



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 14 Mawrth 2007
Wednesday, 14 March 2007**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister
- 22 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 38 Datganiad am Bolisi Gwyddoniaeth a Gwyddoniaeth yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
Statement on Science Policy and Science in the Welsh Assembly Government
- 53 Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25
Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
- 54 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog
Delegation of Functions under the Animal Welfare Act 2006 to the First Minister
- 56 Yr Ail Ddadl ar Gynnig Tamsin Dunwoody ar gyfer Is-ddeddfwriaeth o dan Reol
Sefydlog Rhif 31
Second Debate on Tamsin Dunwoody's Proposal for Subordinate Legislation under
Standing Order No. 31
- 60 Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol o Wasanaethau Canser
The Health and Social Services Committee's Review of Cancer Services
- 88 Dadl Fer: Dore: Gwellhad i Ddyslecsia?
Short Debate: Dore: A Cure for Dyslexia?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister

Cynlluniau Menter Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative Schemes

Q1 David Melding: What meetings has the Minister had in the last 12 months in connection with private finance initiative schemes in Wales? OAQ0805(FIN)

Q6 David Melding: What meetings has the Minister had in the last 12 months in connection with PFI schemes in South Wales Central? OAQ0804(FIN)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I have had three meetings in relation to the waste management scheme being pursued by Wrexham County Borough Council. I also gave final approval to Bridgend County Borough Council to build a school in Maesteg. Both of those are PFI schemes.

David Melding: Spending on PFI in Wales is now at a low level when compared with England, and it is in decline. Do you agree that there is a danger that we will miss the opportunity to improve public services to the maximum extent by this reluctance to embrace PFI?

Sue Essex: I do not know whether 'reluctance' is the right word. We have funded a considerable number of schemes, certainly through the local government portfolio. There have been major schemes on Jeff Cuthbert's particular patch, given that he is in the Chamber to hear me, including Sirhowy Enterprise Way, Lewis School Pengam and Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni. It has also been used to build three hospitals, the A55 dual carriageway across Anglesey, and Lloyd George avenue, not too far from here. Therefore, PFI has been used.

However, various other methods by which you can use private finance have come into

C1 David Melding: Pa gyfarfodydd mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal yn y 12 mis diwethaf ynghylch cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru? OAQ0805(FIN)

C6 David Melding: Pa gyfarfodydd mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal yn y 12 mis diwethaf ynghylch cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0804(FIN)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cefais dri chyfarfod ynghylch y cynllun rheoli gwastraff y mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam yn ei ystyried. Hefyd, rhoddais gymeradwyaeth derfynol i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr godi ysgol ym Maesteg. Mae'r ddau gynllun hyn yn gynlluniau'r fenter cyllid preifat.

David Melding: Mae gwariant ar fentrau cyllid preifat yng Nghymru bellach ar lefel isel o'i gymharu â Lloegr, ac mae'n gostwng. A gytunwch fod perygl y byddwn yn colli'r cyfle i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i'r graddau eithaf o ganlyniad i'r amharodrwydd hwn i dderbyn mentrau cyllid preifat?

Sue Essex: Ni wn ai 'amharodrwydd' yw'r gair cywir. Yr ydym wedi ariannu nifer sylweddol o gynlluniau, yn sicr drwy'r portffolio llywodraeth leol. Bu cynlluniau mawr yn ardal benodol Jeff Cuthbert, o ystyried ei fod yn y Siambr i'm clywed, gan gynnwys Ffordd Fenter Sirhywi, Ysgol Lewis Pengam ac Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni. Fe'i defnyddiwyd hefyd i godi tri ysbyty, ffordd ddeuol yr A55 ar draws Ynys Môn, a rhodfa Lloyd George, nid nepell o'r man hwn. Felly, mae'r fenter cyllid preifat wedi cael ei defnyddio.

Fodd bynnag, daeth amrywiol ddulliau eraill o ddefnyddio cyllid preifat i'r fei—ac wrth

play—and of course the public sector has always borrowed private finance—which may not have the pitfalls associated with PFI, particularly the early schemes. They have been well publicised.

David Melding: The statistics are quite clear: you have been reluctant to use PFI. We are barely at a quarter of the rate of PFI pick-up in England in comparative terms. No PFI credits have been issued for local government since 1999—none at all. You are not even committed to looking at another round for local government.

Sue Essex: Of course we are not issuing any more PFI credits, because what we replaced was prudential borrowing. Local authorities have the wherewithal to use PFI themselves, should they wish to do so, and there are no strictures in that regard.

Many people would think that it is to our credit that we have a lower rate of PFI than England. My answer to all this is that it is a matter of using the right horse for the right course, to be blunt. We should not treat PFI as a god or a pariah; it is just about making sure that we have the right funding mechanisms for the project in hand. I think that people would agree that PFI works very well on road systems, including the A55 and the major £96 million-worth project around Newport. There were more worries around using it to build schools and hospitals. As you know, only a few months ago, I was at Bridgend council with Janice Gregory, turning the first sod of a new PFI hospital. Therefore, you need to go back and take a look at our figures.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid wyf yn siŵr o'ch ateb, Weinidog, a ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn y fenter cyllid preifat. Yr oeddwn mewn adeilad sector cyhoeddus a godwyd gydag arian PFI yn ddiweddar, ac, yn sicr, nid oedd y staff yno yn credu bod y cynllun wedi gweithio o'u plaid. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn sy'n codi yw pa fantais sydd o fenthyg arian

gwrs, mae'r sector cyhoeddus bob amser wedi benthycy cyllid preifat—nad ydynt, o bosibl, yn cyflwyno'r un maglau â'r fenter cyllid preifat, yn arbennig y cynlluniau cynnar. Cawsant gyhoeddusrwydd eang.

David Melding: Mae'r ystadegau yn ddigon amlwg: buoch yn amharod i ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat. Prin yr ydym yn cyfateb i chwarter defnydd Lloegr o'r fenter cyllid preifat o ran cymhariaeth. Ni chyflwynwyd unrhyw greydau'r fenter cyllid preifat ym maes llywodraeth leol ers 1999—dim un. Nid ydych hyd yn oed yn ymrwymedig i ystyried cylch arall ym maes llywodraeth leol.

Sue Essex: Wrth gwrs nad ydym yn cyflwyno rhagor o greydau'r fenter cyllid preifat, gan mai'r hyn a ddisodlwyd gennym oedd benthycy darbodus. Gall awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat eu hunain, pe byddent yn dymuno gwneud hynny, ac nid oes unrhyw strwythurau yn hynny o beth.

Byddai llawer o bobl o'r farn y dylid ein canmol am y ffaith bod gennym gyfradd is na Lloegr o ran y fenter cyllid preifat. Fy ateb i hyn oll, yn blwmp ac yn blaen, yw y dylid dewis y system briodol i'r gweithgarwch. Ni ddylem drin y fenter cyllid preifat fel duw neu barwyd; mae a wnelo hyn â sicrhau bod y systemau ariannu priodol ar waith ar gyfer y prosiect sy'n mynd rhagddo. Credaf y byddai pobl yn cytuno bod y fenter cyllid preifat yn gweithio'n llwyddiannus iawn ar systemau ffyrdd, gan gynnwys yr A55 a'r prosiect pwysig gwerth £96 miliwn yn ardal Casnewydd. Yr oedd mwy o bryderon ynghylch ei defnyddio i godi ysgolion ac ysbytai. Fel y gwyddoch, ddim ond ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, yr oeddwn yng nghyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr gyda Janice Gregory yn troi tywarchen gyntaf ysbyty newydd sy'n rhan o'r fenter cyllid preifat. Felly, mae angen ichi ailedrych ar ein ffigurau.

Alun Ffred Jones: I am not sure from your answer, Minister, whether you are for or against private finance initiatives. Recently, I was in a public sector building that was built with PFI funding, and the staff there certainly did not think that the scheme had worked in their favour. However, the question that arises is what benefit can there be from

gan y sector preifat ar gyfraddau llog uwch nag y gall y sector cyhoeddus fenthg arian, gan gynyddu'r taliadau yn ôl? Beth yw mantais PFI os yw'n golygu y byddwn yn rhoi dyledion ychwanegol i'r pwrs cyhoeddus at y dyfodol?

Sue Essex: To go back to what I said to David, you have to use the right mechanism for the right proposal. I have been rather keen on using mechanisms other than PFI if that does not fit the proposal. One of the strengths of PFI is that the private sector funder or developer, as you borrow private sector money, is tied into the contract over a period of time, whether it is 20 or 25 years, and is responsible for the maintenance and upkeep of the product. If the product takes substantial knocks over time and therefore has a high maintenance bill, you will see the value in that tie-in. That is probably where PFI has scored well.

If you have a PFI that you cannot develop, change, or ascribe easily to other developers over time, or which has hindered improvements—and this was the case in many examples highlighted in England, particularly in relation to schools—you will see the disadvantages of using PFI. I do not think that we should have our heads in the sand when it comes to different mechanisms, and I have been looking at other ways of borrowing private sector money that do not have some of the disadvantages exemplified by PFI projects.

Owen John Thomas: Cardiff's St David's Hospital was built five years ago with a combined PFI and public investment of £14 million. The loan has already cost the NHS £11.5 million, and, with a repayment period of 30 years, the total cost of the loan is likely to be over £100 million.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: May we have a question, Owen?

borrowing money from the private sector at higher rates of interest than the public sector can borrow, thereby increasing the repayments? What is the benefit of PFI if it means that we will be placing an additional burden of debt on the public purse for the future?

Sue Essex: Gan ddychwelyd at yr hyn a ddywedais wrth David, mae'n rhaid ichi ddefnyddio'r system briodol ar gyfer y cynnig priodol. Bûm yn awyddus iawn i ddefnyddio systemau heblaw'r fenter cyllid preifat os nad yw'r fenter honno yn addas i'r cynnig. Un o gryfderau'r fenter cyllid preifat yw y caiff y cyllidwr neu'r datblygwr o'r sector preifat, gan mai gan y sector preifat y byddwch yn benthyg yr arian, ei rwydo i'r contract dros gyfnod o amser, boed yn 20 neu'n 25 mlynedd, ac ef sy'n gyfrifol am gynnal a chadw'r cynnyrch. Os bydd y cynnyrch yn mynd ar ei waeth yn sylweddol dros amser a bod ganddo felly fil cynnal a chadw uchel, daw budd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i'r amlwg. Fwy na thebyg mai dyna un o brif gryfderau'r fenter cyllid preifat.

Os oes gennych fenter cyllid preifat na allwch ei datblygu, ei newid, neu ei phriodoli'n hawdd i ddatblygwyr eraill dros amser, neu sydd wedi llesteirio gwelliannau—a dyma a welwyd mewn sawl enghraifft a amlygwyd yn Lloegr, yn arbennig o ran ysgolion—fe welwch anfanteision defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat. Ni chredaf y dylem gladdu ein pennau yn y tywod wrth ystyried gwahanol systemau, a bûm yn edrych ar ffyrdd eraill o fenthg arian gan y sector preifat nad ydynt yn cyflwyno rhai o'r anfanteision a welwyd o ran prosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat.

Owen John Thomas: Codwyd Ysbyty Dewi Sant yng Nghaerdydd bum mlynedd yn ôl gan ddefnyddio cyfuniad o fuddsoddiad Menter Cyllid Preifat a buddsoddiad cyhoeddus gwerth £14 miliwn. Mae'r benthyciad eisoes wedi costio £11.5 miliwn i'r GIG, a, chydaf cyfnod ad-dalu o 30 mlynedd, mae'n debygol y bydd cyfanswm cost y benthyciad dros £100 miliwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A gawn gwestiwn, Owen?

Owen John Thomas: Minister, will you condemn this scandalous waste of public money, which is even more galling for people such as Mr Bindon Galvin who was forced to take out a loan of £7,500 to pay for his cancer treatment?

Sue Essex: St David's Hospital was a PFI project from way back. I do not have the figures that you quoted; however, borrowing private money in all areas comes at a cost, Owen. I do not know whether this was a good-value-for-money exercise because I was not responsible for it, so I will not defend or oppose it. I hope that we have it right under our system, which involves being more open and not being locked into a particular mode, and having the best way of borrowing private sector money with the best outcome for the public sector.

Owen John Thomas: Weinidog, a wnewch gondemnio'r gwastraff cywilyddus hwn o arian cyhoeddus, sy'n fwy poenus byth i bobl fel Mr Bindon Galvin y gorfodwyd iddo drefnu benthyciad o £7,500 i dalu am ei driniaeth canser?

Sue Essex: Mae Ysbyty Dewi Sant yn un o hen brosiectau'r fenter cyllid preifat. Nid yw'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd gennych gennyf; fodd bynnag, codir tâl am fenthyg arian cyhoeddus ym mhob maes, Owen. Ni wn a oedd yr ymarfer hwn yn werth da am arian gan nad oeddwn yn gyfrifol amdano, felly ni wnaf ei amddiffyn na'i wrthwynebu. Gobeithiaf fod ein system ni, sy'n golygu bod yn fwy agored a pheidio â glynu'n gaeth at un dull penodol, a sicrhau'r ffordd orau o fenthyg arian gan y sector cyhoeddus gyda'r canlyniad gorau i'r sector cyhoeddus, yn gweithredu'n llwyddiannus.

Dyrannu'r Gyllideb Budget Allocations

Q2 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister outline what factors influenced the determination of budget allocations within the Assembly's budget? OAQ0802(FIN)

Sue Essex: Our priorities for funding are set out in the final budget. This budget will enable us to achieve the implementation of our top 10 'Wales: A Better Country' commitments, meeting pay and price pressures, providing more capital investment, meeting the concerns of Assembly committees and reflecting the discussions held with the opposition parties.

Christine Gwyther: Our remit in the Assembly includes the support of small businesses. Businesses across Wales welcomed the rate relief scheme that you introduced. You have been good enough to meet me and tourism operators to discuss the reopening of the rate relief for self-catering operators. Will you outline how businesses adversely affected by the loss of rate relief can look to their own councils for a transitional hardship grant?

C2 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa ffactorau a ddylanwadodd ar bennu'r dyraniadau cyllideb cyffredinol ar gyfer cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0802(FIN)

Sue Essex: Nodir ein blaenoriaethau cyllido yn y gyllideb derfynol. Bydd y gyllideb hon yn ein galluogi i roi'r 10 ymrwymiad a wnaed gennym yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' ar waith, gan ymateb i bwysau o ran cyflogau a phrisiau, darparu mwy o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf, ymateb i bryderon pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ac adlewyrchu'r trafodaethau a gafwyd gyda'r gwrthbleidiau.

Christine Gwyther: Mae ein cylch gwaith yn y Cynulliad yn cynnwys cynorthwyo busnesau bach. Croesawodd busnesau ledled Cymru y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi a gyflwynwyd gennych. Buoch cystal â chyfarfod â mi a chwmnïau twristiaeth i drafod pa un a ellid ailagor y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi ar gyfer cwmnïau hunanarlwyo. A amlinellwch sut y gall busnesau yr effeithiwyd yn andwyol arnynt o ganlyniad i golli'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi ddisgwyl i'w cynghorau eu hunain roi grant caledi trosiannol iddynt?

Sue Essex: I was glad to have our meeting with representatives of the tourism industry in Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire, and I was glad to be able to assure them that if we can find a sensible way forward—and I have no doubt that we can—the consultation will give us an opportunity to include those businesses that need the rate relief and exclude some of the second homes that may be masquerading as small businesses. It was Gwynedd Council that suggested the exception on small business rate relief for self-caterers.

On your second point about businesses so adversely affected by losing their rate relief that they may find themselves in a precarious position, the hardship scheme is available to all local authorities. The Welsh Assembly Government pays 75 per cent of that, and the criteria allow that to be used in those circumstances, particularly where the businesses are an important part of the local community. I have written to all local authorities in Wales to remind them of the ability to use the hardship relief scheme, and I hope that some of them will do that, because they will have made some savings from not making the 10 per cent contribution to the old rural rate relief scheme.

2.10 p.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I wonder whether one of the factors that influenced your determination of the allocations was the growing gap between the university sector in Wales and that in England. The level of funding for universities in England and Wales continues to diverge. If that was a factor, can you tell me when it is likely that we will converge?

Sue Essex: You sat in on the discussions and had the information that we had, Mike, and trying to get an accurate comparison is a complicated business. However, I think that we all agreed that additional funding is needed, and we can certainly add the no-top-up-fees money into our support for higher education in Wales. One interesting area that

Sue Essex: Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael cyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Benfro, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o allu eu sicrhau os gallwn ddod o hyd i ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn wneud hynny—y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn rhoi cyfle inni gynnwys y busnesau hynny y mae angen y rhyddhad ardrethi arnynt a hepgor rhai o'r ail gartrefi a allai fod yn ffugio bodolaeth fel busnesau bach. Cyngor Gwynedd a awgrymodd y dylid eithrio hunan-arlwywyr o'r rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach.

O ran eich ail bwynt ynghylch busnesau yr effeithiwyd arnynt cynddrwg o ganlyniad i golli eu rhyddhad ardrethi fel eu bod yn eu cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfa ansicr, mae'r cynllun caledi ar gael i bob awdurdod lleol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn talu 75 y cant ohono, ac mae'r meini prawf yn galluogi i hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, yn arbennig pan fo'r busnesau yn rhan bwysig o'r gymuned leol. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru i'w hatgoffa y gallant ddefnyddio'r cynllun rhyddhad caledi, a gobeithiaf y bydd rhai ohonynt yn gwneud hynny, gan y byddant wedi gwneud rhai arbedion drwy beidio â chyfrannu 10 y cant at yr hen gynllun rhyddhad ardrethi gwledig.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Tybed a oedd y bwlch cynyddol rhwng y sector prifysgolion yng Nghymru a'r sector yn Lloegr yn un o'r ffactorau a ddylanwadodd ar eich ystyriaethau wrth bennu dyraniadau. Mae lefel y cyllid i brifysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn parhau i ddargyfeirio. Os oedd hynny'n ffactor, a allwch ddweud wrthyf pryd y byddwn yn debygol o gydgyfeirio?

Sue Essex: Yr oeddech yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a chawsoch yr un wybodaeth â ni, Mike, ac mae'n gymhleth ceisio llunio cymhariaeth gywir. Fodd bynnag, credaf i bob un ohonom gytuno bod angen cyllid ychwanegol, ac yn sicr gallwn ychwanegu'r arian sy'n deillio o beidio â chodi ffioedd atodol at ein cymorth ym maes addysg uwch

should be explored by the next Assembly Government is linking higher education into our overall plans for Wales much more. On that basis, I am sure that there can be some agreement with higher education, through the Assembly, about what additional funds can be delivered and how those can be best used for the benefit of Wales. Our spatial plan work is highlighting the role that higher education could play in regeneration. That would be a nice quid pro quo, if you could get it in the next Assembly, between the development of higher education and the additional cash that the Assembly might provide to support that.

David Lloyd: Yn ôl pob sôn, bydd Gordon Brown, y Canghellor, yn cyhoeddi yr wythnos nesaf y bydd twf o lai na 2 y cant mewn gwariant cyhoeddus bob blwyddyn am y tair blynedd nesaf. Pa effaith fydd hynny yn ei gael ar gyllideb y Cynulliad, ac ar wariant y pen yng Nghymru ar iechyd ac addysg o'i gymharu â Lloegr?

Sue Essex: To clarify, that is 2 per cent in real growth, on top of inflation, so we expect between 4 and 5 per cent. That is less than we have had in recent years, as you say, Dai. We have had a bountiful settlement of around 6 per cent growth and more. Although it will go down, there will still be growth in the budget. On how it will affect us, I believe that the Chancellor will continue to place an emphasis on education and health, which is good news for us, because we want to do the same, and that will be reflected in the Barnett settlement. Across the piece, we will need to get greater efficiencies—what Sir Adrian Webb has called better use of the Welsh pound. That will be crucial for Wales over the next four years.

David Lloyd: Yn nghyd-destun gwariant cyhoeddus, ac yn dilyn eich sylwadau, mae wedi dod i'r amlwg y bydd nyrsys yn cael codiad cyflog sydd lawer yn llai na chwyddiant. Felly, pa drafodaethau a ydych wedi eu cael gyda Gweinidogion yn San Steffan er mwyn ceisio cael bargaen well i nyrsys?

Sue Essex: I think that we all agree that there

yng Nghymru. Un maes diddorol y dylai'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad nesaf ei archwilio yw sut y gellir cysylltu addysg uwch i'n cynlluniau cyffredinol i Gymru i raddau llawer mwy. Ar y sail honno, yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir dod i ryw gytundeb gyda'r sector addysg uwch, drwy'r Cynulliad, o ran pa gyllid ychwanegol y gellir ei ddarparu a sut y gellir ei ddefnyddio orau er budd i Gymru. Mae ein gwaith ar y cynllun gofodol yn amlygu'r rôl y gallai addysg uwch ei chwarae ym maes adfywio. Byddai'n hynny'n gyfnewid da, pe gallech ei gynnwys yn y Cynulliad nesaf, rhwng datblygu addysg uwch a'r arian ychwanegol y gallai'r Cynulliad ei ddarparu i gefnogi hynny.

David Lloyd: Apparently, Gordon Brown, the Chancellor, will announce next week that there will be growth in public spending of less than 2 per cent every year for the next three years. What effect will that have on the Assembly's budget, and on per capita spending in Wales on health and education, when compared with England?

Sue Essex: I gadarnhau, mae hynny'n dwf gwirioneddol o 2 y cant, ar ben chwyddiant, felly disgwyliwn rhwng 4 a 5 y cant. Mae hynny'n llai nag a gawsom yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, fel y dywedwch, Dai. Cawsom setliad hael o dwf o ryw 6 y cant a mwy. Er y bydd yn gostwng, bydd twf yn y gyllideb o hyd. O ran sut y bydd yn effeithio arnom, credaf y bydd y Canghellor yn parhau i roi pwyslais ar addysg ac iechyd, sy'n newyddion da inni, gan ein bod am wneud yr un peth, a chaiff hynny ei adlewyrchu yn setliad Barnett. Yn gyffredinol, bydd angen inni sicrhau gwell arbedion—yr hyn y cyfeiriodd Syr Adrian Webb ato fel gwell defnydd o'r bunt Gymreig. Bydd hynny'n hanfodol i Gymru yn ystod y pedair blynedd nesaf.

David Lloyd: In the context of public spending, and following your remarks, it has come to light that nurses will receive a pay increase that is a good deal below inflation. Therefore, what discussions have you had with Ministers at Westminster about getting a better deal for our nurses?

Sue Essex: Credaf fod pawb ohonom yn

needs to be recognition across the piece that growth in public sector spending will not be as large as it has been in recent years. 'Agenda for Change' and its associated changes have uplifted pay within the health sector, and we should bear in mind that there is a difference between the pay rate and pay bill. I think that the pay bill will still run at around an increase of some 4 to 4.5 per cent, because staff are on incremental pay grades.

I have stressed very strongly the need to ensure that all public sector workers are treated fairly. I would not want to see one sector have a difficult pay settlement, and another, a large settlement, as that would lead to resentment within the public sector.

cytuno bod angen cydnabod yn gyffredinol na fydd twf o ran gwariant yn y sector cyhoeddus mor uchel ag y bu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' a'i newidiadau cysylltiedig wedi cynyddu cyflogau yn y sector iechyd, a dylem gofio bod gwahaniaeth rhwng cyfradd cyflogau a'r bil cyflogau. Credaf y bydd cynnydd o tua 4 i 4.5 y cant yn y bil cyflogau o hyd, gan fod staff ar raddfeydd cyflog cynyddrannol.

Yr wyf wedi pwysleisio'n gadarn iawn yr angen i sicrhau y caiff pob gweithiwr yn y sector cyhoeddus ei drin yn deg. Ni fyddem am i un sector gael setliad cyflogau anodd, ac i sector arall gael setliad mawr, gan y byddai hynny'n arwain at ddieter yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Y Gyllideb Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus The Health and Social Services Budget

Q3 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister update us on her considerations when allocating funding to the health and social services budget? OAQ0811(FIN)

Sue Essex: I considered the priorities set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'. I also took into consideration the priorities of the Minister for Health and Social Services, Brian Gibbons, and those of the subject committee, and the discussions that I had with you and the other opposition party leaders.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that response. Would the Minister look in particular at the issue of access to modern medicine? She will be aware that we have pledged that we would provide an additional £25 million for this every financial year. The National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence often has given clearance for treatments and medicines that are not yet generally available—it is very much a postcode lottery.

We know that there has been a problem with brachytherapy treatment, with some drugs for Alzheimer's, with cancer drugs, and so on. What priority is the Minister giving to that in

C3 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am ei hystyriaethau wrth ddyrannu cyllid i'r gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0811(FIN)

Sue Essex: Ystyriais y blaenoriaethau a nodir yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Ystyriais hefyd flaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Brian Gibbons, a blaenoriaethau'r pwyllgor pwnc, a'r trafodaethau a gefais gyda chi ac arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau eraill.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw. A wnaiff y Gweinidog edrych yn benodol ar fynediad i feddyginiaethau modern? Bydd yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi addo y byddem yn darparu £25 miliwn ychwanegol yn y maes hwn bob blwyddyn ariannol. Mae'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol yn aml yn cymeradwyo triniaethau a meddyginiaethau nad ydynt ar gael yn gyffredinol eto—i raddau helaeth, loteri cod post ydyw.

Gwyddom fod problem wedi bod gyda thriniaeth brachytherapi gyda rhai cyffuriau ar gyfer clefyd Alzheimer's, gyda chyffuriau canser, ac ati. Pa flaenoriaeth y mae'r

looking at her budget?

Sue Essex: What we have in the budget are the priorities set by the Minister for Health and Social Services, as he is responsible for sub-dividing the money that I, as Finance Minister, pass across. Your point about modern medicines—and you are probably talking about the new drugs coming onto the market as the result of research—is interesting, as this matter is a challenge. When new drugs come onto the market, people seize the opportunity to ask for them; we can all understand that. Provided that those drugs are vetted, and are seen to be effective and safe, the health service has a responsibility to use them.

One of the interesting areas in this respect is how we incorporate some of these new drugs and keep control of the drugs bill. There is still a lot more that we can do, working with general practitioners and hospitals, to cut back on excessive prescribing—and I think that you would agree that there is some excessive prescribing to be seen. In that way we can make way for these new, good drugs coming onto the market.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, you will be aware of controversial plans in my constituency to close hospital services in three locations. One concern that the community has is that services will close without new services being put in their place. Yet, other Assembly Members have claimed that their local health boards have been provided with pump-priming to develop new services alongside the winding down of old services. What discussions have you had with the Minister for Health and Social Services to look at similar provision for Powys Local Health Board?

Sue Essex: I could not comment in such detail, Kirsty, as this is a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services. I will pass information on to him if you believe that there is inconsistency in dealing with

Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i hynny wrth edrych ar ei chyllideb?

Sue Essex: Yr hyn sydd gennym yn y gyllideb yw'r blaenoriaethau a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, gan mai ef sy'n gyfrifol am isrannu'r arian yr wyf i, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn ei drosglwyddo. Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn â meddyginiaethau modern—ac yr ydych fwy na thebyg yn sôn am y cyffuriau newydd a ddaw ar y farchnad o ganlyniad i ymchwil—yn ddiddorol, gan fod y mater hwn yn un heriol. Pan ddaw cyffuriau newydd ar y farchnad, mae pobl yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ofyn amdanynt; gall pawb ddeall hynny. Cyn belled ag y caiff y cyffuriau hynny eu cadarnhau, a'u bod yn ymddangos yn effeithiol ac yn ddiogel, mae gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gyfrifoldeb i'w defnyddio.

Un o'r meysydd diddorol yn hyn o beth yw sut yr ydym yn ymgorffori rhai o'r cyffuriau newydd hyn ac yn cadw rheolaeth ar y mesur cyffuriau. Mae llawer mwy y gallwn ei wneud o hyd, drwy gydweithio â meddygon teulu ac ysbytai, i leihau nifer y presgripsiynau a roddir yn ddiangen—a chredaf y byddwch yn cytuno y gwelir rhai enghreifftiau o hyn. Yn y ffordd honno, bydd lle i'r cyffuriau newydd, da hyn a ddaw ar y farchnad.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, fe wyddoch am gynlluniau dadleuol yn fy etholaeth i gau gwasanaethau ysbyty mewn tri lleoliad. Un pryder sydd gan y gymuned yw y bydd gwasanaethau yn dod i ben heb i wasanaethau newydd gael eu cynnig yn eu lle. Ac eto, mae Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad wedi honni bod eu byrddau iechyd lleol wedi cael arian sefydlu i gyflymu'r broses o ddatblygu gwasanaethau newydd ochr yn ochr â dirwyn hen wasanaethau i ben. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i edrych ar ddarpariaeth debyg ar gyfer Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys?

Sue Essex: Ni allwn roi sylwadau mor fanwl â hynny, Kirsty, gan fod hyn yn fater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Byddaf yn trosglwyddo'r wybodaeth iddo os credwch fod anghysondeb

issues—I think that that was the basis of your question. I will ensure that you get a response.

Helen Mary Jones: Minister, you will remember the agreement that we came to during the budget negotiations over money for fostering; I repeat our gratitude to you for putting extra money into the fostering budget. However, you will also remember our concern that that money might get lost, particularly given the pressures facing other aspects of social services departments' budgets. What steps are you taking to ensure that the money that your Government has given to local authorities, but has not ring-fenced, ends up in the pockets of foster carers for the benefit of looked-after children?

Sue Essex: The issue is that the money should go into the revenue support grant and not be paid through special grant—I think that all parties supported paying it into the RSG. The point that I made at the time was that there was agreement on the work being done on foster carers' pay allowances, and that it would be very clear what every foster carer was entitled to receive. That would be the agreed rate. De facto, the money has to be protected within local authorities' budgets—it is as though you were entering into a contract. I can look to see whether it would be worthwhile for me to send a letter to all local authorities, but I will do so in conjunction with Brian, because, once we know what the rate is, we can write to say what amount needs to be protected.

o ran ymdrin â materion—credaf mai hynny oedd sail eich cwestiwn. Byddaf yn sicrhau y cewch ateb.

Helen Mary Jones: Weinidog, byddwch yn cofio'r cytundeb y daethom iddo yn ystod y trafodaethau cyllidebol am arian ar gyfer maethu; diolch i chi eto am roi arian ychwanegol i'r cyllid maethu. Fodd bynnag, byddwch hefyd yn cofio ein pryder y byddai'r arian hwnnw efallai yn mynd ar goll, yn enwedig o ystyried y pwysau sy'n wynebu agweddau eraill ar gyllidebau adrannau o'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod yr arian a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol gan eich Llywodraeth chi, ond sydd heb ei glustnodi, yn mynd i bocedi'r gofalwyr maeth er budd y plant sy'n derbyn gofal?

Sue Essex: Y broblem yw y dylai'r arian fynd i mewn i'r grant cynnal refeniw ac ni ddylai gael ei dalu drwy grant arbennig—credaf fod yr holl bleidiau wedi bod o blaid ei dalu i mewn i'r grant cynnal refeniw. Y pwynt a wneuthum ar y pryd oedd bod cytundeb ar y gwaith a wneir ar lwfansau cyflog gofalwyr maeth, ac y byddai'n glir beth oedd gan bob gofalwr maeth yr hawl i'w gael. Hynny fyddai'r gyfradd y cytunwyd arni. De facto, rhaid i'r arian gael ei ddiogelu o fewn cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol—mae fel pe baech yn llunio contract. Gallaf edrych i weld a fyddai'n werth i mi anfon llythyr i'r holl awdurdodau lleol, ond gwnaf hynny ar y cyd â Brian, oherwydd, unwaith y byddwn yn gwybod beth yw'r gyfradd, gallwn ysgrifennu i ddweud pa swm y mae angen ei ddiogelu.

Cyllid gan y Swyddfa Gartref Home Office Funding

Q4 Jenny Randerson: What consideration does the Minister give to funding made available from the Home Office when setting her budget? OAQ0796(FIN)

Sue Essex: Home Office funding deals largely with the police, and is factored in when we approve our final budget.

Jenny Randerson: Our police forces are directly funded from the Home Office, and,

C4 Jenny Randerson: Pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i gyllid a ryddheir gan y Swyddfa Gartref wrth bennu ei chyllideb? OAQ0796(FIN)

Sue Essex: Mae cyllid y Swyddfa Gartref yn ymwneud yn bennaf â'r heddlu, a chaiff ei ystyried pan fyddwn yn cymeradwyo ein cyllideb derfynol.

Jenny Randerson: Caiff ein heddluoedd eu hariannu'n uniongyrchol gan y Swyddfa

as a proportion of the funding given to police forces in England, our police forces receive 5.2 per cent of the total. If responsibility for the police were devolved to Wales and the forces funded according to the Barnett formula, 5.89 per cent would be available. Do you agree with those figures? Do you also agree that the gap between those two figures amounts to about £50 million?

Sue Essex: The police are funded by the Home Office, by the Assembly and by council tax payers—and we had a debate on that last week. Your question is whether I think that the formula works properly. In terms of the Home Office making a fair allocation, responsibility for policing is not devolved, so let us work on where we are now. I do not believe that the formula has worked for the police for a long time, and that is why floors are being put in. Wales benefits from those floors. The formula reflects important factors like population, but it also reflects crime levels and other associated areas. If you are asking whether we are underfunded in Wales, one of the good things about Wales is that we do not have the crime levels of various parts of England. That is something to be applauded, not something to feel sorry about.

2.20 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: You seem to be doing your level best to make the best of a very bad job. The simple fact is that we receive £50 million less for our police forces and that that has a direct impact on the number of police officers that we can employ. Do you agree that, for £50 million, we could employ approximately 1,000 more police officers across Wales?

Sue Essex: As I said, we are a country that has its problems and needs policing in certain areas, but we are also blessed in that we do not have the high rates of crime in the conurbations of, for example, Manchester, Birmingham, or London. Therefore, your question does not make sense. The funding is too complex—with the element of Home

Gartref, ac, fel cyfran o'r cyllid a roddir i heddluoedd yn Lloegr, mae ein heddluoedd yn cael 5.2 y cant o'r cyfanswm. Pe bai'r cyfrifoldeb am yr heddlu yn cael ei ddatganoli i Gymru a'r heddluoedd yn cael eu hariannu yn unol â fformiwla Barnett, byddai 5.89 y cant ar gael. A gytunwch â'r ffigurau hynny? A gytunwch hefyd fod y bwlch rhwng y ddau ffigur hynny yn cyfateb i tua £50 miliwn?

Sue Essex: Caiff yr heddlu ei ariannu gan y Swyddfa Gartref, y Cynulliad a thalwyr y dreth gyngor—a chawsom ddadl ar hynny yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae a wnelo'ch cwestiwn chi â pha un a wyf o'r farn bod y fformiwla yn gweithio'n gywir. O ran y Swyddfa Gartref yn gwneud dyraniad teg, nid yw'r cyfrifoldeb am blismona wedi'i ddatganoli, felly gadewch inni ystyried y sefyllfa sydd ohoni. Ni chredaf fod y fformiwla wedi gweithio i'r heddlu am gyfnod hir, a dyna pam mae terfynau isaf yn cael eu gosod. Mae Cymru yn cael budd o'r terfynau isaf hynny. Mae'r fformiwla yn adlewyrchu ffactorau pwysig fel poblogaeth, ond mae hefyd yn adlewyrchu lefelau troseddu a meysydd cysylltiedig eraill. Os ydych yn gofyn pa un a ydym yn cael ein tanariannu yng Nghymru, un o'r pethau da ynglŷn â Chymru yw nad oes gennym yr un lefelau troseddu â rhannau gwahanol o Loegr. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth i'w gymeradwyo, nid rhywbeth i deimlo'n flin yn ei gylch.

Jenny Randerson: Ymddengys eich bod yn gwneud eich gorau glas i wneud y gorau o'r gwaethaf. Y ffaith syml yw ein bod yn cael £50 miliwn yn llai ar gyfer ein heddluoedd a bod hynny'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar y nifer o swyddogion yr heddlu y gallwn eu cyflogi. A gytunwch, am £50 miliwn, y gallem gyflogi tua 1,000 yn fwy o swyddogion yr heddlu ledled Cymru?

Sue Essex: Fel y soniais, yr ydym yn wlad sy'n wynebu ei phroblemau ei hun ac mae angen plismona mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond yr ydym yn ffodus hefyd nad oes gennym y cyfraddau troseddu uchel sydd gan gytreffiadau fel Manceinion, Birmingham neu Lundain. Felly, nid yw eich cwestiwn yn taro deuddeg. Mae'r broses gyllido yn rhy

Office funding, that of our funding, and the money that goes back and forth between the two, it is difficult for anyone to understand. I would like it to be simplified. I have asked Sir Michael Lyons to look at it to make it simpler so that people in Wales can see what they are getting from whom and then make a judgment about whether it is at the right level.

Leanne Wood: You will be aware of the ongoing debate around the location of any new prisons in Wales. I am of the view that we should incarcerate far fewer children than we do. However, there is a strong case for youth offender facilities to be placed in the north. More than 80 per cent—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must ask a question. It is time to ask questions of the Minister.

Leanne Wood: I am coming to a question.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Do so quickly, please.

Leanne Wood: More than 80 per cent—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is not a question, Leanne. It is time for questions to the Minister.

Leanne Wood: Does that allow me only one sentence?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have had about three sentences.

Leanne Wood: Would a Labour Government put the case for new youth facilities in north Wales, particularly in view of the fact that many young offenders are being rehabilitated through their second language? Do you agree that any new prison facilities in Wales should be publicly run?

Sue Essex: The strange thing about your question is that I put money into that facility last year. I said that money was available to put that facility in north Wales. It has not been achieved, but the money was there.

gymhleth—gyda chyllid y Swyddfa Gartref, ein cyllid ni, a'r arian sy'n symud yn ôl ac ymlaen rhwng y ddau, mae'n anodd i unrhyw un ddeall. Hoffwn i'r broses honno gael ei symleiddio. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Syr Michael Lyons ystyried gwneud y broses yn symlach fel y gall pobl yng Nghymru weld beth maent yn ei gael a chan bwy ac yna penderfynu pa un a yw'r lefel gywir yn cael ei rhoi.

Leanne Wood: Fel y gwyddoch, mae dadl yn mynd rhagddi ynglŷn â lleoliad unrhyw garchardai newydd yng Nghymru. Yn fy marn i, dylem garcharu llawer llai o blant nag yr ydym yn ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, mae achos cryf dros leoli cyfleusterau i droseddwr ifanc yn y gogledd. Mae mwy nag 80 y cant—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ofyn cwestiwn. Mae'n amser i ofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog.

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf ar fin gofyn cwestiwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwnewch hynny'n gyflym, os gwelwch yn dda.

Leanne Wood: Mae mwy nag 80 y cant—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid cwestiwn mohono, Leanne. Mae'n amser i ofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog.

Leanne Wood: A yw hynny'n golygu mai dim ond un frawddeg a ganiateir?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr ydych wedi cael tua thair brawddeg.

Leanne Wood: A fyddai'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn dadlau achos dros leoli cyfleusterau newydd i bobl ifanc yn y gogledd, yn arbennig yng ngoleuni'r ffaith bod llawer o droseddwr ifanc yn cael eu hadsefydlu drwy gyfrwng eu hail iaith? A gytunwch y dylai unrhyw garchardai newydd yng Nghymru gael eu rhedeg yn gyhoeddus?

Sue Essex: Y peth rhyfedd am eich cwestiwn yw fy mod wedi neilltuo arian ar gyfer y cyfleuster hwnnw y llynedd. Soniais fod arian ar gael i leoli'r cyfleuster hwnnw yn y gogledd. Nid yw hynny wedi'i gyflawni, ond

Premises need to be found and the location needs to be right. I feel strongly—like you and many others—that Welsh youngsters should not have to go across the border to youth facilities in Liverpool or Manchester. It is particularly hard if they are Welsh speakers. I announced last June or July that there was money to support that facility. That would have been our money supporting that facility, so I guess that that gives you your answer.

yr oedd yr arian ar gael. Mae angen dod o hyd i safle a'r lleoliad cywir. Teimlaf yn gryf—fel chi a llawer o bobl eraill—na ddylai fod angen i bobl ifanc o Gymru fynd ar draws y ffin i gyfleusterau i bobl ifanc yn Lerpwl neu Fanceinion. Mae'n arbennig o anodd os ydynt yn Gymry Cymraeg. Cyhoeddais fis Mehefin neu Orffennaf diwethaf fod arian ar gael i gefnogi'r cyfleuster hwnnw. Ein harian ni fyddai wedi cefnogi'r cyfleuster hwnnw, felly tybiaf fod hynny'n ateb eich cwestiwn.

Blaenoriaethau'r Gyllideb Budget Priorities

Q5 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on her budget priorities in the run-up to the Assembly elections? OAQ0810(FIN)

C5 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau ei chyllideb yn y cyfnod yn arwain at etholiadau'r Cynulliad? OAQ0810(FIN)

Sue Essex: We have only a few weeks left of this Assembly. My priorities are as set out in our final budget. I am sure that you heard my previous response and you will know the answer to this one.

Sue Essex: Dim ond ychydig wythnosau sy'n weddill o'r Cynulliad hwn. Fy mlaenoriaethau yw'r rhai a nodir yn ein cyllideb derfynol. Yr wyf yn siŵr ichi glywed fy ymateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol a byddwch yn gwybod yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwn.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for that response. Going back to a point that you touched upon earlier in response to a question from, I think, Mike German about the higher education funding situation, you will be aware that, in the budget round at the end of 2005, when the party leaders came together as a group with you, we sought to narrow the funding gap; extra money was put in and yet the gap grew. The same process happened at the end of 2006, and the evidence is that the gap will grow. This will clearly be a serious position for Wales and it will worsen as time goes on unless action is taken—and I suspect that action should be taken now—to ensure that that gap does not grow any wider and, indeed, narrows, because it is growing wider. Could you comment on that?

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Gan ddychwelyd at y pwynt a wnaethoch yn gynharach mewn ymateb i gwestiwn gan Mike German, fe gredaf, ynghylch y sefyllfa o ran ariannu addysg uwch, fe wyddoch, yng nghylch y gyllideb ar ddiwedd 2005, pan ddaeth arweinwyr y pleidiau at ei gilydd fel grŵp gyda chi, gwnaethom geisio lleihau'r bwlch ariannu; neilltuwyd arian ychwanegol ond tyfodd y bwlch ymhellach. Digwyddodd yr un broses ar ddiwedd 2006, ac mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos y bydd y bwlch yn tyfu eto. Yn amlwg, bydd hon yn sefyllfa ddifrifol i Gymru a fydd yn gwaethygu dros amser oni chymerir camau—a thybiaf y dylid cymryd camau yn awr—i sicrhau nad yw'r bwlch yn tyfu ymhellach ac, yn wir, yn culhau, oherwydd mae'n tyfu ymhellach. A allech roi sylwadau ar hynny?

Sue Essex: I probably will repeat a lot of what I said to Mike. We should all recognise what we have done on the top-up fees. We have made a real difference for those youngsters who, perhaps, would not have

Sue Essex: Mae'n debyg y byddaf yn ailadrodd llawer o'r hyn a ddywedais wrth Mike. Dylem oll gydnabod yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud o ran ffioedd ychwanegol. Yr ydym wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth

accessed higher education in past years. They have been given the opportunity, through various means, to come forward. I would not like people to think that this is a negative story, nor would I like them to think that Welsh universities are doing badly, because many of them are achieving brilliant results in their teaching and research assessments. However, as I said to Mike, there is a greater opportunity for HE to be involved in a wider role. Excellent work is being done in medical research; if we can extend that, and support the HE sector in making bids and growing, that would be a real basis for agreement with the sector, and that would make a lot of sense. In fairness, that is the feeling that I am getting from the sector—it is not necessarily saying, ‘We want something for nothing’; it is saying that it wants to be much more involved. That would be the basis of extra funding, but it will be for those of you who are here post the next Assembly elections to take that forward.

