



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 7 Rhagfyr 2005**  
**Wednesday, 7 December 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister.....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.....	18
Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement.....	33
Datganiad am Drafodaethau ar y Gyllideb Ewropeaidd/Goblygiadau i Gymru Statement on the European Budget Discussions/Implications for Wales.....	35
Sefydlu'r Ymchwiliad Cyhoeddus, Penodi Cadeirydd yr Ymchwiliad, Dirprwyo'r Swyddogaethau sy'n Weddill o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog, a Nodi Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar yr Ymchwiliad i'r Achosion E.coli yng Nghymru Establishment of the Public Inquiry, Appointment of the Chair of the Inquiry, Delegation of the Remaining Functions under the Inquiries Act 2005 to the First Minister, and Noting the Report of the Committee on the Inquiry into the E.coli Outbreaks in Wales.....	47
Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2005 Delegation of Functions under the National Assembly for Wales (Transfer of Functions) Order 2005 .....	59
Y Gyllideb Derfynol The Final Budget.....	60
Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion.....	86
Y Gyllideb Derfynol: Parhad The Final Budget: Continued .....	87
Dadl Fer: Cam-drin yn y Cartref—Hunllef y Nadolig Short Debate: Domestic Abuse—The Nightmare for Christmas .....	97

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

### **Effaith Adroddiad Lyons The Effect of the Lyons Review**

**Q1 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the effect of the Lyons review on local government in Wales? OAQ0548(LGP)

**Q6 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Will the Minister make a statement on the implications of the Lyons review for local government in Wales? OAQ0520(LGP)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Sir Michael Lyons is not due to issue his report until the end of 2006. It is too early to predict the outcome of his review, but we are in close contact with his team.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, the Lyons review is meant to be about the redistribution of public sector jobs to less affluent areas, but many workers in the public sector in Wales are concerned about the fact that hundreds of jobs could be lost in the near future. We could be set to lose 250 Ministry of Defence posts in Llangennech, 60 jobs are moving from HM Revenue and Customs in Pontypridd, and 50 jobs are going in Cardiff with the closure of the Government Export Credit Guarantees Department. This conflicts with the stated aims of Lyons and of your Government, as well as with the anti-poverty policies of many local authorities. Do you think that your Government could and should be doing more to stop these job losses?

**Sue Essex:** There are two Lyons reviews, Leanne, and you are referring to the one that took place for the Chancellor of the Exchequer, on the distribution of jobs out from the centre. We interpreted your reference to the Lyons review to be about the current Lyons review, which is about local

**C1 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith adroddiad Lyons ar lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? OAQ0548(LGP)

**C6 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am oblygiadau adolygiad Lyons i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? OAQ0520(LGP)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Ni ddisgwylir i Syr Michael Lyons gyhoeddi ei adroddiad tan ddiwedd 2006. Mae'n rhy gynnar i rag-weld canlyniad ei adolygiad, ond yr ydym mewn cysylltiad agos â'i dîm.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, bwriad adolygiad Lyons yw ymdrin ag ail-ddosbarthu swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus i ardaloedd llai cyfoethog, ond mae nifer o weithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r ffaith y gallai cannoedd o swyddi gael eu colli yn y dyfodol agos. Gallem golli 250 o swyddi'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn Llangennech, mae 60 o swyddi yn symud o Gyllid a Thollau EM ym Mhontypridd, ac mae 50 o swyddi yn cael eu colli yng Nghaerdydd yn sgîl cau Adran Gwarantau Credyd Allforion y Llywodraeth. Mae hyn yn groes i nodau penodedig Lyons a'ch Llywodraeth chi, yn ogystal â pholisïau atal tlodi gan nifer o awdurdodau lleol. A ydych o'r farn y gallai ac y dylai eich Llywodraeth fod yn gwneud mwy i rwystro'r colli swyddi hyn?

**Sue Essex:** Mae yna ddau adolygiad Lyons, Leanne, ac yr ydych yn cyfeirio at yr un a wnaed ar gyfer Canghellor y Trysorlys ar ddosbarthu swyddi o'r canol. Yr oeddem yn dehongli eich cyfeiriad at adolygiad Lyons fel cyfeiriad at yr adolygiad Lyons cyfredol, sy'n ymdrin â gwasanaethau llywodraeth

government services, which is why we grouped the two questions together.

In terms of the original review, there are changes in public sector jobs, but many of the developments in Newport in recent years have been part of the relocation outwards. Therefore, you have to distinguish between jobs that come from changes in the public sector estate as opposed to the decentralisation of jobs. [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Leanne, you know that we do not allow people to shout additional parts of a question during the Minister's reply.

**Sue Essex:** There will be changes throughout the public sector, and we acknowledge that in terms of 'Making the Connections'. The new Lyons review is currently the important one for local government, and maybe Mike's supplementary question will be on that.

**Michael German:** The current Lyons review and the Beecham review are interconnected, because one looks at the services to be provided, and the other at the funding for local government. One problem that you have identified is the way in which local authorities work far closer together, collaborating more. Will either the Lyons or the Beecham review look at the funding implications of collaboration between local authorities as part of its remit?

**Sue Essex:** A key distinction between Lyons and Beecham is that Lyons is about local government, while our review—and I am very pleased that we have tasked Jeremy Beecham with it—is about the whole public service sector. It is important to make that distinction. I am sure that Sir Jeremy and his team will be looking at that. As you know, some pump-priming funding is going out as part of 'Making the Connections'. I will be seeing him tomorrow night, so I will be able to ask him personally.

**Michael German:** The consequence of the Beecham review of that sort of area will have

leol, a dyna pam y gosodwyd y ddaugwestiwn gyda'i gilydd.

O ran yr adolygiad gwreiddiol, mae yna newidiadau mewn swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus, ond mae nifer o'r datblygiadau yng Nghasnewydd yn y blynnyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn rhan o'r broses symud tuag allan. Felly, mae'n rhaid ichi wahaniaethu rhwng swyddi sy'n deillio o newidiadau yn yr ystâd sector cyhoeddus a'r rheini sy'n deillio o ddatganoli swyddi. [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Leanne, gwyddoch na chaniateir i bobl weiddi rhannau ychwanegol o gwestiwn yn ystod ymateb y Gweinidog.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd newidiadau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus, ac yr ydym yn cydnabod hynny o ran 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Adolygiad newydd Lyons yw'r un pwysig i lywodraeth leol ar hyn o bryd, ac efallai y bydd cwestiwn atodol Mike yn ymwneud â hynny.

**Michael German:** Mae adolygiad presennol Lyons ac adolygiad Beecham yn rhyng-gysylltiedig, gan fod y naill yn edrych ar y gwasanaethau i'w darparu, a'r llall ar y cyllid ar gyfer lywodraeth leol. Un broblem a nodwyd gennych yw'r ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio lawer yn agosach, ac yn cydweithredu mwy. A fydd naill ai adolygiad Lyons neu adolygiad Beecham yn ystyried y goblygiadau cyllido yn sgil cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol fel rhan o'i gylch gwaith?

**Sue Essex:** Un o'r prif wahaniaethau rhwng Lyons a Beecham yw bod Lyons yn ymdrin â lywodraeth leol, ond mae ein hadolygiad ni—ac yr wyf yn falch iawn ein bod wedi rhoi'r dasg honno i Jeremy Beecham—yn ymdrin â'r sector gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gyfan. Mae'n bwysig gwahaniaethu felly. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Syr Jeremy a'i dîm yn edrych ar hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, mae rhywfaint o arian sefydlu yn cael ei ddarparu fel rhan o 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Byddaf yn ei weld nos yfory, felly gallaf ofyn iddo'n bersonol.

**Michael German:** Bydd canlyniad adolygiad Beecham o'r math hwnnw o faes yn arwain at

an implication for the Lyons review of local government funding. If you are to have collaboration, how are these funds to be found and then directed? A key concern that many people have in local government and wider, across Wales, is that this is a precursor to further local government reorganisation in Wales. Could you allay those fears, and put them to rest?

**Sue Essex:** Taking your first point, which is interesting, I think that our experience of the Beecham review, if it goes as well as is hoped, will be useful for Sir Michael Lyons. Although he will still be looking at local government, some of the issues, perhaps around the pooling of resources across the public sector, may be appropriate for him.

In terms of local government reorganisation, Mike, I do not know how many times you have raised this in the Chamber. I never raise the issue; you do all the time. I do not know whether that means that the Liberal Democrats want local government reorganisation or not. If that is what you want, we would all like to know that, I think. I do not keep talking about local government reorganisation, but I do talk about the job that Sir Jeremy has to do. Without wishing to tie his hands in doing that job, it is about effective service delivery, and I suspect that he will not agonise over structures for too long.

**William Graham:** In his report, ‘Well Placed to Deliver?’, Sir Michael Lyons suggested that 37 per cent of staff moved with the unit, and 33 per cent were recruited locally. I acknowledge the benefit of that to the Newport area. He also pointed out that 75 per cent of those who moved were, in fact, of administrative assistant and administrative officer grades. Few of the staff on higher grades have moved. What can you do about this to make sure that it is a true representation of a complete department?

**Sue Essex:** That is often the pattern, to be honest, William. Those at higher grades and their families will have put roots down. Many

oblygiad ar gyfer adolygiad Lyons o gyllid llywodraeth leol. Os oes cydweithio i ddigwydd, sut y gellir dod o hyd i'r arian hwn ac yna'i gyfeirio? Un o brif bryderon nifer o bobl mewn llywodraeth leol ac yn ehangach, ar draws Cymru, yw bod hyn yn rhagflaenu proses bellach o ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. A allwch liniaru'r pryderon hynny, a thawelu meddyliau?

**Sue Essex:** O ran eich pwynt cyntaf, sy'n ddiddorol, credaf y bydd ein profiad o adolygiad Beecham, os aiff cystal ag y gobeithir, yn ddefnyddiol i Syr Michael Lyons. Er y bydd yn dal i edrych ar lywodraeth leol, gall thai o'r materion, efallai'r rhai sy'n gysylltiedig â chyfuno adnoddau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus, fod yn briodol iddo.

O ran ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol, Mike, ni wn sawl gwaith yr ydych wedi codi'r pwynt hwn yn y Siambra. Ni fyddaf fi byth yn codi'r mater; chi sy'n gwneud hynny drwy'r amser. Ni wn a yw hynny'n golygu bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am weld ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol ai peidio. Os dyna yr ydych am ei weld, byddem i gyd yn hoffi gwybod hynny, mi gredaf. Nid wyf yn siarad yn ddi-baid am ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol, ond yr wyf yn sôn am y gwaith sydd gan Syr Jeremy i'w wneud. Heb ddymuno clymu ei ddwylo wrth wneud y gwaith hwnnw, mae'n golygu darparu gwasanaethau'n effeithiol, a thybiaf na fydd yn poeni am strwythurau yn rhy hir.

**William Graham:** Yn ei adroddiad ‘Well Placed to Deliver?’, awgrymodd Syr Michael Lyons bod 37 y cant o staff wedi symud gyda'r uned, a bod 33 y cant wedi eu recriwtio'n lleol. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod ardal Casnewydd wedi elwa yn sgîl hyn. Dywedodd hefyd fod 75 y cant o'r rhai a symudodd yn weithwyr gweinyddol cynorthwyl a swyddogion gweinyddol mewn gwirionedd. Ychydig iawn o'r staff ar raddau uwch sydd wedi symud. Beth y gallwch ei wneud am â hyn i sicrhau ei fod yn cynrychioli'r adran gyfan?

**Sue Essex:** Dyna'r patrwm yn aml, a bod yn onest, William. Bydd pobl ar raddau uwch a'u teuluoedd wedi bwrw gwreiddiau.

years ago, I was involved in the relocation of staff to Cardiff, and I know that we were worried about that initially. One thing that we can do—and we are doing this well in Wales—is make areas attractive places to move to. I was in north Wales last week, and I was struck by the number of people who saw the opportunity to come in and settle here, particularly those with young families who have yet to put down roots. As we know, older children are reluctant to move. That is one of the key things that we can do in Wales, and we are doing that well.

Flynnyddoedd yn ôl, yr oeddwyn yn gysylltiedig â phroses symud staff i Gaerdydd, ac yr oeddem yn pryderu am hynny ar y dechrau. Un peth y gallwn ei wneud—ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny'n dda yng Nghymru—yw gwneud ardaloedd yn lleoedd deniadol i symud iddynt. Yr oeddwyn yng ngogledd Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, a chefais fy synnu gan nifer y bobl sydd wedi achub ar y cyfle i symud ac ymsefydlu yma, yn enwedig y rheini sydd â theuluoedd ifanc nad ydynt wedi bwrw gwreiddiau eto. Fel y gwyddom, mae plant hŷn yn amharod i symud. Dyna un o'r prif bethau y gallwn eu gwneud yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny'n dda.

### Praecept yr Heddlu Police Precept

**C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am braecept yr heddlu? OAQ0549(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** In 2005-06, the police precept comprised 29 per cent of the £531 million aggregated police budget in Wales. The police authority element of an average band D council tax was £138 in 2005-06—3.8 per cent higher than in the previous year.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel yr ydych yn ei ddweud, mae'r praecept yn ffurfio canran uchel, bellach, o gyllid yr heddlu. Ers 1999, mae'r baich ar y praecept wedi cynyddu. Mae grant cynnal refeniw, y cymhorthdal ar gyfer y dreth, wedi cynyddu o 34 y cant, ac mae cymhorthdal yr heddlu wedi cynyddu o 16 y cant, ond mae'r praecept ei hunan wedi codi 82 y cant. Ddoe, gwnaethom drafod ad-drefnu posibl yr heddlu, ac yr oedd gofidion y byddai costau ychwanegol. A fydd y rhain hefyd yn cael eu hychwanegu at y praecept? Sut y byddech yn argyhoeddi'r cyhoedd i dalu mwy? A allwch fod yn sicr bydd y cyhoedd yn cael gwell gwasanaeth gan yr heddlu am yr arian hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** I agree with your first point. You know that I have expressed concern that the precept cannot just be added to again and again. There is variation, as we know, in precept levels across Wales. Last year, if you recall, I had all the chief constables in and

**Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the police precept? OAQ0549(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Yn 2005-06, roedd praecept yr heddlu yn cynnwys 29 y cant o gyfanswm cyllideb yr heddlu yng Nghymru, sef £531 miliwn. Roedd elfen yr awdurdod heddlu mewn treth gyngor band D arferol yn £138 yn 2005-06—3.8 y cant yn uwch na'r flwyddyn flaenorol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** These days, as you say, the precept forms a high percentage of police funding. Since 1999, the burden on the precept has increased. The revenue support grant, the rates support, has increased by 34 per cent, and the police support has increased by 16 per cent, but the precept itself has increased by 82 per cent. Yesterday, we discussed the possible reorganisation of police forces, and there was concern that that would mean additional costs. Will these also be added to the precept? How will you persuade the public to pay more? Can you be sure that the public will get a better service by the police for that money?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf â'ch pwynt cyntaf. Gwyddoch fy mod wedi mynegi fy mhryder na ellir ychwanegu at y praecept dro ar ôl tro. Mae amrywiad, fel y gwyddom, yn lefelau'r praecept ar draws Cymru. Y llynedd, os cofiwch, cefais gyfarfod â phob un o'r prif

talked about how I wanted the precept to be kept to a reasonable level, so as not to add too much to the council tax burden. I think that the 3.8 per cent attests to that discussion. I agree with you wholeheartedly on that, and I would send out the message this year that precepts must be kept to a minimum.

In terms of your second point about the possible reorganisation, I think that the points raised around the funding of the police are fair. You would have heard Edwina Hart say yesterday that, if there is reorganisation, we would like the whole issue of how the police are funded to be looked at. I would accord with that. The system is hellishly complicated, and not transparent for the public. That would perhaps reassure people more than the present system, where there are great hikes in the precepts and question marks over those hikes.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** On that second point, yesterday, I think that the Minister said that she would resist any of these costs being passed on to the police precept or taken up by the Welsh Assembly Government. Has the Welsh Assembly Government, either the Cabinet or the First Minister, had any discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales or the Home Secretary about this vital issue?

2.10 p.m.

Given that the decision seems to have already been taken, and even if it has not, and is about to be taken, it is important that we get the message across that we do not want these costs transferred to Wales. They are Home Office costs.

**Sue Essex:** I cannot give you a 100 per cent accurate answer at the moment, as my memory does not allow that. However, I am pretty sure that there have been communications, certainly with the Home Secretary and, I think, with the Secretary of State. I will get back to you on that.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for that. To add to my point, the expected costs range from

gwnstabliaid a soniais wrthynt fy mod am gadw'r praecept ar lefel resymol, fel na fyddai'r baich treth gyngor yn codi'n ormodol. Credaf fod y 3.8 y cant yn dystiolaeth o'r drafodaeth honno. Cytunaf â chi'n llwyr ar y mater hwnnw, a byddwn yn cyfleu'r neges eleni fod yn rhaid cadw praeceptau mor isel â phosibl.

O ran eich ail bwynt am yr ad-drefnu posibl, credaf fod y pwyntiau a godwyd ynglŷn ag ariannu'r heddlu yn deg. Mae'n siŵr ichi glywed Edwina Hart yn sôn ddoe y byddem, pe bai ad-drefnu, yn hoffi gweld holl fater ariannu'r heddlu yn cael ei ystyried. Cytunaf â hynny. Mae'r system yn arswydus o gymhleth, ac nid yw'n glir i'r cyhoedd. Efallai y byddai hynny'n rhoi mwy o sicrwydd i bobl na'r system bresennol, lle mae cynnydd mawr yn y praeceptau a marciau cwestiwn am y cynnydd hwnnw.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ar yr ail bwynt, credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi dweud ddoe y byddai'n gwrthwynebu trosglwyddo unrhyw rai o'r costau hyn i braecept yr heddlu neu wneud Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyfrifol amdanynt. A yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, naill ai'r Cabinet neu'r Prif Weinidog, wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru neu'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar y mater hollbwysig hwn?

O gofio ei bod yn ymddangos bod y penderfyniad eisoes wedi'i wneud, a hyd yn oed os nad ydyw ac os yw ar fin cael ei wneud, mae'n bwysig inni gyfleu'r neges nad ydym am weld trosglwyddo'r costau hyn i Gymru. Costau'r Swyddfa Gartref ydynt.

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf roi ateb holol gywir ichi ar hyn o bryd, gan nad yw fy nghof yn caniatâu imi wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn weddol siŵr fod cyfathrebu wedi digwydd, yn bendant gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ac, mi gredaf, gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Deuaf yn ôl atoch ar hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. I ychwanegu at fy mhwynt, mae'r

£50 million to £60 million, so we are not talking about a small amount. Admittedly, some of those are set-up costs, but some are ongoing. As the Minister has undertaken to respond, I happily accept her offer. I would be grateful if other Members could be copied in on the answer.

**Sue Essex:** Okay. It is sensible for us to agree that, whatever view people take on the reconfiguration of the police forces, we want the nature of police funding to change. In terms of the set-up costs, that cannot be passed on to the precept level. When you are talking about that level of spend, it cannot be done.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr hyn sy'n ein poeni ni, Weinidog, i ddilyn yr un trywydd, yw'r ffaith nad yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi gwrando ar lais pobl Cymru mewn perthynas ag ad-drefnu'r heddlu. Y mae wedi'i gwneud yn berffaith glir ei fod yn disgwyl i gost yr ad-drefnu gael ei dalu o'r praecept. Bu inni fethu â'i argyhoeddi ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr oedd yn ymgynghori ar y pwnc hwn, felly pa mor ffyddio ydych chi y gallwch ei berswadio i roi sicrwydd y bydd y costau'n cael eu talu gan y Swyddfa Gartref ac nid gan drethdalwyr Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** I do not think that he has said that. I may be wrong, but I thought that he talked about restructuring being revenue-neutral over time. That includes an acceptance that there will be some up-front costs, but also that police forces—and I am pretty convinced on this—are not exempt from the kind of efficiencies that may come from the 'Making the Connections' agenda and from reconfiguration, if that took place.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What I am really asking, Minister, is what faith can you have in a Home Secretary who disregards the view of the people of Wales, who does not consult with the Assembly over the timetable for reconfiguration, and who has already said that he wants to see one police force for Wales, even though the people of Wales have not had the opportunity to examine all the options? I am not as confident as you are about how he will pay these costs, and how

costau a ddisgwylir yn amrywio o £50 miliwn i £60 miliwn, felly, nid am swm bychan yr ydym yn sôn. Yn ddiua, costau sefydlu yw rhai o'r rhain, ond mae rhai yn gostau parhaus. Gan fod y Gweinidog wedi addo ymateb, derbyniaf ei chynnig yn barod iawn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Aelodau eraill gael copi o'r ateb.

**Sue Essex:** Iawn. Mae'n synhwyrol inni gytuno, beth bynnag yw safwynt pobl am ail-gyflunio'r heddluoedd, ein bod am weld newid y ffordd y caiff heddluoedd eu hariannu. O ran costau sefydlu, ni ellir eu trosglwyddo i lefel y praecept. Pan soniwch am y lefel honno o wariant, ni ellir gwneud hynny.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What worries us, Minister, to follow the same line of questioning, is the fact that the Home Secretary has not listened to the voice of the people of Wales in relation to police reconfiguration. He has made it absolutely clear that he expects the cost of reconfiguration to be met from the precept. We failed to convince him as to how he consulted on this issue, so how confident are you that you can persuade him to guarantee that the costs will be met by the Home Office, not by Welsh taxpayers?

**Sue Essex:** Ni chredaf iddo ddweud hynny. Efallai fy mod yn anghywir, ond credaf iddo sôn y byddai ad-drefnu yn niwtral o ran refeniw dros gyfnod. Mae hynny'n cynnwys cydnabod y bydd rhai costau cyn cychwyn, ond hefyd nad yw heddluoedd—ac yr wyf yn lled argyhoeddedig am hyn—yn cael eu heithrio o'r math o effeithlonrwydd a all ddeillio o'r agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' a'r broses ail-gyflunio, pe bai hynny'n digwydd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ofyn mewn gwirionedd, Weinidog, yw faint o ffydd a all fod gennych mewn Ysgrifennydd Cartref sy'n diystyr barn pobl Cymru, sy'n methu ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r amserlen ail-gyflunio, ac sydd eisoes wedi dweud ei fod am weld un heddlu ar gyfer Cymru, er nad yw pobl Cymru wedi cael y cyfre i archwilio'r holl ddewisiadau? Nid wyf mor hyderus â chi ynglŷn â'r ffordd y bydd ef yn talu'r costau hyn, a sut y caint eu

they will be passed on. Would it not be helpful if, in the light of the comments made by your colleague, Edwina Hart, yesterday and the comments that you have made today—which agree with everything that we have said—a strong letter were sent to the Home Secretary saying that, should he proceed with reconfiguration, costs must be paid from his budget?

**Sue Essex:** As I said in answer to Nick, I will look at the correspondence. We have made that clear; if not, I am making it clear now. The point about passing costs onto the precept is that, if there is to be a reorganisation, it provides a perfect opportunity to look again at funding issues. What he has said about reconfiguration being revenue-neutral over a period of time indicates that he expects there to be some up-front costs, but that there are also savings to be made. It is for him to balance that and to make that financial adjustment.

trosglwyddo. Yng ngoleuni'r sylwadau a wnaed ddoe gan eich cyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart, a'r sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u gwneud heddiw—sy'n cytuno â phopeth yr ydym wedi'i ddweud—oni fyddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai llythyr cryf yn cael ei anfon at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn dweud, pe bai'n bwrw ymlaen ag ail-gyflunio, y byddai'n rhaid talu'r costau o'i gyllideb ef?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Nick, byddaf yn edrych ar yr ohebiaeth. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny'n glir; ac os nad ydym, yr wyf yn gwneud hynny yn awr. Y pwynt ynglŷn â throsglwyddo costau i'r praecept yw ei fod, os bydd ad-drefnu, yn gyfle perffaith i edrych eto ar faterion ariannu. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd y byddai ail-gyflunio yn niwtral o ran refeniw dros gyfnod yn dangos ei fod yn disgwyl rhai costau cyn cychwyn, ond y gellid gwneud arbedion hefyd. Ei gyfrifoldeb ef yw sicrhau cydbwysedd a gwneud yr addasiad ariannol hwnnw.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Ngheredigion Improving Public Services in Ceredigion**

**C3 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Ngheredigion? OAQ0542(LGP)

**Q3 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on how Welsh Assembly Government policies are improving public services in Ceredigion? OAQ0542(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** There is a whole range of policies, but I will not go through them in detail or we will be here for a long time. Our policies are backed up with financial support. The revenue support grant for Ceredigion for the coming year will be £90 million.

**Sue Essex:** Mae amrywiaeth eang o bolisiau ar waith, ond nid wyf yn bwriadu mynd drwyddyt yn fanwl neu fe fyddwn yma am amser maith. Caiff ein polisiau eu hategu gan gymorth ariannol. Y grant cymorth refeniw ar gyfer Ceredigion am y flwyddyn i ddod fydd £90 miliwn.

**Elin Jones:** Yr ydych yn gwybod fy mod yn gefnogol i benderfyniad eich Llywodraeth i leoli swyddfa ranbarthol yn Aberystwyth. A ydych yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd y bydd yr adeilad newydd yno yn cydymffurfio ag arferion gorau o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni a chynaliadwyedd, a'r defnydd o gontractwyr a deunyddiau lleol?

**Elin Jones:** You will know that I support your Government's decision to locate a regional office in Aberystwyth. Are you able to give an assurance that the new building to be located there will comply with best practice in terms of energy efficiency and sustainability, and the use of local contractors and materials?

**Sue Essex:** As you know, I am very keen on that. I hope that all our new buildings achieve the Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method 'excellent' rating. We have a design

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i hynny ddigwydd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd pob un o'n hadeiladau newydd yn ennill statws 'rhagorol' yn Null Asesiad Amgylcheddol y Sefydliad Ymchwil

champion supporting us, as the person is called, supporting us in the early stages of the work in Llandudno and Merthyr. We have learned some things from the Merthyr building. I, like you, would want this to be an exemplar building for sustainability and design, and I hope that it will be a credit to the fine town of Aberystwyth.

**Lisa Francis:** The policy of relocating Assembly staff to Aberystwyth should bring 500 new jobs to the area. You will know, from your visits there, that the town is badly off for parking facilities, and 80 parking spaces have been lost in the last two years. The introduction of an hourly service on the Cambrian railway line would reduce traffic congestion and parking problems for many new commuters. Do you agree that the introduction of passing loops on this line in the near future would enhance public services in Ceredigion and are a necessary part of the infrastructure required, as your Government continues to expand job opportunities in Aberystwyth?

**Sue Essex:** I commend you, Lisa, on linking the question about the Aberystwyth office with one on the Dyfi junction passing loop. As someone who has always been enthusiastic about the development of the railways, I would be keen to play my part if it becomes physically possible to provide that loop. I know that there is a major blockage at present to getting the frequency of service that you mentioned.

#### **Y Dreth Gyngor yng Nghwm Aman Uchaf Council Tax in the Upper Amman Valley**

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gydag Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio ynglŷn â'r dreth gyngor yng nghwm Aman uchaf? OAQ0511(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I have had no discussions with the Valuation Office Agency on this issue, but I know that my officials have taken up with the agency the points that you made in a letter to me.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r swyddfa brisio rhanbarthol. Pan fydd y swyddfa yn mynd ati

Adeiladu. Mae hyrwyddwr cynllunio, fel y'i gelwir, yn ein cefnogi yng nghamau cyntaf y gwaith yn Llandudno a Merthyr. Yr ydym wedi dysgu rhai pethau o'r adeilad ym Merthyr. Byddwn i, fel chithau, am i hwn fod yn batrwm o adeilad mewn cynaliadwyedd a dylunio, a gobeithio y bydd yn glod i dref braf Aberystwyth.

**Lisa Francis:** Dylai'r polisi o symud staff y Cynulliad i Aberystwyth ddod â 500 o swyddi newydd i'r ardal. Fe wyddoch, ar ôl eich ymweliadau â'r dref, fod y cyfleusterau parcio yn wael yno, a cholwyd 80 o leoedd parcio yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Byddai cyflwyno gwasanaeth bob awr ar reilffordd Cambrian yn lleihau tagfeydd traffig a phroblemau parcio i nifer o gymudwyr newydd. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai darparu dolenni pasio ar y rheilffordd hon yn y dyfodol agos yn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Ngheredigion, a'u bod yn rhan hanfodol o'r seilwaith angenrheidiol, wrth i'ch Llywodraeth barhau i ehangu cyfleoedd swyddi yn Aberystwyth?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn eich cymeradwyo, Lisa, am gysylltu cwestiwn swyddfa Aberystwyth â chwestiwn am ddolen basio yng Nghyffordd Dyfi. Fel rhywun sy'n frwdfrydig erioed ynghylch datblygu'r rheilffyrrdd, byddwn yn awyddus i wneud fy rhan os bydd darparu'r ddolen honno yn bosibl o gwbl. Gwn fod rhwystr mawr ar hyn o bryd rhag cael y gwasanaeth mynchyd yr oeddech yn sôn amdano.

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Valuation Office Agency with regard to council tax in the upper Amman valley? OAQ0511(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio am y mater hwn, ond gwn fod fy swyddogion wedi trafod y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych mewn llythyr ataf gyda'r asiantaeth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I have had discussions with the area valuation office. When the office sets about rebanding houses

i ailfandio tai yn ôl eu gwerth, mae'n ddiddorol nodi nad yw'n ystyried yr amgylchiadau y mae rhai perchnogion tai ynddynt. Yn nyffryn Aman uchaf, mae problem gyda glo brig, gan fod hyn yn cael effaith andwyol ar ansawdd bywyd pobl ac ar werth eu tai. A ddylai rhywun, yn ystod yr ailfandio, fod wedi esbonio i'r bobl a gafodd ostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor am y rheswm a roddais y byddai'r elfen honno yn cael ei hystyried ar ôl i'r ailfandio ddigwydd, yn hytrach na gadael iddynt weld eu tai yn codi dau neu dri band heb ddeall y broses a fyddai'n dilyn?

according to value, it is interesting to note that it does not take into account the circumstances in which some homeowners find themselves. In the upper Amman valley, there is a problem with opencast mining, as this has a detrimental effect on people's quality of life and on the value of their houses. During the rebanding process, should not someone have explained to those who had a reduction in their council tax bills, for the reason that I have given, that their circumstances would be considered after the rebanding process, rather than just letting them see their houses move up two or three bands without understanding the process that would follow?

**Sue Essex:** You will be aware of the answer that the valuation office is giving at the moment, and I think that it is a reasonable answer. Right across Wales, with the upper Amman valley being no exception, the office has tried to put houses in bands according to market value, and it gets the sales data from that. The argument used by the VOA is that environmental aspects are reflected in the market value of properties. I think that that is probably true. I am not a valuer, but, from my experience, I know that environmental issues are as much a part of the determination of house values as the houses themselves. I know that appeals are outstanding in relation to this area, and I think that they will be resolved soon. People will hear about the circumstances of taking this appeal to the VOA, and, if they are not happy, they can go to a valuation tribunal.

If, between now and the next revaluation, people feel that the market value of their homes has been affected and that the value is not right, they can go back to the VOA to ask for the value to be reconsidered. I think that that is a further belt-and-braces reassurance for your constituents.

**Sue Essex:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ateb y mae'r swyddfa brisio yn ei roi ar hyn o bryd, a chredaf ei fod yn ateb rhesymol. Ar draws Cymru, ac nid yw cwm Aman uchaf yn eithriad, mae'r swyddfa wedi ceisio rhoi tai mewn bandiau yn unol â'u gwerth ar y farchnad, ac mae'n cael y data gwerthiannau o hynny. Dadl Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio yw y caiff agweddau amgylcheddol eu hystyried yng ngwerth eiddo ar y farchnad. Credaf fod hynny'n siŵr o fod yn wir. Nid wyf yn brisiwr, ond yn fy mhrofiad i gwn fod materion amgylcheddol yn gymaint rhan o benderfynu gwerth tai ag yw'r tai eu hunain. Gwn fod apeliadau heb eu penderfynu yn yr ardal hon, a chredaf y cânt eu penderfynu yn fuan. Bydd pobl yn cael clywed am amgylchiadau mynd â'r apêl hon at Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio, ac os nad ydynt yn fodlon, gallant fynd at dribiwnlys prisio.

Os bydd pobl, rhwng hyn a'r prisiaid nesaf, yn teimlo bod gwerth eu tai ar y farchnad wedi dioddef ac nad yw eu gwerth yn gywir, gallant fynd yn ôl at Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio i ofyn am ailystyried y gwerth. Credaf fod hynny'n rhoi sicrwydd holl-gynhwysol pellach i'ch etholwyr.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghanol De Cymru Public Services in South Wales Central**

**Q5 David Melding:** What measures is the Minister taking to promote choice and diversity in public services in South Wales Central? OAQ0483(LGP)

**C5 David Melding:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo dewis ac amrywiaeth mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0483(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly Government set out its vision for better public services last October in 'Making the Connections', which applies to South Wales Central just as it does to the whole of Wales. That means that we want services to be far more citizen-centred, with services becoming far easier for people to access, whatever their circumstances, and much more responsive to individual and community needs.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that two key factors that would help us to deliver more effective public services are, first, to have more services delivered by the independent sector, and, secondly, to have more services co-ordinated on a regional basis, particularly by local government co-operating to commission the services that are needed by the people?

2.20 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I do not think that it is fair to say that moving to having more services from the independent sector would automatically give a better product; to say that is not fair to those who work in the public sector. Decisions have to be made by the commissioning body, whether local government or health.

On your second point, on whether regional and co-ordinated delivery would be better, as you know, a core feature of 'Making the Connections' is more joint working. Much of the joint working that is being considered is across regions. Local government has already set up regional groups across Wales, and working together on this. In the health sector, regional offices are looking at more commissioning across boundaries. So, if you want some reassurance, those things are already happening. What is crucial—and this is at the core of your question, and what I thought that you were going to move on to—is that we need to tailor our services to meet individual needs more. It will be important that we can do that in this process.

**Sue Essex:** Cafodd gweledigaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ei gwneud yn glir fis Hydref diwethaf yn y ddogfen 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', sydd yr un mor gymwys i Ganol De Cymru ag ydyw i weddill Cymru. Golyga hynny ein bod am i wasanaethau ganolbwytio lawer yn fwy ar y dinesydd, ac i wasanaethau fod lawer yn fwy hwylus i bobl, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau, ac yn fwy ymatebol o lawer i anghenion unigolion a chymunedau.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno mai dau ffactor allweddol a fyddai o gymorth inni gyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwy effeithiol fyddai, yn gyntaf, cyflwyno mwy o wasanaethau drwy'r sector annibynnol, ac yn ail, cydlyn u mwy o wasanaethau yn rhanbarthol, yn enwedig wrth i lywodraeth leol gydweithredu i gomisiynu'r gwasanaethau y mae ar bobl eu hangen?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn credu ei bod yn deg dweud y byddai symud tuag at gael mwy o wasanaethau o'r sector annibynnol yn rhoi gwell cynyrch o reidrwydd; mae dweud hynny'n annheg â'r rheini sy'n gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus. Y corff comisiynu sydd i benderfynu, boed ym maes llywodraeth leol neu ym maes iechyd.

O ran eich ail bwynt, a fyddai cyflwyno gwasanaethau rhanbarthol wedi'u cydlyn u yn well, un o nodweddion craidd 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', fel y gwyddoch, yw mwy o gydweithio. Cydweithio rhwng rhanbarthau yw llawer o'r cydweithio sy'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Mae llywodraeth leol eisoes wedi sefydlu grwpiau rhanbarthol ledled Cymru, ac yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar hyn. Yn y sector iechyd, mae swyddfeydd rhanbarthol yn ystyried mwy o gomisiynu ar draws ffiniau. Felly, os ydych am gael sicrwydd, mae'r pethau hynny eisoes yn digwydd. Yr hyn sy'n hanfodol—ac mae hyn wrth wraidd eich cwestiwn, a dyna yr oeddwn yn credu y byddech yn dod ato—yw bod angen inni deilwra'n gwasanaethau i ddiwallu anghenion unigolion yn well. Bydd yn bwysig gallu gwneud hynny yn y broses hon.

**Jenny Randerson:** One way in which my constituents are expecting an improvement in services is through the introduction of licensing for houses in multiple occupation. That impacts on different councils to varying extents, as the numbers of houses in multiple occupation vary across Wales. I have raised this issue with you before, Minister. There is money in the budget for dealing with HMO licensing, and you kindly agreed to look at how that would be distributed. Have you made up your mind yet, and, if so, can you explain how you intend to dispense that money?

**Sue Essex:** I have put it in the revenue support grant, but I continue to have discussions about this with the WLGA. To familiarise you with the argument, it is a comparatively small sum of money—I think that it is £1 million that we have as a consequential—and we have not used the grant mechanism for such things previously. If it was not included in the RSG, it would have to go in a targeted grant mechanism. The view from the WLGA is that, for those sums, and considering the fact that we have not targeted other sums of money in the same way, it is a swings-and-roundabouts situation. However, I understand the logic of that. We may need to review this and see how it goes. A range of authorities are represented, and for Cardiff, obviously, this is an important issue. When I was in north Wales last week, I picked up on a range of impacts of HMOs, which went wider than the geographical area. We will leave it at that.

**Jenny Randerson:** Un ffordd y mae fy etholwyr yn disgwyli gwelliannau yn y gwasanaethau yw drwy gyflwyno trwyddedu ar gyfer tai amlfeddiannaeth. Mae hynny'n effeithio ar gynghorau gwahanol i raddau amrywiol, gan fod nifer y tai amlfeddiannaeth yn amrywio ledled Cymru. Codais y mater hwn gyda chi o'r blaen, Weinidog. Mae arian yn y gyllideb ar gyfer ymdrin â thrwyddedu tai amlfeddiannaeth, a bu ichi gytuno, yn garedig iawn, i edrych ar y ffordd y cai hwnnw ei ddosbarthu. A ydych wedi penderfynu eto, ac os ydych, a allwch esbonio sut y bwriadwch ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi ei roi yn y grant cynnal refeniw, ond yr wyf yn parhau i'w draffod gyda CLILC. Er mwyn i chi fod yn gyfarwydd â'r ddadl, swm cymharol fychan o arian ydyw—credaf mai £1 filiwn sydd gennym fel swm canlyniadol—ac nid ydym wedi defnyddio'r mecanwaith grant ar gyfer pethau fel hyn o'r blaen. Pe na byddai'n cae; ei gynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw, byddai'n rhaid iddo fod yn rhan o grant wedi'i dargedu. Barn CLILC, a chan gofio nad ydym wedi targedu symiau eraill o arian yn yr un ffordd, yw bod manteision ac anfanteision yn hynny. Fodd bynnag, deallaf resymeg hynny. Efallai y bydd angen inni adolygu hyn a gweld sut yr aiff pethau. Cynrychiolir amryw awdurdodau, ac yn amlwg mae hyn yn fater pwysig i Gaerdydd. Pan oeddwn yn y gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf, sylwais ar amryw effeithiau tai amlfeddiannaeth a oedd yn mynd ymhellach na'r ardal ddaearyddol. Fe'i gadawn ar hynny.

### Y Dreth Gyngor yng Nghymru Council Tax in Wales

**C7 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru? OAQ0538(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Quite simply, Brynle, council tax is a property tax. It is set and administered by the 22 unitary authorities in Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for that

**Q7 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on council tax in Wales? OAQ0538(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Yn syml iawn, Brynle, treth eiddo yw'r dreth gyngor. Fe'i pennir a'i gweinyddu gan y 22 awdurdod unedol yng Nghymru.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw,

response, Minister. First, I would like to welcome the help that you have promised for pensioners who have been most adversely affected by the council tax rebanding. However, the £100 in 2006 will only be available for those pensioners who have gone up two bands. Many will go up just one band next year, due to the staggering of the process, and will not be eligible. Will the Welsh Assembly Government develop a long-term strategy to protect the elderly who are in financial hardship?

**Sue Essex:** On your first question, you will know that this was part of the agreement secured with your party—and, indeed, with the other parties—so I am surprised that you asked it. On the issue of whether pensioners are properly protected, I am not happy with the take-up of council tax benefit. Using the council tax benefit as an example—although there are many more—£1.5 million is available as part of the budget to extend the take-up of council tax benefit, and that will be particularly targeted at pensioners, because we know that there is insufficient take-up among that group. To answer the second part of your question, Gordon Brown is making provision as Chancellor of the Exchequer, which he is able to do from taxpayers' money, and I support what he is doing.

### **Llywodraeth Leol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Government in Rhondda Cynon Taf**

**Q8 Leighton Andrews:** Will the Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's achievements in the field of local government in Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0488(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Again, there are many achievements. I will start with the funding and the increase in funding that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council has experienced in recent years, particularly through the local government settlement and other forms of grants, which has been the backbone of achievements within the valley.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree that the use made of that investment by Rhondda Cynon Taf council recently in extending investment in street care, extending the recycling scheme and the meals on wheels

Weinidog. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddiolch am y cymorth yr ydych wedi ei addo i bensiynwyr sydd wedi dioddef fwyaf wrth ailfandio treth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, dim ond ar gyfer pensiynwyr sydd wedi codi dau fand y bydd y £100 yn 2006 ar gael. Bydd nifer yn codi dim ond un band y flwyddyn nesaf, gan fod y broses wedi ei chyflwyno mewn dau gam, ac ni fyddant yn gymwys. A fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn datblygu strategaeth hirdymor i ddiogelu'r henoed sy'n wynebu caledi ariannol?

**Sue Essex:** O ran eich cwestiwn cyntaf, fe wyddoch fod hyn yn rhan o gytundeb y daethpwyd iddo gyda'ch plaid—ac, yn wir, gyda'r pleidiau eraill—felly, synnar eich bod yn gofyn hynny. O ran diogelu pensiynwyr, nid wyf yn hapus am y nifer sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dal treth gyngor. Gan ddefnyddio budd-dal treth gyngor fel enghraift—er bod yna lawer mwy—mae £1.5 miliwn ar gael fel rhan o'r gyllideb i gynyddu'r nifer sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dal treth gyngor, a thargedir hwnnw at bensiynwyr yn benodol, oherwydd gwyddom nad oes digon o'r grŵp hwnnw'n gwneud cais amdano. I ateb ail ran eich cwestiwn, mae Gordon Brown yn gwneud darpariaeth fel Canghellor y Trysorlys, ac y mae'n bosibl iddo wneud hynny o arian y trethdalwyr, a chefnogaf yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud.

**C8 Leighton Andrews:** A all y Gweinidog amlinellu llwyddiannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym maes llywodraeth leol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0488(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Unwaith eto, mae llawer wedi ei gyflawni. Dechreuaaf gyda'r ariannu a'r cynnydd yn yr arian y mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi ei gael yn y blynnyddoedd diwethaf, yn enwedig drwy'r setliad llywodraeth leol a grantiau eraill, sydd wedi bod yn asgwrn cefn i llwyddiannau yn y cwm.

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunwch fod y ffordd mae cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi defnyddio'r buddsoddiad hwnnw yn ddiweddar, drwy ehangu buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau gofal strydoedd, ehangu'r

scheme across Rhondda Cynon Taf to seven days a week demonstrates how the Labour-run council in Rhondda Cynon Taf is delivering for the citizens of Rhondda Cynon Taf?

**Sue Essex:** The issue of the delivery of services is core to what people expect from local government. You have the figures, which cover a whole range of improvements, I know, in terms of the work that I do with the council and in terms of its performance targets. For example, the number of children leaving school without a qualification has fallen from 4.3 to 2.5 per cent. That is important: fewer children are now leaving school without qualifications.

cynllun ailgylchu a'r cynllun pryd ar glud ar draws Rhondda Cynon Taf i saith diwrnod yr wythnos, yn dangos sut mae'r cyngor Llafur yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn cyflawni er lles dinasyddion Rhondda Cynon Taf?

**Sue Essex:** Mae mater darparu gwasanaethau yn greiddiol i'r hyn y mae pobl yn ei ddisgwyl gan lywodraeth leol. Mae gennych y ffigurau, sy'n cwmpasu amrywiaeth eang o welliannau, fe wn, o ran y gwaith yr wyf yn ei wneud gyda'r cyngor ac o ran ei dargedau perfformiad. Er enghraifft, mae nifer y plant sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymhwyster wedi gostwng o 4.3 y cant i 2.5 y cant. Mae hynny'n bwysig: mae llai o blant yn gadael yr ysgol yn awr heb gymwysterau.

### **Cyllido Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru Funding of Public Services in Wales**

**Q9 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of public services in Wales? OAQ0539 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I am glad to have another question from you, Brynle. The Government is committed to providing high-quality and effective public services for the people of Wales. Its funding is aligned to the delivery of those services as set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

**Brynle Williams:** The costs of running health and social services have risen a great deal and the services, I am sorry to say, have not improved in line with the increased spending. How will the Welsh Assembly Government improve the monitoring of the spending process to ensure that resources are not being wasted?

**Sue Essex:** There has been a massive increase in funding, particularly in health and social care, with another extra chunk in the final settlement this afternoon. We use a variety of methods, Brynle. As a member of the Local Government and Public Services Committee, you will know about the whole issue of the performance targets. The whole sweep of targets and indicators that we have established is a clear indication of our seriousness about monitoring that important element of performance, which is the

**C9 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ0539 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n braf cael cwestiwn arall gennych, Brynle. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol o safon uchel ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Mae'r cyllido yn gyson â chyflwyno'r gwasanaethau hynny fel y nodir yn strategaeth 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae costau rhedeg y gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol wedi codi'n arw, ac nid yw'r gwasanaethau, mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud, wedi gwella yn unol â'r gwario ychwanegol. Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwella monitro'r broses wario i sicrhau na wastreffir adnoddau?

**Sue Essex:** Bu cynnydd enfawr mewn cyllid, yn arbennig ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, gyda thalp ychwanegol arall yn y setliad terfynol y prynhawn yma. Defnyddiwn amrywiaeth o ddulliau, Brynle. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, fe wyddoch am holl fater y targedau perfformiad. Mae'r holl ystod o dargedau a dangosyddion yr ydym wedi eu sefydlu yn arwydd clir ein bod o ddifrif ynghylch monitro'r elfen bwysig honno, perfformiad, sef y pwyt pwyseg i'r

important point for those who receive services rheini sy'n cael gwasanaethau.

