



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 6 Rhagfyr 2001

Thursday 6 December 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language
- 13 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 21 Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd
Questions to the Minister for Assembly Business
- 31 Datganiad ar 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'
Statement on 'Farming for the Future'
- 45 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 49 Gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.27
Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.27
- 50 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Brif Grwpiau Gwariant
Approval of Changes to Main Expenditure Groups
- 56 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): Strategaeth Economaidd Effeithiol
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales): An Effective Economic Strategy
- 84 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 85 Dadl Fer: Darpariaeth ar gyfer y Celfyddydau Gweledol yng Nghymru
Short Debate: Provision for the Visual Arts in Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language**

**Mynd i'r Afael ag Eithrio Cymdeithasol mewn Chwaraeon
Tackling Social Exclusion in Sport**

Q1 Brian Gibbons: Will the Minister indicate how she expects the recent new opportunities fund school sports scheme to tackle social exclusion in sport? (OAQ14529)

C1 Brian Gibbons: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddangos sut y mae'n disgwyl i gynllun chwaraeon ysgolion diweddar y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd fynd i'r afael ag eithrio cymdeithasol mewn chwaraeon? (OAQ14529)

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I was pleased to be involved, with Jane Davidson, in the launch of the new £48 million programme recently. The funding for the programme will be directed so that more is available in the most deprived areas. I expect the programme to have a long-term impact on key issues facing local communities such as education, health, crime and drug use, by creating a step change in the provision of sporting facilities for young people and their local communities.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Yr oeddwn yn falch o gymryd rhan, gyda Jane Davidson, wrth lansio'r rhaglen newydd £48 miliwn yn ddiweddar. Caiff y cyllid ar gyfer y rhaglen ei gyfeirio fel bod mwy ar gael i'r ardaloedd mwy difreintiedig. Disgwyliaf i'r rhaglen gael effaith hirdymor ar faterion allweddol sy'n wynebu cymunedau lleol megis addysg, iechyd, trosedd a chamdefnyddio cyffuriau, drwy greu newid sylweddol wrth ddarparu cyfleusterau chwaraeon i bobl ifanc a'u cymunedau lleol.

Brian Gibbons: Do you agree that it is crucial that these facilities are located in the community they are to serve, as, if they are situated elsewhere, that could lead to prohibitive travel costs, and so on, for local people?

Brian Gibbons: A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol i'r cyfleusterau hyn gael eu lleoli yn y gymuned y bwriedir iddynt ei gwasanaethu, gan y gallai eu lleoli rywle arall arwain at gostau teithio afresymol, ac ati, i'r bobl leol?

Jenny Randerson: If the community is to use schools' sports facilities, their geographical location is important. This issue should be dealt with by the fact that the new opportunities fund is working closely with education authorities and the Sports Council for Wales to provide an overall provision that is fairly and evenly distributed. The sports council has a rich knowledge of the provision that currently exists, and of what is needed.

Jenny Randerson: Os yw'r gymuned i ddefnyddio cyfleusterau chwaraeon ysgolion, mae eu lleoliad daearyddol yn bwysig. Dylid ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn unol â'r ffaith bod y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn cydweithio'n agos ag awdurdodau addysg a Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i gynnig darpariaeth gyffredinol sydd wedi ei dosbarthu'n deg a chyson. Mae gan y cyngor chwaraeon wybodaeth drylwyr o'r ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael eisoes, ac o'r hyn sydd ei angen.

David Melding: A secondary school in my constituency has no access to playing fields, and must use a hard surface play area for all physical education activities. Do you agree

David Melding: Nid oes gan ysgol uwchradd yn fy etholaeth i gaeau chwarae y gallant eu defnyddio, a rhaid iddynt ddefnyddio maes chwarae wyneb caled ar gyfer ei holl

that that is unacceptable and needs to be sorted out so that schools and the wider community have access to appropriate sporting facilities?

Jenny Randerson: You have put your finger on a knotty problem. There are several schools in my constituency—and I am sure that almost everyone here has the same problem—that do not have access to playing fields. One must do one's best with the facilities that the school has, namely the hard surface playing area, to ensure that those facilities are as good as possible, given that one cannot move the schools.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn darparu cyfle inni gynorthwyo ardaloedd lle mae prinder difrifol o feysydd chwarae ac adeiladau ar gyfer chwaraeon dan-do? A yw hefyd yn derbyn, fel yr awgrymodd yn ei hateb blaenorol, fod ysgolion lleol yn adnodd perffaith ar gyfer datblygu'r math hwn o wasanaeth? Soniodd David Melding am ei etholaeth ef, a gallaf innau siarad am Ysgol David Hughes ym Mhorthaethwy sydd am wneud cais o dan y gronfa hon. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na sôn am gais penodol, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau'r ffaith bod ysgolion yn adnodd pwysig i ddatblygu gwasanaethau fel hyn?

Jenny Randerson: The key concept of this fund is that one should be able to develop the sort of resource you mention. I notice, Ieuan, that your constituency has been allocated over £1 million under this scheme, and that should enable schools to make their case to the local education authorities. The LEAs will then present a portfolio of provision, stating that they wish to receive this money. That will then go to the new opportunities fund, which works with the sports council to provide the sort of provision you mention.

weithgareddau addysg gorfforol. A gytunwch fod hynny yn annerbyniol a bod angen ei ddatrys fel bod ysgolion a'r gymuned ehangach yn cael defnyddio cyfleusterau chwaraeon priodol?

Jenny Randerson: Rhoesoch eich bys ar broblem ddyrys. Mae sawl ysgol yn fy etholaeth i—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr un broblem gan bawb yma bron—na allant ddefnyddio caeau chwarae. Rhaid gwneud y gorau o'r cyfleusterau sydd gan yr ysgol, sef maes chwarae wyneb caled, i sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau hynny cystal â phosibl, o gofio na ellir symud yr ysgolion.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Does the Minister accept that the new opportunities fund provides us with an opportunity to assist areas where playing fields and sports halls are in very short supply? Does she also accept, as she suggested in her previous reply, that local schools are a perfect resource for the development of such services? David Melding referred to his constituency, and I can tell you of Ysgol David Hughes in Menai Bridge, which intends to make an application to this fund. However, rather than discuss a specific application, will the Minister confirm that schools are an important resource in developing such services?

Jenny Randerson: Cysyniad allweddol y gronfa hon yw'r gallu i ddatblygu'r math o adnoddau y cyfeiriwch atynt. Sylwaf, Ieuan, fod dros £1 filiwn wedi ei bennu i'ch etholaeth chi o dan y cynllun hwn, a dylai hynny alluogi ysgolion i gyflwyno eu hachos i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol. Yna, bydd yr AALl yn cyflwyno portffolio o ddarpariaeth, yn nodi eu bod yn dymuno derbyn yr arian hwn. Aiff wedyn i'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd, sy'n cydweithio gyda'r cyngor chwaraeon i gynnig y math o ddarpariaeth y cyfeiriwch ati.

Hyrwyddo Arwyddion Dwyieithog Promoting Bilingual Signage

Q2 Alun Pugh: Will the Minister make a statement on how bilingual signage is to be

C2 Alun Pugh: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sut y bydd arwyddion

promoted in Wales? (OAQ14521)

Jenny Randerson: Signage for which the Welsh Assembly Government is responsible, including trunk road signs, is bilingual under the current language scheme. Also, statutory guidelines for the preparation of language schemes by public bodies in Wales, state that public information signs should be bilingual. Planning advice suggests that local planning authorities should encourage the provision of bilingual signs and the retention of traditional Welsh place names for new developments and streets. In addition, the Welsh Language Board and the Wales Tourist Board operate schemes to grant aid for bilingual signage.

Alun Pugh: If you drive along the A55, you will see many examples of big companies showing no sensitivity towards the Welsh language. While no-one would want to insist that MacDonalds trades as apDonalds on this side of the border, would you agree that fast food companies can be as bad for the Welsh language as for your health?

9:15 a.m.

Jenny Randerson: I hope that big companies working in largely bilingual areas would recognise the advantages of such signs in terms of marketing. However, local authorities, as planning authorities, can take this into account when granting planning permission for signs. They can consider that. The Welsh Language Board works with companies on a voluntary basis to encourage them to produce bilingual signs and to develop an awareness of language issues. I suggest that you might want to contact the Welsh Language Board and discuss this issue with it.

Owen John Thomas: Mae nifer o enwau lleoedd lle mae'r fersiwn Cymraeg a'r fersiwn Saesneg yn ymdebygu o ran sain a sillafiad, er enghraifft, Caerffili, Y Barri a Llandaf. A gytunwch y byddai'n haws ac yn rhatach gosod un ffurf ar arwyddion, sef y

dwyieithog yn cael eu hyrwyddo yng Nghymru? (OAQ14521)

Jenny Randerson: Mae arwyddion sydd yn dod o dan gyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gan gynnwys arwyddion cefnffyrdd, yn ddwyieithog o dan y cynllun iaith presennol. Hefyd, mae'r canllawiau statudol ar gyfer darparu cynlluniau iaith gan gyrrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn nodi y dylai arwyddion gwybodaeth cyhoeddus fod yn ddwyieithog. Mae cyngor cynllunio yn awgrymu y dylai awdurdodau cynllunio lleol annog darparu arwyddion dwyieithog a chadw enwau lleoedd traddodiadol Cymraeg ar gyfer datblygiadau a strydoedd newydd. Yn ogystal, mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn gweithredu cynlluniau cymorth grant ar gyfer arwyddion dwyieithog.

Alun Pugh: Pe baech yn gyrru ar hyd yr A55, byddech yn gweld enghreifftiau lawer o gwmnïau mawr nad ydynt yn dangos unrhyw sensitifrwydd tuag at y Gymraeg. Er na fyddai neb am fynnu bod MacDonalds yn masnachu fel apDonalds ar yr ochr yma i'r ffin, a gytunwch y gall cwmnïau bwyd brys fod yr un mor ddrwg i'r Gymraeg ag y maent i'ch iechyd?

Jenny Randerson: Gobeithiaf y byddai cwmnïau mawr sy'n gweithio mewn ardaloedd sy'n bennaf ddwyieithog yn cydnabod manteision arwyddion o'r fath o ran marchnata. Fodd bynnag, gall awdurdodau lleol, fel awdurdodau cynllunio, ystyried hyn wrth roi caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer arwyddion. Gallant ystyried hynny. Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn cydweithio â chwmnïau yn wirfoddol i'w hannog i gynhyrchu arwyddion dwyieithog ac i ddatblygu ymwybyddiaeth o faterion ieithyddol. Awgrymaf eich bod yn cysylltu â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i drafod y mater gydag ef.

Owen John Thomas: There are a number of place names for which the Welsh and English versions are similar in sound and spelling, for example, Caerphilly, Barry and Llandaff. Do you agree that it would be easier and cheaper to place only the correct Welsh form on

ffurf gywir yn Gymraeg, yn hytrach na gosod y ddwy ffurf?

Jenny Randerson: Since those signs are provided by local authorities and private developers of housing estates and so on, it is for them to decide which signs to put up. However, we must bear in mind that there is a historic interest in comparing the Welsh and English versions and noting similarity. I enjoy looking at such names from a linguistic history perspective.

Glyn Davies: Minister, is it not time that we reached a stage where bilingualism is so accepted in Wales that there is no need to ask this sort of question? We should develop this to the extent that the private sector considers using bilingual signs to be commercially advantageous.

Jenny Randerson: I hope that commercial organisations will recognise the advantage of bilingualism. Several large companies, as well as smaller companies, recognise the advantages of operating and providing a service in two languages. The Wales Tourist Board has gathered good evidence on the advantages of bilingualism to us as a nation, and on providing bilingual marketing for tourism.

signs, rather than use both?

Jenny Randerson: Gan mai awdurdodau lleol a datblygwyr preifat ystadau tai ac ati, sy'n darparu'r arwyddion hynny, hwy sydd i benderfynu pa arwyddion i'w gosod. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio bod diddordeb hanesyddol mewn cymharu fersiynau Cymraeg a Saesneg a nodi tebygrwydd. Byddaf yn mwynhau edrych ar enwau o'r fath o safbwynt hanes iaith.

Glyn Davies: Weinidog, onid yw'n bryd inni gyraedd y cam lle mae dwyieithrwydd yng Nghymru mor arferol fel nad oes angen gofyn y math hwn o gwestiwn? Dylem ddatblygu hyn i'r graddau bod y sector preifat yn ystyried bod defnyddio arwyddion dwyieithog yn fasnachol fanteisiol.

Jenny Randerson: Gobeithiaf y bydd sefydliadau masnachol yn cydnabod manteision dwyieithrwydd. Mae sawl cwmni mawr, yn ogystal â chwmnïau llai, yn cydnabod manteision gweithredu a darparu gwasanaeth mewn dwy iaith. Mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru wedi casglu tystiolaeth dda ar fanteision dwyieithrwydd inni fel cenedl, ac ar ddarparu marchnata dwyieithog ar gyfer twristiaeth.

Cynorthwyo'r Celfyddydau yng Nghymru Supporting the Arts in Wales

C3 Gareth Jones: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio sicrhau bod y celfyddydau yng Nghymru yn derbyn cymorth addas yn holl ranbarthau Cymru? (OAQ14454)

Jenny Randerson: The Arts Council of Wales is putting a regional structure in place to ensure better local delivery of services. The council is also consulting across Wales on its five-year arts development strategy, which will help deliver the aims of my culture strategy, 'Creative Future'. A key aim is to ensure access and participation for everyone. The arts council will receive an increase of nearly £3 million this coming year, on top of the £1.3 million that was already planned. With the extra £2 million per year pledged to support the arts when the Wales Millennium Centre comes on stream,

Q3 Gareth Jones: How is the Minister seeking to ensure that the arts in Wales are adequately supported across all regions of Wales? (QAQ14454)

Jenny Randerson: Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn gosod strwythur rhanbarthol yn ei le er mwyn sicrhau gwell darpariaeth gwasanaeth yn lleol. Mae'r cyngor hefyd yn ymgynghori ledled Cymru ar ei strategaeth datblygu'r celfyddydau pum mlynedd a fydd yn helpu i gyflwyno amcanion fy strategaeth ddiwylliannol, 'Cymru Creadigol'. Un o'r amcanion allweddol fydd sicrhau mynediad a chyfranogiad i bawb. Bydd cyngor y celfyddydau yn derbyn cynnydd o bron £3 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf, ar ben y £1.3 miliwn a gynlluniwyd amdano eisoes. Gyda'r

we will be well placed to ensure that any gaps are filled.

Gareth Jones: Diolch, Weinidog, am y newyddion da. Fodd bynnag, a ydych am sicrhau cynnydd yn y gefnogaeth ariannol i sioeau celfyddydol teithiol yng Nghymru fel ei bod yn debyg i'r hyn a geir yn Lloegr a'r Alban?

Jenny Randerson: My culture strategy, 'Creative Future', allows for the sort of increase and support for which we are looking. We are now able to put the arts in Wales on a firmer financial foundation, similar to that which has existed in Scotland in recent years. We can stop being depressed about the state of the arts in Wales and start looking forward to a much brighter future.

Janice Gregory: Minister, I would love to stop being depressed about the arts in Wales. However, by its own admission, the Arts Council of Wales spent only £90,000 in my constituency, Omore, during the financial year 2000-01. That is 0.7 per cent of its grant-in-aid of £13 million. That is an abysmal amount to give a deprived constituency. I ask you, Minister, to actively encourage organisations in deprived communities to apply for awards from the Arts Council of Wales. It is seen as an elitist organisation, which deters organisations from applying for grant aid.

Jenny Randerson: The perception of the Arts Council of Wales as an elitist organisation is wrong. It has given significant amounts of money to the Valleys; a large proportion of its lottery money goes to Valleys areas. I cannot argue with the figure for your constituency, which I agree sounds exceptionally low. However, the Valleys gets a fair share, per capita—in fact, a higher-than-normal share—of the Arts Council of Wales's grant. However, I agree that much needs to be done to ensure that lottery money is spread fairly throughout Wales.

I was pleased earlier this week to attend an

£2 filiwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol sydd wedi ei addo i gefnogi'r celfyddydau pan ddaw Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn weithredol, byddwn mewn sefyllfa dda i sicrhau y caiff unrhyw fylchau eu llenwi.

Gareth Jones: Thank you for that good news, Minister. However, will you secure an increase in the financial support for touring art shows in Wales so that it is similar to that available in England and Scotland?

Jenny Randerson: Mae fy strategaeth ddiwylliannol, 'Cymru Creadigol', yn caniatáu ar gyfer y math o gynnydd a chefnogaeth a geisiwn. Gallwn bellach roi'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru ar dir ariannol cadarnach, tebyg i'r hyn sydd wedi bodoli yn yr Alban yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Gallwn roi'r gorau i dristau ynglŷn â sefyllfa'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru a dechrau edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol llawer mwy llewyrchus.

Janice Gregory: Weinidog, byddwn wrth fy modd yn rhoi'r gorau i dristau ynglŷn â'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl ei gyfaddefiad ei hun, dim ond £90,000 a wariodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn fy etholaeth i, Ogwr, yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol 2000-01. 0.7 y cant o'r cymorth grant o £13 miliwn yw hynny. Mae hynny yn swm difrifol i'w roi i etholaeth ddifreintiedig. Gofynnaf ichi, Weinidog, roi hwb pendant i sefydliadau mewn cymunedau difreintiedig geisio am grantiau gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Caiff ei weld fel sefydliad elitaidd, sy'n rhwystro sefydliadau rhag gwneud cais am grantiau.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r canfyddiad o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru fel sefydliad elitaidd yn anghywir. Mae wedi rhoi symiau sylweddol o arian i'r Cymoedd; aiff cyfran fawr o'i arian loteri i ardaloedd yn y Cymoedd. Ni allaf ddadlau â'r ffigurau ar gyfer eich etholaeth chi, sy'n swnio'n eithriadol o isel, fe gytunaf. Fodd bynnag, caiff y Cymoedd gyfran deg, y pen—yn wir, gyfran fwy na'r cyffredin—o grant Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf fod yn rhaid gwneud llawer i sicrhau y caiff arian loteri ei rannu'n deg ledled Cymru.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o fynychu digwyddiad

event at Llancaiach Fawr manor, which was designed for the local community and for local organisations. It was organised across the lottery distributors, and representatives from the Arts Council of Wales, the Sports Council for Wales and many others were there. The idea was to tell people that they could apply for money, that they can get small or large amounts of money, and that the application process is simple. The Arts Council of Wales has held and will hold several such events throughout Wales, and I applaud it for its initiative in doing so.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Minister, you are aware of the long-term debt, over some 20 to 30 years, of the Wyeside Arts Centre in Builth Wells of £80,000. We have corresponded on this matter, and while I realise that it is a matter for the Arts Council of Wales, will you consider mentioning this when setting your remit in discussions with the arts council? Ten per cent of the centre's budget goes on servicing that debt, and it is not in anybody's interest—the Arts Council of Wales, the arts in Wales, and certainly not the people of Builth Wells—that that continues.

Jenny Randerson: In my instructions to Arts Council of Wales officials on next year's budget, we discussed the need to spend money on the organisations that it currently funds which are in financial difficulty. We have discussed embarking upon a process known as stabilisation. That was done on a grand scale—given the figures involved—with the Welsh National Opera, but the principle can be applied to other organisations in Wales. I hope to visit the Wyeside Arts Centre soon.

Peter Black: Can you update us on the progress of the Wales Millennium Centre? How will you spend the £2 million that is to be distributed around Wales?

Jenny Randerson: On the Wales Millennium Centre, I had hoped to be able to report on developments by now. The Assembly term is drawing to a close, and I am conscious that there may not be another

ym mhlasty Llancaiach Fawr yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer y gymuned leol a sefydliadau lleol. Fe'i trefnwyd ar y cyd gan y dosbarthwyr loteri, ac yr oedd cynrychiolwyr o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a sawl corff arall yno. Y syniad oedd dweud wrth bobl y gallent wneud cais am arian, y gallent gael swm bach neu fawr, a bod y drefn o wneud cais yn syml. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru wedi cynnal sawl digwyddiad fel hyn ledled Cymru a byddant yn cynnal mwy eto, a chymeradwyaf hwy am ei ddyfeisgarwch wrth wneud hynny.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Weinidog, gwyddoch am y ddyled hirdymor o £80,000 dros gyfnod o tua 20 i 30 mlynedd, sydd gan Ganolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Yr ydym wedi gohebu ar y mater hwn, ac er fy mod yn cydnabod mai mater i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ydyw, a ystyriwch sôn am hyn wrth osod eich cenadwri mewn trafodaethau â chyngor y celfyddydau? Aiff 10 y cant o gyllideb y ganolfan at dalu llog y ddyled honno, ac nid yw o fudd i neb—Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, y celfyddydau yng Nghymru, ac yn sicr nid i bobl Llanfair-ym-Muallt—fod hynny'n parhau.

Jenny Randerson: Yn fy nghyfarwyddyd i swyddogion Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, trafodwyd yr angen i wario arian ar y sefydliadau a ariannir ganddo ar hyn o bryd sydd mewn trafferthion ariannol. Trafodwyd ymgymryd â phroses a elwir yn sefydlogi. Gwnaethpwyd hynny'n sylweddol—o gofio'r ffigurau dan sylw—ag Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, ond gellir defnyddio'r un egwyddor i sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf ymweld â Chanolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy cyn bo hir.

Peter Black: A allwch ein goleuo ar ddatblygiad Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru? Sut y byddwch yn gwario'r £2 filiwn sydd i'w ddosbarthu ledled Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: O safbwynt Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio gallu cyflwyno adroddiad ar y datblygiadau erbyn hyn. Mae tymor y Cynulliad yn tynnu at ei derfyn, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol efallai

opportunity to update Members in Plenary before Christmas. I will give you some information now. For operational reasons, Sir Robert McAlpine Limited was unable to provide the project with a final fixed price on 9 November as planned. Rather, its partners agreed to continue to negotiate the detail of the construction package to establish an even better fix on the cost and risk. I understand that that work is now complete, and that the results will be presented to the Wales Millennium Centre board on 12 December. If all goes well, I expect to be approached shortly afterwards for approval for the project to proceed. I will report on the outcome of that as soon as possible.

On the £2 million for the rest of Wales, in which Peter is interested, it is envisaged that the full £2 million will be available when the centre opens. An initial provision of £800,000 has been established within this year's draft budget settlement for the financial year 2003-04. It is in the arts council's budget for that year.

9:25 a.m.

Peter Law: I was pleased to hear the Minister say earlier that the Wales Millennium Centre would fill in some of the gaps around here. Some of the gaps in my constituency—and in Janice's constituency—with regard to arts provision are big. Will the Minister assure us that she will bring this issue back to Plenary for a democratic vote on the public funding of £25 million for the Wales Millennium Centre? Up to now, she has hidden behind the fact that that debate was cancelled when we lost our late friend and colleague, Val Feld. It is her responsibility to bring it to Plenary for a democratic vote.

Jenny Randerson: I will expand on the answer that I previously gave you, Peter. As a result of that debate being cancelled, it was simply not possible to bring this issue to Plenary for a democratic vote because the whole project would have fallen if we had been unable to proceed with the discussions. When the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, Edwina Hart,

na fydd cyfle arall i hysbysu'r Aelodau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn cyn y Nadolig. Rhoddaf ychydig o wybodaeth ichi yn awr. Am resymau gweithrediadol, ni allai Syr Robert McAlpine Cyfyngedig roi pris cadarn terfynol i'r prosiect ar 9 Tachwedd fel y bwriadwyd. Yn hytrach, cytunodd ei bartneriaid drafod manylion y pecyn adeiladu er mwyn rhoi cadarnhad gwell hyd yn oed ar y gost a'r risg. Deallaf fod y gwaith hwnnw bellach wedi ei gwblhau, ac y caiff y canlyniadau eu cyflwyno i fwrdd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ar 12 Rhagfyr. Os aiff popeth yn iawn, disgwyliaf dderbyn cais yn fuan wedyn i ganiatáu i'r prosiect barhau. Adroddaf yn ôl ar ganlyniad hynny cyn gynted â phosibl.

Ynglŷn â'r £2 filiwn ar gyfer gweddill Cymru, sydd o ddiddordeb i Peter, rhagwelir y bydd y £2 filiwn llawn ar gael pan agorir y ganolfan. Sefydlwyd darpariaeth gychwynnol o £800,000 o fewn setliad cyllideb drafft y flwyddyn hon ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2003-04. Mae yng nghyllideb cyngor y celfyddydau ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno.

Peter Law: Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud yn gynharach y byddai Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn llenwi rhai o'r bylchau sydd yma. Mae rhai o'r bylchau yn fy etholaeth i—ac yn etholaeth Janice—o ran y celfyddydau, yn fawr. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd yn cyflwyno'r mater hwn yn ôl i Gyfarfod Llawn ar gyfer pleidlais ddemocrataidd ar yr arian cyhoeddus o £25 miliwn ar gyfer Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru? Hyd yma, mae wedi cuddio y tu ôl i'r ffaith y cafodd y ddadl honno ei gohirio pan gollasom ein cyfaill a'n diweddar gyd-Aelod, Val Feld. Ei chyfrifoldeb hi yw ei gyflwyno i Gyfarfod Llawn ar gyfer pleidlais ddemocrataidd.

Jenny Randerson: Ehangaf ar yr ateb a roddais ichi eisoes, Peter. O ganlyniad i ohirio'r ddadl honno, yr oedd yn amhosibl cyflwyno'r mater hwn i Gyfarfod Llawn ar gyfer pleidlais ddemocrataidd gan y byddai'r prosiect cyfan wedi cael ei gollu pe baem wedi methu â pharhau â'r trafodaethau. Pan roddodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina

gave her statement in April, there was widespread, all-party support for the terms offered. Edwina and I have worked on a cross-party basis. I realise that within each party there may be people who are unhappy with this, but there has been considerable discussion and consultation. I have adhered to the terms of that statement.

Hart, ei datganiad ym mis Ebrill, cafwyd cefnogaeth eang, drawsbleidiol i'r termau a gynigiwyd. Mae Edwina a minnau wedi gweithio ar sail traswsbleidiol. Deallaf y gallai fod rhai sy'n anhapus â hyn o fewn pob plaid, ond cafwyd trafodaethau ac ymgynghori sylweddol. Yr wyf wedi cadw at delerau'r datganiad hwnnw.

Cynorthwyo Athletwyr Anabl i Ragori mewn Chwaraeon Supporting Sporting Excellence for Disabled Athletes

Q4 Brian Gibbons: What facilities are there in Wales to support sporting excellence for disabled athletes? (OAQ14524)

C4 Brian Gibbons: Pa gyfleusterau sydd ar gael yng Nghymru i gynorthwyo athletwyr anabl i ragori mewn chwaraeon? (OAQ14524)

I felt like an Indian batsman, wondering whether I would get my second innings this morning.

Teimlwn fel batiwr o India, yn tybied a gawn fy ail gyfle y bore yma.

Jenny Randerson: I am pleased to have had the opportunity to answer two questions from you this morning, Brian.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i ateb dau gwestiwn gennych y bore yma, Brian.

All performance and excellence facilities grant-aided through Sportlot funding, which is administered by the Sport Council for Wales, are accessible to disabled people. An example is the national indoor athletics centre at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff which provides for disabled athletes in terms of access and specialist equipment. The new national 50-metre swimming pool in Swansea will also be accessible to disabled, high-performance athletes.

Mae'r holl gyfleusterau perfformio a rhagoriaeth a gaiff eu hariannu drwy gymorth grantiau Sportlot, a weinyddir gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, yn hygyrch i'r anabl. Un enghraifft yw'r ganolfan athletau genedlaethol dan do yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd sy'n darparu ar gyfer athletwyr anabl o ran mynediad ac offer arbenigol. Bydd y pwll nofio cenedlaethol newydd 50-medr yn Abertawe hefyd yn hygyrch i athletwyr anabl o'r radd flaenaf.

Brian Gibbons: To summarise your reply, you are saying that while there are facilities, there is no centre of excellence per se in Wales. In view of the growing popularity of athletics among disabled people in Wales, do you think that we should be promoting it?

Brian Gibbons: I grynhoi eich ateb, yr hyn a ddywedwch yw bod cyfleusterau ar gael, ond nad oes canolfan ragoriaeth fel y cyfryw yng Nghymru. O ystyried poblogrwydd cynyddol athletau ymysg yr anabl yng Nghymru, oni chredwch y dylem fod yn ei hyrwyddo?

Jenny Randerson: It is important that excellent facilities are available throughout Wales for disabled athletes, whether the athletics is simply for pleasure and fitness or undertaken at the highest level. The Sport Council for Wales has a strong eye to a strategic view of those facilities throughout Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n bwysig bod cyfleusterau ardderchog ar gael ledled Cymru ar gyfer athletwyr anabl, pa un a yw'r athletau ar gyfer mwynhad a ffitrwydd yn unig neu ar gyfer ymgymryd ag ef ar y lefel uchaf. Mae gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru fwriad cryf i gynnal adolygiad strategol o'r cyfleusterau hynny ledled Cymru.

Pauline Jarman: Last year, we witnessed a sporting milestone for the local communities

Pauline Jarman: Y llynedd, gwelsom gyrraedd carreg filltir mewn chwaraeon ar

of Rhondda Cynon Taff, when four members of the paralympics team representing Britain in Sydney won 15 medals. At the time, David Roberts, one of those sportspeople—who won three gold, three silver and one bronze medals for swimming—said that he was not prepared to move out of Wales to train full-time in Olympic-sized pools because he would rather that any success he had was claimed for Wales. In view of those comments, do you intend to accommodate the needs of this particular group of athletes?

Jenny Randerson: If you are referring to the need for an Olympic-sized pool, we intend to provide that. It is currently under construction in Swansea.

David Davies: There has been criticism regarding access for the disabled at a recent event held for the disabled at Leckwith stadium. What can we all do to ensure that properly designed facilities are available to people who wish to take part in such events?

Jenny Randerson: As individuals, when asked for our views and support, we can look at access for people with disabilities first, rather than last. My experience of big projects is that the concept is often developed before anyone thinks of access for the disabled. We can also double check the requirements of disabled athletes with the Sports Council for Wales, which has 20 disability sports development officers working in communities throughout Wales. We can use those officers to ensure that the right sort of facilities are provided.

gyfer cymunedau lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf, pan enillodd pedwar aelod o'r tîm paralympaidd a oedd yn cynrychioli Prydain yn Sydney 15 o fedalau. Ar y pryd, dywedodd David Roberts, un o'r athletwyr hynny—a enillodd dair medal aur, tair arian ac un efydd am nofio—nad oedd yn barod i symud allan o Gymru i hyfforddi yn llawn amser mewn pyllau maint Olympaidd gan y byddai i'w ran gael ei hawlio dros Gymru. O ystyried y sylwadau hynny, a yw'n fwriad gennych ddarparu ar gyfer anghenion y grŵp arbennig hwn o athletwyr?

Jenny Randerson: Os ydych yn cyfeirio at yr angen am bwll maint Olympaidd, bwriadwn ddarparu hynny. Mae'n cael ei adeiladu yn Abertawe ar hyn o bryd.

David Davies: Cafwyd beirniadaeth ynglŷn â mynediad i'r anabl mewn digwyddiad diweddar a gynhaliwyd ar gyfer yr anabl yn stadiwm Lecwydd. Beth y gall pawb ohonom ei wneud i sicrhau bod cyfleusterau a gynlluniwyd yn briodol ar gael i bobl sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan mewn digwyddiadau o'r fath?

Jenny Randerson: Fel unigolion, pan ofynnir inni am ein barn a'n cefnogaeth, gallwn edrych ar hygyrchedd i bobl ag anableddau yn gyntaf, yn hytrach nac yn olaf. Fy mhrofiad i o brosiectau mawr yw y caiff y cysyniad yn aml ei ddatblygu cyn i unrhyw un ystyried mynediad i'r anabl. Gallwn hefyd sicrhau beth yw gofynion athletwyr anabl gyda Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, sydd ag 20 o swyddogion datblygu chwaraeon i'r anabl yn gweithio mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru. Gallwn ddefnyddio'r swyddogion hynny i sicrhau y darperir y math priodol o gyfleusterau.

Hyrwyddo Athletau yng Nghymru Promoting Athletics in Wales

Q5 Peter Rogers: What is the Minister doing to promote athletics in Wales? (OAQ14457)—in schools.

Jenny Randerson: Did I hear the words 'in schools', which were not in the wording of the question tabled?

C5 Peter Rogers: Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo athletau yng Nghymru? (OAQ14457)—mewn ysgolion.

Jenny Randerson: A glywais y geiriau 'mewn ysgolion', nad oeddynt yng ngeiriad y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd?

Peter Rogers: I am sorry, I withdraw those words.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members are tending to slip things in in their first questions this morning. Matters should be slipped in during supplementary questions, not when reading the tabled question.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Assembly Government's policy on sport is delivered through the Sports Council for Wales. The council works closely with Athletics Association Wales and other partners to develop and promote athletics throughout Wales. Athletics in Wales is in a healthy state in terms of its financial position, facilities, participation levels—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I ask Members to cool it.

Jenny Randerson: The sports council and the athletics association will continue to seek opportunities to develop and promote sport further.

Peter Rogers: One problem with athletics in Wales is with support for schools and young people. Many Members receive letters asking for financial support for these groups. The other issue is the training facilities that are available, particularly in areas such as north Wales. How can we promote schools' access to the superior facilities at colleges and universities? For example, what plans do you have to promote access to the development announced in October for Deeside College where there are tremendous indoor training facilities? I understand that, as part of the project, students will have access to weight training, fitness programmes and sports science tuition. How can we support school children in this way?

Jenny Randerson: You have raised an important issue. The sports council gave £554,000 in 1997 for the athletics complex in Deeside College. It is important that Members—and myself as Minister—raise the importance of co-operation between colleges and local schools with the sports council.

Peter Rogers: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, tynnaf y geiriau hynny yn ôl.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Tuedda'r Aelodau i gyflwyno pethau ychwanegol at eu cwestiynau cyntaf y bore yma. Dylai materion gael eu cyflwyno yn ystod cwestiynau atodol, nid wrth ddarllen y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd.

Jenny Randerson: Cyflwynir polisi chwaraeon Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Mae'r cyngor yn cydweithio'n agos â Chymdeithas Athletau Cymru a phartneriaid eraill i ddatblygu a hyrwyddo athletau ledled Cymru. Mae cyflwr athletau yng Nghymru yn iach o ran ei sefyllfa ariannol, cyfleusterau, lefelau cyfranogi—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau bwylo.

Jenny Randerson: Bydd y Cyngor Chwaraeon a'r gymdeithas athletau yn parhau i chwilio am gyfleoedd i ddatblygu a hyrwyddo chwaraeon ymhellach.

Peter Rogers: Un broblem sydd gan athletau yng Nghymru yw'r gefnogaeth i ysgolion a phobl ifanc. Bydd nifer o Aelodau yn derbyn llythyrau yn gofyn am gymorth ariannol ar gyfer y grwpiau hyn. Y mater arall yw'r cyfleusterau hyfforddi sydd ar gael, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd megis y Gogledd. Sut y gallwn roi'r cyfle i ysgolion fanteisio ar y cyfleusterau gwell sydd ar gael mewn colegau a phrifysgolion? Er enghraifft, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i hyrwyddo mynediad i'r datblygiad a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Hydref ar gyfer Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy lle ceir cyfleusterau hyfforddi dan do gwych? Deallaf y caiff y myfyrwyr, fel rhan o'r prosiect, gyfle i fanteisio ar gyfleusterau codi pwysau, rhaglenni ffitrwydd a hyfforddiant mewn gwyddor chwaraeon. Sut y gallwn gynorthwyo plant ysgol yn y modd hwn?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych wedi codi mater pwysig. Rhoddodd y cyngor chwaraeon £554,000 yn 1997 ar gyfer y ganolfan athletau yng Ngholeg Glannau Dyfrdwy. Mae'n bwysig bod yr Aelodau—a minnau fel Gweinidog—yn codi pwysigrwydd cydweithio rhwng colegau ac

There is good co-operation. Brian Gibbons told me of a proposed complex in Llandarcy where the proposal is based on the idea of co-operation. I think that that kind of co-operation should be available and considered whenever sports council funding is involved.

Rosemary Butler: I think that we always look for the holes in the provision that we have in Wales, but I support your view that the sports council is doing an excellent job. I hope that we can increase its core funding, as well as the core funding for the arts council. I raise the issue of the percentage of lottery money that comes to Wales. I agree that we should spend lottery money throughout Wales, but do you agree that unless we receive our correct allocation, Wales, which is a deprived country, is being disbenefited?

Jenny Randerson: I agree. I have been working for the last year—and I know that my predecessor, Tom Middlehurst, was also working—on increasing the percentage of lottery money that comes to Wales for sport and the arts. We are working closely with the other devolved administrations on this issue.

ysgolion lleol gyda'r Cyngor Chwaraeon. Mae cydweithio da i'w gael. Soniodd Brian Gibbons wrthyf am ganolfan arfaethedig yn Llandarsi lle mae'r cynnig yn seiliedig ar y syniad o gydweithio. Credaf y dylai'r math hwnnw o gydweithio fod ar gael ac y dylid ei ystyried lle bynnag y bydd arian y Cyngor Chwaraeon yn rhan ohono.

Rosemary Butler: Credaf ein bod bob amser yn chwilio am y diffygion yn y ddarpariaeth sydd gennym yng Nghymru, ond cefnogaf eich barn fod y Cyngor Chwaraeon yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gynyddu ei arian craidd, yn ogystal â'r arian craidd ar gyfer cyngor y celfyddydau. Codaf y mater o ganran arian y loteri a ddaw i Gymru. Cytunaf y dylem wario arian y loteri ledled Cymru, ond a gytunwch oni bai ein bod yn derbyn ein dyraniad cywir, fod Cymru, sy'n wlad ddifreintiedig, yn colli manteision?

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf. Bùm yn gweithio dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf—a gwn fod fy rhagflaenydd, Tom Middlehurst, hefyd wedi bod yn gweithio—ar gynyddu'r ganran o arian y loteri a ddaw i Gymru ar gyfer chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill ar y mater hwn.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Marchnadoedd Arbenigol ac Unigryw Access to Specialist and Niche Markets

Q1 Alun Cairns: How is the Minister for Rural Affairs promoting farmers' access to specialist and niche markets? (OAQ14556)

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): Farming Connect provides a single package for farming families wishing to diversify farming activities. The package aims to improve the efficiency and profitability of farms. Our biggest specialist and niche market is the southern European lamb export market, and it is wonderful news that that market will be open for all of Wales by the end of next week.

C1 Alun Cairns: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn hybu cyfleoedd i ffermwyr fanteisio ar farchnadoedd arbenigol a marchnadoedd unigryw? (OAQ14556)

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Mae Cyswllt Ffermio yn darparu un pecyn i deuluoedd sy'n ffermio sy'n dymuno arallgyfeirio gweithgareddau ffermio. Bwriad y pecyn yw gwella effeithlonrwydd ac elw ffermydd. Ein marchnad arbenigol ac unigryw fwyaf yw'r farchnad allforio cig oen i dde Ewrop, ac mae'n newyddion gwych y bydd y farchnad honno'n agored i Gymru gyfan erbyn diwedd yr wythnos nesaf.

9:35 a.m.

Alun Cairns: If the Minister has proposals to promote specific niche and specialist markets, might he find himself in the position of picking winners? The public sector's record of picking winners has not generally been a successful one in recent times. What support would he offer farmers if those specialist markets went wrong?

Carwyn Jones: That is a cryptic question. I do not know whether it is a straight question or a riddle. Of course, we want to promote best practice to ensure that people succeed and are encouraged to succeed via the examples set by other farmers and the business advice and capital grants available from Farming Connect. That is what Farming Connect is about.

Mick Bates: At Tuesday's winter fair, you visited a stall where some farmers—under Farmers Fresh Cymru—were collaborating on a tremendous product called lamb chips. In terms of processing, how will you ensure that this product is well supported and becomes a success for those farmers who have learned to collaborate?

Carwyn Jones: Money is available through grants, primarily the processing and marketing grant, which can help to add value to Welsh produce. If people wish to apply for such a grant or for other funding—if they are in the Objective 1 area, for example—such applications are always welcome. If funding can be made available, then it will be.

Janet Ryder: Minister, to take advantage of these specialist markets, the availability of small, local abattoirs will be important. We do not have enough in Wales; so what will you do to promote the availability and establishment of more small, local abattoirs?

Alun Cairns: Os oes gan y Gweinidog gynigion i hyrwyddo marchnadoedd unigryw ac arbenigol penodol, a allai ganfod ei hun mewn sefyllfa lle bydd yn dewis enillwyr? Ni fu record y sector cyhoeddus o ddewis enillwyr yn llwyddiannus iawn yn ddiweddar. Pa gefnogaeth y byddai'n ei chyning i ffermwyr pe na byddai'r marchnadoedd arbenigol hynny'n llwyddo?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n gwestiwn cryptig. Ni wn a yw'n gwestiwn syml neu'n bos. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym am hyrwyddo arfer gorau er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn llwyddo a'u bod yn cael eu hannog i lwyddo drwy'r enghreifftiau a osodwyd gan ffermwyr eraill a'r cyngor busnes a'r grantiau cyfalaf fydd ar gael gan Gyswllt Ffermio. Dyna yw hanfod Cyswllt Ffermio.

Mick Bates: Yn y Ffair Aeaf ddydd Mawrth, bu ichi ymweld â stondin lle yr oedd rhai ffermwyr—o dan Farmers Fresh Cymru—yn cydweithio ar gynnyrch gwyh o'r enw sglodion cig oen. O ran prosesu, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau cefnogaeth ddigonol i'r cynnyrch hwn a'i fod yn llwyddo i'r ffermwyr hynny sydd wedi dysgu sut i gydweithio?

Carwyn Jones: Mae arian ar gael drwy grantiau, y grant prosesu a marchnata yn bennaf, a all helpu ychwanegu gwerth at gynnyrch o Gymru. Os bydd pobl yn dymuno gwneud cais am grant o'r fath neu am arian arall—os ydynt yn ardal Amcan 1, er enghraifft—croesewir ceisiadau o'r fath bob amser. Os gellir sicrhau'r arian, yna bydd ar gael.

