



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 4 Gorffennaf 2006  
Tuesday, 4 July 2006**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- 3 Cyflwyno Aelod Newydd  
Introduction of a New Member
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 33 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 37 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio  
Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006  
Approval of the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area)  
(County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006
- 49 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Taliadau Colli Cartref (Symiau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Home Loss Payments (Prescribed Amounts) (Wales) Regulations 2006
- 52 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 a  
Chyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda  
Cynon Taf 2006  
Approval of the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment) Order  
2006 and the Directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda Cynon Taf  
Local Health Board 2006
- 60 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a  
Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006  
Approval of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales)  
(Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006
- 72 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol)  
(Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments)  
(Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006
- 78 Cymeradwyo Meini Prawf ar gyfer Achredu Hyfforddiant Cychwynnol Athrawon gan  
Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru 2006 a Safonau Statws Athro Cymwysedig 2006  
o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval of the Criteria for Initial Teacher Training Accreditation by the Higher  
Education Funding Council for Wales 2006 and the Qualified Teacher Status Standards  
2006 under Standing Order No. 29
- 83 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Gemau'r Gymanwlad  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Commonwealth Games
- 110 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 gan Michael German  
Standing Order No. 31 Proposal by Michael German

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Cyflwyno Aelod Newydd Introduction of a New Member**

**Y Llywydd:** Fy ngorchwyl cyntaf y prynhawn yma yw croesawu Aelod newydd Blaenau Gwent.

You are very welcome, Trish Law. [Applause.]

**Trish Law:** Thank you, Mr Presiding Officer, for the very warm welcome shown to me, and for the assistance and support of your staff. As you all know, I am here to represent the people of Blaenau Gwent. I look forward to my role as Assembly Member, representing my constituency and working for its benefit and for Wales as a whole. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

**The Presiding Officer:** My first assignment this afternoon is to welcome the new Member for Blaenau Gwent.

Mae croeso mawr i chi, Trish Law. [Cymeradwyaeth.]

**Trish Law:** Diolch, Mr Llywydd, am y croeso cynnes iawn a ddangoswyd imi, ac am gymorth a chefnogaeth eich staff. Fel y gwyddoch i gyd, yr wyf yma i gynrychioli pobl Blaenau Gwent. Edrychaf ymlaen at fy rôl fel Aelod Cynulliad, yn cynrychioli fy etholaeth ac yn gweithio er ei lles a thros Gymru gyfan. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Addewidion Allweddol a wnaed yn ystod yr Etholiadau Key Election Pledges**

2

**Q1 Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's ability to deliver on key election pledges made during the 2003 Assembly elections? OAQ1735(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** With the one exception that we have discussed on dozens of occasions, we are well on our way to delivering the promises that were made in the 2003 elections. A token of that is that, by next summer, we expect 557 primary schools in Wales to participate in the free breakfast scheme.

**Alun Cairns:** Is not the reality that you promised to deliver free homecare for the disabled, free school breakfasts for all primary school children, and to increase the number of students in further education, but have failed on all counts? Is not the reality that you are presiding over a tired Government, a failing Government, and that that was the judgment of Blaenau Gwent last

**C1 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am allu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wireddu'r addewidion allweddol a wnaed yn ystod etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2003? OAQ1735(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Gyda'r un eithriad a drafodwyd gennym ar ddwsinau o achlysuron, yr ydym ar fin gwireddu'r addewidion a wnaed yn etholiadau 2003. Arwydd o hynny yw ein bod yn disgwyl, erbyn yr haf nesaf, i 557 o ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru gymryd rhan yn y cynllun brecwast am ddim.

**Alun Cairns:** Onid y realiti yw ichi addo darparu gofal cartref am ddim i'r anabl, brecwast ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd, a chynyddu niferoedd myfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach, ond eich bod wedi methu ym mhob un o'r meysydd hynny? Onid y gwir yw eich bod yn arwain Llywodraeth flinedig, Llywodraeth sydd yn methu, ac mai dyna oedd barn Blaenau

week, which is why it is not a Labour Member who is sitting opposite us in the Chamber?

**The First Minister:** If I were a Conservative, I do not think that I would have the brass neck to be crowing about the election result in Blaenau Gwent, or in Bromley and Chislehurst; I would be keeping very quiet.

As regards the facts, rather than the smears and sneers that I have become accustomed to hearing from you, Alun, with the exception of the one issue on which we have had to accept that we cannot deliver our election promise—although the £75 million commitment to the alternative scheme will provide, we believe, a very good service to a wider range of people than was originally covered by that manifesto pledge—we are meeting our election promises. I have mentioned the 557 primary schools that we expect to participate fully in the free breakfast scheme, and I have also mentioned in the annual report, which we will have ample opportunity to debate shortly, how fully—with that one exception—we are meeting our election promises.

**John Griffiths:** Rhodri, on pledges regarding environmental issues, particularly renewable energy, and bearing in mind our statutory commitment to promote sustainable development, could you assure me that any feasibility study into a possible Severn barrage will include other potential means of generating energy from the Severn estuary, such as tidal lagoons?

**The First Minister:** If, on closer inspection, tidal lagoons provide better value for money than a Severn barrage would, we would be very happy to accept that as the best way forward. There is clearly a huge amount of energy in the 5 cu km of water that goes up and down the Severn every 12 and a half hours, and so it is a question of how you trap that energy and generate useful, reasonably costed electricity from it. We have taken the view that it should go into the pot for consideration, alongside nuclear power, in the Government's energy review. Likewise, if tidal lagoons are a better way of trapping

Gwent yr wythnos diwethaf, sef y rheswm pam nad Aelod Llafur sydd yn eistedd gyferbyn â ni yn y Siambr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe bawn i'n Geidwadwr, nid wyf yn meddwl y byddai'r wyneb gennyf i glochdar am ganlyniad yr etholiad ym Mlaenau Gwent, nac yn Bromley a Chislehurst; byddwn yn cadw'n dawel iawn.

Ynglŷn â'r ffeithiau, yn hytrach na'r pardduo a'r gwawdio yr wyf wedi arfer ei glywed bellach gennyh chi, Alun, ac eithrio'r un mater lle'r ydym wedi gorfod derbyn na allwn wireddu'r addewid a wnaethom yn yr etholiad—er y bydd yr ymrwymiad o £75 miliwn i'r cynllun amgen, yn ein tyb ni, yn darparu gwasanaeth da iawn i amrediad ehangach o bobl nag a gynhwysid yn wreiddiol yn yr addewid maniffesto hwnnw—yr ydym yn gwireddu'r addewidion a wnaethom yn yr etholiad. Yr wyf wedi sôn am y 557 o ysgolion cynradd y disgwyliwn y byddant yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y cynllun brechwast am ddim, ac yr wyf wedi sôn hefyd yn yr adroddiad blynyddol, y cawn ddigon o gyfle i'w drafod toc, mor llwyr—gyda'r un eithriad hwnnw—yr ydym yn gwireddu'r addewidion a wnaethom yn ystod yr etholiad.

**John Griffiths:** Rhodri, ynglŷn ag addewidion ar faterion amgylcheddol, yn enwedig ynni adnewyddadwy, a chan gofio ein hymrwymiad statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, a allech roi sicrwydd imi y bydd unrhyw astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i forglawdd posibl yn aber Hafren yn cynnwys dulliau posibl eraill o gynhyrchu ynni o aber Hafren, megis morlynnoedd llanw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os canfyddir, wedi archwilio'n fanylach, fod morlynnoedd llanw'n cynnig gwell gwerth am arian nag y byddai morglawdd Hafren, byddem yn fodlon iawn derbyn hynny fel y ffordd orau ymlaen. Yn amlwg mae llawer iawn o ynni yn y 5 km ciwbig o ddŵr a aiff i fyny ac i lawr afon Hafren bob 12 awr a hanner, a'r cwestiwn felly yw sut y mae dal yr ynni hwnnw a chreu trydan buddiol, ar gost resymol, ohono. Yr ydym o'r farn y dylai fynd i mewn i'r crochan i'w ystyried, ochr yn ochr ag ynni niwclear, yn adolygiad ynni'r Llywodraeth. Yn yr un modd, os yw morlynnoedd llanw'n

water and generating electricity at a better cost, and can be done more incrementally than the barrage, that is fine. We would not have a problem with that. We do not want to see the energy going to waste.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Er gwaethaf eich ymateb i Alun Cairns, Brif Weinidog, mae arnaf ofn bod rhaid dweud wrthyf fod nifer cynyddol o bobl Cymru yn gweld eich Llywodraeth fel un sydd wedi torri ei haddewidion.

Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio yn benodol at ofal cartref am ddim i'r anabl; gwyddoch fod lobi o bobl anabl wedi bod yma heddiw i danlinellu'r methiant hwnnw. Un arall yw'r ffaith eich bod wedi dweud y byddai nifer myfyrwyr colegau addysg bellach yn codi rhwng 2003 a 2007; mae'r nifer wedi mynd i lawr o 7,500. Onid ydych yn derbyn fod eich Llywodraeth wedi colli'i ffordd, a bod eich awdurdod chi fel Prif Weinidog yn dechrau lithro i ffwrdd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ddim o gwbl. Pe bai Plaid Cymru wedi ennill canran sylweddol, neu hyd yn oed resymol, yn y ddau isetholiad ddydd Iau diwethaf, efallai y byddai gennych sail i'ch ymosodiad—os oes modd ei ddisgrifio felly—arnaf fi, ar y Blaid Lafur neu ar y weinyddiaeth y mae'n fraint i mi ei harwain. Wrth edrych ar y ffigurau o ran buddsoddiad mewn ysgolion, buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar ieuchyd, ac ar bob un o'n haddewidion ac eithrio'r un lle'r ydym wedi gorfod derbyn bod ffordd well o symud ymlaen, er ei fod wedi golygu torri addewid i bobl anabl—datganaf fuddiant teuluol yn hynny—mae ein record yn un arbennig o dda.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwyddoch eich bod hefyd wedi torri eich addewid ar fwy o fyfyrwyr mewn colegau addysg bellach. Mae'n rhaid i chi gydnabod, Brif Weinidog, mai'r blaid a ddiodefodd y gnoc fwyaf oherwydd y canlyniad ym Mlaenau Gwent oedd eich plaid chi. Eich plaid chi oedd yn cadw un o'r seddi mwyaf diogel yng ngwledydd Prydain, a'ch plaid chi sydd wedi ei cholli. Eich plaid chi sy'n dioddef oherwydd hynny. Fodd bynnag, os nad ydych yn fodlon cydnabod bod toriadau wedi'u

ffordd well o ddal dŵr a chynhyrchu trydan ar gost well, ac y gellir ei wneud yn fwy cynyddrannol na'r morglawdd, popeth yn iawn. Ni fyddai gennym broblem gyda hynny. Nid oes arnom eisiau gweld yr ynni'n mynd yn wastraff.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Despite your response to Alun Cairns, First Minister, I am afraid that I must tell you that a growing number of people in Wales see your Government as one that has broken its promises.

You referred specifically to free homecare for the disabled; you know that a lobby of disabled people has been here today to underline that failure. Another is the fact that you said that the number of students in further education colleges would increase between 2003 and 2007; the number has gone down by 7,500. Do you not accept that your Government has lost its way, and that your authority as First Minister is beginning to ebb away?

**The First Minister:** Not at all. Had Plaid Cymru won a significant, or even reasonable, percentage of votes in last Thursday's two by-elections you might have some basis for your attack—if it can be described as such—on me, on the Labour Party or on the administration that it is my privilege to lead. Looking at the figures in terms of investment in schools, capital investment in health, and on all of our promises with the exception of the one promise where we have had to accept that there is a better way of moving forward, even though it has meant breaking our promise to the disabled—I declare a family interest in that—our record is particularly good.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You know that you have also broken your promise on more students in further education colleges. You must accept, First Minister, that it is your party that has suffered the greatest setback from the Blaenau Gwent result. Your party held one of the safest seats in Britain, and your party lost it. It is your party that is suffering as a result. However, if you are not willing to accept that you have broken your promises, this is an opportunity for you to regain some of your authority. You can answer three fundamental

gwneud yn eich addewidion, dyma gyfle i chi adfer rhywfaint ar eich awdurdod. Gallwch ateb dri chwestiwn sylfaenol yr ydych wedi gwrthod eu hateb yn y gorffennol. A wnewch chi eu hateb heddiw, os gwelwch yn dda? A ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn y rhyfel yn Irac? A ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn uno heddluoedd Cymru? A ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn cau swyddfeydd post? Gadewch inni gael ateb am unwaith.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gadewch inni gael cwestiynau sy'n ymwneud â'n haddewidion. Yr oeddech yn ceisio dweud ein bod wedi torri ein haddewidion, ond yr ydych yn awr yn derbyn nad ydym wedi gwneud hynny, felly yr ydych yn symud i bwnc arall. Y cwbl yr ydych yn ei wneud yw cydnabod y gallwn ddweud, â balchder, ein bod wedi cyflawni'r addewidion a wnaethom i etholwyr Cymru yn 2003, heblaw am yr un eithriad y soniais amdano. Gallwn sefyll—ac ennill—ar y record honno y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is pretty obvious that yours is a Government littered with broken promises; we have given you sufficient examples. You, as the First Minister of Wales, have failed to show leadership on any of the key issues facing our nation; you hide behind the fact that these are matters to be decided upon elsewhere. How can you expect the people of Wales to support a lame-duck Government, run by a First Minister who is no longer fit for purpose?

**The First Minister:** That is remarkably tired stuff. I remember Denis Healey referring to Geoffrey Howe's attacks on him as like being savaged by a dead sheep; I do not know what that was, but it was terribly tired stuff. You must come up with some fresh ideas to explain how Plaid Cymru did so appallingly badly in the by-election, and why people showed absolutely no faith in you. When Labour took a knock, we took a knock. Who did the people turn to? Was it Plaid Cymru? No. Have you asked yourself why that was? It is because of your lack of leadership and your inability to bring forward serious questions to the Assembly.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you find it as amazing as

questions that you have refused to answer in the past. Will you please answer them today? Are you for or against the war in Iraq? Are you for or against merging the Welsh police forces? Are you for or against closing post offices? Let us have an answer for once.

**The First Minister:** Let us have some questions that are about our promises. You were trying to say that we had broken our promises, but you now accept that we have not done that, so you are moving to another subject. All that you are doing is accepting that we can say, with pride, that we have fulfilled the promises that we made to the Welsh electorate in 2003, with the one exception that I mentioned. We will be able to stand—and win—on that record next year.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n eithaf amlwg mai Llywodraeth sy'n llawn addewidion wedi'u torri yw eich Llywodraeth chi; yr ydym wedi rhoi digon o enghreifftiau ichi. Yr ydych chi, fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, wedi methu â dangos arweiniad ar ddim un o'r materion allweddol sydd yn wynebu ein cenedl; yr ydych yn cuddio y tu ôl i'r ffaith mai materion i'w penderfynu yn rhywle arall yw'r rhain. Sut y gallwch ddisgwyl i bobl Cymru gefnogi Llywodraeth gloff, sy'n cael ei rhedeg gan Brif Weinidog nad yw'n addas i'w ddiben mwyach?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Stwff hynod o flinedig yw hynny. Cofiaf Denis Healey'n sôn bod ymosodiadau Geoffrey Howe arno fel cael ei larpio gan ddafad farw; ni wn beth oedd hynny, ond yr oedd yn stwff ofnadwy o flinedig. Rhaid ichi ganfod syniadau newydd i esbonio sut y gwnaeth Plaid Cymru mor affwysol o wael yn yr isetholiad, a pham na ddangosodd pobl ronyn o ffydd ynoch. Pan gafodd Llafur gnoc, fe gawsom gnoc. At bwy y trodd y bobl? Ai Plaid Cymru? Nage. A ydych wedi gofyn i chi'ch hun pam y digwyddodd hynny? Oherwydd eich diffyg arweiniad a'ch anallu i gyflwyno cwestiynau difrifol i'r Cynulliad.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn ei gweld yn

I do that we should be criticised for our failure to regain Blaenau Gwent by parties that had derisory amounts of votes? The Conservatives lost their deposits in both elections.

On Monday, I was pleased to visit St Helen's Catholic Primary School in Caerphilly for the launch of the free-breakfast scheme—yet another school taking up that scheme. The school can report, even at this early stage, that it has led to improvements in attendance and attention to learning. Do you agree that schemes such as free school breakfasts, free bus passes, free swimming for older people, and the abolition of prescription charges are bringing real benefits to the people of Wales?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree; you cannot argue against the fact that 557 primary schools have signed up to provide free breakfasts by this time next year. Likewise, in terms of 20 mph zones, 221 have been introduced throughout Wales, and 108 Safe Routes to School projects are now in place. We are moving ahead to fulfil our manifesto commitments, with that one exception. We are spending more than we promised to spend in terms of capital investment in the school system, and in healthcare in hospitals and new general practitioner surgeries. Our record is outstandingly good in meeting the promises that we made. That is the record that we will be proud to take to the people of Wales in 10 months' time.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** In your personal foreword to your 2003 manifesto, you wrote:

'Give us your democratic backing and you will not be disappointed in the results'.

I think that, last week, the electors of Blaenau Gwent spoke. You suggest that, on Friday morning, the great banner headline was, 'Conservatives fail to gain Blaenau Gwent'—and, by the way, there were more sightings of Elvis than of you in Blaenau Gwent—and your parliamentary colleagues in Westminster were spinning the headline,

rhyfeddol, fel fi, ein bod yn cael ein beirniadu am ein methiant i ailennill Blaenau Gwent gan bleidiau a gafodd symiau chwerthinlyd o bleidleisiau? Collodd y Ceidwadwyr eu hernes yn y ddau etholiad.

Ddydd Llun, cefais y pleser o ymweld ag Ysgol Gynradd Gatholig y Santes Helen yng Nghaerffili ar gyfer lansio'r cynllun brecwast am ddim—ysgol arall eto fyth yn manteisio ar y cynllun hwnnw. Gall yr ysgol ddweud, hyd yn oed mor gynnar â hyn, ei fod wedi arwain at welliannau o ran presenoldeb a rhoi sylw i ddysgu. A ydych yn cytuno bod cynlluniau megis brecwast ysgol am ddim, tocynnau bws am ddim, nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn, a dileu ffioedd presgripsiwn yn dod â manteision gwirioneddol i bobl Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf; ni ellir dadlau yn erbyn y ffaith bod 557 o ysgolion cynradd wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu brecwast am ddim erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn yr un modd, o ran parthau 20 mya, mae 221 wedi'u cyflwyno ledled Cymru, ac mae 108 o brosiectau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol bellach wedi'u sefydlu. Yr ydym wrthi'n cyflawni'r ymrwymadau a wnaethom yn ein maniffesto, gyda'r un eithriad hwnnw. Yr ydym yn gwario mwy nag yr addawsom ei wario o ran buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn y system ysgolion, ac ym maes gofal iechyd mewn ysbytai a meddygfeydd newydd. Mae ein record yn eithriadol o dda o ran gwireddu'r addewidion a wnaethom. Dyna'r record y byddwn yn falch o'i chyflwyno i bobl Cymru ymhen 10 mis.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yn eich rhagair personol i'ch maniffesto yn 2003, ysgrifenasoch:

'Rhowch i ni'ch cefnogaeth ddemocrataidd, a chewch chi mo'ch siomi gan y canlyniadau'.

Credaf fod etholwyr Blaenau Gwent wedi llefaru yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr ydych chi'n awgrymu mai'r pennawd bras fore dydd Gwener oedd, 'Y Ceidwadwyr yn methu â chipio Blaenau Gwent'—a gyda llaw, gwelwyd Elvis yn amlach na chi ym Mlaenau Gwent—ac yr oedd eich cyd-aelodau yn y senedd yn San Steffan yn sbinio'r pennawd,

'Labour begins to claw its way back in Blaenau Gwent'. However, is it not true that the reason why the people of Blaenau Gwent turned away from the Labour Party is the broken pledges? You have referred honestly to one of them, the pledge to scrap homecare charges for disabled people; it is a key pledge on page 5 of the manifesto, and it has been broken. You pledge that there will be free breakfasts for all primary school kids—that promise has been broken. You pledge that there will be 23,000 extra students in further education—that promise has been broken. You pledge that there will be no more cash-strapped councils—that promise has been broken. What do you say to those people who assessed your record and voted against you as decisively as they did?

**The First Minister:** I expect this kind of penny-in-the-slot polemics following a by-election defeat. It is terribly predictable, it is boring, it is terribly tired and it amounts to nothing when it is spouted by leaders of parties in whom the electors of Blaenau Gwent put absolutely no faith whatsoever. There is no point in your trying to pretend that this was a good night for the Conservatives, when it was an absolutely appalling night for you, as you almost lost one of your safest seats in southern England. At a time when David Cameron is supposed to be shooting up in the popularity polls, you nearly lose one of your safest seats, Bromley and Chislehurst. It was a bad night for Labour, but it was also a bad night for the Conservatives. You will not acknowledge that, and that is why you will not be in power.

**Nick Bourne:** If we could have £1 for every time that the First Minister has used that tired old phrase 'penny-in-the-slot polemics', we could easily fund the deficit in the free school breakfast funding. I wish to bring him back to the question, which he does not seem to want to answer. Does he not feel that the reason why the electors of Blaenau Gwent—those who turned up—voted against his Government is their disappointment with his record here in relation to those key pledges? That is also why you were not out campaigning much in Blaenau Gwent, is it not, First Minister?

'Llafur yn dechrau crafangu'n ôl ym Mlaenau Gwent'. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n wir mai'r rheswm y cefnodd pobl Blaenau Gwent ar y Blaid Lafur yw'r addewidion a dorwyd? Cyfeiriasoch yn onest at un ohonynt, sef yr addewid i ddileu taliadau am ofal cartref i bobl anabl; mae'n addewid allweddol ar dudalen 5 yn y maniffesto, ac fe'i torrwyd. Addawsoch y bydd brechwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd—torrwyd yr addewid hwnnw. Addawsoch y bydd 23,000 o fyfyrwyr ychwanegol mewn addysg bellach—torrwyd yr addewid hwnnw. Addawsoch na fydd dim mwy o gynghorau prin o arian—torrwyd yr addewid hwnnw. Beth a ddywedwch wrth y bobl hynny a asesodd eich record ac a bleidleisiodd yn eich erbyn mor bendant ag y gwnaethant?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Disgwyliaf y math hwn o bolemeg ceiniog yn y twll ar ôl colli isetholiad. Mae'n ofnadwy o hawdd ei ragweld, mae'n ddiflas, mae'n ofnadwy o flinedig ac nid yw'n golygu dim pan gaiff ei draethu gan arweinwyr pleidiau na roddodd etholwyr Blaenau Gwent ddim ffydd o gwbl ynddynt. Nid oes dim diben ichi geisio cymryd arnoch fod hon wedi bod yn noson dda i'r Ceidwadwyr, a hithau wedi bod yn noson gwbl enbyd ichi, gan y bu bron ichi gollu un o'ch seddau mwyaf diogel yn ne Lloegr. Wrth i David Cameron, fe honnir, godi i'r entrychion yn y polau piniwn, bu ond y dim ichi gollu un o'ch seddau mwyaf diogel, Bromley a Chislehurst. Bu'n noson wael i Lafur, ond bu'n noson wael hefyd i'r Ceidwadwyr. Ni wnewch gydnabod hynny, a dyna pam na fyddwch mewn grym.

**Nick Bourne:** Pe caem bunt am bob tro y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi defnyddio'r hen ystrydeb honno 'polemeg ceiniog yn y twll', galleu yn hawdd ariannu'r diffyg yn y cyllid ar gyfer brechwast ysgol am ddim. Hoffwn ddod ag ef yn ôl at y cwestiwn, nad oes arno eisiau ei ateb, fe ymddengys. Onid yw'n teimlo mai'r rheswm pam y bu i etholwyr Blaenau Gwent—y rhai a drafferthodd fwrw pleidlais—bleidleisio yn erbyn ei Lywodraeth yw eu siom gyda'i record yma mewn perthynas â'r addewidion allweddol hynny? Dyna hefyd pam na fuoch wrthi'n ymgyrchu rhyw lawer ym Mlaenau Gwent, onid e, Brif Weinidog?



**The First Minister:** I do not know where you got that from. I would be interested in the factual basis for your remark that I was not out campaigning in Blaenau Gwent. I suspect that it is the same as the factual basis for all the rest of the claptrap that you have been speaking: you do not let the facts get in the way of a good story. You have never asked me how often I was out campaigning; you would rather just spout some rubbish, prepared by your researchers, whom I would not pay at all. Try to come back with something that is a little bit more apposite to the facts of the case. We had a major swing back to Labour in Blaenau Gwent, but it was nowhere near enough; we have to accept that. They certainly did not favour Plaid Cymru, the Conservatives or the Liberal Democrats. You have to ask yourselves why that is the case. When they want to give Labour a bit of a knock, why do they not go the Conservatives? You know the answer to that. Why do they not go to Plaid? They do not trust Ieuan and his team. Why do they not go to the Liberal Democrats, who are the great past masters of the by-election machinery? Did it work in Blaenau Gwent? Not a bit.

**Nick Bourne:** To quote your comment to me: claptrap. If you think that there was a major swing back to Labour in Blaenau Gwent, and that that was the big news of the night, I feel that you are destined to lose many more seats in the next Assembly elections, and rightly so.

I will bring you back to the question, because you always say that you like the question—I have asked it now three times; try it again. Do you not think that the reason why the people of Blaenau Gwent turned away from the Labour Party in droves was your failure to honour key pledges in your manifesto, such as free homecare for the disabled, free breakfasts for all primary school kids, no more cash-strapped councils, and 23,000 extra students in FE? That is why they did not vote for you, is it not? Will you now listen to them and come up with some sensible, deliverable policies?

**The First Minister:** I still find it

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn o ble y cawsoch hynny. Byddai gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn y sail ffeithiol i'ch sylw na fûm wrthi'n ymgyrchu ym Mlaenau Gwent. Amheufaf mai'r un peth ydyw â'r sail ffeithiol i'r holl lol arall yr ydych wedi bod yn ei siarad: nid ydych yn gadael i'r ffeithiau fod yn rhwystr i stori dda. Nid ydych erioed wedi gofyn imi pa mor aml y bûm wrthi'n ymgyrchu; mae'n well gennyf baldaruo rhyw ddwli, wedi'i baratoi gan eich ymchwilyr, na fyddent yn cael tâl o gwbl gennyf fi. Ceisiwch ddod yn ôl gyda rhywbeth sydd ychydig yn nes at y ffeithiau. Cawsom ogwydd mawr yn ôl at Lafur ym Mlaenau Gwent, ond nid oedd yn hanner digon; rhaid inni dderbyn hynny. Yn sicr nid oeddent yn ffafrio Plaid Cymru, y Ceidwadwyr na'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Rhaid ichi ofyn i chi'ch hunain pam y digwyddodd hynny. Pan fo arnynt eisiau rhoi tipyn o gnoc i Lafur, pam nad ânt at y Ceidwadwyr? Gwyddoch yr ateb i hynny. Pam nad ânt at Plaid? Nid ydynt yn ymddiried yn Ieuan a'i dîm. Pam nad ânt at y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef meistri mawr y peirianwaith isetholiadol gynt? A wnaeth weithio ym Mlaenau Gwent? Dim o gwbl.

**Nick Bourne:** A dyfynnu eich sylw wrthyf fi: lol. Os ydych yn meddwl bod gogwydd mawr yn ôl at Lafur ym Mlaenau Gwent, ac mai hynny oedd stori fawr y noson, credaf eich bod yn sicr o golli llawer mwy o seddau yn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad, a hynny'n ddigon teg.

Dof â chi'n ôl at y cwestiwn, oherwydd dywedwch bob amser eich bod yn hoffi'r cwestiwn—yr wyf wedi ei ofyn dair gwaith bellach; rhowch gynnig arall arni. Onid ydych yn meddwl mai'r rheswm y cefnodd miloedd o bobl Blaenau Gwent ar y Blaid Lafur oedd oherwydd i chi fethu â gwireddu addewidion allweddol yn eich manifesto, megis gofal cartref am ddim i'r anabl, brechwast ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd, dim mwy o gynghorau prin o arian, a 23,000 o fyfyrwyr ychwanegol mewn addysg bellach? Dyna pam na wnaethant bleidleisio drosoch, onid e? A wnewch wrando arnynt yn awr a llunio polisiau synhwyrol y gellir eu cyflawni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn parhau i

mindboggling that you somehow think that this is a great night of triumph for the Tories. The Tories are supposed to be resurgent in the opinion polls, but everyone in Blaenau Gwent turned away from them, and everyone in Bromley and Chislehurst, at the other end of the country, turned away from them. All the newspapers commented on the fact that it was a bad night for Labour, and we accept that. It was a bad night for the Conservatives, too, but you do not accept it. In some way, you seem to think that you were the victors in the Blaenau Gwent by-election. That is absolute rubbish. The voters did not show any faith in you. As regards our record, we have accepted that there is an exception to our record, because of what we have had to say with regard to care of the disabled—and I declare an interest in that regard. However, we have a £75 million alternative scheme that we think is much better than the manifesto promise. We have had to take account of the information coming from Scotland, which was not available when we wrote that manifesto promise. We are well on the way to completing all of our other manifesto promises before the election. That is why we will be proud to take our record to the people of Wales next May.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):**

Given what you have said, I should take great heart from what happened last Thursday, because our vote increased in Blaenau Gwent, for both seats. We leapfrogged the Labour Party and put it behind the UK Independence Party. On that basis, the Labour Party should be dismayed, and we should be very happy. I am glad of your analysis of that matter. However, I think that you have to answer the questions on broken promises. You have been faced with a catalogue of them—and let us add one more to that, which is the promise on school buildings. You pledged in 2003 that you would get all school buildings up to standard by 2010, and remove the backlog in repairs. When you made that pledge, did you know how much it would cost?

**The First Minister:** The pledge in our

ryfeddu eich bod rywfodd yn credu bod hon yn noson o lwyddiant mawr i'r Torïaid. Yn ôl pob sôn, mae'r Torïaid ar i fyny yn y polau piniwn, ond troi oddi wrthynt a wnaeth pawb ym Mlaenau Gwent, a bu i bawb yn Bromley a Chislehurst, ym mhen arall y wlad, droi oddi wrthynt hefyd. Gwnaed sylwadau gan yr holl bapurau newydd ynghylch y ffaith ei bod yn noson wael i Lafur, ac yr ydym yn derbyn hynny. Yr oedd yn noson wael i'r Ceidwadwyr hefyd, ond nid ydych chi'n derbyn hyn. Rywfodd, ymddengys eich bod yn credu ichi gael buddugoliaeth yn isetholiad Blaenau Gwent. Rwts hollol yw hynny. Ni ddangosodd y pleidleiswyr ddim ffydd yn och. O ran ein record, yr ydym wedi derbyn bod eithriad i'n record, oherwydd yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennym ynghylch gofaliad anabl—ac yr wyf yn datgan buddiant yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym gynllun amgen £75 miliwn sydd, yn ein barn ni, yn well na'r addewid yn y maniffesto. Bu'n rhaid i ni roi sylw i'r wybodaeth a oedd yn dod o'r Alban, nad oedd ar gael pan luniwyd yr addewid hwnnw yn y maniffesto gennym. Yr ydym ymhell ar y ffordd tuag at wireddu pob un o'r addewidion eraill a wnaed yn ein maniffesto cyn yr etholiad. Dyna pam y byddwn yn gyflwyno'n record gerbron pobl Cymru fis Mai nesaf.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):**

O ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, fe ddylwn gael fy nghalonogi'n fawr gan yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ddydd Iau diwethaf, oherwydd cynyddodd ein pleidlais ni yn y ddwy sedd. Bu i ni lamu heibio i'r Plaid Lafur, gan ei rhoi ar ôl Plaid Annibyniaeth y DU. Ar sail hynny, dylai'r Plaid Lafur fod yn siomedig, ac fe ddylem ni fod yn hapus iawn. Yr wyf yn falch o'ch dadansoddiad o'r mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, credaf y dylech ateb y cwestiynau ynghylch torri addewidion. Fe'ch wynebwyd â chatalog ohonynt—a gadewch inni ychwanegu un arall atynt, sef yr addewid ynghylch adeiladau ysgolion. Rhoesoch addewid yn 2003 y byddech yn sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yn cyrraedd y safon ofynnol erbyn 2010, a chael gwared â'r gwaith atgyweirio sydd wedi cronni. Pan wnaed yr addewid gennych, a oeddech yn gwybod faint fyddai'r gost?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr addewid yn ein

manifesto was to spend £560 million on new school buildings during this Assembly. The information that I have is that we are currently spending at a rate close to £200 million a year, and we will easily exceed that promise. That is not a broken election pledge, Mike.

**Michael German:** I hate to remind you, but despite what you have just told me, what was stated in your manifesto was that you would make all schools fit for purpose. You stated that you would do that by 2010. This is an important issue, because we now know how much that will cost. We are now told that the current backlog is £620.6 million. Now that you have the figures, do you think that you will meet your target?

**The First Minister:** I think that we will spend £620 million in this Assembly on new school buildings, possibly more, given the rate at which the spend is increasing. Our pledge was to spend £560 million on new school buildings during this Assembly, and the information I have is that we will easily surpass that.

**Michael German:** The figure that you are talking about includes new school builds, and new provision. With the modernisation of the school agenda and the situation of places as it is, you are bound to create new schools, which have been built across Wales. I know that your colleagues have referred to some of them in previous years. However, what about the cost of repairs and making all schools, not just new schools, fit for purpose? That is the question that you were meant to answer, the proposal that you put before the people, and the pledge that you made. The cost of repairs is £620 million and you propose to spend £570 million, minus the money spent on new school buildings. Surely, you will not meet your target. If you are going to meet it, how much additional money will you put in?

manifesto oedd gwario £560 miliwn ar adeiladau newydd i ysgolion yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn. Y wybodaeth sydd gennyf yw ein bod yn gwario bron £200 miliwn y flwyddyn ar hyn o bryd, a byddwn yn rhagori ar yr addewid hwnnw'n ddiraffferth. Nid yw hynny'n addewid etholiadol a dorwyd, Mike.

**Michael German:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich atgoffa, ond er gwaethaf yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud wrthyf, yr hyn a ddatganwyd yn eich manifesto oedd y byddech yn gwneud pob ysgol yn addas i'w diben. Dywedasoch y byddech yn gwneud hynny erbyn 2010. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, oherwydd gwyddom erbyn hyn faint fydd cost hynny. Dywedir wrthym yn awr fod gwerth £620.6 miliwn o waith atgyweirio wedi cronni. Gan fod y ffigurau gennych erbyn hyn, a ydych yn credu y byddwch yn cyrraedd eich targed?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf y byddwn yn gwario £620 miliwn yn y Cynulliad hwn ar adeiladau newydd i ysgolion, mwy o bosibl, o ystyried mor gyflym y mae cyfradd y gwariant yn cynyddu. Ein haddewid oedd gwario £560 miliwn ar adeiladau newydd i ysgolion yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn, a'r wybodaeth sydd gennyf yw y byddwn yn gwario tipyn mwy na hynny.

**Michael German:** Mae'r ffigwr yr ydych yn sôn amdano'n cynnwys adeiladu ysgolion newydd, a darpariaeth newydd. Wrth i agenda'r ysgolion gael ei moderneiddio a'r sefyllfa fel y mae o ran lleoedd, yr ydych yn sicr o greu ysgolion newydd, sydd wedi eu hadeiladu ledled Cymru. Gwn fod eich cyd-Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at rai ohonynt mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, beth am gost atgyweirio a gwneud pob ysgol, nid ysgolion newydd yn unig, yn addas i'w diben? Hwnnw yw'r cwestiwn yr oeddech i fod i'w ateb, y cynnig a roesoch gerbron y bobl, a'r addewid a wnaed gennych. Mae cost y gwaith atgyweirio'n £620 miliwn ac yr ydych yn bwriadu gwario £570 miliwn, gan dynnu'r arian a werir ar adeiladau newydd i ysgolion. Onid yw'n sicr na fyddwch yn cyflawni'ch targed? Os ydych yn mynd i'w gyflawni, faint o arian ychwanegol y byddwch yn ei gyfrannu?

**The First Minister:** We are spending substantially more than our election promise of £560 million. The latest figure that I have received is that our spend is around £620 million—we are reliant on the information coming in from the different bodies that run schools, but we think that it will be at least that. Currently, we are approaching a spend of £200 million a year, and you can see that, given four years' worth of that, expenditure would be far in excess of £560 million. The election pledge to spend £560 million will be easily surpassed, so you ought not to include that in your fake list of alleged broken promises.

**Michael German:** If, First Minister, there is a current backlog of £620 million—that is, as of now—surely you will not be able to reach that target with what you have already spent. This has nothing to do with what you have already spent, but what you are proposing to spend. You said in your promise that by 2010, the backlog would have been dealt with. Currently, there is a backlog of £620 million in repairs. How will that be cleared? You are not making progress on it.

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** You say that we are not making progress, but we are reliant on the local authorities deciding which schools they wish to rebuild, and which they wish to repair and bring up to a modern standard. We do not run the school system; 80-odd per cent of that is done by local education authorities, and then you have the voluntary-aided bodies such as the Anglican Church, the Roman Catholic Church and others, including independent bodies. The important thing is that we realise that we are going to easily surpass the election promise that was made to spend £560 million. As I say, it is on an ever-increasing trend and we believe that it is now up to £200 million a year.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gwario mwy o lawer na'n haddewid etholiadol o £560 miliwn. Y ffigur diweddaraf a gefais yw bod ein gwariant tua £620 miliwn—yr ydym yn dibynnu ar gael y wybodaeth gan y cyrff gwahanol sy'n rhedeg ysgolion, ond credwn y bydd yn gymaint â hynny, o leiaf. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn gwario bron £200 miliwn y flwyddyn, a gallwch weld, o wario'r swm hwnnw'n flynyddol dros bedair blynedd, y byddai'r gwariant ymhell dros £560 miliwn. Awn heibio i'r addewid etholiadol i wario £560 miliwn yn rhwydd, felly ni ddylech gynnwys hynny yn eich rhestr ffug o addewidion yr honnir eu bod wedi eu torri.

**Michael German:** Brif Weinidog, os oes ôl-groniad o £620 miliwn—hynny yw, ar hyn o bryd—onid yw'n sicr na fydd modd ichi gyrraedd y targed hwnnw gyda'r arian a wariwyd gennych eisoes? Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i wario eisoes, ond beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wario. Dywedasoeh yn eich addewid, y byddai'r ôl-groniad o £620 wedi'i ddatrys erbyn 2010. Ar hyn o bryd, mae ôl-groniad o £620 miliwn o ran atgyweirio. Sut y bydd yn cael ei glirio? Nid ydych yn gwneud cynnydd yn hynny o beth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedwch nad ydym yn gwneud cynnydd, ond yr ydym yn dibynnu ar yr awdurdodau lleol wrth i'r rheini benderfynu pa ysgolion y maent yn dymuno'u hailadeiladu a pha rai y maent am eu hatgyweirio i beri eu bod yn cyrraedd safon fodern; gwneir 80 y cant neu fwy o hynny gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, ac yna mae'r cyrff gwirfoddol a gynhelir gennych, megis yr Eglwys Anglicanaidd, yr Eglwys Gatholig ac eraill, gan gynnwys cyrff annibynnol. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn sylweddoli ein bod yn mynd i ragori'n rhwydd ar yr addewid etholiadol a wnaed i wario £560 miliwn. Fel y dywedais, mae ar gynydd yn barhaus a chredwn ei fod bellach bron yn £200 miliwn y flwyddyn.

