



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 3 Tachwedd 2004**

**Wednesday, 3 November 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog  
Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister
- 17 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad  
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 32 Atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13  
Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.13
- 33 Penodi Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru  
Appointment of the Auditor General for Wales
- 35 Materion sy'n Ymwneud â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd  
Matters Relating to the European Union
- 76 Adroddiad Blynyddol ar y Cynllun Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol  
The Annual Report of the Local Government Partnership Scheme
- 100 Dadl Fer: Digartrefedd—yr Allgáu Cymdeithasol Gwaethaf  
Short Debate: Homelessness—the Ultimate Social Exclusion

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister**

### **Grant Bloc Cymru The Welsh Block Grant**

**Q1 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister outline the potential consequences to her spending plans over 2005 to 2008 of a £0.5 billion cut in the Welsh block grant? (OAQ38915)

**C1 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu canlyniadau posibl lleihau grant bloc Cymru £0.5 biliwn i'w chynlluniau gwariant yn ystod 2005-08? (OAQ38915)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Thanks to the Chancellor of the Exchequer, the Assembly budget will grow from £11.8 billion in 2004-05 to £14.3 billion in 2007-08. This is a significant increase in provision that will enable us to spend an additional £2.5 billion a year by the end of this budget period.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Diolch i Ganghellor y Trysorlys, bydd cyllideb y Cynulliad yn cynyddu o £11.8 biliwn yn 2004-05 i £14.3 biliwn yn 2007-08. Mae hwn yn gynydd sylweddol yn y ddarpariaeth a fydd yn ein galluogi i wario £2.5 biliwn ychwanegol y flwyddyn erbyn diwedd cyfnod y gyllideb hon.

**Ann Jones:** I am grateful that you have been able to say that there is an increase in the block grant under the Labour Chancellor at Westminster and in the budget that you have announced. We all know of Tory plans to cut public spending by up to £18 billion, which would mean a cut of £0.5 billion in Wales, should they ever get back into power. The Tories' slash and burn of public services would mean that Wales would have to choose between losing 18,000 teachers, 50 new schools, 14,000 nurses or 7,000 doctors. Do you agree that the Tory plans represent a return to the dark old days, and would have devastating consequences for the people of Wales who rely on public services, and for whom the Tory option of opting out or going private is not an option?

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi gallu datgan bod cynnydd yn y grant bloc o dan y Canghellor Llafur yn San Steffan ac yn y gyllideb a gyhoeddwyd gennych. Gŵyr pob un ohonom am gynlluniau'r Torïaid i gwtogi ar wariant cyhoeddus hyd at £18 biliwn, a fyddai'n golygu gostyngiad o £0.5 biliwn yng Nghymru, pe dychwelent byth i rym. Byddai toriadau hallt y Torïaid i wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn golygu y byddai'n rhaid i Gymru ddewis rhwng colli 18,000 o athrawon, 50 o ysgolion newydd, 14,000 o nyrsys neu 7,000 o feddygon. A gytunwch fod cynlluniau'r Torïaid yn golygu y byddem yn dychwelyd i'r hen ddyddiau tywyll, ac y byddai iddynt ganlyniadau trychinebus i bobl Cymru sy'n dibynnu ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac nad yw opsiwn y Torïaid o ymeithrio neu droi at wasanaethau preifat yn opsiwn iddynt?

**Sue Essex:** Thanks, Ann. [*Laughter.*]

**Sue Essex:** Diolch, Ann. [*Chwerthin.*]

Unprepared as I am for this question, you are right. We must celebrate this and understand that massive improvements in public services can only be financed by the block grant from London. I dread to think what would happen, having set these ambitious plans, if we were

Er nad wyf wedi paratoi ar gyfer y cwestiwn hwn, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle. Rhaid inni ddathlu hyn a deall mai dim ond drwy'r grant bloc o Lundain y gellir ariannu gwelliannau enfawr i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n gas gennyf feddwl beth fyddai'n digwydd, ar ôl

ever set back by having major funding clawbacks. I would not like to be the Finance Minister that would have to make difficult decisions between funding for education, health or other issues dear to our hearts.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I thought, when Ann Jones raised this issue, that she might have been referring to the massive cuts we are seeing under Gordon Brown. That is why we have civil servants protesting outside today. I do not know whether the Finance Minister had the opportunity to talk to those civil servants worried about job losses, or whether she spoke to the Allied Steel and Wire workers who were also outside today, who have lost their jobs and are also losing their pensions. Can she also comment on the National Association of Schoolmasters and Union of Women Teachers, which has rubbished Jane Davidson's plans for free school breakfasts? We are concerned—as are all Members, I am sure—about the widening wealth gap in Wales. We know that it is widening, because the former Finance Minister, Edwina Hart, confirmed that. Would you say something about the waiting list position, which has got so much worse since the Labour Party took over from us in 1997?

**Sue Essex:** In terms of Gordon Brown's statement about civil servants, I have regular meetings with the Public and Commercial Services Union, and Rhodri and I had a meeting with other unions when he announced his 'Making the Connections' paper. The unions understand our approach in the general thrust of what we are doing in trying to improve efficiency to ensure that, if we can save money in certain areas, we can reinvest that money in front-line services. That has been formulated all the way through our attitude towards funding the public sector this year.

On the NASUWT, I saw a brief clip from one of its representatives last night, which saddened me, because it would have been nice to have had a statement which started with the children. When it comes to

llunio'r cynlluniau uchelgeisiol hyn, pe baem byth yn wynebu adfachiadau cyllid mawr. Ni fyddwn yn hapus pe bawn yn Weinidog Cyllid yn gorfod gwneud dewisiadau anodd rhwng cyllid i addysg, iechyd neu faterion eraill sy'n agos at ein calonnau.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Credais, pan gododd Ann Jones y mater hwn, ei bod o bosibl yn cyfeirio at y toriadau aruthrol sy'n cael eu gwneud o dan Gordon Brown. Dyna pam mae gweision sifil yn protestio y tu allan i'r adeilad hwn heddiw. Ni wn pa un a gafodd y Gweinidog Cyllid gyfle i siarad â'r gweision sifil hynny sy'n pryderu am golli eu swyddi, neu pa un a siaradodd â gweithwyr Allied Steel and Wire a oedd y tu allan heddiw hefyd, sydd wedi colli eu swyddi ac sydd hefyd yn colli eu pensiynau. A wnaiff hefyd sylwadau ar Gymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau, sydd wedi difrio cynlluniau Jane Davidson i ddarparu brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol? Yr ydym yn pryderu—fel y mae pob Aelod, yr wyf yn siŵr—am y bwlch cyfoeth sy'n ehangu yng Nghymru. Gwyddom ei fod yn ehangu, gan fod y cyn Weinidog Cyllid, Edwina Hart, wedi cadarnhau hynny. A ddywedwch rywbeth am y sefyllfa o ran rhestrau aros, sydd wedi gwaethygu'n sylweddol ers i'r Blaid Lafur gymryd yr awenau gennym yn 1997?

**Sue Essex:** O ran datganiad Gordon Brown am weision sifil, cynhaliad gyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda'r Undeb Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, a chefais i a Rhodri gyfarfod gydag undebau eraill pan gyhoeddodd ei bapur 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae'r undebau yn deall ein hymagwedd fel rhan o'n hymgyrch gyffredinol i geisio gwella effeithlonrwydd er mwyn sicrhau, os gallwn arbed arian mewn rhai meysydd penodol, y gallwn ail-fuddsoddi'r arian hwnnw mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Dyna fu'r cysyniad ym mhob rhan o'n hagwedd tuag at ariannu'r sector cyhoeddus eleni.

O ran Cymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau, gwelais glip byr gan un o'i chynrychiolwyr neithiwr, a berodd dristwch imi, gan y byddai wedi bod yn braf clywed datganiad yn

education, teachers matter, but it is about putting children first. If we did not have the children, we would not have the education service in the first place. Teachers to whom I have spoken, and the schools with which I have worked in my area, are positive about free breakfasts, because they feel the benefits in terms of concentration levels being maintained, and ensuring that some of the children who do not always attend school regularly are on the premises at the beginning of the day. They see huge benefits and it is a shame that you never recognise a good idea. The proof will be in the practice and therefore we will wait and see.

On waiting lists, the figures year on year show decreases. We know that demand is considerable. People trust us to provide because they know that we believe in the NHS. We will see what will happen as a result of the extra funds going in. I think that we will continue to see decreases, but although we are never complacent and continually monitor the situation, reducing waiting times is a goal that is being met.

**Nick Bourne:** First, the civil service unions have a strange way of showing that they understand your proposals, if they are coming out on strike on Friday against them and are lobbying people as they enter the Assembly building. Secondly, you mentioned the Allied Steel and Wire Ltd situation. Thirdly, on free school breakfasts, it was inherent in what the union leader said that the money and effort should be spent on educating children. That was clearly the message; if you did not get that from the brief clip, perhaps you missed some of it. It was a very clear message. Fourthly, on the serious issue of health, you said that you are not complacent. You will therefore know, and should admit, that the picture is far, far worse than when you came into power in Westminster in 1997 and in the Assembly in 1999. Your commitment has meant that many more people are on waiting lists. What are you doing about it?

dechrau gyda'r plant. Pan ddaw i addysg, mae athrawon yn bwysig, ond mae a wnelo â rhoi plant yn gyntaf. Pe na bai gennym y plant, ni fyddai'r gwasanaeth addysg yno yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'r athrawon y siaradais â hwy, a'r ysgolion y bûm yn gweithio gyda hwy yn fy ardal, yn gadarn o blaid darparu brecwast am ddim, gan eu bod yn gweld y buddiannau o ran cynnal lefelau canolbwyntio, a sicrhau bod rhai o'r plant nad ydynt bob amser yn mynychu'r ysgol yn rheolaidd yn cyrraedd yr ysgol ar ddechrau'r dydd. Gwelant fuddiannau enfawr ac mae'n drueni na allwch byth gydnabod syniad da. Bydd y dystiolaeth i'w gweld ar ôl rhoi'r system ar waith ac felly arhoswn i gael gweld.

O ran rhestrau aros, dengys y ffigurau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ostyngiadau. Gwyddom fod y galw yn sylweddol. Mae pobl yn ymddiried ynom i ddarparu am eu bod yn gwybod ein bod yn credu yn y GIG. Cawn weld beth fydd canlyniadau'r arian ychwanegol sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi. Credaf y bydd y gostyngiadau yn parhau, ond er nad ydym byth yn gorffwys ar ein rhwyfau a'n bod yn monitro'r sefyllfa yn barhaus, mae'r nod o leihau amseroedd aros yn cael ei gyflawni.

**Nick Bourne:** Yn gyntaf, mae gan undebau'r gwasanaeth sifil ffordd ryfedd o ddangos eu bod yn deall eich cynigion, os ydynt yn mynd ar streic ddydd Gwener yn eu herbyn ac yn llobio pobl wrth iddynt gyrraedd adeilad y Cynulliad. Yn ail, bu ichi sôn am sefyllfa Allied Steel and Wire Cyf. Yn drydydd, o ran darparu brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol, yr oedd y ffaith y dylid gwario'r arian a chanolbwyntio'r ymdrech ar addysgu plant yn rhan annatod o'r hyn a ddywedodd arweinydd yr undeb. Dyna yn amlwg oedd y neges; os na fu ichi ddeall hynny o'r clip byr, efallai ichi golli rhywfaint ohono. Yr oedd y neges yn amlwg iawn. Yn bedwerydd, o ran iechyd, sy'n fater difrifol, dywedasoed nad ydych yn gorffwys ar eich rhwyfau. Fe wyddoch felly, a dylech gyfaddef, fod y darlun yn llawer, llawer gwaeth na'r darlun pan ddaethoch i rym yn San Steffan yn 1997 ac yn y Cynulliad yn 1999. Mae eich ymrwymiad wedi golygu bod llawer mwy o bobl ar restrau aros. Beth a wnewch i ddatrys y sefyllfa honno?

**Sue Essex:** On the Public and Commercial Services Union, this is a national dispute and I understand that members of a national UK union will want to show solidarity with their comrades and take part in a picket or in a demonstration. We understand that. I have frequent chats with PCS members because many of them live in my constituency and I meet them regularly here. They understand. If you do not believe that, look at the press release published after the meeting that Rhodri Morgan and I had with PCS, when we announced 'Making the Connections', the consultation document on public services.

On waiting lists, you continually make your point that the lists are higher. I believe that we are giving a far better service across a wide range of areas. We have particular problems with orthopaedic treatment in some areas and we need to bring some of those waiting times down. That is being worked through. You paint a bleak picture, but the reality is nowhere near as bleak as you say. You have to look across the piece, and the situation is nowhere near as bleak as you say. There are difficulties, but we are getting the waiting lists down.

**Sue Essex:** O ran yr Undeb Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, mae hwn yn anghydfod cenedlaethol a deallaf y bydd aelodau undeb cenedlaethol y DU am ddangos undod â'u cyd-aelodau gan gymryd rhan mewn piced neu brotest. Deallwn hynny. Caf sgyrsiau rheolaidd gydag aelodau'r undeb gan fod llawer ohonynt yn byw yn fy etholaeth ac yr wyf yn cyfarfod â hwy yn rheolaidd yma. Maent yn deall. Os nad ydych yn credu hynny, edrychwch ar y datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd ar ôl y cyfarfod a gefais i a Rhodri Morgan gyda'r undeb, pan gyhoeddwyd 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' gennym, sef y ddogfen ymgynghori ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

O ran rhestrau aros, gwnewch eich pwynt yn rheolaidd bod y rhestrau yn uwch. Yr wyf o'r farn ein bod yn rhoi gwasanaeth llawer gwell ar draws amrywiaeth eang o feysydd. Mae gennym broblemau penodol gyda thriniaeth orthopedig mewn rhai ardaloedd ac mae angen inni ostwng rhai o'r amseroedd aros hynny. Yr ydym yn gweithredu yn hynny o beth. Mae'r darlun a grëir gennych yn un llwm, ond nid yw'r gwirionedd yn agos at fod mor llwm â hynny. Rhaid edrych ar y darlun cyfan ac nid yw'r sefyllfa yn agos at fod mor llwm â hynny. Ceir anawsterau, ond yr ydym yn llwyddo i leihau rhestrau aros.

### **Cyllideb Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio The Social Justice and Regeneration Portfolio Budget**

**Q2 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the considerations given to increases made to the social justice and regeneration portfolio budget? (OAQ38925)

**Sue Essex:** When setting the draft budget, we ensured that allocations aligned with the Assembly Government's strategic policy aims. The draft budget increased the social justice and regeneration portfolio provision by over 17 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08. This reflects our commitment to tackling poverty and supporting communities.

**Val Lloyd:** I am grateful for that reply. As you know I have several communities in my constituency that have high levels of deprivation and poverty, especially, it is sad

**C2 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr ystyriaethau a roddwyd i gynyddu cyllideb y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio? (OAQ38925)

**Sue Essex:** Wrth bennu'r gyllideb ddrafft, bu inni sicrhau bod y dyraniadau yn cyd-fynd â nodau polisi strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Cynyddodd y gyllideb ddrafft ddarpariaeth y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio dros 17 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu ein hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi a chefnogi cymunedau.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw. Fel y gwyddoch mae sawl cymuned yn fy etholaeth lle ceir lefelau uchel o amddifadedd a thlodi, yn arbennig, yn

to say, child poverty. Would you agree that continued funding for the Communities First programme, together with the increased early-years expenditure demonstrates the commitment to give every child in Wales the best start in life?

**Sue Essex:** Yes. We are committed to this. I think that you have three Community First areas in your constituency—the wards in Bonymaen and some others. There has been a considerable injection of money into those areas because we feel that they really need support. We are building capacity and facilities to support people in those areas to ensure that the inequalities that we have in Wales are eradicated. I am glad that you mentioned the increased expenditure on early years provision, because, as people will recall, it is a big thrust of our budget for children up to seven years of age, from child care through to formal education. We all believe that if we can make a difference in those years, by providing funding and supporting parents as well as children, we can really put Wales on the right road for the future.

2.10 p.m.

**Leanne Wood:** Partly as a result of the low priority given to investing in housing since devolution, at least £3 billion is needed to reach the Welsh quality housing standard. Do you agree that little consideration has been given to the reality of the situation either now or in the past, and that the increase in the budget is a mere drop in the ocean in terms of dealing with this problem, which has got out of hand?

**Sue Essex:** I agree that the quality of housing has been a major consideration in Wales for many years. Thankfully, in the last few years, we have seen considerable investment in Wales, certainly in new housing. However, we know that there is a particular problem with the quality of social housing. In many private-sector housing areas, there has been investment in terms of private funds and through the Council of Mortgage Lenders. That again contributes to meeting quality

anffodus, tlodi plant. A gytunech fod darparu cyllid parhaus i'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ynghyd â'r gwariant cynyddol ar ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar, yn arwydd o'r ymrwymiad i roi'r cychwyn gorau mewn bywyd i bob plentyn yng Nghymru?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i hyn. Credaf fod tair ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn eich etholaeth—y wardiau ym Monymaen a rhai eraill. Gwnaed buddsoddiad ariannol sylweddol yn yr ardaloedd hynny gan ein bod yn teimlo bod angen cefnogaeth wirioneddol arnynt. Yr ydym yn meithrin gallu ac yn datblygu cyfleusterau i gefnogi pobl yn yr ardaloedd hynny er mwyn sicrhau y ceir gwared ar yr anghydraddoldebau sydd i'w gweld yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch ichi sôn am y gwariant cynyddol ar ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar, oherwydd, fel y bydd pobl yn cofio, mae cyfran fawr o'n cyllideb yn cael ei gwario ar blant hyd at saith mlwydd oed, o ofal plant i addysg ffurfiol. Cred pob un ohonom os gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth yn ystod y blynyddoedd hynny, drwy ddarparu arian a chefnogi rhieni yn ogystal â phlant, y gallwn roi Cymru ar y trywydd cywir i'r dyfodol.

**Leanne Wood:** Yn rhannol o ganlyniad i'r flaenoriaeth isel a roddwyd i fuddsoddi mewn tai ers datganoli, mae angen o leiaf £3 biliwn er mwyn cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru. A gytunwch mai prin fu'r ystyriaeth a roddwyd i realiti'r sefyllfa naill ai yn awr neu yn y gorffennol, ac mai megis dechrau yw'r cynnydd yn y gyllideb o ran ymdrin â'r broblem hon, sydd y tu hwnt i reolaeth erbyn hyn?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf fod ansawdd tai wedi bod yn ystyriaeth bwysig yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd lawer. Yn ffodus, yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gwelwyd buddsoddiad sylweddol yng Nghymru, yn sicr o ran tai newydd. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom fod problem benodol o ran ansawdd tai cymdeithasol. Mewn sawl ardal tai'r sector preifat, gwelwyd buddsoddiad o ran cyllid preifat a thrwy Gyngor y Benthycwyr Morgeisi. Mae hynny unwaith

standards. In terms of the social housing grant, I have announced additional money, which was well received by the social housing sector. That is £16 million each year for the next three years. Also, it is important to note the £30 million allocated for older people in particular, relating to the Wanless recommendations. That could be invested in new housing, but could also be used for organisations such as Care and Repair, which can improve standards in older housing stock and ensure that older people feel comfortable and safe and secure in their homes.

eto'n cyfrannu at y broses o gyrraedd safonau ansawdd. O ran y grant tai cymdeithasol, cyhoeddais arian ychwanegol, a gafodd goeso cynnes gan y sector tai cymdeithasol. Cyhoeddwyd £16 miliwn bob blwyddyn am y tair blynedd nesaf. Hefyd, mae'n bwysig nodi'r £30 miliwn a ddyrannwyd i bobl hŷn yn arbennig, yn deillio o argymhellion Wanless. Gellid buddsoddi'r arian hwnnw mewn tai newydd, ond gellid ei ddefnyddio hefyd i ariannu sefydliadau megis Care and Repair, a all wella safonau stoc tai hŷn a sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn teimlo'n gyfforddus ac yn ddiogel yn eu cartrefi.

### **Adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU o Wariant The UK Government's Spending Review**

**Q3 Jeff Cuthbert:** Will the Minister make a statement on the implications of the UK Government's spending review on the Welsh Assembly Government's budget? (OAQ38897)

**C3 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar oblygiadau adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU o wariant ar gyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? (OAQ38897)

**Sue Essex:** The UK Government spending review has enabled the Assembly to set a budget that grows by 21 per cent over the next three years. The level of resources that we have to spend each year will increase by £2.5 billion, from £11.8 billion this year. Therefore, the budget will increase to £14.3 billion by 2007-08. This level of growth is above that of many Whitehall departments and has been determined through the Barnett funding mechanism.

**Sue Essex:** Mae adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU o wariant wedi galluogi'r Cynulliad i bennu cyllideb sy'n cynyddu 21 y cant dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd yr adnoddau a fydd gennym i'w gwario bob blwyddyn yn cynyddu £2.5 biliwn, o £11.8 biliwn eleni. Felly, bydd y gyllideb yn cynyddu i £14.3 biliwn erbyn 2007-08. Mae'r cynnydd hwn yn fwy na'r hyn a ddyrannwyd i lawer o adrannau Whitehall ac fe'i pennwyd gan ddefnyddio dull cyllido Barnett.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that an extra £2.5 billion for the Welsh block by 2007-08 under Barnett plus is good news for the people of Wales? It allows our budget to increase well above inflation. This package of support will enable more money to be ploughed into the key areas of education, health and better jobs. This spending review also gives us an extra £555 million in additional moneys in Barnett consequentials, which will go in the form of structural funds to assist our poorest communities. Do you agree that it would be churlish for anyone, including the opposition parties, not to commend the Chancellor and the Assembly Government on yet again delivering for the people of Wales, particularly for the youngest schoolchildren in our most deprived areas, who will benefit from free school breakfasts?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytunwch fod £2.5 biliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer bloc Cymru erbyn 2007-08 o dan Barnett a mwy yn newyddion da i bobl Cymru? Mae'n galluogi i'n cyllideb gynyddu ar gyfradd lawer uwch na chwyddiant. Bydd y cymorth hwn yn sicrhau y caiff mwy o arian ei roi i addysg, iechyd a swyddi gwell, sy'n feysydd allweddol. Mae'r adolygiad hwn o wariant hefyd yn rhoi £555 miliwn ychwanegol o arian canlyniadol Barnett inni, a gaiff ei neilltuo i gronfeydd strwythurol i helpu ein cymunedau tlotaf. A gytunwch y byddai'n anfoesgar i unrhyw un, gan gynnwys y gwrthbleidiau, beidio â chymeradwyo'r Canghellor a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am gyflawni unwaith eto dros bobl Cymru, yn arbennig y plant ysgol ieuengaf yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, a fydd yn elwa ar frecwast yn yr ysgol am ddim?



**Sue Essex:** I obviously agree. It would be foolish for anyone not to agree with you on that, Jeff. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We not only seem to have Members seeking to make sedentary interventions, but rather long questions and, occasionally, long answers this afternoon.

**Sue Essex:** These are rather large sums, Presiding Officer, that is why. I will try to be brief.

Of course I agree with you, Jeff. I was proud to be able to present the draft budget, and to distribute that additional money according to a radical vision for Wales. That vision is to try to ensure that we tackle deprivation and inequality, have a strong and sustainable economy and that our youngsters and young people have the skills to equip them for future employment and a good quality of life.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** You have told us that you are now able to set an indicative budget for the period up to 2008. In 2007-08, patients in England will have a wait of 18 weeks between seeing the general practitioner and being on the operating table. You are investing an extra £1 billion in the health service up to 2008. What do you expect the waiting time in Wales to be at the end of that period?

**Sue Essex:** That is a matter for Jane Hutt. I have provided that money for health. Jane is developing national service targets and frameworks. Waits will depend upon whether the Wanless money that is being provided can make a difference in terms of relieving pressures on hospitals to free up beds and staff, and ensure that people go into hospital for the right reasons and do not stay there any longer than necessary.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is obvious from that answer that you do not have a target, and although you are pumping an additional £1 billion into the health service you are unable

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf, yn sicr. Byddai'n hurt i unrhyw un beidio â chytuno â chi ar hynny, Jeff. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yn ogystal ag Aelodau sy'n ceisio ymyrryd ar eu heistedd, ymddengys bod gennym gwestiynau braidd yn hir ac, o bryd i'w gilydd, atebion hir y prynhawn yma.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r symiau hyn braidd yn fawr, Lywydd, dyna paham. Ceisiaf fod yn gryno.

Wrth gwrs cytunaf â chi, Jeff. Yr oeddwn yn falch o allu cyflwyno'r gyllideb ddrafft, a dosbarthu'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw yn ôl gweledigaeth radicalaidd i Gymru. Y weledigaeth honno yw ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd ac anghydraddoldeb, bod economi gref a chynaliadwy gennym a bod gan ein plant a'n pobl ifanc y sgiliau sydd eu hangen arnynt i'w paratoi ar gyfer gwaith yn y dyfodol ac ansawdd bywyd da.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr ydych wedi dweud wrthym eich bod bellach yn gallu pennu cyllideb ddangosol ar gyfer y cyfnod hyd at 2008. Yn 2007-08, bydd yn rhaid i gleifion yn Lloegr aros 18 wythnos rhwng gweld meddyg teulu a chael llawdriniaeth. Yr ydych yn buddsoddi £1 biliwn ychwanegol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd hyd at 2008. Beth y disgwyliwch y bydd yr amser aros yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd y cyfnod hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Mater i Jane Hutt yw hynny. Yr wyf wedi darparu'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer iechyd. Mae Jane yn datblygu targedau a fframweithiau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Bydd yr amser aros yn dibynnu ar ba un a all yr arian Wanless a ddarperir wneud gwahaniaeth o ran lleddfu'r pwysau ar ysbytai i ryddhau gwelyau a staff, a sicrhau bod pobl yn mynd i'r ysbyty am y rhesymau cywir ac nad ydynt yn aros yno yn hwy nag sydd ei angen.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n amlwg o'r ateb hwnnw nad oes targed gennych, ac er eich bod yn rhoi £1 biliwn ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ni allwch ddweud wrth

to tell the people of Wales how long they will have to wait for operations in 2007-08. If you were a patient in England, you would know that you would only have to wait 18 weeks, but in Wales it could be anything up to three years. The current situation, Minister, is that 91 per cent of patients are treated in hospital within six months in England, 87 per cent in Scotland, but only 50 per cent in Wales. That is a national scandal. You are pumping £1 billion into the health service yet you are unable to tell us what reduction there will be in waiting times in three years. What is the point of having a Government that treats the health service in Wales with such contempt?

**Sue Essex:** You always have a narrow view of what the health service is. There is a health service and social care budget that must be looked at as a composite area. As I explained, and as Derek Wanless patiently explained to everyone in Wales, in order to free up hospital beds, you must tackle the needs at both ends—primary healthcare and social care provision. I am sure that Jane Hutt will come up with the figures that you require, but I notice again that you do not talk about access to primary healthcare, which is better in Wales than in England, or about access to accident and emergency departments, which, if memory serves me correctly, is also better in Wales. I beg you not to pick out a single element and say, ‘This is what we are going to concentrate on’. The truth is, if you want to make improvements in the health sector, you must make them comprehensively. You will ensure then that you do not target money at one area and then find that it is another area that causes you problems. Let us look at this wholeheartedly and ensure that when we produce our plans and put the money in, we get a comprehensive result.

bobl Cymru pa mor hir y bydd yn rhaid iddynt aros i gael llawdriniaeth yn 2007-08. Pe baech yn glaf yn Lloegr, fe wyddech mai dim ond 18 wythnos y byddai'n rhaid ichi aros, ond yng Nghymru, gallai fod yn unrhyw beth hyd at dair blynedd. Y sefyllfa bresennol, Weinidog, yw y caiff 91 y cant o gleifion eu trin yn yr ysbyty o fewn chwe mis yn Lloegr, 87 y cant yn yr Alban, ond dim ond 50 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n warth cenedlaethol. Yr ydych yn rhoi £1 biliwn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd eto ni allwch ddweud wrthym faint y bydd amseroedd aros yn gostwng o fewn tair blynedd. Beth yw diben cael Llywodraeth sy'n dirmygu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru i'r fath raddau?

**Sue Essex:** Mae eich barn o'r gwasanaeth iechyd bob amser yn gul. Mae cyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol y mae'n rhaid ei hystyried yn faes cyfansawdd. Fel yr eglurais, ac fel yr eglurodd Derek Wanless gydag amynedd i bawb yng Nghymru, er mwyn rhyddhau gwelyau mewn ysbytai, rhaid ichi fynd i'r afael ag anghenion y ddau faes—gofal iechyd sylfaenol a darpariaeth gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Jane Hutt yn darparu'r ffigurau sydd eu hangen arnoch, ond sylwaf unwaith eto na siaradwch am fynediad i ofal iechyd sylfaenol, sy'n well yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, nac am fynediad i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, sy'n well yng Nghymru hefyd, os cofiaf yn iawn. Erfyniaf arnoch i beidio â dewis un elfen gan ddweud, ‘Dyma'r hyn yr ydym am ganolbwyntio arno’. Y gwirionedd yw, os ydych am wneud gwelliannau yn y sector iechyd, rhaid ichi eu gwneud mewn modd cynhwysfawr. Byddwch wedyn yn sicrhau nad ydych yn targedu arian mewn un maes ac yna'n gweld mai maes arall sy'n achosi problemau. Gadewch inni ystyried hyn mewn modd cynhwysfawr a sicrhau y cawn ganlyniad cynhwysfawr, pan fyddwn yn llunio ein cynlluniau ac yn darparu'r arian.

### **Anghenion y Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio The Needs of the Social Justice and Regeneration Portfolio**

**Q4 Sandy Mewies:** What consideration did the Minister give to the needs of the social justice and regeneration portfolio in formulating the Assembly's draft budget?

**C4 Sandy Mewies:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i anghenion y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio wrth lunio cyllideb ddrafft y Cynulliad?

(OAQ38911)

**Sue Essex:** When setting the draft budget we ensured that allocations were aligned with our strategic policy aims. Social justice and regeneration is core to our beliefs about how Wales should go forward. On that basis, provision for the social justice and regeneration portfolio will grow by 17 per cent by 2007-08.

**Sandy Mewies:** Given the changes that have occurred in the portfolio over the past one and a half years, what flexibility exists in the social justice budget to respond to changes that may occur over the coming three years?

**Sue Essex:** That will be the responsibility of the Minister, advised by, and in discussions with, the committee. You are right to say that things never stay static and when we prepare the budget we make best estimates as to where money should go. We know that money must go into social housing, as Leanne said, and to combat problems that relate to drugs, but there will inevitably be some flexibility and movement to respond to particular circumstances.

**Mark Isherwood:** How will a budget increase of just 2 per cent for the second year running meet your Government's rhetoric about social justice and tackle the housing crisis that has seen new build affordable housing cut by 78 per cent, and homelessness increase by 112 per cent under Welsh Labour?

**Sue Essex:** There is an increase in the social housing budget, as I said. Particular sums are going into rural housing and there is a pilot scheme on housing need in Gwynedd at the moment. Social justice is not just one portfolio—it is an underpinning concept that goes right through the entire budget. If you are referring to where we should look for social justice, I ask you to look for it in health, particularly in the Townsend formula, in education in terms of the narrowing the gap agenda, and across the piece.

(OAQ38911)

**Sue Essex:** Wrth bennu'r gyllideb ddrafft, bu inni sicrhau i arian gael ei ddyrannu yn unol â'n nodau polisi strategol. Mae cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn rhan greiddiol o'n credoau ynghylch sut y dylai Cymru ddatblygu. Ar y sail honno, bydd darpariaeth ar gyfer y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn cynyddu 17 y cant erbyn 2007-08.

**Sandy Mewies:** O gofio'r newidiadau a gafwyd yn y portffolio dros y flwyddyn a hanner diwethaf, pa hyblygrwydd a geir yn y gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i ymateb i newidiadau a allai ddigwydd yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf?

**Sue Essex:** Cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog fydd hynny, ar ôl ceisio cyngor y pwyllgor a thrafod gyda'r pwyllgor. Dywedwch, yn briodol, nad yw pethau byth yn aros yn ddigyfnewid ac mae'n rhaid inni wneud yr amcangyfrifon gorau o ran sut y dylem ddyrannu'r arian wrth inni baratoi'r gyllideb. Gwyddom fod yn rhaid i arian fynd i dai cymdeithasol, fel y dywedodd Leanne, ac i drechu problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau, ond mae'n anochel y bydd rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd a newid er mwyn ymateb i amgylchiadau arbennig.

**Mark Isherwood:** Sut y bydd cynnydd yn y gyllideb o 2 y cant yn unig am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol yn bodloni rhethreg eich Llywodraeth ynghylch cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac yn mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng o ran tai sy'n golygu bod tai fforddiadwy newydd wedi gostwng 78 y cant a bod digartrefedd wedi cynyddu 112 y cant o dan Lafur Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Mae cynnydd yn y gyllideb tai cymdeithasol, fel y dywedais. Mae symiau penodol wedi'u neilltuo i dai gwledig a chynhelir cynllun peilot o ran yr angen am dai yng Ngwynedd ar hyn o bryd. Nid dim ond un portffolio yw cyfiawnder cymdeithasol—cysyniad sylfaenol ydyw sy'n treiddio i'r gyllideb gyfan. Os cyfeiriwch at ble y dylem chwilio am gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, gofynnaf ichi edrych amdano ym maes iechyd, yn arbennig yn fformiwla Townsend, ym maes addysg o ran yr agenda

cau'r bwlch, ac yn gyffredinol.