Janet Ryder: Weinidog, er mwyn manteisio ar y marchnadoedd arbenigol hyn, bydd argaeledd lladd-dai bach, lleol yn bwysig. Nid oes gennym ddigon ohonynt yng Nghymru; felly beth a wnewch i hyrwyddo'r argaeledd a sefydlu mwy o ladd-dai bach, lleol?

Carwyn Jones: We have implemented the McLean report's recommendations and have provided financial assistance to small and medium-sized abattoirs to ensure that they do not decrease in number over the course of the coming years. One abattoir has re-opened—the Nantmel Abattoir in Radnorshire—which is welcome news. Other premises are also being considered by various organisations with a view to opening them as abattoirs. We cannot provide grant aid, via the Assembly's grants to re-open an abattoir. However, we can provide grant aid to enable that abattoir to add value to its basic function.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad McLean ac wedi darparu cymorth ariannol i ladd-dai bach a chanolig eu maint er mwyn sicrhau nad yw eu niferoedd yn lleihau yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae un lladd-dy wedi ail-agor—Lladd-dy Nantmel yn Sir Faesyfed—sy'n newyddion da. Mae eiddo eraill hefyd yn cael eu hystyried gan amryw o sefydliadau gyda'r bwriad o'u hagor fel lladd-dai. Ni allwn ddarparu cymorth grant, drwy grantiau'r Cynulliad i ail-agor lladd-dy. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ddarparu cymorth grant er mwyn galluogi'r lladd-dy hwnnw i ychwanegu gwerth i'w swyddogaeth sylfaenol.

Brand Marchnata Unigryw ar gyfer Bwydydd Cymru Distinctive Marketing Brand for Welsh Food

Q2 Rosemary Butler: Will the Minister give an update on the progress of a distinctive marketing brand for Welsh food? (OAQ14470)

C2 Rosemary Butler: A all y Gweinidog roi gwybodaeth ddiweddar am y camau a gymerwyd o ran cael brand marchnata unigryw ar gyfer bwydydd Cymru? (OAQ14470)

Carwyn Jones: The Welsh Development Agency's food directorate has taken forward a project to develop a clear strategic direction and brand position for Welsh food and drink. The aim is to give Welsh products a clear identity with promotion and marketing geared around the brand, known as True Taste. For all those in the centre of Cardiff over the next few days, you will see the True Taste exhibition at the Old Library.

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyfarwyddiaeth fwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi dwyn prosiect rhagddo i ddatblygu cyfeiriad strategol clir a sefyllfa frandio ar gyfer bwyd a diod o Gymru. Y bwriad yw rhoi hunaniaeth glir i gynnyrch o Gymru gydag ymgyrchoedd hyrwyddo a marchnata wedi'u hanelu o amgylch y brand, sef y Gwir Flas. Ar gyfer y sawl a fydd yng nghanol Caerdydd dros yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf, gwelwch arddangosfa y Gwir Flas yn yr Hen Lyfrgell.

Rosemary Butler: Alun Cairns just made a point about overseas markets, and although it is important that Welsh produce is exported to the rest of the world, do you agree that it is equally important to promote Welsh-produced food in Welsh shops, particularly in the run-up to the festive season? In the Assembly shop there are Welsh chocolates, biscuits, alcohol, perfume and soap, but there is a market for much more, such as cheese. Can you encourage people to put such produce on the shelves as soon as possible?

Rosemary Butler: Gwnaeth Alun Cairns bwynt am farchnadoedd tramor, ac er ei bod yn bwysig i gynnyrch o Gymru gael eu hallforio i weddill y byd, a gytunwch ei bod yr un mor bwysig hyrwyddo bwyd a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru mewn siopau yng Nghymru, yn arbennig yn ystod y cyfnod yn arwain at y Nadolig? Yn siop y Cynulliad ceir siocled, bisgedi, alcohol, persawr a sebon o Gymru, ond mae marchnad ar gyfer llawer mwy o gynnyrch, fel caws. A allwch annog pobl i roi cynnyrch o'r fath ar y silffoedd cyn gynted â phosibl?

Carwyn Jones: I agree entirely with those sentiments. We must have as broad a base as possible in terms of what we sell. To simply

Carwyn Jones: Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r sylwadau hynny. Rhaid inni greu sylfaen mor eang â phosibl yn nhermau'r pethau a

rely on one or two markets is not good in the long term. We must promote what we produce in the home market, both in Wales and the rest of the UK. There are organisations that sell Welsh produce via the internet and mail order, and they are proving to be successful. However, if the Assembly shop wished to stock more Welsh products we could put those responsible for the shop in touch with potential suppliers.

Elin Jones: A yw penderfyniad Cwmni Cig Cymru i ddewis yr enw Balchder Celtaidd ar gyfer ei gynnyrch yn gyfle wedi'i golli o ran hyrwyddo'r brand Cymreig, yn enwedig os cawn statws nod daeryddol gwarchoddedig rhyw ddydd?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hwnnw'n fater i'r cwmni ei hun. Penderfynodd, yn dilyn cysylltu â llawer o bobl, mai dyna'r enw gorau ar gyfer yr hyn y mae'n ei gynhyrchu ac yn ei brosesu. Felly mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn i'r cwmni ei ateb.

Peter Rogers: One way to promote the brand has been the creation of the Best of Rural Wales website. It took £285,000 to set up. In its first year, it made sales worth £7,000. Are you confident that taxpayers' money is being spent effectively?

Carwyn Jones: It is important that we look to the future. One will not get a fantastic return in the first years of a website, but subsequently that investment will pay off. I can give you examples of other organisations in Wales that have set up websites and profited tremendously as a result. For example, Cegin Cymru—I spoke to some of its staff in the winter fair on Tuesday—and, if you speak to Bob Kennard, the gentleman behind Graig Farm Organics, he will tell you that since the website was set up it has been a roaring success. Inevitably, when one invests in something, one cannot expect immediate large returns, as I am sure that Alun will tell you, as someone who is involved in investments. That investment will be worth it over the course of the next few years, because, let us face it, more and more people will buy from internet websites. It is

werthwn. Nid yw dibynnu ar un neu ddwy o farchnadoedd yn beth da yn yr hirdymor. Rhaid inni hyrwyddo'r hyn a gynhyrchwn yn y farchnad gartref, yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill y DU. Mae rhai sefydliadau yn gwerthu cynnyrch o Gymru drwy'r rhyngwyd a thrwy archebu drwy'r post, ac ymddengys eu bod yn llwyddiannus. Fodd bynnag, petai siop y Cynulliad yn awyddus i werthu mwy o gynnyrch o Gymru, gallem roi'r rhai sy'n gyfrifol am y siop mewn cysylltiad â darpar gyflenwyr.

Elin Jones: Is the Welsh Meat Company's decision to choose the name Celtic Pride for its produce a missed opportunity in terms of promoting the Welsh brand, particularly if we were to be granted protected geographical indication status some day?

Carwyn Jones: That is a matter for the company itself. Its decision, after consulting with many people, was that that was the best name for what it produces and processes. That is therefore a question for the company to answer.

Peter Rogers: Un ffordd o hyrwyddo'r brand fu creu gwefan Gorau Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Cost ei sefydlu oedd £285,000. Yn ystod ei blwyddyn gyntaf, llwyddodd i sicrhau gwerthiant o £7,000. A ydych yn hyderus bod arian y trethdalwr yn cael ei wario'n effeithiol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych tua'r dyfodol. Ni ellir cael elw gwych yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar gwefan, ond bydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw'n dwyn elw yn y pen draw. Gallaf roi enghreifftiau ichi o sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru sydd wedi sefydlu gwefannau ac sydd wedi elwa'n aruthrol yn sgîl hynny. Er enghraifft, Cegin Cymru—siaradais â rhai aelodau o'i staff yn y Ffair Aeaf ddydd Mawrth—a, phe baech yn siarad â Bob Kennard, y gŵr a ddyfeisiodd Graig Farm Organics, byddai'n dweud wrthy ch bod y wefan wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol ers ei sefydlu. Yn anorfod, pan fo rhywun yn buddsoddi mewn rhywbeth, ni all ddisgwyl elw mawr yn syth, fel y gallai Alun ddweud wrthy ch, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â buddsoddiadau. Bydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw yn talu ar ei ganfed yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf, oherwydd, rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith,

important, therefore, that we have these structures in place to enable internet businesses to grow.

bydd mwy a mwy o bobl yn prynu o wefannau ar y rhynggrwyd. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sefydlu'r strwythurau hyn er mwyn galluogi busnesau'r rhynggrwydd i dyfu.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 3 (OAQ14570) wedi'i drosglwyddo ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig ac mae cwestiwn 4 (OAQ14484) wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3 (OAQ14570) has been transferred for written answer and question 4 (OAQ14484) has been withdrawn.

Glasbrint Newydd i Ffermio A New Blue-print for Farming

Q5 Nick Bourne: How will the new blue-print for farming protect farmers who have to produce to higher and more expensive animal welfare standards, against more cheaply and less well produced imports? (OAQ14550)

C5 Nick Bourne: Sut fydd y glasbrint newydd ar gyfer ffermio yn diogelu ffermwyr sy'n gorfod cynhyrchu gan gadw at safonau uwch a drutach o les anifeiliaid, yn erbyn mewnfurion rhatach sydd heb gael eu cynhyrchu gystal? (OAQ14550)

Carwyn Jones: I am always amazed by the conversion of the Conservative Party to protectionism, after espousing the principles of the free market for so long. It was certainly not the case in the 1980s. The words 'fair trade' were not used when it came to the coal and steel industry. People were told: 'you are too expensive, therefore, we will start importing instead of relying on British-made goods and British coal'. That was the Conservative Party's viewpoint then. A wonderful u-turn has occurred and it is hypocrisy on an Olympic scale.

Carwyn Jones: Caf fy synnu bob amser gan drawsnewidiad y Blaid Geidwadol tuag at ddiffyndollaeth, ar ôl arddel egwyddorion marchnad rydd ers cyhyd. Yn sicr nid dyna oedd yr achos yn yr 1980au. Ni ddefnyddiwyd y geiriau 'masnachu teg' wrth drin y diwydiannau glo a dur. Dywedwyd wrth bobl: 'yr ydych yn rhy ddrud, felly, byddwn yn dechrau mewnfurio yn hytrach na dibynnu ar nwyddau a wnaethpwyd ym Mhrydain a glo Prydain'. Dyna oedd barn y Blaid Geidwadol bryd hynny. Maent wedi newid eu barn yn llwyr ac mae'n rhagrith ar raddfa Olympaidd.

We cannot expect, and should not try, to compete with produce that is produced more cheaply. Price is a factor when people buy, but it is not the only factor. Most of the supermarkets say that a substantial proportion of people—between a third and two-thirds—buy based on factors other than price. Our biggest market is in exporting lamb to southern Europe, but we can be undercut every time by New Zealand and other countries. However, people buy our lamb, because they see a premium, quality product. That illustrates that we do not need to compete purely on commodity prices.

Ni allwn ddisgwyl, ac ni ddylem geisio, cystadlu â chynnyrch a gynhyrchir yn rhatach. Mae pris yn ffactor pan fo pobl yn prynu, ond nid dyna'r unig ffactor. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o archfarchnadoedd yn dweud bod cyfran sylweddol o bobl—rhwng traean a dwy ran o dair—yn prynu ar sail ffactorau heblaw pris. Ein marchnad fwyaf yw allforio cig oen i dde Ewrop, ond gall Seland Newydd a gwledydd eraill werthu'n rhatach na ni bob tro. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl yn prynu ein cig oen, am eu bod yn gweld cynnyrch o ansawdd uchel. Dengys hynny nad oes angen inni gystadlu ar brisiau nwyddau yn unig.

The Presiding Officer: Eleanor Burnham.

Y Llywydd: Eleanor Burnham.

Nick Bourne: What about my supplementary

Nick Bourne: Beth am fy nghwestiwn

question?

The Presiding Officer: The Minister's answer was so long that I thought he had answered your supplementary question.

Nick Bourne: It was indeed long and most of it was irrelevant. We are familiar with your application to be Minister for Coal or perhaps it is an application to be Prif Weinidog Cymru. I am not sure. However, your answer had little to do with the question that was asked.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Can the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives not emulate the Minister and ask a supplementary please?

Nick Bourne: I would not want to emulate the Minister. My question is not only about prices—and if you read it you will see—it is also about quality. We want Welsh produce to have a fair, level playing field. In particular, it is a question about importing from countries with lower hygiene standards than ours. Will you act against that or are you content with the current position?

Carwyn Jones: Once again I come back to the point that I made earlier. This is a sudden conversion. Why is it that in the year—
[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Answer the question'.] You can shout as much as you want, but the truth hurts.

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Carwyn Jones: This is a sudden conversion from the free market. Where on earth has the Conservative Party been over the last 20 years in terms of talking about fair trade and protection against cheap imports from countries that have lower standards? This is hypocrisy on a tremendous scale.
[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Answer the question'.]

You believe in the free market. You are the people who say that the free market works well and is something that should be worshipped. Why is it that suddenly you turn around and say that people who cannot afford

atodol?

Y Llywydd: Yr oedd cwestiwn y Gweinidog mor hir fel y tybiais iddo ateb eich cwestiwn atodol.

Nick Bourne: Yr oedd yn hir a'r rhan fwyaf ohono'n amherthnasol. Yr ydym yn gyfarwydd â'ch cais i fod yn Weinidog dros Lo neu hwyrach mai cais ydyw i fod yn Brif Weinidog Cymru. Nid wyf yn siŵr. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd a wnelo eich ateb fawr ddim â'r cwestiwn a ofynnais.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A wnaiff Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru beidio ag efelychu'r Gweinidog a gofyn cwestiwn atodol?

Nick Bourne: Ni fyddwn yn dymuno efelychu'r Gweinidog. Nid am brisiau yn unig y mae fy nghwestiwn—ac fe welech hynny pe baech yn ei ddarllen—mae hefyd yn ymwneud ag ansawdd. Yr ydym am i gynnyrch o Gymru allu cystadlu'n deg. Yn arbennig, mae'n fater o allforio o wledydd sydd â safonau hylendid is na'n rhai ni. A weithredwch yn erbyn hynny neu a ydych yn fodlon â'r sefyllfa bresennol?

Carwyn Jones: Unwaith eto, cyfeiriaf at fy mhwynt cynharach. Mae hyn yn newid barn cyflym. Pam, yn ystod y flwyddyn—
[AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'Atebwch y cwestiwn'.] Gallwch weiddi cymaint ag y mynnwch, ond mae'r gwirionedd yn brifo.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hyn yn newid barn o'r farchnad rydd. Ble ar y ddaear y bu'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf yn nhermau trafod masnachu teg a diogelu yn erbyn mewnforyn rhad o wledydd sydd â safonau is? Mae hynny'n rhagrith ar raddfa aruthrol.
[AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'Atebwch y cwestiwn'.]

Yr ydych yn credu yn y farchnad rydd. Chi yw'r bobl sy'n dweud bod y farchnad rydd yn gweithio'n dda a'i fod yn rhywbeth y dylid ei addoli. Pam eich bod wedi newid eich meddwl yn sydyn a dweud y dylid rhwystro

to buy anything other than the cheapest produce should be denied the ability to buy that produce? We need to promote Welsh food in terms of quality, in a market where people will pay more for it. That does not mean that we should force the poorest people in our society to be deprived of the ability to eat cheaper meat. That is the reality of the situation.

Eleanor Burnham *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: I am sorry, but there is no time for another supplementary question.

pobl na allant fforddio prynu unrhyw beth heblaw'r cynnyrch rhataf rhag prynu'r cynnyrch hwnnw? Mae angen inni hyrwyddo bwydydd o Gymru yn nhermau ansawdd, mewn marchnad lle bydd pobl yn talu mwy amdano. Nid yw hynny'n golygu y dylem orfodi'r bobl dlotaf yn ein cymdeithas i gael eu hamddifadu o'r gallu i fwyta cig rhatach. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa wirioneddol.

Eleanor Burnham *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Yn anffodus, nid oes amser i ofyn cwestiwn atodol arall.

Cymorthdaliadau Ffermio yr UE EU Farming Subsidies

Q6 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on the latest position with regard to EU farming subsidies? (OAQ14542)

Carwyn Jones: I regularly attend the meetings of the European Council of Ministers. The main item for discussion at the council meeting on 20 November was the EU sheep meat regime. Unfortunately, at that stage, there was no agreement on its future. However, there is widespread support for the European Commission's proposal for payments to be made on a flat rate headage basis with a less favoured area supplement. We hope that a final decision will be taken on 19 December.

9:45 a.m.

John Griffiths: Sheep farming is important to agriculture and the rural economy in Wales. Will you say something about the position you expect to exist regarding subsidies to sheep meat production in Wales next year?

Carwyn Jones: I hope that there will be agreement on 19 December on the level of 21 euros in terms of flat rate payments to farmers with a seven euro less favoured areas supplement. That will represent a substantial increase in support for sheep farmers in Wales and the rest of the European Union.

C6 John Griffiths: A all y Gweinidog wneud datganiad ar y sefyllfa bresennol o ran cymorthdaliadau ffermio yr UE? (OAQ14542)

Carwyn Jones: Mynychaf gyfarfodydd y Cyngor Gweinidogion Ewropeaidd yn rheolaidd. Y brif eitem i'w thrafod yng nghyfarfod y cyngor ar 20 Tachwedd oedd cyfundrefn cig defaid yr UE. Yn anffodus, bryd hynny, ni chafwyd unrhyw gytundeb ar ei dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae cefnogaeth eang tuag at gynnig y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i wneud taliadau ar sail cyfradd unffurf y pen gyda thâl atodol ardal llai ffafriol. Gobeithiwn y ceir penderfyniad terfynol ar 19 Rhagfyr.

John Griffiths: Mae ffermio defaid yn bwysig i amaethyddiaeth a'r economi wledig yng Nghymru. A ddywedwch rywbeth am y sefyllfa y disgwyliwch ei gweld o ran cymorthdaliadau ar gyfer cynhyrchu cig defaid yng Nghymru y flwyddyn nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Gobeithiaf y ceir cytundeb ar 19 Rhagfyr ar lefel o 21 ewro yn nhermau taliadau cyfradd unffurf i ffermwyr gyda thâl atodol o saith ewro mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol. Bydd hynny'n cynrychioli cynnydd sylweddol yn y cymorth i ffermwyr defaid yng Nghymru ac yng ngweddill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Peter Rogers: How do you think modulation will develop over the coming years and at what consequence to Welsh farmers? Will you give an assurance that modulation will always be match funded?

Carwyn Jones: I cannot give such an assurance because match funding is not a matter for the Assembly. I recognise that modulation is a particularly hot potato in farming politics and it will have to be discussed fully with farmers' representatives. There are no plans at this stage to increase modulation beyond what has already been agreed.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I listened to what you said, Carwyn, about the likely proposal of 21 euros in the 19 December meeting. We understood yesterday during a visit to Brussels that that proposal is equivalent to 22 euros. Are you satisfied that that would be a fair price for farmers in Wales, bearing in mind the collapse in their industry over the last three or four years, or should you push for a higher price on 19 December?

Carwyn Jones: You are right to point out that the proposal, as far as the commission is concerned, includes an extra 0.9 of a euro in terms of what is to be agreed. However, there is widespread support among the member states for the 21.9 euro deal with the seven euro supplement. The choice for member states on 19 December is to approve that or not to approve anything, in which case we will be stuck with the present sheep annual premium scheme system. That means that farmers in Wales and elsewhere in the EU would lose out. In an ideal world we would like to see more. We are not alone in that—other member states agree, but we must accept the political reality. Nevertheless, it represents a substantial increase in the premium paid to Welsh farmers, which is not far off a 100 per cent increase based on present exchange rates. That is good news.

Peter Rogers: Sut y credwch y bydd modylu yn datblygu dros y blynyddoedd nesaf a beth fydd y canlyniad i ffermwyr Cymru? A roddwch sicrwydd y caiff modylu arian cyfatebol bob amser?

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf roi sicrwydd o'r fath am nad mater i'r Cynulliad yw arian cyfatebol. Cydnabyddaf fod modylu'n daten boeth yng ngwleidyddiaeth ffermio a bydd yn rhaid ei drafod yn llawn â chynrychiolwyr ffermwyr. Nid oes unrhyw fwriad ar hyn o bryd i gynyddu modylu y tu hwnt i'r hyn y cytunwyd arno eisoes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gwrandewais ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch, Carwyn, ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd tebygol o 21 ewro yng nghyfarfod 19 Rhagfyr. Deallasom ddoe yn ystod ymweliad â Brwsel fod y cynnig gyfwerth â 22 ewro. A ydych yn fodlon y byddai hynny'n bris teg i ffermwyr yng Nghymru, o ystyried bod eu diwydiant wedi chwalu yn ystod y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf, neu a ddylem wthio am bris uwch ar 19 Rhagfyr?

Carwyn Jones: Yr oedd yn briodol ichi nodi fod y cynnig, o ran y comisiwn, yn cynnwys 0.9 ewro ychwanegol yn nhermau'r hyn y dylid cytuno arno. Fodd bynnag, ceir cymorth cyffredinol ymhlith yr aelod-wladwriaethau ar gyfer y cytundeb 21.9 ewro gyda'r tâl atodol o saith ewro. Y dewis i aelod-wladwriaethau ar 19 Rhagfyr yw cymeradwyo hynny neu beidio â chymeradwyo unrhyw beth, ac os digwydd hynny, bydd y system cynllun premiwm defaid blynyddol bresennol gennym o hyd. Mae hynny'n golygu y byddai ffermwyr yng Nghymru ac mewn rhannau eraill o'r UE ar eu colled. Mewn byd delfrydol hoffem weld mwy. Nid ydym yn unigryw yn hyn o beth—mae aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yn cytuno, ond rhaid inni dderbyn y realiti gwleidyddol. Er hynny, mae'n cynrychioli cynnydd sylweddol yn y premiwm a delir i ffermwyr Cymru, sy'n agos at gynnydd o 100 y cant yn seiliedig ar y cyfraddau cyfnewid presennol. Mae hynny'n newyddion da.

Tyfu Gwinwydd yng Nghymru Viticulture in Wales

Q7 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on viticulture in Wales? (OAQ14546)

Carwyn Jones: I know that you are developing this theme. Viticulture is a small industry in Wales. We have less than 40 acres of vines grown by 20 producers. Nevertheless, they employ 500 people. I know that the Welsh Development Agency's food directorate takes every opportunity to promote Welsh wine at its food and drink exhibitions and receptions in Wales and overseas.

David Melding: Thank you for that encouraging answer and for your remarks last week in your statement on diversification. Will you now commission the WDA to produce a feasibility study into the establishment of a Welsh wine co-operative?

Carwyn Jones: That is an interesting idea and I will take it forward.

C7 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dyfu gwinwydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ14546)

Carwyn Jones: Gwn eich bod yn datblygu'r thema hon. Mae tyfu gwinwydd yn ddiwydiant bach yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lai na 40 erw o winwydd a dyfir gan 20 o gynhyrchwyr. Er hynny, maent yn cyflogi 500 o bobl. Gwn fod cyfarwyddiaeth fwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn achub ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo gwin Cymru mewn arddangosfeydd bwyd a diod a derbyniadau yng Nghymru a thramor.

David Melding: Diolch ichi am yr ateb calonogol hwnnw ac am eich sylwadau yr wythnos diwethaf yn eich datganiad ar arallgyfeirio. A wnewch chi gomisiynu'r WDA yn awr i gynhyrchu astudiaeth ymarferoldeb ar sefydlu cwmni gwin cydweithredol i Gymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n syniad diddorol a gwnaf ymholiadau iddo.

Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd

Questions to the Minister for Assembly Business

Bandiau Amledd (Cyfathrebu Band Llydan) Frequency Bands (Broadband Communication)

Q1 Phil Williams: Will the Minister for Assembly Business indicate what frequency bands are being considered for the future use of wireless as a medium for broadband communication? (OAQ14477)

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): Before I answer, I pay tribute to you, Phil. I know that you have announced that you are standing down as an Assembly Member. I have always enjoyed exchanging views across the Chamber, and I pay tribute to your work in the Assembly. You will be sorely missed.

The availability of wireless spectrum for broadband communication has not been devolved to the National Assembly. It is a matter for the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, working with the Radio Communications Agency. However, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales'

C1 Phil Williams: A wnaiff y Trefnydd ddatgan pa fandiau amledd sy'n cael eu hystyried mewn perthynas â defnyddio radio fel cyfrwng cyfathrebu band llydan yn y dyfodol? (OAQ14477)

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cyn imi ateb, hoffwn dalu teyrnged ichi, Phil. Gwn eich bod wedi cyhoeddi eich bod yn ymddiswyddo fel Aelod y Cynulliad. Yr wyf bob amser wedi mwynhau cyfnewid sylwadau gyda chi ar draws y Siambr, a thalaf deyrnged i'ch gwaith yn y Cynulliad. Bydd colled fawr ar eich ôl.

Nid yw argaeledd sbectrum radio ar gyfer cyfathrebu band llydan yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mater i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant ydyw, sy'n gweithio gyda'r Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio. Fodd bynnag, mae 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better

acknowledges that radio spectrum will be an important feature in rolling out broadband services across Wales. At present, RADCOM has made available the broadband fixed wireless access spectrum at 28 gigahertz. It is also considering the future use of spectrum at 3.4 GHz and 40 GHz.

Phil Williams: Are you aware, Andrew, that wireless communication is only suitable as the main medium for broadband communication in flat countries with sparse populations such as Finland? At 3.4 GHz, frequency contention, where there is not enough bandwidth for all the users, is a problem, and at 28 and 40 GHz, absolute line of sight communication and rain are problems. Do you accept that in Wales, which unlike Finland is relatively hilly and is densely populated, wireless broadband can only provide a limited service as a short-term expedient? [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Answer that one.']

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Andrew Davies: I hope that I will not disappoint the Welsh Conservatives on this question. You are right about the frequency, Phil. The lower the frequency, the more limited the capacity for transmitting information. However, in the 'Cymru Ar-lein' strategy we have stated that broadband delivery is technology neutral. We have already pointed out—I know that Phil and I disagree on this point, we have had many exchanges on the issue—that rolling out fibre optic cables across Wales to every ideal location would be financially prohibitive. Wireless technology, and other forms of technology, will play a role in rolling out broadband. It is not the only solution but it is part of the solution. We will consider that in terms of a wider package of how we ensure that there is access to broadband throughout Wales.

William Graham: I understand less about this matter than the Minister, if that were possible. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I ask Members to get on and ask their

Wales' yn cydnabod y bydd y sbectrwm radio yn nodweddiadol bwysig wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau band llydan ledled Cymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae RADCOM wedi golygu mai 28 gigahertz yw'r mynediad i'r sbectrwm radio band llydan. Mae hefyd yn ystyried defnydd o'r sbectrwm yn y dyfodol ar 3.4 GHz a 40 GHz.

Phil Williams: A ydych yn ymwybodol, Andrew, mai dim ond mewn gwledydd gwastad gyda phoblogaethau gwasgareddig, fel y Ffindir, y mae cysylltiadau radio band llydan yn addas ar gyfer y brif amledd? Ar 3.4 GHz, mae cystadlu am amledd, lle nad oes digon o le ar y bandiau ar gyfer yr holl ddefnyddwyr, yn broblem, ac ar 28 a 40 GHz, mae cysylltiadau llinell welediad absoliwt a glaw yn broblemau. A dderbyniwch fod Cymru, yn wahanol i'r Ffindir, yn eithaf mynyddig â phoblogaeth uchel, ac mai dim ond gwasanaeth cyfyngedig am dymor byr y gall radio band llydan ei ddarparu? [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'Atebwch hynny.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Andrew Davies: Gobeithiaf na fyddaf yn siomi Ceidwadwyr Cymru ar y cwestiwn hwn. Mae'r hyn a ddywedasoich am yr amledd yn gywir Phil. Po isaf yw'r amledd, po fwyaf cyfyngedig fydd y gallu i drosglwyddo gwybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, yn y strategaeth 'Cymru Ar-lein' nodwyd fod y broses o ddarparu band llydan yn dechnoleg niwtral. Soniasom eisoes—gwn fod y pwynt hwn yn peri anghytundeb rhyngof fi a Phil, yr ydym wedi cael sawl trafodaeth ar y mater—y byddai cyflwyno ceblau ffibr optig ledled Cymru i bob lleoliad delfrydol yn gostus iawn. Bydd technoleg radio, a mathau eraill o dechnoleg, yn chwarae rhan yn y broses o gyflwyno band llydan. Nid dyma'r unig ateb ond mae'n rhan o'r ateb. Byddwn yn ystyried hynny yn nhermau pecyn ehangach sut i sicrhau y gall pobl ledled Cymru wrando ar fand llydan.

William Graham: Deallaf lai am y mater hwn na'r Gweinidog, os yw hynny'n bosibl. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau fynd yn eu blaen a holi eu cwestiynau atodol

supplementaries this morning.

y bore yma.

William Graham: What are you going to do to publicise these matters? At present, you seem to be esoteric and confined to mentioning a few issues. Will you ensure that the business knows what it will be getting?

William Graham: Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r materion hyn? Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydych yn ymddwyn yn gyfrinachol ac ond yn trafod rhai materion. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod y busnes yn gwybod beth fydd yn ei gael?

Andrew Davies: 'Cymru Ar-lein' aims to raise awareness of the potential and the opportunities available through electronic communication and trading. There will be a series of roadshows throughout Wales, which started from the launch of 'Cymru Ar-lein' a few weeks ago. The work that we are doing in the Assembly will be used by my ministerial colleagues to raise awareness of using the new technology. The programmes that we have initiated through Wales smE-Business, OpportunitE Wales, the Objective 1 programme, also raise awareness of the opportunities available through information and communications technology, for small and medium-sized enterprises in particular.

Andrew Davies: Bwriad 'Cymru Ar-lein' yw codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r potensial a'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael drwy gysylltiadau a masnachu electronig. Cynhelir cyfres o sioeau teithiol ledled Cymru, a ddechreuodd adeg lansio 'Cymru Ar-lein', ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau gweinidogol yn defnyddio'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud yn y Cynulliad i godi ymwybyddiaeth o ran defnyddio technoleg newydd. Mae'r rhaglenni a ysgogwyd gennym drwy smE-Business Cymru, CyflE Cymru, rhaglen Amcan 1 hefyd yn codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael drwy dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, ar gyfer mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yn arbennig.

Hyfforddiant ar gyfer y Diwydiant Clyweled Training for Audio Visual Industry Sectors

Q2 Alison Halford: What action has the Minister taken to provide suitable training for the audio visual industry sectors in Wales? (OAQ14481)

C2 Alison Halford: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i ddarparu hyfforddiant priodol ar gyfer y diwydiant clyweled yng Nghymru? (OAQ14481)

Andrew Davies: Training in Wales is a matter for my colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. However, the Assembly Government supports a range of programmes to help employers in the industry to train their staff. In addition to funding, through the Education and Learning Wales councils, higher and further education courses and apprenticeship programmes, we have funded the industry with £96,500 for various training projects over the last two years.

Andrew Davies: Mater i'm cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yw hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi amrywiaeth o raglenni i helpu cyflogwyr yn y diwydiant i hyfforddi eu staff. Yn ogystal ag ariannu, drwy gynghorau Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, cyrsiau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach a rhaglenni prentisiaeth, yr ydym wedi rhoi £96,500 i'r diwydiant ar gyfer prosiectau hyfforddi amrywiol dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf.

Alison Halford: Will you tell me how the plan to use the Wales Digital College for courses tailored for the audio visual industry is developing? What steps have you taken to ensure that the college's benefits are felt throughout Wales in terms of inward investment and increasing the skills base of

Alison Halford: A wnewch chi ddweud wrthyf sut mae'r cynllun i ddefnyddio Coleg Digidol Cymru ar gyfer cyrsiau sydd wedi'u teilwra ar gyfer y diwydiant clyweled yn datblygu? Pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych i sicrhau y caiff manteision y coleg eu lledaenu ledled Cymru yn nhermau mewnfuddsoddiad

the industry?

Andrew Davies: The Wales Digital College has an important role to play in extending access to skills across the lifelong learning sector throughout Wales. The college will work closely with organisations such as the University for Industry and ELWa. I would expect the digital college to contribute to our drive to up-skill the Welsh workforce through the best use of modern technology and to build on the Assembly Government's considerable recent investments in that area.

Helen Mary Jones: Wrth ystyried cyfraniad posibl y diwydiannau hyn i ddatblygu economaidd yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod hyfforddiant o'r fath ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

Andrew Davies: That is a priority for delivering training programmes for my ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson. A major priority of 'Cymru Ar-lein', our information technology strategy for Wales, is promoting the use of the Welsh language. Ensuring that material is available bilingually is one of our top five priorities.

9:55 a.m.

Linc Ffibr Optig i Ysgolion yng Nghymru Fibre Optic Link for Schools in Wales

C3 Gareth Jones: Pa gamau sydd yn cael eu cymryd i ddarparu linc ffibr optig ar gyfer pob ysgol yng Nghymru? (OAQ14469)

Andrew Davies: We are committed to extending high-speed internet access to schools throughout Wales. Last month, the Assembly Government announced new investment of £18.4 million to create a far-reaching, broadband, lifelong learning network for Wales. That will provide a high-speed internet backbone into all 22 local authorities in Wales. The type and speed of connections into local schools will, however, be determined locally in the light of local needs and priorities—whether fibre optic or wireless transmission.

a chynyddu sylfaen sgiliau'r diwydiant?

Andrew Davies: Mae gan Goleg Digidol Cymru rôl bwysig i'w chwarae o ran ehangu'r cyfle i feithrin sgiliau ar draws y sector dysgu gydol oes ledled Cymru gyfan. Bydd y coleg yn cydweithio'n agos â sefydliadau fel y Brifysgol Diwydiant ac ELWa. Disgwylwn i'r coleg digidol gyfrannu at ein hymgyrch i gynyddu sgiliau gweithlu Cymru drwy ddefnyddio technoleg fodern i'r eithaf ac i adeiladu ar fuddsoddiadau sylweddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar yn y maes hwnnw.

Helen Mary Jones: Bearing in mind the potential contribution of these industries to economic development in rural Wales, what steps is the Government taking to ensure that this type of training is available through the medium of Welsh?

Andrew Davies: Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth ar gyfer cyflwyno rhaglenni hyfforddiant i'm cyd-Aelod gweinidogol, Jane Davidson. Un o brif flaenoriaethau 'Cymru Ar-lein', ein strategaeth technoleg gwybodaeth ar gyfer Cymru, yw hyrwyddo'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg. Mae sicrhau bod deunydd ar gael yn ddwyieithog yn un o'n pum prif flaenoriaeth.

Q3 Gareth Jones: What measures are being taken to provide a fibre optic link for every school in Wales? (OAQ14469)

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i ehangu mynediad cyflym i'r rhynggrwyd i ysgolion ledled Cymru. Fis diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fuddsoddiad newydd o £18.4 miliwn i greu rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes, band llydan, pellgyrhaeddol ar gyfer Cymru. Bydd hynny'n darparu asgwrn cefn cyflymder uchel i'r rhynggrwyd i'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, gwneir penderfyniadau lleol ynglŷn â'r math o gysylltiadau a'u cyflymder i mewn i ysgolion lleol, yng ngoleuni anghenion a blaenoriaethau lleol—pa un a yw'n

dros glwyddiad ffibr optig neu'n dros glwyddiadau di-wifr.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi ei fod yn fater lleol, ond pryd y gwelwn gynllun gweithredu a fydd yn dangos maint y buddsoddiad ariannol, y math o dechnoleg cyswllt arfaethedig, ac amserlen cyflawni hyn i bob ysgol fel y gall ein hysgolion gynllunio'n strategol a pharatoi ar ei gyfer?

Gareth Jones: I appreciate that it is a local matter, but when will we see an implementation plan detailing the amount of financial investment, the type of communication technology proposed, and a timetable for implementation so that every school can plan strategically and make the necessary preparations?

Andrew Davies: My officials have cooperated closely with local authorities. They have held meetings collectively and individually with all 22 local authorities to consider an implementation plan for the roll-out of our lifelong learning network. Negotiations are still at an early stage. However, there has been an enthusiastic response from local authorities and schools to this major announcement. Once those negotiations and discussions have been taken forward, the action plan will be presented and I will be in a position to make that information available.

Andrew Davies: Mae fy swyddogion wedi cydweithio'n agos ag awdurdodau lleol. Maent wedi cynnal cyfarfodydd ar y cyd ac yn unigol gyda'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol i ystyried cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer cyflwyno ein rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes. Yr ydym yng nghyfnod cynnar y trafodaethau o hyd. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd ymateb brwdfrydig gan awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion i'r cyhoeddiad pwysig hwn. Ar ôl i'r negodiadau a'r trafodaethau hyn gael eu datblygu, cyflwynir y cynllun gweithredu a byddaf mewn sefyllfa i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth honno ar gael.

Mick Bates: Getting broadband to the schools is one thing, but it is important that the technical support is available to ensure that the equipment in the school is well maintained. What discussions have you had with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure that there is sufficient technical support in schools to maintain the hardware?

Mick Bates: Mae cyflwyno band llydan i'r ysgolion yn un peth, ond mae'n bwysig bod cymorth technegol ar gael i sicrhau bod yr offer yn yr ysgol yn cael ei gynnal a'i gadw'n dda. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau bod yna gymorth technegol digonol mewn ysgolion i gynnal a chadw'r caledwedd?

Andrew Davies: The package that the First Minister and I announced was not only about fast internet access to every school, but also about making sure that they have the equipment in the school to be able to use broadband. The aim is to have at least one electronic whiteboard in every school. Some, such as Whitchurch High School, already have this equipment and are extending it to most of their classrooms. If Members wish, I will arrange presentations and demonstrations in the Assembly on this technology.

Andrew Davies: Nid ymwneud yn unig â mynediad cyflym i'r rhyngwrdd i bob ysgol oedd y pecyn a gyhoeddwyd gennyf fi a'r Prif Weinidog ddoe, ond hefyd sicrhau bod ganddynt yr offer yn yr ysgol i allu defnyddio band llydan. Y nod yw cael o leiaf un bwrdd gwyn electronig ym mhob ysgol. Mae gan rai ysgolion, fel Ysgol Uwchradd yr Eglwys Newydd, yr offer hwn eisoes ac maent yn ei gyflwyno i'r rhan fwyaf o'u hystafelloedd dosbarth. Os hoffai'r Aelodau, trefnaf gyflwyniadau ac arddangosiadau o'r dechnoleg hon yn y Cynulliad.

Our proposal also announced that there will be ongoing support for teachers and support staff in using this technology. It is no use having the new technology if people do not

Cyhoeddodd ein cynnig hefyd y bydd cymorth parhaus i athrawon a staff cynnal o ran defnyddio'r dechnoleg hon. Nid oes unrhyw werth cael y dechnoleg newydd os

know its potential or how to use it.

Jonathan Morgan: Fibre optic technology is certainly not a cheap option, but it is the high-speed option. If we are serious about giving local authorities and schools the opportunity to maximise the benefits of that technology, are you convinced that £20 million will be sufficient? There are estimates that suggest that the costs of providing fibre optic technology to schools will far exceed £20 million.

Andrew Davies: As I said in answer to Phil Williams and William Graham earlier, this proposal is technology-neutral. Fibre optics may be the solution, wireless may be the solution or it may be the existing copper cable technology. It is a matter for the local authorities to negotiate, individually, or collectively through consortia, to implement this plan. Clearly, this is a first step—a major first step. It puts Wales ahead of other areas of the UK in terms of rolling out broadband and internet access to schools. It is only the first step. We are working with the Welsh Development Agency on the implementation of the analysis report on broadband in Wales. We hope to implement it, and to complement and build on the major step that we have already announced.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 (OAQ14478) has been transferred for written answer.

Technoleg Band Llydan (Busnesau Bach a Chanolig eu Maint) Broadband Technology (Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises)

Q5 Janice Gregory: What measures are being taken to assist small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales in accessing broadband technology? (OAQ14537)

Andrew Davies: A range of business support mechanisms is available to SMEs to raise their awareness of the benefits, and to help them access broadband technologies. They include projects ranging from Wales smE-Business, run on an all-Wales basis, OpportunitE Wales, the Objective 1 programme, operating within the Objective 1

nad yw pobl yn ymwybodol o'i photensial nac yn gallu ei defnyddio.

Jonathan Morgan: Nid yw technoleg ffibr optig yn opsiwn rhad, ond dyma yw'r opsiwn cyflym. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â rhoi'r cyfle i awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion fanteisio ar y dechnoleg honno i'r eithaf, a ydych yn sicr y bydd £20 miliwn yn ddigonol? Mae amcangyfrifon yn awgrymu y bydd y costau o ddarparu technoleg optig ffibr mewn ysgolion yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i £20 miliwn.

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Phil Williams a William Graham yn gynharach, mae'r cynnig hwn yn dechnolegol niwtral. Efallai mai optig ffibr fydd yr ateb, hwyrach efallai mai di-wifr fydd yr ateb neu'r dechnoleg ceblau copr sy'n bodoli eisoes. Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol ydyw i drafod, yn unigol, neu ar y cyd drwy gonsortia, er mwyn gweithredu'r cynllun hwn. Yn amlwg, y cam cyntaf yw hwn—cam cyntaf mawr. Mae'n rhoi Cymru o flaen ardaloedd eraill o'r DU yn nhermau cyflwyno band llydan a mynediad i'r rhyngwrwd mewn ysgolion. Dim ond y cam cyntaf yw. Yr ydym yn gweithio gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar weithredu'r adroddiad dadansoddol ar fand llydan yng Nghymru. Gobeithiwn ei weithredu, ac i ategu ac adeiladu ar y cam mawr a gyhoeddwyd gennym eisoes.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 4 (OAQ14478) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

C5 Janice Gregory: Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i helpu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru i fanteisio ar y dechnoleg band llydan? (OAQ14537)

Andrew Davies: Mae amrywiaeth o opsiynau cymorth busnes ar gael i fusneau bach a chanolig eu maint i godi eu hymwybyddiaeth o'r manteision, ac i'w helpu i gael mynediad i dechnolegau band llydan. Yn eu plith mae prosiectau sy'n amrywio o smE-Business Cymru, sy'n cael ei gynnal ar draws Cymru gyfan, Cyfle Cymru,

area, and the network of information and communications technology centres that are accessible through Business Connect. However, both 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales' and the Welsh Development Agency analysis report acknowledge that much more needs to be done on this matter. The issues are being considered as part of the report's action plan, by means of demonstration projects, and how assistance can be given to businesses to implement broadband solutions.

