



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 12 Gorffennaf 2006
Wednesday, 12 July 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister
- 20 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 34 Cwestiwn Brys: Map Cymorth Gwladol
Urgent Question: State Aids Map
- 44 Cwestiwn Brys: Canolfan Ddosbarthu Iceland
Urgent Question: Iceland Distribution Centre
- 48 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith (Cymalau Enghreifftiol ar gyfer
Rheilffyrdd a Thramffyrdd) 2006
Approval of the Transport and Works (Model Clauses for Railways and Tramways)
Order 2006
- 49 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad (Addysg
Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales)
(Amendment) Regulations 2006
- 52 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Plant 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog
Delegation of Functions under the Children Act 2004 to the First Minister
- 54 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 55 Adroddiad Blynyddol y Prif Weinidog
The First Minister's Annual Report
- 95 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 96 Adroddiad Blynyddol y Prif Weinidog: Parhad
The First Minister's Annual Report: Continued
- 105 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion
The Report of the Committee on School Funding
- 128 Dadl Fer: A Wnaiff 'Cyfraith Sarah' Amddiffyn Plant yng Nghymru?
Short Debate: Will a 'Sarah's Law' Protect Children in Wales?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer**

Y Llywydd: Cyn i mi alw cwestiynau, croesawaf i'n oriel cyhoeddus Lefarydd Deddfwrfa River State Nigeria a'i ddirprwyaeth. Croeso mawr. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

The Presiding Officer: Before I call questions, I welcome to our public gallery the Speaker of Nigeria's River State Legislature and his delegation. A warm welcome to you. [*Applause.*]

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister**

**Cyllid Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
The Environment, Planning and Countryside Budget**

C1 Elin Jones: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn unrhyw sylwadau yn ddiweddar i gynyddu'r dyraniad cyllid cyffredinol ar gyfer y portffolio amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad? OAQ0615(FIN)

Q1 Elin Jones: Has the Minister received any requests recently to increase the overall budget allocation to the environment, planning and countryside portfolio? OAQ0615(FIN)

Q9 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget priorities for the environment, planning and countryside portfolio for the next 12 months? OAQ0595(FIN)

C9 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau'r gyllideb ar gyfer y portffolio amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad am y 12 mis nesaf? OAQ0595(FIN)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): As part of the budget-setting process, subject committees should have submitted their budget priorities to me by 7 July.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Fel rhan o'r broses o bennu'r gyllideb, dylai pwyllgorau pwnc fod wedi cyflwyno eu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gyllideb imi erbyn 7 Gorffennaf.

Elin Jones: Rhwng y gyllideb ddrafft, cyn y Nadolig, a'r gyllideb derfynol, yr oedd cwmp o £1.3 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Mynydd a Tir Gofal. Er hyn, mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wedi torri £12 miliwn o gyllideb Tir Mynydd, ac wedi dweud wrth Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad fod y £12 miliwn wedi ei golli gan eich bod wedi gorfod ffeindio arian ar gyfer ariannu myfyrwyr. A yw hyn yn gywir?

Elin Jones: Between the draft budget, before Christmas, and the final budget, the budget for Tir Mynydd and Tir Gofal fell by £1.3 million. Despite this, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside has cut £12 million from the Tir Mynydd budget, and has told the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee that the £12 million has been lost because you had to find money for student funding. Is this correct?

Sue Essex: I think that it is generally accepted that Tir Mynydd as it has been used in the past is perhaps not fit for purpose for the future. I know that the 2020 Group is looking specifically at that. We have moved

Sue Essex: Credaf y caiff ei derbyn yn gyffredinol nad yw Tir Mynydd fel y'i defnyddiwyd yn y gorffennol efallai'n addas at y diben ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gwn fod y Grŵp 2020 yn edrych yn benodol ar hynny.

towards more agri-environment schemes, which are more fit for purpose with regard to how we see the future of Wales. I think that that is the basis for changes to the Tir Mynydd budget.

Brynle Williams: Will you provide us with details of how much of the £5 million that has been set aside for evaluation funding in the next budget round for the environment, planning and countryside portfolio will be made available from reductions in Tir Mynydd payments during the same period? That is, is this £5 million being taken out of our budget responsible for Tir Mynydd going and going?

Sue Essex: I am not quite sure what you are asking, Brynle. I will look at the transcript, and write to you. If you are asking about the evaluation money within the budget, I will have to refer that to Carwyn, and get a response back to you.

Brynle Williams: I am asking about the £5 million that has come out of the environment, planning and countryside budget for evaluation—out of Tir Mynydd.

Sue Essex: That is the third attempt at the question, but I still do not understand. To give you an explanation, in the course of the budget planning round, what happens is that we set areas of spend based on requests from Ministers and subject committees—that is my job as Finance Minister—and it is then for the Ministers to distribute that within their portfolio budgets, with the exception of cross-cutting areas. In the case of cross-cutting areas, I take an active interest and ensure consistency across the portfolios.

The Presiding Officer: Question 2 OAQ0601(FIN) has been transferred for written answer.

Yr ydym wedi symud tuag at fwy o gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, sy'n fwy addas at y diben o ran y ffordd y gwelwn ddyfodol Cymru. Credaf mai dyna'r rheswm dros y newidiadau yng nghyllideb Tir Mynydd.

Brynle Williams: A rowch fanylion inni am faint o'r £5 miliwn hwnnw sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer cyllid gwerthuso yn nghylch nesaf y gyllideb ar gyfer y portffolio amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad a gaiff ei ryddhau oherwydd gostyngiadau mewn taliadau Tir Mynydd yn ystod yr un cyfnod? Hynny yw, a yw'r £5 miliwn hwn sy'n cael ei dynnu oddi ar ein cyllideb yn gyfrifol am fod Tir Mynydd yn mynd yn llai ac yn llai?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yr ydych yn ei ofyn, Brynle. Edrychaf ar y trawsgrifiad, ac ysgrifennu atoch. Os ydych yn holi am yr arian gwerthuso yn y gyllideb, bydd yn rhaid imi gyfeirio hynny at Carwyn, a rhoi ateb i chi.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn holi am y £5 miliwn a dynnwyd o'r gyllideb amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad ar gyfer gwerthuso—allan o Tir Mynydd.

Sue Essex: Dyna'r trydydd ymgais i ofyn y cwestiwn, ond nid wyf yn deall o hyd. I roi esboniad ichi, yn ystod cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb, yr hyn sy'n digwydd yw ein bod yn pennu meysydd gwariant ar sail ceisiadau gan Weinidogion a phwyllgorau pwnc—dyna fy ngwaith fel Gweinidog Cyllid—ac yna cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidogion yw dosbarthu hynny yng nghyllidebau eu portffolio, ac eithrio meysydd trawsbynciol. Yn achos meysydd trawsbynciol, mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb mawr a byddaf yn sicrhau cysondeb ar draws y portffolios.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 2 OAQ0601(FIN) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Cyllid Ychwanegol ar gyfer Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Additional Funding for Health and Social Services

Q3 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister make a statement on any additional funding that she is making available for the health and social

C3 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw gyllid ychwanegol y mae am ei ddarparu ar gyfer y portffolio iechyd a

services portfolio? OAQ585(FIN)

gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ585(FIN)

Q5 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget allocation to the health and social services portfolio in comparison with spending on health in England? OAQ0611(FIN)

C5 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o'i gymharu â gwariant ar iechyd yn Lloegr. OAQ0611(FIN)

Sue Essex: Next year's spending is part of this budget round, and the subject committees will have written to me on that. In terms of in-year spend, the additional sums, on top of what the budget set out, is money for the waiting times initiative.

Sue Essex: Mae gwariant y flwyddyn nesaf yn rhan o'r cylch hwn o'r gyllideb, a bydd y pwyllgorau pwnc wedi ysgrifennu ataf am hynny. O ran gwariant yn ystod y flwyddyn, mae'r symiau ychwanegol, ar ben yr hyn a osodwyd allan gan y gyllideb, yn arian ar gyfer y fenter amseroedd aros.

Nick Bourne: The Minister will be aware that there is a concern about funding of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust; Jeremy Colman and the committee are looking at that. Has the Minister taken account of some of the issues relating to that? Will money be available if the committee confirms Roger Thayne's view that extra funding is needed to bring the service up to the level that we need in order for it to be effective?

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod pryder ynghylch cyllido Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ambiwylans Cymru; mae Jeremy Colman a'r pwyllgor yn edrych ar hynny. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried rhai o'r materion yn ymwneud â hynny? A fydd arian ar gael os bydd y pwyllgor yn cadarnhau barn Roger Thayne fod angen cyllid ychwanegol er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn cyrraedd y safon y mae ei hangen arnom er mwyn iddo fod yn effeithiol?

Sue Essex: If we vote for an inquiry and if we want to give that inquiry the respect that it deserves, it is important that we cannot pre-empt any decisions that are made. It is an interesting question, and one that I have thought about. It will be in the hands of the Wales Audit Office, so we will have to see what timing it proposes for the completion of the report. We are going through the budget-planning process now. I will discuss that with my colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services, and bear it in mind, but I do not think that we should constrain that inquiry. That is the difficulty that we have.

Sue Essex: Os byddwn yn pleidleisio dros ymchwiliad ac os byddwn yn dymuno rhoi'r parch haeddiannol i'r ymchwiliad hwnnw, mae'n bwysig na allwn achub y blaen ar unrhyw benderfyniadau a wneir. Mae'n gwestiwn diddorol, ac yn un yr wyf wedi meddwl amdano. Bydd yn nwylo Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, felly bydd yn rhaid inni weld pa amserlen y bydd yn ei chynnig ar gyfer cwblhau'r adroddiad. Yr ydym yn mynd drwy'r broses o gynllunio'r gyllideb yn awr. Trafodaf hynny gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'i gadw mewn cof, ond ni chredaf y dylem lesteirio'r ymchwiliad hwnnw. Dyna'r anhawster sydd gennym.

Helen Mary Jones: We are expecting the next comprehensive spending review in England to provide a far less generous settlement, which will obviously impact on the budget allocation for health in England and will, in turn, impact on our budget. What assessment are you making of the likely impact? If we do have a less generous

Helen Mary Jones: Yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant nesaf yn Lloegr roi setliad llawer llai hael, a fydd yn amlwg yn effeithio ar y dyraniad cyllideb ar gyfer iechyd yn Lloegr ac a fydd, yn ei dro, yn effeithio ar ein cyllideb ni. Pa asesiad sydd yn mynd ymlaen o'r effaith debygol? Os bydd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant

comprehensive spending review, will you look again at whether the Barnett formula needs to be reviewed so that our higher health needs in Wales can be reflected in the allocation that we receive?

Sue Essex: There will be questions on Barnett later on, and you know the answer to that. At the moment, I do not think that there is any likelihood of Barnett being reviewed. It is important that we concentrate on working within the resources. You used the word 'generous'; I am glad that you acknowledge that we have had pretty generous settlements in the past. I cannot predict exactly what the level will be, but I have been honest in giving the impression that I do not think that future settlements will be as bountiful as they have been in previous years. However, I have no reason to think that there will not be growth budgets—and, in saying that, I mean real growth budgets. This Assembly has prioritised health spend; I cannot prejudge what the next Assembly will do, but I believe that it is pretty likely that health will be at the top, or thereabouts, as it is such an important component in revitalising and regenerating the quality of so many people's lives.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, one of the significant pressures now being faced by local health boards is the £5 million that it costs to fund Herceptin. If you look at the drugs element of the health and social services budget this year, you will see that £35 million was taken out and moved into another central budget expenditure line. Do you agree that we should ensure that as much money as possible is left in that budget, to allow for the new, innovative drugs that are coming on stream, year on year, which will require funding by NHS bodies in Wales?

Sue Essex: I agree—as I have already said—that we have a challenge as a society in responding to an increase in the knowledge, technology and products that are available. They offer a health benefit to the people whom we represent. As a society, we must grasp the fact that, as we learn more about gene technology, and as we want to use preventative medicine and interventions, we will need to look at how we fund health

yn llai hael, a fyddwch yn ystyried unwaith eto a oes angen adolygu fformiwla Barnett er mwyn i'n hanghenion iechyd yng Nghymru, sy'n fwy, gael eu hadlewyrchu yn y dyraniad a gawn?

Sue Essex: Bydd cwestiynau ar Barnett yn ddiweddarach, a gwyddoch yr ateb i hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, ni chredaf fod unrhyw debygolrwydd y caiff Barnett ei adolygu. Mae'n bwysig inni ganolbwyntio ar weithio o fewn yr adnoddau. Defnyddiwyd y gair 'hael' gennych; yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cydnabod inni gael setliadau eithaf hael yn y gorffennol. Ni allaf ragweld yn union beth fydd y lefel, ond bûm yn onest wrth roi'r argraff nad wyf yn credu y bydd setliadau yn y dyfodol mor hael ag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennyf reswm i feddwl na fydd cyllidebau cynyddol—ac, wrth ddweud hynny, golygaf gyllidebau cynyddol gwirioneddol. Mae'r Cynulliad hwn wedi rhoi blaenoriaeth i wariant ar iechyd; ni allaf achub y blaen ar yr hyn y bydd y Cynulliad nesaf yn ei wneud, ond credaf ei bod yn weddol debygol y bydd iechyd ar y brig, neu'n agos at y brig, gan ei fod yn elfen mor bwysig o ran hybu ac adfywio ansawdd bywyd cynifer o bobl.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, un o'r pwysau sylweddol sy'n wynebu byrddau iechyd lleol yn awr yw'r £5 miliwn y mae'n ei gostio i dalu am Herceptin. Os edrychwch ar elfen gyffuriau yn y gyllideb iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol eleni, fe welwch fod £35 miliwn wedi ei dynnu a'i symud i linell gwariant arall yn y gyllideb ganolog. A gytunwch y dylem sicrhau bod cymaint o arian â phosibl yn weddill yn y gyllideb honno, i ddarparu ar gyfer y cyffuriau newydd, arloesol sy'n cael eu cyflwyno, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ac y bydd angen i gyrff GIG yng Nghymru eu cyllido?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf—fel y dywedais eisoes—ein bod yn wynebu her fel cymdeithas i ymateb i ddatblygiadau yn y gwybodaeth, y dechnoleg a'r cynnyrch sydd ar gael. Maent yn cynnig budd iechyd i'r bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli. Fel cymdeithas, rhaid inni ddeall y ffaith, wrth inni ddod i wybod mwy am dechnoleg genynnau, ac wrth inni ddymuno defnyddio meddygaeth ataliol ac ymyriadau, y bydd angen inni

collectively. In terms of managing the drugs budget, that lies with the NHS. I know that the director of the NHS is having discussions on this issue—she certainly had discussions last week—with the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, and with others, I guess, across Wales.

2.10 p.m.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Although we do not always agree, Minister, I have always found you to be fair-minded in your responses to various issues. I am sure that you could not have failed to be persuaded by the strong arguments put forward by Roger Thayne in relation to the problems facing the ambulance service. He draws our attention to serious shortcomings. I think that we all accept that it is not all about money; he says that there has to be greater financial control and better use of resources. However, he makes it clear that the service needs capital funding. Putting aside this issue of waiting for the inquiry, it would be helpful if the Minister gave us an indication of whether, should she be persuaded that that money is necessary, she will consider it in a fair-minded way, bearing in mind that by the time the inquiry reports, the budget might well be settled.

Sue Essex: As I said to Nick, I will bear that in mind. I do not have a copy of the committee's response to the budget round, but I will pay great attention to that. We have to be cautious. I appreciate what was said, and I am sure that elements of capital improvements could be made. However, you also need to be mindful of what the Beecham report said, which covers the whole of the public service, and not just local government, as some people think. Sir Jeremy Beecham's attention was very much on the mechanics—he referred to the 'mechanics' that some of our public services operate—and the idea that, by paying attention to that, you can get far better use of resources. No one organisation is immune from that investigation. Perhaps the inquiry will throw up some of those points as well. We have to be careful that we do not automatically pre-judge the outcomes of that. We know that a

edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn cyllido iechyd ar y cyd. O ran rheoli'r gyllideb gyffuriau, cyfrifoldeb y GIG yw hynny. Gwn fod cyfarwyddwr y GIG yn cae trafodaethau ar y mater hwn—yn sicr, cafodd drafodaethau yr wythnos diwethaf—gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, a chydag eraill, mi dybiaf, ledled Cymru.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Er nad ydym bob amser yn cytuno, Weinidog, yn fy marn i yr ydych bob amser yn deg yn eich ymatebion i wahanol faterion. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi'ch darbwyllo gan y dadleuon cryf a gyflwynwyd gan Roger Thayne mewn perthynas â'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae'n tynnu ein sylw at ddiffygion difrifol. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn derbyn nad yw'n fater o arian yn unig; dywed fod yn rhaid sicrhau mwy o reolaeth ariannol a gwell defnydd o adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n pwysleisio bod angen cyllid cyfalaf ar y gwasanaeth. Gan roi o'r neilltu y mater o aros am yr ymchwiliad, byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai'r Gweinidog yn rhoi arwydd inni a fydd, pe bai'n cael ei darbwyllo bod yr arian hwnnw'n angenrheidiol, yn ei ystyried mewn ffordd deg, o gofio ei bod yn bosibl y bydd y gyllideb wedi ei setlo erbyn i'r ymchwiliad gyflwyno adroddiad.

Sue Essex: Fel y dywedais wrth Nick, byddaf yn cadw hynny mewn cof. Nid oes gennyf gopi o ymateb y pwyllgor i gylch y gyllideb, ond byddaf yn rhoi sylw mawr i hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Gwerthfawrogaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gellid sicrhau rhai gwelliannau cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi hefyd gofio'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn adroddiad Beecham, sy'n cwmpasu pob rhan o'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, nid llywodraeth leol yn unig, fel y cred rhai. Ar y mecanweithiau yr oedd sylw Syr Jeremy Beecham yn bennaf—cyfeiriodd at y 'mecanweithiau' a ddefnyddir gan rai o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus—a'r syniad y gallwch sicrhau gwell defnydd o lawer o adnoddau drwy roi sylw i hynny. Nid oes yr un sefydliad yn dianc rhag yr ymchwiliad hwnnw. Efallai y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn rhoi goleuni ar rai o'r pwyntiau hynny hefyd. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus i beidio ag achub y

strong imperative has been set for capital investment. I am aware of that, as is the Minister for Health and Social Services, but I am not sure whether it has been picked up by the committee. Let us not pre-judge that inquiry, because I do not think that that would be fair.

blaen ar y canlyniadau hynny. Gwyddom fod dadl gref wedi ei chyflwyno dros yr angen am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny, fel y mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r pwyllgor wedi nodi hynny. Gadewch inni beidio ag achub y blaen ar yr ymchwiliad hwnnw, oherwydd nid wyf yn credu y byddai hynny'n deg.

Y Grant Bloc The Block Grant

C4 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau'r dyfodol ar gyfer y fformiwla a ddefnyddir i benderfynu maint y grant bloc? OAQ0613(FIN)

Q4 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on future plans for the formula used to determine the size of the block grant? OAQ0613(FIN)

Sue Essex: There are no plans to carry out any immediate review of the Barnett formula. The Assembly Government is careful and realistic about the prospects of moving away from the Barnett mechanism, which has provided funding to Wales in a clear, understandable and stable way.

Sue Essex: Nid oes unrhyw gynlluniau i gynnal adolygiad ar unwaith o fformiwla Barnett. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwylllog ac yn realistig ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o newid mecanwaith Barnett, sydd wedi darparu cyllid i Gymru mewn ffordd glir, ddealladwy a sefydlog.

Alun Ffred Jones: Rhodri Morgan, in his submission to the Treasury select committee's inquiry into the Barnett formula, said that if it were a needs-based formula, there would be some strong arguments for redistributing more public funds to Wales. Plaid Cymru has always called for a formula based on need. Do you agree with us and with your own First Minister on this?

Alun Ffred Jones: Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan, yn ei gyflwyniad i ymchwiliad pwyllgor dethol y Trysorlys i fformiwla Barnett, pe bai'n fformiwla yn seiliedig ar angen y byddai rhai dadleuon cryf dros aiddosbarthu mwy o arian cyhoeddus i Gymru. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw am fformiwla ar sail angen erioed. A gytunwch â'ch Prif Weinidog eich hun a ninnau ar hyn?

Sue Essex: We can go around in circles on this. I understand what you are saying, and we have an attempt at a needs-based formula in local government, which is argued about incessantly in every arena that I go to. The difficulty lies in the fact that you have always made an assumption that, in terms of having a needs-based formula—or whatever shape that formula should take—we are not getting our fair share, to paraphrase what you are saying. I am still waiting to see the evidence that Ieuan Wyn Jones said that he had many moons ago. He said that he had a report that proved the case. No-one, as yet, has come up with an absolutely solid needs-based formula that demonstrates this. We could go on arguing about this. You will be aware that the discussion taking place now about Barnett—

Sue Essex: Gallwn droi mewn cylchoedd ar hyn. Deallaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, ac yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau fformiwla'n seiliedig ar angen mewn llywodraeth leol, a chlywaf ddadlau am hynny ym mhob man. Yr hyn sy'n anodd yw'r ffaith eich bod bob amser wedi tybio nad ydym, o ran cael fformiwla ar sail angen—neu ar ba ffurf bynnag y dylai'r fformiwla honno fod—nad ydym yn cael ein cyfran deg, i aralleirio'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Yr wyf yn aros i weld y dystiolaeth sydd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones ers oesoedd. Dywedodd fod ganddo adroddiad a oedd yn profi'r dadl. Nid oes neb, hyd yma, wedi cyflwyno fformiwla gwbl gadarn ar sail angen sy'n dangos hyn. Gallem ddadlau am hyn am byth. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y drafodaeth sy'n

and we do not live on an island—is about the proportion that the Scots get. That is where the discussions are at the moment, and they are probably hinting at that in terms of Northern Ireland. Therefore, we are in tricky waters here, so we have to be careful. I repeat what I said: if you have any information that you think backs up your assertion regarding a needs-based formula, I would be happy to look at it.

David Melding: Do you agree that the parties of government in our country—classically, the Labour Party and the Conservative Party—have to live in the real world? Do you also agree that, in terms of any rapid shift to a needs-based assessment, if Wales were to benefit from that—it is not clear that it would, but let us assume so—Scotland would see its resources diminish considerably? That is not going to happen. For the good of the United Kingdom, we must approach this in a responsible way and talk about what is realistic and practical in the short and medium terms. I do not think that the Members on the other side of the Chamber talk this issue up very much when they are discussing the matter with their Scottish colleagues.

Sue Essex: You have hit the nail on the head there. As I said, we do not live on an island, and the Barnett formula also applies to other places. There are real worries in Scotland that it will lose that advantage, and if you were in that situation, you could understand that. It is also fair to point out that, 10 years on—it is almost 10 years since the Assembly came into being—Wales is a wealthier place than it was, given the finance that we have had through and the state of the economy. That is shown in disposable income indicators, and simple crude indices such as the house price index. That is not to say that there is no real need or pockets of deprivation needing to be tackled, but Plaid Cymru keeps putting the view forward that this is a country of huge need and deprivation, and that we are still at the bottom of the pile, and that is unfair—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: That is what Labour

digwydd yn awr am Barnett—ac nid ydym yn byw ar ynys—yn ymwneud â'r gyfran a gaiff yr Albanwyr. Dyna'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni o ran y trafodaethau, ac mae'n debygol eu bod awgrymu hynny ar gyfer Gogledd Iwerddon. Felly, yr ydym mewn dyfroedd dyfnion yma, a rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais: os oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth a gredwch sy'n ategu eich honiad am fformiwla ar sail angen, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i edrych arni.

David Melding: A gytunwch fod yn rhaid i bleidiau llywodraethol yn ein gwlad—yn draddodiadol, y Blaid Lafur a'r Blaid Geidwadol—fyw yn y byd go iawn? A gytunwch hefyd, o ran unrhyw newid cyflym i asesiad ar sail angen, pe câi Cymru fudd o hynny—nid yw hynny'n amlwg, ond gadewch inni dybio y câi fudd o hynny—gallai'r Alban weld ei hadnoddau'n lleihau'n sylweddol? Nid yw hynny'n mynd i ddigwydd. Er lles y Deyrnas Unedig, rhaid inni weithredu mewn ffordd gyfrifol a siarad am yr hyn sy'n realistig ac yn ymarferol yn y tymor byr a'r tymor canolig. Ni chredaf fod yr Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr yn rhoi llawer o bwys ar y mater hwn pan fyddant yn trafod y mater gyda'u cyd-aelodau yn yr Alban.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych wedi taro'r hoelen ar ei phen. Fel y dywedais, nid ydym yn byw ar ynys, ac mae fformiwla Barnett yn gymwys hefyd i leoedd eraill. Mae pryderon gwirioneddol yn yr Alban y bydd yn colli'r fantais honno, a phe baech chi yn y sefyllfa honno, gallech ddeall hynny. Mae hefyd yn ddigon teg tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod Cymru, ar ôl 10 mlynedd—mae bron i 10 mlynedd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad—yn lle mwy cyfoethog nag o'r blaen, o gofio'r arian yr ydym wedi ei gael a chyflwr yr economi. Gwelir hynny yn y dangosyddion incwm gwario, a mynegeion bras syml megis y mynegai prisiau tai. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes angen gwirioneddol na phocedi o amddifadedd y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy, ond mae Plaid Cymru yn mynnu dweud ein bod yn wlad anghenus a difreintiedig, ac mai ni sydd yn y sefyllfa waethaf, ac mae hynny'n annheg—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dyna a wna Llafur.

does.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You arrived late and now you start shouting.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oeddech yn hwyr yn cyrraedd, ac yn awr yr ydych yn dechrau gweiddi.

David Melding: Withdraw from the Chamber.

David Melding: Gadewch y Siambr.

The Presiding Officer: Order. It has not gone that far yet.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw pethau wedi mor bell â hynny eto.

Sue Essex: If Rhodri Glyn had been on time, he would have had his question answered. This continual putting forward of a view of Wales as an undeveloped country is unfair; Wales has moved on now, and I think that Plaid Cymru needs to move on a bit, too.

Sue Essex: Pe bai Rhodri Glyn wedi bod yn brydlon, byddai ei gwestiwn wedi'i ateb. Mae dweud o hyd mai gwlad annatblygedig yw Cymru yn annheg; mae Cymru wedi symud ymlaen erbyn hyn, a chredaf ei bod yn bryd i Blaid Cymru symud ymlaen ychydig hefyd.

Jenny Randerson: I have looked at all the indicators of need in relation to Wales and the rest of the UK, and no matter which indicator you look at, Wales comes at, or virtually at, the bottom. Why has your Government been so frightened of moving towards a formula that is based on need?

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf wedi edrych ar bob un o'r dangosyddion angen ar gyfer Cymru a gweddill y DU, ac ni waeth ar ba ddangosydd yr edrychwch, mae Cymru ar y gwaelod, neu'n agos iawn i'r gwaelod. Pam y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi bod mor ofnus o symud tuag at fformiwla'n seiliedig ar angen?

Sue Essex: We are benefiting from Barnett. You are trying to say that there is parity between us and England, but there certainly is not; Barnett gives us a considerable advantage. To pick up David Melding's theme, the Liberal Democrats are in a partnership Government in Scotland, but I do not hear them saying the same things up there. We are part of the UK. As David Melding said, you have to live in the real world. Of course we all pick up indicators and say, 'This is the best picture', if we are going into a negotiation, but you are talking about moving away from a formula that has an inherent advantage to it that will exist for many years to come, and which has served us well, certainly during the lifetime of the Assembly.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn cael budd o Barnett. Yr ydych yn ceisio dweud bod cydraddoldeb rhyngom ni a Lloegr, ond yn sicr nid yw hynny'n wir; mae Barnett yn rhoi mantais sylweddol inni. I ddilyn thema David Melding, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhan o Lywodraeth bartneriaeth yn yr Alban, ond ni chlywaf hwy'n dweud yr un pethau yno. Yr ydym yn rhan o'r DU. Fel y dywedodd David Melding, rhaid ichi fyw yn y byd go iawn. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym i gyd yn edrych ar ddangosyddion ac yn dweud, 'Dyma'r darlun gorau', os ydym yn paratoi i gyd-drafod. Ond yr ydych chi'n siarad am roi'r gorau i fformiwla y mae iddi fantais hanfodol a fydd yn parhau am flynyddoedd i ddod, ac sydd wedi bod o fudd inni, yn sicr yn ystod oes y Cynulliad.

I will make one last point on this, as it is really important. What matters is the amount of public expenditure that goes into the system. We have benefited enormously from this big increase in public expenditure, and that is why we can do so many of the things that we can do, as an Assembly Government.

Gwnaf un pwynt olaf ynghylch hyn, gan ei fod yn bwysig iawn. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw faint o wariant cyhoeddus sy'n mynd i mewn i'r system. Yr ydym wedi cael budd enfawr o'r cynnydd mawr hwn mewn gwariant cyhoeddus, a dyna pam y gallwn wneud cynifer o'r pethau y gallwn eu gwneud, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Jenny Randerson: You will know that, although we may have benefited from a big increase in public expenditure, every sign is that that big increase will not continue. You also know very well that, within the partnership Government, we pressed the case for the reform of the Barnett formula. You also understand that, year on year, the Barnett formula is designed to reduce the benefit to Wales, and yet Wales is not catching up with the rest of the UK. How can you expect us to continue to make any kind of progress if your Government will not even engage in the discussion, let alone make a proper, well thought-through and well researched case for a new formula—Joel Barnett himself says the formula is well out of date?

Sue Essex: What Joel Barnett says is that he never expected it to survive so long. In a funny kind of way, it is a back-handed tribute to him that his formula, devised for a specific purpose, has not been changed because it has stood the test of time quite well. When you were in the partnership Government, you did say that, but I do not hear that message coming through loud and clear. I have heard noises off from Mike German about that, but it is certainly not a popular message in Scotland, as people there have benefited incredibly well from it. You have to understand that Barnett applies beyond Wales, and, if there is a move, there is a real risk that it could move the wrong way, and you have never acknowledged that—except David Melding, who very clearly at that. His view is a sensible and realistic one in the circumstances.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A Melding-Labour coalition. [*Laughter.*]

Sue Essex: I would be quite happy with a Melding-Labour coalition. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

The Presiding Officer: Order. I wish that Ministers would not answer questions that have not been properly asked.

Jenny Randerson: Er ein bod efallai wedi cael budd o gynnydd mawr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus, fe wyddoch mai'r argoel yw na fydd y cynnydd mawr hwnnw'n parhau. Fe wyddoch yn iawn hefyd ein bod, yn y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, wedi dadlau'n gryf dros ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett. Yr ydych hefyd yn deall bod fformiwla Barnett wedi ei chynllunio i leihau'r fantais i Gymru, o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, er nad yw Cymru wedi cyrraedd lefel gweddill y DU. Sut y gallwch ddisgwyl inni barhau i wneud unrhyw fath o gynnydd os nad yw eich Llywodraeth hyd yn oed yn cymryd rhan yn y drafodaeth, heb sôn am gyflwyno achos priodol dros gael fformiwla newydd wedi ei hystyried yn ofalus a'i harchwilio'n drwyadl—dywed Joel Barnett ei hun fod y fformiwla wedi mynd yn hen?

Sue Essex: Yr hyn y mae Joel Barnett yn ei ddweud yw na ddisgwylodd erioed i'r fformiwla bara cyhyd. Mewn ffordd ryfedd, mae'r ffaith nad yw ei fformiwla, a gynlluniwyd at ddiben penodol, wedi ei newid yn deyrnged anuniongyrchol iddo, oherwydd mae wedi gwrthsefyll amser. Pan oeddech yn y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, yr oeddech yn dweud hynny, ond nid wyf yn clywed y neges honno'n uchel ac yn eglur. Clywais ryw sŵn gan Mike German ynghylch hynny, ond yn sicr nid yw'n neges boblogaidd yn yr Alban, gan fod pobl yno wedi cael budd mawr ohoni. Rhaid ichi ddeall bod Barnett yn gymwys y tu hwnt i Gymru, a phe bai symudiad, mae risg wirioneddol mai symud i'r cyfeiriad anghywir a wnâi. Nid ydych erioed wedi cydnabod hynny—heblaw am David Melding, a ddywedodd hynny'n eglur. Mae ei farn yn un gall a realistig o dan yr amgylchiadau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Clymblaid Melding-Llafur. [*Chwerthin.*]

Sue Essex: Byddwn yn eithaf bodlon ar glymblaid Melding-Llafur. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na byddai Gweinidogion yn ateb cwestiynau na ofynnwyd yn briodol.

I have made it quite clear to Members that if they keep shouting and bawling and trying to get extra supplementary questions, they will not be called on the ones that they might otherwise be called for, were they present.

David Lloyd: Yr ydym oll yn cynrychioli gwahanol rannu o Gymru, ac, yn naturiol, mae Barnett yn edrych yn dda i'r Alban ond nid ydym yma i ddadlau'r achos dros yr Alban. Fe gofiwch, o'r cyfarfod yn Llandrindod ddydd Llun, fod bwlch ariannu enfawr o dros £4 biliwn yn y portffolio llywodraeth leol yn unig ar gyfer materion megis tai ac ysgolion yng Nghymru. Felly, a ydych yn dal i gredu nad oes achos i gael fformiwla ariannu teg yn seiliedig ar ein hanghenion yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: I daresay that there would be a huge funding gap if you looked at those figures in relation to England, Scotland or Northern Ireland. As you will have heard, the reality is that the WLGA was not expecting that big funding gap to be immediately filled. You have to be realistic. I will just repeat, as we could go on ad nauseam, that if you have information, as you said that you did at least 18 months ago, that proves beyond doubt that you have a formula that we can get agreed—which is important, as David Melding said—and which does the job, let us see it. I am happy to receive any information, but at present I continue to await that.

David Lloyd: Mae'r wybodaeth gennym a byddwn yn hapus i'w chyfleu ichi. Medrwn drefnu cyflwyniad tymor nesaf oherwydd mae gennym yr holl wybodaeth a'r *critique* ar Barnett. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod ambell fformiwla gennym eisoes sy'n seiliedig ar angen, megis fformiwla Townsend ac ambell fformiwla yn y maes llywodraeth leol. Fe welwch fod y lleoedd hynny sydd â'r angen mwyaf yn denu mwy o arian. Mater syml ydyw ehangu'r un feddylfryd i feddwl pe baem yn ariannu Cymru ar sail anghenion byddem yn denu mwy o arian. Felly, a ydych yn dal i wrthwynebu'r dewis hwn o ailedrych ar ariannu Cymru yn deg?

Yr wyf wedi gwneud yn hollol glir i'r Aelodau y bydd parhau i weiddi a bloeddio a cheisio gofyn cwestiynau atodol yn golygu na elwir arnynt i ofyn y cwestiynau y byddwn wedi galw arnynt i'w gofyn fel arall, pe byddent yn bresennol.

David Lloyd: We all represent different parts of Wales and, naturally, Barnett looks good for Scotland, but we are not here to argue the case for Scotland. You will recall, from the meeting at Llandrindod on Monday, that there is a huge funding gap of over £4 billion in the local government portfolio alone for matters such as housing and schools in Wales. Therefore, do you still believe there is no case for having a fair funding formula based on our needs in Wales?

Sue Essex: Mae'n siŵr y byddai bwlch ariannu enfawr pe baech yn edrych ar y ffigurau hynny yng nghyd-destun Lloegr, yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon. Fel y clywsoch, y gwir amdani yw nad oedd CLILC yn disgwyl i'r bwlch ariannu mawr hwnnw gael ei lenwi ar unwaith. Rhaid ichi fod yn realistig. Fe allem barhau hyd syrffed, felly ni ddywedaf ddim heblaw hyn: os oes gennych wybodaeth, fel yr oeddech yn dweud o leiaf 18 mis yn ôl, sy'n profi'n ddiameduaeth fod gennych fformiwla y gellir cytuno arni—ac mae hynny'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd David Melding—ac sy'n briodol i'r gorchwyl, gadewch inni ei gweld. Yr wyf yn fodlon cymryd unrhyw wybodaeth, ond ar hyn o bryd yr wyf yn dal i ddisgwyl amdani.

David Lloyd: We have the information and I would be happy to give it to you. We can organise a presentation next term because we have all the information and the critique of Barnett. You will be aware that we already have some formulae based on need, such as the Townsend formula and some of the local government formulae. We tend to find that those places of greatest need attract more funding. It would be a simple matter to expand that mindset to thinking that if we were to fund Wales on the basis of need, we would attract more funding. Therefore, do you still object to the option of looking again at funding Wales fairly?

Sue Essex: I do not think that I was promised a presentation; I was promised the information and I would still like to have the information. You are all talking as if we do not have an inherent advantage in Barnett, but we do. That advantage has existed over many years. I think that you are being unrealistic and perhaps slightly misleading in what you are saying.

Sue Essex: Ni chredaf mai addewid o gyflwyniad a gefais; cefais addewid y cawn wybodaeth, a hoffwn gael y wybodaeth o hyd. Yr ydych i gyd yn siarad fel pe na bai mantais hanfodol yn Barnett, ond mae hynny'n wir. Mae'r fantais honno wedi bodoli ers blynnyddoedd. Credaf eich bod yn afrealistig ac efallai ychydig yn gamarweiniol yn yr hyn a ddywedwch.

Cyllideb Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Education and Lifelong Learning Budget

Q6 Janet Ryder: Has the Minister received any representations to increase the overall budget allocation to the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0607(FIN)

C6 Janet Ryder: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau ynglŷn â chynyddu'r gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0607(FIN)

Sue Essex: As you will know, as part of the budget setting process, subject committees should have submitted their budget priorities to me by 7 July. I will have a letter from the committee, but I will also have a presentation from the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills.

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, fel rhan o'r broses o bennu cyllidebau, dylai pwyllgorau pwnc fod wedi cyflwyno'u blaenoriaethau cyllideb imi erbyn 7 Gorffennaf. Byddaf yn cael llythyr gan y pwyllgor, ond byddaf hefyd yn cael cyflwyniad gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

Janet Ryder: I am referring to the current financial year because, this year, the teachers have come to a pension agreement, which will mean an increase in employers' contributions of 0.6 per cent. If schools have to fund that 0.6 per cent increase for all of their teachers from their current budgets, it will cripple many of them. Have you received any application to have an increase in the budget as that payment kicks in from January 2007 to increase the allowances to schools and cover that 0.6 per cent employers' contribution?

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn cyfeirio at y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, oherwydd eleni mae'r athrawon wedi dod i gytundeb ar bensiynau, a fydd yn golygu cynnydd o 0.6 y cant yng nghyfraniadau'r cyflogwyr. Os bydd yn rhaid i ysgolion ariannu'r cynnydd hwnnw o 0.6 y cant ar gyfer pob un o'u hathrawon o'u cyllidebau presennol, bydd yn parlysu nifer ohonynt. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw gais am gynnydd yn y gyllideb, gan fod y taliad hwnnw'n dod i rym o fis Ionawr 2007 ymlaen, i gynyddu'r lwfansau i ysgolion a thalu'r 0.6 y cant hwnnw o gyfraniad y cyflogwyr?

Sue Essex: The way that the system of funding local education authorities for pay rises or pension pressures works is that this is done through the expenditure sub-group, which met on Monday. I have not received any information through it from the WLGA.

Sue Essex: Y ffordd y mae'r system o ariannu awdurdodau addysg lleol ar gyfer codiadau cyflog neu bwysau pensiynau yn gweithio yw y gwneir hyn drwy'r is-grŵp gwariant, a gyfarfu ddydd Llun. Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw wybodaeth drwyddo oddi wrth CLILC.

William Graham: Have you made any further progress with regard to the funding gap for higher education for next year's budget?

William Graham: A ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw gynnydd pellach gyda'r bwllch ariannu ar gyfer addysg uwch yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf?

Sue Essex: We provided the input in last

Sue Essex: Rhoesom y swm y llynedd, a

year, which was agreed across parties. Any further demands, shall we say, will be considered as part of this year's budget process.

Peter Black: The recent PricewaterhouseCoopers report identified that, if your Government is to achieve its manifesto aim of making all schools fit for purpose by 2010, you will need to find another £749 million—or at least the Government working with local government will need to find that amount of money. How do you intend to meet that challenge?

Sue Essex: I suggest that you, as education spokesperson for the Liberal Democrat Party, go back and look at our manifesto, because you keep saying this. That commitment was not in the manifesto; we made a commitment in terms of spending levels, and those spending levels will be met.

On meeting the fit-for-purpose aspiration, it is interesting that a considerable sum of money is going in every year—just under £200 million, we believe, for this year. Secondly—and we have had this debate here as well, so we are going over old ground, but nevertheless I will repeat it—crucial to achieving schools that are fit for purpose are local authorities' decisions on getting their schools reorganised, so that you know which schools are to be invested in, and which are not. If we are honest, the delay has been around making those decisions. I accept that those decisions are difficult for local authorities. They are not easy, but they must be a precondition to getting all schools fit for purpose.

chytunodd y pleidiau arno. Caiff unrhyw alwadau pellach, fel petai, eu hystyried fel rhan o broses y gyllideb eleni.

Peter Black: Dywedodd yr adroddiad gan PricewaterhouseCoopers yn ddiweddar y bydd angen ichi ddod o hyd i £749 miliwn arall er mwyn i'r Llywodraeth gyrraedd ei nod yn y maniffesto o wneud pob ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010—neu o leiaf y bydd angen i'r Llywodraeth ddod o hyd i'r swm hwnnw drwy weithio gyda llywodraeth leol. Sut y bwriadwch ateb yr her honno?

Sue Essex: Awgrymaf eich bod chi, fel llefarydd addysg Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn dychwelyd at ein maniffesto ac yn ailedrych arno, oherwydd mynnwch ddweud hyn o hyd. Nid oedd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw yn ein maniffesto; gwnaethom ymrwymiad ar lefelau gwario, a chyrrhaeddir y lefelau hynny.

O ran cyflawni'r dyhead i ysgolion fod addas at y diben, mae'n ddiddorol fod swm sylweddol o arian yn mynd at hynny bob blwyddyn—dim llawer llai na £200 miliwn, mi gredwn, ar gyfer eleni. Yn ail—ac yr ydym wedi cael y drafodaeth hon yma hefyd, felly yr ydym yn aildwymo'r un cawl, ond fe'i dywedaf eto er hynny—mae penderfyniadau awdurdodau lleol ar ad-drefnu eu hysgolion yn hanfodol i sicrhau ysgolion sy'n addas at y diben, er mwyn gwybod ym mha ysgolion y dylid buddsoddi, ac ym mha rai na ddylid buddsoddi. Os ydym yn onest, gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny sydd wedi achosi'r oedi. Derbyniaf fod y penderfyniadau hynny'n anodd i awdurdodau lleol. Nid ydynt yn hawdd, ond rhaid iddynt fod yn rhagamod ar gyfer sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas at y diben.

Cyllideb Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Budget

Q7 Janet Davies: Has the Minister received any representations to increase the overall budget allocation to the enterprise, innovation and networks portfolio? OAQ0608(FIN)

Sue Essex: I have received a letter from the Chair of the Enterprise, Innovation and

C7 Janet Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau ynglŷn â chynyddu'r gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrennir i'r portffolio menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau? OAQ0608(FIN)

Sue Essex: Yr wyf wedi cael llythyr gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a

Networks Committee on behalf of the committee, and I have received representations from, and have had meetings and discussions with, Andrew Davies.

Janet Davies: As you know, the west Wales and the Valleys area has qualified for European structural funds in the next round, which starts in this financial year. What consideration have you given to which other budget lines may have to be cut to provide the necessary match funding for the convergence fund?

Sue Essex: There is no issue of being—[*Inaudible.*]. Andrew Davies and I talk about the questions of match funding. In previous budgets, we have identified lines for that money. The agreement now is that private sector money will count as match funding. Therefore, the implication in your question that match funding would have to come out of other spending areas is premature.

Alun Cairns: We are told that regional selective assistance does not have any specific budget line, because, if the projects come forward, the money will be found from wherever. However, if you look at the pattern over recent years, the amount spent on RSA has consistently fallen. Is this because there is a budget squeeze elsewhere, so therefore we are not keen to develop the right sort of projects, or are you happy to see failure in attracting inward investment applications?

Sue Essex: It is the result of a thriving economy, in that, in the early years, RSA was important in attracting people to come to Wales. We now have a vibrant economy, and many people are choosing to come here, and RSA—that is, grant money—is only used as a last resort. When I was in north Wales a few weeks ago, it was interesting that we had an acknowledgement that we had a major investment in Gwynedd, for the first time, in an area with no grant pump-priming whatsoever. That is where we want to be—we want the economy to be strong enough so that people want to come and invest in Wales, without our having to use public

Rhwydweithiau ar ran y pwyllgor, ac yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau gan Andrew Davies, a chyfarfodydd a thrafodaethau gydag ef.

Janet Davies: Fel y gwyddoch, mae ardal y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn gymwys ar gyfer cylch nesaf y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, sy'n dechrau yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Pa ystyriaeth a roesoch i ba linellau eraill yn y gyllideb y bydd yn rhaid eu torri efallai er mwyn darparu'r arian cyfatebol angenrheidiol ar gyfer y gronfa gydyfeirio?

Sue Essex: Nid yw'n fater o fod yn—[*Anhyglyw.*]. Yr wyf fi ac Andrew Davies yn siarad am arian cyfatebol. Mewn cyllidebau blaenorol, yr ydym wedi nodi llinellau ar gyfer yr arian hwnnw. Y cytundeb bellach yw y bydd arian y sector preifat yn cyfrif fel arian cyfatebol. Felly, mae'r awgrym yn eich cwestiwn y byddai'n rhaid i arian cyfatebol ddod o feysydd gwario eraill yn gynamserol.

Alun Cairns: Dywedir wrthym nad oes gan gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol unrhyw linell benodol yn y gyllideb, oherwydd os cyflwynir y prosiectau, daw'r arian o rywle neu'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar y patrwm yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r swm a wariwyd ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi lleihau'n gyson. Ai'r rheswm am hyn yw fod gwasgfa ar y gyllideb rywle arall, ac nad ydym felly'n awyddus i ddatblygu'r math cywir o brosiectau. Neu a ydych yn fodlon gweld methiant wrth ddenu ceisiadau mewnfuddsoddi?

Sue Essex: Canlyniad economi ffyniannus ydyw, oherwydd bod cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi bod yn bwysig yn y blynyddoedd cynnar i ddenu pobl i Gymru. Bellach mae gennym economi sy'n ffynnu, ac mae nifer o bobl yn dewis dod yma, a dim ond pan fetho popeth arall y defnyddir cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol—hynny yw, arian grant. Pan oeddwn yn y gogledd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, yr oedd yn ddiddorol inni gael cydnabyddiaeth bod gennym fuddsoddiad mawr yng Ngwynedd, am y tro cyntaf, mewn ardal heb grant ysgogi o gwbl. Felly yr ydym am fod—yr ydym am gael economi ddigon cryf fel y bydd pobl am

money to attract them.

ddod i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru, heb inni orfod defnyddio arian cyhoeddus i'w denu.

Defnydd Effeithiol o Fentrau Cyllid Preifat **The Effective use of Private Finance Initiative**

Q8 William Graham: Will the Minister outline how the Assembly promotes the effective use of private finance initiative in Wales? OAQ0592(FIN)

C8 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut mae'r Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo defnyddio mentrau cyllid preifat yn effeithiol yng Nghymru? OAQ0592(FIN)

Sue Essex: We are using the private finance initiative to take forward projects in various policy areas, including 11 local government PFI projects. There are also three hospitals and several minor schemes undertaken by NHS trusts. In addition, there is the Bute avenue Callaghan square project, and the scheme in relation to a section of the A55.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat i weithredu prosiectau mewn amrywiol feysydd polisi, gan gynnwys 11 o brosiectau menter cyllid preifat llywodraeth leol. Mae yna dri ysbyty hefyd a nifer o gynlluniau bach gan ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG. At hynny, mae cynllun rhodfa Bute sgwâr Callaghan a'r cynllun sy'n ymwneud â rhan o'r A55.

William Graham: You will probably agree that having well-lit city centres is a great aid, not only to the people who live there, but to the city centre in general. There have been 13 PFI street-lighting schemes in England. We do not seem to have one in Wales. Will you comment on that?

William Graham: Mae'n debyg y cytunwch fod cael digon o olau yng nghanol y ddinas yn gymorth mawr, nid yn unig i'r bobl sy'n byw yno, ond i ganol y ddinas yn gyffredinol. Yn Lloegr, cafwyd 13 o gynlluniau menter cyllid preifat ar gyfer goleuadau stryd. Ymddengys nad oes gennym un yng Nghymru. A allwch roi sylwadau ar hynny?

2.30 p.m.

Sue Essex: I was not aware that there were 13 in England, but Andrew and I have discussions with the private sector on the best ways of trying to get public and private money working together, which is the basis of your question. We are pursuing various models and I would certainly be interested, if you have information on those projects, to receive it.

Sue Essex: Nid oeddwn yn gwybod bod 13 yn Lloegr, ond mae Andrew a minnau'n cael trafodaethau gyda'r sector preifat am y ffyrdd gorau i geisio sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus ac arian preifat yn cydweithio, sef sail eich cwestiwn. Yr ydym yn mynd ar drywydd amryw fodolau, a byddai ddiddordeb mawr gennyf gael gwybod am y prosiectau hynny, os yw'r wybodaeth gennyh.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Michael German): The problem with PFI is that it is often seen as an easy opportunity to get money at the very beginning of a project, but by the time you get to the end of it, and you have had to weigh in the balance—all the services that have been provided by the contractor and everything else—the end value price may be more than if you had borrowed money at the beginning and paid for it directly. What evaluation have you made of existing PFI schemes against the cost of borrowing that

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Y broblem gyda PFI yw y caiff ei ystyried yn aml yn gyfle hawdd i gael arian ar ddechrau prosiect, ond erbyn i'r prosiect ddod i ben, a chithau wedi ei bwysu a'i fesur—yr holl wasanaethau a ddarparwyd gan y contractwr a phopeth arall—gall y pris terfynol fod yn fwy na phe baech wedi benthyca arian ar y cychwyn a thalu amdano'n uniongyrchol. Pa werthusiad yr ydych wedi ei wneud o'r cynlluniau PFI presennol yn erbyn y gost o fenthyca'r arian hwnnw? A ddaethoch i

money? Have you come to any conclusions in terms of one being cheaper than the other?

Sue Essex: A full business case has to go with these projects and the projections are made in the way that you said. It is a very strong technical appraisal. It is probably too early in many of those PFI schemes to be able to do that. However, if my memory serves me right, there are one or two—it is quite a complicated process, on which I would be happy to write to you—where we have already seen the fruits of having that cheaper borrowing. However, what I am trying to get to, as Finance Minister, is a palette of options on capital expenditure—different models and different ways of working so that we do not just get hooked into one method. PFI has been the flavour, as it were, for the last couple of years. In talking to the private sector, there are different ways of having private and public partnerships which have some attractive outcomes to them. One of the difficulties of PFI is that they are often reassigned, so you do not have that continuity with the original contractor.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 10, OAQ0579 (FIN), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

unrhyw gasgliadau o ran bod y naill yn rhatach na'r llall?

Sue Essex: Rhaid cael achos busnes llawn gyda'r prosiectau hyn, a gwneir yr amcanestyniadau fel yr oeddech yn dweud. Mae'r arfarniad yn un technegol cryf. Mae'n siŵr ei bod yn rhy gynnar yn achos nifer o'r cynlluniau PFI hynny i allu gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, os cofiaf yn iawn, mae un neu ddau o gynlluniau lle yr ydym wedi gweld manteision benthyca'n rhatach—mae'n broses eithaf cymhleth, a byddwn yn fodlon ysgrifennu atoch amdani. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, yw rhoi amrywiaeth o ddewisiadau gwariant cyfalaf—gwahanol fodolau a gwahanol ffyrdd o weithio fel nad yw'n rhaid inni gadw at un dull yn unig. PFI fu'r ffeffryn dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, fel petai. Wrth drafod gyda'r sector preifat, mae yna wahanol ffyrdd i gael partneriaethau preifat a chyhoeddus, ac mae rhai'n rhoi canlyniadau deniadol. Un o anawsterau PFI yw y bod yn aml yn cael eu hailneilltuo, sy'n golygu na chewch y dilyniant gyda'r contractwr gwreiddiol.

The Presiding Officer: Question 10, OAQ0579 (FIN), has been transferred for written answer.

Y Fformiwla Gyllido The Funding Formula

C11 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw drafodaethau diweddar a gafodd gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y fformiwla gyllido ar gyfer Cymru? OAQ0603(FIN)

Sue Essex: I have had no recent discussions regarding reform of the Barnett formula.

David Lloyd: Yn dilyn cwestiynau cynharach, un effaith arall o wasgfa Barnett yw bod mwy o wariant y pen ar addysg ac iechyd yn Llundain nag sydd yng Nghymru. A ydych yn credu bod hynny'n deg?

Sue Essex: If you know London, you will know that it has huge areas of deprivation and huge areas of need. The notion that, just because it is London, it does not have health

Q11 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on any recent discussions she has had with UK Government Ministers regarding the funding formula for Wales? OAQ0603(FIN)

Sue Essex: Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau'n ddiweddar am ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett.

David Lloyd: Following on from earlier questions, one other effect of the Barnett squeeze is that there is more spending per head on education and health in London than in Wales. Do you believe that is fair?

Sue Essex: Os ydych yn gyfarwydd â Llundain, fe wyddoch fod yno ardaloedd mawr o amddifadedd ac ardaloedd mawr anghenus. Mae'r syniad nad oes yno, am mai

and education expenditure needs is quite a limited argument.

Laura Anne Jones: Do you agree that the Barnett formula preserves the integrity and independence of the Assembly to set its own budget and that a needs-based formula would lead to budget cuts and difficult public spending rounds at Westminster level?

Sue Essex: You are right that it comes across as a block and we then have complete discretion on how to spend it. We have been able to make use of that discretion pretty well over the last eight or nine years.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cyfeiriodd Dai Lloyd at y wasgfa sydd ar y gyllideb. A ydych yn derbyn bod meysydd arbennig o fewn y gyllideb sy'n haeddu eu hariannu pe bai gennym fwy o arian a phe baem yn cael ein hariannu yn ôl yr angen, yn hytrach na drwy fformiwla Barnett? Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Diabetes UK wedi cynnal cyfarfod amser cinio yn tynnu sylw at yr angen i fuddsoddi. A wnewch gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Trysorlys er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael ein cyllido yn ôl ein hanghenion, fel bod y meysydd hynny'n cael sylw dyledus?

Sue Essex: First, on the squeeze, you are talking about convergence, which we all acknowledge. It is interesting when you look at the facts that, due to the improved economy in Wales, we are taking less out of the system and we need to spend less in terms of Department for Health and Social Services and other benefit support. You have to bear that in mind when you are talking about convergence.

Secondly, you talked about whether there are areas where I would consider spending more. There are areas right across the piece where you would want to spend more. There is not a single area where there are not good schemes coming forward and good ideas for spending. As politicians, we must make decisions on priorities that ensure, to pick up Ieuan Wyn Jones's point, that this is fair. Our process engages with committees and with outside communities. People can put their points

Llundain ydyw, anghenion gwariant ar iechyd ac addysg yn ddadl ddigon cyfyngedig.

Laura Anne Jones: A gytunwch fod fformiwla Barnett yn diogelu gonestrwydd ac annibyniaeth y Cynulliad i bennu ei gyllideb ei hun, ac y byddai fformiwla ar sail anghenion yn arwain at doriadau yn y gyllideb a chylchoedd gwario cyhoeddus anodd ar lefel San Steffan?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud ei bod yn dod mewn un rhan a bod gennym ryddid llwyr sut i'w wario wedyn. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud defnydd o'r rhyddid hwnnw'n lled dda yn ystod yr wyth neu naw mlynedd diwethaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dai Lloyd referred to the squeeze on the budget. Do you accept that there are particular areas within the budget that would deserve funding if we had more money, and if we were funded according to need rather than via the Barnett formula? You will be aware that Diabetes UK held a meeting at lunchtime to highlight the need to invest. Will you have discussions with the Treasury to ensure we are funded according to our needs, so that those areas receive proper attention?