Nick Bourne: I appreciate that response, and I do not want to be negative, but the facts as I set them out are the facts. It is undoubtedly the case that the gap is growing. You are right that the sector is not expecting something for nothing, but we must face the position that we are in a competitive position with England as regards research particularly, and, if our universities are underfunded as compared with England, we will suffer from being in that position. I welcome your conversion on top-up fees, because, as I recall, the Government voted against the Conservative-led motion on top-up fees; if you are now committed to being signed up to the agenda of not wanting top-up fees for Welsh students in Wales, I welcome that. However, on the funding gap, the facts are the facts—the gap is growing larger, as I am sure the First Minister would acknowledge, and we need to take action on that, or we will reap the whirlwind in years to come.

Sue Essex: On top-up fees, you might need to convert your own frontbench, which might be showing a slight wobble on that. However,

gwirioneddol i'r bobl ifanc hynny na fyddent, o bosibl, wedi bod mewn addysg uwch yn y gorffennol. Maent wedi cael y cyfle, drwy wahanol ffyrdd, i gymryd rhan. Ni fyddwn am i bobl feddwl mai stori negyddol yw hon, ac ni fyddwn am iddynt feddwl bod prifysgolion Cymru yn tanberfformio, gan fod llawer ohonynt yn cyflawni canlyniadau ardderchog yn eu hasesiadau addysgu ac ymchwil. Fodd bynnag, fel y soniais wrth Mike, mae mwy o gyfle i'r sector AU ymgymryd â rôl ehangach. Mae gwaith ardderchog yn cael ei wneud o ran ymchwil feddygol; os gallwn ymestyn hynny, a chefnogi'r sector AU o ran gwneud ceisiadau a thyfu, byddai hynny'n sail wirioneddol ar gyfer cytundeb â'r sector, a byddai hynny'n gwneud llawer o synnwyr. Er tegwch, dyna'r teimlad yr wyf yn ei gael gan y sector—nid yw o reidrwydd yn dweud, ‘Yr ydym am gael rhywbeth am ddim’; mae'n dweud ei fod am chwarae mwy o ran. Byddai hynny'n sail ar gyfer arian ychwanegol, ond cyfrifoldeb y sawl ohonoch a fydd yma ar ôl etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad fydd mynd i'r afael â hynny.

Nick Bourne: Gwerthfawrogaf yr ymateb hwnnw, ac nid wyf am fod yn negyddol, ond mae'r ffeithiau'n glir. Yn ddiau, mae'r bwlch yn tyfu. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud nad yw'r sector yn disgwyl rhywbeth am ddim, ond rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith ein bod yn cystadlu â Lloegr o ran ymchwil yn arbennig ac, os caiff ein prifysgolion eu tanariannu o gymharu â Lloegr, byddwn yn dioddef yn sgîl y ffaith ein bod yn y sefyllfa honno. Croesawaf eich newid barn ar ffioedd ychwanegol, oherwydd, os cofiaf, pleidleisiodd y Llywodraeth yn erbyn y cynnig a arweiniwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr ar ffioedd ychwanegol; os ydych yn ymrwymedig yn awr i'r agenda o beidio â chodi ffioedd ychwanegol ar fyfyrwyr Cymraeg yng Nghymru, croesawaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran y bwlch ariannu, mae'r ffeithiau'n glir—mae'r bwlch yn tyfu'n fwy, fel y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gydnabod yr wyf yn siŵr, ac mae angen inni gymryd camau ar hynny, neu byddwn yn talu'r pris am hynny mewn blynyddoedd i ddod.

Sue Essex: O ran ffioedd ychwanegol, efallai fod angen ichi newid barn eich Gweinidogion mainc flaen eich hun, a allai fod yn dangos

on the future of HE, Jane Davidson has worked hard on the collaboration agenda, to try to ensure that Welsh universities work together and do not act competitively. From my background of being at a university, there is huge scope to do more of that, so that you make the best use of your resources. However, I do not believe that there would be any dissent among the Labour group if a real programme of how the expansion of universities working together in certain areas could be matched with money from the centre. They would then be much more part of Team Wales, and the family of Wales, in using money to develop opportunities constructively, for themselves and for Wales. It is for those of you who are here after May to take that forward. We put some money in the budget last year, and I would not want you to give the impression that we completely ignored HE because that is just not true.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Does the Minister agree that, during the current round of Objective 1 funding, which will come to an end fairly soon, the Government has had to allocate some £450 million of match funding to draw down the money in the block—a sum equivalent to about £65 million every year of the programme? Does she also agree that if the existing Assembly Government does not put a bid in to the Chancellor of the Exchequer for match funding for convergence funds by the time the comprehensive spending review is announced in July, any incoming Government after the election will not have time to put any bid to the Chancellor? Given that the First Minister has told us that he is waiting for the intervention rates to be confirmed, will she now tell us whether or not this Government will apply for match funding from the Chancellor before the Assembly elections—yes or no?

Sue Essex: We do not know what the intervention rates will be, and that work will still be done. This has been an endless conversation between us, Ieuan. You try to make out that we have some terrible trauma in Wales because the Chancellor does not

rhywfaint o ansicrwydd ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran dyfodol AU, mae Jane Davidson wedi gweithio'n galed ar yr agenda cydweithredu, er mwyn ceisio sicrhau bod prifysgolion Cymru yn cydweithio yn hytrach na chystadlu. O'm profiad i o fod mewn prifysgol, mae llawer o le i wneud mwy o hynny, er mwyn sicrhau eich bod yn gwneud y gorau o'ch adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw anghytuno ymhlith y grŵp Llafur pe gallai rhaglen wirioneddol yn ymwneud ag ymestyn y broses gydweithio rhwng prifysgolion mewn ardaloedd penodol gael ei chyfateb gan arian o'r canol. O ganlyniad, byddent yn fwy o ran o Dîm Cymru, a theulu Cymru, o ran defnyddio arian i ddatblygu cyfleoedd yn adeiladol, i'w hunain ac i Gymru. Cyfrifoldeb y rhai ohonoch a fydd yma ar ôl mis Mai fydd mynd i'r afael â hynny. Rhoddwyd rhywfaint o arian yn y gyllideb y llynedd, ac ni fyddwn am ichi roi'r argraff ein bod wedi anwybyddu'r sector AU yn llwyr gan nad yw hynny'n wir.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, yn ystod y cylch presennol o arian Amcan 1, a ddaw i ben yn weddol fuan, bod y Llywodraeth wedi gorfod neilltuo tua £450 miliwn o arian cyfatebol i ddefnyddio'r arian yn y bloc—swm sy'n cyfateb i tua £65 miliwn i bob blwyddyn o'r rhaglen? A yw'n cytuno hefyd, os na fydd Llywodraeth bresennol y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cais i Ganghellor y Trysorlys am arian cyfatebol ar gyfer cronfeydd cydgyfeirio cyn i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant gael ei gyhoeddi ym mis Gorffennaf, na fydd gan unrhyw Lywodraeth newydd amser i gyflwyno unrhyw gais i'r Canghellor ar ôl yr etholiad? O gofio bod y Prif Weinidog wedi sôn wrthym ei fod yn aros am gadarnhad o'r cyfraddau ymyrraeth, a wnaiff hi ddweud wrthym yn awr pa un a fydd y Llywodraeth hon yn gwneud cais am arian cyfatebol gan y Canghellor cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad—a fydd hynny'n digwydd neu beidio?

Sue Essex: Ni wyddom beth fydd y cyfraddau ymyrraeth, a bydd y gwaith hwnnw yn cael ei wneud o hyd. Mae hon wedi bod yn sgwrs ddi-ddiwedd rhyngom, Ieuan. Yr ydych yn ceisio awgrymu bod Cymru'n dioddef am nad yw'r Canghellor yn

give us match funding and that the whole Objective 1 scheme would be put in jeopardy. That has not happened. We have put the money in, it has been sufficient, we have become much more adept at using our mainstream funding to align budgets, and I am sure that the lessons that we have learned and our experience of Objective 1 will underpin convergence. We are seen as an exemplar, Ieuan, not as a slowcoach on this, and it is about time that you recognised that, and recognised the good work that is going on on the ground, using European funding.

rhoi arian cyfatebol inni ac y byddai'r cynllun Amcan 1 cyfan yn cael ei beryglu. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo symiau digonol o arian, yr ydym wedi dod yn fwy medrus o lawer o ran defnyddio ein cyllid prif ffrwd i alinio cyllidebau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y gwersi yr ydym wedi'u dysgu a'n profiad o Amcan 1 yn ategu'r gwaith cydgyfeirio. Cawn ein hystyried fel enghraifft dda, Ieuan, nid sefydliad sydd ar ei hôl hi o ran hyn, ac mae'n hen bryd ichi gydnabod hynny, a chydabod y gwaith da sy'n mynd rhagddo ar lawr gwlad, gan ddefnyddio arian Ewropeaidd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 6 was grouped with question 1.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cafodd cwestiwn 6 ei grwpio gyda chwestiwn 1.

Hyblygrwydd Diwedd Blwyddyn End-of-Year Flexibility

Q7 Jenny Randerson: How much does the Minister estimate will be available as end-of-year flexibility? OAQ0795(FIN)

C7 Jenny Randerson: Faint mae'r Gweinidog yn ei ragweld fydd ar gael ar ffurf hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn? OAQ0795(FIN)

2.30 p.m.

Sue Essex: Our latest estimates indicate an underspend in 2006-07 of 0.5 per cent of our departmental expenditure limit.

Sue Essex: Mae ein hamcangyfrifon diweddar yn nodi tanwariant o 0.5 y cant o'n terfyn gwariant adrannol yn 2006-07.

Jenny Randerson: I suggest that you spend your end-year flexibility on putting right the recent confusion about business investment grant money for local authorities. You are aware that there is concern across Wales, and that mistakes were made in the allocations for several local authorities, including Newport and Neath Port Talbot, which have had to be corrected. You publicly criticised Cardiff council for taking this money into account when calculating its budget. Bearing in mind that this money amounts to several million pounds, are you saying that Cardiff and all other local authorities should have set a budget that discounted this money and treated it as a windfall?

Jenny Randerson: Awgrymaf eich bod yn gwario eich hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn ar unioni'r dryswch diweddar o ran arian grant buddsoddi busnes ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Fe wyddoch fod pryder ledled Cymru bod camgymeriadau wedi'u gwneud yn y dyraniadau i sawl awdurdod lleol, yn cynnwys Casnewydd a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot, a bu'n rhaid eu cywiro. Gwnaethoch feirniadu cyngor Caerdydd yn gyhoeddus am ystyried yr arian hwn wrth gyfrifo ei gyllideb. Gan gofio bod yr arian hwn yn gyfystyr â miliynau o bunnoedd, a ydych yn dweud y dylai Caerdydd a phob awdurdod lleol arall fod wedi pennu cyllideb a oedd yn diystyru'r arian hwn a'i drin fel ffawdelw?

Sue Essex: Only one authority is complaining about what is known as LABGI—local authority business grants initiative—money, and that is Cardiff. The mistake in relation to Newport and Neath

Sue Essex: Dim ond un awdurdod sy'n cwyno am yr hyn a elwir yn arian LABGI—menter grantiau busnes awdurdodau lleol—sef Caerdydd. Yr oedd y camgymeriad mewn perthynas â Chasnewydd a Castell-nedd Port

Port Talbot was as a result of a typing error. No-one else is complaining. The rules of LABGI are clear; it is extra money that the Chancellor provides. That money is ring-fenced, so there is no way that any of our department expenditure limit money would go to Cardiff, or anywhere else. I can just imagine the reaction of the 21 other authorities if that were to happen, as Cardiff has been, by far, the biggest beneficiary of this—there would be absolute outrage. It is additional money from Gordon Brown of £60 million over three years. The rules of the game were explained to Cardiff by my officials, which were that this year about £11 million of that money was likely to be available, and that it should not make an estimate and put that into its baseline funding, because you can never be sure of getting it, as it is based on business growth. A calculation was made, and I believe that one of Cardiff's officers also made that calculation, so there was an understanding of how much it would be. However, the authority was specifically told not to put it into its baseline in terms of what it had last year. It was its decision to do that. If confusion has arisen, that is down to the council.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn eich cyfeirio'n ôl at gwestiwn Dai Lloyd ar godiadau cyflog nyrsys yng Nghymru. A gytunwch bod nyrsys yn haeddu'r codiad o 2.5 y cant? A ydych yn cydnabod bod Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi cytuno i dalu hynny mewn un swm ar 1 Ebrill, tra'i telir mewn dau swm yng Nghymru a Lloegr—un yn yr Ebrill ac un yn yr Hydref? Cyfeiriasoch at 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Mae 35 y cant o nyrsys Cymru heb eu cofnodi ar eu cynyddran cywir o dan 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' eto. A ydych yn fodlon dweud yn glir wrth San Steffan, sydd â'r penderfyniad terfynol ar hyn, y byddech yn barod i ariannu'r codiad hwn i nyrsys yng Nghymru yn syth o 1 Ebrill o'r arian sydd ar gael ar ddiwedd tymor?

Sue Essex: Do you not understand that end-year flexibility is one-off money? How could we possibly fund a continual pay rise from one-off funding? I hope to goodness that you never get anywhere near managing the budget, Rhodri Glyn, because you would be

Talbot o ganlyniad i wall teipio. Nid oes neb arall yn cwyno. Mae rheolau LABGI yn glir; arian ychwanegol ydyw a ddarperir gan y Canghellor. Caiff yr arian hwnnw ei glustnodi, felly nid oes unrhyw ffordd y byddai unrhyw ran o'n harian terfyn gwariant adrannol yn mynd i Gaerdydd, neu unrhyw le arall. Gallaf ddychmygu ymateb yr 21 o awdurdodau lleol eraill pe bai hynny'n digwydd, oherwydd Caerdydd sydd wedi cael y budd mwyaf o hyn, o bell ffordd—byddai dicter llwyr. Arian ychwanegol gan Gordon Brown ydyw, o £60 miliwn dros dair blynedd. Esboniodd fy swyddogion y rheolau wrth Gaerdydd, sef bod tua £11 miliwn o'r arian hwnnw'n debygol o fod ar gael eleni, ac na ddylai amcangyfrif a'i gynnwys yn ei gyllido llinell sylfaen, oherwydd ni allwch byth fod yn siŵr o'i gael, am ei fod yn seiliedig ar dwf busnes. Gwnaed cyfrifiad, a chredaf fod un o swyddogion Caerdydd wedi gwneud y cyfrifiad hwnnw hefyd, felly yr oedd dealltwriaeth o ran faint o arian fyddai ar gael. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd yn benodol wrth yr awdurdod i beidio â'i gynnwys yn ei linell sylfaen o ran yr hyn yr oedd ganddo y llynedd. Penderfyniad y cyngor oedd hynny. Os oes dryswch wedi codi, y cyngor sydd ar fai.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I refer to Dai Lloyd's question about pay increases for nurses in Wales. Do you agree that nurses deserve the increase of 2.5 per cent? Do you recognise that the Scottish Executive has agreed to pay that money in one go on 1 April, while it will be introduced in two stages in England and Wales—one in April and one in October? You referred to 'Agenda for Change'. Thirty-five per cent of Welsh nurses are yet to be registered on their correct increment under 'Agenda for Change'. Are you prepared to make it clear to Westminster, which has the final say on this matter, that you would be willing to fund this increase for Welsh nurses in one go on 1 April out of end-of-year flexibility?

Sue Essex: Oni ddeallwch mai arian untro yw hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn? Sut gallem gyllido codiad cyflog parhaus o gyllid untro? Gobeithiaf yn wir na fyddwch byth yn rheoli'r gyllideb, Rhodri Glyn, oherwydd byddech mewn trafferthion mawr a byddem

in real trouble and we would be bankrupt by the second year. Your point about fair pay rises for public sector workers—*[Interruption.]* I cannot hear, because you are continuing to rant.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Rhodri, you might not like what the Minister is saying, but the Minister has an absolute right to say it and for us to hear it.

Sue Essex: Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I did not like what you said, Rhodri Glyn, but I listened to you. You have to get real and not promise money to nurses out of end-of-year flexibility, as that would end at the end of this year.

yn fethdalwyr erbyn yr ail flwyddyn. Mae eich pwynt am godiadau cyflog teg i weithwyr y sector cyhoeddus—*[Torri ar draws.]* Ni allaf glywed, oherwydd yr ydych yn parhau i refru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhodri, efallai nad ydych yn hoffi'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei ddweud, ond mae gan y Gweinidog hawl absoliwt i'w ddweud ac inni ei glywed.

Sue Essex: Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Ni hoffais yr hyn a ddywedasoch, Rhodri Glyn, ond gwrandewais arnoch. Rhaid ichi fod yn realistig a pheidio ag addo arian i nyrsys allan o hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn, oherwydd byddai hynny'n dod i ben ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon.

Cyllideb Gyffredinol Budget Allocation

Q8 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget allocation for the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0801(FIN)

Sue Essex: The budget provision for the education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio is £1.548 billion in 2006-07. This represents an increase of 13 per cent on the 2005-06 provision.

Mark Isherwood: Today, the National Association of Head Teachers has told me that the gap between the Assembly Government's indicative figure and the educational funding that it cites in Flintshire has increased again this year, creating a standstill budget with, it says, more than £2 million, which had been provided by the Assembly Government, held back. Noting that per-pupil funding in that county is already the lowest in Wales, it adds that the high standards achieved cannot be sustained indefinitely. Therefore, at its request, I ask whether you will take a close look at this across all authorities and ensure a rigorous and wholly transparent inquiry.

Sue Essex: I certainly will take a close look at it. I could not hear you properly, but I think that you said that it was a low-achieving authority in terms of education—

C8 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddarperir ar gyfer portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0801(FIN)

Sue Essex: Y gyllideb a ddarperir ar gyfer portffolio addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau yw £1.548 biliwn yn 2006-07. Mae hyn yn gynydd o 13 y cant o gymharu â darpariaeth 2005-06.

Mark Isherwood: Heddiw, dywedodd Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon wrthyf fod y bwlch rhwng ffigur dangosol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cyllido addysgol a ddyfynna yn Sir y Fflint wedi cynyddu eto eleni hon, gan greu cyllideb ddigyfnewid gyda, fe ddywed, dros £2 filiwn, a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, wedi'i ddal yn ôl. Gan nodi bod y cyllid fesul disgybl yn y sir honno eisoes yr isaf yng Nghymru, mae'n gwneud synnwyr na ellir cynnal y safonau uchel a gyflawnwyd am byth. Felly, yn sgîl y cais hwn, a edrychwch yn fanwl ar hyn ar draws pob awdurdod a sicrhau ymchwiliad trylwyr a chwbl dryloyw.

Sue Essex: Yn sicr, edrychaf arno'n fanwl. Nid oeddwn yn gallu eich clywed yn gywir, ond credaf ichi ddweud ei fod yn awdurdod a oedd yn cael canlyniadau gwael o ran addysg—

Mark Isherwood: I said that it was high-achieving.

Sue Essex: Oh. Okay, that is fine.

Janet Ryder: You will be fully aware that, in the last budget round, extra money was negotiated for funding schools and that, in Wales, we do not directly fund schools, therefore that money had to go into the general revenue settlement grant for county councils to pass on to those schools. Are you aware that some schools are starting to say that the county council is not passing that money on or, if it is passing it on, it is taking the opportunity to cut into the school budget and, therefore, the school is not seeing an increase in its budget. If you are aware of that, what are you going to do and what negotiations and talks have you had with county councils to ensure that that the full increase is passed onto schools?

Sue Essex: I am not sure that it went into the revenue support grant as such; it was passed to local authorities for them to give directly to schools. However, I will check the mechanism. I have been concerned to ensure that this is additional money, and have been watching local authorities. We have to do that. I have only had reports of one authority doing as you say, and you may be referring to the same authority that I have heard about from my colleague, Ann Jones. I am looking into that and have made it clear that this is separate money.

William Graham: You are devoting about £10 million over the next few years to providing school breakfasts. Do you really think that that is good use of Assembly Government money when there are so many schools in Wales that cannot balance their budgets?

Sue Essex: I could give you a one-word answer, which is 'yes', and I do mean that, but I will go a bit further and say that this is one of the most important keys to unlocking the potential of many children who struggle to pay attention in school and to do their work properly. School breakfasts will make a

Mark Isherwood: Dywedais ei fod yn cael canlyniadau da.

Sue Essex: O. Iawn, digon teg.

Janet Ryder: Fe wyddoch, yng nghylch olaf y gyllideb, fod arian ychwanegol wedi'i gael i gyllido ysgolion ac nad ydym, yng Nghymru, yn cyllido ysgolion yn uniongyrchol, felly yr oedd yn rhaid i'r arian hwnnw fynd i'r grant setliad refeniw cyffredinol i gynghorau sir ei drosglwyddo i'r ysgolion hynny. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod rhai ysgolion yn dechrau dweud nad yw'r cyngor sir yn trosglwyddo'r arian hwnnw neu, os yw'n trosglwyddo'r arian, ei fod yn achub ar y cyfle i gymryd arian o gyllideb yr ysgol ac, felly, nid yw'r ysgol yn gweld cynnydd yn ei chyllideb. Os ydych yn ymwybodol o hynny, beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud a pha drafodaethau a gawsoch â chynghorau sir i sicrhau y caiff y cynnydd llawn ei drosglwyddo i ysgolion?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr iddo gael ei roi yn y grant cynnal refeniw, fel y cyfryw; cafodd ei drosglwyddo i awdurdodau lleol iddynt hwy ei roi yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, cadarnhaf y dull. Yr wyf wedi ceisio sicrhau mai arian ychwanegol yw hwn, a bŵm yn gwylio awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid inni wneud hynny. Cefais wybod am un awdurdod yn unig sy'n gwneud yr hyn a ddywedasoch, ac efallai eich bod yn cyfeirio at yr un awdurdod a glywais amdano gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Ann Jones. Yr wyf yn ymchwilio i hynny ac yr wyf wedi pwysleisio bod hwn yn arian ar wahân.

William Graham: Yr ydych yn neilltuo tua £10 miliwn dros y blynyddoedd nesaf ar gyfer darparu brecwast mewn ysgolion. A gredwch fod hynny'n ddefnydd da o arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn gwirionedd pan fo cymaint o ysgolion yng Nghymru na allant fantoli eu cyllideb?

Sue Essex: Gallwn roi ateb un gair ichi, sef 'ydw', ac yr wyf yn golygu hynny, ond af ychydig yn bellach a dweud bod hwn yn un o'r allweddi pwysicaf o ran rhyddhau potensial llawer o blant sy'n cael trafferth i dalu sylw yn yr ysgol a chyflawni eu gwaith yn gywir. Bydd brecwast mewn ysgolion yn

huge difference in that regard, as well as in terms of other aspects of social cohesion. I have visited breakfast clubs and if you are cynical before you go, afterwards you will be absolutely convinced, having seen those children and heard what the teachers have to say. I think that we will have somewhere near 50 per cent of all schools taking this up by the end of this Assembly. I am proud that we will have achieved that, and that money has been well spent.

Peter Black: We have already talked about higher education funding. Will you consider the capital needs of university estates around Wales? As capital investment is a one-off expenditure, will you consider using end-of-year flexibility to increase the amount of money available to address the dilapidated state of many of the buildings around university campuses?

Sue Essex: I will just go back to William Graham's question. If you felt so strongly about it, William, why did you not propose an amendment to take it out of the budget last time round? You did not do that, because you did not want to do it.

On Peter's question, there are issues about investment in higher education but I think that we would all be pressed to agree that that was the priority for end-of-year flexibility, particularly when end-of-year flexibility is going towards addressing such issues as hospital waiting times. Going back to our earlier discussions around capital, there is a real chance to get a capital programme. We are doing it for schools and hospitals but, working with higher education, we could probably also get a forward-looking capital programme for that sector.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 9 has been transferred for written answer.

gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr yn hynny o beth, yn ogystal ag o ran agweddau eraill ar gydlyniant cymdeithasol. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â chlybiau brecwast ac os ydych yn amau cyn ichi fynd, ar ôl hynny byddwch yn gwbl argyhoeddedig, ar ôl gweld y plant hynny a chlywed yr hyn sydd gan yr athrawon i'w ddweud. Credaf y bydd tua 50 y cant o ysgolion yn manteisio ar hyn erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Yr wyf yn falch y byddwn wedi cyflawni hynny, a gwariwyd yr arian hwnnw'n dda.

Peter Black: Yr ydym wedi trafod cyllido addysg uwch eisoes. A ystyriwch anghenion cyfalaf ystadau prifysgolion ledled Cymru? Gan fod buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn wariant untro, a ystyriwch ddefnyddio hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn i gynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael i fynd i'r afael â chyflwr gwael llawer o'r adeiladau o amgylch campysau prifysgolion?

Sue Essex: Dychwelaf at gwestiwn William Graham. Os oeddech yn teimlo mor gryf amdano, William, pam na wnaethoch gynnig gwelliant i'w ddileu o'r gyllideb y tro diwethaf? Ni wnaethoch hynny, gan nad oeddech yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

O ran cwestiwn Peter, mae materion o ran buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch, ond credaf y byddai'n anodd iawn i bob un ohonom gytuno mai dyna'r flaenoriaeth ar gyfer hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn, yn enwedig pan fo hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn yn mynd tuag at fynd i'r afael â materion megis amseroedd aros ysbytai. Gan ddychwelyd at ein trafodaethau cynharach o ran cyfalaf, mae cyfle gwirionedd i gael rhaglen gyfalaf. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny ar gyfer ysgolion ac ysbytai ond, gan weithio gydag addysg uwch, mae'n debyg y gallem gael raglen gyfalaf flaengar ar gyfer y sector hwnnw hefyd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 9 i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Cyllideb Gyffredinol Overall Budget

Q10 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget provision for enterprise, innovation and networks in

C10 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddarperir ar gyfer y portffolio menter, arloesi

2007-08? OAQ0813(FIN)

a rhwydweithiau yn 2007-08?
OAQ0813(FIN)

Sue Essex: The EIN budget will be £1.1 billion in 2007-08, compared with £488 million in 1999-2000. You can therefore see what huge growth there has been; it is a 139 per cent growth.

Sue Essex: Y gyllideb ar gyfer menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau fydd £1.1 biliwn yn 2007-08, o gymharu â £488 miliwn yn 1999-2000. Felly gallwch weld y twf enfawr a gadwyd; mae'n dwf o 139 y cant.

2.40 p.m.

John Griffiths: That is an impressive rate of growth. Do you agree that, within that budget, it is important that proper and adequate provision is made for our cycling strategy, given the great number of cross-cutting benefits that cycling can deliver? To take one example, Cardiff, which is pretty flat, has a large student population and a lot of fairly short-distance commuting, we can see that there is a huge potential to increase cycling if there is adequate budgetary provision and commitment.

John Griffiths: Mae honno'n gyfradd dwf drawiadol. A gytunwch, o fewn y gyllideb honno, ei bod yn bwysig y gwneir darpariaeth briodol a digonol ar gyfer ein strategaeth feicio, oherwydd y nifer fawr o fanteision trawsbynciol a ddaw yn sgîl beicio? Er enghraifft, yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n gymharol wastad, a lle y ceir nifer fawr o fyfyrwyr, a llawer o gymudo dros bellter cymharol fyr, gallwn weld bod potensial mawr i gynyddu beicio os bydd darpariaeth ac ymrwymiad cyllidebol digonol.

Sue Essex: I was going to say that, in Cardiff, I would be really pushed to try to get my bike up the Wenallt. I take your point, however, that it is largely flat. From my observations—I do not have the figures, but I am sure that the Cardiff Cycling Campaign could provide me with them—there has been a huge growth in cycling in Cardiff, and that has come about as a result of many years of effort. When I was Minister for Environment, Planning and Transport, we prioritised cycling, and you now see people cycling to work, which they did not do five or six years ago. You are absolutely right that a small amount of money invested in cycling facilities can be of a huge benefit, in taking people out of their cars and in terms of fitness.

Sue Essex: Yr oeddwn ar fin dweud y byddai'n anodd iawn imi, yng Nghaerdydd geisio cael fy meic i fyny'r Wenallt. Fodd bynnag, derbynïaf eich pwynt ei bod yn wastad ar y cyfan. O'm harsylwadau—nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai Ymgyrch Beicio Caerdydd eu rhoi imi—cafwyd twf enfawr mewn beicio yng Nghaerdydd, a chafwyd hynny yn sgîl sawl blwyddyn o ymdrech. Pan oeddwn yn Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth i feicio, ac yn awr yr ydych yn gweld pobl yn beicio i'r gwaith, ac nid oeddent yn gwneud hynny bum neu chwe blynedd yn ôl. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud y gall swm bach o arian a fuddsoddir mewn cyfleusterau beicio fod o fudd mawr, o ran sicrhau bod pobl yn gwneud llai o ddefnydd o'u ceir ac o ran ffitrwydd.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd The Environment Agency

Q1 Helen Mary Jones: What discussions has the Minister held with the Environment Agency in England and Wales regarding cross-border working? OAQ1081(EPC)

C1 Helen Mary Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr ynghylch gweithio trawsffiniol?

OAQ1081(EPC)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I regularly discuss a range of issues with the chairman of the Environment Agency, which includes the agency's cross-border activities.

Helen Mary Jones: Can you confirm that those discussions have included the future of the Environment Agency laboratory at Llanelli? What representations did you make with regard to keeping those jobs, and would there be any merit in your having further discussions? You will be aware that there is a concern about losing that number of good quality scientific jobs from a town where employment is already an issue.

Carwyn Jones: I had many discussions with the trade unions, management and, indeed, Catherine Thomas about this issue. It is right to say that good quality jobs should remain at Llanelli, and I have made representations to the Environment Agency along those lines.

Brynle Williams: There is considerable delay in getting access to waterways for kayakers and canoeists. The situation is further complicated in cross-border areas. Will you commit to work with the Environment Agency in England and Wales to ensure that, when the new strategy on recreational access to coast and inland waters is published, there is close co-operation in cross-border areas to speed up the rate at which voluntary access agreements are reached?

Carwyn Jones: I am working with Alun Pugh and several organisations to resolve the issue of canoeists' access to Welsh rivers in particular, and we hope to move things forward during the early part of the summer.

Eleanor Burnham: The threat of flooding, as you well know, is by its nature a cross-border issue. Dr Marek and I were recently involved in the opening of a flood management scheme in Rosset and Trefalin. What action are you taking, or are able to take, to ensure that flood prevention and coastal defence measures taken in England

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Yr wyf yn trafod ystod o faterion gyda chadeirydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rheolaidd, gan gynnwys gweithgareddau trawsffiniol yr asiantaeth.

Helen Mary Jones: A allwch gadarnhau bod y trafodaethau hynny wedi cynnwys dyfodol labordy Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn Llanelli? Pa sylwadau a wnaethoch o ran cadw'r swyddi hynny, ac a fyddai cynnal rhagor o drafodaethau yn fanteisiol? Fel y gwyddoch, mae pryder ynglŷn â cholli cynifer o swyddi gwyddonol o ansawdd da mewn tref lle mae cyflogaeth eisoes yn broblem.

Carwyn Jones: Cefais sawl trafodaeth gyda'r undebau llafur, rheolwyr ac, yn wir, Catherine Thomas ar y mater hwn. Mae'n wir dweud y dylid cadw swyddi o ansawdd da yn Llanelli, ac yr wyf wedi gwneud sylwadau i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ynglŷn â hynny.

Brynle Williams: Mae cryn dipyn o oedi o ran caniatáu i gaiacwyr a chanŵ-wyr ddefnyddio dyfrffyrdd. Mae'r sefyllfa'n fwy cymhleth mewn ardaloedd trawsffiniol. Pan gyhoeddir y strategaeth newydd ar ddefnyddio dyfroedd arfordirol a mewndirol at ddibenion hamdden, a wnewch chi ymrwmo i weithio gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr i sicrhau bod cydweithrediad agos mewn ardaloedd trawsffiniol er mwyn cyflymu'r broses o lunio cytundebau mynediad gwirfoddol?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn gweithio gydag Alun Pugh a sawl sefydliad i ddatrys y broblem o ran defnydd canŵ-wyr o afonydd yng Nghymru yn arbennig, a gobeithiwn y gallwn symud pethau yn eu blaenau ar ddechrau'r haf.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y gwyddoch yn dda, mae bygythiad llifogydd yn fater trawsffiniol ei natur. Bu Dr Marek a minnau'n gysylltiedig ag agor cynllun rheoli llifogydd yn yr Orsedd Goch a Threfalun. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd, neu y gallwch eu cymryd, i sicrhau nad yw'r mesurau atal llifogydd ac amddiffynfeydd arfordirol yn

do not cause flooding problems for us in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware of any measures taken in England that have caused flooding problems in Wales. We have a good working relationship with the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs with regard to flooding, and we ensure that where flood prevention measures are proposed, there will not be a negative effect across the border.

Lloegr yn achosi problemau llifogydd i ni yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw fesurau a gymerwyd yn Lloegr sydd wedi achosi problemau llifogydd yng Nghymru. Mae gennym gydbertynas waith dda ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig o ran llifogydd, a phan gynigir mesurau atal llifogydd, yr ydym yn sicrhau na fyddant yn cael effaith negyddol ar draws y ffin.

Bwyd a Diod o'r Safon Uchaf (Canol De Cymru) Fine Food and Drink (South Wales Central)

Q2 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the production and marketing of fine food and drink in South Wales Central? OAQ1115(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The production of quality food and drink is a key industry in south Wales, and there are a number of major employers in the food manufacturing sector in the region. We have a number of initiatives that promote the production of fine Welsh food and drink.

David Melding: Will you join me in commending the work of the organisers who now put on 35 food and drink festivals? It is a tremendous figure, and in South Wales Central alone, they range from Cardiff's Indian Food Festival to the Cowbridge Food and Drink Festival, during which you can hardly walk down Cowbridge high street. It is a tremendous attraction to tourists that adds greatly to the richness of our life, as well as to my waistline.

Carwyn Jones: I can only agree with you on that point. As far as the Cowbridge Food and Drink Festival is concerned, it received Welsh Assembly Government support. However, it is clear that food festivals are not just a celebration of the countryside and food production, but also a good means of encouraging tourism in areas that were previously not seen to be good areas for tourism.

C2 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynhyrchu a marchnata bwyd a diod o'r safon uchaf yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ1115(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae cynhyrchu bwyd a diod o safon yn ddiwydiant allweddol yn y de, ac mae nifer o gyflogwyr mawr yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu bwyd wedi'u lleoli yn y rhanbarth. Mae gennym nifer o fentrau ar waith sy'n hyrwyddo'r gwaith o gynhyrchu bwyd a diod o'r safon uchaf yng Nghymru.

David Melding: A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ganmol gwaith y trefnwyr sydd bellach yn cynnal 35 o wyliau bwyd a diod? Mae'n ffigur anferth, ac yng Nghanol De Cymru yn unig maent yn amrywio o Wyl Bwyd Indiaidd Caerdydd i Wyl Bwyd a Diod y Bont-faen, lle prin y gallwch gerdded ar hyd stryd fawr y Bont-faen. Mae'n atyniad gwych i dwristiaid sy'n ychwanegu'n fawr at gyfoeth ein bywyd, yn ogystal â'm gwasg.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf ond gytno â chi am hynny. O ran Gwyl Bwyd a Diod y Bont-faen, fe'i cefnogwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad dathliad o gefn gwlad a chynhyrchu bwyd yn unig mo gwyliau bwyd, maent hefyd yn ffordd dda o annog twristiaeth mewn ardaloedd na chawsant eu hystyried yn ardaloedd da i dwristiaeth yn flaenorol.

**Llygredd Arogleuon (Safleoedd Tirlenwi)
Odour Pollution (Landfill Sites)**

Q3 Huw Lewis: Will the Minister make a statement on tackling odour pollution from landfill sites in Wales? OAQ1122(EPC)

C3 Huw Lewis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynd i'r afael â llygredd arogleuon o safleoedd tirlenwi yng Nghymru? OAQ1122(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Landfill operations are subject to tight control under the pollution prevention and control regulations. These are more stringent and site-specific than the old waste management licensing system, and they include standards for air quality. The PPCR permits require progressive re-permitting and are regulated by the Environment Agency.

Carwyn Jones: Caiff gweithrediadau tirlenwi eu rheoli'n llym o dan y rheoliadau atal a rheoli llygredd. Mae'r rhain yn fwy llym a safle-benodol na'r hen system o drwyddedu gweithrediadau rheoli gwastraff, ac maent yn cynnwys safonau ar gyfer ansawdd aer. Mae'r trwyddedau PPCR yn gofyn am ailrwyddedu cynyddol a chânt eu rheoleiddio gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd.

Huw Lewis: Thank you for that reply, and for your recent reply to my letter on the issue. You will know from that letter that complaint levels regarding the Trecatti tip in Dowlais in my constituency are increasing, not just in volume, but also in terms of geographical dispersion. The stink from the tip is now clearly detectable in Rhymney, and as far south as Pentrebach. Do you agree that living alongside this kind of truly pestilential nuisance is unacceptable? Will you also agree to look at the report promised by the Environment Agency on the issue, and hurry it up in terms of providing its findings?

Huw Lewis: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, ac am eich ateb diweddar i'm llythyr ar y mater. Byddwch yn gwybod, o'r llythyr hwnnw, fod nifer y cwynion am safle Trecatti yn Nowlais yn fy etholaeth yn cynyddu, nid yn unig o ran nifer, ond hefyd o ran gwasgariad daeryddol. Erbyn hyn gellir arogl'r drawdod yn Rhymni, ac mor bell â Phentrebach i'r de. A gytunwch fod byw ochr yn ochr â'r math hwn o niwsans heintus yn annerbyniol? A wnewch hefyd gytuno i edrych ar yr adroddiad a addawyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar y mater, a chyflymu'r broses o ddarparu ei ganfyddiadau?

Carwyn Jones: I will do that. You have made many representations to me about Trecatti, and I am aware of the ongoing problems there. It is important not just that the site operator, Biffa, does as much as possible to reduce the problem with odours, but that the Environment Agency keeps a close watch on what is going on. You asked me specifically to look at its report; if I am the Minister in position at the time, I will do so.

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaf hynny. Yr ydych wedi rhoi llawer o sylwadau imi ar Drecatti, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau parhaus yno. Mae'n bwysig bod gweithredwr y safle, Biffa, yn gwneud cymaint â phosibl i leihau'r broblem gydag arogleuon, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig bod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn cadw llygad barcud ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Gofynasoch imi edrych yn benodol ar ei hadroddiad; os mai fi yw'r Gweinidog ar y pryd, gwnaf hynny.

Owen John Thomas: Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl ardal y Groesfaen, lle bu Monsanto yn gwenwyno'r tir gyda sbwriel gwenwynig dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd, yn cael iawndal am hynny, a bod Monsanto yn cwblhau'r gwaith glanhau yn yr ardal?

Owen John Thomas: What steps are you taking to ensure that people in the Groesfaen area, where Monsanto poisoned the land with toxic waste over a period of many years, receive compensation for that, and that Monsanto completes the work of cleaning up that area?

Carwyn Jones: Mae Asiantaeth yr

Carwyn Jones: The Environment Agency is

Amgylchedd ar hyn o bryd yn edrych ar bwy a ddylai dalu—mae'n adolygu'r achosion llys a welir yn yr Unol Daleithiau. O ran yr hyn mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud, yr ydym wedi ariannu astudiaeth o'r safle er mwyn gweld beth yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen. Mae'n rhaid gwneud hynny cyn penderfynu ar yr hyn y dylid ei wneud i adnewyddu'r safle.

Lisa Francis: The best way to eradicate a bad stink is to remove the source. We need more recycling and less landfill. Do you agree that a plastic-sack system for recycling is far more practical than a weekly box system, and that it might also be cheaper? Do you share my disappointment that Carmarthenshire County Council has recently blocked that system, because it says that its collection lorries get far too full too quickly?

Carwyn Jones: I am aware that Bridgend County Council, which is run by the Liberal Democrats and the Conservatives, uses such boxes, so I am sure that the message will reach them. There are difficulties with using boxes—they can get over-full and paper can blow away—but it is up to each local authority to ensure that they have a collection system that is as environmentally friendly as possible, in the sense that the system does not cause paper or bottles to be distributed over a wider area.

currently looking at the issue of who should pay—it is reviewing the court cases brought in the United States. In terms of what the Government has done, we have funded a site study in order to see how best to move forward. That must be done before a decision can be taken on how to renew the site.

Lisa Francis: Y ffordd orau o gael gwared ar ddreudod yw cael gwared ar y ffynhonnell. Mae angen mwy o ailgylchu arnom a llai o dirlenwi. A gytunwch fod system sachau plastig ar gyfer ailgylchu yn llawer mwy ymarferol na system blychau wythnosol, ac y gallai hefyd fod yn rhatach? A ydych yn rhannu fy siom bod Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r system honno yn ddiweddar, am ei fod yn dweud bod ei loriau casglu yn llenwi'n llawer rhy gyflym?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod Cyngor Sir Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a gaiff ei redeg gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Ceidwadwyr, yn defnyddio blychau o'r fath, felly yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y neges yn eu cyrraedd. Mae defnyddio blychau yn peri anawsterau—gallant orlenwi a gall papur chwythu i ffwrdd—ond mater i bob awdurdod lleol yw sicrhau bod ganddo system gasglu sydd mor ecogyfeillgar â phosibl, yn yr ystyr nad yw'r system yn golygu bod papur neu boteli yn chwythu i ffwrdd dros ardal ehangach.

Cerbydau Oddi ar y Ffordd Off-road Vehicles

Q4 Brynle Williams: What discussions has the Minister had with landowners concerning the provision of sites for off-road vehicle use? OAQ1127(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The prime responsibility for consulting with landowners on site provision rests with local planning authorities. The Assembly Government has supported action, for example, by providing extra resources to the Countryside Council for Wales to assist collaborative work on new site and route provision.

Brynle Williams: The encouragement that the Assembly has received from the Wales

C4 Brynle Williams: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda thirfeddianwyr ynghylch darparu safleoedd at ddefnydd cerbydau oddi ar y ffordd? OAQ1127(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Awdurdodau cynllunio lleol sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am ymgynghori â thirfeddianwyr ynghylch darparu safleoedd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnogi camau, er enghraifft, drwy roi adnoddau ychwanegol i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i gynorthwyo gwaith ar y cyd ar safle newydd a darparu llwybrau.

Brynle Williams: Mae'r anogaeth y mae'r Cynulliad wedi ei chael gan grŵp llywio

off-road motorcycling steering group is at odds with the action of local authorities, which continue to turn down applications from landowners for much-needed dedicated sites. What plans do you have to provide the incentive or direction to local authorities to recognise the need for these dedicated sites? We have heard, from all sides of the Chamber, about the urgent need for these sites, but we are slow on action—we do not seem to be getting much done about it.

2.50 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: The draft technical advice note 16 recommends that local planning authorities should undertake an open-space assessment, notwithstanding, of course, Lisa Francis's subordinate legislation, which looks at whether that should be mandatory. That helps to identify the demand for recreational land use, including off-road activity, and it also provides advice on factors to be taken into account in considering specific proposals for new sites. So, draft planning guidance is available.

Janet Davies: Minister, given that Wales must be expected to make its own contribution towards the UK's new and rigorous carbon emission reduction targets, do you think that the use of off-road leisure vehicles is any longer environmentally or socially acceptable?

