



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 5 Rhagfyr 2006
Tuesday, 5 December 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
32	Datganiad Busnes Business Statement
34	Datganiad am Adroddiad ar yr Achosion o Cryptosporidiosis Statement on the Report on the Outbreak of Cryptosporidiosis
48	Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer
48	Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
50	Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Diwygio Rheoleiddiol a Chwynion) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Regulatory Reform and Complaints) (Wales) Regulations 2006
58	Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 ac Arbediad) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 9 and Saving) (Wales) Order 2006
62	Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Climate Change
90	Seithfed Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynulliad ar Gydraddoldeb The Assembly's Seventh Equality Annual Report

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Y Gronfa Gydyfeirio The Convergence Fund

C1 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am raglen y gronfa gydyfeirio? OAQ2130(FM)

Q1 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the convergence fund programme? OAQ2130(FM)

C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynnydd dogfen rhaglen y gronfa gydyfeirio? OAQ2129(FM)

Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will the First Minister make a statement on the progress of the convergence fund programme document? OAQ2129(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Ein hymrwymiad yw bwrw ymlaen gyda'r broses o roi'r brics yn y wal gyda'n partneriaid i ddatblygu'r rhaglenni cydyfeirio fel eu bod yn gallu dechrau cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl yn gynnar yn 2007. Gallaf ymhelaethu ar y pwnc hwn wythnos i heddiw.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Our commitment is to carry on with the process of placing the bricks in the wall with our partners to develop the convergence programmes so that they can start as early as possible in 2007. I will be able to expand on this matter further in a week's time.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae cryn dipyn o ansicrwydd o ran sut y caiff y rhaglen hon ei gweithredu. Mae'r partneriaethau lleol wedi cael eu diddymu, i bob pwrpas, ac mae gan ddwy ardal strategaeth benodol, ond mae gweddill Cymru mewn rhyw fath o *limbo*. Deallaf mai'r syniad diweddaraf yw y caiff timau eu creu o fewn yr Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, wedi eu seilio yn bennaf ar grwpiau'r cynllun gofodol. Mae'n debyg mai swyddogion yr adran fydd yn bennaf gyfrifol am y rhain, ond a fydd rôl hefyd o fewn y grwpiau hyn i swyddogion awdurdodau lleol, neu swyddogion sy'n cynrychioli cyrff cyhoeddus a phreifat eraill fydd â diddordeb yn y maes, er mwyn sicrhau gweithrediad y rhaglen?

Alun Ffred Jones: There is some uncertainty as to how this programme will be implemented. The local partnerships have been abolished, to all intents and purposes, and there are two areas with a specific strategy, but the rest of Wales is in some kind of limbo. I understand that the latest idea is that teams will be created within the Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, based mainly on the spatial plan groups. It is likely that officials in the department will be mainly responsible for these, but will there also be a role in these groups for local authority officials, or officials representing other public and private bodies that would be interested in this matter, to ensure that the programme is implemented?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yn rhaid i mi ystyried rhai o'r pwyntiau manwl a wnaethoch. Credaf fod y sylw a wnaethoch ynglŷn â'r newid yn y rhaglenni a'r blaenoriaethau yn gywir. Fel ymateb i'r broses ymgynghori, yr ydym wedi gwneud rhai newidiadau i'r rhaglenni—nid wyf yn

The First Minister: I will have to consider some of the detailed points that you made. I think that the comment that you made about the change in the programmes and the priorities is correct. In response to the consultation process, we have made some changes to the programmes—I am not

sôn am y strwythur fiwrocraidd, ond y rhaglenni eu hunain—er mwyn rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar ymchwil a datblygu, a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, a fydd yn flaenoriaeth ar wahân yn awr. Rhoddir blaenoriaeth ar wahân hefyd i gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop a sgiliau ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Darparaf ateb ysgrifenedig manwl i'r pwyntiau ynglŷn â'r strwythur.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi cytuno, Brif Weinidog, i wneud datganiad am y rhaglen gydgyfeirio yn y Siambr yr wythnos nesaf. Gwyddoch ein bod yn hynod siomedig nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi trafod cynnwys y ddogfen ar y pwnc hwn gyda phob plaid yn y Cynulliad. Onid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn sylweddoli bod hon yn ddogfen hynod o bwysig a fydd yn effeithio ar economi gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd am y saith mlynedd nesaf? Oni fyddai wedi bod yn ddoeth i'r Llywodraeth geisio cael cefnogaeth pob plaid yn y Cynulliad i'r ddogfen hon, gan y byddai hynny'n cryfhau eich achos pan aiff y ddogfen gerbron Comisiwn Ewrop ym Mrwsel?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at ryw broses ad hoc a blêr. Yr ydym wedi dilyn rheolau gweithdrefnol y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi rhoi siawns i bob un o'r pwyllgorau perthnasol drafod y rhaglen. Credaf fod y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wedi ei drafod, a gwn fod y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol wedi ei drafod gan fy mod yn aelod o'r pwyllgor hwnnw. Cafodd y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau y cyfle i'w drafod, ond penderfynodd fod ganddo flaenoriaethau eraill. Felly, yr ydym wedi cynnal yr ymgynghoriad gan ddilyn y rheolau gweithdrefnol.

Jeff Cuthbert: I recently met officials from the Engineering Employers' Federation, and last night I met representatives from SummitSkills, which is a lead body in the engineering industry. They are particularly keen to engage with the Welsh Assembly Government in the delivery of the convergence programme. Do you agree that private employers will be crucial if we are to seriously address the skills gap issue, which will be a major driver in the convergence

referring to the bureaucratic structure, but to the programmes themselves—to place more emphasis on research and development, and information technology and communication, which will now be a separate priority. Separate priority will also be given to the European social fund and skills for young people. I will prepare a detailed written answer on the points regarding the structure.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You have agreed, First Minister, to make a statement on the convergence programme in the Chamber next week. You will know that we are extremely disappointed that the Government has not discussed the contents of the document on this subject with every party in the Assembly. Does the First Minister not realise that this document is exceptionally important and will have an impact on the economy of west Wales and the Valleys for the next seven years? Would it not have been wiser for the Government to try to seek the approval of every party in the Assembly for this document, as that would strengthen your position when the document goes before the European Commission in Brussels?

The First Minister: I think that you are referring to some kind of untidy, ad-hoc process. We have followed the Assembly's procedural rules. We have given each relevant committee the opportunity to discuss the programme. I believe that the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee has discussed it, and I know that the Committee on European and External Affairs has discussed it as I am a member of it. The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee was given the opportunity to discuss it, but it decided that it had other priorities. Therefore, we have carried out the consultation in line with the procedural rules.

Jeff Cuthbert: Cyfarfûm â swyddogion o Ffederasiwn y Cyflogwyr Peirianeg yn ddiweddar, a neithiwr, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o SummitSkills, sy'n gorff blaenllaw yn y diwydiant peirianeg. Maent yn neilltuol o awyddus i weithio â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu'r rhaglen gydgyfeirio. A gytunwch y bydd cyflogwyr preifat yn hanfodol os ydym am fynd ati o ddifrif i fynd i'r afael â mater bwch sgiliau, a fydd yn brif ysgogydd yn y

programme?

The First Minister: I think that we all accept that the period of seven years, which is coming to an end in three weeks' time, and the next period of seven years will have slightly different priorities. That is why, with general support during the consultation process, we have gone for a 60:40 split between the regional development fund, which tends to be a bit more hardware oriented, and the European social fund, which tends to be oriented more towards software and skills. We think that raising the percentage of European social funding from 30 per cent to 40 per cent makes sense for the next seven years. Similarly, in response to the particular point raised, not necessarily by the EEF employers, but more generally in the consultation process, as I said to Alun Ffred Jones not five minutes ago, the new ESF priority on skills for young people is one of the responses that we have made.

Mark Isherwood: Clearly, logic states that convergence funding between 2007 and 2013 is our last-chance saloon for creating the right economic conditions to attract investment and to allow companies to flourish. You will be aware that the Confederation of British Industry Wales and other business organisations raised concerns that 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' did not provide an action plan for skills, planning, energy, private sector employment and housing. What action do you propose now to ensure that front-line business leaders are given a leading role in plans for the regeneration of the Ynys Môn economy, for implementation before the planned closure of the Wylfa nuclear power plant in 2010 and the possible knock-on effects on Anglesey Aluminium Metals Ltd?

The First Minister: The establishment of the Môn a Menai strategy board, which has been set up three or four years in advance of the event that you described—or pair of events, if it turns out to be that—is a constructive move, and it is trying to draw in as much of the private sector in the Ynys Môn and Menai straits area as possible, to ensure that

rhaglen gydgyfeirio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod pawb yn derbyn y bydd blaenoriaethau'r cyfnod saith mlynedd hwn, a fydd yn dirwyn i ben ymhen tair wythnos, a blaenoriaethau'r cyfnod saith mlynedd nesaf ychydig yn wahanol. Dyna pam ein bod, gyda chefnogaeth gyffredinol yn ystod y broses ymgynghori, wedi penderfynu gwneud rhaniad 60:40 rhwng y gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol, sy'n tueddu i ganolbwyntio mwy ar galedwedd, a chronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, sy'n tueddu i edrych mwy ar galedwedd a sgiliau. Credwn fod codi canran cyllido cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop o 30 y cant i 40 y cant am y saith mlynedd nesaf yn gwneud synnwyr. Yn yr un modd, ac ymateb i'r pwynt penodol a godwyd, nid o angenrheidrwydd gan gyflogwyr Ffederasiwn y Cyflogwyr Peirianeg, ond yn fwy cyffredinol yn y broses ymgynghori, fel y dywedais wrth Alun Ffred Jones lai na phum munud yn ôl, yr ydym wedi ymateb i flaenoriaeth newydd Cronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop ar sgiliau ar gyfer pobl ifanc.

Mark Isherwood: Yn amlwg, mae rhesymeg yn dweud mai cael cyllid cydgyfeirio rhwng 2007 a 2013 yw'n cyfle olaf i greu'r amodau economaidd cywir i ddenu buddsoddiad a chaniatáu i gwmnïau ffynnu. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru a sefydliadau busnes eraill wedi mynegi pryderon nad oedd 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' yn darparu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer sgiliau, cynllunio, ynni, cyflogaeth sector preifat na thai. Pa gamau a gynigiwch yn awr er mwyn sicrhau bod arweinwyr busnes rheng flaen yn cael swyddogaeth flaenllaw yn y cynlluniau ar gyfer adfywio economi Ynys Môn a ddylai gael eu rhoi ar waith cyn bwrw ymlaen â'r bwriad o gau gorsaf niwclear Wylfa yn 2012, a chyn effaith bosibl hyn ar Alwminiwm Môn Cyf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae sefydlu bwrdd strategaeth Môn a Menai, a sefydlwyd dair neu bedair blynedd cyn y digwyddiad a ddisgrifiwyd gennych—neu fwy nag un digwyddiad os mai felly y bydd hi—yn gam adeiladol. Mae'n ceisio denu cymaint â phosibl o'r sector preifat yn ardal Ynys Môn ac afon Menai er mwyn sicrhau bod

there is a wide cross-section of interests driving the process of creating alternative jobs, both in the run-up to, during, and after the almost inevitable blow that will occur at the end of this decade.

trawstoriad eang o ddiddordebau wrth wraidd y broses o greu swyddi amgen cyn, yn ystod ac ar ôl yr ergyd anochel a fydd yn digwydd ddiwedd y degawd hwn.

Dyfodol y Diwydiant Llaeth The Future of the Welsh Dairy Industry

Q3 Mick Bates: Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of the Welsh dairy industry? OAQ2118(FM)

C3 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ2118(FM)

The First Minister: The Welsh dairy sector has a number of competitive advantages on which it now needs to capitalise. The strategic action plan for the dairy industry will be issued for consultation soon. This proposes a number of actions aimed at addressing the challenges undoubtedly facing the industry.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gan y sector llaeth yng Nghymru nifer o fanteision cystadleuol y mae angen iddo fanteisio arnynt yn awr. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu strategol ar gyfer y diwydiant llaeth yn cael ei gyhoeddi'n fuan ar gyfer ymgynghori arno. Mae hwn yn cynnig nifer o gamau sydd wedi'u hanelu at fynd i'r afael â'r sialensiau sydd, yn ddi-os, yn wynebu'r diwydiant.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. The Welsh dairy industry continues to survive, but in a weakened form—a bit like you, First Minister. The ability to get a fair return on their labour is critical to the survival of dairy farmers in Wales. Would you support a campaign for a fair price for Welsh milk, so that all retailers in Wales could have transparent accounting that would enable everyone to see what profit is made in each part of the food chain?

Mick Bates: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Mae'r diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru yn dal i oroesi, ond mae'n wan erbyn hyn—yn debyg i chi, Brif Weinidog. Mae'n hanfodol bod y ffermwyr llaeth yn cael tâl teg am eu gwaith os ydynt am oroesi. A fydddech yn cefnogi ymgyrch i gael pris teg ar laeth Cymru, fel y gallai cyfrifon pob manwerthwr yng Nghymru fod yn dryloyw er mwyn galluogi pawb i weld faint o elw a wneir ym mhob rhan o'r gadwyn fwyd?

The First Minister: You will be aware, Mick, that we have never expressed in any way that we thought that the price of milk could be set, any more than the price of houses or petrol could be set. That is beyond the powers of a First Minister of whatever colour. If you think that another First Minister could set the price of milk, and you want to tell farmers that, I think that you will get a ribald response to that assertion. What is important is that you try to help the industry to convert to meet the challenges, which do exist, to try to improve the farm-gate price and to improve its selling power against the massive buying power of the supermarkets.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Mick, nad ydym erioed wedi datgan, mewn unrhyw fodd, y gellid pennu pris llaeth mwy nag y gellid pennu prisiau tai neu brisiau petrol. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i allu Prif Weinidog, pa bynnag liw yw ei blaid. Os tybiwch y gallai Prif Weinidog arall bennu pris llaeth, a'ch bod yn dymuno dweud hynny wrth ffermwyr, credaf mai ateb coch iawn a gaech i'r honiad hwnnw. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw eich bod yn ceisio cynorthwyo'r diwydiant i drawsnewid er mwyn iddo ddiwallu'r sialensiau—sialensiau sydd yn bodoli—i geisio gwella'r prisiau yn y ffermydd eu hunain a gwella grym gwerthu'r diwydiant yn erbyn grym prynu'r archfarchnadoedd.

We know that the challenges are not unique to Wales; they apply across the industry. We

Gwyddom nad yw'r sialensiau'n unigryw i Gymru; maent yn berthnasol ym mhob rhan

know that the rationalisation of the industry into a smaller number of producers has been going on for many decades—at least four. We also know that there are wide differences between the lowest cost 25 per cent of producers in the industry, and the highest cost producers. There is something like a 12p production cost differential between the top 25 per cent and the bottom 25 per cent. If we can get greater efficiencies from those who are currently inefficient, that will be very helpful in ensuring the survival of the maximum number of producers.

Elin Jones: Mae pris llaeth wedi cael ei wasgu i'r lefel isaf posibl ar hyn o bryd, ac, fel yr ydych wedi cydnabod, mae hynny'n rhoi pwysau sylweddol ar y diwydiant. A ydych yn credu y byddai'n deg i feddwl bod eich Llywodraeth chi yn gallu cydnabod rôl archfarchnadoedd yn hyn o beth, ac yn cysylltu'n swyddogol â'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg i sicrhau bod adolygiad o rôl yr archfarchnadoedd a'r proseswyr mawr yn gwasgu'r pris llaeth i lawr, o ddydd i ddydd bron?

2.10 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna'r pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud wrth ateb Mick Bates. O ystyried faint o rym sydd gan ychydig brynwyr, bydd y diwydiant llaeth yn gweld y bydd yn gorfod gwneud rhywbeth yn debyg ar ochr gwerthwyr—y ffermwyr eu hunain a'r cwmnïau cydweithredol y maent yn aelodau ohonynt. Mae'n rhaid cael sefyllfa fwy cyfartal. Dyna'r ffordd i gael prisiau teg, neu i gael mwy o degwch yn y broses. Mae'n rhaid cael mwy o gryfder drwy gael llai o werthwyr i werthu llaeth i'r ychydig brynwyr sy'n rheoli'r farchnad.

Brynle Williams: Flwyddyn yn ôl, ceisiais sicrhau bod gwerthwyr yn cael yr un pris â proseswyr, ond mae'n drist nodi y pleidleisiwyd yn erbyn hynny. Un ffordd y gall y Llywodraeth ein helpu yw drwy geisio gwthio hynny drwodd. Yng ngweddill Ewrop, rhaid nodi'r pris a delir i broseswyr yn y wasg. Gwyddom beth mae cynhyrchwyr yn ei gael, a gwyddom beth mae gwraig tŷ yn ei dalu, ond y darn yn y canol yw'r broblem. A fydddech yn fodlon helpu gyda hynny?

o'r diwydiant. Gwyddom fod ad-drefnu wedi bod yn y diwydiant, gyda nifer y cynhyrchwyr yn lleihau bob blwyddyn ers degawdau—pedwar o leiaf. Gwyddom hefyd fod gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng y 25 y cant o gynhyrchwyr cost isaf yn y diwydiant, a'r cynhyrchwyr cost uchaf. Mae'r gwahaniaeth yn y gost gynhyrchu rhwng y 25 y cant uchaf a'r 25 y cant isaf yn debyg i 12c. Pe byddai'r rhai nad ydynt yn effeithlon ar hyn o bryd yn gallu bod yn fwy effeithlon, byddai hynny'n gymorth mawr i sicrhau bod cymaint â phosibl o gynhyrchwyr yn goroesi.

Elin Jones: The price of milk has been squeezed to the lowest possible level at the moment, and, as you have acknowledged, that puts considerable pressure on the industry. Do you believe that it would be fair to think that your Government could recognise the role of supermarkets in this, and officially contact the Office of Fair Trading to ensure that there is a review of the role of supermarkets and major processors, which are squeezing down the price of milk almost daily?

The First Minister: That is the point that I was trying to make in reply to Mick Bates. Given the power that lies in the hands of a small number of buyers, the dairy industry will see that it has to do something similar on behalf of sellers—the farmers and the co-operative companies to which they belong. A more level playing field is needed. That is how to secure fair prices, or more fairness in the process. More strength needs to be generated by having fewer sellers selling milk to the few buyers who dominate the market.

Brynle Williams: A year ago, I tried to ensure that sellers were paid the same price as processors, but, sadly, that was voted down. One way in which the Government could help us is by trying to push that through. In the rest of Europe, it is a requirement that the price paid to processors is published in the press. We know what producers are paid, and we know what the housewife pays, but it is the middle part that is the problem. Would you be willing to help with that?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, ond rhaid trafod y cynnig. Nid wyf yn siŵr a roddwyd cyfle i hynny yn y gorffennol ond ei fod wedi methu. Derbyniwn fod y pris hyd at dymor yr hydref yn eithaf isel o'i gymharu â phrisiau eraill ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn—mae'n 1c yn llai am bob litr na'r un pryd y llynedd. Felly, mae'r gwasgu yn parhau. Y cwestiwn i'w ofyn yw sut y gallwch gryfhau ochr y ffermwyr sy'n gwerthu eu llaeth i'r prynwyr mawr. Bydd unrhyw beth a all helpu yn cael ei ystyried, gan gynnwys eich cynnig chi.

Glyn Davies: It is easy for us all to agree that the current price of milk is damaging to the industry—and quite a big chunk of the industry will be unable to survive at this level—but it is far harder to understand what to do about the situation. We know that supermarkets have what many of us believe to be excessive power. The only way forward is to influence these players, and that has to be done at the highest possible level. This is easy to work out, so what steps have you taken to involve the authority of your office and Government in seeking genuine negotiations to change the attitude of supermarkets?

The First Minister: Carwyn Jones and I are strongly committed to trying to ensure that big supermarkets operating in Wales promote as much Welsh produce as possible. In some areas, that work has been exceedingly successful. However, that does not guarantee a higher price for milk. A premium is paid for organic milk, which is probably 7p or 8p higher than for other produce—it has been more than that at some stages. I believe that there is a shortage of organic milk to feed producers, such as Llaeth y Llan Village Dairy, Rachel's Organic Dairy and Trioni Ltd, so trying to help people to move into the premium sector is another area of work, as is trying to get farmers to form co-operative and processing companies. We provide processing and marketing grants, which we are keen on, and we hope that they will lead to farmers—particularly dairy producers—getting more of the profit, rather than leaving it to others beyond the farm gate.

The First Minister: Of course, but that proposal has to be debated. I am not sure whether that was given an opportunity in the past but that it failed. We accept that prices were fairly low up to this autumn compared with other prices at this time of year—it is 1p per litre cheaper than the price paid the same time last year. Therefore, the squeeze persists. The question to ask is how you can strengthen the hand of farmers who sell to the big buyers. Anything that may help will be considered, including your proposal.

Glyn Davies: Mae'n hawdd inni gytuno bod pris llaeth fel y mae ar hyn o bryd yn niweidio'r diwydiant—a bydd rhan helaeth o'r diwydiant yn methu â goroesi ar y lefel hon—ond mae'n llawer anoddach deall beth i'w wneud ynghylch y sefyllfa. Byddai amryw ohonom yn dweud bod gan archfarchnadoedd yr hyn y gellid ei alw'n ormod o rym. Yr unig ffordd ymlaen yw dylanwadu ar y chwaraewyr hyn, a rhaid gwneud hynny ar y lefel uchaf bosibl. Mae'n hawdd deall hyn, felly pa gamau yr ydych chi wedi eu cymryd i gynnwys awdurdod eich swyddfa a'ch Llywodraeth yn y broses o geisio negodi'n ddiffuant er mwyn newid agwedd yr archfarchnadoedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Carwyn Jones a minnau wedi ymrwymo'n gadarn i geisio sicrhau bod archfarchnadoedd mawr sy'n weithredol yng Nghymru yn hybu cynnyrch Cymru cymaint ag y bo modd. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n gwarantu cael pris uwch am laeth. Telir premiwm am laeth organig, sydd oddeutu 7c neu 8c yn uwch na'r premiwm ar gyfer cynhyrchion eraill—mae wedi bod yn fwy na hynny ar adegau. Credaf fod prinder mewn llaeth organig ar gyfer cynhyrchwyr, megis llaethdy Llaeth y Llan, Rachel's Organic Dairy a Trioni Ltd, felly mae cynorthwyo pobl i symud i'r sector premiwm yn faes gwaith arall, yn yr un modd ag y mae ceisio cael ffermwyr i ffurfio cwmnïau prosesu a chwmnïau cydweithredol. Byddwn yn darparu grantiau prosesu a marchnata—yr ydym yn frwd yn eu cylch—a gobeithiwn y byddant yn arwain at fwy o elw i'r ffermwyr—yn enwedig cynhyrchwyr llaeth—yn hytrach na bod yr elw hwnnw'n

cael ei adael i eraill y tu hwnt i lidiart y fferm.

Gwella Amseroedd Aros y GIG Improving NHS Waiting Times

Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies for improving NHS waiting times? OAQ2138(FM)

The First Minister: Our programme is to reduce further the maximum waiting times for Welsh residents so that, by December 2009, the target total wait for the whole patient journey, from GP referral to treatment, including all tests and therapies, will be no more than 26 weeks. That is why we have allocated £80 million a year for that purpose until March 2009.

Nick Bourne: The First Minister will be aware that waiting lists are 54 per cent higher now than when his party came to office in 1999. In light of that, is he confident of meeting the eight-month target by March 2007?

The First Minister: As reasonably confident as you can be in these circumstances, looking at the way in which progress has been pretty steadily sustained over the past two years, including the latest figures that came out last week, I think, both in terms of the actual drop in in-patient and out-patient waits over eight months and in the steady increase in the percentage of people who are seen in less than six months. More than 80 per cent of in-patients and 87 per cent of those on out-patient waiting list are now waiting less than six months.

Nick Bourne: Presiding Officer, if he looks at the in-patient and day cases in particular, he will see that they have clearly been increasing over the past three months.

I will press him on a slightly different point, which is the recent report published by the Welsh Consumer Council, of which he is probably aware, which shows that 47 per cent

C4 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiâu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwella amseroedd aros y GIG? OAQ2138(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein rhaglen yw gostwng ymhellach yr amseroedd aros hwyaf ar gyfer preswylwyr Cymru fel na fydd y targed amser aros ar gyfer siwrnai lawn y claf, o'r adeg pan fydd yn cael ei gyfeirio gan y meddyg teulu hyd nes y bydd yn cael y driniaeth, gan gynnwys yr holl brofion a'r therapïau, yn fwy na 26 wythnos erbyn Rhagfyr 2009. Dyna pam ein bod wedi neilltuo £80 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer y diben hwnnw hyd fis Mawrth 2009.

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod y rhestrau aros 54 y cant yn uwch yn awr nag yr oeddent pan etholwyd ei blaid ym 1999. Yng ngoleuni hynny, a yw'n hyderus y bydd yn cyrraedd y targed wyth mis hwnnw erbyn Mawrth 2007?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mor hyderus ag y gallwch yn rhesymol fod dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, ac edrych ar y ffordd y cynhaliwyd cynnydd yn eithaf cyson dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, gan gynnwys y ffigurau diweddaraf a ryddhawyd yr wythnos diwethaf, credaf, o ran y lleihad gwirioneddol mewn amseroedd aros cleifion preswyl a chleifion allanol dros wyth mis ac o ran y cynnydd cyson yng nghanran y bobl sy'n cael eu gweld mewn llai na chwe mis. Mae dros 80 y cant o gleifion preswyl ac 87 y cant o'r rhai hynny sydd ar restr aros cleifion allanol bellach yn disgwyl llai na chwe mis.

Nick Bourne: Lywydd, pe byddai'n edrych ar yr achosion cleifion mewnol ac achosion dydd yn benodol, fe wêl eu bod yn amlwg wedi bod yn cynyddu dros y tri mis diwethaf.

Pwysaf arno ar bwynt ychydig yn wahanol, sef yr adroddiad diweddar a gyhoeddwyd gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru, y tybiaf ei fod yn ymwybodol ohono, sy'n dangos bod 47 y

of respondents feel that they are not kept fully informed of milestones in their waits for treatment. Does he accept that it is important that patients are kept aware of the position and of where they are on the waiting list? What does he propose to do in response to the criticisms of the system contained in that report?

The First Minister: The in-patient rate dropped by 7 per cent between September and October 2006, which is quite an impressive performance, and the drop in out-patient waits was double that, at 15 per cent. I entirely accept the point about the total patient journey time, which is why we announced a figure for that total time, which, for the first time, is being targeted. That target includes waits for therapies and diagnostic tests in the middle of the patient journey, from GP referral to any treatment required at the end of the day. The 26-week target is novel for us in that sense, as it is for the total patient journey, and, after all, it is the total patient journey that the patient is interested in.

Nick Bourne: With respect, the point about the Welsh Consumer Council report was not just about the length of time that people are waiting, but also about patients and relatives being kept fully informed of progress when on a waiting list. The criticism is that there is not enough information about that. What does the Government propose to do in response to those specific criticisms about lack of information while people are on the waiting list?

The First Minister: I entirely accept that the Welsh Consumer Council may well have been referring to that. However, it is implicit in having such a target—which includes GP referral, any diagnostic tests, therapies, out-patient consultations, and in-patient or day-case treatment—that you have to be kept informed if that whole patient journey is to take place within a maximum of 26 weeks by the end of March 2009.

Val Lloyd: Waiting times are important to all

cant o ymatebwyr yn teimlo nad ydynt yn cael eu hysbysu'n llawn o gerrig milltir yn eu cyfnodau aros am driniaeth. A yw'n derbyn ei bod yn bwysig cadw cleifion yn ymwybodol o'u sefyllfa o ran eu safle ar y rhestr aros? Beth y mae'n cynnig ei wneud fel ymateb i'r beirniadaethau o'r system sydd yn yr adroddiad hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gostyngodd y gyfradd cleifion mewnol 7 y cant rhwng mis Medi a mis Hydref 2006, sy'n berfformiad eithaf clodwiw, ac yr oedd y gostyngiad mewn amseroedd aros cleifion allanol galw heibio yn ddwywaith hynny, sef 15 y cant. Derbyniaf y pwynt am gyfanswm amser taith cleifion yn llwyr, a dyna pam y cyhoeddasom ffigur ar gyfer y cyfanswm amser hwnnw, sydd, am y tro cyntaf, yn cael ei dargedu. Mae'r targed hwnnw'n cynnwys arosiadau am therapi a phroffion diagnostig yng nghanol taith y claf, o gael ei gyfeirio gan feddyg teulu hyd at unrhyw driniaeth sy'n angenrheidiol ar ddiwedd y dydd. Mae'r targed 26 wythnos yn rhywbeth newydd inni yn hynny o beth, gan ei fod ar gyfer cyfanswm taith y claf, ac, wedi'r cyfan, cyfanswm taith y claf sy'n bwysig i'r claf.

Nick Bourne: Gyda pharch, nid y cyfnod amser y mae pobl yn aros oedd unig destun adroddiad Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru, ond hefyd hysbysu cleifion a'u perthnasau'n llawn o'u sefyllfa pan fyddant ar restr aros. Y feirniadaeth yw nad oes digon o wybodaeth am hynny. Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn cynnig ei wneud i ymateb i'r beirniadaethau penodol hynny am ddiffyg gwybodaeth tra bo pobl ar y rhestr aros?

Y Prif Weinidog: Derbyniaf yn llwyr y gallai Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru fod wedi bod yn cyfeirio at hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymhlyg mewn targed o'r fath—sy'n cynnwys cyfeirio gan feddyg teulu, unrhyw broffion diagnostig, therapiâu, ymgynghoriadau i gleifion allanol, a thriniaeth i gleifion preswyl neu achosion dydd—bod rhaid parhau i hysbysu'r claf os yw ei daith gyfan am ddigwydd o fewn uchafswm o 26 wythnos erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth 2009.

Val Lloyd: Mae amseroedd aros yn bwysig

our constituents. In light of that, could you confirm, First Minister, that the surest way of damaging the chances of bringing down waiting times would be to deny the NHS in Wales the certainty that it needs by voting down the budget next week?

The First Minister: Yes, I would agree with that. The £80 million a year that has been allocated specifically to the NHS, on a by-results basis, to deliver the shorter waits in the period from this year through to 2009 is critical. That is the basis on which we will deliver that target. However, if the budget is voted down, the national health service will, inevitably, not have the same period in which to plan how to deliver that target. Therefore, it imperils the target, and I do not think that that would be welcomed by anyone in Wales.

Leanne Wood: One issue that has come up several times is that of people having to wait in accident and emergency departments at busy times. Last week, I asked you about accident and emergency services in Rhondda Cynon Taf and Merthyr, and, in your answer, you said that responsible political parties would look at the proposal and ask whether they were in the best interests of the patients. In your judgment, is the removal of accident and emergency services from either the Royal Glamorgan Hospital or Prince Charles Hospital the best way of looking after the interests of patients? If you are unable to answer that question now, will you look at the proposals and answer me in writing?

The First Minister: When the health service decides that, for technological reasons, it believes that a population of 300,000 or 400,000 is necessary to sustain the recruitment and training of top-quality junior doctors, who will become top-quality consultants, in accident and emergency departments, we have to listen. Some difficult decisions may then emerge, and it makes it impossible for any responsible Minister—either a Minister for health or a First Minister—of whatever party to say, ‘Whatever we have got now will never change’; otherwise, as I have said before, Sully and Llandough hospitals would still be TB sanatoriums, as they were 70 years ago.

i’n holl etholwyr. Ac ystyried hynny, a allech gadarnhau, Brif Weinidog, mai’r ffordd sicraf o beryglu’r cyfle o ostwng amseroedd aros fyddai gwrthod y sicrwydd sydd ei angen ar y GIG yng Nghymru drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y gyllideb yr wythnos nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn, byddwn yn cytuno â hynny. Mae’r £80 miliwn y flwyddyn sydd wedi’i ddyrannu’n benodol i’r GIG, ar sail ei ganlyniadau, i ddarparu’r arosiadau byrrach yn y cyfnod rhwng eleni a 2009, yn hanfodol. Ar sail hwnnw y byddwn yn cyflawni’r targed hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os pleidleisir yn erbyn y gyllideb, yn anochel, ni fydd gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yr un cyfnod amser i gynllunio sut i gyflawni’r targed hwnnw. Felly, mae’n peryglu’r targed, ac ni chredaf y byddai unrhyw un yng Nghymru’n croesawu hynny.

Leanne Wood: Un mater sydd wedi ymddangos nifer o weithiau yw pobl yn gorfod aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ar adegau prysur. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynnais ichi am y gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a Merthyr, ac, yn eich ateb, dywedasoch y byddai pleidiau gwleidyddol cyfrifol yn edrych ar y cynnig ac yn gofyn a oeddent er pennaf les y cleifion. Yn eich barn chi, ai tynnu gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys o Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg neu Ysbyty’r Tywysog Siarl yw’r ffordd orau o ofalu am les cleifion? Os na allwch ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw’n awr, a edrychwch ar y cynigion a rhoi ateb ysgrifenedig imi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pan benderfyna’r gwasanaeth iechyd, am resymau technolegol, fod angen poblogaeth o 300,000 neu 400,000 i gynnal y gwaith o recriwtio a hyfforddi meddygon iau o’r safon uchaf, a ddaw’n feddygon ymgynghorol o’r safon uchaf mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, mae’n rhaid inni wrando. Gallai fod angen gwneud rhai penderfyniadau anodd o ganlyniad i hyn, ac mae’n ei gwneud yn amhosibl i unrhyw Weinidog cyfrifol—boed yn Weinidog dros iechyd neu’n Brif Weinidog—o unrhyw blaid i ddweud ‘Wnaiff yr hyn sydd gennym yn awr fyth newid’; neu, fel yr wyf wedi dweud eisoes, byddai ysbytai Sili a Llandochau’n dal i fod yn sanatoria TB,

fel yr oeddent 70 mlynedd yn ôl.

2.20 p.m.

We know that it does not make sense to set the NHS in aspic and say that there will be never be any change. You only change because it is in the patients' best interests. You have to be able to recruit accident and emergency junior doctors, and they have to be able to train and become superb accident and emergency consultants. That is what we hope to see continuing in as many hospitals as possible in order to deliver top-quality accident and emergency care. Everyone wants that, and they want it at the end of the road, but they have to accept that there will be some changes.

Christine Gwyther: First Minister, one of the longest waiting lists, certainly in my constituency, is that to register with an NHS dentist. I know that you have a question on that later on. Do you agree that the recent injection of cash that we have received in Pembrokeshire, for instance, which has provided a supersurgery at Whitland, which takes 12,000 patients, needs to be rolled out across the rest of the county so that we can get all of our patients registered with an NHS dentist, especially those in the south-west of the county, where provision is extremely poor?

The First Minister: I am grateful that you have raised that issue, because the biggest percentage increase in health allocations in the present financial year is for dentistry. The allocation is rising from £88 million to £121 million, which is a 34 per cent increase in one year, in order to solve the problem that you have referred to, which is occurring as a result of some dentists deciding to leave the NHS. We hope that the turnaround during the year will be very impressive—that is what the service assures us. The £3 million that was put in mid-year, at the same time as the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme for schools, will be of particular benefit in those areas where NHS dentistry was showing a tendency to go private in the hope that people would not have a choice if the practice was the only one in town, and people would have to travel a long way for an NHS dentist. I

Gwyddom nad yw'n gwneud synnwyr gosod y GIG mewn asbig a dweud na fydd unrhyw newidiadau byth. Dim ond er pennaf les y cleifion y gwnewch unrhyw newidiadau. Rhaid ichi allu recriwtio meddygon iau ym maes damweiniau ac achosion brys, a rhaid iddynt allu hyfforddi a dod yn feddygon ymgynghorol ardderchog yn y maes. Dyna'r hyn y gobeithiwn ei weld yn parhau mewn cymaint â phosibl o ysbytai er mwyn darparu gofal o'r safon uchaf mewn damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae ar bawb eisiau hynny, ac mae arnynt ei eisiau yn y pen draw, ond rhaid iddynt dderbyn y bydd rhai newidiadau.

Christine Gwyther: Brif Weinidog, un o'r rhestri aros hiraf, yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i, yw'r un i gofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Gwn fod gennych gwestiwn ar hynny'n ddiweddarach. A gytunwch fod angen lledaenu'r arian yr ydym wedi'i dderbyn yn ddiweddar yn Sir Benfro, er enghraifft, sydd wedi darparu archddeintyddfa yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, sy'n derbyn 12,000 o gleifion, ar draws gweddill y wlad fel y gallwn gofrestru ein holl gleifion gyda deintydd GIG, yn enwedig y rhai hynny yn y de-orllewin, lle mae'r ddarpariaeth yn hynod o wael?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwnnw, oherwydd ym maes deintyddiaeth y mae'r cynnydd canrannol mwyaf mewn dyraniadau iechyd yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol. Mae'r dyraniad yn codi o £88 miliwn i £121 miliwn, sy'n gynydd 34 y cant mewn blwyddyn, er mwyn datrys y broblem yr ydych wedi cyfeirio ati, sy'n digwydd o ganlyniad i benderfyniad rhai deintyddion i adael y GIG. Gobeithiwn y bydd y newid yn ystod y flwyddyn yn drawiadol iawn—dyna'r hyn y mae'r gwasanaeth yn ein sicrhau. Bydd y £3 miliwn a roddwyd i mewn yng nghanol y flwyddyn, ar yr un pryd â'r rhaglen codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yng Nghymru ar gyfer ysgolion, o fudd penodol yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle'r oedd deintyddiaeth GIG yn dangos tuedd i fynd yn breifat, yn y gobaith na fyddai dewis gan bobl os mai'r ddeintyddfa oedd yr unig un yn

think that we have prevented that happening through that extra £3 million on top of the £30 million increase already provided, giving us the figure of £121 million, compared with £88 million last year. However, we have to ensure that dentistry is available on an NHS basis, within a reasonable travelling distance, throughout Wales.

Jenny Randerson: The achievement of waiting-times targets is often adversely affected by the cancellation of operations, and a significant number of operations are cancelled because of delayed transfers of care. The Social Services Inspectorate for Wales is on record as saying that each social services department in every council in Wales spends more on social services than your Government allocates to them, and yet social services departments throughout Wales are facing massive problems, given the increased number of care assessments that they are expected to do and the number of individuals that they are expected to support. That is a big contributor to delayed transfers of care. When will your Government take this serious issue on board?

The First Minister: That is a bit of a one-sided bleat on behalf of friends of yours running Cardiff County Council, I fear, Jenny. A little bit of balance might be in order, and you should perhaps be talking to the leadership of the Liberal Democrat council to see what more it can do to face up to the challenge. I have said this before and I will say it again: there are responsibilities that go with running a council or with running a country such as Wales, and people should not simply wave the finger of blame around in the hope that someone else will catch the flak, especially when they have most of the responsibility and ability to find the answers within their own little empires.

y dref, ac y byddai'n rhaid i bobl deithio ymhell i gael gweld deintydd GIG. Credaf ein bod wedi atal hynny rhag digwydd drwy'r £3 miliwn ychwanegol hwnnw ar ben y cynnydd o £30 miliwn a ddarparwyd eisoes, gan roi'r ffigur o £121 miliwn inni, o'i gymharu ag £88 miliwn y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod deintyddiaeth ar gael drwy'r GIG, o fewn pellter teithio rhesymol, ledled Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Yn aml, ceir effaith andwyol ar gyflawni targedau o ran amseroedd aros gan ganslo llawdriniaeth, a chaiff nifer sylweddol o lawdriniaethau eu canslo oherwydd oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Mae Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru wedi datgan ar goedd bod pob adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ym mhob cyngor yng Nghymru'n gwario mwy ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol nag y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei ddyrannu iddynt, ac eto mae adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru'n wynebu problemau enfawr, ac ystyried y nifer uwch o asesiadau gofal y disgwylir iddynt eu cyflawni a nifer yr unigolion y disgwylir iddynt eu cefnogi. Mae hynny'n cyfrannu'n fawr at oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Pryd bydd eich Llywodraeth yn talu sylw i'r mater difrifol hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gen i ofn mai bref unochrog ar ran eich ffrindiau sy'n rhedeg Cyngor Sir Caerdydd oedd honno, Jenny. Byddai rhywfaint o gydbwysedd yn gwneud lles, ac efallai y dylech siarad ag arweinwyr y cyngor Democrataidd Rhyddfrydol i weld sut y gallant wneud mwy i wynebu'r her. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn o'r blaen ac fe'i dywedaf eto: mae cyfrifoldebau ynghlwm wrth redeg cyngor neu redeg gwlad fel Cymru, ac ni ddylai pobl fod yn hapus i daflu cyhuddiadau o gwmpas gan obeithio y bydd y bai'n disgyn ar rywun arall, yn enwedig pan mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyfrifoldeb, a'r gallu i ganfod yr atebion, ganddynt hwy o fewn eu hymerodraethau bach eu hunain.

Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Dental Services

C5 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of NHS dental services in north Wales?

Q5 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau deintyddol y GIG yn y

OAQ2119(FM)

The First Minister: Local health boards have the responsibility for local commissioning, which gives them control of their own dentistry budgets to provide dental care to meet the local need and the wider oral health agenda. The north Wales region was the main beneficiary of the additional £3 million that we put in mid-year. North Wales received £1.4 million of that, but that is against the background of an already existing £30 million increase across Wales this financial year.

Brynle Williams: We have an impending problem in north Wales. Will you confirm that under the new NHS dental contracts to be offered in Flintshire and the rest of north Wales, children will no longer be treated if their parents are registered privately in mixed practices? What will happen to patients at these practices when existing contracts are renewed, as there simply will not be anywhere in Flintshire that can treat them all on the NHS. That problem is going to raise its head a great deal in future.

The First Minister: I do not have details of any particular contract problems with dentists or LHBs deciding that it is not possible to cover that in the new dental contract. I said earlier that, given that we increased the provision for dentistry from £88 million to, initially, £118 million—a rise of £30 million—and that we then added £3 million to make it an increase of £33 million, which is an increase of 34 per cent in one year, it is fair to say that we have prioritised dentistry this year. The PDS contracts have revolutionised and are continuing to revolutionise the access that people throughout Wales have to NHS dentistry. Particular quirks in the contract may still occur, and it is up to LHBs to try to solve those. However, we shall have to look into the particular point that you raised, so I will ask Brian Gibbons to respond to you on that in detail.

gogledd? OAQ2119(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu lleol, sy'n rhoi rheolaeth iddynt dros eu cyllidebau deintyddiaeth eu hunain i ddarparu gofal deintyddol sy'n diwallu'r angen lleol a'r agenda ehangach o ran iechyd geneuol. Rhanbarth y Gogledd a gafodd y budd pennaf o'r £3 miliwn ychwanegol a roesom i mewn yng nghanol y flwyddyn. Derbyniodd y Gogledd £1.4 miliwn o hynny, ond mae hynny yn erbyn y cefndir o gynnydd o £30 miliwn oedd yn bodoli eisoes ledled Cymru yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon.

Brynle Williams: Mae problem ar ein gwarthaf yn y Gogledd. A gadarnhewch fod y contractau deintyddol GIG newydd a gynigir yn Sir y Fflint a gweddill y gogledd yn datgan na chaiff plant eu trin bellach os yw eu rhieni wedi'u cofrestru'n breifat mewn deintyddfeydd cymysg? Beth sydd am ddigwydd i gleifion yn y deintyddfeydd hyn pan gaiff eu contractau presennol eu hadolygu, oherwydd ni fydd unman yn Sir y Fflint yn gallu eu trin i gyd ar y GIG. Mae'r broblem yna am ymddangos yn aml iawn yn y dyfodol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf fanylion unrhyw broblemau contract penodol lle mae deintyddion neu Fyrddau Iechyd Lleol wedi penderfynu nad yw'n bosibl ymdrin â hynny yn y contract deintyddol newydd. Dywedais eisoes, ac ystyried ein bod wedi cynyddu'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer deintyddiaeth o £88 miliwn i £118 miliwn, i ddechrau—a'n bod wedyn wedi ychwanegu £3 miliwn i'w wneud yn gynnydd o £33 miliwn, sy'n cynnydd o 34 y cant mewn blwyddyn, ei bod yn deg dweud ein bod wedi rhoi'r flaenoriaeth i ddeintyddiaeth eleni. Mae'r contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol wedi chwyldroi'r mynediad sydd gan bobl ledled Cymru at ddeintyddiaeth GIG, ac maent yn parhau i wneud hynny. Efallai y bydd rhai chwiwiau yn y contract yn dal i ymddangos, a chyfrifoldeb Byrddau Iechyd Lleol yw ceisio datrys y rheini. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhaid inni ystyried y pwynt penodol a godwyd gennych, felly gofynnaf i Brian Gibbons roi ymateb manwl ichi am hynny.

Janet Ryder: According to the NHS Direct website, it is the responsibility of local health boards to offer emergency out-of-hours services. However, in north Wales, only Flintshire's LHB website shows a number for people to call. As of last Sunday, 3 December, patients seeking emergency treatment at weekend clinics in Wrexham and Rhyl are advised to make an appointment rather than just turn up. Given that the definition of a dental emergency is: uncontrolled bleeding, acute spreading infection and swelling or accidental damage, do you think that it is acceptable not to allow patients to just turn up for immediate treatment in such emergencies? If you do not find that to be acceptable, what are you going to do about it?

The First Minister: Under the guidance issued just under a year ago, a dental emergency is one that might pose a significant threat to a patient's wellbeing. The guidance details the following as emergencies that would require access to immediate treatment: bleeding from a recent surgical site that will not stop—for example, post wisdom-tooth extraction; increased swelling, causing the patient to have difficulty with breathing or swallowing; and damage to teeth or jaws as a result of an accident. However, toothache is not classed as an emergency, and perhaps that is the cause of confusion at the heart of your question.

