



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 11 Mai 2004**

**Tuesday, 11 May 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
28	Datganiad Busnes Business Statement
32	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
35	Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
36	Comisiynydd ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn Commissioner for Older People
66	Gweithredu'r Diwygiadau i'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin The Common Agricultural Policy Reform Implementation

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Maethu Fostering**

**Q1 Janice Gregory:** What action is the Assembly Government taking to support fostering in Wales? (OAQ34795)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Fostering services are a local authority responsibility. Local authorities may use Assembly Government funding under the Children First programme to support fostering. The Minister for Health and Social Services, Jane Hutt, has sent a message of support to the Fostering Network in connection with 'Foster Care Fortnight', which runs from yesterday until 23 May.

**Janice Gregory:** Are you aware of figures from the Fostering Network—the UK's leading charity for those involved in fostering—which show that there is currently a shortage of foster carers in Wales? Seven hundred additional foster families are needed to provide sustainable placements for looked-after children. Thank you for mentioning 'Foster Care Fortnight', First Minister; I assume that you will join me and the signatories to my statement of opinion on this issue and welcome 'Foster Care Fortnight'. Will you commit the Assembly Government to redoubling its efforts to support foster carers and local authority fostering teams, so that they can meet the needs of looked-after children in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that we would all want to join in the sentiments that are not only expressed in your statement of opinion but also in Jane Hutt's message of goodwill which congratulates the Fostering Network on organising this fortnight of activities, because they will highlight the need for more foster parents. There is no greater gift that foster parents—or any parents—can give children who are unable to stay with their

**C1 Janice Gregory:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd i gefnogi maethu yng Nghymru? (OAQ34795)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau maethu. Caiff awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio cyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o dan raglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf i hyrwyddo maethu. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Jane Hutt, wedi anfon neges o gefnogaeth i'r Rhwydwaith Maethu mewn cysylltiad â 'Phythefnos Gofal Maeth', a ddechreuodd ddoe ac a fydd yn parhau tan 23 Mai.

**Janice Gregory:** A wyddoch am y ffigurau a gafwyd gan y Rhwydwaith Maethu—y brif elusen yn y DU ar gyfer y rhai sy'n ymwneud â maethu—sy'n dangos bod prinder gofalwyr maeth yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd? Mae angen 700 o deuluoedd maeth ychwanegol i ddarparu lleoliadau cynaliadwy ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Diolch i chi am grybwyll 'Pythefnos Gofal Maeth', Brif Weinidog; cymeraf y gwnewch ymuno â mi a'r rhai a lofnododd fy natganiad o farn ar y mater hwn i groesawu 'Pythefnos Gofal Maeth'. A wnewch ymrwymo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddyblu ei hymdrechion i gynorthwyo gofalwyr maeth a thimau maethu'r awdurdodau lleol, fel y gallant ddiwallu anghenion plant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll am gytuno â'r teimladau a fynegir yn eich datganiad o farn ac a fynegir hefyd yn neges ewyllys da Jane Hutt sy'n llongyfarch y Rhwydwaith Maethu ar drefnu pythefnos hwn o weithgareddau, gan y byddant yn tynnu sylw at yr angen am ragor o rieni maeth. Nid oes rhodd well y gall rhieni maeth—neu unrhyw rieni—ei rhoi i blant na allant aros gyda'u rhieni eu hunain na pheri

own parents than to make them a part of their family, whether it is for a short or long time. It is not the same as adoption, but it provides a valuable service.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn ategu eich cydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd rhieni maeth a'r cyfraniad enfawr a wnânt, a'r angen i sicrhau rhagor ohonynt. A gytunwch fod angen gweithredu ar fyrder a bod angen i Lywodraeth Cymru weithredu yn wyneb y sylwadau yn yr adroddiad ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol Blaenau Gwent? Mae'r arolygiaeth yn nodi bod diffygion enfawr a pherygl yn y system, lle ceir rhieni maeth yn gofalu am hyd at naw o blant; plant cymharol ifanc yn cael eu cymysgu â phobl ifanc, a allai arwain at sefyllfaoedd annerbyniol; a phlant yn gorfod cysgu yn yr un gwely? A dderbyniwch fod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru weithredu ar frys yn yr achos hwn, ac mewn achosion eraill ledled Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid cofio'r ochr arall hefyd, sef ei bod yn bwysig i ni i gyd annog mwy o rieni neu bobl hŷn i ystyried gwneud cyfraniad i gymdeithas ac i fywydau plant drwy ddod yn rhieni maeth a derbyn plant fel rhan o'u teuluoedd. Fodd bynnag, ceir cwestiwn o ran safonau hefyd a sut yr ydym yn rheoli rhieni maeth a'r rhai sy'n dymuno bod yn rhieni maeth, a'r cyrsiau y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu dilyn er mwyn cyrraedd y safon angenrheidiol a diwallu'r rheoliadau yr ydym yn eu pasio, fel y rhai a basiwyd gennym rhwng 2000 a 2003. Mae safonau yn bwysig ond nid ydym am rwystro pobl a gwneud iddynt boeni na fyddant yn cyrraedd y safon. Gall hyfforddiant roi help priodol er mwyn i bobl wneud cyfraniad i iechyd ein cymdeithas.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We heard earlier that Wales requires 700 foster carers, which is a substantial deficit. Do you agree that one way of curing some of the negative press and ills within local authorities' social services departments would be a concerted campaign to promote foster carers? Can you, therefore, tell me what funds are available to promote such campaigns and how much is allocated by the various agencies responsible for

iddynt fod yn rhan o'u teulu, boed hynny am gyfnod byr neu gyfnod hir. Nid yw'r un peth â mabwysiadu, ond mae'n darparu gwasanaeth gwerthfawr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sure that we all endorse your comments on the importance of foster parents and the huge contribution they make, and the need to ensure that there are more of them. Do you agree that something must be done as a matter of urgency and that the Government of Wales should act on the criticisms outlined in the report on Blaenau Gwent social services? The inspectorate notes that there are enormous shortcomings and risks in the system, where foster parents care for as many as nine children; relatively young children are placed alongside young people, which could lead to unacceptable situations; and children have to share beds? Do you accept that the Government of Wales needs to take urgent action in this case and others across Wales?

**The First Minister:** We must also remember the other side, namely that it is important for all of us to encourage more parents or adults to consider contributing to society and the lives of children by becoming foster parents and accepting children into their families. However, there is also the issue of standards and how we manage those who are foster parents and those who wish to become foster parents, and the courses that they must complete in order to reach the expected standard and fulfil the regulations that we have passed, such as those passed between 2000 and 2003. Standards are important but we do not want to prevent people coming forward and scare them into believing that they will not reach the standard. Training can provide appropriate assistance so that people can contribute to the health of our society.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Clywsom yn gynharach fod ar Gymru angen 700 o ofalwyr maeth, ac mae hwnnw'n ddiffyg sylweddol. A gytunwch mai un modd i wneud iawn am rywfaint o'r sylw negyddol a gafwyd yn y wasg ac am y diffygion yn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yr awdurdodau lleol fyddai cynnal ymgyrch ar y cyd i hyrwyddo gofalwyr maeth? A allwch ddweud wrthyf, felly, pa gyllid sydd ar gael i

promoting foster carers?

hyrwyddo ymgyrchoedd o'r fath a pha faint a ddyrennir gan y gwahanol asiantaethau sy'n gyfrifol am hyrwyddo gofalwyr maeth?

**The First Minister:** We have considered what payments are made, and they are flexible. Children First funds can be used in order to vary the payments that are made to foster carers. The more difficult the children who are fostered, the higher the possible risk of breakages and wear and tear on potential parents. We leave it to the voluntary bodies and the local authorities to engage with how to make good the deficit in the number of places, while we provide the inspection and regulatory framework and deal with the other issues that I have already mentioned in relation to varying payments. It is an important issue, but if you think that we can do more to engage parents to become foster parents, I would be happy to consider ideas along those lines.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi ystyried pa daliadau a wneir, ac maent yn rhai hyblyg. Gellir defnyddio cyllid Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf i amrywio'r taliadau a roddir i ofalwyr maeth. Mwyaf anhydrin yw'r plant a faethir, mwyaf tebygol yw hi y caiff pethau eu torri ac y bydd y rhai a allai ddod yn rhieni yn blino. Gadawn i'r cyrff gwirfoddol a'r awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â'r modd i wneud iawn am y diffyg yn nifer y lleoedd, tra byddwn ni'n darparu'r fframwaith arolygu a rheoleiddio ac yn delio â'r materion eraill yr wyf eisoes wedi'u crybwyll mewn cysylltiad ag amrywio taliadau. Mae'n fater pwysig, ond os credwch y gallwn wneud mwy i ddenu rhieni i ddod yn rhieni maeth, byddwn yn fodlon ystyried syniadau o'r fath.

### **Y Cynllun Cymorth Prynu Cartref The Homebuy Scheme**

**Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** What action is being taken to extend the homebuy scheme? (OAQ34798)

**C2 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i ymestyn y cynllun cymorth prynu cartref? (OAQ34798)

**The First Minister:** We regularly review the maximum purchase price limits, and last July we increased them by a minimum of 10 per cent. The results of the latest review will be published in the summer. Local authorities and registered social landlords can exceed these limits in appropriate cases. We have also extended the amount of equity loan available in rural areas from 30 to 50 per cent, and would be prepared to consider doing that in other areas experiencing high housing pressure.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn adolygu'r terfynau uchaf ar y prisiau prynu'n rheolaidd a gwnaethom eu codi 10 y cant o leiaf fis Gorffennaf diwethaf. Cyhoeddir canlyniadau'r adolygiad diweddaraf yn yr haf. Gall awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig fynd ymhellach na'r terfynau hynny mewn achosion priodol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cynyddu swm y benthyciad ecwiti sydd ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig o 30 y cant i 50 y cant, a byddem yn barod i ystyried gwneud hynny mewn ardaloedd eraill sy'n profi llawer o bwysau ar y cyflenwad o dai.

**Michael German:** The homebuy scheme is an important tool in the box of trying to ensure affordable housing, but it competes with the other forms of funding for social housing that local authorities have to put in place. Do you believe that there is a case for identifying this grant as a grant separate from the other social housing grants, or that it

**Michael German:** Mae'r cynllun cymorth prynu cartref yn arf pwysig i geisio sicrhau tai fforddiadwy, ond mae'n cystadlu â mathau eraill o gyllid ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol eu darparu. A ydych yn credu bod dadl dros wahanu'r grant hwn oddi wrth y grantiau eraill ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol, neu

should be extended so that affordable housing targets can be met? Many parts of rural Wales are falling behind on those targets.

**The First Minister:** We did a preliminary review of the homebuy scheme in Gwynedd last year, which concluded that, while homebuy is a useful tool to assist with the provision of affordable housing in some rural communities, it is not the solution in all circumstances. We are, therefore, going to undertake a wider review of homebuy. I would not accept that it competes with other provisions, such as shared equity, which we have mentioned in recent weeks. However, we will be considering the whole issue. We are considering the Barker review and the review done in Gwynedd last year. We are hoping to undertake a wider review soon, as I said, because we want to ensure that all the tools are appropriate for the job, so that the planning, funding and other mechanisms available can assist people to get onto the property ladder, and that the affordable and social housing available is adequate to meet Wales's needs.

**Mark Isherwood:** Why, when the demand for affordable housing schemes such as homebuy and shared ownership is at unprecedented levels, has the funding for affordable housing in Wales decreased? It has almost halved since 1997.

**The First Minister:** We are making £59.4 million available in 2004-05 in social housing grant to assist in the provision of social housing. Taken with private funding from registered social landlords, that should generate investment of around £100 million and provide about 1,000 homes for rent or low-cost home ownership this year. Specific needs have arisen during the house price boom over the past two years, which has rolled out from London to Cardiff and then to Swansea and, it seems, now into Gwynedd, where there have been increases over the last 12 months of 50 per cent or so. That poses specific problems, and we have tried to ensure that we have the tools necessary to meet those problems. However, it is still the case that the average cost of repaying a mortgage of 80 per cent of the

dros ei ymestyn fel y gellir cyrraedd targedau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy? Mae sawl rhan o Gymru wledig yn methu â chyrraedd y targedau hynny.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaethom gynnal adolygiad rhagarweiniol o'r cynllun cymorth prynu cartref yng Ngwynedd y llynedd, a daeth i'r casgliad nad hwnnw yw'r ateb o dan bob amgylchiad, er ei fod yn arf defnyddiol i helpu i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig. Gan hynny, byddwn yn cynnal adolygiad ehangach o'r cynllun cymorth prynu cartref. Nid dderbyniaf ei fod yn cystadlu â darpariaethau eraill, fel ecwiti ar y cyd, a grybwyllasom yn yr wythnosau diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ystyried y mater yn ei gyfanrwydd. Yr ydym yn ystyried adolygiad Barker a'r adolygiad a wnaed yng Ngwynedd y llynedd. Yr ydym yn gobeithio ymgymryd ag adolygiad ehangach cyn hir, fel y dywedais, gan ein bod am sicrhau bod yr holl offer yn addas i'r gwaith, fel y bydd cynllunio, cyllido a'r dulliau eraill sydd ar gael yn gallu helpu pobl i brynu tŷ am y tro cyntaf, ac fel y bydd digon o dai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy ar gael i fodloni anghenion Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pam y bu gostyngiad yn y cyllid ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru, tra bo'r galw am gynlluniau tai fforddiadwy fel y cynllun cymorth prynu cartref a chydberchnogaeth yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen? Mae wedi'i haneru bron er 1997.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn cynnig £59.4 miliwn yn 2004-05 ar ffurf grant tai cymdeithasol i helpu i ddarparu tai cymdeithasol. O'i gymryd gyda chyllid preifat oddi wrth landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, dylai hynny greu buddsoddiad o tua £100 miliwn a darparu tua 1,000 o dai ar gyfer rhentu neu berchnogaeth ar dai am gost isel. Mae anghenion penodol wedi codi yn ystod yr ymchwydd ym mhrisiau tai dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, sydd wedi lledaenu o Lundain i Gaerdydd ac wedyn i Abertawe a bellach, mae'n ymddangos, i Wynedd, lle y bu cynnydd dros y 12 mis diwethaf o ryw 50 y cant. Mae hynny'n peri problemau penodol, ac yr ydym wedi ceisio sicrhau bod gennym yr arfau sydd eu hangen i ddatrys y problemau hynny. Er hynny, mae'r gost gyfartalog o ad-dalu morgais o 80 y cant ar

average priced property is half of what it was in 1989.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod problemau penodol gyda'r cynllun mewn rhai ardaloedd. Er enghraifft, ym Mhen Llŷn y llynedd, ni phrynwyd un tŷ o dan y cynllun, gan fod prisiau tai wedi codi tu hwnt i lefel y gallai'r cynllun ymdopi gydag ef. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau tai fforddiadwy mewn ardaloedd o'r fath?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn adolygu'r cynllun i weld a yw'n bodloni'r gofynion. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau mwy o hyblygrwydd yn y cynllun, a byddwn yn adolygu'r uchafsymiau o ran pris ymhennau fis: yr oedd cynnydd o 10 y cant y llynedd, ond nid yw hynny'n ymddangos yn ddigonol erbyn hyn. Byddwn hefyd yn ystyried codi'r canran y gellir ei roi yn y benthychiadau eciwti o 30 i 50 y cant. Mae hynny'n gam sylweddol; dim ond yn yr ardaloedd gwledig y gwneir hynny ar hyn o bryd, ond yr ydym yn fodlon ystyried ymestyn y gallu i fynd i fyny i 50 y cant i ardaloedd eraill Cymru.

eiddo o bris cyfartalog yn dal i fod yn hanner yr hyn ydoedd yn 1989.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You are right to say there are specific problems with the scheme in some areas. For example, last year, not one house was bought under the scheme in the Llŷn peninsula, because house prices have risen beyond a level with which the scheme could cope. What will you do to ensure affordable houses in such areas?

**The First Minister:** It is important that we review the scheme to see whether it meets requirements. We have ensured more flexibility in the scheme, and we will review the upper price limit again in two months' time: there was an increase of 10 per cent last year, but that does not seem sufficient now. We will also consider raising the percentage that can be put into equity loans from 30 to 50 per cent. That is a significant step; it is only done in rural areas at the moment, but we are willing to consider extending the upper limit to 50 per cent to other areas in Wales.

#### **Safleoedd o Bwysigrwydd Rhyngwladol o ran Cadwraeth Natur Sites of International Importance for Nature Conservation**

**Q3 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the National Assembly's legal responsibilities in relation to consents and applications that have an impact on sites of international importance for nature conservation? (OAQ34799)

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The Assembly may only grant consent affecting a site of European Union importance if, after an appropriate assessment and where there may be an adverse impact, it is satisfied that there are no alternative solutions, and that the project needs to go ahead for imperative reasons of overriding public interest. In addition, where another authority has the power to issue a consent that may have a negative impact upon the site, the Assembly may, in some circumstances, direct the authority to withhold its consent temporarily or indefinitely.

**Janet Ryder:** We have discussed this issue

**C3 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn perthynas â chaniatadau a cheisiadau sy'n effeithio ar safleoedd o bwysigrwydd rhyngwladol o ran cadwraeth natur? (OAQ34799)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chaiff y Cynulliad ond rhoi caniatâd sy'n effeithio ar safle o bwys yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd os yw'n fodlon, ar ôl gwneud asesiad priodol a lle y gellid cael effaith niweidiol, nad oes atebion eraill ar gael, a bod rhaid i'r prosiect fynd yn ei flaen am resymau hollbwysig sy'n ymwneud â sicrhau'r budd mwyaf i'r cyhoedd. Yn ogystal â hynny, os yw awdurdod arall yn meddu ar hawl i roi caniatâd a allai amharu ar y safle, caiff y Cynulliad, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, gyfarwyddo'r awdurdod i ymatal rhag rhoi caniatâd dros dro neu am gyfnod amhenodol.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydym wedi trafod y pwnc

many times, especially in relation to possible dredging at the port of Mostyn. It seems that the Assembly has responsibility in two areas: first, as a consenting body for the licence and, secondly, as a result of taking some of the Secretary of State for Wales's responsibilities in those parts of the habitats regulations which have been devolved. Are such consents subject to regulations 48 to 53 of the Conservation (Natural Habitats, etc) Regulations 1994? If so, are they managed without conflict of interest?

**The First Minister:** We believe that they are managed by the appropriate bodies without conflict of interest. The difficulty with regard to the port of Mostyn is that it requires three separate consents, which we are trying to ensure are dealt with together. The Secretary of State for Transport, Alistair Darling, has a role in providing one consent, and the two other consents are matters for the Environment Agency, on the advice of the flood and land drainage committee—or it might be the other way around; I do not remember. I will write to you to clarify this matter. We are trying to ensure that all three consents are considered together. I have referred to the port of Mostyn issue as being one of hyper-Byzantine complexity. I do not retract from that view. However, that does not mean that a huge amount of work is not ongoing. If I can write to you without offending against the principle of conflict of interest that you properly mentioned in your question, I will do so.

**Brynle Williams:** I am also gravely concerned. Last Friday, the French assembly plant for the Airbus A380 was inaugurated by the French Prime Minister. Will you give an indication of the timescale for the process of considering alternative options? Can you give an assurance that you will do everything in your power to ensure that the Broughton wings are not the missing pieces of the jigsaw?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is about nature conservation.

**The First Minister:** The link is reasonably clear, because if they cannot dredge—and the

hwn lawer gwaith, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â'r posibilrwydd o garthu ym mhorthladd Mostyn. Ymddengys fod gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb mewn dau faes: yn gyntaf, fel y corff sy'n caniatáu'r drwydded ac, yn ail, o ganlyniad i ymgymryd â rhai o gyfrifoldebau Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn y rhannau hynny o'r rheoliadau ar gyfer cynefinoedd sydd wedi'u datganoli. A yw caniatadau o'r fath yn ddarostyngedig i reoliadau 48 a 53 Rheoliadau Cadwraeth (Cynefinoedd Naturiol, etc) 1994? Os ydynt, a ydynt yn cael eu trin heb fod unrhyw wrthdaro rhwng buddiannau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credwn eu bod yn cael eu trin gan y cyrff priodol heb wrthdaro rhwng buddiannau. Gyda golwg ar borthladd Mostyn, yr anhawster yw bod angen tri chaniatâd ar wahân, ac yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â hwy gyda'i gilydd. Mae rôl i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Alistair Darling, wrth roi un caniatâd, ac mae'r ddau ganiatâd arall yn fater i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, gan ddilyn cyngor y pwyllgor llifogydd a draenio tir—neu gallai fod fel arall; nid wyf yn cofio. Ysgrifennaf atoch i egluro'r mater hwn. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r tri chaniatâd hyn gyda'i gilydd. Yr wyf wedi dweud bod mater porthladd Mostyn yn un astrus dros ben. Nid wyf yn tynnu'r farn honno'n ôl. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes llawer iawn o waith yn mynd yn ei flaen. Os caf ysgrifennu atoch heb fynd yn erbyn egwyddor y gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau y cyfeisiasoch ati'n briodol yn eich cwestiwn, gwnaf hynny.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf finnau'n bryderus dros ben. Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, agorodd Prif Weinidog Ffrainc y gwaith adeiladu yn Ffrainc ar gyfer Airbus A380. A wnewch roi awgrym ynghylch pa mor hir y cymer i ystyried dewisiadau eraill? A allwch roi sicrwydd y gnewch bopeth yn eich gallu i sicrhau nad yr adenydd o Frychdyn fydd y darnau o'r jig-so fydd ar goll?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â chadwraeth natur.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r cysylltiad yn weddol amlwg, oherwydd os na allant



port of Mostyn's drainage channel is filling up quite rapidly since the cessation of the P&O ferry operations—that causes problems for the vessel which collects the wings using the deep water channel. The wings arrive at the port of Mostyn by barge from Connah's Quay, having gone there by land from the originating factory at Broughton. It is important that that logistical supply chain, as well as the environmental factors, are given their due importance. A huge amount of work is being done by the consenting authorities to complete their consideration of this matter, but it is not a matter on which there can be any useful political interference.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The big issue here is that this has taken so long. As negotiations have been ongoing at the highest level of Government, can you assure us that the environmental and economic balancing act will be adequately resolved?

**The First Minister:** Your preamble was wrong. The results of the trials carried out last November were not what everyone had expected. When the results were received last Christmas, everyone realised that there was a new, and unanticipated, problem. The Dee estuary sand and mud, after it had been dyed an appropriate colour so that it could be tracked by scientists, did not behave in the way that everyone had expected. It is the consequences of that unexpected trial result that have caused the problems since the beginning of this year. There has been no delay since that unexpected outcome to the scientific experiment.

garthu—ac mae sianel ddraenio porthladd Mostyn yn llenwi'n eithaf cyflym ers i weithrediadau llongau fferi P&O ddod i ben—mae hynny'n peri problemau i'r llonga ddaw i gasglu'r adenydd gan ddefnyddio'r sianel ddŵr ddwfn. Mae'r adenydd yn cyrraedd porthladd Mostyn ar fad camlas o Gei Connah, wedi iddynt gael eu cludo yno ar dir o'r ffatri a'u gwnaeth ym Mrychdyn. Mae'n bwysig rhoi pwys dyladwy ar y gadwyn gyflenwi logistaidd, yn ogystal â'r ffactorau amgylcheddol. Mae'r awdurdodau caniatáu'n gwneud gwaith aruthrol i gwblhau eu hystyriaeth o'r mater hwn, ond nid yw'n fater y ceir unrhyw fudd o ymyrryd ag ef yn wleidyddol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Y pwnc pwysig yn hyn o beth yw bod hyn wedi cymryd cymaint o amser. Gan y bu negodiadau'n mynd rhagddynt ar y lefel uchaf o Lywodraeth, a allwch ein sicrhau y ceir ateb boddhaol ar ôl y pwysio a mesur amgylcheddol ac economaidd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd eich rhagymadrodd yn anghywir. Yr oedd canlyniadau'r profion a wnaed fis Tachwedd diwethaf yn wahanol i'r hyn yr oedd pawb yn ei ddisgwyl. Pan gafwyd y canlyniadau Nadolig diwethaf, sylweddolodd pawb fod problem newydd ac annisgwyl. Yr oedd y tywod a'r llaid yn aber Dyfrdwy, ar ôl rhoi lliw priodol iddynt fel y gallai gwyddonwyr eu dilyn, wedi ymddwyn yn wahanol i'r modd yr oedd pawb wedi'i ddisgwyl. Y canlyniad annisgwyl hwnnw i'r profion sydd wedi peri'r problemau ers dechrau'r flwyddyn hon. Ni fu oedi ers y canlyniad annisgwyl i'r arbrawf gwyddonol.

### **Cymorth Ariannol i Rhondda Cynon Taf Financial Support Given to Rhondda Cynon Taf**

**Q4 Leighton Andrews:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the increase of Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's financial support from the National Assembly since 1999? (OAQ34819)

**The First Minister:** Rhondda Cynon Taf receives financial support of £1,149 per capita, which is the fourth highest level of Assembly grant aid for local government

**C4 Leighton Andrews:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd yn y cymorth ariannol y mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi'i roi i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ers 1999? (OAQ34819)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Rhondda Cynon Taf yn cael cymorth ariannol o £1,149 y pen, sef y cymorth grant uchaf ond tri gan y Cynulliad i ddibenion llywodraeth leol. O ran

purposes. As regards the increase since 1999, some £214 million of unhypothecated grant funding was allocated in 1999-2000, and, since 1 April, a total of £265 million will be allocated.

**Leighton Andrews:** In responding to my supplementary question, I am sure that you would want to welcome the members of the Rhondda Friendship Guild who are visiting the Assembly today.

Is it not disappointing that despite all the resources that Rhondda Cynon Taf council has received from the Assembly, the money is never acknowledged by the Plaid-Cymru-controlled council? On top of this, the Plaid-Cymru-controlled council is levying a council tax increase this year that is twice the amount levied by Labour-controlled Cardiff County Council.

**The First Minister:** The levying of council tax is very much the preserve of local authorities. They levy the council tax that they deem to be necessary for political acceptability in an election year or for the provision of services within the authority area. I do not think that any criticism can be made of the level of grant funding provided by the Assembly to Rhondda Cynon Taf or to other local authorities. The grant has been at a handsome level, and there have probably been fewer complaints from local authorities about the level of grant from central or devolved Government in the past few years than ever before.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that it is often council tax payers, rich and poor, in areas such as the Vale of Glamorgan or Monmouth, who fund the increase to areas like Rhondda Cynon Taf? While I agree that poorer areas deserve more support, would it not be more appropriate for them to get that support from central funding, and not from local taxpayers in Barry, for instance?

**The First Minister:** It does not work quite like that. We have a formula arrangement that is agreed with the Welsh Local Government Association. The formula provides for unhypothecated assistance, which is over 90 per cent of the total amount

y cynnydd er 1999, dyrannwyd tua £214 miliwn o gyllid grant heb ei glustnodi yn 1999-2000, ac, er 1 Ebrill, bydd cyfanswm o £265 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu.

**Leighton Andrews:** Wrth ymateb i'm cwestiwn atodol, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn dymuno croesawu aelodau'r Rhondda Friendship Guild sy'n ymweld â'r Cynulliad heddiw.

Onid yw'n siomedig, er yr holl adnoddau a gafodd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf oddi wrth y Cynulliad, nad yw'r arian byth yn cael ei gydnabod gan y cyngor, a reolir gan Blaid Cymru? Ar ben hynny, mae'r cyngor, a reolir gan Blaid Cymru, yn codi treth gyngor y ceir cynnydd ynddi eleni sy'n ddwywaith yr hyn a godir gan Gyngor Sir Caerdydd sy'n cael ei reoli gan Lafur.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i awdurdodau lleol, i raddau helaeth iawn, yw codi treth gyngor. Codant dreth gyngor y barnant ei bod yn wleidyddol dderbyniol mewn blwyddyn etholiad neu'n angenrheidiol i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn ardal yr awdurdod. Ni chredaf y gellir beirniadu lefel y cyllid grant a ddarparwyd gan y Cynulliad i gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf neu i awdurdodau lleol eraill. Bu'r grant yn un hael, ac mae'n debyg bod llai o gwynion oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol am lefel y grant o Lywodraeth ganolog neu ddatganoledig yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf nag erioed o'r blaen.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch mai talwyr y dreth gyngor, rhai tlawd a chyfoethog, mewn ardaloedd fel Bro Morgannwg a Mynwy, sy'n aml yn talu am y cynnydd i ardaloedd fel Rhondda Cynon Taf? Er fy mod yn cytuno bod ardaloedd tlotach yn haeddu mwy o gymorth, oni fyddai'n fwy priodol iddynt gael y cymorth hwnnw o gyllid canolog, ac nid oddi wrth drethdalwyr lleol yn y Barri, er enghraifft?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid felly'n hollol y mae'n gweithio. Mae gennym drefniant sy'n dilyn fformiwla y cytunir arno gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Mae'r fformiwla'n darparu ar gyfer cymorth sydd heb ei glustnodi, sy'n fwy na 90 y cant y cyfanswm

given to local government, and for specific, hypothecated grants, such as the deprivation grant and the performance incentive grant, which are added to the unhypothecated funding. The hypothecated grants are usually tied to the provision of specific new services to be introduced with our agreement. This is all done in agreement with the Welsh Local Government Association, and if it were not happy with the formula it would not have accepted it. However, the formula is based on a 50:50 agreement. It means that all areas do not receive the same amount in grant per capita. Monmouthshire receives the lowest level of funding, and I think that either Merthyr Tydfil or Blaenau Gwent receives the highest. This is appropriate when you consider the income distribution of these areas.

**Owen John Thomas:** You will recall, First Minister, that, prior to 1999, the Labour-led RCT council went through £26 million of reserves and left the incoming council with a debt of £5 million. Will you join me in congratulating the Plaid-Cymru-led authority—the award-winning Plaid-Cymru-led authority—of Rhondda Cynon Taf on turning around the council's financial situation?

**The First Minister:** You almost forgot to look at your crib sheet and use the words 'award-winning', just as I almost forgot to welcome the Rhondda Friendship Guild. I should have done that earlier in answering Leighton Andrews's question. Therefore, I apologise to the members of the Rhondda Friendship Guild who are in the public gallery.

It is important to bear in mind that people will not look back to 1999, but rather look forward to the services that they will receive between 2004 and 2008. People are interested in the next election period, and I think that harking back to 1999 may indicate that you are having difficulty in finding things to say, Owen John.

a roddir i lywodraeth leol, ac ar gyfer grantiau penodol sydd wedi'u clustnodi, fel y grant ar gyfer amddifadedd a'r grant anogaeth perfformiad, a ychwanegir at y cyllid sydd wedi'i glustnodi. Fel arfer, mae'r grantiau a glustnodwyd ynghlwm wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau penodol newydd sydd i'w cyflwyno gyda'n cytundeb. Gwneir hyn oll drwy gytuno â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ac os nad oedd yn fodlon ar y fformiwla ni fyddai wedi'i derbyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r fformiwla'n seiliedig ar gytundeb hanner a hanner. Mae'n golygu nad yw pob ardal yn cael yr un swm o grant y pen. Sir Fynwy a gaiff y lefel isaf o gyllid, a chredaf mai Merthyr Tudful neu Flaenau Gwent sy'n cael yr uchaf. Mae hyn yn briodol o ystyried y dosbarthiad incwm yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Byddwch yn cofio, Brif Weinidog, fod cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, pan fu dan arweiniad Llafur, wedi gwario £26 miliwn o'i gronfeydd wrth gefn, cyn 1999, ac wedi gadael dyled o £5 miliwn i'r cyngor newydd. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch awdurdod Rhondda Cynon Taf, sy'n cael ei arwain gan Blaid Cymru—ac sydd wedi ennill gwobr—ar weddnewid sefyllfa ariannol y cyngor?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bu bron ichi anghofio edrych ar eich nodiadau a defnyddio'r geiriau 'ennill gwobr', bron fel y bu i mi anghofio croesawu'r Rhondda Friendship Guild. Dylwn fod wedi gwneud hynny'n gynharach wrth ateb cwestiwn Leighton Andrews. Gan hynny, ymddiheuraf i aelodau'r Rhondda Friendship Guild sydd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus.

Mae'n bwysig cofio na fydd pobl yn edrych yn ôl ar 1999, ond yn edrych ymlaen, yn hytrach, at y gwasanaethau a gânt rhwng 2004 a 2008. Mae pobl yn ymddiddori yn y cyfnod hwnnw ar ôl yr etholiad, a chredaf y gallai'r ffaith eich bod yn sôn o hyd am 1999 fod yn arwydd eich bod yn ei chael yn anodd meddwl am bethau i'w dweud, Owen John.

### **Addysg Uwch Higher Education**

**Q5 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the state of

**C5 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyflwr addysg uwch

higher education in Wales? (OAQ34811)

**The First Minister:** The higher education sector in Wales is already competitive but faces new, massive competitive challenges. Substantial progress has been made against the Assembly's 'Reaching Higher' strategy, most notably the merger between the University of Wales College of Medicine and Cardiff University and subject rationalisation between the University of Wales Swansea and Swansea Institute of Higher Education. The Welsh Assembly Government fully supports the sector in this reconfiguration.

2.20 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Today, we heard that, following a meeting with representatives of your Government, staff at the school of nursing at the University of Wales Bangor have been warned of a reduction in the number of student nurses next year. In March, the head of the school of care sciences at the University of Glamorgan stated that she had received a letter from your Government telling her to recruit only 80 per cent of the usual intake. However, the Minister for Health and Social Services has denied that there are any cutbacks in the number of training places. First Minister, both statements cannot be right. What is going on? Can you clarify whether the Minister for Health and Social Services is correct to say that there will not be any cutbacks, or are the staff at those two universities correct to say that they have received information from your Government informing them of cutbacks?

**The First Minister:** You have mixed up two matters: first, there is certainly no cutback in the nurse training budget, which was Jane Hutt's point. There may or may not be a plateauing-out of the numbers in a particular nurse training course; that is possible after the massive increases that we have seen. For example, during the first two years of the Assembly's existence, some 740 nurses, who had started their courses during the last few years of the Conservative Government, completed training. This year and next year, that figure will be 1,070 and 1,239. That is some 80 per cent higher than the figures that

yng Nghymru? (OAQ34811)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru'n un cystadleuol eisoes, ond mae'n wynebu heriau newydd aruthrol wrth gystadlu. Gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol ar strategaeth 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' y Cynulliad, yn fwyaf nodedig drwy gyfuno Coleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru a Phrifysgol Caerdydd a thrwy resymoli pynciau cyd-rhwng Prifysgol Cymru Abertawe ac Athrofa Addysg Uwch Abertawe. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n llwyr gefnogi'r sector yn yr ad-drefnu hwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Clywsom heddiw, yn dilyn cyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr eich Llywodraeth, fod staff yn yr ysgol nyrsio ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Bangor wedi'u rhybuddio y bydd gostyngiad yn nifer y nyrsys dan hyfforddiant y flwyddyn nesaf. Ym mis Mawrth, dywedodd pennaeth ysgol y gwyddorau gofalu ym Mhrifysgol Morgannwg ei bod wedi cael llythyr oddi wrth eich Llywodraeth yn dweud wrthi am beidio â recriwtio ond 80 y cant o'r nifer arferol. Er hynny, mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi gwadu bod unrhyw dorri ar nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi. Brif Weinidog, ni all y ddau osodiad fod yn gywir. Beth sy'n digwydd? A allwch egluro a yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn iawn wrth ddweud na fydd unrhyw doriadau, neu a yw'r staff yn y ddwy brifysgol honno'n gywir wrth ddweud eu bod wedi cael gwybodaeth gan eich Llywodraeth yn eu hysbysu am doriadau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi cymysgu dau fater: yn gyntaf, nid oes unrhyw dorri ar y gyllideb ar gyfer hyfforddi nyrsys, a hwnnw oedd y pwynt a wnaeth Jane Hutt. Efallai fod y niferoedd ar gwrs hyfforddi nyrsys penodol yn lefelu; mae hynny'n bosibl yng ngolwg y cynnydd aruthrol a welsom. Er enghraifft, yn ystod y ddwy flynedd gyntaf o oes y Cynulliad, gwnaeth tua 740 o nyrsys, a oedd wedi dechrau eu cyrsiau yn ystod blynyddoedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, gwblhau eu hyfforddiant. Eleni a'r flwyddyn nesaf, y ffigur hwnnw fydd 1,070 a 1,239. Mae

we inherited from the Conservatives. That is a massive increase, on top of which is probably the most effective form of nurse training, namely return-to-practice training. Experienced nurses, who have had long career breaks for child-rearing or because they got fed up, and who then decide to return to the profession, can be re-trained in three to six months. That is a brilliant form of training. We are increasing those numbers from 140 last year to 190 this year. Clearly, that should be in addition to what is done through conventional four-year university courses. You are always trying to adjust those courses so that they meet requirements. The nurse training numbers in Bangor meet exactly what is being requested in four years' time by the north Wales trusts, as the employers.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that higher education institutions need to be proactive with industry, which means offering more bite-sized vocational courses linked to higher level national vocational qualifications and professional qualifications? I suggest that such an approach would improve the teaching link between higher education institutions and industry.

**The First Minister:** They do not have to be bite-sized; they could be of any length—a week, a fortnight, a day, or two or three years. I remember being told recently that Legal and General, the insurance company in Cardiff, had asked Cardiff University to provide a course on medical actuaries, so it laid on a BSc or BA in training medical actuaries because that is what the company needed and what the university could provide. It is a question of flexibility and of trying to find out the needs of industry and to answer those needs. The universities are then involved in the world of business or the public sector, which is healthy for them as well as for the potential employers, and those who will get jobs as a result of that involvement.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives**

hynny tua 80 y cant yn uwch na'r ffigurau a etifeddasom gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae hynny'n gynnydd aruthrol, ac ar ben hynny ceir y math mwyaf effeithiol o hyfforddiant ar gyfer nyrsys, yn ôl pob tebyg, sef hyfforddiant ar gyfer rhai sy'n dychwelyd i nyrsio. Gellir ailhyfforddi nyrsys profiadol, sydd wedi rhoi heibio eu gyrfa am gyfnod hir i fagu plant neu am eu bod wedi diflasu, ond sydd wedyn yn penderfynu dychwelyd i'r proffesiwn, mewn tri i chwe mis. Mae hwnnw'n hyfforddiant gwych. Yr ydym yn codi'r niferoedd hynny o 140 y llynedd i 190 eleni. Mae'n amlwg y dylai hynny fod yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a wneir drwy gyrsgiau pedair blynedd confensiynol yn y brifysgol. Ceisir newid y cyrsiau hynny drwy'r amser fel eu bod yn ateb y gofynion. Mae nifer y nyrsys dan hyfforddiant ym Mangor yn cyfateb yn union i'r hyn y mae'r ymddiriedolaethau yn y Gogledd, fel y cyflogwyr, yn ei ofyn ymhen pedair blynedd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai sefydliadau addysg uwch fod yn rhagweithiol yn eu hymwneud â diwydiant, sy'n golygu y dylent gynnig mwy o gyrsgiau galwedigaethol byr sy'n gysylltiedig â chymwysterau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol ar lefel uwch a chymwysterau proffesiynol? Awgrymaf y byddai dull gweithredu o'r fath yn gwella'r cyswllt dysgu rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch a diwydiant.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes raid iddynt fod yn gyrsgiau byr; gallent fod o unrhyw hyd—wythnos, pythefnos, diwrnod, neu ddwy neu dair blynedd. Cofiaf imi gael fy hysbysu'n ddiweddar fod Legal and General, y cwmni yswiriant yng Nghaerdydd, wedi gofyn i Brifysgol Caerdydd ddarparu cwrs ar actiwariadaid meddygol, a'i bod wedi trefnu ar gyfer BSc neu BA mewn hyfforddi actiwariadaid meddygol gan mai hynny yr oedd ar y cwmni ei angen ac mai hynny y gallai'r brifysgol ei ddarparu. Mater o hyblygrwydd ydyw a cheisio darganfod anghenion diwydiant a diwallu'r anghenion hynny. Wedyn bydd y prifysgolion yn ymwneud â byd busnes neu'r sector cyhoeddus, ac mae hynny'n beth iach iddynt hwy yn ogystal â'r darpar gyflogwyr, a'r rhai a gaiff swyddi o ganlyniad i'r cysylltiad hwnnw.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick**

**(Nick Bourne):** On nurse training places, Bangor university clearly believes that there has been a cut in the training budget. I have a copy of the Assembly's response to that, but the Minister should provide a statement.