Sue Essex: Yn gyntaf, o ran y wasgfa, yr ydych yn sôn am gydyfeirio, ac yn ydym i gyd yn ei gydnabod. Mae'n ddiddorol wrth edrych ar y ffeithiau ein bod ni, oherwydd yr economi well yng Nghymru, yn cymryd llai allan o'r system, ac mae angen inni wario llai ar gyfer yr Adran Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a chymorth budd-daliadau eraill. Rhaid ichi gofio hynny pan fyddwch yn siarad am gydyfeirio.

Yn ail, yr oeddech yn sôn a oes meysydd lle byddwn yn ystyried gwario mwy. Mae yna feysydd cyffredinol lle byddem am wario mwy. Nid oes yr un maes lle nad oes cynlluniau da'n cael eu cyflwyno a syniadau da ar gyfer gwario. Fel gwleidyddion, rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau ar flaenoriaethau sy'n sicrhau, i gyfeirio at bwynt Ieuan Wyn Jones, fod hyn yn deg. Mae ein proses yn ymgysylltu â phwyllgorau ac â chymunedau allanol. Gall pobl fynegi eu safbwyntiau. Yr

through. I take your point on diabetes and other areas of need; yesterday, Dai and I met carers of people with muscular dystrophy, and a week or two ago, I met people involved with Alzheimer's disease and dementia. There are huge areas of need around the health portfolio and we must recognise that, but, hopefully, during our deliberations, as a Government, and as an Assembly, we come up with a fair distribution of our resources.

wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt ynglŷn â diabetes a meysydd eraill lle mae angen. Ddoe, cafodd Dai a minnau gyfarfod â gofalwyr pobl sydd â nychdod cyhyrol, ac wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl cyfarfûm â phobl sy'n dod i gysylltiad â chlefyd Alzheimer a demensia. Mae nifer o feysydd lle mae angen yn y portffolio iechyd, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Ond yn ystod ein trafodaethau, fel Llywodraeth, ac fel Cynulliad, gobeithio y gallwn ddosbarthu ein hadnoddau'n deg.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Ffiniau Ffermydd Farm Boundaries

Q1 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the maintenance of farm boundaries in Wales? OAQ0810(EPC)

C1 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynnal a chadw ffiniau ffermydd yng Nghymru? OAQ0810(EPC)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Farmers in Wales are required to maintain their farm boundaries in accordance with the good agricultural and environmental conditions set out by statute.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae'n ofynnol i ffermwyr Cymru gynnal a chadw ffiniau eu ffermydd yn unol â'r amodau amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da sydd wedi eu gosod allan drwy statud.

Laura Anne Jones: I was disappointed to see that Labour candidates in the last Blaenau Gwent elections implied that irresponsible farmers are not adequately maintaining their farm boundaries, and should be fined on the spot. It is clear, from talking to the community, that vandalism and anti-social behaviour are the real causes of this problem, yet there was no mention of that in the leaflets. The local council clearly exacerbates the problem by failing to take action to maintain boundaries and cattle grids. How are you working with councils to ensure that they maintain their fences and cattle grids? Do you recognise that vandalism is the main cause of this problem? How are you working with Edwina Hart to try to solve this matter? You could fine every farmer in the area, but unless you tackle the vandals who tear down hundreds of metres of farm fencing, you will never stop the problem.

Laura Anne Jones: Yr oeddwn yn siomedig i weld bod ymgeiswyr Llafur yn etholiadau diwethaf Blaenau Gwent yn awgrymu bod ffermwyr anghyfrifol yn methu cynnal a chadw ffiniau eu ffermydd yn ddigonol, ac y dylent gael dirwy yn y fan a'r lle. O drafod y mater gyda'r gymuned, mae'n amlwg mai fandaliaeth ac ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol yw gwir achosion y broblem hon, ond eto ni soniwyd am hynny yn y taflenni. Mae'n amlwg fod y cyngor lleol yn gwaethygu'r sefyllfa drwy fethu gweithredu i gynnal a chadw ffiniau a gridiau gwartheg. Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gyda chynghorau i sicrhau eu bod yn cynnal a chadw eu ffensys a'u gridiau gwartheg? A ydych yn cydnabod mai fandaliaeth yw prif achos y broblem hon? Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gydag Edwina Hart i geisio datrys y mater hwn? Gallech roi dirwy i bob ffermwr yn yr ardal, ond oni fyddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r fandaliaid sy'n dinistrio cannoedd o fetrau o ffensys ffermydd, ni fyddwch byth yn atal y broblem.

Carwyn Jones: Vandalism is a problem for farmers, particularly those who farm close to some communities, but it is also the case that it is a farmer's responsibility to ensure that fences are stock-proof.

Carwyn Jones: Mae fandaliaeth yn broblem i ffermwyr, yn enwedig y rheini sy'n ffermio'n agos at rai cymunedau, ond cyfrifoldeb y ffermwr hefyd yw sicrhau bod ei ffensys yn gallu cadw stoc.

Chwilio am Olew a Nwy Oil and Gas Exploration

C2 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ganllawiau cynllunio ar gyfer prosiectau i chwilio am olew a nwy yng Nghymru? OAQ0843(EPC)

Q2 Elin Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on planning guidance for oil and gas exploration in Wales? OAQ0843(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r cyngor ar gael yn ein dogfen bolisi, 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru', sydd yn dangos beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa fframwaith ynglŷn â'r modd y dylai olew a nwy gael eu hennill ar y tir yn hytrach nag yn y môr.

Carwyn Jones: The guidance is available in 'Minerals Planning Policy Wales', which sets out the framework situation for the way in which oil and gas should be extracted onshore rather than offshore.

Elin Jones: Cyfeiriaf fy nghwestiwn atodol at y posibilrwydd o drwyddedau ar y môr ym mae Ceredigion. O'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ofyn i chi ac i Andrew Davies hyd yn hyn yn y maes hwn, mae un peth yn dal yn aneglur. A fyddwch chi, fel Llywodraeth, yn ymateb i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar sail amgylcheddol yn unig, ynteu a fyddwch yn ymateb ar sail economaidd ac ar sail ynni hefyd?

Elin Jones: I will address my supplementary question to the possibility of offshore licenses in Cardigan bay. From what I have already asked you and Andrew Davies on this matter, one thing remains unclear. Will you, as a Government, respond to the Department of Trade and Industry on an environmental basis alone, or will you also respond on an economic and energy basis?

Carwyn Jones: O'm safbwynt i, yn amgylcheddol, ond nid yw'r system gynllunio yn berthnasol i'r môr—mae'n ymwneud â'r tir ac ychydig o'r môr, at y marc distyll. Felly, nid yw'r system gynllunio yn berthnasol i drwyddedau. Mae'n fater i'r DTI.

Carwyn Jones: From my point of view, it will be environmental, but the planning regime is not relevant to the sea—it only deals with land and a small part of the sea, to the low-water mark. Therefore, the planning regime is not relevant to licences. It is a matter for the DTI.

Elin Jones: Gan ei fod yn fater i'r DTI, ond bod gan eich Llywodraeth yr hawl i roi barn fel ymgynghorydd i'r broses, a fydddech yn disgwyl i'r DTI wrando ar eich barn am drwyddedau posibl ym mae Ceredigion? Os ydych yn gwrthwynebu rhoi'r trwyddedau hynny, a fydddech yn disgwyl i'r DTI wrando arnoch, ynteu a fydddech yn disgwyl iddi eich anwybyddu'n llwyr, fel y gwnaeth ar ynni niwclear?

Elin Jones: As this is a matter for the DTI, but your Government has the right to give its opinion as a consultant in the process, would you expect the DTI to listen to your opinion on possible licences in Cardigan bay? If you oppose the granting of those licenses, would you expect the DTI to listen to your opinion, or would you expect it to ignore you completely, as it did on nuclear energy?

Carwyn Jones: Credaf y bydd y DTI yn gwrandu'n fanwl ar farn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nid oes barn wedi'i mynegi hyd yn hyn; dyna fy nealltwriaeth i.

Carwyn Jones: I believe the DTI will listen carefully to the opinion of the Assembly Government. No opinion has been expressed as yet, as I understand it.

Lisa Francis: Following on from what Elin Jones said, west Wales has a superb environmental resource in both of its areas of heritage coast and the two special areas of conservation. There is concern that, if oil and gas exploration resumes, any drilling or seismic activity could upset the resident bottle-nosed dolphin population. Do you envisage yourself having any discussions with the DTI about the SACs and this future exploration of oil and gas?

Lisa Francis: Yn dilyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Elin Jones, mae gan y gorllewin adnodd amgylcheddol gwych yn ei arfordir treftadaeth a'r ddwy ardal gadwraeth arbennig. Os bydd y gwaith o chwilio am olew a nwy yn ailddechrau, mae pryder y gallai unrhyw ddrilio neu weithgarwch seismig darfu ar y dolffiniaid trwynbwl lleol. A ydych yn rhagweld y byddwch yn cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant am yr Ardaloedd Cadwraeth Arbennig a'r gwaith hwn o chwilio am olew a nwy yn y dyfodol?

2.40 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: The DTI will have to carry out strategic environmental assessments anyway, under the relevant European directives, as well as appropriate assessments under the habitats and birds directives. That will have to be done, in any event, before a licence can be issued.

Carwyn Jones: Bydd yn rhaid i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wneud asesiadau amgylcheddol strategol beth bynnag, o dan y cyfarwydddebau Ewropeaidd perthnasol, yn ogystal â gwneud asesiadau priodol o dan y cyfarwydddebau cynefinoedd ac adar. Bydd yn rhaid gwneud hynny, beth bynnag, cyn y gellir rhoi trwydded.

Y Diwydiant Prosesu Bwyd The Food-processing Industry

C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y diwydiant prosesu bwyd yng Nghymru? OAQ0813(EPC)

Q3 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the food-processing industry in Wales? OAQ0813(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r sector ei hun yn datblygu. Bu rhai colledion ac yr ydym hefyd wedi ennill tir mewn sawl man. Gwelwyd cynnydd o 1.7 y cant yn y sector y llynedd. I roi hynny yn ei gyd-destun, mae'n rhaid cofio fod y sector ym Mhrydain Fawr wedi mynd am yn ôl, felly bu cynnydd sylweddol yng Nghymru.

Carwyn Jones: The sector itself is growing. There have been some losses and we have also gained ground in many areas. The sector grew by 1.7 per cent last year. To put that into context, one must remember that the sector in Great Britain as a whole has declined, so there has been significant growth in Wales.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, nid cynnydd a fu yn Ynys Môn, ond colledion sylweddol. Yr ydych yn gwybod am y colledion yn Cig Môn ac yn y Grampian Country Food Group, yn y ffatri prosesu ieir. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cytuno i gyfarfod â dirprwyaeth o Grampian a gobeithiwn y bydd modd cynorthwyo'r cwmni. Dylech gofio i'r cwmni grybwyll y mater o gymorth gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i gwmnïau yn y maes prosesu bwyd, ac ieir yn arbennig, oherwydd ffliw adar. Mae'r rhan

Ieuan Wyn Jones: As you know, Minister, Anglesey has seen not growth, but substantial losses. You are aware of the losses in Cig Môn and in the Grampian Country Food Group, at the chicken processing plant. I am pleased you have agreed to meet a delegation from Grampian, and we hope you will find a way to help the company. You probably remember that the company raised the matter of support from the European Union for food processing companies, especially those that deal with chickens, in the light of avian flu.

fwyaf o wledydd Ewrop wedi gwneud cais am gymorth i'r diwydiant; yr unig wladwriaeth sydd heb wneud cais yw Prydain. A fydech yn fodlon trafod y mater â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn yr Adran Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a gofyn iddynt ailedrych ar y sefyllfa hon? Os yw gwledydd eraill yn derbyn cymorth, mae hynny'n creu marchnad sy'n annheg i gwmnïau fel Grampian.

Carwyn Jones: Cofiaf y cwestiwn. Yr ydym yn edrych ar hyn o bryd i weld pa fath o gymorth a roddwyd. Nid yw hynny'n glir ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithiaf y cawn yr ateb cyn hir ac y gallwn wneud cymaint ag y bod modd i hybu'r diwydiant yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: With Welsh food processors producing food of the highest quality—we would expect nothing less—it is unfortunate that they are being put under a great deal of financial pressure because of imports from outside Europe, which are being produced to inferior standards, and I make no apologies for using those words. Minister, what are you doing to safeguard consumers from produce from South America, in particular, which is not produced to the same standards in terms of welfare and biosecurity and is found, more alarmingly, to contain banned steroids and the likes of angel dust and so on? This sort of thing is being brought into the country.

Carwyn Jones: Did you say angel dust? That is a matter for the Food Standards Agency; it is its role to ensure that food is safe to eat and it is not appropriate for me, as an agriculture Minister, to comment on any view that the Food Standards Agency might take.

Most European countries have asked for support for the industry; the only state not to have done so is Britain. Would you agree to discuss this matter with your ministerial colleagues in the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and ask them to look again at this situation? If other countries are receiving support, that creates unfair market conditions for Grampian.

Carwyn Jones: I remember the question. We are looking at the moment to see what sort of support was given. That is not clear at the moment. We hope to have the answer soon, and then I hope to do as much as possible to boost the industry in Wales.

Brynle Williams: Gan fod proseswyr bwyd Cymru yn cynhyrchu bwyd o'r safon uchaf—ni fyddem yn disgwyl dim llai—mae'n anffodus eu bod yn cael eu rhoi o dan bwysau ariannol mawr oherwydd mewnfario cynnyrch o'r tu allan i Ewrop sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu ar safon israddol, ac nid wyf am ymddiheuro am ddefnyddio'r geiriau hynny. Weinidog, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ddiogelu defnyddwyr rhag cynnyrch o Dde America, yn benodol, nad yw'n cael ei gynhyrchu ar yr un safon, o ran lles a bioddiogelwch. Yn waeth na hynny, mae'n cynnwys steroidau gwaharddedig a phethau fel phencyclidine, ac ati? Mae'r math hwn o beth yn cael ei gludo i mewn i'r wlad.

Carwyn Jones: Ai phencyclidine ddwedasoch chi? Mae hynny'n fater i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd; ei rôl yw sicrhau bod bwyd yn ddiogel i'w fwyta, ac nid yw'n briodol i mi, fel Gweinidog amaeth, roi sylwadau am unrhyw farn y gallai'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd ei harddel.

Y Mesur Morol The Marine Bill

C4 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith y Mesur Morol ar reolaeth y môr oddi ar lannau Cymru? OAQ0837(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r ymgynghoriad ar y Mesur hwn yn parhau ar hyn o bryd. Y nod yw sicrhau y bydd gennym Fesur a fydd yn edrych ar y system gynllunio ar y glannau yn

Q4 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement regarding the effect of the Marine Bill on sea management around the Welsh coastline? OAQ0837(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The consultation on the Bill is continuing. The aim is to ensure that we have a Bill which will look at the planning system for coastal areas in its entirety.

ei gyfanrwydd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn Lloegr, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud y bydd yn sefydlu corff rheoli morol i ymateb i anghenion y Mesur. Os ydwyf yn deall yn iawn, yr ydych wedi dweud na fydd hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru. O wrthod y trefniant hwnnw, pa drefniadau amgen yr ydych yn bwriadu eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod anghenion y Mesur yn cael eu gweithredu?

Carwyn Jones: Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn agored i syniadau o ran y ffordd ymlaen. Nid wyf o blaid asiantaeth—yr wyf wedi dweud hynny sawl gwaith—felly'r dewis yw cael rhyw fath o system genedlaethol neu system fwy lleol. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn edrych ar ba fath o system fyddai'n cynnig y ffordd orau ymlaen.

Glyn Davies: I share Alun Ffred Jones's concern on this issue. It seems to be a little early to take a definitive decision on the best way forward. What is worrying me more, at the moment, is that the Marine Bill may be slipping back in the programme of Bills. What pressure can you bring to bear so that the proposal for the Marine Bill continues to come forward in its current place in the Bill programme next year?

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware of it slipping back. Certainly, the work is continuing on producing the Bill and, as far as Wales is concerned, in terms of filling in the legislative gaps that will rightly exist because of framework legislation. That work continues, and we anticipate that the Bill will become law in good time and that we will be able to implement a great deal of framework legislation as a result of it.

Alun Ffred Jones: In England, the Government has said that it will establish a marine management body to respond to the requirements of the Bill. If I understand this correctly, you said that that will not happen in Wales. In refusing that arrangement, what alternative arrangements do you intend to put in place in Wales to ensure that the requirements of the Bill are implemented?

Carwyn Jones: At the moment, I am open to ideas about the way forward. I am not in favour of an agency—I have said that many times—so, the choice is to have some sort of national system or a more local system. At the moment, we are looking at which sort of system would provide the best way forward.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf fi, fel Alun Ffred Jones, yn pryderu am y mater hwn. Ymddengys braidd yn gynnar i wneud penderfyniad terfynol am y ffordd orau ymlaen. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhryderu'n fwy ar hyn o bryd yw bod y Mesur Morol yn llithro'n ôl yn rhaglen y Mesurau. Pa bwysau y gallwch eu rhoi fel y bydd y Mesur Morol yn parhau i gael ei gyflwyno yn ei safle presennol yn y rhaglen Fesurau flwyddyn nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol ei fod yn llithro'n ôl. Yn sicr, mae'r gwaith o gynhyrchu'r Mesur, ac o ran Cymru y gwaith o lenwi'r bylchau deddfwriaethol a fydd yn digwydd yn ddigon cywir oherwydd y ddeddfwriaeth fframwaith, yn parhau. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau, ac yr ydym yn rhagweld y bydd y Mesur ar y llyfr statud mewn da bryd, ac y byddwn yn gallu gweithredu llawer iawn o'r ddeddfwriaeth fframwaith o ganlyniad i hynny.

Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change

Q5 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to tackle climate change? OAQ0801(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: As you know, it is a priority to which the Welsh Assembly Government

C5 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd? OAQ0801(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n flaenoriaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad

attaches great importance. Over the course of the next few months, we will be developing a climate adaptation action plan for Wales.

Val Lloyd: Car fumes are a fairly major source of emissions, and, unfortunately, the UK has the worst congestion, the longest commuting times, the second-highest road utilisation levels, and the highest car ownership levels in the EU. A report published last year highlighted the fact that the average commuter drives 19 miles a day, and that cutting that by half through car sharing would save 648 kg of carbon dioxide in one year. Have you developed, or will you develop, any strategies with the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks to encourage car sharing on a big scale?

Carwyn Jones: I can say that ‘Technical Advice Note 18: Transport’ is due to be published in draft form, and a major issue in terms of the TAN is to ensure that we seek to reduce greenhouse gasses and, therefore, move more people out of cars. In terms of car sharing, that is possibly outside the scope of the TAN, but the TAN will certainly try to ensure that, in planning for the future, particularly in terms of residential communities, proper weight is given to the need for them to be designed to be public-transport friendly.

Mick Bates: Following yesterday’s energy review announcement, it would appear that nuclear power will be one of the main means of reducing carbon emissions and combating climate change. Do you agree with the First Minister and the Minister with responsibility for economic development that we do not want any new nuclear build in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: The Government’s view is clear, and energy is not in my portfolio.

Mick Bates: I would have thought that you would have been able to give us a more direct answer, Minister. However, whatever happens—[*Interruption.*] Sorry, I forgot; he has only got one out of 10. Whatever

Cymru yn rhoi pwys mawr arni. Yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, byddwn yn datblygu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer addasu i'r hinsawdd yng Nghymru.

Val Lloyd: Mygdarth ceir yw un o'r prif ffynonellau gollyngiadau, ac yn anffodus yn y DU y mae'r tagfeydd gwaethaf, yr amseroedd cymudo hiraf, y lefelau uchaf ond un o ddefnyddio'r ffyrdd, a'r lefelau uchaf o berchnogaeth ceir yn yr UE. Yr oedd adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod cymudwyr yn gyrru 19 o filltiroedd y dydd ar gyfartaledd, ac y byddai haneru hynny drwy rannu ceir yn arbed 648 kg o garbon deuocsid mewn blwyddyn. A ydych wedi datblygu, neu a ydych yn bwriadu datblygu, unrhyw strategaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau i annog rhannu ceir ar raddfa fawr?

Carwyn Jones: Gallaf ddweud bod ‘Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 18: Trafnidiaeth’ ar fin cael ei gyhoeddi ar ffurf drafft, ac un o'r prif faterion o ran y TAN yw sicrhau ein bod yn ceisio lleihau nwyon tŷ gwydr ac felly'n sicrhau bod llai o bobl yn defnyddio car. O ran rhannu ceir, mae'n bosibl fod hynny y tu allan i gwmpas y TAN, ond bydd y TAN yn sicr yn ceisio sicrhau, wrth gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol, yn enwedig o ran cymunedau preswyl, fod ystyriaeth briodol i'r angen iddynt gael eu cynllunio i fod yn hwylus o ran defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus.

Mick Bates: Ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adolygiad ynni ddoe, ymddengys y bydd ynni niwclear yn un o'r prif ddulliau i leihau gollyngiadau carbon a mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. A gytunwch gyda'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd nad ydym am weld gorsafoedd niwclear newydd yn cael eu hadeiladu yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae safbwynt y Llywodraeth yn glir, ac nid yw ynni yn rhan o'm portffolio.

Mick Bates: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl y byddech wedi gallu rhoi ateb mwy uniongyrchol inni, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, beth bynnag a ddigwydd—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, anghofiais; dim ond un

happens, Minister, the planning process will be the key driver in meeting the 2010 targets embodied in TAN 8, which is your main planning tool for reaching the target of 4 TWh from renewable electricity. Can you indicate how effective TAN 8 has been to date in helping you to reach that target? If it has not been effective, what action do you propose to take to make it more effective so that we will reach the 4 TWh target in 2010?

Carwyn Jones: I believe that TAN 8 remains effective, and we will review, over the course of the next months and years, whether any changes are needed to it. However, the case for change has not yet been made.

Lorraine Barrett: As part of the campaign to tackle climate change, will you join me in congratulating those at Bute Cottage Nursery School in Penarth, who have been working innovatively with local industry and raising funds themselves to have solar panels installed during the summer holidays to heat their water? It is not just helping the environment; it is teaching children at a young age about the sorts of things that we should be doing at this time to save the planet, if you like, for future generations.

Carwyn Jones: Of course, Lorraine; I am more than happy to join you in congratulating them on what they have done. We should remember that, while there is a place for large projects to save energy, it is also the case that, if we have a large number of small projects, a significant increase in energy savings can also take place.

allan o 10 sydd ganddo. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd, Weinidog, y broses gynllunio fydd y prif ysgogwr o ran cyrraedd targedau 2010 sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn TAN 8, sef eich prif ddull cynllunio ar gyfer cyrraedd y targed o 4 TWh ar gyfer trydan adnewyddadwy. A allwch awgrymu pa mor effeithiol fu TAN 8 hyd yma i helpu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw? Os nad oedd yn effeithiol, pa gamau a gynigiwch i'w wneud yn fwy effeithiol fel y gallwn gyrraedd y targed o 4 TWh yn 2010?

Carwyn Jones: Credaf fod TAN 8 yn effeithiol o hyd ac, yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd nesaf, byddwn yn adolygu a oes angen ei newid. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaed unrhyw geisiadau i'w newid hyd yma.

Lorraine Barrett: Fel rhan o'r ymgyrch i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch y rheini yn Ysgol Feithrin Bute Cottage ym Mhenarth sydd wedi bod yn gweithio mewn ffordd arloesol gyda diwydiant lleol ac yn codi arian er mwyn gosod paneli solar yn ystod gwyliau'r haf i gynhesu'r dŵr? Nid mater o helpu'r amgylchedd yn unig yw hyn; mae'n addysgu plant ifanc am y mathau o bethau y dylem fod yn eu gwneud yn awr i achub y blaned, os mynnwch, ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Carwyn Jones: Wrth gwrs, Lorraine; yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ymuno â chi i'w llongyfarch ar yr hyn y maent wedi'i wneud. Dylem gofio, er bod lle i brosiectau mawr i arbed ynni, mae'n wir hefyd, os bydd gennym nifer fawr o brosiectau bach, y gellir gwneud cynnydd sylweddol wrth arbed ynni hefyd.

Cynlluniau Datblygu Lleol Local Development Plans

Q6 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister make a statement on local development plans in Wales? OAQ0803(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The local development plan regulations, the guidance and the manual are now in place. Local planning authorities appear to be adapting well to the new system, and we are working with them in the production of their delivery agreements.

C6 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau datblygu lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ0803(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae rheoliadau cynlluniau datblygu lleol, y canllawiau a'r llawlyfr bellach ar waith. Ymddengys fod awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn addasu'n dda i'r system newydd, ac yr ydym yn gweithio gyda hwy i gynhyrchu eu cytundebau

cyflawni.

Karen Sinclair: Do you agree that the guidance will be an important resource to allow Welsh local authorities to set planning policies that allow important community and sports resources, such as the Racecourse football ground in Wrexham, which has recently been under threat as a potential development site due to such current high land prices, to be protected for future generations?

2.50 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: The development plan process and the local development plans give the opportunity for local authorities to provide that protection for many years to come. The fact that the LDP process includes a community involvement scheme should mean that local people, communities and organisations will be able to make that view clear to local planning authorities.

Eleanor Burnham: How will the local development plans benefit Wales more than the unitary development plans? With the provision of affordable housing remaining a difficulty, will you encourage the local development plans' specific designation of land especially for affordable housing?

Carwyn Jones: Local authorities are well able to do this following the publication of 'Technical Advice Note 2: Planning and Affordable Housing' a fortnight ago. The LDP process is swifter than the present UDP process. For example, LDP inquiries and their recommendations will be binding on local authorities, as opposed to the present system, where they are merely recommendations. I am confident that the LDP system and the publication of 'Technical Advice Note 1: Joint Housing Land Availability Studies' and TAN 2 a fortnight ago mean that there is ample scope for local authorities to make provision for affordable housing.

Helen Mary Jones: Yn eich ateb i Karen Sinclair, cyfeiriasoch at y canllawiau i sicrhau bod y gymuned yn cymryd rhan yn y broses. Pa asesiad fyddwch chi a'ch swyddogion yn ei wneud o ba mor effeithiol

Karen Sinclair: A gytunwch y bydd y canllawiau yn adnodd pwysig a fydd yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i osod polisiau cynllunio sy'n caniatáu adnoddau cymunedol a chwaraeon pwysig, fel cae pêl-droed y Cae Ras yn Wrecsam, sydd wedi bod dan fygythiad yn ddiweddar fel safle datblygu posibl oherwydd prisiau uchel am dir ar hyn o bryd, i gael eu diogelu ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r broses cynlluniau datblygu a'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol yn gyfle i awdurdodau lleol roi'r diogelwch hwnnw am flynyddoedd i ddod. Dylai'r ffaith bod y broses CDLI yn cynnwys cynllun cynnwys cymunedau olygu y bydd pobl leol, cymunedau lleol a sefydliadau lleol yn gallu gwneud y safbwynt hwnnw'n glir i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol.

Eleanor Burnham: Sut y bydd Cymru'n cael mwy o fudd o'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol na'r cynlluniau datblygu unedol? Gyda'r ddarpariaeth tai fforddiadwy yn dal i beri anhawster, a wnewch chi annog defnyddio'r ddarpariaeth yn y cynlluniau i ddynodi tir yn benodol ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy?

Carwyn Jones: Mae awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa i allu gwneud hyn yn dilyn cyhoeddi 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 2: Cynllunio a Thai Fforddiadwy' bythefnos yn ôl. Mae'r broses CDLI yn gyflymach na'r broses CDU bresennol. Er enghraifft, bydd awdurdodau lleol yn rhwym wrth ymchwiliadau CDLI a'u hargymhellion, yn wahanol i'r system bresennol lle nad ydynt ond yn argymhellion. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod y system CDLI a'r broses o gyhoeddi 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 1: Cyd-astudiaethau Argaeledd Tir ar gyfer Tai' a TAN 2 bythefnos yn ôl yn golygu bod digon o gyfle i awdurdodau lleol wneud darpariaeth ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy.

Helen Mary Jones: In your response to Karen Sinclair, you referred to the guidance to ensure that the community engages in the process. What assessment will you and your officials make of the effectiveness of

yw'r broses o dynnu'r gymuned i mewn? A ydych yn argyhoeddedig y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn ddigon cynnar yn y broses fel y gall pobl leol deimlo eu bod wedi dylanwadu ar y broses o'r cychwyn?

Carwyn Jones: Bydd yn rhaid iddo ddigwydd yn gynnar yn y broses beth bynnag. Yn y ddeddfwriaeth sy'n delio â'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol, mae'n dweud pwy yn union y dylid cysylltu â hwy o ran yr ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn dymuno cysylltu â mwy o gyrff ac unigolion yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, o ran y cytundebau a wnaethpwyd ar gyflawni, dylid sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif.

Alun Cairns: The local development plans are obviously the successors of the unitary development plans, but, unfortunately, not many local authorities throughout Wales completed their unitary development plans. The few authorities that did went to considerable costs to complete their UDPs. Therefore, what consideration have you given to compensating those local authorities that have spent significant sums of money on UDPs, and must now redraft their LDPs as successor plans, when many other authorities will go straight to the LDPs?

Carwyn Jones: It is entirely a choice for local authorities as to whether they choose UDPs or LDPs, and I am sure that they would have factored their costs into their decision.

engaging the community? Are you convinced it will happen early enough in the process so that local people feel they have influenced the process from the beginning?

Carwyn Jones: It must start early in the process in any case. In the legislation that deals with the local development plans, it states who exactly should be engaged in the consultation. I hope local authorities will want to contact more bodies and individuals in the future. However, at present, in terms of the agreements made on delivery, it should be ensured that this is taken seriously.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol yn amlwg yn olynu'r cynlluniau datblygu unedol, ond yn anffodus ni chwblhaodd llawer o awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru eu cynlluniau datblygu unedol. Tynnwyd costau sylweddol gan yr ychydig awdurdodau a gwblhaodd eu CDUau. Felly, pa ystyriaeth yr ydych wedi'i rhoi i ddigolledu'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd wedi gwario symiau sylweddol ar CDUau, ac sydd yn awr yn gorfod ailddrafftio'u CDLlau fel cynlluniau olynu, pan fydd nifer o awdurdodau eraill yn symud yn syth i'r CDLlau?

Carwyn Jones: Awdurdodau lleol eu hunain sydd i benderfynu a ydynt am ddewis CDUau neu CDLlau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent wedi cymryd eu costau i ystyriaeth wneud eu penderfyniad.

Amddiffyn yr Amgylchedd Adeiledig Protecting the Built Environment

Q7 David Melding: What measures are in place to protect the built environment in Wales? OAQ0822(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The Wales spatial plan and the environment strategy for Wales provide the framework for Assembly Government policies on this. 'Planning Policy Wales' sets out policies to secure regeneration and new development, while bearing in mind the need to protect the architectural heritage that we have.

C7 David Melding: Pa fesurau sydd ar waith i amddiffyn yr amgylchedd adeiledig yng Nghymru? OAQ0822(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae cynllun gofodol Cymru a'r strategaeth amgylcheddol ar gyfer Cymru yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar hyn. Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn gosod allan bolisiau ar gyfer sicrhau adfywio a datblygu newydd, gan gadw mewn cof yr angen am ddiogelu ein treftadaeth bensaernïol.

David Melding: I am sure that you agree that the best way to protect the built environment is to use it. As part of the Valleys initiative, I was delighted to see that there is a scheme to cherish the industrial buildings of Wales by lighting them up at night. There is a question of light pollution here, but some illumination is appropriate to bring attention to, say, Ynysfach engine house in Merthyr Tydfil. There is a serious point here; we have some of the most outstanding industrial buildings anywhere in the world, and we need to acknowledge that and cherish the fact.

Carwyn Jones: In fairness, that has been done, particularly in terms of the work that has been done by Cadw. We have come a long way in terms of the situation that existed 30 years ago, when a number of industrial buildings in Wales were demolished. We have since begun to appreciate more the importance of our built heritage, and, in particular, the importance of our industrial heritage, which the people who worked in those industries did so much to build upon in Wales.

Owen John Thomas: Mae gennym nifer o adeiladau hardd yng Nghaerdydd, ond nid yw bob un ohonynt o bwysigrwydd cenedlaethol. Nid yw Cadw'n fodlon ystyried rhestru adeiladau sydd o bwysigrwydd lleol yn unig. Pa gamau ydych yn eu cymryd i newid y sefyllfa hon?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hwn yn fater i bortffolio Alun Pugh, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn clywed yr hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch mai'r ffordd orau i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd adeiledig yw drwy ei ddefnyddio. Fel rhan o fenter y Cymoedd, yr oeddwn yn falch gweld bod cynllun ar waith i werthfawrogi adeiladau diwydiannol Cymru drwy eu goleuo gyda'r nos. Gellid cyfeirio at lygredd golau yma, ond mae rhywfaint o oleuo'n briodol i dynnu sylw, dyweder, at beiriandy Ynys-fach ym Merthyr Tudful. Mae pwynt difrifol i'w wneud yn y fan hon; mae gennym rai o'r adeiladau diwydiannol gorau mewn unrhyw fan yn y byd, ac mae angen inni gydnabod hynny ac ymfalchïo yn y ffaith.

Carwyn Jones: I fod yn deg, mae hynny wedi'i wneud, yn enwedig o ran y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud gan Cadw. Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer o ystyried y sefyllfa 30 mlynedd yn ôl, pan gafodd nifer o adeiladau diwydiannol yng Nghymru eu dymchwel. Ers hynny, yr ydym wedi dechrau gwerthfawrogi pwysigrwydd ein treftadaeth adeiledig yn fwy, ac yn arbennig bwysigrwydd ein treftadaeth ddiwydiannol, y gwnaeth y bobl a fu'n gweithio yn y diwydiannau hynny gymaint i adeiladu arni yng Nghymru.

Owen John Thomas: We have a number of attractive buildings in Cardiff, but not every one is of national importance. Cadw is not prepared to list buildings of local importance alone. What action are you taking to change this situation?

Carwyn Jones: This is a matter for Alun Pugh's portfolio, and I am sure he will hear what you have to say.

Hyrwyddo Ailgylchu Promoting Recycling

Q8 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister outline his policies for promoting recycling in Wales? OAQ0834(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Our policies are clear. We have channelled £93 million to local authorities between 2005 and 2008, and we have achieved a fivefold increase in composting over five years.

Nick Bourne: That represents a financial commitment. The Minister will be aware of

C8 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei bolisiau ar gyfer hyrwyddo ailgylchu yng Nghymru? OAQ0834(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae ein polisiau'n glir. Yr ydym wedi rhoi £93 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol rhwng 2005 a 2008, ac yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd pum plyg mewn compostio dros bum mlynedd.

Nick Bourne: Mae hynny'n ymrwymiad ariannol. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol

my interest in this area as it was the subject of a short debate a couple of weeks ago. I appreciate the Minister's commitment but, specifically on the issue of kerbside recycling, much more can be done throughout Wales. It certainly needs encouraging in Cardiff and it is a particular problem in rural Wales, where many people cannot get to the centres for recycling because they do not have transport, or they are perhaps old, disabled or whatever. What are you doing to incentivise or encourage local authorities to promote, or to cajole them into promoting, kerbside recycling?

Carwyn Jones: It is right to say that more could be done to promote kerbside collection, but I do not think that it is an urban/rural split, if I can put it that way. Powys and Ceredigion authorities, for example, are among the better authorities in terms of recycling and collection. However, it certainly is the case that the easier it is for people to recycle, the more they will do it, and that means that kerbside collection should be encouraged rather than there being a dependence on people taking their rubbish for recycling to a civic amenity site.

Jocelyn Davies: Recycling is vital to successful waste management and you will know that the Beecham review says that progress is held back by capacity restraints and an inability to tackle them in a cross-organisational way. This is not for the want of commitment, but more an uncertainty about whose role it is to make the running. How do you intend to remedy that and do you intend to be the one making the running on this in the future?

Carwyn Jones: We have the regional waste fora, which are important in terms of ensuring that local authorities work together. I have made it clear to the regional waste fora that it is important that they work together or we will have to do the work for them. That message has been received. We cannot expect our local authorities, given their size, to try to deal with all the waste arising in their local areas, so it is important that they work together to provide the facilities that will be available for several local authorities, not just for one.

o'm diddordeb yn y maes hwn ar ôl y ddadl fer ychydig wythnosau'n ôl. Gwerthfawrogaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog, ond o ran ailgylchu wrth ymyl y ffordd yn benodol, gellir gwneud llawer mwy ledled Cymru. Yn sicr, mae angen ei annog yng Nghaerdydd ac mae'n broblem benodol yng Nghymru wledig, lle mae nifer o bobl yn methu cyrraedd y canolfannau ailgylchu am nad oes ganddynt gludiant, neu efallai am eu bod yn hen, yn anabl neu beth bynnag. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i gymell neu annog awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo ailgylchu wrth ymyl y ffordd neu eu cymell i wneud hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n gywir dweud y gellid gwneud mwy i hyrwyddo casgliadau wrth ymyl y ffordd, ond ni chredaf fod yna raniad trefol/gwledig, os gallaf ei roi felly. Mae awdurdodau Powys a Cheredigion, er enghraifft, ymhlith yr awdurdodau gorau o ran ailgylchu a chasglu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n sicr yn wir, po hawsaf ydyw i bobl ailgylchu, y mwyaf y byddant yn gwneud hynny, ac mae hynny'n golygu y dylid annog casgliadau wrth ymyl y ffordd yn hytrach na dibynnu ar bobl i fynd â'u sbwriel i safle amwynder dinesig i'w ailgylchu.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae ailgylchu'n hanfodol i'r broses o reoli gwastraff yn llwyddiannus, a gwyddoch fod adolygiad Beecham yn dweud bod cynnydd yn cael ei atal gan rwystrau o ran adnoddau ac anallu i fynd i'r afael â hwy ar draws y sefydliadau. Nid diffyg ymrwymiad sy'n gyfrifol am hyn, ond yn hytrach ansicrwydd ynglŷn â rôl pwy yw arwain. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu unioni hynny, ac a ydych yn bwriadu arwain yn y mater hwn yn y dyfodol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennym y fforymau gwastraff rhanbarthol, sy'n bwysig i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio. Yr wyf wedi'i wneud yn glir i'r fforymau gwastraff rhanbarthol ei bod yn bwysig iddynt gydweithio, neu bydd yn rhaid inni wneud y gwaith drostynt. Mae'r neges honno wedi ei derbyn. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i'n hawdurdodau lleol, o ystyried eu maint, geisio mynd i'r afael â'r holl wastraff yn eu hardaloedd lleol. Felly, mae'n bwysig iddynt gydweithio i ddarparu'r cyfleusterau a fydd ar gael i nifer o awdurdodau lleol, nid i un yn unig.

Gwella Mynediad at yr Arfordir a Chefn Gwlad Improving Access to the Coast and Countryside

Q9 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on what action is being taken to improve access to the coast and countryside in Wales? OAQ0800(EPC)

C9 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i wella mynediad i'r arfordir a chefn gwlad yng Nghymru? OAQ0800(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: You will know that, in May last year, we successfully introduced a new public right of access to 20 per cent of the Welsh countryside. As part of the next steps, the First Minister has announced a new coastal access improvement programme, with the aim of developing an all-Wales coastal path.

Carwyn Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod ein bod, ym mis Mai y llynedd, wedi cyflwyno hawl gyhoeddus newydd yn llwyddiannus i roi mynediad i 20 y cant o gefn gwlad yng Nghymru. Fel rhan o'r camau nesaf, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cyhoeddi rhaglen newydd i wella mynediad i'r arfordir, gyda'r nod o ddatblygu llwybr arfordir Cymru gyfan.

Val Lloyd: I will focus on access to the countryside. One of the barriers to accessing green areas in urban constituencies such as mine is that rights of way are not registered. That causes confusion over maintenance and access. Have you engaged in any discussions with local authorities to ensure that their records are updated and that any unregistered rights of way are taken over?

Val Lloyd: Canolbwyntiaf ar fynediad i gefn gwlad. Un o'r rhwystrau o ran cael mynediad i fannau gwyrdd mewn etholaethau trefol megis fy etholaeth i yw nad yw hawliau tramwy wedi'u cofrestru. Mae hynny'n achosi dryswch o ran cynnal a chadw a mynediad. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod eu cofnodion wedi'u diweddarau ac yr eir i'r afael ag unrhyw hawliau tramwy sydd heb eu cofrestru?

Carwyn Jones: Local authorities have several ways of trying to ensure that rights of way are registered. They have the rights of way improvement plans, which have been important. I tend to find that a lot of work is done by community councils, in areas where there are community councils, to map paths. In the council that I was formerly a member of, namely Coity Higher community council, many of the council members held an encyclopaedic knowledge of the local paths. However, if access is to be enjoyed by as many people as possible, it is important that local authorities are able to map out exactly where those access points are, by working with all those organisations and community councils that are able to provide that information.

Carwyn Jones: Mae gan awdurdodau lleol nifer o ffyrdd i geisio sicrhau bod hawliau tramwy'n cael eu cofrestru. Mae ganddynt gynlluniau i wella hawliau tramwy, sydd wedi bod yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn tueddu i weld bod llawer o'r gwaith yn cael ei wneud gan gynghorau cymuned, mewn ardaloedd lle mae cynghorau cymuned yn bodoli, i fapio llwybrau. Yn y cyngor yr arferwn fod yn aelod ohono, sef cyngor cymuned Coety Uchaf, yr oedd gan nifer o aelodau'r cyngor wybodaeth holl gynhwysfawr am y llwybrau lleol. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn i gynifer â phosibl o bobl gael mynediad, mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol allu dweud yn union ble mae'r pwyntiau mynediad hynny, drwy weithio gyda phob un o'r sefydliadau a'r cynghorau cymuned hynny sy'n gallu rhoi'r wybodaeth honno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gwn eich bod yn bysgotwr brwdfrydig. Nid wyf yn siŵr faint o amser yr ydych yn ei gael i bysgota y dyddiau hyn, ond byddwch yn ymwybodol bod yr hawl i gael mynediad yn golygu'r

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I know you are an enthusiastic fisherman. I do not know how much time you have to go fishing these days, but you will be aware that the right to access means the right of access also to riverbanks.

hawl i gael mynediad i lannau afonydd hefyd. Mae canolfan canŵio llewyrchus ym Mhont-tyweli yn fy etholaeth ac yr wyf yn gefnogol iawn ohono, ond yr wyf wedi derbyn gohebiaeth gan gymdeithasau sy'n cynrychioli pysgotwyr sy'n poeni am bysgodfeydd yn ein hafonydd. A wnewch ein sicrhau eich bod chi a'ch adran yn sicrhau nad yw'r pysgodfeydd hynny'n cael eu peryglu gan y mynediad hwn i lannau afonydd?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn bysgotwr llwyddiannus, ond ychydig iawn o amser sydd gennyf i bysgota. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd ag Alun Pugh, fy nghymydog, ynglŷn â cheisio symud ymlaen i sicrhau bod canŵ-wyr a physgotwyr yn gallu defnyddio afonydd a llynnoedd mewn ffordd nad yw'n amharu ar y naill na'r llall. Mae sawl ffordd ymlaen a byddwn yn gweithio ar hyn yn ystod y misoedd nesaf.

There is an excellent canoeing centre at Pont-tyweli in my constituency, which I support, but I have received correspondence from fishing associations who are worried about fisheries in our rivers. Will you assure us that you and your department are making sure that those fisheries are not endangered by this access to riverbanks?

Carwyn Jones: I am not a successful fisherman, but I do not have much time to fish. I have met with my neighbour, Alun Pugh, to try to move forward to ensure that canoeists and people who enjoy fishing can use rivers and lakes in a way that does not upset neither. There are several ways forward, and we will be working on this over the next few months.

3.00 p.m.

Beiciau Modur Mini Mini Motor Bikes

Q10 Ann Jones: What discussions has the Minister had with ministerial colleagues regarding the illegal and anti-social use of mini motor bikes? OAQ0818(EPC)

C10 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion ynghylch defnyddio beiciau modur mini yn anghyfreithlon ac yn wrthgymdeithasol? OAQ0818(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I have been in touch with several colleagues on this and, although much of the matter is not devolved, we have tried to encourage co-operation at a local level between local authorities, the police and organisations representing those who cycle and drive off road. There is also the Wales Off-road Motorcycling Steering Group, which seeks to bring all these interests together.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi cysylltu â nifer o gyd-Aelodau am hyn, ac er bod llawer o'r mater heb ei ddatganoli, yr ydym wedi ceisio annog cydweithrediad yn lleol rhwng awdurdodau lleol, yr heddlu a sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli pobl sy'n beicio ac yn gyrru oddi ar y ffordd. Mae yna hefyd Grŵp Llywio Beicio Modur Oddi-ar-y-ffordd i Gymru sy'n ceisio dwyn ynghyd yr holl grwpiau hyn sydd â diddordeb.

Ann Jones: Thank you for that, Minister. I am pleased to hear that progress has been made, because increasing use is made of these mini motor bikes, which are causing difficulties—most importantly, they are causing difficulties in urban communities, where youngsters find it necessary to ride up and down on the pavement, which is illegal and dangerous both for them and for anyone who happens to be on the pavement.

Ann Jones: Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Mae'n dda gennyf glywed bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud, oherwydd mae'r beiciau modur bach hyn yn cael eu defnyddio'n gynyddol, sy'n achosi anawsterau—yn bwysicach na hynny, maent yn achosi anawsterau mewn cymunedau trefol lle mae pobl ifanc yn teimlo bod rhaid iddynt yrru i fyny ac i lawr ar y palmant, sy'n anghyfreithlon ac yn beryglus iddynt hwy ac

i unrhyw un sy'n digwydd bod ar y palmant.

As part of the cleaner neighbourhood campaign within your portfolio, what assurances can you give to these communities in terms of looking at bringing forward some legislation that would implicate these mini motor bike riders in any form of anti-social behaviour or environmental damage to communities, so that we can prevent this from getting a hold before it causes the loss of someone's life?

Carwyn Jones: The legislation is in place; it is enforcement that is the important issue. There are examples in some parts of Wales of enforcement being successful. If the message gets through that illegal off-roading will not be tolerated, it tends to stop. However, we should not lose sight of the fact that off-roading is not an illegal activity in itself, so it is important to provide facilities where it can be carried out lawfully. That will mean that there is far less unlawful use of some parts of the countryside. It is a question of enforcement in the first place and secondly of providing facilities.

Brynle Williams: The Wales Off-road Motorcycling Steering Group's annual report in April recommended that legitimate off-road motor sports should be developed as a way of lessening the damaging impact of illegal off-road motor cycling. That does not occur only in rural areas; as Ann said, this problem is also emerging in urban areas. However, landowners are often prevented from fully servicing this market because of restrictions on the number of days in a year on which they could offer land for such use. What are you doing to help landowners to provide legitimate off-road venues to lessen the impact of illegal off-roading?

Carwyn Jones: Farmers are obliged to keep their land in good environmental and agricultural condition. Originally, you will recall that the restriction on the use of land for off-roading was far looser than it is at present. If I understand correctly, it was 28 days fewer than it is now, so there is ample

Fel rhan o'r ymgyrch cymdogaethau glanach yn eich portffolio, pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i'r cymunedau hyn o ran edrych ar lunio deddfwriaeth newydd, a fyddai'n cysylltu'r beicwyr modur bach hyn ag unrhyw fath o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol neu ddifrod amgylcheddol i gymunedau, fel y gallwn atal hyn rhag cael gafael cyn iddo achosi bod rhywun yn colli ei fywyd?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth ar waith; gorfodaeth yw'r mater pwysig. Mae enghreifftiau mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru o orfodaeth lwyddiannus. Os cyflëir y neges na chaniateir gyrru anghyfreithlon oddi ar y ffordd, mae'n dueddol o ddod i ben. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem anwybyddu'r ffaith nad yw gyrru oddi ar y ffordd yn weithgaredd anghyfreithlon ynddo'i hun, felly, mae'n bwysig darparu cyfleusterau lle gellir ei wneud yn gyfreithlon. Bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd llawer llai o ddefnyddio anghyfreithlon mewn rhannau o gefn gwlad. Mae'n gwestiwn o orfodaeth yn y lle cyntaf ac o ddarparu cyfleusterau'n ail.

Brynle Williams: Yr oedd adroddiad blynyddol y Grŵp Llywio Beicio Modur Oddi-ar-y-ffordd i Gymru yn argymhell ym mis Ebrill y dylid datblygu chwaraeon modur oddi ar y ffordd fel modd i leihau effaith andwyol beicio modur oddi ar y ffordd. Nid mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn unig y mae hyn yn digwydd; fel y dywedodd Ann, mae'r broblem yn codi hefyd mewn ardaloedd trefol. Fodd bynnag, caiff tîrffeddiawyr yn eu hatal yn aml rhag gwasanaethu'r farchnad hon yn llawn oherwydd cyfyngiadau ar nifer y diwrnodau mewn blwyddyn y gallant gynnig tir i'w ddefnyddio felly. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu tîrffeddiawyr i ddarparu mannau cyfreithlon oddi ar y ffordd i leihau effaith gyrru oddi ar y ffordd yn anghyfreithlon?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n ddyletswydd ar ffermwyr i gadw'u tir mewn cyflwr amgylcheddol ac amaethyddol da. Yn wreiddiol, fe gofiwch fod y cyfyngiad ar ddefnyddio tir ar gyfer gyrru oddi ar y ffordd lawer yn llai llym nag yw ar hyn o bryd. Os deallaf hyn yn iawn, yr oedd yn 28 diwrnod

scope for farmers to provide those facilities. However, increasing the number of days available for off-roading would mean that the land would then fall foul of our good agricultural and environmental conditions regulations under the single farm payment scheme.

yn llai nag ydyw yn awr, felly mae digon o gyfle i ffermwyr ddarparu'r cyfleusterau hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddai cynyddu nifer y diwrnodau ar gyfer gyrru oddi ar y ffordd yn golygu na fyddai'r tir yn cydymffurfio â'n rheoliadau ar gyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da o dan y cynllun Taliad Sengl.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Map Cymorth Gwladol State Aids Map

Michael German: Would the First Minister make a statement on the implications of the state aids map for east Wales? EAQ1773(FM)

Michael German: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am oblygiadau'r map cymorth gwladol ar gyfer dwyrain Cymru? EAQ1773(FM)

The First Minister: On 10 July, two days ago, the Department of Trade and Industry published a draft of the new UK assisted areas map for consultation. The draft map illustrates proposed article 87(3)(c) status, namely the less generous second tier form of coverage, in east Wales with 52 electoral divisions included. This consultation runs until 7 August. The areas previously included now proposed for exclusion include: Magor in the Newport area; three parts of Cardiff—namely the whole of Cardiff bay from the River Ely to the River Rhymney, Pontprennau in Cardiff north, and Creigiau just north of the M4—Machynlleth, a small part of Monmouthshire, the Goetre ward, and a small part of the Vale of Glamorgan in Llandow. Companies with RSA potential schemes in preparation in those seven areas need to accelerate submitting them so that they can be considered before the deadline of 31 December.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar 10 Gorffennaf, ddeuddydd yn ôl, cyhoeddodd yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ddraftt o'r map newydd o ardaloedd a gynorthwyir yn y DU ar gyfer ymgynghori. Mae'r map drafft yn dangos statws arfaethedig erthygl 87(3)(c), sef y ffurf ail haen o ddarpariaeth sy'n llai hael, yn nwyrain Cymru gyda 52 rhanbarth etholiadol. Bydd yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn parhau tan 7 Awst. Ymhlith yr ardaloedd a gynhwysid gynt ac y bwriedir peidio â'u cynnwys bellach mae Magwyr yn ardal Casnewydd; tair rhan o Gaerdydd—sef bae Caerdydd i gyd o Afon Elái i Afon Rhymni, Pontprennau yng ngogledd Caerdydd, a Chreigiau ychydig i'r gogledd o'r M4—Machynlleth, a rhan fach o sir Fynwy, ward Goetre, a rhan fach o Fro Morgannwg yn Llandŵ. Mae angen i gwmnïau sydd â chynlluniau RSA posibl ar y gweill yn y saith ardal hynny gyflymu'r broses o'u cyflwyno fel y gellir eu hystyried cyn y terfyn amser o 31 Rhagfyr.

Michael German: I thank the First Minister for coming to the Chamber to make that statement, as this is a matter of some concern to many people in Wales, particularly those who look forward to investment being made in their areas up to 2014.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Prif Weinidog am ddod i'r Siambr i wneud y datganiad hwnnw, gan fod hwn yn achosi cryn bryder i nifer o bobl yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rheini sy'n edrych ymlaen at weld buddsoddi yn eu hardaloedd hyd at 2014.

My next question relates to the criteria that are used. We use the index of multiple deprivation in Wales. However, if we look at your map, we see that the problem is that you

Mae fy nghwestiwn nesaf yn ymwneud â'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir. Defnyddiwn fynegai amddifadedd lluosog yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwn ar eich map chi,

have included the other WAG, namely the wives and girlfriends of the England football team. Your negotiations have led to a map that includes Michael Owen's mansion and the surrounding ward, but does not include the areas of multiple deprivation or anywhere approaching them in Wrexham, which is part of the economic driver of north-east Wales, Machynlleth or the parts of south Cardiff that you rightly say are part of the economic drivers of south Wales. It worries us that we have such a short period of time to consult; the closing date is 7 August. First Minister, can you reassure us by telling us whether you will be making a representation on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government to strengthen the provision and the coverage of this map, or are you content to accept it as it has been handed down?

The First Minister: We have negotiated it, so it can be assumed that, although we are not thrilled to have lost any of the seven areas to which I referred, we believe that it is the best possible outcome from the negotiations. There is no loss of population coverage in Wales on a net basis, but that is caused by the fact that the European Commission was extremely hostile to the areas that we previously had, where they were linked to the Objective 1 areas only by a narrow corridor. It was not satisfied with the narrow corridor around the coast road, the A548 from Prestatyn down to Deeside, so we have had to make that corridor a lot thicker. Therefore, many more areas have been given article 87(3)(c) status in Flintshire. On the other hand, the commission also objected to the narrow corridor around Lisvane/Old St Mellons to reach the coastal strip from Wentloog through to, and including, Cardiff bay. In the light of that, we have made a counter offer, which we believe addresses their objections, but it means that there is no net loss of population coverage in Wales at all. We are probably the only part of the United Kingdom of which that is true.

For companies in the areas that lose out—the seven areas that I mentioned, of which Cardiff is the largest—there will be disappointment, but the important thing is

gwelwn mai'r broblem yw eich bod wedi cynnwys y WAG arall, sef gwragedd a chariadon tîm pêl-droed Lloegr. Mae eich trafodaethau wedi arwain at fap sy'n cynnwys plasty Michael Owen a'r ward gyfagos, ond nad yw'n cynnwys yr ardaloedd o amddifadedd lluosog nac unman yn agos iddynt yn Wrecsam, sy'n rhan o sbardun economaidd gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, Machynlleth na'r rhannau o dde Caerdydd, sy'n rhan o sbardunau de Cymru fel y dywedwch yn hollol gywir. Mae'n achosi pryder inni fod gennym gyfnod mor fyr i ymgynghori; y dyddiad cau yw 7 Awst. Brif Weinidog, a allwch roi sicrwydd inni drwy ddweud a fyddwch yn cyflwyno sylwadau ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gryfhau'r ddarpariaeth a'r ardal a gynhwysir yn y map hwn, neu a ydych yn fodlon ei dderbyn fel y mae wedi drosglwyddo?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi ei drafod, felly gellir tybio, er nad ydym wedi'n plesio'n fawr i golli'r saith ardal y soniais amdanynt, ein bod yn credu mai dyma'r canlyniad gorau posibl o'r trafodaethau. Nid oes colled ym maint y boblogaeth yng Nghymru ar sail net, ond mae hynny oherwydd bod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn elyniaethus iawn at yr ardaloedd a oedd gennym gynt, lle nad oedd ond coridor cul yn eu cysylltu ag ardaloedd Amcan 1. Nid oedd yn fodlon ar y coridor cul o amgylch ffordd yr arfordir, yr A548 o Brestatyn i Lannau Dyfrdwy, felly bu'n rhaid inni wneud y coridor hwnnw'n lletach o lawer. Felly, rhoddwyd statws erthygl 87(3)(c) i lawer mwy o ardaloedd yn sir y Fflint. Ar y llaw arall, gwrthwynebodd y comisiwn hefyd y coridor cul o amgylch Llys-faen/yr Hen Laneirwg i gyrraedd llain yr arfordir o Wynllŵg hyd at a chan gynnwys bae Caerdydd. Yng ngoleuni hynny, yr ydym wedi gwneud gwrth-gynnig a fydd, yn ein barn ni, yn mynd i'r afael â'u gwrthwynebiadau. Ond mae'n golygu nad oes dim colled net ym maint y boblogaeth a gynhwysir yng Nghymru. Mae'n fwy na thebyg mai nyni yw'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig y gellir dweud hynny amdani.

