



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 14 Mawrth 2000**

**Tuesday 14 March 2000**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |   |
|----|---|
| 3  | Ethol i Banel Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau Pwnc ac Ethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig<br><i>Election to the Panel of Subject Committee Chairs and Election of Chair to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee</i> |
| 4  | Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig<br><i>Election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee</i>  |
| 5  | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd<br><i>Questions to the First Secretary</i>   |
| 21 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>  |
| 21 | Datganiad Busnes<br><i>Business Statement</i>   |
| 23 | Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ardrethi a Phraeseptau (Addasiadau Terfynol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000<br><i>Approval of the Rates and Precepts (Final Adjustments) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2000</i>  |
| 27 | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd<br><i>Economic Development Committee Report</i>  |
| 73 | Dadl Fer: Y Gwasanaethau Argyfwng yng Nghymru<br><i>Short Debate: The Emergency Services in Wales</i>   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, dywedais y byddwn yn darllen y cofnod ynglŷn â'r ddatganiad a gynhaliwyd gan grŵp Ceidwadol Cymru ar y diwrnod hwnnw ac araith Alun Cairns yn benodol. Ystyriais y cofnod a gwnaf ddatganiad cyffredinol ar hynny. Ystyriais yn benodol y defnydd o'r gair '*corrupt*'—llwgr yn y Gymraeg—yn yr honiadau a wnaethpwyd yn ystod yr araith a hefyd ystyriais yr awgrym fod personau wedi troseddu yn erbyn Cod Gweinidogol pan nad oes penderfyniad i'r perwyl hwnnw wedi cael ei wneud. O ystyried y datganiadau hyn, teimlaf eu bod yn groes i'r Protocol ynglŷn ag Ymddygiad yn y Siambr. Mae'r sylwadau hyn mewn categori o iaith sydd allan o drefn ac a allai ddilorni Aelodau ac eraill. Gofynnaf i Aelodau i ystyried eu geiriau'n ofalus pan yn siarad yn y Siambr er mwyn sicrhau bod eu sylwadau bob amser o fewn y Protocol ynglŷn ag Ymddygiad yn y Siambr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Last Tuesday, I said that I would read the record on the debate held by the Welsh Conservative group on that day and Alun Cairns's speech in particular. I have considered the record and I will make a general statement on that. I considered, in particular, the use of the word 'corrupt' in the allegations made during the speech and I also considered the suggestion that people had violated the Ministerial Code when no resolution to that effect has been made. Having considered these statements, I feel that they transgress the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber. These comments fall into a category of language that is out of order and could offend Members and others. I ask Members to consider their words carefully when speaking in the Chamber to ensure that their comments are always within the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber.

**Ethol i Banel Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau Pwnc ac Ethol Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor  
Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig  
Election to the Panel of Subject Committee Chairs and Election of the Chair of  
the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee**

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the Assembly, acting in accordance with section 57(5) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,*

*elects Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) to the panel of subject committee chairs in place of Ieuan Wyn Jones (Plaid Cymru); and*

*selects Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) to chair the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee.*

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad, drwy weithredu'n unol ag adran 57(5) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*yn ethol Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) i fod yn aelod o banel cadeiryddion y pwyllgorau pwnc yn lle Ieuan Wyn Jones (Plaid Cymru); ac*

*yn dethol Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

**Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig  
Election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee**

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*the Assembly resolves to replace with immediate effect Ieuan Wyn Jones (Plaid Cymru) with Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru) on the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee.*

*y Cynulliad yn penderfynu bod Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru) yn cymryd lle Ieuan Wyn Jones (Plaid Cymru) ar y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, a hynny ar unwaith.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

2:10 p.m.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd Questions to the First Secretary**

#### **Fframwaith Newydd ar gyfer Rheoli Perfformiad Athrawon New Performance Management Framework for Teachers**

**Q1 Jonathan Morgan:** Has the First Secretary discussed regulations governing the new performance management framework for teachers that apply to England and Wales

**C1 Jonathan Morgan:** A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wedi trafod rheoliadau'r drefn newydd ar gyfer rheoli perfformiad athrawon a ddaw i rym yng Nghymru a Lloegr gydag

with the Secretary of State for Wales or the Secretary of State for Education and Employment? (OAQ4044)

**The First Secretary (Rhodri Morgan):** No. There would be no point in doing so, because this matter has been devolved to the Assembly.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Will the First Secretary clarify his remarks in the Chamber last week? He said that

‘the Assembly has asked David Blunkett whether he would voluntarily transfer the rights over this issue. He refused to do this voluntarily’.

If there have been discussions with the Secretary of State for Education and Employment on the performance management framework for teachers, why was the Pre-16 Education Committee not informed and why was it not informed as to the outcome of those discussions?

**The First Secretary:** I can only repeat what I said earlier. There seems to be a problem in the distinction between performance management systems and pay threshold systems. The remarks to which I understood Cynog Dafis was referring last week, when I sought to intervene, were about pay threshold systems and not performance management. It is true that I discussed with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Secretary of State for Education and Employment in the presence of Rosemary Butler, as the Secretary for Education and Children, whether the Department of Education and Employment was interested in finding a method of voluntarily transferring the pay threshold systems to the Assembly by some delegated instrument. However, there was no interest and that closed the matter since it is not a devolved issue, unlike performance management.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Ysgrifennydd, o ystyried mor ddyrys yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd mewn perthynas â rheoli perfformiad athrawon, ac o ystyried ein trafodaethau yn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16—yn wir mae hyn yn berthnasol i unrhyw Bwyllgor Pwnc—a

Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru neu gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth? (OAQ4044)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd (Rhodri Morgan):** Nac ydwyf. Ni fyddai diben i hynny, oherwydd datganolwyd y mater hwn i'r Cynulliad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A fydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd gystal â rhoi gwedd eglurach ar ei sylwadau yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf? Dywedodd fod y

‘Cynulliad wedi gofyn i David Blunkett a fyddai yn trosglwyddo'r hawliau dros y mater hwn yn wirfoddol. Gwrthododd wneud hyn yn wirfoddol.’

Os bu trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth ar y drefn rheoli perfformiad ar gyfer athrawon, pam na roddwyd gwybod i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 a pham na roddwyd gwybod iddo am ganlyniad y trafodaethau hynny?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach. Ymddengys fod problem wrth wahaniaethu rhwng systemau rheoli perfformiad a systemau trothwy tâl. Yr oedd y sylwadau y deallais fod Cynog Dafis yn cyfeirio atynt yr wythnos diwethaf, pan geisiais ymyrryd, yn ymwneud â systemau trothwy tâl ac nid rheoli perfformiad. Mae'n wir imi drafod gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth yng ngŵydd Rosemary Butler, fel yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, a oedd yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn ymddiddori mewn canfod dull o drosglwyddo'r systemau trothwy tâl o'i gwirfodd i'r Cynulliad drwy ryw offeryn dirprwyedig. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd diddordeb ac yr oedd hynny'n ben ar y mater gan nad yw'n fater a ddatganolwyd, yn wahanol i reoli perfformiad.

**Gareth Jones:** First Secretary, considering the complexity of the current situation in relation to the performance management for teachers, and considering our discussions in the Pre-16 Education Committee—indeed this is relevant to any Subject Committee—

ydych yn credu y dylai Pwyllgor Pwnc gael yr hawl i farn gyfreithiol annibynnol allanol?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'n dibynnu beth yw ystyr 'allanol'. Yr ydym wedi trafod yr hyn sydd yn digwydd pan fydd gan aelodau Pwyllgor Pwnc syniadau gwahanol ynglŷn â'r cyngor cyfreithiol a chyfansoddiadol sydd wedi'i roi i'r Ysgrifennydd perthnasol, fel Rosemary Butler o ran addysg cyn-16. Bob tro y mae Ysgrifennydd Cabinet yn dweud ei bod hi neu ef wedi cael cyngor ac nad yw'r mater yn un sydd wedi ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad, nid ydym am i'r Pwyllgor ddweud, 'Wel, os gofynnwn ni i hanner dwsin o gyfreithwyr eraill, efallai y bydd un ohonynt yn dweud ei fod yn gallu dehongli Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn wahanol ac yn dweud ei fod wedi'i ddatganoli'. Y ffordd orau fyddai cael system lle mae aelod o Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol yn bresennol ym mhob cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Pwnc. Wedyn, gallai aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw ofyn i'r cyfreithiwr neu gyfreithwraig o Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wyneb yn wyneb a oedd unrhyw amheuan ynglŷn â'r cyngor yr oedd y cyfreithiwr neu gyfreithwraig wedi'i roi i'r Ysgrifennydd perthnasol. Byddwn yn hapus i drefnu'r math hwnnw o system.

**Jenny Randerson:** Would you agree to review the papers on the issue of performance management pay, because the Committee believes that there has been a change in opinion as to whether or not we have that legal responsibility? The Committee is perplexed that the issue of year on year performance management for teachers has been devolved to the Assembly. However, we are now told that the managed performance one must achieve to go through the threshold has not been devolved to us. No matter what the outcome of any legal advice might be, we would value your support in ensuring that in future, on this issue especially, the views in Wales that we need our own system are made forcibly to the Secretary of State for Education and Employment. We need your support in this, First Secretary.

**The First Secretary:** We have performance

do you believe that a Subject Committee should have the right to independent external legal advice?

**The First Secretary:** That depends on the meaning of 'external'. We have discussed what happens when members of a Subject Committee have different ideas about the legal and constitutional advice that has been given to the relevant Secretary, such as Rosemary Butler in relation to pre-16 education. Every time a Cabinet Secretary says that she or he has received advice and the matter is not one that has been devolved to the Assembly, we do not want the Committee saying, 'Well, if we ask half a dozen other solicitors, perhaps one of them might say that they can interpret the Government of Wales Act 1998 differently and say that it has been devolved'. The best way would be to have a system whereby a member of the Office of the Counsel General is present in every Subject Committee meeting. Members of that Committee could then ask the solicitor from the Office of the Counsel General face to face whether there were any doubts about the advice that the solicitor had given to the relevant Secretary. I would be happy to arrange that kind of system.

**Jenny Randerson:** A fyddech yn fodlon cytuno i ailedrych ar y papurau ar fater tâl rheoli perfformiad, oherwydd mae'r Pwyllgor o'r farn fod newid barn wedi bod ynghylch a yw'r cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol hwnnw gennym ni ai peidio? Mae'r Pwyllgor mewn penbleth ynghylch y ffaith bod mater rheoli perfformiad athrawon o flwyddyn i flwyddyn wedi ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, dywedir wrthym yn awr nad yw'r perfformiad rheoledig y mae'n rhaid ei gyrraedd i fynd dros y trothwy wedi ei ddatganoli i ni. Ni waeth beth fydd canlyniad unrhyw gyngor cyfreithiol, gwerthfawrogem gael eich cefnogaeth i sicrhau, ar y mater hwn yn arbennig, y cyfleir yn rymus yn y dyfodol y farn yng Nghymru fod arnom angen ein system ein hunain i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Mae arnom angen eich cefnogaeth yn hyn o beth, Brif Ysgrifennydd.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae gennym reolaeth

management based on a Welsh system. Pay thresholds are not devolved to the Assembly. If we chose to make a formal request for pay thresholds to be transferred to the Assembly, how would we do that without transferring the whole issue of teachers' pay and conditions to the Assembly?

Cynog Dafis said last week that he did not take the view—and as far as I know Plaid Cymru does not take the view; I do not know about the Liberal group—that it would be wise for teachers' pay and conditions to be transferred to the Assembly. In general, there is a strong feeling that pay negotiations are better dealt with at least on an all England and Wales level, if not an all Great Britain or all UK level. There are 150 civil servants employed in the Northern Ireland Office to deal with teachers' pay and conditions in Northern Ireland. On a population basis, that would mean some 250 civil servants employed in Wales doing the same thing. I have no interest in spending that amount of Assembly money on additional salaries to deal with separate teachers' pay and conditions negotiations in Wales.

ar berfformiad ar sail system Gymreig. Ni ddatganolwyd trothwyau tâl i'r Cynulliad. Os dewiswn wneud cais ffurfiol am drosglwyddo trothwyau tâl i'r Cynulliad, pa fodd y gwnaem hynny heb drosglwyddo holl fater tâl ac amodau athrawon i'r Cynulliad?

Dywedodd Cynog Dafis yr wythnos diwethaf nad oedd o'r farn—a hyd y gwn nid yw Plaid Cymru o'r farn; ni wn am y grŵp Rhyddfrydol—mai doeth fyddai trosglwyddo tâl ac amodau athrawon i'r Cynulliad. Yn gyffredinol, mae teimlad cryf mai gwell yw ymdrin â negodiadau tâl ar lefel y cyfan o Gymru a Lloegr o leiaf, os nad ar lefel Prydain Fawr gyfan neu'r DU gyfan. Cyflogir 150 o weision sifil yn Swyddfa Gogledd Iwerddon i ddelio â thâl ac amodau athrawon yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Ar sail poblogaeth, golygai hynny gyflogi tua 250 o weision sifil yng Nghymru i wneud yr un peth. Nid yw gwario'r swm hwnnw o arian y Cynulliad ar gyflogau ychwanegol i ddelio â negodi ar wahân ar dâl ac amodau athrawon yng Nghymru o ddiddordeb i mi o gwbl.

### **Polisïau'r Cynulliad (Dimensiwn Ewropeaidd) Assembly Policies (European Dimension)**

**Q2 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Secretary make a statement on the European dimension of the Assembly's policies? (OAQ4051)

**The First Secretary:** I am grateful for that question because both my predecessor and I have made clear the importance we attach to the European dimension of the Assembly's work. The Committee on European Affairs received a helpful briefing on current policy issues, both from Commission staff with a special interest in the big issues for Wales and from members of staff at the UK Permanent Representation in Brussels on 2 and 3 March. There were 11 members of the Committee on European Affairs present, representing all four political parties. Assembly Secretaries are undertaking reviews of the policy areas for which they have responsibility to assess how European Community developments and legislation impact on them. Each has been asked to submit a report to me, and those reports will

**C2 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatganiad ar ddimensiwn Ewropeaidd polisïau'r Cynulliad? (OAQ4051)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw oherwydd mae fy rhagflaenydd a minnau wedi rhoi ar ddeall y pwys a roddwn ar y dimensiwn Ewropeaidd i waith y Cynulliad. Derbyniodd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd gyfarwyddyd buddiol ar faterion polisi cyfredol, gan staff y Comisiwn sydd yn ymddiddori'n arbennig yn y materion sydd o bwys mawr i Gymru a chan aelodau staff Cynrychiolaeth Barhaol y DU ym Mrwsel ar 2 a 3 Mawrth. Yr oedd 11 aelod o'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yn bresennol, yn cynrychioli pob un o'r pedair plaid wleidyddol. Mae Ysgrifennyddion Cynulliad yn ymgymryd ag adolygiadau o'r meysydd polisi y maent yn gyfrifol amdanynt er mwyn asesu sut y mae datblygiadau a deddfwriaeth y Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn effeithio arnynt. Gofynnwyd i bob un



be an important step in identifying what contribution the Assembly can make to the European debate. As Pauline is aware, the Committee on European Affairs does not scrutinise European directives and regulations. Some people say that the Assembly should scrutinise more directly the European legislation that affects us, but there is so much of it that we would require 660 Assembly Members, not 60.

**Pauline Jarman:** Do you agree that any further delay in the start of the Objective 1 programme, be it due to the failure of the UK Government to comply with the European Union Natura 2000 Habitats and Birds Directives, or any other reason, would be unacceptable and unfair to the millions of unemployed and poor people within the Objective 1 regions, and would directly impede one of the Assembly's main policies for the regeneration of communities in Wales for the coming years? Can you give us an update on the implications of the failure of the UK Government to comply with the European Union Natura 2000 Habitats and Birds Directives on the progress of implementing the Assembly's policies, in particular the Objective 1 programme?

**The First Secretary:** Yes, I can speak for Wales and I can possibly give some update on the wider UK situation. The Countryside Council for Wales has received a £1.8 million budget increase so that it can carry out the full study and notification procedure of all the sites worthy of inclusion in the Natura 2000 Habitats and Birds Directives. That £1.8 million is spread over two years. Detailed negotiations are still underway with the Countryside Council for Wales on how much it will need in the first year and in the second year.

2:20 p.m.

We have taken urgent action and have provided the resources to back-up that urgent action to ensure that Wales's access to Objective 1 funding will in no way be prejudiced by the strong words that have been used in the European Parliament, today

gyflwyno adroddiad i mi, a bydd yr adroddiadau hynny'n gam pwysig wrth ddynodi'r hyn y gall y Cynulliad ei gyfrannu i'r ddadl Ewropeaidd. Fel y gŵyr Pauline, nid yw'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yn archwilio cyfarwyddbau a rheoliadau Ewropeaidd. Dywed rhai y dylai'r Cynulliad archwilio'r ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd sydd yn effeithio arnom yn fwy uniongyrchol, ond mae cymaint ohoni fel y byddai arnom angen 660 o Aelodau Cynulliad, nid 60.

**Pauline Jarman:** A gytunwch y byddai unrhyw oedi pellach cyn dechrau'r rhaglen Amcan 1, boed oherwydd methiant Llywodraeth y DU i gydymffurfio â Chyfarwyddbau Cynefinoedd ac Adar Natura 2000 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, neu unrhyw reswm arall, yn annerbyniol ac yn annheg â'r miliynau o bobl ddi-waith a thlawd oddi mewn i'r rhanbarthau Amcan 1, ac y byddai'n rhwystr uniongyrchol i un o brif bolisiau'r Cynulliad er mwyn adfywio cymunedau yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod? A allwch roi'r diweddaraf i ni ar oblygiadau methiant Llywodraeth y DU i gydymffurfio â Chyfarwyddbau Cynefinoedd ac Adar Natura 2000 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i'r cynnydd wrth weithredu polisiau'r Cynulliad, yn enwedig y rhaglen Amcan 1?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Gallaf, gallaf sôn am Gymru ac mae'n bosibl y gallaf ddweud ychydig am y diweddaraf ar y sefyllfa ehangach yn y DU. Derbyniodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru godiad o £1.8 miliwn yn ei gyllideb fel y gall gyflawni'r astudiaeth lawn a'r weithdrefn hysbysu ar gyfer yr holl safleoedd sydd yn deilwng o'u cynnwys yng Nghyfarwyddbau Cynefinoedd ac Adar Natura 2000. Rhennir y £1.8 miliwn hwnnw dros ddwy flynedd. Mae trafodaethau manwl yn mynd rhagddynt â Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ynghylch pa faint y bydd arno ei angen yn y flwyddyn gyntaf a'r ail.

Cymerasom gamau brys a darparasom yr adnoddau i ategu'r camau brys hynny er mwyn sicrhau na pheryglir gallu Cymru i gael gafael ar arian Amcan 1 mewn unrhyw fodd gan y geiriau cryf a ddefnyddiwyd yn Senedd Ewrop, heddiw a ddoe, mewn

and yesterday, in relation to certain Member States, including the UK, having been very flat in getting the procedure ready for completion of the Natura 2000 directive by the end of 2000. On the UK side this goes back—as we often hear in this Chamber—to a certain John Redwood. There were such savage cuts in the budget of the Countryside Council for Wales that they were unable to carry out the notification work. We have had to put that right in the past few weeks, and negotiations with the CCW have been successful. On the UK side, we were given assurances in Brussels last week that they were not going to penalise us in Wales, if the rest of the UK did not pass muster in the way that I am now confident that we will pass muster. The situation is not likely to cause us any problems. I understand that the UK Government and the European Commission will shortly be able to announce reasonable agreement on this issue of notification of sites for the Natura 2000 directive and, therefore, the absence of any threat to Objective 1

**Dafydd Wigley:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd am ei ateb sylweddol i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Ar ba ddyddiad yr oeddem yn ymwybodol fod yna unrhyw broblem gydag oblygiadau rhaglen Cyfarwyddbau Cynefinoedd ac Adar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn perthynas ag Amcan 1? Pe bai gennym, bryd hynny, y swydd sydd wedi ei chreu yn awr—gyda Des Clifford yn cysylltu rhwng UKREP, Canolfan Ewropeaidd Cymru ym Mrwsel a ninnau yma—a fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl inni wybod yn gynt ac i wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r broblem yn gynt, yn wahanol i'r bygythiad sydd yn ein hwynebu yn awr?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni allaf roi dyddiad, ond os wyf yn cofio yr oedd tua mis yn ôl. Serch hynny, os wyf yn anghywir, byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Dafydd i'm cywiro fy hunan. Ymatebasom ar frys i'r sefyllfa fel yr oedd yn datblygu. Mae Dafydd yn gwneud pwynt diddorol ynglŷn â phresenoldeb Des Clifford ac eraill ym Mrwsel, yn gynnar ym mis Mai. Bydd hynny'n rhoi gwell rhybudd ymlaen llaw a system o glywed ar y *grapevine*, ys dywed y Sais, ym mhle y mae problemau'n dechrau codi fel ein bod yn gwybod mewn mwy o amser. Felly, bydd llai o fygythiad.

perthynas â diffyg paroddrwydd rhai Aelod Wladwriaethau, gan gynnwys y DU, i baratoi'r weithdrefn er mwyn cwblhau cyfarwydddeb Natura 2000 erbyn diwedd 2000. O ran y DU â hyn yn ôl—fel y clywn yn aml yn y Siambr hon—i ryw John Redwood. Yr oedd toriadau mor llym yng nghyllideb Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru fel na allent gyflawni'r gwaith hysbysu. Bu'n rhaid inni gywiro hynny yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, a bu trafodaethau â Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru'n llwyddiannus. O ran y DU, rhoddwyd sicrwydd inni ym Mrwsel yr wythnos diwethaf nad oeddent am ein cosbi ni yng Nghymru, os nad yw gweddill y DU yn gwneud yn ddigon da yn y modd yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn ni. Nid yw'r sefyllfa'n debygol o beri unrhyw broblemau i ni. Deallaf y bydd Llywodraeth y DU a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gallu cyhoeddi cytundeb rhesymol cyn hir ar y mater hwn o hysbysu am safleoedd ar gyfer cyfarwydddeb Natura 2000 ac, felly, na fydd unrhyw fygythiad i Amcan 1.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I thank the First Secretary for his substantial answer to that question. On what date were we aware that there was any problem with the implications of the European Union's Habitats and Birds Directives in relation to Objective 1? If we had, at that time, the post that has been created now—with Des Clifford linking UKREP, the Wales European Centre in Brussels and us here—would it have been possible for us to know earlier and to do something about the problem earlier, unlike the threat which faces us at the moment?

**The First Secretary:** I cannot give a date, but if I remember it was about a month ago. However, if I am incorrect, I will write to Dafydd to correct myself. We responded quickly to the situation as it developed. Dafydd makes an interesting point regarding the presence of Des Clifford and others in Brussels, in early May. That will give better advance warning and a system of hearing on the grapevine where problems are starting so that we know in more time. Therefore, there will be less of a threat. However, I believe that we have avoided seeing the threat

Serch hynny, credaf ein bod wedi osgoi gweld y bygythiad yn troi'n wirionedd.

**Nick Bourne:** We have had two pieces of significant economic news with an European dimension today. The first has been alluded to. I am surprised, if it was known a month ago, that it was not something that the Committee on European Affairs was acquainted with on our recent visit. If so, all of us in a cross-party way could have discussed it with the Commission's officials. You and I were at meetings where that could have been discussed. Will he comment on Hillary Armstrong, the Labour administrator at Westminster, saying that this could hold up Objective 1 projects until October? Does he regard that as an accurate statement of the position?

On today's other important news, can the First Secretary say something about regional selective assistance for Broughton? Will that be affected by the failure to agree the map, or was that application in beforehand? Would he confirm that any new project will be held up by the failure to agree the RSA map in Europe?

**The First Secretary:** I will deal with the second aspect first, regarding Broughton. That is a pre 1 January application which was first looked at, as I recall, by the Industrial Development Advisory Board at its early November meeting. Therefore, there is not a problem over the map in the case of Broughton. You will have to direct me specifically to any statement made by Hillary Armstrong. My expectation is that the European Commission and the UK Government—he is right that it is Ministers at the Department of the Environment, Transport and Regions who take the lead on this—do not expect this to be a significant problem. His memory may be different from mine, but I thought that there was some context or point during the meetings that we had on 2 and 3 March, at which this matter was raised between us and the officials. I will write to him when I have a better recall of the precise occasion. I will apologise to him and put the matter straight if I am wrong in remembering that it did arise at some point during the two-day visit to Brussels.

turning into reality.

**Nick Bourne:** Cawsom ddau newydd economaidd o bwys ac iddynt ddimensiwn Ewropeaidd heddiw. Cyfeiriwyd at y cyntaf. Synnaf, os oedd yn hysbys fis yn ôl, na roddwyd gwybod amdano i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ar ein hymweliad yn ddiweddar. Pe buasai, gallasem oll fod wedi ei drafod mewn modd trawsbleidiol gyda swyddogion y Comisiwn. Buoch chi a minnau mewn cyfarfodydd lle y gallasid bod wedi trafod hynny. A fydd gystal â gwneud sylw am yr hyn a ddywedodd Hillary Armstrong, gweinyddwr Llafur yn San Steffan, sef y gallai hyn rwystro prosiectau Amcan 1 tan fis Hydref? A yw'n ystyried hynny'n ddatganiad cywir o'r sefyllfa?

Ar y newydd pwysig arall heddiw, a all y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddweud rhywbeth am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i Frychdyn? A fydd methu â chytuno ar y map yn effeithio ar hynny, ynteu a gyflwynwyd y cais hwnnw ymlaen llaw? A wnaiff gadarnhau y bydd unrhyw brosiect newydd yn cael ei rwystro gan y methiant i gytuno ar y map cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn Ewrop?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf am ddelio â'r ail agwedd yn gyntaf, ynghylch Brychdyn. Mae hynny'n gais cyn 1 Ionawr a ystyriwyd yn gyntaf, fel y cofiaf, gan y Bwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol yn ei gyfarfod yn gynnar yn Nhachwedd. Felly, nid oes problem ynghylch y map yn achos Brychdyn. Bydd yn rhaid ichi fy nghyfeirio'n benodol at unrhyw ddatganiad a wnaethpwyd gan Hillary Armstrong. Yr hyn a ddisgwyliaf yw nad yw'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a Llywodraeth y DU—mae'n iawn wrth ddweud mai Gweinidogion yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau sydd yn arwain ar hyn—yn disgwyl i hyn fod yn broblem o bwys. Efallai fod yr atgof sydd ganddo'n wahanol i fy un i, ond credais fod rhyw gyd-destun neu bwynt yn ystod y cyfarfodydd a gawsom ar 2 a 3 Mawrth, pan godwyd y mater hwn rhyngom a'r swyddogion. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu ato pan gofiaf yn well am yr union achlysur. Byddaf yn ymddiheuro iddo ac yn cywiro'r mater os wyf yn anghywir wrth gofio ei fod wedi codi ar ryw bwynt yn ystod yr ymweliad

deuddydd â Brwsel.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for those answers. On the regional aspects of our European relationship, what actions do you propose to take to enhance our regional links, particularly in view of the fact that our educational links with regions seem to be withering on the vine, to quote an article today?

**The First Secretary:** Our regional links in the education field are not withering on the vine at all. I cannot comment on individual programmes, but the European regions exchange programmes for young people, university students and the non-university stream of people of the same age group are stronger than ever. Those different European programmes ensure cross-fertilisation between different parts of Europe. If you write to me and give a specific example of withering on a grapevine, I hope that I will be able to reassure you that the vineyard is healthy even if the odd branch has fallen from the odd vine.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am yr atebion hynny. Ynghylch yr agweddau rhanbarthol ar ein perthynas ag Ewrop, pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i hybu ein cysylltiadau rhanbarthol, yn enwedig yng ngolwg y ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos bod ein cysylltiadau addysgol â rhanbarthau'n gwywo ar y gangen, a dyfynnu o erthygl heddiw?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid yw ein cysylltiadau rhanbarthol ym maes addysg yn gwywo ar y gangen o gwbl. Ni allaf wneud sylw am raglenni unigol, ond mae'r rhaglenni cyfnewid rhanbarthau Ewropeaidd ar gyfer pobl ifanc, myfyrwyr prifysgol a'r ffrwd o bobl o'r un grŵp oedran nad ydynt mewn prifysgol yn gryfach nag erioed. Mae'r gwahanol raglenni Ewropeaidd hynny'n sicrhau croesffirwythloni rhwng gwahanol rannau o Ewrop. Os ysgrifennwch ataf a rhoi enghraifft benodol o wywo ar y gangen, gobeithiaf y byddaf yn gallu rhoi tawelwch meddwl i chi bod y winllan yn iach hyd yn oed os yw ambell gangen wedi disgyn o ambell winwydden.

### **Cefn Gwlad (Datblygu Polisiâu) Rural Wales (Policy Development)**

**Q3 Nick Bourne:** Will the First Secretary consider the development of policies in Wales to take into account the needs of rural Wales? (OAQ4061)

**The First Secretary:** We already do that. The specific needs of rural Wales and its communities are taken into account in developing a whole range of domestic and European policies and programmes. These include the People in Communities programme to which I referred on several occasions when I last answered First Secretary's questions. Other programmes include the Objective 1 single programming document for west Wales and the Valleys, the Objective 2 funding document for many parts of the rural east of Wales along the English border and the rural development plan for Wales which builds on the work of the rural partnership to provide a comprehensive, integrated and strategic approach for the development of rural communities throughout Wales. I accept that the sectoral

**C3 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ystyried datblygu polisiâu yng Nghymru er mwyn cymryd i ystyriaeth anghenion cefn gwlad Cymru? (OAQ4061)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Gwnawn hynny eisoes. Cymerir anghenion penodol cefn gwlad Cymru a'i gymunedau i ystyriaeth wrth ddatblygu amrediad cyflawn o bolisiau a rhaglenni domestig ac Ewropeaidd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys y rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau y cyfeiriais ati sawl gwaith pan atebais y cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd y tro diwethaf. Ymhlith rhaglenni eraill y mae dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, y ddogfen ariannu Amcan 2 ar gyfer llawer rhan o gefn gwlad dwyrain Cymru ar hyd y ffin â Lloegr a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i Gymru sydd yn adeiladu ar waith y bartneriaeth wledig er mwyn darparu dull gweithredu cynhwysfawr, integredig a strategol er mwyn datblygu cymunedau gwledig ledled Cymru. Derbyniaf fod sylfaen sectoraidd llawer o'r economi

basis of much of the rural economy—agriculture and forestry—is suffering from a combination of the effects of the high pound and market failure across many of the specialist commodities that we produce strongly in Wales. Most of that market failure goes back to the BSE problem of 10 or 12 years ago.

**Nick Bourne:** Will the First Secretary consider giving proper financial weighting to rural health expenditure when rural Wales—Powys in particular—faces bed cuts and staff cuts at a time of rising waiting lists and when rural Wales is being asked to make massive savings? This matter is being considered today at Builth Wells.

**The First Secretary:** I am not aware of the meeting in Builth Wells to which you refer, but this is a matter that gives rise to all kinds of problems in England and Wales. Whenever there is a resource allocation working group and a working plan to allocate per capita expenditure by health authority, it is difficult to decide how much extra to put in for sparsity of population, social deprivation and for above average mortality and morbidity rates. Rural Wales comes out quite well on mortality and morbidity rates, but fares badly because of the cost of serving an area with a high sparsity of population. Powys, for example, does not have a district general hospital of its own. Balancing all these factors is extremely difficult. Each time it is done, some of the results are almost similar to local authorities' damping formula problem. Working out how much allowance should be made for rurality, sparsity, mortality, morbidity and general levels of social deprivation is a difficult task. However, one must make tough choices when running an administration.

**Elin Jones:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cyfeirio at y sector amaeth yn ei ateb. Fodd bynnag, a yw'n barod i gydnabod bod argyfwng difrifol ar hyn o bryd yn y sector llaeth o fewn amaethyddiaeth? A yw hefyd yn barod i

wledig—amaethyddiaeth a choedwigaeth—yn dioddef oddi wrth gyfuniad o effeithiau'r bunt uchel a methiant y farchnad ar gyfer llawer o'r nwyddau arbenigol a gynhyrchwn yn helaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r methiant hwnnw yn y farchnad yn deillio o'r broblem BSE 10 neu 12 mlynedd yn ôl.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ystyried rhoi pwysoliad ariannol priodol ar wariant iechyd gwledig pan fo cefn gwlad Cymru—a Phowys yn enwedig—yn wynebu cwtogi ar welyau a chwtogi ar staff ar adeg pan fo rhestrau aros ar gynnydd a phan ofynnir i gefn gwlad Cymru wneud arbedion anferth? Mae'r mater hwn dan ystyriaeth heddiw yn Llanfair ym Muallt.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r cyfarfod yn Llanfair ym Muallt y cyfeiriwch ato, ond mae hyn yn fater sydd yn achosi pob math o broblemau yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Pryd bynnag y ceir gweithgor dyrannu adnoddau a chynllun gwaith i rannu gwariant y pen fesul awdurdod iechyd, mae'n anodd penderfynu pa faint y dylid ei ychwanegu ar gyfer teneurwydd poblogaeth, amddifadedd cymdeithasol a chyfraddau marwolaeth ac afiachusrwydd sydd yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd. Mae cefn gwlad Cymru'n eithaf da o ran cyfraddau marwolaeth ac afiachusrwydd, ond yn gwneud yn wael oherwydd cost gwasanaethu ardal denau iawn ei phoblogaeth. Er enghraifft, nid oes gan Bowys ei hysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol ei hun. Mae cydbwysu'r holl ffactorau hyn yn anodd iawn. Bob tro y gwneir hynny, mae rhai o'r canlyniadau'n debyg bron i broblem fformwla dampio'r awdurdodau lleol. Tasg anodd yw cyfrifo faint y dylid ei ganiatáu ar gyfer gwledigrwydd, teneurwydd, marwolaeth, afiachusrwydd a lefelau cyffredinol o amddifadedd cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i rywun wneud penderfyniadau anodd wrth redeg gweinyddiaeth.

**Elin Jones:** I was pleased to hear the First Secretary refer to the agriculture sector in his answer. However, is he prepared to acknowledge that there is a serious crisis in the dairy sector within agriculture? Will he also acknowledge that the economic policy of

gydnabod mai polisi economaidd y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain, sydd yn arwain at bris uchel y bunt, sydd yn bennaf gyfrifol am yr argyfwng hwn? A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd dderbyn fy ngwahoddiad i fel aelod newydd o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig i ymweld â ffermwyr llaeth yn y gorllewin sydd yn gweld eu busnesau yn mynd i'r wal oherwydd y prisiau trychinebus y maent yn derbyn am eu cynnyrch?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Gwelaf fod Elin yn symud yn gyflym fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. O fewn y pythefnos nesaf byddaf yn cyfarfod ag aelodau blaenllaw pwyllgorau cenedlaethol a swyddogion y ddau undeb amaethyddol. Gobeithiaf y byddaf yn gallu cwrdd â hwy wyneb yn wyneb a chlywed oddi wrthynt pa mor ddwys yw'r argyfwng amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn y sector llaeth. Er hynny, yr wyf hefyd wedi clywed gan arweinwyr yr undebau amaethyddol nad oeddent o blaid rhai o'r protestiadau a gynhaliwyd. Credaf fod y sector llaeth wedi ei hollti ar werth y protestiadau hynny.

2:30 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** If Rhodri were to return to the subject of health I could enlighten him to the nature of the meeting to which Nick Bourne referred, which is Dyfed Powys Health Authority's meeting this afternoon to discuss its financial difficulties. Does it not alarm you that that health authority is demanding savings of some £4 million from Powys Health Care NHS Trust? That could lead to the loss of 90 hospital beds in Powys, including an entire ward at Ystradgynlais, which is one of the most deprived parts of Powys, and an entire ward in the hospital in Brecon. These are the consequences, it seems, of an Audit Commission's report of bad financial management. Do you think that it is acceptable that Powys patients should suffer due to poor financial management by Dyfed Powys Health Authority?

**The First Secretary:** I agree that patients should not suffer because of mismanagement by Dyfed Powys Health Authority. I do not want to commit an allocation of money on

the Labour Government in London, which leads to the high price of the pound, is mainly responsible for this crisis? Will the First Secretary accept my invitation as a new member of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee to visit dairy farmers in the west who see their businesses going to the wall because of the disastrous prices that they receive for their produce?

**The First Secretary:** I see that Elin is moving swiftly as a member of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. During the next two weeks, I will meet prominent national committee members and officials of both farming unions. I hope that I will be able to meet them face to face and hear from them how serious the agriculture crisis is in Wales, especially in the dairy sector. Despite that, I have also heard from leaders of the farming unions that they were not in favour of some of the demonstrations that took place. I believe that the dairy sector is split on the value of those demonstrations.

**Kirsty Williams:** Pe dychwelai Rhodri at bwnc iechyd gallwn ei oleuo ynghylch natur y cyfarfod y cyfeiriodd Nick Bourne ato, sef cyfarfod Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys y prynhawn yma i drafod ei drafferthion ariannol. Onid yw'n peri dychryn i chi fod yr awdurdod iechyd hwnnw'n mynnu arbedion o tua £4 miliwn gan Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Gofal Iechyd Powys? Gallai hynny arwain at golli 90 o welyau ysbyty ym Mhowys, gan gynnwys ward gyfan yn Ystradgynlais, sef un o'r rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Bowys, a ward gyfan yn yr ysbyty yn Aberhonddu. Ymddengys fod y rhain yn ganlyniadau i adroddiad gan y Comisiwn Archwilio am reolaeth ariannol wael. A gredwch ei bod yn dderbyniol i gleifion Powys ddioddef o ganlyniad i reolaeth ariannol wael gan Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cytunaf na ddylai cleifion ddioddef oherwydd camreoli gan Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys. Nid wyf am ymrwymo i ddyrannu arian ar ran y

behalf of the administration, or a refusal to accept certain cutbacks being negotiated between a health authority and health trust. If I did so, I would pre-empt resources that may be needed as much, if not more, by another health authority or a trust in the Dyfed Powys Health Authority area. That cannot be done standing at this lectern. In my response to Nick Bourne's question I highlighted the issue, which is how you allow for weighting the resource allocation formula to take account of sparsity, morbidity, mortality and social deprivation. I would not count Ystradgynlais as part of rural Wales, although it is in Powys.

**Lynne Neagle:** We already have a formula that takes full account of the needs of rural Wales, but it does not take account of deprivation or relative ill-health. Do you, therefore, agree that the real issue, if we are serious about tackling health inequalities, is to ensure that we have a formula that takes account of deprivation and ill-health and therefore delivers fair play for areas such as the Valleys?