**Bourne:** Ynghylch lleoedd hyfforddi nyrsys, mae'n amlwg bod prifysgol Bangor yn credu bod y gyllideb hyfforddi wedi'i thorri. Mae gennyf gopi o ymateb y Cynulliad i hynny, ond dylai'r Gweinidog roi datganiad.

My question is related to the chaos and confusion—and I use those terms advisedly, as they were used by the Labour MP for Cardiff Central, Jon Owen Jones—regarding university funding and top-up tuition fees in Wales. Students and their parents in Wales are now making decisions about their futures without knowing what the position will be in Wales. Again, as Jon Owen Jones said, if we are not to have top-up fees in Wales, we will have to raid other budgets, and we have seen that that has already led to a shortage of money for Coleg Gwent, where there have been cutbacks. We cannot afford any cutbacks in health because of the disasters in the NHS. When will you make clear your position on top-up fees post-2007, because students and their parents are now making decisions about the future and Welsh universities are also being left in the dark?

Mae'r cwestiwn sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â'r dryswch ac anhrefn—a defnyddiaf y geiriau hynny'n fwriadol, gan eu bod wedi'u defnyddio gan yr AS Llafur dros Ganol Caerdydd, Jon Owen Jones—ynghylch cyllido prifysgolion a ffioedd dysgu ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Mae myfyrwyr a'u rhieni yng Nghymru'n penderfynu am eu dyfodol yn awr heb wybod beth fydd y sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Unwaith eto, fel y dywedodd Jon Owen Jones, os nad ydym i gael ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru, bydd yn rhaid inni ddwyn o gyllidebau eraill, a gwelsom fod hynny eisoes wedi arwain at brinder arian ar gyfer Coleg Gwent, lle y bu toriadau. Ni allwn fforddio cael unrhyw doriadau mewn iechyd oherwydd y trychinebau yn y GIG. Pa bryd y gwnewch egluro'ch safbwynt ar ffioedd ychwanegol ar ôl 2007, gan fod myfyrwyr a'u rhieni'n penderfynu'n awr ynghylch y dyfodol a phrifysgolion Cymru'n cael eu gadael yn y niwl?

**The First Minister:** That was a sensible question, ruined by the throwing in of a hatful of false preambles. There is no cut in the training budget for nurses. Jane Hutt has made that clear, and I repeat it today. Secondly, it is not true that there is chaos in the higher education system. I accept that we do not have much time to play with, and we need to press on as quickly as possible, once the Bill has Royal Assent. However, we cannot do much until then. Once it has received Royal Assent, which would normally be expected in July, the Rees commission will be reconvened. It is set up and ready to go. It will probably report in February of next year, in plenty of time for us to debate the issue in the Assembly and for people to know what is happening in time for the beginning of the academic year. That means that we will be able to fulfil our manifesto commitment of having no top-up fees in the Welsh higher education sector in 2006-07. No Welsh students will pay top-up fees in that year. We have not ruled anything

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n gwestiwn synhwyrol, a ddifethwyd drwy gynnwys llond het o ragymadroddion anghywir. Ni chwtogwyd ar y gyllideb hyfforddi ar gyfer nyrsys. Mae Jane Hutt wedi egluro hynny, ac yr wyf yn ei ailadrodd heddiw. Yn ail, nid yw'n wir bod anhrefn yn y system addysg uwch. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad oes gennym lawer o amser ar ôl, a rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd, wedi i'r Mesur gael y Cydsyniad Brenhinol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn wneud llawer tan hynny. Ar ôl iddo gael y Cydsyniad Brenhinol, a ddisgwyld fel arfer ym mis Gorffennaf, ailgynullir comisiwn Rees. Mae wedi'i sefydlu ac mae'n barod i gychwyn. Mae'n debyg y bydd yn adrodd ym mis Chwefror y flwyddyn nesaf, mewn da bryd fel y gallwn gael dadl ar y mater yn y Cynulliad ac fel bod pobl yn cael gwybod beth sy'n digwydd yn ddigon buan cyn dechrau'r flwyddyn academaidd. Mae hynny'n golygu y gallwn gyflawni ein hymrwymiad maniffesto i beidio â chael

in or out after that. We will study the Rees commission's findings and recommendations when it reports in February.

**Nick Bourne:** That is precisely what I was asking you about. You are fond of restating the current position, but you are not fond of setting out your stall for what happens then, which was my question. What happens in 2007? There is uncertainty in the higher education sector, and the words 'chaos' and 'confusion' were not mine, as you will recall—they were the words of a Labour MP at Westminster. Have a word with him if you think that it is hyperbole, but I can see what he is getting at. There is chaos and confusion. Parents and students are now having to make decisions about higher education in Wales without knowing what the position will be when their children start university. When will that uncertainty end?

**The First Minister:** That is an absurd question. It is true that there is much time pressure. I agree with that. We do not have much time to play with—it is a tight timetable. However, to say that there is chaos and confusion because of that is nonsense. We must wait until the Bill has Royal Assent, and we will then reconvene the Rees commission. I strongly deny that there is chaos and confusion. There is a clearly laid out timetable, but I agree that there is no time to be wasted and no time to be lost.

**Nick Bourne:** You seem to agree with everything except the words chaos and confusion. I remind you once again that they were not my words, but those of Jon Owen Jones, who is a Labour MP representing Cardiff, the city which you represent. Have a word with him if you do not believe that there is chaos and confusion. The universities believe that the confusion must be ended, as they must plan on a long-term basis. They are national universities, with international reputations. When will the uncertainty end? The universities need it to end so that they can plan for the future.

ffioedd ychwanegol yn y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn 2006-07. Ni fydd unrhyw fyfyrwr o Gymru'n talu ffioedd ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn honno. Nid ydym wedi diystyru dim a allai ddigwydd ar ôl hynny. Astudiwn ganfyddiadau ac argymhellion comisiwn Rees pan edrydd ym mis Chwefror.

**Nick Bourne:** Dyna'r union beth yr oeddwn yn eich holi yn ei gylch. Yr ydych yn hoff o ailddatgan y sefyllfa bresennol, ond nid ydych yn hoff o egluro beth a ddigwydd wedyn, sef yr hyn yr holais amdano. Beth a ddigwydd yn 2007? Mae ansicrwydd yn y sector addysg uwch, ac nid fy ngeiriau i oedd 'anhrefn' a 'dryswch', fel y cofiwch—geiriau AS Llafur yn San Steffan oeddent. Mynnwch air ag ef os credwch mai gormodiaith ydyw, ond gallaf weld beth sydd ganddo dan sylw. Mae anhrefn a dryswch. Mae rhieni a myfyrwyr yn gorfod gwneud penderfyniadau'n awr ynghylch addysg uwch yng Nghymru, heb wybod beth fydd y sefyllfa pan fydd eu plant yn dechrau yn y brifysgol. Pa bryd y daw'r ansicrwydd hwnnw i ben?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cwestiwn hurt yw hwnnw. Mae'n wir bod llawer o bwysau o ran amser. Cytunaf â hynny. Nid oes gennym lawer o amser ar ôl—mae'n amserlen gyfyng. Er hynny, nonsens yw dweud bod anhrefn a dryswch oherwydd hynny. Rhaid inni ddisgwyl hyd nes y rhoddir Cydsyniad Brenhinol i'r Mesur, ac wedyn ailgynnullwn gomisiwn Rees. Gwadaf yn bendant fod anhrefn a dryswch. Ceir amserlen bendant, ond cytunaf nad oes amser i'w wastraffu na'i gollu.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymddengys eich bod yn cytuno â phopeth heblaw'r geiriau anhrefn a dryswch. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa eto nad fy ngeiriau i oeddent, ond rhai Jon Owen Jones, AS Llafur sy'n cynrychioli Caerdydd, y ddinas yr ydych chi'n ei chynrychioli. Mynnwch air ag ef os na chredwch fod anhrefn a dryswch. Mae'r prifysgolion yn credu bod rhaid rhoi pen ar y dryswch, gan fod rhaid iddynt gynllunio ar gyfer y tymor hir. Prifysgolion cenedlaethol ydynt sydd â bri rhyngwladol. Pa bryd y daw'r ansicrwydd hwnnw i ben? Rhaid i'r prifysgolion weld ei ddiwedd fel y gallant gynllunio ar gyfer y

dyfodol.

**The First Minister:** It is you who should have a word with Jon Owen Jones since you are clearly obsessed with his words. The important issue is time. I have said that there is enough time, and you cannot therefore say that there is chaos and confusion, whether you happen to be here as Nick Bourne, or whether Jon Owen Jones has sent you here as a ventriloquist dummy. It makes no difference. The issue is whether there is enough time. It is a tight timetable, and we will be able to stick to it provided that no time is lost. The Rees commission will be convened as soon as Royal Assent is given, and we expect to receive its proposals in February of next year. Please try to ask your own question next time, Nick.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Chi a ddylai gael gair â Jon Owen Jones gan ei bod yn amlwg bod gennych obsesiwn â'i eiriau. Amser yw'r mater pwysig. Yr wyf wedi dweud bod digon o amser, ac ni allwch ddweud felly fod anhrefn a dryswch, pa un a ydych yma fel Nick Bourne, neu a ydyw Jon Owen Jones wedi'ch anfon yma fel dymi tafleisydd. Ni wnaiff wahaniaeth. Y mater dan sylw yw a oes digon o amser. Mae'r amserlen yn dynn, a byddwn yn gallu glynu wrthi ar yr amod na chollir amser. Cynullir comisiwn Rees cyn gynted ag y rhoddir Cydsyniad Brenhinol, a disgwyliwn gael ei gynigion ym mis Chwefror y flwyddyn nesaf. Ceisiwch ofyn eich cwestiwn eich hun y tro nesaf, Nick, os gwelwch yn dda.

### Gofal Plant Childcare

**C6 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar safon gofal plant yng Nghymru? (OAQ34802)

**Q6 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the First Minister make a statement on the standard of childcare in Wales? (OAQ34802)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol y Cynulliad a'r gwaith cofrestru ac arolygu a gyflawnir gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn ategu gofal plant yng Nghymru i blant o dan wyth mlwydd oed. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn buddsoddi mewn gofal plant drwy Cymorth—y gronfa partneriaeth plant a phobl ifanc, sydd ar gael ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru.

**The First Minister:** The Assembly's national minimum standards and the registration and inspection work performed by the Care Standards Inspectorate underpin childcare in Wales for children under the age of eight. The Assembly Government invests in childcare through Cymorth—the children and youth support fund, which is delivered in every local authority in Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Un o'r bobl sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf am amddiffyn hawliau plant yng Nghymru yw Peter Clarke, y comisiynydd plant. Gwyddoch fod Margaret Hodge wedi ei gyhuddo, yn y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig, o fod yn aneffeithiol am ei fod yn chwilio am achosion unigol, yn hytrach nag edrych ar y darlun cyflawn. A gymerwch y cyfle hwn i gondemnio ei sylwadau, ac i longyfarch Peter Clarke ar y gwaith aruthrol y mae'n ei wneud ar ran plant Cymru?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The children's commissioner, Peter Clarke, is one of the key figures charged with the defence of children's rights in Wales. You know that Margaret Hodge accused him, in the Welsh Affairs Select Committee, of being ineffective because he looks at individual cases rather than at the bigger picture. Will you take this opportunity to condemn her comments, and to congratulate Peter Clarke on the great work that he is doing on behalf of the children of Wales?

2.30 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n amlwg bod model

**The First Minister:** It is obvious that the



Lloegr am gomisiynydd annibynnol ar gyfer plant yn hollol wahanol i'n model ni yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n golygu na fydd gan y comisiynydd plant yn Lloegr yr hawl i wneud ymchwiliadau unigol ar ofyniad plentyn neu deulu, dim ond ar ofyniad y Gweinidog. Model hollol wahanol yw hwn. Nid yw Margaret Hodge yn ymwybodol bod Peter Clarke, yn ei adroddiadau blynyddol i'r Cynulliad, yn cynnal yr arolygiad o wasanaethau plant a gofynion plant yr oedd hi yn ei gyhuddo o beidio â'u cynnal. Mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi gwneud y gwaith, a, chyn belled ag yr wyf yn ei ddeall, fe'i gosodir yn ei adroddiadau blynyddol. Am ryw reswm, yr oedd hi'n anwybyddu'r agwedd honno ar ei waith.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y broblem sylfaenol yn yr achos hwn yw, os caiff y Ddeddf i sefydlu comisiynydd plant yn Lloegr ei phasio, heb ei diwygio, bydd llanastr yng Nghymru gan na fydd plant yn gwybod at bwy yn union i fynd—byddai'n dibynnu ar y broblem. Yr ydych yn gwybod bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi pasio, yn unfrydol, welliant i gael gwared ar y broblem honno, drwy sicrhau bod Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn cael yr hawl i ddelio gydag unrhyw achos yng Nghymru, pa faes bynnag y mae'n ymwneud ag ef. Cefnogodd y Blaid Lafur y gwelliant hwnnw yn y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. Pa gamau a fyddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau newid yn y ddeddfwriaeth i glirio'r mater hwn, ac i sicrhau mai Peter Clarke fydd yr unig gomisiynydd fydd yn gofalu am broblemau plant Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn credu ein bod yn unfrydol o'r farn mai siop un stop sydd ei hangen ar blant yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ar blant sydd mewn rhyw fath o drafferth ac arnynt angen help yr awdurdodau. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod anghytundeb ynglŷn â'r egwyddor sylfaenol o siop un stop ar gyfer ein plant. Rhaid delio â sut y gallwn gyrraedd y nod o siop un stop drwy drafodaethau rhyngom ni a gweinyddiaeth yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yn Llundain, y Gweinidogion, Charles Clarke a Margaret Hodge, ac efallai y ddau gomisiynydd—er nad yw comisiynydd Lloegr wedi ei benodi hyd yn hyn. Oni bai y gallwn sicrhau'r manylion ynglŷn â sut y byddent yn

English model for an independent children's commissioner is completely different from ours in Wales. That means that the children's commissioner in England will not have the right to conduct inquiries at the request of an individual child or family, but only at the request of the Minister. This is a completely different model. Margaret Hodge seems unaware that Peter Clarke, in his annual reports to the Assembly, includes the kind of review of children's services and children's needs that she accused him of not having undertaken. It is obvious that he has done the work and, as I understand it, it is included in his annual reports. For some reason, she ignored that aspect of his work.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The fundamental problem in this case is that, if the Act to establish a children's commissioner in England is passed, without amendment, Wales will be left in a state of confusion because children will not know to whom they should turn—it would depend on the problem. You know that the National Assembly unanimously passed an amendment to resolve that problem, by ensuring that the Children's Commissioner for Wales should have the right to deal with all cases in Wales, irrespective of the policy areas concerned. The Labour Party supported that amendment in the Assembly last week. What steps will you now take to ensure that the legislation is amended to clear up this matter, and to ensure that Peter Clarke will be the only commissioner to deal with children's problems in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I believe that we are of the unanimous opinion that children in Wales need a one-stop shop, particularly children who are facing difficulties of one sort or another and need help from the authorities. I do not think that there is any disagreement about the basic principle of a one-stop shop for our children. We must now consider how we can achieve that aim of a one-stop shop through our discussions with the Department for Education and Skills in London, the Ministers, Charles Clarke and Margaret Hodge, and perhaps the two commissioners—although England's commissioner has not yet been appointed. As long as the details of their joint-working on

cydweithredu ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli ac mai Peter Clarke fydd â'r prif gyfrifoldeb ar gyfer ein plant ni o ran y gwasanaethau a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad, gallwch weld y bydd model ar gael. Nid ydym wedi cyrraedd y model hwnnw hyd yn hyn; nid ydym wedi gallu penderfynu ar yr union berthynas rhwng y comisiynydd newydd ar gyfer Lloegr ac, ar rai agweddau, ar gyfer Lloegr a Chymru, a'r comisiynydd annibynnol dros blant yng Nghymru. Nid ydym yn disgwyl i blant Cymru, yn enwedig pan y byddant mewn cyflwr lle mae angen help yr awdurdodau arnynt, fod yn arbenigwyr ar ein trefniadau cyfansoddiadol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I ddod â chi yn ôl at bwynt sylfaenol, mae'r Cynulliad wedi gofyn ichi sicrhau bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn caniatáu i Peter Clarke fod yr unig gomisiynydd sy'n delio â phroblemau plant yng Nghymru. Mae Margaret Hodge a Don Touhig wedi dweud 'na' i hynny. Maent wedi gwrthod y cais, a hynny'n ddigon clir. Dywedodd Margaret Hodge na fydd newid, a dywedodd Don Touhig bod y sefyllfa yn Lloegr yn wahanol, ac y bydd y Ddeddf hon yn mynd yn ei blaen fel ag y mae ar hyn o bryd. A ydych yn cefnogi newid y ddeddfwriaeth honno, ac os nad yw Margaret Hodge a Don Touhig yn fodlon gwneud hynny, a wnewch fynd at y Prif Weinidog, Tony Blair ei hun, i sicrhau bod plant Cymru yn cael chwarae teg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr unig beth y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod trafodaethau yn parhau gyda'r Gweinidogion perthnasol yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol.

**Laura Anne Jones:** First Minister, the Prime Minister has stated that a pilot of free part-time education for two-year-olds paved the way for the expansion of childcare facilities across England. Is that line of vision for universal state-supported education for under-fives a vision that you share for Wales, and do you agree that it seems somewhat unfair to university students who are in debt because of paying for their education and who are crying out for support?

**The First Minister:** The expansion of the availability of childcare and nursery

non-devolved matters will be sorted out and that Peter Clarke will be chiefly responsible for our children in terms of the services that have been devolved to the Assembly, you can see that a model will emerge. We have not reached that point yet; we have not been able to decide on the exact relationship between the new commissioner for England and, on some issues, for England and Wales, and the independent children's commissioner in Wales. We do not expect children in Wales, particularly those who need the help of the authorities, to be experts on our constitutional arrangement.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** To bring you back to a fundamental point, the Assembly has asked that you ensure that the legislation allows Peter Clarke to be the sole commissioner dealing with children's problems in Wales. Margaret Hodge and Don Touhig have rejected that. They have refused that request, and have done so clearly. Margaret Hodge said that there will be no change, and Don Touhig said that the situation is different in England and that this Act will go forward in its present form. Will you tell us whether you support amending that legislation, and if Margaret Hodge and Don Touhig are not willing to do that, will you approach the Prime Minister, Tony Blair himself, to ensure fair play for children in Wales?

**The First Minister:** All I can say is that negotiations are ongoing with the relevant Ministers in the United Kingdom Government.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Brif Weinidog, mae Prif Weinidog y DU wedi datgan bod rhagbrawf ar addysg ran amser am ddim i blant dwyflwydd oed wedi arloesi'r ffordd ar gyfer ehangu cyfleusterau gofal plant ledled Lloegr. A ydych yn rhannu gweledigaeth o'r fath o addysg gyffredinol a gynhelir gan y wladwriaeth i blant dan bump oed ar gyfer Cymru, ac a ydych yn cytuno bod hynny'n ymddangos yn annheg braidd i fyfyrwyr prifysgol sydd mewn dyled am eu bod yn talu am eu haddysg ac sy'n erfyn am gymorth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ehangu'r ddarpariaeth o ofal plant ac addysg feithrin

education is an exceedingly important part of education policy, not only with regard to not barring students who have children from being able to undertake full-time or near-full-time courses. The availability of childcare for two-year-olds and anything up to 10 and 12-year-olds is also extremely important to economic policy. It should be available. It may not all be state funded—some of it will be funded by the private sector via the tax credit system and it will come in a multiplicity of models—however, we must see an expanding childcare sector to assist the economy and to assist a wide range of career and education choices being made by parents.

yn rhan bwysig iawn o bolisi addysg, nid yn unig o ran peidio â rhwystro myfyrwyr sydd â phlant rhag gallu dilyn cyrsiau llawn amser neu bron yn llawn amser. Mae sicrhau bod gofal plant ar gael i rai dwyflwydd oed a rhai hyd at 10 a 12 mlwydd oed yn bwysig iawn i bolisi economaidd hefyd. Dylai fod ar gael. Efallai na fydd y cwbl yn cael ei ariannu gan y wladwriaeth—bydd rhywfaint ohono'n cael ei ariannu gan y sector preifat drwy'r system credyd treth a bydd ar lawer ffurf—fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd y sector gofal plant yn ehangu er mwyn hybu'r economi a hyrwyddo amrywiaeth mawr o ddewisiadau mewn gyrfa ac addysg i rieni.

### Gorchmynion Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour Orders

**Q7 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the application of anti-social behaviour orders in Wales? (OAQ34797)

**C7 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru? (OAQ34797)

**The First Minister:** An anti-social behaviour order is one of a wide range of measures that can be used to address anti-social behaviour. They are not applied hastily, and community safety partnerships try to tackle the problem through acceptable behaviour contracts and by exhausting other approaches before they have to apply an anti-social behaviour order. You may be aware, William, that magistrates in different parts of Wales take different views. Some seem keen on moving straight to issuing an order, while others prefer to exhaust every other possibility first. You will find varying figures in different parts of Wales because of magistrates' preferences.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn un o blith amrediad eang o fesurau y gellir eu defnyddio i ymdrin ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Nis rhoddir ar waith yn ddifeddwl, ac mae partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r broblem drwy gontractau ymddygiad derbyniol a thrwy roi cynnig ar ddulliau gweithredu eraill cyn iddynt orfod rhoi gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ar waith. Gallech fod yn ymwybodol, William, fod gwahanol farn gan ynadon mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Ymddengys fod rhai'n awyddus i droi'n syth at gyhoeddi gorchmynion, tra bo'n well gan eraill roi cynnig ar bob posibilrwydd arall yn gyntaf. Cewch wahanol ffigurau mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru oherwydd yr hyn sydd orau gan ynadon.

**William Graham:** Do you not agree that this unfortunate initiative requires a second look? Some 19 orders have been issued in Wales in the last four years, of which nearly two thirds were breached in the first instance. They are largely ignored and are beginning to fail. Their credibility is much reduced; please look at them again.

**William Graham:** Oni chytunwch fod angen ailedrych ar y fenter anffodus hon? Cyhoeddwyd tua 19 o orchmynion yng Nghymru yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf, y torrwyd bron ddwy ran o dair ohonynt yn y lle cyntaf. Fe'u hanwybyddir gan mwyaf ac maent yn dechrau methu. Mae eu hygredd yn llai o lawer; ailystyriwch hwy, os

gwelwch yn dda.

**The First Minister:** I had a lengthy discussion on this point with chief constable Brunstrom in north Wales last week, and he did not give me that impression at all. He thought that the combination of the acceptable behaviour contracts and other pre-anti-social behaviour orders, plus the order itself as the ultimate sanction, as it were, was working well in reclaiming the streets for the respectable citizenry of Wales.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Do you agree that a possible way to alleviate anti-social behaviour is by encouraging young people to take part in sport? In my constituency, there are three world championship kick boxers: James Parry and Joshua Heyes, who both won gold medals, and Ryan Parry, who won a silver medal at the world championship last week in Corfu. Ryan and James also won silver in the team event. Some 60 countries competed, and these young people were welcomed home by the whole of Glynneath this morning, led by Max Boyce. Will you join me in congratulating them and their coach, Rhidian Heyes, on their excellent performance and on being such good ambassadors for Wales?

**The First Minister:** How could I do otherwise? That seems to me a commendable example of the science of diversion—which is well established in France—which is the provision of sporting, musical, artistic and cultural alternatives for over-enthusiastic youths who, if they do not have a way to get rid of their excess energy can, unfortunately, get into trouble. The French have made a big thing of this, which is why their sporting achievements have become so outstanding from what was a standing start 30 years ago. They really believe in diversion. We are only beginning to get into diversion, but yours is a classic example of it—not that I am implying that these three would have got into trouble. Such model citizens will act as an inspiration to others, and the provision of music, sport or other means of introducing a bit of adventure or a challenge into people's lives to enable them to see that they have a constructive, rather than destructive, contribution to make

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cefais drafodaeth hir ar y pwynt hwn gyda'r prif gwnstabl Brunstrom yn y Gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac ni roddodd argraff o'r fath i mi o gwbl. Credai fod y cyfuniad o gontractau ymddygiad derbynol a gorchmynion eraill ynghylch ymddygiad cyn y rhai ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, ynghyd â'r gorchmyn ei hun fel yr ataliad terfynol, fel petai, yn llwyddo i hawlio'r strydoedd yn ôl i ddinasyddion parchus Cymru.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A ydych yn cytuno mai un modd i leihau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yw annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon? Yn fy etholaeth i, mae tri chicfocsiwr a fu ym mhencampwriaeth y byd: James Parry a Joshua Heyes, a enillodd fedalau aur ill dau, a Ryan Parry, a enillodd fedal arian ym mhencampwriaeth y byd yr wythnos diwethaf yn Corfu. Gwnaeth Ryan a James ennill medal arian yn y gystadleuaeth i dimau hefyd. Bu rhyw 60 o wledydd yn cystadlu, a chroesawyd y bobl ifanc hyn yn ôl y bore yma gan bawb yng Nglyn-nedd, dan arweiniad Max Boyce. A wnewch ymuno â mi i'w llongyfarch hwy a'u hyfforddwr, Rhidian Heyes, ar eu perfformiad rhagorol ac ar fod yn gystal llysgenhadon dros Gymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sut y gallwn wneud fel arall? Mae hynny'n ymddangos i mi'n enghraifft gymeradwy o wyddor gwrthdynnu—sydd wedi'i hen sefydlu yn Ffrainc—sef darparu dewisiadau ym myd chwaraeon, cerddoriaeth, celfyddyd a diwylliant i bobl ifanc orfrwdfrydig a all fynd i helynt, gwaetha'r modd, os na chânt fodd i gael gwared â'r egni sydd dros ben ganddynt. Mae'r Ffrancwyr wedi rhoi pwys mawr ar hyn, a dyna pam y maent wedi cyflawni cymaint mewn chwaraeon ar ôl cychwyn heb ddim 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Maent yn credu mewn gwrthdynnu sylw. Megis dechrau yr ydym ni wrth roi cynnig ar wrthdynnu, ond yr oedd yr enghraifft a roesoeh yn un glasurol—nid fy mod yn awgrymu y byddai'r tri hyn wedi mynd i helynt. Bydd dinasyddion delfrydol o'r fath yn ysbrydoli eraill, ac mae darparu cerddoriaeth, chwaraeon neu ddulliau eraill o ddod ag ychydig o her neu antur i fywydau

is to be welcomed.

pobl fel y gallant weld fod modd iddynt gyfrannu'n adeiladol, yn hytrach nag yn ddinistriol, yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu.

### **Cyflogaeth Lawn Full Employment**

**Q8 Brian Gibbons:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the implication for labour markets in Wales as we approach full employment? (OAQ34796)

**The First Minister:** This is an issue on which I always have arguments with Digby Jones, the director general of the Confederation of British Industry, because he says that we have already reached full employment and I think that we still have some way to go. We must consider how childcare can be used, as I mentioned in answer to an earlier question, to release more people who, at this moment, find that although they would like to work, the lack of availability of affordable, good quality childcare holds them back from doing so. Similarly, many people with mental or physical illnesses that have caused them to go onto incapacity benefits have simply lost their self confidence to enter the labour force. The pilot scheme in Rhondda Cynon Taf and Bridgend, covering 12 per cent of Wales's population, which I discussed with Andrew Smith last week—although it is early days yet—is said to be going well.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is an encouraging message. You may be aware that, in the past, and certainly in my constituency of Aberavon since world war two, whenever there were serious labour shortages, we always welcomed people from abroad, from England, Scotland, Ireland, Poland, Spain, Italy, the West Indies, India, Pakistan and even the Breton onion sellers at various stages. Would you agree that there are important lessons to be learned from the strengths that we have gained from this diverse workforce, particularly as we may have to look towards these sources in the future?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** Your description of

**C8 Brian Gibbons:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y goblygiad i farchnadoedd llafur yng Nghymru wrth i ni ddynesu at gyflogaeth lawn? (OAQ34796)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn bwnc yr wyf bob amser yn dadlau yn ei gylch gyda Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, gan ei fod ef yn dweud ein bod eisoes wedi cyrraedd cyflogaeth lawn a minnau'n credu bod gennym gryn ffordd i fynd. Rhaid inni ystyried sut y gellir defnyddio gofal plant, fel y dywedais mewn ateb i gwestiwn cynharach, i ryddhau mwy o bobl sy'n gweld ar hyn o bryd, er y carent weithio, fod prinder gofal plant fforddiadwy o ansawdd da yn eu hatal rhag gwneud hynny. Yn yr un modd, mae llawer sydd â salwch meddyliol neu gorfforol, sy'n peri eu bod yn derbyn budd-daliadau analluogrwydd, wedi colli hunan hyder fel na allant ymuno â'r gweithlu. Dywedir bod y cynllun peilot yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n cynnwys 12 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru, a drafodais gydag Andrew Smith yr wythnos diwethaf, yn llwyddo—er nad yw ond newydd ddechrau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae honno'n neges galonogol. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol ein bod bob amser yn y gorffennol, ac yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i, Aberafan, ers yr ail ryfel byd, pryd bynnag yr oedd prinder gweithwyr dybryd, wedi croesawu pobl o wledydd tramor, o Loegr, yr Alban, Iwerddon, Gwlad Pwyl, Sbaen, yr Eidal, India'r Gorllewin, India, Pacistan a hyd yn oed y gwerthwyr winwns o Lydaw ar wahanol adegau. A gytunech fod gwersi pwysig i'w dysgu o'r cryfderau yr ydym wedi'u hennill o'r gweithlu amrywiol hwn, yn enwedig gan y gallem orfod dibynnu ar y ffynonellau hynny yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'ch disgrifiad o Bort

post-war Port Talbot is accurate. I am sure that that is exactly what happened when 19,000 people worked in the steelworks. In the heyday of the docks, Cardiff would have had exactly the same suction effect, drawing people in from all over the world. Ireland is an interesting example, as the number of jobs in the Irish economy went from 1 million to 1.5 million in the space of 10 years, and many Irish people—although, gladly, not you, Brian—decided to return home, because jobs and opportunities became available that were not there when they left in the 1980s. In part—although Ireland started from 17 per cent unemployment in 1992, and we do not; we start from a relatively low level of unemployment—the more you increase jobs, as we are doing at present, the more the question of where the people for the labour force will come from will factor. However, our first recourse must be to reduce the level of people on benefits—if we can give people the confidence to come off benefits—and to provide better transport and childcare to enable people who cannot take up jobs at present to take them up.

**Elin Jones:** Mae 22 y cant o'r bobl sydd yn ystyried eu hunain yn Gymru yn byw y tu allan i Gymru, yn ôl y cyfrifiad diwethaf, a'r mwyafrif o'r bobl hynny yn byw yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr. Yn dilyn y pwyntiau sydd wedi'u gwneud ynglŷn â phrinder sgiliau mewn rhai meysydd yn yr economi Gymreig, a'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud ynglŷn â'r broses yn Iwerddon, a oes gan eich Llywodraeth unrhyw bolisiâu neu fwriad i dargedu'r 22 y cant hynny sydd yn byw y tu allan i Gymru i weld a oes ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn symud yn ôl i Gymru i gyfrannu i'r economi ac at y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a'u rhedeg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd hynny'n digwydd yn naturiol, i raddau helaeth. Yr oedd pobl yn arfer meddwl bod yn rhaid iddynt fynd i fyny'r M4 i Fryste, Swindon, Llundain ac yn y blaen, er mwyn cael swyddi gwell, tâl uwch a mwy o sialens o ran cyrraedd lefelau uwch yn eu gyrfaoedd. Yn awr, maent yn gweld bod y math hwn o alw am bobl sydd â sgiliau technoleg gwybodaeth a meddalwedd yn bodoli mewn lleoedd megis General

Talbot ar ôl y rhyfel yn un cywir. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai hynny'n union a ddigwyddodd pan oedd 19,000 o bobl yn gweithio yn y gwaith dur. Pan oedd y dociau yn eu hanterth, byddai Caerdydd yn denu pobl yn yr union un modd, o bob rhan o'r byd. Mae Iwerddon yn enghraifft ddiddorol, gan fod nifer y swyddi yn economi Iwerddon wedi codi o 1 filiwn i 1.5 miliwn o fewn 10 mlynedd, gan fod llawer o Wyddelod wedi penderfynu mynd adref—er na wnaethoch chi hynny, Brian, a da hynny—gan fod swyddi a chyfleoedd wedi codi nad oeddent yno pan ymadawasant yn yr 1980au. Yn rhannol—er bod Iwerddon wedi dechrau â diweithdra o 17 y cant yn 1992, yn wahanol i ni; yr ydym ni'n dechrau â lefel diweithdra cymharol isel—po fwyaf y cynyddwn nifer y swyddi, fel yr ydym yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, mwyaf fydd yr ystyriaeth a roddir i'r manau y daw pobl ohonynt i'r gweithlu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni roi sylw'n gyntaf i ostwng y nifer sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau—os gallwn ennyn hyder ym mhobl i roi'r gorau i'w derbyn—a darparu gwell trafndiaeth a gofal plant fel y bydd y rhai na allant gymryd swyddi ar hyn o bryd yn gallu gwneud hynny.

**Elin Jones:** According to the last census, 22 per cent of the population who consider themselves to be Welsh live outside Wales, and the majority of those live in the south-east of England. Following the points that have been made on the skills shortage in some areas of the Welsh economy, and what you have just said about the process in Ireland, does your Government have any policy or plan to target that 22 per cent living outside Wales to see whether they would be interested in returning to Wales to contribute to the economy and to run and contribute to public services?

**The First Minister:** To a great extent that will happen naturally. People used to think that they had to go up the M4 to Bristol, Swindon, London and so on in order to get better jobs, a higher salary and a greater challenge in terms of climbing the career ladder. They now see that the demand for people with information technology and software skills exists in places such as General Dynamics in Oakdale. Those people

Dynamics yn Oakdale. Mae'r bobl hyn yn awr yn dod yn ôl i Gymru. Mae Ford yn dweud yr un peth am ei ffatri ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sef bod y bobl sydd wedi symud o Abertawe, neu leoedd eraill yng Nghymru, i Dagenham, yn breuddwydio am ddod yn ôl i Gymru, ond iddynt allu cael swydd sydd yn cyfateb i'w sgiliau a'u gallu.

are now returning to Wales. Ford says exactly the same about its Bridgend factory, namely that the people who moved from Swansea, or other places in Wales, to Dagenham are now dreaming of returning to Wales, as long as they can get a job that is commensurate to their skills and ability.

### **Y Sector Ymchwil a Datblygu** **The Research and Development Sector**

**Q9 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's efforts to increase the research and development sector in Wales? (OAQ34800)

**C9 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ymdrechion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ehangu'r sector ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru? (OAQ34800)

**The First Minister:** This matter is relevant to higher education as well as to the private business sector. We continue to provide strong backing for programmes to encourage increased research and development activity in both sectors, including, most notably, the brain-imaging centre, which is funded by the Office of Science and Technology, costing in excess of £8 million. The OST approved this centre as part of the recent merger proposals between the University of Wales College of Medicine and Cardiff University.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r mater hwn yn berthnasol i addysg uwch yn ogystal ag i'r sector busnes preifat. Parhawn i roi cymorth helaeth i raglenni sy'n hybu gweithgarwch mewn ymchwil a datblygu yn y ddau sector, gan gynnwys, yn fwyaf nodedig, canolfan delweddu'r ymennydd, a gyllidir gan y Swyddfa Gwyddoniaeth a Thechnoleg, sy'n costio mwy nag £8 miliwn. Cymeradwyodd y swyddfa y ganolfan hon fel rhan o'r cynlluniau diweddar i gyfuno Coleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru a Phrifysgol Caerdydd.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that it is crucial that we increase the research and development sector if we are to effectively reduce the wealth gap between Wales and England, which has become so intractable in recent decades?

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig inni ehangu'r sector ymchwil a datblygu os ydym i allu lleihau'r bwlch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, a ddaeth i fod yn gyndyn o newid yn y degawdau diwethaf?

**The First Minister:** That is one of the reasons why we changed the rules on regional selective assistance. They were previously tied to capital investment, but we gave companies a new option some three years ago to encourage research and development, whereby you do not have to have any capital investment and the RSA grant is assessed as a proportion of your wage bill. Therefore, if you have a research laboratory with 30 clever scientists working in it, but little equipment, commensurate with the kind of wages, we can still grant aid it at the level of, I believe, 20 per cent of the wage bill for the first five years. That is the right way to improve the historically low

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna un o'r rhesymau yr ydym wedi newid y rheolau ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. O'r blaen yr oeddent ynghlwm wrth fuddsoddi cyfalaf, ond rhesom ddewis newydd i gwmnïau tua thair blynedd yn ôl i hybu ymchwil a datblygu, fel nad oes raid buddsoddi unrhyw gyfalaf ac fel yr asesir y grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol fel cyfran o'r bil cyflogau. Gan hynny, os oes gan rywun labordy ymchwil a 30 o wyddonwyr medrus yn gweithio ynddo, ond fawr o offer, yn ôl y math o gyflogau, gallwn ddal i roi cymorth grant ar ei gyfer o 20 y cant o'r bil cyflogau, yr wyf yn credu, am y pum mlynedd cyntaf. Dyna'r modd cywir i godi'r cyniferydd isel o weithgarwch

quotient of research and development and industrial activity in Wales's private sector.

**Mick Bates:** Research and development is fundamental to good science. Your colleague, Tony Blair, said that the science base is the bedrock of our economic performance, yet, your Government seems to pay little attention to science. Do you have any plans to develop the science base and, consequently, the research and development base, in Wales? Chamber business looks a bit thin at present; you could even timetable a debate on science research and development next week.

**The First Minister:** It is not up to me to settle matters of business. However, what is not thin is the number of proposals that we have to step up scientific activity in Wales. You will be aware, because you can probably see it from your window, of the gene park phase 2 proposals for the Roath basin near this building. That is one proposal. There is also the roll-out of the technium programmes. This includes the highly successful technium 1 completed building in Swansea, the optics technium development in St Asaph, which has now been completed and which Andrew Davies visited last week, the General Dynamics and Cogent developments in Oakdale and Newport, and the Delta microelectronics development at the Tredomen business park. There are many of these, which are beginning to fulfil the historic research and development deficit in Wales.