Ar gyfer cwmnïau yn yr ardaloedd na chânt eu cynnwys—y saith ardal y soniais amdanynt, a'r fwyaf yng Nghaerdydd—bydd siom. Ond y peth pwysig yw hyn: hyd yn oed

that, even in Cardiff, there is a substantial area left in, with a large business park and job development potential in Wentloog. For the other areas, perhaps I am misreading what you said about Wrexham; Wrexham was not previously in. We cannot take areas of deprivation and simply dot them all around. The European Commission would not have accepted a map filled with dots; it wanted a coherent map based on adjacency, deprivation and unemployment. It is the best that we have been able to come up with—a map with the minimum shrinkage.

John Griffiths: Rhodri, I am obviously disappointed that Magor is no longer included in the state aids map, as it is in my constituency of Newport East. Do you agree that it is now important that businesses in Magor are made aware of the situation and, if they are considering applying for regional selective assistance, that they realise that the deadline is the end of this year? Could you tell me at this stage what steps will be taken to ensure that businesses in Magor are aware of that situation?

The First Minister: I am grateful for that question, because it is an important principle. Even before the end of the consultation, there is no reason why companies in the areas affected, which are proposed to lose their lower-tier assisted area status, should not get on with it and think about accelerating plans, or making their applications based on the plans that they already have on the knitting needles, or are thinking about. They do not have to start building the factories before 31 December; they merely have to get the agreement that regional selective assistance is on offer to them, so they could start doing that. On how to inform them, it has puzzled me that there has been so little reporting of this in the last 48 hours. It is for individual AMs to ring up companies that they know well. However, as soon as the consultation period is over, we will get those letters out and we will contact business organisations to that effect.

I have one final point to make. The impact on

yng Nghaerdydd, mae yna ardal helaeth wedi'i gadael ar y map, gyda pharc busnes mawr a chyfle i ddatblygu swyddi yng Ngwynllŵg. O ran yr ardaloedd eraill, efallai fy mod wedi camddeall yr hyn a ddywedech am Wrecsam; nid oedd Wrecsam ar y map o'r blaen. Ni allwn ddewis ardaloedd o amddifadedd yma a thraw. Ni fyddai'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi derbyn map llawn dotiau yma a thraw; yr oedd am gael map cydlynol wedi'i seilio ar gyfagosrwydd, amddifadedd a diweithdra. Dyma'r gorau y gallem ei gynnig—map gyda chyn lleied â phosibl o grebachu.

John Griffiths: Rhodri, yr wyf yn amlwg yn siomedig nad yw Magwyr wedi'i gynnwys mwyach yn y map cymorth gwladwriaethol, gan ei bod yn fy etholaeth i, Dwyrain Casnewydd. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig yn awr i hysbysu busnesau ym Magwyr o'r sefyllfa, ac os ydynt yn bwriadu gwneud cais am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol eu bod yn sylweddoli mai diwedd eleni yw'r terfyn amser? A allech ddweud wrthyf yn awr pa gamau a gaiff eu cymryd i sicrhau bod busnesau ym Magwyr yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw gan ei bod yn egwyddor bwysig. Hyd yn oed cyn diwedd yr ymgynghori, nid oes rheswm pam na all cwmnïau yn yr ardaloedd yr effeithir arnynt ac y bwriedir iddynt gollu eu statws haen is o ardal a gynorthwyir fwrw ati a meddwl am gyflwyno cynlluniau ynnghynt, neu wneud eu ceisiadau'n seiliedig ar y cynlluniau sydd ganddynt ar y gweill eisoes neu y maent yn meddwl amdanynt. Nid oes rhaid iddynt ddechrau adeiladu ffatrioedd cyn 31 Rhagfyr; dim ond cael cytundeb fod y cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar gael iddynt sydd raid. Felly, gallent ddechrau hynny. O ran rhoi gwybod iddynt, mae wedi fy synnu fod hyn wedi cael cyn lleied o sylw yn y 48 awr ddiwethaf. Cyfrifoldeb yr ACau unigol yw ffonio cwmnïau y maent yn eu hadnabod yn dda. Fodd bynnag, cyn gynted ag y bydd y cyfnod ymgynghori wedi dod i ben, byddwn yn anfon y llythyrau hynny a byddwn yn cysylltu â sefydliadau busnes i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Mae gennyf un pwynt olaf i'w wneud. Nid

small and medium-sized enterprises is nowhere near as great as that on large enterprises, because they will continue to be eligible in all parts of Wales for Assembly investment grants—with or without assisted areas, although there is a drop in the rate.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dywedasoeh mai un o griteria'r Undeb Ewropeaidd oedd bod angen cyswllt cyson a chadarn gydag ardaloedd Amcan 1. Mae hynny'n esbonio pam fod gogledd sir y Fflint wedi gwneud yn dda.

3.10 p.m.

O gofio bod gwerth ychwanegol crynswth sir Fflint yn eithaf iach ac uchel, sut felly mae'r ardal sydd o gwmpas Machynlleth, sydd hefyd yn ffinio gydag ardal Amcan 1 i'r de ac i'r gogledd, wedi colli? Ni fyddwn yn tybio bod de Meirionnydd na gogledd Ceredigion yn ardaloedd cyfoethog yn nhermau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth na chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid y ffaith nad oedd gogledd sir Fflint yn rhan o'r ardaloedd erthygl 87(3)(c) ac 87(3)(a) o'r blaen yw'r pwynt pwysig, ond y ffaith ei fod bellach wedi ei ychwanegu, a hynny er mwyn cryfhau neu ledaenu'r coridor sy'n cysylltu ardal Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol glannau Dyfrdwy. Yr unig amod o ran cynnwys Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol glannau Dyfrdwy oedd oherwydd hwy yw sbardun economaidd mawr yr ardal. Pe bawn ni wedi bod eisiau eu cael i mewn am inni golli'r cysylltiad gyda glannau Merswy—a gafodd ei gynnwys yn y map a fydd yn parhau am bum mis arall yn awr—byddai wedi bod angen cryfhau'r cysylltiad gydag Amcan 1 Cymru, sef ger y Rhyl a Phrestatyn. Nid oedd y comisiwn yn fodlon derbyn y llinyn bach oedd gennym ar lannau Dyfrdwy; yr oedd eisiau rhywbeth llawer tewach a chryfach arno.

O ran Machynlleth, mae Powys i gyd yn dod i mewn o dan un maen prawf, sef GYC a chyflogau isel, ond nid oedd posibilrwydd o gael Powys yn ei gyfanrwydd i mewn oherwydd bod y boblogaeth mor fawr—ymron i 150,000 o bobl. Dim ond Ystradgynlais a Machynlleth oedd i mewn o'r

yw'r effaith ar fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint mor fawr ag yw ar fentrau mawr, oherwydd byddant yn dal yn gymwys ym mhob rhan o Gymru i gael grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad—gyda statws ardaloedd a gynorthwyir neu hebdo, er bod gostyngiad yn y gyfradd.

Alun Ffred Jones: You said that one of the European Union criteria was that there should be frequent and strong contact with Objective 1 areas. That explains why north Flintshire has done well.

Bearing in mind that gross value added in Flintshire is relatively healthy and high, how has the area surrounding Machynlleth, which also borders on Objective 1 areas to the south and to the north, lost out? I do not suppose south Montgomeryshire or north Ceredigion would be considered to be well off areas in terms of gross value added or gross domestic product.

The First Minister: It is not the fact that north Flintshire was not part of the article 87(3)(c) and 87(3)(a) areas before which is important, but the fact that it has now been included in order to strengthen or broaden the corridor linking Broughton with the Deeside industrial park. The only condition for including Broughton and Deeside industrial park was because they are the major economic drivers for the area. If we had wanted to see them included because we had lost the link with Merseyside, which was included in the map that will remain in force for five months, we would have needed to strengthen that link with Wales's Objective 1 area, namely near Rhyl and Prestatyn. The commission was not willing to accept the narrow strip that we had on Deeside; it wanted something far wider and more robust.

In terms of Machynlleth, the whole of Powys was eligible under one criterion, namely its low GVA and wages. But there was no possibility of getting the whole of Powys included, as its population is so large—nearly 150,000 people. Only Ystradgynlais and Machynlleth were included previously, but

blaen, ond mae Machynlleth wedi dod allan y tro hwn. Cafwyd colledion yn y canolbarth a'r de hefyd. Ni chafwyd colledion yn y gogledd am y rhesymau a ddisgrifiwyd gennyf, sef oherwydd pwysigrwydd cenedlaethol parc diwydiannol glannau Dyfrdwy a Brychdwn i Gymru.

Mick Bates: First Minister, in your reply to Alun Ffred Jones, you made reference to Machynlleth, but everyone in Machynlleth will be asking whether you have it in for them. Your relocation strategy ripped 40 well paid jobs out of the area. Previously, regional selective assistance was a mechanism by which we could see that the Government was looking to assist that area, but now we find that it has been removed. In your previous answer, I did not hear any detail of how you decided to remove Machynlleth from the assisted area map. You talk about the criteria of adjacency, deprivation and unemployment—we have all those three. We are adjacent to Objective 1, we have high levels of deprivation, as exemplified in the four divisions represented—all of which are in Communities First, I might add—and there is certainly an unemployment black spot in the area. Given that those three criteria are met, what were the real reasons why you removed Machynlleth from that map?

First Minister: I think that you are being unnecessarily paranoid, if I may say so, because, by far the largest losses are, in fact, in Cardiff—proportionately or absolutely. Consider the fact that the whole of the Cardiff bay area, from the River Rhymney to the River Ely, is coming out, as is the Cardiff gate area around Pontprennau and Old St Mellons, with another business park there, and the business park prospect for which we have high hopes around Creigiau and Capel Llanilltern. That is all coming out. Therefore, all parts of Wales—south and mid, with the exception of north Wales—are making a sacrifice, and the whole of Britain, in terms of assisted area Britain, is making a sacrifice.

Given the special circumstances in Wales, overall, we are not making a sacrifice. The population coverage in Wales remains as before, but, because of the necessity to gain

Machynlleth has been omitted this time, though there have also been losses in mid and south Wales. There were no losses in north Wales, for the reasons that I have outlined, given the national importance of the Deeside industrial park and Broughton to Wales.

Mick Bates: Brif Weinidog, yn eich ymateb i Alun Ffred Jones, yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at Fachynlleth, ond bydd pawb ym Machynlleth yn gofyn a oes gennych rywbeth yn eu herbyn. Tynnodd eich strategaeth adleoli 40 o swyddi gyda chyflog da o'r ardal. Cyn hynny, yr oedd cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn fecanwaith lle y gallem weld fod y Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cynorthwyo'r ardal. Ond bellach gwelwn iddo gael ei dynnu oddi arnom. Yn eich ateb blaenorol, ni chlywais unrhyw fanylion am y ffordd y penderfynwyd dileu Machynlleth o'r map o ardaloedd a gynorthwyir. Yr ydych yn sôn am feini prawf cyfagosrwydd, amddifadedd a diweithdra—mae pob un o'r rheini gennym. Yr ydym yn ymyl ardal Amcan 1, mae gennym lefelau uchel o amddifadedd, fel y gwelir yn y pedwar rhanbarth a gynrychiolir—y mae pob un ohonynt yn rhan o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gyda llaw—ac mae'n sicr bod diweithdra mawr yn yr ardal. O ystyried bod y tri maen prawf hynny wedi eu bodloni, beth oedd y gwir resymau dros ichi ddileu Machynlleth o'r map hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod yn ddiangen o baranoid, os caf ddweud hynny, oherwydd yng Nghaerdydd y mae'r colledion mwyaf o bell ffordd, a dweud y gwir—fel cyfran neu'n absoliwt. Ystyriwch y ffaith fod ardal gyfan bae Caerdydd, o Afon Rhymni i Afon Elái, yn cael ei dileu, fel y mae ardal porth Caerdydd o amgylch Pontprennau a Hen Laneirwg, gyda pharc busnes arall yno, a'r posibilrwydd o barc busnes yr ydym yn obeithiol amdano o amgylch Creigiau a Chapel Llanilltern. Mae hynny'n cael ei ddileu. Felly, mae pob rhan o Gymru—y de a'r canolbarth, ac eithrio'r gogledd—yn aberthu, ac mae Prydain gyfan, o ran Prydain lle mae ardaloedd a gynorthwyir, yn aberthu.

O gofio'r amgylchiadau arbennig yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol, nid ydym yn aberthu. Mae maint y boblogaeth a gynhwysir yng Nghymru yn dal fel yr oedd,

population that was not there before in Flintshire—otherwise, we would have lost Deeside industrial park and Broughton—that has put the pressure on us to take areas out in mid and south Wales. The area coming out in mid Wales is very small indeed, while the areas coming out in south-east Wales are fairly substantial.

However, your points should be made in response to the consultation exercise. I emphasise that, until 7 August, it is for you, the town council and businesses in the area to show what you would lose if you no longer had access to regional selective assistance. I can say that we have looked at the figures, and two RSA applications were agreed during the previous seven years, so Machynlleth companies did make use of it. If they have schemes in mind that they cannot get in by 31 December, you should make that point forcibly to them, as should Powys County Council, during the next three weeks.

Alun Cairns: Does this not highlight the disjointed policies of the Welsh Assembly Government in that some of the most prosperous parts of Wales, in Flintshire, have been included while some of the most deprived parts in other communities are being excluded? This disjointedness is evidenced by the fact that, on the one hand, the Government argues that the revenue support grant for parts of Flintshire cannot be increased because of their relative prosperity, but, on the other, it awards them regional selective assistance status or assisted area status, which enables them to further develop and prosper at the potential cost of other communities, such as some parts of the Bridgend constituency, which have been excluded. Some deprived communities in areas such as Barry have also been excluded. Where is the sense in that? The point about Machynlleth has already been made and it is worth clarifying to the First Minister that Machynlleth was in the original assisted areas map, although in committee this morning he seemed to deny that that was so. Does this not suggest that you do not really have a handle on the issue, First Minister? You are rewarding some of the most prosperous parts, but are taking away from some of the most

and oherwydd yr angen i ennill poblogaeth nad oedd yno eisoes yn sir y Fflint—fel arall, byddem wedi colli parc busnes Glannau Dyfrdwy a Brychdwn—mae hynny wedi rhoi pwysau arnom i ddileu ardaloedd o'r canolbarth a'r de. Mae'r ardal a ddilëir yn y canolbarth yn fach iawn, ond mae'r ardaloedd a ddilëir yn y de-ddwyrain yn eithaf sylweddol.

Fodd bynnag, dylid gwneud eich sylwadau mewn ymateb i'r ymgynghori. Pwysleisiaf mai eich cyfrifoldeb chi, cyngor y dref a'r busnesau yn yr ardal, hyd 7 Awst, yw dangos beth y byddech yn ei golli pe na bai cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar gael ichi mwyach. Gallaf ddweud ein bod wedi edrych ar y ffigurau, a chytunwyd ar ddau gais am RSA yn ystod y saith mlynedd blaenorol, felly defnyddiodd cwmnïau Machynlleth y cynllun. Os oes ganddynt gynlluniau mewn golwg na allant eu cyflwyno erbyn 31 Rhagfyr, dylech bwysleisio hynny wrthynt, fel y dylai Cyngor Sir Powys, yn ystod y tair wythnos nesaf.

Alun Cairns: Onid yw hyn yn tynnu sylw at bolisiau digyswllt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn yr ystyr bod rhai o rannau mwyaf llewyrchus Cymru, yn sir y Fflint, wedi eu cynnwys ond bod rhai o'r rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig mewn cymunedau eraill heb eu cynnwys? Tystiolaeth o natur ddigyswllt polisiau'r Llywodraeth yw'r ffaith ei bod, ar y naill law, yn dadlau na ellir cynyddu'r grant cynnal refeniw i rannau o sir y Fflint am eu bod yn gymharol lewyrchus, ond ar y llaw arall yn dyfarnu statws cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol neu statws ardal a gynorthwyir iddynt, sy'n eu galluogi i ddatblygu ymhellach a ffynnu ar gefn cymunedau eraill, megis rhai rhannau o etholaeth Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, nad ydynt wedi'u cynnwys. Mae rhai cymunedau difreintiedig mewn ardaloedd megis y Barri heb eu cynnwys ychwaith. Ble mae'r synnwyr yn hynny? Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn â Machynlleth eisoes wedi'i wneud, ac mae'n werth egluro wrth y Prif Weinidog fod Machynlleth ar y map gwreiddiol o ardaloedd a gynorthwyir, er iddo ymddangos yn gwadu hynny yn y pwyllgor y bore yma. Onid yw hyn yn awgrymu nad oes gennyh afael ar y mater mewn gwirionedd, Brif Weinidog? Yr ydych yn gwobrwyo rhai o'r rhannau mwyaf llewyrchus, ond yn

deprived parts. Is this not an example of your disjointed policies?

The First Minister: You are getting over-excited, Alun. I have explained before that there is no way that the commission, let alone the Department of Trade and Industry, would accept a map that is based on areas of deprivation dotted all over east Wales. It will not accept it. You say that we are doing this. We are not doing anything other than striking the best bargain for Wales in negotiation with the commission. The commission said, 'We will not accept the narrow corridor along the A548 from Prestatyn to Deeside'. We want it for national reasons; we want, for Welsh economic driver reasons, to keep Broughton and Deeside industrial park in. The only basis on which we could do that was to thicken up the corridor connecting Objective 1 Wales around Prestatyn and Rhyl with Deeside industrial park and Broughton. You may disagree with our doing that; you may be happy to sacrifice Broughton and Deeside industrial park's ability to access regional selective assistance. I do not think that anyone with the best interests of Wales at heart—not just those in Flintshire—would regard that as a nonsense. You have not negotiated with the commission, and I am glad about that, because I cannot imagine what the results would have been; they would certainly not have been in the best interests of Wales.

Carl Sargeant: I am extremely pleased, as I would be, that Flintshire will have assisted area status. Many areas within Flintshire are deprived. I am disappointed that my Conservative colleagues find it fit to say that Flintshire does not deserve support from Europe. People need to know this in Deeside and I will be making that statement in the press. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. Carl Sargeant is asking a supplementary question to the First Minister. He is not engaging in a debate with the Welsh Conservatives, bless them.

Carl Sargeant: It was important to recognise the GVA coming from Broughton and

amddifadu rhai o'r rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig. Onid yw hyn yn enghraifft o'ch polisiau digyswllt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn cynhyrfu'n ormodol, Alun. Esboniais o'r blaen na fyddai'r comisiwn, heb sôn am yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, byth yn derbyn map yn seiliedig ar ardaloedd o amddifadedd yma a thraw ledled dwyrain Cymru. Ni fydd yn derbyn hynny. Fe ddywedwch ein bod ni'n gwneud hyn. Y cyfan yr ydym yn ei wneud yw taro'r fargen orau i Gymru wrth negodi gyda'r comisiwn. Dywedodd y comisiwn, 'Ni fyddwn yn derbyn coridor cul ar hyd ffordd yr A548 o Brestatyn i Lannau Dyfrdwy'. Yr ydym am gael hynny am resymau cenedlaethol; am resymau sy'n ymwneud ag ysgogi economi Cymru yr ydym yn dymuno cadw Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy. Yr unig ffordd y gallem wneud hynny oedd drwy wneud y coridor sy'n cysylltu Cymru Amcan 1 o amgylch Prestatyn a'r Rhyl â pharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy a Brychdwn yn lletach. Efallai eich bod yn anghytuno â'r hyn a wnaethom; efallai eich bod yn barod i atal Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy rhag cael cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yn fy marn i, ni fyddai neb sydd â budd Cymru—nid budd sir y Fflint yn unig—yn bwysig iddo yn ystyried hynny'n hurt. Nid ydych wedi negodi gyda'r comisiwn, ac yr wyf yn falch o hynny, oherwydd pwy a w'yr beth fyddai'r canlyniadau; yn sicr ni fyddent yn llesol i Gymru.

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn hynod falch, fel y gellid ei ddisgwyl, fod sir y Fflint i gael statws ardal a gynorthwyir. Mae llawer ardal yn sir y Fflint yn ddfreintiedig. Yr wyf yn siomedig clywed bod fy nghyd-aelodau Ceidwadol yn teimlo nad yw sir y Fflint yn haeddu cymorth gan Ewrop. Mae angen i bobl wybod hyn yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy, a byddaf yn gwneud y datganiad hwnnw yn y wasg. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae Carl Sargeant yn gofyn cwestiwn atodol i'r Prif Weinidog. Nid yw'n cael dadl â Cheidwadwyr Cymru, y creaduriaid.

Carl Sargeant: Yr oedd yn bwysig cydnabod y GYC sy'n dod o Frychdwn a pharc

Deeside industrial park and I welcome the widening of the band to include more of the Deeside and Flintshire area.

The First Minister: It is important to realise that adjacency to Objective 1 and the ability to generate jobs for the Objective 1 area is important. Broughton and Deeside industrial park, Llanwern, Tredegar Park, junction 28, Celtic Springs and that area of Newport, and Wentloog remain in. Those are the key areas. They are in, not because they are deprived in themselves, but because they have the capacity, because they have 100 acres and more of business park, to provide jobs for people who may live 15 or 20 miles away in the Objective 1 areas, where you do not have the elbow room for a 100-acre business park development. That is the important aspect of the way that the adjacency criteria can be interpreted by us in a constructive way. Had we allowed Deeside industrial park and Broughton to slip out, because we were unwilling to be flexible about developing this wider corridor across Flintshire, we would have been derelict in our duty to look after the best interests of Wales.

Jenny Randerson: You may be content for Cardiff to make sacrifices on behalf of the rest of Wales, but I most certainly am not. I shall be making some strong representations during the consultation on this map. The situation for Cardiff is absolutely dire. We have gone from eight wards receiving assistance down to one.

3.20 p.m.

The ones that have lost assistance—with the exception of Lisvane and St Mellons, which we always regarded as a strange anomaly—Adamsdown, Butetown, Creigiau, Grangetown, Rumney and Splott, are, by anyone's standards, deprived wards that are greatly in need of assistance. Splott is a Communities First ward; Adamsdown, next to it, is an area of influence for Communities First, because it is, literally, just outside of the top 100 deprived wards in Wales. Will you also make representations on this, as a local Assembly Member, First Minister? If this appalling map stands and we do not

diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, a chroesawaf y penderfyniad i wneud yr ardal yn lletach er mwyn cynnwys mwy o Lannau Dyfrdwy a sir y Fflint.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod agosrwydd at ardal Amcan 1 a'r gallu i greu swyddi ar gyfer yr ardal Amcan 1 yn bwysig. Mae Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, Llanwern, Parc Tredegar, cyffordd 28, Celtic Springs a'r ardal honno o Gasnewydd a Gwynllŵg i gyd wedi aros. Y rhain yw'r ardaloedd allweddol. Maent wedi'u cynnwys nid am eu bod yn ddifreintiedig eu hunain, ond oherwydd bod ganddynt 100 erw a mwy o barc busnes i ddarparu swyddi ar gyfer pobl sy'n byw 15 neu 20 milltir i ffwrdd mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1, lle nad oes digon o le i adeiladu parc busnes 100 erw. Dyna'r agwedd bwysig ar y ffordd y gellir dehongli'r meini prawf o ran agosrwydd mewn ffordd adeiladol. Pe baem wedi gadael i barc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy a Brychdwn beidio â chael eu cynnwys, am nad oeddem yn barod i fod yn hyblyg ynglŷn â datblygu'r coridor lletach hwn ar draws sir y Fflint, byddem wedi esgeuluso ein dyletswydd i ofalu am fuddiannau Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Efallai eich bod yn fodlon gweld Caerdydd yn aberthu ar ran gweddill Cymru, ond yn sicr nid wyf fi'n fodlon gwneud hynny. Byddaf yn cynnig dadleuon cryf yn ystod yr ymgynghori ar y map hwn. Mae'r sefyllfa o ran Caerdydd yn gwbl warthus. Mae nifer y wardiau sy'n cael cymorth wedi gostwng o wyth i un.

Mae'r rhai sydd wedi colli cymorth—ac eithrio Llys-faen a Llaneirwg yr oeddem yn meddwl erioed ei bod yn rhyfedd iddynt gael eu cynnwys—mae Adamsdown, Butetown, Creigiau, Grangetown, Rhymni a Sblot, waeth beth fo'ch llinyn mesur, yn wardiau difreintiedig sydd ag angen dirfawr am gymorth. Mae Sblot yn un o'r wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; mae Adamsdown, y ward gyfagos, yn ardal o ddylanwad ar gyfer Cymunedau yn Gyntaf am ei bod, yn llythrennol, ychydig y tu allan i'r 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. A newch chi hefyd roi sylwadau ar hyn, fel

manage to change the minds of the commission on this issue, will you join me in making special representations to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks? He has always said to me, when I have asked for assistance and various schemes to assist business in Cardiff, that there were wards entitled to assistance, and that we should be content with that. Since there are no longer any wards in Cardiff entitled to assistance, we need a much more proactive approach from the Minister. Do you agree?

The First Minister: You are confusing an economic development assistance programme with a social assistance programme. This is not based on what happens to how you attempt to counter social deprivation in Adamsdown, Splott or Grangetown. It is a simple matter of where the people of Splott, Adamsdown, Grangetown and Butetown are going to go to work. You implied that the whole of Cardiff no longer has any development area status—that is not correct. The Trowbridge ward includes some large business park areas, in the Wentloog area. Even what you said about Lisvane and old St Mellons is inaccurate—it is not based on the wealth of the people of Lisvane and old St Mellons; it is based on the fact that you have to have a corridor between Objective 1 and the coastal belt area, and on whether there are any business parks in that area. There were two business parks, which is why it was in, at Pontprennau and old St Mellons, around the Swalec depot; they are coming out, because the corridor now shifts to a big corridor in Newport, rather than one passing down through Lisvane and St Mellons.

You cannot keep everything in. North Wales contains these two extremely large business park areas—Britain's biggest and most successful industrial park at Deeside industrial park, and the Broughton Airbus plant. Once you have made the strategic decision to include those areas, then somewhere else in Wales must sacrifice. The rest of the UK believes that Wales is getting off incredibly lightly, because, on a net basis,

Aelod Cynulliad lleol, Brif Weinidog? Os bydd y map gwarthus hwn yn parhau, ac os na lwyddwn i newid meddwl y comisiwn ar y mater hwn, a ymunwch â mi i gyflwyno sylwadau arbennig i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau? Mae wedi dweud wrthyf erioed, pan fyddaf wedi gofyn am gymorth ac amrywiol gynlluniau i helpu busnesau yng Nghaerdydd, fod gan yr wardiau hawl i gael cymorth, ac y dylem fod yn fodlon ar hynny. Gan na fydd hawl mwyach gan yr un ward yng Nghaerdydd i gael cymorth, mae angen i'r Gweinidog fod lawer yn fwy rhagweithiol. A ydych yn cytuno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn cymysgu rhaglen cymorth datblygu economaidd a rhaglen cymorth cymdeithasol. Nid yw'n seiliedig ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r ffordd yr ydych yn ceisio ymladd amddifadedd cymdeithasol yn Adamsdown, Sblot neu Grangetown. Yr unig fater dan sylw yw ble mae pobl Sblot, Adamsdown, Grangetown a Butetown yn mynd i weithio. Yr oeddech yn awgrymu nad oes unrhyw statws ardal ddatblygu gan Gaerdydd gyfan mwyach—nid yw hynny'n gywir. Mae ward Trowbridge yn cynnwys rhai parciau busnes mawr, yn ardal Gwynllŵg. Mae hyd yn oed yr hyn a ddywedech am Lys-faen a Llaneirwg yn anghywir—nid yw'n seiliedig ar gyfoeth pobl Llys-faen a'r hen Laneirwg; mae'n seiliedig ar y ffaith fod coridor rhwng Amcan 1 ac ardal y llain arfordirol ac a oes unrhyw barciau busnes yn yr ardal honno. Yr oedd dau barc busnes yno, a dyna'r rheswm pam y mae'r ardal wedi'i chynnwys, ym Mhontprennau a'r hen Laneirwg, o amgylch depo Swalec; maent yn cael eu tynnu oddi ar y map am fod y coridor yn awr yn symud i goridor mawr yng Nghasnewydd, yn hytrach nag un sy'n mynd drwy Lys-faen a Llaneirwg.

Ni allwch gadw popeth. Mae dau barc busnes mawr iawn yn y Gogledd—y parc diwydiannol mwyaf o ran maint a llwyddiant ym Mhrydain, sef parc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, a gwaith Airbus yn Mrychdwn. Ar ôl ichi wneud y penderfyniad strategol i gynnwys yr ardaloedd hynny, yna rhaid i rywle arall yng Nghymru gael ei aberthu. Cred gweddill y DU fod Cymru'n dianc yn rhyfeddol o ysgafn am nad ydym wedi colli

we have not lost any population at all, because of what we have gained in the Flintshire area. However, that was at the commission's insistence, otherwise Broughton and Deeside industrial park would have come up.

It is tough on Cardiff; we have to accept that, and you will be able to make all those points in the consultation exercise. Three areas are coming out—the two small ones in Creigiau and Pontprennau, and the big one in Cardiff bay. However, adjoining the big one in Cardiff bay, which is coming out, you have Wentloog, which is staying in.

Glyn Davies: You have made several references to the position of Machynlleth, and its removal from assisted area status, and you have sought to draw a comparison between Machynlleth and other parts of Wales. However, the comparison is not a fair one. What has happened in Machynlleth over recent years is that there have been huge job losses, not least in the removal from the town of the Welsh Assembly Government's presence. Not only is that damaging in itself, but it is damaging in the message that sends to other potential investors. I will speak to Powys County Council about seeking to reverse this—that is sensible advice. However, do you not feel that you have some responsibility to the economic future of Machynlleth not just to write it off? Much of this is a response to the Government's decision, as far as the town is concerned.

The First Minister: I can rebut that 100 per cent. No-one is losing their jobs in Machynlleth as a result of the relocation of the offices. You seem to think that whether or not there is a brass-plate on an Assembly Government office in Machynlleth is of overwhelming importance, whereas, in fact, no jobs will be lost. Those staff will need to travel to Aberystwyth, and I agree that it may be a difficult journey for some people, but the investment that we are proposing to make in Aberystwyth, which is 16 miles away, is an extremely big, strategic investment. People within travelling distance of Aberystwyth, which would include those living in

poblogaeth o gwbl, ar sail net, oherwydd yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei ennill yn ardal sir y Fflint. Fodd bynnag, dyna a fynnai'r comisiwn, neu byddai Brychdwn a pharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy wedi'u hepgor.

Mae'n anodd i Gaerdydd; rhaid inni dderbyn hynny, a gallwch wneud yr holl bwyntiau hynny yn yr ymgynghoriad. Mae tair ardal yn cael eu tynnu oddi ar y map—y ddwy ardal fach yng Nghreigiau a Phontprennau, a'r un fawr ym mae Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, wrth ymyl yr ardal fawr ym mae Caerdydd, sy'n cael ei hepgor, mae Gwynllŵg sy'n aros.

Glyn Davies: Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio droeon at sefyllfa Machynlleth, a'r cynnig i dynnu'r dref oddi ar y map o ardaloedd a gynorthwyir, ac yr ydych wedi ceisio cymharu Machynlleth â rhannau eraill o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gymhariaeth yn un deg. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd ym Machynlleth dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yw bod niferoedd mawr o swyddi wedi eu colli, yn bennaf yn sgîl penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gau ei swyddfa yno. Mae hynny nid yn unig yn niweidiol ynddo'i hun, mae hefyd yn niweidiol o ran y neges y mae hynny'n ei chyfleu i ddarpar fuddsoddwyr eraill. Byddaf yn siaradaf â Chyngor Sir Powys ynglŷn â cheisio newid y penderfyniad hwn—mae hynny'n gyngor synhwyrol. Fodd bynnag, oni theimlwch fod rhywfaint o gyfrifoldeb arnoch am ddyfodol economaidd Machynlleth, ac na ddylech ei hamddifadu fel hyn? Mae llawer o hyn yn ymateb i benderfyniad y Llywodraeth, o ran y dref.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf wrthbrofi hynny'n llwyr. Nid oes neb yn colli ei swydd ym Machynlleth o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniad i symud y swyddfa. Yr ydych fel pe baech yn credu bod cael swyddfa i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ym Machynlleth yn hanfodol bwysig, ond y gwir amdani yw na chaiff swyddi eu colli. Bydd angen i'r aelodau hynny o'r staff deithio i Aberystwyth, a chytunaf y gallai fod yn daith anodd i rai pobl, ond mae'r buddsoddiad yr ydym yn bwriadu ei wneud yn Aberystwyth, sydd 16 milltir i ffwrdd, yn fuddsoddiad enfawr a strategol. Bydd pobl sydd o fewn pellter teithio i Aberystwyth, a byddai hynny'n

Machynlleth, will be far better off as a result of that strategic investment. It is a very major investment by us, with Ceredigion County Council next door, the like of which has never been seen in mid Wales. That will happen over the next two years. People will have different views on this, depending which side of a county boundary they are on, but that should not concern us—it is the strategy that matters, and mid Wales and everyone within the same travel-to-work distance, expect for some people, will gain from this.

With regard to our commitment, you cannot say that the whole of the burden of accommodating the necessary increase in the population covered in Flintshire should be borne by south Wales without mid Wales making any contribution. As we heard from Jenny—and perhaps you should get together and talk about it—a big sacrifice is being made in Cardiff; a tiny sacrifice is being made in eastern Newport, and likewise in the Llandough area in the Vale of Glamorgan, but you cannot say that mid Wales should not be touched at all. This is the difficulty. You will find this throughout Britain—all previous assisted areas are being shrunk and the issue is how much the shrinkage should be. In Wales, on a net basis, we are not losing anything. As a result of the Flintshire issue, mid Wales and south Wales must make a bigger sacrifice, but that is in the best interest of Wales as a whole.

cynnwys pobl sy'n byw ym Machynlleth, lawer yn well eu byd o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad strategol hwnnw. Mae'n fuddsoddiad mawr iawn gennym ni, ynghyd â Chyngor Sir Ceredigion y drws nesaf, na welwyd mo'i debyg erioed o'r blaen yn y canolbarth. Bydd hynny'n digwydd dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Bydd gan bobl safbwyntiau gwahanol ynglŷn â hyn, yn ôl pa ochr o ffin y sir y maent yn byw, ond nid yw hynny'n bwysig inni—y strategaeth sy'n bwysig, a bydd y canolbarth a phawb sydd o fewn yr un pellter teithio i'r gwaith, ac eithrio rhai pobl, ar eu hennill o hyn.

O ran ein hymrwymiad, ni allwch ddweud y dylai'r holl faich o ddarparu ar gyfer y cynnydd angenrheidiol yn y boblogaeth a gynhwysir yn sir y Fflint gael ei dwyn gan y de heb i'r canolbarth wneud unrhyw gyfraniad. Fel y clywsom gan Jenny—ac efallai y dylech gyfarfod i drafod hyn—mae aberth mawr yn cael ei wneud yng Nghaerdydd, mae aberth bach yn cael ei wneud yn nwyrain Casnewydd, a hefyd yn ardal Llandochoau ym Mro Morgannwg, ond ni allwch ddweud na ddylid cyffwrdd â'r canolbarth o gwbl. Dyna'r anhawster. Fe welwch hyn ledled Prydain—mae'r ardaloedd a gynorthwywyd gynt yn cael eu lleihau a'r cwestiwn yw faint y dylid eu lleihau. Yng Nghymru, fel ffigur net, nid ydym yn colli dim. Oherwydd sir y Fflint, mae'r canolbarth a'r de yn gorfod gwneud mwy o aberth, ond mae hynny er lles Cymru gyfan.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Canolfan Ddosbarthu Iceland Iceland Distribution Centre

Janet Ryder: Will the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks make a statement on the closure of the Iceland distribution centre in Flintshire, which will result in the loss of 350 jobs? EAQ0983(EIN)

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): This announcement of job losses at Iceland is very disappointing news and our sympathies are with those affected, as well as their families and the local communities. As a Government,

Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ddatganiad ar gau canolfan ddosbarthu Iceland yn sir y Fflint, a fydd yn arwain at golli 350 o swyddi? EAQ0983(EIN)

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn am golli swyddi yn Iceland yn newyddion siomedig iawn ac yr ydym yn cydymdeimlo â'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt, yn ogystal â'u teuluoedd a'r cymunedau lleol.

we will work with those affected to offer support via our early response redundancy programme. Since hearing of yesterday's announcement, I have spoken to the regional secretary of the Transport and General Workers' Union, as well as the local Assembly Member, Carl Sargeant. My officials have been in regular contact with the company prior to and throughout the 90-day consultation period.

Janet Ryder: I express Plaid Cymru's sympathy with those who may lose their jobs as a result of this. This shocking announcement is a yet another devastating blow to the Iceland workforce—we have just had a discussion about areas of Flintshire that will be given assisted area status—and to the economy of Flintshire, following the 80 call centre jobs that were lost earlier this year and the 400 headquarter jobs that were lost last year. It seems that the company is losing faith in the workforce and the economy of north-east Wales. It is doubly disappointing that Iceland, like Kwik Save before it, a company that was born in Wales, and which grew and blossomed here, is now losing jobs to more prosperous areas of England when we desperately need those jobs in Wales. Your usual response, when companies are leaving Wales, is to blame the global economy and cheap labour in eastern Europe, Asia or elsewhere, but this company is citing lower costs in a more prosperous area of England. What are you doing to address that particular situation, what discussions have you had regarding that in recent weeks, and do you intend to do anything that might encourage the company to rethink its proposal? Also, what, if anything, can you do, to help those people to move on to other jobs?

Andrew Davies: I am disappointed that you seem to be supporting the company's view and blaming the workforce for this situation. As a Government, we have taken a very even-handed view. The former regional director of the Welsh Development Agency, Chris Farrow, was in touch with the company back in early February of this year, and Carl Sargeant and I have been in touch with the company and the trade unions to try to resolve this issue. We are disappointed at the

Fel Llywodraeth, byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt i gynnig cymorth drwy ein rhaglen i ymateb cynnar i golli swyddi. Ers clywed y cyhoeddiad ddoe, yr wyf wedi siarad ag ysgrifennydd rhanbarthol Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol, yn ogystal â'r Aelod Cynulliad lleol, Carl Sargeant. Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r cwmni cyn y cyfnod ymgynghori o 90 diwrnod a thrwy gydol y cyfnod hwnnw.

Janet Ryder: Hoffwn fynegi cydymdeimlad Plaid Cymru â'r rheini a all golli eu swyddi o ganlyniad i hyn. Mae'r newyddion syfrdanol hyn yn ergyd dost arall i weithlu Iceland—yr ydym newydd gael trafodaeth ynglŷn ag ardaloedd yn sir y Fflint a fydd yn cael statws ardal a gynorthwyr—ac i economi sir y Fflint, ar ôl colli 80 o swyddi mewn canolfan alw yn gynharach eleni a'r 400 o swyddi prif swyddfa a gollwyd y llynedd. Ymddengys bod y cwmni'n colli ffydd yng ngweithlu ac economi'r gogledd-ddwyrain. Mae'n ergyd ddwbl fod cwmni Iceland, fel Kwik Save o'i flaen, cwmni sydd â'i wreiddiau yng Nghymru ac sydd wedi tyfu ac wedi blodeuo yma, bellach yn colli swyddi sy'n symud i ardaloedd mwy llewyrchus yn Lloegr er bod angen dybryd am y swyddi hynny yng Nghymru. Eich ymateb arferol, pan fydd cwmnïau'n gadael Cymru, yw beio'r economi fyd-eang a llafur rhad yn nwyrain Ewrop, Asia neu mewn mannau eraill. Ond mae'r cwmni hwn yn sôn am gostau is mewn ardal fwy llewyrchus yn Lloegr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa benodol honno, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch o am hynny yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, ac a ydych yn bwriadu gwneud unrhyw beth a allai annog y cwmni i ailystyried ei gynnig? Hefyd, beth y gallwch ei wneud, os o gwbl, i helpu'r bobl hynny i symud i swyddi eraill?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn siomedig eich bod yn cefnogi barn y cwmni ac yn beio'r gweithlu am y sefyllfa hon yn ôl pob tebyg. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi bod yn gytbwys iawn. Cysylltodd Chris Farrow, cyn-gyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, â'r cwmni ar ddechrau mis Chwefror eleni, ac mae Carl Sargeant a minnau wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â'r cwmni a'r undebau llafur i geisio datrys y mater hwn. Yr ydym yn siomedig am y canlyniad,

outcome, but I do not think that we could have done more as a Government in terms of supporting the company or encouraging it to maintain its employment on Deeside. It is regrettable that the company has made this decision, and as I said, we will do everything that we can as a Government to help those affected by this announcement.

It is cold comfort for those who are affected, but Flintshire, in terms of the labour market, is doing extremely well. There are many job opportunities in the area and we will do everything that we can to help those affected by this announcement to gain alternative employment, or, if they seek to do so, to undertake additional training.

3.30 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: It is extremely disappointing that the Iceland food chain has chosen to make these job redundancies in Flintshire. Quite rightly, I met with the trade unions on several occasions over the last month, and I have had discussions with you and Assembly Government officials. I was disappointed with the response from the management of the company. My view is that it made the decision to move to Warrington a while back. Indeed, I have great concerns because, yesterday, on Iceland's website, there were advertisements for positions in the new Warrington depot, before representations had been made to union officials or a statement had been made to staff about leaving or any such intentions. Therefore, I ask you to look into the legal aspect of that, because it was truly unfortunate that the workforce was looking at its jobs in another area on a website.

My thoughts today go out to the workforce and their families. With your good offices, I will be looking to support the workforce in Flintshire. It is a workforce of good skill and good quality, and it has been loyal to this company in Deeside for many years. Indeed, Iceland was one of the founder companies on Deeside industrial park, many years ago. This is, therefore, a sad loss for the workforce of Flintshire and a sad day for the whole economy. My colleagues on Flintshire County Council, and the council leader and

ond ni chredaf y gallem fod wedi gwneud rhagor fel Llywodraeth i gefnogi'r cwmni neu ei annog i gadw ei swyddi ar Lannau Dyfrdwy. Mae'n anffodus fod y cwmni wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn, ac fel y dywedais, byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu fel Llywodraeth i helpu'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn.

Nid yw'n fawr o gysur i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt, ond mae sir y Fflint, o ran y farchnad lafur, yn gwneud yn arbennig o dda. Mae nifer o gyfleoedd am swyddi yn yr ardal, a byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i helpu'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn i gael swyddi eraill neu, os byddant yn ceisio, i gael hyfforddiant ychwanegol.

Carl Sargeant: Mae'n siom fawr fod cwmni bwyd Iceland wedi dewis dileu swyddi yn sir y Fflint. Cyfarfûm â'r undebau llafur droeon yn ystod y mis diwethaf, ac yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda chi a swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Cefais fy siomi gan ymateb rheolwyr y cwmni. Fy marn i yw fod y penderfyniad i symud yn ôl i Warrington wedi ei wneud gryn amser yn ôl. Yn wir, yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr oherwydd ddoe, ar wefan Iceland, yr oedd hysbysebion swyddi ar gyfer y depo newydd yn Warrington, cyn i sylwadau gael eu cyflwyno i swyddogion undeb neu cyn i ddatganiad gael ei wneud i'r staff ynglŷn â gadael neu unrhyw fwiad o'r fath. Felly, gofynnaf ichi edrych ar yr agwedd gyfreithiol ar hynny, oherwydd yr oedd yn wirioneddol anffodus fod y gweithlu'n gweld eu swyddi mewn ardal arall ar wefan.

Cydymdeimlaf heddiw â'r gweithlu a'u teuluoedd. Gyda'ch cymorth chi, byddaf yn ymdrechu i gefnogi'r gweithlu yn sir y Fflint. Mae'n weithlu medrus iawn o safon uchel, ac mae wedi bod yn deyrngar i'r cwmni hwn ar Lannau Dyfrdwy ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Yn wir, Iceland oedd un o'r cwmnïau cyntaf i ymgartrefu ym mharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl. Felly, mae'r golled hon yn un drist i weithlu sir y Fflint ac mae'n ddiwrnod trist i'r economi gyfan. Mae fy nghyd-aelodau yng Nghyngor

deputy leader, have assured me of their concerns and support for the company. I hope that your department will do all that it can for the workforce from today onwards.

Andrew Davies: As I said in my earlier responses, I do not think that we, as a Government, or the public sector could be faulted in any way. As I said, from early February through to the present day, my officials and those of the former WDA have been in constant touch with both the management and the unions, seeking to resolve the issue. However, there was a failure to agree between the company and the trade unions and that is not a matter for me to comment on. It is the company's decision and point of view that it can operate at a lower cost on the other side of the border. I regret that and wish that an agreement could have been negotiated between the company and its workforce. Sadly, that was not the case.

I will follow up your question about the legality of some of the practices. I am not sure whether we have any locus in that area, but, if we can do anything, we will follow that up. Obviously, we will do everything that we can to assist those affected by the redundancies, either to seek alternative employment or training. As we have found with previous redundancies, many of those workers may want to set up their own companies; we will support them in that.

Eleanor Burnham: It seems rather strange that the company is moving 23 miles away. It does not seem a great distance, as such, but the people who will commute will add to the burden and pressure on the roads, which we know are already very busy in that area. Can you assure us that other companies might not feel the same way? Why would they find Cheshire more productive and less costly? It seems very strange, and I would like some clarification on that. Are you absolutely sure that you have exhausted all negotiations? All our hearts go out to the people who are being made redundant. What exactly can you do to assure us that other companies will not come to you saying exactly the same thing?

Sir y Fflint, ynghyd ag arweinydd y cyngor a'r dirprwy arweinydd, wedi fy sicrhau eu bod yn pryderu ac yn cefnogi'r cwmni. Gobeithio y bydd eich adran yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu dros y gweithlu o heddiw ymlaen.

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais yn fy ymatebion cynharach, ni chredaf y gellid ein beio ni, fel Llywodraeth, na'r sector cyhoeddus mewn unrhyw ffordd. Fel y dywedais, o ddechrau mis Chwefror tan heddiw, mae fy swyddogion a swyddogion WDA gynt wedi bod mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r rheolwyr a'r undebau, i geisio datrys y mater. Fodd bynnag, ni lwyddwyd i gael cytundeb rhwng y cwmni a'r undebau llafur ac nid mater imi wneud sylw arno yw hynny. Penderfyniad y cwmni a'i farn yw y gall weithredu'n rhatach yr ochr draw i'r ffin. Gresynaf fod hynny wedi digwydd, a byddwn wedi dymuno gweld trafod cytundeb rhwng y cwmni a'i weithlu. Yn anffodus, nid dyna a ddigwyddodd.

Atebaf eich cwestiwn am gyfreithlondeb rhai o'r arferion. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes gennym unrhyw locus yn y maes hwnnw, ond, os gallwn wneud unrhyw beth, byddwn yn dilyn y mater. Yn amlwg, byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gynorthwyo'r rheini y mae'r colli swyddi'n effeithio arnynt, naill ai i ddod o hyd i waith arall neu i gael hyfforddiant. Fel y gwelsom gyda diswyddiadau yn y gorffennol, efallai y bydd nifer o'r gweithwyr hynny am sefydlu eu cwmnïau eu hunain; byddwn yn eu cefnogi i wneud hynny.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'n ymddangos braidd yn rhyfedd fod y cwmni'n symud 23 milltir i ffwrdd. Nid yw'n ymddangos yn bellter mawr, fel y cyfryw, ond bydd y bobl a fydd yn teithio yno yn ychwanegu at y pwysau ar y ffyrdd, sydd eisoes yn brysur iawn yn yr ardal honno, fel y gwyddom. A allwch ein sicrhau na fydd cwmnïau eraill yn teimlo'r un fath efallai? Pam y byddent yn gweld bod swydd Gaer yn fwy cynhyrchiol ac yn llai costus? Mae'n ymddangos yn rhyfedd iawn, a hoffwn gael rhywfaint o eglurhad am hynny. A ydych yn hollol siŵr eich bod wedi disbyddu pob trafodaeth bosibl? Cydymdeimlwn â'r rheini a fydd yn colli eu swyddi. Beth yn union y gallwch ei

wneud i'n sicrhau na fydd cwmnïau eraill yn dod atoch gan ddweud yn union yr un peth?

Andrew Davies: My understanding of the reason why Malcolm Walker has decided to relocate his operation is that the trade unions and the workforce were unwilling to renegotiate their employment terms and conditions. That is an industrial relations matter between the company and the unions; it is not a matter for the Government. The Government is not running this company; it is a private company and Malcolm Walker has made the decision that he can operate more effectively, or at a lower cost, in Warrington as opposed to Deeside. I do not think that that says anything about the quality of the workforce or Flintshire as a place to do business. This is a specific case relating to a specific company.

Andrew Davies: O'r hyn a ddeallaf am y rheswm pam mae Malcolm Walker wedi penderfynu symud ei gwmni, nid oedd yr undebau llafur na'r gweithlu'n fodlon ailnegodi eu telerau a'u hamodau cyflogaeth. Mater cysylltiadau diwydiannol rhwng y cwmni a'r undebau yw hynny; nid mater i'r Llywodraeth. Nid y Llywodraeth sy'n rhedeg y cwmni hwn; mae'n gwmni preifat ac mae Malcolm Walker wedi penderfynu y gall weithredu'n fwy effeithiol, neu'n rhatach, yn Warrington nag a all ar Lannau Dyfrdwy. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n dweud dim am safon y gweithlu nac am sir y Fflint fel lle i redeg busnes. Mae hwn yn achos penodol yn ymwneud â chwmni penodol.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith (Cymalau Enghreifftiol ar gyfer Rheilffyrdd a Thramffyrdd) 2006
Approval of the Transport and Works (Model Clauses for Railways and Tramways) Order 2006

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 26,

agrees that the Secretary of State makes the Transport and Works (Model Clauses for Railways and Tramways) Order 2006, which was laid in the Table Office on 4 July 2006. (NDM3187)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes siaradwyr, felly symudwn at y bleidlais.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 26,

yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud y Gorchymyn Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith (Cymalau Enghreifftiol ar gyfer Rheilffyrdd a Thramffyrdd) 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006. (NDM3187)

The Presiding Officer: There are no speakers, so we will move directly to the vote.

Cynnig (NDM3187): O blaid 43 Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3187): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad
 (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
 Approval of the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education)
 (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006**

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod **The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3175)

considers the principle of the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3175)

Cynigiaf fod

I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

2. approves that the draft the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006;

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Gorffennaf 2006; ac

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 July 2006; and

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3176)

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3176)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes siaradwyr, felly symudwn at y bleidlais.

The Presiding Officer: There are no speakers, so we will move to the vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3175): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3175): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3176): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3176): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish

Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Plant 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegation of Functions under the Children Act 2004 to the First Minister

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod
 propose that

the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,

resolves to delegate the following functions of the National Assembly contained within the Children Act 2004 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated:

yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn Neddf Plant 2004, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, mo'u dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw:

Section 26(1) to (4), section 29(1)(a), (2), (5), (6), (7), (8), (10), (11) and (12), section 31(2), (4) and (5), section 32(2) to (3), section 34(1), section 46, and section 49(1). (NDM3191)

Adran 26(1) i (4), adran 29(1)(a), (2), (5), (6), (7), (8), (10), (11) a (12), adran 31(2), (4) a (5), adran 32(2) i (3), adran 34(1), adran 46, ac adran 49(1). (NDM3191)

Owen John Thomas: I welcome the delegation of these functions to the First Minister, especially section 29. Section 29 of the regulations, when completed, will allow local education authorities to access database information that will enable them to carry out surveys to identify the demand for Welsh-medium education. The information from the surveys will give local education authorities' Welsh-education plans a firm and informed basis for making adequate provision for Welsh-medium education. Frequently, the provision for Welsh-medium education fails to meet the demand. This results in siblings being forced to attend different schools, often

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf ddirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru, yn enwedig adran 29. Bydd adran 29 o'r rheoliadau, ar ôl ei chwblhau, yn galluogi awdurdodau addysg lleol i weld gwybodaeth mewn cronfeydd data a fydd yn eu galluogi i wneud arolygon i nodi'r galw am addysg Gymraeg. Bydd y wybodaeth o'r arolygon yn sail gadarn a hyddysg i awdurdodau lleol i wneud darpariaeth ddigonol ar gyfer addysg Gymraeg. Yn aml, nid yw darpariaeth addysg Gymraeg yn bodloni'r galw. Mae hyn yn golygu bod brodyr a chwiorydd yn gorfod mynd i ysgolion gwahanol, sydd filltiroedd

several miles apart, and many children being refused a Welsh-medium education despite their parents' wishes. At this moment, there are 30 children in Aberdare who have not yet been found a place in Welsh-medium schools for September.

We have had to wait two years, since the Children Act 2004, before being able to consider this motion, which is of key importance to the success of 'Iaith Pawb'. The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has informed me that work will not begin on making the new regulations until the autumn, which is two to three months from now. Can I have your assurance, Minister, that you will make every effort to prioritise this matter by bringing forward the start date to enable some sizable steps to be taken to meet the increase of 5 percentile points in the number of Welsh speakers, as promised by the Government in 'Iaith Pawb'?

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I know that there has been a great deal of discussion on this matter at the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee. We must point out that the primary and most important purpose of section 29 is to have a children's information database to identify whether children are accessing the universal services of education and health. Of course, this provision has not yet commenced—legislation has not yet been made under this section—and there will be full consultation to take this forward.

3.40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM3191): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3191): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

lawer ar wahân yn aml, ac addysg Gymraeg yn cael ei gwrthod i nifer o blant, er gwaethaf dymuniadau eu rhieni. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 30 o blant yn Aberdâr nad ydynt eto wedi cael lle mewn ysgolion Cymraeg ar gyfer mis Medi.

Yr ydym wedi gorfod aros dwy flynedd, ers Deddf Plant 2004, cyn gallu ystyried y cynnig hwn, sy'n hollbwysig i lwyddiant 'Iaith Pawb'. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi dweud wrthyf na fydd y gwaith o lunio'r rheoliadau newydd yn dechrau tan yr hydref, sydd ddeufis i dri mis i ffwrdd. A allwch fy sicrhau, Weinidog, y byddwch yn gwneud popeth o fewn eich gallu i flaenoriaethu'r mater hwn drwy ddechrau ar y gwaith ynghynt er mwyn ei gwneud yn bosibl cymryd rhai camau sylweddol tuag at fodloni'r cynnydd o 5 y cant yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg, fel yr addawyd gan y Llywodraeth yn 'Iaith Pawb'?

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Gwn fod y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi trafod y mater hwn yn helaeth. Rhaid inni egluro mai prif ddiben a diben pwysicaf adran 29 yw sefydlu cronfa ddata o wybodaeth am blant er mwyn nodi a yw plant yn gallu cael gwasanaethau addysg ac iechyd yn gyffredinol. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r ddarpariaeth hon wedi cychwyn eto—ni wnaed deddfwriaeth eto o dan yr adran hon—a bydd ymgynghori llawn er mwyn symud y mater hwn ymlaen.