Carwyn Jones: It is a legal activity, and, as such, it is important that provision is made for that activity to continue. The alternative is to have illegal off-roading, which is both bad for the environment and anti-social.

beiciau modur oddi ar y ffordd Cymru yn mynd yn groes i gamau awdurdodau lleol, sy'n parhau i wrthod ceisiadau gan dirfeddianwyr am safleoedd penodol y mae eu hangen yn fawr. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i roi'r anogaeth neu'r cyfeiriad i awdurdodau lleol gydnabod yr angen am y safleoedd penodol hyn? Yr ydym wedi clywed, gan ddwy ochr y Siambr, am yr angen brys am y safleoedd hyn, ond yr ydym yn araf i weithredu—nid ymddengys ein bod yn gwneud llawer am y peth.

Carwyn Jones: Mae nodyn cyngor technegol drafft 16 yn argymhell y dylai awdurdodau cynllunio lleol gynnal asesiad manau agored, er gwaethaf, wrth gwrs, is-ddeddfwriaeth Lisa Francis, sy'n ystyried a ddylai hynny fod yn orfodol. Mae hynny'n helpu i nodi'r galw am dir at ddibenion hamdden, gan gynnwys gweithgarwch oddi ar y ffordd, a rhydd hefyd gyngor ar ffactorau i'w hystyried wrth feddwl am gynigion penodol ar gyfer safleoedd newydd. Felly, mae canllawiau cynllunio drafft ar gael.

Janet Davies: Weinidog, gan fod disgwyl i Gymru wneud ei chyfraniad ei hun at dargedau lleihau gollyngiadau carbon newydd a chadarn y DU, a gredwch fod y defnydd o gerbydau hamdden oddi ar y ffordd yn dderbyniol mwyach, yn amgylcheddol neu'n gymdeithasol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n weithgarwch cyfreithlon, ac, fel y cyfryw, mae'n bwysig gwneud darpariaeth fel y gall y gweithgarwch hwnnw barhau. Y dewis amgen yw gweithgarwch anghyfreithlon oddi ar y ffordd, sy'n ddrwg i'r amgylchedd ac yn wrthgymdeithasol.

Newid Hinsawdd Climate Change

Q5 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister give an update on action taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to tackle climate change? OAQ1092(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The First Minister made a statement to Plenary on 13 February that,

C5 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am y camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â newid hinsawdd? OAQ1092(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar 13

together with my subsequent statement on sustainable buildings, announced a series of measures to tackle climate change.

Sandy Mewies: On this vital issue, it is important that we all contribute what we can to control the challenge of climate change. So, will you join me in congratulating Flintshire County Council, which, with the Eaga partnership, has provided pensioners' bungalows in Cilcain in my constituency with ground-source heating? That is a similar form of heating to the one that we have here at the Senedd, and it provides them with heating and hot water in an environmentally friendly way. That is ideal in such an area of outstanding natural beauty, which does not have gas, and where oil tanks can be quite a blot on the landscape.

Carwyn Jones: I would commend Flintshire on that initiative, and encourage other local authorities to pursue similar initiatives.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ym maes lleihau ôl-troed carbon, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi bod yn gyndyn iawn i sôn am dargedau—yn wir mae wedi gwawdio'r syniad o gael targedau. Fodd bynnag, sylwais ddoe fod David Miliband wedi gosod targed o sicrhau gostyngiad o o leiaf 26 y cant mewn allyriadau carbon deuocsid erbyn 2020, ac wedi cyfeirio at ffigur o dros 30 y cant. A ydych yn cytuno â phenderfyniad Mr Miliband?

Carwyn Jones: Ydwyf. Yr wyf yn credu ei fod yn gwneud llawer mwy o synnwyr cael targedau Prydeinig na thargedau Cymreig, gan fod cymaint o'r arfau sydd ar gael i leihau gollyngiadau carbon yn nwylo Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r arfau hynny yn cynnwys polisiau ynni a pholisiau trethi, sef y meysydd pwysicaf i newid y ffordd yr ydym yn byw.

Glyn Davies: Minister, the draft climate change Bill has been published with five-year targets. We can have some debate about what the targets should be, and whether they should be consistent in all regions of Britain, but do you not agree that there must be annual rolling targets for there to be any pressure on the Government of the day to

Chwefror yn cyhoeddi, ynghyd â'm datganiad dilynol ar adeiladau cynaliadwy, gyfres o fesurau i ymdrin â newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Sandy Mewies: O ran y mater hollbwysig hwn, mae'n bwysig ein bod oll yn cyfrannu'r hyn a allwn i reoli'r her sy'n deillio o newid yn yr hinsawdd. Felly, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir y Fflint, sydd, ar y cyd â phartneriaeth Eaga, wedi darparu gwres o'r ddaear ym myngalos pensïynwyr yng Nghilcain yn fy etholaeth? Mae'r math hwnnw o wres yn debyg i'r hyn sydd gennym yma yn y Senedd, ac mae'n rhoi gwres a dŵr poeth iddynt mewn modd ecogyfeillgar. Mae hynny'n ddelfrydol mewn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, lle nad oes nwy, a lle y gall tanciau olew anharddu'r dirwedd.

Carwyn Jones: Hoffwn ganmol Sir y Fflint am y fenter honno, ac annog awdurdodau lleol eraill i ddilyn mentrau tebyg.

Alun Ffred Jones: In the field of carbon footprint reduction, the Welsh Assembly Government has been rather reluctant to set targets—indeed, it has been very dismissive of the idea of targets. However, I noticed yesterday that David Miliband has set targets for the reduction of carbon dioxide emissions by a minimum of 26 per cent by 2020, and has referred to a figure of 30 per cent. Would you agree with Mr Miliband's decision?

Carwyn Jones: Yes. I believe that it makes much more sense to have British targets than Welsh targets, as so many of the tools available to reduce carbon emissions lie with the UK Government. Those tools include energy policy and tax policy, which are the most important areas in terms of changing the way that we live.

Glyn Davies: Weinidog, cyhoeddwyd fersiwn drafft y Mesur newid yn yr hinsawdd gyda thargedau pum mlynedd. Gallwn gynnal rhywfaint o drafodaeth ar gynnwys y targedau a pha un a ddylent fod yn gyson ymhob rhan o Brydain, ond oni chytunwch fod yn rhaid cael targedau treigl blynyddol er mwyn rhoi unrhyw bwysau ar y Llywodraeth

actually deliver them? Longer-term targets are always seen as somebody else's problem for the future.

Carwyn Jones: Those targets are what has been proposed in the climate change Bill.

Mick Bates: Minister, I wonder if you agree with the evidence that we heard this morning from Wales Environment Link: that here in Wales we do not collect enough data about carbon and greenhouse-gas emissions, and that when we get the data it is very often two years out of date. Is this lack of up-to-date data the reason why you will not accept annual targets for carbon reduction?

Carwyn Jones: I did not hear the evidence, but I suspect that it is obvious to most people that when you are looking at energy and fiscal policy, those levers lie at Westminster. The only way in which you can set a target that can realistically be reached is if you have those powers in your hands—otherwise, the targets mean nothing.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that bit about targets. As I am sure you would agree, setting targets costs nothing; it is delivering them that is important. One target that you did set for reducing carbon was embodied in TAN 8, and that target was to produce 4 TWh of electricity from renewable resources by 2010. How much renewable electricity has been installed since we adopted TAN 8, and what chance do we have of actually achieving that 4TWh target by 2010?

Carwyn Jones: By my reckoning, the targets are meant to be reached by 2007 rather than 2010. If you want to be a serious party of Government, it is important that you have targets that can realistically be reached—not targets pulled out of thin air.

sydd mewn grym ar y pryd i'w cyflawni mewn gwirionedd? Caiff targedau tymor hwy bob amser eu hystyried fel problem rhywun arall yn y dyfodol.

Carwyn Jones: Y targedau hynny a gynigiwyd yn y Mesur newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Mick Bates: Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno â'r dystiolaeth a glywsom y bore yma gan Cyswllt Amgylchedd Cymru sef nad ydym, yma yng Nghymru, yn casglu digon o ddata ar ollyngiadau carbon a nwy tŷ gwydr, a bod y data, pan y'i cawn, ddwy flynedd ar ei hôl hi. Ai'r ffaith nad oes gennym y data diweddaraf sy'n gyfrifol am y ffaith eich bod yn gwrthod derbyn targedau blynyddol i leihau carbon?

Carwyn Jones: Ni chlywais y dystiolaeth, ond mae'n siŵr ei bod yn amlwg i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl mai San Steffan sydd wrth y llyw, o ran polisi ynni a chyllid. Yr unig ffordd o bennu targed y gellir ei gyflawni'n realistig yw drwy i chi gael y pwerau hynny—fel arall, nid yw'r targedau yn golygu dim.

Mick Bates: Diolch am y wybodaeth am dargedau. Fel yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno, nid yw pennu targedau yn costio dim; eu cyflawni sy'n bwysig. Ymgorfforwyd un targed a bennwyd gennych i leihau carbon yn TAN 8, a'r targed hwnnw oedd cynhyrchu 4 TWh o drydan o adnoddau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Faint o drydan adnewyddadwy a osodwyd ers mabwysiadu TAN 8, a pha siawns sydd gennym o gyflawni'r targed 4TWh hwnnw erbyn 2010?

Carwyn Jones: O'r hyn a ddeallaf, dylid bod yn cyflawni'r targedau erbyn 2007 yn hytrach na 2010. Os ydych am fod yn Llywodraeth ddifrifol, mae'n bwysig bod gennych dargedau y gellir eu cyflawni'n realistig—nid targedau chwit chwat.

Labelu Labelling

Q6 William Graham: Will the Minister outline discussions held with farming organisations concerning the inclusion of green standards environment data on produce

C6 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd gyda mudiadau ffermio ynghylch cynnwys data amgylcheddol 'safonau

labels? OAQ1109(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I have had no discussions with farming organisations but we continue to explore ways of using the fact that we have agri-environment schemes, for example, as a way of being able to promote the products that we have in Wales.

William Graham: Will you comment on the suggested plans for an eco-label that shows the amount of greenhouse gases involved in growing and transporting particular produce? Have you had any input into such discussions that would bring about the development of environmental standards specifically for Welsh food?

Carwyn Jones: We will be consulting with the UK Government on the eco-label standard. However, we must ensure that we do not have so many labels that consumers become blasé about what they see. Nevertheless, we will be liaising on the best way forward on that.

Elin Jones: Mae rhywfaint o labelu bwydydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd i ddangos bwydydd sy'n amgylcheddol neu'n gymdeithasol dda, megis bwydydd organig neu fwydydd masnach deg. A yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ystyried labelu bwydydd sy'n niweidiol i'r amgylchedd? Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at gig eidion o Frasil, o wartheg sy'n pori ar diroedd wedi'u clirio o goedwigoedd yr Amazon.

Carwyn Jones: Mae perygl yn hynny o beth. O ddechrau gwneud hynny gyda chig eidion o Frasil, er enghraifft, mae'n siŵr gennyf y byddai rhywfaint o gynnyrch Prydeinig yn cwmpo i'r un twll. Mae'n syniad diddorol ond byddai'n rhaid edrych yn fanwl ar yr hyn fyddai'n cael ei ddiffinio fel rhywbeth a fyddai o les i'r amgylchedd.

Peter Black: Will the Government engage with the sustainable supermarkets forum, set up by the Welsh Consumer Council in conjunction with my colleague, Mick Bates? Do you agree that, in terms of labelling, the best way to deal with this issue is to have more locally sourced produce in supermarkets? How can your Government

gwyrdd' ar labeli cynnyrch? OAQ1109(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda sefydliadau ffermio ond yr ydym yn parhau i archwilio ffyrdd o ddefnyddio'r ffaith bod gennym gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, er enghraifft, fel ffordd o allu hyrwyddo cynhyrchion Cymreig.

William Graham: A wnewch sylw ar y cynlluniau arfaethedig i gyflwyno eco-label sy'n dangos faint o nwyon tŷ gwydr a gynhyrchir yn sgîl tyfu a chludo cynnyrch penodol? A ydych wedi cyfrannu at unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath a fyddai'n arwain at ddatblygu safonau amgylcheddol, yn benodol i fwyd Cymreig?

Carwyn Jones: Byddwn yn ymgynghori â Llywodraeth y DU ar safon ar gyfer yr eco-label. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau nad oes cymaint o labeli fel bod defnyddwyr yn ddifater ynghylch yr hyn a welant. Serch hynny, byddwn yn trafod y ffordd orau ymlaen yn hynny o beth.

Elin Jones: Some food labelling is already seen in order to show which foods are environmentally or socially friendly, such as organic or faire trade foods. Has the Government considered labelling foods that are environmentally damaging? I refer specifically to Brazilian beef, which comes from cattle grazed on land reclaimed from the Amazon forests.

Carwyn Jones: There is a danger in that. If you start doing that with Brazilian beef, for example, I am sure that some British produce would fall into the same category. It is an interesting idea but you would have to give detailed consideration to what would be defined as environmentally friendly.

Peter Black: A wnaiff y Llywodraeth ymgysylltu â'r fforwm archfarchnadoedd cynaliadwy, a sefydlwyd gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru ar y cyd â'm cyd-Aelod, Mick Bates? A gytunwch, o ran labelu, mai'r ffordd orau o ymdrin â'r mater hwn yw drwy gael mwy o gynnyrch lleol mewn archfarchnadoedd? Sut y gall eich

work to achieve that?

Carwyn Jones: I think that that is happening in any case. We have procurement initiatives that have enabled Welsh beef, for example, to get into every NHS trust, bar one, in Wales. We also have to balance out the need to source more food locally against the realisation that many countries rely on being able to export to the European market for their livelihoods. It is a difficult balance to strike, but it does not mean that there is no more scope for local food production and its sale in supermarkets. Clearly, there is more scope for that.

Llywodraeth weithio i gyflawni hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Credaf fod hynny'n digwydd beth bynnag. Mae gennym fentrau caffael sydd wedi ein galluogi i ddarparu cig eidion Cymreig, er enghraifft, ymhob un o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, namyn un, yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni hefyd gydbwysu'r angen i ddarparu mwy o fwyd lleol â'r sylweddoliad bod llawer o wledydd yn dibynnu ar allu allforio i'r farchnad Ewropeaidd ar gyfer eu bywoliaeth. Mae'n anodd cael y cydbwysedd hwnnw, ond nid yw'n golygu nad oes mwy o le i gynhyrchu bwyd lleol a'i werthu mewn archfarchnadoedd. Yn amlwg, mae mwy o le i wneud hynny.

Lleihau Cefnogaeth Amaethyddol Reducing Agricultural Support

Q7 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact to the rural economy of reducing agricultural support? OAQ1097(EPC)

C7 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith lleihau cefnogaeth amaethyddol ar yr economi wledig? OAQ1097(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware that there are reductions in agricultural support planned.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o gynlluniau i leihau cefnogaeth amaethyddol.

Kirsty Williams: Something must have passed you by in the last few months, because the reduction by the Government, ably abetted by Plaid Cymru, of the Tir Mynydd budget in the initial budget rounds has potentially left a shortfall of £12 million in that budget. Do you agree that upland farmers' ability to survive with such reducing income places a huge environmental burden on the Welsh Assembly Government? If the farmers are not there to look after the uplands, who will be there?

Kirsty Williams: Rhaid eich bod wedi methu rhywbeth yn yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, oherwydd mae'r gostyngiad yng nghyllideb Tir Mynydd, a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth, gyda chymorth Plaid Cymru, yn ystod cylchoedd cychwynnol y gyllideb, wedi gadael diffyg posibl o £12 miliwn yn y gyllideb honno. A gytunwch fod gallu ffermwyr ucheldir i oroesi gydag incwm sy'n lleihau cymaint yn rhoi baich amgylcheddol enfawr ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Os nad yw'r ffermwyr yno i ofalu am yr ucheldiroedd, pwy fydd yno?

Carwyn Jones: The Tir Cymru budget, of which Tir Mynydd is a part, has remained the same; there is no reduction in agricultural support. However, I note that, in the last meeting of the for Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, the Lib Dem Member voted to reduce Tir Mynydd payments in any case, from £36 million to £29 million. I have no doubt that the Lib Dems will do the same in Plenary in a fortnight's time. We were honest about what we wished to do; we said that, due to the

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyllideb Tir Cymru, y mae Tir Mynydd yn rhan ohoni, wedi aros yr un peth; ni fu gostyngiad mewn cefnogaeth amaethyddol. Fodd bynnag, nodaf, yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, i Aelod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bleidleisio dros leihau taliadau Tir Mynydd beth bynnag, o £36 miliwn i £29 miliwn. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth na wnaiff y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yr un peth yn y Cyfarfod Llawn mewn pythefnos. Yr oeddem

requirements of the rural development plan, we had to reduce Tir Mynydd payments to £24 million initially, then £22 million. We did not want to reduce Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal, but the Lib Dems have managed to vote to reduce all three.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gydnabod gwaith Elin Jones yn sicrhau bod cronfa Tir Mynydd yn cael ei diogelu ar gyfer y dyfodol; mae'r undebau amaethyddol yn cydnabod hynny hefyd. Mewn cyfnod pan fo pwysau ar ffermwyr, a gytunwch mai'r peth pwysig yw ychwanegu gwerth at gynnyrch ffermwyr? A ydych yn cydnabod bod hwn yn gyfnod tyngedfennol i ffatri Dansco yng Nghastellnewydd Emlyn? Gwn eich bod wedi bod yn gefnogol yn y gorffennol, gan gwrdd â ffermwyr ac yn y blaen, felly, a wnewch chi geisio sicrhau bod y banciau'n gweithredu i achub y cwmnïau hynny yn yr awr dyngedfennol hon?

3.00 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaf fy ngorau i sicrhau hynny. Fel y dywedais, bu ffatri yng Nghastellnewydd Emlyn ers degawdau ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ceisio gwarchod y swyddi sydd yno a bywoliaeth rhai o'r ffermwyr sy'n cynhyrchu'r llaeth ar gyfer y ffatri.

Brynle Williams: I will not go near Tir Mynydd, but you have recognised that moneys provided to upland farming stay in the immediate community. Therefore, reducing that support would undermine the whole range of rural businesses that are dependent on farming. You know that post offices and schools are closing. The money invested by this Government in the uplands always stays local; it supports local industry and keeps local employment. Do you agree that the money stays local?

Carwyn Jones: Clearly, money that is pumped into the rural economy is of help to the rural economy. It is also important that we have schemes that can be justified in terms of how much they pay and the ethos on which they are based. We must remember

yn onest ynghylch yr hyn yr oeddem am ei wneud; dywedasom, o ganlyniad i ofynion y cynllun datblygu gwledig, fod yn rhaid lleihau taliadau Tir Mynydd o £24 miliwn i gychwyn, ac yna i £22 miliwn. Nid oeddem am leihau Tir Gofal na Thir Mynydd, ond mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi llwyddo i bleidleisio i leihau'r tri.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am pleased to be able to recognise the work done by Elin Jones on ensuring that Tir Mynydd is safeguarded for the future; that is also recognised by the agricultural unions. In a time of pressure on farmers, do you agree that it is important to add value to agricultural produce? Do you recognise that this is a critical period for the Dansco factory in Newcastle Emlyn? I know that you have been supportive in the past, and have met with farmers and so on, so will you try to ensure that the banks act to save these companies at this critical time?

Carwyn Jones: I will do my best to do that. As I said, there has been a factory in Newcastle Emlyn for decades and it is important that we try to safeguard the jobs and the livelihoods of some of the farmers who produce the milk for the factory.

Brynle Williams: Nid af yn agos at Dir Mynydd, ond yr ydych wedi cydnabod bod yr arian a ddarperir ym maes ffermio ucheldir yn aros yn y gymuned gyfagos. Felly, byddai lleihau'r cymorth hwnnw'n tansilio'r amrywiaeth eang o fusnesau gwledig sy'n ddibynnol ar ffermio. Gwyddoch fod swyddfeydd post ac ysgolion yn cau. Mae'r arian a fuddsoddir gan y Llywodraeth hon yn yr ucheldiroedd yn aros yn lleol bob amser; mae'n cefnogi diwydiant lleol ac yn cadw gwaith yn lleol. A ydych yn cytuno bod yr arian yn aros yn lleol?

Carwyn Jones: Yn amlwg, mae arian a roddir i'r economi wledig o gymorth i'r economi wledig. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym gynlluniau y gellir eu cyfiawnhau o ran faint y maent yn ei dalu ac o ran pa ethos y maent yn seiliedig arno hefyd. Mae'n bwysig inni

that around £230 million a year is paid to farmers on time, and that money goes into the Welsh rural economy. Today, I made the announcement on the payment of Tir Mynydd in the committee. That is a fair deal, at the very least, as far as farmers are concerned.

gofio y caiff tua £230 miliwn y flwyddyn ei dalu ar amser i ffermwyr, ac mae'r arian hwnnw yn mynd i economi wledig Cymru. Heddiw, gwneuthum gyhoeddiad ynghylch taliadau Tir Mynydd yn y pwyllgor. Mae hynny'n gynnig teg, a dweud y lleiaf, i ffermwyr.

Cynllun Iawndal ar gyfer Halogiad GM Compensation Scheme for GM Contamination

Q8 Jocelyn Davies: What recent discussions has the Minister held regarding establishing a compensation scheme for GM contamination? OAQ1087(EPC)

C8 Jocelyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch sefydlu cynllun iawndal ar gyfer halogiad GM? OAQ1087(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I have not had recent discussions on this, but I intend to seek views on many options to provide redress for the potential GM contamination of non-GM crops as part of our GM co-existence consultation exercise.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau diweddar ynglŷn â hyn, ond bwriadaf gael barn ar lawer o opsiynau i ddarparu iawndal mewn perthynas ag achosion posibl o halogiad GM i gnydau nad ydynt yn GM fel rhan o'n ymarfer ymgynghori ar gydfodolaeth GM.

Jocelyn Davies: In March 2004, you committed to investigate the possibility of establishing a consultation scheme, so it is only fair to ask you now what progress you have managed to make in the three years that have lapsed.

Jocelyn Davies: Ym mis Mawrth 2004, gwnaethoch ymrwmo i ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o sefydlu cynllun ymgynghori, felly mae'n deg inni ofyn bellach pa gynnydd yr ydych wedi llwyddo i'w wneud yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf.

Carwyn Jones: Progress has not been particularly hasty because we have not had a problem with GM contamination in that time. However, we have said that operators should be liable for the remediation costs of contamination, even if the deliberate release were carried out lawfully and in accordance with any permit they might have; that is a significant step forward for liability. We are working towards a compensation regime, although it does not seem likely that we will have any difficulties with the release of GM crops for the foreseeable future.

Carwyn Jones: Ni fu'r cynnydd yn gyflym iawn oherwydd ni chawsom broblem gyda halogiad GM yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi dweud y dylai gweithredwyr fod yn atebol am gostau adfer halogi, hyd yn oed pe cynhaliwyd y broses rhyddhau bwriadol yn gyfreithiol ac yn unol ag unrhyw drwydded a allai fod ganddynt; mae hynny'n gam allweddol ymlaen o ran atebolrwydd. Yr ydym yn gweithio tuag at gyfundrefn iawndal, er nad yw'n edrych yn debygol y byddwn yn cael unrhyw anhawster o ran rhyddhau cnydau GM yn y dyfodol agos.

Laura Anne Jones: If we are serious about GM crop contamination and keeping Wales GM-free, what discussions are you having with the agricultural sector in England to ensure that we are protected from open farms situated just across our border? I am thinking particularly of mid Wales.

Laura Anne Jones: Os ydym o ddifrif am halogiad cnydau GM a chadw Cymru'n rhydd o GM, pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cynnal gyda'r sector amaethyddol yn Lloegr i sicrhau y cawn ein diogelu rhag ffermydd agored sydd wedi'u lleoli nid nepell wrth y ffin? Yr wyf yn meddwl am ganolbarth Cymru yn arbennig.

Carwyn Jones: We cannot directly influence any decision made in England, as we would not expect it to seek to influence decisions made in Wales. However, it is fair to say that the approach towards the growing of GM crops has seen a moving together of our two administrations over the last few years.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allwn ddylanwadu'n uniongyrchol ar unrhyw benderfyniad a wneir yn Lloegr, gan na fyddem yn disgwyl iddi geisio dylanwadu ar y penderfyniadau a wneir yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud bod yr ymagwedd tuag at dyfu cynydu GM wedi peri i'n dwy weinyddiaeth symud gyda'n gilydd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Cyllid Tir Mynydd Tir Mynydd Funding

Q9 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on funding for Tir Mynydd? OAQ1098(EPC)

C9 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllid ar gyfer Tir Mynydd? OAQ1098(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I refer Kirsty to the statement that I made some moments ago.

Carwyn Jones: Cyfeiriaf Kirsty at y datganiad a wneuthum rai munudau yn ôl.

Kirsty Williams: As far as I can see, there was no vote in the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee to get rid of Tir Mynydd money. There has been only one vote to do so, and that was during the negotiations on the budget on the floor of the Chamber, when you and Plaid Cymru voted to cut £12 million. That is the truth of Tir Mynydd. Do you agree that, in cutting that money, you are damaging the environment and the economy of rural Wales?

Kirsty Williams: Hyd y gwelaf, nid oedd pleidlais ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i gael gwared ar arian Tir Mynydd. Dim ond un bleidlais a fu dros wneud hynny, a digwyddodd hynny yn ystod y negodiadau ar y gyllideb ar lawr y Siambr, pan bleidleisioch chi a Phlaid Cymru i dorri £12 miliwn o'r gyllideb. Dyna'r gwir am Dir Mynydd. A ydych yn cytuno, wrth gwtogi'r arian hwnnw, eich bod yn difrodi amgylchedd ac economi Cymru wledig?

Carwyn Jones: This from the party that is voting to cut Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal. Let me remind you of what happened: there was a vote in the committee. Mick Bates, who, as far as I can recall, is a member of the Liberal Democrats, voted to reduce Tir Mynydd in favour of Elin Jones's proposal. He also voted—and I do not know whether he is trying to deny it now—to reduce the funding for Tir Cynnal and for Tir Gofal. The Liberal Democrats may want to run away from this, but they surely cannot distort recent history.

Carwyn Jones: Daw hyn gan y blaid sy'n pleidleisio i gael gwared ar Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal. Gadewch imi'ch hatgoffa o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd: bu pleidlais yn y pwyllgor. Pleidleisiodd Mick Bates, sydd, cyn belled ag yr wyf i'n cofio, yn aelod o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, i leihau cyllid Tir Mynydd gan dderbyn cynnig Elin Jones. Pleidleisiodd hefyd—ac nid wyf yn gwybod a yw'n ceisio gwadu hynny bellach—i leihau cyllid Tir Cynnal a Thir Gofal. Efallai yr hoffai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddianc rhag hyn, ond ni allant, does bosibl, myndroi hanes diweddar.

Elin Jones: Efallai yr hoffech gymryd y cyfle hwn, Weinidog, i atgoffa'r Siambr fod arweinydd grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ynghyd ag arweinyddion y gwrthbleidiau eraill, wedi cytuno'r drefn gyda chi a'ch Llywodraeth o ran adfer cyllideb Tir Mynydd, a bu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gyfan gwbl gefnogol i'r

Elin Jones: You might like to take this opportunity, Minister, to remind the Chamber that the leader of the Liberal Democrat group, along with the leaders of the other opposition parties, agreed the system for bringing back the Tir Mynydd budget with you and your Government, and that the Liberal Democrats were entirely supportive of that process

broses honno cyn pleidleisio ar y gyllideb.

before the vote on the budget.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf ychwanegu dim at hynny.

Carwyn Jones: I can add nothing to that.

Bwyd a Diod o Safon Fine Food and Drink

Q10 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of fine food and drink from Wales? OAQ1116(EPC)

C10 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hybu bwyd a diod o'r safon orau o Gymru? OAQ1116(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I refer you in part to the answer that I gave to question 2, and I will also say simply that our desire to promote fine food and drink is not just for south Wales, but for the whole of Wales.

Carwyn Jones: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf yn rhannol at yr ateb a roddais yng nghwestiwn 2, a dywedaf yn syml mai ein hawydd yw hybu bwyd a diod o safon ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, ac nid y de yn unig.

David Melding: In a recent survey, 68 per cent of tourists said that access to fine food and drink was a critical factor in their choice of holiday destination. Do you agree that we need to market very aggressively our fine drink, fine cheese, our wonderful seafood, and so on, in Wales? Do you also agree that we must highlight in the UK and abroad how many food and drink festivals we have?

David Melding: Mewn arolwg diweddar, dywedodd 68 y cant o dwristiaid bod cael gafael ar fwyd a diod o safon yn ffactor allweddol yn eu dewis o gyrchfan gwyliau. A gytunwch fod angen inni farchnata ein diod a'n caws o safon, ein bwyd môr ardderchog, ac ati, yn ddwys yng Nghymru? A gytunwch hefyd fod rhaid inni dynnu sylw at yr holl wyliau bwyd a diod sydd gennym yng Nghymru yn y DU a thramor?

Carwyn Jones: I think that we are successful in doing that. We have a number of restaurants and hotels that now offer a good package in terms of food and drink. The important thing to remember is that the food and drink sector in Wales employs more and more people. That is important not just for their employment, but also to ensure that value is added in Wales—that processing takes place in Wales, and that we are not just seen as the producers of raw materials.

Carwyn Jones: Credaf ein bod yn gwneud hynny'n llwyddiannus. Mae gennym nifer o fwytai a gwestai sy'n cynnig bargaen dda bellach o ran bwyd a diod. Y peth pwysig i'w gofio yw bod y sector bwyd a diod yng Nghymru yn cyflogi mwy a mwy o bobl. Mae hynny'n bwysig nid yn unig i'w cyflogaeth, ond er mwyn sicrhau yr ychwanegir gwerth yng Nghymru—bod y prosesu yn digwydd yng Nghymru, ac na chawn ein hystyried yn wlad sy'n cynhyrchu deunyddiau crai yn unig.

Cnydau Ynni Energy Crops

Q11 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister make a statement on planning for energy crops in Wales? OAQ1103(EPC)

C11 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynllunio ar gyfer cnydau ynni yng Nghymru? OAQ1103(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: We provide grants under the wood energy business scheme to encourage the establishment of a network of small to medium-scale wood fuel plans.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym yn rhoi grantiau o dan gynllun busnes ynni pren er mwyn annog y gwaith o sefydlu rhwydwaith o gynlluniau tanwydd pren o faint bach a chanolig.

Eleanor Burnham: My understanding is

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y deallaf, yn Lloegr,

that, in England, the Government has set aside £29 million in grants for farmers who seek to grow energy crops. My understanding is that no grants are currently available in Wales. Will you do anything, in the next couple of weeks, to put something in train for the next few years?

Carwyn Jones: In order to provide a scheme along the lines of what we see in England, it would require moving moneys around the rural development plan, which could mean a further cut in the Tir Mynydd budget.

mae'r Llywodraeth wedi clustnodi £29 miliwn mewn grantiau i ffermwyr sydd am dyfu cynydau ynni. Fel y deallaf, nid oes grantiau ar gael yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Dros yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf, a wnewch chi unrhyw beth i roi rhywbeth ar waith ar gyfer y blynyddoedd nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Er mwyn darparu cynllun yn dilyn yr hyn a welwn yn Lloegr, byddai angen symud arian o amgylch y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a allai olygu toriad pellach yng nghyllideb Tir Mynydd.

Glendid Afonydd The Cleanliness of Rivers

Q12 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister make a statement on what work the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to ensure the cleanliness of rivers in Wales? OAQ1121(EPC)

C12 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwaith y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod afonydd Cymru yn lân? OAQ1121(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I place a high priority on maintaining and improving the quality of our rivers, as outlined in the environment strategy for Wales.

Carwyn Jones: Rhoddaf flaenoriaeth i gynnal a gwella ansawdd ein hafonydd, fel yr amlinellwyd yn y strategaeth amgylcheddol ar gyfer Cymru.

Lynne Neagle: I recently wrote to you regarding the Afon Llwyd in my constituency, where, just outside Pontypool, a number of local people are complaining about sewage and associated rag being released untreated into the river system. I have been to the spot where this has been occurring and I can vouch for the deeply unpleasant and unhygienic nature of the problem. Minister, will you raise this matter with Welsh Water, which seems to think that it has an agreement that allows this kind of release, but which is unaware, I believe, of exactly what is happening on this site?

Lynne Neagle: Yn ddiweddar, ysgrifennais atoch parthed Afon Llwyd yn fy etholaeth lle mae nifer o bobl leol y tu allan i Bont-y-pŵl yn cwyno am garthion a deunyddiau crai cysylltiedig yn cael eu gollwng i system yr afon heb eu trin. Bùm i'r man lle y digwyddodd hyn a gallaf gadarnhau bod hyn yn creu problem amhlesurus ac aflan. Weinidog, a wnewch chi godi'r mater hwn gyda Dŵr Cymru, sydd o'r farn bod ganddo gytundeb sy'n caniatáu gollyngiadau o'r fath, ond nad yw'n ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd ar y safle hwn, yn fy marn i.

Carwyn Jones: You have written to me about the Afon Llwyd. We are investigating the concerns that you raised, and I will reply to you shortly.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch Afon Llwyd. Yr ydym yn ymchwilio i'r pryderon a godwyd gennych, a byddaf yn ymateb ichi cyn hir.

Alun Cairns: Will the Minister tell us about his negotiations and discussions with the Environment Agency on this issue? There are several local issues, and the response of the Environment Agency is not always positive. What discussions has he had—or what protestations has he heard—in this respect?

Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym am ei drafodaethau ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ar y mater hwn? Mae sawl mater lleol, ac nid yw ymateb Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gadarnhaol bob tro. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd—neu pa wrthdystiadau a glywodd—yn hyn o beth?

Carwyn Jones: I am unaware of any difficulties having been raised with me; however, I am sure that people will have raised problems with the Environment Agency. Nevertheless, in Wales, a number of incidences still remain every year of sewage being discharged, and I know that Welsh Water is working hard to ensure that they are minimised.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anawsterau a godwyd gyda mi; fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl wedi codi problemau gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Er hynny, yng Nghymru, ceir nifer o achosion bob blwyddyn o garthion yn cael eu gollwng, a gwn fod Dŵr Cymru'n gweithio'n galed iawn i sicrhau y caiff nifer y gollyngiadau hynny eu lleihau i'r eithaf.

Difrod i Safleoedd o Ddiddordeb Gwyddonol Arbennig Damaged Sites of Special Scientific Interest

Q13 Michael German: How many sites of special scientific interest have been damaged in the lifetime of the Assembly? OAQ1100(EPC)

C13 Michael German: Sawl safle o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig a ddifrodwyd yn ystod oes y Cynulliad? OAQ1100(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Two hundred and fifty eight.

Carwyn Jones: Dau gant pum deg wyth.

Michael German: That is an indictment of the fact that we have sites of special scientific interest being damaged at such a significant rate. Have you given attention to what will happen in future when climate change will have an effect on our SSSIs? Have you given any instruction to the Countryside Council for Wales to prepare for climate change in respect of those sites?

Michael German: Mae hynny'n cadarnhau'r ffaith bod gennym safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig yn cael eu difrodi ar raddfa mor sylweddol. A roesoch unrhyw sylw i'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol pan fydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn effeithio ar ein SoDdGA? A roesoch unrhyw gyfarwyddyd i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru i baratoi ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd o ran y safleoedd hynny?

Carwyn Jones: First, CCW is working with landowners to prepare a management plan for all SSSIs. When SSSIs are damaged, action needs to be taken to deal with that situation. I have been working with CCW to look at the possibility of what are called 'green highways'. As we see climate change take root in Wales, it may be that some species that, historically, have been protected in situ in an SSSI will move to another area of land that is not protected, so CCW is looking at the concept of what we might call 'mobile' sites of special scientific interest now.

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, mae CCGC yn gweithio gyda thirfeddianwyr i baratoi cynllun rheoli i bob SoDdGA. Pan ddifrodir SoDdGA, mae angen cymryd camau gweithredu i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa honno. Bùm yn gweithio gyda CCGC i ystyried y posibilrwydd o'r hyn a elwir yn 'briffyrdd gwyrdd'. Wrth i newid yn yr hinsawdd gael ei dderbyn yng Nghymru, mae'n bosibl y bydd rhai rhywogaethau a ddiogelwyd yn y fan a'r lle, yn hanesyddol, mewn SoDdGA yn symud i ardal arall o dir nad yw wedi'i diogelu, felly mae CCGC yn ystyried y cysyniad o'r hyn y gallem ei alw'n safleoedd 'symudol' o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig bellach.

3.10 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: Farmers still have to abide by management orders or restrictions even when the reasons for the original scientific interest, such as wildlife, may have

Mark Isherwood: Rhaid i ffermwyr lynu wrth orchmynion rheoli neu gyfyngiadau o hyd, hyd yn oed pan na fydd y rhesymau dros y diddordeb gwyddonol gwreiddiol, fel

moved on. How do you respond to the call by the Farmers' Union of Wales for regular reviews of SSSIs so that farmers do not have to comply with an order in perpetuity, even when the reason for it no longer applies?

Carwyn Jones: If it is felt that a SSSI should not longer be an SSSI, the landowner can raise the matter with the CCW.

bywyd gwyllt, yn berthnasol mwyach. Sut ydych yn ymateb i'r alwad gan Undeb Ffermwyr Cymru i gynnal adolygiadau rheolaidd o SoDdGA fel nad oes rhaid i ffermwyr gydymffurfio â gorchymyn am byth, hyd yn oed pan nad yw'r rheswm drosto yn gymwys mwyach?

Carwyn Jones: Os credir na ddylai SoDdGA fod yn SoDdGA mwyach, gall y tîrfeddiannwr godi'r mater gyda CCGC.

Datganiad am Bolisi Gwyddoniaeth a Gwyddoniaeth yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru

Statement on Science Policy and Science in the Welsh Assembly Government

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Gyda'ch caniatâd, Dirprwy Lywydd, yr wyf yn awyddus i gadw'r Cynulliad yn y darlun o ran y datblygiadau diweddaraf ym maes gwyddoniaeth ers lansiad y polisi gwyddoniaeth i Gymru ym Mangor, yn y Ganolfan Ecoleg a Hydroleg, ym mis Tachwedd.

Yr wyf wedi sefydlu grŵp ymgynghorol uwch ar wyddoniaeth, er mwyn fy helpu wrth ddelio â phrif gwestiynau gwyddonol gwaith y Llywodraeth, a hefyd i annog cydweithio a chydweithredu rhwng yr wyth prif grŵp o wyddonwyr sy'n gweithio yn y weinyddiaeth.

Budget provision of £3 million has now been included for the financial year about to start and henceforth, to encourage medical charities to contract for more research work done by research teams based in Wales. This ends the competitive handicaps suffered by our medical research teams, compared with Scotland and England, where budget provision already covered the substantial departmental overhead costs of medical research work. Customarily, medical charities pay only for the direct costs of the medical research contracts that they give, which is estimated to be only 57 per cent of the total costs involved. The new £3 million-worth fund should enable our universities to cover around 80 per cent of the costs, which, as intended, is already creating a positive response in the Wellcome Trust and the Association of Medical Research Charities, the trade body for those charities.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): With your permission, Deputy Presiding Officer, I am eager to keep the Assembly in the picture with regard to the latest developments in the field of science since the launch of the Wales science policy in Bangor, in the Centre for Ecology and Hydrology, back in November.

I have set up a senior science advisory group to assist me in addressing the main science-related issues in the work of the Assembly, and to encourage collaboration and co-operation between the eight main groups of scientists working in the administration.

Cynhwyswyd darpariaeth o £3 miliwn yn y gyllideb bellach ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol sydd ar fin dechrau ac o hyn allan, i annog elusennau meddygol i roi timau ymchwil o dan gontract i gynnal mwy o waith ymchwil yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn dileu'r anfanteision cystadleuol a wynebodd ein timau ymchwil meddygol, o gymharu â'r Alban a Lloegr, lle yr oedd y gyllideb a ddarparwyd eisoes yn talu costau gorbenion adrannol sylweddol gwaith ymchwil meddygol. Fel arfer, dim ond costau uniongyrchol y contractau ymchwil meddygol a roddant y bydd elusennau yn talu amdanynt, sef dim ond 57 y cant o gyfanswm y costau dan sylw yn ôl yr amcangyfrif. Dylai'r gronfa newydd gwerth £3 miliwn alluogi ein prifysgolion i dalu tua 80 y cant o'r costau, sydd, yn unol â'r bwriad, eisoes yn creu ymateb cadarnhaol gan y Wellcome Trust a Chymdeithas Elusennau Ymchwil

Feddygol, sef y corff masnachu ar gyfer yr elusennau hynny.

The recently commenced investment of some £16 million in the PET scanner facility in Cardiff University is also a fundamental building block in putting Welsh medical and psychological research at the leading edge of the latest world developments in science. The impending convergence programmes for west Wales and the Valleys, currently under intense negotiation in Brussels, will provide resources to help to drive our science policy. They have a key objective: to improve knowledge and innovation for growth by fostering research and development, innovation, and technology and its commercial exploitation. Welsh higher and further education and businesses will be incentivised to work together to promote technology development, technology transfer and commercialisation, and to increase their access to the European Union's new and significant seventh research and development framework.

Among the social science research projects that we undertake to promote evidence-based government are: research on the impacts on Wales of economic migration; age-related housing and care, and the support needs of older people to respond to Welsh demographic shifts; the Futures project, undertaken by the economic advice division on key longer term economic trends; evaluations of the primary school free breakfast initiative and the national physical exercise referral scheme, both of which involve innovative trial methodologies; the review of the equalities evidence base; and research on citizens' overall satisfaction.

On environmental matters, there are some 50 scientific and allied staff in the technical services division to provide advice and support to Ministers and policy officials, including advice on the 2007-13 rural development plan, the environment strategy, and the structural funds strategic frameworks. This group deploys an annual research budget of £1 million, covering some 20 to 25 projects. Wales also benefits from advice from the Environment Agency Wales, the

Mae'r buddsoddiad diweddar o tua £16 miliwn yn y cyfleuster sganiwr PET ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd hefyd yn floc adeiladu sylfaenol ar gyfer sicrhau bod ymchwil feddygol a seicolegol Cymru ar y blaen yn fyd-eang o ran y datblygiadau diweddaraf ym maes gwyddoniaeth. Bydd y rhaglenni cydgyfeirio sydd ar droed ar gyfer y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, sy'n cael eu trafod yn ddwys ym Mrwsel ar hyn o bryd, yn darparu adnoddau i helpu i lywio ein polisi gwyddoniaeth. Mae ganddynt nod allweddol: gwella gwybodaeth ac arloesedd ar gyfer twf drwy feithrin ymchwil a datblygu, arloesedd, a thechnoleg a'r defnydd masnachol a wneir ohoni. Caiff addysg uwch, addysg bellach a busnesau Cymru eu hysgogi i gydweithio i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o ddatblygu technoleg, trosglwyddo technoleg a masnacheiddio, a chynyddu eu mynediad i seithfed fframwaith ymchwil a datblygu newydd sylweddol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Ymhlith y prosiectau ymchwil gwyddoniaeth cymdeithasol yr ymgwymerwn â hwy i hyrwyddo llywodraeth sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth mae: ymchwil ar effeithiau ymfudiad economaidd ar Gymru; tai a gofal sy'n gysylltiedig ag oedran, ac anghenion cymorth pobl hŷn i ymateb i newidiadau demograffig Cymru; prosiect Futures, yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef gan yr isadran cyngor economaidd ar dueddiadau economaidd tymor hwy allweddol; gwerthusiadau o'r fenter brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion cynradd a'r cynllun cyfeirio ymarfer corff cenedlaethol, sydd ill dau yn cynnwys methodolegau treialu arloesol; adolygu sylfaen tystiolaeth cydraddoldebau; ac ymchwil ar foddhad cyffredinol dinasyddion.