**Owen John Thomas:** The proposal to establish a faculty at Barry for the study of cultural tourism presents the National Assembly with a great opportunity to invest, through the Welsh Development Agency and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, in the expansion of research and development with wide benefits to the whole of Wales. What are you doing to promote that?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of it having a major impact in research and

ymchwil a datblygu a diwydiannol a gafwyd yn y gorffennol yn y sector preifat yng Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Mae ymchwil a datblygu'n hollbwysig i wyddoniaeth dda. Mae'ch cyfaill, Tony Blair, wedi dweud mai'r sylfaen wyddoniaeth sy'n cynnal ein perfformiad economaidd, ac eto, ymddengys mai ychydig o sylw y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei roi i wyddoniaeth. A oes gennych unrhyw fwrriad i ddatblygu'r sylfaen wyddoniaeth ac, o ganlyniad, y sylfaen ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru? Mae busnes y Siambr yn ymddangos braidd yn ddisylwedd ar hyn o bryd; gallech hyd yn oed amserlennu dadl ar ymchwil a datblygu gwyddonol yr wythnos nesaf.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid fy lle i yw trefnu materion busnes. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym nifer sylweddol o gynlluniau i gynyddu gweithgarwch gwyddonol yng Nghymru. Byddwch yn gwybod, gan y gallwch ei weld drwy'ch ffenestr, yn ôl pob tebyg, am y cynlluniau ar gyfer rhan 2 y parc genynnau yn noc y Rhath ger yr adeilad hwn. Dyna un cynllun. Mae'r rhaglenni technium yn cael eu rhoi ar waith hefyd. Mae hynny'n cynnwys yr adeilad a gwblhawyd ar gyfer y technium 1 tra llwyddiannus yn Abertawe, datblygu'r technium opteg yn Llanelwy, sydd wedi'i gwblhau bellach, yr ymwelodd Andrew Davies ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf, datblygiadau General Dynamics a Cogent yn Oakdale a Chasnewydd, a datblygiad microelectroneg Delta ym mharc busnes Tredomen. Mae llawer o'r rhain, sy'n dechrau gwneud iawn am y diffyg ymchwil a datblygu a gafwyd yn y gorffennol yng Nghymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'r bwriad i sefydlu cyfadran yn y Barri i astudio twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn rhoi cyfle gwyh i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fuddsoddi, drwy Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, i ehangu ymchwil a datblygu gan ddod â manteision helaeth i Gymru gyfan. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wyddwn y câi hynny effaith fawr ar ymchwil a datblygu, er ei fod



development, although it is an interesting proposal. I do not believe that it has come to us yet as a fully worked up business plan from the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff. When it does, it will require some sort of indication of how it can fund the figure of, I believe, £25 million of the initial capital cost. We do not have £25 million ready to pluck off trees, therefore it will need to find some private business support for that initial capital cost.

yn gynllun diddorol. Ni chredaf ei fod wedi'i gyflwyno i ni eto fel cynllun busnes cyflawn gan Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd. Pan ddigwydd hynny, bydd yn rhaid iddi ddangos sut y gall dalu'r swm o £25 miliwn, yr wyf yn credu, o'r gost cyfalaf ddechreuol. Nid oes gennym £25 miliwn yn tyfu ar goed, felly bydd yn rhaid iddi ddod o hyd i gymorth oddi wrth fusnes preifat ar gyfer y gost cyfalaf ddechreuol honno.

### **Adroddiad Comisiwn Richard The Richard Commission Report**

**Q10 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister explain the importance of the Richard commission report findings to the process of devolution in Wales? (OAQ34822)

**C10 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog egluro pa mor bwysig yw canfyddiadau adroddiad comisiwn Richard o ran y broses ddatganoli yng Nghymru? (OAQ34822)

**The First Minister:** Perhaps the only thing that I would try to highlight, in addition to what I have said on several previous occasions on the Richard commission, is that the key point for us to work out to satisfy the public as to what is being proposed here—and this is of particular interest to you as the business manager for the official opposition—is how much additional work is involved in the implementation of the Richard proposals. I have said before that I am sceptical about it clearly demonstrating a need for an increase from 60 to 80 Members—it can be done with 60 Members. However, it would mean, for example, dealing with less secondary legislation in Plenary and, likewise, perhaps fewer 'this house believes' debates, because you would achieve the same objectives by having primary legislation to hang it on as a peg, rather than general discussion about a policy.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr unig beth y byddwn am dynnu sylw ato, efallai, yn ychwanegol at yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddweud ar sawl achlysur cyn hyn am gomisiwn Richard, yw mai'r prif bwynt i ni ei ddatrys er mwyn bodloni'r cyhoedd o ran yr hyn a gynigir yma—ac mae hyn o ddiddordeb neilltuol i chi fel rheolwr busnes yr wrthblaid swyddogol—yw pa faint o waith ychwanegol a geid wrth roi cynigion Richard ar waith. Dywedais o'r blaen fy mod yn amheus a yw'n dangos yn glir fod angen cynyddu nifer yr Aelodau o 60 i 80—gellir ei wneud o gael 60 o Aelodau. Er hynny, byddai'n golygu, er enghraifft y byddem yn delio â llai o is-ddeddfwriaeth mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn ac, yn yr un modd, llai o ddadleuon i ddatgan 'barn y tŷ hwn', efallai, gan y gellid cyflawni'r un amcanion o gael deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i'w chyfleu, yn hytrach na thrafodaeth gyffredinol am bolisi.

**Jocelyn Davies:** You have said that you believe that the Assembly should have primary legislative powers. You also acknowledge that you do not believe that we need any more AMs and you do not want to reduce the number of MPs. However, you intend to carry out a time and motion study of Assembly Members. How will that work?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Dywedasoeh eich bod yn credu y dylai'r Cynulliad gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol. Yr ydych hefyd yn cydnabod nad ydych yn credu bod arnom angen rhagor o ACau ac nad ydych am leihau nifer yr ASau. Er hynny, yr ydych yn bwriadu cynnal astudiaeth amser a symud o Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio?

**The First Minister:** Until the study is completed it is difficult to say how it would work, other than along the general lines that I

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hyd nes y cwblheir yr astudiaeth, anodd yw dweud sut y byddai'n gweithio, heblaw y byddai'n debyg i'r hyn a

mentioned in answer to your first question: could we dispense with or put into a kind of upstairs, as do the Scottish and British Parliaments, some of the secondary legislation that we currently debate? Some of that secondary legislation would not be debated on the floor of the House of Commons or in the Scottish Parliament. Therefore, it is the net increase that you must consider rather than the increase coming from the numbers of Bills that we would be dealing with as primary legislation. Secondly, would we, and would the opposition, agree that there would be less need for the kind of debates that we have on a general policy theme, and the debating proposition, 'this house believes'? In a way, if you have primary legislative powers, you can see that that would be more appropriate to being discussed in another forum. Do you need to do that if you have primary legislation? That is why I would like to come forward with proposals, as I said, along the lines of a time and motion study.

**Carl Sargeant:** On the Richard commission report and its recommendations for the process of devolution, do you agree that it would be important to identify the difference between regional Members and directly elected Members of the Assembly, as it would be wrong for someone to call themselves an elected Member for a constituency when they are not?

**The First Minister:** I not only genuinely, but also diplomatically, cannot remember what the Richard commission said on that precise point.

2.50 p.m.

**Michael German:** I will take you in another direction on the Richard commission. Do you regret that the commission did not recommend that the Assembly should have the power, alongside primary legislation powers, to borrow money? Do you believe that such power should be like that of the Northern Ireland Assembly, with due checks and balances established by the Chancellor of the Exchequer? Do you believe that such power sits well alongside primary legislative powers?

grybwyllais mewn ateb i'ch cwestiwn cyntaf: a allem gael gwared ar rai o'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth y cawn ddadleuon arnynt ar hyn o bryd neu eu hanfon i fyny'r grisiau, fel y gwnaiff Seneddau'r Alban a Phrydain? Mae rhywfaint o'r is-ddeddfwriaeth honno na cheid dadleuon arni ar lawr Tŷ'r Cyffredin neu yn Senedd yr Alban. Gan hynny, y cynnydd net y mae'n rhaid ei ystyried yn hytrach na'r cynnydd sy'n dilyn nifer y Mesurau y byddem yn eu trafod fel deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Yn ail, a fyddem ni, ac a fyddai'r gwrthbleidiau, yn cytuno y byddai llai o angen am y math o ddadleuon a gawn ar themâu polisi cyffredinol, a thrafod y cynnig, 'mae'r tŷ hwn o'r farn'? Ar un ystyr, o gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, gellir gweld y byddai'n fwy priodol trafod hynny mewn fforwm arall. A oes angen hynny os oes gennych ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol? Dyna pam y carwn ddwyn cynigion gerbron, fel y dywedais, o fath yr astudiaeth amser a symud.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ynghylch adroddiad comisiwn Richard a'i argymhellion ar gyfer proses datganoli, a ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n bwysig nodi'r gwahaniaeth rhwng Aelodau rhanbarthol ac Aelodau o'r Cynulliad a etholir yn uniongyrchol, gan y byddai'n anghywir i rywun ei alw ei hun yn Aelod etholedig dros etholaeth ac yntau heb fod yn un?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedaf yn ddidwyll, ac yn ddiplomataidd hefyd, na allaf gofio beth a ddywedodd comisiwn Richard ar yr union bwynt hwnnw.

**Michael German:** Af â chi i gyfeiriad arall ar fater comisiwn Richard. A yw'n ofid gennych na wnaeth y comisiwn argymhell y dylai'r Cynulliad gael pŵer, ochr ym ochr â phwerau deddfu sylfaenol, i fenthycu arian? A ydych yn credu y dylai pŵer o'r fath fod yn debyg i'r hyn sydd gan Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, gyda rhwystrau a gwrthbwysau priodol a bennwyd gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys? A ydych yn credu bod pŵer o'r fath yn cydweddu â phwerau deddfu sylfaenol?

**The First Minister:** That would depend upon what you would do with the accumulative total being borrowed by the UK and its public authorities. Currently, you will be aware that Gordon Brown has increased public borrowing to around £35 billion. That is believed to be the safest total public debt that this country's Government can afford. We have benefited from that borrowing in terms of increases in public expenditure in Wales over the past five years. Therefore, if you took our level of borrowing into account, the Chancellor would not be able to borrow £35 billion. That is the problem. Do you think that it is realistic to increase public-sector borrowing beyond the maximum level that Gordon Brown has reached now, which is close to the 3 per cent Maastricht treaty criteria, although we have not signed up to that? He believes that that is a prudent but maximal level of borrowing.

**Michael German:** When the Northern Ireland Assembly was established, it requested permission from the Chancellor to borrow money, and that was granted. The conditions upon which he granted this were within his own framework. This allows the Northern Ireland Assembly to borrow money for issues that it feels are important. Do you think, for example, that the PFI schemes that are hanging in the air could have been concluded more rapidly had we had that power? The new health facility in Monmouth, for example, has been in the process of being built for two years because it is waiting for a financial package to be agreed. Would the Northern Ireland Assembly process not have been a much better process for the National Assembly for Wales to adopt? This is what we wanted. We would then have that power and the facility in Monmouth would have been built more rapidly.

**The First Minister:** If a PFI scheme is, as you say, hanging in the air—I do not know the details of what is hanging in the air in Monmouth; you must write to me about that—it is usually because there is no agreement between the users and the providers of a facility regarding its revenue cost, and not because we have been unable to fund the capital investment. If you know of an example that contradicts this in

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai hynny'n dibynnu ar yr hyn a wnaech â'r cyfanswm cronol a fenthycir gan y DU a'i hawdurdodau cyhoeddus. Gwyddoch fod Gordon Brown wedi cynyddu benthyca cyhoeddus i tua £35 biliwn erbyn hyn. Credir mai hwnnw yw cyfanswm y ddyled gyhoeddus y gall Llywodraeth y wlad hon ei fforddio'n sicr. Cawsom fudd o'r benthyca hwnnw o ran codiadau mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Felly, os cymerid ein lefel benthyca ni i ystyriaeth, ni fyddai'r Canghellor yn gallu benthyca £35 biliwn. Dyna'r broblem. A ydych o'r farn y gellid cynyddu swm y benthyca cyhoeddus y tu hwnt i'r uchafswm y mae Gordon Brown wedi'i gyrraedd yn awr, sy'n agos i'r maen prawf o 3 y cant o dan gytundeb Maastricht, er nad ydym wedi cytuno ar hwnnw? Mae'n credu mai dyna'r lefel benthyca uchaf y mae'n ddoeth ei chael.

**Michael German:** Pan sefydlwyd Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, gofynnodd am ganiatâd gan y Canghellor i fenthycia arian, ac fe'i rhoddwyd. Yr oedd yr amodau ar hynny'n rhan o'i fframwaith ei hun. Mae hyn yn gadael i Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon fenthycia arian ar gyfer materion sy'n bwysig ganddo. A ydych yn credu, er enghraifft, y gellid cyflawni'r cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat sydd ar eu hanner yn gyflymach pe byddem yn meddu ar y pŵer hwnnw? Er enghraifft, mae'r gwaith o adeiladu'r cyfleuster iechyd newydd yn Nhrefynwy wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo am ddwy flynedd wrth ddisgwyl cytundeb ar becyn ariannol. Oni fyddai'n well o lawer i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fabwysiadu proses Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon? Dyna'r hyn yr oeddem ni am ei gael. Byddai'r pŵer hwnnw gennym wedyn a byddai'r cyfleuster yn Nhrefynwy wedi'i godi'n gynt.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os oes cynllun menter cyllid preifat ar ei hanner, fel y dywedwch—ni wn fanylion yr hyn sydd ar ei hanner yn Nhrefynwy; rhaid ichi ysgrifennu ataf am hynny—y rheswm am hynny, fel arfer, yw nad oes cytundeb rhwng y defnyddwyr a darparwyr y cyfleuster ynghylch y gost refeniw. Os gwyddoch am enghraifft sy'n groes i hynny yn Nhrefynwy, ysgrifennwch ataf. Fodd bynnag, yn fy mhrofiad i, mae

Monmouth, write to me. However, in my experience, hold-ups in capital schemes are usually caused by difficulties in getting planning permission or securing an agreement on revenue funding between the providers and the users of services.

oedi mewn cynlluniau cyfalaf yn ganlyniad fel arfer i anawsterau wrth gael caniatâd cynllunio neu sicrhau cytundeb ar gyllid refeniw rhwng y darparwyr a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have three changes to report to this week's business. I have tabled a motion to suspend Standing Orders in order to bring forward a no named day motion tomorrow to elect a new member to the Committee on Standards of Conduct, which meets on Thursday. This is being carried out with the agreement of the Business Committee. Tomorrow, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will make a statement on the allocation of funding under the new school building improvement grant. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae gennyf dri newid i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno cynnig i atal Rheolau Sefydlog er mwyn rhoi cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod gerbron yfory i ethol aelod newydd i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, sy'n cwrdd ddydd Iau. Gwneir hyn gyda chytundeb y Pwyllgor Busnes. Yfory, bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn gwneud datganiad ar ddyrannu cyllid o dan y grant gwella adeiladau ysgol newydd. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol.

Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Conduct of Members (Model Code of Conduct) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2004; the Local Elections (Declaration of Acceptance of Office) and Welsh Forms (Wales) Order 2004; the Review of Children's Cases (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Waste and Emissions Trading Act 2003 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004; the Landfill Allowances Scheme (Wales) Regulations 2004; the Town and Country Planning (General Development Procedure) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2004; the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2004; and the Advocacy Services and Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2004

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Ymddygiad Aelodau (Cod Ymarfer Model) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2004; Gorchymyn Etholiadau Lleol (Datganiad Derbyn Swydd) a Ffurflenni Cymraeg (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau Adolygu Achosion Plant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; Gorchymyn Deddf Gwastraff a Masnachu Allyriannau 2003 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004; Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Lwfansau Tirlenwi (Cymru) 2004; Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Gweithdrefn Datblygu Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2004; a Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Eirioli a Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2004.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I

10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Y Llywydd:** Gwahoddaf un Aelod o bob grŵp i wneud sylwadau byr ar y datganiad busnes.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that the Business Minister is aware of the weekend's events, which Plaid Cymru would like to see addressed by the Assembly and therefore included in future business statements. A number of issues relate to the unfortunate situation that has developed at Coleg Gwent. Plaid Cymru is calling for a full and open public inquiry into the management of Coleg Gwent, given the handling of the present situation, which has left students and staff in limbo. Students will be unable to complete their courses, and many feel so dejected that they have already given up studying for the courses they were following this year, thereby putting their futures at risk. Many staff members were told on Friday that they would be made redundant, without the college having followed the proper procedures. This mishandling and mismanagement of the situation requires a full and open public inquiry, to reinstate confidence among staff, students and the public in the future handling of the college.

Given the funding situation faced by many colleges, Plaid Cymru fears that Coleg Gwent will not be the only college in Wales that will have to make drastic cuts. Plaid Cymru calls for a debate on the funding situation of post-16 education.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. According to Standing Orders, comments on the business statement are to be brief.

see that there are at least 10. I therefore call the Minister to formally propose the business statement.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite one Member from each group to comment briefly on the business statement.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Trefnydd yn gwybod am y digwyddiadau dros y penwythnos, y carai Plaid Cymru weld y Cynulliad yn ymdrin â hwy drwy eu cynnwys mewn datganiadau busnes yn y dyfodol. Mae sawl mater yn codi mewn cysylltiad â'r sefyllfa anffodus a ddatblygodd yng Ngholeg Gwent. Mae Plaid Cymru yn galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn ac agored i reolaeth Coleg Gwent, yng ngolwg y modd yr ymdrinnir â'r sefyllfa bresennol, a adawodd i fyfyrwyr a staff fynd yn angof. Ni fydd myfyrwyr yn gallu gorffen eu cyrsiau, ac mae llawer ohonynt yn teimlo mor ddigalon fel eu bod eisoes wedi rhoi'r gorau i astudio ar gyfer y cyrsiau yr oeddent yn eu dilyn eleni, gan roi eu dyfodol mewn perygl. Dywedwyd wrth sawl aelod staff ddydd Gwener y câi ei ddiswyddo, a hynny heb i'r coleg ddilyn y gweithdrefnau priodol. Mae'r camdraffod a chamreoli ar y sefyllfa'n galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn ac agored, i adfer hyder ymysg y staff, y myfyrwyr a'r cyhoedd yn y modd y trafodir y coleg yn y dyfodol.

Yng ngolwg y sefyllfa y mae llawer o golegau'n ei hwynebu o ran cyllido, mae Plaid Cymru yn ofni nad Coleg Gwent fydd yr unig goleg yng Nghymru a fydd yn gorfod gwneud toriadau llym. Mae Plaid Cymru yn galw am ddadl ar y sefyllfa o ran cyllido addysg ôl-16.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yn ôl Rheolau Sefydlog, mae sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes i fod yn fyr.

**Janet Ryder:** Plaid Cymru calls for a debate on the funding situation of post-16 education, particularly of Welsh colleges. The Minister can no longer hide behind ELWa; she must bring the issue to the Assembly for debate—

**Janet Ryder:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn galw am ddatl ar y sefyllfa o ran cyllido addysg ôl-16, mewn cysylltiad â cholegau Cymru yn benodol. Ni all y Gweinidog guddio y tu ôl i ELWa bellach; rhaid iddi ddod â'r mater i'r Cynulliad i gael dadl arno—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I call Peter Law.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Galwaf Peter Law.

**Peter Law:** We were devastated to hear the news about Coleg Gwent. No consultation has been undertaken and we have seen a lack of public relations and common sense, which leads us to question our confidence in Coleg Gwent. I would ask that the Minister issues a statement as soon as possible about the future of Coleg Gwent. I am particularly concerned about the closure of the engineering department in Ebbw Vale, which will have a knock-on effect on an area that is struggling to survive and to attract new jobs following the closure of the steelworks, and other redundancies. People in Blaenau Gwent will have to travel up to 30 miles to attend engineering courses. This is a serious situation for my constituency, for Coleg Gwent, and for other colleges in the region. I hope that the Minister will make a statement as soon as possible.

**Peter Law:** Yr oedd yn ofid mawr inni glywed y newyddion am Goleg Gwent. Ni fu unrhyw ymgynghori a gwelsom ddiffyg cysylltiadau cyhoeddus a synnwyr cyffredin, sy'n peri inni amau a allwn fod â hyder yng Ngholeg Gwent. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi datganiad cyn gynted ag y bo modd am ddyfodol Coleg Gwent. Yr wyf yn arbennig o bryderus ynghylch cau'r adran peirianeg yng Nglynebwy, a gaiff effaith ganlyniadol ar ardal sy'n ei chael yn anodd parhau a denu swyddi newydd ar ôl cau'r gwaith dur, a cholli swyddi eraill. Bydd pobl Blaenau Gwent yn gorfod teithio hyd at 30 milltir i ddilyn cyrsiau peirianeg. Mae hon yn sefyllfa ddifrifol i'm hetholaeth, i Goleg Gwent, ac i golegau eraill yn y rhanbarth. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**David Davies:** The Conservative Party is united in its astonishment that in the week that 45 lecturers were made redundant and hundreds of people discovered that their courses are to be severely disrupted and that they will have to travel by bus to attend any courses that may be running after a scythe has been taken to provision, we have not had one word from our normally loquacious Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. She cannot normally resist the temptation to make a statement to the Assembly if someone in a school so much as opens a can of peaches. Why have we not had a debate or a statement on this issue?

**David Davies:** Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn cydryfeddu, yn yr wythnos y diswyddwyd 45 o ddarlithwyr ac y darganfu cannoedd o bobl yr amherir yn ddybryd ar eu cyrsiau ac y byddant yn gorfod teithio ar fws i ddilyn unrhyw gyrsiau a allai fod ar gael ar ôl i'r ddarpariaeth gael ei chwtoegi, na chlywsom yr un gair gan ein Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, sydd mor huawdl fel arfer. Fel arfer, ni all ymwrthod â'r demtasiwn i roi datganiad i'r Cynulliad os yw rhywun mewn ysgol yn gymaint ag agor tun ffrwythau. Pam na chawsom ddatl neu ddatganiad ar y mater hwn?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. 'Briefly' also applies to you, David.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae 'byr' yn berthnasol i chi hefyd, David.

**David Davies:** This matter not only affects Coleg Gwent, but every college in Wales.

**David Davies:** Nid ar Goleg Gwent yn unig y mae'r mater hwn yn effeithio, ond ar bob coleg yng Nghymru.

We would also like to know why we have not had a statement or debate on the cut in training places for student nurses, nor a discussion on the cohesion report.

**Peter Black:** David is right to say that we need a debate on Coleg Gwent. However, the problem extends beyond Coleg Gwent, as there is a crisis in the further education sector as a whole. Swansea College has had to abolish courses, and other colleges are under threat and are struggling with their finances. We need a statement or debate on FE funding.

I support the request for a statement on the reduction in the number of training places for student nurses at the University of Wales, Bangor. The Minister stated that no cuts would be made, yet a reduction in the number of training places has now been announced. These statements need to be reconciled, and we request that the Minister makes a further statement to the Assembly so that we can scrutinise the decision.

3.00 p.m.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** On Coleg Gwent, it is not appropriate for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to intervene in the internal workings of a college. However, there is scope for Members to question the Minister on this issue—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a discussion on adopting the business statement and, as David Davies knows, I do not enjoy heckling. He may be seeking to go to a place where there is heckling, but I will not allow that here.

**Karen Sinclair:** There is scope for Members to question the Minister on this issue in the margins of her oral questions tomorrow and there is a Committee meeting next week, where I am sure the matter will be raised.

On nurse training places, how much by way of explanation do you need? The Minister for Health and Social Services does not intend to make a statement on this. Jane Hutt

Carem wybod hefyd pam na chawsom ddatganiad neu ddatl ar y cwtogi ar leoedd i nyrsys dan hyfforddiant, na thrafodaeth ar yr adroddiad cydlyniant.

**Peter Black:** Mae David yn iawn wrth ddweud bod arnom angen dadl ar Goleg Gwent. Er hynny, mae'r broblem yn mynd ymhellach na Choleg Gwent, gan fod argyfwng yn y sector addysg bellach drwyddo draw. Mae Coleg Abertawe wedi gorfod dwyn cyrsiau i ben, ac mae colegau eraill o dan fygythiad ac yn ei chael yn anodd cael deupen llinyn ynghyd. Rhaid inni gael datganiad neu ddatl ar gyllido addysg bellach.

Ategap y cais am ddatganiad ar ostwng nifer y lleoedd ar gyfer nyrsys dan hyfforddiant ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Bangor. Dywedodd y Gweinidog na fyddai toriadau, ond cyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar y bydd nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi'n gostwng. Mae angen cysoni'r ddau ddatganiad hyn, a gofynnwn am ddatganiad pellach gan y Gweinidog fel y gall y Cynulliad graffu ar y penderfyniad.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Ynghylch Coleg Gwent, nid yw'n briodol i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ymyrryd yng ngweithrediadau mewnol unrhyw goleg. Er hynny, mae cyfle i Aelodau holi'r Gweinidog am y mater hwn—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Trafodaeth ar dderbyn y datganiad busnes yw hwn ac, fel y gŵyr David Davies, nid wyf yn mwynhau heclo. Efallai ei fod yn ceisio mynd i lle y mae heclo yn digwydd, ond ni chaniatâf hynny yma.

**Karen Sinclair:** Gall Aelodau holi'r Gweinidog am y mater hwn wrth iddi ateb cwestiynau llafar yfory, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y codir y mater hwn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf.

Ynghylch lleoedd hyfforddi nyrsys, pa faint o eglurhad y mae arnoch ei angen? Nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn bwriadu gwneud datganiad

announced the nursing education commissioned numbers for 2004-05 at the national human resources conference for NHS Wales on Friday, 23 April. The major trade unions have been consulted about the commissioning numbers. The issue has also been the subject of numerous Assembly questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services and to the First Minister. Both Jenny Randerson and Nick Bourne raised this subject today with the First Minister and both received full answers.

am hyn. Cyhoeddodd Jane Hutt y niferoedd a gomisiynwyd ar gyfer addysg nyrsio yn 2004-05 yng nghynhadledd genedlaethol GIG Cymru ar adnoddau dynol ar ddydd Gwener, 23 Ebrill. Ymgynghorwyd â'r prif undebau llafur am y niferoedd a gomisiynwyd. Gofynnwyd sawl cwestiwn yn y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac i'r Prif Weinidog. Gwnaeth Jenny Randerson a Nick Bourne ill dau godi'r mater hwn heddiw gyda'r Prif Weinidog a rhoddwyd atebion llawn i'r ddau ohonynt.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jonathan Morgan:** Point of order. This morning, we heard from the University of Wales, Bangor of suggested cuts in the number of nurse training places for the

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pwynt o drefn. Y bore yma, clywsom gan Brifysgol Cymru, Bangor am doriadau a awgrymwyd yn nifer y lleoedd i nyrsys dan hyfforddiant ar gyfer y



academic year 2004-05. The text of the e-mail, which is before me, suggests even further reductions in years to come. The Government has refuted the allegation, but it is matched by an earlier allegation in March this year from the University of Glamorgan. While we still maintain that the Minister for Health and Social Services should make a statement to the Assembly clarifying the position, because both her position and that of the universities cannot be accurate, there is a further matter, which I believe that you, as Presiding Officer, should consider. In replying to the allegations, no Government Minister or member of the governing party was available for comment. Instead, a civil servant was asked by the Government to reply on its behalf to the media and was quoted as such. I raise this point of order specifically in relation to section 5.1 of the Ministerial Code, which states that

‘Ministers have...a duty to uphold the political impartiality of the Civil Service’.

In light of the highly sensitive nature of the allegations that were being considered this morning, I seek your ruling as to whether or not the Minister for Health and Social Services is in breach of section 5.1 of the Ministerial Code.

**The Presiding Officer:** First, I declare an interest as the president of the University of Wales, Bangor.

The Ministerial Code refers to the relationships between Ministers and officials as well as to the relationship between Ministers and the Assembly. As far as the role of officials is concerned, they act in the public interest on the instruction of Ministers and, as such, are part of the home civil service. The relationship between Ministers and their officials and the opportunity for officials to comment publicly are all matters for the Ministers and for the staff structure of the civil service; they are not matters for me.

It is quite clear that it is of paramount importance that Ministers give accurate and truthful information to the Assembly, as outlined in point 1.5 (iii) of the Ministerial

flwyddyn academaidd 2004-05. Mae testun y neges e-bost, sydd gennyf o'm blaen, yn awgrymu y bydd gostyngiadau pellach eto yn y dyfodol. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod y cyhuddiad, ond cafwyd cyhuddiad tebyg yn gynharach ym mis Mawrth eleni oddi wrth Brifysgol Morgannwg. Er y parhawn i fynnu y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol roi datganiad i'r Cynulliad i egluro'r sefyllfa, gan na all ei safbwynt hi a safbwynt y prifysgolion ill dau fod yn gywir, mae mater pellach yn codi, y credaf y dylech chi, fel Llywydd, ei ystyried. Wrth ymateb i'r cyhuddiadau, nid oedd yr un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth nac aelodau'r blaid lywodraethol ar gael i wneud sylw. Yn hytrach, gofynnodd y Llywodraeth i was sifil ateb ar ei rhan i'r cyfryngau ac fe'i dyfynnwyd fel y cyfryw. Codaf y pwynt hwn o drefn yn benodol mewn cysylltiad ag adran 5.1 y Cod i'r Gweinidogion, sy'n dweud bod

‘ar y Gweinidogion...ddyletsywyd i gynnal didueddwch gwleidyddol y Gwasanaeth sifil’.

Yng ngolwg natur dra sensitif y cyhuddiadau a ystyriwyd y bore yma, ceisiaf ddyfarniad gennych ynghylch a yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi mynd yn groes i adran 5.1 y Cod i'r Gweinidogion ai peidio.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn gyntaf, datganaf fuddiant fel llywydd Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor.

Mae'r Cod i'r Gweinidogion yn cyfeirio at y cysylltiadau rhwng Gweinidogion a swyddogion yn ogystal â'r berthynas rhwng Gweinidogion a'r Cynulliad. O ran rôl swyddogion, gweithredant er budd y cyhoedd o dan gyfarwyddyd Gweinidogion ac, yn hynny o beth, maent yn rhan o'r gwasanaeth sifil cartref. Mae'r berthynas rhwng Gweinidogion a'u swyddogion a'r cyfle i swyddogion wneud sylwadau'n gyhoeddus yn faterion i'r Gweinidogion ac i strwythur staff y gwasanaeth sifil; nid ydynt yn faterion i mi.

Mae'n gwbl amlwg ei bod o'r pwys mwyaf fod Gweinidogion yn rhoi gwybodaeth gywir a geirwir i'r Cynulliad, fel y nodir ym mhwynt 1.5 (iii) yn y Cod i'r Gweinidogion.

Code. However, any complaint that the Minister has not complied with the code should be drawn to the attention of the First Minister, although complaints may also be referred to the Standards Committee. What Ministers say, or do not say, outside of the Assembly is a matter for them. Clearly, Assembly Members are able to make comments on such matters to the media, as I believe Jonathan Morgan did this morning, and to raise them in the Assembly. However, I see no specific matters of order for me on this point.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point of order, I raise the issue of our ability as Assembly Members to carry out our duties of informing constituents about the current situation with regard to nurse training places. One the one hand, two institutions are informing us that training places are being restricted, but the Minister told me categorically on 24 March that there would be no cuts in training places for nurses. Will you help us to understand this matter, Presiding Officer? What are we supposed to tell our constituents? The Minister tells us that the numbers are increasing, but the institutions tell us that the training places are being reduced. Is that the same school of science that told us that restricting the number of Committee meetings would help scrutiny in the Assembly? [*Laughter.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am afraid that I was a little too generous.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am grateful for that.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. My generosity must not be tested too far. It is clear, from the section of the Ministerial Code to which I referred, that it is of paramount importance that Ministers give accurate and truthful information to the Assembly, correcting any inadvertent error at the earliest opportunity, and so on. As far as I am aware, this is a matter for public debate. The Minister had made her views clear and provided information to the Assembly. Further information has emerged from other sources, and, no doubt, this public debate will continue. Clearly, if the Minister wishes

Fodd bynnag, dylai unrhyw gŵyn i'r perwyl nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi cydymffurfio â'r cod gael ei thynnu i sylw'r Prif Weinidog, er y gellir cyfeirio cwynion hefyd i'r Pwyllgor Safonau. Mae'r hyn a ddywed neu na ddywed Gweinidogion y tu allan i'r Cynulliad yn fater iddynt hwy. Wrth gwrs, gall Aelodau o'r Cynulliad wneud sylwadau ar faterion o'r fath i'r cyfryngau, fel y gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan y bore yma, yr wyf yn credu, a'u codi yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ni welaf unrhyw faterion o drefn sy'n benodol i mi yn y pwynt hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, codaf fater ein gallu fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad i gyflawni ein dyletswyddau i hysbysu etholwyr am y sefyllfa bresennol o ran lleoedd i nyrsys dan hyfforddiant. Ar un llaw, mae dau sefydliad yn ein hysbysu y cyfyngir ar nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi, ond dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthyf yn bendant ar 24 Mawrth na fyddai unrhyw dorri ar nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi ar gyfer nyrsys. A wnewch chi ein helpu i ddeall y sefyllfa hon, Lywydd? Beth ddylem ei ddweud wrth ein hetholwyr? Dywed y Gweinidog wrthym fod y niferoedd ar gynydd, ond dywed y sefydliadau wrthym fod nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi yn cael ei leihau. A ddaw'r farn hon o'r un bobl a ddywedodd wrthym y byddai cyfyngu ar nifer y cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor yn hyrwyddo craffu yn y Cynulliad? [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae arnaf ofn imi fod braidd yn rhy hael.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid peidio â threthu fy haelioni'n ormodol. Mae'n amlwg, yn ôl yr adran o'r Cod i'r Gweinidogion y cyfeiriais ati, ei bod o'r pwys mwyaf fod Gweinidogion yn rhoi gwybodaeth gywir a geirwir i'r Cynulliad, gan gywiro unrhyw gamgymeriad a wnaed drwy amryfusedd ar y cyfle cyntaf, ac yn y blaen. Hyd y gwn i, mae hwn yn fater ar gyfer dadl gyhoeddus. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi datgan ei barn ac wedi rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad. Daeth gwybodaeth bellach o ffynonellau eraill, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd y dadl gyhoeddus hon yn parhau. Wrth gwrs, os yw'r Gweinidog yn

to make a statement to the Assembly on this matter, facilities will be provided for her to do so at her earliest convenience.

dymuno rhoi datganiad i'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn, rhoddir trefniadau ar waith i'w galluogi i wneud hynny cyn gynted ag y bo'n hwylus iddi.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 27 April 2004 on the draft regulations, Care Homes (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004;*

*1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Ebrill 2004 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cartrefi Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004;*

*b) approves that Care Homes (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cartrefi Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 30 March 2004; and*

*i) rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Mawrth 2004; a'r*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 30 March 2004;*

*ii) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Mawrth 2004;*

*2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 27 April 2004 on the draft Order, the Valuation Tribunals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004; and*

*2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Ebrill 2004 ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*b) approves that the Valuation Tribunals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 30 March 2004; and*

*i) rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Mawrth 2004; a'r*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 30 March 2004. (NDM1945)*

*ii) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Mawrth. 2004. (NDM1945)*

*Cynnig (NDM1945): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 3.  
Motion (NDM1945): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 3.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.08 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.08 p.m.*

### **Comisiynydd ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn Commissioner for Older People**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Fourteen Members wish to speak on this motion, but  
**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae 14 Aelod am siarad ar y cynnig hwn, ond awr sydd wedi'i

there is an indicative time of one hour for this debate. I appeal therefore for succinct speeches, and where people can take fewer than five minutes, that would be welcomed.

I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**The Deputy Minister for Older People (John Griffiths):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *welcomes the report of the advisory group on a commissioner for older people in Wales, which will be placed on the intranet on 5 May 2004;*

2. *notes the Welsh Assembly Government's intention to consult widely on the report;*

3. *endorses the Assembly Government's commitment to establish a commissioner for older people in Wales; and*

4. *notes the Assembly Government's intention to bring this matter to Plenary again, following completion of the consultation exercise. (NDM1944)*

I will deal first with the two amendments that have been tabled. Jonathan Morgan's amendment 1 seeks to specify in today's motion that the work of the commissioner will not duplicate the work and duties of the proposed commission for equality and human rights. I cannot support that amendment, as it is unnecessary. We have been keeping in close contact with the developing work on the new commission, and the UK Government is fully aware that we intend to establish an older people's commissioner. The relationship between the work of the new equality body and the commissioner is an issue that the advisory group's report specifically addresses, precisely to ensure that the two roles are complementary, as they relate to older people. We will consider the advisory group's proposals in the light of the responses to the consultation and the Government's White Paper on the commission for equality and human rights,

ganiatáu ar gyfer y ddadl. Erfyniaf felly am areithiau cryno; byddwn yn croesawu areithiau o lai na phum munud.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Bobl Hŷn (John Griffiths):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn croesawu adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol ar gomisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, a fydd yn cael ei roi ar y fewnwyd ar 5 Mai 2004;*

2. *yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymgynghori'n eang ynghylch yr adroddiad;*

3. *yn cymeradwyo ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru; ac*

4. *yn nodi bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno'r mater hwn gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn unwaith eto, ar ôl i'r ymarfer ymgynghori ddod i ben. (NDM1944)*

Ymdriniaf yn gyntaf â'r ddau welliant a gyflwynwyd. Mae gwelliant 1 o eiddo Jonathan Morgan yn ceisio pennu yn y cynnig heddiw na fydd gwaith y comisiynydd yn dyblygu gwaith a dyletswyddau'r comisiwn arfaethedig ar gyfer cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw, gan ei fod yn ddiangen. Buom mewn cysylltiad agos â'r gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo ar y comisiwn newydd, ac mae Llywodraeth y DU yn llwyr ymwybodol o'n bwriad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae'r berthynas rhwng gwaith y corff cydraddoldeb newydd a'r comisiynydd yn fater y mae adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol yn ymdrin ag ef yn benodol, a hynny'n unswydd er mwyn sicrhau y bydd y ddwy rôl yn ategu ei gilydd, gan eu bod yn ymwneud â phobl hŷn. Ystyriwn gynigion y grŵp cynghorol yng ngoleuni'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad ynghyd â Phapur Gwyn y Llywodraeth ar y comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol, pan

when published.

gaiff ei gyhoeddi.

3.10 p.m.

Kirsty's amendment regrets our failure to secure a Bill to establish the commissioner. I cannot support this amendment either. We debated the Cabinet's proposals for primary legislation in Plenary as recently as 17 March. The proposals included a Bill to establish the commissioner. Following the advisory group's report, we are now starting the consultation process so that we can work up our detailed requirements in an open and consultative fashion. We have done all that we possibly can do at this stage. As usual, the UK Government will announce the next legislative programme in the Queen's Speech in the autumn.

Mae gwelliant Kirsty yn gresynu at ein methiant i sicrhau Mesur i greu swydd comisiynydd. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn ychwaith. Cawsom ddadl ar gynigion y Cabinet ar gyfer deddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn mor ddiweddar â 17 Mawrth. Yr oedd y cynigion yn cynnwys Mesur i sefydlu'r comisiynydd. Yn dilyn adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol, yr ydym bellach yn dechrau'r broses ymgynghori fel y gallwn baratoi ein gofynion manwl mewn modd agored ac ymgynghorol. Gwnaethom bopeth y bu modd inni'i wneud hyd yma. Yn ôl ei harfer, bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn cyhoeddi'r rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol nesaf yn Araith y Frenhines yn yr hydref.

It is clear from demographic trends that we are an ageing society and, for years to come, we will have a higher proportion of older people than the rest of the UK. That is why the strategy for older people in Wales is important. Also, that is why Wales must continue to be at the forefront in raising the profile of its older people. For too long, older people have been perceived by some to be a problem. We must address that, and celebrate that people are living longer and healthier lives. We must maximise the opportunities that are presented by an ageing society.

Mae'n amlwg o'r tueddiadau demograffig ein bod yn gymdeithas sy'n heneiddio ac, am flynyddoedd i ddod, bydd gennym gyfran fwy o bobl hŷn na gweddill y DU. Dyna pam y mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn bwysig. Hefyd, dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i Gymru aros ar y blaen o ran hybu amlygrwydd pobl hŷn. Mae'r ffaith bod pobl yn ystyried pobl hŷn yn broblem wedi bod yn amlwg ers yn rhy hir. Rhaid inni ymateb i hynny, a dathlu'r ffaith bod pobl yn byw'n hwy ac yn iachach. Rhaid inni wneud y fawr o'r cyfleoedd a gyfyd mewn cymdeithas sy'n heneiddio.

Our landmark strategy for older people has been developed on a sound basis following extensive consultation that included many older people and research. The strategy is set in a 10-year framework and provides the starting point to address the implications of an ageing population. It will be essential to maintain momentum and monitor progress. We have now completed the first full-year of implementation, and an annual report will be published shortly. The strategy provides a new impetus to tackle ageism and discrimination against older people. One of the main features of the strategy is its focus on ensuring active citizenship for older people.