### **Ffyrdd i Ysgafnhau Baich y Dreth Gyngor Ways to reduce the Burden of Council Tax**

**Q10 Glyn Davies:** What discussions does the Minister intend to hold with local government about ways to reduce the burden of council tax on people on low fixed incomes? OAQ525(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I announced last week that I would reimburse local authorities if they introduce a scheme in 2006-07 that will give £100 to those pensioners whose homes have moved up a second band on 1 April 2006 as a result of revaluation. We will work closely with local government to implement the scheme.

**Glyn Davies:** I welcome the limited response that you made in the agreement to the sense of injustice that currently exists in Wales about the level of council tax, but it does not go far enough. I am rather hoping that you will discuss the longer term with local government, in terms of how you can reduce the effects of what is now a brutal and fiercely damaging tax on people who are on low fixed incomes throughout Wales and are suffering as a result of your government. Will you respond on that?

**Sue Essex:** I am always astounded when you say such things, Glyn, because the burden of council tax has been far less under the Labour Government than it was during the Tory years. It is always worth remembering that. As to the future, when we will still have a Labour Government, you know that we will have the Commissioner for Older People in Wales, people leading on this within local authorities, the council tax benefit scheme and the older persons' forum. We will be taking action, with a whole range of innovations and initiatives to try to support pensioners.

I will end by mentioning the home energy efficiency scheme, into which we are injecting considerable sums of money, and which is enormously popular. I visited one of my constituents, a pensioner, on Monday and I was so pleased to see that person safe and

**C10 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu eu cael gyda llywodraeth leol ynglŷn â ffyrdd i ysgafnhau baich y dreth gyngor i bobl sydd ag incwm sefydlog isel? OAQ525(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cyhoeddais yr wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn ad-dalu awdurdodau lleol os cyflwynant gynllun yn 2006-07 a fydd yn rhoi £100 i'r pensiynwyr hynny y mae eu tai wedi codi dau fand ar 1 Ebrill 2006 oherwydd ailbrisio. Byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda llywodraeth leol i weithredu'r cynllun.

**Glyn Davies:** Croesawaf eich ymateb cyfyngedig yn y cytundeb i'r ymdeimlad o anghyfiawnder sydd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yngylch lefel y dreth gyngor, ond nid yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Gobeithio y byddwch yn trafod yr hirdymor gyda llywodraeth leol, o ran sut y gallwch leihau effaith treth sydd erbyn hyn yn dreth greulon a niweidiol iawn i bobl sydd ar incwm sefydlog isel ledled Cymru, ac sy'n dioddef oherwydd eich llywodraeth. A ymatebwch i hynny?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu bob tro pan ddywedwch bethau o'r fath, Glyn, oherwydd mae baich treth gyngor wedi bod yn llai o lawer dan y Llywodraeth Lafur nag ydoedd yn amser y Toraid. Mae'n werth cofio hynny bob amser. O ran y dyfodol, pan fydd gennym Lywodraeth Lafur o hyd, fe wyddoch y bydd gennym Gomisiynydd Pobl Hŷn yng Nghymru, pobl yn arwain ar hyn o fewn awdurdodau lleol, y cynllun budd-dal treth gyngor a fforwm pobl hŷn. Byddwn yn gweithredu, gydag amrywiaeth eang o ddatblygiadau a mentrau i geisio cefnogi pensiynwyr.

Gorffennaf drwy grybwyl y cynllun effeithlonwydd ynni yn y cartref sy'n cael chwistrelliad o symiau sylweddol o arian gennym ac sy'n hynod boblogaidd. Ymwelais ag un o'm hetholwyr ddydd Llun sy'n bensiynwraig, ac yr oeddwn mor falch gweld

secure in her home.

y wraig honno'n ddiogel yn ei chartref.

### **Arferion Effeithiol mewn Cynghorau Tref a Chymuned Effective Practice in Town and Community Councils**

**Q11 Janice Gregory:** What measures is the Welsh Assembly Government putting in place to promote effective practice in town and community councils? OAQ0503(LGP)

**C11 Janice Gregory:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu rhoi ar waith i hyrwyddo arferion effeithiol mewn cynghorau tref a chymuned? OAQ0503 (LGP)

2.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly Government set up a national training advisory group, which has drafted a training strategy, on which community and town councils will be consulted, and has also prioritised a selection of training manuals for councillors and clerks. That has been produced, and it is excellent material.

**Janice Gregory:** I am sure that you will agree, Minister, that people expect town and community councils to represent their views. I am sure that the people in Llanharan, in my constituency, will look to their community council to get involved in the Llanharan railway station project, as I mentioned yesterday. However, will you join me in congratulating Pencoed town council on the way in which it disseminates information throughout Pencoed town, by publishing the *Hyphen* newsletter, which is produced and delivered by the town councillors?

**Sue Essex:** You have mentioned two practical examples of how town and community councils can get involved. You have campaigned for that station for many years, and it will be a great day for you when it opens. The council can be involved in many different ways in terms of informing people, ensuring that there are proper facilities for children, and that there is a buffet, cafe, taxis, and so on. I have seen the Pencoed town council newsletter, which is excellent. It is informative and readable, and I am sure that the residents rely on it for a lot of information. We could use that as a best practice example for other local councils.

**Sue Essex:** Sefydlodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad grŵp cyngori cenedlaethol ar hyfforddiant, sydd wedi drafftio strategaeth hyfforddi. Bydd cynghorau cymuned a thref yn ymgynghori arni, ac mae hefyd wedi blaenoriaethu detholiad o lawlyfrau hyfforddi i gynghorwyr a chlercod. Cynhyrchwyd hynny, ac mae'n ddeunydd ardderchog.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch, Weinidog, fod pobl yn disgwyl i gynghorau tref a chymuned gynrychioli eu barn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y bobl yn Llanharan, yn fy etholaeth, yn disgwyl i'w cyngor cymuned gymryd rhan ym mhrosiect gorsaf reilffordd Llanharan, fel y soniais ddoe. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch cyngor tref Pen-coed am y ffordd y mae'n lledaenu gwybodaeth ledled tref Pen-coed, drwy gyhoeddi'r cylchlythyr *Hyphen*, sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu a'i ddosbarthu gan gynghorwyr y dref?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych wedi sôn am ddwy enghraifft ymarferol o'r ffordd y gall cynghorau tref a chymuned gymryd rhan. Yr ydych wedi ymgyrchu dros yr or saf honno ers blynnyddoedd, a bydd yn ddiwrnod mawr ichi pan fydd yn agor. Gall y cyngor gymryd rhan mewn nifer o wahanol ffyrdd i roi gwybod i bobl, sicrhau bod cyfleusterau addas ar gyfer plant, a bod bwffe, caffi, tacsis ac ati ar gael. Yr wyf wedi gweld cylchlythyr cyngor tref Pen-coed, ac mae'n un gwych. Mae'n llawn gwybodaeth ac yn hawdd ei ddarllen, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod y trigolion yn dibynnu arno am lawer o wybodaeth. Gallem ddefnyddio hynny fel enghraifft o arfer gorau i gynghorau lleol eraill.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning

### Ymestyn Methodoleg y Cyfnod Sylfaen Extending the Foundation Phase Methodology

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drefniadau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gwneud i sicrhau cyllid digonol er mwyn ymestyn methodoleg y cyfnod sylfaen ar hyd y blynnyddoedd cynnar? OAQ0612(ELL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yng nghylch cynllunio diweddaraf y gyllideb, yr wyf wedi sicrhau arian i ddarparu'r hyfforddiant sy'n angenrheidiol i'r gweithlu i'w baratoi ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen llawn, ac i ledaenu'r cynllun peilot cyfredol i rai o ddalgylchoedd Dechrau'n Deg.

**Owen John Thomas:** Deallaf fod cynlluniau i gyflwyno'r cynllun i ysgolion yn fuan, ond bod hyn wedi'i ohirio oherwydd diffyg arian i'w gynnal.

**Jane Davidson:** Na, nid yw hynny'n wir. Deuthum ag adroddiad i gyfarfod diwethaf y pwylgor. Bydd yn rhaid i lawer o bethau weithio'n dda gyda'i gilydd i wneud yn siŵr y gellir lledaenu'r cyfnod sylfaen ledled Cymru. Bydd yn rhaid inni gael gwerthfawrogiad o'r cynllun peilot a meddwl am y gyfraith statudol—bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud hynny. Bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyfnod sylfaen yn cydfynd ag arolygiad y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol o ran Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru hefyd. Bydd yn rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr bod digon o bobl yn cael digon o hyfforddiant, ac mae llawer o arian yn y system ar gyfer hynny.

**Irene James:** The foundation phase is a vital step forward in educational provision, which has been warmly welcomed by heads and teachers in my constituency of Islwyn. Part of what I was going to ask you has already been answered. However, will you ensure that the funding and the timetable for developing the foundation phase is secure, so that teachers and heads can maximise their use of skills, and plan ahead for the benefit of children

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** What arrangements has the Minister made to ensure sufficient funding to extend the foundation phase methodology throughout the early years? OAQ0612(ELL)

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** In the current budget planning round, I have secured additional funds to provide the training necessary for the workforce to prepare it for the introduction of the full foundation phase, and to extend coverage of the ongoing pilot into some of the Flying Start catchment areas.

**Owen John Thomas:** I understand there were plans to introduce the scheme in schools soon, but that this has been delayed because of a lack of funding to support it.

**Jane Davidson:** No, that is not the case. I provided a report to committee at our last meeting. Many things will have to work well together to ensure that the foundation phase can be rolled out throughout Wales. We must have an evaluation of the pilot scheme and think about the statutory legislation—the Assembly will have to do that. We will have to ensure that the foundation phase also runs alongside the review of the national curriculum in terms of the Qualification, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales. We will have to ensure that enough people are given adequate training, and there is a lot of funding in the system for that.

**Irene James:** Mae'r cyfnod sylfaen yn gam hanfodol ymlaen yn y ddarpariaeth addysg, ac mae wedi ei groesawu'n frwd gan benaethiaid ac athrawon yn fy etholaeth i yn Islwyn. Mae rhan o'r hyn yr oeddwon am ei ofyn ichi wedi'i ateb eisoedd. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch sicrhau bod yr arian a'r amserlen ar gyfer datblygu'r cyfnod sylfaen yn gadarn, fel y gall athrawon a phenaethiaid wneud y mwyaf o'u sgiliau a blaengynllunio er lles

across Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** There is no diminution in Labour's commitment to take this initiative forward. We need to ensure that people have the appropriate training. I have asked local authorities to look at workforce issues in terms of analysing the number of people who are working with early years with sufficient skills at present, so that we can ensure that that training is delivered appropriately. With regard to the medium of Welsh, substantial money is going into a partnership between Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin and Trinity College, Carmarthen in terms of training early years' professionals through the medium of Welsh to take this forward bilingually.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Are you saying that you have the full funding to carry out this initiative? What assessment have you made, for example, of how many qualified teachers you will need to carry it out?

**Jane Davidson:** Assessments have already been made, before the workload agreement was put in place. What the workload agreement has done is to bring a substantial number of adults into school settings, many with appropriate skills, particularly in early years. That is why I have asked local authorities to look at how many of those people who are in the school settings now can be trained up very quickly in terms of the foundation phase, and what training needs to be put in place for others. The funding issue is a matter for the whole Assembly, and I would love to have a substantial commitment from all other parties today to ensure that, through the budget planning round, funding is properly put in place for the statutory roll-out in 2008.

### **Hyfforddiant Galwedigaethol mewn Ysgolion Vocational Training in Schools**

**Q2 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on vocational training in schools? OAQ0572(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Welsh Assembly Government has approved a wide range of vocational qualifications in schools and in

plant Cymru?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw ymrwymiad Llafur i hyrwyddo'r fenter hon wedi lleihau. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod pobl yn cael yr hyfforddiant priodol. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol ystyried problemau'r gweithlu o ran dadansoddi nifer y bobl sy'n gweithio gyda'r blynnyddoedd cynnar ac sydd â sgiliau digonol ar hyn o bryd, fel y gallwn sicrhau y caiff yr hyfforddiant hwnnw ei ddarparu'n briodol. O ran darpariaeth cyfrwng Gymraeg, mae swm sylweddol o arian yn cael ei roi i bartneriaeth rhwng Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin a Choleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, o ran hyfforddi gweithwyr proffesiynol y blynnyddoedd cynnar drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg er mwyn hyrwyddo hyn yn ddwyieithog.

**Laura Anne Jones:** A ydych yn dweud bod arian digonol gennych i roi'r fenter hon ar waith? Pa asesiad a wnaethoch, er enghraifft, o nifer yr athrawon cymwysedig y bydd eu hangen arnoch i'w rhoi ar waith?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwnaed asesiadau eisoes, cyn rhoi'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith ar waith. Yr hyn a wnaeth y cytundeb llwyth gwaith oedd dod â nifer sylweddol o oedolion i mewn i ysgolion, nifer ohonynt â sgiliau priodol, yn enwedig yn y blynnyddoedd cynnar. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol edrych ar faint o'r bobl hynny sydd mewn ysgolion nawr y gellir eu hyfforddi'n gyflym iawn o ran y cyfnod sylfaen, a pha hyfforddiant sydd ei angen ar eraill. Mae'r arian yn fater i'r Cynulliad cyfan, a charwn gael ymrwymiad sylweddol gan bob plaid arall heddiw i sicrhau, drwy gylch cynllunio'r gyllideb, y caiff arian ei neilltuo'n briodol ar gyfer ei gyflwyno'n statudol yn 2008.

**C2 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyfforddiant galwedigaethol mewn ysgolion? OAQ0572(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cymeradwyo amrywiaeth eang o gymwysterau galwedigaethol mewn ysgolion

other learning settings. Our 14-19 agenda will increase the flexibility of provision, opening up wider opportunities for these qualifications to be offered in, and on behalf of, schools.

**Bryngle Williams:** The education system appears to be failing a significant number of young people. A recent report has shown that, since 1998, children in Wales are less likely than their counterparts in England to achieve five GCSEs, and a significant number of them are still leaving school with no qualifications. These young people will be more likely to go on to be economically inactive, unemployed or work for very low pay. What support can you provide to make vocational options available earlier, as I have asked before, to prevent so many young people becoming alienated from the education system?

**Jane Davidson:** Although we have a long way to go in terms of ensuring that our young people achieve the best possible results at GCSE, all examination result trends have been upward during the lifetime of the Assembly. Our new 14-19 agenda, for which there is substantial funding in place this year, and massively increased funding the year after, is exactly about expanding the vocational option.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Following on from that question, do you agree that it is crucial that we persist with our investment in the 14-19 learning pathways, as it is key to helping to achieve our objective of getting parity of esteem for vocational educational qualifications, alongside traditional qualifications? We owe this to the children of Wales.

**Jane Davidson:** The evidence is very much on your side in that analysis. I am pleased that the Nuffield Foundation, which has been conducting an exploration of 14-19 delivery across the whole of the UK, sees that Wales is leading the way in terms of our agenda. We are looking, with the sector skills councils, at piloting combined apprenticeships to ensure that there is a learning pathway that combines good school-based or college-based learning with periods of extended learning in a work

a lleoliadau dysgu eraill. Bydd ein hagenda 14-19 yn gwneud y ddarpariaeth yn fwy hyblyg, gan agor cyfleoedd ehangach i gynnig y cymwysterau hyn mewn ysgolion ac ar ran ysgolion.

**Bryngle Williams:** Ymddengys fod y system addysg yn siomi nifer sylweddol o bobl ifanc. Mae adroddiad yn ddiweddar wedi dangos bod plant yng Nghymru, er 1998, yn llai tebygol o lwyddo mewn pum pwnc TGAU o'u cymharu â'u cyfoedion yn Lloegr, a bod nifer sylweddol ohonynt yn dal iadael yr ysgol heb yr un cymhwyster. Bydd y bobl ifanc hyn yn fwy tebygol o fod yn economaidd anweithgar, yn ddi-waith, neu'n gweithio am gyflog isel iawn yn y pen draw. Pa gefnogaeth y gallwch ei darparu i sicrhau bod dewisiadau galwedigaethol ar gael yn gynharach, fel yr wyf wedi gofyn o'r blaen, er mwyn atal cynifer o bobl ifanc rhag ymddieithrio o'r system addysg?

**Jane Davidson:** Er bod gennym gryn ffordd i fynd i sicrhau bod ein pobl ifanc yn cael y canlyniadau TGAU gorau posibl, mae'r holl dueddiadau o ran canlyniadau arholiadau wedi bod ar i fyny ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Ehangu'r dewis galwedigaethol yw union nod ein hagenda 14-19 newydd. Mae cyllid sylweddol ar gael ar ei chyfer eleni, a chyllid cynyddol sylweddol y flwyddyn ganlynol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yn dilyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, a gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol inni barhau ein buddsoddiad yn y llwybrau dysgu 14-19, am fod hynny'n allweddol i'n helpu i gyrraedd ein nod o sicrhau parch cydradd i gymwysterau addysg galwedigaethol, ochr yn ochr â chymwysterau traddodiadol? Dylem wneud hyn er mwyn plant Cymru.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r dystiolaeth yn ategu eich barn yn gadarn am hynny. Yr wyf yn falch fod Sefydliad Nuffield, a fu'n gwneud archwiliad o'r ddarpariaeth 14-19 ledled y DU yn gyfan, yn gweld bod Cymru ar flaen y gad gyda'n hagenda. Yr ydym yn edrych ar dreialu prentisiaethau cyfunol gyda chynghorau sgiliau sector, er mwyn sicrhau bod llwybr dysgu ar gael sy'n cyfuno dysgu yn yr ysgol neu yn y coleg â chyfnodau o ddysgu estynedig mewn lleoliad gwaith i roi

setting to offer a good vocational option to young people. dewis galwedigaethol da i bobl ifanc.

### **Cyfraniad ELWa at Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru Contribution made by ELWa to Education and Training in Wales**

**Q3 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the contribution made by Education and Learning Wales to education and training in Wales? OAQ0557(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Through the development of the national planning and funding system, and related strategies and initiatives to guide service improvement, ELWa has made a significant contribution towards the implementation of the education and training action plan reform agenda.

**Peter Black:** One issue in terms of reforming post-16 education, and one of the tools that ELWa is using, is the geographical pathfinder. Often, these are driven by area inspections by Estyn. However, Estyn only has enough resources to carry out one area inspection every year. Given that it will take 22 years to complete these area inspections around Wales, will you make more resources available to Estyn to try to speed up that process?

2.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** The area inspections are one route into geographical pathfinders, but the point of those pathfinders is to achieve a consensus in the local area in terms of taking forward an agenda that benefits learners better. It then goes to a public consultation process, after which, it will be referred to the Assembly Government for an outcome. That is how things stand under the current arrangements. We will always be looking to ensure that we can take a better area-led approach, and I will keep that under discussion with the chief inspector and others to ensure that the best learning provision is on offer to learners in all areas of Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, you will be familiar with the Daniel Martin case. ELWa refused to fund a Down's Syndrome lad to receive training at Foxes Academy in Minehead. On

**C3 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyfraniad y mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru wedi ei wneud i addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru? OAQ0557(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Drwy ddatblygu'r system cynllunio ac ariannu genedlaethol, a strategaethau a mentrau cysylltiedig i arwain gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau, mae ELWa wedi gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i'r gwaith o weithredu agenda diwygio'r cynllun gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant.

**Peter Black:** Un mater o ran diwygio addysg ôl-16, ac un o'r dulliau y mae ELWa yn ei ddefnyddio, yw'r cynlluniau braenaru daearyddol. Yn aml, caiff y rhain eu hyrwyddo gan archwiliadau ardal gan Estyn. Fodd bynnag, mae adnoddau Estyn yn ddigonol i wneud dim ond un archwiliad ardal bob blwyddyn. A derbyn y bydd yn cymryd 22 flynedd i gwblhau'r archwiliadau ardal hyn ledled Cymru, a allwch ddarparu mwy o adnoddau i Estyn i geisio cyflymu'r broses honno?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r archwiliadau ardal yn un llwybr i'r cynlluniau braenaru daearyddol, ond diben y cynlluniau braenaru hynny yw cael consensws yn yr ardal leol o ran hyrwyddo agenda sydd o fwy o fudd i ddysgwyr. Yna bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus, ac wedyn caiff ei gyfeirio at Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'w benderfynu. Dyna sut y mae pethau ar hyn o bryd dan y trefniadau presennol. Byddwn bob amser yn ceisio sicrhau mai'r ardal leol sy'n arwain yn hyn, a byddaf yn parhau i drafod hynny gyda'r prif arolygydd ac eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth ddysgu orau ar gael i ddysgwyr ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, yr ydych yn gyfarwydd ag achos Daniel Martin. Gwrthododd ELWa ariannu bachgen sydd â Syndrom Down i gael hyfforddiant yn

appeal, it was rejected largely because of Welsh Assembly Government guidance, which I believe to have been discriminatory and contrary to the Learning and Skills Act 2000. Eventually, ELWa and the Welsh Assembly Government acceded, and funding was found from ELWa for the educational element, and from the Vale of Glamorgan Council for the social care element, resulting in the multi-agency approach that we called for and asked you to look at from the outset.

I am sure that you, ELWa officials and your officials will want to learn the lessons of this case. That is why I wrote to you to ask for a meeting with you or your officials and Daniel's parents to learn those lessons, to ensure that no other Down's Syndrome lad and no other pupil or student ever has to go through that experience, which was torturous. With that in mind, I ask you to reconsider your rejection of the request for a meeting, because surely—and I appeal to your better nature—even you do not want to see any special needs child having to go through that experience ever again over a period of torturous months.

**Jane Davidson:** In my letter to you—which, as you have raised the issue today, I hope you will make fully available to all Assembly Members—I showed that we have learned a substantial number of lessons through the process. There was no discrimination in the initial arrangements. We looked at the guidance under which ELWa was operating at the time, independently of the Assembly Government. We have absolutely endorsed the multi-agency approach. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Jane Davidson:** What we need to do for the future is to ensure that, as we go through the process in the committee of looking at issues around transition and special educational needs, such lessons are learned. We are absolutely confident that the appropriate multi-agency approach will deliver, as has been agreed.

Academi Foxes yn Minehead. Cyflwynwyd apêl, ond fe'i gwirthodwyd yn bennaf oherwydd canllaw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sydd wedi bod yn wahaniaethol ac yn groes i Ddeddf Dysgu a Sgiliau 2000, yn fy marn i. Yn y pen draw, cytunodd ELWa a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a daethpwyd o hyd i arian gan ELWa ar gyfer yr elfen addysgol, a chan Gyngor Bro Morgannwg ar gyfer yr elfen gofal cymdeithasol, gan arwain at y dull aml-asiantaeth yr oeddym yn gofyn amdano ac y gofynnwyd ichi ei ystyried o'r cychwyn cyntaf.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi, swyddogion ELWa a'ch swyddogion am ddysgu gwersi'r achos hwn. Dyna pam yr ysgrifennais atoch yn gofyn am gyfarfod â chi neu eich swyddogion a rhieni Daniel er mwyn dysgu'r gwersi hynny, er mwyn sicrhau na fyddai'n rhaid i unrhyw berson ifanc arall sydd â Syndrom Down nac unrhyw ddisgybl na myfyriwr arall gael y profiad hwnnw, a oedd mor drofaus. Gyda hynny mewn cof, gofynnaf ichi ailystyried eich penderfyniad i wrthod y cais am gyfarfod, oherwydd—a gofynnaf ichi fod yn garedig—mae'n sicr nad ydych chi hyd yn oed am weld unrhyw blentyn ag anghenion arbennig yn gorfol mynd drwy'r profiad hwnnw am gyfnod o fisoedd blin.

**Jane Davidson:** Yn fy llythyr atoch—a gobeithio y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd ar gael i bob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, gan eich bod wedi codi'r mater heddiw—dangosais ein bod wedi dysgu cryn dipyn drwy'r broses. Nid oedd unrhyw wahaniaethu yn y trefniadau cychwynnol. Buom yn edrych ar y canllaw yr oedd ELWa yn ei weithredu ar y pryd, yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cymeradwyo'r dull aml-asiantaeth yn llwyr. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud ar gyfer y dyfodol yw sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu gwersi o'r fath wrth fynd drwy'r broses yn y pwyllog o edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â chyfnod pontio ac anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yr ydym yn gwbl hyderus y bydd y dull aml-asiantaeth priodol yn llwyddiannus, fel y cytunwyd.

## Dyfodol y Chweched Dosbarth mewn Ysgolion The Future of School Sixth Forms

**Q4 Leighton Andrews:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of school sixth forms? OAQ0553(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Sixth forms are an integral part of the post-16 sector, and they will remain so in future as the new department for education, lifelong learning and skills seeks to build upon ELWa's work to improve opportunities for learners across Wales.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am glad to hear that. You will be aware from my correspondence with you of my concerns about some proposals that came forward from ELWa's consultants about sixth forms in the Rhondda. I now place on record that the chair of ELWa has written to me to say that the plans will mean the retention of sixth forms at Porth, Treorchy, Tonypandy and Ferndale, through the English language, and in the Welsh language consortium. Do you agree that the sixth forms in the Rhondda play an important part in local education, as does Coleg Morgannwg, and that they are popular with parents and pupils?

**Jane Davidson:** The real point about the notion of geographical pathfinders is that they test whether current provision, either in its current form or expanded through collaboration, or new arrangements would better serve learners in any particular area. Therefore, as I said in answer to Peter Black, geographical pathfinders come forward with a consensus on provision for public consultation. At the end of the day, the Assembly Government will have to respond to concerns raised with regard to any public consultation. However, I maintain my view that all aspects of post-16 provision—sixth forms, colleges and work-based learning provision—have an important part to play. Our job is to ensure that they are all in the right place in the right set of facilities to ensure that they really can offer the greatest opportunities to learners.

**Janet Ryder:** Many schools felt that their

**C4 Leighton Andrews:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol y chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion? OAQ0553(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae dosbarthiadau chwech yn rhan integredig o'r sector ôl-16, a byddant yn parhau felly yn y dyfodol wrth i'r adran newydd dros addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau geisio adeiladu ar waith ELWa i wella cyfleoedd i ddysgwyr ledled Cymru.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'm gohebiaeth â chi am fy pryderon ynglŷn â rhai o'r cynigion a wnaed gan ymgynghorwyr ELWa ynglŷn â dosbarthiadau chwech yn Rhondda. Hoffwn gofnodi yma fod cadeirydd ELWa wedi ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud y bydd y cynlluniau'n golygu cadw dosbarthiadau chwech yn y Porth, Treorci, Tonypandy a Glyn Rhedynog, drwy'r Saesneg, ac yn y consortiwm cyfrwng Cymraeg. A gytunwch fod y dosbarthiadau chwech yn Rhondda yn bwysig mewn addysg leol, fel y mae Coleg Morgannwg, a'u bod yn boblogaidd gyda rhieni a chyda disgylion?

**Jane Davidson:** Y pwynt gwirioneddol ynglŷn â'r syniad o gynlluniau braenaru daearyddol yw eu bod yn profi a fyddai'r ddarpariaeth bresennol, naill ai yn ei ffurf bresennol neu wedi'i hymestyn drwy gydweithio, neu drwy drefniadau newydd, o fwy o fudd i ddysgwyr mewn unrhyw ardal benodol. Felly, fel y dywedais wrth ateb Peter Black, mae cynlluniau braenaru daearyddol yn rhoi consensws am ddarpariaeth ar gyfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Yn y pen draw, bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymateb i bryderon a godir ynglŷn ag unrhyw ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal i'r farn fod gan bob agwedd ar ddarpariaeth ôl-16—dosbarthiadau chwech, colegau a darpariaeth dysgu yn y gweithle—ran bwysig i'w chwarae. Ein gwaith ni yw sicrhau eu bod i gyd yn y lle cywir yn y cyfleusterau cywir er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cynnig y cyfleoedd gorau posibl i ddysgwyr.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr oedd nifer o ysgolion o'r

sixth forms were threatened when ELWa introduced its new planning and funding formula. With the introduction of the 14-19 learning pathways, the possibility that some sixth formers may choose to mix college, work experience and school, will mean the introduction of yet another funding formula for sixth forms. How do you intend to fund sixth forms under the 14-19 learning pathways?

**Jane Davidson:** It is not an issue only concerning sixth forms, because 14-year-olds are not in sixth form. There will not be different funding formulae. We will still operate the same funding formulae, in the sense that, at the moment, ELWa provides funding to local authorities, which provide it to their schools. Therefore, schools will still have the funding in the way that they have done hitherto, but they will share delivery mechanisms with others, and I am sure that you would like to see an expansion of opportunities to young people, the length and breadth of Wales, to have an academic offer and a more vocational offer.

**Mark Isherwood:** How do you respond to the evidence-based concerns of headteachers that sixth-form cuts and closures—which are highly likely, and, in some cases, already biting—will reduce resources and increase class sizes in years 7 to 11?

**Jane Davidson:** I would need to see evidence, Mark, to that effect. We all have to face up to the fact that, by 2013, census figures predict that there will be something in the region of 114,000 empty places in our schools. That trend started in primary schools in the year 2000 and will bite in sixth forms by 2008, which means that there is a greater onus on all of us to ensure that young people can have as wide an offer as possible, and that there is a variety of providers that are able to deal with that.

farn fod eu dosbarthiadau chwech dan fygythiad pan gyflwynodd ELWa ei fformiwlw cynllunio ac ariannu newydd. O gyflwyno llwybrau dysgu 14-19, bydd y posibilrwydd y gall rhai disgylion chweched dosbarth ddewis cymysgu coleg, profiad gwaith a'r ysgol, yn golygu cyflwyno fformiwlw ariannu arall eto ar gyfer dosbarthiadau chwech. Sut y bwriadwch ariannu dosbarthiadau chwech dan y llwybrau dysgu 14-19?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n fater nid yn unig i ddosbarthiadau chwech, oherwydd nid yw disgylion 14 oed yn y chweched dosbarth. Ni fydd fformiwlâu ariannu gwahanol. Byddwn yn parhau i weithredu'r un fformiwlâu ariannu, yn yr ystyr fod ELWa, ar hyn o bryd, yn rhoi arian i awdurdodau lleol, sy'n ei roi i'w hysgolion. Felly, bydd ysgolion yn dal i gael yr arian yn yr un ffordd ag o'r blaen, ond byddant yn rhannu mechanweithiau darparu gydag eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech weld cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc, ar hyd a lled Cymru, yn cael eu hymestyn i gynnig dewis academaidd a dewis mwy galwedigaethol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Beth yw eich ymateb i bryderon penaethiaid, yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, y bydd cwtogi a chau dosbarthiadau chwech—sy'n debygol iawn, ac sydd eisoes yn digwydd, mewn rhai achosion—yn lleihau adnoddau ac yn cynyddu maint dosbarthiadau blynnyddoedd 7 i 11?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddai angen imi weld dystiolaeth o hynny, Mark. Rhaid inni oll wynebu'r ffaith fod ffigurau'r cyfrifiad yn rhag-weld y bydd tua 114,000 o leoedd gwag yn ein hysgolion erbyn 2013. Dechreuodd y duedd honno mewn ysgolion cynradd yn 2000 a bydd yn effeithio ar ddosbarthiadau chwech erbyn 2008, sy'n golygu bod mwy o gyfrifoldeb arnom bob un i sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc gael cymaint o ddewis a phosibl, a bod yna amrywiaeth o ddarparwyr a all ddelio â hynny.

## Manteision Ariannol o Gyfuno ELWa â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Financial Benefits of Merging ELWa into the Welsh Assembly

**Q5 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on the financial benefits of merging ELWa into the Welsh Assembly Government? OAQ0580(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The ELWa merger will contribute the majority of the £1.9 million estimated financial benefits of merger for the new department of education and lifelong learning by 2009. The ELWa merger will also contribute to estimated staff-related financial benefits of £3.1 million in the continued delivery of corporate services for the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Michael German:** I am sure that you remember that, last year, the Assembly was concerned about the funding for Coleg Gwent and the reduction in the number of courses and the staff redundancies that were made there. Can you reassure me that Coleg Gwent will receive funding to make up this problem from the savings that will be made from merging ELWa into the Assembly Government department?

**Jane Davidson:** College funding operates on a formula basis, according to what a college offers. I point out that it is predicted that, over the next couple of years, colleges in Wales will go into surplus.

**C5 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y manteision ariannol o gyfuno ELWa â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAQ0580(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd uno ELWa yn cyfrannu'r rhan fwyaf o'r £1.9 miliwn, sef buddiannau ariannol amcangyfrifedig yr uno i'r adran addysg a dysgu gydol oes newydd erbyn 2009. Bydd uno ELWa hefyd yn cyfrannu at fuddiannau ariannol amcangyfrifedig gwerth £3.1 miliwn yn gysylltiedig â staff drwy barhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau corfforaethol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cofiwch, y llynedd, i'r Cynulliad fynegi pryderon yngylch ariannu Coleg Gwent a lleihau nifer y cyrsiau a'r staff a ymddiswyddwyd yno. A allwch fy sicrhau y bydd Coleg Gwent yn cael arian i wneud iawn am y broblem hon o'r arbedion a wneir yn sgîl uno ELWa ag adran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r broses o ariannu colegau yn seiliedig ar fformiwlwla, yn ôl yr hyn y mae colleg yn ei gynnig. Hoffwn wneud yn glir, yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, y rhagwelir y bydd gan golegau yng Nghymru arian dros ben.

### **Niferoedd Mawr o Ddisgyblion Difreintiedig High Numbers of Disadvantaged Pupils**

**Q6 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on a strategy to support those schools in Wales with high numbers of disadvantaged pupils? OAQ0586(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** We support such schools through: the deprivation element in the standard spending assessment formula; the Better Schools fund, which targets measures to raise the attainment of pupils in disadvantaged areas; an additional £3 million each year since 2003-04 to support improvement in low-performing schools; and local strategies for school improvement.

**C6 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am strategaeth i gefnogi'r ysgolion hynny yng Nghymru sydd â niferoedd mawr o ddisgyblion difreintiedig? OAQ0586(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn cefnogi ysgolion felly drwy: yr elfen amddifadedd yn y fformiwlwla asesiad gwariant safonol; y gronfa Ysgolion Gwell, sy'n targedu mesurau i gynyddu cyrhaeddiad disgyblion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig; £3 miliwn ychwanegol bob blwyddyn er 2003-04 i gefnogi gwelliannau mewn ysgolion sy'n perfformio'n wael; a strategaethau lleol ar gyfer gwella ysgolion.

**John Griffiths:** Thank you for that answer and for all of that work and activity, which is very valuable. However, of course, socio-economic disadvantage impacts on schools with a high percentage of disadvantaged pupils in many ways, some obvious and some not so obvious. That makes the attainment of the sorts of educational standards that we all want to see much more difficult than is the case for schools in more prosperous areas. Given that that is the case, Jane, and that social justice is such a driving imperative for the Welsh Assembly Government, will you continue to look at further ways, and perhaps new ways, of effectively addressing that disadvantage?

**Jane Davidson:** There are two clear ways of doing this. The first, in terms of the education policy agenda, would be to focus on the Narrowing the Gap initiative, which demonstrates that schools in all areas can achieve above what we call the cohort expectation, if they are very clear in terms of raising the expectation of their young people and in supporting them in doing that. Secondly, in financial terms, I am working with Sue Essex to look at the deprivation elements of the school funding settlement, so that we can ensure that they are properly targeted.

**Nick Bourne:** Will you join me in congratulating Penmaes School, which caters for children with special educational needs, many of whom come from disadvantaged backgrounds? It is an excellent school in Brecon, with a first-class head, Ian Elliot, whom I recently visited. The school would be very pleased to see the Minister there. The chairman of governors and the governors are all excellent.

**Jane Davidson:** I have visited the school.

**Nick Bourne:** I know, and they are keen to see you again. It is a first-class school, as you obviously know, and it is about to expand again—I do not know whether you would be able to be there for the official opening. It is such a good school, it does terrific work and

**John Griffiths:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw ac am yr holl waith a'r gweithgarwch hwnnw, sy'n werthfawr iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae anfantais economaidd-gymdeithasol wrth gwrs yn effeithio ar ysgolion sydd â chanran uchel o ddisgyblion difreintiedig mewn llawer ffordd, rai ohonynt yn amlwg a rhai nad ydynt mor amlwg. Mae hynny'n gwneud y gwaith o gyrraedd y mathau o safonau addysgol yr ydym oll am eu gweld lawer yn fwy anodd nag sy'n digwydd mewn ysgolion mewn ardaloedd mwy ffyniannus. A bwrw bod hynny'n wir, Jane, a bod cyfiawnder cymdeithasol mor bwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a fyddwch yn parhau i edrych ar ffyrdd eraill, ac efallai ffyrdd newydd, i fynd i'r afael yn effeithiol â'r anfantais honno?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae dwy ffordd amlwg i wneud hyn. Y cyntaf, o ran yr agenda polisi addysg, fyddai canolbwytio ar y fenter Cau'r Bwlch, sy'n dangos y gall ysgolion ym mhob ardal ragori ar yr hyn a alwn yn ddisgwyliad y garfan, os ydynt yn glir iawn o ran codi disgwyliadau eu pobl ifanc a'u cefnogi i wneud hynny. Yn ail, mewn termau ariannol, yr wyf yn gweithio gyda Sue Essex i edrych ar elfennau amddifadedd yn y setliad ariannu ysgolion, er mwyn inni allu sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu targedu'n briodol.

**Nick Bourne:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Ysgol Pen-maes, sy'n darparu ar gyfer plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, nifer ohonynt o gefndiroedd difreintiedig? Mae'n ysgol ardderchog yn Aberhonddu, gyda phennaeth o'r radd flaenaf, sef Ian Elliot, y bûm yn ymweld ag ef yn ddiweddar. Byddai'r ysgol yn falch iawn gweld y Gweinidog yno. Mae cadeirydd y llywodraethwyr a'r llywodraethwyr yn bobl ragorol.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r ysgol.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwn hynny, ac maent yn awyddus i'ch gweld eto. Mae'n ysgol o'r radd flaenaf, fel y gwyddoch yn amlwg, ac mae ar fin ehangu unwaith eto—ni wn a allech fod yn bresennol ar gyfer yr agoriad swyddogol. Mae'n ysgol mor dda, mae'n

has received considerable assistance from Powys County Council. Will you join me in congratulating the school and, perhaps, visit again?

**Jane Davidson:** I very much enjoyed my visit to Penmaes School, and, of course, funding from the allocation from the Assembly Government has contributed towards the school being in far better premises for the future. I certainly look forward to either attending the opening or hearing about its outcome.

2.50 p.m.

### **Dysgu Gydol Oes yng Nghymru Lifelong Learning in Wales**

**Q7 Denise Idris Jones:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to promote lifelong learning in Wales? OAQ0562(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Opportunities to continue learning beyond the age of 16 are promoted via Careers Wales guidance, the Learndirect helpline and campaigns such as Sign Up Now and Adult Learners' Week. These are supported via a range of learning account grants, career development loans and maintenance allowances.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that learning should be suited to individuals and that it is quite in order for adults to learn for pleasure, as well as working towards formal qualifications?

**Jane Davidson:** Yes, and that is an important part of John Griffiths's strategy for older people. Some of the additional funding that has been made available for that strategy is supporting learning opportunities that are not, in any way, geared towards the world of work, but they contribute to people's quality of life.

**Owen John Thomas:** You would agree with me that the basis of lifelong learning is in the school years and an injustice that you have there is the imbalance between academic and vocational learning. You talk about expanding vocational learning, but for that to be done properly, so that there is parity

gwneud gwaith ardderchog ac mae wedi cael cryn dipyn o gymorth gan Gyngor Sir Powys. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch yr ysgol, ac efallai i ymweld â hi eto?

**Jane Davidson:** Mwynheais fy ymweliad ag Ysgol Pen-maes yn fawr iawn, ac wrth gwrs mae arian a ddyrrannwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyfrannu tuag at sicrhau bod yr ysgol mewn adeiladau llawer gwell ar gyfer y dyfodol. Edrychaf ymlaen yn bendant at naill ai fynychu'r agoriad neu glywed amdano.

**C7 Denise Idris Jones:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru? OAQ0562(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Hyrwyddir cyfleoedd i barhau i ddysgu ar ôl 16 oed drwy ganllawiau Gyrfaoedd Cymru, llinell gymorth Learndirect ac ymgyrchoedd megis Ymunwch Nawr ac Wythnos Addysg Oedolion. Cefnogir y rhain drwy amrywiaeth o grantiau cyfrifon dysgu, benthyciadau datblygu gyrfa a lwfansau cynhaliaeth.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunwch y dylai dysgu fod yn addas ar gyfer unigolion, a'i bod yn gwbl dderbynol i oedolion ddysgu er mwyn mwynhad, yn ogystal â gweithio tuag at gymwysterau ffurfiol?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf, ac mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o strategaeth John Griffiths ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae rhywfaint o'r arian ychwanegol sydd ar gael ar gyfer y strategaeth honno yn cefnogi cyfleoedd dysgu nad ydynt, mewn unrhyw ffordd, wedi'u hanelu at fydd gwaith, ond sy'n cyfrannu at ansawdd bywyd pobl.

**Owen John Thomas:** Byddech yn cytuno â mi fod sylfaen dysgu gydol oes i'w weld yn ystod blynnyddoedd ysgol, ac un o'r anghyfiawnderau sydd gennych yno yw'r anghydbwysedd rhwng dysgu academaidd a dysgu galwedigaethol. Fe soniwch am ehangu dysgu galwedigaethol, ond er mwyn

between the two, you would need a revolution in education. In fact, you would have to produce many people who can do the training work because teachers are not trained to do it. We are talking about vocational training and we need to train thousands of people throughout Wales if we are going to bring about this change. What are your plans for that?

**Jane Davidson:** If we were going to deliver this in the school setting, you would be absolutely right. However, what we have always argued and what the education and training plan reforms initially suggested, which is the why ELWa was established in the first place, was that we must get the right kind of collaborations between those who have the skills. There is a substantial amount of people in the further education sector and the work-based learning sector who have those vocational skills. We want to make those available to young people aged between 14 and 19, as well as the skills that are traditionally taught in the school setting.

**Lisa Francis:** In terms of encouraging vocational skills learning in the tourism industry, I know that you value the importance of in-house training and mentoring, but can you confirm that the Tourism Training Forum for Wales will continue to be funded after the merger of the Wales Tourist Board? Can you confirm that there are no plans to cut the funding to that organisation between April 2006 and 2007?

**Jane Davidson:** I have not received any representations in terms of the tourism training forum. I am happy to see the work that it is doing with the sector skills council and, of course, ELWa is looking at providing better bilingual vocational opportunities, for example in tourism, through the medium of Welsh. It is a big agenda for us all, and I anticipate working with the tourism training forum on that.

#### **Amrywiaeth ym Myd Addysg i Rieni a Disgyblion yng Nghanol De Cymru Diversity in Education for Parents and Pupils in South Wales Central**

gwneud hynny'n gywir, er mwyn i'r ddau fod yn gyfartal, byddai angen chwyldro mewn addysg. Yn wir, byddai angen ichi gynhyrchu nifer o bobl a all wneud y gwaith hyfforddiant am nad yw athrawon wedi'u hyfforddi i wneud hynny. Yr ydym yn sôn am hyfforddiant galwedigaethol ac mae angen inni hyfforddi miloedd o bobl ledled Cymru os ydym am gyflawni'r newid hwn. Beth yw eich cynlluniau ar gyfer hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Pe byddem yn bwriadu darparu hyn mewn ysgolion, byddech yn llygad eich lle. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr ydym bob amser wedi'i ddadlau a'r hyn a awgrymwyd ar y cychwyn gan y diwygiadau yn y cynllun addysg a hyfforddiant, sef y rheswm dros sefydlu ELWa yn y lle cyntaf, oedd ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau'r mathau cywir o gydweithredu rhwng y rheini sy'n meddu ar y sgiliau. Mae yna nifer sylweddol o bobl yn y sector addysg bellach a'r sector dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith sy'n meddu ar y sgiliau galwedigaethol hynny. Yr ydym am i'r rheini fod ar gael i bobl ifanc rhwng 14 a 19 oed, yn ogystal â'r sgiliau a addysgir yn draddodiadol mewn ysgol.

**Lisa Francis:** O ran annog sgiliau galwedigaethol yn y diwydiant twristiaeth, gwn eich bod yn gwerthfawrogi pwysigrwydd hyfforddiant mewnol a mentora, ond a allwch gadarnhau y bydd y Fforwm Hyfforddi Twristiaeth yng Nghymru yn parhau i gael ei ariannu ar ôl uno Bwrdd Croeso Cymru? A allwch gadarnhau nad oes unrhyw gynlluniau i gwtogi'r arian i'r sefydliad hwnnw rhwng Ebrill 2006 a 2007?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau am y fforwm hyfforddiant twristiaeth. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y gwaith y mae'n ei wneud gyda'r cyngor sgiliau sector, ac wrth gwrs, mae ELWa yn ystyried darparu gwell cyfleoedd galwedigaethol dwyieithog, er enghraifft, ym maes twristiaeth, drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'n agenda fawr i bob un ohonom, a disgwyliaf weithio gyda'r fforwm hyfforddiant twristiaeth ar hynny.

**Q8 David Melding:** What measures is the Minister taking to promote choice and diversity in education for parents and pupils in South Wales Central? OAQ0550(ELL)

**C8 David Melding:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo dewis ac amrywiaeth ym myd addysg i rieni a disgylion yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0550(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly Government supports excellent local schools for all through non-selective community schooling. This approach enjoys the overwhelming support of our schools, local education authorities, teachers and parents. From the age of 14, we promote subject choice and diversity to enable young people to fully realise their potential.

**David Melding:** South Wales Central is predominantly an urban area and it is reasonable to expect pupils to travel a short distance to the school of their choice or of the choice that they make with their parents. We need a range of schools, including excellent comprehensives, specialist schools, technical schools, sixth forms and sixth-form colleges. Is this the outcome that you will deliver for us?

**Jane Davidson:** No.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, an issue raised by the Assembly's childcare strategy working group was the lack of choice, particularly with regard to Welsh-medium childcare places. However, due to cuts imposed by Labour-controlled Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, the menter iaith is about to close 96 after-school places, with the loss of 12 jobs. This goes against your Government's stated aims with regard to childcare and the Welsh language. I have been told that each club can survive with only £2,000 until the end of the financial year. Minister, will you take action to stop these closures?