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Dymunaf wneud datganiad byr yn sgîl fy natganiad ddoe ar yr adroddiad 'Ar Draws Ffiniau'. Carwn ychwanegu fy niolchgarwch i Syr Jeremy Beecham, y Fonesig Gillian Morgan, Syr Adrian Webb a'r Athro Steve Martin am gynnwys yr adroddiad. Yn arbennig, carwn ymateb yn ffurfiol yma i'r argymhelliad a wneir ar dudalen 72 yn y fersiwn Gymraeg, yn adran 2.1, sef argymhellion penodol a gyflwynir nid i'r Llywodraeth nac i gyrff eraill ond i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r argymhellion yn pwysleisio'r pwysigrwydd i'r Cynulliad arwain y gwaith o ymgysylltu mwy â dinasyddion a datblygu gwaith craffu trawsbynciol.

The Presiding Officer: I wish to make this short statement following my statement yesterday on the 'Beyond Boundaries' report. I wish to express my gratitude to Sir Jeremy Beecham, Dame Gillian Morgan, Sir Adrian Webb and Professor Steve Martin for the content of the report. In particular, I wish to respond formally here to the recommendation that appears on page 72 in the Welsh version, in section 2.1, recommendations that are made not to the Government or to other bodies but to the Assembly. These recommendations stress the importance for the Assembly to lead in the work of liaising more with citizens and developing the work of cross-cutting scrutiny.

Mae'r argymhellion hefyd yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad arwain trafodaeth gyhoeddus aeddfed, gosod esiampl o safbwynt gwaith craffu sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd, ac, yn olaf, ddefnyddio'r pwerau newydd a ddaw yn sgîl Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru i adolygu gweithdrefnau a strwythurau'r pwyllgorau i sicrhau ffocws trawsbynciol ar y dinesydd ar draws yr holl wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

A minnau'n Llywydd y Cynulliad, carwn ymateb yn ffurfiol heddiw, gan ddiolch am yr argymhellion hyn, a dweud fy mod yn bwriadu ymgynghori drwy ein pwyllgorau. Yr wyf hefyd yn gwahodd pob Aelod i ymateb i mi ynglŷn ag ym mha fodd y credwch y byddai'n briodol inni weithredu ar yr argymhellion hyn. Yn arbennig, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn wynebu ein cyfrifoldeb i arwain y gwaith o ymgysylltu â dinasyddion ac o fod yn ffocws i'r canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd yn ein gwaith craffu. Gan dderbyn yr egwyddorion a osodir inni gan y pwyllgor hwn, yr wyf yn gwahodd ymateb gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac aelodau'r pwyllgorau, a hefyd gan aelodau o'r gymdeithas sifil, dinasyddion a mudiadau gwirfoddol a allai fod â diddordeb yn ein gweithdrefnau ni at y dyfodol i weld sut y gallwn wella ein gwaith o fod yn graffwyr democrataidd.

The recommendations also ask the Assembly to lead a mature public debate, to set an example with regard to citizen-centred scrutiny, and, lastly, to use the powers that will come under the Government of Wales Bill to review the procedures and structures of committees in order to ensure cross-cutting citizen focus across all public services.

As the Assembly's Presiding Officer, I wish to respond formally today, by expressing my gratitude for these recommendations and stating my intention to consult through our committees. I also invite all Members to respond to me about how you feel it would be appropriate for us to take action on these recommendations. In particular, it is important that we face up to our responsibility of taking a lead in the work of engaging with citizens and providing a citizen-centred focus to our scrutiny work. In accepting the principles set by this committee, I invite responses from Assembly Members and committee members, and from members of civil society, citizens and voluntary organisations that may have an interest in our procedures in the future, to see how we might improve our work as democratic scrutineers.

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Prif Weinidog The First Minister's Annual Report

Motion (NDM3192): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the First Minister 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 July 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at end of motion:

regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) meet its hospital waiting-times targets;

Cynnig (NDM3192): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Weinidog 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Gorffennaf 2006.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru:

a) i gyrraedd ei thargedau amseroedd aros ar gyfer ysbytai;

- b) *abolish homecare charges for disabled people;* b) *i ddi-ddymu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl;*
- c) *provide free breakfasts to all primary school children;* c) *i ddarparu brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgolion cynradd;*
- d) *ensure that everyone can have access to an NHS dentist;* d) *i sicrhau bod pawb yn gallu gweld deintydd y GIG;*
- e) *increase the number of students in further education since 2003; and* e) *i gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach ers 2003; ac*
- f) *suspend right to buy in areas of housing pressure.* f) *i atal yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle ceir pwysau am dai*
- expresses concern that:* *yn mynegi pryder:*
- a) *the failure to devolve powers for policing has resulted in a Westminster-imposed restructuring of police forces;* a) *mai canlyniad methu â datganoli pwerau dros yr heddlu yw bod San Steffan wedi gorfodi'r broses o ailstrwythuro'r heddlu arnom;*
- b) *the financial shortfall within the NHS will result in cuts to health services and will detrimentally affect the recruitment and retention of health professionals;* b) *y bydd y diffyg ariannol yn y GIG yn arwain at doriadau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd ac yn effeithio er gwaeth ar recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol;*
- c) *no coherent economic strategy has been developed to improve the economy in west Wales and the Valleys;* c) *nad oes strategaeth economaidd gydlynol wedi'i datblygu i wella economi'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd;*
- d) *the First Minister's report does not include the annual report of the sustainable development scheme;* d) *nad yw adroddiad y Prif Weinidog yn cynnwys yr adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy;*
- e) *insufficient progress has been made in removing the most vulnerable from fuel poverty by 2010; and* e) *nad oes cynnydd digonol wedi'i wneud o ran lleddfu tlodi tanwydd i'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed erbyn 2010; ac*
- f) *a quarter of children are experiencing child poverty;* f) *bod chwarter ein plant yn dioddef tlodi plant;*
- welcomes Assembly resolutions and decisions to:* *yn croesawu penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad, yn benodol ei benderfyniadau:*
- a) *establish an inquiry into ambulance services;* a) *i sefydlu ymchwiliad i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans;*
- b) *assist pensioners whose council tax band had increased by more than one band;* b) *i gynorthwyo pensïynwyr y mae eu band treth gyngor wedi codi fwy nag un band;*
- c) *increase provision for the small school fund;* c) *i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y gronfa ysgolion bach;*

- d) *increase funding for rail services;* d) *i gynyddu'r arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd;*
- e) *increase funding for universities;* e) *i gynyddu'r arian ar gyfer prifysgolion;*
- f) *ensure that Welsh university students studying in Wales will not pay top-up-fees; and* f) *i sicrhau na fydd myfyrwyr prifysgol o Gymru sy'n astudio yng Nghymru'n talu ffioedd ychwanegol; ac*
- g) *establish a committee to scrutinise the funding of schools.* g) *i sefydlu pwyllgor i graffu ar drefniadau ariannu ysgolion.*
- Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- regrets the ditching of the Assembly Government's promise to scrap homecare charges for disabled people.* Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn gresynu at y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnu ar eu haddewid i ddiddymu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl.*
- Amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes the shambolic manner of the merging of certain Assembly sponsored public bodies with the Assembly Government.* Gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi'r diffyg trefn yn y broses o uno cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad penodol â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- welcomes the reduction in waiting times over 12 months but notes that the length of waiting times for many patients are still unacceptably long.* Gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn croesawu'r gostyngiad mewn amseroedd aros dros gyfnod o 12 mis ond yn nodi bod llawer o gleifion yn dal i orfod aros am gyfnodau annerbyniol o hir.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes the paucity of policies contained in the First Minister's programme of government when two of his top five 'most notable achievements' have happened through the actions of others.* Gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi'r prinder polisiau yn rhaglen lywodraethu'r Prif Weinidog pan fo dau o'i bump 'cyflawniad mwyaf nodedig' wedi digwydd drwy weithredoedd pobl eraill.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to give greater priority to infrastructure (particularly transport) projects in the next round of European structural funding.* Gwelliant 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i brosiectau seilwaith, (a phrosiectau trafnidiaeth yn benodol) yn rownd nesaf cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop.*

Amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

and further notes the failure to honour key pledges in Labour's 2003 Assembly election manifesto.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2,3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the First Minister 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 July 2006. (NDM3192)

Throughout this second Assembly term, we have focused consistently on providing more and better jobs for the people of Wales and equipping them with the skills that they need to fill those jobs, combined with improving our health as a nation and developing stronger and safer communities.

This is my fifth report as First Minister, and it measures what has been done to make a difference in these crucial areas through increased investment and more efficient delivery. The full document of record put before you today, packed with facts and figures, highlights how we are progressing against all the commitments we outlined in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

We have eliminated long waiting times for NHS treatment or for first out-patient consultation. By the end of the last financial year, there were no patients waiting more than 12 months for either out-patient consultation or in-patient or day-case treatment. The vast majority wait nothing like 12 months; 80 per cent of patients wait less than six months. This is a great achievement for all the hard-working doctors, nurses, paramedics, support staff and, indeed, managers in the Welsh health service who

Gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

ac yn nodi yn ogystal â hyn y methiant i gyflawni addewidion allweddol maniffesto Llafur ar gyfer etholiad y Cynulliad yn 2003.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis.

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Weinidog 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Gorffennaf 2006. (NDM3192)

Drwy gydol yr ail dymor hwn o'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio'n barhaus ar ddarparu mwy o swyddi a swyddi gwell i bobl Cymru, a rhoi'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt i gyflawni'r swyddi hynny, ynghyd â gwella ein hiechyd fel cenedl a datblygu cymunedau cryfach a mwy diogel.

Hwn yw fy mhumed adroddiad fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, ac mae'n mesur yr hyn a wnaed i wneud gwahaniaeth yn y meysydd hanfodol hyn drwy fwy o fuddsoddi a phroses fwy effeithlon o gyflawni hynny. Mae dogfen lawn y cofnod a gyflwynir ger eich bron heddiw, sy'n llawn ffeithiau a ffigurau, yn tynnu sylw at hynt y broses o gyflawni'r holl ymrwymadau yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Yr ydym wedi dileu amseroedd aros hir ar gyfer triniaeth y GIG neu apwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol. Erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, nid oedd yr un claf yn aros mwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol na thriniaeth fel claf mewnol neu achos dydd. Nid yw amser aros y mwyafrif llethol yn agos at 12 mis; mae 80 y cant o gleifion yn aros llai na chwe mis. Mae hyn yn llwyddiant mawr i'r holl feddygon, y nyrsys, y parafeddygon, y staff cymorth ac, yn wir, rheolwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru

have made all this possible. Of course, that was an interim target. Having achieved the 12 and 12, we are moving on now to the eight months and eight months maximum waiting times elimination by 31 March 2007, and introducing the interim target for the first time of 36 weeks for the so-called hidden waiting list of diagnostics and therapies. We have massively increased the intake of our medical and clinical schools, and the number of staff directly employed by the NHS in Wales at all levels is continuing to rise.

We know that the new dentistry contract has emerged as a big issue, and we are taking action. We have created an additional 206,000 NHS dentistry places this year, thanks to our personal dental service practices, and we have increased our budget allocation in the year that has just begun by £30 million. Therefore, that has increased from £88 million to £118 million from 2005-06 to 2006-07, which is a 31 per cent increase in one year.

I was disappointed, as were all the Cabinet members, that we were unable to deliver the free home care package for disabled people, in which I declare an interest as a part-time carer. We were unable to do that in the way that we had intended, but I am pleased with the £76 million alternative package that we have introduced over the next three years to support older people, disabled people, people suffering from Alzheimer's disease and their carers. It will greatly improve the services available and extend the relief from charging for personal care, which will help more people to stay in their own homes.

In terms of the other areas on which there has been major progress, the Merthyr Tydfil office, which will bring the reality of devolution to the Heads of the Valleys, is under construction and will open this autumn. The railway line from Cardiff to Ebbw Vale is under construction, and we hope that there will be an extension to Newport as soon as the signalling changes can be made on the mainline.

sydd wedi gweithio mor galed ac sydd wedi gwneud hyn yn bosibl. Wrth gwrs, targed dros dro oedd hwnnw. Ar ôl cyrraedd y 12 a 12, symudwn ymlaen yn awr i'r wyth mis a dileu amseroedd aros wyth mis fan pellaf erbyn 31 Mawrth 2007, a chyflwyno'r targed dros dro am y tro cyntaf, sef 36 wythnos ar gyfer y rhestr aros gudd, fel y'i gelwir, ar gyfer diagnosteg a therapïau. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr yn ein hysgolion meddygol a chlinigol yn sylweddol, ac mae nifer y staff a gyflogir yn uniongyrchol gan y GIG yng Nghymru ar bob lefel yn parhau i godi.

Gwyddom fod y contract deintyddiaeth newydd wedi dod yn destun trafod mawr, ac yr ydym yn gweithredu ar hynny. Yr ydym wedi creu 206,000 o leoedd deintyddiaeth GIG ychwanegol eleni, diolch i'n practisau gwasanaeth deintyddol personol, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd o £30 miliwn yn ein dyraniad cyllideb yn y flwyddyn sydd newydd ddechrau. Felly, mae hynny wedi cynyddu o £88 miliwn i £118 miliwn o 2005-06 i 2006-07, sef cynnydd o 31 y cant mewn blwyddyn.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig, fel pob Aelod Cabinet arall, na fu'n bosibl inni sicrhau'r pecyn gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl, ac yr wyf yn datgan buddiant fel gofalwr rhan amser. Nid oedd modd inni gyflawni hynny fel y bwriadwyd, ond yr wyf yn falch â'r pecyn amgen gwerth £76 miliwn a gyflwynwyd gennym dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gefnogi pobl hŷn, pobl anabl, pobl sy'n dioddef gan glefyd Alzheimer a'u gofalwyr. Bydd yn gwella'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael yn fawr, gan ymestyn y rhyddhad rhag taliadau am ofal personol a fydd yn helpu mwy o bobl i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

O ran y meysydd eraill lle bu cynnydd mawr, mae'r gwaith o adeiladu swyddfa Merthyr Tudful, a fydd yn gwneud datganoli yn real ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd, yn mynd rhagddo a bydd yn agor yn yr hydref. Mae gwaith adeiladu'r rheilffordd o Gaerdydd i Lynebwy yn mynd rhagddo, a gobeithio y bydd estyniad i Gasnewydd cyn gynted ag y gellir gwneud y newidiadau yn y signalau ar y brif reilffordd.

On employment more generally, despite a miniscule rise in unemployment yesterday, Wales has outperformed other parts of the UK over recent years. Unemployment is at 5 per cent, as given in yesterday's figures, and remains well below the UK rate of 5.4 per cent. We must remember that seven years ago, when the Assembly came into existence, the unemployment rate of 7.7 per cent in Wales was well above the UK rate of 6.2 per cent. Average gross weekly earnings for adults in Wales have gone up by 19 per cent since April 2001, compared to 17 per cent for the UK as a whole. Gross disposable household income in Wales has grown by 25.6 per cent since devolution, which is faster than in the UK as a whole. Only the eastern region of England has seen faster growth in gross domestic household income since 1999. That is not because of a sprawling public sector in Wales. The most recently published figures show that Wales has seen a bigger percentage increase in private sector employment than in public sector employment. We are the only region or nation of the UK of which that fact is true.

On structural funds, in 2005 alone, £310 million of structural funds were committed to 429 projects. The creation and safeguarding of over 123,000 jobs can be associated with projects that were match funded by the structural funds programmes since 2000. We are about to embark on a new £1.3 billion round of European Objective 1 follow-on funding, under its new name of convergence funding, from 1 January 2007. We hope to put out for consultation later this month the programme for the strategy and the framework for the new Objective 1 funding, which was secured following the successful negotiations on the EU financial perspective—the budget in any other words—for the period between 1 January 2007 until the end of 2013, which meets the EU objectives for growth and jobs, while adding value to our existing policies and strategies.

On developing skills, we have made substantial progress in bringing school buildings up to modern standards by committing £630 million for more than 1,400

O ran cyflogaeth yn fwy cyffredinol, er gwaethaf cynnydd bach iawn mewn diweithdra ddoe, mae Cymru wedi rhagori ar rannau eraill o'r DU yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Pump y cant yw lefel diweithdra, fel y nodwyd yn y ffigurau ddoe, ac mae'n parhau'n sylweddol is na chyfradd y DU, sef 5.4 y cant. Rhaid inni gofio, pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fodolaeth saith mlynedd yn ôl, fod y gyfradd ddiweithdra o 7.7 y cant yng Nghymru yn sylweddol uwch na chyfradd y DU o 6.2 y cant. Mae'r enillion gros wythnosol ar gyfartaledd ar gyfer oedolion yng Nghymru wedi codi 19 y cant ers Ebrill 2001, o'u cymharu â 17 y cant ar gyfer y DU i gyd. Mae incwm gwario gros cartrefi yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 25.6 y cant ers datganoli, sy'n gyfradd gyflymach na'r DU yn gyffredinol. Dim ond yn rhanbarth dwyrain Lloegr y gwelwyd yr incwm gros cartrefi domestig yn cynyddu'n gyflymach ers 1999. Nid oherwydd sector cyhoeddus anferth yng Nghymru y mae hyn. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf fod Cymru wedi gweld cynnydd canrannol uwch mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat nag mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus. Ni yw'r unig ranbarth neu wlad yn y DU a all honni hyn.

O ran cronfeydd strwythurol, yn 2005 yn unig neilltuwyd £310 miliwn o gronfeydd strwythurol i 429 o brosiectau. Gellir priodoli creu a diogelu dros 123,000 o swyddi i brosiectau a ddenodd arian cyfatebol gan raglenni cronfeydd strwythurol er 2000. Yr ydym ar drothwy cylch newydd gwerth £1.3 biliwn o arian dilynol Amcan 1 Ewropeaidd, o dan y teitl newydd ariannu cydgyfeiriant o 1 Ionawr 2007. Ein gobaith yw ymgynghori, yn ddiweddarach y mis yma, ar y rhaglen ar gyfer y strategaeth a'r fframwaith ar gyfer yr ariannu Amcan 1 newydd, a ddiogelwyd yn dilyn trafodaethau llwyddiannus ar bersbectif ariannol yr UE—y gyllideb mewn geiriau eraill—ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng 1 Ionawr 2007 tan ddiwedd 2013, sy'n cyfateb i amcanion yr UE ar gyfer twf a swyddi, gan ychwanegu gwerth at ein polisiau a'n strategaethau presennol.

O ran datblygu sgiliau, yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol wrth foderneiddio adeiladau ysgol, drwy neilltuo £630 miliwn ar gyfer mwy na 1,400 o brosiectau ym maes

projects in the area of school building or rebuilding. We are making sure that the children of Wales—the best children in the world—can learn in an environment that is fit for them.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.47 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.47 p.m.*

Our investment in teaching is paying off. There are now 1,700 more teachers in Wales than there were in 1998, which has contributed to our promise and achievement in reducing all junior class sizes. We have also invested in school support staff—learning support assistants—which enables teachers to focus more of their time on real teaching, and not on paperwork.

School results are improving, with 74 per cent of 11-year-olds achieving the expected levels for the core subjects in combination, and 53 per cent of 15-year-olds achieving five or more GCSEs at grades A* to C in the last academic year for which we have full results, namely 2004-05. The new £16 million raising attainment and individual standards in education programme will target educational under-attainment, especially among disadvantaged pupils, and will benefit over 600 primary, secondary and special schools across Wales.

On training, our investment in the modern apprenticeship scheme has resulted in an increase from 9,500 modern apprenticeships in 1999 to 14,500 modern apprenticeships at the moment, which represents a massive increase well in excess of 50 per cent, which is far higher than in Scotland or England.

3.50 p.m.

Educational success depends in the long term on supporting children's learning from the start. We are revolutionising childcare in Wales by investing in specialist services for babies and infants. We have opened 16 integrated centres, with an additional 15 scheduled to open in the next four months, and a further eight are planned by the end of this financial year.

adeiladau ysgolion neu ailadeiladu. Yr ydym yn sicrhau y gall plant Cymru—y plant gorau yn y byd—ddysgu mewn amgylchedd sy'n addas ar eu cyfer.

Mae ein buddsoddiad mewn addysgu yn talu ar ei ganfed. Bellach, mae 1,700 yn fwy o athrawon yng Nghymru nag oedd yn 1998, ac mae hyn wedi cyfrannu at ein haddewid a'n llwyddiant i leihau maint dosbarthiadau cynradd. Yr ydym hefyd wedi buddsoddi mewn staff cymorth mewn ysgolion—cynorthwywyr dysgu—sy'n galluogi athrawon i ganolbwyntio mwy ar addysgu go iawn yn hytrach nag ar waith papur.

Mae canlyniadau ysgolion yn gwella, gyda 74 y cant o ddisgyblion 11 oed yn cyrraedd y lefelau disgwylidig ar gyfer cyfuniad y pynciau craidd, a 53 y cant o ddisgyblion 15 oed yn llwyddo i ennill gradd A* i C mewn pump neu fwy o arholiadau TGAU yn y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf pan oedd canlyniadau llawn ar gael, sef 2004-05. Bydd y rhaglen newydd gwerth £16 miliwn i godi cyflawniad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yn targedu tangyflawni addysgol, yn enwedig ymhlith disgyblion difreintiedig, a bydd o fudd i dros 600 o ysgolion cynradd, uwchradd ac arbennig ledled Cymru.

Mae ein hyfforddiant a'n buddsoddiad yn y cynllun prentisiaeth fodern wedi arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y prentisiaethau modern o 9,500 yn 1999 i 14,500 o brentisiaethau modern ar hyn o bryd, cynnydd aruthrol sy'n sylweddol uwch na 50 y cant, sy'n uwch o lawer nag yn yr Alban neu Loegr.

Mae llwyddiant addysgiadol yn dibynnu, yn y pen draw, ar gefnogi dysgu plant o'r cychwyn. Yr ydym yn chwyldroi gofal plant yng Nghymru drwy fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau arbenigol i fabanod a phlant bach. Yr ydym wedi agor 16 o ganolfannau integredig, a bwriedir agor 15 arall yn ystod y pedwar mis nesaf ac wyth arall erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon.

Our new curriculum for 3 to 7-year-olds, which encourages children to learn through play, is developing well and will be introduced fully in September 2008. This new system will provide the necessary life skills on which to found a lifetime of future learning and employability. All this investment is aimed at creating a pool of young, highly qualified and skilled people, who in years to come will be at the cutting edge of the Welsh workforce. In case people think that what I am saying is just more of the same, it is anything but, because this is the first time that any part of the United Kingdom has embraced the Scandinavian, 3 to 7-year-old, learn-through-play style of kindergarten-period education.

On community safety, it is important for the people of Wales to feel safe and happy in their communities. We are continuing to invest, with the encouragement of Cambridge Consultants, who have done the action research evaluation for us, in our Communities First programme, which is a long-term strategy to improve living conditions and prospects for people in the most disadvantaged wards and areas of Wales.

We are also tackling crime and anti-social behaviour through our £124 million crime-fighting fund, which includes a focus on youth offending, substance misuse and domestic abuse and how to combat them. We have four anti-social behaviour action area pilots in place, which will establish best practice in tackling nuisance behaviour.

We are also investing in the needs of our older and disabled people. We are well on our way to creating the post of an older people's commissioner—another first for Wales—and we are investing to ensure that our elderly and disabled people have the means by which to maintain their independence. We have introduced schemes and grants that allow people to stay and remain independent in their own homes and to leave hospital and residential care as soon as they are able, and ensure that they have good-quality homes fit for them to live in.

Mae ein cwricwlwm newydd ar gyfer plant 3 i 7 oed, sy'n annog plant i ddysgu drwy chwarae, yn mynd rhagddo'n dda a chaiff ei gyflwyno'n llawn ym Medi 2008. Bydd y system newydd hon yn darparu'r sgiliau bywyd angenrheidiol a fydd yn sail i oes o ddysgu a chyflogadwyedd yn y dyfodol. Mae'r holl fuddsoddiad hwn wedi'i anelu at greu cronfa o bobl ifanc gymwys a medrus a fydd ar flaen y gad yng ngweithlu Cymru mewn blynyddoedd i ddod. Rhag ofn i bobl feddwl fy mod yn ailadrodd fy hun, nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl, oherwydd dyma'r tro cyntaf i unrhyw ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig fabwysiadu arddull Sgandinafia o ddysgu drwy chwarae ar ffurf addysg kindergarten i blant 3 i 7 Llychlyn.

O ran diogelwch cymunedol, mae'n bwysig i bobl Cymru deimlo'n ddiogel ac yn fodlon yn eu cymunedau. Yr ydym yn parhau i fuddsoddi, gydag anogaeth Cambridge Consultants, sydd wedi gwneud gwerthusiad ymchwil gweithredu ar ein rhan, yn ein rhaglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, sy'n strategaeth hirdymor i wella amodau byw a rhagolygon i bobl sy'n byw yn y wardiau a'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru.

Yr ydym hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â throseddau ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol drwy gyfrwng ein cronfa atal troseddau gwerth £124 miliwn, sy'n cynnwys canolbwyntio ar droseddau ymhlith yr ifanc, camddefnyddio sylweddau a thrais yn y cartref, a dulliau i fynd i'r afael â hwy. Mae gennym bedwar cynllun peilot ar waith ym maes gweithredu ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, a fydd yn nodi arfer gorau wrth fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi yn anghenion ein pobl hŷn ac anabl. Yr ydym wedi braenaru'r tir yn dda ar gyfer creu swydd comisiynydd pobl hŷn—gan roi Cymru ar y blaen unwaith eto—ac yr ydym yn buddsoddi i sicrhau y caiff ein pobl hŷn ac anabl y modd i barhau'n annibynnol. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno cynlluniau a grantiau a fydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i bobl aros a pharhau'n annibynnol yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, ac i adael yr ysbyty a gofal preswyl cyn gynted ag y bo modd, gan sicrhau bod ganddynt gartrefi o safon sy'n addas iddynt fyw ynddynt.

We are committed to creating a sustainable environment for the people of Wales and for future generations, because a sustainable environment underpins good health, a strong economy and real quality of life. Our recently published environment strategy provides the framework that we need to achieve this vision.

We have delivered key gains for Wales over the past three years. We have drastically cut prescription charges and are well on our way to abolishing them completely by 31 March next year. We have met our commitment that there will be no top-up fees in Welsh universities during this Assembly term. We have put in place free bus travel and free swimming for older and disabled people, and have invested heavily, in excess of manifesto pledges, in capital investment in improvements to school buildings, hospitals, GP surgeries and health centres. All primary schools in Wales will have been offered the opportunity to take part in our free school breakfasts initiative by next January, and 557 schools have now signed up to participate by the end of the next academic year.

Over the next year, we will continue to work for Wales to deliver all of our commitments, because we want to ensure that the people of Wales enjoy the highest possible quality of public service and the highest possible quality of life.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru:

a) i gyrraedd ei thargedau amseroedd aros ar gyfer ysbytai;

b) i ddi-ddymu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl;

c) i ddarparu brechwast am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgolion cynradd;

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i greu amgylchedd cynaliadwy i bobl Cymru ac i genedlaethau'r dyfodol, oherwydd mae amgylchedd cynaliadwy yn sail i iechyd da, economi gref ac ansawdd bywyd o safon. Mae ein strategaeth amgylcheddol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn darparu'r fframwaith y mae arnom ei angen i wireddu'r weledigaeth hon.

Yr ydym wedi sicrhau llwyddiannau o bwys i Gymru yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf. Yr ydym wedi gostwng taliadau presgripsiwn yn sylweddol ac yn nesáu at eu dileu'n llwyr erbyn 31 Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydym wedi gwireddu'n hymrwymiad na fydd ffioedd ychwanegol mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad hwn. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu tocynnau bws am ddim a nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn ac anabl, ac yr ydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol, yn fwy na'r hyn a addawyd yn y manifest, mewn buddsoddiadau cyfalaf i wella adeiladau ysgol, ysbytai, meddygfeydd a chanolfannau iechyd. Erbyn Ionawr y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd pob ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru wedi cael cynnig cyfle i gymryd rhan yn ein menter brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion, a bellach mae 557 o ysgolion wedi nodi eu hawydd i gymryd rhan erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn academaidd nesaf.

Dros y flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn parhau i weithio dros Gymru i wireddu pob un o'n hymrwymadau, am ein bod yn awyddus i sicrhau y gall pobl Cymru fwynhau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o'r radd flaenaf a'r ansawdd bywyd gorau posibl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at end of motion:

regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) meet its hospital waiting-times targets;

b) abolish homecare charges for disabled people;

c) provide free breakfasts to all primary school children;

- d) i sicrhau bod pawb yn gallu gweld deintydd y GIG; d) ensure that everyone can have access to an NHS dentist;
- e) i gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach ers 2003; ac e) increase the number of students in further education since 2003; and
- f) i atal yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle ceir pwysau am dai f) suspend right to buy in areas of housing pressure.
- yn mynegi pryder: expresses concern that:
- a) mai canlyniad methu â datganoli pwerau dros yr heddlu yw bod San Steffan wedi gorfodi'r broses o ailstrwythuro'r heddlu arnom; a) the failure to devolve powers for policing has resulted in a Westminster-imposed restructuring of police forces;
- b) y bydd y diffyg ariannol yn y GIG yn arwain at doriadau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd ac yn effeithio er gwaeth ar recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol; b) the financial shortfall within the NHS will result in cuts to health services and will detrimentally affect the recruitment and retention of health professionals;
- c) nad oes strategaeth economaidd gydlynol wedi'i datblygu i wella economi'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd; c) no coherent economic strategy has been developed to improve the economy in west Wales and the Valleys;
- d) nad yw adroddiad y Prif Weinidog yn cynnwys yr adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy; d) the First Minister's report does not include the annual report of the sustainable development scheme;
- e) nad oes cynnydd digonol wedi'i wneud o ran lleddfu tlodi tanwydd i'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed erbyn 2010; ac e) insufficient progress has been made in removing the most vulnerable from fuel poverty by 2010; and
- f) bod chwarter ein plant yn dioddef tlodi plant; f) a quarter of children are experiencing child poverty;
- yn croesawu penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad, yn benodol ei benderfyniadau: welcomes Assembly resolutions and decisions to:
- a) i sefydlu ymchwiliad i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans; a) establish an inquiry into ambulance services;
- b) i gynorthwyo pensynwyr y mae eu band treth gyngor wedi codi fwy nag un band; b) assist pensioners whose council tax band had increased by more than one band;
- c) i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y gronfa ysgolion bach; c) increase provision for the small school fund;
- d) i gynyddu'r arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd; d) increase funding for rail services;
- e) i gynyddu'r arian ar gyfer prifysgolion; e) increase funding for universities;
- f) i sicrhau na fydd myfyrwyr prifysgol o Gymru sy'n astudio yng Nghymru'n talu f) ensure that Welsh university students studying in Wales will not pay top-up fees;

ffioedd ychwanegol; ac

and

g) i sefydlu pwyllgor i graffu ar drefniadau ariannu ysgolion.

g) establish a committee to scrutinise the funding of schools.

Yr ydym wedi cynnig gwelliant cynhwysfawr i adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog. Yr ydych wedi clywed am adroddiad y Prif Weinidog o safbwynt y Llywodraeth, ond mae'n bwysig i bobl Cymru hefyd gael cyfle i wrando ar yr wrthddadl i hynny, ac fe dynnwn sylw at nifer o bethau y teimlwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi methu â'u cyflawni yn ystod y flwyddyn—pethau sy'n dal heb eu cyflawni. Byddaf yn tynnu sylw hefyd at rai o'r pethau da y credwn sydd wedi digwydd yn sgîl pleidleisiau yn y Cynulliad ar y gyllideb ac ar ffioedd dysgu i fyfyrwyr.

We have proposed a comprehensive amendment to the First Minister's report. You have heard the First Minister's report from the Government's perspective, but it is important for the people of Wales to have an opportunity to hear the counter-argument to that, and we will draw their attention to several things which we feel the Government has failed to achieve during the year—things that are still waiting to be achieved. I will also highlight some of the good things which we believe have happened as a result of votes in the Assembly on the budget and on student top-up fees.

Teimlwn ei bod yn bwysig bod pobl Cymru yn cael y darlun cyflawn. Mater i bobl Cymru yw penderfynu pa un o'r ddau ddarlun sy'n eu cael eu rhoi heddiw y maent yn ei ystyried sy'n gywir, ond y bobl eu hunain ym Mai 2007 fydd â'r ateb terfynol a'r farn derfynol ar record y Llywodraeth a'r addewidion sy'n cael eu gosod gan lywodraethau sy'n ystyried eu hunain yn rhai amgen.

We feel it is important that the people of Wales should have the full picture. It is a matter for the people of Wales to decide which of the pictures set out today they consider to be true, but the people themselves will have the final response and the final view on the Government's record, and pledges that are made by governments that consider themselves to be alternative governments, in May 2007.

Tynnaf sylw yn gyntaf at un peth y credaf oedd yn arwyddocaol yn ystod y flwyddyn, sef methiant y Llywodraeth i wireddu ei haddewidion ei hunan. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at y gostyngiad yn y rhestrau aros tymor hir, ond nid yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell ac nid yw'n ein hatgoffa o'r addewid a wnaed yn 1999, sef na fyddai neb yn disgwyl mwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad allanol nac yn disgwyl mwy na 18 mis am apwyntiad mewnol. Gwyddom fod 70,000 o bobl bellach yn disgwyl ar y rhestr aros. Nid yw'n tynnu ein sylw at hynny wrth gwrs, nag ychwaith at y ffaith y bydd yn anodd iddynt gyrraedd eu targedu eu hunain.

I draw attention first to one area which I think has been significant during the year, namely the Government's failure to carry out its own pledges. The Minister referred to the reduction in long-term waiting lists, but he does not go far enough, and he does not remind us of the pledge made in 1999 that no-one would wait more than six months for an out-patient appointment, or more than 18 months for an in-patient appointment. We know that 70,000 people are now on that list. He is not drawing our attention to that, of course, nor to the fact that it will be difficult for them to achieve their own targets.

Sylweddolwn fod rhywfaint o welliant wedi digwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond mae cryn ffordd i fynd, hyd yn oed o'i gymharu â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr. Cyfeiriodd eisoes at y methiant i gyflawni'r addewid ar ofal cartref i'r anabl. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at y ffaith y bydd pob ysgol yn cael y cyfle i gynnig brecwastau am ddim, ond yr addewid

We realise there has been some improvement in the health service, but there is a long way to go, even as compared with what is happening in England. He has already referred to the failure to deliver on the pledge on free home care for the disabled. He also referred to the fact that every school will have the opportunity to offer free breakfasts,

oedd y byddai hynny ar gael i bob plentyn ym mhob ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru, ac ni fydd hynny'n digwydd.

Gwyddom hefyd fod problemau difrifol yn y gwasanaeth deintyddol. Yr oedd yn cydnabod hynny i raddau, ond mae'n bwysig i ni bwysleisio'r addewid gwreiddiol, sef y byddai pawb yn cael mynediad i ddeintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd o fewn cyrraedd i'w cartrefi erbyn 2001. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd, ac nid yw'n debygol o ddigwydd erbyn 2007. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn fod pobl yn Ynys Môn yn gorfod teithio 50 milltir neu fwy i gael gwasanaeth. Yn aml, maent yn methu hyd yn oed a chael mynediad i wasanaeth brys. Gwyddom hefyd y bu methiannau o ran cynyddu'r nifer o fyfyrwyr sy'n mynychu colegau addysg bellach.

Other matters that cause us concern include the fact that the substantial financial shortfall in the NHS could lead to cuts in health services and will affect the recruitment and retention of health professionals. What is surprising is that, although there is a clear acknowledgment that between 1999 and 2007, the amount of money going into the health service will have doubled, Wales has some of the worst waiting lists in Europe—they are substantially worse than those in England and Scotland. Although there has been some improvement, there is a very long way to go.

There is also the lack of what I would describe as a coherent strategy to meet the economic challenges that face Wales. It is now clear that, despite the Government's record, we have a situation wherein Wales has qualified for convergence funding for the second time. Although the Government recognises that as a success, it is the Government's failure that has led us to be in a position whereby we have qualified for the second time. We hope that the Government will make a better fist of it the second time around, although, of course, we sincerely hope that this Government will not have to administer it for the majority of the programme's life.

Finally, there were successes during this year, not as a result of what the Government did, but as a result of what we were able to

but the pledge was that this would be available to every child in every primary school in Wales, and that will not happen.

We also know that there are some serious problems in the dentistry service. He acknowledged that to some extent, but it is important to emphasise the original pledge, namely that everyone would have access to an NHS dentist within easy reach of their homes by 2001. That has not happened, and it is not likely to happen by 2007. I am very aware that people on Anglesey have to travel 50 miles or more to receive dentistry services. Often, they even fail to access an emergency dentistry service. We also know that there have been failures in terms of increasing the number of students attending further education colleges.

Ymhlith y materion eraill sy'n peri pryder inni mae'r ffaith y gallai'r diffyg ariannol sylweddol yn y GIG arwain at doriadau mewn gwasanaethau iechyd a fydd yn effeithio ar recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd. Er bod cydnabyddiaeth glir bod yr arian a neilltuir i'r gwasanaeth iechyd rhwng 1999 a 2007 wedi dyblu, yr hyn sy'n peri syndod yw'r ffaith bod gan Gymru rai o'r rhestrau aros gwaethaf yn Ewrop—maent yn waeth o lawer na rhestrau Lloegr a'r Alban. Er bod rhywfaint o gwelliant, mae ffordd hir iawn i fynd.

Mae prinder hefyd yn yr hyn a ddisgrifiwn fel strategaeth gydlynus i ateb yr heriau economaidd sy'n wynebu Cymru. Er gwaethaf record y Llywodraeth, mae bellach yn glir bod gennym sefyllfa lle mae Cymru'n gymwys i gael arian cydgyfeiriant am yr eildro. Er i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod hynny fel llwyddiant, mae'r ffaith ein bod mewn sefyllfa lle yr ydym yn gymwys am yr eildro yn fethiant ar ran y Llywodraeth. Ein gobaith yw y bydd y Llywodraeth yn llwyddo'n well y tro nesaf, er ein bod yn gobeithio'n fawr, wrth gwrs, na fydd yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon ei gweinyddu am y rhan fwyaf o oes y rhaglen.

Yn olaf, cafwyd llwyddiannau yn ystod y flwyddyn hon, nid o ganlyniad i'r hyn a wnaeth y Llywodraeth, ond o ganlyniad i'r

achieve. The opposition parties, including Plaid Cymru, were able to tell the Government that its commitment not to have top-up fees should not only apply to this Assembly term, but should apply to all the students in Wales attending colleges. We were able to secure that for the students of Wales, together with several other initiatives to help pensioners with their council taxes and to ensure increased funding for universities and so on. Therefore, in a sense, we expect the Government to recognise those successes, but also the fact that the real judgment will come in May 2007.

Michael German: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the ditching of the Assembly Government's promise to scrap homecare charges for disabled people.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the shambolic manner of the merging of certain Assembly sponsored public bodies with the Assembly Government.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

welcomes the reduction in waiting times over 12 months but notes that the length of waiting times for many patients are still unacceptably long.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the paucity of policies contained in the First Minister's programme of government when two of his top five 'most notable achievements' have happened through the actions of others.

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to give greater priority to infrastructure

hyn a wnaed gennym ni. Bu modd i'r gwrthbleidiau, gan gynnwys Plaid Cymru, ddweud wrth y Llywodraeth na ddylai ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i wrthwynebu ffioedd ychwanegol fod yn gyfyngedig i'r tymor Cynulliad hwn yn unig, ond y dylai fod yn berthnasol i bob myfyrwr yng Nghymru sy'n astudio mewn colegau. Bu modd inni sicrhau hynny ar gyfer myfyrwr Cymru ynghyd â llawer menter arall i helpu pensiynwyr gyda'u treth gyngor, ac i sicrhau cynnydd yn yr arian i brifysgolion, ac yn y blaen. Felly, mewn ffordd, disgwyliwn i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod y llwyddiannau hynny, ond hefyd y ffaith mai ym mis Mai 2007 y daw'r barnu go iawn.

Michael German: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnu ar eu haddewid i ddiddymu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r diffyg trefn yn y broses o uno cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad penodol â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn croesawu'r gostyngiad mewn amseroedd aros dros gyfnod o 12 mis ond yn nodi bod llawer o gleifion yn dal i orfod aros am gyfnodau annerbyniol o hir.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r prinder polisiau yn rhaglen lywodraethu'r Prif Weinidog pan fo dau o'i bump 'cyflawniad mwyaf nodedig' wedi digwydd drwy weithredoedd pobl eraill.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i brosiectau seilwaith,

(particularly transport) projects in the next round of European structural funding.

It is interesting to look at what the First Minister claims to be the top five most notable achievements of the year. Two of those have come about through the actions of others. As Ieuan Wyn Jones just said, Wales has qualified for seven more years of European funding, but that should not be seen as a badge of honour; it is a sign of the fact that we qualified for that funding because we are a poor area in need of assistance. I fail to understand how that can be seen as a notable achievement. We got there because we were below the magic line, which states that we are below the average for the entire EU.

4.00 p.m.

As for the Government of Wales Bill, I remind the First Minister that he initially backed the Richard commission. I, like others, was there when he said it. He backed the proposals of the Richard commission, but then he changed his mind because he had to come to a Welsh Labour compromise with his colleagues in London. He has ended up giving far too much power in the Bill to the Secretary of State for Wales. To be fair, it is Peter Hain who has guided that compromise through this proposal, and not the Assembly Government.

Another of the First Minister's notable achievements of the year is what he refers to as a successful programme of mergers. In terms of certain Assembly sponsored public bodies, this process has been more shambolic than successful. The merger of the Welsh Language Board has now been postponed, after the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport got himself into a tangled mess. Last year, he wanted a Bill to establish a regulator. Then, he decided that he did not. He then said that one was needed, but that he was in no rush. Now, he has been forced to postpone the merger in the face of the opposition. The handling of the Arts Council of Wales merger was also shambolic with regard to the six major companies. A popular and successful chair was removed from his place in the teeth of opposition from the entire board, and he put forward

(a phrosiectau trafnidiaeth yn benodol) yn rownd nesaf cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop.

Mae'n ddiddorol edrych ar bum llwyddiant pennaf y flwyddyn yn ôl yr hyn a honna'r Prif Weinidog. Mae dau o'r rheini wedi dod yn sgîl gweithredoedd eraill. Fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, mae Cymru wedi bod yn gymwys i gael arian Ewropeaidd am saith mlynedd arall, ond ni ddylid edrych ar hynny fel clod; mae'n arwydd o'r ffaith ein bod yn gymwys i gael yr arian hwnnw oherwydd ein bod yn ardal dlawd sydd ag angen cymorth. Ni allaf ddeall sut y gellir ystyried hynny'n llwyddiant nodedig. Mae i'w briodoli i'r ffaith ein bod islaw'r llinell allweddol honno sy'n dweud ein bod islaw cyfartaledd yr UE gyfan.

O ran Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, hoffwn atgoffa'r Prif Weinidog iddo gefnogi comisiwn Richard yn wreiddiol. Yr oeddwn i, ymysg eraill, yno pan ddywedodd hynny. Cefnogodd gynigion comisiwn Richard, ond yna newidiodd ei feddwl am ei fod wedi gorfod cyfaddawdu â'i gyd-aelodau yn Llundain ynghylch Llafur Cymru. Yn y pen draw, mae wedi rhoi llawer gormod o bŵer yn y Mesur i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. I fod yn deg, Peter Hain sydd wedi llywio'r cyfaddawd hwnnw drwy'r cynnig hwn, nid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Un o lwyddiannau nodedig eraill y Prif Weinidog dros y flwyddyn yw'r hyn y mae'n ei galw'n rhaglen uno lwyddiannus. O ran rhai cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, bu'r broses hon yn fwy o draed moch nag o lwyddiant. Gohiriwyd y broses o uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, ar ôl i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon fynd i drafferth. Y llynedd, yr oedd am gael Mesur i sefydlu rheoleiddiwr. Yna, newidiodd ei feddwl. Yna dywedodd fod angen un, ond nad oedd unrhyw frys. Bellach, mae wedi gorfod gohirio'r broses o uno oherwydd gwrthwynebiad y gwrthbleidiau. Yr oedd y modd yr aed i'r afael â'r broses o uno Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru hefyd yn draed moch o ran y chwe phrif gwmni. Diswyddwyd cadeirydd poblogaidd a llwyddiannus er gwaethaf gwrthwynebiad y bwrdd cyfan, a

proposals without consultation with the arts sector. I do not recall any Minister in the last two decades—whether from Government in London or the National Assembly—who has managed to make the Welsh language a political hot potato. What all political parties here have sought to do is keep it away from that political-hot-potato agenda and make it something on which we can achieve political consensus.

The new Assembly building is a proud achievement, and it is great that Wales now has a parliamentary building to be proud of. However, some of us remember the alternative proposal made by the First Minister for a greenhouse on stilts, which would have been in the car park. Gladly, the Assembly as a whole rejected that, and the success of this building has been down to the overwhelming majority in favour of it in the National Assembly.

We have broken promises to look at in here—of course we do.

‘We promised to rule out Top Up fees in Welsh universities for this Assembly Term.’

What was meant by that was that it promised to rule out top-up fees for one year only. It was the opposition parties that forced upon the Government the better position for tuition fees and support for Welsh students at Welsh universities.

‘We promised to provide the funding for all primary school children to have free breakfasts.’

The pledge was to provide all primary school children with free breakfasts, but that was revised in this report to:

‘All primary schools will be offered the opportunity to take part’.

I will repeat it, because the Minister keeps saying that what is written in the Labour manifesto are not her words. I will therefore repeat them. It says that Labour will:

chyflwynodd gynigion heb ymgynghori â sector y celfyddydau. Ni chofiaf yr un Gweinidog dros y ddau ddegawd diwethaf—o’r Llywodraeth yn Llundain na’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—a lwyddodd i wneud yr iaith Gymraeg yn bwnc llosg gwleidyddol. Yr hyn y mae pob plaid wleidyddol wedi ceisio’i wneud yw cadw’r mater allan o’r agenda honno o bynciau llosg a’i wneud yn rhywbeth y gellir dod i gytundeb gwleidyddol yn ei gylch.

Mae adeilad newydd y Cynulliad yn llwyddiant ardderchog, ac mae’n wych bod gan Gymru bellach adeilad seneddol y gallwn fod yn falch ohono. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhai ohonom yn cofio’r cynnig gwahanol a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog i gael tŷ gwydr ar stiltiau, a fyddai wedi bod yn y maes parcio. Gwrthodwyd hynny gan y Cynulliad yn ei gyfanrwydd, diolch byth, ac mae llwyddiant yr adeilad hwn yn ganlyniad i’r mwyafir llethol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a oedd o’i blaid.

Mae yna addewidion na chadwyd i’w hystyried yma, wrth gwrs.

‘Gwnaethom addewid i ddileu Ffioedd Atodol mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn ystod y tymor hwn yn oes y Cynulliad.’

Golyga hynny mai dim ond am flwyddyn yr addawodd beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd atodol. Y gwrthbleidiau a wthiodd y sefyllfa well ar y Llywodraeth o ran ffioedd dysgu a chymorth i fyfyrwyr o Gymru mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru.

‘Gwnaethom addewid i ddarparu’r arian i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd gael brecwast am ddim.’

Yr addewid oedd rhoi brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd, ond diwygiwyd hynny yn yr adroddiad hwn i:

‘Caiff pob ysgol gynradd gynnig y cyfle i gymryd rhan’.

Hoffwn ailadrodd hyn, oherwydd mae’r Gweinidog yn mynnu nad ei geiriau hi yw’r hyn a nodir ym maniffesto’r Blaid Lafur. Hoffwn eu hailadrodd felly. Mae’n dweud y bydd Llafur:

‘Provide for all primary school children to have free breakfasts in school’.

‘Yn darparu bod pob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd yn cael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol’.

That is revised to:

Diwygiwyd hynny i:

‘All primary schools will be offered the opportunity to take part by January 2007’.

‘Caiff pob ysgol gynradd gynnig y cyfle i gymryd rhan erbyn mis Ionawr 2007’.

That is the change, and that is not what it said in the election campaign.

Dyna’r newid, ac nid dyna a ddywedwyd yn yr ymgyrch etholiadol.

Small and rural schools are listed here as an achievement. It states the commitment to:

Dywedir yma bod ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig yn llwyddiant. Mae’n nodi’r ymrwymiad i:

‘Invest to tackle the problems of small and rural schools’.

‘Buddsoddi er mwyn mynd i’r afael â phroblemau ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig’.

Who was it that made the Government face the reality that that fund was being ill used and had to be put back and reinstated? It was the opposition parties during the budget round. It was not a Government achievement. I do not mind the Government taking credit for things that it says it has done and can do, but I do object when it takes credit for things that were not its responsibility.

Pwy a orfododd y Llywodraeth i wynebu’r realiti nad oedd yr arian hwnnw’n cael ei ddefnyddio’n effeithiol, a bod rhaid ei ddychwelyd a’i adfer? Y gwrthbleidiau a wnaeth hynny yn ystod cylch y gyllideb. Nid cyflawniad gan y Llywodraeth oedd hyn. Nid wyf yn malio fod y Llywodraeth yn cael y clod am bethau y dywed iddi eu gwneud ac y gall eu gwneud, ond yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu pan fydd yn cael y clod am bethau nad oedd yn gyfrifol amdanynt.

There is also the issue of school buildings. The First Minister accepts that his promise was to find the money, but he does not accept that, as part of his promise—and this appears in both its manifesto and in its better plan for Wales—he said that every school in Wales would be fit for purpose by 2010. We now know that that will not happen, and most local authorities believe that it will not happen until 2012, or even 2015 in some cases. No authorities in Wales will reach their fit-for-purpose targets by 2010; that was the verdict heard in recent days.

Hoffwn sôn am adeiladau ysgolion hefyd. Mae’r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn mai ef a addawodd ddod o hyd i’r arian, ond nid yw’n derbyn iddo ddweud, fel rhan o’i adnewid—ac mae hyn yn ymddangos yn ei fanifesto ac yn ei gynllun gwella ar gyfer Cymru—y byddai pob ysgol yng Nghymru yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. Gwyddom bellach na fydd hynny’n digwydd, a chred y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol na fydd yn digwydd tan 2012, neu 2015 hyd yn oed mewn rhai achosion. Ni fydd unrhyw awdurdod yng Nghymru yn cyrraedd ei dargedau addas at y diben erbyn 2010; dyna oedd y dyfarniad a glywyd yn ddiweddar.

Finally, there has been an increase of 2.9 per cent in export growth. That can certainly be seen as an increase, but when you contrast that with the 9.1 per cent for the UK as a whole, you see that our increase cannot be matched in that direction.

Yn olaf, cafwyd cynnydd o 2.9 y cant mewn twf allforio. Gellir gweld hynny fel cynnydd yn bendant, ond o’i gyferbynnu â’r 9.1 y cant ar gyfer y DU gyfan, gwelwch na ellir cymharu ein cynnydd ni yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

The First Minister said that this report was packed with progress, but when we first saw it, we thought that it was more like a postcard. I think that it should be stamped and returned to sender.

Nick Bourne: I propose amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

and further notes the failure to honour key pledges in Labour's 2003 Assembly election manifesto.

The First Minister's annual report is a considerable work of fiction. He deserves a degree in creative writing and I think that this report should be shortlisted for Richard and Judy's Summer Read 2006. The Government is either deluding itself or it is shamelessly trying to delude the Welsh people.

The mini glossy version that is going out to post offices, citizens' advice bureaux and doctors' surgeries, with smiling close-ups of Cabinet members—although I am not sure whether that is a vote winner or not—is nothing short of propaganda. It is funny that this is the first time that the Government has decided to send out the First Minister's annual report in this way. Cynics might say that it is because an election is looming. It is blatant electioneering. Will opposition parties be able to produce a more balanced version to be distributed at taxpayers' expense? I rather doubt it.

For example, the First Minister referred to the ditching of the free home care for the disabled pledge. True enough, it is in the large version; but is it in the smaller glossy version that will be given to electors in post offices, surgeries and citizens' advice bureaux? You bet your sweet life that it is not. This really is a tired Government desperate to take political advantage, lacking in vision, and out of ideas. Let me take the First Minister's 'most notable achievements' of the year in the full-length report in turn.

The first is hospital waiting lists. The fact

Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog fod yr adroddiad hwn yn llawn cynnydd, ond pan welsom ef am y tro cyntaf yr oedd yn edrych mwy fel cerdyn post i ni. Credaf y dylid rhoi stamp arno a'i ddychwelyd at yr anfonwr.

Nick Bourne: Cynigiai welliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

ac yn nodi yn ogystal â hyn y methiant i gyflawni addewidion allweddol maniffesto Llafur ar gyfer etholiad y Cynulliad yn 2003.

Darn o ffuglen sylweddol yw adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog. Mae'n haeddu gradd mewn ysgrifennu creadigol, a chredaf y dylid rhoi'r adroddiad hwn ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer cystadleuaeth Richard and Judy's Summer Read 2006. Mae'r Llywodraeth naill ai'n twyllo'i hun neu'n ddigywilydd yn ceisio twyllo pobl Cymru.

Propaganda llwyr yw'r fersiwn fach sgleiniog sy'n cael ei dosbarthu i swyddfeydd post, canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth a meddygfeydd, gyda lluniau agos o aelodau'r Cabinet yn gwenu—er nad wyf yn siŵr a fydd hynny'n ennill pleidleisiau neu beidio. Mae'n ddoniol mai dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r Llywodraeth benderfynu dosbarthu adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog fel hyn. Gallai sinigiai ddweud mai oherwydd bod etholiad ar y gweill y gwneir hyn. Lecsiyna llwyr ydyw. A fydd y gwrthbleidiau'n gallu llunio fersiwn fwy cytbwys i'w dosbarthu ar draul trethdalwyr? Yr wyf yn amau braidd.

Er enghraifft, cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at gefnu ar yr addewid i ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl. Mae'n wir fod hyn yn ymddangos yn y fersiwn fawr; ond a yw yn y fersiwn fach sgleiniog a roddir i etholwyr mewn swyddfeydd post, meddygfeydd a chanolfannau cyngor ar bopeth? Dim gobaith. Llywodraeth flinedig sydd yma sy'n rhy awyddus i gymryd mantais wleidyddol, nad oes ganddi ddigon o weledigaeth, ac nad oes syniadau ganddi mwyach. Hoffwn gyfeirio at 'gyflawniadau mwyaf nodedig' y flwyddyn gan y Prif Weinidog yn yr adroddiad llawn yn eu tro.

Rhestrau aros ysbytai yw'r cyntaf. Mae'n dal

remains that waiting lists are still far higher than they were when the Assembly was established in 1999. Targets are still behind those set in England. Labour broke its manifesto promise on waiting lists in the first Assembly, which has not been referred to in the annual report, and people still have unacceptably long waits. It is incredible really that Labour expects a pat on the back for this.

The second of the 'notable achievements' is European funding. The GDP gap between Wales and the UK remains as wide as ever. As has been stated, the fact that Wales has qualified for convergence funding alongside new EU eastern European countries is hardly a valiant success; it is a magnificent failure. Our GDP in west Wales and the Valleys is on a par with that of Slovakia and Slovenia. To make matters worse, the First Minister has refused to go to Gordon Brown to seek extra money to secure matched funding.

As has been stated, the mergers programme is the third notable success. To call this 'A successful programme of mergers' would be laughable if it were not so serious. The way in which the Government treated the heads of the organisations to be brought within the Assembly Government—and the First Minister will know that we backed it in relation to Education and Learning Wales and the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales—was deplorable. Business leaders have heavily criticised the Government's centralising policy. As has been stated, the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport has alienated the arts community with the shambolic handling of the arts council, and he has treated the Welsh language appallingly in the botched merger of the Welsh Language Board, which has now had to be delayed. Again, no mention is made of that in the glossy version of the report.

The Government of Wales Bill was also referred to as a notable achievement. First, it is a Westminster piece of legislation, but I remember the First Minister's response to the Richard commission report—he was proud of his nation, and he wanted the Richard report hook, line and sinker. What we have is a

yn wir fod rhestrau aros yn dal lawer yn uwch na phan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad yn 1999. Nid yw'r targedau eto wedi cyrraedd y rhai a bennwyd yn Lloegr. Torrodd Llafur ei haddewid maniffesto ar restrau aros yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, na chyfeirir ato yn yr adroddiad blynyddol, ac mae pobl yn dal i orfod aros am gyfnod annerbyniol o hir. Rhaid dweud ei bod yn anghredadwy fod Llafur yn disgwyl canmoliaeth am hyn.