**The First Secretary:** You have just clarified the point that I was trying to make to Kirsty. We could all stand up and make a plea on behalf of individual communities, or the whole of the areas that we represent, as being disadvantaged by the present formula. Somehow or other, Jane Hutt and her officials have to decide what is a fair formula and identify the differences in allocations received by individual health authorities, compared to what they would have received if we had continued with the present formula. Anyone who loses out in the new formula will come to the Assembly to riot. Anyone who gains will remain quiet and will probably not applaud our work. However, that is the nature of government. It involves tough choices.

### **Polisi Ewropeaidd (Sylwadau) European Policy (Representations)**

**Q4 David Melding:** Will the First Secretary outline what representations he has received regarding the administration's European policy since 1 January 2000? (OAQ4056)

weinyddiaeth, neu wrthod derbyn rhai toriadau a negodir rhwng awdurdod iechyd ac ymddiriedolaeth iechyd. Pe gwnawn hynny, byddwn yn rhagatal adnoddau y gallai fod yr un angen amdanynt, os nad mwy, gan awdurdod iechyd arall neu ymddiriedolaeth yn ardal Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys. Ni ellir gwneud hynny wrth sefyll wrth y darllenfwrdd hwn. Yn fy ymateb i gwestiwn Nick Bourne tynnais sylw at y mater, sef sut y gallwch bwysoli'r fformwla dyrannu adnoddau er mwyn rhoi ystyriaeth i deneurwydd poblogaeth, afiachusrwydd, marwolaeth ac amddifadedd cymdeithasol. Nid ystyriwn Ystradgynlais yn rhan o gefn gwlad Cymru er ei bod ym Mhowys.

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae gennym fformwla sydd yn rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i anghenion cefn gwlad Cymru eisoes, ond nid yw'n cymryd amddifadedd nac iechyd gwael cymharol i ystyriaeth. Agytunwch, felly, mai'r mater gwirioneddol, os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd, yw sicrhau bod gennym fformwla sydd yn cymryd amddifadedd a iechyd gwael i ystyriaeth ac felly'n sicrhau chwarae teg i ardaloedd fel y Cymoedd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr ydych newydd egluro'r pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio ei gyfleu i Kirsty. Gallem oll sefyll ac apelio ar ran cymunedau unigol, neu'r cyfan o'r ardaloedd a gynrychiolwn, eu bod o dan anfantais o dan y fformwla bresennol. Rywsut neu'i gilydd, rhaid i Jane Hutt a'i swyddogion benderfynu ar yr hyn sydd yn fformwla deg a dynodi'r gwahaniaethau yn y dyraniadau a dderbynnir gan awdurdodau iechyd unigol, o'u cymharu â'r hyn a dderbynient pe baem wedi parhau â'r fformwla bresennol. Bydd rhywun sydd ar ei golled o dan y fformwla newydd yn dod i'r Cynulliad i gadw twrw. Bydd rhywun sydd ar ei ennill yn cadw'n ddistaw ac nid yn canmol ein gwaith, yn ôl pob tebyg. Fodd bynnag, peth felly yw llywodraeth. Mae'n golygu gwneud dewisiadau anodd.

**C4 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd ddisgrifio'r sylwadau a dderbyniodd ynghylch polisi Ewropeaidd y weinyddiaeth ers 1 Ionawr 2000?

(OAQ4056)

**The First Secretary:** My predecessor and I have received several representations since 1 January 2000 about the Assembly's European policy. I am happy to write to the Member with details of these if he will indicate in which European policy area he is interested.

**David Melding:** Will the First Secretary overturn the decision of his predecessor and commission a study into the likely effects on Wales were the UK to join the single European currency?

**The First Secretary:** We must be aware of what has been devolved to the Assembly and what has not. If we decide to run a parallel government in exile, as it were, on all the issues that have not been devolved to the Assembly, we could spend a vast sum of money on consultants to look into this, that and the other. For example, how big an army we should have, whether the Child Support Agency should be abolished, what should be done about social security, as well as the issues to which the honourable Member refers. I am not sure that that would be a wise use of Assembly resources. We should stop trying to mark out the pitch and get on with the game.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. David Melding is honourable but he is not an honourable Member in this Chamber.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Rhodri yn derbyn bod llawer o'r fframwaith cyfreithiol sydd yn effeithio arnom yn y Cynulliad yn deillio o Ewrop. Mae'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd yn delio â llawer o gyfarwydddebau Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes mecanwaith o fewn y Cynulliad i edrych ar y cyfarwydddebau hyn yn fanwl. Mae gennym Bwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ond nid yw'r Pwyllgor hwnnw yn edrych ar hyn ar hyn o bryd.

A all y Prif Ysgrifennydd ystyried sut y gellir cael mwy o amser yn y Cynulliad i edrych ar y fframwaith hwnnw, gan fod nifer o'r rheoliadau sydd gerbron y Cynulliad yn

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae fy rhagflaenydd a minnau wedi derbyn nifer o sylwadau ers 1 Ionawr 2000 ynghylch polisi Ewropeaidd y Cynulliad. Byddaf yn falch o ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gan roi manylion y rhain os bydd gystal â nodi ym mha faes polisi Ewropeaidd y mae ei ddiddordeb.

**David Melding:** A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn fodlon gwrthdroi penderfyniad ei ragflaenydd a chomisiynu astudiaeth ar yr effeithiau tebygol ar Gymru pe bai'r DU yn ymuno â'r arian sengl Ewropeaidd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad a'r hyn na ddatganolwyd. Os penderfynwn redeg llywodraeth gyfochrog alltud, fel petai, ar yr holl faterion na ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad, gallem wario swm enfawr o arian ar ymgynghorwyr i ymchwilio i hyn, y llall ac arall. Er enghraifft, byddin o ba faint y dylem ei chael, a ddylid diddymu'r Asiantaeth Cynnal Plant, beth y dylid ei wneud ynghylch nawdd cymdeithasol, yn ogystal â'r materion y cyfeiria'r Aelod anrhydeddus atynt. Nid wyf yn sicr a fyddai hynny'n ddefnydd doeth ar adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Dylem roi'r gorau i geisio marcio'r cae a mynd ymlaen â'r gêm.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae David Melding yn anrhydeddus ond nid yw'n Aelod anrhydeddus yn y Siambr hon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sure that Rhodri accepts that much of the legal framework that affects us in the Assembly emanates from Europe. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and the Local Government and Environment Committee deal with many European directives. However, there is no mechanism within the Assembly to scrutinise these directives in detail. We have a Committee on European Affairs but that Committee is not scrutinising this at the moment.

Can the First Secretary consider how we could have more time in the Assembly to examine that framework, as several of the regulations before the Assembly emanate



deillio o Ewrop?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cyn belled ag y deallaf ganllawiau'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc, dyletswydd y Pwyllgor yw penderfynu a yw unrhyw reol newydd o Ewrop yn berthnasol, yn amserol ac yn bwysig. Mae'r Pwyllgor Pwnc wedyn i fod i ofyn cyngor ac ystyried y pwnc neu'r ddeddf newydd.

Nid dyletswydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yw hynny. Trafodwyd yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor—yn dilyn cais gan Phil Williams—a ddylid trosglwyddo'r dyletswydd o'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd. Penderfynwyd na fyddai hynny'n ddoeth. Fodd bynnag, os oes angen, yr wyf yn agored i adolygu hyn.

#### **Newid Fformat Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd Changing the Format of Questions to the First Secretary**

**C5 Dafydd Wigley:** A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd wedi ystyried newid fformat cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd? (OAQ4045)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nac ydwyf. Ni ystyriais newid y fformat, ond yr wyf yn hapus i ateb cwestiynau ar unrhyw faterion perthnasol lle mae elfen o gyfrifoldeb gennyf yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd. Os yw Dafydd neu'r Cynulliad am newid y patrwm presennol a etifeddasom gan Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn ein bodolaeth, yr wyf yn hapus i dderbyn unrhyw argymhellad.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Meddyliais fy mod yn curo ar ddrws agored o nodi araith Rhodri i'r Sefydliad Materion Cymreig ar 14 Chwefror pan ddywedodd ei fod wedi meddwl droeon tybed pam nad oedd cwestiynau agored yn y Cynulliad i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd. Awgrymaf fod y Cynulliad yn edrych ar fodel Senedd yr Alban i'n sicrhau ei bod yn bosibl gofyn cwestiynau cyfoes a pherthnasol ar y diwrnod y'i hatebir yn hytrach na gorfod ceisio eu gwthio i fframwaith cwestiynau sydd weithiau yn amherthnasol. Byddai hynny yn sicrhau atebion i'r cyhoedd a'r cyfryngau ar bynciau o bwys iddynt hwy, a hynny mewn ffordd agored.

from Europe?

**The First Secretary:** As far as I understand the guidelines of the Subject Committees, it is the Committee's duty to decide whether any new European regulation is relevant, timely and important. The Subject Committee should then ask for advice and consider the new subject or law.

That is not the Committee on European Affairs' duty. We discussed at the Committee's last meeting—following a request from Phil Williams—whether the duty should be transferred from the Subject Committees to the Committee on European Affairs. We decided that that would not be wise. However, if need be, I am open to reviewing this.

**Q5 Dafydd Wigley:** Has the First Secretary considered changing the format of questions to the First Secretary? (OAQ4045)

**The First Secretary:** No. I have not considered changing the format, but I am happy to answer questions on any relevant issues where I have an element of responsibility during questions to the First Secretary. If Dafydd or the Assembly wish to change the present pattern that we inherited from the National Assembly Advisory Group before we came into existence, I am happy to accept any recommendation.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I thought that I was knocking at an open door given Rhodri's speech to the Institute for Welsh Affairs on 14 February when he said that he had often wondered why there were no open questions in the Assembly to the First Secretary. I suggest that the Assembly looks at the Scottish Parliament model to assure ourselves that it is possible to ask contemporary and relevant questions on the day on which they are answered rather than trying to push them into a questions framework that is sometimes irrelevant. That would ensure that answers are given to the public and the media on subjects that are important to them, and given

in an open way.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i'r egwyddor honno. Fodd bynnag, wrth ystyried a ddylem newid yn sylweddol batrwm cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd, ni ddylem feddwl bod popeth yn iawn yn yr Alban oherwydd nad ydym yn gweithredu yn yr un modd—mae'r glaswellt yn lasach ar yr ochr arall bob tro. Cyn belled ag y clywaf, nid yw'r Alban yn hapus gyda'i phatrwm ychwaith. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn agored i syniadau oddi wrth fwyafrif y Cynulliad ar adolygu cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd oherwydd derbyniaf ein bod wedi etifeddu patrwm gan Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr oedd y grŵp, o bosibl, yn rhy barod i feddwl y dylai'r Cynulliad weithredu'n groes i San Steffan, er y dylem, efallai, weithredu'n debyg i San Steffan ambell waith. Os oes mwyafrif eisiau cwestiynau agored nid oes gennyf wrthwynebiad.

**Michael German:** I wonder what your views are on what happens in Westminster and on the sort of open questions to the Secretary of State that ask what he had for breakfast and then move on to an entirely different subject. We have one week in which to table questions in advance. There are bound to be issues of the day that are of concern to all Members. It would be sensible to try to address the immediate issues in a way that is not so contrived as to appear to mimic Westminster and not so contrived as to force us to work through the patterns that we have before us. Perhaps you and others could look at that.

2:40 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** I sympathise with the National Assembly Advisory Group's view that there is an element of farce about the procedure of Prime Minister's question time at Westminster. In order to ask an open question you must go through the rigmarole of asking what the Prime Minister's engagements are. When you have heard 'I refer the Honourable Member to the answer that I gave a few moment ago' 15 times during Prime Minister's question time between 3.00 p.m. and 3.30 p.m., it makes

**The First Secretary:** I have no objection to that principle. However, when considering whether we should substantially change the pattern of questions to the First Secretary, we should not think that everything is fine in Scotland just because we do not operate in the same way—the grass is always greener on the other side. As far as I hear, Scotland is not happy with its pattern either. However, I am open to ideas from the majority of the Assembly on reviewing questions to the First Secretary because I accept that we inherited a pattern from NAAG. The group, possibly, was prone to believe that the Assembly should act contrary to Westminster, although we should, perhaps, sometimes act as Westminster does. If a majority wants open questions I have no objection.

**Michael German:** Beth yw'ch barn, tybed, am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn San Steffan ac am y math o gwestiynau agored i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol sydd yn gofyn am yr hyn a gafodd i'w frecwest ac wedyn yn symud ymlaen at bwnc cwbl wahanol. Mae gennym un wythnos ymlaen llaw i gyflwyno cwestiynau. Mae'n sicr y ceir materion ar y diwrnod sydd o bwys i'r holl Aelodau. Byddai'n synhwyrol ceisio ymdrin â'r materion cyfoes mewn modd nad yw mor annaturiol fel yr ymddengys ei fod yn dynwared San Steffan ac nid mor annaturiol fel y'n gorfodir i weithio drwy'r patrymau sydd gennym o'n blaen. Efallai y gallech chi ac eraill ystyried hynny.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cydymdeimlaf â barn Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod elfen o ffars ynghylch trefn sesiwn cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog yn San Steffan. Er mwyn gofyn cwestiwn agored rhaid ichi fynd drwy'r rigmarôl o holi ynghylch ymrwymadau'r Prif Weinidog. Pan glywsoch 'cyfeiriaf yr Aelod Anrhydeddus at yr ateb a roddais ychydig eiliadau'n ôl' 15 gwaith yn ystod sesiwn cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog rhwng 3.00 p.m. a 3.30 p.m., mae'n peri ichi feddwl bod ffordd well yn

you think that there must be a better way. If there is a way of achieving the openness of Westminster without the element of farce and the rigmarole of having to ask what the Prime Minister's engagements are for the day, I would be fairly willing to consider that sympathetically.

siŵr o fod ar gael. Os oes modd sicrhau'r dull agored a geir yn San Steffan heb yr elfen o ffars a'r rigmarôl o orfod gofyn beth yw ymrwymadau'r Prif Weinidog y diwrnod hwnnw, byddwn yn eithaf parod i ystyried hynny â chydymdeimlad.

### **Dogfen Raglennu Sengl (Datblygu Cefn Gwlad) Single Programming Document (Rural Development)**

**C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pam nad oedd datblygu cefn gwlad yn flaenoriaeth benodol yn nrafft gwreiddiol y ddogfen raglennu sengl? (OAQ4059)

**Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Why was a specific priority for rural development not included in the original draft of the single programming document? (OAQ4059)

Wrth edrych yn ôl, a yw Rhodri yn edifar na ddigwyddodd hynny yn wreiddiol?

With hindsight, does Rhodri regret that that did not happen originally?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a wyf yn edifar am hyn, gan nad oeddwn yn gyfrifol am y mater ar y pryd. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ystyr y cwestiwn hwn. Syniad y bartneriaeth a'r swyddogion yn y tasglu oedd gwau materion gwledig drwy'r ddogfen i gyd yn hytrach na'u neilltuo mewn geto ar wahân. Mae'r ddadl ynglŷn â chwestiynau megis faint o flaenoriaeth y dylai materion cefn gwlad ei chael yn un barhaus. A ddylai'r materion hyn redeg drwy'r mesurau i gyd neu a ddylent gael eu hystyried ar wahân? Gwnaeth y bartneriaeth ei phenderfyniad. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem yn gwrthwynebu pe bai penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i roi blaenoriaeth benodol i faterion gwledig. Efallai mai dyna a fydd yn digwydd. Caiff y Cynulliad gyfle arall i ystyried fersiwn derfynol y ddogfen raglennu sengl a fydd yn sail i'n gwariant o Ewrop dros y saith mlynedd nesaf.

**The First Secretary:** I am not sure whether I regret that, since I was not responsible for the matter at the time. I am not sure what this question means. It was the partnership's and the taskforce officials' idea to weave rural issues through the whole document rather than set them apart in a separate ghetto. The debate about questions such as how much priority should be given to rural issues is a continuing one. Should these matters run through all the measures or should they be considered separately? The partnership made its decision. However, we would not object if a decision were made with the European Commission to give a specific priority to rural matters. Perhaps that is what will happen. The Assembly will have another opportunity to consider the final version of the single programming document, which will be the basis of our expenditure from Europe over the next seven years.

**Y Llywydd:** Rhodri Glyn, gan dy fod wedi ychwanegu at y cwestiwn gwreiddiol, cymeraf dy fod eisoes wedi gofyn dy gwestiwn atodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Rhodri Glyn, as you added to the original question, I take it that you have already asked your supplementary question.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nac ydwyf. Yr oedd hwnnw'n rhan o'm cwestiwn gwreiddiol. Dim ond gofyn am eglurhad ar fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol a wneuthum.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** No. That was part of my original question. I only asked for an explanation on my original question.

**Y Llywydd:** Caniataf gwestiwn atodol byr.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will allow a short supplementary question.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A yw Rhodri yn

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Does Rhodri accept

derbyn bod y ffaith nad oedd y targedau cefn gwlad yn glir o'r cychwyn wedi creu problemau? Yn fy etholaeth i, bu'r cyngor sir a'r sector gwirfoddol yn flaengar yn eu hymateb. Nid yw'r sector preifat yn sicr sut y gall gyflwyno prosiectau ar gyfer arian Amcan 1. A yw Rhodri'n derbyn bod y diffyg eglurder ynglŷn â'r targedau yng nghefn gwlad wedi cyfrannu at y broses honno?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn derbyn bod gwahaniaeth barn rhwng y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a ninnau ynglŷn â sut i ddehongli a blaenoriaethu'r cwestiwn gwledig o fewn yr ardal Amcan 1. A ddylem ei gymryd fel mater ar wahân neu fel thema sydd yn gwau drwy'r holl ddogfen? Nid wyf yn siŵr bod hyd yn oed y swyddogion perthnasol yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd o'r un farn. Credaf i'r Aelodau o bob un o bedair plaid y Cynulliad, a oedd yn y cyfarfod gyda'r swyddogion hynny, weld y gwahaniaeth barn ymhlith swyddogion Ewrop ynglŷn â sut i ymdrin â'r pwnc. Cawn yr hawl i ystyried y fersiwn derfynol a phenderfynu a ddylid rhoi blaenoriaeth ar wahân i faterion gwledig yn hytrach na'u gwau drwy'r ddogfen, fel yr awgrymodd Rhodri.

**Peter Black:** We are anxious that this document is approved as soon as possible and that we get on with implementing the Objective 1 programme. Can you give us an assurance that it will be approved by 1 April, which is the deadline that has been set?

**The First Secretary:** I can only repeat what we were told in Brussels. Phil Williams, Val, Nick Bourne and myself attended meetings on 2 and 3 March, at which we were assured that, in all likelihood—you can never give an absolute guarantee—it would be signed off by the end of this month. In terms of the Assembly's consideration of it, there will be one further debate in the Economic Development Committee at the end of the month and one further debate in Plenary in early April.

that the fact that the targets in rural areas were not clear from the beginning has caused problems? In my constituency, the county council and the voluntary sector have been innovative in their response. The private sector is not sure how it can produce projects for Objective 1 funds. Does Rhodri accept that the lack of clarity on targets in rural areas has contributed to that process?

**The First Secretary:** I accept that there is a difference of opinion between the European Commission and ourselves about how to interpret and prioritise the rural question within the Objective 1 area. Should we take it as a separate issue or as a theme that weaves through the whole document? I am not sure that even the relevant officials in the European Commission are of the same opinion. I believe that Members from each of the Assembly's four parties, who were at the meeting with those officials, saw the difference of opinion among European officials on how to deal with the issue. We will have the right to consider the final version and decide whether rural issues should be given separate priority rather than be woven through the document, as Rhodri suggested.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydym yn awyddus i'r ddogfen hon gael ei chymeradwyo cyn gynted ag y bo modd ac inni fynd ymlaen i roi'r rhaglen Amcan 1 ar waith. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y caiff ei chymeradwyo erbyn 1 Ebrill, sef y dyddiad cwblhau a bennwyd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthym ym Mrwsel. Mynychodd Phil Williams, Val, Nick Bourne a minnau gyfarfodydd ar 2 a 3 Mawrth, lle y rhoddwyd sicrwydd i ni y câi sêl bendith, yn ôl pob tebyg—ni allwch byth roi sicrwydd llwyr—erbyn diwedd y mis hwn. O ran yr ystyriaeth a roddir iddi gan y Cynulliad, bydd un ddadl bellach yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddiwedd y mis ac un ddadl bellach yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn gynnar yn Ebrill.

## **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Cynog Dafis:** Pwynt o drefn. Mewn perthynas â sylwadau Rhodri Morgan ynglŷn â'n sgwrs yr wythnos diwethaf, yr wyf am egluro ystyr yr hyn a ddywedais. Yr oedd y pwynt a wneuthum yn wahanol i'r cwestiwn technegol ynglŷn â pha un ai yw'r cyfrifoldeb dros delerau mynd drwy'r trothwy perfformiad wedi cael ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad, pa un ai y dylai gael ei drosglwyddo neu pa un ai oes modd gwneud hynny yn awr.

**Cynog Dafis:** Point of order. In relation to Rhodri Morgan's comments about our conversation last week, I wish to clarify the meaning of what I said. The point that I made was different to the technical question about whether the responsibility for the terms for crossing the performance threshold has been transferred to the Assembly, whether it should be transferred or whether it is possible to do that now.

Fy mhwynt oedd y byddai'n berffaith bosibl i David Blunkett lunio rheoliadau gwahanol i Gymru a Lloegr, gyda chanllawiau gwahanol yn y ddwy wlad fel nad yw cysylltu tâl athrawon â pherfformiad disgyblion yn weithredol yng Nghymru. Y cwestiwn yw a yw Rhodri Morgan, fel Prif Ysgrifennydd, yn fodlon pwysu ar David Blunkett i weithredu felly er mwyn parchu barn unfrydol pobl Cymru ac ewyllys y Cynulliad.

My point was that it would be perfectly possible for David Blunkett to draw up different regulations for Wales and England, with different guidelines in both countries so that linking teachers' pay to pupils' performance is not implemented in Wales. The question is whether Rhodri Morgan, as First Secretary, is willing to urge David Blunkett to act in that manner to respect the unanimous view of the people of Wales and the Assembly's will.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hynny'n bwynt o drefn, fel y gŵyr Cynog yn iawn. Mae'n dilyn hen draddodiad San Steffan o ymestyn cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog drwy bwyntiau o drefn. Ni fwriadaf i'r arfer drwg hwnnw gael ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad, felly symudwn ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae Cynog wedi cofnodi ei bwynt.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is not a point of order, as Cynog well knows. It follows the old Westminster tradition of extending Prime Minister's question time through points of order. I do not intend for that bad habit to be transferred to the Assembly, so we will proceed. However, Cynog has put his point on record.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** This is the next three weeks' Plenary business statement. Next Tuesday, 21 March, I will make a statement on the next three months' timetable of Plenary meetings, times available for Committee meetings, meetings of political groups and recess times. Business will also include motions to approve the following items of subordinate legislation: the Health Act 1999 Commencement (No 2) Order 2000 and the Health Act 1999 (Fundholding Practices) (Transfer of Assets, Savings, Rights and Liabilities and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2000. I have scheduled time for the Assembly to

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Hwn yw datganiad busnes y Cyfarfod Llawn am y tair wythnos nesaf. Ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 21 Mawrth, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad ar amserlen y Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn y tri mis nesaf, yr amseroedd sydd ar gael ar gyfer cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor, cyfarfodydd grwpiau gwleidyddol ac amseroedd y toriadau. Bydd y busnes hefyd yn cynnwys cynigion i gymeradwyo'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth: Gorchymyn Dechrau'r Ddeddf Iechyd 1999 (Rhif 2) 2000 a Gorchymyn y Ddeddf Iechyd 1999 (Practisiau â Chronfa) (Trosglwyddo Asedau, Arbedion, Hawliau ac Atebolrwydd a

consider Orders being made under the urgency procedure. Business on 22 March is as I reported last week but with one amendment. I have deferred the debate on museums policy until later in the session, to discuss more fully the items of subordinate legislation scheduled. That was agreed in the Business Committee meeting this morning.

On Tuesday 28 March, there will be a debate on the Assembly's strategic plan, 'A Better Wales' and business will also include motions to approve the following items of subordinate legislation: the Electricity Supply (Rateable Values) (Wales) Order 2000, the Town and Country Planning (Blight Provisions) (Wales) Order 2000 and the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2000. As discussed in the Business Committee meeting this morning, the debate on the Health and Social Services Committee progress report has been deferred until 4 April to allow time for the Assembly to fully debate the 'A Better Wales' strategic plan and to consider the items of subordinate legislation. On Wednesday 29 March, there will be two debates on motions proposed by Plaid Cymru and the Conservative Party, and a motion to delegate the functions of the Welfare and Pensions Act 1999.

On Tuesday 4 April, there will be a debate on the Pre-16 Education Committee's interim report on early years provision for three-year-olds and the deferred debate on the Health and Social Services Committee report. On Wednesday 5 April, business will include a debate on the voluntary sector scheme.

Finally, following the Business Committee meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer has, on the advice of the Committee, determined that the following items of subordinate legislation should not be referred to a Subject Committee: the Town and Country Planning (Blight Provisions) (Wales) Order 2000, the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2000 and the Electricity Supply Industry (Rateable Value) (Wales) Order

Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2000. Yr wyf wedi neilltuo amser i'r Cynulliad ystyried Gorchmynion a wneir o dan yr weithdrefn frys. Bydd y busnes ar 22 Mawrth fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf ond gydag un newid. Gohiriais y ddadl ar bolisi amgueddfeydd hyd yn ddiweddarach yn y sesiwn, er mwyn trafod yn fanylach yr eitemau o is-ddeddfwriaeth a amserlennwyd. Cytunwyd ar hynny yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma.

Ddydd Mawrth 28 Mawrth, bydd dadl ar gynllun strategol y Cynulliad, 'Gwell Cymru' a bydd y busnes hefyd yn cynnwys cynigion i gymeradwyo'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth: Gorchymyn y Cyflenwad Trydan (Gwerthoedd Ardrethol) (Cymru) 2000, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Darpariaethau Malltod) (Cymru) 2000 a Gorchymyn Treth y Cyngor (Atebolrwydd dros Berchnogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000. Fel y trafodwyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, gohiriwyd y ddadl ar adroddiad cynnydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hyd 4 Ebrill er mwyn caniatáu amser i'r Cynulliad drafod cynllun strategol 'Gwell Cymru' yn llawn ac i ystyried yr eitemau o is-ddeddfwriaeth. Ddydd Mercher 29 Mawrth, bydd dwy ddadl ar gynigion a gynigir gan Blaid Cymru a'r Blaid Geidwadol, a chynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Deddf Lles a Phensiynau 1999.

Ddydd Mawrth 4 Ebrill, bydd dadl ar adroddiad dros dro'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ar ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar ar gyfer rhai tair mlwydd oed a'r ddadl a ohiriwyd ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Ddydd Mercher 5 Ebrill, bydd y busnes yn cynnwys dadl ar gynllun y sector gwirfoddol.

Yn olaf, ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, yn unol â chyngor y Pwyllgor, na ddylid cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i Bwyllgor Pwnc: Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Darpariaethau Malltod) (Cymru) 2000, Gorchymyn Treth y Cyngor (Atebolrwydd dros Berchnogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000 a Gorchymyn y Diwydiant Cyflenwi Trydan (Gwerth Ardrethol) (Cymru) 2000. Gwneir trefniadau

2000. Arrangements will be made to post this statement on the internet and intranet after Plenary today.

i osod y datganiad hwn ar y rhyngwrwd a'r fewnrwyd ar ôl y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

*Business statement adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.*

2:50 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ardrethi a Phraeseptau (Addasiadau Terfynol)  
(Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000**  
**Approval of the Rates and Precepts (Final Adjustments) (Amendment) (Wales)  
Order 2000**

**The Secretary for Local Government and Housing (Peter Law):** I propose that

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai (Peter Law):** Cynigiaf fod

*the Assembly*

*y Cynulliad*

*(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Order 'The Rates and Precepts (Final Adjustments) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2000' laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2000;*

*(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft 'Gorchymyn Ardrethi a Phraeseptau (Addasiadau Terfynol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2000;*

*(b) considers the principle of the Order; and*

*(b) yn ystyried egwyddor y Gorchymyn; ac*

*(c) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in Table Office on 10 February 2000.*

*(c) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r fersiwn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2000.*

This Order is technical and aims to tidy up legislation that has served its purpose. The Order provides for an end date to financial adjustments between certain bodies which, at the start of the financial year 1989-90, were precept bodies and rating authorities. The financial adjustments relate to amounts found to be recoverable or refunded on or after 1 April 1990, which were attributable to rates for a period ending before that date and to associated administrative expenses. This Order amends the Rates and Precepts (Final Adjustments) Order 1991. In Wales, the only adjustments that can still be made under the 1991 Order relate to the abolished counties and districts whose areas were split on local government reorganisation in 1996. Under the provisions of the draft Order 1999-2000, this will be the last financial year when late rating adjustment claims can be made, with an end date of 31 March 2001 for settling

Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn dechnegol ac yn ceisio tacluso deddfwriaeth a gyflawnodd ei phwrpas. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn darparu ar gyfer dyddiad terfyn ar addasiadau ariannol rhwng rhai cyrff a oedd, ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol 1989-90, yn gyrff praesept ac yn awdurdodau ardreth. Mae'r addasiadau ariannol yn ymwneud â symiau y cafwyd eu bod yn adferadwy neu a adalwyd ar neu ar ôl 1 Ebrill 1990, y gellid eu priodoli i ardrethi am gyfnod a ddaeth i ben cyn y dyddiad hwnnw ac i dreuliau gweinyddol cysylltiedig. Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn diwygio'r Gorchymyn Ardrethi a Phraeseptau (Addasiadau Terfynol) 1991. Yng Nghymru, mae'r unig addasiadau y gellir eu gwneud o hyd o dan Orchymyn 1991 yn ymwneud â'r siroedd a'r dosbarthau a ddiddymwyd y cafodd eu hardaloedd eu rhannu pan ad-drefnwyd llywodraeth leol yn 1996. O dan ddarpariaethau'r Gorchymyn

such claims. I commend the motion.

drafft 1999-2000, hon fydd y flwyddyn ariannol olaf pan ellir gwneud hawliadau addasu ardrethi hwyr, gyda dyddiad terfyn o 31 Mawrth 2001 ar gyfer setlo hawliadau o'r fath. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig.

**Owen John Thomas:** Hoffwn gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Owen John Thomas:** I support the motion.

**David Davies:** I accept that this Order is a bit of legislative tidying up, and that it is not contentious in any way. However, I am concerned about how the Legislation Committee report was set up. Peter Law explained the Order extremely well, but the Legislation Committee report states,

**David Davies:** Derbynïaf mai mymryn o dacluso deddfwriaethol yw'r Gorchymyn hwn, ac nad yw'n ddadleuol o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y modd y cyflwynwyd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau. Eglurodd Peter Law y Gorchymyn yn dda iawn, ond dywed adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau,

'The Memorandum to the Business Committee explains that these final adjustments relate to amounts found to be recoverable or refunded on or after 1 April 1990 which were attributable to rates for a period ending before that date and to associated administrative expenses'.

'Mae'r Memorandwm i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn esbonio bod yr addasiadau terfynol hyn yn cyfeirio at symiau y cafwyd eu bod i'w hadennill neu i'w had-dalu ar 1 Ebrill 1990 neu ar ôl hynny ac a oedd i'w priodoli i'r ardrethi am gyfnod yn dod i ben cyn y dyddiad hwnnw ac i'r costau gweinyddol perthynol'.

Whoever wrote this has watched too many episodes of *Yes Minister*. They were no doubt hoping that Members would read this, nod sagely and allow it to be pushed through, without admitting that they found it hard to understand. I speak in plain English and dabble occasionally in Welsh. While Welsh is said to be a hard language to master, I have found mastering *treigladau*, mutations, a lot easier than mastering the sort of language used in documents such as this. While we will support this motion, can the First Secretary, who is committed to openness and transparency, ask whoever writes these explanatory documents to make them a little clearer for those of us who have not spent our working lives in the civil service?

Mae'r sawl a ysgrifennodd hyn wedi gwyllo gormod o benodau o *Yes Minister*. Mae'n siŵr eu bod yn gobeithio y byddai'r Aelodau'n darllen hyn, yn nodio'n ddoeth ac yn caniatáu ei wthio drwodd, heb gyfaddef eu bod wedi ei gael yn anodd ei ddeall. Siaradaf mewn Saesneg croyw ac ymhelaif weithiau â'r Gymraeg. Er y dywedir bod y Gymraeg yn iaith anodd ei meistroli, cefais fod meistroli'r treigladau'n haws o lawer na meistroli'r math o iaith a arferir mewn dogfennau fel hon. Er y byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, a all y Prif Ysgrifennydd, sydd wedi ymrwymo i fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, ofyn i bwy bynnag sydd yn ysgrifennu'r dogfennau eglurhaol hyn eu gwneud ychydig yn eglurach i'r rhai ohonom na threuliasom ein bywyd gwaith yn y gwasanaeth sifil?

**Michael German:** The Legislation Committee report on the web page in front of David is in very plain English. The legislation before the Legislation Committee so far, as David will probably know, has come directly from London. You would therefore have to go to Westminster to find the person who wrote this. We have not yet

**Michael German:** Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ar y dudalen we o flaen David mewn Saesneg croyw iawn. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth a ddaeth gerbron y Pwyllgor Deddfau hyd yn hyn, fel y gŵyr David yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi dod yn uniongyrchol o Lundain. Felly byddai'n rhaid ichi fynd i San Steffan i ddod o hyd i'r sawl a ysgrifennodd



written one single piece of legislation ourselves. The Legislation Committee has taken the strongest of views and we are fortunate to have John Marek as a member of the Committee as he is also a member of the tax law re-write steering committee in Westminster, which is responsible for finding plain English for difficult decisions. I have no doubt that, when we write Welsh legislation, it will be in plain English and Welsh. It is a matter of concern, but as all the legislation comes from London, to ask for it to be re-written in sensible language would mean sending it back to the House of Commons. We do not have the resource to re-write Westminster legislation.

**Alun Michael:** It is worth remembering that this has a legal implication. It is important that there is precision in the law. That applies to both subsidiary and primary legislation. Those of us who have spent time working on pieces of legislation have often discovered that the intentions of what seems to be plain English can be perverse in terms of the legal implications. You have experienced that, Llywydd, as have others here.

When the Assembly began publishing pieces of secondary legislation, I sought to have an introduction, which would be a plain English translation of the legal words and not part of the document. However, we were advised that care had to be taken even with that plain English translation, because if we inadvertently misled people as to the contents of the legislation, it would be bad for the Assembly and in terms of possibly prejudicing people's interpretation of the law. Therefore, while I applaud and agree with Michael German's sentiment that we should try to use the simplest possible language, it must also be precise. We should be careful that, in the search for plain language, we do not inadvertently produce language that does not fit with the primary legislation or is misleading as to its consequences, which could lead us and those who depend on the precision of the law into expensive litigation and down all sorts of legal avenues. I am sure that David Davies would not want that.

hyn. Hyd yn hyn nid ysgrifenasom yr un darn o ddeddfwriaeth ein hunain. Mae'r Pwyllgor Deddfau wedi cymryd y safbwynt cryfaf posibl ac yr ydym yn ffodus o gael John Marek yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor gan ei fod hefyd yn aelod o'r pwyllgor llywio ar ailysgrifennu cyfraith trethi yn San Steffan, sydd yn gyfrifol am ganfod Saesneg croyw ar gyfer penderfyniadau anodd. Yr wyf yn sicr, pan ysgrifennwn ddeddfwriaeth Gymreig, y bydd mewn Cymraeg a Saesneg croyw. Mae'n fater sydd yn peri pryder, ond gan fod yr holl ddeddfwriaeth yn dod o Lundain, byddai gofyn am ei hailysgrifennu mewn iaith synhwyrol yn golygu ei hanfon yn ôl i Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Nid oes gennym mo'r adnodd i ailysgrifennu deddfwriaeth San Steffan.

**Alun Michael:** Mae'n werth cofio bod oblygiad cyfreithiol i hyn. Mae'n bwysig bod manwl gywirdeb yn y gyfraith. Mae hynny'n wir am is-ddeddfwriaeth a deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Mae'r rhai ohonom a dreuliodd amser yn gweithio ar ddarnau o ddeddfwriaeth wedi darganfod yn aml y gall bwriadau'r hyn yr ymddengys ei fod yn Saesneg croyw fod yn wrthnysig o ran yr oblygiadau cyfreithiol. Profasoch chi hynny, Llywydd, fel y gwnaeth eraill yma.

Pan ddechreuodd y Cynulliad gyhoeddi darnau o ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd, ceisiais gael rhagarweiniad, a fyddai'n drosiad mewn Saesneg croyw o'r geiriau cyfreithiol ac nid yn rhan o'r ddogfen. Fodd bynnag, fe'n cynghorwyd bod rhaid wrth ofal hyd yn oed gyda'r trosiad hwnnw mewn Saesneg croyw, oherwydd os byddem yn camarwain pobl drwy amryfusedd ynghylch cynnwys y ddeddfwriaeth, byddai'n ddrwg i'r Cynulliad ac o ran rhagfarnu dehongliad pobl o'r gyfraith o bosibl. Felly, er fy mod yn cymeradwyo ac yn cytuno â barn Michael German y dylem geisio defnyddio'r iaith symlaf bosibl, rhaid iddi hefyd fod yn fanwl gywir. Dylem fod yn ofalus, wrth chwilio am iaith groyw, nad ydym drwy amryfusedd yn llunio iaith nad yw'n cydweddu â'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol neu sydd yn gamarweiniol o ran ei chanlyniadau, a allai ein harwain ni a'r rhai sydd yn dibynnu ar fanwl gywirdeb y gyfraith i gyfreithio drud ac i lawr pob math o lwybrau cyfreithiol. Yr wyf yn sicr na fyddai David Davies yn dymuno hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pwynt o wybodaeth.

**Owen John Thomas:** Point of information.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes y fath beth â phwynt o wybodaeth, ac yr ydych wedi gwneud araith yn barod.

**The Presiding Officer:** Points of information do not exist, and you have already made a speech.

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid wyf am wneud araith. Yr wyf am ddweud wrth David, pe bai wedi trafferthu i edrych, y byddai wedi dod o hyd i esboniad syml yn y Llyfrgell. Dyna pam y mynegais fy nghefnogaeth mor syml yn gynharach.

**Owen John Thomas:** I do not want to make a speech. I want to tell David that, had he bothered to look, he would have found a simple explanation in the Library. That is why I expressed my support so simply earlier.

**Peter Law:** Only a technical point has been raised in response to the motion. I am grateful to the Legislation Committee for how it deals with matters. I have to send many pieces of legislation through that Committee and it deals with them supportively and efficiently. I am surprised that it took you so long to raise the matter, David. It has been 10 months. These are not the first Orders we have had; we have had them month after month and I have been responsible for many of them. However, if you cannot criticise the subject of the document, I suppose you must criticise the advisory note. It is important that Members support this motion.