**Jane Davidson:** I have asked my department to look into the issues. However, I point out that we have just launched a childcare strategy, and, by 2008, all local authorities of all political colours will have a duty to ensure sufficient childcare provision in their areas. We therefore encourage all local authorities to move forward on that agenda.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi cael ysgolion lleol ardderchog i bawb drwy addysg gymunedol annetholus. Mae'r ymagwedd hon yn cael ei chefnogi'n helaeth iawn gan ein hysgolion, ein hawdurdodau addysg lleol, ein hathrawon a rhieni. Ar ôl 14 oed yr ydym yn hyrwyddo dewis o bynciau ac amrywiaeth i alluogi pobl ifanc i wireddu eu potensial yn llawn.

**David Melding:** Ardal drefol gan mwyaf yw Canol De Cymru, ac mae'n rhesymol disgwyl i ddisgyblion deithio ychydig bellter i'r ysgol a ddewisant eu hunain neu ar y cyd â'u rhieni. Mae angen amrywiaeth o ysgolion arnom, gan gynnwys ysgolion cyfun, ysgolion arbenigol, ysgolion technegol, dosbarthiadau chwech a cholegau chweched dosbarth ardderchog. Ai dyma'r canlyniad y byddwch yn ei sicrhau inni?

**Jane Davidson:** Nage.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, un o'r materion a godwyd gan weithgor strategaeth gofal plant y Cynulliad oedd y diffyg dewis, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â lleoedd gofal plant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i'r toriadau a wnaed gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf sydd dan reolaeth Llafur, mae'r fenter iaith ar fin cau 96 o leoedd ar ôl ysgol, gan olygu colli 12 o swyddi. Mae hyn yn mynd yn groes i'r nodau mae eich Llywodraeth wedi ei datgan ar gyfer gofal plant a'r iaith Gymraeg. Dywedir wrthyf y gall pob clwb barhau ar ddim ond £2,000 tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Weinidog, a wnewch chi rywbeth i rwystro'r clybiau hyn rhag cau?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm hadran ymchwilio i'r problemau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi egluro ein bod newydd lansio strategaeth gofal plant, ac erbyn 2008 bydd yn ddyletswydd ar bob awdurdod lleol, o bob tuedd wleidyddol, i sicrhau bod digon o ddarpariaeth gofal plant yn eu hardaloedd. Felly, anogwn bob awdurdod lleol i symud ymlaen gyda'r agenda honno.

## Partïon Nadolig Ysgolion School Christmas Parties

**Q9 William Graham:** Will the Minister outline guidelines issued regarding the holding of school Christmas parties? OAQ0576(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Guidance issued on 24 November by the E.coli outbreak control team to schools in affected areas restated the control measures put in place at the start of the outbreak. These limit preparation of food to catering staff and allow children to bring in food only for their own consumption. The guidance applies to arrangements for Christmas parties.

**William Graham:** Your answer gives much assurance. Can you be certain that, in future, when we have one of these dreadful outbreaks, as much information is given to parents as is given to headteachers?

**Jane Davidson:** Obviously, with expert advice, our committee on E.coli will look at issues of communication. However, it is important that parents, teachers, and children understand that these rules are there for a purpose, because we do not want a further spread of the E.coli infections.

**C9 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd ynglŷn â chynnal partïon Nadolig ysgolion? OAQ0576(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yn y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Tachwedd gan y tîm rheoli achosion o E.coli ar gyfer ysgolion mewn ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt, ailddatganwyd y mesurau rheoli a roddwyd ar waith adeg yr achosion cyntaf. Mae'r rhain yn dweud mai dim ond staff arlwyd a gaiff baratoi bwyd, a chaiff plant ddod â bwyd i'w fwyta ganddynt hwy eu hunain yn unig. Mae'r canllawiau'n berthnasol i drefniadau ar gyfer partïon Nadolig.

**William Graham:** Mae eich ateb yn rhoi llawer o sicrwydd. A allwch fod yn sicr, yn y dyfodol, pan fydd un o'r achosion arswyodus hyn yn digwydd, y bydd cymaint o wybodaeth yn cael ei rhoi i rieni ag a roddir i benaethiaid?

**Jane Davidson:** Yn amlwg, gyda chyngor arbenigol, bydd ein pwylgor ar E.coli yn edrych ar faterion cyfathrebu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig i rieni, athrawon, a phlant ddeall bod rheswm dros y rheolau hyn, am nad ydym am weld rhagor o achosion o haint E.coli.

## Cyrsiau ym Mhrifysgolion Cymru Courses in Welsh Universities

**C10 David Lloyd:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynglŷn ag ehangu darpariaeth cyrsiau ym mhrifysgolion Cymru? OAQ0593(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi ymweld â phob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn y 12 mis diwethaf, a chyfarfum yn ddiweddar â phob is-ganghellor a phennaeth. Mae'r trafodaethau wedi ymdrin ag amrywiaeth o faterion, gan gynnwys pynciau o bwysigrwydd strategol i Gymru.

**Q10 David Lloyd:** What recent discussions has the Minister had regarding extending the provision of courses in Welsh universities? OAQ0593(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** I have visited all higher education institutions in Wales in the last 12 months, and I recently met all vice-chancellors and principals. The discussions have covered a range of issues, including subjects of strategic importance to Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y cyrsiau meddygol sydd ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae mwy o gyfle yn awr i ddilyn cwrs meddygol drwy'r Gymraeg oherwydd yr ysgolion clinigol yn Abertawe a gogledd Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 11, OAQ0616(ELL), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**David Lloyd:** What are you doing to increase the number of medical courses that are available through the medium of Welsh?

**Jane Davidson:** There is greater opportunity now to follow a medical course through the medium of Welsh because of the clinical schools in Swansea and in north Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11, OAQ0616(ELL), has been transferred for written answer.

### **Darpariaeth Addysgol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf Educational Provision in Rhondda Cynon Taf**

**Q12 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on educational provision in Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0606(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Excluding pupil referral units and special schools, Rhondda Cynon Taf has six nursery schools, 127 primary school, and 19 secondary schools, together with one further education institution, Coleg Morgannwg, and one higher education institution, the University of Glamorgan.

**Leanne Wood:** Further to my question on the closure of 96 after-school places in Rhondda Cynon Taf, would you be able to provide the £2,000 needed to keep those after-school clubs open until the end of the financial year?

**Jane Davidson:** Leanne, my understanding is that the budget for education and training has been fully spent, as usual. I have asked my officials to look at whether there are any particular circumstances in which we can work with the local authority to ensure greater opportunities in the local area.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One of the responsibilities of local authorities is to try to sort out the problem of surplus school places. I understand that Rhondda Cynon Taf has attempted to solve this particular problem, although it is a rather thorny issue. Do you share my concern that local authorities a little closer to home have not been as proactive in sorting this problem out?

**Jane Davidson:** It is incumbent on us all to ensure that our local authorities look at the

**C12 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth addysgol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0606(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Ar wahân i unedau cyfeirio disgyblion ac ysgolion arbennig, mae gan Rhondda Cynon Taf chwe meithrinfa, 127 o ysgolion cynradd, a 19 o ysgolion uwchradd, ynghyd ag un sefydliad addysg bellach, sef Coleg Morgannwg, ac un sefydliad addysg uwch, sef Prifysgol Morgannwg.

**Leanne Wood:** Yn ychwanegol at fy nghwestiwn am gau 96 o leoedd ar ôl ysgol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a fyddch yn gallu darparu'r £2,000 sydd ei angen i gadw'r clybiau ar ôl ysgol hynny ar agar tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol?

**Jane Davidson:** Leanne, deallaf fod y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant wedi'i gwario'n llwyr, fel arfer. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion edrych i weld a oes unrhyw amgylchiadau arbennig lle y gallwn weithio gyda'r awdurdod lleol i sicrhau mwy o gyfleoedd yn yr ardal leol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un o gyfrifoldebau awdurdodau lleol yw ceisio datrys problem lleoedd dros ben mewn ysgolion. Deallaf fod Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi ceisio datrys y broblem benodol hon, er ei fod yn fater dadleuol. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu nad yw awdurdodau lleol ychydig yn nes adref wedi bod mor rhagweithiol i ddatrys y broblem hon?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob un ohonom sicrhau bod ein hawdurdodau

issue of how many empty places there will be in their schools, predicted by 2013. It is incumbent on all of us because we do not want education money to be funding empty places, and we want to see a greater community focus to our schools, and we want to ensure that local authorities carry out their statutory responsibilities in making sure that they have the right provision in the right place for their pupils.

lleol yn ystyried faint o leoedd gwag fydd yn eu hysgolion, fel y rhagwelir erbyn 2013. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob un ohonom wneud hynny oherwydd nid ydym am weld arian addysg yn ariannu lleoedd gwag, ac yr ydym am weld mwy o ffocws cymunedol i'n hysgolion, ac yr ydym am sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau statudol drwy sicrhau bod ganddynt y ddarpariaeth gywir yn y man cywir ar gyfer eu disgylion.

### **Cyllido Ysgolion School Funding**

**Q13 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on school funding?  
OAQ0604(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Funding for schools is provided mainly on an unhypothesised basis through the local government revenue settlement. Local authorities are best placed to judge local needs and circumstances, and to fund schools accordingly. They are accountable to their electorate for the decisions that they make.

3.00 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** How will that funding change for secondary schools, once the '14-19 Learning Pathways' programme is introduced?

**Jane Davidson:** The overarching funding for secondary schools, as I said earlier and to you in committee, will not change. There is substantial additional funding in place for '14-19 Learning Pathways', as I have told you before, as has my Deputy Minister, Christine Chapman, who is leading on this issue.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Since 1997, 10 special schools have closed in Wales, despite the fact that the number of children with special educational needs has increased by 7 per cent. What positive action are you taking to ensure that special educational needs are met in Wales? It is crucial that we tackle this problem.

**C13 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido ysgolion?  
OAQ0604(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Rhoddir arian heb ei neilltuo i ysgolion yn bennaf drwy'r setliad refeniu llywodraeth leol. Awdurdodau lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i farnu anghenion ac amgylchiadau lleol, ac i ariannu ysgolion yn unol â hynny. Maent yn atebol i'w hetholwyr am y penderfyniadau a wrânt.

**Janet Ryder:** Sut y bydd y cyllid hwnnw'n newid ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd, ar ôl cyflwyno rhaglen 'Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19'?

**Jane Davidson:** Ni fydd y cyllid cyffredinol ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd yn newid, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ac fel y dywedais wrthych yn y pwylgor. Mae cyllid ychwanegol sylweddol wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer 'Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19', fel y dywedais wrthych o'r blaen, ac fel y dywedodd fy Nirprwy Weinidog, Christine Chapman, sy'n arwain ar y mater hwn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Er 1997, mae 10 o ysgolion arbennig yng Nghymru wedi cau, er bod nifer y plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig wedi cynyddu 7 y cant. Pa gamau gweithredu cadarnhaol yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod anghenion addysgol arbennig yn cael eu diwallu yng Nghymru? Mae'n hollbwysig inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon.

**Jane Davidson:** I agree absolutely, and we have undertaken substantial work on special educational needs, ranging from publishing the code of practice to setting up our own tribunal, and holding the current investigation in committee. From the Government's perspective, we have always been clear that there are special schools and mainstream schools, some of which have special units and some where children with special educational needs have additional provision. The needs of the learner should guide the location in which they are educated.

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf yn llwyr, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud gwaith sylweddol ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, o gyhoeddi'r cod ymarfer i sefydlu ein tribiwnlys ein hunain, a chynnal yr ymchwiliad presennol yn y pwylgor. O safbwyt y Llywodraeth, yr ydym bob amser wedi dweud yn glir fod ysgolion arbennig ac ysgolion prif ffrwd, rai ohonynt ag unedau arbennig a rhai lle mae plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn cael darpariaeth arbennig. Anghenion y dysgwr a ddylai benderfynu ble y cînt eu haddysgu.

### **Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I come forward with the revised business statement, in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 5.4 and 5.5. The draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I also inform Members that the Finance Minister will issue a written statement this afternoon on the Chancellor's pre-budget statement.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cyflwynaf y datganiad busnes diwygiedig, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 a Rhif 5.5. Mae'r datganiad drafft ar gael ar wefan y Siambro dan ddogfennau ategol. Hoffwn hysbysu'r Aelodau hefyd y bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig y prynhawn yma ar ddatganiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig? Gwelaf nad oes. Yr wyf yn gwahodd sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the revised business statement? I see that there are not. I invite comments on the revised business statement.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Not quite, Minister.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Hanner munud, Weinidog.

Yr wyf yn diolch am y datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog heddiw am y cynigion a gyflwynir gan y Deyrnas Gyfunol ar y gyllideb Ewropeaidd, a sut y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar Gymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffait fod datganiad ysgrifenedig am y datganiad cyn y gyllideb yn San Steffan, er y byddem wedi croesawu cael clywed datganiad llafar, ond yr ydym yn deall y pwysau ar amser.

I am thankful that the First Minister will make a statement today on the United Kingdom's proposals on the European budget, and how that will affect Wales. I also welcome the fact that there will be a written statement on the pre-budget statement in Westminster, although we would have welcomed an oral statement, but we do understand the time constraints.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y gwnaed cais am ddatganiad am yr helyntion yn Arfon a de Môn ynghylch dŵr llyn Cwellyn. A fyddwn yn cael rhyw fath o ddatganiad pellach am hynny?

The Minister will be aware that we requested a statement on the difficulties in Arfon and south Anglesey regarding the water in Cwellyn lake. Will there be some kind of further statement on that?

Bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn ymwybodol inni

The Minister will also be aware that we

wneud cais am ddadl am y bwlch rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yng Nghymru. A fydd cyfle yn y flwyddyn newydd i sicrhau bod dadleuon a datganiadau ar y mater pwysig hwn yn cael eu cyflwyno gan y Llywodraeth?

**Lisa Francis:** I thank the Minister for the revised business statement. The written statement by the Finance Minister on the pre-budget statement is most welcome.

We support Plaid Cymru's request for a further update on the cryptosporidiosis situation in north Wales, especially as health chiefs are warning that the number of cases could rise steadily for another fortnight. That is a very serious issue for people living in north Wales.

I also note on the Chamberweb that there is a change on 18 January, and that the annual report of the Health Service Commissioner for Wales will be debated on that day, instead of the Children's Commissioner for Wales's annual report. Could you confirm when there will be a slot for the very important debate on the Children's Commissioner for Wales's annual report?

**Jenny Randerson:** Along with the two previous speakers, the Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the fact that you have agreed to include a statement on the EU budget. It is not before time, and it is of vital importance to us all throughout Wales. However, I regret that there is not an oral statement on the Chancellor's pre-budget statement. It is important that it is known what it will be, it should be timed into the programme, and I do not accept the pressures-of-time excuse, because, as has been said here before, the Welsh Liberal Democrats, in any event, feel that we should be working closer towards Christmas if there is a pressure on time.

We still ask you to find time for an oral statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on the deficits that NHS trusts and local health boards face. That issue is not creeping up but galloping up fast in the agenda and it is time that we highlighted it. It was highlighted today in the Audit Committee meeting and it is time that it was

requested a debate on the gap between the rich and the poor in Wales. Will there be an opportunity in the new year to ensure that debates and statements on this important matter will be issued by the Government?

**Lisa Francis:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad busnes diwygiedig. Mae'r datganiad ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog Cyllid ar y datganiad cyn y gyllideb i'w groesawu'n fawr.

Cefnogwn gais Plaid Cymru am y newyddion diweddaraf am sefyllfa cryptosporidiosis yn y gogledd, yn enwedig gan fod penaethiaid iechyd yn rhybuddio y gallai nifer yr achosion gynyddu'n gylon am bythefnos arall. Mae hwnnw'n fater difrifol iawn i bobl sy'n byw yn y gogledd.

Sylwaf hefyd ar wefan y Siambwr fod newid ar 18 Ionawr, ac y bydd adroddiad blynnyddol Comisiynydd Gwasanaethau Iechyd Cymru yn cael ei drafod y diwrnod hwnnw, yn lle adroddiad blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. A allech gadarnhau pryd y bydd amser ar gyfer y ddadl bwysig iawn ar adroddiad blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** Fel y ddu siaradwr blaenorol, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r ffaith ichi gytuno i gynnwys datganiad ar gyllideb yr UE. Mae'n hen bryd, ac mae'n hanfodol bwysig i bob un ohonom ar draws Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gresynaf nad oes datganiad llafar ar ddatganiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb. Mae'n bwysig cael gwybod beth fydd ynddo: dylai amser gael ei neilltuo yn y rhaglen ar ei gyfer, ac ni dderbyniaf yr esgus fod pwysau o ran amser, oherwydd, fel y dywedwyd o'r blaen, teimla Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, sut bynnag, y dylem fod yn gweithio tan yn nes at y Nadolig os oes unrhyw bwysau o ran amser.

Gofynnwn eto ichi neilltuo amser ar gyfer datganiad llafar gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y diffygion sy'n wynebu ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'r mater hwnnw yn prysur godi i frig yr agenda ac mae'n bryd inni dynnu sylw ato. Tynnwyd sylw ato heddiw yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor

discussed here in Plenary.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** We have moved from limp to lame today in terms of the requests that have come forward. We have delivered on virtually every request that was made. We are just about to hear a statement from the First Minister on the European Union budget. We had always agreed that we would do that at the appropriate time.

On the Chancellor's pre-budget statement, a written statement is appropriate. We are fully debating our budget, which is key. As I said, the Minister for Health and Social Services will do an updated written statement on cryptosporidium and he will continue to do that throughout the recess. You know that that would be his intention.

Lisa, in terms of the children's commissioner's annual report, if you recall, earlier in the week we discussed that it would be better to have the cross-committee discussion before we brought it back to the Assembly for the full Plenary debate. We will reschedule that debate once we have a date for the cross-committee report. As I said yesterday, the Minister for Health and Social Services will produce a written statement on the finances of the NHS in Wales.

Archwilio, ac mae'n bryd iddo ei drafod yma yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr ydym wedi symud o'r naill un esgus gwan i'r llall heddiw gyda'r ceisiadau a gyflwynwyd. Yr ydym wedi cytuno ar bron bob cais a wnaed. Yr ydym ar fin clywed datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog am gyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr oeddem wedi cytuno o'r cychwyn cyntaf i wneud hynny ar yr adeg briodol.

O ran datganiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb, mae datganiad ysgrifenedig yn briodol. Yr ydym yn cael dadl lawn ar ein cyllideb ninnau, sy'n allweddol. Fel y dywedais, bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig wedi'i ddiweddar am cryptosporidium, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny drwy gydol y toriad. Fe wyddoch mai dyna a fyddai ei fwriad.

Lisa, o ran adroddiad blynnyddol y comisiynydd plant, os cofiwch, yn gynharach yn yr wythnos, buom yn trafod y byddai'n well cael trafodaeth rhwng y pwylgorau cyn ei gyflwyno eto gerbron y Cynulliad ar gyfer dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Byddwn yn aildrefnu'r ddadl honno ar ôl cael dyddiad ar gyfer adroddiad y pwylgorau. Fel y dywedais ddoe, bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad ysgrifenedig ar gyllid y GIG yng Nghymru.

*Derbynwyd y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.  
Revised business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad am Drafodaethau ar y Gyllideb Ewropeaidd/Goblygiadau i Gymru Statement on the European Budget Discussions/Implications for Wales**

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Ddeuddydd yn ôl, cyhoeddodd llywyddiaeth y Deyrnas Unedig gynnig ar setlo'r gwahaniaethau o ran cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gyfer y saith mlynedd nesaf, gan ddechrau ymhen ychydig dros flwyddyn. Set o gynigion ydyw sy'n dangos y ffordd ymlaen i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac sy'n gwneud ymdrech i gyflawni gofynion y 15 hen aelod-wladwriaeth a'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Two days ago, the United Kingdom presidency issued a statement on settling the differences over the European Union budget for the next seven years, beginning in just over a year. It is a set of proposals showing the way forward for the European Union. It also attempts to meet the requirements of the 15 established member states and the 10 new member states.

These proposals include an overall budget of €847 billion, representing 1.03 per cent of EU gross national income. That is 17 per cent less than the commission originally proposed. Therefore, this proposal will maintain tough budgetary discipline for the EU. It will involve significant investment for the new member states in the enlarged union of 25, with the UK offering an extra contribution to the costs of enlargement, amounting to €8 billion, or £5.4 billion, over the budget period. It involves the retention of the UK rebate, which would increase from the current level of €5 billion annually, which is £3.3 billion, to €7 billion, or £4.7 billion, towards the end of the 2007-13 period. It involves no fundamental change in the rebate without a fundamental reform of the common agricultural policy. All spending, including that on agriculture, will be subject to a review during the current budget period.

Since 2001, I have cautioned that Wales would more than likely receive less money from 2007, given the demands of enlargement and the improvement in our own economy. However, under these proposals, Wales's access to structural funds will be better than most people could realistically have predicted only a year ago. Throughout the period, I have consistently pressed for the best possible deal for Wales in discussions in Cardiff, London, Brussels and elsewhere. However, any budget agreement needs to avoid having adverse effects on UK public finances if it is to be good for Wales. A deal at any cost is not in Wales's interests, because we would have to bear our share of the UK's contribution to any settlement. With or without structural funds, we in Wales are not exempt from paying tax or from the consequences of a reduced availability of funds for UK public expenditure. The proposals, as they stand, represent a good deal for Europe, the UK and for Wales.

3.10 p.m.

The UK's proposals represent an increase of 26 per cent, or €62 billion, in comparison with the current structural funds budget. It

Mae'r cynigion hyn yn cynnwys cyllideb o €847 biliwn i gyd, sef 1.03 y cant o incwm gwladol gros yr UE. Mae'r swm hwnnw 17 y cant yn llai nag a gynigiwyd gan y comisiwn yn wreiddiol. Felly, bydd y cynnig hwn yn parhau'r ddisgyblaeth gyllidebol lem i'r UE. Bydd yn golygu cryn fuddsoddiad i'r aelod wladwriaethau newydd yn yr undeb o 25 ar ôl ei ehangu, a bydd y DU yn cynnig cyfraniad ychwanegol at gostau ehangu, sef cyfanswm o €8 biliwn, neu £5.4 biliwn, dros gyfnod y gyllideb. Mae'n golygu y bydd y DU yn cadw ei had-daliad, a fyddai'n cynyddu o'r lefel bresennol o €5 biliwn y flwyddyn, sef £3.3 biliwn, i €7 biliwn, neu £4.7 biliwn, erbyn tua diwedd y cyfnod 2007-13. Golyga na fydd unrhyw newid sylfaenol yn yr addaliad oni chaiff y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin ei ddiwygio'n sylweddol. Caiff pob gwariant, gan gynnwys gwariant ar amaethyddiaeth, ei adolygu yn ystod cyfnod y gyllideb bresennol.

Er 2001, yr wyf wedi rhybuddio y byddai Cymru'n debygol o gael llai o arian ar ôl 2007, o gofio gofynion ehangu a'r gwelliant yn ein heonomi ein hunain. Fodd bynnag, dan y cynigion hyn, bydd cyfle Cymru i gael arian cronfeydd strwythurol yn well nag y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl wedi'i ragweld yn realistig dim ond blwyddyn yn ôl. Drwy gydol y cyfnod, yr wyf wedi pwysa phwysa am y cytundeb gorau posibl i Gymru mewn trafodaethau yng Nghaerdydd, Llundain, Brwsel a mannau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i unrhyw gytundeb cyllideb osgoi cael effaith andwyol ar gyllid cyhoeddus y DU os yw i fod yn beth da i Gymru. Nid yw cytundeb costed a gostio yn llesol i Gymru, oherwydd byddai'n rhaid inni dalu ein cyfran o gyfraniad y DU i unrhyw setliad. Gyda chronfeydd strwythurol neu hebddynt, nid ydym ni yng Nghymru yn cael ein heithrio rhag talu treth nac yn gallu dianc rhag y canlyniadau os bydd llai o gyllid ar gael ar gyfer gwariant cyhoeddus yn y DU. Mae'r cynigion, fel y maent yn sefyll, yn gytundeb da i Ewrop, i'r DU ac i Gymru.

Mae cynigion y DU yn golygu cynnydd o 26 y cant, neu €62 biliwn, o'u cymharu â chyllideb bresennol y cronfeydd strwythurol.

suggests that a ceiling of €297 billion, which represents 0.36 per cent of EU gross national income, should be devoted to direct regional policy for 2007-13.

Wales would continue to receive a good level of structural fund receipts in the next financial perspective. We might expect a significant convergence programme, equivalent to Objective 1, alongside a much reduced competitiveness programme, equivalent to today's Objective 2 and 3, and parts of Wales would be eligible to participate in territorial co-operation programmes, the equivalent of INTERREG, as they do now.

The UK's proposals would enable the 15 so-called 'old' member states to retain similar amounts of receipts as they would have under the previous Luxembourg proposals, and, while the new member states may find that their receipts have been reduced, the far better terms under which they will have to implement their programmes will be far less onerous to them.

These proposals provide a basis for negotiations that will, inevitably, be tough. The conflicting interests of 27 member states—and we must not forget that Romania and Bulgaria will become members, all being well, on 1 January 2007—are at stake. It would be rash to predict an outcome at this stage of the negotiations that will take place in Brussels on 15 and 16 December, and which may be prolonged into Saturday, 17 December.

Overall, the 10 new member states would receive a total of €151 billion. This is a large sum stretching the capacity of the new member states to plan and spend. It is roughly equivalent to two Marshall plans in today's prices. The UK proposals also suggest some technical adjustments, which mean that these countries will be able to spend more of the money that is allocated to them. In the spirit of European enlargement, and in the interests of developing a prosperous single market for European business, this focus is politically justifiable and economically sensible.

We are already preparing ourselves in Wales

Awgryma y dylid gosod terfyn uchaf o €297 biliwn, sef 0.36 y cant o incwm gwladol gros yr UE, ar gyfer polisi rhanbarthol uniongyrchol am 2007-13.

Byddai Cymru yn dal i gael cryn dipyn o'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn y persbectif ariannol nesaf. Gallem ddisgwyl rhaglen gydgyfeirio sylweddol, sy'n cyfateb i Amcan 1, ochr yn ochr â rhaglen cystadleurwydd lawer yn llai, sy'n cyfateb i Amcan 2 ac Amcan 3 heddiw, a byddai rhannau o Gymru yn gymwys i gymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni cydweithredu tiriogaethol, sef yr hyn sy'n cyfateb i INTERREG, fel y gwnânt ar hyn o bryd.

Byddai cynigion y DU yn ei gwneud yn bosib i'r 15 'hen' aelod wladwriaeth, fel y'u gelwir, ddal i gael tua'r un maint o arian ag y byddent wedi'i gael dan gynigion blaenorol Lwcsembwrg, ac er bod derbyniadau'r aelod wladwriaethau newydd wedi gostwng, bydd y telerau llawer gwell a gât i weithredu eu rhaglenni lawer yn llai beichus iddynt.

Mae'r cynigion hyn yn sylfaen ar gyfer trafodaethau a fydd, yn anochel, yn rhai anodd. Mae buddiannau gwrthgyferbyniol 27 o aelod wladwriaethau—a rhaid inni gofio y bydd Rwanda a Bulgaria yn dod yn aelodau, gobeithio, ar 1 Ionawr 2007—yn y fantol. Byddai'n wirion ceisio proffwydo beth fydd yn digwydd yn y trafodaethau a gaiff eu cynnal ar 15 a 16 Rhagfyr, ac a fydd yn parhau, efallai, tan ddydd Sadwrn, 17 Rhagfyr.

Yn gyffredinol, byddai'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd yn cael cyfanswm o €151 biliwn. Mae hwn yn swm mawr a fydd yn ymestyn gallu'r aelod wladwriaethau i gynllunio a gwario. Mae'n cyfateb yn fras i ddau gynllun Marshall yn ôl prisiau heddiw. Mae cynigion y DU hefyd yn awgrymu rhai addasiadau technegol, sy'n golygu y bydd y gwledydd hyn yn gallu gwario mwy o'r arian a ddyrennir iddynt. Yn unol ag ysbryd o ehangu Ewrop, ac er mwyn datblygu un farchnad ffyniannus i fusnesau Ewrop, gellir cyflawnhau'r ffocws hwn yn wleidyddol ac mae'n synhwyrol yn economaidd.

Yr ydym eisoes yn ymbaratoi yng Nghymru

for a range of outcomes. We have established an external stakeholder group, and officials are engaging with experts to consider issues for any future programmes. This will stand us in good stead when a deal is agreed. The UK presidency is committed to reaching a deal, if at all possible. No doubt, there will have to be compromise on all sides—such negotiations always involve a sharing of pain. An agreement later this month, broadly along the lines set out in these proposals, is in the best interests of Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch i chi am ddod gerbron y Cynulliad i wneud y datganiad hwn. Mae'n fater pwysig i ni wrth inni agosáu at y cyfarfod ym Mrwsel yn ddiweddarach yn y mis. Dywedasoch fod y cynigion hyn, fel ag y maent, yn cynrychioli cytundeb da i Ewrop, y Deyrnas Gyfunol a Chymru. Bûm yn chwilio am unrhyw gadarnhad o hynny, ac ni allaf ddarganfod bron i unrhyw wlad yn Ewrop sy'n credu ei fod yn gytundeb da iddynt hwy. Mae'r Almaen, fel y deallwn, wedi gwrrthod y cynigion erbyn hyn, fel y gwnaeth Ffrainc. Dywed Sbaen fod hwn yn gytundeb da i'r Deyrnas Gyfunol ond i neb arall. Mae Gwlad Pwyl a Hwgari wedi ei wrthod. Yr unig wlad a ddangosodd unrhyw gefnogaeth iddo yw Lwcsembwrg, oherwydd dyna pwy a roddodd y cynnig diwethaf gerbron, nad yw'n annhebyg, fel y dywedasoch, i'r hyn a gynigir yn awr.

Os dyna'r drefn ar hyn o bryd, Brif Weinidog, ni ddeallaf ac ni rannaf eich optimistaeth y bydd cynigion Tony Blair yn gweld ffafir ar gyfandir Ewrop, ac mae'n hawdd gweld pam nad ydynt yn apelio i'r gwledydd hynny. Fel y bu ichi ei awgrymu, gosodwyd cyfanswm y gyllideb yn rhy isel. Mae 17 y cant yn is na chynigion y comisiwn, fel y dywedwch. Bu toriadau yn yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer cymorth datblygu i'r aelodau newydd. Un mater na fu ichi gyfeirio ato yn eich datganiad, ond ceir cyfeiriad ato yng nghynigion y Llywodraeth, yw y bydd toriadau sylweddol yn y gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu gwledig. Yr ydych yn ymwybodol, wrth gwrs, o bwysigrwydd hynny i wlad fel Cymru sy'n ddibynnol iawn ar cymorth o'r fath oherwydd y tirwedd sydd gennym a'r ffaith bod cynifer o'n ffermydd

ar gyfer amrywiol ganlyniadau. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp o randdeiliaid allanol, ac mae swyddogion yn cysylltu ag arbenigwyr i ystyried materion ar gyfer unrhyw raglenni yn y dyfodol. Bydd hyn yn fuddiol inni pan fydd cytundeb. Mae llywyddiaeth y DU wedi ymrwymo i gael cytundeb, os yw'n bosibl. Yn ddi-os, bydd yn rhaid i bawb gyfaddawdu—mae trafodaethau felly bob amser yn golygu rhannu'r boen. Bydd cytundeb yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn, yn fras ar hyd y llinellau sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn y cynigion hyn, yn fuddiol i Gymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank you for coming before the Assembly to make this statement. It is an important matter for us as we approach the meeting in Brussels later on this month. You said that these proposals, as they stand, represent a good deal for Europe, the UK and Wales. I have been looking for some confirmation of that, but I cannot find hardly any country in Europe that believes it is a good settlement for them. Germany, we understand, has rejected the proposals, as has France. Spain says this is a good deal for the UK but for no one else. Poland and Hungary have rejected it. The only country to have shown any support for it is Luxembourg, because they came up with the previous proposal which, as you said, is not very far removed that what is being proposed now.

If that is the current situation, First Minister, I do not understand or share your optimism that Tony Blair's proposals will find favour on the Continent, and it is easy to see why they do not appeal to those countries. As you suggested, the total budget has been set too low. It is 17 per cent lower than the commission's proposals, as you say. There have been cuts in the funding available for new members to help with their development. One issue which you did not mention in your statement, but which is referred to in the Government's proposals, is that there will be significant cuts in the rural development budget. You will be aware, of course, of the importance of that funding to a country such as Wales, which is highly dependent on such assistance because of our landscape and because so many of our farms are upland

ar dir uchel.

Is it not the case, First Minister, when you consider this particular set of proposals, that Tony Blair has pitched it far too low? He has done nothing for months, and now he comes up with these proposals at the last minute. Is it not the case that the German statement today is probably right, and that Tony Blair has to withdraw these proposals and produce a more realistic set if we are to secure convergence Objective moneys from 2007 onwards? The current set of proposals does not form the basis of agreement and Tony Blair has to be far more realistic if you and I are to succeed in securing for Wales its fair share of structural funds in the next round.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ceisio deall beth yw ymateb Plaid Cymru, a'ch ymateb arweinydd yr wrthblaid, i'r cynigion hyn, nid dehongli yr hyn y mae'r Almaen, Ffrainc neu Wlad Pwyl yn meddwl amdanynt. Os yw'r cynigion hyn i'w troi yn realiti yn yr uwch-gynhadledd, a gytunwch y byddant o les i Gymru? Nid bargeinio ar ran yr Almaen yr ydym, ond yn ceisio taro bargin a fydd o les i Gymru.

Rhoddyd y set o gynigion hyn o flaen y gwledydd eraill ddydd Llun ac y mae llai na phythefnos cyn i'r uwch-gynhadledd ddechrau. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o waith paratoadol wedi'i wneud gan y swyddogion perthnasol ar draws brif ddinasoedd Ewrop, yn swyddfeydd y Llywodraethau. Y mae'r swyddogion hynny wedi briffio y Gweinidogion sydd yn arbenigo mewn materion Ewropeaidd, a byddent yn ymwybodol o'r hyn yr oedd yn debygol o ymddangos. Felly, os oes modd taro bargin ar gefn y cynigion hyn, a fyddant o les i Gymru? Dyna'r cwestiwn i ni. Ni chlywais chi, Ieuan, fel arweinydd yr wrthblaid, yn dweud nad oeddech yn cytuno y byddent o les i Gymru. Os nad ydych yn credu hynny, iawn. Wedyn, gallich ddweud bod cynigion gan yr Almaen a fyddai efallai o fwy o les i ni, ond nid ydych wedi dweud hynny, felly nid wyf yn gwybod dros beth yr ydych yn ceisio dadlau.

I have a fundamental disagreement here, in trying to work out what the leader of the

farms.

Onid yw'n wir dweud, Brif Weinidog, o ystyried y gyfres benodol hon o gynigion, fod Tony Blair wedi gofyn am lawer rhy ychydig? Nid yw wedi gwneud dim ers misoedd, ac yn awr mae'n cyflwyno'r cynigion hyn ar y funud olaf. Onid yw'n wir fod datganiad yr Almaen heddiw yn debygol o fod yn gywir, a bod yn rhaid i Tony Blair dynnu'r cynigion hyn yn ôl a chynhyrchu rhai mwy realistic os ydym i sicrhau arian Amcan wedi'i gydgyfeirio o 2007 ymlaen? Nid yw'r set bresennol o gynigion yn sail i gytundeb, a rhaid i Tony Blair fod lawer yn fwy realistic os ydych chi a minnau i lwyddo i sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael ei chyfran deg o gronfeydd strwythurol yn y cylch nesaf.

**The First Minister:** I am trying to understand what Plaid Cymru's response, and your response as leader of the opposition, is to these proposals. I am not trying to interpret what Germany, France or Poland think of them. If these proposals become reality in the summit, do you agree that they will be of benefit to Wales? We are not bargaining on behalf of Germany, but trying to strike the best deal for Wales.

This set of proposals was placed before the other countries on Monday, and there is less than a fortnight before the summit is due to begin. However, a great deal of preparatory work has been done by the relevant officials in Government offices across the European capitals. Those officials have briefed the Ministers who specialise in European issues, and they would be aware of what was likely to appear. Therefore, if a bargain can be struck on the back of these proposals, will they benefit Wales? That is the question for us. I did not hear you, Ieuan, as the leader of the opposition, say that you did not agree that they would benefit Wales. If you do not think so, fine. You could then say that there are proposals by Germany which would perhaps be more beneficial to us. But you have not said that, so I do not know what you are trying to argue for.

Yr wyf yn anghytuno'n sylfaenol yma, wrth geisio gweithio allan beth mae arweinydd yr

opposition is saying. I am saying, quite openly, that these proposals would be good for Wales. They would be good for Wales because they involve us having a substantial equivalent Objective 1 programme, although it will not be called that, and some minor programmes outside the Objective 1 area. If they can be agreed in December, then we would be eligible for Objective 1 for two-thirds of the population of Wales. Therefore, I can see no way in which one could describe these proposals as anything other than ones to which we should be giving strong support. I look to you to consider the best interests of Wales. Rather than trying to interpret what the German or French Governments are saying, state whether you support these, and whether you will put your shoulder to the wheel and say, 'Let us go for it and let us see if we can do a deal on this basis because it would be good for Wales.'

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** I think you mean Nick Bourne, Llywydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am sorry.

**Nick Bourne:** Glyn is speaking on the budget.

I thank the First Minister for making this statement, which we requested. First, I will refer to his obvious optimism about these proposals. We cannot divorce the attitude of other countries from whether or not we will support these proposals. Every other member state—even allowing for some negotiation posturing, which is accepted as part of what happens—has said that these proposals are unacceptable, including Luxembourg, which has stated that more of the rebate would have to be on offer before it would row in behind these proposals. Even if we were to form a strategic alliance with Luxembourg, we would need a little more support. It is all very well asking, 'Do you support these or not?' but if every other member state out of the 25 does not support them, it does not matter.

wrthblaid yn ei ddweud. Yr wyf yn dweud, yn ddigon agored, y byddai'r cynigion hyn o fudd i Gymru. Byddent o fudd i Gymru am eu bod yn golygu y byddem yn cael rhaglen Amcan 1 gyfatebol fawr, er na chaiff ei galw'n hynny, a rhai rhaglenni bach y tu allan i'r ardal Amcan 1. Os gellir cytuno ar y rhain ym mis Rhagfyr, yna byddwn yn gymwys i gael Amcan 1 ar gyfer dwy ran o dair o boblogaeth Cymru. Felly, ni welaf unrhyw ffordd y gellid disgrifio'r cynigion hyn fel unrhyw beth heblaw rhai y dylem eu cefnogi'n gadarn. Galwaf arnoch i ystyried lles Cymru. Yn hytrach na cheisio dadansoddi'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth yr Almaen neu Lywodraeth Ffrainc yn ei ddweud, dywedwch a ydych yn cefnogi'r rhain, ac a fyddwch yn torchi llewys a dweud, 'Beth am roi cynnig arni a gweld a allwn ddod i gytundeb ar y sail hon oherwydd y byddai o fudd i Gymru.'

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** Credaf mai Nick Bourne yr ydych yn ei feddwl, Llywydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

**Nick Bourne:** Glyn sy'n siarad am y gyllideb.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Prif Weinidog am wneud y datganiad hwn yr oeddem wedi gofyn amdano. I ddechrau, cyfeiriaf at ei optimistiaeth amlwg ynghylch y cynigion hyn. Ni allwn anwybyddu agwedd gwledydd eraill wrth benderfynu a fyddwn yn cefnogi'r cynigion hyn neu beidio. Mae pob aelod wladwriaeth arall—hyd yn oed gan ganiatáu rhywfaint o smalio trafod, a dderbynir fel rhan o'r hyn sy'n digwydd—wedi dweud bod y cynigion hyn yn annerbyniol, gan gynnwys Lwcsembwrg, sydd wedi dweud y byddai'n rhaid cynnig mwy o'r ad-daliad cyn y byddai'n cefnogi'r cynigion hyn. Hyd yn oed pe baem yn ffurffio cynghrair strategol gyda Lwcsembwrg, byddai angen inni gael ychydig mwy o gefnogaeth. Mae'n ddigon hawdd gofyn, 'A ydych yn cefnogi'r rhain neu beidio?' Ond os nad yw pob aelod wladwriaeth arall o'r 25 yn eu cefnogi, nid oes gwahaniaeth.

The Prime Minister said, as recently as in June, that the UK rebate would remain and that he would not negotiate it away. He is now in the process of doing so. More recently, he said that he would put it on the table if there were some fundamental reform of the CAP, but it is not part of this deal. There is a great danger that the rebate being salami-sliced away. You said that you would not negotiate it, but it is on the table and other member states are saying that they need a bit more of it. It is a negotiating error. The First Minister was right to say in his statement that we in Wales cannot be insulated from the effects of public spending and tax-take in the rest of the UK. Therefore, the surrender of part of the rebate will have implications for public spending. I do not know whether the First Minister has any indication of what it would mean in terms of public spending if this was lopped off, or what the Barnett consequential would be in Wales. I would welcome him trying to address that, even in ball-park terms, because it would have an effect.

The negotiations should achieve three things: the reform of CAP, and there is no talk of that; the rebate being kept intact unless there is reform of CAP, and that is not the case here; and the preservation of Wales's position in relation to Objective 1 funding, or convergence funding as it will become, in the next round. If this is not settled in the UK presidency, which looks possible—I would say it is likely—what will be the effect in the new presidency, that of Austria, of settling on the basis of the new Eurostat figures? How much less will we get in Wales? Again, I am happy to have ball-park terms, as I appreciate that that will depend on the level of the overall budget. What will be the impact on Wales of reaching a settlement later than at the end of 2005, because that is what we are beginning to look at?

**The First Minister:** I would like to correct an expression that both you and Ieuan used. You said that I am optimistic. I support these proposals, but that is not the same as saying that I am optimistic about them being

Dyweddodd Prif Weinidog y DU, mor ddiweddar â mis Mehefin, y byddai ad-daliad y DU yn parhau ac na fyddai'n cael gwared arno yn sgîl trafod. Bellach mae wrthi yn gwneud hynny. Yn fwy diweddar, dywedodd y byddai'n barod i'w drafod pe bai rhyw ddiwygio sylfaenol ar y PAC, ond nid yw'n rhan o'r cytundeb hwn. Mae perygl mawr fod yr ad-daliad yn cael ei leihau'n raddol. Yr oeddech yn dweud na fyddes yn ei drafod, ond mae hynny yn digwydd ac mae aelod wladwriaethau eraill yn dweud bod angen iddynt gael ychydig mwy ohono. Camgymeriad trafod yw hyn. Yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn gywir wrth ddweud yn ei ddatganiad na allwn ni yng Nghymru ddianc rhag effeithiau gwariant cyhoeddus ac incwm trethi yng ngweddill y DU. Felly, bydd ildio rhan o'r ad-daliad yn cael goblygiadau ar wariant cyhoeddus. Ni wn a oes gan y Prif Weinidog syniad o'r hyn a olygai mewn gwariant cyhoeddus pe bae'n cael ei docio, neu beth fyddai'r symiau canlyniadol dan fformiwlau Barnett yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn falch o'i weld yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â hynny, hyd yn oed yn gyffredinol, oherwydd byddai'n cael effaith.

Dylai'r trafodaethau gyflawni tri pheth: diwygio'r PAC, ac nid oes unrhyw sôn am hynny; cadw'r ad-daliad fel y mae oni chaiff y PAC ei ddiwygio, ac nid yw hynny'n wir yma; a chadw sefyllfa Cymru mewn perthynas ag arian Amcan 1, neu arian cydgyfeirio fel y caiff ei alw yn y dyfodol, yn ystod y cylch nesaf. Os na chaiff hyn ei benderfynu yn ystod llywyddiaeth y DU, sy'n ymddangos yn bosibl—byddwn yn dweud ei fod yn debygol—beth fydd yr effaith, yn ystod llywyddiaeth newydd Awstria, o gytuno ar sail y ffigurau Eurostat newydd? Faint yn llai a gawn yng Nghymru? Eto, yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn ffigurau cyffredinol, gan fy mod yn sylweddoli y bydd hynny'n dibynnu ar lefel y gyllideb gyfan. Beth fydd effaith ar Gymru o ddod i gytundeb yn ddiweddaach na diwedd 2005, oherwydd dyna'r sefyllfa sy'n dechrau dod yn amlwg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hoffwn gywiro ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd gennych chi ac Ieuan. Yr oeddech yn dweud fy mod yn optimistaidd. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r cynigion hyn, ond nid yw hynny yr un fath â dweud fy mod yn

accepted. I think that the odds are 50:50. I am slightly less pessimistic than I was a few weeks ago, because the proposals have been heavily trailed at official level and, more recently, at prime ministerial level. There will be a furious series of meetings going on now. However, I would not put it at higher than 50:50 that a deal will be done on 15, 16 or 17 December. One will always yo-yo between optimism and pessimism in the run-up to a summit meeting. There is always grandstanding and posturing. However, as I am about Ieuan, I am concerned about the paradoxical way in which you approach this. You quote, with approval, foreign Governments saying that the UK must give up more of the rebate. However, you then say that Tony Blair must not give up any of the rebate. Which way do you want it? You cannot have both of these propositions in your argument if you want to have any kind of consistency.

Under these proposals—and this is why I ask for your support—the amount of the UK rebate will continue to rise. I presume that you want the rebate to rise; other countries want it to fall. Under these proposals, the rebate will continue to rise. However, it will not rise as rapidly as it would if we were not willing to try to reach an agreement with the new member states that, if they accept a change in the terms for structural funds, Britain will give up that part of the rebate that is attributable to payments that would come across through EU funds from the 10 new member states into the UK—not from the 14 existing member states, but from the 10 new member states. That is a perfectly rational approach to easing forward the proposition for enlargement. I do not think that you are right to say that Tony Blair is proposing anything that is inconsistent with the proposition that you would only give away any other part of the rebate—not the rebate that will be payable by the Poles, the Hungarians, the Slovaks and the Estonians, let us say, but the rebate that is paid by the other 14 existing member states—in return for reform of the common agricultural policy. The proposition involves an agreement to review the present spending plans, and that

optimistaidd y byddant yn cael eu derbyn. Cael a chael fydd hi, yn fy marn i. Yr wyf ychydig yn llai pesimistaidd nag oeddwn ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, gan fod swyddogion wedi rhoi llawer o sylw iddynt, ac yn fwy diweddar mae Prif Weinidog y DU wedi rhoi sylw iddynt. Mae cyfres wylt o gyfarfodydd yn mynd ymlaen ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai cael a chael fydd hi y deuir i gytundeb ar 15, 16 neu 17 Rhagfyr. Bydd dyn yn amrywio'n barhaus rhwng optimistiaeth a phesimistaeth yn ystod y cyfnod cyn cyfarfod uwchgynhadledd. Mae yna enghreifftiau o dynnu sylw a smalio bob amser. Fodd bynnag, fel wyf yn pryeru am Ieuan, yr wyf yn pryeru am y ffordd baradocsaid yr ydych chi'n ymdrin â hyn. Fe ddyfynnwch, gyda chymeradwyaeth, Lywodraethau tramor sy'n dweud ei bod yn rhaid i'r DU ildio mwy o'r ad-daliad. Fodd bynnag, dywedwch wedyn na ddylai Tony Blair ildio unrhyw ran o'r ad-daliad. Pa un sy'n wir? Ni allwch gynnwys y ddau gynnig hyn yn eich dadl os ydych am gael unrhyw fath o gysondeb.

