



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 9 Mai 2006
Tuesday, 9 May 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|---|
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister |
| 30 | Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement |
| 35 | Datganiad am Reoliadau Enseffalopathïau Sbyngffurf Trosglwyddadwy (TSE)
(Cymru) 2006 a wnaed o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27
Statement on the Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathies (TSE) (Wales)
Regulations 2006 made under Standing Order No. 24.27 |
| 48 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Rheolau Sefydlog) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006 |
| 52 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu Dŵr Rhag Llygredd Nitradau Amaethyddol
(Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3
Approval of the Protection of Water Against Agricultural Nitrate Pollution (England
and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 25 Section 3 |
| 56 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Amddiffyn Planhigion (Diwygio) 2006 o dan
Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3
Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2006 under
Standing Order No. 25 Section 3 |
| 57 | Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23
Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 23 |
| 59 | Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Ymrwymïadau ac Addewidion Allweddol
Maniffesto Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The Welsh Assembly Government's Manifesto
Commitments and Key Pledges |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Siambr. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Contract Cyfrif Cerdyn Swyddfa'r Post Post Office Card Account Contract

Q1 Leanne Wood: What discussions has the First Minister had regarding the post office card account contract? OAQ1508(FM)

C1 Leanne Wood: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cynnal ynglŷn â chontract cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post? OAQ1508(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Despite the best efforts of Edwina Hart, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, and her exchange of correspondence with the Department for Work and Pensions, that department has decided to cease funding post office card accounts after March 2010.

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Er i Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ymdrechu ei gorau glas a gohebu gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, mae'r adran honno wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i ariannu cyfrifon cerdyn swyddfa'r post ar ôl mis Mawrth 2010.

Leanne Wood: Since New Labour came to power, 4,000 post offices have closed across the UK, more than 300 of which were in Wales. The network has suffered a relentless and sustained attack by New Labour, and the removal of the post office card account is the latest in a long line of damaging policies initiated by this Government. Does the First Minister agree that post offices have an essential role to play in addressing social exclusion, especially in isolated communities, and, if so, what is he doing to inform his friends at the Department for Work and Pensions that their latest betrayal of the post office network could, according to the National Federation of SubPostmasters, lead to the closure of as many as 10,000 of the remaining 14,000 post offices in the UK over the next four years?

Leanne Wood: Ers i Lafur Newydd ddod i rym, mae 4,000 o swyddfeydd post wedi cau ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, a thros 300 o'r rheini yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhwydwaith wedi dioddef ymosodiad didostur a pharhaus gan Lafur Newydd, a dileu cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yw'r diweddaraf mewn rhestr hir o bolisiâu niweidiol a ddechreuwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon. A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod gan swyddfeydd post ran hanfodol i'w chwarae o ran ateb problemau allgáu cymdeithasol, yn enwedig mewn cymunedau anghysbell, ac os ydyw, beth y mae'n ei wneud i hysbysu ei gyfeillion yn yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau y gallai eu brad diweddaraf yn erbyn y rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post, yn ôl Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol yr Is-bostfeistri, arwain at gau cynifer â 10,000 o'r 14,000 o swyddfeydd post sydd ar ôl yn y Deyrnas Unedig dros y pedair blynedd nesaf?

The First Minister: Clearly, that would have nothing to do with the closing of the post office card account, because that will not happen until March 2010. I agree with some of your remarks—post offices and sub-post offices in isolated rural areas and in some of the more socially isolated urban communities are an essential part of the backbone of

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn amlwg, ni fyddai a wnelo hynny ddim â chau cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post, oherwydd ni fydd hynny'n digwydd tan Fawrth 2010. Cytunaf â rhai o'ch sylwadau—mae swyddfeydd post ac is-swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell ac yn rhai o'r cymunedau trefol mwyaf ynysig yn gymdeithasol yn rhan

community life. I do not agree with some of your colourful language, and we will have to see what comes out of the current review going on between the Department of Trade and Industry and the Treasury of the funding of loss-making post offices.

Irene James: Rhodri, many of my constituents have raised concerns about the termination of the post office card account in 2010, when the contract expires. Many older people have mobility concerns, and do not have easy access to a local bank or building society. I understand that the Post Office is developing alternatives to the card account. Will you continue to raise these concerns with your—sorry, our—Westminster colleagues and what action—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Irene James: What action is being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government to work with the Post Office to ensure that card account holders in Wales are reassured and informed of their options, and have clear and continued access to their pensions and benefits at local post offices?

The First Minister: Clearly, when you have a distance to travel to a bank or building society for the direct payment to be made, and you cannot get there, that is highly inconvenient. Discussions are continuing between the Department for Work and Pensions and the Post Office Ltd about what will happen after March 2010, and we will continue to press on the issue along the lines that you have suggested.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): The impression given is that the Labour Government in London is taking initiatives to do its best to close post offices across the United Kingdom. In my patch, we have lost Lower Dowlais, Brecon Road in Merthyr, Beaufort Hill, Waunlwyd and Willow Town in Blaenau Gwent—all of those post offices have closed since 2004, while you have been First Minister. So far, the only initiative that

hanfodol o asgwrn cefn bywyd y gymuned. Nid wyf yn cytuno â pheth o’ch iaith liwgar, a bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth a ddaw yn sgîl yr adolygiad sydd ar y gweill rhwng yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a’r Trysorlys o’r modd yr ariennir swyddfeydd post sy’n gwneud colled.

Irene James: Rhodri, mae llawer o’r hetholwyr wedi codi pryderon ynghylch terfynu cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa’r post yn 2010, pan ddaw’r contract i ben. Mae gan lawer o bobl hŷn bryderon ynghylch symudedd, ac nid yw’n hawdd iddynt fynd i fanc neu gymdeithas adeiladu yn lleol. Deallaf fod Swyddfa’r Post yn datblygu gwasanaethau eraill i gymryd lle’r cyfrif cerdyn. A wnewch barhau i godi’r pryderon hyn gyda’ch—mae’n ddrwg gennyf, gyda’n—cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan a beth—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Irene James: Beth sy’n cael ei wneud gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithio gyda Swyddfa’r Post i sicrhau y tawelir meddyliau’r rhai sydd yn dal cyfrifon cerdyn yng Nghymru, y cânt wybod pa ddewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt, ac y byddant yn parhau i gael mynediad hwylus at eu pensiynau a’u budd-daliadau mewn swyddfeydd post lleol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn amlwg, pan fo gennych gryn bellter i deithio i fanc neu gymdeithas adeiladu ar gyfer y taliad uniongyrchol, ac nad oes modd ichi gyrraedd yno, mae hynny’n anghyfleus dros ben. Mae trafodaethau’n parhau rhwng yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a Swyddfa’r Post Cyf ynghylch yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd ar ôl Mawrth 2010, a byddwn yn parhau i bwysio ynglŷn â’r mater i’r cyfeiriad a awgrymwyd gennych.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Yr argraff a roddir yw bod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain yn cymryd camau i wneud ei gorau i gau swyddfeydd post ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn fy ardal i, yr ydym wedi colli Dowlais Isaf, Ffordd Aberhonddu ym Merthyr, Bryn Cendl, Waun-lwyd a Willow Town ym Mlaenau Gwent—mae pob un o’r swyddfeydd post hyn wedi cau ers 2004, tra dydych chi wedi bod yn Brif Weinidog. Hyd

we have had in Wales to keep post offices open is the Assembly's post office development fund. Yet now, as you say, we face another two or three years of great uncertainty: 50 per cent of the business of local post offices will be lost with the loss of the post office card account. Has your Government taken enough action and made enough representations to your colleagues in London to keep post offices, which are a vital component of communities in Wales, open?

The First Minister: The post office development fund, which was a unique Welsh Assembly Government initiative—the only one of its kind in any part of Britain—has been successful. Grants were given to 106 post offices, about 60 per cent of which were in isolated urban areas, and 42 per cent in rural areas. That has done a great deal to staunch the closure of loss-making post offices. No-one can wish away the problem of loss-making post offices and pretend that it does not exist. It does exist, and you can see why the Department for Work and Pensions is determined to pursue the course that it wishes to pursue, because it reduces from £1 to 1p the transaction cost of making the payment into someone's bank account rather than their having to make a visit. Therefore, that 99 per cent saving on the administrative cost cannot be wished away by any sloganising at a political level by us or by you. That is a fact. The problem is how to get alternative product lines into post offices to reduce the huge loss of business that they are experiencing.

Michael German: Surely the problem is that sub-postmasters and sub-postmistresses get 12p per £100-worth of transactions. So, it takes the payment of two people's pensions for them to receive 12p. A cost will fall upon banks, and no-one thinks that they will take on this work for free. The post office is the central point of many communities, and if we lose the post office card account, post offices will lose the custom of about half the people who use their services. These people will go elsewhere to get their cash, and communities will lose their post offices as local people spend their cash elsewhere. Do you think that the removal of the post office card account is

yma, yr unig fenter a gawsom yng Nghymru i gadw swyddfeydd post yn agored yw cronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post y Cynulliad. Ond yn awr, fel y dywedwch, wynebwn ddwy neu dair blynedd arall o ansicrwydd mawr: collir 50 y cant o fusnes swyddfeydd post lleol pan gollir cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post. A ydyw eich Llywodraeth wedi gweithredu digon ac wedi pwyso digon ar eich cyd-aelodau yn Llundain i gadw swyddfeydd post, sy'n elfen hanfodol mewn cymunedau yng Nghymru, ar agor?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a oedd yn fenter unigryw gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—yr unig un o'i bath yn unrhyw ran o Brydain—wedi bod yn llwyddiannus. Rhoddwyd grantiau i 106 o swyddfeydd post, tua 60 y cant ohonynt mewn ardaloedd trefol ynysig, a 42 y cant mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Gwnaeth hynny lawer i atal cau swyddfeydd post a oedd yn gwneud colled. Ni all neb anwybyddu problem swyddfeydd post sydd yn gwneud colled a chymryd arnynt nad yw'n bodoli. Mae'n bodoli, a gallwch weld pam mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau'n benderfynol o ddilyn y llwybr y mae am ei ddilyn, gan ei fod yn lleihau cost y trafodiad wrth dalu i gyfrif banc rhywun yn hytrach na'u bod yn gorfod gwneud ymweliad, o £1 i un geiniog. Felly, ni ellir anwybyddu'r arbediad hwnnw o 99 y cant ar y gost weinyddol drwy sloganeiddio ar lefel wleidyddol gennym ni na chennych chi. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Y broblem yw sut i gael cynhyrchion eraill i mewn i swyddfeydd post i leihau'r colli busnes sy'n digwydd ar raddfa enfawr.

Michael German: Y broblem, siawns, yw mai 12c y mae is-bostfeistri ac is-bostfeistresi'n ei gael am werth £100 o drafodion. Felly, mae gofyn talu dau bensiwn iddynt dderbyn 12c. Bydd cost i'r banciau, ac nid oes neb yn meddwl y gwnânt ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn am ddim. Swyddfa'r post yw canolbwynt sawl cymuned, ac os collwn gyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post, bydd swyddfeydd post yn colli cwsmeriaeth tua hanner y bobl sydd yn defnyddio'u gwasanaethau. Aiff y bobl hyn i rywle arall i gael eu harian, a bydd cymunedau'n colli eu swyddfeydd post wrth i bobl leol wario'u harian yn rhywle arall. A ydych yn meddwl

good for rural and urban communities, or do you think that we should be campaigning vigorously against this move and that your Government should be doing more?

The First Minister: In addition to the point about the post office development fund, which we ran—although it is now closed and will remain as such until we know what the nature of the network will be—I mentioned earlier, but you may not have heard me, that there was an exchange of correspondence between Edwina Hart and John Hutton, the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, a couple of months ago. Despite this, the move will go ahead, although it will not take effect for almost four years. The problem for the Post Office is that it also has an ongoing review between the Department of Trade and Industry and the Treasury as to what to do about the huge losses being experienced by a large number of post offices and sub-post offices throughout the United Kingdom. The answer, in theory, is that we need to get more products into post offices to produce the footfall, and to try to reduce the problem described by Irene James, whereby elderly or disabled customers do not always have banks or building societies within easy reach whereas the post office is always within easy reach. That is the nature of the problem, and we are all aware of it. However, doing something about it and finding solutions is a different matter.

Michael German: First Minister, it seems to me that the problem, as always, is one of cash. This relates to the real costs of reviving our communities, and making sure that old-age pensioners and others can get their benefits locally and close to their homes. We are measuring the pure, hard-cash terms of sub-postmasters and sub-postmistresses getting 12p against the cost of running it through banks. There is a difference here. Therefore, what evaluation have you done of the money that your Government is putting into the regeneration of communities, including post offices and other small retail centres, compared with the costs that will fall to us if we have to make sure that communities have another means of survival?

bod dileu cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yn llesol i gymunedau gwledig a threfol, ynteu a ydych yn meddwl y dylem ymgyrchu'n egniol yn erbyn y symudiad hwn ac y dylai'ch Llywodraeth chi fod yn gwneud mwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ogystal â'r pwynt am y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a gynhaliwyd gennym ni—er ei bod bellach wedi cau ac y bydd yn aros felly hyd nes y gwyddom beth fydd natur y rhwydwaith—soniais yn gynharach, ond efallai na chlywsoch fi, fod gohebiaeth wedi bod rhwng Edwina Hart a John Hutton, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau, fis neu ddau yn ôl. Er gwaethaf hyn, aiff y symudiad rhagddo, er na ddaw i rym am bedair blynedd bron. Y broblem i Swyddfa'r Post yw bod ganddi adolygiad ar y gweill hefyd rhwng yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys ynghylch beth i'w wneud am y colledion enfawr a brofir gan nifer fawr o swyddfeydd post ac is-swyddfeydd post ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ateb, mewn egwyddor, yw bod angen inni gael mwy o gynnyrch i mewn i swyddfeydd post i gynhyrchu nifer yr ymwelwyr, ac i geisio lleihau'r broblem a ddisgrifiwyd gan Irene James, sef nad oes banc neu gymdeithas adeiladu bob amser o fewn cyrraedd hwylus i gwsmeriaid oedrannus neu anabl, tra bod swyddfa'r post bob amser o fewn cyrraedd hwylus. Dyna natur y broblem, ac yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol ohoni. Fodd bynnag, mater arall yw gwneud rhywbeth yn ei chylch a chanfod atebion.

Michael German: Brif Weinidog, mae'n ymddangos i mi mai arian, fel arfer, sydd wrth wraidd y broblem. Mae a wnelo hyn â chostau real adfywio ein cymunedau, a gwneud yn siŵr y gall pensiynwyr ac eraill gael eu budd-daliadau'n lleol ac yn agos at eu cartrefi. Yr ydym yn mesur y ffeithiau ariannol moel bod is-bostfeistri ac is-bostfeistresi'n cael 12c yn erbyn y gost o'i redeg drwy fanciau. Mae gwahaniaeth yma. Felly, pa werthusiad yr ydych wedi ei wneud ar yr arian y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei roi i mewn i adfywio cymunedau, gan gynnwys swyddfeydd post a siopau bach eraill, o'i gymharu â'r costau a ddaw i'n rhan os bydd yn rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr fod gan gymunedau fodd arall i oroesi?

The First Minister: We do not have that, because, in a way, it is not a devolved responsibility, although it cuts across many of our devolved responsibilities for urban and rural social regeneration. However, we cannot wish away the problem that it costs £1 to carry out a face-to-face transaction in a post office compared with 1p for electronically transferring the money directly into someone's bank account. The problem comes after that transfer—how do you get hold of the money in your bank account if you do not have a branch of a bank or building society in your community? That is the problem that we believe should be addressed.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw hynny gennym, oherwydd, mewn ffordd, nid yw'n gyfrifoldeb datganoledig, er ei fod yn ymwneud â llawer o'n cyfrifoldebau datganoledig ar gyfer adfywio cymdeithasol trefol a gwledig. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn anwybyddu'r broblem ei bod yn costio £1 i wneud taliad wyneb yn wyneb mewn swyddfa bost o'i gymharu ag un geiniog i drosglwyddo'r arian yn uniongyrchol i gyfrif banc rhywun. Daw'r broblem ar ôl y trosglwyddiad hwnnw—sut y mae cael gafael ar yr arian yn eich cyfrif banc os nad oes gennych gangen o fanc neu gymdeithas adeiladu yn eich cymuned? Dyna'r broblem y dylid rhoi sylw iddi, yn ein barn ni.

Gwasanaethau Deintyddiaeth Dentistry Services

C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau deintyddiaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1512(FM)

Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on dentistry services in Wales? OAQ1512(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae 93 y cant o ddeintyddion wedi llofnodi'r cytundeb deintyddol sydd ar waith ers 1 Ebrill, ac mae'r deintyddion hyn yn darparu dros 95 y cant o wasanaethau deintyddol y GIG a oedd ar gael cyn y newid. Mae'r £30 miliwn ychwanegol a fuddsoddir mewn deintyddiaeth yn y flwyddyn ariannol sydd newydd ddechrau yn gynydd o 35 y cant ar dlyrniad llynedd.

The First Minister: Ninety-three per cent of dentists signed up to the new dental contract from 1 April, and these dentists provide over 95 per cent of the NHS dental services available immediately prior to the changes. Investment of an additional £30 million in NHS dentistry in this financial year represents a 35 per cent increase on last year's allocation.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r cynllun gwasanaethau deintyddol personol wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr yn sir Gaerfyrddin yng nghyd-destun sefydlu deintyddion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The personal dental services scheme has been a huge success in Carmarthenshire from the point of view of establishing dentists within the national health service.

2.10 p.m.

Yr ydym yn gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu cadw'r deintyddion hynny o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond a dderbyniwch fod nifer helaeth o bobl yn parhau i orfod teithio yn bell i gael y gwasanaeth hwn? Beth fydd eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod gan bawb yng Nghymru, pa le bynnag y maent yn byw, fynediad cyfartal i wasanaeth deintyddol o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol?

We hope to be able to retain those dentists within the health service, but do you accept that a considerable number of people still have to travel great distances to receive this service? What will your Government do to ensure that all the people of Wales, wherever they live, have equal access to dental services under the national health service?

Y Prif Weinidog: Erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, gobeithiwn y bydd yr hawl honno ar gael, yn ymarferol, heb i bobl orfod teithio'n rhy bell. Hyd yn oed os nad oes gennych ddeintydd dan y GIG ar hyn o bryd, gobeithiwn y byddwch yn gallu dod o hyd i wasanaeth heb unrhyw broblem. Yr wyf yn croesawu eich geiriau cynnes i ddisgrifio'r sefyllfa yn eich etholaeth chi; credaf fod hynny'n adlewyrchu'r sefyllfa ar hyd a lled Cymru, er nad yw'n wir ym mhob ardal. Ceir anhawster ambell waith gyda'r cytundebau hyn, ac yr wyf yn derbyn hynny, ond credaf fod y sefyllfa wedi'i thrawsnewid yn ystod yr wyth mis diwethaf.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): The First Minister is right to say that there have been problems with the new contract; he is also right to say that there are problems with access to a dentist in some areas. Does he have any figures for the number of people who have been deregistered from NHS dentistry over the last year? There have clearly been many such deregistrations. We know that the Prime Minister has promised access to NHS dentistry for all—that certainly has not happened in Wales. We know that there are massive problems throughout Wales. Does the First Minister have a specific figure of those deregistered over the last year?

The First Minister: I am not sure whether this is the figure that you are looking for, but it is analogous to it: the number of people in Wales not registered for NHS dental care has fallen by 4,790 since last June. Those may not be the same people, as it paints a net picture rather than a gross picture, but it represents, we believe, the fact that 47.8 per cent of the Welsh population are registered with a dentist. However, the important point is the one that I made to Rhodri Glyn: we are quietly confident that, by the end of this financial year, there will not be any difficulty in any part of Wales in registering with an NHS dentist.

Jenny Randerson: I will pursue your last statement. Are you seriously making a commitment this afternoon that, with less than half the population currently registered

The First Minister: By the end of this financial year, we hope that that right will be available, on a practical level, without the need for people to travel too far. Even if you do not currently have an NHS dentist, we hope that you will be able to access the service without any problems. I appreciate your warm words about the situation in your constituency; I believe that that reflects the situation across Wales, although not in all areas. I accept that there are occasional problems with these contracts, but I believe that the situation has been transformed over the last eight months.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn iawn wrth ddweud bod problemau wedi bod gyda'r contract newydd; mae'n iawn hefyd wrth ddweud bod problemau gyda chael mynediad at ddeintydd mewn rhai ardaloedd. A oes ganddo ffigurau ynghylch nifer y bobl sydd wedi'u datgofrestru o ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Yn amlwg bu sawl achos o'r fath o ddatgofrestru. Gwyddom fod Prif Weinidog Prydain wedi addo y caiff pawb fynediad at ddeintyddiaeth y GIG—yn sicr ni ddigwyddodd hynny yng Nghymru. Gwyddom fod problemau aruthrol ar hyd a lled Cymru. A oes gan y Prif Weinidog ffigur penodol ar gyfer y rhai a ddatgofrestrwyd yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr ai hwn yw'r ffigur yr ydych yn chwilio amdano, ond mae'n cyfateb iddo: mae nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sydd heb eu cofrestru ar gyfer gofal deintyddol dan y GIG wedi cwmpo 4,790 ers mis Mehefin diwethaf. Efallai nad yr un bobl yw'r rheini, gan mai darlun net yn hytrach na darlun gros a roddir, ond mae'n golygu, yn ein barn ni, fod 47.8 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru wedi'u cofrestru gyda deintydd. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt pwysig yw hwnnw a wneuthum i Rhodri Glyn: yr ydym yn dawel hyderus na fydd dim anhawster, erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, i gofrestru gyda deintydd dan y GIG mewn dim un rhan o Gymru.

Jenny Randerson: Dilynaf yn eich gosodiad diwethaf. A ydych o ddifrif yn rhoi ymrwymiad y prynhawn yma, a llai na hanner y boblogaeth ar hyn o bryd wedi'u

with an NHS dentist, by the end of the year you will have improved the situation so much that everybody who wishes to register with an NHS dentist will be able to do so? That will be a large proportion of the population.

The First Minister: That is the estimate that we have from the service—by the end of this financial year, there should not be any problems for people wishing to register with an NHS dentist. Many people do not wish to register for NHS dentistry; they are happy with either no dental care, emergency dental care or non-NHS dental care. However, that is the service's belief. The situation is transforming itself so rapidly that the service believes that that should be possible. People who wish to register should be able to go to NHS Direct for a list of dentists, and they should not have to travel very far to access the service.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cofio Tony Blair yn dweud yn 1997:

'We have 24 hours to save the NHS'.

O ystyried y trafferthion a welwyd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gyffredinol a'r gwasanaeth deintyddol yn benodol, a ydych yn credu bod Tony Blair wedi gwneud peth call yn gwneud datganiad o'r fath?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dylech fod wedi gwrando ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Rhodri Glyn ynglŷn â'r gwelliant mawr sydd wedi'i weld yn ei etholaeth ef o ran y gallu i dderbyn gwasanaeth deintyddol dan y GIG. Mae pethau wedi gwella'n fawr dros yr wyth mis diwethaf, ers mis Hydref, pan gyflwynwyd newid yn y rheolau ynglŷn â sut yr oedd arian yn cael ei ailgylchu pan oedd deintydd yn penderfynu mynd yn breifat. Hefyd, mae'r buddsoddiad mewn hyfforddi meddygon, nyrsys a therapyddion ychwanegol yn dangos ein bod yn credu yn nyfodol y GIG. Credwn mai'r GIG yw carreg sylfaen gwasanaethau iechyd ym Mhrydain.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi clywed yr addewidion hyn o'r blaen. Yr ydych wedi

cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG, y byddwch erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn wedi gwella'r sefyllfa i'r fath raddau nes y bydd pawb sydd yn dymuno cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG yn gallu gwneud hynny? Bydd hynny'n gyfran fawr o'r boblogaeth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna'r amcangyfrif a gawsom oddi wrth y gwasanaeth—erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, ni ddylai fod dim problem i bobl sydd yn dymuno cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Mae llawer o bobl nad ydynt yn dymuno cofrestru ar gyfer deintyddiaeth y GIG; maent yn hapus gyda dim gofal deintyddol, gofal deintyddol brys yn unig neu ofal deintyddol y tu allan i'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, dyna a gredir gan y gwasanaeth. Mae'r sefyllfa'n cael ei gweddnewid mor gyflym fel bod y gwasanaeth yn credu y dylai hynny fod yn bosibl. Dylai pobl sydd yn dymuno cofrestru allu mynd at Galw Iechyd Cymru am restr o ddeintyddion, ac ni ddylent orfod teithio'n bell iawn i gael y gwasanaeth.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I am sure that you remember Tony Blair saying in 1997:

Mae gennym 24 awr i achub y GIG.

Given the difficulties experienced by the health service generally and the dental service specifically, do you think that it was prudent of Tony Blair to make such a statement?

The First Minister: You should have listened to what Rhodri Glyn had to say about the vast improvements seen in his constituency in terms of being able to receive NHS dental services. The situation has improved greatly over the last eight months, since October, when a rule change was introduced on recycling money when a dentist decided to go private. In addition, investment in training additional doctors, nurses and therapists demonstrates that we believe in the future of the NHS. We believe that the NHS is the bedrock of health services in Britain.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We have heard these promises before. You have made a clear

gwneud addewid pendant heddiw y bydd pawb, erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, yn cael mynediad at ddeintydd y GIG. Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r hyn a ddywedwyd gan eich plaid chi yn 1999. Dywedodd Tony Blair bryd hynny,

everybody, within two years, will have access to an NHS dentist simply by ringing NHS Direct.

Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd—addewid wedi cael ei dorri. Dywedasoeh ym maniffesto 1999 y byddai pawb ym mhob ardal o Gymru yn cael mynediad at ddeintydd y GIG erbyn 2003. Addewid arall wedi'i wneud; addewid arall wedi'i dorri. Pam ddylem eich coelio chi y tro hwn, Brif Weinidog?

Do, fe gyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas at y sefyllfa yn ei etholaeth ef, ond dywedodd hefyd nad yw hynny'n wir mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Gallaf ddweud wrthyfch nad yw'n bosibl cael mynediad at ddeintydd y GIG yn Ynys Môn ar hyn o bryd. A ydych yn dweud wrthyf, gyda'ch llaw ar eich calon, y bydd pawb yn Ynys Môn erbyn diwedd eleni yn medru cael mynediad at ddeintydd y GIG?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r gwasanaeth yn dweud wrthym y dylai hynny fod yn bosibl, ac mae'n hyderus yn dawel fach mai dyna fydd y sefyllfa erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn bresennol. Nid yw'r sefyllfa gystal ym mhob cornel o Gymru ag ydyw mewn mannau eraill. Yr ydym yn gwybod am gorneli lle nad yw'r trawsnewid y cyfeiriais ato wedi digwydd hyd yn hyn. Mae'n eithaf tebyg bod Ynys Môn, eich etholaeth chi, yn un o'r corneli hynny. Ambell waith, mae sefydlu un ddeintyddfa fawr newydd yn gallu trawsnewid y sefyllfa, fel yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yn y cyfnod presennol, ond dyna'r hyder tawel sydd gan y gwasanaeth, ac yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedir ganddo.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am not quite sure now whether that is a promise made by you or whether you are reporting a promise being made by someone else. In other words, is this a Labour promise that there will be access to an NHS dentist in all parts of Wales by 2006, or are you saying that that is what you are being told will happen? I think that we need clarification of that, as you seem to be giving yourself some wriggle room so that you can

promise today that everybody will be able to access NHS dental services by the end of the year. I remind you of what was said by your party in 1999. At that time, Tony Blair said,

ymhen dwy flynedd, bydd pawb yn gallu cael mynediad at ddeintydd GIG drwy wneud dim ond ffonio Galw Iechyd.

That has not happened—a promise has been broken. You said in the 1999 manifesto that everyone in every part of Wales would have access to an NHS dentist by 2003. Another promise made; another promise broken. Why should we believe you this time, First Minister?

Yes, Rhodri Glyn did refer to the situation in his constituency, but he also said that that is not the case in many other parts of Wales. I can tell you that it is not possible to get access to an NHS dentist in Anglesey at the moment. Are you telling me, hand on heart, that everyone in Anglesey will have access to an NHS dentist by the end of this year?

The First Minister: The service is telling us that that should be possible, and it is quietly confident that that will be the case by the end of the current year. The situation is not quite as good in every corner of Wales as it is in others. We know of some parts where the transformation to which I referred has not yet occurred, and it is highly likely that Anglesey, your constituency, is one of those parts. Sometimes, setting up one major new dental surgery can transform the situation, as is happening at Whitland at the current time, but that is the quiet confidence that the service has, and I accept what it tells me.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid wyf yn gwbl sicr yn awr a yw hynny'n addewid yr ydych chi'n ei wneud ynteu a ydych yn sôn am addewid yn cael ei wneud gan rywun arall. Mewn geiriau eraill, a yw hyn yn addewid gan Lafur y bydd pobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru yn gallu cael mynediad at ddeintydd GIG erbyn 2006, ynteu a ydych yn dweud mai hynny a fydd yn digwydd yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedir wrthyfch? Credaf fod angen eglurhad ynghylch hynny,

say at the end of 2006, 'I did not say it; it was the professionals who said it'. We need to know whether this is your promise to the people of Wales.

Let me tell you, you have a massive mountain to climb. If we in Wales are to have the same number of dentists in proportion to population as countries such as Austria, Poland, Canada and Italy have, we would need an additional 300 dentists. Let us be honest about this, First Minister. Every single promise that you have made on dentistry since 1997 has been broken. Why should we believe you this time?

The First Minister: Because the increase in expenditure is pretty spectacular. In the financial year ending on 31 March 2006, expenditure on NHS dentistry in Wales was £88 million. Expenditure had been rising steadily at around £5 million a year. In the financial year that has just begun, it is rising by £30 million. It has gone from £88 million to £113 million—a 35 per cent increase in one year on NHS dentistry in Wales. I think that it is that increase in funding that leads the service to believe that it can deliver what I have described.

If you read the Record of Proceedings tomorrow, you will read my words. Those are the words that are on record. I do not think that you want to be rearranging my words, and I am sure that Jenny Randerson would not want to rearrange my words either.

gan eich bod fel pe baech yn rhoi lle i chi eich hun sleifio ohoni fel y gallwch ddweud ar ddiwedd 2006, 'Nid fi a ddywedodd hynny; y gweithwyr proffesiynol a ddywedodd hynny'. Mae angen inni gael gwybod a yw hyn yn addewid gennych i bobl Cymru.

Gadewch imi ddweud wrthy, mae gennych fynydd enfawr i'w ddringo. Os ydym ni yng Nghymru i gael yr un nifer o ddeintyddion o'i gymharu â'r boblogaeth â gwledydd fel Awstria, Gwlad Pwyl, Canada a'r Eidal, byddai angen 300 o ddeintyddion ychwanegol arnom. Gadewch inni fod yn onest am hyn, Brif Weinidog. Mae pob addewid yr ydych wedi ei wneud am ddeintyddiaeth ers 1997 wedi cael ei dorri. Pam y dylem eich credu y tro hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Am fod y cynnydd yn y gwariant wedi bod yn bur anhygoel. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol yn gorffen ar 31 Mawrth 2006, yr oedd y gwariant ar ddeintyddiaeth GIG yng Nghymru yn £88 miliwn. Yr oedd y gwariant wedi bod yn cynyddu rhyw £5 miliwn y flwyddyn yn gyson. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol sydd newydd ddechrau, mae'n cynyddu £30 miliwn. Mae wedi cynyddu o £88 miliwn i £113 miliwn—cynnydd o 35 y cant mewn blwyddyn ar ddeintyddiaeth GIG yng Nghymru. Credaf mai'r cynnydd hwnnw o ran cyllid sy'n peri i'r gwasanaeth gredu y gall gyflawni'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddisgrifio.

Os darllenwch Gofnod y Trafodion yfory, fe ddarllenwch fy ngeiriau. Dyna'r geiriau sydd ar glawr a chadw. Ni chredaf y dylech fod yn aildrefnu fy ngeiriau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai Jenny Randerson ychwaith am aildrefnu fy ngeiriau.

Brechiadau Teithio Travel Vaccinations

Q3 Laura Anne Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the cost of travel vaccinations in Wales? OAQ1521(FM)

The First Minister: Vaccines are available on the NHS, and protect against diseases such as hepatitis A, polio and typhoid for travellers visiting high-risk areas. General practitioners are able to charge for other travel vaccines administered on a private

C3 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gost brechiadau teithio yng Nghymru? OAQ1521(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae brechiadau ar gael ar y GIG, ac maent yn diogelu rhag clefydau fel hepatitis A, polio a theiffoid i deithwyr sy'n ymweld ag ardaloedd lle y mae'r perygl yn fawr. Gall meddygon teulu godi tâl am frechiadau teithio eraill a roddir ar

prescription. The amount charged is at the discretion of the GP.