Eleanor Burnham: This is very interesting Minister. None of us is medical here, other than Doctor Gibbons. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'What about Dai Lloyd?'] Oh, I am so sorry. I apologise. Yes, and Dai Lloyd. However, we are splitting hairs here. Do you not agree that it is not up to the individual, until he or she has received treatment, to know whether it is an emergency? If someone has toothache, it may be because he or she has abscesses, which would certainly be detrimental to a person's health. However, my main question concerns the general lack of dentistry in north Wales. At a North Wales Regional Committee meeting on this issue last year, there were many raised voices on this vital area of health provision. Do you not agree that the fall in registration from 2004-05 is a cause for concern? I am sure that you

Janet Ryder: Yn ôl gwefan Galw Iechyd, cyfrifoldeb byrddau iechyd lleol yw cynnig gwasanaethau brys y tu allan i oriau gwaith. Fodd bynnag, yn y Gogledd, dim ond gwefan Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir y Fflint sy'n dangos rhif i bobl ei ffonio. Ddydd Sul diwethaf, 3 Rhagfyr, yr oedd cleifion sy'n ceisio triniaeth frys yn Wrecsam a'r Rhyl yn cael eu cynghori i wneud apwyntiad yn hytrach na mynd yno ar hap. Ac ystyried mai diffiniad argyfwng deintyddol yw: gwaedu afreolus, haint aciwt sy'n lledaenu a chwyddo neu niwed damweiniol, a ydych chi'n meddwl ei bod yn dderbyniol peidio â gadael i gleifion fynd i dderbyn triniaeth ar unwaith mewn argyfyngau o'r fath? Os nad ydych chi'n gweld hynny'n dderbyniol, beth ydych chi am ei wneud ynglŷn â'r peth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn unol â'r cyfarwyddyd a gyhoeddwyd lai na blwyddyn yn ôl, argyfwng deintyddol yw un a allai beri bygythiad arwyddocaol i les claf. Mae'r cyfarwyddyd yn nodi'r canlynol fel argyfyngau y byddai angen triniaeth ar eu cyfer ar unwaith: gwaedu o safle llawdriniaeth ddiweddar na ellir ei atal—er enghraifft, ar ôl tynnu cildannedd ôl; chwyddo difrifol, sy'n achosi i'r claf gael anhawster anadlu neu lyncu; a niwed i ddannedd neu safnau o ganlyniad i ddamwain. Fodd bynnag, ni ystyrir bod y ddannodd yn argyfwng, ac efallai mai dyna sydd wedi achosi'r dryswch yn eich cwestiwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae hyn yn ddiddorol iawn, Weinidog. Nid oes unrhyw un ohonom yn bobl feddygol yma, ar wahân i Doctor Gibbons. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Beth am Dai Lloyd?'] O, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Ie, a Dai Lloyd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn holli blew yma. Oni chytunwch nad cyfrifoldeb yr unigolyn yw gwybod a yw rhywbeth yn argyfwng tan y bydd wedi derbyn triniaeth? Os yw'r ddannodd ar rywun, gall fod oherwydd fod ganddynt grawniadau, a fyddai'n sicr yn niweidiol i iechyd rhywun. Fodd bynnag, mae fy mhrif gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r diffyg deintyddiaeth cyffredinol yn y Gogledd. Mewn cyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarthol Gogledd Cymru ar y mater hwn y llynedd, codwyd nifer o leisiau ar y maes pwysig hwn o ddarpariaeth iechyd. Oni chytunwch fod y cwmp mewn cofrestriadau

can furnish me with up-to-date figures, but in 2005, the percentage of people registered with an NHS dentist fell to 26 per cent, and a pitiful 11 per cent of children were registered with an NHS dentist. I am sure that you will tell me what the exact up-to-date figures are, but surely there are issues around rurality and the lack of training of new dentists. What are you going to do about these important issues for the sake of our general wellbeing and health?

The First Minister: Perhaps you should have listened to some of the earlier answers. I fear that I am boring everyone else in the Assembly. Perhaps I am not boring you, because you may not have heard it until now. There has been an increase of 34 per cent in the dentistry budget in one year, from £88 million to £121 million. Therefore, the figures that you quoted for 2005 are likely to be totally out of date by now. The figure of £121 million includes the additional emergency sum of £3 million, which was given mid-year. Half of that went to north Wales, and the rest went to mid and south-west Wales in the main, because those were the areas where the erosion of access to NHS dentistry had been greatest. Therefore, we believe that a transformation is taking place in rebuilding access to the NHS at a dramatic pace through the new PDS contracts.

ers 2004-05 yn achos pryder? Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch roi'r ffigurau diweddaraf imi, ond yn 2005, cwmpodd canran y bobl sydd wedi'u cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG i 26 y cant, ac 11 y cant truenus o blant oedd wedi'u cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG. Yr wyf yn siŵr y dywedwch wrthyf beth yw'r union ffigurau diweddaraf, ond mae'n siŵr mai rhai o'r materion dan sylw yw gwledigrwydd a diffyg hyfforddiant i ddeintyddion newydd. Beth yr ydych am ei wneud ynglŷn â'r materion pwysig hyn er ein lles a'n hiechyd cyffredinol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Efallai y dylech fod wedi gwranddo ar rai o'r atebion cynharach. Mae arnaf ofn fy mod yn peri syrffed i bawb arall yn y Cynulliad. Efallai nad wyf yn peri syrffed i chi, oherwydd efallai nad ydych wedi clywed hyn tan nawr. Mae cynnydd o 34 y cant wedi bod yn y gyllideb deintyddiaeth mewn blwyddyn, o £88 miliwn i £121 miliwn. Felly, mae'n debygol bod y ffigurau a roesoch ar gyfer 2005 yn hollol amherthnasol bellach. Mae'r ffigur o £121 miliwn yn cynnwys y swm argyfwng ychwanegol o £3 miliwn, a roddwyd yng nghanol y flwyddyn. Aeth hanner hwnnw i'r Gogledd, ac aeth y gweddill i'r Canolbarth a'r De-orllewin yn bennaf, oherwydd dyna'r ardaloedd lle'r oedd mynediad at ddeintyddiaeth GIG wedi lleihau fwyaf. Felly, credwn fod trawsnewid yn digwydd o ran ailagor y drws at wasanaethau'r GIG ar gyflymder dramatig drwy'r contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol newydd.

Gweithredu Polisiâu Iechyd The Implementation of Health Policies

Q6 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the implementation of the Welsh Assembly Government's health policies?
OAQ2127(FM)

The First Minister: Our prime aim is to support improvements in patient access to NHS services, and recent years have seen a significant improvement in the way that healthcare services are planned, delivered and managed. We are also tackling health inequalities, increasing capacity through more training, supporting NHS staff, and dealing with emergency pressures.

C6 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am weithredu polisiâu iechyd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?
OAQ2127(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein prif nod yw cefnogi gwella mynediad cleifion at wasanaethau'r GIG, ac mae gwelliant sylweddol wedi bod yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau gofal iechyd eu cynllunio, eu darparu a'u rheoli. Yr ydym hefyd yn mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd, yn cynyddu gallu drwy fwy o hyfforddiant, yn cefnogi staff y

GIG, ac yn ymdrin â phwysau achosion brys.

2.30 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: Before I ask my supplementary question, I assure you, First Minister, that I have listened to your previous responses on dentistry, so I know what you have said; this is also a dentistry question.

Almost 200 constituents have come to me just from the Llanelli area of my region, seeking my support in looking for an NHS dentist. Almost all of those constituents—with the exception of three—have been told that they have to wait at least six months before they can be registered. These people are not necessarily in an emergency condition, but they want to know—and they include children and families—that the service will be there.

I believe that, in your response to Christine Gwyther, you mentioned something about the service assuring us that progress has been made, and I do not believe that any of us would deny the considerable investment that you have made. The service assures you of one thing, but the experience of my constituents—and the constituents of other Members—suggests that the resources that are going in are not coming out at the other end. Therefore, what are you and your Minister for Health and Social Services doing to monitor the situation, going beyond accepting the service assuring you that this is changing? What hope can you hold out to those constituents of mine, and to constituents in other regions and constituencies, that those long waits, which I believe Christine Gwyther also referred to, will be shortened as soon as possible?

The First Minister: Of the extra £30 million, almost £20 million went into the new personal dental services and general dental services contracts. Very little of the £3 million that was provided on an emergency basis mid-year went to south-east Wales, because the erosion of NHS dentistry provision was not as great in Cardiff, Swansea, and the remainder of south-east Wales. Therefore, as well as the £1.4 million that went to north Wales, which we have

Helen Mary Jones: Cyn gofyn fy nghwestiwn atodol, fe'ch sicrhaf, Brif Weinidog, fy mod wedi gwranddo ar eich atebion blaenorol am ddeintyddiaeth, felly gwn beth yr ydych wedi'i ddweud; cwestiwn am ddeintyddiaeth yw hwn hefyd.

Mae bron 200 o etholwyr wedi dod ataf o ardal Llanelli yn unig yn fy rhanbarth, yn ceisio fy nghefnogaeth wrth edrych am ddeintydd dan y GIG. Dywedwyd wrth bron bob un o'r etholwyr hyn—ac eithrio tri—fod yn rhaid iddynt aros o leiaf chwe mis cyn y gellir eu cofrestru. Nid yw'r bobl hyn o reidrwydd mewn cyflwr o argyfwng, ond mae arnynt eisiau gwybod—ac maent yn cynnwys plant a theuluoedd—y bydd y gwasanaeth yno.

Credaf, yn eich ymateb i Christine Gwyther, ichi sôn rhywbeth am y gwasanaeth, gan ein sicrhau y symudwyd ymlaen, ac nid wyf yn credu y byddai neb ohonom yn gwadu'r buddsoddiad sylweddol yr ydych wedi'i wneud. Mae'r gwasanaeth yn haeru un peth ichi, ond awgryma profiad fy etholwyr—ac etholwyr Aelodau eraill—nad yw'r adnoddau sy'n mynd i mewn yn dod allan y pen arall. Felly, beth yr ydych chi a'ch Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei wneud i fonitro'r sefyllfa, y tu hwnt i dderbyn haerid y gwasanaeth wrthyfod fod hyn yn newid? Pa obaith y gallwch chi ei gynnig i'r etholwyr hynny o'm heiddo, ac i etholwyr mewn rhanbarthau ac etholaethau eraill, y caiff yr arosiadau hir hyn, y credaf y cyfeiriodd Christine Gwyther atynt hefyd, eu byrhau cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Y Prif Weinidog: O'r £30 miliwn ychwanegol, aeth bron £20 miliwn i mewn i'r contractau gwasanaethau deintyddol personol a gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol newydd. Ychydig iawn o'r £3 miliwn a ddarparwyd ar sail argyfwng yng nghanol y flwyddyn a aeth i'r De-ddwyrain, am nad oedd erydiad darpariaeth deintyddiaeth y GIG gynddrwg yng Nghaerdydd, Abertawe a gweddill y De-ddwyrain. Felly, yn ogystal â'r £1.4 miliwn a aeth i'r Gogledd yr ydym wedi

already mentioned, the next largest chunk, at £1.28 million, went to mid and west Wales, especially Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire. That is not to say that, by a particular date in the middle of the year, or slightly past the middle of the year, such as November, all problems would have been solved, but I hope that they will be by 31 March. If you have details, I would be grateful if you could send them to me or Brian, because we rely on information from the coalface, as it were, if it is not working, and we have another four months to try to solve it.

Lorraine Barrett: On the implementation of your Government's health policies and improving services for patients, First Minister, will you speak to the Minister for Health and Social Services about the concerns of many patients regarding changes to the dermatology service at the University Hospital of Wales that are being proposed by Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust? I appreciate that you may not get directly involved in that, but we have had many representations from concerned patients, because of the uncertainty of the service that they will get.

The First Minister: As well as doing the proper thing by raising it here with me, and therefore with Brian, who will have heard everything that you have said, so that it can be taken up in the meetings that Brian, and, occasionally, I have with the management of Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, the important thing and the correct course of action for the people who are making the complaints—and we are aware of them—as well as speaking to you as an Assembly Member, is to speak to the community health council. I would have thought that a change in service of this nature would require the community health council's consent before it can be approved. If the council, as the patient's voice, disapproves of it, it then goes to the Minister on appeal for final determination.

Jonathan Morgan: A few months ago, you and the Minister for Health and Social Services said in the Chamber that people who wanted access to NHS dentistry in Wales would get it if they wanted it. You further

sôn amdano'n barod, aeth y talp mwyaf wedyn, sef £1.28 miliwn, i'r Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, yn enwedig Sir Benfro a Sir Gaerfyrddin. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud y byddai pob problem wedi'i datrys erbyn dyddiad penodol yng nghanol y flwyddyn, neu ychydig wedi canol y flwyddyn, fel Tachwedd, ond gobeithiaf y byddant erbyn 31 Mawrth. Os oes gennych fanylion, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech eu hanfon ataf fi neu at Brian, oherwydd yr ydym yn dibynnu ar wybodaeth o lygad y ffynnon, fel petai, os nad yw'n gweithio, ac mae gennym bedwar mis arall i geisio'i datrys.

Lorraine Barrett: O ran gweithredu polisiau iechyd eich Llywodraeth a gwella gwasanaethau i gleifion, Brif Weinidog, a wnewch chi siarad â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynglŷn â phryderon llawer o gleifion ynghylch newidiadau i'r gwasanaeth dermatoleg yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru sy'n cael eu cynnig gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro? Sylweddolaf na fydd gennych ran uniongyrchol yn hynny, efallai, ond yr ydym wedi cael llawer o gleifion pryderus yn cysylltu â ni, oherwydd ansicrwydd y gwasanaeth a gânt.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ogystal â gwneud y peth iawn trwy ei godi yma gyda mi, ac felly gyda Brian, a fydd wedi clywed popeth a ddywedaso, fel y gellir ei godi yn y cyfarfodydd a gaiff Brian, a minnau weithiau, gyda rheolwyr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, y peth pwysig a'r peth iawn i'w wneud i'r bobl sy'n gwneud y cwynion—ac yr ydym yn ymwybodol ohonynt—yn ogystal â siarad â chi fel Aelod Cynulliad, yw siarad â'r cyngor iechyd cymuned. Buaswn wedi meddwl y byddai newid o'r natur hwn yn y gwasanaeth yn gofyn am gydsyniad y cyngor iechyd cymuned cyn y gellid ei gymeradwyo. Os bydd y cyngor, fel llais y cleifion, yn ei anghymeradwyo, yna aiff i'r Gweinidog ar apêl i'w benderfynu'n derfynol.

Jonathan Morgan: Ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, dywedaso chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Siambr y byddai'r bobl a oedd eisiau mynediad at ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yng Nghymru yn ei

confirmed in answers to Members, as did the Minister for Health and Social Services, that money would not be an issue. Are you now backtracking from that commitment, or are you willing to restate that no-one in Wales will be denied access to an NHS dentist?

The First Minister: I do not believe that I am backtracking on anything. I repeat exactly what I said before; I do not have anything to add to it, or to take away from it. The service assured us that it had enough money put into the system, namely the extra £30 million, which is a 33 per cent increase on last year's budget, and the extra £3 million, which adds another 1 per cent, to make a 34 per cent increase in one year—from £88 million to £121 million. The last £3 million was not given, in the main, to south-east Wales, because the erosion of NHS dentistry did not occur to the same extent there. You can never give an absolute guarantee to every single person—there will always be people who fall out of the system. However, I will repeat exactly what I said before, and I do not backtrack from it at all: the service assures us that money is not an issue, and that everyone who wants NHS dentistry should be able to get it by 31 March.

Catherine Thomas: You will be aware from your recent visit to my constituency, First Minister, of the level of support in the community for the local health service. Do you agree that any decisions made concerning the design and delivery of future services must be carried out in an open and transparent way, as advocated by this Government as it develops and implements its health policies? With that in mind, do you approve of secret ballots by a community health council when deciding on crucial areas of service change, such as retaining emergency surgery at Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli?

The First Minister: Openness and transparency are the hallmarks of any attempt to carry the public with you in any major changes that you are making. If you are

gael os oedd arnynt ei eisiau. Bu ichi gadarnhau ymhellach mewn atebion i Aelodau, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, na fyddai arian yn broblem. A ydych yn awr yn mynd yn ôl ar yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, ynteu a ydych yn fodlon ailddatgan na chaiff neb yng Nghymru ei atal rhag gweld deintydd dan y GIG?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu fy mod yn mynd yn ôl ar unrhyw beth. Ailadroddaf yn union beth a ddywedais o'r blaen; nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu ato, nac i'w gymryd oddi wrtho. Rhoddodd y gwasanaeth sicrwydd inni fod ganddo ddigon o arian i'w roi i mewn i'r system, sef y £30 miliwn ychwanegol, sy'n gynydd o 33 y cant ar gyllideb y llynedd, a'r £3 miliwn ychwanegol, sy'n ychwanegu 1 y cant arall, i wneud cynnydd o 34 y cant mewn un flwyddyn—o £88 miliwn i £121 miliwn. Ni roddwyd y £3 miliwn olaf i'r De-ddwyrain, yn bennaf am nad oedd deintyddiaeth y GIG wedi erydu i'r fath raddau yno. Ni allwch byth roi gwarant absoliwt i bob un person—bydd pobl o hyd yn disgyn allan o'r system. Fodd bynnag, fe ailadroddaf yn union beth a ddywedais o'r blaen, ac nid wyf yn mynd yn ôl arno o gwbl: mae'r gwasanaeth yn ein sicrhau nad yw arian yn broblem, ac y dylai pawb sydd eisiau deintyddiaeth y GIG allu ei chael erbyn 31 Mawrth.

Catherine Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol yn sgîl eich ymweliad diweddar â'm hetholaeth, Brif Weinidog, o lefel y gefnogaeth yn y gymuned i'r gwasanaeth iechyd lleol. A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i unrhyw benderfyniadau a wneir ynglŷn â dyluniad a chyflwyniad gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol gael eu gwneud mewn modd agored a thryloyw, fel yr anogir gan y Llywodraeth hon wrth iddi ddatblygu a gweithredu'i pholisïau iechyd? Gyda hynny mewn golwg, a ydych yn cymeradwyo bod cyngor iechyd cymuned yn cynnal pleidleisiau cudd wrth benderfynu ar feysydd allweddol o ran newid gwasanaeth, megis cadw llawfeddygaeth frys yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae bod yn agored a thryloyw'n hanfodol i unrhyw ymgais i gario'r cyhoedd gyda chi mewn unrhyw newidiadau mawr yr ydych yn eu gwneud. Os

asking whether I should determine what the voting system is in a community health council, I would regret having to get involved in that level of detail. However, the broad principle is that openness and transparency are at the heart of trying to take the public with you; without openness and transparency, it makes it much more difficult to carry the public with you. I do not know who determines the rules for voting in community health councils—I hope it is not me—but I hope that they will try to ensure that they carry the public with them when they consider what is a very important patient-voice role.

Peter Black: You may be aware that, because the community health council in Swansea has objected to the closure of Fairwood Hospital and ward 1 at Hill House Hospital, their fates now lie in the hands of your Minister. I do not expect you to be able to comment on that issue today, but—and I know that Brian is listening to this—can you ask the Minister to take account, in making his decision, of the impact of such a closure on other community services, particularly those provided by the social services department of Swansea? Will you also ask him to consider how replacement services can be paid for?

The First Minister: I cannot comment on the detail, as you said, Peter. I know one of those hospitals extremely well, although not the other. It is extremely important that the views of community health councils are taken into account. Community health councils have disappeared in England, but we still have them in Wales because we want them to be an essential patient voice. They must act as advocates for what they believe to be the best interests of patients in their areas. When they have made a decision to oppose a proposed change, the issue comes to the Minister; I am sure that he will be taking all representations made to him into account before he makes his mind up.

ydych yn gofyn a ddylwn i benderfynu beth yw'r system bleidleisio mewn cyngor iechyd cymuned, byddwn yn gresynu gorfod ymhél â'r lefel honno o fanylder. Fodd bynnag, yr egwyddor yn fras yw bod agwedd agored a thryloyw wrth galon ceisio mynd â'r cyhoedd gyda chi; heb agwedd agored a thryloyw, mae'n llawer anos cario'r cyhoedd gyda chi. Ni wn pwy sy'n penderfynu ar y rheolau ar gyfer pleidleisio mewn cynghorau iechyd cymuned—gobeithio nad fi mohono—ond gobeithiaf y ceisiant sicrhau eu bod yn cario'r cyhoedd gyda hwy pan ystyriant rôl sydd yn un bwysig iawn, sef bod yn llais i gleifion.

Peter Black: Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol, oherwydd i'r cyngor iechyd cymuned yn Abertawe wrthwynebu cau Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg a ward 1 yn Ysbyty Hill House, bod eu tynged bellach yn nwylo eich Gweinidog chi. Nid wyf yn disgwyl ichi allu rhoi sylw ar hynny heddiw, ond—a gwn fod Brian yn gwrandao ar hyn—a allwch ofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried, wrth wneud ei benderfyniad, effaith cau'r rhain ar wasanaethau cymunedol eraill, yn enwedig y rhai a ddarperir gan adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Abertawe? A wnewch chi ofyn hefyd iddo ystyried sut y gellir talu am y gwasanaethau eraill hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf roi sylw ar y pwynt manwl, fel y dywedasoeh, Peter. Yr wyf yn adnabod un o'r ysbytai hynny'n dda iawn, ond nid y llall. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig ystyried sylwadau cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned wedi diflannu yn Lloegr, ond maent yn dal gyda ni yng Nghymru oherwydd bod arnom eisiau iddynt fod yn llais hanfodol i gleifion. Rhaid iddynt weithredu fel eiriolwyr dros yr hyn y credant sydd er budd gorau cleifion yn eu hardaloedd. Pan fyddant wedi gwneud penderfyniad i wrthwynebu newid a gynigir, daw'r mater ger bron y Gweinidog; yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ef yn ystyried pob sylw a gyflwynir iddo cyn gwneud ei benderfyniad.

Pontydd Bridges

Q7 William Graham: What assessment has the First Minister made of the economic importance of the M4/M48 road bridges to

C7 William Graham: Pa asesiad mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i wneud o bwysigrwydd economaidd pontydd ffordd yr M4/M48 i

Wales? OAQ2124(FM)

The First Minister: You cannot overestimate the importance of the two road bridges into Wales. The new M4 has, to an extent, replaced the old M4, but I think that we all accept that the step change in accessibility from south Wales to south-central England and London and the continent, which occurred 40 years ago when the first Severn bridge opened, led to an enormous improvement in accessibility from this part of the world to the major markets of England.

William Graham: Can you make some inquiries and provide some further reassurance regarding an article that appeared in the *Western Mail* saying that the Severn bridge wires could be snapping at a rate of one a month? You will know that one lane has already been closed in both directions and that a weight limit has been imposed. That is clearly a necessary and important restriction, which hopefully will not last long, but can you provide some reassurance?

The First Minister: Due to the peculiar geography of the Severn bridge, although you cannot get on and off the bridge in England, both its pillars are in England, so it is the responsibility of the Highways Agency; it is not a shared responsibility, but entirely the Department for Transport's responsibility. However, it is true that the DfT co-operates strongly with Transport Wales and our highways directorate. The information that we have been given by the Highways Agency is that corrosion, according to a recent investigation, is worse than previously thought. I do not know about the slightly coloured language that appeared in the *Western Mail*—that may or may not be true—but corrosion appears to be a more serious problem than was previously appreciated, and, for some reason, it is more serious than on the Forth bridge, which is two years older. However, investigations are continuing.

Janet Davies: Road crossings across the Severn estuary are obviously important, but, equally so is the rail crossing, which is quite limited and can cause restrictions in services. What discussions have you had with the UK transport Minister and with Network Rail

Gymru? OAQ2124(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd y ddwy bont ffordd i mewn i Gymru. Mae'r M4 newydd, i raddau, wedi disodli'r hen M4, ond yr wyf yn meddwl ein bod i gyd yn derbyn bod y cam mawr a gymerwyd i agor de Cymru i dde-ganol Lloegr a Llundain a'r cyfandir, a ddigwyddodd 40 mlynedd yn ôl gydag agor pont gyntaf Hafren, wedi arwain at welliant mawr yng ngallu'r rhan hon o'r byd i gael mynediad i brif farchnadoedd Lloegr.

William Graham: A allwch wneud ymholiadau a rhoi sicrwydd pellach ynglŷn ag erthygl a ymddangosodd yn y *Western Mail* yn dweud y gallai gwifrau pont Hafren fod yn torri ar gyfradd o un bob mis? Gwyddoch fod un lôn eisoes wedi'i chau i'r ddau gyfeiriad a bod cyfyngiad pwysau wedi'i osod. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn gyfyngiad angenrheidiol a phwysig, na fydd yn para'n hir, gobeithio, ond a allwch roi rhywfaint o sicrwydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Oherwydd daearyddiaeth arbennig pont Hafren, er nad oes modd mynd ar y bont a dod oddi arni yn Lloegr, mae ei dau biler yn Lloegr, felly cyfrifoldeb yr Asiantaeth Briffyrdd ydyw; nid cyfrifoldeb a rennir, ond cyfrifoldeb yr Adran Drafndiaeth yn gyfan gwbl. Fodd bynnag, y mae'n wir fod yr Adran Drafndiaeth yn cydweithredu'n agos gyda Thrafnidiaeth Cymru a'n cyfarwyddiaeth briffyrdd ni. Y wybodaeth a roddwyd inni gan yr Asiantaeth Briffyrdd yw bod y rhwd, yn ôl ymchwiliad diweddar, yn waeth nag a dybiwyd gynt. Nid wyf yn gwybod am yr iaith liwgar braidd a ymddangosodd yn y *Western Mail*—gall hynny fod yn wir neu beidio—ond mae'n ymddangos bod rhwd yn broblem fwy difrifol nag a ragwelwyd cyn hyn, ac, am ryw reswm, mae'n fwy difrifol nag ar bont Forth, sydd ddwy flynedd yn hŷn. Fodd bynnag, mae ymchwiliadau'n parhau.

Janet Davies: Mae croesiadau ffyrdd dros foryd Hafren yn amlwg yn bwysig, ond, yr un mor bwysig yw'r croesiad rheilffordd, sydd yn eithaf cyfyng ac a all achosi cwtogi gwasanaethau. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth y

about the possibility of a second rail crossing across the Severn estuary?

Deyrnas Unedig a chyda Network Rail am y posibilrwydd o gael ail groesiad rheilffordd ar draws foryd Hafren?

2.40 p.m.

The First Minister: I have not had any so far. That idea has been floated from time to time and people sometimes express regret that the second Severn crossing did not include an overland rail crossing, as an alternative to the tunnel. The tunnel is a magnificent structure, but it is getting quite old now—it must be 120 or 130 years old. As far as I am aware, there are no current discussions on that. We are attempting to respond in the context of the Eddington Transport Study, which fortunately swung attention away from investing a vast amount of resources in a north-south British equivalent of the TGV. That therefore provides more opportunities for de-bottlenecking and modernising investments, which would include, if it were needed, a replacement for, or a supplement to, the present Severn tunnel.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi cael dim hyd yn hyn. Mae'r syniad hwnnw wedi'i wyntyllu o bryd i'w gilydd ac weithiau bydd pobl yn mynegi gofid nad oedd ail groesiad Hafren yn cynnwys pont reilffordd, fel dewis arall yn lle'r twnnel. Mae'r twnnel yn adeiledd godidog, ond mae'n heneiddio'n sylweddol erbyn hyn—mae'n rhaid ei fod yn 120 neu 130 mlwydd oed. Hyd y gwn i, nid oes trafodaethau cyfredol ar hynny. Yr ydym yn ceisio ymateb yng nghyd-destun Astudiaeth Drafnidiaeth Eddington, a drodd y sylw i ffwrdd, drwy lwc, oddi wrth fuddsoddi swm aruthrol o adnoddau mewn system a fyddai'n cyfateb i'r TGV rhwng gogledd a de Prydain. Mae hynny felly'n rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn dileu tagfeydd a moderneiddio, a fyddai'n cynnwys, pe bai angen, darpariaeth i gymryd lle, neu ategu, twnnel presennol Hafren.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Many people regard the excessive tolls on the Severn bridge almost as an importation tax for Wales. We know that the fault for this lies in the Severn Bridges Act 1992 that set up the bridge—the same Act that forbids us from using credit or debit cards to pay to cross it. It is also the same Act that will give the bridge back to the public sector after a shortened period of time because of heavy usage of the bridge. Could you tell us whether you, staff from your department, or any of your colleagues, have had conversations with your London Government about what will happen to these bridges at the end of their toll period? Are you seeking any changes to the Act that governs them so that we can have a more progressive system of taxation for coming into Wales than the one that we have at the moment?

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Mae llawer o bobl yn gweld y tollau gormodol ar bont Hafren bron fel treth fewnforio i Gymru. Gwyddom mai Deddf Pontydd Hafren, a sefydlodd y bont, sydd ar fai am hyn—yr un Ddeddf sy'n ein gwahardd rhag defnyddio cardiau credyd neu ddebyd i dalu am ei chroesi. Dyma'r Ddeddf hefyd a fydd yn rhoi'r bont yn ôl i'r sector cyhoeddus ar ôl cyfnod amser sydd wedi'i fyrhau oherwydd defnydd trwm ar y bont. A allech ddweud wrthym a gawsoch chi, staff o'ch adran, neu unrhyw un o'ch cyd-Weinidogion, sgysiau gyda'ch Llywodraeth yn Llundain ynghylch beth fydd yn digwydd i'r pontydd hyn ar ddiwedd eu cyfnod codi toll? A ydych yn ceisio unrhyw newidiadau i'r Ddeddf sy'n eu rheoli fel y gallwn gael system fwy blaengar o drethiant am ddod i mewn i Gymru na honno sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd?

The First Minister: Let us look at this broadly. In the context of the Eddington report, the issue is about road charging and whether it will take its place, side by side, with toll crossings, or whether toll crossings

Y Prif Weinidog: Gadewch inni edrych ar hyn yn fras. Yng nghyd-destun adroddiad Eddington, y cwestiwn yw codi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd ac a yw hynny am ddigwydd ochr yn ochr â thollau croesi, neu

will simply become another part of road charging—that is probably what will happen. Whatever we do in Wales will require primary legislation to introduce road charging and huge investment in in-car technology. Everybody says that the technology is 10 to 15 years away, but they were saying that 10 or 15 years ago, so it seems to be a permanently moving feast of 10 to 15 years. Without the technology, none of that can take place.

Michael German: The bridges will have transferred to the public sector before a universal road charging scheme will have been introduced in the United Kingdom. However, there is still an issue about the use of the bridges and the fact that you cannot pay with a credit or debit card—you have to pay in cash or have a TAG. The fact that, from January, you will have to pay over £5 for a domestic car, and so much more for other vehicles, suggests that we should be trying to find a way of looking at the future of the bridges, in which Wales will play a crucial part. Now is the time to do that in the context of current discussions. That is why I asked you whether you had opened discussions with your colleagues in London about the future of those two bridges.

The First Minister: The point that I was making was that there is a 30-year term for all this and I do not think that there is any likelihood of the crossings becoming toll free before 2021—it would be in 2016 at the earliest, but there is also a five-year permission to build up a sinking fund to cover major maintenance after that. So, 2021 is the date envisaged in the Severn Bridges Act 1992. The important thing is that, by then, we would hope that general road charging technology—some sort of pay-as-you-go scheme—will have come in to cover most major motorways as well as estuarial crossings.

Michael German: There is an earlier trigger of course, First Minister, and that is the number of vehicles crossing the bridge—the number of vehicles can draw that date forward. Some estimates see the bridges

yn teu a fydd tollau croesi yn mynd yn rhan o'r broses godi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd—mae'n debyg mai dyna a wnaiff ddigwydd. Beth bynnag a wnawn ni yng Nghymru, bydd angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i gyflwyno codi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd a buddsoddiad enfawr mewn technoleg mewn ceir. Dywed pawb fod y dechnoleg 10 i 15 mlynedd i ffwrdd, ond yr oeddent yn dweud hynny 10 neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl, felly mae'n ymddangos mai gwledd 10 i 15 mlynedd sy'n symud yn barhaol yw hon. Heb y dechnoleg, ni all dim o hynny ddigwydd.

Michael German: Bydd y pontydd wedi'u trosglwyddo i'r sector cyhoeddus cyn y bydd cynllun codi tâl am ddefnyddio ffyrdd wedi'i gyflwyno'n gyffredinol yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, mae problem yn dal i fodoli gyda defnyddio'r pontydd a'r ffaith na ellir talu gyda cherdyn credyd na debyd—mae'n rhaid talu mewn arian parod neu gael TAG. Mae'r ffaith y bydd raid, o fis Ionawr, dalu dros £5 am gar domestig, a chymaint mwy am gerbydau eraill, yn awgrymu y dylem fod yn ceisio canfod ffordd o edrych ar ddyfodol y pontydd, y bydd gan Gymru ran allweddol ynddi. Dyma'r amser i wneud hynny yng nghyd-destun y trafodaethau cyfredol. Dyna pam y gofynnais ichi a oeddech wedi agor trafodaethau gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn Llundain ynglŷn â dyfodol y ddwy bont hyn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y pwynt oedd gennyf fi oedd bod tymor 30 mlynedd ar gyfer hyn i gyd ac nid wyf yn meddwl bod unrhyw debygrwydd y bydd y croesiadau'n ddi-doll cyn 2021—byddai yn 2016 ar y cynharaf, ond mae caniatâd pum mlynedd yn bodoli hefyd i adeiladu cronfa ad-dalu i dalu am weithfeydd cynnal mawr wedi hynny. Felly, 2021 yw'r dyddiad a ragwelir yn Neddf Pontydd Hafren 1992. Y peth pwysig yw y byddem yn gobeithio y bydd technoleg taliadau ffyrdd cyffredinol—rhyw fath o gynllun talu wrth fynd—wedi dod i mewn erbyn hynny ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o'r prif draffyrdd yn ogystal â chroesfannau moryd.

Michael German: Y mae pwynt terfyn cynharach, wrth gwrs, Brif Weinidog, sef y nifer o gerbydau sy'n croesi'r bont—gall y nifer o gerbydau dynnu'r dyddiad hwnnw ymlaen. Mae rhai amcangyfrifon yn gweld

being returned to public ownership in 2012, which is well within the timeframe that we are talking about, so we ought to be having that discussion now.

The First Minister: Yes, except that I think that you are forgetting the five years after that, during which the Highways Agency will probably wish to exercise its right to build up a sinking fund to cover the major maintenance problems that William Graham referred to on Severn bridge 1.

dychwelyd y pontydd i feddiant cyhoeddus yn 2012, sydd yn hawdd o fewn y ffrâm amser yr ydym yn sôn amdani, felly dylem fod yn trafod hynny'n awr.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ie, heblaw fy mod yn meddwl eich bod yn anghofio'r pum mlynedd wedi hynny, pryd y bydd yr Asiantaeth Briffyrdd, mae'n debyg, yn awyddus i arfer ei hawl i adeiladu cronfa ad-dalu i ofalu am y problemau cynnal a chadw mawr y cyfeiriodd William Graham tynt ar bont Hafren 1.

Trafnidiaeth Integredig Integrated Transport

C8 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am dtrafnidiaeth integredig yng Ngheredigion? OAQ2135(FM)

Q8 Elin Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on integrated transport in Ceredigion? OAQ2135(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi darparu £3.8 miliwn i helpu partneriaeth bysiau Ceredigion, TrawsCambria a gwasanaethau bysiau lleol i ddarparu system drafnidiaeth integredig effeithiol. Mae Network Rail hefyd yn cynnal astudiaeth ddichonoldeb ar wella gwasanaethau rhwng yr Amwythig ac Aberystwyth.

The First Minister: We have provided £3.8 million to support the Ceredigion quality bus partnership, TrawsCambria and local bus services to help deliver an effective integrated transport system. Network Rail is also conducting a feasibility study on improving services between Shrewsbury and Aberystwyth.

Elin Jones: Mae eich Llywodraeth chi wedi ariannu rhai bysys lleol newydd yng Ngheredigion a'r gorllewin, ac mae rhai o'r gwasanaethau lleol yno wedi gwella, ond mae'r bysys hynny yn awr yn cael eu defnyddio ar gyfer teithiau pedair awr o Aberystwyth i Gaerdydd—siwrnai y Traws Cambria. Euthum ar y siwrnai honno'r wythnos diwethaf, ac mae'r bysys a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y siwrnai hir honno yn gwbl anaddas—mae'r seddau'n anghyffyrddus ac nid oes tai bach ar y bysus. Yr wyf wedi cael llawer o gwynion gan bobl ynglŷn ag ansawdd y bysys hynny ar deithiau hir. Pan oeddwn yn fyfyrwraig yng Nghaerdydd ryw 20 mlynedd yn ôl, defnyddiwn y Traws Cambria yn aml iawn, a rhaid dweud bod y bysys bryd hynny'n fwy cyffyrddus na'r bysys lleol a ddefnyddir ar y rhwydwaith yn awr. A gytunwch ei bod yn bryd inni gael rhwydwaith o fysys pellter hir sy'n gyffyrddus ac yn bwrsol at y teithiau hir hynny, a hynny ledled Cymru i sicrhau bod pobl yn gadael eu ceir gartref ac yn mynd ar y bysys?

Elin Jones: Your Government has funded some new local buses in Ceredigion and west Wales, and some of those local services have improved, but those buses are now being used for the four-hour journey from Aberystwyth to Cardiff—the Traws Cambria journey. I undertook that journey last week, and the buses that are used on that long journey are completely inappropriate—the seats are uncomfortable and there are no toilets on the buses. I have received many complaints from people about the condition of those buses on long journeys. As a student in Cardiff around 20 years ago, I used the Traws Cambria regularly, and the buses at that time were more comfortable than the local buses that are currently used on that network. Do you agree that it is time for us to have a network of long-distance buses that are comfortable and are specifically for those longer journeys, and that we have those across Wales to ensure that people leave their cars at home and travel on the buses?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna'r syniad, yn sicr, ond o ran rhai ardaloedd, mae'r siwrnai ar draws cefn gwlad o Gaerdydd i Aberystwyth neu'n ôl yn eithaf anodd gan nad yw'r heolydd yn rhai esmwyth i deithio arnynt. Yr wyf i yn perthyn i'r genhedlaeth a allai ddefnyddio gwasanaeth trên o Gaerdydd i Aberystwyth, a byddai hanner pobl ifanc y chweched dosbarth yr oeddwn i yn ei fynychu yn mynd yno o'r herwydd. Wrth gwrs, dyna'r genhedlaeth olaf i wneud hynny oherwydd toriadau'r Arglwydd Beeching. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn ceisio ateb y galw. Beth yw'r galw hwnnw? Ai myfyrwyr o Aberystwyth a'r cyffiniau sy'n astudio yng Nghaerdydd, neu fel arall, sydd angen gwasanaeth, ynteu bobl sy'n gwneud mwy o siwrneiau byr? Mae ystadegau, fel arfer, yn dwyllodrus, ond maent yn dangos, fel arfer, fod mwy o bobl sydd am deithio 20 milltir neu lai ar fws nag sydd am deithio 100 i 150 o filltiroedd. Er hynny, yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedwch—rhaid i fsys fod yn rhesymol o gyffyrddus os yw pobl am deithio arnynt am bedair awr.

Lisa Francis: The Network Rail feasibility study on the Cambrian line that you referred to is most welcome, but were you aware that, last March, Mid Wales Transportation, TraCC, made a presentation to the former Committee on Rail Infrastructure and Improved Passenger Services, advocating installing a park-and-ride facility at Dyfi Junction? Such an initiative would encourage people, particularly commuters, to travel to Abersytwyth, by allowing them to park their cars and access train services outside the congested town centre. TraCC has said that it is keen to work with your Government and Network Rail to provide vehicular access and parking as part of the Glandyfi bends road improvement scheme. That would, of course, enhance your Government's relocation strategy to Aberystwyth. How far have discussions progressed on that particular initiative, and will your Government be supporting it?

The First Minister: I can say that we are looking at it, but I cannot give you an estimate of how far we have got with it. However, it is certainly being examined as a

The First Minister: That is certainly the idea, but in terms of parts of Wales, the journey across rural Wales from Cardiff to Aberystwyth or vice versa is quite difficult because the roads are not comfortable to travel on. I come from a generation that could use the train service from Cardiff to Aberystwyth, and half the young people from the sixth form that I attended went there because of that. Of course, that was the last generation to do so because of the cuts under Lord Beeching. What is important is that we try to meet the demand. What is that demand? Is it students from Aberystwyth and the area who are studying in Cardiff, or the other way around, who need the service, or is it people who undertake shorter journeys? Statistics are usually quite deceiving, but they usually show that more people wish to travel 20 miles or less than 100 to 150 miles. However, I accept what you say—buses must be reasonably comfortable if people are going to travel on them for four hours.

Lisa Francis: Mae'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb gan Network Rail ar reilffordd y Cambrian y cyfeiriasoch ati i'w chroesawu'n fawr, ond a wyddech fod Trafnidiaeth Canolbarth Cymru, TraCC, wedi rhoi cyflwyniad, fis Mawrth diwethaf, i'r cyn-Bwyllgor ar Seilwaith y Rheilffyrdd a Gwella Gwasanaethau i Deithwyr, yn dadlau dros osod cyfleuster parcio a reidio yng Nghyffordd Dyfi? Byddai cynllun o'r fath yn cymell pobl, a chymudwyr yn benodol, i deithio i Abersytwyth, drwy adael iddynt barcio eu ceir a chael mynediad i wasanaethau trenau y tu allan i ganol y dref lle y ceir tagfeydd. Mae TraCC wedi dweud ei fod yn awyddus i weithio gyda'ch Llywodraeth a chyda Network Rail i ddarparu mynediad i gerbydau a manau parcio fel rhan o'r cynllun gwella ffyrdd ar droadau Glandyfi. Byddai hynny, wrth gwrs, yn hwyluso strategaeth adleoli'ch Llywodraeth ar gyfer Aberystwyth. Pa mor bell yr aeth y trafodaethau ar y cynllun hwnnw, ac a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth ei gefnogi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf ddweud ein bod yn ei ystyried, ond ni allaf roi amcan i chi o ba mor bell yr aethom arno. Fodd bynnag, mae'n sicr yn cael ei ystyried fel

possibility.

posibilrwydd.

Lefelau Anweithgarwch Economaidd Economic Inactivity Levels

Q9 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on economic inactivity levels in Wales? OAQ2131(FM)

C9 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru? OAQ2131(FM)

The First Minister: The number of people of working age who are economically inactive in west Wales and the Valleys fell by 9 per cent between 1999—when the Assembly came into existence—and the year to March 2006. That compares with a reduction of 4 per cent for Wales as a whole, and an increase of 4 per cent across the UK for the same period.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gostyngodd nifer y bobl o oedran gweithio sydd yn economaidd anweithgar yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd 9 y cant rhwng 1999—pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fodolaeth—a'r flwyddyn hyd fis Mawrth 2006. Mae hynny'n cymharu â gostyngiad o 4 y cant ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, a chynnydd o 4 y cant ledled y DU yn yr un cyfnod.

Janet Ryder: At the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee meeting on 5 October 2006, an update was given on economic inactivity following the committee's report on the subject a year ago. During the course of that meeting, it became apparent that, while all the committee members, including the Labour ones, were under the impression that the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee was the lead committee on this subject, it proved not to be the case. After a bit of head scratching, the officials said that the lead department is the Department of Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. I tabled questions on 17 November through the Table Office to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills on economic inactivity—there still seems to be some confusion about to whom they should go, as I was initially told that they should go to Andrew Davies, who is responsible for economic inactivity. Nobody has come back to us on that, and I am still trying to clarify the matter. This seems to show a bit of mismanagement and a lack of joined-up thinking on the part of your Government, if not even your Members or officials seem to know who is in charge of one of the crucial aspects of economic development. How can your Government be taking the problem of economic inactivity seriously if you do not really know who is responsible for leading the work?

Janet Ryder: Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ar 5 Hydref 2006, rhoddwyd yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am anweithgarwch economaidd yn dilyn adroddiad y pwyllgor ar y pwnc hwnnw flwyddyn yn ôl. Yn ystod y cyfarfod hwnnw, daeth yn amlwg, er bod holl aelodau'r pwyllgor, gan gynnwys y rhai Llafur, dan yr argraff mai'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau oedd y pwyllgor arweiniol ar y pwnc hwn, nad felly yr oedd. Ar ôl ychydig o grafu pen, dywedodd y swyddogion mai'r adran arweiniol yw'r Adran Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau. Cyflwynais gwestiynau ar 17 Tachwedd drwy'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau am anweithgarwch economaidd—mae'n ymddangos bod peth dryswch o hyd ynghylch pwy a ddylai eu cael, gan y dywedwyd wrthyf yn gyntaf y dylent fynd at Andrew Davies, sydd yn gyfrifol am anweithgarwch economaidd. Ni ddaeth neb yn ôl atom ynghylch hynny, ac yr wyf yn dal i geisio egluro'r mater. Mae'n ymddangos bod hyn yn arwydd o ryw faint o gamreoli a diffyg meddwl cydgysylltiedig ar ran eich Llywodraeth, os nad yw hyd yn oed eich Aelodau neu'ch swyddogion yn ymddangos eu bod yn gwybod pwy sydd yn gyfrifol am un o'r agweddau hollbwysig ar ddatblygu economaidd. Sut y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn gallu cymryd problem anweithgarwch economaidd o ddifrif os na wyddoch yn iawn pwy sydd yn gyfrifol am arwain y gwaith?

2.50 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before I invite the First Minister to answer one or perhaps two of those questions, I emphasise that no Minister has responsibility for what the Table Office does. The Table Office is responsible, through me, to all Assembly Members.