**Peter Law:** Dim ond pwynt technegol a godwyd mewn ymateb i'r cynnig. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau am y modd y mae'n ymdrin â materion. Yr wyf yn gorfod anfon llawer o ddeddfau drwy'r Pwyllgor hwnnw ac mae'n ymdrin â hwy'n gefnogol ac yn effeithlon. Synnaf ichi fod cyn hwyed cyn codi'r mater, David. Aeth 10 mis heibio. Nid y rhain yw'r Gorchmynion cyntaf a gawsom; fe'u cawsom fis ar ôl mis a bûm i'n gyfrifol am lawer ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, os na allwch feirniadu pwnc y ddogfen, cymeraf fod rhaid ichi feirniadu'r nodyn hysbysu. Mae'n bwysig i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Michael, Alun  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

3:00 p.m.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd The Economic Development Committee Report**

**Val Feld:** I propose that

**Val Feld:** Cynigiau fod

*the Assembly, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 6.5 and 9.9, notes the progress report from the Economic Development Committee, laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2000.*

*y Cynulliad, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.5 a 9.9, yn nodi'r adroddiad ar gynnydd a gyflwynwyd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2000.*

Mae'n bleser imi gyflwyno adroddiad cyntaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae gan y Pwyllgor waith pwysig ac mae'n bwysig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gael cyfle i drafod ein gwaith.

It is a pleasure for me to present the Economic Development Committee's first report. The Committee has important work and it is important that Assembly Members have an opportunity to discuss our work.

I am pleased and proud to have had the opportunity to chair the Committee at this important time. The Committee's work is no more or less important than that of other Committees. However, unless we create wealth and economic growth in Wales, we cannot tackle the underlying poverty, inequality and hopelessness that is embedded in our communities and that contributes greatly to increasing the burden on our social, health and education services.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd ac yn falch o fod wedi cael y cyfle i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor ar yr adeg bwysig hon. Nid yw gwaith y Pwyllgor yn fwy nac yn llai pwysig na gwaith y Pwyllgorau eraill. Fodd bynnag, oni chrewn gyfoeth a thwf economaidd yng Nghymru, ni allwn fynd i'r afael â'r tlodi, yr anghydraddoldeb a'r anobaith sylfaenol sydd wedi gwreiddio yn ein cymunedau ac sydd yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at gynyddu'r baich ar ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, iechyd ac addysg.

The report has been drawn up with the agreement of all four parties. I will discuss the Committee's priorities, how we have worked and the key issues which we must tackle in future. The Committee's work has centred on developing a clear knowledge and understanding of the strengths and

Lluniwyd yr adroddiad gyda chytundeb pob un o'r pedair plaid. Yr wyf am drafod blaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgor, ein dull o weithio a'r materion allweddol y bydd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hwy yn y dyfodol. Mae gwaith y Pwyllgor wedi canolbwyntio ar ddatblygu gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth eglur o

weaknesses of the Welsh economy and the action that is needed to tackle them. That is outlined in the national economic development strategy, which acts as our framework and which will be regularly reviewed and updated over the coming years. Central to it is developing the European structural funds programmes, particularly Objective 1, to ensure that they will have a major impact on developing sustainable growth in our economy.

Our work has also centred on scrutinising the work of the three Assembly sponsored bodies that are funded by the Committee, particularly the WDA and the Wales Tourist Board. That is vital to ensure that they deliver within the national economic development strategy, provide value for money and work closely and in synergy with other agencies. We have also overseen the wind-up and the transfer of the assets of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation. Finally, we have determined budget priorities and, as time has allowed, dealt with other matters. These are often important matters that tend to get squeezed in, such as regional selective assistance.

The national economic development strategy identified the economy's strengths and weaknesses. There are several factors with which you will be familiar, but they are worth repeating at the start of this debate. The over-riding problem is our low gross domestic product per capita, which is 82 per cent of the UK average. Figures released last week show that over 83 per cent of households in Wales still earn less than £10,000 a year. One fifth of our population receive housing benefits. We have significant problems of low wages and low economic activity. As we are not an exporting nation, we do not bring wealth into Wales. We still have low business start-up rates. In the past, we have relied heavily on inward investment. It still has a vital role to play, but we need greater diversity in our economy. We must give greater attention to building and developing our own businesses and linking them to inward investors.

gryfderau a gwendidau economi Cymru a'r camau sydd yn angenrheidiol er mwyn ymdrin â hwy. Amlinellir hynny yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol, sydd yn gweithredu fel fframwaith i ni ac a gaiff ei hadolygu a'i diweddarau'n rheolaidd yn ystod y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Rhan ganolog o hynny yw datblygu rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, yn enwedig Amcan 1, er mwyn sicrhau y cânt effaith sylweddol ar ddatblygu twf cynaliadwy yn ein heconomi.

Mae ein gwaith wedi canolbwyntio hefyd ar archwilio gwaith y tri chorff a noddir gan y Cynulliad a gaiff eu hariannu gan y Pwyllgor, yn enwedig y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Mae hynny'n holl bwysig er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu gwaith oddi mewn i'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol, yn rhoi gwerth am arian ac yn gweithio'n agos ac yn gyfegniol ag asiantaethau eraill. Goruchwylasom hefyd ddirwyn i ben a throsglwyddo asedau Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd. Yn olaf, yr ydym wedi penderfynu blaenoriaethau cyllideb ac, fel yr oedd amser yn caniatáu, wedi delio â materion eraill. Mae'r rhain yn aml yn faterion pwysig y tueddir eu gwasgu i mewn, fel cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol.

Mae'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol wedi dynodi cryfderau a gwendidau'r economi. Mae sawl ffactor y byddwch yn gyfarwydd â hwy, ond maent yn werth eu hailadrodd ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon. Y broblem bennaf yw ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth isel y pen, sydd yn 82 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Dengys ffigurau a ryddhawyd yr wythnos diwethaf fod dros 83 y cant o deuluoedd yng Nghymru'n ennill llai na £10,000 y flwyddyn o hyd. Mae un rhan o bump o'n poblogaeth yn derbyn budd-daliadau tai. Mae gennym broblemau sylweddol o ran cyflogau isel a gweithgaredd economaidd isel. Gan nad ydym yn genedl o allforwyr, ni ddeuwn â chyfoeth i mewn i Gymru. Mae gennym gyfraddau dechrau busnes isel o hyd. Yn y gorffennol, dibynasom yn helaeth ar fewnfuddsoddi. Mae iddo rôl hanfodol o hyd, ond mae arnom angen mwy o amrywiaeth yn ein heconomi. Rhaid inni roi mwy o sylw i adeiladu a datblygu ein busnesau ein hunain a'u cysylltu

â mewnfuddsoddwyr.

We still have major problems with lack of enterprise and enthusiasm for business start-ups. A key message is that creating wealth for Wales is okay. We still operate from a low skills base and have a low level of connectivity, which concerns Phil Williams. Few people in Wales are connected to and using information technology networks.

Mae gennym broblemau mawr o hyd o ran diffyg menter a brwdfrydedd dros ddechrau busnesau. Un neges allweddol yw bod creu cyfoeth ar gyfer Cymru yn iawn. Yr ydym yn dal i weithio o sylfaen medrau isel ac mae gennym lefel isel o gysylltedd, sydd yn peri pryder i Phil Williams. Ychydig o bobl yng Nghymru sydd wedi eu cysylltu â ac yn defnyddio rhwydweithiau technoleg gwybodaeth.

These issues are identified in the strategy and are being taken forward. We seek to ensure that they are taken forward through Objective 1, 2 and 3 and other programmes. The strategy sets high targets which the Committee will oversee and monitor while ensuring that we have the programmes to deliver them. We plan that gross domestic product per capita in Wales will reach 90 per cent of the UK average by 2010, and that GDP per capita in west Wales and the Valleys will reach 81 per cent. We plan to create 48,000 net additional jobs by 2010; 38,000 of those in west Wales and the Valleys. We plan to reduce economic inactivity by 32,000 by 2010 and—my personal favourite—that earnings of women in Wales will be 78 per cent of the UK average by 2010. However, that is still low. The Committee has concentrated on ensuring a policy framework to deliver this and that we use the £2 billion of European funding to build the foundations of a healthy economy that can grow and mature on its own.

Dynodir y materion hyn yn y strategaeth ac maent yn cael eu datblygu. Ceisiwn sicrhau y cânt eu datblygu drwy Amcan 1, 2 a 3 a rhaglenni eraill. Mae'r strategaeth yn pennu targedau uchel y bydd y Pwyllgor yn eu harolygu a'u monitro gan sicrhau bod gennym y rhaglenni i'w cyflawni. Ein bwriad yw y bydd y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru'n cyrraedd 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU erbyn 2010, ac y bydd y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn cyrraedd 81 y cant. Bwriadwn greu 48,000 o swyddi ychwanegol clir erbyn 2010; 38,000 o'r rheini yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Bwriadwn leihau anweithgaredd economaidd o 32,000 erbyn 2010 ac—fy ffeffryn i—y bydd enillion benywod yng Nghymru yn 78 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n isel o hyd. Canolbwyntiodd y Pwyllgor ar sicrhau fframwaith polisi i gyflawni hyn ac y byddwn yn defnyddio'r £2 biliwn o arian Ewropeaidd i osod sylfeini economi iach sydd yn gallu tyfu ac aeddfedu ar ei ben ei hun.

Our work has involved an initial scrutiny of the Objective 1 programme, and an extensive public consultation from which we learnt about the importance of interlinking the different measures and activities. We learnt how little people know, or knew, about European funding until Objective 1 became a household word, but how interested and anxious they were to be involved. We learnt about the importance of building alliances between the public, private and voluntary sectors. We have seen the importance of and are clear on the need to ensure adequate funding to roll out the Objective 1 programme. We fed in continually to the discussion and consultation on the priorities

Yr oedd ein gwaith yn cynnwys archwiliad dechreuol o'r rhaglen Amcan 1, ac ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus helaeth a fu'n gyfrwng inni ddysgu am bwysigrwydd cyd-gysylltu'r gwahanol fesurau a gweithgareddau. Dysgasom gyn lleied a wŷr, neu a wyddai, pobl am ariannu Ewropeaidd nes i Amcan 1 ddod yn air cyfarwydd, ond cymaint oedd eu diddordeb a'u hawydd i fod â rhan ynddo. Dysgasom mor bwysig oedd creu cynghreiriau rhwng y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol. Gwelsom a deallasom mor bwysig yw sicrhau ariannu digonol i ddatblygu'r rhaglen Amcan 1. Cymerasom ran yn barhaus yn y trafod a'r ymgynghori ar y blaenoriaethau yn y ddogfen

in the single programming document. We will return to that on 27 March, before the document is finalised. We have spent a great deal of time discussing one of the most critical issues, which is how we implement this and ensure that organisations can access the funds and use them effectively, particularly smaller private sector and voluntary organisations. We debated at length the kinds of structure and delivery that we would want to see.

Our next task will be to link up our Committee's role with that of the new monitoring committee, the monitoring committees on the different programmes, and the national economic development strategy. With this concentration on structural funds, there has been less time for work on Assembly sponsored public bodies. However, Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, as I am sure you are aware, has taken up much of our time and energy. None of us feel that we have given it enough time or feel enormously satisfied about the situation. However, it has been scrutinised in joint meetings with the Local Government and Environment Committee. That would not have happened if the Assembly did not exist.

We have tried to learn to work together in an arena with a highly political agenda, given Objective 1 and CBDC. We have tried to balance our scrutiny role with our policy development role and at the same time to get a sense of the parameters of what the Committee can do on providing access to information and open government. We have tried to learn to trust each other on the Committee. I hope that the other political parties feel, as I do, that we are making progress. In our recent visit to Brussels, members of each party met European officials. Rhodri is committed to ensuring that the Committee has access to all the information that can be reasonably placed in the public domain.

3:10 p.m.

Every Committee member is highly articulate, opinionated, passionate, stubborn, determined and able. They are an interesting

raglennu sengl. Byddwn yn dychwelyd at hynny ar 27 Mawrth, cyn i'r ddogfen gael ei chwblhau. Treuliasom lawer iawn o amser yn trafod un o'r materion mwyaf tyngedfennol, sef sut y gweithredwn hyn a sicrhau y gall cyrff fynd at y cronfeydd a'u defnyddio'n effeithiol, yn enwedig y cyrff llai yn y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol. Cawsom drafodaeth helaeth ar y mathau o strwythur a dulliau cyflenwi yr oeddem am eu gweld.

Ein tasg nesaf fydd cysylltu rôl ein Pwyllgor â rôl y pwyllgor monitro newydd, y pwyllgorau monitro ar y gwahanol raglenni, ac â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol. Oherwydd bod cymaint o sylw wedi ei roi i gronfeydd strwythurol, bu llai o amser ar gyfer gwaith ar gyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, fel y gwyddoch yr wyf yn siŵr, wedi mynd â llawer o'n hamser a'n hegni. Nid oes yr un ohonom yn teimlo inni roi digon o amser i hynny nac yn teimlo'n fodlon iawn â'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, fe'i harchwiliwyd mewn cyfarfodydd ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd. Ni ddigwyddasai hynny oni bai am fodolaeth y Cynulliad.

Yr ydym wedi ceisio dysgu cydweithio mewn maes ac iddo agenda dra gwleidyddol, o ystyried Amcan 1 a Chorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng ein rôl archwilio a'n rôl datblygu polisi ac ar yr un pryd fagu ymdeimlad o baramedrau'r hyn y gall y Pwyllgor ei wneud o ran darparu mynediad at wybodaeth a llywodraeth agored. Yr ydym wedi ceisio dysgu ymddiried yn ein gilydd ar y Pwyllgor. Gobeithiaf fod y pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill yn teimlo, fel yr wyf fi, ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd. Ar ein hymweliad â Brwsel yn ddiweddar, cyfarfu aelodau o bob plaid â swyddogion Ewropeaidd. Mae Rhodri wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y caiff y Pwyllgor fynediad at yr holl wybodaeth y gellir ei rhoi yn rhesymol yn y maes cyhoeddus.

Mae pob aelod Pwyllgor yn dra llafar, piniwngar, angerddol, ystyfnig, penderfynol a galluog. Maent yn griw diddorol o Aelodau

bunch of Assembly Members. All of us want to change the world tomorrow in our own way and by our own hand. I hope that we are learning to work together. The task of growing a healthy economy for Wales is important not only for the future of our country but for the success of this Assembly. It is vital that we have as much cross-party agreement on our national economic development strategy as possible. Those who will deliver the programmes and undertake the work, for which we set the framework, need to know that we are, as far as possible, in agreement on where we are going and are working effectively with our partners in the private, public and voluntary sectors. We all have things to learn. I have learnt much from Alun Cairns and the Conservative Party about working with private business. We have learnt much from Plaid Cymru on rural issues and ways to address those needs. I have learnt a great deal from Mike German on sensible approaches to decision-making and processes. We can all learn from each other so that we grow Wales's wealth and tackle its poverty.

I thank Rhodri as the Secretary for Economic Development; the clerk, Helen Usher; and the deputy clerks, Jo Trott and Joanne Glenn, who have devoted a vast amount of time to us. I also thank the economic development department staff who have produced papers for us, often at short notice, for their patience and help.

The next step will be to work closely on the European funding programmes, overseeing the Assembly sponsored public bodies and ensuring that their work relates directly to the economic development strategy. Our central work over the next few months, for which we have allocated money in our budget, is to undertake a major study of what business needs to help its growth and development. That is vital work. We have heard much from business people about duplication, confusion, bureaucracy and lack of information. If we are to help these people to grow Wales's wealth, we must ensure that they have the right support and programmes at the right time. We must find ways to make effective links between smaller businesses and

Cynulliad. Mae pob un ohonom am newid y byd yfory yn ein ffordd ein hunain a thrwy ein llaw ein hunain. Gobeithiaf ein bod yn dysgu gweithio gyda'n gilydd. Mae'r dasg o dyfu economi iach i Gymru yn bwysig nid yn unig i ddyfodol ein gwlad ond i lwyddiant y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'n holl bwysig inni gael cymaint ag y bo modd o gytundeb trawsbleidiol ar ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol. Mae angen i'r rhai fydd yn cyflawni'r rhaglenni ac yn ymgymryd â'r gwaith, y gosodasom ni y fframwaith ar ei gyfer, gael gwybod ein bod yn cytuno, i'r graddau mwyaf posibl, ar ein cyfeiriad a'n bod yn gweithio'n effeithiol â'n partneriaid yn y sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol. Mae gennym oll bethau i'w dysgu. Dysgais lawer oddi wrth Alun Cairns a'r Blaid Geidwadol ynghylch gweithio gyda busnes preifat. Dysgasom lawer oddi wrth Blaid Cymru ar faterion gwledig a ffyrdd o roi sylw i'r anghenion hynny. Dysgais lawer iawn oddi wrth Mike German ar ddulliau synhwyrol o ymdrin â gwneud penderfyniadau a phrosesau. Gallwn oll ddysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd fel ein bod yn tyfu cyfoeth Cymru ac yn mynd i'r afael â'i thlodi.

Diolchaf i Rhodri fel yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd; y clerc, Helen Usher; a'r dirprwy glerc, Jo Trott a Joanne Glenn, a roddodd swm anferth o'u hamser i ni. Diolchaf hefyd i staff yr adran datblygu economaidd a luniodd bapurau ar ein cyfer, ar fyr rybudd yn aml, am eu hamynedd a'u cymorth.

Y cam nesaf fydd gweithio'n fanwl ar y rhaglenni ariannu Ewropeaidd, goruchwylio'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a sicrhau bod eu gwaith yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd. Ein gwaith canolog dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, y dyranasom arian ar ei gyfer yn ein cyllideb, yw cyflawni astudiaeth helaeth o'r hyn y mae ar fusnes ei angen i'w helpu i dyfu a datblygu. Mae hynny'n waith holl bwysig. Clywsom lawer gan bobl busnes am ddyblygu, dryswch, biwrocratiaeth a diffyg gwybodaeth. Os ydym i helpu'r bobl hyn i dyfu cyfoeth Cymru, rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn cael y gefnogaeth a'r rhaglenni iawn ar yr adegau iawn. Rhaid inni ganfod ffyrdd o wneud

community enterprises and bigger businesses and the public sector. It is vital that we get this right. So much of the future of Wales depends on it. The Committee members welcome and look forward to hearing other Assembly Members' comments on what they believe our priorities should be and whether they feel that we are tackling the issues as they need to be tackled.

**Phil Williams:** I have been fortunate to have the opportunity to contribute to the work of the Economic Development Committee and give thanks to Val as Chair of that Committee. I have waited for the privilege of being involved with the planning of economic development in Wales for many years.

**The First Secretary:** Decades.

**Phil Williams:** Yes, decades. The excitement of the work matches the size of the challenge. When people query the value of the Assembly, I have no difficulty in justifying its whole cost in the achievements of the Economic Development Committee alone.

What do I regard as the main achievements of the Committee? First, I want to emphasise the importance of what I call the opening of the books. We now have access to important information which was not previously prominent or even in the public domain. On two or three occasions, with my selective passion for numbers, I have seen tables of information that give me a tingle along the spine, which I can only compare to the feeling when something unexpected happens in scientific data. It was at a briefing meeting rather than a formal Committee meeting that we discovered the significance of the comparability factors in calculating the Barnett formula. That explained why my past attempts to try to shadow the Welsh Office budget had never given me exact figures. That deserves a lot more scrutiny when we examine the comparability formulas line by line to see why certain items have been included and others excluded.

The most important opening of the books was the discovery of something fairly

cysylltiadau effeithiol rhwng busnesau llai a mentrau cymunedol a busnesau mwy a'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'n holl bwysig inni wneud hyn yn iawn. Mae cymaint o ddyfodol Cymru'n dibynnu ar hynny. Mae aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn croesawu ac yn edrych ymlaen at glywed sylwadau Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad ar yr hyn a ddylai fod yn flaenoriaethau i ni yn eu barn hwy ac a ydynt yn teimlo ein bod yn ymdrin â'r materion fel y mae angen ymdrin â hwy.

**Phil Williams:** Bûm yn ffodus o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu i waith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a diolchaf i Val fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw. Disgwylais am y fraint o gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o gynllunio datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd lawer.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Degawdau.

**Phil Williams:** Ie, degawdau. Mae cyffro'r gwaith yn gymaint â'r her. Pan yw pobl yn cwestiynu gwerth y Cynulliad, ni chaf unrhyw drafferth wrth gyfiawnhau'r cyfan o'i gost yng nghyflawniadau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn unig.

Beth a welaf yn brif gyflawniadau'r Pwyllgor? Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am bwysleisio pwysigrwydd yr hyn a alwaf yn agoriad y llyfrau. Bellach caniateir inni weld gwybodaeth bwysig nad oedd gynt yn amlwg na hyd yn oed yn y maes cyhoeddus. Ar ddau neu dri achlysur, a minnau â hoffter detholus o rifau, gwelais dablau o wybodaeth a yrrodd ias i lawr fy asgwrn cefn, na allaf ond ei chymharu â'r teimlad a geir pan yw rhywbeth annisgwyl yn digwydd mewn data gwyddonol. Mewn cyfarfod cyfarwyddo yn hytrach nag mewn cyfarfod Pwyllgor ffurfiol y darganfuasom bwysigrwydd y ffactorau cymharedd wrth gyfrifo fformwla Barnett. Rhoddai hynny eglurhad i mi pam nad oedd fy ymdrechion yn y gorffennol i geisio dilyn cyllideb y Swyddfa Gymreig erioed wedi rhoi ffigurau union i mi. Teilynga hynny lawer mwy o sylw pan archwiliwn y fformwlâu cymharedd fesul llinell i weld pam y cafodd rhai eitemau eu cynnwys ac eraill eu hepgor.

Yr agoriad pwysicaf o'r llyfrau oedd y darganfyddiad o rywbeth eithaf cymhleth, sef



complicated, which was the way in which European regional development fund money was funded out of the Barnett block. I was very pleased. As a symbol of inclusivity, this led to unanimous support in Plenary for the principle that the baseline Barnett block should be calculated in a way that excluded all European funding in England as well as Wales and Scotland. The ERDF money should be transferred 100 per cent to the appropriate area. In all the conflicts that have been publicised, the unanimous support for that was an important feature of the basic inclusivity and basic shared interest that we have.

If this issue is resolved in a fair and just way, as we hope it will be, in one year the extra budget will cover the cost of the Assembly for seven years, including the cost of the new building. The fact that an area like that is understood in the public domain is an important lead, which I am glad to say is being followed in regions in England and Scotland to some extent.

The third opening of the books appeared when we discussed in detail the transfer orders from Cardiff Bay Development Corporation to the various new authorities. I will not repeat the details of those transfer orders, which were discussed at length last week. The opportunity to cross-examine the officials, representatives of CBDC and, above all, the leader of Cardiff City and County Council, was one of the highlights of the year. We had the opportunity to repeatedly ask key, crucial questions about the running of the Bay and the continuing cost to the Assembly's budget of this exciting but flawed project. I am sure we will not be satisfied until we get clear, acceptable answers to those questions so that the real potential will be realised in future. The discussions on Cardiff Bay in the Economic Development Committee demonstrated clearly the advantages of the Assembly Committees holding detailed, penetrating discussions in public and usually on television, where previously decisions, and sometimes unfortunate decisions, were made in private with a smaller number of people.

y modd yr ariannwyd cyllid y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd o flocc Barnett. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn. Fel symbol o gynhwysedd, arweiniodd hyn at gefnogaeth unfryd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i'r egwyddor y dylid cyfrifo llinell sylfaen bloc Barnett mewn modd a hepgorai'r holl ariannu Ewropeaidd yn Lloegr yn ogystal â Chymru a'r Alban. Dylid trosglwyddo 100 y cant o arian y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd i'r ardal briodol. Yn yr holl wrthdrawiadau y rhoddwyd cyhoedduswydd iddynt, yr oedd y gefnogaeth unfryd i hynny'n nodwedd bwysig o'r cynhwysedd sylfaenol a'r cyd-ddiddordeb sylfaenol sydd gennym.

Os datrysir y mater hwn mewn modd teg a chyfiawn, fel y gobeithiwn, mewn un flwyddyn bydd y gyllideb ychwanegol yn talu cost y Cynulliad am saith mlynedd, gan gynnwys cost yr adeilad newydd. Mae'r ffaith bod maes felly wedi ei ddeall yn y maes cyhoeddus yn arweiniad pwysig, a ddilyniir, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, mewn rhanbarthau yn Lloegr a'r Alban i ryw raddau.

Daeth y trydydd agoriad o'r llyfrau i'r amlwg pan drafodasom yn fanwl y gorchmynion trosglwyddo o Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i'r gwahanol awdurdodau newydd. Nid wyf am ailadrodd manylion y gorchmynion trosglwyddo hynny, a drafodwyd yn hirfaith yr wythnos diwethaf. Y cyfle i groesholi'r swyddogion, cynrychiolwyr Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd ac, uwchlaw popeth, arweinydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd, oedd un o uchafbwyntiau'r flwyddyn. Cawsom gyfle i ofyn cwestiynau allweddol, tyngedfennol dro ar ôl tro ynghylch rhedeg y Bae a'r gost barhaus i gyllideb y Cynulliad o'r prosiect cyffrous ond diffygiol hwn. Yr wyf yn sicr na fyddwn yn fodlon hyd y cawn atebion clir, derbyniol i'r cwestiynau hynny fel y cyflawnir y gwir botensial yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd y trafodaethau ar Fae Caerdydd yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn dangos yn eglur y manteision o gynnal trafodaethau manwl, treiddiol gan Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad yn gyhoeddus ac fel arfer ar y teledu, lle cynt y gwnaethpwyd penderfyniadau, ac weithiau penderfyniadau anffodus, yn breifat gyda nifer llai o bobl.

The meetings to discuss Cardiff Bay were joint meetings with the Local Government and Environment Committee. The combination was successful. Oddly enough, and Val will confirm this, although we were twice as many, we each spoke less than half as much. They were remarkably disciplined and effective meetings. They were important because the Economic Development Committee, brilliant though it is, may not have had all the expertise on water quality, transport and the transfer of funds to local authorities.

3:20 p.m.

It was of great advantage to have a joint meeting with the Local Government and Environment Committee. I raise the matter of joint committee meetings because my disappointments are mainly focused on the failure to have more joint meetings. I welcome the suggestion in the report that that is remedied. I will give two examples of that failure. In June, I asked for a joint meeting of the Economic Development Committee and the Post-16 Education and Training Committee to discuss the future of work-placed training and the enterprise functions of the training and enterprise councils as proposed by ETAP. For various reasons, a full joint meeting never took place. Eventually Tom Middlehurst and Cynog Dafis attended the Economic Development Committee but, by that stage, the Post-16 Education and Training Committee had made the relevant decisions. Those training proposals would have contributed considerably to our Committee's drafting of the Objective 1 single programming document and both sides would have benefited from working together. I do not think that it would have added to the workload because it involves an element of duplication.

Another example, that is more significant, was the work of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and the Economic Development Committee on the development of policies to use European funds to secure economic development in rural areas. I think others share my sense of missing out on what

Yr oedd y cyfarfodydd i drafod Bae Caerdydd yn gyd-gyfarfodydd â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd. Yr oedd y cyfuniad yn llwyddiannus. Yn ddigon rhyfedd, a bydd Val yn cadarnhau hyn, er bod dwywaith cymaint ohonom, siaradodd pawb lai na hanner cymaint. Yr oeddent yn gyfarfodydd hynod ddisgybledig ac effeithiol. Yr oeddent yn bwysig am ei bod yn bosibl nad oedd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, er cyn wyched ydyw, yn meddu ar yr holl arbenigedd ar ansawdd dŵr, trafniadaeth a throsglwyddo cronfeydd i awdurdodau lleol.

Mantais fawr oedd cael cyd-gyfarfod â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd. Codaf fater cyfarfodydd pwyllgor ar y cyd oherwydd mae'r hyn a barodd siom imi'n ymwneud yn bennaf â'r methiant i gael mwy o gyfarfodydd ar y cyd. Croesawaf yr awgrym yn yr adroddiad y dylid cywiro hynny. Rhoddaf ddwy enghraifft o'r methiant hwnnw. Ym Mehefin, gofynnais am gyfarfod ar y cyd o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 i drafod dyfodol hyfforddiant yn y gweithle a swyddogaethau menter y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter fel y'i cynigiwyd gan y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant. Am amryw o resymau, ni chynhaliwyd cyd-gyfarfod llawn erioed. Yn y diwedd daeth Tom Middlehurst a Cynog Dafis i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ond, erbyn hynny, yr oedd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 wedi gwneud y penderfyniadau perthnasol. Byddai'r cynigion hyfforddiant hynny wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at waith ein Pwyllgor wrth ddrafftio dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 a byddai'r ddwy ochr wedi elwa o gydweithio. Ni chredaf y byddai wedi ychwanegu at y llwyth gwaith oherwydd mae'n golygu elfen o ddyblygu.

Enghraifft arall, sydd yn bwysicach, oedd gwaith y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar ddatblygu polisiau i ddefnyddio cronfeydd Ewropeaidd i sicrhau datblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Credaf fod eraill yn rhannu'r

was happening. It was at that stage, when we were submitting the Objective 1 single programming document with a considerable element of rural development, that I became aware of the rural development plan that the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee was considering at the same time in the next room. Joint meetings on such matters, which are of considerable importance, would have been beneficial. The failure to have them reveals a certain lack of integration on rural policies.

However, despite the problems of being a new Committee with a huge workload, the Economic Development Committee made valuable contributions to the detailed development of the Objective 1 SPD. I add to the thanks to Helen Usher and the other officials, who made a massive contribution. If we think that it is hard work to read the documents, we can apply the multiplying factor to indicate how much work has gone into providing those documents. It is worth noting that, on some occasions, the Committee discussed proposals that were not immediately accepted by the Executive but which were ultimately proved to be perceptive and correct and were accepted. Those proposals included the need to distinguish between rural and urban areas and the need to base local action plans on county councils. The Committee had these initiatives, but did not push them through. We must review the past year and look forward to the coming year in terms of that. It is extremely important that our Committees are not only scrutiny committees but also policy-making ones. In a way, we have been better as a scrutiny committee than as a policy-making one.

**Nick Bourne:** Phil rightly mentioned that sometimes there are cross-cutting issues to discuss when both Committees should get together. Does he agree that some issues seem to have disappeared down a black hole and are not being considered at all? Members of the Mid Wales Regional Committee were alerted to the Wales Tourist Board's concern that the issue of tourism had barely surfaced in the Economic Development Committee and had not surfaced at all in this Chamber. I wonder whether Phil could lend his support

teimlad sydd gennyf o fod wedi peidio â chael bod yn rhan o'r hyn oedd yn digwydd. Bryd hynny, pan oeddem yn cyflwyno'r ddogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 ac ynddi elfen sylweddol o ddatblygu gwledig, y deuthum yn ymwybodol o'r cynllun datblygu gwledig yr oedd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn ei ystyried yn yr ystafell nesaf. Buasai cyfarfodydd ar y cyd ar faterion o'r fath, sydd o gryn bwys, wedi bod yn fanteisiol iawn. Mae'r methiant i'w cynnal yn amlygu rhywfaint o ddiffyg integreiddio ar bolisiau gwledig.

Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf y problemau o fod yn Bwyllgor newydd gyda llwyth gwaith anferth, gwnaeth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd gyfraniadau gwerthfawr i ddatblygiad manwl dogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1. Ategap y diolchiadau i Helen Usher a'r swyddogion eraill, a wnaeth gyfraniad enfawr. Os credwn mai gwaith caled yw darllen y dogfennau, gallwn gymhwyso'r ffactor lluos i ddangos cymaint o waith a aeth i ddarparu'r dogfennau hynny. Mae'n werth nodi bod y Pwyllgor, ar adegau, wedi trafod cynigion na chawsant eu derbyn ar unwaith gan y Weithrediaeth ond y profwyd yn y pen draw eu bod yn graff ac yn gywir ac a dderbyniwyd. Yr oedd y cynigion hynny'n cynnwys yr angen i wahaniaethu rhwng ardaloedd gwledig a threfol a'r angen i seilio cynlluniau gweithredu lleol ar gynghorau sir. Yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor y mentrau hyn, ond nid oedd wedi eu gwthio drwodd. Rhaid inni adolygu'r flwyddyn a aeth heibio ac edrych ymlaen i'r flwyddyn sydd i ddod yn hynny o beth. Mae'n bwysig iawn nad yw ein Pwyllgorau'n bwyllgorau archwilio'n unig ond yn rhai sydd yn gwneud polisi. Ar ryw ystyr, buom yn well fel pwyllgor archwilio nag fel Pwyllgor gwneud polisi.

**Nick Bourne:** Dywed Phil yn gywir fod materion trawsbynciol i'w trafod weithiau pan ddylai'r ddau Bwyllgor ddod at ei gilydd. A yw'n cytuno ei bod yn ymddangos bod rhai materion wedi diflannu i dwll du ac nad ydynt yn cael eu hystyried o gwbl? Tynnwyd sylw aelodau Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth at bryder Bwrdd Croeso Cymru mai prin ymddangos a wnaeth mater twristiaeth yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac nad ymddangosodd o gwbl yn y Siambr hon. Tybed a oes modd i Phil

to the call that we should have a thorough debate on this vital issue?

**Phil Williams:** The Committee has had a heavy workload. It has been an exceptional year with the preparations for Objective 1 and we must confess that it was partly the Committee's fault that ETAP was not debated as fully as it should have been. For example, in one of our meetings, a three-hour agenda included a main discussion on the Objective 1 SPD, the corporate plan of the WDA and originally ETAP as well, I think. That is an indication of the pressure that we are under. The Committee will discuss tourism tomorrow but we have not given it the attention that an industry so important to our economy deserves.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Looking back on the Economic Development Committee's work on the ETAP report, would you outline what evidence from the business community was considered by the Committee and what business representatives you invited to give evidence?

**Phil Williams:** We did not receive evidence from any direct representatives because many had already appeared before the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. That is exactly the situation in which a joint meeting, like those held on the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, would have been effective. That is a better way of handling matters than asking people to come to the Assembly to appear before two different Committees.

We still have a huge job of work to do. I will tell you a secret that we have kept hidden away—the Committee still regards the economic development strategy as a draft. Due to the urgency of the Objective 1 submission, we had to put the work that we might have undertaken to refine the economic development strategy to one side. That poses an important challenge to us in the next six months and I hope that, by working well together, we can be an effective policy-making committee.

**Alun Cairns:** The Chairman asked each of the economic development spokesmen not to

gefnogi'r alwad y dylem gael dadl drwyadl ar y mater holl bwysig hwn?

**Phil Williams:** Bu llwyth gwaith trwm gan y Pwyllgor. Bu'n flwyddyn eithriadol gyda'r paratodau ar gyfer Amcan 1 a rhaid inni gyfaddef mai bai'r Pwyllgor ydoedd yn rhannol na thrafodwyd y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant mor gyflawn ag y dylid fod wedi gwneud. Er enghraifft, yn un o'n cyfarfodydd, yr oedd agenda dair awr yn cynnwys prif drafodaeth ar ddogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1, cynllun corfforaethol y WDA a'r cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant yn wreiddiol hefyd, fe gredaf. Mae hynny'n awgrym o'r pwysau sydd arnom. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn trafod twristiaeth yfory ond ni roesom y sylw sydd yn ddyledus i ddiwydiant sydd mor bwysig i'n heconomi.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Wrth edrych yn ôl ar waith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar yr adroddiad ar y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant, a wnewch nodi pa dystiolaeth o'r gymuned fusnes a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor a pha gynrychiolwyr busnes a wahoddwyd gennych i roi dystiolaeth?

**Phil Williams:** Ni dderbyniasom dystiolaeth gan unrhyw gynrychiolwyr uniongyrchol oherwydd bod llawer ohonynt eisoes wedi ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16. Dyna'r union sefyllfa lle y byddai cyd-gyfarfod, fel y rhai a gynhaliwyd ar Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, wedi bod yn effeithiol. Mae hynny'n well ffordd o ymdrin â materion na gofyn i bobl ddod i'r Cynulliad i ymddangos gerbron dau Bwyllgor gwahanol.

Mae gennym dasg anferth i'w chyflawni o hyd. Fe ddywedaf gyfrinach wrthyech a guddiwyd gennym—mae'r Pwyllgor yn dal i ystyried y strategaeth datblygu economaidd yn ddrafft. Oherwydd brys y cyflwyniad Amcan 1, bu'n rhaid inni roi'r gwaith y gallasem fod wedi ei gyflawni i fanwl gyweirio'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd o'r neilltu. Mae hynny'n cynnig her bwysig i ni yn y chwe mis nesaf a gobeithiaf y gallwn, drwy gydweithio'n dda, fod yn bwyllgor gwneud polisi effeithiol.

**Alun Cairns:** Gofynnodd y Cadeirydd i bob llefarydd datblygu economaidd beidio â thra-

dominate the debate and to consider other Assembly Members who might want to contribute. In the interests of co-operation—for which I am renowned, even if I say so myself—I am prepared to agree with the Chairman's sentiments. I will keep my comments as brief as possible because I have had some opportunities in the Committee to share my views and concerns though maybe not as many as I would have liked. I pay tribute to the Committee's clerk, Helen Usher, for her hard work. She has had to work through two Chairmen and with what I would describe as several strong characters in the Committee who have persisted with their agendas in terms of gaining exposure for their views.

As a member of the Economic Development Committee, I consider it to be one of the most important Committees because a key Assembly objective is to improve the economic prosperity of Wales. The Objective 1 programme for west Wales and the Valleys has been of considerable importance and a priority for the Committee in its early days. The Committee will make recommendations on policy and scrutinise the Executive on the most important area of policy on which the Assembly will be judged by the public in the next Assembly election. The Committee's recommendations and its scrutinising of Government policy will, I hope, instil confidence in the electorate and ensure a better turnout in the next election.

One of the Committee's most important roles is to scrutinise Government policy and the negotiations between the Labour Executive and the European Commission on Objective 1 in particular. You will be aware, Llywydd, that several points of order have been raised about documents not being available early enough, or about whether documents have been redrafted or revised. However, I congratulate Rhodri Morgan on being as honest as possible in the Committee under the circumstances. There are many uncomfortable private negotiations taking place between the Executive and the Westminster Government, in which the benefit of Wales is being considered in terms of match funding and many other policy areas relating to Objective 1, such as

arglwyddiaethu ar y ddadl ac i ystyried Aelodau Cynulliad eraill a allai ddymuno cyfrannu. Er mwyn cydweithredu—yr hyn yr wyf yn enwog amdano, er mai fi fy hun sydd yn dweud hynny—yr wyf yn barod i gytuno â barn y Cadeirydd. Yr wyf am fod mor gryno yn fy sylwadau ag y bo modd oherwydd cefais rai cyfleoedd yn y Pwyllgor i gyfrannu o'm safbwyntiau a'm pryderon ond nid cynifer efallai ag y byddwn wedi dymuno. Talaf deyrnged i glerc y Pwyllgor, Helen Usher, am ei gwaith caled. Bu'n rhaid iddi weithio drwy gyfnodau dau Gadeirydd a chyda nifer a ddisgrifiwn yn gymeriadau cryf ar y Pwyllgor a ddyfalbarhaodd â'u hagendâu o ran ennill sylw i'w safbwyntiau.

Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fe'i ystyriaf yn un o'r Pwyllgorau pwysicaf oherwydd un o amcanion allweddol y Cynulliad yw gwella ffyniant economaidd Cymru. Bu'r rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd o bwys sylweddol ac yn flaenoriaeth i'r Pwyllgor yn ei ddyddiau cynnar. Bydd y Pwyllgor yn gwneud argymhellion ar bolisi ac yn archwilio'r Weithrediaeth ar y maes polisi pwysicaf y bernir y Cynulliad arno gan y cyhoedd yn etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad. Bydd argymhellion y Pwyllgor a'i waith yn archwilio polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn ennyn ymddiriedaeth yr etholwyr, gobeithiaf, ac yn sicrhau y bydd mwy yn pleidleisio yn yr etholiad nesaf.

Un o rolau pwysicaf y Pwyllgor yw archwilio polisiau'r Llywodraeth a'r negodiadau rhwng y Weithrediaeth Lafur a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar Amcan 1 yn arbennig. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Lywydd, fod sawl pwynt o drefn wedi ei godi ynghylch y ffaith na fu dogfennau ar gael yn ddigon cynnar, neu ynghylch a yw dogfennau wedi eu hailddrafftio neu eu diwygio. Fodd bynnag, llongyfarchaf Rhodri Morgan ar fod mor onest ag y bo modd yn y Pwyllgor o dan yr amgylchiadau. Mae llawer o negodiadau preifat anghyfforddus yn digwydd rhwng y Weithrediaeth a Llywodraeth San Steffan, lle'r ystyrir lles Cymru o ran cyllid cyfatebol a llawer o feysydd polisi eraill sydd yn ymwneud ag Amcan 1, fel cymorth gweithredu. Efallai na ellir rhoi'r stori gyfan,

operating aid. Maybe the whole story cannot be given, but I am confident that Rhodri Morgan has shared as much as is politically acceptable to his Westminster colleagues, under difficult circumstances.

3:30 p.m.

Points of order have previously been raised about the documents that we needed and the matter has already been discussed in the Chamber. However, I hope that the Chair of the Committee and the Executive will take this matter back and discuss it with civil servants to ensure that full consideration and sharing of such information is given as early as possible to members of the Economic Development Committee and Assembly Members before the Committee meeting.

The Education and Training Action Group has already been praised in the discussions today. Unfortunately, the Committee could not pay enough attention to that policy area. I understand that the Committee has had a lot of pressure and it would take much skill to ensure that the timings of agendas are strictly followed as they have been set out. ETAG has unfortunately been squeezed into a couple of the meetings, which led to the Committee discussing the ETAG report after the Executive had made decisions on it. The Economic Development Committee had sufficient time to analyse the report a few weeks before the debate came to the Chamber.

In terms of consultation with the private sector on the education and training action plan, I regret that we did not have the opportunity to liaise with business leaders in Wales. I am sure that we all acknowledge that there has been much concern from people such as members of the Federation of Small Businesses, the Institute of Directors and the Confederation of British Industry. The Economic Development Committee must have sufficient influence on training in particular. We must not forget that people are being trained for our employers, and it is the Committee's role in particular to look after the interests of the employers within the Assembly as well as ensure other opportunities to take representations from

ond yr wyf yn sicr bod Rhodri Morgan wedi rhannu cymaint ag sydd yn wleidyddol dderbyniol i'w gydweithwyr yn San Steffan, o dan amgylchiadau anodd.

Codwyd pwyntiau o drefn o'r blaen ynghylch y dogfennau yr oedd arnom eu hangen a thrafodwyd y mater eisoes yn y Siambr. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor a'r Weithrediaeth yn mynd â'r mater hwn yn ôl ac yn ei drafod â'r gweision sifil er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir ystyriaeth lawn ac y rhennir gwybodaeth o'r fath cyn gynted ag y bo modd i aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad cyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor.

Canmolwyd y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant eisoes yn y trafodaethau heddiw. Yn anffodus, ni allai'r Pwyllgor roi digon o sylw i'r maes polisi hwnnw. Deallaf fod y Pwyllgor wedi bod dan lawer o bwysau a buasai angen dehurwydd mawr i gadw'n fanwl at amseriadau agendâu fel y'u nodwyd. Gwasgwyd y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant i ychydig o'r cyfarfodydd yn anffodus, ac o ganlyniad i hynny trafododd y Pwyllgor adroddiad y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant ar ôl i'r Weithrediaeth wneud penderfyniadau arno. Yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ddigon o amser i ddadansoddi'r adroddiad ychydig wythnosau cyn i'r ddadl ddog i'r Siambr.

O ran ymgynghori â'r sector preifat ar y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant, mae'n ofid imi na chawsom gyfle i gysylltu ag arweinyddion busnes yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn sicr ein bod oll yn cydnabod bod llawer o bryder wedi ei fynegi gan rai fel aelodau o Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr a Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd gael digon o ddylanwad ar hyfforddiant yn arbennig. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod pobl yn cael eu hyfforddi ar gyfer ein cyflogwyr, a rôl y Pwyllgor yn arbennig yw gofalu am fuddiannau'r cyflogwyr oddi mewn i'r Cynulliad yn ogystal â sicrhau cyfleoedd eraill i dderbyn sylwadau oddi wrth gyrff fel

bodies such as Business Wales.

I am sure that you will be pleased, Llywydd, that I do not intend to repeat the whole of our debate on Cardiff Bay Development Corporation last week. However, members of the Economic Development Committee had many concerns in terms of the value for money that the Assembly and Welsh taxpayers will have from our agreement. The Welsh Conservative Party endeavoured to highlight that in our minority party debate last week.

I would like to emphasise the representation that the leader of Cardiff City and County Council, Russell Goodway, made to the Committee. I have checked the verbatim report of the Committee meeting and he said that he had negotiated a three-month buffer contract with Crest Nicholson. We should seriously consider this for the future, because investigation shows that an agreement has not been struck with Crest Nicholson. I had discussions with Crest Nicholson last Friday morning and it said that an agreement on a three-month contract had not been struck. That raises general concerns in terms of the representation made to the Committee, and maybe there should be an opportunity for recourse to go back over the evidence provided, albeit in good faith, to the Committee. This is one example when maybe the whole truth was not shared.

Business support and development is on the agenda for the meetings of the Economic Development Committee in the coming months. This is the opportunity to share our concerns or to listen to the private sector as much as possible. Paragraph 24 of today's Economic Development Committee report to the Assembly says that this review of business support and development 'will include wide consultation, particularly with the private sector'. It is our responsibility, as members of the Economic Development Committee, to ensure that the views of the private sector are heard and that the ETAG example is not repeated.

**Christine Humphreys:** Point of order. Let me set the record straight. This is the second time that Alun Cairns has mentioned the ETAG process and virtually accused the

Busnes Cymru.

Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwch yn falch, Lywydd, na fwriadaf ailadrodd y cwbl o'n dadl ar Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd gan aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd lawer o bryderon o ran y gwerth am arian a gaiff y Cynulliad a threthdalwyr Cymru o'n cytundeb. Ceisiodd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru dynnu sylw at hynny yn ein dadl plaid leiafrifol yr wythnos diwethaf.

Hoffwn bwysleisio'r sylwadau a gyflwynodd arweinydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd, Russell Goodway, i'r Pwyllgor. Gwiriais yr adroddiad gair-am-air o gyfarfod y Pwyllgor a dywedodd ei fod wedi negodi contract clustogi tri mis â Crest Nicholson. Dylem ystyried hyn o ddifrif ar gyfer y dyfodol, oherwydd darganfuwyd drwy ymchwil na wnaethpwyd cytundeb â Crest Nicholson. Cefais drafodaethau â Crest Nicholson fore Gwener diwethaf a dywedodd na wnaethpwyd cytundeb ar contract tri mis. Mae hynny'n codi pryderon cyffredinol o ran y sylwadau a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor, ac efallai y dylai fod cyfle i fynd yn ôl ac ailystyried y dystiolaeth a roddwyd, er yn ddidwyll, i'r Pwyllgor. Mae hyn yn un enghraifft o beidio â rhannu'r gwirionedd i gyd efallai.

Mae cefnogi a datblygu busnes ar yr agenda ar gyfer cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn y misoedd sydd i ddod. Dyma'r cyfle i rannu ein pryderon neu i wrando ar y sector preifat gymaint ag y bo modd. Dywed paragraff 24 yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i'r Cynulliad heddiw y bydd yr adolygiad hwn ar gefnogi a datblygu busnes 'yn cynnwys ymgynghori eang, yn arbennig gyda'r sector preifat'. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni, fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, yw sicrhau y clywir barn y sector preifat ac nad ailadroddir esiampl y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant.

**Christine Humphreys:** Pwynt o drefn. Gadewch imi gywiro camgymeriad. Dyma'r eildro i Alun Cairns sôn am broses y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant a bron

Committee of not paying any attention to business. I sat through each one of those Post-16 Education and Training Committee meetings and I assure you that we received presentations from the Confederation of British Industry and from the Federation of Small Businesses. Their views were taken into consideration throughout the whole process. I find it unacceptable to sit here and listen to Alun Cairns, who is not even a member of that Committee, criticise it for not listening to views to which it has listened. The Committee was concerned about the enterprise functions of the training and enterprise councils. We knew that the TECs would be disbanded and we pointed out to the Economic Development Committee that those enterprise functions needed to be examined. We hope that they will be addressed by the Economic Development Committee because this is essential for small and medium sized businesses.

**Alun Cairns:** I correct the interpretation of my statements and I apologise because I had no intention of criticising any Assembly Committee in my address today. My comments have been about the Economic Development Committee and its liaison with the private sector over ETAP in particular. I apologise for any misunderstanding.

The analysis of business support and development is the ideal opportunity to instil confidence in the private sector. I have discussed the range that runs from small business through to larger organisations. This is an area of concern.

In terms of the forward work programme, the entrepreneurship action plan—which has its own agenda item—will extend from business support. I am concerned that Assembly Members may think that this is the answer to many of our problems. It is part of the answer. The cultural change that must take place with any entrepreneurship action plan is the answer or part of the answer to our problems. It is a long-term strategy because cultural change in any organisation, let alone within a nation, will take a long time to influence and move forward to that entrepreneurship culture that we all seek to develop.

gyhuddo'r Pwyllgor o beidio â rhoi unrhyw sylw i fusnes. Eisteddais drwy bob un o'r cyfarfodydd hynny o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 ac fe'ch sicrhaf ein bod wedi derbyn cyflwyniadau gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a chan Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach. Cymerwyd eu barn i ystyriaeth drwy gydol y broses gyfan. Ni allaf oddef eistedd yma a gwrandao ar Alun Cairns, nad yw hyd yn oed yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, yn ei feirniadu am beidio â gwrandao barn y gwrandawodd arni. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn bryderus ynghylch swyddogaethau menter y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter. Gwyddem y câ'r cynghorau hyfforddi a menter eu chwalu a thynasom sylw'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd at yr angen i archwilio'r swyddogaethau menter hynny. Gobeithiwn y cânt sylw gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd oherwydd mae hyn yn holl bwysig i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint.

**Alun Cairns:** Cywiraf y dehongliad o'm gosodiadau ac ymddiheuraf oherwydd nid oedd yn fwriad gennyf i feirniadu unrhyw Bwyllgor Cynulliad yn fy anerchiad heddiw. Bu fy sylwadau am y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'i gysylltiad â'r sector preifat ynghylch y cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant yn arbennig. Ymddiheuraf am unrhyw gamddealltwriaeth.

Dadansoddi'r modd i gefnogi a datblygu busnesau yw'r cyfle delfrydol i ennyn hyder yn y sector preifat. Trafodais yr amrediad sydd yn rhedeg o fusnesau bach drwodd at gyrrff mwy. Mae hyn yn faes sydd yn peri pryder.

O ran y rhaglen waith ar gyfer y dyfodol, bydd y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth—sydd â'i eitem agenda ei hun—yn ymestyn o gefnogaeth i fusnesau. Pryderaf y gallai Aelodau Cynulliad feddwl mai hyn yw'r ateb i lawer o'n problemau. Mae'n rhan o'r ateb. Y newid diwylliannol sydd yn gorfod digwydd gydag unrhyw gynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth yw'r ateb neu ran o'r ateb i'n problemau. Mae'n strategaeth dymor hir oherwydd bydd newid diwylliannol mewn unrhyw gorff, heb sôn am genedl, yn cymryd llawer o amser i gael dylanwad a symud ymlaen at y diwylliant entrepreneuriaeth hwnnw yr ydym oll yn



ceisio ei ddatblygu.

Reference has been made to an economic development bank. It has already been mentioned that Broughton is to receive a soft loan from the Westminster Government of some £500 million. We have experiences of the Welsh Development Agency running a similar bank in the 1970s that lost much public money. That is our concern about an economic development bank. Before we talk about the role of this bank, we must address the perceived funding gap that it is aimed to fill. Anyone who is sufficiently advised in terms of financial planning would never seek to buy a house, for example, on an overdraft, but rather by a long-term mortgage or loan. That is the sort of example that I want to give for an economic development bank. We must establish what the funding gap is, before any public money is thrown at business and enterprise through such a loan.

3:40 p.m.

Tourism has already been highlighted. It is of deep regret that we have not had the opportunity to analyse that, but the continually packed agendas of the Economic Development Committee have made it difficult. The Welsh Development Agency takes a large proportion of the Economic Development Committee's budget. It is unfortunate that the Committee has not yet had the opportunity to take more representations from the WDA so that we can offer our views and guidance on what we would like to see. We must not forget that these quangos, or Assembly sponsored public bodies, must act on the Executive's wishes, about which representations can also be made from the Economic Development Committee.

**Peter Black:** The tradition of trying to avoid having only spokespeople speak will hopefully start here. Although I am not a member of the Economic Development Committee I have some brief points to make on behalf of the Liberal Democrat group. I am sure that other members of my group will also wish to speak.

My first point relates to Objective 1. We have been through a difficult 10 months with Objective 1. The end of this month will see,

Cyfeiriwyd at fanc datblygu economaidd. Soniwyd eisoes y bydd Brychdyn yn derbyn benthyciad rhwydd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan o tua £500 miliwn. Mae gennym brofiadau o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n rhedeg banc tebyg yn y 1970au a gollodd lawer o arian cyhoeddus. Dyna'n pryder ynghylch banc datblygu economaidd. Cyn inni sôn am rôl y banc hwn, rhaid inni ymdrin â'r bwlch ariannu canfyddedig y bwriedir iddo ei lenwi. Ni fyddai unrhyw un sydd yn ddigon synhwyrol o ran cynllunio ariannol byth yn ceisio prynu tŷ, er enghraifft, ar orddrafft, ond yn hytrach drwy forgais neu fenthyciad tymor hir. Dyna'r math o enghraifft yr wyf am ei rhoi ar gyfer banc datblygu economaidd. Rhaid inni ganfod beth yw'r bwlch ariannu, cyn taflu unrhyw arian cyhoeddus tuag at fusnes a menter drwy fenthyciad o'r fath.

Tynnwyd sylw at dwristiaeth eisoes. Mae'n ofid mawr na chawsom gyfle i ddadansoddi hynny, ond mae agendâu bythol lawn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi ei gwneud yn anodd. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n mynd â chyfran fawr o gyllideb y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae'n anffodus nad yw'r Pwyllgor eto wedi cael cyfle i dderbyn mwy o sylwadau gan y WDA fel y gallwn gynnig ein barn a'n harweiniad ar yr hyn y carem ei weld. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod y cwangos hyn, neu gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yn gorfod gweithredu yn unol â dymuniadau'r Weithrediaeth, y gellir cyflwyno sylwadau arnynt hefyd o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

**Peter Black:** Gobeithiaf y bydd y traddodiad o geisio osgoi cael dim ond llefaryddion yn siarad yn dechrau yma. Er nad wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd mae gennyf rai pwyntiau byr i'w gwneud ar ran y grŵp Democrataidd Rhyddfrydol. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd aelodau eraill o'm grŵp hefyd yn dymuno siarad.

Mae fy mhwynt cyntaf yn ymwneud ag Amcan 1. Aethom drwy 10 mis anodd gydag Amcan 1. Ddiwedd y mis hwn, gobeithiaf,

hopefully, the single programming document will be approved. We can then get down to the nitty-gritty of implementing the document, initiating the schemes and ensuring that we start to create the prosperity that we have long talked about. Match funding is still an issue. However, the issue that I raise is that, as Professor Dylan Jones-Evans of the Welsh Enterprise Institute has pointed out, the overwhelming majority of the European Union funds that have so far come to Wales have been channelled into the public sector. While I recognise the importance of using European Union money for public infrastructure improvements, it is clear that more European funding needs to be channelled into the real wealth creators in Wales—the private sector and SMEs. We need to ensure that, when we look at how this is implemented, particularly at a regional level, we try to direct as much as possible of this money into creating real, sustainable jobs. We must not see this as another charter to build roads. That would conflict with the Local Government and Environment Committee's intention to get more people to use integrated transport. Transport is important in tackling social exclusion but we also need to create jobs and wealth. To do that we must invest in SMEs and training so that people can take full advantage of these funds.

My second point relates to the spread of public investment. In a joint meeting, the Economic Development Committee and the Local Government and Environment Committee, of which I am a member, discussed Cardiff Bay and asked for further reports on how the £6.1 million allocated to 'other regeneration' is to be spent. I do not want to dwell on that issue now. However, it is important that the Assembly gives clear guidance to the WDA, and all the other bodies that have responsibility for investing in projects around Wales, on spreading investment evenly over Wales. We do not want the situation that existed prior to the Assembly's establishment, where people in certain areas felt that all the investment went to one region at the expense of others. It is important that the Committee, in its scrutiny of how the WDA spends its money, ensures that that is considered. I am sure that the

gwelir cymeradwyo'r ddogfen raglennu sengl. Wedyn gallwn ddechrau ar y gwaith manwl o roi'r ddogfen ar waith, dechrau'r cynlluniau a sicrhau ein bod yn dechrau creu'r ffyniant y soniasom amdano gyhyd. Mae cyllid cyfatebol yn fater o hyd. Fodd bynnag, y mater a godaf fi yw bod y rhan helaethaf o arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a ddaeth i Gymru hyd yn hyn, fel y nododd yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans o Sefydliad Menter Cymru, wedi ei sianelu i'r sector cyhoeddus. Er fy mod yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw defnyddio arian yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer gwelliannau yn y seilwaith cyhoeddus, mae'n amlwg bod angen sianelu mwy o arian Ewropeaidd i'r gwir grewyr cyfoeth yng Nghymru—y sector preifat a busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Rhaid inni sicrhau, pan ystyriwn sut y gweithredir hyn, yn enwedig ar lefel ranbarthol, ein bod yn ceisio cyfeirio cymaint ag y bo modd o'r arian hwn i greu swyddi gwirioneddol, cynaliadwy. Rhaid inni beidio â gweld hyn fel siarter arall i adeiladu ffyrdd. Byddai hynny'n groes i fwriad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd i gael mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio trafndiaeth integredig. Mae trafndiaeth yn bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol ond mae angen inni hefyd greu swyddi a chyfoeth. I wneud hynny rhaid inni fuddsoddi mewn busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ac mewn hyfforddiant fel y gall pobl fanteisio'n llawn ar yr arian hwn.

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â lledaeniad buddsoddi cyhoeddus. Mewn cyfarfod ar y cyd, cafwyd trafodaeth gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd, yr wyf yn aelod ohono, ar Fae Caerdydd a gofynnwyd am adroddiadau pellach ar y modd y gwerir y £6.1 miliwn a ddyrannwyd i 'eitemau adfywio eraill'. Nid wyf am ymhelaethu ar y mater hwnnw'n awr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad roi arweiniad clir i'r WDA, a'r holl gyrff eraill sydd yn gyfrifol am fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau o amgylch Cymru, ar ledaenu buddsoddi'n gyfartal ledled Cymru. Nid ydym am gael y sefyllfa a gafwyd cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, lle'r oedd pobl mewn rhai ardaloedd yn teimlo bod yr holl fuddsoddi'n mynd i un rhanbarth ar draul eraill. Mae'n bwysig bod y Pwyllgor, wrth archwilio sut y mae'r WDA yn gwario ei arian, yn sicrhau y rhoddir ystyriaeth i hynny.

process has begun, but I wanted to draw attention to it.

My third point is about the New Deal. The entrepreneurship action plan refers to building an entrepreneurship strand into New Deal type schemes. 'A Better Wales' proposes that, by March 2003, the New Deal will have helped 30,000 under 25-year-olds to leave benefit for work and training. By the end of June 1999, only 6,500 unemployed young people, out of the 19,800 entering the New Deal in Wales, had secured sustained jobs. The system for providing entrepreneurial opportunities for New Deal participants could be a valuable alternative to low income and short-term unemployment and training and would lead to a job. I participated in a discussion in Swansea City and County Council on this item this morning. We discussed the training centre that the council operates in Landore, which has a turnover of about £3 million for training. It has clear ideas about how it will use Objective 1 money to try to raise the level of training in the deprived areas of Swansea. It is important that we ensure that Objective 1 money is used, as far as possible, to create a culture of entrepreneurship among young people, encouraging them to start up businesses. Valuable projects such as the Phoenix centre that is being set up in Townhill, Swansea, which is a series of starter units being built by the Council, using European money in a deprived area, are also important initiatives from which other areas in Wales can learn.

My final point concerns tourism, which will be discussed by the South West Wales Regional Committee on Friday. It is important for the constituency I represent, which includes areas such as the Gower and Porthcawl, where large parts of the economy are dependent on tourism. It is important that we have a tourism strategy and I am sure that the Committee is working on one. That will help to invest in tourism and to try to take advantage of the assets that we have in Wales. Members of the tourist industry perceive that there is a problem and there is

Yr wyf yn sicr bod y broses wedi dechrau, ond yr oeddwn am dynnu sylw ati.

Mae fy nhrydydd pwynt yn ymwneud â'r Fargen Newydd. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth yn cyfeirio at greu elfen entrepreneuriaeth mewn cynlluniau o fath y Fargen Newydd. Y bwriad yn 'Gwell Cymru' yw y bydd y Fargen Newydd, erbyn Mawrth 2003, wedi helpu 30,000 o rai dan 25 mlwydd oed i adael budd-daliadau am waith a hyfforddiant. Erbyn diwedd Mehefin 1999, dim ond 6,500 o bobl ifanc ddi-waith, o blith y 19,800 a ddaeth i'r Fargen Newydd yng Nghymru, a oedd wedi sicrhau swyddi cynaliedig. Gallai'r system ar gyfer darparu cyfleoedd entrepreneuriaidd i'r rhai sydd yn cymryd rhan yn y Fargen Newydd fod yn ddewis gwerthfawr yn lle incwm isel a diweithdra a hyfforddiant tymor byr a byddai'n arwain at swydd. Cymerais ran mewn trafodaeth yng Nghyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe ar yr eitem hon y bore yma. Trafodasom y ganolfan hyfforddi a weithredir gan y cyngor yng Nglandŵr, sydd â throsiant o tua £3 miliwn ar gyfer hyfforddi. Mae ganddi syniadau pendant ynghylch y modd y bydd yn defnyddio arian Amcan 1 i geisio codi'r lefel o hyfforddiant yn ardaloedd difreintiedig Abertawe. Mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau y defnyddir arian Amcan 1, hyd y gellir, i greu diwylliant o entrepreneuriaeth ymysg pobl ifanc, gan eu hannog i ddechrau busnesau. Mae prosiectau gwerthfawr fel canolfan Phoenix sydd yn cael ei sefydlu yn Townhill, Abertawe, sydd yn gyfres o unedau dechrau a godir gan y Cyngor, gan ddefnyddio arian Ewropeaidd mewn ardal ddifreintiedig, hefyd yn fentrau pwysig y gall ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru ddysgu oddi wrthynt.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â thwristiaeth, a drafodir gan Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-orllewin ddydd Gwener. Mae'n bwysig i'r etholaeth a gynrychiolaf, sydd yn cynnwys ardaloedd fel Bro Gŵyr a Phorthcawl, lle y mae rhannau helaeth o'r economi'n dibynnu ar dwristiaeth. Mae'n bwysig inni gael strategaeth dwristiaeth ac yr wyf yn sicr bod y Pwyllgor yn gweithio ar un. Bydd hynny'n gymorth i fuddsoddi mewn twristiaeth a cheisio manteisio ar yr asedau sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae aelodau o'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn ystyried bod

one in the sense that the tourist industry is not adjusting easily to the developing trends in how people take their holidays and how they use their money for leisure pursuits. Research needs to be done into this and investment and training in the tourism industry is needed.

**Ron Davies:** I add my thanks to Val to those of several colleagues. There is no doubt that she faced a difficult and demanding task as Chair of the Economic Development Committee. She is entitled to reflect today on a job well done. She held the Committee together during difficult times. She had some difficult Members on that Committee—Phil Williams and Alun Cairns, of course—although some of us tried to be as co-operative and helpful as we could. Despite that, she held the Committee together and arrived at consensus. She has put in much time and effort and hard work behind the scenes and the Committee has functioned all the better for it.

I also add my thanks to Helen Usher who has done a superb job as Committee clerk. She has been unfailingly courteous and helpful and has worked long hours to ensure that Committee members have been properly served. I also reflect Alun Cairns's comments to Rhodri, because Rhodri has been as open as he could be with the Committee and that has been much appreciated.

I move on to the officials who have served the Committee, because undoubtedly it has been a new and challenging experience for them. Voluminous reports have been presented to us. This is a point that I wanted to discuss with Val, but time has prevented it. However, on receiving the Committee's first report, perhaps we should reflect on whether or not we have tried to overload the system. There have been difficulties meeting deadlines. I wonder whether the fact that we tried to cover so much work in so much depth has been a handicap. Perhaps, in future, we should focus on fewer subjects and then, Phil, maybe we can get the balance right between scrutiny mode and policy development. At the moment we rush through so many matters that we are not sure whether we are in

problem ac mae un yn yr ystyr nad yw'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn addasu'n rhwydd i'r tueddiadau sydd yn datblygu yn y modd y mae pobl yn cymryd eu gwyliau a sut y defnyddiant eu harian ar gyfer diddordebau hamdden. Mae angen ymchwilio i hyn ac mae angen buddsoddi a hyfforddi yn y diwydiant twristiaeth.

**Ron Davies:** Atef af ddiolchiadau sawl cydweithiwr arall i Val. Nid oes dwywaith iddi wynebu tasg anodd ac ymestynnol fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Mae ganddi hawl i fwrw golwg yn ôl heddiw ar y swydd dda o waith a gyflawnodd. Daliodd y Pwyllgor at ei gilydd drwy amseroedd anodd. Yr oedd ganddi rai Aelodau anodd ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw—Phil Williams ac Alun Cairns, wrth gwr—er i rai ohonom geisio bod mor gydweithredol a chymwynasgar ag y gallem. Er hynny, daliodd y Pwyllgor at ei gilydd a chyrraedd consensws. Cyfrannodd lawer o amser ac ymdrech a gwaith caled y tu ôl i'r llenni a gweithredodd y Pwyllgor yn well byth oherwydd hynny.

Atef af finau fy niolch hefyd i Helen Usher a wnaeth waith gwych fel clerck y Pwyllgor. Bu'n gwrtais ac yn gymwynasgar bob amser a gweithiodd oriau hir i sicrhau bod yr aelodau Pwyllgor yn derbyn pob cymorth priodol. Atef af hefyd sylwadau Alun Cairns mewn perthynas â Rhodri, oherwydd bu Rhodri mor agored ag y gallai â'r Pwyllgor a gwerthfawrogwyd hynny'n fawr.

Symudaf ymlaen at y swyddogion a wasanaethodd y Pwyllgor, oherwydd bu'n sicr yn brofiad newydd ac ymestynnol iddynt hwy. Cyflwynwyd adroddiadau swmpus i ni. Mae hyn yn bwynt yr oeddwn am ei drafod â Val, ond mae prinder amser wedi rhwystro hynny. Fodd bynnag, wrth dderbyn adroddiad cyntaf y Pwyllgor, efallai y dylem fyfyrion ynghylch a ydym wedi ceisio gorlwytho'r system. Bu anawsterau wrth geisio cwblhau gwaith mewn pryd. Tybed a fu'r ffaith inni geisio cyflawni cymaint o waith mor fanwl yn anfantais. Efallai, yn y dyfodol, y dylem ganolbwyntio ar lai o bynciau ac wedyn, Phil, efallai y gallwn gael y cydbwysedd iawn rhwng y modd archwilio a datblygu polisi. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn brysio drwy gynifer o faterion fel nad ydym yn sicr a ydym yn y

scrutiny or policy development mode. I suggest that we could learn from Sue Essex's Local Government and Environment Committee, where Committee members took time out to sit together on an all-party basis to work out what the Committee wanted to achieve and whether it wanted to sit more in scrutiny mode or policy mode. Perhaps if we did that in a non-confrontational way it would serve to improve the Committee's functioning.

3:50 p.m.

The question that is always on my mind is what are we achieving. Scrutiny is important but what are we achieving? Phil made great play of the fact that we have already bought a new dimension to politics. The Economic Development Committee and the Assembly as a whole are important. However, we must also ask ourselves, given the time and effort put in by Members and officials, how are we improving the decision-making process and policy outcomes and how are we adding value to the process. We have all tried hard in the Economic Development Committee but we have not yet reached the stage—with the exception perhaps of Objective 1 funding—where we can say that the policy output is better for our deliberations.

I will talk briefly about two points. First, one thing that has struck me in all of our deliberations is the sheer size of the task before us. It may well have escaped the attention of Assembly Members that we received a report from a panel of economists in the autumn outlining the scale of the task before us. Wales's gross domestic product per capita in the current year is estimated by economists as 82 per cent of that of the UK. To achieve our target of 90 per cent of the UK GDP by 2010, we must achieve a rate of growth of 1 per cent higher than that of the UK as a whole. The UK estimated growth for that 10-year period is between 2.25 and 2.5 per cent. We are assuming on the basis of our targets that we will achieve a rate of economic growth in Wales of between 3.25 and 3.5 per cent growth. That is 50 per cent higher than the long-run average of Welsh growth and it is higher than any rate of

modd archwilio neu'r modd datblygu polisi. Awgrymaf y gallem ddysgu oddi wrth Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd Sue Essex, lle y neilltuwyd amser gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor o bob plaid i eistedd gyda'i gilydd i benderfynu beth yr oedd y Pwyllgor eisiau ei gyflawni ac i ba raddau yr oedd am eistedd yn y modd archwilio neu yn y modd polisi. Efallai pe baem yn gwneud hynny mewn modd anwrthdrawiadol y byddai'n fodd i wella gweithrediad y Pwyllgor.

Y cwestiwn sydd ar fy meddwl bob amser yw beth yr ydym yn ei gyflawni. Mae archwilio'n bwysig ond beth yr ydym yn ei gyflawni? Gwnaeth Phil yn fawr o'r ffaith ein bod eisoes wedi dod â dimensiwn newydd i wleidyddiaeth. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Cynulliad cyfan yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni holi'n hunain hefyd, o ystyried yr amser a'r ymdrech a gyfrennir gan Aelodau a swyddogion, ym mha fodd yr ydym yn gwella'r broses penderfynu a chanlyniadau polisi a sut yr ydym yn ychwanegu gwerth at y broses. Gwnaethom oll ymdrech galed yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ond nid ydym eto wedi cyrraedd y man—heblaw yn achos arian Amcan 1 efallai—lle y gallwn ddweud bod y cynnyrch polisi'n well oherwydd ein trafodion.

Siaradaf yn fyr am ddau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, un peth a'm trawodd ym mhob un o'n trafodion yw maint aruthrol y dasg sydd o'n blaen. Efallai nad yw Aelodau Cynulliad wedi sylwi inni dderbyn adroddiad gan banel o economegwyr yn yr hydref a oedd yn amlinellu maint y dasg sydd o'n blaen. Mae economegwyr yn amcangyfrif bod y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn gyfredol yn 82 y cant o un y DU. Er mwyn cyrraedd ein targed o 90 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y DU erbyn 2010, rhaid inni gyrraedd cyfradd twf sydd yn 1 y cant yn uwch na'r DU gyfan. Amcangyfrifir y bydd twf y DU yn y cyfnod hwnnw o 10 mlynedd rhwng 2.25 a 2.5 y cant. Rhagdybiwn ar sail ein targedau y byddwn yn cyrraedd cyfradd twf economaidd yng Nghymru o rhwng 3.25 a 3.5 y cant. Mae hynny'n 50 y cant yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd twf tymor hir yng Nghymru

growth that we have seen since the end of the First World War. That indicates the scale of the task before us. The panel of economists concluded in their report,

‘that the targets are challenging, but not impossible. However to achieve them will require a break in trend and policies to mobilise all the resources at our disposal. Existing policies on the existing scale will not break the trend’.

We have not faced up to that. Those figures are for Wales as a whole and we all know that the needs in west Wales and the Valleys are much greater. The GDP in the single programming document submission that we made shows that we had 81 per cent of the UK average. We want to see that increased by 2010. We have a daunting task before us. We have raised aspirations as a result of various debates and we now have a one-off opportunity with Objective 1. However, last week, Cambridge Econometrics—one of the advisers that we received back in September—said in its report, ‘Cambridge Regional Economic Prospects’,

‘given that Wales’s GDP per capita is at present around 82 per cent of the UK average, to reach a target of 90 per cent by the year 2010 is an ambition unlikely to be achieved within current resource constraints and industrial rigidities in the local economy’.

Those people advised us in the autumn. It is for that reason that I—who represent an Objective 1 area—have been determined to ensure that we achieve public expenditure survey cover for that Objective 1 funding and that we also achieve full match funding. It is vital that we set ourselves these targets and, unless we get those resources, everybody agrees that we will not achieve those targets. It is a serious point that we must address.

My second matter is one that I thought Phil

ac yn uwch nag unrhyw gyfradd twf a welsom ers diwedd y Rhyfel Byd Cyntaf. Mae hynny’n dangos maint y dasg sydd o’n blaen. Casgliad y panel economegwyr yn eu hadroddiad oedd,

‘bod y targedau’n ymestynnol, ond nid yn amhosibl. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn eu cyrraedd bydd angen toriad yn y duedd a pholisïau i grynhoi’r holl adnoddau sydd ar gael i ni. Ni fydd y polisïau presennol ar y raddfa bresennol yn torri’r duedd’.

Nid ydym wedi wynebu hynny. Mae’r ffigurau hynny ar gyfer Cymru gyfan a gwyddom oll fod yr anghenion yng ngorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd yn fwy o lawer. Mae’r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl a gyflwynwyd gennym yn dangos bod gennym 81 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Yr ydym am weld cynnydd yn hynny erbyn 2010. Mae gennym dasg frwydychus o’n blaen. Yr ydym wedi codi gobeithion o ganlyniad i amryw o ddadleuon a bellach mae gennym gyfle unwaith ac am byth gydag Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd Cambridge Econometrics—un o’r cynghorwyr a dderbyniasom yn ôl ym Medi—yn ei adroddiad, ‘Cambridge Regional Economic Prospects’,

‘o dderbyn bod y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd tua 82 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, mae cyrraedd targed o 90 y cant erbyn y flwyddyn 2010 yn uchelgais nad yw’n debygol o gael ei gyrraedd oddi mewn i’r cyfyngiadau presennol ar adnoddau a’r anhyblygrwydd yn yr economi leol’.

Fe’n cynghorwyd gan y bobl hynny yn yr hydref. Dyna’r rheswm pam yr wyf fi—sydd yn cynrychioli ardal Amcan 1—wedi bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau y cawn arian o dan yr arolwg gwariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer y cyllid Amcan 1 hwinnw a’n bod hefyd yn sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol llawn. Mae’n holl bwysig inni bennu’r targedau hyn i ni’n hunain ac, os na chawn yr adnoddau hynny, mae pawb yn cytuno na chyrhaeddwn y targedau hynny. Mae’n bwynt difrifol y mae’n rhaid inni roi sylw iddo.

Mae fy ail fater yn un y tybiais fod Phil am

was going to address following Val's invitation in her opening remarks. It is the application of information and communications technology in Wales. Over the last week we have heard good news about Airbus, Intel, British Telecom investment and so on. These developments are welcome but that kind of development at best will not stop us falling behind. These developments will not achieve the step change that we need in the Welsh economy if we are to close the gap. They will allow us to keep marching on but we will be marching on behind. We must catch up. All the indicators are that, rather than catching up on the UK economy as a whole, we are lagging behind, particularly in the application of ICT. There is no doubt in my mind that we will experience a traumatic revolution in the application of ICT. The Office of National Statistics reported in November last year that Wales is the second lowest in Great Britain in terms of the percentage of households who own home computers. In London and the south-east, 36 per cent of households have a home computer. In the whole of England, 31 per cent of households have a home computer. In Wales, we are 33 per cent behind London. Only 25 per cent of people in Wales have access to a home computer. The figures for those who have access to the internet are even worse. Not surprisingly, London is ahead with 16 per cent. The south-east is next with 13 per cent and England as a whole has 11 per cent, but the figure for Wales is less than 50 per cent of the London figure—7 per cent of homes in Wales have access to the internet.