### **Cyllido Addysg Ôl 16 The Funding of Post-16 Education**

**Q2 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the funding of post-16 education? OAQ1730(FM)

**C2 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllido addysg ôl-16? OAQ1730(FM)

**The First Minister:** The principle is that, in funding post-16 education in Wales, institutions must serve the interests of the learners, not the other way round, and we aim for a unified and planned approach across the whole sector, providing the widest range of choices of courses, based on the principle of having a parity of esteem between vocational and academic qualifications.

**Peter Black:** That is the principle but, in practice, the new national planning and funding scheme, which was meant to redress the balance between sixth forms and colleges, has left many colleges struggling to make ends meet and courses that the Assembly Government is meant to be supporting, such as vocational courses, are receiving less money than before. I have spoken to principals in my region who have told me that they do not have enough money for a pay rise for their lecturers next year. Do you not think that the national planning and funding scheme needs to be looked at urgently and that some action needs to be taken to ensure that sufficient money goes to further education?

**The First Minister:** I can understand what happens when you get lobbied by principals of colleges of further education: they will always say, 'We do not have enough money and we cannot pay for the pay increase', and so forth. We have made certain allocations to the FE sector already and the remainder is expected to be allocated, once for a's negotiations with the trade unions are complete, but not before.

**William Graham:** Will you take this opportunity to outline your Government's plan for sixth forms in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I have just done that, implicitly. I made the principle clear that, in the interests of the learner, if the best delivery mechanism for a certain range of courses is in the sixth form, then sixth forms it will be; if the best is through tertiary colleges or sixth-form colleges, then that is where it ought to be, because, for the same pot money,

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr egwyddor, wrth ariannu addysg ôl-16 yng Nghymru, yw bod yn rhaid i sefydliadau wasanaethu buddiannau'r dysgwyr, nid y gwrthwyneb i hynny, ac yr ydym ceisio cael dull gweithredu unedig a chynlluniedig ar draws yr holl sector, gan ddarparu'r ystod ehangaf o ddewis o gyrsiau, ar sail yr egwyddor bod gwerth cyfartal i gymwysterau galwedigaethol ac academiaidd.

**Peter Black:** Hynny yw'r egwyddor, ond yn ymarferol, mae'r cynllun cynllunio a chyllido cenedlaethol newydd, y bwriadwyd iddo unioni'r cydbwysedd rhwng y chweched dosbarth a'r colegau, wedi golygu bod llawer o golegau'n ei chael yn anodd iawn cadw dau ben llinyn ynghyd, ac mae cyrsiau y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn eu cefnogi, megis cyrsiau galwedigaethol, yn derbyn llai o arian nag o'r blaen. Yr wyf wedi siarad â phenaethiaid yn fy rhanbarth i sydd wedi dweud wrthyf nad oes ganddynt ddigon o arian ar gyfer codiad cyflog i'w darlithwyr y flwyddyn nesaf. Onid ydych o'r farn bod angen edrych ar frys ar y cynllun cynllunio a chyllido cenedlaethol a bod angen cymryd rhai camau i sicrhau bod digon o arian yn mynd i addysg bellach?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf ddeall beth sy'n digwydd pan fyddwch yn cael eich llobio gan benaethiaid colegau addysg bellach: byddant bob amser yn dweud, 'Nid oes gennym ddigon o arian ac ni allwn dalu am y codiad cyflog', ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym wedi gwneud rhai dyraniadau i'r sector addysg bellach eisoes, a disgwylir i'r hyn sydd ar ôl gael ei ddyrannu, wedi i drafodaethau'r fforymau gyda'r undebau gael eu cwblhau, ond nid cyn hynny.

**William Graham:** A wnewch achub y cyfle hwn i amlinellu cynllun eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer y chweched dosbarth yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf newydd wneud hynny, mae ymhlyg yn yr hyn a ddywedais. Eglurais yr egwyddor, os mai'r chweched dosbarth, er lles y dysgwr, yw'r mecanwaith gorau ar gyfer ystod benodol o gyrsiau, yna'r chweched dosbarth fydd hi; os mai drwy golegau trydyddol neu golegau chweched dosbarth y ceir y gorau, yna dyna lle y dylai

you can provide the 16-year-olds with a wider range of courses and choices. It is not always easy to do that. Some schools can still decide to have sixth forms, even if those sixth forms are, at least initially, small, as some of them are beyond the NPFS because of the structure of the schools. However, that is the basic principle. We are not against sixth forms and we are not particularly pro or against sixth forms or the colleges of further education doing a particular job. It is the interests of the learner that must come first, not the interests, or turf, of the institution.

**Janet Ryder:** In answer to Peter Black, you seemed to be saying that it is some figment of college principals' imagination that they are seeing a reduction in their money. Yet, since 2003, we have seen a 3 per cent reduction in the courses that they are offering, which would seem to suggest that there is a reduction in the amount of money that they are receiving. How are you going to fulfil that election pledge to increase those post-16 places in the light of that reduction in funding and your own Minister's admission that, since 2003, there has been that 3 per cent reduction in courses provided?

**The First Minister:** The huge range of courses now available to sixth forms in Wales is incomparably greater than in previous years and it is provided in a way that is inching towards the objective of deciding whether such-and-such a course ought to be provided for, say, 20 students in a college of FE or for two separate classes of 10 each in a sixth form, which, admittedly, would probably involve less travel but, on the other hand, less effectiveness in the delivery of the course. In rural areas, you cannot do anything about that, because, obviously, the distances travelled are far too great. However, that will usually tend to put the emphasis more on having larger numbers of students on courses in colleges of FE.

You are talking as though the proliferation of courses was an end in itself. I am not sure

fod, oherwydd, am yr un swm o arian, gallwch ddarparu ystod ehangach o gyrsiau a dewisiadau i bobl ifanc 16 oed. Nid yw'n hawdd gwneud hynny bob amser. Gall rhai ysgolion benderfynu cael chweched dosbarth o hyd, hyd yn oed os yw'r dosbarthiadau hynny'n rhai bach, o leiaf ar y dechrau, gan fod rhai ohonynt y tu hwnt i'r system gynllunio ac ariannu genedlaethol oherwydd strwythur yr ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, hynny yw'r egwyddor sylfaenol. Nid ydym yn erbyn y chweched dosbarth ac nid ydym yn arbennig o blaid nac yn erbyn bod chweched dosbarth neu golegau addysg bellach yn gwneud gwaith penodol. Rhaid i fuddiannau'r dysgwyr ddod gyntaf, nid buddiannau, na lleoliad, y sefydliad.

**Janet Ryder:** Wrth ateb Peter Black, yr oedd yn ymddangos eich bod yn dweud mai ffrwyth ddychymyg penaethiaid y colegau yw eu bod yn gweld gostyngiad yn eu harian. Eto i gyd, ers 2003, gwelsom 3 y cant o ostyngiad yn y cyrsiau a gynigir ganddynt, sydd fel petai'n awgrymu bod gostyngiad yn yr arian y maent yn ei dderbyn. Sut yr ydych yn mynd i gyflawni'r addewid etholiadol hwnnw i gynyddu'r lleoedd ôl-16 yng ngoleuni'r gostyngiad hwnnw yn y cyllid a chyfaddefiad eich Gweinidog eich hun fod gostyngiad o 3 y cant, ers 2003, yn y cyrsiau a ddarperir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ystod anferth o gyrsiau sydd bellach ar gael i'r chweched dosbarth yng Nghymru lawer iawn yn fwy nag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, ac fe'i darperir mewn modd sy'n symud tuag at yr amcan o benderfynu a ddylai rhyw gwrs neu'i gilydd gael ei ddarparu ar gyfer, dyweder, 20 o fyfyrwyr mewn coleg AB neu ar gyfer dau ddosbarth ar wahân o 10 yr un mewn chweched dosbarth a fyddai, mae'n rhaid cyfaddef, yn golygu llai o deithio mae'n debyg, ond, ar y llaw arall, yn llai effeithlon o ran cyflwyno'r cwrs. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ni allwch wneud dim ynghylch hynny, oherwydd, yn amlwg mae'r pellteroedd a deithir yn rhy faith. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n tueddu i roi'r pwyslais yn fwy ar gael nifer fawr o fyfyrwyr ar gyrsiau mewn colegau AB.

Yr ydych yn siarad fel pe bai cynnydd mawr mewn cyrsiau'n nod ynddo'i hun. Nid wyf yn

that that is right. If you had an awful lot of courses, whether they are in colleges of FE or in sixth form, with only five students attending, that is proliferation. That does not make sense. If you can get a lot of people being taught in classes of 15 or 20, it gives the learner a wider range of choice and a much more efficient method of delivery.

sic a yw hynny'n iawn. Pe byddai gennych lawer iawn o gyrsiau, boed mewn colegau AB neu mewn chweched dosbarth, gyda dim ond pump o fyfyrwyr yn eu mynychu, mae hynny'n gynnydd mawr. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Os gallwch sicrhau bod llawer o bobl yn cael eu dysgu mewn dosbarthiadau o 15 i 20, mae'n rhoi ystod ehangach o ddewis i'r dysgwr a dull llawer mwy effeithlon o ddarparu'r addysg.

### **Diogelwch ar y Ffordd Road Safety**

**Q3 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is promoting road safety in South Wales Central? OAQ1733(FM)

**C3 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyrwyddo diogelwch ar y ffordd yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ1733(FM)

**The First Minister:** The road safety strategy for Wales, as in South Wales Central, sets out targets to improve road safety. We have set out an aim to have, by 2010, a 50 per cent reduction in the total number of children killed or seriously injured. A reduction of 19 per cent has already been achieved and we are on track to meet that target.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae strategaeth diogelwch ar y ffordd yng Nghymru, fel yng Nghanol De Cymru, yn nodi'r targedau i wella diogelwch ar y ffordd. Yr ydym wedi gosod nod i gyflawni gostyngiad o 50 y cant, erbyn 2010, yng nghyfanswm nifer y plant sy'n cael eu lladd neu eu hanafu'n ddifrifol. Eisoes cyflawnwyd gostyngiad o 19 y cant ac yr ydym ar y ffordd tuag at gyrraedd y targed hwnnw.

**David Melding:** I must start by making a confession: I was done for speeding in 1989, which was before I started to drive a Skoda—*[Laughter.]* However, it is a serious issue. In urban areas, the standard speed limit should be nearer to 20 mph. When motorists get to middle age and beyond, they need to keep improving their skills constantly. We all rattle through the gearbox trying to get to fourth gear, when, frankly, third gear is usually much better in an urban environment. We need to slow down.

**David Melding:** Rhaid i mi ddechrau drwy wneud cyfaddefiad: cefais fy nal yn goryrru yn 1989, sef cyn i mi ddechrau gyrru Skoda—*[Chwerthin.]* Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater difrifol. Mewn ardaloedd trefol, dylai'r cyfyngiad cyflymder safonol fod yn nes at 20 mya. Pan fydd gyrwyr yn cyrraedd canol oed ac yn hŷn na hynny, mae angen iddynt barhau i wella'u sgiliau'n gyson. Yr ydym i gyd yn rhedeg drwy'r blwch gêrs i gyrraedd y pedwerydd gêr, pan fo'r trydydd gêr, mewn gwirionedd, fel arfer yn llawer gwell mewn amgylchedd trefol. Mae angen inni arafu.

**The First Minister:** I accept what you say about your driving experience, David. It would not quite be mine, but everyone will choose, as a driver, to ensure that they drive safely and it is very important that they do so. I should add that, since 2002, we have provided funding of £30,000 per annum for each local authority for the post of a child pedestrian training co-ordinator. We have allocated around £4 million to that initiative

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedwch am eich profiad gyrru, David. Nid dyna'n union fy mhrofiad i, ond bydd pawb, fel gyrrwr, yn dewis sicrhau eu bod yn gyrru'n ddiogel, ac mae'n bwysig iawn iddynt wneud hynny. Dylwn ychwanegu, ers 2002, ein bod wedi darparu cyllid o £30,000 y flwyddyn i bob awdurdod lleol ar gyfer swydd cydlynnydd hyfforddi plant sy'n cerdded. Yr ydym wedi dyrannu tua £4

and around 7,500 children across Wales receive the pedestrian skills training each year as a result.

**Christine Chapman:** According to a study by the European Conference of Ministers of Transport, young drivers account for around 27 per cent of driver fatalities in countries that belong to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, although people in that age group make up only 10 per cent of the population. Furthermore, between 20 and 30 per cent of total traffic deaths result from crashes involving a younger driver and male drivers' crash fatality rate can be as much as three times that of young female drivers. That is a shocking statistic. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote road safety among this sector of the population, not simply to protect themselves, but others as well?

**The First Minister:** That is a very important point. Unfortunately, we have all seen what is called the alpha male, show-off, young driver syndrome. Since 1 June, there is a new scheme, launched by Tamsin Dunwoody, the Deputy Minister for transport, called Pass Plus Cymru—in other words, you have passed your test, but do not think that you know it all straight away. That is what my driving instructor informed me many years ago when I passed my test. That is available now in each local authority in Wales. It is a training package for young drivers—a three hour theory test and eight hours of in-car training. It costs people £40 as a contribution and local authorities pay £100 from the local road safety grant. I commend that to every young male driver and probably female driver in Wales.

**Leanne Wood:** Traffic wardens perform an important role in keeping our roads safe. Do you agree with the controlled parking zone scheme agreed by a coalition of Labour and Liberal Democrats in Cardiff that privatises traffic enforcement and imposes additional

miliwn i'r cynllun hwnnw ac mae tua 7,500 o blant ar hyd a lled Cymru'n derbyn hyfforddiant sgiliau cerddwyr bob blwyddyn o ganlyniad.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn ôl astudiaeth gan Gynhadledd Ewropeaidd Gweinidogion Trafnidiaeth, gyrywyr ifanc sy'n gyfrifol am tua 27 y cant o yrwyr sy'n cael eu lladd mewn gwledydd sy'n aelodau o'r Gymdeithas dros Gydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, er mai dim ond 10 y cant o'r boblogaeth yw pobl yn y grŵp oedran hwnnw. Yn ogystal, mae rhwng 20 a 30 y cant o gyfanswm y marwolaethau mewn damweiniau traffig yn digwydd o ganlyniad i wrthdrawiad sy'n cynnwys gyrrwr iau, a gall cyfradd marwolaeth dynion sy'n yrwyr fod gymaint â thair gwaith yr hyn ydyw i ferched ifanc sy'n gyrru. Mae hynny'n ystadegyn brawychus. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i hyrwyddo diogelwch ar y ffyrdd ymysg y sector hwn o'r boblogaeth, nid yn unig i'w hamddiffyn hwy eu hunain, ond pobl eraill hefyd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig iawn. Yn anffodus, yr ydym i gyd wedi gweld yr hyn a elwir yn syndrom y gwryw alpha o yrwr ifanc sy'n dangos ei hun. Ers Mehefin 1, mae cynllun newydd, a lansiwyd gan Tamsin Dunwoody, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Drafnidiaeth, o'r enw Pass Plus Cymru— mewn geiriau eraill, yr ydych wedi pasio'ch prawf, ond peidiwch â meddwl eich bod yn gwybod y cyfan ar eich union. Dyna a ddywedodd fy hyfforddwr gyrru wrthyf flynyddoedd yn ôl pan basiais fy mhrawf gyrru. Mae ar gael yn awr ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Pecyn hyfforddiant i yrwyr ifanc ydyw—prawf theori teirawr o hyd ac wyth awr o hyfforddiant mewn cerbyd. Mae'n costio £40 i bobl fel cyfraniad ac mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn talu £100 o'r grant diogelwch ffyrdd lleol. Yr wyf yn ei argymhell i bob llanc ifanc o yrwr a phob merch sy'n gyrru yng Nghymru hefyd.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae wardeiniaid traffig yn cyflawni swyddogaeth bwysig yn y gwaith o gadw'n ffyrdd yn ddiogel. A ydych yn cytuno â'r cynllun parth parcio a reolir y cytunwyd arno gan gynghrair o Lafur a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghaerdydd sy'n



costs on local people, businesses and commuters? Will you tell me whether you would consider introducing secondary legislation to prevent the privatisation of such services in Cardiff and elsewhere in Wales?

**The First Minister:** The planet that you inhabit is different from the one that the rest of us inhabit, Leanne. The coalition in Cardiff—if there is a coalition—is a Lib-Dem-led coalition with Plaid Cymru and occasional Conservative support, and Labour in opposition. In your planet, the Liberal Democrats are in coalition with Labour, but that is the planet Zog; it is not this planet.

On the CPZs, I declare a constituency interest and I know of nothing that would compel you to say that it is essential to have civilianised control of parking administration. By and large, police officers who I have asked about this issue welcome the civilianisation of parking administration, but that is not the same as privatisation. However, it should not be done by police officers, because I think that it is a waste of the time of traffic wardens, who come under police control.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree that one of the important ways to improve road safety in Wales is through the Safe Routes to School scheme, such as the schemes that are to be introduced in Maerdy and Tonypany in my constituency as a result of Assembly investment?

**The First Minister:** The promotion of road safety and Safe Routes to School is a great success story. I mentioned the 221 schemes that we already have in place and I think that I also mentioned the 108 Safe Routes to School projects. Huge progress is being made in this area and it is one of those aspects that affects the daily lives of ordinary people to try to reduce the number of children affected by road accidents, because it absolutely devastates the families and friends of all those who are injured in this way. Higher road safety standards are a high goal for a Government to aim for as a priority.

preifateiddio gorfodaeth traffig ac yn gosod costau ychwanegol ar bobl leol, busnesau a chymudwyr? A wnewch ddweud wrthyf a fydddech yn ystyried cyflwyno deddfwriaeth eilaidd i atal preifateiddio gwasanaethau o'r fath yng Nghaerdydd ac mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r blaned yr ydych yn byw arni'n wahanol i blaned y gweddill ohonom, Leanne. Cynghrair—os oes cynghrair—a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gyda Phlaid Cymru a chefnogaeth achlysurol gan y Ceidwadwyr yw'r un yng Nghaerdydd, a Llafur yn wrthblaid. Yn eich planed chi, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn cynghrair gyda Llafur, ond planed Zog yw honno, nid y blaned hon.

Ynghylch parthau parcio a reolir, yr wyf yn datgan buddiant etholaethol, ac ni wn am ddim a fyddai'n eich gorfodi i ddweud bod yn rhaid cael rheolaeth sifil dros weinyddu parcio. Yn gyffredinol, mae plismyn yr wyf wedi eu holi am y peth, yn croesawu sifileiddio gweinyddu parcio, ond nid yw hynny yr un peth â phreifateiddio. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai gael ei wneud gan blismyn, oherwydd credaf fod hynny'n wastraff ar amser wardeiniaid traffig, sy'n dod dan reolaeth yr heddlu.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ydych yn cytuno mai un o'r ffyrdd pwysig o wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru yw drwy'r cynllun Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, megis y cynlluniau sydd i'w cyflwyno ym Maerdy a Thonypany yn fy etholaeth i o ganlyniad i fuddsoddiad gan y Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyrwyddo diogelwch ar y ffyrdd a Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol yn stori o lwyddiant mawr. Soniais am y 221 o gynlluniau sydd eisoes ar waith gennym a chredaf imi grybwyll hefyd y 108 o brosiectau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol. Mae cynnydd enfawr yn digwydd yn y maes hwn, ac mae'n un o'r agweddau hynny sy'n effeithio ar fywyd beunyddiol pobl gyffredin er mwyn ceisio lleihau nifer y plant yr effeithir arnynt gan ddamweiniau ar y ffyrdd, oherwydd y mae'n llwyr ddinistrio teuluoedd a ffrindiau'r rhai sy'n cael eu hanafu fel hyn. Mae gwell safonau diogelwch ar y ffyrdd yn

nod uchel i Lywodraeth geisio cyrchu ato fel mater o flaenoriaeth.

2.30 p.m.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Are you as concerned as I am about the number of children travelling in cars unrestrained? Will you do what you can to work with other road-safety partners to get the message across that it is lethal to carry children in cars without using seatbelts?

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych mor bryderus ag yr wyf fi ynghylch yr holl blant sy'n teithio heb wregys diogelwch mewn ceir? A ydych am wneud popeth o fewn eich gallu i weithio â phartneriaid eraill ym maes diogelwch ar y ffyrdd i gyfleu'r neges ei bod yn berygl bywyd cludo plant mewn ceir os nad ydynt yn gwisgo gwregysau diogelwch?

**The First Minister:** It is a very serious matter. I am sure that we have all seen occasional examples of it, but it is something to which people should pay a lot of attention until the child is nearly the same size as an adult. They should be in proper car seats if they are very young, and should be restrained by seatbelts if they are not.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n fater difrifol iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wedi gweld enghreifftiau achlysurol ohono, ond mae'n rhywbeth y dylai pobl roi llawer iawn o sylw iddo hyd nes i'r plentyn dyfu nes ei fod bron yr un faint ag oedolyn. Dylent fod mewn cadeiriau plant pwrpasol os ydynt yn fach iawn, a gwisgo gwregysau diogelwch os nad ydynt.

#### **Hyrwyddo Llywodraeth Agored (Llywodraeth Leol) Promoting Open Government (Local Government)**

**Q4 Mark Isherwood:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government measures to promote open government in local government? OAQ1743(FM)

**C4 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gamau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo llywodraeth agored mewn llywodraeth leol? OAQ1743(FM)

**The First Minister:** Under the present access-to-information laws, local authorities in Wales are public authorities in their own right, as are we, and are subject to much the same obligations. In adopting our code of practice, which goes further than the law, I hope that we have set a good example for others to follow.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O dan y cyfreithiau mynediad at wybodaeth presennol, mae awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn awdurdodau cyhoeddus ynddynt eu hunain, fel ninnau, ac yn ddarostyngedig i lawer o'r un ymrwymiadau â ninnau. Wrth fabwysiadu ein cod ymarfer, sy'n mynd ymhellach na'r gyfraith, gobeithio ein bod wedi gosod esiampl dda i eraill ei dilyn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Thank you for developing that. Under the present arrangements, when allegations of misconduct in local government involve political leaders or senior officers, current procedures can allow those same persons to oversee such investigations. For example, the council leader can appoint the committee that will consider whether disciplinary action should be taken, and the chief executive can set the terms of reference for any investigation.

**Mark Isherwood:** Diolch am ddatblygu hynny. O dan y trefniadau presennol, pan honnir bod arweinwyr gwleidyddol neu uwch swyddogion wedi camymddwyn mewn llywodraeth leol, mae'r gweithdrefnau presennol yn golygu bod y bobl hynny hefyd yn gallu goruchwyllo ymchwiliadau o'r fath. Er enghraifft, gall arweinydd y cyngor benodi pwyllgor i ystyried a ddylid cymryd camau disgyblu, a gall y prif weithredwr benderfynu beth fydd cylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad.

There are examples of both those scenarios in one council in my own region. What action will you take to close the loophole that allows such examples of closed government in local government in twenty-first-century Wales?

**The First Minister:** Every council has an internal audit procedure. If people are not satisfied with that, then they can go to the ombudsman, or to the Wales Audit Office, if it is a financial matter. You have raised this issue on many occasions on the floor of the Assembly. However, I do not know of any fresh allegations that you wish to bring forward now, since most of the old ones seem to have withered on the vine.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Last week, a 2004 Arts Council of Wales report on the impact of the reduction in the music development fund for 2004-05 was released under the Freedom of Information Act 2000. This is not world-shattering news, but it is important. Do you share my concern about the lack of information that exists, as we have discovered, on such an innocuous issue? Will you join me in encouraging local authorities to release figures showing what has happened to the allocation for the music development fund after it was cut, and other seemingly innocuous information?

**The First Minister:** I think that we all try to be as innocuous as we possibly can be in the Assembly. However, the information on how much of the music development fund was allocated to music activities in each local authority in the last year, before it went into the revenue support grant, is available in the public domain. The notional allocation to each local authority in the first year that it went into the revenue support grant is also in the public domain; I believe that we publish that. Therefore, the only issue is whether you can easily get from local authorities how much of the money that was notionally allocated to them that they spent, although they were free to do what they liked with it through the revenue support grant. I would be interested in this if what you are trying to tell me is that you have tried and failed to get information from local authorities as to what has happened to that notional allocation of

Ceir enghreifftiau o'r ddau senario hyn mewn un cyngor yn fy rhanbarth i. Pa gamau a gymerwch i atal y ddihangfa hon sy'n caniatáu'r fath enghreifftiau o lywodraeth gaeddig mewn llywodraeth leol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gan bob cyngor weithdrefn archwilio fewnol. Os nad yw pobl yn fodlon ar honno, gallant fynd at yr ombwdsmon, neu at Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru os yw'n fater ariannol. Yr ydych wedi codi'r mater hwn droeon ar lawr y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ni wn i am ddim honiadau newydd yr ydych am eu cyflwyno yn awr, oherwydd y mae'n ymddangos bod y rhan fwyaf o'r hen rai wedi mynd i'r gwellt ers tro.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, rhyddhawyd adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn 2004 gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar effaith y gostyngiad yn y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth yn 2004-05. Nid yw hyn yn newyddion trawiadol, ond mae'n bwysig. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y diffyg gwybodaeth, fel y gwelsom, am fater mor ddistadl? A wnewch ymuno â mi i annog awdurdodau lleol i ryddhau ffigurau sy'n dangos beth a ddigwyddodd i'r dyraniad ar gyfer y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth ar ôl ei thocio, ac i wybodaeth ddistadl arall i bob golwg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf ein bod i gyd yn ceisio bod mor ddistadl â phosibl yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r wybodaeth ynghylch faint o'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth a ddyrannwyd i weithgareddau cerddoriaeth ym mhob awdurdod lleol y llynedd, cyn i'r arian fynd i'r grant cymorth refeniw, ar gael i unrhyw un. Mae'r dyraniad tybiannol i bob awdurdod lleol yn y flwyddyn gyntaf yr aeth i'r grant cymorth refeniw hefyd ar gael i unrhyw un; credaf ein bod yn cyhoeddi hynny. Felly, yr unig gwestiwn yw a ydyw'n hawdd cael gwybodaeth gan awdurdodau lleol am faint o'r arian tybiannol a ddyrannwyd iddynt a wariwyd ganddynt, er eu bod yn rhydd i wneud fel y mynnent ag ef drwy'r grant cymorth refeniw. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb yn y mater hwn os mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ceisio'i ddweud wrthyf yw eich bod wedi ceisio cael gwybodaeth gan awdurdodau lleol

music development fund money.

ynghylch beth a ddigwyddodd i ddyraniad tybiannol arian y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth a'ch bod wedi methu â gwneud hynny.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn cefnogi'r alwad y dylai cadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu mewn llywodraeth leol ddod o'r gwrthbleidiau?

**David Lloyd:** Do you support the call for chairs of scrutiny committees in local government to come from the opposition parties?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel arfer, mae'n egwyddor sy'n gweithio'n dda iawn yn y Senedd, ac mae'n fater o reidrwydd yma. Credaf ei fod yn iachus, ond efallai nad yw'n fater o reidrwydd ym mhob awdurdod lleol. I raddau helaeth, nid yw pleidiau gwleidyddol yn rhedeg y mwyafrif o'r 22 awdurdod yng Nghymru. Byddai'n anodd iawn ffitio'r egwyddor honno o'r Cynulliad i mewn i bob un o'n hawdurdodau lleol.

**The First Minister:** Usually, it is a principle that works well in the Senedd, and it is a requirement here. I believe that it is healthy, but is not perhaps a requirement for every local authority. To a large extent, political parties do not run the majority of the 22 authorities in Wales. It would be difficult to fit that principle from the Assembly into every one of our local authorities.

### **Dyfodol Tir Mynydd The Future of Tir Mynydd**

**Q5 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of the Tir Mynydd scheme? OAQ1737(FM)

**C5 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol y cynllun Tir Mynydd? OAQ1737(FM)

**The First Minister:** I have nothing to add to the statement made on 24 May by Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, in which he announced arrangements for Tir Mynydd relating to the 2007 and 2008 scheme years, and the setting up of a review group, to report by the end of 2007, to consider scheme options from 2009 onwards.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu at y datganiad a gafwyd ar 24 Mai gan Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, a oedd yn cyhoeddi'r trefniadau ar gyfer Tir Mynydd ar gyfer blynyddoedd cynllun 2007 a 2008, ynghyd â sefydlu grŵp adolygu, i adrodd erbyn diwedd 2007, i ystyried y dewisiadau ar gyfer y cynllun o 2009 ymlaen.

**Mick Bates:** Do you agree that your Government is proposing to make hill farming in Wales unsustainable by slashing £12 million from the budget, which, by the way, is not a proposal put forward in England? I do not think that you understand the impact of this. The only analogy that I can make is to ask you to imagine cutting £12 million of support from schemes in the Valleys. Do you not agree that your Government is undermining the future of hill farming in Wales by making this silly proposal to slash £12 million from the Tir Mynydd budget?

**Mick Bates:** A ydych yn cytuno bod eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu gwneud ffermio mynydd yng Nghymru yn anghynaliadwy drwy dorri £12 miliwn oddi ar y gyllideb, rhywbeth na fwriedir ei wneud yn Lloegr, gyda llaw? Ni chredaf eich bod yn deall effaith hyn. Yr unig gymhariaeth y gallaf ei gwneud yw gofyn ichi ddychmygu torri £12 miliwn ar gymorth i gynlluniau yn y Cymoedd. Onid ydych yn cytuno bod eich Llywodraeth yn tanseilio holl ddyfodol ffermio mynydd yng Nghymru gyda'r cynnig hurt hwn i dorri £12 miliwn oddi ar gyllideb Tir Mynydd?

**The First Minister:** The forecast for farming

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y rhagolygon ar gyfer

incomes for 2005-06, for farmers in less-favoured areas—hill farmers, mostly—is £14,000; for lowland farmers, it is £3,600. Therefore, it is quite difficult to justify carrying on with a subsidy that is not payable to any lowland farmers but is payable to many, but not all, less-favoured-area farmers, because of that huge disparity in net farm incomes. Perhaps you need to pay some attention to that in deciding what your view is, because, on that basis, lowland farmers are being short-changed.

**Elin Jones:** Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi dweud mai un o'r prif resymau pam yr ydych yn torri'r gyllideb o £12 miliwn yw nad oes lles amgylcheddol yn deillio o hyn. Mae Carwyn Jones wedi dweud hynny ar sawl achlysur, ond mae hefyd wedi dweud ei fod yn bwriadu cyflwyno deddfwriaeth eleni a fydd yn newid y cynllun Tir Mynydd ac yn cael gwared ar yr unig elfennau sy'n hybu lles anifeiliaid a lles amgylcheddol o'r cynllun presennol. A gytunwch fod croes-ddweud difrifol rhwng y ddau ddatganiad hynny gan yr un Gweinidog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n rhaid i chi geisio bod yn deg â Carwyn. Cafwyd adolygiad annibynnol o gynllun Tir Mynydd oedd yn dangos nad oedd y cynllun o les i'r cyhoedd, a'i fod yn gostus. Adolygiad annibynnol a ddywedodd hynny yn hytrach na bod y Gweinidog yn diuno un bore ac yn penderfynu torri'r grant draean o'r lefel bresennol. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, ni fyddai unrhyw un yn disgrifio cynllun Tir Mynydd fel cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol, gan nad math felly o gynllun yw. Dyna yw cynlluniau Tir Cynnal a Tir Gofal, o bosibl, ond mae Tir Mynydd wedi'i seilio ar ddadansoddiad, gwybodaeth, a ffeithiau daeryddol hanesyddol yn hytrach nag ar unrhyw les o'r math y byddem oll am ei weld.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that the problem that Carwyn Jones faces is that he cannot please the farmers of Wales and hope to lead the Labour Party in the future? That is what has led to the swingeing cuts in Tir Mynydd rather than anything else.

**The First Minister:** If there had not been an

incwm ffermio yn 2005-06, i ffermwyr mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol—ffermwyr mynydd yn bennaf—yw £14,000; i ffermwyr llawr gwlad, £3,600 ydyw. Felly, mae'n eithaf anodd cyfiawnhau parhau gyda chymhorthdal nad yw'n cael ei dalu i ddim un ffermwr llawr gwlad ond sy'n cael ei dalu i lawer o ffermwyr, ond nid i bawb ohonynt, mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol, oherwydd y gwahaniaeth aruthrol hwnnw mewn incwm fferm net. Efallai y dylech roi sylw i hynny wrth lunio barn am hyn, oherwydd, ar sail hynny, mae ffermwyr llawr gwlad yn cael cam.

**Elin Jones:** Your Government has said that one of the main reasons why you are cutting the £12 million budget is because there is no environmental benefit to it. Carwyn Jones has said that on a number of occasions, but he has also said that he intends to introduce legislation this year that will amend the Tir Mynydd scheme and will take out of the current scheme the only elements that promote the welfare of animals and produce environmental benefits. Do you agree that there is great contradiction in those two statements by the same Minister?

**The First Minister:** You have to try to be fair to Carwyn. There was an independent review of the Tir Mynydd scheme, which showed that there was no benefit to the public from the scheme, and that it costs a great deal of money. It was an independent review that said that, rather than the Minister just waking up one morning and deciding to cut the grant by one third of the current level. As far as I understand it, no-one would describe the Tir Mynydd scheme as an agri-environmental scheme, as it is not that kind of scheme. That is what Tir Cynnal and Tir Gofal are, possibly, but Tir Mynydd is based on some historical analysis, data, and geographical information rather than on any benefit of the kind that we would all wish to see.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych yn cytuno mai'r broblem a wynebir gan Carwyn Jones yw na all blesio ffermwyr Cymru a gobeithio arwain y Blaid Lafur yn y dyfodol hefyd? Hyn, yn anad dim, sydd wedi arwain at y toriadau llym i'r cynllun Tir Mynydd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Pe na bai adolygiad

independent review, there could conceivably have been a smidgen of truth in that argument. However, if an independent review says that there is no public benefit to this scheme and you take no action, all that you are doing is simply rolling over in front of the farm lobby. I am pleased to say that Carwyn Jones is not built in that way.

**Brynle Williams:** I would put it to you that you and the Government do not understand the intricacies of upland farming. You will cut Tir Mynydd from under the industry, you will cause land abandonment, and then you will pay an army of people to put your environmental scheme into practice. You will have lost the expertise. Why is Wales alone in reducing the LFA support when all other European member states, including Scotland and England, remain committed to social and economic support to farmers in disadvantaged upland areas?

**The First Minister:** Do not chuck insults around without any basis, Brynle. You have to be fair. If we have an independent review that criticises the lack of public benefits from the Tir Mynydd scheme, you have to take some note of that, otherwise you are spending public money, potentially, in a wasteful way, and that represents poor value for money. Even among upland farmers, it is quite a discriminatory scheme in that upland dairy farmers cannot benefit from it; only upland livestock farmers can benefit from it. Even within the uplands there is discrimination between two categories of farmers. There is certainly discrimination in not spending the money clearly for agri-environmental purposes when that is the trend of the reviews that have been carried out on Common Agricultural Policy subsidies in terms of switching over to single farm payments, so that we can have a clear gateway, starter schemes, and then the fully fledged schemes, such as Tir Gofal, as well. There is a clear public benefit there, which is agri-environmental. There is not that benefit from Tir Mynydd, which is a historical scheme; occasionally, you must review these historical schemes, and ask whether they are good value for money. The independent review body has said that this is not good

annibynnol wedi'i gynnal, mae'n bosibl y gallai'r ddadl honno fod â gronyn o wirionedd yn perthyn iddi. Fodd bynnag, os yw adolygiad annibynnol yn dweud nad oes dim budd cyhoeddus i'r cynllun hwn a chithau'n gwrthod gweithredu, y cwbl y mae rhywun yn ei wneud yw moesyngrymu o flaen y lobi ffermio. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad rhywun felly yw Carwyn Jones.

**Brynle Williams:** Awgrymaf wrthyhych nad ydych chi na'r Llywodraeth yn deall cymhlethdodau ffermio mynydd. Byddwch yn peri i'r diwydiant gollu Tir Mynydd, byddwch yn achosi i bobl adael y tir, ac yna byddwch yn talu i fyddin gyfan o bobl weithredu eich cynllun amgylcheddol. Byddwch wedi colli'r arbenigedd. Pam mai Cymru yw'r unig wlad i gwtogi ar y cymorth i'r ardaloedd llai ffafriol a holl wledydd eraill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, gan gynnwys Lloegr a'r Alban, yn ymrwymedig o hyd i gefnogi ffermwyr yn ardaloedd yr ucheldir sydd dan anfantais economaidd a chymdeithasol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Peidiwch â bod mor sarhaus a chithau heb sail dros fod felly, Brynle. Rhaid ichi fod yn deg. Os yw adolygiad annibynnol yn beirniadu'r diffyg budd i'r cyhoedd o'r cynllun Tir Mynydd, rhaid ichi roi sylw i hynny, neu fel arall gall rhywun fod yn gwario arian cyhoeddus mewn ffordd wastraffus, ac nid yw hynny'n rhoi gwerth da am arian. Hyd yn oed ymhlith ffermwyr mynydd, mae'n gynllun eithaf gwahaniaethol oherwydd ni all ffermwyr llaeth tir uchel elwa ohono; dim ond ffermwyr da byw yn yr ucheldir a all elwa ohono. Hyd yn oed o fewn yr ucheldir, gwahaniaethir rhwng dau gategori o ffermwyr. Yn ddi-os ceir gwahaniaethu oherwydd nad yw'r arian yn cael ei wario'n amlwg at ddibenion amaeth-amgylcheddol er mai hynny yw tuedd yr adolygiadau sydd wedi eu cynnal o gymorthdaliadau'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin o ran symud at y taliad sengl, fel bod gennym borth clir, cynlluniau cychwynnol, ac yna'r cynlluniau llawn fel Tir Gofal, hefyd. Mae budd amlwg i'r cyhoedd o wneud hynny, sy'n amaeth-amgylcheddol. Nid yw'r budd yn bodoli gyda'r cynllun Tir Mynydd, sy'n gynllun hanesyddol; ar adegau, rhaid i rywun adolygu'r cynlluniau hanesyddol hyn, a gofyn a ydynt yn rhoi gwerth am arian. Mae'r

value for money, and we have to take some action.

corff adolygu annibynnol wedi dweud nad yw'n rhoi gwerth da am arian, a rhaid inni weithredu ar hynny.