Laura Anne Jones: Two A-level students in my constituency are planning a post-examination trip to Ghana as volunteers. Both young ladies are receiving the same travel vaccinations in different surgeries in the same constituency. One is getting her vaccinations for free; the other is paying £200 for them. That seems to be somewhat bizarre and unfair. Should we not be looking to standardise these charges across the board in Wales so that one student has the same opportunity as another? Is this not just another example of the postcode lottery in the NHS in Wales?

The First Minister: You did not say what they were being vaccinated against, or at least I did not pick up on that. I repeat what I said: if the vaccinations are for hepatitis A, polio and typhoid, and they are visiting high-risk areas for those diseases, the rule is that the vaccine is available on the NHS. If you want to write to me with the specific details, I will make sure that either Brian Gibbons or I respond to you.

2.20 p.m.

Dyfodol Gwasanaethau Swyddfa'r Post Future of Post Office Services

Q4 Jocelyn Davies: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Department for Work and Pensions on the future of post office services? OAQ1510(FM)

The First Minister: I mentioned earlier the exchange of correspondence between Edwina Hart and John Hutton. She wrote to the Secretary of State and got a reply from James Plaskitt, the parliamentary under-secretary who is dealing with this matter, a couple of months ago. The Department for Work and Pensions has clearly set out its stall as regards what will happen in March 2010. However, we do not know what will happen after March 2010 as it is still discussing that with the Post Office.

Jocelyn Davies: First Minister, as some areas

bresgripsiwn preifat. Mater i'r meddyg teulu yw faint y mae yn ei godi.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae dwy fyfyrwraig Safon Uwch yn fy etholaeth yn cynllunio taith ar ôl eu harholiadau i Ghana fel gwirfoddolwyr. Mae'r naill ferch ifanc a'r llall yn cael yr un brechiadau teithio mewn meddygfeydd gwahanol yn yr un etholaeth. Mae un yn cael ei brechiadau am ddim; mae'r llall yn talu £200 amdanynt. Mae hynny'n ymddangos braidd yn rhyfedd ac yn annheg. Oni ddylem ni fod yn ceisio safoni'r taliadau hyn ym mhobman yng Nghymru fel bod un myfyriwr yn cael yr un cyfle ag un arall? Onid enghraifft arall o'r loteri cod post yn y GIG yng Nghymru yw hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ddywedasoch beth yr oeddynt yn cael ei frechu rhagddo, neu o leiaf ni nodais i hynny. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais: os yw'r brechiadau yn erbyn hepatitis A, polio a theiffoid, a'u bod yn ymweld ag ardaloedd lle y mae perygl mawr iddynt ddal y clefydau hynny, y rheol yw bod y brechiad ar gael ar y GIG. Os ydych am ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r manylion penodol, gwnaf yn siŵr fy mod i neu Brian Gibbons yn anfon ateb atoch.

C4 Jocelyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cynnal gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ynghylch dyfodol gwasanaethau swyddfa'r post? OAQ1510(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Soniais yn gynharach am y gohebu sydd wedi bod rhwng Edwina Hart a John Hutton. Ysgrifennodd at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a chafodd ateb gan James Plaskitt, yr is-ysgrifennydd seneddol sy'n delio â'r mater hwn, ryw ddeufis yn ôl. Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi nodi ei bwriadau'n glir o ran yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd ym mis Mawrth 2010. Fodd bynnag, ni wyddom beth fydd yn digwydd ar ôl mis Mawrth 2010 gan fod yr adran yn dal i drafod hynny gyda Swyddfa'r Post.

Jocelyn Davies: Brif Weinidog, gan fod rhai

of Wales are fast becoming post office and bank-free zones, many people who are on benefits will be dependent on cash machines and may be forced to pay bank charges to withdraw their money. I am sure that you will agree that that would be an unfair levy on those who are least able to bear it. You have admitted that you failed so far, but will you give a categorical assurance today that your Government will do whatever it can to retain the post office card account in Wales beyond 2010, as I am sure that you have more in your armoury than one letter from the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration?

The First Minister: Indeed, and there are three years and 10 months to go on this and to say that we have 'failed so far' seems to me to be a peculiar use of words. They do not know what will succeed after March 2010 and we will be continuing to press them to make available a wide range of services. This is against the background of the other, wider review that is going on between the Department of Trade and Industry and the Treasury as to what to do about the paradox that the Post Office is meant to be a business and it is not meant to run at a loss. However, the loss of the benefits custom has taken away from post offices what forms 80 per cent of the business in some areas, and 50 per cent or 60 per cent on average, and they do not have alternative products to put in the place of the benefits business as yet. That is the problem that the Post Office faces, and which the DTI is continuing to discuss with the Treasury.

Christine Chapman: There is a lot of anxiety in my constituency about the future of post office services. I do not think that this is just a problem for rural areas. While it is incumbent on Governments to explore ways of saving public money and of doing things more efficiently, do you agree that we need to find some middle ground between the good use of public money and what is good for local communities? This will often be the same thing, but sometimes, as in this case, they may conflict. How is the Welsh Assembly Government representing the interests of local communities in Wales in

ardaloedd o Gymru yn prysur droi'n barthau heb swyddfeydd post na banciau, bydd llawer o bobl sydd ar fudd-daliadau yn ddibynnol ar beiriannau pres a gallent gael eu gorfodi i dalu taliadau banc er mwyn codi eu harian. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno y byddai hynny'n ardoll annheg ar y rhai sydd leiaf abl i'w hysgwyddo. Yr ydych wedi cyfaddef eich bod wedi methu hyd yma, ond a roddwch sicrwydd pendant heddiw y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn gwneud beth bynnag a all i gadw cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yng Nghymru ar ôl 2010, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr bod mwy o ddulliau gweithredu ar gael ichi na dim ond un llythyr oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir, ac mae tair blynedd a 10 mis i fynd o ran hyn ac mae dweud ein bod wedi 'methu hyd yma' yn ymddangos i mi yn ddefnydd rhyfedd ar eiriau. Nid ydynt yn gwybod beth a geir ar ôl mis Mawrth 2010 a byddwn yn pwysu arnynt i ddarparu ystod eang o wasanaethau. Mae hyn yn digwydd gyda'r adolygiad arall, ehangach, yn gefndir iddo—adolygiad sy'n cael ei gynnal rhwng yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys i ystyried beth i'w wneud ynghylch y paradocs bod Swyddfa'r Post i fod yn fusnes ac nad yw i fod i redeg ar gollod. Fodd bynnag, mae colli cwsmeriaeth y budd-daliadau wedi mynd ag 80 y cant o'r busnes mewn rhai ardaloedd, a 50 y cant neu 60 y cant ar gyfartaledd, oddi ar swyddfeydd post, ac nid oes ganddynt gynhyrchion amgen i'w rhoi yn lle busnes y budd-daliadau eto. Dyna'r broblem sy'n wynebu Swyddfa'r Post, y mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn dal i'w thrafod gyda'r Trysorlys.

Christine Chapman: Mae llawer o bryder yn fy etholaeth am ddyfodol gwasanaethau swyddfeydd post. Nid wyf yn credu mai problem i ardaloedd gwledig yn unig yw hon. Er ei bod yn ddyletswydd ar Lywodraethau archwilio ffyrdd o arbed arian cyhoeddus a gwneud pethau'n fwy effeithlon, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni ganfod rhyw dir canol rhwng defnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn dda a'r hyn sy'n dda i gymunedau lleol? Yn aml, bydd hynny'n golygu'r un peth, ond weithiau, fel yn yr achos hwn, gallant wrthdaro. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynrychioli buddiannau

discussing, with the UK Government, ways of finding this middle ground?

The First Minister: You are absolutely right about our post office development fund expenditure—we are certainly not biased towards rural areas as about 60 per cent was spent in isolated urban communities, which can be even more deprived. That is the way in which we ran the post office development fund. We cannot run it at the moment because we do not know in which post offices it would be right to encourage investment until the wider review by the DTI and the Treasury is completed. We hope that that will emerge from the inter-departmental undergrowth in Whitehall before too long and then we can make plans as to what to do about the post office development fund and whether to re-open it, because I entirely accept the premise behind your question.

Mark Isherwood: You claim that there are three years and 10 months to wait, but my understanding is that new applicants are being denied access to these cards now. How do you respond to a sub-postmaster in my home county who has contacted politicians to ask whether it is the Government's intention to close all small sub-post offices? Will you answer her call for elected politicians to support local post offices? Will you line up alongside the 321 Members of Parliament, including the three Welsh Conservative Members, who have signed Kate Hoey of the Labour Party's early day motion on this matter? Will you tell the UK Government, on behalf of all parties in this chamber, to think again?

The First Minister: They have not concluded their thinking, therefore I would agree with the idea that negotiations are ongoing between the DTI and the Treasury as to what to do about the underlying chronic loss-making position of a large number of post offices in this country. Those losses were there even before benefit payments were transferred from post office to bank accounts because of the massive 99 per cent savings in administrative costs. That review,

cymunedau lleol yng Nghymru wrth drafod ffyrdd o ddod o hyd i'r tir canol hwn gyda Llywodraeth y DU?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn hollol iawn ynghylch ein gwariant drwy'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post—yn sicr, nid ydym yn gogwyddo tuag at ardaloedd gwledig gan fod tua 60 y cant wedi cael ei wario mewn cymunedau trefol ynysig, sy'n gallu bod yn fwy difreintiedig fyth. Dyna sut y cafodd y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post ei gweinyddu gennym. Ni allwn barhau â hi ar hyn o bryd gan na wyddom ym mha swyddfeydd post y byddai'n briodol buddsoddi hyd nes y bydd yr adolygiad ehangach gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys wedi cael ei gwblhau. Gobeithiwn y daw hynny'n hysbys o'r drysi rhyngadrannol yn Whitehall cyn bo hir, yna gallwn gynllunio beth i'w wneud ynghylch y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post ac a ydym am ei hailagor, oherwydd yr wyf yn derbyn y rhagosodiad y seiliwyd eich cwestiwn arno yn llwyr.

Mark Isherwood: Yr ydych yn honni bod angen aros am dair blynedd a 10 mis, ond yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, nid yw ymgeiswyr newydd yn cael manteisio ar y cardiau hyn yn awr. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i is-bostfeistr yn fy sir sydd wedi cysylltu â gwleidyddion i ofyn ai bwriad y Llywodraeth yw cau pob is-swyddfa bost fach? A wnewch ateb ei galwad hi ar i wleidyddion etholedig gefnogi swyddfeydd post lleol? A wnewch uno â'r 321 o Aelodau Seneddol, gan gynnwys tri Aelod Ceidwadol o Gymru, sydd wedi llofnodi'r cynnig cynnar-yn-y-dydd o eiddo Kate Hoey o'r Blaid Lafur ar y mater hwn? A wnewch ddweud wrth Lywodraeth y DU, ar ran yr holl bleidiau yn y siambr hon, am feddwl eto?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydynt wedi gorffen ystyried, felly byddwn yn cytuno â'r syniad bod trafodaethau'n parhau rhwng yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys o ran beth i'w wneud ynghylch sefyllfa waelodol nifer fawr o swyddfeydd post yn y wlad hon, sef eu bod yn gwneud colled yn barhaus. Yr oedd y colledion hynny'n bodoli hyd yn oed cyn i daliadau budd-dal gael eu trosglwyddo o gyfrifon swyddfeydd post i gyfrifon banc oherwydd yr arbedion enfawr o 99 y cant yn

which is ongoing between the DTI and the Treasury, is still an open book and it is for us to continue to lobby for them to put money into retention, because although the post office is a business, it is unique because it represents the backbone of social life, especially for older people and in areas that are without a bank and in which a local building society is not available.

y costau gweinyddol. Mae'r adolygiad hwnnw, sy'n parhau rhwng yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys, heb ei gwblhau a mater i ni yw parhau i lobio o blaid neilltuo arian er mwyn cadw'r swyddfeydd post, oherwydd er bod swyddfa'r post yn fusnes, mae'n unigryw gan ei bod yn asgwrn cefn bywyd cymdeithasol, yn enwedig i bobl hŷn ac mewn ardaloedd sydd heb fanc a lle nad oes cymdeithas adeiladu leol ar gael.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5, OAQ1501(FM), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5, OAQ1501(FM), has been withdrawn.

Y Cynllun Cymorth Ariannol The Financial Assistance Scheme

Q6 Owen John Thomas: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions regarding the financial assistance scheme? OAQ1525(FM)

C6 Owen John Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cynnal gyda'r Ysgrifennydd dros Waith a Phensiynau ynglŷn â'r cynllun cymorth ariannol? OAQ1525(FM)

The First Minister: I last met John Hutton, the Secretary of State, on 12 January as part of a jointly-led delegation with Michael Leahy, the general secretary of Community union, and on 27 March, I wrote an updating letter to the Secretary of State specifically about the inadequacies of the financial assistance scheme.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfarfŷm ddiwethaf â John Hutton, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ar 12 Ionawr fel rhan o ddirprwyaeth a oedd yn cael ei chyd-arwain gan Michael Leahy, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol undeb Community, ac ar 27 Mawrth ysgrifennais lythyr diweddar at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn benodol ynghylch diffygion y cynllun cymorth ariannol.

Owen John Thomas: Of the 900 former Allied Steel and Wire workers, only 17 have received payment under the Government's financial assistance scheme, averaging just over £3,000 for a lifetime's work. That is less than half the money spent by New Labour on haircuts for Cherie Blair. Meanwhile, the Deputy Prime Minister, known as 'no jobs' Prescott, can expect to receive a pension windfall in the region of £1.5 million. First Minister, is that your idea of New Labour's delivering justice and equality for the people?

Owen John Thomas: O'r 900 o gyn weithwyr Allied Steel and Wire, dim ond 17 sydd wedi cael taliad o dan gynllun cymorth ariannol y Llywodraeth, a hynny'n ddim ond mymryn dros £3,000 ar gyfartaledd am oes o waith. Mae hynny'n llai na hanner yr arian a wariwyd gan Lafur Newydd ar drin gwallt Cherie Blair. Yn y cyfamser, gall y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, a adwaenir fel Prescott 'dim i'w wneud', ddisgwyl cael taliad pensiwn o tua £1.5 miliwn. Brif Weinidog, ai Llafur Newydd yn sicrhau cyfiawnder a thegwch i'r bobl yw hynny yn eich barn chi?

The First Minister: You have a unique way of winning friends and influencing people, Owen John. The key thing is that there is no disagreement between us, as far as I am aware, on the fact that the financial assistance scheme is inadequate, because it only covers people who were within three years of

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennych ffordd unigryw o ennill ffrindiau a dylanwadu ar bobl, Owen John. Y peth allweddol yw nad oes anghytundeb rhyngom, hyd y gwn, ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod y cynllun cymorth ariannol yn annigonol, gan nad yw ond yn cwmpasu pobl a oedd o fewn tair blynedd i

retirement on the day on which Allied Steel and Wire went into administration and the scheme commenced its long, drawn-out wind-up process, which has just been completed now, three and a half years later.

You do not like getting involved in all this factual stuff; you prefer the political knockabout. If you think that that will help people in the Cardiff area, fair enough: I have very different views on that. What we are pursuing is how to persuade the Government to put more money in so that people who were more than three years from retirement on the day on which Allied Steel and Wire went into administrative receivership, and, tragically, the pension fund went into wind-up mode, can actually get access. We know now that only 17 per cent of the pension entitlement will emerge from the pension fund itself. That is then made up to 80 per cent, but only 17 people have benefited so far, because only that number of people were within three years of retirement. That is ludicrous, and we have to try to extend that three-year period.

Glyn Davies: I think that we can all agree that the workers of Allied Steel and Wire have not been treated properly, and that they should receive their pensions. We can also agree that the Westminster Government is simply is not up to this job. You may have discussed this with the Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, but what about discussions with the Chancellor, who created the problem by taking up to £6 billion a year, every year, from pension funds, thereby destroying pension funds? It is the Chancellor who has to take the decisions that would enable a successful scheme to be in place.

The First Minister: That has absolutely nothing to do with it. The problem is that private occupational pension schemes were left uninsured against the collapse of the company by the last pensions Act during the period of a Government of the same colour as your party, Glyn. That meant that it did not matter how widely spread the investments of

ymddeol ar y diwrnod yr aeth Allied Steel and Wire i ddwylo'r gweinyddwyr ac y dechreuodd y cynllun ar ei broses hirfaith o ddirwyn i ben, nad yw ond newydd gael ei chwblhau, dair blynedd a hanner yn ddiweddarach.

Nid ydych yn hoffi ymhél â'r holl stwff ffeithiol hwn; mae'n well gennych y colbio gwleidyddol. Os ydych yn credu y bydd hynny o gymorth i bobl yn ardal Caerdydd, digon teg: mae gennyf farn wahanol iawn am hynny. Yr hyn yr ydym ni'n mynd yn ei gylch yw sut i berswadio'r Llywodraeth i ddarparu rhagor o arian fel bod modd i bobl yr oedd ganddynt fwy na thair blynedd nes eu bod yn ymddeol ar y diwrnod yr aeth Allied Steel and Wire i ddwylo'r derbynwyr gweinyddol, ac, yn drychinebus, y dechreuodd y gronfa bensiwn gael ei dirwyn i ben, allu manteisio ar y cynllun. Gwyddom erbyn hyn mai dim ond 17 y cant o'r hawl pensiwn a fydd yn dod o'r gronfa bensiwn ei hun. Ychwanegir at hynny wedyn fel bod y pensiwn yn 80 y cant o'r hawl, ond dim ond 17 o bobl sydd wedi elwa hyd yma, oherwydd dim ond y nifer hwnnw o bobl a oedd o fewn tair blynedd i ymddeol. Mae hynny'n chwerthinllyd a rhaid inni geisio ymestyn y cyfnod hwnnw o dair blynedd.

Glyn Davies: Credaf y gallwn i gyd gytuno nad yw gweithwyr Allied Steel and Wire wedi cael eu trin yn iawn, ac y dylent gael eu pensiynau. Gallwn gytuno hefyd nad yw Llywodraeth San Steffan yn alluog i wneud ei gwaith. Efallai eich bod wedi trafod hyn gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Waith a Phensiynau, ond beth am drafodaethau gyda'r Canghellor, a greodd y broblem drwy gymryd hyd at £6 biliwn y flwyddyn, bob blwyddyn, o gronfeydd pensiwn, gan ddinistrio cronfeydd pensiwn drwy hynny? Y Canghellor sy'n gorfod gwneud y penderfyniadau a fyddai'n golygu bod modd cynnal cynllun llwyddiannus.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim o gwbl â'r peth. Y broblem yw bod cynlluniau pensiwn galwedigaethol preifat wedi cael eu gadael heb yswiriant i'w gwarchod pe bai'r cwmni'n methu gan y Ddeddf bensiynau ddiwethaf yn ystod cyfnod Llywodraeth o'r un lliw â'ch plaid chi, Glyn. Golygai hynny na wnâi wahaniaeth pa mor

the company pension scheme were, because, if that one company's shares go down, as happened with Allied Steel and Wire, *finito*, the company goes into administrative receivership and, all of a sudden, the company has to go into wind-up mode, sell all its shares, buy bonds and buy annuities to pay out the pensions. If that happens during a stock market slump, as happened with Allied Steel and Wire, the pensions are finished because the pension fund is not insured. They will be insured henceforth—Labour has put that right—but the problem is how to cover those who worked for companies that have gone out of business before the pension protection fund comes in. The financial assistance scheme is trying, very inadequately, to cover those unfortunate people, like those who worked for Allied Steel and Wire.

eang yr oedd buddsoddiadau cynllun pensiwn cwmni wedi cael eu lledaenu, oherwydd, os yw cyfranddaliadau'r un cwmni hwnnw'n mynd i lawr, fel a ddigwyddodd gydag Allied Steel and Wire, *finito*, mae'r cwmni'n mynd i ddwylo'r derbynydd gweinyddol ac, yn ddisymwth, mae'r cwmni'n gorfod dechrau ar y broses o ddirwyn i ben, gwerthu ei holl gyfranddaliadau, prynu bondiau a phrynu blwydd-daliadau i dalu'r pensiynau. Os yw hynny'n digwydd pan fydd cwmp yn y farchnad stoc, fel a ddigwyddodd gydag Allied Steel and Wire, mae wedi darfod ar y pensiynau gan nad yw'r gronfa pensiwn wedi cael ei hyswirio. O hyn ymlaen byddant yn cael eu hyswirio—mae Llafur wedi unioni hynny—ond y broblem yw sut mae gwarchod y rhai a oedd yn gweithio mewn cwmnïau a oedd wedi mynd allan o fusnes cyn i'r gronfa gwarchod pensiynau gael ei chyflwyno. Mae'r cynllun cymorth ariannol, mewn modd annigonol iawn, yn ceisio gwarchod y bobl anffodus hynny, fel y rhai a oedd yn gweithio i Allied Steel and Wire.

Y Strategaeth Pobl Hŷn The Older Person's Strategy

Q7 Sandy Mewies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the older person's strategy? OAQ1520(FM)

C7 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y strategaeth pobl hŷn? OAQ1520(FM)

The First Minister: I declare an interest, Sandy. Good progress continues to be made on the implementation of our strategy for older people. The Bill to establish a commissioner for older people in Wales has completed its passage through the House of Lords and is in the House of Commons awaiting a date for its Second Reading.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant, Sandy. Mae'r gwaith o weithredu ein strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn dal i fynd rhagddo'n dda. Mae'r Mesur i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru wedi cwblhau ei daith drwy Dŷ'r Arglwyddi ac mae yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn aros am ddyddiad ar gyfer ei Ail Ddarlleniad.

Sandy Mewies: The strategy for older people in Flintshire has published its annual report detailing its work over the last 12 months in setting up older people's fora. There is now a network of those fora across the county. It means that older people in Flintshire can now have a structured way to ensure that their views are heard on the issues that affect them. Flintshire local authority is listening. How is the Welsh Assembly Government building on the good work being carried out at local authority level to ensure that you are also listening to older people?

Sandy Mewies: Mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn sir y Fflint wedi cyhoeddi ei hadroddiad blynyddol yn manylu ar ei gwaith dros y 12 mis diwethaf yn sefydlu fforymau i bobl hŷn. Erbyn hyn mae rhwydwaith o'r fforymau hynny ar draws y sir. Mae'n golygu bod modd i bobl hŷn yn sir y Fflint gael ffordd strwythuredig o sicrhau bod eu barn yn cael ei chlywed am y materion sy'n effeithio arnynt hwy. Mae awdurdod lleol sir y Fflint yn gwranddo. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n adeiladu ar y gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud ar lefel yr awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eich bod chithau hefyd yn

gwrando ar bobl hŷn?

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: I am pleased with the progress of the older people's forum in Flintshire. There are some 70 similar bodies around Wales which feed into the national partnership forum for older people, which deals with issues on a cross-Wales basis. I am pleased with the way in which older people are actively involved in trying to determine the priorities for the strategy which is meant to benefit them. We do not want to tell them what they need—they need to tell us what they need; the forum is the right way to do that.

Helen Mary Jones: What assessment has the Government made of the impact on the strategy for older people of your broken promise to deliver free homecare?

The First Minister: It will be very good for some groups, and not so good for others. The groups for which it will be very good are those not covered in the original promise, but which are covered in the substitute scheme—those with Alzheimer's disease and their carers, among others.

Jeff Cuthbert: Next week is Healthy Living week; do you agree that one of the key aspects of the strategy for older people is promoting healthy and active lifestyles through initiatives such as free swimming? Will you join me in encouraging everyone, especially groups associated with older people, such as Age Concern, to take part in next week's Healthy Living activities, and to promote that message across Wales?

The First Minister: Yes, and I will give a very good example of that deriving from my visit last Friday to the Betws Life Centre in Janice Gregory's constituency of Ogmere. There are walking clubs and other activity schemes, in the sense of being socially active as well as physically active, run from that centre. Some people may feel self-conscious

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn fodlon ar gynnydd y fforwm pobl hŷn yn sir y Fflint. Mae tua 70 o gyrff tebyg o gwmpas Cymru sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r fforwm partneriaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hŷn, sydd yn delio â materion ar sail Cymru gyfan. Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y modd y mae pobl hŷn yn ymwneud â'r gwaith o geisio pennu blaenoriaethau'r strategaeth sydd i fod o fudd iddynt. Nid ydym yn dymuno dweud wrthynt beth y mae arnynt ei angen—rhaid iddynt hwy ddweud wrthym ni beth y mae arnynt ei angen; y fforwm yw'r cyfrwng priodol i wneud hynny.

Helen Mary Jones: Pa asesiad a wnaeth y Llywodraeth o'r effaith ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn o ganlyniad i'r ffaith eich bod wedi torri'ch addewid i ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yn dda iawn i rai grwpiau, a heb fod cystal i eraill. Y grwpiau y bydd yn dda iawn iddynt yw'r rhai nad oeddent wedi'u cynnwys yn yr addewid gwreiddiol, ond sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y cynllun a gafwyd yn lle'r un blaenorol—y rhai sydd â chlefyd Alzheimer a'r rhai sydd yn gofalu amdanynt, ymysg eraill.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n wythnos Byw'n Iach yr wythnos nesaf; a ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r agweddau pwysicaf ar y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yw'r amcan o hyrwyddo ffyrdd iach a gweithgar o fyw drwy gynlluniau fel nofio am ddim? A wnewch ymuno â mi i annog pawb, yn enwedig grwpiau sydd yn gysylltiedig â phobl hŷn, fel Age Concern, i gymryd rhan yng ngweithgareddau Byw'n Iach yr wythnos nesaf, ac i ledaenu'r neges honno drwy Gymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, a rhoddaf enghraifft dda iawn o hynny sydd yn codi o'm hymwelid ddydd Gwener diwethaf â Chanolfan Bywyd Betws yn etholaeth Janice Gregory, sef Ogwr. Trefnir clybiau cerdded a chynlluniau gweithgarwch eraill, sydd yn golygu bod yn gymdeithasol weithgar yn ogystal â bod yn gorfforol weithgar, gan y

about going out for a hike or a walk on their own, but, once they join a club to do it, they can see the advantages, and it keeps them socially mobile as well as physically agile.

David Melding: Do you agree that, in the modern age, when many people retire at the traditional age and can expect to live for another 30 years, but on a fairly limited income if their pension provision is not that generous, one of the major disadvantages that they face is compulsory retirement ages in public services as well as in other areas of employment? We need to start to reform this system to set a good example, allowing people to work beyond 65 years of age, and perhaps to partly retire rather than fully retire, and still have an income from employment.

The First Minister: I strongly agree, and I declare an interest as a person who is over retirement age. From talking to American friends of the same age as me, I see that, in America, over the past five years they have done away with this concept of retirement age. You cannot be retired there on the grounds of age, and they do not even think about retiring at 60, 65 or 67, or the multiplicity of different retirement ages that we have for everyone bar politicians. They think in terms of your ability to do the job, your enjoyment of it and any other reasons you may have for wanting to finish work. However, it will not be based on what it says on your birth certificate; that is the way in which we must think.

Eleanor Burnham: The strategy for older people stated that older people need care that ensures dignity and independence. Now that your Government has scrapped free homecare for the elderly and the disabled, on what date will you announce the results of your review of fair charging?

The First Minister: It is a very good alternative package. If you were willing to look beyond the political knockabout at the

ganolfan honno. Gallai rhai deimlo'n annifyr wrth fynd am dro ar eu pennau eu hunain, ond, wedi iddynt ymuno â chlwb i wneud hynny, gallant weld y manteision, ac mae hynny'n peri iddynt gymdeithasu a chadw'n heini hefyd.

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r anfanteision mawr i bobl yn yr oes fodern, pan fo cynifer yn ymddeol yn yr oedran traddodiadol a hwythau'n gallu disgwyl byw am 30 mlynedd arall, ond ar incwm eithaf cyfyng os nad oes ganddynt bensiw sylweddol, yw eu bod yn wynebu oedran ymddeol gorfodol mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ogystal â meysydd cyflogaeth eraill? Rhaid inni ddechrau diwygio'r system hon er mwyn gosod esiampl, gan ganiatáu i bobl weithio ar ôl iddynt gyrraedd 65 mlwydd oed, ac ymddeol yn rhannol efallai, yn lle ymddeol yn llwyr, a dal i gael incwm oddi wrth gyflogaeth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n bendant, a datganaf fuddiant fel un sydd dros oedran ymddeol. Yn ôl fy sgysiau â ffrindiau o America sydd o'r un oedran â mi, gwelaf eu bod wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r syniad o oedran ymddeol yn America dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Ni chewch ymddeol yn y fan honno ar sail oedran, ac ni fyddant hyd yn oed yn ystyried ymddeol yn 60, yn 65 neu'n 67 oed, neu'r nifer fawr o wahanol oedrannau ymddeol sydd gennym ar gyfer pawb heblaw gwleidyddion. Maent yn ystyried eich gallu i wneud y gwaith, y mwynhad a gewch ohono ac unrhyw resymau eraill a allai fod gennych dros ddymuno gorffen gweithio. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd wedi'i seilio ar yr hyn sydd ar eich tystysgrif geni; felly y dylem ninnau feddwl.

Eleanor Burnham: Nodwyd yn y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn fod ar bobl hŷn angen gofal sydd yn sicrhau eu hurddas a'u hannibyniaeth. Gan fod eich Llywodraeth wedi rhoi'r gorau bellach i'r syniad o ofal cartref am ddim i'r henoed a'r anabl, ar ba ddyddiad y cyhoeddwch ganlyniadau'ch adolygiad o daliadau teg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r cynllun newydd yn un da iawn. Pe byddech yn barod i anwybyddu'r ffraeo gwleidyddol ac edrych ar

actual replacement package, you would not be quite so sarcastic about it. On the issue of charging, we are trying to ensure that what local authorities do in this area is fair across Wales while not removing all the discretion from local authorities: that is the difficulty. Ultimately, we do not want to prescribe everything to local authorities, telling them exactly what services to provide, and what charges to make, if any, and so on. It would not be a policy that would commend itself to any part of the Assembly.

y cynllun newydd ei hun, ni fydddech mor goeglyd yn ei gylch. Ynghylch mater y taliadau, yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu'n deg yn y maes hwn ledled Cymru heb ddileu'r holl ddisgresiwn sydd gan awdurdodau lleol: dyna'r anhawster. Yn y pen draw, nid ydym am ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol sut i wneud pob dim, gan ddweud wrthynt pa wasanaethau'n union y dylent eu darparu, a pha daliadau y dylent eu codi, os bydd rhai, ac yn y blaen. Ni fyddai dim un rhan o'r Cynulliad o blaid polisi o'r fath.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Mental Health Services

Q8 Peter Black: What has the Welsh Assembly Government done to improve mental-health services? OAQ1509(FM)

C8 Peter Black: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wneud i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl? OAQ1509(FM)

The First Minister: Improving mental-health services remains a key priority. I am glad that you raised the issue, because we are committed to improving in-patient and community-based mental-health services and improving the experience of the use of the services for all users.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwellu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yw un o'r prif flaenoriaethau o hyd. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn, gan ein bod wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i gleifion mewnlol ac i rai yn y gymuned ac i wella'r profiad a gaiff pawb sydd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny.

Peter Black: I note that Swansea NHS Trust is proposing to close ward A of Cefn Coed Hospital and use some of the resources to strengthen community support for older people with mental-health problems. The trust is also proposing to close ward 1 of Hill House Hospital and Fairwood Hospital. In all these cases, there is talk about reliance on community support for patients. In considering whether or not your Government is prepared to support these closures, will you ensure that adequate alternatives are put in place for the patients who currently use these facilities and that the appropriate support, particularly that in the community, is properly funded?

Peter Black: Nodaf fod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe'n bwriadu cau ward A yn Ysbyty Cefn Coed a defnyddio rhai o'r adnoddau i roi mwy o gymorth yn y gymuned i bobl hŷn sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth hefyd yn bwriadu cau ward 1 yn Ysbyty Hill House ac yn Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg. Yn yr holl achosion hyn, sonnir am ddibynnu ar gymorth yn y gymuned i gleifion. Wrth ystyried a yw'ch Llywodraeth yn barod i gefnogi'r bwriad i gau'r wardiau hyn ai peidio, a wnewch sicrhau bod dewisiadau digonol ar gael yn lle'r cyfleusterau hynny i'r cleifion sydd yn eu defnyddio ar hyn o bryd a bod y cymorth priodol, yn enwedig hynny yn y gymuned, wedi'i ariannu'n iawn?

The First Minister: I had better not comment on the statutory-type procedures, because if the community health council opposes them and they are considered significant, they will come to Brian Gibbons on a quasi-judicial basis on appeal, as I

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n well imi beidio â chyflwyno sylwadau am y gweithdrefnau sydd o natur statudol oherwydd, os bydd y cyngor iechyd cymuned yn gwrthwynebu'r bwriad i'w cau ac os bernir bod y mater hwnnw'n un pwysig, daw gerbron Brian

understand the position.