Datblygwyd ein strategaeth bwysig ar gyfer pobl hŷn ar sail gadarn ar ôl ymgynghori helaeth a oedd yn cynnwys llawer o bobl hŷn ac ymchwil. Mae'r strategaeth yn dilyn fframwaith 10 mlynedd, ac mae'n cynnig man cychwyn i drafod y goblygiadau sy'n codi am fod y boblogaeth yn heneiddio. Bydd dyfalbarhau a monitro cynnydd yn hollbwysig. Bellach, daethom i ddiwedd y flwyddyn lawn gyntaf wrth ei gweithredu, a chyhoeddir adroddiad blynyddol cyn hir. Mae'r strategaeth yn rhoi hwb o'r newydd i fynd i'r afael ag oedraniaeth a gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl hŷn. Un o brif nodweddion y strategaeth yw ei bod yn canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn cymryd rhan lawn fel dinasyddion.

The Labour Party's manifesto for the last

Yr oedd maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur ar gyfer

Assembly election included a commitment to establish a commissioner for older people. When I took up my appointment as Deputy Minister last year, one of my first tasks was to chair the advisory group that produced the report that we are debating today. The advisory group met on five occasions and included representatives from a broad section of society, including older people. Its report was presented to Jane Hutt in March. I pay tribute to the hard work and dedication of all members of the advisory group; they have produced a comprehensive and thoughtful report that makes a strong case for the older people's commissioner.

The advisory group concluded that the commissioner should be an independent champion for older people whose role should include empowering older people and helping them to enforce their legal rights. Its report recommends that the overall aim of the commissioner should be to promote and safeguard the rights and dignity of older people in Wales and to challenge discrimination against older people. The group discussed in detail the commissioner's duties and responsibilities and recommended that they include influencing policy and service delivery; championing and empowerment; being a source of information, advocacy and support; safeguarding and enhancing rights; and investigating complaints. For each of these headline tasks, the advisory group's report provides more detail. It also sets out proposals for the definition of older people, the powers of the commissioner, and, importantly, for the relationship of the commissioner with other bodies that deal with issues such as equality and complaints.

I am therefore delighted to be able to propose this motion. I look forward to a lively and informative debate and, following today's deliberations, to the outcome of the wide-ranging public consultation on the advisory group's report. It is vital that older people are given a stronger voice in society so that they can take a real part in the issues that affect them. Establishing a commissioner will be an important step towards achieving that goal. It is already clear that many older people

etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Pan ymgymerais â'm swydd fel Dirprwy Weinidog y llynedd, un o'm tasgau cyntaf oedd cadeirio'r grŵp cynghorol a gynhyrchodd yr adroddiad yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw. Cyfarfu'r grŵp cynghorol bum gwaith, ac yr oedd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o drawstoriad eang o gymdeithas, gan gynnwys pobl hŷn. Cyflwynwyd yr adroddiad i Jane Hutt ym mis Mawrth. Talaf deyrnged i waith caled ac ymroddiad holl aelodau'r grŵp cynghorol; maent wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad cynhwysfawr ac ystyriol sy'n cynnig dadl gref dros gael comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

Daeth y grŵp cynghorol i'r casgliad y dylai'r comisiynydd fod yn hyrwyddwr annibynnol dros bobl hŷn ac y dylai'i rôl gynnwys galluogi pobl hŷn a'u helpu i fynnu eu hawliau cyfreithiol. Mae ei adroddiad yn argymhell mai'r nod gyffredinol a ddylai fod gan y comisiynydd yw hyrwyddo a diogelu hawliau ac urddas pobl hŷn yng Nghymru a herio gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl hŷn. Trafododd y grŵp ddyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau'r comisiynydd yn fanwl gan argymhell y dylent gynnwys dylanwadu ar bolisi a dulliau darparu gwasanaethau; hyrwyddo a galluogi; bod yn ffynhonnell wybodaeth, eiriolaeth a chymorth; diogelu a hyrwyddo hawliau; ac ymchwilio i gwynion. Mae adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol yn cynnig mwy o fanylion am bob un o'r prif dasgau hyn. Mae hefyd yn nodi cynigion ar gyfer diffinio pobl hŷn, ar gyfer pwerau'r comisiynydd, ac, yn bwysig, ar gyfer y berthynas rhwng y comisiynydd a chyrrff eraill sy'n delio â materion fel cydraddoldeb a chwynion.

Mae'n bleser gennyf, felly, gael cynnig y cynnig hwn. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddadl fywiog a deallus ac, ar ôl trafodaeth heddiw, at ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad eang â'r cyhoedd ar adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol. Mae'n hollbwysig i bobl hŷn gael llais cryfach mewn cymdeithas fel y gallant gymryd rhan go iawn wrth drafod y materion sy'n effeithio arnynt. Bydd sefydlu comisiynydd yn gam pwysig tuag at gyflawni'r nod honno. Mae eisoes yn glir

welcome this proposal and eagerly anticipate the consultation exercise, which was launched today, as well as the establishment of the commissioner. The creation of a commissioner for older people will be another first for Wales, and keeps us in the lead in the UK. I commend the motion to Members.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose amendment 1. Insert at the end of point 3:

*, provided that it does not duplicate the work and duties of the new equality body.*

The Welsh Conservative Party starts from a rather odd perspective on this debate, as we were once sceptical about the Labour Government's intentions with regard to this proposal. Many of us felt initially that it was an election gimmick that would not amount to much. I am pleased, however, given what the Deputy Minister has said, the commitment that he gave, and the consultation that has been launched, that we might see a commissioner with status, who will add real value, as the Children's Commissioner for Wales has done. That post has developed since the commissioner's appointment.

This proposal presents opportunities for older people in Wales to ensure that their rights, their access to public services and their interests are upheld, not just in all that we do in terms of public policy, but also by other agencies and organisations responsible for providing services to older people. This proposal provides the sort of opportunities that we have discussed in committee. I am pleased that the consultation will be far-reaching; I think that we will have a huge response. There are, however, matters that we must consider as a public body, one of which relates to amendment 1. That amendment refers to the concern that many of us have about potential duplication between the proposed equality body at Westminster and the older persons' commissioner in Wales. I am sure that, in terms of the development of the two strategies, it is merely a coincidence that London had an idea at that same time that we did. However, we must ensure that whatever

bod llawer o bobl hŷn yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn ac yn edrych ymlaen yn eiddgar at yr ymgynghoriad, a lansiwyd heddiw, a hefyd at sefydlu'r comisiynydd. Bydd creu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn gam arloesol arall gan Gymru, a bydd yn ein cadw ar y blaen yn y DU. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i Aelodau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 3:

*, ar yr amod nad yw'n ailadrodd gwaith a dydleswyddau'r corff cydraddoldeb newydd.*

Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cychwyn o fan braidd yn rhyfedd ar y ddadl hon, gan ein bod, ar un adeg, yn amau bwriadau'r Llywodraeth Lafur yng nghyd-destun y cynnig hwn. Yr oedd llawer ohonom yn teimlo ar y dechrau mai gimig etholiadol ydoedd na fyddai'n arwain at fawr ddim. Yr wyf yn falch, fodd bynnag, yng ngolwg yr hyn a ddywedodd y Dirprwy Weinidog, a'r ymrwymiad a roddodd, a'r ymgynghoriad sydd wedi'i lansio, y gallem weld comisiynydd ac iddo statws, a fydd yn ychwanegu gwerth gwirioneddol, fel y gwnaeth Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae'r swydd honno wedi datblygu ers penodi'r comisiynydd.

Bydd y cynnig hwn yn arwain at gyfleoedd i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru sicrhau bod eu hawliau, eu gallu i gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a'u buddiannau yn cael eu cynnal, nid yn unig ym mhopeth a wnawn ni o ran polisi cyhoeddus, ond hefyd gan asiantaethau a chyrff eraill sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn un pellgyrhaeddol; credaf y cawn ymateb sylweddol. Er hynny, mae materion y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried fel corff cyhoeddus, ac mae un ohonynt yn ymwneud â gwelliant 1. Mae'r gwelliant hwnnw'n cyfeirio at y pryder sydd gan lawer ohonom am y dyblygu posibl rhwng y corff cydraddoldeb a gynigir yn San Steffan a'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr, yng nghyd-destun datblygu'r ddwy strategaeth, nad yw ond yn gyd-ddigwyddiad bod Llundain wedi cael syniad ar yr un adeg ag y cawsom ni. Er hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd yn hawdd i ba bynnag waith a wnaiff y



work is undertaken by the older persons' commissioner is not easily repeated or taken up by a new commission body in London.

I congratulate the Joint Committee on Human Rights on its work at Westminster. The eleventh report, which considers the need for a commission for equality and human rights, outlining a structure, functions and powers, is a first-class contribution to the debate on promoting equality, enshrining this in a single equality body. My concern is that the older persons' commissioner in Wales will substantially duplicate the work undertaken by a single equality commissioner, who will be established, presumably, through statute in Parliament. On page 14 of the eleventh report, published some months ago by the Joint Committee on Human Rights, there is a list of duties and functions. These include conducting and commissioning research, undertaking and supporting educational activities, promoting human rights, giving guidance and advice to public authorities, giving advice to Ministers and Parliament—presumably, the Assembly would be in there somewhere as well—and providing assistance and support to others that advances its general duty. Much of that, in one shape or form, has been lifted into the consultation document and the documents that we have seen with regard to the older persons' commissioner in Wales. There is, therefore, huge potential for the two bodies to overlap.

Looking further into this report, Deputy Minister, you will see reference to conducting public inquiries. Much of that work in Wales will, presumably, be undertaken by the older persons' commissioner. However, it is not clear in the documentation, from the Assembly Government or from London, which commissioner would be responsible for what. That needs clarification.

3.20 p.m.

I would be grateful if the Government would address two particular issues. First, if the equality body and the older person's commissioner are established along similar lines, with similar functions, responsibilities

comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn gael ei ail-wneud neu ei ddilyn gan gomisiwn newydd yn Llundain.

Llongyfarchaf y Cyd-bwyllgor Hawliau Dynol ar ei waith yn San Steffan. Mae'r unfed adroddiad ar ddeg, sy'n ystyried yr angen am gomisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol, gan nodi strwythur, swyddogaethau a phwerau, yn gyfraniad rhagorol i'r ddadl ar hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb, drwy ymgorffori hynny mewn un corff cydraddoldeb. Y pryder sydd gennyf yw y bydd y comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn dyblygu'n helaeth y gwaith a wnaiff un comisiynydd cydraddoldeb, a sefydlir, gellir cymryd, drwy ddeddf seneddol. Ar dudalen 14 yr unfed adroddiad ar ddeg, a gyhoeddwyd rai misoedd yn ôl gan y Cyd-bwyllgor Hawliau Dynol, mae rhestr o ddyletswyddau a swyddogaethau. Yn eu plith y mae cynnal a chomisiynu ymchwil, ymgymryd â gweithgareddau addysgol a'u cefnogi, hyrwyddo hawliau dynol, rhoi cyngor a chyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau cyhoeddus, cynghori Gweinidogion a'r Senedd—gellir cymryd y byddai'r Cynulliad yn rhan o hynny hefyd—a rhoi cymorth a chefnogaeth i eraill sy'n hyrwyddo ei ddyletswydd gyffredinol. Mae llawer o hynny, ar ryw ffurf neu'i gilydd, wedi'i gynnwys yn y ddogfen ymgynghori a'r dogfennau a welsom sy'n ymwneud â'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, mae'n bosibl iawn y gallai'r ddau gorff orgyffwrdd â'i gilydd.

Wrth edrych ymhellach ar yr adroddiad hwn, Ddirprwy Weinidog, gwelwch gyfeirio at gynnal ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus. Gellir cymryd y bydd llawer o'r gwaith hwnnw yng Nghymru'n cael ei wneud gan y comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Er hynny, nid yw'n glir yn y dogfennau a gafwyd oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad neu o Lundain pa gomisiynydd a fyddai'n gyfrifol am beth. Mae angen egluro hynny.

Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai'r Llywodraeth yn ymdrin â dau fater penodol. Yn gyntaf, os bydd y corff cydraddoldeb a'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn debyg, a chanddynt swyddogaethau, cyfrifoldebau a

and duties, which commissioner will take precedence in Wales? Do you anticipate that the older person's commissioner in Wales would have responsibility for devolved matters and therefore be accountable to us, with the UK commissioner being responsible for non-devolved matters and therefore directly accountable to the relevant UK Secretary of State? That would create a conflict similar to that which we have seen with regard to the Children's Commissioner for Wales and the proposed children's commissioner for the UK. Secondly, will the UK commissioner be able to examine issues relating to devolved matters? That is not clear in the documentation from London, though it implies that the single UK equality body will have responsibility for matters in Wales. That must be clarified.

We are happy to support the consultation, and we welcome it. We hope that this proposal will prove to be meaningful, that it will deliver real change for older people and that it will not just be seen as a gimmick.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We look forward to giving the proposal fuller support and consideration once we have received those assurances.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I hope that Members will not overstep the mark, because that will mean that not everybody will have the chance to speak.

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to secure UK Government time at Westminster to introduce the required primary legislation to establish the commissioner for older people.*

I welcome John Griffiths's statements this afternoon. This is clearly an important provision, and our amendment does not relate to the quality of the proposal, but to

dyletswyddau tebyg, pa gomisiynydd a gaiff flaenoriaeth yng Nghymru? A ydych yn rhagweld y byddai gan y comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru gyfrifoldeb dros faterion sydd wedi'u datganoli ac y byddai, felly, yn atebol i ni, ac y byddai comisiynydd y DU yn gyfrifol am faterion sydd heb eu datganoli ac y byddai, felly, yn uniongyrchol atebol i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol perthnasol yn y DU? Byddai hynny'n creu gwrthdaro tebyg i'r hyn a welsom mewn cysylltiad â Chomisiynydd Plant Cymru a'r comisiynydd plant arfaethedig ar gyfer y DU. Yn ail, a fydd comisiynydd y DU yn gallu ymchwilio i bynciau sy'n ymwneud â materion a ddatganolwyd? Nid yw hynny'n glir yn y ddogfen a gafwyd o Lundain, er ei bod yn awgrymu y bydd y corff cydraddoldeb sengl dros y DU yn gyfrifol am faterion yng Nghymru. Rhaid egluro hynny.

Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi'r ymgynghoriad, ac yr ydym yn ei groesawu. Gobeithiwn y bydd y cynnig hwn yn profi'n un ystyrlon, y bydd yn sicrhau gwir newid i bobl hŷn ac na chaiff ei ystyried yn ddim ond gimig.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Edrychwn ymlaen at roi cefnogaeth ac ystyriaeth lawnach i'r cynnig wedi inni gael sicrwydd ar y materion hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gobeithiaf na fydd Aelodau'n mynd heibio i'w hamser, gan y bydd hynny'n golygu na chaiff pawb gyfle i siarad.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gael amser Llywodraeth y DU yn San Steffan i gyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol angenrheidiol i sefydlu'r Comisiynydd ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn.*

Croesawaf sylwadau John Griffiths y prynhawn yma. Mae'n amlwg mai darpariaeth bwysig yw hon, ac nid yw ein gwelliant yn ymwneud ag ansawdd y cynnig,

the practicalities of implementing it. The proposal is important because many older people suffer at home, in soiled beds, with no-one to care for or visit them. Elderly couples are sometimes separated when one partner goes into care and the other stays at home, or when they are put into different homes. An advocate for those people is desperately needed, and the job needs doing. The advisory committee's report is clear about the direction in which this should go, and I am pleased that the committee's work has now gone out to consultation.

We must ask practical questions, and Jonathan Morgan has alluded to the first of these. On 11 December, the Minister for Health and Social Services told us that the Welsh Assembly Government had to consider the outcome of the UK Government's considerations on a single equality body. That is crucial, because if the commissioner for older people in Wales is to follow the same pattern as that for the children's commissioner, and to have similar powers, we will bump into the same problems regarding jurisdiction.

All of us deal with elderly people in our surgeries, many of whom have problems relating to benefits, pension credit and so on. We seek advice and try to help, but these matters are not devolved to us; they are the responsibility of the UK Government. Tied in with those issues, however, are social services issues, relating to the level of care that people receive in their homes, how they can pay for their care, and how they can receive it directly from their local authority—or perhaps independently, if the Minister implements the legislation that I proposed last term, as she says she will. These matters bring into stark relief the question of who has jurisdiction. If we are, once again, to be faced with a one-stop shop, will that one-stop shop have two different commissioners? These are big questions that need clarification. Had we the legislative power, the simple answer would be to give the commissioner the overarching right to carry out investigations in all areas related to the cases that are brought to his or her attention.

ond â'r agweddau ymarferol ar ei weithredu. Mae'r cynnig yn bwysig gan fod llawer o bobl hŷn yn dioddef yn eu cartrefi, mewn gwelyau wedi'u baeddu, a neb i ofalu amdanynt neu ymweld â hwy. Weithiau caiff cyplau oedrannus eu gwahanu pan fo'r naill yn cael ei dderbyn i ofal a'r llall yn aros gartref, neu pan roddir hwy mewn cartrefi gwahanol. Mae taer angen rhywun i ddadlau dros y bobl hynny, ac mae'n waith y mae angen ei wneud. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor cynghorol yn bendant ynghylch y llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn, ac yr wyf yn falch y ceir ymgynghori'n awr ar waith y pwyllgor.

Rhaid inni ofyn cwestiynau ymarferol, ac mae Jonathan Morgan wedi cyfeirio at y cyntaf ohonynt. Ar 11 Rhagfyr, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrthym fod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried canlyniad ystyriaethau Llywodraeth y DU ar un corff cydraddoldeb. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, oherwydd os yw'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru i ddilyn yr un patrwm â hwnnw ar gyfer y comisiynydd plant, ac os caiff bwerau tebyg, byddwn yn profi'r un problemau o ran awdurdodaeth.

Mae pob un ohonom yn delio â phobl oedrannus yn ein cymorthfeydd, y mae gan lawer ohonynt broblemau sy'n ymwneud â budd-daliadau, credyd pensiwn ac yn y blaen. Gofynnwn am gyngor a cheisio'u helpu, ond nid yw'r materion hyn wedi'u datganoli i ni; maent yn gyfrifoldeb i Lywodraeth y DU. Ynghlwm wrth y materion hynny, fodd bynnag, y mae materion sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, sy'n gysylltiedig â lefel y gofal a gaiff pobl yn eu cartrefi, sut y gallant dalu am eu gofal, a sut y gallant ei gael yn uniongyrchol gan eu hawdurdod lleol—neu efallai'n annibynnol, os gwnaiff y Gweinidog roi ar waith y ddeddfwriaeth a gynigiais y tymor diwethaf, fel y dywedodd y gwnaiff. Mae'r materion hyn yn amlygu'r cwestiwn o gan bwy y mae'r awdurdodaeth. Os byddwn yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o gael siop un stop, unwaith eto, a fydd dau gomisiynydd gwahanol yn y siop un stop honno? Cwestiynau pwysig yw'r rhain y mae angen cael eglurhad arnynt. Pe byddem yn meddu ar bŵer i ddeddfu, yr ateb syml fyddai rhoi i'r comisiynydd yr hawl

gyffredinol i gynnal ymchwiliadau yn yr holl feysydd sy'n ymwneud â'r achosion a ddygir i'w sylw.

The second practical issue relates to the timetable within which this proposal can be achieved. We note that the bid has gone, with the Assembly's blessing, to the Government and that, in the autumn, the Queen's Speech may or may not contain it. However, even if it is in the Queen's Speech, it is likely to be interrupted by a general election, which will mean that it will be postponed. Again, this points to the need for clarity with regard to the National Assembly's powers. We are all clear that we want what we have achieved with the children's commissioner, but without the complications that have been rolled into the post by the UK Government, which has a slightly weaker model. The model that we have described is one that the children's commissioner described. I believe that there is consensus here that having a commissioner with the right to investigate across the board, and one person to whom people can turn, is the right approach. That may not be the case when the UK Government does its work on behalf of England.

I note that Ian Lucas has a private Member's Bill before Parliament on this, but I understand that it will not get any parliamentary time and is thus likely to fall. Therefore, debate on these issues may be postponed for some time. That is an indication of the length of time that it takes for a good proposal to come to fruition, and how important it would be for the Assembly to have legislative powers. To conclude, I wonder whether this champion for older people could also consider discrimination by employers against those who are past the age at which some might expect them to retire.

**Janice Gregory:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to participate in this debate, having campaigned last year on a manifesto that reaffirmed Labour's commitment to delivering for older people in Wales. The older people to whom I spoke during last year's campaign were not only interested in Labour's pledge to establish a commissioner, but were also impressed that Labour was campaigning on a specific manifesto for

Mae'r ail fater ymarferol yn ymwneud â'r cyfnod y gellir cyflawni'r bwriad hwn oddi mewn iddo. Nodwn fod cais wedi'i gyflwyno, gyda sêl bendith y Cynulliad, i'r Llywodraeth ac y gallai fod yn Araith y Frenhines yn yr hydref. Er hynny, hyd yn oed os bydd yn Araith y Frenhines, mae'n debygol y bydd etholiad cyffredinol yn torri ar ei draws, a bydd hynny'n golygu y caiff ei ohirio. Unwaith eto, mae hyn yn dangos yr angen am eglurder o ran pwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr ydym oll yn bendant ein bod am weld cyflawni'r hyn a gyflawnasom yn achos y comisiynydd plant, ond heb y dryswch a grëwyd mewn cysylltiad â'r swydd gan Lywodraeth y DU, sydd â model braidd yn wannach. Y model a ddisgrifiasom yw'r un a ddisgrifiodd y comisiynydd plant. Credaf fod consensws yma mai'r dull gweithredu priodol yw cael comisiynydd sydd â'r hawl i ymchwilio i bob maes, ac un person y gall pobl droi ato. Efallai nad felly y bydd pan wnaiff Llywodraeth y DU ei gwaith ar ran Lloegr.

Nodaf fod Ian Lucas wedi rhoi Mesur Aelod preifat gerbron y Senedd ar hyn, ond deallaf na chaiff unrhyw amser seneddol ac felly ei fod yn debygol o fethu. Gan hynny, gallai'r dadlau ar y materion hyn gael ei ohirio am gryn amser. Mae hynny'n dangos mor hir y cymer i gynnig da ddwyn ffrwyth, a pha mor bwysig y byddai i'r Cynulliad gael pwerau deddfu. I derfynu, yr wyf yn meddwl tybed a allai'r dadleuwr hwn dros bobl hŷn edrych hefyd ar wahaniaethu gan gyflogwyr yn erbyn y rhai sydd wedi mynd heibio i'r oed y byddai rhai'n disgwyl iddynt ymddeol.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon, a minnau wedi ymgyrchu y llynedd ar sail maniffesto a ailddatganodd ymrwymiad Llafur i fynd â'r maen i'r wal ar ran pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Yr oedd y bobl hŷn y siaredais â hwy yn ystod yr ymgyrch y llynedd yn ymddiddori yn addewid Llafur i sefydlu comisiynydd, ac yr oedd ganddynt feddwl mawr hefyd o'r ffaith bod Llafur yn

older people, working together for older people, which is believed to be the first manifesto of its kind.

That manifesto won the endorsement of the people of Wales last May and, since then, the Assembly Government has been pushing ahead, delivering on our commitment to older people. A Deputy Minister for Older People, John Griffiths, has been appointed, which demonstrates the Assembly Government's strong commitment to older people and its determination to implement the older people's strategy. Along the same lines, a new Assembly Cabinet sub-committee has been established to ensure a cross-cutting, coherent approach to this issue.

The Assembly Government's strategy for older people—the first of its kind in the UK—was launched in January last year. It provides a basis for the Assembly and other public bodies to develop future policies and plans that better reflect the needs of older people, and better recognise the changing demography of Wales. Over the next 20 years, it is anticipated that the balance of the population will change. The number of people over 60 in Wales is expected to increase by some 11 per cent, and the number of those aged over 85 is expected to increase by over a third. As a result, it is anticipated that there will be more demand on care and support services. I am convinced, therefore, that the Assembly Government is wholly justified in pursuing its strategy for older people, and especially in establishing a commissioner to champion their needs and rights.

I look forward to primary legislation being secured at Westminster to establish a commissioner who will be independent from Government and in the best possible situation to stand up for older people. Nevertheless, I hope that there will be a positive working relationship between the commissioner and politicians, and that politicians of all parties will support a commissioner who will work imaginatively and in an innovative way. I appreciate the need to avoid duplicating the work of other agencies, but I hope that the commissioner

ymgyrchu ar sail maniffesto penodol i weithio gyda'n gilydd dros bobl hŷn, a chredir mai hwn yw'r maniffesto cyntaf o'i fath.

Cafodd y maniffesto hwnnw ei gymeradwyo gan bobl Cymru fis Mai diwethaf ac, ers hynny, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bwrw ymlaen, gan gyflawni ein hymrwymiad i bobl hŷn. Penodwyd Dirprwy Weinidog dros Bobl Hŷn, John Griffiths, ac mae hynny'n amlygu ymrwymiad cryf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i bobl hŷn a'r ffaith ei bod yn benderfynol o roi ar waith y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Yn yr un modd, sefydlwyd is-bwyllgor newydd gan Gabinet y Cynulliad i sicrhau dull gweithredu trawsbynciol a chydlynol ar y mater hwn.

Lansiwyd strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer pobl hŷn—y gyntaf o'i bath yn y DU—ym mis Ionawr y llynedd. Ar sail honno y bydd y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yn datblygu polisiau a chynlluniau yn y dyfodol sy'n bodloni anghenion pobl hŷn yn well, ac yn cydnabod yn well y demograffi cyfnewidiol yng Nghymru. Dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf, rhagwelir y bydd cydbwysedd y boblogaeth yn newid. Disgwylir y bydd nifer y rhai dros 60 oed yng Nghymru'n cynyddu rhyw 11 y cant, ac y bydd nifer y rhai dros 85 oed yn cynyddu o fwy nag un rhan o dair. O ganlyniad i hynny, rhagwelir y bydd mwy o alw ar wasanaethau gofal a chymorth. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig, felly, ei bod yn gwbl deg i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddilyn ei strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, yn enwedig wrth sefydlu comisiynydd i ddadlau dros eu hawliau a'u hanghenion.

Edrychaf ymlaen at weld sicrhau deddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn San Steffan i sefydlu comisiynydd a fydd yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth ac a fydd yn y lle gorau i sefyll dros bobl hŷn. Er hynny, gobeithiaf y ceir perthynas weithio gadarnhaol rhwng y comisiynydd a gwleidyddion, ac y bydd gwleidyddion o bob plaid yn cefnogi comisiynydd a fydd yn gweithio mewn modd dyfeisgar ac arloesol. Sylwedolaf fod angen osgoi dyblygu gwaith asiantaethau eraill, ond gobeithiaf na chyfyngir ar y comisiynydd—drwy statud neu fel arall—wrth iddo ddadlau

will not be restricted—by statute or otherwise—in championing the rights and needs of older people across the board.

We have heard how the proportion of older people in our population will grow. I hope that the commissioner, in addition to representing the older people of today, will also be able to anticipate the needs of the older people of tomorrow, and think ahead to the older people of the future—and I declare an interest in that, hopefully—and work with the Government to ensure that our ageing society is fully equipped and prepared. This is an exciting opportunity for older people in Wales. I look forward to the commissioner making a difference to their everyday lives, as well as changing attitudes and perceptions to ensure that Wales has an inclusive and cohesive society, in which older people are independent, valued and fully engaged in their communities.

3.30 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae llawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn aelodau hŷn o'n cymdeithas. Mae'n bwysig nodi ein bod yn cyfeirio at unrhyw un dros 50 mlwydd oed wrth drafod penodi comisiynydd, ac, felly, mae'n rhaid imi ddatgan buddiant. Bydd y comisiynydd, os caiff ei benodi, yn gyfrifol amdanaf fi ac Aelodau eraill sy'n 50 mlwydd oed neu'n hŷn. Mae Plaid Cymru yn ymrwymedig i gefnogi unrhyw fenter fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau y mae pobl hŷn yn ein cymdeithas yn eu hwynebu heddiw. Rhaid inni ystyried pobl sydd o fewn oedran ymdeol neu'n hŷn. Mae'r rhagolygon yn dangos yn glir fod ein poblogaeth yn heneiddio, ac mae'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru yn heneiddio yn llawer cynt na phoblogaeth gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni gael strwythur sy'n galluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â'r math o broblemau y mae pobl yn eu hwynebu wrth iddynt fynd yn hŷn. Dangosodd ymchwil Age Concern Cymru yn glir fod cefnogaeth gref i'r math hwn o ymyrraeth gan gomisiynydd. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod naw o bob 10—92 y cant—o'r rhai a gymerodd ran mewn ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan ICM yng Nghymru yn credu y dylai'r comisiynydd gael pwerau llawn i ymwneud ag unrhyw fater sy'n

dros hawliau ac anghenion pobl hŷn ym mhob maes.

Clywsom y bydd y gyfran o bobl hŷn yn ein poblogaeth yn cynyddu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiynydd, yn ogystal â chynrychioli pobl hŷn heddiw, yn gallu rhagweld anghenion pobl hŷn yfory hefyd, ac ystyried pobl hŷn y dyfodol—a datganaf fuddiant yn hynny, gobeithio—ac y bydd yn gweithio gyda'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod ein cymdeithas hŷn yn gwbl barod a chymwys. Mae hyn yn gyfle cyffrous i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y comisiynydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i'w bywyd pob dydd, yn ogystal â newid agweddau a chanfyddiadau er mwyn sicrhau cymdeithas gynhwysol a chydlynol yng Nghymru, lle y mae pobl hŷn yn annibynnol, yn fawr eu parch ac yn ymwneud yn llawn â'u cymunedau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Many Assembly Members are older members of our society. It is important to note that we are referring to anyone over the age of 50 in discussing the appointment of a commissioner, and, therefore, I must declare an interest. The commissioner, if appointed, will be responsible for me and other Assembly Members who are 50 years old or older. Plaid Cymru is committed to supporting any venture that will tackle the problems that older people in our society face today. We must consider people who have reached retirement age or who are older. The forecasts show clearly that our population is ageing, and the population in Wales is ageing much more quickly than that of the rest of the United Kingdom. Therefore, we must have a structure that will enable the Assembly Government to tackle the kind of problems that people face as they become older. Research by Age Concern Wales has shown clearly that there is a great deal of support for this kind of intervention by a commissioner. It is important to note that nine out of every 10—92 per cent—of those who participated in research commissioned by ICM in Wales believe that the commissioner should be given full powers to tackle any issues that affect older people.

effeithio ar bobl hŷn. Yr oedd 76 y cant yn credu y dylai rôl y comisiynydd fod yn gwbl annibynnol ar y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Wedi imi wrando ar sylwadau'r bwrdd ymgynghorol a'r hyn a ddywedodd nifer o fudiadau ac asiantaethau sy'n cynrychioli pobl hŷn, cododd llawer o gwestiynau yn fy meddwl. Rhannaf y pryderon a fynegwyd gan Aelodau'r Blaid Geidwadol a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ac a nodir yn eu gwelliannau. Mae'n bwysig gofyn y cwestiynau hyn: dyna holl bwynt proses ymgynghorol. Yn rhy aml o lawer, cyflwyno gwybodaeth i bobl a wneir fel rhan o'n prosesau ymgynghorol. Dylai'r cwestiynau hyn gael eu gofyn o fewn y broses. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau am iddynt godi cwestiynau pwysig.

Mae'n bwysig gofyn a fydd y comisiynydd yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r materion y dylai ymdrin â hwy. Dyna'r cwestiwn sylfaenol. A fydd yn gallu ymdrin â thlodi ymysg pensïonwyr, a ddaw i sylw Aelodau Cynulliad drwy'r amser? A fydd yn gallu ymdrin â'r sefyllfa o ran cartrefi gofal Cymru a'r diffyg gwelyau? Collwyd 784 o welyau y flwyddyn diwethaf yn unig. A fydd yn gallu ymdrin â'r angen am ofal cartref a'r ffaith bod cyfartaledd yr arian gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gaiff ei wario ar ofal o'r fath wedi gostwng yn hytrach na chynyddu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, er bod pwyslais ar hynny? Fel y gŵyr y Dirprwy Weinidog, mae adroddiad Wanless yn cyfeirio'n benodol at hynny. A fydd y comisiynydd yn gallu ymdrin â'r broblem o ran y dreth gyngor? Gŵyr llawer ohonom fod llawer o bobl hŷn yn byw mewn cartrefi cymharol fawr ond nad oes ganddynt lawer o arian i'w wario. Mae hynny'n eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa anodd. Mae problemau hefyd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac mae angen sylfaenol am ofal personol sy'n rhad ac am ddim. A allwn fod yn sicr y bydd y comisiynydd yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny heb ddatblygu'r sefyllfa bresennol a heb y trafferthion a welwyd o ran comisiynydd plant? Gwn fod cwestiynau ynghylch gallu'r comisiynydd plant i ymwneud â materion sydd heb eu datganoli.

Seventy six per cent believed that the commissioner's role should be completely independent of the Assembly and the Assembly Government.

Having listened to the comments of the advisory board and of many organisations and agencies representing older people, many questions arose in my mind. I share the concerns expressed by Conservative Party Members and the Liberal Democrats, which are noted in their amendments. It is important that these questions are asked: that is the whole point of a consultation process. All too often, our consultation processes present information to people. These questions should be raised within the process. We will support the amendments because they raise important questions.

It is important to ask whether the commissioner will be able to tackle the issues that he or she should address. That is the fundamental question. Will he or she be able to tackle poverty among pensioners, which is constantly brought to the attention of Assembly Members? Will he or she be able to tackle the situation of care homes in Wales and the lack of beds? Last year alone, 784 beds were lost. Will he or she be able to address the need for domiciliary care and the fact that the proportion of social services funding spent on such care has fallen rather than increased over the past few years, even though emphasis has been placed on it? As the Deputy Minister will know, the Wanless report specifically refers to that. Will the commissioner be able to address the problems in relation to council tax? Many of us know that older people live in comparatively large homes but do not have much disposable income. That places them in a difficult position. There are also problems within the health service, and there is a fundamental need for personal care to be free of charge. Can we be sure that the commissioner will be able to tackle those problems without developing the current situation and without the difficulties experienced in terms of the children's commissioner? We know that there are questions about the ability of the children's commissioner to deal with non-devolved issues.

Os cawn sicrwydd, yn ystod y broses ymgynghorol, ynglŷn â'r materion hyn, byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn yn frwd. Nid ydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau gan y credwn fod yn rhaid inni weld canlyniadau'r broses ymgynghorol cyn y gallwn lunio barn derfynol.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the proposal to establish a commissioner for older people. This is a mark of a civilised society in the way it deals with its older citizens, and having a commissioner will turn the spotlight on the many issues affecting older people.

I hope that the commissioner will lend his or her weight to the principle of valuing the skills required to care for our most vulnerable people. It bothers me greatly that the care that older people receive is usually provided by the lowest paid workers, the majority of whom are women. I agree with Polly Toynbee, who asked recently why it is that the value of company directors' work and their related high wages are seen as much more of a high priority than care assistants with their low pay. It is socially unjust to put care workers at the bottom of every heap while the acquisition of computer skills is deemed to be more important in the skills hierarchy. Yet, it is these people who have the quality of life and dignity of many of our vulnerable older people in their hands, and we should value and recognise their work.

A principle that has underpinned the demand for a commissioner is for this person to be a champion for the active participation of older people in Wales, which includes lifelong learning. I have been impressed by the work of the University of the Third Age, but I would like for more of our older people to have the opportunity to partake in informal or formal education. People face more difficulties as they get older but, if we are to encourage everyone to lead a more active and rewarding life, opportunities should be available to everyone, regardless of age. It is interesting to note that pensioners make up a substantial group of people who now use computers, and training providers must be alert to this fact.

If, during the consultation process, we are given an assurance on these issues, we will give our firm support to this proposal. We have not tabled amendments to the motion because we believe that we must wait to see the outcome of the consultation process before we can form a final opinion.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf y bwriad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae hyn yn arwydd o gymdeithas wâr o ran y modd y mae'n ymwneud â'i dinasyddion hŷn ac, o gael comisiynydd, tynnir sylw at y nifer fawr o faterion sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiynydd yn rhoi pwys ar yr egwyddor o drysori'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen i ofalu am y rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed. Gofid mawr i mi yw bod y gofal a gaiff pobl hŷn yn cael ei roi fel arfer gan y gweithwyr sy'n derbyn y tâl isaf, y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn fenywod. Cytunaf â Polly Toynbee, a ofynnodd yn ddiweddar pam y rhoddir mwy o werth o lawer ar waith cyfarwyddwyr cwmnïau gyda'u cyflogau uchel nag ar waith cynorthwyr gofal sy'n derbyn tâl isel. Cymdeithasol anghyfiawn yw rhoi gweithwyr gofal ar y gwaelod bob tro a barnu bod magu sgiliau cyfrifiadur yn bwysicach yn yr hierarchaeth sgiliau. Eto i gyd, y bobl hyn sy'n gofalu am ansawdd bywyd ac urddas llawer o bobl hŷn sy'n fregus, a dylem drysori a chydabod eu gwaith.

Un egwyddor a fu wrth wraidd y galw am gomisiynydd yw'r angen i'r person hwn ddadlau o blaid cael cyfranogi gweithgar gan bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys dysgu gydol oes. Mae gwaith Prifysgol y Trydydd Oedran wedi creu argraff arnaf, ond carwn weld mwy o'n pobl hŷn yn cael cyfle i gymryd rhan mewn addysg anffurfiol neu ffurfiol. Mae pobl yn wynebu mwy o anawsterau wrth heneiddio ond, os ydym i annog pawb i fyw bywyd mwy gweithgar a buddiol, dylai cyfleoedd fod ar gael i bawb, beth bynnag fo'u hoed. Diddorol yw nodi bod nifer sylweddol o bensynwyr yn defnyddio cyfrifiaduron bellach, a rhaid i ddarparwyr hyfforddiant fod yn effro i hynny.



**Janet Ryder:** I agree with you that we should make every opportunity available to people of all ages to access education. Do you agree that it is time that your Government looked at its funding of the further and higher education sectors, to enable institutions to keep courses running instead of having to cut community provision as a result of restricted funding?

**Christine Chapman:** I am concerned about that. However, I have spoken to many organisations in my community and I know that they are keen to ensure that people can attend courses close to home. This is happening, and people are attending courses without having to travel to a specific centre. We need to be careful in our approach to this issue.

The Welsh Assembly Government must consider interventions that will impact on the long-term quality of life of older people. It is interesting that a study of dementia found that the condition is more common in people from lower social classes and those with lower educational achievement. Investing in lifelong activities for the older generation may be a preventative measure. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government gives serious consideration to this point.

Finally, on the target group, I would be comfortable with the target age of 50, as long as more vulnerable people in the older age group are not marginalised, and I seek a reassurance in this regard.

**David Melding:** I am happy to wish the consultation exercise well. My party will vote in favour of today's motion, even if amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan is defeated. However, I have reservations about how the commissioner will sit with the new equality body. These issues cannot be avoided. I criticise the consultation document for an obscure question that attempts to look at the role of other bodies. The document makes no reference to the new equality body, but it mentions existing organisations. It would have been better to focus on this issue. Is it our expectation that the new equality body

**Janet Ryder:** Cytunaf â chi y dylem gynnig pob cyfle i bobl o bob oed gael addysg. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bryd i'ch Llywodraeth ystyried y cyllid y mae'n ei roi i'r sectorau addysg uwch a phellach, fel y gall sefydliadau barhau â chyrsgiau yn hytrach na gorfod cwtogi ar ddarpariaeth yn y gymuned o ganlyniad i'r cyfyngiadau ar gyllid?

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi siarad â sawl sefydliad yn fy nghymuned a gwn eu bod yn awyddus i sicrhau y gall pobl ddilyn cyrsiau yn agos i'w cartrefi. Mae hynny'n digwydd, ac mae pobl yn dilyn cyrsiau heb orfod teithio i ganolfan benodol. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn ofalus.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried ymyriadau a fydd yn effeithio ar ansawdd bywyd pobl hŷn yn y tymor hir. Diddorol yw nodi bod un astudiaeth o orffwylledd wedi canfod bod y cyflwr hwn yn fwy cyffredin ymysg rhai mewn dosbarthiadau cymdeithasol is a'r rhai sydd â chyflawniadau addysgol is. Mae'n bosibl y byddai buddsoddi mewn gweithgareddau gydol oes i'r genhedlaeth hŷn yn fesur ataliol. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ystyried y pwynt hwn yn ofalus.