The First Minister: I was going to dare to hint that there was something obsessive about the structure of the question. Rather than ask about economic inactivity, you did not seem to accept the guidance that I gave to you the last time that this question arose, namely that Jane Davidson is the Minister who takes the lead on the issue. It does not mean that Andrew Davies does not have a strong interest in the issue—clearly he does—but the important thing is that the inactivity rate in Wales is coming down, and has come down substantially during the period of this Assembly, whereas the rate has gone up in the UK as a whole. The inactivity rate has come down much more rapidly in west Wales and the Valleys than in Wales as a whole, which shows a considerable shrink in the gap in economic inactivity rates in the right direction for west Wales and the Valleys. You should get yourself into the frame of mind of looking at the issue, Janet, rather than becoming obsessed with problems that you have had with the Table Office, for which I have no responsibility.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am sure that you would agree that one of the ways of reducing future economic inactivity is to ensure that school pupils receive good career advice from a range of occupational areas. Do you agree that one of those areas is the armed forces? Provided that the armed forces are invited into schools and given the opportunity to explain the range of career and training programmes that they can offer, including full modern apprenticeships in a range of engineering subjects, do you also agree that it is right and proper, in a controlled environment such as a school, that pupils are allowed to hear the options that are open to them?

The First Minister: Yes.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn imi wahodd y Prif Weinidog i ateb un neu efallai ddau o'r cwestiynau hynny, pwysleisiaf nad oes yr un Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am beth a wnaiff y Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Mae'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno'n ymatebol, drwof fi, i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn am feiddio awgrymu bod rhywbeth obsesiynol ynghylch ffurf y cwestiwn. Yn hytrach na holi am anweithgarwch economaidd, nid oedd yn ymddangos eich bod yn derbyn y cyfarwyddyd a roddais i chi y tro diwethaf y cododd y cwestiwn hwn, sef mai Jane Davidson yw'r Gweinidog sydd yn arwain ar y mater hwn. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad yw Andrew Davies yn ymddiddori'n fawr yn y mater hwn—y mae, wrth gwrs—ond y peth pwysig yw bod y gyfradd anweithgarwch yng Nghymru'n gostwng, a'i bod wedi gostwng yn sylweddol yn ystod cyfnod y Cynulliad hwn, tra bo'r gyfradd wedi codi yn y DU gyfan. Mae'r gyfradd anweithgarwch wedi gostwng yn gyflymach o lawer yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd nag yng Nghymru gyfan, ac mae hynny'n dangos bod y bwlch rhwng y cyfraddau anweithgarwch yn lleihau'n sylweddol er budd gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Dylech roi'ch bryd ar ystyried y mater hwn, Janet, yn hytrach nag ymboeni'n ormodol ynghylch problemau a gawsoch gyda'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno, nad oes gennyf unrhyw gyfrifoldeb drostynt.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech mai un modd i leihau anweithgarwch economaidd yn y dyfodol yw sicrhau bod disgyblion ysgol yn cael cyngor da ar yrfaeodd mewn amryw o feysydd galwedigaethol. A ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r meysydd hynny yw'r lluoedd arfog? Ar yr amod y caiff y lluoedd arfog eu gwahodd i ysgolion ac y cânt gyfle i egluro'r dewis o raglenni gyrfa a hyfforddiant y gallant eu cynnig, gan gynnwys prentisiaethau modern llawn mewn amryw o bynciau peirianyddol, a ydych hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn iawn ac yn briodol, mewn amgylchedd rheoledig fel ysgol, i ddisgyblion gael clywed am y dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A gaf i ddod yn ôl at y cysylltiad amlwg yr ydych wedi ei wneud rhwng anweithgarwch economaidd a chyfrifoldebau'r Gweinidog addysg? Er eich bod yn dweud bod y ffigurau wedi gostwng, mae'n amlwg bod anweithgarwch economaidd yn parhau i fod yn broblem mewn nifer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru. Oni fydddech yn derbyn felly y byddai buddsoddi mwy mewn addysg a hyfforddiant yn lleihau anweithgarwch economaidd ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r holl gwestiwn yn ymwneud â sgiliau, cyngor ar yrfaedd, a'r dewis sydd gan blant sy'n gadael yr ysgol, o ran dewis mynd i'r coleg neu i brifysgol, ac yna aros yng Nghymru neu gael swydd sy'n gyfatebol i'r math o radd, ddiploma neu gymhwyster a gyflawnwyd. Dyna'r pethau pwysig, a dyna pam y dywedais yn gynharach ein bod wedi cynyddu'r canran o arian o'r gronfa Ewropeaidd newydd, sy'n dechrau fis Ionawr, sy'n mynd i'r ochr gymdeithasol a sgiliau, o 30 y cant yn y saith mlynedd bresennol i 40 y cant yn y saith mlynedd sy'n dechrau ym mis Ionawr. Felly, mae'r buddsoddiad hwnnw yn digwydd, nid gan ddilyn y patrwm yr ydych yn ei gynnig, ond drwy osod y flaenoriaeth lle mae ei hangen o ran pob peth yr ydym yn ei wneud er mwyn cynyddu nifer y sgiliau y gallwch eu dysgu, a sicrhau bod y sgiliau hynny'n cyfateb i'r gallu sydd gan y bobl ifanc sy'n gadael ysgolion a cholegau, fel eu bod yn gallu cael swyddi cyfatebol yng Nghymru wedi hynny.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yn yr ateb hir hwnnw, bu ichi osgoi sôn am fuddsoddi mewn addysg yn llwyr. Os na roddir mwy arian i ysgolion yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd mwy o ddsbarthiadau â dros 30 o blant a bydd nifer o athrawon yn colli eu swyddi. Os yr ydym yn cytuno bod angen codi safon addysg ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru, sut y gallwch ddweud ar y naill law bod addysg yn bwysig gan wrthod rhoi arian i'r ysgolion hynny ar y llaw arall?

Y Prif Weinidog: Efallai eich bod wedi camddeall y cynnig a wnaeth Sue Essex yn y

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I wish to come back to the obvious link that you have made between economic inactivity and the responsibilities of the education Minister. Although you say that the figures have fallen, it is apparent that economic inactivity continues to be a problem in many areas of Wales. Would you not accept therefore that greater investment in education and training would reduce economic inactivity in all areas of Wales?

The First Minister: The whole question is to do with skills, career advice, and the options available to children who are leaving school, in terms of choosing to go to college or to university, and then staying in Wales or getting a job that is equivalent to the type of degree, diploma or qualification that they have gained. Those are the important things, and that is why I said earlier that we have increased the percentage of the funding from the new European fund, which is starting in January, to fund social issues and skills, from 30 per cent in the current seven years to 40 per cent for the seven-year period that is starting in January. Therefore, that investment is taking place, not exactly in line with the pattern that you have just proposed, but by placing the priority where it is required in terms of everything that we do in order to increase the number of skills that people can acquire, and to ensure that those skills match the ability of those young people who are leaving schools and colleges, so that they can gain employment that matches their skills in Wales in the future.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: In that lengthy response, you completely avoided mentioning investment in education. Unless more funding is made available to schools in next year's budget, there will be more classes with more than 30 children and many teachers will lose their jobs. If we are both agreed that we need to raise the standard of education in every school in Wales, how can you say on the one hand that you believe that education is important while refusing to provide funding for schools on the other?

The First Minister: Perhaps you have misunderstood the proposal that Sue Essex

gyllideb. Mae wedi cynnig £2 filiwn ychwanegol ar y funud olaf fel nad oes straen o ran ynni ar gyllidebau ein hysgolion, ac mae hefyd wedi clustnodi 70 y cant o'r gyllideb a ddyrannwyd i ysgolion, sef arian cyfatebol i staff ysgolion, fel bod yr arian a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer staff ysgolion yn osgoi'r 1 y cant o arbedion effeithlonrwydd yr ydym am eu gweld ar draws y sector gyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n achub ysgolion rhag bod mewn perygl o gollu arian ychwanegol, sy'n dod i gyfanswm o ryw £13 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydych chi'n ceisio amddiffyn biwrocratiaeth mewn llywodraeth leol; yr ydym ni yn ceisio achub ysgolion rhag cael unrhyw doriadau yn eu cyllidebau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I find that an extraordinary answer because what you are saying to local authorities is, 'You cannot now pass on efficiency savings to schools, but take it away from social services, highways and waste disposal.' What we are saying, and you know it perfectly well, is that local authorities, particularly in areas such as Anglesey, Gwynedd and Ceredigion, have had a poor rate support settlement from your Government—Anglesey has the lowest in Wales at 3 per cent. The real losers as a result of your statement today will be children in our schools because there has to be more money on the table for them. It is no good rearranging the deckchairs within local authorities. What they want to hear from you is that more money is on the table. Will you accept that the only way in which our children can be properly educated next year without class sizes going up and teachers being sacked is if the Government makes it clear that education, education, education is its priority?

The First Minister: I did not seek to trap you by my previous answer, Ieuan; you have fallen into a trap entirely of your own making. I answered a question and told you that by exempting 70 per cent of the schools' delegated budget, which is roughly equivalent to the staff costs of running schools, we had saved schools from any danger of having something like £11.5 million of cuts, and we put another £2 million in to cover the unexpectedly high

has put forward in the budget. She has proposed an additional £2 million at the last minute so that there is no strain on school budgets in terms of energy, and she has ring-fenced 70 per cent of the budget allocated to schools, namely the match funding for staff, so that the funding allocated for school staffing would not be affected by the 1 per cent efficiency saving that we have proposed across the public sector. That will ensure that schools will not face any danger of losing out on additional funding, which would come to a total of around £13 million next year. You are attempting to defend bureaucracy in local government; we are trying to save schools from any cuts in their budgets.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn gweld yr ateb hwnnw'n un rhyfedd iawn oherwydd yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol yw, 'Ni chewch drosglwyddo arbedion effeithlonrwydd i ysgolion yn awr, ond cymerwch hwy oddi wrth wasanaethau cymdeithasol, priffyrdd a gwasanaethau gwaredu gwastraff.' Yr hyn yr ydym ni'n ei ddweud, a gwyddoch hynny'n berffaith iawn, yw bod awdurdodau lleol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel Ynys Môn, Gwynedd a Cheredigion, wedi cael setliad gwael ar gyfer cynnal y trethi gan eich Llywodraeth—Ynys Môn sydd â'r isaf yng Nghymru, sef 3 y cant. Y rhai a fydd ar eu colled mewn gwirionedd o ganlyniad i'ch datganiad heddiw yw'r plant yn ein hysgolion gan fod rhaid cael mwy o arian ar eu cyfer. Nid yw'n werth cyboli â manion o fewn awdurdodau lleol. Yr hyn y maent am ei glywed gennych chi yw bod mwy o arian ar gael. A wnewch dderbyn mai'r unig fodd i addysgu ein plant yn iawn y flwyddyn nesaf heb gynyddu maint dosbarthiadau a diswyddo athrawon yw i'r Llywodraeth egluro mai addysg yw ei blaenoriaeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oeddwn yn ceisio'ch maglu gyda'm hateb blaenorol, Ieuan; yr ydych wedi syrthio i fagl o'ch gwneuthuriad eich hun. Atebais gwestiwn a dweud wrthyhych ein bod, drwy eithrio 70 y cant o gyllideb ddirprwyedig yr ysgolion, sydd yn cyfateb yn fras i'r costau staff ar gyfer rhedeg ysgolion, wedi achub ysgolion rhag unrhyw berygl o brofi toriadau o tua £11.5 miliwn, a rhoesom £2 filiwn arall i dalu am y biliau annisgwyl o uchel am ynni. Mae hynny'n bendant yn rhoi

energy bills. That gives schools an additional £13.5 million for sure that they did not know that they had. You then came back, forgetting all about schools, and asked, 'What about waste disposal and all the other aspects of local government?'. Are you interested in schools or are you not? If you are, why do you come back with all this stuff about waste disposal and all the other departments of local government? We have done what you asked for, namely to give a guarantee that schools' budgets next year cannot be cut for any reason other than falling school rolls. We have given you that, but you have now changed your tune. You are more interested in local government bureaucracy than the schools, and you have just proved it.

£13.5 miliwn ychwanegol i ysgolion na wyddent ei fod ganddynt. Daethoch yn ôl wedyn, wedi anghofio'r cwbl am ysgolion, a gofyn, 'Beth am wasanaethau gwaredu gwastraff a'r holl agweddau eraill ar lywodraeth leol?'. A ydych yn ymddiddori mewn ysgolion ai peidio? Os ydych, pam yr ydych yn ateb drwy ofyn yr holl bethau hynny am waredu gwastraff a'r holl adrannau eraill mewn llywodraeth leol? Yr ydym wedi gwneud yr hyn a ofynasoch, sef gwarantu na ellir torri cyllidebau ysgolion y flwyddyn nesaf am unrhyw reswm heblaw bod nifer y disgyblion yn gostwng. Yr ydym wedi rhoi hynny i chi, ond yn awr yr ydych wedi newid eich cân. Yr ydych yn ymddiddori'n fwy mewn biwrocratiaeth llywodraeth leol nag mewn ysgolion, ac yr ydych newydd brofi hynny.

Buddsoddi mewn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Investing in Health Services

Q10 Leanne Wood: Will the First Minister make a statement on what plans the Welsh Assembly Government has to invest in health services in South Wales Central? OAQ2126(FM)

C10 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ba gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ2126(FM)

The First Minister: We continue to invest on a massive scale in NHS services throughout South Wales Central. Funding is being used to ensure the delivery of sustainable, safe, world-class health services for all residents by 2015, as outlined in 'Designed for Life'.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn dal i fuddsoddi symiau anferth yng ngwasanaethau'r GIG ledled Canol De Cymru. Mae'r cyllid yn cael ei ddefnyddio i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaethau iechyd cynaliadwy a diogel o'r radd flaenaf wedi'u darparu i'r holl drigolion erbyn 2015, fel y mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn nodi.

Leanne Wood: I am awaiting a letter from you in relation to the proposed closure of the dermatology ward at the University Hospital of Wales, Cardiff, which is due to take place this month. I have been approached by staff and patients who want the Minister for Health and Social Services to intervene. I heard what you said earlier about the community health council, but I understand that the council has said that it is not supporting the proposal but that it is not opposing it either. If that is the case, can the proposal still be considered by your Minister for health?

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf yn aros am lythyr gennych mewn cysylltiad â'r bwriad i gau'r ward dermatoleg yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Caerdydd, sydd i ddigwydd y mis hwn. Mae staff a chleifion wedi cysylltu â mi sydd yn dymuno i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ymyrryd. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn gynharach am y cyngor iechyd cymuned, ond yr wyf yn deall bod y cyngor wedi dweud nad yw'n cefnogi'r bwriad ond nad yw'n ei wrthwynebu ychwaith. Os felly y mae, a oes modd o hyd i'ch Gweinidog dros iechyd ystyried y bwriad hwn?

The First Minister: I am not aware of the community health council making a final

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod y cyngor iechyd cymuned wedi

determination on this issue, therefore, I will have to make enquiries about the CHC in Cardiff and the Vale as regards the point that you have just made. I do not think that I can answer any hypothetical questions in the absence of knowledge on my part of what the CHC, which is an extremely robust body, has said about the closure of the dermatology ward. It has a right to exercise on behalf of patients, and I think that it is for the council to make its mind up about how it wants to do that.

Leighton Andrews: Next week, the Minister for Health and Social Service will be coming to Ynys-shir to open the new Ynys-shir health centre, which is another example of the health investments being made in South Wales Central by the Government. Do you agree that the biggest risk to investment in the NHS in South Wales Central comes from those who would vote against the budget next week?

3.00 p.m.

The First Minister: The earlier the national health service knows what its budget will be next year, the more time it has in which to plan. I hope that we will be in a position at the end of next week to issue the information to the NHS, as we usually do, well before Christmas, so that it has three or four months at the beginning of 2007 in which to make its plans. If you lose momentum, it is hard to get it back.

David Melding: The modernisation of mental health services remains crucial to patients in South Wales Central. Do you intend to explain to them why your Government did not seek any framework powers or even a Welsh clause to the draft Mental Health Bill that has now been published for a third time by the UK Government?

The First Minister: The Bill does have a pretty wretched history in the run-up to its publication, in terms of its being published, withdrawn, talked about and then withdrawn again, and so forth. However, I understand that it is now ready to go into the front end of the legislative mill at Westminster, and I

penderfynu'n derfynol ar y mater hwn, felly, bydd yn rhaid imi holi ynghylch y cyngor iechyd cymuned yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro mewn cysylltiad â'r pwynt yr ydych newydd ei wneud. Nid wyf yn credu y gallaf ateb unrhyw gwestiynau damcaniaethol gan na wn beth y mae'r cyngor iechyd cymuned, sydd yn gorff tra dibynadwy, wedi dweud am gau'r ward dermatoleg. Mae ganddo hawl i'w harfer ar ran cleifion, ac yr wyf yn credu mai mater i'r cyngor yw penderfynu sut y mae am wneud hynny.

Leighton Andrews: Yr wythnos nesaf, bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dod i Ynys-hir i agor canolfan iechyd newydd Ynys-hir, sydd yn enghraifft arall o'r buddsoddiadau mewn iechyd gan y Llywodraeth yng Nghanol De Cymru. A ydych yn cytuno bod y risg fwyaf i fuddsoddiad yn y GIG yng Nghanol De Cymru yn dod oddi wrth y rhai a fyddai am bleidleisio yn erbyn y gyllideb yr wythnos nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Po gyntaf y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gwybod beth fydd ei gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, y mwyaf o amser sydd ganddo i gynllunio. Gobeithiaf y byddwn mewn sefyllfa erbyn diwedd yr wythnos nesaf i roi'r wybodaeth i'r GIG, fel a wnawn fel arfer, mewn da bryd cyn y Nadolig, fel bod ganddo dri neu bedwar mis ar ddechrau 2007 i wneud ei gynlluniau. Os collir momentwm, mae'n anodd ei gael yn ôl.

David Melding: Mae moderneiddio'r gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn dal i fod yn dyngedfennol i gleifion yng Nghanol De Caerdydd. A ydych yn bwriadu egluro wrthynt pam na cheisiodd eich Llywodraeth chi bwerau fframwaith na hyd yn oed gymal i Gymru yn y Mesur Iechyd Meddwl drafft sydd wedi cael ei gyhoeddi'r drydedd waith erbyn hyn gan Lywodraeth y DU?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hanes y Mesur yn un digon truenus yn y cyfnod cyn y cyhoeddi, gan iddo gael ei gyhoeddi, ei dynnu'n ôl, ei drafod ac yna'i dynnu'n ôl eto, ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, deallaf ei fod yn barod erbyn hyn i gymryd ei le ym mhen blaen melin ddeddfwriaethol San Steffan, ac yr wyf yn

anticipate that it will be very extensively scrutinised, given the obvious concerns expressed about some of its provisions.

On the framework clauses in that Bill, I am not sure what decisions were made, what considerations were given, or what the advantages would have been of having framework clauses, given the particular slant of that Bill. I am not sure whether you are right about that, but I will ensure that you get a detailed reply.

rhagweld y ceir craffu helaeth iawn arno, o gofio'r pryderon amlwg a fynegwyd am rai o'i ddarpariaethau.

O ran y cymalau fframwaith yn y Mesur hwnnw, nid wyf yn siŵr pa benderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd, pa ystyriaeth a roddwyd i hynny, na pha fanteision fyddai wedi deillio o gael cymalau fframwaith, o ystyried gogwydd neilltuol y Mesur hwnnw. Nid wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn iawn am hynny, ond byddaf yn sicrhau eich bod yn cael ateb manwl.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:

the National Health Service (Miscellaneous Amendments Concerning Independent Nurse Prescribers, Supplementary Prescribers, Nurse Independent Prescribers and Pharmacist Independent Prescribers) (Wales) Regulations 2007; and

the Seed (Wales) (Amendments for Tests and Trials etc.) Regulations 2007.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have a few changes to report to tomorrow's business. The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills will make an oral statement on the foundation phase, and the motions to approve two avian influenza Orders have been deferred until next Wednesday, 13 December. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiadau? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, a oes unrhyw sylwadau?

Janet Ryder: I thank the Business Minister for bringing forward a statement on the foundation phase tomorrow. At the beginning of this week, it appeared very much as though the Assembly would yet again read about a major change in education policy on

Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i bwyllgor pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig:

Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau Amrywiol Ynghylch Nyrsys Sy'n Rhagnodi'n Annibynnol, Rhagnodwyr Atodol, Nyrsys-ragnodwyr Annibynnol a Fferyllwyr-ragnodwyr Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2007; a

Rheoliadau Hadau (Cymru) (Diwygiadau ar gyfer Profion a Threialon etc.) 2007.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf rai newidiadau i'w cyfleu am y busnes yfory. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn gwneud datganiad llafar am y cyfnod sylfaen, ac mae'r cynigion i gymeradwyo dau Orchymyn fflw adar wedi cael eu gohirio gan ddydd Mercher nesaf, 13 Rhagfyr. Mae'r busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf fel y nodwyd yn y datganiad drafft, a ddylai fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections? I see that there are none. Therefore, are there any comments?

Janet Ryder: Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am ddod â datganiad gerbron am y cyfnod sylfaen yfory. Ar ddechrau'r wythnos hon, yr oedd yn ymddangos fel pe bai'r Cynulliad unwaith eto ar fin darllen am newid mawr yn y polisi addysg ar dudalennau papurau newydd, ac na

the pages of the newspapers, and that AMs would not be told by the Assembly's Minister for education what the roll-out of the foundation phase would be in Wales.

The Minister knows that she probably has all-party support for this, but it would be courteous of her to tell the Assembly what will happen before the information goes to the newspapers. As Communicator of the Year, I am sure that she would love to give the Assembly a demonstration of her beautiful skills, and I am sure that we are all looking forward to that statement tomorrow.

Lisa Francis: The Minister's change of policy on teaching under-sevens is broadly welcomed and we are glad that she will make a statement to the Assembly tomorrow. Although we are sorry that that information went to the press first, we are glad that we will have an opportunity to scrutinise further tomorrow. It is only right that she should be scrutinised on that particular policy change.

Similarly, we need to know how she intends to find a way forward on the international baccalaureate and how that might affect the value of the Welsh baccalaureate. The Minister has clearly studied the details by now and knows how she wants to move forward on this, so we also look forward to that written statement.

We are grateful for the written statement on HIV in Wales, so thank you for that. We note that the budget is still in the programme and we trust that the Government will continue to make efforts with negotiations so that an agreement can be reached.

Kirsty Williams: We also welcome tomorrow's statement by the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and the indication from the Business Minister's office that Mike German's proposal for legislation under Standing Order No. 31 will return to the Chamber in January. I am grateful for the Minister's accommodation of that measure.

The Minister will be aware that we asked for a statement by the Minister for Health and

fyddai ACau yn cael gwybod gan Weinidog y Cynulliad dros addysg sut y câi'r cyfnod sylfaen ei raddol gyflwyno yng Nghymru.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod ganddi yn ôl pob tebyg gefnogaeth hollbleidiol i hyn, ond byddai'n gwrtais iddi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad beth fydd yn digwydd cyn i'r wybodaeth fynd at y papurau newydd. Fel Cyfathrebwr y Flwyddyn, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai wrth ei bodd yn arddangos ei sgiliau cain gerbron y Cynulliad, ar yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn edrych ymlaen at y datganiad hwnnw yfory.

Lisa Francis: Mae newid polisi'r Gweinidog o ran addysgu plant dan saith oed i'w groesawu'n fras ac yr ydym yn falch y bydd yn gwneud datganiad i'r Cynulliad yfory. Er ei bod yn flin gennym i'r wybodaeth honno fynd at y wasg yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn falch y byddwn yn cael cyfle i graffu ymhellach yfory. Nid yw ond yn iawn y dylai fod craffu arni ar y newid polisi neilltuol hwnnw.

Yn yr un modd, mae angen inni wybod sut y mae'n bwriadu canfod ffordd ymlaen gyda'r fagloraeth ryngwladol a sut y gallai hynny effeithio ar werth bagloraeth Cymru. Mae'r Gweinidog yn amlwg wedi astudio'r manylion erbyn hyn a gŵyr sut y mae am symud ymlaen ar hyn, felly yr ydym ninnau'n edrych ymlaen at y datganiad ysgrifenedig hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am y datganiad ysgrifenedig am HIV yng Nghymru, felly diolch ichi am hynny. Nodwn fod y gyllideb yn dal yn y rhaglen a hyderwn y bydd y Llywodraeth yn parhau i ymdrechu gyda'r trafodaethau fel bod modd dod i gytundeb.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawn ninnau hefyd y datganiad yfory gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau a'r awgrym o swyddfa'r Trefnydd y bydd cynnig Mike German am ddeddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 yn dychwelyd i'r Siambr ym mis Ionawr. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am wneud lle i'r mesur hwnnw.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol inni ofyn am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd

Social Services on the continuing issues affecting the GP contract. I appreciate that the answer given is that negotiations are continuing between the Government and the British Medical Association's negotiating team and that it would be inappropriate for the Minister to come forward at this stage, but perhaps the Business Minister could liaise with her colleague to identify when he thinks those negotiations will come to an end and when it will be appropriate for him to come to the Chamber to give that statement.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): Thank you for supporting the business statement today. This is not new; this is policy development that is well supported. The committee was forewarned about the important conference that was held on Monday to evaluate the pilot. I know that the education sector across Wales was thrilled with the results of the evaluation. However, the important thing is that we will have the oral statement tomorrow. There will be a written statement by the end of this week or early next week on the impact on the international baccalaureate. Having said that, there will be no impact, and that will be the basis of the written statement from the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills.

Kirsty, we have accommodated time for Mike German's proposal for legislation. The Minister for Health and Social Services will give an oral statement as soon as he has the detail of his negotiations on the GP contract with the British Medical Association and the NHS employers. I am delighted to see that there is unanimous support for the business statement today.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Datganiad am Adroddiad ar yr Achosion o Cryptosporidiosis Statement on the Report on the Outbreak of Cryptosporidiosis

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I welcome the opportunity to make this statement to Plenary. A cryptosporidium outbreak occurred in north Wales last winter. The first indications of a possible outbreak became

a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y materion sy'n i effeithio ar y contract meddygon teulu. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi mai'r ateb a roddir yw bod trafodaethau'n parhau rhwng y Llywodraeth a thîm negodi Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ac y byddai'n amhriodol i'r Gweinidog ddod gerbron ar hyn o bryd, ond efallai y gallai'r Trefnydd gysylltu â'i chydweithwyr i nodi pryd yn ei barn hi y daw'r trafodaethau hynny i ben a phryd y bydd yn briodol iddo ef ddod i'r Siambr i roi'r datganiad hwnnw.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Diolch ichi am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes heddiw. Nid yw hyn yn newydd; mae hwn yn ddatblygiad polisi a gefnogir yn helaeth. Rhagrybuddiwyd y pwyllgor am y gynhadledd bwysig a gynhaliwyd ddydd Llun i werthuso'r peilot. Gwn fod y sector addysg ar draws Cymru wrth ei fodd â chanlyniadau'r gwerthusiad. Fodd bynnag, y peth pwysig yw y cawn ni'r datganiad llafar yfory. Ceir datganiad ysgrifenedig erbyn diwedd yr wythnos hon neu'n gynnar yr wythnos nesaf am yr effaith ar y fagloriaeth ryngwladol. Wedi dweud hynny, ni fydd effaith, a dyna fydd sail y datganiad ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

Kirsty, yr ydym wedi gwneud lle i awgrym Mike German am ddeddfwriaeth. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn rhoi datganiad llafar cyn gynted at y bydd manylion ei drafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain a chyflogwyr y GIG am y contract meddygon teulu ganddo. Yr wyf wrth fy modd fod cefnogaeth unfrydol i'r datganiad busnes heddiw.

apparent in early November, at which point an incident management team, known as the outbreak control team, was immediately assembled, involving representatives of all relevant agencies.

A series of investigations was set up to identify all possible causes. By 29 November, evidence demonstrated that waterborne infection was the most likely cause of the increase in the number of cases, at which point an outbreak was declared and people in the area were advised to boil their tap water before drinking it. The outbreak affected 231 people, making it the largest such outbreak in Wales, and it was linked to the Llyn Cwellyn reservoir, serving approximately 70,000 people in north Gwynedd and south Anglesey.

The outbreak control team published its findings in a report last week. This statement outlines the Assembly Government's response to the key findings of that report. The outbreak control team report indicates that the most likely cause of the outbreak was one or more individuals in the catchment area of the reservoir having cryptosporidiosis before the outbreak, and, although they may have been ill with diarrhoea, they would probably not have known the cause of it. This is backed up by the fact that there were no recorded cases of cryptosporidiosis in the area at the time.

Environmental investigations, confirmed by microbiological testing, identified several routes by which cryptosporidium from sewerage systems in the Cwellyn catchment could have entered the reservoir. Sewage effluent, even after the standard treatment, cannot be guaranteed to be free from cryptosporidium. The effluent from sewage treatment systems could have entered the Llyn Cwellyn reservoir through one or more routes identified from the catchment area.

The water treatment process at the time was not designed to remove or kill cryptosporidium. Dŵr Cymru, which is responsible for the water supply, had carried out a risk assessment, which assumed that

heintiad posibl yn amlwg yn gynnar ym mis Tachwedd, a sefydlwyd tîm rheoli digwyddiad, a adwaenid fel y tîm rheoli achosion, ar unwaith ar y pryd, yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r holl asiantaethau perthnasol.

Sefydlwyd cyfres o ymchwiliadau i ganfod pob achos posibl. Erbyn 29 Tachwedd, yr oedd y dystiolaeth yn dangos mai haint a gâi ei chludo gan ddŵr oedd achos mwyaf tebygol y cynnydd yn y nifer o achosion, a dyna pryd y cyhoeddwyd heintiad ac y cynghorwyd pobl yn yr ardal i ferwi eu dŵr tap cyn ei yfed. Effeithiodd yr heintiad ar 231 o bobl, gan ei wneud yr heintiad mwyaf o'i fath yng Nghymru, ac fe'i cysylltwyd â chronfa ddŵr Llyn Cwellyn, sy'n gwasanaethu rhyw 70,000 o bobl yng ngogledd Gwynedd a de Ynys Môn.

Cyhoeddodd y tîm rheoli achosion ei ganfyddiadau mewn adroddiad yr wythnos ddiwethaf. Mae'r datganiad hwn yn amlinellu ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ganfyddiadau allweddol yr adroddiad hwnnw. Mae adroddiad y tîm rheoli achosion yn nodi mai achos mwyaf tebygol yr heintiad oedd bod gan un neu fwy o unigolion yn nalgylch y gronfa ddŵr cryptosporidiosis cyn yr heintiad ac, er y byddent efallai wedi bod yn sâl gyda dolur rhydd, ni fyddent yn ôl pob tebyg wedi gwybod beth a'i hachosodd. Cefnogir hyn gan y ffaith nad oedd unrhyw achosion o cryptosporidiosis wedi'u cofnodi yn yr ardal ar y pryd.

Nododd ymchwiliadau amgylcheddol, a gadarnhawyd drwy brofion microbiolegol, sawl llwybr posibl y gallai cryptosporidiwm o systemau carthffosiaeth yn nalgylch Cwellyn fod wedi mynd i mewn i'r gronfa drwyddynt. Ni ellir gwarantu bod elifiant carthffosiaeth, hyd yn oed ar ôl triniaeth safonol, yn rhydd o cryptosporidiwm. Gallai'r elifiant o systemau trin carthion fod wedi mynd i mewn i gronfa Llyn Cwellyn drwy un neu fwy o'r llwybrau a nodwyd o'r dalgylch.

Nid oedd y broses i drin y dŵr ar y pryd wedi'i bwriadu i gael gwared â nac i ladd cryptosporidiwm. Yr oedd Dŵr Cymru, sy'n gyfrifol am y cyflenwad dŵr, wedi gwneud asesiad risg, a oedd wedi tybio y byddai'r

sewage effluent would be diluted significantly in the lake; this complied with regulatory requirements.

None of the investigations into the outbreak identified any faults in the water treatment system that could be rectified, and continued to strengthen the evidence supporting mains tap water as the probable source. On that basis, the only option for Dŵr Cymru was to install a new ultraviolet light treatment system to kill any residual cryptosporidium. Once the treatment had been installed and demonstrated to be working properly, the boil-water notice was lifted.

The outbreak control team is satisfied that such an outbreak should not occur again, given the proper functioning of the ultraviolet system at Llyn Cwellyn. Continuous monitoring of the reservoir was carried out from 2 November and showed very low levels of cryptosporidium oocysts, well below the regulatory treatment standard specified for sites identified as being at significant risk. A key lesson to be learned from the outbreak therefore is the need to take notice of even low numbers of oocysts in treated drinking water, as this outbreak proves that, even in low numbers, they may constitute a threat to public health. In fact, the infectious dose may be as low as a single oocyst of cryptosporidium, which calls into question the existing widespread practice of relying on dilution as a general policy.

3.10 p.m.

The report recommends that the Chief Medical Officer for Wales should consider the lessons learned and the need for updated expert advice on cryptosporidiosis and the water supply, especially the risk associated with small numbers of oocysts that has been highlighted. The chief medical officer recognises that this is not just an issue for Wales, but one that potentially has implications for the whole of the UK water industry. The CMO is therefore meeting with the Chief Inspector of the Drinking Water Inspectorate in January 2007 to consider jointly the lessons learned, and will raise this issue with the other UK CMOs at

elifiant carthion wedi cael ei wanedu'n ddigonol yn y llyn; yr oedd hyn yn cydymffurfio â'r gofynion rheoleiddio.

Ni chanfu unrhyw un o'r ymchwiliadau i'r heintiad unrhyw ddiffygion yn y system trin ddŵr y gellid eu cywiro, a pharhasant i gryfhau'r dystiolaeth a awgrymai mai dŵr tap o'r prif gyflenwad oedd y ffynhonnell debygol. Ar y sail honno, yr unig ddewis i Ddŵr Cymru oedd gosod system newydd triniaeth golau uwchfioled i ladd unrhyw cryptosporidiwm oedd yn weddill. Unwaith yr oedd y driniaeth wedi cael ei gosod ac y dangoswyd ei bod yn gweithio'n iawn, codwyd y rhybudd i ferwi dŵr.

Mae'r tîm rheoli achosion yn fodlon na ddylai heintiad o'r fath ddigwydd eto, cyhyd â bo'r system uwchfioled yn Llyn Cwellyn yn gweithio'n iawn. Cafodd y gronfa ei monitro'n barhaus o 2 Tachwedd a dangosai lefelau isel iawn o oocystau cryptosporidiwm, llawer is na'r safon triniaeth reoleiddio a bennir i safleoedd lle dynodwyd bod risg sylweddol. Un gwers allweddol i'w dysgu o'r achosion felly yw'r angen i gymryd sylw o nifer isel hyd yn oed o oocystau mewn dŵr yfed sydd wedi cael ei drin, gan fod yr heintiad hwn yn profi y gallant, hyd yn oed os yw'r nifer yn isel, fod yn fygythiad i iechyd y cyhoedd. Yn wir, gallai'r ddos heintus fod cyn ised ag un oocyst o cryptosporidiwm, sy'n codi cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r arfer cyffredin ar hyn o bryd o ddibynnu ar wanedu fel polisi cyffredinol.

Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylai Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru ystyried y gwersi a ddysgwyd a'r angen am gyngor arbenigol wedi'i ddiweddarau am cryptosporidiosis a'r cyflenwad dŵr, yn enwedig y risg yn gysylltiedig â nifer fach o oocystau sydd wedi cael ei hamlygu. Mae'r prif swyddog meddygol yn cydnabod mai nid mater i Gymru yn unig mo hwn, ond un a allai fod â goblygiadau i ddiwydiant dŵr y DU gyfan. Mae'r prif swyddog meddygol felly yn cwrdd â Phrif Arolygydd yr Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed ym mis Ionawr 2007 i gydystyried y gwersi a ddysgwyd, a bydd yn codi'r mater hwn gyda phrif swyddogion meddygol eraill y DU yn

their meeting on 8 December. I will be able to report back by means of a written statement when wider considerations have been made.

Alun Ffred Jones: I welcome the statement, and I understand that the Minister, his colleagues, civil servants and other agencies need time to digest the report and discuss its implications, and so I look forward to a further report in future. This report is thorough, but I hope that any such report in future will not take quite as long to be published as this one took. Some of the issues that are raised in the report need further consideration, and I would welcome the Minister's comments on those. Perhaps the most important is the fact that the report states that safe levels, as indicated now, of cryptosporidium in the water supply are not really safe. I presume that this will be reviewed and that you will discuss this with the chief medical officer and other relevant partners for future comment. Ironically, the ultraviolet technology that has been installed now makes Cwellyn one of the safest water supplies in Wales. However, the capital and revenue costs of putting such technology in place throughout Wales are considerable, and although it is not the Minister's responsibility, that will also need to be commented on in the future.

Another problem, which, again, lies outside the Minister's competence perhaps is that Dŵr Cymru did not know which of its customers were affected by Cwellyn, and therefore it was impossible to contact customers directly and quickly. That will need to be addressed in the future by the Minister's colleague, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside.

Lastly, does the Minister have any comment to make on another aspect of the report, which states that a review should be undertaken as to what should be communicated to people, and how best to warn people or advise them, when outbreaks such as this or other relevant illnesses occur? I would welcome any comments on that. However, more importantly, I look forward to receiving the Minister's future reports on

eu cyfarfod ar 8 Rhagfyr. Gallaf adrodd yn ôl ar ffurf datganiad ysgrifenedig pan fydd ystyriaeth ehangach wedi cael ei rhoi i'r mater.

Alun Ffred Jones: Croesawaf y datganiad, a deallaf fod angen amser ar y Gweinidog, ei gydweithwyr, gweision sifil ac asiantaethau eraill i dreulio'r adroddiad ac i drafod ei oblygiadau, felly edrych ymlaen at adroddiad pellach yn y dyfodol. Mae hwn yn adroddiad trylwyr, ond gobeithiaf na fydd unrhyw adroddiad tebyg yn y dyfodol yn cymryd cyhyd i gael ei gyhoeddi ag a wnaeth hwn. Mae angen ystyried rhai o'r materion a godir yn yr adroddiad ymhellach, a byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y rheini. Efallai mai'r mater pwysicaf yw bod yr adroddiad yn datgan nad yw'r lefelau diogel o cryptosporidiwm yn y cyflenwad dŵr, fel y'u nodir ar hyn o bryd, yn ddiogel mewn gwirionedd. Yr wyf yn tybio y caiff hyn ei adolygu ac y byddwch yn trafod hyn gyda'r prif swyddog meddygol a phartneriaid perthnasol eraill er mwyn cynnig sylwadau yn y dyfodol. Yn eironig, mae'r dechnoleg uwchfioled sydd wedi cael ei gosod yn gwneud Cwellyn yn un o'r cyflenwadau dŵr mwyaf diogel yng Nghymru erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae costau cyfalaf a refeniw sefydlu technoleg o'r fath ar hyd a lled Cymru yn sylweddol, ac er nad cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog yw hynny, bydd angen cynnig sylwadau ar hynny hefyd yn y dyfodol.

Problem arall, sydd, eto, y tu hwnt i awdurdodaeth y Gweinidog efallai yw'r ffaith na wyddai Dŵr Cymru pa rai o'i gwsmeriaid yr oedd Cwellyn yn effeithio arnynt, ac yr oedd felly'n amhosibl cysylltu â chwsmeriaid yn uniongyrchol ac yn gyflym. Bydd angen i gyd-Aelod y Gweinidog, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, ymdrin â hynny yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, a oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw sylw i'w wneud am agwedd arall o'r adroddiad, sy'n dweud y dylid cynnal adolygiad o'r hyn ddylai gael ei gyfleu i bobl, a'r ffordd orau o rybuddio pobl neu roi gwybodaeth iddynt, pan geir heintiad fel hwn neu pan geir mathau eraill o salwch? Byddwn yn croesawu unrhyw sylwadau am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn fwy pwysig, edrychaf ymlaen at dderbyn adroddiadau'r Gweinidog yn y dyfodol am

the outcome of his discussions with various agencies.

Brian Gibbons: I agree that this is a thorough report, and the sheer size of it is evidence of that. I was involved in this investigation, and it surprised me that a lot of the accepted wisdom on cryptosporidium was being called into question by the experience at Cwellyn. Therefore, I think that the fact that the report took so long is probably a reflection of several aspects. For example, the investigation into the nature of the risks of cryptosporidium was groundbreaking, and, while the textbook was not quite rewritten, new paragraphs or chapters were potentially added to it in terms of what we know about cryptosporidium. I do not think that many of these areas were well known before. Therefore, I do not think we can fault anybody for being thorough, particularly as we were at the threshold of our knowledge base in relation to cryptosporidium. Clearly, water supply companies have a primary duty to make sure that their water is safe for the public.

Let there be no doubt that they have primary responsibility in all of these issues. It is not down to the Drinking Water Inspectorate or anyone else; it is up to the supplier in the first instance to ensure that the product is fit for purpose. As you say, we need to take on board the lessons that have been learned from this, and, hopefully, the meeting between the chief medical officers, and between the chief medical officer and the Drinking Water Inspectorate will provide new guidance for water supply companies to better inform their risk assessments and how they need to respond to those risk assessments.

Finally, on informing people, this is a difficult issue. However, this episode, and the tragic episode of the E.coli outbreak before it, showed the expertise of the National Public Health Service for Wales. It is difficult to make the right call at an early stage in these outbreaks, particularly when the evidence seems disjointed and you are trying to make sense of what is happening. In all of these cases, when a difficult call had to be made, the National Public Health Service made the right call, and in many ways it has renewed public confidence in the quality of our

ffrwyth ei drafodaethau gyda gwahanol asiantaethau.

Brian Gibbons: Cytunaf fod hwn yn adroddiad trylwyr, ac mae ei faint ynddo'i hun yn dyst i hynny. Bûm yn ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad, ac fe'm synnwyd bod amheuon yn cael eu codi am lawer o'r wybodaeth gydnabyddedig am cryptosporidiwm oherwydd y profiad yng Nghwellyn. Felly, credaf fod y ffaith i'r adroddiad gymryd cymaint o amser yn adlewyrchiad o sawl agwedd. Er enghraifft, yr oedd yr ymchwiliad i natur peryglon cryptosporidiwm yn torri tir newydd, ac, er na chafodd y gwrslyfr ei ailysgrifennu, gallai paragraffau neu benodau newydd gael eu hychwanegu ato o ran yr hyn a wyddom am cryptosporidiwm. Ni chredaf fod llawer o'r meysydd hynny yn hysbys iawn o'r blaen. Felly, ni chredaf y gallwn feio neb am fod yn drylwyr, yn enwedig gan nad oeddem ond ar y trothwy megis o ran ein sylfaen wybodaeth am cryptosporidiwm. Yn amlwg, mae gan gwmnïau cyflenwi dŵr ddyletswydd sylfaenol i wneud yn siŵr bod eu dŵr yn ddiogel i'r cyhoedd.

Ni ddylai fod unrhyw amheuaeth mai nhw sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am yr holl faterion hyn. Nid cyfrifoldeb yr Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed na neb arall ydyw; lle'r cyflenwr yn y lle cyntaf yw sicrhau bod y cynnyrch yn addas i'w bwrpas. Fel y dywedwch, mae angen inni dderbyn y gwersi a ddysgwyd o hyn, a, gobeithio, bydd y cyfarfod rhwng y prif swyddogion meddygol, a rhwng y prif swyddog meddygol a'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed yn rhoi arweiniad newydd i gwmnïau cyflenwi dŵr er mwyn goleuo eu hasesiadau risg yn well a sut y dylent ymateb i'r asesiadau risg hynny.

Yn olaf, o ran hysbysu pobl, mae hwn yn fater anodd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r digwyddiad hwn, a'r heintiad E.coli trychinebus o'i flaen, wedi dangos arbenigedd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n anodd gwybod beth i'w wneud er y gorau ar ddechrau'r heintiadau hyn, yn enwedig os yw'r dystiolaeth efallai'n anghyson a chithau'n ceisio gwneud synnwyr o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Ym mhob un o'r achosion hyn, pan oedd angen gwneud penderfyniad anodd, mae'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol wedi gwneud yr un iawn, ac yn

experts and their advice. That is important. When we face threats such as pandemic flu, people need to have confidence in the quality of the advice of our public health specialists. The track record in these two instances, the E.coli outbreak and the cryptosporidium outbreak, demonstrates the character and quality of the advice given.

Jonathan Morgan: I also welcome the statement. Like Alun Ffred Jones, I look forward to the further reports that will come forward as a result of this, particularly from the chief medical officer. You have already mentioned the multi-agency approach that was employed in these circumstances. How swift is our emergency response in such circumstances? I know that in this case the services got together fairly quickly, but I doubt that it is easy to get a large number of organisations together. I would like some assurance that you are keeping under review the speed at which the multi-agency approach responding to these circumstances can be achieved. Speed is often of the essence when this sort of outbreak occurs.

Secondly, you referred to the difficulty with the water treatment process, particularly that at the time it was not designed to remove or kill cryptosporidium. What discussions have you or your officials had with Dŵr Cymru about the nature of the water treatment process and whether anything can be done to improve that? Have you also considered whether or not the regulatory requirements need to be re-examined? You said that the process complies with the regulatory requirements, but is it the view of the Government, or certainly of the chief medical officer's department, that we need to look at this in the light of the recent outbreak? In terms of the work that the chief medical officer is doing—and I welcome the fact that he will be examining the lessons that can be learned and the need for updated expert advice—have you requested from him any recommendations that should be implemented from the Welsh Assembly Government perspective that can, perhaps, mitigate any future outbreak?