I note what you said about Hill House Hospital. My late mother was a patient there some five years ago for quite a long time when she was rehabilitating from a hip operation and I admire the work that was done there. I do not know the details of what you refer to but I hope that we would all agree with the broad principle of moving as much of the mental-health service as possible out of buildings belonging to the health service, especially in-patient buildings, into out-patient or community-based services. If we could recruit more community psychiatric nurses and more community-based psychiatrists, we would all be happier and there would be a great deal more non-institution-based mental-health services. That must be the right direction of travel.

Christine Chapman: One of the performance targets in the national service framework for mental-health services is that independent advocacy services should be available in the community for mental-health service users by 2010. One organisation currently providing these services is Merthyr and the Valleys Mind, which may have to close its peer advocacy project, due to a lack of funding. While I accept that determining and commissioning community services is a matter for local health boards, do you agree that there are strong advantages in continuing such projects that are already established and are well placed to deliver the targets set out in the framework?

The First Minister: We thoroughly approve of advocacy. You used the expression 'peer advocacy' and that seems to be a sound principle, because we are trying to encourage the so-called intelligent-patient approach to the use of the NHS and that, by analogy, can include peer advocacy. All of us will have had experience in our constituency surgeries on Saturday mornings, Friday nights or whenever, especially in the last 10 years as

Gibbons i'w ystyried ar sail led-farnwrol ar ôl cyflwyno apêl, fel yr wyf fi'n deall y sefyllfa.

Nodaf yr hyn a ddywedasoich am Ysbyty Hill House. Bu fy niweddar fam yn glaf yno tua phum mlynedd yn ôl am gryn amser pan oedd yn ymadfer ar ôl llawdriniaeth ar ei chlun ac mae gennyf feddwl mawr o'r gwaith a wneid yno. Nid wyf yn gwybod manylion yr hyn yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato ond yr wyf yn hyderu y byddem oll yn cytuno ar yr egwyddor gyffredinol o symud cymaint ag y bo modd o'r gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl o adeiladau sydd yn eiddo i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, yn enwedig adeiladau i gleifion mewnol, fel y byddant ar gael ar ffurf gwasanaethau i gleifion allanol a gwasanaethau yn y gymuned. Pe gallem recriwtio rhagor o nyrsys seiciatrig cymunedol, a rhagor o seiciatryddion yn y gymuned, byddem oll yn fwy bodlon a byddai llawer mwy o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar gael y tu allan i sefydliadau. Rhaid mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Christine Chapman: Un o'r targedau perfformiad yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yw y dylai gwasanaethau eirioli annibynnol fod ar gael yn y gymuned i rai sydd yn defnyddio gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl erbyn 2010. Un corff sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau o'r fath ar hyn o bryd yw Mind Merthyr a'r Cymoedd, ac mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid iddo roi terfyn ar ei brosiect eiriolaeth cymheiriaid, oherwydd diffyg cyllid. Er fy mod yn derbyn mai mater i fyrddau iechyd lleol yw trefnu a chomisiynu gwasanaethau cymunedol, a ydych yn cytuno bod manteision mawr i'w cael o barhau â phrosiectau o'r fath sydd wedi'u sefydlu eisoes ac sydd mewn lle da i gyrraedd y targedau sydd wedi'u nodi yn y fframwaith?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn llwyr o blaid eiriolaeth. Defnyddiasoch y term 'eiriolaeth cymheiriaid' ac mae hynny'n ymddangos yn egwyddor dda, gan ein bod yn ceisio hybu dull y claf deallus, fel y'i gelwir, o ddefnyddio'r GIG ac mae hynny, drwy gydweddiad, yn gallu cynnwys eiriolaeth cymheiriaid. Bydd pob un ohonom wedi cael profiad yn ein cymorthfeydd etholaeth ar fore Sadwrn, nos Wener neu pa bryd bynnag, yn

advocacy has built up, of the value that advocacy can provide for the more vulnerable, or for people during a period when they are vulnerable, who are unable to put their case over as forcibly as they would like for some sort of redress or assistance. The principle must be right, although I do not know the details.

Jonathan Morgan: The Tegfan Day Hospital at Whitchurch Hospital in Cardiff has done a huge amount of work in recent years with people with a mental illness in ensuring that they have a huge amount of social interaction and that they can be part of the local community. Julie Morgan MP, Sue Essex, Owen John Thomas and I have all raised concerns about the way in which patients have not been properly consulted by the NHS trust about the proposed loss of that unit. What can the Assembly Government and the Minister for Health and Social Services do to ensure that the NHS trust complies with the guidance that you, as an Assembly Government, issue?

The First Minister: I dare not disagree with any of that proposition for obvious reasons. I have heard about it through various channels; the situation is confusing. It is absolutely unclear as to what Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust's proposals are at present. That needs to be clarified by the trust and, no doubt, the political advocacy that you describe will help to elicit firm plans that can satisfy service users that they will be properly looked after if there are changes in what happens at Tegfan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn sôn am wasanaethau yn y gymuned i bobl sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Byddem i gyd yn cefnogi hynny pe bai adnoddau digonol yn cael eu rhoi i sicrhau bod y bobl hynny yn derbyn y gwasanaethau y maent yn eu haeddu, ond nid yw hynny'n digwydd. A ydych yn derbyn ei bod yn gwbl annerbyniol bod un o'm hetholwyr wedi'i gludo o Rydaman i Lundain er mwyn iddo gael ei osod mewn uned ddiogel gan nad oedd uned o'r fath ar gael yn nes i Rydaman?

enwedig yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf wrth i eiriolaeth ddatblygu, o werth eiriolaeth i'r rhai sydd yn fwy agored i niwed, neu i bobl yn ystod cyfnod pan ydynt yn agored i niwed, na allant gyfleu eu hachos mor rymus ag y dymument er mwyn cael rhyw fath o iawn neu gymorth. Mae'r egwyddor yn sicr o fod yn gywir, er nad wyf yn gwybod y manylion.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae Ysbyty Dydd Tegfan yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd yng Nghaerdydd wedi gwneud llawer iawn o waith yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf gyda rhai sydd â salwch meddwl o ran sicrhau llawer o ryngweithio cymdeithasol ar eu cyfer a'u galluogi i fod yn rhan o'r gymuned leol. Mae Julie Morgan AS, Sue Essex, Owen John Thomas a minnau wedi mynegi pryderon ynghylch y ffaith nad yw'r ymddiriedolaeth GIG wedi ymgynghori'n briodol â chleifion am y bwriad i gau'r uned honno. Beth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei wneud i sicrhau bod yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG yn cydymffurfio â'r canllawiau yr ydych chi, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn eu cyhoeddi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni feiddiwn anghytuno â dim yn y gosodiad hwnnw am resymau amlwg. Clywais am hyn drwy wahanol sianelau; mae'r sefyllfa'n peri dryswch. Nid yw'n glir o gwbl beth yw cynigion Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid i'r ymddiriedolaeth egluro hynny a bydd yr eiriolaeth wleidyddol yr ydych yn ei disgrifio'n sicr o fod o gymorth i ysgogi cynlluniau pendant a all gynnig sicrwydd i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau y byddant yn derbyn gofal priodol os ceir newidiadau mewn cysylltiad ag ysbyty Tegfan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You talk of services in the community for people with mental-health problems. We would all support that if adequate resources were given to ensure that those people got the services that they deserve, but that is not the case. Do you accept that it is completely unacceptable that one of my constituents was taken from Ammanford to London to be placed in a secure unit because no such unit was available nearer Ammanford?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol ond, ambell waith, mae'r gofynion yn arbenigol. Ni fydd gennych gyfleuster o'r fath ym mhob ardal, rhanbarth neu wlad yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydych yn siarad am adnoddau ond efallai nad ydych yn siarad am adnoddau ariannol; yr ydych yn sôn am wasanaethau arbenigol dros ben. Fel arfer, ym maes iechyd meddwl, y broblem fawr sydd gennym yw prinder nyrsys seiciatrig cymunedol a seiciatryddion clinigol. Mae digon o bobl am fod yn seicolegwyr, ond nid ydynt am fod yn seiciatryddion gan fod yn rhaid bod yn feddyg cyn hyfforddi ymhellach i fod yn seiciatrydd. Dyna'r broblem fawr: nid oes digon o nyrsys seiciatrig cymunedol na seiciatryddion clinigol.

The First Minister: Of course that is not acceptable but sometimes the needs are of a specialist nature. You are not going to get that kind of facility in every area, region or nation of the United Kingdom. You mentioned resources but you may not be talking about financial resources; you are talking about very specialised services. Usually, in the field of mental health, the major problem that we have is the lack of community psychiatric nurses and clinical psychiatrists. Plenty of people want to be psychologists, but they do not want to be psychiatrists because you have to become a doctor before undertaking further training to be a psychiatrist. That is the major problem: there are insufficient numbers of community psychiatric nurses and clinical psychiatrists.

2.40 p.m.

Cyllido Ysgolion School Funding

Q9 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on school funding? OAQ1512(FM)

C9 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllido ysgolion? OAQ1512(FM)

The First Minister: Revenue funding for schools is provided on a non-hypothecated basis through the local government revenue settlement. Capital funding is provided to local authorities through the school building improvement grant and the capital settlement, and for voluntary-aided schools through the VA schools capital grant.

Y Prif Weinidog: Darperir cyllid refeniw i ysgolion heb ei glustnodi drwy setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol. Darperir cyllid cyfalaf i awdurdodau lleol drwy'r grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion a'r setliad cyfalaf, ac i ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynorthwyr drwy'r grant cyfalaf i ysgolion a gynorthwyr.

Janet Ryder: I have a question about your new raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales funding stream, which is deliberately targeted at children from the communities most in need. However, many children from the neediest communities will not benefit because of the formula that you have chosen to use to distribute this grant. Children like those from Rhyl High School, in one of the neediest wards in Rhyl, will not get a penny of this money because that school does not qualify. Why have you deliberately discriminated against many of the neediest children in Wales by choosing to use that formula?

Janet Ryder: Mae gennyf gwestiwn am eich ffrwd ariannu newydd ar gyfer codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru, sydd wedi'i thargedu'n fwrriadol ar blant yn y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus. Er hynny, mae llawer o blant yn y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus na fyddant yn cael budd oherwydd y fformiwla yr ydych wedi dewis ei defnyddio i ddsbarthu'r grant hwn. Ni fydd plant fel y rhai yn Ysgol Uwchradd y Rhyl, yn un o'r wardiau mwyaf anghenus yn y Rhyl, yn cael yr un geiniog o'r arian hwnnw am nad yw'r ysgol honno'n gymwys. Pam yr ydych wedi gwahaniaethu'n fwrriadol yn erbyn llawer o'r plant mwyaf anghenus yng Nghymru drwy ddewis defnyddio'r fformiwla honno?

The First Minister: It is about the setting of priorities. If governments do not have the guts to set priorities, they do not deserve to be in government. You are disqualifying yourself and your party from that. You are using colourful words like deliberate discrimination, or whatever, but all that has happened is that, with regard to secondary schools, we have decided to prioritise the one-third of secondary schools where the level of free-school-meals entitlement—as the best proxy for deprivation—is at 20 per cent plus, or 30 per cent plus for the higher rate RAISE grant. The same applies to primary schools. I think that primary schools in Rhyl are getting money for that reason. You must have the guts to do that and to say that one-third of secondary schools will get the money because they have higher levels of free-school-meal entitlement. Why base it on free-school-meals entitlement? Because everyone in the field says that that is the best proxy for deprivation, and deprivation has the highest link with underattainment in schools, which is what we are trying to tackle. That is the reason for the policy.

Ann Jones: Given that we have used free school meals as an indicator for this money, what can you offer to those children who have lost out due to the inaccuracy of the free-school-meals data, which is currently the responsibility of the local authorities? *[Interruption.]* You may laugh—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I did not hear anyone laugh, Ann Jones. Carry on with your supplementary question.

Ann Jones: Will you ask the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills to look at the quality of the data received from local education authorities to ensure that we have the right data, so that when the funding is distributed according to the formula, we know that it will go to the schools that most need it?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ymwneud â phennu blaenoriaethau. Os nad yw llywodraethau'n ddigon dewr i bennu blaenoriaethau, nid ydynt yn haeddu bod mewn grym. Yr ydych yn eich anghymwyso'ch hun a'ch plaid i wneud hynny. Yr ydych yn defnyddio geiriau lliwgar fel gwahaniaethu bwriadol, neu beth bynnag y bo, ond y cwbl a ddigwyddodd, mewn cysylltiad ag ysgolion uwchradd, yw ein bod wedi penderfynu rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r un rhan o dair o ysgolion uwchradd lle y mae lefel yr hawl i dderbyn prydau ysgol am ddim—fel y dangosydd gorau o amddifadedd—yn 20 y cant a mwy, neu'n 30 y cant a mwy ar gyfer y gyfradd grant uwch ar gyfer codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ysgolion cynradd. Yr wyf yn credu bod ysgolion cynradd yn y Rhyl yn cael arian am y rheswm hwnnw. Rhaid ichi fod yn ddigon dewr i wneud hynny a dweud y bydd un rhan o dair o'r ysgolion uwchradd yn cael yr arian am fod lefel yr hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yn uwch yn yr ysgolion hynny. Pam y dylid ei seilio ar yr hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim? Am fod pawb yn y maes hwn yn dweud mai hynny yw'r dangosydd gorau o amddifadedd, ac amddifadedd sydd â'r cysylltiad cryfaf â thangyflawni mewn ysgolion, sef yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio delio ag ef. Dyna'r rheswm dros y polisi.

Ann Jones: Gan ein bod wedi defnyddio prydau ysgol am ddim fel dangosydd ar gyfer yr arian hwn, beth y gallwch ei gynnig i'r plant hynny sydd ar eu colled oherwydd gwallusrwydd y data ar brydau ysgol am ddim, sydd yn gyfrifoldeb i'r awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd? *[Torri ar draws.]* Digon hawdd ichi chwerthin—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chlywais neb yn chwerthin, Ann Jones. Ewch ymlaen â'ch cwestiwn atodol.

Ann Jones: A wnewch ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau edrych ar ansawdd y data a geir gan awdurdodau addysg lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod y data cywir gennym fel y byddwn yn gwybod, pan ddsbarthir cyllid yn ôl y fformiwla, y bydd yn mynd i'r ysgolion mwyaf anghenus?

The First Minister: Indeed. It is not based on who gets free school meals but on eligibility for free school meals. Eligibility for free school meals is normally related to the income-support entitlement of the parent or parents. At the moment, we have no reason to mistrust the data that we have, but if you have any evidence that the data is wrong and that schools are appearing in the wrong place in the league tables, we would be very interested in looking at that, and we would make the necessary corrections.

Nick Bourne: Are you alarmed that over 50 schools in Wales do not currently have a permanent headteacher, and that almost 50 per cent of local councils are reporting problems with recruitment?

The First Minister: I am not sure if that is up or down on recent figures, but I am told that it is no different from the average. I do not think that it is anything to be greatly concerned about.

Nick Bourne: That sounds complacent to me, because teachers' representatives and teacher unions are concerned, as are parents. Fifty schools without a permanent headteacher and more than a half of local councils reporting problems with recruitment is a serious issue. Most teachers' representatives are blaming an overload of initiatives. We know what and who they mean, and we know that this has gone on for far too long. We can understand that your approach has always been one of clear red water between yourselves and Westminster—understandable, perhaps, at the moment—but in terms of all of these initiatives, will you take a look at the situation so that we can tackle this serious issue of teacher recruitment?

The First Minister: With regard to teacher recruitment, there is an oversupply of primary-school teachers in Wales and an undersupply of secondary-school teachers. There is a particular undersupply of Welsh-medium teachers, some teachers of the hard sciences and of foreign languages. We all know of those problems. On headships, in general, there will always be a frictional

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Nid yw'n seiliedig ar y rhai sydd yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim ond ar yr hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim. Mae'r hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yn ymwneud fel arfer â hawl y rhiant neu'r rhieni i gael cymhorthdal incwm. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym ddim rheswm dros amau'r data sydd gennym, ond os oes gennych unrhyw dystiolaeth bod y data'n anghywir a bod ysgolion mewn safle anghywir yn y tablau, byddem yn awyddus iawn i ystyried hynny, a byddem yn gwneud y cywiriadau angenrheidiol.

Nick Bourne: A yw'n peri braw i chi fod mwy na 50 o ysgolion yng Nghymru sydd heb bennaeth parhaol ar hyn o bryd, a bod bron 50 y cant o'r cynghorau lleol yn dweud eu bod yn profi anawsterau wrth recriwtio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n uwch neu'n is na ffigurau diweddar, ond dywedir wrthyf nad yw'n wahanol i'r arfer. Nid wyf yn credu ei fod yn rhywbeth y dylid poeni'n fawr yn ei gylch.

Nick Bourne: Mae hynny'n swnio'n ddifater yn fy marn i, gan fod cynrychiolwyr athrawon ac undebau athrawon yn bryderus, fel y mae rhieni. Mae'r ffaith bod 50 o ysgolion heb bennaeth parhaol a bod mwy na hanner y cynghorau lleol yn dweud eu bod yn profi anawsterau wrth recriwtio'n fater difrifol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o gynrychiolwyr athrawon yn rhoi'r bai ar y gormodedd o fentrau. Gwyddom beth a phwy sydd ganddynt dan sylw, a gwyddom fod hyn wedi mynd ymlaen yn rhy hir o lawer. Gallwn ddeall mai eich dull chi o weithredu drwy'r amser fu un lle y mae dŵr coch clir rhyngoch chi a San Steffan—a hynny'n ddealladwy, o bosibl, ar hyn o bryd—ond gyda golwg ar y nifer fawr o fentrau, a wnewch edrych ar y sefyllfa fel y gallwn ddelio â'r mater difrifol hwn o recriwtio athrawon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gyda golwg ar recriwtio athrawon, mae cyflenwad gormodol o athrawon ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru a phrinder o ran athrawon ysgol uwchradd. Ceir prinder yn benodol o athrawon cyfrwng Cymraeg, rhai o athrawon y gwyddorau caled ac ieithoedd tramor. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod am y problemau hynny. O ran penaethiaid, yn gyffredinol, mae ffrithiant yn digwydd bob

problem with people leaving and being recruited. You will never get a perfect match, but we are not aware of any major problems and we are certainly not aware of any of the teachers' unions pointing the finger at Assembly initiatives being in excess or being of the wrong kind. We are not aware of any finger-pointing of the kind that you refer to.

Nick Bourne: Iwan Guy, the acting director of the National Association of Head Teachers in Wales has stated that the workload has been the final straw and that much pressure has been put on headteachers with initiative after initiative. He said that there is an overload of initiatives and there is only so much that one can do in a day. That sounds very much like a teachers' representative in Wales. Perhaps you are unaware of it, but it is less excusable that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills does not know about it. However, there obviously is a problem; there is a problem with initiatives and the NAHT is saying as much. Will you take a look at it?

The First Minister: We are not aware of a problem that is greater now than in previous years. If the data on re-examination looks different from that, then we will look at what the cause and effect will be. However, we are not aware that this is a bigger problem than it was. If you are talking about primary schools—and I think that Iwan Guy's federation is primarily an association of primary school headteachers—then certainly people are flooding into the profession, and we have a problem of an excess supply of teachers coming in.

On headteachers in particular, there will always be frictional problems because headteachers leave and you do not necessarily have the new person in post straight away. We will have to look at whether or not the figure of 50 is high or low relative to previous years, and I will write to you about that.

amser pan fydd pobl yn gadael ac yn cael eu recriwtio. Ni chewch fyth gydweddiad perffaith, ond nid ydym yn ymwybodol o broblemau mawr ac yn bendant nid ydym yn ymwybodol o undebau athrawon yn pwyntio bys at fentrau'r Cynulliad oherwydd bod gormod ohonynt neu oherwydd y math anghywir. Nid ydym yn ymwybodol o bwyntio bys o'r math y cyfeiriwch ato.

Nick Bourne: Mae Iwan Guy, cyfarwyddwr dros dro Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon yng Nghymru wedi dweud mai'r llwyth gwaith a fu ei diwedd hi a bod llawer o bwysau wedi cael ei roi ar bennaethiaid gyda menter ar ôl menter. Dywedodd fod gormodedd o fentrau ac nad oes ond hyn a hyn y gall rhywun ei wneud mewn diwrnod. Mae hyn yn swnio'n union fel cynrychiolydd athrawon yng Nghymru. Efallai nad ydych chi'n ymwybodol o hyn, ond mae'n fwy anfaddeuol nad yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn gwybod amdano. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod problem gyda mentrau ac mae Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon yn dweud hynny. A wnewch edrych ar hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydym yn ymwybodol o broblem sy'n fwy yn awr nag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Os yw'r data o ailedrych arno yn edrych yn wahanol i hynny, yna edrychwn ar beth yw'r achos a'r effaith. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn ymwybodol bod hon yn broblem fwy nag a oedd. Os ydych yn sôn am ysgolion cynradd—a chredaf mai cymdeithas o bennaethiaid ysgolion cynradd yn bennaf yw ffederasiwn Iwan Guy—yna yn bendant mae pobl yn llifo i'r proffesiwn, ac mae gennym broblem o ormod o gyflenwad o athrawon yn dod i mewn.

O safbwynt penaeithiaid yn benodol, ceir ffrithiant bob amser oherwydd bod penaeithiaid yn gadael ac nid yw'r un newydd o anghenraid yn llenwi'r swydd ar unwaith. Bydd yn rhaid inni edrych a yw'r ffigur o 50 yn uchel ynteu'n isel mewn perthynas â blynyddoedd blaenorol, ac ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch hynny.

**Cwmni Adfywio Trefol
Urban Regeneration Company**

Q10 Rosemary Butler: Will the First Minister make a statement about development opportunities that have arisen in Newport since the creation of the urban regeneration company? OAQ1502(FM)

The First Minister: Backing for all of those investment opportunities will come from the 1,350 additional jobs going to National Statistics and HM Prison Service in Newport, as well as the 460 jobs at Barlo-Quinn in the new manufacturing plant. I was pleased to learn that the University of Wales, Newport now has a partnership to develop the city centre campus.

Rosemary Butler: Thank you, First Minister. I am glad that you agree that Newport is being transformed and that thousands of quality jobs that you have already referred to have created a new economic environment in the city. The city centre is now being remodelled and Debenhams has committed to opening a new store and, as you say, the university intends to build a city centre campus.

This week, a beautifully designed footbridge is being erected across the River Usk. It is very important that Newport Unlimited, the urban regeneration company, completes its redevelopment of the Cambrian shopping centre and the railway station district, which is at the heart of Newport's regeneration scheme. That must be finished in time for the 2010 Ryder Cup tournament at the Celtic Manor. Thousands of golfing enthusiasts from all over the world will be arriving by train, and it is vital that they get a very good first impression of the city of Newport. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to help Newport achieve that goal?

The First Minister: If we listed all of the initiatives going on in Newport, I would be here until 3.30 p.m., and the Presiding Officer would not be very happy about that. You have listed some of them. I could have said more about the job creation

C10 Rosemary Butler: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyfleoedd datblygu sydd wedi codi yng Nghasnewydd ers creu'r cwmni adfywio trefol? OAQ1502(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y gefnogaeth i'r holl gyfleoedd buddsoddi hynny yn dod o'r 1,350 o swyddi ychwanegol a greir yn yr Ystadegau Gwladol a Gwasanaeth Carchardai EM yng Nghasnewydd, yn ogystal â'r 460 o swyddi yn Barlo-Quinn yn y ffatri gweithgynhyrchu newydd. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o glywed bod gan Brifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd bellach bartneriaeth i ddatblygu campws canol y ddinas.

Rosemary Butler: Diolch ichi, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cytuno bod Casnewydd yn cael ei thrawsnewid a bod y miloedd o swyddi o safon y cyfeiriasoch atynt eisoes wedi creu naw economaidd newydd yn y ddinas. Mae canol y ddinas erbyn hyn yn cael ei ailfodelu ac mae Debenhams wedi ymrwymo i agor siop newydd ac, fel y dywedwch, mae'r brifysgol yn bwriadu adeiladu campws canol y ddinas.

Yr wythnos hon, mae pont droed hardd yn cael ei chodi ar draws Afon Wysg. Mae'n bwysig iawn bod Newport Unlimited, y cwmni adfywio trefol, yn cwblhau ei waith o ailddatblygu canolfan siopa Cambrian ac ardal yr orsaf reilffordd sydd wrth wraidd cynllun adfywio Casnewydd. Rhaid i'r gwaith hwn gael ei gwblhau mewn pryd ar gyfer twrnaint Cwpan Ryder 2010 yn y Celtic Manor. Bydd golffwyr brwd yn cyrraedd yn eu miloedd ar y trê'n o bob cwr o'r byd, ac mae'n hanfodol eu bod yn cael argraff gyntaf dda iawn o ddinas Casnewydd. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i helpu Casnewydd i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe byddem yn rhestru'r holl fentrau sy'n mynd rhagddynt yng Nghasnewydd, byddwn yma tan 3.30 p.m., ac ni fyddai'r Llywydd yn hapus iawn am hynny. Yr ydych wedi rhestru rhai ohonynt. Gallwn fod wedi dweud rhagor am y

opportunities coming into Newport, including, for example, Macquarie Bank. The city centre campus issue that I mentioned is to do with Newport needing a Left Bank, and it will get it if that city centre campus development comes off.

There is also the question of the station because that is where many people get their first impression of the city, and there is the question of the two key motorway intersections, where the regeneration of the heavy end of Llanwern is key. Furthermore, there is the expansion around junction 28 on the other side.

William Graham: Will you acknowledge that regeneration will come from the independent sector, particularly given the purchase by St Modwen Properties of 600 acres of the Corus site?

The First Minister: Indeed. I mentioned Barlo-Quinn earlier—they do not come more independent than Mr Sean Quinn of Barlo-Quinn, I can assure you of that. We are pleased that he is creating 460 additional jobs, along with private sector house builders and office builders. If you look at what has happened in Cardiff bay or in SA1, it is clear that you have to have an initial bit of pump-priming by the public sector, but for the minimum period and amount, and then you hope that the private sector will take it from there. At what stage Newport and Newport Unlimited reaches the stage where it can simply float off the private sector vehicle because the interest has then been created by the initial public sector pump-priming, it is too early to say.

John Griffiths: On that point, Rhodri, it is fair to say that we have seen great strides forward with development in Newport since the creation of Newport Unlimited, and it has been very impressive indeed. That has been done with the Welsh Assembly Government, the WDA and Newport City Council working in partnership. Do you agree that if we are to build on progress to date, bearing in mind the transition to private funding that you have just mentioned, we need to maintain the

cyfleoedd creu swyddi sy'n dod i Gasnewydd, gan gynnwys, er enghraifft, Banc Macquarie. Mae mater campws canol y ddinas a grybwyllais yn ymwneud â'r ffaith bod ar Gasnewydd angen Glan Chwith, a bydd yn cael hynny os bydd datblygiad campws canol y ddinas yn dwyn ffrwyth.

Mae mater yr orsaf hefyd oherwydd dyma ble y mae llawer o bobl yn cael eu hargraff gyntaf o'r ddinas, a mater dwy gyffordd allweddol y draffordd, lle y mae adfywio pen trwm Llan-wern yn allweddol. At hynny, ceir y gwaith ymestyn o amgylch cyffordd 28 ar yr ochr arall.

William Graham: A wnewch gydnabod y daw'r adfywio oddi wrth y sector annibynnol, yn enwedig o gofio bod cwmni St Modwen Properties wedi prynu 600 erw o safle Corus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Soniais am Barlo-Quinn yn gynharach—mae'n anodd cael rhywun mwy annibynnol na Mr Sean Quinn o Barlo-Quinn, gallaf eich sicrhau o hynny. Yr ydym yn falch ei fod yn creu 460 o swyddi ychwanegol, ochr yn ochr ag adeiladwyr swyddfeydd ac adeiladwyr tai'r sector preifat. Os edrychwch ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ym mae Caerdydd neu yn SA1, mae'n amlwg bod yn rhaid ichi gael hwb dechreuol gan y sector cyhoeddus, ond am y cyfnod a'r swm lleiaf, ac yna yr ydych yn gobeithio y bydd y sector preifat yn ymgymryd â phethau o hynny ymlaen. Pa bryd y bydd Casnewydd a Newport Unlimited yn cyrraedd y cam pan ellir bwrw ymaith gerbyd y sector preifat oherwydd bod y diddordeb wedyn wedi cael ei greu gan hwb dechreuol y sector cyhoeddus, mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud.

John Griffiths: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, Rhodri, mae'n deg dweud ein bod wedi gweld camau breision yn cael eu cymryd gyda datblygiadau yng Nghasnewydd ers creu Newport Unlimited, ac mae wedi bod yn drawiadol iawn yn wir. Gwnaed hyn gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Chyngor Sir Casnewydd yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Oni chytunwch os ydym am adeiladu ar y cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma, gan gadw mewn

partnership between the Welsh Assembly Government and Newport City Council, including the funding element, to make sure that the improvements that have taken place are consolidated and built upon?

cof y trawsnewid i gyllid preifat a grybwyllasoch yn awr, fod yn rhaid inni gynnal y bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chyngor Sir Casnewydd, gan gynnwys yr elfen gyllido, er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwelliannau a wnaed yn cael eu hatgyfnerthu a'u datblygu ymhellach?

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: I assure you that I never said on which side of the river the Left Bank of Newport would be. We are pleased to see some private-sector developers, such as Debenhams, committing itself as the anchor store for the new shopping centre. That is the key to remedying Newport's big problem of having been squeezed between Cwmbran and Cardiff originally, and then between Bristol and Cardiff, along with the massive job of regenerating the huge area around the heavy end of Llanwern, which is being led by St Modwen Properties.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf eich sicrhau na ddywedais erioed ar ba ochr i'r afon y byddai Glan Chwith Casnewydd. Yr ydym yn falch o weld rhai datblygwyr o'r sector preifat, megis Debenhams, yn ymrwmo fel y siop allweddol ar gyfer y ganolfan siopa newydd. Dyma yw'r allwedd i wella problem fawr Casnewydd ei bod wedi cael ei gwasgu rhwng Cwmbrân a Chaerdydd yn wreiddiol, ac yna rhwng Bryste a Chaerdydd, ochr yn ochr â'r gwaith aruthrol o adfywio ardal anferthol o gwmpas pen trwm Llan-wern, proses a arweinir gan gwmni St Modwen Properties.

Hyrwyddo'r Celfyddydau Promoting the Arts

Q11 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies for promoting the arts in Wales? OAQ1518(FM)

C11 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru? OAQ1518(FM)

The First Minister: We have prioritised substantial additional money for the arts. A total of £181 million has been allocated since the Assembly's inception, and £27 million has been allocated to the Arts Council of Wales this year, which is an increase in investment of 80 per cent since 1999.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi blaenoriaethu arian ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer y celfyddydau. Dyrannwyd cyfanswm o £181 miliwn ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, a dyrannwyd £27 miliwn i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru eleni; mae hyn yn gynydd o 80 y cant ers 1999.

Nick Bourne: Does the First Minister regret the way that he has handled the whole issue of the arts in Wales, particularly the bringing in-house of the Arts Council of Wales and the effective sacking of an effective and popular chairman?

Nick Bourne: A yw'n edifar gan y Prif Weinidog am y ffordd y bu iddo ddelio â holl fater y celfyddydau yng Nghymru, yn benodol dwyn Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru dan adain y Cynulliad a diswyddo, i bob pwrpas, gadeirydd effeithiol a phoblogaidd?

The First Minister: There never was a sacking. Although there have been many apologies this week, you will not get one from me on that issue. Having now been set up, I understand that the review first met on 27 April, under the chairing of Elan Closs Stephens. Dai Smith is in post as interim

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fu diswyddo. Er bod llawer o ymddiheuriadau wedi bod yr wythnos hon, ni chewch un oddi wrthyf fi ynghylch y mater hwn. Gyda'r adolygiad bellach wedi ei sefydlu, deallaf eu bod wedi cwrdd am y tro cyntaf ar 27 Ebrill, dan gadeiryddiaeth Elan Closs Stephens. Mae Dai

chair. I am sure that you will have noted, contrary to the impression given that there was something odd about what happened in Wales, that the Scottish Executive has gone down exactly the same route of directly funding its five major national arts organisations.

Owen John Thomas: Will you confirm that your Government was making contingency plans as early as last October to replace the entire board of the arts council with Government officials?

The First Minister: I can confirm that the documentation printed in the *Western Mail* was contingency plans that we did not think were ever needed. Fortunately, as you will have noticed, they were not needed, and the transition to an interim chair and the review, following the terms of the debate in February 2006, is now proceeding. I would have thought that you would welcome that. However, you never welcome anything.

Smith wedi ei benodi'n gadeirydd dros dro. Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod wedi sylwi, yn groes i'r argraff a roddwyd fod rhywbeth yn rhyfedd am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghymru, fod Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi dilyn yr un trywydd yn union o gyllido ei phum prif sefydliad celfyddydol cenedlaethol yn uniongyrchol.