Arian Ewropeaidd yw'r ail 'gyflawniad nodedig'. Erys y bwlch CMC rhwng Cymru a'r DU mor fawr ag erioed. Fel y dywedwyd, nid yw'r ffaith fod Cymru'n gymwys i gael arian cydgyfeirio ynghyd â gwledydd newydd yr UE yn nwyrain Ewrop yn llwyddiant mawr; methiant godidog ydyw. Mae ein CMC yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yr un fath â CMC Slofacia a Slofenia. I wneud pethau'n waeth, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gwrthod mynd at Gordon Brown i ofyn am arian ychwanegol i sicrhau arian cyfatebol.

Fel y dywedwyd, y rhaglen uno yw'r trydydd llwyddiant nodedig. Byddai galw hon yn 'rhaglen uno lwyddiannus' yn chwerrthinllyd oni bai ei fod yn fater mor ddifrifol. Mae'r modd y bu i'r Llywodraeth drin penaethiaid y sefydliadau sydd i ddod o dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—a bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwybod inni gefnogi hyn mewn perthynas â Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru—yn warthus. Mae arweinwyr busnes wedi beirniadu polisi canoli'r Llywodraeth yn llym. Fel y dywedwyd, mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon wedi dieithrio cymuned y celfyddydau oherwydd y diffyg trefn wrth ymdrin â'r cyngor celfyddydau, ac mae wedi trin yr iaith Gymraeg yn warthus yn yr ymgais aflwyddiannus i uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, sydd wedi gorfod cael ei gohirio bellach. Unwaith eto, ni chyfeirir at hyn o gwbl yn y fersiwn sgleiniog o'r adroddiad.

Cyfeiriwyd at Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd fel llwyddiant nodedig. I ddechrau, deddfwriaeth San Steffan ydyw, ond cofiaf ymateb y Prif Weinidog i adroddiad comisiwn Richard—yr oedd yn falch o'i genedl, ac yr oedd yn bendant o blaid holl adroddiad Richard, bob darn ohono. Yr hyn a

piece of legislation that has been cobbled together, it is papering over the cracks of a divided Labour Party, using spiteful measures to stop constituency candidates from standing on regional lists, and the d'Hondt system for committees, which is designed to entrench the Labour Party. It grants powers by the back door through Orders in Council, when what we need is a referendum to provide a clear way forward on whether we should have full legislative powers. Instead of settling the constitutional questions for a generation, Labour has given us a recurring nightmare.

Of the top 10 commitments, the free homecare charge for the disabled has been dropped, and free school breakfasts have a take-up rate of just 4.2 per cent. In the economic section, there is no mention of the missed GDP target of 90 per cent of the UK average. In the part on education, there is nothing on the 2,000 teenagers leaving school each year without qualifications.

We are used to this rubbish from the First Minister but, with this year's annual report, you cannot even read between the lines to get the picture. You need to rip it up and start again—and we should do the same with this Government.

Christine Chapman: I will make just a few comments about the annual report. I will focus particularly on aspects of economic development, which is a massive priority for my constituency of Cynon valley, as it is for other Valleys areas.

4.10 p.m.

First, the securing of the convergence programme for west Wales and the Valleys is welcome. As the report says, almost £1.5 billion of structural funds money has been invested under the current programme, and it is crucial that its successor strategically builds upon the foundations that have been laid. I am interested in how this new programme will dovetail with the Heads of the Valleys programme to get the maximum

gawsom yw deddfwriaeth wedi ei thaflu ynghyd sy'n cuddio anghytundebau Plaid Lafur ranedig, gan ddefnyddio camau maleisus i rwystro ymgeiswyr etholaethau rhag sefyll ar restrau rhanbarthol, a system d'Hondt ar gyfer pwyllgorau wedi ei chynllunio i ddiogelu'r Blaid Lafur. Mae'n cyflwyno pwerau drwy'r drws cefn drwy Orchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, ond yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw refferendwm i roi ffordd glir ymlaen ar y cwestiwn a ddylem gael pwerau deddfu llawn. Yn hytrach nag ateb cwestiynau cyfansoddiadol am genhedlaeth, mae Llafur wedi rhoi hunllef inni sy'n dod yn ôl ac yn ôl.

O'r 10 prif ymrwymiad, cefnwyd ar y tâl gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl, a dim ond 4.2 y cant o ddisgyblion sy'n cael brechwast yn yr ysgol am ddim. Yn yr adran economaidd, ni chyfeirir at y targed CMC o 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU y methwyd ei gyrraedd. Yn y rhan ar addysg, ni chyfeirir at y 2,000 o bobl ifanc yn eu harddegau sy'n gadael yr ysgol bob blwyddyn heb gymwysterau.

Yr ydym wedi arfer clywed lol o'r fath gan y Prif Weinidog, ond gyda'r adroddiad blynyddol eleni ni allwch ddarllen rhwng y llinellau hyd yn oed i gael y darlun. Mae angen ei dorri'n ddarnau a dechrau eto—a dylem wneud yr un peth â'r Llywodraeth hon.

Christine Chapman: Hoffwn wneud rhai sylwadau am yr adroddiad blynyddol. Byddaf yn canolbwyntio'n benodol ar agweddau ar ddatblygu economaidd, sy'n flaenoriaeth hollbwysig ar gyfer fy etholaeth i yng nghwm Cynon, fel ar gyfer ardaloedd eraill yn y Cymoedd.

Yn gyntaf, croesewir y ffaith fod y rhaglen gydgyfeirio wedi'i sicrhau ar gyfer y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, buddsodwyd bron £1.5 biliwn o arian cronfeydd strwythurol o dan y rhaglen bresennol, ac mae'n hanfodol i'r rhaglen olynol adeiladu'n strategol ar y sylfeini a osodwyd. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y ffordd y bydd y rhaglen newydd hon yn cydblethu â rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd i

results from these two cash injections.

I have raised this with you, First Minister, in the Chamber, as well as in meetings I have had with Patrick Lewis, the Heads of the Valleys programme director. Both these programmes will be strategically driven, and I am keen to see how closely the people involved will be working together. This week, we have had the publication of the Beecham report, which has endorsed the Assembly Government's collaborative approach to public services. The Heads of the Valleys programme is a good example of how local authorities are starting to work closer together. Can you give an assurance, First Minister, that this momentum is not allowed to slip, as there is a huge amount at stake for these communities?

Secondly, I will remind you of some statistics for areas such as Rhondda Cynon Taf. We know that there is a huge challenge for us in the Heads of the Valleys area. However, although it is a long-term process, things are changing for the better. I was pleased to note that, between 2001 and 2006, the economic activity rate in Rhondda Cynon Taf has risen from 68 per cent to 73 per cent; in the same period, the number of people in employment has risen by 6,000, and the gross weekly wage is up from £298 to £358. There is still much to do, but we are making progress.

The approach to economic development in areas such as the Cynon valley is twofold. First, we need to exploit fully its proximity to the capital region, and the economic growth that has been experienced in and around Cardiff. Many people in my constituency rely on public transport to travel to work in Cardiff, and I want to ensure that Arriva, for example, puts on enough carriages during its peak morning services. I have had meetings with Arriva on this, and we have seen some progress on getting better rail services to the Valleys. However, again, it is about ensuring that we are getting the best quality services for people in my area. I register this with the First Minister as an important priority for areas such as mine.

sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau posibl o'r ddau chwistrelliad hyn o arian.

Yr wyf wedi codi hyn gyda chi, Brif Weinidog, yn y Siambr, yn ogystal ag mewn cyfarfodydd a gefais gyda Patrick Lewis, cyfarwyddwr rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Caiff y ddwy raglen eu rheoli'n strategol, ac yr wyf yn awyddus i weld pa mor agos y bydd y bobl dan sylw yn cydweithio. Yr wythnos hon, cyhoeddwyd adroddiad Beecham, sydd wedi ategu dull cydweithredol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad tuag at wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn enghraifft dda o'r modd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn dechrau cydweithio'n agosach. A allwch ein sicrhau, Brif Weinidog, na chaniateir i'r momentwm hwn gael ei golli, gan fod cymaint yn y fantol i'r cymunedau hyn?

Yn ail, hoffwn eich atgoffa o rai ystadegau ar gyfer ardaloedd fel Rhondda Cynon Taf. Gwyddom ein bod yn wynebu her anferth yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, er mai proses hirdymor yw hon, mae pethau'n newid er gwell. Yr oeddwn yn falch o sylwi, rhwng 2001 a 2006, fod y gyfradd gweithgarwch economaidd yn Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi codi o 68 y cant i 73 y cant; yn ystod yr un cyfnod, mae nifer y bobl mewn cyflogaeth wedi codi 6,000, ac mae'r cyflog wythnosol gros wedi cynyddu o £298 i £358. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto, ond yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd.

Mae'r ymagwedd at ddatblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd fel cwm Cynon yn un ddeublyg. I ddechrau, mae angen inni fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y ffaith ei bod mor agos o ardal y brifddinas, a'r twf economaidd a gafwyd yng Nghaerdydd a'r cyffiniau. Mae nifer o bobl yn fy etholaeth yn dibynnu ar gludiant cyhoeddus i deithio i'r gwaith yng Nghaerdydd, ac yr wyf am sicrhau bod Arriva, er enghraifft, yn darparu digon o gerbydau trên ar gyfer ei wasanaethau yn ystod yr oriau brig yn y bore. Yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd gydag Arriva am hyn, a gwelwyd rhywfaint o gynnydd i gael gwasanaethau rheilffordd gwell yn y Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, unwaith eto, mae a wnelo hyn â sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwasanaethau o'r safon uchaf i bobl yn fy ardal i. Nodaf hyn fel blaenoriaeth bwysig i'r

Prif Weinidog ar gyfer ardaloedd fel fy ardal i.

However, we cannot rely on the Cardiff economy alone; we must build up the Valleys as sustainable communities in their own right. Much of this is about raising aspirations, and doing away with the perception that, to get on in life, you need some kind of passport out of the Valleys. Although I know that there is progress going on, sometimes, when you talk to people, they say that they do not always believe that things are going to happen. Therefore, again, it is about continuing the messages and ensuring that we work on this momentum. Establishing sufficient employment opportunities is key to achieving this, as well as raising the general skills make-up in order to attract inward investment.

Finally, I will mention a good example of what has happened in my area over the last few years. As you know, First Minister, this is to do with the ongoing regeneration of the Phurnacite plant in the Cynon valley. This was symbolised by the £12 million-worth investment made by the Welsh Assembly Government to transform that former Phurnacite plant from a derelict site. Work is now going on to look at the after-use of the site and to regenerate the area; it is desperately in need of that. I am pleased with the progress so far, but we must continue the good work.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am obliged to Christine for not taking up her five minutes. Many Members wish to speak and it would be useful if Members who can make succinct speeches do so. However, this is an important debate, so people may take five minutes if they wish. We have another important debate after that, so we will probably need an extension, and after that, there is the short debate.

Helen Mary Jones: I found my contribution to this debate rather difficult to prepare. In reading the First Minister's annual report, I was so overwhelmed by the weight of self-congratulation that I ended up feeling faintly nauseated, to be honest.

Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ddibynnu ar economi Caerdydd yn unig; rhaid inni ddatblygu'r Cymoedd fel cymunedau cynaliadwy eu hunain. Mae a wnelo hyn i raddau helaeth â chynyddu dyheadau, a dileu'r syniad bod angen rhyw fath o basbort i adael y Cymoedd er mwyn llwyddo mewn bywyd. Er y gwn fod cynnydd yn digwydd, weithiau, wrth siarad â phobl, maent yn dweud nad ydynt yn credu bob amser fod pethau'n mynd i ddigwydd. Felly, unwaith eto, mae a wnelo â pharhau i gyfleu'r negeseuon a sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio ar y momentwm hwn. Mae'n allweddol inni sicrhau digon o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth i gyflawni hyn, yn ogystal â gwella sgiliau cyffredinol i ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad.

Yn olaf, hoffwn nodi enghraifft dda o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn fy ardal i dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Fel y gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, mae a wnelo hyn â'r broses barhaus o adfywio'r gwaith Phurnacite yng nghwm Cynon. Cafodd hwn ei symboleiddio gan y buddsoddiad gwerth £12 miliwn a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i drawsnewid yr hen waith Phurnacite hwnnw o fod yn safle segur. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo bellach i edrych ar ddefnyddio'r safle ar ôl y gwaith ac adfywio'r ardal; mae angen dirfawr am hynny. Yr wyf yn falch â'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma, ond rhaid inni barhau'r gwaith da.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Hoffwn ddiolch i Christine am beidio â defnyddio ei phum munud. Mae nifer o Aelodau'n dymuno siarad a byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallai'r Aelodau wneud areithiau cryno, os yw'n bosibl. Fodd bynnag, mae hon yn ddadl bwysig, felly gall pobl gymryd pum munud os dymunant. Mae gennym ddadl bwysig arall ar ôl hyn, felly mae'n debyg y bydd angen estyniad arnom, ac ar ôl hynny, ceir y ddadl fer.

Helen Mary Jones: Cefais drafferth mawr wrth baratoi fy nghyfraniad i'r ddadl hon. Wrth ddarllen adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog, dechreuais deimlo braidd yn sâl gan ei fod yn canmol ei hun gymaint, a bod yn onest.

We must begin by asking ourselves what an annual report is supposed to be. When I used to write them in the voluntary sector, and when I worked for the Equal Opportunities Commission, they were supposed to be an honest appraisal, setting out one's successes, but also admitting to one's failures and identifying the causes of them. They were supposed to set out one's plans for the following year, but they were also supposed to identify the challenges and how one was going to address them. By those criteria, this may be, as has already been said, a glossy postcard, but it is certainly not an annual report. I will try to be brief. In support of amendment 1, I only have time to refer to one or two specific issues that this report either does not deal with at all or does not deal with adequately.

The first thing that I will talk about is process. The First Minister, in his full report, talks about his way of working. There is the heading 'closer to people'—you can see what I mean about its being nauseating—and there is a lot of emphasis on consultation and involvement, all of which one would approve of. However, I am afraid that everything he says in that approach is contradicted by, for example, the experience of the Coalition on Charging in relation to the dropped promise on free homecare for the disabled. The Coalition on Charging is a coalition of voluntary organisations that represents, and is largely made up of, disabled people. It worked with the Minister for Health and Social Services and his officials on pilots for the homecare project, it was fully involved in the whole process and it was very optimistic about where it was going. At no time was it told that consideration was being given to simply abandoning the promise on homecare—it was not consulted and it certainly did not feel involved. It was simply told on the morning before the First Minister told the Assembly that the commitment was dropped. That is, frankly, a shocking way to treat disabled people and their representatives and it certainly does not fit in with the First Minister's aspiration to be closer to people. That process was almost as shocking as the broken promise itself—others have referred to that—but this report gives no account, and neither has the First Minister today, of how

Rhaid inni ddechrau drwy ofyn beth yw pwrpas adroddiadau blynyddol. Pan fyddwn yn eu hysgrifennu yn y sector gwirfoddol, a phan oeddwn yn gweithio i'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, yr oeddent i fod yn arfarniad gonest, yn pennu llwyddiant yr unigolyn, ond hefyd yn cydnabod ei fethiannau ac yn nodi'r achosion drostynt. Yr oeddent i fod i bennu cynlluniau'r unigolyn am y flwyddyn ganlynol, ond yr oeddent hefyd i fod i nodi'r heriau a sut y byddai dyn yn mynd i'r afael â hwy. Yn ôl y meini prawf hynny, gallai hwn fod yn gerdyn post sgleiniog, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, ond yn sicr nid adroddiad blynyddol mohono. Ceisiaf fod yn gryno. I gefnogi gwelliant 1, oherwydd prinder amser, ni allaf ond cyfeirio at un neu ddau fater penodol nad yw'r adroddiad hwn yn ymdrin â hwy o gwbl neu'n ymdrin â hwy'n ddigonol.

Y peth cyntaf y soniaf amdano yw proses. Mae'r Prif Weinidog, yn ei adroddiad llawn, yn siarad am ei ffordd ef o weithio. Cyfeirir yn benodol at fod 'yn agosach at bobl'—gallwch weld yr hyn yr wyf yn ei olygu ei fod yn gyfogyd—ac mae llawer o bwyslais ar ymgynghori ac ymgysylltu y byddai pawb yn eu cymeradwyo. Fodd bynnag, mae arnaf ofn fod popeth a ddywed yn y dull hwnnw'n cael ei wrth-ddweud, er enghraifft, gan brofiad Coalition on Charging mewn perthynas â'r addewid a dorwyd ar ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl. Clymblaid o sefydliadau gwirfoddol yw Coalition on Charging sy'n cynrychioli pobl anabl, ac sy'n cynnwys pobl anabl yn bennaf. Bu'n gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'i swyddogion ar gynlluniau peilot ar gyfer y prosiect gofal cartref, bu'n ymwneud yn llwyr â'r broses gyfan ac yr oedd yn obeithiol iawn am y cyfeiriad yr oedd yn mynd. Ni ddywedwyd wrthynt o gwbl yr ystyrid rhoi'r gorau i'r addewid ar ofal cartref—nid ymgynghorwyd â hwy ac yn sicr nid oeddent yn teimlo'n rhan o'r broses. Yn syml, dywedwyd wrthynt y bore cyn i'r Prif Weinidog ddweud wrth y Cynulliad eu bod wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r addewid. Mae hynny, a dweud y gwir, yn ffordd warthus i drin pobl anabl a'u cynrychiolwyr, ac yn sicr nid yw'n cyd-fynd â dyhead y Prif Weinidog i fod yn nes at bobl. Yr oedd y broses honno bron yr un mor warthus â'r thorri'r addewid ei hun—mae

the Government came to make that promise, which it now tells us is unaffordable and which it has been forced to admit that it did not have the statutory powers to deliver anyway. In an honest annual report, you must state, when you have got something wrong, why it went wrong and how you will ensure that it will not happen again. Worst of all, the report does not apologise for that broken promise. In fairness to the Minister for Health and Social Services, he has apologised. The First Minister does not do so, and he should be thoroughly ashamed.

This report makes no reference to the state of the ambulance service in Wales, and that is no surprise. The First Minister has been very dismissive of the concerns that were raised by the former acting chief executive, and while we have a Minister for Health and Social Services who does appear to acknowledge that there is some need for concern, the First Minister's complacency has been almost breathtaking, even for him. When he suggested a couple of weeks ago in the Chamber that the reason why Roger Thyne decided not to continue in his post was because he was worn out by the commute, that was amazingly insulting. The First Minister may be feeling the pace a bit; he may be feeling the strain and he may be slowing down—perhaps that is why he is often late for things and a public embarrassment to this country—but Mr Thyne has made it very clear that he left his very lucrative post because he was asked to prioritise financial recovery plans over improving clinical performance and he could not do that in all conscience. The First Minister might do well to examine his own conscience.

Amendment 1 draws attention, as Ieuan Wyn Jones has already said, to what the Assembly has done to try to mitigate some of the worst of the Government's failures, as well as highlighting many issues that I cannot refer to today because of the lack of time. The First Minister and the Government need to show a

eraill wedi cyfeirio at hynny—ond nid yw'r adroddiad hwn yn sôn o gwbl, ac nid yw'r Prif Gweinidog wedi sôn heddiw ychwaith, am y ffordd yr aeth y Llywodraeth ati i wneud yr addewid hwnnw. Dywed wrthym yn awr na ellir ei fforddio ac iddi gael ei gorfodi i gyfaddef nad oedd ganddi'r pwerau statudol i'w wireddu yn y lle cyntaf. Mewn adroddiad blynyddol gonest, rhaid ichi ddatgan, pan aiff rhywbeth o'i le, pam yr aeth o'i le a sut y byddwch yn sicrhau na fydd yn digwydd eto. Yn waeth na hynny, nid yw'r adroddiad yn ymddiheuro am dorri'r addewid hwnnw. O ran tegwch i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae wedi ymddiheuro. Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn gwneud hynny, a dylai fod cywilydd mawr arno.

Nid yw'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio o gwbl at gyflwr y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, ac nid yw hynny'n syndod. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn ddiystyriol iawn o'r pryderon a godwyd gan y cyn brif weithredwr dros dro. Er bod gennym Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol nad ymddengys ei fod yn cydnabod bod angen pryderu, mae hunanfodddhad y Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn anhygoel, hyd yn oed iddo ef. Pan awgrymodd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl yn y Siambr mai'r rheswm pam y penderfynodd Roger Thyne beidio â pharhau yn ei swydd oedd am ei fod wedi hen flino ar gymudo, yr oedd hynny'n gwbl sarhaus. Efallai fod y Prif Weinidog yn ei chael yn anodd dal ati; efallai ei fod yn teimlo'r straen ac efallai ei fod yn arafu—efallai mai dyna'r rheswm y mae'n aml yn hwyr i bethau ac yn peri cywilydd cyhoeddus i'r wlad hon—ond dywedodd Mr Thyne yn glir iawn ei fod wedi gadael ei swydd fuddiol iawn oherwydd gofyn iddo roi blaenoriaeth i gynlluniau adfer ariannol dros y broses o wella perfformiad clinigol, ac ni allai wneud hynny mewn difrif calon. Efallai y byddai'n dda pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn ystyried ei gydwylod ei hun.

Mae gwelliant 1, fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones eisoes, yn tynnu sylw at yr hyn a wnaeth y Cynulliad i geisio lliniaru rhai o fethiannau gwaethaf y Llywodraeth, yn ogystal â phwysleisio nifer o faterion na allaf gyfeirio atynt heddiw oherwydd prinder amser. Mae angen i'r Prif Weinidog a'r

little bit of humility. This self-congratulatory report, which as Nick Bourne has already said, is being sent out to the world and her husband, invites the people of Wales—*[Interruption.]* Deputy Presiding Officer, if anyone on those benches would like to make an intervention, they are very welcome to do so, but I would hesitate to incur your wrath by responding to what they are saying from a sedentary position.

This report is self-congratulatory and it invites the people of Wales to give the First Minister and his Government a nasty lesson if he does not show some humility by next year. I am not sanguine that he will do so, and I commend amendment 1 to the Assembly.

Jeff Cuthbert: First Minister, it is clear to me that the future of our young people lies at the heart of your annual report. Equipping our youngsters with the skills to do the jobs of the future is our shared goal, and, I trust, the goal of everyone in the Chamber. At a higher policy level, the Lisbon and Gothenberg agendas, together with the UK national reform programme, linking into ‘The Learning Country 2’ and ‘WAVE’, all underline the importance of a dynamic economy with a responsive skills base. Caerphilly County Borough Council’s regeneration strategy, entitled ‘The Smart Alternative’, emphasises the importance of skills, together with smarter transport infrastructures with shorter links to markets in the mid-Valleys corridor. It seems that all levels of government agree on the problem. What remains a challenge is how we address the continuing problems that we see in our schools, our colleges and in the workplace.

4.20 p.m.

If giving our young people the skills to release their talents and true ability is our core motivation, then a more thematic approach is needed. Linking the solution of skills to the problem of inactivity, both social and economic, is hard to deliver, but the Heads of the Valleys strategy, which is an excellent strategy, could benefit from such linkages being made on a cross-cutting basis.

Llywodraeth fod ychydig yn ostyngedig. Mae'r adroddiad hunan-ganmoliaethus hwn, fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne eisoes, yn cael ei anfon i'r byd a'r betws, ac yn gwahodd pobl Cymru—*[Torri ar draws.]* Ddirprwy Lywydd, os hoffai unrhyw un ar y meinciau acw ymyrryd, mae croeso mawr iddynt wneud hynny, ond byddwn yn petruso rhag ennyn eich llid chi drwy ymateb i'r hyn a ddywedant ar eu heistedd.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn hunan-ganmoliaethus ac mae'n gwahodd pobl Cymru i ddysgu gwers greulon i'r Prif Weinidog a'i Lywodraeth os nad fydd yn dangos rhywfaint o ostyngeddwrwydd erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid wyf yn hyderus y bydd yn gwneud hynny, a chymeradwyaf welliant 1 i'r Cynulliad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Brif Weinidog, mae'n glir i mi fod dyfodol ein pobl ifanc wrth wraidd eich adroddiad blynyddol. Ein nod cyffredinol, a nod pawb yn y Siambr, mi hyderaf, yw sicrhau bod gan ein pobl ifanc y sgiliau i gyflawni swyddi'r dyfodol. Ar lefel polisi uwch, mae agendâu Lisbon a Gothenberg, ynghyd â rhaglen ddiwygio genedlaethol y DU, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ‘Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2’ a ‘WAVE’, i gyd yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd economi ddeinamig sydd â sylfaen sgiliau ymatebol. Mae strategaeth adnewyddu Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, a elwir ‘The Smart Alternative’, yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd sgiliau, ynghyd â seilwaith trafndiaeth gwell a chysylltiadau ffordd byrrach â marchnadoedd yng nghoridor canol y Cymoedd. Ymddengys fod pob lefel yn y llywodraeth yn cytuno ar y broblem. Yr her yw'r ffordd yr awn ati i ymdrin â'r problemau parhaol a welwn yn ein hysgolion, ein colegau ac yn y gweithle.

Os rhoi'r sgiliau i'n pobl ifanc fel y gallant gyflawni eu talentau a'u gwir allu yw ein prif gymhelliant, yna mae angen mwy nag ymagwedd thematig. Mae cysylltu sgiliau â phroblem anweithgaredd, yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd, yn anodd ei wneud, ond gallai strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd, sy'n strategaeth wych, elwa o wneud y fath gysylltiadau ar draws pynciau. O ran sicrhau

Looking for delivery on skills, our Department of Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills can point towards higher post-16 rates of participation in education, aided by the 14-19 learning pathways. Greater information on financial support in disadvantaged communities should mean that we should shortly be able to prove that many more 19-year-olds in Wales are ready for skilled employment or further learning.

Key skills statistics show Wales outperforming the other parts of the UK, with a greater share of awards in the main key skills and the wider key skills. However, if we want Wales to be a true global leader, we must guarantee that no person is left behind in our race for high-skilled, high-value-added jobs. We need to ensure that a balance is reached and that there is greater joint-working by DELLS and the Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks to ensure that key and basic skills are not overshadowed.

Demographic trends show that we will need our current workforce to work longer and to re-skill. The Confederation of British Industry in Wales's latest paper on skills calls for more competition in education and a funding system that is entirely demand-led. I do not accept this—the whole approach of the Government to skills has been necessary due to market failure. Most big businesses have historically failed to be full partners in skills training and planning. This must change and a proper partnership must develop, in line with the recommendations of the Beecham report for the private, and, indeed, the public sector, in terms of employment and employers.

As chair of the Objective 1 programme monitoring committee, I know that convergence will give Wales another chance to invest over £1.7 billion in the next six years into our disadvantaged communities. Maximising the impact of structural funds will demand greater synergy between our education and enterprise departments. A recent example would be the joint working

sgiliau, gall ein Hadran Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau gyfeirio at gyfraddau cyfranogi ôl-16 uwch mewn addysg, yn cael eu cynorthwyo gan y Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19. Dylai mwy o wybodaeth am gymorth ariannol mewn cymunedau difreintiedig olygu y dylem fod yn gallu profi'n fuan fod llawer mwy o bobl ifanc 19 mlwydd oed yng Nghymru yn barod ar gyfer cyflogaeth sgil uchel neu ddysgu pellach.

Dengys ystadegau ar sgiliau allweddol fod Cymru'n perfformio'n well na rhannau eraill o'r DU, gyda chyfran fwy o gymwysterau mewn prif sgiliau allweddol a sgiliau allweddol ehangach. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn i Gymru fod yn arweinydd byd-eang gwirioneddol, rhaid inni warantu na chaiff neb ei adael ar ôl yn ein hymgyrch i sicrhau swyddi sgiliau uchel a gwerth ychwanegol uchel. Rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd a mwy o gydweithio rhwng AADGOS a'r Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau er mwyn sicrhau na chaiff sgiliau allweddol na sgiliau sylfaenol eu diystyru.

Dengys tueddiadau demograffig y bydd angen inni sicrhau bod ein gweithlu cyfredol yn gweithio'n hwy ac yn meithrin sgiliau newydd. Mae papur diweddaraf Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru ar sgiliau yn galw am fwy o gystadleuaeth mewn addysg a system ariannu sy'n cael ei harwain yn gyfan gwbl gan y galw. Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny—yr oedd ymagwedd gyfan y Llywodraeth at sgiliau yn angenrheidiol yn ganlyniad i fethiant y farchnad. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o fusnesau mawr wedi methu â bod yn bartneriaid llawn yn y gwaith o hyfforddi a chynllunio sgiliau yn hanesyddol. Rhaid i hyn newid, a rhaid datblygu partneriaeth briodol, yn unol ag argymhellion adroddiad Beecham ar gyfer y sector preifat, ac yn wir y sector cyhoeddus, o ran cyflogaeth a chyflogwyr.

Fel cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Amcan 1, gwn y bydd y broses gydgyfeirio yn gyfle arall i Gymru fuddsoddi dros £1.7 biliwn yn ein cymunedau difreintiedig yn ystod y chwe blynedd nesaf. Bydd sicrhau bod arian strwythurol yn cael yr effaith fwyaf bosibl yn gofyn am fwy o synergedd rhwng ein hadrannau addysg a menter. Enghraifft yn ddiweddar fyddai'r cydweithio ar fframwaith

on a strategic framework for economic development and lifelong learning in the construction sector. The existence of our flagship education initiatives, such as the Welsh baccalaureate, modern apprenticeships and the 14-19 learning pathways, prove how important uniting training provision and business is if our education system is to deliver for the young people of today.

The relaunched Lisbon agenda has ensured that investment in skills must be a cross-cutting issue within the second round of structural funds. I believe that, under convergence funding, skills need to be measured in the same way that other cross-cutting issues, such as gender, are measured under the current round of Objective 1 funding. We must not forget that, at a minimum, 60 per cent of convergence funding must address issues from the Lisbon agenda. Interdepartmental co-ordination on the supply of both business support and learning provision is just one example of the increased joint working that both the Lisbon agenda and convergence will make necessary. The latest socioeconomic and strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, threats analyses for west Wales and the Valleys confirm such an interpretation.

Finally, the Labour Assembly Government has a great deal to be proud of: individual learning accounts, the Assembly learning grant, and the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales funding will boost educational attainment and post-16 participation in education rates. Convergence funding has the potential to transform disadvantaged communities in west Wales and the Valleys. However, the level of synergy between education and enterprise may make or break its success.

David Melding: Like the previous speaker, I would like to start by looking at education and then move on to children's services in general. When we compare our GCSE results with those of England, the situation is not quite as healthy as the First Minister indicated, although a general improvement in standards is being achieved in both primary and secondary schools and it is important that we take that further. I would like to commend

strategol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a dysgu gydol oes yn y sector adeiladu. Dengys ein mentrau addysg blaenllaw, fel bagloriaeth Cymru, prentisiaethau modern a Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19 mor bwysig yw uno darpariaeth hyfforddiant a busnesau er mwyn i'n system addysg ddarparu ar gyfer pobl ifanc heddiw.

Mae agenda Lisbon a ail-lansiwyd yn ddiweddar wedi sicrhau bod yn rhaid i'r gwaith o fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau fod yn fater trawsbynciol yn yr ail gylch o arian strwythurol. Credaf, o dan arian cydgyfeirio, fod angen i sgiliau gael eu mesur yn yr un ffordd ag y caiff materion trawsbynciol eraill, fel rhyw, eu mesur o dan gylch cyfredol arian Amcan 1. Ni ddylem anghofio bod yn rhaid i 60 y cant o leiaf o arian cydgyfeirio fynd i'r afael â materion o agenda Lisbon. Mae cydgysylltiad rhwng adrannau ar ddarparu cymorth busnes a darpariaeth dysgu yn un enghraifft o'r lefel uwch o gydweithio a fydd yn angenrheidiol yn ôl agenda Lisbon a'r broses gydgyfeirio. Mae'r dadansoddiad economaidd-gymdeithasol diweddaraf a'r dadansoddiadau diweddaraf o gryfderau, gwendidau, cyfleoedd a bygythiadau ar gyfer y gorllewin a'r cymoedd yn cadarnhau dehongliad felly.

Yn olaf, mae gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gryn dipyn i ymfalchïo ynddo: bydd cyfrifon dysgu unigol, grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, a'r broses o godi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigol yng Nghymru yn hybu cyrhaeddiad addysgol a chyfranogiad ôl-16 mewn cyfraddau addysg. Gall arian cydgyfeirio drawsnewid cymunedau difreintiedig yn y gorllewin a'r cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, gallai ei lwyddiant ddibynnu ar lefel y synergedd rhwng addysg a mentrau.

David Melding: Fel y siaradwr blaenorol, hoffwn ddechrau drwy edrych ar addysg ac yna symud ymlaen at wasanaethau plant yn gyffredinol. Pan gymharwn ein canlyniadau TGAU â'r rheini yn Lloegr, nid yw'r sefyllfa mor iach ag y dywedai'r Prif Weinidog, er bod gwelliant cyffredinol mewn safonau mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, ac mae'n bwysig inni weithredu ymhellach ar hynny. Hoffwn gymeradwyo'r gwaith a

the work that is being done on a cross-party basis on special educational needs, which I think that the First Minister mentioned. A lot can be achieved by concentrating on special schools as centres of excellence, mainstreaming as much as possible and setting realistic targets for measuring pupil achievement in this area. That is important.

I am concerned about the situation of looked-after children. Their educational attainment is quite miserable compared to that of the general population: about 5 per cent achieve five or more good GCSE grades, as opposed to 50 per cent of the population as a whole. I know that it is a difficult group, but we have to set much more ambitious measures of achievement than the current one of how many looked-after children get one or two good GCSEs. I hope that the First Minister will talk to his colleagues about how that can be taken forward.

Children's services in Wales are still, on average, below the required standard. Although there are signs of improvement, when we read the joint review on Cardiff, for instance, we have to be sombre about what has been recorded. Children's services are improving, but they are still well below being safe and of a proper quality. We need to remember that.

On chronic diseases, this area has come into its own in the last 10 years and the management of chronic diseases is rightly seen as essential to general health and wellbeing. I hope that the First Minister might be able to commend the International Diabetes Federation's call for a UN resolution on diabetes, which it launched in Wales in an event here today.

The Beecham report is excellent and the Executive deserves some credit for allowing Sir Jeremy and his team to produce this report and to challenge it. Challenge ought to be at the heart of good government. Beecham recommends concentrating on leadership at all levels, involving all players and political parties in government at the Assembly, at the UK level and locally. The heart of his

wneir gan yr holl bleidiau ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, y soniwyd amdano gan y Prif Weinidog, mi gredaf. Gellir gwneud llawer drwy ganolbwyntio ar ysgolion arbennig fel canolfannau rhagoriaeth, prif-frydio cymaint â phosibl a phennu targedau realistig ar gyfer mesur cyflawniad disgyblion yn y maes hwn. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch sefyllfa plant sy'n cael gofal. Mae eu cyrhaeddiad addysgol yn ddigon gwael o'i gymharu â chyrhaeddiad y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol: mae tua phump y cant yn ennill pump neu fwy o raddau da mewn TGAU, o'u cymharu â 50 y cant o'r boblogaeth gyfan. Gwn ei fod yn grŵp anodd, ond rhaid inni bennu mesurau cyflawni sy'n llawer mwy uchelgeisiol na'r un cyfredol, sef faint o blant mewn gofal sy'n cael un neu ddwy o raddau da mewn TGAU. Gobeithio y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn siarad â'i gyd-Weinidogion am y ffordd y gellir gweithredu ar hynny.

Mae gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru yn dal yn is na'r safon ofynnol ar gyfartaledd. Er bod arwyddion o welliant, pan ddarllenwn yr adolygiad ar y cyd ar Gaerdydd, er enghraifft, rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn a gofnodwyd o ddifrif. Mae gwasanaethau plant yn gwella, ond nid ydynt yn ddigon diogel nac o safon ddigonol o hyd. Rhaid inni gofio hynny.

O ran clefydau cronig, mae'r maes hwn wedi denu llawer iawn o sylw yn ystod y deng mlynedd diwethaf, ac ystyrir bod y broses o reoli clefydau cronig yn hanfodol i iechyd a lles cyffredinol, a hynny'n briodol. Gobeithio y gall y Prif Weinidog gymeradwyo galwad y Cydffederasiwn Diabetes Rhyngwladol am benderfyniad gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar ddiabetes, a lansiwyd ganddi mewn digwyddiad yng Nghymru heddiw.

Mae adroddiad Beecham yn ardderchog ac mae'r Weithrediaeth yn haeddu rhywfaint o glod am ganiatáu i Syr Jeremy a'i dîm gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn a'i herio. Dylai her fod wrth wraidd llywodraeth dda. Mae Beecham yn argymhell canolbwyntio ar arweinyddiaeth ar bob lefel, gan gynnwys pob carfan a phlaid wleidyddol sydd mewn grym yn y Cynulliad, ar lefel y DU ac yn

message is that we need to get more for the Welsh pound. We can have arid debates about whether the Barnett formula ought to be reformed or abandoned and whether a new magic formula based on need that would be comprehensively accepted across the UK should be brought in, but that does not answer the question about how we are to make public spending as efficient and effective as possible. That ought to be at the forefront of our minds. Beecham says that we must travel faster and further. I think that that is a mild criticism—it is a tasteful criticism—and one that I hope that the Government will take seriously as it does not necessarily undermine its authority, but it does say that we have to aim for the best, if we are to put the improvement of public services at the heart of the devolution project.

I was pleased to hear what the First Minister said about the need for a larger private sector. He said that that sector is growing, although I think that he was very particular about the measurement that he used. It is interesting that he is talking the private sector up, and I hope that he will continue to do so, because Beecham says that, in public service delivery, we need a mixed economy that makes more use of the private sector and the voluntary sector. I think that that would help. If we could see people moving from the public sector to the private sector and vice versa, and have that sort of dynamic, that would be healthy for the whole economy and we might get away from our obsession with seeing things as public or private, because there can be a good mix.

Finally, it would be worthwhile if we were to have an annual debate, as Beecham recommends, on public service delivery. Perhaps this debate lacks some rigour because there is not any objective data. I am not insulting the First Minister by saying that, because, in a way, he is brave to have this debate, which is like a prolonged session of questions to the First Minister. However, if we had a set of data that was objective and accepted and understood by politicians, the

lleol. Yr hyn sydd wrth wraidd y neges hon yw bod angen inni ddefnyddio'r arian yng Nghymru i wneud mwy. Gallwn gael dadleuon tanboeth am y cwestiwn a ddylid diwygio neu ddileu fformiwla Barnett ac a ddylid cyflwyno fformiwla hud newydd yn seiliedig ar angen a fyddai'n cael ei derbyn yn gyffredinol ar draws y DU. Ond nid yw hynny'n ateb y cwestiwn sut y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn gwario arian cyhoeddus mor effeithlon ac effeithiol â phosibl. Dylai hynny fod yn ystyriaeth graidd. Dywed Beecham fod angen inni deithio'n gyflymach ac ymhellach. Credaf mai beirniadaeth ysgafn yw honno—mae'n feirniadaeth chwaethus—ac yn un y gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi ystyriaeth fwy difrifol iddi gan nad yw'n tanseilio ei hawdurdod o reidrwydd. Ond mae'n dweud bod angen inni anelu am y gorau, er mwyn sicrhau bod gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wrth wraidd y prosiect datganoli.

Yr oeddwn yn falch clywed yr hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog am yr angen am sector preifat mwy. Dywedodd fod y sector hwnnw'n tyfu, er y credaf iddo fod yn ofalus iawn ynghylch y mesur a ddefnyddiai. Mae'n ddi-ddorol ei fod yn canmol y sector preifat, a gobeithio y bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny, oherwydd dywed Beecham fod angen economi gymysg arnom sy'n gwneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Credaf y byddai hynny o gymorth. Pe gallem weld pobl yn symud o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat ac i'r gwrthwyneb, a sicrhau'r math hwnnw o ddeinameg, byddai hynny'n iach i'r economi gyfan ac efallai y gallem roi'r gorau i'n hobsesiwn o ystyried pethau mewn cyd-destun cyhoeddus neu breifat, oherwydd mae cymysgedd da yn bosibl.

Yn olaf, byddai'n werth chweil pe gallem gael dadl flynyddol, fel y mae Beecham yn ei argymhell, ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Efallai nad yw'r ddadl hon yn ddigon trylwyr oherwydd nad oes unrhyw ddata gwrthrychol. Nid wyf yn sarhau'r Prif Weinidog drwy ddweud hynny, oherwydd mewn ffordd mae'n ddewr i gael y ddadl hon, sydd fel sesiwn hirfaith o gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, pe bai gennym set o ddata a oedd yn wrthrychol ac y byddai

public and the press alike, I think that we would have a more mature debate in general on public services.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There are many Members still wishing to speak. I will not be able to call everyone unless Members, where they can, make succinct speeches.

4.30 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Nick Bourne said that he regards the annual report as a work of fiction—I will be slightly kinder and call it ‘faction’, which is the name given to fiction that is loosely based on fact. However, that is the long version; the short version, in my office, is known as the ‘Noddy version’. That really sums up the Labour Assembly Government’s expectations of its readers; it must think that they must have the same grasp of truth as young children if they think that we will swallow that.

I will concentrate on the health aspects of the report, and I will divide my remarks into two parts. The first part deals with those bits that I regard as being economical with the truth. If you take into account, for example, comments on waiting lists, the report says that they have come down, but it does not mention the fact that over 7,000 people are waiting over eight months for admission to hospital as an in-patient or day case. It does not mention the 18,500 people who are waiting over eight months for first out-patient appointments. It does not mention the increase in the length of wait for the first out-patient cardiology appointment. It does not mention, in talking about dentists, the fact that there are children who used to be able to get orthodontic treatment who are no longer eligible for it. I am looking forward to a year’s time, probably in the period immediately after the election, when we look at the First Minister’s most recent pledge that everyone who wants an NHS dentist will be able to get one—we will see how much progress will have been made on that.

I love the concept of practical difficulties in delivering the free homecare pledge. The practical difficulty is that the Labour Party

gwleidyddion, y cyhoedd a’r wasg at ei gilydd yn ei derbyn a’i deall, credaf y byddem yn cael dadl fwy aeddfed yn gyffredinol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae nifer o Aelodau o hyd am siarad. Ni fyddaf yn gallu galw ar bawb oni fydd Aelodau, pan allant, yn gwneud areithiau byr.

Jenny Randerson: Dywedodd Nick Bourne mai ffuglen yw’r adroddiad blynyddol, yn ei farn ef—byddaf fymryn yn fwy caredig a’i alw’n ‘ffeithlen’, yr enw a roddir ar ffuglen sy’n seiliedig, yn fras, ar ffeithiau. Fodd bynnag, dyna’r fersiwn hir; gelwir y fersiwn fer, yn fy swyddfa i, yn ‘fersiwn Noddy’. Mae hynny’n wirioneddol yn crynhoi’r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn ei ddisgwyl gan ei darllenwyr; rhaid ei bod yn meddwl bod ganddynt yr un gafael ar y gwir â phlant bach os cred y byddwn yn llyncu hynny.

Canolbwytiaf ar yr agweddau iechyd yn yr adroddiad, a rhannaf fy sylwadau yn ddwy ran. Mae’r rhan gyntaf yn ymdrin â’r rhannau hynny nad ydynt yn hollol wir. Os ystyriwch, er enghraifft, sylwadau ar restrau aros, dywed yr adroddiad eu bod wedi gostwng, ond nid yw’n sôn am y ffaith fod mwy na 7,000 o bobl yn aros dros wyth mis i gael mynd i’r ysbyty fel claf mewnlol neu achos dydd. Nid yw’n sôn am y 18,500 o bobl sy’n aros dros wyth mis am apwyntiadau cyntaf fel cleifion allanol. Nid yw’n sôn am y cynnydd yn yr amser y mae’n rhaid aros am yr apwyntiad cardiolog cyntaf fel claf allanol. Wrth drafod deintyddion, nid yw’n sôn am y plant a arferai allu cael triniaeth orthodontig nad ydynt yn gymwys i’w chael mwyach. Edrychaf ymlaen at flwyddyn i nawr, yn syth ar ôl yr etholiad, fwy na thebyg, pan edrychwn ar addewid diweddaraf y Prif Weinidog y bydd pawb sydd am gael deintydd y GIG yn gallu cael un—cawn weld faint o gynnydd a gaiff ei wneud ar hynny.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd gyda’r cysyniad o anawsterau ymarferol wrth gyflawni’r addewid gofal cartref am ddim. Yr anhawster

did not do its sums right, and could not afford it. That is an interesting concept of a practical difficulty. People with chronic illnesses are still waiting for their free prescriptions. Labour said that it would introduce free prescriptions—sure enough, it is doing it, but it is taking four years, and those with chronic illnesses are having to wait four years so that people who are on high incomes and are normally perfectly fit can also have free prescriptions.

There is reference to the review of child and adolescent mental health services, but the report does not mention why that review is necessary. The necessity is because those services are in an appalling condition, and they have been repeatedly criticised by the Children's Commissioner for Wales.

The significance lies in what is not even mentioned. Helen Mary has already said that there is no mention of the ambulance service—not a word about it. There is nothing on the financial plight of local health boards and trusts. There is nothing, therefore, on the lack of progress towards the Townsend formula—I look towards Lynne Neagle, who has taken a particular interest in that with its implications for her constituency of Torfaen. Those are the things that are not mentioned, because they are not good news, or cannot in any way be interpreted as positive news.

To me, this report looks suspiciously like the Labour Party's manifesto for next year, and the people of Wales now know what to do with a Labour Party manifesto and how much of it to believe.

Finally, if an Assembly sponsored public body had produced an annual report like this, it would justly have been condemned by the Government, opposition Assembly Members and the public alike. There might even have been calls for its abolition, because of its distortion of the truth. The best that we can do today is call for the abolition of the Labour Assembly Government as a result of this annual report.

ymarferol yw na wnaeth y Blaid Lafur ei symiau'n gywir, ac na allai ei fforddio. Mae hwnnw'n gysyniad diddorol o anhawster ymarferol. Mae pobl sydd â salwch cronig yn dal i aros am eu presgripsiynau am ddim. Dywedodd Llafur y byddai'n cyflwyno presgripsiynau am ddim—ac yn ddigon gwir, mae'n gwneud hynny, ond mae'n cymryd pedair blynedd, ac mae'n rhaid i'r bobl hynny sydd â salwch cronig aros pedair blynedd er mwyn i bobl sydd ag incwm uchel ac sy'n holliaich fel rheol hefyd allu cael presgripsiynau am ddim.

Cyfeirir at yr adolygiad o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, ond nid yw'r adroddiad yn sôn pam mae'r adroddiad hwnnw'n angenrheidiol. Yr anghenraid yw bod y gwasanaethau hynny mewn cyflwr gwarthus ac wedi eu beirniadu gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru dro ar ôl tro.

Mae'r arwyddocâd yn amlwg yn yr hyn na chrybwyllir hyd yn oed. Mae Helen Mary eisoes wedi dweud na sonnir am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans—dim gair amdano. Ni sonnir am gyflwr ariannol byrddau ac ymddiriedolaethau iechyd lleol. Ni sonnir o gwbl, felly, am y diffyg cynnydd tuag at fformiwla Townsend—edrychaf at Lynne Neagle, sydd wedi dangos diddordeb penodol yn hynny gyda'i oblygiadau i'w hetholaeth yn Nhor-faen. Dyna yw'r pethau na chrybwyllir, gan nad ydynt yn newyddion da, neu na allant gael eu dehongli fel newyddion cadarnhaol mewn unrhyw ffordd.

I mi, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn edrych yn amheus fel maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, a gŵyr pobl Cymru bellach beth i'w wneud â maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur a faint ohono i'w gredu.

Yn olaf, pe byddai corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad blynyddol fel hwn, byddai'r Llywodraeth, Aelodau gwrthbleidiau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd fel ei gilydd, yn syml wedi ei gondemnio. Efallai y byddent hyd yn oed wedi galw am iddo gael ei ddiddymu, oherwydd ei fod yn ystumio'r gwir. Y peth gorau inni ei wneud heddiw yw galw am i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gael ei ddiddymu o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn.

Janet Ryder: As many have said, an annual report is supposed to reflect what has happened in the past year. This year, we have seen, and we have all been aware of, this Government putting a great deal of spin on things. In fact, you could say that this report is another product of that spin. It is interesting to note that, reputedly, the Labour Government spends £3.5 million on its public relations department alone. That is an interesting figure indeed, because that is what the small schools fund stood at for a long time, until the opposition parties made the Assembly Government raise the figure in last year's budget; even now it only stands at £4.1 million. We all know that the demands on the small schools fund have increased. Recently, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has said that the small schools fund should not be used for administration, as was intended, but to support those pupils from the most deprived backgrounds who are in small schools. We have a Government prepared to spend just £600,000 more on small schools than on its publicity department. It is a Government that puts spin before communities, and which seeks to penalise those small schools that need help most, at the cost of getting their message across.

We have seen much about getting that message across from the Government during this past year—it has had to deal with that as each Minister has had to twist and turn to get away from the promises that were made in the Labour election manifesto. Let us look at some of those twists in education. It was promised that all school buildings would be fit for purpose by 2010. The report commissioned by the Welsh Local Government Association and which has just been published by PricewaterhouseCoopers says that there is a £749 million funding gap between identified funding sources and the actual cost of making all schools fit for purpose. Does the First Minister admit that? No. He said yesterday that Labour has spent what it said that it would, and even a little more; well done to you. However, that does not meet the election pledge to have all

Janet Ryder: Fel y mae nifer o bobl wedi'i ddweud, bwriad adroddiad blynyddol yw adlewyrchu'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y flwyddyn flaenorol. Eleni, yr ydym wedi gweld y Llywodraeth hon yn rhoi sbin ar bethau i raddau helaeth, ac yr oeddem oll yn ymwybodol o hyn. Mewn gwirionedd, fe allech ddweud bod yr adroddiad hwn yn un o gynhyrchion eraill yr ystumio hwnnw. Mae'n ddi-ddorol nodi bod y Llywodraeth Lafur, yn honedig, yn gwario £3.5 miliwn ar ei hadran cysylltiadau cyhoeddus yn unig. Mae hwnnw'n ffigur diddorol yn wir, oherwydd dyna oedd sefyllfa'r gronfa ysgolion bach am gyfnod hir, nes i'r gwrthbleidiau orfodi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynyddu'r ffigur hwnnw yng nghyllideb y llynedd; dim ond £4.1 miliwn ydyw hyd yn oed yn awr. Fe wyddom i gyd fod y galw ar y gronfa ysgolion bach wedi cynyddu. Yn ddiweddar, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau na ddylid defnyddio'r gronfa ysgolion bach ar gyfer gweinyddu, yn ôl y bwriad, ond y dylid ei defnyddio i gefnogi'r disgyblion hynny o'r cefndiroedd mwyaf difreintiedig sydd mewn ysgolion bach. Mae gennym Lywodraeth sy'n fodlon gwario dim ond £600,000 yn fwy ar ysgolion bach nag ar ei hadran gyhoeddusrwydd. Mae'n Llywodraeth sy'n rhoi sbin o flaen cymunedau, ac sy'n ceisio cosbi'r ysgolion bach hynny sydd lle mae'r angen mwyaf am gymorth, a hynny er mwyn cyfleu ei neges.

Yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o gyfleu'r neges honno gan y Llywodraeth yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf—bu'n rhaid iddi ymdrin â hynny gan fod pob Gweinidog wedi gorfod troi a throelli i osgoi'r addewidion a wnaed ym manifesto etholiad Llafur. Gadewch inni edrych ar rai o'r troeon hynny ym maes addysg. Addawyd y byddai pob adeilad ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. Yn ôl yr adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac a gyhoeddwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers, mae bwlch ariannu o £749 miliwn rhwng ffynonellau ariannu a nodwyd a'r gost wirioneddol o sicrhau bod ysgolion yn addas at y diben. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cyfaddef hynny? Nac ydyw. Dywedodd ddoe fod Llafur wedi gwario'r hyn y dywedodd y byddai'n ei wario, a hyd yn oed ychydig yn fwy; da iawn chi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n cyflawni

schools fit for purpose by 2010—it is a long way from it.

Then there was the whole issue of expansion in further education. Labour boasted in its manifesto that it would build upon the additional numbers of FE students it claimed for the period between 1999 and 2003. In fact, there are 7,500 fewer students in FE in Wales in 2006 than there were in 2003. It is an interesting dilemma, because despite the promise to expand FE, Labour has frozen budgets, causing colleges to restrict availability. However, it is okay: when the manifesto said that Labour would build on the success of 2003, it really meant that it had already increased the number of courses before the promise was made. It meant that Labour had met its promise in any case. It is easy for a political party to make a promise to achieve something that has already been achieved, and then cut the number and restrict the funding. Is it surprising that so many people are becoming cynical about politicians, when the Labour Party has broken pledge after pledge after pledge while still maintaining, somehow or other, that it has met them? Next year, people will judge this Labour Assembly Government on the pledges that they know have not been met.

Mark Isherwood: In the House of Commons, Rhodri Morgan earned the title of wondrous Welsh word fountain. He has the gift—more than any other person—of compressing the largest number of words into the smallest amount of thought. He has the brain of a sponge but the delivery of an England football team in penalty time. If nothing else, his annual report deserves an award for creative writing to hang alongside his second golden bull award for gobbledegook, awarded by the Plain English Campaign last December. This foot-in-mouth accolade was perhaps trumped only by his inability to give a straight answer on the BBC's *Question Time*. This is the man who had to be escorted from the North East Wales Institute in Wrexham, after his attempts to stage-manage a Welsh Assembly Government question time turned the audience hostile. This is the man who was

addewid yr etholiad i sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010—mae'n bell o gyflawni hynny.

Yna cododd mater ehangu mewn addysg bellach. Broliodd Llafur yn ei maniffesto y byddai'n adeiladu ar y niferoedd ychwanegol o fyfyrwyr addysg bellach a hawliai am y cyfnod rhwng 1999 a 2003. Mewn gwirionedd, mae 7,500 yn llai o fyfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn 2006 nag a oedd yn 2003. Mae'n gyfyng-gyngor diddorol, oherwydd er gwaethaf yr addewid i ehangu addysg bellach, mae Llafur wedi rhewi cyllidebau, gan beri i golegau gyfyngu ar argaeledd. Fodd bynnag, mae popeth yn iawn: pan ddywedodd y maniffesto y byddai Llafur yn adeiladu ar lwyddiant 2003, yr hyn a olygai mewn gwirionedd oedd ei bod eisoes wedi cynyddu nifer y cyrsiau cyn gwneud yr addewid. Golygai fod Llafur wedi cyflawni ei haddewid sut bynnag. Mae'n hawdd i blaid wleidyddol wneud addewid i gyflawni rhywbeth sydd eisoes wedi'i gyflawni, ac yna gwtogi'r nifer a chyfyngu'r arian. A yw'n syndod fod cynifer o bobl yn mynd yn sinigaidd ynghylch gwleidyddion, a'r Blaid Lafur wedi torri addewid ar ôl addewid gan fynnu o hyd, ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd, ei bod wedi'u cyflawni? Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd pobl yn barnu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am yr addewidion y gwyddom na chawsant eu cyflawni.