O ran materion amgylcheddol, mae tua 50 o staff gwyddonol a pherthynol yn yr is-adran gwasanaethau technegol i ddarparu cyngor a chymorth i Weinidogion a swyddogion polisïau, yn cynnwys cyngor ar gynllun datblygu gwledig 2007-13, y strategaeth amgylcheddol, a fframweithiau strategol y cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae'r grŵp hwn yn trefnu cyllideb ymchwil flynyddol o £1 filiwn, sy'n cwmpasu tua 20 i 25 o brosiectau. Mae Cymru hefyd yn elwa ar

Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research at Aberystwyth, and the research Centre for Ecology and Hydrology in Bangor, which has already been mentioned. The directors of both of these non-devolved public sector research establishments were recently able to attend the second meeting of my senior science advisers group.

Energy policy is not devolved, but initiatives such as the Welsh Energy Research Centre and the Engineering Centre for Manufacturing and Materials—ECM²—in Port Talbot bring together interest and expertise from across Wales and apply them to new energy technologies, including part-funding a study of how to harness the Severn estuary's massive tidal power.

In economic development, the insertion of SMARTCymru grant applications into the mainstream of regional selective assistance indicates our enhanced science and technology priorities. Recent successes include a £1 million grant to Protherics UK Ltd, Ceredigion to apply its CytoFab technology in the search to find a cure for septicaemia. The £10 million autonomous systems technology related airborne evaluation and assessment consortium investment, which includes a £3 million grant from us, is also an early win for Parc Aberporth, and Wales and unmanned aerial vehicle technology more generally.

In terms of health-related research funding, following the Chancellor's acceptance of the Cooksey review's conclusions, more investment in health science is anticipated in the UK. The Wales Office of Research and Development for Health and Social Care has already established Clinical Research Collaboration Cymru, which is a collaborative and networked research infrastructure for the whole of Wales. Together with investment in flagship projects such as the Wales Gene Park and the Wales Cancer Bank, WORD deployed £5.5 million for research projects, research infrastructure and capacity building this year. The new £2 million clinical research facility that I opened earlier today, which is jointly funded by

gyngor gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, Sefydliad Tir Glas ac Ymchwil i'r Amgylchedd yn Aberystwyth, a'r Ganolfan Ymchwil Ecoleg a Hydroleg ym Mangor, y soniwyd amdani eisoes. Yn ddiweddar, llwyddodd cyfarwyddwyr y ddau sefydliad ymchwil yn y sector cyhoeddus nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli i fynychu ail gyfarfod fy uwch grŵp cynghori ar wyddoniaeth.

Nid yw'r polisi ynni yn ddatganoledig, ond mae mentrau fel Canolfan Ymchwil Ynni Cymru a'r Ganolfan Beirianeg ar Gyfer Gweithgynhyrchu a Defnyddiau—ECM²—ym Mhort Talbot yn dod â diddordeb ac arbenigedd ynghyd o bob rhan o Gymru ac yn eu cymhwysu i dechnolegau ynni newydd, yn cynnwys ariannu'n rhannol astudiaeth o sut i ddefnyddio pŵer llanw enfawr aber Hafren.

Ym maes datblygu economaidd, mae rhoi ceisiadau grant SMARTCymru ym mhrif ffrwd cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn dangos ein gwell blaenoriaethau o ran gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg. Ymhlith y llwyddiannau diweddar mae grant o £1 filiwn i Protherics UK Ltd, Ceredigion i ddefnyddio ei dechnoleg CytoFab yn y gwaith ymchwil i ddod o hyd i driniaeth ar gyfer septisemia. Mae'r buddsoddiad consortiwm gwerthuso ac asesu o'r awyr sy'n gysylltiedig â thechnoleg systemau ymreolaethol gwerth £10 miliwn, sy'n cynnwys grant £3 miliwn gennym ni, hefyd yn llwyddiant cynnar i Barc Aberporth, a Chymru a thechnoleg cerbydau awyr di-griw yn fwy cyffredinol.

O ran ariannu gwaith ymchwil sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd, ar ôl i'r Canghellor dderbyn casgliadau adolygiad Cooksey, rhagwelir y bydd rhagor o fuddsoddiad ym maes gwyddoniaeth iechyd yn y DU. Mae Swyddfa Cymru ar gyfer Ymchwil a Datblygu Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol eisoes wedi sefydlu Cydweithrediad Ymchwil Clinigol Cymru, sy'n seilwaith ymchwil cydweithredol a rhwydweithiol i Gymru gyfan. Ynghyd â buddsoddiad mewn prosiectau blaenllaw fel Parc Geneteg Cymru a Banc Canser Cymru, defnyddiodd WORD £5.5 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau ymchwil, seilwaith ymchwil a meithrin gallu eleni. Bwriad y cyfleuster ymchwil glinigol newydd gwerth £2 filiwn a agorais yn

Cardiff University's School of Medicine and Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, is intended to speed up the conversion of medical research into clinical practice.

As First Minister, I can receive advice, when required, from the UK Council for Science and Technology. I have just been consulted on appointments and reappointments to the council to refresh it after its first period of operation.

The universities and colleges of higher education in Wales are our number one resource in science in terms of teaching and research. We have made strategic investments in projects, through the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales and directly through the Department of Enterprise, Investment and Networks and the Department of Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, to build our research and commercialisation capabilities in Wales. The £50 million Institute of Life Sciences in Swansea, the all-Wales research and clinical PET scanner facility being built in Cardiff, and the Wales Institute for Mathematical and Computational Science, which draw together existing excellence at Aberystwyth, Bangor, Cardiff and Swansea and are assisted by our 'Reaching Higher' budget, are all practical current examples of our support for science.

The recent announcement of collaborative research involving some £10 million between Morriston Hospital's Welsh centre for burns and plastic surgery, Cardiff University's School of Medicine and the Healing Foundation is another example of collaborative research, although it has a different funding route.

In 'A Science Policy for Wales 2006', we pointed to three broad areas that should be key priorities for the Government and the economy, and to where there were business and academic strengths. We have set up the machinery in Government to promote those three overarching areas of priority in terms of science.

This is an exciting period for Welsh science,

gynharach heddiw, a ariennir ar y cyd gan Ysgol Feddygaeth Prifysgol Caerdydd ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, yw cyflymu'r broses o drawsnewid ymchwil feddygol yn arfer clinigol.

Fel y Prif Weinidog, gallaf gael cyngor, pan fo angen, gan Gyngor Gwyddoniaeth a Thechnoleg y DU. Ymgynghorwyd â mi yn ddiweddar ar benodiadau ac ailbenodiadau i'r cyngor er mwyn ei adfywio ar ôl ei gyfnod gweithredu cyntaf.

Y prifysgolion a'r colegau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yw ein prif adnodd gwyddoniaeth o ran addysgu ac ymchwilio. Yr ydym wedi gwneud buddsoddiadau strategol mewn prosiectau, drwy Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ac yn uniongyrchol drwy'r Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau a'r Adran Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, i feithrin ein gallu i ymchwilio a masnacheiddio yng Nghymru. Mae'r Sefydliad Gwyddorau Byw sydd werth £50 miliwn yn Abertawe, y cyfleuster sganiwr PET ymchwil a chlinigol Cymru gyfan a gaiff ei adeiladu yng Nghaerdydd, a Sefydliad Gwyddorau Mathemategol a Chyfrifiadurol Cymru, sy'n dwyn ynghyd ragoriaeth bresennol yn Aberystwyth, Bangor, Caerdydd ac Abertawe ac a gaiff cymorth gan ein cyllideb 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch', oll yn enghreifftiau cyfredol ymarferol o'n cefnogaeth i wyddoniaeth.

Mae'r cyhoeddiad diweddar ynglŷn ag ymchwil gydweithredol sy'n cynnwys tua £10 miliwn rhwng canolfan llosgiadau a llawfeddygaeth blastig Cymru Ysbyty Treforys, Ysgol Feddygaeth Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Sefydliad Gwella yn enghraifft arall o ymchwil gydweithredol, er bod ganddi lwybr ariannu gwahanol.

Yn 'Polisi Gwyddoniaeth ar gyfer Cymru 2006', gwnaethom nodi tri maes eang a ddylai fod yn flaenoriaethau allweddol i'r Llywodraeth a'r economi, yn ogystal â chryfderau busnes ac academaidd. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu'r gweithdrefnau yn y Llywodraeth i hyrwyddo'r tri maes blaenoriaeth cyffredinol hynny o ran gwyddoniaeth.

Mae hwn yn gyfnod cyffrous iawn ym maes

technology and research. As I have said before, science is vital to Wales's future prosperity and its place in a competitive and knowledge-driven global economy. We are investing and using science to full effect to gain that prosperity and secure a higher profile for Wales in the scientific world.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i chi am y datganiad hwn. Cytunaf gyda'ch sylw ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd gwyddoniaeth. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn eich holi ynghylch rhai materion i weld a oes modd inni symud yr agenda hon ymlaen yn gynt. Cyfeiriaf at yr arian y dywedasoeh sydd wedi ei neilltuo yn y gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf i annog elusennau meddygol i wneud cais am waith ymchwil. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod hynny'n rhan o'r trafodaethau a gawsom am y gyllideb yn ystod wythnosau diwethaf 2006.

Er cymaint yr wyf yn croesawu'r gwahanol elfennau y bu ichi sôn amdanynt yn eich datganiad, mae'n fy nharo nad oes unrhyw beth sy'n cydlynu pob dim er mwyn dangos bod gennym bolisi cydlynol ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru. Hoffwn gyfeirio at ddau neu dri o syniadau y gallem, efallai, ddod i ryw fath o gytundeb yn eu cylch ar draws y Cynulliad.

3.20 p.m.

A gytunwch y dylem, fel nod, symud tuag at wariant o 3 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth ar wyddoniaeth bob blwyddyn erbyn 2010, oherwydd dyna mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gofyn amdano? Er mwyn i ni gyrraedd hynny a sicrhau bod unrhyw adnoddau ychwanegol y rhown i mewn yn cael eu gwario'n iawn ac yn effeithiol, a gytunwch fod angen i ni, rhywsut neu'i gilydd, sefydlu academi wyddoniaeth, a'i sefydlu fel rhan o Brifysgol Cymru? Byddai'r academi hwn yn gallu canolbwyntio ar brif elfennau polisi gwyddoniaeth ac ymchwil, ac, yn benodol, edrych ar y pethau y bu ichi gyfeirio atynt, sef technoleg gwybodaeth ac ymchwil ar ynni.

A dderbyniwch mai ar gampws prifysgol y gwnawn y camau mawr ymlaen yn y maes

gwyddoniaeth, technoleg ac ymchwil yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais yn flaenorol, mae gwyddoniaeth yn hanfodol i ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol a'i safle mewn economi fyd-eang gystadleuol a gaiff ei llywio gan wybodaeth. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi ac yn defnyddio gwyddoniaeth i'r effaith i sicrhau'r ffyniant hwnnw ac i sicrhau proffil uwch i Gymru yn y byd gwyddonol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: First, I thank you for this statement. I agree with the comment that you made about the importance of science. However, I wish to question you about some issues to see whether we can move this agenda forward more swiftly. I wish to refer to the funding that you said has been allocated in next year's budget to encourage medical charities to make bids for research work. I am sure that you would agree that that was part of the discussions that we had on the budget during the last weeks of 2006.

As much as I welcome the various elements that you have referred to in your statement, it strikes me that there is nothing that co-ordinates everything and therefore shows that we have a cohesive policy for science in Wales. I wish to refer to two or three ideas on which we may be able to come to some sort of agreement across the Assembly.

Do you agree that we should, as an aim, move towards expenditure of 3 per cent of gross domestic product on science per annum by 2010, because that is what the European Union is seeking? In order to reach that target and ensure that any additional resources that we may provide are spent properly and effectively, do you agree that we need to somehow establish a science academy as part of the University of Wales? This academy could focus on the main elements of science and research policy, and, specifically, look at the things that you alluded to, namely information technology and energy research.

Do you not accept that the major strides forward in this field can only be taken at a

hwn? Mae'r brifysgol mewn lle allweddol i gydlynu'r gwaith rhwng y gwahanol gampysau yng Nghymru ac yn y lle gorau i weld potensial drwy ddod â byd busnes, sef y sector preifat, a gwaith ymchwil at ei gilydd, fel nad yw prifysgolion Cymru yn cystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd yn y maes hwn ond yn cydweithio fel y gallwn elwa fel cenedl ar y gwaith ymchwil a gaiff ei wneud.

Er pwysiced yw'r gwaith hwnnw, mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau fod ein plant ysgol, yn arbennig yn ystod cyfnodau TGAU a Safon Uwch, yn cael yr hyfforddiant gorau posibl i sicrhau bod gennym lwybr gyrfa ym maes gwyddoniaeth. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod prinder athrawon gyda'r sgiliau cywir ym maes gwyddoniaeth i sicrhau bod yr ysgolion yn gallu rhoi'r dewisiadau cywir i blant 14 oed a 17 oed? Os yw hynny'n wir, a fydddech yn fodlon edrych ar yr angen i hyfforddi athrawon yn ogystal â darparu adnoddau digonol i sicrhau bod gennym ddigon o athrawon a digon o gyrsiau?

Hoffwn grynhoi drwy ddweud fy mod yn siŵr fod pawb yn y Cynulliad am fynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn gweld yr angen inni gydlynu'r gwaith yn well o lawer?

Y Prif Weinidog: Diolch yn fawr am eich cwestiynau a'u hysbryd adeiladol. O ran y cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r diwylliant yng Nghymru a'r effaith ar ein plant, ac os yw'n rhwydd neu'n anodd recriwtio pobl ifanc i astudio gwyddoniaeth Safon Uwch a'u recriwtio i fod yn athrawon gwyddoniaeth ac yn y blaen, mae'n bwysig inni gofio ei bod yn wythnos wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru—a dros y wlad gyfan, os cofiaf yn iawn. Efallai fod nifer ohonom wedi derbyn pecyn gan ambell gwmni yn ein hardal yn ein hannog i ddysgu ein plant ac i chwarae gyda'r pecynnau o arbrofion a'r llyfrynnau a anfonwyd drwy'r post. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at chwarae gyda'r arbrofion gyda fy wyrion ifanc dros y penwythnos. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hyn gweithio os na fydd yn rhan o ymdrech gyson i osgoi'r duedd yn erbyn gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianwaith, a mathemateg—y pynciau STEM, fel y'u gelwir yn Saesneg. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwrthdroi'r duedd ddiwylliannol honno, tuedd nad ydym yn ei

university level? The university is in an ideal position to co-ordinate work between the campuses in Wales and in the best position to identify potential by bringing together business, or the private sector, and research work, in order to ensure that the universities of Wales do not compete against each other in this field of activity and that they collaborate so that we as a nation can benefit from their research work.

Notwithstanding the importance of that work, we must also ensure that schoolchildren, particularly at GCSE and A-level, receive that best possible education in order to ensure that we have a career path in the field of science. Are you aware that there is a shortage of teachers with the right skills in the sciences and that schools, therefore, cannot offer children the right options at the ages of 14 and 17? If that is the case, would you be prepared to consider the need to train teachers and provide sufficient resources to ensure an adequate number of teachers and courses?

I will conclude by saying that I am sure that everyone in the Assembly wants to see us move in the right direction. However, do you see the need for much better co-ordination of this work?

The First Minister: Thank you for the questions and the constructive spirit in which they were asked. Starting with the question about the culture in Wales and its effect on our children, and whether or not it is easy to recruit young people to study science at A-level and to become science teachers and so on, it is important to note that this is science week in Wales—and throughout the whole country, if I remember rightly. Many Members may have received a pack from certain companies in their areas urging them to teach children and to play with the experiments contained in the packs and to turn to the booklets sent in the post. I am looking forward to playing with the experiments with my young grandchildren at the weekend. However, this effort needs to be maintained as part of a cohesive campaign to try to get children hooked on science and to not turn against science, technology, engineering and mathematics—the STEM subjects, as they are known. It is important

deall. Mae'n rhaid i ni i gyd chwarae ein rhan i geisio annog pobl i ymddiddori mewn gwyddoniaeth a bwrw ymlaen i ddilyn gyrfa yn addysgu gwyddoniaeth neu yrfa wyddonol ym myd diwydiant a'r economi.

O ran y cwestiwn ynglŷn â phwy ddylai gael y prif gyfrifoldeb o gydlynu, bu ichi gynnig y syniad mai'r brifysgol ddylai wneud hynny. Yr hyn sy'n anodd yw'r berthynas rhwng y sector addysg uwch ac unrhyw Lywodraeth, oherwydd Llywodraeth sy'n ariannu'r prifysgolion, ond nid oes modd eu gorfodi i wneud unrhyw beth oherwydd sefydliadau hunanlywodraethol yw ein prifysgolion, a bydd hynny'n parhau i fod yn egwyddor hollbwysig. Ar y llaw arall, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, yr adnodd pwysicaf ym myd gwyddoniaeth yw ein colegau addysg bellach, ein prifysgolion a'n colegau addysg uwch.

Felly, mae'n rhaid defnyddio'r foronen yn fwy o lawer na'r wialen i annog y sefydliadau newydd hyn, megis Athrofa Gwyddorau Mathemategol a Chyfrifiadurol Cymru a Sefydliad Niwrowyddoniaeth Wybyddol Cymru. Mae'n rhaid rhoi'r foronen gerbron y gwahanol adrannau yn y gwahanol golegau a phrifysgolion ar draws Cymru er mwyn sefydlu pethau a all gystadlu gyda'r gorau yn y byd. Fodd bynnag, dim ond drwy eu hannog yn ariannol, yn hytrach na'u gorfodi, y gallwn wneud hynny. Felly, mae'n rhaid inni gymryd y prif gyfrifoldeb o gydlynu, oherwydd dim ond Llywodraeth all wneud hynny, yn enwedig gan fod gennym saith sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Hwyl sydd â'r adnoddau, ond ni sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb, a dim ond drwy ddefnyddio'r foronen y gallwn wneud hynny.

O ran y nod o glustnodi 3 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth i wyddoniaeth erbyn 2010, mae hynny'n bwnc anodd, oherwydd, gyda'r darlun fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, nid ni sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf am wyddoniaeth—nid yw wedi cael ei ddatganoli. Nid yw Cymru wedi bod yn gwario cymaint ac ni fu cymaint o sefydliadau ymchwil cyhoeddus gennym—dim ond dau sydd gennym, ac nid yw hynny'n nifer fawr. Mae un ohonynt yn un llwyddiannus iawn, ond un bach yw'r un ym

that we try to reverse this cultural tendency, a tendency that we do not quite understand. We all have a part to play in encouraging people to take an interest in science and follow careers as science teachers or in science-related posts in industry and the economy.

In terms of who should be responsible for the co-ordination of this work, you suggested that the university should have this role. There is a difficulty arising from the relationship between the higher education sector and Government, because universities are funded by Government, and we cannot force them to do anything because they are autonomous institutions, and that all-important principle will continue. However, as I said in my statement, our further education colleges, universities, and higher education colleges represent the most important resources in this area.

Therefore, we must make greater use of the carrot than the stick to persuade the new institutions, such as the Wales Institute of Mathematical and Computational Science and the Wales Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience. The carrot needs to be placed before the various departments in our colleges and universities to ensure that they establish more such institutes that can compete with the best in the world. However, we can achieve this only through using financial incentives and not through forcing them. Therefore, we must take on the role of co-ordination, as it is only Government that can offer that incentive, particularly as we have seven higher education institutions in Wales. They have the resources, but we have the responsibility, and we must use the carrot to achieve this aim.

On the point about earmarking 3 per cent of gross domestic product for science by 2010, that is a difficult issue, because, with things as they are, we do not have the primary responsibility for science—it has not been devolved. Wales has not been spending as much and we do not have as many public research institutions—we only have two, and that is not a large number. The one in Bangor has been very successful, but it is relatively small, with only 25 members of staff. The Institute of Grassland and Environmental

Mangor, gyda rhyw 25 o bobl yn unig. Mae IGER—Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd—yn un cymharol fawr, gyda dros 200 o staff.

Fodd bynnag, o'i gymharu â'r buddsoddiad mewn sefydliadau yn yr Alban a Lloegr, bach iawn yw'r buddsoddiad hanesyddol yr ydym wedi ei etifeddu. O gymharu'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban â honno yng Nghymru o ran yr arian, mae'r elusennau meddygol yn buddsoddi £10 miliwn mewn ymchwil yng Nghymru a £100 miliwn yn yr Alban. Faint o amser a gymer—ta beth wnawn ni—i wneud yn iawn am y gagendor hwnnw sydd wedi agor rhwng yr Alban a Chymru dros y 30 mlynedd diwethaf? Mae'r £3 miliwn yr ydym wedi ei darparu yn ddechrau, ond ni fydd yn trawsnewid pethau dros nos.

Yr hyn a ddywedais wrth y gwyddonwyr yr oeddwn yn siarad â hwy wrth gael ambell frechdan yn dilyn agoriad swyddogol y ganolfan ymchwil clinigol yng Nghaerdydd y bore yma—ac yr oeddem i gyd yn cytuno ar hyn—yw bod yn rhaid i'r tимоedd ymchwil yng Nghymru gael mwy o hyder i gyflwyno ceisiadau. Pan fyddant yn cyflwyno ceisiadau, maent yn ennill, ar yr un raddfa ag yn yr Alban a Lloegr, ond nid ydynt yn cyflwyno digon o geisiadau oherwydd nid oes ganddynt yr hyder. Pan fyddant yn cyflwyno ceisiadau—ac nid oes digon ohonynt—maent yn ennill yr un ganran â sefydliadau mewn gwledydd eraill.

Felly, mae angen annog pawb i geisio am y grantiau â hunanhyder, ac i geisio am grantiau mawr, nid dim ond y rhai bach. Dyna'r darlun y mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu arno er mwyn cyrraedd y nod o godi proffil gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, a chodi proffil gwyddoniaeth Cymru yn y byd.

William Graham: Thank you for this most interesting and helpful report, First Minister, which must have cross-party support. I particularly welcome the clinical research facility that you opened today in Cardiff, which, as you know, has long been called for in that sector. On your promise for the Wales Institute for Mathematical and Computational Sciences, what sort of funding do you expect that to achieve over the next four years from

Research is relatively large, with over 200 members of staff.

However, compared with investment in institutions in Scotland and England, the historic investment that we have inherited is very small. If you were to compare the financial situation in Scotland with that in Wales, you would see that medical charities invest £10 million in research in Wales and £100 million in Scotland. How long will it take—regardless of what we do—to close the gap that has opened between Scotland and Wales over the past 30 years? The £3 million that we have allocated is a start, but it will not improve things overnight.

In conversation with scientists over a few sandwiches following the official opening of the clinical research centre in Cardiff this morning, I suggested—and we all agreed on this—that research teams in Wales need to have the confidence to submit more bids. When they have submitted bids, they have won, on the same scale as teams in Scotland and England, but they do not submit enough bids because they do not have the confidence to do so. When they submit bids—and there are not enough—they win the same percentage as institutions in other countries.

Therefore, we need to encourage all institutions to apply for grants, and to do so with confidence. They need to apply for the big grants, not only the small ones. We must build on that position in order to achieve the aim of raising the profile of science in Wales and the profile of science in Wales throughout the world.

William Graham: Diolch ichi am yr adroddiad diddorol a defnyddiol iawn hwn, Brif Weinidog, a ddylai gael gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Croesawaf yn arbennig y cyfleuster ymchwil glinigol a agorwyd gennyh heddiw yng Nghaerdydd, y bu galw mawr amdano yn y sector hwnnw, fel y gwyddoch. O ran eich addewid am Sefydliad Gwyddorau Mathemategol a Chyfrifiadurol Cymru, pa fath o arian y disgwyliwch iddo ei

the 'Reaching Higher' budget?

gyflawni dros y pedair blynedd nesaf o'r gyllideb 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch'?

Over recent weeks, you have commented in particular on the environment. Will you comment again on that, and tell us how you believe that should be better researched? We all know that science will be the key to our future and to our nation.

Dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, gwnaethoch sylwadau yn arbennig, ar yr amgylchedd. A fyddwch yn gwneud sylwadau ar hynny eto, a dweud wrthym sut y dylid ymchwilio i hynny yn well, yn eich barn chi? Fe wyddom ni oll y bydd gwyddoniaeth yn allweddol i'n dyfodol a'n cenedl.

You alluded to bids. Why have you turned your face completely against having a chief scientific officer? That would greatly facilitate bids of that kind, as you well know.

Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at gynigion. Pam yr ydych wedi newid eich meddwl yn llwyr yn erbyn cael prif swyddog gwyddoniaeth? Byddai hynny yn hwyluso ceisiadau o'r math hwnnw yn fawr, fel y gwyddoch.

3.30 p.m.

The First Minister: Thank you for the general spirit in which you asked your questions; let us try to have as much of a cross-party spirit in discussing science and its application to all of our governmental responsibilities in Wales as possible, although there will never be 100 per cent complete agreement—that would not be natural. I also welcome what you said about the clinical research facility that I opened earlier this morning. The question of the application of research to clinical practice is very important, because blue-sky research might lead to 10 Nobel prize-winners, but if it does not translate into clinical practice, it is a complete waste of time, space and effort. On the other hand, if clinical practice ignores new methods of clinical treatment, it will go backwards at a rate of knots. Therefore, you must have good ethical control, otherwise patients will suffer, as in the Northwick Park disaster of last year, which has inevitably set back innovative treatments a long way, because new safeguards have been put in place. However, it is a trialling facility, which was set up to ensure that, under the strictest ethical control, patients will benefit from research as quickly as is safely practicable. It is a bridge between the research laboratory—it is also a physical bridge between the Wellcome building and the research laboratory, because it is in the next door corridor and links it to the hospital, so it is ideally located to do its bridge-building, translational job.

Y Prif Weinidog: Diolch ichi am yr ysbryd cyffredinol y gwnaethoch ofyn eich cwestiynau; beth am inni geisio cael cymaint o ysbryd trawsbleidiol wrth drafod gwyddoniaeth a'i chymhwyso i'n holl gyfrifoldebau fel llywodraeth yng Nghymru, er na fydd cytundeb llwyr byth—ni fyddai hynny'n naturiol. Hoffwn hefyd groesawu'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennych am y cyfleuster ymchwil glinigol a agorais yn gynharach y bore yma. Mae'n bwysig iawn cymhwyso ymchwil at arfer clinigol, oherwydd gallai ymchwil fympwyol arwain at 10 o enillwyr gwobr Nobel, ond os nad yw'n trosi yn arfer clinigol, mae'n wastraff llwyr o amser, lle ac ymdrech. Ar y llaw arall, os bydd arfer clinigol yn anwybyddu dulliau newydd o driniaeth glinigol, bydd yn mynd am yn ôl yn gyflym iawn. Felly, rhaid ichi gael rheolaeth foesegol dda, neu bydd cleifion yn dioddef, fel yn nhrychineb Parc Northwick y llynedd, sydd yn anochel wedi bod yn gryn ergyd i driniaethau arloesol, gan fod mesurau diogelwch newydd wedi'u sefydlu. Fodd bynnag, cyfleuster treialu ydyw, a sefydlwyd i sicrhau, o dan y rheolaeth foesegol lymaf, y bydd cleifion yn cael budd o ymchwil mor gyflym ag sy'n ymarferol bosibl. Mae'n gyswllt rhwng y labordy ymchwil—mae hefyd yn gyswllt ffisegol rhwng adeilad Wellcome a'r labordy ymchwil, gan ei fod ar y coridor nesaf ac mae'n ei gysylltu â'r ysbyty, felly mae mewn lleoliad gwych i gyflawni ei ddyletswyddau trosi a chreu cysylltiadau.

I will have to write to you about the funding that we have given from the 'Reaching Higher' budget as an incentive to set up the Welsh Institute of Mathematical and Computational Sciences, drawing together expertise in those two allied fields from different universities and university colleges in Wales. It is not the only example of that—the new Wales Institute of Cognitive Neuroscience is another. I will supply you with information regarding the finance and in what years it will flow for both of those.

You raised the vexed issue of the difference of view between the proposals for science in Wales in the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee's review of science and our proposals. It was a strange exercise to have the Government looking at science policy at the same time as a subject committee. I do not think that that had ever happened before. We came at it from different angles. We concentrated on the policy, that is, what subject areas we should concentrate upon, and the committee's report highlighted structures. For instance, it said that there should be a chief scientific adviser, as in Scotland, and that there should be an advisory council on science and technology and so forth.

I have never set my face against having a chief scientific adviser; it is simply that our priority was to try to get the policy priorities right. For a small country like Wales, we thought that the right thing to do was to decide what we wanted to concentrate on and answer the question of what, if we were going to put more effort into science and technology, we would put that effort into. The danger, if we spread the butter thinly across every different subject and decided that every scientific research team in Wales would get a 25 per cent increase in its budget, is that the butter would be spread so thin that we would not make an impact. Therefore, we had to decide what we wanted to concentrate upon. I regarded it as a question of what to do first. Do you set the policy objectives first and then set the structures to match them, or do you set the structures first and decide on the policy later? We thought that the policy should come first.

Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch yr arian a gawsom o'r gyllideb 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' fel cymhelliant i sefydlu Sefydliad Gwyddorau Mathemategol a Chyfrifiadurol Cymru, gan ddefnyddio arbenigedd yn y ddau faes cysylltiedig hyn o brifysgolion a cholegau prifysgol gwahanol yng Nghymru. Mae Sefydliad Niwrowyddoniaeth Wybyddol Cymru yn enghraifft arall o hyn. Byddaf yn rhoi gwybodaeth ichi am yr arian ac am ba flynyddoedd y bydd yn llifo ar gyfer y ddau.

Gwnaethoch godi'r gwahaniaeth barn rhwng y cynigion ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru yn adolygiad y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau o wyddoniaeth a'n cynigion ninnau. Yr oedd yn arfer rhyfedd bod y Llywodraeth yn edrych ar bolisi gwyddoniaeth yr un pryd â phwyllgor pwnc. Ni chredaf fod hynny erioed wedi digwydd o'r blaen. Yr oedd gennym ymagweddau gwahanol at y mater. Gwnaethom ganolbwyntio ar y polisi, hynny yw, pa feysydd pwnc y dylem ganolbwyntio arnynt, ac amlygwyd strwythurau yn adroddiad y pwyllgor. Er enghraifft, dywedwyd y dylid cael prif gynghorydd gwyddonol, fel y ceir yn yr Alban, ac y dylid cael cyngor ymgynghorol ar wyddoniaeth a thechnoleg ac ati.

Nid wyf erioed wedi lleisio barn yn erbyn cael prif gynghorydd gwyddonol, yn hytrach, ein blaenoriaeth oedd ceisio sicrhau bod blaenoriaethau'r polisi yn gywir. I wlad fach fel Cymru, yr oeddem yn credu mai'r peth gorau i'w wneud oedd penderfynu beth yr oeddem am ganolbwyntio arno a phenderfynu, os oeddem am wneud mwy o ymdrech ym maes gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg, beth y byddem yn canolbwyntio arno. Y perygl yw, os ceisiwn ganolbwyntio ar bob pwnc a phenderfynu y byddai pob tîm ymchwil gwyddonol yng Nghymru yn cael cynnydd o 25 y cant yn ei gyllideb, na fyddai hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gan fod yr adroddiadau wedi'u gwasgaru cymaint. Felly, yr oedd yn rhaid inni benderfynu beth yr oeddem am ganolbwyntio arno. Yn fy marn i, yr hyn a oedd ei angen oedd penderfynu beth i'w wneud yn gyntaf. A ddylid pennu amcanion y polisi i ddechrau ac yna pennu'r strwythurau i gyd-fynd â hwy, neu a ddylid pennu'r strwythurau i ddechrau a

phenderfynu ar y polisi yn ddiweddarach? Yn ein barn ni, dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r polisi.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I appeal for briefer questions and answers. We have only roughly eight minutes left on this statement, and there are still four more Members who wish to contribute.

Kirsty Williams: Thank you for your statement, First Minister. I note that its title is 'Science Policy and Science in the Welsh Assembly Government'. It is a list of projects. They are commendable and worthy projects, but it is stretching it slightly to describe it as a policy. This statement underlines the point that the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee was trying to make when it said that we needed a science adviser to co-ordinate policy and to drive this forward. While these projects are very welcome, they do not make a policy, and they do not tackle the fundamental challenges facing this country if we are to move forward in science.

You grossly misrepresented what the committee was trying to do in its review of science policy. Yes, it mentioned the need to appoint a chief scientist—as I said, this statement is the best evidence yet of why we need such a person—and to have an advisory council, but it also identified and sought to find solutions to the fundamental problems that Wales is facing. The research and development expenditure of businesses in Wales makes up less than 2 per cent of the UK total, Welsh higher education institutions are outperformed by higher education institutions in every UK region except the north-east and Northern Ireland, and fewer new patent applications are filed in Wales than in any other region of the UK. Your statement today does not say how you are going to address that. It does not say how you are going to address the huge gap in per capita funding in grants, and it does not say how you are going to address the desperate need for scientists in our economy. The Confederation of British Industry estimates that, across the UK, we need an extra 25 per cent science graduates by 2014, and we are only producing 80,000 science graduates a year.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Hoffwn apelio am gwestiynau ac atebion byrrach. Dim ond tua wyth munud sydd ar ôl ar y datganiad hwn, ac mae pedwar Aelod arall am gyfrannu eto.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch am eich datganiad, Brif Weinidog. Nodaf mai ei deitl yw 'Polisi Gwyddoniaeth a Gwyddoniaeth yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'. Rhestr o brosiectau ydyw. Maent yn brosiectau clodwiw a theilwng, ond prin y gellid ei alw'n bolisi. Mae'r datganiad hwn yn ategu'r pwynt yr oedd y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yn ceisio ei wneud pan ddywedodd fod angen cynghorydd gwyddoniaeth i gydlynu polisi ac i ddatblygu hyn. Er bod angen dirfawr am y prosiectau hyn, nid polisi mohonynt, ac nid ydynt yn ymdrin â'r heriau sylfaenol sy'n wynebu'r wlad hon er mwyn inni ddatblygu ym maes gwyddoniaeth.

Gwnaethoch gamddeall yn llwyr yr hyn yr oedd y pwyllgor yn ceisio ei wneud yn ei adolygiad o bolisi gwyddoniaeth. Soniodd am yr angen i benodi prif wyddonydd—fel y dywedais, y datganiad hwn yw'r dystiolaeth orau eto pam mae angen person o'r fath arnom—a chyngor ymgynghorol, ond hefyd nodwyd a cheisiwyd datrys y problemau sylfaenol a wynebir yng Nghymru. Mae gwariant busnesau yng Nghymru ar ymchwil a datblygu yn llai na 2 y cant o gyfanswm y DU, mae perfformiad sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn waeth na sefydliadau addysg uwch ym mhob rhanbarth yn y DU ac eithrio gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr a Gogledd Iwerddon, a chaiff llai o geisiadau am batentau newydd eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ranbarth arall yn y DU. Nid yw eich datganiad heddiw yn dweud sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdrin â hynny. Nid yw'n dweud sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r bwlch anferth mewn arian y pen mewn grantiau, ac nid yw'n dweud sut yr ydym yn mynd i ymdrin â'r angen dybryd am wyddonwyr yn ein heconomi. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn amcangyfrif, ar draws y DU, bod angen 25 y cant yn fwy o raddedigion gwyddoniaeth erbyn 2014, ac mai dim ond 80,000 o

raddedigion gwyddoniaeth yr ydym yn eu cynhyrchu bob blwyddyn.

This statement is a list of commendable projects, which, I am sure, will serve us well, but it is not a policy and it is not an excuse for not having a policy.

Rhestr o brosiectau clodwiw yw'r datganiad hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn fuddiol, ond nid yw'n bolisi ac nid yw'n esgus dros beidio â chael polisi.

The First Minister: I will deal with those questions in turn. Most of the projects that I referred to fit into the three science priorities that I listed—not all of them, of course; it was never envisaged that only science projects that fell into the three categories that I listed in launching the science policy last November would be allowed to take place in Wales. However, the emphasis is on the move towards a low-carbon economy, and the setting up of the Welsh Energy Research Centre, which is based in Port Talbot, but which draws in talent from a much wider area, across the university sector in Wales and elsewhere, was important to that. The same is true of health and biotechnology: that is a major area for us to emphasise and many of the projects that I have listed are in that field. I also mentioned some of the impact of the research that has already been done in the area of social research and regeneration.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddaf yn ymdrin â'r cwestiynau hynny yn eu tro. Caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r prosiectau y cyfeiriais atynt eu cynnwys o fewn y tair blaenoriaeth gwyddoniaeth a restrais—nid pob un ohonynt, wrth gwrs; ni ragwelwyd erioed mai dim ond prosiectau gwyddoniaeth sy'n cael eu cynnwys yn y tri chategori a restrais wrth lansio'r polisi gwyddoniaeth fis Tachwedd y llynedd a fyddai'n cael eu cynnal yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pwyslais ar symud tuag at economi carbon isel, ac yr oedd sefydlu Canolfan Ymchwil Ynni Cymru, a leolir ym Mhort Talbot, ond sy'n denu talent o ardal lawer ehangach, ar draws y sector prifysgol yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill, yn bwysig i hynny. Mae'r un peth yn wir am iechyd a biodechnoleg: mae hwnnw'n faes pwysig i'w bwysleisio ac mae llawer o'r prosiectau a restrais yn y maes hwnnw. Hefyd soniais am rywfaint o effaith yr ymchwil a wnaed eisoes ym maes ymchwil ac adfywio cymdeithasol.

You mentioned the issue of having a council for science and technology. You have to ask yourself what the additional benefits would be of having a council for science and technology as recommended by the subject committee, compared to having a group of senior science advisors made up from people from within the administration, which I have already set up and which has had two meetings—another is to take place in a week or so. In the last meeting, the two heads of the non-devolved public sector research establishments, the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research and the Centre for Ecology and Hydrology in Bangor, came to the meeting and at the third meeting, which will take place shortly, we hope to have the vice-chancellors responsible for research in the Welsh universities present. Therefore, what would be the additional gain from having a council for science and technology as recommended by the subject committee? It is up to you to make the case for that; I am

Gwnaethoch sôn am gael cyngor ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg. Rhaid ichi ystyried beth fyddai manteision ychwanegol cael cyngor ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg fel yr argymhellwyd gan y pwyllgor pwnc, o gymharu â chael grŵp o uwch gynghorwyr gwyddoniaeth sy'n cynnwys pobl o fewn y weinyddiaeth, a sefydlwyd gennyf eisoes ac sydd wedi cyfarfod ddwywaith—cynhelir cyfarfod arall mewn tua wythnos. Yn y cyfarfod diwethaf, daeth dau bennaeth sefydliadau ymchwil y sector cyhoeddus nas datganolwyd, sef Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd a'r Ganolfan Ecoleg a Hydroleg ym Mangor, i'r cyfarfod, ac yn y trydydd cyfarfod, a gynhelir yn fuan, gobeithio y bydd is-gangellorion sy'n gyfrifol am ymchwil ym mhrifysgolion Cymru yn bresennol. Felly, beth fyddai mantais ychwanegol cael cyngor ar gyfer gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg fel yr argymhellwyd gan y pwyllgor pwnc? Eich cyfrifoldeb chi yw rhoi dadl dros hynny; nid

not sure that the case has been made.

You asked what we are doing to make good the historic gap that has built up, and which I mentioned earlier in response to Ieuan Wyn Jones. Why do the Wellcome Trust and the other medical charities in Britain spend £100 million in Scottish universities but only £10 million in Welsh universities? The purpose of putting £3 million in the budget is precisely to cover the overhead costs that Scotland has recently begun to cover, and likewise England. We have not done so until now, but we have now put that in and it is already having an impact with the Wellcome Trust and the Association of Medical Research Charities, and we hope to see the fruits of that soon.

Carl Sargeant: I welcome this statement. It was also good to hear William Graham welcome it. It is important that universities and businesses collaborate, and we have to highlight that in the science policy that we are taking forward.

Do you agree that Airbus has been having a difficult time as a result of the Power 8 restructuring programme? The impact of that on the workforce at Broughton and Filton is evident. Will you give an assurance that you will personally look into the future science and technology debate surrounding aviation in Wales, particularly at Airbus in Broughton, and at how we can build on the successes that we have had in the plant there?

The First Minister: In trying to stay within my budget of 1,000 words in making my statement, I omitted one of the projects that you would be interested in, which is the integrated wing project. You were present at the launch of that, which has held jointly with Alistair Darling, Louis Gallois, me and many others with far more aerospace qualifications than I have. That integrated wing project is all-important to the future of Broughton.

Alun Ffred Jones: Croesawaf eich datganiad, yn enwedig y cyhoeddiad o ran y maes ymchwil meddygol. Mae gennyf ddau

wyf yn siŵr a yw'r ddadl wedi'i rhoi.

Gwnaethoch ofyn beth yr ydym yn ei wneud i ymdrin â'r bwlch hanesyddol sydd wedi'i greu, ac y soniais amdano'n gynharach mewn ymateb i Ieuan Wyn Jones. Pam mae Ymddiriedolaeth Wellcome a'r elusennau meddygol eraill ym Mhrydain yn gwario £100 miliwn mewn prifysgolion yn yr Alban ond dim ond £10 miliwn mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru? Union ddiben rhoi £3 miliwn yn y gyllideb yw talu'r gorbenion y mae'r Alban a Lloegr wedi dechrau eu talu yn ddiweddar. Nid ydym wedi gwneud hynny hyd yma, ond yr ydym wedi'i gynnwys bellach ac mae eisoes yn cael effaith gydag Ymddiriedolaeth Wellcome a Chymdeithas yr Elusennau Ymchwil Feddygol, a gobeithiwn y bydd hynny yn dwyn ffrwyth cyn hir.

Carl Sargeant: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf glywed William Graham yn ei groesawu hefyd. Mae'n bwysig bod prifysgolion a busnesau yn cydweithio, a rhaid inni amlygu hynny yn y polisi gwyddoniaeth yr ydym yn ei gyflwyno.

A gytunwch fod Airbus wedi dioddef o ganlyniad i raglen ailstrwythuro Power 8? Mae effaith hynny ar y gweithlu ym Mrychdwn a Filton yn amlwg. A roddwch sicrwydd inni y byddwch yn ystyried y drafodaeth ar wyddoniaeth a thechnoleg sy'n ymwneud â'r diwydiant awyrennau yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig yn Airbus ym Mrychdwn, a sut y gallwn adeiladu ar y llwyddiannau a gawsom yn y gwaith yno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth geisio cadw o fewn y terfyn o 1,000 o eiriau wrth lunio fy natganiad, anghofiais am un o'r prosiectau y byddai gennych ddiddordeb ynddo, sef prosiect yr adain integredig. Yr oeddech yn bresennol yn yr achlysur lansio, a gynhaliwyd ar y cyd gydag Alistair Darling, Louis Gallois, fi a sawl un arall a chanddynt lawer mwy o gymwysterau awyrofod na minnau. Mae'r prosiect adain integredig hwnnw yn hollbwysig i ddyfodol Brychdwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: I welcome your statement, especially the announcement about medical research. I have two points to raise.

fater i'w codi. Mae partneriaeth ymchwil wedi'i chyhoeddi yn ddiweddar rhwng Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor, Prifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth ac IGER, ac mae'r dyfodol yn edrych ychydig yn oleuach i IGER. A fyddwch yn cefnogi IGER a'r bartneriaeth newydd yn ymarferol?