### **Cynyddu'r Gyllideb Cymorth i Fyfyrrwyr Increasing the Student Support Budget**

**Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** What consideration did the Minister give to increasing the student support budget when allocating money to the education and lifelong learning portfolio in this year's budget? (OAQ38919)

**Sue Essex:** Within the additional £282.2 million allocated for the education and lifelong learning portfolio, provision for student access funds will increase from £42.9 million in 2004-05 to £73.4 million in 2007-08. We are in discussion with the Department for Education and Skills regarding the transfer of student support functions. The effect of the introduction of variable fees in England on the higher education sector is still uncertain.

2.20 p.m.

**Michael German:** I draw your attention to your budget line for student support, which indicates that you are taking £4.5 million out of the student support grants that are available through the National Assembly's scheme. Why has this budget been reduced by £4.5 million for next year? Is it because the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has indicated that there is no demand? Is it because your Government, collectively, does not wish to increase student support? Or is it that you do not wish to increase the level of the grant or the threshold at which it is paid?

**Sue Essex:** As I am sure you appreciate, the Assembly learning grant has a demand-led budget. You will recall that I have said that I do not leave money in budget lines if it is not needed. Therefore, I have decreased this budget line following discussions with Jane Davidson. It is interesting to note that demand has increased by 13 per cent this year. It is a demand-led budget. We will guarantee to match the demand, but I will not put money in the budget line if the demand

**C5 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i gynyddu'r gyllideb cymorth i fyfyrwyr wrth ddyrannu arian i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes yng nghyllideb eleni? (OAQ38919)

**Sue Essex:** O fewn y £282.2 miliwn ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes, bydd y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer cronfeydd mynediad myfyrwyr yn cynyddu o £42.9 miliwn yn 2004-05 i £73.4 miliwn yn 2007-08. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ynghylch trosglwyddo swyddogaethau cymorth i fyfyrwyr. Mae effaith cyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy yn Lloegr ar y sector addysg uwch yn parhau i fod yn ansicr.

**Michael German:** Tynnaf eich sylw at y llinell yn eich cyllideb ar gyfer cymorth i fyfyrwyr, sy'n nodi eich bod yn tynnu £4.5 miliwn o'r grantiau cymorth i fyfyrwyr sydd ar gael drwy gynllun y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pam mae'r gyllideb hon wedi'i gostwng £4.5 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf? Ai'r rheswm dros hynny yw bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi nodi nad oes galw amdano? Ai'r rheswm yw am nad yw eich Llywodraeth chi, yn gyffredinol, am gynyddu cymorth i fyfyrwyr? Neu ai'r rheswm yw nad ydych am gynyddu lefel y grant na'r trothwy ar gyfer ei dalu?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwerthfawrogwch, mae'n siŵr, mae gan grant dysgu'r Cynulliad gyllideb ar sail galw. Fe gofiwch fy mod wedi dweud na adawaf arian yn llinellau'r gyllideb os nad oes ei angen. Felly, yr wyf wedi gostwng y llinell hon yn y gyllideb ar ôl trafodaethau gyda Jane Davidson. Mae'n ddi-ddorol nodi bod galw wedi cynyddu 13 y cant eleni. Cyllideb ar sail galw ydyw. Byddwn yn ateb y galw yn bendant, ond ni fyddaf yn rhoi arian i linell y gyllideb os nad

does not exist.

I remind you that the higher education grants are coming in this year. Therefore, in terms of student support, considerable sums of money are coming in through annually managed expenditure to help students.

**Michael German:** If there is no demand for the Assembly learning grants, and if you therefore want to reduce the budget, surely it would be better to give more assistance to students by either increasing the small amount of money that they receive through the grants and ensuring that it grows in line with inflation, or making more available by lowering the threshold at which they are paid so that more students can access the grants? Either make more available or raise the level of the grant. Cutting £4.5 million from this valuable budget shows that the demand does not exist among students.

**Sue Essex:** I do not think that you heard me say that demand has increased by 13 per cent this year. This scheme is in demand. Introducing any scheme—

**Michael German:** It is a cut.

**Sue Essex:** It is not a cut; it is an adjustment. Let us get this straight: this is a demand-led budget, therefore, if there is demand, we will pay. You are querying how this is represented in the budget lines. I have said that I do not put money to sit in lines if it will not be used. The scheme has seen a growth of 13 per cent, therefore there is real demand. As people find out more about the scheme's advantages, the grants are being taken up.

oes galw amdano.

Fe'ch atgoffaf fod y grantiau addysg uwch yn cael eu cyflwyno eleni. Felly, o ran cymorth i fyfyrwyr, darperir llawer o arian drwy wariant a reolir yn flynyddol i helpu myfyrwyr.

**Michael German:** Os nad oes galw am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, ac felly os ydych am leihau'r gyllideb, oni fyddai'n well rhoi mwy o gymorth i fyfyrwyr naill ai drwy gynyddu'r swm bach o arian a gânt drwy'r grantiau a sicrhau ei fod yn cynyddu yn unol â chwyddiant, neu ddarparu rhagor o arian drwy ostwng y trothwy ar gyfer talu'r grantiau fel y gall mwy o fyfyrwyr fanteisio arnynt? Dylech naill ai ddarparu mwy o arian neu godi lefel y grant. Dengys y ffaith y caiff y gyllideb werthfawr hon ei gostwng £4.5 miliwn nad yw'r galw yn bodoli ymhlith myfyrwyr.

**Sue Essex:** Ni chredaf ichi fy nghlywed yn dweud bod galw wedi cynyddu 13 y cant eleni. Mae galw am y cynllun hwn. Mae'r broses o gyflwyno unrhyw gynllun—

**Michael German:** Toriad ydyw.

**Sue Essex:** Nid toriad ydyw, ond addasiad. Gadewch inni ddeall hyn: cyllideb ar sail galw yw hon, ac felly, os oes galw, byddwn yn talu. Yr ydych yn holi ynghylch sut y caiff hyn ei gynrychioli yn llinellau'r gyllideb. Dywedais nad wyf yn dyrannu arian i linellau os na fydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Mae'r galw am y cynllun wedi cynyddu 13 y cant, ac felly mae galw gwirioneddol. Wrth i bobl gael mwy o wybodaeth am fanteisio y cynllun, maent yn manteisio ar y grantiau.

### **Cyllid Portfolio Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Economic Development and Transport Portfolio Funding**

**Q6 Mick Bates:** In drawing up this year's budget, what representations did the Minister receive from the Minister for Economic Development and Transport regarding increased funding for his portfolio? (OAQ38904)

**Sue Essex:** When setting the draft budget, I had numerous discussions with all my Cabinet colleagues, individually and

**C6 Mick Bates:** Wrth lunio cyllideb eleni, pa sylwadau y derbyniodd y Gweinidog oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ynghylch cyllid cynyddol ar gyfer ei bortffolio? (OAQ38904)

**Sue Essex:** Wrth bennu'r gyllideb ddrafft, cefais drafodaethau niferus gyda'm holl gyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, yn unigol ac ar y

collectively. This budget means that the economic development and transport portfolio budget will have increased by 153 per cent between 1999-2000 and 2007-08.

**Mick Bates:** I am aware of the increase, and, in one respect, happy about it. However, your answer reinforces the view expressed last week by the Minister for Economic Development and Transport that he is not committed to energy efficiency programmes. Will you revisit the budget and ask the Minister to make greater efforts to bring energy efficiency to Wales? At present, he seems extremely complacent, and the action plan delivered last week was a disgrace.

**Sue Essex:** I cannot speak for the Minister for Economic Development and Transport and discuss what he said in committee. However, I know what he has said in Cabinet and how committed he is to the programme of increasing renewable energy production and promoting energy efficiency. This was made apparent in his report on climate change. I do not think that you can say that there is a lack of commitment. Each portfolio, from social justice to housing, is aware that dealing with energy efficiency will contribute towards meeting our targets on climate change.

**Alun Cairns:** When 'A Winning Wales' was launched, it was deemed that the resources available were wholly unacceptable. Now that our prosperity has deteriorated in relation to that of the rest of the United Kingdom, what extra resources are you making available to the Minister, or is this the best that his negotiating skills could come up with? Whatever the answer to that is, this is completely inadequate.

**Sue Essex:** You have a one-eyed view of what makes a successful economy. If you go back to my budget announcement, I said that we need to build up the skills level in Wales, and that runs through all the advice that we have received. We have been successful in creating jobs and in bringing people into Wales. We now need to move ourselves on to

cyd. Golyga'r gyllideb hon y bydd cyllideb y portffolio datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth wedi cynyddu 153 y cant rhwng 1999-2000 a 2007-08.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r cynnydd, ac, mewn ffordd, yr wyf yn fodlon arno. Fodd bynnag, mae eich ateb yn atgyfnerthu'r farn a fynegwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn nodi nad yw'n ymrwymedig i raglenni effeithlonrwydd ynni. A fyddwch yn ailystyried y gyllideb gan ofyn i'r Gweinidog wneud mwy o ymdrech i gyflwyno effeithlonrwydd ynni yng Nghymru? Ar hyn o bryd, ymddengys ei fod yn gorffwys ar ei rwyfau, ac yr oedd y cynllun gweithredu a gyflwynwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn warthus.

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf siarad ar ran y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a thrafod yr hyn a ddywedodd yn y pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, gwn beth a ddywedodd yn y Cabinet a pha mor ymrwymedig ydyw i'r rhaglen o gynyddu'r ynni adnewyddadwy a gynhyrchir a hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni. Yr oedd hyn yn amlwg yn ei adroddiad ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Ni chredaf y gallwch ddweud bod diffyg ymrwymiad. Mae pob portffolio, o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol i dai, yn ymwybodol y bydd y dasg o ymdrin ag effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ein helpu i gyrraedd ein targedau o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd.

**Alun Cairns:** Pan lanswyd 'Cymru'n Ennill', ystyriwyd bod yr adnoddau a oedd ar gael yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae ein ffyniant wedi gwaethygu mewn perthynas â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn hyn ac felly pa adnoddau ychwanegol yr ydych yn eu rhoi i'r Gweinidog, neu ai dyma'r fargen orau y gallai ei tharo? Beth bynnag yw'r ateb i hynny, mae hyn yn gwbl annigonol.

**Sue Essex:** Mae gennych farn unochrog o economi lwyddiannus. Os ewch yn ôl i'm cyhoeddiad am y gyllideb, dywedais fod angen inni wella sgiliau yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'r holl gyngor a gawsom. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i greu swyddi a denu pobl i Gymru. Mae angen inni symud ymlaen yn awr er mwyn sicrhau y gall Cymru

ensure that Wales can compete in terms of, if you like, higher knowledge and a higher skills level. That does not mean that it has to be full of figures in terms of economic development and transport, because, as you know, it will sit with the education and lifelong learning portfolio. However, if you do not think that putting money into skills and improving skills levels will help our economy, you are missing a trick. I refer you to my colleague Brian Gibbons on your inaccuracy with the figures. I am sure that he will elucidate on the comparison afterwards.

**Brian Gibbons:** Will you confirm that Wales's relative gross value added position has been static for the last few years for which the statistics have been available, in contrast to the dramatic deterioration that took place under the Conservative regime? [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is about to answer the question.

**Sue Essex:** I would not disagree with Brian. He is a whiz with figures. Wales will not get anywhere if a group of people continue to demean and diminish what we are achieving. This is recognised. I saw an interesting article in the *The Wall Street Journal*, to which I refer you, Alun, if your horizons will extend to your reading that. It stated how encouraging the Welsh economy is. If you cannot see that from your little neck of the woods, go and read what *The Wall Street Journal* says.

gystadlu o ran gwybodaeth well a sgiliau gwell, os mynnwch. Ni olyga hynny fod yn rhaid i hynny fod yn llawn ffigurau o ran datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, bydd yn rhan o'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Fodd bynnag, os na chredwch y bydd dyrannu arian i ddatblygu a gwella sgiliau yn helpu ein heconomi, yr ydych yn methu rhywbeth. Fe'ch cyfeirïaf at fy nghyd-Aelod Brian Gibbons o ran eich anghywirdeb gyda'r ffigurau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn esbonio'r gymhariaeth wedyn.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gadarnhewch fod sefyllfa gwerth ychwanegol crynswth gymharol Cymru wedi bod yn ddisymud am yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf y bu ystadegau ar gael ar eu cyfer, mewn cyferbyniad â'r dirywiad sylweddol a welwyd o dan y gyfundrefn Geidwadol? [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog ar fin ateb y cwestiwn.

**Sue Essex:** Ni fyddwn yn anghytuno â Brian. Mae ganddo ddawn at ffigurau. Ni fydd Cymru yn datblygu o gwbl os bydd grŵp o bobl yn parhau i ddiraddio a bychanu'r hyn a gyflawnwn. Cydnabyddir hyn. Gwelais erthygl ddiddorol yn *The Wall Street Journal*, y dylech gyfeirio ati, Alun, os nad yw hynny y tu hwnt ichi. Nododd pa mor galonogol y mae economi Cymru. Os na allwch weld hynny o'ch milltir sgwâr chi, darllenwch yr hyn y mae *The Wall Street Journal* yn ei ddweud.

### **Cyllid Cyffredinol Portffolio Addysg The Education Portfolio's Overall Funding**

**C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cyllid cyffredinol y mae wedi'i ddyrannu i'r portffolio addysg yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad am y tair blynedd nesaf? (OAQ38893)

**Sue Essex:** When setting the draft budget, we ensured that allocations aligned with the Assembly Government's strategic policy aims. Therefore, the draft budget provides significant additional investment of over 25 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08. This investment reflects the importance attached to education and lifelong learning in our

**Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding that she has allocated to the education portfolio in the Assembly budget for the next three years? (OAQ38893)

**Sue Essex:** Wrth bennu'r gyllideb ddrafft, bu inni sicrhau bod y dyraniadau yn gyson â nodau polisi strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn darparu buddsoddiad ychwanegol sylweddol o dros 25 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn

strategic agenda.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych yn sôn am agenda strategol Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae gennych nod i gynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg o 5 y cant erbyn 2010. A ydych yn derbyn mai'r unig ffordd i wneud hynny yw drwy gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth o ran addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a mynediad i'r addysg honno? A ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid cael dilyniant o addysg gyn-ysgol, drwy'r sector cynradd, i'r sector uwchradd ac i addysg bellach ac addysg uwch? Pa ddarpariaeth ariannol yr ydych wedi'i wneud i sicrhau'r dilyniant hwnnw? Gwn am y £7 miliwn sydd wedi mynd i addysg feithrin, ond beth am y dilyniant wedi hynny? A yw hynny wedi'i gynnwys yn eich dyfarniad ar y gyllideb addysg am y tair blynedd nesaf?

**Sue Essex:** In the debate yesterday, Jane Davidson put forward her commitment to improving and increasing Welsh language provision, and that has been reflected in the allocation of spending to her portfolio. In terms of how that is allocated between budget expenditure lines, you probably need to ask Jane Davidson at committee. It has been left to Ministers to determine the way in which the allocation is spread throughout their budgets.

ein agenda strategol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You talk of the Government of Wales's strategic agenda. You have set a target to increase the number of Welsh speakers by 5 per cent by 2010. Do you accept that the only way to do that is to enhance Welsh-medium education provision and access to it? Do you agree that a continuum is needed from pre-school education, through the primary sector, to the secondary sector and to further and higher education? What financial provisions have you made to ensure that continuum? I know that £7 million has been provided for nursery education, but what about the continuum after that? Is that included in your determination on the education budget for the next three years?

**Sue Essex:** Yn y ddadl ddoe, cyflwynodd Jane Davidson ei hymrwymiad i wella a chynyddu darpariaeth Gymraeg, ac adlewyrchwyd hynny yn y ffordd y dyrannwyd gwariant i'w phortffolio. O ran y ffordd y dyrennir hynny rhwng llinellau gwariant y gyllideb, byddai angen ichi ofyn i Jane Davidson yn y pwyllgor. Gweinidogion sy'n gyfrifol am benderfynu ar y ffordd y caiff y dyraniad ei rannu drwy eu cyllidebau.

### **Cyllid Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Funding for the Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio**

**Q8 Eleanor Burnham:** In drawing up this year's budget, what representations did the Minister receive from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning regarding increased funding for his portfolio? Forgive me for the mistake. (OAQ38903)

**Sue Essex:** I do not think that her portfolio is a mistake; it is good news. If you know Jane Davidson well enough, you will know that she leaves no stone unturned in making representations on matters that she feels passionately about. We had good discussions, and I was pleased that, thanks to the big increase in our total budget, we can see the increase in education and lifelong learning.

**C8 Eleanor Burnham:** Wrth lunio cyllideb eleni, pa sylwadau y derbyniodd y Gweinidog oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynghylch cyllid cynyddol ar gyfer ei bortffolio? Maddeuwch imi am y camgymeriad. (OAQ38903)

**Sue Essex:** Ni chredaf mai camgymeriad yw ei phortffolio; mae'n newyddion da. Os ydych yn adnabod Jane Davidson yn ddigon da, fe wyddoch ei bod yn gwneud popeth posibl o ran cynnig sylwadau ar faterion y mae'n teimlo'n frwd drostynt. Cawsom drafodaethau da, ac yr oeddwn yn falch, diolch i gynnydd mawr yng nghyfanswm ein cyllideb, ein bod yn gallu gweld y cynnydd ym maes addysg a dysgu gydol oes.

2.30 p.m.



**Eleanor Burnham:** The mistake was on my screen, which said ‘his’ instead of ‘hers’, so I apologise for that. What are you, and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, doing to help with Welsh-medium education? The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning gave an answer yesterday about Yale College, which I believe was incorrect. We rang Yale College yesterday to find out about the Welsh-medium provision, and we were told that only Welsh was taught through the medium of Welsh. What will you do to encourage and increase the uptake, because this is a bit of a chicken-and-egg situation? If the prospectuses do not indicate that there is provision, how will the students of tomorrow be able to adequately partake of Welsh-medium education?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr oedd y camgymeriad ar fy sgrîn, am ei bod yn nodi ‘his’ yn hytrach na ‘hers’, felly ymddiheuraf am hynny. Beth yr ydych chi, a’r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn ei wneud i helpu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg? Rhoddodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ateb ddoe ynghylch Coleg Iâl a oedd yn anghywir, yn ôl pob tebyg. Bu inni ffonio Coleg Iâl ddoe i gael gwybodaeth am y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg, a dywedwyd wrthym mai dim ond Cymraeg a addysgwyd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Beth a wnewch i annog a chynyddu nifer y bobl sy’n manteisio ar ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg, am ei bod yn anodd gwybod beth sy’n dod gyntaf? Os nad yw’r prosbectysau yn nodi bod darpariaeth, sut y bydd myfyrwyr y dyfodol yn gallu cymryd rhan ddigonol mewn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg?

**Sue Essex:** You will have to take up the issue of Yale College with Jane, as I am not aware of the details. However, the main thrust of this, through ‘Iaith Pawb’, is to mainstream a whole range of improvements in the Welsh language via the culture budget and a range of budgets, but particularly through the education budget. You can ask that question of Jane in committee, but I know that she is absolutely committed to ‘Iaith Pawb’, and she has made great representations with regard to funding to ensure that money is fed into the areas that need it.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd yn rhaid ichi drafod Coleg Iâl gyda Jane, am nad wyf yn gyfarwydd â’r manylion. Fodd bynnag, prif bwyslais hyn, drwy ‘Iaith Pawb’, yw prif ffrydio amrywiaeth o welliannau yn Gymraeg drwy’r gyllideb diwylliant ac ystod o gyllidebau, ond yn arbennig drwy’r gyllideb addysg. Gallwch ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i Jane yn y pwyllgor, ond gwn ei fod yn gwbl ymrwymedig i ‘Iaith Pawb’, a gwnaeth sylwadau cadarnhaol o ran cyllido er mwyn sicrhau y dyrennir arian i’r meysydd sydd ei angen.

## **Cwestiynau i’r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside**

### **Targedau a Chyllid ar Gyfer Ailgylchu Targets and Funding for Recycling in Wales**

**Q1 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the relationship between targets and funding for recycling in Wales? (OAQ38866)

**C1 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y berthynas rhwng targedau a nawdd ar gyfer ailgylchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ38866)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Individual local authorities have agreed recycling targets with the Assembly. The Assembly Government is providing significant funding to ensure that local authorities meet those targets.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae awdurdodau lleol unigol wedi cytuno ar dargedau ailgylchu gyda’r Cynulliad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu llawer o arian i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyrraedd y targedau hynny.

**Peter Black:** That is good news. Will you tell me what targets and funding are in place for the recycling and disposal of hazardous waste?

**Carwyn Jones:** Hazardous waste is not a devolved matter.

**Christine Chapman:** If we are looking to promote a much better take-up of recycling in Wales, what action has the Minister taken, in collaboration with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, to promote recycling among young people and to promote careers in recycling technologies?

**Carwyn Jones:** One way of doing that is via eco-schools. The other way of doing it is to ensure that recycling is seen as the norm and becomes as easy as possible, so that all might be educated in the benefits of recycling when they see the good that it does.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Local authorities have made substantial steps towards meeting their recycling targets. However, I am sure that you would agree that meeting the target of 40 per cent by 2010 will prove to be a considerable challenge. Will you tell us when you will be using the powers given to the Assembly under the Household Waste Recycling Act 2003 to require all local authorities to take a consistent approach to providing doorstep recycling? The Act will provide them with additional resources to do that if you act upon it.

**Carwyn Jones:** I will review the figures and targets for 2003-04, which should be available shortly, but evidence suggests that local authorities have made good progress to meet the recycling target of 15 per cent. Members will also be aware that that target will be raised to 25 per cent in the near future. Those targets are achievable. If problems arise in individual areas, we would then work with local authorities to see whether those problems can be overcome.

**Peter Black:** Mae hynny'n newyddion da. A ddywedwch wrthyf pa dargedau a chyllid a ddarparwyd o ran ailgylchu a gwaredu gwastraff peryglus?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw gwastraff peryglus yn fater datganoledig.

**Christine Chapman:** Os ydym yn awyddus i annog llawer mwy o ailgylchu yng Nghymru, pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, i hyrwyddo ailgylchu ymhlith pobl ifanc ac i hyrwyddo gyrfaedd mewn technolegau ailgylchu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Un ffordd o wneud hynny yw drwy eco-ysgolion. Ffordd arall o'i wneud yw sicrhau bod ailgylchu yn digwydd fel mater o drefn a'i fod mor hawdd â phosibl, fel y gellid addysgu pawb ynghylch manteision ailgylchu pan welant y daioni a wna.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae awdurdodau lleol wedi cymryd camau breision tuag at gyrraedd eu targedau ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno y bydd cyrraedd y targed o 40 y cant erbyn 2010 yn her fawr. A ddywedwch wrthym pryd y byddwch yn defnyddio'r pwerau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Ailgylchu Gwastraff Cartrefi 2003 i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i bob awdurdod lleol fabwysiadu ymagwedd gyson tuag at ddarparu gwasanaeth ailgylchu wrth y drws? Bydd y Ddeddf yn rhoi adnoddau ychwanegol iddynt wneud hynny os gweithredwch arni.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddaf yn adolygu'r ffigurau a'r targedau ar gyfer 2003-04, a ddylai fod ar gael cyn bo hir, ond awgryma'r dystiolaeth fod awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud cynnydd da i gyrraedd y targed ailgylchu o 15 y cant. Bydd Aelodau hefyd yn ymwybodol y caiff y targed hwnnw ei godi i 25 y cant yn y dyfodol agos. Gellir cyrraedd y targedau hynny. Os bydd problemau yn codi mewn ardaloedd unigol, yna byddem yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol i ganfod a ellir goresgyn y problemau hynny.

### Llygredd Dyfroedd Arfordirol Pollution in Coastal Waters

**Q2 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on pollution in coastal waters around Wales? (OAQ38826)

**Carwyn Jones:** Regular monitoring shows considerable improvements in Welsh coastal water quality in recent years, and this was demonstrated by the excellent bathing water results that I announced yesterday.

**John Griffiths:** I take a keen interest in this subject, Carwyn, as a keen swimmer in the seas around Wales during the warmer months of the year—I have recently even had a surfing lesson. Many other people in Wales enjoy leisure use of our coastal waters, and it is important to see standards being driven up. I am pleased, therefore, to see this improvement. However, many people, including me, look at the water sometimes when it has met these higher standards and still see the foam on the waves glistening like washing-up liquid. Therefore, I feel, as many others do, that we need to keep looking at ways of driving these standards up even further, given the importance of good quality bathing waters in Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** One hundred per cent of our bathing waters meet the minimum European standards, and 86 per cent meet the higher standards. That compares with only 20 per cent 10 years ago. However, that means that there is scope for further improvement, even though there has already been considerable improvement in the past 10 years.

**Brynle Williams:** A critical state-of-the-nation report was released a year ago, which told the Assembly that more action was needed and that a new strategy should be developed by the Welsh Assembly Government to deal with pollution. Can you update Members on the progress of this strategy? What do you feel is the biggest challenge to date in terms of this issue?

**Carwyn Jones:** Pollution control, in terms of operational issues, is a matter for various agencies—the Environment Agency being prime among those. If we consider the improvement in coastal waters, and bathing

**C2 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y llygredd yn nyfroedd arfordirol Cymru? (OAQ38826)

**Carwyn Jones:** Dengys gwaith monitro rheolaidd welliannau sylweddol yn ansawdd dŵr arfordir Cymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a dangoswyd hyn gan y canlyniadau ardderchog a gyhoeddais ddoe o ran dŵr ymdrochi.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn ymddiddori yn y pwnc hwn, Carwyn, fel rhywun sy'n hoff o nofio yn y môr o amgylch Cymru yn ystod misoedd cynhesach y flwyddyn—cevais wers syrffio yn ddiweddar hyd yn oed. Mae llawer o bobl eraill yng Nghymru yn mwynhau dyfroedd ein harfordir at ddibenion hamdden, ac mae'n bwysig gwella safonau. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o weld y gwelliant hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o bobl, gan gynnwys minnau, yn edrych ar y dŵr weithiau pan fydd wedi cyrraedd y safonau uwch hyn ac yn gweld yr ewyn ar y tonnau yn sgleinio fel hylif golchi llestri o hyd. Felly, credaf, fel llawer o bobl eraill, fod angen inni barhau i chwilio am ffyrdd o wella'r safonau hyn ymhellach fyth, o gofio pwysigrwydd dyfroedd ymdrochi o safon yng Nghymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae ein holl ddyfroedd ymdrochi yn cyrraedd y safonau gofynnol Ewropeaidd ac mae 86 y cant yn cyrraedd y safonau uwch. Mae hynny'n cymharu â dim ond 20 y cant 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, golyga hynny fod lle i wella ymhellach, er bod y sefyllfa wedi gwella'n sylweddol yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

**Brynle Williams:** Rhyddhawyd adroddiad beirniadol ar gyflwr y genedl flwyddyn yn ôl, a ddywedodd wrth y Cynulliad fod angen gweithredu ymhellach ac y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddatblygu strategaeth newydd i ymdrin â llygredd. A allwch ddiweddarau Aelodau ar gynnydd y strategaeth hon? Beth yw'r her fwyaf hyd yma o ran y mater hwn, yn eich barn chi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Asiantaethau amrywiol sy'n gyfrifol am reoli llygredd, o ran materion gweithredol—Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw'r prif un. Os ystyriwch y gwelliannau o ran dyfroedd yr arfordir, a dyfroedd

waters in particular, there has been a significant improvement in terms of cleaning up those waters and in ensuring that pollution is minimised. Clearly, we want to do all that we can to ensure that the incidence of pollution is minimised.

ymdrochi yn arbennig, bu gwelliant sylweddol o ran glanhau'r dyfroedd hynny a sicrhau cyn lleied o lygredd â phosibl. Mae'n amlwg ein bod am wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau cyn lleied o lygredd â phosibl.

### **Ymdrin â Gweddillion er Lles yr Amgylchedd Eco-friendly Disposal of Remains**

**Q3 David Melding:** What measures have been taken to encourage and develop eco-friendly methods for the disposal of remains, such as woodland burial or burial at sea? (OAQ38876)

**C3 David Melding:** Pa fesurau sydd wedi'u cymryd i annog a datblygu dulliau eco-gyfeillgar, fel claddu mewn coetir neu gladdu yn y môr, o ymdrin â gweddillion? (OAQ38876)

**Carwyn Jones:** The public should have a realistic choice of funeral arrangements for their relatives. I welcome the increasing range of services available to those who wish their remains to be disposed of through environmentally friendly means. My officials are currently participating in a UK-Government-led review of burial law and of current practice, which is aimed at ensuring that standards of service fulfil the expectations and needs of the public today. Therefore, we will have to consider carefully whether burial law needs to be reformed.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dylai'r cyhoedd gael dewis realistig o drefniadau ar gyfer angladdau eu perthnasau. Croesawaf yr amrywiaeth cynyddol o wasanaethau sydd ar gael i'r rhai sydd am ymdrin â'u gweddillion mewn ffordd eco-gyfeillgar. Ar hyn o bryd, mae fy swyddogion yn cymryd rhan mewn adolygiad o dan arweiniad Llywodraeth y DU o'r gyfraith gladdu ac o arferion presennol, gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod y safonau gwasanaeth yn bodloni disgwyliadau ac yn diwallu anghenion y cyhoedd heddiw. Felly, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus a oes angen diwygio'r gyfraith gladdu.

**David Melding:** That is an encouraging answer, but do you agree that burial remains an eco-friendly option, and has many advantages in terms of the environmental impact, compared to cremation? However, planning authorities will have to be quite flexible if, for example, there are to be further woodland burials. I think that there is quite a large demand for this, but few sites are currently available.

**David Melding:** Mae hynny'n ateb calonogol, ond a gytunwch fod claddu yn parhau i fod yn opsiwn eco-gyfeillgar, a bod ganddo sawl mantais o ran yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd, o'i gymharu ag amlosgi? Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau cynllunio fod yn eithaf hyblyg os bydd rhagor o achosion o gladdu mewn coetir, er enghraifft. Credaf fod galw eithaf mawr am hyn, ond ychydig o safleoedd sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes, that is true. I understand that, in England and Wales, the number of natural burial grounds, as they are called, rose from one in 1993 to 182 in 2003. There are plans at the UK level to undertake a survey of burial grounds provision, and that should give us a better idea of the current provision.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n wir. Deallaf i nifer y claddfeydd naturiol, fel y'u gelwir, yng Nghymru a Lloegr, godi o un yn 1993 i 182 yn 2003. Mae cynlluniau ar lefel y DU i gynnal arolwg o'r ddarpariaeth o gladdfeydd a dylai hynny roi gwell syniad inni o'r ddarpariaeth bresennol.

### **Ymwybyddiaeth Defnyddwyr o Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy Consumer Awareness of Sustainable Development**

**C4 Alun Ffred Jones:** A all y Gweinidog ddisgrifio'i gynlluniau i wneud defnyddwyr yn ymwybodol o ddatblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ38851)

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel ffordd o sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn cael ei ystyried yn bwysig ym mywydau pobl Cymru, yr ydym, ar hyn o bryd, yn datblygu ymgyrch i godi ymwybyddiaeth sy'n seiliedig ar ymchwil ar sut i godi diddordeb y cyhoedd. Yn y cyfamser, yr ydym yn cefnogi ymgyrch bwysig yn y cyfryngau sy'n annog pobl i leihau gwastraff ac ailgylchu mwy.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'n deg dweud bod annealltwriaeth ymhlith y cyhoedd ynghylch ystyr y term 'datblygu cynaliadwy'. Felly, pa gynlluniau penodol sydd gennych i roi gwell dealltwriaeth o ddatblygu cynaliadwy i ddisgyblion ysgol, myfyrwyr a phobl ifanc?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr oedd fforwm ieuencid ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn rhan o'r gynhadledd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a gynhaliwyd yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Mawrth. Mae'n bwysig bod bobl ifanc yn deall pwysigrwydd datblygu cynaliadwy a'u bod yn gallu gweld enghreifftiau ohono yn yr adeilad newydd ac yn rhai o adeiladau newydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, er enghraifft. Felly, maent yn gweld bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn gweithio yn y byd go iawn ac nad yw'n gysyniad hollol ddamcaniaethol.

**John Griffiths:** When considering sustainable development in Wales, we do not want to encourage consumers to gamble more by developing super-casinos under a new gambling Act. What planning powers do you have to keep super-casinos out of Wales?

2.40 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is not a matter to which I have given immediate consideration, although it is right to say that there are planning aspects which the Assembly will need to look at, should legislation legalising larger casinos be passed.

**Lisa Francis:** A superb example of

**Q4 Alun Ffred Jones:** Can the Minister outline his plans for creating consumer awareness of sustainable development? (OAQ38851)

**Carwyn Jones:** In order to ensure that sustainable development is seen as important to the lives of the people of Wales, we are currently developing an awareness campaign based on research on how best to engage the public. In the meantime, we are supporting a major media campaign that encourages people to minimise waste and recycle more.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** It is fair to say that there is a lack of understanding among the public as to the meaning of the term 'sustainable development'. Therefore, what specific plans do you have to give schoolchildren, students and young people a better understanding of sustainable development?

