



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 7 Mawrth 2000**

**Tuesday 7 March 2000**

## Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd  
*Questions to the First Secretary*
- 19 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 21 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 22 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Tâl ar sail Perfformiad i Athrawon  
*Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Performance-related Pay for Teachers*
- 53 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd  
*Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Cardiff Bay Development Corporation*
- 82 Dadl Fer: Prinder Gwelyau NHS  
*Short Debate: The Shortage of NHS Beds*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd Questions to the First Secretary**

### **Cynhwysiant Economaidd i Fenywod yn y Gweithlu Economic Inclusion of Women in the Workforce**

**C1 Gareth Jones:** Ym mha fodd y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn hyrwyddo cynhwysiant economaidd i fenywod yn y gweithlu? (OAQ3894)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd (Rhodri Morgan):** Gofal plant yw'r mater allweddol. Clywodd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd, yn ystod eu hymweliad â Brwsel ddydd Iau a dydd Gwener diwethaf, eglurhad o strategaeth gyflogaeth y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Yr oedd pwyslais y Comisiwn yn drwm ar y ffaith fod angen rhwydwaith o ofal plant. Dyna'r ffordd i gynorthwyo menywod i gymryd rhan gyfartal a theilwng yn y gweithlu.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr oeddwn yn synnu clywed mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn ddiweddar—er bod Deddf Cyflogau Cyfartal 1970 mewn bodolaeth ers 30 mlynedd—fod gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng yr hyn y mae menywod a dynion yn ei ennill, ar gyfartaledd, yn ôl yr awr ac yn wythnosol. Er enghraifft, mae hanner y menywod yng Nghymru yn ennill llai na £250 yr wythnos o'i gymharu â chwarter y dynion. Mae hanner y dynion yng Nghymru yn ennill dros £350 yr wythnos. Cyflwynwyd y ffeithiau hynny i ni. Mae angen datrys y broblem hon. A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd y Cynulliad yn arwain y ffordd yng Nghymru drwy gynnal archwiliadau rheolaidd a gorfodol ar gyflogau'r Cynulliad a'r cyrff a noddir gan y Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Wrth gwrs. Byddai gosod isafswm tâl drwy'r gyfraith ym Mhrydain Fawr yn cael mwy o effaith yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Byddwn yn disgwyl gweld tyfiant yn yr economi ac yn y gallu i wario oherwydd y byddai cymaint o fenywod yng Nghymru yn manteisio ar yr isafswm cyflog

**Q1 Gareth Jones:** How will the First Secretary promote the economic inclusion of women in the workforce? (OAQ3894)

**The First Secretary (Rhodri Morgan):** Childcare is the key issue. Members of the European Affairs Committee, during their visit to Brussels last Thursday and Friday, heard an explanation of the European Commission's employment strategy. The Commission placed great emphasis on the fact that a childcare network is needed. That is the way to help women to take an equal, deserved role in the workforce.

**Gareth Jones:** I was surprised to hear in a meeting of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity recently—although the Equal Pay Act 1970 has existed for 30 years—that there are substantial differences between the average hourly and weekly earnings of women and men. For example, half the women in Wales earn less than £250 a week compared to a quarter of the men. Half the men in Wales earn over £350 a week. Those facts were presented to us. This problem needs to be resolved. Will you ensure that the Assembly will lead the way in Wales by holding regular and mandatory audits on the salaries of the Assembly and Assembly sponsored bodies?

**The First Secretary:** Of course. Setting a statutory minimum wage in Great Britain would have a greater effect in Wales than in any other part of the United Kingdom. I would expect to see a growth in the economy and in spending ability because so many women in Wales would take advantage of the minimum wage and the fact that the base had

a'r ffaith fod y llawr wedi ei osod drwy'r Ddeddf newydd honno.

A oes anghydraddoldeb mewn cyrff cyhoeddus fel y Cynulliad ei hun neu mewn unrhyw gwango a noddir gan y Cynulliad? Os oes unrhyw un yn gwybod am ddiffyg chwarae teg yn y ffordd y pennir tâl i fenywod a dynion mewn cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, byddwn yn falch o glywed y dystiolaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you agree that positive discrimination in favour of any sector of the workforce could detract from the objective of any workforce, which is economic and social prosperity and social advancement?

**The First Secretary:** It is almost as if Alun is trying to produce a self-fulfilling definition of positive discrimination; that is, if you use the word 'discrimination', it is automatically bad. People are in favour of positive action. If, in an industry, in the service industries or in the public sector, the present status of the workforce points to evidence of past bad practice—for example, if 90 per cent of employees are men and 10 per cent are women, or if 90 per cent are women but all the top jobs are taken by men—there is something wrong and action is needed to move in the direction of more equal opportunities. I hope that Alun does not dissent from the general proposition that the more successful economies in the world are those where women and men, regardless of the necessary break for childbirth and so forth, are able to participate fully throughout their working lives. Therefore, the expenditure that society and they themselves have invested in their education and qualifications is not wasted. They are able to play their full part in careers rather than dead-end jobs and in making sure that the full range of career opportunities is as open to men as it is to women.

**Kirsty Williams:** Would you agree that one way we can promote the economic inclusion of women in the workforce is to ensure that there are adequate childcare facilities for them? What action is the administration taking on the recommendations of the Welsh Development Agency's entrepreneur action

been set by that new Act.

Is there inequality in public bodies like the Assembly itself or in any quango sponsored by the Assembly? If anybody knows of lack of equity in the way pay is set for women and men in Assembly sponsored public bodies, I would be pleased to hear the evidence.

**Alun Cairns:** A gytunwch y gallai gwahaniaethu cadarnhaol o blaid unrhyw sector o'r gweithlu dynnu oddi wrth amcan unrhyw weithlu, sef ffyniant economaidd a chymdeithasol a chynnydd cymdeithasol?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae bron fel pe bai Alun yn ceisio llunio diffiniad hunangyflawnol o wahaniaethu cadarnhaol; sef, os defnyddiwch y gair 'gwahaniaethu', fod hynny'n ddrwg ynddo'i hun. Mae pobl o blaid gweithredu cadarnhaol. Os yw statws presennol y gweithlu mewn diwydiant, yn y diwydiannau gwasanaethu neu yn y sector cyhoeddus, yn dangos tystiolaeth o arferion gwael yn y gorffennol—er enghraifft, os yw 90 y cant o'r gweithwyr yn ddynion a 10 y cant yn fenywod, neu os yw 90 y cant yn fenywod a'r holl swyddi uchel wedi eu llenwi â dynion—mae rhywbeth o'i le ac mae angen cymryd camau i gyfeiriad mwy o gyfleoedd cyfartal. Gobeithiaf nad yw Alun yn anghydweld â'r gosodiad cyffredinol mai'r economïau mwyaf llwyddiannus yn y byd yw'r rhai lle y mae benywod a dynion, ni waeth am y toriad angenrheidiol i eni plant ac yn y blaen, yn gallu cyfranogi'n llawn gydol eu hoes gweithio. Felly, ni wastreffir y gwariant y mae cymdeithas a hwythau wedi ei fuddsoddi yn eu haddysg a'u cymwysterau. Gallant chwarae eu rhan yn llawn mewn gyrfaedd yn hytrach na swyddi heb ddyfodol ac wrth sicrhau bod yr amrediad cyflawn o gyfleoedd gyrfa ar gael i ddynion fel y mae i fenywod.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunech mai un ffordd y gallwn hybu cynhwysiant economaidd benywod yn y gweithlu yw sicrhau bod cyfleusterau gofal plant digonol ar eu cyfer? Pa gamau y mae'r weinyddiaeth yn eu cymryd ar argymhellion cynllun gweithredu mentrwyr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac

plan and the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs' report on childcare in Wales to ensure that there is adequate childcare provision for women who want to work in Wales?

**The First Secretary:** I strongly support those recommendations. Not only must there be provision of childcare, that childcare must be of good quality and affordable. Unfortunately, affordability is frequently a major issue, particularly in the case of younger children, because of the obligatory staff-children ratios when children are under one year old. In the Scandinavian countries the range, affordability and high minimum standards of childcare are essential to ensure that women and men—because this can affect a minority of men as well—are able to participate in the workforce. They do not lose those key years when they could be bounding up the earnings ladder through having to stay at home due to the absence of good quality, affordable childcare. Childcare is also essential in rural areas, where it is much more difficult to provide.

adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ar ofal plant yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod darpariaeth ddigonol o ofal plant i fenywod sydd am weithio yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cefnogaf yr argymhellion hynny'n gryf. Nid yn unig y mae'n rhaid cael darpariaeth o ofal plant, rhaid i'r gofal plant hwnnw fod o ansawdd da ac yn fforddiadwy. Gwaetha'r modd, mae fforddiadwyedd yn fater mawr yn aml, yn enwedig yn achos plant iau, oherwydd y cymarebau gorfodol rhwng staff a phlant pan yw plant o dan flwydd oed. Yng ngwledydd Llychlyn mae amrediad, fforddiadwyedd a safonau lleiaf uchel y gofal plant yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod benywod a dynion—oherwydd gall hyn effeithio ar leiafrif o ddynion hefyd—yn gallu cyfranogi yn y gweithlu. Ni chollir y blynyddoedd allweddol hynny pan allent fod yn neidio i fyny'r ysgol enillion am eu bod yn gorfod aros gartref oherwydd diffyg gofal plant fforddiadwy o ansawdd da. Mae gofal plant yn holl bwysig hefyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle y mae'n llawer anos ei ddarparu.

### **Allgáu Cymdeithasol ym Mae Colwyn Social Exclusion in Colwyn Bay**

**Q2 David Davies:** What steps is the First Secretary taking to tackle social exclusion in Colwyn Bay? (OAQ3885)

**C2 David Davies:** Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol ym Mae Colwyn? (OAQ3885)

**The First Secretary:** The People in Communities programme, which is the Assembly's innovative response to tackling social exclusion in deprived communities, is operating on the Peulwys Estate in Old Colwyn.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'r rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau, sef ymateb arloesol y Cynulliad i ymdrin ag allgáu cymdeithasol mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, ar waith ar stad Peulwys yn Hen Golwyn.

**David Davies:** It is encouraging to hear that there are moves to tackle social exclusion in Colwyn Bay. Does the First Secretary agree that it is also important that local people be given proper access to recreational facilities? Will he support the campaign by Conservative councillors in the area and the local prospective Conservative candidate, Jimmy James, to prevent a call centre from being built on Eirias Park when there are plenty of other sites available locally that would suit the purpose just as well?

**David Davies:** Calonogol yw clywed bod camau i fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol ym Mae Colwyn. A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig hefyd i bobl leol gael mynediad priodol i gyfleusterau adloniadol? A wnaiff gefnogi'r ymgyrch gan gynghorwyr Ceidwadol yn yr ardal a'r darpar ymgeisydd Ceidwadol lleol, Jimmy James, i atal codi canolfan alwadau ar Barc Eirias pan fo digon o safleoedd eraill ar gael yn lleol a atebai'r diben lawn cystal?

2:10 p.m.

**The First Secretary:** That is an interesting attempt to give publicity to a no-doubt beleaguered Conservative candidate in that constituency.

We tend to be torn both ways on this issue. We have recently announced four call centre developments in Swansea, Pembroke Dock, Cwmbran and Merthyr Tydfil. Therefore, when there is a desperate desire for call centre developments in north Wales, people ask why call centres are not also being developed there. When a site is identified by the Welsh Development Agency and the local council as suitable for a call centre that would be centrally located on the north Wales coast, people say that they play football on that patch of ground or that they pick blackberries there, or whatever. That always happens. You must then ask people whether or not they want a call centre. Finding a balance between an adequate range of industrial sites of this kind to ensure that every part of Wales has an equal chance of attracting a call centre and wishing to preserve every patch of ground that is or was a playing field, is not easy. I am not sure whether David is showing the right degree of balance between the need to create employment and the need to conserve a playing field in this area.

**Alun Pugh:** Rhodri, would you accept that it is quite difficult to get a job in Colwyn Bay? Both Alun Cairns and Rod Richards have recently been unsuccessful in job interviews there. What advice would you give a retired English army major looking for a job in Colwyn Bay? Should he get a map or should he get a new minder?

**The First Secretary:** Many people intend to get a job in Colwyn Bay but not everyone has been as lucky as Alun Pugh in finding one. Whatever may be happening as regards Conservative Party representation in that area, I would urge the Conservative Party to consider the job chances of 100 people who might get a job in a call centre as well as their own desire to look for a headline in the weekly newspaper.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae hynny'n ymgais ddi-ddorol i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i ymgeisydd Ceidwadol yn yr etholaeth honno ac yntau'n sicr o fod dan warchae.

Tueddwn i gael ein tynnu'r ddwy ffordd ar y mater hwn. Cyhoeddassom bedwar datblygiad o ganolfannau galwadau yn ddiweddar yn Abertawe, Doc Penfro, Cwmbrân a Merthyr Tudful. Felly, pan fo awydd taer am ddatblygu canolfannau galwadau yng ngogledd Cymru, mae pobl yn gofyn pam nad yw canolfannau galwadau yn cael eu datblygu yno. Pan ddynodir safle gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r cyngor lleol yn un addas ar gyfer canolfan alwadau a fyddai mewn lleoliad canolog ar arfordir gogledd Cymru, dywed pobl eu bod yn chwarae pêl droed ar y darn tir hwnnw neu eu bod yn mwyara yno, neu beth bynnag. Digwydd hynny bob tro. Rhaid gofyn i bobl wedyn a ydynt eisiau canolfan alwadau ai peidio. Nid hawdd yw cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng amrediad digonol o safleoedd diwydiannol o'r math hwn i sicrhau bod gan bob rhan o Gymru gyfle cyfartal i ddenu canolfan alwadau a dymuno cadw pob darn tir sydd neu a fu'n gae chwarae. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw David yn amlygu'r cydbwysedd priodol rhwng yr angen i greu cyflogaeth a'r angen i gadw cae chwarae yn yr ardal hon.

**Alun Pugh:** Rhodri, a fydddech yn derbyn ei bod yn eithaf anodd cael swydd ym Mae Colwyn? Bu Alun Cairns a Rod Richards yn aflwyddiannus mewn cyfweiliadau am swydd yno'n ddiweddar. Pa gyngor a roddech i uwchgaptlen byddin o Sais wedi ymddeol sydd yn chwilio am swydd ym Mae Colwyn? A ddylai gael map neu a ddylai gael gwarchodwr newydd?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae llawer yn bwriadu cael swydd ym Mae Colwyn ond ni fu pawb mor ffodus ag Alun Pugh wrth gael un. Beth bynnag a allai ddigwydd o ran cynrychiolaeth y Blaid Geidwadol yn yr ardal honno, pwysaf ar y Blaid Geidwadol i ystyried cyfleoedd gwaith 100 o bobl a allai gael swydd mewn canolfan alwadau yn ogystal â'u hawydd eu hunain i geisio cael pennawd yn y papur wythnosol.

**Rod Richards:** What advice would the First Secretary give to those who have been parachuted into jobs, as Alun Pugh was in Colwyn Bay, and the former First Secretary who was parachuted into a job where he did not last very long?

**The First Secretary:** Alun Michael was parachuted out of Colwyn Bay when he went to university many years ago, so I am not sure whether that is relevant. Rod is an ex-commando and may have done a lot more parachute jumping than I ever envisage doing.

Colwyn Bay is sometimes considered a retirement community. It may have many elderly people and great attractions for the retired, but there are also many young and middle-aged people of working age there who want jobs.

I cannot comment on the individual issue of the land adjoining Eirias Park. I will not get involved in that. It is a matter for the WDA and the local council. If the transaction is lawful, I shall not interfere. The area's population cannot be regarded as being entirely made up of pensioners who are not interested in work. People are, of course, interested in work and we must ensure that there is a range of sites available that will attract either call centres or some other form of employment.

**Rod Richards:** Pa gyngor a roddai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd i'r rhai a barasiwtiwyd i swyddi, fel y gwnaethpwyd ag Alun Pugh ym Mae Colwyn, a'r cyn-Brif Ysgrifennydd a barasiwtiwyd i swydd lle na pharhaodd yn hir iawn?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Parasiwtiwyd Alun Michael o Fae Colwyn pan aeth i brifysgol flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, felly nid wyf yn sicr a yw hynny'n berthnasol. Mae Rod yn gyn-gomando ac mae'n bosibl ei fod wedi gwneud llawer mwy o barasiwtio nag y disgwyliaf fi ei wneud byth.

Ystyrir Bae Colwyn weithiau'n gymuned ymddeol. Efallai fod llawer o bobl oedranus yno ac atyniadau mawr i rai wedi ymddeol, ond mae llawer o bobl ifanc a chanol oed yno mewn oedran gwaith sydd am gael swyddi.

Ni allaf wneud sylw ar y mater unigol o'r tir ger Parc Eirias. Nid wyf am ymhel â hynny. Mae'n fater i'r WDA a'r cyngor lleol. Os yw'r pryniant yn gyfreithlon, ni fyddaf yn ymyrryd. Ni ellir ystyried poblogaeth yr ardal yn un sydd ond yn cynnwys pensïynwyr nad ydynt yn ymddiddori mewn gwaith. Wrth gwrs, mae pobl yn ymddiddori mewn gwaith a rhaid inni sicrhau bod amrediad o safleoedd ar gael a fydd yn denu naill ai ganolfannau galwadau neu ryw fath arall o gyflogaeth.

### **Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol yn Nwyrain De Cymru Social Inclusion in South Wales East**

**Q3 William Graham:** How does the First Secretary aim to promote social inclusion in South Wales East? (OAQ3895)

**The First Secretary:** I partially repeat my answer to question 1 in relation to the People in Communities programme, which I mentioned in the context of Colwyn Bay. There are, however, three communities in south-east Wales that are listed among the eight communities in the People in Communities programme. Rhymney in Caerphilly County Borough Council—not Rumney in Cardiff—the Duffryn estate in Newport County Borough Council and the Gurnos and Galon Uchaf estates in the

**C3 William Graham:** Sut y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn bwriadu hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn Nwyrain De Cymru? (OAQ3895)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ailadroddaf yn rhannol fy ateb i gwestiwn 1 mewn perthynas â'r rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau, y cyfeiriais ati yng nghyd-destun Bae Colwyn. Fodd bynnag, mae tair cymuned yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru a restrir ymysg yr wyth gymuned yn y rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau. Mae Rhymni yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili—nid Tredelech yng Nghaerdydd—stad Duffryn yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd a stadau Gurnos a Galon Uchaf yng Nghyngor

County Borough Council of Merthyr Tydfil, have all been included in the People in Communities programme. That will enable residents to identify changes to improve the quality of life in their communities.

**William Graham:** Would you not also agree that social inclusion can be promoted by increased economic activity? What are your views on the M4 relief road and the news today of the promoted international airport on the Gwent levels?

**The First Secretary:** The M4 relief road is a matter that is being dealt with by Sue Essex as the Secretary for Transport, Planning and the Environment. It was previously dealt with by the Environment and Local Government Committee, which she previously chaired with distinction. That is still pending the outcome of further studies. It is a matter that goes back some years. We all know about the problems of the Brynglas tunnels, which go back to the 1960s. It is not for me to address in detail the issue of whether there are alternatives involving greater use of traffic management and of public transport to cover the east-west corridor where it hits the pinchpoint of Newport and the Brynglas tunnels. Studies have been undertaken of what is the right solution to a long-standing problem. It not only affects Newport, but the whole of the south Wales economy, because Newport is to some extent the gateway to the rest of south Wales. I will not comment or take sides on an issue which is still a long way from a decision.

I briefly saw a press report about the airport. This has also gone on for a long time. Whether we should eventually close down Bristol International Airport at Lulsgate and Cardiff International Airport at Rhoose and concentrate on having one airport on the banks of the Severn estuary on the Welsh side, has been a long running saga. It has never got anywhere nearer than lines on maps and occasional articles in *The South Wales Argus* and *The Western Mail*. Beyond that, I do not know if the project has any real life in it. However, it becomes a runner if someone has a few billion pounds and wants to build a new airport: they can buy Cardiff International Airport and Bristol International

Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful oll wedi eu cynnwys yn y rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau. Bydd hynny'n galluogi'r trigolion i ddynodi newidiadau i wella ansawdd bywyd yn eu cymunedau.

**William Graham:** Oni chytunech hefyd y gellir hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol drwy weithgaredd economaidd cynyddol? Beth yw'ch barn am ffordd liniaru'r M4 a'r newyddion heddiw am y maes awyr rhyngwladol a hybir ar wastatir Gwent?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae ffordd liniaru'r M4 yn fater yr ymdrinnir ag ef gan Sue Essex fel yr Ysgrifennydd Trafnidiaeth, Cynllunio a'r Amgylchedd. Ymdriniwyd ag ef cyn hynny gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol, yr oedd gynt yn gadeirydd nodedig iddo. Disgwylir canlyniad astudiaethau pellach ar hynny o hyd. Mae'n fater sydd yn mynd yn ôl rai blynyddoedd. Gwyddom oll am broblemau twneli Brynglas, sydd yn bod ers y 1960au. Nid mater i mi yw trafod yn fanwl a oes dewisiadau eraill sydd yn golygu mwy o ddefnydd o reoli traffig a chludiant cyhoeddus i ymdrin â'r coridor rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin lle y mae'n taro'r pwynt gwasgu yng Nghasnewydd a thwneli Bryn-glas. Ymglymerwyd ag astudiaethau ynghylch beth yw'r ateb iawn i broblem sydd yn bod ers talwm. Nid ar Gasnewydd yn unig y mae'n effeithio, ond ar y cyfan o economi de Cymru, oherwydd Casnewydd, i ryw raddau, yw'r fynedfa i weddill de Cymru. Ni wnafl sylw na chymryd ochr ar fater sydd yn dal ymhell o gael ei benderfynu.

Cefais gipolwg ar adroddiad yn y wasg am y maes awyr. Mae hyn hefyd yn mynd ymlaen ers talwm. Mae'r cwestiwn a ddylid cau Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Bryste yn Lulsgate a Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn y Rhws yn y pen draw a chanolbwytio ar gael un maes awyr ar lannau aber Hafren ar ochr Cymru, yn stori hir. Ni ddaeth erioed yn agosach na llinellau ar fapiau ac erthyglau o bryd i'w gilydd yn *The South Wales Argus* a *The Western Mail*. Ymhellach na hynny, ni wn a oes unrhyw fywyd gwirioneddol yn y prosiect. Fodd bynnag, daw'n gredadwy os oes gan rywun ychydig biliynau o bunnoedd ac am wneud maes awyr newydd: gallant brynu Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd a



Airport and close both of those down. However, William and I will be retired from politics a long time before that happens.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Job losses in the south-east will increase poverty. In light of the fact that union leaders at Llanwern steelworks have been told that the plant is under threat of closure due to the high level of the pound, will you argue our case with the UK Government that the real cost of the high pound is too high a price for the Welsh workforce?

**The First Secretary:** You would not expect me to dissent from that proposition, particularly now that Eddie George, Governor of the Bank of England, has admitted that the pound is too high. There is no question that it is damaging to manufacturing industries. Wales tends to have a higher proportion of manufacturing industries and less of a proportion in the service industries than other parts of the United Kingdom. The specific impact on the steel industry is even worse because of the recent merger between Koninklijke Hoogovens and British Steel to form a new company, Corus, which has similar facilities to Llanwern and Port Talbot on its site in Ijmuiden just outside Rotterdam. I hope to meet the chief executive of British Steel before the end of this month and no doubt the future of Llanwern will be discussed. The only solution is probably a closer alignment between the pound and the euro somewhere back to where it was in 1997 or thereabouts. The issue of whether we should go into the euro will then be debated. However, more important is at what rate would we go into the euro. If we went into the euro at the present rate it would be an absolute killer. However, if we went in at the 1993 rate, after we fell out of the exchange rate mechanism, it would probably be wonderful for manufacturing industries but something in-between might even satisfy Alun Cairns.

**Michael German:** One of the ways in which people can be socially included is to make sure that they have good local services. Would you agree that the closure of rural and urban post offices throughout south-east Wales, including the Penygarn post office in

Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Bryste a chau'r ddau. Fodd bynnag, bydd William a minnau wedi ymddeol o wleidyddiaeth ymhell cyn i hynny ddigwydd.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Bydd colledion swyddi yn y de-ddwyrain yn cynyddu tlodi. Yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fod arweinwyr yr undebau yng ngwaith dur Llanwern wedi cael eu hysbysu bod bygythiad i gau'r gwaith oherwydd lefel uchel y bunt, a dydych yn barod i ddadlau drosom gyda Llywodraeth y DU bod gwir gost y bunt uchel yn bris rhy uchel i weithlu Cymru?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni fydddech yn disgwyl imi anghydweld â'r gosodiad hwnnw, yn enwedig ar ôl i Eddie George, Llywodraethwr Banc Lloegr, gyfaddef bod y bunt yn rhy uchel. Nid oes dwywaith ei bod yn niweidio diwydiannau cynhyrchu. Mae Cymru'n dueddol o fod â chyfran uwch o ddiwydiannau cynhyrchu a chyfran is o'r diwydiannau gwasanaethu na rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r effaith benodol ar y diwydiant dur yn waeth byth oherwydd y cyfuniad diweddar rhwng Koninklijke Hoogovens a British Steel i ffurfio cwmni newydd, Corus, sydd â chyfleusterau tebyg i Lanwern a Port Talbot ar ei safle yn Ijmuiden ar gyrion Rotterdam. Gobeithiaf gyfarfod â phrif weithredwr British Steel cyn diwedd y mis hwn ac nid oes dwywaith y trafodir dyfodol Llanwern. Yr unig ateb, yn ôl pob tebyg, yw cyfliniad agosach rhwng y bunt a'r ewro, yn ôl i'r lle'r oedd tua 1997. Bydd trafod wedyn ynghylch a ddylem ymuno â'r ewro. Fodd bynnag, pwysicach yw ar ba gyfradd y byddem yn ymuno â'r ewro. Pe baem yn ymuno â'r ewro ar y gyfradd bresennol byddai'n gwbl drychinebus. Fodd bynnag, pe baem yn ymuno ar gyfradd 1993, ar ôl inni ddisgyn o fecanwaith y gyfradd gyfnewid, byddai'n ardderchog, yn fwy na thebyg, i ddiwydiannau cynhyrchu ond efallai y byddai rhywbeth rhwng y ddau yn bodloni Alun Cairns hyd yn oed.

**Michael German:** Un o'r dulliau i gynnwys pobl yn gymdeithasol yw sicrhau bod ganddynt wasanaethau lleol da. A gytunech fod cau swyddfeydd post gwledig a threfol ledled de-ddwyrain Cymru, gan gynnwys swyddfa bost Pen-y-garn ym Mhont-y-pŵl,

Pontypool, is a matter of regret? Given the views of the Assembly that we were seeking to change the Government's mind on the way it was treating local post offices, can you tell us what actions you have taken to ensure that the policy of the Assembly is well communicated to the Cabinet, and perhaps with your persuasive tongue, ensure that they take it up?

**The First Secretary:** This is one of those difficult areas which is not devolved. The provision of post offices is a matter—if it is a matter for Government at all—for the Department of Trade and Industry, which oversees the Post Office. The Assembly made its feelings known during the debate on 1 March. Other debates of that kind are communicated automatically through to the Government. When I talk to Stephen Byers, the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, I will make him aware—if he is not already aware—of the strength of feeling on the closure of rural post offices, which may be our marginal businesses, and urban ones, such as the one in Penygarn near Pontypool, even though it is a non-devolved issue. If something can be done that does not undermine the viability of marginal post offices in rural and urban areas, while gaining the advantages of automatic credit transfer in terms of social security payments, it will be considered.

2:20 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** As this question has been asked by a Conservative Member and it involves social exclusion, and Llanwern has been mentioned, I cannot allow the opportunity to pass without referring to the Tory legacy in Newport East, which is keenly felt. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'What is the question?']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not need any help from the Conservatives today.

**John Griffiths:** The Tory legacy is keenly felt by the people of Newport East, not least with regard to the damage that the Conservative Government caused for many years by job losses in the steel industry. Do you agree with me, Rhodri, that the

yn destun gofid? Yng ngoleuni barn y Cynulliad ein bod yn ceisio newid meddwl y Llywodraeth ynghylch y modd y mae'n trin swyddfeydd post lleol, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa gamau a gymerasoch i sicrhau y cyfleir polisi'r Cynulliad yn effeithiol i'r Cabinet, ac efallai â'ch tafod perswadiol, sicrhau eu bod yn ei dderbyn?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae hyn yn un o'r meysydd anodd hynny na ddatganolwyd. Mae darparu swyddfeydd post yn fater—os yw'n fater i Lywodraeth o gwbl—i'r Adran Fasnach a Diwydiant, sydd yn goruchwyllo Swyddfa'r Post. Datganodd y Cynulliad ei deimladau yn ystod y ddadl ar 1 Mawrth. Rhoddir gwybod am ddadleuon eraill o'r math hwnnw yn awtomatig i'r Llywodraeth. Pan siaradaf â Stephen Byers, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant, rhoddaf wybod iddo—os nad yw'n ymwybodol eisoes—o gryfder y teimlad ynghylch cau swyddfeydd post gwledig, a allai fod yn fusnesau ymylol, a'r rhai trefol, fel yr un ym Mhen-y-garn ger Pont-y-pŵl, er bod hyn yn fater na ddatganolwyd. Os gellir gwneud rhywbeth nad yw'n tanseilio hyfywedd swyddfeydd post ymylol mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol, a sicrhau manteision trosglwyddo credyd awtomatig o ran taliadau nawdd cymdeithasol yr un pryd, fe'i hystyrir.

**John Griffiths:** Gan mai Aelod Ceidwadol a ofynnodd y cwestiwn hwn a chan ei fod yn ymwneud ag allgáu cymdeithasol, ac y cyfeiriwyd at Llanwern, ni allaf adael i'r cyfle fynd heibio heb gyfeirio at yr etifeddiaeth Doriaidd yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, a deimlir yn ddwfn. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Beth yw'r cwestiwn?']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes arnaf angen cymorth gan y Ceidwadwyr heddiw.

**John Griffiths:** Teimlir yr etifeddiaeth Doriaidd yn ddwfn gan bobl Dwyrain Casnewydd, nid lleiaf mewn perthynas â'r niwed a achosodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol am flynyddoedd lawer drwy golledion swyddi yn y diwydiant dur. A gytunwch â

importance of Llanwern steelworks to the local economy in Newport East and its surrounding area is crucial and is something of which the Assembly is conscious and will do all that it can to protect?

**The First Secretary:** That was a good preamble and a good question. The issue of the dependence of the community, particularly Newport East and the area further along towards the Severn bridge, on Llanwern steelworks is huge. It used to employ 8,000 or 9,000 people, I think it now employs about 3,000 people. It is an efficient works. It does not have its own deep water harbour, but it shares the costs of the deep water harbour at Port Talbot, which helps to make Port Talbot more viable. However, there is currently no doubt, from the noises emerging from Corus—the new company formed by merging Koninklijke Hoogovens with British Steel—that it is not looking with a positive eye on its British operations, because of the amount of red ink and the amount of black ink involved in its Dutch operations. It is not known how long it will be willing to do that if the currency fails to come back to what everybody, including Eddie George, would regard as a more sustainable, normal rate.

mi, Rhodri, fod pwysigrwydd gwaith dur Llanwern i'r economi lleol yn Nwyrain Casnewydd a'r cyffiniau yn hanfodol ac yn rhywbeth y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol ohono ac y gwna bopeth yn ei allu i'w amddiffyn?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n rhagarweiniad da ac yn gwestiwn da. Mae mater dibyniaeth y gymuned, yn enwedig Dwyrain Casnewydd a'r ardal ymhellach draw am bont Hafren, ar waith dur Llanwern yn aruthrol. Arferai gyflogi 8,000 neu 9,000 o bobl, a chredaf ei fod bellach yn cyflogi tua 3,000 o bobl. Mae'n waith effeithlon. Nid oes ganddo ei borthladd dwfn ei hun, ond mae'n rhannu costau'r porthladd dwfn ym Mhort Talbot, sydd yn gymorth i wneud Port Talbot yn fwy hyfyw. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dwywaith ar hyn o bryd, yn ôl y synau sydd yn dod o Corus—y cwmni newydd a ffurfiwyd drwy gyfuno Koninklijke Hoogovens â British Steel—nad yw'n edrych yn gadarnhaol ar ei weithrediadau ym Mhrydain, oherwydd swm yr inc coch a swm yr inc du sydd yn gysylltiedig â'i weithrediadau yn yr Iseldiroedd. Ni wyddys pa mor hir y bydd yn fodlon gwneud hynny os metha'r arian â dod yn ôl at yr hyn a ystyriai pawb, gan gynnwys Eddie George, yn gyfradd normal, fwy cynaliadwy.

#### **Cysylltiad â Busnes (Pobl Ifanc)** **Contact with Business (Young People)**

**Q4 Janet Ryder:** How will the First Secretary encourage young people to gain greater contact with businesses in Wales? (OAQ3893)

**The First Secretary:** This is an important issue. We help young people as they emerge from the education system in Wales to consider business as a career, with parity of esteem towards business careers and the older professions and the academic world. Traditionally, Wales has been a long way behind in this respect. As a new body, the Assembly can try to establish a new way of looking at education and the business world to provide that parity of esteem. I would think that the new Council for Education and Training in Wales would help to produce parity of esteem in education and training. It will be looking at sixth forms, further

**C4 Janet Ryder:** Ym mha fodd y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn annog pobl ifanc i gael mwy o gysylltiad â busnesau yng Nghymru? (OAQ3893)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Cynorthwywn bobl ifanc wrth iddynt ddod o'r system addysg yng Nghymru i ystyried busnes yn yrfa, gan roi parch cydradd i yrfaedd busnes a'r proffesiynau hyn a'r byd academiaidd. Yn draddodiadol, bu Cymru ymhell ar ei hôl yn hyn o beth. Fel corff newydd, gall y Cynulliad geisio sefydlu dull newydd o edrych ar addysg a byd busnes er mwyn rhoi'r parch cydradd hwnnw. Tybiwn y bydd y Cyngor Cenedlaethol newydd dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru yn helpu i greu parch cydradd mewn addysg a hyfforddiant. Bydd yn edrych ar ddosbarthiadau chwech, colegau addysg

education colleges and workplace training for young people on the same basis, rather than on the basis of failing at academic level meaning that students can go on to further education and failing that, workplace training can be arranged for them. It will not be like that under CETW. There will be complete parity of esteem between the three—currently separate—streams. I hope that there will then be parity of esteem in society.

I do not often commend *The Western Mail*. Usually, when you see photographs of 16 and 17-year-olds, or a bit older, in school, it is because they have obtained passes to Oxford and Cambridge Universities from the local comprehensive. However, *The Western Mail* has recently started a feature called 'Skills Watch', which gives equal attention to people who have obtained apprenticeships in a local firm. I want to see more of that—parity of esteem in society as well as in the world of education, training and the workplace.

**Janet Ryder:** I agree with almost everything that you said, but would you also agree that, while schools have formal schemes to ensure that children gain work experience, there are problems with it? This year, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales advised that work-related education should not become a statutory element of the curriculum, because businesses often do not provide sufficient experience for children. Many students end up carrying out such duties as tea making and photocopying. That is a serious problem. They are not gaining proper business experience. What will you do to encourage businesses in Wales to take work experience seriously and to demonstrate the value it can have for businesses and education?

**The First Secretary:** I agree with Janet. Not all experiences of the business world are wonderful or enriching for pupils in their final years of school who go on work experience. This is true whether they are bright, of average ability or below average ability. Some firms do not know how to handle work experience, so we must help them.

bellach a hyfforddiant yn y gweithle i bobl ifanc ar yr un sail, yn hytrach nag ar y sail bod methu ar lefel academiaidd yn golygu y gall myfyrwyr fynd ymlaen i addysg bellach ac y gellir, yn niffyg hynny, trefnu hyfforddiant yn y gweithle ar eu cyfer. Nid felly y bydd o dan y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru. Bydd parch cwbl gydradd rhwng y tair ffrwd—sydd ar wahân ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithiaf y bydd parch cydradd yn y gymdeithas wedi hynny.

Nid yn aml yr wyf yn canmol *The Western Mail*. Fel arfer, pan welwch luniau o rai 16 a 17 mlwydd oed, neu rai ychydig hŷn, mae am eu bod wedi eu derbyn i Brifysgolion Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt o'r ysgol uwchradd leol. Fodd bynnag, mae *The Western Mail* wedi dechrau ysgrif nodwedd yn ddiweddar o'r enw 'Skills Watch', sydd yn rhoi sylw cyfartal i rai a gafodd brentisiaethau mewn cwmni lleol. Yr wyf am weld mwy o hynny—parch cydradd yn y gymdeithas yn ogystal ag ym myd addysg, hyfforddiant a'r gweithle.

**Janet Ryder:** Cytunaf â bron bopeth a ddywedaso, ond a gytunech hefyd, er bod gan ysgolion gynlluniau ffurfiol i sicrhau bod plant yn cael profiad gwaith, fod problemau ynghylch hynny? Eleni, cafwyd cyngor gan y Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru na ddylai addysg sydd yn gysylltiedig â gwaith fod yn elfen statudol yn y cwricwlwm, am nad yw busnesau mewn llawer achos yn darparu digon o brofiad i blant. Hanes llawer o fyfyrwyr yn y diwedd yw cyflawni dyletswyddau fel gwneud te a llungopïo. Mae hynny'n broblem ddifrifol. Nid ydynt yn ennill profiad busnes iawn. Beth yr ydych yn fodlon ei wneud i annog busnesau yng Nghymru i fod o ddifrif ynghylch profiad gwaith a dangos ei werth posibl i fusnesau ac addysg?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Cytunaf â Janet. Nid yw'r holl brofiadau o fyd busnes yn rhyfeddol neu'n ddyrchafol i'r disgyblion yn eu blynyddoedd olaf yn yr ysgol sydd yn cael profiad gwaith. Mae hynny'n wir pa un a ydynt yn ddisglair, o allu cyfartalog neu â gallu is na'r cyfartaledd. Mae rhai busnesau na wyddant sut i drafod profiad gwaith, felly rhaid i ni eu helpu.

The Engineering in Schools exhibition demonstrated the quality of project work. I saw the prize-winners in the Cardiff International Arena recently and the quality of the project work that had been done by schools and further education colleges in conjunction with local firms was out of this world. It made one hope that many of them would still be doing engineering and creative project and team work in five years' time. If we can ensure that young people who enter the world of work on a placement or after leaving school have positive experiences in the early years, they will have more satisfying careers in industry or business.

**Jonathan Morgan:** How will the abolition of training and enterprise councils affect the valuable work of education business partnerships?

**The First Secretary:** Education business partnerships are part of the range of opportunities that will be available. Christine Chapman worked in this area before entering the Assembly, so she can explain this to me in more detail later today. The matter of ensuring that there are strong partnerships to bridge what is traditionally regarded as the isolated world of academic education and what happens to you afterwards—how you get slotted into the world of work—is not always done with a view to your individual potential. All sorts of areas are having a better link-up. The abolition of the TECs will not lead to the education business partnership being attenuated.

Yr oedd yr arddangosfa Peirianeg mewn Ysgolion yn dangos ansawdd cyweithiau. Gwelais enillwyr y gwobrau yn Arena Ryngwladol Caerdydd yn ddiweddar ac yr oedd ansawdd y cyweithiau a gyflawnwyd gan ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach ar y cyd â chwmnïau lleol yn anhygoel. Parai i rywun obeithio y byddai llawer ohonynt yn parhau i wneud gwaith ar gyweithiau peirianegol a chreadigol a gwaith tîm ymhen pum mlynedd. Os gallwn sicrhau bod pobl ifanc sydd yn mynd i fyd gwaith ar leoliad neu ar ôl gadael yr ysgol yn cael profiadau cadarnhaol yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, byddant yn cael gyrfaedd mwy boddhaol mewn diwydiant neu fusnes.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Sut y bydd diddymu cynghorau hyfforddi a menter yn effeithio ar waith gwerthfawr y partneriaethau addysg busnes?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae partneriaethau addysg busnes yn rhan o'r amrediad o gyfleoedd a fydd ar gael. Yr oedd Christine Chapman yn gweithio yn y maes hwn cyn dod i'r Cynulliad, felly gall egluro hyn imi'n fanylach yn ddiweddarach heddiw. Mae'r mater o sicrhau bod partneriaethau cryf i bontio rhwng yr hyn a ystyrir yn draddodiadol yn arwahanrwydd addysg academiaidd a'r hyn sydd yn digwydd ichi wedyn—sut y cewch eich gosod yn eich lle ym myd gwaith—yn rhywbeth na wneir bob amser gyda golwg ar eich potensial unigol. Mae pob math o feysydd yn cael eu cysylltu'n well. Ni fydd diddymu cynghorau hyfforddi a menter yn arwain at wanhau'r partneriaethau addysg busnes.

### Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol yn Ardaloedd Gwledig Cymru Social Inclusion in Rural Areas of Wales

**C5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Sut y mae'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn bwriadu hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru? (OAQ3893)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Y peth pwysig yw targedu cymhorthdal at yr ardaloedd tlotaf yn ein pentrefi a'n hardaloedd gwledig. Gofynnodd Richard Edwards yr un cwestiwn i Alun Michael ar 8 Chwefror. Mae'r ateb yr un peth: rhaid ichi dargedu. Gwyddom fod

**Q5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** How is the First Secretary planning to promote social inclusion in rural areas of Wales? (OAQ3893)

**The First Secretary:** The important thing is to target subsidy grants towards the poorest areas in our villages and rural areas. Richard Edwards asked the same question of Alun Michael on 8 February. The answer is the same: you must target. We know that there

agweddau arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, sef y ffaith eich bod ar eich pen eich hunan ac allan yn y wlad. Nid yw pobl o hyd yn sylweddoli'r tlodi a'r amddifadiad sydd wedi digwydd yn eu hardal. Gobeithiaf y bydd y grantiau a gyhoeddodd Sue Essex yr wythnos diwethaf o £5 miliwn i'r cwmnïau bws yn llwyddo i wella gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Ceir llawer o bwyslais ar wynebu'r broblem fod pobl mewn cymunedau gwledig lle nad oes llawer o boblogaeth yn methu â chyrraedd lleoedd lle mae gwaith ar gael. Felly, nid ydynt yn medru codi eu safon byw drwy ennill gwell cyflog neu gyflog o gwbl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A yw Rhodri yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu yn ein hardaloedd gwledig a bod y bunt gref unwaith eto yn creu argyfwng gwirioneddol, hyd yn oed mewn meysydd sydd yn gymharol ffyniannus yn draddodiadol, yn enwedig y sector llaeth ar hyn o bryd? Mae'r sefyllfa yr un peth yn y diwydiant dur. A yw'n cytuno bod yr uniad diweddar rhwng Dairy Crest ac Unigate yn cynrychioli perygl ychwanegol i'r sector llaeth ac y gallai hufenfeydd fod dan fygythiad o ganlyniad? Beth y mae ef a'i weinyddiaeth yn bwriadu ei wneud i ateb problem ffermwyr sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn mewn busnes am 20 mlynedd sydd yn dweud nad ydynt yn medru parhau yn y sector pwysig hwn o amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr ydym i gyd wedi sylwi bod y swm y mae ffermwyr yn ei dderbyn am alwyn o laeth wedi gostwng llawer. Mae wedi gostwng i dua chwarter ei werth ryw saith neu wyth mlynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny'n siŵr o effeithio ar safon byw pobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Os nad ydych yn byw ar fferm, efallai eich bod yn gweithio ar fferm neu'n gwerthu tractorau neu'n trwsio peiriannau fferm. Os nad oes arian gan y ffermwyr, nid ydynt yn prynu cymaint mewn siopau lleol nac mewn lleoedd sydd yn gwasanaethu'r gymuned amaethyddol. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod Cymru wledig mewn rhyw fath o argyfwng, yn dibynnu a ydych yn y sector llaeth neu'r sector da byw. Sut y mae modd targedu'r help yr hoffech ei roi? Yn gynt, soniwyd am y rhaglen Pobl mewn Cymunedau. Mae tair o'r wyth ardal a dargedwyd o dan y rhaglen newydd a chreadigol hon yn wledig. Felly, nid ydym yn

are particular aspects in rural areas, namely the fact that you are on your own and out in the country. People do not always realise the poverty and deprivation that has occurred in their area. I hope that the grants announced by Sue Essex last week of £5 million to bus companies will succeed in improving services throughout Wales. There is much emphasis placed on addressing the problem that people in sparsely populated rural areas cannot access places where work is available. Therefore, they cannot raise their standard of living through earning better wages or any wages at all.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Does Rhodri agree that the situation has deteriorated in our rural areas and that the strong pound is again creating a real crisis, even in areas that are traditionally quite prosperous, especially the dairy sector at present? The situation is the same in the steel industry. Does he agree that the recent merger between Dairy Crest and Unigate represents a further danger to the dairy sector and that creameries could be under threat as a result? What does he and his administration intend to do to solve the problem of farmers who have been very successful in business for 20 years who say that they cannot continue in this important sector of agriculture in Wales?

**The First Secretary:** We have all noticed that the sum that farmers receive for a gallon of milk has decreased greatly. It has fallen to almost a quarter of its value seven or eight years ago. That is bound to affect the standard of living of people in rural areas. If you do not live on a farm, you may work on a farm or sell tractors or repair farm machinery. If farmers do not have money, they do not buy as much in local shops or in places that serve the agricultural community. Everyone accepts that rural Wales is in some kind of a crisis, depending on whether you are in the dairy or livestock sector. How can you target the help that you want to give? Earlier, the People in Communities programme was mentioned. Three of the eight targeted areas under that new and creative programme are rural. Therefore, we are not ignoring the problems in the agricultural sector and the fact that the income has reduced drastically in

anwybyddu problemau'r sector amaethyddol a'r ffaith fod incwm wedi disgyn yn sylweddol yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae hyn, fel y dywedodd Rhodri, yn creu tlodi mewn ardaloedd nad oeddem yn eu hystyried yn ardaloedd â phroblemau.

2:30 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Mention was made of the dairy sector, which is in dire trouble, but that is true of the whole farming industry. It is on its knees and things are getting worse. It has worsened under this Government in Westminster and in Cardiff. The First Secretary mentioned the minimum wage earlier—most farmers work for far less than the minimum wage level. He also indicated his desire for the provision of agri-monetary compensation, as did the Secretary for Agriculture and Rural Development. How are you pursuing that point at Westminster, so that we can help our hard-pressed farmers in Wales?

**The First Secretary:** I am sure that the Assembly agrees that there is a massive market failure in the entire agricultural sector. There are minor exceptions, and one occasionally hears good news, but there is a massive market failure exacerbated by surplus production, the level of the pound and the absence of agri-monetary compensation to cope with the fact that people cannot export their produce. These problems are related to the knock-on effect of BSE even 10 years later. It still has a knock-on effect on exports and, in an export-dependent industry, like the Welsh livestock industry, it is bound to have repercussions. Higher levels of regulation and charges have had to be introduced to cope with the loss of consumer confidence, especially abroad. Although beef sales are normal again in this country, they are not at their previous level in the export sector, which comprised 30 per cent of our lamb and beef production. Short-term solutions, such as agri-monetary compensation could be used to cope with this market failure today. However, we must consider ways of reforming the agricultural sector by using modulation as well as other methods to try to see how diversification could assist the farming industry to fare

those areas. This, as Rhodri said, creates poverty in areas that we did not consider to be problem areas.

**Nick Bourne:** Soniwyd am y sector llaeth, sydd mewn trafferth enbyd, ond mae hynny'n wir am y cwbl o'r diwydiant ffermio. Mae ar ei liniau ac mae pethau'n gwaethygu. Gwaethygodd o dan y Llywodraeth hon yn San Steffan ac yng Nghaerdydd. Soniodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd am yr isafswm cyflog yn gynharach—mae'r rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yn gweithio am lai o lawer na lefel yr isafswm cyflog. Nododd ei awydd hefyd i weld darparu iawndal amaeth-arianyddol, fel y gwnaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Sut yr ydych yn dilyn y pwynt hwnnw yn San Steffan, fel y gallwn helpu ein ffermwyr sydd dan bwysau yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn sicr bod y Cynulliad yn cytuno bod methiant anferth ym marchnad y cwbl o'r sector amaethyddol. Mae mân eithriadau, ac mae rhywun yn clywed newyddion da weithiau, ond mae methiant anferth yn y farchnad a waethygir drwy orgynhyrchu, lefel y bunt a diffyg iawndal amaeth-arianyddol i ddygymod â'r ffaith na all pobl allforio eu cynnyrch. Mae'r problemau hyn yn gysylltiedig ag effaith gynyddol BSE hyd yn oed 10 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach. Mae'n dal i gael effaith ganlyniadol ar allforion ac, mewn diwydiant sydd yn dibynnu ar allforio, fel diwydiant da byw Cymru, mae'n sicr o gael sgil-ffeithiau. Bu'n rhaid cyflwyno lefelau uwch o reoleiddio a thaliadau er mwyn dygymod â cholli hyder y defnyddwyr, yn enwedig dramor. Er bod gwerthiant cig eidion yn ôl i'r arfer yn y wlad hon, nid yw ar ei lefel flaenorol yn y sector allforio, a oedd yn cynnwys 30 y cant o'n cynnyrch cig oen ac eidion. Gellid defnyddio atebion tymor byr, fel iawndal amaeth-arianyddol, i ddygymod â'r methiant hwn yn y farchnad heddiw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ystyried dulliau o ddiwygio'r sector amaethyddol drwy ddefnyddio modwleiddio yn ogystal â dulliau eraill i geisio canfod sut y gallai amrywiaethu

better in the next 10 years than it has in the past 10 years.

**Mick Bates:** I am sure that the First Secretary would agree that reducing unemployment is one of the best ways to promote inclusivity. There was once an organisation in rural areas that was dedicated to creating jobs and reducing unemployment. What positive examples does the First Secretary have to demonstrate to the people of rural Wales that the Welsh Development Agency has a strong rural focus in creating jobs thereby reducing social exclusion?

**The First Secretary:** I was recently in Montgomeryshire at Mick's kind invitation and I visited the WDA's mid-Wales office. The dedication of its staff to the cause of creating jobs was evident and was no less than that of its predecessor body—the Development Board for Rural Wales. I will have to list in writing the positive examples for which Mick asks, but the staff of the mid-Wales area are determined to ensure that they will continue to build on the DBRW's good work, which was outstanding on two counts: its social and economic remits, which were unique to it. The social remit has now been terminated; the economic remit is being spread throughout Wales. On the economic remit, because the DBRW did not deal with inward investment from abroad, it was good at creating businesses locally. From being pushed hard exclusively in mid-Wales, that idea is now being pushed throughout Wales. The DBRW did not have an inward investment function and, because of that, we would all share its mission. How do you create more businesses from within Wales and get them thoroughly grounded in the community in the same way as Control Techniques plc, to take an obvious example from Mick's area.

helpu'r diwydiant ffermio i lwyddo'n well yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf nag y gwnaeth yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunai'r Prif Ysgrifennydd mai lleihau diweithdra yw un o'r dulliau gorau o hybu cynhwysiant. Unwaith, yr oedd corff mewn ardaloedd gwledig a fodolai'n unswydd er mwyn creu swyddi a lleihau diweithdra. Pa enghreifftiau cadarnhaol sydd gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd i brofi i bobl cefn gwlad Cymru fod gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ffocws gwledig cryf wrth greu swyddi gan leihau allgáu cymdeithasol drwy hynny?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr oeddwn yn Sir Drefaldwyn yn ddiweddar ar wahoddiad caredig Mick ac ymwelais â swyddfa canolbarth Cymru yr WDA. Yr oedd ymroddiad ei staff i achos creu swyddi yn amlwg ac nid oedd yn llai nag ydoedd yn ei ragflaenydd—Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig. Bydd yn rhaid imi restru yn ysgrifenedig yr enghreifftiau cadarnhaol y mae Mick yn gofyn amdanynt, ond mae staff ardal canolbarth Cymru'n benderfynol o sicrhau y byddant yn parhau i adeiladu ar waith da Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig, a oedd yn eithriadol ar ddau gyfrif: ei gylchoedd gwaith cymdeithasol ac economaidd a oedd yn unigryw iddo. Mae'r cylch gwaith cymdeithasol wedi ei derfynu bellach; lledaenir y cylch gwaith economaidd ledled Cymru. Ynglŷn â'r cylch gwaith economaidd, am nad oedd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig yn ymdrin â mewnfuddsoddi o dramor, yr oedd yn dda o ran creu busnesau'n lleol. Ar ôl cael ei wthio'n galed yng nghanolbarth Cymru yn unig, mae'r syniad hwnnw bellach yn cael ei wthio ledled Cymru. Nid oedd swyddogaeth mewnfuddsoddi gan Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig ac, oherwydd hynny, byddem oll yn rhannu ei genhadaeth. Sut yr ydych yn creu mwy o fusnesau oddi mewn i Gymru a'u sylfaenu'n gadarn yn y gymuned yn yr un modd â Control Techniques ccc, a chymryd enghraifft amlwg o ardal Mick.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ar Amcan 1 Welsh Affairs Select Committee Report on Objective 1**

**Q6 Peter Black:** What discussions has the First Secretary had with the Secretary of

**C6 Peter Black:** Pa drafod a fu rhwng y Prif Ysgrifennydd ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol



State for Wales concerning the Welsh Affairs Select Committee report on Objective 1, and will he make a statement? (OAQ3875)

**The First Secretary:** I have discussions at least once a week with the Secretary of State for Wales on any issues affecting Wales. This is one of the prime issues and it arises regularly in our meetings. Paul Murphy is fully aware of my views on the contents of the Select Committee's report on European structural funds. I do not dissent from the views expressed in the structural funds body. The only difference between the Secretary of State and myself is that he is bound by Cabinet collective responsibility. There are various things that he cannot say. The good side of that is that he is an excellent lobbyist on the inside of the UK Government in a way that I cannot be. I do not think that he would find much difference between the views expressed by the Welsh Affairs Select Committee and my views. Therefore, we are continuing to push, via Paul Murphy and independently of him, for the Treasury to agree with our case that we cannot manage the match funding and public expenditure cover issue within the traditional calculation of the Barnett formula.

**Peter Black:** What is the date by which the negotiations on the comprehensive spending review are likely to be concluded? At what level are those negotiations going on? Have you invited the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown or the Chief Secretary to the Treasury, Andrew Smith, to the Assembly to discuss these matters?

**The First Secretary:** The end of July is the timing as far as the Treasury is concerned. I have invited Andrew Smith to visit the Assembly.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I welcome Rhodri's positive statement about the report of the Select Committee. The report concluded

'We urge the UK Government to respond swiftly to this Report by making a clear public commitment that it will provide Wales both with public expenditure cover for the anticipated European grants and also with additional funding to meet in full the costs of

Cymru ynghylch adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ar Amcan 1, ac a fydd gystal â gwneud datganiad? (OAQ3875)

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau o leiaf unwaith yr wythnos ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar unrhyw faterion sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru. Hwn yw un o'r prif faterion ac mae'n codi'n rheolaidd yn ein cyfarfodydd. Mae Paul Murphy yn llwyr ymwybodol o'm barn ar gynnwys adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop. Nid wyf yn anghydweld â'r farn a fynegir yn y rhan ar gronfeydd strwythurol. Yr unig wahaniaeth rhwng yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a minnau yw ei fod ef wedi ei rwymo gan gydggyfrifoldeb y Cabinet. Mae amryw o bethau nad yw'n gallu eu dweud. Yr ochr dda i hynny yw ei fod yn lobïwr rhagorol y tu mewn i Lywodraeth y DU mewn modd na allaf fi fod. Ni chredaf y gwelai lawer o wahaniaeth rhwng y farn a fynegwyd gan y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig a'm barn i. Felly, yr ydym yn parhau i bwysu, drwy Paul Murphy ac yn annibynnol arno, i gael y Trysorlys i gytuno â'n hachos na allwn ymdopi â mater y cyllid cyfatebol a maint y gwariant cyhoeddus oddi mewn i'r cyfrifiad traddodiadol o fformwla Barnett.

**Peter Black:** Erbyn pa ddyddiad y mae'r negodiadau ar yr arolwg cynhwysfawr o wariant yn debygol o gael eu cwblhau? Ar ba lefel y mae'r negodiadau hynny'n digwydd? A ydych wedi gwahodd Canghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown neu Brif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys, Andrew Smith, i'r Cynulliad i drafod y materion hyn?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Diwedd Gorffennaf yw'r amseriad o ran y Trysorlys. Gwahoddais Andrew Smith i ymweld â'r Cynulliad.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Croesawaf ddatganiad cadarnhaol Rhodri am adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol. Terfyna'r adroddiad drwy ddweud

'Pwyswn ar Lywodraeth y DU i ymateb yn gyflym i'r Adroddiad hwn drwy wneud ymrwymiad cyhoeddus clir y bydd yn rhoi i Gymru'r swm o wariant cyhoeddus ar gyfer y grantiau Ewropeaidd a ddisgwyllir a hefyd arian ychwanegol i dalu'n llawn gostau'r

the public sector match funding requirement.’

gofyniad am gyllid cyfatebol gan y sector cyhoeddus.’

Does the First Secretary share with me a little surprise at the Secretary of State for Wales’s response? He commented that, in his view, the report was incorrect in its conclusion. Given that that conclusion is vitally important to us, can you take this issue up again with Paul Murphy to ensure that he is arguing within the Cabinet in line with the Select Committee’s conclusion?

A yw’r Prif Ysgrifennydd, fel minnau, yn synnu braidd at ymateb Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru? Dywedodd fod yr adroddiad, yn ei farn ef, yn dod i gasgliad anghywir. O dderbyn bod y casgliad hwnnw’n hanfodol bwysig i ni, a allwch godi’r mater hwn eto gyda Paul Murphy er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn dadlau oddi mewn i’r Cabinet yn unol â chasgliad y Pwyllgor Dethol?

**The First Secretary:** I do not remember which point in the Welsh Affairs Select Committee’s report Paul said was incorrect. That does not affect the general principle that Paul is an excellent lobbyist for Wales inside the UK Government. The price of that is that he is bound by Cabinet collective responsibility in what he says outside.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ni chofiaf pa un o’r pwyntiau yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig y dywedodd Paul ei fod yn anghywir. Nid yw hynny’n effeithio ar yr egwyddor gyffredinol bod Paul yn lobïwr rhagorol dros Gymru oddi mewn i Lywodraeth y DU. Y pris y mae’n rhaid ei dalu am hynny yw ei fod wedi ei rwymo gan gydgyfrifoldeb y Cabinet o ran yr hyn a ddywed y tu allan.

**Glyn Davies:** Following his discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales, will the First Secretary guarantee that no job creating projects in Powys are waiting in the in-tray due to financial support being withheld pending agreement with the European Union over the availability of regional selective assistance?

**Glyn Davies:** Yn dilyn ei drafodaethau ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a wnaiff y Prif Ysgrifennydd roi sicrwydd nad oes unrhyw brosiectau creu swyddi ym Mhowys yn disgwyl yn y fasedd ‘i mewn’ oherwydd atal cymorth ariannol wrth ddisgwyl cytundeb â’r Undeb Ewropeaidd ynghylch y cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a fydd ar gael?

**The First Secretary:** I wish that I could give that guarantee but I do not think that I can. I cannot exclude the possibility that there is a firm in Powys that would like to proceed but, because its application was submitted after the 31 December deadline, does not have an interim offer that can be turned into a final offer. Due to the superb efforts of Assembly officials who deal with regional selective assistance having kept the books open longer than in Scotland and England, we are still working through cases that received interim offers before 31 December and are, therefore, not affected by the cut-off date pending the agreement on the new RSA map. I cannot exclude the possibility that, either now or over the next couple of months until that map has been agreed, there will be firms in Powys that will have their projects sterilised or held back by the absence of a map. It is an extremely difficult situation. We are still just

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Byddai’n dda gennyf pe gallwn roi’r sicrwydd hwnnw ond ni chredaf y gallaf. Ni allaf ddiystyru’r posibiliad bod cwmni ym Mhowys a hoffai fynd ymlaen ond nad yw, am fod ei gais wedi ei gyflwyno ar ôl y dyddiad cau ar 31 Rhagfyr, wedi cael cynnig dros dro y gellir ei droi’n gynnig terfynol. Oherwydd ymdrechion gwych swyddogion y Cynulliad sydd yn ymdrin â chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a gadwodd y llyfrau’n agored yn hwy nag yn yr Alban a Lloegr, yr ydym yn dal i weithio drwy achosion a dderbyniodd gynigion dros dro cyn 31 Rhagfyr ac nad effeithir arnynt, felly, gan y dyddiad terfynu hyd nes y cytunir ar y map cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol newydd. Ni allaf ddiystyru’r posibiliad, naill ai’n awr neu dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf nes cytuno ar y map hwnnw, y bydd cwmnïau ym Mhowys y caiff eu prosiectau eu seithugo neu eu dal yn ôl am

about holding the line but the pipeline will eventually run out of projects. If we have not managed to get the regional aid map sorted out by then, we could be in difficulties not only in Powys but in all assisted areas in Wales.

nad oes map. Mae'n sefyllfa anodd iawn. Yr ydym yn dal ein gafael o hyd o drwch blewyn ond daw'r prosiectau sydd yn yr arfaeth i ben yn y diwedd. Os na fyddwn wedi llwyddo i ddatrys y map cymorth rhanbarthol erbyn hynny, gallem fod mewn trafferthion nid yn unig ym Mhowys ond ym mhob rhanbarth cymorth yng Nghymru.

2:40 p.m.

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Alun Pugh:** Point of order. Although I welcome David Davies's interest in Glan y Don field and Gellifor post office, is it in order, Llywydd, to table questions on other Members' constituencies? I know that, in other legislatures, this practice is ruled out of order. I ask you for a formal ruling on this, particularly in the run-up to the UK General Election.

**Alun Pugh:** Pwynt o drefn. Er fy mod yn croesawu diddordeb David Davies yng nghae Glan y Don a swyddfa bost Gellifor, a yw mewn trefn, Lywydd, i gyflwyno cwestiynau ar etholaethau Aelodau eraill? Gwn fod yr arfer hwn, mewn deddfwrfeydd eraill, yn cael ei ddyfarnu allan o drefn. Gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu'n ffurfiol ar hyn, yn enwedig yn y cyfnod cyn Etholiad Cyffredinol y DU.

Secondly, I want to point out to Mr Richards that I was not parachuted into Clwyd West. I won the election. Perhaps he has forgotten that he was an unsuccessful candidate in that election.

Yn ail, yr wyf am dynnu sylw Mr Richards at y ffaith na chefais fy mharasiwtio i Orllewin Clwyd. Enillais yr etholiad. Efallai ei fod wedi anghofio ei fod yn ymgeisydd aflwyddiannus yn yr etholiad hwnnw.

**David Davies:** Can I clarify something for Alun Pugh, because since arriving in Clwyd West, he is obviously fairly new to this political game—

**David Davies:** A gaf egluro rhywbeth i Alun Pugh, oherwydd ers cyrraedd Gorllewin Clwyd, mae'n amlwg ei fod yn eithaf newydd i'r gêm wleidyddol hon—

**The Presiding Officer:** Does this relate to the point of order?

**Y Llywydd:** A yw hyn yn ymwneud â'r pwynt o drefn?

**David Davies:** It does. Is it not in order for Committee members to table questions on matters that relate to those Committees? Is it not the case that recently we have heard Committee Chairs complaining that certain Committee members have not been seen at those Committees? Would the Presiding Officer not agree that it is better for Members to be out and about tackling proper issues that affect real people and that relate to those Committees, rather than sitting around yapping and achieving nothing?

**David Davies:** Ydyw. Onid yw mewn trefn i aelodau Pwyllgor gyflwyno cwestiynau ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud â'r Pwyllgorau hynny? Onid yw'n wir inni glywed Cadeiryddion Pwyllgor yn cwyno'n ddiweddar na welwyd ambell aelod o Bwyllgor yn y Pwyllgorau hynny? Oni chytunai'r Llywydd ei bod yn well i Aelodau fod yn y maes yn mynd i'r afael â materion priodol sydd yn effeithio ar bobl go iawn ac yn ymwneud â'r Pwyllgorau hynny, yn hytrach nag eistedd yn cega ac yn cyflawni dim?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. On the second point, if Assembly Members are elected to Committees, they have a duty to attend those Committees. Whatever else they

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ynghylch yr ail bwynt, os etholir Aelodau Cynulliad i Bwyllgorau, mae dyletswydd arnynt i fynychu'r Pwyllgorau hynny. Nid mater i mi yw beth

do with their time is not a matter for me.

**Rod Richards:** Further to the point of order raised by Alun Pugh, who is one of five Assembly Members for the county borough of Conwy, I say to him that in the Assembly—and I would seek your guidance on this, Llywydd—it has become customary to describe people who have been brought in from the outside, whether or not they win an election, as having been parachuted in. Mr Pugh was parachuted in from another part of north Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** The selection processes of political parties are fortunately not a matter for me and I do not intend to get involved. However, the matter of tabling questions relating to different parts of Wales is a matter for the Table Office and, therefore, for myself and my Office. My advice is that questions relating to Wales or matters affecting Wales are in order, provided that the wording of the questions is in order.

It might have come to your notice that Members, first past the post and regional Members, who represent Colwyn Bay or the county borough of Conwy—part of which I have the honour of representing as a first past the post Member—contributed to that question as did Members from south-east Wales to another question. A first past the post Member also contributed to a question asked by a regional Member. My point is that there are no distinctions in this Chamber between different kinds of Members. However, I had received early notice of David Davies's question, because I read the *North Wales Weekly News* carefully.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Lywydd, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi sylwi bod cynnig ar yr agenda heddiw gan y Blaid Doriáidd ar Fae Caerdydd. Un o'r gwelliannau i'r cynnig hwnnw yw gwelliant gan Aelod o'r un blaid, sef Alun Cairns. A yw mewn trefn i Aelod geisio gwella cynnig gan ei blaid ei hun, onibai ei bod yn rhanedig ar y mater? Mae'n bwynt difrifol, oherwydd gallai guddio gwir bwrpas y cynnig gwreiddiol drwy adael iddo fod yn ddigon llywaeth ac yna gyflwyno gwelliant llawer

bynag arall a wnânt â'u hamser.

**Rod Richards:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn a godwyd gan Alun Pugh, sydd yn un o bum Aelod Cynulliad dros fwrdeistref sirol Conwy, dywedaf wrtho iddo ddod yn arfer yn y Cynulliad—a hoffwn gael arweiniad gennych ar hyn, Lywydd—i ddisgrifio rhai y daethpwyd â hwy o'r tu allan, pa un a enilliant mewn etholiad neu beidio, yn rhai a barasiwtiwyd i mewn. Parasiwtiwyd Mr Pugh o ran arall o ogledd Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn ffordus, nid yw prosesau dethol pleidiau gwleidyddol yn fater i mi ac ni fwriadaf ymhel â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae mater cyflwyno cwestiynau sydd yn ymwneud â gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn fater i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac, felly, i mi ac i'm Swyddfa. Fy nghyngor i yw bod cwestiynau sydd yn ymwneud â Chymru neu faterion sydd yn effeithio ar Gymru mewn trefn, ar yr amod bod geiriad y cwestiynau mewn trefn.

Efallai ichi sylwi bod Aelodau, y rhai cyntaf i'r felin ac Aelodau rhanbarthol, sydd yn cynrychioli Bae Colwyn neu fwrdeistref sirol Conwy—y mae gennyf y fraint o gynrychioli rhan ohono fel Aelod a oedd yn gyntaf i'r felin—wedi cyfrannu i'r cwestiwn hwnnw fel y gwnaeth Aelodau o dde-ddwyrain Cymru i gwestiwn arall. Cyfrannodd Aelod oedd yn gyntaf i'r felin i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Aelod rhanbarthol hefyd. Y pwynt sydd gennyf yw na wahaniaethir yn y Siambr hon rhwng gwahanol fathau o Aelodau. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn wedi cael rhybudd buan o gwestiwn David Davies, oherwydd fy mod yn darllen y *North Wales Weekly News* yn ofalus.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. Presiding Officer, I am sure that you have noticed that there is a motion on today's agenda tabled by the Tory Party on Cardiff Bay. One of the amendments to that motion is an amendment by a Member of the same party, namely Alun Cairns. Is it in order for a Member to try to amend his own party's motion, unless it is divided on the issue? It is a serious point, because it could hide the real purpose of the original motion by allowing it to be anodyne and then tabling a far more controversial

mwy dadleuol, gan beidio â rhoi cyfle i unrhyw un arall ei wella. Dylid anghymeradwyo'r arfer hwn a byddwn yn falch o gael eich sylwadau ar y mater.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, I am glad to have this early opportunity to highlight the purpose of the amendment to the Conservative motion. The reason that the amendment was tabled is the timescale within which motions must be tabled and the notice that must be given. The motion had to be tabled last Tuesday. However, an Economic Development Committee meeting on Wednesday morning revealed several issues that needed to be debated in the Chamber. Therefore, I urgently tabled an amendment to the Conservative Party motion. It is not a means to hide anything, but to have the opportunity to debate those issues in the Chamber. It is meant well.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolchaf i Alun am ei sylwadau. Mae cynigion yn dod o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.12 a 6.13. Lle y mae'r cynigion a gyflwynir mewn trefn, gallai unrhyw un o'r Aelodau gyflwyno gwelliant, hyd yn oed i gynigion eu pleidiau eu hunain. Dros y blynyddoedd, yr wyf wedi sylwi bod llywodraethau a gweinyddiaethau yn tueddu i wneud hyn yn eithaf aml. Fodd bynnag, mae'r perygl y mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi tynnu sylw ato yn bod, ac felly efallai ei bod hi'n briodol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ystyried y mater hwn pan ystyriwn ganllawiau ar drafod a chyflwyno gwelliannau.

amendment, without giving anyone else an opportunity to amend it. This practice should be discouraged and I would be pleased to hear your comments on the matter.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle buan hwn i dynnu sylw at bwrpas y gwelliant i gynnig y Ceidwadwyr. Y rheswm dros gyflwyno'r gwelliant yw'r amserlen y mae angen cyflwyno cynigion oddi mewn iddi a'r rhybudd y mae angen ei roi. Yr oedd yn rhaid cyflwyno'r cynnig ddydd Mawrth diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd fore Mercher, datgelwyd sawl mater y mae angen eu trafod yn y Siambr. Felly, cyflwynais welliant ar frys i gynnig y Blaid Geidwadol. Nid yw'n fodd i gelu unrhyw beth, ond i gael cyfle i drafod y materion hynny yn y Siambr. Mae'n dda ei fwriad.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank Alun for his comments. Motions come under Standing Orders Nos. 6.12 and 6.13. Where the motions tabled are in order, any of the Members may table an amendment, even to their own parties' motions. Over the years, I have noticed that governments and administrations tend to do this quite often. However, the risk to which Ieuan Wyn Jones has drawn attention exists, and therefore it might be appropriate for the Business Committee to examine this matter when we consider guidance on discussing and tabling amendments.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Secretary (Andrew Davies):** Following Ieuan Wyn Jones's recent announcement that he will be standing down as Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, business on 14 March will now include a motion to elect a new Chair for that Committee and a motion to appoint a new Chair to the Panel of Chairs. Business on Wednesday 15 March is as I reported last week. On Tuesday 21 March there will be a debate on the Assembly's strategic plan, 'A Better Wales', and motions to approve three items of subordinate legislation: the Non-domestic Rating (Alteration of Lists and Appeals) Regulations

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Yn dilyn cyhoeddiad Ieuan Wyn Jones yn ddiweddar y bydd yn ymddiswyddo fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, bydd y busnes ar 14 Mawrth bellach yn cynnwys cynnig i ethol Cadeirydd newydd i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw a chynnig i benodi Cadeirydd newydd i'r Panel Cadeiryddion. Mae'r busnes ddydd Mercher 15 Mawrth fel yr adroddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Ddydd Mawrth 21 Mawrth bydd dadl ar gynllun strategol y Cynulliad, 'Gwell Cymru', a chynigion i gymeradwyo tair eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth: y Rheoliadau Trethi Busnes (Newid Rhestrau ac Apeliadau) 2000,

2000, the Health Act 1999 (Commencement Order (No. 2)) Order 2000 and the Health Act 1999 (Fundholding Practices) (Transfer of Assets, Savings, Rights and Liabilities and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2000. Business on 22 March will include a debate on museums policy, a motion to approve the main expenditure groups transfer and motions to approve nine items of subordinate legislation, which are listed on the draft business statement on the Chamberweb. I will not read them out, but they include three local government Orders, four health Orders, an education Order and an Order to raise the financial limit of the Welsh Development Agency.

On Tuesday, 28 March, we will have the Health and Social Services Committee progress report, which is the third report from a Committee, and motions to approve two items of subordinate legislation. On Wednesday 29 March, there will be two debates on motions proposed by Plaid Cymru and the Conservative Party respectively.

Finally, following the Business Committee meeting this morning, and on the advice of the Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation should not be referred to a Subject Committee: the Town and Country Planning (Blight Provisions) (Wales) Order 2000 and the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2000. Arrangements will be made to post this statement on the internet and intranet after Plenary today.

Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd 1999 (Gorchymyn Dechrau (Rhif 2)) 2000 a Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd 1999 (Practisiau â Chronfa) (Trosglwyddo Asedau, Arbedion, Hawliau ac Atebolrwydd a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2000. Bydd y busnes ar 22 Mawrth yn cynnwys dadl ar bolisi amgueddfeydd, cynnig i gymeradwyo trosglwyddo'r prif grwpiau gwariant a chynigion i gymeradwyo naw eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth a restrir yn y datganiad busnes drafft ar we'r Siambr. Ni ddarllenaf hwy, ond maent yn cynnwys tri Gorchymyn llywodraeth leol, pedwar Gorchymyn iechyd, Gorchymyn addysg a Gorchymyn i godi cyfyngiad ariannol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

Ddydd Mawrth, 28 Mawrth, cawn adroddiad gwaith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, sef y trydydd adroddiad oddi wrth Bwyllgor, a chynigion i gymeradwyo dwy eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth. Ddydd Mercher 29 Mawrth, bydd dwy ddadl ar gynigion a gynigir gan Blaid Cymru a chan y Blaid Geidwadol yn y drefn honno.

Yn olaf, yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, ac yn unol â chyngor y Pwyllgor, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd na ddylid cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at Bwyllgor Pwnc: Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Darpariaethau Malltod) (Cymru) 2000 a Gorchymyn Treth y Cyngor (Atebolrwydd dros Berchnogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000. Gwneir trefniadau i osod y datganiad hwn ar y rhyngwyd a'r fewnwyd ar ôl y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

#### **Tâl ar sail Perfformiad i Athrawon Performance-related Pay for Teachers**

2:50 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw Gareth Jones i gynnig y cynnig, atgoffaf Aelodau fod amser yn brin ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Awr o ddadl ydyw. Felly, byddaf yn ffafrio siaradwyr o'r blaid sydd yn cynnig y ddadl a cheisio galw un siaradwr o'r pleidiau eraill am yn ail â'r blaid sydd yn cynnig y ddadl. Dilynafrif yr un

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call Gareth Jones to propose the motion, I remind Members that time is short for this debate. It is an hour-long debate. Therefore, I will favour speakers from the party proposing the debate and try to call one speaker from the other parties alternately to the party

drefn yn y ddadl nesaf. Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jenny Randerson.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad hwn yn credu na ddylai cyflogau athrawon fod yn gysylltiedig â pherfformiad disgyblion.*

Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales wedi galw'r ddadl hon er mwyn tynnu sylw at y datblygiadau diweddaraf yn y trafodaethau ar gyflogau athrawon.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 Jenny Randerson ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Mae cyhoeddiadau diweddar yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn ceisio cadarnhau mai'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth a fydd nid yn unig yn gosod lefel a graddfeydd cyflogau athrawon, ond yn rheoli pryd a sut y dylai ysgolion wobrwyo athrawon da. Yr ydym, fel plaid, yn derbyn mai gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth y mae'r hawl neu'r grym cyfreithiol i osod lefelau cyflog, ond yr ydym yn amharod i dderbyn ac yn anhapus bod yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn torri tir newydd ac yn cyfarwyddo ac yn gorchymyn cyrff llywodraethu ysgolion ar sut i asesu a gwerthuso athrawon.

Mae cynnwys amodau a meini prawf y trothwy yn nogfen gyflogau ac amodau athrawon y Corff Adolygu Athrawon Ysgol yn rym canolog ychwanegol annisgwyl, o ystyried natur cynnwys a chyfarwyddiadau blaenorol y dogfennau hyn. Mae hwn yn faes newydd. Mae'r rhan hon o osod meini prawf yn rhan o ddatblygiad proffesiynol yr athro, sydd yn seiliedig ar yr ysgol unigol ac yn gyfrifoldeb iddi. Datganolwyd y broses hon i'r Cynulliad. Mae cynnwys rhannau o'r meini prawf yn nogfen gyflogau'r Corff Adolygu Athrawon Ysgol yn annerbyniol yn addysgol ac yn groes i ysbryd corfforaethol y proffesiwn.

Mae canllawiau cyffredinol cenedlaethol—heb fod yn seiliedig ar berfformiad disgybl—yn dderbyniol fel fframwaith neu fel trothwy.

proposing the debate. I will follow the same arrangement in the next debate. I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jenny Randerson.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose that

*this Assembly believes that teachers' pay should not be linked to pupil performance.*

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales has called this debate to draw attention to the latest developments in the discussions on teachers' salaries.

We will support Jenny Randerson's amendment 1 on behalf of the Liberal Democrats.

The Secretary of State for Education and Employment's recent announcements attempt to confirm that the Department for Education and Employment will not only set the level and grades of teachers' salaries, but will control when and how schools should reward good teachers. We, as a party, accept that the DfEE has the legal right or power to set salary levels, but we are unwilling to accept and are unhappy that the DfEE is breaking new ground and is directing and commanding school governing bodies on how to assess and appraise teachers.

Including the threshold conditions and criteria in the School Teachers Review Body's teachers' salary and conditions document is an additional and unexpected central power, given the nature of the previous contents and directives of these documents. This is a new field. This part of setting criteria is part of the teacher's professional development, that is based upon and is the responsibility of the individual school. This process has been devolved to the Assembly. Including parts of the criteria in the STRB's salary document is educationally unacceptable and contrary to the corporate spirit of the profession.

National general guidelines—not based on pupil performance—are acceptable as a framework or a threshold. That can

Gall hynny gyfrannu'n helaeth at y broses werthfawr o werthuso a hybu datblygiad proffesiynol athrawon, ac mae'n fodd i wobrwyo athrawon da. Croesawn hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gorchmynion canolog, haearnaid—Fictoraidd yn ôl rhai—sydd yn cyplysu cyflogau athrawon â chanlyniadau arholiadau disgyblion ar y trothwy yn gwbl elyniaethus, bygythiol ac estron i ni yng Nghymru. Mae gorchmynion o'r fath hefyd yn tanseilio hawliau a chyfrifoldebau rheolaethol llywodraethwyr a phenaethiaid ysgolion. Mae hwn yn bwynt y dylid ei ystyried o ddifrif.

Pam y mae'r Llywodraeth yn amharod i ddatganoli meini prawf perfformiad y trothwy? Nid oes sail addysgol i wneud hynny, dim ond sail holl bwysig y Llywodraeth hon o gadw grym a rheolaeth ganolog. Gwyddom i ba gyfeiriad y mae'r Llywodraeth newydd hon yn dymuno mynd, sef *zero tolerance*. Dyna'r targed a dyna sut y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn gweithredu cyn belled ag y mae ysgolion yn y cwestiwn. Dywed *The Times Educational Supplement* ar 3 Mawrth 2000,

'Up to 70 secondaries with the worst GCSE records face closure'.

Mae'r erthygl yn parhau drwy ddweud mai gwae'r ysgolion na fyddant yn cyrraedd nod benodol. Dyna'r bygythiad, ac nid yw hyn ond megis dechrau. Gwelaf hyn yn y pen draw yn fygythiad i'n hathrawon. Bydd *zero tolerance* a dim cyfaddawdu yn berthnasol iddynt hwythau hefyd. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli beth yw'r grymoedd sydd ar waith o'n cwmpas. Mae agenda amgen yn y fan hon, a doeth fyddai i ni yng Nghymru bwysu a mesur agenda'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn y cyd-destun hwn. O glywed y fath fygythiadau, nid yw'n rhyfedd gennyf fod gennym broblem recriwtio yng Nghymru a bod cannoedd o athrawon yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn awchu am adael y proffesiwn. Dyna'r bygythiadau.

Mae'r datblygiad hwn o ganoli grym nid yn unig yn groes i ysbryd datganoli, mae hefyd yn groes i egwyddorion addysgol, yn enwedig yng Nghymru, lle mae ein hysgolion yn ymfalchio yn eu hunigrywiaeth fel

contribute substantially to the valuable process of appraising and promoting the professional development of teachers, and is a means of rewarding good teachers. We welcome that. However, the rigid central directives—described by some as Victorian—that link teachers' salaries to pupil's examination results at the threshold are totally hostile, threatening and alien to us in Wales. Such directives also undermine the management rights and responsibilities of governors and school heads. This is a point that should be seriously considered.

Why is the Government unwilling to devolve the threshold performance criteria? There is no educational basis for doing so, only this Government's all-important basis of retaining central power and control. We know in which direction this new Government wants to move, and that is zero tolerance. That is the target and that is how the Labour Party acts as far as schools are concerned. *The Times Educational Supplement* on 3 March 2000, states,

'Mae hyd at 70 ysgol uwchradd â'r recordiau TGAU gwaethaf yn wynebu'r posibilid o'u cau'.

The article goes on to warn schools to beware if they do not attain a particular target. That is the threat, and this is but the start. I view this as something that will eventually threaten our teachers. Zero tolerance and no compromise will also be relevant to them. It is important that we are aware of the forces that are at work around us. There is an alternative agenda here, and it would be wise for us in Wales to weigh up the Labour Government's agenda in this context. On hearing such threats, it is no wonder to me that we have a recruitment problem in Wales and that hundreds of teachers throughout England and Wales are longing to leave the profession. Those are the threats.

This development of centralising power is not only contrary to the spirit of devolution, it is also contrary to educational principles, particularly in Wales, where our schools take pride in their uniqueness as community



ysgolion cymunedol. Ar yr union amser pan fo galw am gymorth i'n cymunedau, mae penaeithiaid a llywodraethwyr ysgolion yn gorfod trosglwyddo'r grym rheolaethol holl bwysig i ddwylo'r biwrocrataid yn Llundain.

Ystyriwch y raddfa o drosglwyddo hawliau sydd yn digwydd ac sydd wedi digwydd. Bellach, mae'r cwricwlwm wedi ei ganoli. Mae cyllid eisoes wedi ei ganoli ac yn awr mae ansawdd ein hathrawon yn cael ei asesu o'r canol. Meini prawf canolog yw'r safonau cenedlaethol hyn. O hyn ymlaen, caiff athrawon eu talu yn unol â'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth Brydeinig yn ystyried yw eu gwerth.

