



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 11 Gorffennaf 2006  
Tuesday, 11 July 2006**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- 4 Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio  
Election of a Planning Decision Committee
- 5 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 33 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 38 Datganiad am Adolygiad Beecham  
Statement on the Beecham Review
- 59 Datganiad am Ddyraniadau Cyfalaf  
Statement on Capital Allocations
- 71 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 71 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 74 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006  
Approval of the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006
- 77 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cafa-caffa mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Kava-kava in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006
- 80 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006  
Approval of the Contaminants in Food (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006
- 82 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006
- 95 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Baragraff 2(3)(c) Atodlen 1 Deddf Cydraddoldeb 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under Paragraph 2(3)(c) of Schedule 1 to the Equality Act 2006 to the First Minister
- 97 Cymeradwyo Adolygiad o Wasanaethau Ambiwylans  
Approval of a Review of Ambulance Services
- 101 Adroddiad Blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb'  
The Annual Report of 'Iaith Pawb'
- 118 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 119 Adroddiad Blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb': Parhad  
The Annual Report of 'Iaith Pawb': Continued

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Election of a Planning Decision Committee**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly resolves:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu:*

*1. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-5, be established in accordance with Standing Order No. 17 of the Assembly to discharge those functions of the Assembly in respect of the matters identified in the Schedule to this motion which are indicated in respect of each matter in that schedule and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that committee;*

*1. bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-5, yn cael ei sefydlu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17 y Cynulliad i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â'r materion yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn a nodir ar gyfer pob mater yn yr atodlen honno a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o ran y pethau hynny yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r pwyllgor hwnnw;*

*2. that the members of that committee be:*

*2. mai aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw fydd:*

*Carwyn Jones (Chair), Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Jocelyn Davies;*

*Carwyn Jones (Cadeirydd), Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Jocelyn Davies;*

*3. that the committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order 17.16 or on the 31 October 2006, whichever is the earlier; and*

*3. bod y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.16 neu ar 31 Hydref 2006, pa un bynnag sy'n dod gyntaf; a*

*4. that if the committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the Schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.*

*4. os bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna, yn yr achos hwnnw, dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â'r mater hwnnw, i'r Prif Weinidog.*

#### *Schedule*

#### *Atodlen*

*called-in planning application under section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by Mr A. Lloyd for proposed erection of a dwelling and formation of a new access to the highway at Waunbant, Lledrod, Ceredigion;*

*cais cynllunio a alwyd-i-mewn dan adran 77 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gan Mr A. Lloyd ar gyfer cynnig i godi tŷ annedd a ffurfio mynedfa newydd i'r briffordd yn Waunbant, Lledrod, Ceredigion;*

*planning appeal under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by Redrow Homes (North Wales) Ltd for the*

*apêl cynllunio dan adran 78 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gan Redrow Homes (North Wales) Ltd ar gyfer cynnig i adfer hen*

*proposed restoration of former brickwork and quarry, development of up to 300 dwellings, creation of open space, woodland, an area of habitat creation and landscaping, construction of new and improved vehicular and pedestrian access at former Lane End brickworks, Church Road, Buckley, Flintshire. (NDM3173)*

*waith brics a chwarel, datblygu hyd at 300 o dai annedd, creu llecyn agored, coetir, ardal o greu cynefin a thirlunio, adeiladu mynedfa newydd a gwell i gerbydau a cherddwyr yn hen waith brics Lane End, Church Road, Bwcle, Sir y Fflint. (NDM3173)*

**Y Llywydd:** Symudwn yn syth at bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will move directly to the vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3173): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3173): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

## Athletau Athletics

**Q1 Laura Anne Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what he is doing to encourage participation in athletics in Wales? OAQ1759(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I am sure that I speak for all Members in taking this opportunity to congratulate Stephen Dodd, the golfer from Barry, on winning the Smurfit European Open, Enzo Maccarinelli from Swansea for winning the interim world cruiserweight boxing championship, Tom James from Cardiff and Deeside for winning the world silver medal in the rowing pairs, and Nicole Cook for winning the women's Tour de France last weekend.

The Sports Council for Wales is supporting the Athletics Association of Wales in this financial year with £414,000 of funding for the development of athletics. This represents an increase of almost 20 per cent on last year.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I join you in congratulating those athletes. The UK School Games initiative, launched in London in March, will be the biggest ever school sports event. It hopes to engage young people in the Olympic spirit and encourage more people to take up athletics. I am aware that our own star, Colin Jackson, is backing this initiative, as he too believes that it will provide an excellent platform for athletics to develop young talent in the run up to the games. Some of the athletes taking part will probably also take part in the 2012 Olympic Games. However, we know from past experience that such UK initiatives do not always reach Wales. Can you provide us with an assurance that Wales will be making the most of what I and the Conservative Party believe to be a fantastic initiative in the run up to the London Olympic Games and, hopefully, in the future, the Commonwealth Games in Wales?

**The First Minister:** We agree with the notion of building a broad platform of excellence through Dragon Sport for those

**C1 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn mae'n ei wneud i annog pobl i gymryd rhan mewn athletau yng Nghymru? OAQ1759(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Yr wyf yn ffyddiog fy mod yn siarad ar ran yr holl Aelodau wrth achub ar y cyfle hwn i Longyfarch Stephen Dodd, y golffiwr o'r Barri, am ennill Cystadleuaeth Agored Smurfit Ewrop, Enzo Maccarinelli o Abertawe am ennill pencampwriaeth bocsiu pwysau godrwm interim y byd, Tom James o Gaerdydd a Glannau Dyfrdwy am ennill medal arian y byd yn y parau rhwyfo a Nicole Cook am ennill y Tour de France i fenywod benwythnos diwethaf.

Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru'n cefnogi Cymdeithas Athletau Cymru yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon gyda £414,000 o gyllid ar gyfer datblygu athletau. Mae hyn yn cynrychioli cynnydd o bron i 20 y cant ar gyllid y llynedd.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Ymunaf â chi i longyfarch yr athletwyr hynny. Menter Gemau Ysgolion y DU, a lansiwyd yn Llundain fis Mawrth, fydd y digwyddiad chwaraeon ysgolion mwyaf erioed. Gobeithir y bydd yn annog pobl ifanc i ymuno yn ysbryd y Gemau Olympaidd ac yn annog rhagor o bobl i roi cynnig ar athletau. Gwn fod ein seren ein hunain, Colin Jackson, yn cefnogi'r fenter hon, gan fod yntau hefyd yn credu y bydd hyn yn llwyfan gwych i athletau ar gyfer datblygu talent ifanc cyn y gemau. Mae hi'n debygol y bydd rhai o'r athletwyr a fydd yn cymryd rhan hefyd yn cymryd rhan yng Ngemau Olympaidd 2012. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom o brofiad nad yw mentrau o'r fath bob amser yn cyrraedd Cymru. A allwch ein sicrhau y bydd Cymru'n manteisio i'r eithaf ar yr hyn yr wyf fi a'r Blaid Geidwadol yn credu sy'n fenter wych cyn Gemau Olympaidd Llundain a, gobeithio, yn y dyfodol, Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunwn â'r syniad o adeiladu llwyfan eang o ragoriaeth drwy Gampau'r Ddraig ar gyfer plant rhwng 7 a 11

aged 7-11, and for those even younger than that—I know from my grandchildren that school sports now extend to athletics competitions suitably adapted for 5 and 6-year-olds, which did not happen when I was in school. That will help build a pyramid, even though the Olympic Games will come far too soon for those in very young age groups. It is important that we recognise that it is only through building a broad pyramid that we will develop candidates suitable for Elite Cymru support, and, possibly, the kind of people who might get on the podium to receive a gold, silver or bronze medal in the 2012 London Olympic Games.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That was going to be my question: what help will you be able to give to support and inspire the youth of today so that they can become highly competitive athletes for the 2012 Olympic Games?

**The First Minister:** This works in two ways. The prospect of an Olympic Games on home soil inspires people with the thought that they might be possible podium-finishers in 2012, but its being there also acts as an inspiration for people who will perhaps reach their peak in 2016 or in intervening championships, such as the Commonwealth Games or European Championships, or even the 2020 Olympic Games. That is what happened with Lynne Davies; he famously visited the Commonwealth Games in Cardiff in 1958—as did I, but it did not have the same effect on me—and said that being there, and seeing brilliant athletes perform, led to his winning the Olympic long-jump gold medal in the Tokyo Olympic Games six years later in 1964. We also want to stimulate that effect of the Olympic Games.

oed, a rhai sydd hyd yn oed yn iau na hynny—gwn drwy fy wyrion fod chwaraeon ysgol bellach yn cynnwys cystadlaethau athletig a addaswyd yn briodol ar gyfer plant 5 a 6 oed, nad oedd yn digwydd pan oeddwn i yn yr ysgol. Bydd hynny'n helpu i adeiladu pyramid, er y bydd y Gemau Olympaidd yn dod yn rhy fuan o lawer ar gyfer y grwpiau ifanc iawn. Mae hi'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod mai dim ond drwy adeiladu pyramid eang y gallwn ddatblygu ymgeiswyr sy'n addas ar gyfer cefnogaeth Elite Cymru ac, o bosibl, y math o bobl a allai gyrraedd y podiwm i dderbyn medal aur, arian neu efydd yng Ngemau Olympaidd Llundain yn 2012.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr oeddwn i am ofyn hynny: pa gymorth y gallwch ei roi i gefnogi ac ysbrydoli pobl ifanc heddiw er mwyn iddynt allu dod yn athletwyr cystadleuol iawn ar gyfer Gemau Olympaidd 2012?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn gweithio mewn dwy ffordd. Mae gwybod y cynhelir y Gemau Olympaidd ar ein tir ein hunain yn ysbrydoli pobl i feddwl y gallent gyrraedd y podiwm yn 2012, ond mae hefyd yn ysbrydoli pobl a fydd efallai'n cyrraedd y brig yn 2016 neu mewn pencampwriaethau rhwng hynny, fel Gemau'r Gymanwlad neu Bencampwriaethau Ewrop, neu hyd yn oed Gemau Olympaidd 2020. Dyna ddigwyddodd gyda Lynne Davies; mae'n hysbys iawn iddo ymweld â gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghaerdydd yn 1958—fel minnau, ond ni chafodd yr un effaith arnaf i—a dywedodd fod bod yno a gweld yr athletwyr gwych yn perfformio, wedi arwain at ei fuddugoliaeth pan enillodd fedal aur y Gemau Olympaidd am y naid hir yn Tokyo chwe blynedd yn ddiweddarach yn 1964. Yr ydym hefyd eisiau sbarduno'r math hwnnw o ddylanwad yn sgîl y Gemau Olympaidd.

### **Rhoi Organau a Meinwe Organ and Tissue Donation**

**Q2 Carl Sargeant:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to increase public awareness of the positive benefits of organ and tissue donation for transplantation?  
OAQ1769(FM)

**C2 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Prif Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd ynghylch y buddiannau cadarnhaol o roi organau a meinwe ar gyfer trawsblaniadau?  
OAQ1769(FM)

**The First Minister:** That is a very important question. I am pleased to tell you that the number of people in Wales registered as organ donors rose from 622,000 to 674,000 over the year to May 2006. Our budget for the financial year that has just begun includes new money of £1.5 million a year to support a centrally managed tissue service for Wales.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you; those figures are quite impressive, First Minister. Transplants are among the most miraculous achievements of modern medicine, but depend entirely on the generosity of the donors and their families, who are willing to make these life-saving gifts to others. Today, 394 people in Wales are waiting for someone to make that gift. The biggest obstacle that these people face is the reluctance of grieving relatives to allow the organs of their loved one to be removed for transplantation. How can we most effectively give would-be donors the message that they must make their relatives aware of their wishes, as even when the person carries a donor card, the wishes are not always carried out?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for that further question on this issue: heart, heart and lung, liver, kidney and, more recently, face transplants, are all now possible. In Wales, as in the rest of the UK, we have an opt-in system, rather than an opt-out system. We still think that, ethically, that is the right way to do this. People or their relatives make a positive decision: it is a positive gift, made when you cease to be able to avail yourself of your vital organs. We think that is the right way to do it. Although, of course, far more material would be available for transplantation if we had an opt-out system, we believe that trying to encourage more people to opt in is still the right way forward.

**David Lloyd:** Mae argyfwng enfawr o ran rhestrau aros am drawsblaniadau organau. Onid ydych yn credu felly ei bod yn amser i ni edrych unwaith eto ar gael system o optio allan yn lle'r system bresennol o optio i

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn gwestiwn pwysig dros ben. Mae'n falch gennyf ddweud wrthyfch fod nifer y bobl yng Nghymru a gofrestrwyd fel rhoddwyr organau wedi codi o 622,000 i 674,000 dros y flwyddyn hyd at Fai 2006. Mae ein cyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol sydd newydd ddechrau'n cynnwys arian newydd gwerth £1.5 miliwn y flwyddyn i gefnogi gwasanaeth canolog i reoli meinwe yng Nghymru.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch; mae'r ffigurau hynny'n galonogol iawn, Brif Weinidog. Trawsblaniadau yw un o lwyddiannau mwyaf gwyrthiol meddygaeth fodern, ond maent yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar haelioni pobl a'u teuluoedd sy'n fodlon rhoi'r rhodd arbennig hwn i achub bywyd eraill. Heddiw mae 394 o bobl yng Nghymru yn disgwyl i rywun roi'r rhodd hwnnw. Y rhwystr mwyaf sy'n wynebu'r bobl hyn yw amharodrwydd perthnasau sydd mewn galar i ganiatáu i feddygon dynnu organau eu câr ar gyfer trawsblaniad. Beth yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o roi'r neges i ddarpar roddwyr bod yn rhaid iddynt ddweud wrth eu perthnasau am eu dymuniadau, gan hyd yn oed pan fydd pobl â cherdyn rhoi, ni chaiff eu dymuniadau eu gwireddu bob tro?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn ychwanegol hwnnw ar y mater hwn: mae hi bellach yn bosibl trawsblannu calon, calon ac ysgyfaint, iau, arennau ac, yn fwy diweddar, wyneb. Yng Nghymru, yn yr un modd ag yng ngweddill y DU, mae gennym system optio i mewn yn hytrach na system optio allan. Yr ydym yn dal i gredu, yn foesol, mai dyna'r ffordd gywir o wneud hyn. Mae pobl neu eu perthnasau'n gwneud penderfyniad cadarnhaol: mae'n rhodd gadarnhaol, a wneir pan na chewch ragor o fudd o'ch organau pwysig. Credwn mai dyna'r ffordd iawn o wneud hyn. Er, wrth gwrs, y byddai llawer mwy o ddeunyddiau ar gael ar gyfer trawsblannu petai gennym system optio allan, credwn mai ceisio annog rhagor o bobl i optio i mewn yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen o hyd.

**David Lloyd:** There is a huge crisis in terms of waiting lists for organ transplants. Do you not therefore think that it is time that we looked again at an opt-out system instead of the present opt-in system?



mewn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain—ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn parhau i fod yn aelod o'r gymdeithas, Dai—yn cefnogi'r system o optio allan yn hytrach na'r system o optio i mewn, ond yr wyf yn meddwl bod yr elfen o berswâd a newid meddwl, a'r diwylliant moesol o ran gwneud dewis, a dewis positif yn hytrach na dewis negyddol, yn parhau i fod yn bwysig. Mae'r egwyddor o gydsyniad yn bwysig, o ran a ydych wedi cydsynio â hyn, neu a yw eich teulu wedi cydsynio â hyn. Yr ydym yn parhau i weithio ar sail hynny, ac, fel y dywedais, mae mwy na 50,000 yn fwy o bobl ar y rhestr nac oedd flwyddyn yn ôl.

**David Melding:** I understand that there is a test match being played between Britain and Australia this week, and all those taking part have undergone a transplant. It is a terrific indication of the quality of life that can be achieved following a transplant. I think that Carl Sargeant is right; it is about managing these registers when they are developed. There is a fantastic number of people now registered, but we need to do more work so that people know who needs to be informed, and so that the families are aware. I think that the voluntary route is better than having a system in which we are all opted in unless we have specifically said that we do not want to donate our organs.

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for your support. I recognise the pressures, and the integrity of the BMA's thinking on this, although I do not agree with it. The moral climate in which we operate in terms of consent to transplantation may change in the future, and that would make the whole business somewhat easier. At the moment, it relies upon the leadership of sports stars, people in politics and so on, in saying that they have signed up to this, and asking whether others should not also be thinking of this, and talking it through with the family, so that there is no hesitation if anything untoward should happen by way of a road accident or some other sudden event.

**The First Minister:** The British Medical Association—and I am sure that you are still a member of it, Dai—supports an opt-out system rather than an opt-in system, but I think that the element of persuasion and changing one's mind, and the moral culture in terms of making a choice, and a positive rather than a negative choice, continues to be important. The principle of consent is important, in terms of whether you or your family have consented to this. We continue to work on that basis, and, as I said, there are more than 50,000 additional people on the list than there were a year ago.

**David Melding:** Caf ar ddeall fod gêm brawf yn cael ei chwarae rhwng Prydain ac Awstralia'r wythnos hon, a bod pawb sy'n cymryd rhan wedi cael trawsblaniad. Mae'n arwydd gwych o'r ansawdd bywyd y gellir ei gyflawni ar ôl trawsblaniad. Credaf fod Carl Sargeant yn iawn; mae'n ymwneud â rheoli'r cofrestrau hyn pan gânt eu datblygu. Mae nifer fawr o bobl bellach wedi cofrestru ond mae angen i ni wneud rhagor o waith er mwyn i bobl wybod pwy sydd angen cael gwybod, ac er mwyn sicrhau bod eu teuluoedd yn gwybod am hyn. Credaf fod y llwybr gwirfoddol yn well na chael system lle byddem i gyd wedi ein hoptio i mewn oni bai ein bod wedi datgan yn benodol nad ydym eisïau rhoi ein horganau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cefnogaeth. Yr wyf yn cydnabod pwysau, ac unplygrwydd barn Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ar hyn o beth er nad wyf yn cytuno â hi. Gall yr hinsawdd foesol o ran cydsynio i drawsblaniad newid yn y dyfodol, a byddai hynny'n gwneud pethau'n haws. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n dibynnu ar arweiniad gan sêr chwaraeon, pobl ym myd gwleidyddiaeth ac yn y blaen, drwy ddweud eu bod wedi cytuno i wneud hyn, a gofyn oni ddylai eraill fod yn meddwl am hyn ac yn ei drafod gyda'r teulu, er mwyn sicrhau na cheir oedi petai rhywbeth anffodus yn digwydd fel damwain ffordd neu ddigwyddiad sydyn arall.

## Cyswllt Band Eang Broadband Connection

**C3 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Gweinidog ddatganiad am argaeledd cyswllt band eang? OAQ1757(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar hyn o bryd mae 99 y cant o gartrefi Cymru yn gallu derbyn band eang cenhedlaeth gyntaf. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynd ati dros yr haf i alluogi gweddill y cyfnewidfeydd sydd heb eu newid drosodd i gynnig band eang, a bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd ymron i 100 y cant o gartrefi Cymru yn gallu cael band eang erbyn y gaeaf.

2.10 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Bydd pobl Bryn croes ym Mhen Llŷn yn falch pan fydd y gwaith hwnnw wedi'i gwblhau. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, mae nifer o gwmnïau preifat y maes bellach yn cynnig nifer o wasanaethau ar un cytundeb; maent yn cynnig gwasanaethau band eang a ffôn ac ati fel un pecyn. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r cynigion hynny ar gael yng ngogledd Cymru na'r Canolbarth. Er fy mod yn deall mai cwmnïau preifat ydynt, a wnewch chi a'ch Llywodraeth fynd i drafodaethau gyda'r cwmnïau i weld a oes modd ymestyn y cynigion hynny i drefi yng ngogledd a chanolbarth Cymru, fel nad yw'r ardaloedd hynny yn cael eu gadael ar ôl unwaith eto yn y maes pwysig hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn derbyn bod problem bob amser pan fo is-adeiledd technoleg yn dod i mewn o'r newydd. Bydd cwmnïau bob amser yn dechrau gyda'r ardaloedd hynny sydd o fewn cylch yr M25 ac wedyn yn ymestyn i ddinasoedd mawr eraill fel Lerpwl, Manceinion, Caeredin, Glasgow ac ati. Ambell waith, mae'n anodd eu denu i dde Cymru hyd yn oed, heb sôn am fannau gyda phoblogaeth is, fel y gogledd-orllewin Cymru a'r Canolbarth. Yn y lle cyntaf, dylem geisio sicrhau bod yr is-adeiledd ar gael, naill ai drwy dalu amdano'n uniongyrchol neu drwy Amcan 1. Wedyn, rhaid creu cystadleuaeth er mwyn dod â'r prisiau i lawr, ond nid yw'n rhwydd, a rhaid inni dderbyn bod y farchnad bob amser yn gwasgu am osod pwyslais ar yr ardaloedd mwyaf cyfoethog, fel de-ddwyrain Lloegr, yn

**Q3 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the availability of broadband connection? OAQ1757(FM)

**The First Minister:** Currently, 99 per cent of homes in Wales can receive first-generation broadband. The Assembly Government will get on the case over the summer to enable the remaining exchanges that have not been changed over to offer broadband, and that will mean that nearly 100 per cent of Welsh homes can get broadband by the winter.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The people of Bryn croes on the Llŷn peninsula will be pleased when that work is complete. In relation to that, many private sector companies in that industry now offer many services to customers on one contract; broadband and telephony services and so on are offered as a package. Unfortunately, such deals are not on offer in north or mid Wales. While I appreciate that they are private companies, will you and your Government enter into discussions with those companies, to see whether there is any way of extending those offers to towns in north and mid Wales, so that those areas are not left trailing behind once again in this important matter?

**The First Minister:** We accept that there is always a problem when new technological infrastructure is first introduced. Companies always start with those areas that are inside the M25 belt and then extend to other large cities, such as Liverpool, Manchester, Edinburgh, Glasgow and so on. Sometimes, it can be difficult to attract them even to south Wales, let alone to areas with smaller populations, such as north and mid Wales. In the first instance, we should try to ensure that the infrastructure is in place, either by paying for it directly, or through Objective 1. We must then create competition in order to drive down prices, though that is not easy, and we must accept that the market will always push for the emphasis to be placed on the most well off areas first, such as south-east England.

gyntaf.

### Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Public Services

**Q4 Janet Ryder:** What recent discussions has the First Minister held with public bodies in Wales regarding budgetary pressures affecting the delivery of public services? OAQ1762(FM)

**The First Minister:** I thank you for that timely question, because getting more bang for the buck is very much at the heart of the excellent Jeremy Beecham review of local public service delivery in Wales, which was launched yesterday and about which Sue Essex, the Minister with responsibility for finance, local government and public services, will make a statement later.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware that the Welsh Local Government Association recently published a document on managing the funding gap, commissioned by PricewaterhouseCoopers. Interestingly, in the section on capital requirements, it has identified a significant funding gap. It says that if WAG funding levels are assumed to remain constant in 2008-09 and 2009-10, and the capacity for prudential borrowing for the four authorities assumed to be representative across Wales remains the same, a significant funding gap for Welsh schools of some £749 million will remain. How will your Government meet that £749 million and therefore its target of making all schools fit for purpose by 2010?

**The First Minister:** We have found a wide variety in the skills and commitment of certain local authorities as compared with others. I have even been present at a lunch table, hearing one local government leader criticising another for being unable to latch on quickly to the methods that are currently available to promote the more rapid modernisation of the schools system, which, in turn, means deciding which schools to modernise and which have a problem with falling school rolls.

**C4 Janet Ryder:** Pa drafodaethau mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda chyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ynghylch pwysau cyllidebol sy'n effeithio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ1762(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Diolch am y cwestiwn amserol hwn, oherwydd bod manteisio i'r eithaf ar bob punt wrth galon adolygiad gwych Jeremy Beecham o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus lleol yng Nghymru, a lansiwyd ddoe. Bydd Sue Essex, y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros gyllid, llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn rhoi datganiad am hyn yn nes ymlaen.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi cyhoeddi dogfen yn ddiweddar am reoli'r bwloch cyllido, a gomisiynwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers. Yn ddiddorol, yn yr adran am ofynion cyfalaf, nododd fwloch cyllido sylweddol. Dywed os tybir y bydd lefelau cyllido Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n aros yn gyson yn 2008-09 ac yn 2009-10, a bod y gallu ar gyfer cael benthyg yn gall ar gyfer y pedwar awdurdod y tybir eu bod yn gynrychioladol ledled Cymru yn aros yr un fath, bydd bwloch cyllido sylweddol gwerth oddeutu £749 miliwn yn parhau ar gyfer ysgolion Cymru. Sut y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn diwallu'r £749 miliwn hwnnw ac felly ei tharged o sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas at ei phwrpas erbyn 2010?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi dod o hyd i amrywiaeth eang o ran sgiliau ac ymrwymiad rhai awdurdodau lleol o'u cymharu ag eraill. Yr wyf hyd yn oed wedi bod yn bresennol wrth fwrdd cinio ac yn gwrandao ar un arweinydd llywodraeth leol yn beirniadu un arall am na allai gael gafael sydyn ar y dulliau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd i hyrwyddo'r broses ar gyfer moderneiddio'r system ysgolion yn gynt sydd, maes o law, yn golygu penderfynu pa ysgolion i'w moderneiddio a pha ysgolion sydd â phroblem gan fod nifer eu disgyblion yn disgyn.

We have been pleased to see a quite sharp increase in the level of schools' capital expenditure. It is on a rapidly rising curve. We think that this year's outturn will be over £180 million, and we want to see that level continue to rise, to achieve the objective that we all share of making schools fit for purpose at the earliest possible practical date.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Bu ichi gyfeirio at gynnwys adroddiad Jeremy Beecham, ond mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu y gallem ddangos bod strwythur gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a llywodraeth yng Nghymru lawer iawn yn rhy gymhleth. Mae'r system llywodraethu bresennol wedi'i seilio ar hen system Whitehall, a gafodd ei dilyn gan y Swyddfa Gymreig. Mae angen inni ailstrwythuro'r system o'r top i'r gwaelod. Mae hynny'n golygu bod sialens i'r awdurdodau lleol, ac i'r cyrff cyhoeddus megis y cyrff ieuchyd, ond mae sialens hefyd i'r Llywodraeth. A ydych chi fel Llywodraeth, Brif Weinidog, yn fodlon derbyn y sialens honno a rhoi arweiniad drwy ddweud bod yn rhaid i newid y strwythur llywodraethu fod yn rhan o'r broses?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe bai cynnwys adroddiad Jeremy Beecham a'i gydweithwyr, Syr Adrian Webb a'r Fonesig Gillian Morgan, yn debyg i'r hyn a ddywedaso, efallai y byddai modd i mi adnabod sail y cwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn adnabod yr hyn y bu ichi ei ddisgrifio fel rhyw elfen gref yn yr adroddiad. Credaf ei fod yn dweud nad yw'n ddewis rhwydd dweud y gallwch wella safon darpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus lleol yng Nghymru drwy gydweithio yn hytrach na thrwy gystadlu. Yn y cefndir, mae wastad posibilrwydd, os na ellir gwella safon darpariaeth gwasanaethau lleol, y gallwch feddwl am ailwampio ac ailstrwythuro'r cyrff sy'n cyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes eisiau meddwl am hynny yn y lle cyntaf oherwydd maent yn meddwl ein bod ar y trywydd iawn o ran ystyried cydweithio yn hytrach na chystadlu fel yr egwyddor fawr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Derbyniaf fod adroddiad Jeremy Beecham yn her i bawb; mae'n her i

Yr oedd yn falch gennym weld cynnydd eithaf sydyn yn lefel gwariant cyfalaf ysgolion. Mae'n codi'n gyflym ar gromlin. Credwn y bydd alldro eleni dros £180 miliwn, ac yr ydym yn awyddus i weld y lefel honno'n codi, er mwyn cyflawni'r amcan a rannwn i gyd sef sicrhau bod ysgolion yn addas i'w pwrpas ar y dyddiad cyntaf sy'n ymarferol bosibl.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** You referred to the contents of Jeremy Beecham's review, but the report suggests that we could show that the structure of public services and government in Wales is far too complex. The current governance structure has its roots in the old Whitehall system, which was copied by the Welsh Office. We need to restructure the system from top to bottom. That represents a challenge to local authorities, and to public bodies such as our health bodies, but it also represents a challenge to the Government. Are you as a Government, First Minister, willing to accept that challenge and take a lead by saying that changing the governance structure must be part of the process?

**The First Minister:** If the contents of the report published by Jeremy Beecham and his colleagues, Sir Adrian Webb and Dame Gillian Morgan, were similar to what you said, perhaps I could have recognised the basis of your question. However, I do not recognise what you have described as some strong element of the report. I believe that it says that it is not an easy choice to say that you can improve the standard of local public service delivery in Wales through collaboration rather than through competition. In the background, there is always the possibility, if the standard of local service delivery cannot be improved, of considering revamping and restructuring the bodies that deliver those services. However, there is no need to think about that in the first instance as they think that we are on the right track in considering collaboration rather than competition as the key principle.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I accept that Jeremy Beecham's report is a challenge to everyone;

bob plaid wleidyddol, i'r Llywodraeth, i awdurdodau lleol ac i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r arweiniad o ran yr angen am newid ddod oddi uchod. Mae hynny'n golygu os oes angen newid y strwythur llywodraethu fod yn rhaid gwneud hynny. Rhoddaf enghraifft i chi. Gan fod Jeremy Beecham yn dweud bod angen i ni feddwl am ffyrdd newydd o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a chan fod hynny'n gorfod cynnwys y Llywodraeth, awdurdodau lleol a'r cyrff cyhoeddus, onid yw hynny'n gyfle i ni edrych, er enghraifft, ar y syniad o sefydlu gwasanaeth sifil Cymreig, lle y gallwch ddatblygu gyrfaedd, nid yn unig o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil, ond mewn awdurdodau lleol ac mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Byddai modd i chi wedyn gael system integreiddiedig o'r math y dylech ei gael fel arfer da mewn gwlad fach.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydych yn sôn am wasanaeth sifil; credaf eich bod yn sôn am wasanaeth cyhoeddus, sy'n cynnwys llywodraeth leol a'r wasanaeth sifil. Mae llawer mwy o bobl yn gweithio ym maes llywodraeth leol, ond credaf fod pawb yn derbyn bod angen annog datblygu gyrfaedd ac arbenigedd ym maes gweinyddu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dyna beth mae'r cynllun Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Cymru yn ei wneud. Bu inni ddechrau ar y gwaith hwnnw ryw ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a bu'r ysgol haf a gynhaliwyd bythefnos yn ôl, ym Mangor, os cofiaf yn iawn, yn llwyddiannus iawn. Mae'r cynllun a'r holl syniad o ddatblygu safon ein gweinyddwyr yn y sector gyhoeddus wrth galon ein rhaglenni i wella safonau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I must confess that I thought that there was general agreement across the board here that there was a need for change. One of the things that I am surprised about is the fact that the First Minister thinks that everyone should change apart from the Government. If we are to have responsive public services in Wales, the leadership must come from the Government. We have heard an announcement today that up to 1,200 jobs could be cut as a result of certain changes that are happening. Can the First Minister give us an assurance that, as part of the Beecham review, those job cuts will not go forward?

it is a challenge for every political party, the Government, local authorities and public services. However, leadership regarding the need to change must come from the top. That means if there is a need to change the governance structure that that must be done. I will give you an example. Given that Jeremy Beecham states that we need to think about new ways of providing public services, and given that that must incorporate the Government, local authorities and public bodies, is this not an opportunity for us to look, for example, at the idea of setting up a Welsh civil service, within which you could develop careers, not only within the civil service, but also in local authorities and in public services? There would then be an opportunity for you to have an integrated system of the kind that should be in place as good practice in a small country.

**The First Minister:** You are not talking about a civil service; I think that you are talking about a public service, which includes local government and a civil service. Many more people work in local government, but I believe that everyone accepts the need to encourage the development of careers and expertise in the area of public service administration. That is what the Public Services Management Wales initiative is doing. We started that around two years ago, and the summer school that was held in Bangor a fortnight ago, if I remember correctly, was very successful. That initiative and the whole idea of developing the quality of our public sector administrators is right at the heart of our programmes to improve standards.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod wedi credu bod cytundeb cyffredinol ar draws y bwrdd yma fod angen newid. Un o'r pethau sydd yn fy synnu yw'r ffaith fod y Prif Weinidog yn meddwl y dylai pawb newid ar wahân i'r Llywodraeth. Os ydym am gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ymatebol yng Nghymru, rhaid i'r arweinyddiaeth ddod oddi wrth y Llywodraeth. Clywsom gyhoeddiad heddiw y gellid cwtogi hyd at 1,200 o swyddi o ganlyniad i newidiadau penodol sydd yn digwydd. A all y Prif Weinidog roi sicrwydd inni na fydd y cwtogi swyddi hynny'n digwydd, fel rhan o adolygiad Beecham?

**The First Minister:** You are arguing against yourself now. If you are arguing for change and that it must also affect the Assembly Government structure, you are almost arguing for major changes that may result in job losses. We do not recognise the figures that are in the press statement released by the civil service unions. We recognise that we are at the beginning of a budget round, and that, clearly, there will be downward pressure on the running costs of the Assembly civil service, as a Government machine, because we have always said that we want to switch as much resource as possible from the corporate shared service offices, which include human resources, finance, information technology and so on, in order to get more resources into the front line. That must be the right principle. It applies to us as much as it does to the NHS and to local government.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I had not believed, until today, that examinations and testing were getting easier. I thought that this was just a myth that existed, until I heard that you had been awarded eight out of 10 for your performance as First Minister. Then I heard that it was an award that you had made to yourself. Not many examinees have the privilege of marking their own papers.

2.20 p.m.

Given the ditched promises that we all know about, the bungled merger of the ASPBs, and particularly the comments of your own consultants on the Communities First programme—and I would ask you to comment on this—which they talked of as being very disappointing, and as having no measurable impact on poverty after six years, do you not feel that two out of 10 might be a rather generous assessment?

**The First Minister:** I see that you have read the myths created by some of the press coverage rather than the reports themselves. I was asked this question at the press conference this morning. I rejected the question and said that it was for others to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn dadlau yn erbyn eich hun yn awr. Os ydych yn dadlau dros newid a bod yn rhaid i hynny effeithio hefyd ar strwythur Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydych bron â bod yn dadlau dros newidiadau mawr a all olygu colli swyddi. Nid ydym yn cydnabod y ffigurau sydd yn y datganiad i'r wasg a ryddhawyd gan undebau'r gwasanaeth sifil. Cydnabyddwn ein bod ar ddechrau cylch cyllideb, ac y bydd, yn amlwg, wasgu i lawr ar gostau rhedeg gwasanaeth sifil y Cynulliad, fel peiriant Llywodraeth, oherwydd yr ydym wedi dweud erioed bod arnom eisiau symud cymaint o adnoddau ag sy'n bosibl o'r swyddfeydd rhannu gwasanaethau corfforaethol, sydd yn cynnwys adnoddau dynol, cyllid, technoleg gwybodaeth ac ati, er mwyn cael mwy o adnoddau i'r llinell flaen. Rhaid mai dyna'r egwyddor iawn. Mae'n berthnasol i ni yn gymaint ag i'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol ac i lywodraeth leol.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Nid oeddwn wedi credu, tan heddiw, fod arholiadau a phroffion yn mynd yn haws. Credwn mai dim ond chwedl oedd hon, hyd nes y clywais eich bod wedi cael wyth allan o ddeg am eich perfformiad fel Prif Weinidog. Wedyn clywais mai dyfarniad ydoedd a wnaethpwyd gennych i chi'ch hun. Nid llawer o rai sy'n sefyll arholiadau a gaiff y fraint o farcio'u papurau eu hunain.

Yn wyneb y tor addewidion y gŵyr pawb ohonom amdanynt, y traed moch wrth geisio uno'r Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad, ac yn enwedig sylwadau eich ymgynghorwyr eich hun ynglŷn â rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—a hoffwn ofyn ichi roi sylw ar hyn—oedd, meddent hwy, yn siomedig iawn, a heb gael dim effaith fesuradwy ar dlodi wedi chwe blynedd, oni theimlwh efallai y byddai dau allan o ddeg yn asesiad braidd yn hael?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwelaf eich bod wedi darllen y mythau a grëir gan rai o adroddiadau'r wasg yn hytrach na'r adroddiadau eu hunain. Gofynnwyd y cwestiwn hwn i mi yn y gynhadledd i'r wasg y bore yma. Gwrthodais y cwestiwn a

judge. However, I also said that the opposition parties found it difficult to cope with the fact that we have done what they said we could not do. We have brought NHS waiting lists down so that no-one is waiting more than 12 months for treatment or for a first out-patient consultation. We shot that fox, so I am very sorry that you cannot put that in your manifestos next year. We got a renewal of Objective 1 funding, which you never thought we could do, but we did, and so we shot that fox as well. I am sorry that you cannot put that in your manifestos either. You said that the mergers would collapse and that people would walk out in large numbers as we merged. That did not happen either, so we have also shot that fox—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes angen gweiddi yn y Siambr. A allwn gael trafodaeth gall?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A ydych yn siarad â mi?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn siarad â thi a phawb.

**Nick Bourne:** I am not sure whether the First Minister had finished what does not appear to be an answer to the question that I asked. We end this year as we began it: with the First Minister dodging the questions that he was asked. He was asked specifically about the Communities First programme and the comments of his own consultants—who cost £1 million—who said, quite correctly, I am sure, that no measurable impact on poverty had been made in six years. It was against that background that I said that you were extremely disappointing, First Minister, along with the ditched promises and the botched merger of the ASPBs. If you think that that has been a great success, I think that we had better reduce your marks to one out of 10.

**The First Minister:** I notice that you did not bring up NHS waiting lists, so you are accepting that we did what you thought we

dywedais mai mater i eraill ei farnu ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, dywedais hefyd fod y gwrthbleidiau'n ei chael hi'n anodd ymdopi â'r ffaith ein bod wedi gwneud yr hyn y dywedasant hwy na allem ei wneud. Yr ydym wedi lleihau rhestri aros y GIG fel nad oes neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis am driniaeth nac am ymgynghoriad claf allanol cyntaf. Saethwyd y cadno hwnnw gennym, felly mae'n flin iawn gennyf na allwch roi hynny yn eich maniffestos y flwyddyn nesaf. Cawsom adnewyddiad o arian Amcan 1, rhywbeth nad oeddech chi byth yn meddwl y gallem ei wneud, ond fe'i gwnaethom, felly dyna ni wedi saethu'r cadno hwnnw hefyd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na allwch roi hynny yn eich maniffestos ychwaith. Dywedasoeh y byddai'r prosesau uno'n chwalu ac y byddai pobl yn cerdded allan yn heidiau wrth inni uno. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny chwaith, felly dyna'r cadno hwnnw wedi'i saethu hefyd—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no need to shout in the Chamber. Could we please have a rational discussion?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Are you talking to me?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am talking to you and to everyone.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a oedd y Prif Weinidog wedi gorffen yr hyn nad yw'n ymddangos ei fod yn ateb i'r cwestiwn a ofynnais. Diweddw'n y flwyddyn hon fel y'i dechreusom: gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn osgoi'r cwestiynau a ofynnwyd iddo. Fe'i holwyd yn benodol am y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a sylwadau ei ymgynghorwyr ei hun—a gostiodd £1 filiwn—a ddywedodd, yn berffaith gywir, mae'n siŵr, na chafwyd unrhyw effaith fesuradwy ar dlodi mewn chwe blynedd. Yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw y dywedais eich bod yn siomedig eithriadol, Brif Weinidog, ynghyd â'r tor addewidion a'r traed moch o ran uno'r Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad. Os ydych chi'n meddwl bod hynny wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr, credaf fod yn well inni ostwng eich marciau i un allan o ddeg.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sylwaf na wnaethoch sôn am restrï aros y GIG, felly yr ydych yn derbyn ein bod wedi gwneud yr hyn y

could never do. I also notice that you did not bring up the Objective 1 question. You have not repeated the question about the failed mergers, because you cannot sustain it. None of the accusations that you or Alun Cairns made—rubbing your hands with glee that the mergers would all disappear in a puff of smoke—were true. They have been extremely well managed and people have not left.

With regard to the particular issue of Communities First, I have read the report of Cambridge Consultants Ltd, and it bears no similarity either to what the press has reported it as saying, or to what you have said. It has commended our approach, and it is, in general, a very good report.

**Nick Bourne:** It talks about inadequate staffing, which is interesting against the background of the cuts that are now being talked about in the number of Assembly staff. I have seen it, and it talks about there being no measurable impact on poverty. It talks about only £15 million finding its way to projects out of £99 million. To me, that is not a success story; perhaps the First Minister thinks that it is. It seems to indicate a degree of complacency on his behalf, which, even by his own standards, is pretty staggering. I did not ask about the health service; I asked specifically about Communities First. Could you address those issues, which were certainly in the report, because I have seen them?

**The First Minister:** No, you are wrong. The report commends our approach and says that it is a generational issue and, therefore, you cannot measure it before a generation has passed. It said that we had taken the right approach. If you believe that, by trying to find a single word here and gluing it together with a single word there, and then saying that that is a critical report about Communities First, I really think that you ought to go back to school to learn to understand English.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** First Minister, I will try something else that we think that you have not done very well at,

tybioch chi na allem byth ei wneud. Sylwaf hefyd na wnaethoch godi cwestiwn Amcan 1. Nid ydych wedi ailadrodd y cwestiwn am y methiannau wrth uno, oherwydd ni allwch ei gynnal. Nid oedd yr un o'r cyhuddiadau a wnaethoch chi nac Alun Cairns—gan rwbio'ch dwylo'n foddhaus y byddai'r uniadau i gyd yn diflannu mewn pwff o fwg—yn wir. Cawsant eu rheoli'n dda iawn ac nid yw pobl wedi gadael.

Ynglŷn â chwestiwn penodol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr wyf wedi darllen adroddiad Cambridge Consultants Ltd, ac nid oes dim tebygrwydd rhyngddo â'r hyn y mae'r wasg wedi adrodd ei fod yn dweud, nac â'r hyn yr ydych chi wedi'i ddweud. Mae wedi cymeradwyo'r ffordd yr aethom ati, ac y mae, ar y cyfan, yn adroddiad da iawn.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n sôn am staffio annigonol, sydd yn ddiddorol yn erbyn cefndir y toriadau y sonnir amdanynt bellach yn nifer staff y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi'i weld, ac mae'n sôn nad oes effaith fesuradwy ar dlodi. Mae'n sôn am £15 miliwn yn unig allan o £99 miliwn yn canfod ei ffordd i brosiectau. I mi, nid yw honno'n stori lwyddiant, efallai fod y Prif Weinidog yn meddwl ei bod. Mae fel petai'n amlygu rhyw radd o hunanfodddhad ar ei ran, sydd, hyd yn oed yn ôl ei safonau ef ei hun, yn eithaf syfrdanol. Ni holais am y gwasanaeth iechyd; holais yn benodol am Gymunedau yn Gyntaf. A allech roi sylw i'r materion hynny, a oedd yn sicr yn yr adroddiad, oherwydd yr wyf wedi'u gweld?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, yr ydych yn anghywir. Mae'r adroddiad yn cymeradwyo'r ffordd yr aethom ati ac yn dweud ei fod yn fater sy'n ymwneud â chenedlaethau ac na ellir, felly, ei fesur cyn i genhedlaeth fynd heibio. Dywedodd ein bod wedi mynd ati yn y ffordd iawn. Os credwch y gallwch ddod o hyd i un gair yn y fan yma a'i osod wrth un gair yn y fan acw, a dweud wedyn fod hwn yn adroddiad beirniadol am Gymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr wyf yn meddwl wir y dylech fynd yn ôl i'r ysgol i ddysgu deall Saesneg.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Yn gyntaf, Weinidog, rhoddaf gynnig ar rywbeth arall yr ydym ni'n meddwl nad



which may reduce your score, and it relates to your own manifesto commitments. In 2003, in your manifesto, you wrote:

‘By the end of the decade over £1 billion will have been spent ensuring that every school in Wales is fit for our children’.

In 2003, in ‘Wales: A Better Country’, which was your programme for Government, you wrote that you have,

‘An annual programme of funding for school buildings...so that all are fit for purpose by 2010’.

I agree, and this is all in last week’s Record of questions to the First Minister, that you have spent, or will spend—including money that you have got from PFI—the £560 million that you pledged. However, will you now accept that you cannot meet the second half of that pledge, which is to make every school fit for our children by 2010?

**The First Minister:** You are mixing what is in ‘Wales: A Better Country’ with what was in our manifesto. It is quite clear that not only will we meet our manifesto pledge on school modernisation expenditure in Wales, we will easily surpass it. The latest figures that I have seen indicate that the expenditure will be in the order of £650 million, which, as I would remind you, is £90 million more than the £560 million in the manifesto pledge.

**Michael German:** Once again, you are trying to avoid the issue that you are being marked upon, which is the second half of that pledge—the one that I am asking you about. It appears in both your manifesto and in your programme and it states that every school in Wales will be fit for purpose by the end of the decade. It is your manifesto and it is your picture on the cover. It also states that,

‘An annual programme of funding...so that all are fit for purpose by 2010’.

You have the report from the Welsh Local

ydych wedi gwneud yn dda iawn arno, a all ostwng eich sgôr, ac mae’n ymwneud â’ch addewidion maniffesto chi’ch hun. Yn 2003, yn eich maniffesto, ysgrifenasoch:

‘Erbyn diwedd y degawd, felly, bydd dros £1 biliwn wedi’i wario ar sicrhau bod pob ysgol yng Nghymru yn addas i’n plant’.

Yn 2003, yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’, sef eich rhaglen ar gyfer Llywodraeth, ysgrifenasoch fod gennych,

‘Rhaglen gyllido flynyddol ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion...fel y byddant yn addas ar gyfer y gwaith erbyn 2010’.

Cytunaf, ac mae hyn i gyd yng Nghofnod yr wythnos ddiwethaf o gwestiynau i’r Prif Weinidog, eich bod wedi gwario, neu’n mynd i wario—gan gynnwys arian a gawsoch drwy Fenter Cyllid Preifat—y £560 miliwn a addawsoch. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch dderbyn yn awr na allwch wireddu ail hanner yr addewid hwnnw, sef sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas ar gyfer ein plant erbyn 2010?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn cymysgu’r hyn sydd yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’ gyda’r hyn a oedd yn ein maniffesto. Mae’n gwbl glir nid yn unig y gwnawn wireddu ein haddewid maniffesto ynghylch gwariant ar foderneiddio ysgolion yng Nghymru, ond yr awn ymhellach na hynny’n rhwydd. Mae’r ffigurau diweddaraf imi eu gweld yn dangos y bydd y gwariant o gwmpas £650 miliwn, sydd, fel yr hoffwn eich atgoffa, yn £90 miliwn yn fwy na’r £560 miliwn yn yr addewid maniffesto.

**Michael German:** Unwaith eto, yr ydych yn ceisio osgoi’r cwestiwn yr ydych yn cael eich marcio arno, sef ail ran yr addewid hwnnw—yr un yr wyf yn eich holi amdani. Mae’n ymddangos yn eich maniffesto a hefyd yn eich rhaglen a dywed y bydd pob ysgol yng Nghymru’n addas ar gyfer y gwaith erbyn diwedd y ddegawd. Eich maniffesto chi ydyw a’ch llun chi sydd ar y clawr. Dywed hefyd y bydd

‘Rhaglen gyllido flynyddol...fel y byddant yn addas ar gyfer y gwaith erbyn 2010’.

Mae gennych yr adroddiad gan Gymdeithas

Government Association based upon the returns to your Government—not about the association’s own views but on what you have before you. That states that no authorities in Wales will reach their fit-for-purpose targets by 2010, 12 local authorities in Wales estimate that they will reach the fit-for-purpose targets somewhere between 2012 and 2015, and six authorities estimate that they will reach the targets between 2016 and 2020. The rest just do not know. Are you still prepared to tell me whether you will meet that commitment by 2010? Will you stand by that pledge? If so, tell us how you will meet it.

**The First Minister:** I do stand by the manifesto pledge on educational expenditure; it will easily be exceeded. All the figures that we have seen indicate an expenditure of £650 million, which is well above the £560 million contained in the manifesto pledge.

**Michael German:** It is clear that you are not prepared to accept the second half of your pledge, so we must believe that it will not happen by 2010. I would be grateful if you could say whether the Assembly spokesperson, reported in this morning’s *Western Mail*, is correct in saying that you will not meet that Assembly target by 2010. If that person is wrong, please tell me what action you have taken against him or her—a spokesperson for your Government. You have already said that you will not admit that you are not prepared to take it on board—you are not even prepared to answer the question on it—so we must take it that that is a pledge that will not happen.

**The First Minister:** No. We will exceed the manifesto pledge on educational expenditure by some £90 million, which is a creditable record. We have every reason to say that we have done far better than you thought that we would do. A sum of £90 million over and above the £560 million is an extremely good performance, of which we are proud. We are also proud to take it to the people of Wales in May 2007.

Llywodraeth Leol Cymru sy’n seiliedig ar ffigurau eich Llywodraeth—nid ynglŷn â barn y gymdeithas ei hun ond ynglŷn â’r hyn sydd gennych o’ch blaen. Dywed hwnnw na fydd dim awdurdodau yng Nghymru’n cyrraedd eu targedau o ran bod yn addas ar gyfer y gwaith erbyn 2010; mae 12 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru’n amcangyfrif y cyrrhaeddant y targedau o ran bod yn addas ar gyfer y gwaith rywbryd rhwng 2012 a 2015, ac mae chwe awdurdod yn amcangyfrif y cyrrhaeddant y targedau rhwng 2016 a 2020. Nid yw’r lleill yn gwybod. A ydych yn dal i fod yn barod i ddweud wrthyf a ydych am wireddu’r ymrwymiad hwnnw erbyn 2010? A wnewch chi sefyll wrth yr addewid hwnnw? Os gwnewch, dywedwch wrthym sut y gwnewch ei wireddu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn sefyll wrth yr addewid maniffesto ynghylch gwariant ar addysg, eir ymhellach na hynny’n rhwydd. Mae’r holl ffigurau yr ydym wedi’u gweld yn dangos gwariant o £650 miliwn, sydd ymhell uwchben y £560 miliwn a addawyd yn y maniffesto.

**Michael German:** Mae’n amlwg nad ydych yn barod i dderbyn ail ran eich addewid, felly rhaid inni gredu na wnaiff ddigwydd erbyn 2010. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud a yw llefarydd y Cynulliad, a ddyfynnwyd yn y *Western Mail* y bore yma, yn gywir pan ddywed na wnewch gyrraedd y targed hwnnw i’r Cynulliad erbyn 2010. Os yw’r person hwnnw’n anghywir, dywedwch wrthyf pa gamau yr ydych wedi’u cymryd yn ei erbyn ef neu hi—llefarydd ar ran eich Llywodraeth. Yr ydych eisoes wedi dweud na wnewch gyfaddef nad ydych yn barod i ymgymryd â’r mater—nid ydych hyd yn oed yn barod i ateb y cwestiwn amdano—felly rhaid inni gymryd mai addewid nad yw’n mynd i ddigwydd yw hwnnw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Na. Awn ryw £90 miliwn dros yr addewid maniffesto ar wariant addysg, sydd yn record sy’n haeddu clod. Mae gennym bob rheswm i ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud yn llawer gwell nag yr oeddech chi’n disgwyl inni wneud. Mae swm o £90 miliwn ar ben y £560 miliwn yn berfformiad eithriadol o dda, yn un yr ydym yn falch ohono. Yr ydym yn falch hefyd i’w gyflwyno i bobl Cymru ym Mai 2007.

## Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour

**Q5 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is liaising with the Home Office to tackle anti-social behaviour?  
OAQ1755(FM)

**The First Minister:** We work closely with the Home Office crime team, based in the Assembly, and local community safety partnerships on initiatives to tackle anti-social behaviour.

**Peter Black:** As you work so closely with the Home Office, what liaison have you had with its new national respect squad, which has been set up to spread best practice on anti-social behaviour? Does the squad have any members from Wales, and what is the Welsh Assembly Government's input to the squad?

**The First Minister:** I am not familiar with the details of the workings of the respect squad and whether it operates in Wales. I will make sure that Edwina Hart writes to you about it. We try to make sure that we work with community safety partnerships to press down on anti-social behaviour. Use is made of anti-social behaviour orders in Wales, though not on as an extensive a scale as in England. I think that we have around 6 per cent of the England and Wales total population, and we issue around 4 per cent of the anti-social behaviour orders in Wales. It is always available, but if the threat of it works better than the actuality of it, then that solves both problems.

**John Griffiths:** Undoubtedly, there is great public concern about anti-social behaviour, but it is obviously a complex problem, requiring a wide-ranging response if it is to be tackled effectively. Do you agree that two examples of the sort of response that is required for the future perhaps are: first, that we try to make sure that we have a greater pattern of mixed housing in Wales, rather

**C5 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydweithio gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol?  
OAQ1755(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cydweithiwn yn agos gyda thîm troseddau'r Swyddfa Gartref, sy'n gweithio yn y Cynulliad, a phartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol lleol, ar fentrau i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

**Peter Black:** Gan eich bod yn cydweithio mor agos gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref, pa gydweithio a wnaethoch gyda'i sgwad parch cenedlaethol newydd, a sefydlwyd i ledaenu arfer da ynghylch ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? A oes gan y sgwad unrhyw aelodau o Gymru, a beth yw mewnbyn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'r sgwad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â manylion dull gweithio'r sgwad parch a ph'un ai y mae'n weithredol yng Nghymru. Gwnaf yn siŵr y bydd Edwina Hart yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn ag ef. Ceisiwn sicrhau ein bod yn cydweithio gyda phartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol i wasgu i lawr ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Defnyddir gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng Nghymru, er nad mor helaeth ag yn Lloegr. Credaf fod gennym ryw 6 y cant o gyfanswm poblogaeth Cymru a Lloegr, a chyhoeddwn ryw 4 y cant o'r gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae bob amser ar gael, ond os yw'r bygythiad i'w ddefnyddio'n gweithio'n well na'r defnydd, yna mae hynny'n datrys y ddwy broblem.

**John Griffiths:** Yn ddi-os, mae pryder mawr ymysg y cyhoedd ynghylch ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, ond mae'n amlwg yn broblem gymhleth, sydd yn galw am ymateb eang os am fynd i'r afael â hi'n effeithiol. A ydych yn cytuno mai dwy enghraifft o'r math o ymateb sydd ei angen i'r dyfodol efallai yw: yn gyntaf, ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau patrwm mwy cymysg o dai yng Nghymru, yn

than some areas being overwhelmingly private and others being overwhelmingly social; and secondly, that we undoubtedly need more facilities and activities for younger people in Wales so that the small number who cause problems have other things to do to occupy their time?

**The First Minister:** I agree that we are not yet as expert as they are in France in securing good diversion programmes for vulnerable teenagers living in poor housing areas, to make sure that they find other things to do with their time that are just as exciting and more challenging, in some ways, than being engaged in anti-social behaviour, which can eventually progress to crime.

2.30 p.m.

We have much to learn from the French in this regard. However, we also need to be aware of the section 106 provisions to ensure that we have mixed housing areas, and ensure that private house builders abide by the section 106 provisions, and that local authorities chase them up to ensure that they abide by them, to ensure that those mixed areas transpire.

**Mark Isherwood:** As you know, anti-social behaviour damages the lives of many, and often leaves older and more vulnerable people living in fear and despair. However, it is a matter of huge concern that almost half of all anti-social behaviour Orders issued to young people aged between 10 and 17 have been breached on more than one occasion, and that 35 per cent of ASBOs given to those aged under 17 involve children with a diagnosed mental health disorder, or an accepted learning difficulty. Therefore, what action do you propose—at Home Office and devolved level—to reverse this deteriorating position, so that you may truly be tough not only on crime but on the causes of crime?

**The First Minister:** It is important that we give equal weight to both those strictures. I do not know whether you would be able to

hytrach na chael rhai ardaloedd bron yn gyfangwbl breifat ac eraill bron yn dai cymdeithasol i gyd; ac yn ail, fod arnom angen, heb os, mwy o gyfleusterau a gweithgareddau i bobl iau yng Nghymru fel y bydd gan y nifer fach sydd yn peri problemau bethau eraill i'w gwneud i lenwi eu hamser?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf nad ydym eto'n gymaint o arbenigwyr ag y maent yn Ffrainc ar sicrhau rhaglenni difyrru da i arddogolion agored i niwed sydd yn byw mewn ardaloedd tai gwael, i wneud yn siŵr eu bod yn cael pethau eraill i'w gwneud gyda'u hamser sydd yr un mor gyffrous ac yn fwy heriol, mewn rhai ffyrdd, nag ymwneud ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, a all yn y pendraw arwain at droseddu.

Mae gennym lawer i'w ddysgu oddi wrth y Ffrancwyr yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o ddarpariaethau adran 106 hefyd er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ardaloedd o dai cymysg, a sicrhau bod adeiladwyr tai preifat yn cydymffurfio â darpariaethau adran 106, a bod awdurdodau lleol yn mynd ar eu hól i sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio â hwy, er mwyn sicrhau y ceir ardaloedd cymysg o'r fath.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn amharu ar fywydau llawer o bobl, ac yn aml yn gadael rhai hŷn a rhai sydd yn fwy agored i niwed yn byw mewn ofn ac anobaith. Fodd bynnag, testun pryder mawr yw bod bron hanner y Gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a roddwyd i bobl ifanc rhwng 10 a 17 oed wedi'u torri ar fwy nag un achlysur, a bod 35 y cant o'r Gorchmynion a roddwyd i rai dan 17 oed yn ymwneud â phlant y canfuwyd bod anhwylder iechyd meddwl arnynt, neu anhawster dysgu cydnabyddedig. Felly, pa gamau yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd—ar lefel y Swyddfa Gartref a'r lefel ddatganoledig—i wrthdroi'r sefyllfa hon sydd yn mynd yn waeth, fel y gallwch fod yn galed ar droseddu a hefyd ar achosion troseddu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n bwysig inni roi'r un pwys ar y ddwy feirniadaeth hynny. Nid wyf yn gwybod a allech ein goleuo o ran a

enlighten us as to whether you adhere to the John Major philosophy of ‘understand a little less, and condemn a little more’, or to the new ‘let us get to understand the hoodies’ philosophy, which is, apparently, the new policy of your leader. It is important that we understand why young people feel that they want to rebel through anti-social behaviour, and to see whether we can divert them away from it by music programmes, sports programmes, or some other way of getting rid of that surplus energy before it diverts into the ways that have become a nuisance to pensioners and other people trying to live their lives.

**Carl Sargeant:** The ‘hug a hoodie’ campaign seems to be rubbing off on Nick Bourne’s team and Peter Black—they are soft on crime, again. You do not have to be young or old to behave in an anti-social way; the issue is about dealing with anti-social behaviour as a whole. Do you believe that opposition AMs should distance themselves from the Westminster policy? What we should be doing in Wales is looking after the people and ensuring that anti-social behaviour does not affect them, whether they are hoodies or not.

**The First Minister:** I agree. We just want to ensure that the environment in which young people grow up is one in which they do not feel attracted to anti-social behaviour, and that, when they gather in large and sometimes threatening numbers in front of a Spar shop, and therefore discourage a pensioner from feeling safe enough to go out to buy a few necessities at 8 p.m., somehow or other they understand why they are threatening those pensioners and making them feel that the streets do not belong to law-abiding people any more. It is a difficult issue, because young people feel like congregating, but, on the other hand, it makes pensioners’ lives a misery. We must broker between the generations, to ensure that everyone is regarded as a full citizen, without causing problems to other citizens in Wales.

ydych yn glynu wrth athroniaeth John Major o ‘ddeall ychydig yn llai, a cholffarnu ychydig yn fwy’, ynteu’r athroniaeth newydd o ‘gadewch inni ddeall yr *hoodies*’, sef polisi newydd eich arweinydd, mae’n debyg. Mae’n bwysig inni ddeall pam y mae pobl ifanc yn teimlo awydd i wrthryfela drwy ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol, a gweld a allwn dynnu eu sylw oddi wrth hynny drwy raglenni cerddoriaeth, rhaglenni chwaraeon, neu ryw fodd arall i gael gwared â’r egni sydd dros ben cyn iddo gael ei droi i gyfeiriad y pethau sydd wedi dod yn niwsans i bensynwyr ac i bobl eraill sydd yn ceisio byw eu bywydau.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae’n ymddangos bod yr ymgyrch hoffi *hoodies* yn dylanwadu ar dîm Nick Bourne ac ar Peter Black—maent yn trin troseddu’n rhy ysgafn eto. Nid oes raid ichi fod yn ifanc neu’n hen i ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol; mae hyn yn ymwneud â delio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ei gyfanrwydd. A ydych yn credu y dylai ACau y gwrthbleidiau ymbellhau oddi wrth bolisi San Steffan? Yr hyn y dylem ei wneud yng Nghymru yw gofalu am bobl a sicrhau na fydd ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn effeithio arnynt, pa un a ydynt yn *hoodies* ai peidio.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Ein hunig ddymuniad yw sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn tyfu mewn amgylchedd lle nad ydynt yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu denu i ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol, a’u bod yn dod i ddeall, rywsut neu’i gilydd, pan fyddant yn ymgasglu’n niferoedd mawr a bygythiol weithiau o flaen siop Spar, ac felly’n peri i bensynwr deimlo nad yw’n ddigon diogel iddo fynd allan i brynu ychydig o angenrheidiau am 8 p.m., pam y maent yn codi braw ar bensynwyr o’r fath ac yn peri iddynt deimlo nad yw’r strydoedd yn eiddo bellach i bobl sydd yn barchus o’r gyfraith. Mae’n bwnc astrus, gan fod pobl ifanc yn teimlo awydd i ymgasglu, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae hynny’n peri gofid i bensynwyr. Rhaid inni ganoli rhwng y cenedlaethau, i sicrhau bod pawb yn cael ei ystyried yn ddinesydd llawn, heb achosi problemau i ddinasyddion eraill yng Nghymru.

**Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Caerdydd**  
**Ambulance Service in Cardiff**

**Q6 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the ambulance service in Cardiff? OAQ1767(FM)

**The First Minister:** It is for the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, and the body that commissions its services—Health Commission Wales—to determine the provision of emergency ambulances in individual local health board areas, such as Cardiff. The trust is finalising a modernisation plan and has already introduced several improvement initiatives in a number of LHB areas, including Cardiff.

**Jenny Randerson:** What do Cardiff, Torfaen, Caerphilly, Rhondda Cynon Taf, Monmouthshire, Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr and the Vale of Glamorgan have in common, besides being in south-east Wales? I will give you the answer—they have the worst ambulance response times in Wales. We know that response times are bad throughout Wales, but those areas have the worst. I am sure that you are aware that Roger Thayne, the departed chief executive of the ambulance trust, was here in the Senedd today. His judgment is that south-east Wales is under-resourced compared with the rest of Wales. He also said that the modernisation of the ambulance service should go ahead with all speed, and that your Government was well aware of the problems with the ambulance service, but had failed to take a lead. Do you agree with his judgment?

**The First Minister:** The south-east Wales ambulance trust was established in 1992, and I described it at the time as a banana trust—it was a bananas idea of the then Secretary of State for Wales, David Hunt, in putting together such an awkwardly shaped area in his desperation to try to get several trusts in just before the 1992 election. It was an unwieldy structure, based on the personalities of the then chief executives of the different ambulance trusts who wanted them to become one trust, because they thought that they would get patted on the head and get

**C6 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghaerdydd? OAQ1767(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru, a'r corff sydd yn comisiynu ei gwasanaethau—Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru—yw penderfynu ar y ddarpariaeth o ambiwlansiau brys yn ardaloedd byrddau iechyd lleol neilltuol, fel Caerdydd. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn cwblhau cynllun moderneiddio ac mae eisoes wedi cyflwyno sawl cynllun gwella yn nifer o ardaloedd y BILlau, gan gynnwys Caerdydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Beth sydd yn gyffredin rhwng Caerdydd, Tor-faen, Caerffili, Rhondda Cynon Taf, sir Fynwy, Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tudful a Bro Morgannwg, heblaw'r ffaith eu bod yn y De-ddwyrain? Rhoddaf yr ateb i chi—ganddynt hwy y mae'r amseroedd ymateb gwaethaf gan ambiwlansiau yng Nghymru. Gwyddom fod yr amseroedd ymateb yn wael ledled Cymru, ond gan yr ardaloedd hynny y mae'r rhai gwaethaf. Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn gwybod bod Roger Thayne, cyn-brif weithredwr yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, wedi bod yma yn y Senedd heddiw. Yn ei farn ef, mae'r De-ddwyrain yn brin o adnoddau o'i gymharu â gweddill Cymru. Dywedodd hefyd y dylid dechrau moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans rhag blaen, a bod eich Llywodraeth yn gwybod yn iawn am broblemau'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ond ei bod wedi methu â rhoi arweiniad. A ydych yn derbyn ei farn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sefydlwyd ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans de-ddwyrain Cymru yn 1992, ac fe'i galwais ar y pryd yn ymddiriedolaeth ddisynnwyr—yr oedd yn syniad disynnwyr ar ran Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, David Hunt, ac yntau wedi creu ardal mor anodd ei thrin yn ei gyfyng gyngor wrth geisio cyflwyno sawl ymddiriedolaeth ar drothwy etholiad 1992. Yr oedd yn strwythur anhylaw, wedi'i seilio ar bersonoliaethau prif weithredwyr y gwahanol ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans ar y pryd a oedd yn dymuno iddynt ddod yn un

more money from the then Tory Government. It was a completely barmy idea and we have inherited the consequences. With regard to what you said about Roger Thayne, I was not present when he made those remarks, but as he is no longer the chief executive, I would rather listen to the proposals from Dr Anton Van Dellen, who is.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In response to Jenny Randerson, you said that you disagreed with the proposition that was put forward in 1992, which rather begs the question of what you and your party have been doing for the past seven or eight years if you felt that the structure of the ambulance service was not conducive to providing an efficient service. One of the problems that the ambulance service faces, particularly in south Wales, is attempting to meet what is termed the turnaround time, the target for which in Wales is now 15 minutes. The average turnaround time in Wales is 24 minutes, so it is taking quite a substantial amount of time for ambulance crews to discharge a patient to the relevant accident and emergency department member of staff and then get back out on to the road. In light of the problems that are now being faced by the ambulance service, what are you doing as a Government to help it meet that target?

**The First Minister:** We keep ratcheting up the target times for ambulances to get to calls of different levels of urgency. Although the service keeps catching up with the targets that we set, we then ratchet up the targets further because we want to see continuous improvement. You made a particular point about some accident and emergency service areas, where, at the worst of times, there can be six or seven ambulances queuing outside. Just after the out-of hours service was changed over in the University Hospital of Wales, you sometimes had eight or nine ambulances in a queue in the accident and emergency parking area, which was completely unacceptable. I think that the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust would accept that it did not have a properly resourced or

ymddiriedolaeth, gan eu bod yn credu y caent ganmoliaeth a mwy o arian gan y Llywodraeth Doriadaidd ar y pryd. Yr oedd yn syniad hollol hurt ac yr ydym wedi etifeddu'r canlyniadau. Gyda golwg ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch am Roger Thayne, nid oeddwn yn bresennol pan wnaeth y sylwadau hynny ond, gan nad yw bellach yn brif weithredwr, byddai'n well gennyf wrando ar gynigion yr un sydd bellach yn brif weithredwr, sef Dr Anton Van Dellen.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Wrth ymateb i Jenny Randerson, dywedasoch eich bod wedi anghytuno â'r cynllun a gyflwynwyd yn 1992, ac mae hynny'n peri i rywun ofyn beth y buoch chi a'ch plaid yn ei wneud yn y saith neu wyth mlynedd diwethaf os oeddech yn teimlo nad oedd strwythur y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn addas i ddarparu gwasanaeth effeithlon. Un o'r problemau y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn eu hwynebu, yn enwedig yn y De, yw ceisio cyrraedd y targed o ran yr amser rhwng cludo un claf i'r ysbyty a bod yn barod i ymateb i'r alwad nesaf, sy'n 15 munud yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Y amser cyfartalog yng Nghymru yw 24 munud, felly mae'n cymryd cryn amser i griwiau ambiwlans drosglwyddo claf i ofal aelod staff perthnasol mewn adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ac wedyn mynd yn ôl ar y ffordd. Yng ngolwg y problemau y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn eu hwynebu'n awr, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud fel Llywodraeth i'w helpu i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn dal i dynhau'r amseroedd targed i ambiwlansiau ar gyfer ymateb i alwadau o wahanol lefelau brys. Er bod y gwasanaeth yn parhau i gyrraedd y targedau yr ydym yn eu gosod, byddwn wedyn yn codi'r targedau ymhellach gan ein bod am weld gwelliant parhaus. Gwnaethoch bwynt penodol am y gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys mewn rhai ardaloed, lle y gellir gweld chwech neu saith o ambiwlansiau'n aros eu tro y tu allan, ar yr adegau gwaethaf. Yn fuan ar ôl newid y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, byddech weithiau'n gweld wyth neu naw o ambiwlansiau'n aros eu tro ym man parcio'r gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac yr oedd hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol. Yr wyf

properly organised accident and emergency intake service. It is now paying massive attention to that issue and that should solve the problem of ambulances backing up because they simply cannot get the patients out.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I echo what Jonathan Morgan said about it being time for your Government to take responsibility. If we add on the previous two years before the Assembly was established, Labour has had nine years to get this right. It is a matter of grave concern that the ambulance response times are now worse in south-east Wales, including Cardiff, than they were 10 years ago and that surely must be accepted as a crisis situation that must be dealt with. First Minister, will you acknowledge that Anton Van Dellen, who is now the chief executive, was the co-author of Roger Thayne's report, that he shares Roger Thayne's concerns and that, presumably, he is also concerned about your Government's lack of willingness to take a lead on this? Will you commit yourself and your Minister to seriously addressing this service? This service is unsafe—Roger Thayne was able to demonstrate today the basis upon which he stated that we are probably losing 500 Welsh citizens a year because our ambulances are so slow. Will you accept that this is a very serious situation, that it is a matter for your Government and that modernisation plans need to be accelerated?

**The First Minister:** We have seen absolutely no evidence to substantiate his statement that 500 lives are being needlessly lost in Wales because of disorganisation, under-resourcing or any other matter relating to the Welsh ambulance trust. You have tried to lock Dr Van Dellen in with Roger Thayne and imply that if Roger Thayne says anything, Dr Van Dellen must agree with him 100 per cent. That is not true because, clearly, if he had shared Roger Thayne's concerns, he would not have stayed when Roger Thayne left. Roger Thayne decided to walk off the job and Anton Van Dellen decided to take on the job. That is a very important difference, so your idea about

yn credu y byddai Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn derbyn nad oedd ei gwasanaeth derbyn ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys wedi'i ariannu na'i drefnu'n briodol. Mae bellach yn rhoi sylw mawr i'r mater hwnnw a disgwylir y bydd hynny'n datrys y broblem a geir wrth i ambiwlansiau aros eu tro am na allant ollwng y cleifion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ategef yr hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan Morgan i'r perwyl ei bod yn bryd i'ch Llywodraeth dderbyn cyfrifoldeb. Os ychwanegwn y ddwy flynedd blaenorol cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, mae Llafur wedi cael naw mlynedd i roi trefn ar hyn. Testun pryder mawr yw bod amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansiau'n waeth yn awr yn y De-ddwyrain, gan gynnwys Caerdydd, nag yr oeddent 10 mlynedd yn ôl ac mae'n sicr bod rhaid derbyn mai argyfwng yw hwnnw y mae'n rhaid delio ag ef. Brif Weinidog, a wnewch gydnabod mai Anton Van Dellen, sydd bellach yn brif weithredwr, oedd cyd-awdur adroddiad Roger Thayne, ei fod yn rhannu pryderon Roger Thayne a'i fod hefyd, gellir cymryd, yn bryderus ynghylch amharodrydd eich Llywodraeth i gynnig arweiniad ar hyn? A wnewch chi a'ch Gweinidog ymrwmo i roi sylw i'r gwasanaeth hwn o ddifrif? Mae'r gwasanaeth hwn yn anniogel—yr oedd Roger Thayne yn gallu dangos heddiw ar ba sail y dywedodd ein bod yn colli 500 o ddinasyddion Cymru bob blwyddyn, yn ôl pob tebyg, am fod ein hambiwlsiau mor araf. A wnewch dderbyn bod y sefyllfa hon yn ddifrifol iawn, ei bod yn fater i'ch Llywodraeth a bod rhaid cyflymu'r cynlluniau moderneiddio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni welsom unrhyw dystiolaeth o gwbl i gadarnhau ei ddatganiad bod 500 o fywydau'n cael eu colli'n ddiangen yng Nghymru oherwydd diffyg trefn, tanariannu neu unrhyw fater arall sydd yn ymwneud ag ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Yr ydych wedi ceisio cysylltu Dr Van Dellen â Roger Thayne ac awgrymu bod Dr Van Dellen yn sicr o gytuno'n llwyr â phob dim a ddywed Roger Thayne. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir oherwydd pe buasai'n rhannu pryderon Roger Thayne, ni fyddai wedi aros pan ymadawodd Roger Thayne. Penderfynodd Roger Thayne adael y swydd a phenderfynodd Anton Van Dellen ymgymryd â hi. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth



shared concerns is plainly ludicrous.

mawr iawn, felly mae'n amlwg bod eich cred eu bod yn rhannu pryderon yn un chwerthinllyd.

**Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin)  
Public Services (Mid and West Wales)**

**Q7 Glyn Davies:** What plans does the First Minister have to improve the delivery of public services in mid and west Wales? OAQ1753(FM)

**C7 Glyn Davies:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i wella'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin? OAQ1753(FM)

**The First Minister:** I refer you to the excellent report of the review of local service delivery, led by Sir Jeremy Beecham, which was launched yesterday with his colleagues, Professor Steve Martin, and above all, Sir Adrian Webb and Dame Gill Morgan. Sue Essex will make a statement on this report shortly as it covers Wales, including mid and west Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at adroddiad rhagorol yr adolygiad o'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau lleol, a arweiniwyd gan Syr Jeremy Beecham, a lansiwyd ddoe gyda'i gymheiriaid, yr Athro Steve Martin, ac yn anad neb, Syr Adrian Webb a'r Fonesig Gill Morgan. Bydd Sue Essex yn gwneud datganiad am yr adroddiad hwn cyn hir gan ei fod yn ymdrin â Cymru gyfan, gan gynnwys y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin.

**Glyn Davies:** Health services, particularly acute services, in much of mid Wales are dependent on services in Shropshire. Over recent years, the Shrewsbury and Telford NHS Trust has run up a debt of over £34 million. The long-awaited formal consultation on the plan that the new management intends to put in place to resolve the position was due to have been launched today and has been cancelled at the last minute, raising questions about the clinical viability of the Royal Shrewsbury Hospital, which is the main hospital providing acute services for much of mid Wales. There are knock-on effects here for the finances of the Powys Local Health Board, and serious financial effects in the future for waiting lists in mid Wales. Will you or your Minister for Health and Social Services arrange to meet the Powys Local Health Board to discuss this serious and deeply concerning problem, which threatens healthcare services in mid Wales?

**Glyn Davies:** Mae gwasanaethau iechyd, yn enwedig gwasanaethau aciwt, mewn llawer rhan o'r Canolbarth yn dibynnu ar wasanaethau yn swydd Amwythig. Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Amwythig a Telford wedi mynd i ddyled o fwy na £34 miliwn. Yr oedd yr ymgynghoriad ffurfiol hirddisgwyliedig ar y cynllun y mae'r rheolwyr newydd yn bwriadu ei roi ar waith i ddatrys y sefyllfa i fod i gael ei lansio heddiw ond mae wedi'i ddiddymu ar y funud olaf, fel bod amheuon yn codi ynghylch dichonadwyedd clinigol Ysbyty Brenhinol Amwythig, sef y prif ysbyty sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau aciwt i lawer man yn y Canolbarth. Ceir effeithiau cynyddol yn hyn o beth ar sefyllfa ariannol Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, ac effeithiau ariannol difrifol yn y dyfodol ar restrau aros yn y Canolbarth. A wnewch chi neu'ch Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol drefnu i gwrdd â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys i drafod y broblem ddifrifol hon sydd yn peri pryder mawr ac yn bygwth gwasanaethau gofal iechyd yn y Canolbarth?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** Acute services for mid Wales are shared, I think, between the Royal

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwasanaethau aciwt ar gyfer y Canolbarth yn cael eu rhannu, yr

Shrewsbury Hospital, Hereford County Hospital, Bronglais General Hospital and Nevill Hall Hospital and possibly some other hospitals as well. However, there have been particular problems over cross-border commissioning of acute services and I believe that there are fairly regular discussions between the Powys Local Health Board and us about how to resolve that, because changes in accounting rules, commissioning and payment rules and waiting lists rules in England can have adverse effects. Sometimes, the only answer is to repatriate the provision of those services to Welsh hospitals.

**Christine Gwyther:** I also wish to pursue the issue of health in mid and west Wales, First Minister. You will know that the health community in Pembrokeshire is not afraid to be trail-blazing; it blazed a trail in Tenby, building a new hospital following deliberations by the local community. It is blazing a trail with South Pembrokeshire Hospital, which will offer both social and health services. Most importantly, it is blazing a trail with Pembrokeshire Community Health Centre, putting together an option 3 as a rejoinder to 'Designed to Deliver', and firmly rejecting option 1 and option 2. Will you join me in commending the work done by Pembrokeshire CHC in putting option 3 together? It is bringing together partners from the local health board, the council, the voluntary sector and from the trust and will put together a very credible and workable option 3.

**The First Minister:** I assume, from what has been said previously, that the centre will have availed itself of the offer that we made to provide the professional support necessary to work up option 3 to where it is technically the equal of options 1 and 2. Whether the outcome is equal, in terms of safe and excellent services and accessible services, I am not yet in a position to judge. We made the offer available, so that organisations could work up options properly, and I assume, from what you are saying, that that is what has been done.

**Elin Jones:** Cyhoeddodd y comisiwn iechyd ddydd Gwener ei fod yn dymuno symud gwasanaethau niwrolawdriniaethol o

wyf yn credu, rhwng Ysbyty Brenhinol Amwythig, Ysbyty Sirol Henffordd, Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bronglais ac Ysbyty Nevill Hall a rhai ysbytai eraill o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd problemau neilltuol wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau aciwt ar draws y ffin ac yr wyf yn credu bod trafodaethau eithaf rheolaidd rhwng Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys a ni ynghylch y modd i ddatrys hynny, gan fod newidiadau i reolau cyfrifyddu, rheolau comisiynu a thalu a rheolau rhestrau aros yn Lloegr yn gallu cael effaith niweidiol. Weithiau, yr unig ateb yw symud darpariaeth y gwasanaethau hynny i ysbytai yng Nghymru.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr wyf finnau'n dymuno codi mater iechyd yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, Brif Weinidog. Gwyddoch fod y rhai ym maes iechyd yn sir Benfro yn barod iawn i arloesi; gwnaethant arloesi yn Ninbych-y-pysgod, gan godi ysbyty newydd ar ôl trafodaethau yn y gymuned leol. Maent yn arloesi gydag Ysbyty De Sir Benfro, a fydd yn cynnig gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol. Yn bwysicaf oll, maent yn arloesi gyda Chanolfan Iechyd Gymunedol Sir Benfro, gan greu dewis 3 fel ymateb i 'Designed to Deliver', a gwrthod dewis 1 a dewis 2 yn bendant. A wnewch ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo'r gwaith a wnaeth Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Benfro wrth lunio dewis 3? Mae'n dod â phartneriaid at ei gilydd o'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, y cyngor, y sector gwirfoddol a'r ymddiriedolaeth a bydd yn llunio dewis 3 a fydd yn ymarferol a chredadwy iawn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cymryd, o'r hyn a ddywedwyd o'r blaen, fod y ganolfan wedi derbyn y cynnig a wnaethom i ddarparu'r cymorth proffesiynol a oedd yn angenrheidiol i baratoi dewis 3 fel ei fod yn dechnegol gyfwerth â dewisiadau 1 a 2. Nid wyf eto mewn lle i farnu a yw'r canlyniad yr un fath, o ran gwasanaethau diogel a rhagorol a gwasanaethau hygyrch. Rhoesom y cynnig, fel y gallai cyrff baratoi dewisiadau'n briodol, ac yr wyf yn cymryd, o'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, mai hynny a wnaed.

**Elin Jones:** The health commission announced on Friday that it wishes to move neurosurgical services from Morriston to

Dreforus i Gaerdydd. Mae hyn yn newyddion trychinebus i ni yn y gorllewin. Os fydd rhywun yn cael niwed i'r pen mewn damwain yn Aberystwyth yn nhywyllwch nos, pan nad yw'n bosibl i ddefnyddio'r ambiwlans awyr, yna bydd y person hwnnw dros ddwy awr a hanner oddi wrth wasanaeth ysbyty ar gyfer niwed i'r pen. Hefyd, bydd ambiwlans allan o Geredigion am saith neu wyth awr yn trosglwyddo'r person i Gaerdydd. A yw'ch Llywodraeth am weld pawb yng Ngheredigion, sir Benfro a mannau eraill yn symud *lock, stock and barrel*, yn gyfleus i chi, o fewn milltir sgwâr i'r Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru yn Nghaerdydd? Yr ydym yn dechrau teimlo, Brif Weinidog, fel pe baem yn drigolion eilradd yn eich Cymru chi.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn ceisio pwyntio'r bys o fai tuag ataf am ryw reswm gwleidyddol. Nid ni wnaeth yr argymhellid hwnnw. Mae'n rhaid inni ei ddeall ac yna gwneud y penderfyniad naill ai i'w dderbyn neu beidio. Wrth gwrs, mae rhai esiamplau sydd yn gweithio fel arall, sef llosgfeydd a llawfeddygaeth blastig. Dim ond yn Nhreforus y cewch y gwasanaeth hwnnw—mae pobl y dde ddwyrain yn gorfod teithio i Ysbyty Treforus er mwyn cael y gwasanaeth hwnnw, achos mai dyna'r unig ysbyty yng Nghymru sydd yn ei gyflawni. Mae'n bwysig fod pawb yn derbyn yr egwyddor fod angen 100, 200 neu 300—nid wyf yn siŵr faint—o gleifion yn cael eu trin bob blwyddyn er mwyn rhoi'r cyfle i'r meddygon a'r llawfeddygon i gael eu hyfforddi, fel eu bod yn cyrraedd safon dderbyniol. Ni allwch gyflawni pob gwasanaeth ym mhob ysbyty ac mae rhai o'r dewisiadau yr ydych yn gorfod eu gwneud yn rhai anodd dros ben.

Cardiff. This is disastrous news for us in west Wales. If anyone suffers head trauma in an accident in Aberystwyth during the night, when the air ambulance cannot be used, then that person will be over two and a half hours away from a dedicated hospital service for head injuries. Also, an ambulance will be out of Ceredigion for seven or eight hours, transferring that patient to Cardiff. Does your Government want to see everyone in Ceredigion, Pembrokeshire and elsewhere move lock, stock and barrel, for your convenience, to within a square mile of the University Hospital of Wales in Cardiff? We are beginning to feel, First Minister, as if we are second-class citizens in your Wales.

**The First Minister:** You are trying to point the finger of blame towards me for some political reason. We did not make that recommendation. We have to understand it and then decide whether to accept it or not. Of course, there are some examples that work the other way, namely burns and plastic surgery. Only Morriston provides that service—people in south-east Wales have to travel to Morriston Hospital in order to receive that service, because it is the only hospital in Wales that provides it. It is important that everyone accepts the principle that you need 100, 200 or 300—I am not sure how many—patients being treated a year in order to provide an opportunity for the doctors and surgeons to receive training, so that they reach an acceptable standard. You cannot have every service provided in every hospital, and some of the decisions that must be made are exceptionally difficult.

### Cwmnïau Ailgylchu Recycling Companies

**Q8 Mick Bates:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to help promote opportunities for recycling companies? OAQ1768(FM)

**The First Minister:** Our initiatives to help recycling companies are contained in our waste strategy, including the waste and resources action programme, and the creating Welsh markets for recyclates programme, run by the Wales Environment Trust. Assembly

**C8 Mick Bates:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i helpu i hybu cyfleoedd i gwmnïau ailgylchu? OAQ1768(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ceir ein cynlluniau i helpu cwmnïau ailgylchu yn ein strategaeth gwastraff, sydd yn cynnwys y rhaglen weithredu ar wastraff ac adnoddau, a'r rhaglen ar greu marchnadoedd yng Nghymru i ddeunydd a ailgylchwyd, sydd yn cael ei

funding and support is also available through the environmental goods and services programme and the regional selective assistance programme.

**Mick Bates:** Some of that sounds encouraging, but the amount of waste, per person, going to landfill sites in Wales actually increased last year. Therefore, I am not sure that all those actions are having a positive effect. In fact, I know of companies, such as Tesco, Asda and Sainsbury's, that produce massive amounts of packaging that costs us over £400 per year, according to figures from National Federation of Women's Institutes Wales. Do you think that these large retail companies, the supermarkets, should be responsible for recycling their own packaging?

**The First Minister:** As far as I know, they will take the packaging back, if you take it back to them. They may be putting too much packaging on food in the first place in order to protect its integrity, as they see it. There may be better ways of protecting the integrity of that food and its freshness and so on. You sometimes feel that it is like trying to unravel the outer wrapping of the crown jewels, in order to get at a little container of orange juice. We all know that some excessive packaging is used.

As regards the earlier point that you made about the tonnage that is going to landfill sites, there is a moving target on this and we are increasing rapidly the percentage of waste that is recycled. I think that it has gone from 7 per cent to 20 per cent in the last four years, but it needs to reach 40 per cent by 2010 and then you will certainly see the landfill percentage going down.

**Brynle Williams:** The Welsh Assembly Government has made a commitment in its environment strategy to generate energy from waste when it cannot practically be recycled. This is particularly relevant to organic agriculture waste, such as manure and, although it is a distasteful subject, the waste from abattoirs, which release significant amounts of methane and other greenhouse

rhedeg gan Ymddiriedolaeth Amgylchedd Cymru. Mae cyllid a chymorth ar gael gan y Cynulliad hefyd drwy'r rhaglen nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol a'r rhaglen cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol.

**Mick Bates:** Mae hynny'n swnio'n galonogol i ryw raddau, ond mae maint y gwastraff, y person, sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi yng Nghymru wedi codi y llynedd. Felly, nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r holl gamau gweithredu hynny'n cael effaith gadarnhaol. Yn wir, gwn am gwmnïau megis Tesco, Asda a Sainsbury's, sy'n cynhyrchu meintiau enfawr o ddeunydd pecynnu sy'n costio dros £400 y flwyddyn inni, yn ôl ffigurau gan Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliad y Merched yng Nghymru. A ydych chi'n credu y dylai'r cwmnïau adwerthu mawr hyn, yr archfarchnadoedd, fod yn gyfrifol am ailgylchu eu deunydd pecynnu eu hunain?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hyd y gwn i, byddant yn cymryd y deunydd pecynnu'n ôl, os byddwch yn ei ddychwelyd iddynt. Efallai eu bod yn defnyddio gormod o ddeunydd pecynnu gyda'u bwyd yn y lle cyntaf er mwyn ei ddiogelu, yn ôl eu barn hwy. Efallai fod gwell ffyrdd o ddiogelu'r bwyd hwnnw a'i ffresni ac ati. Weithiau yr ydych yn teimlo ei fod fel ceisio datod deunydd lapio allanol gemau'r goron, er mwyn cyrraedd cynhwysydd bychan o sudd oren. Gwyddom i gyd fod gormod o ddeunydd pecynnu'n cael ei ddefnyddio.

O ran y pwynt cynharach a wnaethoch ynglŷn â faint o dunelli sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi, mae targed symudol ynghlwm wrth hyn ac yr ydym yn prysur gynyddu canran y gwastraff sy'n cael ei ailgylchu. Credaf ei fod wedi mynd o 7 y cant i 20 y cant yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf ond mae angen iddo gyrraedd 40 y cant erbyn 2010 ac wedyn yn sicr fe welwch y canran tirlenwi yn gostwng.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo yn ei strategaeth ar gyfer yr amgylchedd i gynhyrchu ynni o wastraff pan nad yw'n ymarferol ei ailgylchu. Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol i wastraff amaethyddol organig, megis tail ac, er ei fod yn fater annymunol, y gwastraff o ladd-dai, sy'n rhyddhau meintiau sylweddol o fethan a nwyon tŷ gwydr eraill.

gases. What support are you giving to businesses involved in energy recovery from such waste and how do you plan to improve it in the future?

**The First Minister:** There are technological issues involved in some of those questions that are well beyond my competence, Brynle. We are aware of some small examples of power stations that run on chicken manure and so on; there are none in Wales, but they certainly exist in England. We are also aware of the potential of producing gas, rather than electricity, from forms of composting and we are certainly interested in seeing bio-gas power stations emerge from the energy review—more details will be given about that in the House of Commons when Alistair Darling, the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, makes his statement in 45 minutes. There is a lot more potential for recovering energy from waste, including farm waste. It is regarded as sustainable and, therefore, it will earn European Union emission trading system carbon credits and I think that that is the right way forward, as it is a sustainable source of energy.

**Janet Davies:** Mick Bates has already mentioned the increased amount of waste going into landfill sites. We have a target to recycle 40 per cent of waste by 2010, but we lack the capacity to do so. Therefore, it appears that a certain amount of the waste will have to be sent to developing countries. There is a report that says that we need 50 regional facilities in the UK—say, two or three in Wales—and the measures that you have taken do not appear to have achieved this. How will you make these measures more effective or are there any other measures that you are proposing to take?

**The First Minister:** We are on track to achieving the 40 per cent target, having trebled the percentage of waste being recycled during the past four years, but some authorities are still stuck at around the 10 per cent mark, although they are extending, for example, the green bag schemes in their areas. I am confident that there is a commitment in local government to reach the

Pa gefnogaeth yr ydych yn ei rhoi i fusnesau sy'n gysylltiedig ag adfer ynni o wastraff o'r fath a sut yr ydych chi'n bwriadu gwella hyn yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae materion technolegol ynghlwm wrth rai o'r cwestiynau hynny sydd ymhell y tu hwnt i fy ngallu, Brynle. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o rai enghreifftiau bychan o orsafoedd pŵer sy'n rhedeg ar dail cywion ieir ac ati; nid oes yr un yng Nghymru, ond yn sicr maent ar gael yn Lloegr. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymwybodol o botensial cynhyrchu nwy, yn hytrach na thrydan, o fathau o gompostio ac yn sicr mae gennym ddiddordeb mewn gweld gorsafoedd pŵer bio-nwy yn deillio o'r adolygiad ynni—ceir mwy o fanylion am hynny yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin pan fydd Alistair Darling, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant, yn gwneud ei ddatganiad mewn 45 munud. Mae llawer mwy o botensial ar gyfer adfer ynni o wastraff, gan gynnwys gwastraff fferm. Mae'n cael ei ystyried yn gynaliadwy ac, felly, bydd yn ennill credydau carbon drwy system masnachu gollyngiadau nwyon llosg yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a chredaf mai dyna'r ffordd ymlaen, gan ei fod yn ffynhonnell ynni gynaliadwy.

**Janet Davies:** Mae Mick Bates eisoes wedi crybwyll y cynnydd ym maint y gwastraff sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae gennym darged i ailgylchu 40 y cant o wastraff erbyn 2010, ond nid yw'r gallu gennym i wneud hynny. Felly, ymddengys y bydd yn rhaid anfon rhywfaint o wastraff i wledydd sy'n datblygu. Dywed un adroddiad fod angen 50 o gyfleusterau rhanbarthol arnom yn y DU—dyweder, dau neu dri yng Nghymru—ac ymddengys nad yw'r mesurau a gymerwyd gennych chi wedi cyflawni hyn. Sut y byddwch yn gwneud y mesurau hyn yn fwy effeithiol neu a ydych chi'n bwriadu cymryd mesurau eraill?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym ar ein ffordd i gyrraedd y targed o 40 y cant, ar ôl treblu canran y gwastraff sy'n cael ei ailgylchu yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, ond mae rhai awdurdodau yn dal o gwmpas y ffigur o 10 y cant, er eu bod yn ymestyn, er enghraifft, y cynlluniau bagiau gwyrdd yn eu hardaloedd. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod ymrwymiad ymhlith llywodraeth leol i

40 per cent target.

On what you said about the recycling taking place in other countries, there are some strange wrinkles going on here. I understand that part of it is to do with the ballast trade. As China sends so many more manufactured goods to Europe and the UK than we send to China and that it is dangerous for ships to take containers back empty, with no weight in them, plastics are frequently taken back as ballast to be reprocessed in China. Whether that is sustainable or whether we should be thinking about recycling those plastics in the UK, I am not sure. However, if you did that, you would have to use another cargo as ballast.

gyrraedd y targed o 40 y cant.

Ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh am yr ailgylchu sy'n digwydd mewn gwledydd eraill, mae rhyw anawsterau bach rhyfedd yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Deallaf fod rhan ohono'n ymwneud â'r fasnach falast. Gan fod China'n anfon cymaint yn fwy o nwyddau wedi'u gweithgynhyrchu i'r DU nag a anfonir gennym ni i China a'i bod yn beryglus i longau ddychwelyd gyda chynwysyddion gwag, heb unrhyw bwysau ynddynt, yn aml mae plastig yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel balast i'w ailbroseu yn China. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw hynny'n gynaliadwy neu a ddylem fod yn meddwl am ailgylchu'r plastigau hynny yn y DU. Fodd bynnag, petaech yn gwneud hynny, byddai'n rhaid ichi ddefnyddio cargo arall fel balast.

### **Perthynas â Busnes Cymru Relations with Welsh Business**

**Q9 Lisa Francis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's relations with Welsh business? OAQ1752(FM)

**C9 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am berthynas Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru â busnes Cymru? OAQ1752(FM)

**The First Minister:** Our relationship with Welsh business is excellent. There is no better example of that than the certainty that businesses throughout west Wales and the Valleys now have that, for the coming seven and a half years, through to 1 January 2014, they will have access to the highest levels of regional selective assistance available anywhere in the UK or Europe.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein perthynas â busnes Cymru'n ardderchog. Nid oes enghraifft well o hynny na'r sicrwydd y bydd busnesau ar draws gorllewin Cymru, ac mae hynny gan y Cymoedd erbyn hyn, am y saith mlynedd a hanner nesaf, hyd at 1 Ionawr 2014, yn gallu cael gafael ar y lefelau uchaf o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol sydd ar gael yn y DU neu Ewrop.

2.50 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** Are you aware of a recent report by North Wales Tourism, in which it said that it is concerned by the potential estrangement of tourism businesses in the region from your Government's new tourism arm, Visit Wales? It claims that there were few signs that the process of isolating tourism businesses had changed under the new Welsh Assembly Government regime. In the interests of openness and transparency, First Minister, can you assure elected representatives such as me with a clear indication that we will be able to contact the head of Visit Wales, on behalf of our constituents, without first having to go

**Lisa Francis:** A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o adroddiad diweddar gan Dwristiaeth Gogledd Cymru, lle nodwyd eu bod yn poeni am y posibilrwydd bod busnesau twristiaeth yn y rhanbarth yn pellhau oddi wrth gangen dwristiaeth newydd eich Llywodraeth, Croeso Cymru? Honna mai ychydig o arwyddion a welwyd bod y broses o ynysu busnesau twristiaeth wedi newid dan drefn newydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Er budd tryloywder a bod yn agored, Brif Weinidog, a allwch chi sicrhau cynrychiolwyr etholedig, fel fi, gydag arwydd clir y byddwn yn gallu cysylltu â phennaeth Croeso Cymru, ar ran ein

through the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, as has been suggested? It is important that we can act swiftly and with certainty for our constituents. Can you give us that assurance?

**The First Minister:** You are confusing tourist enterprises wanting to make representations and backbenchers wanting to make representations directly to individual civil servants. I am not sure that there should be different rules for taking up tourism issues than for any other issues. The important thing is that we look at projects in tourism directly—there is the interesting White House Hotel project by Christopher Chown in Abersoch, and there are the marine projects in various parts of Wales, although we know of one local authority that is pretty well anti-marina. In many ways, that brings integration, so that, if you ask for tax-payer funded assistance under section 4 of the Development of Tourism Act 1969, or regional selective assistance, it all goes through the same channel, and it all goes through the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board and to the Minister. It is the Minister who is accountable for the decisions usually taken on the advice of WIDAB. It is a far more efficient system than we had before, because it means that £100,000 spent on a tourism grant is regarded in the same way as £100,000 spent on an industrial grant. That is absolutely right, and I am sure that you would agree with me.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan gyfeirio at fusnesau a rhaglen Amcan 1, un o'r cwynion cyson gan gwmnïau preifat oedd nad oeddent yn gallu cael gafael ar gymorth, ac yr oeddent yn aml yn troi cefn ar y rhaglen. Er hynny, un o'r cynlluniau mwyaf llwyddiannus oedd y rhaglen cymorth i fusnesau bach yng Ngwynedd. Buoch yn rhan o ddatllylu llwyddiant y rhaglen honno, a phrosiectau eraill yng Ngwynedd, yn y Faenol. A wnewch chi ystyried estyn y rhaglen arbennig honno i ardaloedd eraill o dan y rhaglen gydyfeirio newydd?

hetholwyr, heb yn gyntaf orfod mynd trwy'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, fel sydd wedi ei awgrymu? Mae'n bwysig y gallwn weithredu'n gyflym a chyda sicrwydd ar ran ein hetholwyr. A allwch chi roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw inni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn drysu rhwng y mentrau twristiaeth sydd am wneud sylwadau a'r meincwyr cefn sydd am wneud sylwadau'n uniongyrchol i weision sifil unigol. Nid wyf yn sicr a ddylid cael rheolau gwahanol ar gyfer ymdrin â materion twristiaeth nag ar gyfer unrhyw faterion eraill. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn edrych ar brosiectau mewn twristiaeth yn uniongyrchol—dyna ichi brosiect diddorol gwesty'r White House gan Christopher Chown yn Abersoch, a hefyd y prosiectau morol mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, er ein bod yn gwybod am un awdurdod lleol sy'n wrth-farina i bob pwrpas. Mewn sawl ffordd, mae hynny'n arwain at gyfuno, ac felly, os gofynnwch am gymorth a ariennir gan y trethdalwr dan adran 4 o Ddeddf Datblygu Twristiaeth 1969, neu am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, mae'r cyfan yn mynd drwy'r un sianel, ac mae'r cyfan yn mynd drwy Fwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru ac i'r Gweinidog. Y Gweinidog sy'n atebol am y penderfyniadau a gymerir fel arfer yn unol â chyngor Bwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru. Mae'n system llawer mwy effeithlon na'r un flaenorol, oherwydd mae'n golygu bod £100,000 a werir ar grant twristiaeth yn cael ei ystyried yn yr un ffordd â £100,000 a werir ar grant diwydiannol. Mae hynny'n gwbl wir, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno â mi.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Referring to businesses and the Objective 1 programme, one of the regular complaints from private companies was that they were not able to access assistance, and they would often turn their backs on the programme. However, one of the most successful programmes was Gwynedd's small businesses assistance programme. You took part in celebrations to mark the success of that programme, and other projects in Gwynedd, in the Faenol. Will you consider extending this particular programme to other areas under the new convergence programme?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs; yr ydym yn fodlon ystyried unrhyw raglen sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus lle bo'r angen yn parhau. Yr ydym am fod llawer mwy strategol a llawer llai biwrocraataidd o ran nifer y bobl sy'n gweinyddu'r rhaglenni hyn dros y saith mlynedd nesaf. Hyd yn oed wedyn, nid yw bod yn fwy strategol yn golygu na fyddwch yn hybu busnesau bach a chymedrol eu maint mewn ardaloedd fel Gwynedd.

**The First Minister:** Of course; we are happy to consider any programme that has been successful where the need for it persists. We want to be much more strategic and much less bureaucratic with regard to the number of people required to administer these programmes over the next seven years. Even then, being more strategic does not mean that you will not promote small and medium-sized businesses in such areas as Gwynedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10, OAQ1763(FM), has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 10, OAQ1763(FM), yn ôl.

### Datblygiad Economaidd Economic Development

**Q11 Janice Gregory:** Will the First Minister make a statement on economic development in the constituency of Ogmore? OAQ1750(FM)

**C11 Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiad economaidd yn etholaeth Ogwr? OAQ1750(FM)

**The First Minister:** 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' sets out our vision for economic development throughout Wales, and the department is working with Bridgend County Borough Council to regenerate Maesteg town centre and to strengthen the Garw valley community, as well as revitalise Bridgend town centre, all of which will cascade throughout the constituency of Ogmore, which is recovering well from the series of heavy blows that hit it with the loss of Sony, Christie Tyler Ltd and Smith Kendon Ltd last year.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffyfnu' yn nodi ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer datblygu economaidd ar draws Cymru, ac mae'r adran yn gweithio gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr i adfywio canol tref Maesteg ac i gryfhau cymuned cwm Garw, yn ogystal ag adfywio canol tref Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, gyda'r rhain i gyd yn rhaeadru drwy etholaeth Ogwr, sy'n gwella'n dda ar ôl cyfres o ergydion trwm yn sgil colli Sony, Christie Tyler Cyf a Smith Kendon Cyf y llynedd.

**Janice Gregory:** You mentioned Sony, as did I last week in questions. I had the pleasure of visiting the Sony factory last month, with Sir Harold Stringer, who talked about the fact that the workforce had become entrepreneurial virtually overnight. This, of course, is a wonderful turnaround—you mentioned job losses at Sony—for a factory that many thought, last year, was in its death throes. Do you agree that, to further encourage economic development, we need to engage with companies such as Sony more strategically to highlight the strengths of the Welsh workforce and the benefits of investing in Wales?