2.40 p.m.

**Darpariaeth Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg (Caerdydd)**  
**The Provision of Welsh-medium Education (Cardiff)**

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghaerdydd? OAQ1738(FM)

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of Welsh-medium education in Cardiff? OAQ1738(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cynyddu yng Nghaerdydd. Agorwyd ysgol gynradd â dosbarth derbyn ynddi yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Medi 2005, a bydd ysgol arall o'r math hwn yn dyblu o ran maint ym mis Medi eleni. Gall disgyblion fanteisio ar addysg ysgol gynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn 12 o ysgolion, ac mewn dwy ysgol uwchradd Gymraeg, sef Glantaf a Phlasmawr.

**The First Minister:** Demand for Welsh-medium education in Cardiff is increasing. A primary school containing a reception class opened in Cardiff in September 2005, and another such school will double in size this September. Pupils can access Welsh-medium primary education at 12 schools, and at two Welsh-medium secondary schools, namely Glantaf and Plasmawr.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod adran 29 Deddf Plant 2004 yn cael ei gwireddu, byddai'n galluogi awdurdodau addysg lleol i fynd at gronfa ddata yr ymddiriedolaethau iechyd er mwyn cynnal arolwg i bennu'r galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Gyda thystiolaeth gadarn o'r arolygon—o'r math y mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn ei hoffi—byddai'n bosibl cynllunio ar gyfer twf addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg â mwy o sicrwydd. Pryd y mae'r Llywodraeth, felly, yn bwriadu gwireddu adran 29 o Ddeddf Plant 2004?

**Owen John Thomas:** If the Government ensured that section 29 of the Children Act 2004 was realised, it would enable local authorities to access health trusts' databases in order to carry out a survey to see what is the demand for Welsh-medium education. With hard evidence from the surveys—of the type that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills likes—it would be possible to plan for Welsh-medium education growth with more certainty. When does the Government therefore intend to realise section 29 of the Children Act 2004?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi darparu'r canllawiau hynny yn union ar hyd y llinellau a ddisgrifiwch; ceir arolwg pan fo'r plant yn flwydd oed neu'n ddyflwydd oed, ac yn sicr cyn iddynt ddod at ddiwedd eu cyfnod mewn meithrinfa. Yn anffodus, fodd bynnag, nid yw Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi dilyn y canllawiau yr ydym wedi eu rhoi iddo.

**The First Minister:** We have provided those guidelines along the exact lines that you describe; a survey is undertaken when children are one year old or two years old, and certainly before they come to the end of their nursery education. Unfortunately, however, Cardiff County Council has not followed the guidelines that we have given it.

**Lisa Francis:** Has the First Minister, or any of his Cabinet colleagues, had any discussions with Cardiff County Council about how any fresh proposals to close schools in the city may affect Welsh-medium education? If any policy of centralisation

**Lisa Francis:** A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog, neu unrhyw un o'i gyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, wedi cynnal trafodaethau o gwbl gyda Chyngor Sir Caerdydd ynghylch sut y gallai unrhyw gynigion newydd i gau ysgolion yn y ddinas effeithio ar addysg

provides for Welsh-medium education, what assurances has the First Minister sought that this will not be at the expense of any existing educational provision?

**The First Minister:** That is the nub of the question, which Cardiff, as a county council and as a county council cabinet—and not as a Liberal Democrat/Labour coalition, as Leanne thinks—has struggled with, unsuccessfully so far. It is perhaps at the heart of its failure to get over this question of how you handle the rising demand for Welsh-medium education, and make it fit, when it is a rise of 3 or 4 per cent a year, and not a sudden big bulk for which you can build a big new school. It has not managed to get to grips with a sensible solution to deal with a gradual rise in the demand for Welsh-medium education, and the falling demand for English-medium education.

You ask whether we have had any discussions with the council. I had a brief, informal discussion about this matter in the course of another meeting with the council leader, Rodney Berman. I would imagine that there have been many discussions between officials, along the lines that I am talking about.

cyfrwng Cymraeg? Os bydd unrhyw bolisi o ganoli yn darparu ar gyfer addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, pa sicrwydd y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gofyn amdano i wneud yn siŵr na fydd hyn ar draul unrhyw ddarpariaeth addysgol bresennol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna hanfod y cwestiwn y mae Caerdydd, fel cyngor sir ac fel cabinet cyngor sir—ac nid fel clymblaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur, fel y tybia Leanne—wedi ymdrechu i'w ateb, yn aflwyddiannus hyd yma. Mae hyn efallai wrth wraidd ei fethiant i ateb y cwestiwn hwn ynghylch sut i ymdopi â'r galw cynyddol am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, a gwneud hynny mewn modd addas, pan fo'r cynnydd rhwng 3 a 4 y cant y flwyddyn, yn hytrach na galw mawr sydyn y gallwch adeiladu ysgol newydd fawr ar ei gyfer. Nid yw wedi llwyddo i ddod o hyd i ateb call i ymdopi â'r cynnydd graddol yn y galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, a'r lleihad yn y galw am addysg cyfrwng Saesneg.

Yr ydych yn gofyn a ydym wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r cyngor. Cefais drafodaeth fer, anffurfiol ynghylch y mater hwn yn ystod cyfarfod arall gydag arweinydd y cyngor, Rodney Berman. Byddwn yn tybio bod y swyddogion wedi cynnal llawer o drafodaethau ymysg ei gilydd, ar y llinellau yr wyf yn sôn amdanynt.

#### **Amseroedd Aros (Gwent) Waiting Times (Gwent)**

**Q7 Lynne Neagle:** Will the First Minister provide a further update on waiting times in Gwent? OAQ1734(FM)

**C7 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi diweddariad pellach i ni am amseroedd aros yng Ngwent? OAQ1734(FM)

**The First Minister:** Latest figures show that Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust is maintaining the 12-month target for in-patient day-case treatment and for a first out-patient appointment, and is now working towards achieving its 31 March 2007 target of a maximum eight-month wait.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent yn cadw at ei darged 12 mis o ran darparu triniaeth achosion dydd i gleifion mewnol a rhoi apwyntiad cyntaf i gleifion allanol, a bellach yn gweithio tuag at gyrraedd ei darged erbyn 31 Mawrth 2007, sef aros am wyth mis ar y mwyaf.

**Lynne Neagle:** You will be aware of recent concerns among healthcare staff in Gwent about the possible effects of deficits on front-line services, which can be partly explained by the long-term funding inequities, which mean that health funding is not distributed on

**Lynne Neagle:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o bryderon diweddar gan staff gofal iechyd yng Ngwent ynghylch effeithiau posibl diffygion ariannol ar wasanaethau rheng flaen, y gellir eu priodoli'n rhannol i'r anghydraddoldebau cyllido tymor hir, a all olygu nad yw cyllid



the basis of need in Wales, and which the Townsend formula was meant to address. Will the First Minister commit his Government to looking seriously at the recent Scottish proposal to plough £100 million into the poorest areas to end the injustice of health inequality? That is a redistributive proposal, which is being described as a revolutionary bid to slash the health gap between rich and poor. Will you look at that, with a view to seeing how we can accelerate the redistribution of health resources in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Again, I will have to check with officials on both those issues. As far as I was aware, we already have a health inequalities fund—I cannot remember whether it is £100 million, or something of that sort—and it has precisely the same purpose as the fund in Scotland that you describe. However, I will have to compare the two, and ask Brian to write to you.

On the question of the current status of the changes in funding that would arise from the quicker implementation of the Townsend formula, it has to be said that the implications of Townsend seem to change every year, as you are probably already aware, Lynne. Sometimes, you will be making additional funding available to place A in the first year only to find that you have to take it away again the following year, because that is how the Townsend formula seems to bring up the areas in alleged surplus or alleged deficit. However, we are extremely interested in trying to ensure that health inequalities in Wales are solved at the earliest possible date.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Health inequalities in Wales have not been solved, even though you have said since 1999 that they will be. We have seen in-patient waiting time go down in Gwent, but out-patient waiting times have gone up, so the overall waiting time from referral to treatment remains the same. Why is that, when the health budget has doubled since 1999? Why are we not seeing more significant improvements and why are we seeing front-line staff facing the loss of their

iechyd yn cael ei ddosbarthu ar sail angen yng Nghymru, sef rhywbeth yr oedd fformiwla Townsend i fod i'w ddatrys. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymrwymo i sicrhau bod ei Lywodraeth yn edrych o ddifrif ar y cynnig diweddar yn yr Alban i fuddsoddi £100 miliwn yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf i roi terfyn ar anghyfiawnder yr anghydraddoldebau iechyd? Cynnig i ailddosbarthu ydyw, sy'n cael ei ddisgrifio fel ymgais chwyldroadol i gau'r bwlch iechyd rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd. A wnewch edrych ar hynny, er mwyn gweld sut y gallwn brysuru ailddosbarthu ein hadnoddau iechyd yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Eto, bydd yn rhaid imi gadarnhau'r ddau fater gyda'm swyddogion. Hyd y gwn i, mae gennym gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd eisoes—ni allaf gofio ai £100 miliwn ydyw, neu rywbeth tebyg—a'r un pwrpas yn union sydd iddi â'r gronfa yn yr Alban y gwnaethoch ei disgrifio. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid imi gymharu'r ddwy, a gofyn i Brian ysgrifennu atoch.

Ynghylch statws presennol y newidiadau o ran cyllido a fyddai'n codi o roi fformiwla Townsend ar waith yn gynt, rhaid dweud ei bod yn ymddangos bod goblygiadau fformiwla Townsend yn newid o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, fel y gwyddoch yn barod, Lynne, yn ôl pob tebyg. Weithiau, byddwch yn darparu cyllid ychwanegol yn un lle yn y flwyddyn gyntaf ond yna dyma chi'n gweld bod rhaid ichi ei dynnu'n ôl y flwyddyn wedyn, gan ei bod yn ymddangos mai felly y mae fformiwla Townsend yn tynnu sylw at yr ardaloedd sydd â gwarged neu ddiffyg honedig. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn rhoi pwys mawr ar geisio sicrhau bod anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru'n cael eu datrys cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Nid yw anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru wedi'u datrys, er eich bod wedi dweud ers 1999 y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Gwelsom yr amser aros i gleifion mewdol yn gostwng yng Ngwent, ond mae'r amseroedd aros i gleifion allanol wedi codi, felly mae'r amser aros cyffredinol rhwng atgyfeirio a chael triniaeth yn aros yr un fath. Pam y mae felly, a'r gyllideb iechyd wedi dyblu ers 1999? Pam nad ydym yn gweld gwelliannau mwy sylweddol a pham yr ydym

jobs?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether I accept either of those propositions, to be honest, Jocelyn. You will have to write to me about the first one, because I am bewildered by the allegation you are making. I can see from Brian's body language that he is equally bewildered, so please give us some facts and figures on that. We understand that Gwent NHS Trust is at the bottom of the league table that no-one wants to be at the bottom of, because it has the biggest deficit of any NHS trust in Wales: £6.2 million. Naturally, people will say that it must have a recovery plan and will ask what that consists of. You say that it will definitely consist of people losing their jobs, but we do not know that. You may be reading headlines about what is going on over the border in England and assuming that that will definitely happen in Wales, when it will not definitely happen in Wales. We will have to see what happens when Gwent NHS Trust agrees its recovery plan with our NHS management. However, it cannot carry on being subsidised, in effect, by other trusts that are better at balancing their books. If you keep writing off the deficits, as was happening until recently, all that happens is that a permanent culture of deficit is created.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Recent cancer waiting time figures in Gwent and throughout Wales have shown that hundreds of cancer patients are awaiting treatment despite being diagnosed as urgent cases. As you will be aware, cancer patients diagnosed as urgent cases should start definitive treatment within two months of referral. First Minister, will you comment on whether your targets for cancer waiting times can be met by the end of the year, and how you are setting out to achieve this?

**The First Minister:** I will ask Brian to write to you on that, because he and I are in frequent discussion about cancer waiting

yn gweld bod staff y rheng flaen yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o golli eu swyddi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a wyf yn derbyn dim un o'r gosodiadau hynny, a dweud y gwir, Jocelyn. Bydd yn rhaid ichi ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch y cyntaf, gan fod y cyhuddiad yr ydych yn ei wneud yn peri penbleth i mi. Gallaf weld oddi wrth iaith gorfforol Brian ei fod mewn cymaint o benbleth â minnau, felly rhowch inni ychydig o ffeithiau a ffigurau ynghylch hynny, os gwelwch yn dda. Yr ydym yn deall bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwent ar waelod y gynghrair nad oes neb am fod ar ei gwaelod, gan mai ganddi hi y mae'r diffyg mwyaf o holl ymddiriedolaethau GIG Cymru: £6.2 miliwn. Wrth gwrs, bydd pobl yn dweud bod rhaid iddi gael cynllun adfer ac yn gofyn beth sydd ynddo. Yr ydych chi'n dweud y bydd yn sicr o olygu bod pobl yn colli eu swyddi, ond nid ydym yn gwybod hynny. Efallai'ch bod yn darllen penawdau am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yr ochr draw i'r ffin yn Lloegr ac yn cymryd y bydd hynny'n sicr o ddigwydd yng Nghymru, er nad yw'n sicr o ddigwydd yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth fydd yn digwydd pan gytna Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwent ar ei chynllun adfer gyda'n rheolwyr GIG. Fodd bynnag, ni all barhau i gael cymhorthdal, i bob pwrpas, gan ymddiriedolaethau eraill sydd yn well am fantoli eu cyfrifon. Os daliwch i ddileu'r diffygion, fel a oedd yn digwydd hyd yn ddiweddar, ni fydd hynny ond yn creu diwylliant parhaol o ddiffyg.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'r ffigurau diweddar ynghylch amser aros cleifion sydd â chanser yng Ngwent a ledled Cymru wedi dangos bod cannoedd o gleifion sydd â chanser yn aros am driniaeth er eu bod yn achosion brys yn ôl y diagnosis. Fel y gwyddoch, dylai cleifion sydd â chanser y bernir yn ôl y diagnosis eu bod yn achosion brys, ddechrau cael triniaeth bendant cyn pen dau fis ar ôl cael eu hatgyfeirio. Brif Weinidog, a wnewch sylw ynghylch a ellir cyrraedd eich targedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros cleifion sydd â chanser erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, a'r camau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i gyflawni hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynnaf i Brian ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny, gan y bydd ef a minnau'n cynnal trafodaethau'n aml am

times. It is one of the areas in which we must see a substantial improvement. We know that waiting times are too long, but there is a much better organisation going in to try to sort out our cancer waiting times. We know that urgent cancers are dealt with urgently, but, nevertheless, we are not happy with the current state of play and we want to see a major improvement over the next year or so.

amseroedd aros cleifion sydd â chanser. Mae'n un o'r meysydd lle y mae'n rhaid inni weld gwelliant sylweddol. Gwyddom fod yr amseroedd aros yn rhy hir, ond mae gwaith trefnu gwell o lawer yn digwydd i geisio rhoi trefn ar amseroedd aros cleifion sydd â chanser. Gwyddom fod canserau sydd yn galw am sylw brys yn cael eu trin ar frys, ond, er hynny, nid ydym yn fodlon ar y sefyllfa bresennol ac yr ydym am weld gwelliant mawr yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf.

### **Y Portffolio Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio**

**Q8 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for the education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio? OAQ1725(FM)

**C8 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y portffolio addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau? OAQ1725(FM)

**The First Minister:** I will highlight one priority where we are attempting to meet the demands of the business community that practical skills get praised and esteemed more in the education system, namely key skills. I believe that Wales is now awarding 25 per cent of all key skills awards in the United Kingdom, despite having only 5 per cent of the population.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Tynnaf sylw at un flaenoriaeth lle'r ydym yn ceisio ateb galwadau'r gymuned fusnes am roi mwy o glod a pharch i sgiliau ymarferol yn y system addysg, sef sgiliau allweddol. Yr wyf yn credu mai Cymru bellach sydd yn rhoi 25 y cant o'r holl ddyfarniadau ar gyfer sgiliau allweddol yn y Deyrnas Unedig, er nad oes ganddi ond 5 y cant o'i phoblogaeth.

**Janet Ryder:** In light of the answers that you gave earlier regarding further education provision, and given that your Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has admitted that, since 2003, there has been a 3 per cent reduction in further education provision, can we now take it that your election pledge to increase the provision in further education is now a broken promise?

**Janet Ryder:** Yng ngoleuni'r atebion a roesoch yn gynharach am y ddarpariaeth addysg bellach, ac o gofio bod eich Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi cyfaddef bod 3 y cant o ostyngiad wedi bod yn y ddarpariaeth addysg bellach ers 2003, a allwn gymryd yn awr fod eich addewid etholiadol i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth addysg bellach wedi'i thorri?

**The First Minister:** Despite what I said earlier, you are confusing the numbers of courses with the numbers of students. You are talking about a reduction in the number of courses as though that automatically meant a reduction in the number of students, but those two things do not go together at all. As I said 15 minutes ago, it is far more efficient to be teaching 16-year-olds in groups of 15 or 20 than in two groups of 10, four groups of five or whatever. We have to make an exception in rural areas and in the case of Welsh-medium education but, broadly speaking, the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach, yr ydych yn cymysgu rhwng nifer y cyrsiau a nifer y myfyrwyr. Yr ydych yn sôn am ostyngiad yn nifer y cyrsiau fel petai hynny'n golygu o reidrwydd fod nifer y myfyrwyr yn llai, ond nid yw'r ddau beth hynny'n cyd-fynd o gwbl. Fel y dywedais 15 munud yn ôl, mae'n llawer mwy effeithlon dysgu rhai 16 mlwydd oed mewn grwpiau o 15 neu 20 nag mewn dau grŵp o 10, pedwar grŵp o bump neu beth bynnag y bo. Rhaid inni wneud eithriad mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac yn achos addysg

bigger the class, up to a certain point, like 20 and 25, it means fewer courses, but more students.

2.50 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** At a dinner yesterday evening, hosted by ConstructionSkills and attended by many employers from the construction industry and other sector skills councils, such as SummitSkills, our proposals for developing vocational education—the 14-19 learning pathways and our programme of modern apprenticeships—were warmly praised by those present. Do you agree that our drive to ensure that vocational education, whether in the form of the 14-19 learning pathways or our drive for modern apprenticeships, either at the foundation or the full stage, will be key to our education and learning agenda in the future?

**The First Minister:** I do. The level at which apprenticeships are being taken up in Wales is more than double that in England. I think that 7.5 people per 1,000 in that age group are going in for modern apprenticeships in Wales compared with 3.5 people in England. That is a remarkable achievement for Education and Learning Wales and for us over the past seven years. There has been a huge drive to try to make good the collapse of the apprenticeships scheme during the bad old years of the 1980s and the early 1990s and to try to put that right before the last of the old apprentice-trained craftspersons from the 1960s and 1970s retire and are unable to pass on their wisdom. Likewise, on a wider front, the Construction Industry Training Board and Cardiff City Council scheme, which is extensively supported by us to cover different aspects of construction trades, is absolutely vital to the major boom that is expected in construction in Wales over the next few years.

**William Graham:** One of your priorities is about replacing schools. Would you not agree that they should not be replaced just on the grounds of age and that there should not be one policy, but each school should be

cyfrwng Cymraeg ond, yn gyffredinol, po fwyaf yw'r dosbarth, hyd at ryw bwynt, fel 20 a 25, lleiaf fydd nifer y cyrsiau, ond bydd mwy o fyfyrwyr.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mewn cinio neithiwr a gynhaliwyd gan ConstructionSkills, lle'r oedd llawer o gyflogwyr y diwydiant adeiladu a chynghorau sgiliau sector eraill, fel SummitSkills, yn bresennol, cafwyd canmoliaeth fawr gan y rhai a oedd yno i'n cynigion ar gyfer datblygu addysg alwedigaethol—y llwybrau dysgu 14-19 a'n rhaglen prentisiaethau modern. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd ein hymgyrch i sicrhau addysg alwedigaethol o'r fath, boed ar ffurf y llwybrau dysgu 14-19 neu drwy ein hymgyrch dros brentisiaethau modern, un ai yn y cam sylfaenol neu'r cam llawn, yn hollbwysig ar gyfer ein hagenda ar addysg a dysgu yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Mae cyfradd ymgymryd â phrentisiaethau yng Nghymru'n fwy na dwywaith yr hyn ydyw yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn credu bod 7.5 o bobl o bob 1,000 yn y grŵp oedran hwnnw'n dewis ymgymryd â phrentisiaethau modern yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 3.5 o bobl yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n gamp nodedig ar ran Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac ar ein rhan ni dros y saith mlynedd diwethaf. Cafwyd ymgyrch aruthrol i wneud iawn am gwmp y cynllun prentisiaethau yn ystod blynyddoedd llwm yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au ac i geisio unioni hynny cyn y bydd yr olaf o'r crefftwyr a hyfforddwyd dan yr hen brentisiaethau yn yr 1960au a'r 1970au yn ymddeol fel na fyddant yn gallu trosglwyddo eu gwybodaeth. Yn yr un modd, mewn cyd-destun ehangach, mae Bwrdd Hyfforddi'r Diwydiant Adeiladu a chynllun Cyngor Dinas Caerdydd, sydd yn cael cymorth sylweddol gennym i ofalu am wahanol agweddau ar grefftau adeiladu, yn hollbwysig ar gyfer y cynnydd mawr a ddisgwylir ym maes adeiladu yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf.

**William Graham:** Mae un o'ch blaenoriaethau'n ymwneud â chodi adeiladau newydd i ysgolion yn lle'r hen rai. Oni chytunech nad ar sail eu hoed yn unig y dylid codi rhai yn eu lle ac nad un polisi a ddylai

considered on a case-by-case basis? Some of our older buildings remain almost fit for purpose and require only certain works of improvement, particularly in terms of fire prevention or fire proofing, rather than building a new school.

**The First Minister:** I do not know whether you thought that you would be disagreeing with me or Jane Davidson, but, in fact, you have stated our policy. In other words, it is not age that determines whether a school is fit for purpose; it is how well it has been maintained, and how sound it is in wind and limb, in terms of its roof, fire precautions and other modern necessities. Some schools that were built in the 1880s are absolutely wonderful inside and are perfectly fit for purpose for another 40 years, while we all know of other schools that were built in the pre-pill baby-boom era of the 1960s, and which, after only 20 years, could be knocked down in about five seconds flat in high winds or by a bulldozer, because they were of Meccano-like construction. They fry the kids and the teachers in the summer and freeze them in winter. Those may be only 40 years old, but they are at least 20 years past their sell-by date. We have to do repairs and maintenance, or replacements of both categories.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 9, OAQ1723(FM), is withdrawn.

fod, ond y dylid ystyried pob ysgol fesul un? Mae rhai o'n hadeiladau hŷn yn dal i fod bron yn addas i'w diben ac nid oes angen ond ychydig o welliannau iddynt, yn enwedig o ran atal tân neu ddiogelu rhag tân, yn hytrach na chodi ysgol newydd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gwybod a oeddech yn tybio y byddech yn anghytuno â mi neu Jane Davidson, ond, mewn gwirionedd, yr ydych wedi datgan ein polisi. Mewn geiriau eraill, nid ei hoed sydd yn pennu a yw ysgol yn addas i'w diben, ond pa mor dda y mae wedi'i chynnal, a pha mor gadarn yw ei hadeiladwaith, o ran ei tho, gofal rhag tân ac angenrheidiau modern eraill. Mae rhai ysgolion a godwyd yn yr 1880au'n rhagorol y tu mewn a byddant yn berffaith addas i'w diben am 40 mlynedd arall, tra gwyddom oll am ysgolion eraill a godwyd yng nghyfnod y cynnydd mawr yn nifer y genedigaethau cyn dyddiau'r bilsen yn yr 1960au, y gallai gwyntoedd uchel neu darw dur eu dymchwel mewn pum eiliad union, a hynny ar ôl dim ond 20 mlynedd, gan fod eu hadeiladwaith yn debyg i Meccano. Maent yn crasu'r plant a'r athrawon yn yr haf ac yn eu rhewi yn y gaeaf. Gallai'r rheini fod yn ddim ond 40 mlwydd oed, ond mae eu hoes wedi gorffen ers o leiaf 20 mlynedd. Rhaid inni wneud gwaith trwsio a chynnal a chadw, neu godi adeiladau yn lle rhai yn y ddau gategori.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ1723(FM), yn ôl.

### **Hybu Cadw Gwastraff i Isafswm Promoting Waste Minimisation**

**Q10 Michael German:** What is the Assembly Government doing to promote waste minimisation? OAQ1732(FM)

**C10 Michael German:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i hybu cadw gwastraff i isafswm? OAQ1732(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have issued guidance to local authorities on this subject, and we promote a number of programmes to reduce waste, such as home composting, furniture reuse, reusable nappy collection and return, as well as cutting junk mail, public sector waste, and product waste and packaging.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi rhoi canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol ar y pwnc hwn, ac yr ydym yn hyrwyddo nifer o raglenni i leihau gwastraff, fel compostio yn y cartref, aildefnyddio dodrefn, casglu a dychwelyd clytiau aml dro, yn ogystal â chwtoegi ar bost sothach, gwastraff y sector cyhoeddus, a gwastraff a deunydd pacio cynhyrchion.

**Michael German:** I am sure that you would

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn sicr yr hoffech

like to congratulate the Women's Institute on its campaign to reduce packaging. Currently, packaging costs each person in this country £465. Do you think that it is time that the Government takes more stringent action to ensure that that figure is reduced, and that the cost to the individual's purse is reduced substantially?

**The First Minister:** These are mostly matters for the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and the Department of Trade and Industry, as I think you would agree. However, the devolved administrations, including us, are certainly involved on most of these review working parties, working with the food industry or the brown-goods/white-goods industry to ensure that companies do not believe it necessary to package everything as though it were a cross between the Crown jewels and a Russian doll. There is a huge amount of ripping off of vast quantities of material. It is true that packaging is mostly there to avoid damage to food in transit and so on, and so we understand the purpose of it, but it could be done far better with a bit more thought. There would not then be such a necessity to collect and, when you can, recycle excess packaging.

**Glyn Davies:** One way to encourage waste minimisation is by putting a lot more pressure on people to promote recycling. The more people are pressurised to recycle, the more aware they are of not creating such material in the first place. A lot of authorities in Wales are good, but some are not so good. That is where the biggest scope to promote this lies. What pressure is your Government putting on those local authorities in Wales that are simply not delivering on their recycling budget, so that the people in those areas can start to put pressure on them to minimise waste?

**The First Minister:** I think that I am right in saying that we have agreed a target of recycling 40 per cent of municipal waste by 2010. There has been huge progress in the percentage recycled over the past few years—it has gone from about 6 per cent to 20 per cent, which is massive progress, though still nowhere near 40 per cent. However, we have made a lot of progress and

longyfarch Sefydliad y Merched ar ei ymgyrch i leihau deunydd pacio. Ar hyn o bryd, mae deunydd pacio'n costio £465 i bob un yn y wlad hon. A ydych yn credu ei bod yn bryd i'r Llywodraeth gymryd camau llymach i sicrhau bod y ffigur hwnnw'n llai, a bod y gost i'r unigolyn yn llai o lawer?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Materion i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yw'r rhain gan mwyaf, fel y cytunech, yr wyf yn credu. Er hynny, mae'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig, a ninnau yn eu plith, yn sicr yn cymryd rhan yn y rhan fwyaf o'r gweithgorau adolygu hyn, gan weithio gyda'r diwydiant bwyd neu'r diwydiant nwyddau brown/nwyddau gwyn i sicrhau nad yw cwmnïau'n barnu bod angen pacio pob dim fel petai'n groesiad rhwng tlysau'r Goron a dol Rwsiaidd. Mae llawer iawn iawn o ddeunydd yn cael ei rwygo. Mae'n wir mai prif bwrpas y deunydd pacio yw atal difrod i fwyd wrth ei gludo ac yn y blaen, felly yr ydym yn deall hynny, ond gellid gwneud hynny'n well o lawer drwy roi ychydig mwy o sylw iddo. Wedyn ni fyddai cymaint o angen casglu deunydd pacio dros ben a'i ailgylchu, pan fo hynny'n bosibl.

**Glyn Davies:** Un dull o hybu camau i leihau gwastraff yw rhoi llawer mwy o bwysau ar bobl i hyrwyddo ailgylchu. Po fwyaf y pwysau ar bobl i ailgylchu, mwyaf ymwybodol y byddant o'r angen i beidio â chreu'r fath ddeunydd yn y lle cyntaf. Ceir llawer o awdurdodau da yng Nghymru, ond mae eraill sydd heb fod cystal. Dyna lle y mae'r cyfle mwyaf i hyrwyddo hyn. Pa bwysau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei roi ar yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn gwneud defnydd o'u cyllideb ar gyfer ailgylchu, fel y gall y bobl yn yr ardaloedd hynny ddechrau pwysu arnynt i leihau gwastraff?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn credu fy mod yn gywir wrth ddweud ein bod wedi cytuno ar darged ar gyfer ailgylchu 40 y cant o wastraff trefol erbyn 2010. Cafwyd cynnydd mawr o ran y ganran a ailgylchir dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf—cododd o tua 6 y cant i 20 y cant, ac mae hynny'n gam mawr ymlaen, er ei fod yn dal i fod yn bell o 40 y cant. Fodd bynnag, gwnaethom lawer o

we believe that we can reach that 40 per cent target, though I know that it is well below the Scandinavian and German figures, which are in the region of 60 per cent and 70 per cent. However, if you were to arrange the 22 local authorities in Wales in a league table according to who is recycling 25 per cent and who is still stuck at 9 or 10 per cent, you will see that, of course, some will be at the top and some will be at the bottom. Spreading good practice from the good authorities to the laggard ones is an essential part of the job that we have to do if we are to reach that target of 40 per cent by 2010. However, the goodwill is there.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Gwynedd sydd bron â chyrraedd y targed o 25 y cant, a hynny flwyddyn ymlaen llaw. Bu ichi sôn yn eich ateb am gompostio, ac mae llywodraeth leol yn falch o ddefnyddio'r tunelli hyn sy'n dod o gompostio am ei fod yn wastraff trwm. Fodd bynnag, mewn gwirionedd, a gytunwch ei fod yn wastraffus i fynd o gwmpas tai yn casglu gwastraff gwyrdd a gwastraff cegin, fel llysiau ac ati, gan wastraffu disel tra dylem fod yn compostio gwastraff o'r fath adref gyda fformiwla a fyddai'n caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol gyfrif y gwastraff hwnnw yn rhan o'u cyfanswm ailgylchu? A yw eich Llywodraeth yn ceisio cael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i dderbyn yr egwyddor honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae compostio gwastraff o'r ardd yn bwnc diddorol i bawb. Yn bersonol, yr wyf yn ei wneud, ond mae'n ddiddorol gwybod na allwch roi peth gwastraff o'r ardd yn y pwll yn compost. Rhaid ichi fod yn weddol glir ynghylch yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud. Rhaid ystyried a ddylech roi pethau fel plisg wyau i mewn, fel yr oedd fy nhad yn ei wneud, neu eu gadael allan, fel yr wyf fi yn ei wneud, gan fod arnaf ofn denu llygod Ffrengig ac ati. Y peth pwysig yw nad oes gan lawer o bobl ddigon o le yn eu gerddi ar gyfer pwll yn compost, ond eto, os ydych yn rhoi'r gwastraff mewn bag du, nid yw'r cyngor yn fodlon ei gasglu. Rhaid sicrhau ein bod yn maximeiddio potensial compostio.

gynnydd ac yr ydym yn credu y gallwn gyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 40 y cant, er fy mod yn gwybod ei fod yn is o lawer na'r ffigurau ar gyfer gwledydd Llychlyn a'r Almaen, sef tua 60 y cant a 70 y cant. Fodd bynnag, pe byddech yn gosod y 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru mewn tabl cynghrair yn ôl pwy sydd yn ailgylchu 25 y cant a phwy sydd yn dal i fod ar 9 neu 10 y cant, gwelech, wrth gwrs, fod rhai yn y pen uchaf a rhai ar y gwaelod. Mae lledaenu arferion da o'r awdurdodau da i'r rhai sydd ar ei hôl hi'n rhan hanfodol o'r gwaith y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud os ydym i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 40 y cant erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, mae digon o ewyllys da.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I am sure that you will join me in congratulating Cyngor Gwynedd, which has almost reached the 25 per cent target, a year ahead of schedule. You mentioned composting in your answer, and local government is glad of that tonnage that comes from composting, because it is heavy waste. However, do you agree that, in reality, it is wasteful to go from house to house collecting green waste and kitchen waste, such as vegetables and so on, as it is a waste of diesel when we should be composting such waste at home and using a formula that would allow local authorities to calculate that waste as part of their recycling total? Is your Government making any moves towards trying to get the European Union to accept that principle?

**The First Minister:** Composting garden waste is an interesting subject for us all. Personally, I do it, but it is interesting that there is some garden waste that you cannot put on the compost heap and so you must be fairly sure about what you are doing. You have to consider whether you should put things like egg shells on the heap, as my father did, or leave them out, as I do, because I am afraid of attracting rats and so on. The important thing is that many people do not have enough room in their gardens for a compost heap, and yet, if you put such waste in a black bag, the council will not be willing to collect it. We must ensure that we maximise the potential of composting.

**Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993**  
**The Welsh Language Act 1993**

**Q11 Leanne Wood:** What recent discussions has the First Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding the Welsh Language Act 1993? OAQ1726(FM)

**The First Minister:** My recent discussions with Peter Hain, the Secretary of State for Wales, on the Government of Wales Bill have touched on the Welsh Language Act 1993, and I was pleased that, on 27 June, a Government amendment, paralleling the previous amendment put down by Lord Prys-Davies, was passed overwhelmingly in the House of Lords and now forms part of the Bill.

**Leanne Wood:** British Gas recently sent me some publicity information about schemes that it offers to customers for help with their energy costs. My office phoned up to ask for that information in Welsh, and the reply was, 'British Gas does not do any bilingual marketing in Wales'. Will you agree to raise this issue with British Gas? If it does not respond positively, will you agree to consider bringing British Gas under the remit of the 1993 Act? Finally, when will you honour your promise, made in 1993, to introduce a new Welsh language Act?

**The First Minister:** If you read what I said in 1993, you will see that I said nothing of the sort. I have honoured exactly what I said in 1993. It is you and others who are attempting to rearrange my words. I did not say anything about introducing a new Welsh language Act, so please get a new pair of glasses and read what I said. As regards what you said about British Gas, I am happy to take up this issue, either myself or with Alun Pugh. I wish that you would not repeat this canard, which has come from various students who ought to know better; you are following them and I regret that.

**Lisa Francis:** Language needs evolve as times change; we have only to look at the

**C11 Leanne Wood:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993? OAQ1726(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae fy nhrafodaethau diweddar gyda Peter Hain, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyffwrdd â Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, ac yr oeddwn yn falch bod gwelliant o eiddo'r Llywodraeth, a oedd yn debyg i'r gwelliant blaenorol a gyflwynwyd gan yr Arglwydd Prys-Davies, wedi'i dderbyn â mwyafrif llethol yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi ar 27 Mehefin a'i fod bellach yn rhan o'r Mesur.

**Leanne Wood:** Yn ddiweddar, anfonodd Nwy Prydain wybodaeth gyhoeddusrwydd ataf am gynlluniau y mae'n eu cynnig i gwsmeriaid i'w helpu i dalu eu costau ynni. Gwnaed galwad ffôn o'm swyddfa i ofyn am y wybodaeth honno yn y Gymraeg, a'r ateb a gafwyd oedd, 'Nid yw Nwy Prydain yn ymgymryd â dim marchnata dwyieithog yng Nghymru'. A wnewch gytuno i godi'r mater hwn gyda Nwy Prydain? Os na wnaiff ymateb yn gadarnhaol, a gytunwch i ystyried dod â Nwy Prydain o fewn cwmpas Deddf 1993? Yn olaf, pa bryd y cywirwch eich addewid, a wnaed yn 1993, i gyflwyno Deddf iaith Gymraeg newydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os darllenwch yr hyn a ddywedais yn 1993, gwelwch na ddywedais ddim o'r fath beth. Yr wyf wedi dal yn union at yr hyn a ddywedais yn 1993. Chi ac eraill sydd yn ceisio aildrefnu fy ngeiriau. Ni ddywedais ddim am gyflwyno Deddf iaith Gymraeg newydd, felly mynnwch sbectol newydd, os gwelwch yn dda, a darllen yr hyn a ddywedais. O ran yr hyn a ddywedaisoch am Nwy Prydain, yr wyf yn fodlon codi'r mater hwn, un ai fy hun neu gydag Alun Pugh. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na fyddech yn ailadrodd y chwedl wag hon, a gafwyd gan amryw o fyfyrwyr a ddylai wybod yn well; yr ydych yn eu dilyn ac mae hynny'n ofid imi.

**Lisa Francis:** Rhaid i iaith ddatblygu wrth i'r amseroedd newid; nid oes rhaid inni ond



explosion of technology in the past 20 years to see the impact that that has had on the language that we use every day. Have you had any discussions with UK Ministers about recent legislation enacted in Ireland and Scotland in respect of their languages? If so, what conclusions have you drawn from those discussions?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of any new discussions involving Ireland and Scotland about the official status of the Welsh language or any other aspect of language law. I have been watching what has been happening in other parts of the world that are, in some ways, more similar to Wales. However, we do keep an eye on what you call 'best international practice', and we would like to promote it here.

edrych ar dwf technoleg yn yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf i weld yr effaith a gafodd hynny ar yr iaith a ddefnyddiwn bob dydd. A ydych wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Gweinidogion y DU ynghylch deddfwriaeth a wnaed yn Iwerddon a'r Alban yn ddiweddar mewn cysylltiad â'u hieithoedd? Os ydych, i ba gasgliadau y daethoch ar sail y trafodaethau hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o drafodaethau newydd a oedd yn ymwneud ag Iwerddon a'r Alban am statws swyddogol y Gymraeg na dim un agwedd arall ar gyfraith iaith. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gwylio'r hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd sydd, mewn rhai pethau, yn debycach i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ceisio cadw llygad ar yr hyn a alwch yn 'arferion rhyngwladol gorau', a byddem yn hoffi eu hyrwyddo yma.

3.00 p.m.

In the main, you will find that many areas of the private sector have come on board voluntarily—Tesco, Principality Building Society, Leekes department stores and, internationally, Microsoft and BT as well—without there being the necessity for new legislation in this area.

Drwyddi draw, fe welwch fod llawer o feysydd yn y sector preifat wedi ymuno o'u gwirfodd—Tesco, Cymdeithas Adeiladu Principality, siopau Leekes ac, yn rhyngwladol, Microsoft a BT hefyd—heb fod yn rhaid wrth ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn y maes hwn.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** As well the welcome to Trish Law to her first Plenary, I have just one change to report to this week's business. Unless any Member objects, it has been proposed that the motion to approve the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006 and the motion to approve Directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board 2006 will be grouped together for debate, but with separate votes.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yn ogystal â chroesawu Trish Law i'w Chyfarfod Llawn cyntaf, mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Oni bai fod aelod yn gwrthwynebu, cynigiwyd y bydd y cynnig i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 a'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf 2006 yn cael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd, ond gyda phleidleisiau ar wahân.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which is available to Members on the agenda.

Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally propose the business statement.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae dau fater, fel y gwyddoch, Drefnydd, y gwnaethom ofyn amdanynt yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma. Y cyntaf oedd inni gael datganiad neu ddatl ar flaenraglen waith y Llywodraeth. Deallaf, am ryw reswm, nad yw hynny i'w gynnal tan 4 Hydref, sy'n amser maith i ffwrdd. Mwy na lai, bydd mor agos ag sydd yn bosibl at yr etholiad nesaf cyn y cawn wybod blaenraglen y Llywodraeth.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** There are two matters, as you know, Business Minister, that we asked for in this morning's Business Committee meeting. The first was for a statement or debate on the Government's forward work programme. I understand that, for some reason, that will not be held until 4 October, which is an awfully long time away. More or less, it will be as close to the election as possible before we know the Government's forward programme.

Yn ail, gwnaethom ofyn am ddatganiad clir ar ddyfodol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, gan fod y cyfnod ymgynghorol wedi dod i ben. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn cael y cyfle i gwestiynu'r Gweinidog am unrhyw ddatganiad. Deallaf mai ymateb y Llywodraeth yw bod modd codi materion yng nghyd-destun y ddatl ar 'Iaith Pawb', ond, wrth gwrs, rhan yn unig o'r drafodaeth honno y gellid ei neilltuo ar gyfer bwrdd yr iaith, a chredwn mai'r hyn sydd ei angen, a'r hyn y mae pobl Cymru yn ei haeddu, yw datganiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos hon neu'r wythnos nesaf inni gael gwybod yn union safbwynt y Llywodraeth am ddyfodol y bwrdd.

Secondly, we asked for a clear statement on the future of the Welsh Language Board, given that the consultation period has ended. It is important that we have an opportunity to question the Minister about any statement. I understand that the Government's response is that these matters can be raised in the context of the 'Iaith Pawb' debate, but, of course, only part of that discussion can be given over to the language board, and we believe that what is needed, and what the people of Wales deserve, is a statement in Plenary this week or next week so that we can know exactly what the Government's position is with regard to the board's future.

**Lisa Francis:** Business Minister, I am grateful that you have gone to some lengths to dovetail in many written statements—not that we asked for written statements, but you have said that these will be produced by the end of the week. I accept that there is much to get through before the end of term, but we have to vote against the business statement on the grounds that the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport will not be making a statement on the Welsh Language Board merger, having said that he feels it is sufficient to discuss this in the ‘Iaith Pawb’ debate next week. We feel that this is an important enough issue to warrant a statement in its own right, and for that reason, we will not support the business statement.

**Peter Black:** I echo the previous speakers’ sentiments in thanking the Business Minister for bringing forward a debate on the Government’s work programme—it is just a shame that we will have that debate when there are only six to seven months left of the Government’s term. It is a shame that we have not had the opportunity to debate that previously, and that we have had to press so hard to get that debate.

Like the other speakers, the Liberal Democrats feel strongly that there is a need for a statement on the Welsh Language Board merger before we break for recess. I understand that one was promised and has not been forthcoming. It is important that we have that statement so that we know exactly where we stand and do not allow this issue to fall into abeyance for the two to three months before we return to this Chamber. Therefore, we, too, will oppose the business statement.

**Lisa Francis:** Drefnydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi mynd i drafferth i ymgorffori llawer o ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig—nid ein bod wedi gofyn am ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig, ond yr ydych wedi dweud y caiff y rhain eu cynhyrchu erbyn diwedd yr wythnos. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod llawer i’w wneud cyn diwedd y tymor, ond rhaid inni bleidleisio yn erbyn y datganiad busnes ar y sail na fydd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn gwneud datganiad am ddod â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg o dan adain y Llywodraeth, gan ddweud ei fod o’r farn ei bod yn ddigonol trafod hyn yn y ddadl am ‘Iaith Pawb’ yr wythnos nesaf. Teimlwn fod hwn yn fater digon pwysig i haeddu datganiad ei hun, ac am y rheswm hwnnw, ni fyddwn yn cefnogi’r datganiad busnes.

**Peter Black:** Adleisiaf deimladau’r siaradwyr blaenorol wrth ddiolch i’r Trefnydd am gyflwyno dadl am raglen waith y Llywodraeth—ond mae’n drueni y byddwn yn cynnal y ddadl honno gyda dim ond chwech i saith mis ar ôl o dymor y Llywodraeth. Mae’n drueni nad ydym wedi cael y cyfle i drafod hynny cyn hyn, a’n bod wedi gorfod pwyso mor galed i gael y ddadl honno.

Fel y siaradwyr eraill, mae’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn teimlo’n gryf fod angen datganiad am ddod â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg o dan adain y Llywodraeth cyn y toriad. Deallaf fod dadl wedi cael ei haddo ond ni chafwyd un. Mae’n bwysig inni gael y datganiad hwnnw fel ein bod yn gwybod yn union ymhle yr ydym yn sefyll ac nad ydym yn gadael y mater hwn heb benderfynu arno yn ystod y ddau neu dri mis cyn inni ddychwelyd i’r Siambr hon. Felly, byddwn ninnau, hefyd, yn gwrthwynebu’r datganiad busnes.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I sense a certain amount of confusion, as I did respond to your requests for a debate on the Government's forward work programme. Peter, I do not recall this pressing call coming from you, or from Lisa; I acknowledge that Jocelyn has raised this with me, but only in the last two or three weeks with regard to the business statement. Of course we welcome the opportunity to debate our Government's forward work programme. Indeed, that is why we are seizing this opportunity to schedule it for 4 October. Why that date? It is because, every week, I am presented with a large number of requests for statements and debates from the opposition parties. It would be nice if we could see a certain amount of political grace, if there is such a concept, and a recognition of the give and take that I have displayed. It is important that we schedule the debate, and it will give us a good opportunity for the six months that take us forward to the election, in which Welsh Labour will come through with flying colours.

In terms of the other important issue that you raised, a debate has been scheduled for next Tuesday on the annual report on 'Iaith Pawb'. That will, of course, allow Members an opportunity to raise any matter relating to the Welsh language. The Minister also intends to issue a written statement in advance of the debate, and that is what I have always indicated. I am disappointed that that recognition has not come through from opposition parties today, but, as far as we are concerned, we are on the front foot with our forward work programme debate on 4 October, and our full response on 'Iaith Pawb' and what we are doing in terms of the Welsh language and the Welsh Language Board.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn synhwyro rhywfaint o ddryswch, gan imi ymateb i'ch ceisiadau am ddatl am flaenraglen waith y Llywodraeth. Peter, ni chofiaf yr alwad daer hon yn dod oddi wrthyh chi, nac oddi wrth Lisa; yr wyf yn cydnabod bod Jocelyn wedi codi hyn gyda mi, ond dim ond yn y ddwy neu dair wythnos ddiwethaf mewn perthynas â'r datganiad busnes. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod blaenraglen waith ein Llywodraeth. Yn wir, dyna pam yr ydym yn achub ar y cyfle hwn i'w threfnu ar gyfer 4 Hydref. Pam y dyddiad hwnnw? Y rheswm yw oherwydd, bob wythnos, cyflwynir nifer fawr o geisiadau imi gan y gwrthbleidiau am ddatganiadau a dadleuon. Byddai'n braf pe gallem gael rhywfaint o ras gwleidyddol, os oes y fath beth, a chydabod y cyfaddawdu a wnaed gennyf. Mae'n bwysig inni drefnu'r ddatl, a bydd yn rhoi cyfle da inni ar gyfer y chwe mis hyd at yr etholiad, y bydd Llafur Cymru yn siŵr o ddod drwyddo'n llwyddiannus iawn.

O ran y mater pwysig arall a godwyd gennych, mae dadl wedi cael ei threfnu ar gyfer dydd Mawrth nesaf ar yr adroddiad blynyddol am 'Iaith Pawb'. Bydd honno, wrth gwrs, yn rhoi cyfle i'r Aelodau godi unrhyw fater yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg. Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd yn bwriadu cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig cyn y ddatl, ac yr wyf wedi awgrymu hynny yn wastad. Yr wyf yn siomedig na chafwyd y gydnabyddiaeth honno gan y gwrthbleidiau heddiw, ond, cyn belled ag yr ydym ni'n bod, yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen gyda'n dadl am y flaenraglen waith ar 4 Hydref, a'n hymateb llawn ynghylch 'Iaith Pawb' a'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud o safbwynt y Gymraeg a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg.

*Cynnig: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Motion: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David

Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006**  
**Approval of the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006**

Motion (NDM3146): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3146): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006.*

Amendment 1 withdrawn.

Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl.

Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that local authorities seeking to apply for powers to introduce decriminalisation of parking should carry out full consultations with disability and access groups, community councils and local traders' organisations before submitting applications.*

*yn credu y dylai awdurdodau lleol sydd am wneud cais am bwerau i ddatgrimineiddio parcio gynnal ymgynghoriad llawn gyda grwpiau anabledd a mynediad, cyngorau cymuned a mudiadau masnachwyr lleol cyn cyflwyno ceisiadau.*

Motion (NDM3147): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 2 to NDM3146 in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 1 to NDM3146 in the name of Lisa Francis has been withdrawn.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3146)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006; and*

Cynnig (NDM3147): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 2 i NDM3146 yn enw Lisa Francis. Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 i NDM3146 yn enw Lisa Francis yn ôl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Rheoli Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3146)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Rheoli Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006; a*

2. approves that the draft the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006. (NDM3147)

This piece of legislation is about the transfer of powers of enforcement from the police to the local authority. Section 3 of the Road Traffic Act 1991 makes provision for the designation of permitted parking areas and special parking areas on application by the relevant local authority. The relevant powers contained in the schedule have been transferred to the National Assembly for Wales and enable it, on application by an individual local authority, to designate the whole or part of any area of a county council or county borough council in Wales as a permitted or special parking area. The Department for Transport has identical powers in England. A hundred and eighty local authorities in England and three local authorities in Wales have already had this power transferred. It was transferred to Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council in 1999, to Carmarthenshire County Council in 2004 and also to Denbighshire County Council in 2004. The legislation is solely about the transfer of the responsibility for enforcement of parking procedures in the local authority area from the police to the local authority. It does not cover extending the area or the designation of areas within the local authority in terms of parking restrictions. It is purely about the transfer of enforcement from the police to the local authority.

**Lisa Francis:** I propose amendment 2 to NDM3146. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that local authorities seeking to apply for powers to introduce decriminalisation of parking should carry out full consultations with disability and access*

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Rheoli Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3147)

Mae a wnelo'r darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth â throsglwyddo pwerau gorfodi oddi wrth yr heddlu i'r awdurdod lleol. Mae Adran 3 o Ddeddf Traffig y Ffyrdd 1991 yn gwneud darpariaeth i ddynodi ardaloedd parcio a ganiateir ac ardaloedd parcio arbennig pan wneir cais gan yr awdurdod lleol perthnasol. Mae'r pwerau perthnasol sy'n gynwysedig yn yr atodlen wedi cael eu throsglwyddo i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac maent yn ei alluogi, pan wneir cais gan awdurdod lleol unigol, i ddynodi'r cyfan neu ran o unrhyw ardal o gyngor sir neu gyngor bwrdeistref sirol yng Nghymru yn ardal barcio a ganiateir neu'n ardal barcio arbennig. Mae gan yr Adran Ddrafnidiaeth yr un pwerau'n union yn Lloegr. Mae'r pŵer hwn wedi'i drosglwyddo eisoes i 180 o awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr a thri awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Fe'i throsglwyddwyd i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn 1999, i Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn 2004 a hefyd i Gyngor Sir Ddinbych yn 2004. Nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth ond yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am orfodi gweithdrefnau parcio yn ardal yr awdurdod lleol oddi wrth yr heddlu i'r awdurdod lleol. Nid yw'n cynnwys ymestyn yr ardal na dynodi ardaloedd o fewn yr awdurdod lleol o safbwynt cyfyngiadau parcio. Nid oes a wnelo ond â throsglwyddo'r orfodaeth oddi wrth yr heddlu i'r awdurdod lleol.

**Lisa Francis:** Cynigiaf welliant 2 i NDM3146. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y dylai awdurdodau lleol sydd am wneud cais am bwerau i ddatgrimaleiddio parcio gynnal ymgynghoriad llawn gyda grwpiau anabledd a mynediad, cynghorau*

*groups, community councils and local traders' organisations before submitting applications.*

As has been pointed out, I have withdrawn amendment 1, which I tabled, and I will explain why I did so. The Welsh Conservative group does not oppose the decriminalisation of parking, not for Conwy County Borough Council or for any other local authorities. As the Minister said, London boroughs have been enforcing decriminalised parking since 1944, and the local authorities of Neath Port Talbot, Carmarthenshire and Denbighshire have already been granted these powers, which enable a welcome reduction in the workload of our police forces.

3.10 p.m.

The regulation was first notified to the Assembly's Business Committee on 20 June, accompanied by the usual gubbins, except that the usual gubbins that we received in Business Committee on this particular day, revealed, in this instance, that disability and access groups, community councils, local traders' organisations and tourism groups were apparently not consulted in relation to the local authority's proposal. I have subsequently discovered that these groups were all consulted. What has occurred is that they have not been placed on the official list of consultees that has come back to the Assembly's Business Committee.

I have withdrawn amendment 1 because it has become clear that these very important groups were duly consulted by Conwy County Borough Council. However, the fact that it is not deemed appropriate for these groups to then be listed as official consultees in the paperwork that is passed to us on the Business Committee, or for their responses to be officially recorded and relayed to the Business Committee discloses a serious gap in the provision of information. That almost certainly goes against the principle of equality of opportunity that the Assembly espouses. I am sure that disability and access groups everywhere that take the trouble to respond to a consultation on something as important to them as the decriminalisation of

*cymuned a mudiadau masnachwyr lleol cyn cyflwyno ceisiadau.*

Fel y nodwyd, yr wyf wedi tynnu gwelliant 1, a gyflwynwyd gennyf fi, yn ôl ac esboniaf pam y gwneuthum hynny. Nid yw grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n gwrthwynebu datgrimineiddio parcio, gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy na dim un awdurdod lleol arall. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae bwrdeistrefi Llundain wedi bod yn gorfodi parcio sydd wedi'i ddatgrimineiddio ers 1944, ac mae awdurdodau lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Ddinbych eisoes wedi cael y pwerau hyn, sy'n golygu bod modd lleihau llwyth gwaith ein heddluoedd, sydd yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu.

Hysbyswyd Pwyllgor Busnes y Cynulliad o'r rheoliad, ynghyd â'r manion arferol, gyntaf ar 20 Mehefin, ac eithrio bod y manion arferol a gawsom yn y Pwyllgor Busnes ar y diwrnod arbennig hwn yn datgelu, yn yr achos hwn, nad ymgynghorwyd â grwpiau anabledd a mynediad, cynghorau cymuned, mudiadau masnachwyr lleol a grwpiau twristiaeth ynglŷn â chynnig yr awdurdod lleol. Yr wyf wedi darganfod ers hynny fod ymgynghori wedi bod â'r grwpiau hyn i gyd. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yw nad ydynt wedi cael eu rhoi ar y rhestr swyddogol o ymgynghoreion sydd wedi dod yn ôl i Bwyllgor Busnes y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf wedi tynnu gwelliant 1 yn ôl gan ei bod wedi dod yn amlwg bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy wedi ymgynghori'n briodol â'r grwpiau hynod bwysig hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith na thybir ei bod yn briodol i'r grwpiau hyn gael eu rhestru wedyn fel ymgynghoreion swyddogol yn y gwaith papur a roddir inni yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, nac i'w hymatebion gael eu cofnodi'n swyddogol a'u cyfleu i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn dangos bwch difrifol o ran darparu gwybodaeth. Mae hynny'n sicr bron yn groes i egwyddor cyfle cyfartal y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei harddel. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai grwpiau anabledd a mynediad ym mhobman sy'n mynd i'r drafferth i ymateb i ymgynghoriad ynghylch rhywbeth mor



parking would want to know that the members of the Business Committee were able to read their responses and act accordingly. For that reason, amendment 2 still stands and I should add that the groups listed in this amendment should be classed as official consultees, so that members of the Business Committee can be made aware of responses when other local authorities apply for the power to decriminalise parking, as I am sure that they will. The time is nigh for us in the Assembly to realise that if a job is worth doing, it is worth doing well.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome the fact that amendment 1 has been withdrawn. I, like many other Assembly Members I am sure, have been contacted by members of Conwy County Borough Council who felt that they were being unfairly discriminated against by that amendment, having seen their neighbours in Denbighshire proceed with this without complaint, and feeling that they had fulfilled all the consultation required of them by the National Assembly.

Plaid Cymru would like to support amendment 2. Disability groups certainly need to be included when the discussion of parking and parking charges and how they are being enforced is being consulted on. I would like the Minister to consider how he can include those groups as part of the statutory consultees.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrat group also supports the decriminalisation of parking and amendment 2. However, I make a plea, as I did in a North Wales Regional Committee meeting about six months ago, in respect of Denbighshire's administration, that local authorities appoint parking officers who have sensitivity, so that they do not act in an aggressive and overpowering way to the detriment of local residents, local businesses and visitors alike.

**Carl Sargeant:** Declare an interest.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Would

bwysig iddynt â datgrimineiddio parcio am wybod bod aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn gallu darllen eu hymatebion a gweithredu yn unol â hynny. Am y rheswm hwnnw, mae gwelliant 2 yn dal i sefyll a dylwn ychwanegu y dylai'r grwpiau a restrir yn y gwelliant hwn gael eu dosbarthu fel ymgynghoreion swyddogol, fel y gall aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes gael gwybod am ymatebion pan fydd awdurdodau lleol eraill yn gwneud cais am y pŵer i ddatgrimineiddio parcio, fel y byddant yn gwneud yr wyf yn siŵr. Mae'n hen bryd i ni yn y Cynulliad sylweddoli, os yw rhywbeth yn werth ei wneud, ei fod yn werth ei wneud yn dda.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf y ffaith bod gwelliant 1 wedi cael ei dynnu'n ôl. Cysylltwyd â mi, fel Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad yr wyf yn siŵr, gan aelodau o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy a deimlai fod y gwelliant hwnnw'n gwahaniaethu'n annheg yn eu herbyn, ar ôl iddynt weld eu cymdogion yn sir Ddinbych yn bwrw ymlaen â hyn heb gŵyn, ac yn teimlo eu bod wedi gwneud yr holl ymgynghori yr oedd yn ofynnol iddynt ei wneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Hoffai Plaid Cymru gefnogi gwelliant 2. Yn sicr, mae angen i grwpiau anabledd gael eu cynnwys wrth ymgynghori ynghylch y drafodaeth am barcio a thaliadau parcio a sut y maent i gael eu gorfodi. Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ystyried sut y gall gynnwys y grwpiau hynny fel rhan o'r ymgynghoreion statudol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd o blaid datgrimineiddio parcio a gwelliant 2. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf ble, fel y gwneuthum yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd tua chwe mis yn ôl, mewn perthynas â gweinyddiaeth sir Ddinbych, ar i awdurdodau lleol benodi swyddogion parcio sydd â sensitifrwydd, fel nad ydynt yn ymddwyn mewn modd ymosodol a gorthrechol sy'n gwneud drwg i drigolion lleol, busnesau lleol ac ymwelwyr fel ei gilydd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Datganwch fuddiant.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A hoffai Eleanor

Eleanor Burnham care to resume her speech? Burnham barhau â'i haraith?

**Eleanor Burnham:** I have been asked to declare an interest.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gofynnwyd imi ddatgan buddiant.

**The Presiding Officer:** I did not ask you to declare anything.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni ofynnais i ichi ddatgan dim.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I will declare an interest. About three years ago, I incurred the wrath of a Denbighshire parking attendant. That is not just my experience; it is the experience of many, and it drew my attention to many people's plight. Hence my plea to local authorities.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Datganaf fuddiant. Ryw dair blynedd yn ôl, tynnais un o swyddogion parcio sir Ddinbych yn fy mhen. Nid fy mhrofiad i yn unig yw hynny; mae'n brofiad i lawer, a thynnodd fy sylw at drybini llawer o bobl. Dyna'r rheswm am fy mhle i'r awdurdodau lleol.

**John Marek:** I would like to take up the point that Eleanor made, because I think that it is valid. If finances from fines go to the local authorities, before you know where you are, they will be trying to catch as many people as possible so that they can increase their income. What worries me is that the Government is trying, certainly in north Wales, to have an all-north-Wales policy on parking—I can see Carl Sargeant nodding. When this was first suggested in my authority in Wrexham, it was said that it must control all the double yellow line areas and that it would need a least a dozen people to police it, or to decriminalise it, and that it would cost the council tax payers at least £300,000. That is the problem with it. I hope that the Minister can assure me about the following, but I do not think that he can, because I do not think that he has done his job properly. He ought to have in the regulations clear instructions for local authorities not to persecute motorists who happen to have parked to drop their children off or to buy a newspaper or a bottle of milk or whatever—

**John Marek:** Hoffwn fynd ar drywydd y pwynt a wnaeth Eleanor, oherwydd credaf ei fod yn ddilys. Os yw'r arian oddi wrth y dirwyon yn mynd i'r awdurdodau lleol, cyn ichi wybod ble'r ydych, byddant yn ceisio dal cynifer â phosibl o bobl er mwyn cynyddu eu hincwm. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni i yw bod y Llywodraeth, yn sicr yn y gogledd, yn ceisio cael polisi i ogledd Cymru gyfan ar barcio—gallaf weld Carl Sargeant yn nodio. Pan awgrymwyd hyn gyntaf yn fy awdurdod i yn Wrecsam, dywedwyd bod yn rhaid iddo reoli'r holl ardaloedd lle y mae llinellau melyn dwbl ac y byddai angen o leiaf ddwsin o bobl i blismona hynny, neu ei ddatgriminalaiddio, ac y byddai'n costio o leiaf £300,000 i'r trethdalwyr. Dyna'r broblem gyda hyn. Gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog fy sicrhau am y canlynol, ond ni chredaf y gall, oherwydd ni chredaf ei fod wedi gwneud ei waith yn iawn. Dylai fod ganddo gyfarwyddiadau clir yn y rheoliadau i awdurdodau lleol beidio ag erlid modurwyr sy'n digwydd bod wedi parcio er mwyn gollwng eu plant neu brynu papur newydd neu botelaid o laeth neu beth bynnag y bo—

**Carl Sargeant:** So, the Member is against Safe Routes to Schools? He just mentioned parents dropping their children off at school. You are telling us publicly that you are against that, in principle.

**Carl Sargeant:** Felly, mae'r Aelod yn gwrthwynebu Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol? Mae newydd grybwyll rhieni yn gollwng eu plant yn yr ysgol. Yr ydych yn dweud wrthym yn gyhoeddus eich bod yn erbyn hynny, mewn egwyddor.

**John Marek:** I thought that you had a policy that you did not want children being driven to schools and that you wanted safe routes so that they could cycle, so I do not know where you are coming from, Carl; you need to get

**John Marek:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod gennych bolisi nad oedd arnoch eisiau i blant gael eu danfon i'r ysgol a bod arnoch eisiau llwybrau diogel fel y gallent seiclo, felly ni wn i ba gyfeiriad yr ydych yn gwyrto, Carl;

your facts right.

The Government is surreptitiously trying to inflict a new bureaucracy of traffic wardens upon us. The Liberal-Democrat-led coalition in Wrexham would have none of that. We just have one attendant working at any one time, which is sufficient, because no-one in Wrexham knows where that traffic warden is with the result that parking, by and large, is sensible. What could happen in Denbighshire, if they get it wrong, is that a dozen or two-dozen traffic wardens—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Conwy, not Denbighshire.

**John Marek:** Sorry, Conwy, but Denbighshire was another example. We will have two-dozen traffic wardens and we will all be poorer. Importantly, following on from Lisa Francis's point, the traders will also be poorer.

**Peter Black:** Do you accept the other issue with regard to local authority traffic wardens, namely that they do not have the same range of powers as traffic wardens managed by the police? So, unless more resources are given to the police to deal with issues like obstruction, those issues often go unattended in areas where traffic wardens have been deregulated. Do you not, therefore, agree that, if we are to proceed along this route, the police need to be urged to tackle those issues, which are no longer in the realm of the new traffic wardens patrolling the streets of Conwy, Neath Port Talbot or anywhere else affected by this?

**John Marek:** I agree, but I think that, in Wrexham, the police make a contribution to the traffic warden, who is a community support officer and not a neighbourhood warden. They make a contribution but have realised that traffic wardens cannot tackle those offences, such as obstruction, under the new scheme, whereas the police can. There is a mistake in the Government's legislation. It has not done its homework, as usual. In fact, I am waiting for the Government to resign

rhaid i chi gael eich ffeithiau'n gywir.

Mae'r Llywodraeth, yn llechwraidd, yn ceisio gorfodi biwrocraetiaeth newydd o wardeiniaid traffig arnom. Ni fyddai'r glymblaid dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Wrecsam yn derbyn dim o hyn. Un swyddog yn unig sydd gennym yn gweithio ar y tro, ac mae hyn yn ddigonol, oherwydd ni wŷr neb yn Wrecsam ble y mae'r warden traffig hwnnw ac o'r herwydd mae'r parcio, drwyddo draw, yn synhwyrol. Yr hyn a allai ddigwydd yn sir Ddinbych, os gwneir pethau yn anghywir, yw y byddai dwsin neu ddau ddwsin o wardeiniaid traffig—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Conwy, nid sir Ddinbych.

**John Marek:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Conwy, ond yr oedd sir Ddinbych yn esiampl arall. Bydd ganddynt ddau ddwsin o wardeiniaid traffig a byddwn oll yn dlotach. Yn bwysicach, gan ddilyn pwynt Lisa Francis, bydd y masnachwyr hefyd yn dlotach.

**Peter Black:** A dderbyniwch y mater arall ynglŷn â wardeiniaid traffig awdurdodau lleol, sef nad oes ganddynt yr un ystod o bwerau â wardeiniaid traffig a reolir gan yr heddlu? Felly, oni roddir rhagor o adnoddau i'r heddlu i ddelio â materion fel peri rhwystr, mae'r materion hynny'n digwydd heb gael dim sylw mewn ardaloedd lle y mae wardeiniaid traffig wedi cael eu dadreoleiddio. Oni chytunwch, felly, os byddwn yn parhau ar hyd y trywydd hwn, fod yn rhaid annog yr heddlu i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn, materion nad ydynt mwyach yn perthyn i faes y wardeiniaid traffig newydd sy'n cerdded strydoedd Conwy, Castell-nedd Port Talbot nac unman arall y mae hyn yn effeithio arno?

**John Marek:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, ond credaf, yn Wrecsam, fod yr heddlu yn gwneud cyfraniad at y warden traffig, sy'n swyddog cymorth cymunedol ac nid yn warden cymdogaeth. Maent yn gwneud cyfraniad ond maent wedi sylweddoli na all wardeiniaid traffig fynd i'r afael â'r troseddau hynny, megis peri rhwystr, dan y cynllun newydd, tra gall yr heddlu wneud hynny. Mae camgymeriad yn neddffwriaeth y Llywodraeth. Ni wnaeth ei gwaith cartref, fel

after last week's election results. It should be ensuring that no local councils, as the result of regulations that it passes, can try to enrich themselves at the expense of the ordinary motorist and the ordinary trader in Welsh towns.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I thank Lisa for withdrawing the first amendment, but Members are getting this out of proportion. This is purely about transferring enforcement of current on-street parking offences from the police to the local authority. As Lisa said, she welcomes this broad principle, because it is about taking a burden off the police and transferring the enforcement and administration of that to the local authority. As Lisa and other Members, including Janet Ryder, accepted, Conwy County Borough Council clearly has followed the required procedures, as laid down in the current guidance on consulting with appropriate statutory groups such as the police and others.

Members may be getting this out of proportion. It is not about changing the existing areas in Conwy County Borough Council in terms of parking restrictions or about enforcement fines in the future. That is obviously a matter for Conwy subsequently to determine. At the moment, this is purely a matter of transferring the enforcement of street parking offences from the police to the local authorities. Clearly, if Conwy County Borough Council wishes to extend double yellow lines, then there are correct procedures for doing so. Any change in the current designations would have to be dealt with under its procedures and under current legislation. The same is true with the enforcement of the fines.

**Lisa Francis:** I am grateful to you for taking an intervention. On the fact that Conwy consulted with disability and access groups, do you agree that such information should have been passed on to the Business Committee? If people think that it is worthwhile to respond to a consultation, then

arfer. Yn wir, yr wyf yn disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth ymddiswyddo ar ôl canlyniadau etholiadau'r wythnos diwethaf. Dylai fod yn sicrhau na fydd cynghorau lleol, yn sgîl y rheoliadau y mae'n eu pasio, yn gallu ceisio ymglyfoethogi ar draul y modurwr cyffredin a'r masnachwr cyffredin yn nhrefi Cymru.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Diolchaf i Lisa am dynnu'r gwelliant cyntaf yn ôl, ond mae'r Aelodau yn gwneud môr a mynydd o hyn. Trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb presennol dros orfodi troseddau parcio ar y stryd o ddwylo'r heddlu i ddwylo'r awdurdodau lleol yw hyn, a dyna i gyd. Fel y dywedodd Lisa, mae hi'n croesawu'r egwyddor gyffredinol hon, oherwydd ei bod yn ymwneud â mynd â baich oddi ar yr heddlu a throsglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros orfodi a gweinyddu i'r awdurdod lleol. Fel y derbyniodd Lisa ac Aelodau eraill, gan gynnwys Janet Ryder, mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy yn amlwg wedi dilyn y gweithdrefnau sy'n ofynnol, fel y'u disgrifir yn y canllawiau cyfredol ar ymgynghori gyda'r grwpiau statudol priodol megis yr heddlu ac eraill.

Mae'n ddigon posibl bod yr Aelodau yn gwneud môr a mynydd o hyn. Nid yw'n ymwneud â newid yr ardaloedd presennol yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy o safbwynt cyfyngiadau parcio na gorfodi dirwyon i'r dyfodol. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn fater i Gonwy benderfynu arno maes o law. Ar hyn o bryd, trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros orfodi troseddau parcio ar y stryd o ddwylo'r heddlu i ddwylo'r awdurdodau lleol yw hyn, a dyna i gyd. Yn amlwg, os bydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy'n dymuno ymestyn llinellau melyn dwbl, yna mae gweithdrefnau cywir i wneud hynny. Byddai'n rhaid i unrhyw newid yn y dynodiadau presennol gael sylw dan ei weithdrefnau a than y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol. Mae'r un peth yn wir am orfodi dirwyon.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am dderbyn yr ymyriad. O ran bod Conwy wedi ymgynghori gyda grwpiau anabledd a mynediad, a gytunwch y dylai gwybodaeth o'r fath fod wedi cael ei rhoi i'r Pwyllgor Busnes? Os bydd pobl yn credu ei bod yn werth ymateb i ymgynghoriad, yna mae

we have the right to read those responses and act accordingly. It seems an awful shame that people go to the trouble to respond but that we are not informed of the responses. Would you agree with that?

3.20 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** I am not sure whether the responses to any consultation are passed on for any piece of legislation that the Business Committee or the Government deals with. My understanding is that that is not done. Obviously, if I am wrong, members of the Business Committee may be able to point that out. My understanding is that Conwy County Borough Council has complied with the regulations; that is why it is seeking this power, as Neath Port Talbot, Carmarthen and Denbighshire have done in the past. We support this principle; we feel that traffic management and car-parking can be managed far more effectively in Conwy County Borough Council by taking the burden away from the police. I know that John Marek, like me, has a great commitment to public transport and to trying to get people to use their cars less and public transport more. We feel that this will be a step in the right direction in terms of easing congestion, because we believe that it will lead to more effective enforcement of current parking restrictions in existing local authorities and in Conwy. That is why I would urge Members to support this.

**Karen Sinclair:** While I understand the reasoning behind passing this down to local authorities, one thing that worries me is that there is no uniform system. Each local authority is developing its own way of doing things and its own charges. In Cardiff, the cost is £12.50 if you are caught, while in Denbighshire it is £30. There is a real difference there. We should be aiming to encourage local authorities, if they are to go down this line, to get uniformity across Wales, because it seems unfair that it could be far more expensive if you are caught in one local authority than in another.

**Andrew Davies:** I accept the points that you make, but the legislation is currently framed

gennym hawl i ddarllen yr ymatebion hynny a gweithredu yn unol â hwy. Mae'n ymddangos yn wir drueni bod pobl yn mynd i'r drafferth i ymateb ond na chawn wybod beth yw'r ymatebion hynny. A fyddech yn cytuno â hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r ymatebion i unrhyw ymgynghoriad yn cael eu hanfon ymlaen ar gyfer unrhyw ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth y mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes na'r Llywodraeth yn delio â hi. Yn amlwg, os wyf yn anghywir, mae'n bosibl y gall aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes fy nghywiro. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy wedi cydymffurfio â'r rheoliadau; dyna pam y mae'n ceisio cael y pŵer hwn, fel y gwnaeth Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Caerfyrddin a sir Ddinbych yn y gorffennol. Cefnogwn yr egwyddor hon; teimlwn y gellir rheoli rheolaeth traffig a pharcio ceir yn llawer mwy effeithiol yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy drwy fynd â'r baich oddi ar yr heddlu. Gwn fod John Marek, fel minnau, wedi ymrwymo'n daer iawn i gludiant cyhoeddus ac i geisio cael pobl i ddefnyddio llai ar eu ceir a mwy ar gludiant cyhoeddus. Teimlwn y bydd hyn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn o safbwynt lleddfu tagfeydd, oherwydd credwn y bydd yn arwain at orfodi'r rheoliadau parcio cyfredol yn fwy effeithiol mewn awdurdodau lleol presennol ac yng Nghonwy. Dyna pam y byddwn yn annog yr Aelodau i gefnogi hyn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Er fy mod yn deall y rhesymeg sydd wrth wraidd trosglwyddo hyn i lawr i awdurdodau lleol, un peth sy'n fy mhoeni yw na cheir system unffurf. Mae pob awdurdod lleol yn datblygu ei ffordd ei hun o wneud pethau ynghyd â'i daliadau ei hun. Yng Nghaerdydd y gost yw £12.50 os cewch eich dal, ond mae'n £30 yn sir Ddinbych. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth mawr. Dylem fod yn ymdrechu i annog awdurdodau lleol, os ydynt yn bwriadu mynd ar y trywydd hwn, i gael unffurfiaeth ar draws Cymru, oherwydd ei bod yn ymddangos yn annheg y gallai fod yn llawer drutach os cewch eich dal mewn un awdurdod lleol nag mewn un arall.

**Andrew Davies:** Derbynïaf y pwyntiau a wnewch, ond mae'r ddeddfwriaeth ar hyn o

so that this is rolled out by each local authority area. If this legislation is passed, it will still only be for four out of 22 local authorities. Nevertheless, I will take up with the Welsh Local Government Association, and its transport spokesperson, the issue of how we might address this. However, the level of parking charges or fines that are imposed is ultimately down to the local authority and its system of accountability to the local electorate.

bryd wedi ei fframio fel bod hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno gan bob ardal awdurdod lleol. Os derbynir y ddeddfwriaeth hon, ni fydd ond ar gyfer pedwar allan o 22 o awdurdodau lleol o hyd. Fodd bynnag, trafodaf gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a'i llefarydd trafniadaeth, sut y gallem roi sylw i hyn. Serch hynny, mater i'r awdurdod lleol a'i system o atebolrwydd i'r etholwyr lleol yw lefel y taliadau parcio neu'r dirwyon am barcio sy'n cael eu rhoi.

Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl.  
Amendment 1 withdrawn.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*  
*Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3146): to propose that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

Cynnig (NDM3146): cynnig bod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*considers the principle of the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM3146): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3146): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3147): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3147): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*



**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Taliadau Colli Cartref (Symiau Rhagnodedig)  
(Cymru) 2006**  
**Approval of the Home Loss Payments (Prescribed Amounts) (Wales)  
Regulations 2006**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Home Loss Payments (Prescribed Amounts) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3148)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Home Loss Payments (Prescribed Amounts) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Home Loss Payments (Prescribed Amounts) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3149)*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, ond hoffem eglurhad ar ddwy elfen. A ydych yn hyderus y bydd y taliadau hyn, pan fydd tir neu dai yn cael eu prynu yn orfodol, yn deg? Mae rhai o fy etholwyr wedi cwyno yn ystod y broses o baratoi ar gyfer y llinell nwy naturiol hylifedig fod pwysau'n cael ei roi arnynt i gytuno'n gyflym i'r pris ac, os na chytunir yn syth, fod awgrym y byddant yn cael llai o arian. A fydd y rheoliadau hyn yn diogelu pobl yn y sefyllfaoedd hynny, ac nid yn eu gorfodi i wneud penderfyniad cywir ar sail y

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Taliadau Colli Cartref (Symiau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3148)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Taliadau Colli Cartref (Symiau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Taliadau Colli Cartref (Symiau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3149)*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We welcome these regulations, but we would like an explanation on two elements. Are you confident that these payments, when land or houses are subject to compulsory purchase, are fair? Some of my constituents have complained during the process of preparing for the liquified natural gas line that pressure is put on them to agree swiftly to the price and that, if they do not agree immediately, it is suggested that they might receive less money. Will these regulations safeguard people in that position, without compelling them to make the right

ffaith bod yr hyn a gynigir wedyn yn lleihau?

decision on the basis that less money could then be offered?

Mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath yn Lloegr, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod tai wedi'u prynu'n orfodol a bod y bobl sydd wedi gwerthu yn cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfa lle nad ydynt yn gallu fforddio'r union dai sy'n cael eu hadeiladu ar y safle hwnnw. A sicrhewch, yn nhermau tai fforddiadwy, fod y taliadau hyn yn galluogi'r bobl sy'n colli eu tai drwy bryniant gorfodol i gael mynediad i'r farchnad dai yn yr ardal lle'r oeddent yn preswyllo gynt?