Wrth gwrs, nid yw hyn ond megis dechrau. Ar hyn o bryd, mae hyn yn wirfoddol. Dyna sut y caiff ei gyflwyno i athrawon. Os oes £2,000 ar gael, byddant yn mynd amdano yn wirfoddol. Sut y bydd hi yn y dyfodol? Sut y bydd pethau'n newid unwaith y gosodir y system yn ei lle? Fe welwn dynhau a miniogi'r safonau a byddant yn orfodol yn y dyfodol. Dyna fydd y *zero tolerance* i athrawon.

Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur Brydeinig yn ymgymryd â newidiadau mor eithafol o ganoledd fel bod newidiadau Mrs Thatcher yn ymddangos yn ddiniwed o'u cymharu. Ni feddyliais y byddwn yn gweld canoli grym fel hyn gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Mae'n peri dychryn ac mae'n sicr o ychwanegu at bryderon athrawon a'r pwysau sydd arnynt. Mae hefyd yn cyfyngu ar allu ysgolion i ddatblygu syniadau newydd cyffrous o fewn eu cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, y dychryn mwyaf yw'r ffaith fod y cynllun hwn yn un addysgol ddiffygiol. Mae'n drawiadol hefyd mai grym neu ddehongliad deddfwriaethol ac nid hanfodion addysgol sydd yn cael eu defnyddio i orfodi hyn arnom yng Nghymru.

Mae'n greiddiol i'n dadl ar y pwnc hwn fod yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth wedi cyhoeddi y bydd perfformiad disgyblion a chanlyniadau profion ac arholiadau allanol yn rhan o'r asesiad ar gyfer croesi'r hyn a elwir yn drothwy perfformiad. Fel plaid, yr ydym wedi gwrthwynebu hyn o'r cychwyn am resymau amlwg i'r rhai sydd yn ymwneud ag addysg neu sydd â phrofiad ym myd addysg. Mae'r dadleuon a'r rhesymau pam ein bod yn

schools. At the very time when there is a demand for assistance for our communities, schools heads and governors are having to transfer the all-important managerial power into the hands of bureaucrats in London.

Consider the scale of the transfer of rights that is happening and that has happened. The curriculum has now been centralised. Funding has already been centralised and now the calibre of our teachers is being assessed from the centre. These national standards are central criteria. From now on, teachers will be paid in accordance with what the British Government believes their value to be.

Of course, this is but the start. At the moment, this is voluntary. That is how it is presented to teachers. If £2,000 is available, they will go for it voluntarily. How will things stand in the future? How will things change once the system is put in place? We will see the standards tightened and refined and they will be mandatory in the future. That will be the zero tolerance for teachers.

The British Labour Government is undertaking changes that are so extremely centralised that they make Mrs Thatcher's changes seem innocent in comparison. I never thought I would see such centralisation of powers by a Labour Government. It is frightening and is bound to add to the concerns of teachers and the pressures on them. It also restricts the ability of schools to develop exciting new ideas within their communities. However, the most frightening thing is that this scheme is educationally deficient. It is striking also that legislative power or interpretation rather than educational imperatives are being used to force this upon us in Wales.

At the heart of our debate on this subject is the fact that the Department for Education and Employment has announced that pupils' performance and the results of external tests and examinations will be part of the assessment to cross what is called a performance threshold. As a party, we have objected to this from the outset for reasons that are obvious to those who are involved with education or who have experience in the

gwrthwynebu eisoes wedi eu gwyntyllu yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16. Mae mwyafrif aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw yn erbyn cysylltu cyflogau â pherfformiad disgyblion. Gobeithiaf y bydd eraill, yn ystod y ddadl hon, yn pwysleisio pa mor annoeth yw cysylltu cyflogau athrawon â pherfformiad disgyblion. Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi ymhelaethu ar hynny. Nid oes neb yr wyf i wedi ymgynghori â hwy yn gefnogol i'r fath syniad.

Mae dau beth dan ystyriaeth. Yn gyntaf, y fframwaith rheoli perfformiad. Er nad ydym wedi gweld y fframwaith terfynol, mae gennym le i groesawu'r argymhellion sydd ynddo. Mae'n adeiladu ar gyfundrefn werthuso sydd eisoes yn ein hysgolion a gwelwn fuddsoddiad yn natblygiad proffesiynol pob un o'n hathrawon o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yn unol â chynlluniau datblygu ysgol. Mae hynny i'w groesawu. Yn ôl yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, mae gwerthuso athrawon—y fframwaith o reoli perfformiad—wedi ei ddatganoli i Gymru.

Talaf deyrnged barod a haeddiannol i Rosemary Butler, nid yn unig am iddi sicrhau stamp Cymreig i'r fframwaith gwerthuso neu reoli perfformiad, ond am iddi ymgorffori yn y fframwaith lawer o'r hyn y buom fel plaid ac fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn gofyn amdano yn ein trafodaethau. Credaf, os buddsoddir arian digonol yn y system werthuso ar ei newydd wedd, nid yn unig ar gyfer hyfforddiant ond i gynnal y system i'r dyfodol, y bydd ein hathrawon ac felly ein disgyblion yn elwa o hynny.

Croesawaf ein bod ni yng Nghymru am ymddiried yn yr arbenigedd sydd eisoes gennym yn ein hawdurdodau lleol ac yn ein hymgynghorwyr, i gynnal hyfforddiant, i roi arweiniad i ysgolion ac i sicrhau bod y fframwaith yn gweithredu'n llwyddiannus. Mae'n deg cydnabod bod Rosemary wedi gweithio'n ddygn i'r cyfeiriad hwn i ymgorffori'r syniadau hyn yn y fframwaith. Mae hyn yn dderbyniol ac yn bellgyrhaeddol. Tybiaf fod honno wedi bod yn frwydr galed, Rosemary. Croesawn yr hyn yr ydych wedi ei wneud yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw.

field of education. The arguments and the reasons why we object have already been aired at meetings of the Pre-16 Education Committee. The majority of members of that Committee is against linking salaries to pupils' performance. I hope that others, during this debate, will emphasise how unwise it is to link teachers' salaries to pupils' performance. Time does not allow me to elaborate on that. Nobody whom I have consulted supports such an idea.

There are two things under consideration. First, the performance management framework. Although we have not seen the final framework, we can welcome the recommendations in it. It builds on an appraisal system that already exists in our schools and we will see an investment in the professional development of all our teachers year on year in accordance with school development plans. That is to be welcomed. According to the Secretary for Education and Children, teacher appraisal—the framework of performance management—has been devolved to Wales.

I pay a willing and deserved tribute to Rosemary Butler, not only for ensuring a Welsh stamp for the appraisal or performance management framework, but for incorporating in that framework much of what we as a party and members of the Pre-16 Education Committee asked for in our discussions. I believe that, if adequate funding is invested in the appraisal system in its new guise, not only for training but to maintain the system for the future, our teachers and therefore our pupils will benefit from that.

I welcome that we in Wales will put our trust in the expertise that we already have in our local authorities and in our advisers, to carry out training, to give guidance to schools and to ensure that the framework operates successfully. It is fair to acknowledge that Rosemary has worked hard in this direction to incorporate these ideas into the framework. This is acceptable and far-reaching. I imagine that that was a hard-won battle, Rosemary. We welcome what you have done in that direction.

3:00 p.m.

Y maen tramgwydd yw ail elfen y trafodaethau, sef perfformiad trothwy, lle gwneir cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng cyflogau athrawon a pherfformiad disgyblion. Mae'r gyfundrefn ganolog yn codi ei phen yma ac yn ein rhwystro rhag datblygu cyfundrefn Gymreig. Pe diddymid y cyfeiriad at berfformiad disgyblion, byddai meini prawf y trothwy yn dderbyniol ac yn addas i broses datblygiad proffesiynol athrawon. Maent yn faterion o bwys mewn unrhyw broses werthuso. Cyfeiriant at wybodaeth broffesiynol a deallusrwydd, dysgu ac asesu, priodoleddau ac effeithiolrwydd proffesiynol ac yn y blaen. Nid yw'r agweddau a'r safonau hynny ond yn ymestyniad ac yn rhan naturiol o'r fframwaith. Felly, ni allwch ac ni ddylech eu gwahanu na'u hysgaru.

Bydd dadleuon a datganiadau'r prynhawn yma yn profi mor annoeth yw cyplysu cyflogau athrawon â pherfformiad disgyblion. Byddai'n annoeth inni fabwysiadu'r argymhellion fel y maent. Yr unig ateb yw i ni, drwy lais y Cynulliad a'n Hysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, ddylanwadu a phwyso ar yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth, David Blunkett, i roi Gorchymynion ar wahân i Gymru a Lloegr. Byddai'n rhaid i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ymateb i'r ddadl pe bai'r Cynulliad yn galw am hynny. Dyna bwysigrwydd dadl a phenderfyniad y prynhawn yma.

Onid dyna'r cyfeiriad a roddwyd gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Paul Murphy, yn ei anerchiad yma rai wythnosau yn ôl? Hefyd, onid yw'r Ysgrifennydd wedi cymeradwyo rhai newidiadau ar gyfer Cymru, er enghraifft rôl yr awdurdodau addysg lleol mewn perthynas â'r aseswyr? Mae ef wedi cymryd camau. Felly, credaf y gall yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, yn unol â'i hawliau a'i gyfrifoldebau statudol, fynd gam ymhellach a diddymu pob cyfeiriad ym meini prawf y trothwy at wobrwyo ar sail perfformiad disgyblion a sicrhau Gorchymyn ar wahân i Gymru.

Gyd-aelodau, mae oblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol i'r argymhellion hyn, sydd yn cryfhau grym canolog ar draul hawliau rheolaethol ysgolion

The stumbling block is the second element of the discussions, namely threshold performance, where a direct link is made between teachers' salaries and pupil performance. The central system raises its head here and prevents us from developing a Welsh system. If the reference to pupil performance was removed, the threshold criteria would be acceptable and appropriate for the process of teachers' professional development. They are important matters in any appraisal process. They refer to professional knowledge and intelligence, teaching and assessment, professional attributes and effectiveness and so on. Those aspects and standards are only an extension and a natural part of the framework. Therefore, you cannot and should not separate or divorce them.

This afternoon's arguments and statements will prove that it is unwise to link teachers' salaries with pupil performance. It would be unwise for us to adopt the recommendations as they stand. The only answer is for us, through the voice of the Assembly and our Secretary for Education and Children, to influence and urge the Secretary of State for Education and Employment, David Blunkett, to issue separate Orders for Wales and England. The Secretary of State would have to respond to the debate if the Assembly called for that. That is the importance of this afternoon's debate and decision.

Is that not the direction given by the Secretary of State for Wales, Paul Murphy, in his address here some weeks ago? Also, has not the Secretary approved some amendments for Wales, for example the role of the local education authorities in relation to the assessors? He has taken steps. Therefore, I believe that, in accordance with his statutory rights and responsibilities, the Secretary of State can take a further step and remove all references in the threshold criteria to rewards based on pupil performance and ensure a separate Order for Wales.

Colleagues, there are far-reaching implications to these recommendations, which strengthen central power at the

Cymru. Mae hynny'n groes i ddatganoli. Byddai mabwysiadu'r cynnig hwn yn anfon neges ddiamwys i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fod y Cynulliad o ddifrif nid yn unig am ddatganoli a mabwysiadu hawliau deddfwriaethol i Gymru, ond ynghylch addysg a dyfodol ein hathrawon a'n disgyblion. Erfyniaf arnoch i gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1. Add at the end of the motion

*and, in line with the majority view of the Pre-16 Education Committee, resolves to take all possible steps not to implement such a scheme in Wales.*

In recent months, I have visited many schools in my constituency. They vary in size, social context, appearance and problems. However, not one has supported the concept of performance-related pay. They have all voiced concern about performance-related or performance management pay for teachers. Headteachers, mature teachers and young teachers consider it to be time-consuming, over-bureaucratic and a distraction from the vital business of teaching children from day to day.

Despite those misgivings, teachers are prepared to move forward and develop a scheme that attempts to overcome the obvious weaknesses of any kind of performance-related pay. World wide, performance-related pay is known to undermine teamwork. Above all, schools are teams. They function as teams, with teachers supporting and complementing each other. A workable scheme would emphasise professional development. However, in our Committee's view, a scheme concentrating on pupil performance in exams would fundamentally undermine teamwork. That is the scheme that we are currently being offered. The Committee has said repeatedly that the scheme will not work in Wales. It will undermine rather than reinforce work being done to improve poor schools. It is essential that we take every possible step to ensure that our voice prevails. The Committee has taken a constructive role in opposing this scheme. We have put forward

expense of the management rights of Wales's schools. That is contrary to devolution. Adopting this motion would send an unambiguous message to the Secretary of State that the Assembly is serious not only about devolution and adopting legislative powers for Wales, but about education and the future of our teachers and pupils. I implore you to support the motion.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*ac, yn unol â barn y mwyafrif yn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, yn penderfynu cymryd pob cam posibl i beidio â rhoi cynllun o'r fath ar waith yng Nghymru.*

Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, ymwelais â llawer o ysgolion yn fy etholaeth. Maent yn amrywio o ran maint, cyd-destun cymdeithasol, gwedd a phroblemau. Fodd bynnag, nid oes yr un ohonynt wedi cefnogi'r cysyniad o dâl ar sail perfformiad. Maent oll wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch tâl ar sail perfformiad neu dâl rheoli perfformiad i athrawon. Mae prifathrawon, athrawon hŷn ac athrawon ifanc o'r farn ei fod yn mynd ag amser, yn orfiwrocraidd ac yn tynnu oddi wrth y gwaith holl bwysig o ddysgu plant o ddydd i ddydd.

Er gwaethaf yr amheuon hynny, mae athrawon yn barod i symud ymlaen a datblygu cynllun sydd yn ceisio goresgyn gwendidau amlwg unrhyw fath o dâl ar sail perfformiad. Ledled y byd, gwyddys bod tâl ar sail perfformiad yn tanseilio gwaith tîm. Yn fwy na dim, timau yw ysgolion. Maent yn gweithredu fel timau, gydag athrawon yn cefnogi ac yn cyflenwi gwaith ei gilydd. Byddai cynllun ymarferol yn rhoi pwyslais ar ddatblygu proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, ym marn ein Pwyllgor, byddai cynllun sydd yn canolbwyntio ar berfformiad disgyblion mewn arholiadau yn llwyr danseilio gwaith tîm. Dyna'r cynllun a gynigir i ni ar hyn o bryd. Dywedodd y Pwyllgor dro ar ôl tro na fydd y cynllun yn gweithio yng Nghymru. Bydd yn tanseilio yn hytrach nag atgyfnerthu'r gwaith a wneir i wella ysgolion gwael. Mae'n holl bwysig inni gymryd pob cam posibl i sicrhau mai ein llais ni fydd drechaf. Ymgwymerodd y Pwyllgor â rôl adeiladol wrth wrthwynebu'r cynllun hwn.

alternative schemes and ideas. We have worked together closely as a group and taken soundings from the teaching unions and the governors' association.

The purpose of the Liberal Democrat amendment is to reinforce the oft-expressed views of the Committee. The situation has not been simplified by the apparent change of mind about whether we have the power as an Assembly to introduce our own threshold scheme for teachers. There is no doubt in my mind that we started this debate many months ago with a clear view that we had that power. In an official Assembly press release on 8 July, there was an additional document that stated,

'the Assembly does have flexibility over the details of any revised appraisal arrangements. It can provide an appraisal system which is more tailored to our position in Wales whilst allowing teachers to access proposed higher pay scales, provided that appraisal is linked to pay and that the appraisal process provides adequate standards and rigour'.

For those of you who are not performance management pay anoraks as we in the Pre-16 Education Committee have become, the issue is this—is the performance management scheme for teachers that happens throughout a teacher's career and for which we are having a separate Welsh scheme, separate from the threshold through which teachers go to get higher pay, or is it part of the same threshold? In England, it seems to be part of the same threshold. For example, in September 1999, in written evidence from the Department for Education and Employment to the Schoolteachers' Review Board, it was stated that the Secretary of State for Education and Employment envisages that the outcomes of performance review will inform pay assessments at relevant stages in a teacher's career. That means that performance management or review are linked to pay. However, it appears that they are not to be linked in Wales. There has been extensive consultation on this in England. We have had no consultation in Wales. One would, therefore, expect a separate Welsh scheme.

Cyflwynasom gynlluniau a syniadau eraill. Gweithiasom gyda'n gilydd yn agos fel grŵp a cheisio barn undebau'r athrawon a chymdeithas y llywodraethwyr.

Pwrpas gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw ategu'r farn a fynegwyd yn aml gan y Pwyllgor. Ni symleiddiwyd y sefyllfa drwy'r newid meddwl ymddangosiadol ynghylch a oes gennym bŵer fel Cynulliad i gyflwyno ein cynllun trothwy ein hunain i athrawon. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl inni ddechrau'r ddadl hon fisoedd lawer yn ôl gyda barn bendant bod y pŵer hwnnw gennym. Mewn datganiad swyddogol i'r wasg gan y Cynulliad ar 8 Gorffennaf, yr oedd dogfen ychwanegol a ddatganodd,

'mae hyblygrwydd gan y Cynulliad ynghylch manylion unrhyw drefniadau gwerthuso diwygiedig. Gall ddarparu system gwerthuso sydd yn cydweddu'n well â'n sefyllfa yng Nghymru tra'n caniatáu mynediad i athrawon at y graddfeydd tâl uwch arfaethedig, ar yr amod bod y gwerthuso'n gysylltiedig â thâl a bod y broses gwerthuso'n darparu safonau digonol a manyldeb'.

Er mwyn y rhai ohonoch nad ydych wedi ymgolli mewn tâl rheoli perfformiad fel y gwnaethom ni yn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, y cwestiwn yw hyn—a yw'r cynllun rheoli perfformiad i athrawon sydd yn digwydd ar hyd gyrfa athrawon ac yr ydym yn cael cynllun ar wahân ar ei gyfer yng Nghymru, yn wahanol i'r trothwy y bydd athrawon yn ei groesi i gael tâl uwch, ynteu a yw'n rhan o'r un trothwy? Yn Lloegr, ymddengys ei fod yn rhan o'r un trothwy. Er enghraifft, ym Medi 1999, mewn tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig oddi wrth yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth i Fwrdd Adolygu'r Athrawon Ysgol, dywedwyd bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn rhagweld y bydd canlyniadau adolygiad perfformiad yn goleuo asesiadau tâl ar gamau perthnasol yng ngyrfa athro. Golyga hynny fod rheoli neu adolygu perfformiad yn gysylltiedig â thâl. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys nad ydynt i'w cysylltu yng Nghymru. Bu ymgynghori helaeth ar hyn yn Lloegr. Ni chawsom unrhyw ymgynghori yng Nghymru. Byddai rhywun, felly, yn disgwyl cael cynllun ar wahân yng Nghymru.

The Secretary for Education and Children has taken the Committee's concerns about who the assessors will be on board. We appreciate that and thank her for her efforts. We wanted the local education authorities to do the work, not a Cambridge based company. The local education authorities will now do the work. However, the albatross of pupil examination results is still around our necks. We have a scheme that refers only to professional development issues for the performance management part year on year for teachers throughout their careers. That scheme is assessed by LEA representatives. When teachers then apply to cross the threshold, those same assessors from LEAs will apply largely the same criteria but also criteria based on pupil results. If that is turned on its head, it will be far more difficult to get through that threshold in a tough school than in a school where the examination results come out well every year. How are we going to attract good teachers to poor schools and hence ensure their improvement? Pupils are not cars. You do not put all the same pieces on an assembly line and get identical models at the end. All kinds of things affect pupil performance. What about the excellent teacher who prepares pupils for their exams one year and hands them on the following year to an indifferent teacher? The pupils get good results because they have been prepared well, but the indifferent teacher gets the public kudos and probably the threshold pay also. You therefore have inbuilt unfairness.

3:10 p.m.

This is a giant sledgehammer to crack a very small nut of teachers who are not up to the job. We faced an impasse in the Committee last week. It is public knowledge that one of the unions has had legal advice and that the Executive has had legal advice. The Committee is seeking its own legal advice and that is essential for the good of the Assembly. The situation draws attention to the unevenness of the devolution settlement in Wales and is a source of frustration. Performance-related pay was rejected in

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant wedi derbyn pryderon y Pwyllgor ynghylch pwy fydd yr aseswyr. Gwerthfawrogwn hynny a diolchwn iddi am ei hymdrechion. Yr oeddem am i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol wneud y gwaith, ac nid cwmni a leolir yng Nghaergrawnt. Yr awdurdodau addysg lleol a fydd yn gwneud y gwaith yn awr. Fodd bynnag, ceir o hyd felltith canlyniadau arholiadau disgyblion. Mae gennym gynllun nad yw ond yn cyfeirio at faterion datblygu proffesiynol ar gyfer y rhan rheoli perfformiad flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn i athrawon gydol eu gyrfa. Asesir y cynllun hwnnw gan gynrychiolwyr yr awdurdodau addysg lleol. Pan fo athrawon yn ymgeisio wedyn i groesi'r trothwy, bydd yr un aseswyr o awdurdodau addysg lleol yn cymhwyso'r un meini prawf i raddau helaeth ond hefyd meini prawf sydd yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau disgyblion. A throi hynny wyneb i waered, bydd yn llawer anos croesi'r trothwy hwnnw mewn ysgol galed nag mewn ysgol lle y ceir canlyniadau arholiad da bob blwyddyn. Sut yr ydym yn mynd i ddenu athrawon da i ysgolion gwael a drwy hynny eu gwella? Nid ceir mo disgyblion. Nid ydych yn rhoi'r un darnau ar res gydosod a chael modelau sydd yn union yr un fath yn y pen draw. Mae pob math o bethau'n effeithio ar berfformiad disgyblion. Beth am yr athro rhagorol sydd yn paratoi disgyblion ar gyfer eu harholiadau un flwyddyn ac yn eu trosglwyddo'r flwyddyn wedyn i athro diddrwg-ddidda? Caiff y disgyblion ganlyniadau da am eu bod wedi eu paratoi'n dda, ond yr athro diddrwg-ddidda a gaiff glod y cyhoedd a'r tâl trothwy hefyd yn ôl pob tebyg. Felly mae annhegwch cynhenid.

Mae hyn yn ordd enfawr i dorri cneuen fach iawn, sef athrawon nad ydynt yn gymwys i'w gwaith. Yr oeddem mewn caethgyfle yn y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'n hysbys i'r cyhoedd bod un o'r undebau wedi derbyn cyngor cyfreithiol a bod y Weithrediaeth wedi derbyn cyngor cyfreithiol. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol iddo'i hun ac mae hynny'n holl bwysig er lles y Cynulliad. Mae'r sefyllfa'n tynnu sylw at anghysondeb y setliad datganoli yng Nghymru ac mae'n peri rhwystredigaeth.

Scotland. We cannot reject it in Wales. The Committee and the teaching unions appreciate that, and teachers are also beginning to accept that view. However, we must take every possible step, as our amendment states, to tailor the scheme for Wales. I beg you to support the amendment and thereby give added strength to the hand of the Secretary for Education and Children, who has to fight on our behalf.

**Owen John Thomas:** The Pre-16 Education Committee was presented in the summer with two interrelated papers. One proposed the reintroduction of a system for the appraisal of teachers, and the other proposed the set-up of threshold assessment leading to a new upper pay range. Committee papers repeatedly stated that the appraisal process would be used to assess teachers when they sought to cross the threshold to reach the upper pay range. The association between both proposals was irrefutable.

The report on appraisal, entitled 'Performance Management Framework' and issued in October, states clearly that under new pay proposals, appraisal would inform threshold decisions, and that,

'evidence collected in performance reviews will contribute to judgements about whether teachers have met the threshold standards and can therefore cross the threshold'.

As recently as last Tuesday, 29 February, the Pre-16 Education Committee received a document from Ann Jackson of the Department for Education and Employment claiming that

'information from appraisal of teachers, including classroom observations, will provide an important part of the evidence to support threshold applications'.

However, the next day, 1 March, Committee paper 2 informed Members that the appraisal system would not be reintroduced in schools in Wales until September 2001. In contrast to this delay, the same Committee paper stated that arrangements giving access to the new

Gwrthodwyd tâl ar sail perfformiad yn yr Alban. Ni allwn ei wrthod yng Nghymru. Mae'r Pwyllgor ac undebau'r athrawon yn deall hynny, ac mae'r athrawon hefyd yn dechrau derbyn y farn honno. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gymryd pob cam posibl, fel y dywed ein gwelliant, i deilwra'r cynllun i Gymru. Erfyniaf arnoch i gefnogi'r gwelliant a drwy hynny rhoi nerth ychwanegol i'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, sydd yn gorfod ymladd ar ein rhan.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cyflwynwyd dau bapur cydgyssylltiedig i'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn yr haf. Yr oedd un yn cynnig ailgyflwyno system i werthuso athrawon, a'r llall yn cynnig y trefniant o asesiad trothwy yn arwain at amrediad tâl uwch. Dywedwyd dro ar ôl tro ym mhapurau'r Pwyllgor y câi'r broses gwerthuso ei defnyddio i asesu athrawon pan geisient groesi'r trothwy i gyrraedd yr amrediad tâl uwch. Ni ellid dadlau nad oedd cysylltiad rhwng y ddau gynnig.

Mae'r adroddiad ar werthuso, o'r enw 'Fframwaith Rheoli Perfformiad' a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Hydref, yn datgan yn eglur y byddai gwerthuso, o dan y cynigion tâl newydd, yn goleuo penderfyniadau ar y trothwy, ac y bydd,

'tystiolaeth a gesglir mewn adolygiadau perfformiad yn cyfrannu at ddyfarniadau ynghylch a yw athrawon wedi cyrraedd safonau'r trothwy ac a allant felly groesi'r trothwy'.

Mor ddiweddar â dydd Mawrth diwethaf, 29 Chwefror, derbyniodd y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ddogfen oddi wrth Ann Jackson o'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn honni y bydd

'gwybodaeth a geir drwy werthuso athrawon, gan gynnwys arsylwi yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, yn darparu rhan bwysig o'r dystiolaeth i ategu ceisiadau trothwy'.

Fodd bynnag, drannoeth, 1 Mawrth, hysbyswyd yr Aelodau gan bapur 2 y Pwyllgor na châi'r system werthuso ei hailgyflwyno mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru tan Fedi 2001. Yn groes i'r oedi hwn, nodai'r un papur Pwyllgor y byddai trefniadau i roi

upper pay range would be brought forward in Wales, and that application forms would be available by the end of April. We must not forget that the delayed appraisal process is a devolved matter, whilst the rushed arrangements for pay and conditions are the claimed responsibility of DfEE. The odd nature of these hurried changes is highlighted further in a letter dated 3 March, and approved by the Secretary for Education and Children. The letter states that

‘The responsibility for carrying out these assessments, that is to cross the new pay threshold, will rest with head teachers, and assessments will be made against performance standards set by the Secretary of State for Education and Employment in England.’

It was no doubt felt by those wishing to centralise power, that the imposition of DfEE’s standards upon Wales would be made that much easier with the appraisal system temporarily out of the way. Under the original proposals, with appraisal clearly determining the assessment process, it would be difficult to argue that assessment was not the product of appraisal and therefore also a devolved matter. However, the postponement of the appraisal system has made a nonsense of the revised proposals as they are now left without a rigorous means of making an assessment. Head teachers will be forced to gather a wide range of evidence for each teacher aspiring to cross the threshold, and then check this against DfEE’s list of standards. The single comprehensive ready reference provided by the appraisal system will not be available, and having to make decisions based mainly on personal judgement will place head teachers in an invidious position. These latest proposals, which have been rushed forward at the eleventh hour, contain some positive modifications. However, they still link teachers’ pay to pupil performance and seek to deny the devolution process. By and large, they do not reflect the views of the Pre-16 Education Committee or of the professional bodies that represent teachers across Wales. They appear to have been not so much constructed to benefit our children’s

mynediad at yr amrediad tâl newydd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ynghynt yng Nghymru, ac y byddai ffurflenni cais ar gael erbyn diwedd Ebrill. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod y broses gwerthuso ohiriedig yn fater a ddatganolwyd, tra bo’r trefniadau brysiog ar gyfer tâl ac amodau yn gyfrifoldeb a hawlir gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Pwysleisir natur ryfedd y newidiadau brysiog hyn ymhellach mewn llythyr dyddiedig 3 Mawrth, ac a gymeradwywyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant. Dywed y llythyr

‘Bydd y cyfrifoldeb dros gyflawni’r asesiadau hyn, sef croesi’r trothwy tâl newydd, yn perthyn i brifathrawon, a gwneir yr asesiadau yn ôl safonau perfformiad a osodir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn Lloegr.’

Mae’n sicr bod y rhai sydd yn dymuno canoli grym o’r farn mai llawer haws fyddai gorfodi safonau’r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ar Gymru pe rhoddid y system werthuso o’r neilltu dros dro. O dan y cynigion gwreiddiol, a gwerthuso’n amlwg yn pennu’r broses asesu, byddai’n anodd dadlau nad oedd asesu’n ganlyniad i werthuso ac felly’n fater a ddatganolwyd hefyd. Fodd bynnag, mae gohirio’r system werthuso yn gwneud y cynigion diwygiedig yn ddiystyr gan eu bod bellach heb ddull manwl o asesu. Gorfodir prifathrawon i gasglu amrediad eang o dystiolaeth ar gyfer pob athro sydd yn gobeithio croesi’r trothwy, ac wedyn i wirio hyn yn ôl rhestr safonau’r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Ni fydd y dull cyfeirio rhwydd a chynhwysfawr a geir drwy’r system werthuso ar gael, a bydd prifathrawon mewn sefyllfa annheg o orfod gwneud penderfyniadau sydd yn seiliedig yn bennaf ar farn bersonol. Mae’r cynigion diweddaraf, a ruthrwyd ymlaen ar yr unfed awr ar ddeg, yn cynnwys rhai newidiadau cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, maent yn dal i gysylltu tâl athrawon â pherfformiad disgyblion ac yn ceisio gwrthod y broses datganoli. At ei gilydd, nid ydynt yn adlewyrchu barn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 na barn y cyrff proffesiynol sydd yn cynrychioli athrawon ledled Cymru. Ymddengys nad ydynt wedi eu llunio er lles addysg ein plant yn gymaint â’u taflu at ei gilydd fel ymgais ar y funud



education as cobbled together in a last minute attempt to thwart the Assembly, whatever the cost, from being the decision-making body in this matter.

Nid oes neb yn herio mai cyfrifoldeb San Steffan yw gosod manylion amrediad y cyflogau uwch, ond mae'n amlwg bod asesu athrawon sydd eisiau ennill cyflog uwch yn rhan annatod o'r broses werthuso ac felly'n gyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad. Mae'r bwriad i rannu asesu a gwerthuso yn ymgais amrwd amlwg arall i ganoli grym yn Stryd Downing. A ddysgant byth?

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Welsh Conservative Party is unequivocally in favour of rewarding good teachers. However, that should be done within a well thought out performance management framework. We have no objection to giving extra pay to teachers who excel. I firmly believe that there is a consensus across the political spectrum that the status of the teaching profession should be enhanced and that pay is a crucial part of achieving that. There are positive aspects to the administration's performance management system. The plan is, at least, methodical and systematic. I pay tribute to the Secretary for Education and Children, who has accepted many of the Pre-16 Education Committee's suggestions on the appraisal system. However, the Government's proposals have fundamental flaws that the Assembly should not and cannot ignore.

The Welsh Conservative Party has three principled objections to the proposals as they stand. The first relates to the system's centralised nature. It is being imposed on an England and Wales basis, without local flexibility. The assessment criteria are the same, regardless of the school's circumstances. Rural schools will have the same criteria as inner city ones, small ones the same as large. This system is a far cry from one tailored to the needs of children and local schools. It is, in many respects, a system designed to conform to the control freakery of Millbank.

We should be careful not to turn this into a Wales versus England or a Westminster

olaf i atal y Cynulliad, beth bynnag fo'r gost, rhag bod yn gorff penderfynu yn y mater hwn.

No-one challenges that it is Westminster's responsibility to set the details of the upper pay range, but it is obvious that assessing teachers who want to earn a higher wage is an integral part of the appraisal system and therefore the Assembly's responsibility. The intention to split assessment and evaluation is another crude, obvious attempt to centralise power in Downing Street. Will they never learn?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn ddigamsyniol o blaid gwobrwyo athrawon da. Fodd bynnag, dylid gwneud hynny oddi mewn i fframwaith rheoli perfformiad a ddyfeisiwyd yn dda. Nid ydym yn erbyn rhoi tâl ychwanegol i athrawon sydd yn rhagori. Credaf yn gryf fod consensws ar draws y sbectwm gwleidyddol y dylid hyrwyddo statws athrawon a bod tâl yn rhan hanfodol o gyflawni hynny. Mae agweddau cadarnhaol ar system rheoli perfformiad y weinyddiaeth. Mae'r cynllun, o leiaf, yn drefnus ac yn systematig. Talaf deymged i'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, a dderbyniodd lawer o awgrymiadau'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ar y system werthuso. Fodd bynnag, mae diffygion sylfaenol yng nghynigion y Llywodraeth na ddylai ac na all y Cynulliad eu hanwybyddu.

Mae gan Blaid Geidwadol Cymru dri gwrthwynebiad ar egwyddor i'r cynigion fel y maent. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â natur ganoledig y system. Fe'i gorfodir drwy Gymru a Lloegr, heb hyblygrwydd lleol. Yr un yw'r meini prawf ar gyfer asesu, beth bynnag fo amgylchiadau'r ysgol. Bydd yr un meini prawf ar gyfer ysgolion gwledig ac ysgolion yng nghanol dinasoedd, ysgolion bach a rhai mawr. Mae'r system hon ymhell o fod yn un a gafodd ei theilwra yn ôl anghenion plant ac ysgolion lleol. Ar lawer gwedd, mae'n system a ddyfeisiwyd i gydymffurfio ag obsesiwn rheoli Millbank.

Dylem fod yn ofalus rhag troi hyn yn anghydfod Cymru yn erbyn Lloegr neu San

versus Cardiff dispute. It is a clash of cultures between New Labour and educational common sense. This plan is not just bad news for education in Wales; it is equally unsuited to schools in England. We should not reduce this dispute to the level of an England-Wales rugby match, particularly given last Saturday's result. It is about the nature of devolution and how devolution will allow the Assembly to tailor education policy according to Welsh educational needs.

Our second objection to the scheme is that it is unnecessarily bureaucratic. As I mentioned in the short debate that I tabled on performance-related pay last year, the scheme will be a bureaucratic nightmare. If one looks at the teacher's list of things to do, you will see school development plans, work development plans, work monitoring plans, self-review plans and annual team reviews. This is a burden that teachers could well do without.

I would like to see teachers in classrooms filling in gaps in our children's education, not filling in forms for a divisive pay scheme. We would all have been better off had the administration decided to decentralise this matter to schools rather than impose a national straitjacket. Head teachers and governors are best placed to decide how to reward good teachers and good teaching practices. Perhaps a bit of real devolution would not have gone amiss. Instead, we have a 'one size fits all' approach, which will satisfy no-one.

3:20 p.m.

Finally, the most controversial aspect of the new scheme, which is the substance of Plaid Cymru's motion today, is the link between teachers' pay and examination results. I am more than a little surprised that the Labour Party has come forward with this plan. After all, it was the Labour Party that, only a few years ago, was bleating about the shameful iniquities of school examination league tables. In a U-turn of monumental proportions, it is now advocating a direct link between examination results and teachers'

Steffan yn erbyn Caerdydd. Mae'n wrthdrawiad diwylliannol rhwng Llafur Newydd a synnwyr cyffredin addysgol. Nid yw'r cynllun hwn yn newyddion drwg i addysg yng Nghymru yn unig; mae yr un mor anaddas i ysgolion yn Lloegr. Ni ddylem ostwng yr anghydfod hwn i lefel gêm rygbi rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, yn enwedig yng ngolwg y canlyniad ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf. Mae'n ymwneud â natur datganoli a'r modd y bydd datganoli'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad deilwra polisi addysg yn ôl anghenion addysgol Cymru.

Yr ail wrthwynebiad sydd gennym i'r cynllun yw ei bod yn fiwrocraidd heb fod angen. Fel y dywedais yn y ddadl fer a gyflwynais ar dâl ar sail perfformiad y llynedd, bydd y cynllun yn hunllef fiwrocraidd. Os edrychir ar y rhestr o bethau sydd gan athro i'w gwneud, gwelwch gynlluniau datblygu ysgol, cynlluniau datblygu gwaith, cynlluniau monitro gwaith, cynlluniau hunanadolygu ac adolygiadau tîm blynyddol. Mae hwn yn faich y byddai'n dda i athrawon hebdo.

Hoffwn weld athrawon mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth yn llenwi bylchau yn addysg ein plant, nid yn llenwi ffurflenni ar gyfer cynllun tâl cynhennus. Buasai'n well arnom i gyd pe bai'r weinyddiaeth wedi penderfynu datganoli'r mater hwn i ysgolion yn hytrach na'u rhoi mewn caethwasgod genedlaethol. Prifathrawon a llywodraethwyr sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i benderfynu sut i wobrwyo athrawon da ac ymarferiadau dysgu da. Efallai na fyddai ychydig o ddatganoli gwirioneddol yn ddrwg o beth. Yn lle hynny, mae gennym agwedd 'un maint i ffitio pawb' na fydd yn bodloni neb.

Yn olaf, yr agwedd fwyaf dadleuol ar y cynllun newydd, sef sylwedd cynnig Plaid Cymru heddiw, yw'r cysylltiad rhwng tâl athrawon a chanlyniadau arholiadau. Yr wyf yn synnu'n fawr mai'r Blaid Lafur a gyflwynodd y cynllun hwn. Wedi'r cwbl, y Blaid Lafur, ychydig flynyddoedd yn unig yn ôl, a oedd yn cwyno ynghylch anghyfiawnderau gwaradwyddus tablau cynghrair arholiadau ysgol. Ar ôl tro pedol anferthol, mae bellach yn dadlau dros gysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng canlyniadau

pay. It is another conversion on the road to Damascus, of which Labour has seen more than a superannuated Syrian long-distance lorry driver.

There are myriad reasons why such a link is both unjust and educationally ineffective. Pupil examination results are the function of a huge variety of factors, including parental support, the quality of primary education, class sizes, having English as a first language and the intrinsic abilities of a particular group of children. All of these factors play a profound role in determining class examination results. Teaching is also a factor, but it is difficult to strip it out of the whole education equation. In short, this scheme will mean unfair results and arbitrary rewards. It will undermine rather than bolster teachers' morale.

The Welsh Conservative Party supports Jenny Randerson's amendment 1. It reflects the clear view of the majority of Pre-16 Education Committee members. The Committee has given considerable time to examining this scheme. However flawed the system might be, we want to ensure that teachers in Wales receive the rewards to which they are entitled. Amendment 1 reflects the Committee's work on this.

The heart of the problem, as other speakers have outlined, is the inconsistency between the initial appraisal and the assessment at the point of the threshold. From July to December 1999, the Assembly Secretary's line was that the appraisal and assessment of teachers were inextricably linked. The position was that the Department for Education and Employment would decide where the pay point would come and the sum that teachers would be paid. There is no dispute that the DfEE still has responsibility for overall pay and conditions.

**Brian Gibbons:** In clarification, as you support Jenny Randerson's amendment 1, are you proposing that, if this policy goes ahead, the Assembly should not pay teachers if they are able to cross the threshold? The Liberal Democrats may want to explain this when they speak again.

arholiad a thâl athrawon. Mae'n dröedigaeth arall ar y ffordd i Ddamascus, y gwelodd Llafur fwy ohonynt na gyrrwr lorri hirdeithiau o Syria sydd wedi ymddeol.

Mae llu o resymau pam y mae cysylltiad o'r fath yn anghyfiawn ac yn addysgol aneffeithiol. Mae canlyniadau arholiadau disgyblion yn ffwythiant i amrywiaeth enfawr o ffactorau, gan gynnwys cefnogaeth rhieni, ansawdd addysg gynradd, meintiau dosbarthiadau, cael Saesneg yn iaith gyntaf a galluoedd cynhenid grŵp penodol o blant. Mae'r holl ffactorau hyn yn chwarae rôl sylfaenol wrth benderfynu canlyniadau arholiadau mewn dosbarthiadau. Mae dysgu hefyd yn ffactor, ond mae'n anodd ei wahanu oddi wrth yr hafaliad addysg cyfan. Yn fyr, bydd y cynllun hwn yn golygu canlyniadau annheg a gwobrwyon mympwyol. Bydd yn tanseilio yn hytrach na hybu morâl athrawon.

Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru'n cefnogi gwelliant 1 Jenny Randerson. Mae'n adlewyrchu barn eglur y mwyafrif o aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi treulio cryn amser yn archwilio'r cynllun hwn. Pa mor ddiffygiol bynnag y bo'r cynllun hwnnw, yr ydym am sicrhau bod athrawon yng Nghymru yn derbyn y gwobrwyon y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt. Mae gwelliant 1 yn adlewyrchu gwaith y Pwyllgor ar hyn.

Craidd y broblem, fel y mae siaradwyr eraill wedi amlinellu, yw'r anghysondeb rhwng y gwerthusiad cychwynnol a'r asesiad ar y pwynt trothwy. O Orffennaf i Ragfyr 1999, safbwynt yr Ysgrifennydd Cynulliad oedd bod cysylltiad annatod rhwng gwerthuso ac asesu athrawon. Y safbwynt oedd y byddai'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn penderfynu ym mhle y deuai'r pwynt tâl a'r swm a delid i athrawon. Ni ddadleuir nad yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth biau'r cyfrifoldeb dros dâl ac amodau cyffredinol o hyd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Er mwyn cael eglurhad, gan eich bod yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 Jenny Randerson, a ydych yn cynnig, os â'r polisi hwn ymlaen, na ddylai'r Cynulliad dalu athrawon os gallant groesi'r trothwy? Efallai y bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am egluro hynny pan siaradant eto.