**Janice Gregory:** Crybwyllasoch Sony, fel y gwneuthum innau'r wythnos diwethaf yn y cwestiynau. Cefais y pleser o ymweld â ffatri Sony fis diwethaf, gyda Syr Harold Stringer, a siaradodd am y ffaith fod y gweithlu wedi troi'n entrepreneuriaidd dros nos bron. Mae hyn, wrth gwrs, yn dro gwych ar fyd—crybwyllasoch golli swyddi yn Sony—i ffatri a oedd ar ei gwely angau ym mam llawer y llynedd. A ydych yn cytuno, er mwyn hybu rhagor ar ddatblygu economaidd, bod angen inni gysylltu'n fwy strategol â chwmnïau fel Sony er mwyn amlygu cryfderau gweithlu Cymru a manteision buddsoddi yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** I agree: you have to have a balance between big inward investors like Sony, even though it has taken television

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno: mae'n rhaid ichi gael cydbwysedd rhwng buddsoddwyr mawr o'r tu allan megis Sony,



production away, but it has increased its commitment to professional film camera development and manufacture in Bridgend; that work used to be carried out in Florida. A balance needs to be struck between that and small companies such as TVonics, which is a spin-off from the research and development department of Sony, which is doing brilliantly in the Sony technium. We want half a dozen companies such as TVonics alongside Sony itself to produce a centre of expertise in very advanced consumer electronics.

**David Lloyd:** Un o'r pethau angenrheidiol i wella datblygiad economaidd yng nghwm Ogwr yw gwell darpariaeth trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a gwell ffyrdd o Felin Ifan Ddu hyd at Nant-y-moel. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych yn hynny o beth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i lywodraeth leol fyddai gwella'r ffyrdd, ond byddai'r system grant trafndiaeth ar gael pe bai cynllun yn dod ger bron adran Andrew Davies.

er ei fod wedi symud y gwaith o gynhyrchu setiau teledu oddi yma, ond mae wedi cynyddu ei ymrwymiad i gynhyrchu a datblygu camerâu ffilm proffesiynol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr; arferai'r gwaith hwnnw gael ei wneud yn Fflorida. Rhaid sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng hynny a chwmnïau bychan megis TVonics, a ddeilliodd o adran ymchwil a datblygu Sony, sy'n gwneud yn wych o fewn techniw Sony. Yr ydym am weld hanner dwsin o gwmnïau megis TVonics ochr yn ochr â Sony ei hun er mwyn creu canolfan ragoriaeth ym maes electroneg uwch i ddefnyddwyr.

**David Lloyd:** One element that is necessary in order to improve economic development in the Ogmere valley is better public transport provision and better roads from Blackmill to Nant-y-moel. What plans do you have in this regard?

**The First Minister:** Road improvements would be a matter for local government, but the transport grant system would be available if a scheme came before Andrew Davies's department.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

*The Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:*

*the Horses (Zootechnical Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2006.*

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have one change to report to this week's business. The Finance Minister will this afternoon make a statement on capital allocations. On the next three weeks' business, the draft business statement can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. Gofynnaf felly am sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Business Minister

*Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i bwyllgor pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig:*

*Rheoliadau Ceffylau (Safonau Söodechnegol) (Cymru) 2006*

**Y Gweinidog Busnes (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf un newid i'w gyhoeddi i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Y prynhawn yma bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwneud datganiad am ddyraniadau cyfalaf. Ynghylch busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, gellir gweld y datganiad busnes drafft ar We'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are not. I therefore ask for comments on the business statement.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog

for her statement. I will raise two issues. The first is the issue of adult neurosurgery in Swansea and south Wales in general. The proposal was made by Health Commission Wales last week that adult neurosurgery will now be centralised in Cardiff. This has caused an outcry in Swansea, not just in the medical and nursing fraternity, but also in general. The decision is viewed as a devastating blow not just for Swansea and Neath, but for the whole of mid and west Wales. I note the intention to have an oral statement when the next pieces of consultation have been undertaken, but to reflect the outcry and the strength of public feeling in Swansea and mid and west Wales, as we heard from Elin Jones, we need an urgent debate on the issue so that it gets a just airing. We consider the loss of adult neurosurgery in Swansea, on top of the loss of paediatric neurosurgery a couple of years ago, to be a devastating blow. It undermines Swansea's role as a regional centre of excellence, and it possibly undermines the future of other regional specialties that we have—reviews are also being undertaken of the burns and plastics unit. We also have a new clinical medical school. This is an issue of supreme importance in medical terms to Swansea and also to patients in mid and west Wales. It touches upon travelling times, access, the lack of a suitable ambulance service, as we have heard, and the failure in the Health Commission Wales report to consider the presence of Bristol. This has led to the centralising of two out of three neurosurgery units to cover south Wales. In choosing Bristol and Cardiff, instead of Bristol and Swansea, for example, we are doing a supreme disservice to the patients of mid and west Wales. I urge that this flawed document is cast out and that a reappraisal be undertaken urgently of the whole situation by the Minister for Health and Social Services. I also urge that a general debate on the issue be held in Plenary as a matter of urgency.

My second point is on a statement about police mergers. We have heard recently that there may be an intention to scrap the

Busnes am ei datganiad. Codaf ddau fater. Y cyntaf yw mater niwrolawfeddygaeth oedolion yn Abertawe a de Cymru'n gyffredinol. Gwnaethpwyd y cynnig gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf sef y bydd niwrolawfeddygaeth yn cael ei chanoli bellach yng Nghaerdydd. Mae hyn wedi codi nyth cacwn yn Abertawe, nid dim ond ymysg y frawdoliaeth feddygol a nyrzio, ond hefyd yn gyffredinol. Teimlir bod y penderfyniad yn ergyd ddychrynlyd nid dim ond i Abertawe a Chastell-nedd, ond i ganolbarth a gorllewin Cymru i gyd. Nodaf y bwriad i gael datganiad llafar pan fydd darnau nesaf yr ymgynghoriad wedi cael eu cynnal, ond er mwyn adlewyrchu'r protest a chryfder teimpladau'r cyhoedd yn Abertawe a chanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru, fel y clywsom gan Elin Jones, mae angen cael dadl frys ar y mater fel ei fod yn cael ei wyntyllu'n deg. Yr ydym yn ystyried bod colli niwrolawfeddygaeth oedolion yn Abertawe, ar ben colli niwrolawfeddygaeth bediatrig ryw ddwy flynedd yn ôl, yn ergyd ddychrynlyd. Mae'n tanseilio rôl Abertawe fel canolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol, ac efallai ei fod yn tanseilio dyfodol meysydd arbenigol rhanbarthol eraill sydd gennym—mae adolygiadau'n cael eu cynnal hefyd o'r uned losgiadau a phlastigau. Mae gennym hefyd ysgol feddygol glinigol newydd. Mae hwn yn fater o bwysigrwydd enfawr yn nhermau meddygol i Abertawe a hefyd i gleifion yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Mae'n cyffwrdd ag amseroedd teithio, mynediad, diffyg gwasanaeth ambiwlans addas, fel y clywsom, a'r methiant yn adroddiad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru i ystyried presenoldeb Bryste. Mae hyn wedi arwain at ganoli dwy allan o dair uned niwrolawfeddygaeth ar gyfer de Cymru. Wrth ddewis Bryste a Chaerdydd, yn hytrach na Bryste ac Abertawe, er enghraifft, yr ydym yn gwneud cam enfawr â chleifion canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Erfyniaf arnoch i roi'r ddogfen hon heibio a bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cynnal ailwerthusiad fel mater o frys o'r sefyllfa gyfan. Gofynnaf hefyd am ddadl gyffredinol ar y mater yn y Cyfarfod Llawn fel mater o frys.

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â datganiad am uno heddluoedd. Clywsom yn ddiweddar fod bwriad o bosibl i roi'r gorau i'r uno.

mergers. I note from the business statement that there is an intention to provide a statement—as there always is on the part of Edwina Hart whenever there are any imminent changes—but are there any imminent statements on the issue of whether police mergers, after recent consultations, may be scrapped?

**Lisa Francis:** I reiterate the requests made by Dr Dai Lloyd about a debate on neurosurgery. We are grateful to the Business Minister for agreeing to bring forward a debate on Communities First in the autumn, especially as the programme is still a long way from producing the regeneration outcomes that form part of its aim.

3.00 p.m.

In relation to our request for a statement on police mergers, we understand that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has said that she will make a statement to the Assembly if and when the Home Secretary announces any revised proposals. There are reports today saying that the Home Secretary is going to make a statement tomorrow. In the light of that, can we expect a statement from Mrs Hart tomorrow at any time? Perhaps you could give us an indication of that when you respond.

Finally, we look forward to the statement tomorrow on the energy review.

**Peter Black:** I endorse everything that Dai Lloyd said about the neurosurgery issue. The recommendation that is being consulted on is deeply flawed. In being drawn up, it does not take into account the presence of Bristol, and it has underestimated the impact of removing this unit on Morrison Hospital. We need to have a rethink and perhaps stop this consultation altogether. We need to have a debate on the issue and perhaps restart it on the basis of a proper evaluation. I urge the Minister to schedule that debate at the earliest possible moment.

On the reported plans to cut 1,200 Assembly jobs that have been reported in the press today, I note that, in her response to business managers, the Minister says that she does not

Sylwaf o'r datganiad busnes fod bwriad i ddarparu datganiad—fel y mae Edwina Hart yn ei wneud bob amser bryd bynnag y mae newidiadau yn yr arfaeth—ond a oes unrhyw ddatganiadau yn yr arfaeth ynghylch a fydd uno'r heddluoedd, ar ôl ymgynghoriadau diweddar, yn cael ei anghofio?

**Lisa Francis:** Ailadroddaf y ceisiadau a wnaethpwyd gan Dr Dai Lloyd ynglŷn â chael dadl am niwrolawfeddygaeth. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog Busnes am gytuno i roi dadl ar Gymunedau yn Gyntaf yn yr hydref, yn enwedig gan fod y rhaglen yn dal ymhell o sicrhau'r canlyniadau adfywio sy'n rhan o'i nod.

Yng nghyswllt ein cais am ddatganiad am uno heddluoedd, deallwn fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi dweud y bydd yn gwneud datganiad ger bron y Cynulliad os a phan y cyhoedda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref unrhyw gynigion diwygiedig. Mae adroddiadau heddiw yn dweud bod yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn mynd i wneud datganiad yfory. Yn wyneb hynny, a allwn ddisgwyl datganiad gan Mrs Hart yfory ar ryw adeg? Efallai y gallech ddweud hynny wrthym pan fyddwch yn ymateb.

Yn olaf, edrychwn ymlaen at y datganiad yfory am yr adolygiad ynni.

**Peter Black:** Cefnogaf bopeth a ddywedodd Dai Lloyd am niwrolawdriniaeth. Mae'r argymhelliad sy'n destun ymgynghori yn hynod o ddiffygiol. Wrth gael ei lunio, nid yw'n cymryd i ystyriaeth bresenoldeb Bryste, ac nid yw wedi gwerthfawrogi cymaint o effaith y bydd cael gwared â'r uned hon yn ei chael ar Ysbyty Treforys. Mae angen inni ailfeddwl a rhoi'r gorau efallai i'r ymgynghoriad hwn yn gyfan gwbl. Mae angen inni gael dadl ar y mater hwn ac ailddechrau arno efallai ar sail gwerthusiad iawn. Anogaf y Gweinidog i drefnu'r ddadl honno cyn gynted byth â phosibl.

O ran y cynlluniau i dorri 1,200 o swyddi yn y Cynulliad y cafwyd adroddiadau amdanynt yn y wasg heddiw, nodaf fod y Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb i drefnyddion, yn dweud nad

intend to schedule time for a press story based on a leaked document, and yet it is there in black and white that there are plans to cut 20 per cent of the Welsh Assembly Government's workforce over a period of five years. If it is not true that you intend to make these cuts, will you categorically say so in the Chamber today? If you are not prepared to give that categorical assurance, will you schedule a statement at the earliest possible moment so that we can question the relevant Minister on this?

**Carl Sargeant:** We welcome the business statement, and it is great that the Plaid-Tory coalition also welcomes it. This would be an opportunity, Minister, to have a statement on the energy review, as many businesses in north Wales are affected by energy issues, particularly in my constituency and that of my colleague, Sandy Mewies, of Flintshire.

Another point for a statement is the mapping of the assisted areas that the Department of Trade and Industry released this week. I welcome the initial mapping stages, which include Flintshire in the programme.

I share the point made by colleagues regarding the police mergers, and a statement from the Minister would be welcome, as my colleagues, particularly those from north Wales, have said, in terms of there being no changes if there is no money. We would welcome a statement from Edwina Hart, the Minister, as and when this information comes through.

I would like an update on the position regarding Iceland Foods Ltd in my constituency of Flintshire. I am very concerned about the activities surrounding the job issues in the company. I am even more concerned that it appears, from its website today, that it is advertising for drivers in Warrington, and yet neither the unions nor the workforce are aware of any changes that are afoot in terms of contractual arrangements.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Thank you for supporting the business statement, as we come to the end of this term, in relative

yw'n bwriadu trefnu amser ar gyfer stori yn y wasg a seiliwyd ar ddogfen a ddatgelwyd heb awdurdod, ond eto i gyd mae yno mewn du a gwyn fod cynlluniau i dorri 20 y cant oddi ar weithlu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd. Os nad yw'n wir eich bod yn bwriadu gwneud y toriadau hyn, a wnewch ddweud hynny'n bendant yn y Siambr heddiw? Os nad ydych yn barod i roi'r sicrwydd pendant hwnnw, a wnewch drefnu datganiad cyn gynted byth ag sy'n bosibl er mwyn inni gael holi'r Gweinidog perthnasol am hyn?

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawn y datganiad busnes, ac mae'n wych fod clymblaid Plaid-y Ceidwadwyr hefyd yn ei groesawu. Byddai hwn yn gyfle, Weinidog, i gael datganiad am yr adolygiad ynni, gan fod materion ynni yn effeithio ar lawer o fusnesau yn y Gogledd, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i ac yn etholaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, Sandy Mewies, o sir y Fflint.

Pwynt arall i gael datganiad arno yw mapio'r ardaloedd a gynorthwyir a ryddhawyd gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yr wythnos hon. Croesawaf y camau mapio cychwynnol, sy'n cynnwys sir y Fflint yn y rhaglen.

Rhannaf y pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan gyd-Aelodau am uno'r heddluoedd, a byddwn yn croesawu datganiad gan y Gweinidog, fel y mae fy nghyd-Aelodau, yn enwedig y rhai o'r Gogledd, wedi dweud, i'r perwyl na cheir newidiadau os nad oes arian i'w gael. Byddem yn croesawu datganiad gan Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog, fel a phan y daw'r wybodaeth hon i law.

Hoffwn gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Iceland Foods Ltd yn fy etholaeth i yn sir y Fflint. Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn am y gweithgareddau'n ymwneud â materion swyddi yn y cwmni. Yr wyf hyd yn oed yn fwy pryderus ei bod yn ymddangos, o'i wefan heddiw, ei fod yn hysbysebu am yrwyr yn Warrington, ond nid yw'r undebau na'r gweithlu yn ymwybodol o unrhyw newidiadau sydd ar droed o safbwynt trefniadau contract.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Diolch ichi am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes, wrth inni ddod at ddiwedd y tymor hwn, mewn hwyliau

good humour, judging from the responses that have come forward. I appreciate that opposition spokespeople and business managers take the opportunity with the business statement to raise issues that particularly concern them, and that is fair enough. However, we have to recognise that, in terms of the adult neurosurgery services, a decision has yet to be made. This is a time of consultation. It is important—the First Minister said this in response to his questions—that everybody in the community, namely all the stakeholders, partners and professionals, have the opportunity to contribute, and I have promised that we will have an oral statement when the decisions have been finalised.

In terms of Swansea, the £50 million life sciences institute and the Labour Welsh Assembly Government's important and pioneering decision to open a clinical school in Swansea is what you should be concerned about in terms of taking things forward, although, in terms of people's views, it is fair enough to put them on the record.

To address the points raised by Lisa, Peter, Dai and, my friend, Carl, the police mergers clearly rise to the top of the agenda, and, as you know, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration will come straight to the Chamber, if we are still here, to make an announcement on the police mergers. You have had that confirmation.

On Peter's point on the stories in the *Western Mail*, it would be a full-time job to rebut some of the claims in those stories. However, I will make clear that the key point, as the First Minister said, is that we do not recognise the figures associated with these alleged staffing cuts. We are at the start of the budget round and, as part of that, we need open and honest discussions with our trade union colleagues and others. We share the goals for making the best use of public money and delivering better services for the people in Wales, which will be addressed in the statement on the Beecham review.

On Carl's and Lisa's points, the energy

cymharol dda, a barnu o'r ymatebion a gafwyd. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod llefarwyr a threfnyddion y gwrthbleidiau yn achub ar y cyfle gyda'r datganiad busnes i godi materion sy'n peri pryder neilltuol iddynt, ac mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod, o safbwynt gwasanaethau niwrolawdriniaeth i oedolion, nad oes penderfyniad wedi cael ei wneud eto. Cyfnod o ymgynghori yw hwn. Mae'n bwysig—dywedodd y Prif Weinidog hyn mewn ymateb i'w gwestiynau ef—fod pawb yn y gymuned, sef yr holl randdeiliaid, partneriaid a gweithwyr proffesiynol, yn cael y cyfle i gyfrannu, ac yr wyf wedi addo y cawn ddatganiad llafar pan fydd y penderfyniadau wedi dod i'w gwedd derfynol.

O ran Abertawe, y sefydliad gwyddorau bywyd gwerth £50 miliwn a phenderfyniad pwysig ac arloesol Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru i agor ysgol glinigol yn Abertawe yw'r hyn y dylech fod yn ymboeni yn ei gylch o ran symud pethau ymlaen, er ei bod, o ran barn pobl, yn ddigon teg gwneud yn siŵr bod eu barn yn cael ei chofnodi.

I ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Lisa, Peter, Dai a'm ffrind, Carl, mae uno'r heddluoedd yn amlwg yn dod i frig yr agenda, ac, fel y gwyddoch, bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn dod yn syth i'r Siambr, os ydym yn dal yma, i wneud cyhoeddiad am uno'r heddluoedd. Yr ydych wedi cael y cadarnhad hwnnw.

O ran pwynt Peter am y straeon yn y *Western Mail*, byddai'n swydd amser llawn gwrth-ddweud rhai o'r honiadau yn y straeon hynny. Fodd bynnag, fe'i gwnef yn glir mai'r pwynt allweddol, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, yw nad ydym yn adnabod y ffigurau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r toriadau staffio honedig hyn. Yr ydym ar ddechrau cylch y gyllideb ac, fel rhan o hynny, mae angen trafodaethau agored a gonest arnom gyda'n cydweithwyr yn yr undebau llafur ac eraill. Yr ydym yn rhannu'r amcanion o wneud y defnydd gorau o arian cyhoeddus a darparu gwell gwasanaethau i bobl yng Nghymru, ac eir i'r afael â hynny yn y datganiad am adolygiad Beecham.

O ran pwyntiau Carl a Lisa, mae'r adolygiad

review is important, and the Minister will present a written statement on that tomorrow. There will be ample opportunity next term to take that further. Indeed, in terms of Carl standing up for Flintshire, as usual, outlining the opportunities afforded by the selective assistance announcement, and voicing his concerns about Iceland, that has given us a good way to finish what has been a robust business statement, which has been supported by Members across the whole Assembly today.

ynni yn bwysig, a bydd y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno datganiad ysgrifenedig am hynny yfory. Bydd digonedd o gyfle y tymor nesaf i ymdrin ymhellach â hynny. Yn wir, wrth i Carl bleidio achos sir y Fflint, fel arfer, gan amlinellu'r cyfleoedd a ddaw yn sgil y cyhoeddiad am gymorth dewisol, a lleisio ei bryderon am Iceland, mae hynny wedi rhoi ffordd dda inni o orffen yr hyn a fu'n ddatganiad busnes cryf, sydd wedi cael ei gefnogi gan Aelodau ar draws y Cynulliad cyfan heddiw.

### **Datganiad am Adolygiad Beecham Statement on the Beecham Review**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I wish to formally draw the attention of Members to the publication yesterday of 'Beyond Boundaries'. This is the report of the review of local service delivery, which the Welsh Assembly Government commissioned last year as part of taking forward our commitments in 'Making the Connections' on public service reform.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Aelodau'n ffurfiol at adroddiad 'Ar Draws Ffiniau', a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Dyma'r adroddiad am yr adolygiad i'r ffordd y cyflenwir gwasanaethau lleol, a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y llynedd fel rhan o fwrw ymlaen â'n hymrwymiaid yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' i ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

The review had wide terms of reference, because we wanted an authoritative assessment of what needed to be done to drive public service improvement at the local level. I was especially delighted that we were able to attract Sir Jeremy Beecham, Dame Gillian Morgan and Sir Adrian Webb; this was a review team of the highest quality and experience, and its report reflects this. During the last 10 months, the team met over 300 people during its hectic programme. It also conducted its own research. The result is a rich and well-grounded analysis of the issues. I pay warm tribute to the team, to Professor Steve Martin as their academic adviser, and to the team's secretariat.

Yr oedd cylch gorchwyl yr adolygiad yn un eang, oherwydd yr oeddem am gael asesiad awdurdodol o'r hyn y mae angen ei wneud i yrru gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau lleol ar y lefel leol. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch inni lwyddo i ddenu Syr Jeremy Beecham, y Fonesig Gillian Morgan a Syr Adrian Webb; yr oedd hwn yn dîm adolygu o'r safon a'r profiad gorau, ac mae ei adroddiad yn adlewyrchu hyn. Dros y 10 mis diwethaf, mae'r tîm wedi cwrdd â thros 300 o bobl yn ystod ei raglen brysur. Cynhaliodd ei ymchwil ei hun hefyd. Y canlyniad yw dadansoddiad cyfoethog o'r materion dan sylw, a hynny ar seiliau cadarn. Talaf deyrnged gynnes i'r tîm, i'r Athro Steve Martin fel eu cynghorydd academiaidd, ac i ysgrifenyddiaeth y tîm.

The report endorses our approach in 'Making the Connections' in particular, but urges us to be ambitious for a bold and challenging transformation of public services. This report underlines the extent and nature of the change needed if Wales is to do complete justice to that agenda.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cymeradwyo ein dull gweithredu yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn arbennig, ond mae'n ein hannog i fod yn uchelgeisiol o blaid trawsnewidiad eofn a heriol yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn tanlinellu maint a natur y newid sy'n ofynnol os yw Cymru i wneud cyfiawnder llwyr â'r agenda honno.

The review team believes that there is real opportunity for Wales to become an international exemplar for how small countries deliver public services. They were clear that a major re-organisation of structures would be a distraction from dealing with some of the fundamental barriers to achieving this. The priority is to get to grips with the issues and make the existing system work much better for the twenty-first century. Among other things, transforming the system means: major improvements in systems and the capacity of the workforce with an investment in skills; making the voice of the citizen count more as part of making services much more accessible, responsive and accountable; reducing bureaucracy in the system; managing performance better; providing better public information about performance and improving scrutiny arrangements; pioneering new cross-sector local partnership action contracts to deliver much better joining-up; and stronger collaboration wherever it will deliver efficiency and improved service delivery.

Those are consistent with 'Making the Connections'. The message is that we are on the right track, but that we need to progress further and faster. We published our five-year action plan, 'Delivering the Connections', in June 2005, and we are now at the end of that first year. The public service in Wales is responding with real commitment, as the following highlights show. Exciting and innovative approaches are emerging on regional and local collaborative working, which have the potential to be transformational. For example, last month I announced some 30 projects covering all sectors linked to efficiency and service improvement. We only have to look at the work on special educational needs, the Heads of the Valleys or commissioning services for looked-after children to see the practical benefits that collaboration offers. However, to be fair to Sir Jeremy, I stress that this is not a cosy option.

3.10 p.m.

Public Services Management Wales is now

Cred y tîm adolygu fod cyfle gwirioneddol i Gymru ddod yn esiampl ryngwladol o sut y gall gwledydd bach ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr oeddynt yn glir y byddai ad-drefnu mawr ar y strwythurau yn tynnu'r sylw oddi wrth ddelio â rhai o'r rhwystrau sylfaenol rhag cyflawni hyn. Y flaenoriaeth yw mynd i'r afael â'r materion a gwneud i'r system bresennol weithio'n llawer gwell yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Ymysg pethau eraill, mae trawsnewid y system yn golygu: gwelliannau mawr mewn systemau ac yng ngallu'r gweithlu gan fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau; gwneud i lais y dinesydd gyfrif mwy fel rhan o wneud gwasanaethau'n fwy hygyrch, ymatebol ac atebol; lleihau biwrocraiaeth yn y system; rheoli perfformiad yn well; darparu gwell gwybodaeth gyhoeddus am berfformiad a gwella'r trefniadau craffu; sefydlu contractau newydd, traws-sector, arloesol i weithredu drwy bartneriaethau lleol er mwyn cydgysylltu gwasanaethau'n llawer gwell; a chydweithredu cryfach lle bynnag y bydd hynny'n arwain at effeithlonrwydd a chyflenwi gwasanaethau'n well.

Mae'r rheini'n gyson â 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Y neges yw ein bod ar y trywydd iawn, ond mae angen inni fynd ymhellach ac yn gyflymach. Cyhoeddasom ein cynllun gweithredu pum mlynedd, 'Cyflawni'r Cysylltiadau', ym mis Mehefin 2005, ac yr ydym ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn gyntaf honno erbyn hyn. Mae'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ymateb gydag ymrwymiad gwirioneddol, fel y dengys yr uchafbwyntiau canlynol. Mae dulliau gweithredu cyffrous ac arloesol yn dod i'r amlwg o ran cydweithredu rhanbarthol a lleol, ac mae iddynt y potensial i drawsnewid. Er enghraifft, y mis diwethaf cyhoeddais ryw 30 o brosiectau yn cwmpasu pob sector yn ymwneud ag effeithlonrwydd a gwella gwasanaethau. Nid oes angen inni edrych ond ar y gwaith ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, Blaenau'r Cymoedd neu gomisiynu gwasanaethau i blant sy'n derbyn gofal i weld y manteision ymarferol a ddaw drwy gydweithredu. Fodd bynnag, i fod yn deg â Syr Jeremy, pwysleisiaf nad yw hwn yn opsiwn cysurus.

Mae Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus

fully mobilised and delivers ambitious programmes to develop the public service leaders of today and tomorrow. Across the public service, 2,500 staff are expected to benefit by 2006–07. I know that the First Minister mentioned this in his questions, but, two weeks ago, the first ever Welsh—and, I think, the first ever UK—public services summer school was held in Bangor, which was a success. It was attended by 230 members of staff and managers from across the public service, who will form the next generation of leaders. We are about to consult on the first ever public-service-wide customer service policy and implementation, to consider how we can put customers first.

Members would not expect me to give a detailed response at this stage on such a major report, only 24 hours after its publication. However, the message that I can give today is that we accept the thrust of the Beecham recommendations and the need to go faster and further with our reforms. Although we do not rule out the possibility of local structural change where a case is strong, we agree that the priority needs to be making the existing system work better, and not major reorganisation. Building on ‘Making the Connections’, I intend to publish a further paper on public service reform in the early autumn, which will give our full response to the review and will set out the next steps in our programme. There will be a linked series of related policy documents on specific topics over coming months, including local government, social services, regulation, inspection and e-government. Together, these will provide a detailed vision for the next stage of the transformation of public services.

I stress that the report urges Assembly Members to lead a mature, informed and constructive debate about the future of our services—I am always the optimist. I am willing to engage in that debate with the other parties in shaping the content of the strategy. I share the team’s optimism that we

Cymru yn llwyr weithredol erbyn hyn ac mae’n rhoi rhaglenni uchelgeisiol ar waith i ddatblygu arweinwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus heddiw ac yfory. Ar draws y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, disgwylir i 2,500 o staff elwa erbyn 2006–07. Gwn i’r Prif Weinidog sôn am hyn yn ei gwestiynau ef, ond, bythefnos yn ôl, cynhaliwyd yr ysgol haf gyntaf erioed yng Nghymru—ac, mi gredaf, y gyntaf erioed yn y DU—i’r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ym Mangor, ac yr oedd yn llwyddiant. Daeth 230 o aelodau staff a rheolwyr o bob rhan o’r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus iddi, a hwy fydd y genhedlaeth nesaf o arweinwyr. Yr ydym ar fin ymgynghori am y polisi gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid cyntaf erioed i’r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus drwyddo draw, ac am sut i’w roi ar waith, i ystyried sut y gallwn roi cwsmeriaid yn gyntaf.

Ni fyddai’r Aelodau’n disgwyl imi roi ymateb manwl ar hyn o bryd ar adroddiad mor bwysig, 24 awr yn unig ar ôl iddo gael ei gyhoeddi. Fodd bynnag, y neges y gallaf ei rhoi heddiw yw ein bod yn derbyn byrdwn argymhellion Beecham a’r angen i symud yn gyflymach ac ymhellach gyda’n diwygiadau. Er nad ydym yn diystyru’r posibilrwydd o newid strwythurol lleol lle ceir achos cryf, yr ydym yn cytuno mai’r flaenoriaeth yw gwneud i’r system bresennol weithio’n well, nid cynnal ad-drefnu mawr. Gan adeiladu ar ‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’, yr wyf yn bwriadu cyhoeddi papur arall am ddiwygio’r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn gynnar yn yr hydref, a fydd yn rhoi ein hymateb llawn i’r adolygiad ac yn nodi’r camau nesaf yn ein rhaglen. Ceir cyfres gysylltiedig o ddogfennau polisi cysylltiol ar bynciau penodol dros y misoedd i ddod, yn cynnwys llywodraeth leol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, rheoleiddio, arolygu ac e-lywodraeth. Gyda’i gilydd, bydd y rhain yn darparu gweledigaeth fanwl ar gyfer y cam nesaf yn nhrawsnewidiad y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus

Pwysleisiaf fod yr adroddiad yn annog Aelodau Cynulliad i gynnal dadl aeddfed, adeiladol, ar sail gwybodaeth am ddyfodol ein gwasanaethau—yr wyf bob amser yn optimist. Yr wyf yn barod i weithio ar y ddadl honno gyda’r pleidiau eraill i lunio cynnwys y strategaeth. Rhannaf optimistiaeth



have the potential in Wales to achieve something special. I hope that all sides can sign up to the challenge and the ambition.

Finally, I wish to give my sincere thanks to Sir Jeremy and his team and those who supported them. It was a real pleasure yesterday, for those of us who were there, to listen to what they had to say at the launch in Cwmaman, which went extremely well.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for her statement, and I reiterate the thanks to Sir Jeremy Beecham and his review group for what is an excellent report. We are talking about a review of local service delivery, which is not just about local government, but about health bodies, the police and the voluntary sector. It is a comprehensive review, with a view to improving standards, streamlining delivery, working together across county boundaries in a number of public services, trying to reduce the complexities of public service delivery, and, above all, changing the culture of delivering public services.

During the launch yesterday at Cwmaman Institute, which was an excellent location for such a launch, it was said that the review could have gone two ways in terms of improving the standards of public services. It could have gone the way of increasing marketisation—privatisation, if you like—or it could have gone for public sector renewal. Thankfully, from my point of view, it has gone for public sector renewal. That renewal is not actually in terms of restructuring because, as the Minister has outlined, that would merely be a distraction. There have been several restructurings in the public sector in recent years. Therefore, it is not about changing the structures, but about the bigger challenge of changing behaviour, changing the culture of working together, ensuring true regional planning, and reducing those complexities of delivering services across county boundaries.

There are a few examples of that, which were mentioned yesterday, and again today by the Minister. I will highlight one from the voluntary sector, which is the Wales Neuromuscular Network, whose

y tîm fod gennym y potensial yng Nghymru i gyflawni rhywbeth arbennig. Gobeithiaf y gall pob ochr ymrwymo i'r her a'r uchelgais.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch yn ddiawyll i Syr Jeremy a'i dîm a'r rhai a fu'n eu cynorthwyo. Yr oedd yn bleser gwirioneddol ddoe, i'r rhai ohonom a oedd yno, i wrando ar yr hyn oedd ganddynt i'w ddweud yn y lansiad yng Nghwmaman, a aeth yn arbennig o dda.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, ac ategaf y diolch i Syr Jeremy Beecham a'i grŵp adolygu am yr hyn sy'n adroddiad rhagorol. Yr ydym yn siarad am adolygu'r ffordd y cyflenwir gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, sy'n golygu nid dim ond llywodraeth leol, ond cyrff iechyd, yr heddlu a'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'n adolygiad cynhwysfawr, gyda'r nod o wella safonau, symleiddio'r cyflenwi, cydweithio ar draws ffiniau'r siroedd mewn nifer o wasanaethau cyhoeddus, ceisio gwneud y ffordd y cyflenwir gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn llai cymhleth, ac, uwchlaw popeth, newid diwylliant cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Yn ystod y lansiad ddoe yn Institiwt Cwmaman, a oedd yn lleoliad rhagorol ar gyfer lansiad o'r fath, dywedwyd y gallai'r adolygiad fod wedi mynd i ddau gyfeiriad o ran gwella safonau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Gallai fod wedi mynd ar drywydd cynyddu marchnadeiddio—preifateiddio, os mynnwch chi—neu gallai fod wedi ffafrio adnewyddu'r sector cyhoeddus. Diolch byth, o'm safbwynt i, ei fod wedi ffafrio adnewyddu'r sector cyhoeddus. Nid yw'r adnewyddu hwn ar ffurf ad-drefnu oherwydd, fel yr amlinellodd y Gweinidog, ni fyddai hynny ond wedi tynnu sylw oddi wrth y nod. Cafwyd sawl ad-drefnu yn y sector cyhoeddus dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Felly, nid mater o newid y strwythur mohono, ond yr her fwy o newid ymddygiad, newid y diwylliant er cydweithio, sicrhau cynllunio rhanbarthol gwirioneddol, a lleihau cymhlethodau cyflenwi gwasanaethau ar draws ffiniau sirol.

Mae ychydig o enghreifftiau o hynny, a grybwyllwyd ddoe, ac eto heddiw gan y Gweinidog. Tynnaf sylw at un o'r sector gwirfoddol, sef Rhwydwaith Niwro-gyhyrol Cymru, y mae ei gynrychiolwyr yma heddiw.

representatives are here today. They deliver a service across trusts and local health board boundaries, which works well. The neuromuscular network could obviously do with funding, and it requires funding for its continued operation, but it can work wonderfully well across county boundaries. Those kind of things are happening now, but much more is needed, and it is a challenge for local government and all other bodies to deliver that change in working cultures.

There are, therefore, just two issues for the Minister to respond to today, though I appreciate that it is just 24 hours after the event in Cwmaman, and that the detailed Government response will come later. Many challenges are issued from this body to local government and various health bodies, but there is also a challenge for us, as politicians—and I heard the bit about a mature debate, so I will see whether I can respond maturely to the Minister—in terms of how politics, Government, and local government in Wales works, with open scrutiny of performance. Yesterday, we heard Sir Jeremy say again that improved scrutiny improves performance, and that very good scrutiny leads to very good governance. However, you can have very good scrutiny only if you have a free and open exchange of information at the same level available to all. That means the Government, the opposition, and, where appropriate, other sectors such as the voluntary sector, and that is why it will be such a huge challenge.

Sir Jeremy specifically mentioned improved impartial scrutiny—so no whips. Presumably, he would also echo my call for the chairs of local government scrutiny committees to come from opposition parties. If we are talking about improved scrutiny predicating the improved delivery of service, we are talking about a real challenge to the way in which political parties work in transferring information openly between one and another—the Government and the opposition. That is why it is a huge challenge to cultures of behaviour. That is what is in this document; it is about open, improved scrutiny. Presumably, the Minister will agree with me in the mature and open way that we are conducting this debate, that we can,

Mae'n darparu gwasanaeth ar draws ffiniau ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol, sy'n gweithio'n dda. Yn amlwg, byddai'n dda gan y rhwydwaith niwro-gyhyrol gael cyllid, ac mae angen cyllid arno i barhau i weithredu, ond mae'n gallu gweithio'n rhagorol ar draws ffiniau sirol. Mae'r mathau hynny o bethau'n digwydd yn awr, ond mae angen llawer rhagor, ac mae'n her i lywodraeth leol a phob corff arall wireddu'r newid hwnnw mewn diwylliannau gweithio.

Felly, dau fater yn unig sydd i'r Gweinidog ymateb iddynt heddiw, er fy mod yn sylweddoli mai dim ond 24 awr sydd wedi mynd heibio ers y digwyddiad yng Nghwmaman, ac y daw ymateb manwl gan y Llywodraeth yn ddiweddarach. Mae'r corff hwn yn gosod sawl her i lywodraeth leol ac i amrywiol gyrff ym maes iechyd, ond mae her i ninnau hefyd, fel gwleidyddion—a chlywais y sylw am ddadl aeddfed, felly fe geisiaf weld a allaf ymateb yn aeddfed i'r Gweinidog—o ran sut mae gwleidyddiaeth, Llywodraeth a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'n gweithio, gyda chraffu agored ar berfformiad. Ddoe, clywsom Syr Jeremy'n dweud eto bod gwell craffu'n gwella perfformiad a bod craffu da iawn yn arwain at lywodraethu da iawn. Fodd bynnag, dim ond os cewch gyfnewid gwybodaeth yn rhydd ac agored a'i bod ar gael ar yr un lefel i bawb y gallwch gael craffu da. Golyga hynny'r Llywodraeth, yr wrthblaid, a, lle bo hynny'n briodol, sectorau eraill megis y sector gwirfoddol, a dyna paham y bydd yn her mor anferth.

Soniodd Syr Jeremy'n benodol am well craffu diduedd—felly dim chwipiau. Yr wyf yn tybio y byddai hefyd yn adleisio fy nghais ar i gadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu llywodraeth leol ddod o blith y gwrthbleidiau. Os ydym yn sôn am well craffu er mwyn gwella'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau, yr ydym yn sôn am her go iawn yn y ffordd y mae pleidiau gwleidyddol yn gweithio o ran trosglwyddo gwybodaeth yn agored rhwng ei gilydd—y Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid. Dyna pam ei bod yn her mor anferth i ddiwylliannau ymddygiad. Dyna beth sydd yn y ddogfen hon; mae a wnelo â chraffu agored, gwell. Yr wyf yn tybio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi yn y ffordd aeddfed ac agored yr ydym yn cynnal

maturely and openly, improve scrutiny in the Assembly, particularly after 2007. Committees will change, but what happens to scrutiny? We need that open scrutiny. Ministers will no longer be members of committees. There is a special challenge for us to scrutinise Government decisions and for Government—as was said by Sir Adrian Webb and others yesterday—to redesign the machinery of government. There is a big challenge here. It is no use politicians just standing up and saying ‘This is a big challenge for our local authorities, our local trusts, and for everyone else’; actually, it is a big challenge for this place to govern this small country better. That is my main thrust: how is the Minister thinking about responding to that agenda at this early stage?

My second point concerns the finance of all this. In the earlier meeting yesterday in Llandrindod Wells, the Minister will have discovered the funding gap required to deliver services in Wales. The WLGA report commissioned by PricewaterhouseCoopers identified a gap of more than £4 billion in the funding of essential public services such as housing, school buildings, waste and all the rest of it. That is a huge and significant challenge. That funding gap is more than the entire budget for the local government portfolio. Sir Jeremy Beecham talked yesterday about pooled budgets and the need to simplify funding lines, but, in some cases, pooled budgets really mean pooled deficits, and it is difficult to work in partnership under extreme financial hardship.

The big point was made of the need to simplify funding streams, and to simplify the plethora of ways in which voluntary sector bodies are funded—in terms of specific grants, project moneys, and the different timings of different projects. The Beecham review board felt that the fragmented way in which many sectors delivering public services are funded was fundamentally undermining what they are trying to do. In view of that, in the early stages, how will the Minister tackle not the funding gap in one fell swoop, but the issue of needing to simplify the various funding streams so that the business of bidding for funding itself does

y ddadl hon, y gallwn, yn aeddfed ac yn agored, wella'r drefn graffu yn y Cynulliad, yn enwedig ar ôl 2007. Bydd Pwyllgorau'n newid, ond beth fydd yn digwydd i'r craffu? Rhaid i ni gael y craffu agored hwnnw. Ni fydd Gweinidogion yn aelodau o bwyllgorau rhagor. Bydd yn her arbennig inni graffu ar benderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth ac i'r Llywodraeth—fel y dywedodd Syr Adrian Webb a phobl eraill ddoe—i ailgynllunio peirianwaith llywodraeth. Mae hon yn her fawr. Ni thâl i wleidyddion sefyll ar eu traed a dweud ‘Dyma her fawr i'n hawdurdodau lleol, i'n hymddiriedolaethau lleol ac i bawb arall’; a dweud y gwir, mae'n her fawr i'r lle hwn lywodraethu'r wlad fach hon yn well. Dyna fy mhrif fyrddwn: sut mae'r Gweinidog yn meddwl ymateb i'r agenda honno ar ddechrau'r daith fel hyn?

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â chyllido hyn oll. Yn y cyfarfod cynharach ddoe yn Llandrindod, canfu'r Gweinidog y bwlch cyllido sydd ei angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Canfu adroddiad CLILC a gomisiynwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers fwllch o fwy na £4 biliwn yng nghyllid gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hanfodol megis tai, adeiladau ysgolion, gwastraff a'r gweddill i gyd. Mae honno'n her anferth a sylweddol. Mae'r bwlch cyllido hwnnw yn fwy na chyllideb gyfan y portffolio llywodraeth leol. Soniodd Syr Jeremy Beecham ddoe am Gronni Cyllidebau a'r ffaith fod angen symleiddio llinellau cyllido, ond, dan rai amgylchiadau, gwir ystyr cronni cyllidebau yw cronni diffygion, ac mae'n anodd gweithio mewn partneriaeth lle ceir caledi ariannol dybryd.

Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt pwysig ynghylch yr angen i symleiddio ffrydiau cyllido a symleiddio'r llu o wahanol ffyrdd y cyllidir cyrff y sector gwirfoddol—o ran grantiau penodol, arian prosiect a gwahanol amseriadau gwahanol brosiectau. Teimlai bwrdd adolygiad Beecham fod y ffordd ddarniog y mae llawer o sectorau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cael eu cyllido'n tansilio'n sylfaenol yr hyn y maent yn ceisio'i wneud. Gyda hynny mewn golwg, yn ystod y camau cychwynnol, sut y bydd y Gweinidog nid yn gymaint yn mynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido ag un ddyrnod, ond yn mynd i'r afael â'r ffaith fod angen

not undermine the delivery of public services?

In conclusion, we look forward to the Beecham review delivering what it promises, and we look down the line to governments in Wales—whoever governs after 2007—being improved as a result. Diolch yn fawr.

3.20 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I commend you for being there, because, like Ann and others who were there, you heard exactly what he said. You have just thrown everything into the kitchen sink, I think; that was your tour de force on every single grievance that you have, but it was quite interesting, really. The report talks about simplifying funding streams, and I agree with that absolutely. As Finance Minister, I think that it is a good idea. However, I will check with my colleague, Ann, who was also there, but I do not recall him going on about the funding gap. I think that you are mixing up two meetings. That was the meeting in the morning. I think that Jeremy, Adrian and Gillian were strong; they did not say that this is an issue of putting in massive funding, though I am not saying that funding is not needed. The whole thrust of this, as you rightly said at the beginning, is about culture, ‘the c word’, and behaviour, and not, if you will excuse the term, ‘the f word’—funding. However, we need to concentrate on that, and that is where I do agree with you. They were absolutely clear that this will be a big challenge. It is not the cosy option and it is not a cosy zone, so no-one should be under any illusions here. We have not chosen the easy option.

There are things that we can start working on, such as simplifying the funding streams that we already have. Many other things need to be done if we are to go in for pooled budgets, because they need to be on the same timescale and they need to be compatible and so forth. Therefore, there are some nitty-gritty issues that need to be sorted out.

On improving scrutiny and the issue of local authority scrutiny chairs, I will resist going

symleiddio'r gwahanol ffrydiau cyllido fel nad yw busnes gwneud cais am gyllid ynddo'i hun yn taseilio'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

I gloi, edrychwn ymlaen at weld adolygiad Beecham yn gwireddu ei addewidion, ac edrychwn tua'r dyfodol at well llywodraethau yng Nghymru—pwy bynnag fydd yn llywodraethu ar ôl 2007—yn sgil hynny. Diolch yn fawr.

**Sue Essex:** Fe'ch cymeradwyaf am fod yno, oherwydd, fel Ann a phobl eraill a oedd yno, clywsoch ei union eiriau. Credaf eich bod newydd daflu popeth i'r sinc, dyna eich tour de force gyda phob cwyn sydd gennych, ond yr oedd yn eithaf diddorol, a dweud y gwir. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am symleiddio ffrydiau cyllido, a chytunaf i'r carn â hynny. Fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, credaf ei fod yn syniad da. Fodd bynnag, holaf fy nghydweithwraig, Ann, a oedd yno hefyd, ond ni chofiaf iddo sôn llawer am y bwch cyllido. Credaf eich bod yn drysu rhwng dau gyfarfod. Cyfarfod y bore oedd hwnnw. Credaf fod Jeremy, Adrian a Gillian yn gadarn; ni ddywedasant mai mater o ddarparu arian mawr yw hyn, er nad wyf yn dweud nad oes angen arian. Holl fyrdwn hyn, fel y dywedasochoch ar y dechrau, yw diwylliant, y 'gair sy'n dechrau gyda'r llythyren d' ac ymddygiad, ac nid, os esgusodwch chi'r term 'y gair sy'n dechrau gydag c'—cyllid. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar hynny, ac yn y fan hon y byddwn i'n cytuno â chi. Yr oeddent yn gwbl glir y bydd hyn yn her fawr. Nid y dewis hawdd mohono ac nid hawddfyd mohono ychwaith, felly ni ddylai neb dwyllo'i hun yma. Nid ydym wedi gwneud y dewis hawdd.

Mae ambell beth y gallwn ddechrau gweithio arno, megis symleiddio'r ffynonellau cyllid sydd gennym eisoes. Rhaid gwneud llawer o bethau eraill os dewiswn ni gronni cyllidebau, oherwydd rhaid iddynt ddilyn yr un amserlen a bod yn gydnaws â'i gilydd ac yn y blaen. Felly, bydd angen mynd i'r afael â'r glo mân.

O ran gwella'r craffu a mater cadeiryddion craffu awdurdodau lleol, ni chaf fy hudo ar

down the parrot-in-the-cage route on that because, to be blunt, the recommendation was that there should be party-political balance, as we have here. Therefore, there will be occasions when the chair of the scrutiny committee is from the ruling party, and I do not think that that is the overall issue; it is about how we get a real culture of being honest and diligent about performance. To me, that will be the big breakthrough. I think that you can do that right across the parties, because Beecham is trying to turn the whole agenda around by saying that this is about people first. The structures, funding and all the rest of it is to support the delivery of services to people.

I am glad that you mentioned the Wales Neuromuscular Network, and I am pleased that you sponsored it. I went and spoke to some of my constituents there, and they gave a simple, practical example of how the system was not working like that. I will not go into detail, but these people, who need considerable support and help, were put in at the back of the queue, as it were, and the process was not working for them. Therefore, there are some pertinent illustrations right across the piece where we need to change that culture and say that it is the people—either individually, within family groups, or in communities—who have to come first, and services must be designed for them. That is a really big change in culture, behaviour and attitude, which is at the root of this challenge.

**David Melding:** I also thank Sir Jeremy Beecham and his team. I apologise that I was not able to attend yesterday's function due to a more pressing one here in the Assembly, but 'Beyond Boundaries' will be regarded as a seminal report. It is certainly challenging for us all, not just the Government. It is an excellent, ambitious vision that wants public services to be at the centre of life and what it is to be a citizen. I completely agree with that vision and that Wales ought to set itself the ambition of leading smaller countries in delivering first-class public services.

Sir Jeremy Beecham says that we need to go

hyd llwybr y parot mewn cawell yn hynny o beth oherwydd, a siarad yn gwbl blaen, yr argymhelliad oedd y dylid cael cydbwysedd rhwng y pleidiau gwleidyddol, fel sydd gennym yma. Felly, ar brydiau, bydd cadeirydd y pwyllgor craffu'n perthyn i'r blaidd sydd mewn grym, ac ni chredaf mai dyna'r prif beth sydd dan sylw yma; mater o gael diwylliant sy'n onest ac yn ddiwyd ynghylch perfformiad ydyw. I mi, hynny fydd y newid mawr. Credaf y gallwch wneud hynny ar draws y pleidiau i gyd, oherwydd bod Beecham yn ceisio troi'r agenda gyfan ar ei phen drwy ddweud mai mater o roi pobl yn gyntaf yw hyn. Pwrpas y strwythurau, y cyllido a'r gweddill i gyd yw cefnogi darparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl.

Rwy'n falch iawn eich bod wedi sôn am Rwydwaith Niwrogyhyrol Cymru, ac yn falch eich bod wedi'i noddi. Euthum i siarad â rhai o'm hetholwyr yno, a chlywais am enghraifft syml, ymarferol o fethiant y system yn hynny o beth. Nid wyf am fanylu, ond rhoddwyd y bobl hyn, pobl sydd ag angen cryn gefnogaeth a chymorth, yng nghefn y ciw, fel petai, ac nid oedd y broses yn gweithio iddynt. Felly, ceir darluniau perthnasol ym mhob man sy'n dangos bod angen newid y diwylliant a dweud mai'r bobl—naill ai fel unigolion, o fewn grwpiau teulu, neu mewn cymunedau—sy'n gorfod dod gyntaf, a bod rhaid cynllunio gwasanaethau ar eu cyfer. Mae hynny'n newid gwirioneddol fawr o ran diwylliant, ymddygiad ac agwedd, a hynny sydd wrth wraidd yr her hon.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn diolch i Syr Jeremy Beecham a'i dîm. Ymddiheuraf na allwn fod yn bresennol yn y digwyddiad ddoe gan fod gennyf ddigwyddiad pwysicach yma yn y Cynulliad, ond ystyrir 'Ar Draws Ffiniau' yn adroddiad arloesol. Mae'n sicr yn gosod her i bob un ohonom, nid dim ond y Llywodraeth. Mae'n weledigaeth ardderchog, uchelgeisiol sydd am weld gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wrth galon bywyd a'r hyn y mae'n ei olygu i fod yn ddinesydd. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r weledigaeth honno ac y dylai arwain gwledydd llai i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o'r radd flaenaf fod yn uchelgais i Gymru.

Dywed Syr Jeremy Beecham fod angen inni

further and faster. However, I do not think that this is a cosy report; in a subtle way, it is quite critical of many things that are done at present. That is not just against this Government; it is also against aspects of the health service and local government, as well as performance from many years ago, no doubt. I think that we need to meet some of the key issues that are raised. The first issue that I want to mention is that data and key performance measures have to be improved. I have made the point several times in the Chamber that social services data are often weak, and you cannot really manage, scrutinise, and be confident that you are improving services unless you have effective data, which the public can also understand, and which people can be held to account on.

I would like a response—perhaps not now, as it is only 24 hours since it was published—on the recommendation that, presumably, the First Minister, or, indeed, the Finance Minister, makes an annual statement on public service performance. That would be a useful debate to have annually.