In terms of the report that you have requested

wir wedi adnewyddu ffydd y cyhoedd yn ansawdd ein harbenigwyr a'u cyngor. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Pan wynebwn fygythiadau fel y pandemig fflw, mae angen i bobl fod â ffydd yn ansawdd y cyngor gan ein harbenigwyr iechyd cyhoeddus. Mae'r hanes yn y ddau ddigwyddiad hwn, yr heintiad E-coli a'r heintiad cryptosporidiwm, yn dangos grym ac ansawdd y cyngor a roddwyd.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf innau hefyd yn croesawu'r datganiad. Fel Alun Ffred Jones, edrychaf ymlaen at yr adroddiadau pellach a ddaw o ganlyniad i hyn, yn enwedig gan y prif swyddog meddygol. Soniasoch eisoes am y dull amlasiantaeth o weithredu yn yr amgylchiadau hyn. Pa mor sydyn yw ein hymateb brys yn y fath amgylchiadau? Gwn yn yr achos hwn fod y gwasanaethau wedi ymgynnull yn eithaf sydyn, ond yr wyf yn amau ei bod yn hawdd cael nifer fawr o sefydliadau ynghyd. Hoffwn rywfaint o sicrwydd y byddwch yn parhau i adolygu pa mor gyflym y gweithredir y dull amlasiantaeth o ymateb i'r amgylchiadau hyn. Mae symud yn gyflym yn aml yn hollbwysig pan fydd y math hwn o heintiad yn digwydd.

Yn ail, gwnaethoch gyfeirio at yr anhawster gyda'r broses trin dŵr, yn enwedig y ffaith nad oedd wedi ei chynllunio i dynnu na lladd cryptosporidiwm ar y pryd. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych chi neu eich swyddogion wedi eu cael â Dŵr Cymru ynghylch natur y broses trin dŵr ac a ydyw'n bosibl gwneud unrhyw beth i'w gwella? A ydych hefyd wedi ystyried a oes angen edrych eto ar y gofynion rheoleiddio? Dywedasoch fod y broses yn cydymffurfio â'r gofynion rheoleiddio, ond onid yw'r Llywodraeth yn teimlo, neu'n sicr adran y prif swyddog meddygol, bod angen edrych ar hyn yng ngoleuni'r heintiad diweddar? O ran y gwaith y mae'r prif swyddog meddygol yn ei wneud—ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd yn edrych ar y gwersi y gallwn eu dysgu a bod angen diweddarau'r cyngor arbenigol—a ydych wedi gofyn iddo am unrhyw argymhellion a ddylai gael eu gweithredu o safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a allai, efallai, leihau difrifoldeb unrhyw heintiad yn y dyfodol?

O ran yr adroddiad yr ydych wedi gofyn

of the chief medical officer, will he consider what type of information is passed to consumers and the speed at which that is done? In such circumstances, getting the right information to people at the appropriate time is a necessity. Often, people do not know the basic measures that they need to take in order to reduce the possibility of cryptosporidium's being spread.

I also urge you to allow the advice that you receive to be passed on to the water industry, because any changes that are made in future to improve the quality of the water supply will require the active engagement of the water industry. Any information that the chief medical officer is able to make available to you should be passed on to the industry in any discussions that you have with it.

Finally, in terms of the role of the National Public Health Service, I agree with you that it is a body that works extremely well; it is highly professional and its work is very much valued. Will you be asking the National Public Health Service to look at the quality of our water supply as a result of this recent outbreak?

3.20 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: To take the last point first, the main organisation responsible for this is the Drinking Water Inspectorate, and, clearly, it is not for us to muscle in on its territory or seek to remove its responsibility or duties. Clearly, primary responsibility, as I said to Alun Ffred, rests first with the water companies, and then with the Drinking Water Inspectorate. We have to keep the lines of responsibility clear, and it would not serve us well if there were three or four different cooks trying to sort this out.

Your first question was on the speed of response. The team responds very quickly indeed. The E.coli outbreak had a much more dramatic start, particularly because the initial organism was potentially toxic, but once that organism was identified as the cause of the outbreak, the outbreak control team was called into existence straight away. If we

amdano gan y prif swyddog meddygol, a fydd yn ystyried pa fath o wybodaeth sy'n cael ei throsglwyddo i ddefnyddwyr a pha mor gyflym y mae hynny'n digwydd? Mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath, mae'n hanfodol bwysig cael y wybodaeth iawn i bobl ar yr adeg briodol. Yn aml, nid yw pobl yn gwybod pa bethau syml y mae angen iddynt eu gwneud i leihau'r posibilrwydd o ledaenu cryptosporidiwm.

Yr wyf hefyd yn eich annog i ganiatáu i'r cyngor a dderbyniwch gael ei drosglwyddo i'r diwydiant dŵr, oherwydd bydd angen i'r diwydiant dŵr gyfrannu'n weithredol at unrhyw newidiadau a wneir yn y dyfodol i wella ansawdd y cyflenwad dŵr. Dylai unrhyw wybodaeth y mae'r prif swyddog meddygol yn gallu ei rhoi ichi gael ei throsglwyddo i'r diwydiant fel rhan o unrhyw drafodaethau â nhw.

Yn olaf, o ran rôl y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol, yr wyf yn cytuno â chi ei fod yn gorff sy'n gweithio'n dda iawn; mae'n hynod broffesiynol a gwerthfawrogr ei waith yn fawr iawn. A fyddwch yn gofyn i'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol edrych ar ansawdd y cyflenwad dŵr o ganlyniad i'r heintiad diweddar hwn?

Brian Gibbons: I gymryd eich pwynt olaf yn gyntaf, y prif sefydliad sy'n gyfrifol am hyn yw'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed, ac, yn glir, nid ein lle ni yw tresmasu ar ei thiriogaeth na cheisio tynnu ei chyfrifoldebau na'i dyletswyddau oddi arni. Yn amlwg, y cwmnïau dŵr, fel y dywedais wrth Alun Ffred, sy'n gyfrifol yn y lle cyntaf, ac yna'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch pwy sy'n gyfrifol, ac ni fyddai'n gwneud unrhyw les inni pe bai tri neu bedwar cogydd gwahanol yn ceisio rhoi trefn ar y sefyllfa.

Yr oedd eich cwestiwn cyntaf yn ymwneud â pha mor gyflym yw'r ymateb. Mae'r tîm yn ymateb yn eithriadol sydyn. Yr oedd dechrau'r heintiad E.coli yn llawer mwy dramatig, yn enwedig gan fod yr organeb gychwynnol yn wenwynig o bosibl, ond unwaith y cafodd yr organeb honno ei hadnabod fel achos yr heintiad, galwyd ar y

consider the E.coli outbreak, we became aware of the initial infection—the index case—on a Thursday or a Friday. The investigation to identify the potential source of the outbreak took place over Saturday and Sunday, and, by Monday morning, reasonably robust advice was available for schools. When I got the first indication of the E.coli outbreak, officials in the National Public Health Service for Wales did not quite know where it was coming from. However, they did the necessary epidemiology over a weekend, so that advice was in place for children as they turned up for school on the Monday morning. As it turned out, that advice was correct. People criticised that advice and suggested that schools should be closed during that outbreak. However, the advice given by the National Public Health Service for Wales was spot on.

The cryptosporidium outbreak was a bit more difficult, because there is always a background increase in the incidence of cryptosporidium, particularly in the autumn. Therefore, it took time for the index of suspicion to increase beyond what would be reasonably regarded as a background level of infection. This was particularly difficult because when the monitoring was put in place at Llyn Cwellyn, as you will remember, the readings were showing that the level of cryptosporidium was well within what was regarded as a safe limit at the time. Therefore, we had strong epidemiology telling us that the lake was the cause of the infection, but the existing knowledge base told us that the level of organisms that were being detected was within the level of a relatively low risk situation. As I told Alun Ffred, we were very much at the leading edge of understanding with regard to what this outbreak was about, and how that affects our understanding and response to such outbreaks.

It is important that we engage with the Drinking Water Inspectorate so that it can properly inform the water supply companies with a view to future risk assessment. One of the assumptions before this outbreak was that low levels of the organism would not constitute a significant risk, but, as I said in the statement, we are now of the view that an

tîm rheoli heintiadau ar unwaith. Os ystyriwn yr heintiad E.coli, daethom i wybod am yr heintiad cychwynnol—y prif achos—ar ddydd Iau neu ddydd Gwener. Cynhaliwyd yr ymchwiliad i ganfod ffynhonnell bosibl yr heintiad ddydd Sadwrn a dydd Sul, ac, erbyn bore dydd Llun, yr oedd cyngor eithaf pendant ar gael i'r ysgolion. Pan glywais gyntaf am yr heintiad E.coli, ni wyddai swyddogion Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru o ba le yn union y daeth. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethant y gwaith epidemiolegol angenrheidiol dros y penwythnos, fel bod y cyngor ar gael yn barod i'r plant wrth iddynt ddod i'r ysgol bore dydd Llun. Fel y digwyddodd, yr oedd y cyngor hwnnw'n gywir. Cafodd y cyngor hwnnw ei feirniadu ac awgrymwyd y dylid cau'r ysgolion yn ystod yr heintiad. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y cyngor a roddwyd gan Wasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru yn llygad ei le.

Yr oedd yr heintiad cryptosporidiwm fymryn yn anoddach, oherwydd ceir cynnydd cefndirol mewn cryptosporidiwm bob amser, yn enwedig yn yr hydref. Felly, cymerodd amser cyn i'r hyn a ystyrid yn ddigon rhesymol yn lefel heintiad gefndirol dyfu'n amheuaeth fwy cadarn. Yr oedd hyn yn arbennig o anodd oherwydd pan ddechreuwyd y monitro yn Llyn Cwellyn, fel y cofiwch, dangosodd y darlleniadau fod lefel y cryptosporidiwm ymhell o fewn yr hyn a ystyrid yn derfyn diogel ar y pryd. Felly, yr oedd gwaith epidemiolegol cryf yn dweud wrthym mai'r llyn oedd wedi achosi'r heintiad, er bod ein gwybodaeth flaenorol yn dweud wrthym fod lefel yr organebau a oedd yn cael eu canfod yn ddiogel o fewn sefyllfa risg gymharol isel. Fel y dywedais wrth Alun Ffred, yr oedd ein dealltwriaeth o'r hyn a achosodd yr heintiad hwn yn bur ansicr, ynghyd â sut y mae hynny'n effeithio ar ein dealltwriaeth a'n hymateb i heintiadau o'r fath.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ymgysylltu â'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed fel ei bod yn gallu goleuo'r cwmnïau cyflenwi dŵr yn iawn ynghylch asesu risg yn y dyfodol. Un o'r tybiaethau cyn yr heintiad hwn oedd na fyddai lefelau isel o'r organeb yn peri risg sylweddol, ond, fel y dywedais yn y datganiad, yr ydym bellach o'r farn y gallai

individual could potentially contaminate the lake. If you have been up to the lake, as I am sure that Alun Ffred has, it is amazing that one individual, in one incident, could contaminate such a big lake and have an adverse affect on hundreds of people in the supply area of the lake. The risk assessments have to be revisited and probably rewritten in the light of this.

I regularly meet the chief medical officer—if not every week, every fortnight. This issue, as well as a number of others, will be at the very heart of those meetings, as will be discussing how to move this agenda forward. The chief medical officer, as I said in the statement, will be meeting with his colleagues across the United Kingdom to draw this to their attention, as well as discussing it on a bilateral basis with the Drinking Water Inspectorate.

Eleanor Burnham: I will not talk about the various bodies that you have already mentioned that you are working with to deal with this serious and, according to my reading, highly unusual event that has had huge health implications for a raft of people in Anglesey and Gwynedd—particularly those who are vulnerable and who have weak immune systems. I understand that at least four people are still ill. Aside from what you have already detailed in response to my colleagues, what are you going to do to ensure that compensation will be paid to some of these people? Buying and boiling water for more than two months in more than 70,000 households—perhaps times three—is quite a costly affair. I have not read of anything that is being done to help these people. They obviously have a big grouse, other than being quite ill.

Raising awareness is another issue that I brought to your attention on 29 November last year, when Alun Ffred and I were able to question you. NHS Direct had no knowledge of this, and medical staff were perhaps wrongly prescribing because they did not know what they were dealing with. Can you assure us that that will not happen again? That seems to me almost elementary.

Will everyone be receiving the updated

un person efallai halogi'r llyn. Os ydych wedi bod at y llyn, fel y mae Alun Ffred yn sicr wedi bod, mae'n anhygoel y gallai un person, mewn un digwyddiad, halogi llyn mor fawr a chael effaith andwyol ar gannoedd o bobl yn ardal gyflenwi'r llyn. Rhaid edrych eto ar yr asesiadau risg ac, mae'n debyg, eu hailysgrifennu yng ngoleuni hyn.

Yr wyf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â'r prif swyddog meddygol—os nad bob wythnos, yna bob pythefnos. Mae'r mater hwn, a nifer o rai eraill, wrth galon y cyfarfodydd hynny, yn ogystal â thrafod sut i symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen. Bydd y prif swyddog meddygol, fel y dywedais yn y datganiad, yn cwrdd â'i gydweithwyr ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig i dynnu eu sylw at hyn, a hefyd i'w drafod ar sail ddwyochrog â'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid wyf am siarad am yr amrywiol gyrff yr ydych eisoes wedi sôn amdanynt fel rhai yr ydych yn gweithio â nhw i ddelio â'r digwyddiad difrifol ac, yn ôl fy nealltwriaeth i, hynod anghyffredin hwn sydd â goblygiadau iechyd aruthrol i'r holl bobl yng Ngwynedd ac Ynys Môn—yn enwedig pobl fregus sydd â systemau heintrydd gwan. Deallaf fod o leiaf pedwar o bobl yn dal i fod yn sâl. Ar wahân i'r hyn y soniasoch amdano eisoes wrth ymateb i fy Nghyd-Aelodau, beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i sicrhau bod iawndal yn cael ei roi i rai o'r bobl hyn? Mae'r ffaith bod mwy na 70,000 o gartrefi yn gorfod prynu a berwi dŵr am fwy na deufis—efallai tri—yn fusnes drud iawn. Nid wyf wedi darllen am unrhyw beth sy'n cael ei wneud i helpu'r bobl hyn. Mae ganddynt yn amlwg gryn le i gwyno, ar wahân i fod yn eithaf sâl.

Mae codi ymwybyddiaeth yn fater arall y tynnais at eich sylw ar 29 Tachwedd y llynedd, pan fu Alun Ffred a minnau yn eich holi. Ni wyddai Galw Iechyd Cymru ddim am hyn, ac efallai fod staff meddygol yn rhagnodi'r pethau anghywir oherwydd ni wyddent beth oeddent yn delio ag ef. A allwch ein sicrhau na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto? Mae hynny'n beth sylfaenol bron yn fy marn i.

A fydd pawb yn derbyn y cyngor arbenigol

expert advice? We know that everyone can access the internet and self-diagnose. I was listening to a programme on Radio 4 the other day that suggested that Google can help people out more than your medical brethren sometimes. That is not to cast any aspersions on your medical brethren. What are you able to do to almost guarantee that this will not happen again? One of my big questions concerns the issue of water companies' profits versus investments. Before this happened, my understanding was that the use of ultraviolet light treatment was reactive; is it now a recommended preventative measure? Are you ensuring that all of Wales will benefit from that in case this happens again?

Brian Gibbons: I understand that Dŵr Cymru has paid out approximately £1 million in compensation to a number of people who used the water supply. I do not know how many people have residual symptoms from the outbreak. Media coverage has identified one or two individuals. However, they will have to take that up with Dŵr Cymru. It is not something that we, as the Assembly Government, would get involved with. That would be a bilateral process between those individuals and Dŵr Cymru. I presume that they would have to establish that Dŵr Cymru was in some way negligent in its responsibilities in relation to how it handled the outbreak. I certainly would not want to be the one to try to judge that at this stage, if it were to be subject to a judicial process.

On the ultraviolet light treatment, as I said to other Members, we are going to have to rewrite a number of paragraphs in our knowledge of cryptosporidium. It seems reasonably certain that the present risk assessment with regard to cryptosporidium will need to be revisited in light of the knowledge that we have gained from this outbreak. Clearly, the necessary measures that follow on from that will be informed by that review. As you say, the ultraviolet light treatment is an expensive business. The cost runs to hundreds of thousands of pounds, but 200 people out of 70,000 in the area were affected by this outbreak and it is a very unpleasant condition; it is certainly no trivial matter. Therefore, we need to resolve this in a

mwy diweddar? Gwyddom fod pawb yn gallu mynd ar y rhyngwrwyd a gwneud hunan-ddiagnosis. Yr oeddwn yn gwranddo ar raglen ar Radio 4 y dydd o'r blaen a oedd yn awgrymu bod Google yn gallu cynnig mwy o gymorth i bobl na'ch brodyr meddygol weithiau. Ac nid lladd ar eich brodyr meddygol yr wyf o gwbl. Beth y gallwch ei wneud i warantu na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto? Mae un o fy mhrif gwestiynau yn ymwneud â'r elw sy'n cael ei wneud gan gwmnïau dŵr o'i gymharu â buddsoddi. Cyn i hyn ddigwydd, deallais fod defnyddio triniaeth golau uwchfioled yn adweithiol; onid yw'n cael ei argymell fel mesur ataliol bellach? A ydych yn sicrhau y bydd Cymru gyfan yn elwa o hynny rhag ofn i hyn ddigwydd eto?

Brian Gibbons: Deallaf fod Dŵr Cymru wedi talu iawndal gwerth tua £1 miliwn i nifer o bobl a ddefnyddiodd y cyflenwad dŵr. Ni wn i faint o bobl sydd â symptomau o hyd o ganlyniad i'r heintiad. Mae'r cyfryngau wedi dod o hyd i un neu ddau o unigolion. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid iddynt godi'r mater gyda Dŵr Cymru. Nid rhywbeth i ni, Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ymhél ag ef yw hyn. Proses ddwyochrog rhwng yr unigolion hynny a Dŵr Cymru fyddai. Cymeraf y byddai'n rhaid iddynt sefydlu bod Dŵr Cymru wedi bod yn esgeulus mewn rhyw ffordd yn ei gyfrifoldebau o ran sut yr ymdriniodd â'r heintiad. Ni fyddwn, yn sicr, eisiau barnu hynny ar hyn o bryd, pe bai angen mynd drwy broses farnwrol.

O ran triniaeth gyda golau uwchfioled, fel y dywedais wrth Aelodau eraill, bydd yn rhaid inni ailysgrifennu nifer o baragraffau yn ein gwybodaeth am gryptosporidiwm. Mae'n ymddangos yn eithaf sicr y bydd angen edrych eto ar yr asesiadau risg presennol ar gyfer cryptosporidiwm yng ngoleuni'r wybodaeth newydd am yr heintiad hwn. Yn amlwg, bydd y camau angenrheidiol a fydd yn dilyn ymlaen o hynny yn cael eu goleuo gan yr adolygiad hwnnw. Fel y dywedwch, mae triniaeth gyda golau uwchfioled yn fusnes drud. Mae'r gost yn gannoedd o filoedd o bunnau, ond cafodd 200 o bobl allan o 70,000 yn yr ardal eu heffeithio arnynt gan yr heintiad hwn ac mae'n gyflwr annifyr iawn; nid yw'n fater dibwys yn sicr.

manner that is proportionate but that attracts public confidence. That work must be done, but I am not going to make an announcement on it today.

However, primary responsibility must clearly rest with the company. This is the basic premise: it is not for the Drinking Water Inspectorate, the National Public Health Service or me to catch the supplier out; and it is not the case that it is okay for the supplier to continue in a particular way unless it is detected with its fingers in the cookie jar.

3.30 p.m.

That is not the basis on which these utilities operate. They have primary individual responsibility for the safety of their product, and for how it is delivered; regardless of any inspection regime, that is their responsibility. So, it is important that we clearly identify where responsibility lies. If the primary responsibility is not clearly laid out, then, again, we will be sending out mixed messages, and be a source of confusion.

You raised the issue of NHS Direct at the time, and I took it away. The case that you and Alun Ffred made was rather more equivocal. It would have been a worry to me—and you made the claim more vigorously than anyone, Eleanor—if there was an interval of time in which there was substance to your concerns. However, I was reassured that that deficiency—if it was there—had been rectified at a pretty early stage.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i un mater, sef un o'r pwyntiau a gododd Alun Ffred Jones tua diwedd ei gyfraniad, ynglŷn â'r math o wybodaeth y gellid ei rhoi i bobl sydd mewn perygl o fynd yn sâl oherwydd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Llyn Cwellyn.

Yr oedd bwlch rhwng yr amser y bu i ni ddarganfod bod rhywbeth o'i le a phan gyhoeddwyd, fis yn ddiweddarach, beth oedd y rheswm. A oes unrhyw ffordd—ac mae nifer o bobl wedi codi hyn gyda mi—o gael gwybodaeth ynghynt i bobl? Yn naturiol,

Felly, mae angen inni ddatrys hyn mewn ffordd sy'n gymesur ac sy'n rhoi ffydd i'r cyhoedd. Rhaid gwneud y gwaith hwnnw, ond nid wyf am wneud cyhoeddiad arno heddiw.

Er hynny, y cwmni'n amlwg sy'n gyfrifol yn y lle cyntaf. Dyma'r gosodiad sylfaenol: nid lle'r Arolygiaeth Dŵr Yfed, y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol na fy lle i yw dal y cyflenwr ar ei fai; ac nid mater ydyw ei bod yn iawn i'r cyflenwr barhau i ymddwyn felly oni bai ei fod yn cael ei ddal yn gwneud rhywbeth o'i le.

Nid dyna sut mae'r cyfleustodau hyn yn gweithio. Mae ganddynt gyfrifoldeb unigol sylfaenol dros ddiogelwch eu cynnyrch, a thros y modd y mae'n cael ei ddarparu; beth bynnag fo'r gyfundrefn archwilio, dyna yw eu cyfrifoldeb. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn canfod ble'n union mae'r cyfrifoldeb. Os nad yw'r cyfrifoldeb sylfaenol wedi'i amlinellu'n eglur, yna, unwaith eto, byddwn yn cyfleu negeseuon cymysg, a bydd yn arwain at ddryswch.

Yr oeddech wedi tynnu sylw at Galw Iechyd ar y pryd, ac fe'i tynnais i ffwrdd. Yr oedd y ddadl a godwyd gennych chi ac Alun Ffred ychydig yn fwy amwys. Byddai wedi bod yn achos pryder imi—a gwnaethoch chi'r honiad yn fwy croch na neb, Eleanor—pe bai sail wedi bod i'ch pryderon ar unrhyw adeg. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy sicrhau bod y diffyg hwnnw—os oedd diffyg yno—wedi ei gywiro'n eithaf cynnar.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I will limit my remarks to one issue, on one of the points raised by Alun Ffred Jones towards the end of his contribution, in relation to the sort of information that could be given to people in danger of falling ill because of what happened at Llyn Cwellyn.

There was a gap between finding out that there was something amiss and the announcement being made, a month later, about what had caused it. Is there any way—a number of people have raised this issue—of getting information to people more quickly?

maent yn pryderu bod mis wedi mynd heibio cyn iddynt gael gwybod.

O ran natur yr wybodaeth, a yw'r awdurdodau wedi dysgu gwersi ynglŷn â sut y maent yn dweud wrth bobl beth sy'n digwydd—sut y maent yn cysylltu â phobl, a beth yw'r modd mwyaf effeithiol o wneud hynny? Derbyniad sawl peth a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am faterion eraill, ond mae pobl dal eisiau gwybod a ydynt yn cael yr wybodaeth yn fuan, ac a ydynt yn cael yr wybodaeth mewn ffordd sy'n gwneud iddynt sylweddoli bod sefyllfa beryglus yma, a bod yn rhaid iddynt wneud rhywbeth eu hunain i leihau ei effaith.

Brian Gibbons: It was difficult in the circumstances, because what was happening, in many ways, was not consistent with the existing evidence base. People were being infected by cryptosporidium on the one hand, but, equally, the monitoring from the lake showed that the level of organisms was below threshold levels. Therefore, there was, if you like, a dissonance between what was happening to patients, and the existing knowledge base. However, once the public health people said, 'Forget about what is written in the guidance, we have to start off from square one', they took pretty vigorous action.

On how best to disseminate information—and I believe that Eleanor Burnham also touched on this—our feeling is that people like traditional ways of finding out about such things. By 'traditional ways', I mean distributing leaflets door-to-door and using the mainstream media. While things such as websites and text messages, and all this modern technology, have a role to play, everything suggests that the simple, standard, bread-and-butter ways of communication are the best way to disseminate information. That is our view. Wherever the opportunity presents itself, we also want to bring concerned citizens together to meet a specialist. That happened during the E.coli outbreak, where National Public Health Service for Wales staff went to public meetings and had either small group meetings or even one-to-one meetings with

Naturally, people are worried that a month had gone by before they heard anything.

In terms of the nature of the information, have authorities learned the lessons of how they inform people of what is happening—how they get in touch with people, and what is the most effective means of doing so? I accept a number of the points made by the Minister on other issues, but people still want to know that they receive the information quickly, and that they do so in a way that tells them that there is a dangerous situation and that they must act to lessen its impact.

Brian Gibbons: Yr oedd yn anodd o dan yr amgylchiadau, oherwydd nad oedd yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd, mewn sawl ffordd, yn cydfynd â'r sail dystiolaeth a oedd ar gael. Yr oedd pobl yn cael eu heintio â cryptosporidiwm ar yr un llaw, ond, ar y llaw arall, yr oedd y gwaith monitro a oedd yn cael ei wneud yn y llyn yn dangos bod lefelau'r organebau o dan y lefelau trothwy. Felly, yr oedd, os mynnwch, anghysondeb rhwng yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd i gleifion, a'r sail wybodaeth a oedd ar gael. Fodd bynnag, cyn gynted ag y dywedodd pobl iechyd y cyhoedd, 'Anghofiwch am yr hyn sydd wedi ei ysgrifennu yn y canllawiau, rhaid inni ddechrau o'r dechrau', cymerasant gamau digon cadarn.

Ynglŷn â'r ffordd orau i ledaenu gwybodaeth—a chredaf fod Eleanor Burnham hefyd wedi crybwyll hyn—yr ydym yn cael y teimlad bod yn well gan bobl y dulliau traddodiadol o ddod i wybod am bethau o'r fath. Yr hyn a olygaf wrth 'dulliau traddodiadol' yw dosbarthu taflenni o ddrws i ddrws a defnyddio'r cyfryngau prif ffrwd. Er bod gan bethau fel gwefannau a negeseuon testun, a'r holl dechnoleg fodern ran i'w chwarae, mae popeth yn awgrymu mai dulliau syml, safonol, plaen o gyfathrebu yw'r ffordd orau o ledaenu gwybodaeth. Dyna yw ein barn ni. Pa bryd bynnag y cyfyd y cyfle, yr ydym hefyd am ddod â dinasyddion pryderus at ei gilydd i gwrdd ag arbenigwr. Dyna a ddigwyddodd yn ystod yr achos o E.coli, pan aeth staff Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru i gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus a chawsant

individuals. However, they were proactive in going out and offering themselves as a source of information to the public.

Therefore, low-tech, face-to-face, traditional ways of doing it are the best. We cannot ignore modern technology, but I do not think that we are at a stage where modern technology should be regarded as the main way of doing it.

Mark Isherwood: Clearly, this is a worrying episode and, like all my colleagues, I am sure, I received countless e-mails on this issue from concerned people. As you know, Dr Sandra Payne from the National Public Health Service for Wales has stated that Dŵr Cymru clearly did not break any drinking-water regulations, but, because of that, the regulations need to be looked at again to see if they remain sufficient to protect public health. I know that you have made reference to having to look at the guidance, but I strongly endorse the need to look at those regulations again.

I know that the Welsh Consumer Council expressed its anger, prior to the publication of the report, over the delays in its publishing—I think that that was referred to earlier. Almost a year passed from the date that the boiled water notices first went out to 30,000 households before that report was published. Hopefully, that will provide lessons for the future. In your report, you referred to environmental investigations identifying several routes by which the cryptosporidium from sewage systems in the Cwellyn catchment area could have entered the reservoir. How commonplace is that? Will efforts now be made to close down those routes? I am not a bioscientist, but perhaps you can tell us whether that is a common phenomenon.

You also stated that the water treatment process at the time was not designed to kill or remove cryptosporidium, but an e-mail that was received by north Wales Members and, presumably, constituency Members as well, from Dŵr Cymru stated that the effluent that

gyfarfodydd un ai â grwpiau bach neu hyd yn oed gyfarfodydd un i un gydag unigolion. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddent yn rhagweithiol wrth fynd allan i'r gymuned a chynnig eu hunain fel ffynhonnell o wybodaeth i'r cyhoedd.

Felly, dulliau syml, wyneb yn wyneb, traddodiadol yw'r ffordd orau o fynd ati. Ni allwn anwybyddu technegol fodern, ond ni chredaf ein bod wedi cyrraedd y sefyllfa lle gellir meddwl am y dechnoleg fodern fel y brif ffordd o fynd ati i ledaenu gwybodaeth.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'n amlwg bod yr achos hwn yn peri pryder ac, fel fy holl gyd-Aelodau, yr wyf yn siŵr, derbyniais lu o negeseuon e-bost ynglŷn â'r mater gan bobl bryderus. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Dr Sandra Payne o Wasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi dweud ei bod yn amlwg nad oedd Dŵr Cymru wedi torri unrhyw reoliadau dŵr yfed, ond, oherwydd hynny, mae angen edrych o'r newydd ar y rheoliadau i weld a ydynt yn parhau'n ddigonol i amddiffyn iechyd y cyhoedd. Gwn eich bod wedi sôn am edrych ar y canllawiau, ond yr wyf yn pwysleisio'n gryf yr angen i edrych ar y rheoliadau hyn eto.

Gwn fod Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru wedi mynegi dicter, cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, oherwydd yr oedi a fu cyn ei gyhoeddi—credaf fod cyfeiriad wedi ei wneud at hynny eisoes. Aeth bron i flwyddyn heibio rhwng dyddiad dosbarthu'r hysbysiaid cyntaf i ferwi dŵr i 30,000 o gartrefi a chyhoeddi'r adroddiad. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn cynnwys gwersi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn eich adroddiad, cyfeiriasoch at ymchwiliadau amgylcheddol a ganfu sawl ffordd y gallai'r cryptosporidiwm fod wedi mynd i'r gronfa ddŵr o'r systemau carthffosiaeth yn ardal dalgylch Cwellyn. Pa mor gyffredin yw hynny? A wneir ymdrech yn awr i atal y llwybrau hynny? Nid wyf yn fiowyddonydd, ond efallai y gallwch ddweud wrthym a yw hon yn ffenomenon gyffredin.

Dywedasoch hefyd nad oedd y broses o drin dŵr ar y pryd wedi ei chynllunio i ladd na chael gwared ar gryptosporidiwm, ond yn ôl e-bost a dderbyniwyd gan Aelodau'r Gogledd ac, mi dybiaf, gan Aelodau etholaethol hefyd, gan Ddŵr Cymru a ddywedodd fod yr elifion

goes into Llyn Cwellyn before it is fully treated at the works is a miniscule fraction of the total. What is the relevance of its comment if the treatment does not remove cryptosporidium? Why make that comment in the first place? I do not know if you can shed light on that or pursue it in your broader discussions with Dŵr Cymru.

Brian Gibbons: If you remember, at the very beginning, a number of things were suggested, such as a potential breakdown at the sewage treatment facility at Rhyd Ddu, and there was concern about that. Equally, there was concern that, if a person had diarrhoea and used an ordinary waterway that drained into the lake—if they were camping, for instance, and went down to the end of the field—then that effluent could potentially cause it. Or, if there was a breakdown in a septic tank—cracks in the tank or pipes—that would be sufficient to cause the infection if the person using those toilet facilities had cryptosporidium. It will be extremely difficult, because of that diversity of potential contaminants, to totally eliminate those risks. It is interesting that the autumnal plateauing of cryptosporidium is often associated with heavy rainfall, which might suggest that the organism has been washed off the soil or washed down through waterways and that there may be such a link. Therefore, it could be difficult to totally eradicate all of those things, particularly in an attractive tourism area, as is the case around Llyn Cwellyn.

I cannot fully answer your point in relation to Dŵr Cymru, but I would suggest, in trying to pick up on the question that you were asking, that it has been conventional wisdom up to now that there has not been a significant amount of cryptosporidium—if any—detected in this water. The feeling was that, if there was a small, individual episode, such as potentially happened in this instance, the effect of the body of water in the lake would dilute the number of organisms to such a low level as to constitute no significant risk. However, one of the messages from this outbreak is that, potentially, a single oocyte could be the source of infection, so that there is almost no dilutional effect—if the organism gets into the water and it survives, it is fairly resistant, so that single organism

sy'n llifo i Lyn Cwellyn cyn iddo gael ei drin yn llawn yn y gwaith trin yn ffracsion bach, bach o'r cyfanswm. Beth yw perthnasedd y sylw os nad yw'r driniaeth yn cael gwared ar gryptosporidiwm? Pam gwneud y sylw yn y lle cyntaf? Ni wn a allwch ein goleuo ar y mater neu ei godi yn eich trafodaethau cyffredinol gyda Dŵr Cymru.

Brian Gibbons: Os cofiwch, ar y dechrau un, awgrymwyd nifer o bethau, megis methiant y gwaith trin carthffosiaeth yn Rhyd Ddu o bosibl, ac yr oedd hynny'n achos pryder. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd pryder pe bai'r dolur rhydd ar berson a'i fod yn defnyddio dyfrffordd gyffredin a oedd yn llifo i'r llyn—os oeddent yn gwersylla, er enghraifft, ac yn mynd i lawr i waelod y cae—yna yr oedd yn bosibl y gallai'r elifion hynny ei achosi. Neu, os oedd diffyg mewn tanc septig—craciau yn y tanc neu'r pibelli—y byddai hynny'n ddigon i achosi'r heintiad pe bai cryptosporidiwm ar berson a oedd yn defnyddio'r toiledau hynny. Bydd yn anodd dros ben, oherwydd amrywiaeth yr halogion posibl, i ddileu'r risgiau hynny'n llwyr. Mae'n ddiddorol bod y gwastatau a welir yn nifer yr achosion o gryptosporidiwm yn yr Hydref yn aml yn gysylltiedig â glaw trwm, a all awgrymu bod yr organeb wedi ei olchi oddi ar y pridd neu ei olchi i lawr trwy ddyfrffyrdd a'i bod yn bosibl bod cysylltiad o'r fath. Felly, gall fod yn anodd dileu'r holl bethau hynny'n llwyr, yn enwedig mewn ardal sy'n atyniad i dwristiaid, fel yn achos ardal Llyn Cwellyn.

Ni allaf ateb eich pwynt ynglŷn â Dŵr Cymru'n llawn, ond awgrymaf, wrth geisio ateb y cwestiwn yr oeddech yn ei ofyn, mai'r farn gyffredinol hyd yma yw nad oedd lefel sylweddol o gryptosporidiwm—os oes peth o gwbl—wedi ei ganfod yn y dŵr hwn. Y teimlad oedd, os oedd achos bach, unigol, megis yr hyn a allai fod wedi digwydd yn yr achos hwn, y byddai cymaint o ddŵr ag a geir yn y llyn yn gwanhau nifer yr organebau i lefel mor isel fel na fyddai'n achosi unrhyw risg sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, un o'r negeseuon sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yn sgil yr achos hwn yw ei bod yn bosibl y gallai un öosyt fod yn ffynhonnell heintiad, sy'n golygu nad yw ei wanhau'n cael bron ddim effaith o gwbl—os yw'r organeb yn llwyddo i gyrraedd y dŵr a'i fod yn goroesi, mae'n

could be the potential source of the infection, despite the massive dilution that would take place in the lake.

weddol wydn, felly mae'n bosibl y gall un organeb fod yn ffynhonnell yr heintiad, er gwaethaf y gwanhau enfawr a fyddai'n digwydd yn nŵr y llyn.

3.40 p.m.

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Mae gennym god ymddygiad clir, a gytunwyd rhyngom bron i saith mlynedd yn ôl, i arwain ein hymarweddiad yn y Siambr hon, fel Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Gofynnaf yn ddifrifol i bob un ohonom ailddarllen y cod ymarfer hwnnw, rhag ofn ein bod wedi anghofio'i gynnwys. Plediaf arnoch i ystyried ein bod, fel Cynulliad, yn cynnal ein busnes yn dryloyw gyhoeddus i'r gynulleidfa sydd yma ac i'r gynulleidfa llawer mwy sy'n ein gwyllo ar y rhyngwrwyd ac ar y teledu. Mae'n hanfodol felly ein bod, fel Aelodau, yn ymddwyn gydag urddas bob amser. Mae disgwyl i ni fod yn gadarn yn ein dadleuon, ond hefyd yn gwrtais, a bob amser yn ystyriol.

The Presiding Officer: We have a clear code of conduct, which we agreed nearly seven years ago, to guide our behaviour in this Chamber, as Members of the National Assembly for Wales. I ask that each and every one of us re-reads that code of conduct, in case we have forgotten its content. I urge you to consider that we, as an Assembly, conduct our business in a publicly transparent way for the audience here and the far larger audience watching us on the internet and on television. It is crucial, therefore, that we, as Members, behave with dignity at all times. We are expected to be firm in our debates, but also courteous, and always considerate.

Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006 on the draft The Cereal Seed (Wales) and Fodder Plant Seed (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and

1. a) Yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Hadau Yd (Cymru) a Hadau Planhigion Porthiant (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

b) approves that the Cereal Seed (Wales) and Fodder Plant Seed (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Hadau Yd (Cymru) a Hadau Planhigion Porthiant (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2006; and
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2006;
2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006 on the draft the Meat (Official Controls Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and
- b) approves that the Meat (Official Controls Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2006;
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2006; and
- iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006;
3. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006 on the draft the Feed (Specified Undesirable Substances) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and
- b) approves that the Feed (Specified Undesirable Substances) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006; and
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006. (NDM3352)
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2006; a
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2006;
2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cig (Ffioedd Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Cymru) 2006; a
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cig (Ffioedd Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006;
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006; a
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006;
3. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Sylweddau Annymunol Penodol) (Cymru) 2006; a
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Sylweddau Annymunol Penodol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006; a
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3352)

*Cynnig (NDM3352): O blaid 45, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3352): For 45, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Pugh, Alun

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989
(Diwygio Rheoleiddiol a Chwynion) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Regulatory
Reform and Complaints) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Regulatory Reform and Complaints)

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Diwygio Rheoleiddiol a Chwynion) 2006, y

Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 14 November 2006. (NDM3353)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006 in relation to the draft the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Regulatory Reform and Complaints) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Regulatory Reform and Complaints) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2006. (NDM3354)

This legislation brings the existing regulations on the services that are regulated by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales in line with two recent developments. The first is the reform of regulatory practice in relation to the way in which care standards are provided at a wide range of regulated sites and, secondly, it is to put in place a new framework for the handling of complaints in relation to local authority social services.

Helen Mary Jones: We will be supporting these regulations, taking into account the changes that the Minister has made. However, in doing so, I wish to draw the Minister's attention to one aspect of the regulations that may have implications that the Minister will need to look at. The regulatory appraisal reminds us that the new

gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3353)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Diwygio Rheoleiddiol a Chwynion) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Diwygio Rheoleiddiol a Chwynion) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006; ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3354)

Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn golygu bod y rheoliadau presennol ar y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu rheoleiddio gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn unol â dau ddatblygiad diweddar. Y cyntaf yw diwygio arferion rheoleiddiol o ran y ffordd y mae safonau gofal yn cael eu cyflawni mewn amrywiaeth eang o safleoedd sy'n cael eu rheoleiddio ac, yn ail, mae'n rhoi fframwaith newydd ar waith i ddelio â chwynion yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, gan roi ystyriaeth i'r newidiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, wrth wneud hynny, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at un agwedd o'r rheoliadau a all arwain at oblygiadau y bydd rhaid i'r Gweinidog eu hystyried. Mae'r arfarniad rheoliadol yn ein hatgoffa bod y

regulations make it a fresh responsibility to safeguard and protect service users, and to ascertain and take into account users' wishes and feelings.

In that context, I draw the Minister's attention to the need for more effective and consistent advocacy services across Wales, particularly, but not exclusively, for looked-after children. There is a need for those advocacy services to be independent of the bodies that they may criticise. I put it to the Minister, as I have before, that there is a need for us to commission and fund advocacy services at a national level. It may be that those services should be provided by different organisations in different counties, where different services have been developed, but the need for those services not to be funded by the same body that the advocate may then have to support a service user in criticising, is becoming crucial. I sense some movement in that direction from the Government and I hope that the Minister, in his response to this debate, will be able to indicate how we are progressing towards the development of a truly consistent and independent advocacy service for all vulnerable service users, but particularly for looked-after children across Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: We will be supporting the regulations this afternoon, but I have three points to raise. First, in terms of regulatory reform, Minister, you will know that, on a number of occasions, I have raised my concerns that a large number of registered providers are not meeting a whole raft of requirements under the law, particularly in terms of standards of care, complaints processes, and the way in which they record and keep information on the children in their care. I would be keen for you to outline today how the changes in regulatory reform in this legislation will impact on that. Ultimately, what we want to see are registered providers that provide a higher standard of care, with those providers meeting the requirements of the law and with the children living in safe environments. That needs to be explained in the context of these regulations.

rheoliadau newydd yn golygu cyfrifoldeb newydd i ddiogelu ac amddiffyn defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, ac i ganfod ac ystyried dymuniadau a theimladau defnyddwyr.

Yng nghyd-destun hynny, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at yr angen am wasanaethau eirioli mwy effeithiol a chyson ledled Cymru, yn enwedig, ond nid yn gyfan gwbl, ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Mae angen i'r gwasanaethau eirioli hynny fod yn annibynnol ar y cyrff y gallant fod yn eu beirniadu. Dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog, fel y dywedais eisoes, fod angen inni gomisiynu ac ariannu gwasanaethau eirioli ar lefel genedlaethol. Efallai y dylai'r gwasanaethau hynny gael eu darparu gan wahanol fudiadau mewn gwahanol siroedd, lle mae gwasanaethau gwahanol wedi eu datblygu, ond mae'r angen i'r gwasanaethau hynny beidio â chael eu hariannu gan yr un corff y bydd rhaid i'r eiriolwr wedyn gefnogi defnyddiwr gwasanaeth i'w feirniadu, yn dod yn fater allweddol. Yr wyf yn synhwyro rhyw symudiad i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, yn ei ymateb i'r ddadl hon, yn gallu dangos y cynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud tuag at ddatblygu gwasanaeth eirioli gwirioneddol gyson ac annibynnol i bob defnyddiwr gwasanaeth agored i niwed, ond yn arbennig i blant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau y prynhawn yma, ond mae gennyf dri phwynt yr hoffwn eu codi. Yn gyntaf, o ran diwygio rheoleiddio, Weinidog, gwyddoch fy mod, ar sawl achlysur, wedi mynegi fy mhryderon nad yw nifer fawr o ddarparwyr cofrestredig yn bodloni nifer o ofynion o dan y gyfraith, yn enwedig o ran safonau gofal, prosesau cwyno, a'r ffordd y maent yn cofnodi ac yn cadw gwybodaeth am y plant sydd yn eu gofal. Hoffem pe baech yn amlinellu heddiw sut y bydd y newidiadau mewn diwygio rheoleiddio yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn effeithio ar hynny. Yr hyn yr ydym am ei weld yn y pen draw yw darparwyr cofrestredig sy'n darparu gofal o safon uwch, gyda'r darparwyr hynny'n bodloni gofynion y gyfraith a chyda'r plant yn byw mewn amgylcheddau diogel. Mae'n rhaid egluro hynny yng nghyd-destun y rheoliadau hyn.

Secondly, on the issue of advocacy, I endorse the point raised by Helen Mary Jones. I am not convinced that this will strengthen the role of advocacy, but it does provide young children with a right to follow a complaints procedure. It does not, however, provide the assistance to allow them to do that, and providing the right is one thing, but it is another thing to provide the assistance to those young people, who may find it a daunting task to make complaints and raise concerns about the care home in which they are situated. That needs to be taken on board; advocacy is very much an issue.

Thirdly, I admit that I did not pick this up before, but I have noticed that the Children's Commissioner for Wales was not on the list of consultees for this item of legislation. Bearing in mind the impact that it will have on children, I would have thought that the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales would have been among the long list of other consultees that were notified of this regulation and which were able to provide an input. In the light of his concerns about advocacy, and his general concerns about social service provision and looked-after children, it would make more sense in future to ensure that the children's commissioner is actually consulted.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support these regulations. I will proceed with what is almost an aside of a slightly different nature. The Care Standards Inspectorate Wales is responsible for registering and inspecting a range of services, including children's homes, care homes for adults, adult placement schemes, nurses, agencies and so on. The list also includes voluntary adoption agencies, but the new regulations will not apply to them, because those inspection regulations are joint England-and-Wales regulations. I know that the Minister would like to include those agencies in the inspection regime, and it makes much more sense to have a co-ordinated, consistent approach. That pinpoints how ragged and inconsistent our powers are in that we have a body that has to work to joint England-and-Wales rules under which, obviously, the English agenda dominates. I hope that that comes to an end

Yn ail, ynghylch y mater o eiriolaeth, cefnogaf y pwynt a gododd Helen Mary Jones. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd hyn yn cryfhau rôl eiriolaeth, ond mae yn darparu i blant ifanc hawl i ddilyn trefn gwyno. Nid yw, fodd bynnag, yn darparu'r cymorth i ganiatáu iddynt wneud hyn, ac un peth yw darparu'r hawl, ond mater arall yw darparu'r cymorth i'r bobl ifanc hynny, sydd o bosibl yn credu bod gwneud cwynion a chodi pryderon am y cartref gofal lle cawsant eu lleoli yn dasg frawychus. Rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i hyn; mae eiriolaeth yn ystyriaeth bwysig iawn yn wir.

Yn drydydd, cyfaddefaf na sylwais ar hyn yn flaenorol, ond yr wyf wedi gweld nad yw Comisiynydd Plant Cymru ar y rhestr o ymgngoreion ar gyfer yr eitem hon o ddeddfwriaeth. Gan gofio'r effaith y bydd yn ei chael ar blant, buaswn wedi meddwl y byddai Comisiynydd Plant Cymru wedi bod ymysg y rhestr faith o ymgngoreion y'u hysbyswyd o'r rheoliad hwn ac a oedd yn gallu darparu mewnbyn. Yng ngoleuni ei bryderon am eiriolaeth, a'i bryderon cyffredinol am ddarpariaeth y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a phlant sy'n derbyn gofal, byddai'n gwneud mwy o synnwyr i'r dyfodol i sicrhau yr ymgynghorir â'r comisiynydd plant.