**Jonathan Morgan:** There is certainly an ambiguity within amendment 1. It seems to suggest at the first instance that the Pre-16 Education Committee could stop the system. My view and that of the Welsh Conservative Party is that, while the amendment is ambiguous, it reflects the Committee's work on this. We recognise that there will be a system of performance management and that teachers will be assessed and rewarded accordingly, regardless of the decision and the discussions both in the Assembly and in Committee. Whatever the system and the outcome, we want to ensure that Welsh teachers do not lose out. I agree that the amendment is ambiguous, but I also think that it was right to be tabled as we need to reflect on the Pre-16 Education Committee's cross-party work on this.

**Brian Gibbons:** It would be helpful to your group if the Liberal Democrats clarified the ambiguity before the end of the debate.

**Jonathan Morgan:** It is not for me to try to clarify an ambiguity within a Liberal Democrat amendment, but I note your point. We want to see a successful outcome. We want teachers to be rewarded for good practice and for their contribution to their schools. Whatever the outcome of the decisions in the Assembly, we realise that a system will be implemented in Wales that will hopefully reflect Welsh needs.

**Jenny Randerson:** In my view, there is not an ambiguity in the amendment. It has been clear to all of us for a long time that there will be a performance management scheme in Wales. All possible steps not to implement it refer to performance being linked to exam results and not to the scheme as a whole, which we all know will be implemented as part of measures that are already undertaken.

**Jonathan Morgan:** There is greater inconsistency and ambiguity when one examines the system of appraisal against that of assessment and it is not wilful misinterpretation by opposition politicians. There was an understanding in good faith, not

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'n sicr bod amwysedd yng ngwelliant 1. Ymddengys ei fod yn awgrymu yn y lle cyntaf y gallai'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 atal y system. Fy marn i a barn Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yw, er bod y gwelliant yn amwys, ei fod yn adlewyrchu gwaith y Pwyllgor ar hyn. Cydnabyddwn y bydd system rheoli perfformiad ac y caiff athrawon eu hasesu a'u gwobrwyo yn unol â hynny, ni waeth am y penderfyniad a'r trafodaethau yn y Cynulliad ac yn y Pwyllgor. Beth bynnag fydd y system a'r canlyniad, yr ydym am sicrhau na fydd athrawon Cymru ar eu colled. Cytunaf fod y gwelliant yn amwys, ond credaf hefyd mai iawn oedd ei gyflwyno gan fod angen inni fyfyrion ynghylch gwaith trawsbleidiol y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ar hyn.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddai o gymorth i'ch grŵp pe bai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhoi gwedd eglurach ar yr amwyster cyn diwedd y ddadl.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid mater i mi yw ceisio rhoi gwedd eglurach ar amwyster mewn gwelliant o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond nodaf eich pwynt. Yr ydym am weld canlyniad llwyddiannus. Yr ydym am i athrawon gael eu gwobrwyo am arfer da ac am eu cyfraniad i'w hysgolion. Beth bynnag fydd canlyniad y penderfyniadau yn y Cynulliad, sylweddolwn y caiff system ei rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru a fydd, gobeithio, yn adlewyrchu anghenion Cymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yn fy marn i, nid oes amwyster yn y gwelliant. Mae'n eglur i bawb ohonom ers talwm y bydd cynllun rheoli perfformiad yng Nghymru. Mae cymryd pob cam posibl i beidio â'i roi ar waith yn cyfeirio at gysylltu perfformiad a chanlyniadau arholiadau ac nid at y cynllun cyfan, a roddir ar waith, fel y gwyddom oll, fel rhan o'r mesurau yr ymgwymerwyd â hwy eisoes.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae mwy o anghysondeb ac amwyster pan edrychir ar y system werthuso ochr yn ochr â'r system asesu ac nid camddehongli bwriadus gan wleidyddion yr wrthblaid mo hynny. Yr oedd dealltwriaeth ddidwyll, nid yn unig gennym

only by us, but also by the teaching unions, journalists and others, that the Assembly would have responsibility when examining the appraisal at the point of threshold.

In December, it was claimed that appraisal and teacher assessment were separate concepts. The Secretary for Education and Children maintained that the Assembly had full responsibility for teacher appraisal but had nothing to do with assessment at the point of threshold. I ask the Secretary to outline the fundamental difference between the appraisal of teachers, when they are assessed on their performance, and the appraisal at the point of threshold, to decide whether individual teachers go through that threshold. To assist the Secretary in her answer, I will tell her that in the Oxford English Dictionary 'assessment' is defined as 'to estimate officially the value of' and 'appraisal' is defined as 'to estimate the amount, quality and excellence of; to assess'. I suggest to the Secretary that this is a distinction without a difference. No matter what lexicographical sleight of hand the Secretary uses, it does not obscure the fact that a power hitherto exercised in Wales is being repatriated to New Labour at Westminster. Something that was once the Welsh Office's and the Assembly's responsibility has been handed back to London.

That confusion must be cleared up, which is why the Pre-16 Education Committee has asked for independent legal advice from the Office of the Presiding Officer so that the Assembly can have a clear, definitive statement on its legal responsibilities in this area. If the scheme is imposed against the Assembly's will, then we will have to ask serious questions about why we are expected to cough up the cash to fund the scheme in the first place. We have all heard the old maxim: no taxation without representation. Perhaps we should consider the flip side of the coin: there should be no expenditure without representation. Why should the Assembly use its scarce resources to bankroll a scheme that it had no role in deciding? We should consider those fundamental questions in the long term.

In closing, I will restate my opposition to the

ni, ond hefyd gan undebau'r athrawon, newyddiadurwyr ac eraill, y byddai gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb wrth ystyried gwerthuso ar y pwynt trothwy.

Yn Rhagfyr, honnwyd bod gwerthuso ac asesu athrawon yn gysyniadau gwahanol. Dadleuodd yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant fod gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb llawn dros werthuso athrawon ond nad oedd a wnelo ef ddim ag asesu ar y pwynt trothwy. Gofynnaf i'r Ysgrifennydd amlinellu'r gwahaniaeth sylfaenol rhwng gwerthuso athrawon, pan asesir hwy ar eu perfformiad, a gwerthuso ar y pwynt trothwy, i benderfynu a fydd athrawon unigol yn mynd dros y trothwy hwnnw. Er mwyn cynorthwyo'r Ysgrifennydd â'i hateb, dywedaf wrthi mai diffiniad Geiriadur Saesneg Rhydychen o 'asesu' yw 'bwrw amcan yn swyddogol o werth' ac mai'r diffiniad o 'gwerthuso' yw 'bwrw amcan o faint, ansawdd a rhagoriaeth; asesu'. Awgrymaf i'r Ysgrifennydd mai gwahaniaethu lle nad oes gwahaniaeth yw hyn. Ni waeth pa gyfrwystra geiriadurol a arferar Ysgrifennydd, nid yw'n celu'r ffaith fod y pŵer a arferid hyd hynny yng Nghymru yn cael ei roi'n ôl i Lafur Newydd yn San Steffan. Mae rhywbeth oedd unwaith yn gyfrifoldeb i'r Swyddfa Gymreig a'r Cynulliad wedi ei drosglwyddo'n ôl i Lundain.

Rhaid datrys y dryswch hwnnw, a dyna pam y mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 wedi gofyn am gyngor cyfreithiol annibynnol oddi wrth Swyddfa'r Llywydd fel y gall y Cynulliad gael datganiad terfynol, pendant ar ei gyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol yn y maes hwn. Os gorfodir y cynllun yn groes i ewyllys y Cynulliad, bydd yn rhaid inni wedyn ofyn cwestiynau difrifol ynghylch pam y disgwylir inni ddod o hyd i'r arian i gyllido'r cynllun yn y lle cyntaf. Yr ydym oll wedi clywed yr hen air: dim trethiant heb gynrychiolaeth. Efallai y dylem ystyried ochr arall y geiniog: ni ddylid cael gwariant heb gynrychiolaeth. Pam y dylai'r Cynulliad ddefnyddio ei adnoddau prin i dalu am gynllun na chafodd ran yn ei benderfynu? Dylem ystyried y cwestiynau sylfaenol hynny yn y tymor hir.

I gloi, ailddatganaf fy ngwrthwynebiad i

Administration's plan regarding performance-related pay where pay is linked to pupil examination performance. The means by which teachers will pass through the thresholds will be divisive and educationally ineffective. We have missed an opportunity to build a performance-management framework for teachers that commands the respect of the profession and that conforms to the needs of pupils. I urge all Assembly Members to support the motion and the amendment as tabled by the Liberal Democrats.

**John Marek:** We have heard speeches from my colleagues on the Pre-16 Education Committee and I agree with everything that they have said. I may be forgiven if I ask to be distanced slightly from Jonathan's remarks on New Labour but that does not mean that I want to be associated with New Labour either. We have heard measured and considered speeches and I hope to make another one.

There is a consensus in this Assembly on the way forward and I believe that the Government of Wales will agree with and be a part of that consensus, if we can find a way to achieve the desired result. I pay tribute to Rosemary because she has gone a long way and has leant over backwards to achieve success for us on the employment of assessors. As a Committee we will take legal advice. I do not know whether we can do so from your office, Presiding Officer, but we will have to take it from somewhere. I read Jenny's amendment to mean that she objects to the appraisal of teachers in order to have the money concerned and not that we should not have the scheme at all. Let me be clear. I do not want to repeat what has been said before. I want to make a short speech, because I know that many other people want to contribute. Nobody wants teachers to forego the extra money. There is no way that any of us on the Committee—and I do not believe that anybody here in the Assembly—would be prepared to withhold that money because of lack of agreement between ourselves and the Department for Education and Employment. Nobody on the Committee, as far as I am aware, is against measuring whether or not teachers pass the threshold by measuring their performance.

gynllun y Weinyddiaeth mewn perthynas â thâl ar sail perfformiad lle y cysylltir tâl â pherfformiad yn arholiadau'r disgyblion. Bydd y dull o groesi'r trothwy gan athrawon yn gynhennus ac yn addysgol aneffeithiol. Yr ydym wedi colli cyfle i lunio fframwaith rheoli perfformiad ar gyfer athrawon sydd yn ennyn parch gan y proffesiwn ac yn cydymffurfio ag anghenion y disgyblion. Anogaf holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliant fel y'i cyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**John Marek:** Clywsom areithiau gan fy nghyd-aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 a chytunaf â phopeth a ddywedasant. Efallai y maddeuir i mi os gofynnaf am gael fy ngwahanu ryw ychydig oddi wrth sylwadau Jonathan ar Lafur Newydd ond nid yw hynny'n golygu fy mod am gael fy nghysylltu â Llafur Newydd ychwaith. Clywsom areithiau cytbwys ac ystyriol a gobeithiaf wneud un arall.

Mae consensws yn y Cynulliad hwn ar y ffordd ymlaen a chredaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cytuno â'r consensws hwnnw ac yn dod yn rhan ohono, os gallwn ganfod ffordd i gyrraedd y canlyniad a ddymunir. Talaf deyrnged i Rosemary oherwydd aeth yn bell iawn a phlygu wysg ei chefn i sicrhau llwyddiant i ni ar gyflogi aseswyr. Fel Pwyllgor byddwn yn derbyn cyngor cyfreithiol. Ni wn a allwn ei gael o'ch swyddfa chi, Lywydd, ond bydd yn rhaid inni ei gael o rywle. Yr ystyr a welais yng ngwelliant Jenny oedd ei bod yn gwrthwynebu gwerthuso athrawon er mwyn iddynt gael yr arian dan sylw ac nid na ddylem gael y cynllun o gwbl. Gadewch imi ddweud yn bendant. Nid wyf am ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedwyd cynt. Yr wyf am wneud araith fer, oherwydd gwn fod llawer o bobl eraill am gyfrannu. Nid oes neb am i athrawon fynd heb yr arian ychwanegol. Ni fyddai'r un ohonom ar y Pwyllgor—ac ni chredaf fod neb yma yn y Cynulliad—yn barod i atal yr arian hwnnw oherwydd diffyg cytundeb rhyngom ni a'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth. Nid oes neb ar y Pwyllgor, hyd y gwn i, yn erbyn mesur a yw athrawon yn croesi'r trothwy drwy fesur eu perfformiad ai peidio.

3:30 p.m.

Performance must be involved and the new money will be awarded on the basis of a performance management scheme. It will be performance-related pay. There is no argument about that. It is promotion. It is money to encourage teachers to stay in the classroom. The problem is that the Education (No. 2) Act 1986 was devolved, which gives the Assembly powers to appraise and assess—although it uses the word ‘appraise’—but the School Teachers’ Pay and Conditions Act 1991, which sets the pay and conditions of teachers, has not been devolved. Therefore, we accept that the threshold is something to be set by the DfEE, but believe that the question of whether an individual teacher attains that threshold is a matter for the Assembly.

There is an argument about that. I believe that Rosemary has changed her view on this, or the advice she has received from civil servants has changed in the last two weeks, but there is an argument about whether or not this is a right interpretation. We shall see. If we can get legal evidence to support what the Committee wants, I hope that it will provide Rosemary with ammunition in her argument with the DfEE.

Looking through previous circulars—the most recent one is the ‘School Teachers’ Pay and Conditions Document 1999’—there is no use of detailed powers where the department lays down explicit criteria on what teachers should receive if they reach this point or that point of the pay spine.

I believe that David Blunkett is using circulars unusually, if he uses them to define this explicitly and includes pupil results as part of the content. We must wait and see as to whether or not that leads to a judicial review.

We do not like and do not want pupil results to be part of appraisals. It is divisive. It will set teacher against teacher. It will make teachers teach to the minimum and teach the minimum necessary from the curriculum, knowing that their promotion depends on results. As Jenny said, if you are in a good

Rhaid cael cysylltiad â pherfformiad a dyfernir yr arian newydd ar sail cynllun rheoli perfformiad. Bydd yn dâl ar sail perfformiad. Nid oes dadl ynghylch hynny. Dyrchafiad ydyw. Mae’n arian i annog athrawon i aros yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Y broblem yw bod y Ddeddf Addysg (Rhif 2) 1986 wedi ei datganoli, sydd yn rhoi pwerau i’r Cynulliad werthuso ac asesu—er ei bod yn defnyddio’r gair ‘gwerthuso’—ond na ddatganolwyd y Ddeddf Tâl ac Amodau Athrawon 1991, sydd yn pennu tâl ac amodau athrawon. Felly, derbyniwn fod y trothwy yn rhywbeth sydd i’w osod gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth, ond credwn fod y cwestiwn o ba un a yw athro unigol yn cyrraedd y trothwy hwnnw ai peidio yn fater i’r Cynulliad.

Mae dadl ynghylch hynny. Credaf fod Rosemary wedi newid ei barn ar hyn, neu fod y cyngor a dderbyniodd gan weision sifil wedi newid yn y pythefnos diwethaf, ond mae dadl ynghylch ai hwn yw’r dehongliad cywir ai peidio. Cawn weld. Os gallwn gael cyngor cyfreithiol i gefnogi’r hyn y mae’r Pwyllgor am ei gael, gobeithiaf y bydd hynny’n rhoi bwledi i Rosemary yn ei dadl â’r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth.

O edrych drwy’r cylchlythyrau blaenorol—y diweddaraf yw ‘Dogfen Tâl ac Amodau Athrawon Ysgol 1999’—nid oes defnydd o bwerau manwl lle y mae’r adran yn gosod meini prawf pendant ynghylch yr hyn y dylai athrawon ei dderbyn os cyrhaeddant y pwynt hwn neu’r pwynt arall ar y raddfa tâl.

Credaf fod David Blunkett yn defnyddio cylchlythyrau mewn modd anarferol, os defnyddia hwy i ddiffinio hyn yn bendant a chynnwys canlyniadau disgyblion yn rhan ohonynt. Rhaid inni ddisgwyl i weld a fydd hynny’n arwain at ddyfarniad barnwrol.

Nid ydym yn hoffi nac yn dymuno i ganlyniadau disgyblion fod yn rhan o werthusiadau. Mae’n peri cynnen. Bydd yn codi athro yn erbyn athro. Bydd yn peri i athrawon ddysgu i’r graddau lleiaf posibl a dysgu’r lleiaf sydd yn angenrheidiol o’r cwricwlwm, gan wybod bod eu dyrchafiad yn

school, you will have a better chance of reaching that threshold than if you are in a bad school.

We have no objection if teachers themselves want to include exam results as part of their appraisal for passing the threshold. However, it should not be mandatory, because it is unnecessary and unfair—depending on the school, whether or not there are statemented children in the school and many other factors. The Government of Wales is not against this, if we can find a way forward. I do not believe that there are more than a handful of Members who are against the spirit of these proposals before us this afternoon. I hope that if they are passed it will give power to Rosemary's elbow in her negotiations with the department in Westminster.

**Pauline Jarman:** We are all proud that, through the Assembly, Wales has finally begun to develop its distinctive national education service. We have a national curriculum for Wales, which the Assembly proudly passed this year. Last week, Estyn published its latest report. Estyn represents how Wales has developed its distinctive inspection system, which recognises its needs.

We now appear to be taking a step back. If it is the case that teachers in Wales must, against their will, have their pay determined by pupil results, because of decisions made in London, is it fair that they have had no voice in this matter? The consultation assessment was based firmly on the needs of England with scarcely any thought for the needs of Wales. The Hay/McBear consultants employed to research into the characteristics of effective teaching did not set foot inside a school in Wales. Ofsted was consulted, but Estyn was not. School governors in England were consulted, but those in Wales were not. The National Union of Teachers in London was consulted, but the one in Wales was not. If this is a matter that crosses England and Wales, it is a disgrace that those concerned with education in Wales were not consulted. It begs the question: what steps have really been taken towards devolution?

dibynnu ar ganlyniadau. Fel y dywedodd Jenny, os ydych mewn ysgol dda, bydd gennych well cyfle i gyrraedd y trothwy hwnnw na phe baech mewn ysgol wael.

Nid oes gennym wrthwynebiad os yw'r athrawon eu hunain am gynnwys canlyniadau arholiadau'n rhan o'u gwerthusiad ar gyfer croesi'r trothwy. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai fod yn orfodol, oherwydd mae'n ddiangen ac yn annheg—mae'n dibynnu ar yr ysgol, pa un a oes plant â datganiad yn yr ysgol ai peidio a llawer o ffactorau eraill. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn erbyn hyn, os gallwn ganfod ffordd ymlaen. Ni chredaf fod mwy na llond llaw o Aelodau sydd yn erbyn ysbryd y cynigion hyn sydd ger ein bron y prynhawn yma. Gobeithiaf, os derbynnir hwy, y byddant yn rhoi hwb i Rosemary yn ei negodiadau â'r adran yn San Steffan.

**Pauline Jarman:** Yr ydym oll yn falch bod Cymru, drwy'r Cynulliad, wedi dechrau o'r diwedd ar ddatblygu ei gwasanaeth addysg cenedlaethol nodweddiadol ei hun. Mae gennym gwricwlwm cenedlaethol i Gymru, yr oedd y Cynulliad yn falch o'i basio eleni. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Estyn ei adroddiad diweddaraf. Mae Estyn yn dangos sut y mae Cymru wedi datblygu ei system arolygu nodweddiadol ei hun, sydd yn cydnabod ei hanghenion.

Ymddengys bellach ein bod yn cymryd cam yn ôl. Os yw'n wir bod athrawon yng Nghymru, yn erbyn eu hewyllys, yn gorfod derbyn pennu eu tâl yn ôl canlyniadau disgyblion, oherwydd penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd yn Llundain, a yw'n deg na chawsant lais yn y mater? Yr oedd asesiad yr ymgynghoriad wedi ei seilio'n gadarn ar anghenion Lloegr heb unrhyw feddwl bron am anghenion Cymru. Ni ddaeth ymgynghorwyr Hay/McBear a gyflogwyd i ymchwilio i nodweddion dysgu effeithiol ar gyfyl ysgol yng Nghymru. Ymgynghorwyd ag Ofsted, ond nid ag Estyn. Ymgynghorwyd â llywodraethwyr ysgol yn Lloegr, ond nid y rhai yng Nghymru. Ymgynghorwyd ag Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon yn Llundain, ond nid yr un yng Nghymru. Os yw hyn yn fater sydd yn mynd ar draws Cymru a Lloegr, mae'n warth nad ymgynghorwyd â'r rhai sydd yn gysylltiedig ag addysg yng Nghymru. Mae'n arwain at y



cwestiwn: pa gamau a gymerwyd mewn gwirionedd tuag at ddatganoli?

I sum up, Presiding Officer, by addressing what this means to social inclusion. We know that there is no support for relating pupil performance to teachers' pay in Wales. There are many reasons for this, which have been rehearsed by other Members. However, my concern is for socially deprived areas, especially in the south Wales Valleys. There are problems when the best teachers are sucked away from teaching pupils with the greatest need. It is widely acknowledged that the teacher is only one factor in determining a child's results. Economic status, family life, peer group and societal expectations are some of the issues which have a role to play. It is entirely irresponsible to ignore this when setting criteria for determining teachers' pay.

With Objective 1 status being designated to west Wales and the Valleys, this is an important point for Wales. Promoting social inclusion must lie at the heart of policies for Wales. Education can play this most vital role. We must encourage good recruits into the teaching profession and encourage them to stay there. Rewards should be given on the grounds of professional development and input into the classroom. Putting ever increasing pressures on good teachers frightens them away from the profession with a misplaced zero tolerance mentality, which Gareth outlined, and will ultimately be to the detriment of education in Wales.

**Huw Lewis:** Given the run of the debate so far, I am glad that you have called me to speak, Llywydd. John Marek is wrong to perceive a consensus across the Pre-16 Education Committee and across the Assembly in terms of this issue. I do not share the consensus that has emerged from the speakers so far.

I start from a different point of origin. That is, not the teaching profession per se. I do not set off this debate worrying about what is best for the teaching profession, although I am concerned about that, but I begin with what is best for the pupils in schools in Wales—the life chances of our children. The

Cryrhoaf, Lywydd, drwy ymdrin â'r cysylltiad rhwng hyn a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Gwyddom nad oes cefnogaeth i gysylltu perfformiad disgyblion â thâl athrawon yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o resymau am hynny, a adroddwyd gan Aelodau eraill. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf am ardaloedd cymdeithasol ddifreintiedig, yn enwedig yng Nghymoedd de Cymru. Mae problemau pan dynnir yr athrawon gorau oddi wrth ddysgu'r disgyblion mwyaf anghenus. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol mai ond un ffactor yw'r athro wrth benderfynu canlyniadau plentyn. Statws economaidd, bywyd teuluol, y grŵp cyfoedion a disgwyliadau cymdeithasol yw rhai o'r materion sydd â rhan i'w chwarae. Cwbl anghyfrifol yw anwybyddu hyn wrth osod meini prawf i bennu tâl athrawon.

Gyda dynodi statws Amcan 1 i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, mae hyn yn bwynt pwysig i Gymru. Rhaid i'r bwriad i hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol fod yn ganolog i bolisiau ar gyfer Cymru. Gall addysg chwarae'r rôl dra phwysig hon. Rhaid inni annog rhai da i ddod yn athrawon a'u hannog i aros. Dylid gwobrwyo ar sail datblygiad proffesiynol a mewnbwn i'r ystafell ddosbarth. Mae rhoi pwysau cynyddol ar athrawon da yn eu dychryn ymaith o'r proffesiwn gyda meddylfryd goddefiant sero cyfeiliornus, a amlinellwyd gan Gareth, a bydd hynny yn y pen draw er afles i addysg yng Nghymru.

**Huw Lewis:** Yng ngolwg rhediad y ddadl hyd yn hyn, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi galw arnaf i siarad, Lywydd. Mae John Marek yn anghywir wrth weld consensws ar draws y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 ac ar draws y Cynulliad o ran y mater hwn. Ni rannaf y consensws a ddaeth i'r amlwg ymysg y siaradwyr hyd yn hyn.

Dechreuaf o fan cychwyn gwahanol. Hynny yw, nid y proffesiwn dysgu fel y cyfryw. Ni ddechreuaf yn y ddadl hon drwy ymboeni am yr hyn sydd orau i'r proffesiwn dysgu, er fy mod yn pryderu ynghylch hynny, ond dechreuaf â'r hyn sydd orau i'r disgyblion mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru—cyfleoedd

point of teaching is to change for the better the life chances of our children. To remove the child, in terms of assessing the performance of classroom teachers, which is what all the speakers so far have done, is to take the centre away from the equation. It destroys the whole house of cards and collapses in on itself. It is to deny our duty of care to pupils and parents across Wales. I accept that pupil progress—

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We do not have much time. I must call Rosemary Butler in about three minutes.

**Nick Bourne:** This is important.

**The Presiding Officer:** All issues are equally important in this Chamber.

**Huw Lewis:** I accept that pupil progress is not equivalent to exam results. I have made that argument in committee. The option of taking on board exam results should be retained because we have thousands of talented teachers who would want us to take into account the fact that they have an aptitude for drawing out the best in children through examination. There is nothing wrong with that. We must also accept that a huge proportion of the population of pupils in our schools rely on exam results for their main life chances. Ninety per cent of the people sitting in this room have got where they are through succeeding at examination. I am talking about those pupils who are probably in the majority.

**Alun Cairns:** What about the 10 per cent?

**Michael German:** Chwarae teg i David Davies.

3:40 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** I will make a point about you, David, later on.

Because of the type of constituency I represent, I reject this woolly-headed nonsense. For decades, the main route of escape from social exclusion and poverty in a constituency like mine has been through

bywyd ein plant. Diben dysgu yw newid er gwell gyfleoedd bywyd ein plant. Wrth ddileu'r plentyn, o ran asesu perfformiad athrawon ystafell ddosbarth, sef yr hyn a wnaeth yr holl siaradwyr hyd yn hyn, tynnir y canol o'r hafaliad. Mae'n dinistrio'r tŷ cardiau cyfan ac mae'n dymchwel. Golyga ymwadu â'n dyletswydd o ofal i ddisgyblion a rhieni ledled Cymru. Derbyniaf nad yw cynnydd disgyblion—

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes gennym lawer o amser. Rhaid imi alw ar Rosemary Butler ymhen tua thri munud.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hyn yn bwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae pob mater o'r un pwys yn y Siambr hon.

**Huw Lewis:** Derbyniaf nad yw cynnydd disgyblion yn gyfystyr â chanlyniadau arholiad. Dadleuais felly yn y Pwyllgor. Dylid cadw'r dewis o gynnwys canlyniadau arholiadau oherwydd mae gennym filoedd o athrawon talentog a fyddai am inni gymryd i ystyriaeth y ffaith fod ganddynt y gallu i ennyn y gorau o blant drwy eu harholi. Nid oes dim o'i le ar hynny. Rhaid inni dderbyn hefyd fod cyfran anferth o'r boblogaeth o ddisgyblion yn ein hysgolion yn dibynnu ar ganlyniadau arholiad am eu prif gyfleoedd bywyd. Mae 90 y cant o'r bobl sydd yn eistedd yn yr ystafell hon wedi cyrraedd yma drwy lwyddo mewn arholiadau. Yr wyf yn sôn am y disgyblion hynny sydd yn y mwyafrif yn ôl pob tebyg.

**Alun Cairns:** Beth am y 10 y cant?

**Michael German:** Fair play to David Davies.

**Huw Lewis:** Fe wnaif bwynt amdanoch chi'n ddiweddarach, David.

Oherwydd y math o etholaeth a gynrychiolaf, gwrthodaf y nonsens niwlog hwn. Ers degawdau, y brif ddihangfa o allgáu cymdeithasol a thlodi mewn etholaeth fel fy un i yw drwy arholiadau. Efallai nad yw

examinations. That may not be pretty, but it is the situation we face. I am not going to sit here while people suggest that we should deny that reality and thereby disadvantage our children. The Pre-16 Education Committee has continually run away from the debate about how we could face a distinctive Welsh option in measuring teachers' performance. We could have had a debate about other distinctively Welsh options that were not tied slavishly to exam results. My suggestions were the cultural and social capital of our children, for instance. These were comprehensively rejected in the first phase of kow-towing to the latest National Union of Teachers press release. That is unacceptable and an abdication of responsibility. If this motion, particularly as amended, is passed, there is nothing ambiguous in it. It follows in the footsteps of John Redwood and suggests that the Assembly campaigns to send millions of pounds back to the Treasury which could have been in the pockets of Welsh teachers. That is effectively what the amendment says.

Llywydd, I address these final sentences to you. I am concerned that we should get into a situation where the Assembly is used too often to debate issues for which we have no responsibility. That leads us into political grandstanding of the worst sort, what the Militant Tendency used to affectionately call the transitional demand. It is easy to put to this body an amendment over which we have no powers—which by its nature entails that the Government of Wales will fail—and then to put out a press release saying that the Government of Wales has betrayed the Welsh people. That is unacceptable, disingenuous and dishonest because it does not address the competence of this body. That is a difficult matter for you, Llywydd, to steer through but I hope you will take that on board. Finally, I appeal to Members to put, just once, the child at the centre of your thoughts.

**Rosemary Butler:** It has been an interesting debate and it is obvious that every Member, certainly all the ones that have spoken, are committed to ensuring that we get the best education possible for the children in Wales. There is a slight variation in how we achieve

hynny'n beth tlws, ond hon yw'r sefyllfa a wynebwn. Nid wyf am eistedd yma tra bo pobl yn awgrymu y dylem wadu'r gwirionedd hwnnw a thrwy hynny roi ein plant dan anfantais. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 wedi rhedeg i ffwrdd yn barhaus oddi wrth y ddadl ynghylch sut y gallem wynebu dewis Cymreig arbennig wrth fesur perfformiad athrawon. Gallasem fod wedi cael dadl am ddewisiadau Cymreig arbennig eraill nad oeddent ynghlwm yn wasaidd â chanlyniadau arholiadau. Fy awgrymiadau i oedd cyfalaf diwylliannol a chymdeithasol ein plant, er enghraifft. Gwrthodwyd y rhain yn llwyr yn y cyfnod cyntaf o foesyngrymu i'r datganiad diweddaraf i'r wasg gan Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol ac yn ymwadu â chyfrifoldeb. Os derbynnir y cynnig hwn, yn enwedig gyda'r gwelliant, nid oes dim amwys yn ei gylch. Mae'n dilyn yn ôl traed John Redwood ac yn awgrymu y dylai'r Cynulliad ymgyrchu i anfon miliynau o bunnoedd yn ôl i'r Trysorlys a allasai fod ym mhocedi athrawon Cymru. Dyna a ddywed y gwelliant i bob pwrpas.

Lywydd, cyfeiriraf y brawddegau olaf hyn atoch chi. Pryderaf y gallem fynd i sefyllfa lle y defnyddir y Cynulliad yn rhy aml i drafod materion nad oes gennym gyfrifoldeb drostynt. Mae hynny'n ein harwain at ymagweddu gwleidyddol o'r math gwaethaf, sef yr hyn a alwai'r Tueddiad Milwriaethus yn hoffus yn hawliad trosiannol. Hawdd yw cyflwyno gwelliant i'r corff hwn nad oes gennym bwerau yn ei gylch—sydd o'i hanfod yn golygu y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n methu—ac wedyn cyhoeddi datganiad i'r wasg yn dweud bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bradychu pobl Cymru. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol, yn ddichellgar ac yn anonest oherwydd nid yw'n ymwneud â gallu'r corff hwn. Mae hynny'n fater anodd ichi ei lywio, Lywydd, ond gobeithiaf y byddwch yn nodi hynny. Yn olaf, erfyniaf ar yr Aelodau i roi'r plentyn, am unwaith, yng nghanol eich meddyliau.

**Rosemary Butler:** Bu hon yn ddadl ddiddorol ac mae'n amlwg bod pob Aelod, pawb a siaradodd yn sicr, wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y cawn yr addysg orau bosibl i blant yng Nghymru. Mae mymryn o wahaniaeth yn y modd y cyflawnwn hynny. Gwnaf ddau

that. I will make two points before I address the motion. To explain to the non-anoraks—that was a good way of describing the Pre-16 Education Committee; I have thought of other things in the past, but anorak will do for today—that performance management is an ongoing system of continual professional development of teachers, ensuring that progress is continual within the school and that it is ongoing for every school in Wales. The threshold is a paypoint for allowing access to the new higher pay scales.

This motion rests on a fundamentally false premise. Despite what the motion suggests, it is not the plan that teachers should be paid simply on the basis of pupil performance. We are determined to ensure that teachers who choose to stay in the classroom can be paid more. The amendment to the motion is also seriously flawed and, although Jenny tried to explain it, what she says she wanted to say is not what is before us today. This suggests that there is some role for the Assembly to play in teachers' pay when the legal position is that we do not have a role. That is important. It invites the Assembly to frustrate the intentions of a competent authority responsible for the matter. I regard this as wrong and potentially unlawful. The idea behind this motion may seem superficially attractive to some people, but it would damage the standing of Welsh education, both here and in the wider world.

Let me tell you about my vision for education in Wales. I want to see Wales recognised as an outstanding place in which to learn. I am passionately committed to working in partnership with schools and enabling teachers to develop their capabilities and to sustain genuinely high standards. I want to see good teachers properly rewarded for their work. If we do this we will make a huge contribution to rebuilding the profile of the profession in the public mind, attracting and retaining dedicated and remarkable people and providing fulfilling careers. I want to keep good teachers in the classroom. Paying them more is a good way to achieve this.

I want all this because teachers make a difference to the life chances of every

bwynt cyn imi droi at y cynnig. Er mwyn egluro i'r rhai di-anorac—yr oedd hynny'n ddisgrifiad da o'r Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16; meddyliais am bethau eraill yn y gorffennol, ond gwna anorac y tro am heddiw—mae rheoli perfformiad yn system gyfredol o ddatblygu proffesiynol parhaus i athrawon, er mwyn sicrhau cynnydd parhaus oddi mewn i'r ysgol a bod hynny'n parhau ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru. Mae'r trothwy'n bwynt tâl sydd yn caniatáu mynediad i'r graddfeydd tâl uwch newydd.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn seiliedig ar ragosodiad sylfaenol anghywir. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a awgryma'r cynnig, nid y bwriad yw talu athrawon ar sail perfformiad disgyblion yn unig. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau y gellir talu mwy i athrawon sydd yn dewis aros yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae diffyg difrifol yn y gwelliant i'r cynnig hefyd ac, er i Jenny geisio ei egluro, nid yr hyn y dywed ei bod am ei ddweud sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Mae hyn yn awgrymu bod rhyw rôl i'r Cynulliad yn nhâl athrawon tra nad oes gennym rôl o safbwynt cyfreithiol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n gwahodd y Cynulliad i lesteirio bwriadau awdurdod cymwys sydd yn gyfrifol am y mater. Ystyriaf hyn yn anghywir ac o bosibl yn anghyfreithlon. Efallai fod y syniad sydd y tu ôl i'r cynnig hwn yn ymddangos yn ddeniadol ar y wyneb i rai pobl, ond byddai'n niweidio statws addysg Cymru, yma ac yn y byd y tu allan.

Gadewch imi ddweud wrthyich am fy ngweledigaeth ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am weld cydnabod Cymru'n lle eithriadol i ddysgu. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo'n angerddol i weithio mewn partneriaeth ag ysgolion a galluogi athrawon i ddatblygu eu galluoedd a chynnal safonau gwirioneddol uchel. Yr wyf am weld athrawon da'n cael eu gwobrwyo'n briodol am eu gwaith. Os gwnawn hyn byddwn yn gwneud cyfraniad aruthrol i ailgodi proffil y proffesiwn ym meddwl y cyhoedd, denu a chadw pobl ymroddedig a nodedig a darparu gyrfaoedd boddhaus. Yr wyf am gadw athrawon da yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae talu mwy iddynt yn ffordd dda o gyflawni hynny.

Mae arnaf eisiau gwneud hyn i gyd am fod athrawon yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i

schoolchild in Wales. What is the point of teaching if it is not to improve learning? I have not met one good teacher who does not speak of the overwhelming satisfaction in the tangible improvements in pupil learning that their efforts bring. Good teachers constantly examine what they are achieving for the children and young people that the profession exists to serve. They are not afraid to face up to the outcomes of their work. They know that they make a difference.

Let us look at what the Department for Education and Employment proposes to introduce. The purpose of the scheme is to reward good teachers and to allow them to stay in the classroom. At present, once a teacher has reached scale-point 9, they must take on responsibilities outside the classroom in order to get more money—heading off into management, away from the children to whose lives they have been making a difference. From the debate, and from media coverage, it would appear that teachers will be paid solely by exam results under this scheme. That is not the case.

I wish to correct three misapprehensions, which have almost developed into three myths. First, the DfEE proposals will not be imposed on teachers. Teachers who wish to take advantage of the scheme will do so if they, and they alone, choose. If they want to stay with the current system, they can. What is proposed is the introduction of a new pay range that will enable good teachers to achieve significantly higher salaries regardless of the social and economic context of their work setting.

Second, pupil progress alone will not determine the outcome of a threshold assessment. When head teachers review applications to cross the threshold to the new pay range, they will have to consider the application in the context of the teacher's work as a whole. That means, as well as looking at pupil progress, that they will have to give equal weight to four other areas: teachers' knowledge and understanding of their subjects, their general approach to teaching, their wider professional

gyfleoedd bywyd pob plentyn ysgol yng Nghymru. Beth yw diben addysgu heblaw gwella dysgu? Ni chyfarfûm â'r un athro da nad yw'n sôn am y boddhad aruthrol a gaiff drwy'r gwelliannau gweladwy yn y dysgu gan ddisgyblion a geir drwy ei ymdrechion. Mae athrawon da'n edrych o hyd ar yr hyn y maent yn ei gyflawni ar gyfer y plant a'r bobl ifanc y mae'r proffesiwn yn bod i'w gwasanaethu. Nid oes arnynt ofn wynebu canlyniadau eu gwaith. Gwyddant eu bod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

Gadewch inni edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn bwriadu ei gyflwyno. Pwrpas y cynllun yw gwobrwyo athrawon da a chaniatáu iddynt aros yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Ar hyn o bryd, ar ôl i athro gyrraedd pwynt 9 ar y raddfa, mae'n gorfod ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau y tu allan i'r ystafell ddosbarth er mwyn cael mwy o arian—gan fynd i gyfeiriad rheoli, oddi wrth y plant y bu'n gwneud gwahaniaeth yn eu bywyd. A barnu o'r ddadl, ac o'r sylw yn y cyfryngau, gallech gredu y bydd athrawon yn cael eu talu yn ôl canlyniadau arholiad yn unig o dan y cynllun hwn. Nid yw hynny'n wir.

Dymunaf gywiro tri chamsyniad, sydd bron wedi datblygu'n dri myth. Yn gyntaf, ni orfodir cynigion yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth ar athrawon. Bydd athrawon sydd yn dymuno manteisio ar y cynllun yn gwneud hynny os dewisant hwy, a hwy'n unig. Os ydynt am aros gyda'r system bresennol, gallant wneud hynny. Yr hyn a gynigir yw cyflwyno amrediad tâl newydd a fydd yn galluogi athrawon da i gyrraedd cyflogau uwch o lawer beth bynnag fo cyd-destun cymdeithasol ac economaidd eu lleoliad gwaith.

Yn ail, nid cynnydd disgyblion ar ei ben ei hun fydd yn pennu canlyniad asesiad trothwy. Pan yw prifathrawon yn adolygu ceisiadau i groesi'r trothwy i'r amrediad tâl newydd, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ystyried y cais yng nghyd-destun gwaith yr athro yn ei gyfanrwydd. Golyga hynny, yn ogystal ag edrych ar gynnydd disgyblion, y bydd yn rhaid iddynt roi'r un pwys ar bedwar maes arall: gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth yr athrawon o'u pynciau, eu hymagwedd gyffredinol at ddysgu, eu heffeithiolrwydd

effectiveness and their strength in motivating pupils and building their confidence.

Third, the standard on pupil progress does not require teachers to meet an arbitrarily imposed set of quantitative targets unrelated to setting, subject, or differences year by year in pupil cohorts. There are real safeguards in the system that ensure that pupil progress, when considered, must be related to pupils' prior attainment. In short, how the pupil was doing before they came into contact with the teacher being assessed. The threshold assessment will be looking for the difference that the teacher has made to a set of pupils based on where they started.

I am grateful for the kind words that have been said about me. I would like you to know that I have worked hard to persuade the DfEE to use local education authorities in Wales in the conduct of these assessments. This means that they will be conducted rigorously but also with the greatest sensitivity.

Let us take a look at the proposals in the pay-scheme, as there has been some confusion this afternoon. The pay-scheme designed by the DfEE will be part of the terms and conditions of service that apply to all teachers in Wales and England. Its common standards are a necessary element of a system that is common to both countries. Some want it both ways—they want pay and conditions to be common except when it is not in their interest. When it comes to threshold assessment and access to the new pay range, common standards of fairness and consistency, in Wales and England, will benefit Welsh teachers.

Some Members feel that the appraisal system that currently operates for all teachers means that a separate assessment system for access to the new pay-scheme is unnecessary. But the appraisal system is designed for a different purpose. We need common standards. Standards that include pupil progress in one country but not the other could not be regarded as comparable or

proffesiynol ehangach a'u cryfder wrth ysgogi disgyblion a magu eu hyder.