The Department of Trade and Industry has defined what it calls an indicator of ICT connectivity. That is jargon, but it means the percentage of companies that use modern technology. Four groups were identified. Again, not surprisingly, London is at the top with 74 per cent of companies using modern technology; the Midlands and the south-east are in the next group with between 58 and 65 per cent. Many of our competitors are in the third group—Yorkshire, the east Midlands, Scotland, the south-west and the north-east,

ymdrin ag ef ar ôl gwahoddiad Val yn ei sylwadau agoriadol. Hwnnw yw'r defnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yng Nghymru. Dros yr wythnos diwethaf clywsom newyddion da am fuddsoddiadau Airbus, Intel, British Telecom ac yn y blaen. Mae'r datblygiadau hyn i'w croesawu ond ni fydd y math hwnnw o fuddsoddi, ar y gorau, yn ein hatal rhag syrthio'n ôl. Ni fydd y datblygiadau hyn yn sicrhau'r newid cam y mae ei angen arnom yn economi Cymru os ydym i gau'r bwlch. Byddant yn caniatáu inni gerdded yn ein blaen o hyd ond byddwn yn cerdded ar ôl. Rhaid inni ddal y gweddill i fyny. Yr hyn a welir o'r holl ddangosyddion yw ein bod, yn lle dal i fyny ag economi'r DU gyfan, yn llusgo ar ôl, yn enwedig yn y defnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl y byddwn yn profi chwyldro ysgytiol yn y defnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Adroddodd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Genedlaethol yn Nhachwedd y llynedd mai Cymru yw'r ail isaf ym Mhrydain Fawr o ran y ganran o deuluoedd sydd yn berchen ar gyfrifiadur yn y cartref. Yn Llundain a'r de-ddwyrain, mae gan 36 y cant o deuluoedd gyfrifiadur cartref. Yn Lloegr gyfan, mae gan 31 y cant o deuluoedd gyfrifiadur yn y cartref. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym 33 y cant ar ôl Llundain. Dim ond 25 y cant o bobl Cymru sydd â mynediad at gyfrifiadur yn y cartref. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer y rhai sydd â mynediad at y rhyngwyd yn waeth fyth. Fel y gellid disgwyl, mae Llundain ar y blaen â 16 y cant. Y de-ddwyrain sydd nesaf â 13 y cant a'r ffigur ar gyfer Lloegr gyfan yw 11 y cant, ond mae'r ffigur ar gyfer Cymru'n llai na 50 y cant o ffigur Llundain—7 y cant o'r cartrefi yng Nghymru sydd â mynediad at y rhyngwyd.

Mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wedi diffinio'r hyn a eilw'n ddangosydd o gysylltedd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Jargon yw hynny, ond golyga ganran y cwmnïau sydd yn defnyddio technoleg fodern. Dynodwyd pedwar grŵp. Unwaith eto, fel y gellid disgwyl, Llundain sydd uchaf gyda 74 y cant o gwmnïau'n defnyddio technoleg fodern; mae canolbarth Lloegr a'r de-ddwyrain yn y grŵp nesaf gyda rhwng 58 a 65 y cant. Mae llawer o'n cystadleuwyr yn y trydydd grŵp—Swydd

which have between 51 and 54 per cent, and Wales is lagging behind with Northern Ireland with between 43 and 48 per cent of companies having access to and using ICT. Those are huge challenges, because unless we can get into the game and compete and challenge and apply that level of technology, we will not close the gap.

That is worrying because the Committee's debates have been about inward investment and how we develop our indigenous industries. We have not yet got on to the challenging territory about the future impact of ICT on our existing businesses, regardless of whether they are inward investors or indigenous industries. We must ask ourselves how we will prepare industry and business in Wales and how we will fashion the entrepreneurial spirit in Wales—which you want to encourage, Alun—to respond to these new challenges, particularly in 2002, when we face the prospect of licensing for the third generation mobile phones that are being developed and will transform the existing revolutionary systems of ICT.

I have no doubt that there are huge opportunities facing Wales, particularly if we can harness Objective 1 resources. There will be stunning changes in ICT in the private sector. We have already seen that in the announcements by BT, Alta Vista and especially NTL, which has a strong base in Wales and so much to offer. We must ask ourselves how we can engender skills development and a sense of co-operation, and how we can use the resources and institutions that we have at our disposal—universities, the further education sector, training and enterprise councils, our schools and the whole of our education system, local authorities, the Welsh Development Agency, the Open University, the Digital College and the University for Industry. We must draw these institutions together—not merge them, because the last thing we want is further institutional change—so that we have a single, coherent strategy and we can look at

Efrog, dwyrain canolbarth Lloegr, yr Alban, y de-orllewin a'r gogledd-ddwyrain, sydd â rhwng 51 a 54 y cant, ac mae Cymru'n llusgo ar ôl gyda Gogledd Iwerddon sydd â rhwng 43 a 48 y cant o'u cwmnïau â mynediad at ac yn defnyddio TGCh. Mae'r rheini yn heriau aruthrol, oherwydd oni allwn ddod yn rhan o'r gêm a chystadlu a herio a defnyddio'r lefel honno o dechnoleg, ni fyddwn yn cau'r bwlch.

Mae hynny'n peri pryder oherwydd bu dadleuon y Pwyllgor yn ymwneud â mewnfuddsoddi a sut yr ydym yn datblygu ein diwydiannau cynhenid. Nid ydym eto wedi cyrraedd y maes ymestynnol sydd yn ymwneud ag effaith technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn y dyfodol ar ein busnesau presennol, pa un ai a ydynt yn fewnfuddsoddwyr neu'n ddiwydiannau cynhenid. Rhaid inni holi'n hunain sut y byddwn yn paratoi diwydiant a busnes yng Nghymru a sut y byddwn yn creu'r ysbryd entrepreneuriaid yng Nghymru—yr ydych chi am ei hybu, Alun—i ymateb i'r heriau newydd hynny, yn enwedig yn 2002, pan wynebwn y disgwyliad o drwyddedu ar gyfer y drydedd genhedlaeth o ffonau symudol sydd yn cael eu datblygu ac a fydd yn trawsnewid y systemau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu chwyldroadol presennol.

Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf fod cyfleoedd aruthrol yn wynebu Cymru, yn enwedig os y gallwn harneisio adnoddau Amcan 1. Bydd newidiadau syfrdanol mewn technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn y sector preifat. Gwelsom hynny eisoes yn y cyhoeddiadau gan BT, Alta Vista ac yn enwedig NTL, sydd â sylfaen gryf yng Nghymru a chymaint i'w gynnig. Rhaid inni ofyn i ni'n hunain sut y gallwn feithrin datblygiad medrau ac ymdeimlad o gydweithredu, a sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r adnoddau a'r sefydliadau sydd ar gael i ni—prifysgolion, y sector addysg bellach, cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, ein hysgolion a'r cwbl o'n system addysg, awdurdodau lleol, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, y Brifysgol Agored, y Coleg Digidol a'r Brifysgol i Ddiwydiant. Rhaid inni dynnu'r sefydliadau hyn at ei gilydd—nid eu cyfuno, oherwydd y peth olaf y mae arnom ei angen yw newid sefydliadol pellach—fel bod gennym un strategaeth gydlynol ac fel y



the opportunities and our resources and ensure that we are equipped to face the challenges of the next decade. We must build on our understanding, from the Economic Development Committee's work, of our present problems. We understand the potential for improvement and we must face up to the opportunities but, above all, we must pull all those strands together into a coherent and united strategy. If we can do that, it will be the most important challenge that the Economic Development Committee will face under your chairpersonship, Val, during the coming months. If we do that, we will add another notch to our bow, Phil, in terms of hopefully getting Objective 1 funding, by laying the strategy for the future development of Wales, of which we can all be proud.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon. Er nad wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, nid wyf yn gyfangwbl anwybodus o'i waith, gan fy mod wedi mynychu ambell gyfarfod fel eilydd ac wedi gwyllo ambell gyfarfod arall o bell. Hoffwn wneud sylwadau ynglŷn a'm pryderon ynghylch gwaith y Pwyllgor hyd yn hyn a chynnig awgrymiadau ar gyfer dyfodol.

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi treulio llawer o amser yn trafod cronfeydd strwythurol, sydd yn briodol iawn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ofyn a yw'r Pwyllgor wedi gwneud yr hyn y gall yn nhermau Amcan 1. Mae materion cyllid cyfatebol ac ychwanegedd yn bwysig, ond i raddau helaeth maent oddi allan i rymoedd uniongyrchol y Pwyllgor. Mae gweithredu Amcan 1 o fewn galluoedd y Pwyllgor.

4:00 p.m.

Yr ydym bellach yng nghanol Mawrth ac nid oes gennym wybodaeth lawn, na hyd yn oed wybodaeth gychwynnol, ynglŷn â sut y caiff Amcan 1 ei weithredu yng nghymunedau gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, nac ynglŷn â sut y dylai'r sector gwirfoddol a busnes wneud ceisiadau am arian Amcan 1.

Yr wyf yn gadeirydd fforwm Amcan 1 yng Ngheredigion, a sefydlwyd ddechrau haf y llynedd. Mae gwaith y fforwm yn cael ei lesteirio gan y diffyg gwybodaeth hwn. Hyd

gallwn edrych ar y cyfleoedd a'n hadnoddau a sicrhau ein bod yn barod i wynebu heriau'r degawd nesaf. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar ein dealltwriaeth, drwy waith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, o'n problemau presennol. Deallwn y potensial i wella a rhaid inni wynebu'r cyfleoedd ond, yn fwy na dim, rhaid inni dynnu'r holl elfennau hynny at ei gilydd i greu strategaeth gydlynol ac unedig. Os gallwn wneud hynny, hon fydd yr her bwysicaf a wyneba'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o dan eich cadeiryddiaeth chi, Val, yn ystod y misoedd sydd i ddod. Os gwnawn hynny, byddwn yn ychwanegu at ein sgôr, Phil, o ran cael arian Amcan 1, gobeithiaf, drwy osod y strategaeth ar gyfer datblygiad Cymru yn y dyfodol, y gallwn oll ymfalchïo ynddo.

**Elin Jones:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this discussion. Although I am not a member of the Economic Development Committee, I am not completely ignorant of its work, as I have attended some of its meetings as a deputy and have observed other meetings from afar. I will make comments regarding my concerns about the Committee's work so far and will offer suggestions for the future.

The Committee has spent a great deal of time discussing structural funds, which is very appropriate. However, we must ask if the Committee has done what it can in terms of Objective 1. Issues of match funding and additionality are important, but to a substantial degree they are outwith the direct powers of the Committee. Implementing Objective 1 is within the Committee's powers.

We are now in the middle of March and we do not have full information, or even initial information, on how Objective 1 will be implemented in the communities of west Wales and the Valleys, nor on how the voluntary sector and business should submit bids for Objective 1 funding.

I chair the Objective 1 forum in Ceredigion, which was established at the beginning of last summer. The forum's work is being hindered by this lack of information. As far as I can

y gwelaf, yr unig wybodaeth a gynhyrchwyd gan y Llywodraeth ar Amcan 1 yw'r llyfryn bach lliwgar a gyhoeddwyd tua dau fis yn ôl. Llyfryn arwynebol ydyw sy'n cynnwys gwybodaeth gwbl annigonol ar sut i wneud ceisiadau Amcan 1. Yr wyf yn blino ar glywed y Llywodraeth, ar unigolion o fewn y Llywodraeth ac ar aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn beirniadu'r gwrthbleidiau am beidio â gwneud y gwaith o annog cynlluniau Amcan 1. Mae rhai ohonom wedi bod yn gweithio ers o leiaf haf y llynedd, yn trafod cynlluniau Amcan 1 o fewn ein hetholaethau. Yr hyn a'n daliodd yn ôl oedd diffyg gwybodaeth a gweithredu gan y Pwyllgor ar ganllawiau gweithredu Amcan 1. Dylai'r Pwyllgor fod wedi rhoi blaenoriaeth i hyn ynghynt ac wedi mynnu bod yr Ysgrifennydd Datblygu Economaidd a'r gweision sifil yn cyflenwi'r adnoddau ar gyfer y gwaith hwn. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai partneriaeth ehangach Amcan 1 wedi croesawu hynny hefyd.

Yr wyf yn pryderu am fater arall ynglŷn ag Amcan 1, sef ymwneud y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd â datblygu gwledig. Cwestiwn oeseol yw a ddylai datblygu gwledig fod ar wahân i brif ffrwd datblygu economaidd, neu a ddylid integreiddio'r ddau. Yn y Cynulliad mae'r ddau bwnc ar wahân, gyda dau Bwyllgor yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Tu allan i'r Cynulliad mae'r ddau wedi'u hintegreiddio, wrth i Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig ddod yn rhan o Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Hoffwn sicrhau bod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cydweithio'n agos. Cyfeiriodd Phil Williams at hyn eisoes. Yn y pen draw, mae datblygu amaethyddiaeth a chefn gwlad yn rhan o ddatblygiad economaidd Cymru.

**Glyn Davies:** In a debate that is so important to the future of the Assembly, it is disappointing to find that not one member of the Executive is present in the Chamber.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is known of course that, within our protocols, priority should be given to attendance in the Chamber. In fairness, I am often surprised at

see, the only information produced by the Government on Objective 1 is the colourful little booklet that was published about two months ago. It is a superficial booklet that contains wholly insufficient information on how to submit Objective 1 bids. I am tired of hearing the Government, individuals within the Government and members of the Economic Development Committee criticising opposition parties for not working to encourage Objective 1 schemes. Some of us have been working since at least last summer, discussing Objective 1 schemes in our constituencies. We have been held back by the Committee's lack of information and action on Objective 1 implementation guidelines. The Committee should have given priority to this sooner and insisted that the Economic Development Secretary and civil servants provided the resources to carry out this work. I am sure that that would also have been welcomed by the wider Objective 1 partnership.

I am concerned about another matter related to Objective 1, which is the Economic Development Committee's involvement in rural development. It is an age-old question whether rural development should be separate from the mainstream of economic development, or whether they should be integrated. Within the Assembly the two subjects are separate and are the responsibility of two Committees. Outwith the Assembly they are integrated, as the Development Board for Rural Wales has become part of the Welsh Development Agency. I would like to ensure that the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and the Economic Development Committee work closely together. Phil Williams has already referred to this. Ultimately, developing agriculture and the countryside is part of the economic development of Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** Mewn dadl sydd mor bwysig i ddyfodol y Cynulliad, siomedig yw canfod nad oes yr un aelod o'r Weithrediaeth yn bresennol yn y Siambr.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwyddys, wrth gwrs, oddi mewn i'n protocolau, y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i bresenoldeb yn y Siambr. Er tegwch, synnaf yn aml at y graddau y mae'r

the extent to which the Executive is able to be present. I am sure that it will rectify this situation immediately.

**Elin Jones:** Ni wnaif sylw ar yr ymyriad gan i'r Llywydd ateb y pwynt.

Dychwelaf at fy nghyfeiriad at yr hyn sydd efallai yn ddiffyg cydweithio rhwng y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Cyfeiriodd Phil Williams at y diffyg trafodaeth fanwl o fewn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Mae'r diffyg mewnbwn o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig i ddogfen raglennu sengl Amcan 1 hefyd yn anffodus.

Canlyniad hynny oedd bod diffyg cydnabyddiaeth o anghenion penodol cefn gwlad yn y ddogfen a aeth i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a derbyniwyd ymateb gan y comisiwn yn cadarnhau hyn. Gobeithiaf, pan gawn drafodaeth ar ddogfen derfynnol Amcan 1, y ceir dehongliad mwy realistig a pherthnasol o anghenion gwledig, fel y dymunwn i, fel rhywun sydd yn cynrychioli etholaeth wledig, ei weld.

Cais yw fy mhwynt olaf am drafodaeth lawn ar rôl twristiaeth yn nyfodol economaidd Cymru. Gwnaeth Nick Bourne sylw y prynhawn yma ar ein trafodaeth ym Mhwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Cawsom gyflwyniad da gan Brif Weithredwr Bwrdd Croeso Cymru o'i weledigaeth ar gyfer twristiaeth yn nyfodol economaidd Cymru. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd trafodaeth yfory ar strategaeth Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ond gobeithiaf y gall y Pwyllgor neilltuo amser sylweddol i dwristiaeth yn y dyfodol agos.

Mae twristiaeth yn sector o'r economi sydd yn cyfrannu ar draws Cymru. Mae'n cyfrannu at economi Bae Caerdydd, Bae Aberteifi, Bae Cinnel ac ar draws y mynyddoedd a'r dyffrynoedd rhwng yr arfordiroedd hynny.

Weithrediaeth yn gallu ymbresenoli. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn unioni'r sefyllfa hon ar unwaith.

**Elin Jones:** I will not comment on the intervention because the Presiding Officer has answered the point.

I return to my point about what is possibly lack of co-operation between the Economic Development Committee and the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. Phil Williams referred to the lack of detailed discussion within the Economic Development Committee on the rural development plan. The lack of input from the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee to the Objective 1 single programming document is also unfortunate.

As a result, there was insufficient recognition of the specific needs of rural areas in the document that went to the European Commission and a response was received from the commission confirming this. I hope, when we have a discussion on the final Objective 1 document, that there will be a more realistic and relevant interpretation of the needs of rural areas, as I, as someone who represents a rural electorate, would like to see.

My final point is a request for a full discussion on the role of tourism in Wales's economic future. Nick Bourne made an observation this afternoon on our discussion in the Mid Wales Regional Committee in Blaenau Ffestiniog last Friday. We had a good presentation by the Wales Tourist Board's Chief Executive of his vision for tourism in Wales's economic future. I am aware that there will be a discussion tomorrow on the Wales Tourist Board's strategy in the Economic Development Committee, but I hope that the Committee can put aside a considerable amount of time to consider tourism in the near future.

Tourism is a sector of the economy that contributes across Wales. It contributes to the economy of Cardiff Bay, Cardigan Bay, Kinnel Bay and across the mountains and valleys between those coastlines.

Mae gennyf dri phwynt i Gadeirydd ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd gan unigolyn o'r tu allan. Yn gyntaf, gwybodaeth ar frys ar weithredu Amcan 1; yn ail, cydweithio agos gyda'r Pwyllgor Amaeth a Datblygu Gwledig; ac yn drydydd, sylw llawn a theilwng, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, i rôl twristiaeth mewn datblygu economaidd.

**Glyn Davies:** I am pleased that the members of the Economic Development Committee have spoken so well of each other—verging on the self-congratulatory in places. Most of the smoke-signals coming out of that Committee over the last few months have indicated that the debate was perhaps verging, not only on the robust, but beyond the robust. It has been encouraging today to hear this different tone. I am sure that it will continue in the future.

I am in no doubt that the Economic Development Committee's work is probably the most important with which the Assembly is involved. Every aspect of the Assembly's work and every Committee's work is important. However, the degree to which the Assembly manages to increase the comparative level of prosperity in Wales will probably be the measure by which the Welsh public will judge, not only whether or not we have been successful, but whether or not the establishment of the Assembly was worthwhile. The Economic Development Committee is important to us all. Those of us not on the Committee take an interest in its debates, and we have had some concerns. Like Elin Jones, I have had some concerns over our Objective 1 debates. I was concerned about some of the language used by the European Union when talking about the single programming document. We have concerns about access—businesses that wish to take advantage of Objective 1 are finding difficulties. That is discouraging, to a great extent, in terms of how successful Objective 1 is likely to be.

The second issue in which many of us have taken an interest is the Cardiff Bay development project and the transfer of the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation to another authority. My own preference would have been for the CBDC to continue for a

I have three points for the Chair and members of the Economic Development Committee from an individual from the outside. First, urgent information on Objective 1 implementation; second, close co-operation with the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee; and third, full and worthy consideration, as soon as possible, to the role of tourism in economic development.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch bod aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi canmol ei gilydd gymaint—gan ymylu ar fod yn hunanglodforus ar brydiau. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r arwyddion mwg a ddaeth o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw dros y misoedd diwethaf yn awgrymu bod y ddadl yn ymylu, nid ar fod yn rymus, ond ar fod yn fwy na grymus. Calonogol heddiw oedd clywed yr oslef wahanol hon. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd hynny'n parhau yn y dyfodol.

Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf mai gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ôl pob tebyg yw'r pwysicaf y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud ag ef. Mae pob agwedd ar waith y Cynulliad ac ar waith pob Pwyllgor yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg mai'r graddau y bydd y Cynulliad yn llwyddo i gynyddu'r lefel ffyniant gymharol yng Nghymru fydd y mesur a ddefnyddia'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru i farnu, nid yn unig a fuom yn llwyddiannus ai peidio, ond a oedd sefydlu'r Cynulliad o fudd ai peidio. Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn bwysig inni oll. Mae'r rhai ohonom nad ydym ar y Pwyllgor yn ymddiddori yn ei ddadleuon, a bu rhai pryderon gennym. Fel Elin Jones, bu gennyf rai pryderon ynghylch ein dadleuon ar Amcan 1. Yr oeddwn yn bryderus am rai o'r geiriau a ddefnyddiwyd gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd wrth sôn am y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Mae gennym bryderon ynghylch mynediad—mae busnesau sydd yn dymuno manteisio ar Amcan 1 yn profi anawsterau. Mae hynny'n siomedig, i raddau helaeth, o ran pa mor llwyddiannus y mae Amcan 1 yn debygol o fod.

Yr ail fater y mae llawer ohonom wedi ymddiddori ynddo yw prosiect datblygu Bae Caerdydd a throsglwyddo Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i awdurdod arall. Buasai'n well gennyf pe bai Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd wedi parhau ychydig

little while longer. Since that was not going to happen, it seemed vital that the transfer of the bay and barrage was to a body that had the expertise and experience to ensure its success. I have worried a lot about this because I am not sure that that will happen.

4:10 p.m.

It may seem strange to many that, living in mid Wales as I always have, I should take an interest in the bay, but I have done since the beginning. I well remember when the proposal to develop the barrage and the bay was first mooted. It was during the early days of my career in local government. People tried to persuade me that this was to the disadvantage of mid Wales and that I should express that view and become involved in a campaign against spending too much money in south-east Wales and disapprove of it. I spent a lot of time examining my position. I even travelled to Baltimore to see how the project there was working, and found it to be exciting. I also spent a couple of days in Cardiff, in the early 1980s, looking around at the vision that was proposed for Cardiff Bay. I deliberately decided not to become involved in the antipathy or the objection, because I believed that the scale of what was proposed in Cardiff Bay was such that it could enhance the reputation of Wales and become an all-Wales project. It could be of great benefit, partly through tourism and partly through other forms of image, to the whole of Wales.

That is an area where we must be careful. We are currently undertaking changes in the management or development of the Cardiff Bay project. The worst thing we could do would be to not finish the project properly. It is not finished yet, but if it is not finished and if in some way we do not make the remaining investments to deliver the vision that was there at the start, we will have a project that is a Cardiff project and not a Wales project. It may seem strange but I believe that we must deliver the entire vision to make it a Wales project that will benefit the other parts of Wales.

I will approach today's debate constructively.

hwy. Gan nad oedd hynny i ddigwydd, ymddangosai'n holl bwysig trosglwyddo'r bae a'r morglawdd i gorff a chanddo'r arbenigedd a'r profiad i sicrhau ei lwyddiant. Pryderais lawer ynghylch hynny oherwydd nid wyf yn sicr y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

Gallai ymddangos yn rhyfedd i lawer, a minnau'n byw yng nghanolbarth Cymru erioed, fy mod yn ymddiddori yn y bae, ond yr wyf ers y dechrau. Cofiaf yn dda'r adeg pan grybwyllwyd gyntaf y bwriad i ddatblygu'r morglawdd a'r bae. Yr oedd yn ystod dyddiau cynnar fy ngyrfa mewn llywodraeth leol. Ceisiodd rhai fy narbwylllo bod hyn er anfantais i ganolbarth Cymru ac y dylwn fynegi'r farn honno a dod yn rhan o ymgyrch yn erbyn gwario gormod o arian yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru a'i anghymeradwyo. Treuliais lawer o amser yn ystyried fy sefyllfa. Teithiais i Baltimore, hyd yn oed, i weld sut yr oedd y prosiect yn y fan honno'n gweithio, a chefais ei fod yn gyffrous. Treuliais ychydig ddyddiau yng Nghaerdydd hefyd, yn y 1980au, yn edrych o gwmpas ar y weledigaeth a gynigiwyd ar gyfer Bae Caerdydd. Penderfynais yn fwiadol beidio â bod â rhan yn yr elyniaeth neu'r gwrthwynebiad, oherwydd credais fod maint yr hyn a gynigiwyd ym Mae Caerdydd yn gyfryw fel y gallai hyrwyddo enw da Cymru a dod yn brosiect i Gymru gyfan. Gallai fod o fudd mawr, yn rhannol drwy dwristiaeth ac yn rhannol drwy ffurfiau eraill o ddelwedd, i Gymru gyfan.

Mae hynny'n faes lle y mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ymgymryd â newidiadau yn rheolaeth neu ddatblygiad prosiect Bae Caerdydd. Y peth gwaethaf y gallem ei wneud yw peidio â chwblhau'r prosiect yn iawn. Nid yw wedi ei gwblhau eto, ond os na chwblheir ef ac os na fyddwn rywfodd yn peri i'r buddsoddiadau sydd yn weddill gyflawni'r weledigaeth a oedd yno ar y dechrau, bydd gennym brosiect sydd yn brosiect i Gaerdydd ac nid yn brosiect i Gymru. Gallai ymddangos yn rhyfedd ond credaf fod rhaid inni gyflawni'r weledigaeth gyfan i'w wneud yn brosiect i Gymru a fydd o les i rannau eraill Cymru.

Ymdriniaf â'r ddadl heddiw yn adeiladol.

There are some issues that I want to address and I hope, perhaps, to encourage the Committee to take on board the points I make rather than interpret it as a criticism of how the Committee has operated.

I cannot help but note the Committee's membership. We all have an all-Wales perspective in what we do, but the entire membership of the Committee, apart from one member from north Wales, is south Wales orientated. I was not going to speak in this debate until I saw that. I thought that as I am from mid Wales and interested in economic development I should contribute to the debate. There is a danger of it being perceived from the outside as a south Wales orientated Assembly. We must challenge that perception at every opportunity, which is part of what I am trying to do now.

I still feel the bitterness that I felt when the Development Board for Rural Wales was wound up. That was a huge mistake. Many people do not agree with that, but that is my opinion. I was also disappointed that we have decided not to continue with the Mid Wales Training and Enterprise Council in its present form. I am keen on developing a strategic vision for mid Wales, as that is what I regard as important. There is a regional committee, but there must be an executive side to developing the perspective of mid Wales as a region. The TEC could have done that. I do not agree with what this Assembly has done in terms of dealing with post-16 education.

I will emphasise a couple of important issues concerning mid Wales. One concerns how this Assembly views the development of mid Wales. Sometimes there is a danger—and Elin Jones touched on this—whereby it is seen as an issue for the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. There is no doubt that actions to support the agricultural industry in its difficult financial position are important. It is vital that we take all the steps we can to add value to the primary product from the industry. However, if we are to enhance the prosperity of rural parts of Wales, and in mid Wales particularly, we must see it in terms of developing an alternative employment structure, which is

Mae rhai materion yr wyf am roi sylw iddynt a gobeithiaf, efallai, annog y Pwyllgor i dderbyn rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaif yn hytrach na'u dehongli fel beirniadaeth o'r modd y gweithredodd y Pwyllgor.

Ni allaf beidio â gwneud sylw am aelodaeth y Pwyllgor. Mae gennym oll olwg ar Gymru gyfan yn yr hyn a wnawn, ond mae holl aelodaeth y Pwyllgor, ar wahân i un aelod o ogledd Cymru, â'i gogwydd at dde Cymru. Nid oeddwn am siarad yn y ddadl hon nes gweld hynny. Tybiais y dylwn gyfrannu i'r ddadl, gan fy mod o ganolbarth Cymru ac yn ymddiddori mewn datblygu economaidd. Mae perygl y'i gwelir o'r tu allan fel Cynulliad sydd â'i ogwydd at dde Cymru. Rhaid inni herio'r canfyddiad hwnnw ar bob cyfle, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'r hyn y ceisiaf ei wneud yn awr.

Yr wyf yn dal i deimlo'r chwerwedd a deimlais pan gafodd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig ei ddirwyn i ben. Yr oedd hynny'n gamgymeriad anferth. Mae llawer nad ydynt yn cytuno â hynny, ond dyna fy marn i. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig hefyd na phenderfynasom barhau â Chyngor Hyfforddi a Menter Canolbarth Cymru ar ei ffurf bresennol. Yr wyf yn frwd dros ddatblygu gweledigaeth strategol ar gyfer canolbarth Cymru, gan mai hynny a ystyriaf yn bwysig. Ceir pwyllgor rhanbarthol, ond rhaid cael ochr weithredol ar ddatblygu'r persbectif o ganolbarth Cymru fel rhanbarth. Gallasai'r CHM fod wedi gwneud hynny. Ni chytunaf â'r hyn a wnaeth y Cynulliad hwn o ran delio ag addysg ôl-16.

Yr wyf am bwysleisio ychydig o faterion pwysig sydd yn ymwneud â chanolbarth Cymru. Mae a wnelo un â'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn edrych ar ddatblygu canolbarth Cymru. Mae perygl weithiau—a chyfeiriodd Elin Jones at hyn—y'i gwelir yn fater i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Nid oes dwywaith bod camau i gefnogi'r diwydiant amaethyddol yn ei sefyllfa ariannol anodd yn bwysig. Mae'n holl bwysig inni gymryd yr holl gamau y gallwn i ychwanegu gwerth at y cynnyrch sylfaenol o'r diwydiant. Fodd bynnag, os ydym i hybu ffyniant rhannau gwledig o Gymru, ac yng nghanolbarth Cymru'n arbennig, rhaid inni weld hynny yn nhermau

not necessarily based on developing the agricultural industry. Agriculture and its downstream alone is insufficient to develop the levels of prosperity that I want to see.

The issue of trunk roads is also important. I accept Ron Davies's comments on the development of ICT. You can multiply that and apply it to rural Wales in particular. We discussed this in a regional committee as a specific item some time ago. I was shocked to hear evidence implying that, far from catching up in rural Wales, the gap was widening. There was a danger of us falling further behind. I had always had the perception, like many, that rural Wales could develop through ICT because you would not need roads, you would not need to be there and distances would be shortened. It has come as a shock to me that distances are becoming longer.

I emphasise the continuing importance of the trunk road system, which has almost become an old-fashioned issue to discuss. It is a vital issue in mid Wales. I am not talking about improving the trunk roads within mid Wales—small-scale strategic improvements in places would be sufficient—but the connections to mid Wales: the connection between the M4 to Carmarthen and south-east Ceredigion; the connection between Blaenau Ffestiniog and the A55 in north Wales. It is embarrassing to call the A470 north of Blaenau a trunk road. The road between Welshpool and the English border is a key road. It is outside what we perceive to be the mid Wales region. The development of northern Ceredigion, south Meirionnydd and northern Powys depend on that connection. We should not forget that.

**Phil Williams:** Are you suggesting that transport should be part of the responsibility of the Economic Development Committee rather than that of the Local Government and Environment Committee?

**Glyn Davies:** One difficulty in looking at economic development—it has been touched

datblygu strwythur cyflogaeth amgen, nad yw o reidrwydd yn seiliedig ar ddatblygu'r diwydiant amaethyddol. Mae amaethyddiaeth a'r hyn sydd yn ei sgîl yn annigonol ar ei ben ei hun i ddatblygu'r lefelau ffyniant yr wyf am eu gweld.

Mae mater cefnffyrdd yn bwysig hefyd. Derbyniaf sylwadau Ron Davies ar ddatblygu TGCh. Gallwch luosi hynny a'i gymhwyso i gefn gwlad Cymru'n arbennig. Trafodasom hyn mewn pwyllgor rhanbarthol fel eitem benodol beth amser yn ôl. Fe'm syfrdanwyd o glywed tystiolaeth sydd yn awgrymu, yn hytrach na bod y bwllch yn cau yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, bod y bwllch yn agor ymhellach. Yr oedd perygl y byddem yn syrthio'n ôl ymhellach. Y canfyddiad sydd gennyf erioed, fel llawer un arall, yw y gallai cefn gwlad Cymru ddatblygu drwy dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu oherwydd ni fyddai arnoch angen ffyrdd, ni fyddai angen ichi fod yno a byddai'r pellterau'n cael eu byrhau. Yr oedd yn synn gennyf fod y pellterau'n hwyhau.

Pwysleisiaf bwysigrwydd parhaus y system cefnffyrdd, a ddaeth bron yn fater hen ffasiwn i'w drafod. Mae'n fater holl bwysig yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Nid wyf yn sôn am wella cefnffyrdd oddi mewn i ganolbarth Cymru—byddai mân welliannau strategol mewn rhai mannau'n ddigon—ond am y cysylltiadau â chanolbarth Cymru: y cyswllt rhwng yr M4 i Gaerfyrddin a de-ddwyrain Ceredigion; y cyswllt rhwng Blaenau Ffestiniog a'r A55 yng ngogledd Cymru. Peth chwithig yw galw'r A470 i'r gogledd o'r Blaenau yn gefnffordd. Mae'r ffordd rhwng y Trallwng a'r ffin â Lloegr yn ffordd allweddol. Mae'r tu allan i'r hyn a ganfyddwn yn rhanbarth canolbarth Cymru. Mae datblygu gogledd Ceredigion, de Meirionnydd a gogledd Powys yn dibynnu ar y cyswllt hwnnw. Ni ddylem anghofio hynny.

**Phil Williams:** A ydych yn awgrymu y dylai trafndiaeth fod yn rhan o gyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn hytrach na'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd?

**Glyn Davies:** Un anhawster wrth ystyried datblygu economaidd—cyfeiriwyd at hyn gan

on by one or two speakers before me—is that almost everything we do in the Assembly impacts in some way on economic development. You cannot talk specifically about economic development without talking about the other aspects of our work. We try to confine ourselves in a debate and not talk about side issues, but by doing so we diminish the debate and make it far less relevant.

The second issue is that of developing tourism. Previous speakers have talked about the comments of the chief executive of the Wales Tourist Board at the last meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee in Maentwrog, near Blaenau Ffestiniog, when he openly accused the Assembly of not paying sufficient attention to tourism. I do not know whether or not that is true. It is certainly a view that is felt by many in the industry, to whom I have been talking. I was interested to hear that there will be a debate on tourism tomorrow in the Economic Development Committee.

I will give my views on the structure of how the industry is represented. I take the Wales Tourist Board as an example. Before the Assembly was established and before Labour came to power at Westminster in 1997, there was a lot of anti-quango publicity and campaigns. Many existing quangos feel nervous and in need of reassurance. It is important that the Assembly recognises that an agency such as the WTB is vital to the future of tourism and that we must take every opportunity to reassure it of that.

The second important aspect is a unified structure for the private trade. We have a body called the Wales Tourism Alliance. These are early days, but I hope that in some way we will play a part in helping that body develop and become a significant voice for the trade in Wales. We also have the regional companies. They feel nervous about where they are going. I hope that the Assembly notes my view that regional companies are vital. They are a forum in which the tourism trade and local government have succeeded in working well together. Regional companies have succeeded in erasing competitiveness, which made the message

un neu ddau o siaradwyr o'm blaen i—yw bod bron bopeth a wnawn yn y Cynulliad yn effeithio rywfodd ar ddatblygu economaidd. Ni allwch sôn yn benodol am ddatblygu economaidd heb sôn am yr agweddau eraill ar ein gwaith. Ceisiwn ein cyfyngu ein hunain mewn dadl a pheidio â sôn am faterion ymylol, ond wrth wneud hynny yr ydym yn bychanu'r ddadl ac yn ei gwneud yn llai perthnasol o lawer.

Yr ail fater yw datblygu twristiaeth. Mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi sôn am sylwadau prif weithredwr Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd ym Maentwrog, ger Blaenau Ffestiniog, pan gyhuddodd y Cynulliad yn agored o beidio â rhoi digon o sylw i dwristiaeth. Ni wn a yw hynny'n wir ai peidio. Mae'n sicr yn farn a goleddir gan lawer yn y diwydiant, y bûm yn siarad â hwy. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol clywed y bydd dadl ar dwristiaeth yfory yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd.

Rhoddaf fy marn am strwythur cynrychiolaeth y diwydiant. Cymeraf Fwrdd Croeso Cymru'n enghraifft. Cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad a chyn i Lafur ddod i rym yn San Steffan yn 1997, yr oedd llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd ac ymgyrchoedd yn erbyn cwangos. Mae llawer o'r cwangos presennol yn teimlo anniddigrwydd a'r angen am sicrwydd. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn cydnabod bod asiantaeth fel Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn holl bwysig i ddyfodol twristiaeth a'n bod yn achub ar bob cyfle i roi sicrwydd iddo am hynny.

Yr ail agwedd bwysig yw strwythur unedig ar gyfer y fasnach breifat. Mae gennym gorff o'r enw Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru. Dyddiau cynnar yw'r rhain, ond gobeithiaf y byddwn rywfodd yn chwarae rhan wrth helpu'r corff hwnnw i ddatblygu a dod yn llais o bwys dros y fasnach yng Nghymru. Mae gennym hefyd y cwmnïau rhanbarthol. Maent yn teimlo'n anniddig ynghylch eu cyfeiriad. Gobeithiaf fod y Cynulliad yn nodi fy marn bod cwmnïau rhanbarthol yn holl bwysig. Maent yn fforwm lle y mae'r fasnach dwristiaeth a llywodraeth leol wedi llwyddo i gydweithio'n dda. Mae cwmnïau rhanbarthol wedi llwyddo i ddileu ymrysongarwch, oedd



that we sent out seem disparate. I hope that the Committee ensures that it does not take action that would prevent that from working as efficiently in future.

I have tried to be constructive about two issues that are important to me: the economic prosperity of mid Wales and the tourism industry, which will play a significant part in that.

4:20 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I am glad to see that the Economic Development Committee has spent a great deal of time on Objective 1 issues. Objective 1 is the biggest economic development issue facing Wales for the next decade. However, in many parts of north Wales there is a perception that urban areas will get the lion's share. I make regular visits to the Rhondda—to see my mother rather than to do a David Davies-style photo opportunity tour of opposition seats—and I can see for myself that Valley communities need help. However, the outstanding landscapes and clean air of north Wales do not pay the bills. Rural areas also need economic development. Conwy has some of the lowest wages in Wales. Labour's national minimum wage meant a substantial pay rise for around 4,000 workers living in my part of Wales. I welcome the Conservative Party's recent conversion to the idea of a decency threshold for all.

It is particularly important to support local SMEs who demonstrate innovative approaches. In this context I mention the work of the Snowdonia Cheese Company. A group of farmers in my constituency are concerned about low milk prices and are getting involved with the value-added business of high quality cheese production. They should be congratulated and supported. To Alun Cairns, I would say that 'entrepreneur' does translate into Welsh. It just needs our support. Members do not need to take my word for the excellence of the cheese company's product. Yesterday, I brought 60 of these cheeses in my car boot to the Assembly, and I will distribute them to all Assembly Members later this week. I

yn gwneud y neges a ledaenem yn un anghydweddol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Pwyllgor yn sicrhau nad yw'n cymryd camau a fyddai'n eu rhwystro rhag gweithio'r un mor effeithlon yn y dyfodol.