Dan y cynigion hyn—a dyna pam yr wyf yn gofyn am eich cefnogaeth—bydd ad-daliad y DU yn dal i godi. Cymeraf eich bod am weld yr ad-daliad yn codi; mae gwledydd eraill am iddo ostwng. Dan y cynigion hyn, bydd yr ad-daliad yn dal i godi. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn codi mor gyflym ag a fyddai pe na byddem yn barod i geisio dod i gytundeb â'r aelod wladwriaethau newydd, sef, os byddant yn derbyn newid yn y telerau ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol, y bydd Prydain yn ildio'r rhan honno o'r ad-daliad sydd i'w phriodoli i daliadau a fyddai'n dod drwy gronfeydd yr UE o'r 10 o aelod wladwriaethau newydd i'r DU—nid o'r 14 o aelod wladwriaethau presennol, ond o'r 10 o aelod wladwriaethau newydd. Mae'n ddull hollol resymol o gyflwyno'r cynnig ar gyfer ehangu yn raddol. Ni chredaf eich bod yn gywir wrth ddweud bod Tony Blair yn cynnig dim byd sy'n anghyson â'r cynnig mai dim ond unrhyw ran arall o'r ad-daliad y byddech yn ei hildio—nid yr ad-daliad a fydd yn daladwy gan y Pwyliaid, yr Hwngariaid, y Slofaciaid a'r Estoniaid, dyweder, ond yr ad-daliad a delir gan y 14 o aelod wladwriaethau presennol eraill—yn gyfnewid am ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mae'r cynnig yn cynnwys cytundeb i adolygu'r cynlluniau

would take effect from 1 January 2014. You could say that the remainder of the British rebate will be on the table at the same time and in the same proportions for reform of the common agricultural policy. That is exactly what the proposition before us is based on.

If there is agreement in December—and this is why I asked the Assembly to support these proposals; although we will not put it to the vote today, I believe that it is appropriate that people should express their support for the UK presidency proposals—it would mean that two-thirds of Wales would continue to be eligible for something similar to today's Objective 1 programme at fairly similar levels of funding, although you can never be sure about the exact details of that, and there would be much less funding available outside of Objective 1 Wales than there is at present. That is how it is going at present.

If agreement is not reached in December our chances would be much less. Any undermining of the UK presidency case that causes other countries to think that if they were to delay the process they might get a better deal out of the UK in terms of a bigger trade-in of the rebate, would not be in Wales's best interests. I ask you to bear that in mind.

**Michael German:** I hope that the First Minister will not charge us in the opposition with trying to delay agreement on the budget, and try to put the blame on us. It is not our job; it is your job, First Minister, to say that you have done the best job for Wales and have done your best with the Prime Minister to get the best deal for Wales. It is for us to judge you on whether that task has been carried out most effectively. That is why these questions have been asked here today. I will judge this on a simple matter: does this offer on the table from Tony Blair mean more money into Wales, or more money out of Wales? On the basis of the information that you have given us today, we cannot make that judgment. I asked you the question yesterday: how much we would lose from the rebate's being traded off and how much would we gain by the 10 per cent reduction, or whatever is proposed? Where is the net gain in this matter? I still want you to answer

gwariant presennol, a byddai hynny'n dod i rym o 1 Ionawr 2014. Gallech ddweud y bydd gweddill ad-daliad Prydain yn cael ei drafod ar yr un pryd ac i'r un graddau ag ar gyfer diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Dyna'n union y mae'r cynnig sydd o'n blaenau wedi ei seilio arno.

Os ceir cytundeb ym mis Rhagfyr—a dyna pam y gofynnais i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r cynigion hyn, ac er na fyddwn yn pleidleisio arnynt heddiw, credaf ei bod yn briodol i bobl ddangos eu cefnogaeth i gynigion llywyddiaeth y DU—byddai'n golygu y byddai dwy ran o dair o Gymru yn dal i fod yn gymwys i gael rhywbeth tebyg i raglen Amcan 1 heddiw ar lefel ariannu gymharol debyg, er na allwch byth fod yn siŵr am union fanylion hynny. A byddai llawer llai o arian ar gael y tu allan i Gymru Amcan 1 nag sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Dyna'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd.

Os na ddeur i gytundeb ym mis Rhagfyr, bydd ein siawns lawer yn llai. Ni fyddai'n llesol i Gymru pe bae unrhyw danseilio ar lywyddiaeth y DU i beri i wledydd eraill greded, pe byddent yn gohirio'r broses, y gallent gael bargin well gan y DU o ran ildio mwy o'r ad-daliad. Gofynnaf ichi gofio hynny.

**Michael German:** Gobeithio na fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ein cyhuddo ni yn y gwrthbleidiau o geisio gohirio cytuno ar y gyllideb, gan geisio rhoi'r bai arnom ni. Nid ein cyfrifoldeb ni ond eich cyfrifoldeb chi, Brif Weinidog, yw dweud eich bod wedi gwneud eich gorau dros Gymru ac wedi gwneud eich gorau gyda Phrif Weinidog y DU i gael y cytundeb gorau i Gymru. Ein lle ni yw barnu a yw'r gwaith hwnnw wedi ei wneud yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Dyna pam y gofynnwyd y cwestiynau hyn yma heddiw. Byddaf yn barnu hyn ar sail mater syml: a yw'r cynnig hwn gan Tony Blair yn golygu y daw mwy o arian i Gymru, neu y bydd Cymru yn colli mwy o arian? Ar sail y wybodaeth a roesoch inni heddiw, ni allwn wneud penderfyniad. Gofynnais y cwestiwn ddoe: faint y byddem yn ei golli pe cai'r ad-daliad ei ildio, a faint y byddem ar ein hennill yn sgil y gostyngiad o 10 y cant, neu beth bynnag a gynigir? Ble mae'r budd net yn y

that question.

You say that this is a good result, and I will ask you a few questions on that. Basically, the UK Government is saying that this budget will come to 1 per cent of the gross national income at the end of the process, rather than at the beginning, and, therefore, we will achieve our reduction in the budget right throughout by getting it at the end of the period.

There are a number of questions relating to match funding, because that also matters to Wales. I have been told—and I ask you to confirm this—that the reduction in match funding for the 10 new member states would not apply to the UK or to Wales. Therefore, Wales would have to find the same level of match funding that it has to find now, but that would not be the case for the new member states. I would be grateful if you would confirm that that is the case.

I also understand that the UK Government is proposing that there should be no change in the level of budget for statistically-affected regions. If this budget were to be settled sometime into January or beyond, what would be the net difference? Would we benefit or not? We cannot tell that from the figures that are being presented to us today.

There is also the issue of rural development. I understand that a €7 billion cut in the rural development programme is on the table as part of the budget negotiations. That programme is important for rural Wales. Tir Gofal is a flagship programme and the money for that would be threatened by cuts to this programme. In addition, there are important grants for marketing and trade development in Wales that come from the rural development programme. The proposed €7 billion cut aside, he is saying that if you cannot find the money to support the rural development programme you can take the money from the direct subsidies that are provided for farmers. That is another potential shift being proposed by the Government.

Until we have an answer as to whether this is

mater hwn? Yr wyf am ichi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw o hyd.

Dyweddch fod hwn yn ganlyniad da, ac fe ofynnaf rai cwestiynau ichi am hynny. Yn y bôn, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn dweud y bydd y gyllideb hon yn cyfateb i 1 y cant o'r incwm gwladol crynswth ar ddiwedd y broses, yn hytrach nag ar y dechrau, ac felly byddwn yn sicrhau ein gostyngiad yn y gyllideb drwy gydol y broses drwy ei gael ar ddiwedd y cyfnod.

Mae yna nifer o gwestiynau ynglŷn ag arian cyfatebol, gan fod hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i Gymru. Dywedwyd wrthyf—a gofynnaf ichi gadarnhau hyn—na fyddai'r gostyngiad mewn arian cyfatebol i'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd yn berthnasol i'r DU nac i Gymru. Felly, byddai'n rhaid i Gymru ddod o hyd i'r un arian cyfatebol ag y mae'n rhaid iddi ei gael yn awr, ond ni fyddai hynny'n wir i'r aelod wladwriaethau newydd. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech gadarnhau bod hynny'n wir.

Deallaf hefyd fod Llywodraeth y DU yn cynnig na ddylid newid y gyllideb ar gyfer rhanbarthau yr effeithir arnynt yn ystadegol o gwbl. Pe cytunid ar y gyllideb hon rywbryd yn ystod mis Ionawr neu wedi hynny, beth fyddai'r gwahaniaeth net? A fyddem yn elwa neu beidio? Ni allwn ddweud hynny o'r ffigurau a gyflwynir inni heddiw.

Mae yna fater datblygu gwledig hefyd. Deallaf fod toriad o €7 biliwn yn y rhaglen datblygu gwledig yn cael ei drafod fel rhan o'r trafodaethau ar y gyllideb. Mae'r rhaglen honno'n bwysig i gefn gwlad Cymru. Mae Tir Gofal yn rhaglen flaenllaw, a byddai toriadau yn y rhaglen datblygu gwledig yn golygu y byddai'r arian ar gyfer y rhaglen honno o dan fygythiad. Hefyd, mae yna grantiau pwysig ar gyfer marchnata a datblygu masnach yng Nghymru sy'n dod o'r rhaglen datblygu gwledig. Heb ystyried y toriad arfaethedig o €7 biliwn, mae'n dweud os na allwch ddod o hyd i'r arian i gefnogi'r rhaglen datblygu gwledig y gallwch gymryd yr arian o'r cymorthdaliadau uniongyrchol a ddarperir ar gyfer ffermwyr. Mae hynny'n newid posibl arall a gynigir gan y Llywodraeth.

Nes inni gael ateb i'w cwestiwn a yw hyn yn

a better deal for rural Wales, and until we have an answer to the question about whether there will be more money going out of the door, or coming in through the door, I cannot give you a commitment that my party will be able to support these negotiations and the proposals put on the table by the Prime Minister. We want a clear set of figures before us, and I ask you to tell us whether these proposals will mean more money in through the door or out through the door.

**The First Minister:** First, a correction. You described it as a result. It is not a result, but a set of proposals that is now being passed around the other European countries. The point that I was making to Ieuan and Nick was that they should not to quote with approval the views of the other countries as a way of trying to knock either the integrity of the proposals that the UK presidency has made, or the likelihood of getting them through. Almost all of those involve a reduction in the UK rebate much bigger than that which Tony Blair has put on the table in order to stop the UK rebate being paid by the 10 new member states, which are far more poor than we are.

3.30 p.m.

That is the point that I am trying to make. In this set of proposals, for instance, you make a point about a reduction in match funding for the 10 new member states' access to structural funds. That is part of the proposals. That is in return for a lower amount of structural funds. In other words, you will have a reduction in the amount of structural funds going to the 10 new member states, but you will make the terms on which it can be spent much less onerous in terms of the decommitment rules and the match funding. Neither of those two propositions would apply to those areas eligible for structural funds in the existing 15 member states. There is no reduction, but also no change in the match funding terms. That is the basis of the proposal.

It does not involve the UK or Wales getting off scot-free with what we might have liked. Every country would like the rule to be that every other member state pays for everything and that we get all the receipts, and do not

gytundeb gwell i gefn gwlad Cymru, a nes inni gael ateb i'r cwestiwn a fydd mwy o arian yn mynd allan, neu'n dod i mewn, ni allaf roi ymrwymiad ichi y bydd fy mhlaid yn gallu cefnogi'r trafodaethau hyn a'r cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan Brif Weinidog y DU. Yr ydym am gael set glir o ffigurau o'n blaenau, a gofynnaf ichi ddweud wrthym a fydd y cynigion hyn yn golygu y bydd mwy o arian yn dod i mewn neu'n mynd allan.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, cywiriad. Yr oeddech yn disgrifio hyn fel canlyniad. Nid yw'n ganlyniad, ond yn set o gynigion sy'n cael eu trafod gan wledydd eraill Ewrop. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud wrth Ieuan a Nick oedd na ddylent ddyfynnu safbwytiau'r gwledydd eraill gyda chymeradwyaeth fel ffordd i geisio beirniadu cywirdeb y cynigion a wnaed gan lywyddiaeth y DU, na'r tebygolwydd y caint eu pasio. Mae bron pob un o'r rhain yn cynnwys gostyngiad yn ad-daliad y DU sydd lawer yn fwy nag a gyflwynwyd gan Tony Blair er mwyn atal ad-daliad y DU rhag cael ei dalu gan y 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd, sydd lawer yn dlotach na ni.

Dyna'r pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud. Yn y set hon o gynigion, er enghraifft, gwnewch bwynt am ostyngiad mewn arian cyfatebol er mwyn rhoi hawl i'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd gael cronyfeydd strwythurol. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r cynigion. Mae hynny'n gyfnewid am swm is o arian strwythurol. Mewn geiriau eraill, bydd gostyngiad yn swm y cronyfeydd strwythurol a ddyrennir i'r deg aelod wladwriaeth newydd, ond byddwch yn gwneud y telerau ar gyfer ei wario lawer yn llai beichus o ran y rheolau dadneilltuo a'r arian cyfatebol. Ni fyddai'r naill gynnig hwn na'r llall yn berthnasol yn yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n gymwys i gael cronyfeydd strwythurol yn y 15 aelod wladwriaeth bresennol. Nid oes gostyngiad, ond nid oes newid ychwaith yn nhelerau'r arian cyfatebol. Dyna yw sail y cynig.

Nid yw'n golygu bod y DU na Chymru yn cael dianc yn ddi-gosb gyda'r hyn y byddem efallai wedi ei ddymuno. Byddai pob gwlad yn dymuno i'r rheol ddweud bod pob aelod wladwriaeth arall yn talu am bofeth a'n bod

pay for anything. We know that that is utterly unrealistic. When you compare it with today's seven-year financial perspective, there is clearly a sharing of pay. I will try to get you further details on what this could mean in terms of the rural development plan cuts and what is proposed there.

However, on what would happen if the rebate were traded away, which is not part of these proposals, except for that bit of the rebate paid by the 10 new member states, if the rebate disappeared altogether by 2014, you would be talking about a loss of £4.7 billion out of UK public expenditure. In terms of Welsh public expenditure, which is around 6 per cent of UK public expenditure, that would be £240 million or £250 million less per year. That would be far greater than any expectation of receipts. That is a simple mathematical proposition, but there is no proposal to do that. However, it could happen in return for major changes in the CAP. We will know more about that, as what is being expected is in return for a commitment to talk about the rebate with the CAP reform. That will apply in the next financial perspective, namely 2014-21.

**Janet Davies:** You said that you will respond to Mike German on the rural development reductions, and I too would be grateful to see that. I also raise the issue of the reduction under subheading 3 on freedom, security and justice, of €0.7 billion, which will affect youth, culture and media. Could you comment on how that is likely to affect Wales?

**The First Minister:** I will have to write to you on that.

ni'n cael yr holl dderbyniadau heb dalu am ddim. Gwyddom fod hynny'n hollol afrealistig. Pan gymharwch hynny â'r perspectif ariannol saith mlynedd heddiw, mae'n amlwg fod yna rannu tâl. Ceisiaf gael rhagor o fanylion ichi am yr hyn y gallai hynny ei olygu o ran toriadau'r cynllun datblygu gwledig a'r hyn a gynigir yno.

Fodd bynnag, o ran beth fyddai'n digwydd pe bai'r ad-daliad yn cael ei ildio, nad yw'n rhan o'r cynigion hyn, heblaw am y rhan o'r ad-daliad a delir gan y deg aelod wladwriaeth newydd, pe bai'r ad-daliad yn diflannu'n llwyr erbyn 2014 byddech yn sôn am golli £4.7 biliwn o wariant cyhoeddus yn y DU. O ran gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, sef tua chwech y cant o wariant cyhoeddus yn y DU, byddai hynny tua £240 miliwn neu £250 miliwn yn llai y flwyddyn. Byddai hynny lawer yn fwy nag unrhyw dderbyniadau a ddisgwylid. Mae hynny'n gynnig mathemategol syml, ond nid oes cynnig i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallai ddigwydd yn gyfnewid am newidiadau mawr yn y PAC. Cawn wybod mwy am hynny, oherwydd mae'r hyn a ddisgwylir yn gyfnewid am ymrwymiad i siarad am yr ad-daliad gyda diwygio'r PAC. Bydd hynny'n berthnasol yn y perspectif ariannol nesaf, sef 2014-21.

**Janet Davies:** Dywedwch y byddwch yn ymateb i Mike German ynglŷn â gostyngiadau yn y cynllun datblygu gwledig, a byddwn i hefyd yn falch o weld hynny. Codaf hefyd y mater ynglŷn â'r gostyngiad dan is-bennawd 3 am ryddid, diogelwch a chyflawnder, sef €0.7 biliwn, a fydd yn effeithio ar ieuenctid, diwylliant a'r cyfryngau. A allwch roi eich sylwadau am y ffordd y mae hynny'n debygol o effeithio ar Gymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hynny.

**Sefydlu'r Ymchwiliad Cyhoeddus, Penodi Cadeirydd yr Ymchwiliad,  
Dirprwyo'r Swyddogaethau sy'n Weddill o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 i'r  
Prif Weinidog, a Nodi Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar yr Ymchwiliad i'r Achosion  
E.coli yng Nghymru**

**Establishment of the Public Inquiry, Appointment of the Chair of the Inquiry,  
Delegation of the Remaining Functions under the Inquiries Act 2005 to the First  
Minister, and Noting the Report of the Committee on the Inquiry into the E.coli  
Outbreaks in Wales**

**Jocelyn Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*notes the report of the Committee on the Inquiry into the Outbreaks of E.coli in Wales,  
which was laid in the Table Office on 30 November 2005. (NDM2747)*

I propose this motion as the Chair of the Committee on the Inquiry into the E.coli Outbreaks in Wales.

The outbreak of E.coli was first discovered in the south Wales valleys on 16 September. Within a week, 150 cases had been diagnosed, and, sadly, on 4 October, the death of five-year-old Mason Jones was reported. By the end of last week, the total number of cases in this outbreak was 159. On 5 October, the Assembly established a committee, under Standing Order No. 8.1, to consider the terms of reference and conditions for an inquiry under the Inquiries Act 2005. This will be the first such inquiry. I thank the members of the committee for their co-operation in ensuring that the committee completed its task with such efficiency and goodwill.

We were tasked with recommending who should be appointed to chair the inquiry, and at our meeting on 7 November, the committee agreed that someone with expert knowledge of E.coli should be sought. Several names were considered, and we concluded that Professor Hugh Pennington should be asked by the Assembly to chair the inquiry panel. Professor Pennington agreed that his name should be put forward to the full Assembly. He attended our committee meeting on 17 November, as section 5.4 of the Inquiries Act 2005 requires the Assembly to consult the person it proposes to appoint

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar yr Ymchwiliad i'r Achosion E.coli yng Nghymru, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2747)*

Cynigiaf y cynnig hwn fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar yr Ymchwiliad i'r Achosion E.coli yng Nghymru.

Darganfuwyd yr achosion cyntaf o E.coli yng nghymoedd y de ar 16 Medi. Ymhen wythnos, yr oedd 150 o achosion wedi'u darganfod, ac yn anffodus ar 4 Hydref clywsom am farwolaeth Mason Jones, a oedd yn bum mlwydd oed. Erbyn diwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, 159 oedd cyfanswm yr achosion. Ar 5 Hydref, sefydlodd y Cynulliad bwyllgor, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, i ystyried y cylch gorchwyl a'r amodau ar gyfer ymchwiliad dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005. Dyma'r ymchwiliad cyntaf o'i fath. Yr wyf yn diolch i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu cydweithrediad i sicrhau bod y pwyllgor yn cwblhau ei dasg yn effeithlon a chydag ewyllys da.

Gofynnwyd inni argymhell pwy y dylid ei benodi i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad, ac yn ein cyfarfod ar 7 Tachwedd cytunodd y pwyllgor y dylid ceisio cael rhywun sydd â gwybodaeth arbenigol am E.coli. Ystyriwyd nifer o enwau, a daethom i'r casgliad y dylai'r Cynulliad ofyn i'r Athro Hugh Pennington gadeirio panel yr ymchwiliad. Cytunodd yr Athro Pennington y dylid cyflwyno ei enw gerbron y Cynulliad llawn. Daeth i gyfarfod ein pwyllgor ar 17 Tachwedd, gan fod adran 5.4 o Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Cynulliad ymgynghori a'r sawl y mae'n

about the inquiry's terms of reference.

We also consulted key organisations, including the governors of the schools affected, about what should be included in the terms of reference. There was consensus in the responses we received, and we considered whether these should be detailed in the terms of reference. Following consultation with Professor Pennington, and having regard to the advantages of having brief terms of reference, the committee concluded that the terms of reference should be as broad as possible so that the inquiry is as unfettered as possible. We recommend, therefore, that the terms of reference be those laid by the Business Minister in her motion: to inquire into the circumstances that led to the outbreak of E.coli 0157 infection in south Wales in September 2005, the handling of the outbreak, and to consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly.

We also considered the delegation of the functions under the Inquiries Act 2005 which may need to be exercised during the course of this inquiry. We took account of views expressed in previous debates in the Chamber, and of the fact that all the functions under the Inquiries Act 2005 rest with the Assembly as a whole. We felt that it might prove impractical for the Assembly as a whole, or a committee, to undertake most of the functions for establishing and facilitating the inquiry. We therefore recommend that the functions be delegated to the First Minister for the purposes of this specific inquiry only. I have confidence that he will not abuse the powers vested in him, as this inquiry has his full backing.

We have not commented in the report on when the inquiry should begin, but I see no reason why there should be undue delay. That said, a number of other inquiries, which are related to this outbreak, are under way. One of those is the investigation by South Wales Police, and care must be taken not to prejudice that inquiry in any way.

cynnig ei benodi ynglŷn â chylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad.

Buom yn ymgynghori hefyd â sefydliadau allweddol, gan gynnwys llywodraethwyr yr ysgolion yr effeithiwyd arnynt, ynglŷn â'r hyn y dylid ei gynnwys yn y cylch gorchwyl. Yr oedd consensws yn yr ymatebion a gawsom, ac ystyriwyd a ddylid manylu ar y rhain yn y cylch gorchwyl. Ar ôl ymgynghori â'r Athro Pennington, a chan ystyried manteision cylch gorchwyl byr, daeth y pwylgor i'r casgliad y dylai'r cylch gorchwyl fod mor eang â phosibl er mwyn i'r ymchwiliad fod mor ddilyffethair â phosibl. Argymhellwn, felly, mai'r cylch gorchwyl ddylai fod yr hyn a osodwyd i lawr gan y Trefnydd yn ei chynnig: cynnal ymchwiliad i'r amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at yr achosion E.coli 0157 yn ne Cymru ym mis Medi 2005, y ffodd yr ymdriniwyd â'r haint, ac ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny.

Buom hefyd yn ystyried dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 y gall fod angen eu harfer yn ystod yr ymchwiliad hwn. Ystyriwyd safbwytiau a fynegwyd mewn dadleuon blaenorol yn y Siambr, a'r ffaith mai'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol sy'n gyfrifol am yr holl swyddogaethau dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005. Yr oeddem o'r farn y gallai fod yn anymarferol i'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, neu i bwylgor, ymgymryd â'r rhan fwyaf o'r swyddogaethau ar gyfer sefydlu a hwyluso'r ymchwiliad. Felly, argymhellwyd y dylai'r swyddogaethau gael eu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog at ddibenion yr ymchwiliad penodol hwn yn unig. Yr wyf yn hyderus na fydd yn camddefnyddio'r pwerau a roddir iddo, gan ei fod yn cefnogi'r ymchwiliad hwn yn llawn.

Nid ydym wedi nodi yn yr adroddiad pryd y dylai'r ymchwiliad ddechrau, ond ni welaf unrhyw reswm dros oedi'n ormodol. Ar ôl dweud hynny, mae nifer o ymchwiliadau eraill yn mynd rhagddynt sy'n gysylltiedig â'r achosion hyn. Un o'r rheini yw'r ymchwiliad gan Heddlu De Cymru, a dylid sicrhau na chaiff yr ymchwiliad hwnnw ei beryglu mewn unrhyw ffordd.

On the matter of inquiry rules, we heard that section 41 of the Inquiries Act 2005 provides that the Assembly, as the appropriate authority, may make rules by statutory instrument dealing with matters of evidence, procedure, documentation, award of expenses and so on. These rules are not yet in place, but the Department for Constitutional Affairs is expected to consult soon on the rules that will apply to England. The Assembly has the option to adopt those rules if it so wishes. The committee decided not to make any recommendations about inquiry rules; if these rules are not in place when the inquiry commences, the chair can draft rules. Professor Pennington has told us that he does not envisage any insurmountable difficulties in this matter. I therefore endorse the motion before you today.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. acting in accordance with its powers under section 1 of the Inquiries Act 2005 causes an inquiry to be held into the outbreak of E.coli 0157 in south Wales in September 2005;*

*2. recommends that the terms of reference for the inquiry should be:*

*a) to inquire into the circumstances that led to the outbreak of E.coli 0157 infection in south Wales in September 2005 and into the handling of the outbreak; and*

*b) to consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly;*

*3. recommends that Professor Hugh Pennington be appointed to chair the inquiry; and*

*4. determines that the functions of the Assembly under the Inquiries Act 2005 which relate to the above inquiry and which are not exercised by this motion, be delegated to the First Minister in accordance with section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM2748)*

O ran rheolau'r ymchwiliad, clywsom fod adran 41 o Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn darparu y gall y Cynulliad, fel yr awdurdod priodol, wneud rheolau yn ôl offeryn statudol gan ddilio â materion tystiolaeth, gweithdrefn, dogfennaeth, dyfarnu treuliau, ac ati. Nid yw'r rheolau hyn ar waith eto, ond disgwyli'r Adran Materion Cyfansoddiadol ymgynghori'n fuan am y rheolau a fydd yn gymwys i Loegr. Gall y Cynulliad fabwysiadu'r rheolau hynny os mynn. Penderfynodd y pwylgor beidio â gwneud unrhyw argymhellion ynglŷn â rheolau'r ymchwiliad; os na fydd y rheolau hyn ar waith pan fydd yr ymchwiliad yn dechrau, gall y cadeirydd ddrafftio rheolau. Dywedodd yr Athro Pennington wrthym nad yw'n rhagweld unrhyw anawsterau amhosibl yn y mater hwn. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig sydd ger eich bron heddiw, felly.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. gan weithredu'n unol â'i bwerau dan adran 1 Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynnal ymchwiliad i'r achosion E.coli 0157 yn ne Cymru ym mis Medi 2005;*

*2. yn argymhell y dylai cylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad fod fel a ganlyn:*

*a) cynnal ymchwiliad i'r amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at yr achosion E.coli 0157 yn ne Cymru ym mis Medi 2005 ac i'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r haint; a*

*b) ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny;*

*3. yn argymhell penodi'r Athro Hugh Pennington i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad; a*

*4. yn penderfynu y dylid dirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 sy'n ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad uchod, ac nas arferir drwy'r cynnig hwn, i'r Prif Weinidog yn unol ag adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

(NDM2748)

**Jeff Cuthbert:** As a member of the committee, I have read carefully the evidence submitted during the committee's evidence-taking sessions. The committee consulted widely with experts to ensure that it put in place the appropriate terms of reference. I am glad that cross-party support has been secured in establishing the inquiry here today. The outbreak is, thankfully, not on the scale of the outbreak in Scotland in 1996, where, tragically, 18 people died. Nevertheless, the outbreak must lead to serious questions about the abidance to health and safety guidelines and the veracity of regulations currently in place. It is right and appropriate that the best judge on this issue should be the inquiry, taking detailed evidence in the field, and also taking evidence that flows from both the National Public Health Service for Wales and South Wales Police investigations.

I am confident that this inquiry, lead by Professor Pennington, will investigate the points of concern that many in the Chamber have raised. I am sure that many Members have questions about how this outbreak was handled. The issues of hazard analysis, critical control point systems and practices and hygiene in slaughterhouses and meat production premises are all important. Especially crucial will be the review of school food hygiene rules at point of consumption and the role of environmental health officers. School food and school kitchens, especially, should be beacons of best practice, and I am sure the inquiry will look into this issue. The recent 'Food For Thought' report brought out by the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, is an example of the excellent work already being done in wise food procurement by local authorities throughout Wales. This is also an illustration of policy changes that pre-date the outbreak and are now in the process of being implemented.

However, one point of concern that arose in the E.coli committee meetings was the exact role of Professor Pennington's last report into

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Fel aelod o'r pwylgor, yr wyf wedi darllen yn ofalus y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd yn ystod sesiynau cymryd dystiolaeth gan y pwylgor. Ymgynghorodd y pwylgor yn eang ag arbenigwyr i sicrhau ei fod yn rhoi'r cylch gorchwyl priodol ar waith. Yr wyf yn falch fod cefnogaeth wedi ei sicrhau ar draws y pleidiau er mwyn sefydlu'r ymchwiliad yma heddiw. Nid yw'r achosion, diolch byth, ar raddfa'r achosion yn yr Alban yn 1996, pan fu farw 18 o bobl, yn drasig iawn. Serch hynny, rhaid bod yr achosion yn gofyn cwestiynau difrifol ynglŷn â chadw at ganllawiau iechyd a diogelwch a geirwedd y rheoliadau sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n gywir ac yn briodol mai'r ymchwiliad ddylai benderfynu'r mater hwn, gan gymryd dystiolaeth fanwl yn y maes, a chymryd dystiolaeth hefyd a fydd yn deillio o ymchwiliadau Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru a Heddlu De Cymru.

Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn, dan arweiniad yr Athro Pennington, yn ymchwilio i'r pryderon y mae nifer yn y Siambr wedi'u mynegi. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod gan nifer o Aelodau gwestiynau am y modd yr ymdriniwyd â'r achosion hyn. Mae materion dadansoddi peryglon, systemau pwyntiau rheoli critigol ac arferion a hylendid mewn lladd-dai ac adeiladau cynhyrchu cig i gyd yn bwysig. Un peth arbennig o bwysig fydd yr adolygiad o reolau hylendid bwyd mewn ysgolion lle bydd plant yn bwyta, a'r rôl swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd. Dylai bwyd ysgol a cheginau ysgol, yn arbennig, fod yn esiamplau o arfer gorau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn ystyried y mater hwn. Mae'r adroddiad 'Food For Thought' a gyflwynwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefni Gwlad, yn enghraifft o'r gwaith ardderchog a wneir eisoes gan awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru i brynu bwyd yn ddoeth. Mae hyn hefyd yn enghraifft o newidiadau polisi a ddigwyddodd cyn yr achosion hyn ac sydd bellach yn y broses o gael eu gweithredu.

Fodd bynnag, un mater o bryder a gododd yng nghyfarfodydd y pwylgor E.coli oedd union rôl yr adroddiad diwethaf gan yr Athro

the Scottish outbreak in 1996. I would hope for a clear understanding among all those involved that the inquiry being established today is to deal with the most recent outbreak in the south Wales Valleys and with lessons for the future, not the details of a Scottish report that is now almost 10 years old.

Pennington ar yr achosion yn yr Alban yn 1996. Byddwn yn gobeithio cael dealltwriaeth glir ymhlieth pawb sy'n cymryd rhan mai diben yr ymchwiliad sy'n cael ei sefydlu heddiw yw ymdrin â'r achosion diweddaraf yng nghymoedd y de, ac â'r gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol, nid â manylion adroddiad yr Alban, sydd bellach bron yn 10 mlwydd oed.

3.40 p.m.

It is crucial for the inquiry to be carried out in an inclusive but sensitive manner. There is a strong culture of accountability in Wales that must be maintained. However, many families, including children, will have to be interviewed, and there must be a fine balance between the demands of the modern media and the justifiable rights of families to privacy. The inquiry must get the balance right between transparency and privacy. A public inquiry is essential, but I am confident that no-one in the Chamber or elsewhere would desire a public spectacle where a rush for information would lead to a diminution of the accuracy and precision of the inquiry's recommendations. This is particularly important given the tragic death of young Mason Jones from Deri, near Bargoed in the Caerphilly borough.

Mae'n bwysig i'r ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal mewn ffordd gynhwysol ond sensitif. Mae yna ddiwylliant cadarn o atebolrwydd yng Nghymru y mae'n rhaid ei gynnal. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid cael cyfweliad â nifer o deuluoedd, gan gynnwys plant, a rhaid sicrhau cydbwysedd cywir rhwng galwadau'r cyfryngau modern a hawliau cyflawn teuluoedd i gael preifatrwydd. Rhaid i'r ymchwiliad sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng eglurder a phreifatrwydd. Mae ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn hanfodol, ond yr wyf yn hyderus na fyddai neb yn y Siambr nac yn unman arall am weld sioe gyhoeddus lle y byddai galw mawr am wybodaeth yn golygu llai o gywirdeb a manylder yn argymhellion yr ymchwiliad. Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig o gofio am farwolaeth drist y bachgen bach, Mason Jones o Deri, ger Bargod ym mwrdeistref Caerffili.

More than anything, the families touched by the outbreak want to ensure that no other families ever have to experience such events. That is why I hope that the inquiry will allow them a full role in the process at the appropriate stages. We have an active civic culture in Wales, and it would be wrong not to enable the families to be an integrated part of the inquiry and consultation process. I am confident that it is only a public inquiry of this nature, which seeks to get the balance right, that will deliver what we and the families affected so desperately want and deserve. I will follow the work of Professor Pennington and his inquiry very closely, and I look forward to a thorough and speedy investigation.

Yn anad dim, mae'r teuluoedd yr effeithiodd yr achosion arnynt am sicrhau na fydd unrhyw deuluoedd eraill byth yn gorfol cael profiad o ddigwyddiadau o'r fath. Dyna pam yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn rhoi rhan lawn iddynt yn y broses ar yr adegau priodol. Mae gennym ddiwylliant dinesig gweithredol yng Nghymru, a rhaid ceisio galluogi teuluoedd i fod yn rhan hanfodol o'r ymchwiliad a'r broses ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn hyderus mai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus fel hwn yn unig, sy'n ceisio sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir, fydd yn darparu'r hyn yr ydym ni a'r teuluoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt mor daer i'w weld ac yn ei haeddu. Byddaf yn cadw llygad manwl ar waith yr Athro Pennington a'i ymchwiliad, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ymchwiliad trylwyr a chyflym.

**Jonathan Morgan:** As a committee member, I thank Jocelyn Davies, the Chair, and the

**Jonathan Morgan:** Fel aelod o'r pwylgor, diolchaf i Jocelyn Davies, y Cadeirydd, a'r

clerk and deputy clerk, for the work that they did in putting the report together. More importantly, I thank those who gave up their time to provide evidence on what the terms of reference should be for the inquiry.

In fulfilling our responsibilities, we needed to appoint the right person to chair the public inquiry. Professor Hugh Pennington ticked all the right boxes. He is a microbiologist, he has huge experience of the political process, and he has undertaken an inquiry of this nature in the past. He clearly has a head start, and he will inspire a great deal of confidence among the families and communities affected by the dreadful outbreak. They can trust his judgment, his expertise and his independence from politicians to get to the heart of the problem, judge what caused the outbreak, and more importantly, make recommendations for us to consider. His 1996 inquiry will be an important factor. It is a substantial report that will inform this inquiry.

The terms of reference are simple. It is possible that we could have drafted the terms of reference without taking evidence, bearing in mind the simple nature of what we have suggested. However, the process of gathering the evidence was important in ensuring that people felt that they could contribute to a very important inquiry. The terms of reference are simple, but they allow scope for the chairman of the inquiry to pursue lines of investigation that he feels would be beneficial.

Importantly, the inquiry is concerned not only with finding out what went wrong, but with learning those lessons and with what the lessons will mean for public policy. It will then be up to the Assembly Government, and perhaps other authorities, to consider whether to accept the recommendations, what the cost of the recommendations will be, and how quickly they should be implemented. I hope that the Assembly Government and politicians on all sides of the Chamber will take the inquiry's recommendations seriously.

clerc a'r dirprwy glerc, am y gwaith a wnaethant i lunio'r adroddiad. Yn bwysicach, diolch i'r rheini a roddodd o'u hamser i ddarparu tystiolaeth am yr hyn y dylid ei gynnwys yn y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad.

Wrth gyflawni ein cyfrifoldebau, yr oedd angen inni benodi'r person cywir i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Yr oedd yr Athro Hugh Pennington yn bodloni pob un o'r meini prawf. Mae'n ficrobiolegydd, mae ganddo brofiad helaeth o'r broses wleidyddol, ac mae wedi cynnal ymchwiliad o'r natur hon yn y gorffennol. Mae'n amlwg fod ganddo fantais, a bydd yn enyn llawer iawn o hyder ymhllith y teuluoedd a'r cymunedau yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr achosion trychinebus hyn. Gallant ymddiried yn ei farn, ei arbenigedd a'r ffaith ei fod yn gweithredu'n annibynnol ar wleidyddion i fynd i wraidd y broblem, i benderfynu beth a arweiniodd at yr achosion, ac yn bwysicaf, i wneud argymhellion inni eu hastyried. Bydd ei ymchwiliad yn 1996 yn ffactor pwysig. Mae'n adroddiad sylweddol a fydd yn llywio'r ymchwiliad hwn.

Mae'r cylch gorchwyl yn syml. Hwyrach y gallem fod wedi drafftio'r cylch gorchwyl heb gymryd tystiolaeth, gan ystyried natur syml yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i awgrymu. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y broses o gasglu tystiolaeth yn bwysig er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn teimlo y gallent gyfrannu at ymchwiliad pwysig iawn. Mae'r cylch gorchwyl yn syml, ond mae'n gyfle i gadeirydd yr ymchwiliad ddilyn llinellau ymchwilio a fyddai'n fuddiol yn ei farn ef.

Yn bwysicaf, mae'r ymchwiliad yn ymwneud nid yn unig â darganfod yr hyn a aeth o'i le, ond â dysgu'r gwersi hynny a'r hyn y bydd y gwersi yn ei olygu ar gyfer polisi cyhoeddus. Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedyn, ac awdurdodau eraill efallai, fydd yn ystyried a ddylid derbyn yr argymhellion, beth fydd cost yr argymhellion, a pha mor gyflym y dylid eu gweithredu. Gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a gwleidyddion ar bob ochr o'r Siambra yn ystyried argymhellion yr ymchwiliad o ddifrif.

As Jocelyn Davies mentioned, we considered the issue of the delegation of functions to the First Minister. I am happy with the constraints that are placed on the Minister responsible by the Act of Parliament as to how those functions can be carried out, particularly with regard to the fact that the chairman of the inquiry must be consulted on certain aspects of the functions—if the First Minister wants to make use of them.

I am delighted that we have reached this point, and I hope that this inquiry will now start as quickly as possible—there is no reason for any delay. We know that other investigations are being undertaken, but, in terms of this public inquiry, there is no reason why Professor Pennington could not start the inquiry as early as January, and I know that we all look forward to this inquiry concluding and coming back with recommendations to ensure that if this sort of outbreak occurs in future, we will be better placed to deal with it.

**Christine Chapman:** Many parents and children, I am sure, will remember the autumn of 2005 for the rest of their lives as a time of great anxiety, particularly the family of Mason Jones, following his tragic death. A number of schools in my constituency were affected, and following discussions with parents, I have stressed that they should be involved in the inquiry because we need to ensure that this feels like their inquiry and not something that is being done away from them, the results of which they will simply have to accept. I hope that that is taken on board, because I did not notice many parents groups among the list of people who were invited to make suggestions on the inquiry's terms of reference. I hope that the inquiry will consult them and take account of their experiences.

One important question that parents have asked me is why their children's schools were not closed before being affected by the outbreak. We know that there are good reasons for this, but it is crucial, in times such as these, that parents are given sufficient information, because there is sometimes a myth that it is safer for schools to be closed, but that is not always the case.

Fel y soniodd Jocelyn Davies, buom yn ystyried dirprwyo swyddogaethau i'r Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn fodlon â'r cyfyngiadau a roddir ar y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol gan Ddeddf Seneddol am y ffordd y gellir cyflawni'r swyddogaethau hynny, yn enwedig o ran y ffaith ei bod yn rhaid ymgynghori â chadeirydd yr ymchwiliad am agweddau penodol ar y swyddogaethau—os bydd y Prif Weinidog am eu defnyddio.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cyrraedd y man hwn, a gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn yn awr yn dechrau cyn gynted â phosibl—nid oes rheswm dros oedi. Gwyddom fod ymchwiliadau eraill yn mynd rhagddynt, ond o ran yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus hwn, nid oes rheswm pam na allai'r Athro Pennington ddechrau'r ymchwiliad mor gynnar â mis Ionawr, a gwn ein bod i gyd yn edrych ymlaen at weld yr ymchwiliad hwn yn cael ei gwblhau gydag argymhellion i sicrhau y byddwn mewn gwell sefyllfa i ymdrin â'r math hwn o broblem os bydd yn codi yn y dyfodol.

**Christine Chapman:** Bydd nifer o rieni a phlant, mae'n siŵr, yn cofio hydref 2005 am weddill eu bywyd fel cyfnod o bryder mawr, yn enwedig teulu Mason Jones yn dilyn ei farwolaeth drasig. Effeithiwyd ar nifer o ysgolion yn fy etholaeth, ac yn ar ôl trafod gyda rhieni, yr wyf wedi pwysleisio y dylid eu cynnwys yn yr ymchwiliad oherwydd bod angen inni sicrhau bod yr ymchwiliad hwn yn teimlo fel eu hymchwiliad hwy, nid rhywbeth sy'n digwydd ymhell oddi wrthynt a hwythau, yn syml, yn gorfod derbyn y canlyniadau. Gobeithio yr ystyri hyn oherwydd ni sylwais ar lawer o grwpiau rhieni ymhlið y rhestr o bobl a wahoddwyd i gyflwyno awgrymiadau ar gylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad. Gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn ymgynghori â hwy ac yn ystyried eu profiadau.

Un cwestiwn pwysig y mae rhieni wedi ei ofyn imi yw pam na chaewyd ysgolion eu plant cyn i'r achosion o wenwyn bwyd effeithio arnynt. Gwyddom fod rhesymau da dros hyn, ond mae'n hanfodol sicrhau, ar adegau fel hyn, fod digon o wybodaeth yn cael ei rhoi i rieni oherwydd weithiau mae yna gred ei bod yn fwy diogel cau ysgolion, ond nid yw hynny'n wir bob amser.

I also think—and I am pleased to see this—that the inquiry should identify positive action that was taken, and where the agencies got things right, as well as citing areas where improvements need to be made and lessons learnt. That is an important part of this inquiry, and I know that many accounts suggest that the outbreak control team, led by Dr Roland Salmon, responded to events very well and, along with local authorities, worked closely with schools and teachers. That was certainly the experience in my constituency.

We also need to know from this inquiry how quickly we are able to determine the scale of an outbreak once a supplier has been identified. By this, I mean that we need to be able to know promptly how widely meat over which there are concerns may have been distributed once we know its source. During the outbreak, the Food Standards Agency asked local authorities to contact businesses to ensure that they had not bought any cooked meat from a company with which it had identified a link, so that it had a full list of the company's recipients. It is crucial to identify how far and among which sectors an outbreak could potentially spread.

Finally, perhaps one positive thing that has emerged from the outbreak is the emphasis and the renewal of the importance of maintaining high standards of hygiene among children, including, for example, the need to wash their hands. This has highlighted the issues within education. As an Assembly Member who represents an area that was troubled by this awful outbreak, I look forward to seeing the development of the inquiry.

**Jenny Randerson:** I start by thanking Jocelyn for her excellent chairing of the committee and by giving my thanks to the officials who were involved, because it was a concentrated piece of work. I believe that this committee proved that it is both practical and feasible for the Assembly to deal with the functions of the Inquiries Act 2005, and I strongly support the recommendation in

Credaf hefyd—ac yr wyf yn falch o weld hyn—y dylai'r ymchwiliad nodi camau cadarnhaol a gymerwyd, ac enghreifftiau o weithredu cywir ar ran yr asiantaethau, yn ogystal â nodi meysydd y mae angen eu gwella a gwersi a ddysgwyd. Mae hynny'n rhan bwysig o'r ymchwiliad hwn, a gwn fod nifer o adroddiadau'n awgrymu bod y tîm rheoli achosion, dan arweiniad Dr Roland Salmon, wedi ymateb i'r digwyddiadau mewn modd da iawn a'u bod, ynghyd â'r awdurdodau lleol, wedi gweithio'n agos gydag ysgolion ac athrawon. Dyna, yn sicr, oedd y profiad yn fy etholaeth i.

Mae angen inni gael gwybod hefyd gan yr ymchwiliad hwn pa mor gyflym y gallwn gadarnhau hyd a lled digwyddiad ar ôl dod o hyd i'r cyflenwr. Wrth hyn, yr wyf yn golygu bod angen inni allu cael gwybod ar unwaith pa mor eang yw'r ardal lle gall cig, sy'n destun gofid, fod wedi ei ddosbarthu pan fyddwn yn gwybod beth yw ei darddiad. Yn ystod yr achosion, gofynnodd yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i awdurdodau lleol gysylltu â busnesau i sicrhau nad oeddent wedi prynu unrhyw gig wedi'i goginio gan gwmni yr oedd wedi nodi cysylltiad ag ef, er mwyn i'r Asiantaeth gael rhestr lawn o'r rheini a oedd yn cael cig gan y cwmni. Mae'n hanfodol nodi pa mor bell ac ymhllith pa sectorau y gallai achosion ledu.

Yn olaf, efallai fod un peth cadarnhaol wedi deillio o'r achosion hyn, sef pwysleisio ac adnewyddu'r pwysigrwydd sicrhau safonau uchel o hylendid ymhllith plant, gan gynnwys, er enghraift, yr angen am olchi eu dwylo. Mae hyn wedi tynnu sylw at y problemau ym maes addysg. Fel Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli ardal a ddioddefodd oherwydd yr achosion ofnadwy hyn, edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr ymchwiliad hwn yn datblygu.