Janice Gregory: Are you aware of comments made by former Taoiseach John Bruton, that it was access to broadband that transformed and revitalised the Irish economy? Therefore, access to broadband for Welsh SMEs will be crucial to our Objective 1 programme, and I welcome your recent announcement of almost £19 million to help promote broadband throughout Wales. Do you agree that that investment is only possible due to the prudence of the Labour Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown, and the increased money that he has allocated to the Welsh block? [PLAID CYMRU MEMBERS: 'Oh'].

Andrew Davies: You will not be surprised to hear that I agree with you, nor will you be surprised at Plaid Cymru Members' jeering—they never acknowledge good news when they hear it.

The broadband lifelong learning initiative that we announced recently is a major first step to stimulate the roll-out and take-up of broadband services in Wales. In addition to the £18.4 million provided this year, there will be recurrent funding of £4 million to support the annual running costs of each local authority's points of presence. A sum of £10 million has also been identified to support the expansion of local authority networks. This is complementary to the significant investment in the national health service telecommunications and video infrastructure, which is already creating synergies with other infrastructures such as the Welsh Video Network.

y rhaglen Amcan 1 sy'n gweithredu o fewn ardal Amcan 1, a'r rhwydwaith o ganolfannau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu y gellir cael mynediad iddynt drwy Cyswllt Busnes. Fodd bynnag, mae 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales' ac adroddiad dadansoddol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ill dau yn cydnabod bod angen gwneud llawer mwy ar y mater hwn. Mae'r materion yn cael eu hystyried fel rhan o gynllun gweithredu'r adroddiad, drwy gyfrwng prosiectau arddangos, ar sut y gellir rhoi cymorth i fusnesau weithredu datrysiadau band llydan.

Janice Gregory: A ydych yn ymwybodol o sylwadau a wnaed gan y cyn Taoiseach John Bruton mai mynediad i fand llydan a drawsnewidiodd economi Iwerddon a'i hadfywio? Felly, bydd mynediad i fand llydan ar gyfer mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint Cymru yn holl bwysig i'n rhaglen Amcan 1, a chroesawaf eich cyhoeddiad diweddar o bron i £19 miliwn i helpu i hyrwyddo band llydan ledled Cymru. A gytunwch mai dim ond o ganlyniad i ddarbodusrwydd Canghellor y Trysorlys y Blaid Lafur, Gordon Brown, a'r arian ychwanegol a neilltuodd ar gyfer Cymru y mae hyn yn bosibl? [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU: 'O'].

Andrew Davies: Ni fyddwch yn synnu o'm clywed yn cytuno â chi, ac ni fyddwch yn synnu ychwaith o glywed Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn gwawdio—ni fyddant yn cydnabod newyddion da pan fônt yn ei glywed.

Mae'r fenter dysgu gydol oes band llydan a gyhoeddwyd gennym yn ddiweddar yn gam cyntaf mawr i'r broses o ysgogi cyflwyno a derbyn gwasanaethau band llydan yng Nghymru. Yn ychwanegol at y £18.4 miliwn a ddarparwyd eleni, cyflwynir nawdd rheolaidd o £4 miliwn i gefnogi costau rhedeg blynyddol pwyntiau presenoldeb pob awdurdod lleol. Nodwyd swm o £10 miliwn hefyd i gefnogi'r broses o ehangu rhwydweithiau awdurdodau lleol. Mae hyn yn ategol i'r buddsoddiad sylweddol a wnaethpwyd yn seilwaith telathrebu a fideo'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, sydd eisoes yn creu synergeddau â seilweithiau eraill fel Rhwydwaith Fideo Cymru.

Some more good news is that Wales now has probably the most extensive video-conferencing network in the UK.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A gytunwch mai ansawdd y gwasanaeth band llydan a gynigir i'r ardaloedd sy'n bwysig? O ran busnesau bach, pe cynigiem wasanaethau ffibr optig i ysgolion a bod cabinet â DSL yn gysylltiedig â'r ysgolion hynny, oni fyddai'n opsiwn estyn y gwasanaeth hwnnw i fusnesau bach yr ardal?

Andrew Davies: That is one of the options that we are considering, with the lifelong learning network that was announced last week by Rhodri Morgan and myself. By negotiating this innovative way of dealing with broadband, through Welsh Networking Limited, we hope that, with the WDA, we can provide surplus capacity in business parks such as Parc Menai near Bangor, which would help SMEs to access broadband technology. We are also working closely with the WDA and telecommunications companies to roll out the analysis report on broadband, particularly for the benefit of companies. We plan to make a major announcement early next year.

Newyddion arall da yw fod gan Gymru erbyn hyn y rhwydwaith fideo-gynadledda mwyaf helaeth yn y DU.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do you agree that it is the quality of the broadband service offered to areas that is important? Regarding small businesses, if fibre-optic services were offered to schools, and a cabinet with DSL was connected to those schools, would it not be an option to extend that service to small businesses in the area?

Andrew Davies: Dyna un o'r opsiynau yr ydym yn ei ystyried, ynghyd â'r rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan Rhodri Morgan a minnau. Drwy drafod y ffordd arloesol hon o ddelio â band llydan, drwy Welsh Networking Limited, y gobaith yw y gallwn, gyda'r WDA, ddarparu digon o gapasiti dros ben mewn parciau busnes megis Parc Menai ger Bangor, a fyddai'n helpu mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint i gael mynediad i dechnoleg band llydan. Yr ydym hefyd yn cydweithio'n agos gyda'r WDA a chwmnïau telathrebu i gyflwyno'r adroddiad dadansoddol ar fand llydan, yn arbennig er budd cwmnïau. Bwriadwn wneud cyhoeddiad pwysig ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Dysgu o Bell drwy gyfrwng Band Llydan (Ardaloedd Gwledig) Remote Learning via Broadband (Rural Areas)

C6 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud beth sydd wedi cael ei wneud i annog pobl yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru i ystyried dysgu o bell drwy gyfrwng band llydan? (OAQ14503)

Andrew Davies: Ensuring that people can take advantage of the benefits of ICT, wherever they live in Wales, is a key feature of 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales'. The opportunity to learn and acquire new skills without having to travel to a learning institute is one of the major benefits of widespread ICT in a rural setting. Programmes such as Llwybr/Pathway have actively promoted the use of ICT in rural areas, including opportunities for learning. Learning institutes and private sector providers are creating materials and services, most notably the BBC Wales digital

Q6 David Lloyd: Can the Minister comment on what has been done to encourage people in rural areas of Wales to consider remote learning via broadband? (OAQ14503)

Andrew Davies: Mae sicrhau y gall pobl fanteisio i'r eithaf ar TGCh, lle bynnag y bônt yn byw yng Nghymru, yn un o nodweddion allweddol 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales'. Y cyfle i ddysgu a meithrin sgiliau newydd heb orfod teithio i sefydliad dysgu yw un o brif fanteision TGCh mewn lleoliad gwledig. Mae rhaglenni megis Llwybr wedi hyrwyddo'r defnydd o TGCh yn weithredol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn cynnwys cyfleoedd ar gyfer dysgu. Mae sefydliadau dysgu a darparwyd sector preifat yn creu deunyddiau a gwasanaethau, cwricwlwm digidol BBC

curriculum. Through such initiatives and our broadband investments into schools, we expect people in communities to become much more aware of their capabilities.

Cymru yn arbennig. Drwy fentrau o'r fath a'n buddsoddiadau band llydan mewn ysgolion, disgwyliwn y bydd pobl mewn cymunedau yn dod yn llawer mwy ymwybodol o'u galluoedd.

10:05 a.m.

David Lloyd: Erbyn pa ddyddiad y mae'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld y bydd dros 90 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru—sef y safon yn Sweden—gan gynnwys yr ardaloedd gwledig, yn derbyn gwasanaeth band llydan cyflawn fel y gellir darparu dysgu o bell drwy gyfrwng cyswllt fideo?

David Lloyd: By what date does the Minister anticipate that over 90 per cent of Wales's population—which is the standard in Sweden—including the rural areas, will be in receipt of a complete broadband service so that distance learning can be provided using a video link?

Andrew Davies: We are not in a position to set a date for that, because the work also involves the telecommunications industry. Telecommunications suppliers in the private sector will provide most of the broadband network in Wales. We cannot give a firm date by which 90 per cent of Wales's population can access broadband services. However, as a result of the recently announced lifelong learning network and the roll-out of the Welsh Development Agency's analysis report on ubiquitous telecommunications infrastructure, we will be ahead of the rest of the UK in many ways. There are problems with broadband and telecommunications in a country like Wales, as it is largely rural and mountainous and the population is dispersed. As Phil Williams said earlier, our solutions to those problems must be technology-neutral and we may have to use wireless technology as well as fibre optic technology.

Andrew Davies: Nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i bennu dyddiad ar gyfer hynny, am fod y gwaith hefyd yn cynnwys y diwydiant telathrebu. Cyflenwyr telathrebu yn y sector preifat fydd yn darparu'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhwydwaith band llydan yng Nghymru. Ni allwn roi dyddiad pendant o ran pryd y gall 90 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru gael mynediad i wasanaethau band llydan. Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i'r rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar a chyflwyno adroddiad dadansoddol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar seilwaith telathrebu hollbresennol, byddwn ar y blaen i weddill y DU mewn sawl ffordd. Mae problemau yn gysylltiedig â band llydan a thelathrebu mewn gwlad fel Cymru, am ei bod yn wledig ac yn fynyddig ar y cyfan ac mae'r boblogaeth ar wasgar. Fel y dywedodd Phil Williams yn gynharach, rhaid i'n datrysiaidau i'r problemau hynny fod yn dechnolegol niwtral ac efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni ddefnyddio technoleg di-wifr yn ogystal â thechnoleg optig ffibr.

Unilever

Q7 Alison Halford: What discussions has the Minister had with Unilever over the high cost of connecting to its main internet node? (OAQ14482)

C7 Alison Halford: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Unilever am y gost uchel o gysylltu â'u prif nod rhyngrwyd? (OAQ14482)

Andrew Davies: As far as I am aware, the Assembly Government has had no direct discussions with Unilever on this matter, either in connection with its offices in London or the European arm of the Unilever Global Infrastructures Organisation in Ewloe. Regulating the cost of internet connections is a non-devolved matter, and is currently

Andrew Davies: Hyd y gwn i, nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau uniongyrchol gyda Unilever ar y mater hwn, naill ai mewn cysylltiad â'i swyddfeydd yn Llundain neu gydag adain Ewropeaidd Unilever Global Infrastructures Organisation yn Ewlo. Nid yw rheoleiddio cost cysylltiadau â'r rhyngrwyd

carried out by the Office of Telecommunications. As there has not been much contact with us on this issue, if Alison brings her concerns to the attention of my colleagues and myself, we will consider what representations the Assembly Government might make to the UK Government.

Alison Halford: I appreciate that this issue does not come under your direct authority. Do you wish to investigate this matter further, bearing in mind that there is apparent regional discrimination and also the high costs amounting to over £300,000 for Unilever to connect its node? Do you agree that such an ongoing situation will undoubtedly put off major inward investment from companies that use the internet, which are the companies that we need to encourage? Although it is not a devolved responsibility, do you have a view as to how we can regularise this?

Andrew Davies: Since you asked the question, officials have started to investigate the situation and how we can help the company and others with any problems. However, we must bear in mind that the large discrepancy between internet service costs in north Wales and London directly reflects differences in the level of competition. It is cheaper in London because there is intense competition. Because there is little competition in north Wales, the costs are higher. The Assembly Government is concerned that a situation may arise where these additional costs are seen as a barrier to companies considering moving to Wales. We will make representations on this to the UK Government and Oftel. However, because of the weakness of the private sector market in Wales, the public sector, with the Assembly taking the lead, must step into the breach to make up for the deficiency. As I said earlier, that is why our recent announcement of £18.4 million investment in the lifelong learning network in Wales is a major step to help to remedy the deficiency in the market.

yn fater a ddatganolwyd, ac mae'r Swyddfa Delathrebu yn gweithredu'r broses hon ar hyn o bryd. Am na chafwyd llawer o gyswllt gyda ni ar y mater hwn, os bydd Alison yn cyflwyno ei phryderon imi a'm cyd-Aelodau, byddwn yn ystyried pa gynrychioliadau y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu gwneud i Lywodraeth y DU.

Alison Halford: Gwerthfawrogaf nad yw'r mater hwn yn cael ei gynnwys o dan eich awdurdod uniongyrchol. A hoffech ymchwilio i'r mater hwn ymhellach, o gofio fod yna gamwahaniaethu rhanbarthol a chostau uchel o dros £300,000 er mwyn i Unilever gysylltu ei nod? A gytunwch y bydd sefyllfa barhaus o'r fath yn ddiau annog cwmnïau sy'n defnyddio'r rhyngwrwd i beidio â mewnfuddsoddi yn helaeth, sef y yw'r cwmnïau y mae angen inni eu hannog? Er nad yw'n gyfrifoldeb sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, a oes gennych farn ynglŷn â sut y gallwn reoleiddio hyn?

Andrew Davies: Gan ichi ofyn y cwestiwn, mae swyddogion wedi dechrau ymchwilio i'r sefyllfa a sut y gallwn helpu'r cwmni ac eraill gydag unrhyw broblemau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gadw mewn cof bod y gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng costau gwasanaethau'r rhyngwrwd yn y gogledd a Llundain yn adlewyrchu'n uniongyrchol y gwahaniaethau yn lefel y cystadlu. Mae'n rhatach yn Llundain am fod cystadleuaeth ddwys. Am nad oes fawr o gystadleuaeth yn y gogledd, mae'r costau yn uwch. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bryderus y gallai sefyllfa ddatblygu lle caiff y costau ychwanegol hyn eu hystyried fel rhwystr i gwmnïau sy'n ystyried symud i Gymru. Gwnawn gynrychioliadau ar hyn i Lywodraeth y DU ac i Oftel. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd gwendid marchnad y sector preifat yng Nghymru, rhaid i'r sector cyhoeddus, gyda'r Cynulliad yn arwain, gymryd yr awennau er mwyn unioni'r diffyg. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, dyna pam fod ein cyhoeddiad diweddar o fuddsoddi o £18.4 miliwn yn rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes Cymru yn gam mawr tuag at helpu i unioni'r diffyg yn y farchnad.

Datganiad ar 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' **Statement on 'Farming for the Future'**

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I am pleased to have this opportunity to make a statement on the Assembly Government's long-term strategy for farming in Wales. The strategy, which, as Members know, is entitled 'Farming for the Future: A New Direction for Farming in Wales', was published on 21 November and copies are available in the Library. It has also been posted on the National Assembly website.

I am proud to say that this is a distinctly Welsh strategy. It is 100 per cent made in Wales. It represents for the first time in Wales the publication of an embracing philosophy for farming, setting out a vision for the industry to achieve future sustainability and supported by a framework of actions that the Assembly Government, working with key partners across Wales, intends to deliver.

Farming's problems have been well-documented, and I will not rehearse them here. However, the excellent news this week that the whole of Wales is now a foot and mouth disease-free zone, coupled with the Scientific Veterinary Committee's decision to allow exports to resume, means that we can face the new year with a great deal of optimism.

Members will recall that we had a full debate in Plenary on 23 January about the principles that should underpin this strategy, which received majority support. One of the key points emerging from the debate was the need to consider alternative indicators, other than gross domestic product, to measure the overall contribution of the farming effort to the Welsh economy. I can confirm that the strategy has taken account of these points.

The work represents the culmination of a year's efforts by the Farming Futures advisory group, which I set up in October

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Pleser i mi yw cael y cyfle hwn i roi datganiad ar strategaeth hirdymor Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru. 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol: Cyfeiriad Newydd i Ffermio yng Nghymru', fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau yw enw'r strategaeth, ac fe'i cyhoeddwyd ar 21 Tachwedd ac mae copïau i'w cael yn y Llyfrgell. Mae hefyd wedi cael ei gosod ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud bod hon yn strategaeth benodol Gymreig. Cafodd ei chreu gant y cant yng Nghymru. Cynrychiola am y tro cyntaf yng Nghymru gyhoeddiad athroniaeth gynwysadwy ar gyfer ffermio, gan osod gweledigaeth i'r diwydiant i gyrraedd cynaliadwyedd yn y dyfodol, ac wedi ei chefnogi gan fframwaith o bwyntiau gweithredu y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn gweithio ar y cyd gyda phartneriaid allweddol ar draws Cymru, yn bwriadu eu cyflwyno.

Dogfennwyd problemau ffermio'n drylwyr, ac ni wnaif eu hailadrodd yma. Fodd bynnag, mae'r newyddion da yr wythnos hon bod Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd yn awr yn ardal rydd o glyw'r traed a'r genau, wedi ei gyplysu â phenderfyniad Pwyllgor Gwyddonol y Milfeddygon i ganiatáu ailddechrau allforio, yn golygu y gallwn wynebu'r flwyddyn newydd gyda chryn obaith.

Bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio inni gael dadl lawn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Ionawr ynglŷn â'r egwyddorion a ddylai gynnal y strategaeth hon, ac a gafodd gefnogaeth y mwyafrif. Un o'r pwyntiau allweddol a gododd o'r ddadl oedd yr angen i ystyried dangosyddion amgen, heblaw'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, i fesur cyfraniad cyfan ymdrech ffermio i economi Cymru. Gallaf gadarnhau bod y strategaeth wedi rhoi ystyriaeth i'r pwyntiau hyn.

Cynrychiola'r gwaith ffrwyth ymdrechion blwyddyn gan y grŵp ymgynghorol Dyfodol Ffermio, a sefydlwyd gennyf ym mis Hydref

2000 to work with me in developing a vision and a long-term direction for farming in Wales. The group included a wide cross-section of interests, and the fact that we have achieved a consensus on the way forward is a huge achievement. I place on record my gratitude to each member of the group for rising to the challenge and contributing so positively.

The draft strategy document was the subject of extensive consultation during the summer including a wide range of interests and comments, which were invited via the internet. The outcome of this consultation showed substantial support for the vision. We received many detailed and thoughtful comments, which we have taken on board and incorporated into the strategy.

We also set out in 'Farming for the Future' our vision for agriculture, where Welsh producers will compete on quality rather than price, in an integrated Welsh agri-food industry with farmers and food processors working together to develop and deliver food products for which consumers will pay premium prices. Built into this is the consideration that environmental and food safety matters should become crucial parts of animal and land management. My commitment is that the Assembly will work towards creating conditions that will help the industry to adapt and raise incomes, which is, after all, the bottom line. That will include securing the correct trading and subsidy framework, and providing advice through organisations such as the Farming Connect network.

In essence, my message is quite simple and should come as no surprise to anyone who has listened to me talk on this matter. Welsh agriculture must adapt if it is to have a viable future. The strategy sets out honestly that if Welsh farming tries to compete on price alone as a producer of raw materials, the future for the Welsh family farm, for rural communities and for the things we value about Welsh rural life, is grim. Instead, the strategy sets out a vision based on sustainability—economically, environmentally and socially.

2000 i weithio gyda mi i ddatblygu gweledigaeth a chyfeiriad hirdymor ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru. Yr oedd croestoriad eang o fuddiannau yn y grŵp, ac mae'r ffaith inni ddod i gonsensws ar y ffordd ymlaen yn gamp enfawr. Cofnodaf fy niolchgarwch i bob aelod o'r grŵp am ymateb i'r her a chyfrannu mor gadarnhaol.

Bu'r ddogfen strategaeth ddrafft yn destun ymgynghoriad helaeth yn ystod yr haf yn cynnwys ystod eang o ddiddordebau a sylwadau, a wahoddwyd drwy'r rhyngwyd. Dangosodd canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwn gefnogaeth sylweddol i'r weledigaeth. Cawsom lawer o sylwadau meddylgar a manwl, a dderbyniwyd gennym a'u hymgorffori yn y strategaeth.

Yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol', amlinellwyd hefyd ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth, lle y bydd cynhyrchwyr Cymru yn cystadlu ar sail ansawdd nid pris, mewn diwydiant bwyd-amaeth integredig Cymreig, gyda ffermwyr a phroseswyr bwyd yn cydweithio i ddatblygu a darparu cynnyrch bwydydd y bydd defnyddwyr yn talu prisiau premiwm amdano. Mae'r ystyriaeth y dylai materion amgylcheddol a diogelwch bwyd ddod yn rhannau hanfodol o reolaeth anifeiliaid a thir wedi ei gyfuno yn hyn. Fy ymrwymiad i yw y bydd y Cynulliad yn gweithio i greu'r amodau a fydd yn helpu'r diwydiant i addasu a chodi incwm, a hynny yw'r peth pwysicaf yn y diwedd. Bydd hyn yn cynnwys sicrhau y fframwaith fasnachu a chymhorthdal cywir, a darparu cyngor trwy sefydliadau megis y rhwydwaith Cyswllt Ffermio.

Yn ei hanfod, neges syml sydd gennyf ac ni ddylai beri syndod i unrhyw un sydd wedi gwrandao arnaf yn siarad ar y pwnc. Rhaid i amaethyddiaeth Cymru addasu os yw i gael dyfodol hyfyw. Dengys y strategaeth gyda gonestrwydd fod y dyfodol i'r fferm deuluol Gymreig, i gymunedau gwledig, ac i'r hyn a werthfawrogwn ynglŷn â bywyd cefn gwlad Cymru yn un enbyd, os y gwna ffermio Cymru geisio cystadlu ar sail pris yn unig fel cynhyrchydd deunydd crai. Yn lle hynny dengys y strategaeth weledigaeth sy'n seiliedig ar ar gynaliadwyedd—yn economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol.

In terms of economic sustainability, the challenge for the industry in Wales is to develop markets where the industry can get a better return, based on quality production, branding, and adding value through processing. That does not mean that it is all about 'niche markets', but the strategy makes it clear that there are many ways for farmers to create viable incomes. For example, selling in the top quality ranges offered by supermarkets; developing innovative, high value processed products; developing our export markets and targeting the top end of the expanding catering sector.

What all these have in common is the need for producers to target customers who are prepared to pay a good price for a quality product, and to ensure that they produce precisely what is wanted. In some cases, for example, in terms of local selling, an individual farmer can do this on his or her own. However, in most cases, farmers will need to collaborate, either with other farmers or with processors as well, or with others in the agricultural sector. I do not apologise for saying that collaboration is essential if Welsh agriculture is to adapt and survive.

Environmental sustainability fits with this vision. Enhancing the countryside and its wildlife is not just important in its own right; it is crucial to the development of tourism in Wales, from which farming families can benefit substantially. The foot and mouth disease crisis has shown how interdependent farming and tourism are. In future, farmers need to see walkers as people who bring money into the local economy.

A strong, positive environmental image will also help to sell Welsh food. I want Wales to develop a first-class reputation for its cuisine, to the benefit of our tourism and farming industries. Therefore, the vision hangs together. The strategy does not try to pretend that any of this is easy. The pressure on farming is intense. The more and the quicker the industry can move in this direction, the more family farms will be able to generate a better income and be able to survive. That will help to maintain the

O ran cynaliadwyedd economaidd, yr her i'r diwydiant yng Nghymru yw datblygu marchnadoedd lle gall y diwydiant gael gwell enillion, yn seiliedig ar gynhyrchu o safon, brandio, ac ychwanegu gwerth drwy brosesu. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ei fod yn ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl â 'marchnadoedd niche', ond gwna'r strategaeth hi'n glir fod llawer o ffyrdd i ffermwyr greu sawl incwm ymarferol. Er enghraifft, gwerthu yn yr ystodau ansawdd uchel a gynigir gan archfarchnadoedd; datblygu cynnyrch wedi'i brosesu o werth uchel; datblygu ein marchnadoedd allforion a thargedu pen uchaf y sector arlwyo sy'n tyfu.

Yr hyn sydd yn gyffredin i'r rhain i gyd yw'r angen i gynhyrchwyr dargedu cwsmeriaid sy'n barod i dalu pris da am gynnyrch o safon, ac i sicrhau eu bod yn cynhyrchu yn union beth sydd ei angen. Mewn rhai achosion, er enghraifft, o ran gwerthu'n lleol, gall ffermwr lleol wneud hyn yn unigol. Fodd bynnag, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, bydd angen i ffermwyr gydweithio naill ai gyda ffermwyr eraill neu gyda phroseswyr yn ogystal, neu gydag eraill yn y sector amaethyddol. Nid ymddiheuraf dros ddweud bod cydweithio'n hanfodol os yw amaethyddiaeth Cymru i addasu a goroesi.

Cydwedda cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol gyda'r weledigaeth hon. Nid yw gwella cefn gwlad a'i fywyd gwyllt yn bwysig ynddo'i hun yn unig; mae'n dyngedfennol i ddatblygiad twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Dangosodd clwy'r traed a'r genau pa mor ryngddibynnol yw ffermio a thwristiaeth. Yn y dyfodol, bydd rhaid i ffermwyr edrych ar gerddwyr fel pobl sy'n dod ag arian i mewn i'r economi leol.

Bydd delwedd amgylcheddol gref gadarnhaol hefyd yn helpu i werthu bwyd Cymreig. Yr wyf am i Gymru ddatblygu enw da o'r radd flaenaf am ei bwydydd, er lles ein diwydiannau twristiaeth a ffermio. Felly, mae'r weledigaeth yn un. Nid yw'r strategaeth yn ffugio bod unrhyw ran o hyn yn hawdd. Mae'r pwysau ar ffermio yn eithafol. Cyntaf a chyflymaf i gyd y gall y diwydiant symud i'r cyfeiriad hwn, mwyaf i gyd fydd ffermydd teuluol yn gallu creu gwell incwm ac yn gallu goroesi. Bydd

character of the Welsh countryside and our culture, which is why tourists visit. Economic, environmental and social sustainability all point in the same direction. The vision is coherent and sees the way forward for farming in the broader context, in terms of the countryside as a whole.

10:15 a.m.

I will emphasise two more points. First, on young entrants, the next generation of farmers represents the future of farming, and I was particularly impressed with what I saw at this week's winter fair in Llanellwedd. I saw many examples of the flair and enterprise of young farmers who had set up small, on and off farm businesses. Rural young people need to be given the right opportunities. The strategy acknowledges the important role that young farmers will have in helping to rebuild Welsh agriculture and it includes many measures to encourage and support young people to realise their potential in the industry. I have already demonstrated my commitment in this area by announcing substantial additional funding for young farmers clubs in Wales. Secondly, the strategy makes it clear that there is a continuing role for farming as part of a broad-based rural economy. It is important that farming families are seen to be the life-blood of the rural economy.

This is a broad-based strategy that includes many cross-cutting issues. Publication of the strategy is just the beginning, and we will now need to press ahead to implement all the actions. Over 50 actions are identified in the document, which the Assembly Government and others will take forward to help the industry to adapt. Progress will be monitored against quantifiable indicators set out in the strategy. I will provide regular updates to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and the Farming Futures group that will meet annually to take stock of the situation.

For the first time, farmers have a document that will tell them which direction the

hynny'n helpu i gynnal cymeriad cefn gwlad Cymru a'n diwylliant, sef y rheswm pam bod ymwelwyr yn dod yma. Mae cynaliadwyedd economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol oll yn pwyntio i'r un cyfeiriad. Mae'r weledigaeth yn rhesymegol ac mae'n gweld y ffordd ymlaen i ffermio yn y cyd-destun ehangach, o ran cefn gwlad yn ei gyfanrwydd.

Pwysleisiaf ddau bwynt pellach. Yn gyntaf, ar bobl ifanc sy'n dechrau ffermio, cynrychiola'r genhedlaeth nesaf o ffermwyr ddyfodol ffermio, a chafodd yr hyn a welais yn y ffair aeaf yr wythnos hon yn Llanellwedd argraff arbennig arnaf. Gwelais sawl enghraifft o fentergarwch a gwreiddioldeb ffermwyr ifanc a sefydlodd fusnesau bychain ar, ac oddi ar y fferm. Mae angen i bobl ifanc gwledig gael y cyfleoedd cywir. Cydnabu'r strategaeth y rôl bwysig fydd gan ffermwyr ifanc yn y gwaith o ailadeiladu amaethyddiaeth Cymru, ac mae'n cynnwys sawl mesur i hybu a chefnogi pobl ifanc i wireddu'u potensial yn y diwydiant. Dangosais yn barod fy ymrwymiad yn y maes hwn trwy gyhoeddi arian ychwanegol sylweddol i glybiau ffermwyr ifanc yng Nghymru. Yn ail, gwna'r strategaeth hi'n glir bod rôl barhaol i ffermio fel rhan o economi wledig eang ei sail. Mae'n bwysig bod teuluoedd ffermio yn cael eu gweld fel cynheiliaid yr economi wledig.

Mae hon yn strategaeth eang sy'n cynnwys llawer o bynciau trawsbleidiol. Dechrau yn unig yw cyhoeddi'r strategaeth a bydd yn rhaid i ni nawr fwrw ymlaen i roi'r holl weithrediadau ar waith. Dynodwyd dros 50 o weithrediadau yn y ddogfen, y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac eraill yn eu gweithredu i helpu'r diwydiant i addasu. Bydd y cynnydd yn cael ei fonitro yn erbyn dangosyddion mesuradwy a welir yn y strategaeth. Byddaf yn rhoi diweddariadau cyson i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a'r grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio a fydd yn cwrdd yn flynyddol i asesu'r sefyllfa.

Am y tro cyntaf, mae gan ffermwyr ddogfen a fydd yn rhoi gwybod iddynt pa gyfeiriad y

Assembly Government intends to follow, what they should expect of the Assembly, and what people should expect of them. That is now clear, and people know where they stand. We had to do that from the outset because, people said that they wanted to see a vision for the future of farming. However, turning that vision into reality is an enormous challenge from which we should not shy away.

Success or failure depends on the industry's response. The Assembly can nurture and prepare the ground but it cannot make the seed grow. I urge the industry to rise to the challenge and work with us to create a bright future for Welsh agriculture.

Elin Jones: Mae 52 o bwyntiau gweithredu yn y ddogfen hon. Mae'n debyg mai 52 yw hoff rif y Cabinet: mae 52 o gyrff yn rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru; mae 52 o argymhellion ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth—efallai y dylem fod yn ddiolchgar mai tair swydd yn unig sydd gan y Prif Weinidog ac nid 52.

Mae tua 90 y cant o'r pwyntiau gweithredu eisoes ar waith. Er enghraifft, pwynt gweithredu 40—cyflwyno system apeliadau annibynnol newydd i ffermwyr erbyn 31 Hydref 2001. Nid yw hwnnw'n swnio fel pwynt gweithredu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Tybiaf nad oes mwy na tua 10 y cant o'r pwyntiau ar waith ar hyn o bryd ac y mae'r rheini'n gysylltiedig â chyfuniad o ymgynghori pellach, o sefydlu gweithgorau a dwyn pwysau ar gyrff gwahanol i wneud yr hyn a'r llall. Mae'r ddogfen yn glir ac yn ddarllenadwy, ond mae'r teitl ychydig yn gamarweiniol. Mae'n darllen mwy fel 'ffermio i'r presennol' a byddai hynny'n well adlewyrchiad o gynnwys y ddogfen na'r teitl presennol.

Nid yw'r ddogfen yn cynnig cynlluniau nac arian newydd. Felly, mae gennyf dri chwestiwn i'r Gweinidog. Cyn clwy'r traed a'r genau, fel y mae'r ddogfen yn datgan, incwm cyfartaledd net ffermwyr Cymru oedd £4,100. Sut y bydd cynnwys y ddogfen yn gwella'r sefyllfa druenus honno a chynyddu incwm ffermwyr Cymru? Nid oes llawer o gyfeiriadau yn y ddogfen at yr

bwriada Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei ddilyn, beth y dylent ei ddisgwyl gan y Cynulliad, a beth ddylai pobl ei ddisgwyl ganddynt hwy. Mae hynny'n glir yn awr ac mae pobl yn gwybod lle maent yn sefyll. Bu'n rhaid inni wneud hynny o'r dechrau oherwydd bod pobl yn dweud eu bod am weld gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol ffermio. Fodd bynnag, mae troi'r weledigaeth honno'n realiti yn her enfawr na ddylem ei hofni.

Dibynna llwyddiant neu fethiant ar ymateb y diwydiant. Gall y Cynulliad feithrin a pharatoi'r tir ond ni all beri i'r had dyfu. Anogaf y diwydiant i dderbyn yr her a gweithio gyda ni i greu dyfodol disglair i amaethyddiaeth Cymru.

Elin Jones: There are 52 action points in this document. Fifty-two seems to be the Cabinet's favourite number: there are 52 bodies running the health service in Wales; 52 recommendations for agriculture—perhaps we should be thankful that the First Minister only has three jobs and not 52.

Around 90 per cent of the action points are already being implemented. For example, action point 40—to introduce a new independent appeals system for farmers by 31 October 2001. That does not sound like an action point for the future. As far as I can see only around 10 per cent of the points are not currently being implemented and those relate to a combination of further consultation, the establishment of working parties and putting pressure on various organisations to do this, that and the other. The document is lucid and readable, but the title is slightly misleading. It reads more like 'farming at present' and that would better reflect the document's content than the current title.

The document does not offer any new schemes or money. Therefore, I have three questions for the Minister. Before foot and mouth disease, as this document states, the average net income of Welsh farmers was £4,100. How will the document improve that appalling situation and increase the income of Welsh farmers? There are few references to the need to increase slaughter, processing and

angen i ychwanegu capasiti lladd, prosesu a rendro yng Nghymru. Mae'r capasiti hwnnw'n druenus ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n hollbwysig o ran gwireddu rhai o amcanion y ddogfen. Paham y mae cyn lleied o bwyslais ar y sectorau pwysig hyn?

Siom mwyaf y ddogfen yw'r cyfle a gollwyd o ran cynnwys cynllun mynediad i ffermwyr ifanc. Mae cefnogaeth fy mhlaid at gynllun o'r fath yn ddigon hysbys.

A yw'r ffaith nad oes cynllun mynediad llawn i ffermwyr ifanc yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn golygu eich bod, ynghyd â'ch partneriaid yn y Llywodraeth, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn bendant yn erbyn cyflwyno cynllun o'r fath, a fyddai'n wir hwb i ddyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, mae'r ddogfen hon yn ceisio adeiladu sylfaen ar gyfer y dyfodol. Nid oes neb yn dweud y gellir datrys problemau ffermio dros nos, nac y bydd prisiau'n codi'n sylweddol dros nos. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym ddyfodol da a chadarn. Golyga hynny fod yn rhaid inni gael rhyw fath o weledigaeth er mwyn gwybod i ba gyfeiriad yr ydym yn anelu, ac er mwyn i bobl wybod lle maent yn sefyll. Yr un peth yr oedd pobl yn ei ofyn imi yn Sioe Frenhinol Amaethyddol Cymru y llynedd oedd, beth yw cyfeiriad a gweledigaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru? Ar y pryd—ac mae hyn wedi digwydd dros nifer o flynyddoedd—nid oedd dogfen fel hon ar gael. Mae pobl wedi croesawu'r ddogfen hon yn fawr, gan eu bod yn gwybod lle maent yn sefyll yn awr. Mae'n iawn dweud bod rhai pethau yn y ddogfen wedi cael eu gwneud yn barod, ond mae pobl eisiau darllen beth sydd wedi digwydd mewn dogfen o'r fath. Mae ffermwyr wedi croesawu cynnwys y ddogfen. Dywedaf hyn eto: yr oedd yr undebau amaethyddol yn rhan o grŵp y dyfodol, ac maent wedi cefnogi nod y ddogfen hon. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y rhai a oedd ar y grŵp yn cynrychioli cwsmeriaid, diddordebau amgylcheddol, ac yn y blaen. Mae gan y ddogfen hon, felly, gefnogaeth eang er mwyn adeiladu ar gyfer y dyfodol.

rendering capacity in Wales. That capacity is currently appalling, but it is all-important in terms of realising some of the document's objectives. Why is there so little emphasis on these important sectors?

The most disappointing thing about this document is the omission of a young farmers' entrants scheme. My party's support for such a scheme is well-documented.

Does the omission of a comprehensive young farmers' entrants scheme from 'Farming for the Future' indicate that you, along with your partners in Government, the Liberal Democrats, oppose introducing such a scheme, which would be a real boost to the future of farming in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: First, this document tries to lay a foundation for the future. No-one is saying that the problems facing farming can be solved overnight, or that prices will rise considerably overnight. We must ensure that we have a good and solid future. That means that we must have some sort of vision so that we know in which direction we are aiming, and so that people know where they stand. The one question that people were asking me during last year's Royal Welsh Agricultural Show was, what is the Assembly's direction and vision for farming in Wales? At the time—and this has happened over several years—a document such as this did not exist. People have warmly welcomed this document, because they now know where they stand. It is right to say that some things in the document have already been accomplished, but people want to read documents such as this to find out what has happened. Farmers have welcomed the content of the document. I will say this again: the farming unions were part of the futures group, and they have supported this document's objective. The same is true of the members of the group representing customers, environmental interests, and so on. This document, therefore, has wide-ranging support in building for the future.

Ar brosesu, yr wyf wedi dweud sawl gwaith, yma a thu allan i'r Cynulliad, ein bod eisiau hybu prosesu yng Nghymru. Mae'r sector prosesu llaeth yn weddol gryf yng Nghymru, ond mae gennym broblem ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â phrosesu cig coch, er enghraifft, ac mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu ar hynny. Mae grantiau ar gael i helpu pobl gyda phrosesu, ac yr ydym eisiau hybu a chefnogi pobl sydd yn cyflwyno syniadau synhwyrol.

Ar gynllun mynediad i ffermwyr ifanc, mae pobl yn gwybod beth yw gwendidau'r cynllun y mae Plaid Cymru wedi sôn amdano sawl gwaith. Nid oes digon o arian ynddo. Rhaid cofio mai pris fferm ar gyfartaledd yng Nghymru yw tua £400,000. Nid yw £15,000 yn mynd i wneud unrhyw fath o wahaniaeth i ffermwyr ifanc—symboleiddiaeth ydyw. Mae'n rhaid inni, wrth gwrs, helpu ffermwyr ifanc, ond rhaid dod o hyd i ffordd effeithiol o wneud hynny. Nid yw rhoi swm bach o arian iddynt yn mynd i helpu. Dywedaf hyn eto: yr oedd y grŵp hwn yn grŵp eang, ac nid oedd eisiau pwyso'n ormodol am gynllun mynediad traddodiadol i ffermwyr ifanc.

Mick Bates: Thank you, Minister, for a realistic statement on the future of farming. This fits well with the Assembly's theme of sustainable development. It is a great step forward to have so much collaboration among all parts of the industry.

I have four questions. First, you mentioned the export situation. Can you clarify what the situation is in Wales? We are aware that problems exist between different areas, and there is already a price differential because of the export situation. I am pleased that we will have further data to see how 'Farming Futures' is progressing, but it is a little light on the detail. How will this data be collected and by whom? I am pleased that the Welsh Liberal Democrat policy of Farming Connect has gained such prominence in delivering this. However, we should hear how many farmers have received assistance under Farming Connect.

On processing, I have said several times, here and outside the Assembly, that we want to promote processing in Wales. The dairy processing sector is quite strong in Wales, but we have a problem at the moment with processing red meat, for example, and we must build on that. Grants are available to assist with development in processing, and we want to help and support people who come forward with sensible ideas.

On a young farmers' entrants scheme, the weaknesses of the scheme that Plaid Cymru has talked about several times are well-known. There is not enough money in it. We must remember that the average price of a farm in Wales is around £400,000. Some £15,000 will not make a blind bit of difference to young farmers—it is tokenism. We must, of course, help young farmers, but we must find an effective way of doing so. Giving them a small sum of money will not help. I say this again: this group was a broad group, and it did not want to press too hard for a traditional young farmers' entrants scheme.

Mick Bates: Diolchaf i chi, Weinidog, am ddatganiad realistig ar ddyfodol ffermio. Mae hyn yn cydweddu'n dda gyda thema'r Cynulliad ar ddatblygiad cynaliadwy. Mae'n gam mawr ymlaen i gael cymaint o gydweithrediad rhwng holl rannau'r diwydiant.

Mae gennyf bedwar cwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, soniasoch am y sefyllfa allforio. A allwch egluro beth yw'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru? Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod problemau'n bodoli rhwng y gwahanol feysydd, a bod pris gwahaniaethol yn bod yn barod oherwydd y sefyllfa allforio. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd gennym ddata pellach i weld sut mae 'Dyfodol Ffermio' yn datblygu, ond y mae ychydig yn denau o ran manylion. Sut y caiff y data hwn ei gasglu a chan bwy? Yr wyf yn falch fod polisi y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar Cyswllt Ffermio wedi cael y fath amlygrwydd wrth gyflwyno hyn. Fodd bynnag, dylem gael clywed faint o ffermwyr a dderbyniodd gymorth drwy Cyswllt Ffermio.

On food processing, Objective 1 in west Wales gives a high grant toward processing, yet in east Wales we cannot get the same level of funding for the infrastructure that we need. How will you address that problem in the future so that east Wales has parity with west Wales? Finally, on a young farmers' entrants scheme, we all agree that we have taken a step to give them an extra 10 per cent through Farming Connect. However, restructuring the quota system is also an important feature. How do you propose to ensure that young people who want to enter the industry can gain quota, because at present they are a low priority?

10:25 a.m.

Carwyn Jones: On exports, the recommendation was made by the SVC last Tuesday and we expect a final decision to be made by 14 December. As soon as we receive that decision we will implement legislation as soon as possible so that all parts of Wales are able to export.

Work on the method of data collection is ongoing and will be presented to the Farming Futures group and to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee so that it can be monitored fully.

I turn to processing grants and Objective 1. Processing grants are available to everybody throughout Wales. Inevitably, in areas where there is Objective 1 funding, more money will be available. That is a truism. As regards the processing and marketing grants that we are responsible for administering, there will be full access to east Wales.