Mark Isherwood: Yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, enillodd Rhodri Morgan y teitl ffynnon eiriau ryfeddol Gymreig. Mae ganddo'r ddawn—yn fwy na neb—i gywasgu'r nifer fwyaf o eiriau i'r ystyriaeth leiaf. Mae ganddo ymennydd sbwng, ond yr un gallu i gyflawni â thîm pêldroed Lloegr yn cymryd ciciau o'r smotyn. Yn anad dim, mae ei adroddiad blynyddol yn haeddu gwobr am ysgrifennu creadigol i'w gosod wrth ymyl ei ail wobwr, sef y 'tarw aur' am rwdl-mi-ri, a ddyfarnwyd gan yr Ymgyrch Saesneg Clir fis Rhagfyr diwethaf. Dim ond ei anallu i roi ateb uniongyrchol ar *Question Time* y BBC sy'n waeth na'r wobwr hon am ddweud y peth anghywir. Dyma'r dyn y bu'n rhaid iddo gael ei hebrwng o Athrofa Gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru yn Wrecsam, ar ôl i'w ymgais i reoli'r llwyfan adeg sesiwn holi ac ateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru droi'r gynulleidfa'n gas. Dyma'r dyn a oedd yn hwyr i ben-blwydd y

late for the Queen's eightieth birthday and the international eisteddfod, and who is late for his own overdue resignation.

The report claims that gross disposable household income per head in Wales is at its highest level since 1996, relative to the UK average. The reality is that the figure inherited from the Conservatives in 1997 was higher, and that Wales now has lower prosperity than any other UK nation or region. The report does not tell us that unemployment in Wales has risen over the last year, or that the proportion of working-aged people not in work is now higher than it was at the start of the second Assembly in 2003.

Despite massive increases in spending, the numbers of school leavers and young people not entering education or training has increased. As we heard from Janet Ryder, despite Labour's 2003 manifesto promise, student numbers in further education colleges have fallen.

The report talks of hospital treatment, but it does not tell us that, for every patient waiting more than six months for their first hospital appointment when Labour came to power, there are now seven.

4.40 p.m.

The Assembly Government has practised the policies of cowardice, launching stealth policies and then blaming those forced to implement them. Next time a Labour politician blames a local authority for a threatened school closure, or a local health board or NHS trust for a threatened hospital closure, people should remember that it is Labour Assembly Government policies that are behind this.

The Assembly Government claims to support care closer to home but, instead, we see a pattern of bed losses, cuts, closures and centralisation. Thousands upon thousands of people are now protesting against community hospital closures and, as a writer to the *Daily Post* said last week, Rhodri Morgan's claim in his annual report of improved hospital treatment is ludicrous and beggars belief,

Frenhines yn 80 oed ac i'r eisteddfod gydwladol, ac sy'n hwyr i'w ymddiswyddiad hwyr ei hun.

Honna'r adroddiad fod incwm gwariant cartrefi crynswth y pen yng Nghymru ar ei lefel uchaf erioed er 1996, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd y DU. Y gwir amdani yw bod y ffigur a etifeddwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr yn 1997 yn uwch, a bod Cymru bellach yn llai ffyniannus nag unrhyw genedl neu ranbarth arall yn y DU. Nid yw'r adroddiad yn dweud wrthym fod diweithdra yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, na bod cyfran y bobl o oedran gweithio nad ydynt yn gweithio yn uwch yn awr nag ydoedd ar ddechrau'r ail Gynulliad yn 2003.

Er gwaethaf cynnydd enfawr mewn gwariant, mae nifer y bobl sy'n gadael yr ysgol a phobl ifanc nad ydynt yn dechrau mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant wedi cynyddu. Fel y clywsom gan Janet Ryder, er gwaethaf addewid manifesto Llafur yn 2003, mae nifer y myfyrwyr mewn colegau addysg bellach wedi gostwng.

Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am driniaeth mewn ysbyty, ond nid yw'n dweud wrthym, am bob claf sy'n aros mwy na chwe mis am ei apwyntiad cyntaf yn yr ysbyty pan ddaeth y blaid Lafur i rym, fod yna saith erbyn hyn.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi arfer polisiau llwfrdra, gan lansio polisiau lladradaidd a beio'r rhai y gorfodwyd iddynt eu gweithredu. Pan fydd gwleidydd Llafur y tro nesaf yn beio awdurdod lleol am fygwth cau ysgol, neu'n beio bwrdd iechyd lleol neu ymddiriedolaeth y GIG am fygwth cau ysbyty, dylai pobl gofio mai polisiau Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad sy'n sail i hyn.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn honni ei bod yn cefnogi gofal yn nes at y cartref, ond yn hytrach gwelwn batrwm o golli gwelyau, toriadau, achosion o gau a chanoli. Mae miloedd ar filoedd o bobl yn protestio bellach yn erbyn cau ysbytai cymunedol, ac fel y dywedodd rhywun wrth ysgrifennu at y *Daily Post* yr wythnos diwethaf, mae honiad Rhodri Morgan yn ei adroddiad blynyddol o

given the planned dismantling of hospitals. The writer went on to say that the Welsh Labour Party should hang its head in shame for what it is doing to the NHS in Wales.

As for social justice, an adequate supply of affordable housing is key to sustainable community regeneration but, for every four new affordable houses built 10 years ago, this Assembly Government has built only one. One in 12 people are living in unfit accommodation, but housing waiting lists grew by 50 per cent last year alone. Almost one in six children are now being brought up in households where no-one has a job.

Labour's 2003 manifesto pledged to end fuel poverty but, last winter, the number of excess winter deaths was at a five-year high. When I asked the First Minister to support research into the underlying causes of this, he could only talk about the weather.

The Beecham report, launched this week, complains of a top-down, silo-based mentality in the public sector's work culture. I wonder just who has been keeping the lid on the silo. Rhodri Morgan described Labour's defeat in Blaenau Gwent as therapeutic; Wales needs a lot more therapy of that kind. I heard you on the radio, First Minister, and know exactly what you said. He is the woolly mammoth who still cannot accept that he has become extinct.

Peter Black: I will reflect what Janet Ryder has said about the way that language is being used to alter the way that promises are being achieved and to change the meaning of some of those promises to make it look as though this Government is succeeding. I will look at two particular examples. Mike German mentioned free school breakfasts earlier. One of the advantages of the wonderful internet system in the Chamber is that you can get the Welsh Labour manifesto up on screen in front of you and clearly see that it promises,

well triniaeth yn yr ysbyty yn chwerrthinllyd ac yn anhygoel, o gofio'r broses arfaethedig o ddatgymalu ysbytai. Aeth yr awdur yn ei flaen i ddweud y dylai fod gan Blaid Lafur Cymru gywilydd am yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud i'r GIG yng Nghymru.

O ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, mae cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy yn allweddol i adfywio cymunedau cynaliadwy, ond am bob pedwar tŷ fforddiadwy newydd a adeiladwyd 10 mlynedd yn ôl, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ond wedi adeiladu un. Mae un o bob 12 o bobl yn byw mewn llety anaddas, ond tyfodd y rhestrau aros am dai 50 y cant y llynedd yn unig. Mae bron un plentyn o bob chwech yn cael ei fagu mewn cartref lle nad oes gan neb swydd.

Addawodd maniffesto Llafur yn 2003 ddileu tlodi tanwydd, ond yr oedd nifer y marwolaethau yn ystod y gaeaf y llynedd yn uwch nag yn ystod y pum mlynedd flaenorol. Pan ofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog gefnogi gwaith ymchwil i achosion sylfaenol y marwolaethau hyn, y cyfan y gallai ei drafod oedd y tywydd.

Mae adroddiad Beecham, a lanswyd yr wythnos hon, yn cwyno am feddylfryd o'r brig i'r bôn sy'n seiliedig ar seilo yn niwylliant gwaith y sector cyhoeddus. Tybed pwy'n union sydd wedi bod yn cadw'r caead ar y seilo. Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan fod y ffaith fod Lafur wedi ei threchu ym Mlaenau Gwent yn therapiwtig; mae angen mwy o lawer o therapi felly yng Nghymru. Fe'ch clywais ar y radio, Brif Weinidog, a gwn yn union yr hyn a ddywedasoch. Ef yw'r mammoth gwlanog sy'n methu derbyn o hyd ei fod wedi darfod.

Peter Black: Ystyriaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Janet Ryder ynglŷn â'r ffordd y defnyddir iaith i newid y ffordd y caiff addewidion eu cyflawni, ac i newid ystyr rhai o'r addewidion hynny er mwyn creu'r argraff fod y Llywodraeth hon yn llwyddo. Edrychaf ar ddwy enghraifft benodol. Soniodd Mike German am frecwast ysgol am ddim yn gynharach. Un o fanteision y system ryngrwyd wych yn y Siambr yw y gallwch gael maniffesto Llafur Cymru ar y sgrîn o'ch blaen a gweld yn glir ei bod yn addo,

‘Free breakfasts for all primary school kids’.

‘Brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd’.

It is not in black and white; it is white on a sort of brownly colour, but it is clearly set out in the manifesto. That is not being achieved and what has been put in front of us in this report is a completely different pledge, in the hope that we will not notice what was originally promised, so that the Government can claim that it has been successful.

Nid yw hyn ar ddu a gwyn; mae'n wyn ar liw brownllyd, ond mae wedi ei osod allan yn glir yn y manifesto. Ni chyflawnir hynny ac mae'r hyn a gyflwynwyd inni yn yr adroddiad hwn yn addewid cwbl wahanol, yn y gobaith na fyddwn yn sylwi ar yr hyn a addawyd yn wreiddiol, er mwyn i'r Llywodraeth allu honni iddi lwyddo.

The second example is serious. We were talking about school buildings earlier and I asked a question of the Finance Minister about the Government's pledge to make all school buildings fit for purpose by 2010. We have talked a lot about how much money is going into that and I do not think that anyone doubts that a huge amount of money is going into school buildings from this Government and local authorities. That is reflected in the PricewaterhouseCoopers report, published last week, that makes it clear that a massive amount of money is spent. It also identifies a shortfall of over £700 million in terms of how much is needed: £749 million is needed for school buildings if we are to make them fit for purpose. When I raised that earlier on, the Finance Minister told me that this was not a promise or a pledge but an aspiration. George Orwell would have been proud. It is clearly a pledge and I will prove it. In its 2003 Assembly manifesto Labour promised that,

Mae'r ail enghraifft yn ddifrifol. Yr oeddem yn siarad am adeiladau ysgolion yn gynharach, a gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog Cyllid ynghylch addewid y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. Yr ydym wedi siarad gryn dipyn am faint o arian a gaiff ei wario ar hynny, ac ni chredaf fod neb yn amau bod swm enfawr o arian yn cael ei wario ar adeiladau ysgolion gan y Llywodraeth hon ac awdurdodau lleol. Adlewyrchir hynny yn adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd, sy'n egluro bod cryn swm o arian yn cael ei wario. Dywed hefyd fod diffyg o fwy na £700 miliwn o ran faint sydd ei angen: mae angen £749 miliwn ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion i'w gwneud yn addas at y diben. Pan godais hynny'n gynharach, dywedodd y Gweinidog Cyllid wrthyf nad addewid mohono ond dyhead. Byddai George Orwell wedi bod yn falch o hyn. Mae'n amlwg yn addewid a byddaf yn profi hynny. Yn ei manifesto i'r Cynulliad yn 2003, addawodd Llafur,

‘by the end of the decade over £1 billion will have been spent ensuring that every school in Wales is fit for our children.’

‘erbyn diwedd y degawd, felly, bydd dros £1 biliwn wedi'i wario ar sicrhau bod pob ysgol yng Nghymru yn addas i'n plant’.

In ‘Wales: a Better Country’, also published in 2003, Labour pledged,

Yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2003 hefyd, addawodd Llafur,

‘An annual programme of funding for school buildings... so that all are fit for purpose by 2010.’

‘Rhaglen gyllido flynyddol ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion... fel y byddant yn addas ar gyfer y gwaith erbyn 2010’.

That, to my mind, is a promise and the Government needs to explain why that pledge is not being met.

Mae hynny, yn fy marn i, yn addewid ac mae angen i'r Llywodraeth esbonio pam na chyflawnir yr addewid hwnnw.

What seems to be going to happen, and what the PricewaterhouseCoopers report makes

Yr hyn sy'n ymddangos imi fydd ddigwydd, a'r hyn y mae adroddiad

clear, is that, by 2010, not a single local authority in Wales will have reached the position wherein all their schools are fit for purpose. Again, we have had debates on that. The First Minister has blamed local authorities for it, but local authorities did not make this pledge; the Assembly Government made it and it must ensure that it is delivered. As time is short, I will end there.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am much obliged, Peter.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae gennyf ddau sylw byr iawn i'w gwneud o safbwynt yr economi. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r darlun yn ddu i gyd—mae creu'r Cynulliad wedi creu sefyllfa lle gallwn ganolbwyntio ar broblemau Cymru, sy'n gam ymlaen. Mae'r Prif Weinidog, yn ddigon teg, yn cyfeirio at y gostyngiad yn y lefel o ddiweithdra, ond mae'r anghyfartaledd rhwng Cymru a rhannau o Loegr, a'r anghyfartaledd o fewn Cymru, yn dal yn annerbyniol.

Cyfeiriaf at ddau beth. Yn gyntaf, ar y ffigurau GYC, gwn nad ydynt yn ffasiynol ym marn y Gweinidog y dyddiau hyn, ond dyma'r mesur rhyngwladol a ddefnyddir. Mae'n fesur bras iawn, ond dyna'r unig system a dderbynnir yn rhyngwladol. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog mai ei nod erbyn diwedd y ddegawd oedd codi cyfartaledd GYC Cymru i 90 y cant o GYC Prydain. Dyna oedd yr addewid, y targed, y nod neu'r amcan. Fodd bynnag, dyma'r ffigurau. Yn 1997—a rhaid cofio bod Llafur wedi bod mewn grym ers bron i naw mlynedd—yr oedd cyfartaledd GYC Cymru yn 81 y cant. Yn 1999, yr oedd wedi gostwng i 79 y cant, ac, yn 2003, sef y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y ceir ffigurau ar ei chyfer, yr oedd yn dal yn 79 y cant. O fewn yr ardal Amcan 1, lefel gychwynnol y GYC oedd 71 y cant, ond mae bellach wedi gostwng i 66 y cant.

Nid lefel y GYC yw diwedd y stori, ond dyna'r mesur a ddefnyddiwyd gennych fel sail ar gyfer eich amcan. Bellach, gwelwn ein bod yn dal yn yr un twll.

Huw Lewis: Perhaps the most damaging inequality facing Wales, or any part of the

PricewaterhouseCoopers yn ei egluro, yw na fydd yr un awdurdod lleol, erbyn 2010, wedi cyrraedd y sefyllfa lle y bydd pob un o'u hysgolion yn addas i'r diben. Unwaith eto, cawsom ddadleuon am hynny. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi beio awdurdodau lleol am hynny, ond nid awdurdodau lleol a wnaeth yr addewid hwn; Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i gwnaeth, a rhaid iddi sicrhau y caiff ei wireddu. Gan fod amser yn brin, dof i ben yn awr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Diolch yn fawr, Peter.

Alun Ffred Jones: I have two very short comments to make from the point of view of the economy. Of course, the picture is not entirely black—creating the Assembly has created a situation where we can concentrate on the problems of Wales, which is a step forward. The First Minister, quite fairly, referred to the decrease in unemployment levels, but the inequality between England and Wales, and the inequality within Wales, continues to be unacceptable.

I will refer to two things. First, on the GVA figures, I know the First Minister no longer finds those fashionable, but that is the international measure used. It is quite a rough guide, but that is the only internationally accepted system. The First Minister said that his aim, by the end of the decade, was to raise the average GVA in Wales to 90 per cent of the GVA in Britain. That was the pledge, target, aim or objective. However, these are the figures. In 1997—and we must remember that Labour has been in power for almost nine years—the average GVA in Wales stood at 81 per cent. In 1999, that had decreased to 79 per cent, and in 2003, the most recent year for which we have figures, it was still 79 per cent. Within the Objective 1 area, the GVA started at 70 per cent, but it is now down to 66 per cent.

The GVA level is not the end of the story, but that was the measure which you used as the basis for your aim. However, we now see that we are still in the same predicament.

Huw Lewis: Efallai mai'r anghydraddoldeb mwyaf niweidiol sy'n wynebu Cymru, neu

UK, is that concerning child poverty. Labour has a solid commitment to eradicate it by 2020. Your spokesperson, Leanne Wood, has told the children of Wales that they will have to wait for independence before Plaid Cymru eradicates child poverty. Is that your view?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr oeddwn ar fin cyfeirio at y ffaith honno. Mae'r anghyfartaledd hwn o fewn Cymru yn dal yn sylweddol. Cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith syml honno, sef bod chwarter plant Cymru yn parhau i gael eu magu mewn cartrefi a ystyrir yn gartrefi flawd. Er bod y sefyllfa wedi gwella rhywfaint ers i Lafur ddod i rym, mae'n ffaith bod chwarter ein plant yn dal i gael eu magu yn y math hwnnw o sefyllfa. Soniaf am sefyllfa sy'n parhau i fodoli wedi i Lywodraeth Lafur fod mewn grym am wyth neu naw mlynedd. Mewn gwlad sy'n creu miliwnyddion, fel y gwelaf hwy, fesul yr wythnos, gyda chefnogaeth lwyr Tony Blair a'i gyfeillion yn Llundain, nid yw honno'n sefyllfa dderbyniol, ac y mae'n arwydd o fethiant cymharol y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru hefyd bod lefelau uchel iawn o dlodi plant yn dal i fodoli.

Glyn Davies: 'The First Minister's Annual Report' is a grand title for a debate. In the private sector, an annual report gives an annual opportunity for shareholders to comment on a company's performance and its plans for the future in a changing market. Clearly, the First Minister's annual report is an opportunity for us, as Members, not only to comment on the past performance of the Government and its plans for the future, but to give the First Minister an indication of what we think should happen instead.

I only have time to comment on two issues. First, the Government of Wales Bill is a hugely important issue for us; it the equivalent of an entire company being restructured. The First Minister will know very well that I have utterly condemned the proposal to include a ban on dual candidacy. It is a partisan measure and an utterly disgraceful gerrymandering measure, which I have condemned several times. I also disagree with the proposal to include this

unrhyw ran o'r DU, yw hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â thlodi plant. Mae gan Lafur ymrwymiad cadarn i'w ddileu erbyn 2020. Mae eich llefarydd, Leanne Wood, wedi dweud wrth blant Cymru y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros am annibyniaeth cyn y bydd Plaid Cymru'n dileu tlodi plant. Ai dyna eich barn chi?

Alun Ffred Jones: I was about to refer to that fact. This inequality in Wales is still significant. You referred to that simple fact, namely that a quarter of children in Wales are still brought up in homes considered to be homes in poverty. Although the situation has improved somewhat since Labour came into power, it is a fact that a quarter of all children are still being brought up in that type of situation. I am talking about a situation that still exists eight or nine years since a Labour Government came into power. In a country that creates millionaires, as I see them, week after week, with the clear support of Tony Blair and his friends in London, that is not an acceptable situation, and it is a sign of the relative failure of the Government in Wales that we are still looking at very high levels of child poverty.

Glyn Davies: Mae 'Adroddiad Blynyddol y Prif Weinidog' yn deitl crand ar gyfer dadl. Yn y sector preifat, mae adroddiad blynyddol yn gyfle blynyddol i gyfranddalwyr roi eu sylwadau ar berfformiad cwmni a'i gynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol mewn marchnad sy'n newid. Yn amlwg, mae adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog yn gyfle i ni, fel Aelodau, nid yn unig roi sylwadau ar berfformiad y Llywodraeth yn y gorffennol a'i chynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond i roi awgrym i'r Prif Weinidog o'r hyn a ddylai ddigwydd yn lle hynny yn ein barn ni.

Dim ond amser i roi sylwadau ar ddau fater sydd gennyf. Yn gyntaf, mae Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn fater hollbwysig i ni; mae'n cyfateb i gwmni cyfan yn cael ei ailstrwythuro. Gŵyr y Prif Weinidog yn dda iawn fy mod wedi condemnio'n llwyr y cynnig i gynnwys gwaharddiad ar ymgeisyddiaeth ddeuol. Mae'n fesur pleidiol ac yn fesur cyffin dwyllo hollol warthus. Yr wyf wedi ei gondemnio droeon. Yr wyf hefyd yn anghytuno â'r cynnig i gynnwys y system

d'Hondt system, which is a blatant attempt to fiddle the committee structure when the Government is not in a position to control it itself. Both of those are disgraceful, but I have always believed that we will reach the stage at which the Government of Wales Bill will go through. I hope that the House of Commons will be sensible in terms of what goes back to the House of Lords, and that we will not have an unnecessary ping pong. I think that there will be a common-sense agreement.

4.50 p.m.

Although I condemn certain parts of what has happened and what will happen if the Government retains power, I welcome the fact that we are moving down the road towards having more powers for the National Assembly. I think that it will make the debates in this Chamber far more worthwhile than they currently are, and there will be more of an opportunity for us to have real power and, as a result, real disagreement. It will help the National Assembly to grow up. I welcome that. I am deeply disappointed that we are going down such a convoluted route to achieve this, and that we will not have any recourse in terms of the public's view on the change. Nevertheless, following the referendum in 1997, if we are to have an Assembly, it should have real law-making powers in those areas that are devolved. To the extent that we might get there, I welcome that part of the Bill. If I am lucky enough to be returned after the next Assembly election, I look forward to playing a constructive part in making this place something more worthwhile for Wales.

I wanted to go into some positive areas. However, the second area that I wish to mention is also an area of criticism. My main criticism has been of the Assembly Government's plans to incorporate the quangos. I do not want to talk about the content of that, but about the process. On the content, I had some sympathy with what the Assembly Government intended to do; it was perfectly sensible. No quangos have a permanent right to remain; they must always be reviewed. The establishment of an Assembly with 60 Members created a

d'Hondt hon, sy'n ymdrech amlwg i ymyrryd yn strwythur y pwyllgor pan nad yw'r Llywodraeth mewn sefyllfa i'w reoli ei hun. Mae'r ddau beth hyn yn warthus, ond yr wyf bob amser wedi credu y bydd Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn llwyddo. Gobeithio y bydd Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn ddigon synhwyrol o ran yr hyn sy'n mynd yn ôl i Dŷ'r Arglwyddi, ac na chawn sefyllfa ddiangen o fynd yn ôl ac ymlaen. Credaf y bydd cytundeb synnwyr cyffredin.

Er fy mod yn condemnio rhannau penodol o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd a'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd os bydd y Llywodraeth yn dal mewn grym, croesawaf y ffaith ein bod yn symud tuag at sefyllfa lle y bydd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fwy o bwerau. Credaf y bydd yn gwneud y dadleuon yn y Siambr hon yn fwy gwerthfawr o lawer nag y maent ar hyn o bryd, a bydd mwy o gyfle inni gael gwir bŵer, ac o ganlyniad gwir anghytundeb. Bydd yn helpu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i aeddfedu. Croesawaf hynny. Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn ein bod yn mynd ar drywydd mor gymhleth i gyflawni hyn, ac na fydd gennym unrhyw atebolrwydd o ran barn y cyhoedd ar y newid. Serch hynny, yn dilyn y refferendwm yn 1997, er mwyn inni gael Cynulliad, dylai gael pwerau deddfu gwirioneddol yn y meysydd hynny sydd wedi eu datganoli. I'r graddau y cyflawnwn hynny efallai, croesawaf y rhan honno o'r Mesur. Os byddaf yn ddigon ffodus i gael fy ethol ar ôl etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad, edrychaf ymlaen at chwarae rhan adeiladol i wneud y lle hwn yn rhywbeth mwy gwerthfawr i Gymru.

Yr oeddwn am drafod rhai meysydd cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ail faes yr wyf am sôn amdano yn faes lle mae beirniadaeth hefyd. Fy mhrif feirniadaeth oedd cynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymgorffori'r cwangos. Nid wyf am sôn am gynnwys hynny, ond am y broses. O ran y cynnwys, yr oeddwn yn cydymdeimlo i ryw raddau â'r hyn yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ei wneud; yr oedd yn hollol synhwyrol. Nid oes gan unrhyw gwangos hawl barhaol i aros; rhaid eu hadolygu drwy'r amser. Wrth sefydlu

situation in which that had to be looked at. I was particularly disappointed with what happened with regard to the Welsh Language Board, because that involves bringing a sensitive issue back into the political process. I think that that was a mistake, and I am pleased that that may not happen, because it is beyond the next election. However, the process was an utter disgrace. This is a criticism of Rhodri Morgan; it is personal. It was absolutely shocking. There is no way that this could have happened at Westminster. You decided this with a coterie of people, First Minister. The biggest decision with regard to the governance of Wales was made by you and a couple of colleagues—we do not even know who. You decided what was going to happen and you announced it. At Westminster, there would have been the equivalent of a White Paper; there would have been a debate and an attempt to build a consensus. You behaved like a dictator. On that one decision alone, you rendered yourself unfit to be First Minister. I desperately hope, for more than political reasons, that we have a change at the next election.

Leanne Wood: I will confine my contribution to the elements of the First Minister's report that fall into the remit of the social justice and regeneration portfolio. There are two main areas of concern: housing and fuel poverty.

Housing in Wales is in crisis. More and more people are being forced to live with their parents, and for longer periods of time. We have persistent levels of homelessness and a high proportion of families living in bed-and-breakfast accommodation, which we would all agree is unsuitable. The investment in the social housing grant, in real terms, is now two-thirds of what it was in the 1990s. Local authorities are building no-where near enough homes to meet local need. In 2005, local authorities in Wales built a grand total of one house. House prices in Wales are now six times the average salary. In relative terms, this makes Wales more expensive than London.

Cynulliad gyda 60 o aelodau crëwyd sefyllfa lle y roedd yn rhaid edrych ar hynny. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o siomedig am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o ran Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, oherwydd mae hynny'n golygu dod â mater sensitif yn ôl i mewn i'r broses wleidyddol. Yr oedd hynny'n gamgymeriad yn fy marn i, ac yr wyf yn falch na fydd hynny efallai yn digwydd, oherwydd y bydd ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y broses yn warth llwyr. Beirniadaeth ar Rhodri Morgan yw hyn; mae'n bersonol. Yr oedd yn hollol warthus. Ni fyddai hyn wedi gallu digwydd yn San Steffan. Bu ichi benderfynu ar hyn gyda chylch o bobl, Brif Weinidog. Gwnaed y penderfyniad mwyaf o ran llywodraethu Cymru gennych chi a rhai cyd-Aelodau—ni wyddom pwy hyd yn oed. Bu ichi benderfynu beth oedd i ddigwydd a'i gyhoeddi. Yn San Steffan, byddai hynny wedi cyfateb i Bapur Gwyn, byddai dadl wedi bod ac ymdrech i greu consensws. Bu ichi ymddwyn fel unben. Ar y penderfyniad hwnnw'n unig, rhoesoch eich hun mewn sefyllfa lle nad oeddech yn addas i fod yn Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn gobeithio'n daer, am fwy na rhesymau gwleidyddol, y cawn newid yn yr etholiad nesaf.

Leanne Wood: Cyfyngaf fy nghyfraniad i'r elfennau yn adroddiad y Prif Weinidog sy'n rhan o gylch gwaith y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio. Mae dau faes sy'n achosi pryder: tai a thlodi tanwydd.

Mae'r sefyllfa o ran tai yng Nghymru yn argyfyngus. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn cael eu gorfodi i fyw gyda'u rhieni, ac am gyfnodau hwy o amser. Mae gennym lefelau cyson o ddigartrefedd a chyfran uchel o deuluoedd yn byw mewn llety gwely a brecwast, sydd, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll yn cytuno, yn anaddas. Mae'r buddsoddiad yn y grant tai cymdeithasol, mewn termau gwirioneddol, bellach yn ddwy ran o dair o'r hyn ydoedd yn yr 1990au. Nid yw awdurdodau lleol yn adeiladu digon o gartrefi o bell ffordd i ddiwallu angen lleol. Yn 2005, adeiladodd awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru gyfanswm o un tŷ. Mae prisiau tai yng Nghymru bellach chwe gwaith y cyflog cyfartalog. Mewn termau cymharol, mae hyn yn gwneud Cymru yn ddrutach na Llundain.

In the 2003 election manifesto, your Government said that it would end the right to buy. Some 47 per cent of our social-housing stock has been lost due to the right to buy since it was introduced in 1981. If we do not end the right to buy, we are effectively subsidising home ownership. Homes for rent are needed now, and the right to buy needs to be ended now. However, I am afraid that this is yet another example of your Government's broken promises.

On the subject of broken promises, I predict another. Labour promised to cut fuel poverty in 28,000 households and to eradicate fuel poverty among the most vulnerable by 2010. However, since 2003, fuel prices have increased enormously. Gas bills have gone up by 63.3 per cent, and electricity bills have gone up by 44.2 per cent. Your Government has not reduced the number of households in fuel poverty, and it is highly likely that you will now miss your 2010 target.

Your Government estimates that an additional 30,000 households have fallen back into fuel poverty. However, the Centre for Sustainable Energy calculates that the figure is 10 times your Government's estimations. Of course, we still have not seen the 'Living in Wales' survey, and I want to know why there has been a delay, because, without that survey, we cannot plan properly. We have no Welsh formula to calculate numbers, and, again, without that, we cannot plan properly. Does the First Minister still believe that the Government will meet its fuel poverty target, or will he accept that this will be another broken promise? Unfortunately, I do not have time to talk about my concerns about the Communities First programme, which has no measurable targets. We have no idea as to how this programme has impacted on poverty or unemployment levels, and yet this is meant to be one of the Welsh Assembly Government's greatest achievements.

My final point relates to the social justice portfolio and the farce that is being called 'police restructuring'. That aspect of the Plaid Cymru amendment is now out of date following today's news that the irrational

Ym manifesto etholiad 2003, dywedodd eich Llywodraeth y byddai'n terfynu'r hawl i brynu. Collwyd tua 47 y cant o'n stoc tai cymdeithasol oherwydd yr hawl i brynu ers ei gyflwyno gyntaf yn 1981. Os na therfynwn yr hawl i brynu, yr ydym yn y bôn yn sybsideiddio perchnogaeth tai. Mae angen tai i'w rhentu yn awr, ac mae angen terfynu'r hawl i brynu yn awr. Fodd bynnag, ofnaf fod hon yn enghraifft arall o'ch Llywodraeth yn torri addewidion.

O ran torri addewidion, yr wyf yn darogan un arall. Addawodd Llafur dorri tlodi tanwydd mewn 28,000 o gartrefi a dileu tlodi tanwydd ymhlith y bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, er 2003, mae prisiau tanwydd wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol. Mae biliau nwy wedi codi 63.3 y cant, a biliau trydan wedi codi 44.2 y cant. Nid yw eich Llywodraeth wedi lleihau nifer y cartrefi sy'n wynebu tlodi tanwydd, ac mae'n debygol iawn na fyddwch yn cyrraedd eich targed o 2010.

Mae eich Llywodraeth yn amcangyfrif bod 30,000 ychwanegol o gartrefi wedi syrthio'n ôl i dlodi tanwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Ganolfan dros Ynni Cynaliadwy yn cyfrifo bod y ffigur 10 gwaith yr amcangyfrifon gan eich Llywodraeth. Wrth gwrs, nid ydym wedi gweld yr arolwg 'Byw yng Nghymru' eto, a hoffwn wybod pam mae oedi wedi bod, oherwydd heb yr arolwg hwnnw ni allwn gynllunio'n briodol. Nid oes gennym fformiwla Gymreig i gyfrif niferoedd, ac unwaith eto heb hynny ni allwn gynllunio'n briodol. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn credu o hyd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cyrraedd ei tharged o ran tlodi tanwydd, neu a fydd yn derbyn y bydd hwn yn addewid arall a dorrwyd? Yn anffodus, nid oes amser gennyf i sôn am fy mhryderon am y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, nad oes ganddi unrhyw dargedau mesuradwy. Nid oes syniad gennym sut y mae'r rhaglen hon wedi effeithio ar dlodi neu lefelau diweithdra, ac eto mae hyn i fod yn un o lwyddiannau mwyaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a'r ffars a elwir yn 'ailstrwythuro'r heddlu'. Mae'r agwedd honno ar welliant Plaid Cymru yn hen bellach yn dilyn newyddion heddiw bod

merger is to be scrapped. That is great news for police forces and for communities in Wales, and the position taken by the Assembly has helped in terms of that decision being arrived at. However, First Minister, we still have level 2 protective policing issues to deal with, and now, of course, the police service is in a state of limbo.

Do you agree with me that if police services were devolved, we could reorganise them to best meet the needs of the people of Wales? I hope that you agree with me, First Minister, and I hope that you will do everything that you can to ensure that those services are devolved. I will be putting that point as strongly as I can to Tony McNulty tomorrow, and I hope that you will not give the Home Office another chance to mess up our police services in Wales.

yr uniad afresymol i gael ei ddileu. Mae hynny'n newyddion gwych i heddluoedd ac i gymunedau yng Nghymru, ac mae'r safbwynt a arddelwyd gan y Cynulliad wedi helpu wrth ddod i'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, Brif Weinidog, mae gennym faterion plismona diogelu lefel 2 o hyd i ymdrin â hwy, a bellach, wrth gwrs, mae'r gwasanaeth heddlu mewn cyflwr ansicr.

A gytunwch â mi, pe bai gwasanaethau'r heddlu yn cael eu datganoli, y gallem eu had-drefnu i ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru yn y ffordd orau? Gobeithio eich bod yn cytuno â mi, Brif Weinidog, a gobeithio y gwnewch bopeth a fedrwch i sicrhau datganoli'r gwasanaethau hynny. Byddaf yn cyfleu'r pwynt hwnnw mor gryf ag y gallaf i Tony McNulty yfory, a gobeithio na roddwch gyfle arall i'r Swyddfa Gartref wneud llanestr o'n wasanaethau heddlu yng Nghymru.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call the First Minister to wind up, I invite the Business Minister to propose a motion to extend the meeting by one hour and 15 minutes, which will be more than sufficient.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends the time for this debate by one hour and 15 minutes.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar y Prif Weinidog i ddirwyn i ben, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig i ymestyn y cyfarfod am awr a 15 munud, a fydd yn fwy na digon.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn y ddadl hon am awr a 15 munud.

*Cynnig: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.
Motion: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 4.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Butler, Rosemary
James, Irene
Lewis, Huw
Wood, Leanne

Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Prif Weinidog: Parhad The First Minister's Annual Report: Continued

The First Minister: We are a can-do administration, providing grown-up government for an increasingly self-confident people. However, we are scrutinised, however inadequately, by a can-whinge opposition. I think that they believe that the election is coming next week and not next year. That is best exemplified, perhaps, by the speeches of Mark Isherwood and Helen Mary Jones this afternoon. Mark, I do not know what charm school you went to, but I think that you ought to ask for your money back, and I thought that it was pretty good of Helen Mary Jones to deliver a lecture on humility. There were some examples of useful speeches from the opposition, for example, David Melding's speech and part of Glyn Davies's speech—we expect some contributions of that nature from him, but then he always feels that he has to swing the pendulum over to the other side as well.

Dechreuaf gydag araith Ieuan Wyn Jones, fel arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Yr oedd elfennau o resymeg a rhesymoldeb, o leiaf i ddechrau, o ran y gwelliannau a fu yn ystod y 12 mis

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn weinyddiaeth sy'n gallu cyflawni, ac sy'n darparu llywodraeth aeddfed i bobl sy'n gynyddol hunan-hyderus. Fodd bynnag, creffir arnom, waeth pa mor annigonol, gan wrthbleidiau sy'n cwyno na allwn gyflawni. Yr wyf yn meddwl eu bod yn credu bod yr etholiad yn digwydd yr wythnos nesaf, nid y flwyddyn nesaf. Dangosir hyn orau, efallai, gan areithiau Mark Isherwood a Helen Mary Jones y prynhawn yma. Mark, ni wn i ba ysgol ffasiwn yr aethoch, ond credaf y dylech ofyn am eich arian yn ôl, a chredais fod Helen Mary Jones wedi gwneud gwaith digon da yn rhoi darlith ar ostyngeddwrwydd. Cafwyd rhai enghreifftiau o areithiau defnyddiol gan y gwrthbleidiau, er enghraifft, araith David Melding a rhan o araith Glyn Davies—disgwylw'n rai cyfraniadau felly ganddo, ond mae bob amser yn teimlo bod yn rhaid iddo wthio'r pendil i'r ochr arall hefyd.

I will begin with Ieuan Wyn Jones's speech, as leader of the opposition party. There were elements of logic and rationale, at least at the beginning, regarding the improvements that

diwethaf ar restrau aros hir. Yr ydym wedi cael gwared ar restrau aros hir yng Nghymru, ond derbyniwn fod cryn ffordd i fynd. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi pwysleisio'n syth ar ôl inni gyrraedd y 12 a'r 12 ein bod yn symud ymlaen i'r wyth a'r wyth. Am y tro cyntaf yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol—hyd y gwn—bydd rhestrau aros ar gyfer profion diagnostig a therapiau hefyd, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, pethau megis ffisiotherapi a sganiau MRI sydd â'r rhestrau aros a fu'n gudd hyd yn hyn o dan y Ceidwadwyr ac oddi tanom ni, yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban, a hefyd yma.

Hefyd, o ran deintyddiaeth, derbyniaf fod y cytundeb newydd, a fu'n chwyldroadol ym myd deintyddiaeth, wedi achosi llawer o broblemau. Bu i lawer o ddeintyddion adael system y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, ond yr ydym yn eu denu'n ôl yn llu drwy'r gwasanaeth deintyddol personol. Mae hyn yn rhy hwyr, efallai, ar gyfer y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, ond bydd newidiadau mawr yn digwydd mewn deintyddiaeth, a gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar etholaeth Ieuan, sef Ynys Môn, oherwydd gwn fod problemau drwg yno.

5.00 p.m.

I have two points to make to Mike German. I did not take anything away from the Richard report. We added to it rather than subtracted from it. I did not give Ivor Richard a Zinedine Zidane-style Marseilles kiss on the chest. Glyn Davies's speech answers this point. We have brought forward to the third Assembly what would have required, under Ivor Richard's proposals, waiting until the fourth Assembly in 2011. Virtually everything that is contained in the Ivor Richard report—which would have come in with a boundary review and a lot of agonising over how many MPs there would be in Wales as well as a referendum and so on—will now come in in 2007. I think that the first part of Glyn Davies's speech, the good part, strongly demonstrates the point that I am making about the third Assembly having the powers.

Nick Bourne: Will you give way?

The First Minister: I was coming to your

have taken place over the past 12 months on the lengthy waiting lists. We have got rid of lengthy waiting lists in Wales, but we accept there is long way to go. That is why I emphasised immediately after reaching the 12 and the 12 that we are moving on to the eight and the eight. For the first time ever in the United Kingdom—as far as I know—we will also have waiting lists for diagnostic tests and therapies, because, in the end, it is things such as physiotherapy and MRI scans that have the waiting lists that have been hidden until now, under the Conservatives and under us, in England and Scotland, and also here.

Also, on dentistry, I accept that the new contract, which has been revolutionary in dentistry, has created a lot of problems. Many dentists have walked out of the national health service system, but we are bringing them back in floods with the personal dental service. That is perhaps too late for the year that has just passed, but major changes will occur in dentistry, and I hope that that will affect Ieuan's constituency of Anglesey, because I know that there are serious problems there.

Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w gwneud i Mike German. Ni thynnais ddim oddi wrth adroddiad Richard. Ychwanegu ato a wnaethom yn hytrach na thynnu oddi wrtho. Ni roddais gusan Marseilles fel Zinedine Zidane ar frest Ivor Richard. Mae araith Glyn Davies yn ateb y pwynt hwn. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno i'r trydydd Cynulliad yr hyn a fyddai wedi gorfod aros, o dan gynigion Ivor Richard, tan y pedwerydd Cynulliad yn 2011. Caiff bron bopeth sydd wedi ei gynnwys yn adroddiad Ivor Richard—a fyddai wedi golygu adolygiad o ffiniau a llawer o drafod ar faint o ASau a fyddai yng Nghymru yn ogystal â refferendwm ac ati—ei gyflwyno yn 2007 bellach. Credaf fod rhan gyntaf araith Glyn Davies, y rhan dda, yn dangos yn gryf y pwynt yr wyf yn ei wneud am y pwerau sydd gan y trydydd Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: A wnewch chi ildio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn wedi cyrraedd

speech in a minute or two, but very well.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to the First Minister for giving way. Glyn Davies specifically raised two issues, which were not touched on by the Richard commission report. One was the banning of dual candidatures, and the other is the d'Hondt system for committees. Will you now take the opportunity to distance yourself from both of those? They were not in the Richard commission. It is not that you are adding anything to the Richard commission; they were just not there.

The First Minister: The point that Glyn Davies was making, which we strongly endorse, is that it is the third Assembly that will now have greater legislative powers and the ability to hold better debates on more significant issues, and that was exactly the point that I was making. Otherwise, it will mean waiting until the fourth Assembly in four years' time. That could still involve the full Richard commission recommendation somewhere further down the line, subject to a referendum.

The other point that Mike was quite wrong on was the question of this building. It is perfectly in order for me, in a report, to refer to the fact that we have delivered this building for £67 million. It is another demonstration of our being a can-do Government. This is not just about the Assembly; it is part of our can-do reputation as a country. For £300 million, Wales has produced the Wales Millennium Centre, the Millennium Stadium and the Assembly building on a fixed-price basis for less than the cost of the overrun on the Wembley stadium. It is a mark of how Wales is growing up. It is not all down to the Assembly; some of those came in before the Assembly even existed, but it shows that Wales is maturing, which is important. We have a lot to be proud of in this country. Some of it is down to us and some of it is nothing to do with us, but it is all part of increasing our national self-confidence.

eich araith chi ymhen munud neu ddau, ond o'r gorau.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ildio. Cododd Glyn Davies ddau fater yn benodol na soniodd adroddiad comisiwn Richard amdanynt. Yr oedd y naill yn cyfeirio at wahardd ymgeisyddiaeth ddeuol, a'r llall yn cyfeirio at system d'Hondt ar gyfer pwyllgorau. A wnewch chi fanteisio ar y cyfle'n awr i ymbellhau oddi wrth y ddau hyn? Nid oeddent yn adroddiad comisiwn Richard. Nid ychwanegu rhywbeth at gomisiwn Richard yr ydych; nid oeddent yno o gwbl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y pwynt yr oedd Glyn Davies yn ei wneud, ac a gaiff ei gefnogi'n gryf gennym, yw y bydd gan y trydydd Cynulliad fwy o bwerau deddfwriaethol a'r gallu i gynnal dadleuon ar faterion sydd o fwy o bwys, a dyna'r union bwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud. Fel arall, bydd yn golygu aros tan y pedwerydd Cynulliad ymhen pedair blynedd. Gallai hynny olygu o hyd argymhelliad llawn comisiwn Richard yn ddiweddarach, yn amodol ar refferendwm.

Y pwynt arall yr oedd Mike yn hollol anghywir yn ei gylch oedd hwnnw'n ymwneud â'r adeilad hwn. Mae'n hollol briodol imi, mewn adroddiad, gyfeirio at y ffaith ein bod wedi darparu'r adeilad hwn am £67 miliwn. Mae'n enghraifft arall o'n gallu fel Llywodraeth i gyflawni. Nid yw hwn yn ymwneud â'r Cynulliad yn unig; mae'n rhan o'n henw da fel gwlad a all gyflawni. Am £300 miliwn, mae Cymru wedi cynhyrchu Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, Stadiwm y Mileniwm ac adeilad y Cynulliad ar sail pris sefydlog am lai na'r costau ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig â stadiwm Wembley. Mae hyn yn arwydd o aeddfedrwydd Cymru. Nid cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad yw hyn i gyd, daeth rhai o'r rhain i fodolaeth cyn y Cynulliad hyd yn oed, ond mae'n dangos bod Cymru'n aeddfedu, sy'n bwysig. Mae gennym lawer yn y wlad hon i fod yn falch ohono. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw peth ohono ac nid oes gennym unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros y gweddill, ond mae'r cyfan yn rhan o'n hunanhyder cynyddol fel cenedl.

If you are going to attack the First Minister's

Os ydych am feirniadu adroddiad y Prif

report, Nick, and describe it as a work of fiction, I would find it beneficial, as would civil servants, if you could point out any of the facts that you think are wrong. I said that it is packed with facts and figures; you said that it was not, but you did not quote any particular ones to which you objected. Please write to me with any of those. Otherwise, your speech simply descends into sarky comments, sneers and smears. If you think that there are errors in the report, please write to me to tell me what they are; otherwise, you are open to the accusation that this is evidence-free opposition.

We are pleased with how the legislation is proceeding in Westminster, but I would never presume on their Lordships' House or on MPs' House.

I will just mention the important comments made about the Heads of the Valleys programme by Christine Chapman, and the comments on skills made by Jeff Cuthbert. The four pillars of skills on which we are working are: the modern apprenticeship scheme—into which we have put huge investment—the Welsh baccalaureate; learning pathways; and the kindergarten phase 3 to 7, the Scandinavian learn-through-play type of curriculum.

In response to Christine Chapman, the commitment to the Heads of the Valleys strategy, as one of the strategic programmes on which the new Objective 1 will be based, is important. I am sure that we will do that. You also mentioned the Phurnacite plant, which is a classic example of our can-do Government. The Wales Millennium Centre was 15 years in waiting, the Phurnacite plant was 10 years in waiting, and the Brymbo regeneration scheme was also 10 years waiting, but we have got on and we have solved the problems. That is the mark of a can-do Government. I believe that we have a can-whinge opposition, which is why I recommend the opposition of all opposition amendments today.

Weinidog, Nick, a'i ddisgrifio fel ffuglen, byddai o fudd i mi, ac i weision sifil, pe gallech nodi unrhyw rai o'r ffeithiau y credwch sy'n anghywir. Dywedais ei fod yn llawn ffeithiau a ffigurau; yr oeddech chi'n dweud nad oedd hynny'n wir, ond ni roesoch unrhyw rai penodol yr oeddech yn anghydweld â hwy. Mae croeso ichi ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â hwy. Fel arall, nid yw eich araith ond yn dirywio i wneud sylwadau coeglyd, sarhaus a difenwol. Os credwch fod camgymeriadau yn yr adroddiad, mae croeso ichi ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud wrthyf amdanynt; fel arall, yr ydych yn wynebu cyhuddiad fod hyn yn wrthwynebiad di-dystiolaeth.

Yr ydym yn fodlon ar y modd y mae'r mesur yn symud drwy San Steffan, ond ni fyddwn fyth yn rhyfygu ar Dŷ'r Arglwyddi nac ar Dŷ'r ASau.

Cyfeiriau yn gyflym at y sylwadau pwysig a wnaeth Christine Chapman am raglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a'r sylwadau gan Jeff Cuthbert am sgiliau. Y pedair colofn sgiliau yr ydym yn gweithio arnynt yw: cynllun y brentisiaeth fodern—yr ydym wedi buddsoddi llawer ynddo—bagloriaeth Cymru; llwybrau dysgu; a'r cyfnod meithrin 3 i 7 oed, cwricwlwm Llychlyn sy'n seiliedig ar ddysgu drwy chwarae.

I ymateb i Christine Chapman, mae'r ymrwymiad i strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd, fel un o'r rhaglenni strategol y bydd yr Amcan 1 newydd yn seiliedig arni, yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Soniasoch hefyd am y gwaith Phurnacite, sy'n enghraifft glasurol o'n Llywodraeth gadarnhaol. Bu'n rhaid aros 15 mlynedd am Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, 10 mlynedd am weithfeydd Phurnacite, a 10 mlynedd hefyd am gynllun adfywio Brymbo, ond yr ydym wedi dal ati ac wedi datrys y problemau. Mae hynny'n arwydd o Lywodraeth sy'n gallu cyflawni. Credaf fod gennym wrthblaid gwynfanllyd, a dyna pam yr wyf yn argymhell gwrthod holl welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau heddiw.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 15, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 2: For 15, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice

Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wood, Leanne

Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 15, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 15, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Melding, David
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 6: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 7: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3192): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report of the First Minister 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 July 2006.

Cynnig (NDM3192): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Weinidog 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Gorffennaf 2006.

*Cynnig (NDM3192): O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.
Motion (NDM3192): For 34, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion The Report of the Committee on School Funding

William Graham: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Committee on School Funding titled, 'Report on School Funding Arrangements in Wales' which was laid in the Table Office (LD5751) on 14 June 2006. (NDM3188)

I am delighted to present the Committee on School Funding's report on school funding arrangements in Wales.

Members will recall that the committee was set up by the Assembly last year to review school funding arrangements, and to recommend how the system could be made clearer and simpler. This was realised despite the Assembly Government's opposition at the

William Graham: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, 'Adroddiad ar Drefniadau Ariannu Ysgolion yng Nghymru' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno (LD5751) ar 14 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3188)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu ysgolion ar drefniadau ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio i'r pwyllgor gael ei sefydlu gan y Cynulliad y llynedd i adolygu'r trefniadau ariannu ysgolion, ac argymhell ffordd o wneud y system yn fwy clir ac yn fwy syml. Gwireddwyd hyn er gwaethaf gwrthwynebiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y

time. I am therefore pleased that the committee has been able to reach unanimous agreement on this report and its recommendations. Committee members put aside party-political considerations to work together maturely, to agree important and wide-ranging recommendations to help to improve how schools in Wales are funded. I am also pleased to note, from the Minister's written statement yesterday, that the Assembly Government has broadly welcomed the report and, in principle at least, a number of its key recommendations.

The committee's report makes a series of recommendations aimed at making the school funding system more easily understood and accessible, particularly by those most directly involved: parents, teachers and school governors. The committee's remit was wide-ranging, but our discussions focused on three broad issues: how funding here compares with that of our neighbours, particularly in England; how funding is distributed to schools—often described as a 'postcode lottery'; and how easy it is to understand how schools are funded, the so-called 'funding fog'.

First, do schools in Wales receive more or less money than schools in England? The evidence that we received was ambiguous. It seems clear that schools in Wales do not, generally, receive more money than schools in England. However, whether they receive less overall depends on how you read the statistics; this may be something of a sterile debate. While it is important to understand how we compare with other countries, it is more important to ensure that school funding in Wales is adequate for our particular needs. The committee agreed that, while information on this is important, spending decisions in Wales should not be driven by what happens in other countries.

The way in which funding is distributed to schools in Wales is of rather more concern. It has been described as a 'postcode lottery'. That description may be rather unfair on those councils that try to make decisions in the best interests of their localities. However, the fact remains that there is wide variation in

pryd. Felly yr wyf yn falch bod y pwyllgor wedi gallu dod i gytundeb unfrydol ar yr adroddiad hwn a'i argymhellion. Rhoddodd aelodau'r pwyllgor ystyriaethau pleidiol o'r neilltu i gydweithio'n aeddfed, i gytuno ar argymhellion pwysig ac eang eu cwmpas er mwyn helpu i wella'r modd y caiff ysgolion Cymru eu hariannu. Yr wyf yn falch sylwi hefyd, o ddatganiad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog ddoe, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn yr adroddiad ar y cyfan, a nifer o'i argymhellion allweddol hefyd, mewn egwyddor o leiaf.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gwneud cyfres o argymhellion sy'n anelu at wneud y system ariannu ysgolion yn haws ei deall, yn arbennig ar gyfer y rhai yr effeithir fwyaf arnynt: rhieni, athrawon a llywodraethwyr ysgolion. Yr oedd cylch gwaith y pwyllgor yn eang, ond yr oedd ein trafodaethau'n canolbwyntio ar dri phrif fater: y modd y mae ariannu yma yn cymharu â'n cymdogion, yn arbennig yn Lloegr; y modd y caiff yr arian ei ddsbarthu i ysgolion—a elwir yn aml yn 'loteri cod post'; a pha mor hawdd yw deall sut y caiff ysgolion eu hariannu, a elwir yn 'niwl ariannu'.

Yn gyntaf, a yw ysgolion yng Nghymru yn cael mwy ynteu llai o arian nag ysgolion yn Lloegr? Yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom yn amwys. Mae'n amlwg nad yw ysgolion yng Nghymru, ar y cyfan, yn cael mwy o arian nag ysgolion yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, o ran pa un a ydynt yn cael llai yn gyffredinol, mae hynny yn dibynnu ar y ffordd y darllenwch yr ystadegau; gallai hyn fod yn ddadl ddiffrwyth. Er ei bod yn bwysig deall sut yr ydym yn cymharu â gwledydd eraill, mae'n bwysicach sicrhau bod ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru yn ddigonol ar gyfer ein hanghenion penodol. Cytunodd y pwyllgor, er bod gwybodaeth am hyn yn bwysig, na ddylai penderfyniadau ar wariant yng Nghymru gael eu llywio gan yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwledydd eraill.

Mae'r modd y caiff arian ei ddsbarthu i ysgolion yng Nghymru yn achosi ychydig mwy o bryder. Mae wedi cael ei ddisgrifio fel 'loteri cod post'. Gallai'r disgrifiad hwnnw fod ychydig yn annheg ar y cynghorau hynny sy'n ceisio gwneud y penderfyniadau gorau ar gyfer eu cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, y gwir

the funding that schools across Wales receive. Some councils spend almost £1,000 more per pupil annually than others. The committee was far from convinced that this level of variation is justified. It is difficult to explain to teachers, governors and parents why their school is being funded at a much lower level than a similar school in a similar area. In our view, a considerable part of the reason for this is that the local government funding formula is driven by historic spending patterns rather than by the money that schools need now, and the funding that they will need in the future.

The main area that we considered on the funding fog was how easy it was to understand how schools are funded.

5.10 p.m.

The committee spent a considerable amount of time looking in detail at how schools in Wales are funded and had the benefit of evidence from the Government's own statisticians. Despite this, we were still left with the perception of a complicated system, which was difficult to understand and where accountability was unclear. If we had these difficulties understanding the current funding system, given the time and resources available to us, then teachers, governors and parents must find it almost impenetrable.

The report makes 27 specific recommendations. I do not intend to go through those in detail today, but I will highlight some of the key ones. First and foremost, it has dismayed us to find that the formula for distributing funding to local authorities is based on historic spending patterns. In other words, the funding that the Assembly Government gives to local authorities for education is based on what spending used to be rather than on what it actually costs to run a school. We believe that it is vital that the overall funding arrangements for schools are based on an objective assessment of schools' current and future needs. Our first key recommendation therefore, recommendation 5, is for the Assembly Government:

yw bod amrywiaeth eang yn yr arian a gaiff ysgolion ar draws Cymru. Mae rhai cynghorau'n gwario bron £1,000 y flwyddyn yn fwy ar bob disgybl nag eraill. Nid oedd y pwyllgor yn argyhoeddedig o gwbl ei bod yn bosibl cyfiawnhau amrywiaeth o'r fath. Mae'n anodd egluro i athrawon, llywodraethwyr a rhieni pam mae eu hysgol yn cael llawer llai o arian nag ysgol debyg mewn ardal debyg. Yn ein barn ni, rhan fawr o'r rheswm dros hyn yw y caiff fformiwla ariannu llywodraeth leol ei llywio gan arferion gwario hanesyddol yn hytrach na'r arian y mae ei angen ar ysgolion ar hyn o bryd, a'r arian y bydd ei angen arnynt yn y dyfodol.

Y prif faes a drafodwyd gennym o ran y 'niwl ariannu' yw pa mor hawdd yw deall sut y caiff ysgolion eu hariannu.

Treuliodd y pwyllgor gryn amser yn edrych yn fanwl ar y ffordd y caiff ysgolion yng Nghymru eu hariannu gan fanteisio ar dystiolaeth gan ystadegwyr y Llywodraeth ei hun. Er hynny, ein teimlad oedd bod y system yn un gymhleth, ac yn anodd ei deall lle yr oedd atebolrwydd yn aneglur. Os oeddem yn cael anawsterau felly wrth geisio deall y system ariannu bresennol, o ystyried yr amser a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael inni, yna mae'n rhaid ei bod yn amhosibl i athrawon, llywodraethwyr a rhieni ei datrys.

Gwna'r adroddiad 27 o argymhellion penodol. Nid wyf yn bwriadu eu trafod yn fanwl heddiw, ond amlinellaf rai o'r rhai allweddol. Yn gyntaf, ac yn bennaf, yr oedd yn siom gweld bod y fformiwla ar gyfer dosbarthu arian i awdurdodau lleol yn seiliedig ar arferion gwario hanesyddol. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'r arian a gaiff ei roi i awdurdodau lleol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad at ddibenion addysg yn seiliedig ar yr hyn a arferai'r gwariant fod yn hytrach na'r costau gwirioneddol o redeg ysgol. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol i drefniadau ariannu cyffredinol ar gyfer ysgolion fod yn seiliedig ar asesiad gwrthrychol o anghenion presennol ysgolion a'u hanghenion yn y dyfodol. Felly, ein hargymhelliad allweddol cyntaf, sef argymhelliad 5, yw:

'to review the education element of the local government distribution formula so that it is based on the current and future costs of providing education rather than on historic costs'.