**Jenny Randerson:** Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Jocelyn am gadeirio'r pwylgor mor fedrus a thrwy ddiolch i'r swyddogion cysylltiedig, oherwydd yr oedd yn ddarn manwl o waith. Credaf fod y pwylgor hwn wedi profi ei bod yn ymarferol ac yn bosibl i'r Cynulliad ymdrin â swyddogaethau Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi'n gryf yr argymhelliaid i benodi'r Athro Hugh

relation to the appointment of Professor Hugh Pennington. He will give the inquiry credibility and stature from the start, and we also effectively start ahead by building on his enormous knowledge and experience. I take issue, to some extent, with Jeff Cuthbert, because it is important that any public inquiry looks back at the knowledge that we already have. I point out that the basic microbiology of how E.coli is spread does not change from one outbreak to another; the medical and biological facts are there.

3.50 p.m.

I want to emphasise the importance of the evidence that we had from school governors, and to reassure Christine that we were aiming to approach parents via their school governors because every governing body includes parent governors. In that short period of time, the parents groups were only just being formed, and I think that they will be better formed and easier to contact in the future.

We took evidence from not only school governors, but the acting chief medical officer, the Food Standards Agency, the WLGA and so on. That evidence gave us a clear steer on the scope of the inquiry. There was remarkable agreement on most aspects, from across the board, and that led us to these wide and simple terms of reference, which this inquiry has in common with most other major public inquiries. On a personal note, I think that it is important that we selected terms of reference that made it possible to go right back to farming practices. If that is a key issue, the inquiry must be able to look at it.

The remaining delegations that are recommended to you today are necessary for the smooth running of the inquiry, and I recommend them to you. It is important to notice that we are blazing a trail on the Inquiries Act 2005. As has been mentioned already, it is only the draft rules that will come on stream next year, but there was a determination in the committee not to allow that fact, or the ongoing police or Food Standards Agency inquiries, to hold up the

Pennington. Bydd yn rhoi hygrededd a statws i'r ymchwiliad o'r cychwyn, ac yr ydym hefyd yn dechrau ar y blaen i bob pwrrpas drwy adeiladu ar ei wybodaeth a'i brofiad helaeth. Anghytunaf, i ryw raddau, â Jeff Cuthbert, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig i unrhyw ymchwiliad cyhoeddus edrych yn ôl ar y wybodaeth sydd gennym eisoes. Nodaf hefyd nad yw microbioleg sylfaenol y modd y lledaenir E.coli yn newid o un gyfres o un achos i'r llall; mae'r ffeithiau meddygol a biolegol ar gael.

Yr wyf am bwysleisio pwysigrwydd y dystiolaeth a gawsom gan lywodraethwyr ysgolion, a sicrhau Christine o'n bwriad i gysylltu â rhieni drwy gyfrwng eu llywodraethwyr ysgol, oherwydd mae gan bob corff llywodraethu rieni sy'n llywodraethwyr. Yn y cyfnod byr hwnnw, newydd eu ffurfio yr oedd y grwpiau rhieni, a chredaf y byddant wedi'u ffurfio'n well ac yn haws cysylltu â hwy yn y dyfodol.

Yn ogystal â llywodraethwyr ysgol, cafwyd dystiolaeth gan y prif swyddog meddygol dros dro, yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, CLILC, ac yn y blaen. Rhoddodd y dystiolaeth honno gyfeiriad clir inni ar gwmpas yr ymchwiliad. Yr oedd cytundeb rhyfeddol ar y rhan fwyaf o agweddau, ac arweiniodd hynny at y cylch gorchwyl hwn sy'n syml ac yn eang ei gwmpas, sef rhywbeth sy'n gyffredin rhwng yr ymchwiliad hwn a'r rhan fwyaf o ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus mawr eraill. Ar nodyn personol, credaf ei bod yn bwysig inni ddethol cylch gorchwyl a oedd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl mynd yn ôl at arferion ffermio. Os mai dyna yw'r prif fater, rhaid i'r ymchwiliad allu edrych arno.

Mae'r dirprwyaethau sy'n weddill ac sy'n cael eu cymeradwyo ichi heddiw yn angenrheidiol i sicrhau bod yr ymchwiliad yn mynd rhagddo'n ddidrafferth, ac fe'u cymeradwyaf ichi. Mae'n bwysig sylwi ein bod yn torri cwys newydd yng nghyd-destun Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, dim ond y drafft reolau a ddaw i rym y flwyddyn nesaf. Ond yr oedd y pwylgor yn benderfynol na fyddai'r ffaith honno, nac ymchwiliadau'r heddlu neu'r Asiantaeth

establishment of this inquiry. However, its further progress might be subject to a slowing down from time to time because of those other inquiries. It is important for public confidence in the Assembly that we are, and are seen to be, prepared to act swiftly and to take the most thorough approach to this matter.

**Leighton Andrews:** Briefly, I want to welcome the setting up of the inquiry. A number of schools in my constituency were affected by the outbreak, and most are listed in the annex under those organisations invited to submit suggestions on the terms of reference, in respect of the chairs of governors. I hope that the views of parents will be canvassed in the inquiry by Professor Pennington, and I am sure that they will be. This was a serious outbreak and everyone here recognises that it was. Parents are looking to understand why it occurred, to understand how the processes were followed through and to ensure, above all, that we do the maximum to ensure that such an outbreak does not occur again and that any outbreaks that do occur are handled in the best possible way. People want absolute transparency on the way that this process operates, and I hope that the recommendations will come back to us for proper discussion in due course.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Jeff, I would like to thank you for your contribution to the committee and, in your contribution, you recognised the importance of the cross-party support for the inquiry. You also raised a wide range of issues that you would like the inquiry to look at, as did the people who gave evidence before the committee. I am confident that the inquiry panel will be able to do that. The terms of reference make it quite clear that the inquiry is not about events in Scotland. However, as Jonathan and Jenny pointed out, I do not doubt that Professor Pennington's experience will prove to be invaluable. Both Jonathan and Jenny quite rightly pointed out that Professor Pennington will command considerable public support, and he is clearly independent of the Government. Jonathan Morgan's points on the implementation of any recommendations are well made.

Safonau Bwyd sy'n mynd rhagddynt, yn ei rwystro rhag sefydlu'r ymchwiliad hwn. Fodd bynnag, gall cynnydd pellach arafu o bryd i'w gilydd oherwydd yr ymchwiliadau eraill hynny. Mae'n bwysig er mwyn hyder y cyhoedd yn y Cynulliad inni fod yn barod i weithredu'n gyflym ac i ddefnyddio'r dull mwyaf trwyndl i ddelio â'r mater hwn, a bod eraill yn ein gweld yn gwneud hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn fyr, yr wyf am groesawu sefydlu'r ymchwiliad. Effeithiwyd ar nifer o ysgolion yn fy etholaeth gan yr achosion hyn, a rhestrir y mwyafrif yn yr atodiad dan y sefydliadau hynny a wahoddwyd i gyflwyno awgrymiadau am y cylch gorchwyl o ran cadeiryddion llywodraethwyr. Gobeithio y gofynnir am farn rhieni yn yr ymchwiliad gan yr Athro Pennington, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Yr oedd hwn yn achos difrifol ac mae pawb yma yn cydnabod hynny. Mae rhieni am ddeall pam y digwyddodd hyn, sut y dilynwyd prosesau a sicrhau, uwchlaw popeth, y gwnawn bopeth posibl i sicrhau na fydd achosion felly yn digwydd eto, a phetai unrhyw achosion yn digwydd, y delir â hwy yn y modd gorau posibl. Mae pobl am weld eglurder llwyr yn y ffordd y mae'r broses hon yn mynd rhagddi, a gobeithio y bydd yr argymhellion yn dod ger ein bron ar gyfer trafodaeth iawn, maes o law.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Jeff, hoffwn ddiolch i chi am eich cyfraniad i'r pwylgor, ac yn eich cyfraniad yr oeddech yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cefnogaeth ar draws y pleidiau i'r ymchwiliad hwn. Yr oeddech hefyd yn codi amrywiaeth eang o faterion y byddech yn dymuno i'r ymchwiliad edrych arnynt, fel yn wir, y mae'r bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth gerbron y pwylgor. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gall panel yr ymchwiliad wneud hynny. Mae'r cylch gorchwyl yn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir nad yw'r ymchwiliad yn ymwneud â digwyddiadau yn yr Alban. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Jonathan a Jenny, nid oes gennyd amheuaeth na fydd profiad yr Athro Pennington yn amhrisiadwy. Eglurodd Jonathan a Jenny, yn gwbl briodol, y bydd cryn gefnogaeth gyhoeddus i'r Athro Pennington, ac mae'n amlwg yn annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth. Yr oedd pwyntiau Jonathan Morgan ar weithredu unrhyw

argymhellion yn rhai da.

Christine Chapman, we need to ensure that parents have an input into the inquiry, and holding the inquiry sessions in appropriate places will assist that process. Communication with parents was something that we discussed at the committee and it will be included in the inquiry's remit, as will communication between local authorities, which is another important point that you raised. It is as well now to put on record that this inquiry and its chair have the full backing of the Assembly and, hopefully, it will significantly reduce the likelihood of future outbreaks.

Christine Chapman, mae angen inni sicrhau cyfraniad rhieni i'r ymchwiliad, a bydd cynnal sesiynau'r ymchwiliad mewn mannau priodol yn cynorthwyo'r broses honno. Yr oedd cyfathrebu â rhieni yn rhywbeth a drafodwyd gennym yn y pwylgor ac fe'i cynhwysir yng nghylch gwaith yr ymchwiliad, yn ogystal â chyfathrebu rhwng awdurdodau lleol, sy'n bwynt pwysig arall a godwyd gennych. Cystal cofnodi yn awr fod y Cynulliad a'i gadeirydd yn cefnogi'r ymchwiliad hwn yn llwyr, a gobeithio y bydd yn lleihau'n sylweddol y tebygolrwydd o weld achosion o'r fath yn y dyfodol.

*Cynnig (NDM2747): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2747): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2748): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2748): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2005**  
**Delegation of Functions under the National Assembly for Wales (Transfer of  
Functions) Order 2005**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions transferred to it by the National Assembly for Wales (Transfer of Functions) Order 2005 (SI 2005/1958) to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM2745)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad, holl swyddogaethau Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2005 (SI 2005/1958) ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwennw. (NDM2745)*

*Cynnig (NDM2745): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2745): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Y Gyllideb Derfynol The Final Budget**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.4 adopts the final budget for the financial years 2006-07, 2007-08 and 2008-09, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 30 November 2005. (NDM2749)*

If I thought that our agreement stretched to it, I would simply propose the motion and not make a speech, but I am not sure that it does. [Laughter.]

I am pleased to present the final budget proposals for consideration by the Assembly—at last. My final budget proposals reflect the wide range of views expressed since the debate on the draft budget. The subject committees have had their opportunity to scrutinise the budget, major stakeholders in the delivery of public services have had their opportunity to give views, there have been discussions in the Assembly's partnership councils, and the

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.4, yn mabwysiadu'r gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer blynyddoedd ariannol 2006-07, 2007-08 a 2008-09, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 30 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2749)*

Pe byddwn o'r farn y byddai'n cytundeb yn caniatáu, byddwn yn gwneud y cynnig heb wneud arraith, ond nid wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n wir. [Chwerthin.]

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno cynigion y gyllideb derfynol i'w hystyried gan y Cynulliad—o'r diwedd. Mae fy nghynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb derfynol yn adlewyrchu'r ystod eang o safbwytiau a fynegwyd ers y ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft. Mae'r pwylgorau pwnc wedi cael cyfle i graffu ar y gyllideb, mae prif randdeiliad darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wedi cael cyfle i gyflwyno'u safbwytiau, cafwyd trafodaethau yng nghyngorau partneriaeth y Cynulliad, ac

Assembly expressed its views by debating and amending the draft budget. The procedure of having a draft budget preceding a final budget is designed to invite such input, and I welcome all views. It is worth contrasting our procedures with those of Whitehall and Westminster, where a final budget is announced as a finished product. I think that our procedure is infinitely preferable.

Overwhelmingly, the views expressed have been supportive of the priorities in our spending plans and the draft budget. There have also been discussions between party leaders and finance spokespersons in the development of the budget, which, I am pleased to say, have been constructive and have helped to shape the final budget. I acknowledge that there are times when this Government does not have a majority in the Assembly, and it is right that we should work to gain support across political parties. However, I stress that the discussions between party leaders are not a substitute for open, public debate that the Assembly's procedures are designed to facilitate.

In accordance with our conventions, the draft budget is constructed to allow as full a comparison as possible with previous years. For that purpose, the adjustments that reflect movement between different funding streams take place at the final budget stage. Therefore, the majority of changes between draft and final versions reflect technical adjustments. I have provided each Member with a full explanation of those changes in the tables supplied so that there is clear understanding of the changes. I hope that all Members have received those and can see the changes quite clearly.

Moving on from the process to the budget itself, this budget is steadfast in maintaining the strategic priorities set out in 'Wales: A Better Country', and it builds on the forward allocations made this time last year. Because of the commitment to maintain the forward spending plans, this budget is focussed on allocating the £250 million that I have been able to release from the reserves. This extra money was targeted primarily at increasing the expenditure growth in health and social

mae'r Cynulliad wedi mynegi'i farn drwy drafod y gyllideb ddrafft a'i diwygio. Nod y weithdrefn o gyflwyno cyllideb ddrafft cyn cyllideb derfynol yw cael cyfraniad felly, a chroesawaf bob barn. Mae'n werth cymharu ein gweithdrefnau â gweithdrefnau Whitehall a San Steffan lle cyhoeddir cyllideb derfynol fel rhywbeth gorffenidig. Credaf fod ein gweithdrefn ni yn well o lawer.

Gan mwyaf, y mae'r sylwadau a gyflwynwyd wedi bod yn gefnogol i'r blaenoriaethau yn ein rhaglenni gwario a'r gyllideb ddrafft, Bu trafodaethau hefyd rhwng arweinwyr y pleidiau a llefarwyr cyllid wrth i'r gyllideb ddatblygu, a'r rheini, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, yn adeiladol ac wedi helpu llunio'r gyllideb derfynol. Cydnabyddaf fod adegau pan nad oes gan y Llywodraeth hon fwyarif yn y Cynulliad, ac mae'n briodol inni geisio sicrhau cefnogaeth ar draws y pleidiau gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf n all y trafodaethau rhwng arweinwyr y pleidiau gymryd lle'r drafodaeth gyhoeddus agored y mae gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad yn eu hwyluso.

Yn unol â'n confensiynau, mae'r gyllideb ddrafft wedi'i llunio i ganiatâu cymhariaeth mor llawn â phosibl â blynnyddoedd blaenorol. At y diben hwnnw, mae'r addasiadau sy'n adlewyrchu symudiad rhwng gwahanol ffrydiau ariannu yn digwydd yn ystod y gyllideb derfynol. Felly, mae mwyaf y newidiadau rhwng y fersiynau drafft a'r fersiynau terfynol yn adlewyrchu addasiadau technegol. Yr wyf wedi rhoi esboniad llawn i bob Aelod o'r newidiadau hynny yn y tablau a ddarparwyd, felly, mae dealltwriaeth glir o'r newidiadau. Gobeithio bod pob Aelod wedi eu cael ac yn gallu gweld y newidiadau'n glir.

I symud ymlaen o'r broses i'r gyllideb ei hun, mae'r gyllideb hon yn gadarn yn cynnal y blaenoriaethau strategol sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', ac mae'n adeiladu ar y blaenddyraniadau a wnaed yr adeg hon y llynedd. Oherwydd yr ymrwymiad i barhau gyda'r blaenraglenni gwariant, mae'r gyllideb hon yn canolbwytio ar ddyrannu'r £250 miliwn yr oedd modd imi ei ryddhau o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn. Targedwyd yr arian ychwanegol hwn

care to 8 per cent. The growth in education expenditure is lifted to 14 per cent. The revenue support grant to local government increases by 5.1 per cent, which meets the identified pressures on local government and includes the teachers' workload agreement. Since the draft budget, there has been no suggestion that our response to these priorities has not been appropriate and fair.

4.00 p.m.

On the individual issues, I am determined to maintain a sufficient level of contingency reserves. These are set out on the face of the budget, and are in three distinct parts. A reserve of £64 million can be used for revenue expenditure, which is unchanged from the draft budget. I regard this as the most important source of funds to meet unforeseen emerging demands. To reduce this sum would expose the Welsh budget to an unacceptable level of risk—a level of funds for emergency purposes really is needed. The reserve in 2006-07 is 0.5 per cent of the departmental expenditure limit, which I regard as the absolute minimum, and I give notice of my intention to increase this level of contingency for 2007-08.

Given that the reserve level has remained the same, it is obvious that any increases in revenue expenditure between the draft and final budget—and, in this case, we are proposing £6.4 million for 2006-07—must therefore be matched with corresponding decreases elsewhere in the budget, which is logical. This is the real world of Government in which we face up to the reality of set financial resources.

A second reserve to meet unforeseen demands is the capital expenditure line. With the agreement of the accounting officer, I have reduced the 2006-07 draft budget provision of capital reserves from £43 million to £35 million. This will be able to fund additional capital expenditure, as you will see in the tables. For the sake of clarity, let me say that there is a non-cash reserve for capital charges of £98.4 million, which is fixed by the Treasury. Although shown as a form of reserve, in reality, it cannot be used to fund

yn bennaf at gynyddu'r twf gwariant mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol i 8 y cant. Caiff y twf mewn gwariant addysg ei godi i 14 y cant. Mae'r grant cynnal refeniw i lywodraeth leol yn cynyddu 5.1 y cant, sy'n bodloni'r pwysau a nodwyd ar lywodraeth leol ac sy'n cynnwys y cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith athrawon. Ers y gyllideb ddrafft, ni chafwyd unrhyw awgrym nad oedd ein hymateb i'r blaenoriaethau hyn yn briodol ac yn deg.

O ran y materion unigol, yr wyf yn benderfynol o gadw lefel ddigonol o arian wrth gefn. Mae hwn wedi ei osod allan yn y gyllideb, ac mae tair rhan benodol. Gellir defnyddio cronfa wrth gefn o £64 miliwn ar gyfer gwariant refeniw, nad yw wedi newid ers y gyllideb ddrafft. Ystyriaf mai hon yw'r ffynhonnell ariannol bwysicaf ar gyfer bodloni gofynion na ragwelwyd. Byddai gostwng y swm hwn yn golygu lefel annerbyniol o risg i gyllideb Cymru—mae gwir angen arian ar gyfer argyfyngau. Mae'r gronfa wrth gefn yn 2006-07 yn 0.5 y cant o'r terfyn gwariant adrannol. Yn fy marn i, dyna'r isafswm lleiaf posibl, a rhoddaf rybudd fy mod yn bwriadu cynyddu'r lefel hon o arian wrth gefn ar gyfer 2007-08.

Gan fod lefel y gronfa wrth gefn wedi parhau'r un fath, mae'n amlwg y bydd angen i unrhyw gynnydd mewn gwariant refeniw rhwng y gyllideb ddrafft a'r gyllideb derfynol—ac, yn yr achos hwn, yr ydym yn cynnig £6.4 miliwn ar gyfer 2006-07—gyfateb felly i ostyngiadau mewn mannau eraill yn y gyllideb, sy'n rhesymegol. Dyma yw realiti Llywodraethu lle yr ydym yn wynebu realiti adnoddau ariannol penodedig.

Ail gronfa wrth gefn i ateb gofynion na ragwelwyd yw'r llinell gwariant cyfalaf. Gyda chytundeb y swyddog cyfrifyddu, yr wyf wedi gostwng darpariaeth cyllideb ddrafft y gronfa gyfalaf wrth gefn ar gyfer 2006-07 o £43 miliwn i £35 miliwn. Gall hyn ariannu gwariant cyfalaf ychwanegol, fel y gwellch yn y tablau. Er mwyn eglurder, gadewch imi ddweud bod yna gronfa wrth gefn nad yw'n gronfa arian parod ar gyfer costau cyfalaf o £98.4 miliwn, a bennir gan y Trysorlys. Er bod hyn yn cael ei ddangos fel

revenue or capital expenditure.

In terms of where the extra money is targeted, the final budget provides an additional £2 million in revenue in 2006-07, in response to the funding gap indicated for higher education. It also allocates £3 million capital in 2006-07 and 2007-08 for the 'Reaching Higher' agenda. These allocations have been made in good faith, based on the recent HEFCW report. More work will be done in future on the issue of the funding gap between Wales and England, recognising that the situation is likely to be fluid over the next year. A further assessment will be made in time for next year's budget preparations.

This Government takes the needs of our pensioners very seriously, which is why I am very pleased, in the final budget, to provide extra assistance to older people to make their homes warmer, more efficient in their use of energy, and more secure. Additional money will be provided to allow all householders aged over 80 who need insulation, better security or a new heating system to receive a 100 per cent grant from the Assembly Government. This will remove the existing means test for those aged over 80, which will be very much welcomed. It will mean that those most at risk from poor heating need have no fear in getting their heating needs met. All householders between 60 and 80 years old will be eligible for grants up to £375, which means that the grant contribution has increased from 25 per cent to 50 per cent. Of course, those pensioners receiving pension credit will continue to receive 100 per cent support. These are major steps forward, and I commend them to the Assembly.

Last Monday, the Chancellor announced further support for the heating and insulation of homes in England. Spending per household in England on this form of support has been around 40 per cent less than in Wales. The Chancellor's announcement for England will bring spending closer to that in Wales in 2006-07, but it will still be less. I suggest that this is another case of where

math o gronfa wrth gefn, mewn gwirionedd ni ellir ei defnyddio i ariannu gwariant refeniw na gwariant cyfalaf.

O ran ble mae'r arian ychwanegol yn cael ei dargedu, mae'r gyllideb derfynol yn darparu ar gyfer £2 filiwn o refeniw ychwanegol yn 2006-07, i ymateb i'r bwlcw ariannu a nodwyd ar gyfer addysg uwch. Mae hefyd yn dyrannu £3 miliwn o gyfalaf yn 2006-07 a 2007-08 ar gyfer yr agenda 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch'. Gwnaethpwyd y dyraniadau hyn yn hollol ffyddiog, ar sail adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan CCAUC. Gwneir mwy o waith yn y dyfodol ar y bwlcw ariannu rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, gan gydnabod ei bod yn debygol y bydd y sefyllfa'n newid dros y flwyddyn nesaf. Gwneir asesiad arall mewn pryd ar gyfer y paratoadau ar gyfer y gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i anghenion ein pensiynwyr, a dyna pam yr wyf mor falch o ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol, yn y gyllideb derfynol, i bobl hŷn gynhesu eu tai, defnyddio ynni'n fwy effeithiol, a gwneud eu cartrefi'n fwy diogel. Darperir arian ychwanegol i alluogi perchnogion tai dros 80 oed lle mae angen inswleiddio, gwell diogelwch neu system wresogi newydd i gael grant o 100 y cant gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd hyn yn dileu'r prawf modd presennol ar gyfer pobl dros 80 oed, a bydd croeso cynnes i hynny. Bydd yn golygu nad oes angen i'r rheini sydd yn y perygl mwyaf oherwydd gwresogi gwael bryderu am fodloni eu hanghenion gwresogi. Bydd pob perchenog tŷ rhwng 60 a 80 oed yn gymwys i gael grantiau hyd at £375, sy'n golygu bod y cyfraniad grant wedi cynyddu o 25 y cant i 50 y cant. Wrth gwrs, bydd y pensiynwyr hynny sy'n cael credyd pensiwn yn parhau i gael cymorth o 100 y cant. Mae'r rhain yn gamau pwysig ymlaen, ac fe'u cymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad.

Dydd Llun diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y Canghellor gymorth ychwanegol ar gyfer gwresogi ac inswleiddio cartrefi yn Lloegr. Mae gwariant fesul cartref yn Lloegr ar y math hwn o gymorth wedi bod tua 40 y cant yn is nag yng Nghymru. Bydd cyhoeddiad y Canghellor ar gyfer Lloegr yn golygu y bydd y gwariant yn debycach i'r gwariant yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2006-07, ond bydd yn dal

Wales leads, England follows.

I have issued a written statement on the Chancellor's pre-budget report, which I hope you have received. This provides £28 million of extra funding, which will be available for allocation in next year's budget. I will be considering emerging pressures on the budget and proposals for the most effective use of this additional money.

Council tax increases are also a concern for pensioners. The budget provides £2.3 million to fund a payment of £100 to each pensioner household moving up a second council tax band next year. We are working with Welsh local government on the means of administering that grant, and I, for one, express my grateful thanks for the support that local government is providing. That is in addition to the minimum payment of £200 that pensioners are now receiving.

The Chancellor confirmed that winter fuel payments of £200 for households with someone aged over 60, rising to £300 for households with someone aged over 80, will be available for the duration of this Parliament. That level of support in Wales needs to be seen in the context of the average council tax payments in Wales being an average of 27 per cent lower than those in England. We also know that many people, particularly pensioners, do not claim council tax benefits despite being eligible. The budget provides £1.5 million to support a scheme to offer practical help and to encourage the better take-up of council tax benefits by those groups who most need them. We will be working with local government and the voluntary sector to deliver that.

We are adding £0.6 million to existing funding for specific support to small schools and that brings the amount available to £3.5 million in addition to the £0.6 million funding in the revenue support grant.

The final budget continues to improve rail links across Wales. Improvements are already

yn is. Awgrymaf fod hyn yn achos arall lle mae Cymru yn arwain a Lloegr yn dilyn.

Gobeithio eich bod wedi cael y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyhoeddais ar adroddiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb. Mae hyn yn darparu £28 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol, a fydd ar gael i'w ddyrannu yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf. Byddaf yn rhoi ystyriaeth i bwysau ychwanegol ar y gyllideb ac argymhellion ar gyfer defnyddio'r arian ychwanegol hwn yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol.

Mae cynydd yn y dreth gyngor hefyd yn achosi pryder i bensiynwyr. Mae'r gyllideb yn darparu £2.3 miliwn i ariannu taliad o £100 i bob cartref lle mae pensiynwr yn byw ac sy'n symud i fyny i ail fand y dreth gyngor y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol Cymru ar y ffordd i weinyddu'r grant hwnnw, a hoffwn i, yn bersonol, fynegi fy niolch am y cymorth gan lywodraeth leol. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at yr isafswm taliad o £200 a gaiff pensiynwyr ar hyn o bryd.

Cadarnhaodd y Canghellor y bydd taliadau tanwydd gaeaf o £200 ar gyfer cartrefi lle mae rhywun dros 60 oed yn byw, gan godi i £300 ar gyfer cartrefi lle mae rhywun dros 80 oed yn byw, ar gael drwy gydol oes y Senedd hon. Rhaid edrych ar y lefel honno o gymorth yng Nghymru yng nghyd-destun y ffaith fod cyfartaledd taliadau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru 27 y cant yn is na'r rheini yn Lloegr. Gwyddom hefyd fod nifer o bobl, yn arbennig pensiynwyr, nad ydynt yn hawlio budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor er eu bod yn gymwys i'w cael. Mae'r gyllideb yn darparu £1.5 miliwn i gefnogi cynllun i gynnig cymorth ymarferol ac i annog y grwpiau hynny lle mae'r angen mwyaf i fanteisio ar fudd-daliadau treth gyngor. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol i ddarparu hynny.

Yr ydym yn ychwanegu £0.6 miliwn at y cyllid presennol er mwyn darparu cymorth penodol i ysgolion bach, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod £3.5 miliwn ar gael yn ychwanegol at y £0.6 miliwn o gyllid yn y grant cynnal refeniw.

Mae'r gyllideb derfynol yn parhau i wella cysylltiadau rheilffordd ledled Cymru. Mae

being made to the north-south rail links, through a comprehensive two-hourly service with business-class facilities. That will run between Holyhead and Cardiff from next month. We will examine the business case for making that rail link faster. The Government is also willing to support the expansion of its existing rolling stock for redeployment across the rural rail network to ease overcrowding, at a cost of around £1 million a year. Work will continue to ensure the earliest possible start date for the Ebbw Vale railway—and we all want that to happen—and we will provide pre-feasibility studies for Maindee junction and Gowerton.

The draft budget contained substantial funds for improving nutrition in schools. These are now clearly identified in both the health and education budgets and, by 2007-08, they will add up to £2.9 million. That is in addition to the provision in the draft budget to ensure funds to allow free breakfasts for children who require them in schools that wish to provide them.

I am also setting aside an initial sum of £300,000 to support the E.coli inquiry that we discussed a little while ago.

This final budget is fully in line with our strategic priorities. It is targeted at the key areas that we have identified for the long-term sustainability and improvement of Wales. It invests in children and young people, it expands provision for health and social care and it supports local communities and local government.

I thank my officials who have worked so hard over many months, and certainly in the last few weeks, on this budget, and all those who have helped to make this final budget.  
[Applause.]

gwelliannau eisoes yn cael eu gwneud mewn cysylltiadau rheilffordd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, drwy wasanaeth cynhwysfawr bob dwy awr a chyfleusterau dosbarth busnes. Bydd hwnnw'n rhedeg rhwng Caergybi a Chaerdydd o'r mis nesaf ymlaen. Byddwn yn ymchwilio i'r achos busnes dros gyflymu'r cysylltiad rheilffordd hwnnw. Mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd yn fodlon cynorthwyo'r gwaith o ehangu ei stoc bresennol o gerbydau i'w defnyddio ar draws y rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd gwledig, er mwyn lleddfu'r problemau gorlenwi. Bydd hynny'n costio tuag £1 filiwn y flwyddyn. Bydd y gwaith o sicrhau'r dyddiad cychwyn cynharaf posibl ar gyfer rheilffordd Glynebw y parhau—mae pob un ohonom yn awyddus i hynny ddigwydd—a byddwn yn darparu astudiaethau ymarferoldeb rhagarweiniad ar gyfer cyffordd Maendy a Thre-gŵyr.

Yr oedd y gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys arian sylweddol ar gyfer gwella maethiad mewn ysgolion. Caiff hwn bellach ei nodi'n glir yn y cyllebau iechyd ac addysg, ac erbyn 2007-08 bydd y cyfanswm yn £2.9 miliwn. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at y ddarpariaeth yn y gyllideb ddrafft i sicrhau arian i ganiatáu brecwast am ddim i blant y mae arnynt ei angen mewn ysgolion sy'n dymuno ei ddarparu.

Yr wyf hefyd yn clustnodi swm cychwynnol o £300,000 i gefnogi'r ymchwiliad E.coli a drafodwyd gennym beth amser yn ôl.

Mae'r gyllideb derfynol hon yn cyd-fynd yn union â'n blaenorriaethau strategol. Mae wedi ei thargeddu ar gyfer y meysydd allweddol a nodwyd gennym ar gyfer gwneud Cymru'n gynaliadwy a'i gwella dros gyfnod hir. Mae'n buddsoddi mewn plant a phobl ifanc, mae'n ehangu darpariaeth ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac mae'n cefnogi cymunedau lleol a llywodraeth leol.

Yr wyf yn diolch i'm swyddogion, sydd wedi gweithio mor galed am fisoeedd lawer, ac yn arbennig yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf, ar y gyllideb hon. Ac yr wyf yn diolch i bawb sydd wedi helpu llunio'r gyllideb derfynol hon.  
[Cymeradwyaeth.]

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.08 p.m.*

*The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.08 p.m.*

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am delighted to speak in this budget debate. I want to focus my contribution on what the budget means to my constituents in Cardiff South and Penarth. This debate is significant for two main reasons. The first is, simply, that this final budget brings the uncertainty that has existed to an end. I am delighted that it confirms that funding for the Communities First programme is secure and that the work to address the long-standing levels of multiple deprivation in wards, such as Butetown and Splott, is set to continue.

Secondly, and perhaps more importantly, this budget confirms that Welsh Labour and the Labour Assembly Government is driving forward a radical and socially just agenda for the people of Wales, including those in my constituency. Many of my constituents just want to know what it means for them. The message is clear. As the Minister has just outlined to us, the oldest and youngest residents in Cardiff South and Penarth and Wales are set to benefit. All pensioners will get extra help to keep their homes warm and safe with modern efficiency. I came across an 82-year-old lady this week and, between the Labour Government in Wales and in Westminster, she is receiving an extra £500 this year and she is delighted.

4.10 p.m.

Pensioners moving up two bands following the council tax rebanding will receive an extra payment of £100. Most importantly, for Members on this side of the Chamber, more money will be invested in the take-up scheme to ensure that as many pensioners as possible claim the benefits to which they are entitled, which they are often unaware that they can claim or are reluctant to claim. For me, that applies even more to the elderly people living in black and minority ethnic communities, who may have difficulty in understanding what is available because of linguistic barriers. Children in all our constituencies will also receive healthier and more nutritious food in their schools.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o gael siarad yn y ddadl hon ar y gyllideb. Yr wyf am ganolbwytio fy nghyfraniad ar yr hyn y mae'r gyllideb yn ei olygu i'm hetholwyr i yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth. Mae'r ddadl hon yn bwysig am ddaau brif reswm. Y rheswm cyntaf, yn syml, yw fod y gyllideb hon yn rhoi terfyn ar yr ansicrwydd sydd wedi bodoli. Yr wyf yn falch iawn ei bod yn cadarnhau bod y cyllid yn ddiogel ar gyfer y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a bod y gwaith o fynd i'r afael â'r lefelau hanesyddol o amddifaddedd lluosog mewn wardiau megis Butetown a'r Sblob i barhau.

Yn ail, ac yn bwysicach, efallai, mae'r gyllideb hon yn cadarnhau bod Llafur Cymru a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn llywio agenda radical a chymdeithasol deg ar gyfer pobl Cymru, gan gynnwys y rheini yn fy etholaeth i. Yr unig beth y mae nifer o'm hetholwyr am ei wybod yw beth y mae'n ei olygu iddynt hwy. Mae'r neges yn glir. Fel y mae'r Gweinidog newydd ei amlinellu inni, bydd trigolion ieuengaf a hynaf De Caerdydd a Phenarth a Chymru yn elwa. Caiff pob pensiynwr help ychwanegol i gadw ei gartref yn gynnes a diogel gydag effeithlonrwydd modern. Deuthum ar draws gwraig 82 oed yr wythnos hon, a rhwng y Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan mae'n cael £500 yn ychwanegol eleni ac mae wrth ei bodd.

Bydd pensiynwyr y mae eu heiddo'n codi ddau fand yn dilyn aiffandio'r dreth gyngor yn cael taliad ychwanegol o £100. Yn bwysicach na hynny, i Aelodau yr ochr hon o'r Siambwr, buddsoddir mwy o arian yn y cynllun a fydd yn sicrhau bod cynifer â phosibl o bensiynwyr yn hawlio'r budd-daliadau y mae ganddynt hawl i'w cael, budd-daliadau nad ydynt yn ymwybodol yn aml iawn y gallant eu hawlio neu nad ydynt yn awyddus i'w hawlio. I mi, mae hynny hyd yn oed yn fwy perthnasol i bobl hŷn, sy'n byw mewn cymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, a allai gael anhawster i ddeall yr hyn sydd ar gael oherwydd rhwystrau ieithyddol. Bydd plant yn ein holl etholaethau hefyd yn cael bwyd iachach a mwy maethlon yn eu

hysgolion.

All these measures, as we have heard, are a sensible way forward and reflect the need for the compromise that we have had across the Chamber during this exercise. However, let us be clear. It is a Welsh Labour budget. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'.] If you would listen, you would hear that it is a Labour budget plus. If Labour were not here, I can assure you that we would not have this budget.

I wish to mention some of the Welsh Labour manifesto commitments that we are delivering and will deliver. They include the abolition of prescription charges; the £100 million crime-fighting fund; the extension of free bus travel; free school breakfasts for those who want them; the extension of 20 mph zones and Safe Routes to School, which are important in my constituency; free swimming for older people; the scrapping of home-care charges for disabled people; the £560 million spent on school buildings; and the £550 million spent on health facilities. The budget is taking forward all our commitments for the people of Wales.

When the people of Cardiff South and Penarth gave Welsh Labour a mandate to govern, they did so on the basis that we would deliver those promises. I will be voting for the budget today, because it is based on Labour values. Not only does it uphold our Welsh manifesto pledges, it pushes Welsh Labour's agenda further forwards. Today's budget is clear. It confirms that we were right to promise free prescriptions, and that we were right with our policy to ensure healthier food for children in schools. We will continue to deliver those promises for the people of Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I must apologise, as I called a Government speaker when I should have called an opposition speaker. I was besieged by e-mails. I will now call two opposition speakers and then go back to a rotation. I call on Dai Lloyd.

Mae'r holl fesurau hyn, fel y clywsom, yn ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen ac yn adlewyrchu'r angen am y cyfaddawd a gawsom ar draws y Siambra yn ystod yr ymarfer hwn. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni fod yn glir. Cyllideb Llafur Cymru ydyw. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] Pe baech yn gwrando, byddech wedi clywed bod hon yn gyllideb Lafur a mwy. Oni bai bod Llafur yma, gallaf eich sicrhau na fyddem wedi cael y gyllideb hon.

Hoffwn sôn am rai o ymrwymiadau maniffesto Llafur Cymru sy'n cael eu cyflawni gennym ac y byddwn yn eu cyflawni. Maent yn cynnwys dileu costau presgripsiwn; y gronfa £100 miliwn i ymladd troseddu; ymestyn y cynllun teithio am ddim ar fysiau; brecwast am ddim i blant sydd am ei gael; ymestyn parthau 20 mya a Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, sy'n bwysig yn fy etholaeth i; nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn; dileu costau gofal yn y cartref i bobl anabl; y £560 miliwn sydd wedi ei wario ar adeiladau ysgolion; a'r £550 miliwn sydd wedi ei wario ar gyfleusterau iechyd. Mae'r gyllideb yn golygu bod ein hymrwymiadau i gyd yn cael eu cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

Pan roddodd pobl De Caerdydd a Phenarth fandad i Lafur Cymru lywodraethu, gwnaethant hynny ar y sail y byddem yn gwireddu'r addewidion hynny. Byddaf yn pleidleisio dros y gyllideb heddiw, am ei bod yn seiliedig ar werthoedd Llafur. Yn ogystal ag ategu'r addewidion yn ein maniffesto i Gymru, mae hefyd yn symud agenda Llafur Cymru yn ei blaen. Mae'r gyllideb hon heddiw yn glir. Mae'n cadarnhau ein bod yn iawn i addo presgripsiynau am ddim, a'n bod yn iawn gyda'n polisi i sicrhau bwyd iachach i blant mewn ysgolion. Byddwn yn parhau i wireddu'r addewidion hynny ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rhaid imi ymddiheuro, gan imi alw ar siaradwr ar ran y Llywodraeth, pan ddylwn fod wedi galw ar siaradwr ar ran y gwrthbleidiau. Yr oeddwn yn boddi mewn negeseuon e-bost. Galwaf yn awr ar ddau siaradwr o'r gwrthbleidiau ac yna dychwelaf at system gylch. Galwaf ar Dai Lloyd.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad heddiw am y gyllideb derfynol ac am ei chymorth a'i chydweithredu yn ystod y trafodaethau diweddar ar y gyllideb. Nid wyf am olrhain yr holl hanes diweddar yngylch y gyllideb ddrafft, ond nodaf y cydweithrediad rhwng y pedair plaid a'r Aelodau annibynnol er mwyn dod i gytundeb ar y gyllideb derfynol yr wythnos diwethaf.

Mae'n wir nodi hefyd mai dyma'r math o gydweithio rhwng pleidiau yr oedd pobl Cymru yn awyddus i'w weld yn dilyn 1999—y wleidyddiaeth newydd gyda phawb yn cydweithio er mwyn pobl Cymru. Wrth gwrs, y realiti gwleidyddol yma sy'n gyrru hyn, ac yn gefndir i'r trafodaethau oedd realiti y cytundeb yn yr haf rhwng y pedwar arweinydd ar ffioedd myfyrwyr, a oedd yn cynnwys cytundeb i ddechrau ariannu'r bwllch hanesyddol rhwng prifysgolion Cymru a rhai Lloegr. Ni fu sôn am hynny yn y gyllideb ddrafft, a dyna sail y gwelliant gwreiddiol.

Hefyd yn gefndir i'r trafodaethau oedd y teimladau cryf a oedd yn deillio o ailfandio y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r penderfyniad i ddileu yr ailfandio yn Lloegr a'r dicter oedd yn deillio o hynny. Mae pobl yn teimlo'n flin yngylch hynny o hyd. Dyna oedd sail y cymal yn ein gwelliant i'r gyllideb ddrafft yngylch yr angen i helpu pensiynwyr sy'n dioddef oherwydd yr ailfandio. Yr wyf yn hapus felly i weld bod cymorth i bensiynwyr i leddfu effaith ailfandio'r dreth gyngor. Nid yw'r cymorth gymaint ag yr oeddwn wedi ei obeithio, ond o leiaf bod rhywbeth i helpu'r sawl sydd wedi dioddef fwyaf. Yn dilyn y trafodaethau diweddar, ceir pecyn i gynorthwyo pensiynwyr i ddiogelu, gwresogi ac insiwleiddio eu tai, fel yr amlinellodd y Gweinidog.

Fodd bynnag, cyllideb Llafur Newydd yw hon. Y darlun mawr, wrth gwrs, yw nad yw Cymru yn cael ei hariannu'n ddigonol. Mae gwir angen fformiwla deg, wedi ei seilio ar ein hanghenion. Byddai hynny'n golygu dros £800 miliwn ychwanegol i Gymru bob blwyddyn. Dyna bwysigrwydd y ddadl.

Mae eisoes gennym ambell fformiwla wedi'i seilio ar ein hanghenion—er enghraifft, ym

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for her announcement today on the final budget and for her assistance and co-operation during the recent discussion on the budget. I will not go back over the whole story of the draft budget, but I will just note the collaboration between the four parties and the independent Members in order to reach an agreement on the final budget last week.

It is also true to state that this is the kind of cross-party collaboration that the people of Wales were keen to see following 1999—a new kind of politics with everyone collaborating for the people of Wales. Of course, the political reality here is what drives this, and the background to the discussions was the reality of the agreement between the four leaders in the summer on student fees, which included an agreement to fund the historic gap between universities in Wales and those in England. There was no mention of that in the draft budget, and that was the basis of the original amendment.

Also as a background to that were the strong feelings stemming from council tax rebanding in Wales, especially in light of the decision to abolish the rebanding exercise in England and the anger stemming from that. People are still angry about that. That was the basis of the clause in our amendment to the draft budget on the need to help pensioners who are suffering as a result of rebanding. Therefore, I am happy to see that there is assistance for pensioners to alleviate the effect of council tax rebanding. It is not as much as I had hoped, but at least there is something to help those who have suffered most. Following the recent discussions, there is also a package to help pensioners to heat and insulate their homes and make them secure, as the Minister outlined.

However, this is a New Labour budget. The big picture, of course, is that Wales is not being funded adequately. There is a real need for a fair formula based on our needs. That would mean an additional £800 million plus for Wales every year. That is the importance of the debate.

We already have some needs-based formulae—for example, in health and local

maes iechyd a llywodraeth leol—ac yr ydym wedi darganfod bod y lleoedd â'r anghenion mwyaf wedi cael mwy o arian fel canlyniad. Felly mae gwir angen i Lafur edrych ar y mater hwn o ddifrif, er mwyn Cymru. O ran craffu ar y broses gyllidol yn y Cynulliad, credaf fod angen pwylgor cyllido i fynd i'r afael â'r manylion cyllido drwy gydol y flwyddyn.

Yn nhermau y ddadl hon heddiw, cyllideb Llafur Newydd i Gymru yw hon. Mae gwelliannau i'r drafft gyllideb gwreiddiol. Heb y trafodaethau diweddar ni fyddai wedi bod unrhyw beth ar gyfer ein prifysgolion nac ar gyfer ein pensiynwyr i leddfu poen yr ail-fandio. Yr ydym, fel plaid, wedi bod yn gymedrol iawn yn ein gofynion. Deallwn y cyfyngiadau ariannol, ac y mae mwy na digon o arian wrth gefn i ariannu'r cytundeb hwn. Nid oes angen torri cyllideb unrhyw portffolio i wireddu'r cytundeb ar y gyllideb derfynol heddiw. Nid oes angen torri unrhyw gyllideb; mae digon o arian wrth gefn. Felly, ni fydd Plaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r gyllideb heddiw.

**Glyn Davies:** I thank the Minister for her very detailed presentation, and for her unfailing willingness to discuss budget issues with me, as the Conservative finance spokesman, and to allow her staff to hold discussions with me.

The Conservative group will abstain in the vote on the Government's final budget today. A Conservative budget would be constructed very differently to a Labour budget. Indeed, to pick up a point that Lorraine Barrett made, it is highly likely that a Conservative budget would not have the same degree of free provision, which we have often described as an election gimmick. Therefore, our budget would be different. However, we acknowledge that this final budget is better than the draft budget. On that basis, we are prepared to allow the budget to go through.

I also acknowledge the positive response of the First Minister, and of the formidable and deceptively tough and determined Finance Minister, following the defeat of the draft budget. The Conservative Party was certainly not happy with the draft budget.

government—and we have discovered that the areas of greatest need have had more money as a result. Labour therefore needs to look at this issue seriously, for the sake of Wales. In terms of scrutinising the budgetary process in the Assembly, I think we need a finance committee to tackle financial issues throughout the year.

In terms of this debate, this is a New Labour budget for Wales. There are improvements to the original draft budget. Had it not been for the recent discussions there would not have been anything for our universities or for our pensioners to relieve the pain of rebanding. As a party we have been very reasonable in our requests. We understand the financial limitations, and there is more than enough in the reserves to fund this agreement. There is no need to cut the budget of any portfolio to realise the agreement on the final budget today. There is no need to cut any budget; there are sufficient reserves. Therefore, Plaid Cymru will not oppose the budget today.

**Glyn Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei chyflwyniad manwl iawn, ac am ei pharodrwydd diffaol i drafod materion cyllidebol gyda mi, fel llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr ar gyllid, ac am ganiatáu i'w staff gael trafodaethau gyda mi.