Yn olaf, ynghylch y grŵp targed, byddwn yn fodlon ar oed targed o 50, ar yr amod na fydd mwy o bobl fregus yn y grŵp oedran hŷn yn cael eu gwthio i'r cyrion, a cheisiaf sicrwydd yn hynny o beth.

**David Melding:** Mae'n dda gennyf ddymuno'n dda i'r ymgynghoriad. Bydd fy mhlaid yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig heddiw, hyd yn oed os trechir gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Er hynny, mae gennyf rai amheuan ynghylch perthynas y comisiynydd â'r corff cydraddoldeb newydd. Ni ellir osgoi'r materion hyn. Beirniadaf y ddogfen ymgynghori am ofyn cwestiwn tywyll sy'n ceisio ymdrin â rôl cyrff eraill. Nid yw'r ddogfen yn cyfeirio at y corff cydraddoldeb newydd, ond mae'n sôn am gyrrff sy'n bod eisoes. Buasai'n well canolbwyntio ar y mater hwn. A ydym yn disgwyl mai cylch gwaith cyfyng a fydd i'r

will have a narrow remit? The fact that it will have the appendage 'human rights' indicates that it will be wide-ranging. I do not think that it will narrow its focus on, for instance, age-related employment issues.

3.40 p.m.

There is an issue about the new equality body taking 'age' as its definition rather than 'older people'. I accept that that gives it a wider remit, which could encompass the rights and equality issues relating to children. However, the majority of these issues will tend to consider access to public services and the employment rights of older people. I also warn those who have just said that they would set low limits on the definition of an older person at 50, that that immediately relates back to the general title of age rather than older person. If we were narrower and set that definition at retirement age, then at least there would be a greater difference between what the new equality body will do compared with the commissioner for older people.

The strongest argument in favour of this initiative is that the person would somehow be a champion and be more independent or whatever, than the specific Minister in the Welsh Assembly Government and the various committees that serve that Minister. That is a perfectly valid argument. However, philosophically, we must consider why we think children need a champion. Children are people or citizens, who do not yet have full possession of their civic rights, which are in abeyance until they reach an age of maturity as set down by law. Therefore, that puts children in an exceptional category. Older people do have full civic rights and there is a danger that there may be an element of patronising if we say that older people cannot speak for themselves, and that they need this new conduit and champion. We are treading on somewhat delicate territory here, which I hope will be resolved in the consultation. I do not consider any of these reservations to be insuperable. They certainly should not stop the ongoing work and I congratulate those who undertook the work to produce

corff cydraddoldeb newydd? Mae'r ffaith y bydd 'hawliau dynol' yn rhan o'i deitl yn dangos y bydd ganddo gylch gwaith eang. Ni chredaf y bydd yn cyfyngu ei sylw i faterion cyflogaeth sy'n ymwneud ag oedran, er enghraifft.

Mae mater yn codi ynghylch y ffaith y bydd y corff cydraddoldeb newydd yn cymryd 'oedran' yn ddiffiniad yn hytrach na 'phobl hŷn'. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod hynny'n rhoi cylch gwaith ehangach iddo, a allai gynnwys hawliau a materion sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb mewn cysylltiad â phlant. Er hynny, bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r materion hyn yn ymwneud â'r gallu i gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a hawliau cyflogaeth pobl hŷn. Yr wyf hefyd yn rhybuddio'r rhai sydd newydd ddweud y byddent yn gosod y terfyn isaf ar y diffiniad o rywun hŷn ar 50 oed fod hynny'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol ag oedran fel teitl cyffredinol yn hytrach na phobl hŷn. Pe byddem yn fwy penodol ac yn pennu diffiniad sy'n gysylltiedig ag oedran ymddeol, o leiaf y byddai mwy o wahaniaeth rhwng gwaith y corff cydraddoldeb newydd a gwaith y comisiynydd dros bobl hŷn.

Y ddadl gryfaf o blaid y fenter hon yw y byddai'r sawl sydd dan sylw'n gefnogwr mewn rhyw fodd ac yn fwy annibynnol, neu beth bynnag, na'r Gweinidog penodol yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r gwahanol Bwyllgorau sy'n gwasanaethu'r Gweinidog hwnnw. Mae honno'n ddadl gwbl ddilys. Er hynny, o safbwynt athronyddol, rhaid inni ystyried pam y credwn fod ar blant angen rhywun i ddadlau drostynt. Pobl neu ddinasyddion yw plant sydd heb ddod i feddu'n llawn eto ar eu hawliau dinesig, sy'n ddirym hyd nes y byddant yn cyrraedd oed aeddfedrwydd fel y'i nodir yn y gyfraith. Gan hynny, mae plant mewn categori eithriadol. Mae pobl hŷn yn meddu ar eu holl hawliau dinesig, ac mae perygl y ceir rhywfaint o nawddogi os dywedwn na all pobl hŷn siarad drostynt eu hunain, a bod arnynt angen y cyfrwng a'r cefnogwr newydd hwn. Yr ydym yn mentro ar dir anodd braidd yn hyn o beth, a gobeithiaf y caiff hynny ei ddatrys drwy'r ymgynghoriad. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw un o'r amheuron hyn yn rhai amhosibl eu hateb. Yn sicr, ni

this report and I hope that the consultation exercise will be a success.

Finally, when the Deputy Minister launched this consultation exercise at lunchtime, he said that Wales would be the first country in Europe, and possibly the world, to have an older person's commissioner, which means that either this is a fantastic idea or we are barking up the wrong tree.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome this proposal for an older person's commissioner. One of my earliest jobs was as parliamentary officer for the charity, Age Concern. I was seconded three days a week to work in Parliament for the all-party group for pensioners. Therefore, I have been engaged in these issues for around 20 years or so. I was working on them in the 1980s—the era when Conservative Secretaries of State would announce draconian cuts in benefits to the Sunday newspapers so that they could stimulate rebellions in their own ranks and announce slightly less draconian cuts in benefits just a few months later. I am glad that we have moved on since then.

The briefing that Age Concern circulated for this debate deals with the issue raised by Jonathan Morgan and others about any potential overlap between the role of commissioner on equality and human rights and that of a commissioner for older people. It is worth drawing attention to the fact that, in its briefing, Age Concern states that the proposed commissioner on equality and human rights would not cover the same territory as the commissioner for older people. It gives us an example in the fact that the 2006 EU directive on equal treatment in employment would only cover discrimination on the grounds of age in employment. Therefore, much thought has already gone into these issues.

I support this move particularly as one aspect of demonstrating that we in Wales value the contribution that older people continue to make to our society. It is time that we started to think about the process of ageing as an

ddyfent fod yn rhwystr i'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen a llongyfarchaf y rhai a gynhyrchodd yr adroddiad hwn a gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn llwyddiant.

Yn olaf, pan lansiodd y Dirprwy Weinidog yr ymgynghoriad hwn amser cinio, dywedodd mai Cymru fyddai'r wlad gyntaf yn Ewrop, ac yn y byd o bosibl, a chanddi gomisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ac mae hynny un ai'n golygu bod hyn yn syniad gwych neu ein bod yn mynd ar y trywydd anghywir.

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf y bwriad i gael comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Un o'm swyddi cyntaf oedd un fel swyddog seneddol dros yr elusen, Age Concern. Cawn fy secondio dri diwrnod yr wythnos i weithio yn y Senedd ar ran y grŵp trawsbleidiol i bensiynwyr. Felly, bŷm yn ymwneud â'r materion hyn ers tua 20 mlynedd. Bŷm yn gweithio arnynt yn y 1980au—y cyfnod y byddai Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol yn cyhoeddi toriadau diarbed ar fudd-daliadau i'r papurau newydd ar ddydd Sul fel y gallent ysgogi gwrthryfel yn eu rhengoedd eu hunain a chyhoeddi toriadau ychydig yn llai llym ar fudd-daliadau ymhen ychydig fisodd. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi symud ymlaen ers hynny.

Mae'r wybodaeth a ddsbarthwyd gan Age Concern ar gyfer y ddatl hon yn ymdrin â'r mater a gododd Jonathan Morgan ac eraill ynghylch y posibilrwydd o orgyffwrdd rhwng rôl y comisiynydd cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol ac un y comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae'n werth tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod Age Concern, yn ei wybodaeth, yn nodi na fyddai'r comisiynydd arfaethedig ar gyfer cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol yn ymdrin â'r un maes â'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae'n cynnig enghraifft i ni yn y ffaith na fyddai cyfarwyddeb 2006 yr UE ar driniaeth gyfartal mewn cyflogaeth ond yn ymdrin â gwahaniaethu ar sail oedran mewn cyflogaeth. Felly, mae'r materion hyn wedi'u hystyried yn helaeth eisoes.

Yr wyf o blaid cymryd y cam hwn a hynny, yn benodol, am ei fod yn un modd i ddangos ein bod ni yng Nghymru'n trysori'r cyfraniad y mae pobl hŷn yn dal i'w roi i'n cymdeithas. Mae'n bryd inni ddechrau

opportunity for people to give back to their communities and about providing older people with the opportunities to do so. We have already seen examples of that in many ways—people are drawing on the resource that older people have in terms of the local history of their communities and in terms of making contributions to local schools.

I was pleased to be able to sponsor an exhibition in the Assembly a few weeks ago undertaken by Rhondda Cynon Taf Community Arts, which has involved older people in weaving projects throughout Rhondda Cynon Taf, making artwork that represents the history of their communities. That is a good example of positive engagement with older people and of giving them opportunities. We have also been successful in the Assembly, and it has been widely welcomed throughout Wales, in giving greater support, through a range of benefits, to older people—the most successful of which is the bus pass. That has been widely welcomed by many pensioners in my constituency, who say that it has given them greater mobility and has enhanced the quality of their lives. Today we are building on the work that the Assembly has already undertaken.

The politics of ageing is interesting. Whenever a society moves towards full employment, there are calls for raising the retirement age. We have seen that in the last few years, and much work has been done on it. Much work has also recently been undertaken to consider what might be the impact of one of the most powerful generations in our society—the baby boom generation—and how its approach to ageing may change the way in which images of older people are seen and represented, particularly in the media. The sixties generation will be approaching retirement in the next 10 to 15 years, and its view of ageing may be different from that of earlier generations, as has been suggested. The media, having been obsessed in the past with fashionable images of youth, seem increasingly, particularly within a number of our larger media organisations, to be considering the programming needs of older people. That is also to be welcomed.

ystyried bod proses heneiddio'n gyfle i bobl roi'n ôl i'w cymunedau a chynnig cyfleoedd i bobl hŷn gael gwneud hynny. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld sawl enghraifft o hynny—mae pobl yn defnyddio'r adnodd sydd gan bobl hŷn yng nghyd-destun hanes lleol eu cymunedau a chyfrannu i ysgolion lleol.

Bûm yn falch o allu noddi arddangosfa yn y Cynulliad rai wythnosau'n ôl a gyflwynwyd gan Gelfyddydau Cymunedol Rhondda Cynon Taf, sydd wedi cynnwys pobl hŷn mewn prosiectau gwehyddu ledled Rhondda Cynon Taf, i wneud gwaith celf sy'n portreadu hanes eu cymunedau. Dyna enghraifft dda o ymwneud yn gadarnhaol â phobl hŷn a rhoi cyfleoedd iddynt. Buom yn llwyddiannus hefyd yn y Cynulliad, a chroesawyd hyn yn gyffredinol ledled Cymru, o ran rhoi mwy o gymorth, drwy gynnig amryw o fuddion, i bobl hŷn—a'r mwyaf llwyddiannus yn eu plith yw'r tocyn bws. Mae llawer o bensiynwyr yn fy etholaeth wedi rhoi croeso cyffredinol i hynny, a dywedant ei fod wedi'u galluogi i symud o gwmpas yn fwy ac wedi gwella ansawdd eu bywyd. Heddiw yr ydym yn adeiladu ar sail y gwaith a wnaeth y Cynulliad eisoes.

Mae gwleidyddiaeth heneiddio'n ddiddorol. Pryd bynnag y mae cymdeithas yn dynesu at gyflogaeth lawn, ceir galwadau am godi'r oedran ymdeol. Gwelsom hynny yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a gwnaed llawer o waith ar hynny. Gwnaed llawer o waith hefyd yn ddiweddar i ystyried effaith bosibl un o'r cenedlaethau mwyaf grymus yn ein cymdeithas—y genhedlaeth a aned wedi'r ail ryfel byd—a sut y gallai ei hagwedd at heneiddio beri newid yn y modd y gwelir ac y portreadir pobl hŷn, yn enwedig yn y cyfryngau. Bydd cenedlaeth y chwe degau'n agosáu at oed ymdeol yn y 10 i 15 mlynedd nesaf, a gallai ei barn am heneiddio fod yn wahanol i un y cenedlaethau cynharach, fel yr awgrymwyd. Mae'n ymddangos fwyfwy fod y cyfryngau, a hwythau wedi bod ag obsesiwn yn y gorffennol â delweddau ffasiynol o ieuencid, yn ystyried anghenion pobl hŷn o ran rhaglenni, yn enwedig yn rhai o'r cyrff mwy yn y cyfryngau. Mae hynny i'w groesawu hefyd.

I support this development, and I am delighted that it has arisen from widespread consultation and consideration, involving many pensioners throughout Wales. I hope that the forthcoming consultation will demonstrate the support for this development throughout Wales.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I also welcome this report. Many of us in the Chamber, as has been alluded to, probably fall into the general category of being older people, particularly in the eyes of younger people. We know that there has been a substantial growth in the percentage of older people in Wales. During the debate on the Assembly Government's strategy for older people on 11 December 2002, I questioned Jane Hutt on the possibility of establishing a commissioner for older people. She replied that the administration had not ruled it out and that it must consider the outcome of the UK Government's consideration. I welcome this move towards establishing a commissioner, as long as the position is given real teeth, status and independence. As the Westminster Labour Government gives Wales an average of one Bill per year, I wonder what the chances of that will be.

There is a clear need for a champion of older people in Wales to safeguard and promote their best interests. The commissioner should be enabled to assist older people to enforce their rights and to empower them to reach their full potential as active citizens with still much to contribute to this rather fragmented society. My mother is a case in point. I mention her often, but I am sure that she does not mind. She is 87 and is still a deacon in her chapel. She needs help now, but she helped to care for my father until he died at home two years ago at the age of 93. According to the Help the Aged, on 1 October 2003,

'A commissioner for older people, whose main function is that of promoting and safeguarding human rights, could help to ensure that discriminatory treatment of older people stops and that their rights are protected and upheld.'

Cefnogaf y datblygiad hwn, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd ei fod yn deillio o ymgynghori ac ystyriaeth eang, a oedd yn cynnwys llawer o bensynwyr ledled Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymgynghori sydd i ddod yn dangos y gefnogaeth sydd i'r datblygiad hwn ledled Cymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n debyg bod llawer ohonom sydd yn y Siambr, fel y crybwyllwyd, yn rhai y gellid eu hystyried yn bobl hŷn, yn enwedig yng ngolwg pobl iau. Gwyddom fod canran y bobl hŷn yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Yn ystod y ddadl ar strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer pobl hŷn ar 11 Rhagfyr 2002, holais Jane Hutt ynghylch y posibilrwydd o sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Atebodd nad oedd y weinyddiaeth wedi diystyru hynny a bod yn rhaid iddi ystyried canlyniad trafodion Llywodraeth y DU. Croesawaf y cam hwn tuag at sefydlu comisiynydd, ar yr amod y rhoddir gwir rym, annibyniaeth a statws i'r swydd. Gan mai un Mesur y flwyddyn y mae Llywodraeth Lafur San Steffan yn ei roi i Gymru ar gyfartaledd, tybed pa mor debygol y bydd hynny?

Mae'n amlwg bod angen rhywun i ddadlau dros bobl hŷn yng Nghymru er mwyn diogelu a hyrwyddo eu buddiannau gorau. Dylid galluogi'r comisiynydd i helpu pobl hŷn i fynnu eu hawliau a'u galluogi i gyflawni eu potensial fel dinasyddion gweithgar a chanddynt lawer i'w gyfrannu o hyd i'r gymdeithas eithaf rhanedig sydd gennym. Mae fy mam yn enghraifft dda o hynny. Yr wyf yn sôn amdani'n aml, ond yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw'n hidio am hynny. Mae'n 87 oed ac mae'n dal i fod yn flaenor yn ei chapel. Mae arni angen cymorth yn awr, ond helpodd i ofalu am fy nhad hyd nes y bu farw ddwy flynedd yn ôl yn 93 oed. Yn ôl Help the Aged, ar 1 Hydref 2003.

Byddai comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ac iddo'r brif swyddogaeth o hyrwyddo a diogelu hawliau dynol, yn gallu helpu i sicrhau y bydd triniaeth wahaniaethol yn erbyn pobl hŷn yn dod i ben ac y bydd eu hawliau'n cael eu diogelu a'u cynnal.

Many older people suffer as a result of poverty and of trying to make ends meet on a meagre pension, while council tax and other utilities soar to levels that are out of their reach. Many older people suffer as a result of living in poor housing conditions, while others experience a lack of social and personal care, which the Liberal Democrats believe should be free. Older people can be one of the more vulnerable groups in our society, and we should do all that we can to ensure that they enjoy a good quality of life. They are, after all, our grandfathers, grandmothers, mothers, fathers, and will soon be us.

**Val Lloyd:** Today's discussion is the first step towards securing a strong and representative voice for the elderly of our society. The invaluable role and contribution that older people make to our society should, and is, being recognised in this inclusive policy, and a specific evidence-based policy is being created and will be championed by the proposed commissioner.

3.50 p.m.

Research among older people, undertaken by the City and County of Swansea Council in the last three months, has identified five strong themes that are of concern to the older people who were surveyed. They were safety and security within the community, getting around, being informed, living at home, and participation. It could well have been assumed that those were their concerns, but it is important to have relevant evidence from the people about whom we are talking. Our strategy should include all those areas and should have firm roots in the views and needs of those that it will affect. However, wider consultation is still to take place, with individuals, pensioners' groups and the national pensioners' forum. We have already heard, several times, about the demographic trends in relation to older people, so it is vital that there are safeguards for that potentially vulnerable section of society and proactive planning for the ageing population.

I recently read on a website for pensioners that members describe their generation as

Mae llawer o bobl hŷn yn dioddef oherwydd tlodi a cheisio cael deupen llinyn ynghyd ar bensiwn pitw, tra bo'r dreth gyngor a chostau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill yn codi i lefelau na allant eu fforddio. Mae llawer o bobl hŷn yn dioddef am eu bod yn byw mewn tai gwael, tra bo eraill yn profi diffyg gofal cymdeithasol a phersonol, y cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y dylent fod ar gael am ddim. Gall pobl hŷn fod ymysg y grwpiau sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas, a dylem wneud popeth a allwn i sicrhau eu bod yn mwynhau ansawdd bywyd da. Wedi'r cwbl, hwy yw ein teidiau, ein neiniau, ein mamau a'n tadau, a ni ein hunain cyn hir.

**Val Lloyd:** Y drafodaeth heddiw yw'r cam cyntaf tuag at sicrhau llais cryf a chynrychioladol dros yr henoed yn ein cymdeithas. Mae rôl a chyfraniad amhrisiadwy pobl hŷn i'n cymdeithas yn cael eu cydnabod, fel y dylid, yn y polisi cynhwysol hwn, ac mae polisi penodol ar sail tystiolaeth yn cael yn greu a chaiff ei hyrwyddo gan y comisiynydd arfaethedig.

Mae ymchwil ymysg pobl hŷn, a wnaed gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn y tri mis diwethaf, wedi canfod pum thema bendant sy'n peri pryder i'r bobl hŷn a holwyd. Y rhain oedd diogelwch a diogeledd yn y gymuned, mynd o le i le, cael gwybodaeth, byw gartref, a chymryd rhan. Galleid cymryd mai am hynny y byddent yn pryderu, ond mae'n bwysig cael tystiolaeth berthnasol gan y rhai yr ydym yn sôn amdanynt. Dylai ein strategaeth gynnwys yr holl feysydd hynny a dylai ddeillio o farn ac anghenion y rhai y bydd yn effeithio arnynt. Fodd bynnag, mae ymgynghori ehangach i'w gynnal eto, gydag unigolion, grwpiau pensiynwyr a'r fforwm pensiynwyr cenedlaethol. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed, sawl gwaith, am y tueddiadau demograffig mewn cysylltiad â phobl hŷn, felly mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau amddiffyniadau ar gyfer y rhan honno o gymdeithas a allai fod yn agored i niwed a bod cynllunio rhagweithiol ar gyfer y boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio.

Darllenais yn ddiweddar ar wefan ar gyfer pensiynwyr fod ei haelodau'n disgrifio eu

'the generation treated as second-class citizens', 'the generation discriminated against', 'the generation disregarded' and 'the generation regarded as an economic liability'. Clearly, ageism, and ageist assumptions, still run throughout society. These poignant and moving comments are clear examples of the need for a commissioner and a strategy such as that under discussion. This pioneering older persons' strategy is important if the aim of improving the lives of older people is to be achieved—it gives a means of engaging with policy makers, and a direct route of communication with Government. The new National Partnership Forum for Older People in Wales, as has already been mentioned, is welcome, and is an excellent mechanism by which expert and informed advice can be provided.

First and foremost, older people, like all of us in society, are individuals. No one-size-fits-all approach will ever work. We must rectify problems within the systems, cultures, attitudes and services that diminish them. The aim must be to create policy that reflects facts, not outdated stereotypes of what old age means. Again, like many people, I must declare an interest because I am over 50 years old. I share the concerns aired by two or three Members about the lower age limit. More thought should be given to that. The strategy, led by the commissioner, will work to create a broad vision for the future, where older people have the power and the will to make choices about their lives, choices that suit and are specific to them.

**Mark Isherwood:** We share the welcome given by Age Concern Cymru to the commitment to establish a commissioner for older people in Wales, provided, as Rhodri Glyn said, that the matters identified in opinion polls by Age Concern are addressed. Nine out of 10 people said that the commissioner should have full powers of investigation and three quarters stated that the role must be independent of the Assembly Government. To reinforce this idea, I refer to our debate on the Children Bill last week. I stated that I shared the

cenhedlaeth hwy fel 'y genhedlaeth sy'n cael ei thrin fel dinasyddion eilradd', 'y genhedlaeth y gwahaniaethir yn ei herbyn', 'y genhedlaeth a gaiff ei hanwybyddu' a'r 'genhedlaeth a ystyrir yn faich economaidd'. Mae'n amlwg bod oedraniaeth, a rhagdybiaethau oedraniaethol, yn dal i redeg drwy gymdeithas. Mae'r sylwadau ingol a theimladwy hyn yn dangos yn glir yr angen am gomisiynydd ac am strategaeth fel yr un a drafodir. Mae'r strategaeth arloesol hon ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn bwysig os yw'r nod o wella bywydau pobl hŷn i'w chyflawni—mae'n cynnig modd i gysylltu â llunwyr polisi a llwybr cyfathrebu uniongyrchol â Llywodraeth. Mae'r Fforwm Partneriaeth Cenedlaethol newydd ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn yng Nghymru i'w groesawu, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, ac mae'n ddull rhagorol o gynnig cyngor arbenigol a gwybodus.

Yn fwy na dim, mae pobl hŷn, fel pawb mewn cymdeithas, yn unigolion. Ni ellir cael un dull gweithredu a fydd yn addas i bawb. Rhaid inni ddatrys problemau yn y systemau, y dulliau gweithredu, yr ymagweddau a'r gwasanaethau sy'n eu bychanu. Rhaid anelu at greu polisi sy'n adlewyrchu ffeithiau, nid stereoteipiau hen ffasiwn o'r hyn y mae henaint yn ei olygu. Unwaith eto, fel llawer un arall, rhaid imi ddatgan buddiant gan fy mod dros 50 mlwydd oed. Rhannaf y pryderon a wyntyllwyd gan ddau neu dri Aelod am y terfyn oedran is. Dylid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i hynny. Bydd y strategaeth, o dan arweiniad y comisiynydd, yn ceisio creu gweledigaeth gynhwysfawr ar gyfer y dyfodol, lle y mae pobl hŷn yn meddu ar y grym a'r ewyllys i gymryd dewisiadau ynghylch eu bywyd, dewisiadau penodol sy'n addas ar eu cyfer hwy.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ymunwn â'r croeso a roddodd Age Concern Cymru i'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, ar yr amod, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn, y bydd y materion a ganfuwyd mewn arolygon barn gan Age Concern yn cael sylw. Dywedodd naw o bob 10 y dylai'r comisiynydd feddu ar bwerau ymchwilio llawn a dywedodd tri chwarter ohonynt fod rhaid i'r rôl fod yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Er mwyn ategu'r syniad hwn, cyfeiriai at ein dadl ar y Mesur Plant yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedais fy mod

Welsh children's commissioner's concern that it appears that the Children Bill from the UK will prevent the UK commissioner from launching investigations without the approval of Ministers. This would undermine the independence that should be a key feature of such posts. I contrasted this with the praiseworthy independence and impartiality exhibited by Peter Clarke, the Children's Commissioner for Wales. Clearly, the commissioner for older people in Wales must follow the model established for the children's commissioner, rather than the bodged Hodge model in Westminster.

We agree with Help the Aged that

'discrimination on the basis of age denies the rightful treatment of older people in our society. Help the Aged envisages the commissioner for older people playing a vital role in relation to discriminatory policies, services and behaviours.'

He or she must, therefore, be wholly independent and impartial, with wide-ranging powers of investigation into all areas that affect older people. This remit must, therefore, extend over pensions, where

'Age Concern would like to see a substantial increase to the basic state pension bringing pensioners out of means tested benefits'.

The reality is that 2 million pensioners in Britain today who are entitled to pensions credit are not claiming it. Of those 2 million, 65 per cent are in the bottom 20 per cent for income distribution, which shows that means testing hits the poorest hardest.

The commissioner's remit must extend to the care homes sector. The care forum briefing paper from last month states clearly that, in Wales,

'the Care Sector is in critical condition....Care homes continue to close and beds providing nursing care continue to be deregistered from nursing to residential.'

yn rhannu pryder Comisiynydd Plant Cymru y bydd Mesur Plant y DU yn gwahardd comisiynydd y DU, i bob golwg, rhag dechrau ymchwiliadau heb gael cymeradwyaeth gan Weinidogion. Byddai hyn yn tanseilio'r annibyniaeth a ddylai fod yn agwedd allweddol ar swyddi o'r fath. Gwneuthum wrthyferbynnu hynny â'r annibyniaeth a didueddrwydd clodwiw a amlygwyd gan Peter Clarke, Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae'n amlwg y dylai'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru ddilyn y patrwm a bennwyd ar gyfer y comisiynydd plant, yn hytrach na phatrwm blêr Hodge yn San Steffan.

Cytunwn â Help the Aged pan ddywed fod

gwahaniaethu ar sail oed yn nacáu triniaeth deg i bobl hŷn yn ein cymdeithas. Mae Help the Aged yn rhagweld y bydd y comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn chwarae rhan hollbwysig mewn cysylltiad â pholisïau, gwasanaethau ac ymddygiad sy'n gwahaniaethu.

Gan hynny, rhaid iddo fod yn gwbl annibynnol a diduedd, a rhaid iddo feddu ar bwerau pellgyrhaeddol i ymchwilio i bob maes sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn. Felly, rhaid i'r cylch gwaith hwn gynnwys pensiynau, lle y

carai Age Concern weld cynnydd sylweddol yn y pensiwn gwladol sylfaenol fel y bydd pensiynwyr yn cael eu codi oddi wrth fuddaliadau sy'n seiliedig ar brawf moddion.

Y gwir yw bod 2 filiwn o bensiynwyr ym Mhrydain heddiw sydd â hawl i gael credyd pensiwn nad ydynt yn ei hawlio. O blith y 2 filiwn hyn, mae 65 y cant yn yr 20 y cant isaf o ran dosbarthiad incwm, a dengys hynny mai'r tlotaf sy'n cael eu taro waethaf gan brawf moddion.

Rhaid i gylch gwaith y comisiynydd gynnwys y sector cartrefi gofal. Mae papur briffio'r fforwm gofal y mis diwethaf yn datgan yn glir, wrth sôn am Gymru, fod

y Sector Gofal mewn cyflwr enbyd...Mae cartrefi gofal yn dal i gau ac mae gwelyau sy'n darparu gofal nyrsio'n dal i gael eu datgofrestru oddi wrth nyrsio i fod yn welyau



preswyl.

Rhodri Glyn referred to 784 lost beds, and we must also refer to 108 closures of homes last year. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee has argued that older residents must be allowed to stay in their homes for as long as is practicable. We support that. The Wales care strategy group report, however, predicts a significant increase in the demand for care home and nursing care services over the next 17 years. If the Wanless report's recommendations are implemented to provide additional services to support individuals in the community, it may reduce the amount by which the capacity of the care home sector will need to increase, but it is still unlikely to eliminate the need for growth. That growth must recognise best practice in the sector, which maximises independent living and creates homes from home rather than municipal hospitals or prisons for older, dependent people. The need is not going, it is simply being updated.

The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee recommends that we develop a voluntary charter of rights for residents of care homes. Is that not meaningless, given the gross and unsustainable inequality in funding between England and Wales? For instance, nursing care in Wales last year was funded at £376 per week, while in England it was £472—nearly £100 difference. An Audit Commission report shows that the turnover of care workers in the independent sector has increased to 46 per cent: that is unsustainable.

The commissioner's remit must also extend to beds for the elderly mentally infirm. In north Wales, no such beds are available. This weekend, in a meeting with a senior mental health worker in north Wales, I was told that in Glan Clwyd Hospital, provision is 40 per cent less than is needed to meet demand. It is running on 120 per cent occupancy and delayed discharges are causing a crisis. That is an example of elderly people's human rights being compromised. The commissioner must work in partnership with other agencies. For example, the Council of

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at gollu 784 o welyau, a rhaid inni gyfeirio hefyd at y 108 o gartrefi a gaewyd y llynedd. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi dadlau bod rhaid gadael i breswylwyr hŷn aros yn eu cartrefi cyhyd ag y bo modd. Cefnogwn hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru'n rhagweld y bydd cynnydd sylweddol yn y galw am wasanaethau cartrefi gofal a gofal nyrsio dros y 17 flynedd nesaf. Os rhoddir argymhellion adroddiad Wanless ar waith i ddarparu gwasanaethau ychwanegol i gynnal unigolion yn y gymuned, gallai olygu na fydd y sector cartrefi gofal yn gorfod ehangu cymaint, ond maent yn annhebygol o ddileu'r angen am dwf. Wrth gael twf o'r fath, bydd yn rhaid cydnabod yr arferion gorau a geir yn y sector, sy'n cynnig y graddau mwyaf posibl o fyw annibynnol ac yn creu cartrefi oddi cartref yn hytrach nag ysbytai cyngor neu garchardai ar gyfer pobl hŷn a dibynnol. Nid yw'r angen yn newid, nid yw ond yn cael ei ddiweddarau.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn argymhell y dylem ddatblygu siarter hawliau wirfoddol ar gyfer preswylwyr cartrefi gofal. Onid yw hynny'n ddiystyr, o gofio'r anghydraddoldeb dybryd ac anghynaliadwy mewn cyllid rhwng Cymru a Lloegr? Er enghraifft, telid £376 yr wythnos am ofal nyrsio yng Nghymru y llynedd, tra telid £472 yn Lloegr—bron £100 o wahaniaeth. Mae adroddiad gan y Comisiwn Archwilio yn dangos bod y trosiant ymysg gweithwyr gofal yn y sector annibynnol wedi codi i 46 y cant: mae hynny'n anghynaliadwy.

Rhaid i gylch gwaith y comisiynydd hefyd gynnwys gwelyau ar gyfer henoed bregus eu meddwl. Yn y Gogledd, nid oes unrhyw welyau o'r fath ar gael. Y penwythnos diwethaf, mewn cyfarfod gydag uwch weithiwr iechyd meddwl yn y Gogledd, dywedwyd wrthyf fod y ddarpariaeth yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd yn 40 y cant yn llai na'r hyn y mae ei angen i ateb y galw. Mae 120 y cant o ddefnydd arnynt ac mae oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn peri argyfwng. Dyna enghraifft o beryglu hawliau dynol pobl oedranus. Rhaid i'r comisiynydd weithio ar

Mortgage Lenders' proposals for a Welsh home improvements lending agency is a wonderful model from the private/mutual sector, which, hopefully, looks likely to be recommended by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee.

I could go on, but I will end by arguing that the remit must extend to hospices. In north Wales, before the demise of the North Wales Health Authority, it was stated that north Wales's hospices would need 30 per cent funding from the NHS to meet the palliative care standards, yet they have been struggling since that time, with some in continuing crisis, to meet that level. A commissioner for older people in Wales, focused on the full range of human rights of older people, will have our support now and in the future, provided that he or she has the independence, freedom of principle, and tenacity exhibited by Peter Clarke as Children's Commissioner for Wales.

**Sandy Mewies:** Like previous speakers, I welcome the opportunity to support these proposals, which fulfil a Labour manifesto pledge. I congratulate those who took part in the advisory group chaired by the Deputy Minister, John Griffiths. Its report is comprehensive and it comes up with some much-needed ideas on how to treat older people. Some Members have said that they are concerned about bringing down the age at which one becomes an older person to 50. I have some misgivings about that, because I thought that I was still in the first flush of middle age, but the definition is changing. David Melding said that he felt that we are perhaps patronising old people, but I do not believe that. I see the commissioner's role as being to look after people who are particularly vulnerable, in the same way as the children's commissioner does. To be clear about this, Flintshire has an older people's forum, and it does not need our help: it can tell us what to do and give us wonderful advice on policy. In my view, the commissioner will be dealing with those people who are vulnerable and who need support and help.

y cyd ag asiantaethau eraill. Er enghraifft, mae'r cynigion gan Gyngor y Benthycwyr Morgeisi ar gyfer asiantaeth benthyca i wella cartrefi yng Nghymru yn fodel gwych o'r sector preifat a chydfuddiannol yr ymddengys yn debygol, gobeithio, y bydd y Pwyllgor Cyfawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ei argymhell.

Gallwn fynd ymlaen, ond terfynaf drwy ddadlau y dylai'r cylch gwaith gynnwys hosbisau. Yn y Gogledd, cyn diddymu Awdurdod Iechyd Gogledd Cymru, dywedwyd y byddai ar hosbisau'r Gogledd angen cael 30 y cant o'u cyllid oddi wrth y GIG er mwyn cyrraedd y safonau ar gyfer gofal lliniarol, ac eto cawsant drafferthion ers hynny, a bu rhai ohonynt mewn argyfwng parhaus, wrth geisio cyrraedd y lefel honno. Byddwn o blaid cael comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar holl hawliau dynol pobl hŷn, yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, ar yr amod y bydd yn meddu ar yr annibyniaeth, y rhyddid egwyddorol, a'r dycnwch a amlygodd Peter Clarke fel Comisiynydd Plant Cymru.

**Sandy Mewies:** Fel siaradwyr blaenorol, croesawaf y cyfle hwn i gefnogi'r cynigion hyn, sy'n cyflawni addewid ym maniffesto Llafur. Llongyfarchaf y rhai a gymerodd ran yn y grŵp cynghorol a gadeiriwyd gan y Dirprwy Weinidog, John Griffiths. Mae ei adroddiad yn un cynhwysfawr ac mae'n cynnig rhai syniadau y mae mawr angen amdanynt ar y modd i drin pobl hŷn. Dywedodd rhai Aelodau eu bod yn bryderus ynghylch gostwng yr oedran y bydd rhywun yn dod yn berson hŷn i 50. Mae gennyf rai amheuan ynghylch hynny, gan fy mod yn tybio fy mod yn dal i fod ar drothwy canol oed, ond mae'r diffiniad yn newid. Dywedodd David Melding y teimlai y gallem fod yn yn trin pobl hŷn yn nawddoglyd, ond ni chredaf hynny. Ystyriaf mai rôl y comisiynydd fydd gofalu am bobl sy'n arbennig o agored i niwed, yn yr un modd ag y gwnaiff y comisiynydd plant. Er mwyn egluro hyn yn iawn, mae gan sir y Fflint fforwm pobl hŷn, ac nid oes arno angen cymorth gennym ni: gall ddweud wrthym beth y dylem ei wneud a chynnig cyngor rhagorol i ni ar bolisi. Fel y gwelaf fi hyn, bydd y comisiynydd yn delio â'r rhai sy'n agored i niwed y mae arnynt angen cymorth

a chefnogaeth.

Age Concern Cymru expresses its support for a champion for older people. Flintshire County Council is leading the way in that it has already appointed an elected member as the older people's champion, and that is working well.

Mae Age Concern Cymru yn datgan ei gefnogaeth i'r bwriad i gael dadleuwr dros bobl hŷn. Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn arwain y ffordd i'r graddau ei fod eisoes wedi penodi aelod etholedig yn gefnogwr pobl hŷn, ac mae hynny'n mynd rhagddo'n dda.

4.00 p.m.

I agree that the commissioner should consider the public and private provision of care. He or she should be independent and should have at least the same status as the children's commissioners in Wales and Northern Ireland. Any overlap with other bodies is of concern, as has been mentioned, and we must take that into consideration during the consultation process. I am particularly glad that there will be a full consultation, and that its results will come back to the Assembly, so that we can give our opinions.

Cytunaf y dylai'r comisiynydd ystyried y gofal cyhoeddus a phreifat a ddarperir. Dylai fod yn annibynnol a dylai feddu ar yr un statws o leiaf â'r comisiynwyr plant yng Nghymru a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae unrhyw orgyffwrdd a geir â chyrrff eraill yn peri pryder, fel y nodwyd, a rhaid inni ystyried hynny yn ystod y broses ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch y ceir ymgynghoriad llawn, ac y daw'r canlyniadau yn ôl i'r Cynulliad fel y gallwn ddatgan ein barn.

I agree with Help the Aged that age discrimination is the practical manifestation of ageism, which is a form of prejudice—and it does happen. Establishing a commissioner for older people will be a significant step towards providing a system that protects older people and their human rights.

Cytunaf â Help the Aged pan ddywed mai gwahaniaethu ar sail oedran yw'r agwedd ymarferol ar oedraniaeth, sy'n fath o ragfarn—ac mae'n digwydd hefyd. Drwy sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn, cymerir cam mawr ymlaen tuag at ddarparu system sy'n amddiffyn pobl hŷn ac yn diogelu eu hawliau dynol.

I hope that the commissioner will have duties and responsibilities that enable him or her to support those who are extremely vulnerable. I have experience of caring for someone with Alzheimer's disease, and anyone who has cared for somebody with dementia knows how difficult it is, not just to cope with the caring role, but to jump through the hoops of benefits, housing, hospitalisation, care homes and so on. That is not because the agencies try to be difficult, but because there are so many things to do. I have often reflected on how difficult it must be for older people who do not have children, friends or caring neighbours to, not interfere in their affairs, but help them to get the care that they need and deserve. Therefore, I hope that the commissioner's powers will enable him or her to support those people. Sorting these matters out is a nightmare, and I worry about it. I hope that the commissioner has the

Yr wyf yn gobeithio y caiff y comisiynydd ddyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau a fydd yn ei alluogi i gefnogi'r rhai sy'n agored iawn i niwed. Mae gennyf brofiad o ofalu am rywun â chlefyd Alzheimer, a gŵyr unrhyw un a ofalodd am rywun â gorffwylledd mor anodd yw hynny, nid yn unig o ran ymdopi â'r rôl gofalu, ond hefyd o ran goresgyn y rhwystrau sy'n gysylltiedig â budd-daliadau, tai, gofal mewn ysbyty, cartrefi gofal ac yn y blaen. Nid am fod yr asiantaethau'n ceisio peri anhawster y mae hynny, ond am fod cynifer o bethau i'w gwneud. Yr wyf wedi myfyrio'n aml ynghylch mor anodd y mae i bobl hŷn sydd heb blant, ffrindiau neu gymdogion gofalgarn a all eu helpu, heb ymyrryd yn eu busnes, i gael y gofal y mae arnynt ei angen ac y maent yn ei haeddu. Gan hynny, gobeithiaf y bydd pwerau'r comisiynydd yn ei alluogi i gynorthwyo'r bobl hynny. Hunllef yw ceisio cael trefn ar y

powers and the wherewithal to deal with these and other issues.