In terms of young farmers and the quota system, you will recall, Mick, that consultation was due to take place, before the foot and mouth disease outbreak, on the establishment of national reserves particularly for sheep quota for England, Scotland and Wales separately. At the moment there is a lowland reserve for Great Britain and an upland reserve for Wales. The consultation was put on hold because of foot and mouth disease. We are now encouraging DEFRA to restart the consultation so that the matter can be resolved. Once we have a

Ar brosesu bwyd, mae Amcan 1 yn y Gorllewin yn rhoi grant uchel tuag at brosesu, eto yn y Dwyrain ni allwn gael yr un lefel o ariannu ar gyfer yr isadeiledd sydd ei angen arnom. Sut fyddwch chi'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno yn y dyfodol fel bod y Dwyrain yn gydradd â'r Gorllewin? Yn olaf, ar gynllun mynediad ffermwyr ifanc, cytunwn i gyd ein bod wedi cymryd cam i roi 10 y cant yn ychwanegol iddynt drwy Cyswllt Ffermio. Fodd bynnag, mae ailstrwythuro'r system gwota hefyd yn nodwedd bwysig. Sut y bwriadwch sicrhau bod pobl ifanc sydd yn dymuno dod i mewn i'r diwydiant yn gallu cael cwota, oherwydd ar hyn o bryd maent yn flaenoriaeth isel?

Carwyn Jones: O ran allforion, gwnaed yr argymhellion ddydd Mawrth diwethaf gan yr SVC a disgwyliwn i benderfyniad terfynol gael ei wneud erbyn 14 Rhagfyr. Cyn gynted ag y derbyniwn y penderfyniad hwnnw byddwn yn gweithredu deddfwriaeth fel bod Cymru ben baladr yn gallu allforio.

Mae'r gwaith ar ddull casglu'r data yn parhau a bydd yn cael ei gyflwyno i'r grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio ac i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig fel y gall gael ei fonitro'n llawn.

Trof at grantiau prosesu ac Amcan 1. Mae grantiau prosesu ar gael i bawb ar draws Cymru. Mae'n anorfod y bydd rhagor o arian ar gael yn yr ardaloedd Amcan 1. Mae hynny'n wir. O ran y grantiau prosesu a marchnata yr ydym ni'n gyfrifol am eu gweinyddu, byddant ar gael yn llwyr i'r Dwyrain.

O ran ffermwyr ifanc a'r system gwotâu, byddwch yn cofio, Mick, fod ymgynghori i fod i ddigwydd cyn argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, ar sefydlu cronfeydd cenedlaethol yn arbennig ar gyfer cwotâu defaid ar gyfer Lloegr, yr Alban a Chymru ar wahân. Ar hyn o bryd mae cronfa iseldir ar gyfer Prydain Fawr a chronfa ucheldir ar gyfer Cymru. Rhoddwyd yr ymgynghoriad o'r neilltu am y tro oherwydd clwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr ydym yn awr yn annog DEFRA i ailgychwyn yr ymgynghoriad fel y gellir datrys y mater. Unwaith y bydd gennym gronfa

national reserve, it will be easier for us to start changing the categories where reserve is allocated so that young farmers become category 1, and not category 3B, as at present. We want to do that.

Finally, I welcome any Liberal Democrat policy into a document produced by a Labour Minister.

Peter Rogers: The ghost of farming past, as the Minister calls me, welcomes the—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Peter Rogers: First, I will clarify Mick's contribution. The statement talks about the 'decision to allow exports to resume'. That means that they should start today. You must face the fact—and I thought that I explained this comprehensively to you in Committee yesterday—that the veterinary commissions agreed to this in principle, and that we must wait for the college to issue the Order. In Anglesey—and I do not want this to happen in Brecon and Radnorshire—is that the Order was passed on 22 November and, last week, lambs were bought for export at £2.40 a kilo as against the home market of £2 a kilo. However, they could not be moved until the recommendation came through from the college. I congratulated the administration on completing the Order. Although it was meant to be issued last Friday, it was not signed until 7.30 p.m. on Monday. However, it was not published on the intranet, so abattoirs and trading standards in certain areas were not aware of it. Lambs were taken to abattoirs but had to be included in the home kill. Farmers were losing £8 a lamb and, on 100 lambs, lost £800. Will you make it clear that we are waiting for the college's recommendations and that you will implement them immediately? It is costing people in rural areas a lot of money and people have been phoning to find out what the situation is.

Much of this strategy is welcome. However, you should bear in mind that setting out a direction is one thing, providing a lead is

genedlaethol, bydd yn haws inni i ddechrau newid y categorïau lle dosrennir cronfa fel bod ffermwyr ifanc yn dod yn gategori 1, ac nid yn gategori 3B, fel sy'n digwydd yn awr. Yr ydym yn awyddus i wneud hynny.

I gloi, croesawaf unrhyw bolisi o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i mewn i ddogfen a gynhyrchir gan Weinidog Llafur.

Peter Rogers: Mae ysbryd ffermio'r gorffennol, fel y bydd y Gweinidog yn fy ngalw, yn croesawu'r—*[Torri ar draws]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Peter Rogers: Yn gyntaf, egluraf gyfraniad Mick. Sonia'r datganiad am 'benderfyniad i ganiatáu ail ddechrau allforio'. Golyga hyn y dylent ddechrau heddiw. Rhaid i chi wynebu'r ffaith—ac yr oeddwn wedi meddwl fy mod wedi esbonio hyn yn llwyr i chi yn y Pwyllgor ddoe—bod y comisiynau milfeddygol wedi cytuno ar hyn mewn egwyddor, a bod yn rhaid i ni ddisgwyl i'r coleg gyhoeddi'r Gorchymyn. Ar Ynys Môn—ac nid wyf am i hyn ddigwydd ym Mrycheiniog a Maesyfed—pasiwyd y Gorchymyn ar 22 Tachwedd a'r wythnos diwethaf prynwyd ŵyn ar gyfer eu hallforio am £2.40 y kilo o gymharu â £2 y kilo i'r farchnad gartref. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd hawl i'w symud hyd nes y doi'r argymhelliad drwodd o'r coleg. Llongyferchais y weinyddiaeth ar gwblhau'r Gorchymyn. Er ei bod yn fwriad i'w gyflwyno ddydd Gwener diwethaf, ni chafodd ei arwyddo tan 7.30p.m. ddydd Llun. Fodd bynnag, ni chafodd ei gyhoeddi ar y fewnrwyd, felly nid oedd lladd-dai a safonau masnach mewn rhai ardaloedd yn ymwybodol ohono. Aethpwyd ag ŵyn i ladd-dai ond bu'n rhaid eu cynnwys yn y lladdiad cartref. Collai ffermwyr £8 yr oen, ac ar gant o ŵyn, collasant £800. A wnewch hi'n glir ein bod yn disgwyl am argymhellion y coleg ac y gwnewch eu gweithredu ar unwaith? Mae'n costio llawer o arian i bobl yn yr ardaloedd gwledig ac mae pobl wedi bod yn ffonio i gael gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa.

Mae llawer o'r strategaeth hon i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, dylech gofio bod amlinellu cyfeiriad yn un peth, ond bod rhoi

another. Do you agree that although you have started to support young entrants into the industry, you have said much less about formal agricultural training to provide a rich skills base from which to draw. Do you recognise the importance of getting young people into farming, particularly tenant farming, so that they have training on the farm in order to gain the necessary formal qualifications? I have praised the Isle of Anglesey County Council on its smallholding schemes, which includes young starter schemes and the sustainable farming unit. It will be impossible for young people to enter farming with formal qualifications unless there are agricultural colleges to provide the necessary training. Otherwise, your proposals will only provide opportunities for farmers' sons. That will mean that people like me will never be able to get into this industry in the future. My other question—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Peter Rogers is the lead Conservative spokesperson on agriculture. He has had a short preamble and a series of concise questions will follow.

Peter Rogers: The document does not place enough emphasis on the role of Tir Gofal. Will you ensure that the scheme becomes accessible to any land manager in Wales who wants to participate in it? Is it not the case that if we did that, attitudes towards modulation might change? That is important in securing the necessary levels of funding for what this document sets out. Is it not also the case that as things currently stand, you have not made the necessary financial commitments to achieve the economic and environmental benefits that are needed? Why have you neglected to say anything meaningful about pressing the UK Government to act on illegal imports of meat that continue to undermine the industry? Why are we not pressing for controls at Welsh ports to prevent foot and mouth disease returning to this country? Why are we not demanding a full public inquiry into the foot and mouth disease crisis that resulted in costs in excess of £12 billion? That bungling incompetence cannot be repeated. This document—

arweiniad yn beth arall. A gytunwch er ichi ddechrau cefnogi pobl ifanc sy'n mynd i mewn i'r diwydiant, dywedoch lawer llai am hyfforddiant amaethyddol ffurfiol i ddarparu sylfaen sgiliau cyfoethog y gellir tynnu ohoni. A gydnabyddwch bwysigrwydd cael pobl ifanc i mewn i ffermio, yn enwedig i ffermio tenantiaeth, fel eu bod yn gallu cael hyfforddiant ar y fferm er mwyn ennill y cymwysterau ffurfiol angenrheidiol? Canmolais Gyngor Sir Ynys Môn ar ei gynlluniau daliadau bychain, sy'n cynnwys cynlluniau dechreuwr ifanc a'r uned ffermio cynaliadwy. Bydd yn amhosibl i bobl ifanc ddechrau ffermio gyda chymwysterau ffurfiol oni bai bod colegau amaethyddol i ddarparu'r hyfforddiant angenrheidiol. Fel arall, bydd eich cynigion yn darparu ar gyfer meibion ffermydd yn unig. Golyga hynny na fydd pobl tebyg i mi fyth yn gallu mynd i mewn i'r diwydiant hwn yn y dyfodol. Fy nghwestiwn arall—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Peter Rogers yw prif lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr ar amaethyddiaeth. Mae wedi cael rhagymadroddi'n fyr a bydd cyfres o gwestiynau cryno'n dilyn.

Peter Rogers: Ni rydd y ddogfen ddigon o bwyslais ar rôl Tir Gofal. A wnewch sicrhau bod y cynllun yn dod yn hygyrch i unrhyw reolwr tir yng Nghymru sydd am gyfranogi ynddo? Oni fyddai ein hagwedd tuag at fodylu efallai'n newid pe baem yn gwneud hynny? Mae hynny'n bwysig o safbwynt sicrhau'r lefelau angenrheidiol o arian ar gyfer yr hyn y mae'r ddogfen hon yn ei amlinellu. Onid yw'n wir hefyd, fel y mae pethau'n sefyll yn awr, ni roesoch yr ymrwymadau ariannol angenrheidiol i ennill y buddion economaidd ac amgylcheddol sydd eu hangen? Pam i chi fethu dweud dim ystyrlon am roi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i weithredu ar allforio cig anghyfreithlon sy'n parhau i danseilio'r diwydiant? Pam nad ydym yn pwysu am reoliadau ym mhorthladdoedd Cymru i atal clwy'r traed a'r genau rhag dychwelyd i'r wlad hon? Pam nad ydym yn mynnu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau a arweiniodd at gost o dros £12 biliwn? Ni ellir ailadrodd y bwnglera anniben hwnnw. Mae'r ddogfen hon—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I kindly suggested that you might be a little more succinct in your questions. My problem is deciding when a statement becomes a debate and when a question becomes a speech.

Peter Rogers: I thought I was asking a question.

The Presiding Officer: You have had some time on this already.

Peter Rogers: I will be brief. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am aware of the importance of this issue and I do not want to curtail discussion. I will therefore extend the statement beyond half an hour, but that does not mean that I will extend the opportunity for Members to make speeches.

Peter Rogers: Do you agree that there is a danger of focusing too much attention on headline figures? While inputs are one thing, outputs are clearly another. Do you agree that the most important factor is to get money out of what we are investing in? Will you say more about how you intend to ensure that the clearly defined targets are regularly monitored?

Carwyn Jones: You asked a number of questions. First, Peter, the icy blast and the rattling of chains was felt at the front of the Assembly when you repeated something that I once said to you. On exports, to clarify what I said earlier, when we receive the final confirmation of the decision, we will seek the legislation as quickly as possible. There were difficulties in Anglesey—which you raised yesterday—and an explanation was given. We will seek to avoid those difficulties when we get the final go-ahead from Europe. On agricultural training, we must provide sufficient facilities. The point about tenant farms was well made and Ynys Môn should be congratulated on what it has done. Some local authorities are perhaps tempted to sell the farms, and their holdings are excellent first rungs on the ladder for people who want to progress into farming. However, buying a farm is not an option for many people when they enter the industry. I

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Awgrymais yn garedig y gallasech efallai fod yn fwy cryno yn eich holi. Fy mhroblem i yw penderfynu pryd mae datganiad yn troi'n ddadl a chwestiwn yn troi'n araith.

Peter Rogers: Tybiais mae gofyn cwestiwn wnes i.

Y Llywydd: Cawsoch gryn amser ar hyn yn barod.

Peter Rogers: Byddaf yn gryno. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd y pwnc ac nid wyf am gwtogi ar y drafodaeth. Felly gwnaf ymestyn y datganiad yn hwy na hanner awr, ond ni olyga hynny fy mod yn mynd i roi cyfle i Aelodau roi areithiau.

Peter Rogers: A gytunwch fod perygl mewn canolbwyntio'n ormodol ar y prif ffigurau? Tra bod mewnbynnau yn un peth, mae allbynnau yn amlwg yn rhywbeth arall. A gytunwch mai'r ffactor pwysicaf yw cael arian o'r hyn a fuddsoddwn ynddo? A wnewch ddweud rhagor am y modd y bwriadwch sicrhau bod y targedau a ddiffiniwyd yn glir yn cael eu monitro'n gyson?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi gofyn sawl cwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, Peter, clywyd brath rewlyd a chlindarddach cadwyni ymhen blaen y Cynulliad wrth i chi ailadrodd rhywbeth a ddywedais wrthyhych unwaith. Ar allforion, er mwyn egluro beth a ddywedais yn gynharach, pan gawn gadarnhad terfynol o'r penderfyniad, byddwn yn ceisio deddfwriaeth mor fuan â phosibl. Cafwyd trafferthion ar Ynys Môn—a godwyd gennyhych ddoe—a rhoddwyd eglurhad. Byddwn yn ceisio osgoi'r anawsterau hynny pan dderbyniwn yr hawl terfynol i fwrw ymlaen gan Ewrop. Ar hyfforddiant amaethyddol, rhaid i ni ddarparu cyfleusterau digonol. Gwnaethoch y pwynt am ffermydd rhent yn dda a dylid llongyfarch Ynys Môn ar yr hyn a gyflawnodd. Temtir rhai awdurdodau lleol efallai i werthu eu ffermydd, ac mae eu daliadau yn risiau cyntaf ardderchog ar yr ysgol i bobl sydd am ddechrau ar yrfa mewn

join you in urging local authorities not to sell their tenant farms and to preserve them for the future so that farmers have an opportunity to start off.

On Tir Gofal, you will be aware that increased funding was proposed via the partnership agreement—£13.9 million this year and £16.9 million in the following year. Extra money is going into Tir Gofal, but it is an excellent and successful scheme. The point about modulation is fair. The difficulty with modulation is that there is a perception at present that modulation means that money is taken out of the hands of a large group of farmers and given to a small group of farmers. That must change. It is our task to persuade people that the money that is used as a result of modulation can be used to the benefit of a much larger group of people and that it is not an elitist scheme. We are working hard to do that. You know that there has been a stocktake of Tir Gofal, and there will also be a review to see if there are ways in which it can be made more accessible to more people, as it ultimately must be.

10:35 a.m.

On illegal imports, we have raised this with the UK Government, which will in turn raise the issue at a foot and mouth disease conference on 14 December in Brussels. One of the items that the UK will raise there is what can be done to further minimise the risk of foot and mouth disease coming in to the European Union. Therefore the matter, far from being dead, is being actively considered.

The subject of the public inquiry has been debated long and hard, and the decision taken by the Westminster Government—which I support—is that it is better to have an inquiry with quick results, rather than a long drawn-out inquiry which could take several years.

On monitoring, I refer you to the point I made to Mick Bates, that this document will be monitored by the Agriculture and Rural

ffermio. Fodd bynnag, nid yw prynu fferm yn ddewis i lawer o bobl pan ânt i mewn i'r diwydiant. Ymunaf â chi i annog awdurdodau lleol i beidio â gwerthu eu ffermydd rhent ac i'w cadw er mwyn y dyfodol fel bod ffermwyr yn cael cyfle i ddechrau.

Ar Dir Gofal, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod arian ychwanegol wedi ei fwriadu drwy gytundeb partneriaeth—£13.9 miliwn eleni a £16.9 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ddilynol. Mae arian ychwanegol yn mynd at Dir Gofal, ond mae'n gynllun ardderchog a llwyddiannus. Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn a modylu yn deg. Y drafferth ynglŷn â modylu yw bod canfyddiad ar hyn o bryd fod modylu yn golygu bod arian yn cael ei gymryd o ddwylo grŵp mawr o ffermwyr a'i roi i grŵp llai o ffermwyr. Rhaid i hynny newid. Ein tasg yw perswadio pobl y gellir defnyddio'r arian sy'n ganlyniad modylu er budd grŵp o bobl llawer mwy ac nad yw'n gynllun elitaidd. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n ddyfal i wneud hynny. Gwyddoch fod cymryd stoc wedi digwydd ar Dir Gofal ac y bydd adolygiad hefyd i weld a oes ffyrdd i'w wneud yn fwy hygyrch i fwy o bobl, fel y mae'n rhaid iddo fod yn y pen draw.

Ar allforion anghyfreithlon, codwyd hyn gennym gyda Llywodraeth y DU, a fydd yn ei thro yn codi'r pwnc mewn cynhadledd clwy'r traed a'r genau ar 14 Rhagfyr ym Mrwsel. Un o'r eitemau y bydd y DU yn ei chodi yno fydd gofyn beth y gellir ei wneud i leihau ymhellach y perygl i glwy'r traed a'r genau ddod i mewn i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Felly mae'r mater, sydd ymhell o fod yn farw, yn cael ei ystyried yn weithredol.

Trafodwyd pwnc yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn hir ac yn drwyadl, a'r penderfyniad a wnaed gan Lywodraeth San Steffan—yr wyf finnau'n ei gefnogi—yw ei bod yn well cael ymchwiliad sy'n arwain at ganlyniadau cyflym, yn hytrach nag ymchwiliad maith a allai gymryd blynyddoedd lawer.

Ar fonitro, fe'ch cyfeiriaf at bwynt a wnes i Mick Bates, sef y monitritr y ddogfen hon gan y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Materion

Affairs Committee and the Farming Futures group. Gwledig a grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio.

John Griffiths: In the modern world, image is all-important. Do you agree that we should seek to present an image of rural Wales showing it as progressive, forward-looking, innovative, adapting, changing and modernising? It would be an important marketing advantage, for example, in the quality food production area, to be viewed as a green and pleasant land, valuing the environment and nature. In that context, do you agree that there is no place in Wales for the regressive and outdated immorality and barbarity of recreational fox hunting?

Carwyn Jones: Recreational fox hunting in Wales is a matter that must be determined by the UK Government. I look forward to the review that the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee will conduct at some point on this. I am struck by the fact that one of the major arguments put for and against hunting is that it has an effect on the countryside. Those who are in favour of hunting say that it controls foxes, those against it say that it has no relevance to the control of foxes. Considering that we have had no hunting now for some months, this would have been the ideal time to collect data, and settle the argument one way or another. I hope that someone has done that—let us wait and see.

Promoting Wales as a country of high standards is something that we could benefit from. To give one example from the export market, we now have lambs going to Spain, particularly Majorca, that are branded as Welsh lamb, as it has an excellent image abroad.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawaf y weledigaeth hon; credaf ei bod yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw mai strategaeth arall yw hon. Beth mae'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth hon yn bwriadu ei wneud i sicrhau bod y strategaeth hon yn weithredol? Cawsom strategaeth ar ffermio organig ond pan aeth y prisiau i lawr ni wnaeth y Gweinidog unrhyw beth i rwystro

John Griffiths: Yn y byd modern, mae delwedd yn holl bwysig. A gytunwch y dylem ymdrechu i gyflwyno delwedd o Gymru wledig flaengar, yn edrych i'r dyfodol, yn ddyfeisgar, yn barod i addasu, yn newid ac yn moderneiddio? Byddai'n fantais farchnata bwysig, er enghraifft, ym maes cynhyrchu bwydydd o ansawdd, ei bod yn cael ei gweld fel tir gwyrdd a theg, sy'n gwerthfawrogi'r amgylchedd a natur. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a gytunwch nad oes lle yng Nghymru i'r anfoesoldeb a'r barbareiddiwch hen ffasiwn o hela'r llwynog fel difyrrwch?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hela'r llwynog fel difyrrwch yng Nghymru yn fater sydd yn rhaid ei benderfynu gan Lywodraeth y DU. Edrychaf ymlaen at yr adolygiad y bydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn mynd i'w gynnal ar hyn ar ryw adeg. Fe'm trewir gan y ffaith mai un o'r prif ddadleuon a roddir dros ac yn erbyn hela yw ei fod yn effeithio ar gefn gwlad. Mae'r rhai sydd o blaid hela yn dweud ei fod yn rheoli llwynogod, ac mae'r rhai sydd yn erbyn yn dweud nad yw'n berthnasol o gwbl yn y gwaith o reoli llwynogod. O ystyried na chawsom unrhyw hela bellach ers rhai misoedd, byddai yr adeg yma yn gyfnod delfrydol i gasglu data, a setlo'r ddadl un ffordd neu'r llall. Rwy'n gobeithio bod rhywun wedi gwneud hynny—gadewch i ni aros i weld.

Byddai hyrwyddo Cymru fel gwlad o safonau uchel yn rhywbeth y gallem elwa ohono. I roi un enghraifft o'r farchnad allforio, mae'n hŵyn sydd nawr yn mynd i Sbaen, yn enwedig Majorca, wedi eu brandio fel oen Cymru gan fod ganddo ddelwedd ardderchog dramor.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I welcome this vision; I believe it to be important. However, it is in reality another strategy. What does the Minister and this Government intend to do to ensure that this strategy is implemented? We had a strategy on organic farming but when the prices fell the Minister did nothing to prevent that. We had a strategy on agri-environment schemes, but most farmers

hynny. Cawsom strategaeth ar gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, ond ni all y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr ymuno â chynllun Tir Gofal. Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei wneud i sicrhau bod y weledigaeth hon yn dod yn weithredol?

Carwyn Jones: Ni all unrhyw lywodraeth ddylanwadu ar y pris oherwydd nad y Llywodraeth sydd yn gosod y pris. Mae'r prisiau yn codi a chwmpo gan fod pobl yn gwerthu mewn marchnad. Yn hanesyddol, yn y sector organig, mae'r prisiau wedi codi, ac wedi aros ar y lefel honno am gyfnod, wedyn maent wedi cwmpo tipyn bach, ac wedyn maent wedi codi tipyn bach eto. Dyna sut mae'r sector organig yn gweithio, felly yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid i ni adeiladu sylfaen. Nid wyf yn dweud y bydd y ddogfen hon yn datrys pob problem ffermio dros nos, ond mae'n rhaid i ni yn gyntaf ddweud wrth bobl am yr hyn y bwriadwn ei wneud. Yn y dyfodol, bydd yn bosibl i ni gael, er enghraifft, ryw fath o strategaeth organig, ond yr oedd yn rhaid i ni edrych yn ôl i ddarganfod sylfaen i ffermio ar gyfer y dyfodol yng Nghymru, oherwydd yn hanesyddol, nid oedd hynny wedi'i ystyried.

Glyn Davies: I welcome your statement, and the obvious co-operation and partnership that has gone into your being able to deliver it today.

The worst aspect of the foot and mouth disease crisis is what I believe to have been a deliberate attempt by the Westminster Government to discredit farmers who have been compensated as a result of having foot and mouth disease on their farms. That has greatly increased the lack of understanding between rural and urban Britain. To your credit, Minister, you have not been involved in that campaign. However, how will this document help us undertake the hugely important task of developing an understanding between those who participate in farming and other land-based activities in Wales, and those who live in urban Wales?

Carwyn Jones: I accept that there is much to be done to build trust. I do not see any evidence of an attempt to discredit farmers as regards what happened during the foot

cannot join the Tir Gofal scheme. What is the Minister intending to do to ensure that this vision becomes a reality?

Carwyn Jones: No government can influence prices as it is not the Government that sets the price. Prices rise and fall because people sell in a market. Historically, in the organic sector, prices have risen, stayed at that level for a time, then fallen slightly, and then risen slightly again. That is how the organic sector works, and therefore we must build a foundation first. I am not saying that this document will solve every problem in farming overnight, but we must first tell people what we intend to do. In future, it will be possible for us to have, for example, some sort of organic strategy, but we needed to look back to find a foundation for farming for the future in Wales, because historically, this had not been considered.

Glyn Davies: Croesawaf eich datganiad, a'r cydweithrediad a'r bartneriaeth amlwg sydd wedi eich galluogi i'w gyflwyno heddiw.

Y wedd waethaf ar argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yw'r hyn gredaf a fu'n ymgais fwrriadol gan Lywodraeth San Steffan i fwrw amheuaeth ar ffermwyr a gafodd iawndal o ganlyniad iddynt gael clwy'r traed a'r genau ar eu ffermydd. Ychwanegodd hyn yn fawr at y diffyg dealltwriaeth rhwng y Brydain wledig a threfol. Er clod i chi, Weinidog, ni fu rhan gennych yn yr ymgyrch honno. Fodd bynnag, sut bydd y ddogfen hon yn ein helpu i ymgymryd â'r dasg eithriadol bwysig o feithrin dealltwriaeth rhwng y rheini sy'n ymwneud â ffermio a gweithgareddau eraill sy'n seiliedig ar y tir yng Nghymru, a'r rheini sy'n byw yn y Gymru drefol?

Carwyn Jones: Derbyniaf fod llawer iawn i'w wneud i adeiladu ymddiriedaeth. Ni welaf unrhyw dystiolaeth o ymgais i fwrw amheuaeth ar ffermwyr ynglŷn â'r hyn a

and mouth disease crisis. There were examples of both good and bad practice; that is life. However, as Minister for Rural Affairs, I get to see the other side of the coin. Time and again, I hear people say that all farmers are subsidised and have an easy life, driving around in range rovers, and so on. Some people truly believe that. That shows that we must attempt to build bridges. We cannot pretend that farmers are universally popular, because they are not. We must attempt to build bridges between people who live in urban areas and those in rural areas and, indeed, between those who live in rural areas and farmers. People who live in rural areas often complain to me about farmers. We must build bridges and we should not assume that farming is automatically and universally popular.

ddigwyddodd yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Cafwyd enghreifftiau o arfer da a drwg; dyna fel y gwelwch chi hi. Fodd bynnag, fel Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, caf gyfle i weld yr ochr arall. Dro ar ôl tro, clywaf bobl yn dweud fod y ffermwyr i gyd yn derbyn cymorthdaliadau ac yn cael bywyd hawdd, yn gyrru o gwmpas yn eu *range rovers* ac yn y blaen. Mae rhai pobl yn wirioneddol gredu hynny. Dengys hynny fod rhaid i ni geisio codi pontydd. Ni allwn gymryd arnom fod ffermwyr yn boblogaidd yn gyffredinol, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n wir. Rhaid i ni geisio codi pontydd rhwng pobl sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd trefol a'r rheini sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd gwledig ac, yn wir, rhwng y rheini sy'n byw yn y wlad a ffermwyr. Mae pobl sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd gwledig yn cwyno wrthyf yn fynych am ffermwyr. Rhaid inni godi pontydd ac ni ddylem gymryd yn ganiataol bod ffermio yn naturiol boblogaidd gan bawb.

The objective of this document—which was echoed last night in a meeting of the Glamorgan branch of the National Farmers' Union which I attended—is to explain what farming is and what it does. The meeting recognised that work needs to be done to explain farming and to make it more understandable and popular. This document will explain in easy-to-read terms what we expect of farming and what farmers expect of us. I think that people will appreciate the inclusion of this in the document.

Amcan y ddogfen hon—gafodd ei hadleisio neithiwr mewn cyfarfod o gangen Morgannwg o Undeb Cenedlaethol y Ffermwyr a fynychais—yw egluro beth yw ffermio a beth mae'n ei wneud. Cydnabu'r cyfarfod fod angen gwneud gwaith i egluro ffermio a'i wneud yn fwy dealladwy a phoblogaidd. Bydd y ddogfen hon yn egluro mewn iaith hawdd ei darllen beth a ddisgwyliwn gan ffermio a beth mae ffermwyr yn ei ddisgwyl gennym ni. Credaf y bydd pobl yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith bod hyn wedi'i gynnwys yn y ddogfen.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Geraint Davies: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 9.8, which refers to the conduct of Committee business. The point of order relates to the publication of the Nantygwyddon investigation report tomorrow. From then on, anyone can comment on that report except for members of the Environment, Transport and Planning Committee. We have received a letter from the Chair of that Committee requesting us not to make any comments as they may prejudice the Committee's deliberations. We are now in a nonsensical situation whereby key

Geraint Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 9.8, sy'n cyfeirio at gynnal busnes Pwyllgor. Mae'r pwynt o drefn yn ymwneud â chyhoeddi adroddiad ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon yfory. O'r adeg honno, gall unrhyw un roi sylwadau ar yr adroddiad ar wahân i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a Chynllunio. Yr ydym wedi derbyn llythyr gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw yn gofyn inni beidio a gwneud unrhyw sylwadau gan y gallent ragfarnu trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor. Yr ydym yn awr mewn sefyllfa afresymol lle mae'r

players, such as the Minister for Environment, the leader of the opposition and the local Assembly Member, are gagged on this important issue. Will you rule on whether it is appropriate or desirable that we should be gagged in this way? I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for giving me prior notice of this point of order, which has enabled me to prepare a response. This is a matter for the Committee Chair. I am aware of the letter which Richard Edwards, as Chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, sent to Committee members. In that letter his concern, as you say, is that any comments made by Committee members prior to the Committee's deliberations, might be seen to prejudice the outcome of the investigation. The difficulty is that the Assembly has created a unique procedure in conducting this investigation. I am advised that we are not in the same position as we would be on a planning matter—which would be a quasi-judicial position—but there is an analogy with this investigation. In communicating with Committee members, the Chair's concern was that nothing should happen to prejudice the investigation's progress, and to protect the Committee's work in undertaking the investigation. Committee members have been requested to comply with a self-denying ordinance. Other colleagues, who are not on the Committee and who are members of your party group—such as the leader of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council, Pauline Jarman—can say whatever they want without fear of prejudicing the result of the investigation. This restriction applies to Committee members only until the Committee has deliberated on the matter. Its intention is to protect the Committee's work.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I will make my position clear. The only comments that I have made are to thank those involved in the investigation and to recognise what residents have said; that this has been a fair and open process. I have said that I will not comment on the report's contents until the Committee has deliberated fully. I respect Geraint's point; Richard

rhaf sydd â rôl allweddol, megis y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, arweinydd yr wrthblaid a'r Aelod Cynulliad lleol wedi eu gwahardd rhag siarad ar y pwnc pwysig hwn. A wnewch ddyfarnu a yw'n briodol neu dderbyniol ein bod yn cael ein gwahardd yn y ffordd hon? Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i chi am roi rhybudd ymlaen llaw i mi am y pwynt hwn o drefn, sydd wedi rhoi cyfle i mi baratoi ymateb. Mater yw hwn i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r llythyr a anfonwyd gan Richard Edwards, fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, at aelodau'r Pwyllgor. Yn y llythyr hwnnw, ei bryder, fel y dywedwch, yw y bydd unrhyw sylwadau gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor cyn i'r Pwyllgor ei drafod, o bosibl yn cael eu gweld yn rhagfarnu canlyniad yr ymchwiliad. Yr anhawster yw bod y Cynulliad wedi creu gweithdrefn unigryw wrth gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn. Fe'm cynghorir nad ydym yn yr un sefyllfa ag y byddem ynddi ar fater cynllunio—a fyddai'n sefyllfa lled-farnwrol—ond y mae cyfatebiaeth â'r ymchiliad hwn. Wrth lythyru ag aelodau'r Pwyllgor, pryder y Cadeirydd oedd na fyddai dim yn digwydd i ragfarnu datblygiad yr ymchwiliad, ac i ddiogelu gwaith y Pwyllgor yn ymgymryd â'r ymchwiliad. Gofynnwyd i aelodau'r Pwyllgor gydymffurfio â gorchymyn ymwrthod. Gall cyd-Aelodau eraill nad ydynt ar y Pwyllgor ac sy'n aelodau o'ch grŵp plaid—megis Pauline Jarman arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf—ddweud beth a fyynnont heb ofni rhagfarnu canlyniad yr ymchwiliad. Mae'r cyfyngiad hwn ond yn berthnasol i aelodau'r Pwyllgor hyd nes y bo'r Pwyllgor wedi cynnal trafodaeth ar y mater hwn. Ei fwriad yw diogelu gwaith y Pwyllgor.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Gwnaf fy sefyllfa'n glir. Yr unig sylwadau a wneuthum yw rhoi diolch i'r rhaf fu â rhan yn yr ymchwiliad hwn ac i gydnabod beth a ddywedwyd gan y trigolion; fod hon wedi bod yn broses deg ac agored. Dywedais na fyddwn yn gwneud sylw ar gynnwys yr adroddiad hyd nes bod y Pwyllgor wedi cael trafodaeth lawn. Parchaf

Edwards, the Committee Chair, is absent today, but the approach was stated clearly in Committee and all the members agreed with it.

y pwynt a godwyd gan Geraint; mae Richard Edwards, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn absennol heddiw, ond cyhoeddwyd yr ymagwedd yn glir yn y Pwyllgor a gwnaeth yr holl aelodau gytuno â hi.

10:45 a.m.

Dafydd Wigley: Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a allwn gymryd na all yr un Aelod ddod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor os ydyw wedi datgan barn ar y mater hwn yn y cyfamser?

Dafydd Wigley: Further to that point of order, are we to understand that a Member cannot become a member of that Committee if he or she has stated an opinion on this matter in the meantime?

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hynny wedi ei ystyried yn achos yr ymchwiliad hwn. Fel y dywedais, mae'n ymchwiliad unigryw ac mae defnyddio'r Pwyllgor i gynnal ymchwiliad o'r fath yn gam newydd i'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn fodlon nad yw'r sefyllfa hon yn cyfateb yn llwyr i sefyllfa ein pwyllgorau cynllunio, lle yr ydym yn ethol yr aelodau ac felly mater cyfreithiol yw datgan buddiant. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y mater wedi'i godi, ystyriaf hyn ymhellach i weld a oes angen inni baratoi canllawiau ar gyfer sefyllfa lle yr ydym yn defnyddio ein Pwyllgorau Pwnc, neu'n sefydlu pwyllgor arbennig, i ymchwilio i achosion tebyg. Os bydd o help i'r Aelodau, gallaf wneud hynny a chyflwyno datganiad pellach ar y mater. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, mater i Gadeirydd ac aelodau'r Pwyllgor ydyw, ac yr wyf wedi esbonio'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae'n effeithio ar yr adroddiad hwn.

The Presiding Officer: That has not been considered in the case of this investigation. As I said, it is a unique investigation and a new development for the Assembly to use the Committee to undertake such an investigation. I am content that this situation does not completely correspond to that of our planning committees, whereby we elect members and, therefore, declaring an interest is a legal matter. However, since the issue has been raised, I will consider the matter further to see whether we need to prepare guidelines for a situation whereby we use our Subject Committees, or establish a special committee, to investigate similar cases. If that would be of help to Members, I can do that and provide a further statement on the matter. However, it is currently a matter for the Chair and members of the Committee and I have explained the position as it affects this report.

Lorraine Barrett: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7, in reference to the accuracy of Members' statements in Plenary. On Tuesday, Jocelyn Davies proposed amendments to a motion on the Ministerial Code. During her tirade against the First Minister, she accused him of belittling an opposition Member

Lorraine Barrett: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7, gan gyfeirio at gywirdeb datganiadau Aelod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Ddydd Mawrth, cynigiodd Jocelyn Davies welliannau i gynnig ar God y Gweinidogion. Yn ystod ei phregeth yn erbyn y Prif Weinidog, fe'i cyhuddodd o ddirmygu Aelod o wrthblaid

'by describing him—to use the First Minister's own words—as just “a former bank clerk”.'

'drwy ei ddisgrifio—i ddefnyddio geiriau y Prif Weinidog ei hun—fel dim ond “cyn glerc banc”.'

That referred to Alun Cairns's short debate on 29 November. I checked the record of that short debate and what the First Minister actually said to Alun Cairns, in reference to various percentages of the economy, was

Cyfeiriai hynny at ddadl fer Alun Cairns ar 29 Tachwedd. Fe ddarllenais gofnod y ddadl fer honno a'r hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog mewn gwirionedd wrth Alun Cairns, mewn cyfeiriad at ganrannau amrywiol yn yr economi, oedd

‘As a former bank clerk, you should understand figures.’

‘Fel cyn glerc banc, dylech ddeall ffigurau.’

It is obvious that Jocelyn added the word ‘just’. Will she reconsider what she said? I believe that it was misleading. In addition, her amendment 1, proposed on that day, called on the Assembly to underline,

Mae amlwg bod Jocelyn wedi ychwanegu'r geiriau ‘dim ond’. A wnaiff ailystyried beth a ddywedodd? Credaf iddo fod yn gamarweiniol. Yn ychwanegol, yr oedd ei gwelliant 1, a gynigiwyd ar y diwrnod hwnnw, yn galw ar y Cynulliad i danlinellu,

‘the importance of adhering to the highest standards of personal conduct in the performance of their duties in the Chamber.’

‘pwysigrwydd glynu at y safonau uchaf mewn ymddygiad personol wrth gyflawni'u dyletswyddau yn y Siambr.’

I felt that that was unnecessary because the Ministerial Code being debated was not about conduct in the Chamber. Will you, Presiding Officer, remind Jocelyn and all of us that we are answerable to you for our behaviour in the Chamber? The Deputy Presiding Officer stated on Tuesday that Members could not make amendments to the code. Why, therefore, were amendments to the code allowed to be proposed?

Teimlais nad oedd hynny'n angenrheidiol gan nad oedd Cod y Gweinidogion a drafodwyd yn ymwneud ag ymddygiad yn y Siambr. A wnewch chi, Lywydd, atgoffa Jocelyn a phawb ohonom ein bod yn atebol i chi am ein hymddygiad yn y Siambr? Datganodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ddydd Mawrth nad allai'r Aelodau wneud gwelliannau i'r cod. Pam, felly, y caniatawyd i welliannau i'r cod gael eu cynnig?

The Presiding Officer: To answer your last point first, the code itself was not amendable, but the motion relating to the code was. We discussed this at the time and there have been further discussions since. That is why the amendments to the motion were in order; amendments to the code would not have been.

Y Llywydd: I ateb eich pwynt olaf yn gyntaf, nid oedd modd diwygio'r cod ei hun, ond yr oedd modd gwneud hynny â'r cynnig oedd yn ymwneud â'r cod. Trafodwyd hyn gennym ar y pryd a chafwyd trafodaethau pellach ers hynny. Dyna paham yr oedd y gwelliannau i'r cynnig mewn trefn; ni fyddai gwelliannau i'r cod wedi bod mewn trefn.

Regarding the substance of the point of order, I have examined the record of that debate and I find that nothing that was said could be regarded as disorderly. Certainly, if that had been the case, I am assured that the Deputy Presiding Officer would have intervened and that other Members would have drawn attention to it.

Ynghylch sylwedd y pwynt o drefn, yr wyf wedi archwilio cofnod y ddatl honno ac ni allaf ddod o hyd i ddim a ddywedwyd y gellid ei ystyried yn anrhefnus. Yn sicr, pe bai hynny wedi digwydd, cefais sicrwydd y byddai'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi ymyrryd ac y byddai Aelodau eraill wedi tynnu sylw ato.

Regarding the quotation from the record, I do not see anything disorderly in adding the qualification of an adjective or a noun. It is not a serious matter. Clearly, it would be a serious matter if discourteous words were used. I did not regard those exchanges as such.

Ynghylch y dyfyniad o'r cofnod, ni welaf ddim sy'n anrhefnus mewn ychwanegu goledffiad ansoddair neu enw. Nid yw'n fater difrifol. Mae'n amlwg, byddai wedi bod yn fater difrifol pe bai geiriau anghwrtais wedi cael eu defnyddio. Nid ystyriais fod y cyfnewid geiriau hyn wedi bod felly.

Lorraine Barrett: Further to that point of order, if misleading statements are made, or a

Lorraine Barrett: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, os gwneir datganiadau

misleading word is used, does that come under the same Standing Order? The word 'misleading' is not actually mentioned in the Standing Order on discourteous language.

camarweiniol, neu os defnyddir gair camarweiniol, a yw hynny'n dod o dan yr un Rheol Sefydlog? Nid yw'r gair 'camarweiniol' yn cael ei gyfeirio ato, yn wir, yn y Rheol Sefydlog ar iaith anghwrtais.

The Presiding Officer: No. I am not responsible for the content of what Members say, only for whether it is in order. That is covered by the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber, which is set out on the Chamberweb. I advise Members, when they have a few minutes, to refresh their memories in relation to the content of that protocol and, indeed, other aspects of Standing Orders. It would make all our lives a little easier.

Y Llywydd: Na. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am gynnwys yr hyn a ddywedir gan yr Aelodau, ond yn unig a yw mewn trefn ai peidio. Delir â hynny gan Brococol Ymddygiad yn y Siambr, sydd i'w weld ar we'r Siambr. Cynghoraf yr Aelodau, pan gânt rai munudau, i atgoffa'u hunain o gynnwys y protocol hwnnw ac, yn wir, agweddu eraill ar y Rheolau Sefydlog. Byddai'n gwneud ein bywydau ni i gyd ychydig yn haws.

Gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.27 Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.27

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 34.4, resolves to suspend Standing Order No. 6.27 to enable the Assembly questions shown below to be tabled on 13 December 2001:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 34.4, yn penderfynu gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.27 i alluogi'r Cwestiynau i'r Cynulliad a nodir isod i gael eu cyflwyno ar 13 Rhagfyr 2001:

1. questions to the First Minister for answer on 8 January 2002;

1. cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru i'w hateb ar 8 Ionawr 2002;

2. questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for answer on 10 January 2002; and

2. cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i'w hateb ar 10 Ionawr 2002; a

3. questions to the Minister for Economic Development for answer on 10 January 2002. (NDM883)

3. chwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i'w hateb ar 10 Ionawr 2002. (NDM883)

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David

Davies, Jocelyn
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

The Presiding Officer: The debate on the special grant report, originally tabled for today, has been deferred to 8 January.