3.40 p.m.

Ar drywydd ychydig yn wahanol, nid oedd cyfeiriad yn eich datganiad at dechnoleg newydd ym maes arbed ynni ac adeiladau di-garbon neu garbon niwtral. A ydych yn credu bod lle yn hyn o beth i gael canolfan ragoriaeth i ganolbwyntio ar dechnoleg adeiladu gynaliadwy, gan gofio, yn wyneb eich datganiad diweddar, fod gorboethi adeiladau bron mor bwysig ag yw codi adeiladau sy'n cadw ynni i mewn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna ddau gwestiwn tra gymhleth, ac efallai y bydd rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch. O ran trafodaethau sy'n mynd rhagddynt ynglŷn â dyfodol IGER, mae trafodaethau anodd gyda'r BBSRC, ac efallai mai'r hyn a ddaw o'r trafodaethau hynny—mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud—yw trosglwyddiad rhannol o gyfrifoldeb am IGER i Brifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth fel rhan o'r bartneriaeth newydd rhwng Aberystwyth a Bangor ar ymchwil a menter. Mae hynny'n bosibl, ond ni fydd yn digwydd hyd Ebrill 2008. Wrth gwrs, ni fydd y trafodaethau yn cael eu hystyried yn llwyddiannus hyd nes bod yr inc yn sych ar y papur.

O ran adeiladau di-garbon neu garbon niwtral, mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o drafodaethau eraill ynglŷn ag a allwn sefydlu sefydliad ymchwil carbon isel fel prif flaenoriaeth o blith y tair a osodais. Sefydlwyd Canolfan Ymchwil Ynni Cymru ym Mhort Talbot, sy'n tynnu i mewn arbenigwyr o bob rhan o'r sector addysg uwch a byd busnes, a'r cam nesaf yw sefydlu—bydd cais yn cael ei wneud i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru cyn hir—sefydliad ymchwil carbon isel; gall y syniad hwnnw fod yn rhan ohono.

Alun Cairns: No-one would question the merits of the individual schemes that you highlighted. However, I fail to see the

A research partnership has recently been announced between the University of Wales, Bangor, the University of Wales, Aberystwyth, and IGER, and the future looks a little brighter for IGER. Will you provide IGER and the new partnership with practical support?

On a slightly different tack, there was no reference in your statement to new technology for energy efficiency and carbon-free or carbon-neutral buildings. Do you believe that there is scope for a centre of excellence to concentrate on sustainable building technology, bearing in mind, in light of your recent statement, that building overheating is almost as important as erecting buildings that keep energy in?

The First Minister: Those were two very complicated questions, and I may have to write to you. In terms of discussions on the future of IGER, difficult negotiations are ongoing with the BBSRC, and what comes out of those negotiations may be—it is too early to tell—a partial transfer of responsibility for IGER to the University of Wales, Aberystwyth as part of the new partnership between Aberystwyth and Bangor on research and innovation. That is a possibility, but it will not happen until April 2008. Of course, the negotiations will not be considered successful until the ink has dried on any agreement.

In terms of carbon-free or carbon-neutral buildings, that is an important element of other discussions on whether it would be possible for us to set up a low carbon institute as the main priority of the three that I listed. The Welsh Energy Research Centre was established in Port Talbot, which draws in experts from all parts of the higher education sector and the world of business, and the next step is to establish—a bid will go to the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales before long—a low carbon research institute; that idea could form a part of that.

Alun Cairns: Ni fyddai neb yn amau teilyngdod y cynlluniau unigol a nodwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf weld y

strategy that develops through this. Dylan Jones-Evans, in evidence to committee in the first Assembly, called for a science policy. The Labour Members at that time rejected that call, and it was through continued pressure that we eventually had a science policy review. It was welcomed and was done on a cross-party basis. One recommendation of that review was for a fund to be developed so that higher education and the private sector could collaborate to develop and apply innovative technology and science research. Such a policy would demonstrate a strategy, but nothing in this statement demonstrates a strategy. Where is the strategy in your statement?

The First Minister: The strategy is clear; it was set out last November and it involved concentrating on three main areas. The first is the low carbon economy, which I think that we would all agree is a priority, and the second is the translation of good research practice into advanced clinical practice, and the support that that would give to biotechnology. Protherics plc is an example of that, and of where we are using Government money to point a company towards doing its research in Wales. That is important in developing collaboration between business, research and Government money in the way you described. Social research and regeneration is the third of those priorities.

As to where the strategy is, and where the money is, we are well ahead of the game. The Institute of Life Sciences in Swansea is by far the largest collaboration between industry and the private sector—it involves four or five different branches of the public sector in Wales. Before IBM, there has never before been an example of a *Fortune* 100 company deciding not to manufacture widgets and grommets in Wales, but to develop intellectual property in combination with the Welsh public sector, stimulated by Objective 1 money. We are well ahead of the game, so I think that your questions were really not much more than a carp.

strategaeth sy'n datblygu o ganlyniad i hyn. Galwodd Dylan Jones-Evans, yn ei dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, am bolisi gwyddoniaeth. Gwrthodwyd yr alwad gan Aelodau Llafur ar y pryd, a thrwy bwysau parhaus y gwnaethom lwyddo i sicrhau adolygiad o bolisi gwyddoniaeth yn y pen draw. Fe'i croesawyd a chafodd ei gynnal ar sail drawsbleidiol. Un o argymhellion yr adolygiad hwnnw oedd y dylid datblygu cronfa fel y gallai addysg uwch a'r sector preifat gydweithio i ddatblygu a chymhwyso ymchwil technoleg a gwyddoniaeth arloesol. Byddai polisi o'r fath yn dangos strategaeth, ond nid oes dim yn y datganiad hwn yn dangos strategaeth. Ble mae'r strategaeth yn eich datganiad?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r strategaeth yn glir; fe'i hamlinellwyd fis Tachwedd y llynedd ac yr oedd yn golygu canolbwyntio ar dri phrif faes. Y cyntaf yw'r economi carbon isel, y credaf y byddai pob un ohonom yn cytuno y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddi, a'r ail yw troi arfer da wrth ymchwilio yn arfer clinigol uwch, a'r cymorth y byddai hynny'n ei roi i fiotechnoleg. Mae Protherics ccc yn enghraifft o hynny, ac o'r ffordd yr ydym yn defnyddio arian y Llywodraeth i annog cwmnïau i wneud eu hymchwil yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig i ddatblygu cydweithrediad rhwng busnesau, ymchwil ac arian y Llywodraeth yn y modd a ddisgrifiwyd gennych. Ymchwil ac adfywio cymdeithasol yw'r drydedd flaenoriaeth.

O ran y datblygiad a wnaed mewn perthynas â'r strategaeth a'r arian, yr ydym ymhell ar y blaen. Y Sefydliad Gwyddorau Bywyd yn Abertawe yw'r cydweithrediad mwyaf o bell ffordd rhwng diwydiant a'r sector preifat—mae'n cynnwys pedair neu bump o ganghennau gwahanol o'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Cyn IBM, ni welwyd erioed enghraifft o gwmni *Fortune* 100 yn penderfynu peidio â gweithgynhyrchu teclynnau a gromedau yng Nghymru, ond yn hytrach i ddatblygu eiddo deallusol ar y cyd â'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, gyda chymorth arian Amcan 1. Yr ydym ymhell ar y blaen, felly credaf mai gweld bai yr oeddech yn eich cwestiynau.

Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25
Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 13 February 2007 in relation to the draft the Further Education Corporations (Publication of Draft Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2007; and

a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Chwefror 2007 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Corfforaethau Addysg Bellach (Cyhoeddi Gorchmynion Drafft) (Cymru) 2007; a

b) approves that the draft the Further Education Corporations (Publication of Draft Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2007 is made in accordance with:

b) yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Corfforaethau Addysg Bellach (Cyhoeddi Gorchmynion Drafft) (Cymru) 2007 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

i) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 February 2007; and

i) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Chwefror 2007; a

ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 February 2007. (NDM3544)

ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3544)

Cynnig (NDM3544): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3544): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegation of Functions under the Animal Welfare Act 2006 to the First Minister

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in and under the Animal Welfare Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister. (NDM3540)

Jocelyn Davies: The Plaid Cymru group welcomes the Act, and we will support this delegation motion. The Act introduces a duty of care on owners and keepers of vertebrate animals, although many people will be surprised that that duty of care did not already exist. The Assembly will also be empowered to produce codes of practice to improve standards of animal welfare, and we will soon be voting on the regulation on dog tail docking.

I also look forward to the Assembly developing policy in relation to performing animals in circuses, and also the appalling use of electric shock collars for training; that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn penderfynu dirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn ac o dan Ddeddf Lles Anifeiliaid 2006 i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad. (NDM3540)

Jocelyn Davies: Mae grŵp Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r Ddeddf, a byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig dirprwyaeth hwn. Mae'r Ddeddf yn cyflwyno dyletswydd gofal ar berchnogion a cheidwaid anifeiliaid ag asgwrn cefn, er y bydd llawer o bobl yn synnu nad oedd y ddyletswydd gofal honno'n bodoli eisoes. Caiff y Cynulliad hefyd y pŵer i lunio codau ymarfer i wella safonau lles anifeiliaid, a byddwn yn pleidleisio cyn bo hir ar reoleiddio'r broses o dorri cynffonnau cŵn.

Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at weld y Cynulliad yn llunio polisi o ran anifeiliaid yn perfformio mewn syrcau, yn ogystal â'r defnydd erchyll o goleri sioc drydanol i

is a practice that I am sure all of us would want to see stopped. I also hope that, in the future, this Act will provide a framework for better protection for the many greyhounds that have very short careers as racing dogs. I understand that it will now be possible to introduce an identification traceability scheme that would afford protection for those greyhounds that cannot race any longer, and who currently just seem to disappear.

Brynle Williams: Like Plaid Cymru, we are happy to support the motion as it replaces existing legislation, some of which has, regrettably, been in place for nearly 100 years, with measures to ensure that all owners of domestic or agricultural animals exercise a duty of care to safeguard their welfare. Our Plaid Cymru friends across the Chamber have highlighted many points that we would support.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the motion for the reasons that have been outlined by other Members, and we look forward to making Wales a country where animal welfare has top priority.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There are no more speakers, so we will move to the vote.

hyfforddi anifeiliaid; mae hynny yn arfer yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob un ohonom am weld diwedd arno. Gobeithiaf hefyd, yn y dyfodol, y bydd y Ddeddf hon yn cynnig fframwaith ar gyfer diogelu llawer o'r milgwn sydd â gyrfaedd byr iawn fel cŵn rasio yn well. Deallaf y bydd bellach yn bosibl cyflwyno cynllun olrhain ac adnabod a fyddai'n diogelu'r milgwn hynny na allant rasio mwyach, ac sy'n ymddangos ar hyn o bryd fel pe baent yn diflannu.

Brynle Williams: Fel Plaid Cymru, yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig gan ei fod yn disodli'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol, y bu rhywfaint ohoni, yn anffodus, ar waith ers bron i 100 mlynedd, gyda mesurau i sicrhau y bydd perchnogion pob anifail anwes neu anifail amaethyddol yn arfer dyletswydd gofal i ddiogelu eu lles. Mae ein cyfeillion ym Mhlaid Cymru ar draws y Siambr wedi amlygu llawer o bwyntiau y byddem yn eu cefnogi.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig am y rhesymau a amlinellwyd gan Aelodau eraill, ac edrychwn ymlaen at sicrhau y bydd Cymru yn wlad lle rhoddir blaenoriaeth uchel i les anifeiliaid.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid oes mwy o siaradwyr, felly symudwn at y bleidlais.

*Cynnig (NDM3540): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3540): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William

Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Yr Ail Ddadl ar Gynnig Tamsin Dunwoody ar gyfer Is-ddeddfwriaeth o dan Reol
 Sefydlog Rhif 31
 Second Debate on Tamsin Dunwoody's Proposal for Subordinate Legislation
 under Standing Order No. 31**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 31:

1. welcomes the proposal set out in the motion tabled by Tamsin Dunwoody (NNDM 3280) and agreed in Plenary on 14 November 2006;

2. agrees the proposed way forward set out in the feasibility report laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 6 March 2007, which includes the inspection and regulation of private dental treatment provided by dentists whose practices are NHS funded, and the intention to take forward related supporting secondary legislation;

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31:

1. yn croesawu'r argymhelliad yn y cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan Tamsin Dunwoody (NNDM 3280) ac a gytunwyd arno mewn cyfarfod llawn ar 14 Tachwedd 2006;

2. yn cytuno ar y ffordd ymlaen a gynigir yn yr adroddiad dichonoldeb a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 6 Mawrth 2007, sy'n cynnwys arolygu a rheoleiddio triniaeth ddeintyddol breifat a ddarperir gan ddeintyddion y mae eu deintyddfeydd yn cael eu hariannu gan y GIG, a'r bwriad o fwrw ymlaen â deddfwriaeth eilaidd ategol;

3. *recommends that the National Assembly for Wales proceeds with the proposal.* (NDM3542)

Tamsin Dunwoody: As with the previous debate on this motion, I dedicate it to the memory of my father. I am delighted that this motion has been brought before Plenary today. You will recall that the original motion that I proposed was that wholly private dental practices in Wales should be subject to inspection. During that debate, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, who is not in the Chamber at the moment, raised an issue surrounding private dental practice within NHS practices, and whether or not the legislation could be expanded to also cover that area. We have worked on that issue, and I thank all of those who helped me to do so. The initial motion has now been expanded to include all private dental practice, whether it is undertaken in an NHS environment or in a private environment.

3.50 p.m.

I do not wish to rehearse my arguments, but it is important that we set the reason for this motion in context. I do not believe in private practice, and I never will. I find that, in my constituency of Preseli Pembrokeshire, we are in a situation where, because of the changes to the dental contract, and because dentists opted to undertake private work, a significant number of people are subject to private dental practice. That is not of their choosing, and it is not something that I welcome. Enormous efforts have been made to ensure that we move back to NHS dentistry, but the reality is that dentists do not want to practice within the NHS in Pembrokeshire, and we have had difficulty in west Wales in attracting them. A considerable number of my constituents and those in surrounding seats have to use a private dentist. In some cases that becomes slightly farcical; there is a dental practitioner in Ceredigion who used to treat NHS patients from north Pembrokeshire but is no longer allowed to do so, because of the changes to regulations.

This motion will ensure that those people

3. *yn argymhell bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â'r cynnig.* (NDM3542)

Tamsin Dunwoody: Fel gyda'r ddadl flaenorol ar y cynnig hwn, fe'i cyflwynaf er cof am fy nhad. Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynnig hwn wedi cael ei gyflwyno gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Fe gofiwch mai'r cynnig gwreiddiol a gynigiais oedd y dylid arolygu deintyddfeydd hollol preifat yng Nghymru. Yn ystod y ddadl honno, cododd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, nad yw yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd, fater a oedd yn ymwneud ag ymarfer deintyddol preifat o fewn deintyddfeydd y GIG, a pha un a oedd yn bosibl ymestyn y ddeddfwriaeth i gwmpasu'r maes hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi gweithio ar y mater hwnnw, a diolchaf i bawb a'm cynorthwyodd i wneud hynny. Mae'r cynnig gwreiddiol bellach wedi'i ymestyn i gynnwys pob math o ymarfer deintyddol preifat, pa un a gaiff ei gynnal mewn amgylchedd GIG neu mewn amgylchedd preifat.

Nid wyf am ymarfer fy nadleuon, ond mae'n bwysig gosod y rheswm am y cynnig hwn yn ei gyd-destun. Nid wyf yn credu mewn practis preifat, ac ni fyddaf fyth. Fe welaf, yn fy etholaeth i ym Mhreseli sir Benfro, ein bod mewn sefyllfa lle mae nifer sylweddol o bobl, oherwydd y newidiadau i'r contract deintyddol, ac am fod deintyddion wedi dewis ymgymryd â gwaith preifat, yn dibynnu ar bractis deintyddol preifat. Nid eu dewis hwy yw hynny, ac nid yw'n rhywbeth a groesawaf. Ymdrechwyd yn galed i sicrhau ein bod yn symud yn ôl i ddeintyddiaeth y GIG, ond y gwir yw nad yw deintyddion am ymarfer o fewn y GIG yn sir Benfro, a chawsom drafferth eu denu yn y gorllewin. Mae cryn nifer o'm hetholwyr a'r rhai mewn seddi cyfagos wedi gorfod troi at ddeintydd preifat. Mewn rhai achosion, mae hynny braidd yn chwerthinllyd; mae ymarferydd deintyddol yng Ngheredigion a arferai drin cleifion y GIG o ogledd sir Benfro ond na chaniateir iddo wneud hynny bellach, oherwydd y newidiadau i reoliadau.

Bydd y cynnig hwn yn sicrhau y caiff y bobl

who have to attend a private dentist or private practice will at least be assured that that practitioner is registered—and not only formally registered, but also formally inspected, with the standard of their work being looked at. That achieves something for patients that they have not had since 1948, when the initial contracts were drawn up, and that has to be good for everybody concerned, both patients and practitioners. This piece of legislation is a catch-all that will assist everybody.

I was interested to learn that a similar piece of legislation will be moved in England, but not until 2009-10. So, again in Wales we are using devolution to do exactly what it was supposed to do: to deliver benefits to the people of Wales. I am pleased that we have been able to do that. In the initial debate we had complete cross-party support on this matter, and I trust and hope that that will be the case today. I thank everybody who has assisted me in pulling this case together and in working hard on expanding it to include all private practitioners. I repeat that my motive is simply to ensure that all patients receive the best care; I do not condone the use of private practice.

Jenny Randerson: I had intended my comments simply to relate to the practicalities of these proposals, but I will preface my remarks by saying how refreshing it is to hear a Labour Assembly Member admit that, ten years into a Labour Government, we are in a position where, for many people, it is a case of private dentist or no dentist. I know that that is the case in Tamsin's constituency even more than in mine, where the travel times are at least short enough to give people some element of choice.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this proposal. For the reasons that Tamsin has given, we all owe people the assurance that they are receiving the highest levels of care. However, I would add this caution: any system that we develop as a result of this should avoid being overly bureaucratic, because we tend to introduce layer upon layer of inspection, and we need to ensure that any

hynny sy'n gorfod mynd at ddeintydd preifat neu ddeintyddfa breifat yn gallu cael sicrwydd fod yr ymarferydd hwnnw wedi'i gofrestru—ac wedi ei arolygu'n ffurfiol, yn ogystal â bod wedi'i gofrestru'n ffurfiol, gyda safon eu gwaith yn cael ei harolygu. Mae hynny'n cyflawni rhywbeth i gleifion, na fu ganddynt ers 1948, pan luniwyd y contractau gwreiddiol, a rhaid bod hynny'n beth da i bawb, yn gleifion ac yn ymarferwyr. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cwmpasu popeth a bydd o gymorth i bawb.

Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf glywed y caiff deddfwriaeth debyg ei chyflwyno yn Lloegr, ond ni fydd hynny tan 2009-10. Felly, unwaith eto yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn defnyddio datganoli i wneud yn union yr hyn y bwriadwyd iddo ei wneud: cyflwyno buddiannau i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu gwneud hynny. Yn y ddadl wreiddiol, cawsom gefnogaeth gwbl drawsbleidiol ar y mater hwn, ac yr wyf yn hyderus ac yn obeithiol mai felly y bydd heddiw. Diolchaf i bawb a'm cynorthwyodd i ddwyn yr achos hwn at ei gilydd ac am weithio'n galed i'w ehangu i gynnwys pob ymarferydd preifat. Pwysleisïaf mai fy nghymhelliad yn syml yw sicrhau y caiff pob claf y gofal gorau posibl; nid wyf yn cymeradwyo'r defnydd o bractis preifat.

Jenny Randerson: Yr oeddwn wedi bwriadu i'm sylwadau gyfeirio'n syml at ymarferoldeb y cynigion hyn, ond rhagarweiniaf fy sylwadau drwy ddweud ei fod yn braf clywed un o Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn cyfaddef ein bod, ar ôl deng mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, mewn sefyllfa, lle mai'r unig ddewis i lawer o bobl yw deintydd preifat neu ddim deintydd o gwbl. Gwn mai felly y mae yn etholaeth Tamsin hyd yn oed yn fwy na'm haelodaeth i, lle mae'r amseroedd teithio o leiaf yn ddigon byr i alluogi pobl i ddewis i ryw raddau.

Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Am y rhesymau a roddodd Tamsin, rhaid inni sicrhau pobl eu bod yn cael y gofal gorau posibl. Fodd bynnag, buaswn yn ychwanegu'r rhybudd hwn: dylai unrhyw system a ddatblygir gennym o ganlyniad i hyn osgoi bod yn orfiwrocataidd, am ein bod yn dueddol o gyflwyno haenen ar ben haenen o arolygu, a

inspection system is streamlined.

rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff unrhyw system arolygu ei symleiddio.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I am pleased that we seem to have a large degree of consensus on this issue. I hope that the layers of inspection that Jenny Randerson mentioned will not happen; certainly, in relation to those private dentists with an NHS practice, one of the key points of this feasibility study is that there should be a single inspection process. That, indeed, is one of the reasons why the chief dental officer is recommending that the dental reference service should be responsible for the inspection.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn ymddangos ein bod yn cytuno i raddau helaeth ar y mater hwn. Gobeithiaf na fydd yr haenau o arolygu y soniodd Jenny Randerson amdanynt yn digwydd; yn sicr, o ran y deintyddion preifat hynny sydd â deintyddfa GIG, un o'r pwyntiau allweddol yn yr astudiaeth ddichonoldeb hon yw y dylid sicrhau mai un broses arolygu sengl sydd ar waith. Dyna, yn wir, yw un o'r rhesymau pam mae'r prif swyddog deintyddol yn argymhell y dylai'r gwasanaeth cyfeirio deintyddol fod yn gyfrifol am yr arolygu.

Tamsin is right; the public would probably be surprised to learn that private dentistry is not regulated in any real fashion other than by way of basic standard regulation through the General Dental Council, civil liability and so forth. I think that they would find it extraordinary that the national health service is a regulated service but that private dentistry does not seem to have any of the safeguards and governance arrangements that exist within the NHS.

Mae Tamsin yn llygad ei lle, mae'n debyg y byddai'r cyhoedd yn synnu o glywed na chaiff deintyddiaeth breifat ei rheoleiddio i bob pwrpas ac eithrio drwy ddulliau rheoleiddio safonol sylfaenol drwy'r Cyngor Deintyddol Cyffredinol, rhwymedigaeth sifil ac ati. Credaf y byddent yn ei chael yn anodd credu bod y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn wasanaeth a reoleiddir ond nad yw'n ymddangos bod deintyddiaeth breifat yn ddarostyngedig i unrhyw rai o'r trefniadau diogelu a llywodraethu sy'n bodoli o fewn y GIG.

This is the start of the process. The feasibility study outlines the general approach that we would like to take. There is an opportunity now for the various key stakeholders to become involved in this process. Hopefully, through engagement, we will be able to move this agenda forward, and, in the next Assembly, we will be able to see this particular proposal on the statute books.

Dyma ddechrau'r broses. Mae'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb yn amlinellu'r ymagwedd gyffredinol yr hoffem ei chymryd. Mae cyfle bellach i'r rhanddeiliaid allweddol amrywiol gymryd rhan yn y broses hon. Gobeithio, drwy ymgysylltiad, y gallwn weithredu ar yr agenda hon ymlaen ac y gallwn, yn y Cynulliad nesaf, weld y cynnig arbennig hwn yn y llyfrau statud.

*Cynnig (NDM3542): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3542): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
 o Wasanaethau Canser
 The Health and Social Services Committee's Review of Cancer Services**

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.6:

notes the report of the Health and Social Services Committee on its review of cancer services for the people of Wales, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 07 February 2007. (NDM3546)

Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad. Mae'n adroddiad eithriadol o bwysig ynglŷn â gwasanaethau cancer yng Nghymru, a gobeithiaf y gall y Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, a phob Aelod, ei gefnogi.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r bobl sydd wedi chwarae rhan hanfodol yn y broses o lunio'r adroddiad hwn. Fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, yr oeddwn yn bryderus pan godwyd y pwnc gan

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6:

yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am ei adolygiad o wasanaethau cancer ar gyfer pobl Cymru, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2007. (NDM3546)

I am pleased to have the opportunity to present this report to the Assembly. It is an extremely important report on cancer services in Wales, and I hope that the Assembly as a whole, and all Members, will support it.

I am grateful to those who have played a crucial role in preparing this report. As Chair of the committee, I was worried when Jonathan Morgan raised this subject, and

Jonathan Morgan, a phan awgrymodd y dylem gynnal adolygiad, gan ei fod yn faes mor gynhwysfawr a chan fod gennym gyn lleied o amser oherwydd yr etholiadau—dim ond blwyddyn a oedd gennym i baratoi a chyflwyno'r adroddiad. Yr wyf yn cydnabod cyfraniad holl aelodau'r pwyllgor wrth weithio'n ddisgybledig i sicrhau bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi cyrraedd y fan hon. Yr wyf yn cydnabod gefnogaeth yr ysgrifenyddiaeth, a hefyd y rôl allweddol a gyflawnodd gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau; heb gyfraniad y gwasanaeth hwnnw, byddai wedi bod yn amhosibl inni gyflawni'r gwaith hwn.

Cawsom gymorth ar y cychwyn gan dri arbenigwr o Ysbyty Felindre: y Farwnes Iloro Finlay, Tim Maughan a Malcolm Mason. Yr oedd eu harweiniad ar y dechrau yn ein galluogi i weld yn glir yr hyn yr oedd angen ei wneud. Yna, buom yn ffodus o gael cefnogaeth grŵp o arbenigwyr yn y maes. Yr oedd yn gwbl amlwg inni na fyddai un ymgynghorydd yn ddigon gan fod cymaint o feysydd arbenigol i'w hystyried, felly, rhoddodd grŵp o arbenigwyr eu hamser i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu ystyried yr holl feysydd hynny. Yr oedd eu hymroddiad yn adlewyrchiad o ymroddiad pawb sy'n gweithio o fewn y maes pwysig hwn i gyflawni darpariaeth mor effeithiol â phosibl ar gyfer y bobl sy'n dioddef o ganser yng Nghymru.

Cadeirydd y grŵp arbenigol oedd Andy Fowell, a roddodd gefnogaeth ac arweiniad i'r grŵp. Daeth Andy ac Iloro Finlay gyda Jonathan Morgan, Jenny Randerson a minnau ar ein taith i Caen i weld y gwasanaeth a gynigir yn Ffrainc, er mwyn ein galluogi i gymharu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru gyda'r hyn a gynigir yno.

Wedi inni gael yr arweiniad hwnnw daeth yn amlwg bod meysydd penodol i'w hystyried, ac mai comisiynu oedd un o'r meysydd hynny. Yr hyn a nodir yn glir yn yr adroddiad yw bod cymhlethdodau yn y broses gomisiynu a oedd yn gwneud comisiynu gwasanaethau unigol yn eithriadol o anodd i glinigwyr yn ogystal ag i gleifion. Yr oedd cytundeb bod angen system gliriach o lawer i wneud hynny.

when he suggested that we should hold a review, as it is such a wide-ranging subject and as we had so little time before the election—we only had a year to prepare and present the report. I recognise the contribution of all committee members in working conscientiously to ensure that the report reached this point. I recognise the support provided by the secretariat, and also the key role played by the Members' research service; without that contribution it would have been impossible for us to complete this work.

At the outset, we were aided by three experts from the Velindre Hospital: Baroness Iloro Finlay, Tim Maughan and Malcolm Mason. Their guidance at the beginning enabled us to see clearly what needed to be done. We were then fortunate enough to be supported by a group of cancer experts. It was obvious to us that one adviser would not be adequate, as there were so many specialist areas to consider, so a group of experts gave of their time to ensure that we could look at all those areas. Their commitment reflected the commitment of all those who work in this important area to providing the most effective service possible to those suffering from cancer in Wales.

The specialist group was chaired by Andy Fowell, who provided the group with support and leadership. Andy Fowell and Iloro Finlay accompanied Jonathan Morgan, Jenny Randerson and me on our visit to Caen to see the service that is offered in France, so that we could compare that with what is happening in Wales.

Having been given that lead, it became obvious that there were specific areas that we should consider, and that commissioning was one such area. It is clearly noted in the report that complexities within the commissioning process make the commissioning of individual services extremely difficult for clinicians as well as for patients. There was agreement that a much clearer system was required for that.

4.00 p.m.

Yr oedd y system technoleg gwybodaeth yn eithriadol o bwysig. Unwaith eto, yr oedd diffygion sylfaenol yn y maes hwnnw. O ran comisiynu, yr ydym i gyd yn glir bod y cyfrwng CaNISC yn effeithiol, ond bod angen iddo gael ei ddatblygu'n sylweddol yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau comisiynu effeithiol.

Rhodddwyd cryn dipyn o sylw i faes cyffuriau, meddyginiaethau a thriniaethau newydd. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd gyda Herceptin ac yr ydym yn awr yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd gyda brachytherapi. Croesawn ddatganiad y Gweinidog am y gwasanaeth a fydd ar gael yn Ysbyty Felindre, ond, unwaith eto, mae'r ddau ddigwyddiad yn dangos y problemau sydd yn ein hwynebu. Croesawn hefyd yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud gyda'r grŵp ar draws Gymru ar y strategaeth meddyginiaethau; edrychaf ymlaen at weld sut y bydd y datblygiadau hynny yn cyflymu'r broses o sicrhau eu bod ar gael i gleifion.

Buom hefyd yn edrych ar y maes o fyw gyda chanser, sy'n faes eithriadol o bwysig. Mae cynifer o bobl bellach yn dioddef o ganser, mae'n bwysig bod yr adnoddau ar gael i'w cynnal a'u galluogi i fyw gyda'r clefyd hwn. Y bore yma, yr oeddwn yn hynod falch bod nifer o fy nghyd-aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Gweinidog wedi gallu cefnogi ymgrych elusen Marie Curie, sy'n sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu byw a hyd yn oed marw gydag urddas wrth ddiodeff o ganser. Yr hyn a gafodd ei nodi—ac y mae'n wir am fyw gyda chanser a'i drin—oedd nad ydyw'r adnoddau ar gael yn gyson ym mhob rhan o Gymru i sicrhau bod modd gwneud hynny. Dim ond ychydig dros 30 y cant o'r bobl sy'n dymuno aros yn eu cartrefi yn ystod cyfnod eu clefyd, gan arwain at eu marwolaeth, sy'n gallu gwneud hynny, gan nad yw'r adnoddau ar gael. Mae'n bwysig bod yr adnoddau hynny ar gael i bawb yn gyson drwy Gymru.

Mae elfen olaf yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â gofal lliniarol, sy'n bwysig wrth sôn am y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan hosbisau yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhain yn cynnig gwasanaeth

The information technology system was extremely important. Once again, there were fundamental deficiencies in that area. In terms of commissioning, we are all aware that the CaNISC medium is effective, but needs to be developed extensively in Wales in order to allow for effective commissioning.

Much attention was paid to drugs, medicines and new treatments. We are all aware of what happened with Herceptin and we now know of what is happening with brachytherapy. We welcome the Minister's statement about the service that will be available at Velindre Hospital, but, once again, those two issues illustrate the problems that we face. We also welcome what the Minister is doing with the all-Wales medicines strategy group; I look forward to seeing how those developments speed up the process of ensuring that they are available for patients.

We also looked at living with cancer, which is extremely important. So many people now suffer from cancer that it is important that the resources are available to support them and to enable them to live with the illness. This morning, I was very pleased that a number of my fellow members of the Health and Social Services Committee were able to support the Marie Curie charity campaign that ensures that people with cancer are able to live, and even die, with dignity. The campaign notes—and this is true of living with cancer and of treating cancer—that the resources are not consistently available across Wales to enable that to happen. Only a little over 30 per cent of those who wish to stay at home when suffering from the illness, in the period leading up to their death, are able to do so, as the resources are not available. It is important that those resources are consistently available across Wales.

The final part of the report deals with palliative care, which is important in dealing with the services offered by Welsh hospices. These offer excellent services, and there is a

gwyb, ac mae elfen gref o gefnogaeth iddynt gan y cyhoedd. Mae'n bwysig bod y cyfraniadau elusennol a gwirfoddol a wneir yn parhau—ni wn am yr un hosbis yng Nghymru sy'n dymuno rhoi terfyn ar hwnnw; yn hytrach, maent yn dymuno iddo fod y rhan fwyaf o'u cyllid. Fodd bynnag, mae angen sefydlogrwydd cyllid arnynt i'w galluogi i gyflawni eu gwaith.

Felly, yr ydym wedi edrych ar y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael ac wedi ceisio eu cydlynu. Yr ydym hefyd wedi pwysleisio'r anghenion o ran cefnogi ac ychwanegu at yr adnoddau sydd ar gael yn y meysydd hynny. Yr ydym wedi ceisio gweld y gwendidau a'r bylchau sydd yn y gwasanaeth. Y mae 16 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad, ac yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed i sicrhau eu bod yn argymhellion y gellir eu gweithredu gan Lywodraeth. Pa blaid bynnag fydd yn llywodraethu ar ôl 4 Mai, y mae'r 16 o argymhellion yn gwbl weithiadwy. Yr ydym wedi osgoi gofyn am yr amhosibl; yr ydym wedi gofyn am yr hyn sy'n bosibl a'r hyn sydd ei angen ar bobl sy'n dioddef o ganser yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, nodaf fod y cyfryngau a'r wasg, i raddau, wedi datgan ein bod ni, yn yr adroddiad, wedi beirniadu'r gwasanaeth canser sydd ar gael yng Nghymru, ond nid yw hynny'n wir. Ni fu gair o feirniadaeth o'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael nac o'r bobl sy'n cyflawni'r gwasanaethau hynny; canmoliaeth yn unig sydd iddynt. Yr hyn a ddywedwn yw nad yw'r gwasanaethau ar gael yn gyson i bobl ar draws Cymru, a dyna sydd angen ei sicrhau. Rhaid adeiladu ar yr hyn y gallwn fod yn falch ohono yng Nghymru; yn anffodus, nid yw'n bodoli i bawb yn gyson drwy Gymru.

Yr wyf yn falch iawn i gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn at sylw'r Cynulliad, a mawr obeithiaf y caiff gefnogaeth o bob cyfeiriad.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Glyn Davies.

Glyn Davies: Dirprwy Lywydd, yet again, you have shocked me, as you did the other day by calling me a little bit earlier than I was anticipating. However, because of that experience a few weeks ago, I did anticipate

strong element of public support for them. It is important that charitable and voluntary contributions continue—I know of no hospice in Wales that wants that to come to an end; rather, they want that to account for the largest portion of their funding. However, they need security of funding in order to do their work.

Therefore, we have looked at the services that are available and have tried to co-ordinate them. We have also emphasised the needs in terms of supporting and enhancing the resources available in those areas. We have tried to identify the weaknesses and gaps in the service. The report includes 16 recommendations, and we have worked hard to ensure that they are recommendations that can be implemented by Government. Whatever party is in Government after 4 May, the 16 recommendations are workable. We have avoided asking for the impossible; we have asked for what can be done and what is needed by those suffering from cancer in Wales.

Finally, I note that the media and press, to some extent, have said that the report is critical of the cancer services available in Wales, but that is not true. There is no criticism of the services provided and no criticism of those providing those services; we only praise them. What we say is that services are not consistently available for people across Wales, and that that is what we must secure. We must build on what we can be proud of in Wales; unfortunately, it does not exist for everybody, on a consistent basis, across Wales.

I am very pleased to be able to present this report to the Assembly, and I very much hope that it will be supported in all quarters.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Glyn Davies.

Glyn Davies: Ddirprwy Lywydd, unwaith eto, yr ydych wedi fy synnu, fel y gwnaethoch y diwrnod o'r blaen, drwy fy ngalw ychydig yn gynt na'r disgwyl. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y profiad hwnnw rai

a couple of minutes ago that I just might get called first.

I accept that the committee report was unable to cover everything relating to cancer services, but I want to say something about bowel cancer and about awareness and screening programmes, which are touched on only tangentially in the report. I will speak a little bit from personal knowledge and experience about this issue.

We know that approximately 2,000 cases of bowel cancer are diagnosed in Wales every year, and about 600 deaths resulting from it. What I want to point out is how unusual the disease is, in that you can make a 100 per cent recovery. There are not many illnesses from which you can make a 100 per cent recovery if it is diagnosed early enough. Absolutely crucial to recovery is early diagnosis and early treatment, and that is why screening for early diagnosis is so hugely important.

The case against screening, as far as I can see, is the element of cost. It is not that screening itself is expensive, more that identifying a lot more cases through screening means that it is very expensive to treat those people. These cases arise directly from the fact that they have been identified earlier in the process. It is unlikely that there will be any radiotherapy, chemotherapy or any of those huge costs, and the person will make 100 per cent recovery. It is possible to recover sufficiently well to captain the National Assembly rugby team in taking on the team from the House of Lords and the House of Commons—and to travel to the match using your free bus pass, courtesy of the Assembly Government.

Following my own experience of bowel cancer, I have set myself up as someone who people can call to talk to about this when they are diagnosed. Sometimes, it is shocking and depressing when I speak to someone who is young and, to all intents and purposes, perfectly fit, but who has not been as lucky as I was, in that their diagnosis was a bit later in the day, and the cancer has spread to other parts of the body. I know of one particular young man who was in his 30s and who died

wythnosau yn ôl, rhagwelais ychydig funudau yn ôl y byddwn efallai yn cael fy ngalw gyntaf.

Derbynïaf nad oedd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gallu cwmpasu popeth yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau canser, ond yr wyf am ddweud rhywbeth am ganser y perfedd ac am ymwybyddiaeth a rhaglenni sgrinio, nas cyfeirir atynt ond yn fras yn yr adroddiad. Siaradaf ychydig o wybodaeth a phrofiad personol am y mater hwn.

Gwyddom fod tua 2,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn canfod eu bod yn dioddef o ganser y perfedd bob blwyddyn, a bod tua 600 o bobl yn marw ohono. Yr hyn yr wyf am ei nodi yw pa mor anarferol yw'r clefyd, yn yr ystyr y gallwch wella'n llwyr ohono. Nid oes llawer o afiechydon y gallwch wella'n llwyr ohonynt os gwneir diagnosis yn ddigon cynnar. Mae'n hollbwysig er mwyn gwella bod y clefyd yn cael ei ganfod a'i drin yn gynnar, a dyna pam mae sgrinio ar gyfer diagnosis cynnar mor eithriadol o bwysig.

Y ddadl yn erbyn sgrinio, hyd y gwelaf, yw'r gost. Nid y sgrinio ei hun sy'n gostus, ond y ffaith bod canfod llawer mwy o achosion drwy sgrinio yn golygu bod trin y bobl hynny yn gostus iawn. Mae'r achosion hyn yn deillio'n uniongyrchol o'r ffaith eu bod wedi cael eu canfod yn gynharach yn y broses. Mae'n annhebygol y bydd unrhyw radiotherapi, cemotherapi neu unrhyw un o'r costau enfawr hynny, a bydd y person yn gwella'n llwyr. Mae'n bosibl gwella ddigon da i fod yn gapten ar dîm rygbi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn erbyn tîm o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi a Thŷ'r Cyffredin—ac i deithio i'r gêm gan ddefnyddio eich pas bws am ddim, diolch i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yn dilyn fy mhrofiad i o ganser y perfedd, yr wyf wedi cynnig fy hun fel rhywun y gall pobl ei ffonio i siarad am hyn pan fydd diagnosis wedi ei wneud. Weithiau, mae'n drist ac yn dorcalonnu siarad â rhywun sydd yn ifanc ac, i bob pwrpas, yn hollol ffit, ond na fu mor ffodus â minnau, am i'r diagnosis gael ei wneud yn nes ymlaen, ac mae'r canser wedi lledu i rannau eraill o'r corff. Gwn am un dyn ifanc arbennig yn ei dridegau a fu farw ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach. Mae

two years later. That happens again and again, simply because there has not been early diagnosis. All we need is a screening programme.

To carry on being unable to screen people because we cannot deal with the cases that are identified, owing to a lack of capacity in the service to deal with them, seems to me to be an absolute outrage of a policy. I think that we should move as quickly as we can to a screening programme, certainly for those aged over 50, as cancer is more likely to strike later in life. In addition, it can, to some extent, be identified in families, and so all these people should be targeted. If the Minister gets the chance to touch on this matter in his response, will he give us some sort of timeframe for when screening for bowel cancer will be introduced in Wales? Will he also tell us what discussions he has had with local health boards on how this can be rolled out across Wales, learning from the experiences in England? In addition, if dealing with demand is the problem and the reason why we do not do this, what assessment has been made of the demand that would be placed on the health service by the cases found through screening? How soon will the health service have the capacity to deal with those people? Saving lives and returning people to 100 per cent fitness will save the health service money in the longer term, as you will not have the huge expenses of continuing chemotherapy and radiotherapy for what will be limited lives.

4.10 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: I wish to focus on recommendations 4, 6 and 7. I agree that we need clarity on the way in which services are commissioned, particularly with regard to the role of Health Commission Wales. It took me some time to work out how best to make representations on my constituents' behalf. I am particularly taken with recommendation 6. Having a joint protocol with other parts of the UK for the appraisal of new drugs and therapies is an interesting concept. That will not only speed up the process, but prevent what the committee describes as 'unreasonable and uninformed public expectation'. Sharing expertise is an excellent and sensible idea.

hynny'n digwydd dro ar ôl tro, yn syml am na wnaed diagnosis cynnar. Y cyfan sydd ei angen arnom yw rhaglen sgrinio.

Mae parhau i fethu â sgrinio pobl gan na allwn ymdrin â'r achosion a ganfyddir, oherwydd prinder adnoddau yn y gwasanaeth i ymdrin â hwy yn ymddangos i mi yn bolisi hollol wirion. Credaf y dylem sefydlu rhaglen sgrinio mor gyflym ag y gallwn, yn sicr i'r rhai dros 50 oed gan fod canser yn llawer mwy tebygol o daro yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Hefyd, i ryw raddau, gellir ei ganfod mewn teuluoedd, ac felly dylai'r holl bobl hyn gael eu targedu. Os caiff y Gweinidog y cyfle i sôn am hyn yn ei ymateb, a wnaiff roi rhyw fath o amserlen i ni a fydd yn dangos pryd y caiff sgrinio ar gyfer canser y perfedd ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru? A ddywed hefyd pa drafodaethau a gafodd gyda byrddau iechyd lleol ar sut y gellir cyflwyno hyn ledled Cymru, gan ddysgu o brofiadau Lloegr? Hefyd, os mai ymdrin â'r galw yw'r broblem a'r rheswm pam nad ydym yn gwneud hyn, pa asesiad a wnaed o'r galw a fyddai ar y gwasanaeth iechyd oherwydd yr achosion a ganfyddir drwy sgrinio? Pa mor fuan y bydd gan y gwasanaeth iechyd yr adnoddau i ymdrin â'r bobl hynny? Bydd achub bywydau a sicrhau bod pobl yn gwella'n llwyr yn arbed arian i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y tymor hwy, gan na fydd costau enfawr cemotherapi a radiotherapi parhaus ar gyfer yr hyn a fydd yn fywyd cyfyngedig.

Lorraine Barrett: Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar argymhellion 4, 6 a 7. Cytunaf fod angen i'r ffordd y comisiynir gwasanaethau, yn arbennig o ran rôl Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, gael ei hegluro. Cymerodd beth amser imi weithio allan sut i wneud sylwadau ar ran fy etholwyr yn y ffordd orau. Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb arbennig yn argymhelliad 6. Mae cael protocol ar y cyd â rhannau eraill o'r DU ar gyfer arfarnu cyffuriau a therapïau newydd yn gysyniad diddorol. Bydd hynny nid yn unig yn cyflymu'r broses, ond yn atal yr hyn y mae'r pwyllgor yn ei ddisgrifio fel disgwyliad afresymol ac anwybodus y cyhoedd. Mae rhannu arbenigedd yn syniad rhagorol a doeth.