Jenny Randerson: Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Bwriaf ymlaen gyda'r hyn sydd bron yn neillb o natur ychydig yn wahanol. Mae Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn gyfrifol am gofrestru ac arolygu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau gan gynnwys cartrefi plant, cartrefi gofal i oedolion, cynlluniau lleoliadau oedolion, nyrsys, asiantaethau ac ati. Mae'r rhestr hefyd yn cynnwys asiantaethau mabwysiadu gwirfoddol, ond ni fydd y rheoliadau newydd yn berthnasol iddynt hwy, oherwydd bod y rheoliadau arolygu hynny yn gyd-reoliadau ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr. Gwn yr hoffai'r Gweinidog gynnwys yr asiantaethau hynny yn y gyfundrefn arolygu, ac mae'n gwneud llawer mwy o synnwyr gweithredu mewn dull cydlynol, cyson. Mae hyn yn amlygu pa mor fratiog ac anghyson yw ein pwerau o ran bod gennym gorff sy'n gorfod gweithio yn unol â chyd-reolau ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr, rheolau sydd, wrth

soon.

While endorsing previous speakers' remarks, my main point is to take up the issue of the risk-based approach to inspection, which is generally being adopted across the inspection bodies. There is a risk associated with the risk-based approach, which works through the inspecting organisation—in this case, the Care Standards Inspectorate Wales—pinpointing those organisations that it believes to be most at risk and in greatest need of inspection. Apparently, organisations will have a system of self-assessment as part of this process, and the regulations say that they have to carry out a self-assessment of their service, but that it has to be accurate, and not misleading, and in the form requested by CSIW. With all due respect, that is easier said than done. I recall the fact that schools and further education colleges had to bring in self-assessment as part of their inspection system some years ago. In its early years, it experienced considerable teething troubles, not because people were trying to hide things, but because it is actually difficult for organisations to assess themselves. The advantage that schools and colleges had was that those self-assessments were followed up by an actual inspection in each case. However, this will not be the case with the care standards inspectorate's remit. Those organisations that it inspects will not necessarily be followed up, as I understand the regulations. I ask the Minister to take this issue on board, and to ensure that the organisations that are being inspected, some of which will be small and will have limited resources, receive proper guidance and training on how to carry out self-assessments. I also ask the Minister to ensure that some type of quality-control process be put in place by CSIW as a follow-up and that there is what I would call a reality check on self-assessment across the board, and not just in terms of organisations that it feels might be at risk.

3.50 p.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

reswm, yn golygu bod agenda Lloegr yn cael lle blaenllaw. Gobeithiaf y daw i ben yn fuan.

Tra fy mod yn cefnogi sylwadau siaradwyr blaenorol, fy mhrif bwynt yw delio â mater y dull o gynnal arolygiadau ar sail risg, dull a gaiff ei fabwysiadu yn gyffredinol ar draws y cyrff arolygu. Mae risg yn gysylltiedig â'r dull o weithredu ar sail risg, dull sy'n gweithio drwy fod y sefydliad arolygu—yn yr achos hwn, Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru—yn nodi'r sefydliadau hynny y cred sydd â'r risg fwyaf ac y mae arnynt fwyaf angen arolygiad. I bob golwg, bydd gan y sefydliadau system o hunan-asesu fel rhan o'r broses hon, a dywed y rheoliadau fod yn rhaid iddynt wneud hunan-asesiad o'u gwasanaeth, ond bod yn rhaid iddo fod yn fanwl gywir, ac nid yn gamarweiniol, ac ar y ffurf y mynna ASGC iddo fod. Gyda phob dyledus barch, mae'n haws dweud na gwneud. Cofiaf y ffaith bod yn rhaid i ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach gyflwyno hunan-asesiadau fel rhan o'u system arolygu rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd cynnar, cafwyd cryn drafferthion cychwynnol, nid oherwydd bod pobl yn ceisio cuddio pethau, ond oherwydd ei bod yn wirioneddol anodd i sefydliadau eu hasesu eu hunain. Y fantais gan ysgolion a cholegau oedd y dilynwyd yr hunan-asesiadau hyn gan arolygiad gwirioneddol ym mhob achos. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hyn yn wir gyda chylch gwaith yr arolygiaeth safonau gofal. Ni fydd yn gwneud gwaith dilynol o anghenraid ar y sefydliadau hynny y mae'n eu harolygu, fel y deallaf fi'r rheoliadau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi ystyriaeth lawn i'r mater hwn, a sicrhau bod y sefydliadau hynny y cânt eu harolygu, gyda rhai ohonynt yn fach ac yn meddu ar adnoddau cyfyngedig, yn cael hyfforddiant ac arweiniad priodol ar sut i gynnal hunan-asesiadau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog hefyd sicrhau y bydd ASGC yn sefydlu rhyw fath o broses sicrhau-ansawdd fel gwaith dilynol ac y ceir yr hyn y buaswn yn ei alw yn archwiliad realiti ar hunan-asesu yn gyffredinol, ac nid yn unig gyda'r sefydliadau y teimla eu bod mewn risg o bosibl.

Services (Brian Gibbons): There is no doubt that we need to improve advocacy services, and the principles that Helen Mary and Jonathan outlined is the approach that we are taking. Advocacy services not only need to be independent, but they must also be transparently independent so that there is no doubt. We are at an advanced stage of bringing forward proposals in relation to advocacy services, not just in social services, but in the education system and elsewhere, to strengthen the services that are available. Advocacy services are included as part of the Mental Capacity Act 2005, and are also available in terms of the protection of vulnerable adults.

However, one of the strengths of the regulations is the fact that they place a statutory duty on the providers to draw to the attention of the complainant the fact that they have a right to advocacy services, should they wish to exercise it. If no advocacy service is available, people will not be able to do that, but the provider must mention that advocacy services are available as part of the complaints procedure. That is a welcome step forward in making advocacy more of a part of mainstream provision. In terms of Jonathan's point that the regulations will not make advocacy services mandatory, that is true, but the new set of proposals that we will bring forward for consultation will hopefully clarify our position on that issue.

Another strength of the regulations, going back to where we were in terms of the previous statement, is that self-assessment makes organisations aware of what they are doing. In the past, the best organisations were doing this, but the worst organisations were not. Therefore, the regulations make it a statutory requirement. Self-assessment is also part of making clear who is responsible for standards from the start, namely the provider. The provider must be the primary custodian of the standards of the service that it provides, and not the CSIW or the Assembly Government. Therefore, having undertaking a proper assessment, the providers will be better able to honour their statutory duty in this particular area. It will be an offence

Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth fod yn rhaid inni wella'r gwasanaethau eirioli, a'r egwyddorion y bu i Helen Mary a Jonathan eu hamlinellu yw'r dull gweithredu a fabwysiadwn. Rhaid i'r gwasanaethau eirioli nid yn unig fod yn annibynnol, ond rhaid iddynt hefyd fod yn dryloyw o annibynnol fel na cheir unrhyw amheuaeth. Yr ydym wedi symud ymhell iawn ymlaen gyda'r gwaith o gyflwyno cynigion ynghylch gwasanaethau eirioli, nid yn unig ym maes y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond ym maes y system addysg a meysydd eraill, er mwyn cryfhau'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael. Cynhwysir gwasanaethau eirioli fel rhan o Ddeddf Gallu Meddyliol 2005, ac maent hefyd ar gael o safbwynt amddiffyn oedolion agored i niwed.

Fodd bynnag, un o gryfderau'r rheoliadau yw'r ffaith eu bod yn rhoi dyletswydd statudol ar y darparwyr i dynnu sylw'r achwynydd at y ffaith fod ganddo ef neu hi hawl i wasanaethau eirioli, pe dymunai ddefnyddio'r hawl honno. Os nad oes gwasanaeth eirioli ar gael, ni all pobl wneud hynny, ond rhaid i'r darparwr grybwyll bod gwasanaethau eirioli ar gael fel rhan o'r drefn gwyno. Mae hwn yn gam ymlaen i'w groesawu i wneud eiriolaeth yn fwy o ran o ddarpariaeth y brif ffrwd. O safbwynt pwynt Jonathan na fydd y rheoliadau yn gwneud gwasanaeth eirioli yn orfodol, mae hyn yn wir, ond bydd y set newydd o gynigion y byddwn yn eu cyflwyno i ymgynghori arnynt, gyda lwc, yn egluro ein safbwynt ynghylch hynny.

Un o gryfderau eraill y rheoliadau, gan fynd yn ôl i ble'r oeddem o safbwynt y datganiad blaenorol, yw bod hunan-asesu yn gwneud sefydliadau yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a wnânt. Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd y sefydliadau gorau yn gwneud hyn, ond ni wnâi'r sefydliadau gwaethaf hyn. O'r herwydd, mae'r rheoliadau yn ei wneud yn un o'r gofynion statudol. Mae hunan-asesu hefyd yn gwneud yn glir pwy sy'n gyfrifol am safonau o'r dechrau, sef y darparwr. Rhaid i'r darparwr, ac nid ASGC na Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fod yn brif geidwad i safonau'r gwasanaeth y mae'n eu darparu. Felly, ar ôl cynnal asesiad priodol, bydd y darparwyr mewn sefyllfa well i anrhydeddu eu dyletswydd statudol yn y maes penodol hwn. Bydd yn drosedd dan y

under the regulations if the process is not carried out with due diligence; that is the whole point of bringing forward the regulations. If the self-assessment process is done on a wing and a prayer and does not reflect due diligence, it goes against what the regulations specifically intend to deliver.

On Jenny's point in relation to the risk-based approach, it is the approach that is being taken across all regulatory procedures, and not just in public services in Wales—it also underpins the European food hygiene regulations, and so forth. Therefore, it is a fairly standard approach to it. However, you will know from the debate that we had about the Care Standards Inspectorate Wales annual report that it is reorganising its activity to release time so that there will be more unannounced inspections. It has been a criticism that, if the inspector gives notice, it is easy to prepare for the inspection. However, on the back of the regulations and the risk-based approach that CSIW wants to move towards, the unannounced inspections will mean that all organisations must be up to date with their assessments, and so forth.

I am glad that everyone is unanimous in their support of the regulations, and hopefully that will be manifest in the voting too.

rheoliadau os na chyflawnir y broses gyda'r dyfalwch dyledus; dyna holl bwynt cyflwyno'r rheoliadau. Os gwneir y broses hunan-asesu gydag ond y gobaith lleiaf o lwyddo ac os na fydd yn adlewyrchu'r dyfalwch dyledus, mae'n mynd yn groes i'r hyn y bwriedir i'r rheoliadau eu cyflawni.

O safbwynt pwynt Jenny am y dull gweithredu ar sail risg, dyma'r dull a ddefnyddir ar draws yr holl weithdrefnau rheoleiddio, ac nid ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn unig—dyma hefyd sylfaen y rheoliadau hylendid bwyd Ewropeaidd, ac yn y blaen. O'r herwydd, mae'n ddull gweithredu eithaf safonol. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn gwybod o'r ddadl a gawsom am adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ei bod yn ad-drefnu ei gweithgaredd i ryddhau amser fel y ceir rhagor o arolygiadau dirybudd. Un feirniadaeth a fu, os rhydd yr arolygydd rybudd, ei bod yn hawdd paratoi ar gyfer yr arolygiad. Fodd bynnag, yn ychwanegol at y rheoliadau a'r dull gweithredu ar sail risg y mae ASGC eisiau eu bwrw ymlaen, bydd yr arolygiadau dirybudd yn golygu bod yn rhaid i bob sefydliad fod yn gwbl ddiweddar gyda'u hasesiadau, ac yn y blaen.

Yr wyf yn falch fod pawb yn unfrydol yn ei gefnogaeth i'r rheoliadau, a gobeithiaf y daw hyn i'r amlwg yn y bleidlais hefyd.

*Cynnig (NDM3353): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3353): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3354): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3354): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000
 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 ac Arbediad) (Cymru) 2006
 Approval of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 9
 and Saving) (Wales) Order 2006**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No.9 and Saving) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 14 November 2006. (NDM3355)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006 in relation to the draft the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 9 and Saving) (Wales) Order 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No.9 and Saving) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 ac Arbediad) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3355)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 ac Arbediad) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 ac Arbediad) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno

November 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 November 2006. (NDM3356)

This Order will require local authorities to take into account those with mobility issues when erecting new rights of way furniture, such as gates and stiles.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this piece of legislation. In terms of access and equal opportunity, it is essential that local authorities are encouraged to ensure that the right furniture is in place so that people can access the countryside. However, I would like to clarify three things with you. First, what constitutes a mobility problem? I have had some enquiries as to which particular types of mobility issues are referred to in this legislation.

The second issue is one of cost. Although the regulatory appraisal says that it is cost neutral, it points out that the Government gives £2.4 million to local authorities to improve their furniture on these footpaths. Why do some local authorities with an extremely small percentage of the footpaths in Wales within their areas receive a disproportionately large amount of the £2.4 million, when local authorities such as mine, which has 28.4 per cent of all the footpaths in Wales within its area, only receives 13.6 per cent of the budget? Other local authorities that I do not care to name receive, in some cases, 10 times more in proportion to the footpaths that they have. Do you have any plans to improve the position for those authorities that have the largest amount of footpaths?

Finally, since there was no consultation on this Order—and I understand that full consultation took place on the Act—what plans do you have to inform all stakeholders of this Order, and to raise awareness of their

ar 14 Tachwedd 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006; ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3356)

Bydd y Gorchymyn hwn yn mynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn rhoi ystyriaeth i'r rheini sydd ag anawsterau symudedd wrth osod dodrefn hawliau tramwy newydd, megis giatiau a chamfeydd.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth. O safbwynt mynediad a chyfle cyfartal, mae'n hanfodol yr anogir awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod y dodrefn iawn wedi ei osod fel y gall pobl gael mynediad i gefn gwlad. Serch hynny, hoffwn gael esboniad ar dri pheth gennyh. I ddechrau, beth sy'n cyfrif fel problem symudedd? Cefais rai ymholiadau ynghylch pa fathau penodol o broblemau symudedd y cyfeirir atynt yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon.

Cost yw'r ail fater. Er y dywed yr arfarniad rheoleiddio ei fod yn niwtral o ran cost, mae'n amlygu'r ffaith fod y Llywodraeth yn rhoi £2.4 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol i wella eu dodrefn ar y llwybrau hyn. Pam bod rhai awdurdodau lleol sydd â chanran fechan iawn o'r llwybrau yng Nghymru yn eu hardaloedd yn cael swm anghymesur o fawr o £2.4 miliwn, pan fydd awdurdodau lleol megis fy un i, sydd ag 28.4 y cant o'r holl lwybrau yng Nghymru yn ei ardal, ond yn cael 13.6 y cant o'r gyllideb? Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol nas dymunaf eu henwi yn cael, mewn rhai achosion, 10 gwaith yn fwy yn gymesur â'r llwybrau sydd ganddynt. A oes gennyh unrhyw gynlluniau i wella'r sefyllfa i'r awdurdodau hynny sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o lwybrau?

Yn olaf, gan na chafwyd ymgynghoriad ynghylch y Gorchymyn hwn—a deallaf y cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad llawn ynghylch y Ddeddf—pa gynlluniau sydd gennyh i hysbysu'r holl randdeiliaid o'r Gorchymyn

duty under it?

hwn, a chynyddu eu hymwybyddiaeth o'u dyletswydd oddi tani?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I would have thought that any person who had difficulty, for example, in getting over a stile or using the more traditional gates that we are used to, would constitute a person with mobility problems. Good practice would suggest that local authorities should be in a position to make footpaths as accessible as possible to as many people as possible.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Buaswn wedi meddwl y byddai unrhyw un sy'n cael anhawster, er enghraifft, i ddringo camfa neu ddefnyddio'r giataiau mwy traddodiadol yr ydym wedi arfer gyda hwy, yn cyfrif fel rhywun â phroblemau symudedd. Byddai ymarfer da yn awgrymu y dylai awdurdodau lleol fod mewn sefyllfa i wneud llwybrau mor hygyrch â phosibl i gynifer o bobl â phosibl.

On cost, we are talking here about new furniture being brought within this Order. There is no suggestion that existing furniture should be modified as a result of it. The Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 money has always been distributed on the basis, if I understand it rightly, of the standard spending assessment, and I have not had any representations from the Welsh Local Government Association to change that.

O safbwynt cost, siarad yr ydym yma am ddodrefn newydd yn cael ei ddwyn o fewn y Gorchymyn hwn. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym y dylid addasu'r dodrefn presennol o ganlyniad iddo. Mae arian Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 bob amser wedi cael ei ddosbarthu, os y'i deallaf yn iawn, ar sail yr asesiad o wariant safonol, ac ni chefais unrhyw sylwadau gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i newid hyn.

Guidance will be issued to local authorities. The consultation period for that guidance has already begun and is due to end on 26 January. That will provide the basis for good practice by local authorities across the whole of Wales.

Bydd arweiniad yn cael ei gyflwyno i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r cyfnod ymgynghori ynghylch yr arweiniad hwn eisoes wedi dechrau a bydd yn dod i ben ar 26 Ionawr. Bydd hwn yn darparu'r sylfaen ar gyfer ymarfer da gan awdurdodau lleol ar draws Cymru gyfan.

*Cynnig (NDM3355): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3355): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William

Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3356): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3356): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

4.00 p.m.

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)

Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change

Motion (NDM3357): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3357): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

recognises the seriousness of climate change and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve the standard of energy efficiency by:

yn cydnabod difrifoldeb newid yn yr hinsawdd ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella safon effeithlonrwydd ynni drwy:

a) seeking the power to devolve building regulations to the Assembly thus allowing the Assembly Government to set a timetable to work towards zero carbon new build;

a) ceisio'r pŵer i ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad a thrwy hynny ganiatáu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drefnu amserlen ar gyfer gweithio tuag at adeiladau newydd di-garbon;

b) improving the level of advice on energy efficiency, renewable energy and transport available to consumers and community groups;

b) gwella lefel y cyngor ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, ynni adnewyddadwy a thrafnidiaeth sydd ar gael i ddefnyddwyr a grwpiau cymunedol;

c) conducting a high-profile public information campaign to inform consumers of the need and benefits of becoming more energy efficient;

c) cynnal ymgyrch wybodaeth uchel ei phroffil i roi gwybodaeth i ddefnyddwyr am yr angen i ddefnyddio ynni'n effeithlon a manteision hynny;

d) making carbon reduction in the community a strategic goal for local authorities, including linking reduction targets with financial incentives.

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new sub-point at end of the motion:

developing an initiative to enable significant investment in energy efficiency and renewable energy systems such as the development of a Welsh low carbon building programme.

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new sub-point at the end of the motion:

developing and publishing energy efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales.

Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add new sub-point at the end of the motion:

recognising the potential for smart meters to increase energy efficiency, and working with energy suppliers to introduce a Welsh pilot study.

Amendment 4 in the name of Jane Hutt. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

acknowledges that a full-cost appraisal exercise must be carried out on each of the suggested improvements before they are implemented.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis a gwelliant 4 yn enw Jane Hutt.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn cydnabod difrifoldeb newid yn yr hinsawdd ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella safon effeithlonrwydd ynni drwy:

d) gwneud lleihau carbon yn y gymuned yn nod strategol i awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys cysylltu'r targedau ar gyfer lleihau â chymhellion ariannol.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

datblygu cynllun er mwyn gallu buddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni a systemau ynni adnewyddadwy, megis datblygu rhaglen adeiladu carbon isel yng Nghymru.

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

datblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

cydnabod y potensial ar gyfer cael mesuryddion call i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni, a gweithio gyda darparwyr ynni i gyflwyno astudiaeth beilot yng Nghymru.

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jane Hutt. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid cynnal gwerthusiad llawn o gost pob un o'r gwelliannau a awgrymir cyn iddynt gael eu rhoi ar waith.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams, amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendment 4 in the name of Jane Hutt.

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

recognises the seriousness of climate change and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve the standard of energy efficiency by:

- a) *ceisio'r pŵer i ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad a thrwy hynny ganiatáu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drefnu amserlen ar gyfer gweithio tuag at adeiladau newydd di-garbon;*
- a) *seeking the power to devolve building regulations to the Assembly thus allowing the Assembly Government to set a timetable to work towards zero carbon new build;*
- b) *gwella lefel y cyngor ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, ynni adnewyddadwy a thrafnidiaeth sydd ar gael i ddefnyddwyr a grwpiau cymunedol;*
- b) *improving the level of advice on energy efficiency, renewable energy and transport available to consumers and community groups;*
- c) *cynnal ymgyrch wybodaeth uchel ei phroffil i roi gwybodaeth i ddefnyddwyr am yr angen i ddefnyddio ynni'n effeithlon a manteision hynny;*
- c) *conducting a high-profile public information campaign to inform consumers of the need and benefits of becoming more energy efficient;*
- d) *gwneud lleihau carbon yn y gymuned yn nod strategol i awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys cysylltu'r targedau ar gyfer lleihau â chymhellion ariannol. (NDM3357)*
- d) *making carbon reduction in the community a strategic goal for local authorities, including linking reduction targets with financial incentives. (NDM3357)*

Mae'n bleser cyflwyno'r cynnig a wnaed yn enw Jocelyn Davies ar ran Plaid Cymru, sy'n cydnabod difrifoldeb newid yn yr hinsawdd ac yn rhestru cynllun gweithredu i arbed ynni mewn adeiladau a, drwy hynny, leihau allyriadau carbon deuocsid. Nid oes rhaid mynd ati i gyfiawnhau'r pwnc, gan mai dyma'r mater pwysicaf a fydd yn wynebu'r ddynoliaeth yn y degawdau sydd i ddod. Penllanw oedd adroddiad Stern—penllanw cyfres o rybuddion gan wyddonwyr nad oedd pethau fel y dylent fod yn ein byd ac yn ein hamgylchedd. Mae'r rhyfeddodau a welir ar *Planet Earth* bob nos Sul mewn perygl o gael eu chwalu os na wnawn ni rywbeth heddiw.

It is a pleasure to move the motion tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies on behalf of Plaid Cymru, which recognises the seriousness of climate change and sets out an action plan to improve energy efficiency in buildings, and in so doing reducing emissions of carbon dioxide. I do not need to justify this issue, as this will be the most pressing issue facing humanity over the coming decades. The Stern report was the pinnacle—the latest in a series of warnings from scientists, who tell us that things are not as they should be on our planet and in our environment. The wondrous sights that we see every week on *Planet Earth* on a Sunday evening are at risk of being destroyed unless we take action today.

Yr hyn y mae Syr Nicholas Stern yn ei bwysleisio, wrth gwrs, yw'r canlyniadau. Os na wnawn ni ddim, byddwn yn wynebu terfysgoedd ar raddfa rhyfeloedd byd, a chanlyniadau i'r byd na allwn ond eu dychmygu a'u hofni. Nid yw betio yn erbyn y dystiolaeth yn ddoeth o gwbl. Holl fwriad y cynnig yw canolbwyntio ar faes y gallwn ddylanwadu arno. Mae agweddau eraill allweddol, megis ynni glân, gorddefnydd o geir a lorïau, teithio mewn awyrennau ac yn y blaen, ond dylem ddechrau wrth ein traed yn y Cynulliad.

What Sir Nicholas Stern emphasises, of course, are the outcomes. If we do nothing, we will face catastrophes on the scale of world wars, and consequences for the planet that we cannot yet fathom. Betting against the evidence is unwise to say the least. The whole aim of our motion is to concentrate on an area that we can influence. There are other aspects, such as clean energy, the overuse of cars, lorries, air travel and so on, but we should start at our feet here in the Assembly.

Un sector sy'n gyfrifol am ganran sylweddol o'r carbon deuocsid a ollyngir i'r awyr yw

One sector that is responsible for a large percentage of carbon dioxide emissions is our

ein hadeiladau, a daw hanner y gollyngiadau o'n cartrefi. Os ydym o ddirif am dorri yn ôl ar ein defnydd o ynni, rhaid gwneud ein cartrefi yn fwy effeithlon o ran ynni. Dyna pam y dylem gael pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladau yn y Cynulliad, gan osod targedau heriol i'r diwydiant—ar ôl trafodaeth, wrth gwrs—a mewnfurio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf o'r cyfandir.

Mae angen ysgwyd ein diwydiant adeiladu, er bod gwaith arloesol yn cael ei wneud gan gymdeithas Tai Gwalia ac eraill, er enghraifft. Diddorol oedd darllen yr wythnos hon fod sylfaenydd Ikea eisoes yn creu tai rhad ac effeithiol sy'n hawdd i'w hadeiladu. Mae defnydd dychmygus o goed yn yr adeiladau hyn, ond ble mae'r arweiniad yng Nghymru i wneud defnydd o'n fforestydd ni? Os yw ein coed presennol yn anaddas—a dyna a ddywedir yn aml—mae'n bryd inni blannu rhai a fydd yn addas. Dyma faes arall y dylem fod yn flaengar ynddo. Mae Comisiwn Coedwigaeth Cymru yn atebol—yn rhannol, beth bynnag—i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae hwn yn adnodd pwysig, felly mae angen arweiniad. Dylem fod ar flaen y gad, ac nid yn dilyn gwledydd eraill. Felly, o fewn 10 mlynedd, dylem sicrhau bod pob datblygiad adeiladu newydd yn ddi-garbon.

O ran rhoi gwybodaeth i bobl, gwneir gwaith da eisoes; nid ydym yn dechrau o'r dechrau, ond mae angen codi lefel y gêm. Er enghraifft, gydag estyniadau i dai ac adeiladau, rhaid inni roi gwybodaeth i gynghorau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu gosod amodau cynllunio a rhoi cyngor i ymgeiswyr am y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf o ran arbed ynni. Mae'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni yn awyddus i ehangu ei faes llafur fel y gall gynnig cyngor am ynni adnewyddadwy a thrafnidiaeth i bobl, a hefyd mynd â'r newyddion da i grwpiau cymunedol. O gofio y bydd dwy ran o dair o'n tai presennol yn dal i gael eu defnyddio ymhen 40 mlynedd, ni allwn anwybyddu'r gwaith pwysig hwn.

Gwyddom oll beth sy'n digwydd i'n biliau yn ein cartrefi, felly, fel mae'n digwydd, mae cyd-daro rhwng yr awydd i leihau'r carbon deuocsid a ollyngir i'r awyr a'r awydd i arbed arian ar filiau gwres, golau a choginio. Byddai sicrhau bod pawb yn insiwleiddio'u

buildings, and half of the emissions come from our homes. If we are serious about reducing our use of energy, we must make our homes more energy efficient. That is why we should have the power over building regulations here in the Assembly, and then set challenging targets for the industry—following discussion, of course—and import the latest technologies from the continent.

We need to shake up the building industry, although innovative work is being done by companies such as Tai Gwalia and others. It was interesting to read this week that the founder of Ikea is already creating cheap and effective housing, which is easy to build. These houses make innovative use of timber, but where is the guidance in Wales to make use of our own forests? If the timber that we have is not currently appropriate—that is what is often said—it is time to plant trees that will provide appropriate timber. This is another area in which we should be innovative. Forestry Commission Wales is at least partially accountable to the Welsh Assembly Government. This is an important resource, so we need leadership. We should be in the vanguard rather than following other countries. Therefore, within a decade, we should ensure that all building developments are zero-carbon developments.

In terms of disseminating information, good work is already being done; we are not starting from the beginning, but we need to raise our game. For example, on extensions to houses and buildings, we need to provide information to local councils so that they can place planning conditions and provide advice on latest technologies in terms of energy efficiency. The Energy Saving Trust is eager to expand its activities so that it can provide information on renewable energy and transport for people, and take that gospel to community groups. Bearing in mind that two thirds of our current housing stock will still be in use in 40 years' time, we cannot ignore this important work.

We all know what is happening to bills in our homes, so, as it happens, there is a win-win here between the need to reduce carbon dioxide emissions and saving money on heating, lighting and cooking bills. Ensuring that everyone insulates their roofs would save

nenfydau yn arbed £27 miliwn ar ein biliau ac yn atal rhyddhau 0.25 miliwn tunnell o garbon deuocsid i'r awyr. Yn ôl un gymhariaeth, mae hynny'n ddigon i lenwi Stadiwm y Mileniwm 66 o weithiau—dyna'r esboniad, mae'n siŵr, pam fod y gwair yn gwrthod tyfu ar y cae tatws hwnnw.

Ar nodyn mwy difrifol, nid oes cyllideb gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni i gynnal ymgyrchoedd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, er enghraifft, ac mae'n bwysig bod yr elfen honno hefyd yn cael sylw. Bydd fawr neb yma heddiw yn anghytuno â'r angen i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa fel y mae. Y perygl yw, fel y dywedodd George Monbiot yn ddiweddar, y gall y ffaith bod pawb yn cytuno arwain at sefyllfa lle byddwn yn amharod i wneud penderfyniadau anodd. Mae pris i'w dalu—nid oes dwywaith am hynny.

Mae comisiwn Plaid Cymru ar yr economi wedi ei gwneud yn glir bod rhaid sicrhau bod pob datblygiad economaidd yn ateb gofynion cynaliadwyedd. Yr ydym hefyd yn credu bod gwerth mewn gosod targedau blynyddol o ran gostwng lefelau carbon deuocsid: 3 y cant y flwyddyn er mwyn cyrraedd targedau sydd, erbyn hyn, yn cael eu cydnabod yn fyd-eang ac sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn adroddiad Syr Nicholas Stern. Heb darged cyson, mae'n hawdd i ni osgoi ein cyfrifoldebau, ac mae'r pris a delir ym Mangladesh a'r Sahara yn un o fyw neu farw. Yn fuan iawn, daw'r canlyniadau hynny yn ôl i'n poeni ni. Felly, credwn mewn gosod targedau penodol. Deallaf y ddatl ei bod yn anodd cysoni o un flwyddyn i'r llall, a'i bod yn dibynnu ar yr economi ac yn y blaen, ond, heb dargedau, credaf fod llywodraethau yn gallu osgoi eu cyfrifoldebau. Mae hynny'n wir amdanom ni hefyd, wrth gwrs.

With reference to the amendments, the Government addresses the need for a cost-benefit analysis of these actions, which is perfectly reasonable. The Liberal Democrats once again attempt to gild the lily and repeat the central theme of the motion, but we will support the amendments. *[Interruption.]* Yes, I know. We will also support the amendment in the name of Lisa Francis, as we need a standard carbon benchmarking method for buildings, and so that is to be welcomed.

£27 million on our bills and would reduce carbon dioxide emissions by 0.25 million tonnes. According to one comparison, that would fill the Millennium Stadium 66 times—that explains, I am sure, why the grass refuses to grow on that potato patch.

On a more serious note, the Energy Saving Trust does not have a budget to carry out campaigns through the medium of Welsh, for example, and it is important that that element is covered. Not many people here would doubt the need to get to grips with the position as it currently stands. The danger, as George Monbiot said recently, is that the fact that everyone agrees on this may lead to a situation where we are unwilling to take difficult decisions. There is a price to be paid—there is no doubt about that.

Plaid Cymru's economic commission made it clear that we must ensure that all economic developments follow the principles of sustainability. We also believe that there is value in setting annual targets in terms of carbon dioxide reduction: 3 per cent per annum in order to achieve the targets that are now acknowledged on a global basis and which are included in Sir Nicholas Stern's report. Without a constant target it is easy for us to avoid our responsibilities, and the price paid in Bangladesh and the Sahara is one of life or death. Very soon, those outcomes will come back to concern us all. Therefore, we believe in setting specific targets. I understand the argument that it is difficult to reconcile that from one year to the next, and that it depends on the economy and so on, but, without those targets, I believe that the Government can avoid its responsibilities. That is also true of us all, of course.

Gyda golwg ar y gwelliannau, mae'r Llywodraeth yn rhoi sylw i'r angen am ddadansoddiad cost a budd o'r gweithredoedd hyn, sy'n gwbl resymol. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol unwaith eto'n ceisio euro aur ac ailadrodd thema ganolog y cynnig, ond byddwn ni'n cefnogi'r gwelliannau. *[Torri ar draws.]* Ie, gwn hynny. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi'r gwelliant yn enw Lisa Francis, gan fod arnom angen dull safonol o feincodi carbon ar gyfer

adeiladau, ac mae hyn felly i'w groesawu.

To come back to the cost referred to by Nicholas Stern, it is true that it will come at a cost, but the cost of doing nothing is infinitely greater. As a state, we have thrown away billions of pounds—and continue to do so—on a bloody, illegal war, fought in part to protect the oil supply of the west. It is time to get our priorities right for the sake of our communities and to ensure a safe future for all of our children. [*Applause.*]

I ddod yn ôl at y gost y cyfeiriwyd ati gan Nicholas Stern, mae'n wir y bydd costau, ond mae cost gwneud dim yn llawer mwy. Fel gwladwriaeth, yr ydym wedi gwastraffu biliynau o bunnoedd—ac yr ydym yn dal i wneud hynny—ar ryfel gwaedlyd, anghyfreithlon, sy'n cael ei ymladd yn rhannol er mwyn amddiffyn cyflenwad olew'r gorllewin. Mae'n bryd inni gael ein blaenoriaethau'n iawn er mwyn ein cymunedau ac er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol diogel i bob un o'n plant. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

Mick Bates: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new sub-point at the end of the motion:

Mick Bates: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

developing an initiative to enable significant investment in energy efficiency and renewable energy systems such as the development of a Welsh low carbon building programme.

datblygu cynllun er mwyn gallu buddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni a systemau ynni adnewyddadwy, megis datblygu rhaglen adeiladu carbon isel yng Nghymru.

I propose amendment 2. Add a new sub-point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 2: Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

developing and publishing energy efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales.

datblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

I thank Plaid Cymru for bringing forward one of the most critical and essential challenges for every Parliament throughout the world. However, I will start with a quote from Jonathon Porritt:

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno un o'r heriau pwysicaf a mwyaf hanfodol i bob Senedd ym mhob cwr o'r byd. Fodd bynnag, dechreuaf â dyfyniad gan Jonathon Porritt:

'an unbelievable mess of crabby mandated minima'.

cybolfa anhygoel o fanion mandedig cybyddlyd.

That is how Jonathon Porritt describes the Westminster Government's review of building regulations. Therefore, despite the fact that I do not suppose that any member of the Labour Party—or any party, come to that—would disagree with the sentiments and a great many of the statements in this motion, it appears as though there is a large gap between the rhetoric and the actions of the Labour Party, both here in Wales and at

Dyma sut y mae Jonathon Porritt yn disgrifio adolygiad Llywodraeth San Steffan o reoliadau adeiladu. Felly, er gwaetha'r ffaith nad wyf yn tybio y byddai unrhyw aelod o'r Blaid Lafur—nac unrhyw blaid, o ran hynny—yn anghytuno â'r syniadau a nifer fawr o'r datganiadau sydd yn y cynnig hwn, ymddengys bod gagendor mawr rhwng rhethreg a gweithredoedd y Blaid Lafur, yma yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan.

Westminster.

Another example—one that I have long promoted, as have other Members from the opposition parties—is the energy efficiency of school buildings. The Sustainable Development Commission recently examined energy efficiency in schools and found that a large secondary school could save between £40,000 and £50,000 per annum by improving its energy efficiency. That is the reality of the cost referred to by Alun Ffred. This means something to the whole of the public sector and to individuals. Therefore, I accept entirely the one part of the motion that refers to advice. However, with reference to our amendment 1, I believe that it is essential that we also recognise that there is a cost. Here, Alun Ffred referred to the recent Stern report. Stern is a global economist who is respected everywhere. He made the central point that without massive investment in renewable energy technologies and a change in behaviour, we will not meet the challenge of climate change. That is the central theme that I wish to bring forward in my amendment 1. We have to recognise that, despite the great sentiments of Plaid Cymru's motion and the rhetoric of Labour, unless we provide support for those schools to save that £40,000 or £50,000, with proper funds for statutory not voluntary advice centres, we will not achieve the targets.

4.10 p.m.

The other great theme that we heard from Peter Hain during the Queen's Speech debate last week was that there will be a climate change Bill in this Parliament. Everyone can sign up to a climate change Bill. However, it is a toothless implement unless it has binding statutory carbon-reduction targets. That is the way forward. Without the targets and without the investment, none of these fine ideals will come to fruition.

I also believe that we do not currently possess the data to understand what we need to do in our public buildings in Wales. That is why amendment 2 is particularly important to further the ideals expressed in Plaid Cymru's motion. We have our whole estate

Enghraifft arall—un yr wyf i, ac Aelodau eraill o'r gwrthbleidiau, wedi bod yn ei hybu ers tro—yw effeithlonrwydd ynni adeiladau ysgolion. Cynhaliodd y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy effeithlonrwydd archwiliad o ynni mewn ysgolion yn ddiweddar a chanfu y gallai ysgol uwchradd fawr arbed rhwng £40,000 a £50,000 y flwyddyn drwy wella'i heffeithlonrwydd ynni. Dyna realiti'r gost y cyfeiriwyd ati gan Alun Ffred. Mae hyn yn golygu rhywbeth i'r sector cyhoeddus yn ei gyfanrwydd ac i unigolion. Felly, yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr y rhan o'r cynnig sy'n cyfeirio at gyngor. Fodd bynnag, gyda golwg ar ein gwelliant 1, credaf ei bod yn hanfodol ein bod hefyd yn cydnabod bod cost. Yma, cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred at adroddiad diweddar Stern. Mae Stern yn economegydd uchel ei barch drwy'r byd i gyd. Mynegodd y pwynt canolog na allwn fynd i'r afael â her newid yn yr hinsawdd heb fuddsoddiad aruthrol mewn technolegau ynni adnewyddadwy a newid mewn ymddygiad. Dyma'r thema ganolog yr hoffwn ei chyflwyno yn fy ngwelliant 1. Rhaid inni gydnabod, er gwaetha'r pwyntiau emosiynol iawn sydd yng nghynnig Plaid Cymru a rhethreg Llafur, os nad ydym yn cynorthwyo'r ysgolion hyn i arbed y £40,000 neu'r £50,000, ag arian priodol ar gyfer canolfannau cyngor statudol yn hytrach na gwirfoddol, ni fyddwn yn cyrraedd y targedau.

Y thema fawr arall a glywsom gan Peter Hain yn ystod dadl Araith y Frenhines yr wythnos diwethaf oedd y bydd Mesur newid yn yr hinsawdd yn cael ei gyflwyno yn ystod y Senedd hon. Gall pawb gefnogi Mesur newid yn yr hinsawdd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwbl ddiwerth heb dargedau statudol cyfrwymol ar gyfer lleihau carbon. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Heb y targedau a heb y buddsoddiad, ni fydd unrhyw un o'r syniadau delfrydol hyn yn dwyn ffrwyth.

Credaf hefyd nad ydym ar hyn o bryd yn meddu ar y data i ddeall beth y mae angen inni ei wneud yn ein hadeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Dyna pam bod gwelliant 2 yn bwysig iawn er mwyn gweithredu'r sefyllfaedd delfrydol y cyfeiriwyd atynt yng

in Wales, including the national health service's estate, and our education estate, but no-one is out there saying, 'Look, this is the energy rating of the buildings in your estate, and this is how you can improve it'. Despite the energy route-map, which I know the Minister is extremely fond of quoting, and the microgeneration plan, we can get nowhere unless the people in these buildings have the information to improve the situation as regards energy efficiency. Therefore, I think that we can make great steps forward with fuel poverty if the investment is there, and I hope that the Minister recognises that point in his response to this debate.

Zero-carbon build is, again, a fine ideal. Everyone has heard of BedZED, yet how many people have heard of Howard Kimberley and WyeZed? In Powys, there is an attempt to replicate the great work of BedZED in a rural area. Sometimes, these projects do not go ahead because of a lack of interest from a Government whose rhetoric does not match its actions. Fundamentally, there is a challenge to the Government. On 21 March 2006, when Carwyn Jones was responding to a debate, speaking to the final amendment on devolving building regulations, he said,

'we will be supporting this...because we want to ensure that all homes are built to the highest standards of energy efficiency'.

That, I believe, is a critical feature—but, again, it is rhetoric, and not action. Since that debate, I am not aware that the Minister has had any great contact with Westminster seeking to improve the outcome of the consultation and change the building regulations. Therefore, there is a challenge to us all in this debate, and it will be met only if, as Stern said, we have massive investment in renewable energy technology and energy efficiency, and if we change behaviour. Changing behaviour can be achieved only if the people whose behaviour we wish to change have the data on which they can base their future actions.

ngynnig Plaid Cymru. Mae'n hystâd gyfan gennym yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys ystâd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, a'n hystâd addysg, ond nid oes unrhyw un allan yna'n dweud, 'Edrychwch, dyma raddfa ynni'r adeiladau yn eich ystâd, a dyma sut y gallwch ei gwella'. Er gwaetha'r map llwybr ynni, y gwn fod y Gweinidog yn hoff iawn o'i ddyfynnu, a'r cynllun microgynhyrchu, ni allwn gyflawni dim oni bai fod gan y bobl yn yr adeiladau hyn yr wybodaeth i wella'r sefyllfa o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni. Felly, credaf y gallwn gymryd camau mawrion yn ein blaenau â thlodi tanwydd os yw'r buddsoddiad yno, a hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod y pwynt hwn yn ei ymateb i'r ddadl hon.

Mae adeiladau di-garbon, unwaith eto, yn swnio'n ddelfrydol. Mae pawb wedi clywed am BedZED, ond faint o bobl sydd wedi clywed am Howard Kimberley a WyeZed? Ym Mhowys, mae ymdrech i efelychu gwaith mawr BedZED mewn ardal wledig. Ambell waith, nid yw'r prosiectau hyn yn mynd yn eu blaenau oherwydd diffyg diddordeb gan Lywodraeth nad yw ei rhethreg yn cyfateb i'w gweithredoedd. Yn y bôn, mae'r Llywodraeth yn wynebu her. Ar 21 Mawrth 2006, pan oedd Carwyn Jones yn ymateb i ddadl, ac yn siarad ar y gwelliant olaf ar ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu, dywedodd,

byddwn yn ei gefnogi y prynhawn yma, oherwydd yr ydym am sicrhau bod pob cartref yn cael ei godi yn unol â'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Mae hon, yn fy marn i, yn nodwedd bwysig iawn—ond, unwaith eto, rhethreg sydd yma, ac nid gweithredoedd. Ers y ddadl honno, nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod y Gweinidog wedi cysylltu nemor ddim â San Steffan i geisio gwella canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad a newid y rheoliadau adeiladu. Felly, mae her i bob un ohonom yn y ddadl hon, ac fel y dywedodd Stern, yr unig ffordd o gyflawni'r her yw drwy fuddsoddiad aruthrol mewn technoleg ynni adnewyddadwy ac effeithlonrwydd ynni, a thrwy newid ein hymddygiad. Ni ellir newid ymddygiad onid yw'r bobl yr ydym yn dymuno newid eu hymddygiad yn meddu ar y data i seilio'u gweithredoedd yn y dyfodol arnynt.

Brynle Williams: I propose amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new sub-point at the end of the motion:

recognising the potential for smart meters to increase energy efficiency, and working with energy suppliers to introduce a Welsh pilot study.

Mae'n bleser gweld bod Plaid Cymru wedi dod â'r ddadl hon ger ein bron yn y Siambr.

The Conservatives recognise the importance of energy efficiency in tackling climate change. As my colleague, Mick Bates, has said, we need the tools, and that is what I will speak about. There is little to gain from chasing a 10 per cent renewable energy target if consumption rises so fast that its contribution becomes irrelevant. This is where smart meters come in. They have enormous potential to change the way in which households use energy.

Smart meters are proven to increase efficiency. In Northern Ireland, they have reduced consumption by an average of 3 per cent. In California, the figure has been more than 10 per cent. However, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs has a conservative estimate for the mainland UK of about 5 per cent. When consumption is spiralling upwards, and homes have more and more appliances and electrical goods, the savings that smart meters bring should not be dismissed.

First, by making people aware of how much energy is being used and exactly what it costs, a smart meter can change how a household uses energy and provide an incentive to invest in energy-efficient measures such as loft and cavity wall insulation.

Secondly, the use of smart meters can stop the financially vulnerable from falling into fuel poverty. Many Welsh households rely on estimated billing for their electricity and gas supplies, and these estimates can be wildly off the mark, as we are all aware. With energy prices remaining high over this

Brynle Williams: Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

cydnabod y potensial ar gyfer cael mesuryddion clyfari wella effeithlonrwydd ynni, a gweithio gyda darparwyr ynni i gyflwyno astudiaeth beilot yng Nghymru.

It is a pleasure to see that Plaid Cymru has brought this debate before us in the Chamber.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd effeithlonrwydd ynni wrth fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd. Fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mick Bates, mae arnom angen y cyfarpar, a dyna beth yr wyf am siarad amdano. Nid oes fawr i'w ennill o fynd ar ôl targed o 10 y cant ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy os yw'r defnydd yn cynyddu mor gyflym fel bod ei gyfraniad yn mynd yn amherthnasol. Dyma lle mae mesuryddion clyfar yn mynd i fod yn bwysig. Mae ganddynt botensial aruthrol i newid y ffordd y mae cartrefi'n defnyddio ynni.

Profwyd bod mesuryddion clyfar yn cynyddu effeithlonrwydd. Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, maent wedi arwain at ostyngiad o 3 y cant ar gyfartaledd yn y defnydd o ynni. Yng Nghaliffornia, mae'r ffigwr wedi bod yn fwy na 10 y cant. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig amcangyfrif ceidwadol o tua 5 y cant ar gyfer y DU. Pan fo'r defnydd o ynni ar gynnydd, a chartrefi'n defnyddio mwy a mwy o gyfarpar a nwyddau trydanol, ni ddylid anwybyddu'r arbedion y gall mesuryddion clyfar eu sicrhau.