Y Llywydd: Gohiriwyd y ddatl ar yr adroddiad grant arbennig, a gyflwynwyd yn wreiddiol ar gyfer heddiw, tan 8 Ionawr.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.47 a.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.47 a.m.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Brif Grwpiau Gwariant Approval of Changes to Main Expenditure Groups

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

the Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.5, approves the changes to main expenditure groups for the financial year 2001-02 laid in the Table Office on Wednesday 28 November by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, Edwina Hart. (NDM882)

y Cynulliad, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.5, yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau i'r prif grwpiau gwariant ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2001-02 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mercher 28 Tachwedd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, Edwina Hart. (NDM882)

This motion is the first of a series of motions that I bring to the Assembly every year to explain changes that have been required to be made to the budget in-year. Most of the changes are technical, but I have taken the opportunity to add about £73.5 million to the Assembly's budget for the current financial year. This increase is a result of the take up of carry-forward provision—commonly known as end-year flexibility—transfers to and from Government departments, transfers from the Treasury's departmental expenditure limit reserve and a consequential for the rate relief of rural businesses.

Details of these changes are set out in the tables laid with the motion, but I will make a few points about them. My 2001 budget proposals include a new main expenditure group called 'other Assembly services' and an expanded structure for the forestry main expenditure group. I have made several changes this financial year. The agriculture and rural development, the economic development, and the local government main expenditure groups have been amended to enable expenditure on the rural recovery plan to be more transparent and easily identified.

As promised in the final budget debate, I have placed a table showing the expected profile of expenditure for future financial years on the rural recovery plan and the Wales Millennium Centre in the Assembly Library.

The match funding provision for the local regeneration fund has been transferred from housing and local government other services main expenditure group to the economic development main expenditure group, to reflect the transfer of responsibility for this work to the chief executive of the Welsh European Funding Office. Once I have a robust figure for the likely expenditure in the financial year as a result of the job losses at Corus, I will arrange for that expenditure to be easily identifiable on the management information system.

Hwn yw'r cyntaf mewn cyfres o gynigion a gyflwynaf gerbron y Cynulliad bob blwyddyn i egluro'r newidiadau y bu angen eu gwneud i'r gyllideb yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r newidiadau yn rhai technegol, ond achubais ar y cyfle i ychwanegu tua £73.5 miliwn i gyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Yr oedd y cynnydd hwn yn bosibl o ganlyniad i'r defnydd a wnaethpwyd o'r ddarpariaeth cario ymlaen—a elwir yn hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn yn gyffredinol—trosglwyddo symiau o ac i adrannau'r Llywodraeth, trosglwyddo symiau o gronfa wrth gefn terfyn gwariant adrannol y Trysorlys a'r swm ychwanegol ar gyfer rhyddhad trethi busnesau gwledig.

Nodwyd manylion y newidiadau hyn yn y tablau a osodwyd ar y cyd â'r cynnig, ond gwnaf ychydig o bwyntiau yn eu cylch. Mae fy nghynigion ar gyfer cyllideb 2001 yn cynnwys sefydlu prif grŵp gwariant newydd o'r enw 'gwasanaethau eraill y Cynulliad' a strwythur estynedig ar gyfer prif grŵp gwariant coedwigaeth. Gwneuthum sawl newid yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Newidiwyd prif grwpiau gwariant amaethyddiaeth a datblygu gwledig, datblygu economaidd, a llywodraeth leol er mwyn sicrhau bod gwariant ar y cynllun adfer gwledig yn fwy tryloyw ac yn haws ei nodi.

Fel yr addewais yn y ddadl ar y gyllideb derfynol, gosodais dabl sy'n dangos y proffil gwariant disgwylidig ar gyfer blynyddoedd ariannol yn y dyfodol ar y cynllun adfer gwledig a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn Llyfrgell y Cynulliad.

Trosglwyddwyd y ddarpariaeth o arian cyfatebol ar gyfer y gronfa adfywio leol o brif grŵp gwariant gwasanaethau eraill tai a llywodraeth leol i brif grŵp gwariant datblygu economaidd, er mwyn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod y cyfrifoldeb dros y gwaith hwn wedi ei drosglwyddo i brif weithredwr Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Unwaith y bydd gennyf ffigur cadarn ar gyfer y gwariant tebygol yn y flwyddyn ariannol o ganlyniad i ddiswyddiadau yn Corus, byddaf yn trefnu i'r gwariant hwnnw fod yn hawdd ei nodi ar y system gwybodaeth rheoli.

I take this opportunity to confirm that reducing underspend across the Assembly's budget is one of my main objectives. As I explained in my speech on the draft budget on 18 October, I am determined that the Assembly should improve its forecasting of expenditure during each financial year. I have already announced my medium-term target, which is to reduce the Assembly's departmental expenditure limit underspend to 1 per cent of the total departmental expenditure limit provision.

I will meet my Cabinet colleagues shortly to discuss the full expenditure in this financial year on the activities for which they have responsibility. That will provide me with a further opportunity to examine their budgets carefully. I want to ensure that any existing resources that may not be required in this financial year are relocated to priority areas before drawing down any further end-year flexibility provision in March, by the spring supplementary estimates.

A fully updated list of the revised budget for this financial year will appear on the management information system tomorrow. I indicated to Members that if they had any technical questions, I would be happy to answer them. We have not had any queries from Members. I propose these changes to the main expenditure groups.

10:55 a.m.

Dafydd Wigley: Mae llawer o'r newidiadau hyn yn fân a thechnegol a byddai'n fwy addas rhoi sylw iddynt mewn pwyllgor cyllid—pe bai gennym bwyllgor o'r fath—yn hytrach na mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai ystyriaethau pwysicach, megis pam y ceir tanwario dan rai o benawdau'r gyllideb, pa mor fuan y cawn wybod am hynny, a sut yr ydym yn trosglwyddo'r arian hwn, os ydym yn gwneud hynny, i flaenoriaethau eraill. Bwm yn pryderu'n fawr yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf am y tanwariant yn y gyllideb datblygu economaidd. Os ydym am sicrhau'r tyfiant yn yr economi a'r incwm y pen yr

Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i gadarnhau mai un o'm prif amcanion yw lleihau tanwariant ar draws cyllideb y Cynulliad. Fel yr eglurais yn fy araith ar y gyllideb ddrafft ar 18 Hydref, yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylai'r Cynulliad wella o ran rhagweld gwariant ar gyfer pob blwyddyn ariannol. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyhoeddi fy nharged ar gyfer y tymor canolig, sef lleihau tanwariant terfyn gwariant adrannol y Cynulliad i 1 y cant o gyfanswm y ddarpariaeth terfyn gwariant adrannol.

Byddaf yn cwrdd â'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet cyn bo hir i drafod y gwariant llawn yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon ar y gweithgareddau y maent yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Rhydd hynny gyfle arall imi archwilio eu cyllidebau yn fanwl. Yr wyf am sicrhau y caiff unrhyw adnoddau nad oes eu hangen o bosibl yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon eu hailddosbarthu i feysydd blaenoriaethol cyn i unrhyw symiau ychwanegol o'r ddarpariaeth hyblygrwydd diwedd y flwyddyn gael eu defnyddio ym mis Mawrth, erbyn amcangyfrifon atodol y gwanwyn.

Bydd rhestr wedi'i diweddarau'n llawn o'r gyllideb ddiwygiedig ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon yn ymddangos ar y system gwybodaeth rheoli yfory. Dywedais wrth yr Aelodau y byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ateb unrhyw gwestiynau technegol os oes rhai ganddynt. Nid oes unrhyw ymholiadau wedi dod i law gan Aelodau. Cynigiad y newidiadau hyn i'r prif grwpiau gwariant.

Dafydd Wigley: Many of these changes are minor and technical and would therefore be better dealt with by a finance committee—if we had such a committee—than by an Assembly Plenary. However, there are some more important considerations, such as why there is underspend under some budget headings, how soon that underspend is identified, and how do we transfer the money, if that does happen, to other priority items. I had grave concerns last year about the underspend in the economic development budget. If we are to ensure the economic growth and the per capita income for which we are aiming, we must make full use of the

ydym yn amcanu tuag atynt, rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r holl adnoddau sydd gennym. Os oes rhai eitemau yn y gyllideb yn arwain at danwariant oherwydd diffyg cynnydd mewn maes penodol, rhaid inni feddu ar y gallu i ddefnyddio'r arian hynny mor fuan â phosibl.

Dyna pam y gobeithiaf, yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf o fis Ebrill ymlaen, y bydd gennym system adolygu manwl a thrwyadl i ganfod tanwariant mor fuan â phosibl er mwyn defnyddio'r arian yn y modd y bwriadwyd wrth gynllunio'r gyllideb. Er bod rhai o'r newidiadau yn diwallu rhai o'r anghenion, yr wyf dal yn bryderus nad yw addysg uwch yn derbyn digon o adnoddau ariannol. Nid yw'r cynnydd o £313 miliwn i £321 miliwn yn ddigon. Go brin ei bod yn ddigon i ymdopi â chwyddiant. Os ydym am adeiladu economi ar sail gwybodaeth, rhaid inni gredu yn y sector hwn. Mae hynny'n arwain at ystyriaethau a dadleuon ehangach. Serch hynny, o ran y ddatl hon, mae llawer o'r newidiadau yn dechnegol ac nid wyf am eu gwrthwynebu.

Nick Bourne: Many of these changes are technical and the Welsh Conservatives do not have a problem with the main thrust of most of them. I have one or two points based on today's statement and on previous budget statements. The first is our continuing concern about raiding the reserve. Removing £30.5 million from the reserve to leave less than £2 million seems to be a dangerous and irresponsible thing to do. For that reason we will abstain on this vote.

I am also concerned about underspend, which Dafydd Wigley mentioned. Although the underspend across the whole range of National Assembly activity has not been too serious, it was serious in particular areas such as health, education and economic development. I welcome the Minister's comments about making the reduction of underspend a prime target in this financial year. That is important.

I share the concern about financial scrutiny. We should, at a suitable stage, return to the question of a finance committee to see whether it would be a proper way in which to

resources at our disposal. If there are budget items that lead to an underspend because of lack of progress in a certain area, we must be able to use that money as soon as possible.

That is why I hope that, in the next financial year from April onwards, we will have a detailed and thorough reviewing system to identify underspend as soon as possible so that the money can be used in the way proposed in the budget planning round. Even though some of these changes meet some of the needs, I am still concerned that higher education is not receiving adequate financial resources. The increase from £313 million to £321 million is not enough; it barely covers inflation. If we are to build a knowledge-based economy, we must believe in this sector. This leads to broader considerations and arguments. However, as regards this debate, many of the changes are technical and I do not intend to object to them.

Nick Bourne: Mae llawer o'r newidiadau hyn yn dechnegol ac nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn anghytuno â phrif fyrddwn y rhan fwyaf ohonynt. Hoffwn wneud un neu ddau o bwyntiau yn seiliedig ar y datganiad heddiw ac ar ddatganiadau cyllidebol blaenorol. Y pwynt cyntaf yw ein bod yn pryderu o hyd ynglŷn â'r defnydd a wneir o arian y gronfa wrth gefn. Ymddengys i ni mai peth peryglus ac anghyfrifol yw symud £30.5 miliwn o'r gronfa wrth gefn gan adael llai na £2 filiwn ar ôl. Am y rheswm hwnnw byddwn yn ymatal ar y bleidlais hon.

Yr wyf yn pryderu hefyd am y tanwariant, a grybwyllwyd gan Dafydd Wigley. Er na fu tanwariant mawr ar draws ystod gyfan gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, bu cryn danwariant mewn rhai meysydd megis iechyd, addysg a datblygu economaidd. Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch sicrhau bod lleihau tanwariant yn un o'r prif dargedau ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae hynny yn bwysig.

Pryderaf hefyd ynglŷn â chraffu ariannol. Dylem ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn o sefydlu pwyllgor cyllid, ar adeg briodol, i ganfod a fyddai hynny yn ffordd addas i ystyried rhai

consider some of these issues. That would be welcome.

The prime areas that we identified previously as needing more resources are still agriculture and health. I note the comments about the transfer of resources, which we are approving today, to help with areas affected by foot and mouth disease. This continues to be a problem, despite the welcome news that Wales is now free from foot and mouth disease. Businesses continue to suffer because of the fall in tourist numbers over the summer, which have not increased sufficiently to enable them to survive with their previous workforce and to generate the business in the local economy that they previously did. This is an area of concern that the Minister for Finance will need to reconsider.

We do not have a problem with the main thrust of the changes, but I, and the Conservative group, have grave concerns about the reserve fund.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I thank Dafydd Wigley and Nick Bourne for their comments on underspend. I am also grateful for the support from across the Chamber for dealing with that issue. Underspend, on the whole, compared with Whitehall departments and other devolved administrations, has been good. Underspend issues are caused by other factors. In terms of economic development, underspend can be caused by the fact that regional selective assistance is demand-led. Sometimes it concerns capital projects in health and education. It is a matter of getting the money out of the door and having the capacity to do that. I regularly review what is going on and I have been vigorous this year to achieve my publicised targets to get the underspend down. It is important that my officials and I continue to monitor that. I know that my colleagues in the administration are aware of my priorities on this underspend regarding their individual budget headings.

On the reserve, Nick, it is a question of utilisation. I believe that I have the judgement

o'r materion hyn. Byddai croeso i hynny.

Amaethyddiaeth a iechyd yw'r prif feysydd y mae angen rhagor o adnoddau arnynt o hyd, fel y nodwyd gennym o'r blaen. Nodaf y sylwadau ynglŷn â throsglwyddo adnoddau, rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei gymeradwyo heddiw, i helpu'r ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan glwy'r traed a'r genau. Erys hyn yn broblem o hyd, er gwaethaf y newyddion da bod Cymru erbyn hyn yn rhydd o glwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae busnesau yn parhau i ddiodeff oherwydd y gostyngiad a fu yn niferoedd y twristiaid yn ystod yr haf. Nid ydynt wedi cynyddu digon i alluogi busnesau i oroesi gyda'u gweithlu blaenorol ac i greu'r busnes yn yr economi leol fel y gwnaethant o'r blaen. Mae hyn yn achos pryder y bydd angen i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid ei ailystyried.

Nid ydym yn anghytuno â phrif fyrdrwn y newidiadau, ond mae amheuan mawr gennyf i, a'r grŵp Ceidwadol, ynglŷn â'r gronfa wrth gefn.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Diolchaf i Dafydd Wigley a Nick Bourne am eu sylwadau ar danwariant. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar hefyd am y gefnogaeth o bob rhan o'r Siambr i ddelio â'r mater hwnnw. Bu'r tanwariant yn dda, ar y cyfan, o gymharu ag adrannau Whitehall a'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Mae ffactorau eraill yn achosi tanwariant. O ran datblygu economaidd, ceir tanwariant weithiau am fod cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn dibynnu ar y galw. Weithiau ceir tanwariant mewn prosiectau cyfalaf ym maes iechyd ac addysg. Mater ydyw o ddsbarthu'r arian a bod â'r gallu i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn adolygu'r sefyllfa yn rheolaidd a bŵm yn gweithio'n ddiwyd eleni i gyflawni'r targedau a gyhoeddwyd gennyf ar gyfer lleihau tanwariant. Mae'n bwysig bod fy swyddogion a minnau yn parhau i fonitro hynny. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y weinyddiaeth yn ymwybodol o'm blaenoriaethau ar y tanwariant hwn o ran eu penawdau cyllideb unigol.

O ran cronfeydd wrth gefn, Nick, mater o ddefnyddio arian ydyw. Credaf fy mod wedi

right. However, I heard what you said and I will review the position of the reserves as an ongoing issue when I deal with budgetary considerations. The points about insufficient funds in some areas were well made. Dafydd referred to higher education. I can only refer him to my budget statement. There will be ongoing discussions in that area with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning as policy areas develop. As they develop, we will know where we stand in the higher education field.

The foot and mouth disease crisis has had a devastating effect on agriculture. However, as the Minister for Rural Affairs said, we are now seeing improvements in the coastal and inland areas with regard to tourism. We can only hope that that improvement continues.

These transfers are mainly technical, and I commend them to you.

barnu hynny yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, gwrandewais ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch ac adolygaf y sefyllfa o ran y cronfeydd wrth gefn fel mater parhaus wrth ymdrin â'r ystyriaethau cyllidebol. Yr oedd y pwyntiau am ddiffyg arian mewn rhai meysydd yn rhai dilys. Cyfeiriodd Dafydd at addysg uwch. Ni allaf ond ei gyfeirio at fy natganiad cyllidebol. Bydd trafodaethau yn parhau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn y maes hwnnw wrth i feysydd polisi ddatblygu. Wrth iddynt ddatblygu, cawn wybod beth yw'r sefyllfa o ran addysg uwch.

Cafodd clwy'r traed a'r genau effaith andwyol ar amaethyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, yr ydym erbyn hyn yn gweld gwelliannau yn yr ardaloedd arfordirol a mewndirol o ran twristiaeth. Gallwn ond gobeithio y bydd y gwelliant hwnnw yn parhau.

Mater technegol yw trosglwyddo'r symiau hyn ar y cyfan, ac fe'u hargymhellaf ichi.

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 16, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 16, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)

Strategaeth Economaidd Effeithiol An Effective Economic Strategy

Phil Williams: I propose that

the National Assembly expresses its concern at the serious gap between Wales and the rest of the UK in gross domestic product per head and the continuing job losses in the manufacturing sector, and asserts that an effective economic strategy to ensure environmentally sustainable development of every part of Wales must:

- 1. aim to provide sufficient jobs to guarantee full career opportunities for the whole population in each region of Wales, including the rural and the traditionally industrial areas;*
- 2. set ambitious targets to exploit the considerable potential for renewable and non-polluting production of energy and food;*
- 3. systematically identify those growing sectors of the economy where Wales has intrinsic advantages, and ensure that the appropriate infrastructure and educational facilities to support those sectors are given sufficient priority in the Assembly budget;*

Phil Williams: Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn datgan ei bryder ynghylch yr agendor difrifol sydd rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU o ran CMC y pen a'r swyddi sy'n parhau i gael eu colli yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu, ac yn datgan bod yn rhaid wrth strategaeth economaidd effeithiol i sicrhau datblygiad amgylcheddol-gynaliadwy ym mhob rhan o Gymru a fyddai'n:

- 1. anelu at ddarparu digon o swyddi i warantu cyfleoedd gyrfaol llawn ar gyfer y boblogaeth gyfan ym mhob ardal o Gymru, gan gynnwys yr ardaloedd gwledig a'r ardaloedd traddodiadol diwydiannol;*
- 2. gosod targedau uchelgeisiol i wireddu'r potensial aruthrol i gynhyrchu ynni a bwyd o ffynonellau dilygredd ac adnewyddadwy;*
- 3. clustnodi'n systematig y sectorau twf hynny o'r economi y mae gan Gymru fanteision cynhenid ynddynt, a sicrhau bod yr adnoddau addysgol a'r isadeiledd sy'n cynnal y sectorau hynny yn cael digon o flaenoriaeth yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad;*

4. demand the right to use the maximum range of fiscal measures consistent with European Union regulations; and

5. consider fully the international context of our strategy, including an analysis of best practice in other small countries that have achieved economic success, and a determined anticipation of the opportunities offered by the enlargement of the EU. (NDM884)

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales makes no apology for proposing a motion on economic strategy a week ahead of the Government's debate. Earlier in the year, we submitted a detailed response to the draft strategy and this motion summarises the main principles of our evidence. We were prepared for the Government to steal our best ideas—and we live in hope—but the document published tomorrow will do so, and will be a great improvement on the draft that was published a few weeks ago. An essential feature of any successful strategy is a clear definition of realistic targets. Plaid Cymru is committed to the sustainable development of all our communities and that requires a sufficient number of new jobs at all levels—from shop floor to top management—to establish full employment for the whole population and to offer satisfying careers to our young people. To ensure balanced development, we must assess the specific needs of the different parts of Wales. The division of Wales into Objective 1 and the rest is too coarse. What use would it be to Holyhead or Milford Haven if we met our all-Wales targets by providing jobs in Cwmbran? We must recognise that travel-to-work patterns define the real economic regions of Wales. We identify seven clear regions and we must assess the particular needs of each one.

In the valleys of south-east Wales, and in Swansea bay, we have the largest proportional shortfall in overall employment. Bringing the employment rate in the working age population of those two regions up to the average level for the rest of the UK requires about 60,000 jobs. This is where we must attract the large manufacturing units. To

4. mynnu'r hawl i ddefnyddio'r ystod mwyaf o fesurau cyllidol sy'n gyson â rheoliadau'r UE; ac

5. ystyried cyd-destun rhyngwladol ein strategaeth yn llawn, gan gynnwys dadansoddiad o'r gorau a arferir mewn gwledydd bach eraill sydd wedi profi llwyddiant economaidd, gan gymryd camau penderfynol i wneud y gorau o'r cyfleoedd a ddaw gydag ehangu'r UE. (NDM884)

Nid yw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn ymddiheuro o gwbl am gynnig cynnig ar strategaeth economaidd wythnos cyn dadl y Llywodraeth. Yn gynharach eleni, cyflwynasom ymateb manwl i'r strategaeth ddrafft ac mae'r cynnig hwn yn crynhoi prif egwyddorion ein tystiolaeth. Yr oeddem yn barod i'r Llywodraeth ddwyn ein syniadau gorau—ac yr ydym yn byw mewn gobraith—ond bydd y ddogfen a gyhoeddir yfory yn gwneud hynny, a bydd yn welliant mawr ar y drafft a gyhoeddwyd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Nodwedd hanfodol ar unrhyw strategaeth lwyddiannus yw diffiniad clir o dargedau realistig. Mae Plaid Cymru yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygiad cynaliadwy pob un o'n cymunedau ac mae hynny'n galw am nifer ddigonol o swyddi newydd ar bob lefel—o lawr y ffatri i'r swydd reoli uchaf—i sefydlu cyflogaeth lawn ar gyfer y boblogaeth gyfan ac i gynnig gyrfaedd boddhaus i'n pobl ifanc. Er mwyn sicrhau datblygiad cytbwys, rhaid inni asesu anghenion penodol y rhannau gwahanol o Gymru. Mae rhannu Cymru yn Amcan 1 a'r gweddill yn rhy fras. Pa werth fyddai i Gaergybi neu Aberdaugleddau pe bawn yn cyrraedd pob un o'n targedau Cymru gyfan drwy ddarparu swyddi yng Nghwibrân? Rhaid inni gydnabod mai patrymau teithio i'r gwaith sy'n diffinio rhanbarthau economaidd gwirioneddol Cymru. Rhaid inni nodi saith rhanbarth clir a rhaid inni asesu anghenion penodol pob un.

Yng nghymoedd y De-ddwyrain, ac ym mae Abertawe, mae'r prinder swyddi cyfrannol mwyaf yn gyffredinol. Mae dod â chyfradd gyflogaeth y bobl hynny sy'n gweithio yn y ddau ranbarth hwnnw i fyny i'r lefel gyfartalog ar gyfer gweddill y DU yn golygu creu tua 60,000 o swyddi. Dyma lle y mae'n rhaid inni ddenu'r unedau gweithgynhyrchu

succeed, we need a drive to enhance basic skills, linked with an ambitious programme for integrated passenger transport and a marked improvement in the social and cultural infrastructure of our valley communities. Geraint Davies will deal with that in more detail. In contrast, in mid-Wales, the proportion of the population of working age already in full employment is close to the UK average, but a high proportion of young people from that area receive a university education and then have to leave home to find an appropriate corresponding career. A relatively small number of high-quality jobs are needed, especially in rural areas. You will not be surprised if I say that this points, for example, to a special emphasis on broadband communication, but also to a series of jobs which ensure that people can fulfil their highest ambitions and stay in the community where they grew up, where many would wish to remain. Elin Jones will discuss our policies for rural regeneration.

11:05 a.m.

There is a sharp contrast between north-east and north-west Wales. In the relatively prosperous north-east, employment rates are close to the UK average and our strategy there must focus on a partnership with the private sector to secure the future of two extremely important industries—optoelectronics and aerospace. However, the Objective 1 region in north-west Wales has a superb environment, high educational standards and a rich cultural life in both languages which stand in sharp contrast with the jobs shortfall of over 8,000. That is the crux of the real crisis facing Welsh-speaking communities. We should be asking why young people leave areas such as these.

A similar situation occurs in south-west Wales where the calculations show that 13,000 extra jobs would be needed to create full employment. We may need to offer special incentives, such as enterprise zones, or take positive action, which is in our power, to re-direct some Government jobs into such areas. In all those areas, we have a great long-term potential for developing renewable energy on and off shore. It is absurd that the

mawr. I lwyddo, mae angen ymgyrch arnom i wella sgiliau sylfaenol, wedi'i chysylltu â rhaglen uchelgeisiol ar gyfer cludiant teithwyr integredig a gwelliant amlwg yn seilwaith cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ein cymunedau yn y cymoedd. Bydd Geraint Davies yn delio â hynny yn fanylach. I'r gwrthwyneb, yng nghanolbarth Cymru, mae cyfran y boblogaeth o oed gweithio sydd eisoes mewn cyflogaeth lawn yn agos at gyfartaledd y DU, ond mae cyfran uchel o bobl ifanc o'r ardal honno yn cael addysg brifysgol ac yna'n gorfod gadael cartref i ddod o hyd i yrfa gyfatebol briodol. Mae angen nifer gymharol fechan o swyddi o ansawdd uchel, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ni fyddwch yn synnu os dywedaf fod hyn yn pwyntio, er enghraifft, tuag at bwyslais arbennig ar gyfathrebu band llydan, ond hefyd at gyfres o swyddi sy'n sicrhau y gall pobl wireddu eu huchelgeisiau mwyaf ac aros yn y gymuned lle y cawsant eu magu, lle y byddai llawer yn dymuno aros. Bydd Elin Jones yn trafod ein polisiau ar gyfer adfywio gwledig.

Mae gwrthwynebiad amlwg rhwng y Gogledd-ddwyrain a'r Gogledd-orllewin. Yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain cymharol ffyniannus, mae cyfraddau cyflogaeth yn agos at gyfartaledd y DU a rhaid i'n strategaeth yno ganolbwyntio ar bartneriaeth â'r sector preifat i sicrhau dyfodol dau ddiwydiant eithriadol o bwysig—optoelectroneg ac aerofod. Fodd bynnag, mae gan ranbarth Amcan 1 yn y Gogledd-orllewin amgylchedd gwyach, safonau addysgol uchel a bywyd diwylliannol cyfoethog yn y ddwy iaith sy'n gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â'r prinder swyddi o dros 8,000. Dyna graidd yr argyfwng gwirioneddol sy'n wynebu cymunedau sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Dylem fod yn gofyn pam bod pobl ifanc yn gadael ardaloedd o'r fath.

Cyfyd sefyllfa debyg yn y De-orllewin lle y dengys cyfrifiadau y byddai angen 13,000 o swyddi ychwanegol i greu cyflogaeth lawn. Efallai y bydd angen cymhellion arbennig o'r fath arnom, fel yr ardaloedd menter, neu bydd angen inni gymryd camau cadarnhaol, sydd o fewn ein pŵer, i ailgyfeirio rhai o swyddi'r Llywodraeth i ardaloedd o'r fath. Yn yr holl ardaloedd hynny, mae gennym botensial hirdymor i ddatblygu ynni

draft target for renewable energy production in Wales is only 10 per cent, the same as the UK average. It is one of our assets and, therefore, we should take account of it in developing our economy.

I have tried to show why, in each region of Wales, a successful economic strategy must assess the needs and assets of the region first and identify the appropriate Government action. An economic strategy cannot be considered seriously without a regional dimension. We must also have a policy which targets growth sectors of the economy where Wales has some intrinsic advantage or has already laid strong foundations.

There were two things that we wanted to see added to the draft strategy. First, a systematic methodology to identify those industrial sectors which could find an ideal location in Wales for successful operation. Secondly, and most importantly, those specific measures that a Government can take to target those sectors. Once a sector is identified a partnership of Government, industry and higher education, as in several countries, can then ensure that we supply the graduates, and develop the research facilities appropriate to the sector. The Government can then prioritise spending to the appropriate infrastructure. The fact that the education budget in Wales is set to rise at a slower rate than in England even though we need a faster rate of economic growth is a weakness in the Government's overall plan. Those are budget implications that Dafydd Wigley will address.

We support Jonathan Morgan's amendments 2 and 3. We would have worded them differently but it is important that the strategy should be developed in partnership with the private sector. With regards to tax and fiscal aid, we should only have one barrier, the tax imposed by the EU, and not the Treasury tax, which is added at present.

At the same time, we need to use our limited resources in the most efficient way. I will give an example based on the economic

adnewyddadwy ar y tir ac ar y môr. Mae'n wirion mai dim ond 10 y cant yw'r targed drafft ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, yr un peth â chyfartaledd y DU. Mae'n un o'n hasedion ac, felly, dylem ei ystyried wrth ddatblygu ein heconomi.

Yr wyf wedi ceisio dangos pam, ymhob rhanbarth yng Nghymru, fod yn rhaid i strategaeth economaidd lwyddiannus asesu anghenion ac asedion y rhanbarth yn gyntaf a nodi'r camau priodol i'r Llywodraeth eu cymryd. Ni ellir ystyried strategaeth economaidd yn ddifrifol heb ddimensiwn rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni gael polisi hefyd sy'n targedu sectorau twf yr economi lle mae gan Gymru rywfaint o fantais gynhenid neu lle mae eisoes wedi gosod seiliau cadarn.

Yr oedd dau beth yr oeddem am eu gweld yn cael eu hychwanegu at y strategaeth ddrafft. Yn gyntaf, methodoleg systematig i nodi'r sectorau diwydiannol hynny a allai ddod o hyd i leoliad delfrydol yng Nghymru i weithredu'n llwyddiannus. Yn ail, ac yn bwysicaf oll, y mesurau penodol hynny y gall Llywodraeth eu cymryd i dargedu'r sectorau hynny. Unwaith y caiff sector ei nodi, gall partneriaeth Llywodraeth, diwydiant ac addysg uwch, fel mewn sawl gwlad, sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r graddedigion, a datblygu'r cyfleusterau ymchwil sy'n briodol i'r sector. Gall y Llywodraeth wedyn flaenoriaethu gwariant i'r seilwaith priodol. Mae'r ffaith bod y gyllideb addysg yng Nghymru wedi ei gosod i godi ar gyfradd arafach na Lloegr er bod angen cyfradd gyflymach o dwf economaidd arnom yn wendid yng nghynllun cyffredinol y Llywodraeth. Bydd Dafydd Wigley yn ymdrin â'r goblygiadau hynny i'r gyllideb.

Cefnogwn welliannau 2 a 3 Jonathan Morgan. Byddem wedi eu geirio'n wahanol ond mae'n bwysig bod y strategaeth yn cael ei datblygu mewn partneriaeth â'r sector preifat. O ran treth a chymorth cyllidol, dim ond un rhwystr yn unig a ddylai fod gennym, sef y dreth a osodwyd gan yr UE, ac nid treth y Trysorlys, a ychwanegir ar hyn o bryd.

Yr un pryd, mae angen inni ddefnyddio ein hadnoddau cyfyngedig yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithlon. Rhoddaf enghraifft yn seiliedig ar

choices facing Pembrokeshire. If the future were based on energy, environment and information based industries—with an extension of the tourist season to attract the conference sector—then priority must be given to broadband communication and fast rail and air communications. If, on the other hand, we envisage the development of large-scale manufacturing and container traffic through Milford Haven, then the dual carriageway extension must be a priority. However, the strategy must give some indication so that we provide the appropriate infrastructure.

I am afraid that there is much shoddy thinking on economic strategy. How often have I heard the tired old clichés, ‘We are not in the business of picking winners’ and ‘We must not tell industry what to do’. Of course I agree. However, have the tired, old time-servers who trot out these clichés, as excuses for doing nothing, studied how other small countries have moved from poverty to prosperity through the intelligent use of sector selectivity?

We often quote the success of Ireland, but we should also consider Finland, which has moved from being one of the poorest countries in Europe 50 years ago to being one of the richest. When I worked in Finland, the Government was prepared to put serious money into our project because of the country’s long-term plan to produce young people who were trained in digital electronics. In 1980, the Finnish Government might have been thinking about television and video recorders, but when the mobile phone revolution occurred, Finland was the ideal place.

Finally, the draft strategy seems to ignore the outside world. There is no systematic analysis of the successful economic strategies followed by other countries that have found themselves in a similar position to us. There should have been more analysis of the opportunities offered by the expansion of the EU and how these opportunities, especially in the environmental sector, should affect our strategy.

y dewisiadau economaidd sy’n wynebu Sir Benfro. Pe bai’r dyfodol yn seiliedig ar ynni, yr amgylchedd a diwydiannau yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth—gan ymestyn tymor y twristiaid i ddenu’r sector cynadledda—yna byddai’n rhaid rhoi’r flaenoriaeth i gyfathrebu band llydan a chysylltiadau rheilffordd ac awyr cyflym. Ar y llaw arall, pe baem yn rhagweld y byddai llawer o ddatblygiad ym maes gweithgynhyrchu a mwy o drafnidiaeth cynwysyddion drwy Aberdaugleddau, yna byddai’n rhaid blaenoriaethu’r estyniad ar gyfer ffordd ddeuol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i’r strategaeth roi rhyw arwydd fel ein bod yn darparu’r seilwaith priodol.

Ofnaf fod llawer o feddwl gwael ynglŷn â’r strategaeth economaidd. Clywais yr hen ystrydebau hyn sawl gwaith, ‘Nid ein gwaith ni yw dewis enillwyr’ ac ‘Ni ddylem ddweud wrth ddiwydiant beth i’w wneud’. Wrth gwrs fy mod yn cytuno. Fodd bynnag, a yw’r hen gynffonwyr ystrydebol sy’n dda am sribedu’r ystrydebau hyn, fel esgusodion dros beidio â gwneud dim, wedi astudio sut y symudodd gwledydd bach eraill o dlodi i ffyniant drwy ddefnyddio detholusrwydd sectorau mewn ffordd ddeallus?

Yn aml, dyfynnwn lwyddiant Iwerddon, ond dylem hefyd ystyried y Ffindir, sydd wedi symud o fod yn un o wledydd tlotaf Ewrop 50 mlynedd yn ôl i fod yn un o’r cyfoethocaf. Pan weithiwn yn y Ffindir, yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn barod i fuddsoddi arian mawr yn ein prosiect oherwydd cynllun hirdymor y wlad i gynhyrchu pobl ifanc wedi eu hyfforddi ym maes electroneg ddigidol. Yn 1980, efallai mai meddwl am setiau teledu a pheiriannau fideo oedd Llywodraeth y Ffindir, ond pan fu’r chwyldro o ran ffonau symudol, y Ffindir oedd y lle delfrydol.

Yn olaf, ymddengys petai’r strategaeth ddrafft yn anwybyddu’r byd y tu allan. Nid oes unrhyw ddadansoddiad systematig o’r strategaethau economaidd llwyddiannus a ddilyniir gan wledydd eraill sydd wedi bod mewn sefyllfa debyg. Dylai’r cyfleoedd a oedd ar gael o ganlyniad i ehangu’r UE a’r modd y dylai’r cyfleoedd hyn, yn enwedig yn y sector amgylcheddol, effeithio ar ein strategaeth, fod wedi cael eu dadansoddi mwy.

We hope that these factors will be included in the Assembly's successful economic strategy. We hope that, even at this late stage, the Government will include these recommendations, which we present positively. Otherwise, we must wait for 2003 and a Plaid Cymru government.

The First Minister: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Andrew Davies. Delete from 'and asserts' to end of motion, and replace with:

but is confident that the Assembly Government's economic strategy and the actions flowing from it will ensure the environmentally sustainable economic development of every part of Wales.

We share everybody's concerns about the current state of the Welsh economy. Wales has a GDP per capita level and a general income level that is well below the British or western European average. It is 20 per cent below the average in terms of GDP per capita; slightly less so in terms of household income. However, it is a low starting point at the commencement of this Assembly's responsibilities. It has not decreased during the Assembly's two and a half years of existence, but it has hardly improved. That is a measure of the task in front of us.

I congratulate Plaid Cymru for choosing this subject, and I congratulate Phil on how he introduced the topic. Today's debate is related to next week's debate. I hope Plaid will not mind if I say that next week's debate will be the key one, because it will be on the document, 'A Winning Wales'. Today could be described as a taster for that debate, although no doubt Jocelyn will complain that the phrase 'taster' demeans the opposition in some way. However, it is not meant in that way. Phil said the same thing in his introduction.

The debate next week on 'A Winning Wales' will set out our vision to achieve a prosperous Welsh economy that is dynamic, inclusive

Gobeithiwn y caiff y ffactorau hyn eu cynnwys yn strategaeth economaidd lwyddiannus y Cynulliad. Gobeithiwn, hyd yn oed mor ddiweddar â hyn, y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cynnwys yr argymhellion hyn, a gyflwynwn yn gadarnhaol. Fel arall, rhaid inni aros tan 2003 a llywodraeth Plaid Cymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Andrew Davies. Dileu o 'ac yn datgan' hyd ddiwedd y cynnig, a rhoi:

ond mae'n hyderus y bydd strategaeth economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a'r camau a fydd yn deillio ohoni, yn sicrhau y bydd economi pob rhan o Gymru yn cael ei datblygu mewn modd sy'n amgylcheddol gynaliadwy.

Rhannwn bryderon pawb ynglŷn â chyflwr presennol economi Cymru. Mae gan Gymru lefel CMC y pen a lefel incwm cyffredinol sydd yn is o lawer na'r cyfartaledd ym Mhrydain neu orllewin Ewrop. Mae'n 20 y cant yn is na'r cyfartaledd o ran CMC y pen; ychydig yn llai felly o ran incwm cartrefi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fan cychwyn isel wrth i'r Cynulliad ymgymryd â'i ddyletswyddau. Nid yw wedi gostwng dros y ddwy flynedd a hanner ers bodolaeth y Cynulliad, ond prin ei fod wedi gwella. Dyna faint y dasg sydd o'n blaen.

Hoffwn longyfarch Plaid Cymru ar ddewis y pwnc hwn, a hoffwn longyfarch Phil ar y modd y cyflwynodd y pwnc. Mae dadl heddiw yn ymwneud â dadl yr wythnos nesaf. Gobeithiaf na fydd ots gan Plaid Cymru pe dywedwn mai dadl yr wythnos nesaf fydd yr un allweddol, oherwydd fe fydd yn ymwneud â'r ddogfen 'Cymru ar ei Hennill'. Gellid disgrifio heddiw fel rhagflas o'r ddadl honno, er y bydd Jocelyn, yn ddiau, yn cwyno bod yr ymadrodd 'rhagflas' yn diraddio'r wrthblaid mewn rhyw ffordd. Fodd bynnag, ni olygir hynny. Dywedodd Phil yr un peth yn ei gyflwyniad.

Bydd y ddadl yr wythnos nesaf ar 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn nodi ein gweledigaeth i gyflawni economi Cymru ffyniannus sy'n

and sustainable, based on competitive businesses with skilled and well-motivated people. We all accept that aim of raising the general skills levels of the human resource in Wales pari passu with raising the average quality of the types of jobs in Wales in line with the need for a second reinvention of the Welsh economy. We reinvented ourselves as manufacturers of television sets and video recorders, because we were the lowest cost location for assembly line production of consumer durables and goods 25 years ago, as the coal and steel industries collapsed—although not in terms of production. Now, 25 years later, much of that type of assembly line production is under threat. That is due to the position of the pound compared to the euro, or our wage rates compared to the wage rates of the succession countries that will become members of the European Union in two or three years time. Therefore, we have no alternative but to aim higher for a bigger share of the knowledge economy of the world, as distinct from merely the ambition for which we had to aim 25 years ago when Britain first entered the European Union of being a low cost assembly location for Japanese American, and sometimes German firms. Such firms wanted to expand production capacity, wanted to do so inside the EU's tariff barriers, and wanted low production costs. Sometimes that was combined with continuous competitive devaluations of the British pound relative to the deutschmark. Britain, and Wales in particular, was a good place to assemble television sets and video recorders. It continues to be a good place but we cannot say that it is the cheapest place, given wage levels.

11:15 a.m.

Next week, when we debate 'A Winning Wales' we will set out clear objectives, specific targets and an action plan for the Assembly Government and its partners. It will indicate that over 10 years, more than £15 billion will be committed to economic development in Wales. The definition of economic development excludes local government expenditure on economic development, but includes higher and further education expenditure, and part of the

ddeinamig, cynhwysol a chynaliadwy, yn seiliedig ar fusnesau cystadleuol gyda phobl â sgiliau a chymhelliant. Mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn y nod hwnnw o godi lefelau sgiliau cyffredinol yr adnoddau dynol yng Nghymru gam a cham â chodi ansawdd y mathau o swyddi yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd sy'n unol â'r angen i ailddyfeisio economi Cymru. Gwnaethom ailddyfeisio ein hunain fel gweithgynhyrchwyr setiau teledu a pheiriannau fideo, gan mai ni oedd y lleoliad cost isaf ar gyfer cynhyrchiant rhes gydosod o nwyddau traul a nwyddau 25 mlynedd yn ôl, wrth i'r diwydiannau glo a dur chwalu—er nad o ran cynhyrchiant. Erbyn hyn, 25 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae llawer o'r math hwnnw o gynhyrchiant rhes gydosod o dan fygythiad oherwydd sefyllfa'r bunt o'i chymharu â'r ewro, neu ein cyfraddau cyflogau o'u cymharu â chyfraddau cyflogau y gwledydd olynol a ddaw yn aelodau o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ymhen dwy neu dair blynedd. Felly, nid oes dewis gennym ond anelu at gyfran fwy o economi gwybodaeth y byd, yn wahanol i'r uchelgais y bu'n rhaid inni anelu ato 25 mlynedd yn ôl pan ddaeth Prydain yn aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, sef yr uchelgais o fod yn lleoliad rhes gydosod cost isaf ar gyfer cwmnïau o Japan, America ac weithiau, yr Almaen. Yr oedd cwmnïau o'r fath am ehangu capasiti cynhyrchu, yr oeddent am wneud hynny y tu mewn i ffiniau tollau'r UE, ac yr oeddent am gael costau cynhyrchu isel. Weithiau cyfunwyd hynny â dibrisiadau cystadleuol parhaus y bunt Brydeinig mewn perthynas â'r deutschmark. Yr oedd Prydain, a Chymru yn arbennig, yn lle da i gydosod setiau teledu a pheiriannau fideo. Mae'n parhau i fod yn lle da ond ni allwn ddweud mai hwn yw'r lle rhataf, o gofio lefelau cyflogau.