Owen John Thomas: A wnewch gadarnhau bod eich Llywodraeth yn gwneud cynlluniau wrth gefn mor gynnar â mis Hydref diwethaf i ddisodli holl fwrdd cyngor y celfyddydau â swyddogion y Llywodraeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf gadarnhau bod y dogfennau a argraffwyd yn *The Western Mail* yn gynlluniau wrth gefn na chredem y byddai arnom fyth eu hangen. Yn ffodus, fel y byddwch wedi sylwi, ni fu eu hangen, ac mae'r trawsnewid i gadeirydd dros dro a'r adolygiad, gan ddilyn termau'r ddadl ym mis Chwefror 2006, yn awr yn mynd rhagddo. Byddwn wedi meddwl y byddech yn croesawu hynny. Serch hynny, nid ydych fyth yn croesawu dim byd.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have no changes to report to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Nid oes gennyf ddim newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'u gwelir ar y datganiad drafft. Dylai hwn fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

It has been determined that the Street Works (Inspection Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006 and the Housing Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Transitional Provisions and Savings) (Wales) Order 2006 need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration. However, it has been determined that the Fire and Rescue Services (Charging) (Wales) Order 2006 will be referred to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee for extended consideration.

Penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio Rheoliadau Gwaith Stryd (Ffioedd Arolygu) (Cymru) 2006 na Gorchymyn Deddf Tai 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 ac Arbedion a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006 at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, penderfynwyd y bydd Gorchymyn Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Codi Tâl) yn cael ei gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i'w ystyried ymhellach.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally proposes the

business statement.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I must warn you, Minister, that most people in Wales find that many of the discussions held here are totally irrelevant to the matters that they consider important. [*Interruption.*] We referred you last week to the future of the local health boards. Members of your administration are happy to go around discussing the future of local health boards, but we are not allowed to discuss it in Plenary. In terms of NHS finances in Wales, trusts and local health boards are coming in with deficits, and the Royal College of Nursing will be lobbying the Assembly because it fears job losses, yet you will not allow a debate on these issues. People who are worried about job losses at the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research and NTL cannot understand why we are not able to debate those matters here. An important conference is being held this week by Autism Cymru, and people who are not able to get autism services in Wales cannot understand why we cannot have a debate on those services. The all-party group had a debate on adult services last week, with adults telling us that they cannot get access to necessary services in Wales. A month ago, an all-party group on child and adolescent services warned us that whether people receive those services depends upon where they live and their postcode. However, we are not able to discuss these issues in Wales.

There is a new Minister responsible for the police in Westminster, namely John Reid, who happens to be a Scottish Member of Parliament. May we ask him to come to the Assembly to explain to us why they are merging the police forces in Wales but not in Scotland, where he is an elected representative? Is there any hope that we can

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Rhaid imi eich rhybuddio, Weinidog, fod y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl yng Nghymru yn teimlo bod llawer o'r trafodaethau a gynhelir yma yn gwbl amherthnasol i'r materion sy'n bwysig yn eu barn hwy. [*Torri ar draws.*] Bu inni eich cyfeirio yr wythnos diwethaf at ddyfodol y byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae aelodau eich gweinyddiaeth yn fodlon mynd o gwmpas yn trafod dyfodol y byrddau iechyd lleol, ond ni chaniateir inni ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. O safbwynt arian y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, mae gan ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol ddiffyg ariannol, a bydd Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn llobio'r Cynulliad oherwydd ei fod yn pryderu am golli swyddi, ond eto ni chaniatewch ddadl am y materion hyn. Mae'r bobl sy'n pryderu am golli swyddi yn y Sefydliad Tir Glas ac Ymchwil i'r Amgylchedd ac NTL yn methu â deall pam na allwn drafod y materion hyn yma. Cynhelir cynhadledd bwysig yr wythnos hon gan Awtistiaeth Cymru, ac mae'r bobl na allant gael gwasanaethau awtistiaeth yng Nghymru yn methu â deall pam na allwn gael dadl am y gwasanaethau hyn. Cafodd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ddadl am wasanaethau i oedolion yr wythnos diwethaf, gydag oedolion yn dweud wrthym na allant gael mynediad at y gwasanaethau angenrheidiol yng Nghymru. Fis yn ôl, bu i'r grŵp hollbleidiol ar wasanaethau i blant a'r glasoed ein rhybuddio mai ble y mae pobl yn byw a'u cod post sy'n penderfynu a fyddant yn cael y gwasanaethau hynny ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, ni chawn drafod y materion hyn yng Nghymru.

Mae Gweinidog newydd yn gyfrifol am yr heddlu yn San Steffan, sef John Reid, sy'n digwydd bod yn Aelod Seneddol o'r Alban. A gawn ofyn iddo ddod i'r Cynulliad i esbonio wrthym pam maent yn uno heddluoedd yng Nghymru ond nid yn yr Alban, lle y mae'n gynrychiolydd etholedig? A oes unrhyw obaith y gallwn ei ddarbwylllo

persuade him to come here to explain to us why that is happening?

The Presiding Officer: Order. On the last question, there is no way in which a UK Government Minister can address the Assembly. I call on Lisa Francis.

Lisa Francis: We cannot support this statement because we must have oral statements; written statements are not enough. We asked for a statement on the postcode lottery regarding the availability of Copaxone for multiple sclerosis sufferers. In February 2002, when you were the Minister for Health and Social Services, you made an announcement in which you stated that prescribing Copaxone would not be a postcode lottery issue. However, as you will know from the publicity last week, it clearly is. Mick Bates and I were approached by a concerned constituent in Powys who is unable to obtain that drug, and many more are in that position. Last November, the MS society told you that it was facing significant difficulties in Wales in terms of the prescription of disease-modifying therapies. Given that the Minister with responsibility for health refused to go on a broadcast programme to discuss this, the least that you can offer is an oral statement on the matter.

Our request for a statement on whether NHS trusts have failed to advertise staff vacancies due to financial pressure is something that we feel that your Government cannot afford to ignore either. Similarly, you cannot afford to ignore a request for a statement on the situation at Chatsworth House community hospital in Prestatyn, where there has been a rooftop protest. That protest happened because the LHB is ignoring the—

Ann Jones: You do not know that.

Lisa Francis: It is ignoring what the local community is telling it.

A written statement on the shortage of headteachers in Wales is not enough either.

i ddod yma i esbonio inni pam mae hyn yn digwydd?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. O safbwynt y cwestiwn diwethaf, nid oes dim modd i Weinidog o Lywodraeth y DU annerch y Cynulliad. Galwaf ar Lisa Francis.

Lisa Francis: Ni allwn gefnogi'r datganiad hwn oherwydd bod yn rhaid inni gael datganiadau llafar; nid yw datganiadau ysgrifenedig yn ddigon. Gofynasom am ddatganiad am y loteri cod post o safbwynt cael Copaxone i rai sy'n dioddef gan sglerosis ymledol. Ym mis Chwefror 2002, pan oeddech yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, gwnaethoch gyhoeddiad pryd y dywedasoeh na fyddai rhagnodi Copaxone yn fater o loteri cod post. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch oddi wrth y cyhoeddusrwydd yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'n amlwg ei fod. Cysylltodd etholwr pryderus ym Mhowys sy'n methu â chael y cyffur hwnnw â Mick Bates a minnau, ac mae llawer mwy o bobl yn y sefyllfa honno. Fis Tachwedd diwethaf, dywedodd y gymdeithas sglerosis ymledol wrthyh ei bod yn wynebu anawsterau aruthrol yng Nghymru o safbwynt rhagnodi therapïau addasu'r clefyd. O gofio bod y Gweinidog sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros iechyd wedi gwrthod mynd ar raglen a gafodd ei darlledu i drafod hyn, y lleiaf y gallwch ei gynnig yw datganiad llafar am y mater.

Mae ein cais am ddatganiad ynghylch a yw ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol wedi methu â hysbysebu swyddi gwag oherwydd pwysau ariannol yn rhywbeth y teimlwn na all eich Llywodraeth fforddio ei anwybyddu ychwaith. Yn yr un modd, ni allwch fforddio anwybyddu cais am ddatganiad ynghylch y sefyllfa yn ysbyty cymuned Chatsworth House ym Mhrestatyn, lle y cafwyd protest ar y to. Digwyddodd y brotest oherwydd bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn anwybyddu'r—

Ann Jones: Ni wyddoch hynny.

Lisa Francis: Mae'n anwybyddu'r hyn y mae'r gymuned leol yn ei ddweud wrtho.

Nid yw datganiad ysgrifenedig am y prinder penaeithaid yng Nghymru yn ddigon

Therefore, we cannot support your business statement.

Peter Black: Like other Members, we are not content with the responses that we have received. In particular, the current state of NHS finances is of concern to a large number of people around Wales. Just saying that you do not intend to make time for a debate or a statement on the impact of that on staff vacancies is unacceptable. We need to have some sort of further discussion in the chamber as to how those deficits and the financial situation of many trusts around Wales is impacting on the services that they are able to provide for their patients and the population in their areas.

The second issue that we want to raise is the music development fund. I note from the Minister's response that she does not believe this to be a matter for the Assembly Government but one for local authorities. Of course, the music development fund was paid directly from the Assembly Government to local authorities, and subsuming it into the revenue support grant will impact on music development around Wales. A great many people are concerned about that, and we feel that there should be some scrutiny of the decision so that we can put the case of those people who are most concerned about that change to the Minister in the hope that we can change her mind.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): As colleagues have said, Rhodri Glyn, speak for yourself as regards discussion in the chamber. A great deal of what we debate here comes as a result of our responding to requests from the opposition parties. I have agreed to many statements again this week. A written statement is important as it is placed in the public domain. It provides information, and that is important in terms of concerns that you might rightly express.

On autism services, it is of course important that we recognise that there is a conference taking place this week. Wales is at the forefront of this, and we recognise the work of Autism Cymru and the National Autistic Society. As I said in response to questions

ychwaith. Felly, ni allwn gefnogi eich datganiad busnes.

Peter Black: Fel Aelodau eraill, nid ydym yn fodlon ar yr ymatebion a gawsom. Yn benodol, mae cyflwr ariannol presennol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn bryder i nifer fawr o bobl ledled Cymru. Mae dweud na fwriadwch neilltuo amser ar gyfer dadl na datganiad am effaith hyn ar swyddi gwag yn annerbyniol. Rhaid inni gael rhyw fath o drafodaeth bellach yn y siambr ynghylch sut y mae'r diffygion hyn a sefyllfa ariannol nifer o ymddiriedolaethau ledled Cymru yn effeithio ar y gwasanaethau y gallant eu darparu i'w cleifion a'r boblogaeth yn eu hardaloedd.

Yr ail fater y dymunwn ei godi yw'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth. Sylwaf oddi wrth ymateb y Gweinidog nad yw'n credu mai mater i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yw hwn ond i awdurdodau lleol. Wrth gwrs, daeth y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth yn uniongyrchol oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol, a bydd ei chynnwys yn y grant cymorth refeniw yn cael effaith ar ddatblygu cerddoriaeth ledled Cymru. Mae llawer iawn o bobl yn bryderus ynghylch hyn, a theimlwn y dylid craffu ar y penderfyniad fel y gallwn gyflwyno dadl y bobl hynny sy'n poeni'n fawr am y newid hwn gerbron y Gweinidog yn y gobaith y gallwn newid ei meddwl.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Fel y dywedodd ein cyd-Aelodau, Rhodri Glyn, siaradwch drosoch eich hun o safbwynt trafod yn y siambr. Mae llawer iawn o'r hyn a drafodwn yma yn dod o ganlyniad i'n hymateb i geisiadau oddi wrth y gwrthbleidiau. Yr wyf wedi cytuno i wneud nifer o ddatganiadau unwaith eto yr wythnos hon. Mae datganiad ysgrifenedig yn bwysig oherwydd ei fod yn cael ei roddi yn eiddo i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n darparu gwybodaeth, ac mae hyn yn bwysig o safbwynt pryderon y byddwch yn eu mynegi yn hollol briodol.

O safbwynt gwasanaethau awtistiaeth, mae wrth gwrs yn bwysig inni gydnabod y cynhelir cynhadledd yr wythnos hon. Mae Cymru ar y blaen o safbwynt hyn, a chydabyddwn waith Awtistiaeth Cymru a'r Gymdeithas Awtistiaeth Genedlaethol. Fel y

last week, we are consulting on the autism strategy. We can then bring back to the chamber the conclusions of that and have a debate. I am sure that that will happen in the next session, as a result of the consultation.

3.00 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn, can you not keep up with the news? NTL has announced today that it will not make any redundancies in Wales. Its 791 staff in Swansea will have their employment contracts transferred to IBM. The Business Minister has to put you right, because you are not keeping up with important news for those workers at NTL in Swansea. It is very good news, which I am sure all of us in the chamber will celebrate.

On the police, as far as I am concerned, we do not need John Reid, because we have Edwina Hart to ensure, as we have done, that the Assembly influences and gives its views on restructuring the police, through the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. Edwina Hart has spoken to the new Minister responsible for the police today. She will produce a written statement on this, and will meet him in a few weeks' time. Therefore, we are the ones who are keeping pace, and ensuring that the Assembly is being kept informed of developments.

Lisa, you have made your points about the NHS. Last week—in relation to the business statement, I believe—I said that the Minister for Health and Social Services has agreed that he would update us on this issue, as a result of the outturn from last year's finances. At tomorrow's Health and Social Services Committee meeting, you will have a written statement not only on drugs for multiple sclerosis sufferers, which is an opportunity to raise that matter, but also on NHS finances. That will include issues relating to pressures in terms of NHS staffing issues, Peter. On Chatsworth community hospital, this is all part of the ongoing consultation through 'Designed for Life' and 'Designed to Deliver'. We will bring back the outcome of those public consultations, and, as I have said

dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiynau yr wythnos diwethaf, yr ydym yn ymgynghori ynghylch y strategaeth awtistiaeth. Yna, gallwn ddwyn yn ôl i'r siambr gasgliadau'r ymgynghoriad hwn a chynnal dadl. Yr wyf yn siŵr y digwydd hynny yn ystod y sesiwn nesaf, o ganlyniad i'r ymgynghori.

Rhodri Glyn, oni allwch chi ddilyn y newyddion diweddaraf? Cyhoeddodd NTL heddiw na fydd yn diswyddo neb yng Nghymru. Bydd contractau cyflogaeth eu 791 o staff yn Abertawe yn trosglwyddo i IBM. Rhaid i'r Trefnydd eich rhoi ar ben y ffordd, am nad ydych yn gwranddo ar y newyddion pwysig i'r gweithwyr hynny yn NTL yn Abertawe. Mae'n newyddion da iawn, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd pawb ohonom yn y siambr yn ymfalchïo ynddo.

O ran yr heddlu, cyn belled ag yr wyf fi'n bod, nid oes arnom angen John Reid, oherwydd y mae gennym Edwina Hart i sicrhau, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud, fod y Cynulliad yn dylanwadu ac yn rhoi ei fam ar ailstrwythuro'r heddlu, drwy'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Siaradodd Edwina Hart heddiw â'r Gweinidog newydd sy'n gyfrifol am yr heddlu. Bydd yn rhoi datganiad ysgrifenedig am hyn, ac yn cyfarfod ag ef ymhen rhai wythnosau. Felly, ni sydd yn cadw ar y blaen, ac yn gofalu bod y Cynulliad yn cael gwybod am ddatblygiadau.

Lisa, fe wnaethoch eich pwyntiau am y GIG. Yr wythnos diwethaf - mewn perthynas â'r datganiad busnes, fe gredaf - dywedais fod y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi cytuno y rhoddai'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am y mater hwn, o ganlyniad i alldro cyllid y llynedd. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yfory, cewch ddatganiad ysgrifenedig nid yn unig ar gyffuriau i ddiodefwrwr parlys ymledol, a fydd yn gyfle i godi'r mater hwnnw, ond hefyd ar gyllid y GIG. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys materion yn ymwneud â'r pwysau ar staffio'r GIG, Peter. O ran ysbyty cymuned Chatsworth, mae hyn oll yn rhan o'r ymgynghori sy'n digwydd drwy'r 'Cynllun Oes' a 'Designed to Deliver'.

on so many occasions, the Minister for Health and Social Services, as appropriate, will bring that back for debate. Diolch yn fawr.

Deuwn yn ôl â chanlyniadau'r ymgynghori cyhoeddus hwnnw, ac fel y dywedais droeon, bydd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fel sy'n briodol, yn dwyn hynny yn ôl i gael dadl arno. Thank you very much.

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion adopted.*

**Datganiad am Reoliadau Enseffalopathïau Sbyngffurf Trosglwyddadwy (TSE)
(Cymru) 2006 a wnaed o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27
Statement on the Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathies (TSE) (Wales)
Regulations 2006 made under Standing Order No. 24.27**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Following the cancellation of last week's Plenary debate, the Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathies (TSE) (Wales) Regulations 2006 were made using full executive procedure on 2 May, and came into force on 3 May. You will be aware that, on 3

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Wedi i'r ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf gael ei chanslo, gwnaed Rheoliadau Enseffalopathïau Sbyngffurf Trosglwyddadwy (TSE) (Cymru) 2006 drwy ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol lawn ar 2 Mai, a daethant i rym ar 3 Mai. Fe wyddoch,

May, with the introduction of these regulations and parallel regulations in the rest of the UK, the beef export ban finally came to an end after 10 years. I realise that Assembly Members would have liked the opportunity to debate the regulations before they came into force but, unfortunately, this was not possible and, following this statement, there will be an opportunity to ask questions about the regulations.

The introduction of these regulations and the subsequent lifting of the beef export ban were of significant economic importance to the Welsh farming industry and, unsurprisingly, have been widely welcomed.

This important milestone will allow the export, on the same basis as other European Union members, of cattle born or imported into the UK on or after 1 August 1996. It will also allow the export of products derived from cattle slaughtered in the UK on or after 15 June 2005, and products containing vertebral column derived from cattle slaughtered on or after 3 May 2006. Domestic legislation was required to repeal existing laws that banned the export of beef and live cattle. Legislation was also required to enforce EU rules on the removal of vertebral column and head meat. Without these rules being enforced, the export ban could not have been lifted.

The European Commission regulation that paved the way for the lifting of the ban was published in the *Official Journal of the European Union* on 29 April, and came into force on 2 May. If we had not introduced our domestic legislation by full executive procedure, so that it came into force at the same time as the rest of the UK, there was a chance that we could have jeopardised the lifting of the ban for the whole of the UK. Member states could have argued that the UK was not compliant with the new vertebral column rules and refused to purchase any beef from the UK.

There would also have been disadvantages for Welsh farmers and exporters if there was a delay in the date of the Welsh legislation, as they would not have been able to source the new EU markets at the same time as their

ar 3 Mai, gyda chyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn a rheoliadau cyfochrog yng ngweddill y DU, fod y gwaharddiad ar allforio cig eidion wedi dod i ben wedi 10 mlynedd. Sylweddolaf y carai Aelodau'r Cynulliad fod wedi cael cyfle i drafod y rheoliadau cyn iddynt ddod i rym, ond yn anffodus, ni fu hyn yn bosibl, ac ar ôl y datganiad hwn, bydd cyfle i ofyn cwestiynau am y rheoliadau.

Yr oedd cyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn a chodi'r gwaharddiad ar allforio cig eidion yn sgîl hynny o bwysigrwydd economaidd sylweddol i ddiwydiant ffermio Cymru, ac nid yw'n syndod iddynt gael croeso brwd.

Bydd y garreg filltir bwysig hon yn caniatáu allforio gwartheg a aned neu a fewnforiwyd i'r DU ar 1 Awst 1996 neu wedi hynny, ar yr un sail ag aelodau eraill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Bydd hefyd yn caniatáu allforio cynhyrchion sy'n deillio o wartheg a laddwyd yn y DU ar 15 Mehefin neu wedi hynny, a chynhyrchion yn cynnwys asgwrn y cefn sy'n deillio o wartheg a laddwyd ar 3 Mai 2006 neu wedi hynny. Yr oedd angen deddfwriaeth gartref i ddiddymu cyfreithiau presennol a oedd yn gwahardd allforio cig eidion a da byw. Yr oedd angen deddfwriaeth hefyd i orfodi rheolau'r UE ynghylch tynnu asgwrn y cefn a chig y pen. Heb orfodi'r rheolau hyn, ni ellid bod wedi codi'r gwaharddiad ar allforio.

Cyhoeddwyd rheoliad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a baratôdd y ffordd ar gyfer codi'r gwaharddiad yng *Nghyfnodolyn Swyddogol yr Uned Ewropeaidd* ar 29 Ebrill, a daeth i rym ar 2 Mai. Pe na baem wedi cyflwyno ein deddfwriaeth gartref drwy weithdrefn weithredol lawn, fel y deuai i rym ar yr un pryd â gweddill y DU, yr oedd siawns y gallem fod wedi peryglu codi'r gwaharddiad i'r DU gyfan. Gallai aelod-wladwriaethau fod wedi dadlau nad oedd y DU yn cydymffurfio â'r rheolau newydd ar asgwrn y cefn a gwrthod prynu dim cig eidion o'r DU.

Byddai ffermwyr ac allforwyr o Gymru hefyd wedi bod dan anfantais petai oedi wedi digwydd yn nyddiad deddfwriaeth Cymru, gan na fyddent wedi gallu cyrraedd marchnadoedd newydd yr UE ar yr un pryd

competitors. If we had been late with our legislation, there was also a risk that it could affect the perception of Welsh beef abroad—that somehow, there was a problem with our beef because it was not available for export at the same time as beef from the rest of the UK.

I appreciate that not everyone in Wales supports the export of live cattle, but this is an integral part of the EU legislation and if we did not include provisions for the export of live cattle in our regulations, we would run the risk of infraction proceedings. Farmers who wish to export calves will have to abide by strict health and welfare regulations, which will be rigorously enforced.

Consolidating the TSE regulations at the same time that the beef export ban is lifted was important to ensure that industry had a clear understanding of the legislation. If the legislation was not consolidated, there could well have been a lack of clarity that could have resulted in non-compliance. It is vital therefore that we avoid this as we seek to minimise any risk of the EU reimposing the ban or member states refusing to take our beef.

The TSE (Wales) Regulations 2006 allow Wales to benefit from the lifting of the beef ban at the earliest possible opportunity. They provide a clear legislative framework for exporters and provide a basis in law for EU requirements, which had to be in place when the ban was lifted.

Elin Jones: Fel y Gweinidog, yr wyf innau hefyd yn falch ein bod ni heddiw yn gallu trafod y ffaith bod y gwaharddiad ar allforio cig eidion wedi dod i ben ar ôl degawd du i ffermio cig eidion yma yng Nghymru ac ym Mhrydain. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod bod Plaid Cymru wedi cytuno bod angen i'r rheoliadau yma basio heb bleidlais, fel y digwyddodd yma yng Nghymru, a bod yr hyn a oedd yn cael ei ganiatáu drwy ailagor yr allforio ar yr un pryd â Lloegr a'r Alban yn bwysicach yn yr achos hwn na chydymffurfio â phleidleisiau yn y Siambr, gan ein bod ni'n gwybod o drafodaethau fod mwyafrif yn y Cynulliad yn gefnogol iawn o blaid codi'r gwaharddiad.

â'u cystadleuwyr. Petaem wedi bod yn hwyr gyda'n deddfwriaeth, yr oedd perygl hefyd y gallai effeithio ar y ffordd y gwelid cig eidion Cymru dramor – fod problem o ryw fath gyda'n cig eidion am nad oedd ar gael i'w allforio ar yr un pryd â chig eidion o weddill y DU.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli nad yw pawb yng Nghymru yn cefnogi allforio gwartheg byw, ond mae hyn yn rhan annatod o ddeddfwriaeth yr UE a phe na fyddem yn cynnwys darpariaethau ar gyfer allforio gwartheg byw yn ein rheoliadau, gallem fod mewn perygl o wynebu camau am dor-rheolau. Bydd gofyn i ffermwyr sydd am allforio lloi llynu at reoliadau llym o ran iechyd a lles, a orfodir yn haearnidd.

Yr oedd yn bwysig cyfuno'r rheoliadau TSE ar yr un pryd â chodi'r gwaharddiad ar allforio cig eidion er mwyn sicrhau bod y diwydiant yn deall y ddeddfwriaeth yn glir. Pe na bai'r ddeddfwriaeth wedi ei chyfuno, gallai fod wedi achosi diffyg eglurder, a hynny wedi arwain at fethu â chydymffurfio. Mae'n hanfodol felly inni osgoi hyn wrth inni geisio lleihau unrhyw berygl i'r UE ailosod y gwaharddiad neu i aelod-wladwriaethau wrthod cymryd ein cig eidion.

Mae Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) 2006 yn caniatáu i Gymru elwa o godi'r gwaharddiad ar gig eidion cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Maent yn rhoi fframwaith deddfwriaethol clir i allforwyr ac yn sylfaen mewn cyfraith i ofynion yr UE, a oedd yn gorfod mewn grym pan godwyd y gwaharddiad.

Elin Jones: Like the Minister, I am also very pleased that we are today able to discuss the fact that the ban on beef exports has brought to an end a very dark decade for cattle farming in Wales and in the UK. The Minister knows that Plaid Cymru has agreed with the need for these regulations to be passed without a vote, as happened here in Wales, because what was being permitted by recommencing the exports at the same time as those in England and Scotland was more important in this case than conforming with votes in the chamber, given that we know from discussions that the majority within the Assembly are very supportive of lifting this ban.

Yr ydym hefyd yn gwybod—ac ni chyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at hyn—fod Hybu Cig Cymru a'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn gweithio i ddatblygu marchnadoedd ar y cyfandir yn barod ar gyfer allforio cynnyrch o Gymru. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gweld ffrwyth y gweithgaredd hwnnw'n fuan iawn, a bod hynny'n cael ei weld cyn gynted â phosibl ar ffurf cynnydd mewn prisiau cig eidion yn y dyfodol agos yma yng Nghymru. Mae'n debyg bod allforio lloi a gwartheg byw yn dal yn fater dadleuol, ond yr wyf yn llongyfarch Elwyn Morse a'i gyfeillion am ddatblygu menter yn sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin i sicrhau bod cyfle i allforio lloi byw yn ystod yr wythnos gyntaf o godi'r gwaharddiad hwn. Bydd lloi Cymru unwaith eto ar gael i'w hallforio i farchnadoedd ar y cyfandir sy'n barod iawn i'w cymryd. Nid wyf byth wedi deall yn iawn beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng llwyth o loi sy'n teithio mewn lorri dros y môr ac mewn lorri ar y ffordd. Nid wyf yn deall beth yw'r gwahaniaeth a'r gwrthwynebiad sydd gan rai i hynny, cyn belled, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, â bod yr amodau lles anifeiliaid yn cael eu cadw a'u monitro'n effeithlon ar y loriau hynny, pa un a ydynt yn teithio o fewn gwledydd Prydain neu rhwng Prydain a'r cyfandir.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu cadarnhau heddiw—yn ogystal â'r gefnogaeth y mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ei rhoi i allforio lloi byw—ei fod ef a'i Lywodraeth yn barod, os bydd angen, i edrych ar sut y gall Hybu Cig Cymru a'i Lywodraeth ef roi cefnogaeth i'r farchnad bwysig hon sydd wedi bod ar goll i ffermwyr Cymru, sef y farchnad allforio lloi byw. Gobeithiaf y bydd ef a'i Lywodraeth yn gallu cefnogi hyn, os bydd angen, yng ngweithgareddau marchnata'r adran bwyd-amaeth.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth Elin Jones a gweddill Plaid Cymru.

3.10 p.m.

Gwnaed gwaith cyn i'r gwaharddiad gael ei godi i edrych ar y cyfleoedd mewn marchnadoedd tramor i gig eidion o Gymru. Yn ôl ym mis Hydref, siaredais gyda rhai

We also know—and the Minister did not refer to this—that Hybu Cig Cymru and the Government have been working to develop markets on the continent in preparation for the export of products from Wales. I hope that we will see the fruit of those labours very soon, and that that is seen as soon as possible in the form of increases in beef prices in the near future in Wales. It appears that the export of live calves and cattle is still a contentious issue, but I congratulate Elwyn Morse and his friends on developing an initiative in Pembrokeshire and Cardiganshire to ensure that live calves are exported during the first week of the lifting of this ban. Calves from Wales will once more be available for export to those markets on the continent that are more than willing to take them. I have never quite understood the difference between a lorry load of calves travelling across the water and a lorry load travelling on the road. I do not understand the distinction or the objection that some people have to that, as long as, as the Minister said, animal welfare conditions are adhered to and monitored effectively on those lorries, whether they are travelling within the United Kingdom or between the UK and the continent.

I hope that the Minister will be able to confirm today—in addition to the support that these regulations give to the export of live calves—that he and his Government will be willing, if necessary, to look at how Hybu Cig Cymru and his Government can support this important market that has been lost to the farmers of Wales: the live calf export market. I hope that he and his Government will be able to support that, if necessary, in the marketing activities of the agri-food department.

Carwyn Jones: I am grateful for the support of Elin Jones and the rest of Plaid Cymru.

Work was done before the ban was lifted looking at what opportunities exist in foreign markets for beef from Wales. Back in October, I spoke with some buyers who had

prynwyr oedd wedi prynu cig o Gymru yn y gorffennol, ac yr oedd yn amlwg bod ganddynt hyder mewn cig eidion o Gymru a diddordeb mawr mewn prynu cig eidion o Gymru unwaith eto. Felly, yr wyf yn hyderus bod y farchnad yno, ac y bydd y prynwyr hyn eisiau prynu cig o Gymru unwaith eto.

Yr hyn a roddodd enw mor ddrwg i allforio lloi yn y gorffennol oedd y defnydd o gratiau lloi. Yr oedd yn greulon dros ben, ac nid wyf yn credu y byddai neb yng Nghymru nac unrhyw ffermwr yng Nghymru yn awr yn gwadu hynny. Yr oedd yn amlwg ei fod yn greulon. Ni fyddai neb yng Nghymru yn symud lloi yn y ffordd honno mwyach, a bydd y system honno'n anghyfreithlon beth bynnag ar 1 Ionawr 2007. Felly, nid oes llawer o amser cyn i'r arfer ddod yn anghyfreithlon ar draws yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac ni fydd hynny yn gynamserol ychwaith.

Glyn Davies: There is clearly a wide measure of agreement across the chamber on the actions that you have taken in relation to these regulations. I welcome the fact that you are making a statement in the chamber on the issue today, and I support the decision that you took to use the executive procedure last week—there was no real alternative but to ensure that the regulations were approved last Tuesday and Wednesday. The reason that I welcome the fact that this is available for questions in the chamber today is because there are one or two issues that are consequential upon the regulations being passed that need to be aired, but, generally speaking, it is wonderful news for the livestock industry in Wales. I still remember 10 years ago, I think it was, when just 23 words from the then-Minister, Stephen Dorrell, devastated the livestock industry and have continued to do so for the 10 years since. They devastated an export market worth over £0.5 billion a year and it has caused huge damage to the industry. It is a good-news day.

There are two questions that I wanted to ask you, Minister. One is what specific steps you will take to help the industry to recover the market. We all recognise that it will be a long haul to recover a market on that scale, but you must have specific initiatives. People

purchased beef from Wales in the past, and it was evident that they were confident about Welsh beef and that they were very interested in buying beef from Wales once again. Therefore, I am confident that the market is there, and that these buyers will wish to purchase meat from Wales once again.

What gave the export of calves such a bad reputation in the past was the use of crates to contain the calves. It was extremely cruel, and I do not believe that anyone in Wales or any farmer in Wales would now dispute that. It was obviously cruel. No-one in Wales would wish to transport calves in that manner anymore, and that system will be made illegal anyway on 1 January 2007. Therefore, there is not long to go before the practice is prohibited throughout the European Union, and that will not be before time, either.

Glyn Davies: Mae'n amlwg bod cryn gytundeb ar draws y siambr am y camau a gymerasoch mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau hyn. Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn gwneud datganiad yn y siambr ar y pwnc heddiw, a chefnogaf eich penderfyniad i ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol yr wythnos diwethaf—nid oedd dewis mewn gwirionedd ond gofalu bod y rheoliadau yn cael eu cymeradwyo ddydd Mawrth a dydd Mercher diwethaf. Y rheswm pam yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod hyn ar gael inni ofyn cwestiynau yn y siambr heddiw yw bod angen gwyntyllu un neu ddau o faterion sy'n ganlyniad i basio'r rheoliadau, ond a siarad yn gyffredinol, mae'n newyddion gwych i'r diwydiant da byw yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn dal i gofio 10 mlynedd yn ôl, fe gredaf, pan fu i 23 gair yn unig gan y Gweinidog bryd hynny, Stephen Dorrell, anrheithio'r diwydiant da byw gan barhau i wneud hynny am 10 mlynedd ers hynny. Anrheithiwyd marchnad allforio a oedd yn werth £0.5 biliwn y flwyddyn ac achosodd ddifrod enfawr i'r diwydiant. Mae heddiw yn ddydd o newyddion da.

Yr wyf am ofyn dau gwestiwn ichi, Weinidog. Pa gamau penodol a gymerwch i helpu'r diwydiant i ennill y farchnad yn ôl yw un. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod y cymer amser maith i adennill marchnad ar y raddfa honno, ond rhaid i chi gael mentrau penodol.

will be looking to you, as well as to Hybu Cig Cymru, to develop the worldwide market that has been lost.