That ties in with recommendation 7 regarding how that information on new drugs and treatments is communicated to clinicians and to the public. I am particularly interested in these recommendations, because they have an impact on my constituent, Mr Galvin—and I asked him yesterday whether he minded my using his name. I have spent some time with him, and I have been trying to help him for a while now. He wants brachytherapy for prostate cancer. I do not want to use Mr Galvin's case as a political football; all I am interested in is helping him to get the treatment that I think he needs.

I was a nurse in another life; I am the patron of the Marie Curie hospice in Penarth and my mother had cancer, so I feel that I have a little bit of expertise, although, obviously, I am not his clinician. There is probably a great deal of information that his clinician has that I do not. My problem, and Mr Galvin's, is that, under Health Commission Wales's guidelines, he does not fit the criteria to be eligible for brachytherapy, as he has a Gleason score of 7. In Wales, you can have brachytherapy only if you have a Gleason score of 6 or below. However, in England, patients can receive brachytherapy with a higher Gleason score. There are other considerations, but I am using the Gleason score for these purposes. Therefore, if we had the protocol that the committee suggests across Wales, Scotland and England, for brachytherapy treatment, for instance, people such as Mr Galvin would not be in the position of being told that they do not fit the criteria in Wales but that they would fit it if they lived in England.

It is not for any of us as politicians to say whether a patient is suitable for a particular drug or treatment, but it is incumbent upon us to get as level a playing field as possible for everyone in the UK when it comes to these life-saving opportunities.

Owen John Thomas: You are quite right in everything that you have said so far about Mr Galvin, Lorraine. He is having treatment in England, where people can be treated with a Gleason score of 8; his score of 7 means that, in England, he would be given the treatment.

Mae hynny'n berthnasol i argymhelliad 7 o ran sut y cyfathrebir y wybodaeth honno am gyffuriau a thriniaethau newydd i glinigwyr ac i'r cyhoedd. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig yn yr argymhellion hyn, oherwydd cânt effaith ar fy etholwr, Mr Galvin—a gofynnais iddo ddoe a oedd ots ganddo fy mod yn defnyddio ei enw. Yr wyf wedi treulio peth amser gydag ef, ac wedi bod yn ceisio ei helpu ers peth amser. Mae am gael brachytherapi ar gyfer canser y brostad. Nid wyf am ddefnyddio achos Mr Galvin fel rhan o gêm wleidyddol; yr unig beth y mae gennyf ddiddordeb ynddo yw ei helpu i gael y driniaeth y credaf sydd ei hangen arno.

Arferwn fod yn nyrs mewn oes a fu; fi yw noddwr hosbis Marie Curie ym Mhenarth a chafodd fy mam ganser, felly teimlaf fod gennyf ychydig o arbenigedd, er nad fi, yn amlwg, yw ei glinigwr. Mae llawer iawn o wybodaeth mae'n siŵr gan ei glinigwr nad oes gennyf i. Fy mhroblem i, a phroblem Mr Galvin, yn ôl canllawiau Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yw nad yw'n bodloni'r meini prawf i fod yn gymwys i gael brachytherapi, gan fod ganddo sgôr Gleason o 7. Yng Nghymru, dim ond os oes gennych sgôr Gleason o 6 neu lai y gallwch gael brachytherapi. Fodd bynnag, yn Lloegr, gall cleifion gael brachytherapi gyda sgôr Gleason uwch. Mae sawl ystyriaeth arall, ond yr wyf yn defnyddio'r sgôr Gleason at y dibenion hyn. Felly, pe bai'r protocol gennym y mae'r pwyllgor yn ei awgrymu ar draws Cymru, yr Alban a Lloegr, ar gyfer triniaeth brachytherapi, er enghraifft, ni fyddai pobl fel Mr Galvin yn cael gwybod nad ydynt yn bodloni'r meini prawf yng Nghymru ond y byddent yn gwneud hynny pe byddent yn byw yn Lloegr.

Nid ein lle ni fel gwleidyddion yw dweud a yw claf yn addas ar gyfer cyffur neu driniaeth benodol, ond mae rheidrwydd arnom i sicrhau cyfle mor deg â phosibl i bawb yn y DU o ran y cyfleoedd hyn i achub bywydau.

Owen John Thomas: Mae popeth a ddywedasoeh hyd yma am Mr Galvin yn hollol gywir, Lorraine. Mae'n cael triniaeth yn Lloegr, lle y gall pobl gael eu trin gyda sgôr Gleason o 8; mae ei sgôr o 7 yn golygu, yn Lloegr, y byddai'n cael y driniaeth. O

Given that we cannot provide the treatment here until the autumn and so Mr Galvin has to go to England to get that treatment, it seems that somebody somewhere has raised an extra obstacle by saying that he can go to England, but that he cannot be treated under England's regulations; he must be treated under Wales's regulations. That means that he cannot have that treatment without paying for it. As you know, Mr Galvin will have to find £7,500 from somewhere at 67 years of age to do that. You will appreciate then that the principle—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is supposed to be an intervention.

Owen John Thomas: May I just say—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No. It is an intervention. You are down to make your own speech later, but that is in danger at the moment.

Owen John Thomas: Well, you get my point.

Lorraine Barrett: You have taken my point. That is the point that I have been making, so thanks for reiterating it.

This week, I have written again to Health Commission Wales, but I want to take this opportunity to ask the commission publicly why we cannot have the same criteria as England for this treatment. Someone who lives in Bristol who has a Gleason score of 8 can have brachytherapy, but someone who lives in Penarth who has a Gleason score of 7 cannot. I am assured that it is not a financial but a clinical decision, but it just does not seem right to me. Therefore, I hope that recommendation 6 will put this anomaly right. If Health Commission Wales is listening, I ask it to please look at the letter that I have sent this week, and let us get Mr Galvin's treatment sorted out now.

Eleanor Burnham: I wish to speak briefly, primarily as the former fundraising manager at St Kentigern Hospice and Palliative Care Centre in St Asaph, and having recently chaired the North Wales Regional Committee on this invaluable service. I am not a member

gofio na allwn ddarparu'r driniaeth yma tan yr hydref ac felly bod yn rhaid i Mr Galvin fynd i Loegr i gael y driniaeth honno, ymddengys imi fod rhywun yn rhywle wedi codi rhwystr ychwanegol drwy ddweud y gall fynd i Loegr ond na all gael ei drin o dan reoliadau Lloegr; rhaid iddo gael ei drin o dan reoliadau Cymru. Mae hynny'n golygu na all gael y driniaeth honno heb dalu amdani. Fel y gwyddoch, bydd yn rhaid i Mr Galvin ddod o hyd i £7,500 o rywle yn 67 oed i wneud hynny. Fe werthfawrogwch wedyn fod yr egwyddor—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn i fod.

Owen John Thomas: A allaf ddweud—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Na allwch. Ymyriad yw hwn. Mae'n fwriad ichi draddodi eich araith eich hun yn nes ymlaen, ond mae hynny yn y fantol ar hyn o bryd.

Owen John Thomas: Wel, yr ydych yn deall fy mhwynt.

Lorraine Barrett: Yr ydych wedi mynd â'm pwynt i. Dyna'r pwynt yr wyf i wedi bod yn ei wneud, felly diolch am ei ailadrodd.

Yr wythnos hon, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu eto at Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, ond yr wyf am fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn i'r comisiwn yn gyhoeddus pam na allwn gael yr un meini prawf â Lloegr ar gyfer y driniaeth hon. Gall rhywun sy'n byw ym Mryste sydd â sgôr Gleason o 8 gael brachytherapi, ond ni all rhywun sy'n byw ym Mhenarth sydd â sgôr Gleason o 7 wneud hynny. Caf fy sicrhau nad penderfyniad ariannol ond penderfyniad clinigol yw hwn, ond nid yw'n ymddangos yn iawn i mi. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd argymhellad 6 yn unioni'r anghysondeb hwn. Os yw Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn gwranddo, gofynnaf iddo edrych ar y llythyr a anfonais yr wythnos hon, a threfnu i Mr Galvin gael ei driniaeth.

Eleanor Burnham: Hoffwn siarad yn fras, yn bennaf fel cyn reolwraig codi arian Hosbis St Kentigern a'r Ganolfan Gofal Llanirol yn Llanelwy, ac fel rhywun sydd wedi cadeirio Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd yn ddiweddar ar y gwasanaeth hollbwysig hwn. Nid wyf yn

of the House Committee, but I am concerned about the perilous financial plight of this vital service, especially in north Wales. It is mostly dependent on voluntary fundraising of a mammoth proportion, and a great deal of voluntary staffing and support. Hospices offer the last remnants of dignity and care for terminally ill patients. We hear such horror stories about the lack of tender loving care within the NHS because of enormous pressures and changing attitudes. I believe that it is our duty, in a civilised society and within the wonderful devolved nation of Wales, to offer the best quality of care, and I know from first-hand experience that hospices offer such care. However, this comes at considerable financial cost, and I understand that St Kentigern Hospice and other similar-sized hospices need around £2.5 million per annum to maintain their excellent services for day and in-patient care.

I wish to briefly refer to some of the recommendations that have been highlighted by my colleague, Julie Hinchliffe, who is the director of media and communications at Nightingale House Hospice in Wrexham. I wish to refer in particular to recommendation 4, which states that the Assembly Government should

‘ensure that at each level, there is a requirement for the commissioners to consult with appropriate service providers in the statutory, voluntary and private sectors’,

and that there should be a requirement for joint local commissioning on a local level.

Recommendation 9 states:

‘The Welsh Assembly Government should ensure joint planning between cancer charities and partner organisations’.

In Gwynedd, there is Hospice at Home, and there are variations of that around Wales. Recommendation 9 is important in that regard.

Recommendation 15 states:

‘Local health boards and NHS trusts should work with a range of voluntary sector organisations with a view to their being

aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, ond pryderaf ynghylch sefyllfa ariannol enbyd y gwasanaeth hollbwysig hwn, yn enwedig yn y gogledd. Mae’n dibynnu i raddau helaeth ar wirfoddolwyr yn codi symiau enfawr o arian ac ar gryn dipyn o staffio a chymorth gwirfoddol. Mae hosbisau yn cynnig urddas a gofal i gleifion â salwch angheuol yn ystod eu dyddiau olaf. Clywn storïau arswydus am ofal gwael yn y GIG oherwydd pwysau mawr ac agweddau newydd. Credaf fod dyletswydd arnom mewn cymdeithas waraidd ac yn y wlad ddatganoledig wych hon, i gynnig gofal o’r safon orau, a gwn o’r profiad fy hun fod hosbisau yn cynnig gofal o’r fath. Fodd bynnag, mae’n gostus iawn, a deallaf fod angen tua £2.5 miliwn y flwyddyn ar Hosbis St Kentigern a hosbisau o faint tebyg i gynnal eu gwasanaethau ardderchog ar gyfer gofal dydd a gofal i gleifion mewnol.

Hoffwn gyfeirio’n fras at rai o’r argymhellion a nodwyd gan Julie Hinchliffe, sef cyfarwyddwr y cyfryngau a chyfathrebu yn Hosbis Tŷ Nightingale yn Wrexham. Hoffwn gyfeirio’n benodol at argymhelliad 4, sy’n nodi y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad

‘sichau, ar bob lefel, ei fod yn ofynnol i’r comisiynwyr ymgynghori â darparwyr gwasanaethau priodol yn y sector statudol, gwirfoddol a phreifat’,

ac y dylai fod gofyniad ar gyfer comisiynu ar y cyd yn lleol.

Noda argymhelliad 9:

‘Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sichau bod elusennau canser a chyrrff sy’n bartneriaid yn cynllunio ar y cyd’.

Yng Ngwynedd, ceir Hosbis yn y Cartref, a cheir ffurfiau amrywiol ar hynny ledled Cymru. Mae argymhelliad 9 yn bwysig yn hynny o beth.

Noda argymhelliad 15:

‘Dylai byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau’r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol gydweithio ag amrediad o gyrff y

engaged in providing information and support for patients and carers’.

Glyn mentioned earlier the plight of people who do not find out about their conditions in time; there is a lot of ignorance around, which is appalling in this day and age.

The nub of recommendation 16 is that we should reflect on best practice and ensure that we work in a much smarter way. We cannot rely on hospices, which have this mammoth financial burden, to be able to work with short-term initiatives and injections of money. As much as they appreciated the last injection of money, provided, I believe, when Jane Hutt was the Minister for Health and Social Services, it did not last long and the amount that she offered could be used by a hospice in one year. If we are going to build on providing ongoing care, we need to consider the fact that there is much smarter use of money within the hospice movement. When we consider the waste and less-smart use of resources in the NHS, we should reflect on the important point that, although the NHS saves considerable amounts of money, the dignity of care, which is paramount, is more readily available in hospices.

Owen John Thomas: I do not have much to add, having made my intervention. However, the report proclaims the following:

‘It is a fundamental principle that a patient’s access to drugs and treatment should be based on their clinician’s assessment of the potential benefit to them’.

It is much easier to espouse principles than it is to uphold them. I feel that this principle has not been upheld in the case of my constituent, Mr Galvin. He has been let down over some silly little ruling that we do not need to see that differentiates between people in England and Wales. I would like to think that the Minister could intervene in this matter and ensure, in view of the circumstances, that Mr Galvin gets his treatment, otherwise all these principles and lordly words will be regarded as worthless by the public.

sector gwirfoddol gyda’r bwriad o fod yn gysylltiedig â darparu gwybodaeth a chymorth i gleifion a gofalwyr’.

Soniodd Glyn yn gynharach am dynged pobl nad ydynt yn canfod bod salwch arnynt mewn pryd; ceir cryn anwybodaeth, sy’n beth gwarthus yn y byd sydd ohoni.

Byrdwn argymhelliad 16 yw y dylem ystyried arferion gorau a sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio mewn ffordd gallach. Ni allwn ddibynnu ar hosbisau, sy’n ysgwyddo’r baich ariannol anferthol hwn, i allu gweithio gyda mentrau byrdymor a symiau o arian bob hyn yn hyn. Er cymaint iddynt werthfawrogi’r swm olaf a roddwyd, fe gredaf, pan oedd Jane Hutt yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ni pharhaodd yn hir, a gallai hosbis ddefnyddio’r swm a gynigiwyd ganddi mewn blwyddyn. Os ydym am anelu at ddarparu gofal parhaus, mae angen inni ystyried y ffaith y ceir defnydd callach o arian ymhlith hosbisau. Pan feddyliwn am y gwastraff a’r defnydd llai call o adnoddau yn y GIG, dylem ystyried y pwynt pwysig, er bod y GIG yn arbed cryn dipyn o arian, ei bod yn haws cael gofal gydag urddas, sy’n hollbwysig, mewn hosbisau.

Owen John Thomas: Nid oes gennyf lawer i’w ychwanegu ar ôl fy ymyriad. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr adroddiad y canlynol:

‘Mae’n egwyddor sylfaenol y dylai mynediad cleifion at gyffuriau a thriniaeth fod yn seiliedig ar asesiad eu clinigwyr o’r fantais bosibl iddynt’.

Mae dipyn yn haws arddel egwyddorion na’u gweithredu. Teimlaf na weithredwyd yr egwyddor hon yn achos fy etholwr, Mr Galvin. Bu rhyw ddyfarniad bach hurt nad oes angen inni ei weld sy’n gwahaniaethu rhwng pobl yn Lloegr a phobl yng Nghymru yn ergyd iddo. Hoffwn feddwl y gallai’r Gweinidog ymyrryd yn y mater hwn a sicrhau, o ystyried yr amgylchiadau, bod Mr Galvin yn cael triniaeth, neu fel arall ofer fydd yr holl egwyddorion a’r geiriau teg hyn yn nhyb y cyhoedd.

4.20 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: Welsh hospices provide quality residential, day, respite and palliative care, and care in the home, at a lesser cost than the NHS, but they receive the poorest level of state funding in the UK, averaging just 15 per cent compared with 50 per cent in Scotland and, by 2008, 40 per cent in England. The committee report states that the Welsh Assembly Government should:

‘Put funding on a more stable footing that reflects more equitably the extent to which the sector provides services’.

The Help the Hospices charity has stated that the £2 million funding that has been announced is not enough to solve the long-term financial issues across the 12 independent Welsh hospices. It does not replace the £10 million which ended last April let alone address the desperate need for sustainable core funding over the long term. Hospices remain unclear about whether this funding will support current services or fund additional services. If it is the latter, there may be some resistance from hospices, which are already struggling to make ends meet. The recent statement by Minister for Health and Social Services on the review of cancer services made it clear that subsequent engagement with hospices was about how to distribute this £2 million rather than identifying and adequately funding the core resources needed by our hospices. My party has pledged £10 million per annum to address the needs that have been identified. Following the hospice event that I arranged and hosted in the Assembly last November, which was attended by every hospice in Wales, hospices in north Wales told me that they are concerned that the Labour Assembly Government has slipped an inadequate £2 million into the final budget at the last minute without consultation or explanation.

Referring to the First Minister’s comments yesterday about engaging with the hospice sector, hospices have responded to the

Mark Isherwood: Mae hosbisau yng Nghymru yn rhoi gofal preswyl, gofal dydd, gofal seibiant a gofal lliniarol o safon, a gofal yn y cartref, am lai o gost na’r GIG, ond cânt y lefel isaf o arian gan y wladwriaeth yn y DU, tua 15 y cant ar gyfartaledd o’i chymharu â 50 y cant yn yr Alban ac, erbyn 2008, 40 y cant yn Lloegr. Noda adroddiad y pwyllgor y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru:

‘wneud cyllid yn fwy sefydlog sy’n adlewyrchu’n fwy cytbwys faint o wasanaethau y mae’r sector yn eu darparu’.

Mae’r elusen Helpu’r Hosbisau wedi dweud nad yw’r £2 filiwn o arian a gyhoeddwyd yn ddigon i ddatrys y problemau ariannol hirdymor a wynebir gan y 12 o hosbisau annibynnol yng Nghymru. Nid yw’n gwneud iawn am y £10 miliwn a ddaeth i ben fis Ebrill diwethaf heb sôn am fynd i’r afael â’r angen dybryd am arian craidd cynaliadwy yn yr hirdymor. Erys hosbisau yn ansicr pa un a fydd yr arian hwn yn cynnal y gwasanaethau presennol neu’n ariannu gwasanaethau ychwanegol. Os mai’r olaf ydyw, efallai y bydd hosbisau, sydd eisoes yn wynebu problemau ariannol, ychydig yn wrthwynebus. Yn y datganiad diweddar gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am yr adolygiad o wasanaethau canser, fe’i gwnaeth yn glir y byddai trafodaethau dilynol gyda hosbisau yn ymwneud â’r ffordd y dylid dosbarthu’r swm hwn o £2 filiwn yn hytrach na nodi’r adnoddau craidd sydd eu hangen ar ein hosbisau a’u hariannu’n ddigonol. Mae fy mhlaid wedi addo £10 miliwn y flwyddyn i ddiwallu’r anghenion a nodwyd. Ar ôl y digwyddiad i hosbisau a drefnwyd ac a gynhaliwyd gennyf yn y Cynulliad fis Tachwedd diwethaf, y cymerodd pob hosbis yng Nghymru ran ynddo, dywedodd hosbisau yn y gogledd wrthyf eu bod yn pryderu bod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi cynnwys swm annigonol o £2 filiwn yn y gyllideb derfynol ar y funud olaf heb ymgynghori nac esbonio.

Gan gyfeirio at sylwadau’r Prif Weinidog ddoe am ymgysylltu â’r sector hosbisau, mae hosbisau wedi ymateb i’r datganiad gan y

statement by the Minister for Health and Social Services by telling me that hospice care is very much broader than in-patient care and that a large part of the provision involves care in people's homes and offering wider support. Beyond this, hospices care for carers and the bereaved and provide information and education for healthcare professionals. The implication that hospices are responsible for the lack of ongoing funding from local health boards is wholly unacceptable. All hospices actively engage with their local health boards and yet not one has picked up the cost for projects previously developed through the £10 million funding, which has now ended.

Hospices believe that the review would be better developed as a strategy for Wales with significant input from providers in all sectors. As we have already heard, Marie Curie has delivered its petition to the Assembly Government today supporting the choice for cancer patients to die at home. When I recently asked the First Minister what action he proposed to support this, he referred again to this miraculous £2 million. However, Marie Curie has told me that local health boards are struggling with their budgets and are trying to create their own intermediate care teams when palliative care is not an intermediate stage, but about giving hope to live at the end of life and about giving respite to carers. If the Assembly Government does not listen to the concerned voice of voluntary cancer service providers, it will expose itself as a party without a heart, a soul, or a conscience. I hope that it will prove me wrong.

Karen Sinclair: As we all know, cancer touches the lives of thousands of patients and their families in Wales every single year. The remorseless nature of the disease means that it has no regard for social status, wealth, or gender. Indeed, its only predictable feature is the way that it permeates every aspect of the lives of patients and their families. The human cost of the disease and the damage that it inflicts means that it should always be the centre of any focus for elected representatives charged with shaping the

Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol drwy ddweud wrthyf fod gofal hosbis yn golygu llawer mwy na gofal i gleifion mewnol a bod rhan helaeth o'r ddarpariaeth yn cynnwys gofal yng nghartrefi pobl a chymorth mwy cyffredinol. Y tu hwnt i hyn, mae hosbisau yn gofalu am ofalwyr a'r rhai mewn profedigaeth ac yn rhoi gwybodaeth ac addysg i weithwyr proffesiynol gofal iechyd. Mae'r awgrym mai hosbisau sy'n gyfrifol am y prinder arian parhaus oddi wrth fyrdau iechyd lleol yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae pob hosbis mewn cysylltiad â'u byrddau iechyd lleol ond eto nid oes yr un wedi ysgwyddo'r gost am brosiectau a ddatblygwyd yn flaenorol drwy'r £10 miliwn o gyllid, sydd wedi dod i ben erbyn hyn.

Cred hosbisau mai'r peth gorau fyddai datblygu'r adolygiad yn strategaeth i Gymru gyda chyfraniad sylweddol gan ddarparwyr ym mhob sector. Fel y clywsom eisoes, mae Marie Curie wedi cyflwyno ei deiseb i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad heddiw yn cefnogi rhoi dewis i gleifion cancer farw gartref. Pan ofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog yn ddiweddar pa gamau yr oedd yn bwriadu eu cymryd i gefnogi hyn, cyfeiriodd eto at y swm gwyrthiol hwn o £2 filiwn. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd Marie Curie wrthyf fod byrddau iechyd lleol yn cael trafferthion gyda'u cyllidebau ac yn ceisio creu eu timau gofal canolraddol eu hunain er nad cam canolraddol yw gofal lliniarol ond ymgais i roi gobaith ar ddiwedd bywyd a seibiant i ofalwyr. Os na fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwrandao ar lais darparwyr gwasanaethau cancer gwirfoddol pan fyddant yn mynegi eu pryder, bydd yn dangos mai plaid heb galon, nac enaid na chydwybod ydyw. Gobeithiaf bydd yn fy siomi ar yr ochr orau.

Karen Sinclair: Fel y gwyyddom oll, mae cancer yn effeithio ar filoedd o gleifion a'u teuluoedd yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Mae natur ddirugaredd y clefyd yn golygu nad yw'n parchu statws cymdeithasol na chyfoeth a'i fod yn effeithio ar ddynion a merched fel ei gilydd. Yn wir, yr unig nodwedd ragweladwy yw'r ffordd y mae'n treiddio i bob agwedd ar fywydau cleifion a'u teuluoedd. Mae pris y mae'n rhaid ei dalu a'r niwed y mae'n ei achosi yn golygu y dylai bob amser gael blaenoriaeth gan

healthcare systems of a community.

To look at and examine every aspect of this cruel disease would have been an almost impossible task for the committee and would have provided us with no tangible reward. The decision to concentrate on specific areas proved to be the right one. I praise the work on the report by the officials supporting the committee. In the end, it proves to be a realistic and frank set of recommendations which adds something important to the debate that we should be having about cancer in Wales. I would like to refer to some of the points arising from some of the recommendations in the report and flag up those that I feel are of particular importance in developing a stronger approach to palliative care patients in Wales, with an acknowledgement of the key role that hospices play in that care.

In the past, hospices often dealt with end-of-life issues only. However, people are living far longer with cancer now and are managing the disease. Hospices have a very important part to play in that situation. In many ways, it is a change of role for hospices, but it is an opportune time—with our committee report—to look at how they fit with that.

We are all aware of the important role that they can and should play in our cancer networks, and the Assembly spent some time over the last year discussing their role and overall funding. I particularly welcome the prominence that this report gives to their importance, and to palliative care in general. Hospices provide a dignified and comprehensive care package to a range of vulnerable cancer patients, across the age spectrum. It does not necessarily have to be cancer patients; there are many diseases that hospices can and should be involved with. In Wrexham, Nightingale House is one such example. The episodes of specialist patient care that it provides to many of my constituents in north Wales is invaluable.

I fully support the acknowledgement in several of the recommendations that hospice care should be central to the planning and

gynrychiolwyr etholedig sy'n gyfrifol am lunio systemau gofal iechyd cymuned.

Byddai pwysu a mesur pob agwedd ar y clefyd creulon hwn wedi bod yn dasg amhosibl bron i'r pwyllgor ac ni fyddai wedi esgor ar unrhyw ganlyniadau pendant inni. Bu'r penderfyniad i ganolbwyntio ar feysydd penodol yn un cywir. Canmolaf y gwaith ar yr adroddiad gan y swyddogion sy'n cynorthwyo'r pwyllgor. Yn y pen draw, mae'n gyfres realistig a gonest o argymhellion sy'n ychwanegu rhywbeth pwysig i'r drafodaeth y dylem fod yn ei chael ynglŷn â chanser yng Nghymru. Hoffwn gyfeirio at rai o'r pwyntiau sy'n deillio o rai o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a thynnu sylw at y rhai hynny sy'n bwysig iawn, yn fy marn i, er mwyn meithrin ymagwedd gadarnach tuag at gleifion gofal lliniarol yng Nghymru, gan gydnabod y rôl allweddol a chwaraeir gan hosbisau o ran y gofal hwnnw.

Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd hosbisau yn aml yn ymdrin â materion ar ddiwedd bywyd yn unig. Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn mae pobl yn byw gyda chanser am gyfnod llawer hwy ac yn rheoli'r clefyd. Mae gan hosbisau ran bwysig iawn i'w chwarae yn y sefyllfa honno. Mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n rôl newydd i hosbisau, ond mae'n amser da—gyda'n hadroddiad gan y pwyllgor—i edrych ar eu rôl hwy yn hynny o beth.

Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol o'r rhan bwysig y gallant ac y dylent ei chwarae yn ein rhwydweithiau canser, a threuliodd y Cynulliad beth amser dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn trafod eu rôl a'u cyllid cyffredinol. Croesawaf yn fawr y flaenoriaeth a rydd yr adroddiad hwn i'w pwysigrwydd, ac i ofal lliniarol yn gyffredinol. Mae hosbisau yn cynnig pecyn gofal cynhwysfawr gydag urddas i nifer fawr o gleifion canser diamddiffyn, o bob oedran. Nid ydym yn sôn am gleifion canser o reidrwydd; mae llawer o glefydau y gall ac y dylai hosbisau ymwneud â hwy. Yn Wrecsam, mae Tŷ Nightingale yn enghraifft o'r fath. Mae'r cyfnodau o ofal arbenigol i gleifion y mae'n eu cynnig i lawer o'm hetholwyr yn y gogledd yn amhrisiadwy.

Cefnogaf yn llwyr y gydnabyddiaeth mewn sawl un o'r argymhellion y dylai gofal hosbis fod yn ganolog i'r gwaith o gynllunio a

delivery of cancer services. There is a real commitment now to taking that forward. Hospices can, as they do in Wrexham, provide a level of expertise that significantly adds to the overall care package that we provide to cancer patients. As a result, I would like to see the service level agreements that exist with hospices in Wales made much clearer, and, more importantly, more comprehensive and stronger.

Carl Sargeant and I discussed this at length with the team in Nightingale House a few weeks ago, and we had a frank and open discussion. All of us around the table acknowledged that we need robust arrangements for hospices, with hospices involved and represented at a far earlier point in the planning stage, as a way of providing better care for patients, harnessing their expertise, because they have a superb level of expertise, and helping to roll that out into the community and sharing it with health providers. In Wrexham, for instance, the hospice staff already make their expertise available to GPs and nurses in the field. That is a valuable service that can be provided, and it could be clearly rolled out as a service level agreement.

I also welcome recommendation 10 in the report, which calls on the Assembly Government to reinforce the guidance on information given to support patients. Recommendation 10.ii. makes the important point that clearer information is needed for patients on the financial support, benefits, employment and other rights that are open to them. It is so important that they get that information at the right time, and that they get it in an easily understandable way. We know that, often, when you listen to information at a critical time, you do not take everything in. So, information on their rights and on what they can access needs to be laid out clearly for people, to try to minimise the stress as much as possible.

Cancer patients are some of the most vulnerable and exposed individuals in the whole healthcare system. Giving these patients better information about the exact

darparu gwasanaethau canser. Mae ymrwymiad gwirioneddol bellach i fwrw ymlaen â hynny. Gall hosbisau, fel y gwnânt yn Wrecsam, gynnig arbenigedd sy'n ychwanegu cryn dipyn at y pecyn gofal cyffredinol a roddwn i gleifion canser. O ganlyniad, hoffwn weld y cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth a geir gyda hosbisau yng Nghymru yn cael eu gwneud yn llawer cliriach, ac, yn bwysicach na dim, yn fwy cynhwysfawr a chadarn.

Trafododd Carl Sargeant a minnau hyn yn fanwl gyda'r tîm yn Nhŷ Nightingale ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, a chawsom drafodaeth onest ac agored. Cydnabu pob un ohonom a oedd o amgylch y bwrdd fod angen inni sicrhau trefniadau cadarn ar gyfer hosbisau, gyda hosbisau yn cael eu cynnwys a'u cynrychioli lawer ynghynt yn ystod y cam cynllunio, fel ffordd o roi gwell gofal i gleifion, gan fanteisio ar eu harbenigedd, oherwydd maent yn meddu ar gryn arbenigedd, a helpu i gyflwyno hynny yn y gymuned a'i rannu gyda darparwyr iechyd. Yn Wrecsam, er enghraifft, mae staff hosbis eisoes yn cynnig eu harbenigedd i feddygon teulu a nyrsys yn y maes. Mae hwnnw yn wasanaeth gwerthfawr y gellir ei gynnig, a gallai gael ei gyflwyno yn amlwg fel cytundeb lefel gwasanaeth.

Croesawaf hefyd argymhelliad 10 yn yr adroddiad, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i atgyfnerthu'r canllawiau ar wybodaeth a roddir i gynorthwyo cleifion. Mae argymhelliad 10.ii. yn gwneud y pwynt pwysig bod angen gwybodaeth gliriach ar gleifion ynglŷn â chymorth ariannol, budd-daliadau, hawliau cyflogaeth a hawliau eraill sydd ar gael iddynt. Mae'n bwysig iawn y cânt y wybodaeth honno ar yr adeg gywir, a hynny ar ffurf hawdd iawn ei deall. Gwyddom, pan fyddwch yn gwranddo ar wybodaeth ar adeg dyngedfennol, nad ydych, yn aml, yn deall popeth. Felly, mae angen cyflwyno gwybodaeth am eu hawliau ac am yr hyn y gallant ei gael yn glir i bobl, er mwyn ceisio lleihau'r straen cymaint â phosibl.

Mae cleifion canser ymhlith rhai o'r unigolion mwyaf diamddiffyn yn y system gofal iechyd gyfan. Byddai rhoi gwell gwybodaeth i'r cleifion hyn ynglŷn â'r union

help that is available to them would be a valuable and worthwhile way to strengthen the system of support to patients, and I fully commend this to the Assembly, and certainly to the Minister.

The final issue that I wish to highlight comes from recommendation 10.iii., which proposes the allocation of a key worker as a point of contact for patients and their carers. This is imperative, because we are talking here about patients who are being placed under the most unimaginable strain because of their disease, and it is critical that they have a consistent prop, so that they can feel that they are at the centre of the care system that they are accessing.

Therefore, I welcome this report, and I welcome the effects that it could have on the cancer systems in Wales if the recommendations are accepted. This is an honest and good piece of work, Brian, and I hope that you take all the recommendations on board.

Helen Mary Jones: I will endeavour to be brief, Deputy Presiding Officer.

First, I wish to associate myself with what has already been said by Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Karen Sinclair, and others, in thanking all those who participated in the inquiry, particularly the expert reference group. When we began this piece of work as a committee, we all had our doubts about whether we could address such a large agenda in such a short space of time, and I believe that we have come out with a valuable piece of work. I also welcome the comments that have been made today by those Assembly Members who are not members of the Health and Social Services Committee. It is pleasing to see the consensus that we were able to develop across parties in the committee reflected across the Chamber.

4.30 p.m.

I will concentrate my remarks on three specific groups of recommendations. The first group is recommendations 6 and 7, relating to new drugs. This is a hugely complex area, and we all acknowledge that

gymorth sydd ar gael iddynt yn atgyfnerthu'r system o gymorth i gleifion mewn ffordd werthfawr a buddiol, a chymeradwyaf hwn i'r Cynulliad yn llwyr, ac yn sicr i'r Gweinidog.

Mae'r mater olaf yr hoffwn dynnu sylw ato yn deillio o argymhelliad 10.iii., sy'n cynnig penodi gweithiwr allweddol fel pwynt cyswllt i gleifion a'u gofalwyr. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig, am ein bod yn sôn am gleifion sy'n cael eu rhoi o dan y pwysau mwyaf anhygoel oherwydd eu clefyd, ac mae'n hollbwysig eu bod yn cael cymorth cyson, fel y gallant deimlo eu bod wrth wraidd y system gofal y maent yn ei defnyddio.

Felly, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, a chroesawaf yr effaith y gallai ei chael ar y systemau canser yng Nghymru os derbynnir yr argymhellion. Mae hwn yn ddarn o waith gonest a da, Brian, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn derbyn pob un o'r argymhellion.

Helen Mary Jones: Ceisiaf fod yn gryno, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ategu'r hyn a ddywedwyd eisoes gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Karen Sinclair, ac eraill, wrth ddiolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad, yn enwedig y grŵp cyfeirio o arbenigwyr. Pan ddechreuasom ar y gwaith hwn fel pwyllgor, yr oedd amheuan gan bob un ohonom a allem ymdrin ag agenda mor fawr mewn cyfnod mor fyr, a chredaf inni wneud darn o waith gwerthfawr. Croesawaf hefyd y sylwadau a wnaed heddiw gan yr Aelodau Cynulliad hynny nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'n bleser gweld y consensws yr oeddem wedi llwyddo i'w gael ymhlith y pleidiau yn y pwyllgor yn cael ei adlewyrchu ar draws y Siambr.

Yn fy sylwadau canolbwytiaf ar dri grŵp penodol o argymhellion. Y grŵp cyntaf yw argymhellion 6 a 7, yn ymwneud â chyffuriau newydd. Mae hwn yn faes cymhleth iawn, ac mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod bod y

the current situation causes confusion and distress. I met a constituent this weekend who had been told by his consultant, other more conventional drugs having failed, that Sutent, a new treatment that I was not even aware of until I met this gentleman, is probably his best chance to prolong his life and to maintain his quality of life. This drug is in the situation that we are all familiar with, in that it has been registered but has not yet been approved by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence and the all-Wales medicine strategy group. My constituent understands that patients in Cardiff have been approved for this treatment, and we have approached his local health board, but I had to spend half an hour explaining to this highly intelligent and well-informed family how the system works. I found that very difficult, given that the family had been told by the consultant that this is the drug that can save his life. The situation is complex, as others have said, but we must also acknowledge that it seems very unfair to those who are caught up in it. We need to find a better way, and so I particularly commend recommendations 6 and 7 to the next Assembly Government.

I refer next to recommendations 10, 11 and 12, which relate to the need for information and emotional support for patients and for carers, and the need to address the financial and social problems often faced by cancer patients and their families. The evidence that we received in this regard, as others have said, was certainly compelling. It is shocking that in our country, in this century, families suffering from cancer can end up poor and under extreme social pressure, as well as having to face the clinical problems that the disease presents them with. It is essential—I will not reiterate the case, as others have made it very well—that we take practical steps to deal with this. We must remember, too, that ensuring that patients have a reasonable standard of living and quality of life has an impact on their chances of recovery.

On recommendation 16, which relates to the role of the voluntary sector, others have

sefyllfa bresennol yn achosi dryswch a gofid. Cyfarfûm ag un o'm hetholwyr y penwythnos hwn ac yr oedd ei feddyg ymgynghorol wedi dweud wrtho, am fod cyffuriau mwy confensiynol wedi methu, mai Sutent, sef triniaeth newydd nad oeddwn hyd yn oed wedi clywed amdani hyd nes imi gyfarfod â'r dyn hwn, yw ei obaith gorau, siŵr o fod, o fyw'n hwy a chynnal ansawdd ei fywyd. Mae'r cyffur hwn wedi cyrraedd y cam y mae pob un ohonom yn gyfarwydd ag ef, sef ei fod wedi'i gofrestru ond heb ei gymeradwyo eto gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol a'r grŵp strategaeth feddyginiaethau Cymru gyfan. Mae fy etholwr yn deall bod cleifion yng Nghaerdydd wedi'u cymeradwyo i gael y driniaeth hon, ac yr ydym wedi cysylltu â'i fwrdd iechyd lleol, ond bu'n rhaid imi dreulio hanner awr yn egluro i'w deulu deallus a hyddysg iawn sut y mae'r system yn gweithio. Bu hynny'n anodd iawn, o gofio bod y meddyg ymgynghorol wedi dweud wrth y teulu mai dyma'r cyffur a all achub ei fywyd. Mae'r sefyllfa yn gymhleth, fel y dywedodd eraill, ond rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd ei bod yn ymddangos yn annheg iawn i'r rhai sy'n rhan o'r sefyllfa. Mae angen inni ddod o hyd i ffordd well, ac felly cymeradwyaf argymhellion 6 a 7 yn arbennig i'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad nesaf.

Cyfeiriaf nesaf at argymhellion 10, 11 a 12, sy'n ymwneud â'r angen i gleifion a gofalwyr gael gwybodaeth a chymorth emosiynol, a'r angen i ymdrin â'r problemau ariannol a chymdeithasol a wynebir yn aml gan gleifion canser a'u teuluoedd. Yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom yn hyn o beth, fel y dywedodd eraill, yn sicr yn gymhellol. Mae'n ofnadwy y gall teuluoedd sy'n dioddef o ganser yn y wlad hon, yn y ganrif hon, fod yn dlawd ac o dan bwysau cymdeithasol eithriadol, yn ogystal â gorfod wynebu'r problemau clinigol yn sgîl y clefyd. Mae'n hanfodol—ac ni fyddaf yn ailadrodd y ddadl, am fod eraill wedi gwneud hynny'n dda iawn—ein bod yn cymryd camau ymarferol i ymdrin â hyn. Rhaid inni gofio, hefyd, y caiff sicrhau bod gan gleifion safon byw ac ansawdd bywyd rhesymol effaith ar eu gobaith o wella.

O ran argymhelliad 16, sy'n ymwneud â rôl y sector gwirfoddol, mae eraill wedi cyfeirio

already touched on the vital contribution that the voluntary sector makes in cancer care, particularly palliative care, and have spoken of the importance of the hospice movement. I take this opportunity to pay tribute to Tŷ Bryngwyn hospice in Llanelli, and to commend the funding model that has been developed there, after hard and passionate campaigning by those involved. We have a model there whereby the elements of care that would otherwise be provided by the NHS, either in a hospital setting or in the community—Tŷ Bryngwyn hospice also runs a hospice-at-home service—are funded by the local health board, as they would be if they were provided in a hospital. The extra elements of care that only a hospice can provide, whether aromatherapy or the detailed emotional support that is provided by volunteers, are funded through the voluntary model. It is more complicated than that, and we continue to have to have regular discussions with the local health board to maintain the model, but that model that could work for other hospices across Wales, based on a proper service level agreement, whereby everyone knows what needs to be contributed and what is expected in return.

I commend to fellow Members and to the Minister the Marie Curie Cancer Care campaign for the right to die at home. I do so from an emotional perspective, I admit. My family had a positive experience in caring for my mother through her last illness, supported by a GP practice that had palliative care expertise, district nurses who had had special palliative care training, and Marie Curie nurses, who were amazing and who made a huge difference to us, as they do to families across Wales. Having been so fortunate as a family, we and I believe passionately that every family in Wales should be able to make that choice. That may not be choice of many families, they may prefer hospice care or they may feel that, because of the medical pressures and pressures on family members, the patient may prefer to be in hospital. However, that should be a choice.

I commend this report to the next Assembly and the next Assembly Government,

eisoies at y cyfraniad allweddol a wna'r sector gwirfoddol i ofal canser, yn enwedig gofal lliniarol, ac wedi siarad am bwysigrwydd y mudiad hosbisau. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i hosbis Tŷ Bryngwyn yn Llanelli, ac i gymeradwyo'r model cyllido a ddatblygwyd yno, ar ôl ymgyrchu caled a brwd gan bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r mater. Mae gennym fodel yno lle yr ariennir yr elfennau gofal a ddarperid gan y GIG fel arall, naill ai yn yr ysbyty neu yn y gymuned—mae hosbis Tŷ Bryngwyn hefyd yn rhedeg gwasanaeth yr hosbis yn y cartref—gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol, fel y byddai'n digwydd pes darperid mewn ysbyty. Ariennir yr elfennau gofal ychwanegol na all ond hosbis eu darparu, boed yn aromatherapi neu'r cymorth emosiynol manwl a ddarperir gan wirfoddolwyr, drwy'r model gwirfoddol. Mae'n fwy cymhleth na hynny, a rhaid inni barhau i gael trafodaethau rheolaidd â'r bwrdd iechyd lleol er mwyn cynnal y model, ond gallai'r model hwnnw weithio i hosbisau eraill ledled Cymru, yn seiliedig ar gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth priodol, lle y gŵyr pawb yr hyn y mae angen ei gyfrannu a'r hyn a ddisgwyilir yn gyfnewid am hynny.

Cymeradwyaf i'm cyd-Aelodau ac i'r Gweinidog ymgyrch Gofal Canser Marie Curie sy'n ymdrin â'r hawl i farw gartref. Gwnaf hynny o safbwynt emosiynol, fe gyfaddefaf. Cafodd fy nheulu brofiad cadarnhaol o ofalu am fy mam yn ystod ei salwch olaf, gyda chymorth meddygfa a oedd ag arbenigedd ym maes gofal lliniarol, nyrsys ardal a oedd wedi cael hyfforddiant arbennig ym maes gofal lliniarol, a nyrsys Marie Curie, a oedd yn wych ac a wnaeth wahaniaeth mawr inni, fel a wnânt i deuluoedd ledled Cymru. Ar ôl bod mor ffodus fel teulu, credwn yn gryf y dylai pob teulu yng Nghymru allu wneud y dewis hwnnw. Efallai na fydd llawer o deuluoedd yn dewis hynny, efallai y byddai'n well ganddynt ddewis gofal mewn hosbis neu efallai y byddant yn teimlo, oherwydd y pwysau meddygol a phwysau ar aelodau'r teulu, fod yn well gan y claf fod yn yr ysbyty. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r dewis hwnnw fod ar gael.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad nesaf ac i'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad nesaf,

whatever its make-up. We got the evidence that it really is time for a change for the better for cancer patients across Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: I join my colleagues in thanking those who contributed to this review, most notably our professors, our expert reference group and those who provided a huge wealth of evidence. I am delighted with the outcome of the review, and I thank Members for accepting the recommendation that I made to them that we undertake a review into cancer services, although the committee did not need much convincing that this was an important piece of work for us to do. It was our final policy review as the Health and Social Services Committee, and it is probably one of the most important reviews undertaken in this Assembly.