Bydd y grŵp Ceidwadwyr yn ymatal yn y bleidlais ar gyllideb derfynol y Llywodraeth heddiw. Byddai cyllideb Geidwadol wedi'i llunio'n wahanol iawn i gyllideb Lafur. Yn wir, i godi pwynt a wnaeth Lorraine Barrett, mae'n debygol iawn na fyddai gan gyllideb Geidwadol yr un ddarpariaeth am ddim -rhywbeth a ddisgrifiwyd gennym yn aml fel gimig etholiadol. Felly, byddai ein cyllideb ni yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddwn fod y gyllideb derfynol hon yn well na'r gyllideb ddrafft. Ar y sail honno, yr ydym yn barod i ganiatáu i'r gyllideb gael ei derbyn.

Cydnabyddaf hefyd ymateb cadarnhaol y Prif Weinidog, a'r Gweinidog Cyllid gwydn sy'n dwyllodrus o galed a phenderfynol, ar ôl i'r gyllideb ddrafft gael ei threchu. Yn sicr, nid oedd y Blaid Geidwadol yn fodlon â'r gyllideb ddrafft.

The most disappointing aspect of the agreement, which has enabled us to change our position on the budget, is the amount of help to be given to council tax payers, particularly those on low fixed incomes. We acknowledge that 16,000 pensioners who have gone up one band will have help, but I do not think that goes far enough to assuage the sense of injustice that exists across Wales, particularly among those who are older and on low fixed incomes.

Yr agwedd fwyaf siomedig ar y cytundeb, sydd wedi ein galluogi i newid ein safbwyt ar y gyllideb, yw'r cymorth y bwriedir ei roi i bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor, yn arbennig y rheini sydd ar incwm sefydlog isel. Cydnabyddwn y bydd 16,000 o bensiynwyr y mae eu heiddo wedi codi un band yn cael cymorth, ond ni chredaf fod hynny'n mynd yn ddigon pell i leddfu'r ymdeimlad o anghyfiawnder sy'n bodoli ledled Cymru, yn arbennig ymhliith pobl hŷn sydd ar incwm sefydlog isel.

**Leighton Andrews:** You said earlier that we could not expect the same degree of free provision in a Conservative budget, so could you clarify which provision the Conservatives would cut? Would it be free swimming, free prescriptions or free bus passes for the elderly and disabled people?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr oeddech yn dweud yn gynharach na allem ddisgwyl yr un ddarpariaeth am ddim mewn cyllideb Geidwadol, felly, a allech egluro pa ddarpariaeth y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei thorri? Ai nofio am ddim, presgripsiynau am ddim neu docynnau bws am ddim i'r henoed a phobl anabl?

**Glyn Davies:** You ask a question to which you know the answer. We have made it clear that we do not think that providing free prescriptions is sensible. We think that it has led to more people having to wait for operations. However, we have always thought free swimming was a sensible policy.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydych yn gofyn cwestiwn ac yn gwybod yr ateb. Yr ydym wedi egluro nad ydym yn credu bod darparu presgripsiynau am ddim yn ddoeth. Credwn fod mwy o bobl yn gorfod aros am lawdriniaeth yn sgîl hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi bod o'r farn o'r cychwyn fod nofio am ddim yn bolisi doeth.

4.20 p.m.

We particularly welcome the additional £5 million in the budget to help pensioners with their heating. That is a sensible and welcome improvement. Indeed, it is such a good proposal that Gordon Brown, who must have been listening in on the discussions, has decided to adopt the proposal for England. Yet again, Wales is leading the way.

Croesawn yn arbennig y £5 miliwn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i helpu pensiynwyr i dalu costau gwresogi eu cartrefi. Croesawn y gwelliant doeth hwnnw. Yn wir, mae'n gynnig mor dda fel bod Gordon Brown, sydd wdi bod yn gwrando ar y trafodaethau, mae'n rhaid, wedi penderfynu mabwysiadu'r cynnig ar gyfer Lloegr. Unwaith eto, mae Cymru yn arwain y ffordd.

The pre-budget report provides a context for a discussion of the Government's final budget. I would like to look at one or two issues in that regard. It is clear that the economy is slowing down seriously. For the second time, the Chancellor admitted a reduction in the growth rates, which fell from 3.5 per cent to 2.5 per cent, and have now fallen to 1.75 per cent. That is the equivalent of a finance director giving two profit warnings in a year. In those circumstances,

Mae'r adroddiad cyn y gyllideb yn gyddestun ar gyfer trafodaeth ar gyllideb derfynol y Llywodraeth. Hoffwn ystyried un neu ddau fater yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Mae'n amlwg fod yr economi'n arafu'n sylweddol. Am yr eildro, mae'r Canghellor wedi cyfaddef bod cyfraddau twf wedi gostwng, o 3.5 y cant i 2.5 y cant, a bellach maent wedi gostwng i 1.75 y cant. Mae hynny fel clywed cyfarwyddwr cyllid yn rhoi dau rybudd am elw mewn blwyddyn. Yn yr

the finance director would nearly always have the sack. The Chancellor yesterday looked rather like a ragged, battle-scarred old war-horse, particularly when compared with the sleek, gleaming thoroughbreds that he now faces across the despatch box in the form of David Cameron and George Osborne. I would like to congratulate David Cameron, not only on his elevation to leader of the party, but on a brilliant performance during Prime Minister's questions today; the Prime Minister was clearly discomfited.

It is obvious that, across Britain, the Conservative Party is back in business big time. There are indeed political Barnett-style consequentials for the Assembly arising from this. It is clear that, after the 2007 election, the Conservative Party will threaten the Labour Party's position as the largest party in this institution. There are other financial consequentials arising from this. It is reported to be £28 million over a three-year period, with around £14 million for next year. At this stage, we do not know exactly what that figure is—although perhaps the Minister does—but this will become apparent in due course. I hope that there will be a degree of cross-party discussion about how this additional money will be spent. That is an important development, building on what has happened so far. Bearing in mind the Minister's oft-quoted commitment to committee priorities, I hope that she will at least consider using this money to redress the cuts made to committees' budgets. This has to be a matter for cross-party discussion between the Minister and the finance spokespeople and leaders of the opposition parties.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The future growth and prosperity of Wales depends upon a strategic and long-term investment in the greatest asset that Wales has: its people. Investing in human capital is the next step in the development of Wales as a leader in the global race for jobs. Long-term fiscal sustainability will only flow from the creation of a well-educated, adaptable and skilled workforce that is able to drive down unemployment and drive up productivity and growth.

amgylchiadau hynny, byddai'r cyfarwyddwr cyllid wedi ei ddiswyddo bron bob tro. Yr oedd y Canghellor yn edrych yn debyg i hen geffyl rhyfel lluddedig â chreithiau'r brwydrau arno, yn arbennig o'i gymharu â'r cefylau brid llyfn, gloyw sy'n ei wynebu bellach ar draws y blwch dogfennau ar ffurf David Cameron a George Osborne. Hoffwn longyfarch David Cameron, nid yn unig ar ei ddyrchafiad i fod yn arweinydd y blaidd, ond ar berfformiad rhagorol yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog yn San Steffan heddiw; yr oedd yn amlwg fod y Prif Weinidog yn teimlo'n anesmwyth.

Mae'n amlwg, ar hyd a lled Prydain, fod y Blaid Geidwadol yn ôl ar ei thraed eto. Yn wir, mae yna ganlyniadau gwleidyddol tebyg i'r fformiwla Barnett i'r Cynulliad o hyn. Mae'n amlwg, ar ôl etholiad 2007, y bydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn peryglu statws y Blaid Lafur fel y blaidd fwyaf yn y sefydliad hwn. Mae canlyniadau ariannol eraill yn deillio o hyn. Dywedir bod hynny yn £28 miliwn dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, a thua £14 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Ar hyn o bryd, ni wyddom yn union beth yw'r ffigur—er bod y Gweinidog yn gwybod, hwyrach—ond bydd yn dod i'r amlwg maes o law. Gobeithio y bydd rhywfaint o drafodaeth drawsbleidiol am y ffordd y caiff yr arian ychwanegol hwn ei wario. Mae hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig, gan adeiladu ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd hyd yma. O gofio ymrwymiad y Gweinidog, a ddyfynnir yn aml, i flaenorriaethau pwylgor, gobeithio y bydd o leiaf yn ystyried defnyddio'r arian hwn i wneud iawn am y toriadau yng nghyllidebau'r pwylgorau. Rhaid i hwn fod yn fater i'w drafod rhwng y Gweinidog a llefarwyr cyllid ac arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae twf a ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar fuddsoddiad strategol a hir yn yr ased mwyaf sydd gan Gymru: ei phobl. Buddsoddi mewn cyfalaf dynol yw'r cam nesaf yn natblygiad Cymru fel arweinydd yn y ras fyde-eang am swyddi. Dim ond drwy greu gweithlu hyddysg, hyblyg a medrus sy'n gallu lleihau diweithdra a gwella cynhyrchiant a thwf y daw cynaliadwyedd ariannol hirdymor.

**Jocelyn Davies:** If our future success relies so much on having a well-educated workforce, why did you resist the no-tuition-fees position of the opposition?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The answer, as you know, is long and detailed. I believe that a contribution by graduates, and a recognition of the financial investment in their future, is reasonable. I think that you knew the answer to that question before you asked it. [Interruption.] I have given my answer.

**Several Assembly Members rose—**

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I will not take any more interventions on that point; I have only reached my third sentence.

Wales and the UK are in a strong position, with clear strategies for such investments, strategies that are right to rely on a strong interchange between education and economic development policy.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I will come back to you in a minute. I have only reached my third paragraph.

The newly-announced strategy, ‘Wales: A Vibrant Economy’, capitalises on these very issues and gives Wales a coherent modern strategy that matches the Lisbon and Gothenburg agendas for more and better jobs. I assume that the opposition knows what that is.

This budget allows for continued strong investments in our deprived communities. I do not expect the opposition to be too concerned about that.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you give way?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Go on then.

**Eleanor Burnham:** If you are so confident that you are doing so well, how is it that the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, whose gathering I attended last week, alleges that

**Jocelyn Davies:** Os yw ein llwyddiant yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu cymaint ar gael gweithlu hydysg, pam yr oeddech yn gwrrhod y safbwyt dim ffioedd dysgu gan y gwrrbleidiau?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'r ateb yn hir ac yn fanwl, fel y gwyddoch. Credaf fod cyfraniad gan raddedigion, a chydnabyddiaeth o'r buddsoddiad ariannol yn eu dyfodol, yn rhesymol. Credaf eich bod yn gwybod yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw cyn ichi ei ofyn. [Torri ar draws.] Yr wyf wedi rhoi fy ateb.

**Cododd sawl Aelod o'r Cynulliad—**

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Ni dderbyniaf unrhyw ymyriadau eraill ar y pwynt hwnnw; nid wyf wedi cyrraedd ond fy nhrydedd frawddeg eto.

Mae Cymru a'r DU mewn sefyllfa gref, gyda strategaethau clir ar gyfer buddsoddiadau felly, strategaethau sy'n iawn i ddibynnu ar broses gyfnewid gref rhwng polisi addysg a datblygu economaidd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Dychwelaf at eich pwynt ymhen munud. Nid wyf wedi cyrraedd ond fy nhrydydd paragraff eto.

Mae'r strategaeth sydd newydd ei chyhoeddi, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', yn manteisio ar yr union faterion hyn ac yn rhoi strategaeth fodern gydlynol i Gymru, sy'n cyd-fynd ag agendâu Lisbon a Gothenburg i gael mwy o swyddi a swyddi gwell. Tybiaf fod y gwrrbleidiau yn gwybod beth yw hynny.

Mae'r gyllideb hon yn caniatáu buddsoddiadau cryf parhaus yn ein cymunedau difreintiedig. Ni ddisgwyliaf i'r gwrrbleidiau bryderu llawer am hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ildiwch?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** O'r gorau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Os ydych mor hyderus eich bod yn gwneud cystal, pam mae Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree – a bûm yn ei gyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf - yn honni nad

we are not doing any better than we have done over the last 20 years, and that it could take until at least 2040 until we eradicate any poverty in Wales?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Employment and earnings in Wales are up. I do not accept your analysis.

Let me talk about our deprived communities, as I represent an area that knows deprivation very well. It is worth remembering that 33 per cent of the population of Wales live in the greater Valleys areas. Improving links between education and business in our deprived communities is fundamental to the success of this budget's additional investments in this area.

The additional £38 million in this budget to create flexible learning opportunities for 14 to 19 year-olds across schools, colleges and workplaces will chime well with the aims of the strategic framework for the Heads of the Valleys. It will deliver an increase in the quality and choice of courses that meet the needs of the learner and the employer.

As the chair of the Objective 1 programme monitoring committee I also know that this additional money in the budget will help bolster many of the aims of the Objective 1 projects throughout west Wales and the Valleys in years to come. This is Welsh Labour investing for the long term, not the short term.

The final budget should ensure that all investments are directed towards delivering better business sustainability. It is a difficult task, but sustainability is key if the businesses in which we invest are to make a long-term commitment to the communities in which they operate.

I believe that this budget today will enable us to gear additional investments towards improving skills and supporting re-entry into the labour market for many thousands of people in Wales. Ensuring that the jobs on offer are high value-added jobs, with skills demands fit for a knowledge economy, is critical in all of this. This is why the additional £30 million for the expansion of

ydym yn gwneud yn well nag a wnaethom yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, ac y gallai gymryd tan o leiaf 2040 i ddileu unrhyw dldodi yng Nghymru?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae cyflogaeth ac enillion wedi cynyddu yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn derbyn eich dadansoddiad.

Gadewch imi siarad am ein cymunedau difreintiedig, gan fy mod yn cynrychioli ardal sy'n gyfarwydd iawn ag amddifadedd. Mae'n werth cofio bod 33 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru yn byw yn ardaloedd y Cymoedd. Mae gwella cysylltiadau rhwng addysg a busnes yn ein cymunedau difreintiedig yn hanfodol i sicrhau llwyddiant buddsoddiadau ychwanegol y gyllideb hon yn yr ardal hon.

Bydd y £38 miliwn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb hon i greu cyfleoedd dysgu hyblyg i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed mewn ysgolion, colegau a gweithleoedd yn cydwedu'n dda â nodau'r fframwaith strategol ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Bydd yn sicrhau cynnydd yn ansawdd ac amrywiaeth cyrsiau sy'n diwallu anghenion y dysgwr a'r cyflogwr.

Fel cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen Amcan 1 gwn hefyd y bydd yr arian ychwanegol hwn yn y gyllideb yn helpu hybu nifer o'r nodau yn y prosiectau Amcan 1 ledled y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn y blynnyddoedd i ddod. Llafur Cymru yn buddsoddi ar gyfer y cyfnod hir yw hyn, yn hytrach nag yn y cyfnod byr.

Dylai'r gyllideb derfynol sicrhau y bydd pob buddsoddiad yn anelu'n uniongyrchol at sicrhau gwell cynaliadwyedd busnes. Mae'n dasg anodd, ond mae cynaliadwyedd yn allweddol er mwyn i'r busnesau y buddsoddwn ynddynt wneud ymrwymiad hirdymor i'r cymunedau lle maent yn gweithredu.

Credaf y bydd y gyllideb hon heddiw yn ein galluogi i anelu buddsoddiadau ychwanegol at wella sgiliau miloedd lawer o bobl yng Nghymru, a'u helpu i ailymuno â'r farchnad lafur. Mae sicrhau bod y swyddi sydd ar gael yn swyddi sy'n ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol, gyda galw am sgiliau sy'n addas i'r economi wybodaeth, yn allweddol yn hyn oll. Dyma pam y mae croeso i'r £30 miliwn

innovation and design and technology initiatives is welcome in this final budget. This budget is yet another clear indication of Labour's forward-looking commitment to the people of Wales, as we plan ahead in investing in areas of job growth.

Finally, in respect of the additional £15 million for better nutrition in schools, as the chair of the all-party group on healthy living I have taken a close interest in the school nutrition agenda since the group was founded in 2003. It is excellent news that more money is available for this critical issue. We all know that childhood obesity is likely to reach almost epidemic levels in Wales in decades to come unless we put in place preventative measures now. This additional money can be channelled into investments in simple measures like making more water coolers available and providing healthy vending machines in more schools. However, I would not be comfortable with the bulk of this money being allocated before we know the recommendations in the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning's comprehensive report on a whole-school approach to nutrition, which is due in April 2006. This is welcome additional money, but we need to know what is happening on the ground in our schools, and to ensure that interventions make the best use of the firm evidence that we can gather.

I welcome this budget because it delivers for people throughout Wales, including our youngest citizens. It delivers to the people of Wales greater equality of outcomes in the long term, not just greater choice in the short term.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r gyllideb newydd yn well na'r gyllideb wreiddiol. Mae'r trafod rhwng y gwrthbleidiau a'r Llywodraeth wedi talu'r ffordd. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r arian a fydd yn dod i'r pensiynwyr ar gyfer y dreth gyngor.

However, this is still far from perfect. It represents what was achievable in the circumstances rather than what we as Welsh Liberal Democrats would ideally wish to see even within the unfair constraints of the

ychwanegol yn y gyllideb derfynol hon ar gyfer ehangu arloesedd a mentrau dylunio a thechnoleg. Mae'r gyllideb hon yn arwydd clir arall o ymrwymiad blaengar Llafur i bobl Cymru, wrth inni gynllunio at y dyfodol i i fuddsoddi mewn ardaloedd lle mae twf mewn swyddi.

I gloi, o ran y £15 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer maethiad gwell mewn ysgolion, fel cadeirydd y grŵp hollbleidiol ar fyw'n iach, yr wyf wedi dilyn yr agenda maethiad mewn ysgolion yn agos ers sefydlu'r grŵp yn 2003. Mae'n newyddion ardderchog fod rhagor o arian ar gael ar gyfer y mater hollbwysig hwn. Gwyddom o gyd fod gordewdra ymhliith plant yn debygol o droi'n epidemig bron yng Nghymru yn y degawdau i ddod oni roddwn fusurau ataliol ar waith yn awr. Gellir sianelu'r arian ychwanegol hwn i fuddsoddi mewn mesurau syml, fel sicrhau bod mwy o gyfarpar oeri dŵr ar gael a rhoi peiriannau gwerthu bwyd iach mewn mwy o ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn hapus pe bae'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian hwn yn cael ei ddyrannu cyn inni wybod argymhellion adroddiad cynhwysfawr y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar ddull ysgol gyfan o fynd i'r afael â maethiad, y bwriedir ei gyhoeddi ym mis Ebrill 2006. Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol hwn, ond mae angen inni wybod beth sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad yn ein ysgolion, a sicrhau bod yr ymyriadau yn defnyddio yn y ffordd orau y dystiolaeth gadarn y gallwn ei chasglu.

Croesawaf y gyllideb hon am ei bod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i bobl ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys ein dinasyddion ieuengaf. Mae'n sicrhau canlyniadau mwy cyfartal dros gyfnod hir i bobl Cymru, nid mwy o ddewis yn unig.

**Jenny Randerson:** The new budget is better than the original budget. The discussions between the opposition parties and the Government have paid off. I welcome the money which will be made available to pensioners for the council tax.

Fodd bynnag, mae hyn ymhell o fod yn berffaith. Mae'n cynrychioli'r hyn y gellid ei gyflawni dan yr amgylchiadau, yn hytrach na'r hyn y byddem ni fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru am ei weld yn

Barnett formula.

4.30 p.m.

It is interesting that the First Minister has called this a real Labour budget. I do not follow his logic. Labour's real budget came to the Chamber, and was thrown out. It was thrown out because there was no help for pensioners, there was no attempt to close the funding gap in higher education, there was no money to improve our children's school dinners, and there was no extra investment in railways. It was the Labour budget. The Assembly said that it was not good enough. What we have now is a better budget. It has Liberal Democrat priorities in education and help for pensioners back among the Assembly's spending priorities.

**Carl Sargeant:** If it is your budget now, will you support it today?

**Jenny Randerson:** Wait a minute, I have not gone far enough yet.

That is now back among our spending priorities. We have put back the small schools fund, which was created by the partnership Government, which was driven by the Welsh Liberal Democrats, and has been renegotiated by us here.

However, this is still Labour's budget. It is based on Labour's plans, and it is Labour's way of dealing with the amendments that were put forward in the debate on the draft budget.

Labour's draft budget also put the emphasis on administration, with millions of pounds set aside for bureaucracy, and further millions sitting in the bank, building up, one has to suspect, a war chest for the pre-election budget in 12 months' time. Forgive me if I sound a little cynical, but I suspect that that is what we will see. Labour told us that we could not touch these pots of money, but it has now seen sense. We have put the money where it is needed instead—in the purses of pensioners, on the plates of our schoolchildren, and to put our universities on

ddelfrydol, hyd yn oed gyda chyfngiadau annheg y fformiwla Barnett.

Mae'n ddiddorol fod y Prif Weinidog wedi galw hon yn gyllideb Lafur go iawn. Ni allaf ddilyn ei resymeg. Daeth cyllideb Lafur go iawn i'r Siambr, ac fe'i taflwyd allan. Fe'i taflwyd allan oherwydd nad oedd cymorth i bensiynwyr, nid oedd ymgais i gau'r bwlch ariannu mewn addysg uwch, nid oedd arian i wella ciniawau ysgol ein plant, ac nid oedd buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn rheilffyrdd. Dyna oedd y gyllideb Lafur. Dywedodd y Cynulliad nad oedd hynny'n ddigon da. Yr hyn sydd gennym yn awr yw gwell cyllideb. Mae wedi gosod blaenoriaethau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o ran addysg a chymorth i bensiynwyr yn ôl ymhlieth blaenoriaethau gwariant y Cynulliad.

**Carl Sargeant:** Os eich cyllideb chi yw hi yn awr, a fyddwch yn ei chefnogi heddiw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Arhoswch funud, rhowch gyfle i mi ymhelaethu.

Mae hynny bellach yn ôl ymhlieth ein blaenoriaethau gwariant. Yr ydym wedi rhoi'r gronfa ysgolion bach yn ei hôl, a gafodd ei chreu gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, ei hysgogi gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru a'i hail-negodi gennym ni yma.

Fodd bynnag, cyllideb Lafur yw hi o hyd. Mae'n seiliedig ar gynlluniau Llafur, a dyma yw ffordd Llafur i ymdrin â'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn y ddadl ar y gyllideb ddrafft.

Yr oedd cyllideb ddrafft Llafur hefyd yn rhoi pwyslais ar weinyddu, a miliynau o bunnoedd wedi'u neilltuo ar gyfer biwrocratiaeth, a miliynau'n rhagor yn eistedd yn y banc, gan gronni, dybiwn i, gronfa wrth gefn ar gyfer y gyllideb cyn yr etholiad ymhen 12 mis. Maddeuwch imi os wyf yn swnio braidd yn sinigaidd, ond yr wyf yn amau mai dyna a welwn. Dywedodd Llafur wrthym na allem gyffwrdd â'r cronfeydd hyn, ond yn awr mae wedi gweld y goleuni. Yn hytrach, yr ydym wedi rhoi'r arian lle mae ei angen—ym mhwrws

a level footing with their neighbours in England.

This is not, and is far short of, a perfect budget. It is not the budget that the Welsh Liberal Democrats would have put forward in Government, but it is a better budget than Labour's first draft.

One key question for the Minister is where this budget stands vis-à-vis the additional money announced by Gordon Brown, which has consequentials of £28 million for Wales, £15 million of which seems to relate to assistance for council tax payers. I hope that the Minister will not consider that her duty to council tax payers has already been discharged with the allocation of £100 for those people going up by two or more bands. Council tax payers' needs go further than the £2.3 million that you were prepared to put in this budget. The Minister always argues that council tax in Wales is lower than in England, but she misses the point that council tax rises have been much steeper in Wales because of rebanding. Therefore, we expect all council tax payers in Wales to see the benefit of the money announced by Gordon Brown.

Also, you clearly knew at the time of the negotiations that the money announced for additional heating was going to come forward, and that is why the offer was made. To balance the budget, however, it had to come out of the main body of the existing budget. When the consequentials come through to Wales, I hope that any excess over the £10 million in the budget will go through to pensioners and to those in the poorest groups, to help them with their heating.

We welcome strongly the money in here for the small schools fund—the extra £3.5 million. It is a pity that it has not been possible to put the additional £0.6 million into the same pot of money, although we understand that, at this late stage in negotiations, it was difficult to do so. However, I hope that the Minister will give some consideration to that next year.

pensiynwyr, ar blatiau ein plant ysgol, ac i sierhau bod ein prifysgolion yn gyfartal â'u cymdogion yn Lloegr.

Nid yw hon yn gyllideb berffaith, ac mae ymhell o fod yn berffaith. Nid dyna'r gyllideb y byddai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi'i chyflwyno fel Llywodraeth, ond mae'n gyllideb well na drafft cyntaf Llafur.

Un cwestiwn allweddol i'r Gweinidog yw beth yw sefyllfa'r gyllideb hon o ran yr arian ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd gan Gordon Brown, sydd â symiau canlyniadol o £28 miliwn i Gymru. Mae'n ymddangos bod £15 miliwn o hynny'n ymwneud â chymorth i bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor. Gobeithio na fydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried ei bod wedi cyflawni ei dyletswydd i bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor gyda'r dyraniad o £100 ar gyfer y bobl hynny y mae eu heiddo yn codi dau fand neu fwy. Mae anghenion pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor yn fwy na'r £2.3 miliwn yr oeddech yn barod i'w roi yn y gyllideb hon. Mae'r Gweinidog bob amser yn dadlau bod y dreth gyngor yn is yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ond nid yw'n deall y pwynt fod y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor wedi bod lawer yn uwch yng Nghymru oherwydd yr ailfandio. Felly, disgwyliwn i bawb sy'n talu treth gyngor yng Nghymru weld budd o'r arian a gyhoeddwyd gan Gordon Brown.

Hefyd, yr oeddech yn amlwg yn gwybod yn ystod y negodiadau y byddai arian yn cael ei gyhoeddi ar gyfer gwresogi ychwanegol, a dyna pam y gwnaed y cynnig. I fantoli'r gyllideb, fod bynnag, yr oedd yn rhaid iddo ddod o brif gorff y gyllideb bresennol. Pan ddaw'r symiau canlyniadol i Gymru, gobeithio y bydd unrhyw arian sy'n ychwanegol at y £10 miliwn yn y gyllideb yn cael ei roi i'r pensiynwyr ac i bobl yn y grwpiau tlataf, i'w helpu gyda gwresogi.

Croesawn yn fawr yr arian sydd yma ar gyfer y gronfa ysgolion bach—y £3.5 miliwn ychwanegol. Mae'n drueni na fu'n bosibl rhoi'r £0.6 miliwn ychwanegol yn yr un gronfa, er y deallwn ei bod yn anodd gwneud hynny oherwydd ei bod mor hwyr yn y trafodaethau. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi ystyriaeth i hynny flwyddyn nesaf.

I have one other question for the Minister. You pinpointed in your statement on 30 November the contingency reserve of £64 million. You define this as a way of covering unforeseen emergency demands. I would be grateful if you could inform us exactly what kind of event you would consider to be an unforeseen emergency. Can we have an undertaking that it will not be set aside for pre-planned projects?

To conclude, the Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that the amendments incorporated here are good news for higher education and good news for council tax payers, but that they do not solve the problems faced in either sector. It does, however, make a start. We will not support the budget; we will abstain.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o'r cyfle i gyfrannu i'r drafodaeth hon ar y gyllideb. Yr wyf bellach yn cytuno gyda byrdwn y ddadl hon, sef bod mwyafrif y gyllideb hon yn gyllideb Lafur, ond bod y gwrthbleidiau, oherwydd y gwelliant a'r trafodaethau, wedi gwella'r gyllideb sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Bydd y newidiadau y mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi'u hamlinellu, sef y newidiadau o safbwyt gwariant ar bensiynwyr ac yn y blaen—a dof at hynny mewn eiliad—o gymorth sylweddol i bobl Cymru, a byddant yn golygu rhywbeth i bawb sy'n cael cymorth. Bydd yn golygu rhywbeth yn benodol i'r pensiynwyr sydd yn mynd i fyny fwy na dau fand eu bod yn mynd i gael cymorth uniongyrchol i dalu eu biliau treth gyngor. Er fy mod yn cytuno gyda Glyn Davies nad yw'r niferoedd yn enfawr—rhyw 16,000 o bobl—ac y byddwn wedi hoffi gweld mwy o bensiynwyr yn derbyn cymorth, mae'n help gwirioneddol iddynt o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny.

Cytunaf hefyd gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid bod angen ymgrych i sicrhau bod y pensiynwyr hynny sydd â hawl i gael cymorth gyda'r dreth gyngor yn manteisio ar eu hawliau. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymgrych yn llwyddiannus; mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar bob Aelod i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch iawn o weld bod y Llywodraeth wedi symud ar fater cyllido

Mae gennys un cwestiwn arall i'r Gweinidog. Yn eich datganiad ar 30 Tachwedd yr oeddech yn sôn yn benodol am y gronfa wrth gefn o £64 miliwn. Diffiniwch hyn fel modd o fodloni gofynion mewn argyfwng na ellir ei ragweld. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe galleg ddweud wrthym yn union pa fath o ddigwyddiad y byddech yn ei ystyried yn argyfwng na ellir ei ragweld. A allwn gael addewid na chaiff hyn ei neilltuo ar gyfer prosiectau a gynnuniwyd eisoes?

I orffen, cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru fod y gwelliannau a ymgorfforir yma yn newyddion da ar gyfer addysg uwch ac yn newyddion da ar gyfer pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor. Ond nid ydynt yn datrys y problemau yn y naill sector na'r llall. Fodd bynnag, y mae'n fan cychwyn. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gyllideb; byddwn yn ymatal.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am very pleased to have the opportunity to contribute to this debate on the budget. I now agree with the thrust of this debate, namely that this is mainly a Labour budget, but that the opposition parties, because of the amendment and the discussions, have improved the budget that is before us today. The changes which the Finance Minister have outlined, namely those of expenditure on pensioners—and I will come to that in a second—will be of significant assistance to the people of Wales, and they will mean something to everyone who benefits. It will mean something specific to those pensioners who will move up more than two bands that they will be given direct assistance to pay their council tax bills. Although I agree with Glyn Davies that the numbers are not huge—around 16,000 people—and although that I would have liked to see more pensioners receiving assistance, it is a real help to them in those circumstances.

I also agree with the Finance Minister that we need a campaign to ensure that pensioners who are eligible to claim council tax assistance take advantage of their rights. I hope that campaign is a success; it is up to every Member to ensure that that happens.

I am also very pleased to see that the Government has moved on the issue of

prifysgolion. Mae'n hynod bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod yr ymrwymiad a wnaed pan gytunwyd ar ffioedd dysgu myfyrwyr, sef ein bod ni, yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, yn dechrau cau'r bwlch. Cydnabyddaf fod y trafodaethau wedi bod yn anodd iawn ar nifer o faterion, ond yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn hynny.

Mae'r holl faterion hyn yn unol â blaenoriaethau Plaid Cymru ar helpu pensiynwyr, plant yn ein hysgolion a myfyrwyr. Cyfeiriad yn benodol at yr arian ar gyfer ysgolion bach. Mae hyn yn bwysig gan fod nifer o awdurodau lleol, ar hyn o bryd, yn mynd drwy broses boenus iawn o edrych ar faint o ysgolion bach y dylent eu cadw. Bydd yr arian sydd ar gael o gymorth, nid fel cronfa y gall pobl ei defnyddio pan fo ysgolion ar fin cau, ond fel cymorth i ysgolion bach o safbwyt gweinyddu, ac i brifathrawon ysgolion bach gyda'u cyfrifoldebau eang. Yr ydym yn falch o weld yr holl bwyntiau hyn—y mae Plaid Cymru wedi ymladd drostynt dros nifer o flynyddoedd—yn y gyllideb o ganlyniad i drafodaethau gyda'r pleidiau eraill.

Cyfeiriad hefyd at drafnidiaeth—sydd wedi chwarae rhan eithaf pwysig yn ein trafodaethau—ac at un gwasanaeth yn benodol. Bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gwybod yn union pa wasanaeth yw hwnnw—y gwasanaeth rhwng y de a'r gogledd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd y gwasanaeth yn gwella o fis Rhagfyr, yn yr ystyr y bydd mwy o drenau yn mynd bob cam o Gaergybi i Gaerdydd. Croesawaf hynny, ond bydd y gwasanaeth newydd hwnnw, hyd yn oed, yn waeth na'r hyn a gaiff pobl sy'n teithio o ogledd Cymru i Lundain. Pam yn y byd bod yn rhaid i drenau aros yn yr Amwythig—a dywedaf hyn gymaint o weithiau ag sydd angen—am 15 neu 20 munud pan fo trenau sy'n mynd o Gaergybi i Lundain yn gallu mynd heb aros fwy nag unwaith neu ddwy ar ôl Crewe? Pam bod yn rhaid i drenau rhwng y de a'r gogledd stopio ym mhob Gorsaf, bron, hyd yn oed yn Lloegr, cyn cyrraedd Caerdydd? Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn cael gwasanaethau trêu cyflym, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn o ymrwymiad y Gweinidog y bydd yr achos busnes dros y gwasanaeth hwnnw yn dechrau yn y flwyddyn newydd.

university funding. It is extremely important that the Government should acknowledge the commitment made when student tuition fees were agreed upon, namely that we would start to close the gap in the next financial year. I acknowledge that discussions have been very difficult on a number of issues, but I am pleased that the Government has accepted that.

All of these issues are in line with the Plaid Cymru priorities for helping pensioners, children in our schools and students. I refer specifically to the funding for small schools. This is important because a number of local authorities are, at present, going through a painful process of looking at how many small schools they should maintain. The funding available will be of assistance, not just as a fund that people can dip into when schools are about to close, but to assist small schools in terms of administration, and for headteachers of small schools with their wide-ranging responsibilities. We are very pleased to see all these points—for which Plaid Cymru has been fighting over a number of years—being included in the budget as a result of discussions with the other parties.

I shall refer also to transport—which has been a quite important part of our discussions—and to one service in particular. The Finance Minister will know exactly which service that is—the north-south service. I am aware that the service will improve as from December, in the sense that a greater number of trains will travel all the way from Holyhead to Cardiff. I welcome that, but even that new service is worse than that which people travelling from north Wales to London will have. Why on earth do trains have to wait in Shrewsbury—and I will say this as many times as necessary—for 15 or 20 minutes when trains travelling all the way from Holyhead to London can go without stopping more than once or twice after Crewe? Why do trains from north to south Wales have to stop at almost every station, even in England, before reaching Cardiff? It is extremely important that we have fast train services, and I am very pleased with the commitment given by the Minister that the business case for that service will be considered in the new year. She said that this will happen in the new year,

Dyweddodd y bydd yn dechrau yn y flwyddyn newydd, er mwyn inni gael y gwasanaeth cyflym hwnnw, os yw'r achos busnes yn iawn.

4.40 p.m.

I gloi, yr wyf yn cydnabod fod y trafodaethau wedi bod yn llwyddiannus. Nid bwriad y gwrthbleidiau ar unrhyw bwynt oedd rhwystro'r Llywodraeth rhag cael ei chyllideb; ein bwriad oedd cael cyllideb well na'r un a gyflwynwyd ar ffurf ddrafft. Nid yw'r gyllideb hon yn berffaith, ond mae'n well na'r drafft. Talaf deyrnged i bawb yn y Cynulliad sydd wedi gweithio mor galed i sicrhau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cael ei chyllideb heddiw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Imprudence Brown has persistently got his borrowing, tax and spend forecasts wrong, and, as we have heard from my colleague, Glyn, now he has got his growth forecast wrong as well. His failure threatens future prosperity and improved public services—the UK has slipped from fourth to thirteenth in the world competitiveness league. Our growth rate is now nineteenth out of 25 in the European Union, and we are now seventy-third out of 117 in the league table of Government deficits.

We have failed to reform our public services. Despite the Chancellor's claims, low inflation has been delivered by the private sector. All that Labour has delivered in England and Wales is high inflation and falling productivity in the public sector. The most competitive UK regions are those that are least dependent on the public sector. We cannot sustain a situation where public expenditure represents 60 per cent of gross domestic product, shoring up the Welsh economy as manufacturing employment has plummeted. Record levels of investment in public services cannot continue indefinitely and there is an urgent need for Wales to stimulate the private sector and to close the widening prosperity gap with the rest of the United Kingdom.

To achieve growth, we will need a skilled

so that we can have that fast service if the business case is right.

To closeg, I acknowledge that the discussions have been successful. It was never the intention of opposition parties, at any point, to prevent the Government from having its budget; our intention was to improve the draft budget. This budget is not perfect, but it is better than the draft. I pay tribute to everyone in the Assembly who has worked so hard to ensure that the Government will get its budget today.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Brown annoeth yn gyson wedi cael ei ragolygon benthyca, treth a gwariant yn anghywir, ac fel y clywsom gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Glyn, yn awr mae ei ragolwg twf yn anghywir hefyd. Mae ei fethiant yn bygwth ffyniant y dyfodol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell—mae'r DU wedi llithro o'r pedwerydd safle i'r trydydd ar ddeg yng nghyngahrair cystadleurwydd y byd. Mae ein cyfradd twf yn awr yn y pedwerydd safle ar bymtheg allan o 25 yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac yr ydym yn awr yn y trydydd safle ar ddeg a thrigain allan o 117 yn nhabl cynghahrair diffygion y Llywodraeth.

Yr ydym wedi methu â diwygio ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Er gwaethaf honiadau'r Canghellor, y sector preifat sydd wedi sicrhau chwyddiant isel. Y cyfan y mae Lhafur wedi ei gyflawni yng Nghymru a Lloegr yw chwyddiant uwch a gostyngiad mewn cynhyrchiad yn y sector cyhoeddus. Rhanbarthau mwyaf cystadleuol y DU yw'r rheini sydd leiaf dibynnol ar y sector cyhoeddus. Ni all sefyllfa, lle mae gwariant cyhoeddus yn cynrychioli 60 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth gan gynnal economi Cymru, barhau wrth i gyflogaeth gweithgynhyrchu ostwng yn sylweddol. Ni all y lefelau uchaf erioed o fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus barhau'n ddi-bendraw, ac mae angen ar frys i Gymru ysgogi'r sector preifat a chau'r bwlc ffyniant sy'n lledu rhyngddi a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

I sicrhau twf, bydd arnom angen economi

economy, but the proportion of young people in education, training or employment in Wales has not increased since devolution under Labour. I therefore commend the better deal for schools, students and teachers secured by the opposition parties in this revised budget.

The Chancellor this week reannounced his affordable homes plan as a smokescreen for his economic failure, but at least he is doing something. This budget does nothing to address the housing crisis in Wales, where Labour has imposed massive cuts on affordable housing, and its projected budget, forward to even 2008-09, still represents a huge cut in real terms. The number of first-time buyers in Wales is down 50 per cent. For every four affordable houses built in Wales before 1997, Labour has built only one. For every three assisted low-cost home owner purchases before devolution, Labour has only funded one. Housing waiting lists have risen by 50 per cent over the last year alone, and homelessness in Wales has more than doubled. That is what Labour does for social justice.

Labour's failure to prioritise housing has betrayed a whole generation of Welsh people. As for council tax revaluation, Labour told us that there would be as many winners as losers. Labour in Westminster pledged that revaluation would not lead to increases in the council tax yield and Sue Essex said that the process:

'Was not undertaken as a reason to increase council tax levels'.

The reality is very different: one third of properties have gone up, rising to 41 per cent in Flintshire, while only 2 per cent went down, and rising to 53 per cent in Wrexham, while only 1 per cent went down. So much for trust in a Labour Welsh Assembly Government that has forfeited the right to claim any [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

fedrus, ond nid yw cyfran y bobl ifanc sy'n cael addysg, hyfforddiant neu gyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu ers datganoli o dan Lafur. Felly, cymeradwyaf y fargen well ar gyfer ysgolion, myfyrwyr ac athrawon a sicrhawyd gan y gwrthbleidiau yn y gyllideb ddiwygiedig hon.

Ailgyhoeddodd y Canghellor ei gynllun cartrefi fforddiadwy yr wythnos hon fel llen fwg i'w fethiant economaidd, ond o leiaf mae'n gwneud rhywbeth. Nid yw'r gyllideb yn gwneud dim i fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai yng Nghymru, lle mae Llafur wedi gwneud toriadau enfawr yn nifer y tai fforddiadwy, ac mae amcangyfrif ei chyllideb, hyd yn oed mor bell â 2008-09, yn dal yn doriad enfawr mewn termau real. Mae nifer y rhai sy'n prynu tai am y tro cyntaf yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 50 y cant. Am bob pedwar tŷ fforddiadwy a adeiladwyd yng Nghymru cyn 1997, dim ond un a adeiladwyd gan Lafur. Am bob tri chartref a brynwyt yn rhad gyda chymorth cyn datganoli, dim ond un a ariannwyd gan Lafur. Mae rhestrau aros tai wedi codi 50 y cant dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig, ac mae nifer y bobl ddigartref yng Nghymru wedi mwy na dyblu. Dyna y mae Llafur yn ei wneud dros gyflawnder cymdeithasol.

Mae methiant Llafur i flaenoriaethu tai wedi bradychu cenhedlaeth gyfan o Gymry. O ran ailbrisio'r dreth cyngor, dywedodd Llafur wrthym y byddai cynifer o bobl ar eu hennill ag a fyddai ar eu colled. Addawodd Llafur yn San Steffan na fyddai ailbrisio yn arwain at gynnydd yn yr incwm o dreth cyngor, a dywedodd Sue Essex am y broses:

'Nid er mwyn cynyddu lefelau treth gyngor y cafwyd ailbrisio'.

Mae'r realiti yn wahanol iawn: mae gwerth un rhan o dair o gartrefi wedi cynyddu, gan godi i 41 y cant yn sir y Fflint. Ond dim ond 2 y cant sydd wedi gostwng, a chynyddodd i 53 y cant yn Wrecsam, er mai dim ond 1 y cant ostyngodd yn eu gwerth. Dyna yw canlyniad rhoi ffydd yn Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru, sydd wedi fförffedu'r hawl i gael unrhyw [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Mark Isherwood:** I would say to the First Minister, if he were here—and he cannot even be present for his own budget—that the reality for many pensioners in Wales today is council tax increases equivalent to the total council tax that was paid 10 years ago. He simply insults them when he trades in meaningless percentage figures. Conservatives campaigned against this flawed revaluation in Westminster, and it is the united opposition here that has delivered extra budget assistance for pensioner households, not Labour. My party's task now is to demonstrate a set of values that represent real compassion, so that the squandered years of Labour waste and incompetence may finally be put behind us.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am grateful for the opportunity to participate in what has been an interesting, though sometimes slightly confusing, debate.

There are many aspects of the new budget that we warmly welcome. I particularly mention the funding for small schools that may help many small community schools not only to survive, but to thrive and really deliver for their pupils and their communities. In this context, I suggest to Carmarthenshire County Council that it looks again at the funding that is available to its smaller schools to enable it perhaps to change some rather radical and dangerous plans that is has.

The extra assistance for pensioners, both with council tax and for warmth and security, has been widely welcomed. I have already received numerous enquiries at my office in Llanelli from pensioners hoping to take advantage of this, and I am sure that we would all see that as a very positive thing. It will also make a contribution to reducing carbon emissions and to our duty as an Assembly to promote sustainable development. Therefore, there can be no doubt that this is a better budget than the draft that was presented to us.

However, some of the contributions to this debate have left me rather confused. I would particularly like to mention the contribution

**Mark Isherwood:** Byddwn yn dweud wrth y Prif Weinidog, pe bai yma—ac ni all fod yn bresennol ar gyfer ei gyllideb ei hun hyd yn oed—mai'r realiti i nifer o bensiynwyr yng Nghymru heddiw yw cynnydd mewn treth gyngor sy'n cyfateb i gyfanswm y dreth gyngor a dalwyd 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Yn syml, mae'n eu sarhau pan fydd yn masnachu mewn ffigurau canran diystyr. Ymgyrchodd y Ceidwadwyr yn erbyn yr ailbrisio gwallus hwn yn San Steffan, a'r gwrthwynebiad unedig hwn sydd wedi sicrhau'r cymorth ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i gartrefi pensiynwyr, nid Llafur. Gorchwyl fy mhlaid i yn awr yw dangos gwerthoedd sy'n cynrychioli tosturi gwirioneddol, fel y gellir rhoi'r blynnyddoedd afiad o wastraff ac anallu gan Lafur y tu ôl inni o'r diwedd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfre i gymryd rhan mewn dadl sy'n ddiddorol, er ei bod braidd yn ddryslyd ar adegau.

Mae llawer agwedd ar y gyllideb newydd yr wyf yn eu croesawu'n wresog. Soniaf yn arbennig am yr arian ar gyfer ysgolion bach a allai gynorthwyo nifer o ysgolion cymunedol bach nid yn unig i barhau, ond i ffynnu a chyflawni ar gyfer eu disgylion a'u cymunedau. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, awgrymaf y dylai Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin edrych eto ar yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer ei ysgolion llai, er mwyn ei alluogi efallai i newid rhai o'r cynlluniau digon radical a pheryglus sydd ganddo.

Mae'r cymorth ychwanegol ar gyfer pensiynwyr, gyda threth gyngor a chyda gwres a diogelwch, wedi cael croeso mawr. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael nifer o ymholaau yn fy swyddfa yn Llanelli gan bensiynwyr sy'n gobeithio manteisio ar hyn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn gweld hynny fel rhywbeth cadarnhaol iawn. Bydd hefyd yn cyfrannu at leihau gollyngiadau carbon ac at ein dyletswydd fel Cynulliad i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw'r gyllideb hon yn well na'r gyllideb ddrafft a gyflwynwyd ger ein bron.

Fodd bynnag, mae rhai o'r cyfraniadau i'r ddadl hon wedi fy nrusu braidd. Hoffwn grybwyl yn arbennig gyfraniad Lorraine

of Lorraine Barrett, who was so anxious to present this as what she called a ‘Welsh Labour budget’—presenting as a New Labour budget would perhaps have been more accurate—when the Minister was trying to present it as a whole-Assembly budget. I do not know which of them is right, but my view is that this is a New Labour budget, with some significant, but fairly minor, improvements. That is why the opposition parties, and certainly Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, will abstain rather than support this. It is so much better than it was, but it is still not good enough.