The second issue relates to the live export of calves. This is clearly a controversial issue, and we have already seen protests—indeed, some violence—with the first batch of live calves that have been exported. Welfare is important. Everyone to whom I have talked in the industry is concerned about it. We know that there are regulations in place to cover transport, and I note in your statement that you intend to enforce these rigorously, as is absolutely right, but we also have an interest in ensuring that the recipients of the calves in Europe have systems in place to safeguard animal welfare right through until they reach the market as veal. That is an area on which you and colleagues across Europe could do some work. We must satisfy everyone that, where live calves are being exported, everything possible is being done to ensure that high welfare standards are kept from the day that those calves are born until the day that they are slaughtered for veal.

Carwyn Jones: Dealing with the issue of marketing, this would be done primarily through Hybu Cig Cymru, as a body in which the Assembly Government has an indirect interest. Work had been done on examining markets in France, Italy and the Low Countries, where Welsh beef was exported previously. As I said to Elin Jones, there is a great deal of interest in buying Welsh beef once again. Therefore, work is being done by HCC at the moment on redeveloping those markets. Let us not forget that some beef was exported before this date under the date-based export scheme, and most of that was going to Belgium. At one time, 90 per cent of beef being exported under the old scheme was Welsh beef, so we know that there is a market there.

In terms of how we will promote it, as an Assembly Government, we will do whatever it takes. HCC has the market knowledge that is required in order for us to regain our markets and it will take this forwards, but I have also noted over the past few days that a number of farmers are looking at export

Bydd pobl yn disgwyl i chi, yn ogystal â Hybu Cig Cymru, ddatblygu'r farchnad fydeang a gollwyd.

Mae a wnelo'r ail fater ag allforio lloi byw. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn bwnc llosg, a gwelsom brotestiadau eisoes - ac yn wir, beth trais - wrth allforio'r llwyth cyntaf o loi byw. Mae lles yn bwysig. Mae pawb yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy yn y diwydiant yn pryderu amdano. Gwyddom fod rheoliadau ar gael i ymdrin â chludo, a sylwaf yn eich datganiad y bwriadwch orfodi'r rhain yn gadarn, fel sy'n hollol iawn. Ond mae o fudd inni sicrhau hefyd fod gan y rhai sy'n derbyn y lloi yn Ewrop systemau i ddiogelu lles yr anifeiliaid bob cam nes iddynt gyrraedd y farchnad fel cig llo. Dyma faes lle y gallech chi a chyd-weithwyr ledled Ewrop wneud peth gwaith. Rhaid inni argyhoeddi pawb, lle y bo lloi byw yn cael eu hallforio, fod popeth posibl yn cael ei wneud i sicrhau y cedwir at safonau lles uchel o ddiwrnod geni'r lloi hynny tan y diwrnod y lleddir hwy am eu cig.

Carwyn Jones: O ddelio â phwnc marchnata, bydd hyn yn cael ei wneud yn bennaf gan Hybu Cig Cymru, fel corff y mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddiddordeb anuniongyrchol ynddo. Gwnaed gwaith ar archwilio marchnadoedd yn Ffrainc, yr Eidal a'r Iseldiroedd, lle'r arferid allforio cig eidion Cymru. Fel y dywedais wrth Elin Jones, mae llawer o ddiddordeb unwaith eto mewn prynu cig eidion Cymru. Felly, mae gwaith yn cael ei wneud gan HCC ar hyn o bryd i ailddatblygu'r marchnadoedd hynny. Ni ddylem anghofio bod peth cig eidion yn cael ei allforio cyn y dyddiad hwn dan y cynllun allforio seiliedig ar ddyddiad, a bod y rhan fwyaf o hwnnw'n mynd i Wlad Belg. Ar un adeg, yr oedd 90 y cant o'r cig eidion a oedd yn cael ei allforio dan yr hen gynllun yn gig eidion Cymru, felly gwyddom fod y farchnad yn bod.

O ran sut y byddwn yn ei hybu, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fe wnawn beth bynnag sydd ei angen. Mae gan HCC y wybodaeth angenrheidiol am y farchnad inni adennill ein marchnadoedd, a byddant yn bwrw ymlaen â hyn, ond yr wyf hefyd wedi sylwi dros y dyddiau diwethaf fod nifer o

markets and are taking the initiative to enter those markets once again.

In terms of calves, it must be reiterated that no-one would seriously argue that veal crates are a humane way of dealing with animals. As I mentioned, they will be banned in any event across the UK on 1 January 2007, and not before time. However, there are high welfare standards now for the transporting not just of calves, but of live animals in general. Those standards have to be adhered to and if they are breached, a fine of £5,000, or even a term of imprisonment, is available to the courts to deal with it. It is important for us in Wales, as we seek to sell ourselves as a country with high animal-welfare standards, to be seen to preserve those standards as animals are transported.

We also have to remember that the veal trade is there because of the dairy industry—we all know that veal is, effectively, a by-product of the dairy industry. Most male dairy calves have no value and have, until now, been destroyed. The moves on 2 May opened up the market once again for the exportation of those live calves and veal meat, in the same way that the export market is open for lamb and other animals.

This is not the time to get into a debate about the morality of eating meat or not, or of eating dairy products and drinking milk, but I think that it is worth reiterating the fact that while we have a meat trade, it is important that that trade is seen to adhere to the highest standards possible. I do not believe that any farmer in Wales would argue that the systems that we had in place 10 years ago were in any way adequate for the trade and the animal-welfare standards that are required in 2006.

Mick Bates: Thank you, Minister, for your statement. While I would not condone the use of the executive procedure as a standard procedure, in this case, the cross-party consensus reflected in the comments from other parties acknowledge the importance of ensuring that this regulation was accepted in Wales, so that Welsh beef would not be

ffermwyr yn edrych ar y marchnadoedd allforio ac yn bwrw ati i gyrraedd y marchnadoedd hynny unwaith eto.

O ran lloi, rhaid ailadrodd na fyddai neb yn dadlau o ddifrif fod cewyll lloi yn ffordd drugarog iawn o ddelio ag anifeiliaid. Fel y soniais, byddant yn cael eu gwahardd beth bynnag ar draws y DU ar 1 Ionawr 2007, ac nid cyn pryd. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym safonau lles uchel erbyn hyn ar gyfer cludo anifeiliaid byw yn gyffredinol, nid lloi yn unig. Rhaid glynu wrth y safonau hyn ac os bydd unrhyw un yn eu torri, gall y llysoedd eu gorfodi i dalu dirwy o £5,000 neu eu dedfrydu i garchar hyd yn oed. Mae'n bwysig i ni yng Nghymru, wrth inni geisio gwerthu ein hunain fel gwlad sydd â safonau uchel o ran lles anifeiliaid, ein bod yn cael ein gweld fel gwlad sy'n glynu wrth y safonau hynny wrth gludo anifeiliaid.

Rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod y fasnach cig llo yno oherwydd y diwydiant llaeth—gwyddom i gyd mai sgîl-gynnyrch y diwydiant llaeth yw cig llo mewn gwirionedd. Nid oes dim gwerth i'r rhan fwyaf o loi llaeth gwryw a, hyd yn ddiweddar, yr oeddent yn cael eu difa. Mae'r symudiadau ar 2 Mai wedi agor y farchnad unwaith eto i allforio'r lloi byw hynny a chig llo, yn yr un modd ag y mae'r farchnad allforio ar agor i wŷn ac anifeiliaid eraill.

Nid dyma'r amser i ddechrau dadlau ynghylch moesoldeb bwyta cig neu beidio, neu fwyta cynhyrchion llaeth ac yfed llaeth, ond credaf ei bod yn werth ailadrodd y ffaith ei bod yn bwysig, tra bydd masnach gig gennym, fod pawb yn gweld bod y fasnach honno'n glynu wrth y safonau uchaf posibl. Ni chredaf y byddai dim un ffarmwr yng Nghymru'n dadlau bod y systemau a oedd yn bodoli ddeng mlynedd yn ôl yn foddhaol o gwbl ar gyfer y safonau masnach a lles anifeiliaid sy'n ofynnol yn 2006.

Mick Bates: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad. Er na fyddwn yn cymeradwyo defnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol fel un arferol, yn yr achos hwn, mae'r consensws ar draws y pleidiau, a adlewyrchir yn y sylwadau a wnaed gan bleidiau eraill, yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw sicrhau bod y rheoliad hwn yn cael ei dderbyn yng

condemned and would have equal status with beef from other parts of the UK. It is a special day after many years of suffering and the loss of what were very important markets.

The whole issue of exports, particularly the live export of calves, is an emotive one. Your reiteration that strict controls exist to ensure that welfare standards are maintained was reassuring. However, there are a few points on which I would like to hear you comment further. The first is whether sufficient resources exist to ensure that the welfare standards are in place and that when the calves leave these shores all standards are adhered to. Secondly, do you agree that a great many of those who protest so vehemently at docksides and so on often have an anti livestock-farming agenda anyway? It does not come as any surprise to me to see the same group also opposing the eating of meat.

The next issue, which you have mainly clarified, is the Government's investment through Hybu Cig Cymru to encourage exports, building upon the date-based export scheme that previously existed and to regain some of our markets. It would be interesting if you would quantify exactly what you mean by 'support'. There is always concern in the industry that when its profitability is low, putting aside money to promote our products abroad is a greater burden on the industry. The Government has an important catalytic role in ensuring that our exports are up there with those of Scottish beef, for example, so that we can enter those markets.

Finally, will you clarify a group of issues about the return of other meat products—head meat, for example—derived from cattle? Does this regulation allow those back into the market, or what are your plans for those derived products to be put back into the market?

Carwyn Jones: In terms of the first question that you asked, the way in which meat is produced has changed profoundly over the

Nghymru, fel na fyddai cig eidion o Gymru yn cael ei gondemnio ac fel y byddai iddo yr un statws â chig eidion o rannau eraill o'r DU. Mae'n ddiwrnod arbennig ar ôl blynyddoedd lawer o ddioddef a cholli marchnadoedd a oedd unwaith yn eithriadol bwysig.

Mae'r holl gwestiwn o allforio, yn enwedig allforio lloi byw, yn un emosiynol. Yr oedd yn dda eich clywed yn ailadrodd bod rheolau llym yn bodoli i sicrhau y glynir wrth safonau lles. Er hynny, mae rhai pwyntiau yr hoffwn ichi wneud sylw pellach arnynt. Y cyntaf yw a oes digon o adnoddau i sicrhau bod y safonau lles ar waith ac y glynir wrth y safonau i gyd pan fydd y lloi yn gadael y glannau hyn. Yn ail, a ydych yn cytuno bod gan lawer iawn o'r rhai sy'n protestio mor chwyrn wrth y dociau yn aml agenda sy'n gwrthwynebu ffermio da byw beth bynnag? Nid yw'n syndod o gwbl imi ddeall bod yr un grŵp hefyd yn gwrthwynebu bwyta cig.

Y mater nesaf, ac yr ydych wedi egluro hyn i raddau helaeth, yw buddsoddiad y Llywodraeth drwy Hybu Cig Cymru i annog allforio, sy'n adeiladu ar y cynllun allforio ar sail dyddiad a oedd yn bodoli o'r blaen ac i adennill rhai o'n marchnadoedd. Byddai'n ddiddorol pe baech yn esbonio'n beth yn union yr ydych yn ei feddwl wrth 'gefngi'. Mae'r diwydiant o hyd yn bryderus, pan fydd proffidioldeb yn isel, fod neilltuo arian i hyrwyddo ein cynhyrchion dramor yn fwy o faich ar y diwydiant. Mae gan y Llywodraeth rôl bwysig i'w chwarae fel catalydd o ran sicrhau bod ein hallforion o'r un safon â chig eidion o'r Alban, er enghraifft, fel bod y marchnadoedd hynny yn agor eu drysau inni.

Yn olaf, a wnewch roi eglurhad ar grŵp o faterion ynghylch ailgyflwyno cynhyrchion cig eraill—cig pen er enghraifft—sy'n deillio o wartheg? A ydyw'r rheoliad hwn yn gadael i'r cynhyrchion hyn ddod yn ôl ar y farchnad, neu beth yw eich cynlluniau ar gyfer rhoi'r cynhyrchion deilliedig hynny yn ôl ar y farchnad?

Carwyn Jones: O ran y cwestiwn cyntaf y gwnaethoch ei ofyn, mae'r modd y cynhyrchir cig wedi newid yn aruthrol yn

last few years. I believe that live exports are in decline and will remain so. The deadweight meat market will be the way forward for the future as far as Wales is concerned. Live exports will be a declining part of the export trade as far as Wales is concerned. I think that that is inevitable. When you look at the demands of, for example, the Gulf States, when people there consider buying Welsh lamb, they do not want live exports; they want lambs to be slaughtered in Wales as they believe, for a number of reasons, that that is a better way of doing things.

3.20 p.m.

In an ideal world, there would be a UK market for veal, and there would be no need to transport to Belgium and the Netherlands in particular. We have tried the UK market, and it does not work very well. The irony is that, because of the bad publicity surrounding veal crates in years gone by, there is a natural aversion to eating veal in the UK. It is not widely available, and people have an aversion to eating it, even though they are not averse to eating lamb, of course, which was Elin Jones's point. That means that it is difficult to slaughter the animals in Wales, their having been finished off here, and to then go for export, because there is not yet the demand for the deadweight meat, and the demand in the UK does not exist as yet. However, the reality is that the majority of male dairy calves do not have a value, except for meat, and we have to accept that.

With regard to other meat products, I will just remind you of what I said in the statement. These regulations allows for the export of products derived from cattle slaughtered in the UK on or after 15 June 2005, and products containing vertebral column derived from cattle slaughtered in the UK on or after 3 May 2006. There are rules, of course, in relation to the removal of vertebral column and head meat, which I mentioned in the statement, and those rules had to be removed before the export ban could be lifted. The regulations therefore deal with issues such as head meat, and they provide the detail required so that those who are looking to

ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Credaf fod allforio anifeiliaid byw ar drai ac y bydd hynny'n parhau. Y farchnad gig pwysau marw fydd y ffordd ymlaen yn y dyfodol cyn belled ag y mae Cymru yn y cwestiwn. Bydd allforion byw yn rhan a fydd ar drai o'r farchnad allforio cyn belled ag y mae Cymru yn y cwestiwn. Credaf fod hynny'n anochel. Pan edrychwch ar y galw sy'n dod o Wledydd y Gwlff, er enghraifft, pan fydd pobl yno yn ystyried prynu cig oen o Gymru, nid ydynt am gael allforion byw; maent am weld yr ŵyn yn cael eu lladd yng Nghymru oherwydd eu bod yn credu, am nifer o resymau, mai dyna'r ffordd orau o wneud pethau.

Mewn byd delfrydol, byddai marchnad yn y DU ar gyfer cig llo, ac ni fyddai angen cludo i Wlad Belg ac i'r Iseldiroedd yn enwedig. Yr ydym wedi ceisio gwerthu i farchnad y DU, ond nid yw'n gweithio'n dda iawn. Yr eironi yw, oherwydd y cyhoeddusrwydd gwael yng nghyswllt cewyll lloi yn y gorffennol, fod pobl yn naturiol yn troi eu trwynau ar fwyta cig llo yn y DU. Nid yw ar gael yn eang, ac mae pobl yn gyndyn iawn o'i fwyta, er nad ydynt yn gwrthod bwyta cig oen, wrth gwrs, a dyna oedd pwynt Elin Jones. Mae hyn yn golygu ei bod yn anodd lladd yr anifeiliaid yng Nghymru, ar ôl gorffen eu pesgi yma a'u hanfon i'w hallforio wedyn, oherwydd nid oes galw eto am y cig pwysau marw, ac nid yw'r galw yn y DU yn bodoli eto. Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw nad oes gan y rhan fwyaf o loi llaeth gwryw werth ar wahân i'w gwerth fel cig, a rhaid inni dderbyn hynny.

O ran y cynhyrchion cig eraill, hoffwn eich atgoffa o'r hyn a ddywedais yn y datganiad. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn caniatáu allforio cynhyrchion sy'n deillio o wartheg a gafodd eu lladd yn y DU ar neu ar ôl 15 Mehefin 2005, a chynhyrchion yn cynnwys asgwrn y cefn yn deillio o wartheg a gafodd eu lladd yn y DU ar neu ar ôl 3 Mai 2006. Wrth gwrs, mae rheolau'n bodoli ar gyfer tynnu asgwrn y cefn a chig y pen, a soniais am hynny yn y datganiad, a bu'n rhaid gwneud i ffwrdd â'r rheolau hynny cyn y gellid codi'r gwaharddiad. Felly, mae'r rheoliadau'n delio â materion fel cig pen, ac yn darparu'r manylion angenrheidiol fel bod y bobl sy'n

develop markets for such by-products know where they stand in future.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for the statement, and for this opportunity for me to express my concern at the reinstatement of live exports. I have mixed feelings, really. From an economic perspective, the reintroduction of beef exports is fine for farmers. I should, I suppose, declare an interest as a non-meat-eater. However, I take exception to Mick Bates's comments that people who demonstrate against the live export of animals have, not a hidden agenda, exactly, but only come from one area of life: there are many members in my group—and my husband would want me to include him in this—who eat meat, but who are totally against animals being exported from Wales to other countries.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a debate; it is a statement. I do not think I can possibly call you, unless you have a highly relevant point of order at the end of the statement.

Lorraine Barrett: I will now come to my question, as this is a statement. That was my little preamble.

The Presiding Officer: If you were on your preamble that is alright.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you. While I hope that we would reach a point in the future at which no live animals are transported from Wales or the UK, can you assure me, Minister—you have already mentioned it, but I want more assurance—that you have sufficient personnel to ensure that you can monitor vigorously the welfare standards that you mentioned in your statement for those animals, which have no choice but to be exported across quite long distances from Wales?

Carwyn Jones: The situation in Wales is very different from that in England, in that we do not have any ports in Wales from which the animals are exported. Animals leaving Wales go to England, and it is a matter then for the English port authorities to check on the animals' welfare. We have a

ystyried datblygu marchnadoedd ar gyfer y sgîl-gynhyrchion hyn yn gwybod beth fydd eu sefyllfa yn y dyfodol.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch am y datganiad, ac am y cyfle hwn imi gael lleisio fy mhryder ynghylch ailgyflwyno allforion byw. A dweud y gwir, mae gennyf deimladau cymysg. O bersbectif economaidd, mae ailgyflwyno allforion cig eidion yn iawn i ffermwyr. Mae'n debyg y dylwn ddatgan buddiant fel rhywun nad yw'n bwyta cig. Er hynny, yr wyf yn anfodlon ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick Bates fod gan bobl sy'n protestio yn erbyn allforio anifeiliaid byw, nid agenda gudd, yn hollol, ond eu bod yn perthyn i un garfan neilltuol: mae nifer o aelodau yn fy ngrŵp i—a byddai fy ngŵr am imi ei gynnwys ef ynddo hefyd—sy'n bwyta cig, ond sydd yn erbyn allforio anifeiliaid o Gymru i wledydd eraill yn llwyr.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid dadl yw hyn ond datganiad. Ni chredaf y gallaf alw arnoch, oni bai fod gennych bwynt o drefn hynod berthnasol i'w wneud ar ddiwedd y datganiad.

Lorraine Barrett: Dof at fy nghwestiwn yn awr, gan mai datganiad yw hyn. Pwt o ragymadrodd gennyf oedd hynny.

Y Llywydd: Os mai rhagymadrodd ydoedd, mae hynny'n iawn.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch. Er fy mod yn gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu cyrraedd sefyllfa yn y dyfodol lle nad yw anifeiliaid byw yn cael eu cludo o Gymru nac o'r DU, a allwch fy sicrhau, Weinidog—yr ydych eisoes wedi sôn ond hoffwn dderbyn mwy o sicrwydd—fod gennych ddigon o staff i sicrhau y gallwch fonitro'r safonau lles y soniasoch amdanynt yn eich datganiad yn drylwyr ar gyfer yr anifeiliaid hynny nad oes ganddynt ddim dewis ond cael eu hallforio dros bellteroedd eithaf hir o Gymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru yn dra gwahanol i'r un yn Lloegr, am nad oes gennym borthladdoedd yng Nghymru i allforio'r anifeiliaid ohonynt. Mae anifeiliaid sy'n gadael Cymru yn mynd i Loegr, a mater i awdurdodau'r porthladdoedd yn Lloegr wedyn yw ymorol am les yr anifeiliaid. Mae

good reputation, as I said, for high animal standards; we have the animal health and welfare strategy, of which many farmers in Wales are proud, and animal health and welfare is crucial to our being able to sell what we produce to the world. Most people who eat meat would want to know that animals have been treated well and humanely while they were alive.

I can only reiterate what I have already said: there will be checks at the ports. There are veterinary inspections as well, of course. However, while we have a market for meat there will inevitably be movements of animals. As politicians in Wales and across the UK, we must ensure that the animals are moved in as humane a condition as possible. That was certainly not the case 10 or 11 years ago, and that is why so much opposition was generated at that time to the movement of calves. It was because of the inhumanity of the veal crates and the failure of the farming industry in general to see how bad a reputation it was getting because of a practice that was so obviously cruel to many people in the UK and beyond. Those days are gone, and it is important that we stick to the high standards that we have to ensure that when people look at us as a country, both Wales and the UK, they see us as having high welfare standards, which are unmatched in Europe.

Carl Sargeant: I am probably an example of the people whom Lorraine Barrett mentioned—I am happy to eat meat, but I do not agree with live veal exports under the conditions that currently exist. The Royal Society for the Protection of Animals has suggested that there are serious and negative long-term effects on the health of young calves transported in the crates. Minister, you said that the crates will be banned by the end of 2006, and that it is inhumane to transport calves in this fashion—yet it is okay to continue with this inhumane and terrible transportation of young cattle for another six months. You will also be aware that the 'strict' controls that are in operation in ports are the same controls on meat imports and the smuggling of meat. There are failures in this respect, and I am concerned about supporting live veal exports. Perhaps I lack

gennym enw da, fel y dywedais, am safonau uchel o ran anifeiliaid; mae'r strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid sydd gennym yn un y mae llawer o ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn ymfalchïo ynnddi, ac mae lles ac iechyd anifeiliaid yn hanfodol i sicrhau y gallwn werthu'r hyn a gynhyrchwn i'r byd. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n bwyta cig am wybod ein bod wedi trin ein hanifeiliaid yn dda ac yn drugarog pan oeddent yn fyw.

Ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais eisoes: bod y safonau'n cael eu gwirio yn y porthladdoedd. Wrth gwrs, mae gennym filfeddygon sydd hefyd yn archwilio. Fodd bynnag, tra bydd marchnad gig gennym, bydd anifeiliaid yn anochel yn cael eu symud. Fel gwleidyddion yng Nghymru ac ar draws y DU, rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr anifeiliaid yn cael eu symud mewn cyflwr mor drugarog â phosibl. Yn sicr, nid oedd hynny'n digwydd 10 neu 11 mlynedd yn ôl, a dyna pam yr oedd cymaint o wrthwynebiad bryd hynny i symud lloi. Yr oedd hynny oherwydd bryntni'r cewyll lloi a bod y diwydiant ffermio yn gyffredinol yn methu â gweld ei fod yn cael ei bardduo oherwydd arferiad a oedd yn amlwg yn greulon i amryw o bobl yn y DU a'r tu hwnt. Mae'r dyddiau hynny wedi mynd, ac mae'n bwysig inni llynu wrth y safonau uchel sydd gennym i sicrhau, pan fydd pobl yn edrych arnom fel gwlad, sef Cymru a'r DU, eu bod yn gweld bod gennym safonau lles uchel sydd heb eu hail yn Ewrop.

Carl Sargeant: Mae'n debyg fy mod yn esiampl o'r bobl y soniodd Lorraine Barrett amdanynt—yr wyf yn fodlon bwyta cig, ond nid wyf yn cytuno ag allforio lloi byw o dan yr amodau presennol. Mae'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Creulondeb i Anifeiliaid wedi awgrymu bod cludo lloi ifanc yn y cewyll hyn yn cael effaith ddifrifol, negyddol a hirdymor ar eu hiechyd. Weinidog, yr ydych wedi dweud y bydd y cewyll hyn wedi eu gwahardd erbyn diwedd 2006, a'i bod yn greulon cludo lloi yn y fath fodd—eto mae'n iawn parhau gyda'r trefniadau creulon ac ofnadwy hyn ar gyfer cludo gwartheg ifanc am chwe mis arall. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol mai'r rheolau 'llym' sy'n cael eu gweithredu yn y porthladdoedd yw'r un rheolau ar gyfer mewnfario a smyglo cig. Maent yn methu yn hyn o beth, ac yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch cefnogi allforio lloi byw.

understanding about some aspects of this, and I readily accept that, but I am at a loss to explain, if we must have veal exports, why we cannot kill the calves in the UK and send them across to the continent in refrigerated vehicles.

Carwyn Jones: In terms of transportation, it must be emphasised that the conditions that were in place in 1990s are not the conditions of today. No-one could possibly support the re-introduction of those conditions, and it is important to make that clear. It is worth mentioning again that these are animals that would otherwise be shot; they do not have value, and they are destroyed not long after they are born. No-one could pretend that it is pleasant, but for those of us who are consumers of meat and dairy products, that is what the industry creates, and there is no getting away from that. Where there are animals that would otherwise be destroyed soon after birth, it is legitimate to look for a market for those animals—it is a market for their meat, but that is the way in which the livestock market operates. It is important that people understand that. Lambs are also transported. Animals are transported great distances, and some animals, such as beef cattle, are transported to Scotland, which is further away than the Low Countries and France. That does not get away from the fact that we must have standards that are as high as they can possibly be, and which are strictly monitored. Thirty years ago, standards in the UK were not particularly high compared to what they are now, and the same is true of many other countries, but we now have extremely high standards.

There is a difference between meat being smuggled through the ports into the UK and live exports going out—they are far more obvious than people trying to smuggle meat in via suitcases, and through freight depots and some of the larger airports. The way in which it works at the moment is that the market for the veal is in the Low Countries—there is no market for it in Britain. It has been tried. I was familiar with a unit in Carmarthenshire that tried to engender a market for veal in the UK, but it did not work. As things stand, that is where the market exists and, as far as the livestock industry is concerned, it is the reality, even

Efallai nad wyf yn llwyr ddeall rhai agweddau ar hyn, a byddwn yn derbyn hynny, ond ni allaf yn fy myw ddeall, os oes raid inni allforio lloi byw, pam na allwn ladd y lloi yn y DU a'u hanfon drosodd i'r cyfandir mewn oergelloedd.

Carwyn Jones: O ran cludo, rhaid pwysleisio nad yr amodau a oedd yn bodoli yn y 1990au yw'r amodau sydd gennym heddiw. Prin y gallai neb gefnogi ailgyflwyno'r amodau hynny, ac mae'n bwysig bod yn glir ynghylch hynny. Mae'n werth sôn eto y byddai'r anifeiliaid hyn fel arall yn cael eu saethu; nid oes dim gwerth iddynt, ac maent yn cael eu difa'n fuan ar ôl eu geni. Ni allai neb gymryd arno fod hynny'n ddymunol, ond i'r rhai ohonom sy'n bwyta cig a chynhyrchion llaeth, dyna'r hyn y mae'r diwydiant yn ei greu, ac ni ellir gwadu hynny. Lle y mae gennym anifeiliaid a fyddai fel arall yn cael eu difa yn fuan ar ôl eu geni, mae'n beth da chwilio am farchnad i'r anifeiliaid hynny—marchnad ar gyfer eu cig ydyw, ond dyna sut y mae'r farchnad da byw yn gweithio. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn deall hynny. Mae ŵyn hefyd yn cael eu cludo. Mae anifeiliaid yn cael eu cludo dros bellteroedd maith, ac mae rhai anifeiliaid, fel gwartheg biff, yn cael eu cludo i'r Alban, sy'n bellach i ffwrdd na'r Iseldiroedd a Ffrainc. Ni ellir dianc rhag y ffaith bod yn rhaid inni gael safonau sydd mor uchel ag y gallant fod, ac sy'n cael eu monitro'n llym. Ddeng mlynedd ar hugain yn ôl, nid oedd y safonau yn y DU yn arbennig o uchel o'u cymharu â rhai heddiw, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am lawer o wledydd eraill, ond mae safonau eithriadol uchel gennym erbyn hyn.

Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng cig yn cael ei smyglo drwy'r porthladdoedd i'r DU ac allforion byw yn mynd allan—maent yn llawer mwy amlwg na phobl yn ceisio smyglo cig mewn cesys teithio, a thrwy ddepos cludo a rhai o'r meysydd awyr mwy. Y ffordd y mae pethau'n gweithio ar y funud yw mai yn yr Iseldiroedd y mae'r farchnad ar gyfer cig llo—nid oes marchnad ar ei gyfer ym Mhrydain. Yr ydym eisoes wedi rhoi cynnig arni. Yr oeddwn yn gyfarwydd ag uned yn sir Gaerfyrddin a geisiodd greu marchnad ar gyfer cig llo yn y DU, ond ni weithiodd. Fel y nae pethau ar hyn o bryd, dyna lle y mae'r farchnad yn bodoli a, chyn

though in other sectors of the livestock trade the demand for live exports is declining.

3.30 p.m.

Karen Sinclair: By your own admission, you believe that live exports of animals are in decline. If that is the case, why on earth are we going back to this practice? I am a meat eater; I am quite happy with the reality of farming, but I am not happy with the reality of carting animals around Europe for economic reasons. If, as you have said, this market is in decline in the long term, there will be no real, sustainable benefit to farmers, because they will fall back into using this as a trade for the male offspring and will not look for a long-term solution. Therefore, when live exports decline further and further, they will find themselves in exactly the same position that they are in now. I cannot, for the life of me, understand what value there is in going down this road.

Carwyn Jones: I see nothing wrong with economic reasons being the reason for moving animals, as long as it is done according to the highest standards possible. The whole industry works according to economic reasons and we have to accept that. Again, we are talking here about animals that would otherwise be shot. It is not as if they would live in fields and have a normal life; they would be destroyed. Therefore, in terms of, if you like, the morality of the situation, I do not see anything wrong, as long as standards are high enough, with ensuring that they have a purpose, because that is what they are bred for, at the end of the day. Whether we like it or not, that is the reality of the situation.

I would like to see the development of home-grown facilities in Wales and in the rest of Britain and the further development of a UK market. It has been tried and has failed so far. That is the difficulty with it. That said, it is always important that the farming industry keeps its eye on what is going to happen in five, 10 or 15 years' time. No market lasts forever. If we could move towards a situation where calves do not have to travel, I would support it. There is no question about that. At

belled ag y mae'r diwydiant da byw yn y cwestiwn, dyna'r realiti, er bod llai o alw bellach am allforion byw mewn sectorau eraill o'r fasnach da byw.

Karen Sinclair: Yr ydych yn cyfaddef eich bod yn credu bod allforion anifeiliaid byw ar drai. Os mai felly y mae, pam ar y ddaear yr ydym yn mynd yn ôl at yr arfer hwn? Yr wyf fi'n bwyta cig; yr wyf yn ddigon hapus gyda realiti ffermio, ond nid wyf yn hapus gyda'r realiti o gludo anifeiliaid o gwmpas Ewrop am resymau economaidd. Os yw'r farchnad hon, fel yr ydych wedi dweud, ar drai yn y tymor hir, ni fydd dim budd gwirioneddol, cynaliadwy i ffermwyr, oherwydd byddant yn mynd yn ôl at ddefnyddio hyn fel masnach ar gyfer y lloi gwryw ac ni fyddant yn chwilio am ateb hirdymor. Felly, pan fydd allforion byw yn edwino o dipyn i beth, byddant yn yr un sefyllfa yn union ag y maent yn awr. Ni allaf, yn fy myw, ddeall pa werth sydd mewn dilyn y trywydd hwn.

Carwyn Jones: Ni welaf ddim o'i le os mai rhesymau economaidd yw'r rheswm dros symud anifeiliaid, cyn belled â'i fod yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r safonau uchaf posibl. Mae holl waith y diwydiant yn seiliedig ar resymau economaidd a rhaid inni dderbyn hynny. Unwaith eto, yr ydym yn sôn yma am anifeiliaid a fyddai'n cael eu saethu fel arall. Nid yw fel pe baent yn byw mewn caeau ac yn byw bywyd normal; byddent yn cael eu difa. Felly, o ran moesoldeb y sefyllfa, os mynnwch, ni welaf ddim o'i le, cyn belled â bod y safonau'n ddigon uchel, mewn sicrhau bod pwrpas iddynt, oherwydd dyna pam, yn y pen draw, y maent yn cael eu magu. Beth bynnag yw ein barn amdano, dyna yw realiti'r sefyllfa.