Ceisiais fod yn adeiladol am ddau fater sydd yn bwysig i mi: ffyniant economaidd canolbarth Cymru a'r diwydiant twristiaeth, a fydd yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi treulio llawer iawn o amser ar faterion Amcan 1. Amcan 1 yw'r mater datblygu economaidd mwyaf sydd yn wynebu Cymru yn y degawd nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae canfyddiad mewn sawl rhan o ogledd Cymru mai'r ardaloedd trefol a gaiff y rhan fwyaf. Yr wyf yn ymweld yn rheolaidd â'r Rhondda—i weld fy mam yn hytrach nag i wneud taith o seddau'r wrthblaid yn null David Davies i dynnu lluniau—a gallaf weld dros fy hun fod angen cymorth ar gymunedau'r Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw tirweddau gwych ac awyr iach gogledd Cymru yn talu'r biliau. Mae ar ardaloedd gwledig angen eu datblygu'n economaidd hefyd. Gan Gonwy y mae rhai o'r cyflogau isaf yng Nghymru. Yr oedd isafswm cyflog Llafur yn golygu codiad cyflog sylweddol i tua 4,000 o weithwyr sydd yn byw yn fy rhan i o Gymru. Croesawaf dröedigaeth ddiweddar y Blaid Geidwadol i'r syniad o drothwy gwedduster i bawb.

Mae'n arbennig o bwysig cefnogi busnesau lleol bach a chanolig eu maint sydd yn amlygu dulliau arloesol. Yn y cyd-destun hwn soniaf am waith y Snowdonia Cheese Company. Mae grŵp o ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth yn bryderus ynghylch prisiau llaeth isel ac yn dechrau ymwneud â'r busnes gwerth ychwanegol o gynhyrchu caws o ansawdd uchel. Dylid eu llongyfarch a'u cefnogi. Dywedaf wrth Alun Cairns fod gair Cymraeg am 'entrepreneur'. Y cwbl y mae arno ei angen yw ein cefnogaeth ni. Nid oes rhaid i'r Aelodau gymryd fy ngair i am ragoriaeth cynnyrch y cwmni caws. Ddoe, deuthum â 60 o'r cosynnau hynny yng nghist fy nghar i'r Cynulliad, ac fe'u dosbarthaf i'r Aelodau Cynulliad i gyd yn ddiweddarach yr

reassure Wales's most famous vegetarian—I am afraid she is not here at the moment—that this product will not cause her any difficulties. This is currently a small business but I have no doubt that with a bit of help from us it will become a big cheese in the near future.

I conclude with a few remarks about the role of the new communications technology in economic development. The internet is transforming how the economy works and is about to have a major impact on the way we work, shop and live. Some of this is oversold and some 'dot coms' are absurdly over-rated. The likes of lastminute.com are not a stock for widows and orphans and certainly not the sort of stock on which to bet your pension. However, beneath this froth there are some fundamental changes at work. We would do well to use Objective 1 funding to create a fully wired Wales, with a substantial investment in the IT skill upgrading of our people, matched with a leading role for the Assembly and our partners in local government in providing not just joined-up Government but wired-up Government.

Ron Davies is quite right: ICT will be a key engine in the new economy. The message to date is not encouraging. I take little comfort from ICT connectivity indicies. We could start to remedy these problems by providing free internet access as a universal service obligation in Welsh public libraries. We could go beyond the English plans and put laptops in the hands of teachers in schools. We could provide easy, rapid and effective access to e-commerce advice for SMEs throughout Wales. Some of this has already taken place but we need to go further. With the right plans and the financial commitment we can close this prosperity gap. However, we should not be under any illusions. There is also the potential to fall even further behind.

**Brian Hancock:** First, I thank members of the Economic Development Committee and offer congratulations to our Chair, Val Feld

wythnos hon. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i fwydlysieuydd enwocaf Cymru—mae arnaf ofn nad yw yma ar hyn o bryd—na fydd y cynnyrch hwn yn peri unrhyw anhawster iddi. Busnes bach yw hwn ar hyn o bryd ond nid oes amheuaeth gennyf y bydd, gydag ychydig o gymorth gennym ni, yn fusnes o bwys yn y dyfodol agos.

Terfynaf ag ychydig o sylwadau am rôl y dechnoleg cyfathrebu newydd mewn datblygu economaidd. Mae'r rhyngwrwyd yn gweddnewid y modd y mae'r economi'n gweithio ac mae ar fin cael effaith fawr ar y modd yr ydym yn gweithio, yn siopa ac yn byw. Mae rhywfaint o orddweud am hyn ac mae rhai o'r 'dot coms' wedi eu gorbrisio'n hurt. Nid yw rhai fel lastminute.com yn stoc ar gyfer gweddwon a phlant amddifad ac yn sicr nid yn stoc y dylech fentro'ch pensiwn arno. Fodd bynnag, y tu ôl i'r malu awyr hwn y mae rhai newidiadau sylfaenol ar waith. Byddai'n dda o beth inni ddefnyddio arian Amcan 1 i greu Cymru gwbl wifrog, gyda buddsoddi helaeth i uwchraddio medrau TG ein pobl, law yn llaw â rôl arweiniol i'r Cynulliad a'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol wrth ddarparu nid yn unig Lywodraeth gydgysylltiedig ond Llywodraeth wifrog.

Mae Ron Davies yn llygad ei le: bydd TGCh yn beiriant allweddol yn yr economi newydd. Nid yw'r neges hyd yma'n galonogol. Ychydig o gysur a gymeraf o'r mynegeiau cysylltedd TGCh. Gallem ddechrau cywiro'r problemau hyn drwy ddarparu mynediad am ddim i'r rhyngwrwyd fel rhwymedigaeth gwasanaeth gyffredinol mewn llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Gallem fynd y tu hwnt i'r cynlluniau yn Lloegr a rhoi cyfrifiaduron arffed yn nwylo athrawon mewn ysgolion. Gallem ddarparu mynediad rhwydd, cyflym ac effeithiol at gyngor ar e-fasnach i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ledled Cymru. Mae rhywfaint o hyn wedi digwydd eisoes ond mae angen inni fynd ymhellach. Gyda'r cynlluniau iawn a'r ymrwymiad ariannol gallwn gau'r bwloch hwn mewn ffyniant. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem dwyllo ein hunain o gwbl. Mae'n bosibl hefyd y gellid syrthio'n ôl ymhellach.

**Brian Hancock:** Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a llongyfarchaf ein Cadeirydd, Val Feld a

who has done a sparkling job even though she shuts me up sometimes. I welcome this report and the opportunity to speak today because this is an important part of the work of 'Wales plc'. It has been a busy 10 months.

The task of getting to the bottom of Objective 1 funding and the single programming document has been time consuming, and rightly so, because everything depends upon it. We have managed to have joint committee meetings with the Local Government and Environment Committee on Cardiff Bay. I am a member of both committees, so have a foot in both camps. We considered Cardiff Bay last week, so I will not go through it again, but concerns about issues such as the £12 million for environmental costs, the lack of a business plan and the expertise needed to operate the barrage and its operation to no less a standard than any other organisation are important. Cardiff Bay will be a selling point not just for Cardiff but for Wales. We must get it right.

I welcome the establishment of a development bank. It was one of Plaid Cymru's priorities in the Assembly's first months. We must think carefully about how it is going to develop and about its next steps. We need to ask who, what, where, when, why and how. I am concerned about these questions in terms of the Objective 1 programme, small and medium enterprises, tourism and rural development. Where does the commitment to establish a small business taskforce fit in? It is a concern that the 'e' in training and enterprise councils should not be lost, given their experience with SMEs and I welcome the appointment of a business expert advisor. Small and medium businesses, including voluntary and community enterprises, exist throughout Wales. It is said that if every SME took on one additional person, the unemployment situation in Wales could be solved. These businesses in the rural, urban and valley areas of Wales could have great impact on deprivation in Wales. I make a complaint here that small businesses such as our sub-post offices are not being supported, although they employ people and provide a partnership and a service to our communities. The additional impacts of deprivation affect our

wnaeth waith gwych er ei bod yn rhoi taw arnaf weithiau. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'r cyfle i siarad heddiw oherwydd mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o waith 'Cymru ccc'. Bu'n 10 mis prysur.

Treuliwyd llawer o amser ar y dasg o fynd i waelod ariannu Amcan 1 a'r ddogfen raglennu sengl, a hynny'n briodol, oherwydd mae popeth yn dibynnu arno. Llwyddasom i gael cyfarfodydd pwyllgor ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a'r Amgylchedd ynghylch Bae Caerdydd. Yr wyf yn aelod o'r ddau Bwyllgor, felly yr wyf yn perthyn i'r ddwy ochr. Ystyriasom Fae Caerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf, felly nid af drwy hynny eto, ond mae pryderon ynghylch materion fel y £12 miliwn am gostau amgylcheddol, diffyg cynllun busnes a'r arbenigedd busnes sydd yn angenrheidiol i weithredu'r morglawdd a'i weithredu yn ôl safon nad yw'n is nag un unrhyw gorff arall yn bwysig. Bydd Bae Caerdydd yn nodwedd gwerthu nid yn unig i Gaerdydd ond i Gymru. Rhaid inni gael hyn yn iawn.

Croesawaf sefydlu banc datblygu. Yr oedd yn un o flaenoriaethau Plaid Cymru ym misoedd cyntaf y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni feddwl yn ofalus ynghylch y modd y bydd yn datblygu ac am ei gamau nesaf. Mae angen inni ofyn pwy, beth, ymhle, pryd, pam a sut. Pryderaf am y cwestiynau hynny o ran y rhaglen Amcan 1, busnesau bach a chanolig, twristiaeth a datblygu gwledig. Ym mhle y mae'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu tasglu busnesau bach yn ffitio? Mae'n bryder na cholir y 'fenter' yn y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter, yng ngolwg eu profiad gyda busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint a chroesawaf benodi cynghorydd arbenigol ar fusnes. Mae busnesau bach a chanolig, gan gynnwys mentrau gwirfoddol a chymunedol, yn bodoli ledled Cymru. Dywedir y gellid datrys y sefyllfa diweithdra yng Nghymru pe bai pob busnes bach a chanolig ei faint yn cyflogi un person ychwanegol. Gallai'r busnesau hyn yn ardaloedd gwledig, trefol a chymoedd Cymru gael effaith fawr ar amddifadedd yng Nghymru. Nodaf fy nghwyn yn y fan hon nad yw busnesau bach fel ein his-swyddfeydd post yn cael cefnogaeth, er eu bod yn cyflogi pobl ac yn cynnig partneriaeth a gwasanaeth i'n cymunedau. Mae effeithiau ychwanegol amddifadedd yn effeithio ar ein systemau

education systems and housing.

I have in mind a picture of Wales as a three-legged stool made of Welsh hard wood. To make it stand, it must have the three balanced legs of the economy, employment and the social aspect. I include under the heading 'social aspect' the environment, equal opportunities, education, health and housing. We need to get this balance right or Wales will not grow sustainably. The next steps in economic development are important because 'Wales plc' depends upon them. How we encourage large or small companies to invest in Wales is important because we need a balance of large, small and medium enterprises. Ireland managed to do this by cutting corporation tax. Our challenge is to find an initiative that will excite investors to come to Wales and provide high quality and well paid jobs, which will improve the well-being of people in the whole of Wales, not just those in the Valleys and the M4 belt.

At the same time we need to encourage local, home-grown businesses and enterprises. Here again I make a plea that we remember local, voluntary and community enterprises. Education and training will play an important part in this. The growth we expect in GDP per capita may not be sustained unless we get a growth in the quality of skills for life, including ICT skills and entrepreneurship. Tourism is also of growing importance. Tourism is perceived to be the global industry. We must support and ensure extreme development to get in front of the rest of the world and to have a lead. We need a strategy and spatial targets, because it will vary throughout Wales. We must consider the development of green tourism and good transport links. We might have to consider transport jointly with the other Committee.

4:30 p.m.

On tourism, the branding of Wales—*gwnaethpwyd yng Nghymru* or made in Wales—in terms of food and other manufactured goods should be part of the experience of Wales. Only last year Caerphilly cheese was made for the first time

addysg a thai.

Mae gennyf ddarlun yn fy meddwl o Gymru fel stôl deircoes a wnaethpwyd o bren caled o Gymru. Er mwyn ei chael i sefyll, rhaid cael tair coes gyfartal, sef yr economi, cyflogaeth a'r agwedd gymdeithasol. O dan bennawd yr 'agwedd gymdeithasol' cynhwysaf yr amgylchedd, cyfle cyfartal, addysg, iechyd a thai. Rhaid inni gael y cydbwysedd hwn yn iawn neu ni fydd Cymru'n tyfu'n gynaliadwy. Mae'r camau nesaf mewn datblygu economaidd yn bwysig oherwydd mae 'Cymru ccc' yn dibynnu arnynt. Mae'r modd yr ydym yn annog cwmnïau mawr neu fach i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru'n bwysig oherwydd mae arnom angen cydbwysedd o fusnesau mawr, bach a chanolig. Llwyddodd Iwerddon i wneud hyn drwy dorri'r dreth gorfforaeth. Yr her i ni yw darganfod menter a fydd yn cymell buddsoddwyr i ddod i Gymru ac yn darparu swyddi o ansawdd uchel â thâl da, a fydd yn hwb i les pobl Cymru gyfan, nid y rhai yn y Cymoedd a llain yr M4 yn unig.

Ar yr un pryd mae angen inni hybu busnesau a mentrau lleol, cynhenid. Yma eto, gwnaf apêl inni gofio mentrau lleol, gwirfoddol a chymunedol. Bydd addysg a hyfforddiant yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn hyn. Efallai na chynhelir y twf a ddisgwyliwn yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen os na chawn dwf yn ansawdd y medrau ar gyfer byw, gan gynnwys medrau TGCh ac entrepreneuriaeth. Mae twristiaeth hefyd o bwys cynyddol. Cydnabyddir mai twristiaeth yw'r diwydiant byd-eang. Rhaid inni gefnogi a sicrhau datblygu eithafol er mwyn achub y blaen ar weddill y byd a bod ar y blaen. Mae arnom angen strategaeth a thargedau gofodol, oherwydd bydd yn amrywio ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni ystyried datblygu twristiaeth wyrdd a chysylltiadau trafndiaeth da. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried trafndiaeth ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor arall.

Ynghylch twristiaeth, dylai brandio Cymru—*gwnaethpwyd yng Nghymru*—o ran bwyd a nwyddau gwneuthuriedig eraill fod yn rhan o'r profiad o Gymru. Y llynedd y gwnaethpwyd caws Caerffili yng Nghaerffili am y tro cyntaf ers cannoedd o flynyddoedd.

for hundreds of years in Caerphilly. Such products should have a Welsh dragon stamped on them large and proud.

**Brian Gibbons:** As Glyn Davies said, the bottom line is that the Assembly will be judged on its ability to deliver a significant gear change in Wales's economic prosperity and well-being. However, as Ron suggested, growth rates of 3 per cent plus form a massive mountain that we must climb—maybe Alun Pugh can help us—with many steep cliff faces to negotiate.

There is major consensus in the Assembly on the importance of entrepreneurship and small and medium sized enterprises. All political parties have emphasised the importance of SMEs in Wales's economic development. I agree with that. Any economic strategy that does not encourage the development of SMEs will fail, ultimately. However, are SMEs the vehicle to achieve the significant gear change in Wales's economic well-being that we seem to accept almost by default? If we consider not only the performance, but the formation and failure of SMEs in Wales, they are just about standing steady. The level of new SME formation in Wales is considerably below the average UK performance level, which, as we all know, is significantly below international levels.

Wales relies on a vehicle that is not performing well. I wonder when this vehicle will achieve the necessary gear change to bring us to a new era of economic prosperity. There is no clear international evidence that this has been achieved anywhere else. There have been sub-regional successes in Italy, Germany and Spain, but there is no evidence to suggest that SMEs have been capable of achieving the qualitative change that we are trying to achieve in Wales.

The other option is inward investment, which is very much small print stuff in documents that emanate from the Assembly. It seems to have been forgotten, although Wales has a

Dylai cynhyrchion o'r fath gael stamp draig Cymru yn fawr ac yn amlwg arnynt.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedodd Glyn Davies, diwedd y gân yw y caiff y Cynulliad ei farnu yn ôl ei allu i gyflawni newid gêr sylweddol yn ffyniant a lles economaidd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, fel yr awgrymodd Ron, mae cyfraddau twf o 3 y cant a mwyn fynydd anferth y bydd yn rhaid inni ei ddringo—efallai y gall Alun Pugh ein helpu—gyda llawer o glogwyni serth i'w goresgyn.

Mae consensws helaeth yn y Cynulliad ynghylch pwysigrwydd entrepreneuriaeth a busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Pwysleisiodd yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol mor bwysig yw busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn natblygiad economaidd Cymru. Cytunaf â hynny. Bydd unrhyw strategaeth economaidd nad yw'n hybu datblygiad busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn methu, yn y pen draw. Fodd bynnag, ai busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yw'r cyfrwng i gyflawni newid gêr sylweddol yn lles economaidd Cymru fel yr ymddangoswn i dderbyn bron yn niffyg dim arall? Os ystyriwn ffurfiant a methiant busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'u perfformiad, maent bron yn sefyll yn eu hunfan. Mae lefel ffurfio busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint newydd yng Nghymru'n is o lawer na lefel perfformiad gyfartalog y DU sydd, fel y gwyddom oll, yn is o lawer na lefelau rhyngwladol.

Mae Cymru'n dibynnu ar gyfrwng nad yw'n perfformio'n dda. Pa bryd, tybed, y bydd y cyfrwng hwn yn cyflawni'r newid gêr angenrheidiol i ddod â ni i oes newydd o ffyniant economaidd? Nid oes tystiolaeth ryngwladol bendant bod hyn wedi ei gyflawni yn unman arall. Bu llwyddiannau is-ranbarthol yn yr Eidal, yr Almaen a Sbaen, ond nid oes tystiolaeth i awgrymu bod busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint wedi gallu cyflawni'r newid ansoddol yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni yng Nghymru.

Y dewis arall yw mewnfuddsoddi, sydd yn rhywbeth a welir mewn print mân i raddau helaeth mewn dogfennau a ddaw o'r Cynulliad. Ymddengys ei fod wedi mynd yn

good record in attracting inward investment, particularly at UK level. We must consider that, but even inward investment presents problems. The location pattern of inward investment in Wales shows that 70 to 75 per cent of inward investment is in south-east and north-east Wales. If we are to achieve the dramatic changes needed in the most deprived parts of Wales, we must replicate that success elsewhere. I do not see evidence of the strategy that gives me the confidence to say that we have achieved that.

The two main vehicles to achieve the dramatic change are not functioning well. We must investigate new ways of achieving this. Inward investment is likely to be the most productive way of achieving the driven change that we need. If we do not have an indigenous entrepreneurial culture in Wales—which we do not at the moment—there are no real markets in which small companies can expand. However, if we have investment, the entrepreneurial culture in Wales can be used to source and support inward investment. Once we start creating that enterprise culture through support and sourcing, we will begin to create the new culture that is necessary for our economic regeneration.

We have a window of opportunity. Many times in the Assembly, people have pointed to the example of the Irish Republic and its success. However, we need to remind ourselves that the circumstances within the Irish Republic do not, by and large, exist in Wales. We do not have access to the same operational aids. I do not think that we have very strong social partnerships, particularly partnerships between government, trade unions and employers, which exist in the Irish Republic.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I take it that in your remarks you are advocating stronger powers and possibly even self-government for Wales to enable us to do what the Irish have done.

angof, er bod gan Gymru record dda o ran denu mewnfuddsoddi, yn enwedig ar lefel y DU. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny, ond mae hyd yn oed mewnfuddsoddi yn dod â phroblemau. Dengys patrwm lleoliad mewnfuddsoddi yng Nghymru fod 70 i 75 y cant o'r mewnfuddsoddi yn ne-ddwyrain a gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Os ydym i sicrhau'r newidiadau trawiadol sydd yn angenrheidiol yn y rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Gymru, rhaid inni ailadrodd y llwyddiant hwnnw mewn mannau eraill. Ni welaf dystiolaeth o strategaeth sydd yn rhoi'r hyder imi ddweud ein bod wedi cyflawni hynny.

Nid yw'r ddau brif gyfrwng i sicrhau newid trawiadol yn gweithredu'n dda. Rhaid inni ymchwilio i ddulliau newydd o gyflawni hyn. Mae'n debyg mai mewnfuddsoddi fydd y dull mwyaf cynhyrchiol o gyflawni'r newid cymelledig y mae arnom ei angen. Os nad oes gennym ddiwylliant entrepreneuraidd cynhenid yng Nghymru—nad oes gennym ar hyn o bryd—nid oes unrhyw farchnadoedd gwirioneddol lle y gall cwmnïau bach ehangu. Fodd bynnag, os cawn fuddsoddiad, gellir defnyddio'r diwylliant entrepreneuraidd yng Nghymru i gyflenwi a chefnogi mewnfuddsoddi. Ar ôl inni ddechrau creu'r diwylliant menter hwnnw drwy gefnogi a chyflenwi, byddwn yn dechrau creu'r diwylliant newydd sydd yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer ein hadfywiad economaidd.

Mae gennym gyfnod o gyfle. Mae rhai wedi cyfeirio lawer gwaith yn y Cynulliad at esiampl Gweriniaeth Iwerddon a'i llwyddiant. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ein hatgoffa ein hunain nad yw'r amgylchiadau oddi mewn i Weriniaeth Iwerddon yn bod, at ei gilydd, yng Nghymru. Nid oes gennym fynediad at yr un cymhorthion gweithrediadol. Ni chredaf fod gennym y partneriaethau cymdeithasol cryf iawn, yn enwedig partneriaethau rhwng llywodraeth, yr undebau llafur a'r cyflogwyr, a geir yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cymeraf fod eich sylwadau yn dadlau dros bwerau cryfach a hyd yn oed hunanlywodraeth o bosibl i Gymru i'n galluogi i wneud fel y gwnaeth y Gwyddelod.

**Brian Gibbons:** I left Ireland, and most of my family left Ireland, when there were nationalist economic policies there and I know that nationalist economic policies have dismally failed in Ireland. It was only when we started abandoning the rhetoric of nationalism that our country started seeing some economic prosperity. I would not recommend that road for Wales.

However, what is happening in Ireland is important because for the first time there are signs of bottlenecks occurring in the Irish economy, even though it is achieving success rates of 5 and 6 per cent and can anticipate doing so over the next five or six years. It has been estimated that up to 200,000 new workers will be needed in the Irish economy. Many will have to be immigrants into Ireland, which is a change from what happened in previous generations, as I have already mentioned. If the Irish economy is developing bottlenecks, it provides us with the opportunity to seek in the international market the companies that may find it less attractive to invest in Ireland over the next few years. We have the opportunity to compete more effectively in this market. If we are going to do this, one of the key areas we need to consider is the development of clusters. If we develop clustering of industrial locations, it will allow us to develop in depth the infrastructure to which so many people have referred in this debate. Through that infrastructure, we could create the virtuous circle of sustainable economic development that Wales desperately needs.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will call the Chair of the Committee to reply at 4.45 p.m. First, Jenny Randerson.

**Jenny Randerson:** As I am not a member of the Committee, I will couch my comments in a series of questions to the Chair. I seek reassurance about the role of the Committee and the way in which it has dealt with the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and its winding up. I declare an interest as a member of Cardiff county council. My comments come from an entrenched support for the principle that local government should be running the Cardiff Bay area in the future. It

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadewais Iwerddon, ac ymadawodd y rhan fwyaf o'm teulu ag Iwerddon, pan oedd polisiau economaidd cenedlaetholgar yno a gwn fod polisiau economaidd cenedlaetholgar wedi methu'n druenus yn Iwerddon. Dim ond pan ddechreuasom roi'r gorau i rethreg cenedlaetholdeb y dechreuodd ein gwlad weld rhywfaint o ffyniant economaidd. Ni fyddwn yn argymhell y ffordd honno i Gymru.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yn Iwerddon yn bwysig oherwydd am y tro cyntaf mae arwyddion bod tagfeydd yn digwydd yn economi Iwerddon, er ei bod yn cyflawni cyfraddau llwyddiant o 5 a 6 y cant ac yn gallu rhagweld gwneud hynny dros y pum neu chwe blynedd nesaf. Amcangyfrifir y bydd angen hyd at 200,000 o weithwyr newydd yn economi Iwerddon. Bydd yn rhaid i lawer ohonynt fod yn ymfudwyr i Iwerddon, sydd yn newid o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd mewn cenedlaethau cynt, fel y crybwyllais eisoes. Os yw economi Iwerddon yn datblygu tagfeydd, mae hynny'n rhoi cyfle inni chwilio yn y farchnad ryngwladol am y cwmnïau a allai weld buddsoddi yn Iwerddon dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf yn llai deniadol. Mae gennym gyfle i gystadlu'n fwy effeithiol yn y farchnad hon. Os ydym i wneud hynny, un o'r meysydd allweddol y bydd yn rhaid inni ei ystyried yw datblygu clystyrau. Os datblygwn glystyrau o leoliadau diwydiannol, bydd hynny'n caniatáu inni ddatblygu'n fanwl y seilwaith y mae cynifer wedi cyfeirio ato yn y ddatl hon. Drwy'r seilwaith hwnnw, gallem greu'r cylch rhinweddol o ddatblygu economaidd cynaliadwy y mae ar Gymru ei daer angen.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf am alw ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor i ymateb am 4.45 p.m. Yn gyntaf, Jenny Randerson.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gan nad wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor, yr wyf am roi fy sylwadau ar ffurf cyfres o gwestiynau i'r Cadeirydd. Ceisïaf sicrwydd ynghylch rôl y Pwyllgor a'r modd yr ymdriniodd â Chorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd a'i dirwyn i ben. Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor sir Caerdydd. Mae fy sylwadau'n deillio o gefnogaeth ddwfn i'r egwyddor mai llywodraeth leol ddylai redeg ardal Bae Caerdydd yn y dyfodol. Dim ond drwy gynnwys llywodraeth leol y gallwn gael

is only by involving local government that we can have true accountability in the running of this important area. I have read the papers on the winding up of CBDC. I have been interested in this issue for many years and I would welcome Val's comments on whether she was satisfied with the level of detail provided on how the Cardiff Bay area will be managed in future by the council, bearing in mind that this is an area of great environmental sensitivity. After all, a site of special scientific interest was destroyed in order to create the bay. We must be assured that what comes afterwards is the best we can possibly have. It strikes me, as other people have mentioned, that the papers lack any clear statement on what the £6.1 million referred to should be spent. As a local Cardiff Member, I believe that the money could be well spent three times over.

4:40 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** Does the honourable Member agree that £5.95 million of that will be for the purchase of the sports village site leaving only £150,000 of what might loosely be called uncommitted money?

**Jenny Randerson:** If you are providing us with that assurance, then it is a pity that it was not made clear at the time. I am happy if that is how it will go ahead. However, at the time that was not clear. I am also flattered to be called an honourable Member; I know that we are not supposed to use that language here. I thought that Rhodri was getting out of his Westminster habits.

**The Presiding Officer:** He is trying to do so.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is often forgotten that Cardiff Bay affects not only the immediate area of Butetown but also Penarth, Grangetown and, in my constituency, Cathays, Plasnewydd and Adamsdown. All of these areas are within the protected property area. One or two of these are among the most deprived wards in Wales. Alun Cairns's comments last week about the history of this issue were wrong-headed. Sue Essex, and the First Secretary through their opposition to the barrage in the early stages along with that of many local people, people

gwir atebolrwydd wrth redeg yr ardal bwysig hon. Darllenais y papurau ar ddirwyn Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ben. Yr wyf yn ymddiddori yn y mater hwn ers blynyddoedd lawer a byddwn yn falch o dderbyn sylwadau Val ynghylch a oedd yn fodlon â lefel y manylder am y modd y rheolir ardal Bae Caerdydd yn y dyfodol gan y cyngor, gan gofio bod hon yn ardal o sensitifrwydd amgylcheddol mawr. Wedi'r cwbl, dinistriwyd safle o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig er mwyn creu'r bae. Rhaid inni gael sicrwydd mai'r hyn a ddaw wedyn yw'r gorau y gallwn ei gael. Mae'n fy nharo i, fel y dywedodd eraill, nad oes dim yn y papurau sydd yn datgan yn bendant ar beth y dylid gwario'r £6.1 miliwn y cyfeiriwyd ato. Fel Aelod lleol yng Nghaerdydd, credaf y gellid gwario'r arian yn dda dair gwaith drosodd.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** A yw'r Aelod anrhydeddus yn cytuno y bydd £5.95 miliwn o hynny ar gyfer prynu safle'r pentref chwaraeon gan adael dim ond £150,000 o'r hyn y gellid ei alw'n fras yn arian heb ei neilltuo?

**Jenny Randerson:** Os ydych yn rhoi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i ni, mae'n drueni na roddwyd hynny ar ddeall ar y pryd. Yr wyf yn fodlon os mai felly yr â ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, ar y pryd nid oedd hynny'n glir. Fe'm cyfareddir hefyd o gael fy ngalw'n Aelod anrhydeddus; gwn nad ydym i fod i ddefnyddio'r geiriau hynny yma. Tybiais fod Rhodri'n ymadael â'i arferion o San Steffan.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n ceisio gwneud hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Anghofir yn aml fod Bae Caerdydd yn effeithio nid yn unig ar ardal gyfagos Butetown ond hefyd ar Benarth, Grangetown ac, yn fy etholaeth i, Cathays, Plasnewydd ac Adamsdown. Mae'r holl ardaloedd hynny oddi mewn i'r ardal eiddo gwarchoddedig. Mae un neu ddwy o'r rhain ymysg y wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Yr oedd sylwadau Alun Cairns yr wythnos diwethaf am hanes y mater hwn yn bengam. Yr oedd Sue Essex, a'r Prif Ysgrifennydd drwy eu gwrthwynebiad i'r morglawdd yn y cyfnod cynnar ynghyd â



from my own party and the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, ensured that safeguards were included in the Bill which would never have been included otherwise. The dewatering proposals, dealing with the water table and the alternative wetland reserve for birds would not have been secured if it had not been for the campaign of local people to get a development of better quality. I pay tribute to Ron Davies who was the only politician in Westminster who was ever genuinely concerned about the birds before they became a useful excuse for other people to—

**David Davies:** On the subject of the bird sanctuary that was purchased on the Gwent levels, do you agree that it is disgraceful that the farmers whose land was taken from them for that bird sanctuary have not been properly compensated? I declare an interest because I know one of them. It is appalling that a man who farmed that land for centuries had it taken away against his will, was not properly compensated and treated in an abominable fashion by the people behind this.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have no knowledge of that. The compulsory purchase order was carried out under the powers given to the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, which was led by its chairman, Sir Geoffrey Inkin. I am sure that they obeyed the laws to the letter.

It concerns me that one early proposal—and I address my remarks to the Chair of the Committee—considered in relation to the barrage was that it should remain semi-impounded to avoid the costs of aeration of the water. That is the present situation. That proposal was rejected because it would cause scour and because salt water falls to the bottom and the top layer of water is therefore more likely to cause algal blooms in the summer. We are facing that temporary situation. I would be grateful for some reassurance that there will be careful scrutiny via the appropriate agencies and by the Committee, to ensure that the temporary solution will not cause any permanent damage. We also need the Chair's assurance that the Committee will do all it can to ensure that these issues are fully investigated. The

gwrthwynebiad llawer o bobl leol, rhai o'm plaid fy hun a'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar, wedi sicrhau bod amddiffyniadau wedi eu cynnwys yn y Mesur na fuasent wedi eu cynnwys fel arall. Ni fyddai'r cynigion gwagio, yn ymwneud â'r lefel trwythiad a'r warchodfa dir gwlyb amgen ar gyfer adar wedi eu sicrhau oni bai am yr ymgyrch gan bobl leol i gael datblygiad o ansawdd gwell. Talaf deyrnged i Ron Davies a oedd yr unig wleidydd yn San Steffan a bryderai'n wirioneddol am yr adar cyn iddynt ddod yn esgus hwylus i bobl eraill—

**David Davies:** Ynghylch y warchodfa adar a brynwyd ar wastatir Gwent, a gytunwch ei bod yn warthus nad yw'r ffermwyr y cymerwyd eu tir oddi arnynt ar gyfer y warchodfa natur honno wedi cael iawndal priodol? Datganaf fuddiant oherwydd yr wyf yn adnabod un ohonynt. Mae'n waradwyddus bod dyn a ffermiodd y tir hwnnw am ganrifoedd wedi ei weld yn cael ei gymryd oddi arno o'i anfodd, ei fod heb gael iawndal priodol a'i fod wedi ei drin yn gywilyddus gan y rhai sydd y tu ôl i hyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid wyf yn gwybod dim am hynny. Cyflawnwyd y gorchymyn pryniant gorfodol o dan bwerau a roddwyd i Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, oedd dan arweiniad ei chadeirydd, Syr Geoffrey Inkin. Yr wyf yn sicr iddynt ufuddhau i'r deddfau i'r llythyren.

Pryderaf mai un cynnig cynnar—a chyfeiriaf fy sylwadau i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor—a ystyriwyd mewn perthynas â'r morglawdd oedd y dylai aros wedi ei hanner gronni er mwyn osgoi costau nwyeddio'r dŵr. Dyna'r sefyllfa bresennol. Gwrthodwyd y cynnig hwnnw am y byddai'n achosi sgwrfa ac am fod dŵr heli yn mynd i'r gwaelod a'r haen uchaf o ddŵr yn fwy tebygol felly o achosi ysllafan algaidd yn yr haf. Yr ydym yn wynebu'r sefyllfa dros dro honno. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am rywfaint o sicrwydd y bydd archwilio gofalus drwy'r asiantaethau priodol a chan y Pwyllgor, i sicrhau na fydd yr ateb dros dro yn achosi unrhyw ddifrod parhaol. Mae arnom angen sicrwydd gan y Cadeirydd hefyd y gwna'r Pwyllgor bopeth yn ei allu i sicrhau yr ymchwilir yn llawn i'r materion hyn. Mae angen i'r Pwyllgor weithio gyda'r

Committee needs to work with the council so that the final agreement takes account of these concerns and spells out the detail. The £6.1 million, which I mentioned earlier, is described in the document as being 'initiatives for training, employment, the local community and other regeneration activities'.

These are all splendid activities but we need precision and commitment. Cardiff Bay Development Corporation has left a job incomplete as Glyn said earlier. I had a wry smile when I looked at the document because it refers to Hamadryad Park, Ferry Road and the reclamation of the tip. I remember Cardiff City and County Council—Sue will also remember this—being recalled urgently in the middle of the summer holidays of, I think, 1990, to pass a planning application. That issue remains unresolved 10 years later. These issues must now be tied up and the job completed. We must also ensure that the money is spent in the areas affected. The barrage is an unknown quantity. Many of us thought we would have got much better value for money out of a light rapid transport system for Cardiff.

**Alun Cairns:** You mentioned the cost of the barrage and the cost of Cardiff Bay, but would you join me in congratulating Cardiff Bay Development Corporation which, from a sum of £500 million, has attracted or will attract within the next two years, more than £2 billion of private sector money, which is an excellent return on any public sector investment?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree wholeheartedly that what we have now is 10, even 100 times better than what we had to begin with. The Liberal Democrats were in no way opponents of the regeneration of Cardiff Bay. We gave evidence in the 1970s, and I believe Rhodri Morgan was giving evidence on the other side, in the county council or in a public inquiry, urging the redevelopment of Cardiff Bay. We would not have chosen this specific vehicle but in the political climate of the time development corporations were the only way to get this kind of money and investment into Cardiff Bay. I regret that the money and

cyngor fel bod y cytundeb terfynol yn cymryd i ystyriaeth y pryderon hyn ac yn egluro'r manylion. Yn y ddogfen, disgrifir y £6.1 miliwn, a grybwyllais yn gynharach, fel swm ar gyfer 'mentrau ar gyfer hyfforddiant, cyflogaeth a'r gymuned leol a gweithgareddau adfywio eraill'.

Mae'r rhain yn weithgareddau gwych bob un ond mae arnom angen manylder ac ymrwymiad. Mae Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd wedi gadael y gwaith heb ei orffen fel y dywedodd Glyn yn gynharach. Gwenais yn gam pan edrychais ar y ddogfen oherwydd mae'n cyfeirio at Hamadryad Park, Ferry Road ac adennill y domen. Cofiaf fod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd—bydd Sue yn cofio hyn hefyd—wedi ei ailalw ar frys ar ganol gwyliau'r haf yn 1990, yr wyf yn credu, i basio cais cynllunio. Mae'r mater hwnnw heb ei ddatrys 10 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach. Rhaid dod â'r materion hyn i ben yn awr a gorffen y gwaith. Rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei wario yn yr ardaloedd yr effeithir arnynt. Ni wyddom faint fydd dylanwad y morglawdd. Credai llawer ohonom y buasem wedi cael llawer gwell gwerth am arian o system cludiant cyflym ysgafn i Gaerdydd.

**Alun Cairns:** Soniasoch am gost y morglawdd a chost Bae Caerdydd, ond a ydych yn fodlon ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd sydd, o swm o £500 miliwn, wedi denu neu a fydd yn denu o fewn y ddwy flynedd nesaf, mwy na £2 biliwn o arian y sector preifat, sydd yn elw rhagorol o unrhyw fuddsoddiad sector cyhoeddus?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf yn llwyr fod yr hyn sydd gennym yn awr yn 10, hyd yn oed 100 gwaith gwell na'r hyn a oedd gennym i ddechrau. Nid oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn wrthwynebwyr o gwbl i adfywio Bae Caerdydd. Rhoesom dystiolaeth yn y 1970au, a chredaf fod Rhodri Morgan yn rhoi tystiolaeth ar yr ochr arall, yn y cyngor sir neu mewn ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, gan annog ailddatblygu Bae Caerdydd. Ni fuasem wedi dewis y cyfrwng arbennig hwn ond yn hinsawdd wleidyddol y cyfnod corfforaethau datblygu oedd yr unig ffordd i gael y math hwn o arian a buddsoddiad i Fae

support was not given to local government. Local government would also have done a good job.

The Assembly needs to know, as far as possible, what eventualities it may face. We cannot blame Cardiff City and County Council for not wishing to shoulder these responsibilities. It also has an obligation to its residents. As a Cardiff Assembly Member I want the best for the constituency and the city I represent. I want the best deal for the taxpayers of Cardiff but also the best for Wales as a whole. Glyn referred to Cardiff being a symbol for the whole of Wales. The bay is struggling into new life, not without problems and setbacks. We have a responsibility to see that this rebirth is a success because the eyes of the rest of Wales are on Cardiff and the eyes of Britain are on Wales. As we establish ourselves in the Assembly and establish its reputation I hope that many more eyes throughout the world will be turned on Cardiff Bay. We cannot hide a half completed job here. I ask for the Chair's assurance that scrutiny will be thorough but that there will be good will shown towards the completion of a job that has not only been started but is well under way towards completion.

**Val Feld:** It is clear how difficult it is to cut down on our agenda, given the range of issues and the fundamental importance of so many of the issues with which we are dealing, so many of them to do with agendas that are running forward so that decisions that have to be made. There are areas where we need to get to grips with some fundamental policies, strategies, frameworks and scrutiny.

4:50 p.m.