In such situations in England, I am aware that houses have been subject to compulsory purchase where the people who have sold those houses have found themselves in a position where they cannot afford the new houses that have been built on that site. In terms of affordable housing, can you assure us that these payments will ensure that those people who have to sell their houses under compulsory purchase will be able to gain access to the housing market in those areas?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):**

Heddiw, bydd lefel yr iawndal ar ben pris y tŷ yn cael ei gynyddu o £38,000 i £40,000 fel uchafswm, ac o £3,800 i £4,000 o ran yr isafswm a delir. Bydd hyn hefyd yn effeithio ar y taliad ynglŷn â'r gyfradd wastad i denantiaid a fydd yn newid o £3,800 i £4,000. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod hwn yn deg; bydd pobl yn cael pris y tŷ yn ogystal â'r taliad hwn. Ni ddylai fod unrhyw bwysau ar bobl yn y trafodaethau rhyngddynt a'r rhai sydd am brynu eu tai. Mae proses gyfreithiol y gall pobl ei dilyn wrth brynu tai. Ni ddylai fod problem o safbwynt pobl yn teimlo pwysau oherwydd y gallant gael llai o arian, gan fod yr iawndal hwn yn cael ei dalu.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):**

Today, the level of compensation in addition to the house price will increase from £38,000 to £40,000 as the maximum, and £3,800 to £4,000 as the minimum paid. This will also have an impact on the flat rate payment for tenants, which will increase from £3,800 to £4,000. I am confident that this is fair; people will receive the value of their house plus that payment. There should not be any pressure on people as regards the negotiations between them and the purchaser. There is a legal process that people can follow in the purchase of houses. There should be no problem in terms of people being put under pressure in that they might be paid less, as this compensation is paid.

O safbwynt tai fforddiadwy, fe'ch cyfeiriai at y datganiadau a wnaed yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â nodyn cyngor technegol 1, sy'n rhoi llawer mwy o bwerau i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau tai fforddiadwy yn eu hardaloedd eu hunain, ac yn egluro pwerau awdurdodau lleol i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn hyderus bod y ffigurau hyn yn deg. Newidir y ffigurau bob blwyddyn; nid rhywbeth newydd mo hwn. Gyda nodyn cyngor technegol 1 a chyda'r ffigurau hyn, mae'n gwbl bosibl i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael yn eu hardaloedd.

In terms of affordable housing, I refer you to last week's statement regarding technical advice note 1, which gives local authorities many more powers to secure affordable housing in their own areas, and explains the powers of local authorities to do so. I am confident that these figures are equitable. The figures are amended annually; this is nothing new. With technical advice note 1 and these figures, it is quite possible for local authorities to ensure that affordable houses are available in their areas.

*Cynnig (NDM3148): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3148): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3149): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3149): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue

German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio)  
 2006 a Chyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol  
 Rhondda Cynon Taf 2006**  
**Approval of the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment)  
 Order 2006 and the Directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda  
 Cynon Taf Local Health Board 2006**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3150)*

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3150)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the Local Health Boards (Establishment) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3151)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii):*

*considers the principle of the directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3156)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee in relation to Directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board 2006 laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006; and*

2. *acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii), approves directions to Caerphilly Local Health Board and Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board 2006 made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3157)*

I am pleased that we can discuss these two motions together to deal with the directions

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Sefydlu) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3151)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog 29.3 (iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf 2006 y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3156)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ynghylch Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf 2006 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

2. *gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog 29.3 (iii), yn cymeradwyo bod cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3157)*

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn gallu trafod y ddau gynnig hyn gyda'i gilydd i ddelio â'r

for Rhondda Cynon Taf and Caerphilly local health boards to work together as teaching local health boards and an Order for changing the name of Rhondda Cynon Taf, Caerphilly and Powys local health boards to be teaching local health boards.

Teaching local health board status is a wonderful innovation that will support us to deliver a wider objective of 'Designed for Life' in terms of creating a world-class health service in Wales. Teaching LHBs will be expected to develop a learning culture within the organisation by bringing specific additional capacity into their locality. We will develop an academic programme of learning, teaching, research and evaluation, to be conducted and associated with established academic institutions in Wales, in order to encourage and to provide high quality primary care services.

3.30 p.m.

Through the utilisation of educational and research activity, the expectation is that a teaching local health board will be able to provide an alternative portfolio or career option for general practitioners and other healthcare professionals. Such alternative arrangements are expected to assist in the recruitment and retention of necessary healthcare staff. Therefore, in practice, this measure will obviously be of benefit to Powys, but also to some of the more socially and economically disadvantaged communities in the south Wales Valleys.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, we welcome these regulations, and, as you explained, they will be beneficial. I have four points of clarification. First, will you explain why no consultation was held as part of this process? Do you believe that a consultation would have been useful in order to obtain the views of stakeholders on how they wish to see the LHB functioning? Secondly, there were five expressions of interest in this, but we are faced today with the two successful applicants. Minister, will you explain the terms of reference for a successful application? Were they based upon the

cyfarwyddiadau er mwyn i fwrdd iechyd lleol Caerffili a bwrdd iechyd lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf weithio gyda'i gilydd fel byrddau addysgu iechyd lleol ynghyd â Gorchymyn er mwyn newid enw bwrdd iechyd lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf, bwrdd iechyd lleol Caerffili a bwrdd iechyd lleol Powys i fod yn fyrddau addysgu iechyd lleol.

Mae statws bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol yn enghraifft ardderchog o arloesi a fydd yn ein cynorthwyo i gyflawni amcan ehangach 'Cynllun Oes' o safbwynt creu gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru. Bydd disgwyl i fyrddau addysgu iechyd lleol feithrin diwylliant o ddysgu o fewn y sefydliad drwy ddod â gallu ychwanegol penodol i'w hardal. Byddwn yn datblygu rhaglen academaidd o ddysgu, addysgu, ymchwilio a gwerthuso, i gael ei chynnal a'i chysylltu gyda sefydliadau academaidd sefydledig yng Nghymru, er mwyn annog a darparu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol o safon uchel.

Drwy ddefnyddio gweithgaredd addysgol ac ymchwilio, y disgwyl yw y bydd bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol yn gallu darparu portffolio neu ddewis gyrfaol amgen i feddygon teulu a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes gofal iechyd. Disgwylir y bydd trefniadau amgen o'r fath o gymorth er mwyn recriwtio a chadw staff gofal iechyd angenrheidiol. Felly, yn ymarferol, bydd y mesur hwn yn amlwg o fudd i Bowys, a bydd hefyd o fudd i rai o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig o safbwynt cymdeithasol ac economaidd yng Nghymoedd y de.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, ac, fel yr esboniwyd gennych, byddant yn fuddiol. Mae gennyf bedwar pwynt yr hoffwn gael eglurhad arnynt. Yn gyntaf, a wnewch esbonio pam na chynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad fel rhan o'r broses hon? A ydych yn credu y byddai ymgynghoriad wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol er mwyn canfod barn rhanddeiliaid ynglŷn â sut y maent yn dymuno gweld y BILL yn gweithio? Yn ail, yr oedd pump wedi datgan diddordeb yn hyn, ond dim ond y ddau ymgeisydd llwyddiannus a welwn yma heddiw. Weinidog, a wnewch

current ability or capacity of the LHB to provide services, or were they based upon a need to recruit and retain health professionals in certain areas? Thirdly, if they were based on the capacity and the ability of LHBs to provide services, will you ensure that other LHB areas, especially those experiencing high vacancy rates for certain health professionals, continue to receive adequate support in recruiting and retaining staff? Finally, will there be a focus on specific health professionals? GPs are named in the regulatory appraisal, but should other professions also be targeted, especially if we are entering a period of reconfiguration of certain services in the community?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Caerphilly Local Health Board has been waiting some time for this legislation, as it will enable it to officially launch the teaching LHB. It is important that this piece of legislation is passed, because, without it, it cannot function in the way that it wishes to function. Caerphilly and Rhondda Cynon Taf LHBs will be working in partnership, and the status recognises that LHBs can take the lead in training primary care nurses and doctors, in developing new workforces to do things differently, and in providing innovative delivery of primary care. It can also mean that they can provide services differently, which means that there could be different models for recruiting and retaining GPs, for example, having salaried GPs, providing ways in which to support the training of GPs, and providing experience of working through placements in other communities, such as Valleys communities. I urge full support for this piece of legislation; it is certainly something that my LHB is keen to take up.

**Leighton Andrews:** I also want to support the regulations that have been tabled. There is no question that Rhondda Cynon Taf LHB has been looking forward to taking on the status of a teaching LHB for some time. It has been a matter of public discussion within

esbonio'r cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer cais llwyddiannus? A oedd yn seiliedig ar allu neu gapasiti presennol y BILL i ddarparu gwasanaethau, ynteu ar angen i recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol mewn meysydd penodol? Yn drydydd, os oeddent yn seiliedig ar gapasiti a gallu BILLau i ddarparu gwasanaethau, a wnewch sicrhau bod meysydd eraill BILLau, yn enwedig y rhai lle y mae cyfraddau'r swyddi gweigion ar gyfer rhai gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn uchel, yn parhau i dderbyn digon o gefnogaeth er mwyn recriwtio a chadw staff? Yn olaf, a fydd ffocws ar weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol penodol? Cyfeirir at feddygon teulu yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, ond a ddylid targedu proffesiynau eraill hefyd, yn enwedig os ydym yn dechrau ar gyfnod o ailgyflunio rhai gwasanaethau yn y gymuned?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili wedi bod yn aros ers tro am y ddeddfwriaeth hon, gan y bydd yn ei alluogi i lansio'r bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol yn swyddogol. Mae'n bwysig bod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cael ei phasio, oherwydd, hebdi, ni all weithredu fel y mae'n dymuno gwneud. Bydd BILLau Caerffili a Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth, ac mae'r statws yn cydnabod y gall BILLau gymryd yr awenau wrth hyfforddi nyrsys a meddygon gofal sylfaenol, wrth ddatblygu gweithluoedd newydd i wneud pethau'n wahanol, ac wrth sicrhau bod gofal sylfaenol yn cael ei ddarparu mewn dull arloesol. Gall hefyd olygu eu bod yn gallu darparu gwasanaethau'n wahanol, sy'n golygu y gellid cael modelau gwahanol ar gyfer recriwtio a chadw meddygon teulu, er enghraifft, cael meddygon teulu cyflogedig, darparu ffyrdd o gefnogi hyfforddiant meddygon teulu, a darparu profiad gwaith drwy leoliadau mewn cymunedau eraill, megis cymunedau'r Cymoedd. Erfyniaf arnoch i gefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon gant y cant; mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth y mae fy Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol yn awyddus i'w weld.

**Leighton Andrews:** Hoffwn innau gefnogi'r rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron. Mae BILL Rhondda Cynon Taf yn sicr wedi bod yn edrych ymlaen at gael statws bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol ers tro. Mae wedi bod yn destun trafodaeth gyhoeddus o fewn y bwrdd

that board, and I believe that it has also been raised in the public fora. I think it is innovative and contributes to the innovative delivery of healthcare in Rhondda Cynon Taf. The health board has been able, through a number of initiatives—for example, the recruitment of several salaried GPs within the area—to provide some of my constituents with access to a female GP, which is something that they did not have before. It also has the ability to draw down funds from NHS capital budgets, in advance of many other LHBs, which is another testimony to the way in which that LHB is working. I want to pay tribute to the way in which it has worked to ensure that patients are able to hold local primary care services to account. This continues some of the innovative working that we have seen within Rhondda Cynon Taf LHB. I fully commend these regulations.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Many questions were raised, particularly by Rhodri Glyn. First, these are Orders and directions, rather than regulations. Therefore, my understanding is that the same rigour, in terms of consultation, and so on, does not apply as it might in terms of regulations. On acquiring the status of being a teaching LHB, there were five initial applications. The criteria against which they were judged were based on: the needs of the LHB and its population; the vision that the LHB offered in terms of delivering the teaching LHB status; the degree of local support that there was for the proposals; the capacity of the organisation to deliver; the impact that that would have on service delivery; complementing, rather than duplicating or replicating, what is going on; and being able to demonstrate positive outcome measures. Therefore, it is on the basis of current performance and potential, as well as local sign-up, that these LHBs were chosen.

It should not take away from efforts to recruit in other areas that find it difficult to recruit. You will be aware that the Assembly Government has been proactive. For example, we have set up the Heads of the Valleys salaried GP practice in Gelligaer, Caerphilly, which I visited with Jeff Cuthbert. There is also the primary care

hwnnw, a chredaf ei fod hefyd wedi ei godi yn y fforymau cyhoeddus. Credaf ei fod yn arloesol a'i fod yn cyfrannu tuag at ddarparu gofal iechyd mewn ffordd arloesol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd, drwy nifer o fentrau—er enghraifft, recriwtio amryw o feddygon teulu cyflogedig yn yr ardal—wedi gallu sicrhau bod meddyg teulu benywaidd ar gael i rai o'm hetholwyr, lle nad oedd un ar gael cynt. Gall hefyd ddefnyddio arian o gyllidebau cyfalaf y GIG, o flaen BILlau eraill, sy'n dystiolaeth arall o'r ffordd y mae'r BILl hwn yn gweithio. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r ffordd y mae wedi gweithio er mwyn sicrhau bod cleifion yn gallu dwyn gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol lleol i gyfrif. Mae hyn yn barhad o rai o'r dulliau gweithio arloesol yr ydym wedi eu gweld yn BILl Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Codwyd llawer o gwestiynau, yn enwedig gan Rhodri Glyn. Yn gyntaf, Gorchmynion a chyfarwyddiadau yw'r rhain, yn hytrach na rheoliadau. Felly, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, nid oes angen yr un manylrwydd ar eu cyfer, o ran ymgynghoriad, ac yn y blaen, ag y byddai ei angen ar reoliadau. Ynghylch cael statws bod yn fwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol, derbyniwyd pum cais cychwynnol. Yr oedd y meini prawf a ddefnyddiwyd i'w pwysu a'u mesur yn seiliedig ar: anghenion y BILl a'i boblogaeth; y weledigaeth a gynigid gan y BILl o ran cyflwyno statws bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol; faint o gefnogaeth leol a oedd i'r cynigion; gallu'r sefydliad i gyflawni; yr effaith y byddai hynny'n ei chael ar ddarparu gwasanaeth; ategu, yn hytrach nag ail-wneud neu ddyblygu, yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud; a gallu dangos mesurau canlyniad cadarnhaol. Felly, dewiswyd y BILlau hyn ar sail eu perfformiad presennol a'u photensial, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth leol.

Ni ddylai amharu ar ymdrechion i recriwtio mewn meysydd eraill sy'n cael anawsterau wrth recriwtio. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn rhagweithiol. Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi sefydlu practis meddygon teulu cyflogedig Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn Gelli-gaer, Caerffili, ac euthum i'w weld gyda Jeff Cuthbert.



support unit in Rhondda Cynon Taf, which Leighton mentioned. These are excellent examples of how the Welsh Assembly Government is trying to ensure that we get quality GPs into our most socially and economically deprived communities, and where the healthcare needs are greatest.

Finally, it is not confined to GPs; other members of the primary healthcare team will be involved—nurses, health visitors, and even practice staff members, such as practice managers, and so on. They will all have an opportunity to be involved with the teaching LHB and, consequently, improve the standards of care that those communities will receive.

Enghraifft arall yw'r uned cefnogi gofal sylfaenol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, y cyfeiriodd Leighton ati. Mae'r rhain yn enghreifftiau rhagorol o sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn cael meddygon teulu o safon uchel i'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig o safbwynt cymdeithasol ac economaidd, a lle y mae'r anghenion gofal iechyd mwyaf.

Yn olaf, nid yw'n gyfyngedig i feddygon teulu; bydd aelodau eraill o'r tîm gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn cael eu cynnwys—nyrsys, ymwelwyr iechyd, a hyd yn oed aelodau o staff y practis, fel rheolwyr practis, ac yn y blaen. Byddant i gyd yn cael cyfle i ymwneud â'r bwrdd addysgu iechyd lleol ac, o ganlyniad, i wella safon y gofal a roddir yn y cymunedau hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM3150): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3150): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3151): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3151): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3156): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3156): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3157): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3157): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006**  
**Approval of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3152)*

I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3152)*

Cynigïaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 June 2006. (NDM3153)*

The National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2006 govern the rates charged for prescription items dispensed in Wales. This change is one of a series of measures designed to fulfil this Government's commitment to abolishing prescription charges in Wales, which has been outstanding Welsh Labour business for many years.

Last year, the Assembly took the decisive step of preventing health tourism, by restricting the benefit of the lower Welsh charges to those patients in possession of a white prescription form. However, this excluded those living on the border who had chosen to register with an English GP. We estimate that approximately 7,000 people have been adversely affected. This amendment will rectify this anomaly by giving those people an entitlement card, which they can present at a Welsh pharmacy, alongside their prescription from their English-based GP, in order to take advantage of this lower charge.

3.40 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** While we do not support the move towards free prescriptions, we have

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3153)*

Mae Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn rheoli'r ffioedd a godir am eitemau a roddir ar bresgripsiwn yng Nghymru. Mae'r newid hwn yn un o gyfres o fesurau a gynlluniwyd er mwyn cyflawni ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon i ddiddymu ffioedd presgripsiwn yng Nghymru, mater y mae Llafur Cymru wedi bod yn ceisio'i ddatrys ers blynnyddoedd lawer.

Y llynedd, cymerodd y Cynulliad gamau pendant i atal twristiaeth iechyd, drwy gyfyngu manteision ffioedd is Cymru i'r cleifion hynny sydd â ffurflen bresgripsiwn wen. Fodd bynnag, golygai hyn na allai pobl a oedd yn byw ar y ffin ac a oedd wedi dewis cofrestru gyda meddyg teulu yn Lloegr fanteisio ar y ffioedd is. Amcangyfrifwn fod hyn wedi effeithio ar tua 7,000 o bobl. Bydd y diwygiad hwn yn unioni'r anghysonder hwn drwy roi i'r bobl hyn gerdyn hawlio, y gallant ei gyflwyno mewn fferyllfa yng Nghymru, ochr yn ochr â'r ffurflen bresgripsiwn gan eu meddyg teulu yn Lloegr, er mwyn manteisio ar y ffioedd is hyn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Er nad ydym yn cefnogi'r symudiad tuag at bresgripsiynau am

been supportive thus far of reducing the level of the prescription charge. It is important that patients living on the border who are registered with a doctor in England can benefit from the lower fee. If the First Minister, who seems to find this tremendously funny, thinks that wasting tens of millions of pounds of taxpayers' money on a free-for-all is a good idea, then he has not listened to any of the pharmacists in Wales who feel that free prescriptions are a complete waste of money and will lead to a wastage of medicines, and that people will not have a sense of ownership of their prescriptions. It also means that you will not be using valuable taxpayers' money in any strategic way, and that you seriously do not understand the fact that more than 80 per cent of those people who need prescriptions in Wales do not pay for them anyway. The Government and the First Minister have completely failed to understand how to get the maximum benefit from the scarce resources of taxpayers' money. Free prescriptions will not be a successful policy in Wales. The First Minister and the Cabinet can laugh all they like, but all the professional advice has been that this is not a sensible use of taxpayers' money—

**Alun Cairns:** Do you think it reasonable that someone such as the First Minister, who earns sums in excess of £100,000 per year, will now have free prescriptions as a result of this policy, when some people on relatively smaller levels of income will not have free prescriptions? They may well be the people waiting for an operation, while someone on the First Minister's salary level can afford private medical insurance.

**The First Minister** *rose—*

**Jonathan Morgan:** I think that you know the rules, First Minister; I have to respond first before giving way to you.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am very grateful to the assistant Deputy Presiding Officer, Jonathan Morgan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In response to my friend, this is, in essence, socialism in reverse; it is

ddim, yr ydym wedi bod yn gefnogol hyd yn hyn i ostwng y ffi am bresgripsiwn. Mae'n bwysig bod cleifion sy'n byw ar y ffin ac sydd wedi cofrestru gyda meddyg yn Lloegr yn gallu manteisio ar y ffi is. Os yw'r Prif Weinidog, sydd fel pe bai'n meddwl bod hyn yn ddoniol iawn, yn meddwl bod gwastraffu degau o filiynau o bunnoedd o arian trethdalwyr i gael rhywbeth am ddim i bawb yn syniad da, yna nid yw wedi gwranddo ar ddim un o'r fferyllwyr yng Nghymru sy'n teimlo bod presgripsiynau am ddim yn wastraff llwyr ar arian ac y byddant yn arwain at wastraffu meddyginiaethau, ac na fydd pobl yn gweld gwerth eu presgripsiynau. Mae hefyd yn golygu na fyddwch yn defnyddio arian gwerthfawr trethdalwyr mewn ffordd strategol, ac nad ydych mewn difrif yn deall y ffaith nad yw dros 80 y cant o'r bobl hynny sydd angen presgripsiynau yng Nghymru yn talu amdanynt pa un bynnag. Mae'r Llywodraeth a'r Prif Weinidog wedi methu'n glir â deall sut i gael y budd mwyaf o adnoddau prin arian trethdalwyr. Ni fydd presgripsiynau am ddim yn bolisi llwyddiannus yng Nghymru. Gall y Prif Weinidog a'r Cabinet chwerthin hynny a fyddant, ond mae pob cyngor proffesiynol a roddir yn dweud nad yw hyn yn ddefnydd doeth o arian trethdalwyr—

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn meddwl ei bod yn rhesymol bod rhywun fel y Prif Weinidog, sy'n ennill dros £100,000 y flwyddyn, yn mynd i gael presgripsiwn am ddim yn awr o ganlyniad i'r polisi hwn, pan na fydd presgripsiwn am ddim i rai pobl sydd ag incwm llai, o'i gymharu â hynny? Mae'n ddigon posibl mai'r bobl hyn fydd yn aros am lawdriniaeth, tra bo pobl sy'n derbyn cyflog mawr fel y Prif Weinidog yn gallu fforddio yswiriant meddygol preifat.

**Y Prif Weinidog** *a gododd—*

**Jonathan Morgan:** Credaf eich bod yn gwybod y rheolau, Brif Weinidog; rhaid imi ymateb yn gyntaf cyn ildio i chi.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn i'r Dirprwy Lywydd cynorthwyol, Jonathan Morgan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mewn ymateb i'm cyfaill, sosialaeth o chwith yw hyn yn y bôn;

taking money from very needy people and giving it to people such as us. The First Minister has hit his pensionable age, and, as a result, I do not think that he has to pay for his prescription. However, if he was below the age of 65 and earning the sort of salary that he is earning, then, under his policy, he would not have to pay for a prescription, which is rather bizarre.

**The First Minister:** Is this combination of Alun Cairns and Jonathan Morgan trying to explain to us that, if the Tories ever got back into power, they would take free prescriptions away from those aged over 60?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am not going to make a manifesto commitment today, and I would urge the First Minister and the Labour Party to avoid making any manifesto commitments between now and polling day for fear of deceiving the electorate. Let us face it; the commitment on waiting lists that you made in 1999 was not met, so I would shy away from making any such commitments to the health service. In recent months, we have seen your dreadful letdown of disabled people in Wales, who were conned by you and your colleagues into believing that you would be in a position to scrap home-care charges. Therefore, I will certainly not take any lectures from this rather tired administration as to when commitments should be made and how they can be honoured. We have always maintained that we think this move towards a zero prescription charge is not a sensible use of public resources, and, as I said earlier, if you had taken any notice of the professionals in Wales—the pharmacists and those who administer prescriptions—you would know that this is a complete waste of money. I am afraid that the chickens will come home to roost for you as a Government on this particular issue. It is very easy to give something away for nothing; the challenge in this job is to do something for maximum benefit that is a sound use of public resources, and you have not demonstrated that in this manifesto commitment. So, I am happy to support this regulation. I am being shouted down by the Government, but I am happy to support it.

mae'n mynd ag arian oddi ar bobl anghenus iawn ac yn ei roi i bobl fel ni. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi cyrraedd ei oedran pensiwn, ac, o ganlyniad, nid wyf yn credu bod rhaid iddo dalu am ei bresgripsiwn. Fodd bynnag, pe bai dan 65 oed ac yn ennill y math o gyflog y mae'n ei ennill, yna, dan ei bolisi ef, ni fyddai'n gorfod talu am bresgripsiwn, sydd braidd yn od.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** A yw'r cyfuniad hwn o Alun Cairns a Jonathan Morgan yn ceisio dweud wrthym y byddai'r Toriaid, pe baent yn ôl wrth y llyw ryw dro, yn gwneud i bobl dros 60 oed dalu am bresgripsiwn?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid wyf yn mynd i wneud ymrwymiad maniffesto heddiw, a byddwn yn annog y Prif Weinidog a'r Blaid Lafur i beidio â gwneud dim ymrwymadau maniffesto o hyn hyd ddiwrnod yr etholiad rhag ofn iddynt dwyllo'r etholwyr. Gadewch inni wynebu'r gwir; ni wireddwyd yr ymrwymiad ynghylch rhestrau aros a wnaethpwyd gennych yn 1999, felly byddwn yn oedi cyn gwneud unrhyw addewidion o'r fath yng nghyswllt y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, gwelsom fel y bu ichi siomi pobl anabl yng Nghymru, a dwyllwyd gennych chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau i gredu y byddech yn gallu diddymu taliadau gofal cartref. Felly, ni fyddaf yn sicr yn gwrandao ar ddarlith gan y weinyddiaeth hon sydd braidd yn flinedig ynglŷn â pha bryd y dylid gwneud addewidion a sut y gellir eu cyflawni. Yr ydym wedi dweud o hyd ein bod yn credu nad yw'r symudiad hwn tuag at ddiddymu taliadau presgripsiwn yn ddefnydd doeth o adnoddau cyhoeddus, ac, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, pe baech wedi cymryd unrhyw sylw o'r gweithwyr proffesiynol yng Nghymru—y fferyllwyr a'r rhai sy'n rhoi presgripsiynau—byddech yn gwybod bod hyn yn wastraff llwyr ar arian. Mae arnaf ofn y bydd y rhod yn troi arnoch fel Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn. Mae'n hawdd iawn rhoi rhywbeth am ddim; yr her yn y swydd hon yw gwneud rhywbeth er mwyn y budd mwyaf sydd yn ddefnydd doeth o adnoddau cyhoeddus, ac nid ydych wedi dangos hynny yn yr ymrwymiad maniffesto hwn. Felly, yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliad hwn. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweiddi ar fy nhraws, ond yr wyf yn fodlon ei gefnogi.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are not being shouted down by the Government. No-one shouts anyone down in this Chamber.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am more than happy to support this regulation, because I have raised the issue of those people living near the border before. The Minister for health has mentioned the cost of prescription tourism, and it is a matter that I have raised with him previously. Can he tell me the cost of prescription tourism since the start of the reduction in prescription charges? I think that it ran into a couple of million pounds, but perhaps he could confirm the exact figure.

In addition, could the Minister provide an update on the current estimate of the cost of the complete introduction of free prescriptions? When the Government announced this policy, it was thought that that cost would be in the region of £30 million to £35 million. Is that still the estimate, or does he believe that it will be higher than that? Many of the professionals to whom we have spoken believe that to be a gross underestimate of the final figure, simply because of the likely explosion in the number of people who will lose their medicines or continue to come back to doctors and additional prescribers, such as nurses and pharmacists, which we will have when this is introduced by the end of next year? As a result of that explosion, the cost could increase. If the Minister could provide answers to those questions, we will be more than happy to support these regulations.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats are happy to support this, because it will deal with an anomaly that I have been in correspondence with the Minister about, having received representations from people living in Powys whose GP surgeries are in Wales but the main practices of those surgeries are registered in England. Those people have been badly discriminated against as a result of this. What is surprising, however, is that the omission was pointed out by community pharmacists when the first regulations were brought in, but it was not dealt with at the time. For that reason, it would be helpful if the Minister could tell us

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn gweiddi ar eich traws. Ni cheir gweiddi ar draws neb yn y Siambr hon.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn fodlon iawn cefnogi'r rheoliad hwn, gan fy mod wedi codi'r mater sydd yn ymwneud â'r rhai sydd yn byw ger y ffin o'r blaen. Mae'r Gweinidog dros iechyd wedi sôn am gost twristiaeth presgripsiynau, ac mae'n fater yr wyf wedi'i godi gydag ef o'r blaen. A yw'n gallu dweud wrthyf beth yw cost twristiaeth presgripsiynau ers pan ddechreuwyd gostwng ffioedd presgripsiwn? Yr wyf yn credu ei bod tua filiwn o bunnoedd, ond efallai y gallai gadarnhau'r union ffigur.

Yn ogystal â hynny, a all y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr amcangyfrif presennol o gost cyflwyno presgripsiynau am ddim yn llawn? Pan gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth y polisi hwn, credid y byddai'r gost rhwng £30 miliwn a £35 miliwn yn fras. Ai hynny yw'r amcangyfrif o hyd, neu a yw'n credu y bydd yn uwch na hynny? Mae llawer o'r gweithwyr proffesiynol yr ydym wedi siarad â hwy'n credu bod hynny'n amcangyfrif llawer rhy isel o'r ffigur terfynol, oherwydd y cynnydd aruthrol sydd yn debygol yn nifer y rhai a fydd yn colli eu meddyginiaethau neu'n dal i ddod yn ôl at feddygon ac at bresgripsiynwyr ychwanegol, fel nyrsys a fferyllwyr, a fydd gennym pan gyflwynir hyn erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn nesaf. O ganlyniad i'r cynnydd mawr hwnnw, gallai'r gost fod yn fwy. Os gall y Gweinidog roi atebion i'r cwestiynau hynny, byddwn yn fodlon iawn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n fodlon cefnogi hyn, gan y bydd yn delio ag anghysonder yr wyf wedi gohebu â'r Gweinidog yn ei gylch, ar ôl cael sylwadau gan bobl sydd yn byw ym Mhowys y mae meddygfeydd eu meddygon teulu yng Nghymru a phrif bractisiau'r meddygfeydd hynny wedi'u cofrestru yn Lloegr. Cafwyd gwahaniaethu difrifol yn erbyn y bobl hynny oherwydd hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd yn peri syndod yw bod fferyllwyr cymunedol wedi tynnu sylw at y diffyg hwn pan roddwyd y rheoliadau cyntaf mewn grym, ond ni ddeliwyd â hynny ar y pryd. Oherwydd hynny, byddai o gymorth pe



how many people he estimates this will cover and the approximate cost of this. I assume that it must be additional to his original estimate, since it was not included in the original plan, but perhaps he could clarify that for us.

Like the Conservatives, the Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that health money could have been spent on better things than free prescriptions for the better off, but we have them, and we will certainly not oppose this motion for that reason. However, I want to take this opportunity to pursue an issue with the Minister. Jonathan asked for some figures, which will be useful, but I would like to know the rate at which the estimated cost of producing free prescriptions has escalated, and whether the number of prescriptions issued each year has increased as the cost of prescription items has reduced, so that we can have some measure of the potential impact of this policy on the demand. I say this because, when the Scottish committee came to Wales to visit us and to investigate the issue of free prescriptions, its Members, on a cross-party basis, repeatedly expressed amazement that the Welsh Assembly Government could not provide them with any figures or estimates, and even professed that it had not done such estimates.

I am old enough to remember the days when prescriptions were free—a long time ago. When the Government reversed that policy, one reason given for that was the massive demand for prescriptions to deal only with people's coughs and sneezes. There was real concern at the time among the medical profession about the impact of free prescriptions on GP surgeries. Decades may have passed, but human nature has not changed, and I am pretty certain that we are likely to see a similar phenomenon.

3.50 p.m.

It may not impact on doctors' surgeries; it may impact more on community pharmacies, and they will have to deal with the issue. However, it is important that the Minister clarifies the estimated cost, the estimated

gallai'r Gweinidog roi ei amcangyfrif o nifer y bobl y bydd hyn yn berthnasol iddynt a'i gost yn fras. Yr wyf yn cymryd y bydd hynny'n ychwanegol at ei amcangyfrif gwreiddiol, gan nad oedd wedi'i gynnwys yn y cynllun gwreiddiol, ond efallai y gallai egluro hynny i ni.

Fel y Ceidwadwyr, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu y gellid bod wedi gwario arian iechyd ar bethau gwell na phresgripsiynau am ddim ar gyfer y rhai gwell eu byd, ond maent gennym bellach, ac, yn sicr, ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r cynnig hwn oherwydd hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dymuno achub ar y cyfle hwn i godi mater gyda'r Gweinidog. Gofynnodd Jonathan am rai ffigurau, a fyddai'n fuddiol, ond hoffwn wybod o faint y mae'r amcangyfrif o gost creu presgripsiynau am ddim wedi codi, ac a yw nifer y presgripsiynau a roddir bob blwyddyn wedi codi wrth i gost eitemau presgripsiwn ostwng, fel y gallwn gael rhyw amcan o effaith bosibl y polisi hwn ar y galw. Yr wyf yn dweud hyn am fod aelodau o bob plaid ym mhwyllgor yr Alban, pan ddaeth i Gymru i ymweld â ni ac ymchwilio i fater presgripsiynau am ddim, wedi mynegi syndod sawl gwaith ynghylch y ffaith na allai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi dim ffigurau neu amcangyfrifon iddynt, a'i bod hyd yn oed wedi addef nad oedd wedi gwneud amcangyfrifon o'r fath.

Yr wyf yn ddigon hen i gofio'r dyddiau pan oedd presgripsiynau am ddim—amser maith yn ôl. Pan newidiodd y Llywodraeth y polisi hwnnw, un rheswm a roddwyd dros wneud hynny oedd bod galw enfawr am bresgripsiynau i drin pobl nad oeddent yn gwneud dim ond pesychu a thisian. Yr oedd gwir bryder ar y pryd ymysg meddygon am effaith presgripsiynau am ddim ar feddygfeydd meddygon teulu. Er bod degawdau wedi mynd heibio, nid yw'r natur ddynol wedi newid, ac yr wyf yn eithaf sicr ein bod yn debygol o weld ffenomen debyg.

Efallai na fydd yn effeithio ar feddygfeydd meddygon; gallai gael mwy o effaith ar fferyllfeydd cymunedol, a byddant yn gorfod delio â'r mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig bod y Gweinidog yn egluro'r gost a

number of people affected by this, the estimated number of prescriptions and any increase that he thinks will occur as a result of this policy.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn er ein bod yn rhannu rhai o'r amheuon a grybwyllwyd gan Jonathan Morgan a Jenny Randerson ynglŷn â'r polisi hwn gan y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru. Y realiti yw y bydd y cardiau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno, ac mae gennyf gwestiwn penodol ynglŷn â'r broses o gyflawni hyn. Weinidog, pam na chafodd Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru wybod am y bwriad hwn hyd 26 Mai? Rhaid iddo weithio yn awr gyda byrddau iechyd lleol ac Atebion Iechyd Cymru i geisio sicrhau y caiff hyn ei gyflawni yn unol â'r amserlen a osodwyd gennych chi. Oni fyddai wedi bod yn well cynnwys Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru yn y trafodaethau, oherwydd ei staff fydd yn gorfod ymdrin â'r problemau ymarferol a fydd yn codi? A ydych yn credu y caiff eich amserlen ei gwireddu? Rhaid i chi gydnabod bod yr amserlen yn eithriadol o dynn, a chan nad ydych wedi ymgynghori â chyrff fel Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru, bydd hynny yn gwneud y broses yn anos ei gweithredu.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, I am grateful that the steps that you have outlined today will be taken forwards. Given the nature of Brecon and Radnorshire, many of my constituents live on the border and are registered with English GPs for practical reasons. They have been discriminated against since other Welsh patients have been able to receive their prescriptions at a cheaper price.

It has taken considerable time to reach this solution and it concerns me that it has taken so long. Minister, you will be aware that even the solution that we are talking about today will not solve the problem for a sizeable amount of people living in my constituency. They are registered with a GP in England and will have to continue to take their prescriptions to pharmacists in England; to require them to take their prescription from their GP to a pharmacist in Wales, where they could use their entitlement card to obtain their prescription, would be entirely

amcangyfrifir, yr amcangyfrif o nifer y bobl y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt, yr amcangyfrif o nifer y presgripsiynau ac unrhyw gynnydd a fydd yn digwydd o ganlyniad i'r polisi hwn, yn ei farn ef.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We will support these regulations although we share some of the concerns that were expressed by Jonathan Morgan and Jenny Randerson about this Labour Party policy in Wales. The reality is that these cards will be introduced, and so I have a specific question about the process of doing that. Minister, why was Community Pharmacy Wales not told about this intention until 26 May? It will now have to work with local health boards and Health Solutions Wales to try to ensure that this is achieved in accordance with the timetable that you have fixed. Would it not have been better to include Community Pharmacy Wales in the discussions because it is its staff who will have to deal with the practical problems that will arise? Minister, do you believe that your timetable will be realised? You must concede that the timetable is extremely tight and, as you have not consulted organisations such as Community Pharmacy Wales, that will make the process even more difficult to implement.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar y bydd y camau yr ydych wedi'u hamlinellu heddiw'n cael eu cymryd. Oherwydd natur Brycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, mae llawer o'm hetholwyr yn byw ar y ffin ac wedi'u cofrestru gyda meddygon teulu yn Lloegr am resymau ymarferol. Gwahaniaethwyd yn eu herbyn gan fod cleifion eraill yng Nghymru wedi gallu cael eu presgripsiynau'n rhatach.

Aeth cryn amser heibio cyn cael yr ateb hwn ac mae'n ofid i mi fod hyn wedi cymryd cymaint o amser. Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol na fydd yr ateb yr ydym yn sôn amdano heddiw'n ddigon i ddatrys y broblem i nifer sylweddol o'r bobl sydd yn byw yn fy etholaeth. Maent wedi cofrestru gyda meddyg teulu yn Lloegr a byddant yn dal i orfod mynd â'u presgripsiynau at fferyllwyr yn Lloegr; byddai mynnu eu bod yn mynd â phresgripsiwn a gawsant gan eu meddyg teulu i fferyllfa yng Nghymru, lle y gallent ddefnyddio eu cerdyn hawliau i gael eu

impractical. For example, the vast majority of patients in the villages of New Radnor and Old Radnor obtain their GP services at the practice at Kington. They do so because of tradition, and also simply because there are better bus links from those villages to England than to other parts of Wales. For them to obtain their prescription at a Welsh pharmacy would require them to travel several miles past their homes to a pharmacy this side of the Welsh border. In reality, given the nature of public transport links and the cost of fuel, many pensioners or people in vulnerable groups will simply not be in a position to undertake those journeys, and this policy will still leave them at a disadvantage, compared with other people living in Wales.

I am grateful that we have cut the numbers of people losing out from approximately 7,000 people, but a significant number of people living in the east Radnor area will continue to have difficulties in obtaining reduced-price prescriptions—and free prescriptions, in future. I ask you to look again at this matter. Surely it is not beyond the wit of your officials to allow these people some kind of documentation to enable them to obtain their prescriptions in a pharmacy in England while still retaining their right, as Welsh citizens, to a reduced-price or free prescription.

**Carl Sargeant:** We should welcome these regulations today. Many thousands of my constituents fell foul of the loophole that was in place and I thank you personally for rectifying the problem. The people of Broughton and Saltney will now be able to benefit from reduced prescription charges—indeed, ultimately, from free prescriptions also.