Yr wythnos nesaf, pan gynhaliwn ddadl ar 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' byddwn yn gosod amcanion clir, targedau penodol a chynllun gweithredu ar gyfer Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i phartneriaid. Bydd yn nodi y caiff mwy na £15 biliwn, dros 10 mlynedd, ei neilltuo ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r diffiniad datblygu economaidd yn cynnwys gwariant llywodraeth leol ar ddatblygu economaidd, ond yn cynnwys gwariant ar addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, a

transport budget. We think that that definition is broadly acceptable to indicate what sort of resources must go into economic development over the next 10 years.

'A Winning Wales' sets out our approach. The strategy is designed to serve the Assembly Government's three key themes of sustainable development, social inclusion and equality of opportunity, and shows the way forward in terms of our investment into the knowledge economy. I was pleased to see a classic example in this morning's paper, namely the Enfis project in the University of Wales, Swansea. It shows classic co-operation between higher education, venture capital, and university professors—Professor Ken Board and Professor Marc Clement in Swansea. Those developing that project are using the latest laser technology for the treatment of acne, which we hope will be as successful as the treatment of wrinkles. Non-invasive surgery is sustainable and has health benefits, as well as achieving economic development. Most important from our point of view is that it marks out territory where Wales leads the way globally. We can pull in university resources, the venture capital resources of Terry Matthews's Wesley Clover group, conventional financial resources and contributions from the Assembly. If only we had dozens and dozens of such companies spinning out of universities. We need more of them. At least we can now see where our higher education resources are beginning to play well into the needs of the economy.

We continue to discuss with Treasury colleagues the potential for further tax incentives following the pre-budget statement, which opened up many opportunities for Wales. Stamp duty on land transactions of up to £150,000 was abolished last week. That covers the residential and small business premises in the 363 electoral divisions in Wales, benefiting 47 per cent of the population. The Treasury also promised to seek state aids clearance from Europe to enhance that exemption.

We also have proposals for a community

rhan o'r gyllideb trafniadaeth. Credwn fod y diffiniad hwnnw yn dderbyniol yn fras i nodi pa fath o adnoddau sy'n gorfod cael eu neilltuo ar gyfer datblygu economaidd dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf.

Mae 'Cymru ar ei Hennill' yn nodi ein hymagwedd. Bwriad y strategaeth yw gwasanaethu tair thema allweddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sef datblygu cynaliadwy, cynhwysedd cymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal, a dengys y ffordd ymlaen o ran ein buddsoddiad yn yr economi wybodaeth. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld enghraifft wych yn y papur y bore yma, sef prosiect Enfis ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe. Dengys gydweithredu gwych rhwng addysg uwch, cyfalaf menter ac athrawon prifysgol—yr Athro Ken Board a'r Athro Marc Clement yn Abertawe. Mae'r rhai sy'n datblygu'r prosiect hwnnw yn defnyddio'r dechnoleg laser ddiweddaraf i drin acne, a fydd, gobeithiwn, yr un mor llwyddiannus â'r driniaeth ar gyfer crychion. Mae llawdriniaeth nad yw'n ymwthiol yn gynaliadwy ac mae iddi fanteision iechyd, yn ogystal â chyflawni datblygiad economaidd. Yn bwysicaf oll o'n safbwynt ni, mae'n nodi lle mae Cymru ar flaen y gad yn y byd. Gallwn alw ar adnoddau prifysgol, adnoddau grŵp Wesley Clover Terry Matthews, adnoddau ariannol confensiynol a chyfraniadau gan y Cynulliad. Pe bai ond gennym ddwsinau o gwmnïau o'r fath yn deillio o brifysgolion. Mae angen mwy ohonynt. O leiaf gallwn weld yn awr lle y mae ein hadnoddau addysg uwch yn dechrau effeithio'n gadarnhaol ar anghenion yr economi.

Yr ydym yn parhau i drafod gyda chyd-aelodau yn y Trysorlys y posibilrwydd o gael cymhellion treth pellach yn dilyn y datganiad cyn y gyllideb, a greodd lawer o gyfleoedd i Gymru. Diddymwyd toll stamp ar drafodion tir o hyd at £150,000 yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae hynny'n cwmpasu eiddo preswyl ac eiddo busnesau bach yn y 363 o ranbarthau etholiadol yng Nghymru, ac mae 47 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn elwa ar hyn. Addawodd y Trysorlys hefyd y byddai'n ceisio caniatâd cymorth y wladwriaeth gan Ewrop i wella'r eithriad hwnnw.

Mae gennym gynigion hefyd ar gyfer cynllun

investment tax credit scheme to start in the next tax year. We continue to press for regional enhancements to the research and development tax credit, which Phil asked for. We are pushing for a tax incentive to encourage more training by SMEs. Likewise for tax incentives to help urban regeneration companies, such as that which we hope to establish in Newport in the wake of the redundancies at Corus. Within our own powers, we have extended the rural rate relief scheme. Furthermore, we are about to consult on a rate relief scheme for small businesses for which primary legislation would be needed.

Those who believe that there should be a general reduction in payroll or corporation tax in the Objective 1 areas are not living in the real world. However, we can make our firms more competitive. That is why we have programmes such as Accelerate Wales, Source Wales, the garment and textile sourcing programme, the technicians—the first already up and running exceptionally well in Swansea, well above expectations—and the Centres of Excellence for Technology and Industrial Collaboration programme, working in 20 research groups in Welsh academia. We believe that they will have a great spin-off into job creation of that knowledge-economy kind. That addresses leading business sectors including aerospace, automotive, biotechnology, IT and electronics, energy and the environment.

I am pleased to announce that new arrangements for providing financial support to business will be in place from April 2002. The new arrangements are set out in a paper circulated to the Economic Development Committee today, which is based on the report of the task and finish group set up in the spring, and which is also being circulated today. These new arrangements will form an integrated menu or suite of different types of support, geared to the needs of businesses at different stages of their development. Local authorities will make business grants of between £5,000 and £50,000 available—I am not talking about assisted areas, but the whole of Wales—administered by the Assembly Government. Likewise, Finance Wales will

credyd treth buddsoddi yn y gymuned i ddechrau yn y flwyddyn dreth nesaf. Parhawn i bwysu am welliannau rhanbarthol i'r credyd treth ymchwil a datblygu, y gofynnodd Phil amdanynt. Pwyswn am gymhelliant treth i annog mwy o hyfforddiant gan fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint. Yn yr un modd pwyswn am gymhellion treth i helpu cwmnïau ym maes adfywio trefol, fel yr un y gobeithiwn ei sefydlu yng Nghasnewydd yn sgîl y diswyddiadau yn Corus. O fewn ein pwerau ein hunain, yr ydym wedi ymestyn y cynllun cymorth trethi gwledig. At hynny, yr ydym ar fin ymgynghori ar gynllun rhyddhad cymorth trethi ar gyfer busnesau bach y byddai angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar ei gyfer.

Nid yw'r rhai sy'n credu y dylai fod gostyngiad cyffredinol yn y gyflogres neu'r dreth gorfforaeth yn ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn byw yn y byd go iawn. Fodd bynnag, gallwn wneud ein cwmnïau yn fwy cystadleuol. Dyna pam bod gennym raglenni fel Sbardun Cymru, Ffynhonnell Cymru, y rhaglen ffynonellu dillad a thecstilau, y technicians—mae'r gyntaf eisoes ar waith ac yn llwyddiannus iawn yn Abertawe, yn well o lawer na'r disgwyl—a'r Canolfannau Rhagoriaeth ar gyfer Technoleg a'r rhaglen Cydweithio Diwydiannol, gan weithio mewn 20 o grwpiau ymchwil yn y byd academaidd. Credwn y byddant yn sgîl-gynhyrchu swyddi o'r math hwnnw o economi wybodaeth. Mae hynny'n ymdrin â'r prif sectorau busnes gan gynnwys aerofod, modurol, biotechnoleg, TG ac electroneg, ynni a'r amgylchedd.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi y bydd trefniadau newydd ar gyfer darparu cymorth ariannol i fusnesau ar waith erbyn Ebrill 2002. Nodir y trefniadau newydd mewn papur a ddosbarthwyd i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd heddiw, sy'n seiliedig ar adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen a sefydlwyd yn y gwanwyn, ac sydd yn cael ei ddosbarthu heddiw. Bydd y trefniadau newydd hyn yn ffurfio dewislen integredig neu gyfres o fathau gwahanol o gymorth, wedi ei theilwra i anghenion busnesau ar gamau gwahanol o'u datblygiad. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn sicrhau bod grantiau busnes rhwng £5,000 a £50,000 ar gael—nid sôn yr wyf am ardaloedd â chymorth, ond am Gymru gyfan—wedi ei weinyddu gan

continue to offer loans. Linked with the investment support ELWa will be offering support for the training—

Christine Chapman: You mentioned the private sector in business. Will you welcome the innovative projects emerging from the private sector under Objective 1? I draw your attention to one that I visited last week in Ebbw Vale called Streaming Wales. It received a large Objective 1 grant and is a private sector led project. It has involved the private sector from the start, has created high-tech jobs and will be an exciting development for Wales. These are new projects that are starting to emerge through Objective 1.

The First Minister: That hits the mark on three different fronts. The first is Ebbw Vale, which is one of our most difficult areas for job creation. The second is on high technology. The third is that the project is led by the private sector. That is the triple crown. If we have more of such projects spread across Objective 1 Wales, we would all be happy.

Finally, as part of the package of assistance, the support for research and development, and innovation presently provided by smart Wales programmes will be reviewed, redesigned and incorporated into the menu above. Initial provision of £3 million in the budget, for the year starting in April, and £4 million for the year starting in April 2002—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up.

The First Minister: That money will be made available for the new grant scheme, available throughout Wales—not just the assisted areas—in this new £5,000-£50,000 category. I am pleased to announce that as part of our structure today. I will not support Jonathan Morgan's amendments 2 and 3 because our amendment will, in any case, render them obsolete.

Nick Bourne: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan

Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn yr un modd, bydd Cyllid Cymru yn parhau i gynnig benthyciadau. Yn gysylltiedig â'r cymorth buddsoddi bydd ELWa yn cynnig cymorth ar gyfer hyfforddi—

Christine Chapman: Gwnaethoch sôn am y sector preifat mewn busnes. A groesewch y prosiectau arloesol sy'n datblygu yn y sector preifat o dan Amcan 1? Tynnaf eich sylw at un yr ymwelais ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf yng Nglynebwy o'r enw Streaming Wales. Cafodd grant Amcan 1 mawr ac mae'n brosiect a arweinir gan y sector preifat. Mae wedi cynnwys y sector preifat o'r cychwyn, wedi creu swyddi technolegol iawn a bydd yn ddatblygiad cyffrous i Gymru. Prosiectau newydd yw'r rhain sy'n dechrau datblygu drwy Amcan 1.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hwnnw'n taro'r nod ar dair ystyr. Yn gyntaf, Glynebwy, sy'n un o'n hardaloedd anos ar gyfer creu swyddi. Yn ail, technoleg fodern. Y drydedd, bod y prosiect yn cael ei arwain gan y sector preifat. Dyna'r goron driphlyg. Pe bai gennym fwy o brosiectau o'r fath ar draws Amcan 1 Cymru, byddai pob un ohonom yn fodlon.

Yn olaf, fel rhan o'r pecyn cymorth, caiff y cymorth ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu, ac arloesedd a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd gan raglenni cyflym Cymru, ei adolygu, ei ailgynllunio a'i ymgorffori yn y ddewislen uchod. Darpariaeth gychwynnol o £3 miliwn yn y gyllideb, ar gyfer y flwyddyn yn dechrau ym mis Ebrill, a £4 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn yn dechrau ym mis Ebrill 2002—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun grant newydd, ledled Cymru—nid ar gyfer yr ardaloedd a gynorthwyir yn unig—yn y categori £5,000-£50,000 newydd hwn. Mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi hynny fel rhan o'n strwythur heddiw. Ni chefnogaf welliannau 2 a 3 Jonathan Morgan oherwydd bydd ein gwelliant, beth bynnag, yn eu disodli.

Nick Bourne: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant

Morgan. Amendment 2: in point 3 replace 'systematically identify' with:

support private enterprise to identify and develop

I propose amendment 3. In point 4, after 'EU regulations', add:

and the Government of Wales Act

I am happy to support the motion proposed by Plaid Cymru and I thank Phil Williams for saying he will support amendments 2 and 3. I will make a few comments on the general position of the manufacturing industry, and then I will speak about our amendments and fiscal variation, which is key to manufacturing success in Wales. It must be obvious to everyone, despite the First Minister's bluster during last Thursday's short debate—though he seems to exhibit a more refreshing candour today than he exhibited last week—that our manufacturing sector is in recession. That has been acknowledged. I see that the first Minister is indicating that he agrees with that.

The First Minister: I never disagreed with that.

Nick Bourne: You never disagreed with that? Well, that goes on the record. The First Minister indicated last week that only 28 per cent of the Welsh economy was in manufacturing. That is true, statistically, but it still remains a significant part of the Welsh economy. It is significant that, in many areas of Wales, manufacturing is a larger part of the local economy than 28 per cent. I will refer to one or two issues of surveys and trends relating to manufacturing as it is important that we grasp the scale of the problem that we face. The latest *CBI/Business Strategies Regional Trends Survey* shows that, compared with the same quarter last year, we are operating at 41 per cent capacity, our orders are down by 19 per cent, our output is down by 9 per cent and employment prospects are 22 per cent lower. The summary for Wales reads,

2: ym mhwynt 3 dileu 'clustnodi'n systematig', a rhoi:

helpu busnesau preifat i ddarganfod a datblygu

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ym mhwynt 4, ar ôl 'rheoliadau'r UE', ychwanegu:

a Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru

Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig a gynigiwyd gan Blaid Cymru a diolchaf i Phil Williams am ddweud y bydd yn cefnogi gwelliannau 2 a 3. Gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau ar sefyllfa gyffredinol y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, ac yna siaradaf am ein gwelliannau ac amrywiad cyllidol, sy'n allweddol i lwyddiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Rhaid iddo fod yn amlwg i bawb, er gwaethaf arthio'r Prif Weinidog yn ystod y ddadl fer ddydd Iau diwethaf—er ei fod yn ôl pob tebyg, yn arddangos mwy o ddiwyllledd heddiw nag a ddangosodd yr wythnos diwethaf—bod ein sector gweithgynhyrchu mewn dirwasgiad. Cydnabuwyd hynny. Gwelaf fod y Prif Weinidog yn nodi ei fod yn cytuno â hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid anghytunais â hynny erioed.

Nick Bourne: Nid anghytunasoch â hynny erioed? Wel, caiff hynny ei gofnodi. Nododd y Prif Weinidog yr wythnos diwethaf mai dim ond 28 y cant o economi Cymru sydd yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Mae hynny'n wir, yn ystadegol, ond erys yn rhan sylweddol o economi Cymru o hyd. Mae'n arwyddocaol, mewn sawl ardal yng Nghymru, bod gweithgynhyrchu yn rhan fwy o'r economi leol na 28 y cant. Cyfeiriai at un neu ddau o faterion sy'n ymwneud ag arolygon a thueddiadau o ran gweithgynhyrchu gan ei fod yn bwysig ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â maint y broblem a wynebwn. Yn rhifyn diweddaraf y *CBI/Business Strategies Regional Trends Survey* dengys ein bod, o'n cymharu â'r un chwarter y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, yn gweithredu ar gapasiti o 41 y cant, bod ein harchebion wedi gostwng 19 y cant, bod ein hallbwn wedi gostwng 9 y cant a bod ein rhagolygon cyflogaeth 22 y cant yn is. Darllena'r crynodeb ar gyfer Cymru,

‘[o]verall business confidence fell for the fourth consecutive Survey, the fall on this occasion being the largest on record. Export optimism also declined very sharply. Total orders fell quite sharply, after two years of stability. An even steeper decline is expected in the next four months.’

It is important that we address those issues raised in the Confederation of British Industry survey. It is echoed elsewhere. Cardiff Bay’s think tank, Robert Huggins Associates, tells us that competitive performance in Wales has fallen even further behind the rest of the UK. Barclays Bank plc has meanwhile reported that the number of business start-ups is down by 28 per cent, a far greater margin than in the rest of the United Kingdom compared with last year. In the Government of Wales’s own figures, the business birth rate strategy has seen only 1,244 businesses created in the last six months against an annual target of 4,236. I realise that these are sterile statistics, but they underline the importance of today’s debate. The First Minister has often said that we must look at outcomes. Those statistics are based on outcomes in the Welsh economy and it is therefore important that they are addressed by the First Minister, including in his capacity as Minister for Economic Development. As is known, we believe that we would be better able to address these problems if we had two heads addressing them: one as First Minister, and one as Minister for Economic Development.

11:25 a.m.

The forecasting body, Business Strategies Limited, gives figures for the future—if I may look to the future rather than at the present position. It initially forecasts growth for the Welsh economy this year of 1.7 per cent. That has been revised downward to 0.1 per cent—in other words, an almost total standstill. If Welsh GDP per capita is to reach 90 per cent of the UK average—

Glyn Davies: I am currently reading the Business Strategies Limited report, to which you refer. It is much more worrying than you indicate. The fall is in part attributed to the international situation since 11 September.

Mae’n bwysig ein bod yn ymdrin â’r materion hynny a godwyd yn arolwg Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Fe’i hadleisir mewn manau eraill. Dywed pwyllgor ystyried Bae Caerdydd, Robert Huggins Associates wrthym fod perfformiad cystadleuol yng Nghymru wedi gostwng hyd yn oed ymhellach y tu ôl i weddill y DU. Yn y cyfamser mae Banc Barclays ccc wedi nodi bod nifer y busnesau sy’n cychwyn wedi gostwng 28 y cant, gwahaniaeth mwy o lawer nag yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig o’i gymharu â’r llynedd. Yn ôl ffigurau Llywodraeth Cymru ei hun, dim ond 1,244 o fusnesau a grëwyd yn y chwe mis diwethaf yn ôl y strategaeth cyfradd busnesau newydd yn erbyn targed blynyddol o 4,236. Sylweddolaf fod y rhain yn ystadegau diwerth, ond pwysleisiant bwysigrwydd dadl heddiw. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn aml wedi dweud bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar ganlyniadau. Seilir yr ystadegau hynny ar ganlyniadau yn economi Cymru ac felly mae’n bwysig bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymdrin â hwy, gan gynnwys yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Fel y gwyddom, credwn y byddem yn gallu ymdrin â’r problemau hynny yn well pe bae gennym ddau berson yn ymdrin â hwy: un fel Prif Weinidog, ac un fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd.

Rhydd y corff rhagweld, Strategaethau Busnes Cyfyngedig, ffigurau ar gyfer y dyfodol—os caf edrych i’r dyfodol yn hytrach nag ar y sefyllfa bresennol. Mae’n rhagweld twf cychwynnol o 1.7 y cant ar gyfer economi Cymru eleni. Diwygiwyd hynny i lawr i 0.1 y cant—mewn geiriau eraill, mae bron wedi dod i stop. Er mwyn i CMC Cymru y pen gyrraedd 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU—

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn darllen yr adroddiad y cyfeiriwch ato sef Strategaethau Busnes Cyfyngedig ar hyn o bryd. Mae’n achosi mwy o bryder na’r hyn a awgrymwch. Priodolir y gostyngiad yn rhannol i’r sefyllfa

However, the reduction in the whole of Britain was from 2.6 per cent to 2.2 per cent. In Wales, it was from 1.7 per cent to 0.1 per cent. Wales is falling further and further behind the United Kingdom.

Nick Bourne: That point was well made. Barclays Bank also underlined that fact. If Wales is to make the quantum leap to obtain 90 per cent of the UK average GDP per capita by 2010, our annual growth rate must outperform that in England, not underperform it, as we are currently doing. The growth rate needed would probably be between 4 per cent and 5 per cent in Wales, and significantly higher than in the rest of the United Kingdom—for these purposes, that means England, predominantly. The figures show that this is not happening. That is the serious position which we are in.

We cannot support amendment 1, in Andrew Davies's name, relating to the Government's economic development strategy. Having started this process early in the year, we were promised that it would be completed by summer for the budget round. However, it has not yet come before us.

I wish to say something quickly about fiscal variations.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have 40 seconds.

Nick Bourne: It is important that the First Minister, who has said that he has raised this with the Treasury, indicates what fiscal variations he has asked for. It has been accepted by the Treasury now, in relation to stamp duties, so the principle is already there—accept it. We need to know what fiscal variations have been asked for. The minutes of meetings with the Treasury and the Department of Trade and Industry should also be published. We are happy to support the Plaid Cymru motion, subject to support for amendments 2 and 3, which Phil Williams indicated would be given.

Elin Jones: Dechreuaf drwy atgoffa'r Cynulliad am ymrywiad y Llywodraeth yn

ryngwladol ers 11 Medi. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfer Prydain gyfan bu gostyngiad o 2.6 y cant i 2.2 y cant. Yng Nghymru, bu gostyngiad o 1.7 y cant i 0.1 y cant. Mae Cymru yn syrthio ymhellach fyth ar ôl y Deyrnas Unedig.

Nick Bourne: Gwnaethpwyd y pwynt hwnnw'n dda. Amlinellodd Banc Barclays y ffaith honno hefyd. Er mwyn i Gymru wneud y naid cwantwm i gyrraedd 90 y cant o CMC cyfartalog y pen y DU erbyn 2010, rhaid i'n cyfradd dwf flynyddol gyflawni'n well na'r un yn Lloegr, nid tangyflawni, fel y gwnawn ar hyn o bryd. Y gyfradd dwf y byddai ei hangen mae'n debyg fyddai cyfradd rhwng 4 y cant a 5 y cant yng Nghymru, a byddai'n sylweddol uwch nag yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig—at y dibenion hyn, mae hynny'n golygu Lloegr, yn bennaf. Dengys y ffigurau nad yw hyn yn digwydd. Dyna'r sefyllfa ddifrifol yr ydym ynddi.

Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 1, yn enw Andrew Davies, sy'n ymwneud â strategaeth datblygu economaidd y Llywodraeth. Ar ôl dechrau'r broses hon yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn, addawyd y câi ei chwblhau erbyn yr haf ar gyfer cylch y gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, ni ddaeth ger ein bron eto.

Yr wyf am ddweud rhywbeth yn gyflym ynglŷn ag amrywiadau cyllidol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennych 40 eiliad ar ôl.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n bwysig bod y Prif Weinidog, a ddywedodd ei fod wedi codi hyn gyda'r Trysorlys, yn nodi pa amrywiadau cyllidol y gofynnodd amdanynt. Fe'i derbyniwyd gan y Trysorlys yn awr, mewn perthynas â thollau stamp, felly mae'r egwyddor eisoes yno—derbyniwch hi. Mae angen inni wybod pa amrywiadau cyllidol y gofynnwyd amdanynt. Dylid cyhoeddi cofnodion cyfarfodydd gyda'r Trysorlys a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant hefyd. Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi cynnig Plaid Cymru, yn amodol ar gefnogaeth i welliannau 2 a 3, a fyddai'n cael eu rhoi yn ôl awgrym Phil Williams.

Elin Jones: I begin by reminding the Assembly of the Government's commitment

'Gwellcymru.com' i greu strategaeth gyflogaeth fanwl. Yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl amdani. Nid oes amheuaeth mai creu a chynnal swyddi yw un o brif amcanion polisi economaidd llewyrchus, ac mae strategaeth marchnad lafur yn greiddiol i gyflawni hyn. Mae angen adnabod strwythur y farchnad lafur bresennol, rhagweld tueddiadau'r dyfodol ar lefelau lleol a chenedlaethol, a chynllunio ymyrraeth polisi cyhoeddus yn unol â hyn er mwyn creu swyddi cynaliadwy, pwrpasol ar hyd a lled y wlad.

Yn ogystal â thargeddu cyfleon swyddi i wahanol ranbarthau, mae angen targedu grwpiau cymdeithasol economaidd-ddifreintiedig â chynlluniau hyfforddiant penodol. 'Ar dy feic' oedd agwedd Norman Tebbit at swyddi, a olygai unigolion yn crwydro'r wlad yn chwilio am swyddi, ac o'r herwydd yn ansefydlogi cymunedau. Dylem anelu at ddiogelu hawl unigolion i gael cyfleoedd swyddi yn eu cymunedau, neu o fewn cyrraedd eu cymunedau o leiaf. Mae hyn yn bwysig yn ein cymunedau diwydiannol, a'n rhai gwledig. Yn hyn o beth, rhaid cofio pa mor gamarweiniol y gall ystadegau fod ar adegau. Mae lefel diweithdra—y cyfeiriodd Phil Williams ato—yn gymharol isel mewn nifer o ardaloedd gwledig, ond mae nifer y swyddi yn isel hefyd, a chyfleon gwaith a gyrfa yn brin. Arwain hynny at allfudo sylweddol gan bobl ifanc, ac yn y gorllewin, fel y gwyddom oll yr wyf yn siŵr, mae'r symud poblogaeth hwn yn fygythiad real i ddyfodol y Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol.

Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, felly, gyfrifoldeb i ymyrryd i greu swyddi ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Glyn Davies: You make a great point about the 'on your bike' philosophy, suggesting that the previous Government encouraged outmigration in some way. It was the previous Conservative Government that maintained a development board for rural Wales, which for the last 20 years served your constituency well. It was a Labour Government that came in and abolished it.

Elin Jones: Gwnaeth y bwrdd hwnnw fy ngwasanaethu'n dda oherwydd rhoddodd

in 'Betterwales.com' to create a detailed employment strategy. We are still waiting for it. There is no doubt that creating and retaining jobs is one of the main aims of a successful economic policy, and a labour market strategy is crucial to achieving this. We need to identify the structure of the present labour market, anticipate future trends at a local and national level, and plan public policy intervention in keeping with this in order to create sustainable and appropriate jobs across the country.

As well as targeting job opportunities for different regions, we need to target specific training schemes at economically deprived social groups. Norman Tebbit's attitude to jobs was, 'on your bike', which meant that individuals had to roam around the country looking for jobs, which, in turn, destabilised communities. We should aim to safeguard people's rights to job opportunities in their communities, or at least within reach of their communities. This is important in our industrial communities as well as in our rural areas. In this respect, we must remember how misleading statistics can be at times. The level of unemployment—to which Phil Williams referred—is relatively low in several rural areas, but the number of jobs is also low, and job and career opportunities are scarce. That leads to high levels of outmigration of young people, and in west Wales, as I am sure we all know, this population shift is a real threat to the future of Welsh as a community language.

The public sector and the Assembly Government, therefore, have a responsibility to intervene to create jobs in all parts of Wales.

Glyn Davies: Gwnewch bwynt da iawn ynglŷn â'r athroniaeth 'ar dy feic' gan awgrymu bod y Llywodraeth flaenorol wedi annog allfudo mewn rhyw ffordd. Y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol fu'n cynnal bwrdd datblygu ar gyfer Cymru wledig a wasanaethodd eich etholaeth yn dda am yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Llywodraeth Lafur ddaeth i rym a'i ddi-ddymu.

Elin Jones: That board served me well because it gave me a job working directly for

swydd i fi lle yr oeddwn yn gweithio'n uniongyrchol i'r bwrdd datblygu yn fy nghymuned yn y Gorllewin. Mae hefyd wedi gwasanaethu Glyn yn dda. Efallai, dylai'r ddau ohonom ddatgan buddiant ar hynny.

Un o brif broblemau Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig oedd yr anhawster a gafodd wrth greu swyddi yng ngorllewin y Canolbarth. Yr oedd yn rhwydd yn y Trallwng a'r Drenewydd ond yn anodd mewn lleoedd fel Aberteifi, Llandysul a Dolgellau.

Fodd bynnag, croesawaf ymgynghoriad y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar adleoli swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil o Gaerdydd. Anogaf y Gweinidog, yn ei habsenoldeb, i ystyried o ddifrif ddychwelyd yr adran amaeth i Aberystwyth, er enghraifft, a chreu canolfannau eraill y gwasanaeth sifil ar hyd a lled y wlad. Byddai hynny'n gyfraniad pwysig.

Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau bod ein polisiau economaidd yn gynaliadwy. Hoffwn weld archwiliad cynaliadwyedd llawn o'r strategaeth economaidd, ac mae hyn ar goll o strategaeth y Llywodraeth. Mae ei strategaeth yn methu â deall y berthynas rhwng yr economi a'r amgylchedd. Yng Nghymru, mae'n rhaid inni ddatblygu a defnyddio dangosyddion amgen a datblygu mynegai o les economaidd cynaliadwy.

Ar y cyfan, nid yw CMC yn fynegai addas i asesu ein hymrwymiad statudol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Dylai'r angen i greu cymunedau cynaliadwy, ar sail economaidd, cymdeithasol, amgylcheddol ac ieithyddol ymhob rhan o Gymru fod yn greiddiol i'n gweledigaeth economaidd.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I will concentrate on what is either underplayed in or missing from the Plaid Cymru motion. I am surprised that it has omitted some significant issues. I am sure that Phil Williams will want to comment on those later. The key issue is that we must provide support for our own businesses, as well as encourage those who seek inward

the development agency in my own community in west Wales. It also served Glyn well. Perhaps, we should both declare an interest in relation to that.

One of the main problems that faced the Development Board for Rural Wales was the difficulty that it had in creating jobs in the western part of mid Wales. It was easy in Welshpool and Newtown, but difficult in areas such as Cardigan, Llandysul and Dolgellau.

However, I welcome the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities' consultation on relocating civil service jobs from Cardiff. I encourage the Minister, in her absence, to give serious consideration to returning the agriculture department to Aberystwyth, for example, and to create other civil service centres throughout the country. That would be an important contribution.

We must also ensure that our economic policies are sustainable. I would like to see a full sustainability audit of the economic strategy. This is missing from the Government's strategy. Its strategy fails to understand the relationship between the economy and the environment. In Wales, we must develop and use alternative indicators and develop an index of sustainable economic welfare.

GDP is not, on the whole, a suitable index for assessing our statutory commitment to sustainable development. The need to create sustainable communities on a social, economic, environmental and linguistic basis in every part of Wales should be at the core of our economic vision.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Canolbwytiaf ar yr hyn a fychenir neu sydd ar goll yng nghynnig Plaid Cymru. Synnaf iddi hepgor rhai materion pwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Phil Williams am roi sylwadau arnynt yn ddiweddarach. Yr hyn sy'n allweddol yw bod yn rhaid inni ddarparu cefnogaeth i'n busnesau ein hunain, yn ogystal ag annog y rheini sy'n ceisio

investment—one must not downplay that. However, we must undertake some significant tasks to encourage our existing companies to grow and move up the value chain. Those policies are essential and they are missing from this motion. For example, it would be unlikely for Phil the butcher to stay up all night in Wales analysing the flexible labour market policies of the Czech Republic and then decide to relocate his business there. Therefore, in terms of stability, it is important that we encourage these policies.

The second aspect, which is missing from the motion, relates to point 2 on ‘ambitious targets’. I accept that we must set ambitious targets for renewable energy. However, should we not set ambitious targets for the economic development of Wales as a whole? Should we not be ambitious for the whole of Wales and not simply for those areas to which you referred?

Phil Williams: The motion summarises the evidence that we submitted, which concentrated on what we thought were additions to the draft strategy. Indeed, we covered all parts of Wales in our assessment, including Cardiff. I simply concentrated on some of them in a short speech.

Michael German: I am grateful for that clarification, because you have set out your other priorities in the motion. Another priority that is not included is how we develop supply chains. If we are to assist companies to stay and develop in Wales, we must work with our supply chains. I want to mention, in particular, the success of Accelerate Wales, which, as you know, has assisted companies to grow and develop. It has also provided assistance to companies that have relocated outside Wales, but are being supplied by Welsh companies.

I note that you talk about the international context. I also note that the partnership Government has undertaken this work. You know that there are significant new measures in support of WalesTrade International and the Economic Development Committee heard

mewnfuddsoddiad—ni ddylai rhywun fychanu hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ymgymryd â rhai tasgau o bwys i annog ein cwmnïau presennol i dyfu a symud i fyny'r gadwyn gwerthoedd. Mae'r polisiau hynny'n hanfodol ac maent ar goll yn y cynnig hwn. Er enghraifft, mae'n annhebyg y byddai Phil y cigydd yn aros ar ei draed drwy'r nos yng Nghymru yn dadansoddi polisiau marchnad lafur hyblyg Gweriniaeth Tsiec ac yn penderfynu wedyn adleoli ei fusnes yno. Felly, o ran sefydlogrwydd, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn annog y polisiau hyn.

Mae'r ail agwedd, sydd ar goll yn y cynnig, yn ymwneud â phwynt 2 ar ‘dargedau uchelgeisiol’. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni osod targedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Fodd bynnag, oni ddylem osod targedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer datblygu Cymru gyfan yn economaidd? Oni ddylem fod yn uchelgeisiol ar gyfer Cymru gyfan ac nid ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hynny y cyfeiriwch atynt yn unig?

Phil Williams: Mae'r cynnig yn crynhoi'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynasom, a ganolbwyntiodd ar yr hyn a oedd yn ychwanegiadau i'r strategaeth ddrafft yn ein tyb ni. Yn wir, cwmpaswyd pob rhan o Gymru gennym yn ein hasesiad, gan gynnwys Caerdydd. Dim ond ar rai ohonynt y canolbwyntiais mewn araith fer.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr eglurhad hwnnw, oherwydd yr ydych wedi nodi eich blaenoriaethau eraill yn y cynnig. Un flaenoriaeth arall nas cynhwyswyd yw'r modd y datblygwn gadwynau cyflenwi. Er mwyn helpu cwmnïau i aros yng Nghymru a datblygu, rhaid inni weithio gyda'n cadwynau cyflenwi. Hoffwn sôn, yn benodol, am lwyddiant Sbardun Cymru, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, wedi helpu cwmnïau i dyfu a datblygu. Mae hefyd wedi darparu cymorth i gwmnïau sydd wedi adleoli y tu allan i Gymru, ond a gyflenwir gan gwmnïau Cymreig.

Nodaf eich bod yn sôn am y cyd-destun rhyngwladol. Nodaf hefyd fod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn. Gwyddoch fod mesurau newydd o bwys sy'n gefnogol i Masnach Cymru Rhyngwladol a chlywodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd

from it about its successes. You know that the Welsh Development Agency has had additional resources for internationalisation. The whole concept of how Wales is represented overseas is now being reconsidered.

A particular success, which needs to be mentioned, is the Wales Tourist Board. Its budget increased to about £35 million from a budget of £14 million in the previous year. That puts it well ahead of what the Scottish can achieve with VisitScotland. Therefore, it makes tourism central to the growth of our economy.

The First Minister has mentioned what we are considering with regards to fiscal variations. Despite all that I hear from the Conservatives, that was not in the Conservative general election manifesto. I looked hard for it; it was not there. Therefore, perhaps those who shout loudest about that should ensure that they have their own party's support on the matter.

I also notice that the important issue of the euro is missing from the motion. I notice that David Davies is not here today and will assist him by letting him have some copies of this important document that I have in my hand. I note that in our last debate on the national economic development strategy, which was tabled by the Conservatives, David Davies enlightened us on his great knowledge of European affairs. He argued that Finland has experienced economic success because it is presently outside the European Union and has no intention of joining the euro. I am sure that we all remember that. It is particularly interesting as Finland joined the European Union in 1995 and is part of the European single currency. Therefore, we know that David's grasp of economics appears to be equal to his grasp of geo-politics and European affairs.

This motion adds little to the development of economic strategy. We have heard about the welcomed news of assistance to business, not just in the Objective 1 assisted areas, but in the non-assisted areas of Wales, from the First Minister today. Businesses in Powys, Wrexham and Monmouthshire, in particular,

ganddo ynglŷn â'i lwyddiant. Gwyddoch fod Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi cael adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer rhyngwladoli. Ailystyriar ar hyn o bryd y modd y cynrychiolir Cymru dramor.

Un llwyddiant penodol, y mae angen ei grybwyll, yw Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Cynyddodd ei gyllideb tua £35 miliwn o gyllideb o £14 miliwn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Mae hynny'n golygu ei fod yn rhagori llawer ar yr hyn y gall yr Alban ei gyflawni gyda VisitScotland. Felly, gwna dwristiaeth yn ganolog i dwf ein heconomi.

Soniodd Prif Weinidog Cymru am yr hyn a ystyriwn o ran amrywiadau cyllidol. Er gwaethaf popeth a glywais ganddynt, nid oedd hynny ym maniffestro etholiad cyffredinol y Ceidwadwyr. Edrychais yn galed amdano, ond nid oedd yno. Felly, efallai y dylai'r rheini sy'n gwneud y sŵn mwyaf sicrhau bod eu plaid eu hunain yn eu cefnogi ar y mater hwn.

Sylwaf hefyd fod mater pwysig yr ewro yn absennol o'r cynnig. Sylwaf nad yw David Davies yma heddiw ac fe'i cynorthwyaf drwy adael iddo gael rhai copïau o'r ddogfen bwysig hon sydd gennyf yn fy llaw. Nodaf i David Davies ein goleuo ar ei wybodaeth fawr am faterion Ewropeaidd yn ein dadl ddiwethaf ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Dadleuodd fod gan y Ffindir brofiad o lwyddiant economaidd gan ei bod ar hyn o bryd y tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac nid yw'n bwriadu ymuno â'r ewro. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pob un ohonom yn cofio hynny. Mae'n arbennig o ddiddorol oherwydd ymunodd y Ffindir â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn 1995 ac mae'n rhan o arian sengl Ewrop. Felly gwyddom fod gafael David ar economeg yn ymddangos gystal â'i afael ar geo-wleidyddiaeth a materion Ewropeaidd.

Nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn ychwanegu fawr ddim at ddatblygu strategaeth economaidd. Clywsom y newyddion da am gymorth i fusnesau, nid yn ardaloedd Amcan 1 a gynorthwyir yn unig, ond yn ardaloedd Cymru nas cynorthwyir, gan Brif Weinidog Cymru heddiw. Bydd busnesau ym Mhowys,

will now be able to access that grant aid of up to £50,000, putting them at a significant advantage compared to their English neighbours across the border. I am pleased to hear that announcement.

Plaid Cymru's motion today adds little to the process that is already in train. I note its ambition—if you read the motion carefully—to rid Britain of the Treasury and its macro-economic policy making. However, that is perhaps more in line with the independent status that it is seeking for Wales. I agree, however, that skilful use of intelligence to obtain sector specificity is important. That is what has happened with the private sector. It is driving us forward in the motor vehicle component and electronics sectors, which have been supported by the industry and are driving that change themselves. I agree that that is an important issue, however, it needs to be spelt out more carefully. The Government cannot be choosing the winners, the sectors themselves must come forward with that intelligence. On that basis, this motion does not add anything to the process that is already in train and the national economic development strategy, which we will debate next week, will seek the answer to that.

Geraint Davies: I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. An effective economic development strategy that will bring prosperity to Wales must be based on the concept of regional targets. The south Wales Valleys will benefit more than anywhere in the country. The problems that we face in the Valleys are well documented, namely low activity levels in every valley authority, a GDP per capita of only 62 per cent of the European average, life expectancy of five years less than the EU average, low qualifications and the highest proportion of unfit housing in Wales. That is the legacy that we have inherited as a result of decades of neglect by successive Labour and Tory Governments. These Valleys' communities offer huge potential—releasing it is the key to the Wales's economic progress. It is the challenge that faces a truly national economic development strategy.

Wrecsam a Sir Fynwy, yn arbennig, yn awr yn gallu manteisio ar y cymorth grant hwnnw o hyd at £50,000, a fydd o fantais fawr iddynt o'u cymharu â'u cymdogion ar draws y ffin yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y cyhoeddiad hwnnw.

Nid yw cynnig Plaid Cymru heddiw yn ychwanegu fawr ddim at y broses sydd eisoes ar waith. Nodaf ei huchelgais—os darllenwch y cynnig yn ofalus—i waredu Prydain rhag y Trysorlys a'i bolisiau macro-economaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny efallai yn fwy cyson â'r statws annibynnol y mae'n ei geisio ar gyfer Cymru. Cytunaf, fodd bynnag, fod defnyddio gwybodaeth yn fedrus er mwyn cael penodoldeb sectorau yn bwysig. Dyna sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r sector preifat. Mae'n ein datblygu yn y sectorau cydrannau cerbydau modur ac electroneg, a gefnogwyd gan y diwydiant ac sy'n cyflwyno'r newid hwnnw eu hunain. Cytunaf fod hynny'n fater pwysig, fodd bynnag, mae angen ei egluro yn ofalus. Ni all y Llywodraeth ddewis yr enillwyr, rhaid i'r sectorau eu hunain gynnig y wybodaeth honno. Ar y sail honno, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn ychwanegu unrhyw beth at y broses honno sydd eisoes ar waith a bydd y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol y cynhaliwn ddadl arni yr wythnos nesaf, yn ceisio ateb i hynny.

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'n rhaid i strategaeth datblygu economaidd a ddaw â ffyniant i Gymru fod yn seiliedig ar gysyniad targedau rhanbarthol. Bydd Cymoedd de Cymru yn elwa mwy ar hyn nag unman arall yng Nghymru. Rhoddwyd cryn sylw i'r problemau a wynebwn yn y Cymoedd, sef lefelau gweithgaredd isel ym mhob awdurdod, CMC y pen o ddim ond 62 y cant o gyfartaledd Ewrop, disgwyliad oes o bum mlynedd yn llai na chyfartaledd yr UE, cymwysterau gwael a'r gyfran uchaf o dai anaddas yng Nghymru. Dyna'r hyn a etifeddwyd gennym o ganlyniad i ddegawdau o esgeulustod gan Lywodraethau Llafur a Thorïaidd olynol. Cynigia'r cymunedau hyn yn y Cymoedd bosibiliadau mawr—eu rhyddhau yw'r allwedd i gynnydd economaidd Cymru. Dyma'r her sy'n wynebu strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol wirioneddol.