Yn drydydd, nid yw'r safon ar gynnydd disgyblion yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i athrawon gyflawni set o dargedau meintiol a osodir yn fympwyol a heb gysylltiad â'r lleoliad, y pwnc, neu wahaniaethau fesul blwyddyn yng ngharfanau'r disgyblion. Mae amddiffyniadau gwirioneddol yn y system i sicrhau bod cynnydd disgyblion, pan ystyrir ef, yn cael ei gymharu â chyflawniad blaenorol y disgyblion. Yn fyr, sut yr oedd y disgybl yn gwneud cyn dod i gysylltiad â'r athro a asesir. Bydd yr asesiad trothwy'n chwilio am y gwahaniaeth a wnaeth yr athro ymysg set o ddisgyblion ar sail eu man cychwyn.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y geiriau caredig a ddywedwyd amdanaf. Hoffwn ichi gael gwybod fy mod wedi gweithio'n galed i berswadio'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth i ddefnyddio awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru wrth gynnal yr asesiadau hyn. Golyga hynny y byddant yn cael eu cynnal yn drwyadl ond gyda'r sensitifrwydd mwyaf.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y cynigion yn y cynllun talu, gan fod rhywfaint o ddrysych wedi bod ynghylch hynny y prynhawn yma. Bydd y cynllun talu a ddyfeisiwyd gan yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth yn rhan o'r telerau ac amodau gwasanaeth sydd yn berthnasol i'r holl athrawon yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae'r safonau cyffredin sydd ynddo'n elfen angenrheidiol mewn system sydd yn gyffredin i'r ddwy wlad. Mae rhai am ei gael y ddwy ffordd—maent am i'r tâl a'r amodau fod yn gyffredin heblaw pan nad yw hynny er budd iddynt. Pan ddaw at asesiad trothwy a mynediad i'r amrediad tâl newydd, bydd safonau cyffredin o degwech a chysondeb, yng Nghymru a Lloegr, o fudd i athrawon Cymru.

Mae rhai Aelodau o'r farn bod y system gwerthuso sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer yr holl athrawon yn golygu nad oes angen system asesu ar wahân ar gyfer mynediad i'r cynllun talu newydd. Dyfeisiwyd y system gwerthuso i bwrpas gwahanol. Mae arnom angen safonau cyffredin. Ni ellid ystyried safonau sydd yn cynnwys cynnydd disgyblion mewn un wlad

equivalent. Teachers in Wales would be subject to the slur that standards at the threshold were lower for them and that they were being offered easier access to higher pay. There is a danger that this could devalue the profession in Wales with the corrosive impression that our teachers were in the second division compared with their colleagues in England. We could see a restriction in the cross-border flow of teachers.

3:50 p.m.

Some Members would also like the legal position to be different but we must deal with the statutory position that exists. My job is not to design a different set of powers for the Assembly, but to ensure that the powers that we have work. Some Members would like to control the threshold standards but we cannot pick and choose the issues that we would like to add to the Assembly's responsibilities over this.

Concentrating on this one issue is not realistic. We either have to control teachers' pay and conditions of service in Wales, which means controlling everything—including related issues such as pensions—or we leave matters as they are. If we want to control them we must carefully consider all the possible implications, including additional cost to the Assembly—about 150 extra members of staff has been mooted. As things stand, I know of no-one who argues that the transfer of all the functions related to teachers' pay should be a priority for the Assembly or that it would be in the interest of the teaching profession in Wales. Not one union has written to me in favour of transferring powers to set terms and conditions of service to the Assembly.

Despite the focus of this debate, this issue is not primarily about teachers. It is about pupils. It is their interests and those of their parents and carers that must be paramount, even though the interests of the profession also deserve respect and responsible judgment. Monitoring pupils' progress and measuring outcomes informs teachers and schools of their strengths and weaknesses. Monitoring provides critically important information to teachers about how they can

and nid yn y llall yn rhai cymaradwy neu gyfwerth. Byddai athrawon yng Nghymru yn agored i'r honiad fod safonau ar y trothwy'n is iddynt hwy a'u bod yn cael cynnig mynediad haws i dâl uwch. Mae perygl y gallai hynny ddibrisio'r proffesiwn yng Nghymru gyda'r argraff ddifaol bod ein hathrawon ni yn yr ail gynghrair o'u cymharu â'u cydweithwyr yn Lloegr. Gallem weld cyfyngu ar y llif o athrawon ar draws y ffin.

Byddai rhai Aelodau hefyd yn hoffi i'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol fod yn wahanol ond rhaid inni ymdrin â'r sefyllfa statudol fel y mae. Nid llunio set wahanol o bwerau i'r Cynulliad yw fy ngwaith i, ond sicrhau bod y pwerau sydd gennym yn gweithio. Byddai rhai Aelodau'n hoffi rheoli'r safonau trothwy ond ni allwn ddewis a dethol y materion yr hoffem eu hychwanegu at gyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad yn hyn o beth.

Nid yw canolbwyntio ar yr un mater hwn yn ymarferol. Naill ai y mae'n rhaid inni reoli tâl ac amodau gwasanaeth athrawon yng Nghymru, sydd yn golygu rheoli popeth—gan gynnwys materion cysylltiedig fel pensiynau—neu rhaid inni adael pethau fel y maent. Os ydym am eu rheoli rhaid inni roi ystyriaeth ofalus i'r holl oblygiadau posibl, gan gynnwys cost ychwanegol i'r Cynulliad—crybwyllwyd tua 150 o aelodau staff ychwanegol. Fel y mae, ni wn am neb sydd yn dadlau y dylai'r Cynulliad roi blaenoriaeth i drosglwyddo'r holl swyddogaethau sydd yn ymwneud â thâl athrawon neu fod hynny er budd athrawon yng Nghymru. Nid ysgrifennodd yr un undeb ataf o blaid trosglwyddo pwerau i bennu telerau ac amodau gwasanaeth i'r Cynulliad.

Er gwaethaf ffocws y ddadl hon, nid mater sydd yn ymwneud ag athrawon yw hwn yn bennaf. Mae'n ymwneud â disgyblion. Eu buddiannau hwy a rhai eu rhieni a'u gofalwyr a ddylai fod yn bwysicaf, er bod buddiannau'r proffesiwn hefyd yn haeddu parch a dyfarniad cyfrifol. Mae monitro cynnydd disgyblion a mesur eu canlyniadau yn goleuo athrawon ac ysgolion ynghylch eu cryfderau a'u gwendidau. Mae monitro'n rhoi gwybodaeth hanfodol bwysig i athrawon

work to build on those strengths and overcome those weaknesses, not just for their benefit but, even more importantly, for the benefit of their pupils.

I hope that Members, unions and professional associations in Wales will see how much progress has been made in establishing a new system that offers special rewards for good teachers, sets high but realistic standards and takes into account fairly all the attributes that make up a good teacher. I hope that teachers will see the clear direction of the scheme, which is to provide a means of recognising and rewarding the huge contribution made by teachers in securing pupil progress. That is my vision. I am determined to keep good teachers in the classroom in Wales if that is their career choice.

The matter behind this motion is not for the Assembly. The functions on teachers' pay have not been transferred to us and there is no point pretending that we can affect them. The amendment to the motion ignores the fact that this matter is not a devolved subject. It suggests that there is a role for the Assembly when there is none. It implies a willingness to prevent teachers from getting access to the proposed new threshold pay increase. It talks of all possible steps when there is no realistic way to achieve what the motion seeks. It suggests that it would be acceptable for the Assembly to intervene in matters where the power rests elsewhere, when any institution with an ounce of responsibility would know that that is not the way that mature political bodies behave.

If we ignore the statutory realities, we indulge in gesture politics. We will not send a signal to London. If we did, we would let down Wales's teachers. Worst of all we would do a huge disservice to Wales's children. The teachers of Wales deserve substance, not gestures. I do not intend to support this motion.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae'n anrhydedd cloi dadl mor bwysig â hon.

Mae hawliau a phwerau'r Cynulliad ar y

ynghylch y modd y gallant ddatblygu'r cryfderau hynny a goresgyn y gwendidau hynny, nid yn unig er budd iddynt hwy ond, yn bwysicach fyth, er budd i'w disgyblion.

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau, yr undebau a'r cymdeithasau proffesiynol yng Nghymru yn gweld cymaint o gynnydd a wnaethpwyd wrth sefydlu system newydd sydd yn cynnig gwobrwyon arbennig i athrawon da, yn pennu safonau uchel ond ymarferol ac yn rhoi ystyriaeth deg i'r holl rinweddau sydd yn gwneud athro da. Gobeithiaf y bydd athrawon yn gweld pwrpas pendant y cynllun, sef darparu cyfrwng i gydnabod a gwobrwyo'r cyfraniad enfawr gan athrawon wrth sicrhau cynnydd disgyblion. Dyna fy ngweledigaeth. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o gadw athrawon da yn yr ystafell ddosbarth yng Nghymru os mai hynny yw eu dewis o yrfa.

Nid yw'r mater sydd y tu ôl i'r cynnig hwn yn un i'r Cynulliad. Ni throsglwyddwyd y swyddogaethau ar dâl athrawon i ni ac nid oes diben cymryd arnom y gallwn ddylanwadu arnynt. Mae'r gwelliant i'r cynnig yn anwybyddu'r ffaith nad yw'r mater hwn yn bwnc a ddatganolwyd. Mae'n awgrymu bod rôl i'r Cynulliad pan nad oes un. Mae'n awgrymu parodrwydd i atal athrawon rhag cael mynediad i'r codiad tâl trothwy newydd arfaethedig. Mae'n sôn am bob cam posibl pan nad oes modd ymarferol i gyflawni'r hyn a geisir yn y cynnig. Mae'n awgrymu y byddai'n dderbyniol i'r Cynulliad ymyrryd mewn materion lle y mae'r pŵer mewn man arall, pan fyddai unrhyw sefydliad â'r mymryn lleiaf o gyfrifoldeb yn gwybod nad dyna'r modd y mae cyrff gwleidyddol aeddfed yn ymddwyn.

Os anwybyddwn y gwirioneddau statudol, yr ydym yn ymroi i wleidyddiaeth symbolaidd. Ni fyddwn yn anfon neges i Lundain. Pe baem yn gwneud, byddem yn siomi athrawon Cymru. Y peth gwaethaf yw y byddem yn gwneud cam enfawr â phlant Cymru. Mae athrawon Cymru'n haeddu sylwedd, nid symbolau. Ni fwriadaf gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

**Cynog Dafis:** It is an honour to close such an important debate as this.

The Assembly's rights and powers on this



mater hwn yn fater o bwys—traethodd Rosemary Butler ar hynny. Anghytunaf yn llwyr â'i safbwynt na ddylai'r Cynulliad geisio dylanwadu ar faterion sydd y tu hwnt i'w bwerau cyfreithiol a'i hawliau. Credaf fod dylanwad y Cynulliad ar benderfyniadau Llundain yn rhan eithriadol o bwysig o'i rôl. Mae gennym hawl i'n safbwynt yma a hawl i ddisgwyl i Lundain gymryd sylw o'n safbwynt a gweithredu arno. Mae holl gwestiwn y farn gyfreithiol ar y mater hwn yn dal i gael ei ddatrys ac edrychwn ymlaen i'r canlyniad. Trafododd Jenny Randerson yn ddeallus y gwahaniaeth rhwng y trothwy perfformiad ar y naill llaw a'r fframwaith rheoli perfformiad ar y llaw arall. Mae gwahaniaethu rhwng y ddau beth hyn yn nonsens llwyr.

Gobeithiaf felly y bydd gan y Cynulliad yr hawl i benderfynu'r meini prawf a fydd yn dyfarnu pa un ai yw athro yn cael croesi'r trothwy neu beidio. Yr wyf yn sicr mai felly y dylai hi fod ac y gallai hi fod felly pa un a ddylai fod gan y Cynulliad yr hawl i drafod cyflogau athrawon mewn ystyr gyffredinol neu beidio. Mae hi'n annioddefol ein bod yn trafod bygythiad i dynnu arian allan o'r gyllideb Gymreig oni bai ein bod yn fodlon dilyn gorchymyn Llundain ar y mater hwn.

Mae'n gwbl glir bod modd gweithredu dymuniad y Cynulliad hwn os oes ewyllys gwleidyddol i wneud hynny. Gellir gwneud hynny un ffordd neu'r llall. Mae dau fater, felly. Yn gyntaf, a oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru yr ewyllys wleidyddol i weithredu yn ôl dymuniad y Cynulliad? A yw'r ewyllys wleidyddol yn bodoli o fewn y Blaid Lafur? Mae hynny'n gymysglyd ar hyn o bryd gan fod gwahanol leisiau wedi dod o'r Blaid Lafur. Croesawaf hynny. Deallaf fod y Blaid Lafur yn bwriadu atal ei phleidlais ar y mater, sydd yn dynodi diffyg argyhoeddiad o blaid yr argymhellion. A oes gan Gabinet y Cynulliad a'r Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant yr ewyllys wleidyddol i wneud yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei ddymuno? Canmolwyd Rosemary Butler am yr hyn y mae wedi'i gyflawni ac yr wyf finnau'n ei chanmol hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siomedig o'i chlywed yn amddiffyn yr anamddiffynadwy y prynhawn yma. Y cwestiwn arall yw a oes gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd ewyllys wleidyddol?

matter is a matter of importance—Rosemary Butler addressed that. I disagree completely with her standpoint that the Assembly should not try to influence issues that are beyond its legal powers and rights. I believe that the Assembly's influence on London's decisions is an extremely important part of its role. We have a right to our standpoint here and a right to expect London to pay attention to our standpoint and to take action accordingly. The whole issue of the legal opinion on this matter is still being resolved and we look forward to the outcome. Jenny Randerson intelligently discussed the difference between the performance threshold on the one hand and the performance management framework on the other. Differentiating between these two things is utter nonsense.

I hope therefore that the Assembly will have the right to decide the criteria which will determine whether or not the teacher is allowed to cross the threshold. I am certain that that is how it should be and that it could be so, irrespective of whether or not the Assembly should have the right to discuss teacher salaries in a general sense. It is intolerable that we are discussing a threat to take money out of the Welsh budget unless we are willing to follow London's dictate on this matter.

It is absolutely clear that it is possible to implement this Assembly's desire if there is a political will to do so. It is possible to do that one way or another. There are two issues, therefore. First, does the Government of Wales have the political will to act in accordance with the desire of the Assembly? Does the political will exist within the Labour Party? That question is confused at the moment because disparate voices have emanated from the Labour Party. I welcome that. I understand that the Labour Party intends to abstain on this matter, which denotes a lack of conviction in favour of the recommendations. Does the Assembly's Cabinet and the Secretary for Education and Children have the political will to do what the Assembly wishes? Rosemary Butler has been praised for what she has achieved and I praise her also. However, I am disappointed to hear her defending the indefensible this afternoon. The other question is does the First Secretary have the political will? I

Tybiaf ei fod yn ei swydd bresennol am ei fod yn fwy parod na'i ragflaenydd i weithredu polisiau priodol i Gymru. Mae hygredded Rhodri Morgan ar y lein i raddau helaeth.

presume that he is in his present job because he is more willing than his predecessor to implement appropriate policies for Wales. Rhodri Morgan's credibility is on the line to a great extent.

Yr ail gwestiwn yw a yw'r ewyllys wleidyddol i barchu Cymru, i barchu'r farn gyhoeddus yng Nghymru ac i barchu'r Cynulliad a'i farn yn bodoli yn Llundain. Mae ein sefyllfa yn dangos yn glir ddiffygion y model o ddatganoli sydd gennym. Mae angen i'r broses ddatganoli symud ymlaen a hynny ar frys.

The second question is whether the political will to respect Wales, the public opinion in Wales and the Assembly and its opinions exist in London. Our situation shows clearly the deficiencies of the model of devolution we have. The process of devolution must move forward with speed.

Mae llwyddiant datganoli yn dibynnu ar ddau fater. Yn gyntaf, mae angen defnyddio pwerau'r Cynulliad yn llawn. Mae hynny yn fater cymhleth. Mae gwybod beth yw hyd a lled pwerau'r Cynulliad hwn yn dipyn o gamp. Mae'n rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r pwerau hynny'n llawn. Mae llwyddiant datganoli yn dibynnu hefyd ar barodrwydd Llundain i ymateb i ddymuniadau a dyheadau y Cynulliad yn y modd y mae'n llunio deddfwriaeth ac yn caniatáu amrywio is-ddeddfwriaeth.

Securing the success of devolution is dependent on two issues. First, the powers of the Assembly must be used in full. That is a complex issue. Knowing the length and breadth of the powers of this Assembly is a feat in itself. We must use those powers fully. The success of devolution is also dependent on the willingness of London to respond to the aspirations and desires of the Assembly in the way in which it draws up legislation and allows the variation of subordinate legislation.

4:00 p.m.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i ymyrryd gan fod Cynog wedi sôn am fy hygredded. A yw yn ceisio dadlau y dylai'r Cynulliad gael y pŵer i ddatrys materion tâl? Dywedodd Rosemary yn ei haraith y byddai hynny'n golygu dros gant o swyddi ychwanegol, ac ystyried fod 150 o weision sifil yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn datrys eu materion tâl hwythau. A ydych chi'n bwriadu gofyn am y pŵer a'r swyddi ychwanegol y byddai eu hangen i ymdrin â materion tâl ein hathrawon? Yn ail, mae'r Cynulliad wedi gofyn i David Blunkett a fyddai'n trosglwyddo'r hawliau dros y mater hwn yn wirfoddol. Gwrthododd wneud hyn yn wirfoddol, felly beth ddylai'r Cabinet ei wneud? Derbynia Cynog fod y gyfraith yn nodi'n glir na throsglwyddwyd y mater hwn i'r Cynulliad dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Beth y mae'n disgwyl i'r Cabinet, y Prif Ysgrifennydd, y grŵp Llafur neu unrhyw un arall ei wneud?

**The First Secretary:** I am pleased to have the opportunity to intervene as Cynog has mentioned my credibility. Is he trying to argue that the Assembly should have the power to settle issues of salaries? Rosemary said in her speech that that would mean more than a hundred additional jobs, given that 150 civil servants in Northern Ireland settle their salary issues. Do you intend to ask for the power and the additional jobs that would be required to deal with our teachers' salaries? Secondly, the Assembly has asked David Blunkett whether he would voluntarily transfer the rights over this issue. He has refused to do this voluntarily, so what should the Cabinet do? Cynog accepts that the law clearly states that this issue was not transferred to the Assembly under the Government of Wales Act 1998. What does he expect the Cabinet, the First Secretary, the Labour Group or anyone else to do?

**Cynog Dafis:** Ar bwynt cyntaf Rhodri, yn sicr nid wyf yn dadlau dros drosglwyddo holl

**Cynog Dafis:** On Rhodri's first point, I am certainly not arguing for all the responsibility

gyfrifoldeb trafod a phenderfynu ar lefel cyflogau athrawon i'r Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd. Yn y diwedd, carwn weld hynny'n digwydd. Mae'n berffaith bosibl yn yr Alban ac felly yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n flaenoriaeth yn sicr.

Mae'n ddigon eglur y dylai fod gennym y gallu a'r hawl i benderfynu ar delerau dyrchafu athro a'r canllawiau ar gyfer penderfynu a ydynt yn cael dyrchafiad cyflog o ganlyniad i fesuriad o'u perfformiad. Yn sicr, dylai fod gan y Cynulliad yr hawliau hyn yn llawn. Mae'r ffaith nad ydynt gennym yn dangos yr annibendod presennol yn y system ddatganoli ac, fel y dywedodd Gareth Jones, mae'n dangos y gall pŵer gael ei dynnu'n ôl o Gymru o dan y system bresennol. Mae'r holl broses o adolygu cyflogau athrawon bellach yn cynnwys rheoliadau manwl ynglŷn â'r modd y mesurir perfformiad athrawon a'r hyn a gynhwysir o fewn hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid imi ddiogelu amser y ddadl nesaf. Mae'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn haeddu awr ar gyfer ei ddadl plaid leiafrifol ac fe gymer y ddadl fer hanner awr. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn dod â'r ddadl i ben.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ar ail bwynt Rhodri, credaf ei fod wedi gollwng y gath o'r cwd. Dywedodd fod Cabinet Llafur y Cynulliad wedi gwneud cais i David Blunkett roi'r hyblygrwydd inni a'i fod wedi gwrthod. Mae hynny'n fater difrifol. Yr ydych wedi gwneud cais i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Chyflogaeth i ganiatáu gwahanol driniaeth yng Nghymru i'r hyn a fydd yn Lloegr ac mae wedi gwrthod. Os yw wedi gwrthod, mae'n euog o'r union *control freakery* sydd yn destun y fath ddieter yng Nghymru ac, fel y gŵyr ef, o fewn ei blaid ei hun.

Trafododd Owen John Thomas yn ddeallus y modd y cymerwyd y penderfyniad i wahanu asesiad i'r trothwy a gwerthuso athrawon. Mae'n amlwg bod agenda gwleidyddol y tu cefn i hynny.

Mae lles ein cyfundrefn addysg a chreu fframwaith synhwyrol a theg ar gyfer talu athrawon a systemau dyrchafiad yn y fantol. Peidied neb â dadlau y bydd gweithredu'r

for discussing and determining the level of teachers' salaries to be transferred to the Assembly at present. Ultimately, I would like to see that happening. It is perfectly possible in Scotland and therefore in Wales. However, that is certainly not a priority.

It is clear enough that we should have the ability and the right to determine the terms for promoting a teacher and the guidelines for determining if they receive an increase in salary as a result of a measure of their performance. The Assembly should certainly have these rights in full. The fact that we do not have them shows the present mess in the devolution system and, as Gareth Jones said, it shows that power can be taken back from Wales under the present system. The whole process of reviewing teachers' salaries now includes detailed regulations on the way in which teachers' performance is measured and what is included within that.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I must protect the time for the next debate. The Conservative Group deserves an hour for its minority party debate and the short debate will take half an hour. I would be grateful if you could conclude the debate.

**Cynog Dafis:** On Rhodri's second point, I believe that he has let the cat out of the bag. He said that the Assembly's Labour Cabinet has made a request to David Blunkett to give us the flexibility and that he refused. That is a serious matter. You have made a request to the Secretary of State for Education and Employment to allow a different treatment in Wales to that which will exist in England and he has refused. If he has refused, he is guilty of the exact control freakery that is the subject of such anger in Wales and, as he knows, within his own party.

Owen John Thomas intelligently discussed the way in which the decision was taken to separate the assessment to the threshold and teachers' appraisal. It is obvious that there is a political agenda behind that.

The welfare of our education system and creating a fair and sensible framework for paying teachers and promotion systems lie in the balance. Let nobody argue that

math hwn o gynllun sydd yn cysylltu tâl athrawon â pherfformiad disgyblion o les i blant. Mae hynny'n gamgymeriad cyfeiliornus. Mae morâl a thegwch wrth drin athrawon yn eithriadol o bwysig i les plant. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod lles plant yn ganolog i hyn.

Yn bwysicach ac yn ehangach na'r gyfundrefn addysg y mae democratiaeth Gymreig. Mae hawl pobl Cymru i benderfynu ar faterion o bwys yn ôl eu gwerthoedd a'u hanghenion ymarferol yn y fantol. Mae angen i ddemocratiaeth Gymreig symud yn ei blaen. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn sôn am dynnu'r broses ddemocrataidd yng Nghymru yn ei hôl. Mae gorfodi'r cynllun hwn ar Gymru yn erbyn ewyllys unfrydol y genedl yn groes i ysbryd democratiaeth ac mae'n eithriadol o bwysig fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig ac yn erbyn yr awgrym hwn.

implementing this kind of scheme that links teachers' pay to pupils' performance will benefit children. That is a massive mistake. Morale and fairness in treating teachers is exceptionally important to the welfare of children. We all agree that the welfare of children is central to this.

More important and broader than the education system is Welsh democracy. The right of the people of Wales to decide on important issues according to their values and practical needs hangs in the balance. Welsh democracy needs to move forward. This scheme discusses dragging the democratic process in Wales backwards. Forcing this scheme on Wales against the unanimous wish of the nation is contrary to the spirit of democracy and it is exceptionally important that Assembly Members vote for this motion and against this suggestion.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 30, Ymatal 27, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 30, Abstain 27, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Amendment adopted.*

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Marek, John  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynn  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

Amended motion:

*that the Assembly*

*believes that teachers' pay should not be linked to pupil performance and, in line with the majority view of the Pre-16 Education Committee, resolves to take all possible steps not to implement such a scheme in Wales.*

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*bod y Cynulliad hwn*

*yn credu na ddylai cyflogau athrawon fod yn gysylltiedig â pherfformiad disgyblion ac, yn unol â barn y mwyafrif yn y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16, yn penderfynu cymryd pob cam posibl i beidio â rhoi cynllun o'r fath ar waith yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 30, Ymatal 27, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 30, Abstain 27, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Marek, John  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Amended motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.*

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol: Y Blaid Geidwadol Minority Party Debate: The Conservative Party**

#### **Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd Cardiff Bay Development Corporation**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies, amendment 2 in the name of Michael German and amendment 3 in the name of

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies, gwelliant 2 yn enw Michael German a gwelliant 3 yn enw Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose that

*this Assembly criticises the handling by the administration of the wind-up of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation.*

I also propose amendment 3. At the end of the motion, add

*and calls for a full statement from the First Secretary specifying projects that will be funded from accrued benefits received by Cardiff County Council, with an accompanying assurance that these will not be used against normal county expenditure responsibilities.*

Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, its wind-up and the procedures for doing so have been discussed on a number of occasions in the Economic Development Committee. If the principle of equal opportunity had stretched to every member of that Committee, perhaps we would not need such a debate this afternoon. However, I am pleased to propose the motion and to reveal the interesting findings of the research I have conducted.

The redevelopment of Cardiff Bay from an area of social and economic deprivation to one of prosperity, social inclusion and sustainable economic promise will deliver the key objective of the New Towns and Urban Development Corporations Act 1985. The vision of Labour's Lord Brook and the then Secretary of State for Wales, the Conservative Nicholas Edwards, will have been realised. Cardiff will be put on the international map as a superlative maritime city that will stand comparison with any such city in the world, thereby enhancing the image and economic well-being of Cardiff and Wales.

I pay tribute to the chairman of CBDC, Sir Geoffrey Inkin, as well as his board of directors and the chief executive, Michael Boyce. I hope that the First Secretary will join me in congratulating them and the staff. Their achievements have been considerable in the face of much hostility from key

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad hwn yn beirniadu'r ffordd y mae'r weinyddiaeth wedi delio â'r broses o ddwyn Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ben.*

Cynigiau hefyd welliant 3. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig, ychwaneger

*ac yn galw am ddatganiad llawn gan y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn nodi'r prosiectau a gaiff eu hariannu o fuddion cronedig a dderbyniwyd gan Gyngor Sir Caerdydd, a sicrwydd hefyd na fydd y rhain yn cael eu defnyddio yn erbyn cyfrifoldebau gwariant arferol y sir.*

Mae Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, ei dirwyn i ben a'r gweithdrefnau ar gyfer hynny wedi eu trafod sawl gwaith yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Pe bai egwyddor cyfle cyfartal wedi ymestyn i gynnwys pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, efallai na fyddai angen inni gael dadl o'r fath y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o gynnig y cynnig a datgelu canfyddiadau diddorol yr ymchwil a gyflawnais.

Bydd ailddatblygu Bae Caerdydd o fod yn ardal o amddifadedd cymdeithasol ac economaidd i fod yn un lle y ceir ffyniant, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac addewid o economi cynaliadwy yn cyflawni prif amcan y Ddeddf Corfforaethau Trefi Newydd a Datblygu Trefol 1985. Bydd gweledigaeth Arglwydd Brook o'r Blaid Lafur ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, y Ceidwadwr Nicholas Edwards, wedi ei chyflawni. Rhoddir Caerdydd ar y map rhyngwladol fel dinas arforol wych y gellir ei chymharu ag unrhyw ddinas o'r fath yn y byd, gan wella delwedd a lles economaidd Caerdydd a Chymru.

Talaf deyrnged i gadeirydd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, Syr Geoffrey Inkin, yn ogystal â'i fwrdd cyfarwyddwyr a'r prif weithredwr, Michael Boyce. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Ysgrifennydd yn ymuno â mi wrth eu llongyfarch hwy a'r staff. Bu eu cyflawniadau'n rhai sylweddol yn wyneb

individuals, no-one more significant than the now First Secretary. Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, from its public sector funding base of £500 million, has already gained more than £1 billion of private sector investment, which will ultimately lead to more than £2 billion. It has created 20,000 new jobs and developed 5,000 new homes, a quarter of which are classed as social housing. The corporation has reclaimed 400 hectares of land, all for the community of Cardiff, striking a balance between social needs and economic development. The barrage is the pinnacle of the project. One of Europe's largest and most prestigious civil engineering projects has been built in Wales. There is every reason to celebrate that achievement, to sell the image of Wales as a forward-looking, dynamic, reborn nation, confident of its culture and heritage as well as innovative and creative for the future.

However, in place of a royal opening attracting journalists from all over Europe, a fitting celebration of the achievements, we will have the subtle unveiling of a brass plaque—a news item that will capture the bottom left-hand corners of the UK journals if we are lucky. The reason for that is the First Secretary's hostility and spite and to save his embarrassment. It is sad that a cause to celebrate and promote Wales throughout the world is being ignored because of one individual.

4:10 p.m.

**Alun Michael:** I will nail that canard straightaway. There was no suggestion of the Assembly proposing a royal opening during my time as First Secretary. For Alun Cairns to use it as a platform for a shoddy attack on the present First Secretary is outrageous and not in keeping with the standards that we should uphold in the Assembly.

**Alun Cairns:** Thank you for that contribution, but the excuse made by the Government of Wales's official spokesman last week, that the royal family was not available, was a weak one. It was then

llawer o elyniaeth gan unigolion allweddol, a'r un ohonynt yn bwysicach na'r Prif Ysgrifennydd presennol. Mae Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, o'i sylfaen arian sector cyhoeddus o £500 miliwn, eisoes wedi ennill mwy na £1 biliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat, a fydd yn y pen draw yn arwain at fwy na £2 biliwn. Creodd 20,000 o swyddi newydd a datblygodd 5,000 o gartrefi newydd, y dynodir chwarter ohonynt yn dai cymdeithasol. Mae'r gorfforaeth wedi adfer 400 hectar o dir, y cwbl ar gyfer cymuned Caerdydd, gan gadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng anghenion cymdeithasol a datblygu economaidd. Y morglawdd yw uchafbwynt y prosiect. Yng Nghymru yr adeiladwyd un o'r prosiectau peirianeg sifil mwyaf ac uchaf ei fri yn Ewrop. Mae pob rheswm i ddathlu'r gamp honno, gwerthu delwedd Cymru fel cenedl flaengar, ddeinamig, ailanedig sydd â hyder yn ei diwylliant a'i threftadaeth yn ogystal â bod yn arloesol ac yn greadigol ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Fodd bynnag, yn lle agoriad brenhinol gan ddenu newyddiadurwyr o bob rhan o Ewrop, dathliad priodol o'r hyn a gyflawnwyd, byddwn yn cael dadorchuddio plac pres yn gynnil—eitem newyddion a fydd yn dal corneli gwaelod chwith papurau newydd y DU os ydym yn ffodus. Y rheswm am hynny yw gelyniaeth a malais y Prif Ysgrifennydd ac er mwyn peidio â pheri annifyrrwch iddo. Mae'n drist bod achos i ddathlu a hybu Cymru ledled y byd yn cael ei anwybyddu oherwydd un unigolyn.

**Alun Michael:** Yr wyf am roi hoelen yn y chwedl wag honno ar unwaith. Nid oedd unrhyw awgrym y byddai'r Cynulliad yn cynnig agoriad brenhinol yn ystod fy nghyfnod i yn Brif Ysgrifennydd. Peth gwarthus yw bod Alun Cairns yn defnyddio hynny'n llwyfan ar gyfer ymosodiad salw ar y Prif Ysgrifennydd presennol ac nid yw'n gydnaws â'r safonau y dylem eu cynnal yn y Cynulliad.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi am y cyfraniad hwnnw, ond yr oedd yr esgus a roddwyd gan lefarydd swyddogol Llywodraeth Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, nad oedd y teulu brenhinol ar gael, yn un gwan. Darganfuwyd wedyn y

discovered that the Prince of Wales will visit south Wales on 15 March. That would have been an appropriate occasion to celebrate the opening of Cardiff Bay.

**Alun Michael:** It is not possible, and I am sure that it would be impossible for the present First Secretary, to discuss long-term or short-term arrangements with the royal family. That is not the way it is done. To try to draw the royal family into a piece of political point scoring is outrageous and falls below the standards that we expect in this Assembly.

**Alun Cairns:** I agree with your last point. That is why I was particularly disappointed that the Government of Wales's official spokesman used the royal family as an excuse last week.

The hostility originated some time ago, with filibustering in the House of Commons breaking every record and delaying and obstructing the will of the people of Cardiff. It is estimated that that delay alone cost over £5 million in administration. The cost in lost business opportunities for Cardiff and Wales can only be imagined. It is ironic that the man who fought every battle to prevent the redevelopment of Cardiff Bay became responsible for the whole operation and organisation of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation. It is no wonder that the current fiasco has developed.

**Jenny Randerson** *rose—*

**The First Secretary** *rose—*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. One at a time.

**Alun Cairns:** We are short of time in this debate. We only have an hour and several of my colleagues would like to contribute. However, I will give way to the First Secretary.

**The First Secretary:** This is a bit personal.

**Alun Cairns:** It is true, is it not?

**Jenny Randerson:** I know that you were not around in Cardiff at the time and are

bydd Tywysog Cymru yn ymweld â de Cymru ar 15 Mawrth. Byddai hwnnw wedi bod yn achlysur priodol i ddathlu agor Bae Caerdydd.

**Alun Michael:** Nid yw'n bosibl, ac yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'n amhosibl i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd presennol, drafod trefniadau tymor hir neu dymor byr â'r teulu brenhinol. Nid felly y'i gwneir. Mae ceisio tynnu'r teulu brenhinol i mewn i ychydig o sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol yn warthus ac ymhell o dan y safonau a ddisgwyliwn yn y Cynulliad hwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Cytunaf â'ch pwynt diwethaf. Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn arbennig o siomedig bod llefarydd swyddogol Llywodraeth Cymru wedi defnyddio'r teulu brenhinol fel esgus yr wythnos diwethaf.

Dechreuodd yr elyniaeth gryn amser yn ôl, gyda'r ffilibystro yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn torri pob record ac yn gohirio ac yn rhwystro ewyllys pobl Caerdydd. Amcangyfrifir bod y gohirio hwnnw ar ei ben ei hun wedi costio dros £5 miliwn o ran gweinyddu. Ni ellir ond dychmygu'r cyfleoedd busnes a gollwyd yng Nghaerdydd a Chymru. Mae'n eironig bod y dyn a ymladdodd ym mhob brwydr i atal ailddatblygu Bae Caerdydd wedi dod yn gyfrifol am holl weithrediad a threfniadaeth Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd. Nid yw'n syndod bod y llangstr presennol wedi datblygu.

**Jenny Randerson** *a gododd—*

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd** *a gododd—*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Un ar y tro.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr ydym yn brin o amser yn y ddadl hon. Nid oes ond awr gennym ac mae nifer o'm cydweithwyr yn dymuno cyfrannu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fodlon ildio i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae hyn braidd yn bersonol.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n wir, onid yw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwn nad oeddech o gwmpas yng Nghaerdydd ar y pryd a'ch bod



therefore speaking from a position of almost perfect ignorance, but I must correct you on the history of CBDC and the barrage. The will of the people of Cardiff was never sought on this issue. The barrage was imposed on Cardiff and Wales by the then Tory Government, run by people who did not even represent Welsh constituencies. It rumbled on and on over many years and the will of the people of Cardiff was never considered.

**Alun Cairns:** Thank you for your contribution. You are right: I was not around in Cardiff at that time. However, I can look objectively at the situation. CBDC has been an enormous success for Cardiff and, as a result, we are all happy to take part in that success through the establishment of the Assembly here in Cardiff Bay.

**David Melding:** I lived in Cardiff in the early 1980s and went to university here. I was at the press conference when this project was announced and it was greeted with widespread acclaim. It was a privilege to see the top financial journalists and all those interested in regeneration projects, including people from North America, here to say that Cardiff was leading the way in maritime redevelopment in Britain.

**Alun Cairns:** Thank you for that comment. That would have been the sort of publicity that an official opening would have gained us: journalists from North America and from financial journals across the UK and Europe. However, unfortunately, we are left with this situation.

I will move on, if I can. To describe a situation as a 'fiasco' is often to overstate. However, on this occasion only the words 'fiasco', 'shambles', 'disaster' and 'debacle' combined could describe the political fix that has developed in the winding-up of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and in the handover to successor bodies. Last April, Alun Michael, as Secretary of State for Wales, agreed a memorandum of understanding with the leader of Cardiff City and County Council, Russell Goodway.

felly'n siarad o sefyllfa o anwybodaeth lwyr bron, ond rhaid imi'ch cywiro ynghylch hanes Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd a'r morglawdd. Ni cheisiwyd ewyllys pobl Caerdydd ar y mater hwn erioed. Gorfodwyd y morglawdd ar Gaerdydd a Chymru gan y Llywodraeth Dori'aidd bryd hynny, a'i redeg gan bobl nad oeddent hyd yn oed yn cynrychioli etholaethau yng Nghymru. Llusgodd ymlaen ac ymlaen dros flynyddoedd lawer ac nid ystyriwyd ewyllys pobl Caerdydd erioed.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniad. Yr ydych yn iawn: nid oeddwn o gwmpas yng Nghaerdydd bryd hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallaf edrych yn wrthrychol ar y sefyllfa. Bu Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd yn llwyddiant aruthrol i Gaerdydd ac, o ganlyniad, yr ydym yn falch o gymryd rhan yn y llwyddiant hwnnw drwy sefydlu'r Cynulliad yma ym Mae Caerdydd.

**David Melding:** Yr oeddwn yn byw yng Nghaerdydd yn y 1980au cynnar ac euthum i'r brifysgol yma. Yr oeddwn yn y gynhadledd i'r wasg pan gyhoeddwyd y prosiect hwn a chafodd glod gyffredinol. Yr oedd yn fraint gweld y newyddiadurwyr ariannol pennaf a phawb a ymddiddorai mewn prosiectau adfywio, gan gynnwys rhai o Ogledd America, yma i ddweud bod Caerdydd yn achub y blaen mewn datblygu arforol ym Mhrydain.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi am y sylw hwnnw. Dyna'r math o gyhoeddusrwydd a ddeuai agoriad swyddogol inni: newyddiadurwyr o Ogledd America ac o gylchgronau ariannol ledled y DU ac Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, gwaetha'r modd, gadawyd ni â'r sefyllfa hon.

Yr wyf am symud ymlaen, os caf. Gorddweud yn aml yw disgrifio sefyllfa fel 'llanastr'. Fodd bynnag, y tro hwn dim ond y geiriau 'llanastr', 'anhrefn', 'trychineb' a 'chwalfa' gyda'i gilydd a allai ddisgrifio'r twyll gwleidyddol a ddatblygodd wrth ddirwyn Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ben ac wrth drosglwyddo i gyrff olynol. Fis Ebrill diwethaf, cytunodd Alun Michael, fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ar femorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth ag arweinydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd,

Within any negotiating procedure, no-one would blame Russell Goodway for seeking to gain the best possible deal for Cardiff. However, it would be fair to say that we would have to rely on the honesty, integrity and the skills of the Secretary of State for Wales at the time in achieving a fair and reasonable outcome. What would be a fair and reasonable outcome? I would say that it would be one that passed a balance of assets and liabilities to a successor body. One would assume that inheriting the prosperity of the development of Cardiff Bay, together with the extra income that will be afforded in time, would be enough of a bonus for any local authority.

Swansea, west Wales and north Wales would have been delighted to have received infrastructure benefits on this scale. What was the outcome of this agreement? Cardiff county council will receive assets of more than £16 million. It is not until the details are revealed that this financial scandal comes to light. With the transfer of assets to Cardiff council, it will receive £6.1 million of net benefit for no apparent reason to spend as it wishes. Evidence at the last Economic Development Committee meeting demonstrated that there are no plans for this £6 million and it was clear that Russell Goodway intends to spend this on whatever projects, inside or outside the bay, that he chooses. I have been forced to table an amendment to my motion because of the scandal that Cardiff council is running away with £6 million over and above what is needed.

After the massive, inflation-busting council tax rises that have been imposed on every council tax payer in Wales, would not they have appreciated a bonus of a £6 million handout? Would not our health service or our schools have welcomed a £6 million injection over and above what they have been allocated? However, the biggest scandal is the political fix and the blatant way in which this has been done.

Standards in public life have been criticised on many occasions. We all accept rules and regulations to maintain public confidence in the interest of openness and transparency. Government ministers are expected to adhere

Russell Goodway. Oddi mewn i unrhyw weithdrefn negodi, ni welai neb fai ar Russell Goodway am geisio cael y fargen orau bosibl i Gaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, teg yw dweud y byddai'n rhaid inni ddibynnu ar onestrwydd, unplygrwydd a medrau Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd er mwyn sicrhau canlyniad teg a rhesymol. Beth a fyddai'n ganlyniad teg a rhesymol? Dywedwn i y byddai hwnnw'n un a drosglwyddai gydbwysedd o asedau a rhwymedigaethau i gorff olynol. Tybiai rhywun y byddai etifeddu'r ffyniant o ddatblygu Bae Caerdydd, ynghyd â'r incwm ychwanegol a roddir ymhen amser, yn ddigon o fonws i unrhyw awdurdod lleol.

Byddai Abertawe, gorllewin Cymru a gogledd Cymru wedi bod wrth eu bodd yn derbyn buddion seilwaith o'r maint hwnnw. Beth oedd canlyniad y cytundeb hwn? Bydd cyngor sir Caerdydd yn derbyn asedau o fwy na £16 miliwn. Nid hyd nes y datgelir y manylion y daw'r sgandal ariannol hon i'r amlwg. Wrth drosglwyddo asedau i gyngor Caerdydd, bydd yn derbyn £6.1 miliwn o fudd clir heb unrhyw reswm amlwg i'w wario yn ôl ei ddymuniad. Yr oedd tystiolaeth yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn dangos nad oes cynlluniau ar gyfer y £6 miliwn hwn ac yr oedd yn amlwg bod Russell Goodway yn bwriadu ei wario ar ba bynnag brosiectau, y tu mewn neu'r tu allan i'r bae, a ddewisai. Gorfu imi gyflwyno gwelliant i'm cynnig oherwydd y sgandal bod cyngor Caerdydd yn dianc â £6 miliwn ar ben yr hyn sydd yn angenrheidiol.