**Carwyn Jones:** A youth forum on sustainable development was held as part of the conference on sustainable development held in Cardiff in March. It is important that young people understand the importance of sustainable development and that they can see examples of it in the new Assembly building and in some of the Environment Agency's new buildings, for example. That way, they can see that sustainable development works in the real world and that it is not just a theoretical concept.

**John Griffiths:** Wrth ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, nid ydym am annog defnyddwyr i gamblo mwy drwy ddatblygu casinos mawr o dan Ddeddf gamblo newydd. Pa bwerau cynllunio sydd gennych i sicrhau na chaiff casinos mawr eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf wedi rhoi ystyriaeth uniongyrchol i'r mater hwn, er ei bod yn gywir dweud bod rhai agweddau cynllunio y bydd angen i'r Cynulliad eu hystyried, os caiff deddfwriaeth yn cyfreithloni casinos mwy ei phasio.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae canolfan Coed-y-Brenin,

sustainable development is the Coed-y-Brenin centre, set up by Forest Enterprise, which provides mountain-bike trails and which has been the forerunner for many other successful trails in Wales. Due to a lack of funding, many rangers who work in facilities such as these may soon be leaving, and future arrangements for the maintenance and development of these highly successful trails may come to an end. What kind of message does this send out to the consumer, in this case the person who uses those mountain-bike trails?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have heard no such complaints about Coed-y-Brenin. If people want to make any individual submissions, please write to me and I will look into the issue further.

**Brian Gibbons:** To follow up on that point, you will be aware from your own experience of the success of the mountain-bike trails in Afan Forest Park and Afan Argoed. There is some concern about the sustainability of these mountain-bike trails, particularly given the tremendous amount of investment that went into establishing them. Could you issue a written statement at some stage on what new role the Forestry Commission, or some other public agency, may play in sustaining these mountain-bike trails?

**Carwyn Jones:** If you write to me, I will consider what needs to be done in terms of whether a written statement should be provided or if this should be part of the Minister's report to committee. If you have encountered difficulties, I will look into them.

a sefydlwyd gan y Fenter Goedwigaeth, sy'n darparu llwybrau beiciau mynydd ac a ragflaenodd sawl llwybr llwyddiannus arall yng Nghymru, yn enghraifft ardderchog o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Oherwydd diffyg arian, efallai y bydd sawl ceidwad sy'n gweithio mewn cyfleusterau o'r fath yn gadael cyn bo hir, ac efallai y bydd trefniadau ar gyfer cynnal a chadw a datblygu'r llwybrau llwyddiannus iawn hyn yn y dyfodol yn dod i ben. Pa fath o neges y mae hyn yn ei chyfleu i'r defnyddiwr, yn yr achos hwn y person sy'n defnyddio'r llwybrau beiciau mynydd hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chlywais unrhyw gwynion o'r fath ynghylch Coed-y-Brenin. Os yw pobl am wneud unrhyw gyflwyniadau unigol, ysgrifennwch ataf ac ymchwiliat ymhellach i'r mater.

**Brian Gibbons:** I ymhelaethu ar y pwynt hwnnw, fe wyddoch o'ch profiad chi eich hun am lwyddiant y llwybrau beiciau mynydd ym Mharc Coedwig Afan ac Afan Argoed. Mae rhywfaint o bryder ynghylch cynaliadwyedd y llwybrau beiciau mynydd hyn, yn arbennig o gofio'r buddsoddiad sylweddol a wnaed i'w sefydlu. A allech gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig rywbryd ar y rôl newydd y gallai'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, neu ryw asiantaeth gyhoeddus arall, ei chwarae i gynnal y llwybrau beiciau mynydd hyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Os ysgrifennwch ataf, ystyriaf yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud o ran a ddylid darparu datganiad ysgrifenedig neu a ddylai hyn fod yn rhan o adroddiad y Gweinidog i'r pwyllgor. Os ydych wedi cael anawsterau, ymchwiliat iddynt.

### **Cynnydd mewn Cynlluniau Ailgylchu Increase in Recycling Schemes**

**Q5 Val Lloyd:** What is the Minister doing to support an increase in recycling schemes across Wales? (OAQ38855)

**Carwyn Jones:** On top of the Wales waste strategy and the money committed to that, local authorities are receiving a sustainable waste grant totalling £21 million in 2004-05, which is being used to roll out local recycling

**C5 Val Lloyd:** Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i gefnogi cynnydd mewn cynlluniau ailgylchu ledled Cymru? (OAQ38855)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn ychwanegol at strategaeth wastraff Cymru a'r arian a neilltuwyd i hynny, caiff awdurdodau lleol gyfanswm grant gwastraff cynaliadwy o £21 miliwn yn 2004-05, a ddefnyddir i gyflwyno

schemes, often in partnership with the community sector, private industry and other local authorities.

**Val Lloyd:** I welcome the Assembly's increased funding for the waste strategy. Sound use of that funding to date allowed the former Labour administration in Swansea to ensure that it became one of the four top performing authorities in Wales. Do you agree that the current administration can learn from that good work, build on the sound foundation left by Labour, and maintain Swansea's position as one of the best performing authorities in terms of recycling in Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** That will be important. The £21 million is part of the waste strategy spend, just to be correct. It is important that local authorities continue to do well where they have done so in the past. It would be disappointing to see any local authority lose momentum over the next few years.

**Janet Davies:** What stage have you reached in progressing arrangements to reuse and recycle 85 per cent of end-of-life vehicles by January 2006?

**Carwyn Jones:** That is currently part of the negotiations with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and we hope that the target will be met. It is important to understand that some of the matters to which you referred are not devolved.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Despite the fact that recycling rates have increased at a marginal annual rate, are you aware that fly-tipping and illegal dumping has risen by 80 per cent in three years? Why have you failed to combat this increasing problem?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not know from where you have got your figures. Recycling has gone from 4 per cent to 15 per cent, which is more than a three-fold increase. In terms of fly-tipping, the Environment Agency has not reported a large increase to me. I would be interested in receiving those figures, if you

cynlluniau ailgylchu lleol, yn aml mewn partneriaeth â'r sector cymunedol, diwydiant preifat ac awdurdodau lleol eraill.

**Val Lloyd:** Croesawaf y cynnydd yn y cyllid a roddir gan y Cynulliad i'r strategaeth wastraff. Yn sgîl defnyddio'r cyllid hwnnw yn ddoeth, gallai'r hen weinyddiaeth Lafur yn Abertawe sicrhau bod yr awdurdod yn un o'r pedwar awdurdod â'r perfformiad gorau yng Nghymru. A gytunwch y gall y weinyddiaeth bresennol ddysgu o'r gwaith da hwnnw, datblygu'r sylfaen gadarn a adawyd gan Lafur, a chynnal statws Abertawe fel un o'r awdurdodau sydd â'r perfformiad gorau o ran ailgylchu yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r £21 miliwn yn rhan o'r gwariant ar y strategaeth wastraff, i fod yn gywir. Mae'n bwysig bod awdurdodau lleol yn parhau i wneud yn dda lle y maent wedi gwneud yn dda yn y gorffennol. Byddai'n siomedig gweld unrhyw awdurdod lleol yn colli momentwm dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

**Janet Davies:** Pa gam yr ydych wedi'i gyrraedd o ran datblygu trefniadau i aildefnyddio ac ailgylchu 85 y cant o gerbydau ar ddiwedd eu bywyd erbyn mis Ionawr 2006?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n rhan o'r negodiadau sy'n mynd rhagddynt gydag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, a gobeithiwn y caiff y targed ei gyrraedd. Mae'n bwysig deall nad yw rhai o'r materion y bu ichi gyfeirio atynt wedi'u datganoli.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Er gwaethaf y ffaith bod cyfraddau ailgylchu wedi cynyddu ar gyfradd flynyddol ymylol, a wyddoch fod tipio a dympio anghyfreithlon wedi codi 80 y cant mewn tair blynedd? Pam nad ydych wedi mynd i'r afael â'r broblem gynyddol hon?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni wn ble y cawsoch eich ffigurau. Mae ailgylchu wedi codi o 4 y cant i 15 y cant, sy'n golygu ei fod wedi mwy na threblu. O ran tipio anghyfreithlon, nid yw Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi fy hysbysu am gynnydd mawr. Byddai diddordeb gennyf gael y ffigurau hynny, pe gallech eu

could provide them to me.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What extra funding is available from your Government to encourage local authorities to recycle? Fly-tipping is a problem—when we go to the countryside, we hear anecdotal evidence and we see it with our own eyes. I saw it only the other day around Rosset—it is quite awful. In Wrexham, for instance, the ‘Recycle with Michael’ scheme only includes 6,000 households. Surely we need to be able to roll that scheme out throughout the borough, particularly to address the vital question of hazardous household waste.

**Carwyn Jones:** Hazardous household waste is a different matter. We are discussing household waste for recycling. It is up to each local authority to identify the best way forward in terms of recycling in its own area. The Wales waste strategy received £70 million, and I announced today in committee that an extra £33 million is being made available for that strategy, which is a substantial amount of money for recycling. The indication is that the targets that we have set, which represent a three-fold increase, are being met, which represents a good return on the substantial investment that has been made.

rhoi imi.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Pa arian ychwanegol sydd ar gael gan eich Llywodraeth i annog awdurdodau lleol i ailgylchu? Mae tipio anghyfreithlon yn broblem—pan awn i gefn gwlad, clywn dystiolaeth anecdotaidd ac fe'i gwelwn gyda'n llygaid ein hunain. Fe'i gwelais ba ddiwrnod o amgylch yr Orsedd—mae'n ofnadwy. Yn Wrecsam, er enghraifft, dim ond 6,000 o gartrefi a gaiff eu cynnwys yn y cynllun 'Ailgylchu gyda Michael'. Onid oes angen inni allu cyflwyno'r cynllun hwnnw ledled y fwrdeistref, yn arbennig i ymdrin â gwastraff cartref peryglus, sy'n fater hanfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae gwastraff cartref peryglus yn fater arall. Trafodwn wastraff cartref i'w ailgylchu. Cyfrifoldeb pob awdurdod lleol unigol yw nodi'r ffordd orau ymlaen o ran ailgylchu yn ei ardal ei hun. Cafodd strategaeth wastraff Cymru £70 miliwn, a chyhoeddais heddiw yn y pwyllgor y neilltuir £33 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y strategaeth honno, sy'n swm sylweddol o arian ar gyfer ailgylchu. Yr arwydd yw bod y targedau a bennwyd gennym, sef cynnydd triphlyg, yn cael eu cyrraedd, sy'n dangos bod y buddsoddiad sylweddol a wnaed yn dwyn ffrwyth.

### Y Diwydiant Llaeth The Milk Industry

**C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ38844)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod y sector llaeth yng Nghymru yn wynebu problemau ar hyn o bryd. Un broblem yw pris llaeth wrth glwyd y fferm, ond, fel y gŵyr Aelodau'r Cynulliad, mater masnachol yw hwn ac ni all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymyrryd. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym strategaeth i ganolbwyntio ar gynorthwyo'r diwydiant i ychwanegu gwerth at y llaeth a gynhyrchwn yng Nghymru drwy ddatblygu cynnyrch sy'n cystadlu ar sail ansawdd yn hytrach na phris, ac sydd wedi ei frandio yn effeithiol. Golyga hynny hefyd fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau y buddsoddir mewn hufenfeydd yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd mae gennym

**Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the milk industry in Wales? (OAQ38844)

**Carwyn Jones:** I recognise that the dairy sector in Wales is facing difficulties at present. One problem is the price of milk at the farm gate, but, as Assembly Members know, this is a commercial matter and the Assembly Government cannot intervene. However, we have a strategy that focuses on assisting the industry to add value to milk produced in Wales by developing products that compete on quality rather than price, and which are branded effectively. That also means that we must ensure investment in Welsh creameries. Currently, there is good news to be shared on this issue.



newyddion da i'w rannu ynglŷn â hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at broblem pris llaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn derbyn bod perthynas ariannol cymhleth rhwng y cynhyrchwyr, y proseswyr a'r gwerthwyr llaeth, ac, yn arbennig, yr archfarchnadoedd, sy'n effeithio ar y pris hwnnw, a'i bod yn anodd dyfalu yn union pwy sydd yn gwneud yr elw mwyaf yn y broses honno—o ran y proseswyr a'r gwerthwyr yn sicr, nid yn gymaint o ran y cynhyrchwyr, fel y gwyddom. A ydych yn rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r angen am ombwdsmon i roi gwybodaeth ac i ddyfarnu mewn materion o'r fath er mwyn ceisio gwneud rhywbeth i egluro'r broses honno?

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddai'n rhaid imi ystyried hynny i weld pa wahaniaeth y byddai ombwdsmon yn ei wneud. Un peth yw dweud bod yn rhaid cael ombwdsmon, ond nid yw'n rhwydd gweld beth yn union y gallai ei wneud o ran edrych ar reoli pris. Un peth yw cael ombwdsmon sy'n ystyried cwynion ynglŷn ag iechyd a llywodraeth leol, ac yn y blaen, ond mae rheoli pris yn wahanol. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, ni welaf y byddai cael ombwdsmon yn effeithiol. Efallai fod pobl yn meddwl ei fod yn beth da, ond, os na fyddai'n effeithiol, nid oes pwynt cael ombwdsmon. Ar hyn o bryd nid oes tystiolaeth y byddai ombwdsmon yn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae nifer o ffermwyr yn mynd allan o fusnes oherwydd pris llaeth wrth glwyd y fferm. Pa gysylltiadau, a phryd, a gawsoch gyda'r archfarchnadoedd ynglŷn â'r pris y maent yn fodlon ei dalu yn y pen draw?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi siarad ag archfarchnadoedd—siaradais â rhai yn ystod y Sioe Frenhinol. Y broblem yw—a gwnaeth Rhodri Glyn y pwynt yn gywir—ei bod yn anodd gweld ym mhle mae'r pwysau'n dod yn y gadwyn yn y farchnad. Mae'n rhaid inni ddatrys hynny, oherwydd ar ddiwedd y dydd mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod digon o laeth yn cael ei gynhyrchu neu bydd yr archfarchnadoedd, yn ogystal â'r proseswyr, mewn trafferthion. Mae'n bwysig dros ben, felly, bod ffermwyr yn cael pris teg, sy'n rhoi bywoliaeth deg iddynt, am eu llaeth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You have referred to the problem of the price of milk. I am sure that you would agree that there is a complex financial relationship between the producers, the processors and the milk sellers, and, especially, the supermarkets. That, in turn, impacts on that price, and it can prove difficult to discover who exactly is making the greater profit in that process—in terms of the processors and sellers certainly, not so much in terms of the producers, as we know. Have you given any consideration to the need for an ombudsman to provide information and to make decisions on such matters so that we can do something to clarify that process?

**Carwyn Jones:** I would have to consider that to see what difference an ombudsman would make. It is one thing to say that we must have an ombudsman, but it is not clear exactly what an ombudsman would be able to do regarding price control. It is one thing to have an ombudsman looking at complaints about health or local government, and so on, but price control is different. Therefore, at present, I do not see that having an ombudsman would be effective. People may think that it would be a good idea, but, if it is not effective, there would be no point in having an ombudsman. At present there is no evidence that an ombudsman would make a difference.

**Alun Cairns:** Many farmers are going out of business because of the farm-gate price of milk. What contacts, and when, have you had with the supermarkets regarding the price that they are ultimately willing to pay?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have spoken to the supermarkets—I spoke to some at the Royal Welsh Show. The problem is—and Rhodri Glyn rightly made the point—that it is difficult to see where the pressure is in the market chain. We must sort this out, because at the end of the day we must ensure that enough milk is produced or the supermarkets, as well as the processors, will be in trouble. It is extremely important, therefore, that farmers get the right price for their milk, giving them a reasonable living.

### **Monitro Awdurdodau Cynllunio Lleol Monitoring Local Planning Authorities**

**Q7 Kirsty Williams:** How does the Assembly Government monitor local planning authorities' compliance with guidance issued from the Assembly? (OAQ38832)

**Carwyn Jones:** This is done through the development plan system. The Assembly Government is a statutory consultee for local planning authorities. The Assembly can raise objections with the local planning authority, which are considered by a planning inspector who makes recommendations to the planning authority after the inquiry process. If necessary, the Assembly has powers to direct on, or call in, plans that do not conform to national policy.

**Kirsty Williams:** Constituents in Brecon and Radnorshire are becoming increasingly concerned over the performance of the planning department of Powys County Council and its apparent inability, in some cases, to follow guidance that is issued from the Assembly, for instance, carrying out environmental surveys on controversial sites. What can you do to reassure my constituents that that planning authority is working properly and is mindful of the guidance issued from the Assembly?

**Carwyn Jones:** Rural planning authorities are, at the outset, responsible to the local communities that elect them. If, however, specific planning applications are put forward that contain facts that would put them at odds with national planning policy, then of course those applications may be liable for call-in.

**C7 Kirsty Williams:** Sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn monitro bod awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn cydymffurfio â chanllawiau a gyhoeddir gan y Cynulliad? (OAQ38832)

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwneir hyn drwy system y cynlluniau datblygu. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn un o'r ymgynghoreion statudol i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol. Gall y Cynulliad godi gwrthwynebiadau gyda'r awdurdod cynllunio lleol, a gaiff eu hystyried gan arolygydd cynllunio sy'n cyflwyno argymhellion i'r awdurdod cynllunio ar ôl y broses ymchwilio. Os bydd angen, mae gan y Cynulliad bwerau i roi cyfarwyddyd ynglŷn â chynlluniau nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio â pholisi cenedlaethol neu i'w galw i mewn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae etholwyr ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn pryderu'n gynyddol ynghylch perfformiad adran gynllunio Cyngor Sir Powys a'i diffyg gallu ymddangosiadol, mewn rhai achosion, i ddilyn canllawiau a gyhoeddir gan y Cynulliad, er enghraifft, cynnal arolygon amgylcheddol ar safleoedd dadleuol. Beth y gallwch ei wneud i sicrhau fy etholwyr bod yr awdurdod cynllunio hwnnw yn gweithio mewn ffordd briodol ac yn ystyried y canllawiau a gyhoeddir gan y Cynulliad?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae awdurdodau cynllunio gwledig yn atebol, yn y lle cyntaf, i'r cymunedau lleol sy'n eu hethol. Fodd bynnag, os cyflwynir ceisiadau cynllunio penodol sy'n cynnwys ffeithiau a fyddai'n golygu eu bod yn gweithredu'n groes i bolisi cynllunio cenedlaethol, yna wrth gwrs efallai y byddai'n rhaid galw'r ceisiadau hynny i mewn.

### **Newidiadau i'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin Modifications to the Common Agricultural Policy**

**C8 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar newidiadau i'r PAC? (OAQ38843)

**Q8 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on modifications to the CAP? (OAQ38843)

2.50 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwyddom y daw'r systemau

**Carwyn Jones:** We know that the new

newydd i rym fis Rhagfyr y flwyddyn nesaf, a chynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad mawr dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr ydym hefyd yn ceisio sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn gwybod beth fydd yn digwydd o ran y system newydd drwy'r cylchgrawn *Gwlad*, er enghraifft, a sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cael y manylion o'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwnaethoch ddatganiad y bore yma ynglŷn â'r gronfa genedlaethol, sy'n dibynnu, fel y'i deallaf, ar lefi o 3 y cant o'r taliad sengl i ffermwyr. Yn ôl yr esboniad a gafwyd y bore yma, mae arian ychwanegol yn dod oddi wrth ffermwyr nad ydynt yn hawlio'r hyn maent yn gymwys i'w gael o dan y gronfa. Ai cynllun Cymru a Lloegr yw hwn, ac a fydd yr arian ychwanegol hwnnw a ddaw o'r arian sydd heb ei hawlio yn cael ei gadw yng Nghymru, neu ei roi ym mhair Prydain neu Gymru a Lloegr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid cynllun Cymru a Lloegr yw'r gronfa, ond cynllun y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer y wladwriaeth gyfan. Fel y soniais y bore yma, nid ydym yn disgwyl y cyfyd sefyllfa lle y bydd ffermwyr yng Nghymru ar eu colled. Bydd digon yn y gronfa i sicrhau y caiff gobeithion ffermwyr yng Nghymru eu diwallu.

### **Amddiffynfeydd rhag Llifogydd Flood Defences**

**Q9 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement regarding flood defences in Wales. (OAQ38878)

**Carwyn Jones:** Following a consultation last year, I am introducing new arrangements for Wales to make flood defence more responsive to the challenges posed by climate changes. I am reorganising flood defence committees and encouraging operating authorities to work more closely together. The Welsh Assembly Government has also made provision in the draft budget for 2005 onwards to help facilitate these changes.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the Welsh Assembly Government's announcement in the draft budget proposals for 2005-06, which indicates a £2.2 million increase in the flood

system comes into force in December next year, and a major consultation has been undertaken over the last year. We are also trying to ensure that farmers know what will happen with the new system via the magazine *Gwlad*, for example, and ensuring that people can obtain the details from the regional offices.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You made a statement this morning about the national reserve, which depends, as I understand it, on a levy of 3 per cent of the single farm payment. According to this morning's explanation, that additional funding is generated when farmers fail to claim their entitlement from the reserve. Is this an England and Wales scheme, and will the additional funding that comes from those unclaimed entitlements be held in Wales or put into the British, or England and Wales, pot?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is not an England and Wales fund, but a United Kingdom scheme for the entire state. As I mentioned this morning, we do not expect a situation to arise whereby farmers in Wales will lose out. The fund will be sufficient to ensure that the aspirations of farmers in Wales are met.

**C9 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ38878)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn dilyn ymgynghoriad y llynedd, cyflwynaf drefniadau newydd ar gyfer Cymru i sicrhau bod amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yn ymateb yn well i'r heriau a osodir gan newidiadau yn yr hinsawdd. Yr wyf yn ad-drefnu'r pwyllgorau atal llifogydd ac yn annog awdurdodau gweithredu i gydweithio'n agosach. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hefyd wedi gwneud darpariaeth yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2005 ymlaen i helpu i hwyluso'r newidiadau hyn.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf gyhoeddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng nghynigion y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2005-06, sy'n nodi cynnydd o £2.2 miliwn yn y

defence capital block grant. This increase over three years, including the Objective 1 match funding, will help the Environment Agency to ensure that work is completed on flood defences in all parts of Wales, including the river Tawe at Pontardawe, in my constituency. Will you confirm that the new flood defence committee will be given adequate resources to assist the Environment Agency to improve its planning and operational efficiency?

**Carwyn Jones:** I can confirm that. The intention is that the new flood defence committee will be directly funded by the Assembly Government, and it will therefore be clear what the arrangements actually are. Our intention is to ensure that, as we have shown in the budget, more money goes to flood defence arrangements.

**William Graham:** Could you outline how the Environment Agency's flood maps will affect existing and proposed housing developments in Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** These, of course, form part of Technical Advice Note (Wales) 15 'Development and Flood Risk' draft planning guidance, of which local authorities must take account. It does not impose a blanket prohibition on development within flood plain areas, but a local authority would have to show overwhelming arguments in favour—particularly economic arguments—and the fact that the flood risk can be managed before allowing a planning application for development on these sites.

grant bloc cyfalaf atal llifogydd. Bydd y cynnydd hwn dros dair blynedd, gan gynnwys yr arian cyfatebol Amcan 1, yn helpu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i sicrhau y gwneir gwaith ar amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys afon Tawe ym Mhontardawe, yn fy etholaeth i. A gadarnhewch y caiff y pwyllgor atal llifogydd newydd ddigon o adnoddau i helpu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i wella ei heffeithlonrwydd o ran cynllunio a materion gweithredol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf gadarnhau hynny. Y bwriad yw y caiff y pwyllgor atal llifogydd newydd ei ariannu'n uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac felly bydd yn amlwg pa drefniadau sydd ar waith mewn gwirionedd. Bwriadwn sicrhau bod mwy o arian yn cael ei wario ar drefniadau atal llifogydd, fel yr ydym wedi'i ddangos yn y gyllideb.

**William Graham:** A allech amlinellu sut y bydd mapiau llifogydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn effeithio ar ddatblygiadau tai presennol ac arfaethedig yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r rhain, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o ganllawiau cynllunio drafft Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 15 'Datblygu a Pherylgl o Lifogydd', y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol eu hystyried. Nid yw'n gosod gwaharddiad llwyr ar ddatblygiadau o fewn ardaloedd gorlifdiroedd, ond byddai'n rhaid i awdurdod lleol ddangos dadleuon cryf o blaid hynny—yn enwedig dadleuon economaidd—a'r ffaith y gellir rheoli perygl llifogydd cyn caniatáu cais cynllunio i ddatblygu ar y safleoedd hyn.

### Pasportau Ceffylau Horse Passports

**Q10 Lorraine Barrett:** Will the Minister make a statement on horse passports in Wales? (OAQ38873)

**Carwyn Jones:** The European Commission decision 2000/68 requires all horses, ponies, donkeys and other equidae in the European Union to have a passport. The draft legislation was subject to scrutiny at the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting today and I intend that

**C10 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar basportau ceffylau yng Nghymru? (OAQ38873)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae penderfyniad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd 2000/68 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod gan bob ceffyl, merlyn, asyn a mathau eraill o geffylau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd basport. Craffwyd ar y ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn

the matter should come back for further scrutiny at the next meeting.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I thank you for meeting me recently to discuss the concerns of the all-party group on animal welfare on horse passports. However, to press you on one issue, can you give an assurance that we will have similar arrangements to those in England, in that horse owners will not be obliged to sign the passport stating whether their horse is fit for human consumption at the early stages of its registration?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is a matter of public record that the current advice to us does not support that. However, we have commissioned further advice from counsel to see whether that advice is justifiable, and to see whether the English provision—if I can call it that—is something that we can consider.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You will be aware, from discussions in committee this morning, that there are grave concerns about the practicalities of the current draft regulations. I appreciate your words this afternoon about seeking further legal advice. In seeking advice, and achieving new-look regulations perhaps, will you reconsider the issue of derogation for certain categories of horses, similar to the derogations granted to the New Forest in England?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes. If we were in a situation where an organisation was willing to manage an area of land which could be delineated, as an area of land that is self-contained or has natural boundaries, it would be a possibility. I am willing to reconsider this, should the situation arise.

**Brynle Williams:** We discussed passports in depth this morning. We have definitely taken a major step. The whole mess demonstrates what is achieved in Europe without consultation, and the effects of what happens in Wales. I am pleased that we are going the right way.

**Carwyn Jones:** Llywydd, I cannot add to that.

Gwlad heddiw a bwriadaf sicrhau y creffir ar y mater ymhellach yn y cyfarfod nesaf.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch ichi am gyfarfod â mi yn ddiweddar i drafod pryderon y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar les anifeiliaid o ran pasportau ceffylau. Fodd bynnag, i bwysio arnoch o ran un mater, a allwch ein sicrhau y bydd gennym drefniadau tebyg i'r rhai a geir yn Lloegr, sef na fydd yn ofynnol i berchnogion ceffylau lofnodi'r pasport i nodi pa un a yw eu ceffyl yn addas i'w fwyta gan bobl yn ystod camau cyntaf ei gofrestrriad?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n hysbys nad yw'r cyngor a roddir inni ar hyn o bryd yn cefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi comisiynu cyngor pellach gan gwmsleriaid i weld a ellir cyfiawnhau'r cyngor hwnnw, ac i weld a yw'r ddarpariaeth Seisnig—os gallaf ei galw'n hynny—yn rhywbeth y gallwn ei ystyried.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe wyddoch, o'r trafodaethau yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, fod pryderon difrifol ynghylch ymarferoldeb y rheoliadau drafft presennol. Gwerthfawrogaf eich geiriau y prynhawn yma ynghylch ceisio cyngor cyfreithiol pellach. Wrth geisio cyngor, a llunio rheoliadau newydd efallai, a fyddwch yn ailystyried rhanddirymiad ar gyfer rhai mathau o geffylau, yn debyg i'r rhanddirymiaid a roddwyd i'r New Forest yn Lloegr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddaf. Pe baem mewn sefyllfa lle yr oedd sefydliad yn fodlon rheoli ardal o dir y gellid ei nodi, fel ardal o dir hunangynhwysol neu sydd â ffiniau naturiol, byddai'n bosiblwydd. Yr wyf yn fodlon ailystyried hynny, pe bai'r sefyllfa yn codi.

**Brynle Williams:** Bu inni drafod pasportau yn fanwl y bore yma. Yr ydym yn sicr wedi cymryd cam mawr. Mae'r llanastr cyfan yn dangos yr hyn a gyflawnir yn Ewrop heb ymgynghori, ac effeithiau'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

**Carwyn Jones:** Lywydd, ni allaf ychwanegu at hynny.

#### Lleihau Tirlenwi

## Reducing Landfill

**Q11 Irene James:** Will the Minister make a statement on action he is taking to reduce levels of landfill in Wales? (OAQ38881)

**C11 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i leihau lefelau tirlenwi yng Nghymru? (OAQ38881)

**Carwyn Jones:** We are taking a number of actions. The landfill allowance scheme, in particular, was launched in Wales on 1 October 2004. The purpose of the scheme is to require waste disposal authorities in Wales to limit the quantities of biodegradable municipal waste that they landfill, in accordance with the allowance of the Assembly Government.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn cymryd nifer o gamau gweithredu. Yn benodol, lanswyd y cynllun lwfans tirlenwi yng Nghymru ar 1 Hydref 2004. Diben y cynllun yw ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau gwaredu gwastraff yng Nghymru gyfyngu ar y swm o wastraff trefol pydradwy y maent yn ei dirlenwi, yn unol â lwfans Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Irene James:** I welcome the extra funding commitments to reduce landfill in Wales, to encourage better waste management schemes, and to assist local authorities and businesses to meet their recycling targets. Do you agree that raising public awareness of recycling schemes, the benefits of recycling, and innovative local community enterprise schemes which, for example, use and reuse furniture and other household equipment, is vital to ensure a cleaner, greener, and more prosperous future for our communities?

**Irene James:** Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol sydd wedi'i ymrwymo i leihau lefelau tirlenwi yng Nghymru, i annog cynlluniau rheoli gwastraff gwell, ac i helpu awdurdodau lleol a busnesau i gyrraedd eu targedau ailgylchu. A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o gynlluniau ailgylchu, manteision ailgylchu, a chynlluniau menter cymunedol lleol arloesol, sydd, er enghraifft, yn defnyddio ac yn ailddefnyddio dodrefn ac offer cartref arall, er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol glanach, gwyrddach a mwy ffyniannus i'n cymunedau?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have seen excellent examples of recycling. The challenge for us is to ensure that the examples that we see in areas such as Islwyn and Caerphilly, and other parts of Wales, are shown as good examples in other parts of Wales so that they can be followed.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi gweld enghreifftiau ardderchog o ailgylchu. Yr her i ni yw sicrhau y caiff yr enghreifftiau a welwn mewn ardaloedd megis Islwyn a Chaerffili, a rhannau eraill o Gymru, eu dangos fel enghreifftiau da mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru fel y gellir eu dilyn.

**Alun Cairns:** One alternative to landfill is recycling. In your earlier flippant answer to Peter Black, you said that the recycling and disposal of hazardous waste is not a devolved matter. Do you not accept that you have a responsibility to at least encourage good practice and make facilities available for the disposal and recycling of hazardous waste?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae ailgylchu yn un o'r dewisiadau amgen yn lle tirlenwi. Yn eich ateb gwamal cynharach i Peter Black, bu ichi ddweud nad yw'r mater o ailgylchu a gwaredu gwastraff peryglus wedi'i ddatganoli. Oni dderbyniwch fod cyfrifoldeb gennych i annog arferion da o leiaf a sicrhau bod cyfleusterau ar gael i waredu ac ailgylchu gwastraff peryglus?

**Carwyn Jones:** Tories believe that a statement of fact is a flippant answer. It is a reality that hazardous waste is not a devolved matter. However, we are looking at an Objective 1 scheme to assist, and there has been tremendous interest in such a scheme.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r Torïaid o'r farn bod datganiad ffeithiau yn ateb gwamal. Mae'n wir nad yw gwastraff peryglus yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn y bydd un o gynlluniau Amcan 1 yn helpu, a bu diddordeb brwd mewn cynllun o'r fath.

**Treulio Anerobig i Drin Gwastraff**  
**Anaerobic Digestion as a Treatment for Waste**

**Q12 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of anaerobic digestion as a treatment for waste? (OAQ38825)

**C12 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dreulio anerobig i drin gwastraff? (OAQ38825)

**Carwyn Jones:** The specific waste grant to local authorities may be used to fund anaerobic digestion projects when materials digested are separately-collected food and green waste, and where they are digested, they are subsequently composted.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gellir defnyddio'r grant gwastraff penodol i awdurdodau lleol i ariannu prosiectau treulio anerobig pan gaiff deunyddiau a dreulir eu casglu ar wahân fel gwastraff bwyd a gwastraff gwyrdd, a lle y cânt eu treulio, cânt eu compostio ar ôl hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** The scheme that you proposed for the collection of dead stock from farms across Wales is unworkable and impractical, and is a bio-security nightmare. Why have you not done more to persuade colleagues in England and Europe that this anaerobic digestive system provides an answer for farmers to deal with this problem on their own farms?