Dai Lloyd made the point on improving scrutiny, and I shall not develop his points, but I will say that, in order to scrutinise effectively, you need support and training. In the Assembly, that means training for Assembly Members on how to look at and track a budget and legislation, and all sorts of things, but also at local government level. I hope that the start that has been made at the WLGA—as well as at the Assembly Government, in fairness—to improve scrutiny, training and performance in local government goes on, but also that we do it ourselves in the Assembly.

I commend the call for a mixed economy in delivering public services. It is not about privatising services; private companies, voluntary bodies, and, of course, the state sector can all deliver public services. There is no problem with that—we do not need to construct lots of ideological walls to prevent that mixed economy. The joint reviews often pointed to the fact that councils had not succeeded well in creating a mixed economy

fynd ymhellach ac yn gynt. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod hwn yn adroddiad cysurus; mewn ffordd gynnil, mae'n eithaf beirniadol o nifer o bethau a wneir ar hyn o bryd. Nid dim ond yn erbyn y Llywodraeth hon y mae hynny; mae hefyd yn erbyn agweddau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd a llywodraeth leol, yn ogystal â pherfformiad o nifer o flynyddoedd yn ôl, yn ddiau. Credaf fod angen i ni ddiwallu rhai o'r prif faterion a godir. Y mater cyntaf y carwn ei grybwyll yw bod yn rhaid gwella mesurau perfformiad allweddol a data. Yr wyf wedi codi'r pwynt hwn sawl tro yn y Siambr, bod data gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn aml yn wan, ac na allwch reoli, craffu na themlo'n hyderus eich bod yn gwella gwasanaethau oni bai fod gennych ddata effeithiol, y gall y cyhoedd ei ddeall hefyd, ac y gellir dal pobl i gyfrif yn ei gylch.

Hoffwn ymateb—nid yn awr efallai, gan mai dim ond 24 awr sydd wedi mynd hebio ers ei gyhoeddi—ar yr argymhelliad i'r Prif Weinidog yn ôl pob tebyg, neu, yn wir, y Gweinidog Cyllid, roi datganiad blynyddol ar berfformiad gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Byddai honno'n ddadl flynyddol ddefnyddiol.

Gwnaeth Dai Lloyd y pwynt am wella craffu, ac ni ddatblygaf ei bwyntiau, ond dywedaf, er mwyn craffu'n effeithiol, fod angen cefnogaeth a hyfforddiant arnoch. Yn y Cynulliad, mae hynny'n golygu hyfforddiant ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynghylch sut i edrych ar gyllideb a deddfwriaeth a'u holrhain, a phob math o bethau, ond hefyd ar lefel llywodraeth leol. Gobeithiaf fod camau cyntaf CLILC—ynghyd â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fod yn deg—i wella craffu, hyfforddiant a pherfformiad mewn llywodraeth leol yn parhau, ond ein bod hefyd yn gwneud hyn ein hunain yn y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn canmol yr alwad am economi gymysg o ran darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â phreifatiddio gwasanaethau; gall cwmnïau preifat, cyrff gwirfoddol, ac, wrth gwrs, sector y wladwriaeth, un ac oll, ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid oes problem gyda hynny—nid oes angen inni godi nifer o waliau ideolegol i rwystro'r economi gymysg honno. Roedd yr adolygiadau ar y cyd yn aml

for care.

The call for pooled sovereignty as a model for joint working is pushing us, and saying, 'Look, the voluntary approach is not working well, or at least not fast enough'. We will have to look at this, as well as at more regional services, which should be on our agenda.

There were one or two really quite surprising things, such as whether we should experiment with different models, such as care trusts. That has been on the agenda in England, though I do not think that it has seriously been a runner in the Assembly; it is only my own party that has ever raised it as an issue, but perhaps we should look at that in more detail.

Finally, I agree that standards should be broad rather than extremely detailed, and we need to allow earned autonomy in the response to local need, which means that you can deliver a broad standard, but if you are told to deliver too many small targets, local flexibility is lost. However, we must remember that some areas of public services, such as children's services, are still in need of considerable improvement, and any inspection regime will have to be much more rigorous for much longer, until we are confident that the general service levels are high enough.

**Sue Essex:** There is much there that I would agree with. As you say, David, you have just made a preliminary canter through the recommendations.

If you had been there, and I understand your reasons for not, you would have heard Sir Jeremy's reasons for congratulating the Welsh Assembly Government on its courage of leadership in doing this—I always cringe when I hear the word 'courage', as I can hear the *Yes Minister* connotations coming in. However, I believe that it was genuine, because we could have just sat back and carried on with 'Making the Connections'. We believe in 'Making the Connections', but we knew that we needed some extra help and

yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad oedd cynghorau wedi llwyddo'n dda i greu economi gymysg ar gyfer gofal.

Mae galw am sofraniaeth wedi'i chronni fel model ar gyfer cydweithio yn ein gwthio, ac yn dweud, 'Edrychwch, nid yw'r dull gwirfoddol yn gweithio'n dda, neu o leiaf yn ddigon cyflym'. Bydd yn rhaid inni edrych ar hyn, yn ogystal ag ar wasanaethau mwy rhanbarthol, a ddylai fod ar ein hagenda.

Ceir ambell beth a'm synnodd, megis a ddylem arbrofi gyda modelau gwahanol, fel ymddiriedolaethau gofal. Bu hynny ar yr agenda yn Lloegr, er nad wyf yn credu iddo gael ei ystyried yn ddifrifol yn y Cynulliad; dim ond fy mhlaid i sydd wedi codi hyn fel mater perthnasol erioed, ond efallai y dylem edrych yn fanylach ar hynny.

Yn olaf, cytunaf y dylai safonau fod yn eang yn hytrach nag yn arbennig o fanwl, ac mae angen i ni ganiatáu ymreolaeth wedi'i hennill yn yr ymateb i angen lleol, sy'n golygu y gallwch ddarparu safon eang, ond os dywedir wrthyhch ddarparu gormod o dargedau bach, collir hyblygrwydd lleol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio bod rhai meysydd mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel gwasanaethau plant, dal angen cael eu gwella'n sylweddol, a bydd yn rhaid i unrhyw drefn ymchwilio fod yn llawer mwy cadarn am gyfnod hwy o lawer, nes y byddwn yn hyderus bod y lefelau gwasanaethau cyffredinol yn ddigon uchel.

**Sue Essex:** Byddwn yn cytuno â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedasoch. Fel y dywedwch, David, yr ydych wedi rhoi carlam cyntaf drwy'r argymhellion.

Petaech wedi bod yno, a deallaf eich rhesymau dros beidio â bod yno, byddech wedi clywed rhesymau Syr Jeremy dros longyfarch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ei dewrder a'i harweinyddiaeth am wneud hyn—byddaf bob amser yn gwingo wrth glywed y gair 'dewrder', gan ei fod yn fy atgoffa o *Yes Minister*. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod hynny'n wir, oherwydd byddem wedi gallu eistedd yn ôl a bwrw ymlaen â 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Credwn yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', ond gwyddem fod angen

advice to really make it count and bite, and that is what the report does.

It is also interesting because it requires us to show leadership; that has been demonstrated by commissioning the report, and, undoubtedly, there will already have been leadership from us through Value Wales and Public Service Management Wales. We are starting to put in the key contributors and catalysts for change. However, the recommendations are interesting, because they are across the piece. He fervently believes, as do Gill and Adrian, that we can do it here in the Assembly, but it will be challenging. I know that there is a parting of views, which I said post the presentation—we all put our party political hats on when it is necessary. However, if we are truly putting people first, there are things in this agenda on which we can all unite, and, where we can unite, we must do so, and show leadership across the piece; we must also show an example to others.

3.30 p.m.

Your points about support and training for people doing the job are also critical. It is good timing that we are looking at the role of elected members because this will give them more of a focus. However, people need to be able to train to do this job—it does not come naturally to everyone; in fact, it comes naturally to very few people because it is very different from the job that people perhaps expect to do as elected politicians, either centrally or locally. People will not thank us if we shirk that; we must give people the tools to do the job. I absolutely agree with your last point on children's services. There are times when a light touch is appropriate with regard to regulation and inspection, as the Welsh Local Government Association said, and I commend the WLGA because it has supported this commission from the beginning. A light touch is appropriate once you have learned so much, but in some areas and for people who are particularly vulnerable, we need to be absolutely sure, and you are right to say that is where the regulation and inspection must be as protective as possible.

rhywfaint o gymorth a chyngor ychwanegol arnom i wneud iddo gael gwir ddylanwad, a dyna'r hyn a wna'r adroddiad.

Mae hefyd yn ddiddorol gan ei fod yn gofyn inni ddangos arweinyddiaeth; dangoswyd hynny drwy gomisiynu'r adroddiad, ac, yn ddiau, ceid arweinyddiaeth gennym drwy Gwerth Cymru a Rheoli yng Ngwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru. Yr ydym yn dechrau rhoi'r cyfranwyr a'r catalyddion allweddol ar gyfer newid ar waith. Fodd bynnag, mae'r argymhellion yn ddiddorol oherwydd eu bod yn gyffredinol. Cred yn gryf, fel y gwna Gill ac Adrian, y gallwn wneud hyn yma yn y Cynulliad, ond bydd yn anodd. Gwn nad yw pawb o'r un farn, fel y dywedais ar ôl y cyflwyniad—byddwn i gyd yn gwisgo het ein plaid wleidyddol pan fydd angen. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn rhoi pobl yn gyntaf o ddifrif, ceir pethau yn yr agenda hon y gallwn oll fod yn unfrydol yn eu cylch, a, phan fo modd inni fod yn unfrydol, rhaid inni wneud hynny, a dangos arweinyddiaeth yn gyffredinol; rhaid inni hefyd ddangos enghraifft i eraill.

Mae eich pwyntiau ynghylch cefnogaeth a hyfforddiant i'r bobl sy'n gwneud y gwaith hefyd yn hollbwysig. Mae'n amseru da ein bod yn edrych ar swyddogaeth aelodau etholedig oherwydd bydd hyn yn rhoi mwy o ffocws iddynt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i bobl allu hyfforddi i wneud y gwaith hwn—ni ddaw'n naturiol i bawb; yn wir, i ychydig iawn o bobl y daw'n naturiol oherwydd y mae'n wahanol iawn i'r gwaith y mae pobl yn disgwyl ei wneud fel gwleidyddion etholedig, boed hynny'n ganolog neu'n lleol. Ni fydd pobl yn diolch inni os byddwn yn osgoi hynny; rhaid inni roi i bobl y cyfryngau i wneud y gwaith. Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr gyda'ch pwynt diwethaf am wasanaethau plant. Mae adegau pan fydd cyffyrddiad ysgafn yn briodol o safbwynt rheoleiddio ac arolygu, fel y dywedodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a chanmolaf CLILC oherwydd ei bod wedi cefnogi'r comisiwn hwn o'r dechrau. Mae cyffyrddiad ysgafn yn briodol unwaith yr ydych wedi dysgu rhyw gymaint, ond mewn rhai meysydd ac i bobl sy'n hynod o agored i niwed, rhaid inni fod yn gwbl sicr, ac yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud mai dyma



ymhle y mae'n rhaid i'r rheoleiddio a'r arolygu fod mor warchodol â phosibl.

**Michael German:** When Ieuan Wyn Jones and I met Sir Jeremy yesterday and were given our copy of the report, so that we could go through it prior to its launch, I turned, as one always does with reports of this kind, to the recommendations and Sir Jeremy said, 'It's not that sort of report', and goodness me, was he right. It is not that sort of report. In most reports you would expect to see a series of concrete actions and for it to state, 'This is what you must do if you want to make this real change, and we recommend that you take these very concrete actions' This is, if you like, a philosophical report about the nature of public services throughout our country and the sorts of changes that need to be made to make those public services work more effectively. It is a reflective piece, and you do not normally get that in reports of this sort. I pay tribute to Sir Jeremy and his team for not taking the obvious route of simply writing down a series of structural changes that need to be made.

**Michael German:** Pan gyfarfu Ieuan Wyn Jones a minnau gyda Syr Jeremy ddoe a phan gawsom ein copi o'r adroddiad, fel y gallem fwrw golwg arno cyn iddo gael ei lansio, cyfeiriais, fel y gwna rhywun bob amser gydag adroddiadau o'r math hwn, at yr argymhellion a dywedodd Syr Jeremy, 'Nid dyna'r math o adroddiad ydyw', ac yn wir ichi, yr oedd yn iawn. Nid dyna'r math o adroddiad ydyw. Yn y rhan fwyaf o adroddiadau buasech yn disgwyl gweld cyfres o weithredoedd concriid ac y byddai'n nodi, 'Dyma y mae'n rhaid ichi ei wneud os ydych eisiau gwneud y newid gwirioneddol hwn, ac argymhellwn eich bod yn cyflawni'r gweithredoedd concriid hyn'. Mae hwn, os dymunwch, yn adroddiad athronyddol am natur gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled ein gwlad a'r mathau o newidiadau y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud i wneud i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hyn weithio yn fwy effeithiol. Darn myfyriol ydyw ac ni chewch hyn fel arfer mewn adroddiadau o'r math hwn. Talaf deyrnged i Syr Jeremy a'i dîm am beidio â chymryd y llwybr amlwg a dim ond ysgrifennu cyfres o newidiadau strwythurol y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud.

I want to raise four points with the Minister. I do not intend to go into the detail, because that is to come. I believe that there are, genuinely, issues to come. The first point has already been partially raised, in its being mentioned that there are lessons for us all. However, as we know, those who make the policies, strategies and determinations are elected to do so and have the power to do so and the funding flows from that. So, it is pretty obvious to me that when, for example, Andrew Davies makes a decision and signs off a dossier, it is from his budget that the funding should come for that. When Sue signs something off for local government, the money for that should come from her budget, and that is because the money follows the people who have the right to make the determination. One of the key issues that is touched upon here, and which is at the heart of all this, is that if you are going to make changes, those changes must occur across the whole of the structure. They must occur in Cabinet, and all the issues of whether we

Yr wyf eisiau codi pedwar pwynt gyda'r Gweinidog. Ni fwriadaf fynd i fanylder, oherwydd bod hyn i ddod. Credaf fod, yn wirioneddol, broblemau i ddod. Codwyd y pwynt cyntaf eisoes yn rhannol, o ran y crybwyllwyd y ceir gwersi inni oll. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddom, mae'r rhai hynny sy'n gwneud y polisiau, y strategaethau a'r penderfyniadau yn cael eu hethol i wneud hynny ac mae ganddynt y pŵer i wneud hynny ac mae'r cyllid yn llifo o hynny. Felly, mae'n eithaf amlwg imi pan fydd Andrew Davies, er enghraifft, yn gwneud penderfyniad ac yn cymeradwyo coflen, y dylai'r cyllid ar gyfer hyn ddod oddi wrth ei gyllideb ef. Pan fydd Sue yn cymeradwyo rhywbeth ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, dylai'r arian ar gyfer hynny ddod oddi wrth ei chyllideb hi, a'r rheswm am hyn yw oherwydd bod yr arian yn dilyn y bobl sydd â'r hawl i wneud y penderfyniad. Un o'r materion allweddol y cyffyrddir arno yma, ac sydd wrth wraidd hyn oll, yw os ydych yn mynd i wneud newidiadau, bod yn rhaid i'r

should have portfolios in the way that we do, whether we should have broader areas with cross-cutting themes at ministerial and Government level, whether we should have committees of that kind here, how we should scrutinise those judgments and how we should work, are thrust into this discussion. I am sure that the Committee on Standing Orders will have to reflect upon that when it looks at what we will do post 2007, because that has an interest and an implication for all of us. However, the key issue, and I would like to test the Minister's opinion on this, is that there must be a lead and change from the top, at Cabinet level, as well as in the National Assembly. I would hope that you would agree with that.

On the second point, I welcome the report's moving away from what London Labour has done with regard to the choice and competition agenda. The report states that participation and finding common routes to local determination is the way forward for us in Wales. Effectively, I take that as non-conformity. Essentially, it is saying that we should have local determination wherever possible. That is devolution at work and that should happen, but the consequence of that is a diversity of provision. It does not mean that you will find in Bangor the same as you have in Barry; it does not mean that you will have in Caernarfon the same as in Cardiff in terms of the provision of services. Finding that balance between what you have as uniform services and what you have as local services is a key issue in this whole agenda. If you have a citizen-focused process, that may well result in a different range of options and alternatives in different areas of Wales, and the Welsh Liberal Democrats would welcome that. The third key area that I would like to ask the Minister about is performance measuring. Clearly, if you count the beans as you count the beans now, and measure the beans that are counted in one area against those counted in another, you will have no solution whatsoever to how you measure performance, when those things that you are bean-counting in area A are quite different from the solutions proposed for area B. If you have a diverse society in Wales, you will

newidiadau hynny ddigwydd ar draws yr holl strwythur. Rhaid iddynt ddigwydd yn y Cabinet, ac mae'r holl ystyriaethau ynghylch a ddylem gael portffolios yn y modd y'u cawn, a ddylem gael meysydd ehangach gyda themâu trawsbynciol ar lefel Weinidogol ac ar lefel y Llywodraeth, a ddylem gael pwyllgorau o'r math hwn, sut y dylem graffu ar y dyfarniadau hyn a sut y dylem weithio, yn cael eu bwrw i mewn i'r drafodaeth hon. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog bwysu a mesur hyn pan fydd yn edrych ar yr hyn a wnawn ar ôl 2007, oherwydd bod gan hyn ddi-ddordeb a goblygiadau inni oll. Fodd bynnag, y mater allweddol, a hoffwn brofi barn y Gweinidog am hyn, yw bod yn rhaid cael arweiniad a newid o'r brig, ar lefel y Cabinet, yn ogystal ag yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Buaswn yn gobeithio y buasech yn cytuno gyda hynny.

O safbwynt yr ail bwynt, croesawaf y ffaith fod yr adroddiad yn symud oddi wrth yr hyn a wnaeth Llafur Llundain o ran yr agenda dewis a chystadleuaeth. Dywed yr adroddiad mai'r ffordd ymlaen inni yng Nghymru yw cyfranogaeth a chanfod llwybrau cyffredin tuag at benderfyniadau lleol. I bob pwrpas, cymeraf hynny fel anghydfurfiaeth. Yn ei hanfod, mae'n dweud y dylem gael penderfyniadau lleol pryd bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Datganoli ar waith yw hyn a dylai hyn ddigwydd, ond canlyniad hyn yw darpariaeth amrywiol. Nid yw'n golygu y cewch ym Mangor yr un fath ag a gewch yn y Barri; nid yw'n golygu y cewch yng Nghaernarfon yr un fath ag a gewch yng Nghaerdydd o safbwynt darpariaeth gwasanaethau. Mae canfod y cydbwysedd hwnnw rhwng yr hyn sydd gennych fel gwasanaethau unffurf a'r hyn sydd gennych fel gwasanaethau lleol yn fater allweddol yn yr agenda hon drwyddi draw. Os oes gennych broses sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddinasyddion, mae'n wir bosibl y bydd hon yn arwain at ystod wahanol o opsiynau a dewisiadau amgen mewn gwahanol ardaloedd o Gymru, a byddai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu hynny. Y trydydd maes allweddol yr hoffwn holi'r Gweinidog yn ei gylch yw mesur perfformiad. Yn amlwg, os cyfrifwch y ffa fel y cyfrifwch hwy yn awr, a mesur y ffa a gyfrifir mewn un ardal yn erbyn y pethau a gyfrifir mewn un arall, ni chewch unrhyw atebion o gwbl am sut mae mesur

have different communities doing different things, and so you cannot measure the same; you have to measure in a different way. Does the Minister think that we will have to review the whole of performance measurement for public services in Wales?

Finally, on the issue of broad political consensus, the Minister has said, and I agree, that this agenda is so huge—because it touches upon every aspect of political, social and economic life in Wales—that it requires a broad political consensus. If the Minister is prepared to address those four key areas of leading from the top, diversity, changes to performance measurement, and the funding mechanisms, she might get that political consensus. She will certainly get support from the Welsh Liberal Democrats, if she is prepared to take on that challenge. We are prepared to take on that challenge, and I hope that the Minister will indicate in her response today, and in the responses that she will give over the next few months, that this agenda, being so large, can only be dealt with on the basis of consensus and that she is prepared to tackle those fundamental points. There is no point in tackling things at one end, without tackling them at the other, and I hope that the Minister will respond positively to those points.

**Sue Essex:** I made it as clear as I could at the beginning that this is about changing people's culture and behaviour, and we are not exempt from that. We are part of that. We are not standing here pointing fingers at other organisations saying, 'You change; we are on terra firma and need to do nothing' This is about all of us, and I thought that I had made that particularly clear.

In terms of policies and funding, it is difficult, but not impossible, to get cross-cutting funding and policy making, and we are starting to make major breakthroughs.

perfformiad, pan fydd y rhai hynny yr ydych yn eu ffa-gyfrif yn ardal A yn gwbl wahanol i'r atebion a fwriedir ar gyfer ardal B. Os oes gennych gymdeithas amrywiol yng Nghymru, bydd gennych wahanol gymunedau yn gwneud gwahanol bethau, ac felly ni allwch fesur yr un fath; rhaid ichi fesur mewn ffordd wahanol. A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu y bydd yn rhaid inni adolygu'r holl broses o fesur perfformiad ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

Yn olaf, o safbwynt y mater o gonsensws gwleidyddol cyffredinol, mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, a chytunaf fi, fod yr agenda hon mor anferthol—oherwydd ei bod yn cyffwrdd ar bob agwedd ar fywyd gwleidyddol, cymdeithasol ac economaidd Cymru—fel bod arni angen consensws gwleidyddol cyffredinol. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn barod i roi sylw i'r pedwar maes allweddol hwn, sef arwain o'r brig, amrywiaeth, newidiadau i ddulliau mesur perfformiad, a'r mecanweithiau cyllido, mae'n bosibl y caiff y consensws gwleidyddol hwnnw. Bydd hi'n bendant yn cael cefnogaeth oddi wrth Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, os yw'n barod i gymryd y sialens hon, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn dangos yn ei hymateb heddiw, ac yn yr ymatebion a rydd dros y misoedd nesaf, na ellir ond delio â'r agenda hon, oherwydd ei maint, ar sail consensws a'i bod yn barod i fynd i'r afael â'r pwyntiau sylfaenol hynny. Nid oes unrhyw ddiben mynd i'r afael â phethau yn un pen, heb fynd i'r afael â hwy yn y pen arall, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r pwyntiau hyn.

**Sue Essex:** Dywedais mor glir ag y gallwn ar y dechrau fod hyn yn ymwneud â newid ymddygiad a diwylliant pobl, ac nid ydym wedi ein heithrio o hyn. Yr ydym yn rhan o hyn. Nid ydym yn sefyll yma yn pwyntio bys ar sefydliadau eraill gan ddweud, 'Newidiwch chi; yr ydym ni ar terra firma ac nid oes arnom angen gwneud dim'. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â phob un ohonom, a chredais fy mod wedi gwneud hyn yn gwbl glir.

O safbwynt polisiau a chyllid, mae'n anodd, ond nid yn amhosibl, cael proses llunio polisiau a chyllid trawsbynciol, ac yr ydym yn dechrau cymryd camau breision ymlaen.

The Heads of the Valleys strategy is a good example of how we are trying to pull funding streams together. We know, and Sir Jeremy gives us clues on this, how we will move forward and that is about being cross-cutting and changing the culture. We have yet to give the detailed response, but we are certainly up for that as a Government.

Yesterday, Sir Jeremy pursued this issue of local differences and local responsiveness. The phrase that has been used is 'double devolution', and many of us believe in that, because you then get a close relationship between the services and the provider and get that knowledge. The spatial plan has been predicated on the basis that there are differences and different approaches in Wales, and that we need to respond to that. That is a good example of a current policy that is doing that. If we are to provide citizen-oriented services, we must listen to what people say. Sometimes, they will say things that we do not like, and sometimes they will say, 'We want the same as next door'. We have to respond to that and deal with it.

When it comes to bean-counting, I left that behind in infant school. They do not make me, as Finance Minister, count up beans, so I lost the thread there a little. We do not have a big bean pole in Cathays park where we count all the beans up and then distribute them. I think that what you are saying is about funding and the way that we fund and pulling budgets together to fit the purpose.

On performance management, I feel very strongly that this must be done; we have systems in place and those of us on the Committee on Local Government and Public Services spent a long time looking at performance indicators for local government. There are key performance indicators for the Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, and the health sector is full of performance indicators. The interesting challenge would be to ensure that they come together, because they have different origins; bringing them together and trying to make them consistent is a challenge. It is not just

Mae strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn esiampl dda o sut yr ydym yn ceisio dwyn llifau cyllid ynghyd. Gwyddom, ac mae Syr Jeremy yn rhoi cliwiau inni ynghylch hyn, sut y byddwn yn symud ymlaen ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â bod yn drawsbynciol a newid y diwylliant. Ni roesom yr ymateb manwl eto, ond yr ydym yn bendant yn barod amdani fel Llywodraeth.

Ddoe, aeth Syr Jeremy ar drywydd y mater hwn o wahaniaethau lleol ac ymatebolrwydd lleol. Yr ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd yw 'datganoli dwbl', ac mae llawer ohonom yn credu yn hynny, oherwydd cewch wedyn berthynas agos rhwng y gwasanaethau a'r darparwr a chewch y wybodaeth hon. Priodolwyd y cynllun gofodol ar y sail y ceir gwahaniaethau a gwahanol ddulliau gweithredu yng Nghymru, a bod arnom angen ymateb i hynny. Mae hon yn esiampl dda o bolisi cyfredol sy'n gwneud hyn. Os ydym eisiau darparu gwasanaethau sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dinasyddion, rhaid inni wrando ar yr hyn a ddywed pobl. Weithiau, byddant yn dweud pethau nad ydym yn eu hoffi, ac weithiau byddant yn dweud, 'Yr ydym eisiau'r un fath â'r drws nesaf'. Rhaid inni ymateb i hyn a delio gydag ef.

O ran cyfrif ffa, gadewais hynny ar fy ôl yn ysgol y babanod. Ni chaf fy ngorfodi, fel Gweinidog Cyllid, i gyfrif ffa, felly collais rediad eich sylwadau bryd hynny braidd. Nid oes gennym goeden ffa ym Mharc Cathays lle'r ydym yn cyfrif yr holl ffa ac yna yn eu dosbarthu. Credaf fod yr hyn a ddywedwch yn ymwneud â chyllid a'r modd y cyllidwn ac y tynnwn gyllidebau at ei gilydd i fod yn addas at y diben.

O safbwynt rheoli perfformiad, teimlaf yn gryf fod yn rhaid gwneud hyn; mae gennym systemau wedi eu sefydlu a bu i'r rhai hynny ohonom sydd ar y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwariant Cyhoeddus dreulio llawer o amser yn edrych ar ddangosyddion perfformiad llywodraeth leol. Ceir dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol ar gyfer yr Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, ac mae'r sector iechyd yn llawn dangosyddion perfformiad. Yr her ddiddorol fyddai sicrhau eu bod yn dod ynghyd, oherwydd mae ganddynt wahanol darddiadau; mae eu dwyn ynghyd a cheisio

elected members who will be monitoring; user groups and others will also be monitoring.

You challenge me on whether there should be a broad political consensus, but I have said before that, around this agenda, there could be a lot of fusing of political party interests to bridge that gap and find a common thread, because that is what people want. People judge all of us according to the value and quality, and the consistency and the integrity of public services. That is the direction in which we should be going and if we can convince people that we are doing that, we will start to have a bit more respect as politicians, to be blunt.

3.40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I realise that we are over the time for this statement, but it is an important subject and, as the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group put it, it is indeed a philosophical statement, and as a part-time philosopher I am keen to encourage philosophising in every context. On that basis, I will extend the time for this statement by 15 minutes, if required.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Minister, you will be pleased to hear that my comments will be far briefer than those of previous speakers, and you will have heard much of what I have to say yesterday, when I was able to ask a question at Cwmaman. I also congratulate the Beecham review team, and you are absolutely right to say that the recommendations that have been made are across the board.

Interestingly, recommendation 12 is aimed at the media in Wales and it includes such revolutionary suggestions as encouraging more informed and mature debate, publicising reliable information and being willing to acknowledge and celebrate success and good performance. I am sure that we would all endorse that, given the rather bizarre statements made by the BBC and in the *Western Mail* yesterday.

It is also important to note, as you have done,

eu gwneud yn gyson yn her. Nid aelodau etholedig yn unig a fydd yn monitro; bydd grwpiau defnyddwyr ac eraill hefyd yn monitro.

Yr ydych yn fy herio ynghylch a ddylid bod consensws gwleidyddol cyffredinol, ond yr wyf wedi dweud, o safbwynt yr agenda hon, y gellir bod llawer o gyfuno buddiannau pleidiau gwleidyddol i bontio'r bwlech hwn a dod o hyd i llyn cyffredin, oherwydd dyna beth y mae ar bobl ei eisiau. Mae pobl yn barnu pob un ohonom yn unol â gwerth ac ansawdd, a chysondeb a chywirdeb gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. I'r cyfeiriad hwn y dylem fod yn mynd ac os gallwn argyhoeddi pobl ein bod yn gwneud hynny, byddwn yn dechrau ennyn ychydig yn rhagor o barch fel gwleidyddion, i fod yn blaen.

**Y Llywydd:** Sylweddolaf ein bod dros yr amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn, ond mae'n bwnc pwysig ac, fel y dywedodd arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, mae'n wir yn ddatganiad athronyddol, ac fel athronydd rhan-amser yr wyf yn awyddus i annog athronyddu ym mhob cyd-destun. Ar sail hyn, ymestynnaf yr amser ar gyfer y datganiad hwn 15 munud, os oes angen.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Weinidog, byddwch yn falch o glywed y bydd fy sylwadau yn llawer byrrach na rhai'r siaradwyr blaenorol, a byddwch wedi clywed llawer o'r hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud, pan gefais gyfle i ofyn cwestiwn yng Nghwmaman. Llongyfarchaf hefyd dîm adolygiad Beecham, ac yr ydych yn gwbl gywir i ddweud bod yr argymhellion a wnaed yn gwbl hollgynhwysol.

Yn ddi-ddorol, anelir argymhelliad 12 tuag at y cyfryngau yng Nghymru ac mae'n cynnwys awgrymiadau chwyldroadol megis annog trafodaethau mwy aeddfed a gwybodus, cyhoeddi gwybodaeth ddibynadwy a bod yn barod i gydnabod a dathlu llwyddiant a pherfformiad da. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem yn barod i gymeradwyo hyn, o gofio'r datganiadau rhyfeddol a wnaeth y BBC ac a wnaed yn *The Western Mail* ddoe.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig nodi, fel y gwnaethoch

and as others have acknowledged, that in the introduction to recommendation 7.5, the report points out that it is not a question of starting again, but of continuing with the development of the ideas that are at the heart of this change. I agree with those who have said that the issue of collaboration, which is driving this report, is not a cosy option; it will demand far-reaching thought by those involved in civic society in Wales. It will mean that those who have vested interests, in the public or private sectors, will have to be prepared to work together properly, for the benefit of the people of Wales.

Perhaps this is nowhere more true than in the key field of education and, in particular, for one of our key initiatives, the 14-19 Learning Pathways. Unless we can get good collaboration between the education sector, the further education sector, the work-based learning sector, and private and public employers, this key opportunity for young people will not work. That is a good example of where collaboration must work. I would welcome your comments on that, because the economic benefits for Wales as a whole will be massive if it does succeed.

**Sue Essex:** You made that point forcibly yesterday. It was well made, because 14-19 Learning Pathways is a good example of a policy that requires collaboration. I will quote something that Sir Jeremy said, for those who were not there. He said that this is very much about change and that it will be, on many occasions, about 'moving away from the familiar' I am only too aware that that is difficult at times, but the 14-19 Learning Pathways is an example of where that has to be done. This is where it has to be turned around in order to put people first, because if we get this right, collaboration will give youngsters much better choices and opportunities and a better start in life. That is the starting point, not the structures or the processes. The starting point has to be them. I think that you are right, Jeff, that that is a good example.

chi, ac fel y mae eraill wedi cydnabod, fod yr adroddiad, yn y cyflwyniad i argymhelliad 7.5, yn amlygu'r ffaith nad mater o ddechrau eto ydyw, ond o barhau i ddatblygu'r syniadau sydd wrth wraidd y newid hwn. Cytunaf gyda'r rhai hynny a ddywedodd nad yw'r mater o gydweithrediad, mater sy'n symbylu'r adroddiad hwn, yn opsiwn cysurus; bydd yn gofyn am feddwl pellgyrhaeddol gan y rhai hynny sy'n ymwneud â chymdeithas sifil yng Nghymru. Bydd yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid i'r rhai hynny sydd â buddiannau manteisiol, yn y sector cyhoeddus neu'r sector preifat, fod yn barod i weithio gyda'i gilydd yn briodol, er budd pobl Cymru.

Mae'n bosibl nad yw hyn yn fwy gwir yn unman nag ym maes allweddol addysg ac, yn benodol, i un o'n cynlluniau allweddol, y Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19. Oni bai y gallwn gael cydweithrediad da rhwng y sector addysg, y sector addysg bellach, y sector dysgu seiliedig ar waith, a chyflogwyr preifat a chyhoeddus, ni fydd y cyfle allweddol hwn i bobl ifanc yn gweithio. Mae hwn yn esiampl dda o le y mae'n rhaid i gydweithrediad weithio. Buaswn yn croesawu eich sylwadau ynghylch hyn, oherwydd y bydd y manteision economaidd i Gymru yn ei chyfanrwydd yn aruthrol os bydd yn llwyddo.

**Sue Essex:** Gwnaethoch y pwynt hwn yn effeithiol ddoe. Fe'i gwnaed yn dda, oherwydd y mae Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19 yn esiampl dda o bolisi sy'n gofyn am gydweithrediad. Dyfynnaf rywbeth a ddywedodd Syr Jeremy, i'r rhai ohonoch nad oeddech yno. Dywedodd fod hyn yn ymwneud yn wirioneddol â newid ac y bydd, ar sawl achlysur, yn ymwneud â 'symud oddi wrth y cyfarwydd'. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn bod hyn yn anodd ar adegau, ond mae'r Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19 yn esiampl o le y mae'n rhaid gwneud hyn. Dyma ymhle y mae'n rhaid ei wyrdroi er mwyn rhoi pobl yn gyntaf, oherwydd os cawn hyn yn iawn, bydd cydweithrediad yn rhoi i bobl ifanc gyfleoedd a dewisiadau llawer gwell ynghyd â dechrau gwell mewn bywyd. Dyna'r man cychwyn, nid y strwythurau na'r prosesau. Rhaid eu rhoi hwy fel y man cychwyn. Credaf eich bod yn iawn, Jeff, fod hon yn esiampl dda.

Yesterday we saw, unfortunately, in the early part of the day, a good example of the media not waiting to hear what Sir Jeremy had to say. It tried to jump the gun and guess and I think that some unfortunate things were said or written at that stage. During the course of the day, things got better and, by the evening, when people had heard and read what Sir Jeremy and the team had said, there was much better and more informed reporting. That is what we need. We need to have this debate across the piece. It needs to involve more than the organisations, because the media, community groups and the voluntary sector also have a role to play. Therefore, let us be honest and informed, before we make comments, because incorrect comments can be more damaging than not making any comments at all.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf innau i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, ac am ymateb yn llawn i'r pwyntiau a wnaed.

Mae'n rhaid imi gydnabod, wrth imi dderbyn yr adroddiad, yng nghwmni arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, nododd Jeremy Beecham yn berffaith glir bod ei neges ynglŷn â'r angen i newid y ffordd yr ydym yn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus nid yn unig yn neges i lywodraeth leol ac i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond i'r Llywodraeth hefyd. Synais felly o glywed y Prif Weinidog yn awgrymu, rhywsut neu'i gilydd, nad neges i'r Llywodraeth sydd yma, ond neges i rywun arall. Er nad ydym am fynd ar ôl y ddadl ynglŷn â strwythurau Llywodraeth, credaf ei bod yn angenrheidiol i chi, ar ran y Llywodraeth, ddatgan eich parodrwydd i fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n rhaid edrych am ffordd o symleiddio'r broses; dywed yr adroddiad mai un o'r materion sy'n rhwystro datblygiad yw'r syniad o gymhlethdod. Os ydym i symleiddio pethau, bydd rhaid newid.

I gloi, mae'n gwneud y pwynt, os ydym am symud i ffwrdd o'r syniad o weithio mewn seilos, ac edrych ar y syniad o weithio'n drawsbynciol, fod angen arweiniad o'r pen uchaf.

**Sue Essex:** I did not hear the First Minister say exactly what you said, but you have

Ddoe gwelsom, yn anffodus, yn rhan gyntaf y dydd, esiampl dda o'r cyfryngau yn peidio ag aros i glywed beth yr oedd gan Syr Jeremy i'w ddweud. Ceisiais achub y blaen a dyfalu a chredaf y dywedwyd neu yr ysgrifennwyd rhai pethau anffodus bryd hynny. Yn ystod y dydd, daeth pethau'n well ac, erbyn gyda'r nos, pan oedd pobl wedi clywed a darllen yr hyn a ddywedodd Syr Jeremy a'r tîm, cafwyd adroddiadau llawer gwell a mwy gwybodus. Dyna beth y mae arnom ei angen. Rhaid inni gael y drafodaeth hon yn gyffredinol. Rhaid iddi gynnwys mwy na'r sefydliadau, oherwydd bod gan y cyfryngau, grwpiau cymunedol a'r sector gwirfoddol hefyd rôl i'w chwarae. Felly, gadewch inni fod yn onest a gwybodus, oherwydd y gall sylwadau anghywir fod yn fwy niweidiol na pheidio â gwneud unrhyw sylwadau o gwbl.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I, too, thank the Minister for her statement, and for responding fully to the points made.

I must admit that, when I received this report, in the company of the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group, Jeremy Beecham made it perfectly clear that his message about the need to change the way in which we deliver public services was not just a message for local government and public services, but for the Government as well. I was surprised, therefore, to hear the First Minister suggest that, somehow or other, this was not a message for the Government, but for someone else. Although we do not wish to go into the argument about Government structures, I think that you must, on behalf of the Government, express your readiness to be part of the discussion on the future of public services. We must look for a means of simplifying the process; the report says that one of the issues frustrating development is the concept of complexity. If we are to achieve simplicity, then change is a must.

Finally, he makes the point that, if we are to move away from the idea of working in silos, and look at the idea of working across subjects, leadership from the top is needed.

**Sue Essex:** Ni chlywais y Prif Weinidog yn dweud yn union yr hyn a ddywedasoch, ond

heard me say, over and again this afternoon, that we have a role to play, and that we are absolutely intrinsic to that. The fact that we set the commission up shows that we are prepared to show leadership, and we have put money into Value Wales, Public Service Management Wales, and other organisations. We have supported local government with regional co-ordinators. We have been doing a whole range of things, but we are not satisfied, or saying that that is sufficient and stopping—that is the point of getting Sir Jeremy in. The recommendations are in his report for us, and they are in there for other organisations as well.

Ieuan, you have to enter into the spirit of that partnership in the same way as that was expressed yesterday. There is no point in picking one group and saying that it is not a part of it or that it has to be a part. We are all in this together, and that is really what I wanted to stress.

He did say that it is complex, and there are some complex arrangements there. There was an open mandate on this—it was not a matter of saying, ‘Whatever you say, you must not say reorganisation’. We really did, truthfully—and Sir Jeremy acknowledged that yesterday—give the review freedom around this agenda. Gill Morgan was strong in saying, ‘If you think that you can reorganise boundaries to get yourself out of this, you are making a mistake’. I can see Dai nodding. To reduce the complexity, they are suggesting other means of pulling the services together. We all get this from constituents; for some people, the complexity is around the multiplicity of agencies not working together. It is not so much the different agencies, but the fact that they do not work together. So, these poor people have to find their way through all these different agencies, without their being pulled together. That is what they are trying to stress. This is where innovative service-end collaboration is going to be. They were very clear. They did not say ‘never, ever’, and they did not say that there may not be one or two things coming through, but they pleaded with us not to get hung up on reorganisation, thinking that it was going to solve all our problems; experience shows that that does not happen.

yr ydych wedi fy nghlywed yn dweud, drosodd a throsodd brynhawn heddiw, bod gennym rôl i’w chwarae, a’n bod yn hollol greiddiol i hynny. Mae’r ffaith ein bod wedi sefydlu’r comisiwn yn dangos ein bod yn barod i ddangos arweiniad, a rhoesom arian i Gwerth Cymru, Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Cymru, a sefydliadau eraill. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi llywodraeth leol gyda chydlynwyr rhanbarthol. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gwneud amrediad cyfan o bethau, ond nid ydym yn fodlon, nac yn dweud ychwaith bod hynny’n ddigon a’n bod yn rhoi’r gorau iddi—dyna holl bwynt cael Syr Jeremy. Mae’r argymhellion yn ei adroddiad inni, ac maen nhw yno i sefydliadau eraill hefyd.

Ieuan, rhaid ichi fynd i ysbryd y bartneriaeth honno yn yr un modd ag y mynegwyd hynny ddoe. Nid oes unrhyw bwynt dewis un grŵp a dweud nad yw’n rhan ohono neu fod yn rhaid iddo fod yn rhan. Yr ydym i gyd yn rhan o hyn, a dyna beth oeddwn eisiau ei bwysleisio mewn gwirionedd.

Dywedodd ei fod yn gymhleth, a bod rhai trefniadau yn rhai cymhleth. Yr oedd mandad agored ynghylch hyn—nid mater ydoedd o ddweud, ‘Beth bynnag a ddywedwch, peidiwch â dweud ad-drefnu’. Yr ydym wedi rhoi rhyddid gwirioneddol—ac mae Syr Jeremy wedi cydnabod hynny ddoe—i’r adolygiad yng nghyswllt yr agenda hon. Yr oedd Gill Morgan yn gryf pan ddywedodd, ‘Os credwch y gallwch ad-drefnu ffiniau i gael eich hunain allan o hyn, yr ydych yn twyllo eich hunain’. Gallaf weld Dai yn amneidio ei ben. I leihau’r cymhlethdod, maent yn awgrymu ffordd arall o ddod â’r gwasanaethau at ei gilydd. Mae pob un ohonom yn clywed hyn gan etholwyr; i rai pobl, mae’r cymhlethdod yn ymwneud â’r ffaith nad yw’r holl asiantaethau yn cydweithio. Nid mater o wahanol asiantaethau ydyw, ond y ffaith nad ydynt yn cydweithio. Felly, rhaid i’r bobl druan hyn ddarganfod eu ffordd drwy’r holl wahanol asiantaethau hyn, heb y cydweithio. Dyna’r hyn y maent yn ceisio ei bwysleisio. Dyma lle bydd cydweithrediad arloesol rhwng gwasanaethau yn digwydd. Yr oeddent yn hollol glir. Nid dweud ‘byth bythoedd’ oedden nhw, nac ychwaith na fydd efallai un neu ddau o bethau yn dod drwodd, ond ymbil arnom i beidio â meddwl mai ad-drefnu yw’r



ateb, y byddai'n datrys ein holl broblemau; mae profiad yn dangos nad yw hynny'n digwydd.

The great thing about this was that it was their choice as a title, but when he showed it to me, he said, 'I know that you will like this—it is "Beyond Boundaries"'. We are fixated on boundaries. Somebody told me the other day that they remembered exactly what I said—it always frightens me when I hear that, because I think, 'Well, what did I say?'—and that was that people do not live their lives within administrative boundaries. He said that he went home and reflected on that, and it is absolutely true; they do not live their lives in LHB areas, local government areas and so on. Wherever you put the boundaries, you will still have to have this collaboration. We could reorganise tomorrow, and I tell you, in a couple of years' time, people would be saying, 'These are not fit for purpose'.

Y peth gwych am hyn oedd mai nhw a ddewisodd y teitl, ond pan y'i dangosodd imi, meddai, 'Gwn y byddwch yn hoffi hwn—y teitl yw "Ar Draws Ffiniau"'. Mae gennym obsesiwn ynghylch ffiniau. Dywedodd rhywun wrthyf y diwrnod o'r blaen eu bod yn cofio yn union yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi'i ddweud—byddaf o hyd yn dychryn pan glywaf hynny, ac yn meddwl, 'Wel, beth a ddywedais?' —a hynny oedd nad yw pobl yn byw eu bywydau o fewn ffiniau gweinyddol. Dywedodd ei fod wedi mynd adref ac wedi troi'r peth yn ei feddwl, ac mae'n hollol wir; nid ydynt yn byw eu bywydau mewn ardaloedd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol, ardaloedd llywodraeth leol ac yn y blaen. Lle bynnag y codwch y ffiniau, bydd dal yn rhaid ichi gael y cydweithrediad hwn. Byddem yn gallu ad-drefnu yfory, ac yn wir ichi, mewn cwpl o flynyddoedd, byddai pobl yn dweud, 'Nid yw'r rhain yn ffit i'w pwrpas'.

3.50 p.m.

It is really saying that there have to be boundaries to a certain extent for the sake of good administration, but, in terms of service delivery, we should try to break down those boundaries, and put citizens first. That is such a fundamental issue, but they are challenging messages, because we have all been brought up, particularly those of us who worked in public services, to see those boundaries as being absolute. Yet we know that the best innovation and the best experience of public services is where people have gone beyond those boundaries and designed, planned and delivered a service that is person-orientated. Those are the examples that we must use, bring forward and learn from. Learning from each other is a very important part of this agenda.

Dweud y mae mewn gwirionedd bod yn rhaid cael ffiniau i raddau er mwyn cael gweinyddiaeth dda, ond, o ran darparu gwasanaethau, dylem geisio chwalu'r ffiniau hynny, a rhoi dinasyddion yn gyntaf. Mae'n rhywbeth mor sylfaenol, ond maent yn negeseuon heriol, oherwydd cawsom i gyd ein magu, yn enwedig y rhai ohonom sydd wedi gweithio yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, i weld y ffiniau hynny fel rhai absoliwt. Eto, gwyddom fod yr arloesi gorau a'r profiad gorau o wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn digwydd pan fydd pobl wedi croesi'r ffiniau hynny ac wedi dylunio, cynllunio a darparu gwasanaeth person-ganolog. Dyma'r enghreifftiau sydd angen inni eu defnyddio, eu hefelychu a dysgu ohonynt. Mae dysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd yn rhan eithriadol bwysig o'r agenda hon.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank the Minister for the statement, and I also offer my thanks to the review team. One of the most important things that it has stressed is the need to break down boundaries, but the other point that I wanted to mention was the whole issue of implementing cultural change. There is a

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad, a diolch hefyd i dîm yr adolygiad. Un o'r pethau pwysicaf y mae hyn wedi'i bwysleisio yw bod angen chwalu ffiniau, ond y pwynt arall yr oeddwn eisiau ei grybwyll oedd yr holl fater o weithredu newid diwylliant. Mae'r ddogfen

recommendation in the document that there should be a strong central team created to help lead change throughout the public sector. It is my experience, from other public sector organisations going through cultural change, that you need buy-in at a local level by individual managers, but for change to happen, you need that change programme to be led. Can you give us some more thoughts about the creation of that strong central team?

**Sue Essex:** That is a good point, because there needs to be that co-ordination and sense of common purpose. At the moment, I do not have any firm ideas and we have not sat down as a Cabinet to discuss in what direction we will take this forward—we have only done so in general terms, because we did not know what Sir Jeremy would say. Now is the time for us to work carefully on this, talking to everyone that needs to be involved. We will make a further statement in September. I will bear in mind the point that you made that culture and change of behaviour has to be led at times.

**Mark Ishewood:** As you are aware, in north Wales, council leaders and chief executives are working well together in the early stages of co-operation and collaboration, and are holding meetings. However, concerns have been expressed by one council leader on their behalf that, in achieving better corporate services and better public service delivery through critical mass and economies of scale, they want an assurance that the principle of subsidiarity will still hold, so that we deliver as close to people as possible, subject to that being efficient. They want an assurance that those services that can still be delivered at a local level most efficiently will not be inefficiently encouraged to also move up to a regional level.

**Sue Essex:** There must be a trade-off between efficient use of resources, which is often around the large-scale agenda, and effective service delivery, which is often around the local delivery aspects. Sir Jeremy stressed that this was about local delivery; that must be the starting point. So, there would be no sense in moving to a large-scale design of services, if I can put it that way, if

yn argymell y dylid creu tîm canolog cryf i helpu i arwain newid ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Yn fy mhrofiad i o weld cyrff cyhoeddus eraill yn mynd drwy newid diwylliant, mae angen cytundeb rheolwyr unigol ar lefel leol ond, er mwyn i newid ddigwydd, mae angen i'r rhaglen newid honno gael ei harwain. A allwch ddweud mwy wrthym am greu'r tîm canolog cryf hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n bwynt da, oherwydd mae angen cael y cydlynu hynny a'r teimlad hwnnw o bwrpas cyffredin. Ar y funud, nid oes gennyf unrhyw syniadau pendant ac nid ydym wedi eistedd i lawr fel Cabinet i drafod ym mha gyfeiriad y byddwn yn mynd—dim ond yn gyffredinol iawn, oherwydd nid oeddem yn gwybod beth fyddai Syr Jeremy yn ei ddweud. Mae'n bryd bellach inni weithio'n ofalus ar hyn, a siarad gyda phawb sydd angen iddynt gael eu cynnwys. Byddwn yn gwneud datganiad pellach ym mis Medi. Byddaf yn cadw'r pwynt a wnaethoch mewn cof, sef bod yn rhaid i ddiwylliant a newid ymddygiad gael ei arwain weithiau.

**Mark Ishewood:** Fel y gwyddoch, yng ngogledd Cymru, mae arweinyddion cyngor a phrif weithredwyr yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd yn dda yn y dyddiau cydweithredu cynnar hyn, ac yn cynnal cyfarfodydd. Fodd bynnag, lleisiwyd pryderon gan un arweinydd cyngor ar eu rhan eu bod eisiau derbyn sicrwydd, er mwyn cyflawni gwasanaethau corfforaethol gwell a gwella eu darpariaeth drwy fâs critigol a darbodion maint, y bydd yr egwyddor o sybsidiaredd yn parhau, fel ein bod yn darparu mor agos at y bobl â phosibl, ar yr amod bod hynny'n effeithiol. Maent eisiau derbyn sicrwydd na fydd pwysau ar y gwasanaethau hynny y gellir parhau i'w darparu yn fwyaf effeithlon ar lefel leol i gael eu darparu hefyd ar lefel ranbarthol.

**Sue Essex:** Rhaid cael cyfaddawd rhwng defnyddio adnoddau yn effeithlon, sy'n aml yn berthnasol i'r agenda raddfa fawr, a darparu gwasanaethau yn effeithiol, sy'n aml yn ymwneud ag agweddau darpariaeth leol. Pwysleisiodd Syr Jeremy mai mater o ddarpariaeth leol oedd hyn; rhaid i hynny fod yn fan cychwyn. Felly, ni fyddai pwynt o gwbl symud at ddylunio gwasanaethau ar

that did not respond adequately to people in communities. That is where the element of putting the citizen, customer or client—whatever you wish to call it—at the centre will be important, because that will focus on accessibility. So much of service delivery is around physical accessibility or other types of accessibility, such as broadband; that is key to people having a quality of life and quality of public service delivery.

raddfa fawr, os gallaf ei rhoi hi felly, os na fyddai hynny'n ymateb yn foddhaol i bobl mewn cymunedau. Dyna lle bydd yr elfen o roi'r dinesydd, y cwsmer neu'r cleient—fel y mynnwch—yn y canol yn bwysig, oherwydd bydd hynny'n canolbwyntio ar hygyrchedd. Mae gymaint o ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau yn ymwneud â hygyrchedd ffisegol neu fathau eraill o hygyrchedd, fel band eang; mae hynny'n allweddol i sicrhau ansawdd bywyd a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd.