Ar ôl y codiadau anferth, uwch na chwyddiant, yn nhreth y cyngor a orfodwyd ar bob talwr treth y cyngor yng Nghymru, oni fyddent wedi gwerthfawrogi bonws o rodd o £6 miliwn? Oni fyddai ein gwasanaeth iechyd neu ein hysgolion wedi croesawu chwistrelliad o £6 miliwn ar ben yr hyn a ddyrannwyd iddynt? Fodd bynnag, y sgandal fwyaf yw'r twyll gwleidyddol a'r modd digywilydd y gwnaethpwyd hyn.

Bu beirniadu ar safonau mewn bywyd cyhoeddus ar lawer achlysur. Yr ydym oll yn derbyn rheolau a rheoliadau i gadw ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd er mwyn bod yn agored a thryloyw. Disgwylir i weinidogion y

to those regulations. However, the Secretary of State for Wales at the time, who for no apparent reason, rushed through this memorandum of understanding before the establishment of the Assembly, did so contrary to the Government's own code of conduct for Ministers. Regulation 64 of the Ministerial Code states that

'Where Ministers have to take decisions within their Departments which might have an impact on their own constituencies, they should, of course, take particular care to avoid any possible conflict of interest.'

**Alun Michael:** Point of order. Alun Cairns is factually wrong. I refute his totally unfounded allegations. He refers to the code of conduct for Ministers. If he looks at this he will find that I—as Secretary of State for Wales and subsequent to that as First Secretary—and others who have been involved in decision making have kept to this code of conduct. To make allegations in the Assembly in this way is contrary to how Members should behave. Alun Cairns has not expressed any concerns to me prior to this debate. However, I understand that he had a press conference this morning to share his apparent concerns with the media. We can therefore see what his agenda is. The matter should be raised in a proper way. Any allegations of misbehaviour or of failing to live up to the higher standards of the Ministerial Code and any other requirements will be found to be totally unfounded. It seems to me that Alun is throwing mud in the hope that some of it will stick. My concern is that even when allegations are totally unfounded, they may have the desired effect. However, this brings the thrower into disrepute and risks the danger of bringing this Assembly into disrepute.

4:20 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will check the Record, but I did not hear Alun Cairns use words that were contrary to the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber. However, I ask him to consider carefully whether he might be doing so if he continues on this line.

Llywodraeth gadw at y rheoliadau hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, a ruthrodd y memorandwm hwn o gyd-ddealltwriaeth drwodd, heb reswm amlwg, cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad, wedi gwneud hynny'n groes i'r cod sydd gan y Llywodraeth ei hun ar ymddygiad Gweinidogion. Dywed rheoliad 64 o'r Cod Gweinidogol

'Pan fo'n rhaid i Weinidogion wneud penderfyniadau oddi mewn i'w Hadrannau a allai effeithio ar eu hetholaethau eu hunain, dylent, wrth gwrs, fod yn arbennig o ofalus i osgoi unrhyw wrthdaro posibl rhwng buddiannau.'

**Alun Michael:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae Alun Cairns yn ffeithiol anghywir. Gwrthbrofaf yn llwyr ei honiadau di-sail. Cyfeiria at y cod ymddygiad i Weinidogion. Os edrych arno gwêl fy mod i—fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ac wedi hynny fel Prif Ysgrifennydd—ac eraill a fu â rhan mewn penderfynu wedi cadw at y cod ymddygiad hwn. Mae gwneud honiadau yn y Cynulliad fel hyn yn groes i'r modd y dylai Aelodau ymddwyn. Ni fynegodd Alun Cairns unrhyw bryderon i mi cyn y ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, deallaf iddo gael cynhadledd i'r wasg y bore yma i rannu ei bryderon ymddangosol â'r cyfryngau. Felly gallwn weld beth yw ei agenda. Dylid codi'r mater mewn modd priodol. Ceir bod unrhyw honiadau am gamymddwyn neu fethu â chydymffurfio â safonau uwch y Cod Gweinidogol ac unrhyw ofyniad arall yn gwbl ddi-sail. Ymddengys i mi fod Alun yn taflu baw yn y gobaith y bydd rhywfaint ohono'n glynu. Fy mhryder i yw y gall honiadau, hyd yn oed pan ydynt yn gwbl ddi-sail, gael yr effaith a ddymunir o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n dwyn anfri ar y taflwr baw ac yn creu'r perygl o ddwyn anfri ar y Cynulliad hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Archwiliat y Cofnod, ond ni chlywais Alun Cairns yn defnyddio geiriau a oedd yn groes i'r Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf iddo ystyried yn ofalus a allai wneud hynny os yw'n parhau ar y llwybr hwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Thank you, Llywydd. I seek to give you my assurance. In spite of regulation 64 of the Ministerial Code, I believe that Alun Michael, as Secretary of State for Wales, agreed to hand over £6 million of net benefits to Cardiff county council, a local authority in which he had a critical interest as a Member of Parliament for Cardiff South and Penarth.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask you to reconsider. If you are making allegations of interests that have not been declared or interests that have been pursued outwith the public duty, that is a serious matter, which would be against the code of conduct for Members in the Chamber.

**Alun Cairns:** I agree. I am so concerned about these allegations that I intend to refer them to Sir Richard Wilson, the Cabinet Secretary, and to the Standards and Privileges Committee of the House of Commons, because it was done at the time that Alun Michael was Secretary of State. I will be doing it through the Parliamentary Standards Commissioner, Elizabeth Filkin. I trust that that satisfies your concerns.

**Alun Michael:** Point of order. Would it not be appropriate, if Alun had a genuine concern on these matters, for him to have raised them with the Cabinet Secretary or the Ombudsman or whoever else he pleases, rather than seeking to make them a subject of a press comment and an unfounded attack within this Assembly?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you for making that point. It is not necessary to declare publicly in this Chamber any issues that may be referred either to the Standards Committee here or to the Parliamentary Standards Commissioner at any time. Any Member or member of the public may do so.

**Alun Cairns:** I believe this to be potentially the biggest financial scandal that the Assembly will have to face. That is why I will be taking the action that I have highlighted. If only the shenanigans and political fix and what I believe to be handouts ended there.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Ceisïaf roi sicrwydd ichi. Er gwaethaf rheoliad 64 yn y Cod Gweinidogol, credaf fod Alun Michael, fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, wedi cytuno i drosglwyddo £6 miliwn o fuddion clir i gyngor sir Caerdydd, awdurdod lleol yr oedd ganddo fuddiant holl bwysig ynddo fel Aelod Seneddol dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf ichi ailystyried. Os ydych yn gwneud honiadau am fuddiannau na ddatganwyd neu fuddiannau a ddilynwyd y tu hwnt i'r ddyletswydd gyhoeddus, mae hynny'n fater difrifol, a fyddai'n groes i'r cod ymddygiad i Aelodau yn y Siambr.

**Alun Cairns:** Cytunaf. Yr wyf mor bryderus ynghylch yr honiadau hyn fel fy mod yn bwriadu eu cyfeirio i Syr Richard Wilson, Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet, ac i Bwyllgor Safonau a Breintiau Tŷ'r Cyffredin, oherwydd gwnaethpwyd hyn pan oedd Alun Michael yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Byddaf yn gwneud hynny drwy'r Comisiynydd Safonau Seneddol, Elizabeth Filkin. Hydraraf fod hynny'n ateb eich pryderon.

**Alun Michael:** Pwynt o drefn. Oni fyddai'n briodol, pe bai gan Alun bryder gwirioneddol ar y materion hyn, iddo ei godi gydag Ysgrifennydd y Cabinet neu'r Ombwdsmon neu bwy bynnag arall a hoffai, yn hytrach na cheisio eu gwneud yn destun i sylw yn y wasg ac i ymosodiad di-sail oddi mewn i'r Cynulliad hwn?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am wneud y pwynt hwnnw. Nid oes angen datgan yn gyhoeddus yn y Siambr hon unrhyw faterion y gellir eu cyfeirio naill ai i'r Pwyllgor Safonau yma neu i'r Comisiynydd Safonau Seneddol ar unrhyw adeg. Caiff unrhyw Aelod neu aelod o'r cyhoedd wneud hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Credaf ei bod yn bosibl mai hon yw'r sgandal ariannol fwyaf y bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad ei hwynebu. Dyna pam y byddaf yn cymryd y camau y tynnais sylw atynt. O na bai'r castiau a'r twyll gwleidyddol a'r hyn a gredaf sydd yn rhoddion yn gorffen yn y fan honno.

Last October, you will recall that the then First Secretary made a statement to this Chamber on his second memorandum of understanding with Russell Goodway. After 36 companies had followed a European procurement procedure over 18 months, in which Thames Water was selected to become the preferred bidder to run the Cardiff Bay barrage, Russell Goodway threw together a contract in 48 hours and was awarded the deal. This seemed either to be super-efficient of the public sector, compared with the 18 months taken by the private sector, or another political and financial stitch-up. You have guessed it. I have come to the same conclusion again.

It seems that the Finance Director of the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, Phil Higgins, left the corporation on Sunday 5 September and started work for Cardiff county council on Monday 6 September. It is no wonder that Cardiff county council could offer an agreement, irrespective of any expertise that it offered.

An estimated £12 million was proposed to run the harbour authority, but Alun Michael agreed with Russell Goodway that Cardiff county council would be able to save £2 million over three years. In spite of the corrupt way in which it was achieved, that proposal sounded reasonable enough in the first instance. However, the paper offered to the Economic Development Committee in January showed that this £12 million had mysteriously risen to £14 million for no apparent reason. Questions at that time offered no explanation. I was pleased to see in the papers for last week's Committee that this figure had been revised to £12 million. This all adds to the unsavoury demonstration or arrangements that I believe have taken place in the negotiations leading to the wind-up of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation.

As for that alleged saving of £2 million over three years, there will be a few extra costs. Thames Water believes that its deal would have been £3 million cheaper in any case. I understand there will be many legal implications as a result.

Fis Hydref diwethaf, fe gofiwch fod y Prif Ysgrifennydd ar y pryd wedi gwneud datganiad i'r Siambr hon ar ei ail femorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth â Russell Goodway. Ar ôl i 36 o gwmnïau ddilyn gweithdrefn caffael Ewropeaidd dros 18 mis, pan ddedolwyd Thames Water yn ddewis ymgeisydd i redeg morglawdd Bae Caerdydd, taflodd Russell Goodway gontract at ei gilydd o fewn 48 awr a dyfarnwyd y fargen iddo. Ymddangosai hynny naill ai'n dra effeithlon ar ran y sector cyhoeddus, o'i gymharu â'r 18 mis a gymerwyd gan y sector preifat, neu'n dwyll gwleidyddol ac ariannol arall. Yr ydych wedi dyfalu'n iawn. Deuthum i'r un casgliad eto.

Ymddengys bod Cyfarwyddwr Cyllid Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, Phil Higgins, wedi gadael y gorfforaeth ddydd Sul 5 Medi ac wedi dechrau gweithio i gyngor sir Caerdydd ddydd Llun 6 Medi. Nid yw'n syndod y gallai cyngor sir Caerdydd gynnig cytundeb, heb ystyriaeth i unrhyw arbenigedd a gynigiai.

Cynigiwyd amcangyfrif o £12 miliwn i redeg yr awdurdod porthladd, ond cytunodd Alun Michael â Russell Goodway y gallai cyngor sir Caerdydd arbed £2 filiwn dros dair blynedd. Er gwaethaf y modd llwgr y cyflawnwyd hynny, swniai'r cynnig hwnnw'n ddigon rhesymol yn y lle cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y papur a gynigiwyd i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn Ionawr yn dangos bod y £12 miliwn hwn wedi codi'n rhyfeddol i £14 miliwn heb unrhyw reswm amlwg. Ni chynigiwyd unrhyw eglurhad mewn cwestiynau ar y pryd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld yn y papurau ar gyfer y Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf fod y ffigur hwn wedi ei ddiwygio'n £12 miliwn. Mae hyn oll yn ychwanegu at yr arddangosfa ddi-chwaeth neu'r trefniadau y credaf iddynt ddigwydd yn y negodiadau a arweiniodd at ddirwyn Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ben.

O ran yr arbediad honedig o £2 filiwn dros dair blynedd, bydd ychydig o gostau ychwanegol. Cred Thames Water y byddai ei gynnig ef wedi bod £3 miliwn yn rhatach pa un bynnag. Deallaf y bydd llawer o oblygiadau cyfreithiol o ganlyniad.

However, in addition to the extra cost, there will be a delay of freshwater impoundment for 12 months, lost business confidence, and a barrage that is designed to hold water back will have to move to a tidal regime in the summer months to maintain water quality, which is likely to lead to considerable damage to the structure. This has been likened to a car with five forward gears and one reverse gear being driven in reverse for twelve months. No manufacturer would offer you a guarantee on that operation, therefore nobody would expect the barrage designers to offer a warranty on a tidal flow regime. The potential costs—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know that this is a Conservative Party debate, but you have spoken for nearly 20 minutes. It is difficult for me to call Members outwith the Conservative Party to speak, as well as call votes on the amendments and protect the time of the short debate.

**Alun Cairns:** I will bring my speech to a close. Alun Michael's and Rhodri Morgan's negotiations have led to the Assembly picking up the tab for the 12-month delay of a freshwater impoundment, scouring damage, lost business confidence and safety implications of barrage operators who have not been trained. The shambles of the agreement that the First Secretary has fixed with Cardiff county council, or is still trying to negotiate, is potentially putting the safety of the barrage operators and the city of Cardiff at risk.

We are only three weeks away from Cardiff county council being handed the responsibility of running the barrage. Yet, it was less than three weeks ago that the recruitment procedure commenced. Within that short period, Cardiff county council must have sifted the applicants, short-listed the candidates, interviewed potential operators, allowed those operators to serve notice with their existing employers and completed all necessary training. All within five weeks—Russell Goodway is living in a dream world.

However, last week in the meeting of the Economic Development Committee, Russell Goodway said he thought it was possible.

Fodd bynnag, yn ogystal â'r gost ychwanegol, gohirir cronni dŵr croyw am 12 mis, collir hyder byd busnes, a bydd morglawdd a gynlluniwyd i ddal dŵr yn ôl yn gorfod symud yn ôl patrwm y llanw ym misoedd yr haf er mwyn cynnal ansawdd y dŵr, sydd yn debygol o arwain at gryn ddifrod i'r adeiladwaith. Cyffelybwyd hyn i gar â phum gêr ymlaen ac un gêr ôl yn cael ei yrru yn ei ôl am 12 mis. Ni chynigiad un gwneuthurwr warant ichi ar y gweithrediad hwnnw, felly ni ddisgwyliai neb i gynllunwyr y morglawdd gynnig gwarant ar batrwm llif y llanw. Mae'r costau posibl—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn mai dadl y Blaid Geidwadol yw hon, ond yr ydych yn siarad ers bron 20 munud. Mae'n anodd imi alw ar Aelodau o'r tu allan i'r Blaid Geidwadol i siarad, yn ogystal â galw pleidleisiau ar y gwelliannau a gwarchod amser y ddadl fer.

**Alun Cairns:** Terfynaf fy araith. Mae negodiadau Alun Michael a Rhodri Morgan wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle mae'r Cynulliad yn talu'r pris am y 12 mis o oedi cyn cronni dŵr croyw, difrod sgwrio, colli hyder byd busnes ac oblygiadau diogelwch gweithredwyr morglawdd sydd heb eu hyfforddi. Mae llastr y cytundeb a drefnodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd â chyngor sir Caerdydd, neu'r un y mae'n dal i geisio ei drafod, yn un a allai beryglu diogelwch gweithredwyr y morglawdd a dinas Caerdydd.

Nid oes ond tair wythnos nes y byddwn yn trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb rhedeg y morglawdd i gyngor sir Caerdydd. Eto, mae llai na thair wythnos ers dechrau'r weithdrefn recriwtio. Oddi mewn i'r cyfnod byr hwnnw, yr oedd yn rhaid i gyngor sir Caerdydd hidlo'r ymgeiswyr, gwneud rhestr fer o'r ymgeiswyr, cyfweld gweithredwyr posibl, caniatáu i'r gweithredwyr hynny roi rhybudd ymadael i'w cyflogwyr presennol a chwblhau'r holl hyfforddi angenrheidiol. Y cwbl o fewn pum wythnos—mae Russell Goodway yn byw ym myd breuddwydion.

Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, dywedodd Russell Goodway ei fod yn credu

Therefore, why did he say that he had negotiated a buffer contract with Crest Nicholson—the current barrage operators—to run it just in case? In discussions yesterday, Crest Nicholson told me that no such negotiations had been concluded and that it had, in fact, sent out redundancy notices yesterday. It is not interested in a three-month contract, but may consider something longer-term. Who are we to negotiate? We are being held over a barrel by Cardiff county council and the negotiations that have led to this.

The most prestigious civil engineering project in Europe is being sidelined from an official opening. Freshwater impoundment is being delayed by 12 months. There are enormous costs in terms of lost business confidence, scouring and lost warranty. Cardiff county council is receiving a £6 million handout in what I believe to be a stitch-up. Negotiations took place which contravened the Ministerial Code. By awarding the agreement to Cardiff county council and rejecting private sector bids, which apparently were cheaper, Russell Goodway is holding the Labour Executive over a barrel and the agreement is yet to be signed. We are three weeks away from the end of the existing barrage contract and nobody has been recruited, employed or trained to operate the flood prevention mechanisms. All this and Andrew Davies has the audacity to table an amendment to the motion. I will let the Assembly decide, Llywydd.

**Andrew Davies:** I propose amendment 1. After *'This Assembly'*, delete the words *'criticises the handling by the administration of'* and replace with the words *'notes the arrangements for'*.

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 2. Add at the end of the motion

*and requires that the final agreements between the National Assembly for Wales and Cardiff County Council include:*

*a clear definition of the 'initiatives for training, employment and the local community and other regeneration activities'*

bod hynny'n bosibl. Felly, pam y dywedodd ei fod wedi negodi contract clustogi â Crest Nicholson—gweithredwyr presennol y morglawdd—i'w redeg rhag ofn? Mewn trafodaethau ddoe, dywedodd Crest Nicholson wrthyf nad oedd unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath wedi eu cwblhau a'i fod, mewn gwirionedd, wedi anfon rhybuddion diswyddo ddoe. Nid oes ganddo ddiddordeb mewn contract tri mis, ond gallai ystyried rhywbeth tymor hwy. Pwy ydym ni i drafod? Yr ydym ar drugaredd cyngor sir Caerdydd ac mae'r trafodaethau wedi arwain at hyn.

Mae'r prosiect peirianeg sifil uchaf ei fri yn Ewrop yn cael ei wthio o'r neilltu heb agoriad swyddogol. Gohirir cronni dŵr croyw am 12 mis. Mae costau anferth o ran colli hyder byd busnes, sgwrio a cholli gwarant. Mae cyngor sir Caerdydd yn derbyn rhodd o £6 miliwn drwy'r hyn a gredaf sydd yn dwyll. Mae negodiadau wedi digwydd sydd yn groes i'r Cod Gweinidogol. Drwy ddyfarnu'r cytundeb i gyngor sir Caerdydd a gwrthod cynigion o'r sector preifat, a oedd yn rhatach mae'n debyg, mae Russell Goodway yn dal y Weithrediaeth Lafur ar gledr ei law ac nid yw'r cytundeb wedi ei arwyddo eto. Yr ydym dair wythnos o ddiwedd contract presennol y morglawdd ac nid oes neb wedi ei recriwtio, ei gyflogi na'i hyfforddi i weithredu'r mecanweithiau atal llifogydd. Ar ôl hyn oll mae gan Andrew Davies yr wyneb i gyflwyno gwelliant i'r cynnig. Gadawaf i'r Cynulliad benderfynu, Lywydd.

**Andrew Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Ar ôl *'Mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn'*, dileer y geiriau *'beirniadu'r ffordd y mae'r weinyddiaeth wedi delio â'r'* a rhoi yn eu lle *'nodi trefniadau'r'*.

**Michael German:** Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*ac mae'n mynnu bod y cytundebau terfynol rhwng Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Chyngor Sir Caerdydd yn cynnwys:*

*diffiniad clir o'r 'mentrau ar gyfer hyfforddiant, cyflogaeth a'r gymuned leol a gweithgareddau adfywio eraill' y dyrannwyd*

*for which £6.1 million have been allocated and*

*as firm as possible, a definition of any eventualities for which the National Assembly will be responsible, in order to protect the National Assembly's position and minimise any future additional financial expenditure in this area.*

I am not here to chuck allegations about. My purpose is to ensure that the interests of the Assembly and the taxpayers of Wales are fully protected. I might say that I come not to praise Caesar—or CBDC—but to sort out some of the problems that it left behind. As one who was around during the difficult initial stages when CBDC was set up, and one who is concerned about local people's concerns not being taken into account, I feel that it is right that the local authority should try to recover some of the functions that it has lost.

The people of Cardiff may not like Russell Goodway, but they do not like CBDC either. However, we should seek to maximise the financial benefit and get the best value for the Assembly. At the same time, one would expect Cardiff county council to seek to maximise the financial gain to Cardiff and its citizens, therefore we are definitely in a negotiating process. The ongoing negotiations between the CBDC, the Assembly and Cardiff council have been tense, sharp and, as you might expect, will continue to be tough. Ultimately, this Assembly, working on behalf of the people of Wales must ensure that they feel comfortable and that their interests as well as ours have been protected. The underpinning memoranda of understanding, which Alun Michael signed in April and October do not place legal obligations on this Assembly but they have been used as the basis for the Section 165 Agreements that underpin everything.

4:30 p.m.

There is a range of unanswered questions and my amendment seeks to address that fact today to protect our interests. It is right for this Assembly to seek best value for the

*£6.1 miliwn ar eu cyfer a*

*diffiniad mor bendant â phosibl o unrhyw ddigwyddiadau y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol amdanynt, er mwyn amddiffyn sefyllfa'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a lleihau unrhyw wariant ariannol ychwanegol ar hyn yn y dyfodol.*

Nid wyf yma i daflu cyhuddiadau. Fy mwriad yw sicrhau y caiff buddiannau'r Cynulliad a threthdalwyr Cymru eu diogelu'n llwyr. Gallwn ddweud imi ddod nid i foli Cesar—neu CDBC—ond i ddatrys rhai o'r problemau a adawodd ar ei hôl. Fel un a oedd o gwmpas yn ystod y cyfnodau cyntaf anodd pan sefydlwyd CDBC, ac un sydd yn bryderus na roddwyd sylw i bryderon pobl leol, teimlaf ei bod yn iawn y dylai'r awdurdod lleol geisio adfer rhai o'r swyddogaethau a gollodd.

Efallai nad yw pobl Caerdydd yn hoff o Russell Goodway, ond nid ydynt yn hoffi CDBC ychwaith. Fodd bynnag, dylem geisio amlhau'r budd ariannol a chael y gwerth gorau i'r Cynulliad. Ar yr un pryd, byddai rhywun yn disgwyl i gyngor sir Caerdydd geisio amlhau'r enillion ariannol i Gaerdydd a'i dinasyddion, felly yr ydym yn bendant mewn proses negodi. Bu'r trafodaethau sydd yn mynd rhagddynt rhwng CDBC, y Cynulliad a chyngor Caerdydd yn ddirdynol, yn graff ac, fel y gallech ddisgwyl, byddant yn parhau i fod yn anodd. Yn y pen draw, rhaid i'r Cynulliad hwn, gan weithio ar ran pobl Cymru sicrhau eu bod yn teimlo'n gyfforddus a bod eu buddiannau hwy yn ogystal â'n rhai ni wedi eu diogelu. Nid yw'r memoranda o gyd-ddealltwriaeth sylfaenol, a arwyddodd Alun Michael yn Ebrill a Hydref yn rhwymo'r Cynulliad hwn yn gyfreithiol ond fe'u defnyddiwyd fel y sylfaen ar gyfer y cytundebau Adran 165 sydd yn sail i bopeth.

Mae amrediad o gwestiynau sydd heb eu hateb ac mae fy nghynnig yn ceisio ymdrin â'r ffaith honno heddiw er mwyn diogelu ein buddiannau. Mae'n iawn i'r Cynulliad hwn



taxpayer's money in Wales. There are some in this Assembly—colleagues in my party, Rhodri Morgan, Sue and others who would have wanted the barrage to be in a different place. Unfortunately, that is a matter of history. We cannot wind the tape back; we have to continue from where we are at the moment.

Best value does not necessarily mean that we should put our faith and trust in Thames Water. Look at its record. It is the leakiest water company in Britain. It also has a poor record on technical competence. That would require some examination. It is an unanswered question because when we asked the local authority last week what it planned to do to meet the water quality conditions of the Cardiff Bay Barrage Act, it said that it had not yet determined the method that it would use. This Assembly needs the assurance that there is a methodology in place that is precise and that will pin down the proposed contractor to ensure that the water quality conditions are met. I agree with Alun Cairns: there are a range of concerns about scouring, water quality and other issues that should be addressed.

My amendment 2 also addresses the fact that £6.1 million has been allocated for additional regeneration. Members of the Economic Development and the Environment and Local Government Committees who met together to discuss this issue are genuinely concerned about it. Although the contracts were to be concluded by 31 March and have not yet been signed, we were told that the agreement did not include details of how the money should be spent. In other words, the decision on how to spend the money would be left until after the agreement had been signed. That is not satisfactory. The interest of this Assembly has not been met if that is going to be the case. We must establish what will be in the contract for that £6.1 million.

In April 1999, Cardiff council accepted that any funding provided for training, community activities, business development, event management and tourism promotion would be restricted to the purpose of completing the development of the bay area.

geisio'r gwerth gorau am arian y trethdalwr yng Nghymru. Mae rhai yn y Cynulliad hwn—cydweithwyr yn fy mhllaid i, Rhodri Morgan, Sue ac eraill a fyddai wedi bod eisiau i'r morglawdd fod mewn lle gwahanol. Gwaetha'r modd, mater i hanes yw hynny. Ni allwn ddirwyn y tâp yn ôl; rhaid inni fynd ymlaen o'r man lle'r ydym ar hyn o bryd.

Nid yw gwerth gorau o reidrwydd yn golygu y dylem roi ein ffydd a'n hymddiriedaeth yn Thames Water. Edrychwch ar ei record. Hwn yw'r cwmni dŵr mwyaf diferllyd ym Mhrydain. Mae ganddo record wael hefyd ar allu technegol. Byddai angen edrych ar hynny. Mae'n gwestiwn sydd heb ei ateb oherwydd pan ofynasom i'r awdurdod lleol yr wythnos diwethaf beth yr oedd yn bwriadu ei wneud i gyflawni'r amodau ansawdd dŵr yn Neddf Morglawdd Bae Caerdydd, dywedodd nad oedd eto wedi pennu'r dull a ddefnyddiai. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad gael sicrwydd bod methodoleg ar waith sydd yn fanwl ac a fydd yn rhoi rhwymedigaeth ar y contractwr arfaethedig er mwyn sicrhau y cyflawnir yr amodau ansawdd dŵr. Cytunaf ag Alun Cairns: mae amryw o bryderon ynghylch sgwrio, ansawdd dŵr a materion eraill y dylid rhoi sylw iddynt.

Mae fy ngwelliant 2 hefyd yn ymwneud â'r ffaith fod £6.1 miliwn wedi ei ddyrannu ar gyfer adfywio ychwanegol. Mae'r aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol a gyfarfu â'i gilydd i drafod y mater hwn yn pryderu'n wirioneddol yn ei gylch. Er bod y contractau i'w cwblhau erbyn 31 Mawrth ac er nad ydynt wedi eu harwyddo eto, dywedwyd wrthym nad oedd y cytundeb yn cynnwys manylion am y modd y dylid gwario'r arian. Mewn geiriau eraill, gadewid y penderfyniad ynghylch y modd o wario'r arian tan ar ôl arwyddo'r cytundeb. Nid yw hynny'n foddhaol. Ni ofalwyd am fuddiant y Cynulliad hwn os mai hynny sydd i ddigwydd. Rhaid inni sefydlu beth fydd yn y contract hwnnw ar gyfer y £6.1 miliwn.

Yn Ebrill 1999, derbyniodd cyngor Caerdydd y byddai unrhyw arian a ddarperid ar gyfer hyfforddi, gweithgareddau cymunedol, datblygu busnes, rheoli digwyddiadau a hybu twristiaeth wedi ei gyfyngu i'r diben o gwblhau datblygiad ardal y Bae. Sylwch ar y

Note the word 'completing' not 'continuing' or 'undertaking', so it must be possible for us to be able to identify and to cost the work that is necessary to complete the development of the bay area. In the meantime, the WDA is faced with managing the completion of the Bute Avenue PFI on a reduced budget. That is inequitable, so we must establish whether we are getting the best value for money from the contracts before us.

This amendment seeks to express the views of the Economic Development and the Environment and Local Government Committees. Negotiating with Cardiff council and its leader, as I am sure that Ron Davies and others in this Chamber will tell you, is rather like handling a slippery eel. I suppose that that is better than being hit by a wet kipper. One way or other, we need a strong way of ensuring that arbitration between the Assembly and Cardiff council and its leader in subsequent years is in place. At the moment, I am not satisfied that the contract documents allow sufficiently strong arbitration to enable us to reserve and strengthen our position. We must be convinced that the taxpayers and the people of Wales will not be forever digging deeper and deeper into their pockets, not knowing where it will end.

This Assembly cannot be a bottomless purse with money diverted from other public services, both for Cardiff and elsewhere. Every single document available on this transfer shows different figures. No matter where you look, whatever you are trying to find a solution for or whatever you are paying for, the figures will vary from one day to the next. That does not do much for public confidence.

Our worry is that the Assembly will continue to shell out more and more money without having the essential controls in place. That is what amendment 2 seeks to do. It asks this Assembly to ensure that the contracts are sufficiently watertight to ensure that the Assembly does not have to pass out more and more money from the public purse and that the purse will not forever be drained by the resources that we will be required to continue to provide, as we negotiate on issues which

gair 'cwblhau' nid 'parhau' neu 'cyflawni', felly rhaid iddi fod yn bosibl inni ddynodi a chostio'r gwaith sydd yn angenrheidiol i gwblhau datblygiad ardal y bae. Yn y cyfamser, mae'r WDA yn gorfod dygymod â chwblhau menter cyllid preifat Bute Avenue ar gyllideb is. Mae hynny'n annheg, felly rhaid inni ganfod a ydym yn cael y gwerth gorau am arian o'r contractau sydd ger ein bron.

Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn ceisio mynegi barn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol. Mae negodi â chyngor Caerdydd a'i arweinydd, fel y bydd Ron Davies ac eraill yn y Siambr hon, yn dweud wrthy, yr wyf yn siŵr, braidd fel trin llysywen lithrig. Tybiaf fod hynny'n well na chael eich taro gan bennog gwlyb. Un ffordd neu'r llall, mae arnom angen dull cryf o sicrhau bod cyflafareddu ar waith rhwng y Cynulliad a chyngor Caerdydd yn y blynyddoedd dilynol. Ar hyn o bryd, nid wyf yn sicr bod y dogfennau contract yn caniatáu cyflafareddu digon cryf i'n galluogi i gynnal a chryfhau ein sefyllfa. Rhaid inni fod yn argyhoeddedig na fydd trethdalwyr a phobl Cymru yn mynd yn ddyfnach o hyd i'w pocedi, heb wybod pryd y daw hynny i ben.

Ni all y Cynulliad hwn fod yn bwrs diwaelod, ac arian yn cael ei ddargyfeirio oddi wrth wasanaethau cyhoeddus, boed hynny i Gaerdydd neu i fannau eraill. Mae pob dogfen sydd ar gael ar y trosglwyddo hwn yn dangos gwahanol ffigurau. Ni waeth ym mhle yr edrychwch, beth bynnag yr ydych yn ceisio ateb iddo neu beth bynnag yr ydych yn talu amdano, bydd y ffigurau yn amrywio o un diwrnod i'r llall. Ni wna hynny fawr ddim i hybu hyder y cyhoedd.

Y pryder sydd gennym yw y bydd y Cynulliad yn parhau i gyfrannu mwy a mwy o arian heb gael y mesurau rheoli hanfodol yn eu lle. Dyna'r hyn y mae gwelliant 2 yn ceisio'i wneud. Mae'n gofyn i'r Cynulliad hwn sicrhau bod y contractau'n ddigon cynhwysfawr fel nad oes yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad drosglwyddo mwy a mwy o arian o'r pwrs cyhoeddus ac na fydd y pwrs hwnnw'n cael ei wagio o hyd gan yr adnoddau y bydd yn ofynnol inni eu darparu

Cardiff council want us to complete. I therefore ask you to support amendment 2 to ensure that we, as an Assembly, seek to draw the line and keep control of the public purse.

**David Melding:** I will try not to take such a combative approach as my colleague, Alun Cairns did in setting out these issues so vigorously. Perhaps my mode of delivery can be a bit more ‘thought for the day’.

When we consider the future of Cardiff and the achievements of the last 15 years, it is appropriate to put it in a wider perspective. Cardiff, for me, symbolises the history of Glamorgan. I am proud to say that I am a Glamorgan son. I was born in Neath. I have lived in Cardiff most of my life and now live in Barry. The county means a lot to me. It is not the whole of Wales. I grant those who are from other parts of Wales that sometimes we can get drawn into that trap. However, it has certainly been a county that has played a prominent part in the history of Wales and its historical and industrial development.

If you visit Cardiff Castle, you can see the foundations of the Roman walls. This reminds us that, from the earliest historical times, people in this part of the world have sought to build an environment that gives them vision and security for the future. In medieval times, this was an important place, although the settlement of Cardiff was fairly small.

Llandaff Cathedral had a huge influence on church matters. However, it was the industrial period that saw Cardiff expand remarkably from 2,000 people in 1801 to 165,000 by 1901 and nearly double that today. It was an astonishing growth. Many of us look at the development of cities in the New World and North America and forget that Cardiff developed at that pace.

In 1910 there were roughly 400 coal mines in Glamorgan. One third of the world’s exported coal passed through the port of

o hyd, wrth inni negodi ynghylch materion y mae cyngor Caerdydd am inni eu cwblhau. Gofynnaf felly ichi gefnogi gwelliant 2 er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni, fel Cynulliad, yn ceisio tynnu’r llinell a chadw rheolaeth ar y pwrs cyhoeddus.

**David Melding:** Nid wyf am geisio bod mor ymosodol yn fy agwedd ag yr oedd fy nghydweithiwr, Alun Cairns wrth gyflwyno’r materion hyn mor egnïol. Efallai y bydd fy null cyflwyno yn debycach i ‘funud i feddwl’.

Pan ystyriwn ddyfodol Caerdydd a’r hyn a gyflawnwyd yn y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, priodol yw rhoi hynny mewn cyd-destun ehangach. Yn fy ngolwg i, mae Caerdydd yn symbol o hanes Morgannwg. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud mai brodor o Forgannwg ydwyf. Fe’m ganwyd yng Nghastell-nedd. Bûm yn byw yng Nghaerdydd am y rhan fwyaf o’m hoes ac yr wyf yn byw bellach yn y Barri. Mae’r sir yn golygu llawer i mi. Nid Cymru gyfan mohoni. Addefaf wrth y rhai o rannau eraill o Gymru ein bod weithiau’n cael ein tynnu i’r fagl honno. Fodd bynnag, mae’n sicr yn sir a chwaraeodd ran flaenllaw yn hanes Cymru a’i datblygiad hanesyddol a diwydiannol.

Os ewch i Gastell Caerdydd, gallwch weld sylfeini’r muriau Rhufeinig. Mae hynny’n ein hatgoffa bod pobl yn y rhan hon o’r byd, o’r cyfnodau hanesyddol cynharaf, wedi ceisio adeiladu amgylchedd sydd yn rhoi gweledigaeth iddynt a sicrwydd ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn y cyfnod canoloesol, yr oedd yn lle pwysig, er bod anheddiad Caerdydd yn eithaf bach.

Yr oedd Eglwys Gadeiriol Llandaf yn fawr ei dylanwad ar faterion eglwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfnod diwydiannol y gwelwyd twf rhyfeddol Caerdydd o 2,000 o bobl yn 1801 i 165,000 erbyn 1901 ac i bron ddwywaith hynny heddiw. Yr oedd yn dwf rhyfeddol. Mae llawer ohonom yn edrych ar ddatblygiad dinasoedd yn y Byd Newydd a Gogledd America ac yn anghofio bod Caerdydd wedi datblygu cyn gyflymed â hynny.

Yn 1910 yr oedd tua 400 o lofeydd yn Morgannwg. Âi un rhan o dair o allforion glo’r byd drwy borthladd Caerdydd, a oedd

Cardiff, which was one of the world's greatest ports. This was an astonishing development. It is a small part of our history if we look at it now in a wider perspective. However, at the time, the vigour and vision that that brought to people was astonishing, and it is that success that we must build on. We are not abolishing anything. When we find a new use for the magnificent docks that were left to us, we will not be turning our backs on that heritage, but realising that our world is different. However, we hope to have the same enterprise and vision for the future as our forebears.

In the period between 1900 and the 1930s, the civic buildings in Cardiff were built to an astonishing degree. They are quite magnificent. For example, City Hall, the museum and other buildings built with the profits of coal owners, such as the Temple of Peace, bring a vision that linked Wales with the League of Nations and international issues in a striking and innovative way.

By about 1980, Cardiff seemed to be in decline. When I came to University in 1981, people were rather depressed about the future of Cardiff, particularly Cardiff south of the tracks. I remember being reminded by lecturers on an economic history course how different Cardiff was if you took the railway line and divided Cardiff into north and south. In south Cardiff there did not seem to be much hope for the future. A new vision was conceived in the early 1980s, and it is fitting that Alun Cairns paid tribute to the cross-party involvement of all the people in Cardiff and south Wales. This was not created by one party.

4:40 p.m.

**David Davies:** While it is important that we recognise the benefits that this scheme has brought to Cardiff, will David Melding accept that some people have suffered as a result? Does he share my concern about those who saw their land compulsorily purchased in order to make way for a bird sanctuary? Some have still not received compensation, and I declare an interest in that I know one of those people. He lost 300 acres of land that

yn un o borthladdoedd mwyaf y byd. Yr oedd hwn yn ddatblygiad rhyfeddol. Rhan fach o'n hanes ydyw os edrychwn arno'n awr o safbwynt ehangach. Fodd bynnag, ar y pryd, yr oedd yr egni a'r weledigaeth a ddaeth i bobl drwy hynny yn rhyfeddol, a'r llwyddiant hwnnw yw'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu arno. Nid ydym yn dinistrio dim. Pan ddeuwn o hyd i ddefnydd newydd i'r dociau gwych a adawyd i ni, ni fyddwn yn troi ein cefn ar y dreftadaeth honno, ond yn sylweddoli bod ein byd yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn y bydd gennym yr un fenter a gweledigaeth at y dyfodol ag a oedd gan eu cyndadau.

Yn y cyfnod rhwng 1900 a'r 1930au, codwyd adeiladau dinesig yng Nghaerdydd ar raddfa ryfeddol. Maent yn gwbl wych. Er enghraifft, mae Neuadd y Ddinas, yr amgueddfa a'r adeiladau eraill a godwyd ag elw perchnogion y glofeydd, fel y Deml Heddwch, yn dod â gweledigaeth a gysylltodd Gymru â Chynghair y Cenhedloedd a materion rhyngwladol mewn modd trawiadol ac arloesol.

Erbyn tua 1980, ymddangosai fod Caerdydd yn dirywio. Pan ddeuthum yma i'r Brifysgol yn 1981, yr oedd pobl braidd yn ddigalon ynghylch dyfodol Caerdydd, yn enwedig Caerdydd i'r de o'r rheilffordd. Cofiaf gael fy atgoffa gan ddarlithwyr mewn cwrs hanes economaidd mor wahanol yr oedd Caerdydd os oeddech yn cymryd y rheilffordd ac yn rhannu Caerdydd yn ogledd ac yn dde. Yn ne Caerdydd nid ymddangosai fod llawer o obaith ar gyfer y dyfodol. Cafwyd gweledigaeth newydd yn y 1980au cynnar, ac mae'n briodol bod Alun Cairns wedi talu teyrnged i gyfraniad trawsbleidiol holl bobl Caerdydd a de Cymru. Ni chrewyd hynny gan un blaid.

**David Davies:** Er ei bod yn bwysig inni gydnabod y buddion a ddaeth i Gaerdydd o'r cynllun hwn, a yw David Melding yn fodlon derbyn bod rhai wedi dioddef o ganlyniad? A yw'n rhannu fy mhryder am y rhai a welodd brynu eu tir drwy orfodaeth er mwyn gwneud lle i warchodfa adar? Mae rhai heb dderbyn iawndal o hyd, a datganaf fuddiant i'r graddau fy mod yn adnabod un o'r bobl hynny. Collodd 300 erw o dir a fu yn ei deulu

had been in his family for centuries. While it is right that we celebrate this achievement in Cardiff, does my colleague agree that it has not been to the benefit of everyone?

**David Melding:** I sympathise with anyone who feels aggrieved. There are procedures to deal with people who feel that their affairs have been maladministered.

I started by emphasising the part that the built environment plays in human affairs. We must concede that when we build something such as the barrage, there are costs and losses. However, it has always been man's endeavour to control the environment. It is impossible to live the modern enterprising life that we all take for granted unless we control everything from agriculture to telecommunications. The built environment is part of that. I am uncertain about the specific issues to which my colleague referred, but I am sure that they are worthy of further examination.