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid yw'r cynllun a gynigiwyd gennych ar gyfer casglu stoc trig o ffermydd ledled Cymru yn weithredadwy nac yn ymarferol, ac mae'n hunllef o ran bioddiogelwch. Pam nad ydych wedi gwneud mwy i ddarbwylllo cyd-aelodau yn Lloegr ac Ewrop bod y system dreulio anerobig hon yn rhoi ateb i ffermwyr ddatrys y broblem hon ar eu ffermydd eu hunain?

**Carwyn Jones:** This is being considered. We wish to take it forward. There are a number of ways in which stock can be disposed, of which the national fallen stock scheme is an example. We are keen to ensure that as many avenues as possible are opened up in the future.

**Carwyn Jones:** Caiff hyn ei ystyried. Yr ydym am ei ddatblygu. Mae nifer o ffyrdd y gellir gwaredu stoc, a mae'r cynllun stoc trig cenedlaethol yn enghraifft o hynny. Yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau y caiff cymaint o lwybrau â phosibl eu hagor yn y dyfodol.

3.00 p.m.

**Brynle Williams:** Following on from Kirsty's questions, we should be considering biodigestors and sealed tanks. As we discussed in committee this morning, the practicalities of dealing with fallen stock, particularly in west Wales make your scheme completely unworkable. Will the Minister throw his weight behind this?

**Brynle Williams:** Yn dilyn cwestiynau Kirsty, dylem fod yn ystyried biodreulwyr a thanciau wedi'u selio. Fel y trafodwyd gennym yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, mae ymarferoldeb ymdrin â stoc trig, yn arbennig yn y Gorllewin, yn gwneud eich cynllun yn gwbl gwbl amhosibl. A wnaiff y Gweinidog bwysu am hyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** I must be careful what I eat from now on, as it seems that my weight has become an issue in the Chamber. My answer to that is the same as the one that I gave to Kirsty Williams.

**Carwyn Jones:** Rhaid imi fod yn ofalus o ran yr hyn yr wyf yn ei fwyta o hyn ymlaen, oherwydd ymddengys bod fy mhwysau yn bwysig yn y Siambr. Rhoddaf yr un ateb â'r un a roddais i Kirsty Williams.

**Atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13**  
**Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.13**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 37.5, agrees to suspend Standing Order No. 6.13, to allow the no named day motion (NNDM2145) tabled on 2 November 2004, to be debated in Plenary on Wednesday 3 November 2004. (NDM2149)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5, yn cytuno i atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 i ganiatáu i'r cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod (NNDM2145) a gyflwynwyd ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, gael ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 3 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2149)*

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n rhaid cael mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid i dderbyn y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** A two-thirds majority vote in favour is needed to carry this motion.

*Cynnig (NDM2149): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2149): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val



Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Penodi Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru Appointment of the Auditor General for Wales**

**Janet Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales recommends Jeremy Colman to the Secretary of State for Wales for appointment as Auditor General for Wales. (NNDM2145)*

This is the unanimous recommendation of the selection panel following an open competition. Mr Colman is currently an assistant auditor general and a member of the senior management board at the National Audit Office. From 2000-01, he was responsible for NAO Wales. I record my thanks to the current auditor general, Sir John Bourn, who has laid a solid foundation for the Wales Audit Office and has set a benchmark for the Auditor General for Wales.

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn argymhell Jeremy Colman i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i'w benodi yn Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. (NNDM2145)*

Dyma argymhelliad unfrydol y panel dethol yn dilyn cystadleuaeth agored. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Mr Colman yn archwilydd cyffredinol cynorthwyol ac yn aelod o'r uwch fwrdd rheoli yn y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. O 2000-01, yr oedd yn gyfrifol am Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru. Cofnodaf fy niolch i'r archwilydd cyffredinol presennol, Syr John Bourn, sydd wedi gosod sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ac sydd wedi pennu meincnod ar gyfer Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru.

*Cynnig (NNDM2145): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NNDM2145): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Fel gweddill yr Aelodau, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio am ei waith ar ein rhan ar y mater hwn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gydweithio gyda'r archwiliwr cyffredinol newydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Like all Members, I am grateful to the Audit Committee for its work on our behalf on this issue, and I look forward to working with the new auditor general.

## Materion sy'n Ymwneud â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd Matters Relating to the European Union

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 4, 8 and 9 in the name of David Melding, amendments 2, 5, 6, 10 and 12 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 3, 7, 11 and 13 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 4, 8 a 9 yn enw David Melding, gwelliannau 2, 5, 6, 10 a 12 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 3, 7, 11 ac 13 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I propose that

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes the contribution made by the Assembly Government to the debate on the EU constitutional treaty and looks forward to playing a full role in the future referendum debate;*

*1. yn croesawu'r cyfraniad a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r ddadl ar gyntundeb cyfansoddiadol yr UE a'i fod yn edrych ymlaen at chwarae rôl lawn yn y drafodaeth sydd i ddod ar y refferendwm;*

*2. recognises the progress made in maintaining the European profile and influence of Wales with European institutions;*

*2. yn cydnabod y cynnydd a wnaed o ran cynnal proffil Ewropeaidd Cymru a'i dylanwad ymhlith y sefydliadau Ewropeaidd;*

*3. welcomes the Assembly Government's intention to make a telling contribution towards the success of the UK EU presidency in 2005; and*

*3. yn croesawu bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud cyfraniad grymus at lwyddiant y DU o ran llywyddiaeth yr UE yn 2005; a*

*4. welcomes the Assembly Government's successful management of the current structural funds programmes, other EU initiatives and its lead in securing the best deal for Wales from the ongoing review of EU regional policy. (NDM2143)*

*4. yn croesawu rheolaeth lwyddiannus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol, mentrau eraill yr UE a'i rôl arweiniol o ran sicrhau y fargen orau i Gymru yn sgîl yr adolygiad sydd ar y gweill o bolisi rhanbarthol yr EU. (NDM2143)*

In introducing this debate today, I will emphasise four main points before referring to the amendments. First, there is widespread support for the constitutional treaty signed in Rome last week. It is good news for Europe because it permits the introduction of the 10 new member states. Without a revision of the constitutional treaty, it would have been difficult to do what I think people overwhelmingly view as something positive for Europe, namely to introduce those additional states.

Wrth gyflwyno'r ddadl hon heddiw, pwysleisiaf bedwar prif bwynt cyn cyfeirio at y gwelliannau. Yn gyntaf, ceir cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r cytundeb cyfansoddiadol a lofnodwyd yn Rhufain yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'n newyddion da i Ewrop am ei fod yn caniatáu cyflwyno'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd. Heb ddiwygio'r cytundeb cyfansoddiadol, byddai wedi bod yn anodd cymryd cam sy'n un cadarnhaol i Ewrop ym marn y mwyafrif llethol o bobl, fe gredaf, sef cyflwyno'r gwladwriaethau ychwanegol hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Can the First Minister clarify on what basis he claims that there is

**Alun Cairns:** A all y Prif Weinidog egluro ar ba sail yr honna fod cefnogaeth gyffredinol

widespread support for the European constitution in Wales and the United Kingdom?

**The First Minister:** It permits something that has been widely supported, namely having 10 additional member states. There is also widespread acceptance of the logic that the constitutional arrangements that work for six, nine or 10 member states would not be sustainable for 25.

Although I do not wish to exaggerate Wales's contribution, we did make a difference. The reference to the regional tier of government that is found in the final text is there because of the joint paper submitted by Peter Hain, on behalf of the Foreign and Commonwealth Office when he was the Minister for Europe, and a great deal of the work was done by the Assembly Government and our officials. It was a joint paper by the Scottish Executive, the Welsh Assembly Government and the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, produced in February 2003. It led to a considerable revision among other European countries of their attitude towards the UK and an acceptance of the new devolved format that we have. Before that, they—and perhaps many Members in the Chamber—did not think that we would ever see such an international conference as that on the constitution treaty, in which there was a paper that had been authored jointly by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, the Welsh Assembly Government and the Scottish Executive, with the Welsh Assembly Government playing a major role. The role of the Committee of the Regions is strengthened in the new treaty. The regional tier governments and assemblies, such as this one, and the UK Parliament now have a yellow-card role in monitoring subsidiarity. If it is intended that something be implemented by a national parliament, the UK Parliament has the right to issue a yellow card; likewise, if it must be implemented by a regional tier of government, we have the right to get involved in the yellow card subsidiarity monitoring procedure.

I will move on to the question of European profile and our influence.

Yr ydym ni, Weinidogion Llywodraeth y

i'r cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n caniatáu rhywbeth y bu cryn gefnogaeth iddo, sef cyflwyno 10 aelod wladwriaeth ychwanegol. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol hefyd y rhesymeg na fyddai'r trefniadau cyfansoddiadol sy'n addas ar gyfer chwech, naw neu 10 aelod wladwriaeth yn gynaliadwy i 25.

Er na hoffwn or-ddweud beth oedd cyfraniad Cymru, fe wnaethom wahaniaeth. Mae'r cyfeiriad at yr haen ranbarthol o lywodraeth a geir yn y testun terfynol wedi'i gynnwys oherwydd y papur ar y cyd a gyflwynwyd gan Peter Hain, ar ran y Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad pan oedd yn Weinidog dros Ewrop, a gwnaed cryn dipyn o'r gwaith gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'n swyddogion. Yr oedd yn bapur ar y cyd gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad, a gynhyrchwyd ym mis Chwefror 2003. Parodd i wledydd eraill yn Ewrop newid eu hagwedd tuag at y DU gryn dipyn a derbyn y fformat datganoledig newydd sydd gennym. Cyn hynny, nid oeddent hwy—ac efallai sawl Aelod yn y Siambr—yn credu y byddem byth yn gweld y fath gynhadledd ryngwladol ag a gynhaliwyd ar y cytundeb cyfansoddiadol, lle y cyflwynwyd papur a oedd wedi'i ysgrifennu ar y cyd gan y Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gweithrediaeth yr Alban, gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn chwarae prif ran. Mae rôl Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau wedi'i hatgyfnerthu yn y cytundeb newydd. Mae gan yr haen ranbarthol o lywodraethau a chynulladau, megis hwn, a Senedd y DU rôl cerdyn melyn bellach o ran monitro sybsidiaredd. Os bwriedir i rywbeth gael ei weithredu gan senedd genedlaethol, mae gan Senedd y DU hawl i roi cerdyn melyn; yn yr un modd, os oes rhaid iddo gael ei weithredu gan haen ranbarthol o lywodraeth, mae gennym hawl i fod yn rhan o'r weithdrefn cerdyn melyn ar gyfer monitro sybsidiaredd.

Symudaf ymlaen at ein proffil a'n dylanwad yn Ewrop.

We, as Assembly Government Ministers,

Cynulliad, wedi cynnal ein record o fod yn bresennol mewn cyfarfodydd o Gyngor Gweinidogion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Yr wyf wedi cynrychioli'r Deyrnas Unedig fel rhan o'r ddirprwyath yng Nghyngor y Gweinidogion—ac wedi'i harwain ambell waith—yn y cyfarfodydd ar bolisi rhanbarthol yn Halkidiki yng Ngroeg yn Ebrill 2003, yn y cyfarfod anffurfiol ar rôl neu bwysigrwydd y rhanbarthau datganoledig yn Rhufain yn Hydref 2003, a hefyd gyda Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, yn y fforwm ar '*cohésion*' ym mis Mai eleni. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r gair gorau am '*cohésion*' achos mae ganddo ystyr mor benodol yn Ffrangeg. Yr oedd 1,000 o bobl yn y fforwm o bob gwlad yn Ewrop, gan gynnwys rhai gwledydd nad ydynt wedi ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd hyd yn hyn, er enghraifft, Bwlgaria, Twrci a Romania.

David, yr ydym wedi cryfhau ein swyddfa ym Mrwsel. Yr ydym yn aelodau blaenllaw o rai cyrff rhyngwladol, er enghraifft, Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau a Chynhadledd Rhanbarthau Ymylol Morol Ewrop. Yr ydym wedi arwyddo memorandwm o ddealltwriaeth gyda Latfia ym mis Mai, y cyntaf gydag unrhyw dalaith neu wlad annibynnol o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a chyda Llydaw yn Ionawr eleni. Ar ôl i'r Llywodraeth newydd ddod i rym yn Llydaw, yr ydym wedi ail arwyddo'r ddogfen gyda'r weinyddiaeth newydd.

O ran llywyddiaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a ddaw i Brydain Fawr yn ail hanner y flwyddyn nesaf, ymgynghorwyd â ni ar y cyfraniad y gall y llywyddiaeth ei wneud. Yr ydym yn gweithio ar lefel wleidyddol ac ar lefel gweision sifil gyda'n cymheiriaid yn Llywodraeth Prydain Fawr. Gwyddom yn sicr am un cyfarfod sydd i'w gynnal yng Nghymru, sef y gynhadledd fawr ar ieuencid a'u cyfraniad hwy i'r broses wleidyddol. Cynhelir y cyfarfod hwnnw yng Nghaerdydd, ac, yn gyfleus, bydd yn digwydd fel rhan o'r dathliadau o ganmlwyddiant Caerdydd fel dinas a'i hanner-canmlwyddiant fel prif ddinas Cymru ym mis Hydref y flwyddyn nesaf. Parhawn i obeithio y cynhelir o leiaf un cyfarfod anffurfiol o Gyngor y Gweinidogion yng Nghymru, ond nid oes sicrwydd ynglŷn â hynny hyd yn hyn.

have maintained our record of being present at the meetings of the European Union's Council of Ministers, and that is important. I have represented the United Kingdom as part of the delegation in the Council of Ministers—and have occasionally been its leader—in the meetings on regional policy in Halkidiki in Greece in April 2003, in the informal meeting on the role or importance of the devolved regions in Rome in October 2003, and also with Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, at the forum on '*cohésion*' in May this year. I am not sure what the most appropriate translation for '*cohésion*' is, because it has such a specific meaning in French. There were 1,000 people at the forum from every European country, including some countries that have not yet joined the European Union, such as Bulgaria, Turkey and Romania.

David, we have strengthened our office in Brussels. We are leading members of some international bodies, for example the Committee of the Regions and the Conference of Peripheral Maritime Regions of Europe. We signed a memorandum of understanding with Latvia in May, the first with an independent state or country within the European Union, and with Brittany in January this year. Following the election of the new Government in Brittany, we resigned the document with the new administration.

On the presidency of the European Union, which will fall to Great Britain in the second half of next year, we were consulted on the contribution that the presidency could make. We are working at a political level and at a civil service level with our counterparts in the Government of Great Britain. We know for certain that one meeting will be held in Wales, namely the major conference on youth and their contribution to the political process. That meeting will be held in Cardiff and, conveniently, it will occur as part of the celebrations of Cardiff's centenary as a city and its fiftieth anniversary as the capital of Wales in October next year. We still hope that at least one informal meeting of the Council of Ministers will be held in Wales, but there is no certainty on that as yet.

On structural funds and the question of EU regional policy up to and after 1 January 2007, we are approaching the end of a remarkable year. In September 2004, only two thirds of the way through the programmes, we have achieved impressive milestones, committing £1 billion in grants to over 2,000 projects, along with the match funding that goes with that £1 billion of Objective 1 and other funds' money. We are talking about £2.4 billion of investment in people, facilities and the other things that will transform the future of the Objective 1 areas of Wales and the other areas that are covered by other regional programmes. We started 2004 with the knowledge that all the targets to avoid the decommitment of European funds, which had been set by the commission in the first half of the 2000-07 programme, had been met. That led to an award of an additional £65.4 million performance reward for us, which gives objective credit to what we have said about the quality of administration of the funds. Likewise, we have successfully come through the mid-term evaluation and reviews of the programmes.

3.10 p.m.

As regards post-2006, we are committed to securing the best deal for Wales from the British Government and Brussels. This will involve long, tortuous and difficult negotiations that will not finish before the end period of the British presidency, in about 12 months' time. They may well continue into 2006, looking at what happened in the run up to the 2000 programme, when it went close to the wire. Ideally, they should be finished by this time next year, so that the whole of 2006 can be spent preparing the programmes for the subsequent period. However, the problem is that the European Commission can publish regulations, but it does not know how much money will be available because the financial perspective is being pushed forward as a separate negotiation, over which the commission has limited control. As the issue of whether or not the funds available will exceed 1 per cent of GDP is ongoing, the commission does not know how much funding is available to spend on structural funds, particularly given

O ran cronfeydd strwythurol a pholisi rhanbarthol yr UE hyd at 1 Ionawr 2007 ac ar ôl hynny, yr ydym yn dynesu at ddiwedd blwyddyn hynod. Ym mis Medi 2004, dim ond dwy ran o dair o'r ffordd drwy'r rhaglenni, yr ydym wedi cyflawni cerrig milltir nodedig, gan neilltuo £1 biliwn mewn grantiau i fwy na 2,000 o brosiectau, ynghyd â'r arian cyfatebol sy'n mynd ochr yn ochr â'r £1 biliwn honno o arian Amcan 1 ac arian o gronfeydd eraill. Yr ydym yn sôn am £2.4 biliwn o fuddsoddiad mewn pobl, cyfleusterau a phethau eraill a fydd yn trawsnewid dyfodol ardaloedd Amcan 1 Cymru a'r ardaloedd eraill sy'n rhan o raglenni rhanbarthol eraill. Ar ddechrau 2004 yr oeddem yn gwybod bod yr holl dargedau i osgoi dadneilltuo cronfeydd Ewropeaidd, a osodwyd gan y comisiwn yn hanner cyntaf rhaglen 2000-07, wedi'u cyflawni. Arweiniodd hynny at ddyfarnu £65.4 miliwn arall yn wobwr perfformiad inni, sy'n rhoi hygyrdded gwrthrychol i'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennym ynglŷn ag ansawdd y weinyddiaeth o'r cronfeydd. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym wedi llwyddo yn y gwerthusiad a'r arolygiadau canol tymor o'r rhaglenni.

O ran y sefyllfa ar ôl 2006, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau'r fargen orau i Gymru oddi wrth Lywodraeth Prydain a Brwsel. Bydd hyn yn golygu negodiadau hir, trofaus ac anodd na ddeuant i ben cyn diwedd cyfnod llywyddiaeth Prydain, ymhenn tua 12 mis. Mae'n ddigon posibl y byddant yn parhau tan 2006, o gofio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y cyfnod cyn dechrau rhaglen 2000, pan gafwyd cytundeb ychydig cyn y terfyn amser. Yn ddelfrydol, dylent fod wedi dod i ben cyn pen blwyddyn, felly bydd modd treulio'r flwyddyn gyfan yn 2006 yn paratoi'r rhaglenni ar gyfer y cyfnod ar ôl hynny. Fodd bynnag, y broblem yw y gall y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gyhoeddi rheoliadau, ond na wŷr faint o arian a fydd ar gael am fod y persbectif ariannol yn cael ei ddatblygu mewn negodiadau gwahanol, nad oes gan y comisiwn fawr ddim rheolaeth drostynt. Oherwydd y parheir i drafod a fydd y cronfeydd sydd ar gael yn mynd dros 1 y cant o CMC, ni wŷr y comisiwn faint o arian fydd ar gael i'w wario ar gronfeydd strwythurol,

the commitments made on the common agricultural policy and the lack of desire to undo the commitments on research and development.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The First Minister explained the background and painted a picture of the situation as he sees it. It is time for him to make it clear where he stands in relation to the 1 per cent repatriation and statistical effect regions. He knows that virtually all of the regions and countries that are not member states back the statistical effect regions. When will the First Minister come out firmly in support of this principle?

**The First Minister:** I have made it absolutely clear that I do not think that the regional objectives that we all share can be achieved with a 1 per cent budgetary ceiling. However, if the 1 per cent budgetary ceiling could be used as a way of renegotiating the CAP agreements made in Copenhagen almost two years ago, I think that we would all give our support. That would be the best possible outcome for the United Kingdom. In the absence of a revision downwards of the CAP commitments, we face a difficult situation. The important point for us is that the public expenditure cover that we need over and above the Barnett formula is equally as important as allocations of structural funds expenditure. I would not really describe it as more of a curse than a blessing, but there is not much to be said about receiving structural fund allocations from Europe without receiving money over and above the Barnett formula, because we would have to dig money out of health and education expenditure in order to spend on European structural funds. I do not think that anyone in our administration would be interested in doing that, so we must continue to persuade the UK Treasury to provide funding over and above the Barnett formula level. Negotiations will continue for a long time.

I turn to the amendments, and make it clear to the opposition that these numerous amendments are flaccid and mean very little. The opposition has accepted that we have exceeded its expectations, but it cannot get out of the mode of trying to spread doom, gloom, despondency, disruption and diminution. We have done far better than the

yn enwedig o gofio'r ymrwymiadau a wnaed ynglŷn â'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin a'r anfonlonrwydd i dynnu'n ôl yr ymrwymiadau o ran gwaith ymchwil a datblygu.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi esbonio'r cefndir ac wedi disgrifio'r sefyllfa fel y gwêl ef hi. Mae'n bryd iddo egluro beth yw ei farn ar ailwladoli 1 y cant a'r rhanbarthau effaith ystadegol. Gwyr fod bron pob rhanbarth a gwlad nad ydynt yn aelod wladwriaethau yn cefnogi'r rhanbarthau effaith ystadegol. Pryd y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn mynegi'n glir ei gefnogaeth i'r gwyddor hon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn hollol glir na ellir, yn fy marn i, gyflawni'r amcanion rhanbarthol a rennir gennym ni oll gyda nenfwd cyllideb o 1 y cant. Fodd bynnag, pe gellid defnyddio'r nenfwd cyllidebol o 1 y cant fel ffordd o ailnegodi'r cytundebau PAC a wnaed yn Copenhagen bron dwy flynedd yn ôl, credaf y byddem oll yn cefnogi hynny. Hynny fyddai'r canlyniad gorau posibl i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Os na chaiff ymrwymiadau'r PAC eu diwygio ar i lawr, wynebwn sefyllfa anodd. Y pwynt pwysig i ni yw bod y sicrwydd o wariant cyhoeddus sydd ei angen arnom yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett yr un mor bwysig â dyraniadau o wariant cronfeydd strwythurol. Ni fyddwn yn ei ddisgrifio'n fwy o felltith na bendith mewn gwirionedd, ond nid oes fawr ddiben mewn derbyn dyraniadau o gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop heb gael arian yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid inni ddod o hyd i arian o wariant iechyd ac addysg er mwyn gwario ar gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop. Ni chredaf y byddai neb yn ein gweinyddiaeth am wneud hynny, felly rhaid inni barhau i geisio darbwyllo Trysorlys y DU i roi arian yn ychwanegol at arian fformiwla Barnett. Bydd y negodiadau yn parhau am amser hir eto.

Trof at y gwelliannau, a hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir i'r gwrthbleidiau mai llipa a diystyr bron yw'r gwelliannau niferus hyn. Mae'r gwrthbleidiau wedi derbyn ein bod wedi gwneud yn well nag yr oeddent wedi ei ddisgwyl, ond ni allant beidio â cheisio lledu drwgargoelion ac anobaith gan amharu a bychanu. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yn llawer

opposition parties expected, and the £65 million is objective evidence of this fact. However, they cannot bring themselves to support our achievements. This is why we cannot bring ourselves to support any of the useless amendments.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: delete all in point 1 and replace with:

*welcomes the decision to hold a referendum on the EU constitutional treaty.*

I propose amendment 4. Delete all in point 2 and replace with:

*recognises the need to establish a strong Welsh profile, and deplores the omission of Wales from the recent Eurostat map.*

I propose amendment 8. Add at the end of point 3:

*and calls upon the Assembly Government to bring forward details of that intended contribution for debate in the National Assembly for Wales.*

I propose amendment 9. Delete point 4 in its entirety and replace with:

*regrets the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to make full use of the current structural funds programmes and other EU initiatives and regrets its failure to take a lead in securing Wales' interest in future EU regional policy.*

The First Minister's speech was far better when he concentrated on the section prepared by his research unit. The stand-up routine at the end was distinctly funny, but it departed seriously from the truth.

No-one is a stronger supporter of the European Union than me and, indeed, my party. *[Laughter.]*

Labour Members may well laugh, but, in all of our political lives, only two parties have

gwell nag yr oedd y gwrthbleidiau wedi ei ddisgwyl ac mae'r £65 miliwn yn dystiolaeth wrthrychol o'r ffaith hon. Fodd bynnag, ni allant yn eu byw gefnogi'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym. Dyna pam na allwn gefnogi unrhyw un o'r gwelliannau diddim.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: dileu popeth ym mhwynt 1 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn croesawu'r penderfyniad i gynnal refferendwm ar gytundeb cyfansoddiadol yr UE.*

Cynigaf welliant 4. Dileu popeth ym mhwynt 2 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn cydnabod yr angen i sefydlu proffil amlwg i Gymru, ac yn gresynu at y ffaith bod Cymru wedi'i hepgor o fap Eurostat yn ddiweddar.*

Cynigaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 3:

*ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fanylu ar y cyfraniad y bwriedir ei wneud er mwyn i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fedru cynnal dadl yn ei gylch.*

Cynigaf welliant 9. Dileu popeth ym mhwynt 4 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu â manteisio i'r eithaf ar raglenni cyfredol y cronfeydd strwythurol ac ar fentrau eraill yr UE ac yn gresynu at y ffaith ei bod wedi methu â dangos arweiniad wrth ddiogelu buddiannau Cymru ym mholisi rhanbarthol yr UE yn y dyfodol.*

Yr oedd araith y Prif Weinidog yn llawer gwell pan ganolbwyntiodd ar y rhan a baratowyd gan ei uned ymchwil. Yr oedd y sylwadau comedi'aid ar y diwedd yn ddoniol dros ben, ond ymhell iawn o'r gwirionedd.

Nid oes neb yn cefnogi'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn fwy brwd na minnau ac, yn wir, fy mhlaidd. *[Chwerthin.]*

Mae'n ddigon hawdd i Aelodau Llafur chwerthin, ond, yn ystod ein bywydau



suggested pulling out of Europe—the UK Independence Party and the Labour Party. At least one of those is not a serious political party, but it may be true of both. Like the Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru, we have always believed that Europe is a good thing.

**Leighton Andrews:** What about the 1950s?

**Nick Bourne:** I am willing to give way to the Member for Rhondda if he has something serious to contribute.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is not true that your party has always been a supporter of the European Union. If you look back through your party's history since the European coal and steel community was founded, your party has not always supported it.

**Nick Bourne:** I said 'in all of our political lives', but, as you will recall, the Macmillan and the Wilson Governments sought membership of the European Union, and the only political leader to ever seriously suggest coming out of it was Michael Foot. You have experience of the Liberal Democrats and of the Labour Party; you obviously do not have enough experience of the Conservative Party.

I support a European Union of 25 members and the new members who are waiting to join, namely Bulgaria, Romania and Croatia. I also support Turkey's ultimately joining as a member as that would be good for Europe. We are looking to a confederation of states. However, being in favour of Europe as a concept does not mean that we have to support everything that comes from Europe. I disagreed vehemently with the First Minister when he talked about widespread support for the European constitution. I do not know where he has been but, clearly, there is not widespread support in Britain—you only have to consider the polls and the nervousness of the Prime Minister in calling a referendum. We are not to have a pre-legislative referendum as we did on the National Assembly for Wales, and we know why: it is because if he is still in power—and that is a big 'if'—the Prime Minister wants the referendum to take place on the other side

gwleidyddol ni, dim ond dwy blaidd sydd wedi awgrymu gadael Ewrop—Plaid Annibyniaeth y DU a'r Blaidd Lafur. Mae o leiaf un o'r rhain heb fod yn blaidd wleidyddol ddifrifol, ond efallai fod hynny'n wir am y ddwy. Fel y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaidd Cymru, yr ydym bob amser wedi credu mai peth da yw Ewrop.

**Leighton Andrews:** Beth am y 1950au?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ildio i'r Aelod dros y Rhondda os yw am wneud cyfraniad difrifol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Nid yw'n wir bod eich plaid wedi cefnogi'r Undeb Ewropeaidd erioed. Os edrychwch yn ôl ar hanes eich plaid ers sefydlu'r gymuned glo a dur Ewropeaidd, nid yw eich plaid bob amser wedi'i gefnogi.

**Nick Bourne:** Dywedais 'yn ystod ein bywydau gwleidyddol ni', ond fel y cofiwch, ceisiodd Llywodraethau Macmillan a Wilson ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, a'r unig arweinydd gwleidyddol a awgrymodd o ddifrif y dylem ei adael oedd Michael Foot. Mae gennych brofiad o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaidd Lafur; mae'n amlwg nad oes gennych ddigon o brofiad o'r Blaidd Geidwadol.

Cefnogaf Undeb Ewropeaidd a chanddo 25 o aelodau a'r aelodau newydd sy'n aros i ymuno, sef Bwlgaria, Romania a Chroatia. Yr wyf yn gefnogol hefyd i gais Twrci i ddod yn aelod yn y pen draw gan y byddai hynny yn fuddiol i Ewrop. Yr ydym yn disgwyl cydffederasiwn o wladwriaethau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw bod o blaidd Ewrop fel cysyniad yn golygu bod yn rhaid inni gefnogi popeth a ddaw o Ewrop. Llwyf anghytunais â'r Prif Weinidog pan soniodd am y gefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd. Ni wn ble y bu'n ddiweddar ond, yn amlwg, nid oes cefnogaeth gyffredinol ym Mhrydain—nid oes ond angen edrych ar yr arolygon barn a nerfusrwydd Prif Weinidog y DU wrth alw am refferendwm. Ni chawn refferendwm cyn llunio'r ddeddfwriaeth, fel y cawsom ar Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a gwyddom y rheswm dros hynny: os bydd Prif Weinidog y DU yn dal mewn grym—ac mae cryn

of the general election, for reasons that are all too clear. I heard the First Minister on the radio on Friday. There is doubt about whether we would have this referendum if other states vote 'no'. If the gallant Estonia says 'no' to the European constitution, Jack Straw has said that all sorts of things are possible, indicating that we may have a referendum and we may not. The Prime Minister had previously said that we would. When pressed on the radio on the question of whether we would have a referendum, the First Minister said—paraphrasing Sam Goldwyn of Metro-Goldwyn-Meyer—that the answer is a 'definite maybe'. Perhaps he would clarify that when he speaks later, as there is doubt on it.

Whatever your views on the constitution, it has massive implications, and it is only because of Conservative Party pressure that the Prime Minister conceded a referendum. An EU with a new president, a foreign minister, a diplomatic service and an EU that turns the European Court of Justice into a kind of Supreme Court and which deals with the areas of criminal justice, asylum, immigration, energy, trade, social security and civil rights would have much greater influence, and it takes integration too far. That point of view will be put in the debate on the European constitution, and it will be settled by the people.

On the Welsh profile, we believe that the omission of Wales from the Eurostat map was, in many ways, symbolic. We have not made the impact there that we could have made. As the First Minister said, he spoke at the cohesion forum, but all opposition leaders felt—and he will know this—that he did not put a powerful case for Wales and for Welsh regional funding. We had a classic opportunity there, but it was not seized.

I hope that we make use of the European Union presidency in Wales. The youth parliament and youth involvement idea is a good one, but we also need to use this as a platform to ensure that we get a fair deal

amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny—mae am i'r refferendwm gael ei gynnal ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, am resymau amlwg iawn. Clywais y Prif Weinidog yn siarad ar y radio ddydd Gwener. Mae ansicrwydd a gaiff y refferendwm hwn ei gynnal os bydd gwladwriaethau eraill yn pleidleisio 'na'. Os bydd gwrol Estonia yn dweud 'na' i'r cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd, mae Jack Straw wedi dweud bod pob math o bethau yn bosibl, gan awgrymu y cawn refferendwm ac efallai na chawn. Dywedasai Prif Weinidog y DU cyn hynny y byddem yn cael refferendwm. Pan bwyswyd ar y Prif Weinidog ar y radio i ddweud a fyddem yn cael refferendwm ai peidio, dywedodd—gan aralleirio Sam Goldwyn o Metro-Goldwyn-Meyer—mai '*definite maybe*' yw'r ateb. Efallai y bydd yn egluro hynny ymhellach pan fydd yn siarad yn diweddarach, gan fod amheuaeth ynghylch y mater hwn.

Beth bynnag fo'ch barn am y cyfansoddiad, mae iddo oblygiadau mawr, a dim ond oherwydd pwysau'r Blaid Geidwadol y cytunodd Prif Weinidog y DU i gynnal refferendwm. Byddai UE gyda llywydd newydd, gweinidog tramor, gwasanaeth diplomataidd ac UE sy'n troi Llys Cyfiawnder Ewrop yn fath o Oruchaf Lys ac sy'n ymdrin â meysydd cyfiawnder troseddol, lloches, mewnfudo, ynni, masnach, nawdd cymdeithasol a hawliau sifil yn cael llawer mwy o ddylanwad, ac mae'n ormod o integreiddio. Caiff y safbwynt hwnnw ei fynegi yn y ddadl ar y cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd, a'r bobl fydd yn penderfynu.