### **Datganiad am Ddyraniadau Cyfalaf** **Statement on Capital Allocations**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I announced in March that I would bring my proposals for allocating the £9 million capital allocations from the UK budget back to Plenary. My statement today fulfils that commitment. I am able to add a further £2 million from savings secured from capital expenditure on central administration. This means that, today, we are allocating £11 million of new capital funding. Our commitment to capital investment is beyond doubt. We are investing to deliver a modern infrastructure to strengthen our communities, to improve the health and wellbeing of individuals, and to promote sustainable development. However, we are also investing in people by providing them with opportunities to improve their health and wellbeing. That is why I am proposing that these funds are directed to four main cross-cutting themes: active lifestyles, access for the disabled, caring for the vulnerable and protecting our environment.

I propose to make £4 million available to fund community active lifestyle venues. That will provide equipment and adaptations to existing indoor and outdoor community facilities, which can be used by local people on a regular basis for physical activities. These will include community centres, village halls, schools, parks and so on. This is an innovative programme that will develop new solutions in response to Health Challenge Wales and the 'Climbing Higher' objectives of improving health through increased physical activity. It also seeks to promote the sustainable and better use of

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cyhoeddais ym mis Mawrth y byddwn yn dod â fy nghynigion ar gyfer dyrannu'r £9 miliwn mewn arian cyfalaf o gyllideb y DU yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae fy natganiad heddiw yn cyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Byddaf yn gallu ychwanegu £2 miliwn arall o arbedion yn deillio o wariant cyfalaf ar weinyddu canolog. Mae hyn yn golygu ein bod, heddiw, yn dyrannu £11 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf newydd. Mae ein hymrwymiad i fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn ddiymwad. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi i ddarparu seilwaith modern i gryfhau ein cymunedau, i wella iechyd a lles unigolion, ac i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi mewn pobl drwy roi cyfle iddynt hwythau wella eu hiechyd a'u lles. Dyna pam yr wyf yn cynnig cyfeirio'r cyllid hwn i bedair thema drawsbynciol bwysig: byw'n egnïol, mynediad i'r anabl, gofalu am bobl agored i niwed a diogelu ein hamgylchedd.

Yr wyf yn bwriadu rhoi £4 miliwn i ariannu lleoliadau byw'n egnïol cymunedol. Bydd yn darparu cyfarpar ac yn talu am addasiadau i gyfleusterau cymunedol dan do ac awyr agored, i'w defnyddio gan bobl leol yn rheolaidd ar gyfer gweithgareddau corfforol. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys canolfannau cymunedol, neuaddau pentref, ysgolion, parciau ac yn y blaen. Mae hon yn rhaglen arloesol a fydd yn datblygu atebion newydd mewn ymateb i'r amcanion yn Her Iechyd Cymru a 'Dringo'n Uwch', sef gwella iechyd drwy wneud mwy o weithgarwch corfforol. Mae hefyd yn ceisio hybu defnydd gwella a

buildings and outdoor spaces. Funding will be available to adapt existing facilities, for example, bicycle parks, fitness rooms, changing facilities, green gyms and the mapping and signage of routes for cycling walking and jogging, to make them appropriate and attractive for daily physical activity.

Priority will be given to communities where the need for health improvement and extra facilities is the greatest. The allocation of these funds will involve the Sports Council for Wales, local authorities and other key stakeholders, with a requirement that there is an appropriate balance of support for facilities provided by the public and voluntary sectors. Fuller details will be given by Alun Pugh when he announces the next steps of 'Climbing Higher' at the end of July.

It is essential that people are able to access services and facilities. That is why I propose to provide another £3.5 million to assist increased accessibility. I have allocated £3 million to the post-16 education sector to address the requirements of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. A total of 23 further education institutions will benefit, building upon the successful investment of £6.5 million deployed last year. The funding will pay for a wide range of works that, collectively, will remove the physical barriers faced by disabled students, which disadvantage them on a daily basis. The installation of lifts, ramps and induction loops and the provision of suitable car parking are all examples of the types of work to be supported.

I am aware that provision for the disabled to access the countryside is not as good as it could be, so I am delighted to be able to announce an extra £350,000 this year for the national park authorities to enable the disabled to enjoy the spectacular scenery within our national parks.

I am also making £125,000 available to Cadw to continue the development of improved facilities for people with sensory impairments. That includes projects at Castell Coch and Plas Mawr, Conwy. The project

chynaliadwy o adeiladau a manau awyr agored. Bydd cyllid ar gael i addasu cyfleusterau presennol, er enghraifft, parciau beicio, ystafelloedd ffitrwydd, cyfleusterau newid, campfeydd gwyrdd ac i fapio a chodi arwyddion ar hyd llwybrau beicio, cerdded a loncian, i'w gwneud yn briodol ac yn ddeniadol ar gyfer gweithgarwch corfforol pob dydd.

Rhoddir blaenoriaeth i gymunedau lle mae mwyaf o angen gwella iechyd a chael cyfleusterau ychwanegol. Bydd dyrannu'r cyllid hwn yn cynnwys Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, awdurdodau lleol a rhanddeiliaid allweddol eraill, ynghyd â gofyniad i gydbwysu'r cymorth ariannol yn briodol ar gyfer cyfleusterau a ddarperir gan y sectorau cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol. Bydd Alun Pugh yn rhoi'r manylion llawn pan fydd yn cyhoeddi'r camau nesaf ar gyfer 'Dringo'n Uwch' ar ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf.

Mae'n hanfodol fod pobl yn gallu cael gafael ar wasanaethau a chyfleusterau. Dyna pam fy mod yn bwriadu rhoi £3.5 miliwn arall i helpu i wella mynediad. Yr wyf wedi dyrannu £3 miliwn i'r sector addysg ôl 16 oed i gwrdd â gofynion Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995. Bydd 23 o sefydliadau addysg bellach yn elwa i gyd, gan adeiladu ar y buddsoddiad llwyddiannus o £6.5 miliwn a ddefnyddiwyd y llynedd. Bydd y cyllid yn talu am ystod eang o waith a fydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn chwalu'r rhwystrau ffisegol a wynebir gan fyfyrwyr anabl, sy'n anfantais feunyddiol iddynt. Mae gosod lifftiau, rampiau a dolenni clyw, a darparu lleoedd parcio addas, i gyd yn enghreifftiau o'r mathau o waith a gefnogir.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol nad yw'r ddarpariaeth i'r anabl i gael mynediad i gefn gwlad cystal ag y gallai fod, felly yr wyf yn falch iawn o gyhoeddi £350,000 ychwanegol eleni ar gyfer awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol fel bod pobl anabl yn gallu mwynhau'r golygfeydd ysblennydd yn ein parciau cenedlaethol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn rhoi £125,000 i Cadw i barhau i ddatblygu cyfleusterau gwell i bobl â nam ar eu synhwyrau. Mae hynny'n cynnwys prosiectau yng Nghastell Coch ac ym Mhlas Mawr, Conwy. Bydd y prosiect yn helpu i

will help enrich the visitor experience and increase the understanding and enjoyment of the heritage.

Caring for the vulnerable is a recognised key priority and the £2 million of funding that I am providing reinforces our commitment. I have allocated £870,000 for extra care housing for the elderly. That allows people to remain independent in a home environment, with varying levels of support and care delivered to them as and when they need it. Each local authority in Wales has expressed a strategic requirement for such schemes in their area. The development of these schemes is truly cross-cutting: decisions are made jointly by housing, health and social care officials. My additional funding will enable the delivery of this successful programme to be brought forward.

At the moment, less than one third of Welsh young offenders serving custodial sentences are able to serve their sentences in Wales. Clearly, this situation works against the need for these young people to maintain relationships with their families. Maintaining these links is vital for these young people if they are to successfully reintegrate into their local communities on release from custody. The problem in north Wales is particularly acute as there are currently no facilities available. I have, therefore, made £750,000 available this year to assist with the process of developing a collaborative scheme in north Wales.

I propose to provide £375,000 to support an innovative project in Neath Port Talbot to provide supported accommodation for substance misusers, together with employment and training.

4.00 p.m.

I am making £1.5 million available to projects that protect our environment. Tackling climate change is an important priority for the Welsh Assembly Government. I am, therefore, glad to announce an additional £1 million for energy and water management in the higher

gyfoethogi profiad ymwelwyr ac yn gwella dealltwriaeth a mwynhad o'n treftadaeth.

Mae gofalu am bobl agored i niwed yn flaenoriaeth allweddol glir ac mae'r £2 miliwn o gyllid yr wyf yn ei ddarparu yn atgyfnerthu ein hymrwymiad. Yr wyf wedi dyrannu £870,000 i ddarparu tai gofal ychwanegol i'r henoed. Mae hynny'n caniatáu i bobl aros yn annibynnol yn eu cartrefi, gyda gwahanol lefelau o gymorth a gofal yn cael ei roi iddynt fel a phan fo'i angen. Mae pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru wedi datgan bod cynlluniau o'r fath yn strategol angenrheidiol yn eu hardaloedd. Mae datblygiad y cynlluniau hyn yn wirioneddol drawsbynciol: gwneir penderfyniadau ar y cyd gan swyddogion tai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd y cyllid ychwanegol yn golygu y gellir ehangu'r rhaglen lwyddiannus hon.

Ar y funud, mae llai na thraean o droseddwy'r ifanc Cymreig sydd â dedfrydau o garchar i'w treulio yn gallu gwneud hynny yng Nghymru. Yn amlwg, mae'r sefyllfa'n gweithio yn erbyn y ffaith bod angen i'r bobl ifanc hyn gadw mewn cysylltiad â'u teuluoedd. Mae cynnal y cysylltiadau hyn yn hanfodol os yw'r bobl ifanc hyn i ailymdoddi'n llwyddiannus i'w cymunedau lleol ar ôl eu rhyddhau. Mae'r broblem yng ngogledd Cymru yn arbennig o ddifrifol oherwydd ar hyn o bryd nid oes unrhyw gyfleusterau ar gael. Felly, yr wyf wedi darparu £750,000 eleni i helpu gyda'r broses o ddatblygu cynllun cydweithredol yng ngogledd Cymru.

Yr wyf yn bwriadu darparu £375,000 i gefnogi prosiect arloesol yng Nghastell Nedd Port Talbot i ddarparu llety cymorth i rai sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, ynghyd â hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth.

Yr wyf yn rhoi £1.5 miliwn i brosiectau sy'n diogelu ein hamgylchedd. Mae mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn flaenoriaeth bwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf, felly, yn falch o gyhoeddi £1 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer rheoli ynni a dŵr yn y sector addysg uwch. Bydd yr arian hwn yn

education sector. This money will permit the sector to achieve longer-term efficiency savings. My funding will allow universities to play a role as models of best practice in innovative approaches to sustainability.

I propose to make available additional funding of £375,000 for improving the environmental performance of the Assembly estate. Areas of investment will include expanded recycling facilities and energy efficient measures within specific buildings. My additional funding will build on the good practice that we have already demonstrated through the design and construction of the new Assembly building and the new Assembly Government offices throughout Wales.

In addition, I have allocated £150,000 to complete the refurbishment of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority offices in Pembroke Dock. The building was brought back into use with Assembly grant of some £1.5 million several years ago, and incorporates some good sustainability features, such as a biomass boiler for heating. However, it was always recognised that further investment on the building would be required.

The £11 million of extra funding that I have announced today demonstrates how the Assembly Government is committed to ensuring that its capital investment makes a difference and that the benefits are seen by people across Wales.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for her latest statement—she is on a roll today—on capital allocations from the UK budget. We are talking about allocating £11 million of new capital funding. Capital investment is vital, and many worthwhile projects are outlined here; we naturally welcome all the allocations.

The £3 million allocated to the post-16 education sector to address the requirements of the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 is welcome. There are many further education institutions and huge challenges with the

galluogi'r sector i sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd tymor hir. Bydd fy arian yn caniatáu i brifysgolion chwarae rôl fel modelau ymarfer gorau mewn dulliau arloesol o weithredu ym maes cynaliadwyedd.

Yr wyf yn bwriadu darparu £375,000 o arian ychwanegol i wella perfformiad amgylcheddol ystâd y Cynulliad. Bydd y meysydd a fuddsoddir ynddynt yn cynnwys ehangu'r cyfleusterau ailgylchu a mesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn adeiladau penodol. Bydd fy arian ychwanegol yn adeiladu ar yr arferion da yr ydym wedi eu dangos eisoes yn nyluniad ac adeiladwaith adeilad newydd y Cynulliad ac yn swyddfeydd newydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ledled Cymru.

Hefyd, yr wyf wedi neilltuo £150,000 i gwblhau'r gwaith adnewyddu yn swyddfeydd Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro yn Noc Penfro. Dechreuwyd ailddefnyddio'r adeilad yn dilyn grant o tua £1.5 miliwn gan y Cynulliad rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ac mae'n cynnwys nifer o nodweddion cynaliadwyedd da, megis boeler biomas ar gyfer cynhesu. Fodd bynnag, cydnabuwyd o'r cychwyn y byddai angen buddsoddiad pellach yn yr adeilad.

Mae'r £11 miliwn o arian ychwanegol yr wyf wedi ei gyhoeddi heddiw'n dangos i ba raddau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwmo i sicrhau bod ei buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn gwneud gwahaniaeth a bod pobl ledled Cymru'n gallu gweld buddiannau hynny.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad diweddaraf—mae hi'n mynd i hwyl heddiw—ar ddyraniadau cyfalaf o gyllideb y DU. Yr ydym yn sôn am ddyrannu £11 miliwn o arian cyfalaf newydd. Mae buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn hanfodol, ac amlinellir sawl prosiect gwerth chweil yma; yr ydym yn naturiol ddigon yn croesawu'r holl ddyraniadau.

Mae'r £3 miliwn a ddyrennir i'r sector addysg ôl-16 i gwrdd â gofynion Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005 yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Ceir llawer o sefydliadau addysg bellach ac mae heriau'r

Disability Discrimination Act. How do you deal with all the necessary allocations required under that Act? Could you give us some insight into how you deal with all the possible requests that fall on your desk from organisations and individuals having to conform to the responsibilities brought about by the Act?

On the additional £1 million again for energy and water management in the higher education sector, in terms of the detail and our ability to scrutinise that sum of money, what strategies would qualify under that heading in the fourth paragraph on page 4? We are talking about £11 million of extra capital funding, and the big picture, as I outlined earlier, was that there is a huge capital funding gap in Wales of over £4 billion in terms of the need to make the housing repairs and the school building repairs that are extant. That total of over £4 billion is more than the total local government budget that is available every year. Therefore, on that funding gap, we will naturally welcome that £11 million today, but what strategies do you, as Finance Minister, have in place to deal with that predicted huge capital funding gap, particularly in the local government sector? With that caveat, I warmly welcome the announcement this afternoon of £11 million for the various projects.

**Sue Essex:** On your first point on FE, the £3 million will build upon the £6.5 million funding deployed to date, which will enable a further step change to be made to FE establishments. It will be delivered following the results of the access audit survey, which has been the key piece of work in terms of any building work. The access audit survey will determine where that money goes. It has already identified what works are required, and this is more of a rolling programme. It will be managed by the education department, and, in terms of compliance, funding will go out in receipt of approval on the works.

What is good about this—and this is very important—is that we are trying to encourage more people to go into FE. For some

Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd yn rhai enfawr. Sut mae delio â'r holl ddyraniadau angenrheidiol sy'n ofynnol o dan y Ddeddf honno? Allwch chi roi syniad inni sut y mae delio â'r holl geisiadau posibl sy'n cyrraedd eich desg oddi wrth sefydliadau ac unigolion sy'n gorfod cydymffurfio â'r cyfrifoldebau sy'n codi yn sgil y Ddeddf?

Ynglŷn â'r £1 miliwn ychwanegol eto ar gyfer rheoli ynni a dŵr yn y sector addysg uwch, o ran y manylion a'n gallu i graffu ar y swm hwnnw o arian, pa strategaethau fyddai'n gymwys o dan y pennawd hwnnw yn y pedwerydd paragraff ar dudalen 4? Yr ydym yn sôn am £11 miliwn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf ychwanegol, a'r darlun cyffredinol, fel yr amlinellais yn gynharach, oedd bod bwlch cyllido cyfalaf enfawr o dros £4 biliwn yng Nghymru o ran yr angen sy'n bodoli i wneud gwaith trwsio i dai ac adeiladau ysgol. Mae'r cyfanswm hwnnw o dros £4 biliwn yn fwy na chyfanswm y gyllideb sydd ar gael i lywodraeth leol bob blwyddyn. Felly, o ran y bwlch cyllido hwnnw, byddwn yn naturiol yn croesawu'r £11 miliwn hwn heddiw, ond pa strategaethau sydd gennych chi, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, ar waith i ddelio â'r bwlch anferthol yn y cyllid cyfalaf a ragwelir, yn enwedig yn y sector llywodraeth leol? Gan dderbyn yr amod hwnnw, croesawaf yn gynnes y cyhoeddiad y prynhawn yma o £11 miliwn ar gyfer y gwahanol brosiectau.

**Sue Essex:** Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt cyntaf ar addysg bellach, bydd y £3 miliwn yn adeiladu ar y £6.5 miliwn sydd ar gael eisoes, a fydd yn galluogi newid sylfaenol pellach mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach. Caiff ei gyflwyno yn dilyn canlyniadau'r arolwg o'r archwiliad mynediad, sef y darn gwaith allweddol o ran unrhyw waith adeiladu. Bydd yr arolwg o'r archwiliad mynediad yn penderfynu i ble fydd yr arian yn mynd. Mae eisoes wedi dangos pa waith sydd angen ei wneud, ac mae hyn yn fwy o raglen dreigl. Caiff ei rheoli gan yr adran addysg, ac, o ran cydymffurfiaid, bydd yr arian yn cael ei ddyrannu ar ôl i'r gwaith gael ei gymeradwyo.

Yr hyn sy'n dda ynglŷn â hyn—ac mae hyn yn bwysig iawn—yw ein bod yn ceisio annog mwy o bobl i fynd ymlaen i addysg bellach.

people—and I have talked to some of them—it is a real frustration in that they gear themselves up to go only to find that it is impossible for them to have the normal access that able-bodied people have. FE establishments have a good track record on this, and we think that 23 institutions can benefit from this money. I will not go into the details, because you are obviously aware of what kind of schemes the money is spent on.

On HE—I will just turn to the note on HE to make sure that I get it right for you—I can give you details of what kind of schemes there might be. These include the provision and installation of electric, gas and water supply sub-meters, further development of methodology and systems to support installations, strategy reporting, and the provision of on-line monitoring and support advice. We are trying to get over how we can use the bids that have come through from HE as exemplars and as research centres for the use of this. It is about effectively looking at how we can develop proper monitoring systems, which is essential in terms of energy efficiency, and take forward some of the progress that has been made to date. Therefore, it is about turning HE into a model of best practice.

On the capital funding gap, like you, I was at the meeting of the consultative forum on finance, and when the report came through from local government, you will remember that Dave Brown, the finance officer from the WLGA, said, 'We want to make it clear that we do not expect all of this to come from the Welsh Assembly Government', which was a relief, when they talked about billions of pounds. That is the truth of it. What it was doing in that report was identifying the shortfall. It was realistic about what we can provide. There has been a big step-change in capital provision. In areas such as waste management, we are talking about major schemes, and it is pretty obvious that some of this investment will come from the private sector.

In terms of the budget, you know that, in the last couple of years, we have prioritised

Yn achos rhai pobl—ac yr wyf wedi siarad â rhai ohonynt—maent yn profi rhwystredigaeth mawr gan eu bod yn paratoi eu hunain ar gyfer mynd, dim ond i sylweddoli ei bod yn amhosibl iddynt gael yr un mynediad normal ag sydd gan bobl nad ydynt yn anabl. Mae gan sefydliadau addysg bellach enw da yn hyn o beth, a chredwn y gall 23 o sefydliadau elwa ar yr arian hwn. Nid wyf am fanylu yma, oherwydd ei bod yn amlwg eich bod yn gwybod ar ba fath o gynlluniau y mae'r arian yn cael ei wario.

O ran addysg uwch—cyfeiriaf at y nodyn ar addysg uwch i sicrhau fod y manylion a roddaf i chi'n gywir—gallaf roi manylion ar ba fath o gynlluniau a all fod ar gael. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys darparu a gosod is-fetrau cyflenwadau trydan, nwy a dŵr, datblygu ymhellach fethodolegau a systemau i gefnogi gosodiadau, adrodd ar strategaethau, a darparu cyngor ar fonitro a chefnogi ar-lein. Yr ydym yn ceisio dangos sut y gellir defnyddio'r bidiau sydd wedi dod trwy addysg uwch fel enghreifftiau patrymog ac fel canolfannau ymchwil i ddefnyddio hyn. Mae'n golygu, mewn gwirionedd, edrych sut y gallwn ddatblygu systemau monitro effeithiol, sy'n hanfodol o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni, a bwrw ymlaen gyda pheth o'r cynnydd a wnaethpwyd hyd yma. Felly, mae'n golygu trawsnewid addysg uwch i fod yn fodel o ymarfer gorau.

O ran y bwch mewn cyllid cyfalaf, yr oeddwn, fel chi, yng nghyfarfod y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid, a phan ddaeth yr adroddiad gan lywodraeth leol, cofiwch i Dave Brown, swyddog cyllid gyda CLILC, ddweud eu bod am ei gwneud yn amlwg nad oeddent yn disgwyl i hyn i gyd ddod oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a oedd yn rhyddhad, gan eu bod yn sôn am biliynau o bunnoedd. Dyna oedd y gwir amdani. Yr hyn a wnaethpwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn oedd nodi'r diffyg. Yr oedd yn realistig ynglŷn â'r hyn y gallwn ei ddarparu. Gwelwyd newid sylfaenol mewn darpariaeth gyfalaf. Mewn meysydd megis rheoli gwastraff, yr ydym yn sôn yma am gynlluniau sylweddol, ac mae'n ddigon amlwg y bydd peth o'r buddsoddiad hwn yn dod o'r sector preifat.

O ran y gyllideb, yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf gwyddoch ein bod wedi rhoi



capital investment. That has to be capital investment on a proper asset-management base, because we are now picking up an under-investment over many years, so you get to the state where the actual asset has deteriorated so much that it has to be renewed completely. The plus of that, sometimes, is that you can put in energy-efficiency measures and sustainability measures, but, really, what we have to move through is building and developing capital assets in which we put proper resources over the years to maintain, modernise and keep them up to standard.

**Nick Bourne:** First, I thank the Minister for her statement and for the briefing that she gave me before the session started, when she must have been extremely busy; I am very grateful for that.

I will take the statement in terms of the four areas on which it concentrated. First, the active lifestyle £4 million commitment of capital funding is very welcome—that is good news. I simply ask—and I am sure that this has been taken on board—that there be facilities for the disabled. I know that the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 will involve requirements there anyway, but if we are able to go beyond those, it would be very welcome. I would also like an assurance that this is across the spectrum of all ages. I am sure that there is a concentration on the young, but we need to look at all ages, and I would welcome an assurance from the Minister that that will be incorporated. Subject to those assurances, we welcome that.

The second element of the statement concentrated on access for the disabled to further education colleges and some Cadw projects. Much is also being done in the private sector in terms of innovative projects. The Minister referred to those in Cadw, but it is being done elsewhere. However, that money is well spent, and we certainly support that.

blaenoriaeth i fuddsoddiad cyfalaf. Rhaid i hynny fod yn fuddsoddiad cyfalaf ar sail rheoli asedau gwirioneddol, oherwydd ein bod yn ceisio gwneud iawn am ddiffyg buddsoddi dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd, felly yr ydych yn cyrraedd y cyflwr lle mae'r ased gwirioneddol wedi dirywio i'r fath raddau fel bod rhaid ei adnewyddu'n llwyr. Ochr bositif hynny, weithiau, yw bod modd ymgorffori mesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni a mesurau cynaliadwyedd, ond, a dweud y gwir, yr hyn yr ydym yn gorfod ei wneud yw adeiladu a datblygu asedau cyfalaf lle yr ydym yn neilltuo adnoddau dros y blynyddoedd i'w cynnal, eu moderneiddio a'u cadw i'r safonau gofynnol.

**Nick Bourne:** Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ac am y briff a gefais ganddi cyn cychwyn y sesiwn, ar adeg pan oedd yn brysur dros ben; yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn iddi am hynny.

Yr wyf am ymdrin â'r datganiad trwy roi sylw i'r pedwar maes yr oedd yn canolbwyntio arnynt. Yn gyntaf, mae'r ymrwymiad o £4 miliwn o gyllid cyfalaf ar gyfer ffordd o fyw weithgar yn rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei groesawu—mae hynny'n newyddion da. Hoffwn ofyn—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hyn wedi derbyn sylw—bod cyfleusterau ar gael i bobl anabl. Gwn y bydd Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005 yn golygu gofynion o ran hyn beth bynnag, ond os gallwn fynd ymhellach na'r rhain, byddai hynny'n rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd hefyd y bydd hyn yn digwydd ar draws pob oed. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn canolbwyntio ar yr ifanc, ond mae angen inni edrych ar bob oed, a byddwn yn croesawu pe cawn sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd hynny'n cael ei ymgorffori. Yn amodol ar y sicrwydd hwnnw, yr ydym yn ei groesawu.

Yr oedd ail elfen y datganiad yn canolbwyntio ar fynediad i bobl anabl i golegau addysg bellach a rhai o brosiectau Cadw. Mae llawer o waith yn cael ei wneud yn y sector preifat o ran prosiectau arloesol. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y rhai yn Cadw, ond mae'n cael ei wneud mewn mannau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario'n ddoeth, ac yr ydym yn sicr yn cefnogi hynny.

The third element of the statement involved caring for the vulnerable. Some money was being allocated to substance misuse accommodation in Neath Port Talbot—and I have no problem with this as it seems to make a lot of sense and there is clearly a need for it there. There is a need for these projects throughout Wales, and I do not know whether the accommodation would just be for people in the Neath Port Talbot area, because there is also an unmet need in north Wales, for example, in Rhyl, where I visited a project on Friday. There is also an untapped need in mid and west Wales and so on. I do not know whether the facilities are just for Neath Port Talbot or whether they are available more widely, although the project is clearly based there.

Yr oedd trydedd elfen y datganiad yn ymwneud â gofalu am bobl agored i niwed. Yr oedd peth arian yn cael ei neilltuo i lety i bobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot—ac nid yw hynny'n broblem imi gan yr ymddengys ei fod yn gwneud llawer o synnwyr ac mae'n amlwg bod angen amdano yno. Mae angen am y prosiectau hyn ledled Cymru, ac wn i ddim a fyddai'r llety hwn ar gael i bobl yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn unig, oherwydd ceir angen nad yw'n cael ei ddiwallu yn y Gogledd hefyd, er enghraifft, yn y Rhyl, lle bûm yn ymweld â phrosiect ddydd Gwener. Ceir angen heb ei ddiwallu hefyd yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin ac yn y blaen. Ni wn a fydd y cyfleusterau ar gael i bobl yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn unig, ynteu a fyddant ar gael i bobl o ardal fwy eang, er ei bod yn amlwg fod y prosiect wedi ei leoli yno.

4.10 p.m.

With regard to the secure accommodation for young offenders in north Wales, the Minister will know that, when she told me about it at lunchtime, I welcomed it. It was ironic, therefore, that Carl Sargeant, who probably did not know about this when he made the point, seemed to find something funny, which was not remotely funny, about the Conservatives wanting to address issues of criminality and to stop recidivism, and he seemed to say that we should get tough with young offenders. Clearly, we should do that, but this will help with problems of recidivism and people going back into the community and reoffending. Therefore, we welcome that. As the Minister said, there is an issue about being close to family and friends and so forth. There is also an issue in north Wales in terms of the Welsh language for some people in secure accommodation, which this also helps to address.

O ran y llety diogel ar gyfer troseddwr yn y Gogledd, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol, pan soniodd amdano wrthyf amser cinio, fy mod yn ei groesawu. Yr oedd yn eironig, felly, fod Carl Sargeant, nad oedd o bosibl yn gwybod am hyn pan wnaeth y pwynt, yn ymddangos ei fod yn gweld rhywbeth yn ddoniol, ond nad oedd yn ddoniol o gwbl, ynglŷn ag awydd y Ceidwadwyr i wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â throreddolrwydd ac atal pobl rhag aildroseddu, ac ymddengys ei fod yn dweud y dylem fod yn llym â throreddwyr ifanc. Mae'n amlwg y dylem wneud hynny, ond bydd hyn yn helpu gyda phroblemau aildroseddu a phobl yn mynd yn ôl i'r gymuned ac yn aildroseddu. Felly, yr ydym yn croesawu hynny. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'n golygu cael bod yn agos at y teulu a chyfeillion ac yn y blaen. Mae mater y Gymraeg hefyd yn berthnasol yn y Gogledd yn achos rhai pobl mewn llety diogel, ac mae hyn yn helpu i ddatrys hynny hefyd.

The last element of the statement, with regard to energy efficiency, is a particular hobby-horse of mine. If there is anything that we can do to encourage recycling, and anything that we can do across the piece, and not just in the public sector—although I appreciate that much of this will be on the Assembly

Mae elfen olaf y datganiad, sef y cyfeiriad at effeithlonrwydd ynni, yn rhywbeth sy'n agos iawn at fy nghalon. Os oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud i annog ailgylchu, ac unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud yn gyffredinol, ac nid yn y sector cyhoeddus yn unig—er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi y bydd

estate—it must be done. However, if, at the same time, we are able to encourage others outside the Assembly and the public sector to follow good practice, all the better for that.

Clearly, £11 million goes some way, although it does not go as far as the Minister and all of us would want it to go. I do not criticise what is in it; there are elements outside of it that I am sure some Minister bid for but perhaps did not get. School refurbishment and repair and the building of social houses spring to mind as two areas that need to be considered. However, subject to that, we welcome the statement. I thank the Minister for bringing it forward and for the briefing that she gave me before the meeting started.

**Sue Essex:** I will take those points in order. The active lifestyle commitment clearly includes disabled people, and sometimes just a small amount of money can change the whole nature of having access to an area. It will be applied to all ages. I am aware that GPs are now prescribing activity as part of people's rehabilitation. Sometimes, that can be provided in the local park. It could be about just incorporating extra things, such as giving people information about the fact that if they walk around the park three times, it gives them a certain amount of exercise. So, it is about helping people to incorporate exercise and healthy living into their daily lives and encouraging others to take part. I think that the Green Gym scheme is a win-win scheme, because all this is about ensuring that you use existing facilities more intensively and extensively.

In terms of the money for the facility in Neath Port Talbot, it is operated by West Glamorgan Council on Alcohol and Drug Abuse Ltd. Edwina will have more details on that, but it is my understanding that it will take in people from beyond Neath Port Talbot. I think that it is an innovative scheme. You have to try new schemes. It is incorporating accommodation, but it is also giving people a chance to become familiar

llawer o hyn yn cael ei wneud ar ystâd y Cynulliad—mae'n rhaid ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, os oes modd inni, ar yr un pryd, annog eraill y tu allan i'r Cynulliad a'r sector cyhoeddus i ddilyn arferion da, yna gorau oll.

Yn amlwg, mae £11 miliwn yn gyfraniad gwerthfawr, er nad yw'n mynd cyn belled ag y byddai'r Gweinidog a phob un ohonom am iddo fynd. Nid wyf am feirniadu'r hyn sydd ynddo; yr wyf yn siŵr bod elfennau y tu allan iddo y mae rhyw Weinidog neu'i gilydd wedi gwneud cais amdano ond a fu'n aflwyddiannus, efallai. Mae adnewyddu a thrwsio ysgolion ac adeiladu tai cymdeithasol yn ddau faes sy'n dod i'r meddwl sydd angen cael eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, yn amodol ar hynny, yr ydym yn croesawu'r datganiad. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am godi'r mater ac am y briff a gefais ganddi cyn y cyfarfod.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf am ymdrin â'r pwyntiau hyn yn eu trefn. Mae'r ymrwymiad i ffordd o fyw weithgar yn amlwg yn cynnwys pobl anabl, ac weithiau bydd swm bychan yn unig o arian yn gallu newid holl natur mynediad mewn ardal. Bydd yn berthnasol i bob oed. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod meddygon teulu yn awr yn argymhell gweithgarwch corfforol fel rhan o adferiad pobl. Weithiau, gellir ei ddarparu yn y parc lleol. Efallai na fyddai'n golygu dim mwy nag ymgorffori pethau ychwanegol, megis rhoi gwybodaeth i bobl am y ffaith y byddai cerdded deirgwaith o amgylch y parc yn rhoi rhyw gymaint o ymarfer corff iddynt. Felly, mae'n golygu helpu pobl i ymgorffori ymarfer corff a byw'n iach yn eu bywyd bob dydd ac annog eraill i gymryd rhan. Yr wyf yn credu bod cynllun y Gampfa Werdd yn ennill ym mhob ffordd, oherwydd ei fod yn sicrhau eich bod yn defnyddio cyfleusterau sydd ar gael eisoes ac yn eu defnyddio mewn ffordd fwy dwys ac yn amlach.

O ran arian ar gyfer y cyfleuster yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, fe'i rhedir gan Gyngor Gorllewin Morgannwg ar Gamdefnyddio Alcohol a Chyffuriau Cyf. Bydd gan Edwina fwy o fanylion ar hynny, ond yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf bydd yn derbyn pobl o ardaloedd y tu hwnt i Gastell-nedd Port Talbot. Credaf ei fod yn gynllun arloesol. Rhaid rhoi cynnig ar gynlluniau newydd. Mae'n ymgorffori llety, ond mae

with the world of work. We can give you the details of this. You have to start somewhere, and, if it works, that model may be replicable elsewhere.

In terms of the secure accommodation, it is for youth offenders. All that we are saying for this is that it is not good that youngsters are forced to go outside of Wales. If you want those youngsters to be rehabilitated and to have visitors, and not to feel completely dislocated from their community, this is an absolutely essential idea. If Welsh-speaking youngsters, in particular, go beyond Wales, they are unable to use their language in the way that they need to use it.

On recycling, this is our estate or HE estates in terms of the whole environmental package. Putting our own house in order is fundamental, because it is no good preaching to others if you are not doing this yourself. I see no conflict in that. It is not a case of either/or because Carwyn's budget has pretty enormous sums that are included to support recycling.

On social housing and those wider things, in terms of the main budget spend when we had the three-year spending programme, there was a big chunk of extra money for social housing and housing for the elderly.

**Jenny Randerson:** In thanking you for this, Minister, I wish to ask you about the saving of £2 million to which you referred, which came from the central administration budget. It is my recollection, though I have not had a chance to check this, as I did not have sufficient time in advance to work this out, that this central administration money was allocated largely for the dispersal of Assembly offices and jobs outside Cardiff. Therefore, which aspect of the central administration budget is running so far behind schedule that you have not spent that money this year, or is there an aspect that has been cut? Which parts of Wales will be affected by this? It would be a matter of concern to people across parties, I believe, if there was to be anything more than a

hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i bobl gynefino â byd gwaith. Gallwn roi manylion i chi am hyn. Rhaid ichi ddechrau yn rhywle, ac, os yw'n llwyddo, gellir efelychu'r model hwnnw mewn ardaloedd eraill.

O ran y llety diogel, mae ar gael ar gyfer troseddwr ifanc. Yr unig beth yr ydym yn ei ddweud ynglŷn â hyn yw nad yw'n beth da fod pobl ifanc yn cael eu gorfodi i fynd y tu allan i Gymru. Os ydych am i'r bobl ifanc hyn gael eu hadsefydlu a chael ymwelwyr, ac i beidio â theimlo eu bod wedi eu hysgaru'n llwyr oddi wrth eu cymuned, mae hwn yn syniad cwbl hanfodol. Os yw siaradwyr Cymraeg ifanc, yn fwyaf arbennig, yn gorfod mynd y tu allan i Gymru, ni allant ddefnyddio eu hiaith yn y ffordd y mae angen iddynt ei defnyddio.

O ran ailgylchu, mae hyn yn golygu ein hystâd ni neu ystadau addysg uwch o ran y pecyn amgylcheddol cyfan. Mae rhoi trefn ar ein hystâd ni ein hunain yn rhywbeth sylfaenol, oherwydd nid oes diben pregethu wrth eraill os nad ydych chi'n gwneud hyn eich hun. Ni allaf weld gwrthdaro yn hyn o beth. Nid yw'n fater o un ai/neu gan fod gan gyllideb Carwyn symiau sylweddol iawn sydd wedi eu cynnwys i gefnogi ailgylchu.

O ran tai cymdeithasol a'r materion ehangach hynny, a gwariant y brif gyllideb pan oedd gennym y rhaglen wario dair-blynedd, yr oedd talp mawr o arian ychwanegol ar gael, ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol a thai i bobl hŷn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Wrth ddiolch ichi am hyn, Weinidog, hoffwn ofyn ichi am yr arbediad o £2 miliwn y cyfeiriasoch ato, a ddaeth o'r gyllideb weinyddu ganolog. Os wyf yn cofio'n iawn, er na chefais gyfle i gadarnhau hyn, gan na chefais ddigon o amser o flaen llaw i wneud y swm hwn, yr oedd yr arian hwn ar gyfer gweinyddu canolog wedi'i ddyrannu'n bennaf i wasgaru swyddfeydd a swyddi'r Cynulliad o Gaerdydd. Felly, pa agwedd ar y gyllideb gweinyddu canolog sydd wedi rhedeg mor hwyr fel nad ydych wedi gwario'r arian hwnnw eleni, neu a oes rhyw agwedd ar hyn sydd wedi'i thorri? Pa rannau o Gymru y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt? Byddai'n destun pryder i rai ym mhob plaid, yr wyf yn credu, pe byddai mwy nag oedi dros dro ar y

temporary delay in the dispersal of jobs away from Cardiff.

This is a list of worthy projects; I do not believe that anyone would object to them. Inevitably, at this stage of the year, however, it is a scattergun approach. I say 'inevitably', although I wonder whether it is inevitable, and whether a more strategic approach would be more effective. I know what happens, Minister; other Ministers come to you with a little shopping list of projects, of things that have overrun or that they cannot fund out of current budgets and so on, and you seek to accommodate their needs. However, £11 million is a small amount of money in public spending terms. It might be helpful if you could explain the reasoning for each of these projects. I do not want you to go into that level of detail now, but it would be helpful to know whether one of your lines of thinking in giving this money might have been that some Ministers, who had a pretty lean time of it back in the budget round, are getting a little extra to compensate them now. If that is your thinking, it would be helpful for us to know that.

Beyond that, this is, literally, a shopping list of projects, all of which are worthy in their way, and all of which I believe we would support. None of them comes through as being in any way being controversial. I would be grateful for some more details.

**Sue Essex:** The £2 million is from the location strategy, where we have not spent as much as we had anticipated. Therefore, that is a straight drop across. It will come primarily from the Llandudno Junction building, as it is three or four months ahead of schedule. You profile your spend per year, and we will be able to use that money, so rather than it just going into reserves, we put it in to top up the Gordon Brown money. It was Gordon Brown money—it was extra money that we had over and above what we had at the budget. Therefore, it is for this financial year, and I made a commitment in Plenary that we would use it to what I thought was best effect.

broses o wasgaru swyddi o Gaerdydd.

Mae hon yn rhestr brosiectau deilwng; nid wyf yn credu y byddai neb yn eu gwrthwynebu. Mae'n anochel, ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, y ceir dull gweithredu gwasgarog. Defnyddiais y gair 'anochel', er fy mod yn amau tybed a yw'n anochel, ac a fyddai dull gweithredu mwy strategol yn fwy effeithiol. Yr wyf yn gwybod beth sydd yn digwydd, Weinidog; daw Gweinidogion eraill atoch gyda rhestr fach o brosiectau, o bethau sydd wedi rhedeg yn hwyr neu bethau na allant eu hariannu o'r cyllidebau presennol, ac yn y blaen, ac yr ydych yn ceisio diwallu eu hanghenion. Fodd bynnag, mae £11 filiwn yn swm bach o arian yng nghyd-destun gwariant cyhoeddus. Gallai fod o gymorth pe gallech egluro'r sail resymegol i bob un o'r prosiectau hyn. Nid wyf yn dymuno ichi fynd i gymaint â hynny o fanylion yn awr, ond byddai'n fuddiol cael gwybod ai un o'r pethau a oedd gennych mewn cof wrth roi'r arian hwn oedd bod rhai Gweinidogion, y bu braidd yn fain arnynt yng nghylch y gyllideb, yn cael ychydig yn ychwaneg i wneud iawn am hynny'n awr. Os felly yr ydych yn meddwl, byddai'n fuddiol inni gael gwybod hynny.

Heblaw am hynny, mae hyn, yn llythrennol, yn rhestr siopa o brosiectau, y mae pob un ohonynt yn deilwng ar ryw olwg, ac yn rhai y byddem yn eu cefnogi, yr wyf yn credu. Nid oes yr un ohonynt sydd yn ymddangos yn ddadleuol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael mwy o fanylion.

**Sue Essex:** Daw'r £2 filiwn o'r strategaeth lleoli, lle nad ydym wedi gwario cymaint ag yr oeddem wedi'i ragweld. Felly, mae'r swm hwnnw wedi'i drosglwyddo'n uniongyrchol. Daw'n bennaf o'r arian ar gyfer adeilad Cyffordd Llandudno, gan ei fod dri neu bedwar mis o flaen yr amserlen. Gwneir proffil o wariant bob blwyddyn, a byddwn yn gallu defnyddio'r arian hwnnw, felly'n hytrach na'i roi mewn cronfa wrth gefn, fe'i rhoesom ar ben arian Gordon Brown. Arian oddi wrth Gordon Brown ydoedd—arian ychwanegol ar ben yr hyn a oedd yn y gyllideb. Felly, mae ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon, a gwneuthum ymrwymiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y byddem yn ei ddefnyddio

yn y modd a oedd yn fwyaf effeithiol yn fy ngolwg i.

I am not sure whether you said that you were for or against this spend. You cannot have it both ways, Jenny. Either you think that it is sensible and good, which I believe everyone else has said, or you are against it. It is not compensation for any individual Ministers. I will tell you exactly what happened. I wrote to all Ministers, saying that we had this extra sum of money that we needed to spend in this financial year, and asked them whether there were things in their area that were really deserving this time, which could also be cross-cutting, if we could manage it, and which would make a real difference to people's lives.

Sometimes, small sums of money can do a hell of a lot of good. The access issue came forward, which Alun and I were thinking about—Alun was thinking of the voluntary sector, and I was thinking of local government in terms of parks, footpaths, and so on. We suddenly realised that a small sum of money could transform some of these areas. Imagine a small community hall that has a keep-fit group, but does not have proper changing rooms or equipment. How sensible, through a grants system, to give a small amount of money to that group. It would give it a great deal of encouragement, and would match our aspirations across the piece on Health Challenge Wales. Similarly, with the Disability Discrimination Act 2005, putting that extra money in can potentially open up access to further education to a whole new range of people.

4.20 p.m.

Therefore, it is not just a shopping list that has been drawn together; it has been thought through based on my colleagues' submissions and on the priorities that we think are right. I would hope that, like everyone else here, you can say, 'We were not expecting to get £9 million of that £11 million that we got from the Chancellor; let us spend it wisely, and really make a difference'. That is what the package is about and I commend it to you.

Nid wyf yn sicr a ddywedasoeh a oeddech o blaid neu yn erbyn y gwariant hwn. Ni allwch ei chael bob ffordd, Jenny. Un ai yr ydych yn credu bod hyn yn dda ac yn synhwyrol, fel y dywedodd pawb arall, yr wyf yn credu, neu yr ydych yn ei erbyn. Nid yw'n iawndal i unrhyw Weinidogion neilltuol. Dywedaf wrthych beth yn union a ddigwyddodd. Ysgrifennais at yr holl Weinidogion, gan ddweud bod y swm ychwanegol hwn gennym a bod rhaid inni ei wario yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, a gofynnais iddynt a oedd unrhyw bethau yn eu meysydd a oedd yn wirioneddol haeddiannol y tro hwn, ac a allai fod yn rhai trawsbynciol hefyd, os gallem lwyddo i sicrhau hynny, ac a fyddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol ym mywydau pobl.

Weithiau, gall symiau bach o arian wneud byd o les. Cododd mater mynediad, y bu Alun a minnau'n meddwl yn ei gylch—bu Alun yn meddwl am y sector gwirfoddol, a minnau am lywodraeth leol yng nghydestun parciau, llwybrau troed, ac yn y blaen. Yn sydyn, sylweddolasom y gallai swm bach o arian drawsnewid rhai o'r manau hynny. Meddyliwch am neuadd gymunedol fach sydd â grŵp cadw'n heini, ond sydd heb ystafelloedd newid neu gyfarpar priodol. Peth synhwyrol iawn fyddai rhoi symiau bach o arian i grŵp o'r fath, drwy system grantiau. Byddai'n rhoi hwb mawr iddo, ac yn cydfynd â'n dyheadau cyffredinol mewn cysylltiad â Her Iechyd Cymru. Yn yr un modd, yn achos Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005, gallai arian ychwanegol o'r fath gynnig mynediad i addysg bellach i amrywiaeth fawr o bobl o'r newydd.

Felly, mae'n rhywbeth amgenach na chasgliad o bethau mewn rhestr siopa; fe'i hystyriwyd yn drwyadl ar sail ceisiadau gan fy nghyd-Weinidogion a'r blaenoriaethau sydd yn briodol, yn ein barn ni. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn gallu dweud, fel pawb arall sydd yma, 'Nid oeddem yn disgwyl cael £9 miliwn o'r £11 filiwn hwnnw a gawsom gan y Canghellor; gadewch inni ei wario'n ddoeth, a gwneud gwahaniaeth

gwirioneddol'. Dyna bwrpas y pecyn hwn ac yr wyf yn ei gymeradwyo i chi.

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw'r busnes cyfreithiol a chynigion eraill y Llywodraeth, yr wyf am wneud datganiad byr yn dilyn y pwynt o drefn a godwyd gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad cyn dechrau'r ddadl ar gynnig arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, wythnos yn ôl. Mewn ymateb i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gwneuthum sicrhau y byddwn yn ceisio gweithredu yn briodol i sicrhau y câi unrhyw gynnig neu welliant o bwys cyfreithiol a ddeuai ger ein bron ei gyfeirio ataf ar ffurf ddrafft, yn lle fy mod yn dod eto i'r sefyllfa resynus o orfod atal cynnig rhag mynd yn ei flaen, serch ei fod wedi cael ei dderbyn gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we discuss the legal business and other motions of the Government, I will make a brief statement following the point of order that was raised by the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside before the start of the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group's debate on a proposal under Standing Order No. 31 a week ago. In response to that point of order, I gave an assurance that I would seek to take appropriate steps to ensure that any motion or amendment of legal significance coming before us would first be referred to me in draft form, to prevent our returning to the regrettable situation of having to prevent a motion from proceeding, despite its having been accepted by the Table Office.

Gallaf roi gwybod i Aelodau fod gweithdrefn felly bellach yn ei lle ac y bydd cynigion a gwelliannau y mae angen cyngor cyfreithiol arnynt yn cael eu cyfeirio'n awtomatig ar gyfer y cyngor hwnnw cyn gynted â phosibl, gan osgoi, gobeithiaf, yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn anffodus iawn i ymgais gwbl deg arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wythnos yn ôl.

I can now inform Members that such a procedure has now been put in place, so that motions and amendments requiring legal advice are referred automatically for that advice as soon as possible, thereby avoiding, I would hope, a repeat of what happened most regrettably to the entirely fair attempt of the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group a week ago.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf wedi rhoi rhybudd i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon fy mod yn bwriadu codi'r pwynt hwn, sy'n mynd yn ôl i'r pwynt o drefn a godais gyda'r Llywydd ar 9 Tachwedd 2005, a hynny'n dilyn penderfyniad y Cynulliad ar 11 Hydref i ohirio'r broses o uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg hyd nes bod cynnig arall a oedd yn dderbyniol i'r Cynulliad yn cael ei dderbyn. Gwrthododd y Gweinidog roi addewid i'r Cynulliad bryd hynny y byddai'r gwaith o uno yn cael ei ohirio. Fodd bynnag, ymatebodd y Prif Weinidog gan ddweud bod y Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cario ymlaen gyda'r gwaith o baratoi ar gyfer ail osodiad y

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. I have notified the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport that I will be raising this point, which goes back to the point of order that I raised with the Presiding Officer on 9 November 2005, following the Assembly resolution of 11 October to postpone the process of merging the Welsh Language Board until another motion that was acceptable to the Assembly was carried. The Minister refused to pledge to the Assembly at that time that the process of merging the board would be postponed. However, the First Minister responded by saying that the Government intended to continue with the preparatory work on the second matter in the

cynnig. Yn sgil hynny, penderfynodd y Llywodraeth i beidio â sefydlu tîm prosiect a fyddai'n arwain y gwaith o uno'r bwrdd. Dyna oedd y sefyllfa tan yn gynharach eleni pan gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth bapur ymgynghorol ar ddyfodol y bwrdd.

Er ei bod bellach wedi gwneud datganiad na fydd dim yn digwydd tan ar ôl 2007, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gosod proses yn ei lle yn barod i uno'r bwrdd. Sefydlwyd pwyllgor ym mis Mehefin sydd wedi cyfarfod ym mis Gorffennaf a deallwn ei fod yn cyfarfod yn fisol hyd ddiwedd y flwyddyn. Y cwestiwn i chi, Lywydd, fel ceidwad y Rheolau Sefydlog a'n gweithrediadau ni, yw penderfynu ble mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n sefyll mewn perthynas â'r cynnig gwreiddiol a dderbyniwyd. O'm dehongliad i, mae'n amlwg ei fod yn mynd yn groes i'r penderfyniad. Os ydym yn credu hynny, beth sy'n ymarferol bosibl i ni ei wneud i ddwyn y Llywodraeth hon i gyfrif am ei gweithrediadau?

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** Further to that point of order, the Assembly Government will always fully respect all motions passed by the Assembly. It is not a question of my understanding of what a motion means or, with the greatest respect, of the leader of the opposition's understanding of the text of a motion; if there is any doubt, we always take legal advice on the precise legal meaning of Assembly resolutions. I certainly would not instruct officials, incur public expenditure or do anything that was contrary to the legal meaning of any resolution passed by the Assembly.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn diolch i arweinydd yr wrthblaid am ei bwyt o drefn ac i'r Gweinidog am y sicrwydd a roddodd. Diolchaf hefyd am y rhybudd ynglŷn â'r pwynt hwn, sydd wedi fy ngalluogi i weld fy mod yn cytuno â'r hyn a ddywedais ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd. I grynhoi yr ymateb hwnnw, yr hyn a bwysais arno oedd yr hyn a gadarnhawyd gan y Gweinidog, sef bod angen i bob Aelod gydymffurfio â chynigion a dderbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig yn achos Llywodraeth

motion. As a result, the Government decided not to establish a project team to take the lead on the work of merging the board. That was the position until earlier this year when the Government published a consultation document on the future of the board.