The best things that I have taken from today's debate are to realise that every time we look at a page of new figures Phil Williams thrills with delight and to know that Ron Davies is keen on us all getting together for a 'how was it for you' session. This is the way forward for bonding in the Economic Development Committee, which will leave Alun Cairns with grave difficulty. The challenge for me is that if I stay in this post, by this time next

Caerdydd. Mae'n ofid imi na roddwyd yr arian a'r gefnogaeth i lywodraeth leol. Byddai llywodraeth leol wedi gwneud y gwaith yn dda hefyd.

Mae angen i'r Cynulliad wybod, hyd y gellir, pa bosibiliadau y gallai eu hwynebu. Ni allwn weld bai ar Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd am beidio â dymuno ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau hyn. Mae ganddo ddyletswydd hefyd at ei drigolion. Fel Aelod Cynulliad dros Gaerdydd yr wyf am gael y gorau posibl i'r etholaeth a'r ddinas a gynrychiolaf. Yr wyf am gael y fargen orau i drethdalwyr Caerdydd ond y gorau hefyd i Gymru gyfan. Cyfeiriodd Glyn at Gaerdydd fel symbol i Gymru gyfan. Mae'r Bae yn llwyddo i ddod yn fyw o'r newydd, nid heb broblemau ac anawsterau. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau bod y dadeni hwn yn llwyddo oherwydd mae llygaid gweddill Cymru ar Gaerdydd ac mae llygaid Prydain ar Gymru. Wrth inni ymsefydlu yn y Cynulliad a sefydlu ei enw da gobeithiaf y bydd llawer mwy o lygaid ledled y byd wedi eu troi at Fae Caerdydd. Ni allwn guddio gwaith sydd ar ei hanner yma. Gofynnaf am sicrwydd gan y Cadeirydd y ceir archwilio trylwyr ond yr amlygir ewyllys da tuag at gwblhau gwaith sydd nid yn unig wedi ei ddechrau ond sydd yn agos at ei gwblhau.

**Val Feld:** Gwelir yn amlwg mor anodd yw cwtogi ar ein hagenda, yng ngolwg yr amrediad o faterion a phwysigrwydd sylfaenol cynifer o'r materion yr ydym yn ymdrin â hwy, cynifer ohonynt yn ymwneud ag agendâu sydd yn mynd rhagddynt fel bod rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau. Mae meysydd lle y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â rhai polisïau, strategaethau, fframweithiau ac archwilio sylfaenol.

Y pethau gorau a gymerais o'r ddadl heddiw yw sylweddoli bod Phil Williams, bob tro yr edrychwn ar dudalen o ffigurau newydd, yn cael ias o foddhad a gwybod bod Ron Davies yn awyddus i'n gweld yn dod at ein gilydd am sesiwn 'sut oedd hi i chi'. Dyma'r ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer bondio yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a fydd yn gadael Alun Cairns mewn trafferth mawr. Yr her i mi os arhosaf yn y swydd hon yw y bydd,

year he will call me 'Chair'.

I will address the issues that have been raised. There have been many questions about our involvement in the ETAG process. It was not for our Committee to carry out the fundamental work on ETAG. That was for the Post-16 Education and Training Committee. There may be an argument for the Economic Development Committee having more of an involvement in such matters and for the two Committees working more closely together, but that was the case. Economic Development Committee members were invited to attend the Post-16 Education and Training Committee's meetings when it took evidence on ETAG and I attended two of those meetings. We agreed that we would take over when it came to considering the enterprise functions, which is what we are currently doing. As part of our review of business support, I have written to a wide range of organisations and have gone to particular trouble to seek out private sector organisations and small businesses, business people, private training providers and business support providers to ask their views on what should happen to the training and enterprise councils' function. I hope that we are dealing with the concerns on that.

Tourism is a critical area for the Welsh economy. I say to Peter Black that there is a tourism strategy, on which there has been widespread consultation by the Wales Tourist Board. We will have our final discussion on that tomorrow. There is also a major plan for reorganisation in the structure of tourism, which we will also consider tomorrow. We have met with the Wales Tourist Board twice and we will meet it again tomorrow. It is true that we have not looked at tourism per se in much detail. However, in tackling the structural funds programmes and the national economic development strategy and the business support review—or at least this is how I perceive it—we have tried to develop a framework for growth in terms of a whole range of business opportunities for Wales, particularly for small businesses, many of which are fundamental to the development of tourism in rural areas and to its economic potential. At this stage, that is what we are

erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, yn fy ngalw'n 'Chair'.

Yr wyf am roi sylw i'r materion a godwyd. Bu llawer o gwestiynau ynghylch ein cysylltiad â phroses y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Nid lle ein Pwyllgor ni oedd cyflawni'r gwaith sylfaenol ar y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 oedd i wneud hynny. Efallai fod dadl o blaid mwy o gysylltiad gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd â materion o'r fath ac i'r ddau Bwyllgor weithio'n agosach â'i gilydd, ond felly y bu. Gwahoddwyd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i fynychu cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 pan dderbynai dystiolaeth ar y Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant a bûm mewn dau o'r cyfarfodydd hynny. Cytunasom y byddem yn cymryd yr awenau pan ddeuai at ystyried y swyddogaethau menter, sef yr hyn a wnawn ar hyn o bryd. Fel rhan o'n harolwg o gefnogaeth i fusnes, ysgrifennais at amrediad eang o gyrff a mudiadau a thrafferthais yn arbennig i gysylltu â chyrff sector preifat a busnesau bach, pobl busnes, darparwyr hyfforddiant preifat a darparwyr cefnogaeth busnes i ofyn eu barn ar yr hyn a ddylai ddigwydd i swyddogaeth y cynghorau hyfforddi a menter. Gobeithiaf ein bod yn ymdrin â'r pryderon ynghylch hynny.

Mae twristiaeth yn faes holl bwysig i economi Cymru. Dywedaf wrth Peter Black fod strategaeth twristiaeth, y bu ymgynghori eang arni gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru. Cawn ein trafodaeth olaf ar hynny yfory. Mae cynllun pwysig hefyd ar gyfer ad-drefnu strwythur twristiaeth, a ystyriwn yfory hefyd. Cyfarfuasom ddwywaith â Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a byddwn yn cyfarfod ag ef eto yfory. Mae'n wir nad edrychasom ar dwristiaeth fel y cyfryw yn fanwl iawn. Fodd bynnag, wrth ymdrin â rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol a'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol a'r arolwg o gefnogaeth i fusnes—neu felly yr wyf fi'n ei gweld o leiaf—ceisiasom ddatblygu fframwaith ar gyfer twf o ran amrediad cyflawn o gyfleoedd busnes i Gymru, yn enwedig i fusnesau bach, y mae llawer ohonynt yn holl bwysig i ddatblygiad twristiaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac i'w photensial economaidd. Dyna'r hyn a wnawn ar hyn o

doing, but, perhaps, further down the line, we need to look at this in much more detail. I am sure that we will.

Rural development is another difficult area in terms of the dividing line between the work of different Committees. It is true that we have not got to grips with that as quickly as we did ETAG. Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, and I have talked about joint meetings and we will have them. There may be an argument for much closer working. There may indeed be an argument that the separation between economic development in general and rural development is not helpful to greater integration.

I say to Glyn Davies that the strong legacy of the Development Board for Rural Wales comes across in meetings and discussions. It is important that the WDA, in taking on that role and the social responsibility that the DBRW had, starts to learn from how the work was carried out in those rural areas. We need to carry out similar work in our urban areas and in our quasi half-rural, half-urban areas. I say that as someone who comes from an urban constituency, which, nevertheless, has several farms. Those distinctions are not easy for us to make in Wales.

The cheese company that Alun Pugh mentioned makes the point well about the great potential of innovation and imagination in the rural economy. It emphasises the opportunities that we have to drive the economy forward and find business opportunities that are distinctly Welsh, on which only we can capitalise and which link to our other activities.

Transport is another area that is difficult for us. It also involves another Committee. The Economic Development Forum and others regularly make points about the bigger business of transport infrastructure. However, I am more concerned about the public transport issue of getting people to the jobs that we create. We are creating jobs in places that are inaccessible. The old days when people built houses alongside factories are gone. We are now creating jobs with flexible

bryd, ond, efallai, ymhellach ymlaen, y bydd angen inni edrych ar hyn yn fanylach o lawer. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn.

Mae datblygu gwledig yn faes anodd arall o ran y llinell derfyn rhwng gwaith gwahanol Bwyllgorau. Mae'n wir nad aethom i'r afael â hyn gyflymed ag y gwnaethom â'r Grŵp Gweithredu Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Mae Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, wedi trafod cyd-gyfarfodydd a byddwn yn eu cael. Efallai fod dadl dros weithio'n agosach o lawer. Efallai'n wir fod dadl dros ddweud nad yw'r gwahanu rhwng datblygu economaidd yn gyffredinol a datblygu gwledig o gymorth i integreiddio'n helaethach.

Dywedaf wrth Glyn Davies fod etifeddiaeth gadarn Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig yn cael ei chyfleu mewn cyfarfodydd a thrafodaethau. Mae'n bwysig bod y WDA, wrth ymgymryd â'r rôl honno a'r cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol a oedd gan Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig, yn dechrau dysgu o'r modd y cyflawnwyd y gwaith yn yr ardaloedd gwledig hynny. Mae angen inni gyflawni gwaith tebyg yn ein hardaloedd gwledig a'n hardaloedd lled-wledig, lled-drefol. Dywedaf hynny fel un o etholaeth drefol sydd, er hynny, yn cynnwys sawl fferm. Nid yw'n hawdd inni wahaniaethu felly yng Nghymru.

Mae'r cwmni caws y cyfeiriodd Alun Pugh ato yn amlygu'r potensial mawr ar gyfer arloesi a dychymyg yn yr economi wledig. Pwysleisia'r cyfleoedd sydd gennym i yrru'r economi ymlaen a chanfod cyfleoedd busnes sydd yn nodweddiadol Gymreig, na all neb ond ni fanteisio arnynt ac sydd yn ymgysylltu â'n gweithgareddau eraill.

Mae trafndiaeth yn faes arall sydd yn anodd i ni. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â Phwyllgor arall. Mae'r Fforwm Datblygu Economaidd ac eraill yn gwneud pwyntiau'n rheolaidd am fater ehangach y seilwaith trafndiaeth. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf yn fwy ynghylch y mater cludiant cyhoeddus o fynd â phobl at y swyddi a grewn. Yr ydym yn creu swyddi mewn mannau anhygyrch. Mae'r hen oes pan fyddai pobl yn codi tai ger ffatrioedd wedi mynd. Yr ydym bellach yn creu swyddi ag

working conditions and it is difficult for people to get to them if they do not have cars. If they have cars, they jam up the roads. If they do not have cars, they often do not think of applying for the jobs. Transport is a real issue for different reasons to those you identified.

Linked to that is the importance of working on economic activity, not only for women, which we have done for some time, but for people who have been sick for a long period and disabled people. We must also ensure that young people build their capacity in our workforce. That is vital to Objective 1. It has been one of the big issues that we have pushed through the Committee. We have put much emphasis on trying to obtain baseline data to adequately and effectively monitor what we are doing.

That brings me to the GDP targets. Ron is right to say that they are high. Maybe they are not achievable, but it is right for us to reach for the sky and we must look at what we can do to put in place the steps that will get us there. However, we must have the information to enable us to monitor how we are doing. That will be the Economic Development Committee's work in relation to the new monitoring committees for all structural fund programmes. It will be our job to monitor how we are doing in our work towards meeting the big targets and to tell the monitoring committees if we do not find ways of achieving that. It is important that Assembly Members are clear that all the European funding programmes are not only owned by the Assembly, but by a partnership of private, public and voluntary sector organisations, which will drive much of the work forward. Our role is to stand back and influence what they are doing effectively.

I agree with Ron, Alun Pugh and others who have spoken about the importance of ICT. We are lagging behind and this is one of the issues on the Committee's forward work programme. Coming to Brian Gibbons's point, I hope that the business review will help us to achieve a clearer sense of the links between inward investment and public sector

amodau gweithio hyblyg ac mae'n anodd i bobl eu cyrraedd os nad oes ganddynt geir. Os oes ganddynt geir, maent yn tagu'r ffordd. Os nad oes ganddynt geir, nid ydynt yn ystyried ymgeisio am y swyddi mewn llawer achos. Mae trafndiaeth yn fater gwirioneddol am wahanol resymau i'r rhai a ddynodwyd gennych.

Yn gysylltiedig â hynny y mae pwysigrwydd gweithio ar weithgaredd economaidd, nid yn unig ar gyfer menywod, a wnaethom ers cryn amser, ond hefyd ar gyfer pobl a fu'n sâl am gyfnod hir a phobl anabl. Rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn adeiladu eu gallu yn ein gweithlu. Mae hynny'n holl bwysig i Amcan 1. Bu'n un o'r materion mawr yr ydym wedi ei hybu drwy'r Pwyllgor. Rhoesom lawer o bwys ar geisio sicrhau data llinell sylfaen er mwyn monitro'r hyn a wnawn yn ddigonol ac yn effeithiol.

Daw hynny â mi at y targedau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Mae Ron yn gywir wrth ddweud eu bod yn uchel. Efallai nad ydynt yn gyraeddadwy, ond mae'n iawn inni fod yn uchelgeisiol a rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i roi'r camau ar waith a fydd yn mynd â ni yno. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gael yr wybodaeth i'n galluogi i fonitro sut yr ydym yn gwneud. Dyna fydd gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd mewn perthynas â'r pwyllgorau monitro newydd ar gyfer yr holl raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol. Ein gwaith ni fydd monitro sut yr ydym yn gwneud ein gwaith er mwyn cyrraedd y targedau mawr ac i ddweud wrth y pwyllgorau monitro os na chanfyddwn ffordd i gyflawni hynny. Mae'n bwysig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddeall nad eiddo'r Cynulliad yw'r holl raglenni ariannu Ewropeaidd, ond eiddo partneriaeth o gyrff a mudiadau yn y sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol, a fydd yn gyrru llawer o'r gwaith ymlaen. Ein rôl ni yw sefyll yn ôl a dylanwadu ar yr hyn a wnânt yn effeithiol.

Cytunaf â Ron, Alun Pugh ac eraill a siaradodd am bwysigrwydd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Yr ydym ar ei hôl hi a dyma un o'r materion ar raglen waith y Pwyllgor ar gyfer y dyfodol. A dod at bwynt Brian Gibbons, gobeithiaf y bydd yr arolwg busnes yn ein helpu i ddeall yn gliriach y cysylltiadau rhwng mewnffuddsoddi a

employers, and the development and growth of our small businesses. I hope it will help us to achieve a clearer sense of the strategies we can use to attract inward investors that will help us to grow our own businesses, and give us an idea of where the gaps are and what we are not providing. We have had much discussion about development banks and the entrepreneurship plan, but we have not looked at the whole picture and asked what we do not provide, but should provide. The aim should be to provide ladders all the way up to enable small businesses to grow into medium businesses and medium businesses to grow into larger businesses that will not get sold out to multi-nationals as soon as they reach a certain size, and provide people with a route to climb.

Turning to Cardiff Bay and the critical question that Jenny and others have asked. I think the Committee believes that we must make this work because of the amount of investment that has gone into it. There is no suggestion of the Committee pulling out of that. However, we are concerned about the amount of investment and cost that has gone into the project. To be sure that that will make the difference, we must make this work. In terms of how it will be managed in the future, Jenny asked if I was satisfied as Chair of the Committee. No, I am not and I do not think that the Committee is satisfied either, which is why we have asked Cardiff council to come back to us with its development plan. I have been trying to get a date—

**Glyn Davies** *rose—*

5:00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are out of time. The short debate must start in two minutes.

**Val Feld:** We are therefore not satisfied about that. There is some confusion over the £6 million. There are actually two sums of £6 million in the paper, which is why we get in a muddle over it. One sum deals with the adoption of highways, drainage, Tremorfa Frag and Ferry Road tips and Hamadryad Park. The other sum is for transitional

chyflogwyr sector preifat, a datblygiad a thwff ein busnesau bach. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ein helpu i ddeall y gliriach y strategaethau y gallwn eu defnyddio i ddenu mewnfuddsoddwyr a fydd yn ein helpu i dyfu ein busnesau ein hunain, a rhoi syniad i ni o'r bylchau sydd yn bod a'r hyn nad ydym yn ei ddarparu. Cawsom drafodaeth helaeth am fanciau datblygu a'r cynllun entrepreneuriaeth, ond nid edrychasom ar y darlun cyflawn a gofyn pa beth nad ydym yn ei ddarparu, ond y dylem ei ddarparu. Y nod y dylid ei chael yw darparu ysgolion yr holl ffordd i fyny i alluogi busnesau bach i dyfu'n fusnesau canolig a busnesau canolig i dyfu'n fusnesau mwy na fyddant yn cael eu gwerthu i gwmnïau rhyngwladol cyn gynted ag y cyrhaeddant faint penodol, ac a fydd yn darparu ffordd i bobl eu dringo.

A throi at Fae Caerdydd a'r cwestiwn tyngedfennol y mae Jenny ac eraill wedi ei ofyn. Credaf fod y Pwyllgor o'r farn fod rhaid inni gael hyn i weithio oherwydd swm y buddsoddiad a aeth iddo. Nid oes awgrym y bydd y Pwyllgor yn tynnu allan o hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch maint y buddsoddiad a'r gost a aeth i mewn i'r prosiect. Er mwyn sicrhau y bydd hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid inni ei gael i weithio. O ran y modd y caiff ei reoli yn y dyfodol, holodd Jenny a oeddwn yn fodlon fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Nac ydwyf, nid ydwyf ac ni chredaf fod y Pwyllgor yn fodlon ychwaith, a dyna pam y gofynnais i gyngor Caerdydd ddod yn ôl atom â'i gynllun datblygu. Bùm yn ceisio cael dyddiad—

**Glyn Davies** *a gododd—*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae ein hamser ar ben. Rhaid i'r ddadl fer ddechrau ymhen dwy funud.

**Val Feld:** Nid ydym felly yn fodlon ynghylch hynny. Mae rhywfaint o ddrysych ynghylch y £6 miliwn. Mewn gwirionedd mae dau swm o £6 miliwn yn y papur, a dyna pam yr ydym yn drysu yn ei gylch. Mae un swm yn ymwneud â mabwysiadu priffyrdd, draenio, tomenni Tremorfa Frag a Ferry Road a Pharc Hamadryad. Mae'r swm arall ar gyfer

funding over three years for training, employment and local development. However, Rhodri is right. It is substantially taken up with the purchasing of land for the sports village. That was in the paper we had the week before last. This is the paper—

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are out of time. Will you wind up please?

**Val Feld:** A sum of £150,000 is uncommitted, and we have asked for details of that. Committee members will also see the agreements with Cardiff.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We have a debate on emergency services and you will have to wind up now.

**Val Feld:** There will continue to be scrutiny of what takes place.

ariannu trosiannol dros dair blynedd ar gyfer hyfforddi, cyflogi a datblygu lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae Rhodri'n gywir. Cymerir y rhan fwyaf ohono i brynu tir ar gyfer y pentref chwaraeon. Yr oedd hynny yn y papur a oedd gennym yr wythnos cyn y ddiwethaf. Dyma'r papur—

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae ein hamser ar ben. A fyddwch gystal â therfynu, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Val Feld:** Mae swm o £150,000 heb ei glustnodi, a gofynasom am fanylion am hynny. Bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor hefyd yn gweld y cytundebau â Chaerdydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gennym ddadl ar y gwasanaethau argyfwng a bydd yn rhaid ichi derfynu'n awr.

**Val Feld:** Parheir i archwilio'r hyn sydd yn digwydd.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin



Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Michael, Alun  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Y Gwasanaethau Argyfwng yng Nghymru The Emergency Services in Wales**

**Ann Jones:** I have accepted requests from Mike German and Lynne Neagle to talk about the ambulance service, and from Geraint Davies and David Melding who also want to contribute to this debate.

None of us can predict when the moment may arise when we will need one or more of the emergency services. In the unhappy event that we do, it may be of some comfort to know that the men and the women who deal with and respond to our 999 calls, be they the ambulance service, the fire brigade, the police or the coastguards, are among the most professional, dedicated and highly trained in the world.

As someone who, before being elected to this Assembly, worked in the fire brigade for the best part of 25 years, I would like to begin this debate by paying tribute to the dedication of the men and women who work in our emergency services. They risk their lives every time they respond to an emergency and, occasionally, they make the ultimate sacrifice in the attempt to save the lives of total strangers. It is important that we consider the emergency services in Wales, not only because they serve the people of our

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn ceisiadau oddi wrth Mike German a Lynne Neagle i siarad am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac oddi wrth Geraint Davies a David Melding sydd hefyd am gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon.

Ni all yr un ohonom ragweld pryd y bydd yr adeg yn codi pan fydd arnom angen un neu ragor o'r gwasanaethau argyfwng. Os digwydd inni fod mor anffodus â bod â'u hangen, gellir cael rhyw gysur o wybod bod y dynion a'r benywod sydd yn trafod ac yn ymateb i'n galwadau 999, boed y rheini yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y frigâd dân, yr heddlu neu wylwyr y glannau, ymysg y rhai mwyaf proffesiynol, ymroddedig a hyfforddedig yn y byd.

Fel un a weithiodd yn y frigâd dân am y rhan fwyaf o 25 mlynedd, cyn fy ethol i'r Cynulliad hwn, hoffwn ddechrau'r ddadl hon drwy dalu teyrnged i ymroddiad y dynion a'r merched sydd yn gweithio yn ein gwasanaethau argyfwng. Maent yn peryglu eu bywydau bob tro yr ymatebant i argyfwng ac, weithiau, maent yn gwneud yr aberth eithaf wrth geisio achub bywydau diethriaid llwyr. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y gwasanaethau argyfwng yng Nghymru, nid yn unig am eu bod yn gwasanaethu pobl ein

country, but because their views and requirements need to be taken into account across the whole range of our responsibilities.

When we debate transport planning, we should consider the views of the emergency services on how measures such as traffic calming and road widening may impact on the response times of their vehicles. The police also have clear and obvious views on the benefits of street lighting with regard to crime.

When we consider housing, the fire service has important views not only about the need for hard-wired smoke alarms, but on gas safety, housing design and the responsibilities of private landlords in houses in multiple occupation. Even the naming of roads on estates can have an impact on fire and ambulance services.

On education, the fire service is keen to enhance the levels of awareness among our young people about the use of matches and chip-pans and how to handle kitchen fires.

The coastguard, the Royal National Lifeboat Institution and the mountain rescue services all have contributions to make about aspects of our tourist industry.

On education and in general, we need to engage with the police to tackle offending behaviour and nurture social responsibility among our young people. The experiences and requirements of our emergency services are such that they need to be considered across the entire spectrum of our work in the Assembly. As public figures, we have a responsibility to work with the police forces in Wales. In the Vale of Clwyd, I am pleased to say that I have an excellent working relationship with my local police division. It has positively engaged with a range of agencies and voluntary bodies in the community to ensure that the aims of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 are being met. I am also working locally with it on issues such as decriminalising parking offences. That measure could transfer responsibility for enforcing parking restrictions to the council's highways departments, thus freeing police

gwlad, ond am fod angen cymryd eu barn a'u hanghenion i ystyriaeth ar draws amrediad cyflawn ein cyfrifoldebau.

Pan drafodwn gynllunio trafndiaeth, dylem ystyried barn y gwasanaethau argyfwng ynghylch y modd y gallai mesurau fel tawelu traffig ac ehangu ffyrdd effeithio ar amseroedd ymateb eu cerbydau. Mae gan yr heddlu hefyd farn glir ac amlwg ar fanteision goleuadau stryd mewn perthynas â throseddau.

Pan ystyriwn dai, mae gan y gwasanaeth tân farn bwysig iawn nid yn unig am yr angen am larymau mwg gwifredig, ond ar ddiogelwch nwy, dylunio tai a chyfrifoldebau landlordiaid preifat mewn tai amlbreswyliaeth. Mae hyd yn oed enwi ffyrdd ar stadau'n gallu effeithio ar wasanaethau tân ac ambiwlans.

Ynghylch addysg, mae'r gwasanaeth tân yn awyddus i hybu lefelau ymwybyddiaeth ymysg ein pobl ifanc am y defnydd o fatsys a sosbenni sglodion a sut i ddelio â thanau mewn ceginau.

Mae gan wasanaethau gwylwyr y glannau, Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub a'r gwasanaeth achub ar y mynydd gyfraniadau bob un ar agweddau ar ein ddydiant twristiaeth.

Ynghylch addysg ac yn gyffredinol, mae angen inni ymwneud â'r heddlu er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad troseddol a meithrin cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol ymysg ein pobl ifanc. Mae profiadau ac anghenion ein gwasanaethau argyfwng yn gyfryw fel bod angen eu hystyried ar draws holl sbectrum ein gwaith yn y Cynulliad. Fel ffigyrau cyhoeddus, mae cyfrifoldeb arnom i weithio gyda'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru. Yn Nyffryn Clwyd, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod gennyf berthynas weithio ragorol â'm hadran heddlu leol. Mae wedi ymwneud yn gadarnhaol ag amryw o asiantaethau a chyrrff gwirfoddol yn y gymuned er mwyn sicrhau y cyflawnir nodau'r Ddeddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998. Yr wyf hefyd yn gweithio â hi'n lleol ar faterion fel dad-droseddoli troseddau parcio. Gallai'r mesur hwnnw drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros orfodi cyfyngiadau parcio i adrannau priffyrdd y

officers for more serious duties.

As I have said, there are many issues of mutual interest for the police and this Assembly. In London, the newly elected mayor will have a direct responsibility for oversight of the Metropolitan Police. While I would not go so far as to propose a similar relationship for our Assembly, I would suggest that we consider our mechanisms for dialogue with the police forces in Wales so that we can achieve a more co-ordinated and coherent approach to those many issues of mutual interest.

The service for which we have responsibility is the Welsh Ambulance Service's NHS Trust, which is based within my constituency at St Asaph. Two weeks ago, it was revealed that the Welsh ambulance service responded to only 45 per cent of category A calls—life-threatening emergencies—within the time target of eight minutes. The services have a long way to go if they are to meet the target of 75 per cent by next year. As things stand, without extra resources, this will be extremely difficult to achieve. The ambulance services are in need of extra staff and equipment. I know that Jane Hutt is aware of this issue and will take measures to address it.

As a north Wales Member representing a partly rural constituency, I am also aware of the problems caused by the closure of ambulance stations. The ambulance service in north Wales is relying increasingly on 'jump cover'. I apologise for jargon but that is a phrase that we always loved to use in the emergency services. 'Jump cover' is an ambulance parked on the roadside at a strategic point or location ready for action. This practise is far from ideal. The ambulance crews have virtually no facilities. I accept that 'jump cover' will be a necessary evil from time to time, but the extent to which controllers currently depend on it seems excessive and unreasonable.

cynghorau, gan ryddhau heddweision i gyflawni dyletswyddau mwy difrifol.

Fel y dywedais, mae llawer o faterion o gyd-ddiddordeb i'r heddlu a'r Cynulliad hwn. Yn Llundain, bydd gan y maer newydd-etholedig gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros oruchwylio Heddlu Llundain. Er na fyddwn am fynd mor bell â chynnig perthynas debyg i'n Cynulliad ni, byddwn am awgrymu y dylem ystyried ein mecanweithiau ar gyfer deialog â'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru fel y gallwn sicrhau dull mwy cyd-drefnus a chydlynol o ymdrin â'r nifer fawr hynny o faterion sydd o gyd-ddiddordeb.

Y gwasanaeth y mae gennym gyfrifoldeb drosto yw Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru, sydd â'i phencadlys yn fy etholaeth i yn Llanelwy. Bythefnos yn ôl, datgelwyd nad oedd gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru wedi ymateb i ond 45 y cant o'r galwadau categori A—argyfyngau sydd yn peryglu einioes—o fewn yr amser targed o wyth munud. Mae ffordd bell o flaen y gwasanaethau os ydynt i gyrraedd y targed o 75 y cant erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Fel y mae pethau, heb adnoddau ychwanegol, bydd hyn yn anodd iawn ei gyflawni. Mae ar y gwasanaethau ambiwlans angen staff ac offer ychwanegol. Gwn fod Jane Hutt yn ymwybodol o'r mater hwn ac y bydd yn cymryd camau i ymdrin ag ef.

Fel Aelod o ogledd Cymru sydd yn cynrychioli etholaeth rannol wledig, yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r problemau a achosir drwy gau gorsafoedd ambiwlans. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng ngogledd Cymru'n dibynnu'n gynyddol ar 'jump cover'. Ymddiheuraf am y jargon ond mae hwnnw'n ymadrodd yr oeddem bob amser wrth ein bodd yn ei ddefnyddio yn y gwasanaethau argyfwng. 'Jump cover' yw ambiwlans sydd wedi ei barcio ar ochr y ffordd mewn pwynt neu leoliad strategol yn barod i weithredu. Mae'r arfer hwn ymhell o fod yn ddelfrydol. I bob pwrpas, mae'r criwiau ambiwlans heb unrhyw gyfleusterau. Derbyniaf y bydd 'jump cover' yn anochel o bryd i'w gilydd, ond mae'r graddau y mae rheolwyr yn dibynnu arno ar hyn o bryd yn ymddangos yn ormodol ac yn afresymol.

I, and no doubt other Members, have received representations on the location of the north Wales ambulance control. I am concerned that if the move to Llanfairfechan goes ahead, many of our experienced and highly trained staff, predominantly women, may not be able to travel that distance to work and may not take up employment in Llanfairfechan.

Having said that, an exciting project is being pursued by the ambulance service, which I am pleased to endorse. By the autumn of this year, it plans to take delivery of the first of two helicopter air ambulances for Wales. This project is being sponsored by the Automobile Association, which has agreed to pay for the aircraft and for part of the operating costs over the first three years. This will cost them around £1.6 million per helicopter. While Her Majesty's Coastguard and I would dispute the AA's claim to be 'the fourth emergency service', I am delighted that it has agreed to provide this money. It is a generous offer of which we must take full advantage. However, it will not all be plain flying as running two air ambulances will cost about £1 million a year.

5:10 p.m.

I have already mentioned our ambulance service's problems in meeting response targets. I concur with its view that diverting its limited resources to running two air ambulances at the expense of road-based vehicles would not be justified. There is a strong case for more resources for our ambulance service. However, any extra money should go into the existing ground service. The ambulance service is setting up a dedicated charity to raise funds to get their air ambulances flying. We have all heard many times that people in Wales would be willing to pay more for better health services. What could be of more universal interest than an air ambulance, to which all of us might owe our lives some day?

As well as being of special benefit to rural Wales, the air ambulances could also prove their worth in emergency transfers from one hospital to another. They could also reach

Yr wyf fi, ac Aelodau eraill mae'n sicr, wedi derbyn sylwadau ar leoliad swyddfa reoli ambiwlansiau gogledd Cymru. Pryderaf, os bydd y symudiad i Lanfairfechan yn mynd ymlaen, na fydd llawer o'n staff profiadol a thra hyfforddedig, benywod yn bennaf, yn gallu teithio mor bell â hynny i weithio ac na fyddant efallai'n ymgymryd â gwaith yn Llanfairfechan.

Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn bwrw ymlaen â phrosiect cyffrous yr wyf yn falch o'i gefnogi. Erbyn yr hydref eleni, bwriada dderbyn y cyntaf o ddau hofrennydd ambiwlans awyr i Gymru. Noddir y prosiect hwn gan y Gymdeithas Foduro, a gytunodd i dalu am yr awyren ac am ran o'r costau gweithredu dros y tair blynedd cyntaf. Bydd hyn yn costio tua £1.6 miliwn iddynt am bob hofrennydd. Er y byddai Gwylwyr y Glannau Ei Mawrhydi a minnau'n herio honiad y Gymdeithas Foduro mai hi yw'r 'pedwerydd gwasanaeth argyfwng', yr wyf wrth fy modd ei bod wedi cytuno i ddarparu'r arian hwn. Mae'n gynnig hael y dylem fanteisio arno'n llawn. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn hollol ddiraffferth oherwydd bydd cynnal dau ambiwlans awyr yn costio tua £1 filiwn y flwyddyn.

Soniais eisoes am broblemau ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans wrth gyrraedd targedau ymateb. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'i farn nad oes cyfiawnhad dros ailgyfeirio'i adnoddau prin i redeg dau ambiwlans awyr ar draul cerbydau ffordd. Mae dadl gryf dros roi mwy o adnoddau i'n gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Fodd bynnag, dylai unrhyw arian ychwanegol fynd i'r gwasanaeth presennol ar y llawr. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn sefydlu elusen bwrpasol i godi arian i hedfan eu hambiwllansiau awyr. Clywsom oll lawer gwaith y byddai pobl yng Nghymru'n barod i dalu mwy am wasanaethau iechyd gwell. Beth a allai fod o ddiddordeb mwy cyffredinol nag ambiwlans awyr, y gallem oll fod yn ddyledus iddo am ein bywydau ryw ddiwrnod?

Yn ogystal â bod o fudd arbennig i gefn gwlad Cymru, gallai'r awbiwlansiau awyr brofi'n werthfawr mewn trosglwyddiadau argyfwng rhwng un ysbyty a'r llall. Gallent

road accidents where traffic builds up, making it difficult for the road based ambulances to get through, and give speedy back-up to ordinary ambulances arriving at major incidents involving multiple casualties. These two air ambulances will save numerous lives. I ask all Assembly Members, regardless of your party affiliation, to make every effort in your constituencies and elsewhere to promote and draw public attention to this exciting and worthy appeal. I hope that everyone here, as well as those who have left the Chamber for whatever reason, will subscribe to the statement of opinion that I have tabled on this subject.

The public appeal will be launched officially on 17 April. I will ensure that Members who want information on how to be involved in this will receive the publicity material and the progress updates. I am sure that there will be an enthusiastic response from people in Wales to this appeal. It will give the ambulance service in Wales the high-tech, cutting edge capability to come flying to the rescue of people when road dependent vehicles cannot reach them in time. Time is short if the service wants to get the first air ambulance off the ground by early autumn. I urge all Members to do their utmost to support this appeal.

The fire service is close to my heart. As I see nobody in uniform, Llywydd, I declare my interest to you as a once-serving fire control officer with the Merseyside Fire Brigade. That was always required of me when I took up my duties everywhere else and it is hard to break that habit. Before being elected as an Assembly Member, I worked in the former Clwyd fire service and in the Merseyside fire service for nearly 25 years. I still have not received the long service and good conduct medal that you normally receive for 20 years' service. It was the Fire Brigades' Union that first led me to become actively involved in politics. Perhaps that explains the non-appearance of the medal—'good conduct' may have let me down.

Like the ambulance service, our fire brigades

hefyd gyrraedd damweiniau ffyrdd lle y mae traffig yn crynhoi, gan ei gwneud yn anodd i ambiwlansiau ffordd fynd drwodd, a rhoi cefnogaeth yn gyflym i ambiwlansiau arferol sydd yn cyrraedd digwyddiadau mawr lle y mae nifer fawr o glwyfedigion. Bydd y ddau ambiwlans awyr hyn yn achub nifer o fywydau. Gofynnaf i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, i ba bynnag blaid yr ydych yn perthyn, wneud pob ymdrech yn eich etholaethau ac mewn mannau eraill i hyrwyddo a thynnu sylw'r cyhoedd at yr apêl gyffrous a theilwng hon. Gobeithiaf y bydd pawb yma, yn ogystal â'r rhai a adawodd y Siambr am ba bynnag reswm, yn tanysgrifio i'r datganiad barn a gyflwynais ar y pwnc hwn.

Lansir yr apêl gyhoeddus yn swyddogol ar 17 Ebrill. Sicrhaf y bydd yr Aelodau sydd am gael gwybodaeth ynghylch sut i gymryd rhan ynddi yn derbyn y deunydd cyhoeddusrwydd a'r newyddion am gynnydd. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd ymateb brwd oddi wrth bobl yng Nghymru i'r apêl hon. Bydd yn rhoi'r gallu uwch-dechnolegol, diweddaraf i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru hedfan i achub pobl pan nad yw cerbydau ffordd yn gallu eu cyrraedd mewn pryd. Mae'r amser yn brin os yw'r gwasanaeth am ddechrau hedfan yr ambiwlans awyr cyntaf erbyn dechrau'r hydref. Anogaf yr holl Aelodau i ymdrechu i'r eithaf i gefnogi'r apêl hon.

Mae'r gwasanaeth tân yn agos at fy nghalon. Gan na welaf unrhyw un mewn gwisg swyddogol, Lywydd, datganaf y buddiant sydd gennyf i chi fel un a wasanaethodd fel swyddog rheoli tân gyda Brigâd Dân Glannau Mersi. Yr oedd bob amser yn ofynnol imi wneud hynny pan ymgymerais â'm dyletsyddau ym mhobman arall ac anodd yw torri'r arfer. Cyn fy ethol yn Aelod Cynulliad, bûm yn gweithio yng nghynwasanaeth tân Clwyd ac yng ngwasanaeth tân Glannau Mersi am bron 25 mlynedd. Nid wyf eto wedi derbyn y fedal am hir wasanaeth ac ymddygiad da a dderbyniwch fel arfer am 20 mlynedd o wasanaeth. Undeb y Brigadau Tân a'm cymhellodd gyntaf i ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth. Efallai mai dyna pam nad yw'r fedal wedi dod—efallai fod 'ymddygiad da' wedi fy ngadael i lawr.

Fel y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, nid yw ein

never have enough resources. There is always more that can be achieved and improved upon. However, I am delighted to pay tribute to the Mid and West Wales Fire Brigade. Last week, it was praised by the Audit Commission for achieving the best response rate to calls of any fire brigade in England and Wales.

At UK Parliament level, the Fire Brigades' Union has long been pushing for a fire safety Bill. Jack Straw supports the principles behind this Bill. It is the fruit of the FBU's long and hard work in this field and will provide a modern document for a modern fire service. I pay tribute to my former colleagues in the FBU—the general secretary, Ken Cameron; the assistant general secretary, Mike Fordham; the regional executive member for Wales, Mike Smith and an officer member, Glyn Evans—for their contributions and hard work in getting this Bill drafted. I hope that time can be found for this important measure.

Some success has come from the FBU lobby. Sprinkler systems will be installed in all new supermarkets and the union is currently lobbying for this to be extended to houses in multiple occupation and schools. A comprehensive fire safety measure will also contain secondary legislative powers that will allow the Assembly to take on a role in respect of the fire service in Wales.

There may be geographical problems in having an all-Wales fire service, but there may also be benefits in terms of recognising the new circumstances resulting from devolution. Before going down this route, however, we must have a wide-ranging consultation with all the stakeholders in the fire service: from rank and file firefighters and control room operators to chief fire officers, local councils, voluntary bodies and the Welsh public as a whole. We could investigate secondary legislation that would allow the three existing fire authorities to precept in the same way as police forces.