O ran proffil Cymru, credwn fod y ffaith i Gymru gael ei hepgor o fap Eurostat, yn symbolaidd, ar sawl cyfrif. Nid ydym wedi gwneud yr argraff yno y gallem fod wedi'i gwneud. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, soniodd am y fforwm cydlyniant, ond teimlodd pob un o arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau—a gŵyr hyn—na roddodd ddadl gref dros Gymru a thros wariant rhanbarthol i Gymru. Cawsom gyfle rhagorol yno, ond ni fanteisiwyd arno.

Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn bachu ar y cyfle i ddefnyddio llywyddiaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru. Mae'r syniad o senedd i'r ieuenctid a chynnwys pobl ifanc yn un da, ond mae angen hefyd inni ei

from regional funding. I welcome the First Minister's response on what we will do to ensure that we signal that clearly during the UK presidency, as this issue will probably still be on the back burner when we have that UK presidency.

On structural funds and EU regional policy, I did not recognise the description of the success of Objective 1. It has been bureaucratic, slow and often chaotic. The gap in gross domestic product per head has widened from 80.2 per cent to 78.8 per cent. Those are official figures. There is disparity between east and west Wales in terms of employment rates, inactivity rates and average earnings. Job creation has taken place at a greater rate outside the Objective 1 region. Therefore, there are clear warnings that there has not been effective engagement with the private sector. The process has been too bureaucratic, and we have not learned from the experience of Ireland and Finland. Those are the serious reservations that we have, hence our amendments.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: dileu popeth ym mhwynt 1 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl ar gytundeb cyfansoddiadol yr UE ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i chwarae rhan lawn yn y ddadl am y refferendwm y bwriedir ei chynnal yn y dyfodol.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ym mhwynt 2, ar ôl 'cydnabod y', ychwanegu'r gair 'diffyg'.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Dileu popeth ym mhwynt 3 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i wella proffil Cymru a thynnu sylw at faterion sy'n uniongyrchol berthnasol i Gymru yn ystod Llywyddiaeth y DU yn 2005.*

Cynigiau welliant 10. Dileu popeth ym mhwynt 4 a rhoi'r pwynt a ganlyn yn ei le:

*yn condemnio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am ei*

defnyddio fel llwyfan i sicrhau ein bod yn cael bargaen deg o ran cyllid rhanbarthol. Croesawaf ymateb y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r hyn y byddwn yn ei wneud i sicrhau ein bod yn tynnu sylw at hyn yn ystod llywyddiaeth y DU, gan y bydd y mater hwn yn dal yn y cefndir siŵr o fod adeg llywyddiaeth y DU.

O ran cronfeydd strwythurol a pholisi rhanbarthol yr UE, nid oedd y disgrifiad o lwyddiant Amcan 1 yn taro tant gyda mi. Bu'n fiwrocraidd, yn araf ac yn aml yn ddryslyd. Mae'r bwlch yng nghynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen wedi cynyddu o 80.2 y cant i 78.8 y cant. Dyna'r ffigurau swyddogol. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng y Dwyrain a'r Gorllewin o ran cyfraddau cyflogaeth, cyfraddau anweithgarwch ac enillion cyfartalog. Mae mwy o swyddi wedi cael eu creu y tu allan i ranbarth Amcan 1. Felly, mae rhybuddion amlwg na fu ymgysylltu effeithiol â'r sector preifat. Bu'r broses yn rhy fiwrocraidd ac nid ydym wedi dysgu o brofiad Iwerddon a'r Ffindir. Dyna'r amheuan difrifol sydd gennym, a dyna'r rheswm dros ein gwelliannau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: delete everything in point 1 and replace with:

*regrets the lack of a contribution made by the Assembly Government to the debate on the EU constitutional treaty and calls on the Government to play a full role in the future referendum debate.*

I propose amendment 5. In point 2, after 'recognises the' insert the words 'lack of'.

I propose amendment 6. Delete everything in point 3 and replace with:

*calls on the Assembly Government to raise the profile of Wales, and issues of immediate relevance to Wales, during the UK Presidency in 2005.*

I propose amendment 10. Delete everything in point 4, and replace with:

*condemns the Assembly Government for its*

*methiannau wrth reoli rhaglen gyfredol y cronfeydd strwythurol, ei methiant i sicrhau cyllid cyfatebol oddi wrth Drysorlys y DU a'i diffyg arweiniad yn ystod y trafodaethau a fydd yn arwain at gylch nesaf y cronfeydd strwythurol, ac yn galw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i gefnogi cynigion y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn hytrach na rhai Trysorlys y DU.*

*failures in managing the current structural funds programme, its failure to secure adequate matching funds from the UK Treasury and its lack of leadership during the negotiations leading to the next round of structural funds, and calls on the First Minister to back the European Commission's proposals rather than those put forward by the UK Treasury.*

Cynigiad welliant 12. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 12. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn derbyn mai dim ond pan fydd ganddi senedd go iawn y bydd Cymru'n gallu gwella ei pherthynas ag Ewrop yn sylweddol a sicrhau bod ganddi broffil uwch a mwy o ddylanwad.*

*accepts that Wales can only substantially improve its relationship with Europe and increase its profile and influence when it secures a proper parliament.*

Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at y gwelliannau a rhaid i minnau hefyd gyfeirio at bedwar pwynt y cynnig hwn sy'n hynod o hunanfodlon ac yn organmoliaethus. Os yw'r Llywodraeth am ddisgrifio'i hun yn y modd hwnnw, yna bai'r Llywodraeth yw bod y gwelliannau wedi cael eu cyflwyno, ac yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y drafodaeth yn ategu hynny hefyd.

I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate. The First Minister referred to the amendments and I must also refer to the four points that make up this motion, which are extremely arrogant and self-aggrandising. If the Government describes itself in that way, then it is the Government's fault that the amendments have been tabled, and I am confident that the debate will also support that.

3.20 p.m.

Mae nifer o broblemau yn codi yn sgîl agwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac felly perthynas Cymru ag Ewrop. Nid wyf am sôn yn benodol am y cyfansoddiad, ond gobeithiaf, os caiff Janet Davies gyfle i siarad, y bydd yn amlinellu ein safbwynt ni ar hynny. Symudaf felly at broffil Cymru a'i dylanwad, a'n perthynas ni â'r sefydliadau Ewropeaidd. Yn anffodus, nid ydym yn derbyn gwybodaeth fel y dylem ynglŷn â beth yn union mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud mewn perthynas â sefydliadau Ewropeaidd. Gwn ein bod yn derbyn rhestr perthnasol bob tro y mae'r Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yn cyfarfod yn y Cynulliad, ond yn aml, nid oes gennym lawer o syniad pa mor effeithiol yw'r Gweinidogion pan ymwelant â sefydliadau Ewropeaidd.

A number of problems arise as a result of the Welsh Assembly Government's attitude and therefore Wales's relationship with Europe. I will not refer specifically to the constitution, but I hope, if Janet Davies has an opportunity to speak, that she will outline our position on that. I move therefore to Wales's profile and influence, and our relationship with the European institutions. Unfortunately, we do not receive information as we should on exactly what the Assembly Government is doing in relation to European institutions. I know that we receive a relevant list each time the Committee on European and External Affairs meets in the Assembly, but we often do not have much of an idea how effective Ministers are when they visit European institutions.

Nid wyf yn ymwybodol chwaith o beth yn union y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cyfeirio ato pan sonia am ein cyfraniad i'r ddadl ar y

I am not aware either of what exactly the First Minister is referring to when he talks about our contribution to the debate on the

cyfansoddiad. Derbyniaf ein bod wedi cael rhywfaint o ddylanwad ar gynnwys y cyfansoddiad, ond mewn realiti, ychydig iawn o ddylanwad y mae'r rhanbarthau wedi'i gael ar hyn, a dyna pam mae rhai rhanbarthau yn Ewrop yn dal yn bryderus ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod y cyfansoddiad o bosibl yn gorganoli grym. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio hynny ar yr ymylon.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi sôn heddiw am ddyfodol y cronfeydd strwythurol, a gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau ar hynny cyn diwedd fy nghyfraniad. Yr ydym wedi cyfeirio lawer gwaith—a synnais na chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at hyn heddiw—at bwysigrwydd secondio gweision sifil y Cynulliad, a phobl sy'n gweithio yn y maes Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru, i weithio nid yn unig yn y sefydliadau Ewropeaidd, ond yn swyddfa UKREP hefyd. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod dylanwad Cymru yn cael ei weld nid yn unig ar y lefel weinidogol, ond hefyd ar lefel swyddogion. Yn aml, mae'r hysbysrwydd a ddaw o Ewrop yn dibynnu ar y math o ddylanwad sydd gan swyddogion y ddau sefydliad pwysig hwnnw.

Gofynnaf hefyd i'r Prif Weinidog adrodd i'r Cyfarfod Llawn, o bryd i'w gilydd, ar y cyfarfodydd a fynychir gan Weinidogion yn y sefydliadau Ewropeaidd. Braff fyddai cael clywed pa ddylanwad y mae Gweinidogion wedi'i gael ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yno, boed hynny ym maes amaethyddiaeth, addysg neu beth bynnag.

Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at y cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae problemau wedi bodoli ynglŷn â rheoli'r rhaglenni presennol, a rhaid i'r Prif Weinidog gydnabod hynny. Derbyniwn fod arian ychwanegol wedi dod ar ben Barnett, a chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at hynny, ond y mae ef hefyd yn gwybod y rheswm am hynny, sef y ffaith bod Alun Michael wedi colli'i swydd.

Nid oes digon o arian wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer arian cyfatebol. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog, ond mae nifer o bobl yn dal i ddatgan bod diffyg arian cyfatebol yn eu rhwystro rhag cyflwyno prosiectau. Fel y cyfeiriodd Nick Bourne yn gynharach, nid ydym wedi gweld effaith y cronfeydd strwythurol ar lefelau cynnyrch mewnwladol

constitution. I accept that we have had some influence on the content of the constitution, but in reality, the regions have had little influence on this, and that is why many regions in Europe are still concerned that the constitution is over-centralising power. It is important to emphasise that on the periphery.

We have also mentioned today the future of the structural funds, and I will make a few comments on that before the end of my contribution. We have referred on several occasions—and I am surprised that the First Minister did not refer to this today—to the importance of seconding civil servants from the Assembly, and people who work in the European field in Wales, to work not only in the European institutions, but also in the UKREP office. It is crucial that Wales's influence is seen not only at ministerial level, but also at an official level. Often, the intelligence which comes from Europe depends upon the kind of influence that officials have in those two important institutions.

I also ask the First Minister to report to Plenary, from time to time, on the meetings that Ministers attend in the European institutions. It would be nice to hear what influence Ministers have on what happens there, be that in the field of agriculture, education or whatever.

I refer specifically to the structural funds. Problems have existed with regard to managing the current programmes, and the First Minister must acknowledge that. We accept that additional funding has been given over and above Barnett, and the First Minister referred to that, but he also knows the reason for it, namely the fact that Alun Michael lost his job.

Not enough money has been allocated for match funding. I heard what the First Minister said, but many people are still saying that the lack of match funding prevents them from submitting projects. As Nick Bourne said earlier, we have not seen the impact of structural funds on gross domestic product levels, as we had hoped.

crynswth, fel yr oeddem wedi gobeithio. Nid yw'r cynnydd yn lefelau CMC wedi digwydd fel yr awgrymodd y Llywodraeth hon. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r lefelau CMC wedi gostwng ers 1995 ac 1999. Soniasom ddoe am gyrraedd 90 y cant erbyn 2010, ond byddai hynny'n amhosibl o dan y sefyllfa bresennol.

I refer briefly to the debate about the future of structural funds. It is important that the First Minister provides leadership and a commentary on the situation regarding the debate in Europe. Does he support the commission's proposals with regard to the budget and in terms of statistical effect regions? There is no doubt that Wales would benefit if we accept the commission's proposals. Wales will not benefit if we simply hang onto the coat-tails of the Treasury and the Department of Trade and Industry in London. Over many years, our experience has been that if you follow the Treasury's or DTI's line, Wales does not benefit. The commission's proposals are by far the better proposals for Wales. I hope that, at the end of this debate, the First Minister will give Wales the leadership that it deserves.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: in point 1, delete the word 'government'.

I propose amendment 7. Delete point 3 and replace with:

*believes the Assembly Government should make a telling contribution towards the success of the UK EU presidency in 2005 by taking the lead in securing the best deal for Wales from the ongoing review of EU regional structural policy.*

I propose amendment 11. Delete all of point 4 and replace with:

*calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that the return from the present round of European structural funds is maximised.*

I propose amendment 13. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

The increase in GDP levels has not occurred as this Government suggested would be the case. In fact, GDP levels have fallen since 1995 and 1999. We referred yesterday to achieving 90 per cent by 2010, but that would be impossible under the current circumstances.

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at y ddadl ynglŷn â dyfodol cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae'n bwysig bod y Prif Weinidog yn rhoi arweiniad ac esboniad ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa o ran y ddadl yn Ewrop. A yw'n cefnogi cynigion y comisiwn o ran y gyllideb ac o ran y rhanbarthau effaith ystadegol? Nid oes amheuaeth y byddai Cymru ar ei hennill pe baem yn derbyn cynigion y comisiwn. Ni fydd Cymru ar ei hennill os ydym yn dal gafael yng nghwt y Trysorlys a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn Llundain. Dros flynyddoedd lawer, yr ydym wedi dysgu, os dilynweh y Trysorlys neu'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, nad oes dim manteision i Gymru. Cynigion y comisiwn yw'r cynigion gorau i Gymru o bell ffordd. Gobeithiaf, ar ddiwedd y ddadl hon, y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn rhoi'r arweiniad y mae Cymru yn ei haeddu.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: ym mhwynt 1: dileu'r gair 'Lywodraeth'.

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Dileu pwynt 3 a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn credu y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud cyfraniad grymus at lwyddiant y DU o ran llywyddiaeth yr UE yn 2005 gan ymgymryd â rôl arweiniol o ran sicrhau y fargen orau i Gymru yn sgîl yr adolygiad sydd ar y gweill o bolisi rhanbarthol yr UE.*

Cynigiaf welliant 11. Dileu pwynt 4 a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn galw ar i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau y manteisir i'r eithaf ar yr hyn sy'n deillio o gylch presennol y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 13. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Government to explain why European structural funding lines continue in the budget at a flatline, after the present structural fund period has ended.*

We are faced with a report on where we have come from and on where we are going. The European debate is increasingly about the future, as much as the past. I welcome the First Minister's remarks on the EU constitution, because this is a major issue that we will face and I welcome the opening up of that debate and its importance for Wales.

Improving how the EU works is good for Wales and is bound to be good for the EU. The new constitution will streamline decision-making procedures, which must be done, given an enlarged Europe of 25 member states. It will sensibly consolidate the existing treaties. For those who did not want a new constitution, consider the existing treaties and how they would fail to meet the needs and demands of not only of the twenty-first century, but also the increased number of member states.

Importantly, the new constitution will increase the openness and accountability of EU institutions. It will also require the European Council of Ministers to sit in public for the first time. That is a substantive change. The Scottish Parliament's European committee receives regular detailed reports from the Council of Ministers on the issues discussed by it. The openness proposed in the constitution should also apply here in terms of how the Assembly conducts its business. I am sure that all Members would welcome that, and the First Minister may wish to take that on board.

**Glyn Davies:** Your party often prides itself on liking referenda. Are you in favour of holding a referendum on the EU constitution? Do you agree that that referendum should take place soon and

*yn galw ar i'r llywodraeth esbonio pam y mae llinellau'r cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn y gyllideb yn dal ar linell wastad ar ôl i gyfnod presennol y cronfeydd strwythurol ddod i ben.*

Mae adroddiad o'n blaen ar y sefyllfa a fu a'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol. Mae a wnelo'r ddadl Ewropeaidd yn fwyfwy â'r dyfodol, yn lle'r gorffennol. Croesawaf sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog ar gyfansoddiad yr UE, am fod hwn yn fater pwysig y byddwn yn ei wynebu a chroesawaf y cam i ehangu'r ddadl honno a'i phwysigrwydd i Gymru.

Bydd gwella'r ffordd y mae'r UE yn gweithio yn fuddiol i Gymru a rhaid ei bod yn fuddiol i'r UE. Bydd y cyfansoddiad newydd yn symleiddio'r gweithdrefnau gwneud penderfyniadau, rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid ei wneud, o gofio y bydd Ewrop wedi'i hehangu i 25 o aelod wladwriaethau. Bydd yn cydgrynhoi'r cytundebau sy'n bodoli eisoes mewn ffordd synhwyrol. I'r rhai nad oeddent am gael cyfansoddiad newydd, ystyriwch y cytundebau presennol a'r ffordd y byddent yn methu â diwallu anghenion a bodloni gofynion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, heb sôn am y nifer gynyddol o aelod wladwriaethau.

Mae'n bwysig y bydd y cyfansoddiad newydd yn arwain at sefydliadau mwy agored ac atebol yn yr UE. Bydd hefyd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Gyngor Gweinidogion Ewrop gyfarfod yng ngŵydd y cyhoedd am y tro cyntaf. Mae hynny'n newid sylweddol. Mae pwyllgor Ewropeaidd Senedd yr Alban yn cael adroddiadau manwl yn rheolaidd oddi wrth Gyngor y Gweinidogion ar y materion a drafodwyd ganddo. Dylai'r natur agored a gynigir yn y cyfansoddiad hefyd fod yn gymwys yma o ran y ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn cynnal ei fusnes. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod yn croesawu hynny, ac efallai yr hoffai'r Prif Weinidog ystyried hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae eich plaid yn aml yn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith ei bod o blaid refferenda. A ydych o blaid cynnal refferendwm ar gyfansoddiad yr UE? A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r refferendwm

should not be put off until some time in 2006 in the hope—by the Prime Minister—that some other member state will vote against it, so that the referendum will never have to be held?

**Michael German:** ‘Yes’ is my answer to both questions.

Improving how the EU works is good for Wales and for the European Union. This is a historic opportunity, and I am surprised that the eurosceptics are so opposed to the constitution, given that it clearly sets out what the EU can and cannot do. They may disagree with what the EU can and cannot do, but the principle of a constitution must be good because it allows national parliaments and nationally elected Members of the European Parliament to have more control over EU legislation, and ensures that Ministers are better held to account. In this constitution, there will be further powers for devolved legislatures throughout the EU, such as the Assembly, to have a say in what is going on. That is a distinctive, pro-devolutionary change and is integral to Liberal Democrat thinking.

There is no point in saying that the EU is absolutely perfect—it is not flawless, but we must argue for positive change from a position of strength, namely from inside Europe, and not shout from the sidelines. Those who talk about re-negotiation must understand that if you say ‘no’ to Europe by standing on the outside and shouting ‘no’, then you will not be able to influence colleagues inside. Our mantra is simple: we are pro-Europe and pro-reform inside Europe. The UK should be at the top table as a member, and at the heart of the EU. It is time to take on and defeat the eurosceptics’ scaremongering. Now that we have a signed constitution, all parts of the political spectrum should unite and make a strong case, on behalf of the Welsh people, for supporting the referendum on the EU constitution. Is the First Minister prepared to take a lead on this matter and commit his party to joining with mine and others to work

hwnnw gael ei gynnal yn fuan ac na ddylai gael ei ohirio tan rywbryd yn 2006 yn y gobaith—o du Prif Weinidog y DU—y bydd rhyw aelod wladwriaeth arall wedi pleidleisio yn ei erbyn, fel na fydd yn rhaid cynnal y refferendwm o gwbl?

**Michael German:** ‘Ydwyf’ yw’r ateb i’r ddau gwestiwn.

Bydd gwella’r ffordd y mae’r UE yn gweithio yn fuddiol i Gymru ac i’r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae hwn yn gyfle hanesyddol, a synnaf fod pobl ewrosgeptig mor wrthwynebus i’r cyfansoddiad, o gofio ei fod yn nodi’n glir yr hyn y gall yr UE ei wneud a’r hyn na all ei wneud. Efallai eu bod yn anghytuno â’r hyn y gall yr UE ei wneud a’r hyn na all ei wneud, ond rhaid bod egwyddor cyfansoddiad yn un dda am ei bod yn caniatáu i seneddau cenedlaethol ac Aelodau Senedd Ewrop a etholwyd yn genedlaethol gael mwy o reolaeth dros ddeddfwriaeth yr UE a sicrhau y caiff Gweinidogion eu dwyn i gyfrif yn well. Yn y cyfansoddiad hwn, bydd pwerau ychwanegol i ddeddfwrfeydd datganoledig ledled yr UE, megis y Cynulliad, fynegi barn ynglŷn â’r hyn sy’n digwydd. Mae hynny yn newid penodol o blaid datganoli ac mae’n rhan annatod o syniadau’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Nid oes diben mewn dweud bod yr UE yn berffaith—mae ganddo ddiffygion, ond rhaid inni ddadlau dros newid cadarnhaol o safle cryf, sef y tu mewn i Ewrop, a pheidio â gweiddi o’r ymylon. Rhaid i’r rhai sy’n sôn am ailnegodi ddeall os dywedwch ‘na’ i Ewrop drwy sefyll y tu allan iddi a gweiddi ‘na’, yna ni fyddwch yn gallu dylanwadu ar y rhai y tu mewn iddi. Mae ein mantra yn un syml: yr ydym o blaid Ewrop ac o blaid diwygio y tu mewn i Ewrop. Dylai’r DU fod ymhlith yr aelodau mwyaf blaenllaw yn yr UE, ac yn ei ganol. Mae’n bryd herio bwganod yr ewrosgeptiaid a’u trechu. Gan fod gennym gyfansoddiad wedi’i lofnodi bellach, dylai pob plaid ddod ynghyd a rhoi dadl gref, ar ran pobl Cymru, dros gefnogi’r refferendwm ar gyfansoddiad yr UE. A yw’r Prif Weinidog yn barod i arwain ar y mater hwn ac ymrwymo ar ran ei blaid i ymuno â’r plaid innau ac eraill i weithio gyda’n gilydd, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud yn y



together, as we have done in the past, to ensure that this happens?

3.30 p.m.

I would also like to ask the First Minister about the British-Irish Council. It is not often referred to in this Chamber, but the National Assembly is deeply engaged with it in terms of its work with the British-Irish Inter-Parliamentary Body. The British-Irish Inter-Parliamentary Body, on which we are all represented, recently made strongly-worded criticisms of the failure of the British-Irish Council to agree to be scrutinised by it. I hope that the First Minister will also consider that matter.

Turning to the future of the structural funds, it is not good news. Defending Wales's interests requires a lead from the First Minister. Keeping quiet on this matter, because delicate negotiations will take place, is not the same as giving a lead. There are those in Wales who are waiting for that lead, notably the Welsh Local Government Association, and many of those who are engaged on the ground in our projects. We have considerable expertise on the ground in Wales in terms of people who can manage and handle European projects, and it would be senseless to throw that out of the window, when it has taken us so long to achieve. The Government cannot be complacent—we need to see a clear lead, and an unequivocal statement of what is best for Wales. I am told by the First Minister that getting funding above the Barnett formula is his principal interest. He told me that yesterday during First Minister's questions. However, I asked him the same question in the Committee on European and External Affairs, and he said that he does not expect it to be a problem. Where is the truth in this matter?

To conclude, I have three questions to ask the First Minister on Gordon Brown's proposals. Does Gordon Brown's offer of domestic compensation money for not having European structural funds come on top of the Barnett formula? Please answer that in your response. Against which benchmark will Gordon Brown's offer be placed? Will it be

gorffennol, i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd?

Hoffwn hefyd holi'r Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig. Anaml y cyfeirir ato yn y Siambr hon, ond mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymwneud gryn dipyn ag ef drwy ei waith gyda'r Corff Rhyngseneddol Prydeinig-Gwyddelig. Mae'r Corff Rhyngseneddol Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, y cynrychiolir pob un ohonom arno, wedi beirniadu'n llym yn ddiweddar fethiant y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig i gytuno iddo graffu ar ei waith. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ystyried y mater hwnnw hefyd.

Gan droi at ddyfodol y cronfeydd strwythurol, nid oes newyddion da. Mae amddiffyn buddiannau Cymru yn gofyn am arweiniad gan y Prif Weinidog. Nid yw cadw'n dawel am y mater hwn, am fod negodiadau sensitif yn mynd rhagddynt, yn gyfystyr â rhoi arweiniad. Mae rhai pobl yng Nghymru yn disgwyl am yr arweiniad hwn, yn enwedig Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a llawer o'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â'n prosiectau ar lawr gwlad. Mae gennym gryn arbenigedd ar lawr gwlad yng Nghymru o ran pobl a all reoli a thrafod prosiectau Ewropeaidd, a byddai'n hurt taflu hynny i ffwrdd, ar ôl inni gymryd cymaint o amser i'w gyflawni. Ni all y Llywodraeth fod yn hunanfodlon—mae angen inni weld arweiniad clir, a datganiad diamwys o'r hyn sydd orau i Gymru. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrthyf mai sicrhau arian yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett yw ei brif ddiddordeb. Dywedodd hynny wrthyf ddoe yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, gofynnais yr un cwestiwn iddo yn y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, a dywedodd nad yw'n disgwyl i hynny fod yn broblem. Beth yw'r gwirionedd o ran y mater hwn?

I gloi, mae gennyf dri chwestiwn i'w gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â chynigion Gordon Brown. A yw cynnig Gordon Brown o iawndal mewnwladol am beidio â chael cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett? Atebwch y cwestiwn hwnnw os gwelwch yn dda yn eich ymateb. Beth fydd y meincnod ar gyfer

placed against the level of eventual agreement by the European Council Ministers, or the level of the offer by the European Commission, or somewhere in between? What preparatory work has already been done by the Welsh Assembly Government on a new single programming document for 2007 to 2013? Will it incorporate the lessons learnt from the current programmes? Despite the fact that you will not give us a lead, First Minister, will you at least tell us what preparatory work you are undertaking, so that we will not be rushed into making a judgment in those last few months before we reach 2007?

**Rosemary Butler:** In addition to the ministerial input that has already been outlined by the First Minister, it is important that we make the most of every possible opportunity to influence European policies through our involvement in institutions such as the Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions and the Committee of the Regions.

The Committee of the Regions is an advisory assembly of the European Union and is the National Assembly for Wales's opportunity to have direct input into decision making at the European level. It is composed of representatives of local and regional authorities within the EU, and its purpose is to comment on EU proposals that are of direct interest to local and regional governments. It also ensures that the subsidiarity principle—which stipulates that decisions should be taken at the level of authority that can implement them most effectively—is properly applied.

I am a member of the Committee of the Regions' education and culture commission, which deals with education, culture and cultural diversity, the promotion of minority languages, youth, sport, and vocational training. I was asked to present an opinion on the culture 2004 budget, which was accepted unanimously by the Committee of the Regions and presented before the European parliament. I have also been asked to present another opinion on the budget for 2007 to 2013. I was recently elected as one of the three UK members to the bureau, which is the executive of the Committee of the Regions, and I am a member of a joint

mesur cynnig Gordon Brown? A gaiff ei fesur yn erbyn cytundeb Cyngor Gweinidogion Ewrop yn y pen draw, neu gynnig y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, neu rywle yn y canol. Pa waith paratoi y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei wneud eisoes ar ddogfen raglennu sengl ar gyfer 2007 i 2013? A fydd yn ymgorffori'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o'r rhaglenni cyfredol? Er nad ydych yn barod i roi arweiniad inni, Brif Weinidog, a ddywedwch wrthym pa waith paratoi yr ydych yn ei wneud, fel na fyddwn yn gorfod dod i benderfyniad ar frys yn yr ychydig fisoedd olaf hynny cyn cyrraedd 2007?

**Rosemary Butler:** Yn ogystal â'r cyfraniad gweinidogol a nodwyd eisoes gan y Prif Weinidog, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn manteisio ar bob cyfle posibl i ddylanwadu ar bolisiâu Ewropeaidd drwy ein hymwneud â sefydliadau megis Cynhadledd Rhanbarthau Arforol Ymylol Ewrop a Phwyllgor y Rhanbarthau.

Cynulliad cynghori i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yw Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau a rhydd gyfle i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru wneud cyfraniad uniongyrchol i'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Mae'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o awdurdodau lleol a rhanbarthol yn yr UE, a'i ddiben yw gwneud sylwadau ar gynigion yr UE sydd o ddiddordeb uniongyrchol i lywodraethau lleol a rhanbarthol. Mae hefyd yn sicrhau y caiff egwyddor sybsidiaredd—sy'n nodi y dylai penderfyniadau gael eu gwneud ar lefel awdurdod sy'n gallu eu gweithredu fwyaf effeithiol—ei chymhwyso'n gywir.

Yr wyf yn aelod o gomisiwn addysg a diwylliant Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, sy'n ymdrin ag addysg, diwylliant ac amrywiaeth diwylliannol, hyrwyddo ieithoedd lleiafrifol, ieuencid, chwaraeon a hyfforddiant galwedigaethol. Gofynnwyd imi gyflwyno barn ar gyllideb diwylliant 2004, a dderbyniwyd yn unfrydol gan Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau ac a gyflwynwyd gerbron Senedd Ewrop. Gofynnwyd imi hefyd gyflwyno barn arall ar y gyllideb ar gyfer 2007 i 2013 hefyd. Fe'm hetholwyd yn ddiweddar yn un o'r tri aelod o'r DU i'r biwro, sef gweithrediaeth Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, ac yr wyf yn aelod o gyd-

consultative committee on Bulgaria, which is helping that country to prepare for accession into the European Union. Janet Davies is also a member of the Committee of the Regions as an alternate member, and we work closely together.

The main thrust of the Committee of the Regions' work is to ensure that local and regional authorities play an important part in the definition, management and evaluation of European Commission policies that directly concern them. Once opinions or policies are adopted by the Committee of the Regions, they are placed before the commission, the Council of Europe and the European Parliament. Therefore, we have a direct input into policy making and evaluation.

Polling consistently shows that people in the UK consider themselves to be uninformed about European issues. Along with our MEPs and the European Commission in Wales, we as an Assembly have a duty to highlight how Wales benefits from European decisions, as well as from European funding.

As the First Minister said earlier, the constitutional treaty that was signed last week in Rome highlights the importance of local and regional government, and strengthens the role of the Committee of the Regions. As an Assembly, we must take advantage of these proposed changes. I would like to see much closer co-operation between Wales and other countries, and cities and regions across Europe. The new link with Latvia will open up a whole range of opportunities for Welsh businesses, educational institutions and cultural groups, and we should encourage them to take full advantage of these new and exciting opportunities.

However, if we are to play a full part in the newly enlarged Europe, we need to invest more in teaching European languages in our schools, colleges and universities. I would also like to see the Assembly introduce incentives to encourage more staff to take up secondments in the European Commission or the European Parliament. The benefits to the

bwyllgor ymgynghori ar Fwlgaria, sy'n helpu'r wlad honno i baratoi i ddod yn aelod o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae Janet Davies hefyd yn aelod o Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau fel eilydd, ac yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'n gilydd.

Prif fyrddwn gwaith Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol a rhanbarthol yn chwarae rhan bwysig wrth bennu, rheoli a gwerthuso polisiau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd sy'n effeithio arnynt yn uniongyrchol. Ar ôl i safbwynt neu bolisi gael ei fabwysiadu gan Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, caiff ei osod gerbron y comisiwn, Cyngor Ewrop a Senedd Ewrop. Felly, yr ydym yn gwneud cyfraniad uniongyrchol i'r broses o lunio a gwerthuso polisiau.

Dengys arolygon barn yn gyson fod pobl yn y DU yn credu eu bod yn anwybodus ynglŷn â materion Ewropeaidd. Ynghyd â'n ASEau a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru, mae arnom ni yn y Cynulliad ddyletswydd i ddangos sut y mae Cymru yn elwa ar benderfyniadau Ewropeaidd, yn ogystal ag arian Ewropeaidd.

Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, mae'r cytundeb cyfansoddiadol a lofnodwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn Rhufain yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd llywodraeth leol a rhanbarthol ac yn cryfhau rôl Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Fel Cynulliad, rhaid inni fanteisio ar y newidiadau arfaethedig hyn. Hoffwn weld llawer mwy o gydweithredu rhwng Cymru a gwledydd eraill, a rhwng dinasoedd a rhanbarthau ledled Ewrop. Bydd y cysylltiad newydd â Latfia yn esgor ar bob math o gyfleoedd i fusnesau, sefydliadau addysg a grwpiau diwylliannol yng Nghymru, a dylem eu hannog i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd newydd a chyffrous hyn.

Fodd bynnag, er mwyn inni chwarae rhan lawn yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sydd newydd ei ehangu, mae angen inni fuddsoddi mwy mewn dysgu ieithoedd Ewropeaidd yn ein hysgolion, colegau a'n prifysgolion. Hoffwn hefyd weld y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno cymellddaliadau i annog staff i dderbyn seconddiadau yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd neu

individual, as well as to the Assembly, would be invaluable.

Unbelievably, the opposition fails to recognise the contribution made by, and the influence of, the Assembly in Europe. I shall vote against all the amendments.

**Janet Davies:** The treaties of the European Union have been creaking under the strain of the increasing number of member states. The entry of 10 new countries, with two more expected shortly, had to be the fuse that blew to melt most of the existing treaties into one constitution, which is better fitted to a union of 25 countries in the twenty-first century. All the citizens of the European Union should take pride in being part of an organisation that brings centuries-old enemies together, and which, for nearly 50 years, has maintained peace in a continent often previously torn apart by war.