I mentioned the cross-party support shown to the Cardiff Bay development by people such as Lord Brook, Nicholas Edwards, who was a visionary in this respect, and Sir Geoffrey Inkin who took the idea forward. There are others who were involved and I have named but a few. I am not saying that local authorities did not have a part to play. It is easy to play a harsh partisan game about who should have taken this forward. Many people and authorities had a part to play.

**Nick Bourne:** Some previous points need re-emphasising. One of the basic problems is that we have suffered from three individuals who took different views. Our previous First Secretary favoured the barrage and wanted it publicised. The new First Secretary was against the barrage and any publicity. In between these two we had the Lord Mayor, Russell Goodway, who favoured Russell Goodway and wanted to publicise that. Has that not been one of the great dangers and the reason why we have not seen the publicity that this project deserves? This is to the detriment of Cardiff and Wales.

ers canrifoedd. Er ei bod yn iawn inni ddatlu'r orchest hon yng Nghaerdydd, a yw fy nghyd-Aelod yn cytuno na fu er budd i bawb?

**David Melding:** Cydymdeimlaf ag unrhyw un a deimla iddo gael cam. Mae gweithdrefnau i ddelio â phobl sydd yn teimlo bod eu busnes wedi ei gamweinyddu.

Dechreuais drwy bwysleisio rhan yr amgylchedd adeiledig mewn materion dynol. Rhaid inni dderbyn, pan adeiladwn rywbeth fel y morglawdd, fod costau a cholledion. Fodd bynnag, mae dyn yn ymdrechu erioed i reoli'r amgylchedd. Ni ellir byw'r bywyd mentrus a gymerwn oll yn ganiataol oni reolwn bopeth o amaethyddiaeth i delegyfathrebu. Mae'r amgylchedd adeiledig yn rhan o hynny. Nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch y materion penodol y cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod atynt, ond yr wyf yn sicr eu bod yn teilyngu archwiliad pellach.

Crybwyllais y gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol a roddwyd i ddatblygu Bae Caerdydd gan bobl fel Arglwydd Brook, Nicholas Edwards, a oedd yn weledydd yn hyn o beth, a Syr Geoffrey Inkin a aeth â'r syniad yn ei flaen. Yr oedd eraill yn gysylltiedig ac nid enwais ond ychydig. Nid wyf yn dweud nad oedd rhan i'w chwarae gan awdurdodau lleol. Hawdd yw chwarae gêm bleidiol galed ynghylch pwy a ddylai fod wedi mynd â hyn ymlaen. Yr oedd gan lawer o bobl ac awdurdodau ran i'w chwarae.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae angen ailbwysleisio rhai o'r pwyntiau blaenorol. Un o'r problemau sylfaenol yw ein bod wedi dioddef oherwydd tri unigolyn oedd yn wahanol eu barn. Yr oedd ein Prif Ysgrifennydd blaenorol o blaid y morglawdd ac am gael cyhoeddusrwydd iddo. Yr oedd y Prif Ysgrifennydd newydd yn erbyn y morglawdd ac unrhyw gyhoeddusrwydd. Rhwng y ddau hyn cawsom yr Arglwydd Faer, Russell Goodway, a oedd o blaid Russell Goodway ac a oedd am gael cyhoeddusrwydd i hynny. Onid hynny fu un o'r peryglon mwyaf a'r rheswm pam na welsom y cyhoeddusrwydd y mae'r prosiect hwn yn ei haeddu? Mae hyn er afles i Gaerdydd a Chymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Is this a brief intervention?

**Nick Bourne:** This is a brief intervention and it would be even briefer if I were allowed to finish.

**The Presiding Officer:** I would be grateful if you finished your intervention now because this is a Conservative debate and I must have regard of the short debate that is due to begin at 5.00 p.m. There are also three votes to be cast.

**Nick Bourne:** I thought that I would be assisting by making an intervention rather than a speech.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are you, therefore, winding up the debate on behalf of your party?

**Nick Bourne:** We have only had two speeches so far.

My point relates to the important issue of the benefit to the people of Wales. It is a shame that there are not more Labour and Plaid Cymru Members present to hear about the benefit that should accrue to the city if the £16 million of assets were identified to fund projects in Cardiff, and if the people who are supposed to work the barrage were in place and were properly trained.

**David Melding:** I commend my friend's remarks to the Executive for further consideration.

I was taking a thought for the day approach and I will now move to a conclusion. It is important to look forward. There have been battles along the way. When I look around Cardiff and witness the astonishing transformation, it is clear that we are about three-quarters of the way through this project. A lot of land is now becoming available. The final stage in many ways clinches the success of the project, or whether it merely achieves a more average outcome. We must now focus on the last stage and ensure that the local authority with responsibility for its delivery meets the most exacting demands and executes a vision that takes Cardiff forward. This is one of the great cities of Europe. We

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ai ymyriad byr yw hwn?

**Nick Bourne:** Ymyriad byr ydyw a byddai'n fyrrach byth pe caniateid imi orffen.

**Y Llywydd:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn gorffen eich ymyriad yn awr oherwydd dadl y Ceidwadwyr yw hon a rhaid imi ystyried y ddadl fer sydd i fod i ddechrau am 5.00 p.m. Mae tair pleidlais i'w bwrw hefyd.

**Nick Bourne:** Tybiais y byddwn yn cynorthwyo drwy ymyrryd yn hytrach na gwneud araith.

**Y Llywydd:** A ydych, felly, yn dirwyn y ddadl i ben ar ran eich plaid?

**Nick Bourne:** Ni chawsom ond dwy araith hyd yn hyn.

Mae'r pwynt sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â'r mater pwysig o fudd i bobl Cymru. Mae'n drueni nad oes mwy o Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru'n bresennol i glywed am y budd a ddylai ddod i ran y ddinas, pe câi'r £16 miliwn o asedau eu dynodi i ariannu prosiectau yng Nghaerdydd, a phe câi'r rhai sydd i fod i weithio'r morglawdd eu penodi a'u hyfforddi'n briodol.

**David Melding:** Cymeradwyaf sylwadau fy nghyfaill i'r Weithrediaeth i'w hystyried ymhellach.

Yr oeddwn yn siarad yn null 'munud i feddwl' ac yr wyf bellach am derfynu. Mae'n bwysig edrych ymlaen. Bu brwydrau ar hyd y ffordd. Pan edrychaf o gwmpas Caerdydd a gweld y trawsffurfiad rhyfeddol, mae'n amlwg ein bod tua thri chwarter ffordd drwy'r prosiect hwn. Mae llawer o dir ar gael yn awr. Mae'r cam olaf ar lawer ystyr yn selio llwyddiant y prosiect, neu'n pennu ai canlyniad mwy cyffredin yn unig a geir. Bellach rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y cam olaf a sicrhau bod yr awdurdod lleol sydd yn gyfrifol am ei gyflawni yn cyrraedd y gofynion mwyaf ymestynnol ac yn gwireddu gweledigaeth sydd yn mynd â Chaerdydd ymlaen. Hon yw un o ddinasoedd mawr

live in a world where the provincial world is again being writ large. In many ways, the age of centralism has ended. We want to take our place as one of Europe's great provincial cities, and we can. The last stage is here and we can succeed or, if we bicker, fail. Much has been put in place for us to move forward and achieve an outstanding outcome. We should all seek to be part of that, regardless of party and past stances on these issues. Cardiff deserves the best from us all.

**Janet Ryder:** I have not always lived in Cardiff and have not always been aware of the machinations around this issue. Therefore, I will give you an outsider's view of how it has appeared to people living at the other end of Wales, particularly in the last few weeks.

This issue and how it has been handled does not seem to have been an example of good practice or even—it must be said—open government. Many more questions have been raised than have been answered, despite joint committees and so on. However this has been handled, the important issue is getting appropriate water quality management strategies right and in place by the summer. If we do not, we could be in a bad position, especially given the location of this building. I declare an interest, as a new resident in the bay area. It will affect many of us who have moved into this area.

Water quality is important and I will concentrate on that. During our meetings with it, Cardiff City and County Council has consistently refused to give assurances on several critical issues relating to the transfer of functions. There has been no clarification on how the council will respond to the Environment Agency's directives, no confirmation that the council has a methodology in place to control the lake and no clear indication of the methodology that it will employ to secure environmental standards. That is the crux of the issue.

Cardiff Bay Development Corporation put a tender in the Official Journal of the European Community in early summer 1998 and

Ewrop. Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd lle y mae'r byd taleithiol yn dod i'r amlwg eto. Ar lawer ystyr, mae oes canoli ar ben. Yr ydym am gymryd ein lle fel un o ddinasoedd taleithiol mawr Ewrop, a gallwn wneud hynny. Mae'r cam olaf yma a gallwn lwyddo neu, os ymgecrwn, gallwn fethu. Mae llawer wedi ei gyflawni er mwyn inni symud ymlaen a chyflawni canlyniad eithriadol. Dylem oll geisio bod yn rhan o hynny, beth bynnag fo'n plaid a'n safbwyntiau yn y gorffennol ar y materion hyn. Mae Caerdydd yn haeddu'r gorau gennym i gyd.

**Janet Ryder:** Nid yng Nghaerdydd yr wyf yn byw erioed ac ni fûm yn ymwybodol bob amser o'r cynllwynion ynghylch y mater hwn. Felly, rhoddaf safbwynt rhywun o'r tu allan ar y modd y mae wedi ymddangos i bobl sydd yn byw yn y pen arall o Gymru, yn enwedig yn yr wythnosau diwethaf hyn.

Nid yw'r mater hwn a'r modd yr ymdriniwyd ag ef yn ymddangos yn enghraifft o arfer da na hyd yn oed—rhaid dweud—llywodraeth agored. Codwyd llawer mwy o gwestiynau nag a atebwyd, er gwaethaf cyd-bwyllgorau ac yn y blaen. Sut bynnag yr ymdriniwyd â hyn, y mater pwysig yw cael strategaethau rheoli ansawdd dŵr priodol yn iawn ac ar waith erbyn yr haf. Os na wnawn hynny, gallem fod mewn sefyllfa wael, yn enwedig yng ngolwg lleoliad yr adeilad hwn. Datganaf fuddiant, fel un o drigolion newydd ardal y bae. Bydd yn effeithio ar lawer ohonom a symudodd i'r ardal hon.

Mae ansawdd dŵr yn bwysig ac yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar hynny. Yn ystod ein cyfarfodydd ag ef, mae Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd wedi gwrthod yn gyson roi sicrwydd ar sawl mater holl bwysig sydd yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo swyddogaethau. Ni fu unrhyw eglurhad ynghylch sut y bydd y cyngor yn ymateb i gyfarwyddebau Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, nac unrhyw gadarnhad bod gan y cyngor unrhyw fethodoleg ar waith i reoli'r llyn nac unrhyw arwydd clir am y fethodoleg a ddefnyddia i sicrhau safonau amgylcheddol. Dyna graidd y mater.

Rhoddodd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd dendr yng Nghylchgrawn Swyddogol y Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn

companies then made bids according to that tender. CBDC decided to give work to one main bidder, instead of to many companies that bid for different aspects of the tender. That main bidder turned out to be Thames Water, with other companies—local companies perhaps—managing water quality and the barrage. The tendering process was open and was according to public procurement requirements. The bids were worked on, developed and refined over the months. Then, suddenly, on 7 December, 1999, the former First Secretary made an announcement to the Assembly:

‘I turn to the other issue covered by this statement. Over the past month, I have personally supervised a detailed exercise that has scrutinised the options in this area. This has involved close consultation with CBDC, Cardiff City and County Council, the Environment Agency Wales and representatives of the business community. I am now in a position to draw conclusions. The Development Corporation put a proposal to me that the future management of the bay should be the subject of a three or five-year contract let to Thames Water, who had emerged as the preferred bidder following a tendering process conducted by CBDC in line with EU procurement rules.

However, in my statement to the Assembly on 20 October, I confirmed that Cardiff City and County Council would be assuming the responsibilities and functions of the harbour authority as part of the wider succession arrangements for Cardiff Bay. Instinctively, I think it is right that the local authority with its democratic mandate should be given the opportunity to assume as many of the post-CBDC functions as are appropriate to transfer to it and that it is able to discharge.

Against this background, it is only right that the local authority should be consulted on that decision, as it would assume management responsibility for the Thames Water contract if it were let. In the event, the county council was able to formulate an

gynnar yn haf 1998 a gwnaethpwyd cynigion wedyn gan gwmnïau yn unol â'r tendr hwnnw. Penderfynodd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd roi'r gwaith i un prif ymgeisydd, yn hytrach nag i lawer o gwmnïau a ymgeisiodd am wahanol agweddau ar y tendr. Gwelwyd wedyn mai'r prif ymgeisydd hwnnw oedd Thames Water, gyda chwmnïau eraill—cwmnïau lleol efallai—yn rheoli ansawdd dŵr a'r morglawdd. Yr oedd y broses tendro'n agored ac yn unol â gofynion caffael cyhoeddus. Gweithiwyd ar y cynigion, eu datblygu a'u cyweirio dros y misoedd. Yna, yn sydyn, ar 7 Rhagfyr, 1999, gwnaeth y cyn-Brif Ysgrifennydd gyhoeddiad i'r Cynulliad:

‘Trof at y mater arall sydd dan sylw yn y datganiad hwn. Dros y mis diwethaf, bûm yn bersonol yn goruchwyllo ymarfer manwl sydd wedi archwilio'r dewisiadau yn y maes hwn. Mae hyn wedi cynnwys ymgynghori manwl â Chorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a chynrychiolwyr o'r gymuned fusnes. Yr wyf bellach mewn sefyllfa i ddod i gasgliadau. Rhoddwyd cynnig i mi gan y Gorfforaeth Datblygu y dylai rheolaeth y bae yn y dyfodol fod yn ddarostyngedig i gontract tair neu bum-mlunedd a osodir i Thames Water, a ddaeth i'r amlwg fel y dewis ymgeisydd ar ôl proses tendro a gynhaliwyd gan Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd yn unol â rheolau caffael yr UE.

Fodd bynnag, yn fy natganiad i'r Cynulliad ar 20 Hydref, cadarnheais y byddai Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau a swyddogaethau'r awdurdod porthladd fel rhan o'r trefniadau olynau ehangach ar gyfer Bae Caerdydd. Yn reddfól, credaf ei bod yn iawn y dylai'r awdurdod lleol â'i fandad democrataidd gael y cyfle i ymgymryd â chynifer ag y bo modd o'r swyddogaethau ôl-Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd ag y mae'n briodol eu trosglwyddo iddo ac y mae'n alluog i'w cyflawni.

Yn erbyn y cefndir hwn, nid yw ond yn briodol y dylid ymgynghori â'r awdurdod lleol ynghylch y penderfyniad hwnnw, gan y byddai'n ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb rheoli dros gontract Thames Water pe câi ei osod. Fel y digwyddodd, yr oedd y Cyngor Sir yn



alternative to the Thames Water option, which I have also carefully considered. After doing so, I have concluded that the council option offers better value for money. It offers advantages in terms of cost and affordability, better control of risk and a more comprehensive solution in terms of maximising the business and leisure potential of the Cardiff Bay.'

4:50 p.m.

That raises a number of questions about the whole process. To an outsider looking at the process, it is at that point that matters seem to have gone behind closed doors. No-one would dispute that giving control of the bay to a democratically elected body is the right thing to do. Nobody is here to defend the actions of CBDC. However, the then First Secretary said in his statement that Cardiff council would assume management responsibility for the Thames Water contract if it were let. In the next sentence he said that the council was able to formulate an alternative to the Thames option. He carefully considered the council offer and concluded that it was a better offer.

However, had the council, when it formed its bid, seen the Thames Water bid, and is that an open and fair way of doing things? If it had formed an alternative to the Thames scheme, then why has it consistently failed to come forward with this scheme? We must question whether this alternative ever existed, apart from the rumoured alternative that the council could do it cheaper.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will have to call Rhodri Morgan in one minute.

**Janet Ryder:** The Economic Development Committee's minutes of 15 December state that the council would be given further time to consider how to come forward with this scheme. In the last joint meeting with the Environment and Local Government Committee, councillor Russell Goodway said that the council had still not determined how it intended to monitor water quality. That is not good enough, because maintaining water quality is the main point of this whole issue.

gallu llunio dewis yn lle un Thames Water, yr wyf hefyd wedi ei ystyried yn ofalus. Ar ôl gwneud hynny, deuthum i'r casgliad fod dewis y Cyngor yn cynnig gwell gwerth am arian. Mae'n cynnig manteision o ran cost a fforddiadwyedd, gwell rheolaeth ar risg ac ateb mwy cynhwysfawr o ran cynyddu potensial busnes a hamdden Bae Caerdydd i'r eithaf.

Mae hynny'n codi nifer o gwestiynau am y broses gyfan. I rywun sydd yn edrych ar y broses o'r tu allan, y pwynt hwnnw yw ei bod yn ymddangos bod materion wedi mynd y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig. Ni fyddai neb yn dadlau nad y peth iawn yw rhoi rheolaeth ar y bae i gorff a etholir yn ddemocrataidd. Nid oes neb yma i amddiffyn gweithredoedd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd y Prif Ysgrifennydd bryd hynny yn ei ddatganiad y byddai cyngor Caerdydd yn ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb rheoli dros gontract Thames Water pe câi ei osod. Yn y frawddeg nesaf dywedodd fod y cyngor yn gallu llunio dewis arall yn lle un Thames. Rhoddodd ystyriaeth ofalus i gynnig y cyngor a daeth i'r casgliad ei fod yn well cynnig.

Fodd bynnag, a oedd y cyngor, pan luniodd ei gynnig, wedi gweld cynnig Thames Water, ac a yw hynny'n ddull agored a theg o wneud pethau? Os oedd wedi llunio dewis arall yn lle cynllun Thames, yna pam y mae wedi methu'n gyson â chyflwyno'r cynllun hwn? Rhaid inni holi a fu'r dewis arall hwn erioed yn bod, ar wahân i'r si am y dewis y gallai'r cyngor ei wneud yn rhatach.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Bydd yn rhaid imi alw ar Rhodri Morgan ymhen un funud.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae cofnodion y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd am 15 Rhagfyr yn datgan y rhoddid amser ychwanegol i'r cyngor ystyried sut i gyflwyno'r cynllun hwn. Yn y cyd-gyfarfod diwethaf â Phwyllgor yr Amgylchedd a Llywodraeth Leol, dywedodd y cynghorydd Russell Goodway fod y cyngor yn dal heb benderfynu sut y bwriada fonitro ansawdd dŵr. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da, oherwydd cynnal ansawdd dŵr yw prif bwynt yr holl

There are other issues about Section 165 Agreements, which in the Committee we were assured we could see. When I asked to see them they were given to me, but all the figures had been erased, which made it hard to evaluate them. Those figures have been available to other people in the past, and I want to know where those figures have gone. There has been an evaluation of those figures, which would show that the Thames Water bid for the management of the water quality is cheaper.

We need a clear assurance that if the scheme the council decides upon to manage the water quality is more expensive than the first option, it will not be able to come back to the Assembly for more money and it will have to find the money itself. We need an assurance today that no blank cheque will be given to Cardiff council if maintaining water quality, monitoring the barrage and developing the bay area proves to be more expensive than it first decided. We agree with the motion, Mike German's amendment 2 and Alun Cairns's amendment 3. However, because we cannot agree with the way the first speaker conducted himself in this Chamber, we cannot support the motion or amendment 3. We will not vote against them because we agree that this has not been handled properly, but the first speaker should have been more considerate in his arguments. We will therefore abstain.

**The First Secretary:** It is rather late in the day for me to start my speech, but this is a debate that the Conservatives have introduced. As a general warning to Alun Cairns, when you dip your shovel in the manure and start flinging it about, you will find that the manure shovel develops a certain boomerang quality. It is not right or proper for Alun to start making allegations of corruption, either about Alun Michael, Russell Goodway or myself. If he wants to assemble a dossier of facts and submit it to the proper quarters, that is fine, but to use Assembly privilege in this way lowers the tone of the Chamber. I do not think that anybody in the Chamber, probably including many in his own party, wants to be associated with the way in which he conducted himself this afternoon. He will have heard the reaction from Janet Ryder. It is in common

fater. Mae materion eraill ynghylch Cytundebau Adran 165, y dywedwyd wrthym yn y Pwyllgor y caem eu gweld. Pan ofynnais am eu gweld fe'u rhoddwyd i mi, ond yr oedd yr holl ffigurau wedi eu dileu, a'u gwnâi'n anodd eu gwerthuso. Bu'r ffigurau hynny ar gael i eraill yn y gorffennol, ac yr wyf am wybod i ble'r aeth y ffigurau hynny. Bu gwerthuso ar y ffigurau hynny, a ddangosai fod cynnig Thames Water i reoli ansawdd dŵr yn rhatach.

Mae arnom angen sicrwydd pendant na fydd y cyngor, os bydd y cynllun y penderfyna arno i reoli ansawdd dŵr yn ddrutach na'r dewis cyntaf, yn gallu dod yn ôl at y Cynulliad am fwy o arian, ac y bydd yn gorfod canfod yr arian ei hun. Mae arnom angen sicrwydd heddiw na roddir siec wag i gyngor Caerdydd os yw cynnal ansawdd dŵr, monitro'r morglawdd a datblygu ardal y Bae yn profi'n ddrutach na'r hyn a benderfynodd gyntaf. Cytunwn â'r cynnig, gwelliant 2 Mike German a gwelliant 3 Alun Cairns. Fodd bynnag, am na allwn gytuno â'r modd yr oedd y siaradwr cyntaf yn ymddwyn yn y Siambr hon, ni allwn gefnogi'r cynnig na gwelliant 3. Ni phleidleisiwn yn eu herbyn oherwydd cytunwn nad ymdriniwyd â hyn yn briodol, ond dylai'r siaradwr cyntaf fod wedi bod yn fwy ystyriol yn ei ddadleuon. Byddwn felly'n ymatal.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae braidd yn hwyr yn y dydd imi ddechrau ar fy araith, ond mae hon yn ddadl a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Fel rhybudd cyffredinol i Alun Cairns, pan roddwch eich rhaw yn y tail a dechrau'i daflu o gwmpas, gwelwch fod y rhaw dail yn datblygu rhywfaint o natur y bwmerang. Nid yw'n iawn nac yn briodol i Alun ddechrau gwneud honiadau o lygredd, am Alun Michael, am Russell Goodway nac amdanaf fi. Os yw am gasglu ffeil o ffeithiau a'i chyflwyno i'r cychoedd priodol, mae hynny'n iawn, ond mae defnyddio braint y Cynulliad fel hyn yn iselhaul'r Siambr. Ni chredaf fod neb yn y Siambr, gan gynnwys llawer yn ei blaid ei hun yn ôl pob tebyg, am gael ei gysylltu â'i ymddygiad y prynhawn yma. Bydd wedi clywed ymateb Janet Ryder. Mae'n cyd-fynd ag ymateb y pleidiau eraill yn y Siambr.

with the reaction of the other parties in the Chamber.

I turn to the issue of the opening ceremony in order to put it to one side. I have said it before and I will say it again—I do not think that Alun, nor perhaps Nick Bourne will accept it—I was not responsible for any decisions relating to the opening ceremony being a huge whizz-bang one or being the unveiling of a small plaque. The issue is that the barrage is not finished yet. The question of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation wanting a small plaque to be erected before it went out of existence, even though the barrage is not finished, was a decision that had to be taken by the previous First Secretary. I was in no way involved in blocking a huge ceremony of the kind that Alun may have in mind. I wish that he and Nick Bourne would accept that once and for all.

**Nick Bourne:** I accept that. I wonder if, at the same time, he would acknowledge that it is a worthwhile venture and that, once this project is completed, it would be to the good of Wales and Cardiff if we had such an opening. At least then we would have achieved something through this debate.

**The First Secretary:** That may well be the case. It will be a matter for Cardiff City and County Council rather than for the Assembly. I am sure that the council will bear his words in mind. It would have borne them in mind more favourably had Alun not spoken in the tone that he did today. We cannot have such penny in the slot, personalised polemics polluting our debates.

We do not believe that it is responsible for the Conservatives to table a motion criticising the administration's actions and think of a reason why they did so later. They waited until after the Economic Development Committee before they thought of a reason for tabling the motion in the first place and then they explained the reasons for the original criticism. To amend your own motion because you have thought of a reason for tabling it is an absurd way of going about it.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the First Secretary accept

Trof at fater y seremoni agoriadol er mwyn ei roi o'r neilltu. Fe'i dywedais o'r blaen ac fe'i dywedaf eto—ni chredaf y bydd Alun, na Nick Bourne efallai, yn ei dderbyn—nid oeddwn yn gyfrifol am unrhyw benderfyniadau ynghylch gwneud y seremoni agoriadol yn sbloet enfawr neu'n ddadorchuddiad o blac bach. Y mater yw nad yw'r morglawdd wedi ei gwblhau eto. Yr oedd y cwestiwn o ddymuniad Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i osod plac bach cyn iddo ddod i ben, er nad yw'r morglawdd wedi ei gwblhau, yn benderfyniad y bu'n rhaid i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd blaenorol ei wneud. Nid oedd gennyf unrhyw gysylltiad ag atal seremoni anferth o'r math a allai fod ym meddwl Alun. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai ef a Nick Bourne yn derbyn hynny unwaith ac am byth.

**Nick Bourne:** Derbyniaf hynny. Tybed, ar yr un pryd, a fyddai'n cydnabod bod hon yn fenter fuddiol ac y byddai er budd Cymru a Chaerdydd, ar ôl cwblhau'r prosiect hwn, pe caem agoriad o'r fath. O leiaf byddem wedyn wedi cyflawni rhywbeth drwy'r ddadl hon.

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Mae'n ddigon posibl bod hynny'n wir. Bydd yn fater i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn hytrach nag i'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y cyngor yn cadw ei eiriau mewn cof. Byddai wedi rhoi ystyriaeth fwy ffafriol iddynt pe na bai Alun wedi siarad yn y modd a wnaeth heddiw. Ni allwn gael y fath ddadleuaeth geiniog a dimai, bersonoledig yn llygru ein dadleuon.

Ni chredwn ei bod yn gyfrifol i'r Ceidwadwyr gyflwyno cynnig yn beirniadu gweithredoedd y weinyddiaeth ac wedyn meddwl am reswm dros wneud hynny. Arosasant tan ar ôl y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd cyn meddwl am reswm dros gyflwyno'r cynnig yn y lle cyntaf ac wedyn fe eglurasant y rhesymau am y feirniadaeth wreiddiol. Mae diwygio eich cynnig eich hun am eich bod wedi meddwl am reswm dros ei gyflwyno yn ffordd hurt o fynd o'i chwmpas hi.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Prif Ysgrifennydd yn

that there were several revelations at the last Economic Development Committee that needed airing in this Chamber and that the amendment fits the concerns of the Committee?

**The First Secretary:** Yes, but since you did not know that when you tabled the motion, I find it difficult to understand that kind of conduct. John Redwood said that the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation was going to be wound up. He originally wanted it be wound up on 31 December 1999. A three-month extension was given by Ron Davies, to which Alun Michael adhered during their respective periods as Secretary of State. The barrage has taken a lot longer than that to build. Cardiff Bay Development Corporation will go out of existence in 17 days' time with the barrage incomplete. It should have been completed during 1998. It will be completed in 2000-01 as soon as the freshwater dredging is completed. That is why dissonance has arisen between the termination of the life of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and the completion of the barrage. The barrage is two years late.

I will refer briefly to the £6.1 million. I believe that 95 per cent of that is related to the sports village. Therefore, the expenditure that will relate to the completion—Mike German is right to use the word completion—of training and other urban regeneration projects linked with the transition from Cardiff Bay Development Corporation to Cardiff City and County Council is small, probably about £200,000 over the three-year period. The rest of it is the money that will be paid for the land acquired in connection with the sports village.

Labour will recommend its own motion because it changes the tone of the original Conservative motion. We will support Mike German's amendment 2. After Alun Cairns's conduct earlier, we cannot support his amendment 3. Because it is such a large project, the National Audit Office was already looking up the question of the accounting issues relating to the wind-up procedures of Cardiff Bay and, on a value for money basis, of the barrage project and CBDC. That is natural and it has been ongoing. Meetings have taken place between

derbyn bod nifer o bethau wedi eu datgelu yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd diwethaf yr oedd angen eu gwyntyllu yn y Siambr hon a bod y gwelliant yn cydweddu â phryderon y Pwyllgor?

**Y Prif Ysgrifennydd:** Ydwyf, ond gan na wyddech hynny pan gyflwynasoch y cynnig, fe'i caf yn anodd deall ymddygiad o'r fath. Dywedodd John Redwood y byddai Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd yn cael ei dirwyn i ben. Yn wreiddiol yr oedd am ei dirwyn i ben ar 31 Rhagfyr 1999. Rhoddwyd estyniad o dri mis gan Ron Davies, y cadwodd Alun Michael ato, yn ystod eu cyfnodau hwy yn Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol. Cymerwyd llawer mwy o amser na hynny i godi'r morglawdd. Daw Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ddiwedd ei hoes ymhen 17 niwrnod a'r morglawdd heb ei gwblhau. Dylasai fod wedi ei gwblhau yn ystod 1998. Fe'i cwblheir yn 2000-01 cyn gynted ag y cwblheir carthu'r dŵr croyw. Dyna pam y mae anghysondeb wedi codi rhwng diweddu oes Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd a chwblhau'r morglawdd. Mae'r morglawdd ddwy flynedd yn hwyr.

Cyfeiriai yn fyr at y £6.1 miliwn. Credaf fod 95 y cant o hynny'n ymwneud â'r pentref chwaraeon. Felly, mae'r gwariant a fydd yn gysylltiedig â chwblhau—ac mae Mike German yn iawn wrth ddefnyddio'r gair cwblhau—prosiectau hyfforddi a phrosiectau adfywio trefol eraill sydd yn gysylltiedig â throsglwyddo o Gorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn fach, tua £200,000 yn ôl pob tebyg dros y cyfnod o dair blynedd. Y gweddill yw'r arian a delir am y tir a geir mewn cysylltiad â'r pentref chwaraeon.

Bydd Llafur yn argymhell ei gynnig ei hun am ei fod yn newid goslef cynnig gwreiddiol y Ceidwadwyr. Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 Mike German. Ar ôl ymddygiad Alun Cairns yn gynharach, ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 3 o'i eiddo. Am ei fod yn brosiect mor fawr, yr oedd y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol eisoes yn ymchwilio i gwestiwn y materion cyfrifo sydd yn ymwneud â gweithdrefnau dirwyn i ben Bae Caerdydd ac, ar sail gwerth am arian, prosiect y morglawdd a CBDC. Mae hynny'n naturiol a bu'n mynd rhagddo. Cafwyd cyfarfodydd rhwng swyddogion y

officials of the Assembly and the National Audit Office in line with this review project by the National Audit Office, which has been going on for some time. It is not in any way related to the absurd allegations about corruption that Alun Cairns made. I say that in case he tries to claim the credit for the National Audit Office being engaged in those exercises.

5:00 p.m.

It is also fair for me to point out that I hope to come back to the Assembly with further details on how much the barrage will cost. We have been working to a capped figure of £197 million. The barrage will probably breach the £200 million mark by the time that the final settlement is made. I do not want to weaken the bargaining position of officials, who hope to come to an agreement with CBDC and the contractors fairly shortly. By the end of this month, I hope that I will be able to return to the Assembly and give a statement in Plenary on the final cost of the barrage.

Thames Water is disappointed but there was a perfectly proper procedure, in which Jon Shortridge, as the Assembly's Accounting Officer, took a full role. He recommended strongly that the Cardiff City and County Council option was cheaper. I do not think that anyone in this Chamber would say lightly that one should ignore the Accounting Officer's support for the view taken by Alun Michael and myself that the Cardiff council option would save £2 million. We still hold that view and therefore the allegations about backstairs deals with the leader of Cardiff council are absurd. I hope that parties across the Assembly will support amendment 1. If amendment 1 is adopted we will support the amended motion. If not, we will oppose it.

**Glyn Davies:** Like David Melding, I do not think that I stand much chance of matching the combative performance of my colleague Alun Cairns earlier. I will therefore content myself with eliminating all of the gentle contribution that I had intended to make to this debate and concentrate instead on the gently combative element that was my

Cynulliad a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn unol â'r prosiect adolygu hwn gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, sydd yn mynd rhagddo ers cryn amser. Nid yw'n gysylltiedig o gwbl â'r honiadau hurt am lygredd a wnaethpwyd gan Alun Cairns. Dywedaf hynny rhag ofn iddo hawlio clod am gysylltiad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn yr ymarferiadau hynny.

Mae hefyd yn deg imi nodi fy mod yn gobeithio dod â manylion pellach i'r Cynulliad ynghylch cost y morglawdd. Buom yn gweithio yn ôl ffigur capiedig o £197 miliwn. Mae'n fwy na thebyg y bydd y morglawdd yn mynd heibio i'r marc £200 miliwn erbyn gwneud y setliad terfynol. Nid wyf am wanhau sefyllfa fargeinio'r swyddogion, sydd yn gobeithio dod i gytundeb â Chorfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd a'r contractwyr yn eithaf buan. Erbyn diwedd y mis hwn, gobeithiaf y byddaf yn gallu dod yn ôl i'r Cynulliad a gwneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar gost derfynol y morglawdd.

Mae Thames Water yn siomedig ond yr oedd gweithdrefn gwbl briodol, y cymerodd Jon Shortridge, fel Swyddog Cyfrifo'r Cynulliad, ran lawn ynddi. Argymhellodd yn gryf fod dewis Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn rhatach. Ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw un yn y Siambr hon yn dweud yn ysgafn y dylid anwybyddu cefnogaeth y Swyddog Cyfrifo i'r safbwynt a gymerwyd gan Alun Michael a minnau y byddai dewis cyngor Caerdydd yn arbed £2 filiwn. Yr ydym yn dal i fod o'r farn honno ac felly mae'r honiadau am fargeinion cudd ag arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd yn hurt. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pleidiau ar draws y Cynulliad yn cefnogi gwelliant 1. Os derbynir gwelliant 1 byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio. Fel arall, fe'i gwrthwynebwn.

**Glyn Davies:** Fel David Melding, ni chredaf fod llawer o obaith imi gystadlu â pherfformiad ymosodol fy nghydweithiwr Alun Cairns yn gynharach. Byddaf felly'n ymfodloni i ddileu'r cwbl o'r cyfraniad tyner y bwriadsw'n ei wneud i'r ddadl hon a chanolbwyntio'n hytrach ar yr elfen addfwyn ymosodol y bwriadsw'n orffen â hi.

planned wind-up.

The Assembly has taken an enormous risk with the barrage. We are courting disaster by transferring the management of the barrage to Cardiff council, which does not have the obvious expertise or experience to undertake such a project. We look to the First Secretary to sort out the mess. In electing you, First Secretary, the Assembly placed a great deal of confidence in you. That confidence could ebb quickly, like the strength of a one-legged duck caught in a strong current, if you do not get a grip on this issue and on the leader of Cardiff council. I have previously chided you gently—I can see that you feel sensitive today, so rather than I say that I criticised you, I will say that I chided you gently—for not taking ownership of the WDA in the past, for not making it feel wanted and for not giving it political leadership. You must now give political leadership on the Cardiff Bay barrage scheme. It is another project that you have opposed, I am sure for good reasons. You have done everything you can to destabilise it in your own determined way in another place. However, as with the WDA, if you fail to deliver and to make the Cardiff Bay barrage a success, you will fail as First Secretary.

I hope that Plaid Cymru Members will rethink their decision to abstain on this motion because they disagree with how it was presented. I have often disagreed with the way that Plaid Cymru has presented issues, but if I agree with it and believe that it is right, I vote for its proposals. If Plaid Cymru behaves in what seems to me to be an incredibly chicken way today, it will let the people of Wales and Cardiff down.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi mentro'n enbyd gyda'r morglawdd. Yr ydym yn gwahodd trychineb drwy drosglwyddo rheolaeth y morglawdd i gyngor Caerdydd, nad oes ganddo'r arbenigedd na'r profiad amlwg i ymgymryd â phrosiect o'r fath. Yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r Prif Ysgrifennydd ddatrys y llanastr. Wrth eich ethol, Brif Ysgrifennydd, yr oedd y Cynulliad yn ymddiried yn fawr yn och. Gallai'r ymddiriedaeth honno gilio'n gyflym, fel cryfder hwyaden ungoes yng ngafael cerrynt cryf, os nad ewch i'r afael â'r mater hwn ac ag arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd. Fe'ch ceryddais yn ysgafn o'r blaen—gallaf weld eich bod yn teimlo'n sensitif heddiw, felly yn hytrach na dweud imi eich beirniadu, dywedaf imi eich ceryddu'n ysgafn—am beidio ag ymgymryd â pherchnogaeth dros y WDA yn y gorffennol, am beidio â gwneud iddo deimlo bod ei eisiau ac am beidio â rhoi arweiniad gwleidyddol iddo. Rhaid ichi bellach roi arweiniad gwleidyddol ar gynllun morglawdd Bae Caerdydd. Mae'n brosiect arall a wrthwynebwyd gennych, am resymau da, yr wyf yn siŵr. Gwnaethoch bopeth a allech i'w ddadsefydlogi yn eich ffordd benderfynol eich hun mewn lle arall. Fodd bynnag, fel yn achos y WDA, os methwch â mynd â'r maen i'r wal a gwneud morglawdd Bae Caerdydd yn llwyddiant, byddwch yn methu fel Prif Ysgrifennydd.

Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn ailfeddwl ynghylch eu penderfyniad i ymatal ar y cynnig hwn am eu bod yn anghytuno â'r modd y'i cyflwynwyd. Yr wyf wedi anghytuno'n aml â'r modd y cyflwynwyd materion gan Plaid Cymru, ond os cytunaf â hi ac os credaf ei bod yn iawn, pleidleisiaf dros ei chynigion. Os bydd Plaid Cymru yn ymddwyn mewn modd a ymddengys imi'n hynod o gachgäidd heddiw, bydd yn siomi pobl Cymru a Chaerdydd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 21, Yn erbyn 8.  
Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 21, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Marek, John  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Hancock, Brian  
Humphreys, Christine  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Amendment adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 40, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 40, Abstain 15, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary

Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Michael, Alun  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Amendment adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 14, Ymatal 16, Yn erbyn 26.  
 Amendment 3: For 14, Abstain 16, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Feld, Val  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Marek, John  
 Michael, Alun  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda



Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Amendment rejected.*

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

Amended motion:

Y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*that the Assembly*

*bod y Cynulliad*

*notes the arrangements for the wind-up of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation; and*

*yn nodi trefniadau'r broses o ddwyn Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd i ben; ac*

*requires that the final agreements between the National Assembly for Wales and Cardiff City and County Council include:*

*yn mynnu bod y cytundebau terfynol rhwng Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn cynnwys:*

*a clear definition of the 'initiatives for training, employment and the local community and other regeneration activities' for which £6.1 million have been allocated and*

*diffiniad clir o'r 'mentrau ar gyfer hyfforddiant, cyflogaeth a'r gymuned leol a gweithgareddau adfywio eraill' y dyrannwyd £6.1 miliwn ar eu cyfer a*

*as firm as possible, a definition of any eventualities for which the Assembly will be responsible, in order to protect the Assembly's position and minimise any future additional financial expenditure in this area.*

*diffiniad mor bendant â phosibl o unrhyw ddigwyddiadau y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol amdanynt, er mwyn amddiffyn sefyllfa'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a lleihau unrhyw wariant ariannol ychwanegol ar hyn yn y dyfodol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 33, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 8.*

*Amended motion: For 33, Abstain 15, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Humphreys, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Marek, John  
Michael, Alun  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Amended motion adopted.*

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.*

5:10 p.m.

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Prinder Gwelyau NHS The Shortage of NHS Beds**

**Janet Davies:** I chose this issue because it is one of the most important issues in Wales at the moment. During the first weeks of this year, newspapers and television stations ran stories daily about patients sleeping in hospital corridors and casualty departments and about patients being driven for miles in a

**Janet Davies:** Dewisais y mater hwn am ei fod yn un o'r materion pwysicaf yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Yn ystod wythnosau cyntaf y flwyddyn hon, yr oedd hanesion mewn papurau newydd a chan orsafoedd teledu bob dydd am gleifion yn cysgu mewn coridorau ysbyty ac mewn adrannau

search for a bed or being sent home from hospital too soon. Patients and their families are suffering and the public has become uneasy about a perceived lack of treatment. It is easy to get hundreds of people to sign a petition on the need for extra beds. The present situation is unacceptable. A modern, prosperous state should be able to ensure that hospital treatment and appropriate facilities, including a bed on a ward, are available for those who need it.

However, it is a complex situation that needs to be looked at responsibly and carefully. Knee-jerk tabloid headlines, comments and speeches are unhelpful. Research and information to prepare a strategy and a practical plan to execute that strategy are essential for successful achievement. The political will has to be there 100 per cent and backed by hard work and enthusiasm from politicians. We should all be passionate about this. More money is needed and wise spending of that money is important.

Let us first compare our situation with that of other countries in the European Union. We do not come out well compared with France and Germany, for example. If you contact the twin town of a town in your constituency, the problem is put into sharp relief. For example, Mannheim, the city twinned with Swansea, had no problem last winter whereas Singleton and Morriston Hospitals hung on by their fingertips. It is the same throughout Germany and France, yet they had the same winter weather and flu bugs. What is the difference between them and us? The major difference is a higher level of public expenditure on health.