I understand that the costs of the commissioner are calculated to be about £1.25 million a year. The Welsh Assembly Government funds the older people's strategy to the tune of about £10 million. In his response, could the Minister tell me whether the commissioner will be funded from the stream for the older people's strategy, or whether new money will be made available? We cannot set up posts, bodies and organisations without providing the funds to do the job properly. That is what older people deserve.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** This has been a supportive and constructive debate. It has been recognised that this would be not only a first for Wales, but also for the UK and the world. It was useful, David, when members of the advisory group came to the Health and Social Services Committee. They had a testing time, but I am sure that that helped to sharpen up the report, which was formally launched today. We had a good launch at lunchtime, which many Members across all parties attended. As John Griffiths said at that launch, it is important that this consultation stretches not only to all those thousands of organisations that represent and involve older people, but also to individuals. This matter has been given a high profile and much publicity, and older people will welcome the fact that the whole Assembly regards this as an opportunity.

There will be an extensive consultation period, and we are looking forward to hearing people's views on this. However, I assure Members that this matter will be brought back to Committee and to Plenary for debate once we have had a chance to consider the results of the consultation exercise. We will then be able to put before you our proposals for the commissioner's core functions and powers.

On the points made by Jonathan, Mike, David and others on the amendments, we have been keeping in touch with the

materion hyn, ac yr wyf yn poeni am hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiynydd yn meddu ar y pwerau a'r modd i ddelio â hynny a materion eraill.

Deallaf mai tua £1.25 miliwn y flwyddyn fydd costau'r comisiynydd. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n rhoi cyllid o tua £10 miliwn tuag at y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Yn ei hymateb, a all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf a ddaw'r cyllid ar gyfer y comisiynydd o'r llif ar gyfer y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, neu a ddarperir arian newydd? Ni allwn sefydlu swyddi, cyrff a chyfundrefnau heb ddarparu digon o gyllid i wneud y gwaith yn iawn. Dyna y mae pobl hŷn yn ei haeddu.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Bu hon yn ddadl gefnogol ac adeiladol. Cydnabuwyd y byddai hyn yn rhywbeth newydd i Gymru, a hefyd i'r DU ac i'r byd. Bu o gymorth, David, pan ddaeth aelodau'r grŵp cynghorol i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cawsant amser anodd, ond yr wyf yn siŵr i hynny fod o gymorth i finiogi'r adroddiad, a lansiwyd yn ffurfiol heddiw. Cawsom gyfarfod lansio da amser cinio lle y bu sawl Aelod o'r holl bleidiau yn bresennol. Fel y dywedodd John Griffiths yn y cyfarfod lansio hwnnw, mae'n bwysig i'r ymgynghoriad hwn gynnwys unigolion yn ogystal â'r miloedd o gyrff sy'n cynrychioli ac yn cynnwys pobl hŷn. Rhoddwyd cryn sylw a llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd i'r mater hwn, a bydd pobl hŷn yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Cynulliad cyfan yn ystyried hyn yn gyfle.

Ceir cyfnod ymgynghori hir, ac yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at glywed barn pobl am hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicrhau Aelodau y deuir â'r mater hwn yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor ac i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar gyfer dadl wedi inni gael cyfle i ystyried canlyniadau'r ymgynghoriad. Byddwn wedyn yn gallu rhoi ein cynigion ger eich bron ar gyfer swyddogaethau craidd a phwerau'r comisiynydd.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Jonathan, Mike, David ac eraill am y gwelliannau, buom yn cadw mewn cysylltiad â'r gwaith

developing work on the new commission and, as you know, the UK Government is fully aware of our intention to establish an older people's commissioner. We debated it on 17 March in relation to primary legislation, and our bid is firmly lodged. I am committed to ensuring that the respective roles of the commissioner for older people and the new equality body are clear, and the publication of the White Paper on the commission is imminent. The advisory group's report discusses this issue, and we have debated it this afternoon. It offers several options, including drawing up a memorandum of understanding to ensure that the two roles are complementary in relation to older people.

It is interesting that, as Leighton said, Age Concern and Help the Aged have made comments. I have given thought to this, as has the advisory committee. Help the Aged says that the commissioner will provide an authoritative link with the Commission for Equality and Human Rights, while acknowledging the distinct political, cultural and linguistic circumstances and developments in Wales. That is the nub of what we are seeking, as well as the independence and autonomy that we know that statutory powers would give to such a commissioner. We also look to our children's commissioner to see the impact that he has had on us in terms of policy, from an independent perspective, as well as the reports that have been produced and the evidence that he has given us on children and young people's views. That is what we would get from a commissioner for older people.

We must look carefully at the detail of the White Paper on a commission for equality and human rights, once it is published, alongside our own proposals. It will be important to ensure that a high-level focus remains on the needs and aspirations of older people in Wales. With that knowledge and understanding of the distinctive picture of Wales, this is about promoting and safeguarding the rights and dignity of older people, and challenging discrimination against them in the round. We talked about this at today's launch. The commissioner is

sy'n mynd ymlaen ar y comisiwn newydd ac, fel y gwyddoch, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn llwyr ymwybodol o'n bwriad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Cawsom ddafl arno ar 17 Mawrth mewn cysylltiad â deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, ac mae ein cais wedi'i gyflwyno'n sicr. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd priodrolau'r comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn a'r corff cydraddoldeb newydd yn eglur, ac mae'r Papur Gwyn ar y comisiwn ar fin cael ei gyhoeddi. Mae adroddiad y grŵp cynghorol yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn, ac yr ydym wedi'i drafod y prynhawn yma. Mae'n cynnig sawl dewis, gan gynnwys llunio memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth i sicrhau bod y ddwy rôl yn ategu'i gilydd mewn cysylltiad â phobl hŷn.

Fel y dywedodd Leighton, diddorol yw nodi bod Age Concern a Help the Aged wedi gwneud sylwadau. Yr wyf wedi ystyried hyn, fel y mae'r pwyllgor cynghorol. Dywed Help the Aged y bydd y comisiynydd yn gyswllt awdurdodol â'r comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol, gan gydnabod yr amgylchiadau gwleidyddol, diwylliannol ac ieithyddol a'r datblygiadau a geir yng Nghymru. Dyna hanfod yr hyn yr ydym yn ei geisio, yn ogystal â'r annibyniaeth ac ymreolaeth y gwyddom y byddai pwerau statudol yn eu rhoi i gomisiynydd o'r fath. Edrychwn hefyd ar ein comisiynydd plant a gweld yr effaith a gafodd arnom o ran polisi, o safbwynt annibynnol, yn ogystal â'r adroddiadau a gynhyrchwyd a'r dystiolaeth a roddodd i ni ar farn plant a phobl ifanc. Dyna'r hyn a gaem gan gomisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

Rhaid inni edrych yn fanwl ar y Papur Gwyn ar gomisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol, wedi iddo gael ei gyhoeddi, ochr yn ochr â'n cynigion ein hunain. Bydd yn bwysig sicrhau y parheir i roi sylw ar lefel uchel i anghenion a dyheadau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Ar sail y ddealltwriaeth a'r wybodaeth honno am y sefyllfa neilltuol a geir yng Nghymru, ceisir hyrwyddo a diogelu hawliau ac urddas pobl hŷn, a herio gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn ym mhob maes. Gwnaethom sôn am hyn yn y cyfarfod lansio heddiw. Nid yw'r comisiynydd yr un fath ag ombwdsmon.

not the same as an ombudsman. He or she will be a champion to empower older people, although, as Sandy said, as a result of the support that we have given through the strategy for older people, we now have champions at local authority level, in members and executives.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that one important point raised at today's launch is that we must continue to ensure that adult continuing education is properly funded, as we are doing now, so that older people can benefit from learning? It is also important that those who wish to pursue a formal course will be entitled to the Assembly learning grant.

**Jane Hutt:** The commissioner would want to take these issues up. Rhodri Glyn, Christine and Leighton made points about how we can ensure that older people have opportunities. This is about expanding people's opportunities beyond the age of 50, let alone 64 plus. This is about expanding the opportunities for lifelong learning and, as Christine said, about the impact that older people can have on their local health, social care and wellbeing strategies, as well as on the care sector. I was taken by the points that Christine made about the care sector and the fact that we now have a social care workforce development programme. Some £7.5 million is going into that this year, for work with local authorities and, indeed, with the private and independent sector.

It is good that this report is not bland. It contains some quite controversial and blue-sky thinking about how we should take forward issues such as the role of the private sector. Should the commissioner be able to look into the private provision of care? We need to look at that in the consultation and consider whether we should enable the commissioner to scrutinise how older people are treated by private care providers, or whether that would increase the burden of regulation. We need to address those issues.

Everyone says that this commissioner must have clout. We know that and have subscribed to that for our children's commissioner. We must consider the issues

Bydd yn gefnogwr a fydd yn galluogi pobl hŷn, er bod gennym gefnogwyr bellach ar lefel awdurdodau lleol, ar ffurf aelodau a swyddogion gweithredol, o ganlyniad i'r gefnogaeth a roesom drwy'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, fel y dywedodd Sandy.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn cytuno mai un pwynt pwysig a godwyd yn y cyfarfod lansio heddiw yw bod rhaid inni ddal i sicrhau y caiff addysg barhaus i oedolion ei chyllido'n iawn, fel y gwnawn yn awr, fel y gall pobl hŷn gael budd o ddysgu? Mae hefyd yn bwysig nodi y bydd y rhai sy'n dymuno dilyn cwrs ffurfiol yn gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad.

**Jane Hutt:** Byddai'r comisiynydd am godi'r materion hynny. Gwnaeth Rhodri Glyn, Christine a Leighton bwyntiau ynghylch y modd y gallwn sicrhau cyfleoedd i bobl hŷn. Y bwriad yw ehangu cyfleoedd ar ôl 50 oed, heb sôn am 64 oed ac wedyn. Mae hyn yn golygu ehangu'r cyfleoedd ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes ac, fel y dywedodd Christine, mae'n ymwneud â'r effaith y gall pobl hŷn ei chael ar eu strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles lleol, yn ogystal â'r sector gofal. Fe'm trawyd gan y pwyntiau a wnaeth Christine am y sector gofal a'r ffaith bod gennym raglen ddatblygu bellach ar gyfer y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Rhoddir tua £7.5 miliwn tuag at hynny eleni, ar gyfer gwaith gydag awdurdodau lleol ac, yn wir, gyda'r sector preifat ac annibynnol.

Mae'n beth da nad yw'r adroddiad hwn yn ddi-liw. Mae'n cynnwys peth meddwl eithaf dadleuol a mentrus ynghylch y modd y dylem fynd ynghylch materion fel rôl y sector preifat. A ddylai'r comisiynydd allu ymchwilio i'r gofal a ddarperir yn breifat? Rhaid inni ymchwilio i hynny yn yr ymgynghoriad ac ystyried a ddylem alluogi'r comisiynydd i graffu ar y driniaeth a gaiff pobl hŷn gan ddarparwyr gofal preifat, neu a fyddai hynny'n gosod mwy o faich o ran rheoleiddio. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r materion hynny.

Dywed pawb fod rhaid i'r comisiynydd hwn feddu ar ddylanwad. Gwyddom hynny ac yr ydym wedi dal at hynny yn achos ein comisiynydd plant. Rhaid inni ystyried y

around powers in relation to the new legislation that we are seeking, because pensions, taxation and benefits are of fundamental importance to older people in Wales. The advisory group has rightly recommended that the commissioner be empowered to take up these issues and to make direct representations to the UK Government on non-devolved matters. That is why we must ensure that this consultation and these debates test that out and enable us to present a robust, clear Bill to the UK Government so that we can take this forward, as we have secured acceptance that it will be a bid from the Welsh Assembly Government.

All this is about ensuring that we have better outcomes for older people. Great strides have been made in our policies for older people. The strategy for older people, which we launched over 14 months ago, is making a positive impact on the lives of older people in Wales. As Val said, it is a pioneering strategy. Real progress has been made, with members of a national partnership forum being appointed in the next few months. Most local authorities have appointed their older people's champions, and older people have strong voices in the local fora set up across Wales. As Leighton said, there are opportunities for older people to make a contribution within our communities. They are also contributing within their families and in everyday life. Free bus travel has liberated older people and opportunities such as free swimming are coming through. Older people are often at the forefront of the healthy living initiatives that are taking place across Wales, which is crucial in terms of preventing illness.

4.10 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It has been mentioned often today that if the commissioner is to be appointed, he or she must have proper powers. How will you resource those powers and how much is the commissioner likely to cost?

**Jane Hutt:** Sandy also made the point that we must ensure that we give substantial and appropriate funding to the older people's

materion sy'n ymwneud â phwerau mewn cysylltiad â'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd yr ydym yn ei cheisio, gan fod pensiynau, trethu a budd-daliadau o bwys sylfaenol i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Mae'r grŵp cynghorol wedi argymhell yn briodol y dylid galluogi'r comisiynydd i drafod y materion hyn a chyflwyno sylwadau'n uniongyrchol i Lywodraeth y DU ar faterion sydd heb eu datganoli. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yr ymgynghoriad hwn a'r dadleuon hyn yn rhoi prawf ar hynny ac yn ein galluogi i gyflwyno Mesur clir a chadarn i Lywodraeth y DU fel y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â hyn, gan ein bod wedi sicrhau bod cais wedi'i dderbyn oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Pwrpas hyn oll yw sicrhau gwell canlyniadau i bobl hŷn. Cymerwyd camau mawr ymlaen yn ein polisiau ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, y gwnaethom ei lansio fwy na 14 mis yn ôl, yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar fywydau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd Val, mae'n strategaeth arloesol. Gwnaed gwir gynnydd, a phenodir aelodau i fforwm partneriaeth cenedlaethol yn y misoedd nesaf. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol wedi penodi cefnogwyr ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ac mae gan bobl hŷn lais cryf yn y fforymau lleol a sefydlwyd ledled Cymru. Fel y dywedodd Leighton, mae cyfleoedd i bobl hŷn gyfrannu yn ein cymunedau. Maent yn cyfrannu hefyd yn eu teuluoedd ac yn eu bywyd pob dydd. Mae teithio am ddim ar fysiau wedi rhyddhau pobl hŷn a bydd cyfleoedd fel nofio am ddim ar gael. Pobl hŷn sydd ar y blaen yn aml yn y mentrau byw'n iach sy'n digwydd ledled Cymru, sy'n hollbwysig o ran atal salwch.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dywedwyd yn aml heddiw y bydd yn rhaid i'r comisiynydd gael pwerau iawn, os caiff ei benodi. Sut y byddwch yn cyllido'r pwerau hynny a pha faint y mae'r comisiynydd yn debygol o'i gostio?

**Jane Hutt:** Gwnaeth Sandy y pwynt hefyd y bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau y rhoddwn gyllid sylweddol a phriodol i'r comisiynydd ar

commissioner. We have done that for the children's commissioner, and we have increased the budget substantially from the early estimates. We must begin by ensuring that we have an understanding of the commissioner's role and powers. If we have a first-stage commissioner before we have statutory powers, he or she will be funded by the Welsh Assembly Government to meet the need. This is about outcomes and ensuring that we have a champion for older people in Wales. Let us move forward and put practicalities and opportunities before politics in this debate. I think that we have achieved that. That is what older people and the citizens of Wales want to hear. This is about seeking the best outcomes for senior citizens in Wales. We look forward to the outcome. Let us put this first, get it right for the people of Wales and make it a model for the world.

gyfer pobl hŷn. Gwnaethom hynny yn achos y comisiynydd plant, ac yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb yn sylweddol o'i chymharu â'r amcangyfrifon cynnar. Rhaid inni ddechrau drwy sicrhau ein bod yn deall rôl a phwerau'r comisiynydd. Os cawn gomisiynydd fel cam cyntaf cyn inni gael pwerau statudol, caiff ei gyllido gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddiwallu'r angen. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chanlyniadau a sicrhau bod gennym gefnogwr i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen a rhoi ystyriaethau ymarferol a chyfleoedd o flaen gwleidyddiaeth yn y ddadl hon. Credaf ein bod wedi cyflawni hynny. Dyna'r hyn y mae pobl hŷn a dinasyddion Cymru am ei glywed. Pwrpas hyn yw ceisio'r canlyniadau gorau i ddinasyddion hŷn yng Nghymru. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld y canlyniad. Gadewch inni roi hyn yn gyntaf, a pheri ei fod yn addas i bobl Cymru a'i wneud yn fodel ar gyfer y byd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*



*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM1944): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1944): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.14 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.14 p.m.*

### **Gweithredu'r Diwygiadau i'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin The Common Agricultural Policy Reform Implementation**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. endorses the decision of the Welsh Assembly Government to adopt the historic model as the basis of the new CAP single farm payment from 2005 as in the best interests of Wales and Welsh farming;*

*1. yn cymeradwyo penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fabwysiadu'r model hanesyddol yn sail i daliad sengl newydd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin o 2005 ymlaen er lles gorau Cymru a ffermio yng Nghymru;*

*2. welcomes that further decisions on CAP*

*2. yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd*

*reform relating to cross-compliance, the national reserve and the national envelope will be informed by the responses to the extensive consultation now under way.*  
(NDM1946)

I am grateful for the opportunity to update Members on the progress of preparing Wales for the implementation of reform to the common agriculture policy in 2005. I am keen to hear views on the key issues currently out to consultation.

In February, I announced to the National Assembly that the Assembly Government had decided to adopt the historic model as the basis for the new single farm payment that will come on-stream next year. This decision is right for Wales and for Welsh farming. It will deliver greater stability for the majority in the industry, and it confirms the approach that we took throughout the important negotiations on CAP reform. Vitaly, the historic model avoids the major redistribution of CAP resources, particularly to farmers with larger farms, that is inherent in any system based on an area payment.

Furthermore, I have announced that the new dairy payments—the dairy premium scheme and associated additional payment—will be decoupled and incorporated into the single farm payment in 2005. I am confident that these decisions will provide the industry with the maximum flexibility to respond to market demands and consumer preferences.

We have agreement from Brussels on two commission-implementing regulations that provide the legal framework for much of the operational detail of CAP reform. This has provided a greater degree of clarity that has, in turn, informed the further consultation now under way in Wales on proposals relating to the CAP cross-compliance requirements, the national reserve and whether we need to adopt a national envelope, and, if so, how it might be taken forward.

*penderfyniadau ar ddiwygio'r PAC mewn perthynas â thrawsgydymffurfio, y gronfa genedlaethol a'r amlen genedlaethol yn cael eu llywio gan yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad helaeth sydd ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd.*  
(NDM1946)

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gael cyfle i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau ar y cynnydd a wneir wrth baratoi Cymru ar gyfer gweithredu'r diwygiadau i'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn 2005. Yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed barn am y prif faterion y ceir ymgynghori arnynt ar hyn o bryd.

Ym mis Chwefror, cyhoeddais i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi penderfynu mabwysiadu'r model hanesyddol yn sail i'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr newydd a fydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r penderfyniad hwn yn iawn i Gymru ac i ffermio yng Nghymru. Bydd yn sicrhau mwy o sefydlogrwydd i'r mwyafrif yn y diwydiant, ac mae'n ategu'r safbwynt y gwnaethom ddal ato drwy gydol y negodiadau pwysig ar ddiwygio'r PAC. Yr hyn sy'n hollbwysig yw bod y model hanesyddol yn osgoi'r ailddosbarthu helaeth ar adnoddau'r PAC, yn enwedig i ffermwyr â ffermydd mwy, sy'n elfen annatod mewn unrhyw system sy'n seiliedig ar daliadau yn ôl arwynebedd.

At hynny, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi y bydd y taliadau llaeth newydd—y cynllun premiwm llaeth a'r taliad ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef—yn cael eu datgyplu a'u cynnwys yn y taliad sengl i ffermwyr yn 2005. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd y penderfyniadau hyn yn rhoi'r hyblygrwydd mwyaf posibl i'r diwydiant fel y gall ymateb i ofynion y farchnad a dewisiadau defnyddwyr.

Cawsom gytundeb gan Frwsel ar ddau reoliad ar gyfer gweithredu gan y comisiwn sy'n cynnig y fframwaith cyfreithiol ar gyfer llawer o fanylion gweithredol y diwygiadau i'r PAC. Mae hyn wedi rhoi mwy o eglurder ac mae hynny, yn ei dro, wedi goleuo'r ymgynghori pellach sy'n mynd ymlaen yn awr yng Nghymru ar gynigion sy'n ymwneud â gofynion trawsgydymffurfio'r PAC, y gronfa genedlaethol ac a oes angen inni fabwysiadu amlen genedlaethol, ac, os oes, sut y gellid mynd ynghylch hynny.

Receipt of the single farm payment is conditional on farmers meeting cross-compliance standards. A failure to meet any of these standards could result in penalties being imposed in the value of the SFP made to individual farmers. There are two distinct elements within the cross-compliance regime. The first relates to statutory management requirements. These cover existing EU statutory obligations relating to the environment, the public and to plant and animal health and animal welfare issues. They also cover specified provisions within 18 EU directives or regulations that have been in existence for some time. A phased introduction of these requirements will be required. The key point is that farmers have nothing new to fear from these regulations, as the industry should already be complying with the standards. The EU requirements cover, for example, habitat preservation, including wild birds, the prevention of groundwater and soil pollution, and the identification and registration of animals.

The other aspect of cross-compliance is the need to demonstrate that land is kept in good agricultural and environmental condition. In practice, the standards relate to soil and land management, and much of what is proposed in the consultation paper will not be that new to the farming community. We have to accept that cross-compliance is a legal requirement set by the EU. I want a regime that demonstrates the fulfilment of this obligation, where farmers are clear about what they are expected to deliver, and, importantly, where we achieve balance in terms of not imposing unnecessary burdens on the farming community. It is my intention that the production freedom and flexibility to respond directly to market and consumer preferences that are implicit within the SFP should not be undermined by added red tape through cross-compliance.

My officials are working with our partners in the regulatory authorities to develop a co-ordinated inspection system that has at its

Bydd yr hawl i dderbyn y taliad sengl i ffermwyr yn dibynnu ar allu ffermwyr i gyrraedd y safonau ar gyfer trawsgydymffurfio. Byddai methu â chyrraedd unrhyw un o'r safonau hyn yn gallu arwain at osod cosbau yng nghydestun gwerth y taliad sengl i ffermwyr newydd a roddir i ffermwyr unigol. Mae dwy elfen ar wahân yn y gyfundrefn drawsgydymffurfio. Mae'r gyntaf yn ymwneud â gofynion rheoli statudol. Mae'r rhain yn ymdrin â'r rhwymedigaethau statudol presennol yn yr UE mewn cysylltiad â'r amgylchedd, y cyhoedd ac iechyd planhigion ac anifeiliaid a materion sy'n ymwneud â lles anifeiliaid. Maent hefyd yn ymwneud â darpariaethau penodol yn 18 o gyfarwyddebau neu reoliadau'r UE sy'n bod ers cryn amser. Bydd yn rhaid cyflwyno'r gofynion hyn yn raddol. Y pwynt pwysig yw nad oes dim i'w ofni gan ffermwyr yn y rheoliadau newydd hyn, gan y dylai'r diwydiant fod yn cydymffurfio â'r safonau hyn eisoes. Mae gofynion yr UE yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, cadw cynefinoedd, gan gynnwys adar gwyllt, atal llygru pridd a dŵr daear, ac adnabod a chofrestru anifeiliaid.

Yr agwedd arall ar drawsgydymffurfio yw'r angen i ddangos bod tir wedi'i gadw mewn cyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da. Yn ymarferol, mae'r safonau'n ymwneud â phridd a rheoli tir, ac mae llawer yn y papur ymgynghori na fydd yn hollol newydd i ffermwyr. Rhaid inni dderbyn mai gofyniad cyfreithiol yw trawsgydymffurfio a osodwyd gan yr UE. Yr wyf am gael cyfundrefn sy'n dangos bod yr ymrwymiad hwnnw wedi'i gyflawni, lle y mae ffermwyr yn deall yr hyn y disgwylir iddynt ei gyflawni, ac, yn bwysig, lle yr ydym yn dal y ddysgl yn wastad o ran peidio â gosod beichiau diangen ar ffermwyr. Fy mwriad yw sicrhau na thanseilir y rhyddid o ran cynhyrchu a'r hyblygrwydd i allu ymateb yn uniongyrchol i ddewisiadau'r farchnad a'r defnyddwyr sydd ymhlyg yn y taliad sengl i ffermwyr drwy ychwanegu biwrocratiaeth drwy drawsgydymffurfio.

Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio gyda'n partneriaid yn yr awdurdodau rheoleiddio i ddatblygu system arolygu gydlynol a fydd yn

heart an approach that will minimise the bureaucratic burden. It needs to be borne in mind that, of the 20,000 potential applicants for the SFP, around 200 farms a year will be subject to cross-compliance checks. I intend to elaborate on the inspection and enforcement aspects of cross-compliance when these discussions have been completed and when I have considered all the responses to the current consultation exercise. More generally, officials will prepare detailed advice and guidance to help farmers to deliver the standards within the cross-compliance regime. However, we must be clear: cross-compliance is a prerequisite. My intention for Wales is a regime that provides the minimum framework consistent with the EU legal requirements.

I cannot support amendment 2 tabled in the name of Jonathan Morgan, which, in part, covers cross-compliance. A 'minimalist approach' can be interpreted in a number of ways, one of which could be such that we adapt cross-compliance for Wales is seen as little more than lip service. I appreciate the spirit behind this amendment and it is my intention that we have a regime that provides the minimum that is consistent with the EU requirement.

I turn to consultation on the national reserve. There has, of course, been some media coverage in recent times about the national reserve and those new to farming. I say once again, for the record, that the Assembly Government understands fully that the historic model could pose problems for those who have recently entered farming. However, within the flexibility provided for in the European legislation, I will ensure that the needs of new entrants are recognised.

4.20 p.m.

With the historic basis for the SFP, the value of the future CAP payment will be calculated on the averaged farm activity undertaken in the 2000 to 2002 period. In practice, it is the average activity that underpinned a CAP subsidy payment in any of these three years.

rhoi pwys ar ddull gweithredu a fydd yn lleihau'r baich biwrocraidd. Dylid cofio mai tua 200 o ffermydd y flwyddyn, o blith y 20,000 a allai ymgeisio am y taliad sengl i ffermwyr, a fydd yn destun gwiriadau ar drawsgydymffurfio. Bwriadaf ymhelaethu ar yr agweddau ar drawsgydymffurfio sy'n ymwneud ag arolygu a gorfodi ar ôl cwblhau'r trafodaethau hynny a phan fyddaf wedi ystyried yr holl ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad presennol. Yn fwy cyffredinol, bydd swyddogion yn paratoi cyngor a chanllawiau manwl i helpu ffermwyr i gyrraedd y safonau o fewn y gyfundrefn drawsgydymffurfio. Er hynny, rhaid inni fod yn glir: anghenraid yw trawsgydymffurfio. Yr hyn a fwriadaf ar gyfer Cymru yw cyfundrefn sy'n darparu'r fframwaith lleiaf a fo'n gyson â gofynion cyfreithiol yr UE.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 2 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Jonathan Morgan, sy'n ymdrin yn rhannol â thrawsgydymffurfio. Gellir cael sawl dehongliad o 'wneud y lleiaf sy'n angenrheidiol', y gallai un ohonynt olygu y byddem yn addasu trawsgydymffurfio ar gyfer Cymru fel nad yw'n fawr mwy na gwasanaeth gwefus. Deallaf y teimlad sydd wrth wraidd y gwelliant hwn a'm bwriad yw y cawn gyfundrefn sy'n darparu'r lleiaf sy'n gyson â gofyniad yr UE.

Trof at yr ymgynghori ar y gronfa genedlaethol. Wrth gwrs, rhoddwyd rhywfaint o sylw yn y cyfryngau'n ddiweddar i'r gronfa genedlaethol a rhai sydd newydd ddechrau ffermio. Dywedaf eto, er mwyn iddo gael ei gofnodi, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn llawn ddeall y gallai'r model hanesyddol beri problemau i'r rhai sydd wedi dechrau ffermio'n ddiweddar. Fodd bynnag, o fewn yr hyblygrwydd a geir yn y ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, byddaf yn sicrhau y cydnabyddir anghenion ffermwyr newydd.

O gael sail hanesyddol i'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr, cyfrifir gwerth y taliad o dan y PAC yn y dyfodol yn ôl gweithgarwch cyfartalog ar y fferm yn y cyfnod o 2000 i 2002. Yn ymarferol, y gweithgarwch cyfartalog a fu'n sail i'r cymhorthdal o dan y

Therefore, if subsidy was claimed for only two of the three years, the average is based on the two years only and so on.

There will be some people farming in 2005 who will be unable to demonstrate any prior historic activity between 2000 and 2002, especially those who are new to farming, and certain categories of farmer who, during that historic period, were building up their farm business. Their payment entitlement for SFP purposes will be met from the arrangements that we adopt in Wales for the national reserve. The consultation paper sets out the range of issues associated with the reserve, on which views have been invited.

The reserve will be funded by a deduction of up to 3 per cent from the Wales financial ceiling that will take effect from 2005. In addition, the balance in the ceiling remaining after all payments have been made would revert to the reserve. The initial conclusion is that we will need to adopt the full 3 per cent in the early years of the reform process. This assessment presumes that there will be little, if any, spare funds left within the Wales financial ceiling. Subsequently, it is open to reduce the deduction from the 3 per cent level, if the demand on the reserve decreases.

Once CAP reform has settled down, I would expect payment entitlement transfer to become integral to the usual farm land sale and lease processes. That would considerably reduce pressure for entitlement to come via the reserve. For this reason, the consultation paper also invites views on mechanisms through which the reserve might be replenished through a siphon on entitlements that are sold or leased. The consultation paper outlines that access to the reserve will be on the basis of two categories: those with automatic access and those where access is discretionary.

Automatic access covers instances where, by 29 September 2003, a farmer can demonstrate a business development process, namely a quota purchase, or purchase of land that also includes a lease of six or more

PAC yn unrhyw un o'r tair blynedd hynny ydyw. Gan hynny, os hawliwyd cymhorthdal am ddim ond dwy o'r tair blynedd, mae'r cyfartaledd yn seiliedig ar y ddwy flynedd hynny'n unig ac yn y blaen.

Bydd rhai'n ffermio yn 2005 na fyddant yn gallu dangos unrhyw weithgarwch hanesyddol blaenorol rhwng 2000 a 2002, yn enwedig y rhai sydd newydd ddechrau ffermio, a ffermwyr mewn rhai categorïau a oedd yn datblygu eu busnes fferm yn ystod y cyfnod hanesyddol hwnnw. Rhoddir y taliad y mae ganddynt hawl iddo i ddibenion y taliad sengl i ffermwyr o dan y trefniadau a fabwysiadwn yng Nghymru ar gyfer y gronfa genedlaethol. Mae'r papur ymgynghori'n nodi amryw o faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r gronfa y gofynnwyd am sylwadau arnynt.

Caiff y gronfa ei chyllido drwy dynnu hyd at 3 y cant o'r terfyn ariannol uchaf ar gyfer Cymru a ddaw i rym o 2005. Yn ogystal â hynny, byddai'r hyn sy'n weddill o'r terfyn ariannol uchaf ar ôl rhoi'r holl daliadau'n mynd yn ôl i'r gronfa. Yn ôl y casgliad cyntaf y daethpwyd iddo, bydd yn rhaid inni gymryd y 3 y cant llawn ym mlynnyddoedd cyntaf y broses ddiwygio. Yn ôl yr asesiad hwn, cymerir na fydd fawr ddim arian yn weddill o dan derfyn ariannol uchaf Cymru. Ar ôl hynny, bydd lle i dynnu llai na 3 y cant, os bydd llai o alw ar y gronfa.

Wedi i'r diwygiadau i'r PAC ymsefydlogi, byddwn yn disgwyl i'r trosglwyddo ar yr hawl i gael taliad ddod yn rhan annatod o'r prosesau arferol a geir wrth werthu ffermydd a'u gosod ar brydles. O ganlyniad i hynny, byddai llawer llai o alw am gael taliadau drwy'r gronfa. Oherwydd hynny, mae'r papur ymgynghori'n gofyn am sylwadau hefyd ar ddulliau y gellid eu defnyddio i ail-lenwi'r gronfa drwy dynnu arian o hawliau sy'n cael eu gwerthu neu eu gosod ar brydles. Mae'r papur ymgynghori'n nodi mai rhai mewn dau gategori a fydd yn gallu cael arian o'r gronfa: y rhai a'i caiff yn awtomatig a'r rhai a'i caiff yn ôl disgrisiwn.

Mae'r hawl awtomatig yn cynnwys achosion lle y gall ffermwr ddangos, erbyn 29 Medi 2003, ei fod yn arfer proses datblygu busnes, sef prynu cwota, neu brynu tir sydd hefyd yn cynnwys prydles o chwe blynedd neu fwy,

years, or other categories of land acquisition and lease. The detail is in the consultation paper.

I am aware that there are occasions when a new entrant might only have a lease running for an initial three years. My officials are considering how we might be flexible in those circumstances as far as access to the reserve is concerned. Where automatic access applies, we have to determine the process by which payments from the reserve are calculated. The consultation paper asks for views on that process.

The second category, the discretionary category, covers those new to farming and farmers participating in a national programme of conversion. The commission regulations stipulate that payments from the reserve for the discretionary category should be based on a regional average. However, there is some flexibility in the commission regulations, and the consultation paper proposes that new entrants in Wales should have automatic access to the reserve. This should ensure that new entrants get the same qualifying access arrangements as farmers having automatic access to the reserve as a right. I will be interested to hear Members' views on this issue.

Furthermore, the fact that a farmer, whether or not a new entrant, might have SFP entitlement from the 2000 to 2002 period does not preclude applying to the national reserve. Where a farmer who already has mainstream SFP entitlement receives a higher payment value from the national reserve, then the entitlement basis of that SFP would be up-rated to the national reserve value. Again, this matter is being taken forward via consultation.

I accept the spirit behind amendment 1, and we have said on successive occasions that we are looking to assist young farmers. The national reserve is most important, but not the only, way of doing that.

Moving on to the national envelope, the third

neu fathau eraill o gaffael tir ac o'i gymryd ar brydles. Mae'r manylion yn y papur ymgynghori.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod achosion lle gallai ffermwr newydd fod wedi cymryd prydles nad yw ond yn parhau am dair blynedd ar y dechrau. Mae fy swyddogion yn ystyried sut y gallem fod yn hyblyg o dan amgylchiadau o'r fath o ran cael arian o'r gronfa. Mewn achosion lle gellir ei gael yn awtomatig, rhaid inni bennu'r broses o gyfrifo'r taliadau a wneir o'r gronfa. Mae'r papur ymgynghori'n gofyn am sylwadau ar y broses honno hefyd.

Mae'r ail gategori, sef yr un sy'n ymwneud â thaliadau yn ôl disgresiwn, yn cynnwys ffermwyr newydd a ffermwyr sy'n cymryd rhan mewn rhaglen drawsnewid genedlaethol. Mae rheoliadau'r comisiwn yn mynnu y bydd y taliadau o'r gronfa a wneir yn ôl disgresiwn yn seiliedig ar gyfartaledd rhanbarthol. Er hynny, mae rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd yn rheoliadau'r comisiwn, ac mae'r papur ymgynghori'n cynnig y dylai ffermwyr newydd yng Nghymru allu cael arian o'r gronfa'n awtomatig. Dylai hyn fod yn fodd i sicrhau y bydd ffermwyr newydd yn cael yr un trefniadau ar gyfer ymgymhwyso ag a gaiff ffermwyr sydd â hawl awtomatig i gael arian o'r gronfa. Bydd o ddiddordeb imi glywed barn Aelodau ar y mater hwn.

At hynny, nid yw'r ffaith y gallai ffermwr, boed yn un newydd neu beidio, fod â hawl i dderbyn y taliad sengl i ffermwyr ar sail y cyfnod o 2000 i 2002, yn golygu na chaiff ymgeisio i'r gronfa genedlaethol. Os yw ffermwr sydd eisoes â hawl i gael y taliad sengl i ffermwyr arferol yn cael hawl i dderbyn taliad mwy o'r gronfa genedlaethol, bydd gwerth y taliad sengl i ffermwyr y mae ganddo hawl iddo'n cael ei godi i werth y taliad o'r gronfa genedlaethol. Unwaith eto, trafodir y mater hwn drwy ymgynghori.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod y teimlad sydd wrth wraidd gwelliant 1, a dywedasom dro ar ôl tro ein bod yn ceisio helpu ffermwyr ifanc. Y gronfa genedlaethol yw'r modd pwysicaf i wneud hynny, er nad yr unig un.

Gan symud ymlaen at yr amlen genedlaethol,

consultation currently underway seeks views on whether or not there is a need for a national envelope in Wales. The envelope may be used to address the environmental issues that might arise from the decoupling of CAP payment from production, or to support marketing or quality initiatives. The regulations allow the use of up to 10 per cent of the total SFPs under each of the relevant sectors—beef, sheep, arable or dairy—for specific measures to support a sector. I have stated previously that I would need to be convinced that an envelope would bring an overall advantage to Welsh farming that would otherwise outweigh the impact on individual farmer receipts under the single farm payment. The consultation paper sets out possible uses in Wales for an envelope.

On timing, all three consultations close on 2 June. Having considered the responses, I hope that I will be able to make decisions by late June or early July.

I note that my speaking time has already reached 11 minutes. I have further information that I can provide Members with during the course of the debate. However, I have set out in some detail the thinking behind the current consultation exercises.

**Mick Bates:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*within the process of reform calls for the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that young people are able to enter the farming industry.*

I thank the Minister for his comprehensive statement on the three critical issues in this consultation. This is the biggest single change in CAP that we have ever witnessed, and its impact could be enormous. I am also grateful to the Minister for stating, in the last meeting of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, that he has also undertaken, as part of his consultation, to bring forward a paper about the market impact of these fundamental changes in

mae'r trydydd ymgynghoriad sy'n mynd rhagddo'n awr yn gofyn barn ynghylch a oes angen amlen genedlaethol yng Nghymru. Gellir defnyddio'r amlen i ymdrin â'r materion amgylcheddol a allai godi yn sgîl datgyplu'r taliad o dan y PAC oddi wrth gynhyrchu, neu i hybu mentrau sy'n ymwneud â marchnata neu wella ansawdd. Mae'r rheoliadau'n caniatáu defnyddio hyd at 10 y cant o gyfanswm y taliadau sengl i ffermwyr o dan bob un o'r sectorau perthnasol—cig eidion, defaid, tir â'r llaeth—ar gyfer mesurau penodol i hybu sector. Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen y byddai'n rhaid imi fod yn sicr y byddai amlen yn dod â mantais gyffredinol i ffermio yng Nghymru a fyddai'n fwy na'r effaith a geid fel arall ar yr arian y byddai ffermwyr unigol yn ei dderbyn o dan y taliad sengl i ffermwyr. Mae'r papur yn nodi'r hyn y gellid defnyddio'r amlen ar ei gyfer yng Nghymru.

Ynghylch amseru, daw'r tri ymgynghoriad hyn i ben ar 2 Mehefin. Ar ôl ystyried yr ymatebion, gobeithiaf y byddaf yn gallu gwneud penderfyniadau erbyn diwedd Mehefin neu ddechrau Gorffennaf.