This constitution has been thrashed out in months of debate, negotiation and compromise, but it has been achieved—as far as it goes. It will now take leadership by all Governments, including the Government of Wales, to explain its contents truthfully to the peoples of Europe. No-one is likely to agree with every clause and sentence in the constitution—I certainly do not, and nor does Plaid Cymru. However, we see a greater potential for good from being part of this changed European Union, than from being isolated or on its margins. I refer the Conservative Party to an opinion from the Committee of the Regions, which was prepared by two rapporteurs, one from the Liberal Democrats in Europe, and one from the group to which the Conservatives belong in Europe. It considers that the treaty represents a positive step forward for the European Union and puts in place many necessary arrangements for its effective government. Therefore, perhaps you need to talk so some of your friends.

The Assembly has many opportunities to contribute to decision-making processes for the benefit of the Welsh people. We now

Senedd Ewrop. Byddai'r manteision i'r unigolyn, yn ogystal ag i'r Cynulliad, yn amhrisiadwy.

Mae'n anhygoel nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau yn cydnabod cyfraniad a dylanwad y Cynulliad yn Ewrop. Pleidleisiaf yn erbyn pob un o'r gwelliannau.

**Janet Davies:** Mae cytundebau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi bod yn gwegian o dan bwysau'r nifer gynyddol o aelod wladwriaethau. Yr oedd aelodaeth y 10 gwlad newydd, a'r ddwy arall y disgwylir iddynt ymuno cyn hir, yn anochel yn ffiws a chwythodd y cytundebau presennol a'u toddi'n un cyfansoddiad, a fyddai'n fwy addas ar gyfer undeb o 25 o wledydd yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dylai holl ddinasyddion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd fod yn falch eu bod yn rhan o sefydliad sy'n dwyn ynghyd bobloedd sydd wedi bod yn elynion ers canrifoedd, ac sydd, ers bron hanner canrif, wedi cadw heddwch ar gyfandir sydd yn aml wedi dioddef rhyfeloedd yn y gorffennol.

Daethpwyd i gytundeb ar y cyfansoddiad hwn ar ôl misoedd o ddadlau, negodi a chyfaddawdu, ond mae wedi'i gyflawni—i ryw raddau. Mae angen yn awr i bob Llywodraeth, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth Cymru, roi arweiniad, er mwyn esbonio ei gynnwys i bobloedd Ewrop yn gywir. Nid oes neb yn debygol o gytuno â phob cymal a brawddeg yn y cyfansoddiad—yn sicr nid wyf innau na Phlaid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gwelwn fwy o fanteision posibl o fod yn rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd newydd hwn na bod wedi ein hynysu neu ar ei ymylon. Cyfeiriaf y Blaid Geidwadol at farn a gyhoeddwyd gan Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, a baratowyd gan ddau adroddwr, un o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Ewrop, a'r llall o'r grŵp yn Ewrop y mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn perthyn iddo. Cred fod y cytundeb yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a'i fod yn rhoi ar waith lawer o'r trefniadau sydd eu hangen i'w llywodraethu'n effeithiol. Felly, efallai fod angen ichi siarad â rhai o'ch ffrindiau.

Mae gan y Cynulliad lawer o gyfleoedd i gyfrannu at brosesau gwneud penderfyniadau er budd pobl Cymru. Mae gennym swyddfa

have offices in Brussels and we are gradually improving our effectiveness. However, the Assembly Government has been slow to understand European processes and their potential for Wales. The constitution could, however, have a stronger content for sub-member-state governments. While the constitution recognises the role and place of authorities such as Wales in the process of European integration, it nevertheless seriously underestimates them.

So much European legislation and policy is implemented regionally and locally that better recognition of this is essential. Waste management, the protection of biodiversity and linguistic and cultural diversity are obvious examples. Plaid Cymru also welcomes the legally binding charter of fundamental human rights, to prevent discrimination from European laws. However the European constitution should recognise the need to actively contribute to removing poverty, inequality and repression throughout the world.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that that should also include the repression of journalists, such as Hans Tillack, who speak out against European corruption?

**Janet Davies:** This charter relates to European laws. That is what it is about. You obviously have not read what it is about, David.

3.40 p.m.

As a big player, it should do this because it is the right thing to do, and also because the injustice and unfairness of poverty leads, in its extreme forms, to acts of terrorism. Repression will never defeat terrorism, but the removal of poverty can. In this, the European Union has the opportunity to act as a counterpoint to the stupidity of the Government of the United States and its destabilising policies and actions. The European Union should use its new constitution to persuade its member states to cancel third-world debts that prevent some countries from achieving the millennium development goals. Harmful economic conditions have made poor countries poorer,

ym Mrwsel erbyn hyn ac yr ydym yn raddol yn dod yn fwy effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cymryd amser i ddeall prosesau Ewropeaidd a'u potensial i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, gallai cynnwys y cyfansoddiad o ran llywodraethau'r is-aelod wladwriaethau fod yn gryfach. Er bod y cyfansoddiad yn cydnabod rôl a safle awdurdodau megis Cymru yn y broses o integreiddio Ewrop, eto i gyd mae'n tanamcangyfrif eu pwysigrwydd.

Cymaint yw'r ddeddfwriaeth a'r polisiau Ewropeaidd a weithredir yn rhanbarthol ac yn lleol fel ei bod yn hanfodol bod hyn yn cael gwell cydnabyddiaeth. Mae rheoli gwastraff, diogelu bioamrywiaeth ac amrywiaeth ieithyddol a diwylliannol yn enghreifftiau amlwg. Mae Plaid Cymru hefyd yn croesawu'r siarter hawliau dynol sylfaenol sy'n gyfrwymol yn gyfreithiol i atal gwahaniaethu o dan gyfreithiau Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, dylai'r cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd gydnabod yr angen i fynd ati i helpu i ddileu tlodi, anghydraddoldeb a gormes drwy'r byd.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch y dylai hynny gynnwys gormes yn erbyn newyddiadurwyr, megis Hans Tillack, sy'n tynnu sylw at lygredd Ewropeaidd?

**Janet Davies:** Mae a wnelo'r siarter hon â chyfreithiau Ewropeaidd. Dyna destun y siarter. Mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi darllen am ei nodau, David.

Fel sefydliad pwysig, dylai wneud hyn am mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud, a hefyd am fod anghyfiawnder ac annhegwch tlodi, ar ei ffurf fwyaf eithafol, yn arwain at derfysgaeth. Ni fydd gormes byth yn trechu terfysgaeth, ond y mae modd ei threchu drwy ddileu tlodi. Yn hyn o beth, mae gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gyfle i wrthbwysu ynfyrdrwydd Llywodraeth yr Unol Daleithiau a'i pholisiau a'i gweithredoedd sy'n peri ansefydlogrwydd. Dylai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ddefnyddio ei gyfansoddiad newydd i ddarbwylllo ei aelod wladwriaethau i ddileu dyledion y trydydd byd sy'n atal rhai gwledydd rhag cyflawni nodau datblygu'r mileniwm. Mae amgylchiadau economaidd

and have undermined democracy. Reform of the common agricultural policy is essential to give these countries a fair chance to climb out of their massive poverty trap. The tariffs against imports of sugar are just one example of how badly reform is needed. I will produce a statement of opinion on this matter, which I hope that Members will agree to sign.

Finally, a constitution is a dry-as-dust concept for most people. However, what it is used for matters to millions.

**Sandy Mewies:** I welcome the motion before us, as well as the opportunity to discuss the role played by the Welsh Assembly Government and the National Assembly in the development of Europe. The first point in the motion refers to the Assembly Government's contribution to the debate on the EU constitutional treaty, which sets out the basic rules for a new Europe and allows the enlarged EU to be more effective. The second point is about maintaining our European profile and exerting influence, which is ongoing through our attendance at ministerial council meetings, for example. The third point refers to the UK's EU presidency, and I know that our officials are working closely with their UK counterparts to input into that programme. I have already said that I hope that people from all over Wales will be given every opportunity to participate in any Welsh activity, and that they will be given full access to any activities. The last point in the motion refers to the structural funds, for which Labour is maximising the opportunities available.

I recognise the successful and prime role of the Assembly Government, but, as Chair of the European and External Affairs Committee, I would like to make some reference to the work of the committee, which has also considered and made a contribution to the debate on European issues in Wales. It has provided an opportunity for Members from all parties to meet, listen, and discuss with colleagues from all over the UK and Europe, and I have welcomed the positive and constructive approach that

niweidiol wedi gwneud gwledydd tlawd yn dlotach, ac wedi tanseilio democratiaeth. Mae'n hanfodol diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin er mwyn rhoi cyfle teg i'r gwledydd hyn ddianc rhag eu tlodi mawr. Mae tariffau ar fewnforio siwgr yn un enghraifft o'r angen dirfawr am ddiwygio'r polisi. Cyflwynaf ddatganiad barn ar y mater hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau yn cytuno i'w lofnodi.

Yn olaf, i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl mae cyfansoddiad yn rhywbeth sych iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffordd y caiff ei ddefnyddio o bwys i filiynau.

**Sandy Mewies:** Croesawaf y cynnig ger ein bron, a'r cyfle hefyd i drafod y rhan a chwaraeodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn natblygiad Ewrop. Cyfeiria'r pwynt cyntaf yn y cynnig at gyfraniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r ddadl ar gytundeb cyfansoddiadol yr UE, sy'n nodi'r rheolau sylfaenol i Ewrop newydd ac sy'n galluogi'r UE ar ei newydd wedd i fod yn fwy effeithiol. Mae'r ail bwynt yn ymwneud â chynnal ein proffil yn Ewrop a dylanwadu, proses sy'n mynd rhagddi drwy ein presenoldeb mewn cyfarfodydd o Gyngor y Gweinidogion, er enghraifft. Cyfeiria'r trydydd pwynt at lywyddiaeth yr UE ym Mhrydain, a gwn fod ein swyddogion yn gweithio'n agos gyda'u cymheiriaid yn y DU i gyfrannu i'r rhaglen honno. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd pobl o bob rhan o Gymru yn cael cyfle i gymryd rhan mewn unrhyw weithgaredd yng Nghymru, ac y byddant yn cael mynediad llawn i unrhyw weithgareddau. Cyfeiria'r pwynt olaf yn y cynnig at y cronfeydd strwythurol, y mae Llafur yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael.

Cydnabyddaf y rhan lwyddiannus a blaenllaw a chwaraeodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ond fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, hoffwn gyfeirio at waith y pwyllgor, sydd hefyd wedi ystyried ac wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl ar faterion Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru. Bu'n gyfle i Aelodau o bob plaid gyfarfod, gwrando a thrafod gydag eraill o bob rhan o'r DU ac Ewrop, ac yr wyf wedi croesawu ymagwedd gadarnhaol ac adeiladol pawb yn y trafodaethau hyn. Mae'n bleser mynychu

everybody has taken in these discussions. It is a pleasure to attend the committee's meetings. We have welcomed people such as the deputy ambassador from Italy and the ambassador from Ireland, who told us about their countries' respective presidencies, and we will soon welcome the ambassador of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg to talk to us about its presidency.

Structural funds have inevitably figured large in our discussions—we have had joint discussions with the Economic Development and Transport Committee, and we have been joined in these discussions by senior officials from the European Commission, the Treasury and the Department of Trade and Industry. Recently, we had an update on the draft regulations, as well as on proposals for the new assisted areas map. At the next meeting, we will be looking at different approaches to defining the areas of Wales eligible to receive assistance. These issues are crucial. I know that the Welsh Assembly Government will keep a close eye on what is happening, but I am sure that the committee will also do so.

We are just one nation in Europe, so we are working closely with colleagues in the House of Commons, the House of Lords, and the Scottish Parliament to ensure that we all aware of the issues and priorities that we face. We have maintained close links with organisations such as the British-Irish Inter-Parliamentary Body, the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association and CALRE—the Conference of European Regional Legislative Assemblies. I think that everybody involved in Europe knows that these acronyms and titles are always ready to trip up anyone's tongue. The committee's members have been invited to attend the forthcoming meeting in Cardiff of the UK delegations to the EU Committee of the Regions, and I am sure that as many as are able to do so will attend. To make such liaison worthwhile, we need information, and I am grateful to the First Minister and his officials for their regular reports to committee on developments. Subject committee Chairs have also told us how they interface on European issues, and how they impact on the respective portfolios.

cyfarfodydd y pwyllgor. Yr ydym wedi croesawu pobl megis dirprwy lysgennad yr Eidal a llysgennad Iwerddon, sydd wedi dweud wrthym am lywyddiaethau eu gwledydd hwy a chyn bo hir byddwn yn croesawu llysgennad Archddugiaeth Lwcsembwrg i siarad â ni am ei llywyddiaeth.

Yn anochel mae cronfeydd strwythurol wedi mynd â llawer o amser yn ein trafodaethau—yr ydym wedi cael trafodaethau ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ac mae uwch swyddogion o'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, y Trysorlys a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wedi ymuno â ni. Yn ddiweddar, cawsom y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar y rheoliadau drafft, ac ar y cynigion ar gyfer y map newydd o ardaloedd a gynorthwyr. Yn y cyfarfod nesaf, byddwn yn edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o bennu pa ardaloedd o Gymru sy'n gymwys i gael cymorth. Mae'r materion hyn yn hollbwysig. Gwn y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cadw llygad barcud ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y pwyllgor hefyd yn gwneud hynny.

Dim ond un genedl ydym yn Ewrop, felly yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda chyd-aelodau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, ac yn Senedd yr Alban er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni oll yn ymwybodol o'r materion a'r blaenoriaethau a wynebwn. Mae gennym gysylltiadau agos â sefydliadau megis y Corff Rhyngseneddol Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, Cymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad a CALRE—Cynhadledd Cynullidiadau Deddfwriaethol Rhanbarthol Ewrop. Gŵyr pawb sy'n ymwneud ag Ewrop, fe gredaf, fod rhywun bob amser mewn perygl o faglu dros y byrfodau a'r teitlau hyn. Gwahoddwyd aelodau'r pwyllgor i fynychu'r cyfarfod o ddirprwyaethau'r DU i Bwyllgor Rhanbarthau'r UE a gynhelir yng Nghaerdydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd cymaint ohonynt â phosibl yn mynychu. Er mwyn sicrhau bod cyswllt o'r fath yn fuddiol, mae angen gwybodaeth arnom, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog a'i swyddogion am eu hadroddiadau rheolaidd i'r pwyllgor ar ddatblygiadau. Mae Cadeiryddion y pwyllgorau pwnc hefyd wedi dweud wrthym

We need this sort of knowledge to take our rightful place in Europe. European issues are challenging and they are of vital importance to Wales. There has never been a more important time because of the issues that lie ahead, including the proposed European constitution and the changes to structural funds. The new European Commission is also a factor. We have invited the UK Commission nominee, Peter Mandelson, to talk to the committee but, perhaps for understandable reasons, he has not yet accepted our invitation.

It has been an interesting and worthwhile year or so, for me. Since the committee was established, its positive approach of informed discussion on the vital issues that we face has made a constructive contribution to maintain Wales's profile and influence in Europe. I hope that in future, thinking Wales into Europe and vice versa, will become embedded and mainstreamed throughout the work of the Welsh Assembly Government and the National Assembly for Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am delighted to follow Sandy Mewies, as the Assembly Member for Delyn, but most importantly in the context of this debate, as chair of the Committee on European and External Affairs. It is important that we recognise the committee's work, how it operates and the range of discussions that we have. It is a fruitful way for an Assembly committee to operate in this particular field. I pay tribute to the Member for Delyn, for the way in which she chairs the committee and the fairness that she displays in allowing Members of all parties to have their say.

Turning to the motion before us, I am confused after listening to the First Minister and his rationale this afternoon. He did not explain why the Assembly Government and the Labour Party will vote against the amendments. On the one hand, we have the Government asking us to recognise that the Government looks forward to playing a full role in the future constitutional referendum, yet on the other, it is refusing to welcome the

am eu cysylltiadau o ran materion Ewropeaidd, a sut y maent yn effeithio ar eu priod bortffolios. Mae angen y math hwn o wybodaeth arnom i gymryd ein priod le yn Ewrop. Mae materion Ewropeaidd yn rhai heriol ac maent yn hollbwysig i Gymru. Ni fu adeg bwysicach erioed oherwydd y materion sydd o'n blaenau, gan gynnwys y cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd arfaethedig a'r newidiadau i'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd newydd hefyd yn ffactor. Yr ydym wedi gwahodd enwebai'r DU i'r comisiwn, Peter Mandelson, i annerch y pwyllgor, ond, am resymau dealladwy efallai, nid yw wedi derbyn ein gwahoddiad eto.

Bu'n flwyddyn ddiddorol a buddiol i mi. Ers sefydlu'r pwyllgor, mae'r ffordd y mae wedi mynd ati'n gadarnhaol i drafod yn hyddysg y materion hollbwysig a wynebir gennym wedi gwneud cyfraniad adeiladol i gynnal proffil a dylanwad Cymru yn Ewrop. Gobeithiaf yn y dyfodol y bydd meddwl am Gymru fel rhan o Ewrop, ac i'r gwrthwyneb, yn dod yn rhan annatod o waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac y bydd hynny wedi'i brif ffrydio drwy'r holl waith hwnnw.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pleser i mi yw dilyn Sandy Mewies, Aelod y Cynulliad dros Ddelyn, ond yn bwysicach na dim yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon, cadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod gwaith y pwyllgor, sut y mae'n gweithredu a'r amrywiaeth o drafodaethau a gawn. Mae'n ffordd fuddiol i un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad weithredu yn y maes arbennig hwn. Talaf deyrnged i'r Aelod dros Ddelyn, am y ffordd y mae wedi cadeirio'r pwyllgor ac am ei thegwch wrth roi cyfle i Aelodau o bob plaid fynegi barn.

Gan droi at y cynnig ger ein bron, yr wyf wedi drysu ar ôl gwranddo ar y Prif Weinidog a'i resymeg y prynhawn yma. Nid esboniodd pam y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Blaid Lafur yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliannau. Ar y naill law, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gofyn inni gydnabod bod y Llywodraeth yn edrych ymlaen at chwarae rhan lawn yn y refferendwm ar y cyfansoddiad yn y dyfodol, ond ar y llaw



decision by the Prime Minister to hold the referendum. It is illogical.

**Leighton Andrews:** You have tabled amendment 1 welcoming the referendum on the European constitution. Which way will you campaign and vote on the referendum, Jonathan?

**Jonathan Morgan:** When, or if there is a referendum, depending on whether the Labour Party is re-elected next February or May, I will campaign against the constitution. The Conservative Party has said that if it wins the general election, we will have a referendum as soon as possible which, I suspect, will be sometime next year. I will vote against in a referendum, like many people throughout the capital, I suspect.

It is confusing this afternoon for the Government to say that it wants us to accept that it is enthusiastic about playing its part in the referendum, but refuses to welcome the decision to have a referendum in the first place. It does not make sense. I think that the First Minister was confused when he said that there is widespread support, simply because of the extra 10 member states. He is trying to confuse two separate issues. On the one hand, people are enthusiastic about the enlargement of the European Union and the benefits this will bring to the Union, but, on the other hand, they are sceptical about the constitution which, in the minds of the Welsh and British public, goes a stage too far.

**Leighton Andrews:** As I recall, the Conservative Government did not offer a referendum on the Maastricht treaty which, many would argue, entailed a fundamental choice about the future of Europe, given the way in which that opened the door to co-decision with the European Parliament. Do you not think that if you are now in favour of a referendum it would have been more interesting for the British public to have had a referendum in the past on the Maastricht treaty which was more fundamental?

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Labour Party did not even suggest at the time that there should

arall, mae'n gwrthod croesawu penderfyniad Prif Weinidog y DU i gynnal y refferendwm. Nid yw'n rhesymegol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno gwelliant 1 yn croesawu'r refferendwm ar y cyfansoddiad Ewropeaidd. Sut y byddwch yn ymgyrchu ac yn pleidleisio yn y refferendwm, Jonathan?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pan fydd refferendwm, neu os bydd un, yn dibynnu ar ba un a gaiff y Blaid Lafur ei hethol fis Chwefror neu fis Mai nesaf, ymgyrchaf yn erbyn y cyfansoddiad. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi dweud, os bydd yn ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol, y byddwn yn cynnal refferendwm mor fuan â phosibl, rywbryd y flwyddyn nesaf, fe gredaf. Pleidleisiaf 'na' mewn refferendwm, fel llawer o bobl yn y brifddinas, fe gredaf.

Mae'n ddryslyd y prynhawn yma i'r Llywodraeth ddweud ei bod am inni dderbyn ei bod yn frwd dros chwarae ei rhan yn y refferendwm, ond ei bod yn gwrthod croesawu'r penderfyniad i gynnal refferendwm yn y lle cyntaf. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr. Credaf fod y Prif Weinidog yn drysu pan ddywedodd fod cefnogaeth gyffredinol, oherwydd aelodaeth y 10 aelod wladwriaeth ychwanegol. Mae'n ceisio cymysgu dau fater gwahanol. Ar y naill law, mae pobl yn frwdfrydig ynglŷn ag ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a'r manteision a ddaw yn ei sgîl i'r Undeb, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae ganddynt amheuan ynglŷn â'r cyfansoddiad, sydd, yn nhyb y cyhoedd yng Nghymru ac ym Mhrydain, yn mynd gam yn rhy bell.

**Leighton Andrews:** Os cofiaf yn iawn, ni chynigiodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol refferendwm ar gytundeb Maastricht, a oedd, fel y byddai llawer yn dadlau, yn golygu dewis sylfaenol ynglŷn â dyfodol Ewrop, o gofio sut yr arweiniodd hynny at benderfynu ar y cyd â Senedd Ewrop. Oni chredwch, os ydych o blaid refferendwm yn awr, y byddai wedi bod yn fwy diddorol i'r cyhoedd ym Mhrydain gael refferendwm yn y gorffennol ar gytundeb Maastricht a oedd yn golygu newidiadau mwy sylfaenol?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid awgrymodd y Blaid Lafur hyd yn oed ar y pryd y dylid cynnal

be a referendum on the Maastricht treaty. My personal view is that there should have been a treaty referendum, as a treaty making all members of the public within member states, citizens of a European Union, should have been confirmed in a referendum. I remember saying so in 1992.

3.50 p.m.

This debate has rather confused us this afternoon because the public will be wondering why the Government wants to play a full role in the referendum when it does not welcome the decision to hold it. We must recognise that, although we hold debates in the Chamber on European matters, the role that we play within the European Union and the impact of the constitution are in isolation. We must also recognise that all the opinion polls held among the British people on the constitution have delivered a resounding 'no' thus far. If the Assembly Government wishes to get involved in that referendum when it occurs to bolster support for the 'yes' campaign, I would welcome that. The popularity of the Assembly Government is currently at such a low level that that would more than likely help the 'no' campaign. Therefore, please get involved; I would be delighted to see Cabinet Members sitting in television studios arguing the case for the constitution, because it is doomed to fail.

In terms of point 2 in the motion on Wales's role in Europe and pushing Wales's cause, what has happened thus far has been positive. However, I am slightly concerned that the Government is refusing to recognise that, with the enlargement of the European Union, we will have to up the pace considerably in order to continue to ensure that Wales's voice is heard loud and clear. That will be important because all the national governments and the regional authorities of the new member states will be desperate to make their mark within the European context. We will have to respond to that by doing much more work to ensure that Wales's voice is heard. While this debate, what we do in Brussels, what Rosemary does and what individual Members do to influence Brussels are important, the Government must take into

refferendwm ar gytundeb Maastricht. Yn fy marn i, dylid bod wedi cynnal refferendwm ar y cytundeb, fel y dylid bod wedi cadarnhau cytundeb a oedd yn gwneud pob aelod o'r cyhoedd o fewn aelod wladwriaethau yn ddinasyddion Undeb Ewropeaidd mewn refferendwm. Cofiaf ddweud hynny yn 1992.

Mae'r ddadl hon wedi ein drysu braidd y prynhawn yma, oherwydd bydd y cyhoedd yn meddwl tybed pam mae'r Llywodraeth am chwarae rhan lawn yn y refferendwm er nad yw'n croesawu'r penderfyniad i'w gynnal. Rhaid inni gydnabod, er inni gynnal dadleuon yn y Siambr ar faterion Ewropeaidd, bod y rhan a chwaraewn yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac effaith y cyfansoddiad yn ddau beth gwahanol. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd ym mhob arolwg barn a gynhaliwyd ymhlith pobl Prydain ynglŷn â'r cyfansoddiad y bu mwyafrif mawr hyd yma yn rhoi'r ateb 'na'. Os dymuna Llywodraeth y Cynulliad chwarae rhan yn y refferendwm hwnnw, pan gaiff ei gynnal er mwyn cryfhau cefnogaeth i'r ymgyrch 'ie', byddwn yn croesawu hynny. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mor amhoblogaidd ar hyn o bryd fel y byddai hynny yn fwy tebygol o helpu'r ymgyrch 'na'. Felly, chwaraewch ran, da chi; byddwn wrth fy modd yn gweld Aelodau'r Cabinet yn eistedd mewn stiwdios teledu yn dadlau dros y cyfansoddiad, oherwydd mae'n anochel mai methiant fydd.

O ran pwynt 2 yn y cynnig ynglŷn â rhan Cymru yn Ewrop a phledio achos Cymru, mae'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd hyd yma wedi bod yn gadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu braidd fod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid inni fod dipyn yn fwy gweithgar, yn sgîl ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, er mwyn parhau i sicrhau y caiff llais Cymru ei glywed. Bydd hynny yn bwysig oherwydd bydd pob llywodraeth genedlaethol ac awdurdod rhanbarthol yr aelod wladwriaethau newydd yn awyddus iawn i fod yn ddylanwadol yn y cyd-destun Ewropeaidd. Bydd yn rhaid inni ymateb i hynny drwy wneud llawer mwy o waith er mwyn sicrhau y caiff llais Cymru ei glywed. Er bod y ddadl hon, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud ym Mrwsel, yr hyn a wna Rosemary ac Aelodau unigol i ddylanwadu ar

account what the people of Wales think about Brussels and some European projects. You cannot get away from the fact that the people of Wales will be voting against this constitution.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the real opportunity that we have been given to once again raise Wales's profile in Europe during the UK's EU presidency next year. That important issue was discussed a few weeks ago in the Committee on European and External Affairs, and I am sure that we will return to it occasionally. Britain has been part of the European Union for over 30 years, but far too many people still have little understanding of what Europe does for us all. Being part of the European Union has been a positive experience. However, I think that many of us take what has been achieved for granted. The anti-European media can undermine the success of the EU, but Wales's role in the UK presidency can help to remind people of those achievements, namely securing peace and prosperity, human rights, better conditions for workers and access to structural funds.

**David Davies:** Do Labour Party Members think that locking up sceptical journalists is part of the European Union's human rights agenda?

**Christine Chapman:** You are probably referring to an individual. We will not be considering that policy.

I was disappointed to hear the opposition parties' comments on structural funds. We are currently half-way through the programmes, including the Objective 1 programme. If we look around us, we can see real improvements in Wales because of the structural funds. All the achievements have benefited the older European member states and the newer ones will now begin to enjoy those benefits.

One major activity planned for Wales is the high-profile youth event to be held in Cardiff City Hall in October 2005. I welcome that because it will help to encourage greater participation among young people in the

Frwsel yn bwysig, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried barn pobl Cymru am Frwsel a rhai prosiectau Ewropeaidd. Ni allweh osgoi'r ffaith y bydd pobl Cymru yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cyfansoddiad hwn.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf y cyfle gwirioneddol a roddwyd inni godi proffil Cymru unwaith eto yn Ewrop pan fydd y DU yn dal llywyddiaeth yr UE y flwyddyn nesaf. Trafodwyd y mater pwysig hwnnw ychydig wythnosau yn ôl yn y Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn dychwelyd ato o bryd i'w gilydd. Bu Prydain yn rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ers dros 30 mlynedd, ond mae llawer gormod o bobl o hyd heb fawr o ddealltwriaeth o'r hyn a wna Ewrop dros bob un ohonom. Mae bod yn rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi bod yn brofiad cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod llawer ohonom yn cymryd yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn ganiataol. Gall y cyfryngau gwrth-Ewropeaidd danseilio llwyddiant yr UE, ond gall rhan Cymru yn llywyddiaeth y DU helpu i atgoffa pobl o'r cyflawniadau hynny, sef sicrhau heddwch a ffyniant, hawliau dynol, amodau gwell i weithwyr a mynediad i gronfeydd strwythurol.

**David Davies:** A yw Aelodau Llafur yn credu bod rhoi newyddiadwyr amheugar yn y ddalfa yn rhan o agenda hawliau dynol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd?

**Christine Chapman:** Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at unigolyn siŵr o fod. Ni fyddwn yn ystyried y polisi hwnnw.

Siom imi oedd clywed sylwadau'r gwrthbleidiau ynglŷn â'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Yr ydym erbyn hyn hanner ffordd drwy'r rhaglenni, gan gynnwys rhaglen Amcan 1. Os edrychwn o'n hamgylch, gallwn weld gwelliannau gwirioneddol yng Nghymru oherwydd y cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae'r holl gyflawniadau wedi bod o fudd i'r aelod wladwriaethau Ewropeaidd hŷn a bydd y rhai newydd yn dechrau elwa yn awr hefyd.

Un gweithgaredd mawr sydd wedi'i gynllunio ar gyfer Cymru yw'r digwyddiad ieuenctid ag iddo broffil uchel, sydd i'w gynnal yn Neuadd y Ddinas, Caerdydd ym mis Hydref 2005. Croesawaf hynny

European agenda and in policy making. I ask that we consider organising spin-off activities for young people around Wales, which could be taken to schools, youth clubs and colleges. That may give added value to the planned one-off event and would help to draw in local authorities and others at a unique time for Wales.

**Jenny Randerson:** One of the disappointing aspects of Tony Blair's premiership has been his failure to live up to his promise to place Britain at the heart of Europe. Instead, the hostility of the tabloid press seems to have imposed a kind of paralysis on him, particularly in relation to membership of the euro.

**Leighton Andrews:** Will you give way?

**Jenny Randerson:** I would have loved to have got started, but I will.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am fascinated by your comment. The pro-European MEP from Germany, Elmar Brock, has said that he thinks that Britain has had a lot of success, many delegations are unhappy in terms of European negotiations, that no-one is as clever at negotiating as Britain and that Britain has the best foreign service in the world. Does that not suggest that Britain has been rather successful under Tony Blair's leadership in its negotiations in Europe?

**Jenny Randerson:** If you had allowed me to finish my first sentence you would follow my drift.

Blair's paralysis is particularly worrying for us in relation to our potential membership of the euro. It is disappointing for us in Wales because we rely so heavily on EU funding and because of our heavy manufacturing base—manufacturers have had to absorb the cost of the fluctuations of the pound against the euro in their pricing policies. Wales needs Europe even if there are those in Europe who do not recognise the map of Wales when they

oherwydd y bydd yn helpu i annog mwya o bobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn yr agenda Ewropeaidd ac ym mhrosesau llunio polisiau Ewrop. Gofynnaf inni ystyried trefnu gweithgareddau cysylltiedig i bobl ifanc ledled Cymru, y gellid eu cyflwyno mewn ysgolion, clybiau ieuencid a cholegau. Efallai y bydd hynny yn rhoi gwerth ychwanegol i'r digwyddiad arfaethedig unigryw hwn ac efallai y byddai'n helpu i gael awdurdodau lleol ac eraill i gymryd rhan ar adeg unigryw i Gymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Un o'r agweddau siomedig ar gyfnod Tony Blair fel Prif Weinidog y DU yw ei fethiant i gadw ei addewid i roi Prydain yng nghanol Ewrop. Yn lle hynny, ymddengys bod gelyniaeth y wasg tabloid wedi ei atal rhag gweithredu, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag aelodaeth o'r ewro.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ildiwch?

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn fod wedi bwrw ati, ond ildiaf.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae eich sylwadau yn hynod ddiddorol. Mae Elmar Brock, sef ASE o'r Almaen sy'n gefnogol i'r UE, wedi dweud ei fod yn credu bod Prydain wedi cael llawer o lwyddiant, bod llawer o ddirprwyaethau yn anfodlon o ran negodiadau Ewropeaidd, nad oes unrhyw un cystal â Phrydain o ran negodi ac mai Prydain sydd â'r gwasanaeth tramor gorau yn y byd. Onid yw hynny yn awgrymu bod Prydain wedi bod yn eithaf llwyddiannus o dan arweinyddiaeth Tony Blair yn ei negodiadau yn Ewrop?

**Jenny Randerson:** Pe baech wedi gadael imi orffen fy mrawddeg gyntaf byddech wedi deall y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud.

Mae'r diffyg gweithredu ar ran Blair yn achos pryder inni yn enwedig o ran ein haelodaeth bosibl o'r ewro. Mae'n siomedig inni yng Nghymru am ein bod yn dibynnu mor drwm ar arian Ewrop ac oherwydd ein sylfaen gweithgynhyrchu trwm—mae gweithgynhyrchwyr wedi gorfod ymdopi â'r newidiadau mawr yn y bunt yn erbyn yr ewro yn eu polisiau prisio. Mae ar Gymru angen Ewrop hyd yn oed os oes rhai yn Ewrop nad

see it. I know that the First Minister is a committed and enthusiastic European—his history tells us as much—although his lack of profile in giving the Welsh perspective on recent key European issues has been almost as disappointing as Tony Blair's inactivity. In the face of the public silence of the Labour Assembly Government on issues such as repatriation of EU funding, the self-congratulatory nature of this Government motion sticks a little in the throat. However, I am delighted to read that the Labour Assembly Government

'looks forward to playing a full role in the future referendum debate'.