Hoffwn weld cyfleusterau'n cael eu datblygu yma yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill Prydain a marchnad yn cael ei datblygu ymhellach yn y DU. Cafwyd ymdrech i wneud hynny ond methiant a fu hyd yma. Dyna yw'r drafferth gyda hyn. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n bwysig bob amser i'r diwydiant ffermio gadw golwg ar yr hyn sy'n mynd i ddigwydd ymhen pum, 10 neu 15 mlynedd. Nid oes yr un farchnad yn para am byth. Pe gallem symud tuag at sefyllfa lle nad oes rhaid i loi deithio,

present, however, European Union regulations demand that we allow the movement of animals, according to the highest standards. However, in the future, I would be more than happy to look for ways of ensuring that fewer calves move, and that the money that the calf trade undoubtedly generates for the dairy industry could be generated in other ways.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am gytuno i roi'r datganiad, sydd wedi rhoi cyfle inni drafod y mater pwysig hwn, serch bod y ddeddfwriaeth wedi'i phasio ymlaen llaw.

byddwn yn cefnogi hynny. Nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, fodd bynnag, mae rheoliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn mynnu ein bod yn caniatáu i anifeiliaid byw gael eu symud, gan lynu wrth y safonau uchaf. Fodd bynnag, yn y dyfodol, byddwn yn fwy na bodlon i edrych ar ffyrdd a fyddai'n golygu bod llai o loi'n cael eu symud, a bod yr arian y mae'r fasnach mewn lloi yn ei gynhyrchu i'r diwydiant llaeth yn cael ei gynhyrchu mewn ffyrdd eraill.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister for agreeing to give the statement, giving us an opportunity to discuss this important matter, despite the fact that the legislation has already been passed.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Rheolau Sefydlog) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2995)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2006 in relation to the draft the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Rheolau Sefydlog) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2995)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Rheolau Sefydlog) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Rheolau Sefydlog) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006, ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y

Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2996)

Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2996)

Jocelyn Davies: I place on record that my partner is a Plaid Cymru councillor on Caerphilly County Borough Council, but that does not prevent me from speaking or voting in this debate.

Jocelyn Davies: Hoffwn ddatgan bod fy mhartner yn gynghorydd Plaid Cymru ar Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, ond nid yw hynny'n fy rhwystro rhag siarad na phleidleisio yn y ddadl hon.

We in Plaid Cymru welcome these regulations, which will improve good governance in local councils. What progress has the Minister made towards further improving good governance by persuading her Labour colleagues in Caerphilly to allow Plaid Cymru opposition members to chair the committees that scrutinise the work of the Labour cabinet? When in opposition in Caerphilly, the Labour group's stated position was that Labour members would not participate in running the administration and it refused to even consider having Labour members as chairs. However, it seems that you have failed to persuade Caerphilly council of your view. You said that you would seek primary legislation to force them to do this if needed. You have not sought that primary legislation. Will you take this opportunity to tell us what the current position is and when you expect Caerphilly Labour group to recognise the good sense in striving to achieve good, sound governance within local government?

Yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, a fydd yn gwella llywodraethu da mewn cynghorau lleol. Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud i wella llywodraethu da drwy berswadio ei chyd-aelodau Llafur yng Nghaerffili i ganiatáu i aelodau o'r wrthblaid, sef Plaid Cymru, gadeirio'r pwyllgorau sy'n craffu ar waith y cabinet Llafur? Pan oeddent yn wrthblaid yng Nghaerffili, y safbwynt a oedd yn cael ei arddel gan y grŵp Llafur oedd na fyddai aelodau Llafur yn cyfranogi yn y ffordd yr oedd y weinyddiaeth yn cael ei rhedeg a gwrthododd hyd yn oed ystyried cael aelodau Llafur fel cadeiryddion. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys eich bod wedi methu ag argyhoeddi cyngor Caerffili ynglŷn â'ch safbwynt chi. Dywedasoeh y byddech yn ceisio cael deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i'w gorfodi i wneud hyn pe bai'n rhaid. Nid ydych wedi ceisio cael y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol honno. A wnewch fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddweud wrthym beth yw'r sefyllfa bresennol a pha bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl i grŵp Llafur Caerffili gydnabod doethineb ymdrechu i sicrhau llywodraethu da, cadarn mewn llywodraeth leol?

The Presiding Officer: I call the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group, speaking as its local government spokesperson.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, sy'n llefaru fel ei lefarydd ar lywodraeth leol.

Michael German: Thank you for that explanation, Presiding Officer.

Michael German: Diolch, Lywydd, am yr esboniad hwnnw.

I welcome these regulations, particularly as they bring the chief financial officer and the monitoring officer for local authorities into the ambit of the standing orders. There has been some concern that chief officers, including chief executives, have, at some stages, been able to frustrate the flow of the way in which disciplinary action can or should be taken. It is wholly appropriate that this should be the case.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, yn enwedig gan eu bod yn dod â'r prif swyddog cyllid a'r swyddog monitro mewn awdurdodau lleol o fewn cwmmpas y rheolau sefydlog. Mynegwyd peth pryder bod prif swyddogion, gan gynnwys prif weithredwyr, ar adegau, wedi gallu amharu ar lif y ffordd y gall neu y dylai camau disgyblu gael eu cymryd. Mae'n gwbl amhriodol i hyn ddigwydd.

I want to raise only one question with the Minister, on the designated independent person. A substantial amount of power is given under section 9 to that person. If a local authority committee finds that there is a case to answer, or that further investigation is needed of their chief executive, chief financial officer or their monitoring officer, then it must appoint a designated independent person. The quality of 'independent' is what I am asking the Minister to help us with. While the regulations are clear that a designated independent person must be appointed, there is no clarification in the regulations regarding what that means, and the sort of criteria required in order to lay out a clear pathway for councillors so that they would know the route forward. It may be that you want to issue that in the form of guidance to follow these regulations, but I think that it is important that, when you get to this point in a serious matter where a chief executive or a senior officer of an authority is under investigation, the independent person designated by the committee set up to investigate—which is a very good way forward—is recognised as being independent by those who are looking on.

This will obviously be a matter of great public concern, and there will be involvement and engagement by the media in looking at this matter, and they will want to be assured that we have given the maximum amount of guidance to local authorities to ensure that that person, in setting out that investigation, has clarity of independence just like the ombudsman has in Wales for the functions that we execute.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I thank Jocelyn for her support for the regulations; I will not answer her second point, because it was outside the ambit of these regulations.

Mike raised an interesting point. The word 'independent', as you know, is used in legislation. I suggest that I look at the experience in England to see whether what is meant by 'independent' has been further refined. We use that word in many ways; for example, the adjudication panel is recognised as being independent. If I feel that there is a need for further clarification and guidance, I

Dim ond un cwestiwn yr wyf am ei ofyn i'r Gweinidog, ynglŷn â'r person annibynnol dynodedig. Rhoddir cryn bŵer i'r person hwnnw o dan adran 9. Os yw pwyllgor awdurdod lleol yn canfod bod achos i'w ateb, neu fod angen ymchwiliad pellach i'w prif weithredwr, eu prif swyddog cyllid neu eu swyddog monitro, yna rhaid iddynt benodi person annibynnol dynodedig. Yr wyf yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog am gymorth gyda'r hyn a olygir wrth 'annibynnol'. Er bod y rheoliadau'n ei gwneud yn amlwg bod rhaid penodi person annibynnol dynodedig, nid oes eglurhad yn y rheoliadau o ran yr hyn a olygir wrth hyn, a pha fath o feini prawf sydd eu hangen er mwyn gosod llwybr clir i gynghorwyr fel eu bod yn gwybod beth fyddai'r ffordd ymlaen. Efallai eich bod am gyhoeddi hynny ar ffurf canllawiau i ddilyn y rheoliadau hyn, ond credaf ei bod yn bwysig, pan ydych yn cyrraedd sefyllfa o'r fath mewn achos difrifol pan fo prif weithredwr neu uwch swyddog awdurdod yn destun ymchwiliad, fod y person annibynnol dynodedig a benodir gan y pwyllgor a sefydlwyd i gynnal yr ymchwiliad—sydd yn ffordd dda ymlaen—yn cael ei gydnabod fel rhywun annibynnol gan y rhai sy'n edrych ar y digwyddiadau o'r tu allan.

Bydd hyn yn amlwg yn fater o bwys mawr i'r cyhoedd, a bydd y cyfryngau'n dangos diddordeb ac yn rhoi sylw i'r pwnc, a byddant am gael sicrwydd ein bod wedi rhoi cymaint â phosibl o arweiniad i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod gan y person hwnnw, wrth gynnal yr ymchwiliad, yr un math o annibyniaeth â'r hyn sydd gan yr ombwdsmon yng Nghymru ar gyfer y swyddogaethau a weinyddir gennym ni.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Diolchaf i Jocelyn am ei chefnogaeth i'r rheoliadau; ni wnaf ateb ei hail bwynt, oherwydd ei fod y tu allan i gwmpas y rheoliadau hyn.

Codwyd pwynt diddorol gan Mike. Mae'r gair 'annibynnol', fel y gwyddoch, yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn deddfwriaeth. Awgrymaf fy mod yn edrych ar brofiad Lloegr i weld a yw'r hyn a olygir wrth 'annibynnol' wedi ei fireinio ymhellach. Yr ydym yn defnyddio'r gair hwn mewn sawl ffordd; er enghraifft, cydnabyddir bod y panel dyfarnu'n annibynnol. Os byddaf yn teimlo bod angen

will come back to committee to discuss that issue. It is an interesting point, and I will consult with colleagues in England to see whether they have come across similar issues. If not, we may put it to one side. However, if there is concern, we will look at this again.

egluhad ac arweiniad pellach, dof yn ôl at y pwyllgor i drafod y mater. Mae'n bwynt diddorol, ac ymgynghoraf â chyd-aelodau yn Lloegr i holi a ydynt wedi dod ar draws problemau tebyg. Os nad ydynt, efallai y byddwn yn ei roi o'r neilltu. Fodd bynnag, os oes pryder, edrychwn arno eto.

*Cynnig (NDM2995): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2995): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2996): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2996): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Diogelu Dŵr Rhag Llygredd Nitradau Amaethyddol
(Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3
Approval of the Protection of Water Against Agricultural Nitrate Pollution
(England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No.
25 Section 3**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25.13:
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.13:

approves the draft the Protection of Water Against Agricultural Nitrate Pollution (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2006, and notes the explanatory memorandum for this Order laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2006. (NDM2994)

Glyn Davies: We will support these regulations. They are hugely important regulations, but I would like to look at how they are being applied in Wales. It is worth making the point in the Assembly that, over the last few weeks, I have been speaking to people working in the industry in England and Scotland, where there is huge concern about the impact of these regulations, and concern that they would be damaging to the farming industry. There is also concern that Governments have introduced these in an unnecessarily bureaucratic way. All the correspondence that I have had in Wales has indicated the opposite.

3.40 p.m.

It has been emphasised that this measure is being introduced in the way that perhaps it should be introduced. There will obviously be one or two people who have been affected who will have negative views, but, generally speaking, it has been introduced in Wales in the light-touch way that I had hoped for. That has been the general attitude. That point is worth making. We quite often have reasons to disagree with the performance of the Government here as compared with what happens over the border in England, but in this particular area, as indeed with single farm payments, devolution is delivering something for Wales that is beneficial for the industry.

William Graham: I echo the remarks made by my colleague, Glyn Davies. Protecting our water supplies and waterways against all types of pollutant is clearly paramount. Due regard must be given to farmers being able to sustain agriculture and the dual role of maintaining the countryside, which we all enjoy. In South Wales East, the Minister will know that nitrate-vulnerable zones are identified at Trellick and at Portskewett at the entrance to the Severn tunnel. I do not know

yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Diogelu Dŵr Rhag Llygredd Nitradau Amaethyddol (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006 ac yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006. (NDM2994)

Glyn Davies: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Maent yn rheoliadau eithriadol o bwysig, ond hoffwn edrych ar sut y maent yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru. Mae'n werth dweud yn y Cynulliad fy mod, yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, wedi bod yn siarad â phobl sy'n gweithio yn y diwydiant yn Lloegr a'r Alban, lle y mae pryderon enfawr ynglŷn ag effaith y rheoliadau hyn, a phryderon y byddant yn niweidiol i'r diwydiant ffermio. Mynegwyd pryder hefyd fod Llywodraethau wedi eu cyflwyno mewn dull sy'n ddianghenraid o fiwrocataidd. Mae'r holl ohebiaeth yr wyf wedi'i derbyn yng Nghymru'n awgrymu'r gwrthwyneb.

Pwysleisiwyd bod y mesur hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno yn y ffordd y dylai gael ei gyflwyno o bosibl. Mae'n amlwg y bydd gan un neu ddau o bobl yr effeithiwyd arnynt ganddo farn negyddol amdano, ond, ar y cyfan, mae wedi cael ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru yn y ffordd sensitif yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai'n digwydd. Dyna fu'r agwedd yn gyffredinol. Mae'n werth gwneud y pwynt hwnnw. Mae gennym yn aml resymau dros anghytuno â pherfformiad y Llywodraeth yma wrth gymharu hynny â'r hyn sy'n digwydd dros y ffin yn Lloegr, ond yn y maes arbennig hwn, fel yn wir yn achos y taliadau sengl, mae datganoli yn cyflawni rhywbeth i Gymru sydd o fudd i'r diwydiant.

William Graham: Ategef sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelod, Glyn Davies. Mae diogelu ein cyflenwadau dŵr a'n dyfrffyrdd rhag pob math o lygryddion yn amlwg o'r pwys mwyaf. Rhaid rhoi sylw dyledus i alluogi ffermwyr i gynnal amaethyddiaeth a'r rôl ddeuol o gynnal cefn gwlad, yr ydym i gyd yn mwynhau cymaint arno. Yn Nwyrain De Cymru, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod parthau perygl nitradau wedi eu dynodi yn Nhryleg a Phorth Ysgewin wrth geg

whether the Minister will agree, but I would like him to monitor that in terms of improving farming methods. The production of fertilisers is clearly reliant on oil and gas, the cost of which has greatly increased over recent years.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats, by and large, support the principle of protecting the environment embodied in nitrate-sensitive zones. However, how effective has the legislation been in Wales? How many reported nitrate pollution incidences have occurred and how many prosecutions have followed?

Secondly, on this particular legislation, there is provision in England for much greater consultation on the zones. Could you explain why that has not been implemented in Wales?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): We seem to have two different messages from the Conservatives and the Liberal Democrats: the Conservatives say that this has been carried out well in Wales and the Liberal Democrats say that that is not the case. The reality is that we have to accept that the situation in Wales, in terms of how the legislation has been introduced, is no different from that in England, or indeed, what we anticipate will be the case in Scotland. At the moment, Northern Ireland is the only part of the UK that has its own action programme under the new rules. The main difference is that far more land in England than in Wales is affected, as a percentage of the total land—it is 55 per cent in England and 3 per cent in Wales. However, it emphasises the importance of continuing to monitor the presence of nitrates in our soil.

Mick Bates asked me how many prosecutions had taken place. I will write to him on that.

Mick Bates: Your comment that the Welsh Liberal Democrats do not welcome these regulations is quite wrong. I will look at the Record of Proceedings, but I think that I said that we welcomed the regulations in terms of environmental protection. The question that I

twinned Hafren. Ni wn a fydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno, ond hoffwn pe bai'n monitro hynny o ran gwella dulliau ffermio. Mae cynhyrchu gwrteithiau'n amlwg yn ddibynnol ar olew a nwy, ac mae cost hynny wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Mick Bates: Ar y cyfan, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r egwyddor o ddiogelu'r amgylchedd mewn parthau perygl nitradau. Fodd bynnag, pa mor effeithiol y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth wedi bod yng Nghymru? Sawl achos o lygredd nitradau a hysbyswyd a sawl erlyniad sydd wedi dilyn hynny?

Yn ail, o ran y ddeddfwriaeth benodol hon, mae darpariaeth yn Lloegr ar gyfer llawer mwy o ymgynghori ar y parthau. A allwch esbonio pam nad yw hyn wedi ei roi ar waith yng Nghymru?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Ymddengys ein bod yn cael dwy neges wahanol gan y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol: dywed y Ceidwadwyr fod hyn wedi ei wneud yn dda yng Nghymru a dywed y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol nad yw hynny'n wir. Y gwir yw bod rhaid inni dderbyn nad yw'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru, o ran sut y cyflwynwyd y ddeddfwriaeth, yn wahanol i'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr, nac ychwaith, yn wahanol i'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn yr Alban, yn ôl yr hyn a ragwelwn. Ar hyn o bryd, Gogledd Iwerddon yw'r unig ran o'r DU sydd â'i rhaglen weithredu ei hun o dan y rheolau newydd. Y gwahaniaeth mwyaf yw bod hyn yn effeithio ar lawer mwy o dir yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru, fel canran o gyfanswm y tir—mae'n 55 y cant yn Lloegr a 3 y cant yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n pwysleisio pa mor bwysig yw parhau i fonitro presenoldeb nitradau yn ein pridd.

Gofynnodd Mick Bates imi sawl achos sydd wedi arwain at erlyn. Ysgrifennaf ato ynglŷn â hynny.

Mick Bates: Mae eich sylw nad yw Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn yn anghywir. Edrychaf ar Gofnod y Trafodion, ond credaf imi ddweud ein bod yn croesawu'r rheoliadau o ran diogelu'r amgylchedd. Yr

put to you concerned regulation 3, which in my explanatory notes—which apply to England only—ensures that the new public-participation obligations apply in relation to action programmes for nitrate-vulnerable zones in England. It specifically relates to England, so does that mean that it is already here in Wales or not?

Carwyn Jones: Yes, is the simple answer. The requirements for public consultation under the EC's public-participation directive are already accepted practice within the Welsh Assembly Government and they will continue to be observed in respect of the implementation of the nitrates directive.

On William Graham's point, it is important to ensure that farming practice continues to be carried out in harmony with the environment rather than in opposition to it. That is why it is so important that we continue to monitor our nitrate-vulnerable zones and continue to ensure that farmers and the wider community have a stronghold on ensuring that the small number of NVZs in Wales are monitored correctly and effectively so that we can avoid the sort of situation that we see in other EU countries.

oedd y cwestiwn a ofynnais i chi'n ymwneud â rheoliad 3 sydd, yn ôl fy nodiadau esboniadol—sy'n berthnasol i Loegr yn unig—yn sicrhau bod y rhwymedigaethau cyfranogiad cyhoeddus newydd yn berthnasol yn achos rhaglenni gweithredu ar gyfer y parthau perygl nitradau yn Lloegr. Mae'n cyfeirio'n benodol at Loegr, felly a yw hynny'n golygu ei fod eisoes yn weithredol yma yng Nghymru ai peidio?

Carwyn Jones: Ydyw, yw'r ateb syml. Mae'r gofynion ar gyfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus o dan gyfarwydddeb cyfranogiad cyhoeddus yr UE eisoes yn arfer sydd wedi ei dderbyn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a byddant yn parhau i gael eu dilyn o ran gweithredu'r gyfarwydddeb nitradau.

Ynglŷn â phwynt William Graham, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod arferion ffermio'n parhau i gael eu cynnal mewn cytgorod â'r amgylchedd yn hytrach na gweithio'n ei erbyn. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig inni barhau i fonitro ein parthau perygl nitradau a pharhau i sicrhau bod ffermwyr a'r gymuned yn gyffredinol yn gallu sicrhau bod y nifer fach o barthau perygl nitradau yng Nghymru'n cael eu monitro'n gywir ac effeithiol er mwyn inni osgoi'r math o sefyllfa yr ydym yn ei gweld yng ngwledydd eraill yr UE.

*Cynnig (NDM2994): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2994): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Amddiffyn Planhigion (Diwygio) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3
Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 25 Section 3

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): I propose that
 Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan the National Assembly for Wales, acting weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.13: under Standing Order No. 25.13:

yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft, approves the draft the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Amddiffyn a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on Planhigion (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006, and notes the explanatory 2006 ac yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol memorandum for this Order laid in the Table ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Office on 4 April 2006. (NDM2993) Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2006. (NDM2993)

Y Llywydd: Gan nad oes neb am siarad am y **The Presiding Officer:** As no-one wishes to cynnig hwn, awn yn syth at y bleidlais. speak to this motion, we will move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM2993): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion (NDM2993): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23 Approval of Changes to Standing Order No. 23

Jenny Randerson: I propose that

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 37:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 46(6) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37:

1. considers the report of the Business Committee which was e-mailed to Members and laid in the Table Office on 2 May; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ac a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mai; a

2. *approves the amendments to Standing Orders set out in the report of the Business Committee.* (NNDM3007)

2. *yn cymeradwyo'r gwelliannau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a geir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes.* (NNDM3007)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes neb yn dymuno siarad am y cynnig hwn ychwaith, felly awn at y bleidlais.

The Presiding Officer: There are no speakers on this motion either, therefore I call a vote.

*Cynnig (NNDM3007): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NNDM3007): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

**Ymrwymïadau ac Addewidion Allweddol Maniffesto Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
The Welsh Assembly Government's Manifesto Commitments and Key Pledges**

Motion (NDM2999): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

expresses its deep concern at the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to honour the manifesto commitments and key pledges on which it was elected.

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the Assembly Government's most recent u-turn in failing to honour its manifesto commitment to provide free home care for the disabled.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn mynegi ei bryder difrifol ynghylch methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i anrhydeddu ymrwymïadau ac addewidion allweddol y maniffesto a oedd yn sail ar gyfer ei hethol. (NDM2999)

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Mae gennym broblem gyda'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Mae rhywun yn teimlo weithiau fod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn credu bod ganddi'r hawl ddwyfol i lywodraethu. Nid yw pethau megis torri addewidion yn golygu llawer i blaid sydd yn teimlo felly. Yn syml, agwedd y Llywodraeth yw, 'Llafur ydym ni; ni sy'n rheoli Cymru ac ni wnaiff hynny newid beth bynnag a wnawn'. Mae honno'n agwedd afiach a nawddoglyd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod mai aelodau Llafur yw mwyafrif Aelodau Seneddol Cymru ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac,

Cynnig (NDM2999): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn mynegi ei bryder difrifol ynghylch methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i anrhydeddu ymrwymïadau ac addewidion allweddol y maniffesto a oedd yn sail ar gyfer ei hethol.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

yn gresynu at dro pedol mwyaf diweddar Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn methu ag anrhydeddu'r ymrwymïad yn ei maniffesto i ddarparu gofal cartref rhad ac am ddim ar gyfer pobl anabl.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

expresses its deep concern at the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to honour the manifesto commitments and key pledges on which it was elected. (NDM2999)

We will support the amendment tabled in the name of Kirsty Williams.

We have a problem with the Labour Government in the Assembly. One sometimes feels that the Labour Government thinks that it has the divine right to govern. Things such as breaking promises do not mean much to a party that has such ideas. The Government's attitude is simply, 'We are Labour; we govern Wales and that will not change whatever we do'. That is an unhealthy and patronising attitude. At present, we have to acknowledge that Labour has the majority of Members of Parliament in Wales and Assembly Members and, of

wrth gwrs, mae'r blaid wedi bod yn rheoli nifer o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru bron yn ddi-dor ers rhyw ganrif.

course, it has been controlling a number of local authorities in Wales almost continually for almost a century.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.47 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.47 p.m.*

Efallai fod Aelodau Llafur yn meddwl, mae'n debyg yn eu hisymwybod y rhan fwyaf o'r amser, nad oes llawer o wahaniaeth os torrir yr addewid hwn ar iechyd neu os methir y targed acw ar yr economi, ac na chaiff hynny lawer o effaith ar ganlyniad yr etholiad nesaf. Felly, mae gennym yr hawl i ofyn a wnaiff rhywbeth newid o gwbl, ac a oes pris i'w dalu am dorri'r addewid ar iechyd, er enghraifft. A gaiff y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi torri cymaint o addewidion a cholli targedau yn y cyfnod ers 1999 unrhyw effaith ar ganlyniad yr etholiad nesaf?

Perhaps Labour Members do believe, probably subconsciously most of the time, that it does not make much of a difference if we break a pledge on health or miss a target on the economy, and that it will not have much of an effect on the result of the next election. Therefore, we have the right to ask whether anything will change, and whether there is a price to be paid for breaking promises on health, for example. Will the fact that the Labour Government in the Assembly has broken so many promises and has failed to achieve so many targets in the period since 1999 have any effect on the result of the next election?

Fy mhwynt cyffredinol ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon yw ein bod ni am weld ymddiriedaeth mewn Llywodraeth yn bwnc llosg yn etholiad 2007. Mae gennym hawl i ddisgwyl bod Llywodraeth sy'n cael ei hethol ar raglen maniffesto yn cadw mor agos â phosibl at y maniffesto hwnnw. Dywedwn wrth bobl Cymru, wrth arwain at etholiad 2007, fod credadwyedd y Llywodraeth a'r Prif Weinidog yn y fantol, a bod hawl gan bobl Cymru gael eu llywodraethu gan blaid y gellir ymddiried ynddi i gadw at ei gair.

My general point in opening this debate is that we want to see trust in Government being a major issue in the 2007 election. We have a right to expect that the Government elected on a manifesto programme sticks as closely as possible to the commitments in that manifesto. In the run-up to the 2007 elections, we want to tell the people of Wales that the credibility of the Government and the First Minister is in the balance, and that the people of Wales have a right to be governed by a party that can be trusted to keep its promises.

The issue of trust and credibility will be at the heart of the campaign in 2007. If you look at the number of promises and pledges made by Labour in Government in the UK since 1997, and since 1999 in Wales, you will see that we have a litany of broken promises. What is worse than that, Labour thinks that it can get away with it. The purpose of today's debate, as I am sure it will be during the 2007 election campaign, is to make it clear that it cannot get away with it, because the people of Wales will be reminded time and again of the promises that it made and those that it has broken.

Bydd mater ymddiriedaeth a hygredd yn ganolog yn yr ymgyrch yn 2007. Os ystyriwch yr addewidion a'r addunedau a wnaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Deyrnas Unedig ers 1997, ac ers 1999 yng Nghymru, gwelwch fod llu o addewidion wedi eu torri. Yr hyn sy'n waeth na hynny yw bod Llafur yn credu y gall osgoi'r gosb am hynny. Diben dadl heddiw, fel y bydd, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn ystod ymgyrch etholiadol 2007, yw ei gwneud yn glir na all osgoi'r gosb, oherwydd y bydd pobl Cymru'n cael eu hatgoffa dro ar ôl tro am yr addewidion a wnaeth a'r rhai y mae wedi eu torri.

3.50 p.m.

There is a pattern here. Not only has Labour

Mae patrwm i'w weld yma. Nid yn unig y

made promises in its manifesto, but when it knows that it cannot deliver those promises, it will somehow or other turn them into other promises or targets to be kept and reached during the lifetime of an Assembly. That has happened many times on issues such as health. Labour makes a manifesto promise that it knows that it cannot keep. Half-way through the match, which is the four-year Assembly term, it moves the goalposts. Then it says, 'Well, of course, we have not been able to keep that promise. Let us put in another target or pledge.' What happens then is that those are missed, abandoned or sometimes conveniently forgotten.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o ran iechyd. Credaf fod hynny'n darlunio i'r dim sut y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn gweithredu. A ydych yn cofio'r hyn a ddywedodd Tony Blair yn agos at etholiad 1997? Dywedodd:

'We have 24 hours to save the NHS'.

Dyma un o'r targedau a osododd y Llywodraeth yn 1999. Dywedodd, yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, na fyddai neb yn Nghymru, erbyn 2003, yn aros mwy na chwe mis am driniaeth fel claf allanol. Yn awr, mae dros 40,000 yn aros, a hynny yn 2006, nid yn 2003. Ni fydd y Llywodraeth wedi cyrraedd y targed erbyn 2007 na 2009. Bydd 10 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ac ni fydd wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd y targed gwreiddiol.

Dywedodd hefyd na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty. Yr ydym yn sylweddoli bod y ffigurau wedi gostwng, ond gosodwyd y targed hwnnw ar gyfer 2003. Yn 2006, mae 10 o bobl ar y rhestr yn disgwyl am driniaeth. Mae hyd yn oed wedi methu'r targed i ostwng yr amser i 12 mis, oherwydd bu iddi newid y targed yn 2003 a 2004. Felly, mae blynyddoedd wedi mynd heibio ers iddi fethu'r targed cyntaf, ac mae hyd yn oed yn methu'r targedau y mae wedi eu hailosod ar ei chyfer ei hun.

Yr hyn yr oedd Llafur yn ei ddweud yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar y Cynulliad oedd, 'Nid oes digon o arian. Mae'r Torïaid wedi gwasgu ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Sut y gallwn

mae Llafur wedi gwneud addewidion yn ei manifesto, ond pan fydd yn gwybod na all gyflawni'r addewidion hynny, bydd rywsut neu'i gilydd yn eu troi'n addewidion a thargedau eraill i'w cadw a'u cyflawni yn ystod oes Cynulliad. Digwyddodd hynny sawl gwaith ar faterion megis iechyd. Bydd Llafur yn gwneud addewid yn ei manifesto gan wybod na all ei chadw. Hanner y ffordd drwy'r gêm, sef tymor pedair blynedd y Cynulliad, mae'n symud pyst y gôl. Yna mae'n dweud, 'Wel, wrth gwrs, nid ydym wedi gallu cadw'r addewid hwnnw. Gadewch inni osod targed arall neu addewid arall.' Yna methir â chyflawni'r rheini'n ogystal, a rhoddir y gorau iddynt a'u hanghofio'n gyfleus ddigon.

I want to concentrate on what has happened in relation to health. I believe that that gives us an accurate picture of the way in which this Government operates. Do you recall what Tony Blair said just prior to the 1997 election? He said:

Mae gennym 24 awr i achub y GIG.

This is one of the targets that the Government set in 1999. It said, during the first Assembly, that, by 2003, no-one in Wales would wait longer than six months for out-patient treatment. Currently, over 40,000 people are waiting, and we are now in 2006, not 2003. This Government will not reach that target by 2007 or 2009. Ten years will have passed and it will not have reached the original target.

It also stated that no-one would wait longer than 18 months for in-patient, hospital treatment. We recognise that the figures have come down, but that target was set for 2003. In 2006, there are 10 people on the list waiting for treatment. It has even missed the target to bring it down to 12 months, because it changed the target in 2003 and 2004. Therefore, years have gone by since it missed the first target, and it is now missing the targets that it reset for itself.

During the early years of the Assembly, Labour said, 'There is not enough money. The Tories have squeezed the health service. How can we reduce these waiting lists?'. I

ostwng y rhestrau aros hyn?'. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Gweinidog Cyllid yma heddiw. Gall ddweud wrthym fod y Llywodraeth wedi dyblu'r gwariant ar iechyd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gwybod erbyn hyn fod y sefyllfa cynddrwg ag a oedd pan oedd yn gwario hanner y swm hwnnw ar y gwasanaeth yn 1999. Felly, ni all y Llywodraeth ddweud bellach mai prinder arian sy'n gyfrifol am y sefyllfa. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod y gwasanaeth iechyd mewn dyled o £82 miliwn erbyn hyn.

Therefore, we have this litany of broken promises on health.

I challenged the First Minister on the issue of dentistry today. What about the pledge that the Prime Minister made that people would have access to an NHS dentist within two years from 1999 simply by telephoning NHS Direct? We know what happened to that promise. The First Minister told us today that he thinks that everyone in Wales will have access to an NHS dentist by December 2006. Why should we believe that statement when he has broken every promise?

What about education? I am glad that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is here. Let us talk about free school breakfasts. The Government is really squirming on this. The pledge that it made in 2003 could not have been clearer. It said that every child in Wales would get a free school breakfast by 2007. Ten per cent of schools in Wales are currently providing free school breakfasts, but not every child in those schools gets a free school breakfast. The total number of children getting a free school breakfast amounts to 3 per cent of pupils.

Jeff Cuthbert: You seem to have a divine right to mislead and confuse. I have listened in amazement to opposition members claiming that the pledge on free school breakfasts has been broken. We have made it clear that we will provide for all children. Make it clear from your party's point of view: are you suggesting that you would somehow force-feed children who have breakfast at home? Are you suggesting that primary schools that do not want to take up

am pleased to see that the Finance Minister is here today. She can tell us that the Government has doubled health expenditure. However, we know that the situation is just as bad as it was when it was spending half that amount on the service in 1999. Therefore, the Government can no longer claim that lack of funding is to blame for this situation. We know that the health service now faces debts of £82 million.

Felly mae llu o addewidion wedi eu torri o ran iechyd.

Heriais y Prif Weinidog ynghylch mater deintyddiaeth heddiw. Beth ddigwyddodd i'r addewid a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog y byddai pawb yn gallu mynd at un o ddeintyddion y GIG o fewn dwy flynedd ar ôl 1999 a hynny drwy ffonio Galw Iechyd. Gwyddom beth fu hanes yr addewid hwnnw. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrthym heddiw ei fod yn credu y bydd un o ddeintyddion y GIG ar gael i bawb yng Nghymru erbyn mis Rhagfyr 2006. Pam y dylem gredu'r addewid hwnnw ac yntau wedi torri pob addewid arall?