Other key recommendations build on this approach. There is currently no common understanding of schools' basic funding needs. We recommend therefore, in recommendations 15, 16 and 17, that,

'Alongside a forward looking funding formula...the Assembly Government should establish basic funding requirements for...schools...and...local authorities should be expected to demonstrate that as a minimum they are spending up to that level'.

This will still leave councils free to determine local needs, but there will be better evidence to inform their decisions and they will be more accountable for their decisions if they choose to fund schools below basic levels of need. These, then, are our key recommendations: a forward-looking funding formula and schools funded according to agreed needs.

We also made a number of other important recommendations. We recommended that a three-year budget for schools be introduced as a priority. We believe that this recommendation will be widely welcomed, as it would help schools to plan more effectively and with greater certainty.

Although deprivation and sparsity are taken into account in allocating funding to LEAs, we are not convinced that the balance between the two is correct or is based on an objective assessment of need. We recommend that this should be reviewed to ensure that the right weighting is given to these important factors.

We are very surprised to learn that there is very little evidence of a link between funding and attainment. What evidence there is appears to be unclear. An evidence-based approach to education policy needs to address this gap in the evidence, and we have recommended that the Assembly Government

y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad 'adolygu'r elfen addysg yn y fformiwla dosbarthu cyllid llywodraeth leol er mwyn ei seilio ar gost darparu addysg yn awr ac yn y dyfodol yn hytrach nag ar gostau hanesyddol'.

Mae argymhellion allweddol eraill yn adeiladu ar y dull hwn. Nid oes unrhyw ddealltwriaeth gyffredin ar hyn o bryd o anghenion ariannu sylfaenol ysgolion. Argymhellwn, felly, yn argymhellion 15, 16 ac 17,

'Ochr yn ochr â fformiwla ariannu sy'n edrych at y dyfodol...dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad bennu gofynion ariannu sylfaenol ar gyfer pob Ysgol yng Nghymru ac y dylid disgwyl i'r awdurdodau lleol wario hyd at y lefel honno o leiaf'.

Bydd hyn yn rhoi rhyddid i gynghorau benderfynu anghenion lleol a bydd gwell tystiolaeth i lywio'u penderfyniadau, a byddant yn fwy atebol am eu penderfyniadau os byddant yn dewis ariannu ysgol islaw'r lefel sylfaenol o anghenion. Y rhain, felly, yw ein hargymhellion allweddol: fformiwla ariannu sy'n edrych ymlaen, ac ysgolion yn cael eu hariannu'n unol ag anghenion wedi eu cytuno.

Gwnaethom nifer o argymhellion pwysig eraill. Argymhellwyd y dylid cyflwyno cyllideb tair blynedd i ysgolion fel blaenoriaeth. Credwn y caiff yr argymhelliad hwn groeso brwd, gan y bydd yn cynorthwyo ysgolion i gynllunio'n fwy effeithiol a chyda mwy o sicrwydd.

Er bod amddifadedd a theneurwydd yn cael eu hystyried wrth ddyrannu arian i AALLau, nid ydym yn argyhoeddedig bod y cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau yn gywir nac yn seiliedig ar asesiad gwrthrychol o angen. Argymhellwn y dylid adolygu hyn i sicrhau rhoi'r pwyslais cywir ar y ffactorau pwysig hyn.

Yr ydym wedi synnu mai ychydig iawn o dystiolaeth sydd bod cysylltiad rhwng ariannu a chyrhaeddiad. Ymddengys fod unrhyw dystiolaeth sydd ar gael yn aneglur. Rhaid i dull polisi addysg sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth fynd i'r afael â'r bwch hwn yn y dystiolaeth, ac yr ydym wedi argymhell bod

addresses this by commissioning detailed research in this area. There is also a gap in the statistical evidence base when you try to compare spending on schools in Wales compared with that in other parts of the United Kingdom. As education policies diverge because of devolution, it is becoming increasingly difficult to make meaningful comparisons. Similarly, it is not always clear how Barnett consequential funding is used in Wales. We recommend that the Government should seek to establish meaningful statistical comparators as an aid to scrutiny, and it should make more information available on education-related Barnett consequentials.

We encountered widespread criticism over the Government's target of making all schools in Wales fit for purpose by 2010, and whether it would be met. We have therefore recommended that the Assembly Government should either require local authorities to spend more on school capital improvements or consider making additional resources available to meet its own target. We have also made other recommendations aimed at improving information and clarity and helping schools to plan ahead effectively.

It is not possible in the time available to cover all aspects of the report, but I understand that the Minister intends to further outline the Cabinet's initial written response to the report in today's debate. I welcome this, and I am very pleased that she has chosen to give an early response. As I mentioned earlier, I am also delighted that yesterday's Cabinet statement suggested that it has, in broad terms, accepted the direction of travel that the report advocates. Our report has already started a vigorous debate on how we ensure that our schools are properly and fairly funded, and I hope that Members' contribution today, particularly the Minister's response, will help to shape that debate further into positive action based on our recommendations to help to clear some of the fog that surrounds school funding in Wales.

I thank all those who presented evidence to the committee. I also thank members of the committee for the mature and consensual way

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynd i'r afael â hyn drwy gomisiynu ymchwil fanwl i'r maes hwn. Mae yna fwch hefyd yn y dystiolaeth ystadegol os ceisiwch gymharu gwariant ar ysgolion yng Nghymru â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Wrth i bolisiâu addysg wahanu oherwydd datganoli, mae'n fwyfwy anodd gwneud cymariaethau ystyrlon. Yn yr un modd, nid yw bob amser yn glir sut y defnyddir arian canlyniadol Barnett yng Nghymru. Argymhellwn fod y Llywodraeth yn ceisio pennu cymariaethau ystadegol ystyrlon i gynorthwyo'r broses graffu, ac y dylai sicrhau bod mwy o wybodaeth ar gael am ganlyniadau Barnett sy'n berthnasol i addysg.

Clywsom feirniadaeth eang o darged y Llywodraeth i wneud pob ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010, ac a gâi hynny ei gyflawni. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad naill ai ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol wario mwy ar welliannau cyfalaf i ysgolion, neu ystyried darparu adnoddau ychwanegol i gyrraedd ei tharged ei hun. Yr ydym wedi gwneud argymhellion eraill hefyd yn ymwneud â gwella gwybodaeth ac eglurder, a helpu ysgolion i gynllunio ymlaen yn effeithiol.

Nid yw'n bosibl o fewn yr amser sydd ar gael i gyflwyno pob agwedd ar yr adroddiad, ond deallaf ei bod yn fwriad gan y Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar ymateb ysgrifenedig cyntaf y Cabinet i'r adroddiad yn ystod y ddadl heddiw. Croesawaf hyn, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn ei bod wedi dewis rhoi ymateb buan. Fel y soniais yn gynharach, yr wyf hefyd yn falch bod datganiad y Cabinet ddoe yn awgrymu ei fod, ar y cyfan, wedi derbyn y cyfeiriad a gaiff ei argymhell gan yr adroddiad. Mae ein hadroddiad eisoes wedi ysgogi dadl fywiog ar y ffordd y gallwn sicrhau y caiff ein hysgolion eu hariannu'n briodol ac yn deg, a'r gobaith yw y bydd cyfraniad yr Aelodau heddiw, yn arbennig ymateb y Gweinidog, yn helpu llywio'r ddadl honno ymhellach a'i throï'n gamau gweithredu cadarnhaol yn seiliedig ar ein hargymhellion i helpu i chwalu peth o'r niwl ynglŷn ag ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Diolchaf i bawb a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor. Diolchaf hefyd i aelodau'r pwyllgor am y ffordd aeddfed a chydysniol

in which they approached their task, which resulted in a unanimously agreed report. Finally, I express my thanks, and those of the committee, to the staff of the Assembly's committee and research service for their help in producing the report. I commend the report to the Assembly and to the Minister.

Lynne Neagle: I warmly welcome today's debate on the report of the Committee on School Funding and I take this opportunity to thank the many teachers and school governors from Torfaen who took the time to meet with me and make representations to me in the course of my time as a member of the committee. I also thank Torfaen local education authority for its invaluable briefing.

Having campaigned on school funding issues for many years, I am delighted that we have now achieved real cross-party consensus on this most important of issues. Over the past year, the committee has heard evidence from educational experts, trade unions, local government representatives and Assembly officials. While there were many and varied suggestions about how best to improve the school funding system in Wales, there was near universal agreement on one key point—the current system is simply not delivering fairness in education funding.

The 27 recommendations made in the report will go a long way to improving matters. They should help to establish a formula that better reflects need and does not rely on historical spend or regression analysis, which to my mind, are fancy titles for received opinion and habit. There is a spending gap of almost £1,000 per pupil per year between the lowest-spending local authority and the highest. This is manifestly unjust. One of the basic commitments of the Labour Assembly Government is to equality—equality of aspiration, equality of opportunity and equality of access to the best public services. By denying our children an equal share of education funding, we risk fatally undermining our social justice agenda. If we value the richness of the educational experience of a child in Torfaen as much as that of a child in Ceredigion, the status quo cannot continue.

yr aethant ati i drafod y gwaith, a arweiniodd at adroddiad cytûn. Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch ar fy rhan i ac ar ran y pwyllgor i staff gwasanaeth pwyllgor ac ymchwil y Cynulliad am eu cymorth wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad. Cyflwynaf yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad ac i'r Gweinidog.

Lynne Neagle: Croesawaf y ddadl heddiw ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, a manteisiaf ar y cyfle i ddiolch i'r holl athrawon a'r llywodraethwyr ysgolion o Dorfaen a roddodd o'u hamser i gwrdd â mi a chyflwyno sylwadau imi yn ystod fy nghyfnod fel aelod o'r pwyllgor. Diolch hefyd i awdurdod iechyd lleol Torfaen am ei wybodaeth werthfawr.

Ar ôl ymgyrchu dros faterion ariannu ysgolion am flynyddoedd, yr wyf yn falch ein bod bellach wedi sicrhau cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y mater pwysig hwn. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'r pwyllgor wedi clywed tystiolaeth gan arbenigwyr addysg, undebau llafur, cynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol a swyddogion y Cynulliad. Er bod nifer o awgrymiadau amrywiol ynghylch y ffordd orau o wella'r system ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru, cafwyd cytundeb gan bron bawb ar un pwynt allweddol—nad yw'r system bresennol yn deg o ran ariannu addysg.

Bydd y 27 o argymhellion a wnaed yn yr adroddiad yn gwneud llawer i wella'r sefyllfa. Dylent helpu pennu fformiwla sy'n adlewyrchu angen yn well, ac nad yw'n dibynnu ar wariant hanesyddol na dadansoddiad atchweliad, sef enwau ffansi am farn dderbyniedig ac arfer, yn fy marn i. Mae bwlech gwariant o bron £1,000 y disgybl y flwyddyn rhwng yr awdurdod lleol sydd â'r gwariant lleiaf a'r un sydd â'r gwariant mwyaf. Mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n annheg. Un o ymrwymadau sylfaenol Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yw cydraddoldeb—dyhead cyfartal, cyfle cyfartal a mynediad cyfartal i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gorau. Drwy wrthod cyfran deg o arian addysg i'n plant, yr ydym yn peryglu tanseilio ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i raddau helaeth. Os gwerthfawrogwn gyfoeth profiad addysgol plentyn yng Nhorfaen gymaint â phrofiad addysg plentyn yng Ngheredigion, ni all y

sefyllfa sydd ohoni barhau.

As things currently stand, half of all local authorities in Wales spend below their education indicative baseline assessments. In other words, they spend less than the Assembly gives them for education on education. This report outlines steps that can be taken to correct this aberration. A key step will be the new use of local authority IBA as an explicit target for education spend. If local authorities choose to spend below this target, they must make their reasons for doing so available to the Welsh Assembly Government, as well as to their full council and school budget fora. I agree with the Minister when she points out that this will aid both transparency of funding and local accountability. It will also afford the Assembly Government a new opportunity to work with those local authorities that are currently falling below their education IBA, and help to boost their investment in our children's future.

WAG has already instructed local authorities to ensure that schools in the most deprived areas get the funding that they need, using a deprivation factor in their formula. Unfortunately, not all local authorities are doing this. Recommendation 12 calls on the Assembly Government to require that they do so. There is no point in having guidelines if they are not followed, and the ethos of this report is to move from guidance to compliance. If we allocate extra assistance to children whose education is corroded by deprivation, then we have a duty to those children to deliver the cash. If we do not, then we are engaged in a cruel deception.

This is not only an issue for local government, however. We must also ensure that fairness lies at the heart of the Assembly's own funding formula for local government. Key to achieving this are recommendations 2 and 5 in the report, on which some work is already being done, following sustained calls from me and from other Labour Members. These

Fel y mae pethau ar hyn o bryd, mae hanner yr holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn gwario llai na'u hasesiadau sylfaenol dangosol ar gyfer addysg. Mewn geiriau eraill, maent yn gwario llai ar addysg na'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei roi iddynt ar gyfer addysg. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amlinellu'r camau y gellir eu cymryd i unioni'r gwarth hwnnw. Un o'r camau allweddol fydd y defnydd newydd o asesiad sylfaenol dangosol awdurdod lleol fel targed penodol ar gyfer gwariant ar addysg. Os bydd awdurdodau lleol yn dewis gwario llai na'r targed hwn, rhaid iddynt roi eu rhesymau i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros wneud hynny, a hefyd i'w cyngor llawn a fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog pan ddywed y bydd hyn yn helpu gwneud ariannu ac atebolrwydd lleol yn eglur. Bydd hefyd yn gyfle newydd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sy'n gwario llai na'u hasesiad sylfaenol dangosol ar gyfer addysg, ac i helpu hybu eu buddsoddiad yn nyfodol ein plant.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol eisoes i sicrhau y caiff ysgolion yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yr arian sydd ei angen arnynt, gan ddefnyddio ffactor amddifadedd yn eu fformiwla. Yn anffodus, nid yw pob un o'r awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud hyn. Mae argymhelliad 12 yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'w gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt wneud hynny. Nid oes diben cael canllawiau os na chânt eu dilyn, ac ethos yr adroddiad hwn yw trosglwyddo o ganllawiau i gydymffurfio. Os dyrannwn gymorth ychwanegol i blant y caiff amddifadedd effaith andwyol ar eu haddysg, yna mae gennym ddyletswydd i'r plant hynny i roi'r arian. Os na wnawn hynny, yna yr ydym yn twyllo'n greulon.

Fodd bynnag, nid mater i lywodraeth leol yn unig yw hwn. Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd bod tegwch wrth wraidd fformiwla ariannu'r Cynulliad ei hun ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Mae argymhellion 2 a 5 yn yr adroddiad yn allweddol i wneud hyn, ac mae rhywfaint o waith yn cael ei wneud eisoes ar hyn, yn dilyn galwadau parhaus gennyf fi a chan Aelodau Llafur eraill. Mae'r argymhellion

recommendations call for a forward-looking funding formula, not one based on historic spend, which is a system of calculation that is almost designed to reinforce inequality.

There is also a call for a comprehensive review of the sparsity weightings used to calculate education allocations. When we are allocating billions of pounds of public money across Wales in the local government settlement, we must be satisfied that we are doing so through a calculation that is both socially just and evidence-based. It is a common-sense call that I have made on numerous occasions, supported by other Labour AMs. No persuasive case has ever been made in favour of the current sparsity weightings in the local government formula, and it is a welcome relief that, after some seven years of making the call for a socially just funding system, a genuinely comprehensive review has now been promised.

Let us be clear: without a change in the system, we will continue to divert millions of pounds away from the areas of greatest need. The issue here is about our duty to our children and our duty to be fair. It is bad enough that Assembly investment in children is diverted elsewhere, but it is even worse that we ourselves skew funding away from deprived communities through laziness or habit. This report is an honest bid for fairness in school funding in Wales. I commend it to the Assembly.

Mark Isherwood: I warmly welcome this report. It was, in fact, on 14 June last year that opposition parties defeated the Assembly Government and forced it to establish the Committee on School Funding. People need to be reminded that every single Labour Member voted against us on that day, despite the funding fog identified by headteachers' organisations, despite a postcode lottery in which pupils are funded on the basis of where they live rather than what they need, and despite the funding gap identified between English and Welsh schools.

hyn yn galw am fformiwla ariannu flaengar, yn hytrach na fformiwla'n seiliedig ar wariant hanesyddol, system gyfrifo sydd bron wedi'i chynllunio i atgyfnerthu anghydraddoldeb.

Gelwir hefyd am adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r pwysoliadau teneurwydd poblogaeth i'w defnyddio i gyfrifo dyraniadau addysg. Pan fyddwn yn dyrannu biliynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus ledled Cymru yn y setliad llywodraeth leol, rhaid inni fod yn fodlon ein bod yn gwneud hynny drwy gyfrifiad sy'n gymdeithasol deg ac yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Mae'n alwad yn seiliedig ar synnwyr cyffredin a wneuthum lawer gwaith, gyda chefnogaeth ACau Llafur eraill. Nid oes achos darbwyllo cryf erioed wedi ei wneud o blaid y pwysoliadau teneurwydd poblogaeth presennol yn y fformiwla llywodraeth leol, a dylid croesawu'r ffaith, ar ôl saith mlynedd o alw am system ariannu gymdeithasol deg, fod adolygiad gwirioneddol gynhwysfawr wedi'i addo bellach.

Gadewch inni fod yn glir: heb newid yn y system, byddwn yn dal i ddargyfeirio miliynau o bunnoedd o'r ardaloedd lle mae'r angen mwyaf. Mae a wnelo hyn â'n dyletswydd i'n plant a'n dyletswydd i fod yn deg. Mae'n ddigon gwael bod buddsoddiad y Cynulliad mewn plant yn cael ei ddargyfeirio i rywle arall, ond mae hyd yn oed yn waeth ein bod ni ein hunain yn dargyfeirio arian o gymunedau difreintiedig oherwydd diogi neu arfer. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymgais onest i sicrhau tegwch wrth ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru. Fe'i cymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad.

Mark Isherwood: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mewn gwirionedd, ar 14 Mehefin y llynedd trechodd y gwrthbleidiau Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i gorfodi i sefydlu Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion. Mae angen atgoffa pobl fod pob Aelod Llafur wedi pleidleisio yn ein herbyn y diwrnod hwnnw, er gwaethaf yr aneglurder am ariannu a nodwyd gan sefydliadau penaethiaid, er gwaethaf loteri cod post lle caiff disgyblion eu hariannu yn ôl ble maent yn byw yn hytrach na'r hyn sydd ei angen arnynt, ac er gwaethaf y bwloch ariannu a nodwyd rhwng ysgolion yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr.

5.20 p.m.

In that debate, I highlighted the unsustainability of a situation in which the worst-funded primary schools in Wales, which are in Flintshire, received £941 less per pupil than the best-funded primary schools in Wales, the worst-funded secondary schools in Wales, which are in Denbighshire, received £696 less per pupil than the best-funded secondary schools in Wales, and the overall worst-funded schools in Wales, which are in Flintshire, received £754 less per pupil than the best-funded schools in Wales. As I stated then, some Governments have straight-talking education Ministers, but the Welsh Assembly Government has Jane Davidson, the Minister for disappearing dosh. In pursuit of countless initiatives, strategies and gimmicks, she robs Peter to pay Paul and digs up the foundations of Welsh education as she builds her legacy on sand. This 'not me, guv' Minister launches stealth policies that have outcomes that are inevitable, but which are blamed on local authorities, front-line teaching professionals—and quangos, when we had them. Nowhere has this been more evident than in relation to school funding. I believe that the report that is before us today validates the comments that I made last June.

There is insufficient time today to comment on all the report's recommendations, but they collectively represent the voice of sound common sense, which we have needed for so long. As I have identified in Plenary and in committee, on many occasions, there is a strong correlation between the Welsh Assembly Government funding that is provided to local authorities through the revenue support grant and the funding level per pupil in each county. I therefore strongly welcome recommendation 5, that the Assembly Government should immediately set in train a review of the local government distribution formula, so that the education element is based on the current and future costs of providing education services, rather than on historic costs.

I welcome recommendation 13, that the Assembly Government should publish

Yn y ddadl honno, tynnais sylw at anghynaliadwyedd sefyllfa lle yr oedd yr ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru a ariennir waethaf, sydd yn sir y Fflint, yn cael £941 yn llai y pen na'r ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru a ariennir orau; lle yr oedd yr ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru a ariennir waethaf, sydd yn sir Ninbych, yn cael £696 yn llai y pen na'r ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru a ariennir orau, a lle yr oedd yr ysgolion yng Nghymru a ariennir waethaf yn gyffredinol, sydd yn sir y Fflint, yn cael £754 yn llai y pen na'r ysgolion a ariennir orau yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais ar y pryd, mae gan rai Llywodraethau Weinidogion addysg sy'n siarad yn blaen, ond mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros arian sy'n diflannu. I fynd ar drywydd mentrau, strategaethau a gimigau niferus, mae'n dwyn yr hen i dalu'r newydd ac yn dinistrio sylfeini addysg yng Nghymru wrth iddi adeiladu ei hetifeddiaeth ar dywod. Mae'r Gweinidog 'nid fi' yma yn lansio polisiau'n llechwraidd sydd â chanlyniadau anochel, ond gan roi'r bai ar awdurdodau lleol, gweithwyr addysg proffesiynol yn y rheng flaen, a chwangos pan oeddent yn bodoli. Yr oedd hyn ar ei fwyaf amlwg mewn perthynas ag ariannu ysgolion. Credaf fod yr adroddiad sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn dilysu'r sylwadau a wneuthum fis Mehefin diwethaf.

Nid oes digon o amser heddiw i sôn am holl argymhellion yr adroddiad, ond ar y cyd maent yn cynrychioli llais synnwyr cyffredin cadarn, y bu ei angen arnom ers cymaint o amser. Fel yr wyf wedi'i nodi mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn ac yn y pwyllgor droeon, mae perthynas gref rhwng arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a roddir i awdurdodau lleol drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw a lefel yr arian y pen ym mhob sir. Felly, croesawaf argymhelliad 5 yn fawr, sef y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fynd ati ar unwaith i wneud adolygiad o fformiwla ddosbarthu llywodraeth leol, er mwyn i'r elfen addysg fod yn seiliedig ar gostau presennol a chostau yn y dyfodol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau addysg, yn hytrach nag ar gostau hanesyddol.

Croesawaf argymhelliad 13, y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi

meaningful comparisons of education spending in Wales and in the other nations and regions of the United Kingdom and internationally. The current school funding formula ignores core fixed costs, therefore recommendation 15 is essential. The Assembly Government must establish and publish minimum common basic funding requirements for school staffing, accommodation and equipment. I warmly welcome recommendation 24 as every headteacher to whom I have ever spoken has told me that three-year budgets for schools should be introduced as a priority.

Recommendation 3 is spot on: as the Wales Audit Office has stated, there should be a review of whether eligibility for free school meals represents the best indicator of deprivation. The shortcomings of a policy that funds schools on this basis, as with the RAISE budget, are highlighted by GCSE underachievement in areas such as Wrexham, which measures low on the deprivation scale and therefore receives less funding, and by the fact that schools in Merthyr Tydfil, one of the most deprived areas, record the best school attendance in Wales. As one headteacher from Merthyr stated, it made him angry when links were automatically made between deprivation and poor achievement. We must apply target measures to underachievement wherever we find it, recognising that the 59 per cent of pupils at the London school with the highest number of free school meals in England and Wales, at 83 per cent, achieved five A* to C passes at GCSE, whereas just 14 per cent of pupils at the Swansea school with the highest number of free school meals in Wales, at 62 per cent, achieved five A* to C passes at GCSE.

As members of the Wrexham schools forum told me and other Assembly Members last November, they were cut to the bone and their objective is to push for a greater overall share of resources for schools in Wales. I mentioned earlier that Flintshire was the biggest loser in the Welsh postcode lottery of school funding and the Flintshire schools budget forum has written to the Minister and the Chair of the Committee on School Funding strongly welcoming the committee's report and wholeheartedly endorsing its

cymariaethau ystyrllon o wariant addysg yng Nghymru ac yng ngwledydd a rhanbarthau eraill y Deyrnas Unedig ac yn rhyngwladol. Mae'r fformiwla bresennol ar gyfer ariannu ysgolion yn anwybyddu costau sefydlog craidd, ac felly mae argymhelliad 15 yn hanfodol. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bennu a chyhoeddi gofynion ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin ar gyfer staffio, adeiladau ac offer ysgolion. Croesawaf argymhelliad 24 yn gynnes gan fod pob pennaeth yr wyf erioed wedi siarad ag ef wedi dweud wrthyf y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gyflwyno cyllidebau tair blynedd i ysgolion.

Mae argymhelliad 3 yn llygad ei le: fel y dywedodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, dylid gwneud adolygiad i weld ai bod yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim yw'r dangosydd gorau o ran amddifadedd. Tynnir sylw at ddiffygion polisi sy'n ariannu ysgolion ar y sail hon, fel gyda chyllideb Rhagori, gan y tangyflawni mewn TGAU mewn ardaloedd megis Wrecsam, sy'n isel ar y raddfa amddifadedd ac felly sy'n cael llai o arian, a chan y ffaith fod gan ysgolion ym Merthyr Tudful, un o'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, y presenoldeb gorau yn yr ysgol yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd un pennaeth o Ferthyr, yr oedd yn ddig pan wnaed cysylltiadau awtomatig rhwng amddifadedd a chyflawni gwael. Rhaid inni gymhwyso mesurau targed i dangyflawni lle bynnag y mae, gan gydnabod bod 59 y cant o'r disgyblion yn yr ysgol yn Llundain sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o ddisgyblion sy'n cael cinio am ddim yng Nghymru a Lloegr, sef 83 y cant, wedi ennill pum TGAU A* i C, a dim ond 14 y cant o'r disgyblion yn yr ysgol yn Abertawe sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o ddisgyblion sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru, sef 62 y cant, a enillodd bum TGAU A* i C.

Fel y dywedodd aelodau o fforwm ysgolion Wrecsam wrthyf fi ac wrth Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad fis Tachwedd diwethaf, cafodd eu harian ei leihau'n ddifrifol a'u hamcan yw pwyso am gyfran fwy o adnoddau yn gyffredinol i ysgolion yng Nghymru. Soniais yn gynharach mai sir y Fflint a oedd fwyaf ar ei cholled yn y loteri cod post yng Nghymru wrth ariannu ysgolion, ac mae fforwm cyllideb ysgolion sir y Fflint wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion i groesawu adroddiad y

recommendations. The forum added that it wished for speedy and just improvements to be actioned by the Welsh Assembly Government in order to move to a more principled and coherent mechanism for the allocation of school budgets in Wales.

I will conclude by quoting from the letter, dated 4 July, from the Gwynedd schools forum to the Minister, Jane Davidson. Although written in the context of the future of schools in Gwynedd's small communities, the comments on cost and price are also hugely appropriate in the context of this report.

'Is it not high time that you are honest and admit that financial reasons, as in all else, drive your policy regarding schools?'

Denise Idris Jones: I will begin by echoing the words of gratitude expressed by William Graham to the numerous representatives from educational circles, from teacher groups to local authority directors, governors, unions, statisticians and academics, who have willingly given of their time and resources to contribute to what has emerged to be a stimulating point of discussion and a thorough review of school funding in Wales.

I welcome the fact that many of the issues surrounding this subject have already been acknowledged in principle by the Government, in response to the Wales Audit Office report, as part of an ongoing review of local government funding in Wales, or in the Minister's statement.

I further stress that the report before you today is born out of consensus, and is thoroughly evidence-based following the input of stakeholders who are committed to the best education of young people across Wales. Given that I do not have the time to explore all of the recommendations here, I feel that it would be appropriate to reflect on the core issues that emerge from the review. These are included in the recommendations that advocate funding on the basis of current and future costs instead of historic spend, coupled to a review of weightings to better reflect needs across Wales. These

pywllgor a chan gymeradwyo ei argymhellion yn frwd. Ychwanegodd y fforwm ei fod am weld gwelliannau cyflym a theg yn cael eu cyflwyno gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn newid i ddull mwy cyfiawn a chydlynol o ddyrannu cyllidebau ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Dof i ben drwy ddyfynnu o'r llythyr, dyddiedig 4 Gorffennaf, gan fforwm ysgolion Gwynedd at y Gweinidog, Jane Davidson. Er iddo gael ei ysgrifennu yng nghyd-destun dyfodol ysgolion yng nghymunedau bach Gwynedd, mae'r sylwadau am gost a phris hefyd yn briodol iawn yng nghyd-destun yr adroddiad hwn.

Onid yw'n hen bryd ichi fod yn onest a chyfaddef mai rhesymau ariannol sy'n llywio eich polisi o ran ysgolion, fel ym mhob maes arall?

Denise Idris Jones: Dechreuaf drwy adleisio'r geiriau o ddiolch a fynegwyd gan William Graham i gynrychiolwyr niferus o gylchoedd addysgol, o grwpiau athrawon i gyfarwyddwyr awdurdodau lleol, llywodraethwyr, undebau, ystadegwyr ac academyddion, sydd wedi rhoi mor barod o'u hamser a'u hadnoddau i gyfrannu at bwynt trafod ysgogol ac adolygiad trylwyr o ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Croesawaf y ffaith fod nifer o'r materion ynghylch y pwnc hwn wedi'u cydnabod mewn egwyddor eisoes gan y Llywodraeth, wrth ymateb i adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, fel rhan o adolygiad parhaus o ariannu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, neu yn natganiad y Gweinidog.

Pwysleisiaf ymhellach fod yr adroddiad ger eich bron heddiw yn seiliedig ar gytundeb barn, ac yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth drylwyr yn dilyn cyfraniad rhanddeiliaid sydd wedi ymroi i'r addysg orau i bobl ifanc ledled Cymru. O gofio nad oes gennyf amser i archwilio'r holl argymhellion yma, teimlaf y byddai'n briodol myfyrio ar y materion craidd sy'n deillio o'r adolygiad. Cynhwysir y rhain yn yr argymhellion sy'n cefnogi ariannu ar sail costau presennol a chostau yn y dyfodol, yn hytrach nag ar wariant hanesyddol, ar y cyd ag adolygiadau o bwysoliadau i adlewyrchu angen ledled

recommendations reflect the priority that our society places on education, and jointly advocate surety of funding allocated for learning. The recommendations work to lift the fog and account for resources through the different tiers of our education system. It is these core recommendations that ultimately reflect the balance of evidence about financing schools, consolidating views that varied from the significant reform of school funding to maintaining current arrangements. They are recommendations that I believe, read together in the context of the report, best represent what is achievable in terms of our starting point, in terms of improving the allocation of funds for education, and in terms of lifting the funding fog.

In conclusion, although I remain more passionate about some recommendations than others, the report is written on the basis of a vast, detailed and thorough review, built on broad consensus, which, I am pleased to see, has been universally welcomed by the education community in Wales. I look forward to a similar endorsement of the report in due course from the Welsh Assembly Government.

Janet Ryder: I am pleased to hear Denise Idris Jones's remarks because when I proposed in Plenary that this committee should be established, Denise said that there was no justification for establishing a committee to look at school funding. I am glad that this committee has done its work so well that it has convinced her of the need to look at how we fund schools.

In that debate, the Minister challenged Plaid Cymru to explain its claim that teachers' unions would welcome such a committee. The evidence that was given to the committee overwhelmingly demonstrates the full support for it from teaching unions, professionals, headteachers, governors, and anybody who has anything to do with schools—everybody wanted to see this committee established, and everybody has fully endorsed its recommendations. It was pleasing, as a member of the committee, to see the reception given to this report by teaching professionals. There is now a great

Cymru yn well. Mae'r argymhellion hyn yn adlewyrchu'r flaenoriaeth y mae ein cymdeithas yn ei rhoi i addysg, ac ar y cyd yn cefnogi sicrwydd ariannu wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer dysgu. Mae'r argymhellion yn egluro'r sefyllfa ac yn cyfrif am adnoddau drwy wahanol haenau ein system addysg. Yr argymhellion craidd hyn yn y pen draw sy'n adlewyrchu'r cydbwysedd o ran tystiolaeth am ariannu ysgolion, gan atgyfnerthu safbwyntiau a oedd yn amrywio o ddiwygio'r system ariannu ysgolion yn sylweddol i barhau'r trefniadau presennol. Credaf mai'r argymhellion hyn, wedi'u darllen gyda'i gilydd yng nghyd-destun yr adroddiad, sy'n cynrychioli orau yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni o ran ein man cychwyn, o ran gwella'r broses o ddyrannu arian i addysg, ac o ran egluro'r sefyllfa ariannu.

I gloi, er fy mod eto'n fwy brwdfrydig dros rai argymhellion na'r lleill, ysgrifennir yr adroddiad ar sail adolygiad helaeth, manwl a thrylwyr, ar sail cytundeb barn eang, ac yr wyf yn falch gweld ei fod wedi'i groesawu gan y gymuned addysg gyfan yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at gymeradwyaeth debyg i'r adroddiad maes o law gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn falch clywed sylwadau Denise Idris Jones oherwydd, pan gynigiais mewn Cyfarfod Llawn y dylid sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn, dywedodd Denise nad oedd cyfiawnhad dros sefydlu pwyllgor i ystyried ariannu ysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch fod y pwyllgor hwn wedi gwneud ei waith cystal fel y mae wedi'i hargyhoeddi o'r angen i ystyried sut yr ariannwn ysgolion.

Yn y ddadl honno, heriodd y Gweinidog Blaid Cymru i egluro ei honiad y byddai undebau athrawon yn croesawu pwyllgor o'r fath. Mae'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor yn dangos yn glir gefnogaeth lawn iddo gan undebau athrawon, gweithwyr proffesiynol, penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr, ac unrhyw un arall sy'n ymwneud ag ysgolion—yr oedd pawb am i'r pwyllgor hwn gael ei sefydlu, ac mae pawb wedi cymeradwyo ei argymhellion yn llawn. Yr oeddwn yn falch, fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, o weld y ffordd y croesawyd yr adroddiad hwn gan weithwyr proffesiynol addysgu. Mae llawer o

deal of expectation among teachers and teaching professionals that these recommendations will be acted upon, and that the Minister will act upon them and fulfil them.

How many more years will those Members who represent north Wales go to schools—Mark referred to this—in the former county of Clwyd, only to be asked, ‘Why aren’t we given as much money as anywhere else?’ and have to say, ‘All we’re told is that it is because of historical reasons?’ That has to stop. We need to fund our schools to teach the curriculum of today, and that means fully assessing the financial need and totally revising the local government school funding formula.

We also need to ensure, as Lynne Neagle pointed out, a level playing field, so that schools within each county do not look at each other and ask why schools that are exactly the same get x thousand pounds more to do the same things. We need to look at that, and I hope that the Minister is prepared to move on those recommendations. In her written responses issued to date, the Minister has said that she is prepared to accept some of those recommendations, but there is a lot of looseness in how she talks about responding, particularly on the need to look at a new formula. The only thing that we will perhaps see is a move to three-year funding, which will be welcome. However, much more could happen now in the Assembly, even within this budget round, as we are looking at budgets. Will the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee be able to look at the budget set for local government, and to look at the education part of the local government settlement?

5.30 p.m.

For too long, nobody has been able to fully scrutinise the money that goes into schools, because it is under the local government settlement. The Local Government and Public Services Committee cannot look at it because it is education funding, and the

ddisgwyliadau bellach ymhlith athrawon a gweithwyr addysgu proffesiynol y bydd yr argymhellion hyn yn cael eu gweithredu, ac y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu arnynt ac yn eu cyflawni.

Sawl blwyddyn arall y bydd yr Aelodau hynny sy’n cynrychioli’r gogledd yn mynd i ysgolion—cyfeiriodd Mark at hyn—yn hen sir Clwyd, ac yn cael y cwestiwn, ‘Pam nad ydym yn cael cymaint o arian ag unrhyw le arall?’ a rhaid iddynt ddweud, ‘Y cyfan a ddywedir wrthym yw mai rhesymau hanesyddol sy’n achosi hyn?’ Rhaid i hynny ddod i ben. Mae angen inni ariannu ein hysgolion i addysgu’r cwricwlwm presennol, ac mae hynny’n golygu asesu’r angen ariannol yn llawn a diwygio’r fformiwla ariannu ysgolion gan lywodraeth leol yn llwyr.

Mae angen inni sicrhau chwarae teg hefyd, fel y dywedodd Lynne Neagle, fel nad yw ysgolion o fewn pob sir yn edrych ar ei gilydd ac yn gofyn pam mae ysgolion sy’n gwneud yn union yr un peth yn cael x o filoedd o bunnoedd yn fwy i wneud yr un pethau. Mae angen inni edrych ar hynny, a gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog yn barod i weithredu ar yr argymhellion hynny. Yn ei hymatebion ysgrifenedig a roddwyd hyd yma, mae’r Gweinidog wedi dweud ei bod yn fodlon derbyn rhai o’r argymhellion hynny, ond mae’n amwys iawn yn y ffordd y mae’n siarad am ymateb, yn arbennig o ran yr angen i ystyried fformiwla newydd. Yr unig beth a welwn efallai fydd cyflwyno ariannu tair blynedd, a groesewir. Fodd bynnag, gallai llawer mwy ddigwydd yn awr yn y Cynulliad, hyd yn oed o fewn cylch y gyllideb hon, gan ein bod yn ystyried cyllidebau. A all y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ystyried y gyllideb a bennir ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, ac ystyried y rhan o’r setliad llywodraeth leol ar gyfer addysg?

Ers gormod o amser, nid oes neb wedi llwyddo i graffu’n llawn ar yr arian sy’n cael ei roi i ysgolion am ei fod o dan y setliad llywodraeth leol. Ni all y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus edrych arno am ei fod yn fater

Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee cannot look at it because it is local government funding. The recommendation says that the Finance Minister must be available to come to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee to answer questions on the local government settlement, so that the committee, which looks at schools, can have an input into it. That is something that could be actioned now, as could the releasing of the other financial information that the recommendations ask for. For instance, how much money is transferred in the block grant to Wales for education? It does not matter how it is used, but how much is transferred across, so that the information is open to public scrutiny? In that way, people can decide how that money is used, and whether it should be used on education.

There are many recommendations in the report that could be put into action in this budget round. I hope that, when the Minister responds in September, she lets us move on some of the recommendations, and tells us how she will start, with her colleague, the Finance Minister, looking at the local government formula so that we can move towards three-year funding and a level playing field for all schools. I hope that the Assembly will fully support the recommendations in the report.

Peter Black: The content of the report is a welcome breath of fresh air in the debate on school funding, which fully justifies setting up the committee in the first place. That also applies to the consensus that is so evident in this debate, across all Assembly parties, in supporting the report's broad thrust and many of its detailed recommendations. If we are able to put the recommendations into place, one of the big gains for the education community, and parents in particular, will be greater transparency in terms of the way in which funding finds its way from the Assembly Government, through the Assembly, to local schools. Many of these recommendations will, as well as achieving greater parity of funding between schools, assist and aid that transparency.

When we have discussed school funding in the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills

ariannu addysgol ac ni all y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau edrych arno am ei fod yn fater ariannu llywodraeth leol. Dywed yr argymhelliad y dylai'r Gweinidog Cyllid fod ar gael i ddod i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i ateb cwestiynau ar y setliad llywodraeth leol fel y gall y pwyllgor, sy'n edrych ar ysgolion, gyfrannu ato. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gellid gweithredu arno yn awr, yn ogystal â rhyddhau'r wybodaeth ariannol arall y mae'r argymhellion yn gofyn amdani. Er enghraifft, faint o arian a drosglwyddir yn y grant bloc i Gymru ar gyfer addysg? Ni waeth sut y caiff ei ddefnyddio, ond faint a drosglwyddir, fel y gall y cyhoedd graffu ar y wybodaeth? Fel hynny gall pobl benderfynu sut y defnyddir yr arian ac a ddylid ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer addysg.

Mae nifer o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad y gellid gweithredu arnynt yn y cylch cyllido hwn. Gobeithio, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb ym mis Medi, y bydd yn gadael inni fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r argymhellion, gan ddweud wrthym sut y bydd yn mynd ati, gyda'i chyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog Cyllid, i edrych ar y fformiwla llywodraeth leol fel y gallwn symud tuag at ariannu tair blynedd a sefyllfa gyfartal i bob ysgol. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad yn llwyr.

Peter Black: Mae cynnwys yr adroddiad yn chwa o awyr iach yn y ddadl ar ariannu ysgolion, sy'n llwyr gyfiawnhau sefydlu'r pwyllgor yn y lle cyntaf. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i'r consensws amlwg yn y ddadl hon, ar draws pob plaid yn y Cynulliad, sy'n cefnogi prif fyrdwn yr adroddiad a nifer o'i argymhellion manwl. Os llwyddwn i roi'r argymhellion ar waith, un o'r prif fanteision i'r gymuned addysg, a'r rhieni'n benodol, fydd mwy o dryloywder yn y ffordd y caiff arian ei drosglwyddo o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy'r Cynulliad i'r ysgolion lleol. Yn ogystal â sicrhau mwy o gysondeb ariannu ymysg ysgolion, bydd nifer o'r argymhellion hyn yn cynorthwyo'r tryloywder hwnnw.

Pan drafodwyd ariannu ysgolion gennym yn y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a

Committee in the past, we have always sought that level of transparency and accountability, and tried to find indicators and measures by which we could establish how much money goes to schools compared with how much money has been allocated. To do so, in the past—and the present for that matter, although this report recommends it as an interim measure—we have relied on the indicator-based assessment, which is an element of the local government funding formula that gives a rough idea of how much was spent on a particular service in the past.

Many had not appreciated the way in which those IBAs were made up, and that they were based on historic spending patterns rather than on what was needed by schools. So, if you looked at an IBA for a particular council, in terms of its educational spend, you were actually looking at how much that council had spent in previous years as opposed to how much it needed to spend. That is one of the reasons why we puzzled so much over why so little money seemed to be going to schools in north-east Wales and the Vale of Glamorgan, while so much went to other parts of Wales, such as Ceredigion, Neath Port Talbot, and so on. It was simply because that was the historic spending pattern on education. There was no attempt to relate the spending to what the schools needed.

Another by-product of these recommendations—Lynne Neagle referred to this—is that we will hopefully be able to understand the way in which deprivation scarcity is accounted for in the funding distribution to local schools. That is also important. We will hopefully have comparable statistics, so that we can make the necessary comparisons to establish whether schools are being short changed, or whether local authorities are meeting their obligations in terms of funding. It will also help local electors to make that judgment when it comes to voting in local elections.

It has been mentioned on a number of occasions that we need three-year funding. I have been banging on about that for a long

Sgiliau yn y gorffennol, yr ydym bob amser wedi ceisio sicrhau'r lefel honno o dryloywder ac atebolrwydd ac wedi ceisio dod o hyd i ddangosyddion a mesurau er mwyn cadarnhau faint o arian sy'n mynd i'r ysgolion o'i gymharu â faint o arian sydd wedi ei ddyrannu. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, yn y gorffennol—a'r presennol o ran hynny, er bod yr adroddiad hwn yn ei argymhell fel mesur dros dro—yr ydym wedi dibynnu ar yr asesiad ar sail dangosyddion, sy'n elfen o'r fformiwla cyllido llywodraeth leol sy'n rhoi brasamcan o faint a gafodd ei wario ar wasanaeth penodol yn y gorffennol.

Yr oedd heb sylweddoli sut y lluniwyd yr asesiadau hynny, a'u bod yn seiliedig ar batrymau gwario hanesyddol, yn hytrach nag ar yr hyn yr oedd ei angen ar yr ysgolion. Felly, os byddech yn edrych ar asesiad ar gyfer cyngor arbennig, o ran ei wariant addysgol, yr oeddech, mewn gwirionedd, yn edrych ar faint a wariwyd gan y cyngor arbennig hwnnw mewn blynyddoedd a fu yn hytrach na faint yr oedd arno angen ei wario. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y buom yn pendroni gymaint ynghylch pam y mae'n ymddangos bod cyn lleied o arian yn cael ei ddyrannu i ysgolion yn y gogledd-ddwyrain a Bro Morgannwg, a chymaint yn cael ei ddyrannu i rannau eraill o Gymru, fel Ceredigion, Castell-nedd a Phort Talbot ac yn y blaen. Yn syml, yr oedd hyn i'w briodoli i'r patrwm gwario hanesyddol ar addysg. Nid oedd unrhyw ymgais i gysylltu'r gwariant â'r hyn yr oedd ei angen ar yr ysgolion.

Rhywbeth arall sy'n deillio o'r argymhellion hyn—cyfeiriodd Lynne Neagle at hyn—yw'r ffaith y byddwn, gobeithio, yn gallu deall y modd y cyfrifir prinder amddifadedd yn y dyraniadau ariannu i ysgolion lleol. Mae hynny hefyd yn bwysig. Bydd gennym, gobeithio, ystadegau cymaradwy, fel y gallwn wneud y cymariaethau angenrheidiol i ganfod pa un a yw ysgolion ar eu colled, neu pa un a yw awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau o ran ariannu. Bydd hefyd yn helpu etholwyr lleol i farnu hynny yng nghyd-destun pleidleisio mewn etholiadau lleol.

Crybwyllwyd droeon fod angen ariannu tair blynedd arnom. Yr wyf wedi bod yn sôn am hyn ers tro, felly hefyd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn

time, as have my Welsh Liberal Democrat colleagues and other parties. We think that three-year funding is essential to give that element of stability for headteachers.

Above all, we need to establish the minimum common basic funding requirement for schools, based on staffing, accommodation and equipment, and use that to benchmark and inform decision making. If we do not have that benchmark, and if it is not based on realistic costs, we, as an Assembly, will not be able to scrutinise properly the actions of Ministers in terms of how they allocate money.

I believe that these measures will transform the way that schools are funded. They will offer certainty for schools and open up the process for everybody. Although the Minister has issued a written statement making positive noises, we will need to wait until September for her full response. I hope that she can accept and implement all of these recommendations.

I have a few more quick points—I notice that time is getting on. Sustainability is an important factor in terms of grants. Too many schools complain that they receive grants late in the day and do not know how long they will receive the grants for, so they cannot plan. Often there is a huge amount of bureaucracy associated with them and there is rarely an exit plan. That should change.

I have already discussed capital funding in an earlier debate, but it is worth making a few additional points. Despite the significant increase in capital spend, it is clear that not all the unhypothecated capital moneys included in the Government's £560 million over four years is being spent on school buildings. We believe that that should be rectified.

I take on board the £749 million shortfall identified by PricewaterhouseCoopers. I know that this report has only recently been published and that the Minister needs time to digest it, but the point about the Government's pledge to make all school buildings fit for purpose by 2010 still stands. If that is not achievable, the Minister needs to

y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghymru a phleidiau eraill. Yr ydym o'r farn bod ariannu tair blynedd yn hanfodol er mwyn rhoi'r elfen honno o sefydlogrwydd i benaethiaid.

Yn anad dim, mae angen inni gadarnhau'r gofyniad ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin gwaelodol i ysgolion yn seiliedig ar staffio, adeiladau ac ystafelloedd ac offer, gan ddefnyddio hwnnw fel sail ar gyfer penderfyniadau a meincnodi. Os nad yw'r meincnod hwnnw gennym, ac os nad yw'n seiliedig ar gostau realistig, ni fyddai modd inni, fel Cynulliad, graffu'n iawn ar weithredoedd Gweinidogion o ran y modd y maent yn dyrannu arian.

Credaf y bydd y mesurau hyn yn trawsnewid y modd yr ariennir ysgolion. Byddant yn cynnig sicrwydd i ysgolion ac yn gwneud y broses yn fwy agored i bawb. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig sy'n gadarnhaol ei naws, bydd angen inni aros tan fis Medi am ei hymateb llawn. Gobeithio y gall dderbyn pob un o'r argymhellion hyn a gweithredu arnynt.

Mae gennyf ychydig bwyntiau byr pellach—sylwaf fod yr amser yn mynd yn ei flaen. Mae cynaliadwyedd yn ffactor pwysig o ran grantiau. Mae gormod o ysgolion yn cwyno eu bod yn cael grantiau'n hwyr ac ni wyddant am ba hyd y byddant yn cael y grantiau, felly ni allant gynllunio. Yn aml, mae llawer iawn o fiwrocratiaeth ynghlwm â hwy ac anaml y bydd cynllun ymadael. Dylai hynny newid.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi trafod ariannu cyfalaf mewn dadl gynharach, ond mae'n werth gwneud ychydig bwyntiau ychwanegol. Er gwaethaf y cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant cyfalaf, mae'n glir na chaiff yr holl arian cyfalaf heb ei neilltuo a gynhwysir yn £560 miliwn y Llywodraeth dros bedair blynedd ei wario ar adeiladau ysgol. Credwn y dylid unioni hyn.

Cydnabyddaf y diffyg o £749 miliwn a nodwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers. Gwn mai'n ddiweddar y cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad hwn a bod angen amser yr y Gweinidog i'w ddadansoddi, ond mae'r pwynt ynghylch addewid y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010 yn parhau. Os nad yw'n gyraeddadwy, mae

say so and set a new target that we can all understand and which can be achieved.

Carl Sargeant: I welcome this report to the Assembly and congratulate the committee on the work that it has undertaken to give clarity to the Assembly on school funding. I endorse the comments made by Lynne Neagle. We share an awful lot of common ground on education funding and the thoughts behind that. My colleague, Sandy Mewies, and I, representing Flintshire, have made many representations to the Minister on school funding over many years. Many of the recommendations in this report are key to our thoughts.

I welcome recommendation 24 on a three-year funding stream. It is important that we synchronise funding across all portfolios to cover three years. The social justice budgets do that, and I think that that would be helpful to schools in planning for the years ahead.

On recommendation 3, which supports the Wales Audit Office with regard to free school meals, I have had quite an interesting time in the Chamber on this. Members of the opposition parties have put to me my concerns over free school dinners being a measurement; I stand by my words and have gone public on the fact that I do not believe that they are an accurate measure. I support the committee's recommendations for clarity in those figures.

My thoughts are with the end users: the children and young people who are in education. This is not a report about teachers and buildings; it is about children and their education. I am still concerned about the disparity of £1,000 in terms of children's education in different parts of the country and would welcome clarity from the WLGA on any evidence that it could produce that says that the funding does not matter to the user and that it is the resources and how they are used that matter. That confused me and I am sure that it would confuse many.

I welcome this report and, once again, congratulate the committee on the work that it has done.

angen i'r Gweinidog ddweud hynny a phennu targed newydd y gallwn i gyd ei ddeall ac y gellir ei gyflawni.

Carl Sargeant: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad a llongyfarchaf y pwyllgor ar y gwaith a wnaed i roi goleuni ar ariannu ysgolion i'r Cynulliad. Ategaf y sylwadau a wnaed gan Lynne Neagle. Mae gennym lawer yn gyffredin yng nghyd-destun ariannu addysg a'r syniadau sy'n sail i hynny. Mae fy nghyd-aelod, Sandy Mewies, a minnau, sy'n cynrychioli Sir y Fflint, wedi cyflwyno nifer o sylwadau i'r Gweinidog ar ariannu ysgolion dros lawer o flynyddoedd. Mae llawer o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn yn allweddol i'n syniadau.

Croesawaf argymhelliad 24 ar ffrwd ariannu tair blynedd. Mae'n bwysig inni gysoni ariannu ar draws pob portffolio i gwmpasu tair blynedd. Mae'r cyllidebau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn gwneud hynny, a chredaf y byddai o fudd i ysgolion wrth gynllunio am y blynyddoedd i ddod.

O ran argymhelliad 3, sy'n cefnogi Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru parthed prydau ysgol am ddim, cefais amser diddorol yn y Siambr ar hyn. Mae aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wedi cwestiynu fy mhryderon ynghylch y ffaith bod prydau ysgol am ddim yn fesur; glynaf wrth fy ngeiriau ac yr wyf wedi datgan yn gyhoeddus nad wyf yn credu eu bod yn fesur cywir. Cefnogaf argymhellion y pwyllgor ar gyfer eglurhad i'r ffigurau hynny.

Y defnyddwyr sydd flaenaf yn fy meddwl: y plant a'r bobl ifanc sydd mewn addysg. Nid adroddiad am athrawon ac adeiladau mohono; mae'n ymwneud â phlant a'u haddysg. Pryderaf o hyd ynghylch yr anghyfartaledd o £1,000 o ran addysg plant mewn gwahanol rannau o'r wlad a byddem yn croesawu eglurhad gan CLILC ar unrhyw dystiolaeth y gallai ei chynhyrchu sy'n dweud nad yw ariannu o bwys i'r defnyddiwr ac mai'r adnoddau a'r modd y'u defnyddir sy'n bwysig. Bu hynny'n ddryswch i mi ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n ddryswch i lawer.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn ac, unwaith eto, llongyfarchaf y pwyllgor ar y gwaith a wnaed ganddo.

The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson): I thank the Members who took part in this committee. I found that, when I appeared before it, there were several detailed questions and, as the Chair of the committee has said, that demonstrated unequivocally that these things are complicated. We have to be careful that, in taking decisions on one thing, we do not create any perverse outcomes in another area.

I hope that, in the written statement that I have put before you today, I have been able to clearly make four statements. I will be coming to the Assembly in September, in the normal way, in terms of responding fully to the report's recommendations in a written statement and then, when the Assembly is back in session, I will come to you with an oral statement on which I can be questioned. However, there are a number of areas where I felt that, by giving indications now, it would clearly demonstrate how seriously the Assembly Government takes this issue.

5.40 p.m.

I am grateful to William, not only for the way in which he chaired the committee, but for the reasonable recommendations, many of which, I am sure that Members will accept, accord with work that was already being undertaken by the Assembly Government.

In the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills committee, we have found some difficulties in doing funding comparisons, because we do not hold our statistics in the same way. I am grateful for the committee's recommendation that comparisons with England, or with other countries, albeit useful, should not drive education policies in Wales. I hope that, in the future, we will be able to develop comparisons with regions and countries the size and socioeconomic circumstances of which are, in fact, similar to those seen in Wales. That is why, for example, we have gone voluntarily into the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development to benchmark ourselves against other countries across the world.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson): Diolch i'r Aelodau a gymerodd ran yn y pwyllgor hwn. Cefais, wrth imi ymddangos ger ei fron, fod yno nifer o gwestiynau manwl, ac fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, yr oedd hynny'n dangos mewn modd diamheuol fod y materion hyn yn gymhleth. Pan fyddwn yn penderfynu ar un peth, rhaid inni ochel rhag creu canlyniadau croes mewn maes arall.

Yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyflwynais ger eich bron heddiw, gobeithio fy mod wedi gallu gwneud pedwar datganiad clir. Byddaf yn dod i'r Cynulliad ym mis Medi, yn y ffordd arferol, i ymateb yn llawn i argymhellion yr adroddiad mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig ac yna, pan fydd y Cynulliad yn eistedd eto, dof ger eich bron gyda datganiad llafar y gellir fy holi yn ei gylch. Fodd bynnag, mae yna lawer maes lle yr oeddwn yn credu y gellid dangos yn glir mor ddifrifol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystyried y mater hwn, drwy nodi bwriadau yn eu cylch yn awr.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i William, am y modd y cadeiriodd y pwyllgor ac am yr argymhellion rhesymol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Aelodau yn derbyn bod llawer o'r argymhellion hynny yn gydnaws â gwaith yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn ei wneud.

Yn y pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, yr ydym wedi cael rhai anawsterau wrth wneud cymariaethau ariannu, gan nad ydym yn cadw ein hystadegau yn yr un ffordd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am argymhelliad y pwyllgor na ddylai cymariaethau â Lloegr, neu â gwledydd eraill, er mor ddefnyddiol, fod yn sail i bolisiau addysg yng Nghymru. Gobeithio, yn y dyfodol, y bydd modd inni ddatblygu cymariaethau â rhanbarthau a gwledydd sy'n cyfateb o ran maint ac amgylchiadau economaidd-gymdeithasol â Chymru. Dyna paham, er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi ymuno â'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd yn wirfoddol i feincnodi ein hunain yn erbyn gwledydd

eraill ar draws y byd.