It is a great pity that, over the last year, when we needed our Government to play a full role in the debates on repatriation and the 1 per cent budget ceiling, it left the job to the Welsh Local Government Association. I commend the WLGA for the excellent job that it has made of it. It did it before, when the first round of European funding was negotiated, and it has done it again, but the sad thing is that the WLGA should not have had to play that role now that we have our own Government.

The Government's silence is all the more perplexing because European Commission officials have, on several occasions, made it clear that they would welcome a direct contribution from the Welsh Assembly Government—that is, one that does not slavishly follow the UK Government line. I understand the issues, as I have attended meetings of the Council of Ministers, and if you speak as a representative of the National Assembly, you are normally expected to follow the UK Government line. There is a problem if it were to be done in a formal way because our interests are not the same as those of England, certainly not in terms of repatriation or the new map of assisted areas.

On the EU constitutional treaty, I suggest that the First Minister does not wait for Tony Blair on this issue, as is suggested here, but that he should take the lead on his own in

ydont yn adnabod map o Gymru. Gwn fod y Prif Weinidog yn ymrwymedig i Ewrop ac yn frwd drosti—mae ei hanes yn dweud hynny wrthym—er bod ei ddiffyg proffil wrth roi safbwynt Cymru ar y materion Ewropeaidd allweddol diweddar bron â bod yr un mor siomedig â diffyg gweithredu Tony Blair. Yn wyneb amharodrwydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddweud dim yn gyhoeddus ynglŷn â materion megis ailwladoli arian yr UE, mae natur hunanglodforus y cynnig hwn o eiddo'r Llywodraeth yn anodd i'w derbyn. Fodd bynnag yr wyf yn falch o ddarllen bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru

'yn edrych ymlaen at chwarae rôl lawn yn y drafodaeth sydd i ddod ar y refferendwm'.

Mae'n drueni mawr, dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, pan oeddem angen i'n Llywodraeth chwarae rhan lawn yn y dadleuon ynglŷn ag ailwladoli a'r uchafswm o 1 y cant o'r gyllideb, ei bod wedi gadael hynny i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Cymeradwyaf CLILC am ei gwaith rhagorol. Gwnaeth hynny o'r blaen, ar adeg negodi'r cylch cyntaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd ac mae wedi ei gwneud hynny eto, ond yr hyn sy'n drist yw na ddylai CLILC fod wedi gorfod chwarae'r rhan honno gan fod gennym ein Llywodraeth ein hunain bellach.

Mae amharodrwydd y Llywodraeth i ddweud dim yn peri mwy o ddrysych fyth am fod swyddogion y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd wedi egluro, sawl gwaith, y byddent yn croesawu cyfraniad uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—hynny yw, cyfraniad nad yw'n arddel safbwynt Llywodraeth y DU yn slafaid. Deallaf y materion dan sylw, gan fy mod wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd o Gyngor y Gweinidogion, ac os siaradwch fel cynrychiolwr o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, disgwylir ichi fel arfer arddel safbwynt Llywodraeth y DU. Codai problem pe bai angen gwneud hynny'n ffurfiol am nad oes gennym yr un buddiannau â Lloegr, yn sicr nid o ran ailwladoli neu'r map newydd o ardaloedd a gynorthwyr.

O ran cytundeb cyfansoddiadol yr UE, awgrymaf na ddylai'r Prif Weinidog aros am Tony Blair ar y mater hwn, fel yr awgrymir yma, ond y dylai arwain ar ei ben ei hun yng

Wales in explaining the advantages and safeguards of the new constitution. Indeed, he should also take the opportunity to tell people about the advantages of the EU as a whole. The Prime Minister, I recall, once promised us roadshows on the euro. We did not get them, but the idea was a good one, and the First Minister could usefully adopt it in relation to the constitution. However, the Welsh Liberal Democrats accept that the Welsh Assembly Government has played a part in the development of the constitution. Indeed, proactive preliminary behind-the-scenes-work was undertaken during the partnership Government.

Finally, on the amendments, they are many and varied, but a strong cross-party thread runs through them. Whatever our views on the constitution may be, there is recognition of the importance of EU funding to Wales and of the need to develop a strong Welsh profile in Europe. We need to build on this consensus if we are to get the best out of Europe for Wales, and I ask the Government to be more proactive in the next year than it has been in the last.

4.00 p.m.

**David Davies:** Article 10 of the European convention on human rights, supported by the European Union and incorporated into British law, is meant to guarantee the right to freedom of expression. The various bodies of the European Union have clearly demonstrated scant regard for this over the past year. The name of Hans-Martin Tillack does not yet rank alongside those of Solzhenitsyn or the Reverend Niemoller, but I suspect that one day it might. He is a journalist for Germany's *Stern* magazine and has published a book and a number of articles on mismanagement, corruption and cover-ups in the European Union based on inside information. In March, following a complaint from OLAF officials, which was subsequently shown to be false, Mr Tillack's flat was raided by six police officers who held him without charge for 10 hours and confiscated all of his computer records and documents. Despite the fact that the allegations were shown to have been concocted by two OLAF officials, the

Nghymru i esbonio manteision a chamau diogelwch y cyfansoddiad newydd. Yn wir, dylai hefyd fanteisio ar y cyfle i ddweud wrth bobl am fanteision yr UE yn gyffredinol. Cofiaf i Brif Weinidog y DU addo cynnal sioeau teithiol ar yr ewro unwaith. Ni chawsom hwy, ond yr oedd y syniad yn un da, a byddai'n fuddiol pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn ei fabwysiadu o ran y cyfansoddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn derbyn bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi chwarae rhan yn y gwaith o ddatblygu'r cyfansoddiad, Yn wir, gwnaed gwaith cychwynnol rhagweithiol y tu ôl i'r llen yn ystod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth.

Yn olaf, o ran y gwelliannau, mae llawer ohonynt ac maent yn amrywiol, ond ceir llinyn trawsbleidiol cryf drwyddynt. Beth bynnag fo'n barn am y cyfansoddiad, cydnabyddir pwysigrwydd arian yr UE i Gymru a'r angen i ddatblygu proffil cryf i Gymru yn Ewrop. Mae angen inni adeiladu ar y consensws hwn er mwyn i Gymru gael y gorau o Ewrop, a gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth fod yn fwy rhagweithiol yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf nag a fu yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

**David Davies:** Diben erthygl 10 y confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar hawliau dynol, a gefnogwyd gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac a ymgorfforwyd yng nghyfreithiau Prydain, yw gwarantu'r hawl i ryddid i ddatgan barn. Mae cyrff amrywiol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn amlwg wedi dangos nemor ddim parch i hynny dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Nid yw enw Hans-Martin Tillack mor adnabyddus eto â Solzhenitsyn neu'r Parchedig Niemoller, ond credaf y gallai fod yr un mor adnabyddus ryw ddydd. Newyddiadurwr ydyw sy'n gweithio i gylchgrawn *Stern* yn yr Almaen ac mae wedi cyhoeddi llyfr a nifer o erthyglau ar gamreoli, llygredd a chelu camgymeriadau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth o'r tu mewn. Ym mis Mawrth, ar ôl cwyn gan swyddogion OLAF, a brofwyd yn ddi-sail wedyn, dygwyd cyrch ar fflat Mr Tillack gan chwe swyddog o'r heddlu. Bu yn y ddalfa heb ei gyhuddo am 10 awr ac atafaelwyd ei holl gofnodion cyfrifiadurol a'i ddogfennau. Er y profwyd bod honiadau'r ddau swyddog o OLAF yn

authorities have refused to return his records and are using them, against all existing European case law, to try to identify those who sought to blow the whistle on EU corruption.

Last week, Signor Buttiglione, who holds private views about morality that I do not share but which are shared by millions of Roman Catholics, was barred from office despite stating that his religious views would not affect his work. We may disagree with Mr Buttiglione, but to bar him from office was another flagrant breach of the EU's supposed commitment to freedom.

Most damning of all if the personal vilification of anyone who seeks to criticise any aspect of the European Union. They are branded by people such as Dennis MacShane, the European Minister, as xenophobes, racists and bigots. I am not xenophobic—I am married to a Hungarian, her family are now my family, and our daughter will be as much Hungarian as she is British. I make no apologies for saying that I am Welsh and proud to be British, and, unlike the people running the European Union, I am a proud believer in freedom and democracy. We voted to become part of a trading and customs union, but, instead, a European elite has made us part of a drive for a federal European state in which dissenters are vilified, barred from office, and, on occasion, locked up. Michael Howard was right to say that it is time to renegotiate.

**The First Minister:** I enjoyed this debate, because I have been savaged for being too enthusiastic about the treaty, and savaged by other Members of the opposition flock of sheep, moribund or otherwise, for not being enthusiastic enough about it. This tells me that I have probably got it about right. If people believe that 10 new countries should have joined the union, as has happened—and I do not think there is dissent from this proposition—they then tend to believe that

gwbl ddi-sail, mae'r awdurdodau wedi gwrthod dychwelyd ei gofnodion ac maent yn eu defnyddio, yn groes i bob cyfraith achos Ewropeaidd sy'n bodoli, i geisio canfod y rhai a geisiodd ddatgelu llygredd yn yr UE.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwaharddwyd Signor Buttiglione, sy'n arddel safbwyntiau moesegol nad wyf i'n eu harddel ond sy'n cael eu harddel gan filiynau o Babyddion, rhag ymgymryd â'i swydd, er iddo ddweud na fyddai ei safbwyntiau crefyddol yn effeithio ar ei waith. Efallai ein bod yn anghytuno â Mr Buttiglione, ond yr oedd y penderfyniad i'w wahardd rhag ymgymryd â'i swydd yn achos amlwg o dorri ymrwymiad honedig yr UE i ryddid.

Yr hyn sydd fwyaf damniol yw'r ffordd y caiff unrhyw un sy'n ceisio beirniadu unrhyw agwedd ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ei ddiffrïo. Cânt eu cyhuddo o fod yn estrongar, yn hiliol ac yn rhagfarnllyd gan bobl megis Dennis MacShane, y Gweinidog dros Ewrop. Nid wyf yn estrongar—yr wyf yn briod â merch o Hwngari, ei theulu hi yw fy nheulu i bellach, ac i'n merch bydd ei threftadaeth Hwngaraidd yr un mor bwysig â'i threftadaeth Brydeinig. Nid ymddiheuraf am ddweud mai Cymro ydwyf ac fy mod yn falch o fod yn Brydeiniwr, ac, yn wahanol i'r bobl sy'n rhedeg yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, yr wyf yn gredwr mawr mewn rhyddid a democratiaeth. Bu inni bleidleisio i ddod yn rhan o undeb masnachu a thollau, ond, yn lle hynny, mae elît Ewropeaidd wedi ein gwneud yn rhan o ymgyrch i greu gwladwriaeth Ewropeaidd ffederal lle y caiff gwrthwynebwyr eu diffrïo, eu gwahardd rhag dal swyddi, ac, ambell waith, eu rhoi yn y ddalfa. Yr oedd Michael Howard yn llygad ei le pan ddywedodd ei bod yn bryd inni ailnegodi.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mwynheais y ddadl hon am i rai Aelodau ymosod arnaf am fod yn rhy frwd dros y cytundeb, ac am i Aelodau eraill o'r gwrthbleidiau sy'n ymddwyn fel defaid, pa un a ydynt ar fin trigo ai peidio, ymosod arnaf am beidio â bod yn ddigon brwd drosto. Dywed hynny wrthyf fy mod wedi gwneud y peth iawn siŵr o fod. Os cred pobl y dylai 10 gwlad newydd fod wedi ymuno â'r undeb, fel sydd wedi digwydd—ac ni chredaf fod unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r cynnig hwn—yna

the arrangements that suited a EU of six, nine or 10 countries cannot be maintained. Therefore, changes have to be made. Not everyone agrees with every aspect of the treaty, but it is accepted that we need a treaty to make a EU of 25 countries workable. If this is accepted, to then not accept the treaty itself is sheer opportunism, because, if you will the end, you must will the means.

It is important to understand the referendum issue. What is a referendum? Saving your graces, it is rather like the House of Lords. It is a device promoted by the Conservatives to try to keep themselves in power even when they are not in office. If they win a general election, referenda will be forgotten. They did not hold a referendum when we first entered the Common Market, on the single European treaty, or on Maastricht.

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**The First Minister:** Given that Nick Bourne has risen to his feet, perhaps he can answer this question: is it a matter of not doing as I do, but do as I say? The Conservatives have not held referenda; it is only Labour that held a referendum on entry into the Common Market, which was the equivalent of today's European Union.

**Nick Bourne:** I look forward to you posing questions to me when I am in your position and when you are leader of the opposition. Given that you are old enough, you will recall that Labour's referendum on remaining in the European Union was held very much in the teeth of the views of the then Prime Minister, Harold Wilson. It was forced on him by Tony Benn. Your argument against referenda might hold more water were it not for the fact that this is now Labour Party policy. Or is this an example of clear red water in that you do not want this referendum? If so, perhaps you would say so, but it flies in the face of your leader at Westminster.

tueddant i gredu na ellir parhau â'r trefniadau a oedd yn addas i UE a chanddo chwech, naw neu 10 o wledydd. Felly rhaid gwneud newidiadau. Nid yw pawb yn cytuno â phob agwedd ar y cytundeb, ond derbynnir bod arnom angen cytundeb i sicrhau bod UE o 25 o wledydd yn ymarferol. Os derbynnir hyn, oportiwnistiaeth lwyr felly yw peidio â derbyn y cytundeb ei hun, oherwydd os ydych yn chwennych y diben, rhaid wrth y moddion.

Mae'n bwysig deall y mater o ran y refferendwm. Beth yw refferendwm? Gyda phob parch i'r arglwyddi, mae'n eithaf tebyg i Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Mae'n ddyfais a hyrwyddwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr i geisio cadw eu hunain mewn grym hyd yn oed pan nad ydynt mewn grym. Os enilliant etholiad cyffredinol, ni fydd sôn am refferenda. Ni chynhaliwyd refferendwm ganddynt ar adeg ymuno â'r Farchnad Gyffredin, ar y cytundeb Ewropeaidd sengl nac ar gytundeb Maastricht.

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O weld bod Nick Bourne wedi codi ar ei draed, efallai y gall ateb y cwestiwn hwn: onid yw'n fater o beidio â gwneud fel y gwnaf fi, ond gwneud fel y dywedaf fi? Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr wedi cynnal refferenda; dim ond Llafur a gynhaliodd refferendwm ar adeg ymuno â'r Farchnad Gyffredin, sef yr hyn a oedd yn cyfateb â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd heddiw.

**Nick Bourne:** Edrychaf ymlaen at adeg pan fyddwch yn fy holi a minnau yn eich swydd chi a chithau'n arweinydd yr wrthblaid. O ystyried eich bod yn ddigon hen, fe gofiwch i refferendwm Llafur ynglŷn ag aros yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gael ei gynnal er gwaethaf gwrthwynebiad Prif Weinidog y DU ar y pryd, Harold Wilson. Fe'i gorfodwyd arno gan Tony Benn. Efallai y byddai eich dadl yn erbyn refferenda yn dal mwy o ddŵr oni bai am y ffaith bod hyn yn bolisi gan y Blaid Lafur bellach. Neu a yw hyn yn enghraifft o wahaniaeth barn rhwng y Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan ac ym Mae Caerdydd yn yr ystyr nad ydych am gael y refferendwm hwn? Os felly, efallai y byddech yn dweud hynny, ond byddwch yn mynd yn hollol groes i'ch arweinydd yn San



Steffan.

**The First Minister:** If ever there was an example of being caught on the quick, that was it. That is the final proof of your ‘do as I say, not as I do’ attitude. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** Referenda are a device that the Conservatives discover when they have lost two general elections in a row—or three in a row as it will be next year. When you have lost that third general election in a row, you will still be bleating on about a referendum. You will think, ‘If we cannot win a general election, maybe we can win a referendum.’ You have lost the general election, but you must be consistent: you never had referenda, so why are you always demanding them now that Labour is in power? You must remember that it is not a matter—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** It is not something to be used only when you are not in power because you lost a general election.

**Mark Isherwood:** We learn from the past; we do not live in it. Do you agree with the Belgian premier, Guy Verhofstadt, who states:

‘The EU now acquires all the instruments of a federal state. The capstone is the Constitutional treaty.’?

Do you agree with Tony Blair’s former chief economic adviser, Derek Scott, that Gordon Brown’s five euro tests are absurd and economically illiterate?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that it is necessary to bring up those issues this afternoon, and I do not agree with Guy Verhofstadt’s view, but the important point is that you must have a workable arrangement. If you agree with bringing 10 new member states in, you must have workable arrangements with them, and that is not possible with the system that we had before.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna enghraifft wych o ddal rhywun. Dyna’r prawf terfynol o’ch agwedd ‘gwnewch fel y dywedaf, nid fel y gwnaf’. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyfais yw refferenda y mae’r Ceidwadwyr yn ei darganfod ar ôl iddynt gollu dau etholiad cyffredinol yn olynol—neu dri yn olynol fel y bydd y flwyddyn nesaf. Ar ôl colli eich trydydd etholiad cyffredinol yn olynol, byddwch yn dal i sôn am refferendwm. Byddwch yn meddwl, ‘Os na allwn ennill etholiad cyffredinol, efallai y gallwn ennill refferendwm.’ Yr ydych wedi colli’r etholiad cyffredinol, ond rhaid ichi fod yn gyson: ni chynhaliwyd refferenda erioed gennych, felly pam yr ydych bob amser yn galw amdanynt a Llafur mewn grym bellach? Rhaid ichi gofio nad mater—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw’n rhywbeth i’w ddefnyddio dim ond pan nad ydych mewn grym am eich bod wedi colli etholiad.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr ydym yn dysgu oddi wrth y gorffennol; nid ydym yn byw ynddo. Dywedodd prif weinidog Gwlad Belg, Guy Verhofstadt:

Mae’r UE bellach yn cael gafael ar bob offeryn gwladwriaeth ffereral. Mae’r cytundeb Cyfansoddiadol yn coroni’r cyfan.

A gytunwch ag ef? A gytunwch â chyn-brif ymgynghorydd economaidd Tony Blair, Derek Scott, fod pum prawf ewro Gordon Brown yn hurt ac nad ydynt yn gwneud synnwyr yn economaidd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf fod angen codi’r materion hynny y prynhawn yma, ac ni chytunaf â barn Guy Verhofstadt, ond y pwynt pwysig yw bod yn rhaid wrth drefniant ymarferol. Os cytunwch ag aelodaeth 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd, rhaid wrth drefniadau ymarferol, ac nid yw hynny yn bosibl gyda’r system a fu gennym gynt. Oportiwntiaeth lwyr yw ceisio dweud fel

It is sheer opportunism to try to claim otherwise.

We have had success with the structural funds, but there is still a long way to go. I noticed that Ieuan Wyn Jones again showed utter economic illiteracy in his comments—and Nick Bourne also said this—about there being a decline in relative gross domestic product per head in Wales, connected with the implementation of the structural funds. That is not so. If you consider the statistics again, you will see that the long decline in Wales's relative GDP per head has come to an end and that it has been stable since 2000-01. If it had been in a long period of decline, you would not expect, especially against the currency factors, which Jenny Randerson was right to refer to, a straight upturn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will you give way?

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, but there is no time. I have a time limit.

I am grateful to Mike German for making at least a partially constructive contribution to the debate, as did Jenny, by referring to the importance of our achievements in raising Wales's profile, and we intend to continue to do that during the presidency. We hope to have Council of Ministers informal meetings here also. The important point is that we will continue to seek above-Barnett-formula funding. Your comments about what I said at the last Committee on European and External Affairs meeting is a distinction without a difference. There is no problem with the principle of getting above-Barnett-formula funding to continue, but it is important that we bargain on the amount, and you cannot do that, and there is no point in people talking about leadership, if you are talking about followership. You cannot follow the European Commission line when it does not have budgetary power. It is offering us cheques with nothing behind them in the bank. It is important that we continue to seek the best deal for Europe, and that means getting the Treasury to agree a substantial slug of above Barnett money to pursue our European objectives, which have been

arall. Yr ydym wedi cael llwyddiant gyda'r cronfeydd strwythurol, ond mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd eto. Sylwais fod Ieuan Wyn Jones unwaith eto wedi dangos anwybodaeth lwyr o faterion economaidd yn ei sylwadau—a dywedodd Nick Bourne hyn hefyd—o ran bod gostyngiad yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cymharol y pen yng Nghymru, sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithrediad y cronfeydd strwythurol. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Os ystyriwch yr ystadegau eto, fe welwch fod y gostyngiad hirdymor yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cymharol y pen yng Nghymru wedi dod i ben ac y bu'n sefydlog er 2000-01. Pe bai wedi bod yn gostwng ers cyfnod maith, ni fydddech yn disgwyl cynnydd syml, yn enwedig o ystyried y ffactorau o ran arian cyfred, y cyfeiriodd Jenny Randerson atynt, a hynny'n briodol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A ildiwch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond nid oes amser. Mae gennyf derfyn amser.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Mike German am wneud cyfraniad rhannol adeiladol o leiaf i'r ddadl, fel y gwnaeth Jenny, drwy gyfeirio at bwysigrwydd ein cyflawniadau wrth godi proffil Cymru, a bwriadwn barhau i wneud hynny yn ystod y llywyddiaeth. Ein gobaith yw cael cyfarfodydd anffurfiol o Gyngor y Gweinidogion yma hefyd. Y pwynt pwysig yw y byddwn yn parhau i geisio cael arian yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett. Mae eich sylwadau ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedais yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yn hollti blew. Nid oes unrhyw broblem gyda'r egwyddor o sicrhau bod arian yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett yn parhau, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn negodi'r swm, ac ni allwch wneud hynny, ac ofer yw sôn am roi arweiniad, os mai sôn am ddilyn yr ydych. Ni allwch ddilyn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd pan nad yw'r pŵer cyllidebol ganddo. Mae'n cynnig sieciau inni heb ddim byd wrth gefn yn y banc. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn parhau i geisio'r fargen orau i Ewrop, ac mae hynny'n golygu cael y Trysorlys i gytuno ar swm mawr o arian yn ychwanegol at Barnett er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'n hamcanion

remarkably successful.

Ewropeaidd, a fu'n hynod lwyddiannus.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 10, Ymatal 17, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 10, Abstain 17, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*  
*Amendment 3: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val

Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

4.10 p.m.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 4: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 5: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 6: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 7: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 8: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 9: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 18, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 10: For 18, Abstain 9, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:



Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 German, Michael  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*  
*Amendment 11: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
 Amendment 12: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 13: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2143): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Motion (NDM2143): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.16 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.16 p.m.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol ar y Cynllun Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol The Annual Report of the Local Government Partnership Scheme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Part II of Schedule 11 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 6.6, considers the local government partnership scheme annual report for 2003-04, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 27 October 2004. (NDM2142)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rhan II o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6, yn ystyried adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2003-04, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 27 Hydref 2004. (NDM2142)*

I am pleased to introduce the debate on the 2003-04 annual report of the local government partnership scheme. It has been developed in partnership with local government and was considered by the Partnership Council on 6 May and the Assembly's Local Government and Public Services Committee on 16 June. The partnership scheme and the council embrace all sectors of local government, including the police, fire and national park authorities as well as town and community councils.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol 2003-04 ar y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol. Fe'i datblygwyd mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol ac fe'i hystyriwyd gan y Cyngor Partneriaeth ar 6 Mai a chan Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad ar 16 Mehefin. Mae'r cynllun partneriaeth a'r cyngor yn ymgorffori pob sector o lywodraeth leol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau'r heddlu, tân a'r parciau cenedlaethol yn ogystal â chynghorau tref a chymuned.

One important and significant development to the evolution of this partnership has been the establishment of One Voice Wales, which paves the way for a single association to represent town and community councils in Wales. Over 500 councils have already joined and the organisation is now developing with the intention of being an effective voice for local councils.

The reality is that the partnership with local government is essential. That was recognised in the Government of Wales Act 1998. It is certainly essential for the Assembly Government to achieve our strategic vision, shared by local government, as set out in 'Wales—A Better Country'. The continuing challenge is to match local and national priorities—the local authority community strategies with the Assembly Government's strategic agenda. Members will recall that I have often discussed how we can get that balance between the strategy and the local objectives right.

The development of policy agreements is part of how we manage those local and national priorities. We are close to concluding a new round of policy agreements covering the period 2004-07. These policy agreements are the result of dialogue and commitments between the Welsh Assembly Government and the 22 unitary authorities in Wales. These agreements draw an explicit link between local and national priorities and set out specific measures of success so that the public can see what progress is really being made. I am pleased that a number of authorities have already signed policy agreements. I signed the Conwy and Denbighshire agreements last week and they are already in receipt of their performance incentive grant.

I also believe that community strategies are critical documents because they are very much based on working with local partnerships, following the input of local communities. When I was in north Wales last week, I was pleased to launch Conwy's community strategy. Denise Idris Jones was also there. The top hall at the North Wales Theatre and Conference Centre in Llandudno was full of people, young and old, from

Un o ddatblygiadau pwysig ac arwyddocaol datblygiad y bartneriaeth hon oedd sefydlu Un Llais i Gymru, sy'n paratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer un gymdeithas i gynrychioli cyngorau tref a chymuned yng Nghymru. Mae dros 500 o gynghorau eisoes wedi ymuno â'r bartneriaeth ac mae'r sefydliad yn datblygu yn awr gyda'r bwriad o fod yn llais effeithiol i gynghorau lleol.

Y gwir yw bod y bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol yn hanfodol. Cydnabuwyd hynny yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Yn sicr mae'n hanfodol er mwyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyflawni ein gweledigaeth strategol, a rennir gan lywodraeth leol, fel y nodir yn 'Cymru—Gwlad Well'. Yr her barhaus yw cyfateb blaenoriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol—strategaethau cymunedol awdurdodau lleol gydag agenda strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd Aelodau yn cofio imi drafod yn aml sut y gallwn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng y strategaeth a'r amcanion lleol.

Mae datblygu cytundebau polisi yn rhan o'r ffordd y rheolwn y blaenoriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol hynny. Yr ydym yn agos at gwblhau cylch newydd o gytundebau polisi yn cwmpasu'r cyfnod 2004-07. Canlyniad trafodaethau ac ymrwymadau rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r 22 o awdurdodau unedol yng Nghymru yw'r cytundebau polisi hyn. Mae'r cytundebau hyn yn creu cyswllt amlwg rhwng blaenoriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol ac yn nodi mesurau penodol o lwyddiant fel y gall y cyhoedd weld pa gynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud mewn gwirionedd. Yr wyf yn falch bod nifer o awdurdodau eisoes wedi llofnodi cytundebau polisi. Llofnodais gytundebau Conwy a sir Ddinbych yr wythnos diwethaf ac maent eisoes wedi derbyn eu grant cymell perfformiad.

Credaf hefyd fod strategaethau cymunedol yn ddogfennau hollbwysig oherwydd maent yn seiliedig i raddau helaeth ar weithio gyda phartneriaethau lleol, yn dilyn cyfraniad cymunedau lleol. Pan oeddwn yn y Gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn yn falch o lansio strategaeth gymunedol Conwy. Yr oedd Denise Idris Jones yno hefyd. Yr oedd y neuadd uchaf yn Theatr a Chanolfan Gynadledda Gogledd Cymru yn Llandudno

different parts of the constituency, which sent a positive message about how community strategies work.

I intend shortly to commission an independent evaluation of the first round of community strategies to establish how well the process of joint working between authorities, communities and agencies operate.

4.20 p.m.

I am also pleased to report that work to rationalise the plan-making burden on local authorities is well in hand and on target. We are working with local authorities, the voluntary sector and other interested parties to identify alternatives to plan requirements. By April next year, I hope to consolidate this into an agreed, more coherent and streamlined planning and improvement framework. I know that local authorities have wanted this for many years, and I hope that we will achieve that by next April.

Partnership is also needed to improve standards of service delivery. I will mention one particular service area—town and country planning. We are working closely with our partners in local government and other sectors to improve the planning system, in line with 'Planning: Delivering for Wales'. Clearly, the commitment of local authorities, and indeed of each elected member, is essential to deliver the improved service we need. This summer, with Assembly support, Syniad, the Welsh Local Government Association's training organisation, prepared and delivered a planning briefing programme for members of all local planning authorities in Wales. Every Member knows that we must deliver a consistent quality and standard across Wales in this regard. Between the Assembly, Syniad and local government we shall, hopefully, realise that quality. Feedback received to date has been positive and we hope that the programme will provide real benefits for everyone who uses the planning system.

We work with the Audit Commission and

yn llawn pobl, hen ac ifanc, o wahanol rannau o'r etholaeth, a oedd yn cyfleu neges gadarnhaol ynglŷn â sut y mae strategaethau cymunedol yn gweithio.

Cyn bo hir bwriadaf gomisiynu gwerthusiad annibynnol o gylch cyntaf y strategaethau cymunedol i weld pa mor dda y mae'r awdurdodau, y cymunedau a'r asiantaethau yn cydweithio â'i gilydd.

Yr wyf yn falch hefyd o adrodd bod y gwaith o symleiddio'r baich o wneud cynlluniau ar awdurdodau lleol yn mynd rhagddo'n dda ac ar amser. Yr ydym yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol, y sector gwirfoddol a rhai eraill sydd â diddordeb i nodi dewisiadau amgen i ofynion cynllunio. Erbyn mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, gobeithiaf atgyfnerthu hyn yn fframwaith cynllunio a gwella symlach, mwy cydlynol y cytunwyd arno. Gwn fod awdurdodau lleol wedi dymuno cael hyn ers blynyddoedd lawer, a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn cyflawni hynny erbyn mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae angen partneriaeth hefyd i wella safonau darparu gwasanaethau. Soniaf am un maes gwasanaeth yn benodol—cynllunio gwlad a thref. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol a sectorau eraill i wella'r system gynllunio, yn unol â 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru'. Yn amlwg, mae ymrwymiad awdurdodau lleol, ac yn wir pob aelod etholedig, yn hanfodol i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gwell sydd ei angen arnom. Yr haf hwn, gyda chymorth y Cynulliad, paratôdd Syniad, sef sefydliad hyfforddi Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, raglen friffio ar gynllunio a'i chyflwyno i aelodau pob awdurdod cynllunio lleol yng Nghymru. Mae pob Aelod yn gwybod bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau ansawdd a safon gyson ledled Cymru yn hyn o beth. Rhwng y Cynulliad, Syniad a llywodraeth leol gobeithiwn y gallwn wireddu'r ansawdd hwnnw. Bu'r adborth a gafwyd hyd yma yn gadarnhaol a gobeithiwn y bydd y rhaglen yn rhoi buddiannau gwirioneddol i bawb sy'n defnyddio'r system gynllunio.

Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Comisiwn

local government on the development of our programme for achieving sustainable improvement in local services in each local authority, the Wales programme for improvement. This programme is creating an innovative balance between demanding local responsibility and providing mutual support, and, importantly for the public, ensuring robust external challenge where needed. Although still in its early stage of development, the Wales programme for improvement has shown positive results, with every authority showing a net improvement as measured by the performance indicators set by the Assembly. That is crucial in terms of taking local authorities down the path of improvement. In particular, improvement has been marked in education, the amount of waste recycled by local authorities has increased, housing repairs classed as urgent are being dealt with more promptly, which is crucial for tenants, and the use of leisure facilities is on an upward trend. This, again, is important in terms of our health agenda.

This progress provides a solid foundation for taking forward our vision for public services and the way in which they are designed and delivered in Wales. Our programme for change is about delivering the best possible services to the people of Wales: services based on the principle of collaboration—as Rhodri Morgan set out in his ‘Making the Connections’ report—not competition, which take care of everyone, particularly those in greatest need, and empower the citizen to participate alongside the professional. I commend this report to you. There are many other examples which I could mention, but I know that time is short.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the need for the Partnership Council to prepare a strategy to reduce unacceptably high levels of council tax.*

All parties in the Chamber recognise the importance of a spirit of partnership between local government and central Government—that is important. Local government is a key

Archwilio a llywodraeth leol i ddatblygu ein rhaglen ar gyfer sicrhau gwelliannau cynaliadwy o ran gwasanaethau lleol ym mhob awdurdod lleol, y rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella. Mae'r rhaglen hon yn creu cydbwysedd arloesol rhwng gofyn am gyfrifoldeb lleol ac annog y ddwy ochr i helpu ei gilydd, ac yn bwysig i'r cyhoedd, sicrhau her allanol gadarn lle bo ei hangen. Er nad yw wedi datblygu llawer eto, mae rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella wedi dangos canlyniadau cadarnhaol, gyda phob awdurdod yn dangos gwelliant clir fel y mesurwyd gan y dangosyddion perfformiad a bennwyd gan y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig o ran sicrhau y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gwella. Yn arbennig, bu gwelliant amlwg ym maes addysg, bu cynnydd ym maint y gwastraff a ailgylchir gan awdurdodau lleol, mae gwaith atgyweirio tai a nodwyd fel gwaith brys yn cael ei wneud yn gynt, sy'n hollbwysig i denantiaid, a bu cynnydd yn y defnydd o gyfleusterau hamdden. Mae hyn, unwaith eto, yn bwysig o ran ein hagenda iechyd.