Beth am addysg? Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yma. Gadewch inni siarad am frecwast am ddim yn yr ysgolion. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwingo o ddifrif ynghylch hyn. Ni allasai'r addewid a roes yn 2003 fod yn gliriach. Dywedodd y câi pob plentyn yng Nghymru frecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol erbyn 2007. Deg y cant o ysgolion Cymru sy'n darparu brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol ar hyn o bryd, ond nid yw pob plentyn yn yr ysgolion hynny'n cael brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol. Nid oes ond 3 y cant o'r disgyblion yn cael brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Ymddengys fod gennych hawl ddwyfol i gamarwain a pheri dryswch. Yr wyf wedi gwrandao mewn syndod ar aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n honni bod yr addewid ar frecwast am ddim yn yr ysgolion wedi ei dorri. Yr ydym wedi dweud yn glir y byddwn yn darparu ar gyfer y plant i gyd. Beth am i chi ddatgan barn eich plaid yn glir ar hyn: a ydych yn awgrymu rywsut y dylem orfodi plant sy'n cael brechwast gartref i fwyta? A ydych yn awgrymu y dylid gorfodi

the offer should be forced to do so? What is your policy?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: When the Labour Party is in trouble, it brings out Jeff. What an interesting intervention that was. Labour is telling the people of Wales that it can only keep this promise by force-feeding children—that, in effect, is what Jeff is saying.

Denise Idris Jones *rose*—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am not giving way. There are other matters that I want to bring to the Assembly's attention.

The free school breakfast promise is a con, and the people of Wales know that it is a con. It was misleading, it was worthless, and it was a con.

On additional students in further education colleges, Labour told us that there would be 22,000 extra students in further education colleges. This year, it has frozen the budgets of further education colleges. Therefore, there will not be investment and more students, but there will be cuts and fewer students going to further education colleges if their budgets are frozen. Therefore, there will be fewer students, and there will be cuts and redundancies. That is what happens under a Labour Government.

Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r addewidion yn ymwneud â'r economi? Dywedwyd wrthym y byddai Amcan 1 a'r holl arian a fyddai'n cael ei fuddsoddi yn codi cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru i 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Gyfunol erbyn 2010. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd. Mae Llafur wedi newid yr addewid hwnnw ac wedi newid y system.

Dywedaf wrth y Llywodraeth fod Cymru, yn economaidd, mewn sefyllfa waeth yn awr nag a oedd pan wnaeth y Llywodraeth y cynnig hwnnw. Mae lefelau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru wedi gostwng, ac nid ydynt wedi codi. Os cymherir lefelau GVA yng Nghymru yn awr gyda'r hyn oeddent yn 1999, a phan y'u cymherir â'r sefyllfa ym 15 gwlad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, yn hytrach na'r 25 gwlad, gwelir bod sefyllfa

ysgolion cynradd nad ydynt am dderbyn y cynnig i wneud hynny? Beth yw eich polisi?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pan fo'r Blaid Lafur mewn trafferthion, daw Jeff i'r adwy. Yr oedd hwnnw'n ymyriad diddorol. Mae Llafur yn dweud wrth bobl Cymru na all gadw'r addewid hwn heb orfodi plant i fwyta—dyna'r hyn y mae Jeff yn ei ddweud, i bob pwrpas.

Denise Idris Jones *a gododd*—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid wyf am ildio. Mae materion eraill yr hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad atynt.

Twyll yw addewid y brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgolion, ac mae pobl Cymru'n gwybod mai twyll ydyw. Yr oedd yn gamarweiniol, yr oedd yn ddi-werth, ac yr oedd yn dwyll.

Ynglŷn â myfyrwyr ychwanegol mewn colegau addysg bellach, dywedodd Llafur wrthym y byddai 22,000 yn rhagor o fyfyrwyr mewn colegau addysg bellach. Eleni mae wedi rhewi cyllidebau'r colegau addysg bellach. Felly, ni fydd buddsoddiad a rhagor o fyfyrwyr, ond yn hytrach bydd toriadau a llai o fyfyrwyr yn mynd i golegau addysg bellach os caiff eu cyllidebau eu rhewi. Felly, bydd llai o fyfyrwyr, a bydd toriadau a diswyddiadau. Dyna sy'n digwydd dan Lywodraeth Lafur.

What has happened to the pledges on the economy? We were told that Objective 1 and all the funding that would be invested would raise per capita gross domestic product in Wales to 90 per cent of the United Kingdom average by 2010. That has not happened. Labour has changed that pledge and changed the system.

I say to the Government that, economically, Wales is worse off now than it was when the Government made that pledge. Gross value added levels in Wales have gone down, not up. If you compare GVA levels in Wales today with the position in 1999, and when you compare them with the position in the 15 nations of the European Union, rather than the 25 countries, you will see that Wales's position is appalling. The position in west

Cymru'n warthus. Mae'r sefyllfa yng ngorllewin Cymru wedi dirywio yn sylweddol. Pe baech yn tynnu allan 10 gwlad newydd yr UE a chymharu Cymru â'r 15 gwlad wreiddiol, byddech yn sylweddoli bod ein sefyllfa economaidd wedi dirywio.

Mae pob un o addewidion y Llywodraeth ar yr economi—y rhai pwysicaf, beth bynnag—wedi methu.

However, let me make it clear that it does not matter which area you are talking about, be that health, education, the economy, or the environment, because they are all areas in which Labour has broken its promises. We should say to the people of Wales that Wales deserves a Government that it can trust after 2007, and Plaid Cymru is determined to ensure that that is what they get.

Jenny Randerson: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the Assembly Government's most recent u-turn in failing to honour its manifesto commitment to provide free home care for the disabled.

There have been many broken promises, and many half-delivered promises. In the case of this Labour Government, that is due in large part to total incompetence rather than a deliberate attempt to mislead. However, I predict that we have another pledge set up for us today on which it will fall, which is that everyone who wants one will have an NHS dentist by the end of the year. The phrase 'pigs might fly' comes to mind.

4.00 p.m.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats tabled this amendment because we believe that this is not a case of incompetence or bad luck leading to the failure to deliver on a promise, but the most barefaced u-turn of them all. It is the only one of the top 10 promises that the Labour Party has totally abandoned. The others have either been partly adhered to or at

Wales has deteriorated significantly. If you were to take out the 10 new EU countries and compare Wales with the original 15 countries, you would realise that our economic position has deteriorated.

Every one of the Government's pledges on the economy—the most important ones, at least—has not been fulfilled.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ddatgan yn glir nad yw o bwys pa faes yr ydych yn sôn amdano, boed yn iechyd, yn addysg, yr economi, neu'r amgylchedd, gan eu bod i gyd yn feysydd lle y mae Llafur wedi torri ei haddewidion. Dylem ddweud wrth bobl Cymru fod Cymru'n haeddu Llywodraeth y gall ymddiried ynddi ar ôl 2007, ac mae Plaid Cymru'n benderfynol o sicrhau mai dyna n gânt.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at dro pedol mwyaf diweddar Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn methu ag anrhydeddu'r ymrwymiad yn ei manifestio i ddarparu gofal cartref rhad ac am ddim ar gyfer pobl anabl.

Mae llawer o addewidion wedi eu torri, ac mae llawer o addewidion wedi hanner eu cyflawni. Yn achos y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, mae hynny'n bod i raddau helaeth oherwydd diffyg medr llwyr yn hytrach nag ymgais fwriadol i gamarwain. Fodd bynnag, rhagwelaf fod addewid arall wedi ei wneud heddiw y bydd yn methu â'i gyflawni, sef y bydd un o ddeintyddion y GIG ar gael i bawb sy'n dymuno hynny erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Daw'r geiriau 'pe bai'r Wyddfa i gyd yn gaws' i'm meddwl.

Cyflwynodd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru y gwelliant hwn am ein bod yn credu nad mater o ddiffyg medr nac anlwc yw hyn, a hynny wedi arwain at fethu â chadw addewid, ond y tro pedol mwyaf digywilydd a fu erioed. Hwn yw'r unig un o'r 10 prif addewid y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi troi ei chefn yn llwyr arno. Mae wedi cadw'r

least aspired to; it has paid lip service to them rather than abandoning them. To understand the enormity of this u-turn, you must take account of the processes that any responsible political party should go through before making an election promise. After all, civil service advice is available to us should we wish to avail ourselves of it in order to get costings for certain things. That applies to all political parties evenly, but it is undoubtedly the case that the Labour Party has an advantage—it is the incumbent; it knows the current costings and details in far greater depth than we as opposition parties do. Therefore, as an insider, one would have expected it to get its costings right.

There have been problems with this promise of free homecare for the disabled from the start. Do you remember all the arguments about the definition of disability? Do you remember the prevarication on that issue? Do you remember the meetings with the Coalition on Charging, and the long silences after those meetings? Time went on, and I believed that it was going to be a watered-down promise and that it would apply to only a certain number of people with disabilities. However, we were all wrong-footed about it. The impatience of people with disabilities as they waited was palpable. More and more people contacted me as they waited for what they were sure must come by the beginning of the current financial year if this promise was to be delivered.

I have looked at documentation obtained under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 during the period after the current Minister for Health and Social Services became health Minister. Local authorities were beavering away on desk projects right up to this February thinking that they were going to be part of this big scheme. We were all looking at how it had happened in Scotland, where, apparently, it had not cost as much as some people had predicted; it cost a lot, but it was manageable. There was no clue as to the change of heart, but it must have come sometime before 15 February, because the date for that statement was fixed well in

gweddill yn rhannol neu o leiaf wedi dweud ei bod yn awyddus i'w cadw; mae wedi esgus eu cefnogi yn hytrach na throi ei chefn arnynt. Er mwyn sylweddoli maint y tro pedol hwn, rhaid ichi ystyried y prosesau y dylai unrhyw blaid wleidyddol gyfrifol eu dilyn cyn gwneud addewid mewn etholiad. Wedi'r cyfan, mae cyngor gan y gwasanaeth sifil ar gael inni os ydym am fanteisio arno er mwyn cael costau rhai pethau. Mae hyn yn berthnasol i bob un o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol, ond heb os nac oni bai mae gan y Blaid Lafur fantais—hi sy'n gyfrifol amdano; mae'n gwybod llawer mwy am y costau a'r manylion na ni fel gwrthbleidiau. Felly, gan fod gwybodaeth fewnol ganddi, byddech yn disgwyl y byddai wedi cael ei chostau'n iawn.

Cafwyd problemau o'r dechrau gyda'r addewid hwn o ofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl. A ydych yn cofio'r holl ddadleuon ynglŷn â'r diffiniad o anabledd? A ydych yn cofio'r ymatebion cloff ar y mater hwn? A ydych yn cofio'r cyfarfodydd gyda'r Gynghrair ar Godi Tâl, a'r cyfnodau maith o dawelwch ar ôl y cyfarfodydd hynny? Aeth amser heibio, a chredwn ei fod yn mynd i fod yn addewid wedi ei lastwreiddio ac mai dim ond i nifer penodol o bobl ag anabledd y byddai'n berthnasol. Fodd bynnag, daliwyd pob un ohonom ar y troed anghywir yn ei gylch. Yr oedd diffyg amynedd pobl sydd ag anabledd wrth iddynt aros yn amlwg iawn. Cysylltodd mwy a mwy o bobl â mi wrth iddynt aros am rywbeth yr oeddent yn siŵr ei fod am ddod cyn dechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol os oedd yr addewid hwn yn mynd i gael ei gyflawni.

Yr wyf wedi edrych ar ddogfennau a gafwyd dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn ystod y cyfnod ar ôl i'r Gweinidog presennol dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddod yn Weinidog iechyd. Yr oedd awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio'n galed ar brosiectau desg hyd fis Chwefror eleni gan feddwl eu bod yn mynd i fod yn rhan o'r cynllun mawr hwn. Yr oeddem i gyd yn edrych ar sut yr oedd pethau wedi digwydd yn yr Alban, lle nad oedd, yn ôl pob golwg, wedi costio cymaint ag yr oedd rhai pobl wedi rhagweld; yr oedd wedi costio cryn dipyn, ond gellid ei reoli. Ni chafwyd dim awgrym ynglŷn â'r newid meddwl, ond

advance.

I understand, as we all do, that promises are made and are sometimes not achieved. They are not achieved either for very understandable and good reasons, or simply because of incompetence. There can be a change in circumstances, either financial or legal, but in this case—and I give him full marks for honesty—the Minister made it clear that the Government simply got the figures wrong, and the hopes of disabled people and their carers throughout Wales were dashed with that fatal miscalculation. With all the political knockabout here, let us remember that this is what this is really about. This u-turn is about disabled people and their carers, who have been so badly let down.

Jeff Cuthbert referred to Ieuan Wyn Jones misleading and confusing people, but that is what the Labour manifesto did in 2003 on so many issues. I predict that the people of Wales will be more cautious in 2007 and the Welsh Liberal Democrats will certainly be reminding them of this.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I apologise to Plenary; I should have imposed a three-minute time limit on speeches. I cannot do it now according to Standing Orders, but if any Member, apart from the Minister, takes more than three minutes, he or she will be the only member from that party who will get in.

Helen Mary Jones: Preparing for this speech was quite a difficult task; in fact, it was one of the more difficult presentations to the Assembly that I have had to prepare. There have been so many broken promises and half-met promises in health and social care and people have been let down. I take no pleasure in saying that, because we are talking about the sick and vulnerable fellow citizens of Wales being let down by a Government that made promises to them. None of us can take any pleasure in that. There are, as I have said, so very many. Ieuan Wyn Jones has already touched on some, and I will talk a little bit

mae'n rhaid ei fod wedi digwydd rywdro cyn 15 Chwefror, oherwydd yr oedd y dyddiad ar gyfer y datganiad hwnnw wedi ei bennu beth amser ymlaen llaw.

Yr wyf fi, a phawb arall, yn deall nad yw addewidion bob amser yn cael eu cyflawni. Mae hyn yn digwydd naill ai oherwydd rhesymau da a chwbl ddealladwy, neu oherwydd anallu i'w cyflawni. Mae'n bosibl bod amgylchiadau, ariannol neu gyfreithiol, wedi newid, ond yn yr achos hwn—a rhoddaf farciau llawn iddo am onestrwydd—mae'r Gweinidog wedi nodi'n glir fod y Llywodraeth wedi camfarnu o ran y ffigurau, a chwalwyd gobeithion pobl anabl a'u gofawyr ym mhob rhan o Gymru gan y camgyfrifiad tyngedfennol hwn. Yng nghanol yr holl ddadleuon gwleidyddol ar y mater hwn, gadewch inni gofio mai dyma beth yw gwraidd y broblem. Mae'r tro pedol hwn yn ymwneud â phobl anabl a'u gofawyr, ac maent wedi eu siomi'n fawr iawn.

Cyfeiriodd Jeff Cuthbert at Ieuan Wyn Jones yn camarwain ac yn drysu pobl, ond dyna beth a wnaeth maniffesto Llafur yn 2003 ar nifer fawr o faterion. Rhagwelaf y bydd pobl Cymru'n fwy gofalus yn 2007 a bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn sicr yn eu hatgoffa o hyn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Ymddiheuraf i'r Cyfarfod Llawn; dylwn fod wedi cyfyngu'r areithiau i dri munud yr un. Ni allaf wneud hynny yn awr yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog, ond os bydd unrhyw Aelod, ar wahân i'r Gweinidog, yn cymryd mwy na thri munud, ef neu hi fydd yr unig aelod o'r blaid honno a fydd yn cael cyfle i siarad.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr oedd paratoi ar gyfer yr araith hon yn dasg anodd iawn; mewn gwirionedd, dyma un o'r cyflwyniadau anoddaf i'r Cynulliad yr wyf wedi gorfod ei baratoi. Mae cynifer o addewidion wedi eu torri a chymaint o addewidion heb eu cyflawni'n llwyr ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac mae pobl wedi eu siomi. Mae'n gas gennyf ddweud hyn, oherwydd yr ydym yn siarad am gyd-ddinasyddion gwael a bregus yng Nghymru'n cael eu siomi gan Lywodraeth a wnaeth addewidion iddynt. Mae hyn yn ofid i bob un ohonom. Fel y dywedais, mae nifer fawr iawn o addewidion

more about some of these examples.

We were asked a few weeks ago to be pleased that the Government had partly met its latest waiting time targets, but these must be the most moved goalposts in the history of Wales. I briefly remind fellow Members of where we have come from on this. In 1999, the Government made a pledge in its election manifesto that no-one would wait longer than six months for in-patient treatment and 18 months for out-patient treatment by 2003. Here we are in 2006, and that is still not met. Even its own target of waiting 12 months for people in both categories was still missed, with some in-patients waiting over 18 months for treatment.

Some 40,533 people are still waiting more than six months for an out-patient appointment; 69,500 more people are on hospital waiting lists in Wales than there were in 1999. When we use those figures, we need to remind ourselves that every one of those people is a person in pain. They may not be in danger of their lives—I think that we all acknowledge that our health services are good at dealing with emergencies—but they are in pain. The Minister will say—and, in fairness, it is right to admit—that there has been some progress, but I would invite the Minister to come to my regional office in Llanelli and tell that to a gentleman with whom I was talking yesterday, a constituent in his 70s, who has already been waiting more than two years for his first out-patient appointment for a painful, though not life-threatening condition. He was told that he had to go to the bottom of the waiting list because of an administrative error. I would really like the Minister to explain to that gentleman how progress is working for him.

Jenny Randerson has spoken at some length on the issues to do with the pledge on free homecare, which, for whatever reason, was just dumped. It was an absolute, 100 per cent, manifesto commitment, and it was just

wedi eu torri. Cyfeiriodd Ieuan Wyn Jones at rai yn gynharach, ac yr wyf finnau am ddweud ychydig bach mwy am rai o'r enghreifftiau hyn.

Rai wythnosau'n ôl gofynnwyd inni fod yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo'n rhannol i gyrraedd ei thargedau diweddaraf ar gyfer amseroedd aros, ond mae'n siŵr mai'r rhain yw'r pyst sydd wedi eu symud fwyaf yn holl hanes Cymru. Hoffwn atgoffa fy nghyd-Aelodau yn sydyn o'r cefndir y tu ôl i hyn. Yn 1999, addawodd y Llywodraeth yn ei maniffesto etholiadol na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na chwe mis am driniaeth claf mewnol a 18 mis am driniaeth claf allanol erbyn 2003. Dyma ni yn 2006, ac mae hynny heb ei gyflawni byth. Methwyd â chyrraedd hyd yn oed ei tharged ei hun o 12 mis ar restr aros ar gyfer pobl yn y ddau gategori, gyda rhai cleifion mewnol yn aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth.

Mae 40,533 o bobl yn dal i aros am fwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad claf allanol; mae 69,500 yn fwy o bobl ar restrau aros ysbytai yng Nghymru nag a oedd yn 1999. Pan fyddwn yn defnyddio'r ffigurau hyn, mae angen inni atgoffa'n hunain fod pob un o'r bobl hynny'n unigolyn sydd mewn poen. Efallai nad yw eu bywydau mewn perygl—credaf ein bod yn cydnabod bod ein gwasanaethau iechyd yn dda am ddelio gydag argyfyngau—ond maent mewn poen. Bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud—ac, a bod yn deg, mae'n iawn inni gyfaddef—fod rhywfaint o gynnydd wedi ei wneud, ond hoffwn wahodd y Gweinidog i ddod i'm swyddfa ranbarthol yn Llanelli a dweud hynny wrth ŵr yr oeddwn yn siarad ag ef ddoe, etholwr yn ei 70au, sydd wedi bod yn aros ers dros ddwy flynedd am ei apwyntiad claf allanol cyntaf ar gyfer cyflwr sydd, er nad yw'n peryglu ei fywyd, yn un poenus iawn. Dywedwyd wrtho fod rhaid iddo fynd i waelod y rhestr aros oherwydd camgymeriad gweinyddol. Byddwn yn hoffi gweld y Gweinidog yn esbonio wrth y gŵr hwnnw sut y mae ef yn elwa o'r cynnydd.

Mae Jenny Randerson wedi siarad cryn dipyn am y materion yn ymwneud â'r addewid o ofal cartref am ddim, a fwrwyd o'r neilltu'n ddisymwth am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd. Yr oedd yn ymrwymiad llwyr, 100 y cant, yn y

dumped. I will not repeat the points that Jenny Randerson made, as they are points that I have also made so often in the chamber, but I wonder whether the Minister and this Government have any idea of the scale of anger and disappointment that this decision has caused. Any idea? This, I know, was a vote-maker for many disabled citizens and their carers, and the Government needs to acknowledge that it has let them down. Apologies, frankly, are not enough; we need action.

Ieuan Wyn Jones referred in his speech to the promise on dentistry, and I want to refer back to his earlier intervention on dentistry and the First Minister's response. If I heard rightly, and the Record will show, the First Minister suggested that there are people who are happy not to be registered with a dentist, happy not to have dental care. There may well be some wealthy people who are happy to get the high-quality private care that they can afford to pay for, but I have yet to meet a single person anywhere in Mid and West Wales who says, 'Oh, I am not registered with a dentist, but I do not mind'.

It is high time the First Minister ate his words. Let me reiterate Tony Blair's promise in 1999: within two years, everyone would be able to get access to an NHS dentist by phoning NHS Direct. To give a specific example, only 54.7 per cent of people in Blaenau Gwent are registered with an NHS dentist. Perhaps it is time for the Secretary of State for Wales to apologise to them for that, rather than for some other, more esoteric matters. I could continue with many examples—[*Interruption.*] If the Minister would like to make an intervention, he is welcome to do so, but I find it a bit embarrassing when he does so from a sedentary position. There we are; I see that he does not have the courage of his convictions. He murmurs in the chamber, but he is not prepared to be heard by the people of Wales. There we are; that is absolutely typical.

I want to refer briefly to the 'Designed to Deliver' programme for Mid and West Wales, which those of us who live there are

manifesto, a chafodd ei fwrw o'r neilltu'n ddisymwth. Nid wyf am ailadrodd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan Jenny Randerson, gan eu bod yn bwyntiau yr wyf finnau hefyd wedi eu codi mor aml yn y siambr, ond tybed a oes gan y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth hon ryw syniad faint o ddieter a siom y mae'r penderfyniad hwn wedi ei achosi? Unrhyw syniad? Gwn fod hyn wedi ennill pleidleisiau llawer o ddinasyddion anabl a'u gofalwyr, a bod angen i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod ei bod wedi eu siomi. Nid yw ymddiheuriadau, a dweud y gwir, yn ddigon; mae angen gweithredu.

Cyfeiriodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn ei araith at yr addewid ar ddeintyddiaeth, a hoffwn gyfeirio'n ôl at ei ymyriad cynharach ar ddeintyddiaeth ac ymateb y Prif Weinidog. Os clywais yn iawn, a bydd y Cofnod yn dangos, awgrymodd y Prif Weinidog fod rhai pobl sy'n fodlon nad ydynt ar lyfrau deintydd, sy'n fodlon nad ydynt yn cael gofal deintyddol. Mae'n bosibl bod rhai pobl gyfoethog sy'n fodlon cael y gofal preifat o safon uchel y gallant fforddio talu amdano, ond nid wyf wedi cyfarfod neb yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru sy'n dweud, 'O, nid wyf wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd, ond nid wyf yn poeni'.

Mae'n hen bryd i'r Prif Weinidog lyncu ei eiriau. Gadewch imi ailadrodd addewid Tony Blair yn 1999: ymhen dwy flynedd, byddai pawb yn gallu cael mynediad at ddeintydd dan y GIG drwy ffonio Galw Iechyd. A rhoi enghraifft benodol, dim ond 54.7 y cant o bobl Blaenau Gwent sydd wedi eu cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Efallai ei bod yn bryd i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ymddiheuro iddynt am hynny, yn hytrach nag am ryw faterion eraill, mwy esoterig. Gallwn roi rhagor o enghreifftiau—[*Torri ar draws.*] Os yw'r Gweinidog am wneud ymyriad, mae croeso iddo wneud hynny, ond mae'n gwneud imi deimlo braidd yn annifyr pan fo'n gwneud hynny ar ei eistedd. Dyna ni; gwelaf nad yw'n barod i sefyll dros ei egwyddorion. Mae'n mwman yn y siambr, ond nid yw'n barod i gael ei glywed gan bobl Cymru. Dyna ni; mae hynny'n gwbl nodweddiadol.

Hoffwn gyfeirio'n sydyn at y rhaglen 'Designed to Deliver' ar gyfer Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, rhaglen y mae'r rhai

beginning to refer to as 'Designed for Disaster'. It talks about reconfiguring hospital services, but, in fact, it will cut them. Questions have been raised about the competence of health service managers by Labour Members, and I wonder whether the Government agrees that it is time to dispose of them.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time is up.

Helen Mary Jones: May I close with one sentence?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Yes.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful, Deputy Presiding Officer. In the end, this matter goes either to the competence or to the credibility of this Government; it is reaching the point when it has neither, and it will face its judgment at the ballot box.

4.10 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: I am glad that I am on this side of the chamber, and not in the parallel universe occupied by the opposition parties. I am proud to speak in this debate to remind everyone of the excellent record that Welsh Labour has in delivering services for people in Wales. Prescriptions now cost only £3 per item and will be free next year, which will make a huge difference to hundreds of thousands of people living in Wales. Over £100 million has been allocated to fight crime and, for people in my constituency, Cardiff South and Penarth, that is really to be welcomed. Free bus travel has transformed people's lives. I spoke last week to a retired couple who now travel all over Wales, just having to pay for their bed-and-breakfast accommodation; they are now retired and are having a great life together, travelling freely around our country. My colleague, Irene, told me earlier that pensioners can also travel at half price outside Wales, to England. I was not aware of that, so that is another bonus.

ohonom sy'n byw yn yr ardal honno'n dechrau cyfeirio ati fel 'Designed for Disaster'. Mae'n sôn am ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ysbytai, ond, mewn gwirionedd, eu torri a wnaiff. Codwyd cwestiynau ynglŷn â chymhwysedd rheolwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd gan Aelodau Llafur; tybed a yw'r Llywodraeth yn cytuno ei bod yn amser cael gwared arnynt?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

Helen Mary Jones: A gaf gloi gydag un frawddeg?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cewch.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Yn y diwedd, mae a wnelo'r mater hwn â naill ai cymhwysedd neu hygyrdded y Llywodraeth hon; mae'n cyrraedd sefyllfa pan nad oes ganddi'r naill na'r llall, a bydd yn wynebu ei thynged yn y blychau pleidleisio.

Lorraine Barrett: Yr wyf yn falch fy mod yr ochr hon i'r siambr, ac nid yn y byd arall lle y mae'r gwrthbleidiau. Yr wyf yn falch o gael siarad yn y ddadl hon er mwyn atgoffa pawb o record ragorol Llafur Cymru wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl yng Nghymru. Dim ond £3 yr eitem yw cost presgripsiynau yn awr a byddant am ddim y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i gannoedd o filoedd o bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Dyrannwyd dros £100 miliwn i ymladd troseddu ac, i bobl yn fy etholaeth i, De Caerdydd a Phenarth, mae hynny yn sicr i'w groesawu. Mae teithio am ddim ar fysis wedi trawsnewid bywydau pobl. Bîm yn siarad yr wythnos diwethaf â chwpl wedi ymddeol sydd bellach yn teithio i bob cwr o Gymru, heb orfod talu am ddim heblaw llety gwely a brechwast; maent wedi ymddeol ac yn mwynhau bywyd gyda'i gilydd, yn teithio am ddim o amgylch y wlad. Dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Irene, wrthyf yn gynharach fod pensiynwyr hefyd yn gallu teithio am hanner pris y tu allan i Gymru, i Loegr. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o hynny, felly mae hynny'n fonws arall.

There was an item on Radio Wales this morning expressing concern about parents who drive their children to school and park outside the school and so on, which puts children's lives in danger. The Welsh Assembly Government has provided more than £33 million for councils to introduce Safe Routes to School and 20mph zones. Capital investment in the health service has trebled and seven new community hospitals are on their way. More than £100 million per year is being invested in our school buildings and that has happened since 2002. From this year, that will rise to £143 million a year. Government expenditure on school buildings is well ahead of the £560 million commitment. The millions just go on and on. This Government in Wales can hold its head up high on its commitment to deliver services for the people of Wales.

Mark Isherwood: Business is about getting things done, but this bunch of high-spending bureaucrats justify their existence as an end in itself. They claim that the driving force of the Labour Party is social justice, yet the gap between reality and rhetoric grows ever wider. We have heard about failed promises on free homecare, dentistry and free school breakfasts and we heard references to education. We know that there has been a magnificent increase in expenditure, as we are repeatedly told. Why, therefore, has the number of young people not in education, training or employment risen? Why is it that schools in the most deprived areas of England, measured by free school meals, outperform equivalent schools in Wales at GCSE level three times over? Why have further education colleges faced zero growth in their budgets, therefore net reductions in real terms, over three years? That will affect the most vulnerable: those with the lowest results when they leave school.

On the economy, we had 'A Winning Wales' according to which we were going to achieve 85 per cent of UK prosperity by 2005. The reality was that we barely got to 79 per cent. So, what did we do? We moved to WAVE—

Yr oedd eitem ar Radio Wales y bore yma yn mynegi pryder am rieni sy'n cludo eu plant i'r ysgol ac yn parcio ceir y tu allan i'r ysgol ac yn y blaen, gan beri bod bywydau plant mewn perygl. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi darparu dros £33 miliwn i gynghorau er mwyn cyflwyno Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol a pharthau 20 milltir yr awr. Mae'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi treblu ac mae saith ysbyty cymuned newydd ar y ffordd. Buddsoddir dros £100 miliwn y flwyddyn yn adeiladau ein hysgolion ac mae hynny wedi digwydd ers 2002. O'r flwyddyn hon ymlaen, bydd hyn yn codi i £143 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae gwariant y Llywodraeth ar adeiladau ysgolion gryn dipyn ar y blaen i'r ymrwymiad o £560 miliwn. Mae'r miliynau'n amlhau. Gall y Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru ymfalchïo yn ei hymrwymiad i ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl Cymru.

Mark Isherwood: Mae busnes yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod pethau'n cael eu gwneud, ond mae'r criw hwn o fiwrocrataid sy'n gwario'n ddychrynlyd yn cyfiawnhau eu bodolaeth fel diben ynddo'i hun. Maent yn honni mai prif nod y Blaid Lafur yw cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ond mae'r bwlch rhwng realiti a rhyethreg yn cynyddu drwy'r amser. Clywsom am addewidion a dorwyd yng nghyswllt gofal cartref am ddim, deintyddiaeth a brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion a chlywsom gyfeiriadau at addysg. Gwyddom fod cynnydd aruthrol mewn gwariant, fel y dywedir wrthym dro ar ôl tro. Pam, felly, y mae nifer y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth wedi codi? Pam mae ysgolion yn ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Lloegr, a fesurir ar sail prydau ysgol am ddim, yn perfformio deirgwaith yn well nag ysgolion cyfatebol yng Nghymru ar lefel TGAU? Pam mae colegau addysg bellach heb weld dim cynnydd yn eu cyllidebau, sef gostyngiad net mewn termau real, dros gyfnod o dair blynedd? Bydd hyn yn effeithio ar y bobl fwyaf bregus: y rhai sydd â'r canlyniadau isaf pan fônt yn gadael yr ysgol.

O ran yr economi, cawsom 'Cymru'n Ennill' a oedd yn dweud y byddem yn cyrraedd 85 y cant o ffyniant y DU erbyn 2005. Y gwir amdani oedd mai cael a chael oedd inni gyrraedd 79 y cant. Felly, beth a wnaethom?

'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. A wave away to the reality of giving Wales an economic chance, despite £1.3 billion of European money. We talk about job creation, yet the number of working-age households with no-one in employment has now risen to one in five. We talk about investment, yet when Labour came to power, Wales received the highest amount of inward investment of any nation or region in the United Kingdom, but it has now slipped to ninth position. We are now lower in terms of prosperity than any other nation or region in the United Kingdom.

The Labour Government talks about delivering care closer to people's homes, so why are we seeing the same pattern of cuts, closures and centralisation in care homes, nursing homes, community hospitals, and hostels, where the gap between that provision and what may or may not happen in the future is absolutely terrifying? Why did we hear in Audit Committee last week that 'Agenda for Change', combined with mandatory and universal so-called 'efficiency savings' regardless of the efficiency levels currently being achieved, and politically driven waiting time targets, mean that many of our hospitals are facing cuts and redundancies? They are already facing a freeze on recruitment.

On social justice, why are one in four Welsh people functionally illiterate or innumerate? We heard that one in five of Welsh working-age households have no-one in employment and one in six children in Wales live in a house where no-one has a job. One in seven people live in fuel poverty—you promised to get rid of fuel poverty by 2010, yet the number of excess winter deaths has gone up. In housing, you have cut new affordable housing by three quarters, homelessness has doubled, and there are now 100,000 people on housing waiting lists. You should hang your heads in shame.