Although it has now declared that nothing will happen until after 2007, the Government has already put a process in place for the merger of the board. A committee was established in June, it held its first meeting in July and we understand that it will meet on a monthly basis until the end of the year. The question for you, Presiding Officer, as the custodian of our Standing Orders and of our procedures, is to decide where that work stands in relation to the original motion that was carried. From my interpretation, it is obvious that it is in breach of that resolution. If we believe that, what is practicably possible for us to do if we are to hold this Government to account for its actions?

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad bob amser yn llawn barchu'r holl gynigion sydd yn cael eu derbyn gan y Cynulliad. Nid yr hyn yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall yw ystyr cynnig sydd yn bwysig neu, gyda phob parch, yr hyn y mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn ei ddeall yw ystyr y geiriau mewn cynnig; os oes unrhyw amheuaeth, yr ydym bob amser yn cymryd cyngor cyfreithiol ar union ystyr cyfreithiol penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad. Yn sicr, ni fyddwn yn cyfarwyddo swyddogion, yn gwario arian cyhoeddus nac yn gwneud dim a oedd yn groes i ystyr cyfreithiol unrhyw benderfyniad gan y Cynulliad.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the leader of the opposition for his point of order and to the Minister for the assurance that he gave. I also thank him for notifying me of this point, which enabled me to see that I agree with what I said last November. To summarise that response, what I pressed upon him then was what has now been confirmed by the Minister, namely that every Member needs to comply with motions that have been carried by the Assembly. That is especially important in the case of the Government of



Cymru, am ei bod yn ffurfio Cabinet y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, dywedais hefyd nad mater i mi yw dehongli geiriad cynigion na phenderfynu a thafoli ynghylch y cydymffurfio. Felly, yn y sefyllfa hon, nid wyf am ddatgan ymhellach—ond nid wyf ychwaith am dderbyn gwahoddiad arweinydd yr wrthblaid i'w gynghori'n gyhoeddus ynghylch y dulliau eraill y gallai gwrthbleidiau ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad eu defnyddio i wrthwynebu unrhyw weithredu ar ran y Llywodraeth.

Dywedaf yn unig ei bod yn briodol inni godi ein golygon tuag at 2007, a meddwl am ba weithdrefnau fydd yn briodol mewn sefyllfa gyfansoddiadol newydd. Pan neu os caiff Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru y Cydsyniad Brenhinol y mis hwn—ac yr wyf yn ymgroesi wrth ddweud hynny—byddwn mewn sefyllfa gyfansoddiadol newydd. Unwaith y bydd y Llywodraeth honno yn Llywodraeth o Weinidogion y Goron, mewn Cabinet, a'r Cynulliad hwn yn annibynnol o'r Llywodraeth honno, ni fydd y dulliau o alw'r Llywodraeth i gyfrif—gan gynnwys cynigion sy'n cyfarwyddo'r Llywodraeth, fel a ddaeth ger ein bron ynglŷn â'r bwrdd iaith, ac sydd ger ein bron y prynhawn hwn mewn gwelliant pellach ar yr un pwnc, a chynigion i ddirprwyo pwerau sy'n perthyn i'r Cynulliad i'r Prif Weinidog—yn rhai addas ac mewn trefn i'w trafod, oherwydd nid dyna'r math o gyfansoddiad a fydd gennym. Fodd bynnag, bydd ystod o dulliau eraill ar gael, o bosibl, gan gynnwys dulliau cyllido llawer mwy effeithiol, pan ddeuwn i bleidleisio ar hawl y Llywodraeth i dynnu gwariant o'r gronfa gryswth Gymreig newydd a fydd yn cael ei ffurfio. Nid wyf am fynd ymhellach ar hynny heddiw, neu gallwn innau hefyd gael fy nghyhuddo o athronyddu.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae'n amlwg, os caf gyfeirio'n fyr at ymateb y Gweinidog, fod y gwaith hwn yn cael ei fwrw ymlaen. Dywedodd yn glir y bu iddo gael cyngor cyfreithiol sydd, dywed ef, yn caniatáu i'r Llywodraeth gario ymlaen. Oni gredwch, felly, ei bod yn briodol bod gan Aelodau cyffredin y Cynulliad hefyd yr hawl i gymryd cyngor cyfreithiol gan swyddogion y Cynulliad, a hynny er mwyn herio penderfyniad y Llywodraeth o bosibl?

Wales, as it forms the Assembly Cabinet. However, I also said that it is not a matter for me to interpret the wording of motions or to decide and to weigh up whether there has been compliance. Therefore, in this situation, I will make no further pronouncements—but nor will I accept the leader of the opposition's invitation to advise him publicly of what other methods opposition parties and Assembly Members could use to oppose any actions on the part of the Government.

I will say only that it may be appropriate for us to set our sights higher ready for 2007, and to consider which procedures would be appropriate in a new constitutional order. If and when the Government of Wales Bill receives Royal Assent this month—and I cross myself as I say that—we will be in a new constitutional order. Once that Government is one made up of Ministers of the Crown, forming a Cabinet, and this Assembly is independent of that Government, the methods of calling the Government to account—such as motions directing the Government, as was before us regarding the Welsh Language Board, and as is before us in a further amendment on the same topic this afternoon, and motions to delegate the powers of the Assembly to the First Minister—will not be appropriate or in order for us to debate, as we will not have that kind of constitution. However, a range of other methods will be at our disposal, possibly including far more effective funding mechanisms, when we come to vote on the Government's right to draw down funds from the new Welsh consolidated fund that will be created. I will not say anything further on that today, or I too could be accused of philosophising.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further to that point of order, if I may briefly refer to the Minister's response, it is obvious that this work is going on. He said clearly that he took legal advice, which, so he says, allowed the Government to carry on. Do you not believe, therefore, that it would be appropriate for ordinary Members of the Assembly also to have the right to take legal advice from Assembly officials, even if that were in order to challenge a Government decision?

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n gwbl agored i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad geisio cyngor cyfreithiol ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad. Nid oes cwestiwn ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog wedi datgan yn glir fod y Cabinet wedi cymryd cyngor cyfreithiol, a rhaid derbyn bod hwnnw'n benderfyniad i'r Cabinet, a'i fod wedi gweithredu'n ddilys o fewn y cyngor cyfreithiol hwnnw. Mae'r hyn sy'n briodol i'r Llywodraeth hefyd yn briodol i'r wrthblaid—dyna yw democratiaeth. Felly, tybiwn fod y drws yn agored, ond peidiwch â mynd i rhyw gost enfawr am gyngor cyfreithiol, Mr arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Dyna'r unig gyngor sydd gennyf. Nid awn ymhellach ar hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Every Assembly Member is perfectly entitled to seek legal advice on matters pertaining to Assembly procedures. There is no question about that. However, the Minister has stated clearly that the Cabinet took legal advice, and we must accept that that is the Cabinet's decision and that it acted in good faith, based on that legal advice. What is appropriate for the Government is also appropriate for the opposition—that is the essence of democracy. Therefore, I would imagine that the door is open to you, but do not go to enormous expense to get legal advice, Mr leader of the opposition. That is my only advice. We will not take that any further.

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 Approval of the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*considers the principle of the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3177)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3178)*

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3177)*

Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3178)*

**David Lloyd:** Plaid Cymru is happy to support these regulations. There was a debate in the Local Government and Public Services Committee about the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, revolving, as they do, around community council nominations through a local authority standards committee. The clarification that is required is on the fact that this is a local authority standards committee, but it involves community council nominations. Presumably, it is just a matter of the community councils in that area getting together to make a nomination. There is no question that the local authority can veto the community council nomination. With that one caveat, we are happy to support these regulations.

**David Lloyd:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Bu dadl yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus am Reoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, a oedd, fel dadleuon eraill o'r fath, yn troi o gylch enwebiadau gan gynghorau cymuned drwy bwyllgor safonau awdurdod lleol. Mae angen eglurhad ar y ffaith mai pwyllgor safonau awdurdod lleol yw hwn, ond ei fod yn cynnwys rhai a enwebwyd gan gynghorau cymuned. Gellir cymryd bod hynny'n golygu bod y cynghorau cymuned mewn ardal benodol yn dod at ei gilydd i enwebu rhywun. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r awdurdod lleol yn gallu rhoi feto ar enwebiad y cyngor cymuned. Gyda'r un cafeat hwnnw, yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn.

4.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** Let me reiterate that where there is more than one community council in the area, the aim is to get them to come up with one name, which would then be ratified by the council. Should that not happen, someone will have to make a decision and it will be made by the county council. However, we stress that if community councils can come together and put forward one preferred name for the standards committee that would solve the problem.

**Sue Essex:** Gadewch imi ailadrodd os oes mwy nag un cyngor cymuned yn yr ardal, y nod yw iddynt gynnig un enw, y byddai'r cyngor ei gadarnhau. Oni fydd hynny'n digwydd, bydd yn rhaid i rywun wneud penderfyniad a'r cyngor sir a fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiwn os gall cynghorau cymuned ddod ynghyd â chynnig un enw sydd orau ganddynt ar gyfer y pwyllgor safonau byddai hynny'n datrys y broblem.

*Cynnig (NDM3177): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3177): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3178): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3178): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cafu-caffa mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Kava-kava in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006**

**The Minister for Health and Social Service (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Kava-kava in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3179)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Kava-kava in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Kava-kava in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006;*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cafu-caffa mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3179)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cafu-caffa mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cafu-caffa mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006;*

*b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006; and*

*b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006; ac*

*c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3180)*

*c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3180)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes neb am siarad ar y rheoliadau hyn, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** No-one wishes to speak on these regulations, therefore we move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3179): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3179): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3180): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3180): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006  
Approval of the Contaminants in Food (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006**

**The Minister for Health and Social Service (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Contaminants in Food (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3181)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Contaminants in Food (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Contaminants in Food (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3182)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes neb am siarad ar y rheoliadau hyn, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3181)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006, ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3182)*

**The Presiding Officer:** No-one wishes to speak to these regulations, therefore we move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3181): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3181): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter



Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3182): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3182): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub  
 (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006**

**Approval of the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006**

Motion (NDM3183): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3183): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
 Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to issue guidance to fire and rescue authorities on the circumstances in which charges should be levied for the services specified under this Order.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that this Order excludes provision for fire and rescue authorities to charge owners or occupiers for attending repeated false alarms generated by an automatic fire alarm system.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*in the context of section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, directs the Welsh Assembly Government to provide greater clarity on the circumstances in which fire and rescue authorities may charge for advice given to persons in relation to premises where a trade, business or other undertaking is carried on.*

Motion (NDM3184): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 i NDM3183 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**The Minister for Social Justice and**

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi canllawiau i'r awdurdodau tân ac achub ynghylch yr amgylchiadau lle y dylid codi tâl am wasanaethau a bennir dan y Gorchymyn hwn.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad yw'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cynnwys darpariaeth i'r awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl ar berchnogion neu breswylwyr am ymateb i alwadau di-sail a gynhrychir gan systemau larwm tân awtomatig dro ar ôl tro.*

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yng nghyd-destun adran 6 o Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i egluro'n well dan ba amgylchiadau y caiff awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl am gyngor a roddir i bobl ynglŷn ag eiddo lle mae rhywun yn masnachu, neu'n cadw busnes neu ymgymeriad arall.*

Cynnig (NDM3184): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 to NDM3183 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder**

**Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3183)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 4 July 2006 in relation to the draft the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006. (NDM3184)*

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose the following amendments to NDM3183 in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to issue guidance to fire and rescue authorities on the circumstances in which charges should be levied for the services specified under this Order.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that this Order excludes provision for fire and rescue authorities to charge owners or occupiers for attending repeated false alarms generated by an automatic fire alarm system.*

**Cymdeithasol ac Adfwyio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3183)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 4 Gorffennaf 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3184)*

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol i NDM3183 yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi canllawiau i'r awdurdodau tân ac achub ynghylch yr amgylchiadau lle y dylid codi tâl am wasanaethau a bennir dan y Gorchymyn hwn.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu nad yw'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cynnwys darpariaeth i'r awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl ar berchnogion neu breswylwyr am ymateb i alwadau di-sail a gynhrychir gan systemau larwm tân awtomatig dro ar ôl tro.*

I propose amendment 3 to NDM3183. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*in the context of section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, directs the Welsh Assembly Government to provide greater clarity on the circumstances in which fire and rescue authorities may charge for advice given to persons in relation to premises where a trade, business or other undertaking is carried on.*

Amendment 1 instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to issue guidance to fire and rescue authorities on the circumstances in which charges should be levied for the services specified under this Order. The charging for many of these services, such as the hiring out and provision of equipment, should not be open to any misinterpretation or confusion. However, charging for services such as the removal of water, entry to or egress from premises, and the rescuing of persons from lift cabins requires greater clarification if it is not to be open to possible misinterpretation and confusion. Few would argue that charging would be inappropriate if a service was abused. However, it would be contentious and controversial if charges were applied to domestic or commercial premises in respect of these services where repeat callouts have not occurred and where the degree of householder and/or occupier responsibility is open to valid dispute.

Amendment 2 expresses regret that this Order excludes provision for fire and rescue authorities to charge owners or occupiers for attending repeated false alarms generated by an automatic fire alarm system. When the Minister responded on this issue last month, she stated that further work was required in relation to automatic fire alarm policy and that, prior to considering extending existing chargeable activities, the Assembly Government would undertake further consultation, and that that remained the position.

It is highly regrettable that that remains the position as we are asked to vote on this Order, given the briefing paper to members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee provided by North Wales Fire

Cynigiau welliant 3 i NDM3183. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*ynghyd-destun adran 6 o Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i egluro'n well dan ba amgylchiadau y caiff awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl am gyngor a roddir i bobl ynghlân ag eiddo lle mae rhywun yn masnachu, neu'n cadw busnes neu ymgymeriad arall.*

Mae gwelliant 1 yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi arweiniad i awdurdodau tân ac achub ynghlân â than ba amgylchiadau y dylid codi tâl am y gwasanaethau a bennir dan y Gorchymyn hwn. Ni ddylai fod unrhyw gamddechongli na dryswch ynghlân â chodi tâl am y gwasanaethau hyn, megis hurio a darparu cyfarpar. Fodd bynnag, mae angen rhagor o eglurhad ynghlân â chodi tâl am wasanaethau megis symud dŵr, cael mynediad i eiddo neu fynd allan o eiddo, ac achub pobl o gabanau lifftiau er mwyn sicrhau na fydd modd camddechongli pethau a chreu dryswch. Go brin y byddai neb yn dadlau y byddai'n amhriodol codi tâl pe câi gwasanaeth ei gamddefnyddio. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n ddadleuol ac yn gynhennus pe codid taliadau ar eiddo domestig neu fasnachol parthed y gwasanaethau hynny oni fu galwadau am yr eildro ac os yw maint cyfrifoldeb deiliad y tŷ a/neu'r preswlydd yn fater o drafod dilys.

Yng ngwelliant 2 gresynir nad yw'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cynnwys darpariaeth i awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl ar berchnogion neu breswylwyr am iddynt fynd allan yn sgîl galwadau di-sail dro ar ôl tro a achosir gan systemau larwm tân awtomatig. Pan ymatebodd y Gweinidog ynghylch y mater hwn fis diwethaf, dywedodd fod angen rhagor o waith parthed y polisi larymau tân awtomatig ac y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, cyn ystyried ymestyn y gweithgareddau presennol y mae modd codi tâl amdanynt, yn ymgynghori rhagor, ac mai dyna oedd y sefyllfa o hyd.

Y mae'n resynus iawn mai dyna yw'r sefyllfa o hyd a ninnau ar fin pleidleisio ar y Gorchymyn hwn, o ystyried y papur briffio a roddwyd i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio gan Awdurdod

and Rescue Authority. It was keen to emphasise an area that it believed was an omission and to seek a provision in this Order to charge the owner or occupier for attending repeated false alarms generated by an automatic fire alarm system. Its representatives stated that there were 2,993 false alarms due to automatic fire alarms in north Wales in 2005-06, and that the figure has been consistent over the past few years, in contrast to the other major areas of operational activity, which the authority has been successful in reducing. They further stated that responding to false alarms from automatic fire alarms was a considerable drain, both financially and in terms of time.

In the context of section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, amendment 3 directs the Welsh Assembly Government to provide greater clarity as to the circumstances in which fire and rescue authorities may charge for advice given to persons in relation to a premises where a trade, business or other undertaking is carried out. Currently, if a fire officer is carrying out an inspection of a business premises and finds, for instance, that a door closure or smoke alarm is not working, his or her duty is to inform the proprietor and to ensure that the matter is put right as soon as possible, with a follow-up inspection accordingly. Businesses rely completely on the unparalleled and highly professional expertise offered freely by the fire authorities, and good communication and honesty in relationships between businesses and the fire and rescue service is essential.

Under section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, each fire and rescue authority must undertake fire safety work in its area, and providing advice on community safety is not chargeable. Each authority must make reasonable arrangements for providing advice on the prevention of fires, restricting the spread of fires and means of escape, but otherwise, it has discretion over what advice it should charge for. In apparent contradiction of that, however, this Order states that fire and rescue authorities can charge for

Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru. Yr oedd yn awyddus i bwysleisio maes y credai iddo gael ei hepgor a cheisio darpariaeth yn y Gorchymyn hwn i godi tâl ar berchnogion neu breswylwyr am fynd allan dro ar ôl tro oherwydd galwadau di-sail a achosir gan system larwm tân awtomatig. Dywedodd ei gynrychiolwyr y bu 2,993 o alwadau di-sail oherwydd larymau tân awtomatig yng ngogledd Cymru yn 2005-06, ac y bu'r ffigur yn gyson yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn wahanol i'r meysydd gwaith eraill, lle llwyddodd yr awdurdod i'w lleihau. Dywedasant hefyd fod ateb galwadau di-sail larymau tân awtomatig yn straen sylweddol, yn ariannol ac o ran amser.

Yng nghyd-destun adran 6 Deddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, mae gwelliant 3 yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnig rhagor o eglurder ynglŷn â than ba amgylchiadau y caiff awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl am gyngor a roddir i bobl parthed eiddo lle mae masnach, busnes neu waith arall yn mynd rhagddo. Ar hyn o bryd, os yw swyddog tân yn arolygu eiddo busnes ac yn darganfod, er enghraifft, nad yw drws yn cau'n iawn neu nad yw synhwyrydd mwg yn gweithio, mae dyletswydd arno ef neu arni hi i hysbysu'r perchennog a sicrhau y caiff y mater ei unioni cyn gynted ag y bo modd, gan ddod yn ôl ac arolygu'r eiddo drachefn fel bo'n briodol. Mae busnesau'n dibynnu'n llwyr ar yr arbenigedd dihafal a hynod broffesiynol a gynigir yn hael gan awdurdodau tân, ac mae cyfathrebu da a gonestrwydd yn y berthynas rhwng busnesau a'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub yn hanfodol.

Dan adran 6 Deddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod tân ac achub wneud gwaith diogelwch tân yn ei ardal, ac nid oes tâl am roi cyngor ynghylch diogelwch cymunedol. Mae'n rhaid i bob awdurdod wneud trefniadau rhesymol i roi cyngor ynglŷn â gwarchod rhag tanau, rhwystro tanau rhag ymledu a dulliau dianc, ond ar wahân i hynny mae ganddo ddisgresiwn ynglŷn â pha gyngor y dylai godi tâl amdano. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gorchymyn hwn i'w weld yn groes i hynny a dywed y caiff awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl am

'the giving of advice to persons in relation to 'roi cyngor i bersonau mewn perthynas â

premises where a trade, business or other undertaking is carried on',

on matters such as the prevention of fires, restricting the spread of fires and means of escape. This is a recipe for confusion, and, without greater clarity, risks a breakdown in relationships that we cannot, and would not, want. I therefore urge all Members to support these non-contentious, non-party-political amendments.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I speak in support of the regulations, and I support the amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. We in the Plaid Cymru group feel unable to support amendment 2, as we doubt that these regulations are the most appropriate mechanism to deal with false alarms generated by faulty alarm systems, so we will abstain in the vote on that amendment.

These regulations outline the kind of services that fire authorities may charge for, instead of continuing to rely on the Local Government Act 2003 for the ability to do so, and we welcome the regulations, but point out that the services outlined in them can only be delivered by a first-class firefighting regime. You will know, Minister, that many of us are concerned about the implementation of the risk reduction plan about the implementation of the risk reduction plan of the South Wales Fire Authority, if that plan were to radically reduce the number of full-time firefighters, and result in the downgrading of some stations.

4.40 p.m.

The framework and the guidance adopted by the Assembly demands that the aim of any changes must be to reduce risk. People will, quite rightly, wonder how the loss of full-time firefighting posts in stations will improve safety. I was grateful for your commitment last week to look at this issue, which is of concern to Assembly Members of all parties. You also said that you would bring the concerns to the attention of the authority. Will you also commit to reporting back to the relevant committee sometime in the autumn, as I am confident that you will share my view that any changes to our

mangre lle cynhelir masnach, busnes neu ymgymeriad arall',

ynghylch materion megis gwarchod rhag tanau, rhwystro tanau rhag ymledu a dulliau dianc. Dyma annog dryswch, ac, oni cheir rhagor o eglurder, mae perygl i'r gydberthynas chwalu ac ni allwn oddef hynny ac ni fyddem am weld hynny. Felly anogaf bob Aelod i gefnogi'r gwelliannau annadleuol, amhleidiol hyn.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf am siarad o blaid y rheoliadau hyn, a chefnogaf welliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Teimlwn ninnau yng ngrŵp Plaid Cymru na allwn gefnogi gwelliant 2, gan inni amau nad y rheoliadau hyn yw'r dull mwyaf priodol o ddelio â galwadau di-sail a achosir gan systemau larwm gwallus, ac felly byddwn yn atal ein pleidleisiau yn y bleidlais ar y gwelliant hwnnw.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn amlinellu'r math o wasanaethau y caiff awdurdodau tân godi tâl amdanynt, yn hytrach na dal i ddbynnu ar Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003 i fedru gwneud hynny, ac yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau, ond pwysleisiwn nad oes modd darparu'r gwasanaethau a amlinellir ynddynt ond gan gyfundrefn ymladd tân sydd gyda'r gorau. Gwyddoch, Weinidog, fod llawer yn ein plith yn pryderu ynglŷn â gweithrediad cynllun lleihau risg Awdurdod Tân De Cymru, petai'r cynllun hwnnw'n lleihau nifer yr ymladdwyr tân llawn amser yn sylweddol, gan arwain at israddio rhai gorsafoedd.

Yn y fframwaith a'r cyfarwyddyd a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cynulliad mynnir mai diben unrhyw newidiadau yw lleihau risg. Bydd pobl yn pendroni, yn briodol ddigon, sut y bydd colli swyddi ymladd tân llawn amser yn gwella diogelwch. Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar am yr ymrwymiad a roesoch yr wythnos diwethaf i edrych ar y mater hwn, sy'n bryder i Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid. Dywedasoeh hefyd y byddech yn dwyn y pryderon i sylw'r awdurdod. A roddwch ymrwymiad hefyd i gyflwyno adroddiad ger bron y pwyllgor priodol ryw dro yn yr hydref, gan fy mod yn hyderus y byddwch yn

firefighting services must comply with the framework that the Assembly has already agreed?

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the Order and the three amendments to it. I note that, in England, the emergency Order will not be made until April 2007. On what grounds did you decide that the Order should go ahead in Wales before that? It states in the regulatory appraisal that this coincides with:

‘the final rollout of New Dimension equipment in part to answer problems over new burdens’,

which were previously discussed. I note that Plaid Cymru will abstain on amendment 2, but, in principle, I think that it is an excellent amendment. I understand Plaid’s attitude, but I commend the amendment, because discouraging and policing false alarms, which are so costly to the service, is a major problem. I am appalled at the attacks on firefighters that sometimes take place when they are called to false alarms.

Furthermore, I ask the Minister to consider, as Jocelyn Davies did, the impact of the regulations and the introduction of the integrated management plan, which appears to have severe implications for the retained fire service, which, in rural areas such as my constituency of Montgomeryshire, is an essential feature of ensuring that the fire service continues to be held in esteem. Close co-operation between local businesses and companies and the fire service provides us with a service that is second to none, and I sometimes wonder whether the Minister fully understands the impact and the implications of the integrated management plan, and how it will affect our retained fire service.

Otherwise, there is much to commend in the regulations, and I hope that the details of charging will be useful to the fire service, and can be used to improve its capital and equipment.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** The Order will do no more than to replicate the charging

unfarn â mi fod yn rhaid i unrhyw newidiadau a wneir i’n gwasanaethau ymladd tân gydymffurfio â’r fframwaith y mae’r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cytuno arno?

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru’n cefnogi’r Gorchymyn a’r tri gwelliant. Nodaf, yn Lloegr, na wneir y Gorchymyn brys hyd fis Ebrill 2007. Ar ba sail y penderfynasoch y dylai’r Gorchymyn fynd yn ei flaen yng Nghymru cyn hynny? Dywedir yn y gwerthusiad rheoleiddiol fod hyn yn cyd-daro â:

‘y cam olaf o ran cyflwyno’r cyfarpar New Dimension yn rhannol i ateb problemau parthed beichiau newydd’,

a drafodwyd yn flaenorol. Nodaf fod Plaid Cymru am atal eu pleidlais ar welliant 2, ond, mewn egwyddor, credaf ei fod yn welliant rhagorol. Deallaf agwedd Plaid, ond cymeradwyaf y gwelliant, oherwydd bod gwrthannog a phlisma galwadau di-sail, sydd mor gostus i’r gwasanaeth, yn broblem fawr. Gresynaf at yr ymosodiadau ar ymladdwyr tân sy’n digwydd weithiau pan gânt eu galw i alwadau di-sail.

Hefyd, gofynnaf i’r Gweinidog ystyried, fel y gwnaeth Jocelyn Davies, effaith y rheoliadau a chyflwyno’r cynllun rheoli integredig, yr ymddengys fod iddynt oblygiadau difrifol i’r gwasanaeth tân wrth gefn, sydd, mewn ardaloedd gwledig megis fy etholaeth yn Sir Drefaldwyn, yn elfen hanfodol o ran sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaeth tân ei barchu o hyd. Mae’r cydweithredu clos rhwng busnesau a chwmnïau lleol a’r gwasanaeth tân yn rhoi inni wasanaeth heb ei ail, ac weithiau meddyliaf a yw’r Gweinidog wir yn deall effaith a goblygiadau’r cynllun rheoli integredig, a sut y bydd yn effeithio ar ein gwasanaeth tân wrth gefn.

Heblaw am hynny, mae llawer i’w ganmol yn y rheoliadau, a gobeithiaf y bydd y manylion parthed codi tâl yn ddefnyddiol i’r gwasanaeth tân, ac y bydd modd eu defnyddio i wella ei gyfalaf a’i gyfarpar.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Ni fydd y Gorchymyn yn gwneud dim ond



practices that the fire and rescue services used under previous legislation prior to the Fire and Rescue Act 2004. Emergency responses provided by the fire and rescue services are free at the point of delivery. The services specified within the Order are not specifically an emergency response, and some may be provided by other sectors. The charges levied are not greater than the full cost of providing the service. The fire and rescue services may not make a profit from providing any of these services, and I wish to make that clear to the Chamber.

With reference to amendment 1, the Order clarifies the circumstances in which fire and rescue authorities can charge for services, and it reflects the practices that evolved within fire and rescue services when they relied upon the powers under the Fire Services Act 1947. It is for each authority to decide whether it wishes to charge for a particular service, and the circumstances under which it imposes the charge. It will also be for the authority to decide the amount of the charge, subject to the restriction that it does not make a profit. That has worked satisfactorily across Wales, and, as Minister, I am not aware of having received any correspondence on this particular issue.

On amendment 2, I thank Jocelyn for her particular points on this, because a fire and rescue service should assess its automatic fire alarm system policy as part of its reduction plan, to ensure that changes do not increase the risk of death or injury to the public. It is essential that the rescue and fire authorities achieve an appropriate balance in their response to automatic fire alarm systems, and a more proactive approach to improving fire safety and management. It must be remembered that the most effective way to deal with unwanted automatic fire alarm system false alarms is to prevent them from occurring in the first place. Fire and rescue authorities can influence the reduction of automatic fire alarm system false alarms through advice and guidance. The consultation on the charging Order stated that further work was required prior to extending existing chargeable activities and, as a Government, we remain committed to extensive consultation on any future proposals, as stated in the initial consultation.

ailadrodd yr arferion yr arferai'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub eu defnyddio dan y ddeddfwriaeth flaenorol cyn Deddf Tân ac Achub 2004 o ran codi tâl. Pan fyddant yn ateb galwadau brys mae'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn ddi-dâl. Nid yw'r gwasanaethau a bennir yn y Gorchymyn yn benodol yn alwadau brys, a gall sectorau eraill ddarparu rhai ohonynt. Nid yw'r taliadau'n fwy na chost lawn darparu'r gwasanaeth. Ni chaiff y gwasanaethau tân ac achub wneud elw o ddarparu dim o'r gwasanaethau hyn, ac yr wyf am wneud hynny'n glir i'r Siambr.

Parthed gwelliant 1, mae'r Gorchymyn yn egluro dan ba amgylchiadau y caiff awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl am wasanaethau, ac mae'n unol â'r arferion a esblygodd yn y gwasanaethau tân ac achub pan fuont yn dibynnu ar y pwerau a fu ganddynt dan Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Tân 1947. Lle pob awdurdod yw penderfynu a yw am godi tâl am wasanaethau neilltuol, a than ba amgylchiadau y mae am godi tâl. Lle'r awdurdod hefyd yw penderfynu swm y tâl, ar yr amod na fydd yn gwneud elw. Gweithiodd hynny'n ddigon bodhaol ar draws Cymru, ac, fel Gweinidog, ni wn imi gael gohebiaeth ynghylch y mater penodol hwn.

Parthed gwelliant 2, hoffwn ddiolch i Jocelyn am y pwyntiau neilltuol a wnaeth ynghylch hyn, oherwydd dylai gwasanaeth tân ac achub asesu ei bolisi parthed systemau larymau tân awtomatig fel rhan o'r cynllun lleihau, er mwyn sicrhau na fydd newidiadau'n cynyddu perygl marwolaeth neu anafiadau i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n hanfodol bod yr awdurdodau tân ac achub yn sicrhau cydbwysedd priodol yn y modd y byddant yn ymateb i systemau larymau tân awtomatig, a ffordd fwy rhagweithiol o wella diogelwch a rheoli tanau. Mae'n rhaid cofio mai'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o ddelio â galwadau di-sail gan systemau larymau tân yw sicrhau na fyddant yn digwydd o gwbl. Gall awdurdodau tân ac achub ddylanwadu i leihau galwadau di-sail gan systemau larymau tân awtomatig trwy roi cyngor ac arweiniad. Mae'r ymgynghori ar y Gorchymyn codi taliadau yn dweud bod angen gwneud rhagor o waith cyn ehangu'r gweithgareddau presennol y gellir codi tâl amdanynt ac, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn

Therefore, Jocelyn was quite right in the point that she made.

She made further points in her contribution, which I will now turn to. They were about concerns that have been expressed over the reduction plans that are being looked at across Wales in terms of the consultation process. I would urge Members to be involved in that process and I will be taking up concerns that are made to me across the piece with the fire and rescue authorities. Obviously, the operational matters are a matter for them, as long as they remain within my guidance, but I think that my guidance is quite clear. I will be pleased to update the committee in the autumn on the results of the consultation process that has been undertaken by the fire and rescue services.

In the context of section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, amendment 3 directs the Welsh Assembly Government to provide greater clarity on the circumstances under which fire and rescue authorities may charge. Under section 6 of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004, each fire and rescue authority must make provision for the purposes of promoting fire safety in its area. Fire and rescue authorities must make reasonable arrangements for providing advice about the prevention of fires, restricting their spread and the means of escape from premises. Each fire and rescue authority will have the discretion to decide what advice, other than its section 6 responsibilities, it will charge for, subject to the restriction that they may not make a profit. I think that that adequately covers some of the points.

The point was made that the North Wales Fire and Rescue Authority had provided a briefing note to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on these issues. I regularly meet fire and rescue authorities and they bring up many and varied points, and I am sure that they will continue to do that. I am always anxious to listen to their views on matters and will try to ensure that the

parhau i fod yn ymrwymedig i ymgynghori'n eang ar unrhyw gynigion yn y dyfodol, fel y nodwyd yn yr ymgynghoriad cychwynnol. Felly, yr oedd Jocelyn yn llygad ei lle â'r pwynt a wnaeth.

Cododd bwyntiau eraill yn ei chyfraniad, a throf at y rhain yn awr. Yr oeddent yn ymwneud â phryderon sydd wedi eu mynegi ynglŷn â'r cynlluniau ar gyfer cwtogiadau sy'n cael eu hystyried ledled Cymru yng nghyswllt y broses ymgynghori. Byddwn yn annog yr Aelodau i fod yn rhan o'r broses hon a byddaf yn trafod pryderon cyffredinol sy'n cael eu dwyn i'm sylw gyda'r awdurdodau tân ac achub. Mater iddynt hwy, wrth gwrs, yw'r materion gweithredol, cyn belled eu bod yn cadw at fy nghanllawiau, ond credaf fod fy nghanllawiau yn ddigon clir. Bydd yn bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r wybodaeth ddiweddar i'r pwyllgor yn yr hydref ynglŷn â chanlyniadau'r broses ymgynghori a gynhaliwyd gan y gwasanaethau tân ac achub.

Yng nghyd-destun adran 6 o Ddeddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, mae gwelliant 3 yn nodi y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru egluro'n fanylach ym mha amgylchiadau y gall yr awdurdodau tân ac achub godi tâl. Dan adran 6 o Ddeddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004, rhaid i bob awdurdod tân ac achub wneud darpariaeth er mwyn hybu diogelwch rhag tân yn ei ardal. Rhaid i awdurdodau tân ac achub wneud trefniadau rhesymol ar gyfer darparu cyngor ynglŷn ag atal tanau, eu rhwystro rhag lledaenu a sut i ddianc o adeiladau. Bydd gan bob awdurdod tân ac achub hawl i benderfynu pa gyngor, ar wahân i'w gyfrifoldebau adran 6, y bydd yn codi tâl amdano, yn amodol ar y cyfyngiad na allant wneud elw. Credaf fod hynny'n ymdrin yn ddigonol â rhai o'r pwyntiau.

Codwyd y pwynt bod Awdurdod Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru wedi cyflwyno nodyn briffio ar y materion hyn i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Yr wyf yn cyfarfod awdurdodau tân ac achub yn rheolaidd ac maent yn codi pwyntiau niferus ac amrywiol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn dal i wneud hynny. Yr wyf bob amser yn awyddus i wrando ar eu safbwyntiau ynglŷn

legislation reflects their views.

â materion a byddaf yn ceisio sicrhau bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn gydnaws â'u safbwyntiau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 9, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3183): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3183): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Taliadau) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM3183): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3183): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3184): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3184): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Baragraff 2(3)(c) Atodlen 1 Deddf  
Cydraddoldeb 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under Paragraph 2(3)(c) of Schedule 1 to the Equality  
Act 2006 to the First Minister**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate the function of the National Assembly contained in or under paragraph 2(3)(c) of Schedule 1 of the Equality Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM3174)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog Cymru swyddogaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan baragraff 2(3) (c) Atodlen 1 Deddf Cydraddoldeb 2006 ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, mo'u dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM3174)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** I have a brief comment. I am always a little worried about delegating further responsibilities to this First Minister, since he seems to be struggling with keeping up with those that he has. However, we will not oppose this delegation, given that it will go into the hands of the Business Minister, who I am sure that we can trust to behave sensibly in this regard.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae gennyf sylw byr. Yr wyf bob amser braidd yn bryderus ynglŷn â dirprwyo rhagor o gyfrifoldebau i'r Prif Weinidog hwn, gan ei bod yn ymddangos fel pe bai'n cael trafferth i ymdopi â'r hyn sydd ganddo. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r ddirprwyaeth hon, o ystyried y bydd yn mynd i ddwylo'r Trefnydd, un yr wyf yn sicr y gallwn ymddiried ynddi i ymddwyn yn gall yn y cyswllt hwn.

4.50 p.m.

I seek the Minister's commitment. I am sure that we have all studied this regulation in great detail, but it sets out the procedure by which the Assembly will have an input into appointing the commissioner for Wales to the new single equality commission, so it is very important. The regulation commits the commissioner to be appointed as someone who understands Wales. I stress to the Minister that it is very important that this person understands the equality and social justice issues relating to the use of the Welsh language.

Gofynnaf am addewid gan y Trefnydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wedi darllen y rheoliad hwn yn ofalus iawn, ond mae'n nodi sut y bydd y Cynulliad yn ymwneud â phenodi comisiynydd dros Gymru i'r comisiwn cydraddoldeb unedig newydd, felly mae'n bwysig iawn. Mae'r rheoliad yn nodi y dylai'r comisiynydd a benodir fod yn rhywun sy'n deall Cymru. Yr wyf yn pwysleisio wrth y Gweinidog ei bod yn bwysig iawn bod y person hwn yn deall y materion cydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol sy'n gysylltiedig â defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg.

I am aware that the Government has been rather reluctant so far to protect the rights of Welsh speakers and to see the Welsh

Gwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi bod braidd yn gyndyn hyd yn hyn o amddiffyn hawliau siaradwyr Cymraeg a gweld yr iaith Gymraeg

language as part of the equality agenda, but the very fact that the Welsh Language Board has sat as an adviser to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity shows that there is an element of understanding across the Assembly that Welsh speakers have rights to receive services through the medium of Welsh and that those rights should be protected.

The Minister will be aware of issues that have arisen in the past with the previous equality commissions not understanding things as basic as the need to produce materials in both languages and the fact that they are bound by the Welsh Language Act 1993. So, I am anxious to get the Government's assurance that, when it makes this appointment, it will ensure that this person understands that element of the equality agenda in Wales as well as the other, broader, elements included in the regulation.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I will ignore the first jibe and say that we are, of course, fully involved in the recruitment and selection process; it is vital that we get that right in terms of the commissioner for Wales and the committee that will be put in place. We will proceed, as we always have, in terms of fairness to the Welsh language and adherence to the recruitment specification.

fel rhan o'r agenda gydraddoldeb, ond mae'r ffaith bod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi eistedd fel cynghorydd i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn dangos ynddi'i hun bod elfen o ddealltwriaeth ar draws y Cynulliad bod gan siaradwyr Cymraeg hawliau yn ymwneud â derbyn gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac y dylid amddiffyn yr hawliau hyn.

Bydd y Trefnydd yn gwybod am broblemau a gododd yn y gorffennol gan nad oedd y comisiynau cydraddoldeb blaenorol yn deall pethau mor sylfaenol â'r angen i gynhyrchu deunydd yn y ddwy iaith a'r ffaith eu bod wedi eu rhwymo gan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Felly, hoffwn gael sicrwydd y bydd y Llywodraeth, wrth wneud y penodiad hwn, yn gwneud yn siŵr bod y sawl a benodir yn deall yr elfen hon o'r agenda gydraddoldeb yng Nghymru yn ogystal â'r elfennau eraill, ehangach, sydd yn y rheoliad.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf am anwybyddu'r enllib cyntaf a dweud ein bod, wrth gwrs, yn chwarae rhan lawn yn y broses recriwtio a dewis; mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cael hyn yn iawn o ran y comisiynydd dros Gymru a'r pwyllgor a fydd yn cael ei sefydlu. Byddwn yn symud ymlaen, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud bob amser, gyda golwg ar degwch i'r iaith Gymraeg a chadw at y fanyleb recriwtio.

*Cynnig (NDM3174): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3174): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John



Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Adolygiad o Wasanaethau Ambiwllans Approval of a Review of Ambulance Services**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose the following motion in my name and the names of Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Helen Mary Jones, Jonathan Morgan and Jenny Randerson. I propose that

*the National Assembly resolves:*

*1. the resolution of 20 June (NDM3100 as amended) should cease to have effect but that;*

*2. the actions sought in paragraphs 2(a) and 2(b) of that resolution to:*

*a) look at the effectiveness of performance standards, structures, staffing issues, financial and resource pressures together*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau y cynnig canlynol yn fy enw i ac enwau Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Helen Mary Jones, Jonathan Morgan and Jenny Randerson. Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu:*

*1. y dylai'r penderfyniad ar 20 Mehefin (NDM3100 fel y'i diwygiwyd) beidio â chael effaith, ond;*

*2. y dylai Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru gyflawni'r camau a nodir ym mharagraff 2(a) a pharagraff 2(b) y penderfyniad hwnnw i:*

*a) edrych ar effeithiolrwydd safonau perfformiad, strwythurau, materion staffio, pwysau o ran arian ac adnoddau, ynghyd ag*

*with any other related matters considered relevant; and*

*b) consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly; should be discharged through the Auditor General for Wales in accordance with the powers vested in him; and that*

*3. a report of the findings should be produced accordingly. (NDM3190)*

This motion represents a cross-party proposal on how to take forward the review of ambulance services. If this resolution is passed, I will immediately write to the Auditor General for Wales, Jeremy Colman, formally inviting him to lead this review.

We must observe the constitutional position here; it is not for the Assembly to instruct the auditor general. I will convey to him the Assembly's view and I understand that he has indicated that he would be pleased to accept the Assembly's invitation to carry out an inquiry into the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am happy to support this motion. I put on record that the Minister has acted very well in this regard and that we are glad that there has been no attempt to rescind the Assembly's original decision. This motion, of course, replaces the motion that was passed, but it does not rescind its effect. This is not the time or place to rehearse what has already been said about the condition of the ambulance service, but we were all very grateful to the auditor general for agreeing to undertake this investigation and we look forward to its speedy conclusion, so that we can develop a national consensus on the way forward for our ambulance service.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I echo Helen Mary Jones's comments. I look forward to the review concluding its work as quickly as possible. I know that we were not able to put a timeframe on when the report could be expected, but the Minister knows that

*unrhyw faterion perthnasol eraill yr ystyrir eu bod yn berthnasol; a*

*b) ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny; yn unol â'r pwerau a freiniwyd ynddo; a*

*3. y dylid paratoi adroddiad am y canfyddiadau yn unol â hynny. (NDM3190)*

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn gynnig trawsbleidiol sy'n ymwneud â sut i symud ymlaen â'r adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans. Os bydd y penderfyniad hwn yn cael ei basio, byddaf yn ysgrifennu ar unwaith at Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Jeremy Colman, i'w wahodd yn ffurfiol i arwain yr adolygiad hwn.

Rhaid inni gadw at yr hyn sydd yn y cyfansoddiad yma; nid lle'r Cynulliad yw rhoi cyfarwyddyd i'r archwilydd cyffredinol. Byddaf yn ei hysbysu ynglŷn â barn y Cynulliad a deallaf ei fod wedi dweud y byddai'n falch o dderbyn gwahoddiad y Cynulliad i gynnal ymchwiliad i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Yr wyf am gofnodi bod y Gweinidog wedi gweithredu'n dda iawn yn y cyswllt hwn a'n bod yn falch na wnaethpwyd unrhyw ymdrech i ddiddymu penderfyniad gwreiddiol y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnig hwn, wrth gwrs, yn cymryd lle'r cynnig a basiwyd, ond nid yw'n diddymu ei effaith. Nid dyma'r adeg na'r lle i ailadrodd yr hyn sydd wedi ei ddweud yn barod am gyflwr y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ond yr oeddem i gyd yn ddiolchgar iawn i'r archwilydd cyffredinol am gytuno i ymgymryd â'r ymchwiliad hwn ac edrychwn ymlaen at gasgliad buan, er mwyn inni allu datblygu consensws cenedlaethol ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen i'n gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Hoffwn ategu sylwadau Helen Mary Jones. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen i weld yr adolygiad yn cael ei gwblhau cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Gwn na allem ddweud pa bryd y gellid disgwyl yr adroddiad, ond mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod y byddai'r

Members would like to see that report early in the autumn. I know that the report's recommendations will mean budgetary implications, of which the Minister is already aware.

I also put on record my thanks to the Minister for responding in the way that he has. He has been constructive and we appreciate how he has dealt with opposition parties on this occasion. I assure the Minister that he can push the green button today. I know that it is not the button that he always pushes, but he can do so this afternoon.

**Jenny Randerson:** I reiterate that it is a pleasure that we have cross-party agreement on this issue. There is a positive way forward on what was, initially, a tricky issue.

I will make some brief comments on the scope of the inquiry. I know that the First Minister brushed aside the comments of the ex-chief executive today, but it is worth noting that he pointed out at lunchtime that there is no high-performing ambulance service in the world that serves a population of more than 1 million. That underlines the necessity to look at structure as well as at things such as resources.

He also made the point, which I think is terribly relevant in light of Sue Essex's statement on the Beecham report, that there was a necessity for the ambulance service to work much more closely with fire and rescue services. On the direction of the inquiry, I hope that those two specific issues will be taken into account. It is important that we move on with this as quickly as possible and that the Government responds with urgency to any findings that are not already being taken forward as part of the modernisation process.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r ffordd yr ydym wedi llwyddo i symud ymlaen gyda'r mater hwn yn arddangos aeddfedrwydd gwleidyddol ar ran y Llywodraeth, y Gweinidog a'r gwrthbleidiau. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn ein galluogi i symud ymlaen gydag ymchwiliad cynhwysfawr i'r gwasanaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ein galluogi ni fel

Aelodau'n hoffi gweld yr adroddiad hwn yn gynnar yn yr hydref. Gwn y bydd argymhellion yr adroddiad yn arwain at oblygiadau cyllidebol, y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes yn ymwybodol ohonynt.

Yr wyf hefyd am gofnodi fy niolch i'r Gweinidog am ymateb fel y mae wedi gwneud. Mae wedi bod yn adeiladol ac yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r modd y mae wedi delio gyda'r gwrthbleidiau ar yr achlysur hwn. Gall y Gweinidog bwysu'r botwm gwyrdd heddiw. Gwn nad hwn yw'r botwm y mae'n ei bwysu bob amser, ond gall wneud hyn y prynhawn yma.

**Jenny Randerson:** Rhaid i minnau ddweud ei bod yn braf iawn bod gennym gytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y mater hwn. Mae gennym ffordd gadarnhaol ymlaen ar fater a oedd, ar y dechrau, yn un anodd.

Yr wyf am wneud rhai sylwadau byr ar gwmpas yr ymchwiliad. Gwn fod y Prif Weinidog wedi ysgubo sylwadau'r cyn brif weithredwr o'r neilltu heddiw, ond mae'n werth nodi ei fod wedi dweud amser cinio nad oes gwasanaeth ambiwlans â pherfformiad rhagorol yn unman yn y byd sy'n gwasanaethu poblogaeth o dros 1 filiwn. Mae hyn yn dangos bod angen inni edrych ar strwythur yn ogystal â phethau fel adnoddau.