What has also been clear from the contribution of the Conservative benches and the grand coalition that seems to have appeared today between Plaid and the Tories is that they are opposed to free prescriptions. In their next manifestos, they need to be clear and honest with the public, saying that they would withdraw free prescriptions from the people of Wales. I am sure that my new colleague, Trish Law, will be fighting for her

presgripsiwn, yn gwbl anymarferol. Er enghraifft, mae mwyafrif llethol y cleifion ym mhentrefi Maesyfed a Phencraig yn cael eu gwasanaethau meddyg teulu yn y practis yng Ngheintun. Gwnânt hynny o ran traddodiad, a hefyd am fod gwell cysylltiadau ar fysiau rhwng y pentrefi hynny a Lloegr nag â rhannau eraill o Gymru. Er mwyn cael eu presgripsiwn mewn fferyllfa yng Nghymru, byddai'n rhaid iddynt deithio rhai milltiroedd heibio i'w cartrefi i fferyllfa ar yr ochr hon i ffin Cymru. Mewn gwirionedd, o ystyried natur y cysylltiadau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a chost tanwydd, mae llawer o bensynwyr a rhai sydd yn agored i niwed na fyddant yn gallu mynd ar y teithiau hynny, a bydd y polisi hwn yn dal i'w rhoi dan anfantais, o'u cymharu â phobl eraill sydd yn byw yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ein bod wedi lleihau'r nifer sydd ar eu colled o tua 7,000 o bobl, ond mae nifer sylweddol o bobl yn ardal dwyrain Maesyfed a fydd yn dal i'w chael yn anodd cael presgripsiynau rhatach—a phresgripsiynau am ddim, yn y dyfodol. Gofynnaf ichi ailedrych ar y mater hwn. Mae'n sicr nad yw y tu hwnt i grebwyll eich swyddogion roi rhyw fath o ddogfennau i'r bobl hyn i'w galluogi i gael eu presgripsiwn mewn fferyllfa yn Lloegr gan gadw eu hawl, fel dinasyddion Cymru, i gael presgripsiwn rhatach neu bresgripsiwn am ddim.

**Carl Sargeant:** Dylem groesawu'r rheoliadau hyn heddiw. Yr oedd miloedd lawer o'm hetholwyr wedi cael cam oherwydd y man gwan a oedd yn bod a diolchaf ichi'n bersonol am ddatrys y broblem. Yn awr, bydd pobl Brychdyn a Saltney yn gallu manteisio ar ffioedd presgripsiwn is—ac, yn wir, ar bresgripsiynau am ddim hefyd, yn y pen draw.

Yr hyn a welwyd yn glir hefyd yn y cyfraniad o du meinciau'r Ceidwadwyr a chan y glymblaid fawr y mae'n ymddangos ei bod wedi codi heddiw rhwng Plaid a'r Toriaid yw eu bod yn gwrthwynebu presgripsiynau am ddim. Yn eu manifestos nesaf, rhaid iddynt fod yn glir ac yn eirwir wrth y cyhoedd, a dweud y byddent yn tynnu'n ôl bresgripsiynau am ddim oddi wrth bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-

constituents in Blaenau, where they deserve free prescriptions as they are part of the needy, and will not be voting with the grand coalition that seems to have been adopted today.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** We wandered far and wide on this issue, but it is true that, if you introduce universal entitlement to anything, there will be people at the wealthier end of the spectrum who will benefit. However, the question is whether we can introduce a scheme that is relatively anomaly-free that can benefit the changing patterns of healthcare that we see, particularly post the Wanless review. One of the big messages of the Wanless review was that we needed to manage chronic disease far more effectively. I would suggest that the main beneficiaries of this scheme will be those who are on low and modest incomes who are in receipt of several prescription items, particularly for conditions such as heart disease, for which they could be on blood-pressure tablets, cholesterol tablets, aspirin and so forth. Many of these people are not the rich people whom Alun Cairns tried to highlight; they are ordinary, decent, hard-working people on relatively modest incomes.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, had you offered a policy that targeted specific groups, as many opposition members mentioned at the time, you might have had widespread support for this. Why have you offered an absolute free-for-all when you could have identified a particular group in the way that was suggested?

**Brian Gibbons:** The choice was whether to go for a clear, unambiguous system or to replace one system based on anomalies and means testing with another. Our decision was that it was better to address this in an anomaly-free manner. Clearly, the opportunity will be available to the Welsh Conservatives and others to go to the electorate on this issue and ask it to make a judgment on it. However, in terms of the message of the Wanless report, I have no doubt that if we accept that the distribution of

Aelod newydd, Trish Law, yn ymladd dros ei hetholwyr ym Mlaenau, lle y maent yn haeddu cael presgripsiynau am ddim gan eu bod yn anghenus, ac na fydd yn pleidleisio gyda'r glymblaid fawr sydd wedi'i mabwysiadu heddiw, yn ôl pob golwg.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Crwydrasom i bob man ar y mater hwn, ond mae'n wir, os cyflwynir hawl gyffredinol i unrhyw beth, y bydd rhai pobl ym mhewn cyfoethocaf y sbectrwm a fydd yn elwa. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn pwysig yw a allwn gyflwyno cynllun nad oes ynddo fawr o anghysonderau a all fod o fudd i'r patrymau gofâl iechyd cyfnewidiol a welwn, yn enwedig ar ôl adolygiad Wanless. Un o'r negeseuon pwysig yn adolygiad Wanless oedd bod angen inni reoli afiechyd cronig yn llawer mwy effeithiol. Awgrymaf mai'r rhai a gaiff y budd mwyaf o'r cynllun hwn yw'r rhai sydd ag incwm isel a chanolig sydd yn cael amryw o eitemau ar bresgripsiwn, yn enwedig ar gyfer cyflyrau fel clefyd y galon, y gallent fod yn cael tabledi at bwysedd gwaed, tabledi ar gyfer colesterol, aspirin ac yn y blaen i'w drin. Mae llawer o'r bobl hyn nad ydynt ymhlith y bobl gyfoethog y ceisiodd Alun Cairns dynnu sylw atynt; maent yn bobl gyffredin, barchus a gweithgar sydd ag incwm eithaf bach.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, pe byddech wedi cynnig polisi a oedd yn targedu grwpiau penodol, fel y nododd llawer o aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau ar y pryd, efallai y cawsech gefnogaeth gyffredinol i hyn. Pam yr ydych wedi cynnig rhywbeth sydd yn rhad ac am ddim i bawb pryd y gallech fod wedi canolbwyntio ar grŵp penodol fel yr awgrymwyd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd yn rhaid dewis rhwng pennu system glir a diamwys a rhoi system sydd yn seiliedig ar anghysonderau a phrawf modd yn lle un arall debyg. Penderfynasom ei bod yn well ymdrin â hyn heb gyflwyno anghysonderau. Wrth gwrs, bydd cyfle gan Geidwadwyr Cymru ac eraill i fynd at yr etholwyr ynghylch y mater hwn a gofyn iddynt farnu yn ei gylch. Fodd bynnag, yng nghyd-destun y neges yn adroddiad Wanless, yr wyf yn sicr, os ydym yn derbyn bod dosbarthiad afiechyd yn seiliedig ar bobl

ill health is based on people on relatively low incomes, and if the burden of ill health involves many prescriptions, then this is a highly progressive move to tackle the unequal health experience of people in Wales, and is a significant contribution towards delivering social justice.

I do not think that the cost of the scheme will increase dramatically because, originally, we envisaged that everyone in Wales would benefit from the scheme. It was only because of the particular anomalies around the border that potentially 14,000 people, though probably only 7,000, of those entitled to reduced-cost prescriptions had to be included in the scheme in this new way. I do not think that the overall cost of the scheme will be increased dramatically because of that.

To date, we have not had any substantial evidence of a dramatic increase in the number of prescriptions being cashed purely because of this reduction in charges. Equally, it is fair to say that there is not a large amount of evidence of prescription tourism taking place, though that is based purely on anecdote. When the reduction in charges came in, I remember, as will other Assembly Members, having an e-mail from a gentleman in the Wirral who wondered whether there was any Assembly scheme to promote his business, which was to collect prescriptions in the Wirral to come over to Wales to cash them in, so that those prescriptions would benefit from the reduced charges. I think that we all had that e-mail at that time.

4.00 p.m.

I know that Carl Sargeant, Sandy Mewies and Karen Sinclair have been active on this issue, and they have lobbied heavily. I hope that, as well as the other Members who spoke on this issue, they will be able to acknowledge the progress that is being made.

On Kirsty's point, we are aware that there is a pocket in New Radnor where this is a problem. I cannot remember your exact form of words, but the numbers that are likely to be affected by the outstanding anomaly are

sydd ag incwm cymharol isel, ac os yw baich afiechyd yn galw am lawer o bresgripsiynau, fod hyn yn gam blaengar dros ben i ddelio â'r profiad anghyfartal o ran iechyd ymysg pobl Cymru, a'i fod yn gyfraniad o bwys at sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Nid wyf yn credu y bydd cost y cynllun yn codi'n sylweddol oherwydd, ar y dechrau, rhagwelasom y byddai pawb yng Nghymru'n cael budd o'r cynllun. Dim ond oherwydd yr anghysonderau penodol mewn cysylltiad â'r ffin y bu'n rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r dull newydd hwn i gynnwys hyd at 14,000 o bobl, er na fydd ond 7,000 yn ôl pob tebyg, sydd â hawl i gael presgripsiynau rhatach yn y cynllun hwn. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd cost gyffredinol y cynllun yn codi'n sylweddol oherwydd hynny.

Hyd yn hyn, ni chawsom ddim tystiolaeth sylweddol i ddangos bod nifer y presgripsiynau a gyfnewidir wedi codi'n drawiadol dim ond am fod y ffioedd wedi gostwng. Yn yr un modd, teg yw dweud nad oes llawer o dystiolaeth o dwristiaeth presgripsiynau, er bod hynny wedi'i seilio'n llwyr ar anecdotau. Pan gyflwynwyd y gostyngiad yn y taliadau, yr wyf yn cofio, fel y bydd Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad, imi gael neges drwy'r e-bost oddi wrth ŵr bonheddig yng Nghilgwri a oedd yn holi tybed a oedd unrhyw gynllun o eiddo'r Cynulliad i hyrwyddo ei fusnes, sef casglu presgripsiynau yng Nghilgwri a dod draw i Gymru i'w cyfnewid, fel y byddai taliadau is am y presgripsiynau hynny. Yr wyf yn credu bod pob un ohonom wedi cael y neges e-bost honno bryd hynny.

Yr wyf yn gwybod bod Carl Sargeant, Sandy Mewies a Karen Sinclair wedi bod yn ymgyrchu ar y mater hwn, ac maent wedi llobio'n daer. Gobeithio, yn ogystal â'r Aelodau eraill a siaradodd ar y pwnc hwn, y gallant gydnabod y cynnydd a wneir.

O ran pwynt Kirsty, yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod ardal fach ym Maesyfed lle y mae hyn yn broblem. Ni allaf gofio eich union eiriau, ond mae'r niferoedd sydd yn debyg o ddiodeff effaith yr anghysonder sydd heb ei ddatrys yn

very small, even in comparison to the 7,000 people that are likely to benefit. In pointing out the New Radnor situation, you said that pensioners will have to travel, but that is not the case. Anyone entitled to a free prescription in England will also be able to cash it in England.

It has not been easy to come up with this solution. In retrospect, it seems to be fairly simple, but when the anomaly was highlighted in the first instance, I asked all Assembly Members to contribute their ideas as to how we could come up with a more elegant solution. A number of people presented ideas, but none were deliverable in practice.

On Rhodri Glyn's point, there has been an ongoing debate and consultation with Community Pharmacy Wales and other pharmacy interests, not least because they were involved in the conference that took place in, I think, December in which this idea emerged as the most likely and viable way forward. So, I would be surprised if they were not fully au fait with the discussions, and were not being kept up to date.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The point that they made was that they were not formally informed of the introduction of this card until 26 May, which makes the timetable very tight for them. They are facing real practical problems in terms of the introduction.

**Brian Gibbons:** There is nothing that I can say on that, except that the direction in which we were travelling could not have been a surprise to them, not least because they were part of the event that was the architect of the solution. We are in discussions with the various contractors and pricing organisations, such as Health Solutions Wales, to ensure that this is introduced in a smooth way, and that bureaucratic and red tape issues will be resolved effectively. It was the intention that it would be introduced with the minimum hassle and bureaucracy for pharmacists, because we realise that they have enough to do without getting tied up in red tape.

fach iawn, hyd yn oed o'u cymharu â'r 7,000 mil o bobl sydd yn debyg o elwa. Wrth dynnu sylw at sefyllfa Maesyfed, dywedasoeh y bydd yn rhaid i bensiynwyr deithio, ond nid yw hynny'n wir. Gall unrhyw un sydd â hawl i gael presgripsiwn am ddim yn Lloegr ei ddefnyddio yn Lloegr hefyd.

Ni fu'n hawdd darganfod yr ateb hwn. O edrych yn ôl, ymddengys yn weddol syml, ond pan dynnwyd sylw at yr anghysonder gyntaf, gofynnais i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyfrannu eu syniadau ynghylch sut i ddod o hyd i ateb mwy boddhaol. Cyflwynodd nifer o bobl syniadau, ond nid oedd modd rhoi'r un ohonynt ar waith.

O ran pwynt Rhodri Glyn, cafwyd trafod ac ymgynghori cyson gyda Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru a chyrrff fferyllol perthnasol eraill, ac un o'r rhesymau am hynny oedd eu bod wedi cymryd rhan yn y gynhadledd a gynhaliwyd ym mis Rhagfyr, yr wyf yn credu, lle'r ymddangosodd y syniad hwn fel y dull mwyaf tebygol ac ymarferol o fwrw ymlaen. Felly byddwn yn synnu pe na baent yn hollol gyfarwydd â'r trafodaethau a phe na baent yn derbyn y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Eu pwynt hwy oedd na chawsant eu hysbysu'n ffurfiol am gyflwyno'r cerdyn hwn tan 26 Mai, sydd yn gwneud yr amserlen yn un dynn iawn iddynt. Maent yn wynebu problemau ymarferol gwirioneddol o ran cyflwyno hyn.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid oes dim y gallaf ei ddweud am hynny, ac eithrio na allai'r cyfeiriad yr oeddem yn mynd iddo fod wedi bod yn syndod iddynt, a hynny oherwydd eu bod yn rhan o'r digwyddiad a roes fod i'r ateb. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r gwahanol gontractwyr a sefydliadau prisio, megis Atebion Iechyd Cymru, er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno'n ddidrafferth, ac y caiff materion yn ymwneud â biwrocratiaeth a thâp coch eu datrys yn effeithiol. Y bwriad oedd y byddai'n cael ei gyflwyno gyda chyn lleied ag oedd modd o helynt a biwrocratiaeth i fferyllwyr, gan ein bod yn sylweddoli bod ganddynt ddigon i'w wneud heb gael eu llyffetheirio gan dâp coch.

*Cynnig (NDM3152): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3152): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3153): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3153): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau  
Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments)  
(Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that  
**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*



*considers the principle of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3154)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 June 2006. (NDM3155)*

The regulations merely update the value of the vouchers in the light of national negotiations between the Assembly and the UK Government.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Again, we will support the regulations. As you rightly say, they amend the 1997 regulations and increase the value of the voucher.

I wish to raise two other issues connected with this. As you will know, the Scottish Executive has introduced free eye tests for everyone in Scotland. Is that something that you have considered for Wales? Do you accept that free eye tests could lead to the early identification of a number of health problems, and that there would be real savings to the health budget as a result?

In England, individuals suffering from keratoconus are able to obtain contact lenses and solutions on prescription, but we are

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3154)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3155)*

Y cyfan y mae'r rheoliadau yn ei wneud yw diweddarau gwerth y talebau yng ngoleuni trafodaethau cenedlaethol rhwng y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Unwaith eto, byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau. Fel y dywedwch, a hynny'n gywir, maent yn diwygio rheoliadau 1997 ac yn cynyddu gwerth y daleb.

Dymunaf godi dau fater arall sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn. Fel y gwyddoch, cyflwynodd Gweithrediaeth yr Alban brofion llygaid am ddim i bawb yn yr Alban. A yw hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydych wedi ei ystyried ar gyfer Cymru? A ydych yn derbyn y gallai profion llygaid am ddim arwain at ganfod nifer o broblemau iechyd yn gynnar, ac y byddai arbedion gwirioneddol i'r gyllideb iechyd o ganlyniad?

Yn Lloegr, gall unigolion sydd yn dioddef gan ceratoconws gael lensys cyffwrdd a thoddiannau ar bresgripsiwn, ond nid ydym

uncertain as to what the situation is in Wales and we would be grateful if you could enlighten us on that matter.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Welsh Liberal Democrat group will support these regulations, although we regret that the voucher increases were not put through earlier. The rest of the UK had them introduced in April, so the people of Wales have been put at a disadvantage since the beginning of April as a result of the Welsh Assembly Government's tardiness in introducing this.

I will also refer to the issue of keratoconus. The Minister will be aware that I have written to him about a constituent who suffers from the condition. It requires regular changes of lenses. Glasses will not do; it has to be contact lenses. It requires expert fitting and hospital attendance is usually necessary. There are also issues about the need for the fluid for the cleaning of those lenses and so on. I referred the Minister to a Welsh Office health circular of 1989. At that time, it appeared that people suffering from this debilitating eye condition, which greatly hampers their ability to function if they do not have the appropriate lenses, were exempt. I asked whether the circular was still extant. If it is, Minister, it is not being implemented and patients are being told that they have to pay for their lenses and for their cleaning solutions. I was surprised to have a letter from you today, Minister, which tells me about the eye condition but goes on to say at the end that your officials are working to confirm the current position regarding the provision of lenses and solutions. I assume from that that you do not know whether the circular from 1989 is still extant. If it is, I strongly urge you to raise the issue with local health boards and trusts throughout Wales because it is not being implemented. If it is not, I urge you to do something about it to reintroduce the provision of free eye care in these respects for the sufferers of this debilitating disease. I repeat my concern that the Welsh Assembly Government does not know what the rules are on this condition, because this is not a terribly rare condition.

yn sicr beth yw'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru a byddem yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ein goleuo ar y mater hwnnw.

**Jenny Randerson:** Bydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, er ein bod yn gresynu na weithredwyd y codiadau yn y talebion ynghynt. Fe'u cyflwynwyd yng ngweddill y DU ym mis Ebrill, felly mae pobl Cymru wedi bod dan anfantais ers dechrau Ebrill o ganlyniad i arafwch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth gyflwyno hyn.

Cyfeiriaf finnau hefyd at bwnc ceratoconws. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi ysgrifennu ato ynghylch etholwr sydd yn dioddef gan y cyflwr. Mae gofyn newid lensys yn rheolaidd. Ni wnaiff sbectol y tro; rhaid cael lensys cyffwrdd. Mae angen iddynt gael eu gosod gan arbenigwr, ac fel rheol, rhaid mynd i'r ysbyty. Rhaid cael hylif i lanhau'r lensys hynny hefyd ac yn y blaen. Tynnais sylw'r Gweinidog at gylchlythyr iechyd y Swyddfa Gymreig dyddiedig 1989. Bryd hynny, yr oedd yn ymddangos bod pobl a oedd yn dioddef gan y cyflwr hwn sydd yn gwanychu'r llygaid ac yn amharu'n fawr ar eu gallu i fyw eu bywydau os na chânt y lensys priodol, wedi eu heithrio. Gofynnais a oedd y cylchlythyr ar gael o hyd. Os ydyw, Weinidog, nid yw'n cael ei weithredu a dywedir wrth gleifion fod yn rhaid iddynt dalu am eu lensys ac am eu toddiannau glanhau. Synnais dderbyn llythyr gennych heddiw, Weinidog, sy'n dweud wrthyf am y cyflwr ar y llygad ond sydd yn mynd ymlaen i ddweud ar y diwedd fod eich swyddogion yn gweithio i gadarnhau'r sefyllfa bresennol o ran darparu lensys a thoddiannau. Tybiaf yn sgîl hynny nad ydych yn gwybod a yw cylchlythyr 1989 mewn bodolaeth o hyd. Os ydyw, yr wyf yn eich annog yn gryf i godi'r mater gyda byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau ledled Cymru, oherwydd nid yw'n cael ei weithredu. Os nad ydyw, yr wyf yn eich annog i wneud rhywbeth ynghylch y peth i ailgyflwyno darparu gofal llygaid am ddim yn hyn o beth i'r rhai sy'n dioddef gan y clefyd gwanychol hwn. Ailadroddaf fy mhryder na wŷr Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru beth yw'r rheolau ynghylch y cyflwr hwn, oherwydd nid yw'n gyflwr eithriadol o brin.

**Brian Gibbons:** On the free eye tests, we went through this when the Assembly was first established. If you remember, following on from that, we introduced the Welsh eye care initiative, having thoroughly investigated the free eye test issue. Generally, the Welsh eye care initiative has been an outstanding success and I think that even the Royal College of Ophthalmologists made a presentation on the basis of the Welsh eye care initiative. The feeling was that this programme was much more innovative and imaginative than simply going down the road of providing free eye tests. In a world in which there were no such things as priorities, you could do everything, but, in terms of deciding on priorities, and making a real difference to those who are at risk of a visual disability, the feeling is that going down the Welsh eye care initiative route was a much more productive and constructive way to go.

However, you are right. We had an event last week here in the Assembly at which the Royal National Institute for the Blind, among others, was urging people, particularly older people, to have a regular eye check, certainly annually or every two years, because there are some conditions, such as macular degeneration and so forth, which are asymptomatic. If you have a regular eye check and you can see the early signs of macular degeneration, in a minority of cases, something can be done, but, unfortunately, not in all cases.

4.10 p.m.

Jenny, there is nothing that I can add to the letter, but, hopefully, we will get clarification on that point, because it is unsatisfactory. However, it is important to emphasise that keratoconus is not an individual condition; it is a wide-spectrum disorder. It is like having asthma. As an asthmatic, you could be severely disabled to the point of hardly being able to get out of your chair, or you could be able to play international rugby for Wales. The range of disability varies quite considerably, and the same is true of keratoconus. However, people at the severe end of the spectrum clearly need specialist treatment, as you said. We will clarify that

**Brian Gibbons:** O ran y profion llygaid am ddim, aethom drwy hyn pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad gyntaf. Os cofiwch, yn dilyn hynny, cyflwynasom fenter profion llygaid Cymru, ar ôl ymchwilio'n drylwyr i fater profion llygaid am ddim. Yn gyffredinol, bu menter profion llygaid Cymru yn llwyddiant ysgubol, a thybiaf i Goleg Brenhinol yr Offthalmolegwyr hyd yn oed wneud cyflwyniad ar sail menter profion llygaid Cymru. Y teimlad oedd bod y rhaglen hon yn fwy mentrus a dychmygus o lawer na darparu profion llygaid am ddim yn unig. Mewn byd lle nad oedd y fath beth â blaenoriaethau, gallech wneud popeth, ond o ran penderfynu ar flaenoriaethau, a gwneud gwir wahaniaeth i'r rhai y mae perygl iddynt gael nam ar eu golwg, y teimlad oedd bod dilyn llwybr menter profion llygaid Cymru yn drywydd mwy cynhyrchiol ac adeiladol o lawer.

Er hynny, yr ydych yn iawn. Cawsom ddigwyddiad yma yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Cynulliad lle'r oedd Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol Pobl Ddall, ymysg eraill, yn annog pobl, yn enwedig pobl hŷn, i gael prawf llygaid rheolaidd, yn sicrhob blwyddyn neu ddwy flynedd, gan fod rhai cyflyrau, megis dirywiad maciwlaid ac yn y blaen, nad ydynt yn dangos symptomau. Os ydych yn cael prawf llygaid rheolaidd a bod modd gweld arwyddion cynnar dirywiad maciwlaid, mewn lleiafrif o achosion, mae modd gwneud rhywbeth, ond yn anffodus, nid yw hyn yn wir bob tro.

Jenny, ni allaf ychwanegu dim at y llythyr, ond y gobaith yw y cawn eglurhad ar y pwynt hwnnw, gan nad yw'n foddhaol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig pwysleisio nad cyflwr unigol yw ceratoconws; mae'n anhwylder sbectrwm eang. Mae yr un fath â dioddef gan asthma. Fel rhywun astmatig, gallech fod yn ddifrifol anabl i'r graddau mai prin y gallwch godi o'ch cadair, neu fe allech chwarae rygbi rhyngwladol dros Gymru. Mae rhychwant yr anabledd yn amrywio'n eithaf sylweddol, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am ceratoconws. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod angen triniaeth arbenigol ar bobl ym mhegwn difrifol y sbectrwm, fel y dywedaso. Eglurwn y

outstanding point and get back to you.

pwynt hwnnw, sydd heb ei egluro, a dod yn ôl atoch.

*Cynnig (NDM3154): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3154): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3155): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3155): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Meini Prawf ar gyfer Achredu Hyfforddiant Cychwynnol  
Athrawon gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru 2006 a Safonau Statws  
Athro Cymwysedig 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval of the Criteria for Initial Teacher Training Accreditation by the  
Higher Education Funding Council for Wales 2006 and the Qualified Teacher  
Status Standards 2006 under Standing Order No. 29**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor meini prawf ar gyfer achredu hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru 2006 y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3158)*

*considers the principle of the criteria for initial teacher training accreditation by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3158)*

Cynigiau fod

I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y pwyllgor deddfau ynghylch meini prawf ar gyfer achredu hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru 2006 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee in relation to criteria for initial teacher training accreditation by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales 2006 laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006; and*

*2. gan weithredu'n unol â rheol sefydlog 29.3 (iii), yn cymeradwyo bod meini prawf ar gyfer achredu hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*2. acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii), approves criteria for initial teacher training accreditation by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales 2006 made in accordance with:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006; a*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006; and*

*b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 27 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3159)*

*b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 27 June 2006. (NDM3159)*

Cynigiau fod

I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan*

*the National Assembly for Wales acting*

*weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):* *under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*  
29.3(iii):

*yn ystyried egwyddor safonau statws athro cymwysedig 2006 y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006.* (NDM3160) *considers the principle of qualified teacher status standards 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006.* (NDM3160)

Cynigiad fod

I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y pwyllgor deddfau ynghylch safonau statws athro cymwysedig 2006 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 27 Mehefin 2006; a*

*1. considers the report of the legislation committee in relation to qualified teacher status standards 2006 laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 27 June 2006; and*

*2. gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo bod safonau statws athro cymwysedig 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006.* (NDM3161)

*2. acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii), approves qualified teacher status standards 2006 made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006.* (NDM3161)

**Y Llywydd:** Gwelaf nad oes neb yn dymuno siarad ar y rheoliadau hyn, felly symudwn at bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** I see that no-one wishes to debate these regulations, therefore, we will move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3158): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM3158): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3159): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3159): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri



Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3160): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3160): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3161): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3161): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)**  
**Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Gemau'r Gymanwlad**  
**The Commonwealth Games**

<p>Motion (NDM3162): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i></p> <p><i>calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to commit itself in principle to supporting a Welsh bid to host the Commonwealth Games and further calls for work to begin forthwith, in collaboration with all stakeholders, to secure this objective.</i></p>	<p>Cynnig (NDM3162): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i></p> <p><i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo ei hun, mewn egwyddor, i gefnogi cais gan Gymru i lwyfannu Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn galw ymhellach am ddechrau'r gwaith ar fyrder, trwy gydweithredu â phob rhanddeiliad, er mwyn sicrhau'r nod hwn.</i></p>
<p>Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure, if a bid is viable, that it will be to the benefit of the whole of Wales.</i></p>	<p>Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau, os yw cais yn ymarferol, y bydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.</i></p>
<p>Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>agrees that the starting point for the Welsh Assembly Government's work on this issue, in collaboration with stakeholders, should be the undertaking of a comprehensive cost benefit analysis as part of a viability study.</i></p>	<p>Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn cytuno y dylai gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y mater hwn, mewn cydweithrediad â rhanddeiliaid, ddechrau gyda chyflawni dadansoddiad cost a budd cynhwysfawr, fel rhan o astudiaeth dichonolrwydd.</i></p>
<p>Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end:</p> <p><i>calls on WAG to ensure that any bid to host the Commonwealth Games will seek to bring benefit to Wales as a whole.</i></p>	<p>Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod unrhyw gais i lwyfannu Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn anelu at ddwyn budd i Gymru gyfan.</i></p>
<p>Amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add new point at end:</p> <p><i>acknowledges that the next opportunity for Wales to hold the Commonwealth Games will be in 2018 and believes that, in the meantime, improvements to transport, cultural and sporting facilities would be a</i></p>	<p>Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn derbyn mai 2018 fydd y cyfle nesaf i Gymru gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn credu, yn y cyfamser, y byddai gwella cyfleusterau trafnidiaeth, diwylliant a chwaraeon yn fuddsoddiad doeth.</i></p>

*wise investment.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to commit itself in principle to supporting a Welsh bid to host the Commonwealth Games and further calls for work to begin forthwith, in collaboration with all stakeholders, to secure this objective. (NDM3162)*

Wales has a strong case for holding the Commonwealth Games. We already have experience of hosting many world-class events here and we now boast some of the most fantastic world-class sporting facilities. There is no doubt in my mind nor in that of my party that Wales has a real chance of success in any bid that it would put forward to host the games.

In 2004, the First Minister shared our vision of Wales as a world-class sporting nation that was willing, ready and able to host the games, and to bring this prestigious event back to Wales for the first time since 1958. However, we have chosen to put forward this motion as our Conservative Party debate because we are deeply concerned that the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport does not share this vision, having ruled out the possibility of Wales hosting the event in the near future. Although it states in 'Climbing Higher' that the Government is looking to achieve sustainable success in the global sporting arena, it concerns us that it has now lost that vision. It seems that the Government likes to talk about how important sport is to our nation, but when it comes down to putting its words into action for the benefit of our nation, the Government does not deliver.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo ei hun, mewn egwyddor, i gefnogi cais gan Gymru i lwyfannu Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn galw ymhellach am ddechrau'r gwaith ar fyrder, trwy gydweithredu â phob rhanddeiliad, er mwyn sicrhau'r nod hwn. (NDM3162)*

Mae gan Gymru achos cryf dros gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Cawsom brofiad eisoes o groesawu nifer o achlysuron o safon orau'r byd yma, a bellach, gallwn hawlio bod gennym rai o'r cyfleusterau chwaraeon mwyaf rhagorol yn y byd. Nid oes amheuaeth yn fy meddwl i na'm plaid nad oes gan Gymru obaith gwirioneddol o lwyddo mewn unrhyw gais a fyddai'n cael ei wneud i gynnal y gemau.

Yn 2004, yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn cydfynd â'n gweledigaeth o Gymru fel cenedl chwaraeon o safon ryngwladol a oedd yn awyddus, yn barod ac yn alluog i gynnal y gemau, ac i ddod â'r digwyddiad mawreddog hwn yn ôl i Gymru am y tro cyntaf ers 1958. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi dewis cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn fel dadl y Blaid Geidwadol gan ein bod yn bryderus iawn nad yw'r weledigaeth hon gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, gan iddo ddiystyru'r posibilrwydd y gallai Cymru gynnal y digwyddiad yn y dyfodol agos. Er ei fod yn datgan yn 'Dringo'n Uwch' fod y Llywodraeth yn gobeithio gweld llwyddiant cynaliadwy yn y maes chwaraeon byd-eang, mae'n peri pryder inni ei bod bellach wedi colli'r weledigaeth honno. Ymddengys fod y Llywodraeth yn hoffi siarad am bwysigrwydd chwaraeon i'n cenedl, ond pan ddaw'n fater o roi ei geiriau ar waith er budd ein cenedl, nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn cyflawni dim.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.14 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.14 p.m.*

Hosting the games would have major economic benefits, and would bring in a lot of investment, as was the case in Manchester, where 16,000 jobs were created, tourism brought in £22 million, and the city secured more than £600-million-worth of private and public investment. Many people would visit Wales if we hosted the games. In 2002, 3,863 athletes made the trip to Manchester. The closing ceremony alone was attended by a sell-out crowd of 38,000 people. If it is the cost of hosting the games that concerns you, Minister, surely you can see that the money that will come back after that initial investment would be significantly higher in terms of inward investment, tourism and so on. The benefits far outweigh any reservations that the Government might have.

As well as further solidifying Wales's place on the world sporting map, hosting the Commonwealth Games would also serve to ignite the interest of the people of Wales—particularly the young—in sport; they would find new sporting heroes and would want to emulate the athletes. At a time when all Members are deeply concerned about the state of the health of our nation, and with childhood obesity levels higher in Wales than anywhere else, surely we should be looking to encourage sporting activity in any way possible. As we have seen from hosting other sporting events, hosting events in Wales increases sporting activity significantly. What better way is there for us to develop mass participation in sport and physical activity than by getting the nation behind an event such as the Commonwealth Games. It would inspire the nation to get involved with sport and instil a national pride in sport and in what can be achieved.

Sport has always been important to Wales. It has crossed divides and has brought communities together. We have an opportunity to leave a legacy for Wales. Consider the huge economic benefits: increased tourism; a chance to develop

Byddai cynnal y gemau'n golygu manteision economaidd sylweddol, a byddent yn denu llawer o fuddsoddiad, fel y gwelwyd ym Manceinion, lle y crëwyd 16,000 o swyddi, denodd twristiaeth £22 miliwn, a sicraodd y ddinas werth dros £600 miliwn mewn buddsoddiad preifat a chyhoeddus. Byddai llawer o bobl yn ymweld â Chymru pe baem yn cynnal y gemau. Yn 2002, teithiodd 3,863 o athletwyr i Fanceinion. Gwerthwyd pob un o'r 38,000 o docynnau ar gyfer y seremoni i gloi'r gemau yn unig. Os mai'r gost o gynnal y gemau sy'n eich poeni, Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch weld y bydd yr arian a ddaw'n ôl wedi'r buddsoddiad cychwynnol yn llawer mwy o ran mewnffuddsoddiad, twristiaeth ac yn y blaen. Mae'r manteision yn llawer mwy nag unrhyw amheuan a allai fod gan y Llywodraeth.

Yn ogystal â chadarnhau lle Cymru ymhellach ar fap chwaraeon y byd, byddai cynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad hefyd yn fodd i ennyn diddordeb pobl Cymru—yn enwedig yr ifanc—mewn chwaraeon; byddent yn darganfod arwyr chwaraeon newydd a byddent am efelychu'r athletwyr. Ar adeg pan fo'r holl Aelodau'n bryderus dros ben ynglŷn â chyflwr iechyd ein cenedl, a chan fod lefelau gordewdra ymhlith plant yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn unman arall, yr wyf yn sicr y dylem fod yn ymdrechu i annog pobl i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon mewn unrhyw ffordd bosibl. Fel yr ydym wedi gweld yn sgîl cynnal digwyddiadau chwaraeon eraill, mae cynnal digwyddiadau yng Nghymru'n arwain at gynnydd sylweddol mewn gweithgarwch ym maes chwaraeon. Pa ffordd well sydd inni o ddatblygu cyfranogiad torfol mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol na thrwy sicrhau cefnogaeth y genedl i ddigwyddiad megis Gemau'r Gymanwlad? Byddai'n ysbrydoli'r genedl i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon ac yn ennyn balchder cenedlaethol mewn chwaraeon a'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni.

Mae chwaraeon wedi bod yn bwysig i Gymru erioed. Mae wedi goresgyn rhaniadau ac wedi dod â chymunedau at ei gilydd. Mae gennym gyfle i adael rhywbeth o bwys i Gymru. Ystyriwch y manteision economaidd enfawr: cynnydd mewn twristiaeth; cyfle i

sporting facilities to benefit communities right across Wales; to involve people in sport from grassroots level; to allow our elite athletes the very best chance to succeed; to further enhance our nation's major-event capability; and to solidify Wales's place on the world sporting map.

**Val Lloyd:** Thank you for taking an intervention. I have listened with interest and, in principle, what you are suggesting could be a very good thing. Do you have any estimate of the cost of putting on the games?

**Laura Anne Jones:** That would, of course, have to form part of the feasibility study. I hope that the Government will support the idea of hosting the games in principle and will get together with the relevant stakeholders to sort out how much it would cost. I am sure that you will agree that the initial cost of hosting the games would be far outweighed by the benefits that they would bring to Wales, both economically and by interesting people in sport. I am sure that, as a member of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, you would agree with me on that.

Attracting the Ryder Cup and Ashes to Wales has shown what can be done when all interested groups work together.

I call on the Welsh Assembly Government to support a Welsh Commonwealth Games bid. What we need is political leadership from the First Minister—who, unfortunately, is not here—from the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, and from the Assembly Government. If the First Minister is determined to bring the games to Wales, now is the time for him to show it.

4.20 p.m.

I hope that this Government grasps the opportunity today to show that it also shares the vision that we, the Welsh Conservative Party, the other Assembly political groups and the nation, share.

ddatblygu cyfleusterau chwaraeon er budd cymunedau ledled Cymru; denu pobl i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon ar lawr gwlad; rhoi'r cyfle gorau posibl i'n hathletwyr elitaidd i lwyddo; rhoi hwb ychwanegol i allu ein cenedl i gynnal digwyddiadau mawr; a chadarnhau lle Cymru ar fap chwaraeon y byd.

**Val Lloyd:** Diolch i chi am ganiatáu ymyriad. Yr wyf wedi gwrandio gyda diddordeb ac, mewn egwyddor, gallai'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu fod yn beth da iawn. A oes gennych unrhyw amcangyfrif o gost cynnal y gemau?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Byddai'n rhaid i hynny, wrth gwrs, fod yn rhan o'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'r syniad o gynnal y gemau mewn egwyddor ac y bydd yn ymuno â'r rhanddeiliaid perthnasol i ganfod faint y byddai'n ei gostio. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno y bydd y manteision i Gymru o gynnal y gemau'n llawer mwy na'r gost gychwynnol, o safbwynt economaidd ac o ran ennyn diddordeb pobl mewn chwaraeon. Yr wyf yn siŵr, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, y byddwch yn cytuno â mi ynghylch hynny.

Mae denu Cwpan Ryder a gemau'r Llundw i Gymru wedi dangos yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni pan fo'r holl grwpiau perthnasol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd.

Galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi cais gan Gymru i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw arweiniad gwleidyddol gan y Prif Weinidog—sydd, yn anffodus, yn absennol—gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, a chan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Os yw'r Prif Weinidog yn benderfynol o ddod â'r gemau i Gymru, dyma'r amser iddo ddangos hynny.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn manteisio ar y cyfle heddiw i ddangos ei bod hithau hefyd yn rhannu'r weledigaeth yr ydym ni, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, y grwpiau gwleidyddol eraill yn y Cynulliad a'r genedl

yn ei rhannu.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. With these 45 minute debates, it is difficult to get Members in. Therefore, speakers other than those proposing amendments will have a time limit of three minutes.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yn y dadleuon 45 munud hyn, mae'n anodd rhoi cyfle i Aelodau siarad. Felly, rhoddir cyfyngiad amser o dri munud ar siaradwyr heblaw'r rhai sy'n cynnig gwelliannau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure, if a bid is viable, that it will be to the benefit of the whole of Wales.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau, os yw cais yn ymarferol, y bydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*agrees that the starting point for the Welsh Assembly Government's work on this issue, in collaboration with stakeholders, should be the undertaking of a comprehensive cost benefit analysis as part of a viability study.*

*yn cytuno y dylai gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y mater hwn, mewn cydweithrediad â rhanddeiliaid, ddechrau gyda chyflawni dadansoddiad cost a budd cynhwysfawr, fel rhan o astudiaeth dichonolrwydd.*

We broadly support the Tory motion and the Plaid amendment, but we also propose two amendments of our own in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Ar y cyfan, yr ydym yn cefnogi cynnig y Ceidwadwyr a gwelliant Plaid, ond yr ydym hefyd yn cynnig dau welliant ein hunain yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Commonwealth Games held in Manchester from 25 July to 4 August 2002 was the largest multi-sport event ever to be held in England, eclipsing the size of the 1948 summer Olympic Games in terms of teams and athletes participating.