It was also perhaps one of the most challenging reviews because, as the Chair of the committee has said, the range of issues that we could have discussed and examined was enormous. The review could have been longer and it certainly could have been broader in terms of the issues dealt with, but we were fairly strict in examining certain areas of concern. This report not only makes interesting reading, but makes a valuable contribution in pointing the direction in which the third Assembly could go in developing services, the way those services are planned, where they are delivered, the types of research and professional support that we have and how we provide for palliative care at the crucial time for cancer sufferers.

The report points to several glaring omissions, one of which is that there are key shortfalls in the basic provision of cancer services in Wales, particularly in some treatments, radiotherapy, chemotherapy, and surgery. We must ensure that the next Assembly Government begins to get the basics right. We must look at more innovative forms of treatment and provide and pay for all of those wonderful new developments that will be created in generations to come, but we must also ensure that we get the basics right, because if we cannot do that, we are in trouble.

beth bynnag fo'i chyfansoddiad. Cawsom y dystiolaeth ei bod yn hen bryd newid er gwell i gleifion canser ledled Cymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Ymunaf â'm cyd-Aelodau i ddiolch i'r rhai a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad hwn, yn bennaf ein hathrawon, ein grŵp cyfeirio arbenigol a'r rhai a roddodd lawer iawn o dystiolaeth. Yr wyf yn fodlon iawn ar ganlyniad yr adroddiad, a diolchaf i'r Aelodau am dderbyn yr argymhelliad a gynigiais iddynt sef ein bod yn cynnal adolygiad o wasanaethau canser, er nad oedd angen gwneud llawer i argyhoeddi'r pwyllgor bod hwn yn waith pwysig inni ei wneud. Dyna ein hadolygiad olaf o bolisi fel y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac mae'n debyg ei fod yn un o'r adolygiadau pwysicaf a gyflawnwyd yn y Cynulliad hwn.

Efallai, hefyd, ei fod yn un o'r adolygiadau mwyaf heriol oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, yr oedd yr amrywiaeth o faterion y gallem fod wedi'u trafod a'u harchwilio yn enfawr. Gallai'r adolygiad fod wedi bod yn hwy ac, yn sicr, gallai fod wedi bod yn ehangach o ran y materion yr ymdriniodd â hwy, ond yr oeddem yn eithaf llym wrth archwilio meysydd penodol a oedd yn peri pryder. Nid yn unig y mae'r adroddiad yn ddiddorol, ond gwna gyfraniad gwerthfawr i nodi'r cyfeiriad y gallai'r trydydd Cynulliad fynd iddo wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau, y ffordd y caiff y gwasanaethau hynny eu cynllunio, lle y cânt eu darparu, y mathau o ymchwil a chymorth proffesiynol sydd gennym a sut y darparwn ofal lliniarol ar yr adeg allweddol i'r rhai sy'n dioddef o ganser.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi sawl bwlch amlwg. Un o'r rhain yw bod diffygion allweddol yn y ddarpariaeth sylfaenol o wasanaethau canser yng Nghymru, yn arbennig mewn rhai mathau o driniaethau, radiotherapi, cemotherapi, a llawdriniaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth Cynulliad nesaf yn dechrau cael yr hanfodion yn gywir. Rhaid inni ystyried mathau mwy arloesol o driniaeth a darparu'r holl ddatblygiadau gwych newydd hynny a gaiff eu creu mewn cenedlaethau i ddod a thalu amdanynt, ond rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd ein bod yn cael yr hanfodion yn gywir, oherwydd os na allwn

The planning and delivery of services was a major concern and the range of evidence that was brought to us by experts and by groups suggested that the planning of services was at best patchy. Recommendation 4 of the report, which looks at the need for clarity and transparency in commissioning, is of fundamental importance, particularly given the confusion around what is provided and commissioned by local health boards on the one hand, and by Health Commission Wales on the other. For example, local health boards are responsible for commissioning adult cancer services, but Health Commission Wales is responsible for commissioning children's cancer services. There is real confusion not only among patients, but among clinicians and those who work in the health sector, as to who is responsible for commissioning what and where services are best provided.

There is a need for us to provide clarity as to the role of cancer networks. Many of the clinicians whom we spoke to were unclear about what the cancer networks were there to achieve, and we need to ensure clarity in future. If there is just one example—and this has been raised by others this afternoon—of where planning of services and, in particular, of treatment and drugs is important, it is brachytherapy. The decisions over that and the confusion over whether or not it could be provided for highlighted the real stupidity that we have seen in Wales in the planning of treatment and drugs. This needs to be tackled quickly and, in future, we need to ensure that the horizon scanning that is done by Health Commission Wales and by LHBs in planning for new treatments and drugs is much more strict and provides for patient treatment and care.

We have many excellent professionals working in Wales. I pay particular tribute to those who work at Velindre Hospital. We recently celebrated its fiftieth anniversary at a wonderful service at Llandaff cathedral in Cardiff and it was an amazing testament to the dedication and hard work of all those who work in cancer services. For those who work in the palliative care sector, there can be no

wneud hynny, yr ydym mewn trafferth.

Yr oedd y broses o gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau yn peri pryder mawr ac awgrymodd yr amrywiaeth o dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd inni gan arbenigwyr a grwpiau fod y gwaith o gynllunio gwasanaethau yn anghyson ar y gorau. Mae argymhelliad 4 o'r adroddiad, sy'n ystyried yr angen i sicrhau gwaith comisiynu clir a thryloyw, yn hollbwysig, yn arbennig o gofio'r dryswch o ran yr hyn a ddarperir ac a gomisiynir gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ar yr un llaw, a chan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar y llaw arall. Er enghraifft, byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu gwasanaethau canser i oedolion, ond Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu gwasanaethau canser i blant. Mae dryswch gwirioneddol nid yn unig ymhlith cleifion, ond ymhlith clinigwyr a'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y sector iechyd, o ran pwys sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu beth a'r lle gorau i ddarparu gwasanaethau.

Mae angen inni egluro rôl y rhwydweithiau canser. Nid oedd llawer o'r clinigwyr y gwnaethom siarad â hwy yn deall beth oedd nod y rhwydweithiau canser, ac mae angen inni egluro hynny yn y dyfodol. Un enghraifft—a chodwyd hyn gan eraill y prynhawn yma—lle y mae'r gwaith o gynllunio gwasanaethau ac, yn benodol, driniaeth a chyffuriau yn bwysig, yw brachytherapi. Amlygodd y penderfyniadau ynghylch hynny a'r dryswch ynghylch a ellid ei ddarparu ai peidio y gwiriondeb gwirioneddol a welsom yng Nghymru ym maes cynllunio triniaeth a chyffuriau. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â hyn yn gyflym ac, yn y dyfodol, mae angen inni sicrhau bod y gwaith chwilio'r gorwelion a wneir gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru a chan fyrddau iechyd lleol i gynllunio triniaethau a chyffuriau newydd yn llawer mwy llym ac yn darparu ar gyfer triniaeth a gofal cleifion.

Mae llawer o weithwyr proffesiynol ardderchog yn gweithio yng Nghymru. Talaf deyrnged arbennig i'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn Ysbyty Felindre. Dathlwyd ei hanner canmlwyddiant yn ddiweddar mewn gwasanaeth hyfryd yn eglwys gadeiriol Llandaf yng Nghaerdydd ac yr oedd yn dyst anhygoel i ymroddiad a gwaith caled pawb sy'n gweithio ym maes gwasanaethau canser.

greater need than for the Assembly to start treating them not just as charity workers but as partners in the delivery of services. Those people are not just good at raising money, but experts at providing palliative care services. Unless we start treating them in that way, and invest in the infrastructure in our communities, we will never provide for those who wish to die at home and not in a hospice. We know that for many people, who are, sadly, at the end of their life, that choice is important both for them and their families.

There are huge issues here for the next Assembly to address, because the people of Wales deserve a better service than they are getting now.

4.40 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: I will start, as others have done, by thanking Dr Andy Fowell, the expert reference group and all those who contributed to the report, including committee staff. As others have said, this was a massive topic, and there were, inevitably, aspects that we could not touch. People have approached me asking why we did not look at certain aspects, but we made a decision early on that we would attempt to cover certain aspects of cancer care services thoroughly and effectively, rather than taking a broad-brush approach that could only skim over the surface.

I will pick out some key points from among the recommendations. The recommendations on commissioning are not about issues that people argue about in the press or talk about in the pub, but we all realised, when we looked at the problem, that commissioning is at the heart of this. You can have no better illustration of how important commissioning is than the exchange between Lorraine and Owen John earlier. It was a discussion about there being one Gleeson score in England and another in Wales, and the fact that where you live determines how you are judged from a clinical perspective. The public could be forgiven for being profoundly cynical about

I'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y sector gofal lliniarol, ni all fod angen mwy nag i'r Cynulliad ddechrau eu trin nid dim ond fel gweithwyr elusen ond fel partneriaid wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau. Nid dim ond codi arian y gall y bobl hyn ei wneud, ond maent hefyd yn arbenigo mewn darparu gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol. Oni ddechreuwn eu trin yn y ffordd hon, a buddsoddi yn y seilwaith yn ein cymunedau, ni fyddwn byth yn darparu ar gyfer y rhai sydd am farw gartref yn hytrach nag mewn hosbis. Gwyddom fod y dewis hwnnw i lawer o bobl sydd, yn anffodus, ar ddiwedd eu hoes, yn bwysig iddynt hwy ac i'w teuluoedd.

Mae materion enfawr yma y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad nesaf ymdrin â hwy, am fod pobl Cymru yn haeddu gwasanaeth gwell nag a gânt ar hyn o bryd.

Jenny Randerson: Dechreuaf, fel y mae eraill wedi'i wneud, drwy ddiolch i Dr Andy Fowell, y grŵp cyfeirio arbenigol a phawb a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad, gan gynnwys staff y pwyllgor. Fel y dywedodd eraill, yr oedd hwn yn bwnc enfawr, ac yn anochel, yr oedd agweddau arno na allem eu hystyried. Mae pobl wedi cysylltu â mi i ofyn pam nad ystyriwyd agweddau penodol, ond gwnaethom benderfyniad yn gynnar y byddem yn ceisio cwmpasu agweddau penodol ar wasanaethau gofal canser yn drwyadl ac yn effeithiol, yn hytrach nag edrych ar ystod ehangach o faterion mewn ffordd arwynebol.

Cyfeiriaf at rai pwyntiau allweddol ymhlith yr argymhellion. Nid oes a wnelo'r argymhellion ynghylch comisiynu â materion y mae pobl yn dadlau drostynt yn y wasg nac yn siarad amdanynt yn y dafarn, ond sylweddolodd pob un ohonom, wrth inni ystyried y broblem, mai comisiynu sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Nid oes enghraifft well o bwysigrwydd comisiynu na'r drafodaeth rhwng Lorraine ac Owen John yn gynharach. Cafwyd trafodaeth ynghylch y ffaith bod un sgôr Gleeson yn Lloegr a sgôr arall yng Nghymru, a'r ffaith bod yr ardal lle yr ydych yn byw yn penderfynu sut y cewch eich ystyried o safbwynt clinigol. Gellid maddau

the whole process. When you are talking about clinical judgments, where you live should not be an issue. We need much more clarity, more public information and a much simpler and more straightforward system of commissioning. Not all services can be commissioned at the same level. The committee was clear on that point, but there has to be a firm decision, with good communication between the different levels.

We also emphasised the importance of the cancer networks, which are made up of those at the heart of the services provided. The cancer networks have a tremendous contribution to make, but, at the moment, they more or less have one hand tied behind their backs. They do not have the money or the resources to be as effective as they might be.

We decided that certain services have to be commissioned regionally. In other words, local health boards have to work together to ensure provision.

The issue of new drugs coming onto the market is phenomenally difficult to tackle. How you overcome the media pressure, and the expectation it raises among the public, is not an easy matter. However I remain convinced—and I think that it is reflected in the report—that there is a better way to do it than how we do it at present, and that there can be a speedier process, and one that better communicates how approvals are made. Clinicians have a key role to play here in how they give advice to their patients.

Turning to the phenomenal contribution of the voluntary sector, one key issue that we tackled was the importance of trusts and local health boards engaging properly with the voluntary sector, especially in relation to palliative care. We have to find some means of avoiding the major palliative care organisations, such as Marie Curie, having to negotiate with 22 local health boards and ending up providing a very variable service across Wales. That is totally inappropriate.

Whoever is in Government after May, the £2 million set aside this year by the Minister is a

i'r cyhoedd am fod yn sinigaidd iawn ynghylch y broses gyfan. Pan sonnir am farn glinigol, ni ddylai'r ardal lle yr ydych yn byw fod yn broblem. Mae angen llawer mwy o eglurder, mwy o wybodaeth i'r cyhoedd a system gomisiynu lawer symlach. Ni ellir comisiynu pob gwasanaeth ar yr un lefel. Gwnaeth y pwyllgor y pwynt hwnnw yn glir, ond rhaid cael penderfyniad cadarn, gyda chyfathrebu da rhwng y lefelau gwahanol.

Gwnaethom bwysleisio pwysigrwydd y rhwydweithiau cancer hefyd, sy'n cynnwys y rhai sydd wrth wraidd y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Mae gan y rhwydweithiau cancer gyfraniad mawr iawn i'w wneud, ond, ar hyn o bryd, maent o dan anfantais. Nid yw'r arian na'r adnoddau ganddynt i fod mor effeithiol ag y gallent fod.

Gwnaethom benderfynu bod yn rhaid comisiynu rhai gwasanaethau yn rhanbarthol. Hynny yw, rhaid i fyrddau iechyd lleol gydweithio i sicrhau darpariaeth.

Mae'n anodd iawn mynd i'r afael â'r mater o ran cyffuriau newydd a roddir ar y farchnad. Nid yw'n hawdd goresgyn pwysau'r cyfryngau, a disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd sy'n deillio o hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig o hyd—a chredaf fod hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad—fod ffordd well o wneud hyn na'r hyn a wnawn ar hyn o bryd, ac y gall fod proses gyflymach, sy'n cyfleu'r ffordd y cymeradwyir cyffuriau yn well. Mae gan glinigwyr ran allweddol i'w chwarae yma o ran sut y maent yn rhoi cyngor i'w cleifion.

Gan droi at gyfraniad enfawr y sector gwirfoddol, mater allweddol yr aethom i'r afael ag ef oedd pa mor bwysig ydyw bod ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol yn ymgysylltu â'r sector gwirfoddol yn iawn, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â gofal lliniarol. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad oes yn rhaid i sefydliadau gofal lliniarol mawr, megis Marie Curie, drafod telerau â 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol gan olygu y darperir gwasanaeth amrywiol iawn ledled Cymru. Mae hynny'n gwbl amhriodol.

Pwy bynnag sydd mewn grym ar ôl mis Mai, mae'r £2 filiwn a neilltuwyd eleni gan y

small contribution towards the cost of the core services that our hospices provide. It is not what is needed, and we have to cover the cost of those core services.

A significant point that has not yet been raised today is that there are many areas in Wales that do not have hospice services, and we have an obligation to ensure that they exist throughout Wales.

Much more support for carers is needed, as is a much more patient-centred approach to care—those are the key messages of this report.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): From the outset, the Assembly Government has welcomed this review and I acknowledge that a significant amount of work has been undertaken by everyone involved. As Rhodri Glyn said, this is not a negative or unduly critical report—it is a report to be welcomed.

Our formal response to the individual recommendations was set out in our Cabinet statement on 7 March. I hope that Karen, in view of her detailed comments on the document, will agree that we have responded, in the main, if not overwhelmingly, in a positive way to virtually all of the recommendations, not least because they are very much in line with the concerns that the Assembly Government has picked up.

Tackling cancer is a top Assembly Government priority, as outlined in our statement, 'Designed to Tackle Cancer in Wales'. Our commitment is to reduce the incidence of cancer, to provide increased early detection and to provide first-class treatment. In response to Glyn Davies's point, we are putting in place a £7.9 million bowel screening programme. Work has already begun on putting the programme in place, and we are also putting extra resources into the bowel cancer screening programme to ensure that it reaches the global rating-systems standard recommended to us by professionals in Wales. Once we complete that work—it will take a few years to do so—we will have a first-class bowel screening programme; the training and investment has

Gweinidog yn gyfraniad bach tuag at gost y gwasanaethau craidd a ddarperir gan ein hosbisau. Nid dyna sydd ei angen, a rhaid inni dalu cost y gwasanaethau craidd hynny.

Pwynt pwysig nas codwyd eto heddiw yw bod llawer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt wasanaethau hosbis, ac mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i sicrhau eu bod yn bodoli ledled Cymru.

Mae angen llawer mwy o gymorth i ofalwyr, yn yr un modd, mae angen ymagwedd at ofal sy'n canolbwyntio llawer mwy ar y claf—dyna brif negeseuon yr adroddiad hwn.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): O'r dechrau, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi croesawu'r adolygiad hwn a chydnyddaf i waith sylweddol gael ei wneud gan bawb a fu'n cymryd rhan. Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, nid yw hwn yn adroddiad negyddol nac yn adroddiad sy'n or-feirniadol—mae'n adroddiad i'w groesawu.

Nodwyd ein hymateb ffurfiol i'r argymhellion unigol yn ein datganiad gan y Cabinet ar 7 Mawrth. Gobeithiaf y bydd Karen, yng ngoleuni ei sylwadau manwl ar y ddogfen, yn cytuno ein bod wedi ymateb, yn gyffredinol, os nad y rhan fwyaf o achosion, mewn ffordd gadarnhaol i bob un o'r argymhellion bron, yn rhannol am eu bod yn unol yn llwyr â'r pryderon y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi sylwi arnynt.

Mae mynd i'r afael â chanser yn brif flaenoriaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel yr amlinellwyd yn ein datganiad, 'Cynllun i Fynd i'r Afael â Chanser yng Nghymru'. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i leihau niferoedd yr achosion o ganser, i ganfod y clefyd yn gynharach a darparu triniaeth o'r radd flaenaf. Mewn ymateb i bwynt Glyn Davies, yr ydym yn rhoi £7.9 miliwn i raglen sgrinio'r coluddyn. Mae gwaith eisoes yn mynd rhagddo ar sefydlu'r rhaglen ac yr ydym hefyd yn rhoi adnoddau ychwanegol i'r rhaglen sgrinio canser y coluddyn er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn cyrraedd y safonau graddio byd-eang a argymhellwyd inni gan weithwyr proffesiynol yng Nghymru. Unwaith y byddwn yn cwblhau'r gwaith hwnnw—bydd yn cymryd rai blynyddoedd i wneud hynny—

already started.

Another excellent example of our commitment to preventing cancer is the ban on smoking in enclosed public places that is due to be introduced in three weeks' time. People who are interested in preventing cancer will be able to celebrate that event before the end of this Assembly.

Improvements have been made, and continue to be made, in cancer services, particularly around waiting times, which is a tribute to the effort and dedication of NHS staff. Therefore, I am pleased that, overall, there are no major differences of principle or divergence of approach between what the report states and the approach that the Assembly Government wishes to pursue.

I will deal with three particular points. First, we need to strive to reach and sustain cancer-treatment waiting times that are in line with the 31-day and 62-day targets that the Assembly Government has established. This has been a major challenge for the NHS, because it has involved a degree of proactive clinical monitoring, not only within trusts and across departments within trusts, but also across trust boundaries. We have made substantial progress, and we are not far from delivering on, and sustaining, that target. It will make a massive contribution to improving cancer care in Wales.

Secondly, the pace of change must increase significantly so that we deliver the quality that we wish to see in cancer services, as outlined in the cancer standards to be delivered by March 2009. Delivering those standards on time—and we are making progress—will be a tribute to our commitment to quality.

A number of people mentioned end-of-life issues. The Assembly Government recognises the importance of those issues, and we issued a circular to the health service on this issue in June or July of last year. The importance of end-of-life issues is consistently highlighted in the chronic

bydd gennym raglen sgrinio cancer y coluddyn o'r radd flaenaf; mae'r hyfforddi a'r buddsoddi eisoes wedi dechrau.

Enghraifft wych arall o'n hymrwymiad i atal cancer yw'r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus caeëdig a fydd yn cael ei gyflwyno ymhen tair wythnos. Bydd pobl sydd â diddordeb mewn atal cancer yn gallu dathlu'r digwyddiad hwnnw cyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn.

Gwnaed gwelliannau, a chânt eu gwneud o hyd, i wasanaethau cancer, yn arbennig o ran amseroedd aros, sy'n glod i ymdrech ac ymroddiad staff y GIG. Felly, yr wyf yn falch, yn gyffredinol, nad oes gwahaniaethau mawr o ran egwyddor na dulliau gweithredu rhwng yr hyn y mae'r adroddiad yn ei ddweud a'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dymuno gweithredu.

Byddaf yn ymdrin â thri phwynt penodol. Yn gyntaf, mae angen inni ymdrechu i gyrraedd a chynnal amseroedd aros triniaeth cancer sy'n unol â thargedau 31 diwrnod a 62 diwrnod a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bu hyn yn her fawr i'r GIG gan ei bod yn cynnwys rhywfaint o fonitro clinigol rhagweithiol, nid dim ond o fewn ymddiriedolaethau ac ar draws adrannau mewn ymddiriedolaethau, ond hefyd ar draws ffiniau ymddiriedolaethau. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol, ac yr ydym o fewn dim i gyflwyno'r targed hwnnw, a'i gynnal. Bydd yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr tuag at wella gofal cancer yng Nghymru.

Yn ail, rhaid gwneud newidiadau dipyn yn gynt fel y gallwn gyflwyno'r ansawdd yr ydym yn dymuno ei weld mewn gwasanaethau cancer, fel yr amlinellwyd yn y safonau cancer sydd i'w cyflwyno erbyn mis Mawrth 2009. Bydd cyflwyno'r safonau hynny'n brydlon—ac yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd—yn glod i'n hymrwymiad i wasanaethau o safon.

Soniodd nifer o bobl am faterion ar ddiwedd bywyd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y materion hynny a chyhoeddwyd cylchlythyr i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gennym ar y mater hwn ym mis Mehefin neu fis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Amlygir pwysigrwydd materion ar ddiwedd

disease commissioning directives that we are now issuing, and they will also be part of the renal national service framework. Palliative care and end-of-life issues are not discrete services; they must be included in mainstream services.

4.50 p.m.

Every speaker has mentioned the importance of commissioning, and the point raised by Jenny, Glyn Davies, Rhodri Glyn, and others, about co-ordinating our effort is very important. That is why regional commissioning is the way forward in this particular area.

Owen John and Lorraine made points relating to brachytherapy. I do not think that it would be appropriate for clinical decisions to be made by politicians in the Chamber, and this certainly should not be judged a political issue. However, we should point out, for the sake of clarity, that the Gleeson score that we operate on is not an arbitrary political decision; it is based on the advice that we have received from the all-Wales urology group. These are evidence-based, clinical decisions taken by the leading clinicians here in Wales, and it is on that basis that commissioning decisions are made.

Turning to Sutent, because we have the all-Wales medicines strategy group, we will be able to undertake an evaluation of the drug before the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence needs to undertake that particular work. However, I would caution that we need to have realistic expectations of what this drug can offer—to classify it as a life-saving drug might unduly raise people's expectations beyond that which can reasonably be delivered.

Lorraine Barrett: I think that you will agree that I was careful to make the point that it is not for us as politicians to decide whether someone should or should not receive a particular treatment. However, we, as politicians, might agree that we cannot understand how clinicians in one part of the

bywyd yn gyson yn y cyfarwyddbau comisiynu clefyd cronig yr ydym yn eu cyhoeddi yn awr, a byddant hefyd yn dod yn rhan o'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol arenol. Nid yw gofal lliniarol na materion diwedd bywyd yn wasanaethau ar wahân; rhaid eu cynnwys ymhlith gwasanaethau prif ffrwd.

Mae pob siaradwr wedi sôn am bwysigrwydd comisiynu ac mae'r pwynt a godwyd gan Jenny, Glyn Davies, Rhodri Glyn ac eraill, ynglŷn â chydlynu ein hymdrech yn bwysig iawn. Dyna'r rheswm pam mai comisiynu rhanbarthol yw'r ffordd ymlaen yn y maes arbennig hwn.

Gwnaeth Owen John a Lorraine godi pwyntiau'n ymwneud â brachtherapi. Ni chredaf y byddai'n briodol i wleidyddion yn y Siambr wneud penderfyniadau clinigol, ac yn sicr, ni ddylai hyn gael ei ystyried yn fater gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, dylem nodi, er mwyn eglurder, nad yw sgôr Gleeson y gweithredwn arni yn benderfyniad gwleidyddol mympwyol; mae'n seiliedig ar y cyngor a gawsom gan grŵp wroleg Cymru gyfan. Maent yn benderfyniadau clinigol sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth a wneir gan glinigwyr blaengar yma yng Nghymru, a dyna'r sail y gwneir y penderfyniadau comisiynu arni.

Gan droi at Sutent, gan fod gennym y grŵp strategaeth feddyginiaethau Cymru gyfan, byddwn yn gallu ymgymryd â gwerthusiad o'r cyffur cyn y bydd angen i'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol ymgymryd â'r gwaith arbennig hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn eich rhybuddio bod angen inni fod yn realistig ynglŷn â'r hyn y gall y cyffur hwn ei gynnig—gallai ei ddosbarthu'n gyffur sy'n achub bywydau godi disgwyliaid pobl yn ormodol, y tu hwnt i'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni'n rhesymol.

Lorraine Barrett: Fe gytunwch, fe gredaf, fy mod wedi bod yn ofalus i wneud y pwynt nad ein dyletswydd ni fel gwleidyddion yw penderfynu pa un a ddylai rywun gael triniaeth arbennig ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, gallem ni, fel gwleidyddion, gytuno na allwn ddeall sut y mae clinigwyr yn un rhan o'r DU

UK can set certain criteria, while clinicians in another part of the UK set different ones. That is why I welcomed recommendation 6, where the different regions can get together and hopefully agree on a protocol on criteria for a certain drug. I hope that I made that clear. I certainly do not want to use Mr Galvin as a political football, but he specifically wanted his case raised.

Brian Gibbons: In many of these areas, particularly around the edges of the benefits and costs of treatment, there will always be differences, and it would be incorrect to say that there is a clear dogmatic line on such matters. In all of these things, particularly when dealing with invasive treatments, you must always weigh up the benefits, and it is a grey area where one issue merges into another. Clearly, we have taken the view of clinicians here in Wales, and that is a clinically based decision.

The last point that I would like to deal with, in view of the time, is palliative care, which a number of speakers raised. I do not doubt Mark Isherwood's personal commitment to this subject; he has been entirely consistent in pursuing this as a personal issue, and we must be grateful to him for that. However, I do not think that it is in order for Mark to attack Welsh Labour's integrity, as he did on this particular issue, not least because his party failed to vote for the £2 million towards core provision of palliative care in Welsh voluntary hospices. Nor did his party include palliative care services or core provision in its list of demands to Sue Essex. Therefore, while I do not doubt your personal integrity on this, Mark, I do not think that you are in a position, as a Conservative Member, to question our commitment. It was the Labour Party that made this pledge, and delivered on it, while you voted against it.

Mark Isherwood: You know very well that we opposed the budget for different reasons, which have previously been debated. I visited a number of hospices in the week before Christmas, and they told me that they thought that you were taking a very cynical route, and that they were disgusted. One hospice asked

yn gallu gosod meini prawf, tra bo clinigwyr mewn rhan arall o'r DU yn gosod rhai gwahanol. Dyna'r rheswm y croesawaf argymhellad 6, lle y gall y rhanbarthau gwahanol ddod ynghyd a, gobeithio, chytuno ar brotocol ar gyfer meini prawf ar gyfer cyffur penodol. Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi gwneud hynny'n glir. Yn sicr, nid wyf am ddefnyddio Mr Galvin fel rhan o gêm wleidyddol, ond yr oedd am i'w achos gael ei godi'n benodol.

Brian Gibbons: Mewn sawl un o'r meysydd hyn, yn arbennig o ran cost a budd triniaeth, bydd gwahaniaeth barn bob amser, a byddai'n anghywir dweud bod llinell bendant ar faterion o'r fath. Yn yr holl feysydd hyn, yn arbennig wrth ymdrin â llawdriniaethau, rhaid ichi bwyso a mesur y buddiannau, ac nid yw'n eglur lle mae un maes yn ymdoddi â maes arall. Yn amlwg, yr ydym wedi derbyn barn clinigwyr yma yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n benderfyniad sy'n seiliedig ar faterion clinigol.

Y pwynt olaf yr hoffwn ei wneud, o gofio'r amser, yw gofal lliniarol, a godwyd gan nifer o siaradwyr. Nid wyf yn amau ymrwymiad personol Mark Isherwood i'r pwnc hwn; bu'n gwbl gyson wrth godi hwn fel mater personol, a rhaid inni fod yn ddiolchgar iddo am hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf ei fod yn dderbyniol fod Mark yn ymosod ar gywirdeb Llafur Cymru, fel y gwnaeth ar y mater penodol hwn, yn rhannol am fod ei blaid wedi methu â phleidleisio dros y £2 filiwn tuag at y ddarpariaeth graidd o ofal lliniarol mewn hosbisau gwirfoddol yng Nghymru. Ni wnaeth ei blaid gynnwys gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol na'r ddarpariaeth graidd yn ei rhestr o ofynion i Sue Essex ychwaith. Felly, er nad wyf yn amau eich cywirdeb personol ar y mater hwn, Mark, ni chredaf eich bod mewn sefyllfa, fel Aelod Ceidwadol, i amau ein hymrwymiad. Y Blaid Lafur a wnaeth yr addewid hwn, a'i gyflwyno, tra eich bod chi wedi pleidleisio yn ei erbyn.

Mark Isherwood: Gwyddoch yn iawn ein bod wedi gwrthwynebu'r gyllideb am resymau gwahanol, a drafodwyd o'r blaen. Ymwelais â nifer o hosbisau yn ystod yr wythnos cyn y Nadolig, a dywedasant wrthyf eu bod yn credu eich bod yn ymddwyn yn sinigaidd iawn, a'u bod wedi ffeiddio.

me whether this was what politics in Wales was really like—sneaking £2 million in at the last minute as a knee-jerk response to an event that happened two weeks previously, showing that you had completely failed to listen to what they were saying to you when they were here. They saw through it, Minister. We now need you to show them that you really care.

Brian Gibbons: I will not even bother to respond to that.

In conclusion, this is an excellent report. It gives us a real basis for working together on a consensus. I thank the committee and all of the experts who worked so hard to produce such a good and authoritative report.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank everyone for their positive response to the report. I especially thank the Minister for his positive response and that of his Government, which has already begun to respond to the report. As the Minister said, it is a balanced report that has received all-party support. It is slightly unfortunate that the tail end of our debate degenerated into a level of political point scoring. We must all work together on this issue if we are to ensure that the same level of provision is there for all the people of Wales.

I welcome each contribution, which were all positive and added to the debate and to the report. Glyn's point about screening is all-important. I welcome the Government's initiative and its funding support for screening. However, if you fund screening, you are creating a situation where you need greater provision in terms of treatment, greater information to people about the screening process, and that calls for further investment. Glyn is an inspiration to many people in the way that he has coped with his illness and shown that you can live a full life having suffered cancer. That is an important point: cancer no longer has the fear factor that it once had. People presume that, as soon as you have cancer, that is the end of your life, but Glyn and others have shown that you can continue with a high quality of life having suffered cancer. However, Glyn

Gofynnodd un hosbis imi ai dyma sut oedd gwleidyddiaeth yng Nghymru mewn gwirionedd—sleifio £2 filiwn ar y funud olaf fel ymateb difeddwl i rywbeth a ddigwyddodd bythefnos ynghynt, gan ddangos ichi fethu â gwrando o gwbl ar yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei ddweud wrthyhych pan oeddent yma. Gwelsant drwy'r cyfan, Weinidog. Yn awr mae angen ichi ddangos iddynt bod hyn yn wirioneddol bwysig ichi.

Brian Gibbons: Ni fyddaf hyd yn oed yn trafferthu ymateb i hynny.

I gloi, mae hwn yn adroddiad gwych. Mae'n rhoi sail wirioneddol inni gydweithio ar gonsensws. Diolchaf i'r pwyllgor a'r holl arbenigwyr a fu'n gweithio mor galed i gynhyrchu adroddiad mor dda ac awdurdodol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolchaf i bawb am eu hymateb cadarnhaol i'r adroddiad. Diolchaf yn arbennig i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb cadarnhaol ac ymateb ei Lywodraeth, sydd eisoes wedi dechrau ymateb i'r adroddiad. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'n adroddiad cytbwys sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth yr holl bleidiau. Mae ychydig yn anffodus ar ddiwedd ein dadl inni weld gwleidyddu plaid. Rhaid i bob un ohonom gydweithio ar y mater hwn os ydym am sicrhau'r un ddarpariaeth i holl bobl Cymru.

Croesawaf bob cyfraniad, yr oedd pob un ohonynt yn gadarnhaol ac yn ychwanegu at y ddadl ac at yr adroddiad. Mae pwynt Glyn ynglŷn â sgrinio yn hollbwysig. Croesawaf fenter y Llywodraeth a'i chymorth ariannol ar gyfer sgrinio. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn ariannu sgrinio, yr ydych yn creu sefyllfa lle y bydd angen darpariaeth fwy o ran triniaeth, rhagor o wybodaeth i bobl am y broses sgrinio, ac mae hynny'n gofyn am fuddsoddiad pellach. Mae Glyn yn ysbrydoliaeth i lawer o bobl yn y ffordd y mae wedi ymdopi â'i salwch ac wedi dangos y gallwch fyw bywyd llawn ar ôl cael canser. Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig: nid yw pobl yn ofni canser fel yr oeddent o'r blaen. Mae pobl yn tybio, unwaith bod canser arnoch, mai dyna ddiwedd eich bywyd, ond mae Glyn ac eraill wedi dangos y gallwch fyw bywyd da o hyd ar ôl cael ganser. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai

should not presume that he is to be the captain of the Assembly rugby team on Saturday morning. We will discuss that matter again, but he will need the support of his colleagues to ensure the captaincy of that particular team.

Lorraine Barrett raised an important point about inconsistency and what is perceived to be unfair in the way in which patients are treated in England, compared with Wales. I take the Minister's point: it has to be a clinical decision, but people have to understand that it is so. There is a perception that it is a funding issue, which has to be addressed. Lorraine and Owen John raised Mr Galvin's case. I can only say to Mr Galvin that, if he has Lorraine and Owen John working together on his case, he has every hope of success.

Eleanor Burnham raised the issue of the need for stabilising the funding of hospices. They want to raise money—they know how important the charitable part of their work is, and they would not want to lose that—but they also want stability in order to offer an important service to the people of Wales. Mark Isherwood reiterated that point. I give credit to Mark and others, such as Lorraine and Owen John, who have lobbied on issues in this report. We need to commend the work that they have done in raising awareness of these issues.

Karen Sinclair referred to the fact that people are living longer with cancer and that we need to ensure that they have the support that they need. I agree that we need to get clarity into the issue of service agreements and we must ensure consistency. I agree that recommendation 3, about key workers, is important. Helen Mary Jones referred to new drugs, medicines and treatments and again emphasised the need to ensure that people understand how the system works. We have difficulty, as politicians—even Members who have sat on the Health and Social Services Committee—to understand how the system works. Clinicians came in to give evidence to say that they, at times, do not understand how the system works. What hope do patients and the public have, if that is the case? That has to be addressed.

Glyn dybio y bydd yn gapten tîm rygbi'r Cynulliad ar fore Sadwrn. Byddwn yn trafod y mater hwnnw rywbyrd eto, ond bydd angen cefnogaeth ei gyd-Aelodau er mwyn sicrhau capteiniaeth y tîm arbennig hwnnw.

Cododd Lorraine Barrett bwynt pwysig ynglŷn ag anghysondeb a'r hyn sy'n annheg, yn nhyb rhai, yn y ffordd y caiff cleifion eu trin yn Lloegr, o'i chymharu â Chymru. Derbyniaf bwynt y Gweinidog: rhaid iddo fod yn benderfyniad clinigol, ond rhaid i bobl ddeall mai felly y mae. Mae rhai'n teimlo mai mater ariannu ydyw, y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef. Cododd Lorraine ac Owen John achos Mr Galvin. Y cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud wrth Mr Galvin yw, os yw Lorraine ac Owen John yn cydweithio ar ei achos, fod ganddo bob gobaith o lwyddo.

Cododd Eleanor Burnham yr angen i sefydlogi arian i hosbisau. Maent am godi arian—gwyddant pa mor bwysig yw rhan elusennol eu gwaith, ac ni fyddant am golli hynny—ond maent hefyd am gael sefydlogrwydd er mwyn cynnig gwasanaeth pwysig i bobl Cymru. Ailadroddodd Mark Isherwood y pwynt hwnnw. Canmolaf Mark ac eraill, megis Lorraine ac Owen John, sydd wedi llobio ar faterion yn yr adroddiad hwn. Mae angen inni ganmol y gwaith y maent wedi'i wneud i godi ymwybyddiaeth o'r materion hyn.

Cyfeiriodd Karen Sinclair at y ffaith fod pobl yn byw gyda chanser am gyfnod hwy a bod angen inni sicrhau y cânt y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt. Cytunaf fod angen eglurder arnom ar y mater o gytundebau gwasanaeth a bod rhaid inni sicrhau cysondeb. Cytunaf fod argymhelliad 3, ynglŷn â gweithwyr allweddol, yn bwysig. Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary Jones at gyffuriau, meddyginiaethau a thriniaethau newydd a phwysleisiodd eto'r angen i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall sut y mae'r system yn gweithio. Mae gennym anhawster, fel gwleidyddion—hyd yn oed Aelodau sydd wedi bod ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—i ddeall sut y mae'r system yn gweithio. Daeth clinigwyr i roi tystiolaeth i ddweud nad ydynt, ar brydiau, yn gallu deall sut y mae'r system yn gweithio. Pa obaith sydd i gleifion a'r cyhoedd, os mai felly y mae? Rhaid mynd i'r

afael â hynny.

5.00 p.m.

The quality and standard of life for those who have family members suffering from cancer is important. I am glad to hear of the positive experience that Helen and her family had during her mother's illness, which should be available to everyone, everywhere in Wales.

To respond to Jonathan Morgan's points, when talking about cancer, it is often easy to emphasise some of the minor issues, which are of course important to the individual; however, we cannot forget the basic service, and radiotherapy and chemotherapy are core to that service. There has to be a substantial investment to ensure that they are available to everyone. Jonathan and others referred to the cancer networks. They are important, and they need to function more efficiently than they do. They need an element of clarity to them so that people can understand how they work.

Jenny Randerson also made the point about understanding how the system works. That is true of brachytherapy and it was also the problem with the whole debate surrounding Herceptin. There is also an issue with informing people of the nature of these drugs, medicines and treatments. They are not the answer to everyone's problem with cancer, and there is often a danger that that impression is given.

I thank everyone, including the Minister and the Government, for their positive responses. I hope that the third Assembly can move forward on this issue, and offer the people of Wales the provision that they need and deserve.

Mae ansawdd a safon bywyd i'r rhai y mae gan aelodau o'u teulu ganser yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed am y profiad cadarnhaol a gafodd Helen a'i theulu yn ystod salwch ei mam, a ddylai fod ar gael i bawb, ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

I ymateb i bwyntiau Jonathan Morgan, wrth sôn am ganser, mae'n aml yn hawdd pwysleisio rhai o'r mân faterion, sydd wrth gwrs yn bwysig i'r unigolyn; fodd bynnag, ni allwn anghofio'r gwasanaeth sylfaenol, ac mae radiotherapi a chemotherapi yn graidd i'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Rhaid cael buddsoddiad sylweddol i sicrhau eu bod ar gael i bawb. Cyfeiriodd Jonathan ac eraill at y rhwydweithiau canser. Maent yn bwysig, ac mae angen iddynt weithredu'n fwy effeithlon nag y gwnânt. Mae angen iddynt fod yn eglur er mwyn i bobl allu deall sut maent yn gweithio.

Soniodd Jenny Randerson hefyd am ddeall sut mae'r system yn gweithio. Mae hynny'n wir am brachytherapi a dyna oedd y broblem hefyd gyda'r ddadl ynghylch Herceptin. Ceir problem hefyd o ran hysbysu pobl o natur y cyffuriau, y meddyginiaethau a'r triniaethau hyn. Nid ydynt yn ateb problem pawb gyda chanser, ac yn aml ceir perygl y creir yr argraff honno.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb, yn cynnwys y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth, am eu hymatebion cadarnhaol. Gobeithiaf y gall y trydydd Cynulliad weithredu ar y mater hwn, a chynnig y ddarpariaeth sydd ei hangen ar bobl Cymru ac y maent yn ei haeddu.

*Cynnig (NDM3546): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3546): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Dore: Gwellhad i Ddyslecsia? Dore: A Cure for Dyslexia?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call Alun Cairns to present his topic for the short debate, I ask Members who are leaving the Chamber to do so quietly.

Alun Cairns: Thank you for calling me to present one of the last short debates of the Assembly, before the election. Glyn Davies, Mark Isherwood, Janet Ryder and Jeff Cuthbert have asked for a minute each in which to speak on this debate. I hope to give them that opportunity, but, if I go on and use more time than I had originally planned, I

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Alun Cairns i gyflwyno ei bwnc ar gyfer y ddadl fer, gofynnaf i Aelodau sy'n gadael y Siambr heddiw i wneud hynny'n dawel.

Alun Cairns: Diolch am alw arnaf i gyflwyno un o ddadleuon byr olaf y Cynulliad, cyn yr etholiad. Mae Glyn Davies, Mark Isherwood, Janet Ryder a Jeff Cuthbert wedi gofyn am funud yr un i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Gobeithiaf roi'r cyfle hwnnw iddynt, ond, os defnyddiaf fwy o amser nag yr oeddwn wedi'i fwriadu'n wreiddiol,

hope that the Minister will look favourably on any interventions requested by those people. However, that, of course, is a matter for her.

I am delighted to have won the ballot for the short debate, as research into the benefits or otherwise of the Dore programme should not stop because of the election. I come to this issue from a background of having a particular interest in special educational needs, and wanting the best for children, particularly.

The Dore programme came to my attention through a mutual friend of mine and Scott Quinnell's. Early in January, I was introduced to the Welsh rugby legend for the first time. A mutual friend had brought us together as a result of Scott's hope to make the Dore programme available to all dyslexic pupils in Wales, should they or their parents wish to receive that treatment and support. He wanted to establish how best to further the case. In tandem with that, the BBC had been following Scott Quinnell for almost 12 months to track his progress in the Dore programme. Scott's interest came from his own experience. Being dyslexic, he was told at school that he was thick and lazy. Sadly, his dyslexia was not identified and diagnosed until he was 21 years old. However, he also says that he was fortunate, because he had rugby to save him from being cast aside—I think that he used the phrase 'scrap heap'. He told me that he followed the Dore programme, which truly changed his life.