One major problem that the fire service faces,

brigadau tân erioed wedi cael digon o adnoddau. Mae bob amser mwy y gellir ei gyflawni a'i wella. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wrth fy modd yn talu teyrnged i Frigâd Dân Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Yr wythnos diwethaf, fe'i canmolwyd gan y Comisiwn Archwilio am gyrraedd y gyfradd ymateb orau i alwadau o blith holl frigadau tân Cymru a Lloegr.

Ar lefel Senedd y DU, mae Undeb y Brigadau Tân yn pwyso ers amser maith am fesur diogelwch tân. Mae Jack Straw yn cefnogi'r egwyddorion sydd y tu ôl i'r Mesur hwn. Mae'n ganlyniad i waith hir a chaled gan Undeb y Brigadau Tân yn y maes hwn a bydd yn darparu dogfen fodern ar gyfer gwasanaeth tân modern. Talaf deyrnged i'm cyn-gydweithwyr yn Undeb y Brigadau Tân—yr ysgrifennydd cyffredinol, Ken Cameron; yr ysgrifennydd cyffredinol cynorthwyol, Mike Fordham; yr aelod rhanbarthol dros Gymru ar y pwyllgor gwaith, Mike Smith a swyddog aelod, Glyn Evans—am eu cyfraniadau a'u gwaith caled wrth sicrhau drafftio'r mesur hwn. Gobeithiaf y gellir canfod amser ar gyfer y mesur pwysig hwn.

Daeth rhywfaint o lwyddiant o lobïo Undeb y Brigadau Tân. Gosodir systemau taenellu ym mhob archfarchnad newydd ac mae'r undeb ar hyn o bryd yn lobïo er mwyn ymestyn hyn i dai amlbreswyliaeth ac ysgolion. Bydd mesur diogelwch tân cynhwysfawr hefyd yn cynnwys pwerau deddfu eilaidd a fydd yn caniatáu i'r Cynulliad gymryd rôl mewn perthynas â'r gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru.

Efallai fod problemau daearyddol o gael gwasanaeth tân i Gymru gyfan, ond efallai y bydd manteision hefyd o ran cydnabod yr amgylchiadau newydd o ganlyniad i ddatganoli. Cyn mynd ar hyd y llwybr hwn, fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymgynghori'n eang â'r holl gyfranogion yn y gwasanaeth tân: o'r ymladdwyr tân cyffredin a gweithredwyr yr ystafell reoli i'r prif swyddogion tân, cynghorau lleol, mudiadau gwirfoddol a'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol. Gallem ymchwilio i ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd a ganiatâi i'r tri awdurdod tân presennol osod praesept yn yr un modd â heddluoedd.

Un broblem fawr a wyneba'r gwasanaeth tân,

particularly although not exclusively in rural areas, is recruiting retained firefighters. These are the men and women who are on call to respond to emergencies whenever their bleeper goes, 168 hours of the week, 52 weeks a year, including Christmas Day and New Year's Eve. Many retained firefighters have other full or part-time jobs, but when the calls come they are ready to drop what they are doing to become part of a team to face an emergency. I pay tribute to the employers that allow members of their workforce who are part-time firefighters to respond. I hope that more employers will allow our firefighters to respond on a regular basis.

There is a particular need to attract more women to train as firefighters in the retained and the full-time service. In our International Women's Day debate last Wednesday I drew your attention to the North Wales Fire Service's contribution in holding open days to encourage recruitment into the fire service. It was more by fault than by design to promote International Women's Day that the dates coincided, but I still give the service credit.

Historically, the fire service, like the police force, has had a macho or a military structure that has not assisted efforts to attract women and people from our ethnic minorities. However, Wales is leading the way here as well. Following the recent HMI report on equality and fairness in the fire service, the South Wales Fire Service, the Welsh regional branch of the Fire Brigades' Union and the Trades Union Congress' education department have come together to form a unique partnership to provide bullying and harassment awareness training to everyone in the fire service, from the chief fire officer down. I am pleased that this scheme was financed in part by our own Wales Union Learning Fund, thus enabling it to be copied by the other two Welsh fire brigades. The scheme has received the support of the Home Office Minister, Mike O'Brien, and is now likely to be exported into England.

Having initiated this debate, it would not be

yn enwedig ond nid yn gyfan gwbl mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yw recriwtio ymladdwyr tân cadwedig. Y rhain yw'r dynion a'r merched sydd ar alwad i ymateb i argyfyngau pryd bynnag y bydd eu bipiwr yn canu, 168 awr yr wythnos, 52 wythnos y flwyddyn, gan gynnwys Dydd Nadolig a Nos Galan. Mae gan lawer o ymladdwyr tân cadwedig swyddi llawn amser neu ran amser, ond pan ddaw'r galwadau rhaid iddynt ollwng beth bynnag y maent yn ei wneud a dod yn rhan o dîm er mwyn wynebu argyfwng. Talaf deyrnged i'r cyflogwyr sydd yn caniatáu i aelodau o'u gweithlu sydd yn ymladdwyr tân rhan amser ymateb. Gobeithiaf y bydd mwy o gyflogwyr yn caniatáu i'n hymlladdwyr tân ymateb yn rheolaidd.

Mae angen arbennig i ddenu mwy o fenywod i hyfforddi'n ymladdwyr tân yn y gwasanaeth cadwedig a'r gwasanaeth llawn amser. Yn ein dadl Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod ddydd Mercher diwethaf, tynnais eich sylw at gyfraniad Gwasanaeth Tân Gogledd Cymru wrth gynnal diwrnodiau agored i hybu recriwtio i'r gwasanaeth tân. Yr oedd y dyddiadau wedi cyd-ddigwydd drwy ffawd yn hytrach na thrwy fwriad i hybu Diwrnod Rhyngwladol y Menywod, ond rhoddaf glod i'r gwasanaeth er hynny.

Yn hanesyddol, mae gan y gwasanaeth tân, fel yr heddlu, strwythur *macho* neu filwrol nad yw wedi helpu i ddenu benywod a phobl o'n lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Fodd bynnag, mae Cymru ar y blaen yma hefyd. Ar ôl yr adroddiad diweddar gan Arolygwyr Ei Mawrhydi ar gydraddoldeb a thegwch yn y gwasanaeth tân, mae Gwasanaeth Tân De Cymru, cangen ranbarthol Cymru o Undeb y Brigadau Tân ac adran addysg Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur wedi dod at ei gilydd i ffurfio partneriaeth unigryw i ddarparu hyfforddiant ar ymwybyddiaeth o fwlio ac aflonyddu i bawb yn y gwasanaeth tân, o'r prif swyddog tân i lawr. Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynllun hwn wedi ei ariannu'n rhannol gan Gronfa Dysgu Undebau Cymru, gan ei gwneud yn bosibl iddo gael ei gopïo gan y ddwy frigâd dân arall yng Nghymru. Mae'r cynllun wedi cael cefnogaeth y Gweinidog yn y Swyddfa Gartref, Mike O'Brien, ac mae'n awr yn debygol o gael ei allforio i Loegr.

A minnau wedi cychwyn y ddadl hon, ni

right for me not to mention the fourth emergency service that is all too often missed out, namely Her Majesty's Coastguard. Wales has three coastguard headquarters at Holyhead, Milford Haven and the Mumbles. There are also hundreds of voluntary coastguards all around Wales. In conjunction with the Royal National Lifeboat Institution, they provide vital help to people in distress out at sea or on the coast of Wales.

I pay a timely tribute to the RNLI, because part of the contingent that it has sent to Mozambique to assist with the floods comes from Wales. There is also a team of firefighters from Wales there. We must pay tribute to those people who are currently working with other agencies in Mozambique. I recall the role that the RNLI played in the Towyn floods 10 years ago. I was the most senior operator on duty in the Clwyd fire service control room as we took the first 40 calls in as many seconds, alerting us that the sea was breaching the wall. Many visions return to me when I think of how I had to co-ordinate the emergency services. The vision that I remember most vividly is that of the former chief fire officer and the former Secretary of State for Wales cruising down the river—the song 'Cruising Down The River (On a Sunday Afternoon)' comes to mind. Unfortunately, that river was the A547 between Towyn and Rhyl. Last year marked the hundred and seventy-fifth anniversary of the RNLI. I am sure that everyone concurs that the bravery shown by lifeboat personnel on many occasions since then is an example and an inspiration to us all.

5:20 p.m.

Finally, I pay tribute to the mountain rescue teams in Wales. With cutbacks to the air and sea rescue, their role has become more important in saving the lives of people, from experienced climbers to unfortunate day trippers who every year find themselves lost or injured on Welsh mountains. It is

fyddai'n iawn imi beidio â chrybwyll y pedwerydd gwasanaeth argyfwng a anghofir yn rhy aml o lawer, sef Gwylwyr y Glannau Ei Mawrhydi. Mae gan Gymru dri phencadlys gwylwyr y glannau yng Nghaerdybi, Aberdaugleddau a'r Mwmbwls. Ceir hefyd gannoedd o wylwyr y glannau gwirfoddol o gwmpas Cymru. Ar y cyd â Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub, darparant gymorth holl bwysig i bobl mewn cyfyngder ar y môr neu ar arfordir Cymru.

Talaf deyrnged amserol i Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub, oherwydd o Gymru y daw rhan o'r fintai a anfonodd i Mozambique i gynorthwyo gyda'r llifogydd. Mae tîm o ymladdwyr tân o Gymru yno hefyd. Rhaid inni dalu teyrnged i'r bobl hynny sydd yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd gydag asiantaethau eraill yn Mozambique. Cofiaf y rôl a chwaraeodd Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub yn y llifogydd yn Nhowyn 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Fi oedd y gweithredwr uchaf ar ddyletswydd yn ystafell reoli gwasanaeth tân Clwyd pan dderbyniasom y 40 galwad gyntaf yn yr un nifer o eiliadau, yn ein rhybuddio bod y môr yn torri drwy'r morglawdd. Daw llawer o ddarluniau'n ôl i'r meddwl wrth gofio sut yr oeddwn yn gorfod cyd-drefnu'r gwasanaethau argyfwng. Y darlun a gofiaf yn fwyaf eglur oedd hwnnw o'r cyn-brif swyddog tân a chyn-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n hwylio i lawr yr afon—daw'r gân 'Cruising Down The River (On a Sunday Afternoon)' i'r meddwl. Yn anffodus, yr afon honno oedd yr A547 rhwng Towyn a'r Rhyl. Y llynedd oedd pen blwydd Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub yn 175 mlwydd oed. Yr wyf yn sicr bod pawb yn cyd-weld bod y dewrder a amlygwyd gan bersonél y badau achub ar lawer achlysur ers hynny yn esiampl ac yn ysbrydoliaeth i bawb ohonom.

Yn olaf, talaf deyrnged i'r timau achub ar y mynydd yng Nghymru. Gyda chwtogi ar wasanaethau achub awyr a môr, mae eu rôl yn fwyfwy pwysig bellach wrth achub bywydau pobl, o ddringwyr profiadol i ymwelwyr undydd anffortunos sydd yn mynd ar goll neu'n cael eu hanafu bob blwyddyn



impossible to consider the role of the emergency services without feeling humility at the dedication of those men and women who commit time and, if necessary, risk their lives to come to the aid of those in distress.

I urge you all as Members to support your local lifeboats, where applicable, and to support the air ambulance appeal. Always pull your vehicle over at the roadside when you hear the two-toned horn and never try to get out of the way. Firefighters, ambulance workers and even the police will always manage to get around you. When you try to turn off the road, you upset them as they have already found their line of vision. All you need to do is to stop. We need to remind others of the debt that we owe to the paid and unpaid men and women who respond to our calls for help in emergencies.

**Lynne Neagle:** I want to highlight the pressures facing the ambulance service in my constituency and in Gwent as a whole. I recently visited the ambulance headquarters in Pontypool and saw at first hand the pressures that staff are under—making life and death decisions as calls come in constantly, prioritising, reprioritising, allocating and reallocating ambulances. At one point there was only one ambulance available to cover the whole of Gwent. That ambulance was down in Newport. If a call had come in from the north of the constituency, the ambulance would never have got there within the eight minute target. The staff are under incredible pressure, which means that they are no longer able to take the appropriate breaks.

The ambulance trust in south-east Wales does not receive its fair share of resources. In south-east Wales last year, they dealt with 131,764 calls with 78 crews. In north Wales, they dealt with only 52 per cent of those calls with two-thirds the number of crews. The contrast is even more stark in the central and west region where they dealt with just 65 per cent of the calls but had 80 crews. The south-east is losing out. This is not a rural versus

ym mynyddoedd Cymru. Amhosibl yw ystyried rôl y gwasanaethau argyfwng heb deimlo'n wylaidd o flaen ymroddiad y dynion a'r merched hynny sydd yn rhoi o'u hamser ac, os oes rhaid, yn mentro eu bywydau er mwyn cynorthwyo rhai sydd mewn cyfyngder.

Fe'ch anogaf i gyd fel Aelodau i gefnogi'ch badau achub lleol, lle y bo hynny'n berthnasol, ac i gefnogi apêl yr ambiwlans awyr. Tynnwch eich cerbyd i ochr y ffordd bob amser pan glywch y corn dwy dôn a pheidwch byth â cheisio symud o'r ffordd. Bydd ymladdwyr tân, gweithwyr ambiwlans a hyd yn oed yr heddlu'n llwyddo i fynd heibio i chi bob tro. Pan geiswch droi oddi ar y ffordd, yr ydych yn tarfu arnynt gan eu bod eisoes wedi dod o hyd i'w llinell edrych. Y cwbl y dylech ei wneud yw stopio. Mae angen inni atgoffa eraill am ein dyled i'r dynion a'r merched taledig a di-dâl sydd yn ymateb i'n galwadau am gymorth mewn argyfwng.

**Lynne Neagle:** Yr wyf am dynnu sylw at y pwysau sydd yn wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn fy etholaeth i ac yng Ngwent gyfan. Ymwelais yn ddiweddar â'r pencadlys ambiwlans ym Mhont-y-pŵl a gweld â'm llygaid fy hun y pwysau y mae'r staff odditao—gan wneud penderfyniadau tyngedfennol wrth i alwadau ddod i mewn yn gyson, blaenoriaethu, ailflaenoriaethu, dyrannu ac ailddyrrannu ambiwlansiau. Ar un adeg nid oedd ond un ambiwlans ar gael ar gyfer y cyfan o Went. Yr oedd yr ambiwlans hwnnw i lawr yng Nghasnewydd. Pe bai galwad wedi dod o ogledd yr etholaeth, ni fyddai'r ambiwlans byth wedi gallu cyrraedd yno o fewn y targed o wyth munud. Mae'r staff o dan bwysau anhygoel, sydd yn golygu nad ydynt bellach yn gallu cymryd y seibiannau priodol.

Nid yw'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru yn derbyn ei chyfran deg o'r adnoddau. Yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru y llynedd, ymdriniasant â 131,764 o alwadau gyda 78 o griwiau. Yng ngogledd Cymru, ymdriniasant â dim ond 52 y cant o'r galwadau hynny gyda dwy ran o dair o nifer y criwiau. Mae'r gwrthgyferbyniad yn amlycach fyth yn rhanbarth y canolbarth a'r gorllewin lle yr ymdriniasant â dim ond 65 y

urban issue. We have a formula that recognises rurality and sparsity but does not take into account deprivation and ill-health. In short, we have an NHS formula that does not take into account the NHS and health. We need to address that. Rhodri said earlier that this meant tough choices for the Assembly. When it comes to making those tough choices, I hope that this Assembly will have the courage and the basis of fairness and social justice to make them.

**Geraint Davies:** I thank Ann Jones for the opportunity to comment on the emergency services, particularly the ambulance service. I have been concerned for a long time about the response time in the upper Rhondda, especially since the closure of our local ambulance station in Treherbert. We had two ambulances there and we have had nothing to replace this service. There is no standby position and response time has inevitably increased. There have been cases of people waiting over 40 minutes for an ambulance. Ambulances have been deployed from as far away as Maesteg, which is over two valleys away. These cases are anecdotal but the statistics bear them out. In Rhondda Cynon Taff, only 38 per cent of ambulances arrive within the designated response time of eight minutes, compared with the national average of 49 per cent. The target by April 2001 is 75 per cent, so we have a long way to go. These response times are unacceptable and cost lives. We are not criticising the crews, which are first class. It is a criticism of the resources that they are given. This situation is unsatisfactory and must be addressed as a matter of priority.

**Michael German:** I pay tribute to Ann for raising this matter today. I was fortunate to have spent yesterday with the ambulance crew in Gwent, which, as you know, has the biggest problem in Wales in terms of response times. I pay tribute to the staff concerned because they were incredible, particularly Mike Finiake and John Myer

cant o'r galwadau ond gyda 80 o griwiau. Mae'r de-ddwyrain ar ei golled. Nid mater o'r wlad yn erbyn y dref yw hwn. Mae gennym fformwla sydd yn cydnabod gwledigrwydd a theneurwydd poblogaeth ond nid yw'n cymryd amddifadedd a iechyd gwael i ystyriaeth. Yn syml, mae gennym fformwla NHS nad yw'n cymryd i ystyriaeth yr NHS a iechyd. Rhaid inni roi sylw i hynny. Dywedodd Rhodri'n gynharach fod hyn yn golygu bod rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniadau anodd. Pan ddaw i wneud y penderfyniadau anodd hynny, gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn meddu ar y dewrder a'r sylfaen o degwch a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'w gwneud.

**Geraint Davies:** Diolchaf i Ann Jones am y cyfle i wneud sylw am y gwasanaethau argyfwng, yn enwedig y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Bûm yn bryderus ers amser maith ynghylch yr amser ymateb yn Rhondda uchaf, yn enwedig ers cau ein gorsaf ambiwlans leol yn Nhereherbert. Yr oedd gennym ddau ambiwlans yno ac nid oes gennym ddim yn lle'r gwasanaeth hwn. Nid oes safle wrth gefn ac mae'r amser ymateb wedi cynyddu'n anorfod. Bu achosion lle y bu pobl yn disgwyl dros 40 munud am ambiwlans. Anfonwyd ambiwlansiau o gyn belled â Maesteg, sydd yn bellach na dau gwm i ffwrdd. Mae'r achosion hyn yn anecdotaidd ond mae'r ystadegau'n eu hategu. Yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, dim ond 38 y cant o ambiwlansiau sydd yn cyrraedd o fewn yr amser ymateb dynodedig o wyth munud, o'i gymharu â'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol o 49 y cant. Y targed erbyn Ebrill 2001 yw 75 y cant, felly mae gennym ffordd bell o'n blaen. Mae'r amseroedd ymateb hyn yn annerbyniol ac maent yn costio bywydau. Nid ydym yn beirniadu'r criwiau, sydd o'r radd flaenaf. Mae'n feirniadaeth ar yr adnoddau a roddir iddynt. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn anfodddhaol a rhaid ymdrin ag ef fel mater o flaenoriaeth.

**Michael German:** Talaf deyrnged i Ann am godi'r mater hwn heddiw. Yr oeddwn yn ffodus o gael treulio'r diwrnod ddoe gyda'r criw ambiwlans yng Ngwent sydd, fel y gwyddoch, â'r broblem fwyaf yng Nghymru o ran amseroedd ymateb. Talaf deyrnged i'r staff dan sylw oherwydd yr oeddent yn anhygoel, yn enwedig Mike Finiake a John

who treated me as an unpaid adviser apart from lobbying me between red calls for the day.

It was an exciting day and it was interesting to see the problems that they face. On one problem facing the Royal Gwent Hospital, I was present when the ambulance crew took patients into ward D1 west—the pre-medical ward and I regret to say that those patients were stacking up in the corridors. That occurs on a daily basis and ambulance personnel are then held up having to manage patients until a bed can be made available. That is one of the main criticisms of bed blocking in Wales. It must be resolved because ambulance personnel should be out on the road doing the job that they do best.

On the ambulance trust in Gwent, there are questions to be asked about management, deployment, morale and bed blocking but primarily about resources, personnel and the ambulances concerned. We must now regard this issue as one of great concern to the people of Wales. Yesterday, I was present on an ambulance call that could not have been made in eight minutes. It took 15 minutes to respond. We had to stop twice to ask people for directions because the ambulance personnel were outside their area and did not have any local knowledge. The Assembly must address these issues of management, deployment and resources. I hope that this debate reflects the need to do so.

**David Melding:** I stand in complete awe of Ann Jones and her mastery of this subject and I can only say that if I should ever need the emergency services, I hope that there is an Ann Jones equivalent co-ordinating on that day.

Many ambulance crews are trained paramedics and the outcome for patients is often vastly improved by the immediate treatment that they receive from paramedics, for example, by administering adrenalin for drug users or aspirin for patients who have suffered from heart attacks. This is a crucial area in terms of the health gain that can be secured through response times being as short as possible and through getting highly trained

Myer a oedd yn fy nhrin fel ymgynghorydd di-dâl heblaw am fy lobïo rhwng galwadau coch gydol y dydd.

Yr oedd yn ddiwrnod cyffrous ac yr oedd yn ddiddorol gweld y problemau a wynebant. Ynghylch un broblem sydd yn wynebu Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, yr oeddwn yn bresennol pan aeth y criw ambiwlans â chleifion i ward D1 gorllewin—y ward gynfeddygol ac mae'n ofid imi ddweud bod y cleifion hynny'n cael eu pentyrru yn y coridorau. Digwydd hynny bob dydd a delir y personél ambiwlans yn ôl wedyn drwy orfod rheoli cleifion hyd y gellir darparu gwely. Dyna un o'r prif feiriadaethau ar flocio gwelyau yng Nghymru. Rhaid ei ddatrys oherwydd dylai personél ambiwlans fod allan ar y ffordd yn gwneud y gwaith a wnânt orau.

Ynghylch yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yng Ngwent, mae cwestiynau i'w gofyn ynghylch rheoli, trefnu, morâl a blocio gwelyau ond yn bennaf ynghylch adnoddau, personél a'r ambiwlansiau cysylltiedig. Rhaid inni ystyried hyn bellach yn fater o bryder mawr i bobl Cymru. Ddoe, yr oeddwn yn bresennol ar alwad ambiwlans na ellid ei hateb o fewn wyth munud. Cymerwyd 15 munud i ymateb. Bu'n rhaid inni stopio ddwywaith i ofyn am gyfarwyddiadau oherwydd yr oedd y personél ambiwlans y tu allan i'w hardal ac nid oedd ganddynt unrhyw wybodaeth leol. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad ymdrin â'r materion hyn o reoli, trefnu ac adnoddau. Gobeithiaf fod y ddadl hon yn adlewyrchu'r angen i wneud hynny.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn llawn parchedig ofn tuag at Ann Jones a'i meistrolaeth o'r pwnc hwn ac ni allaf ond dweud, os byth y bydd arnaf angen y gwasanaethau argyfwng, y gobeithiaf fod rhywun tebyg i Ann Jones yn cyd-drefnu ar y diwrnod hwnnw.

Mae llawer o griwiau ambiwlans yn barameddygon hyfforddedig ac mae'r canlyniad i gleifion yn well o lawer iawn yn aml oherwydd y driniaeth a dderbyniant ar unwaith gan barameddygon, er enghraifft, drwy roi adrenalin i ddefnyddwyr cyffuriau neu aspirin i gleifion a ddiodefodd drawiad ar y galon. Mae hyn yn faes holl bwysig o ran yr enillion mewn iechyd y gellir eu sicrhau drwy fyrhau amseroedd ymateb gymaint ag y

people who can administer medical attention immediately. It is an important service.

**Peter Law:** I have five minutes to respond. We should be dealing with response times for Assembly Secretaries on these short debates.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am prepared to go a little over the allotted time as Helen Mary is not in the Chamber.

**The Secretary for Local Government and Housing (Peter Law):** I am grateful to Ann for raising this important subject and I begin by putting on record the debt of gratitude that we in Wales owe to the highly dedicated and professional staff who provide us with emergency services. I am sure that you will all wish to join me in expressing our appreciation to those involved in the provision of essential services in Wales: fire, police, ambulance, coastguard, the Royal National Lifeboat Institution and the mountain rescue. Those people make the difference on a day-to-day basis and we greatly appreciate their contribution. I was pleased to hear of the RNLI's work in Mozambique. I know that the South Wales Fire Service has sent people to Mozambique because someone from my constituency went and I am sure that there are others out there helping those people who have been overwhelmed by this tragedy. We are very proud of them.

I will remind Members that policy responsibility for the police and fire services rests with the Home Office. However, the provision of all emergency services in Wales relies on a successful working partnership with local authorities. That relationship is important because local authorities play a key role in supporting the emergency services in many ways. Local authorities provide representation on police and fire service authorities and help to ensure that these services respond to the needs and expectations of local communities. They undertake the preparation of emergency plans and assist in co-ordinating emergency services in the unlikely event of a major disruption. They provide updates on the

bo modd a thrwy gael pobl dra hyfforddedig a all roi sylw meddygol ar unwaith. Mae'n wasanaeth pwysig.

**Peter Law:** Mae gennyf bum munud i ymateb. Dylem fod yn ymdrin ag amseroedd ymateb ar gyfer Ysgrifenyddion Cynulliad yn y dadleuon byr hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn barod i fynd ychydig dros yr amser a ddyrannwyd gan nad yw Helen Mary yn y Siambr.

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai (Peter Law):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Ann am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn a dechreuaf drwy gofnodi'r diolch sydd yn ddyledus gennym ni yng Nghymru i'r staff ymroddedig a phroffesiynol dros ben sydd yn darparu ein gwasanaethau argyfwng i ni. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd pawb ohonoch am ymuno â mi wrth fynegi ein gwerthfawrogiad o'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol yng Nghymru: y gwasanaeth tân, yr heddlu, ambiwlansiau, gwylwyr y glannau, Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub a'r gwasanaeth achub ar y mynydd. Mae'r bobl hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth o ddydd i ddydd a mawr werthfawrogwn eu cyfraniad. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed am waith Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub yn Mozambique. Gwn fod Gwasanaeth Tân De Cymru wedi anfon pobl i Mozambique oherwydd aeth rhywun o'm hetholaeth i ac yr wyf yn sicr bod eraill yno'n helpu'r bobl hynny a lethwyd gan y drasiedi hon. Yr ydym yn falch iawn ohonynt.

Yr wyf am atgoffa'r Aelodau bod y cyfrifoldeb polisi dros yr heddlu a'r gwasanaeth tân yn eiddo i'r Swyddfa Gartref. Fodd bynnag, mae darparu'r holl wasanaethau argyfwng yng Nghymru'n dibynnu ar bartneriaeth waith lwyddiannus ag awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r berthynas honno'n bwysig oherwydd mae awdurdodau lleol yn chwarae rôl allweddol wrth gynnal y gwasanaethau argyfwng mewn llawer ffordd. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn darparu cynrychiolaeth ar awdurdodau'r heddlu a'r gwasanaeth tân ac yn helpu i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hyn yn ymateb i anghenion a disgwyliadau cymunedau lleol. Ymglymerant i baratoi cynlluniau argyfwng a chynorthwyo wrth gyd-drefnu gwasanaethau argyfwng os

distribution of population, including new developments, and they identify likely problem areas. They keep emergency services informed on changes to road design and diversions and arrange suitable access for them where appropriate. That close liaison is paramount in ensuring that emergency services can function as efficiently and effectively as possible.

bydd amhariad sylweddol yn digwydd, er annhebyced hynny. Darparant yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar ddsbarthiad y boblogaeth, gan gynnwys datblygiadau newydd, a dynodant feysydd sydd yn debygol o beri problemau. Rhoddant wybod yn gyson i'r gwasanaethau argyfwng am newidiadau yn nyluniad ffyrdd a dargyfeiriadau a threfnu mynediad addas iddynt lle y bo'n briodol. Mae'r cysylltiad agos hwnnw'n bwysicach na dim wrth sicrhau bod gwasanaethau argyfwng yn gallu gweithredu mor effeithlon ac effeithiol ag y bo modd.

5:30 p.m.

Ann mentioned closer liaison with the police service. The police authorities liaise ever closer with us. The Assembly is now designated under the Crime and Disorder Act 1998 and Gwent chief constables met senior Assembly officials during the last year. I am due to meet chief constables on behalf of the Assembly shortly. This is a partnership approach on behalf of the people of Wales.

Soniodd Ann am gysylltiad agosach â gwasanaeth yr heddlu. Mae awdurdodau'r heddlu'n cysylltu'n agosach â ni o hyd. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ei ddynodi bellach o dan y Ddeddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998 a chyfarfu prif gwnstabiliaid Gwent ag uwch swyddogion o'r Cynulliad yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr wyf i fod i gyfarfod â phrif gwnstabiliaid ar ran y Cynulliad cyn hir. Mae hyn yn ddull o weithio mewn partneriaeth ar ran pobl Cymru.

As I am Secretary for Local Government and Housing, you will not be surprised if I mention Best Value, which is important in what we are trying to achieve. It covers local authorities, police and fire authorities and is about delivering effective, efficient and economic services for the benefit of local people. An important aspect of Best Value is the need to consider the public's views on how services should be delivered. They know as well as anybody what should be delivered, when it should be delivered and by whom. Under Best Value, the Home Secretary has issued guidance to police authorities on setting targets for reducing domestic burglaries and vehicle crime. The Government has set targets for fire brigades on meeting attendance standards and carrying out work on fire safety certificates.

Gan fy mod yn Ysgrifennydd Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, ni fyddwch yn synnu os crybwyllaf Werth Gorau, sydd yn bwysig o ran yr hyn y ceisiwn ei gyflawni. Mae'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau'r heddlu a'r gwasanaeth tân ac mae'n ymwneud â chyflenwi gwasanaethau effeithiol, effeithlon ac economaidd er budd pobl leol. Agwedd bwysig ar Werth Gorau yw'r angen i ystyried barn y cyhoedd ar y modd y dylid cyflenwi gwasanaethau. Gwyddant gystal â neb yr hyn y dylid ei gyflenwi, pryd y dylid ei gyflenwi a chan bwy. O dan Werth Gorau, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi cyhoeddi arweiniad i awdurdodau'r heddlu ynghylch gosod targedau i leihau bwrgeriaeth mewn cartrefi a throseddau sydd yn ymwneud â cherbydau. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi pennu targedau i frigadau tân ynghylch cyrraedd safonau presenoldeb a chyflawni gwaith ar dystysgrifau diogelwch tân.

The ambulance service also has demanding targets, which cover Wales and England. Several Members, namely Mike, Lynne and Geraint, expressed concerns about the

Mae gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans dargedau ymestynnol hefyd, sydd yn cynnwys Cymru a Lloegr. Mae sawl Aelod, sef Mike, Lynne a Geraint, wedi mynegi pryderon ynghylch

performance of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. It was interesting to hear about Lynne and Mike's productive visits to ambulance headquarters. Following the demanding new performance standards that were introduced last year, the trust has been invited to appear before the Health and Social Services Committee on 5 April to discuss performance across Wales and other issues, such as the proposed dedicated air ambulance service. That will give Members an opportunity to raise their concerns directly with the trust on a range of ambulance issues. I am sure that my friend, Jane Hutt, will consider the concerns raised this afternoon.

Ann raised an important point about the air ambulance service. The Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust has agreements with several organisations across Wales to provide air ambulance services. The ambulance service examined the introduction of a dedicated air ambulance service but determined that resources would be better invested in ground-based services. However, the Automobile Association has provided the ambulance trust with an opportunity to provide a dedicated air ambulance service by offering sponsorship to meet the full cost of helicopter cover for Wales in the first year. It will meet 75 per cent of the cost in the second year and 50 per cent of the cost thereafter. That is a generous offer but, in the long term, the ambulance service will still need to meet an annual running cost of about £1 million. The ambulance trust cannot afford that financial burden. For that reason, and in common with ambulance trusts in England, it is establishing a charitable organisation to raise funds to meet the recurring cost. Fundraising of this level year on year will not be easy. The ambulance trust has been pleased with the public's response in assisting to establish and run the charitable organisation. I hope that that public support will continue once the fundraising effort begins. I am sure that Members will join me in wishing this venture every success.

We can all help to ease the pressure on the

perfformiad Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol clywed am ymweliadau cynhyrchiol Lynne a Mike â'r pencadlys ambiwlans. Ar ôl y safonau perfformiad newydd ymestynnol a gyflwynwyd y llynedd, gwahoddiwyd yr ymddiriedolaeth i ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 5 Ebrill i drafod perfformiad ledled Cymru a materion eraill, fel y gwasanaethau ambiwlans awyr pwrpasol arfaethedig. Bydd hynny'n rhoi cyfle i'r Aelodau godi eu pryderon yn uniongyrchol gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth ar amrediad o faterion ambiwlans. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd fy ffrind, Jane Hutt, yn ystyried y pryderon a godwyd y prynhawn yma.

Cododd Ann bwynt pwysig ynghylch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr. Mae gan Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru gytundebau â sawl corff drwy Gymru i ddarparu gwasanaethau ambiwlans awyr. Rhoddodd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ystyriaeth i gyflwyno gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr un pwrpas ond penderfynodd mai gwell fyddai buddsoddi adnoddau mewn gwasanaethau ar y llawr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gymdeithas Foduro wedi rhoi cyfle i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ddarparu gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr un pwrpas drwy gynnig nawdd i dalu holl gostau gwasanaeth hofrenyddion i Gymru yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Bydd yn talu 75 y cant o'r gost yn yr ail flwyddyn a 50 y cant o'r gost wedi hynny. Mae hynny'n gynnig hael ond, yn y tymor hir, bydd angen o hyd i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans dalu costau rhedeg blynyddol o tua £1 miliwn. Ni all yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans fforddio'r baich ariannol hwnnw. Oherwydd hynny, ac yn yr un modd ag ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans yn Lloegr, mae'n sefydlu mudiad elusennol i godi arian i dalu'r gost reolaidd. Ni fydd codi arian ar y lefel hon flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yn hawdd. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn fodlon ag ymateb y cyhoedd wrth helpu i sefydlu a rhedeg y mudiad elusennol. Gobeithiaf y bydd cefnogaeth y cyhoedd yn parhau ar ôl i'r gwaith codi arian ddechrau. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yr Aelodau'n ymuno â mi wrth ddyuno pob llwyddiant i'r fenter hon.

Gall bawb ohonom helpu i leddfu'r pwysau

emergency services by taking more responsibility for our safety. Key to this is the Government's commitment to reducing the number of house fire deaths. Lead responsibility for this rests with the Home Secretary, who has announced a target to reduce house fire deaths by 20 per cent by 2003. To achieve this, some £14 million will be provided by the Government over the next three years. The installation of properly-maintained smoke alarms in every household has been central to the Government's goal of reducing fire casualties. The Government's efforts and those of the fire brigades has increased ownership of smoke alarms from 9 per cent of the population in 1987 to 82 per cent. Since 1992, all new dwellings in England and Wales have been required to have smoke alarms fitted, and consideration has been given to making smoke alarms mandatory.

I pay tribute to the Fire Brigades' Union, which has played an important part. The provision of fire safety equipment in other buildings is regulated under the Fire Precautions (Workplace) Regulations 1997. This requires a risk assessment by employers of their premises. In light of this, they must provide fire fighting equipment, fire detectors and alarms, and other fire safety equipment to safeguard their employees. In addition, most large factories, offices, shops and hotels require a fire certificate whose provision by the fire authority will depend, among other things, on the provision of suitable means for giving warning of fire and for fighting it.

It is not only the roads accessed by emergency services that can be problematic. The enforcement of the legal requirements in relation to houses in multiple occupation, where access can be difficult, rests with local authorities. They must ensure that there are suitable means of ingress for emergency services, and where there are known problems of access to houses of multiple occupation, they should be drawn to the attention of the local authority and the appropriate emergency services.

Finally, I echo what I said at the beginning—

ar y gwasanaethau argyfwng drwy ymgymryd â mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros ein diogelwch. Un peth allweddol i hynny yw ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i leihau nifer y marwolaethau o danau mewn tai. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb arweiniol dros hynny'n perthyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, a gyhoeddodd darged i leihau nifer y marwolaeth o danau mewn tai 20 y cant erbyn 2003. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, darperir tua £14 miliwn gan y Llywodraeth dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae gosod larymau mwg a gaiff eu cynnal a'u cadw'n iawn ym mhob cartref yn ganolog erioed i nod y Llywodraeth o leihau marwolaethau oherwydd tân. Mae ymdrechion y Llywodraeth a rhai'r brigadau tân wedi cynyddu perchnogaeth ar larymau mwg o 9 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn 1987 i 82 y cant. Ers 1992, mae'n ofynnol gosod larwm mwg ym mhob annedd newydd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, a rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i wneud larymau mwg yn orfodol.

Talaf deyrnged i Undeb y Brigadau Tân, a chwaraeodd ran bwysig. Mae darparu offer diogelwch tân mewn adeiladau eraill wedi ei reoleiddio o dan y Rheoliadau Rhagofalon Tân (Gweithle) 1997. Mae hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gyflogwyr gyflawni asesiad risg yn eu hadeiladau. Yng ngoleuni hynny, rhaid iddynt ddarparu offer ymladd tân, canfodyddion tân a larymau, ac offer diogelwch tân eraill i warchod eu gweithwyr. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae angen tystysgrif tân ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o ffatrioedd, swyddfeydd, siopau a gwestai mawr, y bydd y ddarpariaeth ohoni gan yr awdurdod tân yn dibynnu, ymysg pethau eraill, ar y ddarpariaeth o ddull priodol i roi rhybudd am dân a'i ymladd.

Nid y ffyrdd a gyrchir gan y gwasanaethau argyfwng yw'r unig bethau a all fod yn broblemus. Mae gorfodi gofynion cyfreithiol mewn perthynas â thai amlbreswyliaeth, y gall fod yn anodd mynd iddynt, yn ddyletswydd i awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid iddynt sicrhau bod mynedfeydd addas ar gyfer y gwasanaethau argyfwng, a lle y bo problemau hysbys ynghylch mynd i dai amlbreswyliaeth, dylid eu dwyn i sylw'r awdurdod lleol a'r gwasanaethau argyfwng priodol.

Yn olaf, ategaf yr hyn a ddywedais ar y

we owe an enormous debt of gratitude to those who work in the police, fire, ambulance and other emergency services in Wales. Their job is not an easy one and they deserve the fullest support of politicians and the community. I know that the Assembly recognises their important contribution to the people of Wales.

dechrau—mae arnom ddyled enfawr i'r rhai sydd yn gweithio yn yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth tân, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a gwasanaethau argyfwng eraill yng Nghymru. Nid yw eu gwaith yn hawdd ac maent yn teilyngu'r gefnogaeth fwyaf posibl gan wleidyddion a'r gymuned. Gwn fod y Cynulliad yn cydnabod eu cyfraniad pwysig i bobl Cymru.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.35 p.m.*