Yn gyntaf, drwy wneud pobl yn ymwybodol o faint o ynni sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio a faint yn union y mae'n ei gostio, gall mesurydd clyfar newid y ffordd y mae cartref yn defnyddio ynni a bod yn gymhelliant i fuddsoddi mewn dulliau arbed ynni megis insiwleiddio'r llofft a waliau dwbl.

Yn ail, o ddefnyddio mesuryddion clyfar gellid arbed pobl sydd mewn sefyllfa ariannol fregus rhag tloedi tanwydd. Mae llawer o aelwydydd yng Nghymru'n dibynnu ar filiau sydd wedi eu hamcangyfrif ar gyfer eu cyflenwadau trydan a nwy, a gall yr amcangyfrifon hyn fod yn wallus iawn, fel y

winter, households may end up facing a substantial energy bill in the new year.

Janet Ryder: Do you not agree that many energy companies fail to recalibrate their prepayment meters promptly enough and therefore create a mountain of debt for some of the poorest people in society? This needs to be addressed, and those companies that are not recalibrating now need to do so quickly to avoid people having their debt increased.

Brynle Williams: I agree, Janet. That is why smart meters are so important. As I said, a smart meter can provide households with instant information on how much energy they are using, and exactly what their bill will be, and allows people to assess where they have room to make energy savings.

Finally, smart meters can be a gateway to a wholly different energy market: one that is fit for the twenty-first century. They can make it simple to sell electricity produced through microgeneration back into the national grid. The Stern report, which my colleagues across the Chamber have referred to, has a great deal to say in support of smart meters. It states that they are critical to the cost-effectiveness of these technologies.

For utility companies, smart meters offer great opportunities. Fewer disputes over estimated bills would simplify their operations and they could introduce different tariffs in order to cut back on peak demand. The Stern report suggests that power companies could reduce peak demand by between 8 per cent and 17 per cent. Installing smart meters in the place of traditional units, the majority of which are based on 1970s designs, would cost an estimated £40 to £50. However, as the Stern report points out, over 90 per cent of the initial cost can be reclaimed in the savings that they bring. Utility companies replace thousands of meters in Wales each year. It makes perfect sense for a smart meter to be installed when existing ones are to be changed, but there needs to be a standard for utility companies

gwyddom oll. Gan fod prisiau ynni'n dal i fod yn uchel dros y Gaeaf hwn, mae'n bosib y bydd aelwydydd yn wynebu biliau ynni mawr yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Janet Ryder: Onid ydych yn cytuno nad yw llawer o gwmnïau ynni'n ailgalibro eu mesuryddion rhagdalun ddigon buan gan greu dyledion anferthol i rai o bobl dlotaf cymdeithas? Mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw i hyn, ac mae angen i'r cwmnïau hynny nad ydynt yn ailgalibro yn awr wneud hynny ar fyrder er mwyn sicrhau na fydd dyledion pobl yn cynyddu.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn cytuno, Janet. Dyna pam y mae mesuryddion clyfar mor bwysig. Ys dywedais, gall mesurydd clyfar roi gwybodaeth i aelwydydd yn syth ynglŷn â faint o ynni y maent yn ei ddefnyddio, ac yn union beth fydd eu biliau, ac mae'n fodd iddynt asesu pethau er mwyn gwneud arbedion o ran ynni.

Yn olaf, gall mesuryddion clyfar arwain at farchnad ynni hollol wahanol: un sy'n addas i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Gallant gynnig ffordd syml o werthu'r trydan a gaiff ei werthu drwy ficrogynhyrchu yn ôl i'r grid cenedlaethol. Mae adroddiad Stern, y cyfeiriodd fy nghydweithwyr ar y tu arall i'r Siambr ato, yn bleidiol iawn i fesuryddion smart. Dywedir eu bod yn allweddol o ran gwneud y technolegau hyn yn rhai cost effeithiol.

I gwmnïau'r cyfleustodau, mae mesuryddion clyfar yn gyfle gwych. Byddai llai o anghydfodau ynghylch amcangyfrifon biliau a byddai hynny'n symleiddio pethau iddynt a gallent gyflwyno tariffau gwahanol er mwyn lleihau'r galw yn ystod oriau brig. Awgrymir yn adroddiad Stern y gallai'r cwmnïau ynni leihau'r galw ar yr oriau brig rhwng 8 y cant ac 17 y cant. Byddai gosod mesuryddion clyfar yn lle'r rhai traddodiadol, y cafodd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt eu seilio ar ddyluniadau o'r 1970au, yn costio tua £40 hyd £50. Fodd bynnag, ys dywedir yn adroddiad Stern, byddai modd adennill mwy na 90 y cant o'r gost ddechreuol trwy'r arbedion a ddeuai yn eu sgil. Mae cwmnïau'r cyfleustodau'n gosod miloedd o fesuryddion newydd yn lle hen rai yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Mae'n gwneud synnwyr perffaith gosod mesurydd clyfar os

to follow, which is why I have called for a pilot study in Wales, in partnership with energy companies.

DEFRA has committed to a trial in London this year, but Wales should not stand still for another two years before the results of that are known. With a Welsh study we can find out exactly what technology is best suited, and start making headway on increasing energy efficiency and cutting back on carbon dioxide emissions.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enw Jane Hutt. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid cynnal gwerthusiad llawn o gost pob un o'r gwelliannau a awgrymir cyn iddynt gael eu rhoi ar waith.

Helen Mary Jones: As other speakers have already said, climate change is, without doubt, one of the greatest challenges facing us all. Our motion focuses on specific measures that we believe would make an enormous difference, and which could begin to be put into place immediately. No-one underestimates the complexity of the problem facing us, but the fact that the situation is so complex has sometimes led people to do nothing. We believe that it is better to take some small concrete steps in order to make a more significant contribution now.

I will address sub-point b) in our motion specifically, which is about information and advice and making sure that that is widely spread. As Alun Ffred Jones said in his speech, some progress has been made in that regard. There are valuable projects across Wales and I pay tribute to the work being done in my region by the Carmarthenshire Energy Agency. I know that other Members who represent Carmarthenshire have also had experience of how useful this agency's work is. It is a dynamic partnership between a range of bodies; it maximises resources, and it does all of the things that we ask such organisations to do.

bwriedir newid y rhai presennol, ond dylai fod safon i gwmnïau'r cyfleustodau ei dilyn, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn am astudiaeth dreialu yng Nghymru, ar y cyd â'r cwmnïau ynni.

Mae DEFRA wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i dreialu yn Llundain eleni, ond ni ddylai Cymru aros yn llonydd am ddwy flynedd arall cyn y bydd y canlyniadau hynny'n hysbys. O wneud astudiaeth yng Nghymru gallwn ddarganfod yn union pa dechnoleg sydd fwyaf addas, a dechrau bwrw ymlaen i gynyddu effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid.

The First Minister: I propose amendment 4 in the name of Jane Hutt. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

acknowledges that a full-cost appraisal exercise must be carried out on each of the suggested improvements before they are implemented.

Helen Mary Jones: Ys dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, mae'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn ddiamau, yn un o'r sialensau mwyaf sy'n ein hwynebu ni oll. Mae ein cynnig yn canolbwyntio ar fesurau penodol y credwn y byddent yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr, ac y gellid cychwyn eu rhoi ar waith ar unwaith. Nid oes neb yn tanbrizio cymhlethdod y broblem sy'n ein hwynebu, ond y gwir amdani yw bod cymhlethdod astrus y sefyllfa wedi arwain pobl i beidio â gwneud dim. Credwn mai gwell fyddai cymryd camau bach a phendant er mwyn gwneud cyfraniad mwy sylweddol yn awr.

Yr wyf am roi sylw penodol i is-bwynt b) ein cynnig, sy'n ymwneud â gwybodaeth a chyngor a sicrhau eu bod wedi eu rhannu'n eang. Ys dywedodd Alun Ffred Jones yn ei araith, gwnaethpwyd peth cynnydd yn hynny o beth. Mae prosiectau gwerthfawr ar draws Cymru a hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yn fy rhanbarth innau gan Asiantaeth Ynni Sir Gâr. Gwn i Aelodau eraill sy'n cynrychioli Sir Gaerfyrddin brofi pa mor ddefnyddiol y mae gwaith yr asiantaeth hon. Mae'n bartneriaeth ddeinamig ar y cyd ag amrywiol gyrff; mae'n defnyddio adnoddau i'r eithaf, ac mae'n gwneud popeth y gofynnwn i gyrff o'r fath ei wneud.

4.20 p.m.

It undertakes very valuable work in raising awareness and it is present at a huge range of community events, doing basic things such as handing out energy-saving light bulbs and talking to people about loft insulation. These are basic, but important things. There is also a focus on working in some of our poorer communities, which picks up on another theme about fuel poverty and about how saving energy can not only impact on the environment, but be of huge benefit with regard to people's incomes.

Next week, the trust will celebrate the completion of a valuable renewable energy project, which will provide solar panels to community buildings across Carmarthenshire. Many of us are looking forward to the celebration at Neuadd Gwenllïan in Kidwelly next week. The work has wide community backing and is valued, but it is fragile. Projects such as this across Wales depend on variable funding streams, some from the public sector and some from the voluntary sector, and too many projects expend almost as much energy on seeking and maintaining funding, as they do on promoting renewable energy, giving out information, and promoting saving energy. There is also the risk of duplication of action.

For these basic services that provide advice, we need to move away from a project culture. We now know what works. The demonstration projects have been done, we know the difference that the work can make, and we need to build it into the core of what we do, to use a slightly overused phrase. Information and advice about saving energy and renewable energy and so on need to be mainstreamed into how we build new houses and advise businesses; it needs to be core to what the Assembly Government does. Our motion, as I said, sets out practical steps that could begin to make a major difference, and I hope that the whole Assembly will support the motion.

Glyn Davies: It seems that we are all pretty

Mae'n gwneud gwaith da iawn o ran codi ymwybyddiaeth ac mae'n bresennol mewn nifer fawr o ddigwyddiadau cymunedol, yn gwneud pethau sylfaenol megis rhannu bylchau ynni isel a siarad â phobl ynghylch insiwleiddio loffydd. Mae'r pethau hyn yn sylfaenol ond maent yn bwysig. Mae ffocws hefyd ar weithio yn rhai o'n cymunedau tlotaf, sy'n cyffwrdd â thema arall sef tlodi tanwydd a sut y gall arbed ynni effeithio nid ar yr amgylchedd yn unig, gall ddwyn manteision mawr i incwm pobl hefyd.

Yr wythnos nesaf, bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn dathlu cwblhau prosiect ynni adnewyddadwy gwerthfawr, a fydd yn darparu paneli solar i adeiladau cymunedol ar draws Sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae llawer ohonom yn edrych ymlaen at y dathliad yn Neuadd Gwenllïan yng Nghydweli yr wythnos nesaf. Mae cefnogaeth helaeth i'r gwaith yn y gymuned ac mae'n cael ei drysori, ond mae'n fregus. Mae prosiectau fel hyn ar draws Cymru'n dibynnu ar amrywiol ffynonellau arian, rhai o'r sector cyhoeddus a rhai o'r sector gwirfoddol, ac mae gormod o brosiectau'n defnyddio bron cymaint o egni'n chwilio am arian a chynnal yr arian hwnnw ag y maent ar hybu ynni adnewyddadwy, rhannu gwybodaeth a hybu arbed ynni. Mae perygl dyblygu gwaith hefyd.

I'r gwasanaethau sylfaenol hyn sy'n cynnig cyngor, mae'n rhaid inni adael diwylliant y prosiectau o'n hól. Gwyddom beth sy'n gweithio bellach. Mae'r prosiectau arddangos wedi eu gwneud, gwyddom y gwahaniaeth y gall y gwaith ei wneud, ac mae angen inni ei feithrin wrth graidd yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud, o ddefnyddio geiriau y mae braidd gormod o ddefnydd arnynt. Mae angen dwyn gwybodaeth a chyngor ynghylch arbed ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy ac ati i'r brif ffrwd o ran y ffordd y codwn dai newydd a chynghori busnesau; mae angen iddo fod yn greiddiol i'r hyn y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud. Mae ein cynnig, ys dywedais, yn gosod camau ymarferol a allai ddechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Cynulliad cyfan gefnogi'r cynnig.

Glyn Davies: Ymddengys fod pawb yn

well in agreement in this Chamber on this issue, which is not surprising, because I think that all of us now accept that mitigating the impacts of climate change is one of the greatest issues that we face. I am sure that over the next few months, and probably the next few years, there will be very substantial debates about this in this Chamber, and not just a 45-minute minority party debate. We will undoubtedly have very significant debates about this.

I was very pleased to see in the Queen's Speech reference to the fact that there will be a climate change Bill at Westminster, which I greatly welcome. I hope that the Government here, the Minister, and, indeed, the First Minister, will enter into discussions as to what will be in that Bill. We should not just wait until a Bill is formed and then, as an Assembly, comment on it. I hope that we will be involved in the consultation process. Hopefully, there will be some sort of a document issued giving ideas about what the Bill might include. We can then go through a process of taking evidence and discussing it, by means of whatever the committee structure will be, and make a contribution to what goes in the Bill, rather than simply commenting on it.

One key issue is the targets that will be set in the Bill. That will not be straightforward in my view; I have seen an awful lot of comment about having a simple, annual target. We have to do a lot of work on deciding what the timescale is, and whether there should be an annual target, or one set over a slightly longer period. I am not clear as to exactly what the timescale might be. We will also have to be quite careful about having targets that apply equally across Britain. In some parts of Britain, it is easier to reach a particular target than in others, depending on what the employment base is. That is another issue. There is a whole range of factors that have to be carefully considered when preparing a climate change Bill that places obligations on different parts of the United Kingdom to meet targets.

weddol gytûn yn y Siambr hon ynghylch y mater hwn, ac nid yw hynny'n syndod, oherwydd credaf fod pawb sydd yma'n derbyn bellach bod lliniaru effaith y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn un o'r pethau mwyaf yr ydym yn ei wynebu. Yr wyf yn sicr dros y misoedd nesaf, a thros y blynyddoedd nesaf yn ôl pob tebyg, y bydd trafod mawr ynghylch hyn yn y Siambr hon, ac nid mewn dadl 45 munud gan y pleidiau lleiafrifol yn unig. Yn sicr cawn drafodaethau sylweddol iawn ynghylch hyn.

Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld cyfeiriad yn Araith y Frenhines at y ffaith y bydd Mesur ynghylch y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn San Steffan, yr hwn yr wyf yn ei groesawu'n fawr. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth hon, y Gweinidog, ac, yn wir, y Prif Weinidog, yn cynnal trafodaethau ynghylch yr hyn a ddylai fod yn y Mesur hwnnw. Ni ddylem aros nes bydd Mesur wedi ei lunio a chynnig sylwadau arno fel Cynulliad y pryd hynny. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori. Gobeithiaf y caiff rhyw fath o ddogfen ei chyhoeddi a fydd yn cynnig syniadau ynghylch yr hyn y gellid ei gynnwys yn y Mesur. Yna cawn fynd trwy broses o dderbyn tystiolaeth a'i thrafod, trwy'r strwythur pwyllgorau beth bynnag y bo, a chyfrannu at yr hyn a aiff i mewn i'r Mesur, yn hytrach na chynnig sylwadau yn ei gylch yn unig.

Bydd y targedau a gaiff eu gosod yn y Mesur yn fater allweddol. Ni fydd hynny'n beth syml yn fy marn innau; gwelais sylwadau dirif ynghylch gosod targed syml blynyddol. Bydd yn rhaid inni weithio'n galed i benderfynu ar yr amserlen, a ph'un ai a ddylid gosod targed blynyddol ai peidio, neu darged dros gyfnod amser ychydig yn hirach na hynny. Nid wyf yn sicr ynglŷn â'r union amserlen. Bydd yn rhaid inni fod yn weddol ofalus hefyd ynglŷn â gosod targedau sy'n gymwys yn gyfartal ar draws Prydain. Mewn rhannau o Brydain, mae'n haws cyrraedd targed neilltuol nag ydyw mewn rhannau eraill, gan ddibynnu beth yw'r sylfaen gyflogaeth. Mae hwnnw'n fater arall. Mae nifer helaeth o ffactorau y dylid eu hystyried yn ofalus wrth lunio Mesur ynghylch y newid yn yr hinsawdd sy'n gosod rhwymedigaethau ar wahanol rannau o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol er mwyn cyflawni targedau.

One proposal in the motion before us is the devolution of building regulations, which is an issue that we have discussed within the group. I am committed to the devolution of building regulations to Cardiff, because I think that it sits very well with planning. Having said that, there is also an ambition on our part, if we are to make a real difference, to ensure change right across the United Kingdom. It is also important in calling for devolution of this sort, of a whole service or sector, that we are very careful about its implications. I was pleased to see amendment 4 from Labour. It is obvious, from the comments that have been made, that the Labour amendment will be supported. It is a consideration that makes this motion acceptable to us, and we will be supporting it.

I wish to make one further point about tackling the climate change issue in Wales and how we improve buildings. We have talked quite a lot in this debate about housing and the way that it improves. I think that there is a role here for the Assembly Government, whoever forms the Government in future, in using the finance that it distributes—in all the ways that it does that, whether through grants to farms, schools, social centres or any other building—to require that some contribution be made to the overall target of tackling climate change and make certain that everything it supports outside its direct involvement meets the same sort of building standards that the Assembly Government does with its buildings.

We need to spread out from advertising the energy saving aspects of our buildings to bringing everything else in Wales into line. There is an awful lot of work to be done if we are to make a difference and if we are to set a standard in Wales that we wish to see spread to the rest of the world. That is what is important. Doing something just in Wales will play a relatively small—important, but small—part. The big ambition for us is to behave in a way in Wales that becomes an exemplar, first for the rest of the UK, and Europe, and eventually for the rest of the world.

Un elfen o'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron yw datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu, sy'n fater yr ydym wedi ei drafod yn y grŵp. Yr wyf wedi fy ymrwymo i ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i Gaerdydd, gan fy mod yn credu eu bod yn gydnaws iawn â chynllunio. Wedi dweud hynny, mae gennym uchelgais, os ydym am wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol, i sicrhau newid ar draws y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Mae'n bwysig hefyd wrth alw am ddatganoli o'r fath, sef gwasanaeth neu sector cyfan, ein bod yn ofalus iawn ynghylch ei oblygiadau. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld gwelliant 4 gan Lafur. Mae'n amlwg, yn ôl y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd, y caiff gwelliant Llafur ei gefnogi. Mae'n ystyriaeth sy'n peri bod y cynnig hwn yn dderbyniol gennym, a byddwn yn ei gefnogi.

Hoffwn wneud un pwynt yn rhagor ynghylch mynd i'r afael â mater y newid yn yr hinsawdd yng Nghymru a'r modd y byddwn yn gwella adeiladau. Bu llawer o sôn yn ystod y ddadl hon ynghylch tai a'r modd y cânt eu gwella. Credaf fod rôl yn hyn o beth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, pwy bynnag a fydd yn ffurfio'r Llywodraeth at y dyfodol, o ran defnyddio'r arian y mae'n ei ddsbarthu—ym mhob ffordd y bydd yn gwneud hynny, p'un ai a yw hynny ar ffurf grantiau i ffermydd, ysgolion, canolfannau cymdeithasol neu adeiladau eraill—i fynnu bod rhyw fath o gyfraniad yn cael ei wneud at y targed cyffredinol o fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd a sicrhau bod popeth y mae'n ei gefnogi y tu hwnt i'w ymwneud uniongyrchol yn cyflawni'r un mathau o safonau adeiladu ag y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud gyda'i adeiladau ei hun.

Mae angen inni symud ymlaen o hysbysebu'r agweddau ar ein hadeiladau sy'n arbed ynni at roi trefn ar bopeth arall yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lawer iawn o waith i'w wneud os ydym am wneud gwahaniaeth ac os ydym am osod safon yng Nghymru yr ydym am weld ei lledaenu i weddill y byd. Dyna'r hyn sy'n bwysig. Bydd gwneud rhywbeth yng Nghymru'n rhan gymharol fach—rhan bwysig ond rhan fach. Yr uchelgais fawr i ni yw ymddwyn yng Nghymru mewn modd a fydd yn esiampl, ar gyfer gweddill y Deyrnas Gyfunol i ddechrau, ac Ewrop, ac yn y pen draw i weddill y byd.

Janet Davies: We have already heard from one or two Members about the inadequate action on acting and prioritising to achieve better energy efficiency. I am going to speak about transport, industry and renewable energy. Integrated modern public transport systems are the first priority in reducing carbon dioxide emissions from transport. It is common sense to tackle the high levels of commuter car transport. Emissions from cars standing in traffic jams going nowhere are massive. However, punishment through the use of congestion charges must be preceded by persuasion in the form of comfortable and convenient public transport. It would be foolish to damage the economy and hurt individuals by implementing urban congestion charges where alternative modes of travel are not available.

Although we hear constantly about low-energy light bulbs and insulating homes, we should not ignore the energy use of industry and commerce, both for actual production and for heating and lighting their premises. Dow Corning from Barry recently gave a very impressive presentation to the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee. It has reduced its carbon footprint significantly and is working on further cuts. However, SMEs find it difficult to make the investment needed, even though they would then cut costs and become more competitive as well as helping the environment. Will the Assembly Government consider linking existing grants to such investments, and how else it can help? I know that the Carbon Trust gives advice to businesses, but financial help from Government might pay for itself.

I have been looking at the recent UK energy review, and I think that it is an exemplar: unfortunately, that is of complacent, centrist, macho thinking. It is dismissive of energy-efficiency measures. Wind energy generation is, of course, important, but issues are arising that are opening up new questions. I understand that the DTI is now reconsidering the flat-rate subsidy for renewable energy, which may well be over the odds for wind energy given the present state of the industry,

Janet Davies: Clywsom eisoes gan un neu ddau o'r Aelodau ynghylch y camau annigonol a gymerwyd parthed gweithredu a blaenoriaethu i sicrhau gwell effeithiolrwydd ynni. Yr wyf am siarad ynglŷn â chludiant, diwydiant ac ynni adnewyddadwy. Systemau cludiant cyhoeddus modern integredig yw'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf o ran lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid o gludiant. Mae'n synnwyr cyffredin mynd i'r afael â'r nifer mawr o geir a ddefnyddir gan gymudwyr. Daw gollyngiadau enfawr o geir sy'n sefyll mewn tagfeydd traffig heb fynd i unlle. Fodd bynnag, cyn cosbi neb trwy godi tâl atal tagfeydd mae'n rhaid perswadio pobl trwy ddarparu cludiant cyhoeddus cyffyrddus a chyfleus. Byddai'n ffolineb niweidio'r economi a brifo unigolion trwy weithredu taliadau atal tagfeydd trefol os nad oes dulliau eraill o deithio ar gael.

Er y clywn yn gyson am fylbau ynni isel ac insiwleiddio cartrefi, ni ddylem anwybyddu'r ynni y mae diwydiant a masnach yn ei ddefnyddio, ar gyfer y cynhyrchu ei hun ac ar gyfer gwres a golau yn eu hadeiladau. Yn ddiweddar rhoes Dow Corning o'r Barri gyflwyniad hynod dda i'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau. Mae wedi lleihau ei ôl troed carbon yn sylweddol ac mae'n gweithio ar ragor o doriadau. Fodd bynnag, mae mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yn ei chael yn anodd gwneud y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol, hyd yn oed petaent wedyn yn torri costau ac yn mynd yn fwy cystadleuol ynghyd â helpu'r amgylchedd. A wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried cysylltu'r grantiau presennol â buddsoddiadau o'r fath, a dulliau eraill o helpu? Gwn fod yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon yn rhoi cyngor i fusnesau, ond gallai help ariannol gan y Llywodraeth dalu amdano ei hun.

Bûm yn edrych ar adolygiad ynni diweddar y Deyrnas Gyfunol, a chredaf ei fod yn esiampl: yn anffodus felly, o feddylfryd hunanfodlon, canolgar, 'macho'. Mae'n wfftio dulliau arbed ynni. Mae cynhyrchu ynni o'r gwynt yn bwysig, wrth gwrs, ond mae materion yn codi sy'n agor cwestiynau newydd. Deallaf fod yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn ailystyried y sybsidi cyfradd wastad a roddir ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, sydd o bosib yn uwch nag y dylai fod ac

and which seems to be leading to a planned gross overdevelopment around our Heads of the Valleys communities. It is also looking at the issues of infrasonic sound. Also, I have not yet seen anything on the effects of excavating peat areas, which are natural carbon sinks. Excavating those areas releases a lot more carbon into the atmosphere.

In present action there is muddled thinking and a lack of sensible prioritisation to reduce our carbon footprint. Too often, Governments in Westminster and Cardiff fail to get value for money in this field, and fail to achieve the reduced greenhouse gas emissions that taxpayers' money is going towards.

Lorraine Barrett: I welcome the debate. This is an issue about which we are all obviously very concerned. The seriousness of climate change never escapes us. This has been the warmest November that I can remember, and it will possibly be the warmest December. The Welsh Assembly Government is playing a huge part in the work that is needed to achieve the goals that we all want to meet.

4.30 p.m.

It has been mentioned already that this building is testament to what can be done to reduce carbon emissions. In an ideal world, all new buildings—public and private—should meet this standard. I had the pleasure of opening some new houses—social housing and private housing—in Penarth last week. The builders there had gone a long way towards building energy-efficient houses, but they could probably have gone a step further with collecting water and the sorts of things that we do in the Senedd.

I agree with Helen Mary Jones that the issue, and the solution, is complex. We can all do our bit individually; we have all seen the advert which asks, 'What difference will it make if one of us switches a light off?'. If 20 million of us switch a light off, or switch off the television, it can make a difference, and as a country, we can also make a difference. However, the likes of China, India and

ystyried cyflwr y diwydiant ar hyn o bryd, ac sydd i'w weld yn arwain at gynlluniau mawr i orddatblygu o gwmpas cymunedau Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae hefyd yn edrych ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â sŵn is-sonig. Hefyd, ni welais ddim hyd yma ynghylch effeithiau cloddio ardaloedd mawn, sy'n sinciau carbon naturiol. O gloddio yn yr ardaloedd hynny caiff llawer mwy o garbon ei ryddhau i'r awyr.

Yn y camau sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd mae meddyliau dryslyd a diffyg blaenoriaethu synhwyrol i leihau ein hól troed carbon. Yn rhy aml, nid yw Llywodraethau San Steffan a Chaerdydd yn cael gwerth am arian yn y maes hwn, ac maent yn methu â sicrhau'r lleihad mewn gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr y mae arian y trethdalwyr yn mynd tuag ato.

Lorraine Barrett: Croesawaf y ddadl. Dyma fater y mae pawb yn amlwg yn pryderu yn ei gylch. Nid yw difrifoldeb y newid yn yr hinsawdd byth yn ein gadael. Hwn fu'r mis Tachwedd cynhesaf imi ei gofio, ac o bosib mai mis nesaf fydd y mis Rhagfyr cynhesaf. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n chwarae rhan fawr yn y gwaith sy'n angenrheidiol i gyflawni'r amcanion yr ydym oll am eu cyrraedd.

Dywedwyd eisoes bod yr adeilad hwn yn dyst i'r hyn y gellir ei wneud i leihau allyriadau carbon. Mewn byd delfrydol, dylai pob adeilad newydd—cyhoeddus a phreifat—gwrdd â'r safon hon. Cefais y pleser o agor tai newydd—tai cymdeithasol a thai preifat—ym Mhenarth yr wythnos diwethaf. Aethai'r adeiladwyr gryn ffordd at godi tai ynni-effeithiol, ond mae'n siŵr y gallasent fod wedi mynd gam ymhellach gyda chasglu dŵr a'r math o bethau yr ydym ni yn eu gwneud yn y Senedd.

Cytunaf gyda Helen Mary Jones fod y pwnc, a'r ateb, yn gymhleth. Gallwn oll chwarae ein rhan fechan ein hun; yr ydym oll wedi gweld yr hysbyseb sy'n gofyn, 'Pa wahaniaeth wnaiff hi os bydd un ohonom yn diffodd golau?'. Os bydd 20 miliwn ohonom yn diffodd golau, neu'n diffodd y teledu, fe all wneud gwahaniaeth, ac fel gwlad, gallwn ninnau wneud gwahaniaeth. Fodd bynnag, y

America obviously have a huge part to play, and I do not believe that we could influence them much this afternoon.

mae gan wledydd fel China, India ac America yn amlwg ran enfawr i'w chwarae ac ni chredaf y bydd modd i ni ddylanwadu llawer arnynt y prynhawn hwn.

I was interested to hear Janet Davies mentioning traffic. I have raised this issue in the past with the Minister with responsibility for transport. Looking at the need to reduce emissions from the traffic on our roads, we have nearby one of the most beautiful bays in Wales—the harbour in Cardiff bay—so I put on record again my support for expanding the opportunities that water taxis could provide. You could get on a water bus from Penarth over to the bay, or up to the Millennium Stadium, and go to do your shopping. I have been involved in that, and will continue to be involved in it. Considering the numbers who leave Penarth in the morning, come down Windsor Road, and clog up poor Cogan, if many of us got the boat in the morning, it would be much healthier in the town centre and in Cogan, where the fumes are incredible at present. These are all little things, but they all add up to the big picture.

Diddorol oedd clywed Janet Davies yn crybwyll traffig. Codais y mater hwn yn y gorffennol gyda'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am drafnidiaeth. O edrych ar yr angen i leihau allyriadau o'r traffig ar ein ffyrdd, mae gennym gerllaw fae sydd ymhlith yr hyfrytaf yng Nghymru—harbwr bae Caerdydd—felly cofnodaf unwaith eto fy nghefnogaeth dros ehangu'r cyfleoedd y gallai tacsis dŵr eu rhoi. Gallasech gael bws dŵr o Benarth drosodd i'r bae, neu i fyny at Stadiwm y Mileniwm a mynd i wneud eich siopa. Bum yn rhan o hynny, a byddaf yn parhau i ymwneud ag ef. O ystyried y niferoedd sydd yn gadael Penarth yn y bore, yn dod i lawr Heol Windsor ac yn tagu Cogan druan, petai mwy ohonom yn cymryd cwch yn y bore, byddai'n iachach o lawer yng nghanol y dref ac yn Cogan, lle mae'r nwyon yn anhygoel ar hyn o bryd. Pethau bychain yw'r rhain oll, ond y maent yn rhan o'r darlun ehangach.

The motion mentions getting public information out to people. Alun Michael and I have been holding energy advice surgeries around the constituency, which are very successful. The EAGA partnership comes along, as do Care and Repair and Energywatch. Free light bulbs are given out, and people are grateful for the information that they receive. Everyone goes away with some advice from these surgeries, whether it is to do with benefits or grants, or just a light bulb. In some small way, we are also doing our bit.

Mae'r cynnig yn crybwyll cyfleu gwybodaeth gyhoeddus i bobl. Bu Alun Michael a minnau yn cynnal cymorthfeydd cyngor ar ynni o gwmpas yr etholaeth, sydd yn llwyddiannus iawn. Bydd partneriaeth EAGA yn dod draw; felly hefyd Gofal a Thrwsio a Golwg ar Ynni. Bydd bylbiau golau yn cael eu rhoi am ddim ac y mae pobl yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth y byddant yn ei dderbyn. Bydd pawb yn gadael y cymorthfeydd hyn gyda rhyw gyngor, boed ar fater budd-daliadau neu grantiau, neu ddim ond bylbiau golau. Mewn ffordd fechan, yr ydym ninnau hefyd yn chwarae ein rhan.

Therefore, I welcome the debate, and I look forward to listening to the Minister's response.

Yr wyf felly yn croesawu'r ddadl ac yn edrych ymlaen at glywed ymateb y Gweinidog.

Elin Jones: Yn ddiweddar, bûm yn gwrandao ar Jonathan Porritt yn traddodi darlith goffa Phil Williams. Dywedodd sawl peth diddorol yn ystod y ddarlith, gan gynnwys mai ei ddau arwr yw Cynog Dafis ac Arnold Schwarzenegger, sy'n gyfuniad diddorol. Fe'i gwnaeth yn glir hefyd ei fod yn gweld yr

Elin Jones: I recently heard Jonathan Porritt give the Phil Williams memorial lecture. He said many interesting things during that lecture, and among them was the fact that his two heroes are Cynog Dafis and Arnold Schwarzenegger, which is an interesting combination. He also made it clear that he

angen i reoliadau adeiladu gael eu defnyddio gan Lywodraeth mewn ffordd llawer mwy rhagweithiol nag ar hyn o bryd, er mwyn gosod targedau ac amserlen bendant ar gyfer adeiladau di-garbon. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth cwbl ymarferol y gall Llywodraeth ei wneud, a byddai effaith gwneud hyn yn gyflym a pharhaol.

Nid oedd Jonathan Porritt yn ymwybodol nad oedd rheoliadau adeiladu wedi cael eu datganoli i ni yng Nghymru, a bod Carwyn Jones, yn y ddadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ym mis Mehefin, wedi dweud nad oedd bwriad datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad. Pleidleisiodd y Blaid Lafur yn erbyn gwelliant Plaid Cymru ar reoliadau adeiladu y diwrnod hwnnw, ac ymataliodd y Blaid Geidwadol ei phleidlais. Bydd yn gam mawr ymlaen heddiw os y caiff Plaid Cymru gefnogaeth yr holl bleidiau i'r egwyddor o ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad, oherwydd gallwn gael effaith sylweddol ar hynny.

Mae cynnig Plaid Cymru hefyd yn cyfeirio at yr angen i wella'r cyngor sydd ar gael ar gyfer defnyddwyr ar effeithlonrwydd ynni ac ar ynni adnewyddadwy, sydd yn feysydd newydd i gymaint ohonom. Ein tristwch ni yng Ngheredigion, ac ym Mhowys a Meirionnydd, yw bod yr asiantaeth a oedd yn darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn tan yn ddiweddar, sef Asiantaeth Ynni Canolbarth Cymru, wedi dod â'i gweithgaredd i ben oherwydd diffygion a phroblemau ariannol. Y sialens yn awr, i unrhyw Lywodraeth—y Llywodraeth bresennol neu'r Llywodraeth nesaf—yw sefydlu system o wasanaeth ar hyd a lled Cymru sy'n darparu'r cyngor hanfodol hwnnw, er mwyn inni weld ein cartrefi a'n busnesau yn buddsoddi yn ddoeth mewn ynni adnewyddadwy a dulliau o ddefnyddio ynni yn effeithiol.

Y Llywydd: Diolch am fod yn gryno.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ambell waith yn y Cynulliad ceir anghytundeb, ond ambell waith ceir ysbryd hollol wahanol i lywio ein dadleuon. Mae'n hollol weddus i mi longyfarch Plaid Cymru ar ddewis y ddadl hon heddiw ac ar y ffordd y mae wedi gosod hon heddiw ac ar y ffordd y mae wedi gosod y prif bwyntiau. Yr wyf eisiau ateb yn yr un

sees the need for building regulations to be used much more proactively by Government than is currently the case, so that a definite timetable and targets are set for carbon-free buildings. This is practical action that Government can take; its impact would be quick and permanent.

Jonathan Porritt was not aware that building regulations had not been devolved to Wales, and that Carwyn Jones, in the debate on sustainable development in June, had said that there was no intention of devolving building regulations to the Assembly. The Labour Party voted against Plaid Cymru's building regulations amendment on that day, and the Conservative Party abstained. It will be a big step forward today if Plaid Cymru secures the support of all parties for the principle of devolving building regulations to the Assembly, as we can have a significant impact on that.

Plaid Cymru's motion also refers to the need to improve the advice that is available for users on energy efficiency and renewable energy, which are new areas for so many of us. Sadly, for us in Ceredigion, and in Powys and Meirionnydd, the agency that provided that service until recently, the Mid Wales Energy Agency, has wound up its activities because of financial problems and deficiencies. The challenge now, for any Government—the current Government or the next Government—is to establish a service system across Wales to provide that crucial advice, so that our homes and businesses invest wisely in renewable energy and in ways of using energy effectively.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for being succinct.

The First Minister: On occasion in the Assembly you will see disagreement, but on occasion there is an entirely different spirit guiding our debates. It is appropriate for me to congratulate Plaid Cymru on its choice of debate this afternoon and for the way in which it has put forth its main points. I would

ysbryd adeiladol, gan ddweud ein bod yn cytuno gyda'r ddadl hon a'r prif bwyntiau. Nid bwriad y gwelliant yr ydym wedi'i gyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad yw pwyllor ar y pwnc; ei fwriad yw ystyried sut yn union y byddwn yn delio â'r holl gwestiynau cymhleth hyn.

Our amendment today is entirely constructive in saying that it is absolutely essential that cost-benefit analyses are undertaken of the implications of each of the actions recommended here, just in case they counter-intuitively damage the very people or sectors of the economy, housing or public services that we are trying to assist. It changes your perspective to have a hatful of grandchildren—all of whom I expect to be alive in three-quarters of a century, when I will not be—when you hear about the long-term perspectives and the massive damage that climate change could do to our planet if carbon dioxide emissions and other greenhouse gas emissions are not controlled, initially, and then reduced. A difficult equity question arises with China, India and other developing countries, which are determined to eradicate poverty in their own countries and therefore need room to create more emissions. That means that the developed world, which already has high standards of living, needs to emit less carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases.

We need to be enormously careful, which is why we are talking about the need for a careful cost-benefit analysis of each of the measures being proposed here. It is a sensitive time for the steel industry, for instance, with the potential Brazilian or possibly Indian takeover of Corus; we need to be sure that what we do does not damage the likelihood of the steel industry in Wales surviving the takeover or that it will not accelerate problems caused by the carbon dioxide emissions regime.

Likewise, we want to see the home energy efficiency scheme—which has been extraordinarily successful in bringing about a major reduction in fuel poverty—possibly being tweaked, but certainly used further in order to reduce the wasting of energy from houses through the lack of draught-proofing or proper heat insulation, preventing heat loss

like to respond in the same constructive spirit, and say that we agree with this debate and its main points. The amendment that we have tabled before the Assembly is not there to slow this issue down; its intention is to consider exactly how we are going to handle all of these complex questions.

Mae ein gwelliant heddiw yn gyfan gwbl adeiladol trwy ddweud ei bod yn hollol hanfodol i ddadansoddiadau cost a budd gael eu cynnal ar oblygiadau pob un o'r camau a argymhellir yma, dim ond rhag ofn iddynt yn groes i'r graen beri niwed i'r union bobl neu sectorau o'r economi, tai neu wasanaethau cyhoeddus yr ydym yn ceisio'u helpu. Y mae'n newid eich golwg ar bethau i gael nythaid o wyrion ac wyresau—a minnau'n disgwyl iddynt oll fod yn fyw ymhen trichwarter canrif, pan na fyddaf i—pan glywch am y rhagolygu tymor-hir a'r niwed enfawr y gallai newid yn yr hinsawdd wneud i'n planed os na reolwn allyriadau carbon deuocsid ac allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr eraill, ac yna'u lleihau. Cyfyd cwestiwn anodd ynghylch cyfartaledd gyda China, India a gwledydd eraill sy'n datblygu, sydd yn benderfynol o ddileu tlodi yn eu gwledydd eu hunain ac sydd felly ag angen lle i greu mwy o allyriadau. Golyga hyn fod yn rhaid i'r byd datblygedig, sydd eisoes â safonau byw uchel, allyrru llai o garbon deuocsid a nwyon tŷ gwydr eraill.

Rhaid i ni fod yn ofalus dros ben, a dyna pam ein bod yn sôn bod angen dadansoddiad cost a budd gofalus o bob un o'r camau a gynnigir yma. Mae'n gyfnod sensitif i'r diwydiant dur, er enghraifft, gyda Corus yn debyg o gael ei brynu gan Frasil, neu India o bosibl; rhaid i ni fod yn sicr nad yw yr hyn a wnawn yn ei gwneud yn llai tebygol y bydd y diwydiant dur yng Nghymru yn goroesi'r trosfeddiannu neu na fydd yn gwaethygu problemau a achosir gan y drefn o allyriadau carbon deuocsid.

Yn yr un modd, yr ydym eisiau gweld y cynllun effeithiolrwydd ynni yn y cartref—a fu'n llwyddiannus dros ben yn gostwng tlodi tanwydd yn sylweddol—o bosibl yn cael ei fireinio, ond yn sicr yn cael ei ddefnyddio ymhellach er mwyn gwastraffu llai o ynni trwy ddiffyg atal drafftiau neu insiwleiddio gwres yn iawn, atal gwres rhag cael ei golli

through roofs and walls or through other means.

Turning to the issue of the devolution of building regulations, that is a classic example of the need for a careful approach and cost-benefit analysis. In principle, we support it; we would like to have the ability to move forward on our own set of building regulations. However, you must ask whether the additional bureaucracy that would be involved in having our own regime would exceed any gains—for instance, you would ask, ‘What would you do with different building regulations in Wales?’, and in response you would say, ‘Well, in England, they will be continuing with 8 inches of roof insulation, so we want to go for 10 inches or 12 inches’. There would be some energy saving from doing that, but would it be worth the additional bureaucracy of having to run two different regimes that housebuilders and others would have to get used to? That may, or may not, be worth it, but we are saying that you must be careful with that type of easy answer.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to you for giving way. I understand the point that you are making, but, for example, we have a different planning system in Wales, increasingly, one that is stricter about development on flood plains than the planning system in England. If we follow through the logic of what you said about building regulations, might that not be an argument against devolution altogether? I know that that was not your intention, and I fully take on board what you said about needing to measure the benefits, but I think that most of us, certainly on this side of the Chamber, would feel strongly that those benefits would probably outweigh any possible problems.

4.40 p.m.

The First Minister: That would then emerge, in that way, from the cost-benefit analysis. That is the answer. Building regulations and planning are totally separate dispensations: one of which relates to house design and standards, such as how much roof insulation you have, and what other means you have. They are regulatory functions and

trwy doeau a waliau neu trwy ddulliau eraill.

I droi at fater datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu, dyma enghraifft glasurol o'r angen am agwedd ofalus a dadansoddiad cost a budd. Mewn egwyddor, yr ydym yn ei gefnogi, a charem gael y gallu i fwrw ymlaen gyda'n set ni ein hunain o reoliadau adeiladu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i chi ofyn a fyddai'r fiwrocratiaeth ychwanegol a ddeuai yn sgil cael ein trefn ein hunain yn fwy nac unrhyw fantais—er enghraifft, byddech yn gofyn, ‘Beth wnewch chi gyda rheoliadau adeiladu gwahanol yng Nghymru?’, a chithau yn ateb, ‘Wel, yn Lloegr byddant yn parhau gydag 8 modfedd o insiwleiddio tai, felly yr ydym ni am fynd am 10 modfedd neu 12 modfedd’. Byddai gwneud hynny yn arbed peth ynni, ond a fyddai'n werth biwrocratiaeth ychwanegol gorfod rhedeg dwy drefn wahanol i adeiladwyr tai ac eraill orfod dygymod â hwy? Gallai fod o werth neu beidio, ond yr hyn a ddywedwn ni yw y dylech fod yn ofalus gyda'r math hwnnw o ateb rhwydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am ildio. Deallaf y pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud, ond, er enghraifft, mae gennym, fwyfwy, system gynllunio wahanol yng Nghymru, un sydd yn llymach ynghylch datblygu ar orlifdiroedd na'r system gynllunio yn Lloegr. Petaem yn dilyn rhesymeg yr hyn a ddywedsoch am reoliadau adeiladu i'r pen, oni allai hynny fod yn ddadl yn erbyn datganoli o gwbl? Gwn nad dyna oedd eich bwriad, a derbyniaf yn llwyr yr hyn a ddywedsoch am orfod mesur y manteision, ond credaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom, yn sicr ar yr ochr hon y Siambr, yn credu'n gryf y byddai'r manteision hynny fwy na thebyg yn gwrthbwyso unrhyw broblemau posibl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai hynny yn deillio felly o'r dadansoddiad cost a budd. Dyna'r ateb. Mae rheoliadau adeiladu a chynllunio yn oddefebau hollol wahanol: mae a wnelo un â dylunio a safonau tai, megis faint o insiwleiddio sydd gennych yn y to, a pha ddulliau eraill sydd gennych. Swyddogaethau rheoleiddio ydynt ac ymdrinnir â hwy yn

are dealt with differently in local authorities, by different departments, so, I would not follow that parallel too closely.

We intend to work closely with the Government on how we deal with the Climate Change Bill that is going to be produced, because we want a low-carbon future for Wales, for all the reasons that I have said, such as wanting to see our children and grandchildren being able to inherit a planet that has not been destabilised by our actions or inactions. On the other hand, we need to look at the difficult issues in relation to nuclear energy that are bound to arise.

You can easily achieve a low-carbon-emitting future for the UK by having many more nuclear power stations than we have now and by replacing all the nuclear stations that are about to come to the end of their natural lives. That may, or may not, be right for Wales and we would need to work closely with the Government on that. If you replace nuclear power stations with new ones, or even establish nuclear power stations where there have never been such stations before, what effect will that have on the prospects of other forms of energy generation? They may include renewables and arguable renewables, such as the wood energy scheme that we must be sure is not only renewable, but sustainable-renewable, such as the Prenergy Power scheme that has been suggested for Port Talbot and possibly elsewhere. Likewise with gas-fired power stations, that are efficient in their own way. The GE Energy Baglan Bay power station is supposed to be the most efficient gas-fired power station in the world, but it does emit some carbon dioxide. Relatively, it creates less carbon dioxide than any other power station that produces 350 MW of energy, but it does produce some carbon dioxide.

If we had too-tight annual targets, the only way in which you could achieve a low-carbon future for Wales would be by going for an all-nuclear future or a nuclear-and-renewable future. We all know the problems that that would cause if it is not flexible enough to cope with the other schemes that may come in, which can make a big difference in a small economy like that seen

wahanol mewn awdurdodau lleol gan wahanol adrannau, felly ni fyddwn yn dilyn y gymhariaeth honno yn rhy glos.