I want to make reference to where the money is coming from. It should be made clear—and we need to put this on record, as Dai Lloyd, Jenny Randerson and others have done—that the requests of the opposition could have been met from the very substantial reserves. No-one is asking the Minister to sell the family silver, and no-one is asking her to spend every penny that she has in the building society. However, while it sits in reserves, that money is not making any difference to the people of Wales, and I reiterate Jenny Randerson’s call for an explanation of the size of the unforeseen emergency that would have to occur in order to require quite that amount of money. It is not for me to say that the Minister is planning generous spending in an election year, and I would hesitate in this context to use the word ‘bribe’. However, I would associate myself with some of Jenny Randerson’s comments about what the money might be for. If the Minister can tell us otherwise in her response to the debate, I would be very glad to hear that.

I wish to refer to the cuts in the environment budget, which we believe were unnecessary. I will put on record that I think that it is a great pity that the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside did not fight a little harder. We are going to get cuts in the Tir Mynydd budget, which is there to deliver for the poorest farming families, and, yes, whatever people on that side of the Chamber believe, there are poor farming families. It is a small cut, but it is a petty and unnecessary cut, because that money is there in the reserves.

To conclude, I will refer briefly to some of

Barrett, a oedd mor awyddus i gyflwyno’r gyllideb hon fel yr hyn a alwyd ganddi yn ‘gyllideb Llafur Cymru’—hwyrach y buasai’n fwy priodol ei galw’n gyllideb Llafur Newydd—tra yr oedd y Gweinidog yn ceisio’i chyflwyno fel cyllideb gan y Cynulliad cyfan. Ni wn pa un sy’n gywir, ond yn fy marn i, cyllideb Llafur Newydd ydyw, gyda rhai gwelliannau sylweddol, ond cymharol fach. Dyna pam y bydd y gwrthbleidiau, a Phlaid Cymru yn sicr, yn ymatal yn hytrach na’i chefnogi. Mae’n well o lawer nag ydoedd, ond nid yw’n ddigon da o hyd.

Hoffwn gyfeirio at darddiad yr arian. Dylid egluro—ac mae angen inni roi hyn ar gofnod, fel y gwnaeth Dai Lloyd, Jenny Randerson ac eraill—y gellid bod wedi darparu ceisiadau'r wrthblaid o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn sylweddol iawn. Nid oes neb yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog werthu llestri arian y teulu, ac nid oes neb yn gofyn iddi wario pob ceiniog sydd ganddi yn y gymdeithas adeiladu. Fodd bynnag, tra mae'r arian mewn cronfeydd wrth gefn, nid yw'n gwneud gwahaniaeth o gwbl i bobl Cymru, ac ailadroddaf gais Jenny Randerson am esboniad o raddau'r argyfwng annisgwyl a fyddai'n gorfol digwydd er mwyn bod angen cymaint o arian. Nid fy lle i yw dweud bod y Gweinidog yn bwriadu gwario'n hael mewn blwyddyn etholiad, a byddwn yn ofalus yn y cyd-destun hwn rhag defnyddio'r gair 'llwgrwobrwy'. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cysylltu fy hun â rhai o sylwadau Jenny Randerson ar yr hyn y gellid defnyddio'r arian ar ei gyfer. Os gall y Gweinidog ddweud yn wahanol yn ei hymateb i'r ddadl, byddwn yn falch iawn o glywed hynny.

Hoffwn gyfeirio at y toriadau yng nghyllideb yr amgylchedd, nad oedd eu hangen yn ein barn ni. Hoffwn roi ar gofnod fy mod yn gresynu na frwydrodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ychydig yn galetach. Bwriedir gwneud toriadau yn y gyllideb Tir Mynydd, sy'n bodoli i gynorthwyo'r teuluoedd ffermio tloaf, ac, oes, beth bynnag a gred pobl ar yr ochr honno o'r Siambr, mae yna deuluoedd ffermio tlawd. Toriad bach ydyw, ond mae'n doriad pitw a diangen, gan fod yr arian ar gael yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn.

I gloi, cyfeiriaf yn gryno at rai o'r

the contributions made by Conservative Members. Insofar as I could follow Mark, I thought that he went a little over the top. To my friend Glyn Davies, I would say that whatever a Conservative budget might have looked like, it might have had fewer gimmicks, but it would have had a lot less of everything if past history is anything to go by. I do not think that any of us want to take lessons in fiscal matters from the Conservatives, let alone in social justice.

This is a better budget than we were offered before, but it is by no means as good as it could be. That is why Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will abstain today.

**Bryngle Williams:** Like Helen Mary, I would like to express my disappointment with what I would call a severe cut in the environment, planning and countryside budget. When agri-environment schemes under Tir Cymru are playing such an important role in supporting farmers in Wales, why has the Minister been so willing to single them out for these cuts?

Underfunding is already one of the major problems in one of the finest environmental schemes in Europe. Tir Gofal is a flagship agri-environment scheme. Farmers are spending an excessive amount of time simply waiting to get into the scheme, and we have cut £1.3 million from it. Cutting funds from the agri-environment schemes sends out completely the wrong message to the rural community. It undermines confidence in the ability of the Assembly to deliver such schemes effectively.

Will the Minister clarify exactly which schemes this money will come from? To say ‘Tir Cymru’ is rather broad. Has the Minister worked out, down to individual farmers, what effect this will have? As Helen Mary pointed out, this money goes to the poorer high-hill farmers at present, who are desperately in need of it. The agriculture sector is currently in a fragile state. Reducing support for farmers who are putting in the work to maintain and improve the environment, through these schemes, should be a last resort. As it is, Labour’s willingness to cut the Tir Cymru budget shows little more than

cyfraniadau a wnaed gan Aelodau Ceidwadol. I’r graddau y gallwn ddilyn Mark, credaf iddo fynd dros ben llestri braidd. I’m cyfaill Glyn Davies, byddwn yn dweud, waeth beth fyddai cynnwys cyllideb Geidwadol, efallai y fyddai’n cynnwys llai o gimig, ond byddai wedi cynnwys llawer llai o bopeth o ystyried enghreifftiau’r gorffennol. Ni chredaf fod yr un ohonom am ddysgu unrhyw wersi ariannol gan y Ceidwadwyr, heb sôn am wersi mewn cyflawnder cymdeithasol.

Mae hon yn well cyllideb nag a gynigiwyd inni o’r blaen, ond nid yw cystal ag y gallai fod o bell ffodd. Dyna pam y bydd Plaid Cymru yn ymatal heddiw.

**Bryngle Williams:** Fel Helen Mary, hoffwn ddatgan fy siom am yr hyn y byddwn yn ei alw’n doriad sylweddol yng nghyllideb yr amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad. Gan fod cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol o dan Tir Cymru yn chwarae rhan mor bwysig i gynorthwyo ffermwyr yng Nghymru, pam y mae’r Gweinidog wedi mor barod i’w dewis ar gyfer y toriadau hyn?

Mae tanariannu eisoes yn un o’r problemau mwyaf sy’n wynebu un o’r cynlluniau amgylcheddol gorau yn Ewrop. Mae Tir Gofal yn gynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol blaenllaw. Mae ffermwyr yn treulio gormod o amser yn aros i ymuno â’r cynllun, ac yr ydym wedi tynnau £1.3 miliwn oddi wrtho. Mae lleihau’r arian a fuddsoddir yn y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn anfon neges gwbl anghywir i’r gymuned wledig. Mae’n tanseilio hyder yng ngallu’r Cynulliad i ddarparu cynlluniau felly fath yn effeithiol.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro yn union o ba gynlluniau y daw’r arian hwn? Mae dweud ‘Tir Cymru’ braidd yn annelwig. A yw’r Gweinidog wedi gweithio allan, o ran ffermwyr unigol, pa effaith a gaiff hyn? Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, mae’r arian hwn yn mynd i’r ffermwyr ucheldir tlotaf ar hyn o bryd, ac mae dirfawr ei angen arnynt. Mae’r sector amaethyddiaeth mewn cyflwr bregus ar hyn o bryd. Dim ond pan fetho popeth arall y dylid lleihau’r cymorth i ffermwyr sy’n gweithio’n galed i gynnal a gwella’r amgylchedd, drwy’r cynlluniau hyn. Fel y mae, mae parodrwydd Llafur i gwtogi

the party's contempt for the rural community.

cyclideb Tir Cymru yn esiampl o ddirmyg y blaid tuag at y gymuned wledig.

4.50 p.m.

**Michael German:** It is worth reminding ourselves that this budget was not passed by the Assembly when it first came before us for five reasons. In the intervening period, those five reasons have been addressed, maybe not as fully as some of us would have liked, but they certainly have been addressed and changes have been made to the budget. Those five reasons are the reason why, today, the opposition parties will allow the budget to go through.

I hope that the Government recognises, and I will return to this later, that it has some priorities of its own, but that it also has a duty to the wider Welsh public that are represented by the opposition parties that now have a majority in the Assembly. The budget will go through today because a majority of people want to see it passed, not because the majority wholly supports its contents. That is why we will take the actions that we are proposing today.

It is worth while reminding ourselves that there is now more money in this budget for schools. I welcome the money for school meals and healthy eating, which is a matter of concern. Jeff Cuthbert is absolutely right that this is a matter of concern not just in his constituency, but across Wales among those who are concerned about what our children are eating. That is a crucial change. Changes will also be brought forth in order to help schools to save to invest, which will allow them to put more money into front-line services. There is also more money for our universities to enable them to compete better with those across the border in England and more money to help schools to consider alternatives to closure, when they are threatened with it.

There is more money for the railways, including improvements to rolling stock and to the way in which people's travel around Wales can happen. Crucially, there is more help for the council tax payers who have been hardest hit, including pensioners. It would be difficult for us to say that everything in those

**Michael German:** Mae'n werth inni ein hatgoffa ein hunain na phasiwyd y gyllideb hon gan y Cynulliad pan gafodd ei chyflwyno ger ein bron gyntaf am bum rheswm. Yn y cyfnod ers hynny, ymdriniwyd â'r pum rheswm hynny, efallai nad mor drwyndl ag y byddai rhai ohonom wedi ei hoffi, ond yn sicr, deliwyd â hwy a gwnaed newidiadau yn y gyllideb. Y pum rheswm hynny yw'r rheswm pam y bydd y gwrthbleidiau, heddiw, yn caniatáu i'r gyllideb gael ei phasio.

Gobeithio bod y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod, a dychwelaf at hyn yn ddiweddarach, fod ganddi rai blaenoriaethau ei hun, ond bod dyletswydd arni hefyd i'r cyhoedd ehangach yng Nghymru a gynrychiolir gan y gwrthbleidiau sydd bellach â mwyaf yn y Cynulliad. Caiff y gyllideb ei phasio heddiw am fod y mwyaf am iddi gael ei phasio, nid am fod y mwyaf yn llwyr o blaid ei chynnwys. Dyna pam y byddwn yn cymryd y camau yr ydym yn eu cynnig heddiw.

Mae'n werth inni ein hatgoffa ein hunain fod mwy o arian yn y gyllideb hon yn awr ar gyfer ysgolion. Croesawaf yr arian ar gyfer prydau bwyd ysgol a bwyta'n iach, sy'n peri pryder. Mae Jeff Cuthbert yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod hyn yn peri pryder, nid yn unig yn ei etholaeth, ond ledled Cymru ymhli y rheini sy'n pryderu am yr hyn y mae ein plant yn ei fwyta. Mae hynny'n newid hanfodol. Bydd newidiadau hefyd i helpu ysgolion i gynilo er mwyn buddsoddi, a fydd yn eu galluogi i ddyrannu mwy o arian i wasanaethau rheng flaen. Bydd mwy o arian hefyd i'n prifysgolion i'w galluogi i gystadlu'n well â phrifysgolion ar draws y ffin yn Lloegr, a mwy o arian i helpu ysgolion i ystyried dewisiadau amgen yn hytrach na chau, pan gânt eu bygwth felly.

Mae mwy o arian i'r rheilffyrdd, gan gynnwys gwella cerbydau a'r ffordd y gall pobl deithio o amgylch Cymru. Yn hanfodol, rhoddir mwy o gymorth i'r bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor ac yr effeithiwyd arnynt fwyaf, gan gynnwys pensiynwyr. Byddai'n anodd inni ddweud bod popeth sydd wedi'i

changes was exactly what we wanted, but they represent a step in the right direction, and that is why this changed budget is being allowed to go through today. I welcome the extra £200,000 for domestic violence, which will be the subject of the debate that will follow this one. It would be churlish of anyone in this Chamber, particularly those of us in this party, to say that that money is not to be welcomed.

We must remember that, behind this process, this Assembly is not a goal for its own sake, but a tool to improve the lives of the people of Wales. For the moment, distributing the block grant is the single most important way that we, as Assembly Members, can change the lives of the people of Wales. That is why it is pleasing that all of us have had a say in this year's budget. We have always worked for this Assembly to work for the people of Wales. That is what we did when we were in the partnership Government, when we tried to bring stability, ideas and delivery for the people of Wales. However, this is not a perfect budget, and it would be false of us to say that it was.

The great hope of the Assembly was that it could be built on a certain degree of consensus. The tragedy of the Assembly is that it is only when the Labour Party is defeated that it seeks to find consensus. When you taste defeat, it is not the best time to look for consensus. However, I celebrate the fact that we have set aside some of our differences on this matter. I do not forget that each party has its own policies and philosophies. Our policies are not the same as those of the Conservatives, Plaid Cymru or the Labour Party, yet, by working together on this budget proposal, we have found some common ground on which we can all agree. More importantly for the people of Wales, particularly pensioners and young people, we have found areas of agreement that benefit them.

This is not a perfect budget; it is not a budget that the Welsh Liberal Democrats would have put forward in Government, but it is a better budget than Labour's first draft. It recognises that a party in a minority Government cannot

gynnwys yn y newidiadau hynny yn union fel y byddem wedi'i ddymuno, ond maent yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir, a dyna pam y caniateir i'r gyllideb newydd hon gael ei phasio heddiw. Croesawaf y £200,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer trais yn y cartref, sy'n destun y ddadl nesaf. Byddai'n anfoesgar i neb yn y Siambra hon, yn arbennig ni yn y blaidd hon, ddweud na ddylid croesawu'r arian hwnnw.

Rhaid inni gofio, fel sail i'r broses hon, nad er ei fwyn ei hun y mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn bodoli, ond er mwyn gwella bywydau pobl Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd, dosbarthu'r grant bloc yw'r ffordd bwysicaf i ni, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, allu newid bywydau pobl Cymru. Dyna pam y mae'n braf fod pob un o honom wedi cael cyfle i gyfrannu at lunio'r gyllideb eleni. Yr ydym bob amser wedi gweithio er mwyn Cynulliad hwn weithio dros bobl Cymru. Dyna a wnaethom pan oeddym yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, pan oeddym yn ceisio sicrhau sefydlogrwydd, syniadau a darpariaeth i bobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gyllideb hon yn berffaith, a byddai'n anghywir inni ddweud ei bod.

Gobaith mawr y Cynulliad oedd y gellid ei adeiladu gyda rhyw faint o gonsensws. Trasiedi'r Cynulliad yw mai dim ond pan gaiff y Blaid Lafur ei threchu y mae'n ceisio cael consensws. Nid pan fyddwch yn wynebu cael eich trechu yw'r adeg orau i geisio consensws. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymfalchi yn y ffaith ein bod wedi rhoi rhai o'n gwahaniaethau barn o'r neilltu yn y mater hwn. Nid wyf yn anghofio bod gan bob plaid ei pholisiau a'i hathroniaethau ei hun. Nid yw ein polisiau ni yr un fath â pholisiau'r Ceidwadwyr, Plaid Cymru na'r Blaid Lafur. Ond drwy gydweithio ar y cynnig hwn ar gyfer y gyllideb, yr ydym wedi darganfod ychydig dir cyffredin y gallwn oll gytuno arno. Yr hyn sy'n bwysicach i bobl Cymru, yn arbennig pensiynwyr a phobl ifanc, yw ein bod wedi darganfod meysydd o gytundeb sydd o fudd iddynt hwy.

Nid yw'r gyllideb hon yn berffaith; nid yw'n gyllideb y byddai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi'i chyflwyno fel Llywodraeth, ond mae'n gyllideb well na chyllideb ddraftif gyntaf Llafur. Mae'n cydnabod na all plaid o

ride roughshod over the wishes of the Assembly. Labour's priorities are not the only priorities. In large swathes of the country, Labour's priorities are not the people's priorities, and we have to recognise that. I remind Labour Members that they do not represent a majority of the voters of Wales, and neither do individual parties. Labour simply does not represent a majority on its own. We must, therefore, ensure that the voices that you do not represent are heard, which is why, in this budget debate, I believe that those voices have been heard, and I celebrate that fact.

fewn Llywodraeth leiafrifol anwybyddu dymuniadau'r Cynulliad. Nid blaenoriaethau Llafur yw'r unig flaenoriaethau. Mewn rhannau helaeth o'r wlad, nid blaenoriaethau Llafur yw blaenoriaethau'r bobl, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau Llafur nad ydynt yn cynrychioli mwyafrif pleidleiswyr Cymru, ac nid yw pleidiau unigol yn gwneud hynny ychwaith. Yn syml, nid yw Llafur yn cynrychioli mwyafrif ar ei phen ei hun. Felly, rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff y lleisiau na chynrychiolir gennych eu clywed, a dyna pam, yn y ddadl hon ar y gyllideb, y credaf i'r lleisiau hynny gael eu clywed, ac yr wyf yn ymfalchio yn y ffaith honno.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21(iii), extends Plenary until 6 p.m. in order to complete business.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am satisfied that this is not an abuse of Assembly procedure. Under Standing Order No. 21, at least 10 Members must support the motion to extend Plenary. I see that at least 10 Members do, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21(iii), yn ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn hyd 6 p.m. er mwyn cwblhau busnes.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn fodlon nad yw hyn yn camddefnyddio gweithdrefn y Cynulliad. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 21, rhaid i o leiaf 10 Aelod gefnogi'r cynnig i ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 Aelod yn gwneud hynny, felly, awn ati i bleidleisio.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.  
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Bourne, Nick
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Chapman, Christine
- Cuthbert, Jeff
- Davies, Glyn
- Davies, Janet
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Dunwoody, Tamsin
- Essex, Sue
- Francis, Lisa
- German, Michael
- Graham, William
- Griffiths, John
- Gwyther, Christine
- Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

- Butler, Rosemary
- Gregory, Janice
- Idris Jones, Denise
- Lewis, Huw
- Neagle, Lynne
- Pugh, Alun

Hutt, Jane  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Y Gyllideb Derfynol: Parhad The Final Budget: Continued**

**John Griffiths:** I welcome this budget as Labour's budget. If we look at its content, we will see that it clearly is a Labour budget that addresses our priorities of social justice. Even if we look at the new measures, we will see that, again, the budget presses the buttons that are so important to the Labour movement. Consider the home energy efficiency scheme and think of how important it is to older people, for example. It is not just important in terms of warmth in the home and all the benefits that that brings in the form of health and comfort, but in terms of its safety aspects. Consider too the benefits advice on council tax for older people and of the benefit that that brings to the individuals concerned and to the local economies across Wales, because, when people on limited income get additional income, they tend to spend that money rather than save it. It is, therefore, a huge benefit to the individuals concerned and to the local economy, and it is completely in line with Labour's priority.

**Jocelyn Davies:** On the subject of Labour's priorities, you probably remember that, in 2000, the Minister for Health and Social Services told the Assembly that free prescriptions would cost about £50 million a year. Also, there were to be no tuition fees for students in Wales, which would also have cost about £50 million a year. Can you explain the Labour values that prioritise free

**John Griffiths:** Croesawaf y gyllideb hon fel cyllideb Llafur. Os edrychwn ar ei chynnwys, gwelwn yn amlwg mai cyllideb Lafur ydyw sy'n ymdrin â'n blaenoriaethau o ran cyflawnder cymdeithasol. Hyd yn oed os edrychwn ar y mesurau newydd, gwelwn, unwaith eto, fod y gyllideb yn gwasgu'r botymau sydd mor bwysig i'r blaid Lafur. Ystyriwch y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref a meddwl am ei bwysigrwydd i bobl hŷn, er enghraift. Mae'n bwysig nid yn unig o ran gwres yn y cartref a'r holl fuddiannau cysylltiedig o ran iechyd a chysur, ond hefyd o ran ei agweddau diogelwch. Ystyriwch hefyd y cyngor ar fudd-daliadau treth gyngor i bobl hŷn a'r budd cysylltiedig i'r unigolion dan sylw ac i'r economiau lleol ledled Cymru, oherwydd, pan gaiff pobl ar incwm cyfyngedig incwm ychwanegol, y duedd yw iddynt wario'r arian hwnnw yn hytrach na'i gynilo. Felly, mae o fudd enfawr i'r unigolion dan sylw ac i'r economi leol, ac mae'n gwbl gydnaws â blaenoriaeth Llafur.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Wrth sôn am flaenoriaethau Llafur, fe gofiwch mae'n siwr fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi dweud wrth y Cynulliad yn 2000 y byddai presgripsiynau am ddim yn costio tua £50 miliwn y flwyddyn. Hefyd, ni fyddai unrhyw ffioedd dysgu i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru, a fyddai hefyd wedi costio tua £50 miliwn y flwyddyn. A allwch egluro'r

prescriptions for millionaires over free education for students?

**John Griffiths:** Jocelyn, we have gone over these matters many times. If you look at this budget in its totality, you will see that it is a strong social justice budget, and we put it forward on that basis. If you were to look at it in the round and approach it with an open mind, you would come to that view.

I would like to concentrate on the constructive and progressive—albeit small—element in this budget for the international sustainable development fund. That £300,000 per annum is going to allow a huge amount of good work in Wales to be strengthened and reinforced, even though the amount is modest. The reason for that is because of a huge fund of goodwill for Wales as part of the prosperous world helping the developing world. Look, for example, at Lesotho, which I visited recently, to see the work that Dolen Cymru has done over many years to build links between Wales and Lesotho. While we were there, we saw teacher exchange programmes bringing big benefits to Lesotho and to Wales, and to the schools and communities concerned in Wales. Among other examples, we heard of medical exchanges and of great problems with soil erosion, and overlying it all is the huge problem of HIV/Aids, which is having a terrible effect.

5.00 p.m.

It affects one in three of their most productive age group, namely adults up to the age of 45. Therefore, there are huge difficulties over there. There are strong links between Wales and Lesotho, and an awful lot of work is already happening in terms of Wales helping Lesotho. The money in the international sustainable development fund will reinforce and strengthen that work.

The UK Government wants to see the UK's devolved institutions adding value to what it does in international development. The Scottish Executive is already doing an impressive amount of work, and we in Wales have done a lot but we have not been as

gwerthoedd Llafur sy'n rhoi blaenoriaeth i bresgripsiynau am ddim i filiwnyddion dros addysg am ddim i fyfyrwyr?

**John Griffiths:** Jocelyn, yr ydym wedi trafod y materion hyn droeon. Os edrychwrch ar y gyllideb hon yn ei chyfanrwydd, fe welwrch ei bod yn gyllideb gadarn o gyflwynnwr cymdeithasol, ac fe'i cyflwynwn ar y sail honno. Pe byddech yn edrych arni fel cyfanwaith a'i hystyried gyda meddwl agored, byddech yn cytuno â hynny.

Hoffwn ganolbwytio ar yr elfen adeiladol a datblygiadol—er yn fach—yn y gyllideb hon ar gyfer y gronfa datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol. Bydd y £300,000 hwnnw y flwyddyn yn caniatau i lawer iawn o waith da yng Nghymru gael ei gryfhau a'i atgyfnerthu, er bod y swm yn un bach. Y rheswm am hynny yw'r gronfa fawr o ewyllys da i Gymru fel rhan o'r byd ffyniannus sy'n helpu'r byd sy'n datblygu. Edrychwrch, er enghraifft, ar Lesotho. Bûm yno'n ddiweddar i weld y gwaith a wnaed gan Dolen Cymru dros y blynnyddoedd i greu cysylltiadau rhwng Cymru a Lesotho. Yn ystod ein hymweliad, gwelsom raglenni cyfnewid athrawon a oedd yn fuddiol iawn i Lesotho ac i Gymru, ac i'r ysgolion a'r cymunedau dan sylw yng Nghymru. Ymhlieth enghreifftiau eraill, clywsom am raglenni cyfnewid meddygol ac am broblemau mawr yn sgîl erydu pridd, ac yn gefndir i hyn oll mae'r broblem HIV/Aids aruthrol, sy'n cael effaith arswydus.

Mae'n effeithio ar un o bob tri o'u grŵp oedran mwyaf cynhyrchiol, sef oedolion hyd at 45 oed. Felly, mae yna anawsterau mawr. Mae cysylltiadau cryf rhwng Cymru a Lesotho, ac mae llawer o waith eisoes yn cael ei wneud lle mae Cymru'n helpu Lesotho. Bydd yr arian yn y gronfa datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol yn ategu'r gwaith hwnnw a'i gryfhau.

Mae Llywodraeth y DU am weld sefydliadau datganoledig y DU yn ychwanegu gwerth at yr hyn a wna mewn datblygu rhyngwladol. Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban eisoes yn gwneud cryn llawer iawn o waith. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru wedi gwneud llawer, ond

focused on that work as we could have been. This fund will allow us to have that profile, and also to take work further than we do currently. We will look at issues such as making Wales a fair trade country and procurement issues around that, as well as global citizenship in our education system, support for non-governmental organisations in Wales involved with overseas aid, and emergency responses when there are terrible disasters, such as the earthquake in Pakistan or the tsunami disaster last year.

Therefore, a huge amount of good work is emerging from this development, which is a modest but important part of this budget. There is a huge amount of support for it from the people of Wales and on a cross-party basis in the Assembly. I commend this development, and look forward to each development that will come under its umbrella in the future.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this budget debate. I pay tribute to the First Minister and the Finance Minister for their constructive and positive approach throughout, which was also our approach. It was important that we ensured that there was a budget, and that Labour had a budget on which it could deliver. It is still a Labour budget. However, in terms of the possibility that it is more of a Labour budget, which some people have suggested, including the First Minister, that flies in the face of logic and the circumstances. If that is true, why did we spend eight weeks negotiating robustly, albeit constructively, to get some concessions on amendments on which the Labour Party had voted against? It does not make sense. It is still a Labour budget, but it is less of a Labour budget. Otherwise, you would not have voted against the amendments. If you wanted the budget that we have now, you could have presented it the first time around. That was not the case. Let us be clear about this. It is still a Labour budget, but it is a better budget because it addresses an issue that we were promised would be addressed, namely the funding gap between higher education institutions in England and Wales.

nid ydym wedi canolbwytio cymaint ag a allem ar y gwaith hwnnw. Bydd y gronfa hon yn ein galluogi i sicrhau'r proffil hwnnw, a hefyd i ddatblygu'r gwaith ymhellach nag a wnawn ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn edrych ar faterion fel sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad masnach deg a materion caffaol yn gysylltiedig â hynny, yn ogystal â dinasyddiaeth fydeang yn ein system addysg, cymorth i sefydliadau anlywodraethol yng Nghymru sy'n ymwneud â chymorth tramor, ac ymatebion brys pan fydd trychinebau erchyll yn digwydd, fel y daeargrynn ym Mhacistan neu drychineb y twnami y llynedd.

Felly, mae llawer iawn o waith da yn deillio o'r datblygiad hwn nad yw'n rhan fawr o'r gyllideb hon ond sy'n rhan bwysig ohoni serch hynny. Mae pobl Cymru yn ei gefnogi'n frwd ac mae cefnogaeth iddo ar draws y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad hefyd. Cymeradwyaf y datblygiad hwn ac edrychaf ymlaen at bob datblygiad a ddaw dan ei fantell yn y dyfodol.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon ar y gyllideb. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog Cyllid am eu hymagwedd adeiladol a chadarnhaol drwy gydol y broses, agwedd a oedd yn adlewyrchu ein hagwedd ni. Yr oedd yn bwysig inni sicrhau bod cyllideb ar gael, a bod gan Lafur gyllideb a fyddai'n galluogi cyflawni pethau. Cyllideb Lafur ydyw o hyd, fodd bynnag, o ran y posiblirwydd ei bod yn fwy o gyllideb Lafur, fel yr awgrymwyd gan rai pobl, gan gynnwys y Prif Weinidog, sy'n mynd yn groes i reswm a'r amgylchiadau. Os yw hynny'n wir, pam yr ydym wedi treulio wyth wythnos yn negodi'n frwd, er yn adeiladol, i gael am bell gyfaddawd ar welliannau yr oedd y Blaid Lafur wedi pleidleisio yn eu herbyn? Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr. Cyllideb Lafur ydyw o hyd, ond mae'n llai o gyllideb Lafur. Fel arall, ni fydddech wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliannau. Os oeddech am gael y gyllideb sydd gennym yn awr, gallech fod wedi ei chyflwyno'r tro cyntaf. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â hyn. Cyllideb Lafur ydyw o hyd, ond mae'n gyllideb well gan ei bod yn mynd i'r afael â mater yr addawyd fyddai'n cael ei ddatrys, sef y bwlcw cyllido rhwng sefydliadau addysg

The sector is pleased about that, and it is important for the higher education sector and students in Wales that we do so.

It is also important that we provide some relief for pensioners. We have been able to do something for pensioners who are hit by moving up more than one council tax band. That was not in the original proposals. I heard Lorraine Barrett say what a good thing it was. I am glad that she now appreciates it, but I remind her that it was not in the original proposals, nor were the proposals on home insulation, heating and security. We are now able to do something for pensioners throughout Wales on these issues, but they were not included in the original proposals.

**Carl Sargeant:** You keep referring to the fact that ‘we’ have got extra money for pensioners, and ‘we’ have obtained extra money for the home energy efficiency scheme. However, it is our budget. If ‘we’ have done this, vote in favour of the budget. What you are doing is not voting for more money for pensioners; you are sitting on your hands, and that is quite disgraceful.

**Nick Bourne:** It is probably just as well that you were not part of the negotiations, but had you been, you would know that they were carried out in a constructive way on the basis that the opposition parties did not want to block the budget. We have previously voted against the budget, but we will not do so on this occasion. It is still a Labour budget, and there are many elements within it that my party and I do not like. We do not agree with free prescriptions, for example, as we would rather the money went to deal with waiting lists. Therefore, it is not a Welsh Conservatives budget and, on that basis, of course we cannot vote in favour of it. However, we can abstain to allow you your budget. I make the point that it is a Labour budget, but it is less of a Labour budget than it was, for the reasons that I have outlined. We voted against it last time; this time, we will abstain. I thought that you might be grateful for that, because you will now have

uwch yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae'r sector yn falch am hynny, ac mae'n bwysig i'r sector addysg uwch ac i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru ein bod yn gwneud hynny.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni ddarparu rhywfaint o ryddhad i bensiynwyr. Yr ydym wedi gallu gwneud rhywbeth dros bensiynwyr sydd wedi dioddef am fod eu treth gyngor wedi codi mwy nag un band. Nid oedd hynny yn y cynigion gwreiddiol. Clywais Lorraine Barrett yn dweud mor dda ydoedd. Yr wyf yn falch ei bod bellach yn ei werthfawrogi, ond hoffwn ei hatgoffa nad oedd hynny, na'r cynigion ar inswleiddio tai, gwres a diogelwch, yn y cynigion gwreiddiol. Gallwn bellach wneud rhywbeth dros bensiynwyr ledled Cymru ynghylch y materion hyn, ond nid oeddent yn rhan o'r cynigion gwreiddiol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr ydych yn cyfeirio'n barhaus at yffaith ein bod ‘ni’ wedi cael arian ychwanegol i bensiynwyr, a’n bod ‘ni’ wedi cael arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Fodd bynnag, ein cyllideb ni ydyw. Os ‘ni’ a wnaeth hyn, pleidleisiwch o blaid y gyllideb. Yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud yw gwrthod pleidleisio dros ragor o arian i bensiynwyr; yr ydych yn eistedd ar eich dwylo, ac mae hynny'n hollol warthus.

**Nick Bourne:** Efallai ei bod yn beth da nad oeddech yn rhan o'r negodiadau, ond pe baech wedi bod yn rhan ohonynt, byddech yn gwybod iddynt gael eu cynnal mewn ffordd gadarnhaol ar y sail nad oedd y gwrthbleidiau am atal y gyllideb. Yr ydym wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn y gyllideb yn y gorffennol, ond ni wnawn hynny y tro hwn. Cyllideb Lafur ydyw o hyd, ac mae llawer elfen ynddi nad wyf fi a'm plaid yn eu hoffi. Nid ydym yn cytuno â phresgripsiynau am ddim, er enghraifft, gan y byddai'n well gennym weld yr arian yn cael ei ddefnyddio i fynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros. Felly, nid cyllideb Ceidwadwyr Cymru mohoni, ac ar y sail honno ni allwn bleidleisio drosti, wrth reswm. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ymatal er mwyn eich galluogi i gael eich cyllideb. Pwysleisiaf mai cyllideb Lafur ydyw, ond mae'n llai o gyllideb Lafur nag yr oedd, am y rhesymau a amlinellais. Bu inni bleidleisio yn ei herbry y tro diwethaf; y tro hwn, byddwn yn ymatal.

your budget.

It is a better budget, because we are able to do something for small schools. I agree with the comments that Helen Mary Jones made earlier—though she is not here, and Elin Jones is sitting in her seat. She said, ‘Let us have a look’ in the hope that perhaps Carmarthenshire can do something differently in relation to school closures. I wish Helen Mary were here—though she can no doubt take care of herself later on—so that I could tell her that she obviously does not understand the way in which the Barnett formula works if she thinks that a Welsh Conservative administration here would have less money to spend than a Labour administration, unless she is seriously suggesting that the Labour Party at Westminster would somehow ensure that that were the case. I do not believe for a minute that that would be the case, and I do not believe that that is what she was suggesting. She simply does not understand how the system works.

We are pleased, too, that something has been done on nutrition, though I think that Jeff Cuthbert had better have a word with the Finance Minister, because I do not think that there will be the £15 million that Jeff Cuthbert suggested, unless more money has gone in. If that is the case, I applaud it, as it is very important. I think that it is £5 million one year and £5 million the next year, so I do not think that it is £15 million. Perhaps a ‘1’ has slipped in there somewhere, but it is certainly a worthwhile development and we support it.

On the railways, it is, again, important that we have additional money for rolling stock, for the mid Wales line, for Aberystwyth to Shrewsbury, for the Cambrian coast line, and the Heart of Wales line—to do something with the fifth service there. It is important that we are able to do something for the Ebbw Vale line and in relation to the pinch points at Maindee and Gowerton and it is important that we now have a commitment to look at a business case for a north-to-south link with the prospect of that coming on-stream in 2006.

Credwn y byddech yn ddiolchgar am hynny, oherwydd fe gewch eich cyllideb yn awr.

Mae’n gyllideb well, oherwydd gallwn wneud rhywbeth dros ysgolion bach. Cytunaf â'r sylwadau a wnaeth Helen Mary Jones yn gynharach—er nad yw hi yma, ac mae Elin Jones yn eistedd yn ei sedd. Dywedodd, ‘Gadewch inni weld’ yn y gobaith y gall sir Gaerfyrddin o bosibl wneud rhywbeth yn wahanol mewn perthynas â chau ysgolion. Trueni nad yw Helen Mary yma—er mae'n siŵr y gall amddiffyn ei hun yn ddiweddarach—fel y gallwn ddweud wrthi ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'n deall y ffordd y mae'r fformiwl a Barnett yn gweithio os yw'n credu y byddai gan weinyddiaeth gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig lai o arian i'w wariona gweinyddiaeth Lafur, oni bai ei bod yn awgrymu o ddifrif y byddai'r Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan rywsut yn sicrhau hynny. Ni chredaf am funud y byddai hynny'n digwydd, ac ni chredaf mai dyna yr oedd yn ei awgrymu. Nid yw'n deall sut y mae'r system yn gweithio.

Yr ydym ni hefyd yn falch fod rhywbeth yn cael ei wneud ynghylch maethiad, er y credaf y byddai'n well i Jeff Cuthbert gael gair â'r Gweinidog Cyllid, oherwydd ni chredaf y bydd £15 miliwn ar gael fel yr awgrymodd Jeff Cuthbert, oni bai bod rhagor o arian wedi ei ddyrannu. Os felly, fe'i cymeradwyaf, gan ei fod yn bwysig iawn. Credaf ei fod yn £5 miliwn un flwyddyn a £5 miliwn y flwyddyn ganlynol, felly ni chredaf fod hynny'n gwneud £15 miliwn. Efallai fod y rhif ‘1’ wedi llithro i mewn yna rywsut, ond mae'n sicr yn ddatblygiad gwerth chweil ac fe'i cefnogwn.

O ran y rheilffyrdd, unwaith eto, mae'n bwysig fod gennym arian ychwanegol ar gyfer cerbydau, ar gyfer rheilffordd y canolbarth, ar gyfer Aberystwyth i'r Amwythig, ar gyfer rheilffordd arfordir Cambria a rheilffordd Calon Cymru—i wneud rhywbeth gyda'r pumed gwasanaeth yno. Mae'n bwysig inni wneud rhywbeth ar gyfer rheilffordd Glynebw y ac ynglŷn â'r mannau cyfyng ym Maendy a Thre-gŵyr, ac mae'n bwysig inni ymrwymo bellach i edrych ar achos busnes ar gyfer cyswllt rhwng y de a'r gogledd gyda'r posiblwydd

o gyflwyno hynny yn 2006.

To deal briefly with the announcements made by Gordon Brown yesterday, I will say that I hope that the Finance Minister will extend the spirit of what was agreed, in terms of the opposition parties being involved at an earlier stage with the budget negotiation, to this additional sum that is coming to us as a Barnett consequential. I also hope that some of that money can go towards council tax relief. That is important. It is important that all of the parties engage to look at that.

The whole Assembly can take credit for this budget. I do not see that it should be a case of ‘This is more our budget than your budget’. It is a better budget. We are abstaining and letting you have your budget. We can all take credit for it, because it is in the interests of Wales. Many things in the budget are certainly worthwhile but we disagree with many and that is why we are abstaining.

I ymdrin yn fyr â'r cyhoeddiadau a wnaed gan Gordon Brown ddoe, gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn estyn ysbryd yr hyn a gytunwyd, o ran cynnwys y gwrthbleidiau yn gynharach yn y negodiadau ar y gyllideb, i gynnwys y swm ychwanegol hwn a gawn yn sgîl Barnett. Gobeithio hefyd y gall rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer rhyddhad treth gyngor. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n bwysig i bob plaid gymryd rhan er mwyn edrych ar hynny.

Gall y Cynulliad cyfan gymryd y clod am y gyllideb hon. Ni welaf pam y dylai fod yn fater o ddweud ‘Mae hon yn fwy o'n cyllideb ni ag ydyw o'ch cyllideb chi’. Mae'n cyllideb well. Yr ydym ni'n ymatal ac yn caniatáu ichi gael eich cyllideb. Gall pob un ohonom gymryd y clod amdani, oherwydd mae er budd Cymru. Mae nifer o'r pethau yn y gyllideb yn sicr yn werth chweil, ond anghytunwn â nifer o'r pethau sydd yn ddi a dyna pam yr ydym yn ymatal.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel rhywun na chymerodd ran yn y trafodaethau hyn, mae'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, o edrych yn wrthrychol ar y sefyllfa, yn ddiddorol ac yn dangos rhywfaint o aedd fedrwydd gwleidyddol. Cyflwynodd y Blaid Lafur ei chyllideb ddrafft i'r Cynulliad ac fe'i gwrthodwyd. O ganlyniad i hynny, bu trafodaethau hir a manwl ac, yn y pen draw, aed i sefyllfa lle yr oedd y gwrthbleidiau yn barod i dderbyn cyllideb ddiwygiedig. Dyna wleidyddiaeth ymarferol yn gweithredu mewn sefyllfa lle nad oes gan y Llywodraeth fwyafrif.

Fodd bynnag, ni ddeallaf yr awydd sydd ar feinciau Llafur i geisio hawlio'r clod yn llawn am y gyllideb hon. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog mai cyllideb Llafur ‘go iawn’ yw hon. Os ydych am gael hynny, rhaid ichi ddysgu rhywbeth am y broses wleidyddol. Yr oedd yn amlwg o'r cychwyn nad oedd gennych ddigon o bleidleisiau i sicrhau y byddai eich cyllideb ddrafft wreiddiol yn mynd drwyddo. Oni fyddai wedi bod yn well ichi drafod gyda'r gwrthbleidiau i weld pa fath o gyllideb y byddai'r gwrthbleidiau yn barod i ganiatáu i fynd drwyddo ar y bleidlais gyntaf? Pe baech wedi gwneud hynny,

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As someone who did not take part in these discussions, what has happened over the past weeks, from an objective point of view, is interesting and shows a degree of political maturity. The Labour Party presented its draft budget to the Assembly and it was rejected. As a result of that, there were long and detailed discussions and eventually a situation was reached where the opposition parties were willing to accept an amended budget. That is pragmatic politics in action in a situation where the Government does not have a majority.

However, I do not understand the desire on the Labour benches to claim all the praise for this budget. The First Minister said that this is a ‘real’ Labour budget. If you want that, you will have to learn something about the political process. It was obvious from the outset that you did not have enough votes to ensure that the original draft budget would go through. Would it not have been better to discuss with the opposition parties in advance to see what kind of budget they would have been prepared to allow through on the first vote? If you had done that, you could have claimed that it was a ‘real’ Labour budget—

byddech wedi gallu hawlio bod hon yn gyllideb Lafur—Lafur Newydd, Llafur Cymru, beth bynnag yr ydych am ei galw—‘go iawn’. Fodd bynnag, bu ichi roi eich cyllideb ddrafft go iawn gerbron y Siambr, fe’i gwirthodwyd, a bu raid ichi gyfaddawdu. Yr ydych wedi cyfaddawdu i’r graddau bod y gwirthbleidiau bellach yn barod i atal eu pleidlais ar y gyllideb i ganiatáu iddi fynd drwyddo. Dylech dderbyn hynny fel gwleidyddiaeth ymarferol a pheidio ceisio twyllo’r etholwyr, gan na chânt eu twyllo. Mae’r etholwyr llawer yn fwy soffistigedig nag ydych yn meddwl yr ydynt. Maent yn gwybod eich bod wedi cyflwyno cyllideb, ei bod wedi cael ei throi i lawr a’ch bod wedi gorfol cyfaddawdu, felly gystal i chi wynebu’r realiti.

5.10 p.m.

I droi at y toriadau yn y gyllideb newydd hon, mae’r cyfrifoldeb yn gorwedd yn llwyr gyda’r Gweinidogion hynny sydd wedi bod yn barod i dderbyn toriadau yn eu cyllidebau hwy. Nid oedd angen iddynt wneud hynny, oherwydd yr ydym yn sôn am symiau cymharol fach o arian. Yr oedd mwy na digon o arian yn y cyllid wrth gefn. Mae gennych Weinidogion gwan sydd wedi methu ag amddiffyn eu cyllidebau eu hunain, a rhaid iddynt gyfiawnhau hynny i’r bobl sy’n gorfol wynebu’r toriadau hynny. Nid oedd angen gwneud hynny, a dylai’r Gweinidogion hynny gywilyddio eu bod wedi plygu mor barod i’r gofynion am doriadau yn eu cyllidebau.

Bu’r broses yn adeiladol, sy’n dangos gwleidyddiaeth ymarferol ar ei gorau. Derbyniwch hynny, fel y bydd pobl Cymru yn ei dderbyn. Caiff cyllideb ei derbyn, bellach, oherwydd bod y gwirthbleidiau yn derbyn eu bod wedi cael digon o gonesiynau i beidio â phleidleisio yn ei herbyn. Mae’r consesiynau hynny’n bwysig, ac enillwyd pwyntiau sylfaenol. Fodd bynnag—[*Torri ar draws.*] Pe baech naill ai’n gwrando neu’n gallu deall dadl resymegol, byddech yn gwybod erbyn hyn pam nad ydym wedi pleidleisio o blaidd y gyllideb. Esboniwyd hynny. Bydd yn gwbl amlwg i’r etholwyr eich bod wedi cynnig cyllideb ddrafft, a gafodd ei gwirthod, a’ch bod wedi gorfol cyfaddawdu. Gallwch dwyllo eich hunain,

or a New Labour or a Welsh Labour budget, whatever you want to call it. However, you brought your real draft budget before the Chamber, it was rejected and you have had to reach a compromise. You have compromised to such an extent that the opposition parties are now prepared to abstain on the budget to allow it to go through. You should accept that as pragmatic politics and not try to deceive the electorate, because they will not be deceived. The electorate are far more sophisticated than you give them credit. They know that you have presented a budget, that it was turned down and that you had to compromise, so you might as well face up to the reality.

To turn to the cuts in this new budget, the responsibility lies solely with those Ministers who have been willing to accept cuts to their budgets. They did not need to do that because we are talking about relatively small sums of money. There was more than enough money in the reserve budget. You have weak Ministers who have failed to defend their own budgets, and they must justify that to the people who have to face those cuts. There was no need to do that, and those Ministers should feel ashamed that they have yielded so readily to the demand for cuts in their budgets.

This has been a constructive process, and it shows pragmatic politics at its best. Accept that, as the people of Wales will accept it. There is a budget that will now be accepted because the opposition parties have accepted that sufficient concessions have been made so as not to vote against it. Those concessions are important, and fundamental points have been won. However—[*Interruption.*] If you would listen or could understand a rational argument, you would know by now why we have not voted in favour of the budget. That has been explained. It will be obvious to the electorate that you presented a draft budget, it was rejected, and you have had to reach a compromise. You can deceive yourselves, but you cannot deceive the electorate. They

ond ni allwch dwyllo'r etholwyr. Maent yn deall gwleidyddiaeth lawer yn well na chi.

**Carl Sargeant:** The only thing that is obvious to the electorate is the fact that you are not supporting a Welsh Labour budget. You are voting against it, and you are letting down the people of Wales again.

**Rhodri Glyn Thoms:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw realiti na rhesymeg yn golygu dim i rai Aelodau yn y Siambra. Mae'r realiti yn amlwg. Cyflwynwyd cyllideb ddrafft, fe'i gwrtthodwyd, a chafwyd trafodaethau a chonsesiynau. Ni fyddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y gyllideb, ond caiff ei derbyn. Dyna'r realiti, sy'n gwbl syml ac eglur i bawb, oni bai am y sawl ar y meinciau Llafur sy'n anwybyddu realiti yn gyfan gwbl.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** My time is limited, so I will pick up the main points. The first point that I wish to address is contingency funding and the opposition's belief that I could just continue to take whatever extra funding that I need from the contingency fund. The revenue of that fund stands at 0.5 per cent. Just to remind those of you in local government, it works on the basis of 5 per cent of its budget being in reserve. To go below 0.5 per cent would be reckless. I am not prepared to do anything reckless. Jenny, if you want an example, because you cannot think of one, just think of the discussions that we had three weeks ago on the bird flu pandemic, which public health officials said would put us under huge pressure. There are also other things.