In 1945, Winston Churchill, commenting on his defeat by Labour, said that it could not

Symud at 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Ffarwél i'r realiti o roi cyfle economaidd i Gymru, er gwaethaf £1.3 biliwn o arian Ewropeaidd. Siaradwn am greu swyddi, ond mae nifer yr aelwydydd oed gweithio lle nad oes neb mewn gwaith bellach wedi codi i un o bob pump. Siaradwn am fuddsoddi, ond pan ddaeth Llafur i rym, derbyniodd Cymru fwy o fewnfuddsoddiad na dim un genedl neu ranbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond mae wedi llithro erbyn hyn i'r nawfed safle. Mae gennym ffyniant is yn awr na dim un genedl neu ranbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn siarad am ddarparu gofal yn nes at gartrefi pobl, felly pam yr ydym yn gweld yr un patrwm o doriadau, cau a chanoli mewn cartrefi gofal, cartrefi nyrsio, ysbytai cymuned, a hosteli, lle y mae'r bwlch rhwng y ddarpariaeth honno a'r hyn a all neu na all ddigwydd yn y dyfodol yn gwbl frawychus? Pam y clywsom yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio yr wythnos diwethaf fod yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', ynghyd â'r 'arbedion effeithlonrwydd' bondigrybwyll, sy'n rhai gorfodol a chyffredinol, ni waeth pa mor effeithlon yw'r gwasanaethau ar hyn o bryd, a thargedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros sy'n seiliedig ar wleidyddiaeth, yn golygu bod llawer o'n hysbytai yn wynebu toriadau a diswyddiadau? Maent eisoes yn gorfod rhoi'r gorau i recriwtio.

O ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, pam mae un o bob pedwar unigolyn yng Nghymru yn anllythrennog neu anrhifog yn ymarferol? Clywsom fod un o bob pum aelwyd oed gweithio yng Nghymru heb neb mewn gwaith ac mae un o bob chwe phlentyn yng Nghymru yn byw mewn tŷ lle nad oes gan neb swydd. Mae un o bob saith unigolyn yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd—addawsoch y byddech yn dileu tlodi tanwydd erbyn 2010, ond mae nifer y marwolaethau gaeaf gormodol wedi codi. O ran tai, gwelwyd gostyngiad o dri chwarter yn nifer y tai newydd rhesymol eu pris, mae digartrefedd wedi dyblu, ac mae 100,000 o bobl ar restrau yn aros am dai erbyn hyn. Dylech ostwng eich pennau o gywilydd.

Ym 1945, dywedodd Winston Churchill am Lafur, a oedd newydd ei drechu, na allai'r

manage a wheelk stall. With respect to the great man, in the context of the Labour Welsh Assembly Government, that would be an insult to wheelks.

Janet Ryder: Members on the Government benches have bandied around words such as ‘misleading’, ‘confusing’ and ‘living in a parallel universe’. A number of other words come to mind, but the main one for me is ‘arrogance’—the sheer arrogance of a Government that thought that it could mislead people with election pledges, and then try to wish them away as if it had never made those pledges, or to change them. That is what you have done with many of your pledges, as Ieuan said. Consider the pledge on free school breakfasts. When you gave that pledge, it was a free breakfast for every primary school child. That original pledge included every child, and not just those in state schools, but those in private schools. You were going to give every primary school child a free breakfast.

Then, the pledge changed. When the eisteddfod came to Cardiff, during the first few days, a leaflet was distributed on the *maes* from the Government’s own stand that restated the pledge of a free school breakfast for every primary school child. Once it was picked up by the press, that leaflet mysteriously disappeared, and you could not get a copy anywhere—it was wiped out as though it had never existed. The pledge was then changed to a free breakfast for every primary school child attending a school that wants to offer it. That is a radical change. How many primary schools have taken up that offer? It is less than 10 per cent. Few pupils are benefiting from that pledge, and you are a long way from your original promise.

Another pledge was on half-price bus travel for 16 to 18-year-olds. When will that happen? Will it be before the next election? You are a year away from the next election. Will we see this as one of your pledges for the 2007 election? The pilot scheme for north Wales has not even begun yet, and that has to run for two years in Wrexham.

blaid reoli stonidin wichiaid. Gyda phob parch i’r dyn mawr, yng nghyd-destun Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru, byddai hynny’n sarhad ar wichiaid.

Janet Ryder: Mae’r Aelodau ar feinciau’r Llywodraeth wedi taflu geiriau fel ‘camarweiniol’, ‘dryslud’ a ‘byw mewn byd arall’ o gwmpas. Daw nifer o eiriau eraill i’r meddwl, ond y prif un i mi yw ‘trahauster’—trahauster noeth Llywodraeth a feddyliai y gallai gamarwain pobl gydag addewidion etholiad, ac wedyn ceisio deisyfu eu diflaniad fel pe na bai erioed wedi gwneud yr addewidion hynny, neu eu newid. Dyna beth yr ydych wedi’i wneud gyda llawer o’ch addewidion, fel y dywedodd Ieuan. Ystyriwch yr addewid ynghylch brecwast ysgol am ddim. Pan roesoch yr addewid hwnnw, brecwast am ddim ydoedd i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd. Yr oedd yr addewid gwreiddiol hwnnw’n cynnwys pob plentyn, nid dim ond y rhai sydd yn ysgolion y wladwriaeth, ond y rhai sydd mewn ysgolion preifat. Yr oeddech yn mynd i roi brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd.

Wedyn, newidiwyd yr addewid. Pan ddaeth yr eisteddfod i Gaerdydd, yn ystod y dyddiau cyntaf dosbarthwyd taflen ar y maes o stonidin y Llywodraeth ei hun yn ailgyhoeddi’r addewid o frewast ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd. Wedi i’r wasg gael gafael arni, diflannodd y daflen honno, yn rhyfedd iawn, ac nid oedd modd cael copi yn unman—yr oedd wedi’i diddymu fel pe na bai erioed wedi bodoli. Wedyn newidiwyd yr addewid i frewast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd sydd yn mynychu ysgol sy’n dymuno ei gynnig. Mae hynny’n newid sylfaenol. Sawl ysgol gynradd sydd wedi derbyn y cynnig hwnnw? Mae’n llai na 10 y cant. Ychydig o ddisgyblion sy’n cael budd o’r addewid hwnnw, ac yr ydych yn bur bell oddi wrth eich addewid gwreiddiol.

Addewid arall oedd tocynnau bws hanner pris i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 mlwydd oed. Pa bryd y bydd hynny’n digwydd? Ai cyn yr etholiad nesaf? Mae gennych flwyddyn tan yr etholiad nesaf. A welwn hyn yn un o’ch addewidion ar gyfer etholiad 2007? Nid yw’r cynllun peilot ar gyfer y gogledd hyd yn oed wedi dechrau eto, ac mae’n rhaid i hwnnw barhau

am ddwy flynedd yn Wrecsam.

Carl Sargeant: I find it impressive that you have been learning from your frontbench colleague about when these things are implemented. The half-price bus travel scheme is working in Flintshire, and in Wrexham. As a Member for north Wales, you should really be aware of that, should you not?

Carl Sargeant: Testun edmygedd i mi yw eich bod wedi bod yn dysgu pa bryd y caiff y pethau hyn eu gweithredu oddi wrth eich cyd-Aelod ar y fainc flaen. Mae'r cynllun teithio am hanner y pris ar y bws yn gweithio yn sir y Fflint, ac yn Wrecsam. Fel Aelod dros y gogledd, dylech yn wir fod yn ymwybodol o hynny, oni ddylech?

Janet Ryder: You are two years from the end of that pilot scheme, and that will not bring in half-price bus travel for every 16 to 18-year-old in Wales. I have sat in meetings with young people at which members of the Government benches have said to them, 'We're going to give you half-price travel'. They should have added, 'but not before 2007'. 'We want your vote; we want your parents' vote. We'll give you it when we can, because we actually can't afford to roll it out'—that it is what is behind this.

Janet Ryder: Mae gennych ddwy flynedd nes y bydd y cynllun peilot hwnnw wedi dod i ben, ac ni fydd hynny'n cyflwyno teithio hanner pris ar y bws i bawb sy'n 16 i 18 oed yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi eistedd mewn cyfarfodydd gyda phobl ifanc lle y mae aelodau meinciau'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud wrthynt, 'Yr ydym yn mynd i roi teithio hanner pris ichi'. Dylent fod wedi ychwanegu, 'ond nid cyn 2007'. 'Mae arnom eisiau eich pleidlais; mae arnom eisiau pleidlais eich rhieni. Fe'i rhoddwn ichi pan allwn, oherwydd ni allwn fforddio ei roi ar waith, a dweud y gwir'—dyna'r hyn sydd y tu ôl i hyn.

Another pledge was that all school buildings would be fit for purpose by 2010. At least 11 counties will come nowhere near that. The Minister disputes the Welsh Local Government Association's figures, but the WLGA says that England is spending millions more pounds on its school buildings. The Minister disputes those figures. I wonder whether she also disputes the WLGA's statement that there is a great deal of confusion as to what is classed as being fit for purpose. While we can make our school buildings structurally sound, they may well not be fit for purpose. Many of our primary schools are not fit to deliver the foundation phase.

Addewid arall oedd y byddai pob adeilad ysgol yn addas i'w ddiben erbyn 2010. Bydd o leiaf 11 sir yn methu â dod yn agos at hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwadu ffigurau Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ond dywed y gymdeithas fod Lloegr yn gwario miliynau'n fwy o bunnoedd ar ei hadeiladau ysgolion. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwadu'r ffigurau hynny. Tybed a yw hi hefyd yn gwadu datganiad CLILC fod llawer iawn o ddryswch ynghylch yr hyn y bernir ei fod yn addas i'r diben. Er y gallwn sicrhau bod ein hadeiladau ysgolion yn gadarn o ran adeiladwaith, mae'n eithaf posibl nad ydynt yn addas i'w diben. Mae llawer o'n hysgolion cynradd heb fod yn addas i gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen.

4.20 p.m.

The foundation phase is another of your lauded promises. When will it be rolled out? It has been delayed for at least two years already. It is happening in pilot schemes, but it has not been rolled out. You may wish to intervene again, Carl—you can fool some of the people some of the time, but your chickens will come home to roost in 2007

Mae'r cyfnod sylfaen yn un arall o'ch addewidion sy'n cael eu clodfodi. Pa bryd y caiff ei roi ar waith? Mae o leiaf ddwy flynedd o ohirio wedi bod yn barod. Mae'n digwydd mewn cynlluniau peilot, ond nid yw wedi'i roi ar waith. Efallai y dymunwch ymyrryd eto, Carl—gallwch dwyllo rhai o'r bobl am ryw faint o'r amser, ond daw eich

when people start to count your pledges. There is no training for teachers in the primary foundation phase, no adequate books or materials have been prepared or sent out to the staff, and no guidelines have been issued from the National Assembly. It has been delayed for two years, because the money is not there. In terms of the schools where it is being rolled out, they are struggling in physical conditions that are not suitable for running a foundation phase. The buildings are not fit for purpose, and that is yet another pledge that you will not meet.

David Melding: The Mike German award for mixed metaphors goes to Janet this afternoon; I congratulate her on that startling image. I want to return to the issue of free school breakfasts. I try never to miss breakfast, because it is an important meal that sets you up for the day. It was an eye-catching promise when the Labour Party made it during the last election, and it was at the core of the 10 promises contained in its manifesto. If a party cannot deliver on its key pledges or cannot conceive of those promises in a coherent way, it must be brought to book. I find it quite miserable that members of the Labour Party have stood up and said, 'Of course, we never meant everyone when we said "all"—we only meant about 3 per cent of the population'. I have before me the relevant quotation from the Labour manifesto, which is:

'Free school breakfasts for all school kids'.

It was discovered on an Easter egg hunt: they had lots of children running around a field finding Easter eggs with promises on. In fairness, it was good campaigning, as it caught the interest of the media. However, did anyone from the Labour Party then tell the media, 'When we say "all", we mean a certain proportion, which we now realise is 3 per cent'? The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is lucky that the chamber is circular, because if it was in the shape of a classroom she would have been sent to the naughty corner a long time ago for not doing her homework.

cywion adref i glwydo yn 2007 pan fydd pobl yn dechrau cyfrif eich addewidion. Nid oes dim hyfforddiant i athrawon yn y cyfnod sylfaen cynradd, ni chafodd dim llyfrau na deunyddiau digonol eu paratoi na'u hanfon allan i'r staff, ac ni chyhoeddwyd dim canllawiau gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fe'i gohiriwyd am ddwy flynedd, am nad yw'r arian yno. O ran yr ysgolion lle y mae'n cael ei roi ar waith, maent yn ymlafnio mewn amodau corfforol nad ydynt yn addas ar gyfer rhedeg cyfnod sylfaen. Nid yw'r adeiladau'n addas i'r diben, ac mae hynny'n addewid arall eto fyth na wnewch ei gadw.

David Melding: Aiff gwobr Mike German am gymysgu trosiadau i Janet y prynhawn yma; yr wyf yn ei llongyfarch am y ddelwedd ysgytwol honno. Hoffwn ddychwelyd at gwestiwn brecwast ysgol am ddim. Byddaf yn ceisio peidio â cholli brecwast byth, oherwydd y mae'n bryd pwysig sy'n eich paratoi ar gyfer y dydd. Yr oedd yn addewid oedd yn cipio'r sylw pan wnaethpwyd ef gan y Blaid Lafur yn ystod yr etholiad diwethaf, ac yr oedd wrth graidd y 10 addewid a geid yn ei manifesto. Os na all plaid gyflawni ei haddewidion allweddol neu os na all synio am yr addewidion hynny mewn ffordd gydlynol, rhaid ei dal i gyfrif. Mae'n resynus i mi fod aelodau o'r Blaid Lafur wedi sefyll a dweud, 'Wrth gwrs, nid oeddem yn golygu pawb pan ddywedasom "pob"—dim ond rhyw 3 y cant o'r boblogaeth a oedd gennym mewn golwg'. Mae'r dyfyniad perthnasol o fanifesto Llafur gennyf o'm blaen, sef:

Brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd.

Fe'i darganfuwyd ar helpa wyau Pasg: yr oedd ganddynt lu o blant yn rhedeg o gwmpas cae yn dod o hyd i wyau Pasg gydag addewidion arnynt. A bod yn deg, yr oedd yn ardderchog o ran ymgyrchu, gan iddo ennyn diddordeb y cyfryngau. Fodd bynnag, a ddywedodd unrhyw un o'r Blaid Lafur wrth y cyfryngau wedyn, 'Pan ddywedwn "pob", golygwn gyfran arbennig, ac yr ydym yn sylweddoli erbyn hyn mai 3 y cant ydyw'? Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau'n ffodus bod y siambr yn grwn, oherwydd pe bai ar ffurf ystafell ddothbarth byddid wedi ei hanfon i gornel y plant drwg ers tro byd am beidio â gwneud ei gwaith

cartref.

Nick Bourne: In an attempt to help the Labour Party, I will just say that there could still be some undiscovered eggs out there, one of which might say, 'These promises are not to be taken seriously'. That might be the explanation.

David Melding: That is the essential point, because all parties are now in the process of preparing manifestos for the 2007 election, and they are important documents. An effective and honest manifesto is at the heart of an accountable and trusted democratic Government. If we aspire to be a Government, we all have a duty to present a manifesto that is honestly conceived. This has been the problem: some of the promises that the Labour Party made at the last election were drawn up very quickly and without effective preparation. The Permanent Secretary offers all political parties a chance to have their main promises examined from a legal and financial point of view and validated, if they wish to go through that procedure. The opposition parties have that right, but the governing party has three or four years in the preparation of its next manifesto to look at all kinds of policy developments that it might wish to make, and to ensure that what it says could be delivered. This Government has shown that it has failed on the most basic requirement necessary for people to trust their Government.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I want to return to the word 'trust'. I would guess that what is said in the chamber today will not change anyone's vote one iota. The motion mentions the manifesto commitments upon which we were elected, and, in the time permitted, I will give what I hope people will accept as an honest reflection on the 10 manifesto commitments.

I will run through them and use the exact wording used in the document. On the promise to 'abolish all prescription charges', which, as Lorraine says, is an extremely popular manifesto pledge, the reality is that prescriptions were cut to just £3 in April, and we are on track to provide free prescriptions

Nick Bourne: Er mwyn ceisio helpu'r Blaid Lafur, y cwbl a wnaif yw dweud y gallai fod wyau o hyd heb eu darganfod, un ohonynt efallai'n dwyn y geiriau, 'Nid yw'r addewidion hyn i'w cymryd o ddfrif'. Efallai mai dyna'r esboniad.

David Melding: Hynny yw'r pwynt hanfodol, oherwydd y mae'r pleidiau i gyd bellach wrthi'n paratoi maniffestos ar gyfer etholiad 2007, ac maent yn ddogfennau pwysig. Mae maniffesto effeithiol a gonest yn ganolog mewn Llywodraeth ddemocrataidd y gellir ei dwyn i gyfrif ac ymddiried ynnddi. Os rhoddwn ein bryd ar ffurfio Llywodraeth, mae'n ddyletswydd ar ar bawb ohonom gyflwyno maniffesto sydd wedi'i lunio'n ddidwyll. Hyn fu'r broblem: yr oedd rhai o'r addewidion a wnaeth y Blaid Lafur yn yr etholiad diwethaf wedi'u llunio'n gyflym iawn a heb baratoad effeithiol. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn cynnig cyfle i bob plaid wleidyddol gael archwilio'u prif addewidion o safbwynt cyfreithiol ac ariannol a'u dilysu, os dymunant fynd drwy'r drefn honno. Mae'r hawl honno gan y gwrthbleidiau, ond mae gan y blaid lywodraethol dair neu bedair blynedd wrth baratoi ei maniffesto nesaf i edrych ar bob math o ddatblygiad polisi y gallai ddymuno eu gwneud, ac i sicrhau y gellid cyflawni'r hyn a ddywed. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi dangos ei bod wedi methu o ran y gofyniad mwyaf sylfaenol sydd yn angenrheidiol i bobl ymddiried yn eu Llywodraeth.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Hoffwn ddychwelyd at y gair 'ymddiried'. Fe dybiwn na wnaiff yr hyn a ddywedir yn y siambr heddiw newid yr un iot ar bleidlais neb. Sonia'r cynnig am yr addewidion maniffesto yr etholwyd ni arnynt, ac, yn yr amser a ganiateir, rhoddaf yr hyn y gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn ei dderbyn fel myfyrdod gonest ar y 10 addewid maniffesto.

Af drwyddynt a defnyddio'r union eiriau a ddefnyddiwyd yn y ddogfen. O ran yr addewid i 'ddiddymu pob tâl presgripsiwn', sydd, fel y dywed Lorraine, yn addewid maniffesto hynod o boblogaidd, y realiti yw bod taliadau presgripsiwn wedi eu cwtdgi i £3 yn unig yn Ebrill, ac yr ydym ar y

for all by 2007. That is fairly unambiguous, and people acknowledge that.

We also promised to

‘Create a £100 million crime fighting fund’,

and we have allocated over £120 million over the course of the second term to fund a range of good programmes, which will make a lot of difference on the ground, including work on youth offending, substance misuse, domestic abuse and safer communities.

On the promises to

‘Extend free bus travel for over 60s and disabled people—develop a scheme for half-price bus travel for 16 to 18 year olds’,

as Lorraine said, free bus travel is one of the most popular things that we have done in Wales and it is to be followed in England. It has been extended to older people. Local authorities have issued more than 530,000 free bus passes and I am pleased to say that the scheme has helped to turn around the long-term decline in bus passenger journeys. I do not think that anyone can argue with that.

A total of £3 million between 2005 and 2008 is funding 15 demonstration projects throughout Wales, testing a range of mechanisms for improving accessibility for severely disabled people to community transport. Again, we are honouring that pledge and, on the developing side, we have launched half-fare pilot schemes for 16 to 18-year-olds on buses in Bridgend and in north-east Wales, as Carl mentioned, to determine whether and how a scheme could be introduced and how much it would cost. The pledge was developed and everyone knew that it would be complicated. What we discover from those pilots will be extremely useful in putting the scheme in place.

The next one was to

trywydd iawn i roi presgripsiynau am ddim i bawb erbyn 2007. Mae hynny'n weddol ddiamwys, ac mae pobl yn cydnabod hynny.

Addewid arall gennym oedd

creu cronfa o £100 miliwn i ymladd troseddu,

ac yr ydym wedi dyrannu dros £120 miliwn dros gyfnod yr ail dymor i dalu am amrediad o raglenni da, a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr ar lawr gwlad, gan gynnwys gwaith ar droseddu ymhlith yr ifanc, camddefnyddio sylweddau, cam-drin yn y cartref a chymunedau mwy diogel.

O ran yr addewidion i

estyn teithio ar fysiau am ddim i'r rhai dros 60 oed a phobl anabl—gan ddatblygu cynllun i'r rhai 16-18 oed deithio ar fysiau am hanner pris,

fel y dywedodd Lorraine, caniatáu teithio am ddim ar y bysus yw un o'r pethau mwyaf poblogaidd yr ydym wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru ac mae Lloegr am ei ddilyn. Mae wedi'i estyn i bobl hŷn. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi cyhoeddi mwy na 530,000 o docynnau bws am ddim ac mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod y cynllun wedi helpu i wrthdroi'r dirywiad hirdymor mewn siwrneiau teithwyr bws. Nid wyf yn meddwl y gall neb ddadlau â hynny.

Mae cyfanswm o £3 miliwn rhwng 2005 a 2008 yn ariannu 15 prosiect enghreifftiol ledled Cymru, yn profi amrediad o fecanweithiau i helpu pobl ddifrifol anabl i gael mynediad at drafnidiaeth gymunedol. Eto, yr ydym yn cywiro'r addewid hwnnw ac, o ran yr hyn sy'n cael ei ddatblygu, yr ydym wedi lansio cynlluniau peilot tocynnau hanner pris i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 mlwydd oed ar fysus ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, fel y soniodd Carl, i benderfynu a fyddai modd cyflwyno cynllun, sut, a faint y byddai'n ei gostio. Datblygwyd yr addewid a gwyddai pawb y byddai'n gymhleth. Bydd yr hyn a ddarganfyddwn o'r cynlluniau peilot hynny'n eithriadol o ddefnyddiol wrth sefydlu'r cynllun.

Y nesaf oedd

'rule out Top Up fees in Welsh universities'.

gwrthod cyflwyno ffioedd atodol ym mhrifysgolion Cymru.

We have done that for the life of this Assembly. That pledge has been achieved; you cannot argue with that. Perhaps we will concentrate on the next one because, of all the—

Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny am oes y Cynulliad hwn. Cyflawnwyd yr addewid hwnnw; ni allwch ddadlau â hynny. Efallai y canolbwyntiwn ar yr un nesaf, achos, o'r holl—

Jenny Randerson: Will you give way?

Jenny Randerson: A wnewch ildio?

Sue Essex: No, I have hardly any time.

Sue Essex: Na wnaif, nid oes gennyf fawr ddim amser.

These are the words in the manifesto:

Dyma'r geiriau yn y maniffesto:

'Provide for all primary school children to have free breakfast in school'.

darparu bod pob plentyn mewn ysgolion cynradd yn cael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol.

The word is 'provide'. I have heard some idiotic things said here. Any school that wants to come and get at that—*[Interruption.]* You can guffaw and shout and make all those rather strange noises that you make over there, but there is no argument about that. It is not a compulsory scheme, and it is progressing: a further 78 schools have already committed to begin providing breakfasts from this summer term. Get real. This is what is on offer and this is how it is progressing.

'Darparu' yw'r gair. Yr wyf wedi clywed pethau gwirion yn cael eu dweud yma. Gall unrhyw ysgol sydd am gael hynny—*[Torri ar draws.]* Cewch grechwenu a gweiddi a gwneud yr holl synau od braidd a wnewch chi draw yn y fan acw, ond nid oes dim dadl ynghylch hynny. Nid cynllun gorfodol ydyw, ac mae ar gynnydd: mae 78 ysgol arall eisoes wedi ymrwymo i ddechrau darparu brecwast o dymor yr haf eleni. Ceisiwch ei gweld hi. Dyma'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig a dyma sut y mae'n symud ymlaen.

The next promise is to

Yr addewid nesaf yw

'Set up a Knowledge Bank for entrepreneurs'.

sefydlu Banc Gwybodaeth i entrepreneuriaid.

We have established a knowledge bank. The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks has a knowledge bank for high-growth businesses that is positively engaged with around 80 companies.

Yr ydym wedi sefydlu banc gwybodaeth. Mae gan y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau fanc gwybodaeth ar gyfer busnesau twf mawr sydd yn ymwneud yn bositif â rhyw 80 o gwmnïau.

On the promise to

O ran yr addewid i

'Extend the 20mph zone and Safe Routes to Schools schemes',

estyn cynllun y parthau 20mya a'r cynlluniau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol,

over 150 Safe Routes to School schemes exist and, since the scheme began in 1999 to 2000, approximately 350 schools have benefited from it.

mae dros 150 o gynlluniau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol yn bodoli, ac ers i'r cynllun ddechrau yn 1999-2000, mae tua 350 o ysgolion wedi elwa ohono.

Leanne Wood: Will you give way?

Leanne Wood: A wnewch ildio?

Sue Essex: I only have a short amount of time. It is your debate; you can speak afterwards.

Between April 2000 and March 2006, local authorities were provided with grants totalling £33 million for initiatives, including the introduction of 20 mph zones to improve road safety. To date, 221 of these 20 mph zones have been implemented.

We have been honest about the next promise, and no-one was more honest about it than Brian when he stood up to talk about it. It is the promise to scrap homecare charges for disabled people. We admitted that this was not achieved and we were extremely clear that, although we were not achieving the promise as it was set out in the manifesto, we would do our best to look at an alternative package that could achieve things for the same group of people that we wanted to achieve this for. That has been put in place and we extended the commitment to people with Alzheimer's disease, which has been greatly appreciated. This is the reality of life. If we had walked away from this and said, 'No can do, we are not touching this in any way', then yes, you could quite properly criticise us. However, we have worked with the group to see how we can take that forward.

4.30 p.m.

On enabling free access to local authority swimming pools for older people, we have invested nearly £10 million to provide free swimming in local authority pools for children and young people, and for older people aged 60 and over. Free swimming is our largest health-intervention initiative, and the first national initiative of its kind in Europe. I think that we should be very proud of that.

The last point is the promise to invest £560 million to improve school buildings, and to invest £550 million in modernising GP surgeries and hospitals. We have committed over £600 million to improve school buildings and £710 million on healthcare capital over the course of our second term.

Sue Essex: Dim ond ychydig o amser sydd gennyf. Eich dadl chi yw hi; cewch siarad wedyn.

Rhwng Ebrill 2000 a Mawrth 2006, darparwyd grantiau gwerth cyfanswm o £33 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer mentrau, gan gynnwys cyflwyno parthau 20 mya i wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd. Hyd yma, mae 221 o'r parthau 20 mya hyn wedi'u sefydlu.

Yr ydym wedi bod yn onest ynglŷn â'r addewid nesaf, ac ni fu neb yn fwy gonest yn ei gylch na Brian pan safodd ar ei draed i siarad amdano. Yr addewid ydyw i ddileu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl. Yr ydym wedi cyfaddef na chyflawnwyd hyn ac wedi dweud yn hollol glir, er nad oeddem yn cyflawni'r addewid fel y'i gwnaed yn y maniffesto, y gwnaem ein gorau i edrych ar becyn arall a allai gyflawni pethau i'r un grŵp o bobl yr oeddem am gyflawni hyn drostynt. Mae hynny wedi'i wneud ac yr ydym wedi estyn yr ymrwymiad i bobl sydd â chlefyd Alzheimer, sydd wedi'i werthfawrogi'n fawr. Dyma realiti bywyd. Pe baem wedi cefnu ar hyn a dweud, 'Amhosibl, nid ydym yn ymhel â hyn sut yn y byd', yna byddai rhwydd hyn i chi ein beirniadu. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda'r grŵp i weld sut y gallwn fwrw ati â hynny.

O ran rhoi mynediad am ddim i byllau nofio awdurdodau lleol i bobl hŷn, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi bron £10 miliwn i ddarparu nofio am ddim ym mhyllau'r awdurdodau lleol i blant a phobl ifanc, ac i bobl hŷn 60 oed a hŷn. Nofio am ddim yw ein menter fwyaf ym maes ymyrryd er mwyn iechyd, a'r fenter genedlaethol gyntaf o'i bath yn Ewrop. Yn fy marn i, dylem fod yn falch iawn o hynny.

Y pwynt olaf yw'r addewid i fuddsoddi £650 miliwn i wella adeiladau ysgolion, a buddsoddi £550 miliwn i foderneiddio meddygfeydd meddygon teulu ac ysbytai. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i roi dros £600 miliwn i wella adeiladau ysgolion a £710 miliwn ar gyfalaf gofal iechyd yn ystod ein hail dymor.

I will end by discussing some of the words that have been bandied around this afternoon. The reality is that the opposition wants to huff and puff and put out leaflets and say, 'Is it not terrible? That Labour Government is patronising, it is arrogant and does not deliver on its promises', but it will get you nowhere. The reality on the ground is very different. That is the truth, and people know the situation. They know when they have their bus pass; they know when they go for their prescriptions; they know when their child goes for a free breakfast at school; they know that those school buildings, GP surgeries and hospitals are being built. I could hardly stop myself from laughing at Ieuan's incredible words—I only laughed louder when Janet talked about the chickens coming home to roost; that was the biggest laugh this afternoon. However, with regard to the words that Ieuan used, when it comes to the election, the word 'trust' will come into consideration. Your party is for independence one day and not on another, so how can you talk about anyone having trust in you when you have that attitude? We have been honest as a Government and have met almost all of our commitments. Only one of the top 10 manifesto commitments has not been met. The public will know that and will make the appropriate judgment. They know that life has improved under Labour.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The Minister who responded to the debate said that this debate will not change a single vote in the chamber. What she forgets is that it will change the votes of those outside the chamber, because they are the people who have been let down by this Government time and again. Although that was a credible defence by the Finance Minister, she has to recognise that, out there, people have lost trust in the Labour Party, and you will pay the price in 2007.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 24.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 24.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick

Terfynaf drwy drafod rhai o'r geiriau a ddefnyddiwyd y prynhawn yma. Y gwirionedd yw bod ar y gwrthbleidiau eisiau rhusio a rhefru a chyhoeddi taflenni a dweud 'Onid yw hyn yn ofnadwy? Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn nawddoglyd, yn drahaus ac yn methu â chyflawni ei haddewidion', ond ni fyddwch ddim elwach. Mae'r realiti ar lawr gwlad yn wahanol iawn. Dyna'r gwirionedd, ac fe w'yr pobl beth yw'r sefyllfa. Maent yn gwybod pan fyddant yn cael eu tocynnau bws; maent yn gwybod pan ânt i gael eu presgripsiwn; maent yn gwybod pan fydd eu plentyn yn mynd i gael brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol; maent yn gwybod bod yr ysgolion, y meddygfeydd a'r ysbytai hynny'n cael eu codi. Prin y gallwn ymatal rhag chwerthin o glywed geiriau anhygoel Ieuan—a chwerthin yn uwch pan soniodd Janet am y cywion yn dod adref i glwydo; hynny a barodd imi chwerthin fwyaf y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, yng nghydestun y geiriau a ddefnyddiodd Ieuan, pan ddaw'r etholiad, bydd y gair 'ymddiried' yn cael ei ystyried. Mae eich plaid o blaid annibyniaeth un diwrnod a heb fod drosto dro arall, felly sut y gallwch siarad am unrhyw un yn ymddiried yn och, a'r agwedd honno gennych? Yr ydym wedi bod yn onest fel Llywodraeth ac yr ydym wedi cyflawni bron pob un o'n hymrwymiaidau. Dim ond un o'r 10 prif ymrwymiad yn y manifesto sydd heb ei gyflawni. Bydd y cyhoedd yn gwybod hynny ac yn barnu'n briodol. Gwyddant fod bywyd wedi gwella dan Lafur.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dywedodd y Gweinidog a ymatebodd i'r ddadl na fydd y ddadl hon yn newid yr un bleidlais yn y siambr. Yr hyn y mae hi'n ei anghofio yw y bydd yn newid pleidleisiau'r rhai sydd y tu allan i'r siambr, gan mai hwy yw'r bobl a siomwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon dro ar ôl tro. Er bod hynny'n amddiffyniad credadwy gan y Gweinidog Cyllid, rhaid iddi gydnabod bod pobl y tu allan wedi colli ymddiriedaeth yn y Blaid Lafur, a byddwch yn talu'r pris yn 2007.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Butler, Rosemary

Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2999): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2999): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

expresses its deep concern at the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to honour the manifesto commitments and key pledges on which it was elected.

yn mynegi ei bryder difrifol ynghylch methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i anrhydeddu ymrwymadau ac addewidion allweddol y manifesto a oedd yn sail ar gyfer ei hethol.

Cynnig (NDM2999): O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.

Motion (NDM2999): For 25, Abstain 0, Against 27.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne

Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion defeated.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.34 p.m.
The meeting ended at 4.34 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)

Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)