The knock-on effect of the flu crisis at the turn of the year, when hundreds of elective operations were cancelled, is the creation of backlogs that have not yet cleared two months later. More Welsh patients are likely to have to wait longer than the charter waiting time targets of their counterparts in England. Even England compares poorly with other developed countries. Backlogs occur despite high efficiency levels in Wales.

damweiniau ac am gleifion yn cael eu gyrru am filltiroedd er mwyn chwilio am wely neu'n cael eu hanfon adref o'r ysbyty'n rhy gynnar. Mae cleifion a'u teuluoedd yn dioddef ac mae'r cyhoedd yn anesmwyth bellach ynghylch yr hyn a welir yn ddiffyg triniaeth. Mae'n hawdd cael cannoedd o bobl i arwyddo deiseb ar yr angen am welyau ychwanegol. Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn annerbyniol. Dylai gwladwriaeth fodern, ffyniannus allu sicrhau bod triniaeth mewn ysbyty a chyfleusterau priodol, gan gynnwys gwely mewn ward, ar gael i'r rhai y mae arnynt eu hangen.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n sefyllfa gymhleth y mae angen edrych arni'n gyfrifol ac yn ofalus. Nid yw penawdau tabloid, sylwadau ac areithiau byrbwyll o gymorth. Mae ymchwil a gwybodaeth er mwyn paratoi strategaeth a chynllun ymarferol i weithredu'r strategaeth honno'n holl bwysig er mwyn llwyddo. Rhaid wrth ewyllys wleidyddol o 100 y cant gyda gwaith caled a brwdfrydedd gan wleidyddion yn gefn iddi. Dylem oll fod yn danbaid dros hyn. Mae angen mwy o arian ac mae'n bwysig gwario'r arian hwnnw'n ddoeth.

Yn gyntaf, gadewch inni gymharu ein sefyllfa ag un gwledydd eraill yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Nid ydym yn cymharu'n dda â Ffrainc a'r Almaen, er enghraifft. Os cysylltwch â gefeilldref tref yn eich etholaeth, gwelir y broblem yn amlwg. Er enghraifft, nid oedd problem ym Mannheim, y ddinas a efeilliwyd ag Abertawe, y gaeaf diwethaf tra mai prin ddal eu gafael yr oedd ysbytai Singleton a Threforys. Mae hi'r un fath ledled yr Almaen a Ffrainc, er iddynt gael yr un tywydd a'r un heintiau ffliw dros y gaeaf. Beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhyngddynt hwy a ni? Y gwahaniaeth mwyaf yw lefel uwch y gwariant cyhoeddus ar iechyd.

Effaith ganlyniadol yr argyfwng ffliw ar droad y flwyddyn, pan ddiddymwyd cannoedd o lawdriniaethau dewisol, yw creu ôl-groniadau nad ydynt wedi eu clirio ddau fis yn ddiweddarach. Mae mwy o gleifion yng Nghymru yn debygol o orfod aros yn hwy na thargedau amser aros siarter eu cymheiriaid yn Lloegr. Mae hyd yn oed Lloegr yn wael o'i chymharu â gwledydd datblygedig eraill. Ceir ôl-groniadau er

In 1997-98, the number of what are called finished consultant episodes treated per hospital doctor or dentist in Wales was 31 per cent higher than in England.

This year's winter crisis was avoidable. After last year's crisis, a taskforce was set up to consider how to avoid a repeat of that crisis. It produced recommendations that were set out in the report 'Beds and Bureaucracy: Responses to Winter Pressures in Wales' last May. The Assembly's Health and Social Services Committee considered another report last September. Action was spelt out in both reports. This Assembly has an Executive to carry out recommendations and action. Considering and accepting reports is not enough. I am not underestimating the difficulties of doing this: the difficulties of getting people to work together, to think laterally and to act flexibly. I suggest a quote from another context: the status quo is not an option.

We could make better use of existing beds. There are major problems in some practices and in the use of resources. A five-day working week with a skeleton staff at weekends is in force in most, if not all, NHS hospitals. Over weekends, there are no doctors with the power to discharge patients and no means of carrying out non-emergency laboratory tests. This leads to an accumulation of blocked beds and tests every Monday. This was accentuated by three-day working over Christmas and the new year. Also at that time, social services staff were on holiday for a fortnight, so more bed blocking occurred because there was nobody to arrange for patients who were occupying acute beds to be transferred to residential care. When we had a crisis, operations were cancelled. Some surgeons concentrated on their out-patients appointments to try to reduce pressure in that area. Others were less flexible.

Let me make it clear that I am not demanding more work from already hard-pressed staff.

gwaethaf lefelau effeithlonrwydd uchel yng Nghymru. Yn 1997-98, yr oedd nifer yr hyn a elwir yn episodau ymgynghorydd gorffenedig fesul meddyg neu ddeintydd ysbyty yng Nghymru 31 y cant yn uwch nag yn Lloegr.

Yr oedd modd osgoi argyfwng y gaeaf eleni. Ar ôl argyfwng y llynedd, sefydlwyd tasglu i ystyried sut i osgoi ailddigwyddiad o'r argyfwng hwnnw. Cyflwynodd argymhellion a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad 'Gwelyau a Biwrocratiaeth: Ymateb i Bwysau'r Gaeaf yng Nghymru' fis Mai diwethaf. Ystyriodd Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y Cynulliad adroddiad arall fis Medi diwethaf. Nodwyd y camau yn y ddau adroddiad. Mae gan y Cynulliad hwn Weithrediaeth i gyflawni argymhellion ac i gymryd camau. Nid yw ystyried a derbyn adroddiadau yn ddigon. Nid wyf yn bychanu'r anawsterau wrth wneud hyn: yr anawsterau wrth gael pobl i weithio gyda'i gilydd, i feddwl yn ochrol ac i weithredu'n hyblyg. Awgrymaf ddywediad a ddyfynnir o gyd-destun arall: nid yw'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni yn ddewis.

Gallem ddefnyddio'r gwelyau presennol yn well. Mae problemau mawr mewn rhai ymarferiadau ac yn y defnydd o adnoddau. Mae wythnos waith bum niwrnod gyda chnewyllyn staff ar y penwythnosau mewn grym yn y rhan fwyaf, os nad y cwbl, o ysbytai'r NHS. Dros y penwythnos, nid oes meddygon a chanddynt yr awdurdod i ryddhau cleifion ac nid oes modd cyflawni profion labordy nad ydynt yn rhai brys. Mae hyn yn arwain at Groniad o welyau a phroffion a flociwyd bob dydd Llun. Gwaethygydd hynny drwy'r gweithio am dridiau dros y Nadolig a'r flwyddyn newydd. Bryd hynny, hefyd, yr oedd staff gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar wyliau am bythefnos, felly cafwyd mwy o flocio ar welyau am nad oedd unrhyw un i drefnu trosglwyddo cleifion a oedd yn defnyddio gwelyau arhosiad byr i ofal preswyl. Pan gawsom argyfwng, diddymwyd llawdriniaethau. Canolbwyntiai rhai llawfeddygon ar eu hapwyntiadau cleifion allanol er mwyn ceisio lleihau pwysau yn y maes hwnnw. Yr oedd eraill yn llai hyblyg.

Gadewch imi roi ar ddeall nad wyf yn galw am fwy o waith gan staff sydd eisoes o dan

Too much is asked of them already in short-term initiatives that rely on extra effort. I suggest that politicians work with managers who work with staff to find better ways of using resources. We must consider private medicine. I do not propose that we reduce freedom of choice for individuals but I am asking whether one person's choice should be allowed to cause someone else to suffer. In Wales and in Plaid Cymru we have long understood that individual rights work best in the context of community responsibility. Does the use of NHS beds by private patients contribute to NHS income, as is claimed? Do payments cover the full costs and to what extent does this cause bed blocking? For example, if someone picks up a virulent infection in hospital, is there always a single cubicle available for isolation or do such patients sometimes end up occupying four or six-bed wards because single rooms are privately occupied?

Medium-term planning is crucial. The answer to a recent Assembly question from Dafydd Wigley was that the health improvement programme is responsible for this. In the short term, we could examine how the management of beds is carried out. Are there compatible information systems across the different agencies? Do specific individuals have responsibility for co-ordination? Health authorities should have the lead responsibility for reducing waiting times for routine appointments. A pilot project on prioritisation in Carmarthen awaits completion. When that is complete, the lessons learnt must be put into place throughout the country. Better booking systems are needed for GP out-patients slots and for day admissions, with a time-scale for introducing those systems. If all these ideas and structures were put into practice, it would make a huge difference in reducing waiting times and avoiding another crisis next winter. Whatever is done in this way, there will still be a need for greater bed capacity.

First, we must remember that the function, not the building, is important. It is time to consider with open minds the role of community hospitals and to use them in a

bwysau. Gofynnir gormod ganddynt eisoes mewn cynlluniau tymor byr sydd yn dibynnu ar ymdrech ychwanegol. Awgrymaf y dylai gwleidyddion weithio gyda rheolwyr sydd yn gweithio gyda staff er mwyn canfod gwell dulliau o ddefnyddio adnoddau. Rhaid inni ystyried meddygaeth breifat. Ni chynigaf y dylem leihau rhyddid dewis i unigolion ond yr wyf yn gofyn a ddylid caniatáu i ddewis un achosi dioddef i un arall. Yng Nghymru ac ym Mhlaid Cymru yr ydym yn deall ers talwm fod hawliau unigol yn gweithio orau yng nghyd-destun cyfrifoldeb cymunedol. A yw'r defnydd o welyau'r NHS gan gleifion preifat yn cyfrannu at incwm yr NHS, fel yr honnir? A yw'r taliadau'n cynnwys yr holl gostau ac i ba raddau y mae hyn yn blocio gwelyau? Er enghraifft, os yw rhywun yn codi haint gwenwynig mewn ysbyty, a oes ciwbicl sengl ar gael bob amser i'w arwahanu neu a yw cleifion o'r fath yn y diwedd yn defnyddio wardiau pedwar neu chwe gwely am fod ystafelloedd sengl mewn defnydd preifat?

Mae cynllunio tymor canolig yn holl bwysig. Yr ateb i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd yn ddiweddar yn y Cynulliad gan Dafydd Wigley oedd mai'r rhaglen gwella iechyd sydd yn gyfrifol am hyn. Yn y tymor byr, gallem ystyried y modd y rheolir gwelyau. A oes systemau gwybodaeth cyfaddas ar draws y gwahanol asiantaethau? A oes unigolion penodol sydd yn gyfrifol am gydlynw? Dylai awdurdodau iechyd gael y cyfrifoldeb arweiniol i leihau amseroedd aros am apwyntiadau rheolaidd. Mae prosiect peilot ar flaenoriaethu yng Nghaerfyrddin yn aros i gael ei gwblhau. Pan fydd wedi ei gwblhau, rhaid rhoi'r gwersi a ddysgir ar waith ledled y wlad. Mae angen gwell systemau apwyntiadau ar gyfer amseroedd cleifion allanol meddygon teulu ac ar gyfer derbyniadau dydd, gydag amserlen ar gyfer cyflwyno'r systemau hynny. Pe rhoddid yr holl syniadau a strwythurau hyn ar waith, gwnâi wahaniaeth enfawr wrth leihau amseroedd aros ac osgoi argyfwng arall y gaeaf nesaf. Beth bynnag a wneir ar hyn, bydd angen o hyd am fwy o welyau.

Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni gofio mai'r swyddogaeth, nid yr adeilad, sydd yn bwysig. Mae'n bryd ystyried rôl ysbytai cymunedol â meddwl agored a'u defnyddio mewn cynllun

strategic plan for resolving shortages. Flexibility over function and an open mind regarding the use of community hospitals will provide many answers. Their use should be increased but they will need flexible functions, and sometimes a change of function. They have the potential to be used for day surgery, minor operations and for elderly, long-stay patients. In Plaid Cymru, we have demanded the increased use of community hospitals for years. The Secretary of State for Health is addressing this now. I do not know whether he is picking up on Plaid Cymru policy, but he is getting on with the job. I hope that our Secretary for Health and Social Services agrees with this.

Even when all these measures have been implemented, there will still be a need for more acute beds. Intensive care doctors estimate that we need 100 extra critical care beds, 30 extra beds for patients needing ventilators to breathe and 68 extra high dependency beds. A study published in *The Lancet* this week concludes that Swansea and Bridgend need 138 critical beds, but there are only 96. During the recent crisis, patients were ferried hundreds of miles in search of intensive care beds. One patient died. The report in *The Lancet* is the first scientific assessment of the adult population's needs for these beds. It shows considerable underprovision. It is essential to plan now and to act before next winter.

It is the Assembly's duty to ask whether the Secretary for Health and Social Services intends to make increasing bed capacity a key target for health in the document 'A Better Wales.' Is the latest taskforce progressing and who is monitoring it? Four thousand new beds have been promised for England. How many are promised for Wales? Will resources be released to Wales for this purpose? If not, is pressure being put on the UK Government to do this? When will the Prime Minister act to achieve his aspirations of increasing public expenditure on health to the European average? The Assembly is constricted by

strategol i ddatrys prinder. Bydd hyblygrwydd ynghylch swyddogaeth a meddwl agored o ran y defnydd o ysbytai cymunedol yn rhoi llawer o atebion. Dylid gwneud mwy o ddefnydd ohonynt ond bydd angen swyddogaethau hyblyg ar eu cyfer, a newid swyddogaeth weithiau. Mae ynddynt y potensial i'w defnyddio ar gyfer llawfeddygaeth ddydd, mân lawdriniaethau a chleifion arhosiad hir, oeddrannus. Ym Mhlaid Cymru, yr ydym yn galw ers blynyddoedd am gynnydd yn y defnydd o ysbytai cymunedol. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd yn ymdrin â hyn yn awr. Ni wn a yw'n dilyn polisi Plaid Cymru, ond mae'n mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith. Gobeithiaf fod ein Hysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ni'n cytuno â hyn.

Hyd yn oed ar ôl rhoi'r holl fesurau hyn ar waith, bydd angen o hyd am fwy o welyau arhosiad byr. Mae meddygon gofal dwys yn amcangyfrif bod arnom angen 100 o welyau gofal critigol ychwanegol, 30 o welyau ychwanegol ar gyfer cleifion y mae arnynt angen gwyntiedyddion i anadlu a 68 o welyau dibyniaeth uchel ychwanegol. Mae astudiaeth a gyhoeddwyd yn *The Lancet* yr wythnos hon yn dod i'r casgliad bod ar Abertawe a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr angen 138 o welyau critigol, ond nid oes ond 96. Yn ystod yr argyfwng diweddar, câi cleifion eu cludo gannoedd o filltiroedd wrth chwilio am welyau gofal dwys. Bu farw un claf. Yr adroddiad yn *The Lancet* yw'r asesiad gwyddonol cyntaf o anghenion y boblogaeth mewn oed am y gwelyau hynny. Dengys danddarpariaeth sylweddol. Mae'n holl bwysig cynllunio'n awr a gweithredu cyn y gaeaf nesaf.

Dyletswydd y Cynulliad yw gofyn a yw'r Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn bwriadu gwneud cynnydd yn nifer y gwelyau yn darged allweddol ar gyfer iechyd yn y ddogfen 'Gwell Cymru'. A yw'r tasglu diweddaraf yn gwneud cynnydd a phwy sydd yn ei fonitro? Addawyd 4,000 o welyau newydd ar gyfer Lloegr. Pa nifer a addewir i Gymru? A ryddheir adnoddau i Gymru i'r diben hwn? Oni wneir, a roddir pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i wneud hynny? Pa bryd y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gweithredu i gyflawni ei ddyheadau i godi gwariant cyhoeddus ar iechyd i'r cyfartaledd

Tony Blair's control of the purse strings. It is up to him to act regarding finance for hospitals. Discussions in the Health and Social Services Committee on the 2000-01 budget will soon begin. The Secretary for Health and Social Services had a rough ride there earlier this year. There has to be pressure on the UK Government to realise the needs of the NHS. There has to be courage to plan and to act with the Assembly's resources. Talking about joined-up government is pointless unless action is taken. There should be lateral thinking and readiness to put ideas into action in flexible ways. I have always had a nasty fear that joined-up thinking is merely a way of avoiding responsibility and hiding lack of action. It will always be possible to make a case for money for the NHS, but difficult to find that money. The sight of patients lying on stretchers in hospital corridors is unacceptable. Setting up taskforces will not in itself produce more beds or make their use more effective. Their recommendations have to be carried out. Ignoring them, as last year's have been ignored so far, wastes resources—financial, physical and human.

5:20 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Since 1980 we have seen a complete demolition of the number of available hospital beds in Wales. We have seen figures fall from over 23,000 in 1980 to less than 16,000 now. The situation over recent months has strongly illustrated the effects of those cuts in bed numbers, as have the ever-spiralling in-patients waiting lists. There has been an amazing increase of 167 per cent in those waiting for in-patient surgery since Labour came to power in 1997. Despite this situation, Wales faces even more bed cuts. In my constituency alone we face the loss of one ward in Ystradgynlais Hospital and another ward in Brecon War Memorial Hospital. Newtown Hospital, where I was treated last week, is in danger of losing five beds if proposals are passed by the health authority. But, as Janet says, it is not only community hospitals that have a problem. A recent report by the Welsh

Ewropeaidd? Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ei gyfyngu gan reolaeth Tony Blair ar linyddau'r pwrs. Ei gyfrifoldeb ef yw gweithredu mewn perthynas â chyllid i ysbytai. Bydd trafodaethau yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar gyllideb 2000-01 yn dechrau cyn hir. Cafodd yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol amser caled yno'n gynharach eleni. Rhaid rhoi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i gyflawni anghenion yr NHS. Rhaid wrth ddewrder i gynllunio a gweithredu gydag adnoddau'r Cynulliad. Nid oes diben sôn am lywodraeth gydgysylltiol oni weithredir. Dylid cael meddwl ochrol a pharodrwydd i roi syniadau ar waith mewn dulliau hyblyg. Mae ofn annifyr arnaf erioed mai'r cwbl yw meddwl cydgysylltiol yw ffordd o osgoi cyfrifoldeb a chelu diffyg gweithredu. Bydd bob amser yn bosibl cyflwyno dadl dros arian i'r NHS, ond yn anodd canfod yr arian hwnnw. Mae gweld cleifion yn gorwedd ar gludwelyau mewn coridorau ysbytai yn annerbyniol. Ni fydd sefydlu tasgluoedd ynddo'i hun yn creu mwy o welyau nac yn gwneud defnydd mwy effeithiol ohonynt. Rhaid rhoi eu hargymhellion ar waith. Drwy eu hanwybyddu, fel yr anwybyddwyd rhai'r llynedd hyd yn hyn, gwastreffir adnoddau—rhai ariannol, ffisegol a dynol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ers 1980 gwelwom chwalfa lwyf yn nifer y gwelyau ysbyty sydd ar gael yng Nghymru. Gwelwom y ffigurau'n disgyn o dros 23,000 yn 1980 i lai na 16,000 yn awr. Mae'r sefyllfa dros y misoedd diwethaf wedi dangos yn eglur effeithiau'r toriadau hynny yn nifer y gwelyau, fel y mae'r rhestrau aros cynyddol o gleifion mewnol. Bu cynnydd rhyfeddol o 167 y cant yn y rhai sydd yn disgwyl am lawdriniaeth cleifion mewnol ers i Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997. Er gwaethaf y sefyllfa hon, mae Cymru'n wynebu toriadau mwy fyth yn nifer y gwelyau. Yn fy etholaeth i yn unig wynebwn gollu un ward yn Ysbyty Ystradgynlais a ward arall yn Ysbyty Coffa Aberhonddu. Mae Ysbyty'r Drenewydd, lle y cefais driniaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, mewn perygl o gollu pum gwely os derbynnir y cynigion gan yr awdurdod iechyd. Ond, fel y dywed Janet, nid yn unig yn yr ysbytai cymunedol y ceir problem. Mewn adroddiad

Intensive Care Society highlighted, as she said, the need for an extra 98 critical care beds in Wales.

This is more complex than a call for more beds. We need our own national bed inquiry, to examine the type of beds needed and the most appropriate setting for those beds. As Janet said, we need to manage the beds that we have in a better fashion. At different points during this winter, some 600 beds in Welsh hospitals were blocked by people who medically did not need to be in them. We will not solve this problem until we break down the empires of the NHS and social services who refuse to tackle head-on the problem of bed blocking. The dream of having better resourced hospitals in terms of beds cannot be tackled in isolation. All the beds in the world are useless if we do not have the staff to man them. We have some 600 nursing vacancies in Wales and shortages in some fields of medical expertise. The Liberal Democrats in this Chamber call today for a moratorium on bed cuts in Wales, an in-depth inquiry into bed capacity in Wales and into where extra beds are needed, urgent action to recruit more medical staff and, ultimately, for the Labour administration both here and in London to put its money where its mouth is. It could do well by scrapping the 1p cut in income tax this month and putting it instead into a hospital.

**David Melding:** It is fair to distinguish between bed blocking and general medical beds, where figures have fallen because of a change in policy to treat more people quickly and then as quickly as possible after that in the community. Bed blocking is usually caused by the fact that local authorities cannot place people in beds that are available in the nursing and residential sector. There is a question to be considered, but that is not the focus of this debate. This debate is about number of high-dependency and intensive care beds that we will need in future. The possibility of intervening and extending life even when people are what would have been thought mortally ill in the past is increasing vastly. There is a case for considering the

diweddar gan Gymdeithas Gofal Dwys Cymru, fel y dywedodd hi, pwysleisiwyd yr angen am 98 o welyau gofal critigol ychwanegol yng Nghymru.

Mae hyn yn fwy cymhleth na gofyn am ragor o welyau. Mae arnom angen ein hymchwiliad cenedlaethol ein hunain ar welyau, er mwyn ystyried y math o welyau y mae eu hangen a'r lleoliad mwyaf priodol i'r gwelyau hynny. Fel y dywedodd Janet, mae angen inni reoli'r gwelyau sydd gennym yn well. Ar wahanol adegau yn ystod y gaeaf hwn, yr oedd tua 600 o welyau mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru wedi eu blocio gan bobl nad oedd ganddynt angen meddygol i fod ynddynt. Ni ddatryswn y broblem hon nes chwalwn ymerodraethau'r NHS a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol sydd yn gwrthod mynd i'r afael â'r broblem blocio gwelyau. Ni ellir ymdrin ar wahân â'r freuddwyd o gael ysbytai â gwell adnoddau o ran gwelyau. Nid oes diben cael yr un gwely ychwanegol oni bai fod gennym staff ar ei gyfer. Mae gennym tua 600 o swyddi nyrsio gwag yng Nghymru a phrinder mewn rhai meysydd meddygol arbenigol. Heddiw mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Siambr hon yn galw am foratoriwm ar gwtogi nifer y gwelyau yng Nghymru, am ymchwiliad manwl i nifer y gwelyau yng Nghymru ac ym mha le y mae angen gwelyau ychwanegol, am weithredu brys i recriwtio rhagor o staff meddygol ac, yn y pen draw, am i'r weinyddiaeth Lafur yma ac yn Llundain roi ei arian ar ei air. Byddai'n dda iddi gael gwared â'r toriad o 1c mewn treth incwm y mis hwn a'i roi tuag at ysbyty yn lle hynny.

**David Melding:** Mae'n deg gwahaniaethu rhwng blocio gwelyau a gwelyau meddygol cyffredinol, lle y mae'r ffigurau wedi disgyn oherwydd newid mewn polisi er mwyn trin mwy o bobl yn gyflym a chyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl hynny yn y gymuned. Achosir blocio gwelyau fel arfer am na all awdurdodau lleol leoli pobl mewn gwelyau sydd ar gael yn y sector nyrsio a phreswyl. Mae cwestiwn y dylid ei ystyried, ond nid hynny yw canolbwynt y ddadl hon. Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â nifer y gwelyau dibyniaeth uchel a gofal dwys y bydd arnom eu hangen yn y dyfodol. Ceir cynnydd aruthrol yn y posibiliad o ymyrryd ac estyn einioes hyd yn oed pan fo pobl, fel y credid yn y gorffennol, yn anghueol wael. Mae dadl



number of those beds that we will need in future and linking this to the Government's commitment to increase the resources given to the health service to bring it to something like the European average in a five or six-year period. We will support that review of the number of high-dependency and intensive care beds, backed by staff that serve them, which is a crucial issue, and encourage the Executive to fulfil its commitment in this area as it increases expenditure as promised.

**Jane Hutt:** I thank Janet Davies for bringing this issue to the Assembly's attention. I hope that everyone here shares our passion for improving the NHS in Wales. I have listened to everything that has been said today. I am glad that you started by reflecting on the pressure that the NHS suffered, particularly after Christmas.

**Brian Gibbons:** I regret that I have been unable to make a contribution to this debate. I had intended to make a longer contribution than I will now be able to make, because, unfortunately, in this instance Plaid Cymru was not prepared to allow a Labour backbencher to contribute, even though this was allowed in past debates initiated by Plaid Cymru.

I wanted to refer to changing patterns of demography, hospital use, community service and the changing financial situation. I support a great deal of Kirsty Williams's contribution as it was sensible. Unfortunately, in what was not the most glorious opportunity of open government or open participatory involvement in the Assembly, I have been unable to contribute.

**The Secretary for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** It was helpful to hear Janet Davies start her contribution by saying that we should not only have knee-jerk media comment and political soundbites about dealing with this difficult situation. This is about improving resources, strategy and better planning, and ensuring that we look at all the issues that have contributed to the pressure placed on the health service over the

dros ystyried y nifer o'r gwelyau hynny y bydd arnom eu hangen yn y dyfodol a chysylltu hynny ag ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i gynyddu'r adnoddau a roddir i'r gwasanaeth iechyd er mwyn ei godi i lefel sydd yn debyg i'r cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd o fewn cyfnod o bum neu chwe blynedd. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r adolygiad hwnnw o nifer y gwelyau dibyniaeth uchel a gofal dwys, ynghyd â'r staff i'w gwasanaethu, sydd yn fater holl bwysig, ac yn annog y Weithrediaeth i gyflawni ei hymrwymiad yn y maes hwn wrth iddi gynyddu gwariant yn unol â'i haddewid.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolchaf i Janet Davies am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf fod pawb yma yn rhannu'n sêl dros wella'r NHS yng Nghymru. Gwrandewais ar bopeth a ddywedwyd heddiw. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi dechrau drwy fyfyrion ynghylch y pwysau a ddiodeffodd yr NHS, yn enwedig ar ôl y Nadolig.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n ofid imi na fu modd imi gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Yr oedd yn fwriad gennyf gyfrannu'n hwy nag y gallaf yn awr, oherwydd, yn anffodus, yn yr achos hwn nid oedd Plaid Cymru'n barod i ganiatáu cyfraniad gan feinciwr cefn Llafur, er caniatáu hynny mewn dadleuon yn y gorffennol a gychwynwyd gan Plaid Cymru.

Yr oeddwn am gyfeirio at newidiadau mewn patrymau demograffig, patrymau defnyddio ysbytai, patrymau gwasanaeth cymunedol a'r newidiadau yn y sefyllfa ariannol. Cefnogaf lawer o'r hyn a oedd yng nghyfraniad Kirsty Williams gan ei fod yn synhwyrol. Yn anffodus, yn yr hyn nad oedd yn gyfle gwych o ran llywodraeth agored neu gyfranogiad agored yn y Cynulliad, ni fu modd imi gyfrannu.

**Yr Ysgrifennydd Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr oedd o gymorth clywed Janet Davies yn dechrau ei chyfraniad drwy ddweud y dylem gael rhywbeth amgenach na sylwadau byrbwyll gan y cyfryngau a datganiadau bachog gwleidyddol am ddelio â'r sefyllfa anodd hon. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwella adnoddau, strategaeth a gwell cynllunio, a sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried yr holl faterion a

past few months due to the unprecedented flu outbreak. The taskforce that I have established will not only consider what happened during the weeks of that outbreak, it will consider the pressures as a whole. That means examining issues such as critical care and high dependency beds, to which David Melding, Kirsty Williams and Janet Davies referred. Health services were under immense pressure during January and early February, but the situation has eased in recent weeks. Janet is right to say that we must consider the issue of critical care beds availability. Kirsty Williams and David Melding also referred to this. We must also consider other types of bed availability throughout Wales. This is not about expecting the staff who worked so hard during the weeks after Christmas to give more. We pay tribute to their hard work. This is about workforce planning, which will be one of the key points of the emergency pressures taskforce along with bed capacity and out of hours services. We must examine what failed during a time when other services closed down, namely the holiday period, and how the out of hours and social services worked.

I would take issue with some of the other points raised by Janet Davies. Health authorities worked and planned for Christmas. We expected great pressure during the millennium period. Extra money was injected into the health authorities to deal with this. Many health authorities provided additional beds over the Christmas period. They did not expect the flu crisis. As a result, the taskforce will consider immunisation plans for next year and ways in which we can plan for periods such as Christmas. I want the taskforce to consider emergency pressures throughout the year, not only prepare for next winter. That is a key part, but it must also be about the whole system of ensuring that we have the capacity, in the community as well as in hospitals, to deal with the needs and care of our people. That is why the taskforce not only includes the NHS and hospital sectors, but also local government, social services, the primary sector through general practitioners, the partnership organisations

gyfrannodd at y pwysau a roddwyd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd dros y misoedd diwethaf hyn oherwydd y nifer digyffelyb o achosion o fflw. Bydd y tasglu a sefydlais nid yn unig yn edrych ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod wythnosau'r achosion hynny, bydd yn edrych ar y pwysau yn eu cyfanrwydd. Mae hynny'n golygu ystyried materion fel gwelyau gofal critigol a dibyniaeth uchel, y cyfeiriodd David Melding, Kirsty Williams a Janet Davies atynt. Yr oedd y gwasanaethau iechyd dan bwysau aruthrol yn ystod Ionawr a dechrau Chwefror, ond lliniarodd y sefyllfa yn yr wythnosau diwethaf hyn. Mae Janet yn gywir wrth ddweud bod yn rhaid inni ystyried y mater o argaeledd gwelyau gofal critigol. Cyfeiriodd Kirsty Williams a David Melding at hyn hefyd. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried fathau eraill o argaeledd gwelyau ledled Cymru. Nid yw hyn yn fater o ddisgwyl mwy gan y staff a weithiodd mor galed yn ystod yr wythnosau ar ôl y Nadolig. Talwn deyrnged i'w gwaith caled. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chynllunio'r gweithlu, a fydd yn un o brif bwyntiau'r tasglu pwysau brys ynghyd â nifer y gwelyau a gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau. Rhaid inni ystyried beth a fethodd ar adeg pan gaeodd gwasanaethau eraill, sef cyfnod y gwyliau, a sut y gweithiodd y gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Byddwn yn anghytuno â rhai o'r pwyntiau eraill a godwyd gan Janet Davies. Yr oedd yr awdurdodau iechyd wedi gweithio a chynllunio ar gyfer y Nadolig. Disgwyliem bwysau mawr yn ystod cyfnod y mileniwm. Chwistrellwyd arian ychwanegol i'r awdurdodau iechyd i ddelio â hyn. Darparwyd gwelyau ychwanegol gan lawer o awdurdodau iechyd dros gyfnod y Nadolig. Ni ddisgwyliant argyfwng y fflw. O ganlyniad, bydd y tasglu'n ystyried cynlluniau imiwneiddio ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf a dulliau y gallwn eu defnyddio i gynllunio ar gyfer cyfnodau fel y Nadolig. Yr wyf am i'r tasglu ystyried pwysau brys gydol y flwyddyn, ac nid paratoi ar gyfer y gaeaf nesaf yn unig. Mae hynny'n rhan allweddol, ond rhaid iddo ymwneud hefyd â'r holl system o sicrhau bod gennym y nifer gwelyau, yn y gymuned yn ogystal ag mewn ysbytai, i ymdrin ag anghenion ein pobl a'u gofal. Dyna pam y mae'r tasglu'n cynnwys nid yn unig sectorau'r NHS a'r ysbytai, ond

and union and staff representatives. The taskforce will report to the Health and Social Services Committee regularly. I believe that it will come up with recommendations, not only on how to deal with next year and to avoid the same kind of pressures as last winter if a similar flu outbreak happened, but also on how we plan throughout the year.

It is important, Kirsty, that we consider capacity planning issues throughout the NHS. That is a central issue for the taskforce. It is vital that we have compatible information and that the taskforce collects data on capacity from all the NHS trusts, including critical care beds, bed usage and demand. We will consider the English bed inquiry as part of the programme of work. As people know, that was set up in September 1998 and has recently published its findings. The initial findings of that inquiry were that two thirds of general and acute NHS beds are occupied by people aged over 65, and that they account for more than half the recent growth in emergency admissions. This goes back to the point that Brian Gibbons made about demography. At least two out of every 10 days spent by people aged over 65 in acute hospital beds could be better provided for with alternative facilities, such as intermediate care beds. I hope that we can all agree, across parties, that this issue requires consideration. As Kirsty Williams said, we must consider the kind of beds needed. It is not only about the number of beds. We are beyond that situation.

5:30 p.m.

We know that interesting discussions are taking place about community hospitals and the different functions that they can play, including the provision of intermediate and social care as well as acute and emergency care. The role of other hospitals in Wales has been examined in our acute services review. We must go beyond the soundbite, from the

hefyd llywodraeth leol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, y sector gofal sylfaenol drwy ymarferwyr cyffredinol, y cyrff partneriaeth a chynrychiolwyr yr undebau a'r staff. Bydd y tasglu'n adrodd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn rheolaidd. Credaf y bydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion, nid yn unig ynghylch y modd i ddelio â'r flwyddyn nesaf ac osgoi'r un math o bwysau â'r gaeaf diwethaf os bydd achosion tebyg o'r fflw yn digwydd, ond hefyd ynghylch y modd y cynlluniwn drwy'r flwyddyn.

Mae'n bwysig, Kirsty, inni ystyried materion cynllunio niferoedd gwelyau ledled yr NHS. Mae hynny'n fater canolog i'r tasglu. Mae'n holl bwysig inni gael gwybodaeth gyfaddas a bod y tasglu'n casglu data ar nifer y gwelyau oddi wrth holl ymddiriedolaethau'r NHS, gan gynnwys gwelyau gofal critigol, defnydd o welyau a galw. Byddwn yn ystyried yr ymchwiliad i welyau yn Lloegr fel rhan o'r rhaglen waith. Fel y gwyddys, sefydlwyd hynny ym Medi 1998 a chyhoeddodd ei ganfyddiadau'n ddiweddar. Canfyddiadau dechreuol yr ymchwiliad hwnnw oedd bod dwy ran o dair o welyau cyffredinol ac arhosiad byr yr NHS yn cael eu defnyddio gan rai dros 65, a'u bod yn cyfrif am fwy na hanner y cynnydd diweddar mewn derbyniadau brys. Mae hyn yn dychwelyd at y pwynt a wnaeth Brian Gibbons am ddemograffi. Mae o leiaf ddau o bob 10 diwrnod a dreulir gan rai dros 65 oed mewn gwelyau ysbyty arhosiad byr yn rhai y gellid darparu'n well ar eu cyfer â chyfleusterau amgen, fel gwelyau gofal rhyngol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn oll gytuno, ar draws y pleidiau, fod angen rhoi ystyriaeth i'r mater hwn. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, rhaid inni ystyried y math o welyau y mae eu hangen. Nid nifer y gwelyau yn unig sydd dan sylw. Yr ydym wedi mynd ymhellach na'r sefyllfa honno.

Gwyddom fod trafodaethau diddorol yn digwydd ynghylch ysbytai cymunedol a'r gwahanol swyddogaethau y gallant eu cyflawni, gan gynnwys darparu gofal rhyngol a chymdeithasol yn ogystal â gofal arhosiad byr a brys. Ystyriwyd rôl ysbytai eraill yng Nghymru yn ein hadolygiad o wasanaethau arhosiad byr. Rhaid inni fynd ymhellach na'r

'more beds' issue to consider what kind of beds, care in the community and out of hours services we provide.

In terms of our bed capacity we have 5.2 beds per 1,000 of the population, compared with 4.3 beds per 1,000 in England. Scotland has 7.4 beds per 1,000. Therefore, we are not in the same position as England. Part of England's response to its inquiry was that it should increase the number of beds to 4,000. Many of those beds would be intermediate care beds. We must examine the bed inquiry and what that means for us.

Janet Davies mentioned day surgery. I am glad that you have seen that there are many developments that we must move forward. I recently visited the day surgery unit in Wrexham Maelor Hospital and saw the excellent care provided there. Karen Sinclair is not here, but she was a patient at the unit a few days before I visited.

The number of acute day case patients treated in Wales between 1996 and 1997 has increased by 15 per cent. They now account for around 70 per cent of all elective activity. A working group which is considering increasing the capacity of day surgery throughout Wales to a 23-hour day case capacity. We must consider that. We must also consider how we can ensure that community care is provided for day surgery patients after they return home.

We have shorter stays in hospitals because of clinical advances. We all know that. That means that the link with social services and community care must be even more rigorous. We have opportunities to develop this through our local health groups and the Health Act 1999, which gives us the opportunity to pool budgets and lead commissioning between health and social services. There are interesting developments in Wales where health and social services are working much closer together.

datganiad bachog, oddi wrth y mater 'mwy o welyau' i ystyried pa fath o welyau, gofal yn y gymuned a gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau a ddarparwn.

O ran nifer ein gwelyau, mae gennym 5.2 gwely am bob 1,000 o'r boblogaeth, o'i gymharu â 4.3 gwely am bob 1,000 yn Lloegr. Mae gan yr Alban 7.4 gwely am bob 1,000. Felly, nid ydym yn yr un sefyllfa â Lloegr. Rhan o ymateb Lloegr i'w hymchwiliad oedd y dylai gynyddu nifer y gwelyau i 4,000. Byddai llawer o'r gwelyau hynny'n welyau gofal rhyngol. Rhaid inni ystyried yr ymchwiliad gwelyau a'r hyn y mae'n ei olygu i ni.

Crybwyllodd Janet Davies lawfeddygaeth ddydd. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gweld bod llawer o ddatblygiadau y mae'n rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen â hwy. Ymwelais yn ddiweddar ag uned llawfeddygaeth ddydd Ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor a gwelais y gofal rhagorol a ddarperir yno. Nid yw Karen Sinclair yma, ond yr oedd yn glaf yn yr uned ychydig ddyddiau cyn imi ymweld.

Bu cynnydd o 15 y cant yn nifer y cleifion achosion dydd arhosiad byr a gafodd driniaeth yng Nghymru rhwng 1996 a 1997. Bellach maent yn cyfrif am tua 70 y cant o'r holl weithgaredd dewisol. Mae gweithgor sydd yn ystyried cynyddu gallu llawfeddygaeth ddydd ledled Cymru fel y gall drin achosion dydd o fewn 23 awr. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried sut y gallwn sicrhau y darperir gofal cymunedol i gleifion llawfeddygaeth ddydd ar ôl iddynt ddod adref.

Mae gennym arhosiadau byrrach mewn ysbytai oherwydd datblygiadau clinigol. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod hynny. Golyga hynny fod yn rhaid wrth gysylltiad mwy trwyadl byth â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymunedol. Mae gennym gyfleoedd i ddatblygu hyn drwy ein grwpiau iechyd lleol a Deddf Iechyd 1999, sydd yn rhoi'r cyfle inni gyfuno cyllidebau a chomisiynu arweiniol rhwng gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol. Mae datblygiadau diddorol yng Nghymru lle y mae gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol yn gweithio'n llawer agosach â'i gilydd.

We are at the start of real change in Wales in how we provide our health and social care. This relates to the kind of care we provide across the board. More resources are needed and I will press for those, as I hope that you will continue to do. This means not simply setting up taskforces and working groups that go away and study the papers; it means delivering on the recommendations. It means ensuring that the Carmarthenshire project on prioritisation, which is an excellent example of considering social as well as clinical issues, is embedded into the system.

We must learn from the beds and bureaucracy report and move together on this issue. The Health and Social Services Committee must take on board that we have high levels of ill health in Wales. We have those pressures and we must address them in the Assembly. We must also consider the starting point of prevention and health care, recognising that it includes issues like chronic disease management. We must ensure that our most vulnerable people, such as those who suffered respiratory diseases after Christmas, are supported in the community. They often have to go into hospital because they do not have the community support that they need.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am ddiwrnod o ddadlau diddorol. Bydd y Dirprwy Lywydd, Jane Davidson, yn llywyddu yfory. Ymddiheuraf am fy absenoldeb. Diolch i'r Aelodau am weithgareddau heddiw. Dyna ddiwedd busnes heddiw.

Yr ydym ar ddechrau newid gwirioneddol yng Nghymru o ran y modd y darparwn ein gofal iechyd a chymdeithasol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r math o ofal a ddarparwn drwyddo draw. Mae angen mwy o adnoddau a byddaf yn pwysu am y rheini, fel y byddwch chi'n parhau i wneud, yr wyf yn gobeithio. Mae hyn yn golygu nid yn unig sefydlu tasgluoedd a gweithgorau sydd yn mynd i ffwrdd ac yn astudio'r papurau; golyga gyflawni'r argymhellion. Golyga sicrhau bod y prosiect yn Sir Gaerfyrddin ar flaenoriaethu, sydd yn enghraifft ragorol o ystyried materion cymdeithasol yn ogystal â rhai clinigol, wedi ei ymgorffori yn y system.

Rhaid inni ddysgu oddi wrth yr adroddiad ar welyau a biwrocratiaeth a symud gyda'n gilydd ar y mater hwn. Rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dderbyn bod gennym lefelau uchel o iechyd gwael yng Nghymru. Mae'r pwysau hynny gennym a rhaid inni roi sylw iddynt yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd y man cychwyn o atal a gofal iechyd, gan gydnabod ei fod yn cynnwys materion fel rheoli clefydau hirfaith. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y bobl sydd yn fwyaf agored i newid, fel y rhai a ddioddefodd glefydau anadliadol ar ôl y Nadolig, yn cael eu cynnal yn y gymuned. Yn aml, rhaid iddynt fynd i'r ysbyty am nad oes ganddynt mo'r gefnogaeth gymunedol y mae arnynt ei hangen.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for a day of interesting debate. The Deputy Presiding Officer, Jane Davidson, will preside tomorrow. I apologise for my absence. Thank you to Members for today's deliberation. That is the end of today's business.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.*

*The session ended at 5.35 p.m.*