What do the Valleys need? Piecemeal initiatives will do nothing, history has shown us that. We need a polycentric strategy that will draw together and develop our geographic, cultural and social infrastructures. We need to ensure that spatial targeting for areas of deprivation is integrated into every initiative. Communities First is a good start. However, it needs to be extended into all schemes. As an Assembly, we should also encourage Assembly sponsored public bodies to incorporate spatial targeting into their programmes.

We need an integrated strategy to simplify the present funding maze. We have to place available funding into one pot and do away with the present confusion. Rhondda Cynon Taff's Communities First bid is hoping to take the lead in that. We plan to establish one central development fund that will be of use to all groups that receive Communities First funding.

Regionally balanced job creation will be at the core of Plaid Cymru's economic development strategy. Around 41,000 jobs are needed just to bring the south-east Valleys' employment rate up to the UK average. Add to that the shortfall in the Swansea bay area, and we are talking about a need for over 60,000 jobs.

11:35 a.m.

We also need to improve training and key skills, and open people's horizons, not so that they can move elsewhere, but so that they can begin to see that they have a future in their communities. We must strive to keep our best people here and we can only do that by offering a secure future with good quality employment opportunities. As well as developing an information and communications technology programme, we need to invest greatly in our road and rail infrastructure, which currently actively discourages and prohibits people from fulfilling their employment potential. That must be a priority, if people in the Valleys are to be mobile to take advantage of career and training opportunities.

Beth sydd ei angen ar y Cymoedd? Ni wnaiff mentrau tameidiog ddim, mae hanes wedi profi hynny. Mae angen strategaeth luosganolog a fydd yn tynnu ynghyd ac yn datblygu ein seilweithiau daearyddol, diwylliannol a chymdeithasol. Mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff proses dargeddu ofodol ar gyfer ardaloedd amddifadedd ei hintegreiddio ym mhob menter. Mae Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn ddechrau da. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ei hymestyn i bob cynllun. Fel Cynulliad, dylem hefyd annog cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad i ymgorffori targedu gofodol yn eu rhaglenni.

Mae angen strategaeth integredig arnom i symleiddio'r ddrysfa ariannu bresennol. Rhaid inni roi'r arian sydd ar gael mewn un gronfa a dileu'r dryswch presennol. Mae cais Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gobeithio bod ar flaen y gad yn hynny o beth. Bwriadwn sefydlu un gronfa ddatblygu ganolog a fydd o ddefnydd i bob grŵp sy'n cael arian Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.

Bydd creu swyddi a sicrhau cydbwysedd rhanbarthol wrth wraidd strategaeth datblygu economaidd Plaid Cymru. Mae angen tua 41,000 o swyddi yn ne-ddwyrain y Cymoedd i gyfateb â chyfartaledd y DU. Ychwanegwch y prinder swyddi yn ardal bae Abertawe, ac mae angen dros 60,000 o swyddi arnom.

Mae angen inni hefyd wella hyfforddiant a sgiliau allweddol, a lledu gorwelion pobl, nid fel y gallant symud i rywle arall, ond fel y gallant ddechrau gweld bod ganddynt ddyfodol yn eu cymunedau. Rhaid inni ymdrechu i gadw ein pobl orau yma a dim ond drwy gynnig dyfodol sicr gyda chyfleoedd cyflogaeth o ansawdd da y gallwn wneud hynny. Yn ogystal â datblygu rhaglen technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, mae angen inni fuddsoddi llawer yn ein seilwaith ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn atal pobl rhag cyflawni eu potensial o ran cyflogaeth ac mewn gwirionedd yn eu hannog i beidio â'i gyflawni. Rhaid i hynny fod yn flaenoriaeth, er mwyn i bobl yn y Cymoedd allu teithio i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd o ran gyrfaedd a hyfforddiant.

Plaid Cymru's alternative economic strategy recognises that different areas of Wales require different solutions. We have seen the positive impact of the rural taskforce on the Objective 1 programme in rural areas. Consider the impact that an urban counterpart could have. That is why Plaid Cymru is so committed to developing a comprehensive and co-ordinated strategy that is geared uniquely towards the Valleys' needs, why it speaks for the Valleys, and is the only party calling for a Minister for the Valleys.

It is easy to be negative and to disparage Government strategies. Certainly, the previous drafts of the national economic development strategy have given us little hope for the future economic prosperity of Wales as a whole, and even less in terms of addressing the needs of the Valleys. However, Plaid Cymru is offering an alternative. We have drawn up an economic development strategy that addresses the needs of the whole of Wales, particularly the Valleys.

Glyn Davies: I thank Plaid Cymru and Phil Williams for tabling this debate. I will make a short contribution that will be critical of the Government of Wales. That is not an wholly surprising ambition for an opposition AM, but perhaps the more surprising ambition is that I expect to make a speech with which most Labour AMs will agree.

All of us have ideas about what we consider to be the most important functions to have been devolved to the Assembly. Obvious portfolios are healthcare, education and the environment, but, in my view, the Assembly's most important job, on which it will be judged, is management of the Welsh economy. Most of the economic levers that shape the framework within which economic development functions are carried out have not been devolved. However, the Assembly has a crucial role and the Government of Wales is making a poor fist of it.

It is the importance of economic development that leads opposition Members to make such an issue of the two-jobs-Morgan factor. We

Cydnabu strategaeth economaidd amgen Plaid Cymru fod angen atebion gwahanol ar ardaloedd gwahanol o Gymru. Gwelsom yr effaith gadarnhaol a gafodd y tasglu gwledig ar raglen Amcan 1 mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ystyriwch yr effaith y gallai tasglu trefol ei chael. Dyna pam y mae Plaid Cymru mor ymrwymedig i ddatblygu strategaeth gynhwysfawr a chydgyssylltiedig sydd wedi ei theilwra mor unigryw i anghenion y Cymoedd, pam ei bod yn gweithredu fel llais y Cymoedd, a pham mai dyma'r unig blaid sy'n galw am Weinidog dros y Cymoedd.

Mae'n hawdd bod yn negyddol a dibrisio strategaethau'r Llywodraeth. Yn sicr, nid yw drafftiau blaenorol y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol wedi rhoi llawer o obaith inni ar gyfer ffyniant economaidd Cymru gyfan yn y dyfodol, a hyd yn oed llai o ran ymdrin ag anghenion y Cymoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae Plaid Cymru yn cynnig dewis amgen. Yr ydym wedi llunio strategaeth datblygu economaidd sy'n ymdrin ag anghenion Cymru gyfan, yn enwedig y Cymoedd.

Glyn Davies: Diolchaf i Blaid Cymru ac i Phil Williams am gyflwyno'r ddatl hon. Gwnaf gyfraniad byr a fydd yn feirniadol o Lywodraeth Cymru. Nid yw hynny'n uchelgais hollol annisgwyl i Aelod o wrthblaid yn y Cynulliad, ond efallai mai'r uchelgais mwy annisgwyl yw y rhoddaf araith y bydd y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn cytuno â hi.

Mae gan bob un ohonom syniadau ynglŷn â'r swyddogaethau pwysicaf yn ein barn ni a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad. Portffolios amlwg yw gofal iechyd, addysg a'r amgylchedd, ond yn fy marn ni, swydd bwysicaf y Cynulliad, y caiff ei farnu arni, yw rheoli economi Cymru. Ni ddatganolwyd eto y rhan fwyaf o'r liferi economaidd sy'n llunio'r fframwaith y cyflawnir swyddogaethau datblygu economaidd ynddi. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y Cynulliad rôl holl bwysig ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud gwaith gwael wrth wneud hynny.

Pwysigrwydd datblygu economaidd sy'n gwneud i Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau roi cymaint o sylw i'r ddwy swydd sydd gan

will continue to press for an early end to that wholly unsatisfactory situation. Although there is an element of opposition towards our campaign, I do not think that there is a Member here, or watching this on television in his or her office, who does not now think it absolutely bizarre that the First Minister has declared his own job part-time and taken on another job—the Minister for Economic Development—as a part-time extra job. Those are the two most important jobs in terms of the Assembly's future and the First Minister has elected to undertake both. There is no-one left, except for those occupying the Liberal Democrat seats, who is not totally exasperated by the continuing two-jobs-Morgan saga, and it will not be long before every business in Wales and every person who wishes this Assembly well agrees with them.

Peter Rogers: As well as those two jobs, he is also responsible for co-ordination of Government policy in north Wales, which is also important.

Glyn Davies: That was an excellent intervention, Peter. It beggars belief that the Assembly's reputation and the future of the Welsh economy should be compromised by the stubbornness of the First Minister, who is determined to dance to the Liberal Democrats' tune. Another issue on which the Government of Wales has been letting us down, is in the development of the national economic development strategy. I am no fan of the concept of a great detailed national economic plan, but a basic economic development strategy should have been the first priority of the newly elected Government of Wales in 1999—almost three years ago.

There is disagreement over the draft plan, as there has been over all the draft plans that we have seen so far. I have seen this in Committee. However, there is no excuse for delay on this scale. It is inevitable that opposition Assembly Members will see this as an obsession with process, using consultation as an excuse to avoid taking decisions, and replacing action with activity. These are the signs of an indecisive Government, afraid of taking difficult decisions.

Rhodri Morgan. Byddwn yn parhau i bwysu ar i'r sefyllfa anfoddfa honno ddod i ben yn fuan. Er bod elfen o wrthwynebiad tuag at ein hymgyrch, ni chredaf fod Aelod yma, neu Aelod sy'n gwyllo hyn ar y teledu yn ei swyddfa, nad yw o'r farn ei fod yn hollol ryfedd bod y Prif Weinidog wedi datgan mai swydd ran amser sydd ganddo a'i fod wedi ymgymryd â swydd arall—y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd—fel swydd ychwanegol ran amser. Dyna'r ddwy swydd bwysicaf o ran dyfodol y Cynulliad ac mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dewis gwneud y ddwy. Erbyn hyn, mae pawb, ar wahân i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi hen ddiflasu ar y saga barhaus am Rhodri a'i ddwy swydd, a chyn bo hir bydd pob busnes yng Nghymru a phob person sy'n dymuno'n dda i'r Cynulliad yn cytuno â hwy.

Peter Rogers: Yn ogystal â'r ddwy swydd honno, mae'n gyfrifol hefyd am gydgysylltu polisi'r Llywodraeth yn y gogledd, sy'n bwysig hefyd.

Glyn Davies: Yr oedd hynny'n ymyriad rhagorol, Peter. Mae'n anodd credu bod enw da y Cynulliad a dyfodol economi Cymru yn cael ei beryglu gan ystyfnigrwydd Prif Weinidog Cymru, sy'n benderfynol o gael ei arwain gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Un mater arall lle y cawsom ein siomi gan Lywodraeth Cymru yw ar fater datblygu strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Nid wyf o blaid y cysyniad o gynllun economaidd cenedlaethol manwl iawn, ond dylai strategaeth datblygu economaidd sylfaenol fod wedi cael ei phennu yn flaenoriaeth gyntaf Llywodraeth Cymru pan gafodd ei hethol yn 1999—bron dair blynedd yn ôl.

Mae anghytundeb ynglŷn â'r cynllun drafft, fel y bu gyda'r holl gynlluniau drafft a welsom hyd yn hyn. Gwelais hyn yn y Pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n esgus dros oedi i'r graddau hyn. Mae'n anochel y bydd Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn ystyried hyn yn obsesiwn gyda phroses, gan ddefnyddio ymgynghori fel esgus i beidio â gwneud penderfyniadau, ac arddel gweithgaredd yn lle gweithredu. Dyma arwyddion Llywodraeth amhendiant, sy'n ofni gwneud penderfyniadau anodd.

I also want to comment on the misleading nature of the national economic development plan's preparation. It was suggested that fiscal variation was to play a significant part in developing Wales's economy. I would have welcomed that, but I never believed that it would be so. Any fiscal variation would not be branded as state aid, was always to be minor, and would probably also be applicable to all other parts of Britain, thereby immediately diluting any beneficial impact.

Another example of the strategy's misleading nature is that it is based on a gross domestic product profile that is hopelessly unachievable. There is nothing wrong with ambition; I am in favour of ambitious targets, and I would not criticise a government that does not achieve ambitious targets. However, the GDP targets are not ambitious; they are laughably unrealistic and totally incredible, particularly when most of the trends are negative rather than positive—Nick Bourne mentioned many of them. There is also no suggestion of where the finance is to come from to underpin this claim that Wales will dramatically outperform every other part of Britain.

I believe that Wales can perform well economically, and I believe that the Assembly can play an important part in that. In my more contemplative moments, I think how successful Wales could be economically if we were to have a Conservative Government both here in the Assembly and in Westminster.

Brian Gibbons: I will speak in favour of amendment 1. We all recognise that the Welsh and the British economy is facing a period of great challenge, and our ability to meet the ambitious targets for job creation and prosperity in Wales will be conditional on our ability to weather the present international situation.

There seems to be a general agreement that the UK economy and the economy of Wales has survived relatively well to date. Unemployment is at 3.6 per cent—a record

Yr wyf am roi fy sylwadau hefyd ar natur gamarweiniol gwaith paratoi'r cynllun datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol. Awgrymwyd y byddai amrywiad cyllidol yn chwarae rhan fawr wrth ddatblygu economi Cymru. Byddwn wedi croesawu hynny, ond ni chredais erioed y byddai felly. Ni fyddai unrhyw amrywiad cyllidol yn cael ei ystyried yn gymorth y wladwriaeth, byddai bob amser yn fach ac mae'n debyg y byddai hefyd yn gymwys i bob rhan arall o Brydain, a fyddai'n gwanhau unrhyw effaith fuddiol ar unwaith.

Un enghraifft arall o natur gamarweiniol y strategaeth yw ei bod yn seiliedig ar broffil cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth nad oes gobaith ei gyflawni. Nid oes dim o'i le ar uchelgais; yr wyf o blaid targedau uchelgeisiol, ac ni fyddwn yn beirniadu llywodraeth nad yw'n cyrraedd targedau uchelgeisiol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r targedau CMC yn uchelgeisiol; maent yn chwethinllyd o afrealistig ac yn hollol anghredadwy, yn arbennig pan fo'r rhan fwyaf o'r tueddiadau yn negyddol yn hytrach na chadarnhaol—soniodd Nick Bourne am lawer ohonynt. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym ychwaith o ble y daw'r arian i ategu'r honiad hwn y bydd Cymru yn cyflawni'n well o lawer nag unrhyw ran arall o Brydain.

Credaf y gall Cymru gyflawni'n well yn economaidd, a chredaf y gall y Cynulliad chwarae rhan bwysig yn hynny. Ar adegau o fyfyrdod, meddyliaf pa mor llwyddiannus y gallai Cymru fod yn economaidd pe bai gennym Lywodraeth Geidwadol yma yn y Cynulliad ac yn San Steffan.

Brian Gibbons: Siaradaf o blaid gwelliant 1. Mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod bod economi Cymru a Phrydain yn wynebu cyfnod o her fawr, a bydd ein gallu i gyrraedd targedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer creu swyddi a ffyniant yng Nghymru yn amodol ar ein gallu i ddod drwy'r sefyllfa ryngwladol bresennol.

Ymddengys fod cytundeb cyffredinol bod economi'r DU ac economi Cymru wedi goroesi'n gymharol dda hyd yn hyn. Mae diweithdra yn 3.6 y cant—yr isaf erioed; mae

low; pay levels are increasing by 4 per cent in Wales, compared to the Great Britain average of 2 per cent—a 50 to 60 per cent greater increase in Wales; and the latest figures on unfilled vacancies show an increase in Wales of 4 per cent, compared to a small decline in the United Kingdom. Service and construction employment in Wales has increased by 18 per cent since 1997, but unfortunately, over the same period, employment in manufacturing has declined by approximately 5 to 6 per cent. The loss of these 12,000 jobs in manufacturing is serious because manufacturing is a highly-paid, highly-productive sector with strong linkages into the indigenous economy of Wales, which we cannot readily afford to lose.

Despite this, Wales's relatively good position was unlikely to have been so had we followed the advice given to the Chancellor of the Exchequer by the opposition in the National Assembly. Had we followed that advice we might have had a bigger boom over the last few years, but it is also more than likely that we would now be on the road to the big bust that is currently happening in the world economy, especially in countries such as the United States and Japan.

Statistics show that Welsh GDP per capita is progressing on a course parallel to the overall United Kingdom GDP per capita, and consequently we are not fulfilling our objective of narrowing the gap between the two. However, we need to bear in mind the international context. The GDP per capita growth in Germany is 0.3 per cent with pay increases of 2.1 per cent, compared with 4 per cent in Wales. The GDP per capita growth in the Netherlands is 0.4 per cent, with an income growth of 3.4 per cent compared with 4 per cent in Wales. In Japan there is negative growth with a 1.5 per cent increase in pay compared with 4 per cent in Wales. In the USA there is 0.8 per cent growth compared with the situation in the United Kingdom.

11:45 a.m.

While the goal of narrowing the UK GDP per

cyflogau yn cynyddu 4 y cant yng Nghymru, o'u cymharu â chyfartaledd Prydain Fawr o 2 y cant—cynnydd o 50 i 60 y cant yn fwy yng Nghymru; a dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf ar swyddi gwag nas llenwyd gynnydd yng Nghymru o 4 y cant, o'i gymharu â gostyngiad bach yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae cyflogaeth ym maes gwasanaethau ac adeiladu yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 18 y cant ers 1997, ond yn anffodus, yn ystod yr un cyfnod, mae cyflogaeth ym maes gweithgynhyrchu wedi gostwng tua 5 i 6 y cant. Mae colli'r 12,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu hyn yn fater difrifol oherwydd mae gweithgynhyrchu yn sector cynhyrchiol iawn gyda chyflogau uchel a chysylltiadau cryf ag economi gynhenid Cymru, sef rhywbeth na allwn fforddio ei golli.

Er gwaethaf hyn, mae'n annhebyg y byddai Cymru yn y sefyllfa gymharol dda hon pe baem wedi dilyn y cyngor a roddwyd i Ganghellor y Trysorlys gan yr wrthblaid yn y nnulliad Cenedlaethol. Pe baem wedi dilyn y cyngor hwnnw efallai y byddem wedi cael hyd yn oed mwy o lwyddiant dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, ond mae hefyd yn fwy tebygol y byddem yn awr yn wynebu methiant mawr fel sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn economi'r byd, yn enwedig mewn gwledydd fel yr Unol Daleithiau a Japan.

Dengys ystadegau fod CMC y pen yng Nghymru yn datblygu ochr yn ochr â CMC y pen y Deyrnas Unedig yn gyffredinol, ac o ganlyniad nid ydym yn cyflawni ein hamcan o gau'r gagendor rhwng y ddau. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gadw mewn cof y cyd-destun rhyngwladol. Twf CMC y pen yr Almaen yw 0.3 y cant gyda chodiadau cyflog o 2.1 y cant, o'i gymharu â 4 y cant yng Nghymru. Twf CMC y pen yr Iseldiroedd yw 0.4 y cant, gyda thwf incwm o 3.4 y cant o'i gymharu â 4 y cant yng Nghymru. Yn Japan, mae twf negyddol gyda chynnydd o 1.5 y cant mewn cyflogau o'i gymharu â 4 y cant yng Nghymru. Yn UDA mae twf o 0.8 y cant o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

Er bod y nod o gau'r gagendor o ran CMC y

capita gap is a legitimate one—and we should be striving towards it—the more fundamental aim must be to improve the situation in absolute terms for the people of Wales. We are performing well on an international scale, but people focus too much on the comparative situation vis-à-vis the rest of the United Kingdom and not on the relative position of five, six and seven years ago when unemployment rates were at 5, 6, 7 and 8 per cent.

Glyn Davies: I agree with much of what you say, Brian, but do you not accept that it contradicts the First Minister's national economic development strategy? That maintains that we should focus on the relative position within Britain. The whole strategy is based on that and you undermine it.

Brian Gibbons: Had you been listening and if you care to look—

Glyn Davies: I was listening.

Brian Gibbons: If you would care to read the record, I said that narrowing the UK GDP per capita gap is a legitimate objective. However, we must not focus on that to the extent that we do not acknowledge the relative international performance of Wales compared with other countries and the improvement that has occurred over time in terms of money in people's pockets and jobs. If we only concentrate on one measure—the comparative performance vis-à-vis the UK—then we ignore the tremendous progress that has been made in the economy in Wales. That is obvious to anyone who walks down a street in Wales.

Dafydd Wigley: Datganaf fuddiant fel cyfarwyddwr cwmni bach. Ar ba blaned y mae Brian yn byw gyda'r datganiad am '*weathering the storm*'? Ceisiwch ddweud hynny wrth bobl yn Nolgarrrog ac wrth y 4,000 yng Ngwent sydd wedi colli eu swyddi eleni.

Brian Gibbons *rose*—

Dafydd Wigley: Nid wyf am ildio gan fy mod yn ateb eich pwynt, Brian.

pen yn y DU yn un dilys—a dylem fod yn ymdrechu i wneud hynny—dylem anelu yn y bôn at wella'r sefyllfa yn nhermau absoliwt i bobl Cymru. Yr ydym yn cyflawni'n dda ar raddfa ryngwladol ond mae pobl yn canolbwyntio gormod ar y sefyllfa gymharol vis-à-vis gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig ac nid ar sefyllfa gymharol pump, chwech a saith blynedd yn ôl pan oedd cyfraddau diweithdra yn 5, 6, 7 ac 8 y cant.

Glyn Davies: Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwch, Brian, ond oni chytunwch ei fod yn gwrth-ddweud strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol Prif Weinidog Cymru? Mae'r strategaeth yn honni y dylem ganolbwyntio ar y sefyllfa berthynol o fewn Prydain. Seilir y strategaeth gyfan ar hynny ac yr ydych wedi ei thanseilio.

Brian Gibbons: Pe baech wedi bod yn gwrando a phe baech wedi trafferthu edrych—

Glyn Davies: Yr oeddwn yn gwrando.

Brian Gibbons: Pe baech yn dymuno darllen y cofnod, dywedais fod cau'r gagendor o ran CMC y pen yn y DU yn amcan dilys. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem ganolbwyntio ar hynny i'r graddau nad ydym yn cydnabod perfformiad rhyngwladol perthynol Cymru o'i gymharu â gwledydd eraill a'r gwelliant a fu dros gyfnod o amser o ran arian ym mhocedi pobl a swyddi. Os canolbwyntiwn ar un mesur yn unig—y perfformiad cymharol vis-à-vis y DU—yna anwybyddwn y cynnydd aruthrol a wnaed yn yr economi yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n amlwg i unrhyw un sy'n cerdded i lawr stryd yng Nghymru.

Dafydd Wigley: I declare an interest as a director of a small business. On what planet is Brian living given his statement about weathering the storm? Try saying that to the people in Dolgarrog and to the 4,000 in Gwent who have lost their jobs this year.

Brian Gibbons *a gododd*—

Dafydd Wigley: I will not give way as I am responding to your point, Brian.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig gyda datganiad Gordon Brown fis diwethaf. Wrth i ni drafod yr angen i gynllunio ein heconomi, mae arnom angen y celfi i wneud y gwaith. Mae'r Llywodraeth yng Nghaerdydd wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau rhaglen o amrywiadau cyllidol er mwyn gallu manteisio'n llawn ar yr arian strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth rhwng y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur. Mae pwynt 4.18 o 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' yn dweud:

'Er mwyn sicrhau bod statws Amcan 1 yn cael yr effaith fwyaf posibl yn ystod y cyfnod rhaglennu byddwn yn bwrw ati'n ddygn i ganfod a oes posibl sefydlu amrywiadau cyllidol.'

Cafwyd adroddiad fis Mai diwethaf gan PricewaterhouseCoopers yn dangos beth oedd yn bosibl. Mae'r adroddiad yn datgan:

'There is now an urgent need to address these handicaps by improving the incentives 'offer' to companies.'

Yr oeddem yn disgwyl yn awchus i rywbeth ddigwydd ac i glywed bod Rhodri Morgan wedi llwyddo i ennill y cymhellion fel rhan o ddatganiad Gordon Brown fis diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, ni chafwyd unrhyw bolisiau rhanbarthol newydd; dim ond addewid o adolygiad. Mae gostwng treth stamp ar eiddo yn ffars llwyr, nid yw o fantais i ddiwydiant yn ardal Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, mae heidiau o bobl wedi'u denu i chwilio am dai haf yn Abersoch—ward sydd wedi'i ddiffinio fel un difreintiedig.

I will tackle head-on the issue that caused so much mirth among Labour Members of Parliament last week. I never have, or ever will, sell our country short. I will seek every opportunity to talk Wales up, not down. That is why I welcome the Office of National Statistics prediction that shows a potential for Wales to increase its population by 150,000 over the next 30 years. Over the next 10 years, that means an extra 54,000 working-aged people, and a need for 40,000 new jobs. That is the challenge.

I was disappointed by Gordon Brown's statement last month. As we discuss the need to plan our economy, we need the tools to do the job. The Government in Cardiff is committed to securing a programme of fiscal variation to take full advantage of the European structural funds. That is part of the partnership agreement between the Liberal Democrats and Labour. Point 4.18 of 'Putting Wales First' states:

'In order to achieve the maximum impact of Objective 1 status during the programming period we will rigorously pursue the scope for fiscal variations'.

A report last May by PricewaterhouseCoopers showed what was possible. The report states:

'There is now an urgent need to address these handicaps by improving the incentives 'offer' to companies.'

We were eagerly anticipating some development and news that Rhodri Morgan had succeeded in winning some incentives as part of Gordon Brown's statement last month. However, we did not get any new regional policies; only the promise of a review. Reducing stamp duty on properties is a total farce and will not benefit industry in Objective 1 areas. However, it is already attracting scores of people to look for second homes in Abersoch—one of the wards defined as deprived.

Ymdriniaf yn uniongyrchol â'r mater a achosodd gymaint o hwyl ymhlith Aelodau Llafur yn y Senedd yr wythnos diwethaf. Ni wneuthum erioed, ac ni wnaif byth, brisio ein gwlad yn rhy isel. Manteisiaf ar bob cyfle i glodfori Cymru ac nid ei bychanu. Dyna pam y croesewais yr hyn yr oedd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn ei ddarogan sy'n dangos potensial i Gymru gynyddu ei phoblogaeth 150,000 dros y 30 mlynedd nesaf. Dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf, golyga hynny 54,000 o bobl o oed gweithio ychwanegol, a'r angen am 40,000 o swyddi newydd. Dyna'r her.

11:25 a.m.

Wales has always had immense potential. It has enjoyed immense assets, not least its energy sources. Coal should have made Wales one of the richest countries on earth, but we know what happened. We have potential today, in terms of tidal, hydro and wind energy—a potential that has still not been fully realised. We have the potential of our raw materials, our agriculture, forestry, water and minerals. We have a splendid environment, and tourist potential. Most of all, we have the potential of a workforce that is one of the most adaptable and trainable workforces in the world.

Yet, despite this, we languish at the bottom of the UK league table of GDP per head, and suffer the ignominy of being classed as one of the poorest areas in Europe. That has been the pattern for the last century, and sadly, it remains so today. There is one central reason for that. Wales has been blighted by appallingly bad government over the whole of that period: a Government incapable of unlocking the great potential of our nation. We have had Governments unwilling to be ambitious for our country; unwilling to set detailed targets for the jobs that we need, in the places that need them. Decent well-paid jobs are needed, on which to build our country's future, and to give all our people, in every part of Wales, a fair chance in life.

In the 1960s, we had the same situation of a Labour Government unwilling to acknowledge the size of the problem, because it was not prepared to commit the resources needed to do the job—a point that has already been raised today. Here we are, yet again, with a Government unwilling to set regional targets, because it does not have the political will to achieve those goals; a Government that blandly talks of 135,000 new jobs, but whose economic development budget is only set to increase from £505 million to £520 million over the next three years—an increase less than inflation.

Bu gan Gymru botensial aruthrol bob amser. Mae wedi elwa ar asedion enfawr, ei ffynonellau ynni yn bennaf. Dylai glo fod wedi rhoi Cymru ymhlith gwledydd cyfoethocaf y byd, ond gwyddom beth a ddigwyddodd. Mae'r potensial gennym heddiw, o ran ynni llanw, hydro a gwynt—potensial nas gwireddwyd yn llawn eto. Mae'r potensial gennym o ran ein deunyddiau crai, ein hamaethyddiaeth, ein coedwigoedd, ein dŵr a'n mwynion. Mae gennym amgylchedd gwych, a photensial i ddenu twristiaid. Yn bennaf oll, mae gennym botensial o ran gweithlu sydd ymhlith y gweithluoedd mwyaf hyblyg a hyfforddadwy y byd.

Ac eto, er gwaethaf hyn, yr ydym ar waelod tabl cynghrair y DU o CMC y pen, a dioddefwn y gwarth o fod yn un o ardaloedd tlotaf Ewrop. Dyna fu'r patrwm dros y ganrif ddiwethaf ac yn anffodus erys felly heddiw. Mae un rheswm canolog dros hynny. Mae llywodraethu gwael ofnadwy yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw wedi difetha Cymru: Llywodraeth nad yw'n gallu gwireddu potensial mawr ein cenedl. Cawsom Lywodraethau a oedd yn amharod i fod yn uchelgeisiol dros ein gwlad; yn amharod i osod targedau manwl ar gyfer y swyddi sydd eu hangen arnom, yn y lleoedd sydd eu hangen. Mae angen swyddi â chyflogau da, y gallwn adeiladu dyfodol ein gwlad arnynt a rhoi cyfle teg mewn bywyd i'n pobl ymhob rhan o Gymru.

Yn y 1960au, yr oedd y sefyllfa yn debyg gyda Llywodraeth Lafur yn amharod i gydnabod maint y broblem, gan nad oedd yn barod i neilltuo'r adnoddau yr oedd eu hangen i wneud y gwaith—pwynt a godwyd eisoes heddiw. Ac eto, dyma ni eto, gyda Llywodraeth sy'n amharod i osod targedau rhanbarthol, gan nad oes ganddi'r ewyllys wleidyddol i gyflawni'r nodau hyn; Llywodraeth sy'n sôn yn ddigyffro am 135,000 o swyddi newydd, ond dim ond o £505 miliwn i £520 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf y disgwylir i'w chyllideb datblygu economaidd gynyddu—cynnydd sy'n llai na chwyddiant.

We have a Government paralysed by inaction. We have only to consider the saga of incompetence over the national economic development strategy programme; the failure to develop operating aids; the continuing delays in taking vital decisions on windfarm projects in Clwyd; the 16-month delay on the Butlins bypass in my constituency; and the First Minister's inability to appoint an economic development Minister to give that vital portfolio the full time and committed attention that it needs.

Economic development should be built on the twin legs of a First Minister steering the necessary strategic direction, and an economic development Minister with a full-time hands-on approach, driving forward a committed agenda on a day-to-day basis, in true partnership with industry and business, and with our social partners.

Instead of enjoying decisive leadership, Wales is turning around in circles of meaningless consultation, of which the Government takes not a blind bit of notice. It ignores the wishes of industry and commerce, as it ignored the unanimous wish of the Economic Development Committee to have an economic policy board.

Instead of standing on two sturdy legs, economic strategy is now tottering on one leg—that of the First Minister trying to do both jobs. In economic development terms, we have a lame duck Government. If there is one thing that is worse than a lame duck Government, it is a lame, one-legged duck Government, which cannot even swim around in circles. If this Government cannot do a better job of economic development—so vital to our country—it can be sure of one thing: in 2003, the people of Wales will turf it out on its neck and will elect a Government that not only has confidence in our nation, but a commitment to deliver the goods.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I now call for a vote on Andrew Davies's amendment 1. If this amendment is carried, amendments 2 and 3 will fall.

Mae gennym Lywodraeth sydd wedi ei pharlysu gan anweithgarwch. Ni raid inni ond ystyried saga'r analluogrwydd ynglŷn â'r rhaglen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol; y methiant i ddatblygu cymhorthion gweithredu; yr oedi parhaus wrth wneud penderfyniadau holl bwysig ar brosiectau ffermydd gwynt yng Nghlwyd; oedi am 16 mis o ran ffordd osgoi Butlins yn fy etholaeth i a methiant Prif Weinidog Cymru i benodi Gweinidog datblygu economaidd i roi'r sylw llawn amser a phenodedig sydd ei angen i'r portffolio holl bwysig hwnnw.

Dylid adeiladu strategaeth datblygu economaidd ar ddwy goes: Prif Weinidog Cymru yn llywio'r cyfeiriad strategol angenrheidiol, a Gweinidog datblygu economaidd gydag ymagwedd lawn amser ymarferol, yn datblygu agenda neilltuedig o ddydd i ddydd, mewn partneriaeth wirioneddol â diwydiant a busnes, ac â'n partneriaid cymdeithasol.

Yn lle mwynhau arweinyddiaeth bendant, mae Cymru yn troi mewn cylchoedd o ymgynghoriadau diystyr, nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn cymryd dim sylw ohonynt. Mae'n anwybyddu dymuniadau diwydiant a masnach, fel yr anwybyddodd ddymuniad unfrydol y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i gael bwrdd polisi economaidd.

Yn lle sefyll ar ddwy goes gadarn, mae'r strategaeth economaidd yn siglo ar un goes—sef Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ceisio cyflawni dwy swydd. O ran datblygu economaidd, mae gennym Lywodraeth gloff. Os oes un peth yn waeth na Llywodraeth hwyaden gloff, Llywodraeth hwyaden gloff, ungoes yw honno, na all hyd yn oed nofio o amgylch mewn cylchoedd. Os na all y Llywodraeth hon ddatblygu'n well yn economaidd—sydd mor hanfodol i'n gwlad—gall fod yn sicr o un peth: yn 2003 bydd pobl Cymru yn ei thafu allan ar ei phen ac yn ethol Llywodraeth nid yn unig sydd â hyder yn ein cenedl, ond sydd ag ymrwymiad i gyflawni addewid.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf yn awr am bleidlais ar welliant 1 Andrew Davies. Os cymeradwyir y gwelliant hwn, bydd gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.
Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

11:55 a.m.

Amended motion:

the National Assembly expresses its concern at the serious gap between Wales and the rest of the UK in gross domestic product per head and the continuing job losses in the manufacturing sector, but is confident that the Assembly Government's economic strategy and the actions flowing from it will ensure the environmentally sustainable economic development of every part of Wales.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn datgan ei bryder ynghylch yr agendor difrifol sydd rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU o ran CMC y pen a'r swyddi sy'n parhau i gael eu colli yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu, ond mae'n hyderus y bydd strategaeth economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a'r camau a fydd yn deillio ohoni, yn sicrhau y bydd economi pob rhan o Gymru yn cael ei datblygu mewn modd sy'n amgylcheddol gynaliadwy.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.
Amended motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Karen Sinclair: Point of order. I requested that the bell be rung.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: If Members wish to ask that the bell be rung, the guidance states that they must do so before the vote is called. The vote was open, Karen, when you called for the bell.

Karen Sinclair: I had e-mailed you previously.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am sorry, but I have not seen any e-mails. Members must stand up and make themselves heard. I am willing to ring the bell, but it must be requested before I call for a vote.

Karen Sinclair: Pwynt o drefn. Gofynnais ichi ganu'r gloch.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Os bydd yr Aelodau am ofyn inni ganu'r gloch, noda'r canllawiau fod rhaid iddynt wneud hynny cyn i'r bleidlais ddechrau. Yr oedd y bleidlais ar agor, Karen, pan wnaethoch ofyn inni ganu'r gloch.

Karen Sinclair: Yr oeddwn wedi anfon e-bost atoch yn gynharach.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni welais unrhyw negeseuon e-bost. Rhaid i'r Aelodau sefyll i sicrhau fy mod yn eu clywed. Yr wyf yn fodlon canu'r gloch, ond rhaid gofyn imi ei wneud cyn imi ddechrau'r bleidlais.

**Dadl Fer
Short Debate**

**Darpariaeth ar gyfer y Celfyddydau Gweledol yng Nghymru
Provision for the Visual Arts in Wales**

Phil Williams: I chose this subject for three reasons. First, I express my conviction that Wales's achievements in the visual arts are far more impressive than most people realise. Over the last 50 years, Wales has been home to a remarkable number of outstanding artists. Secondly, I add my voice to the growing number of people calling for a national gallery of modern art. Thirdly, and most importantly, I express a note of urgency. A commitment to establishing such a gallery is a prerequisite for Cardiff to be chosen as the Cultural Capital of Europe. I had to leave Wales to appreciate Welsh art. While I was an undergraduate in Cambridge, my college hosted an exhibition of contemporary Welsh art. I have the catalogue before me. It was there that I first saw the work of Ernest Zobole and Jeffrey Steele. The college had already bought works by artists from Wales as part of the student collection. I spent two years with a George Chapman etching of Rhondda on my study wall. However, I discovered that an appreciation of Welsh art was not universal. By chance, I got to know several art historians and they were totally unaware of any significant art in Wales. However, to be fair, where would an art historian or an art critic in the 1950s have seen the range of contemporary Welsh art? For that matter, where would the people of Wales have ever seen Welsh art? It took considerable effort.

As a student, I also came across the work of Dick Innis in the Fitzwilliam Museum in Cambridge. It took many years, visiting dozens of different galleries—mainly in England—to fully appreciate that he was the first Welsh artist since Richard Wilson to be truly world-class. However, when the Eisteddfod was held in Llanelli, there was no mention of perhaps the most outstanding person to have ever come from the town.

Phil Williams: Dewisais y pwnc hwn am dri rheswm. Yn gyntaf, mynegaf fy marn bod gorchestion Cymru yn y celfyddydau gweledol yn llawer gwell nag y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ei sylweddoli. Yn ystod y 50 mlynedd diwethaf, bu Cymru yn gartref i nifer syfrdanol o arlunwyr rhagorol. Yn ail, ychwanegaf fy llais at y nifer gynyddol o bobl sy'n galw am oriel genedlaethol o gelfyddyd fodern. Yn drydydd, ac yn bwysicaf, yr wyf am fynegi bod hwn yn fater o frys. Bydd yn rhaid cael ymrwymiad i sefydlu oriel o'r fath er mwyn i Gaerdydd gael ei dewis yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop. Bu'n rhaid imi adael Cymru i werthfawrogi celfyddyd Cymru. Pan oeddwn yn fyfyrwr israddedig yng Nghaergrawnt, cynhaliodd fy ngholeg arddangosfa o gelfyddyd gyfoes Cymru. Mae'r catalog gennyf yma. Yno y gwelais waith Ernest Zobole a Jeffrey Steele am y tro cyntaf. Yr oedd y coleg wedi prynu gweithiau gan arlunwyr o Gymru fel rhan o gasgliad y myfyrwyr. Treuliais ddwy flynedd gydag ysgythriad George Chapman o'r Rhondda ar wal fy stydi. Fodd bynnag, darganfûm na werthfawrogwyd celfyddyd Cymru gan bawb. Drwy ddamwain, cyfarfûm â nifer o haneswyr celfyddyd ac nid oeddent yn ymwybodol o gwbl o unrhyw gelfyddyd o bwys yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, i fod yn deg, ble fyddai hanesydd celfyddyd neu adolygydd celfyddyd yn y 1950au wedi gweld yr ystod o gelfyddyd gyfoes sydd gennym? I ddweud y gwir, ble fyddai pobl Cymru wedi gweld celfyddyd Cymru erioed? Bu'n rhaid wrth ymdrech fawr.

Fel myfyrwr, gwelais waith Dick Innis yn Amgueddfa Fitzwilliam yng Nghaergrawnt hefyd. Cymerodd flynyddoedd lawer, drwy ymweld ag orielau gwahanol—yn Lloegr yn bennaf—i werthfawrogi'n llwyr mai ef oedd arlunydd cyntaf Cymru o'r radd flaenaf ers Richard Wilson. Fodd bynnag, pan gynhaliwyd yr Eisteddfod yn Llanelli, ni chrybwyllwyd y person mwyaf nodedig o bosibl a hanodd o'r dref. Ar ôl dychwelyd i

After returning to Wales, I got to know Welsh art much better. I was tolerated as an associate member of Artists and Designers Wales. It is a serious indictment of the Arts Council of Wales in the 1980s that a movement as dynamic, stimulating, exciting and relatively cheap as ADW should have been killed off. However, political tact was never the strong point of an organisation of artists. I remember an annual meeting of ADW where the invited speaker from the Arts Council of Wales, which was funding the organisation, was prevented from making his speech until the meeting had voted on whether he should be allowed to proceed. Nevertheless, there were some good artists, many of whom are represented in this building.

12:05 p.m.

Through ADW, through contact with arts colleges and through exhibitions, I have been privileged to know many of the best artists working in Wales—such as Glyn Jones, George Chapman, David Tinker, Harry Holland, Tony Goble, Pete Bailey, Phil Nicholls, Islwyn Watkins, Ogwyn Davies, Aneurin Jones, Ozi Osmond, Peter Prendergast, David Petersen, Paul Davies, Ivor Davies, Mary Lloyd Jones, Iwan Bala, Alun Evans and, of course, Jeffrey Steele. They are all friends of mine and if I missed one out I would probably make an enemy. It is an impressive list, and yet the people that I happen to know form only a small part of the whole spectrum. When Jeffrey Steele was featured in *Newsweek*, he must have been the only Welshman for many years to be prominently celebrated in a leading American weekly. For a week, at least, he must have been the best known Welshman in the world. Yet, there are many people who have never heard his name, even in Newport. Can anyone tell me where in Wales today we can see the work of Jeffrey Steele?

We do not have a national gallery that can present the considerable wealth of contemporary Welsh art. All we can do is put the work that we happen to know into a virtual gallery, as Peter Lord did so memorably in his television series. When we

Gymru, ymgyfarwyddais â chelfyddyd Cymru yn llawer gwell. Ymgodymwyd â mi fel aelod cyswllt o Arlunwyr a Dylunwyr Cymru. Mae'n ddiad difrifol ar Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn y 1980au y cafodd corff mor fywiog, ysgogol, cyffrous a chymharol rad ag Arlunwyr a Dylunwyr Cymru gael ei chwalu. Fodd bynnag, ni fu tact gwleidyddol erioed yn un o gryfderau corff o arlunwyr. Cofiaf gyfarfod blynyddol Arlunwyr a Dylunwyr Cymru lle y rhwystrwyd y siaradwr gwadd o Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru—a oedd yn ariannu'r sefydliad—rhag annerch y cyfarfod hyd nes eu bod wedi cael pleidlais o safbwynt a ddylid caniatáu iddo barhau. Serch hynny, yr oedd rhai arlunwyr da, y cynrychiolir llawer ohonynt yn yr adeilad hwn.