Gemau'r Gymanwlad a gynhaliwyd ym Manceinion rhwng 25 Gorffennaf a 4 Awst 2002 oedd y digwyddiad aml-chwarae mwyaf erioed i gael ei gynnal yn Lloegr, ac yr oedd yn fwy na Gemau Olympaidd haf 1948 o ran nifer y timau a'r athletwyr a oedd yn cymryd rhan.

Restaurants and pubs in Manchester reported a threefold increase in takings during the games, and the local tourism board estimates that some 300,000 more visitors will come to the city each year as a result of its increased profile.

Dyweddodd bwytai a thafarnau ym Manceinion fod lefel eu busnes wedi cynyddu deirgwaith yn ystod y gemau, ac amcangyfrifodd y bwrdd twristiaeth lleol y bydd tua 300,000 yn fwy o ymwelwyr yn dod i'r ddinas bob blwyddyn o ganlyniad i'w phroffil uwch.

In terms of amendment 1, I observed Lord Coe's Olympic meeting in Cardiff last week regarding the London Olympic Games. Any bid by Wales must truly benefit the whole of Wales. Too often, Wales is used as a pejorative term that seems to mean either the south or north but never the whole of Wales.

O ran gwelliant 1, yr oeddwn yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y gemau Olympaidd gyda'r Arglwydd Coe yng Nghaerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â Gemau Olympaidd Llundain. Bydd rhaid i unrhyw gais gan Gymru fod o fudd gwirioneddol i Gymru gyfan. Yn rhy aml, mae Cymru'n cael ei

Any bid must detail how it will ensure that the events will be distributed across the country to involve as many people and communities as possible. Also, it must show how the legacy of any international event, such as the Commonwealth Games, will be of benefit across Wales. There is a risk that any bid would simply build on what infrastructure and facility there already is, therefore perpetuating current imbalances in sport facilities.

Speaking as a north Wales Assembly Member, I know that my region does not have the sport facility that it could have. I would hope that any bid would include plans for improving sports facilities across north Wales. Any bid must be based, surely, on current facilities and infrastructure, but also seek to build and address inequalities and inadequacies. We know of many people from north Wales who have to go across the border, as the Minister knows, to practise in their bid to develop their skills.

Amendment 2 adds a new point at the end of the motion. We believe that any bid for an international event risks becoming a blank cheque. While we support the proposal for a bid, it must be properly costed. It must be detailed enough to provide reassurance to the public that the Government is not writing cheques in pursuit of its ambitions without the means to guarantee success. Having listened to Lord Coe last week, I believe that, in essence, they have got it right about the London Olympic Games, so, if we are serious about sports activity we should do the same here. Despite being loudly acclaimed, Manchester 2002 came within hours of insolvency until a Government rescue package worth £105 million took public spending to £250 million; or to put it another way, a subsidy of more than £300 per ticket sold.

ddefnyddio fel term difriol sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio i olygu'r de neu'r gogledd ond nid Cymru gyfan byth. Bydd rhaid i unrhyw gais amlinellu sut y bydd y digwyddiadau'n cael eu gwasgaru ar hyd a lled y wlad i gynnwys cynifer o bobl a chymunedau â phosibl. Hefyd, bydd rhaid iddo ddangos sut y bydd yr hyn a fydd yn para wedi unrhyw ddigwyddiad rhyngwladol, megis Gemau'r Gymanwlad, o fudd i bob rhan o Gymru. Mae perygl na fyddai cais yn gwneud dim mwy nag adeiladu ar hynny o seilwaith a chyfleusterau sydd ar gael eisoes, ac felly'n dwysáu'r anghyfartaledd presennol o ran cyfleusterau chwaraeon.

Gan siarad fel Aelod Cynulliad dros ogledd Cymru, gwn nad oes gan fy rhanbarth y cyfleusterau chwaraeon a allai fod ganddi. Gobeithiaf y byddai unrhyw gais yn cynnwys cynlluniau i wella cyfleusterau chwaraeon ar draws gogledd Cymru. Dylai unrhyw gais, felly, fod yn seiliedig ar y cyfleusterau a'r seilwaith presennol, ond dylai hefyd ymdrechu i adeiladu a rhoi sylw i anghydraddoldebau a chyfleusterau annigonol. Gwn am lawer o bobl o'r gogledd sy'n gorfod croesi'r ffin, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, i ymarfer yn eu hymdrech i wella'u sgiliau.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn ychwanegu pwynt newydd at ddiwedd y cynnig. Yr ydym yn credu bod perygl i unrhyw gais am ddigwyddiad rhyngwladol ddiweddu fel siec wag. Er ein bod yn cefnogi'r cynnig i baratoi cais, rhaid iddo gael ei gostio'n drylwyr. Rhaid iddo fod yn ddigon manwl i sicrhau'r cyhoedd nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn ysgrifennu sieciau mewn ymdrech i wireddu ei huchelgeisiau heb y modd i sicrhau llwyddiant. Ar ôl gwrandao ar yr Arglwydd Coe yr wythnos diwethaf, credaf, yn y bôn, eu bod wedi taro'r cywair cywir gyda Gemau Olympaidd Llundain, felly, os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â gweithgarwch chwaraeon, dylem ninnau wneud yr un peth yma. Er yr holl ganmol, daeth Gemau Manceinion yn 2002 o fewn oriau i fod yn fethdalwyr hyd nes i becyn i'w hachub gan y Llywodraeth a oedd yn werth £105 miliwn godi'r gwariant cyhoeddus i £250 miliwn; neu o'i gyfleu mewn ffordd arall, cymhorthdal gwerth dros £300 am bob tocyn a werthwyd.



Once a promise is made to the international committee to stage an event, the Government, whether it likes it or not, underwrites the games with a national reputation. Any mistakes invariably lead to money being paid from the public purse. Whether many of these bids are rational, from an economic or financial perspective, is not always proven. As each new event comes along, it is always conveniently forgotten that almost every previous major sport event is accompanied by a post-mortem into why punitive economic benefits were not realised. We must break with the past and put forward a workable and costed bid.

Finally, I was disappointed to see that we had to put forward a specific amendment to cost any bid. Surely, to anyone who has researched the history of staging such events, this is a self-evident point—a sign, maybe, that the Tories have yet to regain their economic competence.

I urge the Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government to consider this motion seriously so that we can use this to put Wales further on the international map.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod unrhyw gais i lwyfannu Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn anelu at ddwyn budd i Gymru gyfan.*

Cynigaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn derbyn mai 2018 fydd y cyfle nesaf i Gymru gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn credu, yn y cyfamser, y byddai gwella cyfleusterau trafndiaeth, diwylliant a chwaraeon yn fuddsoddiad doeth.*

Croesawaf gynnig y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghymru yn 2018, ac yr wyf yn ei chymryd

Ar ôl i addewid gael ei roi i'r pwyllgor rhyngwladol i gynnal digwyddiad, mae'r Llywodraeth, boed hi'n dymuno hynny ai peidio, yn rhoi enw da'r wlad yn ernes i'r gemau. Bydd unrhyw gamgymeriadau'n sicr o arwain at dalu arian o'r coffrau cyhoeddus. Ni ellir profi bob amser a yw llawer o'r ceisiadau hyn yn rhai rhesymegol ai peidio, o safbwynt economaidd neu ariannol. Wrth i bob digwyddiad newydd ymddangos ar y gorwel, mae'n gyfleus bob amser anghofio bod bron pob digwyddiad chwaraeon blaenorol o bwys wedi wynebu *post mortem* i holi pam na wireddwyd buddion economaidd cosbol. Rhaid inni dorri'n rhydd oddi wrth y gorffennol a chyflwyno cais ymarferol sydd wedi ei gostio'n fanwl.

Yn olaf, yr oedd yn siom gweld bod yn rhaid inni gyflwyno gwelliant penodol i gostio unrhyw gais. Wrth reswm, i unrhyw un sydd wedi ymchwilio i hanes cynnal digwyddiadau o'r fath, mae hwn yn bwynt cwbl amlwg—arwydd, efallai, nad yw'r Toriaid eto wedi adennill eu gallu economaidd.

Yr wyf yn annog y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r cynnig hwn, er mwyn inni allu defnyddio hyn i sicrhau lle amlycach i Gymru ar y map rhyngwladol.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end:

*calls on WAG to ensure that any bid to host the Commonwealth Games will seek to bring benefit to Wales as a whole.*

I propose amendment 4. Add new point at end:

*acknowledges that the next opportunity for Wales to hold the Commonwealth Games will be in 2018 and believes that, in the meantime, improvements to transport, cultural and sporting facilities would be a wise investment.*

I welcome the Welsh Conservative Party's motion for Wales to host the Commonwealth Games in 2018, and I assume that the

yn ganiataol y byddai hyfywdra'r cynnig yn cael ei ystyried yn ofalus.

Mae bron 50 mlynedd ers i'r gemau gael eu cynnal yng Nghymru, yn 1958. Yr oedd Caerdydd yn brifddinas dair blwydd oed ar y pryd, yn croesawu'r digwyddiad rhyngwladol hwnnw ar ôl dangos yr hyder a'r parodrwydd i fentro. Drwy'r teledu a'r wasg, cynhyrwyd Cymru gyfan gan bresenoldeb yr achlysur mawr.

Yn fwy diweddar, yn 2002, yr oedd Manceinion yn llwyddiannus yn ei chais i gynnal y gemau. Er i'r ddinas wneud cais swyddogol yn 1995, yr oedd wedi gwneud blynyddoedd o gynllunio ac ymchwilio dwys cyn hynny. Cydweithiodd 10 awdurdod lleol Manceinion Fawr mewn modd hollol newydd, gan rannu'r weledigaeth am y budd economaidd a chymdeithasol y byddai'r gemau yn eu creu i'r rhanbarth gyfan. Ymwelodd dros 18 miliwn o bobl â'r rhanbarth yn 2002, gan gynhyrchu £6 biliwn i economi gogledd-orllewin Lloegr.

Mae Glasgow yn ceisio efelychu llwyddiant Manceinion, ac mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi addo buddsoddi £250 miliwn mewn adnoddau i gefnogi ei chais am y gemau yn 2014.

Some will no doubt argue that Glasgow's bid for the games in 2014, if successful, would make it unlikely that a bid from Wales for 2018 would be accepted, in that the proximity of the two nations would not favour Wales holding the games immediately after Scotland.

**Alun Cairns:** What is the rationale behind that, because Scotland and Wales are two different nations?

**Owen John Thomas:** If you sit down and listen, you will find out.

However, it may be that our bid for 2018 would be the most favourable one, and there would be another opportunity in 2022. Some will also claim that money used to prepare an unsuccessful bid would be wasted, but the Manchester bid for the 2002 games took a far more optimistic view. The objective of

viability of that proposal would be considered carefully.

It is almost 50 years since the games were held in Wales, in 1958. Cardiff was a three-year-old capital city at the time, welcoming that international event after demonstrating the confidence and willingness to have a go. Through television and the press, the whole of Wales was excited by the presence of this big event.

More recently, in 2002, Manchester was successful in its bid to hold the games. Although it submitted the official bid in 1995, the city had undertaken years of intensive planning and research prior to that. The 10 local authorities of Greater Manchester worked in a totally new way, sharing the vision for the economic and social benefit that would come to the whole region in the wake of the games. Over 18 million people visited the region in 2002, generating £6 billion for the north-west of England's economy.

Glasgow is trying to emulate Manchester's success, and the Scottish Executive has promised to invest £250 million in resources to support its bid to host the 2014 games.

Yn ddi-os, bydd rhai'n dadlau pe byddai cais Glasgow am y gemau yn 2014 yn llwyddiannus, y byddai hynny'n ei gwneud yn annhebygol y byddai cais o Gymru am gemau 2018 yn cael ei dderbyn, gan y byddai'r ffaith bod y ddwy wlad mor agos at ei gilydd yn anfanteisiol i Gymru yn syth ar ôl i'r gemau gael eu cynnal yn yr Alban.

**Alun Cairns:** Beth yw'r rhesymeg sydd wrth wraidd hynny, gan fod yr Alban a Chymru'n ddwy wlad wahanol?

**Owen John Thomas:** Os eisteddwch i lawr a gwrando, cewch wybod pam.

Fodd bynnag, efallai mai ein cais ni ar gyfer 2018 fyddai'r un mwyaf ffafriol, a byddai cyfle arall yn 2022. Bydd rhai hefyd yn honni y byddai'r arian a fyddai'n cael ei wario i baratoi cais aflwyddiannus yn cael ei wastraffu, ond cymerodd cais Manceinion ar gyfer gemau 2002 agwedd lawer mwy

obtaining the games acted as an incentive, which led to the drawing up of a five-year regional events strategy by the Northwest Regional Development Agency. The whole project thus acted as a stimulus for economic and cultural development—not just in the host city, but throughout that populous and extensive region. Development, initiative and enterprise were aided by the clear aims of the strategy.

In Wales, we would have the benefit of having the National Assembly to draw up an events strategy, and to plan and create an integrated transport system. The need for better transport links—both road and rail, at national and regional levels—is much greater here than it is in the north-west of England. Improvements to our transport system, and to our sporting, leisure and cultural facilities, would bring lasting benefits, whether or not our aim to attract the games was successful.

The target of hosting the 2018 games is not set in stone. However, in the meantime, it would be wise to build and improve the necessary infrastructure to be ready to consider subsequent dates, and also to continually strengthen Wales's economic and cultural capacity. The requirements for meeting the standards of the Commonwealth Games are not inconsiderable, but they can be established gradually, given that the 2018 games are 12 years away. For example, knowing that an athletics stadium must have a seating capacity of 40,000, it would be prudent to allow for this before Cardiff's new stadium is built.

The challenges are real; as well as requiring a clear vision, and a firm will, they will need to be matched by adequate finance. A successful bid will, therefore, require total commitment from the Government. However, a statement by the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport in the *Wales on Sunday* three months ago ruled out a bid for the Commonwealth Games. The failure of his Government to show either the vision or the will to encourage the people of

optimistaidd. Yr oedd y nod o sicrhau'r gemau'n gymhelliad iddynt, a ysgogodd Asiantaeth Datblygu Rhanbarthol Gogledd Orllewin Lloegr i lunio strategaeth pum mlynedd ar gyfer digwyddiadau rhanbarthol. Bu'r prosiect yn ei gyfanrwydd felly'n sbardun ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a diwylliannol—nid yn unig yn y ddinas a fyddai'n cynnal y gemau, ond ledled y rhanbarth poblog ac eang hwnnw. Bu nodau pendant y strategaeth o gymorth i ddatblygu, arloesi a mentro.

Yng Nghymru, byddai gennym y fantais o gael y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i lunio strategaeth ddiwyddiadau, a chynllunio a chreu system drafnidiaeth integredig. Mae'r angen am well cysylltiadau trafndiaeth—ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd, ar lefelau cenedlaethol a rhanbarthol—yn llawer mwy yma nag yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Byddai gwelliannau i'n system drafnidiaeth, ac i'n cyfleusterau chwaraeon, hamdden a diwylliannol, yn golygu buddion parhaol, boed ein nod o ddenu'r gemau'n llwyddiannus neu beidio.

Nid yw'r targed o gynnal y gemau yn 2018 yn un cwbl haearnaidd. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, byddai'n ddoeth adeiladu a gwella'r seilwaith angenrheidiol i fod yn barod i ystyried dyddiadau wedi hynny, a hefyd mynd ati i barhau i wella gallu economaidd a diwylliannol Cymru. Mae'r gofynion i fodloni'r safonau ar gyfer Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn rhai sylweddol, ond gellir gweithio tuag atynt yn raddol, o gofio bod 12 mlynedd i fynd tan gemau 2018. Er enghraifft, gan ein bod yn gwybod bod rhaid cael stadiwm athletau gyda 40,000 o seddau, byddai'n ddoeth pe baem yn darparu ar gyfer hyn cyn bod stadiwm newydd Caerdydd yn cael ei hadeiladu.

Mae'r heriau'n rhai real; yn ogystal â'r angen am weledigaeth eglur, ac ewyllys gadarn, bydd angen cyllid digonol hefyd i gyd-fynd â hynny. Bydd ar gais llwyddiannus, felly, angen ymrwymiad llwyr y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn y *Wales on Sunday* dri mis yn ôl wedi diystyru cais i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Mae methiant ei Lywodraeth i ddangos un ai'r weledigaeth neu'r ewyllys i

Wales to be venturesome puts us at a great disadvantage in an increasingly competitive world—but only while Labour remains in power.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I remind Members that contributions are to be kept strictly to three minutes—or four minutes if there is an intervention.

4.30 p.m.

**William Graham:** In June 2001, Wales had just successfully staged the FA Cup and the Rugby World Cup, and the Celtic Manor campaign to bring the Ryder Cup to Newport was at its height. Anyone who had the vision for the wider promotion of Welsh sport, culture and economy would have focused upon attracting the Commonwealth Games to Wales. I tabled a question to the relevant Minister in 2001 asking for a feasibility study to be conducted into the possibility of bidding for the Commonwealth Games to be staged in Wales. The answer was clear:

‘The Minister has no intention of conducting a feasibility study into the possibility of the Commonwealth Games being staged in Wales. As you are no doubt aware, the Commonwealth Games 2002 are being staged in Manchester. It is extremely unlikely that the games would return to any part of the UK for at least a further four or five games, that is, up to 20 years. Any bid would need to be initiated by the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales. Wales does not possess the range of facilities suitable for staging this event and, therefore, significant capital investments would be required. It would be difficult for Wales to justify such investment in facilities for a one-off event, as they would have considerable long-term revenue costs.’

Therefore, I was somewhat amazed that, before the cheers of the closing ceremony of the Manchester games had died away, Rhodri Morgan, who was a little younger and looked rather less tired than he does today, made an announcement to Wales and beyond that he

annog pobl Cymru i fod yn fentrus yn peri ein bod o dan anfantais mewn byd sy'n gynyddol gystadleuol—ond dim ond tra erys Llafur mewn grym.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod rhaid cyfyngu cyfraniadau i dri munud—neu bedwar os oes ymyriad.

**William Graham:** Ym Mehefin 2001, yr oedd Cymru newydd gynnal rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA a Chwpan Rygbi'r Byd yn llwyddiannus, ac yr oedd yr ymgyrch i ddod â Chwpan Ryder i Gasnewydd yn ei hanterth. Byddai unrhyw un a oedd â'r weledigaeth ar gyfer hyrwyddo chwaraeon, diwylliant ac economi Cymru'n ehangach wedi canolbwyntio ar ddenu Gemau'r Gymanwlad i Gymru. Cyflwynais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn 2001 yn gofyn am gynnal astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i bosibilrwydd gwneud cais am i Gemau'r Gymanwlad gael eu cynnal yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yr ateb yn glir:

Nid yw'n fwriad gan y Gweinidog gynnal astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i bosibilrwydd cynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghymru. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n siŵr, mae Gemau'r Gymanwlad 2002 yn cael eu cynnal ym Manceinion. Mae'n eithriadol o annhebygol y dychwelai'r gemau i unrhyw ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig am o leiaf bedair neu bum gornest arall, hynny yw, hyd at 20 mlynedd. Byddai angen i unrhyw gais gael ei gychwyn gan Gyngor Cymru ar gyfer Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Nid oes gan Gymru yr amrediad o gyfleusterau sy'n addas ar gyfer cynnal y digwyddiad hwn ac, felly, byddai angen buddsoddiadau cyfalaf sylweddol. Byddai'n anodd i Gymru gyfiawnhau'r fath fuddsoddiad mewn cyfleusterau ar gyfer digwyddiad unwaith ac am byth, gan y byddai costau refeniw hirdymor sylweddol ynglŷn â hwy.

Felly, syndod braidd i mi oedd bod Rhodri Morgan, a oedd ychydig yn iau a golwg dipyn llai blinedig arno nag sydd heddiw, cyn i fonllefau seremoni gloi gemau Manceinion ddistewi, wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad i Gymru a'r tu hwnt ei fod yn mynd i sefydlu tasglu i

was going to set up a taskforce to investigate setting up a Welsh bid for the Commonwealth Games. Rhodri had been awakened by the economic and sporting potential, referred to by speakers today, of staging the Commonwealth Games here in Wales. In January of this year, I asked the First Minister for a statement on the possibility of a Welsh bid to hold the Commonwealth Games. Sadly, by this time, the First Minister had once again lost his vision of the economic and sporting potential and retreated into thinking, 'Forget Wales; let us not step on the toes of other UK bids to stage sports championships'. We need to capture the vision and realise the potential for all of Wales. Today, we can commit ourselves to the principle of attracting the Commonwealth Games to Wales. Tomorrow, those of us with vision will obtain these championships for all of Wales.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I was a little disappointed with William's personal jibe at the First Minister, which was unnecessary.

I generally welcome the initiative and the idea behind it, and I await the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport's response to some of the criticisms of him and his attitude towards this potential bid. As I understand it, a bid must come from the city—it would not come from a Government. I wondered this afternoon whether, rather than having one city showing an interest, some work could be done with Cardiff, Swansea and Newport. I do not know if it is possible under the rules—I know that we could all get behind one city, but it would be quite nice if the cities could work together in some way, given that the Welsh Assembly Government has supported big sporting ventures in those cities, such as the Wales National Velodrome in Newport, the national pool in Swansea and the international sports village in Cardiff.

A Plaid Cymru Member mentioned the 1958 Commonwealth Games in Cardiff. Mike German has kindly loaned me a booklet about those games, and the fencing

ymchwilio i bosibilrwydd gwneud cais gan Gymru am Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Yr oedd Rhodri wedi'i ddeffro gan y potensial economaidd ac o ran chwaraeon, y cyfeiriwyd ato gan rai siaradwyr heddiw, wrth gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yma yng Nghymru. Yn Ionawr eleni, gofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog am ddatganiad ynghylch y posibilrwydd y byddai cais gan Gymru i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Ysywaeth, erbyn hyn, yr oedd y Prif Weinidog unwaith eto wedi colli'i weledigaeth o'r potensial o ran yr economi ac o ran chwaraeon ac wedi mynd yn ôl i feddwl, 'Anghofiwn am Gymru; gadewch inni beidio â mynd ar draws ceisiadau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig am gynnal pencampwriaethau chwaraeon'. Mae angen cydio yn y weledigaeth a gwireddu'r potensial ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Heddiw, gallwn ymrwymo i'r egwyddor o ddenu Gemau'r Gymanwlad i Gymru. Yfory, bydd y rhai ohonom sydd â gweledigaeth yn sicrhau'r pencampwriaethau hyn i Gymru gyfan.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr oeddwn ychydig yn siomedig â gwawd personol William at y Prif Weinidog, a oedd yn ddiangen.

Croesawaf y cam hwn at ei gilydd a'r syniad y tu ôl iddo, a disgwyliaf am ymateb y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i rai o'r beirniadaethau arno a'i agwedd at y cais posibl hwn. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, rhaid i gais ddod oddi wrth y ddinas—ni ddeuai oddi wrth Lywodraeth. Meddyliais y prynhawn yma, yn hytrach na bod un ddinas yn dangos diddordeb, tybed a ellid gwneud rhywfaint o waith gyda Chaerdydd, Abertawe a Chasnewydd. Ni wn a yw hynny'n bosibl dan y rheolau—gwn y gallem i gyd uno y tu ôl i un ddinas, ond byddai'n eithaf braf pe gallai'r dinasoedd gydweithio mewn rhyw fodd, gan fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cefnogi mentrau chwaraeon mawr yn y dinasoedd hynny, megis Felodrom Cenedlaethol Cymru yng Nghasnewydd, y pwll nofio cenedlaethol yn Abertawe a'r pentref chwaraeon rhyngwladol yng Nghaerdydd.

Soniodd Aelod o Blaid Cymru am Gemau'r Gymanwlad 1958 yng Nghaerdydd. Mae Mike German yn garedig iawn wedi rhoi benthgylfryn imi am y gemau hynny, a

tournament was held in what was then Caer Castell School in Llanrhymney, Cardiff. That does not exist as such anymore, but there is still a school there today, so it is very interesting to see a booklet from that time. I would hope that we would not gain any revenue from gin and cigarettes, as advertised in that booklet, in any potential Commonwealth Games—I am sure that we would have a healthier approach to any Commonwealth Games that might come to us. I will support today's motion and the amendments in the spirit in which they have been tabled, but there is an awful lot of work to be done and the financial considerations would be great. However, I would hope that we could do some work on it in the years to come and see where we get with it.

**Glyn Davies:** I encourage the Assembly Government to make a commitment to doing what it can to attract the Commonwealth Games to Wales, and, having made the commitment—picking up on the point that Val Lloyd made earlier—to put in place the mechanisms by which to identify the benefits and the costs, so that that commitment can be backed up with real, hard facts. I am one of the few who remember the British Empire and Commonwealth Games—Owen John may also remember—

**Owen John Thomas:** I was there.

**Glyn Davies:** I was also there—I went on a school trip, and I am a bit shocked to remember how bold I was as a young 14-year-old boy, in that I wandered through the competitors' entrance and watched the mile race from the side of the track, in the company of the British high-jump champion, Thelma Hopkins, as it happens. You cannot imagine that sort of informality occurring in a modern Commonwealth Games.

The main reason why I support the Government's commitment to holding the Commonwealth Games in Wales is the economic benefit. Other speakers have already talked about the obvious benefit in attracting more visitors to Wales, and the business investment that might come before it, which would have a spillover and would

chynhaliwyd yr ornest gleddyfa yn Ysgol Caer Castell, fel yr oedd bryd hynny, yn Llanrhymni, Caerdydd. Nid yw honno'n bodoli fel y cyfryw mwyach, ond mae ysgol yno hyd heddiw, felly mae'n ddiddorol iawn gweld llyfryn yn dyddio o'r adeg honno. Hoffwn obeithio na fyddem ni'n ennill unrhyw refeniw o jin a sigarêts, fel a hysbysebwyd yn y llyfryn hwnnw, mewn unrhyw ddarpar Gemau'r Gymanwlad—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gennym agwedd iachach at unrhyw Gemau'r Gymanwlad a allai ddod i'n rhan. Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn heddiw a'r gwelliannau yn yr ysbryd y'u cyflwynwyd, ond mae peth wmbreth o waith i'w wneud a byddai'r ystyriaethau ariannol yn fawr. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn obeithio y gallem weithio rhywfaint arno yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw a gweld i ble yr awn â'r peth.

**Glyn Davies:** Anogaf Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud ymrwymiad i wneud yr hyn a all i ddenu Gemau'r Gymanwlad i Gymru, ac, wedi gwneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw—a chodi'r pwynt a wnaeth Val Lloyd yn gynharach—i sefydlu'r mecanweithiau i weld beth yw'r buddion a'r costau, fel y gellir ategu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw â ffeithiau caled go iawn. Yr wyf yn un o'r ychydig rai sydd yn cofio Gemau'r Gymanwlad a'r Ymerodraeth Brydeinig—efallai fod Owen John yn cofio hefyd—

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oeddwn yno.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr oeddwn innau yno—euthum ar drip ysgol, ac mae'n dipyn o sioc i mi gofio mor hy yr oeddwn yn fachgen ifanc 14 blwydd oed, gan imi grwydro drwy fynedfa'r cystadleuwyr a gwyllo'r ras filltir o ochr y trac, yng nghwmni pencampwraig naid uchel Prydain, Thelma Hopkins, fel y mae'n digwydd. Ni ellir dychmygu'r math hwnnw o anffurfioldeb yn digwydd yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad heddiw.

Y prif reswm pam yr wyf yn cefnogi ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yng Nghymru yw'r budd economaidd. Mae siaradwyr eraill wedi sôn eisoes am y budd amlwg o ran denu mwy o ymwelwyr i Gymru, a'r buddsoddiad busnes a allai ddod o'i flaen, a fyddai'n gorlifo ac yn aros yma wedyn—mae hynny'n weddol

remain here afterwards—that is fairly obvious. However, the more intangible benefits are even more important. When I was chair of a development agency, we referred to a corporate marketing budget. The important point was about changing the perception of Wales in the wider world. We have already done that to some extent—the Ryder Cup is coming to Wales, the Ashes series is coming here, and the Football Association Cup has done more than anything else, because of the way in which football impacts on the whole world. However, to my mind, nothing can do more for Wales than for it to host the Commonwealth Games. There is an intangible benefit, as well as the more direct financial benefit, which will be easy to measure.

The second issue is the problem of obesity and lack of physical fitness in Wales. This is probably one of the greatest challenges that we face, and the inspiration of the games—because these big events always promote activity—will raise the agenda of keeping fit and will have a huge beneficial impact. There is a major issue of cost, and I think that we all know that, which is why I welcome the Liberal Democrats' amendment 2, which improves the motion that we tabled. However, the commitment is important, because it refocuses our healthcare policy in many ways. I see that the education Minister is here, and I can imagine how such a commitment would impact on the education budget: everyone would suddenly panic about the possible closure of playing fields, and we would all be hugely committed to having two hours a week of physical education in schools. If the games were held in Wales, there would be a major commitment to changing education policy in a direction that benefits the health of us all.

**Jenny Randerson:** We have had several proud mentions of the 1958 Commonwealth Games, and, judging from the number of programmes, Mike German spent a considerable amount of time at the games. However, it has long faded into history, just as much as the England win in the 1966 World Cup has. It is time, I believe, for us to look at this afresh. However, I strongly

amlwg. Fodd bynnag, mae'r buddion mwy annelwig yn bwysicach fyth. Pan oeddwn yn gadeirydd asiantaeth ddatblygu, arferem gyfeirio at gyllideb marchnata corfforaethol. Y pwynt pwysig oedd newid canfyddiad y byd ehangach o Gymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny i ryw raddau—mae Cwpan Ryder yn dod i Gymru, mae cyfres y Llundw'n dod yma, ac mae Cwpan Pêl-droed Lloegr wedi gwneud mwy na dim arall, oherwydd y ffordd y mae pêl-droed yn effeithio ar y byd i gyd. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, ni all dim wneud mwy dros Gymru na'i bod yn cael bod yn gartref i Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Mae budd annelwig, yn ogystal â'r budd ariannol mwy uniongyrchol, a fydd yn hawdd ei fesur.

Yr ail fater yw problem gordewdra a diffyg ffitrwydd corfforol yng Nghymru. Mae'n debyg bod hyn yn un o'r heriau mwyaf a wynebwn, a bydd ysbrydoliaeth y gemau—oherwydd y mae'r digwyddiadau mawr hyn bob amser yn hybu gweithgaredd—yn codi agenda cadw'n heini ac yn cael effaith fuddiol enfawr. Mae'r gost yn fater mawr, a chredaf ein bod i gyd yn gwybod hynny, a dyna pam y croesawaf welliant 2 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sydd yn gwella'r cynnig a gyflwynwyd gennym. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymrwymiad yn bwysig, oherwydd y mae'n ailffocysu ein polisi gofal iechyd mewn sawl ffordd. Gwelaf fod y Gweinidog Addysg yma, a gallaf ddyfalu sut y byddai ymrwymiad o'r fath yn effeithio ar y gyllideb addysg: yn sydyn byddai pawb yn mynd i banig am y posibilrwydd o gau caeau chwarae, a byddem i gyd yn gwbl ymroddedig i gael dwy awr yr wythnos o addysg gorfforol mewn ysgolion. Pe cynhelid y gemau yng Nghymru, ceid ymrwymiad mawr i newid polisi addysg i gyfeiriad sydd o fudd i iechyd pawb ohonom.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydym wedi cael sawl cyfeiriad balch at Gemau'r Gymanwlad 1958, ac a barnu yn ôl nifer y rhaglenni, treuliodd Mike German gryn dipyn o amser yn y gemau. Fodd bynnag, maent wedi hen ddiflannu i'r gorffennol, llawn cymaint â buddugoliaeth Lloegr yng Nghwpan y Byd 1966. Credaf ei bod yn bryd inni edrych ar hyn o'r newydd. Fodd bynnag, fe'ch

advise you to take this on with great caution and care. I was part of the Cardiff team that bid for the Commonwealth Games in the late 1980s, and we were totally outclassed. It is essential that you get the right mix of public and private funding for any facilities. In the late 1980s, we were beaten hollow by Canada in financial terms. Laura Anne could not give us an answer on the finance question, but the figure that I have been given is £300 million or £400 million for the facilities alone. You must remember that you have to build some of those upfront. You cannot make a bid based on paper; it will not convince anyone. You must build some of your facilities upfront; that convinces people that you will be able to deliver in the end.

It is a long-term ambition, because, if Glasgow makes a successful bid to host the games in 2014—and the sports Minister has given his public support to that bid—we would not get a look-in for 2018, because it will go to the southern hemisphere, probably to Cape Town. If Glasgow is not successful, it might put in another bid to host the games in 2018, and we would be out of it again. We are therefore talking about 2022 at least. Never let people say that politicians do not look ahead, because it is perfectly acceptable to start planning now for then, given the length of time that it takes to deliver a large-scale project. It is important that we have ambition for Wales and that we do not accept that Scotland always has the money and the ambition to do everything bigger and better and ahead of us—

4.40 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** I have supported it in the past, and I still support the ideas that you have put forward for an events strategy for Wales. Unfortunately, that idea could not be carried forward when the Government changed in 2003. That was the basis for the strategy for north-west England; they had developed an events policy that brought in money and a lot of support and made people committed to the idea. Perhaps you might have something to say about that.

cynghoraf yn gryf i ymgymryd â hyn yn bwyllog a gofalus iawn. Yr oeddwn yn rhan o dîm Caerdydd a wnaeth gais am Gemau'r Gymanwlad tua diwedd yr 1980au, a chawsom ein trechu'n llwyr. Mae'n hanfodol cael y cymysgedd iawn o gyllid cyhoeddus a phreifat ar gyfer unrhyw gyfleusterau. Yn niwedd yr 1980au, cawsom ein curo'n rhacs yn ariannol gan Ganada. Ni allai Laura Anne roi ateb inni ar gwestiwn cyllid, ond y ffigur a roddwyd i mi yw £300 miliwn neu £400 miliwn ar y cyfleusterau'n unig. Rhaid cofio bod yn rhaid adeiladu rhai o'r rheini ymlaen llaw. Ni allwch wneud cais yn seiliedig ar bapur; ni wnaiff hwnnw ddarbwylllo neb. Rhaid ichi adeiladu rhai o'ch cyfleusterau ymlaen llaw; bydd hynny'n darbwyllo pobl y byddwch yn gallu cyflawni'r peth yn y diwedd.

Uchelgais hirdymor ydyw, oherwydd os gwna Glasgow gais llwyddiannus i gynnal y gemau yn 2014—ac mae'r Gweinidog Chwaraeon wedi rhoi ei gefnogaeth gyhoeddus i'r cais hwnnw—ni chaem ni gyfle i'w cynnal yn 2018, oherwydd fe âi i hemisffer y de, i Cape Town, mae'n debyg. Os na fydd Glasgow'n llwyddiannus, gallai gyflwyno cais arall i gynnal y gemau yn 2018, a byddem ni allan ohoni eto. Felly yr ydym yn sôn am 2022 o leiaf. Peidied neb â dweud nad yw gwleidyddion yn edrych ymlaen, oherwydd y mae'n berffaith dderbyniol dechrau cynllunio'n awr ar gyfer yr adeg honno, o gofio faint o amser y mae'n ei gymryd i wireddu prosiect ar raddfa fawr. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym uchelgais ar gyfer Cymru ac na dderbyniwn fod yr arian a'r uchelgais gan yr Alban bob amser i wneud popeth yn fwy ac yn well ac o'n blaen ni—

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi ei gefnogi yn y gorffennol, ac yr wyf yn dal i gefnogi'r syniadau yr ydych wedi'u cynnig ar gyfer strategaeth ddigwyddiadau i Gymru. Yn anffodus, ni ellid bwrw ymlaen â'r syniad hwnnw pan newidiodd y Llywodraeth yn 2003. Dyna oedd sail y strategaeth ar gyfer gogledd-orllewin Lloegr; yr oeddent wedi datblygu polisi digwyddiadau a ddaeth ag arian i mewn a llawer o gefnogaeth ac a wnaeth i bobl ymrwymo i'r syniad. Efallai y gallech ddweud rhywbeth am hynny.



**Jenny Randerson:** That is really important. I went to the Commonwealth Games in Manchester, and in Edinburgh, in the 1980s. The build up of local support and a local view of the future is essential. I strongly advocate the idea of an events strategy, and it was a great pity that it was abandoned. I would have liked the Commonwealth Games to have been part of an events strategy. In saying that I think that it is time that we raised our eyes, looked to the horizon and planned long term, I also urge caution in that you need the buy in of the UK Government. Manchester got about 30 per cent of its costs from the UK Government and it was still on a financial knife edge. We need to get UK support.

**Alun Cairns:** The Welsh Conservative Party has tabled this motion with a positive agenda. We look to the future, with every ambition of winning the bid for the Commonwealth Games. The last thing that we want to hear at this stage is excuses about why we will not be successful in our bid for 2018 because Glasgow might be successful in its bid for 2014. You never go into any sort of bidding process voicing excuses before you start and saying, 'We might not get it'. This is a positive agenda with a positive vision for the future of a happy, healthy, sporting Wales, celebrating success. Of course, in the Commonwealth Games, we also have the opportunity to participate as the nation of Wales, rather than as part of the Great Britain team, as we do in the Olympics.