**Jenny Randerson:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** No. I do not have much time. I have given you your answer. Look at the transcript and at what you said. You will see that it is you, and not me, who would be reckless.

Rhodri Glyn accused other Ministers of being weak, but the opposite is true. It takes guts to sit down and go through your budget and come up with areas in which you can make cuts. That is the difference between a Minister and a wannabe Minister. These people actually do this.

understand politics far better than you do.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr unig beth sy'n amlwg i'r etholwyr yw'r ffaith nad ydych yn cefnogi cyllideb Llafur Cymru. Yr ydych yn pleidleisio yn ei herbry, ac yr ydych yn siomi pobl Cymru unwaith eto.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sorry, but it is obvious that reality and reason mean nothing to some Members in the Chamber. The reality is obvious. A draft budget was presented, it was rejected, and discussions and concessions were held. We will not vote against the budget, but it will go through. That is the reality, which is quite simple and clear to all, apart from those on the Labour benches who completely ignore reality.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Mae fy amser yn brin, felly, deliaf â'r prif bwyntiau. Y pwynt cyntaf yr hoffwn fynd i'r afael ag ef yw arian wrth gefn, a chred y gwrtbleidiau y gallwn barhau i gymryd faint bynnag o arian ychwanegol y mae arnaf ei angen o'r gronfa wrth gefn. Mae'r refeniw yn y gronfa honno yn 0.5 y cant. I atgoffa'r rheini ohonoch mewn llywodraeth leol, mae'n gweithio ar y sail bod 5 y cant o'r gyllideb yn cael ei roi yn y gronfa wrth gefn. Byddai mynd yn is na 0.5 y cant yn anghyfrifol. Nid wyf yn barod i wneud dim byd sy'n anghyfrifol. Jenny, os hoffech gael engrafft, gan na allwch feddwl am un, ystyriwch y trafodaethau a gawsom dair wythnos yn ôl ar y pandemig ffliw adar, pan ddywedodd swyddogion iechyd cyhoeddus y byddai hyn yn rhoi pwysau enfawr arnom. Mae yna bethau eraill hefyd.

**Jenny Randerson:** A ildiwrch?

**Sue Essex:** Na wnaf. Nid oes gennyf lawer o amser. Yr wyf wedi rhoi eich ateb ichi. Edrychwch ar y trawsysgrif ac ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych. Fe welwch mai chi, nid fi, a fyddai'n anghyfrifol.

Cyhuddodd Rhodri Glyn y Gweinidogion eraill o fod yn wan, ond y gwrtwyneb sy'n wir. Mae'n cymryd dewrder i eistedd i lawr ac edrych ar eich cyllideb a phenderfynu ble y gallwch wneud toriadau. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng Gweinidog a rhywun sy'n dyheu am fod yn Weinidog. Mae'r bobl

hyn yn gwneud hyn.

Ieuan, I support you completely on the north-to-south train link. You have my word that we will continue with that business case and work with Arriva Trains Wales on the outcomes of that.

Jeff made strong points on the value of nutrition in schools, which I appreciate. Jenny, you were wrong. Everything on nutrition was in the draft budget. It has not been increased and it is in the final budget. That was the initiative.

On council tax reductions and reliefs, in fairness, all of you who were involved in the discussions will know about the legal advice that we received. I have operated completely within that, which I respect, as I am pretty sure you do, too.

On the issue of consequentials from the pre-budget report, Jenny, you were wrong again. They were not for council tax reductions; Gordon Brown was moving money around the English departments so that he could get somewhere near to the 5.1 per cent increase for local government that we are getting in Wales. We have already given the 5.1 per cent increase.

The money that we get is largely from the warm homes initiative. You were wrong again—I did not know about Gordon Brown's budget. The idea that he would give me a ring to say, 'Look here, I know that you are having a bit of trouble with your budget down there, so I will tell you about our warm homes initiative a week before I tell anyone else', makes me wonder what world you live in. I am glad that Gordon Brown looked at what we were doing and what we were suggesting after three or four years of doing it in Wales and thought, 'What a good idea, why do we not have that in England?'

We can have all kinds of arguments about a better, brighter budget—it sounds like a new form of soap powder—and who was

Ieuan, fe'ch cefnogaf yn llwyr o ran y cyswllt trenau rhwng y gogledd a'r de. Rhoddaf fy ngair ichi y byddwn yn parhau gyda'r achos busnes hwnnw ac yn gweithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru ar ganlyniadau hynny.

Gwnaeth Jeff bwyntiau cryf ynghylch gwerth maethiad mewn ysgolion, pwyntiau yr wyf yn eu gwerthfawrogi. Yr oeddech chi yn anghywir, Jenny. Yr oedd popeth ar faethiad yn y gyllideb ddrafft. Nid yw wedi cynyddu ac mae yn y gyllideb derfynol. Dyna oedd y cymhelliant.

O ran gostyngiadau a rhyddhad ar gyfer y dreth gyngor, od yn deg, bydd pob un ohonoch a fu'n rhan o'r trafodaethau'n gwybod am y cyngor cyfreithiol a gawsom. Yr wyf wedi gweithredu'n gyfan gwbl o fewn hynny. Parchaf hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi hefyd yn parchu hynny.

O ran y symiau canlyniadol o'r adroddiad cyn y gyllideb, Jenny, yr oeddech yn anghywir unwaith eto. Nid oeddent ar gyfer gostyngiadau treth gyngor; yr oedd Gordon Brown yn symud arian o amgylch yr adrannau yn Lloegr er mwyn sicrhau swm rhywbeth yn debyg i'r cynnydd o 5.1 y cant ar gyfer llywodraeth leol a gawn ni yng Nghymru. Yr ydym ni eisoes wedi rhoi'r cynnydd o 5.1 y cant.

Daw'r arian a gawn o'r fenter cartrefi cynnes yn bennaf. Yr oeddech yn anghywir unwaith eto—nid oeddwn yn gwybod am gyllideb Gordon Brown. Mae'r syniad y byddai'n fy ffonio i ddweud, 'Gwrando, gwn dy fod yn cael ychydig drafferth gyda'ch cyllideb lawr fan yna, felly, fe ddwedaf wrthyt am ein menter cartrefi cynnes ni wytnos cyn imi ddweud wrth neb arall', yn gwneud imi amau ym mha fyd yr ydych yn byw. Yr wyf yn falch fod Gordon Brown wedi edrych ar yr hyn yr oeddem yn ei wneud a'r hyn yr oeddem yn ei awgrymu ar ôl tair neu bedair blynedd o'i wneud yng Nghymru ac wedi meddwl, 'Dyna syniad da, pam nad yw hynny ar waith yn Lloegr?'

Gallwn gael pob math o ddadleuon ynghylch cyllideb well, mwy disgrair—mae'n swnio fel math newydd o bowdwr golchi—a phwy

responsible for it, but a final budget is always better than a draft budget. However, I acknowledge that we worked together and I have acknowledged the situation, and lessons have come out of that.

Lorraine made a significant point about an 82-year-old pensioner. That is the end of the line. That pensioner will not bother too much about our debates here; the issue for her is about seeing improvements in her life. None of us should forget that.

I am prepared, as someone said, to listen to anyone. I have listened carefully to committees, which have an important role in this, and I would not usurp that role. My door is always open, and if we can reach a consensus so much the better. As we are about to move into the open and transparent new Assembly building, of which I think we will all be proud, I am determined to ensure that we maintain and develop an open and transparent budget process that ensures that the public understands the allocation of our resources.

I am disappointed, but not surprised, that the opposition parties will not vote positively for this budget. We will be voting positively: for pensioners and young people and essential health and social care improvements. I am glad that we can be positive about the people of Wales. [Applause.]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That clapping was unseemly and unbefitting; it sounded like a Labour Party meeting.

oedd yn gyfrifol amdani. Ond mae cyllideb derfynol bob amser yn well na chyllideb ddrafft. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf ein bod wedi gweithio gyda'n gilydd, ac yr wyf wedi cydnabod y sefyllfa, ac mae gwersi wedi deillio o hynny.

Gwnaeth Lorraine bwynt arwyddocaol ynghylch pensiynwraig 82 mlwydd oed. Dyna yw diwedd y llinell. Ni fydd y bensiynwraig honno yn poeni rhyw lawer am ein dadleuon yma; y mater iddi hi yw gweld gwelliannau yn ei bywyd. Ni ddylai neb anghofio hynny.

Yr wyf yn barod, fel y dywedodd rhywun, i wrando ar unrhyw un. Yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud ar bwylgorau, sydd â rhan bwysig yn hyn, ac ni fyddwn yn cymryd y rôl honno oddi wrthynt. Mae fy nrws bob amser ar agor, ac os gallwn ddod i gytundeb, gorau oll. Gan ein bod ar fin symud i adeilad newydd agored a thryloyw'r Cynulliad, y credaf y byddwn i gyd yn ymfalchiō ynddo, yr wyf yn benderfynol o sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal ac yn datblygu proses agored a thryloyw o ran y gyllideb sy'n sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn deall sut y caiff ein hadnoddau eu dyrannu.

Yr wyf yn siomedig, ond nid yn synnu, na fydd y gwrthbleidiau'n pleidleisio'n gadarnhaol o blaid y gyllideb hon. Byddwn ni yn pleidleisio'n gadarnhaol: dros bensiynwyr a phobl ifanc a gwelliannau hanfodol ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn falch y gallwn fod yn gadarnhaol ynghylch pobl Cymru. [Cymeradwyo.]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr oedd y cymeradwyo hwnnw'n amhriodol ac yn anweddus; yr oedd yn swnio fel un o gyfarfodydd y Blaid Lafur.

*Cynnig (NDM2749): O blaid 29, Ymatal 25, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2749): For 29, Abstain 25, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Cam-drin yn y Cartref—Hunllef y Nadolig Domestic Abuse—The Nightmare for Christmas**

**Michael German:** I have allowed time for Jenny Randerson, Leanne Wood, Val Lloyd and Mark Isherwood, who have indicated that they would like to speak.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf wedi caniatáu amser i Jenny Randerson, Leanne Wood, Val Lloyd a Mark Isherwood, sydd wedi nodi eu bod am siarad.

I have chosen to address domestic abuse today in the hope of raising awareness. Issues of domestic abuse need to be faced and brought out into the open. As politicians, we cannot leave it to the soap operas to do that for us.

Never has this topic been more pertinent than this week, following the murder of Tracey Jones in Wrexham last weekend. She had suffered years of domestic violence. After living away for 18 months, her former partner broke into her house and stabbed her repeatedly. Unfortunately, domestic abuse is not a one-off occurrence; it is frequent and persistent.

5.20 p.m.

The Welsh national strategy defines domestic abuse as:

‘The use of physical and/or emotional abuse or violence, including undermining of self confidence, sexual violence or the threat of violence, by a person who is or has been in a close relationship.’

It can go beyond actual physical violence. It can also involve emotional abuse, the destruction of a spouse’s or partner’s property, his or her isolation from friends, family or other potential sources of support, threats to others, including children, control over access to money, personal items, food, transportation and the telephone, and stalking. It can also include violence perpetrated by a son, daughter or any other person who has a close or blood relationship with the victim or survivor.

By its nature, domestic violence is an under-reported crime. It is subject to many common myths about its causes and severity. Many wrongly believe that if the violence or abuse were serious enough or frequent enough, then the abused would leave or at least report the crime. In fact, there are more repeat victims for this crime than any other. It accounts for about one in six violent crimes in Wales. The British Crime Report 2004-05 estimates that, on average, there are 35 assaults before a victim calls the police. Domestic abuse

Yr wyf wedi dewis mynd i’r afael â cham-drin yn y cartref heddiw yn y gobaith o godi ymwybyddiaeth. Mae angen wynebu materion yn ymwneud â cham-drin yn y cartref a thynnu sylw atynt. Fel gwleidyddion, ni allwn adael i’r operâu sebon wneud hynny drosom.

Ni fu’r pwnc hwn erioed mor berthnasol nag yn yr wythnos hon, yn dilyn llofruddiaeth Tracey Jones yn Wrecsam y penwythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd wedi dioddef blynnyddoedd o drais yn y cartref. Ar ôl byw oddi cartref am 18 mis, torrodd ei chyn-bartner i mewn i’w thy’ a’i thrywanu droeon. Yn anffodus, nid digwyddiad unigol yw cam-drin yn y cartref; mae’n rheolaidd ac yn barhaus.

Mae strategaeth genedlaethol Cymru yn diffinio cam-drin yn y cartref fel:

‘Defnyddio traus neu gam-drin corfforol a/neu emosiynol, gan gynnwys tanseilio hunanhyder, traus rhywiol neu fygwth traus gan berson sydd, neu sydd wedi bod, mewn perthynas agos.’

Gall fynd y tu hwnt i drais corfforol gwirioneddol. Gall hefyd gynnwys cam-drin emosiynol, distrywio eiddo priod neu bartner, ei ynysu o’i ffrindiau, teulu neu ffynonellau eraill posibl o gymorth, bygwth eraill, gan gynnwys plant, rheoli gallu rhywun i gael hyd i arian, eitemau personol, bwyd, cludiant a’r ffôn, a stelcian. Gall hefyd gynnwys traus a gyflawnir gan fab, merch neu unrhyw un arall sydd â pherthynas agos neu berthynas waed â’r dioddefwr neu’r goroeswr.

Yn ôl ei natur, mae traus yn y cartref yn drosedd nad yw’n cael ei gofnodi bob tro. Mae llawer o fythau cyffredin am ei achosion a’i ddifrifoldeb. Mae nifer yn credu’n anghywir, pe byddai’r traus neu’r cam-drin yn ddigon difrifol neu’n digwydd yn ddigon aml, y byddai’r sawl sy’n cael ei gam-drin yn gadael neu o leiaf yn rhoi gwybod am y trosedd. Mewn gwirionedd, mae mwy o bobl sy’n dioddef y trosedd hwn yn gyson nag unrhyw drosedd arall. Mae’n cyfrif am tuag un o bob chwe throedd difrifol yng

occurs across society. It makes no exception for age, gender, race, sexuality, wealth or geography. A conservative estimate suggests that domestic violence will affect one in four women and one in six men in their lifetime.

A few months ago a young woman, let us call her Josephine, came to my surgery, obviously very distressed at the circumstances in which she found herself. She did not want to go into too much detail, but talked about how she was being treated by her partner. She had been regularly physically abused over a lengthy period. She did not want to contact the police, and clearly did not feel she could leave her home, but did not know what else she could do. I suggested to her a number of helplines, which may assist, and provide far better information and advice than I, or I suspect any of us, could. However, that one example highlighted to me the impossible predicament in which many find themselves. Domestic abuse cuts across lives as victims suffer at many levels: in health, housing, and education. They lose the freedom to live their lives as they want and without fear.

Between April 2004 and April 2005, the Wales domestic abuse helpline received over 6,000 calls. Of those who called, 82 per cent were between the ages of 18 and 25, and 69 per cent of callers had children. More than one in four callers wanted refuge, 8 per cent of callers were disabled, 7 per cent of callers were male, and 1 per cent of calls came from children. The calls reflected a wide spectrum of abuse. Over one third of the abuse was sexual, one third was physical abuse and a quarter was emotional abuse. One in 50 calls reported financial abuse.

Domestic abuse is intentional behaviour. Abusers choose to behave violently to get

Nghymru. Mae Adroddiad Troseddau Prydain 2004-05 yn amcangyfrif bod 35 o ymosodiadau'n digwydd, ar gyfartaledd, cyn i ddioddefwr ffonio'r heddlu. Mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn digwydd ar draws cymdeithas. Nid yw oed, rhyw, hil, rhywioldeb, cyfoeth na daearyddiaeth yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Awgryma amcangyfrif ceidwadol y bydd trais yn y cartref yn effeithio ar un o bob pedair merch ac un o bob chwe dyn yn ystod eu hoes.

Ychydig fisoeedd yn ôl daeth merch ifanc, fe'i galwn yn Josephine, i'm cynghorfa, yn amlwg yn gofidio'n fawr am ei sefyllfa. Nid oedd am fanylu gormod, ond soniodd am y ffordd yr oedd ei phartner yn ei thrin. Yr oedd wedi cael ei cham-drin yn gorfforol yn rheolaidd dros gyfnod hir. Nid oedd am gysylltu â'r heddlu, ac yn amlwg nid oedd yn teimlo y gallai adael ei chartref, ond ni wyddai beth arall y gallai ei wneud. Awgrymais nifer o linellau cymorth, a all fod o gymorth ac sy'n rhoi llawer mwy o wybodaeth a chyngor nag y gallwn i ei roi, nac unrhyw un ohonom, mi dybiaf. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr un enghraifft honno yn tynnu fy sylw at y benbleth amhosibl y mae nifer yn ei hwynebu. Mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn effeithio ar bob agwedd ar fywyd gan fod dioddefwyr yn dioddef ar lawer lefel: o ran iechyd, tai, ac addysg. Maent yn colli'r rhyddid i fyw eu bywydau fel y dymunant a heb ofn.

Rhwng mis Ebrill 2004 a mis Ebrill 2005, cafodd llinell gymorth Cymru ar gam-drin yn y cartref dros 6,000 o alwadau. O'r rhai a ffoniodd y llinell gymorth, yr oedd 82 y cant rhwng 18 a 25 oed, ac yr oedd plant gan 69 y cant o'r rhai a ffoniodd. Yr oedd mwy nag un o bob pedwar person a ffoniodd am gael lloches, yr oedd 8 y cant o'r rhai a ffoniodd yn anabl, yr oedd 7 y cant o'r rhai a ffoniodd yn ddynion, a gwnaed 1 y cant o'r galwadau gan blant. Roedd y galwadau'nadlewyrchu ystod eang o fathau o gam-drin. Yr oedd mwy na thraean yr achosion yn rhywiol, yr oedd traean yn gam-drin corfforol, ac yr oedd chwarter yn gam-drin emosiynol. Yr oedd un o bob 50 o alwadau yn sôn am gam-drin ariannol.

Mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn ymddygiad bwriadol. Mae'r rhai sy'n cam-drin yn dewis

what they want and to gain control. Their behaviour often originates from a belief that it is their right. Often this is supported by sexist, racist, or homophobic attitudes. It is the misuse of power and control. Domestic abuse is not the result of a lack of control. It is about gaining control. If an abuser is careful about when, where and to whom they are abusive, then they are sufficiently aware of their actions to indicate they are not out of control.

The statistics show that we all know someone, male or female, who will be or has been affected by domestic abuse. The effects are far reaching and cost society in different ways. From June 2005, in Wales, 2,319 households were accepted as homeless. One in five of these were due to violence against members of the household, most arising from the violent breakdown of a relationship with a former partner. A total of 224 female single parents were reported as homeless because of violence from former partners.

As well as the human cost, the estimated total cost of domestic violence in Wales in purely monetary terms is £1.15 billion per annum. That figure includes an estimated £155 million as the cost to the state, £65 million as the cost to employers, and human suffering costs of £850 million.

The effect on children can be particularly devastating. Children witness around three-quarters of the abusive incidents in relationships where there is domestic violence. In witnessing this violence, they are also being abused themselves.

The title of this debate makes reference to domestic abuse in the context of Christmas. At a time linked with peace and goodwill, when even the trenches fell silent during the first world war, I find it most disturbing that it does not stop. If we are honest, Christmas is a difficult time in many families, even when everything is going well. Even in an

ymddwyn yn dreisgar i gael eu ffordd eu hunain ac ennill rheolaeth. Mae eu hymddygiad yn aml yn deillio o gred mai dyna yw eu hawl. Ategir hyn yn aml gan ymagweddau rhywiol, hiliol neu homoffobaidd. Mae'n fater o gamddefnyddio pŵer a rheolaeth. Nid yw cam-drin yn y cartref yn deillio o ddiffyg rheolaeth. Mae'n ymwneud ag ennill rheolaeth. Os bydd y sawl sy'n cam-drin yn ofalus o ran pryd a ble y mae'n cam-drin a phwy sy'n cael ei gamdrin, yna mae'n ddigon ymwybodol o'i weithredoedd i ddangos nad wedi colli rheolaeth.

Dengys yr ystadegau ein bod i gyd yn adnabod rhywun, yn ddyn neu'n ferch, y mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn effeithio arno ef neu hi neu wedi effeithio arno ef neu hi. Mae'r effeithiau'n bellgyrhaeddol ac yn achosi costau i gymdeithas mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. O fis Mehefin 2005 yng Nghymru, derbynwyd 2,319 o deuluoedd fel rhai digartref. Yr oedd un o bob pump o'r rheini yn ganlyniad i drais yn erbyn aelodau o'r teulu, a'r rhan fwyaf yn deillio o dorperthynas treisgar â chyn bartner. Cofnodwyd cyfanswm o 224 o famau sengl fel pobl ddigartref oherwydd traís gan gyn bartneriaid.

Yn ogystal â'r gost ddynol, amcangyfrifir bod traís yn y cartref yng Nghymru yn costio cyfanswm o £1.15 biliwn y flwyddyn, yn ariannol yn unig. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys amcangyfrif cost o £155 miliwn i'r wladwriaeth, cost o £65 miliwn i gyflogwyr, a chostau o £850 miliwn o ran dioddefaint pobl.

Gall yr effaith ar blant fod yn arbennig o ddinistriol. Mae plant yn dyst i tua thrif chwarter yr achosion o gam-drin mewn perthynas lle mae traís yn y cartref. Oherwydd gweld y traís hwnnw, maent hwy eu hunain hefyd yn cael eu cam-drin.

Mae teitl y ddadl hon yn cyfeirio at gam-drin yn y cartref yng nghyd-destun y Nadolig. Ar adeg a gysylltir â heddwch ac ewyllys da, pan fu i'r ffosydd hyd yn oed dawelu yn ystod y rhyfel byd cyntaf, mae'n fy ngofidio'n arw nad oes terfyn arno. Os ydym yn onest, mae'r Nadolig yn amser anodd mewn nifer o deuluoedd, hyd yn oed pan fydd popeth yn

abusive situation most people want to stay at home over the festive period, more often than not for the sake of the happiness of children and the extended family. However, levels of stress, alcohol and debt increase. If you live in an abusive family, those tensions can reach fever pitch.

In Wales, a wide cross-section of Welsh agencies are working hard to act against domestic abuse in all its forms. Fortunately—or, perhaps, unfortunately—many of these partner-organisations are stretched to capacity. Refuges are consistently full. For example, Caerphilly Women's Aid has just opened a fourth refuge. Helplines take record numbers of calls. However pressed the services needed under the umbrella of domestic abuse are, they are adapting to meet that demand. There are a growing number of organisations for male sufferers and for sufferers of abuse within same-sex relationships. Thankfully, awareness is beginning to be raised in this area, and I hope that today's debate will raise that awareness further.

However, we should not lose sight of the idea that the growing number and range of service providers is not necessarily good news. It is good that support and refuge is there, but it is not good that the support is needed in the first place. I find it encouraging that it is getting easier to access these services, however, and that the resources exist to ensure seamless service and treatment for survivors of domestic abuse.

Tackling domestic abuse in the long term demands preventative steps. That means anti-violence education in schools and other programmes that educate children about healthy relationships and effective conflict resolution skills. These are important preventive measures. As with any long-term solution, the root causes of the problem must be addressed. Our strategy states that:

'Stereotypes must be confronted, the hidden nature of domestic abuse must be emphasised and the unacceptability of domestic abuse

mynd yn dda. Hyd yn oed mewn sefyllfa dreisgar mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl am fod gartref dros yr wyl, yn amlach na pheidio er mwyn plant a'r teulu estynedig. Fodd bynnag, mae lefelau straen, alcohol a dyled yn cynyddu. Os ydych yn byw mewn teulu treisgar, gall y tensiynau hynny gynyddu'n eithriadol.

Yng Nghymru, mae croestoriad eang o asiantaethau'n gweithio'n galed i atal pob math o gam-drin yn y cartref. Yn ffodus-neu, efallai, yn anffodus-mae nifer o'r sefydliadau partner hyn yn gweithio hyd eithaf eu gallu. Mae llochesi'n llawn yn barhaus. Er enghraifft, mae Cymorth i Fenywod Caerffili newydd agor pedwaredd loches. Mae llinellau cymorth yn cael y niferoedd uchaf erioed o alwadau. Pa bwysau bynnag sydd ar y gwasanaethau angenrheidiol yng nghyddestun cam-drin yn y cartref, maent yn addasu i fodloni'r galw hwnnw. Mae yna nifer cynyddol o sefydliadau ar gyfer dynion sy'n dioddef a'r rheini sy'n cael eu cam-drin mewn perthynas o'r un rhyw. Diolch byth, mae pobl yn dechrau dod yn fwy ymwybodol yn y maes hwn, a gobeithio y bydd y ddadl hon heddiw yn cynyddu'r ymwybyddiaeth honno ymhellach.

Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem golli golwg o'r syniad nad yw'r nifer cynyddol o ddarparwyr gwasanaethau a'ur hamrywiaeth o reidrwydd yn newyddion da. Mae'n dda gweld bod cymorth a llochesi ar gael, ond nid yw'n dda bod angen y cymorth yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n galonogol ei bod yn haws cael gafael ar y gwasanaethau hyn, fodd bynnag, a bod yr adnoddau ar gael i sicrhau gwasanaeth di-dor a thriniaeth i'r rheini sy'n dod drwy gam-drin yn y cartref.

Mae mynd i'r afael â cham-drin yn y cartref yn y cyfnod hir yn galw am gamau ataliol. Golyga hynny addysg gwrth-drais mewn ysgolion, a rhagleni eraill sy'n addysgu plant am gydberthynas iach a sgiliau effeithiol i ddatrys gwrthdar. Mae'r rhain yn fesurau ataliol pwysig. Fel gydag unrhyw ateb dros gyfnod hir, rhaid mynd i'r afael â gwraidd y broblem. Dywed ein strategaeth:

'Rhaid herio stereoteipiau, pwysleisio natur gudd cam-drin yn y cartref a rhaid cyfleo'n effeithiol nad yw cam-drin yn y cartref yn

must be effectively communicated. Information must be accessible to all people which means that it must be available in a range of formats and languages and be culturally relevant.'

That is the real challenge for Wales in the near and distant future: to invest in prevention, to work across portfolios on policy development, and to keep shining a light on an issue that thrives in the dark.

A YouGov poll of 2004 revealed that 20 per cent of women admit that they have lived or currently live in fear of violence; yet more than half told researchers that they would be too embarrassed or ashamed to tell their friends. Even more—nearly 60 per cent—said that they would be too embarrassed or ashamed to tell their families. Reports suggest that Tracey Jones's extended family and friends had no idea that she was suffering domestic violence.

5.30 p.m.

The notion that this problem must be kept behind closed doors must be rubbed out. Investing in preventative work in the workplace, schools and colleges will go some way to ensuring that people are given the tools to meet their full potential. An essential part of this is awareness and confidence to demand healthy, safe and mutually respectful relationships. While the Christmas season of goodwill can be a nightmare for those in abusive situations, abuse is a life and death issue all year long.

Today is our last day in this Chamber this year—potentially, our last day here altogether. This is our final debate in our temporary home, which we will leave for greener pastures next door. We must not forget what has happened in this room. I trust that we will not forget the issues raised here today either. [Applause.]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We do not want clapping from the other side of the Chamber either.

dderbyniol. Rhaid i wybodaeth fod ar gael i bawb, sy'n golygu fod yn rhaid iddi fod ar gael mewn sawl iaith a fformat a bod yn berthnasol yn ddiwylliannol.'

Dyna'r her wirioneddol sy'n wynebu Cymru yn y dyfodol agos ac yn y cyfnod hir: buddsoddi mewn gwaith ataliol, gweithio ar draws portffolios ar ddatblygu polisiau, a pharhau i daflu goleuni ar fater sy'n ffynnu yn y tywyllwch.

Datgelodd arolwg barn gan YouGov yn 2004 fod 20 y cant o ferched yn cyfaddef eu bod yn byw neu wedi byw yn ofni traïs; fodd bynnag, dywedodd mwy na hanner wrth ymchwilwyr y byddent yn teimlo gormod o embaras neu gywilydd i ddweud wrth ffrindiau. Yr oedd mwy hyd yn oed yn dweud—bron 60 y cant—y byddent yn teimlo gormod o embaras neu gywilydd i ddweud wrth eu teuluoedd. Awgryma adroddiadau nad oedd gan deulu estynedig a ffrindiau Tracey Jones unrhyw syniad ei bod yn dioddef traïs yn y cartref.

Rhaid dileu'r gred fod yn rhaid i'r broblem hon gael ei chadw y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig. Bydd buddsoddi mewn gwaith ataliol yn y gweithle, mewn ysgolion a cholegau yn gwneud rhywfaint i sicrhau bod gan bobl yr adnoddau i gyflawni eu potensial llawn. Rhan hanfodol o hyn yw ymwybyddiaeth a hyder i hawlio perthynas iach, ddiogel sy'n cael ei pharchu gan y ddwy ochr. Er y gall tymor ewyllys da y Nadolig fod yn hunllef i'r rheini sy'n cael eu cam-drin, mae cam-drin yn fater o fyw neu farw drwy gydol y flwyddyn.

Heddiw yw ein diwrnod olaf yn y Siambra hon eleni—o bosibl, ein diwrnod olaf oll yma. Hon yw ein dadl olaf yn ein cartref dros dro, a byddwn yn ei adael am borfeydd mwy gwelltog y drws nesaf. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn yr ystafell hon. Hyderaf nad anghofiwn y materion a godwyd yma heddiw ychwaith. [Cymeradwyaeth.]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym am gael cymeradwyaeth o ochr arall y Siambra hon eleni—o bosibl, ein diwrnod olaf oll yma. Hon yw ein dadl olaf yn ein cartref dros dro, a byddwn yn ei adael am borfeydd mwy gwelltog y drws nesaf. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn yr ystafell hon. Hyderaf nad anghofiwn y materion a godwyd yma heddiw ychwaith. [Cymeradwyaeth.]

If everyone is going to get in, please keep contributions to less than 40 seconds each.

**Jenny Randerson:** Domestic abuse is a particularly difficult and sensitive subject for some ethnic minority groups. In my constituency, which has a large ethnic minority population, this is a serious and difficult issue. I commend the work of the Black Association of Women Step Out. I have visited a refuge, which is doing tremendous work for ethnic minority women who suffer domestic abuse. I know from dealing with two specific cases in my constituency how difficult it is to raise and deal with this issue among those groups.

**Leanne Wood:** Thanks for raising this issue, Mike; it is an important issue. It is important to remember as well that Christmas is a nightmare for homeless people, those who have lost someone, those who live in dire poverty, and those who are in debt. They face a horrendous time this Christmas. I am not a big fan of Christmas, so I can identify with many of those sentiments.

As Christmas becomes more and more commercialised, the pressures on people increase. That is why this debate is important. Prior to my election to the Assembly, I used to work as a Women's Aid officer, and I still chair Cwm Cynon Women's Aid. I know the pressure that organisations face at this time of year. There is particular uncertainty within the Women's Aid movement at present because of the tariff situation with Supporting People, which could result in a cut in services. Therefore, if there is one message to give this Christmas, it is: please do not let domestic abuse remain hidden.

**Val Lloyd:** Amnesty International currently has a global campaign to stop abuse against women. In support of that, I am hosting a candlelit vigil in Swansea next Friday. Much valuable work has been done at the Assembly, but my crux is: what more can we do. The more you uncover on this issue and look into it, the more worrying it becomes. If you look at the telephone helpline calls, last year, before Christmas, the calls decreased

Er mwyn i bawb gael cyfle i siarad, cadwch y cyfraniadau i lai na 40 eiliad yr un.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn bwnc arbennig o anodd a sensitif i rai grwpiau o leiafrifoedd ethnig. Yn fy etholaeth i, sydd â phoblogaeth fawr o leiafrifoedd ethnig, mae hwn yn fater difrifol ac anodd. Canmolaf waith Black Association of Women Step Out. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â lloches, sy'n gwneud gwaith aruthrol dros fenywod o leiafrifoedd ethnig sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref. Gwn o'm hymwneud â dau achos penodol yn fy etholaeth mor anodd yw codi'r mater hwn ymhlið y grwpiau hynny a delio ag ef.

**Leanne Wood:** Diolch am godi'r mater hwn, Mike; mae'n fater pwysig. Mae'n bwysig cofio hefyd fod y Nadolig yn hunllef i bobl ddigartref, pobl sydd wedi colli rhywun, pobl sy'n byw mewn tlodi enbyd, a phobl sydd mewn dyled. Maent yn wynebu amser erchyll y Nadolig hwn. Nid wyf yn or-hoff o'r Nadolig, felly, gallaf uniaethu â nifer o'r teimladau hynny.

Wrth i'r Nadolig fynd yn fwy a mwy masnacheiddiol, mae'r pwysau ar bobl yn cynyddu. Dyna pam y mae'r ddadl hon mor bwysig. Cyn fy ethol i'r Cynulliad, arferwn weithio fel swyddog Cymorth i Fenywod, ac yr wyf yn dal yn gadeirydd Cymorth i Fenywod Cwm Cynon. Gwn am y pwysau sy'n wynebu sefydliadau ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Mae ansicrwydd yn arbennig yn y mudiad Cymorth i Fenywod ar hyn o bryd oherwydd y sefyllfa tariff gyda Chefnnogi Pobl, a allai olygu lleihau gwasanaethau. Felly, os oes un neges i'w rhoi y Nadolig hwn, y neges honno yw: peidiwch â gadael i achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref ddal ynghudd.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae gan Amnest Rhyngwladol ar hyn o bryd ymgyrch fyd-eang i atal cam-drin menywod. I gefnogi hynny, byddaf yn cynnal gwylnos yng ngolau cannwyll yn Abertawe nos Wener nesaf. Gwnaed llawer o waith gwerthfawr yn y Cynulliad, ond y cwestiwn craidd yw: beth yn rhagor y gallwn ei wneud. Po fwyaf a ddatgelwch am y mater hwn ac ymchwilio iddo, y mwyaf gofidus ydyw. Os ystyriwch y galwadau ffôn i'r llinell gymorth

from women, mainly because it was thought that they did not want to spoil the family Christmas, but they shot up to nearly 50 per cent more after Christmas.

**Mark Isherwood:** Following on from that point, Women's Aid tells me that it is also a common misconception that it is busier at Christmas. The abused tend to keep quiet during the festive period, and it is in January that Women's Aid groups experience a rise in demand, caused by the nightmare at Christmas.

In these circumstances, I am sure that you will share my concerns, raised with me at Women's Aid annual general meetings, that the lack of funding has led to cuts in opening hours at some Women's Aid information centres. One reason that women return to abusive partners is the problems faced in getting their children to high schools when they move into refuge accommodation—

y llynedd, cyn y Nadolig, gostyngodd nifer y galwadau gan fenywod, yn bennaf oherwydd credid nad oeddent am ddifetha Nadolig y teulu. Ond cynyddodd y nifer yn sydyn i bron 50 y cant yn fwy ar ôl y Nadolig.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn dilyn o'r pwynt hwnnw, dywed Cymorth i Fenywod wrthyf fod yna gamdybiaeth gyffredin ei fod yn brysurach adeg y Nadolig. Mae'r rhai sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn tueddu i gadw'n dawel yn ystod y Nadolig, ac ym mis Ionawr y bydd grwpiau Cymorth i Fenywod yn gweld cynnydd yn y galw, wedi ei achosi gan yr hunllef adeg y Nadolig.

O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch, fel fi, yn pryderu am fater sy'n cael godi gyda mi yng nghyfarfodydd cyffredinol blynyddol Cymorth i Fenywod, sef bod y prinder arian wedi arwain at gwtogi oriau agor mewn rhai canolfannau gwybodaeth Cymorth i Fenywod. Un rheswm pam y mae menywod yn dychwelyd at bartneriaid sy'n eu cam-drin yw'r problemau a wynebant wrth geisio cael lle i'w plant mewn ysgolion uwchradd pan symudant i lety lloches-

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Time has run out.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I thank Mike for bringing this issue up just before Christmas. It is a nightmare for thousands of women and children every day of the year; we must recognise that. It comes sharply into focus at Christmas, with all the pressures that you, and Leanne, have outlined, for many people.

When you think that one in four women suffer domestic abuse—those are the current statistics—and that one incident is reported to the police every minute, you start to realise the startling levels. Domestic abuse accounts for 17 to 25 per cent of all violent crime, and 30 per cent of domestic abuse starts or escalates during pregnancy. That figure shocks most people, I think. Someone is expecting their child, they have the joy of that, yet domestic abuse increases.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth yr amser i ben.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Diolch i Mike am godi'r mater hwn ychydig cyn y Nadolig. Mae'n hunllef i filoedd o fenywod a phlant bob dydd o'r flwyddyn; rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Daw'n amlwg iawn adeg y Nadolig, gyda'r holl bwysau sydd ar nifer o bobl, fel yr ydych chi a Leanne wedi eu hamlinellu.

Pan feddyliwch fod un o bob pedair o fenywod yn cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref—dyna'r ystadegau cyfredol—a bod yr heddlu'n cael gwybod am un digwyddiad bob munud, byddwch yn dechrau deall y lefelau syfrdanol. Mae achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref yn cyfrif am 17 i 25 y cant o'r holl droseddau treisgar, ac mae 30 y cant o achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref yn dechrau neu'n gwaethgu yn ystod beichiogrwydd. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n syfrdanu'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, mi gredaf. Mae rhywun yn disgwyl eu plentyn, maent yn ymhyfrydu yn hynny, ac eto mae'r achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref yn

cynyddu.

We have successfully published a good strategy here that takes the work forward. As Val said, the more work that you do, the more work you uncover on this agenda. We have put additional resources in, so I do not agree with Mark. Lots of resources are going into domestic abuse—I think that the reason for that is because there are more women in politics, and this issue has gone up the political agenda. I have allocated a further £1.1 million in 2005-06, in addition to a budget of £1.6 million already in place. We currently fund 19 domestic abuse projects, and there are eight new ones across Wales: Amman Valley Women's Aid, New Pathways in Merthyr, Montgomeryshire Family Crisis Centre, Blaenau Gwent Domestic Abuse Services, Wrexham Community Safety Partnership, Gwent Bobby Van Trust, Pembrokeshire Domestic Abuse Forum and Caerphilly Domestic Abuse Forum. There is a remaining sum of £800,000 to allocate in 2006-07. The strategy is starting to bear fruit in some of those areas.

Community safety partnerships are responsible for steering this collaboration. We must also look at our core funding for Welsh Women's Aid. We are reviewing how the free telephone helpline is working. The number of calls that the helpline takes is staggering. We must ask whether we need a 24-hour service, as people cannot always call during office hours—people sometimes flee out at night to make calls when there is somebody drunk in bed beside them. It is important that we work with the cross-party support that we have on domestic abuse. There is no difference across parties on this issue, in terms of what we want to do about the individuals concerned.

I also welcome the lead that has been taken with the Westminster Government. The Home Office is developing a specialist domestic violence course across Wales,

Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gyhoeddi strategaeth dda yma sy'n datblygu'r gwaith. Fel y dywedodd Val, po fwyaf o waith a wnewch, mwyaf yn y byd o waith sy'n dod i'r amlwg ar yr agenda hon. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo adnoddau ychwanegol, felly, ni chytunaf â Mark. Mae llawer o adnoddau'n cael eu neilltuo i ddelio ag achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref—credaf mai'r rheswm am hynny yw bod mwy o fenywod mewn gwleidyddiaeth, a bod y mater hwn wedi codi'n uwch ar yr agenda wleidyddol. Yr wyf wedi dyrannu £1.1 miliwn arall yn 2005-06, yn ychwanegol at gyllideb o £1.6 miliwn sydd eisoes ar waith. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennym 19 o brosiectau cam-drin yn y cartref, ac mae wyth o rai newydd ledled Cymru: Cymorth i Fenywod Dyffryn Aman, Llwybrau Newydd ym Merthyr, Canolfan Argyfwng Teuluol Sir Drefaldwyn, Gwasanaethau Cam-drin yn y Cartref Blaenau Gwent, Partneriaeth Diogelwch Cymunedol Wrecsam, Ymddiriedolaeth Bobby Van Gwent, Fforwm Cam-drin yn y Cartref Sir Benfro a Fforwm Cam-drin yn y Cartref Caerffili. Mae swm o £800,000 yn weddill i'w ddyrannu yn 2006-07. Mae'r strategaeth yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth yn rhai o'r ardaloedd hynny.

Partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol sy'n gyfrifol am lywio'r cydweithrediad hwn. Rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar ein harian craidd ar gyfer Cymorth i Fenywod Cymru. Yr ydym yn adolygu'r modd y mae'r llinell gymorth ar y ffôn am ddim yn gweithio. Mae nifer y galwadau a dderbynir gan y llinell gymorth yn syfrdanol. Rhaid inni ofyn a oes angen gwasanaeth 24 awr, oherwydd ni all pobl bob amser ffonio yn ystod oriau swyddfa—weithiau bydd pobl yn dianc yn y nos i wneud galwadau tra bydd rhywun yn feddw yn y gwely wrth eu hymyl. Mae'n bwysig inni weithio gyda'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol sydd gennym ar gam-drin yn y cartref. Nid oes gwahaniaeth ar draws y pleidiau yn y mater hwn, o ran yr hyn yr ydym am ei wneud ynghylch yr unigolion dan sylw.

Croesawaf hefyd yr arweiniad a roddwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn datblygu cwrs arbenigol ar draisiau yn y cartref ledled Cymru, sy'n bwysig. Mae

which is important. A pattern needs to be established; when someone makes that decision and gets it into the system, we must ensure that they are dealt with properly. We must remember that domestic abuse is a crime, and we should never talk about it in any other terms. It is criminal activity. We are talking about violent assaults on many vulnerable people. We must also remember what children see at home and that that pattern can carry on in later life. There is so much more to do in education, such as explaining the issue and considering how we engage with young people to talk about it. One figure that concerns me is the age-group figures; more young women are suffering domestic abuse, some of whom do not think that it is odd or that there is anything wrong with it. People can sometimes think that it is a generational thing and that their mothers suffered more than them; we are seeing the pattern constantly repeating itself from generation to generation.

We must also look at the issues that fuel domestic abuse, such as alcohol and drug abuse. We must look at all our policies. I have highlighted some of the work being undertaken by the Government in Wales, and we have absolute commitment as a Government, and as a National Assembly, to the development of this strategy. I know that there are concerns—and Leanne raised one—about tariffs, and I will look at that issue in discussions, as I am well aware of the excellent work done by Welsh Women's Aid and want it to continue.

I share Jenny's respect for BAWSO, which is an excellent organisation, but there are difficult issues in that area that we must still tackle with regard to what constitutes domestic abuse; it is sometimes not regarded as a crime, like we would regard it, but as a normal pattern of events within certain communities, where families do not want to talk about it. We must be much more upfront, and if this debate has done anything, it has brought the issue to the forefront again. It is important that the Assembly has regular debates on this issue because people will understand that it is a major issue for us.

angen sefydlu patrwm: pan fydd rhywun yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw ac yn dod yn rhan o'r system, rhaid inni sierhau delio â hwy yn gywir. Rhaid inni gofio bod cam-drin yn y cartref yn drosedd, ac ni ddylem byth sôn amdano mewn unrhyw ffordd arall. Mae'n weithgaredd troseddol. Yr ydym yn sôn am ymosodiadau treisgar ar nifer o bobl ddiamddiffyn. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd yr hyn a wêl plant yn y cartref, ac y gall y patrwm hwnnw barhau'n ddiweddarach mewn bywyd. Mae cymaint mwy i'w wneud ym maes addysg, megis egluro'r broblem ac ystyried sut y gallwn ymgysylltu â phobl ifanc i siarad am y peth. Un ffigur sy'n achos pryder i mi yw ffigurau'r grŵp oedran; mae mwy o ferched ifanc yn cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref, ac nid yw rhai ohonynt yn credu bod hynny'n rhyfedd na bod dim o'i le ar hynny. Weithiau, gall pobl feddwl ei fod yn fater o genhedlaeth a bod eu mamau wedi dioddef mwy na hwy; gwelwn y patrwm yn ailadrodd ei hun yn gyson o genhedlaeth i genhedlaeth.

Rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar y materion sy'n hybu achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref, megis camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau. Rhaid inni edrych ar bob un o'n polisiau. Yr wyf wedi tynnu sylw at rywfaint o'r gwaith a wneir gan y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr fel Llywodraeth, ac fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i ddatblygu'r strategaeth hon. Gwn fod yna bryderon—a chodwyd un gan Leanne—am dariffau, a byddaf yn edrychaf ar y mater hwnnw mewn trafodaethau, gan fy mod yn ymwybodol iawn o'r gwaith rhagorol a wneir gan Gymorth i Fenywod Cymru ac yr wyf am iddo barhau.

Fel Jenny, yr wyf yn parchu BAWSO, sy'n sefydliad rhagorol. Ond mae yna faterion anodd yn y maes hwnnw y mae'n rhaid inni barhau i fynd i'r afael â hwy o ran beth yw cam-drin yn y cartref, weithiau ni chaiff ei ystyried yn drosedd, fel yr hoffem iddo gael ei ystyried, ond yn batrwm arferol o ddigwyddiadau mewn rhai cymunedau, lle nad yw teuluoedd am siarad am y peth. Rhaid inni fod lawer yn fwy blaenllaw, ac os yw'r ddadl hon wedi gwneud unrhyw beth, mae wedi dwyn y mater i'n sylw unwaith eto. Mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad gael trafodaethau rheolaidd ar y mater hwn, oherwydd bydd

These acts of violence must be stopped.

I thank Mike for bringing the debate to the Chamber today. It is very important that we recognise that we all have a responsibility in this area. As Assembly Members and MPs, people come to our surgeries and we can only refer them, but we must encourage them to take action for themselves, even though, sometimes, it is terribly difficult.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.39 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.39 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)

pobl yn deall ei fod yn fater pwysig inni.  
Rhaid atal yr achosion hyn o drais.

Diolch i Mike am gyflwyno'r ddadl yn y Siambr heddiw. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni gydnabod bod gennym gyfrifoldeb yn y maes hwn. Fel Aelodau Cynulliad ac ASau, daw pobl i'n cymorthfeydd ac ni allwn ond eu cyfeirio. Ond rhaid inni eu hannog i gymryd camau eu hunain, er bod hynny weithiau, yn ofnadwy o anodd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)