Sylwaf fy mod eisoes wedi bod yn siarad am 11 munud. Mae gennyf wybodaeth bellach y gallaf ei rhoi i Aelodau yn ystod y ddatl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi nodi'n eithaf manwl y meddwl sy'n sail i'r ymgynghoriadau presennol.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o fewn y broses ddiwygio, i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael mynediad i'r diwydiant ffermio.*

Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad cynhwysfawr ar y tri mater hollbwysig yn yr ymgynghori hwn. Hwn yw'r newid mwyaf i'r PAC a welsom erioed, a gallai gael effaith aruthrol. Yr wyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ddweud, yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, ei fod hefyd wedi ymgymryd, fel rhan o'i ymgynghori, i ddwyn papur gerbron ynghylch yr effaith y bydd y newidiadau sylfaenol hyn mewn



Welsh agriculture. I welcome the consultation, provided that the views expressed within this process are taken on board. The debates that follow will be crucial to the future of our industry. I endorse the philosophy of the CAP reform, which is one of simplification, and, during the debates that follow, we must not lose sight of that need to keep the process simple. I take on board the Minister's comments about not supporting amendment 2, but I am grateful that he will support amendment 1. However, with regard to amendment 2, the minimalist approach it proposes suggests that we should not gold-plate all these regulations, which would disadvantage our farmers in Wales.

I was pleased to hear the Minister use the word 'flexible', with regard to the use of the regulations, and that underpins our attitude in Wales. There must be a flexible interpretation, and I hope that the Minister will be able to answer my first point with regard to that interpretation. Does the Assembly have the capacity to deal with these reforms to ensure that by December 2005, farmers will be able to receive the single payment? The single payment will adversely affect cash flow and receiving it will mean readjustment within individual businesses. I would like to hear the Minister's comments on that.

On the national reserve, the Minister referred to young farmers in Wales. I am indebted to Matthew Vaughan, Anthony Mears, Darren Williams and Bob Davies for raising this critical issue about the future of our industry in Wales. Our amendment 1 seeks to ensure that young people can enter the industry, and we must not disadvantage them in doing so. The Minister must answer crucial questions. Will he go some way at least towards offering a guarantee that young farmers who have entered the industry since the reference period will not lose support? It is crucial that they are not disadvantaged. Will new entrants receive the same support as established farmers? That, within that reference period, is crucial. Finally, what appeal system does the Minister have in mind to deal with individual cases? Those farmers who experienced milk quota

amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru'n ei chael ar y farchnad. Croesawaf yr ymgynghori, ar yr amod yr ystyrir y farn a fynegir yn y broses hon. Bydd y dadleuon a fydd yn dilyn yn hollbwysig i ddyfodol ein diwydiant. Cymeradwyaf yr athroniaeth sy'n sail i'r diwygiadau i'r PAC, sef symleiddio, ac, yn ystod a dadleuon a fydd yn dilyn, rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar yr angen i gadw'r broses yn syml. Ystyriaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch peidio â chefnogi gwelliant 2, ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar y gwnaiff gefnogi gwelliant 1. Er hynny, gyda golwg ar welliant 2, mae'r dull o wneud y lleiaf sy'n angenrheidiol a gynigir ynddo'n awgrymu na ddylem oreuro'r holl reoliadau hyn, gan y byddai hynny'n peri anfantais i'n ffermwyr yng Nghymru.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn defnyddio'r gair 'hyblyg', gyda golwg ar ddefnyddio'r rheoliadau, a hynny sydd wrth wraidd ein hymagwedd yng Nghymru. Rhaid wrth ddehongli hyblyg, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ateb y pwynt cyntaf a wneuthum gyda golwg ar y dehongli hwnnw. A yw'r Cynulliad yn meddu ar ddigon o gapasiti i ddelio â'r diwygiadau hyn er mwyn sicrhau, erbyn Rhagfyr 2005, y bydd ffermwyr yn gallu derbyn y taliad sengl? Bydd y taliad sengl yn amharu ar lif arian a bydd ei dderbyn yn peri y bydd angen ymaddasu mewn busnesau unigol. Carwn glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar hynny.

Ynghylch y gronfa genedlaethol, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at ffermwyr ifanc yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn ddyledus i Matthew Vaughan, Anthony Mears, Darren Williams a Bob Davies am godi'r mater hollbwysig hwn ynghylch dyfodol ein diwydiant yng Nghymru. Mae gwelliant 1 o'n heiddo'n ceisio sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc ddod i'r diwydiant, a rhaid inni beidio â'u rhoi o dan anfantais wrth iddynt wneud hynny. Mae cwestiynau hollbwysig i'w hateb gan y Gweinidog. A wnaiff gymryd rhai camau o leiaf tuag at gynnig gwarant na fydd ffermwyr ifanc a ddaeth i'r diwydiant ers y cyfnod y cyfeirir ato yn colli cymorth? Mae'n hollbwysig nas rhoddir o dan anfantais. A fydd ffermwyr newydd yn cael yr un cymorth â ffermwyr sydd wedi ymsefydlu? Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, o fewn y cyfnod y cyfeirir ato. Yn olaf, pa system

allocations will know that any appeal system must take all factors into account.

In view of the simplification philosophy of the CAP reform, we cannot accept the use of a national envelope. Until now, we have talked about the complexity of the system and the mistakes that that generates in applications by individual businesses, which has led to so many cases of people losing money, compounding their anxiety. Simplification is obviously the rule. We will already see modulation rise from 3.5 per cent to 4.5 per cent. There will be a 3 per cent take-off from the national reserve and that extra 10 per cent would reduce the money to individuals. I cannot therefore recommend that anybody adopts that approach. A much bigger and thornier issue is that of cross-compliance. The principles of Tir Mynydd adopted the idea of cross-compliance, and there are two main issues with regard to that, namely statutory management requirements, and good agricultural practice. I hope that the Minister approaches those issues with flexibility. Article 5 of the statutory management states that organic manure cannot be spread on slopes. Most people will have noticed that there are many hills and sloping fields in Wales. Therefore, if you were to interpret that to the letter of the law, we would lose out.

4.30 p.m.

I hope that there will be a proper procedure, because it stated that all inspections must be carried out before payments can be made. Therefore, I would like to hear you say that you are certain that there is sufficient capacity for inspections to be carried out, because payments cannot be made until inspections have been completed. There is a thorny issue for 350 businesses along the border of Wales that also have land in England, and I hope that this issue will be addressed so that there are no delays. Finally, I end with a quotation from one of the young entrants who was featured in *The Western Mail* on the implications of CAP reform:

'I'm gobsmacked. I can't believe we are

apêl sydd gan y Gweinidog dan sylw i ddelio ag achosion unigol? Bydd y ffermwyr hynny a brofodd ddyrannu'r cwotâu llaeth yn gwybod bod rhaid i unrhyw system apêl roi sylw i'r holl ffactorau.

Yng ngolwg y bwriad i symleiddio wrth ddiwygio'r PAC, ni allwn dderbyn y defnydd o amlen genedlaethol. Hyd yma, yr ydym wedi sôn am gymhlethdod y system a'r camgymeriadau sy'n deillio o hynny mewn ceisiadau gan fusnesau unigol, sydd wedi peri i gymaint o bobl gollu arian, gan ychwanegu at eu pryderon. Mae'n amlwg mai symleiddio yw'r egwyddor a ddilynnir. Byddwn yn gweld modiwlleiddio'n codi o 3.5 y cant i 4.5 y cant, beth bynnag. Cymerir 3 y cant o'r gronfa genedlaethol a byddai'r 10 y cant ychwanegol hwnnw'n golygu y byddai llai o arian i unigolion. Gan hynny, ni allaf argymhell y dylai neb ddilyn y llwybr hwnnw. Mater mwy ac anos o lawer yw trawsgydymffurfio. Mabwysiadwyd y syniad o drawsgydymffurfio yn egwyddorion Tir Mynydd, ac mae dau brif fater yn codi mewn cysylltiad â hynny, sef gofynion rheoli statudol, ac arferion amaethyddol da. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymdrin yn hyblyg â'r materion hynny. Mae erthygl 5 y rheolaeth statudol yn dweud na cheir taenu tail organig ar lechweddau. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi sylwi bod llawer o fryniau a chaeau ar lethr yng Nghymru. Felly, pe byddech yn dehongli hynny'n ôl llythyren y ddeddf, byddem ar ein colled.

Gobeithiaf y ceir gweithdrefn briodol, gan y dywedir y bydd yn rhaid cwblhau'r holl arolygiadau cyn y gellir rhoi taliadau. Gan hynny, carwn gael sicrwydd gennych fod digon o gapasiti i allu cwblhau arolygiadau, gan na ellir rhoi taliadau hyd nes y bydd arolygiadau wedi'u cwblhau. Mae mater anodd yn codi yn achos 350 o fusnesau ar hyd ffin Cymru sydd â thir yn Lloegr hefyd, a gobeithiaf yr ymdrinnir â'r mater hwn fel na cheir oedi. Yn olaf, terfynaf drwy ddyfynnu geiriau un o'r ffermwyr newydd a gafodd sylw yn *The Western Mail* ynghylch goblygiadau'r diwygiadau i'r PAC:

Yr wyf wedi fy syfrdanu. Ni allaf gredu y

going to preserve all the old farmers and kick out the young ones.’

Minister, please, for the sake and the future of our industry, do not let that happen.

**Brynle Williams:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add as two new points at the end of the motion:

*takes a minimalist approach with regard to the cross-compliance controls which will be applied.*

*makes provision to safeguard young farmers and new entrants who have come into farming outside of the specified period who may only receive the ‘area average’ entitlement.*

First, I declare an interest because I am a practising farmer. The issue that we are debating is important. I agree with the motion, but it needs additional strands to make it more structured and more inclusive for all farmers, both established and new. All farmers would agree that we should take a minimalist approach with regard to the cross-compliance controls, to which you referred and showed which part will be applied. I hope that reducing the six main support schemes to one will assist in cutting down the amount of form filling and bureaucracy associated with previous schemes. This needs to be closely monitored to ensure that all is working well, as planned. Regular meetings and contact with farmers and their unions need to be convened, with feedback used for future planning.

I am pleased to see that the Minister has listened to the farming communities and unions in Wales, and agrees that the single farm payment will be beneficial to the vast majority of people living and farming in Wales. My only concern relates to the new and young farmers who are starting out—they need special consideration, as the single farm payment will not work for them. Therefore, I hope that you, Minister, will support amendment 2 in good faith and recognise the importance of supporting people who are entering the farming industry

byddwn yn cadw’r hen ffermwyr i gyd a chael gwared ar y rhai ifanc.

Weinidog, os gwelwch yn dda, er mwyn ein diwydiant a’i ddyfodol, peidiwch â gadael i hynny ddigwydd.

**Brynle Williams:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu dau bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gwneud y lleiaf sy’n angenrheidiol wrth roi’r amodau trawsgydymffurfio ar waith.*

*yn darparu ar gyfer diogelu ffermwyr ifanc a newydd-ddyfodiaid i ffermio sydd wedi dechrau y tu allan i’r cyfnod penodedig ac a fydd o bosibl ond yn cael yr hawl i’r ‘cyfartaledd arwynebedd’.*

Yn gyntaf, datganaf fuddiant gan fy mod yn ffermio. Mae’r mater dan sylw yn y ddadl hon yn un pwysig. Cytunaf â’r cynnig, ond rhaid ychwanegu elfennau ato i’w wneud yn fwy trefnus a chynhwysol mewn cysylltiad â’r holl ffermwyr, rhai sydd wedi ymsefydlu a rhai newydd. Byddai pob ffermwr yn cytuno y dylem wneud y lleiaf sy’n angenrheidiol gyda golwg ar y rheolaethau ar draws gydymffurfio, y cyfeiriasoch atynt gan nodi pa ran a gymhwysir. Gobeithiaf y bydd lleihau nifer y prif gynlluniau cymorth o chwech i un yn gymorth i gwtogi ar y gwaith llenwi ffurflenni a’r fiwrocratiaeth a oedd yn gysylltiedig â’r cynlluniau blaenorol. Rhaid monitro hyn yn fanwl i sicrhau bod popeth yn gweithio yn ôl y bwriad. Rhaid cynnull cyfarfodydd rheolaidd a chysylltiadau â ffermwyr a’u hundebau, a defnyddio’r adborth ar gyfer cynllunio yn y dyfodol.

Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Gweinidog wedi gwrandao ar y cymunedau a’r undebau ffermio yng Nghymru, a’i fod yn cytuno y bydd y taliad sengl i ffermwyr yn llesol i’r mwyafrif helaeth sy’n byw ac yn ffermio yng Nghymru. Yr unig fater yr wyf yn pryderu yn ei gylch yw ffermwyr newydd a ffermwyr ifanc sy’n dechrau arni—rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth arbennig iddynt, gan na fydd y taliad sengl i ffermwyr o fudd iddynt hwy. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, felly, y byddwch chi, Weinidog, yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn ddidwyll ac yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw

for the first time. The single farm payment will replace the existing, direct, main support schemes, for example, the arable area payment scheme, the suckler cow premium scheme, and so on. It will also include associated payments like the less-favoured area supplement on sheep. If implemented properly, and on time, this will make life much easier for farming communities in Wales. I hope that the changes will give farmers greater control over their affairs and cut unnecessary red tape.

I hope that the Government will provide sufficient support for environmentally sustainable farming in Wales, which will increase the rapid development of such farming, which in turn will provide consumers with excellent, high-quality products. This should enable farmers to make decisions in response to the market, not in response to the rules or incentives of a subsidy scheme. I look forward to the promotion and encouragement of sustainable farming.

While we have welcomed the statements made by the Welsh Assembly Government on the operation of the single farm payment in Wales, there is some concern that WAG will struggle to meet an ambitious implementation programme. Almost 12 months have passed since the reform was agreed in Luxembourg, and the implementing regulations are not yet available in their final form—they have not been published in the official journal. We are working to a timetable in which farmers should be paid their single farm payment in December 2005, but little of the detailed work on individual entitlement and, more particularly, on the national reserve and the appeals process has been done. Cash-flow is obviously crucial to all farm businesses, and a huge amount of work will be required over the next 18 months to ensure timely payments. We would, therefore, hope that sufficient resources are made available to ensure that these targets are met.

I am a politician who likes to speak his mind. I am the first to stand up and criticise when the Government is doing wrong, but I am also the first to stand up and commend good

helpu pobl sy'n dod i'r diwydiant ffermio am y tro cyntaf. Bydd y taliad sengl i ffermwyr yn cymryd lle'r prif gynlluniau cymorth uniongychol a geir ar hyn o bryd, er enghraifft, y cynllun taliadau arwynebedd tir âr, y cynllun premiwm buchod sugno, ac yn y blaen. Os caiff ei weithredu'n iawn, ac yn brydlon, gwnaiff fywyd yn llawer haws i gymunedau ffermio yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y newidiadau'n rhoi mwy o reolaeth i ffermwyr dros eu materion eu hunain ac yn cwtogi ar fiwrocratiaeth ddiangen.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi digon o gymorth ar gyfer ffermio amgylcheddol gynaliadwy yng Nghymru, fel y bydd ffermio o'r fath yn datblygu'n gyflym, gan roi cynhyrchion rhagorol o ansawdd da i ddefnyddwyr. Dylai hyn alluogi ffermwyr i wneud penderfyniadau mewn ymateb i'r farchnad, nid mewn ymateb i reolau neu anogaethau unrhyw gynllun cymorthdaliadau. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld hybu a hyrwyddo ffermio cynaliadwy.

Er ein bod wedi croesawu'r datganiadau a wnaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar weithredu'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr yng Nghymru, mae cryn bryder y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei chael yn anodd cyflawni'r rhaglen weithredu uchelgeisiol hon. Aeth ymron i 12 mis heibio ers cytuno ar y diwygiadau yn Lwcsembwrg, ac nid yw'r rheoliadau ar gyfer eu gweithredu ar gael eto ar eu ffurf derfynol—nis cyhoeddwyd yn y cyfnodolyn swyddogol. Yr ydym yn dilyn amserlen sy'n golygu y dylai ffermwyr gael eu taliad sengl i ffermwyr yn Rhagfyr 2005, ond ychydig iawn o waith a wnaed ar y gwaith manwl ynghylch hawliau unigolion ac, yn fwy penodol, ar y gronfa genedlaethol a'r broses apeliadau. Mae'n amlwg bod llif arian yn hollbwysig i bob busnes fferm, a bydd angen cyflawni gwaith aruthrol dros y 18 mis nesaf i sicrhau y gwneir taliadau'n brydlon. Byddem yn gobeithio, felly, fod digon o adnoddau wedi'u darparu i sicrhau y cyrhaeddir y targedau hynny.

Yr wyf yn wleidydd sy'n hoffi siarad heb flewyn ar ei dafod. Myfi yw'r cyntaf i sefyll ar ei draed a beirniadu pan yw'r Llywodraeth yn methu, ond myfi yw'r cyntaf hefyd i

work. The amended motion would certainly send out a strong signal to the farming communities throughout the principality that we in the National Assembly want to support farmers and the excellent work that they do for the people of Wales and, indeed, the United Kingdom.

I have spoken to members of the farming community and they are pleased with the proposals. The only negative comments that I have heard relate to the implementation of the scheme. Minister, you will remember the horrendous problems farmers that endured under your predecessor, especially with regard to late payments and the infamous computer problems. That must not happen again. Farmers have said that the scheme will be a significant boost to agriculture, the countryside and the rural economy. We, as an Assembly, must ensure that the scheme works properly and on time for the people of Wales. If this is successful, it will have a positive impact on our daily lives. I urge all Members, from all political spectrums, to support the motion and the amendments.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales is content to endorse the Government's decision to adopt the historic payment model as the basis for the new common agricultural policy single farm payments. We welcome the consultation on issues relating to cross-compliance, the national reserve and the national envelope. Given that this debate comes before the end of the consultation period, we have decided not to amend the Government's motion. However, we endorse the concerns about young entrants expressed in the Liberal Democrats' amendment, and we will therefore support it. We will abstain on the Conservatives' amendment. We concur that the regime required to meet the statutory management requirement to maintain the land in good agricultural and environmental conditions should not be overly onerous. We are concerned, however, as the Minister said, that the word 'minimalist' in the Conservatives' amendment suggests a negative approach to meeting those requirements.

A justification for ongoing public financial

sefyll ar ei draed a chanmol gwaith da. Byddai'r cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio'n sicr o gyfleu neges bendant i'r cymunedau ffermio ledled y dywysogaeth i'r perwyl ein bod ni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn dymuno cefnogi ffermwyr a'r gwaith rhagorol a wnânt dros bobl Cymru ac, yn wir, dros y Deyrnas Unedig.

Yr wyf wedi siarad â phobl yn y byd ffermio ac maent yn fodlon ar y cynigion. Yr unig sylwadau negyddol a glywais yw rhai sy'n ymwneud â gweithredu'r cynllun. Weinidog, byddwch yn cofio'r problemau arswydus a brofodd ffermwyr o dan eich rhagflaenydd, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar daliadau hwyr a'r problemau gwarthus â chyfrifiaduron. Ni chaiff hynny ddigwydd eto. Mae ffermwyr wedi dweud y bydd y cynllun yn rhoi hwb sylweddol i amaethyddiaeth, cefn gwlad a'r economi wledig. Rhaid i ni, fel Cynulliad, sicrhau y bydd y cynllun yn gweithio'n iawn ac yn brydlon er mwyn pobl Cymru. Os bydd yn llwyddo, caiff effaith gadarnhaol ar ein bywydau beunyddiol. Anogaf yr holl Aelodau, o bob lliw gwleidyddol, i gefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn fodlon cymeradwyo penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i fabwysiadu'r model talu hanesyddol yn sail i'r taliadau sengl i ffermwyr newydd o dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Croesawn yr ymgynghori ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â thrawsgydymffurfio, y gronfa genedlaethol a'r amlen genedlaethol. Gan fod y ddadl hon yn digwydd cyn diwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori, yr ydym wedi penderfynu peidio â chynnig gwelliannau i gynnig y Llywodraeth. Er hynny, yr ydym yn ategu'r pryderon ynghylch newydd-ddyfodiaid ifanc a fynegir yng ngwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ac felly byddwn yn ei gefnogi. Byddwn yn ymatal rhag pleidleisio ar welliant y Ceidwadwyr. Cytunwn na ddylai'r gyfundrefn y mae ei hangen i ateb y gofyniad rheoli statudol i gadw tir mewn cyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da fod yn rhy feichus. Yr ydym yn bryderus, er hynny, fod y geiriau 'y lleiaf' yng ngwelliant y Ceidwadwyr yn awgrymu ymagwedd negyddol at fodloni'r gofynion hynny.

Un cyfiawnhad dros barhau i roi cymorth

support for farming is the role of farming businesses as the custodians of the countryside. It would be wrong of us to use language in this debate that might suggest that the industry does not embrace that role enthusiastically. The trick for the Minister, as he said, will be to ensure a light-touch approach to cross-compliance and to avoid unnecessary bureaucracy, while at the same time setting and monitoring standards that the wider public would endorse as reasonable and complying with EU law.

With regard to the national reserve, I refer the Minister to the minutes of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee of 24 March. Those minutes show his officials indicating that,

‘new entrants would not automatically qualify for access to the national reserve’.

Elsewhere, the Minister has expressed his concern about new entrants. The Minister cannot be surprised that the public is in some confusion about where he stands on this matter and that young farmers are concerned. We welcome the Minister’s positive comments today about an automatic entitlement for new entrants; we endorse such an approach. The future of the Welsh countryside and rural communities depends on a strong and innovative farming industry. The current age profile of farming is not sustainable, and we need a national strategic approach to address this issue. Also with regard to the national reserve, I hope that the Minister can assure us that any farmers that have to go through appeals’ processes will not be subjected to unnecessary delays. A benefit of the new system to the industry is supposed to be a reduction in bureaucracy, and the Minister must ensure that that benefit is delivered.

We believe that the jury is out on the idea of a national envelope. Indeed, we share the Minister’s scepticism. We are concerned about the possible complexities of such a scheme, and we seek his assurance today that any moneys deducted from single farm payments under any national envelope would

ariannol cyhoeddus i ffermio yw’r rôl sydd gan fusnesau ffermio fel ceidwaid cefn gwlad. Ni fyddai’n iawn inni ddefnyddio geiriau yn y ddadl hon a allai awgrymu nad yw’r diwydiant yn ymgymryd â’r rôl honno’n frwdfrydig. Y gamp i’r Gweinidog, fel y dywedodd, fydd sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â thrawsgydymffurfio â chyffyrddiad ysgafn gan osgoi biwrocratiaeth ddiangen ac, ar yr un pryd, pennu a monitro safonau y bydd y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol yn eu cymeradwyo fel rhai rhesymol sy’n cydymffurfio â chyfraith yr UE.

Gyda golwg ar y gronfa genedlaethol, cyfeiriai y Gweinidog at gofnodion Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar 24 Mawrth. Gwelir yn y cofnodion hynny fod ei swyddogion yn nodi

‘na fyddai hawl wyr newydd yn cael manteisio’n awtomatig ar y gronfa genedlaethol’.

Mewn man arall, mae’r Gweinidog wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch newydd-ddyfodiaid. Ni ddylai’r Gweinidog synnu bod rhywfaint o ddryswch ymysg y cyhoedd ynghylch ei safbwynt ar y mater hwn a bod ffermwyr ifanc yn bryderus. Croesawn sylwadau cadarnhaol y Gweinidog heddiw am hawl awtomatig i newydd-ddyfodiaid; cefnogwn ddull gweithredu o’r fath. Mae dyfodol cefn gwlad a chymunedau gwledig Cymru’n dibynnu ar ddiwydiant ffermio cadarn ac arloesol. Nid yw proffil oedran presennol ffermio yn gynaliadwy, ac mae arnom angen strategaeth genedlaethol i ymdrin â’r mater hwn. Hefyd gyda golwg ar y gronfa genedlaethol, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ein sicrhau na fydd unrhyw ffermwyr sy’n gorfod dilyn prosesau apeliadau’n profi oedi diangen. Un o fanteision tybiedig y system newydd i’r diwydiant yw y ceir llai o fiwrocratiaeth, a rhaid i’r Gweinidog sicrhau y gwiredir hynny.

Credwn fod angen rhoi ystyriaeth bellach i’r syniad o amlen genedlaethol. Yn wir, rhannwn amheuan y Gweinidog. Yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch y dryswch a allai godi mewn cynllun o’r fath, a cheisiwn sicrwydd ganddo heddiw na fyddai unrhyw arian a dynnir o daliadau sengl i ffermwyr o dan

not be used to replace funding for any scheme currently funded by the Welsh Assembly Government, and, further, that any scheme that he may propose under the national envelope would be subject to a rigorous cost-benefit analysis before its implementation. Basically, we share the Minister's scepticism, and that expressed by others, with regard to the usefulness of a national envelope in Wales.

I would be grateful if the Minister, in his reply, would update the Assembly on the possibility of using match-funded voluntary modulation to fund an entry-level scheme. This matter has been under discussion for some time and, although I realise that it is complex, surely a decision on what is needed when we consider how the funds should be used under CAP reform should take this matter into account, as modulation may be needed to address any gaps that exist.

4.40 p.m.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** I, too, welcome this debate and the discussion of the consultation documents on CAP reform. On the national reserve, it is only right that the single farm payment is an historic payment, as that will cover the majority of farmers in Wales. As the Minister said, the flexibility that allows us to consider individual cases requiring completion under the discretionary categories will be built in. That will include farmers who have commenced farming within the reference period or those who have undergone restructuring or development. Therefore, there is flexibility for us to consider the young farmers who Mick Bates mentioned and to whom I have also spoken. I was also glad to hear the Minister say that he was happy to meet young farmers to discuss these issues. That must be welcomed.

The Labour Government is determined that young farmers will not be ignored in the farming sector or farming environment in Wales, because, after all, they are the future

unrhyw amlen genedlaethol yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn lle cyllid ar gyfer unrhyw gynllun sy'n cael ei gyllido ar hyn o bryd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac, ymhellach, y byddid yn cynnal dadansoddiad trwyadl o gost a budd unrhyw gynllun y gallai ei gynnig o dan yr amlen genedlaethol cyn ei weithredu. Yn y bôn, rhannwn amheuan y Gweinidog, a'r rhai a fynegwyd gan eraill, gyda golwg ar fuddioldeb amlen genedlaethol yng Nghymru.

Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog, wrth ymateb, yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio modiwlleiddio gwirfoddol gyda chyllid cyfatebol i gyllido cynllun lefel mynediad. Bu trafod ar y mater hwn ers cryn amser ac, er fy mod yn sylweddoli ei fod yn gymhleth, mae'n sicr y dylid ystyried y mater hwn wrth benderfynu sut y dylid defnyddio'r cyllid o dan y diwygiadau i'r PAC, gan ei bod yn bosibl y bydd angen modiwlleiddio er mwyn llenwi unrhyw fylchau a geir.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r ddadl hon a'r drafodaeth ar y dogfennau ymgynghori ar y diwygiadau i'r PAC. Ynghylch y gronfa genedlaethol, nid yw ond yn iawn i'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr fod yn daliad hanesyddol, gan y bydd yn cynnwys y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, bydd yr hyblygrwydd i ystyried achosion unigol y mae angen penderfynu arnynt o dan y categorïau yr ymdrinnir â hwy yn ôl disgrisiwn yn rhan o hynny. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys ffermwyr sydd wedi dechrau ffermio yn y cyfnod y cyfeirir ato a'r rhai sydd wedi ymgymryd ag ailstrwythuro neu ddatblygu. Felly, mae hyblygrwydd ar gael fel y gallwn ystyried y ffermwyr ifanc y cyfeiriodd Mick Bates atynt, yr wyf fi wedi siarad â hwy hefyd. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o glywed gan y Gweinidog ei fod yn fodlon cwrdd â ffermwyr ifanc i drafod y materion hyn. Dylid croesawu hynny.

Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn benderfynol na chaiff ffermwyr ifanc eu hanwybyddu yn y sector ffermio neu ym myd ffermio yng Nghymru, oherwydd, wedi'r cwbl, hwy yw

of farming. I welcome the work done by the Wales Young Farmers' Clubs in rural areas, both the direct work that they do in relation to farming and business and the work that they do in social and community terms. Young farmers contribute a great deal to our rural communities and are of great benefit to them.

I welcome the fact that we have an opportunity to discuss a cross-compliance consultation. Everybody wants cross-compliance to be as simple as possible—in other words no major changes from the existing European Union directives or regulations—but we must use it as a stepping stone to look to the future in terms of improving environmental management. Mick mentioned this issue earlier. Cross-compliance is not a stick to beat people with; it is about ensuring that those who are taking care of the countryside continue to do so to the highest possible level.

I am pleased that certain issues have been mentioned in detail in the paper: the need to preserve peat bogs for example. These rare areas may not necessarily be sites of scientific interest, but they naturally preserve amazing flora and fauna. Cross-compliance will mean that those peat bogs are not damaged and that they are protected and, perhaps, fed without the land being damaged and or drained so that it can be put to another agricultural use. We will also retain the ability to tackle such invasive and damaging plants as Japanese knotweed. Therefore, cross-compliance will not prohibit the farmer or the person caring for the land from protecting it from damage from invasive plants.

However, I would like one issue to be strengthened under cross-compliance. Although hedgerows and the deadlines for cutting them are mentioned in the paper, I want us to discourage local authorities and farmers from using hedge-whackers. It is right that a specific timetable on cutting hedgerows is given because of the disturbance that that causes to wildlife. However, hedge-whackers are extraordinarily damaging to our natural hedgerows, which we should be protecting. I would like us to move forward on that.

dyfodol ffermio. Croesawaf y gwaith a wnaed gan Glybiau Ffermwyr Ifanc Cymru mewn ardaloedd gwledig, drwy'r gwaith uniongyrchol â wnânt mewn cysylltiad â ffermio a busnes a'u gwaith cymdeithasol a chymunedol. Mae ffermwyr ifanc yn cyfrannu llawer iawn i'n cymunedau gwledig ac maent o fudd mawr iddynt.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod gennym gyfle i drafod yr ymgynghori ar drawsgydymffurfio. Mae pawb yn dymuno i drawsgydymffurfio fod cyn symled ag y bo modd—hynny yw, heb unrhyw newidiadau o bwys i gyfarwydddebau a rheoliadau presennol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—ond rhaid inni ei ddefnyddio fel modd i ystyried y dyfodol o ran gwella rheoli amgylcheddol. Cyfeiriodd Mick at y mater hwn yn gynharach. Nid ffon i guro pobl yw trawsgydymffurfio; mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau y bydd y rhai sy'n gofalu am gefn gwlad yn dal i wneud hynny hyd eithaf eu gallu.

Yr wyf yn falch bod ymdriniaeth fanwl â rhai materion yn y papur: yr angen i gadw mawnogydd, er enghraifft. Nid yw'r llecynnau prin hynny'n safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol ym mhob achos, ond maent yn fannau naturiol sy'n cadw fflora a ffawna rhyfeddol. O ganlyniad i drawsgydymffurfio, ni ddifrod y mawnogydd hynny ac fe'u diogelir a'u porthi heb ddifrodi neu ddraenio'r tir fel y gellir ei ddefnyddio at ddiben amaethyddol arall. Byddwn hefyd yn dal i allu ymdrin â phlanhigion ymledol a niweidiol fel canclwm Siapan. Felly, ni fydd trawsgydymffurfio'n atal y ffarmwr neu'r sawl sy'n gofalu am y tir rhag ei ddiogelu rhag difrod gan blanhigion ymledol.

Er hynny, mae un mater y carwn weld ei gryfhau o dan drawsgydymffurfio. Er bod sôn am wrychoedd a'r terfynau amser ar gyfer eu torri yn y papur, yr wyf am ein gweld yn annog awdurdodau lleol a ffermwyr i beidio â defnyddio peiriannau colbio gwrychoedd. Mae'n briodol rhoi amserlen benodol ar gyfer torri gwrychoedd gan fod hynny'n aflonyddu ar fywyd gwyllt. Fodd bynnag, mae peiriannau colbio gwrychoedd yn peri difrod eithriadol i'n gwrychoedd naturiol, y dylem fod yn eu diogelu. Carwn ein gweld yn cymryd camau



ynghylch hynny.

Finally—and I do not want to go into this in too much detail—in his speech, Mick mentioned article 5 of the directive. My understanding of article 5 is that it specifically relates to nitrate vulnerable zones, namely those areas which are already in danger of damage from nitrate. This is not an attempt to be difficult about the use of organic manure; it is an effort to protect the water table and those areas that are already in danger of being damaged. Therefore, we should discuss this issue openly, not reject it because steep slopes are involved. Yes, Wales has many steep slopes, but we are talking about vulnerable areas where the effect could be so severely damaging that it would take years to repair.

**Michael German:** I will make two points. First, the CAP reform is welcome. One of its contexts is simplification. I sometimes wonder whether we could simplify the language that we use. The consequence of having had a deep-seated, huge subsidy regime for so many years is that people have talked a whole new language for decades, which has become inbred in the system, but which many people outside find impenetrable. Crucial issues are being debated here about the future of the countryside and the future management of our landscape and land, which is common sense and straightforward. Therefore, would the Minister reflect on the terminology that we use for the future?

My main point relates to the crucial issue, which seems to be coming out of the context of the historic payment system—which was the right way to go—of how young people can engage in farming and how we can change the age profile of farming in Wales. This is not new—it has not come about as a result of this whole change in the CAP. However, the opportunity now arises, because there is access to some funding, for us to be able to address this major issue. It is probably the principal issue for the whole of rural Wales, in terms of the outward migration of young people and the effect that has on rural crafts and skills, as well as

Yn olaf—ac nid wyf am fynd i ormod o fanylder ar hyn—yn ei araith, cyfeiriodd Mick at erthygl 5 y gyfarwyddeb. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf am erthygl 5, mae'n ymwneud yn benodol â pharthau sy'n agored i nitradau, sef y llecynnau hynny sydd eisoes mewn perygl o gael eu difrodi gan nitradau. Nid ymgais i rwystro'r defnydd o dail organig yw hyn; mae'n ymgais i ddiogelu'r lefelau trwythiad ac mae'r llecynnau hynny eisoes mewn perygl o gael eu difrodi. Felly, dylem drafod y mater hwn yn agored, ac nid ei wrthod am ei fod yn ymwneud â llechweddau serth. Oes, mae llawer o lechweddau serth yng Nghymru, ond yr ydym yn sôn am lecynnau a allai gael eu difrodi lle y gallai'r effaith fod mor niweidiol fel y cymerai flynyddoedd i'w chywiro.

**Michael German:** Gwnaf ddau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, mae'r diwygiadau i'r PAC i'w croesawu. Un o'r cyd-destunau i hynny yw symleiddio. Meddyliaf weithiau tybed a allem symleiddio'r iaith a ddefnyddiwn. Y canlyniad o gael cyfundrefn gymorthdaliadau anferth a hirsefydlog ers cynifer o flynyddoedd yw bod pobl yn defnyddio iaith gwbl newydd ers degawdau, a bod hynny wedi dod yn rhan annatod o'r system, ond bod llawer y tu allan yn methu â'i deall. Mae materion hollbwysig yn cael eu trafod yma ynghylch dyfodol cefn gwlad a'r dull o reoli ein tirwedd a'n tir yn y dyfodol, ac mae hynny'n synhwyrol ac yn syml. Felly, a wnaiff y Gweinidog fyfyrion ynghylch y derminoleg a ddefnyddiwn ar gyfer y dyfodol?

Mae'r prif bwynt sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â'r mater hollbwysig, yr ymddengys ei fod yn codi yng nghyd-destun y system talu hanesyddol—sef y llwybr yr oedd yn briodol ei ddilyn—o'r modd y gall pobl ifanc ddechrau ffermio a sut y gallwn newid proffil oedran ffermio yng Nghymru. Nid peth newydd yw hyn—ni chododd o ganlyniad i'r newid mawr hwn yn y PAC. Fodd bynnag, ceir cyfle'n awr, am fod rhywfaint o gyllid ar gael, inni allu trafod y pwnc pwysig hwn. Mae'n debyg mai hwn yw'r prif destun trafod ledled Cymru wledig, o ran allfudiad pobl ifanc ac effaith hynny ar grefftiau a sgiliau gwledig, yn ogystal â sgiliau ffermio.

farming skills.

There are two sides to the issue. One is the financial appeal of being able to get the single farm payment, and the second is related to land and the accessibility to land. If you were to start a small business in the countryside, which for many farmers is what farming is, would you start with a business plan that looks like many current farming business plans, which has largely been a distorting factor on the way in which people can buy-in their inputs and sell their outputs? The answer would probably be 'no'. Therefore, there is a chance with this reform to make farming a sensible business for people to enter into in the longer term. The opportunity through the national reserve to offset and to deal with the single farm payment and to make it relevant and accessible to people who are planning their businesses in the future as farmers is important. Making it accessible is equally important because, if you cannot get your hands on the money, you will not be able to put forward a business plan.

The other issue, which is probably just as difficult, is what you do about land availability for those who are not in a farming family, and will therefore not get a farm passed on to them, or who will perhaps only get a portion of a farm passed on to them, and who want to engage in farming. In this context, the former local authority smallholding scheme, which was a way of allowing people to get into farming without having to purchase land outright, is important. However, the scheme has fallen partially into decline in many local authorities in Wales. I wonder whether there is any merit in thinking and rethinking the accessibility of land and the ability of local government to be able to provide access to land again in the future in order to create this opportunity?

The Minister referred to the three-years-leasing problem that young farmers may face in coming in. I am glad that he has acknowledged that, because sometimes you cannot access land on a long-term lease. You cannot always get it with a lifespan. You will do what many small businesses do any way, which is to lease your capital premises, in

Mae dwy ochr i'r mater hwn. Un ohonynt yw'r apêl ariannol o allu cael y taliad sengl i ffermwyr, ac mae'r ail yn ymwneud â thir a'r gallu i gael gafael ar dir. Pe byddech yn cychwyn busnes bach yng nghefn gwlad—a dyna yw ffermio yng ngolwg llawer o ffermwyr—a fyddech yn dechrau drwy gael cynllun busnes tebyg i lawer o'r cynlluniau busnes ffermio a geir ar hyn o bryd, gan eu bod mewn sawl achos wedi ystumio'r modd y gall pobl brynu a gwerthu cynnyrch? 'Na fyddwn' fyddai'r ateb, yn ôl pob tebyg. Felly, mae cyfle wrth ddiwygio fel hyn i beri i ffermio fod yn fusnes synhwyrol y gall pobl fynd iddo yn y tymor hwy. Mae'r cyfle a geir drwy'r gronfa genedlaethol i wrthbwyso a delio â'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr a pheri iddo fod yn berthnasol ac yn hawdd ei gael i rai sy'n cynllunio eu busnesau yn y dyfodol fel ffermwyr yn un pwysig. Mae yr un mor bwysig peri iddo fod yn hawdd ei gael oherwydd, os na allwch gael yr arian yn eich dwylo, ni fyddwch yn gallu cyflwyno cynllun busnes.

Y mater arall, sydd yr un mor anodd, mae'n debyg, yw'r hyn y gellir ei wneud i ofalu bod tir ar gael i rai nad ydynt yn perthyn i deulu o ffermwyr, na fydd fferm yn cael ei throsglwyddo iddynt felly, neu a fydd efallai'n cael dim ond rhan o fferm, a hwythau am ddechrau ffermio. Yn y cyddestun hwn, mae'r cynllun gosod tyddynnod o eiddo awdurdodau lleol a gaed gynt, a oedd yn fodd i adael i bobl ddechrau ffermio heb orfod prynu tir yn syth, yn un pwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynllun wedi dechrau dirywio mewn sawl awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Tybed a oes unrhyw fudd mewn ystyried sut y gellid darparu tir a gallu llywodraeth leol i alluogi pobl i gael tir eto yn y dyfodol er mwyn creu'r cyfle hwn?

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y broblem y gall ffermwyr ifanc ei phrofi wrth ddechrau os ydynt yn cymryd prydles dros dair blynedd. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod wedi cydnabod hynny, oherwydd weithiau ni ellir cael tir ar brydles dymor hir. Ni ellir ei gael ar hyd oes bob amser. Gwneir yr hyn a wnaiff llawer o fusnesau bach pa un bynnag, sef cymryd

this case the land, over a short period. Related to that is accessibility to loan money and to repayments, and so on. Could the Minister address how accessibility to land and the national reserve could be used for that purpose, to help people plan their businesses?