Pwynt arall a wnaethpwyd ganddo, ac sy'n berthnasol iawn yng ngoleuni datganiad Sue Essex ar adroddiad Beecham, yw bod angen cysylltiad llawer agosach rhwng gwaith y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub. Ar gyfeiriad yr ymchwiliad, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y ddau fater penodol hyn yn cael eu hystyried. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn symud ymlaen â hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd a bod y Llywodraeth yn ymateb ar fyrder i unrhyw ganfyddiadau nad ydynt yn cael eu hystyried yn barod fel rhan o'r broses foderneiddio.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The way in which we have succeeded in moving forward with this issue shows political maturity on behalf of the Government, the Minister and the opposition parties. This motion enables us to move forward with a comprehensive review of the service. Hopefully, it will also enable us as politicians to be in a situation by the

gwleidyddion i fod mewn sefyllfa yn yr hydref lle gallwn gefnogi a chynnal y bobl sydd yn cynnig y gwasanaeth hwn. Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gydnabod bod y Gweinidog wedi gweithio mewn ffordd aeddfed gyda'r gwrthbleidiau ar y mater hwn.

autumn to support the people who offer this service. I am grateful for the opportunity to acknowledge that the Minister has worked in a mature way with opposition parties on this issue.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I have nothing to add in reply.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth i'w ychwanegu mewn ymateb i hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM3190): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3190): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb' The Annual Report of 'Iaith Pawb'**

Motion (NDM3185): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. reaffirms its support for the Welsh Assembly Government's long-term aim of creating a bilingual nation;*

*2. notes the publication of the 'Iaith Pawb and Welsh Language Scheme Annual Report 2005-06', and the good progress made in the last year; and*

*3. endorses the Welsh Assembly Government policy of promoting the use of the Welsh language in all aspects of life in Wales through means other than introducing new statutory duties across the private sector in relation to the Welsh language, beyond the current Welsh Language Act.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Delete all after '2005-06' in point 2, and replace as new point 3:

*reviews the need for legislation to strengthen the Welsh language.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to retain the Welsh Language Board with its current powers, responsibility and funding, given that the Assembly Government's case for merger, as set out in its consultation paper, has not been made out.*

Cynnig (NDM3185): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ail-ddatgan ei gefnogaeth i nod hirdymor Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o greu cenedl ddwyieithog;*

*2. yn nodi cyhoeddi 'Adroddiad Blynyddol Iaith Pawb a'r Cynllun Iaith Gymraeg 2005-06', a'r cynnydd da a wnaed yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf; a*

*3. yn cadarnhau polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o hybu'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd yng Nghymru drwy ddulliau eraill ac eithrio cyflwyno dyletswyddau statudol newydd ar draws y sector preifat mewn perthynas â'r Gymraeg, y tu hwnt i ofynion y Ddeddf gyfredol ar yr iaith Gymraeg.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Dileu popeth ar ôl '2005-06' ym mhwynt 2 a rhoi pwynt 3 newydd yn ei le:

*yn adolygu'r angen am ddeddfwriaeth i gryfhau'r iaith Gymraeg.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gadw Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg gyda'i bwerau, ei gyfrifoldeb a'i gyllid presennol, gan nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dadlau ei hachos dros uno, fel ag y'i nodir yn ei phapur ymgynghori.*

- Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls for the power to legislate on the Welsh language to be devolved to the National Assembly in 2007.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Assembly Government to bring utilities under the Welsh Language Act 1993, using its powers to name organisations under section 6 of the Act.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance given to local education authorities in respect of surplus school places to ensure that inclusive and meaningful consultations are carried out with parents and school governors and believes that failure to do so will undermine the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance to local education authorities to ensure that they publish specific information on the linguistic implications of transferring pupils from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools planned for closure to other predominantly English-medium schools and believes that failure to do so will undermine the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to prioritise affordable housing within the 'Iaith Pawb' strategy.*
- Amendment 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- believes that the principle of linguistic rights*
- Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw am ddatganoli'r pŵer i ddeddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2007.*
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddod â'r cyfleustodau o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, gan ddefnyddio'i phwerau i enwi sefydliadau dan adran 6 o'r Ddeddf.*
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu'r canllawiau a roddir i awdurdodau addysg lleol ynghylch lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau bod ymgynghoriadau cynhwysol ac ystyrlon yn cael eu cynnal gyda rhieni a llywodraethwyr ysgol ac yn credu y bydd methu â gwneud hynny'n tanseilio amcanion 'Iaith Pawb'.*
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu ei chanllawiau i awdurdodau addysg lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn cyhoeddi gwybodaeth benodol am oblygiadau ieithyddol trosglwyddo disgyblion o ysgolion cyfrwng Gymraeg a dwyieithog y bwriedir eu cau i ysgolion eraill sy'n bennaf Saesneg eu cyfrwng, ac yn credu y bydd methu â gwneud hynny'n tanseilio amcanion 'Iaith Pawb'.*
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i dai fforddiadwy yn strategaeth 'Iaith Pawb'.*
- Gwelliant 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn credu y dylai egwyddor hawliau ieithyddol*

*should play a key part in the Assembly Government's aim of creating a bilingual nation.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that new legislation is needed primarily to incorporate those utilities that have migrated from the public sector to the private sector since the current Welsh Language Act was passed.*

Amendment 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that all powers over the Welsh language should be devolved to the National Assembly.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams, gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Lisa Francis a gwelliannau 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ail-ddatgan ei gefnogaeth i nod hirdymor Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o greu cenedl ddwyieithog;*

*2. yn nodi cyhoeddi 'Adroddiad Blynyddol Iaith Pawb a'r Cynllun Iaith Gymraeg 2005-06', a'r cynnydd da a wnaed yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf; a*

*3. yn cadarnhau polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o hybu'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd yng Nghymru drwy ddulliau eraill ac eithrio cyflwyno dyletswyddau statudol newydd ar draws y sector preifat mewn perthynas â'r Gymraeg, y tu hwnt i ofynion y Ddeddf gyfredol ar yr iaith Gymraeg. (NDM3185)*

Mae'n fraint gennyf agor y ddadl flynyddol

*chwarae rhan allweddol yn nod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o greu cenedl ddwyieithog.*

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu bod angen deddfwriaeth newydd yn bennaf i ymgorffori'r cyfleustodau hynny sydd wedi mudo o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat ers pasio'r Ddeddf gyfredol ar yr iaith Gymraeg.*

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid datganoli'r holl bwerau dros yr iaith Gymraeg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 a 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams, amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 5, 6, and 7 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 8, 9 and 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. reaffirms its support for the Welsh Assembly Government's long-term aim of creating a bilingual nation;*

*2. notes the publication of the 'Iaith Pawb and Welsh Language Scheme Annual Report 2005-06', and the good progress made in the last year; and*

*3. endorses the Welsh Assembly Government policy of promoting the use of the Welsh language in all aspects of life in Wales through means other than introducing new statutory duties across the private sector in relation to the Welsh language, beyond the current Welsh Language Act. (NDM3185)*

It is my privilege to open the annual debate

ar yr iaith Gymraeg. Yn y lle cyntaf, ailddatganaf amcan Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i greu cymdeithas ddwyieithog yng Nghymru yn y tymor hir. Mae adroddiad blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb' a'r cynllun iaith Gymraeg ar gyfer 2005-06 yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i gyrraedd y nod hwn.

on the Welsh language. In the first instance, I reiterate the Welsh Assembly Government's long-term aim of creating a bilingual society in Wales. The 'Iaith Pawb' annual report and the Welsh language scheme for 2005-06 demonstrate our commitment to fulfilling this aim.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.56 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.56 p.m.*

Mae prosiectau 'Iaith Pawb', a'r arian ychwanegol yr ydym wedi'i fuddsoddi yn yr iaith Gymraeg, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i siaradwyr Cymraeg ac i gymunedau Cymraeg. Ym myd addysg, er enghraifft, gwelwyd cynnydd o 9 y cant yn nifer y plant cyn-ysgol sy'n mynd i gylchoedd Ti a Fi. Hefyd, agorwyd ysgolion Cymraeg newydd yng Nghaerdydd a Llangollen. Mae hyn yn digwydd mewn cyd-destun lle mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn dewis addysg ddwyieithog i'w plant, a hynny oherwydd eu bod yn gweld manteision yr addysg honno, ac am eu bod am roi'r cyfle gorau i'w plant mewn bywyd. Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi bod yn lledaenu'r neges gyda'i ymgyrch farchnata, 'Cymraeg-Kids Soak it Up'. Mae'n record ar addysg Gymraeg yn dda, ac yr ydym yn tyfu'r ddarpariaeth i gwrdd â'r gofyn. Nid wyf, felly, yn derbyn gwelliannau 5 a 6 yn enw Lisa Francis—nid oes eu hangen.

'Iaith Pawb' projects and the additional money that we have invested in the Welsh language, are making a real difference to Welsh speakers and to Welsh-speaking communities. In education, for example, a 9 per cent increase has been seen in the number of children of pre-school age who attend Ti a Fi groups. New Welsh-medium schools have also been opened in Cardiff and Llangollen. This is happening in a context in which more and more people are choosing bilingual education for their children, because they see the advantages of this education, and because they want to give their children the best opportunities in life. The Welsh Language Board has been spreading this message with its marketing campaign, 'Cymraeg-Kids Soak it Up'. Our record on education is good, and we are growing the provision to meet demand. Therefore, I do not accept amendments 5 and 6 in the name of Lisa Francis—they are unnecessary.

Ond, nid ym maes addysg yn unig y mae'r £28 miliwn ychwanegol yr ydym wedi'i fuddsoddi ar yr iaith yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Yr ydym wedi helpu siaradwyr Cymraeg i sefydlu busnesau drwy brosiect Potentia, megis y feithrinfa yn sir Gaerfyrddin yr ymwelais â hi yn ddiweddar, ac wedi creu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc aros neu symud yn ôl i gefn gwlad Cymru drwy brosiect Llwybro. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gwneud gwaith da ym maes tai fforddiadwy drwy'r cynllun cymorth prynu neu strategaethau tai awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf felly yn gwrthod gwelliant 7.

However, it is not only in the field of education that the £28 million that we have invested in the Welsh language is making a difference. We have helped Welsh-speakers set up businesses through the Potentia scheme, such as the nursery I recently visited in Carmarthenshire, and have created opportunities for young people to either stay in or return to rural Wales through the Llwybro project. We have also done good work in the field of affordable housing through the homebuy scheme or local authorities' housing strategies. Therefore, I reject amendment 7.

Mae ein bwrdd iaith a'i bartneriaid yn parhau i wneud gwahaniaeth mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru drwy gefnogi'r iaith a chreu cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith, er enghraifft, drwy gynnal teithiau cerddoriaeth bop Cymraeg, digwyddiadau chwaraeon drwy

Our language board and its partners continue to make a difference in communities throughout Wales by promoting the Welsh language and by creating opportunities to use the language, for example, by organising Welsh-language pop music tours, sporting



gyfrwng y Gymraeg i bobl ifanc, sesiynau dysgu Cymraeg, a digwyddiadau cymdeithasol. Ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf, bydd y bwrdd yn lansio strategaeth ar gyfer y Gymraeg yn y sector preifat. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, nid yw bwrdd yr iaith yn galw am Ddeddf iaith newydd sy'n cwmpasu'r sector preifat.

5.00 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Bu i'r Gweinidog gyfeirio at fwrdd yr iaith, a dywed nad yw'n galw am ddeddfu yn y sector preifat, ond mae'r bwrdd yn galw am ddeddfu mewn meysydd eraill. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylid gwneud hyn mewn meysydd eraill, hyd yn oed os nad yw'n credu y dylid ei wneud yn y sector preifat?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddaf yn sôn am hynny nes ymlaen yn fy araith.

Mae'r bwrdd am barhau i weithio'n strategol i annog cwmnïau i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg, o ran y fantais fusnes mae darparu gwasanaeth dwyieithog yn ei roi i gwmnïau fel BT, cymdeithas adeiladu'r Principality, a Tesco.

Cefais ginio diddorol yr wythnos ddiwethaf gyda'r CBI a nifer o gwmnïau mawr. Ar draws y sector preifat, nid oes awydd am ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn y maes hwn. Y ffordd i gynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg yw drwy fuddsoddi yn yr iaith, annog rhieni i roi addysg Gymraeg i'w plant, a rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Yr ydym yn gwneud hyn. Mae'r obsesiwn ynghylch cael Deddf iaith newydd a hawliau ieithyddol yn tynnu'r ffocws oddi ar hyn. Felly, gwrthodaf welliant 8. Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn adolygu 'Iaith Pawb' flwyddyn nesaf. Byddai adolygiad yn ystyried y fframwaith deddfwriaethol, ac felly derbynïaf welliant 1.

**Lisa Francis:** Do you accept that it is difficult for language planning to take place without establishing linguistic rights?

**Alun Pugh:** At the moment, many Welsh speakers have those rights, for example, through language schemes across the public sector. Although it is not expressed in the

events in Welsh for young people, Welsh-language learning sessions, and social events. At the end of July, the board will be launching a strategy for the Welsh language in the private sector. Like the Assembly Government, the language board is not calling for a new language Act that encompasses the private sector.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Minister referred to the language board, and he said that it is not calling for legislation in the private sector. However, the board calls for legislation in other areas. Does the Minister agree that this should be done in other areas, even if he does not believe that it should be done in the private sector?

**Alun Pugh:** I will talk about that later on in my speech.

The board wishes to continue to work strategically to encourage companies to use the Welsh language, in terms of the competitive edge that providing a bilingual service gives to companies such as BT, the Principality building society, and Tesco.

I had an interesting dinner last week with the CBI and a number of large companies. Across the private sector, there is no call for new legislation in this area. The way in which to grow the number of Welsh speakers is to invest in the language, encourage parents to choose Welsh-medium education for their children, and provide more opportunities to use the Welsh language. We are doing that. The obsession with having a new Welsh language Act and linguistic rights takes the focus away from that. Therefore, I reject amendment 8. We will, of course, review 'Iaith Pawb' next year. A review would consider the legislative framework, and therefore I accept amendment 1.

**Lisa Francis:** A ydych yn derbyn ei bod yn anodd mynd ati i gynllunio'n ieithyddol heb sefydlu hawliau ieithyddol?

**Alun Pugh:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae gan lawer o siaradwyr Cymraeg yr hawliau hynny, er enghraifft, drwy gynlluniau iaith ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Er nad yw'n cael ei fynegi

language of rights, if you write to a public sector organisation in the Welsh language, you will receive a reply in the Welsh language. Therefore, you have that right at the moment. We must not get obsessed with moving down the route of, for example, Quebec-style rights-based legislation. As I said a minute ago, there will be a major review of 'Iaith Pawb'. Of course, we are happy to look at the issue of legislation. The Assembly currently has legislation rights, and we are happy to look at that as part of that review.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I think that the Minister is straying into an area on which there is fundamental disagreement. I think that it is right that that be placed on record, because, although the Minister says that a member of the public has the right to demand correspondence in Welsh, that is not the case. All that the legislation currently says is that the public body has a responsibility to prepare a language scheme. That does not confer rights on anyone. All that it does is to confer a responsibility on a public body to prepare a scheme. The member of the public has no rights whatsoever.

**Alun Pugh:** I accept that, but if you look at the reality of language schemes, you would struggle, for example, to find a local authority anywhere in Wales which, as part of its scheme, does not say, 'We reply to correspondence in the language of choice'. Therefore, if you write to a local authority—from Ynys Môn in the north to Cardiff in the south—in the Welsh language, you will receive a reply in the Welsh language. I think that that is entirely right.

**Jenny Randerson:** Will you give way?

**Alun Pugh:** I have taken two interventions; I need to make some progress.

Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn defnyddio pwerau o dan y Ddeddf bresennol. Mae'r cwmnïau dŵr wedi dod o fewn sgôp y Ddeddf ers 2004. Mae gan y cwmnïau dŵr fonopoli, wrth gwrs, ond nid yw hynny'n wir yn achos rhai o'r cyfleustodau eraill megis nwy a thrydan. Mae'n bosibl i chi brynu eich trydan a'ch nwy heddiw drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, nid wyf yn cefnogi gwelliannau 4 a 9.

yn ieithwedd hawliau, os ysgrifennwch chi at gorff sector cyhoeddus yn y Gymraeg, byddwch yn cael ateb yn y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'r hawl honno gennych ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni beidio â bod ag obsesiwn am symud i gyfeiriad, er enghraifft, deddfwriaeth seiliedig ar hawliau ar batrwm Cwebec. Fel y dywedais funud yn ôl, ceir adolygiad mawr o 'Iaith Pawb'. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn barod i edrych ar y cwestiwn o ddeddfwriaeth. Mae gan y Cynulliad hawliau deddfwriaeth ar hyn o bryd, ac yr ydym yn barod i edrych ar hynny fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Credaf fod y Gweinidog yn crwydro i faes y mae anghytuno sylfaenol yn ei gylch. Credaf ei bod yn briodol i hynny gael ei gofnodi, oherwydd, er bod y Gweinidog yn dweud bod gan aelod o'r cyhoedd yr hawl i fynnu gohebiaeth yn y Gymraeg, nid dyna'r sefyllfa. Y cyfan y mae'r deddfwriaeth yn ei ddweud ar hyn o bryd yw bod gan y corff cyhoeddus gyfrifoldeb i baratoi cynllun iaith. Nid yw hynny'n rhoi hawliau i neb. Y cyfan a wna yw rhoi cyfrifoldeb ar gorff cyhoeddus i baratoi cynllun. Nid oes gan aelod o'r cyhoedd unrhyw hawliau o gwbl.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny, ond os edrychwch chi ar realiti cynlluniau iaith, byddech yn ei chael hi'n anodd, er enghraifft, dod o hyd i awdurdod lleol yn unrhyw le yng Nghymru nad yw'n dweud, fel rhan o'i gynllun, 'Yr ydym yn ateb gohebiaeth yn y ddewis iaith'. Felly, os ysgrifennwch chi at awdurdod lleol—o Ynys Môn yn y gogledd i Gaerdydd yn y de—yn y Gymraeg, byddwch yn cael ateb yn y Gymraeg. Credaf fod hynny'n gwbl briodol.

**Jenny Randerson:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi cymryd dau ymyriad. Mae angen imi fwrw ymlaen.

This Government is using powers under the existing Act. The water companies have come within the scope of the Act since 2004. The water companies have a monopoly, of course, which is not the case for some other utilities such as gas and electricity. These days, it is possible to buy your gas and electricity through the medium of Welsh. Therefore, I do not support amendments 4

Mae'r cwmnïau trên mewn sefyllfa ychydig yn wahanol, ac edrychwn o ddifrif arnynt hwy.

Pan ddaw Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru i rym, gall y Cynulliad ddeddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg o fewn ystod y Ddeddf honno. Felly, gallwn dderbyn gwelliant 3, ond mae gwelliant 10 yn galw am ddeddfu mewn meysydd sydd heb eu datganoli, ac, felly, gwrthodaf welliant 10.

Bwriadwn ddefnyddio'r pwerau ychwanegol a gaiff y Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru i greu swydd y dyfarnydd. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos ddiwethaf, byddwn yn uno bwrdd yr iaith â'r Llywodraeth ar yr un pryd.

Ym mis Gorffennaf 2004, cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog ein diwygiad eang o'r cwangos. Dywedodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid bryd hynny:

'I welcome this statement...let us hope by 2008...there will not be a single quango left in Wales.'

Dyna eiriau dewr, a dyna'r rheswm cyntaf pam y byddaf yn pleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliant 2. Yr ail reswm yw bod y gwelliant yn smonach llwyr. Nid wyf yn sicr ai bwriad yr awdur oedd rhewi'r gwariant ar yr iaith Gymraeg, ond dyna sut y mae'n ymddangos i mi. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth hon am weld gwariant ar yr iaith yn rhewi. Dymunwn roi mwy o fuddsoddiad a mwy o gefnogaeth er mwyn creu mwy o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Dyna yw ein gweledigaeth ni ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: dileu popeth ar ôl '2005-06' ym mhwynt 2 a rhoi pwynt 3 newydd yn ei le:

*yn adolygu'r angen am ddeddfwriaeth i gryfhau'r iaith Gymraeg.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

and 9. Train companies are in a slightly different position, and we are looking at those companies in earnest.

When the Government of Wales Bill becomes law, the Assembly will be able to legislate on the Welsh language within the scope of the Act. We can therefore accept amendment 3, but amendment 10 calls for legislation in non-devolved areas, and, therefore, I reject amendment 10.

We intend to use the additional powers that the Assembly will have under the Government of Wales Act to create the post of the dyfarnydd. As I announced last week, we will merge the Welsh Language Board into the Assembly Government at the same time.

In July 2004, the First Minister announced a major reform of the quango state. The leader of the opposition said at the time:

'Croesawaf y datganiad hwn...gobeithio na fydd yr un cwango ar ôl yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd 2008.'

Those were brave words, and that is the first reason why I will be voting against amendment 2. The second reason is that it is a botched amendment. I am not sure whether the author's intention was to freeze spending on the Welsh language, but that is how it appears to me. This Government does not want to see a freeze on spending on the language. We want to see more investment and more support in order to create more Welsh speakers. That is our vision for the Welsh language.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: delete all after '2005-06' in point 2, and replace as new point 3:

*reviews the need for legislation to strengthen the Welsh language.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gadw Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg gyda'i bwerau, ei gyfrifoldeb a'i gyllid presennol, gan nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dadlau ei hachos dros uno, fel ag y'i nodir yn ei phapur ymgynghori.*

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to retain the Welsh Language Board with its current powers, responsibility and funding, given that the Assembly Government's case for merger, as set out in its consultation paper, has not been made out.*

Yn y lle cyntaf, yr unig beth y gallwn ei gefnogi yng nghynnig y Llywodraeth yw paragraff 1, lle dywed ein bod yn cefnogi bwriad y Llywodraeth i greu cenedl ddwyieithog. Credaf fod hynny'n elfen gyffredin ar draws y pleidiau. Serch hynny, ni dderbyniwn fod digon o gynnydd wedi'i wneud o safbwynt cynllun 'Iaith Pawb', ac, felly, ni dderbyniwn baragraff 3.

First, the only thing that we can support in the Government's motion is paragraph 1, where it states that we support the Government's intention to create a bilingual nation. I think that has general cross-party support. However, we do not accept that sufficient progress has been made in terms of the 'Iaith Pawb' scheme, and, therefore, we do not accept paragraph 3.

Gan droi at rai o'r pethau a ddywedodd y Gweinidog, credaf fod yn rhaid inni ddatgan yn glir pam bod angen deddfwriaeth newydd i gryfhau'r iaith Gymraeg. Yr wyf yn gwrthod yn llwyr honiad y Gweinidog mai mater o obsesiwn yw hynny. Pam y cafwyd Deddf yn 1967 ac un arall yn 1993? Ai obsesiwn oedd hynny ar ran y Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1967, ac ar ran y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1993? Mae dau beth pwysig ynglŷn â'r deddfau hynny. Yn gyntaf, hyd yn oed wedi mil o flynyddoedd o ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg, nid yw hyd yma'n cael ei hystyried yn iaith swyddogol yng Nghymru. Credaf ei bod yn hen bryd inni roi yn y Ddeddf fod yr iaith Gymraeg yn iaith swyddogol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n rhoi statws i'r iaith; mae'n golygu bod pawb sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith yn gwybod bod ganddi statws gyfreithiol, sy'n bwysig. Derbyniaf nad yw hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn creu cenedl ddwyieithog, ond credaf ei fod yn bwysig o safbwynt yr egwyddor.

Turning to some of the things that the Minister said, I think that we have to state clearly why we need new legislation to strengthen the Welsh language. I reject the Minister's claim that this is a matter of obsession. Why was there an Act in 1967 and another in 1993? Was that an obsession on the part of the Labour Government in 1967, and the Conservative Government in 1993? There are two important aspects to those acts. First, even after thousands of years of using the Welsh language, it is still not acknowledged as an official language in Wales. I think that it is high time for us to place in the Act that the Welsh language is an official language in Wales. It gives status to the language; it means that everyone who deals with the language knows that it has a legal status, which is important. I accept that that, in itself, does not create a bilingual nation, but I think that it is important in terms of the principle.

5.10 p.m.

Unwaith y rhoddwch statws swyddogol i iaith gallwch gael hawliau ieithyddol. Nid wyf yn deall yn iawn pam bod yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog sôn drwy'r amser am ryw 'Quebec-style linguistic rights'. Nid ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw siarad ar ran Cwbec—ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw siarad ar ran pobl Cymru.

Once you grant official status to a language you can have linguistic rights. I do not quite understand why the Minister always has to talk about some 'Quebec-style linguistic rights'. It is not our responsibility to speak on behalf of Quebec—it is our responsibility to speak on behalf of the people of Wales.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you agree that the Minister seems to misunderstand the situation in Quebec? In Quebec, the intention is unashamedly to convert the country into a

**Jenny Randerson:** A ydych yn cytuno bod y Gweinidog fel pe bai'n camddeall y sefyllfa yng Nghwbec? Yng Nghwbec, y bwriad yn ddiedifar yw troi'r wlad yn wlad lle siaredir

predominantly French-speaking country—a country where French speakers have greater rights than English speakers. I have yet to hear any politician in the Assembly state that they want anything other than a truly bilingual Wales, and, therefore, a Quebec structure is not what people are aiming at.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud, ond yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud yw defnyddio Cwebec fel ffordd o ddweud na ddylai fod hawliau ieithyddol yng Nghymru. Nonsens yw hynny. Mae'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddeall bod yn rhaid i ni gael trafodaeth synhwyrol yn y fan hon. Nid oes neb yn dadlau yr hyn y mae ef yn ei ddadlau.

Felly, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddweud yw bod hawliau ieithyddol yn greiddiol i hawliau pobl i ddefnyddio'r iaith. Mae gan nifer o bobl hawliau mewn gwahanol feysydd—pam na all rywun gael yr hawl i gael llythyr drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Nid oes gan bobl yr hawl hwnnw ar hyn o bryd. Mae cyfrifoldeb ar gyrff i ddatblygu cynlluniau iaith, ond nid oes gan yr unigolyn hawliau. Ni ddylai'r mater hwnnw ein rhannu ni. Nid wyf yn deall pam bod y Gweinidog eisiau ei roi mewn rhyw fath o cul de sac drwy'r amser, gan ddefnyddio enghreifftiau cwbl amherthnasol i sefyllfa Cymru i geisio cyfiawnhau ei safbwynt.

Yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog drafod y mater ar ei deilyngdod ei hun—nid drwy ddefnyddio enghreifftiau o wledydd eraill, ond drwy drafod y mater gyda ni ar ei deilyngdod ei hun, o ran a ddylem gael hawliau ieithyddol yng Nghymru.

Y trydydd peth sy'n hynod bwysig os ydym am gael sefyllfa y tu hwnt i Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yw bod y system o gael dyfarnydd yn cael ei datblygu i fod yn system o gael comisiynydd iaith. Mae'n rhaid inni drafod hynny ar draws y sbectrum gwleidyddol bellach.

Pan ddywed y Gweinidog mai bwriad yr wrthblaid yw cadw bwrdd yr iaith am byth, mae eto'n cam-liwio'r safbwynt yn wleidyddol. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei ddweud yw, os gall y Llywodraeth ddod ag achos i ni sy'n dangos y bydd sefyllfa'r Gymraeg yn

Ffrangeg yn bennaf—gwlad lle mae gan siaradwyr Ffrangeg fwy o hawliau na siaradwyr Saesneg. Nid wyf eto wedi clywed unrhyw wleidydd yn y Cynulliad yn dweud ei fod am gael unrhyw beth ar wahân i Gymru gwbl ddwyieithog, ac, felly, nid strwythur tebyg i un Cwebec yw'r hyn y mae pobl yn ymgynraedd ato.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sorry to say, but what the Minister is doing is using Quebec as a way of saying that there should be no linguistic rights in Wales. That is nonsense. The Minister must understand that we need to have a sensible discussion here. No-one is arguing what he is arguing.

Therefore, what we are saying is that linguistic rights are a core part of people's rights to use the language. Many people have rights in different areas—why cannot people have the right to receive a letter through the medium of Welsh? People do not have that right at present. Organisations have a responsibility to develop Welsh-language schemes, but individuals have no rights at all. That issue should not divide us. I do not understand why the Minister always wants to put it in some kind of cul de sac, and use totally irrelevant examples to the situation in Wales to try to justify his point of view.

I want the Minister to discuss the issue on its own merit—not by using examples from other countries, but by discussing the issue with us on its own merit, in terms of whether we should have linguistic rights in Wales.

The third thing that is exceptionally important if we are going to have a situation beyond the Welsh Language Board is that the system of having a dyfarnydd is developed to be a system of having a language commissioner. We must now discuss that across the political spectrum.

When the Minister says that the opposition party's intention is to keep the language board for ever, he is politically misrepresenting the situation again. What we have said is that, if the Government can bring us a case that shows that the situation of the

cryfhau ar ôl diddymu bwrdd yr iaith, buasem yn fodlon ystyried hynny, ac mae'r cynnig hwnnw yn dal yn agored i'r Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, nid yw wedi cynnig hynny. Y broblem yw mai rhyw waith tacluso y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud, ac nid yw hynny'n ddigon.

Yn olaf, mae'n angenrheidiol i ni edrych ar ddatblygu'r iaith Gymraeg. Ni ddylid ei gadael fel ag y mae; dylid gweld lle y gallwn ei chryfhau. Ni wn bellach, pan welwn y consensws sy'n datblygu yng Nghymru o blaid y newidiadau hyn, pam mai'r Blaid Lafur yw'r unig blaid wleidyddol yng Nghymru nad yw'n gweld pwysigrwydd symud ymlaen.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddatganoli'r pŵer i ddeddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2007.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddod â'r cyfleustodau o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, gan ddefnyddio'i phwerau i enwi sefydliadau dan adran 6 y Ddeddf.*

Ni fyddai unrhyw un sy'n gyfarwydd ag adfywio iaith yn gwadu pwysigrwydd cynyddu nifer siaradwyr yr iaith sydd dan ystyriaeth. Nid yw'n ddatganiad syfrdanol felly i honni mai man cychwyn creu Cymru ddwyieithog yw addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg—dyna'r dull sy'n gyfrifol am gynhyrchu dau allan o bob tri o'n pobl ifanc a all siarad yr iaith. Mae creu mwy o siaradwyr Gymraeg yn arwain at greu mwy o gyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith, ac os bydd cyfradd twf y broses hon yn ddigon bywiog gall arwain at dwf parhaol, hynny yw, twf esbonyddol.

Serch hynny, yn ddiweddar, galwodd cyn-gyfarwyddwr addysg Morgannwg Ganol, Ken Hopkins, am bolisi uchelgeisiol i greu Cymru ddwyieithog, drwy wella dysgu Gymraeg fel ail iaith. Mae'r Gweinidog dros

Welsh language will strengthen after abolishing the language board, we would be willing to consider that, and that offer is still open to the Minister. However, he has not proposed that. The problem is that he just intends to do a little bit of tidying up, which is not enough.

Finally, it is essential that we look at developing the Welsh language. It should not be left as it is; we should look at where we can strengthen it. I do not know any more, when we see the consensus that is developing in Wales in favour of these changes, why the Labour Party is the only political party in Wales that does not see the importance of moving on.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the power to legislate on the Welsh language to be devolved to the National Assembly in 2007.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring utilities under the Welsh Language Act 1993, using its powers to name organisations under section 6 of the Act.*

No-one who is familiar with linguistic resurgence would deny the importance of increasing the number of speakers of any language. It is not a shocking statement therefore to claim that the starting point for creating a bilingual Wales is Welsh-medium education—that is the system that has produced two out of three of our young people who can speak the language. Creating more Welsh speakers leads to creating more opportunities to use the language, and if the rate of growth of this process is sufficiently lively, it can lead to continuous growth, namely, exponential growth.

However, recently, the former director of education in Mid Glamorgan, Ken Hopkins, called for an ambitious policy to create a bilingual Wales, by improving the teaching of Welsh as a second language. The Minister

Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau hefyd yn frwd o blaid prosiect i arbrofi â chynllun i wneud plant cynradd yn rhugl yn y Gymraeg ar ôl chwe wythnos o ddysgu dwys. Er bod eu dyheadau yn anelu at ehangu'r cyfleoedd i ddysgu'r iaith, fel y maent, mae prosiectau Ken Hopkins a'r Gweinidog yn anymarferol. Ni ellir eu cynnal nes bod addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ddigon cryf i gynnal ei thwf ei hunan a chynhyrchu digon o athrawon Cymraeg ychwanegol i gryfhau dysgu Cymraeg yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth ar gyfer creu Cymru ddwyieithog ganolbwyntio ar addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg er mwyn cynhyrchu mwy a mwy o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Mae'r ffaith hon wedi cael ei derbyn gan bob un o'r pleidiau erbyn hyn, ond yr hyn sydd wedi bod ar goll tan yn awr yw'r ymrwymiad a'r ewyllys gan y Llywodraeth i gymryd y camau i alluogi addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i dyfu, yn unol â'r galw o blith rhieni.

Ar ôl blynyddoedd o betruso ac ansicrwydd, daw cynnig gerbron y Cynulliad yfory a ddylai, gyda threigl amser, beri cynnydd sylweddol iawn yn nifer y disgyblion sy'n cael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Bydd rhoi adran 29 Deddf Plant 2004 ar waith yn caniatáu mynediad i awdurdodau addysg lleol at gronfa ddata i gael yr wybodaeth sydd ei heisiau arnynt er mwyn cynnal arolwg o rieni plant cyn oed ysgol, a hynny er mwyn pennu'r galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Gallai hyn fod yn drobwynt yn hanes y Gymraeg.

Mae ymchwil gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn y maes hwn yn dangos bod potensial enfawr i gynyddu'n sylweddol nifer y plant sy'n mynychu ysgolion Cymraeg, gan roi hwb hanfodol i brif amcan 'Iaith Pawb'. Wrth ystyried hyn, ynghyd â'r ffaith bod Deddf Plant 2004 bellach dros ddwy flyydd oed, rhaid gofyn pam na chafodd swyddogaethau adran 29 o'r Ddeddf hon eu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog cyn hyn. Ai diffyg blaenoriaethu yw'r esboniad efallai?

Galwaf ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau nad yw'r broses o roi adran 29 ar waith yn hirach na'r angen. Gorau po gynted y bydd gan

for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is also enthusiastic to support a project to experiment with a scheme to make primary school children fluent in Welsh after six weeks of intensive learning. Although their aspirations aim at expanding the opportunities to learn Welsh, as they stand, the projects of Ken Hopkins and the Minister are not practical. They cannot be sustained until Welsh-medium education is sufficiently strong to sustain its own growth and also to produce enough additional Welsh teachers to strengthen the teaching of Welsh in the English-medium sector. Therefore, at present, any strategy to create a bilingual Wales must focus on Welsh-medium education as a means of creating more and more Welsh speakers. That fact has now been accepted by all parties, but what has been missing until now is the commitment and the determination on behalf of the Government to take the steps required to enable Welsh-medium education to grow in line with demand for it among parents.

Following years of hesitation and uncertainty, a motion will be brought before the Assembly tomorrow, which, in time, should lead to a significant increase in the number of pupils who receive a Welsh-medium education. Implementing section 29 of the Children Act 2004 will allow local education authorities access to databases to gather the information required by them to conduct a survey of the parents of pre-school children, to ascertain the demand for Welsh-medium education. This could be a turning point in the history of the language.

Research on this by the Welsh Language Board reveals that there is huge potential to increase significantly the number of children attending Welsh-medium schools, giving a much-needed boost to the main objective of 'Iaith Pawb'. In considering this, as well as the fact that the Children Act 2004 is now over two years old, we must ask why the functions contained in section 29 of this Act were not delegated to the First Minister before now. Could it be explained by a failure to prioritise?

I call on the Government to ensure that the process of implementing section 29 does not take longer than necessary. The sooner the

awdurdodau lleol yr wybodaeth gywir o'u harolygon iaith er mwyn iddynt baratoi cynlluniau addysg Gymraeg, a hynny i sicrhau darpariaeth sy'n cwrdd â'r galw ym mhob un o'u cymunedau. Wrth weithredu hyn, byddai'r Llywodraeth yn dod â blynyddoedd o bryder ymysg rhieni i ben—pryder ynghylch rhannu eu sibliŋgiaid rhwng ysgolion gwahanol a'r ansicrwydd o gael lleoedd o gwbl i'w plant yn sgil diffyg darpariaeth gan ambell awdurdod lleol.

I gloi, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflawni gwaith cefnogol mewn meysydd eraill, er enghraifft, drwy baratoi cyrsiau ar gyfer ymarferwyr y blynyddoedd cynnar Cymraeg. Bydd hyn yn cryfhau'r sylfaen am dwf yn y sector cynradd. Croesewir hefyd y cyrsiau sabothol ar gyfer athrawon cynradd ac uwchradd sydd eisiau cryfhau eu sgiliau Cymraeg. Yn olaf, rhaid mynegi pryder am y diffyg cynnydd a wnaed wrth ymdrin â Chymraeg i oedolion, addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg, y problemau megis dilyniant rhwng y sectorau cynradd ac uwchradd, a'r angen am ddisgrifiadau ieithyddol cywir i'n hysgolion. Mae eich diffyg blaenoriaeth ac arweiniad, Weinidog, wrth ymwneud â rhai o argymhellion pwysicaf 'Iaith Pawb' yn tanlinellu diffyg strategaeth y Llywodraeth mewn maes sydd mor bwysig i'n hunaniaeth genedlaethol.

**Lisa Francis:** Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu'r canllawiau a roddir i awdurdodau addysg lleol ynghylch lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau bod ymgynghoriadau cynhwysol ac ystyrlon yn cael eu cynnal gyda rhieni a llywodraethwyr ysgol ac yn credu y bydd methu gwneud hynny'n tanseilio amcanion 'Iaith Pawb'.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu ei chanllawiau i awdurdodau addysg lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn cyhoeddi gwybodaeth benodol am oblygiadau ieithyddol trosglwyddo disgyblion o ysgolion*

local education authorities can access the correct information from their language surveys the better, so that they can prepare their Welsh-language-education schemes to ensure that provision meets the demand in each community. Implementing this would mean that the Government would end years of worry among parents—concern about sending siblings to different schools and about finding any school places at all for their children because of the lack of provision of some local authorities.

In conclusion, the Government has undertaken support work in other areas, for example, by preparing courses for Welsh-medium early years practitioners. This will strengthen the foundation for growth in the primary sector. The sabbatical courses for primary and secondary teachers who want to improve their Welsh language skills are also to be welcomed. Finally, I must express my concern over the lack of progress made on Welsh for adults, Welsh-medium higher education, problems with the transition from the primary to the secondary sector, as well as the need for correct linguistic designations for our schools. Your lack of priority and leadership, Minister, in dealing with some of the most important recommendations of 'Iaith Pawb' underline the Government's lack of strategy in an area that is so important to our national identity.

**Lisa Francis:** I move amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance given to local education authorities in respect of surplus school places to ensure that inclusive and meaningful consultations are carried out with parents and school governors and believes that failure to do so will undermine the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance to local education authorities to ensure that they publish specific information on the linguistic implications of transferring pupils from*



*cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog y bwriedir eu cau i ysgolion eraill sy'n bennaf Saesneg eu cyfrwng, ac yn credu y bydd methu â gwneud hynny'n tanseilio nodau 'Iaith Pawb'.*

*Welsh-medium and bilingual schools planned for closure to other predominantly English-medium schools and believes that failure to do so will undermine the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'.*

Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i dai fforddiadwy yn strategaeth 'Iaith Pawb'.*

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to prioritise affordable housing within the 'Iaith Pawb' strategy.*

Mae'n ddi-ddorol nodi bod y ddogfen 'Iaith Pawb' yn gosod cryn bwyslais ar bwysigrwydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth am gymryd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg o dan ei hadain, nid yw erioed wedi cynnig cynllun manwl i ddangos sut y bydd hynny o fudd i amcanion strategaeth 'Iaith Pawb'. Yn yr un modd, nid ydyw wedi cynnig manylion ynghylch sut y bydd dwyn bwrdd yr iaith i mewn i gorlan y Llywodraeth yn fanteisiol mewn unrhyw ffordd.

It is interesting to note that the 'Iaith Pawb' document places sizeable emphasis on the importance of the Welsh Language Board. Despite the fact that the Government wishes to take the Welsh Language Board under its wing, it has never come up with a detailed plan of how that would benefit the aims of the 'Iaith Pawb' strategy. Similarly, no details have been forthcoming on how bringing the Welsh Language Board into the fold of the Government would be in any way advantageous.

The Government's consultation document did not give us any idea as to how mainstreaming the Welsh language would occur. All of the Welsh Language Board's meetings are currently open to the public. How would the Assembly Government be more open and transparent than that? It does not tell us. In its consultation response, Newport City Council points to its disappointment that the document does not fully explore the issues raised by the merger, such as how the fact that the Minister is proposed as chair of the ministerial advisory group post merger will affect agenda setting, decision making, procedures, openness and accountability.

Ni roddodd dogfen ymgynghori'r Llywodraeth unrhyw syniad inni ynghylch sut y byddai prif-ffrydio'r Gymraeg yn digwydd. Mae holl gyfarfodydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn agored i'r cyhoedd ar hyn o bryd. Sut y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fwy agored a thryloyw na hynny? Nid yw'n dweud wrthym. Yn ei ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad, cyfeiria Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd at ei siom nad yw'r ddogfen yn archwilio'n llawn y cwestiynau a godir gan yr uno, megis sut y bydd y ffaith y cynigir y Gweinidog i gadeirio'r grŵp cynghori gweinidogol wedi'r uno yn effeithio ar y modd y gosodir agendau, ar benderfyniadau, gweithdrefnau, a'i allu i fod yn agored ac yn atebol.

5.20 p.m.

Given that the Government has found itself in this mess of its own making, it is not surprising that the Minister announced last week that the merger would not go ahead for a year or so. Many will be grateful for this breathing space, but the arrogance of the Government took our breath away when it became apparent that freedom of information papers disclosed that numerous work streams

Gan fod y llywodraeth wedi'i chael ei hun yn y llanast hwn o'i gwneuthuriad ei hun, nid yw'n syndod i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi yr wythnos ddiwethaf na fyddai'r uno'n digwydd am ryw flwyddyn. Bydd llawer yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i gael ein gwynt, ond yr oedd hyfdra'r Llywodraeth yn mynd â'n gwynt pan ddaeth yn amlwg fod papurau rhyddid gwybodaeth yn dangos fod sawl

had been pushing forward the ongoing merger process in spite of, and in defiance of, the majority vote taken by the Assembly last October, as well as the further investigations that were undertaken by the auditor general as to whether public funds were being used to abolish the board following that resolution to bring matters to a halt. Minister, will you give us your assurance today that these numerous work streams to facilitate the merger will cease, and that you will stop wasting public money against the will of the Assembly, as well as wasting the time and energy of the Welsh Language Board, which has had to devote itself to these tasks, deviating from what its work should really be all about?

While the 2000 census told us how many people spoke Welsh, it did not give us any information as to how the language was used or in what depth. However, we know that the fluency connected with Welsh is significantly threatened at community level and that languages are constantly evolving within their social context. The Welsh Language Board recognises that the principle of language rights forms the basis of language planning, and that, sadly, is virtually absent here in Wales. The current legislation does not address clear language rights for the public and, therefore, the time is now right for a detailed discussion on recognising the rights of the speakers of both our national languages. For example, last week, I asked whether it was acceptable for some community councils in Wales to produce their agendas and minutes in the Welsh language only, as I and others believe that that could be in breach of the European convention on human rights.

**Leighton Andrews:** On a point of clarification, would your proposal for rights for Welsh-language speakers entail rights in relation to private sector companies as well?

**Lisa Francis:** The time is now right, Leighton, for us to start looking not necessarily at the status of service providers but at the nature of the service that they provide.

ffrwd waith wedi bod yn gwthio'r broses uno yn ei blaen, a hynny er gwaethaf, ac yn nannedd, y bleidlais drwy fwyafrif a gymerwyd gan y Cynulliad fis Hydref diwethaf, yn ogystal â'r ymchwiliadau pellach a wnaethpwyd gan yr archwiliwr cyffredinol i ganfod a oedd arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei ddefnyddio i ddiddymu'r bwrdd yn dilyn y penderfyniad hwnnw i atal y broses. Weinidog, a roddwch sicrwydd inni heddiw y bydd terfyn ar y ffrydiau gwaith niferus hyn i hwyluso'r uno, ac y rhoddwch y gorau i wastraffu arian cyhoeddus yn groes i ewyllys y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â gwastraffu amser ac egni Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, sydd wedi gorfod rhoi ei holl sylw i'r tasgau hyn, gan droi oddi wrth yr hyn a ddylai fod yn brif destun ei waith?

Pan ddywedodd cyfrifiad 2000 wrthym faint o bobl oedd yn medru'r Gymraeg, ni roddodd unrhyw wybodaeth inni ynghylch sut y defnyddid yr iaith nac i ba ddyfnder. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom fod rhuglder yn y Gymraeg dan fygythiad arwyddocaol ar lefel gymunedol a bod ieithoedd yn esblygu o hyd o fewn eu cyd-destun cymdeithasol. Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn sylweddoli bod egwyddor hawliau iaith yn ffurfio'r sail i gynllunio iaith, ac mae hynny, ysywaeth, yn absennol i bob pwrpas yma yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol yn rhoi sylw i hawliau iaith clir i'r cyhoedd, ac felly, dyma'r amser i gael trafodaeth fanwl ynglŷn â chydabod hawliau siaradwyr ein dwy iaith genedlaethol. Er enghraifft, yr wythnos ddiwethaf, gofynnais a oedd yn dderbyniol i rai cynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru lunio'u hagenda'u a'u cofnodion yn y Gymraeg yn unig, gan fy mod i ac eraill yn credu y gallai hynny fod yn groes i'r cytundeb Ewropeaidd ar hawliau dynol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ar bwynt o eglurder, a fyddai eich cynnig parthed hawliau i siaradwyr Cymraeg yn cynnwys hawliau mewn perthynas â chwmnïau'r sector preifat hefyd?

**Lisa Francis:** Mae'n amserol yn awr, Leighton, inni ddechrau edrych nid o reidrwydd ar statws darparwyr gwasanaethau ond ar natur y gwasanaeth a ddarparant.

There must be clarity about what language users can expect, which could, in turn, promote the practical use of Welsh by the public and, importantly, would lead to raising the confidence of language users. As Ieuan Wyn Jones has said, one of the major weaknesses in the current Welsh language legislation is that it does not place a duty on bodies to provide information to the Welsh Language Board as part of any statutory investigation into the implementation of language schemes.

That leads me on to our amendments 5 and 6, and I will explain them for the Minister, because it does not really surprise me that he does not want to support them. In July 2005, the director of education of Carmarthenshire County Council wrote to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives explaining that specific school reorganisation considerations should be determined and developed only with relevant stakeholders, that we should all be assured that there would be opportunities for full and extensive consultation at appropriate times, and that Carmarthenshire's modernisation of education provision was designed to foster the Welsh language, rather than to have any adverse implications.

Fodd bynnag, fel y gwelsom gydag Ysgol Gynradd Mynydd Cerrig yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae'r cyngor sir wedi cyfyngu'r ymgynghori i'r lleiafswm posibl, drwy gynnig mis yn unig i ystyried holl ddyfodol yr ysgol, a thrwy anfon ei ddogfen yn unig at y cyrff hynny yr oedd rheidrwydd arno i wneud, yn hytrach na cheisio arwain trafodaeth agored a gonest yn y gymuned leol, fel y gwnaeth swyddogion Ceredigion a Gwynedd. Mewn gwirionedd, ffars yw ymgynghori mewn ffordd fel hyn. Gwaethaf oll, nid yw Cyngor Sir Gâr yn bwriadu trafod y mater hyd yn oed.

The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills—and I am pleased that she is here for this debate—would doubtless say what she always says on these occasions, namely that it is not a matter for her, even though Carmarthenshire County Council would tell us that its programme of school closures is due to guidance issued to it by the

Rhaid wrth eglurder ynghylch beth y gall defnyddwyr iaith ei ddisgwyl, a allai, yn ei dro, hyrwyddo defnydd ymarferol o'r Gymraeg gan y cyhoedd, gan arwain, yn bwysig, at godi hyder defnyddwyr iaith. Fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, un o'r prif wendidau yn y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol ar yr iaith Gymraeg yw nad yw'n gosod dyletswydd ar gyrff i ddarparu gwybodaeth i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg fel rhan o unrhyw ymchwiliad statudol i weithrediad cynlluniau iaith.

Mae hynny'n fy arwain ymlaen at ein gwelliannau 5 a 6, ac fe'u hesboniaf i'r Gweinidog, oherwydd nid yw'n syndod imi mewn gwirionedd nad oes arno eisiau eu cefnogi. Ym mis Gorffennaf 2005, ysgrifennodd cyfarwyddwr addysg Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin at arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn egluro y dylai ystyriaethau ad-drefnu ysgolion penodol gael eu penderfynu a'u datblygu gyda rhanddeiliaid perthnasol yn unig, y dylem i gyd deimlo'n dawel ein meddwl y ceid cyfleoedd i ymgynghori'n llawn a thrwyadl ar adegau priodol, a bod Sir Gaerfyrddin, wrth foderneiddio'i darpariaeth addysg, â'i bryd ar feithrin yr iaith Gymraeg, yn hytrach na chael unrhyw oblygiadau anffafriol.

However, as we saw with Mynydd Cerrig Primary School in Carmarthenshire, the county council has limited its consultation to the minimum possible, by allowing only a month for the consideration of the school's entire future, and by sending its document only to those bodies that it was obliged to send it to, rather than attempting to hold an open and honest discussion in the local community, as was done by officials at Ceredigion and Gwynedd. In truth, it is a farce to hold a consultation in that way. Worst of all, Carmarthenshire County Council does not even intend to discuss the matter.

Byddai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—ac yr wyf yn falch ei bod hi yma ar gyfer y ddadl hon—yn siŵr o ddweud yr hyn y bydd hi wastad yn ei ddweud ar yr achlysuron hyn, sef nad mater iddi hi mohono, er y dywedai Cyngor Sir Gâr wrthym fod ei raglen gau ysgolion yn ganlyniad arweiniad a roddwyd iddo gan

Welsh Assembly Government. It is time for the Minister to stop using the subsidiarity argument, and time for her to stop using the 'Not me, guv; I'm the guv' approach.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai egwyddor hawliau ieithyddol chwarae rhan allweddol yn nod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o greu cenedl ddwyieithog.*

Cynigiau welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu bod angen deddfwriaeth newydd yn bennaf i ymgorffori'r cyfleustodau hynny sydd wedi mudo o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat ers pasio'r Ddeddf gyfredol ar yr iaith Gymraeg.*

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylid datganoli'r holl bwerau dros yr iaith Gymraeg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

Ni chlywais yn araith y Gweinidog ac ni welaf yn yr adroddiad hwn y weledigaeth glir na'r awydd am lwyddiant a welwyd adeg lansiad 'Iaith Pawb' gan ein Gweinidog ni dros ddiwylliant, sef Jenny Randerson, adeg y glymblaid. A ninnau'n Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol, teimlwn gyfrifoldeb dros 'Iaith Pawb' er ei holl wendidau. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn nodi nifer o lwyddiannau a phethau positif. Mae'r ddadl am y Gymraeg wedi datblygu ers cyhoeddi 'Iaith Pawb', ond mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi methu symud ymlaen yn ddigonol. Heddiw, mae'r gwrthbleidiau wedi rhoi eu gwahaniaethau i'r naill ochr er mwyn cyflawni'r hyn sydd orau ar gyfer yr iaith ac ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Estynnaf wahoddiad i'r Gweinidog i ymuno â ni wrth i ni adeiladu ar gonsensws newydd i sefydlu statws statudol i'r iaith a chomisynydd iaith. Oedi'r Gweinidog o ran statws Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yw un o'r prif resymau pam na allwn ymddiried ynddo i ofalu am ddyfodol yr iaith. Yr oedd ei

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n bryd i'r Gweinidog roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio dadl sybsidiariti, ac yn bryd iddi roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r dull 'Nid y fi, bôs; fi yw'r bôs'.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the principle of linguistic rights should play a key part in the Assembly Government's aim of creating a bilingual nation.*

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that new legislation is needed primarily to incorporate those utilities that have migrated from the public sector to the private sector since the current Welsh language Act was passed.*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that all powers over the Welsh language should be devolved to the National Assembly.*

I did not hear in the Minister's speech and I did not see in this report any sign of the clear vision and desire for success that was manifest when 'Iaith Pawb' was launched by our Minister for culture, Jenny Randerson, at the time of the coalition. As Liberal Democrats, we feel some responsibility for 'Iaith Pawb', despite all its weaknesses. This report notes a number of successes and positive outcomes. The debate on the Welsh language has moved on since the publication of 'Iaith Pawb', but this Labour Government has failed to progress sufficiently. Today, the opposition parties have set aside their differences in order to achieve what is best for the language and for the whole of Wales. I invite the Minister to join us as we build on a new consensus to give a statutory footing for the language and a language commissioner. The Minister's dawdling with regard to the status of the Welsh Language Board is one of the main reasons why we cannot entrust the future of the language to

ddatganiad byr yn y Siambwr yr wythnos diwethaf yn enghraifft arall o'i ddiffyg arweinyddiaeth.

Mae adroddiad heddiw yn cynnwys nifer o lwyddiannau bwrdd yr iaith, llwyddiannau nad yw'r Llywodraeth, yn fy marn i, yn gallu eu hefelychu. Rhaid cadw'r bwrdd a'i arbenigedd. Mae'n cyflawni gwaith gwych ac ni welaf reswm dros gael gwared ar gorff sydd wedi gweithio, a hynny gyda Llywodraeth nad yw'n gweithio.

Cynigiad welliant 10 oherwydd, er bod dadl heddiw, heb bŵer deddfwriaethol go iawn, hwyrach mai'r unig beth y mae rhai yn tybio y llwyddwn i'w wneud yw cyfrannu at gynhesu byd eang. Dylid datganoli pwerau dros yr iaith i'r Cynulliad oherwydd o'r Cynulliad y daw 'Iaith Pawb' a'r Cynulliad sy'n atebol am 'Iaith Pawb'. Mae pobl Cymru yn edrych i'r Cynulliad fel y corff sy'n arwain ac yn gweithredu ar faterion yr iaith, sydd mor bwysig i Gymry Cymraeg. Yn ei pharodrwydd i gynnau coelcerth y cwangos, mae perygl bod y Llywodraeth wedi llosgi ei thŷ ei hun.

Cynigiad welliant 9 oherwydd fy mod yn credu bod angen Deddf iaith newydd arnom, er mwyn cynnwys gwasanaethau sydd wedi gadael y sector cyhoeddus ers cyflawni Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993.