Bwriadwn weithio'n agos gyda'r Llywodraeth ar sut yr awn i'r afael â'r Mesur Newid Hinsawdd a gynhyrchir, am ein bod eisiau dyfodol carbon-isel i Gymru, am yr holl resymau a grybwyllais, megis bod eisiau gweld ein plant a phlant ein plant yn gallu etifeddu planed nas ansefydlogwyd gan ein gweithredoedd neu'n diffyg gweithredoedd. Ar y llaw arall, rhaid i ni edrych ar y pynciau anodd mewn perthynas ag ynni niwclear sydd yn rhwym o godi.

Gallwch yn hawdd gael dyfodol gydag allyriadau carbon isel iawn i'r DU trwy gael llawer mwy o bwerdai niwclear nag sydd gennym yn awr a thrwy godi gorsafoedd niwclear newydd yn lle'r holl rai sy'n dod i derfyn eu hoes naturiol. Gall hynny fod yn iawn neu beidio i Gymru, a byddai'n rhaid i ni weithio'n agos gyda'r Llywodraeth ar hynny. Os codwch orsafoedd niwclear yn lle'r hen rai, neu hyd yn oed os codwch bwerdai niwclear newydd lle na fu rhai o'r blaen, pa effaith a gaiff hynny ar ragolygon ffurfiau eraill o gynhyrchu ynni? Gallant gynnwys ynni adnewyddadwy ac ynni a allai fod yn adnewyddadwy, megis y cynllun ynni coed y mae'n rhaid i ni fod yn sicr nid yn unig ei fod yn adnewyddadwy, ond yn gynaliadwy-adnewyddadwy, megis cynllun Prenergy Power a awgrymwyd ar gyfer Port Talbot a manau eraill o bosibl. Felly hefyd gyda phwerdai nwy, sydd yn effeithlon yn eu ffordd eu hunain. Dywedir mai pwerdy GE Energy ym Mae Baglan yw'r pwerdy nwy mwyaf effeithlon yn y byd, ond mae'n allyrru rhywfaint o garbon deuocsid. O safbwynt cymharol, mae'n creu llai o garbon deuocsid nac unrhyw bwerdy arall sydd yn cynhyrchu 350 MW o ynni, ond mae'n cynhyrchu rhywfaint o garbon deuocsid.

Petai gennym dargedau blynyddol a fyddai'n rhy dynn, yr unig ffordd y gallasech gael dyfodol carbon-isel i Gymru fyddai trwy fynd am ddyfodol niwclear-llwyr neu ddyfodol niwclear-ac-adnewyddadwy. Gwyddom oll y problemau y byddai hynny'n eu hachosi pe na bai'n ddigon hyblyg i ymdopi â'r cynlluniau eraill a allai ymddangos, a all wneud gwahaniaeth mawr mewn economi

in Wales. We would say that you have to be careful about how you approach all this. You will hamper the development of the economy and the development of the science policy unless you are very careful and say, 'We do not mind about that; let us go nuclear'. I am not sure that that is actually what we are trying to achieve. I do not think that that is what Plaid Cymru wants and I do not think that that is what others want; they want cases to be dealt with on their merits. That is why we are saying, 'Be careful', and let us make sure that all of those factors—the future of the steel and energy industries, and of the HEES scheme—get due consideration when we look at how we are to ensure that energy efficiency is at the top of the tree when it comes to how we approach the future of Wales.

That is why we are pleased that we have made a low-carbon future one of the three key topics in our science policy. Likewise, in industrial development, we are keen to encourage developments such as the new, £60 million G24i plant in Wentloog, producing new solar photovoltaic technology. I was also pleased to be at the Sharp Electronics (UK) Ltd plant in Wrexham recently, which is expanding rapidly, as the No. 1 producer in Europe of solar photovoltaic panels. There are all manner of ways in which you can promote a low-energy, low-carbon future. We also want our higher education system to be able to promote a low-carbon institute as a collaborative project for the future.

In the spirit of constructiveness, I hope that other parties will support our amendment this afternoon, in the same way that we are recommending support for the Plaid Cymru motion.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Ategaf eiriau'r Prif Weinidog drwy ddweud, er ein bod o bryd i'w gilydd yn cael dadleuon sy'n dangos gwahaniaethau eithaf sylfaenol rhyngom ar faterion polisi, mae heddiw yn ddiwrnod da i'r Cynulliad gan ein bod wedi gallu uno ar un o'r pynciau mawr sy'n wynebu'r ddynoliaeth—fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred—yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n dda nad ydym yn rhanedig ar y mater hwn

fechan fel economi Cymru. Yr hyn a ddywedwn i yw bod rhaid i chi fod yn ofalus iawn sut y deuwch at hyn. Byddwch yn rhwystro datblygu'r polisi gwyddoniaeth oni fyddwch yn ofalus iawn a dweud, 'Nid oes ots gennym am hynny; gadewch i ni fynd yn niwclear'. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai at hynny yr ydym yn mynd, mewn gwirionedd. Nid wyf yn meddwl mai dyna'r hyn y mae Plaid Cymru yn awyddus i'w weld, na'r lleill ychwaith; maent eisiau i achosion gael eu trin yn ôl eu teilyngdod. Dyna pam ein bod yn dweud, 'Byddwch yn ofalus', a gadewch i ni wneud yn siŵr fod yr holl ffactorau hynny—dyfodol y diwydiannau dur ac ynni, a'r cynllun CEEC—yn cael ystyriaeth briodol pan fyddwn yn edrych ar sut i ofalu bod effeithlonrwydd ynni ar flaen y gad pan ddaw yn fater o'n hagwedd at ddyfodol Cymru.

Dyna pam ein bod yn falch i ni wneud dyfodol carbon-isel yn un o dri phwnc allweddol ein polisi gwyddoniaeth. Yn yr un modd, gyda datblygu diwydiannol, yr ydym yn awyddus i annog datblygiadau megis y gwaith G24i £60 miliwn newydd yng Ngwynllwg, sydd yn cynhyrchu technoleg ffotofoltaidd newydd o'r haul. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o fod yng ngwaith Sharp Electronics (DU) Cyf yn Wrecsam yn ddiweddar, sydd yn ehangu yn gyflym, fel prif gynhyrchydd paneli haul ffotofoltaidd Ewrop. Mae pob math o ffyrdd i chi hybu dyfodol ynni-isel, carbon-isel. Yr ydym hefyd eisiau i'n system addysg uwch allu hybu sefydliad carbon-isel fel prosiect cydweithredol ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mewn ysbryd adeiladol, gobeithio y bydd y pleidiau eraill yn cefnogi ein gwelliant y prynhawn hwn, yn yr un modd ag yr ydym ni yn argymhell cefnogi cynnig Plaid Cymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I thank everybody who has participated in this debate. I endorse the words of the First Minister by saying that, although we sometimes have debates that demonstrate quite fundamental differences on policy matters, today is a good day for the Assembly, because we are united on one of the major subjects facing humanity—as Alun Ffred said—over the coming years. It is good that we are not split on this matter, of course.

wrth gwrs.

Os cofiaf yn iawn, dywedodd Carwyn Jones, ym mis Mehefin, nad oedd y Llywodraeth, bryd hynny, yn gweld yr achos o blaid trosglwyddo pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladu; yr ydym yn falch ein bod o leiaf yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn, oherwydd i'r Prif Weinidog ddweud y bydd yn edrych ar y dadansoddiad cost a budd, ac os yw'n rhywbeth y dylem ei gael, yna bydd y Llywodraeth yn fodlon ei gefnogi. Croesawaf ysbryd cyfraniad y Prif Weinidog heddiw. Deuaf yn ôl at y rheoliadau adeiladau yn y man.

Wrth agor y drafodaeth, cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred at gyd-destun arbennig y ddadl yn sgîl adroddiad Stern, a dywedodd y byddai gwneud dim byd yn golygu pris uchel i ddynoliaeth. Yr ydym felly, yn y cynnig hwn, yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud, ac yr ydym yn dechrau wrth ein traed. Soniodd yn arbennig am y nifer o gartrefi yng Nghymru nad ydynt ar hyn o bryd yn effeithiol o safbwynt arbed ynni, a bod rhaid inni wneud llawer o waith i sicrhau eu bod yn gwella. Cyfeiriodd at y ffaith ei bod yn bwysig trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros reoliadau adeiladu i Gymru, gan mai dyna'r unig ffordd o sicrhau bod adeiladau newydd yn cydymffurfio â rheoliadau pwysig o ran arbedion.

Mick Bates referred in particular to the issue of energy efficiency in school buildings and the need for us all to change our behaviour. He also referred, as many others did, to the Climate Change Bill and to statutorily binding targets.

Cyfeiriodd ef ac eraill at y ffaith y gallwn wneud dau beth: edrych ar arbedion ynni mewn tai a helpu pobl sydd mewn tlodi ynni. Hynny yw, gallwn leihau costau i bobl a lleihau eu defnydd o ynni. Golyga hynny y gallwn wneud dau beth ar unwaith.

Soniodd Brynle Williams am yr angen i ystyried y cynllun peilot a'r mesuryddion call. Gwnaeth araith feddylgar, gan gyfeirio at sut y gallwch sicrhau arbedion ynni—fel y soniodd Mick Bates ac eraill—a helpu pobl i leihau costau ynni. Gwnaeth bwytiau

If I remember correctly, Carwyn Jones said in June that the Government, at that time, did not see the case for devolving powers over building regulations; we are pleased that we are at least moving in the right direction, with the First Minister saying that he will look at a cost benefit analysis, and, if it is something that we should have, that the Government will be willing to support it. I welcome the spirit in which the First Minister made his contribution today. I will return to the regulations shortly.

In his opening remarks, Alun Ffred referred to the particular context of the debate in light of the Stern report, and said that doing nothing would lead to a high price for humanity. In this motion, therefore, we concentrate on what we can do, and we are starting at our feet. He mentioned the number of homes in Wales that are not currently energy efficient, and said that we must work to ensure that they improve. He referred to the fact that it is important for us to transfer responsibility for building regulations to Wales, as that is the only way in which we can ensure that new buildings conform to important regulations on savings.

Cyfeiriodd Mick Bates yn arbennig at gwstiwn effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn adeiladau ysgolion a'r angen i bawb ohonom newid ein hymddygiad. Cyfeiriodd hefyd, fel y gwnaeth sawl un arall, at y Mesur Newid Hinsawdd ac at dargedau sy'n rhwymo'n statudol.

He, and others, referred to the fact that we can do two things: we can look at energy saving in houses and help people who are in fuel poverty. That is, we can reduce costs for people and reduce their use of energy. That means that we can do two things simultaneously.

Brynle Williams mentioned the need to consider the pilot scheme and smart meters. He made a thoughtful speech, referring to how you can save energy—as did Mick Bates and others—and help people to reduce energy costs. He made some interesting points.

diddorol yn ei araith.

Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary Jones at y ffaith bod newid hinsawdd yn her inni, a chynigiodd bethau y gallwn eu gwneud ar unwaith—gan aralleirio'r hyn a ddywedodd Helen, deuparth gwaith yw ei ddechrau. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn cael cyngor da ynglŷn â phrosiectau lleol. Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary at gynllun yng Nghaerfyrddin, a chyfeiriodd Elin at y ffaith bod yr arian i'r corff yn y canolbarth wedi dod i ben a'i fod felly yn methu â chynnig y gwasanaeth. Gwnaeth Elin y pwynt ei bod yn bwysig inni gael cynlluniau ledled Cymru sy'n rhoi help i bobl.

Soniodd Janet Davies am drafnidiaeth ceir a'r angen i'w lleihau, a'r ffaith bod angen trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn ei lle. Mae Janet wedi ein hatgoffa o bwysigrwydd hynny, a chyfeiriodd hefyd at yr angen i fusnesau gymryd eu cyfrifoldeb o ddifrif. Cyfeiriodd at ddiffyg blaenoriaethu gwaith sydd ar y gweill gan y Llywodraeth yn Llundain.

Lorraine Barrett made an interesting point about new buildings and this building. Lorraine, one of the reasons why we want building regulations devolved to the Assembly is because we can then, with any new building, ensure that certain targets are met. Linking that to the First Minister's comments, I think that he was asking what we would do differently, administratively. One thing that we could do differently is to ensure that all new buildings comply with the stringent targets that we want in Wales. The First Minister almost made the case for that, but he did not actually come down on the side of ensuring that we have these as soon as possible. However, he has moved the Government's significantly from its position in June, and that is to be welcomed.

4.50 p.m.

Referring briefly to Glyn's point that the Conservative Party has moved a little on its position, all parties are now agreed that, subject to a proper cost-benefit analysis, building regulation approval should be devolved to the Assembly. This is a significant day for the National Assembly

Helen Mary Jones said that climate change poses a challenge for us, and she proposed some things that we can do immediately—paraphrasing what Helen said, the sooner the better that we start on this. It is important that we get sound advice for people on local projects. Helen Mary referred to one scheme in Carmarthen, and Elin referred to the fact that the organisation in mid Wales had run out of funds and, therefore, could not offer that service. Elin made the point that it is important to have schemes to assist people across Wales.

Janet Davies mentioned car transport and the need to reduce traffic, and that better public transport was needed. Janet reminded us of the importance of that, and also referred to the fact that businesses need to take their responsibilities seriously. She made reference to the lack of prioritisation of work by the London Government.

Gwnaeth Lorraine Barrett bwynt diddorol am adeiladau newydd a'r adeilad hwn. Lorraine, un o'r rhesymau pam y mae arnom eisiau cael datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad yw oherwydd y gallwn wedyn, gydag unrhyw adeilad newydd, sicrhau y cyrhaeddir targedau penodol. A chysylltu hynny â sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog, yr wyf yn meddwl mai gofyn yr oedd ef beth y byddem yn ei wneud yn wahanol, o safbwynt gweinyddiaeth. Un peth y gallem ei wneud yn wahanol yw sicrhau bod pob adeilad newydd yn cydymffurfio â'r targedau caeth y mae arnom eu heisiau yng Nghymru. Bu bron i'r Prif Weinidog ddadlau'r achos dros hynny, ond ni chyhoeddodd yn bendant o blaid sicrhau y cawn y rhain cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Fodd bynnag, y mae wedi symud y Llywodraeth yn sylweddol o'i safle ym Mehefin, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu.

A chyfeirio'n fyr at bwynt Glyn fod y Blaid Geidwadol wedi symud ychydig ar ei safle, mae'r pleidiau i gyd bellach yn gytûn y dylid, yn amodol ar ddadansoddiad manteision cost priodol, ddatganoli proses cymeradwyo rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod arwyddocaol i'r

and for all parties here.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac i bob plaid yma.

I welcome the point that the First Minister made when he congratulated Plaid Cymru for introducing the topic. I thank him for the positive comments that he made, and let us ensure that this type of motion, as amended, will receive the unanimous backing of all Assembly parties.

Croesawaf y pwynt a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog pan longyfarchodd Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r pwnc. Diolchaf iddo am y sylwadau cadarnhaol a wnaeth, a boed inni sicrhau y caiff y math hwn o gynnig, fel y'i diwygiwyd, gefnogaeth unfrydol holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 2: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
 Amendment 3: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion (NDM3357): as amended

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. recognises the seriousness of climate change and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve the standard of energy efficiency by:

a) seeking the power to devolve building regulations to the Assembly thus allowing the Assembly Government to set a timetable to work towards zero carbon new build;

b) improving the level of advice on energy efficiency, renewable energy and transport available to consumers and community groups;

c) conducting a high-profile public information campaign to inform consumers of the need and benefits of becoming more energy efficient;

d) making carbon reduction in the community a strategic goal for local authorities, including linking reduction targets with financial incentives;

e) developing and publishing energy efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales;

f) recognising the potential for smart meters to increase energy efficiency, and working with energy suppliers to introduce a Welsh pilot study; and

2. acknowledges that a full-cost appraisal exercise must be carried out on each of the suggested improvements before they are implemented.

Cynnig (NDM3357): fel y'i diwygiwyd

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn cydnabod difrifoldeb newid yn yr hinsawdd ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella safon effeithlonrwydd ynni drwy:

a) geisio'r pŵer i ddatganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i'r Cynulliad a thrwy hynny ganiatáu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drefnu amserlen ar gyfer gweithio tuag at adeiladau newydd di-garbon;

b) wella lefel y cyngor ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, ynni adnewyddadwy a thrafnidiaeth sydd ar gael i ddefnyddwyr a grwpiau cymunedol;

c) gynnal ymgyrch wybodaeth uchel ei phroffil i roi gwybodaeth i ddefnyddwyr am yr angen i ddefnyddio ynni'n effeithlon a manteision hynny;

ch) wneud lleihau carbon yn y gymuned yn nod strategol i awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys cysylltu'r targedau ar gyfer lleihau â chymhellion ariannol;

d) ddatblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru;

dd) gydnabod y potensial ar gyfer cael mesuryddion call i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni, a gweithio gyda darparwyr ynni i gyflwyno astudiaeth beilot yng Nghymru; a

2. yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid cynnal gwerthusiad llawn o gost pob un o'r gwelliannau a awgrymir cyn iddynt gael eu rhoi ar waith.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amended motion: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.53 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.53 p.m.*

Seithfed Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynulliad ar Gydraddoldeb The Assembly's Seventh Equality Annual Report

Motion (NDM3358): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3358): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales acting
under Standing Order No. 6.6(ix):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan
weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6*

(ix):

notes the National Assembly for Wales: arrangements to promote equality of opportunity—financial year 2005-06 which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006.

yn nodi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: trefniadau i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal—blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that future reports measure improved equality outcomes as well as setting out equality outputs.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod adroddiadau'r dyfodol yn mesur canlyniadau gwell o ran cydraddoldeb yn ogystal â phennu allbynnau cydraddoldeb.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Gwenda Thomas: I propose that

Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 6.6(ix):

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6 (ix):

notes the National Assembly for Wales: arrangements to promote equality of opportunity—financial year 2005-06 which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 28 November 2006. (NDM3358)

yn nodi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: trefniadau i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal—blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3358)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n amlinellu'r camau a gymerwyd gan y Cynulliad i gyflawni ei ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bawb, fel y nodwyd yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'r weledigaeth i gael Llywodraeth ddatganoleddig yng Nghymru. Bu gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn allweddol wrth gyflawni'r ddyletswydd honno.

It is a pleasure to present this report to the Assembly. It outlines the steps taken by the Assembly to carry out its duty to promote equality of opportunity for all, as noted in the Government of Wales Act 1998. This is an important aspect of the vision of having a devolved Government in Wales. The work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity has been crucial in carrying out that duty.

Mae'r adroddiad yn rhychwantu blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06. Mae'r rhan gyntaf yn ymdrin â gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ac mae'r ail ran yn cyfeirio at waith Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Mae'r rhan olaf, sef swmp yr adroddiad, yn amlinellu gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Am y tro cyntaf, mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn cynnwys diweddariadau blynyddol ar y cynnydd a wnaed wrth weithredu cynlluniau

The report covers the 2005-06 financial year. The first part deals with the work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the second part refers to the work of the Assembly Parliamentary Service. The final part, which is the bulk of the report, outlines the Assembly Government's work. For the first time, the report also includes annual updates on the progress made in implementing the race equality schemes of

cydraddoldeb hiliol Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

the Assembly Parliamentary Service and Welsh Assembly Government.

Diolchaf i wahoddedigion sefydlog y pwyllgor am eu cyfraniad, sef y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, Stonewall Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Bu eu cyfraniad at waith y pwyllgor drwy gydol y flwyddyn yn amhrisiadwy.

I thank the committee's standing invitees for their contribution, namely the Commission for Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission, the Equal Opportunities Commission, Stonewall Cymru and the Welsh Language Board. Their contribution to the work of the committee throughout the year has been invaluable.

Erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, ni fydd y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd a'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal yn bodoli mwyach. Bydd eu gwaith yn cael ei ymgorffori yn y comisiwn newydd dros gydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol y bydd ei gylch gorchwyl hefyd yn ymdrin â themâu cydraddoldeb eraill. Yr wyf yn dymuno'n dda i'r sefydliadau a'u staff yn ystod y cyfnod trosglwyddo hwn ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod hefyd yn dymuno'n dda i Neil Wooding yn ei swydd fel comisiynydd dros Gymru. Diolchaf hefyd i'r unigolion a'r sefydliadau eraill sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser i roi cyngor a thystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor. Yn olaf, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog, Jane Hutt. Mae'n siŵr gennyf y siaradaf dros bob aelod o'r pwyllgor pan ddywedaf ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y cymorth a gafodd y pwyllgor ganddi.

By this time next year, the Commission on Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission and the Equal Opportunities Commission will not longer exist. Their work will be incorporated in the new commission for equality and human rights, and its remit will also deal with other equality themes. I wish these organisations and their staff well during this transitional period and I am sure that we also wish Neil Wooding well in his role as commissioner for Wales. I also wish to thank the other individuals and organisations that have given of their time to advise the committee and give evidence. Finally, I thank the Minister, Jane Hutt. I am sure that I speak on behalf of all committee members when I say that I we greatly appreciate the assistance that she has given to the committee.

This debate is taking place nine months after the end of the year to which the equality report relates. During 2005-06, the Committee on Equality of Opportunity considered a wide range of issues, including matters relating to the Assembly's internal processes, the operation of organisations under the Assembly's remit, and issues relating to the wider community in Wales. I will take this opportunity to draw attention to some of the key areas that the committee considered and, hopefully, to set out how we are taking them forward.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn digwydd naw mis ar ôl diwedd y flwyddyn y mae'r adroddiad ar gydraddoldeb yn ymdrin â hi. Yn ystod 2005-06, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal amrediad eang o faterion, yn cynnwys materion ynglŷn â phrosesau mewnol y Cynulliad, gweithrediad cyrff dan gyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad, a materion yn ymwneud â'r gymuned ehangach yng Nghymru. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at rai o'r meysydd allweddol a ystyriwyd gan y pwyllgor a, gobeithio, i amlinellu sut yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â hwy.

The committee scrutinised several pieces of legislation during the year, including the Equality Bill and the civil partnership regulations. Reports on both pieces of legislation were laid before the Assembly and sent to the appropriate Whitehall departments and to Welsh MPs to inform the debate in Westminster. We also made our views known

Craffodd y pwyllgor ar sawl darn o ddeddfwriaeth yn ystod y flwyddyn, gan gynnwys y Mesur Cydraddoldeb a'r rheoliadau partneriaeth sifil. Gosodwyd adroddiadau ar y ddau ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth ger bron y Cynulliad a'u hanfon i'r adrannau priodol yn Whitehall ac at Aelodau Seneddol Cymru i roi cefndir i'r ddadl yn San Steffan.

on the Assembly's statutory equality duty during the scrutiny of the Government of Wales Bill, and we welcome its inclusion in the Government of Wales Act 2006. We have continued to provide input into the development of the Assembly's Standing Orders, and we are pleased with the support from all parties for the continuation of the committee into the third Assembly.

We consider that our major achievement during the year, however, has been the ongoing study into service provision for disabled young people. I am particularly proud of the way in which the committee has decided to carry out this review by utilising the resources of a reference group of disabled young people to advise it. I take this opportunity to thank and pay tribute to the members of the reference group who have put their views honestly and articulately and have given the committee a unique insight into the issues faced by disabled young people in Wales. We hope that the resulting report, which will be published shortly, will make a real difference to the lives of disabled young people, their families and carers.

In addition to our obligations under Standing Orders to scrutinise the three equality commissions, we have considered the annual report of the Welsh Local Government Association's equality unit and received updates on Stonewall Cymru's reports, 'Counted Out' and 'Count Us In!'.

In terms of our future work, we have identified a number of key issues to focus on: monitoring progress with mainstreaming equality and implementing the recommendations of the 'Review of Service Provision for Gypsies and Travellers'; monitoring the implementation of public duties on race, gender and disability equality; scrutinising equality-related legislation and the Welsh dimension of the commission for equality and human rights; holding Ministers to account, both in correspondence and, if necessary, by inviting direct scrutiny; and considering what mechanisms and arrangements will best equip the third Assembly to meet its duty to promote equality, in the context of the Government of

Gwnaethom ddatgan ein barn hefyd am ddyletswydd y Cynulliad o ran cydraddoldeb statudol yn ystod y broses o graffu ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru, a chroesawn y ffaith ei fod wedi'i gynnwys yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Yr ydym wedi parhau i roi mewnbwn i ddatblygiad Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym yn falch o'r gefnogaeth gan yr holl bleidiau i barhad y pwyllgor i mewn i'r trydydd Cynulliad.

Ystyriwn mai'r prif beth a gyflawnwyd gennym yn ystod y flwyddyn, serch hynny, oedd yr astudiaeth barhaus ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc ag anabledd. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o'r ffordd y penderfynodd y pwyllgor wneud yr adolygiad hwn drwy fanteisio ar adnoddau grŵp cyfeirio o bobl ifanc anabl i'w gynghori. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i ddiolch a thalu teyrnged i aelodau'r grŵp cyfeirio a roddodd eu sylwadau'n onest ac yn groyw, gan roi golwg unigryw i'r pwyllgor ar y materion a wynebir gan bobl ifanc anabl yng Nghymru. Gobeithiwn y bydd yr adroddiad sy'n deillio o hyn, a gyhoeddir yn fuan, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i fywydau pobl ifanc anabl, eu teuluoedd a'u gofalwyr.

Yn ogystal â'n dyletswyddau dan y Rheolau Sefydlog i graffu ar y tri chomisiwn cydraddoldeb, yr ydym wedi ystyried adroddiad blynyddol uned gydraddoldeb Cymdeithas Lywodraeth Leol Cymru ac wedi cael y manylion diweddaraf am adroddiadau Stonewall Cymru, 'Eich Cyfrif neu'ch Eithrio' a 'Ninnau Hefyd!'.

O ran ein gwaith yn y dyfodol, yr ydym wedi nodi nifer o faterion allweddol i ganolbwyntio arnynt: monitro hynt dod â chydaddoldeb i'r brif ffrwd a gweithredu argymhellion yr 'Adolygiad o'r Gwasanaethau a Ddarperir i Sipsiwn a Chrwydriaid'; monitro gweithrediad dyletswyddau cyhoeddus ynglŷn â chydaddoldeb hil, rhyw ac anabledd; craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol i gydraddoldeb ac ar ddimensiwn Cymreig y comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol; dal Gweinidogion i gyfrif, trwy ohebiaeth ac, os oes angen, trwy wahodd craffu uniongyrchol; ac ystyried pa fecanweithiau a threfniadau fydd orau ar gyfer arfogi'r trydydd Cynulliad i gyflawni'i ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo

Wales Bill and the introduction of the CEHR.

cydraddoldeb, yng nghyd-destun Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru a chyflwyno'r comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol.

5.00 p.m.

In considering the annual report of the Welsh Assembly Government, the committee, in agreement with the Panel of Chairs, asked each subject committee to scrutinise its Minister's contribution to the report. That enabled each committee's in-depth knowledge of its portfolio area to be used to help the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to conduct a robust scrutiny of the report. Several issues were raised by the subject committees and those will be taken up with the Ministers and departments concerned. We were pleased to see that our recommendations for a more outcome-based report had been followed by both the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Welsh Assembly Government. I think that this deals with the Plaid Cymru amendment. We felt, however, that some departments were better than others at adopting that approach, and evidence of outputs rather than outcomes was still being reported. We hope to see further progress in this area in the final report from the second Assembly.

We are pleased with the further progress made by the Welsh Assembly Government in taking forward the mainstreaming equality agenda and in implementing the recommendations contained in its 'Report on Mainstreaming Equality in the Work of the National Assembly'. In particular, we welcome the development of the mainstreaming equality strategy, and we look forward to the production of overarching equality plans for all departments.

The committee is encouraged by the advances made by the Assembly in fulfilling its equality duties, as demonstrated in this report. The next 12 months will be a time of great change for the Assembly, its Members and staff. New ways of working will have to be established, and protocols agreed. The commission for equality and human rights will also come into being, and the Assembly will quickly have to establish a good working relationship with it. We hope that the third Assembly will continue the progress on

Wrth ystyried adroddiad blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gofynnodd y pwyllgor, gan gytuno â'r Panel Cadeiryddion, i bob pwyllgor pwnc graffu ar gyfraniad ei Weinidog i'r adroddiad. Galluogodd hynny wybodaeth drylwyr pob pwyllgor o'i faes pwnc i gael ei defnyddio i helpu'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal i fynd ati i graffu'n fanwl ar yr adroddiad. Codwyd sawl mater gan y pwyllgorau pwnc a byddir yn codi'r rheini gyda'r Gweinidogion a'r adrannau dan sylw. Yr ydym yn falch o weld bod ein hargymhellion am adroddiad sydd wedi'i seilio'n fwy helaeth ar ganlyniadau wedi cael eu dilyn gan Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a chan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Credaf fod hyn yn delio â gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Teimlem, fodd bynnag, fod rhai adrannau yn well nag eraill am fabwysiadu'r drefn honno, a bod tystiolaeth am allbynnau yn hytrach na chanlyniadau yn dal i gael ei hadrodd. Gobeithiwn weld cynnydd pellach yn y maes hwn yn yr adroddiad terfynol gan yr ail Gynulliad.

Yr ydym yn falch o'r cynnydd pellach a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn symud yr agenda prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb ymlaen ac yn gweithredu'r argymhellion yn ei 'Hadroddiad ar Brif Ffrydio Cydraddoldeb yng Ngwaith y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol'. Yn arbennig, yr ydym yn croesawu datblygu'r strategaeth ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gynhyrchu cynlluniau cydraddoldeb cyffredinol i'r adrannau i gyd.

Calonogir y pwyllgor gan y cynnydd y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i wneud yn cyflawni ei ddyletswyddau cydraddoldeb, fel y dangosir yn yr adroddiad hwn. Bydd y 12 mis nesaf yn gyfnod o newid mawr i'r Cynulliad, ei Aelodau a'r staff. Bydd yn rhaid sefydlu ffyrdd newydd o weithio, a chytuno ar brotocolau. Bydd y comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol yn cael ei sefydlu, a bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad sefydlu perthynas waith dda ag ef yn gyflym. Gobeithiwn y bydd y trydydd Cynulliad yn parhau â'r cynnydd ar

equality issues started by the current Assembly, and that its equality duties will be fully exercised in the use of its increased powers.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that future reports measure improved equality outcomes as well as setting out equality outputs.

This is indeed a significant document, and we chose to table this amendment to strengthen the point to which Gwenda Thomas has referred, which was a view shared across parties on the committee, on the importance of measuring the difference that Government action makes—which would also apply to the Assembly’s actions—rather than simply measuring what it does. That is the penultimate report that will be laid jointly by the committee, the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Assembly Government before the new arrangements come into play. It is in that context that I wish to focus my comments today on the Government’s report.

No-one would argue that no progress at all has been made in the past seven years; that would be inaccurate. The engagement of people from, for example, ethnic minority groups and the lesbian, gay and bisexual community in public discourse and public decision-making in Wales has improved beyond recognition since those pre-devolution days. I congratulate the Government on its willingness to support and resource organisations, particularly Stonewall Cymru, to facilitate that engagement.

The Government has made a genuine attempt to address the needs of historically excluded groups, and it has enjoyed cross-party support in its efforts to do so. For example, on the historic occasion when a Home Office official was brought before the Assembly’s first equality committee to justify the incarceration of innocent asylum seekers, I

faterion cydraddoldeb a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad presennol, ac y bydd ei ddyletswyddau cydraddoldeb yn cael eu harfer yn llawn wrth iddo ddefnyddio ei bwerau estynedig.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod adroddiadau'r dyfodol yn mesur canlyniadau gwell o ran cydraddoldeb yn ogystal â phennu allbynnau cydraddoldeb.

Mae hon yn wir yn ddogfen arwyddocaol, a dewiswyd gyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn i gryfhau'r pwynt y mae Gwenda Thomas wedi cyfeirio ato, a oedd yn farn a gâi ei rhannu ar draws y pleidiau ar y pwyllgor, ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd mesur y gwahaniaeth a wna gweithredu'r Llywodraeth—a fyddai'n gymwys hefyd i weithredu'r Cynulliad—yn hytrach na dim ond mesur yr hyn a wna. Dyna'r adroddiad olaf ond un a gaiff ei gyflwyno ar y cyd gan y pwyllgor, Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad cyn i'r trefniadau newydd ddod i rym. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw yr wyf am hoelio fy sylwadau heddiw ar adroddiad y Llywodraeth.

Ni fyddai unrhyw un yn dadlau nad oes cynnydd o gwbl wedi cael ei wneud dros y saith mlynedd diwethaf; byddai hynny'n anghywir. Mae ymwneud pobl o, er enghraifft, grwpiau lleiafrifoedd ethnig a'r gymuned lesbiaidd, hoyw a deurywiol â thrafodaethau cyhoeddus a threfniadau i wneud penderfyniadau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi gwella y tu hwnt i adnabyddiaeth ers y dyddiau hynny cyn datganoli. Llongyfarchaf y Llywodraeth ar ei pharodrwydd i gefnogi a darparu adnoddau i sefydliadau, Stonewall Cymru yn arbennig, er mwyn hwyluso'r ymwneud hwnnw.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud ymdrech wirioneddol i fynd i'r afael ag anghenion grwpiau sydd yn hanesyddol wedi cael eu hallgáu, ac mae wedi cael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn ei hymdrechion i wneud hynny. Er enghraifft, ar yr achlysur hanesyddol pan ddygwyd swyddog o'r Swyddfa Gartref gerbron pwyllgor

will never forget how, having been thoroughly grilled by the then Minister, Edwina Hart, and me, the official turned with relief to the Conservative spokesman, David Melding, obviously expecting a little support, but he was left in absolutely no doubt that David Melding and his party in the Assembly shared our view on the incarceration of innocent people under those circumstances. I think that that poor official went home to London knowing that he had been to a different country, and with a very clear view of the broad, if not all-encompassing, consensus of this parliamentary body over the years on the promotion of equality.

We have seen real progress with engagement and the development of a solid and, I believe, durable political consensus. However, is this making a difference, and how do we know? We have to find ways to measure this, hence the amendment. This report from the Government—and I believe that the Minister would acknowledge this herself—still tells us too much about what Government departments have done and not enough about what difference, if any, their actions have made. In stating that, I do not wish to imply for a moment that I do not think that these actions have made any difference, because I am sure that they have. However, we do not know what difference they have made and whether it is the right difference unless we start receiving reports on the outputs of activity.

I acknowledge that the very fact that departments have been able to demonstrate, in these seven years, that they are taking action is progress. We acknowledge, as Gwenda Thomas said, that that action is, as yet, far from consistent across departments, but they are beginning to describe more accurately and more clearly what they do. In the early days of the committee, I remember having departmental reports that did not mention things that I, as an opposition Member, knew perfectly well they were doing, such as not acknowledging that they were funding bodies that we knew they were funding. There has been progress, in that they can describe outputs. However, we have to

cydraddoldeb cyntaf y Cynulliad i gyfiawnhau carcharu ceiswyr lloches diniwed, nid anghofiaf fyth fel y trodd y swyddog, ar ôl cael ei groesholi gan y Gweinidog ar y pryd, Edwina Hart, a minnau, at y llefarydd Ceidwadol, David Melding, yn amlwg yn disgwyl ychydig o gefnogaeth, ond fe'i gadawyd mewn dim amheuaeth o gwbl bod David Melding a'i blaid yn y Cynulliad yn rhannu ein barn ni am garcharu pobl ddiniwed o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Credaf i'r swyddog truan hwnnw fynd yn ôl i Lundain yn gwybod ei fod wedi bod mewn gwlad wahanol, a chyda darlun clir iawn o'r consensws eang, os nad yw'n hollgwmpasog, yn y corff seneddol hwn dros y blynyddoedd o blaid hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb.

Yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd gwirioneddol o ran ymwneud a datblygu consensws gwleidyddol cadarn a fydd, mi gredaf, yn para. Fodd bynnag, a yw hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, a sut gwyddom ni? Rhaid inni ganfod ffyrdd o fesur hyn, a dyna'r rheswm dros y gwelliant. Mae'r adroddiad gan y Gweinidog—a chredaf y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod hyn ei hun—yn dal i ddweud gormod wrthym am yr hyn y mae adrannau'r Llywodraeth wedi ei wneud a dim digon am ba wahaniaeth, os oes gwahaniaeth, y mae eu gweithredu wedi ei wneud. Wrth ddweud hynny, nid wyf yn dymuno cyfleu am eiliad nad wyf yn credu bod y gweithredu hwn wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod. Fodd bynnag, ni wyddom pa wahaniaeth a wnaeth ac a yw'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth iawn onid ydym yn dechrau cael adroddiad am allbynnau'r gweithredu.

Cydnabyddaf fod y ffaith ynddi ei hun fod yr adrannau wedi gallu dangos, dros y saith mlynedd hyn, eu bod wedi bod yn gweithredu yn gynnydd. Yr ydym yn cydnabod, fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas, fod y gweithredu hwnnw, hyd yma, ymhell o fod yn gyson ar draws adrannau, ond maent yn dechrau disgrifio'r hyn a wnânt yn fwy cywir ac yn gliriach. Yn nyddiau cynnar y pwyllgor, cofiaf gael adroddiadau adrannol nad oeddent yn sôn am bethau yr oeddwn i, fel Aelod o'r wrthblaid, yn gwybod yn iawn eu bod yn eu gwneud, megis peidio â chydabod eu bod yn cyllido cyrff y gwyddem eu bod yn eu cyllido. Bu cynnydd, yn yr ystyr eu bod yn gallu disgrifio

move towards measuring the change that all of this activity brings about. No-one is suggesting that this is easy, as we are asking public bodies and Government departments to make a huge cultural change, but I hope that the Minister will agree that we must begin to do this; otherwise, the Government cannot know whether there is any point in what it is doing, and the opposition cannot scrutinise its effectiveness.

This is not a new message, not from me nor from our standing invitees. I would endorse the comments already made by Gwenda Thomas about the invaluable role that our standing invitees have played, and I am optimistic that they will continue to play a role under the new arrangements in 2007. However, this is not new. In fact, when I showed this amendment to one of my colleagues, she said, 'Oh dear, it is your amendment again'. I am afraid that it is, and it is an amendment and a point that I will keep making until we can measure outcomes and real change.

Those who have been, and who, sadly, continue to be, discriminated against in our communities have welcomed our consultations, engagement and commitment. They now expect the Government to turn mainstreaming theory into transformational practice, and they expect the opposition to scrutinise effectively what the Government does. We cannot do that until we measure real change.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As the motion asks us to take note of a National Assembly for Wales document, I will now call two speakers from the two sides of the Assembly: the Executive and the House Committee. I will be calling William Graham to speak next, and I will then call upon the Business Minister to speak for the Welsh Assembly Government. That will cover the executive role of this document, and the reason why we have it before us.

William Graham: First, I endorse the remarks made by the Chair of the Committee

allbynnau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni symud tuag at fesur y newid y mae'r holl weithgarwch hwn yn ei achosi. Nid oes neb yn awgrymu bod hyn yn hawdd, gan ein bod yn gofyn i gyrff cyhoeddus ac adrannau'r Llywodraeth wneud newid diwylliannol enfawr, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni ddechrau gwneud hyn; fel arall, ni all y Llywodraeth wybod a oes unrhyw bwynt i'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud, ac ni all yr wrthblaid graffu ar ei effeithiolrwydd.

Nid yw hon yn neges newydd, nid gennyf fi na'n gwahoddedigion sefydlog. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r sylwadau y mae Gwenda Thomas wedi eu gwneud eisoes am y rôl amhrisiadwy a chwaraewyd gan ein gwahoddedigion sefydlog, ac yr wyf yn obeithiol y byddant yn parhau i chwarae rhan o dan y trefniadau newydd yn 2007. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn newydd. Yn wir, pan ddangosais y gwelliant hwn i un o'm cyd-Aelodau, dywedodd, 'O diar, dyna dy welliant di eto'. Mae arnaf ofn bod hynny'n wir, ac mae'n welliant ac yn bwynt y byddaf yn dal i'w gwneud hyd nes y gallwn fesur canlyniadau a newid gwirioneddol.

Mae'r rhai y mae ein cymunedau wedi gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn ac sydd, yn drist, yn dal i wynebu gwahaniaethu felly, wedi croesawu ein hymgyngoriadau, ein hymwneud a'n hymrwymiad. Maent yn disgwyl yn awr i'r Llywodraeth droi theori prif ffrydio yn arfer a fydd yn trawsnewid, ac maent yn disgwyl i'r wrthblaid graffu'n effeithiol ar yr hyn a wna'r Llywodraeth. Ni allwn wneud hynny nes inni fesur newid gwirioneddol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gan fod y cynnig yn gofyn inni gymryd sylw o ddogfen gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, galwaf yn awr ar ddau siaradwr o'r naill ochr a'r llall o'r Cynulliad: y Weithrediaeth a Phwyllgor y Tŷ. Byddaf yn galw ar William Graham i siarad nesaf, yna byddaf yn galw ar y Trefnydd i siarad ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Bydd hynny'n cwmpasu rôl weithredol y ddogfen hon, a'r rheswm pam y mae'n ymddangos ger ein bron.

William Graham: Yn gyntaf, cymeradwyaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Gadeirydd y

on Equality of Opportunity and her acknowledgement of the good progress made during the year by the Assembly in promoting this most important subject. As Chair of the House Committee, I will concentrate on the achievements of the Assembly Parliamentary Service with regard to equality of opportunity in its work and the business that it carries out.

The report outlines the work undertaken in APS between April 2005 and March 2006. As the Chair has said, this work is at least three quarters of the year behind. We must ensure that the business of the Assembly is conducted with due regard for the principle that there should be equality of opportunity for all. The report sets out the processes implemented to ensure equality of opportunity within the work of APS and the outcomes that result from these processes. Clear arrangements are set out for the regular monitoring of work undertaken to promote such equality, and the report provides information on progress made since the end of March 2006, as well as future plans.

Some examples of progress include: the development of an innovative ethnic minority outreach programme, which aims to raise awareness of APS as a potential employer and to provide guidance on APS recruitment procedures; an increased focus on equality-related issues in Assembly subject committees, supported by staff in the Members' Research and Committee Services; the continued development of flexible working arrangements such as home working; the awarding of a contract to produce the leaflet 'Your Guide to the Assembly' in British Sign Language—and I am delighted to say that the leaflet is produced in 18 different languages—and the establishment of an APS equality steering group, which is chaired by the clerk and is responsible for the monitoring of the progress made in the promotion of equality. In addition to the continued work undertaken by the APS access adviser, an equality capacity-building project with a full-time seconded member of staff was established, and a human resources manager with special responsibility for equality-related issues was

Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'i chydnabyddiaeth o'r cynnydd da a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y flwyddyn gan y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo'r pwnc hynod o bwysig hwn. Fel cadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gan Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad o ran cyfle cyfartal yn ei waith ac yn y busnes y mae yn ei gyflawni.

Mae'r adroddiad yn amlinellu'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y gwasanaeth Seneddol rhwng Ebrill 2005 a Mawrth 2006. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae'r gwaith hwn o leiaf dri chwarter o'r flwyddyn ar ei hôl hi. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod busnes y Cynulliad yn cael ei gyflawni gan roi sylw dyledus i'r egwyddor y dylai fod cyfle cyfartal i bawb. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'r prosesau a roddwyd ar waith i sicrhau cyfle cyfartal yng ngwaith y gwasanaeth Seneddol a'r canlyniadau sy'n deillio o'r prosesau hynny. Nodir trefniadau clir ar gyfer y monitro rheolaidd ar y gwaith a wneir i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb o'r fath, ac mae'r adroddiad yn darparu gwybodaeth am y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd er diwedd mis Mawrth 2006, yn ogystal â chynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Ymysg rhai enghreifftiau o gynnydd mae datblygu'r rhaglen allanol arloesol i leiafrifoedd ethnig, sy'n ceisio codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r gwasanaeth Seneddol fel cyflogwr posibl a darparu canllawiau ar weithdrefnau recriwtio'r gwasanaeth; mwy o ffocws ar faterion yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb ym mhwyllgorau pwnc y Cynulliad, gyda chymorth staff yng Ngwasanaethau'r Pwyllgorau ac Ymchwil yr Aelodau; parhau i ddatblygu trefniadau gwaith hyblyg megis gweithio gartref; dyfarnu contract i gynhyrchu taflen 'Eich Arweiniad Chi i'r Cynulliad' yn Iaith Arwyddion Prydain—ac yr wyf wrth fy modd yn dweud bod y daflen yn cael ei chynhyrchu mewn 18 o ieithoedd gwahanol—a sefydlu grŵp llywio cydraddoldeb y gwasanaeth Seneddol, o dan gadeiryddiaeth y cler, sy'n gyfrifol am fonitro'r cynnydd a wneir yn hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb. Yn ychwanegol at y gwaith sy'n parhau dan ofal cynghorydd mynediad y gwasanaeth Seneddol, sefydlwyd prosiect cydraddoldeb meithrin gallu gydag aelod staff amser llawn ar secondiad, a recriwtiwyd rheolwr adnoddau dynol gyda

recruited. On behalf of the House Committee, I extend my thanks for this work, which has been taken forward so diligently.

5.10 p.m.

On recruitment advertising, there is an opportunity to be more imaginative with the new Assembly commission. On black and minority ethnic representation among APS staff, an action plan forms part of the APS race equality scheme. We could take a number of potential actions to increase the proportion of higher grade staff, some of which will be possible only when we are no longer part of the civil service. The emphasis in 2005-06 has been on raising awareness, so that staff across APS have a better understanding of the ways in which equality legislation can apply to their role in the organisation. The APS working group on childcare will also be reporting its final recommendations to the House Committee on Thursday.