As a result, we discussed how best to pursue it. I felt that a presentation in the Assembly from someone like Scott Quinnell would have an impact, and would draw Assembly Members' attention to the matter. I was delighted that it did. Unfortunately, the Minister could not be present, but I am grateful that she sent one of her officials along in her place. Before organising the presentation, I also conducted some research of my own. I spoke to journalists and educationalists, and all, in general, were very positive about the experience of the Dore programme.

gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn caniatáu unrhyw ymyriadau y gofynnir amdanynt gan y bobl hynny. Fodd bynnag, mater iddi hi yw hynny, wrth gwrs.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd o fod wedi ennill y bleidlais ar gyfer y ddadl fer, gan na ddylai gwaith ymchwil ar fanteision neu anfanteision rhaglen Dore ddod i ben oherwydd yr etholiad. Ymdriniaf â'r mater hwn o safbwynt rhywun â diddordeb penodol mewn anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac oherwydd fy mod am sicrhau'r gorau i blant, yn arbennig.

Daeth rhaglen Dore i'm sylw drwy un o'm ffrindiau sydd hefyd yn ffrind i Scott Quinnell. Ddechrau mis Ionawr, fe'm cyflwynwyd i'r arwr rygbi am y tro cyntaf. Yr oedd ffrind i'r ddau ohonom wedi trefnu inni gwrdd o ganlyniad i obaith Scott o sicrhau bod rhaglen Dore ar gael i bob disgybl dyslecsig yng Nghymru, pe bai ef neu ei rieni'n awyddus i gael triniaeth a chymorth. Yr oedd am ganfod y ffordd orau o weithredu ymhellach. Ar y cyd â hynny, bu'r BBC yn dilyn Scott Quinnell am bron i 12 mis i olrhain ei gynnydd wrth ddilyn rhaglen Dore. Tarddodd diddordeb Scott o'i brofiad ei hun. Ac yntau'n ddyslecsig, dywedwyd wrtho yn yr ysgol ei fod yn dwp ac yn ddiog. Yn anffodus, ni chanfuwyd ei fod yn ddyslecsig tan ei fod yn 21 oed. Fodd bynnag, dywed hefyd iddo fod yn ffodus, oherwydd bod ganddo rygbi i'w achub rhag cael ei daflu o'r neilltu—credaf iddo ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd 'scrap heap'. Dywedodd wrthyf ei fod yn dilyn rhaglen Dore, a newidiodd ei fywyd yn wirioneddol.

O ganlyniad, gwnaethom drafod y ffordd orau o weithredu arni. Credwn y byddai cyflwyniad yn y Cynulliad gan rywun fel Scott Quinnell yn cael effaith, ac y byddai'n tynnu sylw Aelodau'r Cynulliad at y mater. Yr oeddwn wrth fy mod mai dyna a ddigwyddodd. Yn anffodus, ni allai'r Gweinidog fod yn bresennol, ond yr wyf yn falch iddi anfon un o'i swyddogion yn ei lle. Cyn trefnu'r cyflwyniad, cyflawnais rywfaint o waith ymchwil fy hun. Siaradais â newyddiadurwyr ac addysgwyr, ac yr oedd pawb, ar y cyfan, yn gadarnhaol iawn ynghylch y profiad o raglen Dore.

Hearing of Scott's experience was one of the most moving occasions I have ever had in the Assembly. He talked about his treatment at school and of his family. Both of his children suffer from dyslexia, and he spoke of how he saw his children fall behind exactly as he did, and of how a lack of balance has had a huge impact on his son. I am advised that dyslexia and balance are linked. One of the most moving parts of his speech was when he said that, as a family, they used to go on activity holidays to Center Parcs, but that they had to walk everywhere because his son could not ride a bicycle. He said that he had played rugby for Wales 53 times, but the proudest moment of his life was when his son, at eight years of age, learned to ride a bicycle after following the Dore programme. Scott commented on how other forms of treatment and support for dyslexia, which had not been made available to him but had been made available to his son, had not had the sort of impact that they were hoping for. The Dore programme was suggested to him by a rugby colleague who had had similar experiences.

The Dore programme was pioneered by a Welshman, Wynford Dore, following some horrific experience with his daughter. The Dore methodology concentrates on the cerebellum, which is a relatively small part of the brain that affects matters ranging from emotion to memory. The method consists of routine five to 10-minute exercises that are done twice a day, which work to create new neural pathways in the cerebellum. This speeds up the processing of information and assists in learning, language, emotion and motor skills.

In view of Scott's experience following the 12-month programme, which was summarised on television, and in view of the talk that he gave to us and of the research that I had done from educationalists and from journalists, I am surprised and quite shocked by some of the responses that I have come across since that presentation in the Assembly, and since commenting on it on my weblog. Some people have been positively aggressive in their criticism of the Dore programme. In view of the positive responses and reports that I have heard from whom I

Yr oedd clywed am brofiad Scott yn un o'r achlysuron mwyaf emosiynol imi erioed ei brofi yn y Cynulliad. Siaradodd am ei driniaeth yn yr ysgol ac am ei deulu. Mae gandau o'i blant ddyslecsia, a soniodd am sut y gwelodd ei blant yn cael eu gadael ar ôl yn union fel ef, a sut mae diffyg cydbwysedd wedi effeithio'n enfawr ar ei fab. Fe'm hysbysir bod cysylltiad rhwng dyslecsia a chydbwysedd. Un o'r rhannau mwyaf emosiynol o'i araith oedd pan ddywedodd eu bod yn arfer mynd ar wyliau gweithgaredd i Center Parcs fel teulu, ond bod yn rhaid iddynt gerdded i bob man am na allai ei fab reidio beic. Dywedodd iddo chwarae rygbi dros Gymru 53 o weithiau, ond mai'r digwyddiad yr oedd yn ymfalchïo fwyaf ynddo oedd pan ddysgodd ei fab, yn wyth mlwydd oed, i reidio beic ar ôl dilyn rhaglen Dore. Dywedodd Scott nad oedd mathau eraill o driniaeth a chymorth ar gyfer dyslecsia, na chafodd ef y cyfle i fanteisio arnynt ond a ddarparwyd i'w fab, wedi cael y math o effaith yr oeddent yn ei obeithio. Awgrymodd cyfaill iddo ym myd rygbi a gafodd brofiadau tebyg y dylai ystyried rhaglen Dore.

Cafodd rhaglen Dore ei harloesi gan Gymro, Wynford Dore, yn dilyn profiad erchyll gyda'i ferch. Mae dull Dore yn canolbwyntio ar y serebelwm, sy'n rhan gymharol fach o'r ymennydd sy'n effeithio ar emosiynau a'r cof ymhlith pethau eraill. Mae'r dull yn cynnwys ymarferion rheolaidd pump i ddeng munud o hyd a wneir ddwywaith y dydd, sy'n gweithio i greu llwybrau nerfol newydd yn y serebelwm. Mae hyn yn cyflymu'r broses o brosesu gwybodaeth ac o gymorth gyda sgiliau dysgu, iaith, emosiwn a moduro.

Gan ystyried profiad Scott o ddilyn y rhaglen 12 mis, a gynhowyd ar y teledu, a chan ystyried y cyflwyniad a wnaeth inni a'r gwaith ymchwil a wneuthum i gydag addysgwyr a newyddiadurwyr, yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at rai o'r ymatebion y deuthum ar eu traws ers y cyflwyniad hwnnw yn y Cynulliad, ac ers gwneud sylwadau arno ar fy we-log ac maent yn peri cryn syndod i mi. Mae rhai pobl wedi bod yn gwbl ymosodol yn eu beirniadaeth o raglen Dore. O gofio'r ymatebion a'r adroddiadau cadarnhaol yr wyf wedi'u clywed gan bobl y tybiaf eu bod yn

assume to be independent individuals, I am quite shocked by the attitude of some people. One individual has even reported me to the Assembly's Committee on Standards of Conduct for proposing and promoting this sort of programme. I am sure that members of that committee will deal with the matter accordingly, but it is the principle of it and the aggression with which some of the criticisms have been made that are so shocking. They want to know what interest I have in the programme, what financial resources I have put into it, and what the financial outcome is for Scott Quinnell, or for any other proponent.

The point of my raising this debate today is to ask the Minister to consider at least, in the first instance, some sort of independent research. On the face of it, it appears as though there are exceptionally positive outcomes to be had, which are not medically based—that is, they do not involve taking a drug or a tablet. From the evidence that has been presented so far, it appears as though this can really change people's lives in so many ways. I was pleased to establish from some of the research that I conducted that Anglesey and Gwynedd local education authorities have also conducted some research into the programme. It is fair to assume that the educational psychologists from Anglesey and Gwynedd LEAs would not necessarily have an interest in the programme. In their summary, the representatives said that,

'The pupils who followed the...programme for more than one year showed significant improvement in English reading which was higher than would be expected in a non dyslexic...group of the same age despite no change in the received teaching'.

5.10 p.m.

The educational psychologist said that,

'The conclusion must be that reading and reading related skills improve when a pupil follows the...programme, even though the programme does not address reading or language skills in any way'.

unigolion annibynnol, yr wyf yn synnu i raddau at agwedd rhai pobl. Mae un unigolyn hyd yn oed wedi hysbysu Pwyllgor y Cynulliad ar Safonau ac Ymddygiad o'r ffaith fy mod wedi cynnig y math hwn o raglen ac wedi ei hyrwyddo. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw yn ymdrin â'r mater yn unol â hynny, ond egwyddor y peth a natur ymosodol rhai o'r beirniadaethau sy'n fy synnu fwyaf. Maent am wybod pa fuddiant sydd gennyf yn y rhaglen, pa adnoddau ariannol yr wyf wedi'u rhoi iddi, a beth yw'r canlyniad ariannol i Scott Quinnell, neu i unrhyw gynigydd arall.

Fy mwriad wrth godi'r ddatl hon heddiw yw gofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried, yn y lle cyntaf, ryw fath o waith ymchwil annibynnol, o leiaf. Ar yr wyneb, ymddengys fel pe bai canlyniadau cadarnhaol iawn i'w cael yn sgîl y rhaglen hon, nad oes iddynt sail feddygol—hynny yw, nid ydynt yn cynnwys cymryd cyffuriau neu dabledi. O'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd hyd yma, mae'n debyg y gall hyn newid bywydau pobl yn wirioneddol mewn cymaint o ffyrdd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o ganfod o rywfaint o waith ymchwil a gyflawnais fod awdurdodau addysg lleol Ynys Môn a Gwynedd hefyd wedi cyflawni gwaith ymchwil ar y rhaglen. Mae'n deg tybio na fyddai gan seicolegwyr addysgol o Awdurdodau Addysg Lleol Ynys Môn a Gwynedd ddiddordeb o reidrwydd yn y rhaglen. Yn eu crynodeb, dywedodd y cynrychiolwyr,

Dangosodd y disgyblion a ddilynodd y rhaglen... am fwy na blwyddyn welliant sylweddol o ran eu gallu i ddarllen Saesneg a oedd yn uwch na'r disgwyl mewn grŵp.... o'r un oedran nad yw'n ddyslecsig er gwaethaf y ffaith nad oedd unrhyw newid yn y math o addysgu a gawsant.

Dywedodd y seicolegydd addysgol,

Rhaid dod i'r casgliad bod darllen a sgiliau sy'n gysylltiedig â darllen yn gwella pan fydd disgybl yn dilyn y rhaglen..., er nad yw'r rhaglen yn mynd i'r afael â sgiliau darllen neu iaith mewn unrhyw ffordd.

Wynford Dore and Scott Quinnell use the analogy of a bucket, saying that the programme will help to block any holes in the bucket, but that it is then up to the child to fill it by learning to read with the new skills that he or she has developed.

I have no interest in this, other than wanting the best for people. So many confused and angry parents have been in touch with me as a result of the conflicting reports on my blog and on others. Research has been conducted in the United States into the positive effect that this has had on criminals in prison. Wynford Dore has written a book calling this a miracle cure. I am not an academic or a clinician, and I do not necessarily understand all of the questions that have been asked, but surely we can use this opportunity. There is a possibility here of a Welsh solution that can transform so many people's lives. It has done as much for Scott Quinnell; he says that it has done the same for his children, who are coming to the end of the programme. On the face of it, therefore, it could transform the lives of so many others.

I urge the Minister to establish a research group of sorts to evaluate the outcomes, but to look very closely at the membership of that group to ensure that it does not have any vested interest in a particular outcome. Some dyslexia organisations have an interest in the current arrangements; some do not. It is important that we have a completely objective analysis to develop policy on an all-party basis.

Glyn Davies: I wish to make a short contribution to this debate simply to support the line that Alun Cairns is taking. I do not know the clinical background to the Dore programme, so I cannot make any judgment on that. However, I wish to speak because I too have been very surprised by the negativity of some of the responses to the presentation that was given in the Assembly. There is not the slightest shadow of a doubt that Scott Quinnell and his family, for whatever reasons, have had their lives hugely enhanced by the Dore programme. That is sufficient evidence for us to want to examine very closely what is behind it, to see whether

Mae Wynford Dore a Scott Quinnell yn cymharu hyn â'r syniad o fwced, gan ddweud y bydd y rhaglen yn helpu i flocio unrhyw dyllau yn y fwced, ond mai cyfrifoldeb y plentyn yw ei llenwi drwy ddysgu i ddarllen gyda'r sgiliau newydd y mae ef neu hi wedi eu datblygu.

Nid oes gennyf unrhyw ddiddordeb yn hyn, heblaw am fod eisiau'r gorau i bobl. Mae cymaint o rieni dryslyd a blin wedi cysylltu â mi o ganlyniad i adroddiadau croes ar fy mlog ac ar flogiau pobl eraill. Cyflawnwyd gwaith ymchwil yn Unol Daleithiau America ar yr effaith gadarnhaol y mae hyn wedi'i chael ar droseddwr yn y carchar. Mae Wynford Dore wedi ysgrifennu llyfr yn galw hyn yn driniaeth wyrthiol. Nid academydd na chlinigwr mohonof, ac nid wyf o reidrwydd yn deall yr holl gwestiynau a ofynnwyd, ond oni allwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn. Mae posibilrwydd yma o ddatrysiad yng Nghymru a all drawsnewid bywydau cymaint o bobl. Mae wedi gwneud hynny i Scott Quinnell; dywed ei fod wedi gwneud yr un fath i'w blant, sy'n cyrraedd diwedd y rhaglen. Ar yr wyneb, felly, gallai drawsnewid bywydau cymaint o bobl eraill.

Anogaf y Gweinidog i sefydlu grŵp ymchwil o ryw fath i werthuso'r canlyniadau, ond i edrych yn agos iawn ar aelodau'r grŵp hwnnw i sicrhau nad oes ganddo fuddiant personol mewn canlyniad penodol. Mae gan rai sefydliadau dyslecsia fuddiant yn y trefniadau presennol; nid oes gan eraill. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynnal dadansoddiad cwbl wrthrychol i ddatblygu polisi ar sail hollbleidiol.

Glyn Davies: Hoffwn wneud cyfraniad byr i'r ddadl hon, yn syml, i gefnogi safbwynt Alun Cairns. Ni wn gefndir clinigol rhaglen Dore, felly ni allaf roi barn ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am siarad gan fy mod innau hefyd wedi fy synnu gan natur negyddol rhai o'r ymatebion i'r cyflwyniad a roddwyd yn y Cynulliad. Yn ddi-au, mae rhaglen Dore wedi gwella bywyd Scott Quinnell a'i deulu yn aruthrol, am ba resymau bynnag. Mae hynny'n ddigon o dystiolaeth inni fod yn awyddus i archwilio'n agos iawn beth sy'n sail i hyn, i weld a all y rhaglen hon wneud yr un peth i lawer o bobl eraill sy'n dioddef yn wael.

this programme can do the same for many other people who suffer badly.

Mark Isherwood: As a parent, I want to know that there are solutions out there. I know how difficult it is to take a child through the statementing process—as a parent, an uncle, a friend, a neighbour—which is used as a rationing process and as a certificate of entitlement, rather than as a way of dealing with the needs of young children. I also know that, where things happen as they should, a young child can receive a great deal of support and make tremendous progress. I speak from personal experience, but I do not want to name the children in this context, as they have a right to privacy. I do, however, wish to celebrate their achievements as bright young people. If this offers any solution, I urge the Assembly Government to ignore the subjective carping that has gone on and to give the programme all the support that it can, so that it is not the preserve of the wealthy few, but an opportunity for the many.

Janet Ryder: Likewise, I wish to ask the Minister to consider evaluating the programme through an independent study. However, what is more important is that this is raising people's awareness of dyslexia and dyspraxia. I am totally dismayed that it is still the response of some in the teaching profession that dyslexia is an excuse given by middle-class parents for their children who cannot spell. However, we know that it is a diagnosable and treatable condition. We can help children to learn through it, and we can totally change their lives. We should be taking that very seriously, and challenging those misheld beliefs.

Jeff Cuthbert: I speak from personal experience, as I am dyslexic. My condition was diagnosed when I was about 10 years old, not by a clinician or an educationalist, but by a member of my family, who happened to have particular experience in that regard. However, I can recall—and my mother often reminds me—that, when I was in junior school, the headteacher's view was that I was just slow and thick, and that I was in a remedial class, and that was that.

It took a long time—I have not experienced

Mark Isherwood: Fel rhiant, yr wyf am wybod bod datrysiadau ar gael. Gwn pa mor anodd ydyw tywys plentyn drwy broses y datganiad—fel rhiant, ewythr, cyfaill, a chymydog—a ddefnyddir fel proses ddogni ac fel tystysgrif o hawliad, yn hytrach na fel ffordd o ymdrin ag anghenion plant ifanc. Gwn hefyd, lle mae pethau'n digwydd fel y dylent, y gall plentyn ifanc gael llawer o gefnogaeth a gwneud cynnydd aruthrol. Siaradaf o brofiad personol, ond nid wyf am enwi'r plant yn y cyd-destun hwn, gan fod ganddynt yr hawl i breifatrwydd. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf ddathlu eu cyflawniadau fel pobl ifanc ddisglair. Os yw hyn yn cynnig unrhyw ddatrysiad, anogaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i anwybyddu'r ceecu goddrychol sydd wedi mynd rhagddo ac i gefnogi'r rhaglen hyd eithaf ei gallu, er mwyn sicrhau nad dim ond pobl gefnog a all fanteisio arni ond bod cyfle i bawb.

Janet Ryder: Yn yr un modd, hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried gwerthuso'r rhaglen drwy astudiaeth annibynnol. Fodd bynnag, yn bwysicach, mae hyn yn codi ymwybyddiaeth pobl o ddyslecsia a dyspraxia. Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn bod rhai pobl yn y proffesiwn addysgu yn dal i fod o'r farn bod dyslecsia yn esgus a ddefnyddir gan rieni dosbarth canol pan na all eu plant sillafu. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom ei fod yn gyflwr y gellir ei ganfod a'i drin. Gallwn helpu plant i ddysgu drwyddo, a gallwn newid eu bywydau'n llwyr. Dylem fod yn ystyried hynny'n ddifrifol iawn, ac yn herio'r credoau anghywir hynny.

Jeff Cuthbert: Siaradaf o brofiad personol, gan fy mod i'n ddyslecsig. Cefais wybod fy mod yn ddyslecsig pan oeddwn tua 10 mlwydd oed, nid gan glinigwr nac addysgwr, ond gan aelod o'm teulu, a oedd yn digwydd meddu ar brofiad penodol yn y maes hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, gallaf gofio—ac mae mam yn aml yn fy atgoffa—pan oeddwn yn yr ysgol iau, bod y pennaeth o'r farn fy mod yn araf ac yn dwp, ac fy mod mewn dosbarth adfer, a dyna fel yr oedd hi.

Cymerodd amser hir—nid wyf wedi cael

the Dore programme—for me, as a teenager, and then as a young man, to overcome the dyslexia to a degree of reasonable competence. However, even now, at my age—and I am in my late 50s—there are still occasions when I am unable to see and recognise a word that I want to write. The mathematics side had never been a problem for me, but written English was, and still is to a degree.

We know that many people suffer in work from a lack of basic skills, and, undoubtedly, in part, that will be due to dyslexia in the cases of some of those people. Likewise, there are many young people in prison, or in detention centres, and learning disabilities are part of their problem. If plans are not put in place to assist them, then the dangers of re-offending and returning to prison or detention centres, is all too great. I cannot say whether Dore is a solution, but it seems that it could be part of a solution and should be considered.

The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson): I am grateful to Alun Cairns for choosing this issue for this afternoon's short debate. The Assembly Government very much recognises dyslexia as a debilitating condition that affects many people in Wales. In the UK as a whole, over 1.2 million children have dyslexia or closely related disabilities. Although we do not have reliable figures for Wales, it is strongly believed that one in every 25 children has some form of dyslexia, and others suggest that it could be as high as one in 10. Alun's commitment to wanting the best for all individuals is shared by every Assembly Member.

It is important to note that we fully recognise that there are significant long-term social and economic costs in not dealing with dyslexia and its associated specific learning difficulties. We know that it can lead to potentially poor academic attainment, school exclusions, losses in earning, and lower tax revenue, and that dyslexic adults are over-represented in our prison system and as part of our probation system. Someone has estimated that the cost to the economy is

profiad o raglen Dore—i mi, fel rhywun yn ei ardegau, ac yna fel dyn ifanc, oresgyn y dyslecsia i lefel cymhwysedd resymol. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed yn awr, yn fy oedran i—ac yr wyf yn fy 50au hwyr—ceir adegau o hyd lle na allaf weld ac adnabod gair yr wyf am ei ysgrifennu. Nid yw'r ochr fathemateg erioed wedi bod yn broblem imi, ond yr oedd Saesneg ysgrifenedig yn broblem, ac mae'n parhau i fod yn broblem i ryw raddau.

Gwyddom fod llawer o bobl yn dioddef yn y gwaith o ganlyniad i ddiffyg sgiliau sylfaenol, ac, yn ddi-au, yn rhannol, bydd hynny o ganlyniad i ddyslecsia yn achos rhai o'r bobl hynny. Yn yr un modd, mae llawer o bobl ifanc yn y carchar, neu mewn canolfannau cadw, ac mae anableddau dysgu yn rhan o'u problem. Os na fydd cynlluniau ar waith i'w cynorthwyo, mae'r perygl o aildroeddu a dychwelyd i'r carchar neu i ganolfan gadw, yn fawr. Ni allaf ddweud pa un a yw Dore yn ateb, ond ymddengys y gallai fod yn rhan o'r ateb a dylid ei hystyried.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun Cairns am ddewis y mater hwn ar gyfer y ddadl fer y prynhawn yma. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn llwyr gydnabod bod dyslecsia yn gyflwr gwanychol sy'n effeithio ar lawer o bobl yng Nghymru. Yn y DU gyfan, mae gan dros 1.2 miliwn o blant ddyslecsia neu anableddau sy'n gysylltiedig yn agos â dyslecsia. Er nad oes gennym ffigurau dibynadwy ar gyfer Cymru, credir yn gadarn bod gan un o bob 25 o blant ryw fath o ddyslecsia, ac awgryma eraill y gallai fod mor uchel ag un o bob 10. Mae pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn rhannu ymrwymiad Alun i sicrhau'r gorau i bob unigolyn.

Mae'n bwysig nodi ein bod yn llwyr gydnabod bod costau cymdeithasol ac economaidd hirdymor sylweddol ynghlwm wrth beidio ag ymdrin â dyslecsia a'i anawsterau dysgu penodol cysylltiedig. Gwyddom y gall arwain at gyrhaeddiad academiaidd gwael o bosibl, gwaharddiadau o'r ysgol, colledion mewn enillion, a refeniw treth is, a bod oedolion dyslecsig yn cael eu gorgynrychioli yn ein system carchardai ac fel rhan o'n system prawf. Mae rhywun wedi

around £1 billion a year. However, conversely, there are some imaginative and creative success stories, all the way from Leonardo da Vinci to people such as Sir Richard Branson, the actor Robin Williams, John Lennon, and the violinist Nigel Kennedy. There is also evidence about ability associated with dyslexia in terms of being intuitive and creative and excelling in hands-on learning.

The Assembly Government has given dyslexia real attention in recent years. We are extremely supportive of, for example, the Dyslexia Friendly Schools initiative established in Swansea. In early 2006, we established an external reference group for specific learning difficulties, to look particularly at dyslexia. That group has wide representation, from key stakeholders, including local education authorities, schools, the voluntary sector, to bodies such as the Dyslexia Institute Wales and the British Dyslexia Association, as well as professionals with expertise in their field and different points of view. Following a meeting last March, the group issued a questionnaire to all local authorities during the summer term last year requesting details of their provision for children and young people with dyslexia. It took some time to get the results back in, but those questionnaires have now been returned and are being evaluated.

We have already made a commitment to developing quality standards in education to meet the needs of these young people, and we have complemented the support that we have given to the British Dyslexia Association Cymru with funding for the printing and distribution costs of a resource pack entitled 'Achieving Dyslexia-friendly Schools in Wales'. I was pleased to write the foreword to that pack. The pack aims to advise schools on different approaches to meeting the needs of pupils with dyslexia, by removing potential barriers to learning, and it emphasises the importance of identifying children and young people's needs at the earliest possible point and of providing the right support geared to their particular needs. This whole concept of early identification

amcangyfrif bod y gost i'r economi yn cyfateb i tua £1 biliwn y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, i'r gwrthwyneb, mae rhai storïau llwyddiant dychmygus a chreadigol, o bobl megis Leonardo da Vinci i bobl megis Syr Richard Branson, yr actor Robin Williams, John Lennon, a'r feiolinydd Nigel Kennedy. Ceir tystiolaeth hefyd am allu sy'n gysylltiedig â dyslecsia o ran bod yn sythweledol ac yn greadigol a rhagori mewn dysgu ymarferol.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi sylw gwirioneddol i ddyslecsia yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yr ydym yn gefnogol iawn o fenter Ysgolion Cyfeillgar at Ddyslecsia, er enghraifft, a sefydlwyd yn Abertawe. Ar ddechrau 2006, gwnaethom sefydlu grŵp cyfeirio allanol ar gyfer anawsterau dysgu penodol, i edrych yn benodol ar ddyslecsia. Mae gan y grŵp hwnnw gynrychiolaeth eang, o randdeiliaid allweddol, yn cynnwys awdurdodau addysg lleol, ysgolion, y sector gwirfoddol, i gyrrff fel Sefydliad Dyslecsia Cymru a Chymdeithas Dyslecsia Prydain, yn ogystal â gweithwyr proffesiynol ag arbenigedd yn eu maes a safbwyntiau gwahanol. Yn dilyn cyfarfod mis Mawrth diwethaf, dosbarthodd y grŵp holiadur i bob awdurdod lleol yn ystod tymor yr haf y llynedd yn gofyn am fanylion ynghylch eu darpariaeth i blant a phobl ifanc â dyslecsia. Cymerodd gryn amser i gael y canlyniadau, ond mae'r holiaduron hynny bellach wedi'u dychwelyd ac maent yn cael eu gwerthuso.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu safonau ansawdd mewn addysg er mwyn diwallu anghenion y bobl ifanc hyn, ac yr ydym wedi ategu'r gefnogaeth a roesom i Gymdeithas Dyslecsia Prydain Cymru drwy roi arian ar gyfer costau argraffu a dosbarthu pecyn adnoddau sy'n dwyn y teitl 'Cyflawni Ysgolion Cyfeillgar at Ddyslecsia yng Nghymru'. Yr oeddwn yn falch o ysgrifennu'r rhagair i'r pecyn hwnnw. Nod y pecyn yw rhoi cyngor i ysgolion ar ymagweddau gwahanol tuag at ddiwallu anghenion disgyblion â dyslecsia, drwy ddileu'r rhwystrau posibl i ddysgu, ac mae'n pwysleisio pwysigrwydd nodi anghenion plant a phobl ifanc cyn gynted â phosibl a rhoi'r cymorth cywir wedi'i deilwra i'w hanghenion penodol. Mae'r cysyniad cyfan

and intervention is consistent with the Assembly Government's approach, and it is one that is strongly supported by the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee.

5.20 p.m.

The British Dyslexia Association has obtained over £1 million from Objective 1 funds to support its Llwyddiant project, a joint initiative between the BDA and the Dyscovery Trust and other partners. It is helping hundreds of teenagers across Wales by supporting and enhancing existing systems for education and training, and it is working with a target group of 2,000 young people, between 13 and 19 years old, whose dyslexia, and the social and communication difficulties that go with it, impede them from realising their full educational potential. The project provides tailor-made individual assistance to learners to ensure that they get the best from their education, training and support programmes. The individual action programmes allow young people to take part in specialist, targeted education provision, where their progress is reviewed and monitored as they work towards their learning goals. The support then continues wherever the young person decides to undertake their educational training to maintain that vital learning momentum. That funding will run out at the end of June this year, and we are working with them on how we can sustain that vital work.

Turning to the particular topic of this debate, I noticed and appreciated, Alun, that you were very careful not to describe this method as a cure for dyslexia. That is a claim that has been made, and it is an ambitious claim of which even the most ardent supporter needs to be careful, certainly at this stage of the game. However, it is encouraging that the department of psychological medicine at Cardiff University announced in 2005 that it believed that it might have discovered a gene that was likely to be the cause of dyslexia in children. At the time, that was described as a major breakthrough, but one of the leading researchers stressed that further work needed to be undertaken on it before those findings

hwn o nodi ac ymyrryd yn gynnar yn gyson ag ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chaiff ei gefnogi'n gadarn gan y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

Mae Cymdeithas Dyslecsia Prydain wedi cael dros £1 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 i gefnogi ei phrosiect Llwyddiant, sef menter ar y cyd rhwng Cymdeithas Dyslecsia Prydain ac Ymddiriedolaeth Dyscovery a phartneriaid eraill. Mae'n helpu cannoedd o bobl yn eu harddegau ledled Cymru drwy gefnogi a gwella systemau presennol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant ac mae'n gweithio gyda grŵp targed o 2,000 o bobl ifanc, rhwng 13 a 19 oed, y mae eu dyslecsia, a'r anawsterau cymdeithasol a chyfathrebu sydd ynghlwm wrtho, yn eu hatal rhag cyflawni eu potensial addysgol llawn. Mae'r prosiect yn rhoi cymorth unigol wedi'i deilwra'n arbennig i ddysgwyr i sicrhau eu bod yn cael y gorau o'u rhaglenni addysg, hyfforddiant a chymorth. Mae'r rhaglenni gweithredu unigol yn galluogi pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn darpariaeth addysg benodol arbenigol, lle y caiff eu cynnydd ei adolygu a'i fonitro wrth iddynt weithio tuag at eu nodau dysgu. Mae'r cymorth wedyn yn parhau lle bynnag y bydd y person ifanc yn penderfynu ymgymryd â'i hyfforddiant addysgol er mwyn cynnal y momentwm dysgu hanfodol hwnnw. Daw'r arian hwnnw i ben ar ddiwedd mis Mehefin eleni, ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda hwy ar sut y gallwn gynnal y gwaith hanfodol hwnnw.

Gan droi at bwnc penodol y ddadl hon, sylwais a gwerthfawrogais, Alun, eich bod yn ofalus iawn i beidio â disgrifio'r dull hwn fel ffordd o wella dyslecsia. Dyna honiad a wnaed, ac mae'n honiad uchelgeisiol y dylai hyd yn oed y cefnogwr mwyaf selog fod yn ofalus ohono, yn sicr ar y cam cynnar hwn o'r broses. Fodd bynnag, mae'n galonogol i adran meddygaeth seicolegol Prifysgol Caerdydd gyhoeddi yn 2005 ei bod yn credu y gallai fod wedi darganfod genyn a oedd yn debygol o achosi dyslecsia mewn plant. Ar yr adeg honno, fe'i disgrifiwyd yn garreg filltir, ond pwysleisiodd un o'r ymchwilwyr arweiniol fod angen gwneud gwaith pellach arno cyn y gellid troi'r canfyddiadau hynny

could be translated into a therapy. I know that the people who attended your presentation found it extremely interesting, and I was pleased to ensure that a member of my department attended, while I was elsewhere at a previously arranged engagement.

The Dore individualised exercise programme is, as you said, aimed at minimising or eliminating cerebellar development delay, which is considered by many to be the likely cause of a range of learning difficulties. The programme addresses the physiological source of the problem by using exercises to stimulate the cerebellum to aid the individual to process information more rapidly. Academics such as Professor David Reynolds of the University of Plymouth have strongly supported it. He has undertaken a three-year study into this method of intervention and is on record as saying:

‘Before the treatment began, independent school reading tests showed that the children with learning difficulties were making only seven months progress in 12 months. And they were falling further and further behind their peers’.

However, in his findings, in the 12 months of treatment, the children made 20 months’ improvement in reading progress and caught up with their peers. After their treatment, the children maintained that progress. In other words, the treatment provided a permanent solution to the problem and the programme was just as effective regardless of whether or not the children had been previously diagnosed as dyslexic. That is an attractive evidence base.

However, other leading experts in the field, as you know, such as Dyslexia Action, have called into question the basis of the research. Its head of assessment and evaluation, Dr John Rack, said that:

‘The main problem with the follow-up study is that there is no control group. Pupils identified at risk on a screening test were found to have made progress (on some but not all measures) following six months of the Dore treatment, and those gains did not diminish over the follow-up

yn therapi. Gwn fod y bobl a aeth i’ch cyflwyniad o’r farn ei fod yn ddidorol iawn, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o sicrhau bod aelod o’r hadran i yn bresennol, gan fy mod innau yn rhywle arall mewn digwyddiad a drefnwyd yn flaenorol.

Nod rhaglen ymarfer unigol Dore, fel y dywedwyd gennych, yw lleihau neu ddileu’r oedi yn natblygiad y serebelwm, a ystyrir gan lawer o bobl fel achos tebygol ystod o anawsterau dysgu. Mae’r rhaglen yn mynd i’r afael â ffynhonnell seicolegol y broblem drwy ddefnyddio ymarferion i symbylu’r serebelwm er mwyn helpu’r unigolyn i brosesu gwybodaeth yn gyflymach. Mae academyddion fel yr Athro David Reynolds o Brifysgol Plymouth wedi ei chefnogi’n gryf. Mae wedi ymgymryd ag astudiaeth dair blynedd i’r dull ymyrryd hwn a dywedodd yn gyhoeddus:

Cyn i’r driniaeth ddechrau, dangosodd profion darllen ysgolion annibynnol mai dim ond cynnydd o saith mis yr oedd plant ag anawsterau dysgu yn ei wneud o fewn 12 mis. Ac yr oeddent fwyfwy ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â’u cyfoedion.

Fodd bynnag, yn ei ganfyddiadau, yn y 12 mis o driniaeth, gwnaeth y plant 20 mis o welliant o ran eu cynnydd darllen a gwnaethant gyrraedd lefel eu cyfoedion. Ar ôl eu triniaeth, cynhaliodd y plant y cynnydd hwnnw. Mewn geiriau eraill, rhoddodd y driniaeth ateb parhaol i’r broblem ac yr oedd y rhaglen yr un mor effeithiol pa un a oedd y plant wedi cael diagnosis o ddyslecsia yn flaenorol ai peidio. Mae honno’n sylfaen dystiolaeth ddeniadol.

Fodd bynnag, mae arbenigwyr arweiniol eraill yn y maes, fel y gwyddoch, megis Dyslexia Action, wedi codi amheuan ynghylch sylfaen y gwaith ymchwil. Dywedodd pennaeth asesu a gwerthuso’r sefydliad, Dr John Rack:

Y brif broblem o ran yr astudiaeth ddilynol yw nad oes unrhyw grŵp safonol. Canfuwyd bod disgyblion y nodwyd eu bod yn wynebu risg yn ystod prawf sgrinio wedi gwneud cynnydd (ar rai o’r mesurau ond nid pob un ohonynt) ar ôl chwe mis o driniaeth Dore, ac ni leihaodd yr enillion hynny dros y cyfnod

period. However, those pupils had been receiving all kinds of other support at school’.

Therefore, analysis of what had caused the improvement was not clear. He added:

‘There are so many factors that can affect progress year to year and, without a control group, one can say very little about the impact of a special programme of treatment. To make it very clear: the pupils who are described in the forthcoming paper did make some progress on some measures, but we cannot interpret that because there is no control group’.

Dyslexia Action also made it clear that it:

‘does not support any claim that one cause of cerebellar immaturity and one treatment for correcting it would be effective’.

That is, it would not be effective for all children.

As a result of today’s short debate and what we know about this method of intervention, I am happy to respond to your call to invite the external reference group to consider examining the various approaches to dealing with dyslexia, including the Dore programme, and to advise on the benefit of a longitudinal study to assess which approach is most effective and which one an Assembly Government could potentially endorse. My evidence-based approach is based on the fact that there are clearly differences of opinion, especially among leading scientists about the efficacy of the programme and some of the claims that are being made about it. Like Alun, as a layperson, I am simply not in a position to make a definitive judgment.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for much of what the Minister said, particularly regarding the external reference group. However, in terms of what I asked about potential conflicts of interest, can we at least establish whether there are potential conflicts of interest on all sides of the argument, whether that is with proponents of Dore having questions about some of those against whom they are being evaluated or whether it is with those whom

dilynol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y disgyblion hynny wedi bod yn cael pob math o gymorth arall yn yr ysgol.

Felly, nid oedd y dadansoddiad o’r hyn a oedd wedi achosi’r gwelliant yn glir. Ychwanegodd:

Mae cymaint o ffactorau a all effeithio ar gynnydd o flwyddyn i flwyddyn a, heb grŵp safonol, ni ellir dweud fawr ddim am effaith rhaglen driniaeth arbennig. I egluro’r sefyllfa: gwnaeth y disgyblion a ddisgrifir yn y papur sydd ar ddod rywfaint o gynnydd ar rai mesurau, ond ni allwn ddehongli hynny oherwydd nid oes grŵp rheoli.

Eglurodd Dyslexia Action hefyd:

nad yw’n cefnogi unrhyw honiad y byddai un achos o anaeddfedrwydd serebelaid ac un driniaeth i’w gywiro yn effeithiol.

Hynny yw, ni fyddai’n effeithiol i bob plentyn.

O ganlyniad i’r ddadl fer heddiw a’r hyn a wyddom am y dull ymyrryd hwn, yr wyf yn fodlon ymateb i’ch cais i wahodd y grŵp cyfeirio allanol i ystyried archwilio’r ymagweddau amrywiol tuag at ddelio â dyslecsia, yn cynnwys rhaglen Dore, ac i roi cyngor ar fantais astudiaeth hydredol i asesu pa ymagwedd sydd fwyaf effeithiol a pha un y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei chymeradwyo o bosibl. Mae fy ymagwedd sy’n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth yn ymwneud â’r ffaith bod gwahaniaeth barn amlwg, yn enwedig ymhlith gwyddonwyr arweiniol, ynglŷn ag effeithiolrwydd y rhaglen a rhai o’r honiadau a wneir yn ei chylch. Yn debyg i Alun, fel unigolyn lleyg, nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i wneud dyfarniad pendant.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am lawer o’r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog, yn enwedig o ran y grŵp cyfeirio allanol. Fodd bynnag, o ran yr hyn a ofynnais ynghylch gwrthdaro buddiannau posibl, a allwn o leiaf gadarnhau a oes gwrthdaro buddiannau posibl ar bob ochr o’r ddadl, pa un a yw hynny o ran cefnogwyr Dore sydd â chwestiynau ynghylch rhai o’r bobl hynny y cânt eu gwerthuso yn eu herbyn, neu o ran y

they are being evaluated against having questions about those on the side of the Dore programme? I understand that Dyslexia Action has an interest in the current arrangements, but if Dyslexia Action is part of your group, there will not be absolute independence in exactly the same way as there would not be absolute independence if Wynford Dore or one of his proponents were on the committee.

Jane Davidson: The critical issue is to ensure that the whole committee has a balance of different interests, that all those who advocate different schemes have their proponents and that that evidence can be properly evaluated, because removing expertise from a committee would not be appropriate either.

There is a range of opportunities and schemes around at present. The Units of Sound programme is a structured, cumulative and multi-sensory programme of reading and speaking, involving a high-level of independent work by the learner. That has been in use since the early 1970s. There is also the Alpha to Omega programme, which is another structured, multi-sensory teaching scheme for reading and spelling, devised by Professor Beve Hornsby, a psychologist and speech therapist in London. There is an alternative sound linkage, phonological awareness training programme that has been developed by Peter Hatcher specifically for 7-year-olds who have fallen behind in their reading. That has been lauded for its success with this specific group of children and is now more widely used with children of all ages who have dyslexia and other moderate learning difficulties. That programme is recommended in England by the Department for Education and Skills. Those are just some examples.

What underlies your request is that you want to ensure that Dore gets a fair hearing and I am entirely happy, as Minister, to undertake to ensure, through my officials, that that external reference group considers Dore properly against other initiatives. We are therefore likely, as a Government committed to evidence-based policy, to come out with options that will be available for slightly different needs. I hope that you will welcome

bobl hynny y cânt eu gwerthuso yn eu herbyn sydd â chwestiynau ynghylch y rhai sydd o blaid rhaglen Dore? Deallaf fod gan Dyslexia Action fudd yn y trefniadau cyfredol, ond os yw Dyslexia Action yn rhan o'r ch grŵp, ni fydd annibyniaeth lwyr yn union fel na fyddai annibyniaeth lwyr pe bai Wynford Dore neu un o'i gefnogwyr ar y pwyllgor.

Jane Davidson: Y mater hanfodol yw sicrhau bod gan y pwyllgor cyfan gydbwysedd o fuddiannau gwahanol, bod gan bawb sy'n dadlau o blaid cynlluniau gwahanol eu cefnogwyr eu hunain ac y gellir gwerthuso'r dystiolaeth honno yn briodol, oherwydd na fyddai cael gwared ar arbenigedd o bwyllgor yn briodol ychwaith.

Mae ystod o gyfleoedd a chynlluniau ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r rhaglen Units of Sound yn rhaglen darllen a siarad strwythuredig, cronol ac amlsynhwyraidd, sy'n cynnwys llawer o waith annibynnol gan y dysgwyr. Mae wedi cael ei defnyddio ers dechrau'r 1970au. Ceir y rhaglen Alpha to Omega hefyd, sy'n gynllun addysgu strwythuredig, amlsynhwyraidd arall ar gyfer darllen a sillafu, a luniwyd gan yr Athro Beve Hornsby, seicolegydd a therapydd lleferydd yn Llundain. Ceir rhaglen hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth ffonolegol amgen, yn ymwneud â chysylltiadau sain, a ddatblygwyd gan Peter Hatcher ar gyfer plant saith blwydd oed sydd ar ei hôl hi o ran eu darllen yn benodol. Cafodd honno ei chanmol am ei llwyddiant gyda'r grŵp penodol hwn o blant ac fe'i defnyddir yn ehangach erbyn hyn gyda phlant o bob oed sydd â dyslecsia ac anawsterau dysgu cymedrol eraill. Caiff y rhaglen honno ei hargymell yn Lloegr gan yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau. Dim ond ychydig enghreifftiau yw'r rheini.

Yr hyn sy'n sail i'ch cais yw eich bod am sicrhau bod Dore yn cael gwrandawriad teg ac yr wyf yn gwbl fodlon, fel Gweinidog, i ymrwmo i sicrhau, drwy fy swyddogion, bod y grŵp cyfeirio allanol hwnnw yn ystyried Dore yn briodol yn erbyn mentrau eraill. Yr ydym yn debygol felly, fel Llywodraeth sy'n ymrwymedig i bolisi sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, o gyflwyno opsiynau a fydd ar gael ar gyfer anghenion sydd

that systematic and objective approach to the evaluation of these approaches. ychydig yn wahanol. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn croesawu'r ymagwedd systematig a gwrthrychol honno tuag at werthuso'r dulliau hyn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. That completes business for this afternoon. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.27 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.27 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)