We are keen to improve the transparency, objectivity and fairness of how education funding is distributed to local authorities. We have established the school budget fora, we have made the IBA a public figure, and Sue Essex has already indicated, even before this committee started its work, that she was reviewing issues around dispersal and deprivation factors and their weightings within the standard spending assessment formula for distribution of the revenue support grant. That underlines our policy commitment to move towards distribution based on a more deliberate identification of future need to spend, and a distribution that delivers our social justice objectives.

The Members who represent Flintshire and the Member for Torfaen have continually talked to Sue and me about wanting to see deprivation tackled effectively at the local level and about looking at issues around the indicator-based assessment. I strongly welcome the emphasis that the Committee on School Funding has put on tackling deprivation, because we know that there is a strong link between deprivation and attainment. Statistics published every year on free school meals and attainment demonstrate that fact, and show, unequivocally, that as levels of eligibility for free school meals increase, attainment levels decrease. We are committed to tackling deprivation and breaking that link. The RAISE programme and the Flying Start programme are specifically targeted at that level.

At local level, following extensive consultation and debate in the Assembly—very strongly supported by Ann Jones from Denbighshire—we made it a requirement for local authorities to include a deprivation factor in their formula for determining schools' delegated budgets from April 2005. We have agreed with the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee to review what local authorities have done and will, in light of that, consider whether the requirement needs to be strengthened. I will report on that to the committee later this year.

Yr ydym yn awyddus i gynyddu tryloywder, gwrthrychedd a thegwch y modd y dyrennir cyllid addysg i awdurdodau lleol. Sefydlwyd y ffora cyllidebau ysgol gennym, yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi ffigur yr asesiad ar sail dangosyddion, ac mae Sue Essex eisoes wedi nodi, cyn, hyd yn oed, i'r pwyllgor hwn ddechrau ei waith, ei bod yn adolygu materion yn ymwneud â dyrannu a ffactorau amddifadedd a'u pwysoliadau yn y fformiwla asesu gwariant safonol ar gyfer dosbarthu'r grant cymorth refeniw. Mae hynny'n tanlinellu ein hymrwymiad polisi i symud tuag at broses ddosbarthu'n seiliedig ar ddull mwy pendant o nodi angen gwariant yn y dyfodol, a phroses ddosbarthu sy'n gwireddu ein hamcanion cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Mae'r Aelodau sy'n cynrychioli Sir y Fflint a'r Aelod dros Dor-faen wedi siarad yn barhaus â Sue a minnau ynghylch yr awydd i sicrhau mynd i'r afael yn effeithiol ag amddifadedd yn lleol ac am edrych ar y materion sy'n ymwneud â'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion. Croesawaf y pwyslais y mae'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion wedi'i roi ar fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd, oherwydd gwyddom fod cyswllt cryf rhwng amddifadedd a chyrhaeddiad. Mae ystadegau a gyhoeddir bob blwyddyn am brydau ysgol am ddim a chyrhaeddiad yn dangos y ffaith honno, ac yn dangos, yn ddiamheuol, bod lefelau cyrhaeddiad yn gostwng wrth i niferoedd y rheini sy'n gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim gynyddu. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a thorri'r cyswllt hwnnw. Mae'r rhaglen Rhagori a'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg wedi'u hanelu'n benodol at y lefel honno.

Yn lleol, yn dilyn ymgynghori a thrafodaethau helaeth yn y Cynulliad—gyda chefnogaeth gref Ann Jones o Sir Ddinbych—fe'i gwnaed yn ofyniad i awdurdodau lleol gynnwys ffactor amddifadedd yn eu fformiwla ar gyfer pennu cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion o Ebrill 2005. Yr ydym wedi cytuno â'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i adolygu'r hyn a wnaed gan awdurdodau lleol a byddwn, yng ngoleuni hynny, yn ystyried pa un a ddylid cryfhau'r gofyniad. Byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar hynny i'r pwyllgor yn

ddiweddarach y flwyddyn hon.

It is important to say that spending has increased hugely under this Assembly Government. Local authorities spend over a third of their total revenue budgets annually on education. Education spending has risen well ahead of the rate of inflation every year since the Assembly was established. Figures that I presented to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee on 5 July show that, at the all-Wales level, total local authority net revenue spend on education exceeds the total education indicator-based assessment, as it has done every year, by over £1.9 billion.

However, there is some variation in the local authorities across Wales; 12 have budgeted to spend above IBA this year and 10 below it. That is broadly the same split as in 2005-06. We need to complete our review of the formula and its outcome to look at how that can be used in terms of the local government settlement. However, we are clear that, in the interim, the education IBA for each authority will be used, as an interim measure, as the local target for education spend.

It is important to say that using education IBA in this way does not mean fettering authorities' discretion to set education budgets according to local priorities. However, where authorities set a budget below IBA, they will be asked to report publicly on the reasons for that to the schools budget forum, to their full council and to the Assembly Government. That will aid transparency and local accountability. I know that that will be warmly welcomed by teachers' unions and others, who have wanted us to look at IBA as a spending target.

However, for the reasons that other Members have outlined, we could not look at IBA as a spending target in the longer term. We have sympathy with the objective behind the recommendation on minimum spend, but we should be under no illusion about the difficulty of achieving it. The committee is

Mae'n bwysig dweud bod gwariant wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol o dan y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gwario dros draean o'u holl gyllidebau refeniw ar addysg bob blwyddyn. Mae gwariant ar addysg wedi codi'n uwch o dipyn na'r gyfradd chwyddiant bob blwyddyn ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Dengys y ffigurau a gyflwynais i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar 5 Gorffennaf fod cyfanswm gwariant refeniw net awdurdodau lleol drwy Gymru ar addysg yn fwy na chyfanswm yr asesiad ar sail dangosyddion ar gyfer addysg, fel sydd wedi digwydd bob blwyddyn, a hynny o dros £1.9 biliwn.

Fodd bynnag, mae ychydig amrywiad yn yr awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru; mae 12 wedi cyllidebu i wario uwchlaw'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion eleni a 10 islaw'r asesiad hwnnw. Mae'r rhaniad hwnnw'n debyg i'r hyn a welwyd yn 2005-06. Mae angen inni gwblhau ein hadolygiad o'r fformiwla a'i ganlyniad i edrych ar y modd y gellid defnyddio hynny yng nghyd-destun y setliad llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn sicr y caiff yr asesiad ar sail dangosyddion o ran addysg ei ddefnyddio, dros dro, fel targed lleol ar gyfer gwario ar addysg.

Mae'n bwysig dweud nad yw defnyddio'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion ym maes addysg yn golygu cyfyngu ar ddisgresiwn awdurdodau i bennu cyllidebau addysg yn unol â blaenoriaethau lleol. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd awdurdodau yn pennu cyllideb islaw'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion, gofynnir iddynt gyhoeddi'r rhesymau dros hynny i'r fforwm cyllideb ysgolion, i'w cyngor llawn ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd hynny'n cynorthwyo tryloywder ac atebolrwydd lleol. Gwn y bydd croeso mawr i hynny gan undebau athrawon ac eraill a oedd am inni edrych ar asesiad ar sail ddangosyddion fel targed gwariant.

Fodd bynnag, am y rhesymau a amlinellwyd gan Aelodau eraill, gallem ystyried yr asesiad ar sail dangosyddion fel targed gwariant yn y tymor hwy. Yr ydym yn cydymdeimlo â'r amcan y tu ôl i'r argymhelliad ar isafswm gwariant, ond ni ddylem dwyllo ein hunain ynglŷn â'r anhawster o'i gyflawni. Ni all y

unable to offer a view at the moment as to how that should be approached. There has been a history of unsuccessful attempts. When I first became Minister, I worked with the teacher unions on this a few years ago to see whether we could arrive at a basis for determining a minimum funding level. It would be irresponsible of me to raise expectations that we can deliver a minimum basic funding level approach. We need to weigh up what can be done, and what the consequences might be in terms of affecting the budgets of individual schools. I will give Members an example from my own patch. When we looked at taking a figure that removed the deprivation and sparsity elements, and looked at a few schools in Rhondda Cynon Taff, we found that operating that minimum spending requirement would shift funding away from a school on a deprived estate into a school in a more affluent area. We have to look carefully at how that is done, alongside the review that Sue is undertaking in terms of issues around the forum.

I know that everyone in the Assembly will welcome the fact that Sue's distribution group has now agreed the three-year funding targets for local authorities. There will be three-year budgets for local authorities, and the three-year budget for education will be set for the 2008-09 financial year, alongside the setting of three-year budgets for local authorities. We have had the powers to do that, but we had to ensure that we consulted on that and that we can deliver on it.

Leighton Andrews: I would like to ask a question in relation to what you said a moment ago about minimum spending requirements resulting, for example, in RCT, in a transfer of funding from a school in a more deprived area into a school in another area. It seems to me that part of what the committee was saying in its evidence was that there was a disparity of funding between authorities. The point that you made seemed to be about a change in the notion of funding within an authority. It is the issue of funding between authorities that many of us are concerned about.

pwylgor gynnig safbwynt ar hyn o bryd o ran y ffordd y dylid mynd i'r afael â hyn. Bu hanes o gynigion aflwyddiannus. Pan ddechreuais yn fy swydd fel Gweinidog, gweithiais gydag undebau'r athrawon ar hyn ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl i weld a allem ddod i benderfyniad o ran sail ar gyfer pennu isafswm lefel ariannu. Byddwn yn anghyfrifol i godi disgwyliadau y gallwn gyflawni ymagwedd isafswm lefel ariannu sylfaenol. Mae angen inni bwysu a mesur yr hyn y gellir ei wneud, a'r canlyniadau posibl o ran yr effaith ar gyllidebau ysgolion unigol. Rhoddaf enghraifft i Aelodau o'm hardal fy hun. Pan wnaethom ystyried defnyddio ffigur a oedd yn dileu'r elfennau amddifadedd a theneurwydd poblogaeth, gan ystyried rhai ysgolion yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, gwelwyd y byddai gweithredu'r gofyniad gwario sylfaenol hwnnw yn golygu y byddai arian yn cael ei symud o ysgol ar ystâd ddfreintiedig i ysgol mewn ardal fwy cyfoethog. Mae angen inni ystyried sut y caiff hyn ei wneud yn ofalus, ochr yn ochr â'r adolygiad y mae Sue yn ei gynnal o ran materion sy'n ymwneud â'r fforwm.

Gwn y bydd pawb yn y Cynulliad yn croesawu'r ffaith fod grŵp dosbarthu Sue bellach wedi cytuno ar dargedau ariannu tair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Bydd cyllidebau tair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, a chaiff y gyllideb tair blynedd ar gyfer addysg ei phennu ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2008-09, ochr yn ochr â chyllidebau tair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Mae gennym y pwerau i wneud hynny, ond yr oedd yn rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal ymgynghoriad ar hynny ac y gallwn ei gyflawni.

Leighton Andrews: Hoffwn ofyn cwestiwn sy'n gysylltiedig â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh eiliad yn ôl ynglŷn â'r gofynion gwariant sylfaenol sy'n arwain, er enghraifft, yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, at drosglwyddo arian o ysgol mewn ardal fwy difreintiedig i ysgol mewn ardal arall. Ymddengys i mi mai rhan o'r hyn yr oedd y pwylgor yn ei ddweud yn ei dystiolaeth oedd bod anghysondeb mewn ariannu rhwng awdurdodau. Ymddengys fod y pwynt a wnaethoch yn ymwneud â newid yn y syniad o ariannu o fewn awdurdod. Ariannu rhwng awdurdodau yw'r hyn sy'n achosi pryder i lawer ohonom.

Jane Davidson: The important point is that, if we set a minimum level of funding without looking at all the potential outcomes, both within and between local authorities, we could have some perverse outcomes. That is part of the difficulty of this debate. We all want to see greater security of the funding of our schools. That is why, as Minister, I have taken the actions that I have taken so far in improving the transparency, establishing the school budget fora, and publishing the IBA, for example. I am now delighted that we can announce that the three-year budgets will be a reality for schools from the 2008-09 financial year. In terms of ensuring that we can deliver effectively on that commitment on the minimum funding level—and that level would have to be a level that discounted the elements of weighting that would come in over and above that on the needs of individual local authority areas—we need to be cautious so that we do not have outcomes that we would not want to see.

I am pleased that the committee's report pays considerable attention to the funding fog in Wales. We have improved transparency, but we have accepted the Wales Audit Office recommendations, and your own, about further clarity, so that teachers, pupils, parents, governors and the Welsh Assembly Government can operate with the same information.

William Graham: I intend to be brief, if only because I am also presenting the next debate, and the contingencies of the hour are pressing on us all.

I thank you for your contributions; they reflect much of what the report says. In parts of the debate, some of the consensus became somewhat fragile, but I am grateful that we at least know what the way forward for schools in Wales should be. We have been closely observed in this committee. Once again, I pay tribute to those who gave evidence in a frank and constructive manner, and who replied to questions from the committee members in a remarkably frank manner. This enabled us to have a good evidence base for the report.

Jane Davidson: Y pwynt pwysig yw, pe byddem yn gosod isafswm lefel ariannu heb ystyried pob un o'r canlyniadau posibl, o fewn awdurdodau lleol a rhyngddynt, y gallem wynebu rhai canlyniadau croes. Dyna ran o'r anhawster yn y ddadl hon. Mae pob un ohonom am weld mwy o sicrwydd o ran ariannu ein hysgolion. Dyma pam, fel Gweinidog, yr wyf wedi cymryd y camau a gymerwyd gennyf hyd yn hyn i wella tryloywder, sefydlu fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion, a chyhoeddi'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion, er enghraifft. Yr wyf yn falch iawn yn awr y gallwn gyhoeddi y bydd cyllidebau tair blynedd yn realiti ar gyfer ysgolion o'r flwyddyn ariannol 2008-09. O ran sicrhau y gallwn gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw ar yr isafswm lefel ariannu yn effeithiol—a byddai'n rhaid i'r lefel honno ddiystyru'r elfennau pwysoli a fyddai'n ychwanegol at yr hyn ar gyfer anghenion ardaloedd awdurdod lleol unigol—mae angen inni fod yn wylidwrus na fyddwn yn cael canlyniadau na fyddem am eu gweld.

Yr wyf yn falch fod adroddiad y pwyllgor yn rhoi cryn sylw i'r niwl ariannu yng Nghymru. Mae pethau'n fwy tryloyw, ond yr ydym wedi derbyn argymhellion Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, a'ch argymhellion chi, ynglŷn â sicrhau eglurder pellach, fel y gall athrawon, disgyblion, rhieni, llywodraethwyr a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithredu gan ddefnyddio'r un wybodaeth.

William Graham: Yr wyf am fod yn gryno, yn bennaf am fy mod hefyd yn cyflwyno'r ddadl nesaf, ac mae'r amser yn mynd yn ei flaen.

Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniadau; maent yn adlewyrchu llawer o'r hyn a nodir yn yr adroddiad. Mewn rhai rhannau o'r ddadl, yr oedd y consensws yn ddigon bregus, ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar o leiaf ein bod yn gwybod beth ddylai'r ffordd ymlaen i ysgolion yng Nghymru fod. Sylwyd arnom yn fanwl yn y pwyllgor hwn. Unwaith eto, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth mewn ffordd agored ac adeiladol, ac a tebodd gwestiynau gan aelodau'r pwyllgor mewn ffordd agored iawn. Sicrhodd hyn fod gennym dystiolaeth dda ar gyfer yr adroddiad.

The contributions today were worthwhile. Leighton identified one part in particular that is probably not given the most satisfactory answer in the report. Further information will be needed on that point in particular.

Yr oedd y cyfraniadau heddiw'n werthfawr. Nododd Leighton un rhan yn benodol na roddwyd yr ateb mwyaf boddhaol iddi yn yr adroddiad yn ôl pob tebyg. Bydd angen gwybodaeth bellach ar y pwynt hwnnw yn benodol.

I would like to pay tribute to what Lynne said. There was one particular phrase that echoed with me, namely that we must now turn guidance into compliance. That is incumbent on us all. If nothing else, we must help to simplify and clarify the funding process so that those who deliver education in Wales can better understand how the system works. I commend the report.

Hoffwn roi teyrnged i Lynne am yr hyn a ddywedodd. Yr oedd un frawddeg benodol a oedd yn taro tant i mi, sef ei bod yn rhaid inni droi canllawiau yn gydymffurfiaeth bellach. Mae dyletswydd ar bob un ohonom i wneud hynny. Os na wnawn ddim byd arall, rhaid inni helpu symleiddio ac egluro'r broses ariannu fel y gall y rheini sy'n darparu addysg yng Nghymru ddeall yn well sut mae'r system yn gweithio. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad.

5.50 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM3188): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3188): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val

Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

A Wnaiff 'Cyfraith Sarah' Amddiffyn Plant yng Nghymru? Will a 'Sarah's Law' Protect Children in Wales?

William Graham: I acknowledge the research assistance for this presentation from Gwent Police, Dyfed-Powys Police and the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children Cymru. I direct Members' attention to NSPCC Cymru's current campaign, Don't Hide It. I have agreed to allow Mick Bates to speak for a minute during this debate, in accordance with the usual convention.

William Graham: Hoffwn gydnabod y cymorth ymchwil a gafwyd ar gyfer y cyflwyniad hwn gan Heddlu Gwent, Heddlu Dyfed-Powys a Chymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant Cymru. Hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at ymgyrch bresennol NSPCC Cymru, Don't Hide It. Yr wyf wedi cytuno i ganiatáu i Mick Bates siarad am funud yn ystod y ddadl hon, yn unol â'r drefn arferol.

It is important that children are allowed the freedom by their parents to learn self-reliance, to enjoy their childhood and to be able to play and travel safely within their community.

Mae'n bwysig i blant gael y rhyddid gan eu rhieni i ddysgu sut i fod yn hunan-ddibynnol, i fwynhau eu plentynod ac i allu chwarae a theithio'n ddiogel o fewn eu cymuned.

In July 1994, seven-year-old Megan Kanka was lured into a neighbour's home, ostensibly to see his new puppy. She was raped and murdered by this neighbour. Unknown to her parents, a convicted sex offender lived across the street. The murderer had already served six years in prison for aggravated assault and attempted sexual assault. Megan's mother said:

Ym mis Gorffennaf 1994, cafodd Megan Kanka, a oedd yn saith mlwydd oed ar y pryd, ei denu i mewn i gartref cymydog, i weld ei gi bach newydd i bob golwg. Cafodd ei threisio a'i llofruddio gan y cymydog hwn. Heb yn wybod i'w rhieni, yr oedd troseddwr rhyw wedi ei gollfarnu yn byw ar draws y stryd. Yr oedd y llofruddiwr eisoes wedi treulio chwe blynedd yn y carchar am ymosodiad dwys ac ymgais i ymosod yn rhywiol. Meddai mam Megan:

'We knew nothing about him; if we had been aware of his record, my daughter would be alive today.'

Ni wyddem ddim amdano; pe baem yn gwybod am ei record, byddai fy merch yn fyw heddiw.

A campaign began, which resulted in the USA implementing legislation that has become known worldwide as Megan's law.

Dechreuwyd ymgyrch, a arweiniodd at weithredu deddfwriaeth yn yr UD sy'n hysbys ledled y byd fel cyfraith Megan.

On Saturday 1 July 2000, Sarah Payne disappeared from her grandparents' home in Little Hampton, West Sussex. When Roy Whiting was convicted of assaulting and murdering Sarah, in December 2001, it was revealed that he had previous convictions for kidnapping and indecently assaulting a nine-year-old girl. Sarah's parents called on the Government to change the law to ensure that it does not happen again. Since then, people in the UK have been campaigning for a Sarah's law.

Incidents in my home city of Newport illustrate the possible need for and the real dangers of placing a Sarah's law on the statute book. Those who campaign for this law use Craig Sweeney as an example. When he committed further paedophile crimes earlier this year, parents were not aware that he was living in their community on Caerleon Road in Newport. Those who believe that such a law would be dangerous will draw attention to Dr Yvette Cloete, a specialist registrar in paediatric medicine at the Royal Gwent Hospital, who was forced to flee her home when vandals, confused over the words 'paedophile' and 'paediatrician', daubed the word 'paedo' on the walls and doors of her home. These examples illustrate the need for caution and the widest consideration of all aspects of this proposed law. We need to ensure that any legislation that we introduce enhances the protection of children and does not inadvertently increase potential dangers.

In essence, Megan's law states that

'no convicted paedophile released from prison should be allowed to reside in a neighbourhood without the knowledge of the parents of children in that neighbourhood'.

When you begin to look at Megan's law you immediately become aware that, in practice, it is not a single law. Different states throughout America have interpreted the law in different ways. Some states list details of sex offenders on the internet, which are accessible to everyone; in other states, law

Ddydd Sadwrn 1 Gorffennaf 2000, diflannodd Sarah Payne o gartref ei nain a'i thaid yn Little Hampton, Gorllewin Sussex. Pan gafwyd Roy Whiting yn euog o ymosod ar Sarah a'i llofruddio, ym mis Rhagfyr 2001, datgelwyd bod ganddo gollfarnau blaenorol am gipio merch naw oed ac ymosod yn anwedus arni. Galwodd rhieni Sarah ar y Llywodraeth i newid y gyfraith er mwyn sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd eto. Ers hynny, mae pobl yn y DU wedi bod yn ymgyrchu dros gyfraith Sarah.

Mae digwyddiadau yn y ddinas lle'r wyf yn byw, sef Casnewydd, yn dangos yr angen posibl am gyfraith Sarah a'r peryglon gwirioneddol yn sgîl ei roi ar y llyfr statud. Mae'r rheini sy'n ymgyrchu dros y gyfraith hon yn defnyddio Craig Sweeney fel enghraifft. Pan gyflawnodd droseddau pedoffilaidd pellach yn gynharach eleni, nid oedd rhieni yn ymwybodol ei fod yn byw yn eu cymuned ar Heol Caerllion yng Nghasnewydd. Bydd y rhai sy'n credu y byddai cyfraith o'r fath yn beryglus yn tynnu sylw at Dr Yvette Cloete, cofrestrydd arbenigol ym maes meddygaeth bediatrig yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, y bu'n rhaid iddi ddianc o'i chartref pan ysgrifennodd fandaliaid, oherwydd dryswch ynglŷn â'r geiriau 'paedophile' a 'paediatrician', y gair 'paedo' ar waliau a drysau ei chartref. Mae'r enghreifftiau hyn yn dangos bod angen bod yn wylidwrus a rhoi'r ystyriaeth fwyaf posibl i bob agwedd ar y gyfraith arfaethedig hon. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwn yn golygu y gellir amddiffyn plant yn well ac nad yw'n cynyddu peryglon posibl yn anfwriadol.

Yn ei hanfod, mae cyfraith Megan yn dweud

na ddylid caniatáu i unrhyw bedoffilydd a gollfarnwyd gael ei ryddhau o'r carchar i fyw mewn cymdogaeth heb roi gwybod i rieni plant yn y gymdogaeth honno.

Pan ddechreuwch ystyried cyfraith Megan, yr ydych yn dod yn ymwybodol ar unwaith nad un gyfraith mohoni yn ymarferol. Mae gwahanol daleithiau ledled America wedi dehongli'r gyfraith mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mae rhai taleithiau yn rhestru manylion troseddwy'r rhyw ar y rhyngryd, sy'n

enforcers call at every home in a neighbourhood to inform parents that a sex offender is living in the area. In some states, the sex offenders themselves call at every home to notify parents that they are living in their neighbourhood. In Oregon, sex offenders can be forced to display a sign in their windows.

All the states with open access via the internet to sex offender information have this warning as a major feature on the opening pages of their websites:

‘This website indicates that many of these registrants are currently in violation of their registration requirement. If you have details of these people please inform a law enforcement officer.’

Campaigners for a Sarah’s law in the United Kingdom explain that a legal right to controlled access to information about dangerous child sex offenders would be regulated by an Act of Parliament; that parents or carers would have to contact their local police station to formally request information; and that the police would, within a specified time, write back to the parents’ home address giving details of any predatory paedophiles in their community. The information would only be released after it has been properly checked and verified by the police. Also, information would only be released to those on the electoral register, and it would be used to allow parents to take whatever legitimate steps they felt were appropriate to safeguard their children. There would be severe penalties for anyone who abused the information.

We all accept that parents will do anything to protect their children. It is an acceptable response of a parent, once they know that a sex offender is living in their community, to seek to have them moved from that neighbourhood, if they are able to petition the Probation Service or their local authority. Although we would not condone such actions, it is easy to see how these can escalate and bring concerned parents into

hygyrch i bawb; mewn taleithiau eraill, mae gorfodwyr y gyfraith yn galw ym mhob cartref yn y gymdogaeth i hysbysu rhieni bod troseddwr rhyw yn byw yn yr ardal. Mewn rhai taleithiau, mae’r troseddwr rhyw eu hunain yn galw ym mhob cartref i ddweud wrth rieni eu bod yn byw yn eu cymdogaeth. Yn Oregon, gellir gorfodi troseddwr rhyw i ddangos arwydd yn eu ffenestri.

Mae pob talaith sy’n gallu rhoi gwybodaeth yn agored am droseddwr rhyw drwy’r rhyngwyd yn gosod y rhybudd hwn yn glir ar dudalennau agoriadol eu gwefannau:

Mae’r wefan hon yn dangos bod nifer o’r rheini a gofrestrwyd yn torri eu gofyniad cofrestru ar hyn o bryd. Os oes gennych fanylion am y bobl hyn, rhowch wybod i swyddog gorfodi’r gyfraith.

Mae’r rheini sy’n ymgyrchu dros gyfraith Sarah yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn esbonio y byddai hawl gyfreithiol i fynediad rheoledig i wybodaeth am droseddwr rhyw peryglus sy’n cyflawni troseddau yn erbyn plant yn cael ei rheoleiddio gan Ddeddf Seneddol; y byddai’n rhaid i rieni neu ofalwyr gysylltu â’u gorsaf heddlu leol i ofyn am wybodaeth yn ffurfiol; ac y byddai’r heddlu, o fewn amser penodedig, yn ysgrifennu yn ôl i’r rheini yn eu cyfeiriad cartref yn rhoi manylion unrhyw bedoffiliaid sydd â’u bryd ar gamfanteisio ar blant yn eu cymuned. Dim ond ar ôl iddi gael ei gwirio a’i dilysu gan yr heddlu y byddai’r wybodaeth yn cael ei rhyddhau. Hefyd, dim ond i’r rhai ar y gofrestr etholwyr y byddai’r wybodaeth yn cael ei rhyddhau, a byddai’n cael ei defnyddio i alluogi rhieni i gymryd pa gamau cyfreithlon bynnag a fyddai’n briodol, yn eu barn hwy, i ddiogelu eu plant. Byddai unrhyw un a gamddefnyddiai’r wybodaeth yn wynebu cosbau difrifol.

Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn y bydd rhieni’n gwneud unrhyw beth i amddiffyn eu plant. Mae’n ymateb derbynol gan rieni, pan fyddant yn gwybod bod troseddwr rhyw yn byw yn eu cymuned, i geisio sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei symud o’r gymdogaeth honno, os gallant ddeisebu’r Gwasanaeth Prawf neu eu hawdurdod lleol. Er na fyddem yn cydoddef camau o’r fath, mae’n hawdd gweld sut y gall y rhain ddwysáu gan ddod â rhieni i

conflict with the law. Tensions within the community may be further escalated as the police, by doing their job of keeping the peace, are seen by the public as only protecting the suspect.

The stark reality is that the overwhelming number of acts of child sexual abuse are committed by a family member or someone known to the child. Some 75 per cent of abused children do not tell anyone about this abuse at the time of their being abused. They often wait until they are teenagers or young adults before reporting the crimes committed. Therefore, the majority of current sex offenders are not identified for their crimes. That is why we must take every opportunity to promote the NSPCC's Don't Hide It campaign, and show children that they will be listened to, and that they must have the confidence to report any aspect of any relationship with which they are unhappy.

Megan's law, and the proposals for Sarah's law, were created in response to stranger-predatory crimes, which are relatively rare and difficult to predict. We must acknowledge the deviant and deceptive behaviour of predatory paedophiles, such as how they use the internet to entice, groom and purposely trick young people into inappropriate situations. Welsh police are recorded as having apprehended paedophiles from Lancashire who have travelled to beaches in Pembrokeshire to photograph children.

In the United Kingdom, the whereabouts of the vast majority of sex offenders are known, because they are members of a family; 97 per cent of known sex offenders are on the sex offenders register. In America, it is believed that Megan's law has deterred offenders from registering or keeping to the terms of their registration. It is estimated that their information is only 15 per cent accurate.

UK police fear that, as in America, they will spend more and more time and resources on managing the information system rather than

wrthdrawiad â'r gyfraith. Gallai tensiynau yn y gymuned gael eu dwysáu ymhellach wrth iddo ymddangos i'r cyhoedd bod yr heddlu, wrth wneud eu gwaith o gadw'r heddwch, yn diogelu'r person a ddrwgdybir yn unig.

Y gwir yw bod nifer fawr iawn o achosion o gam-drin plant yn rhywiol yn cael eu cyflawni gan aelod o'r teulu neu rywun y mae'r plentyn yn ei adnabod. Nid yw tua 75 y cant o blant a gaiff eu cam-drin yn sôn wrth neb am y cam-drin hwn pan fyddant yn cael eu cam-drin. Yn aml, maent yn aros tan eu bod yn eu harddegau neu'n oedolion ifanc cyn roi gwybod am y troseddau a gyflawnwyd. Felly, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r troseddwr rhyw presennol yn wybyddus. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid inni achub ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo ymgyrch Don't Hide It yr NSPCC, a dangos i blant y bydd pobl yn gwrandao arnynt, a bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn ddigon hyderus i roi gwybod am unrhyw agwedd ar unrhyw berthynas nad ydynt yn hapus amdani.

Crëwyd cyfraith Megan, a'r cynigion ar gyfer cyfraith Sarah, mewn ymateb i droseddau a gyflawnir gan ddieithriaid sydd â'u bryd ar gamfanteisio ar blant, sy'n gymharol brin ac yn anodd i'w rhagweld. Rhaid inni gydnabod ymddygiad cyfrwys a thwyllodrus pedoffilyddion sydd â'u bryd ar gamfanteisio ar blant, megis y ffordd y maent yn defnyddio'r rhyngwrwyd yn fwiadol i ddenu, paratoi a thwylo pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn sefyllfaoedd amhriodol. Cofnodwyd bod yr heddlu yng Nghymru wedi arestio pedoffilyddion o swydd Gaerhirfryn a oedd wedi teithio i draethau yn sir Benfro i dynnu lluniau o blant.

Yn y Deyrnas Unedig, mae lleoliad y mwyafrif helaeth o droseddwr rhyw yn hysbys, oherwydd eu bod yn aelodau o deulu; mae 97 y cant o'r troseddwr rhyw sy'n hysbys ar y gofrestr troseddwr rhyw. Yn America, credir bod cyfraith Megan wedi atal troseddwr rhag cofrestru neu lynu wrth delerau eu cofrestriad. Amcangyfrifir mai dim ond 15 y cant o'u gwybodaeth sy'n gywir.

Mae heddlu'r DU yn pryderu, fel y gwelwyd yn America, y byddant yn treulio mwy a mwy o amser ac yn defnyddio adnoddau

on the surveillance of offenders in the community, and protecting vulnerable people. It is sadly a fact that almost one-third of all paedophiles fail to fully comply with their licensing agreements, or disappear. This figure will probably increase if the public is allowed access to information on where they live. The most likely increase will be among predatory paedophiles, who will disappear if they fear identification.

The agencies engaged in the multi-agency public protection arrangements outline the problems of predatory paedophiles who disappear from surveillance. Not only do they no longer know where they are living, they are unable to monitor potential opportunities for them to re-offend—such as whether they are living near a school, or have formed a relationship with a mother of young children. NSPCC research indicates that the threat of increased vigilante action has had unforeseen consequences, including helping sex offenders to get in touch with each other, to develop effective co-operation systems to disguise their identities, and to share inappropriate images and criminal activities.

Multi-agency public protection arrangements enable the police, probation workers and prisons to work together with education, housing, health and social services, to agree a more comprehensive, robust risk management plan, to ensure that violent and sexual offenders are identified and managed effectively. It has only been since the Criminal Justice and Court Services Act 2000 that there has been a requirement for our police forces to evaluate and monitor sex offenders after their release from prison. This has cost police forces approximately £100 million, for which they have received no additional funding—it has been met entirely by redistributing current police budgets, and it largely falls on the council tax precept. It is crucial that the Home Office provides adequate funding to allow for the complete evaluation and monitoring of sex offenders.

cynyddol ar reoli'r system wybodaeth yn hytrach na goruchwyllo troseddwr yn y gymuned, a diogelu pobl ddi-amddiffyn. Yn anffodus, mae bron traean o'r holl bedoffilyddion yn methu â chydymffurfio'n llawn â'u cytundebau trwyddedu, neu'n diflannu. Bydd y ffigur hwn yn cynyddu yn ôl pob tebyg os caniateir i'r cyhoedd weld gwybodaeth am ble y maent yn byw. Caiff y cynnydd mwyaf tebygol ei weld ymhlith pedoffilyddion sydd â'u bryd ar gamfanteisio ar blant, a fydd yn diflannu os byddant yn ofni y cânt eu hadnabod.

Mae'r asiantaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r trefniadau aml-asiantaeth ar gyfer diogelu'r cyhoedd yn amlinellu'r problemau pedoffiliaid sy'n camfanteisio ar blant ac sy'n diflannu o'r golwg. Yn ogystal â'r ffaith nad ydynt yn gwybod ble maent yn byw mwyach, ni allant fonitro cyfleoedd posibl iddynt aildroseddu—megis a ydynt yn byw wrth ymyl ysgol, neu a ydynt mewn cydberthynas â mam â phlant ifanc. Dywed ymchwil gan NSPCC fod y bygythiad o weld mwy o bobl gyffredin yn ffurfio grwpiau cosbi wedi arwain at ganlyniadau na ragwelwyd, gan gynnwys helpu troseddwr rhyw i gysylltu â'i gilydd, datblygu systemau cydweithredu effeithiol i guddio pwy ydynt, a rhannu delweddau amhriodol a gweithgareddau troseddol.

Mae trefniadau amlasiantaeth ar gyfer diogelu'r cyhoedd yn galluogi'r heddlu, gweithwyr prawf a charchardai i gydweithio ag addysg, tai, iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, i gytuno ar gynllun rheoli risg mwy cynhwysfawr a chadarn er mwyn sicrhau y caiff troseddwr treisgar a throeddwr rhyw eu nodi a'u rheoli'n effeithiol. Dim ond ers cyflwyno Deddf Cyfiawnder Troseddol a Gwasanaethau Llys 2000 y bu'n ofynnol i'n heddluoedd werthuso a monitro troseddwr rhyw ar ôl iddynt gael eu rhyddhau o'r carchar. Mae hyn wedi costio tua £100 miliwn i heddluoedd, nad ydynt wedi cael unrhyw arian ychwanegol ar ei gyfer—talwyd y cyfan drwy ailddosbarthu cyllidebau cyfredol yr heddlu, ac fe'i telir yn bennaf gan braesept y dreth gyngor. Mae'n hanfodol i'r Swyddfa Gartref roi arian digonol i alluogi'r broses o werthuso a monitro troseddwr rhyw yn llawn.

An extension to the sex offenders' treatment programme—available to sex offenders in prison in England and Wales since 1991—should be encouraged. Prison sentences should be extended to ensure a more effective programme of treatment. This treatment costs about £6,000 a time; it is voluntary, and only works if offenders are willing to change. Prison authorities state that only 11 per cent of offenders respond to treatment. Of the 5,000 men in prison for sex offences, only 786 completed the programme last year. Roy Whiting, who was responsible for abducting, assaulting and murdering Sarah Payne, refused to undergo any such treatment. Re-offending rates are disturbingly high among sex offenders—it is up to 43 per cent. If the therapy programme is not more extensively applied, and offenders get no help in changing their behaviour, by not offering treatment to adult offenders, we release them to commit further offences.

I can understand why the mother of the three-year-old child who was kidnapped and sexually assaulted by Craig Sweeney can feel 'gut-wrenchingly sick' at the media-given impression that he has been given a minimum sentence of six years.

6.00 p.m.

However, it must be stressed that, in reality, because of the nature of his crimes and his history of re-offending, Sweeney may never be released from prison. At the heart of the misunderstanding surrounding this sentence is Labour's Criminal Justice Act 2003 and current sentencing guidelines. I implore the early revision of sentencing guidelines to allow judges to deal adequately with convicted criminals of this kind. If new laws, or amendments to existing laws, are required to address this issue, they must be proposed with the overwhelming objective of offering the greatest protection to our children. I urge the Assembly Government to pursue colleagues at Westminster to ensure that, as local safeguarding children boards take over from area child protection committees later this year, comprehensive guidelines are

Dylid annog y gwaith o ehangu'r rhaglen driniaeth i droseddwr rhyw—sydd ar gael i droseddwr rhyw yn y carchar yng Nghymru a Lloegr er 1991. Dylid ymestyn dedfrydau yn y carchar er mwyn sicrhau bod rhaglen driniaeth fwy effeithiol ar waith. Mae'r driniaeth hon yn costio tua £6,000 y tro; mae'n wirfoddol, a dim ond os yw troseddwr yn barod i newid y mae'n gweithio. Noda awdurdodau carchardai mai dim ond 11 y cant o droseddwr sy'n ymateb i driniaeth. O'r 5,000 o ddynion sydd yn y carchar am gyflawni troseddau rhyw, dim ond 786 a gwblhaodd y rhaglen y llynedd. Gwrthododd Roy Whiting, a oedd yn gyfrifol am gipio Sarah Payne, ymosod arni a'i llofruddio, ymgymryd ag unrhyw driniaeth o'r fath. Mae'r cyfraddau aildroseddu uchel iawn ymhlith troseddwr rhyw yn peri pryder—sef hyd at 43 y cant. Os na ddefnyddir y rhaglen therapi yn ehangach, ac os na fydd troseddwr yn cael help i newid eu hymddygiad, drwy beidio â chynnig triniaeth i droseddwr sy'n oedolion, yr ydym yn eu rhyddhau i gyflawni troseddau pellach.

Gallaf ddeall pam mae mam y plentyn tair oed a gipiwyd ac yr ymosodwyd yn rhywiol arni gan Craig Sweeney yn teimlo'n swp sâl ar ôl yr argraff a roddwyd gan y cyfryngau ei fod wedi cael isafswm dedfryd o chwe blynedd.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid pwysleisio, mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd natur ei droseddau a'i hanes o aildroseddu, efallai na chaiff Sweeney ei ryddhau o'r carchar byth. Wrth wraidd y camddealltwriaeth ynghylch y ddedfryd hon mae'r Ddeddf Cyfiawnder Troseddol 2003 gan Lafur a chanllawiau dedfrydu presennol. Dymunwn i ganllawiau dedfrydu gael eu hadolygu'n fuan er mwyn galluogi barnwyr i ymdrin yn briodol â throseddwr felly a gollfennir. Os oes angen cyfreithiau newydd, neu os oes angen diwygio cyfreithiau sy'n bodoli eisoes, rhaid eu cynnig gyda'r prif amcan o amddiffyn ein plant yn y ffordd orau posibl. Anogaf Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynnal trafodaethau â chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan er mwyn sicrhau, wrth i fyrddau lleol diogelu plant gymryd y llyw oddi wrth bwyllgorau

published to assist children, parents and carers to recognise and respond to incidents of child abuse.

I hope that, by highlighting the various opinions regarding this matter, I have contributed to promoting an informed debate, which is vital if we are to give our children the protection that they deserve.

Mick Bates: I thank William for allowing me a minute to contribute to this debate. As we all realise, it is an extremely difficult topic to debate and on which to reach a rational conclusion that will enhance child protection while also dealing with what are obviously very devious and determined people. Parents have a right to know who is living in their area, I believe. However, having examined the literature on the subject, I draw attention to the following points, particularly those raised by the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children, which has warned against the unforeseen effects of the introduction of such a law. For instance, there is great concern—and William made reference to this in his speech—that it may well drive sex offenders underground, which would give rise to cases of mistaken identity and vigilantes attacking innocent people. There is a role for Government to play here, namely to ensure that behaviour is controlled adequately and is well monitored, and that sufficient resources are available to undertake that monitoring to ensure that our children can live safely wherever they wish to live.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I thank William for his thoughtful and informed contribution today, and I am pleased to have the opportunity to respond to this important debate.

Recent cases have understandably created considerable public disquiet, with the most concerning of cases occurring right here on our doorstep, in Cardiff. At the forefront of our concerns must be the safeguarding of children, which is why we commissioned the Gwenda Thomas review, resulting in the report, 'Keeping Us Safe'. Although I recognise at the outset that the responsibility

ardal amddiffyn plant yn ddiweddarach eleni, bod canllawiau cynhwysfawr yn cael eu cyhoeddi i helpu plant, rhieni a gofalwyr i adnabod achosion o gam-drin plant ac ymateb iddynt.

Gobeithio, drwy dynnu sylw at yr amrywiol safbwyntiau ar y mater hwn, fy mod wedi cyfrannu at hybu dadl hyddysg, sy'n hanfodol er mwyn amddiffyn ein plant fel y maent yn ei haeddu.

Mick Bates: Hoffwn ddiolch i William am roi munud imi gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Fel y gwyddom, mae'n bwnc anodd iawn i'w ddadlau ac i ddod i gasgliad synhwyrol yn ei gylch a fydd yn gwella'r broses o amddiffyn plant tra hefyd yn ymdrin â phobl sydd yn amlwg yn gyfrwys ac yn benderfynol iawn. Credaf fod gan rieni yr hawl i wybod pwy sy'n byw yn eu hardal. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl archwilio'r llenyddiaeth ar y pwnc, hoffwn dynnu sylw at y pwyntiau canlynol, yn enwedig y rhai a godwyd gan y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant, sydd wedi rhybuddio yn erbyn effeithiau anrhagweladwy cyflwyno cyfraith o'r fath. Er enghraifft, mae pryder mawr—a chyfeiriodd William at hyn yn ei araith—y gallai yrru troseddwyr rhyw dan ddaear, a fyddai'n arwain at achosion o gam-adnabod a phobl gyffredin yn gorfodi'r gyfraith ac yn ymosod ar bobl ddieuog. Mae gan y Llywodraeth ran i'w chwarae yma, sef sicrhau bod ymddygiad yn cael ei reoli yn ddigonol ac yn cael ei fonitro'n dda, a bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i wneud y gwaith monitro hwnnw er mwyn sicrhau y gall ein plant fyw'n ddiogel ble bynnag y maent yn dymuno byw.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Hoffwn ddiolch i William am ei gyfraniad ystyrlon a hyddysg heddiw, ac yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl bwysig hon.

Mae achosion yn ddiweddar wedi creu anesmythyd sylweddol ymhlith y cyhoedd, sy'n ddealladwy, a digwyddodd yr achos sydd wedi peri'r pryder mwyaf ar garreg ein drws yng Nghaerdydd. Rhaid gwneud diogelu plant yn brif flaenoriaeth, a dyna'r rheswm y bu inni gomisiynu adolygiad Gwenda Thomas, a arweiniodd at yr adroddiad, 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Er fy mod

for many of the issues mentioned is not devolved, we must take our responsibility seriously in terms of the opportunities open to us. That is why I am glad that you have brought this to the Chamber, William. Those opportunities must be delivered in partnership with the UK Government at a ministerial level. We must also recognise the context in which we are working. Your penultimate point about the local safeguarding children boards was crucial, in the fact that we have consulted and now improved the regulations. That will be a key vehicle to safeguarding children.

To put the current arrangements into context, in England and Wales, the national offender management service has responsibility for the resettlement and rehabilitation of offenders, and it is committed to designing interventions and services for offenders to reduce re-offending and reconviction and to protect the public. A number of significant developments in recent years have offered increased public protection from sex offenders. For example, the Criminal Justice and Court Services Act 2000 established the MAPPAs, or multi-agency public protection arrangements, to which you referred. They are there to safeguard the public and to manage dangerous offenders in the community. As you say, it is about the risk management of offenders. It is important to report, as I am sure you know, that the Gwent MAPPA strategic management board has commissioned a review of the handling of the Craig Sweeney case. A sentencing review has also been announced, which will consider the sentences given in cases such as Craig Sweeney's, where a guilty plea means that it can be cut by a third.

The responsible authorities in each of the 42 areas in England and Wales now comprise the police, probation and prison services. The sex offenders' register, as you reported so clearly, was set up under the Sex Offenders Act 1997, and means that offenders must register with the police within 72 hours of being convicted or cautioned. Failure to register attracts a fine or a prison sentence of

yn cydnabod o'r cychwyn nad yw'r cyfrifoldeb am lawer o'r materion a grybwyllir wedi'i ddatganoli, rhaid inni gymryd ein cyfrifoldeb o ddifrif o ran y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael inni. Dyna pam fy mod yn falch eich bod wedi cyflwyno'r mater hwn i'r Siambr, William. Rhaid achub ar y cyfleoedd hynny mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth y DU ar lefel weinidogol. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod y cyd-destun yr ydym yn gweithio ynddo. Yr oedd eich pwynt olaf ond un ynghylch y byrddau lleol diogelu plant yn hanfodol, gan ein bod wedi cynnal ymgynghoriad ac wedi gwella'r rheoliadau bellach. Bydd hynny'n allweddol i ddiogelu plant.

I roi'r trefniadau presennol mewn cyd-destun, yng Nghymru a Lloegr mae'r gwasanaeth cenedlaethol rheoli troseddwyd yn gyfrifol am ymsefydlu ac adsefydlu troseddwyd, ac mae wedi ymrwymo i lunio ymyriadau a gwasanaethau i droseddwyd er mwyn gostwng nifer yr achosion o aildroseddu ac ailgollfarnu, ac i amddiffyn y cyhoedd. Mae nifer o ddatblygiadau sylweddol mewn blynyddoedd diweddar wedi golygu bod y cyhoedd yn cael eu hamddiffyn yn fwy rhag troseddwyd rhyw. Er enghraifft, sefydlodd Deddf Cyfiawnder Troseddol a Gwasanaethau Llys 2000 MAPPAs, neu drefniadau amlasiantaeth ar gyfer amddiffyn y cyhoedd y cyfeirir atynt. Eu diben yw diogelu'r cyhoedd a rheoli troseddwyd peryglus yn y gymuned. Fel y dywedwch, mae a wnelo â rheoli'r risgiau a berir gan droseddwyd. Mae'n bwysig nodi, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch, bod bwrdd rheoli strategol MAPPAs Gwent wedi comisiynu adolygiad o'r modd yr ymdriniwyd ag achos Craig Sweeney. Cyhoeddwyd adolygiad o'r broses ddedfrydu hefyd, a fydd yn ystyried y dedfrydau a roddir mewn achosion fel achos Craig Sweeney, lle y mae ple euogrydd yn golygu y gellir ei lleihau o draean.

Mae'r awdurdodau cyfrifol yn y 42 o ardaloedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr bellach yn cynnwys yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth prawf a'r gwasanaeth carchardai. Sefydlwyd y gofrestr troseddwyd rhyw, fel y dywedwyd gennych mor glir, o dan Ddeddf Troseddwyd Rhyw 1997, ac mae'n golygu bod yn rhaid i droseddwyd gofrestru gyda'r heddlu ymhen 72 awr ar ôl cael eu collfarnu neu eu

up to five years. According to the Home Office, the compliance rate is around 97 per cent. In addition, the Criminal Justice Act 2003 places a duty on a range of other agencies, including local housing and education authorities, social services and health services, to co-operate with the responsible authorities.

The Sexual Offences Act 2003 overhauled the notification requirements and made significant changes. It put in place measures such as creating the new offence of grooming, to increase the protection of children and other vulnerable people. It also ensured that the perpetrators of such offences would be dealt with appropriately. The 2003 Act also provided additional powers to ensure that the most dangerous offenders, including dangerous sex offenders, would not be released until it is safe for them to be released. A taskforce has been established for child protection on the internet—and I know that you have raised this issue with me in questions, William—and the National Hi Tech Crime Unit also provides a powerful enforcement tool to combat child pornography on the internet.

All these measures should not be seen in isolation but as a range of complementary initiatives aimed at improving public protection. However, an important point that you made was that they must be evaluated by the Home Office in terms of priority and resources. Following the tragic death of Sarah Payne in July 2000, there were calls for routine public access to the sexual offenders' register. Megan's law was implemented in the US, but not in the same way across different states. After careful consideration of all the issues, the UK Government concluded that extending access to the personal details of sex offenders to the public was not appropriate.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for taking an intervention, Jane. Thinking about this really important subject—and I am grateful to William for raising it—do you agree that the media have a huge part to play in this, by

rhybuddio. Os na wneir hynny, rhoddir dirwy neu ddedfryd o garchar o hyd at bum mlynedd. Yn ôl y Swyddfa Gartref, mae tua 97 y cant yn cydymffurfio. Yn ogystal, mae Deddf Cyfiawnder Troseddol 2003 yn gosod dyletswydd ar amrywiol asiantaethau eraill, gan gynnwys awdurdodau tai ac awdurdodau addysg lleol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gwasanaethau iechyd, i gydweithio â'r awdurdodau cyfrifol.

Yr oedd Deddf Troseddau Rhywiol 2003 yn trawsnewid y gofynion hysbysu ac yn gwneud newidiadau sylweddol. Rhoddodd fesurau ar waith megis creu'r trosedd newydd o feithrin perthynas amhriodol, er mwyn amddiffyn plant a phobl ddi-amddiffyn eraill yn fwy. Hefyd sicrhodd fod dull priodol o ymdrin â throseddwyr o'r fath yn cael ei weithredu. Yn ogystal, cyflwynodd Deddf 2003 bwerau ychwanegol i sicrhau na fyddai'r troseddwyr mwyaf peryglus, gan gynnwys troseddwyr rhyw peryglus, yn cael eu rhyddhau nes ei bod yn ddiogel gwneud hynny. Sefydlwyd tasglu ar y rhyngwrwyd ar gyfer amddiffyn plant—a gwn eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda mi mewn cwestiynau, William—ac mae'r Uned Troseddau Uwch-Dechnoleg Genedlaethol hefyd yn gyfrwng gorfodi pwerus i fynd i'r afael â phornograffi plant ar y rhyngwrwyd.

Ni ddylid ystyried y mesurau hyn ar wahân, ond eu gweld fel ystod o fentrau ategol sy'n anelu at wella'r broses o amddiffyn y cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, un o'r pwyntiau pwysig a wnaed gennych oedd bod yn rhaid i'r Swyddfa Gartref eu gwerthuso o ran blaenoriaeth ac adnoddau. Yn dilyn marwolaeth drasig Sarah Payne ym mis Gorffennaf 2000, galwyd am roi'r hawl i'r cyhoedd weld y gofrestr troseddwyr rhyw fel mater o drefn. Gweithredwyd cyfraith Megan yn yr UD, ond nid yn yr un ffordd ym mhob un o'r taleithiau gwahanol. Ar ôl ystyried yr holl faterion yn ofalus, daeth Llywodraeth y DU i'r casgliad nad oedd yn briodol rhoi'r hawl i'r cyhoedd weld manylion personol troseddwyr rhyw.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch am dderbyn ymyriad, Jane. Gan feddwl am y pwnc hollbwysig hwn—ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i William am ei godi—a gytunwch fod gan y cyfryngau ran enfawr i'w chwarae, drwy

behaving in a responsible manner across the board? Whatever our feeling on this whole issue, the media can be key and can, technically, cause some huge problems if they go down a certain route with their coverage.

Jane Hutt: We have cross-party agreement on that, and it formed one of the key challenges in the Gwenda Thomas review, 'Keeping Us Safe'. The media have an important role to play in terms of their responsibilities and the impact of their coverage. The good thing about organisations like the NSPCC is that people respect them. The evidence that the NSPCC provides through its experience at the sharp end is evidence that we can all sign up to and understand. To go back to its paper in 2001, in which it reviewed the evidence of the impact of community notification—that was legislated through Megan's law in the United States—it concluded that there was very little evidence to substantiate claims that community notification would enhance child safety. However, there needs to be further research in taking this forwards. This is where we must consider the evidence and the campaign that the NSPCC is taking forwards. Experience in other countries is always important to inform developments here.

In fact, it is thought among those dealing with the management of sex offenders living in the community that general community notification is likely to cause more problems than it would solve. Our children's commissioners have been clear on this, including our Children's Commissioner for Wales. Fear in the community would be exacerbated, and the offender might feel more isolated, making his behaviour unpredictable. There could also be more examples of vigilante attacks. The realities of the situation of the families in these circumstances and our concerns about safeguarding and protecting children mean that we have to take these issues very seriously, and consider them again when the challenge is put to us. Across the Chamber, we seek to protect children from all types of abuse. We wish to see the best possible child protection, and we wish to play our part here through the Welsh Assembly Government

ymddwyn mewn modd cyfrifol yn gyffredinol? Beth bynnag a deimlwn ynghylch y mater hwn, gall y cyfryngau chwarae rhan allweddol, ac yn dechnegol gallant achosi rhai problemau enfawr os byddant yn penderfynu dilyn trywydd penodol yn sylw a roddir.

Jane Hutt: Mae pob plaid yn cytuno â hynny, a dyna oedd un o'r heriau allweddol yn adolygiad Gwenda Thomas, 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Mae gan y cyfryngau ran bwysig i'w chwarae o ran eu cyfrifoldebau ac effaith y sylw a roddir. Y peth da am sefydliadau fel yr NSPCC yw bod pobl yn eu parchu. Mae'r dystiolaeth a roddir gan yr NSPCC drwy ei phrofiad ar flaen y gad yn dystiolaeth y gallwn oll ei deall. Gan fynd yn ôl i'w phapur yn 2001, lle yr adolygodd y dystiolaeth o effaith roi gwybod i gymunedau—a gafodd ei ddeddfu drwy gyfraith Megan yn yr Unol Daleithiau—daeth i'r casgliad mai prin iawn oedd y dystiolaeth i gefnogi honiadau y byddai hysbysu cymunedau yn diogelu plant yn fwy. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ymchwilio i hyn ymhellach wrth symud y mater ymlaen. Dyna pryd y mae'n rhaid inni ystyried y dystiolaeth a'r ymgyrch y mae NSPCC yn eu cyflwyno. Mae profiad mewn gwledydd eraill bob amser yn bwysig i lywio datblygiadau yma.

Yn wir, ym marn y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am reoli troseddwr rhyw sy'n byw yn y gymuned, mae hysbysu cymunedau yn gyffredinol yn debygol o achosi mwy o broblemau nag y byddai'n eu datrys. Mae ein comisiynwyr plant wedi bod yn glir ynghylch hyn, gan gynnwys Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Byddai ofn yn y gymuned yn gwaethygu, a gallai'r troseddwr deimlo'n fwy ynysig, gan wneud iddo ymddwyn mewn modd na ellid ei ragweld. Hefyd, gellid gweld mwy o enghreifftiau o ymosodiadau ar bobl ddieuog. Mae gwirionedd sefyllfa'r teuluoedd yn yr amgylchiadau hyn a'n pryderon ynghylch diogelu ac amddiffyn plant yn golygu bod yn rhaid inni gymryd y materion hyn o ddifrif, a'u hystyried eto pan roddir yr her inni. Ar draws y Siambr, ceisiwn amddiffyn plant rhag pob math o gamdriniaeth. Dymunwn weld y math gorau o system amddiffyn plant, a dymunwn chwarae ein rhan yma drwy Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r gefnogaeth

and this cross-party support, and, indeed, through all the agencies that play their part in Wales.

drawsbleidiol hon, ac, yn wir, drwy'r holl asiantaethau sy'n chwarae eu rhan yng Nghymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That completes this afternoon's business.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â busnes y prynhawn yma i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.09 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6.09 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)

Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)