I attended the presentation given by Lord Coe last week, and it was obvious from the number of business people who attended how keen they were to play some part in the Olympics, be it by supplying refrigeration or having any link with the games in order to play their part. Of course, that was done for commercial reasons, but that is also part of the passion of being involved in an enormous sporting activity. With great credit to Lord Coe, he is key to spreading that benefit throughout Wales. Wales will host the soccer elements of the Olympics at the Millennium

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hynny'n wirioneddol bwysig. Euthum i Gemau'r Gymanwlad ym Manceinion, ac yng Nghaeredin yn yr 1980au. Mae datblygu cefnogaeth leol a golwg leol ar y dyfodol yn hanfodol. Yr wyf yn gryf o blaid y syniad o strategaeth ddigwyddiadau, ac mae'n drueni mawr iddo gael ei roi heibio. Byddwn wedi hoffi i Gemau'r Gymanwlad fod yn rhan o strategaeth ddigwyddiadau. Wrth ddweud fy mod yn meddwl ei bod yn bryd inni godi'n golygon, edrych tua'r gorwel a chynllunio ar gyfer y tymor hir, anogaf hefyd y dylem bwylllo gan fod angen i Lywodraeth y DU gyd-fynd â'r syniad. Cafodd Manceinion ryw 30 y cant o'i chostau oddi wrth Lywodraeth y DU ac yr oedd yn dal ar y dibyn yn ariannol. Mae angen cael cefnogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn gydag agenda gadarnhaol. Edrychwn i'r dyfodol, gyda phob uchelgais o ennill y cais am Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Y peth olaf y dymunwn ei glywed ar hyn o bryd yw esgusion ynghylch pam na fyddwn yn llwyddiannus yn ein cais am 2018 oherwydd y gallai Glasgow fod yn llwyddiannus yn ei chais am 2014. Ni ddylid byth fynd ati i gymryd rhan mewn dim math o broses ymgeisio gan leisio esgusion cyn dechrau a chan ddweud, 'Efallai na lwyddwn i'w gael'. Mae hyn yn agenda gadarnhaol gyda gweledigaeth gadarnhaol ar gyfer dyfodol Cymru lawen, iach, sy'n ymhel â chwaraeon, yn dathlu llwyddiant. Wrth gwrs, yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad, cawn y cyfle hefyd i gymryd rhan fel cenedl y Cymry, yn hytrach nag fel rhan o dîm Prydain Fawr, fel y gwnawn yn y Gemau Olympaidd.

Euthum i'r cyflwyniad a roddwyd gan yr Arglwydd Coe yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr oedd yn amlwg yn ôl nifer y bobl fusnes a oedd yno mor awyddus yr oeddent i chwarae rhyw ran yn y Gemau Olympaidd, boed drwy gyflenwi offer oeri neu drwy gael unrhyw gysylltiad â'r gemau er mwyn chwarae eu rhan. Wrth gwrs, am resymau masnachol y gwnaethpwyd hynny, ond mae hynny hefyd yn rhan o'r angerdd sydd ynghlwm wrth ddigwyddiad chwaraeon anferthol. Er mawr glod i'r Arglwydd Coe, mae'n allweddol i ledaenu'r budd hwnnw drwy Gymru gyfan.

Stadium, and that is something that we can celebrate and something in which we can play our part.

The last thing that we want to do is to come up with excuses as to why we will not win the bid for 2018; if we do not win the 2018 bid, our bid will be all the more relevant and better just four years later. Obviously, Glasgow has stolen a march on us for 2014, and I say that with regret. It seems to me that the Scottish Executive might be more forward thinking than the Welsh Assembly Government, but this is the position that we are in and no-one would choose to start from this position.

We have had the great credit in Wales of hosting the Rugby World Cup, the FA Cup and the Wales Rally GB; the Ryder Cup and the Ashes are to come, and the Commonwealth Games would sit on the top of that list. I noted the point that Jenny Randerson made that we need the support of the UK Government. Many people have referred back to the games in the 1950s, and, of course, it was a Conservative Government that helped to bring those games to Cardiff. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will play its part in helping to deliver the games back to Wales in 2018.

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I start by stating for the record something that we have said on many previous occasions, namely that the Labour Government will bring a constructive and positive approach to any discussion with any organisation or city in Wales on the potential bid to host the Commonwealth Games. That is why we will support the principle of this motion.

I want to start by being clear about some of the technicalities of bidding. A nation, of course, cannot bid to host the Commonwealth Games. William Graham talked about a Welsh bid, but there is no such thing. The Welsh Assembly Government certainly cannot put forward a bid because, under the

Bydd Cymru'n cynnal elfennau pêl-droed y Gemau Olympaidd yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gallwn ei ddathlu ac yn rhywbeth y gallwn chwarae ein rhan ynndo.

Y peth olaf y mae arnom eisiau ei wneud yw cynnig esgusion pam na wnawn ennill gyda'n cais ar gyfer 2018; os nad ennillwn gyda chais 2018, bydd ein cais gymaint â hynny'n fwy perthnasol a gwell bedair blynedd yn ddiweddarach. Yn amlwg, mae Glasgow wedi achub y blaen arnom ar gyfer 2014, ac mae'n flin gennyf ddweud hynny. Mae'n ymddangos i mi efallai fod Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn fwy blaengar na Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond dyma'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynnddi ac ni fyddai neb yn dewis cychwyn o'r sefyllfa hon.

Yr ydym wedi cael yr anrhydedd mawr yng Nghymru o gynnal Cwpan Rygbi'r Byd, Cwpan Pêl-droed Lloegr a Rali Cymru Prydain Fawr; mae Cwpan Ryder a'r Llundw i ddod, a byddai Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn goron ar y rhestr honno. Nodais y pwynt a wnaeth Jenny Randerson fod arnom angen cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae llawer o bobl wedi cyfeirio'n ôl at y gemau yn yr 1950au ac, wrth gwrs, Llywodraeth Geidwadol a helpodd i ddod â'r gemau hynny i Gaerdydd. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru chwarae ei rhan i helpu i ddod â'r gemau'n ôl i Gymru yn 2018.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan er mwyn iddo gael ei gofnodi rywbeth yr ydym wedi'i ddweud ar sawl achlysur o'r blaen, sef y bydd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur agwedd adeiladol a chadarnhaol wrth gynnal unrhyw drafodaeth gydag unrhyw gorff neu ddinas yng Nghymru ynghylch y cais posibl i gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Dyna pam y cefnogwn egwyddor y cynnig hwn.

Hoffwn ddechrau drwy fod yn glir ynghylch rhai o'r pwyntiau technegol wrth wneud cais. Ni all cenedl, wrth reswm, wneud cais am gael cynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Siaradodd William Graham am gais gan Gymru, ond nid oes dim o'r fath beth. Yn sicr ni all Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyflwyno cais

rules, it is a city within a Commonwealth nation that takes on the responsibility of leading the bid process.

If a city puts forward such a bid, it is up to the host nation's Commonwealth Games association to endorse the bid and to submit it to the Commonwealth Games Federation. While we would want to support a bid, the impetus must come from a potential host city, and, given the sheer scale of the mega event of the modern games—we do not hold these events in school gyms any more—only our capital city could realistically consider winning such a bid.

I think that we would all agree that winning a mega event such as the Commonwealth Games would be a superb achievement for Wales, and one that would put us in the spotlight on the world's sporting stage.

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Alun Pugh:** Perhaps later.

Wales has rightly developed an international reputation for successfully holding world-class sporting events, such as FA Cup finals, the Wales Rally GB, the Ashes, and major international rugby events and, of course, the Ryder Cup. There is no lack of ambition there. However, the Commonwealth Games are an altogether different scale and proposition. We will certainly support amendment 2 for its call for a comprehensive cost benefit survey. The benefits of a Welsh Commonwealth Games would be substantial—and we have certainly heard that this afternoon—as would the costs. We do not currently have an athletics stadium capable of holding the games, and Owen John Thomas talked about the sheer size of the spectator accommodation required. There is no swimming pool—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Is that not the point, though, that we have to aspire and have vision? If you keep saying that we do not have it, we will never get it, surely.

**Alun Pugh:** If we were to have an athletics

oherwydd, dan y rheolau, dinas o fewn un o genhedloedd y Gymanwlad sy'n ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb o arwain y broses ymgeisio.

Os yw dinas yn cyflwyno cais o'r fath, mater i gymdeithas Gemau'r Gymanwlad y genedl sy'n noddi yw cefnogi'r cais a'i gyflwyno i Ffederasiwn Gemau'r Gymanwlad. Er y byddem am gefnogi cais, rhaid i'r ysgogiad ddod oddi wrth ddinas a allai noddi'r digwyddiad, ac, o ystyried graddfa enfawr megaddigwyddiad y gemau modern—nid ydym yn cynnal y digwyddiadau hyn yng nghampfeydd ysgolion mwyach—dim ond ein prifddinas a allai'n realistig ystyried ennill gyda chais o'r fath.

Credaf y byddem i gyd yn cytuno y byddai ennill megaddigwyddiad fel Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn llwyddiant ardderchog i Gymru, ac yn un a fyddai'n hoelio sylw'r byd arnom ym maes chwaraeon.

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnewch ildio?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn ddiweddarach efallai.

Mae Cymru yn gwbl briodol wedi datblygu enw'n rhyngwladol am gynnal digwyddiadau chwaraeon o'r radd flaenaf yn llwyddiannus, megis rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA, Rali Cymru Prydain Fawr, gemau cyfres y Llundw, a digwyddiadau rygbi rhyngwladol mawr ac, wrth gwrs, Cwpan Ryder. Nid oes diffyg uchelgais yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, mae Gemau'r Gymanwlad ar raddfa gwbl wahanol ac yn gynnig cwbl wahanol. Byddwn yn sicr yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 am ei fod yn galw am arolwg cost a budd cynhwysfawr. Byddai'r budd yn sgîl Gemau Cymru yn sylweddol—ac yr ydym yn sicr wedi clywed hynny y prynhawn yma—felly hefyd y costau. Nid oes gennym stadiwm athletau ar hyn o bryd a allai gynnal y gemau, a siaradodd Owen John Thomas am faint aruthrol y lle sy'n ofynnol ar gyfer gwylwyr. Nid oes pwll nofio—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ond onid hynny yw'r pwynt, fod yn rhaid inni ddyheu a chael gweledigaeth? Os daliwch i ddweud nad yw hynny gennym, ni chawn hynny byth, mae'n siŵr.

**Alun Pugh:** Pa baem gennym stadiwm

stadium with capacity for 40,000 to 50,000 spectators, you have to consider how often that facility would be used, and what its end use would be. There is no swimming pool anywhere in Wales, for that matter, with such big spectator capacity or warm-up facilities of the required standard. The brand-new pool planned for Cardiff bay does not meet that standard.

**Glyn Davies:** You have shown willingness to support the principle, Minister, but you are now coming up with several reasons to indicate that you do not really support it because of the cost. How will you put your support into effect? Will you talk to one of the city councils with a view to developing a bid, or will you just do nothing at all about it except say that you support it in principle?

**Alun Pugh:** No, I have said that I am happy to engage with any city council that is up to putting together a bid, but, at the moment, I am speaking in favour of amendment 2, which calls for a comprehensive cost benefits analysis. I am pointing out some of the early work that the Welsh Assembly Government has done. We have, of course, a superb velodrome of international standard—John Griffiths would tell us that—but, again, it does not have a big spectator capacity. Indeed, we have deliberately spread out our top-quality national sporting facilities around our nation as a policy objective. We have not put all our capital expenditure for national facilities into a single location—quite deliberately.

We would need a great deal of indoor space to hold the indoor events such as badminton, gymnastics, table tennis and so on—equivalent to five Cardiff international arenas. Jenny Randerson was quite right; the Tories tabled this motion, but they do not even know what it will cost. Jenny Randerson, in fairness, said that it would cost around £350 million and, having done some early work on the initial capital expenditure bill, I agree, though that is an appropriate ball-park estimate—plus inflation, of course. However, it would give us a legacy of facilities with huge spectator capacity without an identified continuing use. On the

athletau gyda lle i rhwng 40,000 a 50,000 o wylwyr, rhaid ichi ystyried pa mor aml y câ'r cyfleuster hwnnw ei ddefnyddio, ac i beth y câi ei ddefnyddio yn y pen draw. Nid oes pwll nofio yn unman yng Nghymru, ychwaith, sydd â digon o le i wylwyr na chyfleusterau cynhesu o'r safon sy'n ofynnol. Nid yw'r pwll newydd sbon sy'n cael ei gynllunio ar gyfer bae Caerdydd yn cyrraedd y safon honno.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydych wedi dangos parodrwydd i gefnogi'r egwyddor, Weinidog, ond yn awr yr ydych yn cynnig sawl rheswm sy'n dangos nad ydych yn ei chefnogi mewn gwirionedd oherwydd y gost. Sut y rhowch eich cefnogaeth ar waith? A wnewch siarad ag un o'r cynghorau dinas gyda golwg ar ddatblygu cais, neu a ydych am wneud dim byd o gwbl yn ei gylch ar wahân i ddweud eich bod yn ei gefnogi mewn egwyddor?

**Alun Pugh:** Na, yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod yn fodlon gweithio gydag unrhyw gyngor dinas sy'n barod i lunio cais, ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn siarad o blaid gwelliant 2, sy'n galw am ddadansoddiad cost a budd cynhwysfawr. Yr wyf yn tynnu sylw at beth o'r gwaith cynnar y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei wneud. Mae gennym, wrth gwrs, felodrom gwych o safon ryngwladol—byddai John Griffiths yn dweud hynny wrthym—ond, eto, nid oes ynddo le mawr i wylwyr. Yn wir, yn ydym yn fwriadol wedi gwasgaru ein cyfleusterau chwaraeon cenedlaethol o'r safon uchaf ar draws y genedl fel amcan polisi. Nid ydym wedi rhoi ein holl wariant cyfalaf ar gyfleusterau cenedlaethol i un lleoliad—yn gwbl fwriadol.

Byddai angen llawer iawn o le dan do arnom i gynnal digwyddiadau dan do fel badminton, gymnasteg, tennis bwrdd ac yn y blaen—yn cyfateb i bum arena ryngwladol Caerdydd. Yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn gwbl gywir; y Toriaid a gyflwynodd y cynnig hwn, ond nid ydynt hyd yn oed yn gwybod faint y bydd yn ei gostio. Dywedodd Jenny Randerson, a bod yn deg, y byddai'n costio tua £350 miliwn ac, ar ôl gwneud rhywfaint o waith cynnar ar y bil gwariant cyfalaf cychwynol, yr wyf yn cytuno, er mai amcangyfrif bras yw hynny—ynghyd â chwyddiant, wrth gwrs. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n rhoi inni etifeddiaeth o gyfleusterau gyda lle enfawr i wylwyr heb

plus side, of course, we would have a superb venue for the rugby sevens.

I understand why amendments 1 and 3 have been tabled; we would certainly want to spread the benefits as far as we can around the nation, and we will support these amendments. It is inevitable, however, that the host city would get much of the benefit. Frankly, there is more in this for Cardiff than for Blaenau Ffestiniog or Blaenau Gwent, for that matter, but that is not a reason not to proceed. As a national forum, we have to take a national view of major projects of this sort, rather than doing everything on the basis of what is in it for an individual constituency.

The Conservatives have tabled this motion, and it is good to debate elite sport. However, the Conservatives did not prioritise sport in their budget proposals last year.

4.50 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** This is not just a proposition for elite sport; this is about using an occasion such as the Commonwealth Games as an incentive to take us forwards, because we have been sitting still for seven years.

**Alun Pugh:** Absolutely. The benefits would indeed spread, but the Commonwealth Games are, quite rightly, a festival of elite sport and neither the Conservatives nor Plaid Cymru prioritised sport in their budget proposals last year. In coalition with independents and others, they collectively voted to cut Assembly Government investment in sport. That is what the Record shows. I welcome this Tory change of heart if it is genuine, but we will see whether it continues in this year's budget.

**David Melding:** I was unaware that we were setting the budget for 2018, but I congratulate you on your forward planning.

wybod i beth y byddid yn eu defnyddio'n barhaol. O edrych ar yr ochr gadarnhaol, wrth gwrs, byddai gennym ganolfan wych ar gyfer rygbi saith bob ochr.

Yr wyf yn deall pam mae gwelliannau 1 a 3 wedi cael eu cyflwyno; byddem yn sicr am ledaenu'r buddion mor eang â phosibl o amgylch y genedl, a byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae'n anochel, fodd bynnag, mai'r ddinas fyddai'n noddi'r gemau fyddai'n cael llawer o'r budd. Yn blwmp ac yn blaen, mae mwy yn hyn i Gaerdydd nag i Flaenau Ffestiniog neu Flaenau Gwent, o ran hynny, ond nid yw hynny'n rheswm dros beidio â bwrw ymlaen. Fel fforwm cenedlaethol, rhaid inni edrych ar brosiectau mawr fel hyn o safbwynt cenedlaethol, yn hytrach na gwneud popeth ar sail y fantais i etholaeth unigol.

Y Ceidwadwyr sydd wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn, ac mae'n dda trafod chwaraeon elit. Fodd bynnag, ni roddodd y Ceidwadwyr flaenoriaeth i chwaraeon yn eu cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb y llynedd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid cynnig ar gyfer chwaraeon elit yn unig yw hwn; mae a wnelo â defnyddio achlysur fel Gemau'r Gymanwlad fel ysgogiad i beri inni symud ymlaen, oherwydd yr ydym wedi bod yn eistedd yn ein hunfan ers saith mlynedd.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn hollol. Byddai'r buddion yn sicr yn lledaenu, ond mae Gemau'r Gymanwlad, yn gwbl briodol, yn wyl o chwaraeon elit ac ni roddodd y Ceidwadwyr na Phlaid Cymru flaenoriaeth i chwaraeon yn eu cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb y llynedd. Mewn clymblaid â'r annibynwyr ac eraill, pleidleisiasant gyda'i gilydd i gwtogi ar fuddsoddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn chwaraeon. Dyna'r hyn y mae'r Cofnod yn ei ddangos. Croesawaf y newid meddwl hwn gan y Ceidwadwyr os yw'n ddiffuant, ond cawn weld a wnaiff barhau yn y gyllideb eleni.

**David Melding:** Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol ein bod yn gosod y gyllideb ar gyfer 2018, ond llongyfarchaf chi ar eich blaengynllunio.

**Alun Pugh:** We were not setting the budget for 2018, but we were setting a budget for sport, and you voted to cut expenditure for sport, culture and language in your budget proposals. [*Interruption.*] You did.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Alun Pugh:** Glasgow has made a formal bid for the 2014 Commonwealth Games. Formal bids were required by 24 February 2006. The decision of which city will win the games will be taken on 9 November 2007. Glasgow's bid is in competition with bids from Canada and Nigeria. I am sure that the entire Assembly would want to join me in offering Glasgow our best wishes.

As amendment 4 rightly points out, Wales's earliest opportunity to host the Commonwealth Games is in 2018. However, if Glasgow succeeded in its bid to host the games in 2014, it is pretty unlikely that another British bid would succeed so soon afterwards.

The Assembly Government has big ambitions for this small nation. We want to continue to attract world-class sporting events, but we must also get good value for every Welsh taxpayer. That is why we will support the motion and the amendments.

**Nick Bourne:** The Minister's speech was most grudging from someone who said that he was wholly behind this. It was totally lacking in vision and incredibly pessimistic—the Minister is the Victor Meldrew of the outfit. Having upset the Welsh Language Board and the Arts Council of Wales, I always thought that he could get the full set, and now, on the sports front, he has put the ball in the back of his own net. I found that quite staggering. Given the generous speech from Lorraine Barrett, for instance, I do not think that the Minister measured up in the sort of response that you might expect to a positive agenda for something from which all of Wales would benefit. Yes, of course there will be a cost, and no-one knows what precisely it will be. Jenny Randerson will have a far better idea as she used to be the

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oeddem yn gosod y gyllideb ar gyfer 2018, ond yr oeddem yn gosod cyllideb ar gyfer chwaraeon, a phleidleisiasoch i dorri'r gwariant ar chwaraeon, diwylliant ac iaith yn eich cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb. [*Torri ar draws.*] Dyna a wnaethoch.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Glasgow wedi gwneud cais ffurfiol am Gemau'r Gymanwlad 2014. Yr oedd ceisiadau ffurfiol yn ofynnol erbyn 24 Chwefror 2006. Penderfynir pa ddinas a fydd yn ennill y gemau ar 9 Tachwedd 2007. Mae cais Glasgow yn cystadlu yn erbyn ceisiadau o Ganada a Nigeria. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Cynulliad cyfan am ymuno â mi i gynnig ein dymuniadau gorau i Glasgow.

Fel y dywed gwelliant 4 yn gwbl gywir, daw'r cyfle cyntaf i Gymru gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn 2018. Fodd bynnag, pe bai Glasgow yn llwyddo yn ei gais i gynnal y gemau yn 2014, mae'n bur annhebygol y byddai cais arall o Brydain yn llwyddo mor fuan wedi hynny.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn uchelgeisiol iawn dros y genedl fach hon. Yr ydym am barhau i ddenu digwyddiadau chwaraeon o'r radd flaenaf, ond rhaid inni hefyd gael gwerth da i bob trethdalwr yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr oedd araith y Gweinidog yn hynod o grintachlyd gan rywun a ddywedodd ei fod yn llwyr gefnogi hyn. Nid oedd ynnddi ddim gweledigaeth ac yr oedd yn anhygoel o besimistaidd—y Gweinidog yw Victor Meldrew'r criw. Ar ôl tramgwyddo Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, yr oeddwn yn tybio drwy'r amser y gallai gael y set lawn, ac yn awr, ym maes chwaraeon, mae wedi rhoi'r bêl yng nghefn ei rwyd ei hun. Yr oedd hynny'n fy syfrdanu. O ystyried yr araith haelfrydig gan Lorraine Barrett, er enghraifft, ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn cymharu'n ffafriol yn y math o ymateb y gallech ei ddisgwyl i agenda gadarnhaol o blaid rhywbeth y byddai Cymru gyfan yn elwa ohono. Bydd cost, wrth gwrs, ac ni wŷr neb beth yn union fydd y gost. Bydd gan Jenny

Minister for sport, and I accept that that is the sort of figure that we are looking at. Yes, we need a cost benefit analysis and, yes, we will support that, but everyone knows that there will be a cost and that no-one knows precisely what it will be. However, look at the positive benefits for the health, education, tourism and economic development agendas, which I am sure the respective Ministers would welcome. So, let us move forward. For heaven's sake, do not be so grudging about everything, Minister. This would have a real benefit for everyone in Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** I am not trying to be grudging at all. However, can you identify a possible use for a 50,000-seat athletics stadium after the Commonwealth Games have ended? *[Interruption.]* Okay, even a 40,000-seat stadium.

**Nick Bourne:** After the two-week duration of the competition in Manchester, for example, no-one has suggested that no benefits accrued to the north-west of England. We need a vision and we need to see how it can be used. This is part of the analysis that now starts. You started talking about a budget that was defeated in December last year for a three-year spending programme, but this is a far longer-term project in comparison. We are looking at 2018 at the very earliest.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cardiff City Football Club is building a new stadium with a maximum capacity of 30,000 seats. With this in view, requiring a stadium with a capacity of 40,000, perhaps it could look to build a bigger stadium with a running track. The track may not be there permanently and it could be laid later, but those are things that the Minister should consider while he has the time to consider them. If you want to consider them, Minister, do so, instead of saying 50,000 rather than 40,000 to try to weigh the thing down. You are a bogeyman.

**Nick Bourne:** There will always be reasons for not doing something; we are trying to

Randerson lawer gwell syniad gan ei bod wedi bod yn Weinidog dros chwaraeon, ac yr wyf yn derbyn mai dyna'r math o ffigur yr ydym yn edrych arno. Oes, mae angen inni gael dadansoddiad cost a budd, a byddwn yn cefnogi hynny, ond gŵyr pawb y bydd cost ac nad oes neb yn gwybod yn union beth fydd hynny. Fodd bynnag, edrychwch ar y buddion cadarnhaol o ran agendâu iechyd, addysg, twristiaeth a datblygu economaidd, y byddai'r Gweinidogion perthnasol yn eu croesawu yr wyf yn siŵr. Felly, gadewch inni symud ymlaen. Er mwyn y mawredd, peidiwch â bod mor grintachlyd ynghylch popeth, Weinidog. Byddai hyn o fudd gwirioneddol i bawb yng Nghymru.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf yn ceisio bod yn grintachlyd o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, a allwch nodi defnydd posibl i stadiwm athletau 50,000 sedd ar ôl i Gemau'r Gymanwlad orffen? *[Torri ar draws.]* O'r gorau, hyd yn oed stadiwm 40,000 sedd.

**Nick Bourne:** Ar ôl y gystadleuaeth a barhaodd am bythefnos ym Manceinion, er enghraifft, nid oes neb wedi awgrymu na ddaeth dim budd i ogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Mae angen gweledigaeth arnom ac mae angen inni weld sut y mae modd ei ddefnyddio. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r dadansoddi sy'n dechrau yn awr. Siaradasoch am gyllideb a drechwyd fis Rhagfyr y llynedd ar gyfer rhaglen wario dair blynedd, ond mae hwn yn brosiect dros dymor llawer hwy mewn cymhariaeth. Yr ydym yn edrych ar 2018 fan gyntaf.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd yn adeiladu stadiwm newydd gyda lle i uchafswm o 30,000 o seddau. Gyda hyn mewn golwg, a'r angen am stadiwm sydd â lle i 40,000, efallai y gallai ystyried codi stadiwm mwy gyda thrac rhedeg. Efallai na fyddai'r trac yno'n barhaol a gallai gael ei osod yn ddiweddarach, ond mae'r rhain yn bethau y dylai'r Gweinidog eu hystyried tra bo ganddo amser i'w hystyried. Os ydych am eu hystyried, Weinidog, gwnewch hynny, yn hytrach na dweud 50,000 yn lle 40,000 i geisio lladd y peth. Yr ydych yn fwgan.

**Nick Bourne:** Bydd rhesymau bob amser dros beidio â gwneud rhywbeth; yr ydym yn

look at the reasons for doing it. If there are problems, and there will be, how do we crack them and solve them? I will give way, but for the last time.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree with the proposal that Plaid Cymru has just made to delay the building of the Cardiff City Football Club stadium in order to incorporate an athletics stadium?

**Nick Bourne:** The acoustics in here are very good and that is not what was said. You will need to consult the Record. I heard very distinctly what was said.

There are positive benefits from this motion. I am glad that we have the support of the Assembly in this and, as other speakers said, Glyn Davies in particular, this must not end here; this has to be the starting point for the Welsh Assembly Government to do something positive on this. If all Assembly Members vote for this today, as I believe they will, we must follow it through with genuine action to ensure that there is delivery for the whole of Wales. It is right to say that it has to be a city bid; I do not think that it can be a joint city bid, as it is likely to be ruled out if it is a joint bid. We have looked at that issue, which was raised by Lorraine, and I do not think that that is a possibility. When the Manchester games happened in 2002, bear in mind that the shooting event was held in Surrey, so there is no reason why events cannot pan out around Wales. When the event took place in—*[Interruption.]* I will gladly give way if it is on a point of correction.

When the event took place in Cardiff in 1958, the cycling and road race event was held in Ogmores-by-Sea, the athletes' village was located in St Athan and the rowing event was held in Llanberis in north Wales, so all of Wales will benefit from this. It should be a unifying games for the whole of Wales. We have world-class facilities now. Reference has been made to the velodrome, the Millennium Stadium, and the Liberty Stadium in Swansea. The Chamber here

ceisio edrych ar y rhesymau dros ei wneud. Os oes problemau, ac fe fydd, sut y mae eu deall a'u datrys? Ildiaf, ond dyma'r tro olaf.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ydych yn cytuno â'r cynnig y mae Plaid Cymru newydd ei wneud i oedi cyn adeiladu stadiwm Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd er mwyn ymgorffori stadiwm athletau?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r acwsteg yma yn dda iawn ac nid hynny a ddywedwyd. Bydd angen ichi edrych ar y Cofnod. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn glir iawn.

Mae manteision cadarnhaol yn sgîl y cynnig hwn. Yr wyf yn falch bod gennym gefnogaeth gan y Cynulliad yn hyn o beth ac, fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, Glyn Davies yn arbennig, rhaid peidio â gorffen yn y fan hon; rhaid i hyn fod yn fan cychwyn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wneud rhywbeth cadarnhaol ynghylch hyn. Os bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn pleidleisio dros hyn heddiw, fel y credaf y gwnânt, rhaid i hynny gael ei ddilyn gan weithredu gwirioneddol i sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei gyflawni dros Gymru gyfan. Mae'n iawn dweud bod yn rhaid i'r cais ddod gan ddinas; ni chredaf y gall fod yn gais ar y cyd gan ddinasoedd, gan y byddai'n debygol o gael ei wrthod fel cais ar y cyd. Yr ydym wedi edrych ar y mater hwnnw, a godwyd gan Lorraine, ac ni chredaf fod hynny'n bosibilrwydd. Pan gynhaliwyd gemau Manceinion yn 2002, cofiwch i'r digwyddiad saethu gael ei gynnal yn Surrey, felly nid oes rheswm pam na all y digwyddiadau gael eu lledaenu ar draws Cymru. Pan gynhaliwyd y digwyddiad yn—*[Torri ar draws.]* Yr wyf yn barod iawn i ildio os mai pwynt sy'n ymwneud â chywiro sydd gennych.

Pan gynhaliwyd y digwyddiad yng Nghaerdydd yn 1958, cynhaliwyd y beicio a'r ras feicio ar y ffordd yn Aberogwr, yn Sain Tathan yr oedd pentref yr athletwyr a chynhaliwyd y rhwyfo yn Llanberis yn y gogledd, felly bydd Cymru gyfan yn elwa o hyn. Dylent fod yn gemau a fydd yn uno Cymru gyfan. Mae gennym gyfleusterau gyda'r gorau yn y byd erbyn hyn. Cyfeiriwyd at y felodrom, Stadiwm y Mileniwm a Stadiwm Liberty yn Abertawe. Mae'n debyg



could probably be used for a warm-up event or even for beach volleyball if the temperature stays at the sort of level that it has been today.

However, in all seriousness, this is something that we can move forward with. We will be watching the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that it delivers on the commitment that there clearly is in this motion. We won 19 medals at the Commonwealth Games in Melbourne in March this year; imagine what our athletes and sporting stars could achieve in front of a home crowd.

I am glad that we have the whole Assembly behind us. We will be coming back to this issue, but it demands action from the Government and not just warm words and a vote today.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I open the vote, Members will know that amendments 1 and 3 are quite similar. If amendment 1 is carried, I shall ask the proposer of amendment 3 whether she wishes to seek to withdraw it and, if so, subject to no Member objecting, we will withdraw it. If not, we will vote for amendments 1 and 3. I will not deselect amendment 3 if amendment 1 is carried.

y gellid defnyddio'r Siambr yma ar gyfer digwyddiad cynhesu neu hyd yn oed pêl foli ar y traeth pe bai'r tymheredd yn aros ar yr un math o lefel ag a gafwyd heddiw.

Fodd bynnag, a bod o ddifrif calon, mae hyn yn rhywbeth y gallwn fwrw ymlaen ag ef. Byddwn yn gwyllo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau ei bod yn gwireddu'r ymrwymiad sydd yma'n glir yn y cynnig hwn. Enillasom 19 o fedalau yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad yn Melbourne ym mis Mawrth eleni; dychmygwch yr hyn y gallai ein hathletwyr a'n sêr o fyd chwaraeon ei gyflawni o flaen tyrfa gartref.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Cynulliad cyfan yn ein cefnogi. Byddwn yn dod yn ôl at y mater hwn, ond mae gofyn i'r Llywodraeth weithredu, yn hytrach na chynnig geiriau hynaws a phleidlais heddiw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi agor y bleidlais, bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod bod gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn bur debyg. Os caiff gwelliant 1 ei basio, byddaf yn gofyn i gynigydd gwelliant 3 a yw am geisio ei dynnu'n ôl ac, os felly, ar yr amod na fydd dim un Aelod yn gwrthwynebu, byddwn yn ei dynnu'n ôl. Os nad yw am wneud hynny, byddwn yn pleidleisio ar welliannau 1 a 3. Ni fyddaf yn dad-ddethol gwelliant 3 os caiff gwelliant 1 ei basio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amended carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Is it your wish to seek to withdraw amendment 3? **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A ydych yn dymuno tynnu gwelliant 3 yn ôl?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, I withdraw amendment 3. **Jocelyn Davies:** Ydwyf, hoffwn dynnu gwelliant 3 yn ôl.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amended carried.*

5.00 p.m.

Motion NDM3162 as amended: to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to commit itself in principle to supporting a Welsh bid to host the Commonwealth Games and further calls for work to begin forthwith, in collaboration with all stakeholders, to secure this objective;*

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure, if a bid is viable, that it will be to the benefit of the whole of Wales.*

*agrees that the starting point for the Welsh Assembly Government's work on this issue, in collaboration with stakeholders, should be the undertaking of a comprehensive cost benefit analysis as part of a viability study.*

Cynnig NDM3162 fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo ei hun, mewn egwyddor, i gefnogi cais gan Gymru i lwyfannu Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn galw ymhellach am ddechrau'r gwaith ar fyrder, trwy gydweithredu â phob rhanddeiliad, er mwyn sicrhau'r nod hwn;*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau, os yw cais yn ymarferol, y bydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.*

*yn cytuno y dylai gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y mater hwn, mewn cydweithrediad â rhanddeiliaid, ddechrau gyda chyflawni dadansoddiad cost a budd cynhwysfawr, fel rhan o astudiaeth dichonolrwydd.*

*acknowledges that the next opportunity for Wales to hold the Commonwealth Games will be in 2018 and believes that, in the meantime, improvements to transport, cultural and sporting facilities would be a wise investment.*

*yn derbyn mai 2018 fydd y cyfle nesaf i Gymru gynnal Gemau'r Gymanwlad ac yn credu, yn y cyfamser, y byddai gwella cyfleusterau trafnidiaeth, diwylliant a chwaraeon yn fuddsoddiad doeth.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.00 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.00 p.m.*

### **Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 gan Michael German Standing Order No. 31 Proposal by Michael German**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Point of order. Standing Order No. 31 refers to proposals made by Assembly Members for subordinate legislation, but, on the face of it, one of the proposals put forward under this item is an amendment to primary legislation, therefore, I seek your guidance as to how that fits with Standing Orders.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Minister for giving me prior notice of this point of order. I have considered this matter carefully in the last few hours and have taken extensive legal advice. The Minister is right. My understanding is that one element of the proposal is to amend the Local Government Finance Act 1992. It is not possible for subordinate legislation to amend such primary legislation, therefore, my ruling is that that is not correct. There are further elements of this proposal, which include the regulations made under the second element of the 1992 Act—this is the second element. The regulations can be made, but only in relation to council tax discounts. It is therefore not clear to me, after careful consideration, how such an amendment can be made under the powers cited in the motion. Furthermore, the Minister is quite right when he refers to section 11(b) in the message that I have received from him. That is not correct—there is no section 11(b) and there are no enabling powers. I have considered this carefully and I will hear from Mike German if he wishes to come in on this point of order before I finally rule, but, as of this moment, I am minded to rule the motion out of order.

**Michael German:** First, in relation to section 11(b), you will know that we made a request of the Members' research service, which

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Pwynt o drefn. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31 yn cyfeirio at gynigion a wneir gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer is-ddeddfwriaeth, ond, ar yr wyneb, mae un o'r cynigion a gyflwynwyd dan yr eitem hon yn ddiwygiad i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, felly yr wyf yn gofyn am arweiniad gennych ynglŷn â sut y mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am roi rhybudd imi ymlaen llaw ynglŷn â'r pwynt o drefn hwn. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y mater hwn yn ofalus yn ystod yr oriau diwethaf ac yr wyf wedi cael cyngor cyfreithiol helaeth. Mae'r Gweinidog yn llygad ei le. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae un elfen o'r cynnig yn diwygio Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1992. Ni all is-ddeddfwriaeth newid deddfwriaeth sylfaenol o'r fath, ac felly dyfarnaf nad yw hynny'n briodol. Mae elfennau eraill i'r cynnig hwn, gan gynnwys y rheoliadau a wneir dan ail elfen Deddf 1992—dyma'r ail elfen. Mae modd gwneud y rheoliadau, ond dim ond parthed disgowntiau'r dreth gyngor. Felly nid yw'n eglur i mi, wedi imi ei ystyried yn ofalus, sut y gellid gwneud diwygiad o'r fath dan y pwerau y cyfeirir atynt yn y cynnig. Yn ogystal, mae'r Gweinidog yn llygad ei le pan gyfeiria at adran 11(b) yn y neges a gefais ganddo. Mae'n iawn—nid oes adran 11(b) ac nid oes pwerau galluogi. Yr wyf wedi ystyried hyn yn ofalus ac fe glywaf gan Mike German os yw am siarad ar y pwynt o drefn hwn cyn imi ddyfarnu'n derfynol, ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn bwriadu dyfarnu bod y cynnig allan o drefn.

**Michael German:** Yn gyntaf, parthed adran 11(b), gwyddoch inni wneud cais i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau, a dychwelwyd y cais

returned with section 11(b) within it. We now realise that that was a typographical error and should not have been included as there is no section 11(b) of this particular Act. When the motion was tabled, it was done in the knowledge that we had sought advice and believed that we were able to undertake the decision to make discounts available under other sections. If the reference to section 11(b) is deleted entirely, we believe that those discounts can be made available under other sections under the subordinate legislation transferred to the National Assembly for Wales, according to the advice that we have received from the Members' research service, but certainly not under section 11(b), which does not exist.

**The Presiding Officer:** If any advice that you have received was inaccurate or inappropriate, then I apologise unreservedly. I seek to introduce a system whereby all matters that have a legislative import of this kind involving Members and, for that matter, any amendments, for example, instructions to Government, which may affect the relationship between the Assembly and the Government, will be referred to me in draft form before they are accepted for tabling. Serious issues face us in 2007 and clearly we must have the competence to deal with legislation properly. For that reason, I rule this motion out of order. Therefore, the debate will not proceed.

Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

gydag adran 11(b) ynddo. Sylweddolwn bellach mai gwall teipio oedd hwnnw ac na ddylid bod wedi ei gynnwys gan nad oes adran 11(b) i'r Ddeddf arbennig hon. Pan gyflwynwyd y cynnig, fe'i gwnaethpwyd gan wybod inni geisio cael cyngor a chan gredu y gallem ymgymryd â'r penderfyniad i wneud y disgowntiau dan adrannau eraill. O ddileu'r cyfeiriad at adran 11(b) yn gyfan gwbl, credwn y gellir gwneud y disgowntiau hynny dan adrannau eraill dan yr is-ddeddfwriaeth a drosglwyddwyd i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn ôl y cyngor a gawsom gan wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau, ond yn sicr ddigon nid dan adran 11(b), gan nad yw honno'n bod.

**Y Llywydd:** Os cawsoch gyngor anghywir neu amhriodol, ymddiheuraf yn daer. Yr wyf yn ceisio cyflwyno system lle y caiff pob mater o'r math hwn sydd o bwys deddfwriaethol sy'n ymwneud â'r Aelodau ac, o ran hynny, unrhyw ddiwygiadau, er enghraifft, cyfarwyddiadau i'r Llywodraeth, a all effeithio ar y berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth, eu cyfeirio ataf ar ffurf drafft cyn eu derbyn ar gyfer eu cyflwyno. Bydd materion difrifol yn ein hwynebu yn 2007 ac mae'n amlwg y bydd angen y gallu arnom i ymdrin â'r ddeddfwriaeth mewn modd priodol. Gan hynny, dyfarnaf fod y cynnig hwn allan o drefn. Felly, nid â'r ddadl hon rhagddi.

That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.03 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.03 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)