Diddorol yw nodi teitl pennod 1.5 adroddiad eleni, sef 'Yr Unigolyn a Hawliau Iaith', ac eto nid oes sôn am hawliau ieithyddol ar ôl hynny. Dengys hynny amharodrwydd y Gweinidog, unwaith yn rhagor, i drin a thrafod yr egwyddor bwysig hon. Os ydym am greu cenedl wirioneddol ddwyieithog rhaid iddi fod yn seiliedig ar gydraddoldeb. Dyna fy rheswm dros gynnig gwelliant 8, oherwydd credaf y dylai hawliau ieithyddol chwarae rhan allweddol ym mwriad y Llywodraeth Lafur i greu cenedl ddwyieithog. A minnau'n Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol, credaf ei bod yn addas dehongli datblygu a hybu'r iaith yng nghyd-destun hawliau dynol neu ryddfrentiau sifil. Bydd rhoi hawliau ieithyddol yn annog pobl i hybu twf yr iaith. Un peth yw i'r wladwriaeth warchod lles yr iaith; peth arall yw gwneud yr iaith yn eiddo i'r bobl. Credaf ein bod

him. His brief statement in the Chamber last week was yet another example of his lack of leadership.

Today's report outlines many of the board's successes, which the Government, in my opinion, can never emulate. The board and its expertise must be retained. It accomplishes excellent work and I see no reason why we should abolish an organisation that works, and that alongside a Government that does not.

I propose amendment 10 because, although there is a debate today, without full legislative powers, some might think that the only thing we will succeed in doing is to contribute to global warming. Powers over the Welsh language should be devolved to the Assembly, because 'Iaith Pawb' comes from the Assembly and the Assembly is responsible for 'Iaith Pawb'. The people of Wales look to the Assembly as the body that takes the lead and acts on language matters, which are so important to Welsh speakers. In its eagerness to ignite the bonfire of the quangos, there is a danger that the Government has burnt its own house down.

I propose amendment 9 because I believe that we need a new Welsh language Act, to include those services that have left the public sector since the Welsh Language Act 1993 was enacted.

It is interesting to note the title of chapter 1.5 of this year's report, 'The Individual and Language Rights', yet no mention is made of language rights after that. Once again, this reveals the Minister's reticence to discuss this important principle. If we are to create a truly bilingual nation, that nation must be based on equality. That is why I proposed amendment 8, because I believe that language rights should play a key part in the Labour Government's aim of creating a bilingual nation. As a Liberal Democrat, I think that it is appropriate to interpret the development and the promotion of the language in the context of human rights or civil liberties. Giving people language rights will help them to support language growth. It is one thing for the state to safeguard the welfare of the language, but it is another to make the language the property of the people. I believe

wedi cyrraedd amser cyffrous yn hanes yr iaith a gobeithiaf y gallwn bwyso ar y Gweinidog i gyd-fynd â ni, i gynnal bwrdd yr iaith, ac i ddatblygu Cymru sy'n wir ddwyieithog.

that we have reached an exciting stage in the history of the language, and I hope that we can urge the Minister to join us, to support the language board and to develop a truly bilingual Wales.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have many more speakers and it is already 5.29 p.m. so, to allow the debate to continue, I invite the Business Minister to propose a motion to extend the meeting, under Standing Order No. 6.21.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennyf lawer mwy o siaradwyr ac mae hi eisoes yn 5.29 y prynhawn ac felly, er mwyn caniatáu i'r ddadl fynd yn ei blaen, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig ymestyn y cyfarfod, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends the time for this debate by 30 minutes.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn y ddadl hon am 30 munud.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Business Minister has proposed that we extend the meeting until 6 p.m.. Are there 10 Members in support of the motion? I see that there are. I therefore call for a vote on the motion.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'r Trefnydd wedi cynnig ein bod yn ymestyn y cyfarfod tan 6 o'r gloch. A oes 10 Aelod o blaid y cynnig? Gwelaf fod. Galwaf felly am bleidlais ar y cynnig.

5.30 p.m.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish

Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davies, Janet  
James, Irene  
Lewis, Huw  
Neagle, Lynne

Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb': Parhad The Annual Report of 'Iaith Pawb': Continued**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I still have many more Members wishing to speak than I can fit in. I am not imposing a three-minute time limit—Members may speak for up to five minutes, but where they can confine their remarks to three minutes, that would greatly help the Chair.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Mae'n bleser imi groesawu trydydd adroddiad blynyddol 'Iaith Pawb', a hefyd weld bod yr iaith yn cryfhau a thyfu'n gryf. Mae mwy o blant bach yn dysgu Cymraeg heddiw nag erioed, ac mae'n rhaid cofio nad yw dysgu'r iaith yn yr ysgol byth yn ddigon—mae'n rhaid hefyd wrth y cyfle i siarad y tu allan i'r dosbarth, yn y cartref. Felly, mae'n bwysig cael gwersi i rieni a phlant gyda'i gilydd. Nid oes gwell dosbarth na'r cartref, a dyna pam mae'r gwersi Ti a Fi mor bwysig. Hwyrach mai myfi yw'r unig Aelod Cynulliad o'r gogledd sy'n mwynhau'r daith i'r de bob nos Lun. Pam? Mae'n bleser clywed cymaint o Gymraeg yn cael ei siarad ar y trê, sy'n cychwyn yng Nghaerdybi ac yn teithio drwy Fangor a Llandudno, lle mae'r iaith yn gryf ac yn cael ei siarad yn bur ac yn naturiol bob dydd, heb feddwl.

Yr oedd yn dda gennyf glywed i £3 miliwn gael ei rhoi i addysg uwch i sicrhau bod mwy o bynciau yn cael eu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn ein prifysgolion, Bangor yn arbennig. Mae busnesau yn gwella hefyd, ac mae'n bosibl yn awr gael llythyrau a biliau dwyieithog, ond dim digon.

Mae rhai meysydd lle nad oes digon yn cael

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennyf lawer mwy o Aelodau sy'n dymuno siarad na sydd o amser ar gael ar eu cyfer. Nid wyf yn gosod terfyn amser o dri munud—gall Aelodau siarad am hyd at bum munud, ond os gallant gyfyngu eu sylwadau i dri munud, byddai hynny o gymorth mawr i'r Gadair.

**Denise Idris Jones:** It gives me pleasure to welcome the third annual 'Iaith Pawb' report, and to see that the language has become stronger and is growing strongly. More young children are learning Welsh today than ever before, and we have to remember that it is never enough just to learn the language in school—you also have to have the opportunity to speak it outside of the classroom, in the home. It is important, therefore, to have lessons for children and parents together. There is no better classroom than the home, and that is why the Ti a Fi classes are so important. Perhaps I am the only Assembly Member from north Wales who enjoys the journey south every Monday evening. Why? It is because it is a pleasure to hear so much Welsh spoken on the train, which starts in Holyhead and travels through Bangor and Llandudno, where the language is strong and is spoken purely and naturally every day, without thinking about it.

I was pleased to hear that £3 million has been given to higher education to ensure that more subjects are taught through the medium of Welsh in our universities, Bangor in particular. Businesses are improving, too, and it is now possible to receive bilingual letters and bills, but not enough.

There are certain areas in which not enough

ei wneud o hyd. Tuag wythnos yn ôl, cefais y cyfle i siarad â hen ddyn oedd wedi dioddef trawiad, sydd wedi effeithio ar ei allu i siarad. Er ei fod yn gwella, a'i bod yn bosibl iddo gael therapi lleferydd, nid oedd y therapi hwnnw drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae hynny'n anodd iddo: mae hyn yn drist. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau ein bod yn creu Cymru dwyieithog, ac mae hynny'n bleser gennyf.

**Mark Isherwood:** I rise in support of amendment 7, proposed by my colleague, Lisa Francis, which calls on the Assembly Government to prioritise affordable housing in the 'Iaith Pawb' strategy. By 'affordable housing', let me stress that that means housing that people can afford to rent or buy with their current incomes.

'Iaith Pawb' is about promoting the use of the Welsh language in all aspects of Welsh life. Cymuned is campaigning for the *Fro Gymraeg*, and for policies that will strengthen Cymraeg-speaking communities—policies focused on housing and the economy.

Dylai'r Gymraeg fod yn ganolog i'n cymunedau, felly mae'n rhaid i dai fforddiadwy fod yn ganolog i'n cymunedau hefyd.

However, housing receives less than one page in this 74-page Assembly Government annual report.

In evidence to the National Assembly, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation highlighted the severe shortage of low-cost housing in many rural areas, and the particularly difficult problems faced by young people in rural areas. The latest *Welsh Housing Quarterly* includes a report on community regeneration and the Skills for Empowerment event held in Cardiff in May. I was a member of the cross-party question time panel at that event.

This report stated that a common and painful theme running through the discussions was

is being done still. About a week ago, I had the opportunity to speak to an elderly man who had suffered a stroke, which has affected his speech. Although his health was improving, and he could have speech therapy, that therapy was not available through the medium of Welsh. That was difficult for him, and it is sad. Having said that, the report shows that the Assembly Government is ensuring that we are creating a bilingual Wales, and that brings me great pleasure.

**Mark Isherwood:** Codaf i gefnogi gwelliant 7, a gynigiwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod Lisa Francis, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi blaenoriaeth i dai fforddiadwy yn strategaeth 'Iaith Pawb'. Wrth gyfeirio at 'dai fforddiadwy', gadewch imi bwysleisio bod hynny'n golygu tai y gall pobl fforddio eu rhentu neu eu prynu gyda'u hincwm presennol.

Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn golygu hyrwyddo defnydd o'r Gymraeg ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd Cymru. Mae Cymuned yn ymgyrchu dros *Fro Gymraeg*, ac am bolisiau a fydd yn cryfhau cymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith—polisiau sy'n canolbwyntio ar dai a'r economi.

The Welsh language should be at the heart of our communities, and therefore affordable housing must also be at the heart of our communities.

Fodd bynnag, mae tai'n cael llai nag un dudalen o sylw yn adroddiad blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sy'n 74 tudalen o hyd.

Mewn tystiolaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, tynnodd Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree sylw at y prinder difrifol o dai cost isel mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig, a'r problemau difrifol y mae pobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn eu hwynebu. Mae'r *Welsh Housing Quarterly* diweddaraf yn cynnwys adroddiad ar adfywio cymunedol a'r digwyddiad Skills for Empowerment a gynhaliwyd yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Mai. Yr oeddwn yn aelod o banel y seiat holi trawsbleidiol yn y digwyddiad hwnnw.

Nododd yr adroddiad hwn mai thema gyffredin a phoenus a oedd yn elfen ganolog



the struggle to join up policy and practice in Wales. Listening to real life stories about things that get in the way of the change, one could feel a rising anger. The rhetoric of empowerment does not match the reality. Cardiff University states that good housing should be at the heart of community regeneration, and the Chartered Institute of Housing states that an adequate supply of affordable housing is key to creating sustainable communities. The Confederation of British Industry has expressed disappointment that housing does not feature in the Assembly Government's document, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', stating that new housing is a key factor in attracting investment into Wales, and in retaining the workforce. This reflects previous warnings by Business in the Community that the lack of affordable housing impacts on the ability of existing businesses to grow, and affects the ability to attract new businesses.

Despite rising waiting lists, rising homelessness and rising house prices, the Labour Assembly Government has massively cut funding for social and affordable housing. As I have said previously, 17,400 affordable houses were built in Wales during the last six years of Conservative Government, but just 4,400 such houses were built in the first six years of devolution, which is a 75 per cent cut. The Assembly Government boasts of its affordable housing toolkit—I have seen press releases from Labour Assembly Members during the past week. However, while acknowledging that it is a useful checklist, the Wales rural housing associations group and the Wales rural housing authorities network add that there is nothing new or innovative in the guide. They also express disappointment that the toolkit does not show a firm commitment to community land trusts, and express concern that the rural homebuy assisted home purchase scheme is not working.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please make points that relate to 'Iaith Pawb' from time to time.

o'r trafodaethau oedd yr anhawster i gydlynu polisïau a gweithredu yng Nghymru. Wrth wrando ar yr hanesion go iawn am fywydau pobl ynglŷn â phethau sy'n rhwystro newid, gallem deimlo dichter yn codi. Nid oes llawer o gysylltiad rhwng rethreg grymuso a realiti'r sefyllfa. Dywed Prifysgol Caerdydd y dylai tai da fod yn elfen ganolog o adfywio cymunedau, a dywed y Sefydliad Siartredig Tai bod cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy'n allweddol i greu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi mynegi siom nad yw tai yn elfen o ddogfen Llywodraeth y Cynulliad 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', gan ddatgan fod tai newydd yn ffactor allweddol i ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru, ac i gadw'r gweithlu. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu rhybuddion blaenorol a fynegwyd gan Fusnes yn y Gymuned bod prinder tai fforddiadwy'n effeithio ar allu busnesau presennol i dyfu, a'i fod yn effeithio ar y gallu i ddenu busnesau newydd.

Er gwaethaf y twf yn y rhestrau aros, cynnydd mewn digartrefedd a phrisiau tai sy'n codi, mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi cwtogi'n ddifrifol ar yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy. Fel y dywedais eisoes, adeiladwyd 17,400 o dai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru yn ystod chwe blynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, ond dim ond 4,400 o dai o'r fath a adeiladwyd yn ystod chwe blynedd gyntaf datganoli, sy'n ostyngiad o 75 y cant. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymffrostio yn ei pheccyn cymorth tai fforddiadwy—yr wyf wedi gweld datganiadau i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan Aelodau Llafur o'r Cynulliad yn ystod yr wythnos ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, er yn cydnabod ei bod yn rhestr wirio ddefnyddiol, dywed grŵp cymdeithasau tai gwledig Cymru a rhwydwaith awdurdodau tai gwledig Cymru nad oes unrhyw beth newydd nac arloesol yn yr arweiniad. Maent hefyd yn mynegi siom nad yw'r pecyn cymorth yn cynnwys ymrwymiad pendant i ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, ac maent yn mynegi pryder nad yw'r cynllun cymorth i brynu tai gwledig yn gweithio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gwnewch sylwadau sy'n berthnasol i 'Iaith Pawb' o bryd i'w gilydd, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Mark Isherwood:** Instead of action by the Assembly Government in relation to housing, we get hot air. Instead of engagement and delivery, we get process and policy. Cymraeg-speaking communities have been betrayed when it comes to housing in their own areas.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn hytrach na bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu ym maes tai, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gael yw gwynt poeth. Yn hytrach na gweithredu a chyflawni, cawn brosesau a pholisïau. Mae cymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith wedi cael eu bradychu pan ddaw'n fater o dai yn eu hardaloedd eu hunain.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae traddodiad hir yn y Blaid Lafur o gefnogi'r iaith. Dywedodd Aneurin Bevan yn 1953 ei fod yn ddiwylliant unigryw ac nad oedd yn fodlon ei weld yn marw. Mae pethau wedi symud ymlaen ers hynny. Mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn fyw yn awr ac yr ydym yn trafod y ffordd ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn hyrwyddo defnydd o'r iaith. Yr wyf wedi dysgu ei bod yn haws pigo lan y Gymraeg mewn sefyllfa dwyieithog. Yn y Cynulliad, mae'n bosibl gwrando ar yr iaith a'i defnyddio; mae'n bosibl ymarfer, ac mae'r awyrgylch yn gefnogol. Nid oes unrhyw un yn poeni os byddwch yn gwneud camgymeriad. Fel arfer, mae pawb yn helpu.

**Leighton Andrews:** There is a long tradition in the Labour Party of supporting the language. Aneurin Bevan said in 1953 that it was a unique culture, and that he was not willing to see it die. Things have moved on since then. The Welsh language is now vibrant, and we are discussing the way forward. It is important that we promote the use of the language. I have learned that it is easier to pick up the language in a bilingual context. At the Assembly, it is possible to listen to the language and use it; you can practice, and there is a supportive atmosphere. No-one minds if you make a mistake. Everyone is usually willing to help.

Mae'n amlwg bod llawer o gyfleoedd i ddysgu'r iaith. Yr oeddwn yn hapus i agor Gŵyl Feithrin Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ddiweddar. Mae llawer o grwpiau meithrin yn y Rhondda ac yn Rhondda Cynon Taf hefyd.

It is clear that there are many opportunities to learn the language. I was pleased to open the Meithrin Festival in Rhondda Cynon Taf recently. There are many nursery groups in the Rhondda and throughout Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Defnyddio'r iaith yw un o'r pethau pwysicaf. Yr wyf wedi darllen yr arolwg o ddefnydd iaith gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae'n amlwg bod pobl eisïau defnyddio'r iaith, ond weithiau mae'n anodd iddynt wneud hynny. Os ydym am greu Cymru ddwyieithog, mae'n rhaid inni helpu mwy o bobl i ddysgu'r iaith a'i defnyddio. Yn anffodus, mae'n rhaid inni wneud mwy i gryfhau dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith yn ein hysgolion, yn ychwanegol at gael ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae gormod o bobl yn gadael yr ysgol heb fedru siarad yr iaith, er eu bod wedi dysgu'r iaith nes iddynt gyrraedd 16 oed. Mae adroddiad Estyn yn dweud hynny.

Using the language is one of the most important things. I have read the survey of language use by the Welsh Language Board. It is clear that people wish to use the language, but it can sometimes be difficult for them to do so. If we are to create a bilingual Wales, we must assist more people to learn and use the language. Unfortunately, we must do more to strengthen the teaching of Welsh as a second language in our schools, in addition to having Welsh-medium schools. Too many people leave school without being able to speak the language, despite their having learned the language up to the age of 16. The Estyn report states that.

Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r cynigion gan Ken Hopkins o'r Rhondda yn ei bamffled 'Achub ein Haith', a gyhoeddwyd gan y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig.

I support the proposals of Ken Hopkins from the Rhondda in his pamphlet 'Saving our Language', published by the Institute of Welsh Affairs.

**Owen John Thomas:** It is a very good idea

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae syniad Ken

of Ken Hopkins and yours to increase the teaching of Welsh as second language, but in order to do that you have to have many more Welsh-speaking staff than at present. From where will you get those staff?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n rhaid ichi ddarllen ei bamffled. Mae'n esbonio profiad ysgolion fel Ysgol Gyfun Treorci a'r ysgolion cynradd sy'n ei bwydo. Mae'n dadlau dros gael targedau ar gyfer y nifer sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg, a dros gefnogi ehangu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ym mhob ysgol. Mae'r pamffled yn ddiddorol a dylai pobl ei ddarllen.

5.40 p.m.

Yr wyf am sôn am y cysylltiad rhwng datblygu'r iaith a datblygu'r economi. Gwn fod Menter a Busnes wedi cyhoeddi astudiaeth hyd a lled ar iaith, diwylliant a'r economi. Mae'n rhaid inni fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd sydd gennym pan fyddwn yn datblygu prosiectau ar gyfer y sefyllfa ddwyieithog, er enghraifft, yn y diwydiannau creadigol.

Ar gwestiwn Mesur ar yr iaith Gymraeg, dywedodd y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd Mesur i uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg â'r Llywodraeth ar ôl 2007. Felly, dyma'r cyfle i greu consensws o gwmpas y Mesur newydd. Nid wyf yn cytuno â'r gwrthblaid ar y pwnc hwn; cytunaf â'r polisi i uno bwrdd yr iaith â'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni greu consensws newydd ynglŷn â'r iaith Gymraeg ar ôl 2007. Yn y dyfodol, bydd yn rhaid inni symud y tu hwnt i 'Iaith Pawb'.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will start by talking about the importance of legislation. Legislation is just one tool for promoting the language, but it is an important one. It is crucial that we remember that the previous two Acts were ground-breaking in their time. However, we have moved on, and in two ways. First, following the privatisation of utilities, the existing language Act is simply no longer a neat fit; we have to bend the legislation to make it fit what was intended to apply to the utilities when the original Act was passed. Secondly, we have moved on in

Hopkins yn un da ynghyd â'ch syniad chi i gynyddu dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith, ond er mwyn gwneud hynny rhaid cael llawer iawn mwy o staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg na'r hyn sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd. O ble cawn ni'r staff hynny?

**Leighton Andrews:** You must read his pamphlet. It explains the experience of schools such as Ysgol Gyfun Treorci and its feeder primary schools. It argues for setting targets for the number of Welsh speakers, and for supporting the expansion of teaching through the medium of Welsh at all schools. The pamphlet is interesting and people should read it.

I want to discuss the link between developing the language and developing the economy. I know that Menter a Busnes has published a scoping study on language, culture and the economy. We must take the opportunities that we have in developing projects for the bilingual situation, for example, in the creative industries.

On the question of a Welsh Language Bill, the Minister said last week that there will be a Bill to merge the Welsh Language Board and the Government after 2007. Therefore, this is an opportunity to create consensus around the new Bill. I do not agree with the opposition on this subject; I agree with the policy of merging the language board with the Government. However, we must create a new consensus post 2007 on the Welsh language. In the future, we must move beyond 'Iaith Pawb'.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf am ddechrau trwy sôn am bwysigrwydd deddfwriaeth. Un erfyn yn unig i hyrwyddo'r iaith yw deddfwriaeth, ond mae'n un pwysig. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cofio bod y ddwy Ddeddf flaenorol yn rhai arloesol yn eu dydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen, a hynny mewn dwy ffordd. Yn gyntaf, yn dilyn preifateiddio'r cyfleustodau, nid yw'r Ddeddf iaith bresennol yn gweddu cystal; rhaid inni ystumio'r deddfwriaeth i'w gwneud yn addas ar gyfer yr hyn a fwriadwyd i fod yn berthnasol i'r cyfleustodau pan basiwyd y

terms of our concept of rights. I will illustrate to the Minister, since he clearly did not understand the issue earlier on, what I mean by that.

Representatives from the Post Office came to talk to me about the new crown branch in Cardiff, which is to replace that in the old building. When I asked about the provision of services in Welsh, I was told that the post office operates a bilingual service, as it is bound to do by its own obligations. We all know that when go to the post office, we can pick up bilingual leaflets, and the recorded announcement is bilingual. However, when I asked how many Welsh-speaking staff were employed there, I was told 'none'. So I said that, in that case, I do not have the right to go there and demand a service through the medium of Welsh. The response was, 'Well, you would not get one, because we have no Welsh-speaking staff.' There is a nice ending to this story, because they have recently written to me, clearly shamed by the whole exchange, to say that they are now recruiting Welsh-speaking staff. This is a post office in the centre of our capital city. The representatives did not regard it as a right for their customers to be able to speak, over the counter, to people through the medium of Welsh.

Legislation and rights are only one side of the story. Education is another key part of the jigsaw. I was delighted to read in the 'Iaith Pawb' report about various pilot projects on new ways of delivering Welsh-medium education and new ways of allowing children to catch up and get that second chance, which is so vital. However, we still do not have a strong enough structure to support the establishment of new Welsh-medium schools and to encourage councils that wish to do this.

I will refer to the situation in Cardiff. Leaving aside the details of which school does what, in Cardiff there is an expanding demand for Welsh-medium education, and a declining demand for English-medium education. The council put forward a plan in which it said that it would convert some

Ddeddf wreiddiol. Yn ail, yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen o ran ein cysyniad o hawliau. Rhoddaf enghraifft i'r Gweinidog, gan ei bod yn amlwg na ddeallodd y mater dan sylw'n gynharach, o'r hyn a olygaf wrth hynny.

Daeth cynrychiolwyr o Swyddfa'r Post i drafod cangen newydd y goron yng Nghaerdydd, sydd i ddisodli'r hen adeilad. Pan holais am ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau yn Gymraeg, dywedwyd wrthyf fod swyddfa'r post yn gweithredu gwasanaeth dwyieithog, gan ei bod wedi ymrwmo i wneud hynny gan ei rhwymedigaethau ei hun. Gwyddom pan fyddwn yn mynd i swyddfa'r post y gallwn gael taflenni dwyieithog, a bod y cyhoeddiad sydd wedi ei recordio'n un dwyieithog. Fodd bynnag, pan ofynnais faint o staff sy'n medru'r Gymraeg sy'n cael eu cyflogi yno, yr ateb a gefais oedd 'dim'. Dywedais nad oes gennyf, felly, yr hawl i fynd yno a mynnu gwasanaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr ymateb oedd, 'Wel, ni chaech hynny, oherwydd nid oes gennym staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg.' Mae diwedd glo hapus i'r stori hon, gan eu bod wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ddiweddar, yn amlwg ar ôl cael eu cywilyddio gan yr holl ddiwyddiad, i ddweud eu bod yn awr yn recriwtio staff sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Mae hon yn gangen o swyddfa'r post yng nghanol ein prifddinas. Nid oedd y cynrychiolwyr yn ystyried bod gan eu cwsmeriaid yr hawl i allu siarad, dros y cownter, â phobl trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Dim ond un ochr o'r geiniog yw deddfwriaeth a hawliau. Mae addysg yn ddarn arall o'r jig-so. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd yn darllen yn adroddiad 'Iaith Pawb' am y gwahanol brosiectau peilot ar ffyrdd newydd o gyflwyno addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a dulliau newydd i alluogi plant i ddal i fyny a chael yr ail gyfle hwnnw, sydd mor allweddol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennym eto strwythur digon cryf i gefnogi sefydlu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ac i annog cynghorau sy'n dymuno gwneud hynny.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio at y sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd. Nid wyf am gynnwys manylion am ba ysgol sy'n gwneud beth, yng Nghaerdydd mae galw cynyddol am addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a gostyngiad yn y galw am addysg trwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Cyflwynodd y cyngor gynllun lle dywedwyd

English-medium schools to Welsh-medium schools. I hope that some people here will share my surprise that Plaid Cymru managed to take a ridiculous in-principle decision that it would not countenance the conversion of any English-medium school to a Welsh-medium school on the grounds that it was the closure of a school. That is a completely ludicrous position.

**Owen John Thomas:** What you are saying is not strictly correct.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is strictly correct.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Owen John Thomas:** The party's policy was that Welsh-medium schools should be set up after a survey had done to find out the demand. Therefore, you would have an evidence base, as the Minister would say, for the demand. The Liberal Democrats could not show that. People in Radnor Primary School, Eglwys Wen Primary School and Cefn Onn Primary School were up in arms about it.

**Jenny Randerson:** Your weasel words will not do, Owen John. The council had conducted a massive survey in conjunction with the Minister's own officials. Of course, it is Plaid Cymru's party policy not to countenance the closure of any schools. [*Interruption.*] That is just not an acceptable excuse.

Finally, it is ironic that most of 'Iaith Pawb' refers this year, as it does every year, to the work of the Welsh Language Board, which the Minister has set out to destroy. It is only his own sheer ineptitude that has prevented that from happening already and has given us a lifeline for the next couple of years in terms of the board's future. It is regrettable that the uncertainty has undermined both staff morale and their sense of purpose as well as future strategic planning for the language. I still wonder why, because the language board is welcomed and congratulated throughout the world on its expertise, success and its track record in promoting the language.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Siaradaf am fy

y byddai'n newid rhai ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg i fod yn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Gobeithiaf y bydd rhai pobl yma yn rhannu fy syndod fod Plaid Cymru wedi llwyddo i wneud penderfyniad hurt mewn egwyddor na fyddai'n cefnogi cynlluniau i droi ysgol gyfrwng Saesneg i fod yn ysgol gyfrwng Gymraeg gan y byddai hynny'n golygu cau ysgol. Mae hynny'n sefyllfa gwbl hurt.

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid yw'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yn gwbl gywir.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n gwbl gywir.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Owen John Thomas:** Polisi'r blaid oedd y dylid sefydlu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ar ôl cynnal arolwg i ganfod y galw am un. Felly, byddai gennych dystiolaeth wedyn, fel y byddai'r Gweinidog yn ei ddweud, o'r galw. Ni allai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddangos hynny. Yr oedd pobl yn Ysgol Gynradd Maesyfed, Ysgol Gynradd Eglwys Wen ac Ysgol Gynradd Cefn Onn yn gandryll ynghylch y peth.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni wnaiff eich geiriau slic mo'r tro, Owen John. Mae'r cyngor wedi cynnal arolwg eang iawn ar y cyd â swyddogion y Gweinidog ei hun. Wrth gwrs, polisi Plaid Cymru yw peidio â chymeradwyo cau unrhyw ysgol. [*Torri ar draws.*] Nid yw hynny'n esgus derbynol o gwbl.

Yn olaf, mae'n eironig bod y rhan fwyaf o 'Iaith Pawb' yn cyfeirio eleni, fel y mae'n ei wneud bob blwyddyn, at waith Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, sy'n gorff y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei ddinistrio. Dim ond ei ddiffyg gallu llwyr sydd wedi atal hynny rhag digwydd yn barod ac sydd wedi taflu rhaff inni dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf o ran dyfodol y bwrdd. Mae'r ansicrwydd hynny, gwaetha'r modd, wedi tansilio moral y staff a'u teimlad o bwrpas yn ogystal â'r cynllunio strategol ar gyfer yr iaith. Mae'r peth dal yn ddirgelwch imi, oherwydd mae bwrdd yr iaith yn cael ei groesawu a'i longyfarch ar draws y byd am ei arbenigedd, ei lwyddiant a'i enw da am hybu'r iaith.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I will speak about my

nheimladau cryf, personol, fel rhywun sydd, yn y gorffennol, wedi rhoi ei swydd ar y lein i amddiffyn yr iaith. Amddiffynaf yr hawl i ddewis addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, ond ni ddylem anghofio pwysigrwydd a phoblogrwydd y model dysgu a gynigir yn Ysgol Dyffryn Aman, lle mae mwy o ddewis ynglyn â phynciau i'w dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond lle mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei dysgu fel iaith gyntaf.

Mae angen cydnabod realiti'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae yng Ngwauncaegurwen. Tri phlentyn yn unig allan o flwyddyn o 11 sydd wedi dewis mynd i Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera eleni, er bod Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Gwauncaegurwen yn un o'r ysgolion sy'n bwydo Ystalyfera. Yn fy marn i, mae'n dda o beth i beidio â chyfyngu dysgu'r Gymraeg fel iaith gyntaf i ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn unig. Yr wyf yn falch bod Ysgol Gyfun Cwmtawe yn awr yn cynnig y Gymraeg fel iaith gyntaf. Am rai blynyddoedd, nid oedd hynny'n bosibl.

Mae'n rhaid sylweddoli, hyd yn oed yng Ngwauncaegurwen, bod 61 y cant o rieni plant yr ysgol gynradd yn rhieni di-Gymraeg a bod y gymuned hefyd yn elwa o fenter Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Er hynny, hysbyseb pob swydd gan y bartneriaeth Cymunedau'n Gyntaf fel swydd lle mae'r Gymraeg yn hanfodol. Yn fy mhrofiad i, mae hynny'n golygu bod pobl â chymwysterau addas i gyflawni swydd swyddog datblygu cymuned yn aml yn teimlo nad yw eu Cymraeg yn ddigon da neu eu bod yn cael eu cau allan. Nid dyna'r ffordd i hybu—

**Owen John Thomas:** Os nad yw Cymraeg y bobl hyn yn iawn, ac os oes rhyw wendid ynnddi, a ydych yn rhoi'r bai ar gyfundrefn yr ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg neu'r rhai sy'n dysgu rhywfaint o Gymraeg? Beth yn union sydd o'i le?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Credaf eich bod wedi cwmpo i mewn i fy nwylo ac esboniaf hynny yn fy sylwadau nesaf.

Ni chredaf mai dyna'r ffordd i hybu, meithrin a datblygu'r iaith o fewn cymunedau Cymraeg traddodiadol. Dylem ymfalchïo yn ein tafodiaith—Cymraeg carreg calch neu

strong, personal feelings, as someone who, in the past, has put her job on the line to defend the language. I defend the right to choose Welsh-medium education, but we should not forget the importance and popularity of the teaching model used in Aman Valley School, where there is more choice with regard to subjects taught through the medium of Welsh, but where Welsh is taught as a first language.

We must acknowledge the reality of the situation as it is in Gwauncaegurwen. Only three children out of a year of 11 have chosen to attend Ysgol Gyfun Ystalyfera this year, despite the fact that Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Gwauncaegurwen is one of the feeder schools for Ystalyfera. In my opinion, it is good not to confine the teaching of Welsh as a first language to Welsh-medium schools. I am glad that Cwmtawe Comprehensive School also offers Welsh as a first language. For many years, that was not possible.

We must acknowledge that, even in Gwauncaegurwen, 61 per cent of the parents of children in the primary school are non-Welsh-speakers and that the community also benefits from the Communities First initiative. However, every job with the Communities First partnership is advertised with the requirement that Welsh is essential. In my experience, that means that people with the appropriate qualifications and abilities to undertake community development officer jobs often feel that their Welsh is not good enough or that they are being excluded. That is not the way to promote—

**Owen John Thomas:** If these people's Welsh is not right, and if there is something wrong with it, do you blame the Welsh-medium schools system or those schools that teach some Welsh? What is wrong?

**Gwenda Thomas:** I think that you have fallen into my hands and I will explain as much in my next comments.

I do not think that that is the way to promote, develop and nurture the Welsh language in traditional Welsh communities. We should take pride in and celebrate dialect, as that is

Gymraeg y cwm—gan mai dyna'r Gymraeg sydd yn fyw ymhlith mwyafrif pobl Gwauncaegurwen, a sawl Gwauncaegurwen arall. Beth a wnaem heb yr hen ddywediadau—'Siwmai', 'Gad dy lap', 'Ffordd aer', 'Twls ar y bar' a 'Thwll top'? Mae rhai o'r rhain wedi eu hetifeddu o'r gweithfeydd glo.

5.50 p.m.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch am ildio a chefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedwch. Mae gormod o bwyslais ar beth yw Cymraeg cywir a pha Gymraeg y dylem ei defnyddio. Tra'n bod yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg bob dydd, nid oes ots eon bod yn defnyddio geiriau gwahanol. Mae'n bwynt pwysig ofnadwy, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tynnu sylw ato.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Diolch, Brynle.

Carwn hefyd weld mwy o adnoddau'r Mentrau Iaith yn cael eu defnyddio i gefnogi partneriaethau Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.

Yn olaf, a ddylem ystyried beth yw'r ffordd orau i'n cefnogi ni fel Aelodau i allu gweithio a chyfathrebu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Ai cyfieithu pob gair o bob dogfen a phob tamaid o ddeddfwriaeth yw'r ffordd orau, ynteu a oes ffordd llawer gwell i ddefnyddio adnoddau ar ein cyfer ni a'r cyhoedd? Ys gwn i.

Yn y pen draw—a theimlaf hyn yn ddiffuant—nid ysgrifennu manffesto gwleidyddol derbyniol yw'r gamp i ni fel gwleidyddion, ond ennill calonnau a meddyliau ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'n ddiddorol bod nifer o'r cyfraniadau heddiw wedi'u gwneud yn Gymraeg. Llongyfarchaf y rhai sydd wedi gwneud hynny, yn enwedig y rhai sydd wedi dysgu'r Gymraeg, ond credaf y byddai'n well inni ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn amlach mewn areithiau nad ydynt yn ymwneud â'r iaith.

Mae'r adroddiad yn ddisgrifiad o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y maes hwn drwy fwrdd yr iaith. Mae nifer o bethau da a chadarnhaol yn y ddogfen, ac mae swyddogion a gweithwyr yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog—yr wyf yn dod i gysylltiad â hwy yn gyson. Problem sylfaenol

the Welsh that is alive and used by the majority of people in Gwauncaegurwen, and other Gwauncaegurwens across Wales. What would we do without the old sayings, 'Siwmai', 'Gad dy lap', 'Ffordd aer', 'Twls ar y bar' and 'Thwll top'. Some of these were inherited from the coal mines.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for giving way and I support what you say. There is too much emphasis on what is correct Welsh and which Welsh we should use. While we use Welsh every day, it does not matter that we use different words. It is an extremely important point, and I am pleased that you have drawn attention to it.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Thank you, Brynle.

I would also like to see more Mentrau Iaith resources being used to support Communities First partnerships.

Finally, should we consider the best way of supporting us as Members to work and communicate through the medium of Welsh? Is translating every word of every document and every piece of legislation the best way of doing this, or is there a far better way to use resources for us and the public? I wonder.

At the end of the day—and I feel this sincerely—the goal for us as politicians is not to write an acceptable political manifesto; rather it is winning the hearts and minds of our children and young people.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** It is interesting that a number of the contributions today have been in Welsh. I congratulate those who did that, particularly those who have learned Welsh, but I believe that we should use Welsh more frequently in speeches that are not related to the language.

The report describes what is happening in this field through the language board. There are a number of good and positive things in the document, and there are officials and workers who do wonderful work—I come into contact with them regularly. The

'Iaith Pawb' oedd diffyg targedau a diffyg ffyrdd o fesur llwyddiant a chynnydd. Mae'r adroddiad, yn anffodus, yn adlewyrchu'r diffygion hynny.

Canolbwyntiaf ychydig ar yr adran sy'n ymwneud â thai—adran fach iawn, fel y dywedodd Mark Isherwood. Os edrychwch yn ôl at 'Iaith Pawb', mae'n cyfeirio at ddogfen, neu astudiaeth, diddorol iawn, sef astudiaeth cymunedau cytbwys o ran oed. Ond, beth a ddigwyddodd i'r ddogfen honno? Cafodd ei hanghofio a'i chladdu. Gwelaf yn yr adroddiad blynyddol fod Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru bellach yn mynd i wneud adroddiad arall ar y newid mewn dylanwadau cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ar boblogaeth Cymru wledig—diddorol iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn astudiaeth werthfawr iawn. Ond, mae'n ymddangos ein bod yn mynd o un astudiaeth i'r llall heb weithredu ar yr astudiaethau hynny na mesur eu llwyddiant neu eu methiant. Mae adolygiad o nodyn cyngor technegol 1 a 2 wedi'i gynnal, ac mae pethau cadarnhaol ynddynt, ond nid yw nodyn cyngor technegol 20, sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â rhan yr iaith Gymraeg yn y broses gynllunio, wedi ei ddiwygio. Mae gwaith wedi ei wneud arno, ond nid oes cynnydd na mwy o eglurder yn y sefyllfa. Mae'n hen bryd claddu nodyn cyngor technegol 20 neu ei wneud yn rhan annatod o'r broses gynllunio.

Yn olaf, un o amcanion 'Iaith Pawb' oedd sefydlogi a chadw'r cymunedau lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith fyw, yn cael ei siarad gan dros 70 y cant o'r trigolion. Mae cyfeiriad yn yr adroddiad at nifer o brosiectau yn yr ardaloedd hynny, ond nid oes modd mesur llwyddiant neu aflwyddiant y prosiectau hynny. Gwelaf gyfeiriad at 'Llwyddo'n Lleol', prosiect sydd wedi ei gychwyn gan Gyngor Gwynedd, ond, unwaith eto, nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw perthynas bwrdd yr iaith na'r adroddiad hwn â'r prosiect hwnnw. Mae diffyg fframwaith strwythurol i fesur llwyddiant. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas, yr her fwyaf i ni yw sut i annog y defnydd o'r Gymraeg ymhlith pobl ifanc yn ein cymunedau. Nid oes gennyf atebion hawdd i hynny, ac nid oes atebion yn yr adroddiad ychwaith; nid wyf yn disgwyl atebion hawdd, ond dyna'r sialens i ni. Os na allwn ddangos rhyw fath o fframwaith

fundamental problem with 'Iaith Pawb' was its lack of targets and the lack of ways to measure success and progress. The report, unfortunately, reflects those deficiencies.

I will concentrate on the section relating to housing—it is a small section, as Mark Isherwood said. If we look back at 'Iaith Pawb', there is a reference to an interesting document, or study, on age-balanced communities. However, what happened to that document? It was forgotten and buried. I see in the annual report that the Wales Rural Observatory is to undertake another report on the changing social and cultural influences on the population in rural Wales—very interesting. I am sure that it will be a valuable study. However, it is as if we go from one study to the next without acting upon those studies and without measuring their success or failure. Technical advice notes 1 and 2 have been reviewed, and they include positive aspects, but technical advice note 20, which specifically relates to the role of the Welsh language in the planning process, has not been reviewed. Work has been carried out on it, but there has been neither progress nor further clarification on the situation. It is high time that technical advice note 20 was either buried or made an integral part of the planning process.

Finally, one of the aims of 'Iaith Pawb' was to stabilise and retain those communities where the Welsh language is a vibrant language, spoken by over 70 per cent of the population. There is a reference in the report to a number of projects in those areas, but there is no way of measuring the success or failure of those projects. I see that there is a reference to the 'Get on in Gwynedd' initiative, set up by Gwynedd Council, but, once again, I am not sure what relationship the language board or this report has with that project. There is no strategic framework for us to measure success. As Gwenda Thomas said, the biggest challenge that we face is how to encourage the use of the Welsh language among young people in our communities. I have no easy answers to that, and there are no solutions in the report; I do not expect easy answers, but that is the challenge for us. If we cannot produce some



strwythurol o ran sut yr ydym yn gobeithio cyrraedd y nod, ni allwn ddisgwyl cyrraedd y nod drwy hap a damwain.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call John Griffiths, but I must call the Minister at 5.55 p.m..

**John Griffiths:** Mae ffordd hir i fynd cyn cael Cymru ddwyieithog, ond credaf ein bod wedi symud ymlaen. Yng Nghasnewydd, er enghraifft, pan oeddwn i'n ifanc yr oedd ychydig o Gymraeg i'w glywed, ond erbyn hyn mae mwy. Mae gennym Ysgol Gymraeg Casnewydd, mae pawb sydd mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg yn dysgu Cymraeg, cynhelir dosbarthiadau i oedolion, mae arwyddion Cymraeg o gwmpas y ddinas, a cheir datganiadau Cymraeg yn yr orsaf drenau. Yn ddiweddar, daeth yr eisteddfod genedlaethol yn ôl i Gasnewydd, ac yr oedd yr eisteddfod honno, unwaith eto, yn llwyddiannus iawn. Felly, credaf fod pethau yn symud ymlaen. Yn awr, mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau bod y camau hynny'n parhau, a'n bod yn adeiladu ar y llwyddiannau a welwyd hyd yn hyn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Yr oeddwn yn mwynhau cyfraniad John Griffiths.

I will cover as many comments as possible in the short time that I have. First, it is worth saying that there is a clear consensus across the Assembly that having just 20 per cent of the population speaking both of our national languages is not good enough. We all want to see a steady growth in the number of people who speak both our national languages. There is some agreement about means, but not complete consensus. For example, in terms of the public sector, that is not an issue; we all accept that the public sector has legal obligations and responsibilities—as we all have—to promote the language. On the private sector there are legitimate differences between political parties. We did not get a clear answer from the Conservatives, but I would be surprised if they called for an extension of the Welsh language into sectors such as financial services or retail via schemes or rights-based legislation.

sort of structural framework in terms of how we hope to achieve that aim, I do not believe that we can expect to achieve that aim by luck.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn galw ar John Griffiths, ond rhaid imi alw ar y Gweinidog am 5.55 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** There is a long way to go before we have a bilingual Wales, but I believe that we have moved forward. In Newport, for example, when I was young there was some Welsh to be heard, but there is now more. We have Ysgol Gymraeg Casnewydd, everyone in English-medium schools learn Welsh, adult classes are held, Welsh signs are to be seen around the city, and Welsh announcements are made in the train station. Recently, the national eisteddfod returned to Newport, and that eisteddfod was, once again, very successful. Therefore, I believe that things are moving forward. We must now ensure that those steps continue, and that we build on the successes seen to date.

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I was enjoying John Griffiths's contribution.

Byddaf yn ateb cyn gymaint o sylwadau ag yn bosibl o fewn yr amser byr sydd gennyf. Yn gyntaf, mae'n werth dweud bod consensws clir ar draws y Cynulliad nad yw'r ffaith mai ond 20 y cant o'r boblogaeth sy'n siarad ein dwy iaith genedlaethol yn ddigon da. Yr ydym i gyd eisiau gweld cynnydd cyson yn nifer y bobl sy'n siarad ein dwy iaith genedlaethol. Ceir peth cytundeb ynghylch y modd, ond nid consensws llwyr. Er enghraifft, yn y sector cyhoeddus, nid yw hyn yn broblem; yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn bod gan y sector cyhoeddus ymrwymadau a chyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol—fel pob un ohonom—i hybu'r iaith. O ran y sector preifat ceir gwahaniaethau cyfreithlon rhwng y pleidiau gwleidyddol. Ni chawsom ateb clir gan y Ceidwadwyr, ond byddwn yn synnu pe baent yn galw am ymestyn yr iaith i sectorau fel gwasanaethau ariannol neu adwerthu drwy gynlluniau neu ddeddfwriaeth hawliau.

Jenny Randerson made an interesting point about former public utilities—the state industries privatised by the Tories in the sell-off of water, power and trains. We have not bent the law, but we have used it quite creatively. We have brought water companies within the scope of Welsh-language legislation, because they enjoy a monopoly position. However, it is different across different utilities. In terms of power, for example, I occasionally get the odd letter saying that particular electricity companies will not bill people in Welsh. Many power companies will do precisely that and individual consumers have considerable power. If companies will not work in both of our national languages and will not provide those services, consumers have the power to buy their power from a company that is prepared to do that.

As I said in my opening speech, trains are in a slightly different situation; it is something that we are considering closely. I will make a formal announcement about that later on.

Yr wyf yn cytuno ag Owen John Thomas fod addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn hanfodol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi buddsoddi yn yr iaith. Yr wyf yn hapus, y prynhawn yma, i annog rhieni i ddefnyddio addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

Ieuan talked about some tidying up. I think that that was slightly churlish. The Assembly Government has invested substantial additional resources in the Welsh language—some £28 million of additional investment in resources. If you just look at the grant list you will see that Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin had an 88 per cent increase in its grant between 1999-2000 and 2005-06; the Mentrau Iaith have had an overall uplift of 233 per cent; and Urdd Gobaith Cymru, as referred to by Denise Idris Jones, has had an increase of 108 per cent in grants. Therefore, there has been a substantial increase in Government investment right across bodies that are making a big contribution towards moving Wales to a more bilingual society.

It is not easy to change the education system

Gwnaeth Jenny Randerson bwynt diddorol ynghylch y cyfleustodau cyhoeddus gynt—diwydiannau'r wladwriaeth a breifateiddiwyd gan y Toriaid drwy werthu dŵr, pŵer a threnau. Nid gwyrddroi'r gyfraith a wnaethom, ond ei defnyddio'n eithaf creadigol. Yr ydym wedi dod â chwmnïau dŵr o fewn sgôp deddfwriaeth iaith Gymraeg, oherwydd eu bod yn mwynhau sefyllfa fonopoli. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa yn wahanol ar draws gwahanol gyfleustodau. O ran pŵer, er enghraifft, byddaf weithiau'n derbyn ambell lythyr yn dweud nad yw rhai cwmnïau trydan yn bilio pobl yn Gymraeg. Mae nifer o gwmnïau pŵer yn barod i wneud hynny ac mae gan ddefnyddwyr gryn bŵer yn y mater. Os nad yw cwmnïau yn barod i weithio yn y ddwy iaith genedlaethol ac yn gwrthod darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny, mae gan ddefnyddwyr bŵer i brynu eu trydan gan gwmni sydd yn barod i wneud hynny.

Fel y dywedais yn fy araith agoriadol, mae trenau mewn sefyllfa fymryn yn wahanol; mae'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei ystyried yn ofalus. Byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ffurfiol ynghylch hynny nes ymlaen.

I agree with Owen John Thomas that Welsh-medium education is essential. That is why we have invested in the language. I am happy, this afternoon, to encourage parents to use Welsh-medium education.

Siaradodd Ieuan am dacluso rhywfaint. Yr wyf yn credu bod hynny braidd yn anghynnes. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol yn yr iaith Gymraeg—tua £28 miliwn o fuddsoddiad adnoddau pellach. Os edrychwch ar y rhestr grantiau, gwelwch fod y grant i'r Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin wedi cynyddu o 88 y cant rhwng 1999-2000 a 2005-06; mae'r Mentrau Iaith wedi derbyn cynnydd cyffredinol o 233 y cant; ac mae Urdd Gobaith Cymru, fel y cyfeiriwyd ati gan Denise Idris Jones, wedi derbyn cynnydd o 108 y cant yn ei grantiau. Felly, mae buddsoddiad y Llywodraeth wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ar draws y cyrff hynny sy'n cyfrannu'n helaeth at greu cymdeithas fwy dwyieithog yng Nghymru.

Nid yw'n hawdd newid y system addysg dros

overnight. Again, Jenny Randerson quite rightly pointed out that, in many parts of Wales, the overall demand for education is going down as a result of demographic change, but the demand for Welsh-medium education is going up. We welcome that.

6.00 p.m.

Changing and adapting the teaching workforce so that it can support that change is not easy. However, through additional investments in initial teacher training, and additional support for sabbaticals, which is a brand-new scheme that the Assembly Government has introduced, we are making those changes in the workforce.

Finally, we accept the fact that the Tories have been consistent in their opposition to the abolition of the quango state. In terms of every progressive programme of reform, from the creation of the Assembly, to the right to roam, to the national minimum wage, every time there is a progressive argument, you can depend on the Tories to be against it.

nos. Eto, dywedodd Jenny Randerson yn ddigon teg bod y galw cyffredinol am addysg mewn sawl ardal yng Nghymru yn lleihau o ganlyniad i newid demograffig, ond bod y galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cynyddu. Yr ydym yn croesawu hynny.

Nid mater hawdd yw newid ac addasu'r gweithlu dysgu fel y gall gefnogi'r newid hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, drwy fuddsoddi'n ychwanegol mewn hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon a chefnogaeth ychwanegol ar gyfer cyfnodau Sabothol, sy'n gynllun newydd sbon a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn cyflawni'r newidiadau hynny yn y gweithlu.

Yn olaf, yr ydym yn derbyn y ffaith y bu'r Torïaid yn gyson yn eu gwrthwynebiad i wneud i ffwrdd â'r wladwriaeth gwango. Waeth pa raglen o ddiwygio blaengar a geir, o greu'r Cynulliad, hyd at yr hawl i grwydro a'r isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol, bob tro y ceir dadl flaengar, gallwch ddibynnu ar y Torïaid i'w gwrthwynebu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 2: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 42, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 42, Abstain 7, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 4: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 5: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gwyther, Christine  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 23, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 6: For 23, Abstain 1, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gwyther, Christine  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Law, Trish

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 22, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 7: For 22, Abstain 1, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Law, Trish

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 8: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 5, Ymatal 18, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 9: For 5, Abstain 18, Against 27.*



Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 16, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 10: For 16, Abstain 7, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Melding, David  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM3185 as amended: to propose that

Cynnig NDM3185 fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. reaffirms its support for the Welsh Assembly Government's long-term aim of creating a bilingual nation;*

*1. yn ail-ddatgan ei gefnogaeth i nod hirdymor Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o greu cenedl ddwyieithog;*

*2. notes the publication of the 'Iaith Pawb and Welsh Language Scheme Annual Report 2005-06';*

*2. yn nodi cyhoeddi 'Adroddiad Blynyddol Iaith Pawb a'r Cynllun Iaith Gymraeg 2005-06';*

*3. reviews the need for legislation to strengthen the Welsh language; and*

*3. yn adolygu'r angen am ddeddfwriaeth i gryfhau'r iaith Gymraeg; a*

*4. calls for the power to legislate on the Welsh language to be devolved to the National Assembly in 2007.*

*4. yn galw am ddatganoli'r pŵer i ddeddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2007.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 33, Ymatal 17, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 33, Abstain 17, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.      **Y Diprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.04 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 6.04 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)