Overall, there are opportunities in the CAP reform to create a new environment that values the family farm and the small farm as a potential long-term ambition for those younger people in the business, which will drive it forward for decades to come, rather than it becoming the regime of older people.

4.50 p.m.

**Lynne Neagle:** As Members will know, I am a strong supporter of CAP reform. This policy destroys the lives of farmers and their families in the developing world. I will focus today on the need for further reform. Next week, I have the pleasure of hosting an Oxfam event in the Assembly. Oxfam is one of the world's most respected advocates of international trade justice. In January, it published a report entitled 'Spotlight on subsidies—Cereal injustice under CAP in Britain', which I encourage Members to read, as it makes interesting, though disturbing, reading. Drawing from the limited pool of available evidence, the report makes a powerful case for reform. Next week, Oxfam will make several key demands of AMs that could make a real difference to the developing world. I hope Members who say that they support social justice for the developing world will support their words with action. I hope that they will support the call for an early phase-out of export subsidies, which lead to export dumping on international markets, and the call for a payment ceiling for individual producers. The Assembly Government should be arguing for a ceiling to be set at £50,000 on all payments with immediate effect, to be reduced over time. The Assembly could use the resources saved to further our social justice agenda by tackling poverty in rural and urban communities.

eiddo cyfalaf ar brydles, sef y tir yn yr achos hwn, dros gyfnod byr. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny y mae'r gallu i gael arian ar fenthyg a'i dalu'n ôl, ac yn y blaen. A allai'r Gweinidog ymdrin â'r modd y gellid defnyddio'r gallu i gael tir ac arian o'r gronfa genedlaethol i'r diben hwnnw, i helpu pobl i gynllunio eu busnesau?

Yn gyffredinol, ceir cyfleoedd drwy'r diwygiadau i'r PAC i greu amgylchedd newydd sy'n trysori'r fferm deuluol a'r fferm fach fel uchelgais tymor hir posibl i rai iau yn y busnes, a fydd yn ei hyrwyddo am ddegawdau i ddod, yn hytrach nag iddo ddod yn faes i bobl hŷn.

**Lynne Neagle:** Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, yr wyf yn bleidiol iawn i ddiwygio'r PAC. Mae'r polisi hwn yn dinistrio bywydau ffermwyr a'u teuluoedd yn y byd sy'n datblygu. Canolbwyntiaf heddiw ar yr angen am ddiwygio pellach. Yr wythnos nesaf, caf y pleser o lywyddu mewn digwyddiad o eiddo Oxfam yn y Cynulliad. Oxfam yw un o'r dadleuwyr uchaf eu parch drwy'r byd dros gyfiawnder mewn masnach ryngwladol. Ym mis Ionawr, cyhoeddodd adroddiad o'r enw 'Spotlight on subsidies—Cereal injustice under CAP in Britain', yr anogaf Aelodau i'w ddarllen, gan ei fod yn ddi-ddorol, ond yn peri pryder er hynny. Gan ddefnyddio'r dystiolaeth brin sydd ar gael, mae'r adroddiad yn cyflwyno dadl gref dros ddiwygio. Yr wythnos nesaf, bydd Oxfam yn gwneud sawl galwad bwysig ar ACau a allai wneud gwir wahaniaeth i'r byd sy'n datblygu. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau a ddywed eu bod o blaid cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r byd sy'n datblygu yn ategu eu geiriau drwy weithredu. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn cefnogi'r alwad am ddileu cymorthdaliadau allforio'n raddol ac yn fuan, gan eu bod yn arwain at waredu allforion ar farchnadoedd rhyngwladol, a'r alwad am derfyn taliadau i gynhyrchwyr unigol. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddadlau dros bennu terfyn o £50,000 ar yr holl daliadau ar unwaith, a'i ostwng dros amser. Gallai'r Cynulliad ddefnyddio'r adnoddau a arbedir i hyrwyddo ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol drwy fynd i'r afael â thlodi mewn cymunedau gwledig a threfol.

The Minister may wish to commit to a call today for the public disclosure of CAP payments. We should have an open and transparent system in which we know how many farmers are in receipt of subsidies of over £20,000 and every £10,000 thereafter.

I hope that Members will endorse calls for more support within the CAP system for less intensive agriculture. Less than 1 per cent of CAP support is currently targeted at organic agriculture. By increasing support to the organic sector, the Assembly has the power to reduce export surpluses, to improve our environment and to address the health concerns of consumers.

The Labour Party is an internationalist party. It believes that power, prosperity and opportunity should lie in the hands of the many, not the few. At a recent Labour Party conference, the Minister spoke of CAP reform and stated that we still have further to go. He acknowledged the detrimental effect that CAP was having on the economy of the developing world and that the Assembly has a moral duty to act as an agent for reform. It is time to match those words with action. What will we say to the Welsh agriculture sector? It is not enough to call for reforms from others when we refuse to commit ourselves, as if our indefensible reliance on subsidies is somehow less reprehensible than everyone else's. Farmers in the developing world do not have public relations machines, like those of supermarkets or farmers' unions, to defend their interests. They rely on the co-operation of governments. The Assembly Government and the Assembly should set an example to others and ensure that reform happens more quickly. Let us use our voice to speak out for reform. Our commitment to social justice demands it.

**Lisa Francis:** Future European farm payments made to Welsh farmers on a historic basis will act as a major boost to the survival of traditional Welsh livestock farms. It is also welcome that new SFPs can be made at a regional level for the first time.

Efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn dymuno ymrwmo i alw heddiw am ddatgelu yn gyhoeddus y taliadau a wneir o dan y PAC. Dylem gael system agored a thryloyw lle y gwyddom pa sawl ffermwr sy'n derbyn cymorthdaliadau o fwy na £20,000 a phob £10,000 ar ôl hynny.

Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n cymeradwyo galwadau am roi mwy o gymorth o fewn system y PAC ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth lai arddwys. Ar hyn o bryd, targedir llai nag 1 y cant o gymorth y PAC ar amaethyddiaeth organig. Drwy roi mwy o gymorth i'r sector organig, gall y Cynulliad leihau gwargedion ar gyfer allforio, gwella ein hamgylchedd ac ymateb i bryderon defnyddwyr ynghylch iechyd.

Mae'r Blaid Lafur yn blaid gydwladol. Mae'n credu y dylai pŵer, ffyniant a chyfle fod yn eiddo i'r lliaws, ac nid i'r ychydig. Yn un o gynadleddau'r Blaid Lafur yn ddiweddar, siaradodd y Gweinidog am ddiwygio'r PAC a dweud bod gennym fwy i'w wneud eto. Cydnabu effaith niweidiol y PAC ar economi'r byd sy'n datblygu a bod y Cynulliad o dan ddyletswydd foesol i fod yn gyfrwng i ddiwygio. Mae'n bryd rhoi'r geiriau hynny ar waith. Beth a ddywedwn wrth y sector amaethyddol yng Nghymru? Nid digon yw galw am ddiwygiadau gan eraill a ninnau'n gwrthod ymrwmo, fel pe byddai ein dibyniaeth anesgusodol ni ar gymorthdaliadau'n llai teilwng o gerydd na dibyniaeth pawb arall. Nid yw ffermwyr yn y byd sy'n datblygu'n meddu ar gyfundrefnau cysylltiadau cyhoeddus, fel y rhai sydd gan yr archfarchnadoedd neu undebau'r ffermwyr, i warchod eu buddiannau. Maent yn dibynnu ar gydweithrediad rhwng llywodraethau. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Cynulliad osod esiampl i eraill a sicrhau y bydd y diwygio'n digwydd yn gynt. Gadewch inni godi ein llais o blaid diwygio. Mae ein hymrwymiad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn galw am hynny.

**Lisa Francis:** Drwy roi taliadau fferm Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol i ffermwyr Cymru ar sail hanesyddol, rhoddir hwb mawr i barhad ffermydd da byw traddodiadol yng Nghymru. Peth i'w groesawu hefyd yw y gellir rhoi'r taliadau sengl i ffermwyr ar lefel

This represents a considerable departure from previous reform agreements.

In terms of the operation of the national reserve, cross-compliance and the national envelope, farmers tell me that there seems to be a distinct lack of clarity as to how these will affect them. Three consultation papers have been issued, but it is felt that they should have been issued much sooner.

In terms of having a flexible approach to cross-compliance, the good agricultural and environmental condition component of cross-compliance refers to the protection and maintenance of soil. This could mean that farmers and land managers, in accordance with guidance, will be expected to draw up risk-based, soil management plans in 2006. What does that mean? In much of Wales we do not, and cannot, plough on heath land, hills or mountains. Can you give me significant examples of erosion of, and structural damage to, the soil in Wales? Can you give me significant examples of soil management in Wales? Welsh farmers have been successfully managing the soil for generations—in fact, for hundreds of years. Therefore, why should this be introduced now? Does it mean that we could see an army of bureaucrats walking up and down the land for no real purpose whatsoever? I accept that there must be an element of control and checking in all matters agricultural, but is a risk-based soil management plan justified? How will farmers in Meirionnydd and Ceredigion be able to implement, cope with, or respond to this, along with the raft of other regulations with which they have to deal?

I believe that most Welsh farmers think that the proposal for a risk-based soil management plan is a complete nonsense and that it should be withdrawn. I agree with that view. However, if Brussels is going to insist that the plan be implemented, can you at least give me an assurance that it will be implemented with a light touch?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am pleased to have an opportunity to contribute to this debate, not least because the common agricultural policy has been central to the EU virtually since its

ranbarthol am y tro cyntaf. Mae hyn yn newid cyfeiriad mawr o'i gymharu â'r cytundebau blaenorol ar ddiwygio.

Gyda golwg ar weithredu'r gronfa genedlaethol, trawsgydymffurfio a'r amlen genedlaethol, dywed ffermwyr wrthyf nad yw'n eglur o gwbl sut y bydd y rhain yn effeithio arnynt. Dosbarthwyd tri phapur ymgynghori, ond teimlir y dylent fod wedi'u dosbarthu'n llawer cynt.

O ran cael ymagwedd hyblyg at drawsgydymffurfio, mae'r rhan o drawsgydymffurfio sy'n ymwneud â chyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da yn cyfeirio at ddiogelu a chadw pridd. Gallai hyn olygu y bydd disgwyl i ffermwyr a rheolwyr tir baratoi cynlluniau rheoli pridd ar sail risgiau yn 2006, yn unol â'r canllawiau. Beth y mae hynny'n ei olygu? Mewn llawer rhan o Gymru ni wnawn, ac ni allwn, aredig ar weundir, bryniau neu fynyddoedd. A allwch gynnig enghreifftiau sylweddol i mi o erydu a difrod i adeiledd pridd yng Nghymru? A allwch gynnig enghreifftiau sylweddol i mi o reoli pridd yng Nghymru? Bu ffermwyr Cymru'n rheoli'r pridd yn llwyddiannus ers cenedlaethau—am gannoedd o flynyddoedd, mewn gwirionedd. Felly, pam y dylid cyflwyno hyn yn awr? A yw'n golygu y gallem weld byddin o fiwrocrataid yn cerdded y wlad yn gwbl ddbwrpas? Yr wyf yn derbyn bod rhaid cael rhywfaint o reoli a gwirio ym mhob mater amaethyddol, ond a oes cyfiawnhad dros gael cynllun rheoli pridd ar sail risgiau? Sut y bydd ffermwyr ym Meirionnydd a Cheredigion yn gallu gweithredu hyn, ac ymdopi neu ymateb iddo, ynghyd â'r llu o reoliadau eraill y maent yn gorfod delio â hwy?

Credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr Cymru o'r farn bod y cynnig i gael cynllun rheoli pridd ar sail risgiau yn nonsens pur ac y dylid ei dynnu'n ôl. Cytunaf â'r farn honno. Fodd bynnag, os bydd Brwsel yn mynnu y rhoddir y cynllun hwnnw ar waith, a allwch o leiaf roi sicrwydd i mi yr arferir cyffyrddiad ysgafn wrth ei roi ar waith?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon, a hynny'n anad dim am fod y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin wedi bod yn elfen ganolog yn yr UE ers ei sefydlu

inception, and, when the common market was formed, it accounted for 75 per cent of its budget. This was understandable in the immediate wake of the second world war and at a time of food shortages. We have since been up the butter mountain and down to the bottom of the wine lake, which are features of serious over-production. Not only is over-production wrong in itself, but it has created a number of unacceptable anomalies, which I hope will be addressed by the CAP reforms. As well as over-production, we have seen an over-industrialisation and intensification of agriculture, which has led to suspect animal welfare practices, lake and river pollution and the loss of biodiversity in many parts of the EU. In addition, the CAP has had a significant adverse effect, as Lynne Neagle said, on free trade, through the dumping of surplus products and through squeezing third world producers out of a legitimate market. This has been underpinned by a package of massive subsidies.

It has been amazing to see so many free-marketeers or self-described socialists lining up to defend this distortion for so long. Not only has the distortion, on average, provided over £11,000 in subsidies per farmer, per year, but approximately 70 per cent of the subsidies are given to 20 per cent of farmers. In other words, the rich are getting more, which is an affront to social justice.

The common agricultural policy remains the single biggest budget in the EU—it is 45 per cent of the budget.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Can you clarify whether the figures you quoted relate to Wales or to Britain? My instinct tells me that the picture in Wales is different but, if you can prove me wrong, I would be grateful.

**Brian Gibbons:** They are UK figures. People concerned about social injustice in Wales and the reform of the common agricultural policy should be raising a stink how the CAP discriminates against rural Wales. No-one in Wales should try to defend or campaign in favour of the CAP system.

bron, a phan ffurfiwyd y farchnad gyffredin, yr oedd yn cyfrif am 75 y cant o'i chyllideb. Yr oedd hynny'n ddealladwy yn sgîl yr ail ryfel byd ac ar adeg yr oedd bwyd yn brin. Ers hynny, buom ar ben y mynydd menyng ac i waelod y llyn gwin, sy'n arwyddion o orgynhyrchu dybryd. Yn ogystal â bod yn anghywir ohono'i hun, mae gorgynhyrchu wedi creu sawl anghysonder annerbyniol, a gaiff sylw drwy'r diwygiadau i'r PAC, yr wyf yn gobeithio. Yn ogystal â gorgynhyrchu, gwelsom orddiwydiannu a dwysáu mewn amaethyddiaeth, ac mae hynny wedi arwain at arferion sy'n amheus o ran lles anifeiliaid, llygru llynnoedd ac afonydd a cholli bioamrywiaeth mewn llawer rhan o'r UE. Ar ben hynny, mae'r PAC wedi bod yn andwyol iawn i fasnach rydd, fel y dywedodd Lynne Neagle, drwy waredu cynhyrchion sydd dros ben a thrwy wthio cynhyrchwyr y trydydd byd o farchnad ddilys. Ategwyd hynny gan becyn o gymorthdaliadau enfawr.

Rhyfedd fu gweld cynifer o bleidwyr y farchnad rhydd a rhai sy'n eu galw eu hunain yn sosialwyr yn aros eu tro i amddiffyn y camystumio hwn ers cyhyd. Yn ogystal â darparu mwy nag £11,000 y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd i bob ffermwr ar ffurf cymorthdaliadau, mae'r camystumio hwn yn peri bod tua 70 y cant o'r cymorthdaliadau'n cael eu rhoi i 20 y cant o'r ffermwyr. Hynny yw, mae'r cyfoethog yn cael mwy, ac mae hynny'n groes i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Y gyllideb ar gyfer y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yw'r fwyaf yn yr UE o hyd—mae'n cymryd 45 y cant o'r gyllideb.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A allwch egluro a yw'r ffigurau a ddyfynasoch yn ymwneud â Chymru neu â Phrydain? Yr wyf yn amau bod y sefyllfa yng Nghymru'n wahanol ond, os gallwch brofi fy mod yn anghywir, byddwn yn ddiolchgar.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ffigurau ar gyfer y DU ydynt. Dylai rhai sy'n ymboeni ynghylch anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin fod yn codi helynt ynghylch y modd y mae'r PAC yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn Cymru wledig. Ni ddylai neb yng Nghymru geisio amddiffyn neu ymgyrchu o blaid system y

PAC.

As I said, the CAP makes up 45 per cent of the EU budget and, with a ceiling of 1 per cent, plus or minus, of average GDP per capita being placed on EU spend, the amount spent on agriculture will have a major impact on what is available for worthwhile tasks in building a more socially just Europe and a more socially just world. In other words, the amount we spend on agriculture means that there could be less for structural and cohesion funds or for aid to be given to under-developing countries. This is where the amendments need to be confronted. I think that everyone in Wales has an attachment to the family farm—it is as much a part of Wales as rain, rugby, male voice choirs, coal and steel. However, speaking of coal and steel, no-one is suggesting that we reopen coal mines so that they can be mined once again. Equally, people are struggling to defend their jobs in the steel industry.

5.00 p.m.

In building or trying to maintain the family farm, particularly small and medium-sized farms, we know that farmers will struggle under any conceivable system that we are likely to see in the next decade, particularly as we move towards a more market-based system. We can continue to subsidise agriculture as a matter of social policy, but it would be much better for rural Wales and for the sons and daughters of small family farms, who are struggling for existence, if the money devoted to agriculture were spent on other programmes and policies, such as better structural funds or better social cohesion funds. Money spent in that way would deliver a better and fairer Wales.

We must maintain the natural beauty and heritage of our countryside and we need to invest public money into that and to support sustainable agricultural production.

Fel y dywedais, mae'r PAC yn cymryd 45 y cant o gyllideb yr UE, a chan fod hyd at 1 y cant, fwy neu lai, o'r CPC y pen cyfartalog yn cael ei wario drwy'r UE, bydd y swm a werir ar amaethyddiaeth yn cael effaith fawr ar yr hyn sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwaith buddiol o ran creu Ewrop sy'n fwy cymdeithasol gyfiawn a byd mwy cymdeithasol gyfiawn. Mewn geiriau eraill, oherwydd y swm a wariwn ar amaethyddiaeth, gallai llai fod ar gael ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol a chronfeydd cydlyniant neu gymorth i wledydd sydd heb ddatblygu. Am hynny y dylid gwrthwynebu'r gwelliannau. Credaf fod pawb yng Nghymru'n hoff o'r fferm deuluol—mae'n gymaint rhan o Gymru ag y mae glaw, rygbi, corau meibion, glo a dur. Er hynny, a sôn am lo a dur, nid oes neb yn awgrymu y dylem ailagor pyllau glo fel y gellir eu cloddio eto. Yn yr un modd, mae gweithwyr yn ei chael yn anodd cadw eu swyddi yn y diwydiant dur.

Wrth ddatblygu neu geisio cynnal y fferm deuluol, yn enwedig ffermydd bach a chanolig eu maint, gwyddom y bydd ffermwyr yn ei chael yn anodd o dan unrhyw system y gellid ei dyfeisio yr ydym yn debygol o'i gweld yn y degawd nesaf, yn enwedig wrth inni symud tuag at system sy'n seiliedig i fwy o raddau ar y farchnad. Gallwn barhau i roi cymorthdaliadau tuag at amaethyddiaeth fel mater o bolisi cymdeithasol, ond byddai'n well o lawer i Gymru wledig ac i feibion a merched ffermydd teuluol bach, sy'n ei chael yn anodd parhau, pe byddai'r arian sy'n cael ei neilltuo i amaethyddiaeth yn cael ei wario ar raglenni a pholisiau eraill, fel cronfeydd strwythurol gwell neu gronfeydd cydlyniant cymdeithasol gwell. Byddai arian a gâi ei wario felly'n arwain at Gymru well a thecach.

Rhaid inni gynnal treftadaeth a phrydferthwch naturiol ein cefn gwlad a rhaid inni fuddsoddi arian cyhoeddus yn hynny ac i hybu cynhyrchu amaethyddol cynaliadwy.

**Brynle Williams:** I have noted your comments, but we must look beyond the subsidies that we are supposed to be paying. We are trying to keep young people in the community and, in turn, trying to keep the community alive. I accept what Lynne Neagle said earlier, but the problem is that we could end up in the same situation of mass depopulation in rural areas. Tourists visiting Wales want to see the agricultural communities intact. Food is cheap—it is far too cheap for everyone, but this is also a social problem and the subsidies help to sustain the fabric of the community throughout our principality.

**Brian Gibbons:** If you consider the census returns, Brynle, the rural population is the fastest growing population in Wales, at a time when the agricultural contribution to our economy is declining. To create a more socially just Wales in the countryside, EU funds being invested into unproductive, useless agricultural activity should be diverted to support other types of industrial activity in rural Wales to create a fairer system. Pardon the pun, but it is time to slay this sacred cow.

**Elin Jones:** Bu i chi gyfeirio at y cynnydd mewn poblogaeth yn ein hardaloedd gwledig, ond a ydych wedi ystyried yr ystadegau sy'n dangos bod y cydbwysedd o ran oedran yn symud yn sylweddol tuag at gynnydd yn y boblogaeth oedranus yn yr ardaloedd hynny yn hytrach nag adlewyrchu ein gallu i gadw pobl ifanc yn yr ardaloedd gwledig drwy ddarparu swyddi a thai ar eu cyfer?

**Brian Gibbons:** Why should we pursue policies to encourage young people to go into agriculture, on the one hand, if the elderly population is increasing in rural Wales? We should provide diverse types of economic opportunities for the older people coming to live in Wales as well as the public service support, such as social care, health, education, training and transport. Money should be invested in those services and not into agriculture, to address the problem—

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf wedi nodi'ch sylwadau, ond rhaid inni edrych y tu hwnt i'r cymorthdaliadau yr ydym i fod i'w talu. Yr ydym yn ceisio cadw pobl ifanc yn y gymuned a, drwy hynny, yn ceisio cadw'r gymuned yn fyw. Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Lynne Neagle yn gynharach, ond y broblem yw y gallem gael yr un math o ddiboblogi helaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn y pen draw. Mae rhai sy'n ymweld â Chymru am weld y cymunedau amaethyddol yn gyfan. Mae bwyd yn rhad—mae'n rhy rad o lawer i bawb, ond problem gymdeithasol yw hon hefyd ac mae'r cymorthdaliadau'n helpu i gynnal adeiledd cymunedau ledled y diwysogaeth.

**Brian Gibbons:** Os ystyriwch ganlyniadau'r cyfrifiad, Brynle, gwelwch mai'r boblogaeth wledig yw'r un sy'n tyfu'n gyflymaf yng Nghymru, a hynny ar adeg y mae'r cyfraniad amaethyddol i'n heconomi'n lleihau. Er mwyn creu Cymru fwy cymdeithasol gyfiawn yng nghefn gwlad, yn lle buddsoddi cyllid yr UE mewn gweithgarwch di-werth a di-fudd, dylid ei ddefnyddio i gynnal mathau eraill o weithgarwch diwydiannol yng Nghymru wledig er mwyn creu system decach. Mae'n bryd cael gwared ar y siboleth hwn.

**Elin Jones:** You referred to the increase in population in our rural areas, but have you considered the statistics that show that the age balance is shifting significantly towards an increase in the elderly population in those areas rather than reflecting our ability to keep young people in rural areas by providing jobs and houses for them?

**Brian Gibbons:** Pam y dylem ddilyn polisiau i annog pobl ifanc i ddechrau amaethu, ar y naill law, os yw'r boblogaeth oedranus ar gynnydd yng Nghymru wledig? Dylem ddarparu gwahanol fathau o gyfleoedd economaidd i bobl hŷn sy'n dod i fyw i Gymru yn ogystal â chymorth drwy wasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel gofal cymdeithasol, iechyd, addysg, hyfforddiant a thrafnidiaeth. Dylid buddsoddi arian yn y gwasanaethau hynny ac nid mewn amaethyddiaeth, er mwyn ymateb i'r broblem—



**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are running out of time.

**Brian Gibbons:** In conclusion, we do not need to spend more money on the common agricultural policy. It needs root-and-branch reform to build a fairer and more prosperous Wales in general, and a more prosperous and fairer rural Wales in particular.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** First, in terms of capacity, there are no difficulties. We are confident that we can get everything done by the time the window opens on 1 December 2005, and the window will remain open until 30 June 2006. Staff in the divisional offices have made heroic efforts to catch up with last year's backlog. They have done well to ensure that we are ahead of the rest of the UK on this year's payments. I do not doubt that that will continue into next year.

On the national reserve and the comments made in the media, I cannot for the life of me understand how on earth those young farmers, as they described themselves, could work out their entitlements. That is impossible. It would have been far more productive had they aired their views in the consultation, rather than making erroneous claims to the media.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You have clarified the position to a great extent today, but there is one further concern, namely the capacity of the national reserve at 3 per cent to meet the demands that might be made on it. I know that the consultation is at an early stage, but do you have any further comments on that?

**Carwyn Jones:** We will have to wait for the consultation's findings, but your other point is about the automatic and discretionary entitlements. Some categories have automatic entitlements under the regulations, but there are other groups that come under the discretionary entitlement category, such as young farmers. However, we have the ability to give them automatic access, and that is where the confusion may have arisen.

Many of the points raised by Members are

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser yn dod i ben.

**Brian Gibbons:** I derfynu, ni ddylem wario mwy o arian ar y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Rhaid ei ddiwygio o'r bôn i'r brig er mwyn creu Cymru decach a mwy ffyniannus yn gyffredinol, a Chymru wledig decach a mwy ffyniannus yn benodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Yn gyntaf, o ran capasiti, nid oes unrhyw anawsterau. Yr ydym yn ffyddiog y gallwn gwblhau popeth erbyn dechrau'r cyfnod talu ar 1 Rhagfyr 2005, a bydd y cyfnod hwnnw'n parhau tan 30 Mehefin 2006. Mae staff yn y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol wedi rhoi pob gewyn ar waith i gael gwared â'r ôl-groniad a gafwyd y llynedd. Llwyddasant i sicrhau ein bod ar y blaen i weddill y DU ar y taliadau ar gyfer eleni. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n parhau yn y flwyddyn nesaf.

Ynghylch y gronfa genedlaethol a'r sylwadau a wnaed yn y cyfryngau, ni allaf yn fy myw ddeall sut ar y ddaear y gallai'r ffermwyr ifanc hynny, fel y'u galwent eu hunain, gyfrifo'u hawliadau. Mae hynny'n amhosibl. Buasai'n fwy buddiol o lawer pe byddent wedi gwyntyllu eu barn yn yr ymgynghoriad, yn hytrach na chyflwyno honiadau cyfeiliornus i'r cyfryngau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr ydych wedi egluro'r sefyllfa i raddau helaeth heddiw, ond mae un tesun pryder pellach, sef gallu'r gronfa genedlaethol ar 3 y cant i ateb y galwadau a allai fod arni. Gwn mai newydd ddechrau y mae'r ymgynghoriad, ond a oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau pellach ar hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd yn rhaid inni ddisgwyl canfyddiadau'r ymgynghori, ond mae'r pwynt arall a wnaethoch yn ymwneud â hawliadau awtomatig a rhai a roddir yn ôl disgrisiwn. Mae hawliadau awtomatig i rai categorïau o dan y rheoliadau, ond mae grwpiau eraill, fel ffermwyr ifanc, yn y categori lle y rhoddir hawliadau yn ôl disgrisiwn. Er hynny, gallwn roi mynediad awtomatig iddynt, ac mae'n bosibl mai ynghylch hynny y mae'r dryswch wedi codi.

Ceir eglurhad ar lawer o'r pwyntiau a

clarified in the consultation paper, especially with regard to new entrants. I hope that it is now clear that we are aiming to do as much as we possibly can to ensure that new entrants benefit. The appeal system will be similar to that for the IACS system. We are considering whether we need to bolster the capacity of the appeal system, and that work is ongoing. On cross-border issues, 364 of the 500 cross-border farms are registered in Wales. At present, we are discussing with Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs what must be done with regard to dealing with cross-border issues, given the different subsidy payment regimes that exist on both sides of the border, and in the three different regions of England.

On the other points, the intention of the national envelope, Helen Mary, is not to pay for existing schemes, but to see whether particular courses of action need to be taken to ensure that there is, for example, a sound mix of farming in Wales, and to prevent any unforeseen environmental degradation. The entry-level scheme can only be paid for with modulation, which can only be secured with match funding from the Treasury. We know that that is how the figures stack up, and negotiations are continuing. The attraction of helping young farmers is based on the fact that the majority of them view the subsidy as an extra, and not as the heart of their business. Many young farmers admit that they would like to farm, if possible, without subsidies. They would rather farm within the market and not have to rely on subsidies. It is that kind of attitude that will serve Welsh farming well in the future.

There is no doubt that the present CAP regime is unsustainable in the long-term; everybody knows that. The inclusion of the accession countries in the European Union means that the CAP budget will not stretch in future years. In Luxembourg last year, the issue was effectively kicked into the long grass, although a mechanism has been put in place to trigger a review of the present CAP reform if the budget is exceeded. However, there is no doubt that the present budget is unsustainable in the long-term. There is still

gododd Aelodau yn y papur ymgynghori, mewn cysylltiad â ffermwyr newydd yn enwedig. Gobeithiaf ei bod yn amlwg bellach ein bod yn ceisio gwneud cymaint ag y gallwn i sicrhau y caiff ffermwyr newydd fudd o hyn. Bydd y system apêl yn debyg i'r un a geir ar gyfer system IACS. Yr ydym yn ystyried a oes angen cryfhau gallu'r system apêl, ac mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo. Ynghylch materion trawsffiniol, mae 364 o'r 500 o ffermydd sydd o boptu i'r ffin wedi'u cofrestru yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn trafod gydag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud o ran delio â materion trawsffiniol, yng ngolwg y gwahaniaeth rhwng y cyfundrefnau talu cymorthdaliadau a geir ar ddwy ochr y ffin, ac yn y tri rhanbarth yn Lloegr.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau eraill a wnaed, nid talu am y cynlluniau presennol yw bwriad yr amlen genedlaethol, Helen Mary, ond ystyried a oes angen cymryd camau penodol i sicrhau, er enghraifft, fod cymysgedd da mewn ffermio yng Nghymru, ac i atal unrhyw ddiraddio annisgwyl ar yr amgylchedd. Dim ond drwy fodiwleiddio y gellir talu am y cynllun lefel mynediad, ac ni ellir ond sicrhau hynny drwy gael cyllid cyfatebol gan y Trysorlys. Gwyddom hynny ar sail y ffigurau, ac mae negodiadau'n parhau. Mae cynorthwyo ffermwyr ifanc yn beth atyniadol gan fod y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn ystyried y cymhorthdal yn rhywbeth ychwanegol, ac nid yn hanfod i'w busnes. Cyfddyf llawer o ffermwyr ifanc y carent ffermio heb gymorthdaliadau, pe gallent. Byddai'n well ganddynt ffermio o fewn y farchnad, heb orfod dibynnu ar gymorthdaliadau. Bydd ymagwedd o'r fath o fantais i ffermio yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw cyfundrefn bresennol y PAC yn anghynaliadwy yn y tymor hir; mae pawb yn gwybod hynny. O ganlyniad i gynnwys y gwledydd sy'n ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ni fydd cyllideb y PAC yn ymestyn ym mlynnyddoedd y dyfodol. Yn Lwcsembwrg y llynedd, bwriwyd y mater o'r neilltu i bob pwrpas, er bod dull gweithredu wedi'i roi ar waith i gychwyn adolygiad o'r diwygiadau presennol i'r PAC os gwarir mwy nag sydd yn y gyllideb. Er hynny, nid oes amheuaeth

a great deal to be done on a world level in respect of fair trade, by looking not only at Europe's contribution, but also at the USA, the contribution of which leads to a worse distortion in the market place. It is important that all the major players unite to consider ways of assisting countries in the developing world to have fair access to the market, which brings me on to Lynne's point. We must remember that the money that we receive and distribute in CAP payments is not our own. We cannot do anything with it, other than pay it out. If we did not pay it, we would not receive it. We cannot use that money to pay for anything else. The EU gives us that money to funnel, in effect, to farmers.

I will investigate the data situation, but we clearly cannot provide individual names. However, I will consider whether it is possible to group people with regard to the numbers of people who receive a particular subsidy. I agree that actions can be taken, and I made that point in a letter to Margaret Beckett. While bolstering her view, I stated that we could also go further than her original intention. We need, at the very least, to consider the regimes that govern beet, cereal, olive oil, cotton, tobacco and all the crops that have an immediate effect on the economies of developing countries, not only with regard to subsidy, but also with regard to market access, which those countries do not have at present.

5.10 p.m.

I know that time is running out. There are one or two issues to be dealt with. First, on Lisa Francis's point, earlier consultation could not be done because we had not made the decision on the single farm payment on an historic basis. We could not do that until we had consulted on it. If we had gone down the route of an area-based system of payment, the consultation would have looked completely different, so this was the quickest way to do it. I was astonished to hear someone say that there are no examples of poor soil management, degradation or

nad yw'r gyllideb bresennol yn anghynaliadwy yn y tymor hir. Mae llawer iawn i'w wneud o hyd ar lefel y byd mewn cysylltiad â masnachu teg, drwy edrych nid yn unig ar gyfraniad Ewrop, ond hefyd ar UDA, y mae ei chyfraniad yn peri mwy o gamystumio yn y farchnad. Mae'n bwysig i'r holl brif gyfranwyr ddod at ei gilydd i ystyried dulliau o helpu gwledydd yn y byd sy'n datblygu i gael mynediad teg i'r farchnad, ac mae hynny'n dod â mi at y pwynt a wnaeth Lynne. Rhaid inni gofio nad ein harian ni yw'r hyn yr ydym yn ei gael ac yn ei ddosbarthu ar ffurf taliadau'r PAC. Ni allwn wneud dim ag ef heblaw ei dalu allan. Pe na fyddem yn ei dalu, ni fyddem yn ei gael. Ni allwn ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i dalu am unrhyw beth arall. Mae'r UE yn rhoi'r arian hwnnw i ni i'w sianelu, i bob pwrpas, at ffermwyr.

Ymchwiliad i'r sefyllfa o ran data, ond mae'n amlwg na allwn ddarparu enwau unigolion. Er hynny, ystyriaif a oes modd grwpio pobl gyda golwg ar y niferoedd sy'n derbyn cymhorthdal penodol. Cytunaf y gellir cymryd camau, a gwneuthum y pwynt hwnnw mewn llythyr at Margaret Beckett. Er imi ategu ei barn, dywedais y gallem hefyd fynd ymhellach na'i bwriad gwreiddiol. Rhaid inni o leiaf ystyried y cyfundrefnau sy'n llywodraethu betys, grawn, olew olewydd, cotwm, tybaco a'r holl gnydau sy'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar economïau gwledydd sy'n datblygu, nid yn unig mewn cysylltiad â chymorthdaliadau, ond hefyd mewn cysylltiad â mynediad i'r farchnad, nad yw ar gael i'r gwledydd hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Gwn fod amser yn brin. Mae un neu ddau o faterion y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Lisa Francis, ni ellid ymgynghori'n gynharach gan nad oeddem wedi penderfynu ar y taliad sengl i ffermwyr ar sail hanesyddol. Ni allem wneud hynny hyd nes y byddem wedi ymgynghori arno. Pe byddem wedi penderfynu ar system talu a oedd yn seiliedig ar arwynebedd, buasai gwedd gwbl wahanol ar yr ymgynghori, felly hwn oedd y modd cyflymaf i'w wneud. Yr oedd yn syn gennyf glywed rhywun yn dweud nad oes

overgrazing in Wales—there are numerous examples. Last week I received a presentation on the river Teifi, where a bank of land with severe land erosion due to overgrazing had been redeveloped and redone. Also, there is a concern on the Teifi about the pesticide that is being put into the river, killing substantial numbers of fish stocks. We must recognise the negative effect to farming and deal with it.

We are looking for a farming industry that can stand on its own two feet, that can survive, prosper and do well in European and world markets. Farmers must understand that they have to compete in markets where they have a fair chance of competing—this message is getting through. There is no point in Wales trying to sell commodities; we must compete in the markets where price is not the sole determinant. Those markets are increasing year on year.

On Brian's point, I do not agree that medium-sized farms cannot prosper. I think that they can—there is no doubt about it, as long as they are producing good quality produce. They cannot, however, try to sell as individuals. The way forward for farming must be for people to join larger and larger co-operatives, which is the model that exists in most of Europe, and stick with those co-operatives through thick and thin. There is no point joining a co-operative only to sell round the side, if the price is better somewhere else. In northern Italy, co-operatives are strong and they negotiate directly with the supermarkets, yet the farms are smaller in hectareage than farms in Wales. There must be solidarity in farming to ensure that it has a strong future in Wales. There is strength in unity. We must remember that, or farming will face a difficult future.

enghreifftiau o reoli gwael ar bridd, diraddio neu orbori yng Nghymru—mae sawl enghraifft. Yr wythnos diwethaf cefais gyflwyniad ar afon Teifi, lle y mae llechwedd a erydwyd yn ddifrifol oherwydd gorbori wedi cael ei hailddatblygu a'i hailwneud. Mae pryder hefyd ar afon Teifi ynghylch y plaladdwyr sy'n cael eu gollwng i'r afon, gan ladd niferoedd mawr o bysgod. Rhaid inni gydnabod effaith negyddol ffermio a delio â hi.

Yr ydym yn ceisio diwydiant ffermio sy'n gallu sefyll ar ei draed ei hun, sy'n gallu parhau, ffynnu a llwyddo ym marchnadoedd Ewrop a'r byd. Rhaid i ffermwyr ddeall eu bod yn gorfod cystadlu mewn marchnadoedd lle y mae ganddynt gyfle teg i gystadlu—mae'r neges hon yn mynd drwodd. Nid oes diben i Gymru geisio gwerthu nwyddau sylfaenol; rhaid inni gystadlu yn y marchnadoedd nad ydynt yn cael eu pennu gan y pris yn unig. Mae'r marchnadoedd hynny'n ehangu o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Brian, ni chytunaf nad oes modd i ffermydd canolig eu maint ffynnu. Credaf y gallant—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny, cyhyd ag y cynhyrchant gynnyrch o ansawdd da. Fodd bynnag, ni allant geisio gwerthu fel unigolion. Er mwyn i ffermio lwyddo, rhaid i bobl ymuno â mentrau cydweithredol sy'n mynd yn fwy ac yn fwy, sef y model a geir yn y rhan helaethaf o Ewrop, a glynu wrth y mentrau cydweithredol hynny, doed a ddelo. Nid oes diben mewn ymuno â menter gydweithredol ac wedyn gwerthu o'r neilltu, os yw'r pris yn well yn rhywle arall. Yng ngogledd yr Eidal, ceir mentrau cydweithredol cryf ac maent yn negodi'n uniongyrchol â'r archfarchnadoedd, ac eto, mae'r ffermydd yn llai o ran eu maint na ffermydd yng Nghymru. Rhaid wrth gydgefnogaeth mewn ffermio i sicrhau dyfodol cadarn iddo yng Nghymru. Mae nerth mewn undod. Rhaid inni gofio hynny, neu bydd ffermio'n wynebu dyfodol anodd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 14, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 2: For 14, Abstain 7, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM1946 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

- 1. endorses the decision of the Welsh Assembly Government to adopt the historic model as the basis of the new CAP single farm payment from 2005 as in the best interests of Wales and Welsh farming;*
- 2. welcomes that further decisions on CAP reform relating to cross compliance, the national reserve and the national envelope will be informed by the responses to the extensive consultation now underway;*
- 3. within the process of reform calls for the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that young people are able to enter the farming industry.*

Cynnig NDM1946 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

- 1. yn cymeradwyo penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fabwysiadu'r model hanesyddol yn sail i daliad sengl newydd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin o 2005 ymlaen er lles gorau Cymru a ffermio yng Nghymru;*
- 2. yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd penderfyniadau ar ddiwygio'r PAC mewn perthynas â thrawsgydymffurfio, y gronfa genedlaethol a'r amlen genedlaethol yn cael eu llywio gan yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad helaeth sydd ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd;*
- 3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o fewn y broses ddiwygio, i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael mynediad i'r diwydiant ffermio.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben. Diolch i Aelodau am eu cydweithrediad.

**The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. I thank Members for their co-operation.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.14 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.14 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)