We aspire to schemes designed to ensure that people with any disability can maximise their independence, and we must demonstrate that we believe that inclusion and integration are truly part of our agenda. We must emphasise the positive shift in developing this agenda, although I acknowledge, as I am sure many Members will agree, that there is still some way to go, and we have to ensure that the work undertaken is continued.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to you for allowing me to intervene. Looking to the future, concerns have been raised with me and with other Members about how thorough we are when letting contracts about ensuring that our contractors operate the best equality of opportunity practices with regard to how they treat their workforce. Is this an issue that the House Committee has addressed? I hope that you continually monitor that, not only at the beginning of a contract, but as the contract progresses, so that we can ensure that we are indeed acting as an exemplar.

chyfrifoldeb arbennig am faterion yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb. Ar ran Pwyllgor y Tŷ, estynnaf fy niolch am y gwaith hwn, sydd wedi cael ei symud ymlaen yn ddiwyd.

O ran hysbysebion recriwtio, mae cyfle i ddefnyddio mwy o ddychymyg gyda chomisiwn newydd y Cynulliad. O ran cynrychiolaeth pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig ymysg staff y gwasanaeth Seneddol, mae cynllun gweithredu yn rhan o gynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y gwasanaeth. Gallem gymryd nifer o gamau posibl i gynyddu'r gyfran o staff ar raddau uwch, ac ni fydd rhai ohonynt yn bosibl ond pan nad ydynt mwyach yn rhan o'r gwasanaeth sifil. Bu'r pwyslais yn 2005-06 ar godi ymwybyddiaeth, fel bod gan staff ar draws y gwasanaeth Seneddol well dealltwriaeth o'r ffyrdd y gall deddfwriaeth gydraddoldeb fod yn gymwys i'w rôl hwy yn y sefydliad. Bydd gweithgor y gwasanaeth Seneddol ar ofal plant hefyd yn adrodd ei argymhellion terfynol i Bwyllgor y Tŷ ddydd Iau.

Yr ydym yn anelu at gynlluniau a ddyluniwyd i sicrhau bod pobl ag unrhyw anabledd yn gallu bod mor annibynnol â phosibl, a rhaid inni ddangos ein bod yn credu bod cynnwys ac integreiddio yn wir yn rhan o'n hagenda. Rhaid inni bwysleisio'r newid cadarnhaol wrth ddatblygu'r agenda hon, er fy mod yn cydnabod, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o Aelodau yn cytuno, bod cryn ffordd i fynd eto, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod y gwaith yr ymgymeryd ag ef yn parhau.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am adael imi ymyrryd. Gan edrych i'r dyfodol, mae pryderon wedi cael eu codi gyda mi a chydag Aelodau eraill am ba mor drylwyr ydym wrth osod contractau ynglŷn â sicrhau bod ein contractwyr yn rhoi'r arferion cyfle cyfartal gorau ar waith o ran y ffordd y maent yn trin eu gweithlu. A yw hwn yn fater y mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi rhoi sylw iddo? Gobeithiaf eich bod yn monitro hynny'n barhaus, nid dim ond ar ddechrau contract, ond wrth i'r contract fynd rhagddo, fel y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn wir yn gweithredu fel esiampl.

William Graham: Thank you for that intervention, as it gives me the opportunity to say that, when the system changes next May, there will be far greater scope for the Assembly commission to monitor contracts in exactly the way that you describe. The House Committee is aware of the issues that have been raised, and the Deputy Presiding Officer, who is a former Chair of the House Committee, was helpful in securing better conditions for our cleaning staff, for example. Therefore, contracts can be monitored from time to time, but, in the future, there will be a much more direct relationship between the contractor and the commission, and precisely the issues that you raised can be put into contracts to ensure that we become a truly exemplar employer in Wales.

The Assembly Parliamentary Service is working closely with representative organisations to achieve as much as we possibly can. I am sure that Members will join me in entrusting the new Assembly commission to build on the foundations of this important work, and to follow it through assiduously for the greater benefit of all.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I am pleased to speak about this report for 2005-06, the seventh annual report on equality produced by the Welsh Assembly Government. It will be the last report of this kind, as the committee Chair, Gwenda Thomas, outlined. We have sought to produce a report that builds on the real progress that was made last year, and to take on board previous comments with regard to scrutiny and outcomes. I thank Helen Mary for her recognition of real progress, especially in relation to those strands of diversity that we have supported, such as Stonewall Cymru, and the fact that we are now engaged, with the Department of Trade and Industry, in funding a project that will influence the whole of the commission for equality and human rights as a result of our pioneering work with lesbian, gay and bisexual people. I think that that is an indication of progress.

We also clearly have a long way to go, but I want to put in context the fact that all Ministers are fully accountable for the actions

William Graham: Diolch ichi am yr ymyriad hwnnw, gan ei fod yn rhoi'r cyfle imi i ddweud, pan fydd y system yn newid fis Mai nesaf, y bydd llawer mwy o gyfle i gomisiwn y Cynulliad fonitro contractau yn yr union ffordd a ddisgrifiwch. Mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn ymwybodol o'r materion yr ydych wedi eu codi, ac yr oedd y Dirprwy Lywydd, sy'n gyn Gadeirydd ar Bwyllgor y Tŷ, o gymorth yn sicrhau gwell amodau i'n staff glanhau, er enghraifft. Felly, mae modd monitro contractau o bryd i'w gilydd, ond, yn y dyfodol, bydd perthynas lawer mwy uniongyrchol rhwng y contractwr a'r comisiwn, a bydd modd rhoi'r union faterion a godwyd gennych mewn contractau i sicrhau ein bod yn wir yn dod yn esiampl o gyflogwr yng Nghymru.

Mae Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n agos gyda chyrrff cynrychiadol i gyflawni cymaint ag a fedrwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau'n ymuno â mi yn ymddiried yng nghomisiwn newydd y Cynulliad i adeiladu ar sylfeini'r gwaith pwysig hwn, ac i barhau i ymgyrhaedd yn ddiwyd ato er budd pennaf pawb.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn falch o siarad am yr adroddiad hwn am 2005-06, y seithfed adroddiad blynyddol am gydraddoldeb i gael ei gynhyrchu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Hwn fydd yr adroddiad olaf o'i fath, fel y mae Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, Gwenda Thomas, wedi amlinellu. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cynhyrchu adroddiad sy'n adeiladu ar y cynnydd gwirioneddol a wnaethpwyd y llynedd, ac i adlewyrchu'r sylwadau blaenorol a wnaethpwyd am graffu a chanlyniadau. Diolchaf i Helen Mary am ei chydabyddiaeth o gynnydd gwirioneddol, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r elfennau hynny o amrywiaeth yr ydym wedi eu cefnogi, megis Stonewall Cymru, a'r ffaith ein bod erbyn hyn, ynghyd â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, yn cyllido prosiect a fydd yn dylanwadu ar y comisiwn dros gydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol drwyddo draw o ganlyniad i'n gwaith arloesol gyda phobl lesbiaidd, hoyw a deurywiol. Credaf fod hynny yn arwydd o gynnydd.

Mae gennym yn amlwg hefyd ffordd bell i fynd, ond yr wyf am roi yn ei gyd-destun y ffaith bod pob Gweinidog yn llwyr atebol am

taken in their portfolio areas. I think that the annual report shows just how much work has been undertaken across all those areas of ministerial responsibility. It demonstrates that equality is firmly on the strategic agenda of the Welsh Assembly Government.

For the first time, subject committees have scrutinised their relevant section of the annual report; that is an important development. I think that that is key in providing a mechanism for Ministers to be held accountable for equality in their areas. When I discussed the report at the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I received a number of specific policy-related questions, which cut across ministerial portfolios. This change of procedure will allow committee members to raise these issues directly with the Minister responsible, and also to provide more effective scrutiny of the annual report as a whole, facilitating the provision of detailed responses to specific policy questions. However, this is about embedding equality across all Assembly Government areas to ensure that it is effectively mainstreamed throughout all of our policies.

Outcomes pose one of the most important challenges. The amendment proposed by Helen Mary, on measuring improved equality outcomes, is welcome; it demonstrates the maturity of the debate in Wales. I think that we have always been mature in this Chamber, and in committee, in our cross-party commitment to promoting equality of opportunity, as enshrined in our unique duty in the Government of Wales Act 1998 and the Government of Wales Act 2006.

We have made every effort this year to improve on last year's report in relation to identifying outcomes. I recognise that we are not there yet. We must make a difference. Description is not enough; activity is crucial. A great deal of benefit results from that activity, but we need to prove it. Our departmental equality champions, through the workshops that we have held over the last year, are now realising how they can pull out

y camau gweithredu a gymerir yn eu meysydd portffolio. Credaf fod yr adroddiad blynyddol yn dangos faint yn union o waith sydd wedi cael ei wneud ar draws yr holl feysydd hynny y mae'r Gweinidogion yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Mae'n dangos bod cydraddoldeb yn gadarn ar agenda strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Am y tro cyntaf, mae pwyllgorau pwnc wedi craffu ar eu hadran berthnasol o'r adroddiad blynyddol; mae hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig. Credaf fod hynny'n allweddol er mwyn darparu mecanwaith i Weinidogion i gael eu dal yn atebol am gydraddoldeb yn eu meysydd. Pan drafodais yr adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, cefais nifer o gwestiynau yn ymwneud â pholisïau penodol, sy'n torri ar draws portffolios y Gweinidogion. Bydd y newid hwn o ran gweithdrefn yn galluogi aelodau pwyllgorau i godi'r materion hyn yn uniongyrchol gyda'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol, a bydd hefyd yn fodd i gael craffu mwy effeithiol ar yr adroddiad blynyddol drwyddo draw, gan ei gwneud yn haws darparu ymatebion manwl i gwestiynau polisi penodol. Fodd bynnag, hanfod hyn yw gwreiddio cydraddoldeb ar draws holl feysydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei brif ffrydio'n effeithiol ar hyd a lled ein holl bolisïau.

Canlyniadau yw un o'r heriau pwysicaf. Mae'r gwelliant a gynigiwyd gan Helen Mary, ar fesur gwell canlyniadau o ran cydraddoldeb, i'w groesawu; mae'n dangos natur aeddfed y ddadl yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn credu inni fod yn aeddfed bob amser yn y Siambr hon, ac yn y pwyllgor, o ran ein hymrwymiad trawsbleidiol i hybu cyfle cyfartal, fel y mae wedi'i ymgorffori yn ein dyletswydd unigryw yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006.

Gwnaethom bob ymdrech eleni i wella ar adroddiad y llynedd mewn cysylltiad â chanfod canlyniadau. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli nad ydym wedi cyrraedd y nod eto. Rhaid inni wneud gwahaniaeth. Nid yw disgrifio'n ddigon; mae gweithgarwch yn hollbwysig. Mae llawer o fudd yn deillio o'r gweithgarwch hwnnw, ond rhaid inni brofi hynny. Mae ein hyrwyddwyr cydraddoldeb yn yr adrannau, drwy'r gweithdai a

the outcomes and the impact of the work that has been undertaken. That is linked to the availability of evidence on equality in Wales. We can only truly measure outcomes when we have a firm evidence base in place. To address this, we now have the Office of the Chief Social Research Officer and the Statistical Directorate.

We are strengthening the evidence base on equality in numerous ways. We have an innovative snapshot audit for every portfolio area, and we have the development of research and evaluation plans. We recognise that there are gaps and still more work to be done, but I firmly believe that we are making real progress.

I mentioned earlier that the new committee arrangements will help to mainstream equality across all the work of the Assembly Government. In the context of the new arrangements from May 2007, and separation, accountabilities will be clear.

The mainstreaming equality agenda continues to provide the basis for ensuring that equality is at the heart of all that we do. It underpins our policies, our programmes, and our strategies. The mainstreaming equality strategy has been approved by the Cabinet and came from the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. The recommendations are now being implemented, and the strategy sets in place the tools and systems that are crucial to assist and guide the policy-making process and produce a consistent and coherent approach to mainstreaming equality across all policy areas. We intend to inform the development and delivery of better public services in Wales, and that is about mainstreaming equality in those services. That is for our communities, and, in terms of addressing inequalities, that has to be at the heart of our social justice agenda. The mainstreaming equality strategy is a way of making social justice a reality and it identifies outcomes from effective, culturally sensitive consultation, for example, through to an improved evidence base in order to achieve it. A key outcome identified in the

gynaliasom dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, yn sylweddoli bellach sut y gallant dynnu sylw at y canlyniadau ac at effaith y gwaith a wnaed. Mae hynny'n gysylltiedig ag argaeledd y dystiolaeth am gydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. Nid ydym ond yn gallu mesur canlyniadau'n iawn pan fo sylfaen dystiolaeth gadarn gennym. Bellach mae gennym Swyddfa'r Prif Swyddog Ymchwil Gymdeithasol a'r Gyfarwyddiaeth Ystadegol i ddelio â hynny.

Yr ydym yn cryfhau'r sylfaen dystiolaeth ar gydraddoldeb drwy sawl dull a modd. Mae gennym archwiliad ciplun arloesol ar gyfer pob maes portffolio, ac mae cynlluniau ymchwil a gwerthuso'n cael eu datblygu. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod bylchau a bod mwy o waith i'w wneud eto, ond yr wyf yn credu'n bendant ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol.

Dywedais yn gynharach y bydd y trefniadau newydd ar gyfer pwyllgorau'n gymorth i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn holl waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yng nghyd-destun y trefniadau newydd o fis Mai 2007, a'r gwahanu, bydd yr atebolrwydd yn glir.

Mae'r agenda ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn dal i fod yn sail i sicrhau bod cydraddoldeb wrth wraidd popeth yr ydym yn ei wneud. Mae'n sylfaen i'n polisiau, ein rhaglenni, a'n strategaethau. Mae'r strategaeth ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb wedi'i chymeradwyo gan y Cabinet a daeth oddi wrth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae'r argymhellion yn cael eu gweithredu'n awr, ac mae'r strategaeth yn rhoi ar waith yr offer a'r systemau sydd yn hollbwysig i hybu ac arwain y broses llunio polisi a chreu dull cyson a chydlynol o brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn yr holl feysydd polisi. Yr ydym yn bwriadu dylanwadu ar y gwaith o ddatblygu a darparu gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n golygu prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn y gwasanaethau hynny. Gwneir hynny er mwyn ein cymunedau, ac, o ran delio ag anghydraddoldebau, rhaid i hynny fod wrth wraidd ein hagenda ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae'r strategaeth ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn fodd i wireddu cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac mae'n nodi canlyniadau sydd yn cynnwys pob dim rhwng ymgynghori effeithiol a diwyllianol

strategy will be the development of a single equality action plan. That is when we will really mainstream. From 2007 onwards, all portfolio areas will develop this overarching equality plan, with clear measures of success built in from the outset. This will encourage thinking on how equality relates to all of our objectives and will support a change of mindset from viewing equality strands in isolation towards embracing a wider view of equality. That will form part of the arrangements for future annual reports—it will be a forward-looking, outcome-based plan feeding into the annual reporting cycle.

We also have our legislative duties to take forward. Our first race equality scheme annual report is an annex to the overarching annual report. Again, that holds us to account for the delivery of that scheme, provides an evidence-based account of our progress for 2005-06 on the race equality scheme, and an update on how successful we have been in delivering the commitments set out in the scheme. Updates are available on monitoring systems, leadership, accountability, departmental progress and policy development. The report also highlights those areas where we still have to make progress, where we may have failed to fully deliver our commitments, and where work needs to continue.

We are also committed to the disability equality scheme, supported by the Assembly last week, which is an exemplar in design and development. With regard to our disability equality scheme, every Minister will have the responsibility of ensuring that they have clearly stated objectives and outcomes in relation to providing an exemplary service to disabled people in Wales.

5.20 p.m.

In conclusion, we have particular

sensitif, er enghraifft, a chael gwell sylfaen dystiolaeth i gyflawni hynny. Un o'r canlyniadau allweddol a nodwyd yn y strategaeth yw datblygu cynllun gweithredu sengl ar gydraddoldeb. Dyna pryd y byddwn yn prif ffrydio o ddifrif. O 2007 ymlaen, bydd yr holl feysydd portffolio'n datblygu cynllun cydraddoldeb cyffredinol o'r fath, a fydd yn cynnwys dulliau eglur i fesur llwyddiant o'r cychwyn. Bydd hynny'n ysgogi syniadau am y cysylltiad rhwng cydraddoldeb a'n holl amcanion a bydd o gymorth i droi'r cyfeiriad meddwl oddi wrth ystyried meysydd cydraddoldeb ar wahân at goleddu golwg ehangach ar gydraddoldeb. Bydd hynny'n rhan o'r trefniadau ar gyfer adroddiadau blynyddol yn y dyfodol—bydd yn gynllun blaengar sydd yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau a fydd yn cyfrannu i'r cylch adrodd blynyddol.

Mae gennym ddyletswyddau deddfwriaethol i'w cyflawni hefyd. Mae ein hadroddiad blynyddol cyntaf ar y cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol yn atodiad i'r adroddiad blynyddol cyffredinol. Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n ein dal yn atebol dros gyflawni'r cynllun hwnnw, ac yn cynnig disgrifiad sydd yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth o'r cynnydd a wnaethom yn 2005-06 ar y cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol, a diweddariad ar y llwyddiant a gawsom wrth gyflawni'r ymrwymadau sydd wedi'u nodi yn y cynllun. Mae diweddariadau ar gael am systemau monitro, arweinyddiaeth, atebolrwydd, cynnydd yr adrannau a datblygu polisi. Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw hefyd at y meysydd hynny lle y mae angen inni wneud cynnydd o hyd, lle y gallem fod wedi methu â llwyr gyflawni ein hymrwymadau, a lle y mae angen parhau â'r gwaith.

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo hefyd i'r cynllun cydraddoldeb anabledd, a gefnogwyd gan y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf, sydd yn batrwm o ran y dull o'i ddylunio a'i ddatblygu. Gyda golwg ar ein cynllun cydraddoldeb anabledd, bydd pob Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am sicrhau ei fod wedi datgan amcanion a chanlyniadau'n glir mewn cysylltiad â darparu gwasanaeth rhagorol i bobl anabl yng Nghymru.

I gloi, bu datblygiadau penodol mewn

developments in relation to the gender equality scheme. You will be aware that I have asked for Wales to be given the power to make its own regulations, which will enable us to have our own gender equality duty. That is a step forward that we should again celebrate today the recognition that we have our own needs and circumstances that we want to acknowledge in a gender quality scheme.

The report demonstrates that much work is being done to ensure that equality is at the heart of all that we are trying to achieve. It provides an insight into our future thinking on equality and into new areas of work, such as the single equality action plan. I welcome the appointment of Neil Wooding as the new commissioner for equality and human rights for Wales, which was announced today. The new commission for equality and human rights will transform the equality agenda. There has been much input and thought about how that transition can take place from our current commissions, which have played an important role. We look forward to working with the new commission, to the opportunities of the Government of Wales Act 2006 from next May, and to ensuring that we embed equality and social justice in all Welsh Assembly Government functions.

Mark Isherwood: We must celebrate diversity, remove barriers to access, ensure inclusion for all, and integrate respect for the principle of equality of opportunity into everything that we do. We support the amendment calling on the Assembly Government to ensure that its future reports not only set out equality outputs, but also measure improved equality outcomes. When we reviewed the Assembly Government's report in committee, I stated that it read, in part, regrettably like an election leaflet.

With reference to European funding, I referred to the Assembly visitor the previous day who told me that the courses that she was attending in her community, which were funded by the European social fund, were

cysylltiad â'r cynllun cydraddoldeb rhywiol. Gwyddoch fy mod wedi gofyn am i Gymru gael y pŵer i wneud ei rheoliadau ei hun, a fydd yn ein galluogi i gael ein dyletswydd cydraddoldeb rhywiol ein hun. Mae hynny'n gam ymlaen y dylem ei ddathlu heddiw hefyd, sef y gydnabyddiaeth bod gennym ein hanghenion a'n hamgylchiadau ein hunain yr ydym am eu cydnabod mewn cynllun cydraddoldeb rhywiol.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod llawer o waith yn cael ei wneud i sicrhau bod cydraddoldeb wrth wraidd y cwbl yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni. Mae'n taflu goleuni ar ein syniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol ynghylch cydraddoldeb ac ar feysydd gwaith newydd, fel y cynllun gweithredu sengl ar gydraddoldeb. Yr wyf yn croesawu penodiad Neil Wooding yn gomisiynydd newydd dros gydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol i Gymru, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Bydd y comisiwn cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol newydd yn trawsnewid yr agenda ar gydraddoldeb. Cafwyd llawer o fewnbwn a syniadau am y modd i hwyluso'r trawsnewid hwnnw gan y comisiynau presennol, sydd wedi chwarae rhan bwysig. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at weithio gyda'r comisiwn newydd, at y cyfleoedd a geir o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 o fis Mai nesaf, ac at sicrhau ein bod yn gwreiddio cydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn holl swyddogaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mark Isherwood: Rhaid inni ddathlu amrywiaeth, chwalu rhwystrau rhag mynediad, sicrhau cynhwysiant i bawb ac integreiddio parch at egwyddor cyfle cyfartal ym mhopeth a wnawn. Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r gwelliant sydd yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod ei hadroddiadau yn y dyfodol yn mesur gwell canlyniadau o ran cydraddoldeb, yn ogystal â nodi allbynnau ar gyfer cydraddoldeb. Pan adolygasom adroddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y pwyllgor, dywedais ei fod, gwaetha'r modd, yn darllen yn rhannol fel taflen etholiad.

Gyda golwg ar gyllid Ewropeaidd, cyfeiriais at un a fu'n ymweld â'r Cynulliad y diwrnod cynt a ddywedodd wrthyf fod y cyrsiau yr oedd yn eu dilyn yn ei chymuned, a oedd yn cael eu hariannu gan gronfa gymdeithasol

coming an end. We need to know what, if any, transitional provision has been made for what is a widespread problem across Wales, and one that was highlighted by the National Institute of Adult Continuing Education Cymru about a year and a half ago.

The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee has raised concerns about the educational needs of the children of migrant workers. In committee, I noted that Wrexham has the largest population of migrant workers in Wales, and expressed concern at the lack of UK Government funding to meet the consequent demand on local services. We must ensure that migrant workers and their families can live with dignity and that friction does not develop within communities.

I referred to the crisis in the youth justice system, noting that a large proportion of these young people have mental health problems or learning needs. Action is needed to address this. I also referred to bullying and to the group that had recently expressed concern to me that bullying strategies are too often bits of paper and do not inform the culture within schools. This is particularly the case for disabled young people and for those from black and minority ethnic communities and lesbian, gay and bisexual communities.

I referred to a parent of a child with an autism spectrum disorder who recently wrote to me to express concern about the lack of specialist teaching provision in mainstream schools for pupils with an autism spectrum disorder. We still need to address core teacher training on additional learning needs. As stated, the Assembly seeks to remove barriers to access and inclusion. However, the law of unintended outcomes often means that Assembly Government policy can itself create such barriers. Flexibility is therefore required to remove barriers that, for example—and I referred to this last week—prevent the new residential facilities for children with ASD at Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn from commencing preparations to open, despite being ready for use, and that prevent people in Wales with HIV/AIDS, unlike

Ewrop, yn dod i ben. Rhaid inni gael gwybod pa ddarpariaeth drosiannol a wnaed, os rhywbeth, i ddatrys problem sydd yn gyffredin ledled Cymru, ac yn un y tynnodd Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Addysg Barhaus i Oedolion Cymru sylw ati tua blwyddyn a hanner yn ôl.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi mynegi pryderon ynghylch anghenion addysgol plant i weithwyr mudol. Yn y pwyllgor, nodais mai yn Wrecsam y mae'r boblogaeth fwyaf o weithwyr mudol yng Nghymru, a mynegi pryder nad oedd Llywodraeth y DU wedi darparu cyllid i ateb y galw ar wasanaethau lleol o ganlyniad i hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gweithwyr mudol a'u teuluoedd yn gallu byw gydag urddas ac na fydd cynnen yn codi mewn cymunedau.

Cyfeiriais at yr argyfwng yn y system cyfiawnder ieuenctid, gan nodi bod problemau iechyd meddwl neu anghenion dysgu gan gyfran fawr o'r bobl ifanc hynny. Rhaid cymryd camau i ddelio â hynny. Cyfeiriais hefyd at fwlio ac at y grŵp a fynegodd pryder wrthyf yn ddiweddar gan ddweud mai darnau o bapur yw strategaethau bwlio'n aml iawn ac nad ydynt yn dylanwadu ar yr arferion mewn ysgolion. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir yn achos plant ifanc anabl a rhai o gymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig a chymunedau lesbiaidd, hoyw a deurywiol.

Cyfeiriais at riant i blentyn sydd ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistiaeth a ysgrifennodd ataf yn ddiweddar i fynegi pryder am y diffyg darpariaeth dysgu arbenigol mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd ar gyfer disgyblion sydd ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistiaeth. Mae angen o hyd inni roi sylw i hyfforddiant craidd i athrawon ar anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Fel y dywedwyd, mae'r Cynulliad yn ceisio chwalu rhwystrau rhag mynediad a chynhwysiant. Er hynny, yn groes i'r bwriad, mae polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu codi rhwystrau o'r fath ei hun. Mae angen hyblygrwydd felly i chwalu rhwystrau sydd, er enghraifft—a chyfeiriais at hyn yr wythnos diwethaf—yn atal y cyfleusterau preswyl newydd i blant ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistiaeth yn Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn rhag cychwyn

people in England with HIV/AIDS, being referred to Tyddyn Bach respite centre in Penmaenmawr, which is the only such centre in England and Wales. Barriers are also raised when, without there being a replacement, the only civilian centre for ex-service personnel with post traumatic stress disorder and associated substance misuse problems in the UK has been closed. Worryingly, the numbers of such people are increasing because of current conflicts, and this has had a direct impact in suicides, homelessness and violent crime.

With regard to the strategy for older people, I highlighted in committee concern that one local authority in north Wales is considering replacing the county's older people's forum with a new body of 12 appointed persons. This could set a dangerous precedent if it silences the voice of grass-roots opinion. It is essential that this body is shaped, participated in and controlled by those who qualify by age or special interest, rather than being directed from the local authority downward. The engagement and participation of older people must continue to drive the strategy for older people. As Housing Forum Cymru states:

'Housing is creating a more divided Wales.'

It goes on to say that, in both Welsh and English-language communities, that has

'consequences for social cohesion and reduced life chances'.

Housing has been raised increasingly in the committee as an equality issue. So, in tackling the Welsh housing crisis, we must therefore also tackle the housing needs of lesbian, gay and bisexual people, disabled young people, older people and the black and minority ethnic community. As the north Wales race equality network recently told me, there is a need for the Assembly Government to provide accessible legal

paratoadau i agor, er eu bod yn barod i'w defnyddio, ac yn atal pobl yng Nghymru sydd â HIV/AIDS, yn wahanol i bobl yn Lloegr sydd â HIV/AIDS, rhag cael eu hatgyfeirio i ganolfan gofal seibiant Tyddyn Bach ym Mhenmaen-mawr, sef yr unig ganolfan o'i bath yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Codwyd rhwystrau hefyd pan gaewyd yr unig ganolfan sifil yn y DU i gyn-aelodau'r lluoedd arfog sydd ag anhwylder straen wedi trawma a phroblemau o ran camddefnyddio sylweddau sydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny, heb fod un i gymryd ei lle. Mae'n destun pryder bod mwy o bobl o'r fath oherwydd y brwydro sydd ar hyn o bryd, ac mae hynny wedi cael effaith uniongyrchol ar ffurf achosion o hunanladdiad, digartrefedd a throseddau treisgar.

Gyda golwg ar y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, tynnais sylw yn y pwyllgor at bryder bod un awdurdod lleol yn y Gogledd yn ystyried rhoi corff newydd o 12 o bobl benodedig yn lle fforwm pobl hŷn y sir. Gallai hynny osod cynsail peryglus os bydd yn mygu barn rhai ar lawr gwlad. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r corff hwn gynnwys rhai sydd yn gymwys oherwydd eu hoed neu fuddiant arbennig ac iddo gael ei siapio a'i reoli ganddynt, yn hytrach na'i fod yn cael ei gyfarwyddo o'r pen i lawr gan yr awdurdod lleol. Rhaid parhau i yrru'r strategaeth i bobl hŷn yn ei blaen drwy ymgysylltu â phobl hŷn a chael cyfranogiad ganddynt. Fel y dywed Fforwm Tai Cymru:

Mae tai'n creu Cymru fwy rhanedig.

Mae'n mynd ymlaen i ddweud bod hynny, mewn cymunedau Cymraeg a Saesneg eu hiaith, wedi arwain at

ganlyniadau o ran cydlyniaeth gymdeithasol a chyfleoedd bywyd llai.

Mae mater tai wedi'i godi'n amlach yn y pwyllgor fel un sydd yn ymwneud â chydarddoldeb. Felly, wrth fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai yng Nghymru, rhaid inni hefyd ddelio ag anghenion tai pobl lesbiaidd, hoyw a deurywiol, pobl ifanc anabl, pobl hŷn a'r gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Fel y dywedodd rhwydwaith cydraddoldeb hiliol gogledd Cymru wrthyf yn ddiweddar, mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad

guidelines for the statutory and voluntary sectors on these issues. It also highlighted the need for mediation services that will intervene before anxieties develop into serious situations within and between communities.

On mental health, Mind describes this as a cinderella service, and the Welsh Local Government Association describes the current situation as 'unsustainable'. As we heard two weeks ago, the mental health charity Hafal seeks to give ownership to service users, but only yesterday I was in a meeting with a county council at which service users stated that consultation had not made a scrap of difference and that instead of promoting independence, the council was promoting isolation.

The Assembly has made advances in the fulfilment of its equality duties, but I have used my contribution today to highlight real issues that must be addressed if real outcomes are to be delivered on a sustainable basis for us all and all those whom we represent.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the seventh annual equality report, and regard it as a reminder that, despite all the mechanisms that we have in place to protect our rights and freedoms in many situations, we cannot just sit back and forget about it. For those of you who think that we are making progress, I remind you that, 40 years on, we are still trying to establish the most basic situation on equal pay in many of our public services, let alone the private sector. So, there is still a long way to go.

We shall be supporting Plaid Cymru's amendment. The reporting of outcomes as well as outputs will play a vital role in ascertaining how effective the Government's measures are for mainstreaming equality. I would characterise the Government's report as having a tendency to count the quantity rather than the quality of action. Although considerable progress has been made, I am

ddarparu canllawiau cyfreithiol hawdd eu deall i'r sectorau statudol a gwirfoddol ar y materion hyn. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at yr angen am wasanaethau canoli a fydd yn ymyrryd cyn i bryderon droi'n sefyllfaoedd difrifol o fewn cymunedau a rhyngddynt.

Ynghylch iechyd meddwl, mae Mind yn ei alw'n wasanaeth isradd, ac mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n dweud bod y sefyllfa bresennol yn 'anghynaliadwy'. Fel y clywsom bythefnos yn ôl, mae'r elusen iechyd meddwl Hafal yn ceisio rhoi perchnogaeth i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau, ond ddoe ddiwethaf bûm mewn cyfarfod â chyngor sir lle y dywedodd defnyddwyr gwasanaethau nad oedd ymgynghori wedi gwneud yr un iot o wahaniaeth a bod y cyngor yn hyrwyddo arwahanu yn hytrach na hyrwyddo annibyniaeth.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gwneud cynnydd o ran cyflawni ei ddyletswyddau cydraddoldeb, ond yr wyf wedi defnyddio fy nghyfraniad heddiw i dynnu sylw at faterion penodol y mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw iddynt os yw canlyniadau pendant i'w sicrhau'n barhaus er mwyn pawb ohonom ni a phawb yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli.

Jenny Randerson: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r seithfed adroddiad blynyddol ar gydraddoldeb, ac yn ystyried ei fod yn ein hatgoffa, er gwaethaf yr holl fecanweithiau sydd ar waith gennym i ddiogelu ein hawliau a'n rhyddid mewn llawer o sefyllfaoedd, na allwn laesu dwylo ac anghofio amdano. Er mwyn y rhai ohonoch sydd yn credu ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd, yr wyf yn eich atgoffa ein bod, wedi 40 mlynedd, yn dal i geisio sicrhau'r sefyllfa fwyaf elfennol o ran cyflog cyfartal mewn llawer o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, heb sôn am y sector preifat. Felly, mae llawer iawn i'w wneud eto.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Drwy adrodd ar ganlyniadau yn ogystal ag allbynnau, ceir modd hollbwysig i ganfod pa mor effeithiol yw mesurau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer prif ffrydio cydraddoldeb. Pe byddwn yn disgrifio adroddiad y Llywodraeth, dywedwn fod tuedd ynddo i gyfrif nifer yn hytrach nag ansawdd y camau gweithredu. Er y cafwyd cryn gynnydd, gyda llawer o

sure with a great deal of involvement by the Minister to improve matters, there is still a way to go.

I wish to raise one issue in relation to the Government in particular, namely my recurring theme of job advertisements. This issue has come up time and again. I raised it in the debate on the sixth annual equality report. I was interested to note that it came out of the review of the English-language newspapers in Wales conducted by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee. When other committees start saying it too, you have to take notice. If the Government is serious about the value of a diverse body of staff, it will have to work harder to place job advertisements where underrepresented groups can reach them. It is not as though it does not make much financial difference. We spend a great deal of money on job advertisements.

Despite the efforts of the past seven years to raise the profile of equality issues, it was interesting to discover from this report that the wider perception of some minority groups in Wales is that the Welsh Assembly Government is still an unattractive place to work. That is very worrying, because the Government has stated its commitment to equality on many occasions. There is clearly still a great deal of work to be done on the practical side of recruitment of minority groups. I believe that there is a communication issue here. The work that has been undertaken to mainstream equality by the Assembly and the Assembly Government must be as accessible as possible to the Welsh public. That means that the Government must ensure that that is communicated as widely as possible, and in the broadest range of forms.

5.30 p.m.

The Assembly Government's diversity survey had a response rate of 90 per cent, which is strikingly high. It revealed a significantly higher proportion of self-

ymwneud gan y Gweinidog i wella pethau, yr wyf yn siŵr, mae cryn waith i'w wneud eto.

Yr wyf yn dymuno codi un mater sydd yn ymwneud â'r Llywodraeth yn benodol, sef mater hysbysebion swyddi, y byddaf yn cyfeirio ato'n aml. Mae'r mater hwn wedi codi dro ar ôl tro. Fe'i codais yn y ddadl ar y chweched adroddiad blynyddol ar gydraddoldeb. Yr oedd o ddiddordeb imi nodi iddo godi o'r adolygiad o'r papurau newydd Saesneg yng Nghymru a gynhaliwyd gan Bwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon. Pan yw pwyllgorau eraill yn dechrau dweud hyn hefyd, rhaid ichi gymryd sylw. Os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch y gwerth o gael corff staff amrywiol, bydd yn rhaid iddi weithio'n galetach i osod hysbysebion swyddi mewn mannau lle y gall grwpiau sydd wedi'u tangynrychioli eu cyrraedd. Mae'n sicr o wneud gwahaniaeth yn ariannol. Yr ydym yn gwario llawer iawn o arian ar hysbysebion swyddi.

Er gwaethaf yr ymdrechion dros y saith mlynedd diwethaf i roi lle amlycach i faterion sydd yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb, yr oedd yn ddiddorol darganfod o ddarllen yr adroddiad hwn mai'r farn gyffredinol ymysg rhai grwpiau lleiafrifol yng Nghymru yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dal i fod yn lle annymunol i weithio. Mae hynny'n peri pryder mawr, gan fod y Llywodraeth wedi datgan ei hymrwymiad i gydraddoldeb lawer gwaith. Mae'n amlwg bod llawer o waith i'w wneud eto ar yr agwedd ymarferol ar recriwtio grwpiau lleiafrifol. Yr wyf yn credu bod anhawster o ran cyfathrebu yn hyn o beth. Rhaid i'r gwaith a wnaed i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb gan y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod mor ddealladwy ag y bo modd i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n golygu bod rhaid i'r Llywodraeth sicrhau y lledaenir gwybodaeth amdano mor eang â phosibl, ac ar gynifer o wahanol ffurfiau ag y bo modd.

Cafwyd cyfradd ymateb o 90 y cant i'r arolwg o amrywiaeth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac mae hynny'n drawiadol o uchel. Dangosodd cyfran uwch o bobl anabl

reported disabled people than was thought. This emphasises the importance of collecting accurate data, not simply about who works here, but throughout Wales. How can the Welsh Assembly Government mould service delivery and good practice—the very basis of ensuring that we are reaching people properly—if we do not know who we are dealing with? Therefore, the Government needs to collect better data.

We welcome the Minister's commitment to the Assembly being given the power to make its own regulations in pursuit of a specific gender equality duty. The committee was unanimous in feeling that the acceptance of a watered-down version from the Westminster Government would have seriously undermined the good work done by the equal-pay campaign. We were pleased with the committee's united message, and with the Minister's persistence and considerable success in this regard.

On childcare, for all the rhetoric, until we have good childcare facilities here—for staff and Assembly Members—we are undermining our own rhetoric.

Finally, I thank Gwenda and the committee's standing invitees. As Chair of the committee, Gwenda has led with shining example, and it is very much thanks to her stand that we will have an equality committee in the new Assembly. That is an important legacy of the work of the current committee.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawn yr adroddiad hwn, a'r pwyllgor newydd a gaiff ei sefydlu dros hawliau dynol yn gyffredinol, cyhyd ag y gall y pwyllgor newydd hwnnw warchod yr amrywiaeth o agweddau a ddaw o dan yr ymbarél newydd.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen gwell datblygiad, a bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad, o fis Mai nesaf, wneud mwy o ymdrech. Dylai pob Gweinidog, a phob pwyllgor, hawlio perchnogaeth ar gydraddoldeb. Fel y dywedodd Jenny, mae eisiau bod yn fwy hyblyg o ran cydbwysu gwaith a bywyd teulu, a dylem sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwell cyfleusterau gwarchod plant.

hunan-gofnodedig nag a dybiwyd. Mae hyn yn pwysleisio mor bwysig yw casglu data cywir, nid dim ond ynglŷn â phwy sy'n gweithio yma, ond drwy Gymru gyfan. Sut all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fowldio cyflwyniad gwasanaethau ac ymarfer da—holl sail sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd pobl yn iawn—os na wyddom gyda phwy yr ydym yn delio? Felly, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth gasglu data gwell.

Croesawn ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros i'r Cynulliad gael y grym wneud ei reoliadau ei hun ar drywydd dyletswydd benodol o ran cydraddoldeb rhywiol. Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn teimlo'n unfryd y buasai derbyn fersiwn glastweiddiedig oddi wrth Lywodraeth San Steffan wedi tansilio'n ddifrifol y gwaith da a wnaethpwyd gan yr ymgyrch dros gyflog cyfartal. Yr oeddem yn falch gyda neges unfryd y pwyllgor, a chyda dyfalbarhad a chryn lwyddiant y Gweinidog yn hyn o beth.

Ynglŷn â gofal plant, er yr holl rethreg, hyd nes y bydd gennym gyfleusterau da yma ar gyfer gofal plant—i staff ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad—yr ydym yn tansilio ein rethreg ein hunain.

Yn olaf, diolch i Gwenda a gwahoddedigion sefydlog y pwyllgor. Fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, mae Gwenda wedi arwain trwy esiampl ddisglair, ac i'w safiad hi y mae'r diolch yn bennaf y bydd gennym bwyllgor cydraddoldeb yn y Cynulliad newydd. Dyna waddol pwysig i waith y pwyllgor cyfredol.

Eleanor Burnham: We welcome this report, and the new committee that will be established to consider human rights in general, as long as that committee is able to safeguard the diversity of aspects that come under the new umbrella.

However, we need better development, and the Assembly, from next May, will have to make a greater effort. Every Minister and committee should take ownership of equality. As Jenny said, we need to be more flexible regarding work/life balance, and we should ensure that we establish better childminding facilities.

Dylem hefyd sicrhau gwell defnydd o'r iaith Gymraeg. Yr ydym i gyd yn ceisio'n gorau—mae gwallau weithiau, ac nid yw pawb mor hyderus â'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, dylai pob un ohonom—ar draws y Cynulliad—wneud gwell defnydd o'r iaith Gymraeg.

Dylem hefyd sicrhau gwell cynnydd o ran materion cynaliadwy yn gyffredinol, gan mai dyna'r ddau bwnc sydd yn croesi pob pwyllgor. Teimlaf yn gryf y dylem wneud hynny.

Gwenda Thomas: I am pleased to welcome a degree of political consensus in the Chamber this afternoon; I believe that you would endorse that, Helen Mary—indeed, you referred to political consensus. You also referred to the Government's report and outcomes, and I am more than prepared and happy to support the amendment that you have tabled to this debate. You also mentioned the real progress that has been made towards equality of opportunity.

Mark Isherwood, your comments on the importance of outcomes are also noted. You referred to mental health issues, bullying, and other concerns regarding inequalities. I am sure that the Minister will take those comments on board.

I thank you for your comments on my chairing, Jenny. You referred to equal pay; I will mention that when I come to the Minister's contribution. You also mentioned outcomes, and made comments for the Welsh Assembly Government, the Assembly Parliamentary Service, and the Assembly itself, on employment and childcare issues. Those issues have regularly been discussed at the Committee on Equality of Opportunity.

Eleanor Burnham, soniasoch am hybu lles teuluol. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno â hynny.

William, we thank you for your contribution as Chair of the House Committee. You pointed to the progress made by the Assembly Parliamentary Service on equality issues. I believe that your contribution was largely supportive of the report in front of us this afternoon.

We should also ensure that better use is made of the Welsh language. We all try our best—there are sometimes mistakes, and some of us are not as confident as others. However, all of us—across the Assembly—should make better use of the Welsh language.

We should also secure better progress with sustainability issues generally, as those are the two cross-cutting subjects. I feel strongly that we should do that.

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch o groesawu rhyw radd o gonsensws gwleidyddol yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma; credaf yr ategoch chi hynny, Helen Mary—yn wir, cyfeiriasoch at gonsensws gwleidyddol. Soniasoch hefyd am adroddiad a chanlyniadau'r Llywodraeth, ac yr wyf yn fwy na pharod a bodlon i gefnogi'r gwelliant yr ydych wedi'i gyflwyno i'r ddadl hon. Bu ichi grybwyll hefyd y camau gwirioneddol ymlaen a gymerwyd tuag at gyfle cyfartal.

Mark Isherwood, nodir eich sylwadau chithau ar bwysigrwydd canlyniadau. Cyfeiriasoch at faterion iechyd meddwl, bwlio, a phryderon eraill ynghylch anghydraddoldeb. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn y sylwadau hynny i'w hystyried.

Diolch am eich sylwadau ar fy nghadeiryddiaeth, Jenny. Cyfeiriasoch at gyflogau cyfartal; soniaf am hynny pan ddeuaf at gyfraniad y Gweinidog. Cyfeiriasoch hefyd at ganlyniadau, a gwnaethoch sylwadau i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, a'r Cynulliad ei hun, ar faterion cyflogaeth a gofal plant. Mae'r materion hynny wedi'u trafod yn rheolaidd yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

Eleanor Burnham, you mentioned promoting family wellbeing. I am sure that we all agree with that.

William, diolchwn i chi am eich cyfraniad yng Nghadair Pwyllgor y Tŷ. Cyfeiriasoch at y camau ymlaen a gymerwyd gan Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ar faterion cydraddoldeb. Credaf fod eich cyfraniad ar y cyfan yn cefnogi'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron y prynhawn yma.

Minister, I thank you for recognising the extent of the work that has already been done and for the way in which you recognised the important work of the committee. You mentioned the importance of mainstreaming equality and the recognition across Welsh Assembly Government portfolios of the importance of being able to measure these outcomes. I am sure that we look forward to further progress in next year's report. I am pleased that you mentioned the single equality action plan and the transfer of functions with regard to gender equality; we all wish you well with those negotiations.

Weinidog, diolch i chi am gydnabod cymaint o waith sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud ac am y ffordd y bu ichi gydnabod gwaith pwysig y pwyllgor. Soniasoch am bwysigrwydd dod â chydardoldeb i'r brif ffrwd a chydabod ar draws portffolios Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mor bwysig yw gallu mesur y canlyniadau hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod yn edrych ymlaen at ddatblygiadau pellach yn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf yn falch ichi grybwyll yr un cynllun gweithredu dros gydraddoldeb a throsglwyddo swyddogaethau yng nghyswllt cydraddoldeb rhywiol; yr ydym i gyd yn dymuno'n dda ichi yn y trafodaethau hynny.

I will end by saying that there will be another report on the third Assembly, but that will be after we have a fourth Assembly. I am sure that we are all pleased that statutory responsibility in terms of equality of opportunity will continue and that it will be a responsibility for the new Welsh Assembly Government, for the new Assembly Commission and for the Assembly as a legislature. We will remain, in that case, unique as a legislature in the democratic process.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddweud y ceir adroddiad arall ar y trydydd Cynulliad, ond mai ar ôl inni gael pedwerydd Cynulliad y bydd hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn falch y bydd cyfrifoldeb statudol yn nhermau cyfle cyfartal yn parhau ac y bydd yn gyfrifoldeb i Lywodraeth newydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i Gomisiwn newydd y Cynulliad ac i'r Cynulliad fel deddfwrfa. Byddwn yn parhau, yn yr achos hwnnw, yn unigryw fel deddfwrfa yn y broses ddemocrataidd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 1: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

Motion (NDM3358) as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales acting
 under Standing Order No. 6.6(ix):*

*1. notes the National Assembly for Wales:
 arrangements to promote equality of
 opportunity—financial year 2005-06 which
 was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to
 Assembly Members on 28 November 2006;
 and*

*2. calls on the Assembly Government to
 ensure that future reports measure improved
 equality outcomes as well as setting out
 equality outputs.*

Cynnig (NDM3358) fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan
 weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6
 (ix):*

*1. yn nodi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:
 trefniadau i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal—
 blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06 a osodwyd yn y
 Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at
 Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 28 Tachwedd 2006;
 ac*

*2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i
 sicrhau bod adroddiadau'r dyfodol yn mesur
 canlyniadau gwell o ran cydraddoldeb yn
 ogystal â phennu allbynnau cydraddoldeb.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Amended motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
completes business for this afternoon. chyarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.36 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.36 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)