Drwy Arlunwyr a Dylunwyr Cymru, drwy gysylltiadau â cholegau celf a thrwy arddangosfeydd, cefais y ffrindiau unig Gymro ers blynyddoedd i gael lle amlwg yn un o brif gylchgronau wythnosol yr Unol Daleithiau. Am wythnos, o leiaf, rhaid mai ef oedd y Cymro enwocaf yn y byd. Eto, nid oes llawer o bobl wedi clywed ei enw, hyd yn oed yng Nghasnewydd. A all unrhyw un ddweud wrthyf ym mha le yng Nghymru heddiw y gallwn weld gwaith Jeffrey Steele?

Nid oes gennym oriel genedlaethol a all gyflwyno cyfoeth mawr celfyddyd gyfoes Cymru. Yr unig beth y gallwn ei wneud yw rhoi'r gwaith yr ydym yn ymwybodol ohono mewn oriel rithwir, fel y gwnaeth Peter Lord mewn ffordd mor gofiadwy yn ei gyfres

assemble the work of our artists in our minds, we see a distinctive style of which we can be proud and which expresses vividly and uniquely the experiences of the people of Wales. There is a strong element of expressionism in many of the paintings. Many of them also have a pronounced sense of place and, often, a social message. If I can overcome the usual dichotomy of twentieth century art into abstract expressionism and social realism, I am tempted to coin the term 'social expressionism' to describe a school of Welsh art that matches the Welsh National Opera in its quality and potential importance. At least we have been able to hear the national opera over the years. So much of our art is hidden. We are failing to exploit one of Wales's most impressive assets.

How different it is in other small countries. I lived for two and a half years in Sweden and discovered how passionately Sweden appreciates the importance of art. That may be one reason why Sweden has such economic success. Sweden was the first country to introduce the rule that 1 per cent of the cost of any public building should be spent on art. As a result, there is good quality art everywhere—in every school, hospital, housing estate and even in the Institute for Space Physics. I believe that it is within the Assembly's planning powers to do the same. If so, we should consider doing that, so that we can match the other countries which use what seems to be a small percentage of the cost of public buildings to greatly enhance quality of life. The public art of Sweden celebrates the country's ordinary people, with paintings and sculptures of fishermen, reindeer farmers, ore miners, blacksmiths, political activists, comedians and young mothers. It is genuinely popular art.

In the mining town in Lapland where I lived, the mine workforce had formed an art club and used money subtracted from their wage packets to buy modern art. A new museum of modern art has recently been built in Stockholm to replace the existing one, where I spent so many hours.

deledu. Pan feddyliwn am waith ein harlunwyr, gwelwn arddull nodweddiadol y gallwn ymfalchïo ynnddi ac sy'n mynegi profiadau pobl Cymru yn glir ac mewn ffordd unigryw. Mae elfen gref o fynegiadaeth mewn llawer o'r lluniau. Mae gan lawer ohonynt hefyd ymdeimlad cryf o le ac, yn aml, neges gymdeithasol. Os gallaf oresgyn yr hollt arferol yng nghelfyddyd yr ugeinfed ganrif rhwng mynegiadaeth haniaethol a realaeth gymdeithasol, caf fy nhentio i fathu'r ymadrodd 'mynegiadaeth gymdeithasol' i ddisgrifio ysgol o gelfyddyd Cymru sy'n cyfateb â Chwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru o ran ei hansawdd a'i phwysigrwydd posibl. O leiaf bu'n bosibl inni glywed y cwmni opera cenedlaethol dros y blynyddoedd. Mae cymaint o'n celfyddyd wedi'i chuddio. Nid ydym yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar un o asedau mwyaf trawiadol Cymru.

Mae'r sefyllfa yn wahanol iawn mewn gwledydd bach eraill. Bùm yn byw yn Sweden am ddwy flynedd a hanner a gwelais pa mor bwysig yw celfyddyd yno. Efallai fod hynny'n un o'r rhesymau pam y caiff Sweden gymaint o lwyddiant yn economaidd. Sweden oedd y wlad gyntaf i gyflwyno'r rheol y dylid gwario 1 y cant o gost unrhyw adeilad cyhoeddus ar gelfyddyd. O ganlyniad, ceir celfyddyd o safon ym mhob man—ym mhob ysgol, ysbyty ac ystad tai a hyd yn oed yn Athrofa Ffiseg y Gofod. Credaf fod gan y Cynulliad y pwerau cynllunio i wneud yr un peth. Os felly, dylem ystyried gwneud hynny, fel y gallwn gyfateb â'r gwledydd eraill sy'n defnyddio yr hyn sy'n ymddangos yn ganran fach o gost adeiladau cyhoeddus i wella ansawdd bywyd yn sylweddol. Mae celfyddyd gyhoeddus Sweden yn dathlu pobl gyffredin y wlad, a cheir lluniau a cherfluniau o bysgotwyr, ffermwyr ceirw, cloddwyr mwynau, gofaint, gwleidyddion, digrifwyr a mamau ifanc. Mae'n gelfyddyd wirioneddol boblogaidd.

Yn y dref gloddio yn y Lapdir lle yr oeddwn yn byw, yr oedd gweithlu'r cloddfeydd wedi ffurfio clwb celf gan ddefnyddio arian o'u cyflog i brynu celfyddyd fodern. Adeiladwyd amgueddfa celfyddyd fodern newydd yn Stockholm yn ddiweddar yn lle'r un bresennol, lle y treuliais llawer o'm hamser.

The situation is similar in almost every other small European country. There are modern art galleries in Wien, Prague, Bilbao, Barcelona, Dublin and in many other cities. There are two in Scotland. We have nothing comparable in Wales. Yet, the most important ingredients—the paintings and sculptures—already exist. At least it is better to have the paintings and no building than to have a building with no paintings. The National Library of Wales has assembled a superb collection of landscapes and portraits, and a welcome, tiny selection from that collection is displayed in the Assembly's Committee and conference rooms. It is wholly appropriate that this building has a better selection of such art on display than anywhere else in Wales, so that we are reminded daily of the quality of Welsh art over the past 50 years.

In the years up to 1982, the arts council also acquired a large and outstanding collection of Welsh art. Since then, there have been many plans to display the collection more widely. I believe that some of the impressive paintings in the BBC in Llandaf, which I see when I go there early in the morning to be interviewed on *Good Morning Wales*, are part of that collection. However, for 20 years, a large part of the collection has been hidden from view. The National Museums and Galleries of Wales also has a valuable collection in reserve.

It may seem presumptuous for an economic development spokesperson to speak on art. Many people might assume that economic development is only concerned with infrastructure, budgets, large factory operations and so on. However, we are beginning to recognise that art is an important source of economic activity, especially in areas of high-class tourism. It is also an important ingredient in economic development as a whole. At the Economic and Social Research Institute in Dublin, which the Committee visited, the term 'social and cultural infrastructure' was used to describe that which makes an area much more attractive for key workers, investors and local people. The gallery of contemporary art in Bilbao has proven that

Mae'r sefyllfa yn debyg ym mron pob gwlad fach arall yn Ewrop. Mae orielau celfyddyd fodern yn Wien, Prague, Bilbao, Barcelona, Dulyn ac mewn llawer o ddinasoedd eraill. Mae dwy oriel gelfyddyd fodern yn yr Alban. Nid oes dim byd tebyg gennym yng Nghymru. Eto mae'r elfennau pwysicaf—y lluniau a'r cerfluniau—eisoed yn bodoli. O leiaf mae'n well bod y lluniau gennym heb adeilad na bod adeilad gennym heb luniau. Mae gan Lyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru gasgliad ardderchog o luniau o dirweddau a phortreadau, a chroesawaf y ffaith yr arddangosir detholiad bach iawn o'r casgliad hwnnw yn ystafelloedd Pwyllgora ac ystafelloedd cynadledda'r Cynulliad. Mae'n hollol briodol bod yr adeilad hwn yn arddangos detholiad o gelfyddyd o'r fath sydd yn well nag unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru, fel y cawn ein hatgoffa bob dydd o ansawdd celfyddyd Cymru dros y 50 mlynedd diwethaf.

Yn ystod y blynyddoedd cyn 1982, caffaelodd cyngor y celfyddydau gasgliad mawr rhagorol o gelfyddyd Cymru hefyd. Ers hynny, bu llawer o gynlluniau i arddangos y casgliad yn ehangach. Credaf fod rhai o'r lluniau gwych a geir yn y BBC yn Llandaf, y'u gwelaf pan af yno yn gynnar yn y bore i gael cyfweiliad ar *Good Morning Wales*, yn rhan o'r casgliad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ers 20 mlynedd, mae rhan fawr o'r casgliad yn guddiedig. Mae gan Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru gasgliad gwerthfawr wrth gefn hefyd.

Efallai ei bod yn ymddangos yn hyf i lefarydd dros ddatblygu economaidd siarad am gelfyddyd. Efallai y byddai llawer o bobl yn cymryd bod datblygu economaidd ond yn ymwneud â seilwaith, cyllidebau, ffatrioedd mawr ac ati. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dechrau cydnabod bod celfyddyd yn ffynhonnell bwysig o weithgarwch economaidd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd o dwristiaeth o safon uchel. Mae'n elfen bwysig o ddatblygu economaidd yn gyffredinol hefyd. Yn yr Athrofa Ymchwil Economaidd a Chymdeithasol yn Nulyn, yr ymwelodd y Pwyllgor â hi, defnyddiwyd yr ymadrodd 'seilwaith cymdeithasol a diwylliannol' i ddisgrifio'r hyn sy'n gwneud ardal yn llawer mwy deniadol i weithwyr allweddol, i fuddsoddwyr ac i bobl leol. Mae

repeatedly.

That is why it is so important to establish a national gallery of contemporary art for Wales. The campaign to establish such a gallery started 120 years ago with the formation of the Royal Cambrian Academy and its campaign for a national gallery to display Welsh art. The campaign has continued off and on in the intervening years, with Kyffin Williams, among others, arguing the case passionately. However, never until now has it reached the critical mass to overcome all the usual apathy and objections. This time, I think that it will succeed. Peter Lord has introduced many of us to this rich seam in our cultural history. The large attendance at the consultation meetings organised by the national museum is testament to widespread support. We also have the National Assembly. Therefore, the campaign must succeed this time.

I do not want to go into detail that would preempt the consultation by the national museum, or the detailed recommendations it will give to the Assembly. I will suggest one principle. The primary aim would be to display the best of contemporary art in Wales to the widest possible audience, ensuring that it is set in context. I would recommend that, although there needs to be a single prestigious and appropriate headquarters building, which may well be located somewhere near Cardiff, there must also be three or four other galleries in different parts of Wales, so that the collection can be rotated from one to another and hence be appreciated by the maximum number of people.

I will end by stressing the sense of urgency. Cardiff's bid to be Cultural Capital of Europe must be submitted before the end of March. I believe that achieving that status would be even more important economically than attracting the Ryder Cup to Wales. It is far more important. I agree with the consultant's assessment that Cardiff, as a new capital, has huge assets in its musical prestige and as a vigorous centre for the media and for bilingual culture, but that it is perceived as failing in its promotion of the visual arts.

oriel celfyddyd gyfoes Bilbao wedi profi hynny droeon.

Dyna pam ei bod mor bwysig sefydlu oriel genedlaethol ar gyfer celfyddyd gyfoes yng Nghymru. Dechreuodd yr ymgyrch i sefydlu oriel o'r fath 120 o flynyddoedd yn ôl pan sefydlwyd Academi Frenhinol Cambrian a'i hymgyrch dros oriel genedlaethol i arddangos celfyddyd Cymru. Mae'r ymgyrch wedi parhau'n ysbeidiol yn ystod y blynyddoedd ers hynny ac mae Kyffin Williams, ymysg eraill, wedi dadlau'n gryf drosti. Fodd bynnag, nid yw erioed, tan yn awr, wedi cyrraedd y màs critigol i oresgyn yr holl ddifaterwch a gwrthwynebiadau arferol. Credaf y bydd yn llwyddo y tro hwn. Mae Peter Lord wedi cyflwyno'r elfen gyfoethog hon o'n hanes diwylliannol i lawer ohonom. Mae'r nifer fawr o bobl a aeth i'r cyfarfodydd ymgynghorol a drefnwyd gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn dyst i'r ffaith fod cryn gefnogaeth i hyn. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gennym hefyd. Felly, rhaid i'r ymgyrch lwyddo y tro hwn.

Nid wyf am roi manylion a fyddai'n achub y blaen ar y broses ymgynghorol gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol, neu'r argymhellion manwl y bydd yn eu rhoi i'r Cynulliad. Awgrymaf un egwyddor. Y prif nod fyddai arddangos celfyddyd gyfoes orau Cymru i'r gynulleidfa ehangaf bosibl, gan sicrhau y caiff ei gosod yn ei chyd-destun. Er bod angen pencadlys mawreddog a phriodol, a allai fod rywle ger Caerdydd, bydd yn rhaid cael tair neu bedair oriel mewn rhannau gwahanol o Gymru, fel y gellir symud y casgliad o un oriel i'r llall er mwyn sicrhau bod y nifer fwyaf o bobl yn ei werthfawrogi.

Dof i ben drwy bwysleisio fod hwn yn fater o frys. Rhaid cyflwyno cais Caerdydd i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop cyn diwedd mis Mawrth. Credaf y byddai cael y statws hwnnw hyd yn oed yn bwysicach yn economaidd na denu'r Cwpan Ryder i Gymru. Mae'n llawer pwysicach. Cytunaf ag asesiad yr ymgynghorydd fod gan Gaerdydd, fel prifddinas newydd, asedau enfawr o ran ei bri cerddorol ac fel canolfan fywiog ar gyfer y cyfryngau a diwylliant dwyieithog, ond y canfyddiad yw nad yw'n hyrwyddo'r

That perception must be reversed. We can do that. We may not have all the details, and we may not have it worked out in full. However, I believe that all parties in the Assembly support our making a firm commitment in the near future to establishing a national gallery to do justice to Wales's rich collection of modern art.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Three Members have stated that they want to contribute to the debate. I am afraid that you must limit yourselves to 40 seconds each, if this debate is to end on time.

Glyn Davies: I hope that Phil will reconsider his decision to stand down from the Assembly in 2003. I have never met a man with such talent for making people feel inadequate. I have only just escaped from the Economic Development Committee, where he mystified me for a year or so. All of a sudden, I join the Culture Committee, and I find that Phil Williams is also an expert on this.

I agree with virtually all of Phil's comments. There are two principles. First, we need a national art gallery for Wales. Second, although the gallery would be based in Cardiff, there should be a way to ensure that it also has a presence in the rest of Wales.

Rosemary Butler: I am fully in favour of the proposal to establish a national gallery of Welsh art in Wales. However, I would like Phil to extend his proposal to establishing a gallery for Welsh art, not just contemporary Welsh art. As he said, we are already the proud possessors of a superb collection of international art and crafts at the National Museums and Galleries of Wales's sites in Cardiff and throughout Wales. The museums are attracting an ever-growing number of visitors, particularly now that we offer free entry.

12:15 p.m.

A national gallery of Welsh art would

celfyddydau gweledol yn ddigonol. Rhaid gwrthdroi'r canfyddiad hwnnw. Gallwn wneud hynny. Efallai nad yw'r holl fanylion gennym, ac efallai nad ydym wedi cynllunio'r mater yn llwyr. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod pob plaid yn y Cynulliad o blaid gwneud ymrwymiad cadarn yn y dyfodol agos i sefydlu oriel genedlaethol i wneud cyfiawnder â chasgliad cyfoethog Cymru o gelfyddyd fodern.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae tri Aelod wedi nodi eu bod am gyfrannu i'r ddatl. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ond dim ond 40 eiliad fydd gennych, er mwyn i'r ddatl hon orffen yn byrdlon.

Glyn Davies: Gobeithiaf y bydd Phil yn ailystyried ei benderfyniad i beidio â sefyll yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2003. Ni chyfarfûm erioed â dyn sydd â chymaint o dalent i wneud i bobl deimlo'n annigonol. Dim ond newydd ddianc ydyf rhag y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, lle y'm synnodd am ryw flwyddyn. Yn sydyn, ymunaf â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, a chanfyddaf fod Phil Williams yn arbenigwr yn y maes hwn hefyd.

Cytunaf â bron pob un o sylwadau Phil. Y mae dwy egwyddor ynghlwm â hyn. Yn gyntaf, mae angen oriel gelfyddyd genedlaethol arnom. Yn ail, er y byddai'r oriel wedi ei lleoli yng Nghaerdydd, dylai fod ffordd o sicrhau y caiff ei chynrychioli yng gweddill Cymru hefyd.

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi'r cynnig i sefydlu oriel genedlaethol o gelfyddyd Cymreig yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn i Phil ehangu ei gynnig i sefydlu oriel i gelfyddyd Cymru, ac nid celfyddyd gyfoes Cymru yn unig. Fel y dywedodd, yr ydym yn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith ein bod eisoes yn berchen ar gasgliad gwych o gelf a chreffft rhyngwladol yn safleoedd Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru yng Nghaerdydd a ledled Cymru. Mae'r amgueddfeydd yn denu nifer gynyddol o ymwelwyr, yn arbennig gan ein bod bellach yn cynnig mynediad am ddim.

Byddai oriel genedlaethol o gelfyddyd

complement the National Museums and Galleries of Wales's collection, just as Tate Britain complements Tate Modern and the other national galleries in London, by further raising public interest in the arts.

I envisage that the National Museums and Galleries of Wales and a national gallery of Welsh art would work in close co-operation, loaning works of art and exchanging expertise. As Phil has already said, the national museum and the national library have a huge collection of pictures, drawings and prints that remain almost permanently in storage. That applies not only to the national galleries, but also to private and local authority galleries also.

Wales has artists, past and present, who could form a magnificent national collection. Phil has already mentioned some; Thomas Jones, Gwen and Augustus John, Ceri Richards and Ernest Zobole are among the finest artists Britain has produced. They would be enhanced by Turner, Rowlandson, Cox, Graham Sutherland and David Jones, who were not born in Wales but who were inspired by and worked in Wales. A collection of work by all those artists would attract international attention.

I fully support this proposal, with one proviso: the gallery should not be situated in Cardiff but in Wales's newest city, Newport.

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I, too, welcome Phil's choice of this topic for debate. The public scrutiny of this topic is important to the Assembly and Wales as a whole. I welcome any opportunity to debate issues that relate to Welsh art and its cultural significance.

Phil, you provided us with an impressive list of contemporary Welsh artists, to which Rosemary added. I will not talk about individual artists, but about concepts and principles.

As Members know, we already have a

Cymru yn ategu casgliad Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru, fel y mae Tate Britain yn ategu Tate Modern a'r oriolau cenedlaethol eraill yn Llundain, drwy gynyddu diddordeb y cyhoedd yn y celfyddydau ymhellach.

Rhagwelaf y byddai Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cymru ac oriel genedlaethol o gelfyddyd Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos, gan fenthyca gweithiau celf a chyfnewid arbenigedd. Fel y mae Phil eisoes wedi'i ddweud, mae gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol a'r llyfrgell genedlaethol gasgliad enfawr o luniau, darluniau a phrintiau a roddir i'w cadw bron yn barhaol. Mae hynny nid yn unig yn berthnasol i oriolau cenedlaethol, ond hefyd i oriolau preifat ac oriolau awdurdodau lleol hefyd.

Mae gan Gymru arlunwyr, ddoe a heddiw, a allai ffurfio casgliad cenedlaethol gwych. Mae Phil eisoes wedi crybwyll rhai ohonynt; mae Thomas Jones, Gwen ac Augustus John, Ceri Richards ac Ernest Zobole ymysg arlunwyr gorau Prydain. Caent eu hategu gan Turner, Rowlandson, Cox, Graham Sutherland a David Jones, nas ganed yng Nghymru ond a gâi eu hysbrydoli gan Gymru ac a weithiai yng Nghymru. Byddai casgliad o waith gan yr holl arlunwyr hynny yn denu sylw rhyngwladol.

Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn yn llwyr, ar un amod: sef na ddylai'r oriel fod yng Nghaerdydd ond yn ninas ddiweddaraf Cymru, sef Casnewydd.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Croesawaf innau, hefyd, y ffaith fod Phil wedi dewis y pwnc hwn i'w drafod. Mae craffu ar y pwnc hwn yn gyhoeddus yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad ac i Gymru gyfan. Croesawaf unrhyw gyfle i drafod materion sy'n ymwneud â chelfyddyd Cymru a'i harwyddocâd diwylliannol.

Phil, gwnaethoch roi restr drawiadol inni o arlunwyr cyfoes Cymru, yr ychwanegodd Rosemary ati. Ni soniaf am arlunwyr unigol, ond am gysyniadau ac egwyddorion.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae gennym oriel gelf

national art gallery, which contains modern and contemporary Welsh art, as well work by long-dead Welsh artists, and a great deal of international art. We have a magnificent collection of paintings and sculpture from Wales and beyond and I have long believed it to be a hidden treasure that needs to be made much more of.

A third of the oil paintings owned by the museum are on display in that gallery at any one time and, although that does not sound much, it is a higher proportion than in many other national galleries. However, visual arts display and public art in Wales is underdeveloped. There has been long-standing debate about the need for a gallery for contemporary art. This issue will be resolved in the context of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales's consultation on and review of galleries and also the Arts Council for Wales's consultation and review.

However, we need to be clear about what we calling for. Rosemary's contribution highlighted the issues. Do we mean contemporary art or modern art? Phil used both terms. Do we want Welsh art or international art? How do we define Welsh art? Is it the art created by Welsh artists, or by artists who paint in Wales or on Welsh subjects? Different people want different things. That is why the review is useful, because those technical issues are being examined by it in detail.

The review is well advanced. To date, the national museum has consulted other museum professionals and curators and, most importantly, contemporary Welsh artists. Advice was sought from Scandinavian countries and Ireland on how to undertake the review. A series of workshops and public meetings have been held. The results of the first stage were presented to the Assembly in a seminar in July. All Assembly Members were invited to that and I was disappointed by the poor attendance at that event, particularly among opposition Members.

genedlaethol, sy'n cynnwys celfyddyd fodern a chyfoes Cymru, yn ogystal â gwaith gan arlunwyr Cymru ddoe, a llawer o gelfyddyd ryngwladol. Mae gennym gasgliad gwych o luniau a cherfluniau o Gymru a'r tu hwnt a chredais ers peth amser ei fod yn drysor cudd y mae angen ei bwysleisio llawer mwy.

Arddangosir traean o'r peintiadau olew y mae'r amgueddfa yn berchen arnynt yn yr oriel honno ar unrhyw adeg ac, er nad yw hynny'n ymddangos yn rhyw lawer, mae'n gyfran uwch nag mewn llawer o orielau cenedlaethol eraill. Fodd bynnag, nid yw arddangosfeydd celfyddydau gweledol a chelfyddyd gyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi'u datblygu'n ddigonol. Cafwyd dadl hirsefydlog am yr angen am oriel ar gyfer celfyddyd gyfoes. Caiff y mater hwn ei ddatrys yng nghyd-destun ymgynghoriad Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru ar orielau a'r adolygiad ohonynt a hefyd ar broses ymgynghori ac adolygu Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni fod yn glir am yr hyn yr ydym yn galw amdano. Amlygwyd y materion gan gyfraniad Rosemary. A gyfeirir at gelfyddyd gyfoes neu gelfyddyd fodern? Defnyddiwyd y ddau derm gan Phil. A ydym am weld celfyddyd Cymru neu gelfyddyd ryngwladol? Sut y diffiniwn gelfyddyd Cymru? Ai'r gelfyddyd a grëir gan arlunwyr Cymru, neu gelfyddyd gan arlunwyr sy'n peintio yng Nghymru neu gelfyddyd ar bynciau Cymreig ydyw? Mae pobl wahanol am gael pethau gwahanol. Dyma pam bod yr adolygiad yn ddefnyddiol, oherwydd y caiff y materion technegol hynny eu harchwilio'n fanwl.

Mae'r adolygiad wedi datblygu'n dda. Hyd yma, mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol wedi ymgynghori â gweithwyr proffesiynol a churaduriaid eraill mewn amgueddfeydd ac, yn bwysicaf oll, ag arlunwyr cyfoes Cymru. Gofynnwyd am gyngor gan wledydd Scandinafaid ac Iwerddon ar sut i gynnal yr adolygiad. Cynhaliwyd cyfres o weithdai a chyfarfodydd cyhoeddus. Cyflwynwyd canlyniadau'r cam cyntaf i'r Cynulliad mewn seminar ym mis Gorffennaf. Gwahodwyd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad i'r seminar hwnnw ac fe'm siomwyd gan y nifer isel o bobl a

oedd yn bresennol, yn enwedig ymysg Aelodau'r wrthblaid.

The next stage in the review is a public consultation. The national museum will release a consultation paper in the new year. It would not, therefore, be appropriate for me, at this stage, to take a definite view on what we want and where we want it, because that would pre-empt the public's view. I urge all Members to read the document and make their views known. I assure Members that the museum is talking to Cardiff City and County Council about the Cultural Capital of Europe bid, and the arts council is talking to Cardiff council about its ownership of the old library building.

Ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yw'r cam nesaf yn yr adolygiad. Bydd yr amgueddfa genedlaethol yn cyhoeddi papur ymgynghorol yn y flwyddyn newydd. Felly, ni fyddai'n briodol imi leisio barn bendant, ar hyn o bryd, ar yr hyn yr ydym am ei weld a ble yr ydym am ei chael, oherwydd byddai'n achub y blaen ar farn y cyhoedd. Anogaf bob un o'r Aelodau i ddarllen y ddogfen ac i leisio eu barn. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r Aelodau bod yr amgueddfa mewn trafodaethau â Chyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd am y cais i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop, a bod cyngor y celfyddydau mewn trafodaethau â chyngor Caerdydd am ei berchenogaeth o adeilad yr hen lyfrgell.

Eleanor Burnham: I am concerned that there should be a good arts presence in north Wales. We are lucky that there is an exhibition in Theatr Clwyd at present. The arts exhibition at the National Eisteddfod of Wales in Denbigh this year was outstanding and far superior to anything I have seen at Tate Modern. Will you address the fact that there is not a branch of the national museum in north Wales?

Eleanor Burnham: Pryderaf y dylai'r celfyddydau fod yn bresennol yn y Gogledd. Yr ydym yn ffodus bod arddangosfa yn Theatr Clwyd ar hyn o bryd. Yr oedd arddangosfa'r celfyddydau yn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yn Ninbych eleni yn wych ac yn llawer gwell nag unrhyw beth a welais yn Tate Modern. A wnewch ymdrin â'r ffaith nad oes cangen o'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn y Gogledd?

Jenny Randerson: I hope to address that in terms of displaying art. The Council of Museums in Wales, which is the non-national arm of museums in Wales, is considering, with the national museum, pilot projects to display art throughout Wales. The idea is that that should include the whole of Wales, but the pilot projects will concentrate on north-east and mid Wales, in order to right the deficiency caused by the fact that there are no branches of the national museum in those areas at present.

Jenny Randerson: Gobeithiaf ymdrin â hynny o ran y mater o arddangos celfyddyd. Mae Cyngor Amgueddfeydd Cymru, sef y gangen anghenedlaethol o amgueddfeydd Cymru, yn ystyried, ar y cyd â'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol, brosiectau peilot i arddangos celfyddyd ledled Cymru. Y syniad yw y dylai gynnwys Cymru gyfan, ond bydd y prosiectau peilot yn canolbwyntio ar ogledd-ddwyrain a chanolbarth Cymru er mwyn unioni'r diffyg yn sgîl y ffaith nad oes canghennau o'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn yr ardaloedd hynny ar hyn o bryd.

The arts council's review of gallery provision in Wales is one of a number of reviews it is conducting in order to build evidence to inform its five-year arts strategy. The report will be subject to wide public consultation throughout December. The council has been in close contact with the national museum on the reviews to ensure that they dovetail. The arts council's own collection—I am sure that you will be pleased to hear that it has an

Mae adolygiad cyngor y celfyddydau o'r orielau yng Nghymru yn un o nifer o adolygiadau y mae'n eu cyflawni i gael tystiolaeth i lywio ei strategaeth pum mlynedd ar y celfyddydau. Bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus eang ar yr adroddiad yn ystod mis Rhagfyr. Bu'r cyngor mewn cysylltiad agos â'r amgueddfa genedlaethol ynglŷn â'r adolygiadau er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn goryffwrdd. Caiff

extensive collection of modern and contemporary art—will be dispersed throughout Wales shortly. It has been locked away for too long.

One message that has come through strongly—which was reinforced in last week's debate on the quinquennial review of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales—is the need to ensure that more of the museum's national collection is displayed throughout Wales. I, and the museum, have taken that on board. I agree that the situation is not as good as it could be. Steps have been taken in the right direction. I do not know whether Members have visited the museum's gallery 16, which has been rehung and now displays the work of a number of contemporary Welsh artists alongside international greats. That display will be rotated. There is already an extensive loans programme, and some 3,000 items are on loan in Wales to 118 institutions, with another 13,000 items on loan to institutions abroad. I have a number of contemporary and modern art works on loan in my office here.

More can, and should, be done to make the national collections available to people throughout Wales. I am determined that we should make progress quickly on the three fronts that I have outlined. I agree with Phil's point about economic impact. One of my missions in this past year was to talk about the importance of the creative industries. I am pleased that the Welsh Development Agency has taken that on board. It is working with the arts council on a creative industries forum to develop that sector of the economy. The message has also been taken on board by the Wales Tourist Board, and it has produced a cultural tourism strategy, which is currently out to consultation. There has been general recognition of the important economic impact of free entry to museums at a difficult time for tourism. Free entry to museums has not only had an impact on the economy—it has led to a change in the type of people who visit museums, broadening its visitor base considerably.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I do not disagree

casgliad cyngor y celfyddydau ei hun—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn falch o glywed bod ganddo gasgliad helaeth o gelfyddyd fodern a chyfoes—ei wasgaru ledled Cymru maes o law. Bu dan glo ers gormod o amser.

Un neges a gyflëwyd yn gryf—ac a atgyfnerthwyd yn y ddadl a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf ar yr adolygiad pum mlynedd o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru—yw'r angen i sicrhau yr arddangosir rhagor o gasgliad cenedlaethol yr amgueddfa ledled Cymru. Derbyniwyd hynny gennyf fi, a chan yr amgueddfa. Cytunaf nad yw'r sefyllfa cystal ag y gallai fod. Cymerwyd camau i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Ni wn a yw'r Aelodau wedi ymweld ag oriel 16 yr amgueddfa, a gafodd ei hailosod ac sydd bellach yn arddangos gwaith gan nifer o arlunwyr cyfoes Cymru ochr yn ochr ag arlunwyr rhyngwladol enwog. Caiff yr arddangosfa honno ei newid. Mae rhaglen benthyciadau fawr eisoes ar waith, ac mae tua 3,000 o eitemau wedi'u rhoi ar fenthyg yng Nghymru i 118 o sefydliadau, gyda 13,000 o eitemau eraill wedi'u rhoi ar fenthyg i sefydliadau dramor. Mae gennyf nifer o weithiau celfyddyd cyfoes a modern ar fenthyg yn fy swyddfa i yma.

Gellir, a dylid, gwneud mwy, i sicrhau bod y casgliadau cenedlaethol ar gael i bobl ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylem wneud cynnydd yn gyflym ar y tri mater yr wyf wedi'u hamlinellu. Cytunaf â phwynt Phil am effaith economaidd. Un o'm tasgau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf oedd siarad am bwysigrwydd y diwydiannau creadigol. Mae'n dda gennyf fod Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi derbyn hynny. Mae'n cydweithio â chyngor y celfyddydau ar fforwm diwydiannau creadigol i ddatblygu'r sector hwnnw o'r economi. Derbyniwyd y neges gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru hefyd, ac mae wedi cynhyrchu strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, yr ymgynghorir â hi ar hyn o bryd. Cydnabuwyd yn gyffredinol yr effaith economaidd bwysig a gaiff mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ar adeg anodd i dwristiaeth. Nid yn unig ar yr economi y mae mynediad am ddim wedi cael effaith—arweiniodd at newid a chryn amrywiaeth yn y math o bobl sy'n ymweld ag amgueddfeydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Nid anghytunaf â

with the importance of free entry to museums. However, will you recognise that there is also a problem regarding private tourist attractions that offer educational provision for children? They are suffering as a result of free admission to national museums, because their entry numbers are down.

Jenny Randerson: I have agreed that we should conduct research into that now that the immediate effect of foot and mouth disease on tourist attractions has lessened. I hope that it will not have an impact in future. However, the tourism industry will take a while to build itself up again. We need to consider that. However, I hope that you agree that, as guardians of the nation's treasures—given to the nation or bought with the nation's taxes—we have an obligation to display them free of charge. I will bear in mind what you have said, particularly when we consider local authority museums, although about half of those also have free entry. That has not been taken on board before.

Lorraine Barrett: Will you cast your mind back to the days when entrance to museums was free? The two giggling Tories in the corner might remember that it was a previous Conservative Government that introduced fees. Therefore, the private galleries must have coped at that time. We need some time for them to re-adjust now that entry into galleries and museums is free again. However, all those years ago, they must have coped and competed well enough.

Jenny Randerson: There must be a period of re-adjustment and we must recognise the damage done to the museum visiting habit by the introduction of entrance fees. We should rejoice in the fact that we no longer have them. However, we cannot take on responsibility for the whole market economy and you are quite right in that, Lorraine.

There has been too little debate about the visual arts in Wales compared with that on literature. We are only rarely in a position to hold major exhibitions from other countries.

phwysigrwydd mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd. Fodd bynnag, a gydnabyddwch fod problem hefyd o ran atyniadau preifat i dwristiaid sy'n cynnig darpariaeth addysgol i blant? Maent yn dioddef o ganlyniad i'r ffaith bod mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol, ac mae niferoedd eu hymwelwyr wedi gostwng.

Jenny Randerson: Cytunais y dylem gynnal ymchwil i hynny gan fod effaith uniongyrchol clwy'r traed a'r genau ar atyniadau i dwristiaid bellach wedi lleihau. Gobeithiaf na chaiff effaith yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn cymryd amser i'r sefyllfa yn y diwydiant twristiaeth wella eto. Bydd angen inni ystyried hynny. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf eich bod yn cytuno, fel ceidwaid trysorau'r genedl—a roddwyd i'r genedl neu a brynwyd o drethi'r genedl—bod dyletswydd arnom i'w harddangos am ddim. Byddaf yn ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, yn arbennig pan ystyriwn amgueddfeydd awdurdodau lleol, er bod mynediad am ddim i tua hanner ohonynt hwy hefyd. Nid ystyriwyd hynny o'r blaen.

Lorraine Barrett: A feddylwch yn ôl i'r dyddiau pan gafwyd mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd? Efallai y bydd y ddau Dori sy'n cilchwerthin yn y gornel yn cofio mai Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol a gyflwynodd ffioedd mynediad. Felly, rhaid bod yr orielau preifat wedi ymdopi y pryd hynny. Mae angen rhywfaint o amser iddynt ailaddasu â'r sefyllfa gan fod mynediad am ddim i orielau ac amgueddfeydd unwaith eto. Fodd bynnag, yr holl flynyddoedd hynny yn ôl, rhaid eu bod wedi ymdopi ac wedi cystadlu'n ddigon da.

Jenny Randerson: Rhaid cael cyfnod o ailaddasu a rhaid inni gydnabod y niwed a wnaethpwyd i'r arfer o ymweld ag amgueddfeydd drwy gyflwyno ffioedd mynediad. Dylem fod yn falch o'r ffaith nad oes gennym ffioedd mynediad bellach. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb yr economi farchnad gyfan ac yr ydych yn gywir i nodi hynny, Lorraine.

Ni fu digon o drafodaeth ar y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â'r drafodaeth a gafwyd ar lenyddiaeth. Anaml iawn yn unig yr ydym mewn sefyllfa i gynnal

We need to consider many issues, such as increasing the number of private and public exhibition spaces throughout Wales, improving visual arts marketing, encouraging the installation of public art and improving facilities for research, training and publication of critical and historical writing on visual arts. We also need to consider assisting artists to find studio places, providing bursaries and commissions, improving the interaction between artists, designers and craft outlets and attracting more exhibitions from around the world. I would put forward the idea of a Wales contemporary arts fair as a good vehicle for encouraging the development of a prosperous and flourishing contemporary art world in Wales.

I should stress the important fact that the Arts Council of Wales spends more per capita on the visual arts in Wales than any other UK arts council. Unfortunately, that is not matched by local authorities in Wales, which spend less per capita than the rest of the UK. I would like to see the re-engagement of local authorities. Some have an excellent record. However, I would like them all to have excellent contribution to the visual arts.

There are various procedures and ways in which we can encourage and develop the visual arts in Wales. Public art is one means whereby many aspects of public expenditure can deliver a cultural return. There needs to be far wider recognition of the part public art can play in creating not only more beautiful, but more secure public spaces and in contributing to the regeneration of communities. Best public art practice brings a high degree of community involvement. The culture strategy, 'Creative Future', unveiled in Plenary this week, tackles that issue among others.

There is a strong place for the visual arts in 'Creative Future'. It contains points relating to displaying art, which I will not repeat because that is clearly the main topic of this

arddangosfeydd mawr o wledydd eraill. Mae angen inni ystyried llawer o faterion, megis cynyddu nifer y lleoedd arddangos preifat a chyhoeddus ledled Cymru, gwella'r broses o farchnata'r celfyddydau gweledol, annog y broses o osod celfyddyd gyhoeddus a gwella'r cyfleusterau ar gyfer ymchwil, hyfforddiant a chyhoeddi gweithiau beirniadol a hanesyddol ar y celfyddydau gweledol. Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried cynorthwyo arlunwyr i gael stiwdio, rhoi bwrsariaethau a chomisiynau, gwella'r broses ryngweithio rhwng arlunwyr, dylunwyr a chanolfannau crefft a denu mwy o arddangosfeydd o bob cwr o'r byd. Byddwn yn awgrymu y byddai ffair crefftau cyfoes Cymru yn ffordd dda o annog y broses o ddatblygu byd celfyddyd gyfoes ffyniannus a llewyrchus yng Nghymru.

Dylwn bwysleisio'r ffaith bwysig bod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn gwario mwy o arian y pen ar y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru nag unrhyw gyngor y celfyddydau arall yn y DU. Yn anffodus, ni cheir yr un sefyllfa yn awdurdodau lleol Cymru, sy'n gwario llai o arian y pen na gweddill y DU. Hoffwn weld awdurdodau lleol yn ailgysylltu â'r mater hwn. Mae gan rai ohonynt record ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld pob un ohonynt yn rhoi cyfraniad ardderchog i'r celfyddydau gweledol.

Mae gweithdrefnau a ffyrdd gwahanol y gallwn eu defnyddio i annog a datblygu'r celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru. Mae celfyddyd gyhoeddus yn un modd o sicrhau bod llawer o agweddau ar wariant cyhoeddus yn gwneud elw diwylliannol. Mae angen cydnabod yn llawer ehangach y rhan y gall celfyddyd gyhoeddus ei chwarae i greu lleoedd cyhoeddus mwy prydferth, a hefyd lleoedd cyhoeddus mwy diogel ac i gyfrannu at adfywio ein cymunedau. Mae arfer celfyddyd gyhoeddus gorau yn cynnwys cyfranogiad sylweddol gan y gymuned. Mae'r strategaeth ddiwylliant, 'Cymru'n Creu', a gyhoeddwyd mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos hon, yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw ymhlith materion eraill.

Ceir lle cryf i'r celfyddydau gweledol yn 'Cymru'n Creu'. Mae'n cynnwys pwyntiau sy'n ymwneud ag arddangos celfyddyd, na fyddaf yn eu hailadrodd gan ei bod yn amlwg

strategy. It recognises the need for a thoroughgoing improvement in what is available. The strategy also outlines points relating to improving understanding of the Welsh contribution to visual arts history and an appreciation of increasing activity in the sector across Wales and the need for a network of local museums, galleries, public libraries, historic buildings and monuments to increase access to our heritage, including modern and contemporary heritage. It also refers to the need to develop art forms, such as the visual arts and dance—I want to put in a word for dance at this point—which in the past have been subject to weak and unpredictable strategies. I agree that we have not made the most of the talent available. Therefore, we must now develop, encourage and make the most of it.

I leave you with two points: first, we have had an excellent settlement for next year's budget, which allows us to make a start on some of these issues. Secondly, the National Museums and Galleries of Wales's motto is to show Wales to the world and the world to Wales. That, in the context of this debate, is well said.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

mai dyna brif bwnc y strategaeth hon. Mae'n cydnabod yr angen i wella'n drwyadl yr hyn sydd ar gael. Mae'r strategaeth hefyd yn amlinellu'r pwyntiau o ran gwella'r ddealltwriaeth o gyfraniad Cymru i hanes y celfyddydau gweledol a gwerthfawrogi'r gweithgarwch cynyddol yn y sector ledled Cymru a'r angen am rwydwaith o amgueddfeydd lleol, orielau, llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus, adeiladau hanesyddol a henebion i wella mynediad i'n treftadaeth, gan gynnwys ein treftadaeth fodern a chyfoes. Mae hefyd yn cyfeirio at yr angen i ddatblygu'r celfyddydau, megis y celfyddydau gweledol a dawns—yr wyf am sôn am ddawns fan hyn—a fu'n destun strategaethau gwan ac anrhagweladwy yn y gorffennol. Cytunaf nad ydym wedi manteisio i'r eithaf ar y doniau sydd ar gael. Felly, rhaid inni bellach eu datblygu, eu hannog a manteisio i'r eithaf arnynt.

Mae dau bwynt gennyf i gloi: yn gyntaf, mae gennym setliad ardderchog ar gyfer cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, sy'n ein galluogi i ddechrau mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn. Yn ail, arwyddair Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru yw dangos Cymru i'r byd a dangos y byd i Gymru. Mae'r rheini yn eiriau da, yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.27 p.m.
The session ended at 12.27 p.m.*