Mae'r cynnydd hwn yn darparu sail gadarn ar gyfer gweithredu ar ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a'r ffordd y cânt eu cynllunio a'u darparu yng Nghymru. Mae a wnelo ein rhaglen ar gyfer newid â darparu'r gwasanaethau gorau posibl i bobl Cymru: gwasanaethau yn seiliedig ar egwyddor cydweithredu—fel y nododd Rhodri Morgan yn ei adroddiad ‘Creu'r Cysylltiadau’—nid cystadlu, sy'n gofalu am bawb, yn arbennig y rhai sydd â'r angen mwyaf, a grymuso'r dinesydd i gyfranogi ochr yn ochr â'r gweithiwr proffesiynol. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn ichi. Mae sawl enghraifft arall y gallwn eu crybwyll, ond gwn fod amser yn brin.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod angen i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth baratoi strategaeth er mwyn lleihau lefelau'r dreth gyngor sy'n annerbyniol o uchel.*

Mae pob plaid yn y Siambr yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd ysbryd o bartneriaeth rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth ganolog—mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae llywodraeth leol

partner in the governance of Wales. The National Assembly for Wales may be the primary Wales-based partner in that partnership, but it is local government which delivers the public services that are so important. There may be times when there is disagreement between us as parties or individuals with regard to individual councils or local government as a whole, but that is entirely healthy in a democracy. As long as we never forget that we are partners, that is perfectly acceptable.

I shall deal with one theme, namely working together with local government to ensure that it retains the respect and support of local people. There is wide range of subjects that we could have chosen, but that is a theme that will allow me to talk about council tax, the balance of funding issue, which is important, and, if there is time, the point the Minister raised about the planning system and, in my view, the perhaps inappropriate use of the system in terms of planning gain.

Council tax is a real problem in Wales, though not in principle. I know that Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats think that council tax itself is wrong in principle, but I have never thought that. In previous debates here, it has always been my view that a property tax is a perfectly reasonable tax within the portfolio of taxes by means of which every Government must raise funds. The real problem is the level of council tax. We try to blame various people—and there are battles about who is to blame—but the real problem with the level of council tax is that it will mostly affect local government. When people get their bills from local government, they blame local government, and the level that council tax has now reached has caused many people to turn against their councils, even though it is not their fault.

The blame lies with the Labour Government. Without any messing at all, the blame lies with Labour. We know the facts: in 1993, council tax was less than £400 on average. By the time that the Conservatives left office it was still less than £500. Last year, it rose to just short of £900. You cannot escape those

yn un o'r partneriaid allweddol o ran llywodraethu Cymru. Efallai mai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw'r partner sylfaenol yng Nghymru yn y bartneriaeth honno, ond llywodraeth leol sy'n darparu'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd mor bwysig. Efallai fod adegau pan fo anghytundeb rhyngom fel pleidiau neu unigolion o ran cynghorau unigol neu lywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol, ond mae hynny'n hollol iach mewn democratiaeth. Cyhyd â'n bod bob amser yn cofio ein bod yn bartneriaid, mae hynny'n hollol dderbyniol.

Ymdriniaf ag un thema, sef cydweithio â llywodraeth leol i sicrhau bod pobl leol yn parhau i'w pharchu a'i chefnogi. Gallem fod wedi dewis ystod eang o bynciau, ond mae honno'n thema a fydd yn caniatáu imi sôn am y dreth gyngor, mater cydbwysedd cyllid, sy'n bwysig, ac, os bydd amser, y pwynt a gododd y Gweinidog am y system gynllunio ac, yn fy marn i, y defnydd amhriodol efallai o'r system o ran lles cynllunio.

Mae'r dreth gyngor yn broblem wirioneddol yng Nghymru, er nad ydyw mewn egwyddor. Gwn fod Plaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn credu bod y dreth gyngor ei hun yn anghywir mewn egwyddor, ond nid wyf erioed wedi credu hynny. Mewn dadleuon blaenorol yma, yr wyf bob amser wedi bod o'r farn bod treth eiddo yn dreth hollol resymol o fewn y portffolio trethi y mae'n rhaid i bob Llywodraeth godi arian drwyddo. Y broblem wirioneddol yw lefel y dreth gyngor. Ceisiwn roi'r bai ar wahanol bobl—a cheir anghytuno ynghylch pwy sydd ar fai—ond y broblem wirioneddol gyda lefel y dreth gyngor yw y bydd yn effeithio'n bennaf ar lywodraeth leol. Pan fydd pobl yn cael eu biliau gan lywodraeth leol, maent yn beio llywodraeth leol, ac mae lefel y dreth gyngor bellach wedi achosi i lawer o bobl droi yn erbyn eu cynghorau, er nad hwy sydd ar fai.

Y Llywodraeth Lafur sydd ar fai. Heb wastraffu geiriau, Llafur sydd ar fai. Gwyddom y ffeithiau: yn 1993, yr oedd y dreth gyngor yn llai na £400 ar gyfartaledd. Erbyn i gyfnod y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym ddod i ben, yr oedd yn llai na £500 o hyd. Y llynedd, cododd i ychydig yn llai na £900. Ni



figures. I have heard the First Minister trying to play the percentages game; other people are probably following that now, but that does not wash with anyone. These are the basic figures. The blame lies absolutely with Labour. It is important that we recognise that, because if you do not recognise where the problem lies you cannot do much about it.

We must find some way of funding local government without raising council tax, because we cannot go on like this. The Minister announced the settlement for local government yesterday. It is too early to make an absolute judgment on its impact, but already local councils are telephoning me to say that the inadequacy of this settlement will lead to huge council tax increases next year. If that turns out to be the case, it will cause the people of Wales to turn against their councils. That is no good to councils, and is no good to us. We must work with councils, in partnership, to find a way to prevent this from happening.

**Peter Law:** This is all old stuff—we hear week after week that the level of council tax is the Labour Government’s fault. However, will you not join me in welcoming the good news that the Minister gave us yesterday? Do you not think that it is excellent that Monmouthshire—and I notice that everyone is quiet on your side of the Chamber—got a 7.1 per cent uplift? That is the highest percentage on the list. Some £13 million in business rates have come back to local authorities in Wales from the Chancellor, thanks to the good work of my friend, the Minister, in negotiating that, and the capital budgets are up 16 per cent. Is that not to be celebrated, and would it not be appropriate to hear the Tories say ‘well done’, because this is all positive stuff?

**Glyn Davies:** You should know, as a former Minister, Peter, that it is wise to look beyond the press release that the Minister has prepared for the day: looking at the press release seems to be all that you have done. I will talk to local government and find out what it thinks of this: if you ask it, you will

allwch ddianc rhag y ffigurau hynny. Yr wyf wedi clywed y Prif Weinidog yn ceisio chwarae’r gêm canrannau; mae pobl eraill yn ceisio gwneud hynny yn awr mae’n siŵr, ond ni fydd neb yn credu hynny. Y ffigurau sylfaenol yw’r rhain. Llafur yn bendant sydd ar fai. Mae’n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny, oherwydd os nad ydych yn cydnabod ble mae’r broblem ni allwch wneud llawer yn ei chylch.

Rhaid inni ganfod rhyw ffordd o ariannu llywodraeth leol heb godi’r dreth gyngor, oherwydd ni allwn barhau fel hyn. Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog y setliad ar gyfer llywodraeth leol ddoe. Mae’n rhy gynnar i lunio barn bendant ar ei effaith, ond eisoes mae cynghorau lleol yn fy ffonio i ddweud y bydd annigonolrwydd y setliad hwn yn arwain at gynnydd enfawr yn y dreth gyngor y flwyddyn nesaf. Os bydd hynny’n wir, bydd pobl Cymru yn troi yn erbyn eu cynghorau. Nid yw hynny’n beth da i gynghorau, ac nid yw’n beth da i ni. Rhaid inni weithio gyda chynghorau, mewn partneriaeth, i ganfod ffordd o atal hyn rhag digwydd.

**Peter Law:** Hen newyddion yw hyn i gyd—clywn wythnos ar ôl wythnos mai bai’r Llywodraeth Lafur yw lefel y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, oni ymunwch â mi i groesawu’r newyddion da a roddodd y Gweinidog inni ddoe? Oni chredwch ei bod yn rhagorol bod sir Fynwy—a sylwaf fod pawb yn dawel ar eich ochr chi o’r Siambr—wedi cael codiad o 7.1 y cant? Dyna’r ganran uchaf ar y rhestr. Daeth tua £13 miliwn mewn trethi busnes yn ôl i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru oddi wrth y Canghellor, diolch i waith da fy ffrind, y Gweinidog, a negododd hynny, ac mae’r cyllidebau cyfalaf wedi codi 16 y cant. Onid yw hynny yn rhywbeth i’w ddatlu, ac oni fyddai’n briodol clywed y Toriaid yn dweud ‘llongyfarchiadau’, oherwydd mae hyn i gyd yn newyddion cadarnhaol?

**Glyn Davies:** Dylech wybod, fel cyn Weinidog, Peter, ei bod yn ddoeth edrych y tu hwnt i’r datganiad y wasg a baratôdd y Gweinidog ar gyfer y diwrnod: ymddengys nad ydych wedi gwneud dim heblaw edrych ar y datganiad i’r wasg. Byddaf yn siarad â llywodraeth leol ac yn canfod ei barn ar hyn:

get an entirely different story. You should look beyond the press release.

The balance of funding is another huge problem for local government and for us. All of us agree that we want to get closer to a 50:50 payment, which is part-funded by the local tax and part-funded by central Government. I cannot see how we can achieve that. I have thought about this for ages, and I cannot see a way. It is not possible to raise council tax beyond its current level, because so many people in Wales who are on low fixed incomes already find it impossible to pay. We must spend much more time working with local government to consider the options. One option must be to remove one service from local government altogether so that we can get that balance.

We can argue back and forth about this, and I notice that the Government at Westminster, probably with the agreement of the Government here, has put this whole issue beyond the next general election because of its difficulty. However, if we are to retain the support of the people for their councils, so that councils can deliver services, working in partnership with us for the good of the people of Wales, we must find answers to these questions, rather than just entering into this blame culture. We must accept responsibility for what we do, and not just try to put the blame on others.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the damage done to partnership working by the Government's continued support for the council tax; a tax whose gearing inevitably leads to higher than inflation council tax increases with the blame being attached to local authorities.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the damage done to partnership*

os gofynnwch iddi, cewch stori hollol wahanol. Dylech edrych y tu hwnt i'r datganiad i'r wasg.

Mae'r cydbwysedd cyllid yn broblem fawr arall i lywodraeth leol ac i ni. Cytuna pob un ohonom ein bod am agosáu at daliad 50:50, a ariennir yn rhannol gan y dreth leol ac yn rhannol gan Lywodraeth ganolog. Ni allaf weld sut y gallwn gyflawni hynny. Yr wyf wedi rhoi ystyriaeth drylwyr i hyn, ac ni allaf ddod o hyd i ateb. Nid yw'n bosibl codi'r dreth gyngor yn uwch na'i lefel bresennol, oherwydd mae cymaint o bobl yng Nghymru sydd ar incwm sefydlog isel eisoes yn cael anhawster i'w thalu. Rhaid inni dreulio llawer mwy o amser yn gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol i ystyried yr opsiynau. Un opsiwn yw dileu un gwasanaeth o lywodraeth leol yn gyfan gwbl fel y gallwn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw.

Gallwn ddadlau yn ddi-baid am hyn, a sylwaf fod y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, gyda chytundeb y Llywodraeth yma siŵr o fod, wedi gohirio'r mater cyfan hwn tan ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf am ei fod mor anodd. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn inni sicrhau bod pobl yn parhau i gefnogi eu cynghorau, fel y gall cynghorau ddarparu gwasanaethau, gan weithio mewn partneriaeth â ni er budd pobl Cymru, rhaid inni ddod o hyd i atebion i'r cwestiynau hyn, yn hytrach na beio ein gilydd. Rhaid inni dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am yr hyn a wnawn, a pheidio â cheisio rhoi'r bai ar eraill.

**Michael German:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r difrod y mae cefnogaeth barhaus y llywodraeth i'r dreth gyngor wedi'i wneud i waith partneriaeth; treth sydd wedi'i chreu mewn modd sy'n arwain yn anorfod at gynnydd uwch na chwyddiant yn y dreth gyngor y mae awdurdodau lleol yn wynebu'r bai amdano.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r difrod y mae methiant y*

*working by the Government's failure to publish the full implications of the revaluation process in one go. This has led to growing concerns about the impact on individuals and councils.*

I will comment a little on what Glyn has just said. I am interested that he wishes to retain the balance of funding at roughly 80:20 between council tax payers and central Government. Unfortunately, that is not the policy of his party where it can make a difference, which, of course, is at Westminster, in terms of legislation to make changes to the whole system.

4.30 p.m.

I keep repeating this fact to Conservatives when they talk to me about this matter: your party's current position is to increase the contribution of council tax to 50 per cent. That was repeated in the magazine *Public Finance* just two weeks ago.

A change in that policy can only be undertaken at Westminster through primary legislation. Perhaps you are pleased to have that on board. However, perhaps you could give the Conservative Party's view on primary legislative powers for the Assembly.

**Glyn Davies:** Those who are obsessed with themselves find it difficult to listen to what others are saying. Had you listened to my speech, you would know that I said that we would all like to achieve a 50:50 balance. What we need to do, however, is to discuss with local government the best way to achieve that. There is a real problem, and there are options, but if we try to do this without the agreement of local government, all we will have is a great big row, and we will not achieve what we want.

**Michael German:** I am still fascinated, because you say that 'we all' want to achieve 50 per cent—I certainly do not, because that would place a horrendous burden on council tax payers across Wales, who already have great difficulty in funding the 20 per cent. Council tax has resulted in inequalities, as it

*llywodraeth i gyhoeddi goblygiadau llawn y broses ailbriso ar yr un pryd wedi'i wneud i waith partneriaeth. Mae hyn wedi arwain at bryderon cynyddol ynglyn â'r effaith ar unigolion a chynghorau.*

Cyfeiriai yn fras at yr hyn y mae Glyn newydd ei ddweud. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb i glywed ei fod am gadw'r cydbwysedd cyllid tua 80:20 rhwng talwyr y dreth gyngor a Llywodraeth ganolog. Yn anffodus, nid dyna bolisi ei blaid lle y gall wneud gwahaniaeth, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn San Steffan, o ran deddfwriaeth i wneud newidiadau i'r system gyfan.

Ailadroddaf y ffaith hon i'r Ceidwadwyr pan fyddant yn siarad â mi ar y mater hwn: safbwynt presennol eich plaid chi yw cynyddu cyfraniad y dreth gyngor i 50 y cant. Ailadroddwyd hynny yn y cylchgrawn *Public Finance* brin pythefnos yn ôl.

Dim ond yn San Steffan drwy ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol y gellir newid y polisi hwnnw. Efallai eich bod yn falch bod hynny'n wir. Fodd bynnag, efallai y gallech roi barn y Blaid Geidwadol ar bwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r rheini nad ydynt ond yn meddwl amdanynt hwy eu hunain yn ei chael yn anodd gwrando ar beth y mae eraill yn ei ddweud. Pe baech wedi gwrando ar fy araith, byddech yn gwybod imi ddweud yr hoffai pob un ohonom gael cydbwysedd 50:50. Yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud, fodd bynnag, yw trafod y ffordd orau o gyflawni hynny gyda llywodraeth leol. Mae problem wirioneddol, ac mae opsiynau, ond os ceisiwn wneud hyn heb gytundeb llywodraeth leol, y cyfan a gawn fydd dadlau mawr, ac ni fyddwn yn cyflawni'r hyn y dymunwn ei gael.

**Michael German:** Mae hyn o ddiddordeb mawr imi o hyd, oherwydd dywedwch fod 'pob un ohonom' am gael 50 y cant—yn sicr, nid wyf fi am gael hynny, oherwydd byddai hynny'n rhoi baich echrydus ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor ledled Cymru, sydd eisoes yn cael anhawster mawr i ariannu'r 20 y cant.

is based on the house in which people live.

The problem with the report that we are supposed to be debating—and the Minister may wish to comment on this—is that it is somewhat out of date. Paragraphs 5.5 and 6.5 of the report have largely been superseded, and there is some merit in discussing whether it is appropriate for a report such as this to come before the full Assembly at this stage. Inevitably, I suspect that what will happen today, as much as on any other day, is that we will have a general debate on local government, no matter what problems may arise from the report. The report alludes to local government structures, but they now go well beyond what is stated in the report. The Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government have responded to the report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee on this issue, and we are about to debate the regulations, but inherent in the change that is behind the Minister's response to this matter and the committee's view is the idea that there must be a change in the role of scrutiny. That is just as applicable to the National Assembly, and I know that Peter Law is keen to ensure that Members of the majority party use the powers of scrutiny properly and well, and are not subject to the whip. I commend to the Labour Party his actions yesterday on a matter of principle.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** And Andrew.

**Michael German:** Andrew as well, of course. I forgot about Andrew Davies, who supported Peter Law so ably yesterday in this matter.

Where scrutiny occurs in local government and in this Chamber, and the way in which it proceeds, is an issue. There are changes that the Minister will have to push through a little more strongly, particularly with regard to the matter of who chairs scrutiny committees, and whether the scrutiny committees are shared out equally across the whole of a council rather than being attracted into one group. As you know, Newport City Council has taken the view that, unless the Minister tells it otherwise, it will not change, and I

Mae'r dreth gyngor wedi arwain at anghydraddoldebau, gan ei bod yn seiliedig ar y tŷ y mae pobl yn byw ynddo.

Y broblem gyda'r adroddiad yr ydym i fod wrthi'n ei drafod—ac efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog roi sylwadau ar hyn—yw bod y wybodaeth ynddo ychydig yn hen. Disodlwyd paragraffau 5.5 a 6.5 o'r adroddiad i raddau helaeth, ac mae'n werth trafod a yw'n briodol i adroddiad o'r fath ddod gerbron y Cynulliad llawn ar yr adeg hon. Yn anochel, tybiaf mai'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd heddiw, fel unrhyw ddiwrnod arall, yw y cawn drafodaeth gyffredinol ar lywodraeth leol, waeth beth fo'r problemau a allai ddeillio o'r adroddiad. Mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at strwythurau llywodraeth leol, ond erbyn hyn maent yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r hyn a nodir yn yr adroddiad. Mae'r Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar y mater hwn, ac yr ydym ar fin trafod y rheoliadau, ond ymhlyg yn y newid sydd y tu ôl i ymateb y Gweinidog i'r mater hwn a barn y pwyllgor mae'r syniad bod yn rhaid newid rôl craffu. Mae hynny yr un mor gymwys i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a gwn fod Peter Law yn awyddus i sicrhau bod Aelodau plaid y mwyaf yn defnyddio pwerau craffu yn briodol ac yn dda, ac nad ydynt yn atebol i'r chwip. Cymeradwyaf ei weithredoedd ddoe ar fater o egwyddor i'r Blaid Lafur.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ac Andrew.

**Michael German:** Andrew hefyd, wrth gwrs. Anghofiais am Andrew Davies, a gefnogodd Peter Law mor fedrus ddoe yn y mater hwn.

Mae'r broses graffu mewn llywodraeth leol ac yn y Siambr hon, a'r ffordd y mae'n mynd rhagddi, yn fater i'w ystyried. Ceir newidiadau y bydd yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog weithredu arnynt mewn ffordd ychydig yn gryfach, yn arbennig o ran pwy sy'n cadeirio pwyllgorau craffu, ac a yw'r pwyllgorau craffu yn cael eu rhannu'n gyfartal ar draws y cyngor cyfan yn hytrach na chael eu denu i un grŵp. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd wedi arddel y farn na fydd yn newid, oni fydd y Gweinidog yn dweud fel

hope that the Minister will follow through the meaning of the Assembly's position by instructing local authorities on what they should be doing and, if necessary, seeking the legislative powers to take that forward.

Another point relates to policy agreements, and I will briefly touch on the fact that the Minister referred to already signing some of these. A problem with our current local government funding formula is that it is largely based on historic funding. For example, to put it crudely, if you spent £10 per lamp post on street lighting maintenance last year, then this year you will get that £10 per lamp post plus whatever the uplift happens to be. None of the reforms of the formula take efficiency into account. Does the Minister have any views as to how she could use those policy agreements to reward those councils that spend their money efficiently and effectively?

Finally, there is the balance of funding issue. We have just had the debacle of rebanding, which has meant arbitrary rises in council tax for many people. If you live in one street, you could have a 20 per cent increase in your council tax simply because of your house, whereas those living around the corner in the next street might not have any increase. The dampening effect gives an increase of one year on one year, therefore in two years' time those people could be suffering a 40 per cent increase.

You now have a balance of funding review, Minister, going on behind the scenes, which will report after the next general election. What efforts are you making to ensure that the current inequities in our council tax system are addressed properly so that we can change to a proper system? Will you allow this change to be made with the structures that you already have in place? In other words, revaluation may not be here to stay. We may be considering alternative systems in the future.

**Peter Law:** I pay tribute to my colleagues in local government across Wales for the excellent work that they undertake daily in delivering services on behalf of the National

arall wrtho, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu ar ystyr safbwynt y Cynulliad drwy gyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol ar yr hyn y dylent fod yn ei wneud ac, os oes angen, geisio'r pwerau deddfwriaethol i weithredu ar hynny.

Mae pwynt arall yn ymwneud â chytundebau polisi a soniaf yn fyr am y ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at lofnodi rhai o'r rhain eisoes. Un broblem gyda'n fformiwla ariannu llywodraeth leol bresennol yw ei bod yn seiliedig i raddau helaeth ar arian hanesyddol. Er enghraifft, mewn iaith syml, os bu ichi wario £10 fesul polyn lamp ar waith cynnal a chadw goleuadau stryd y llynedd, yna eleni cewch y £10 hwnnw fesul polyn lamp ynghyd â beth bynnag fo'r codiad. Nid oes un o ddiwygiadau'r fformiwla yn ystyried effeithlonrwydd. A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw farn ar sut y gallai ddefnyddio'r cytundebau polisi hynny i wobrwyo'r cynghorau hynny sy'n gwario eu harian yn effeithlon ac yn effeithiol?

I gloi, mae mater cydbwysedd cyllid. Yr ydym newydd gael llanastr ailfandio, sydd wedi golygu codiadau mympwyol yn y dreth gyngor i lawer o bobl. Os ydych yn byw mewn un stryd, gallech gael cynnydd o 20 y cant yn eich treth gyngor dim ond oherwydd eich tŷ, ond efallai na fyddai'r rhai sy'n byw rownd y gornel yn y stryd nesaf yn cael unrhyw gynnydd. Mae'r effaith ddampio yn rhoi cynnydd flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, felly ymhen dwy flynedd gallai'r bobl hynny fod yn wynebu cynnydd o 40 y cant.

Mae adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid yn mynd rhagddo'n awr, Weinidog, a fydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir yn briodol ag anghydraddoldebau presennol ein system treth gyngor fel y gallwn newid i system briodol? A ganiatewch i'r newid hwn gael ei wneud gyda'r strwythurau sydd eisoes ar waith gennych? Mewn geiriau eraill, efallai nad yw ailbriso yn rhywbeth parhaol. Efallai y byddwn yn ystyried systemau amgen yn y dyfodol.

**Peter Law:** Talaf deyrnged i'm cyd-aelodau mewn llywodraeth leol ledled Cymru am y gwaith rhagorol a wnânt yn ddyddiol yn darparu gwasanaethau ar ran y Cynulliad

Assembly, which is responsible for local government. That applies whether it is local government as we know it, in terms of local councils, or whether it is the fire service, tpolice authorities, national parks authorities. It also applies to those wonderful people who are members of town and community councils, who, as we have heard from the Minister, have recently come together under a new organisation called One Voice. It now has over 500 members. We have aimed to achieve this since I had ministerial responsibility for local government in 1999 and it has now been realised. This is an achievement and it is embodied in this report today. The public might wonder whether we are actually discussing the annual report of the local government partnership scheme: as Mike German was honest enough to say, this has become a debate on local government. It is always an opportunistic debate for the Conservatives when it comes to local government.

We should talk about the merits of the report and the achievements, as this scheme is unique in Great Britain. We have something special here, in working with our colleagues in partnership, that is delivering throughout Wales for the people of Wales. I am sorry that it should be politicised again by the Conservatives. I listened to the usual load of bilge coming from my colleague, Glyn Davies. Look at them over there: it is like millionaires' row. We have an axis of privilege between Old Smokey at the back, Mr Lah-di-dah Graham in the centre, and Farmer Poll Tax in the front. What do these people know about hardship in council tax, or about owing anything?

**Glyn Davies:** Are you opposed to people being financially successful, or are you maintaining the old-fashioned Labour approach to clear red water of resenting anyone who has been successful in life?

**Peter Law:** I am not resentful of anyone who is successful. I just want you to take an honest approach and not come to the Chamber and start to cry on people's shoulders when we know your backgrounds and the way in which you live.

Cenedlaethol, sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol. Mae hynny'n berthnasol pa un ai llywodraeth leol ydyw, o ran cynghorau lleol, neu pa un ai'r gwasanaeth tân, awdurdodau'r heddlu neu awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol ydyw. Mae hefyd yn berthnasol i'r bobl wych hynny sy'n aelodau o gynghorau tref a chymuned sydd, fel y clywsom gan y Gweinidog, wedi dod at ei gilydd yn ddiweddar o dan sefydliad newydd o'r enw Un Llais. Bellach mae ganddo dros 500 o aelodau. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cyflawni hyn ers imi feddu ar y cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol dros lywodraeth leol yn 1999, a bellach cafodd ei gyflawni. Mae hyn yn gyflawniad ac fe'i hymgorfforir yn yr adroddiad hwn heddiw. Efallai y byddai'r cyhoedd yn tybied ai'r adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol yr ydym yn ei drafod mewn gwirionedd: fel y dywedodd Mike German yn ddigon onest, mae hyn wedi troi yn ddadl ar lywodraeth leol. Mae trafod llywodraeth leol bob amser yn fanteisgar i'r Ceidwadwyr.

Dylem sôn am rinweddau'r adroddiad a'r cyflawniadau, gan fod y cynllun hwn yn unigryw ym Mhrydain. Mae gennym rywbeth arbennig yma, yn cydweithio â'n cyfeillion mewn partneriaeth, sy'n cyflawni ledled Cymru i bobl Cymru. Mae'n drueni bod y Ceidwadwyr yn ei wleidyddoli eto. Gwrandewais ar y nonsens arferol oddi wrth fy nghyd-Aelod, Glyn Davies. Edrychwch arnynt draw fan acw: mae fel rhes y miliwyddion. Mae gennym griw breintiedig sef Old Smokey yn y cefn, Mr La-di-da Graham yn y canol, a Farmer Poll Tax yn y blaen. Beth a wŷr y bobl hyn am galedi o ran y dreth gyngor, neu am fod mewn dyled?

**Glyn Davies:** A ydych yn wrthwynebus i bobl sy'n llwyddo yn ariannol, neu a ydych yn arddel ymagwedd hen ffasiwn y blaid Lafur o ddigio wrth unrhyw un sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus mewn bywyd?

**Peter Law:** Nid wyf yn digio wrth unrhyw un am fod yn llwyddiannus. Yr wyf am ichi fabwysiadu ymagwedd onest a pheidio â dod i'r Siambr a dechrau llefain ar ysgwyddau pobl pan wyddom am eich cefndir a'r ffordd yr ydych yn byw.

**Brynle Williams** *rose*—

**Peter Law:** Come on, Old Smokey.

**Brynle Williams:** I take it as a personal insult, sir, that you cast aspersions on my financial situation. I would exchange my overdraft and mortgage with you anytime.

**Peter Law:** I think that you would be on a loser with me, but we have seen your car, Brynle. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘And yours.’] Mine is nine years old.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This discussion should come back to the debate.

**Peter Law:** I tried to tell them that. When you look at this excellent report, you can see the work that has been done on policy agreements for the first time ever. Local government has never had a better deal, even before the Assembly was established. Like many other Assembly Members, I was involved in local government, and there is no doubt that local government now gets a better deal. We have these policy agreements and we do not have hypothecation here, as is the case in England. That is because there is mutual trust and partnership with the Government Minister.

**Glyn Davies:** How can you say that, Peter, when hypothecation has increased from about 4 per cent of local authorities’ budgets to over 10 per cent under the Labour Government since this Assembly was established? The situation is completely the opposite of what you have just said.

**Peter Law:** You do not understand what hypothecation is in local government terms. If you went to England, you would see that someone was put in to run the education department in one place. That is what happens there. We do not have that as we have a mutual working agreement, through policy agreements, to ensure that our local authorities perform on behalf of the people whom we all represent.

4.40 p.m.

**Brynle Williams** *a gododd*—

**Peter Law:** Dewch ymlaen, Old Smokey.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn fy marn i, syr, yr ydych yn bwrw sen ar fy sefyllfa ariannol. Yr wyf yn fodlon cyfnewid fy ngorddrafft a’ m morgais gyda chi unrhyw bryd.

**Peter Law:** Credaf y byddech ar eich colled pe baech yn gwneud hynny, ond yr ydym wedi gweld eich car, Brynle. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘A’ch car chi.’] Mae fy nghar i yn naw mlwydd oed.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylai’r drafodaeth hon ddod yn ôl at y ddadl.

**Peter Law:** Ceisiais ddweud hynny wrthynt. Pan edrychwch ar yr adroddiad rhagorol hwn, fe welwch y gwaith a wnaed ar gytundebau polisi am y tro cyntaf erioed. Ni chafodd llywodraeth leol erioed fargen well, hyd yn oed cyn i’r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu. Fel llawer o Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, bûm yn gysylltiedig â llywodraeth leol, ac nid oes amheuaeth bod llywodraeth leol yn cael bargen well yn awr. Mae gennym y cytundebau polisi hyn ac nid oes unrhyw glustnodi yma, fel sydd yn Lloegr. Mae hynny oherwydd bod cyd-ymddiriedaeth a phartneriaeth gyda Gweinidog y Llywodraeth.

**Glyn Davies:** Sut y gallwch ddweud hynny, Peter, pan fo clustnodi wedi cynyddu o tua 4 y cant o gyllidebau awdurdodau lleol i dros 10 y cant o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur ers i’r Cynulliad hwn gael ei sefydlu? Mae’r sefyllfa i’r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr i’r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud.

**Peter Law:** Nid ydych yn deall beth yw clustnodi yn nhermau llywodraeth leol. Pe baech yn mynd i Loegr, byddech yn gweld bod rhywun yn cael ei ddewis i redeg yr adran addysg mewn un lle. Dyna’r hyn sy’n digwydd yno. Nid yw hynny gennym gan fod gennym gytundeb gwaith ar y cyd, drwy gytundebau polisi, i sicrhau bod ein hawdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni ar ran y bobl y mae pob un ohonom yn eu cynrychioli.

When you read this report, you can see the work that has been undertaken in establishing the equal opportunities unit, the data unit for the Wales biodiversity action group, and community safety officers. These did not exist in 1999; they have only recently been established in every local authority. This is making our communities safer through the community safety partnerships. This is good stuff and should be commended. We need to show people positively and responsibly today that the Assembly, which is responsible for local government, commends our colleagues in local government on the way that they work excellently with us. This report may be a year or six months out of date, but it is the best that we currently have and it is telling us about an awful lot of good work that has been done. I support the Minister and thank her for her good work. I look forward to hearing more about the proposed joint-working arrangements in future. There is no doubt that we have a Minister who is dedicated and is working in the best interests of the people of Wales in partnership with the Welsh Local Government Association. I am delighted to complement her on that and I look forward to us carrying on that work in the future for the good of all the people of Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, dadl yw hon i ystyried adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol. Ni fydd neb yn anghytuno bod angen partneriaethau, cydweithio a chydlynio i symud agenda llywodraeth leol a Chymru yn eu blaen. Fodd bynnag, er yr holl eiriau melys am bartneriaethau a chydweithio, yr hyn sydd ei wir angen yw cyllido digonol. Gall arian, neu ddiffyg arian, danseilio'r holl gydweithio sy'n digwydd gyda llywodraeth leol. Mae llywodraeth leol yn allweddol, fel y clywsom eisoes, ac mae ein cynghorau sir yn haeddu ariannu teg i wneud eu gwaith. Yn dilyn cyhoeddi'r setliad ariannol cychwynnol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yr wythnos hon, mae ein cynghorau yn wynebu her sylweddol i ddarparu y lefel bresennol o wasanaethau gyda dim ond 5 y cant yn ychwanegol.

Mae pwysau aruthrol ar gyllid llywodraeth

Pan ddarllenwch yr adroddiad hwn, gallwch weld y gwaith a wnaed i sefydlu'r uned cyfle cyfartal, yr uned ddata ar gyfer grŵp gweithredu bioamrywiaeth Cymru, a swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol. Nid oedd y rhain yn bodoli yn 1999; dim ond yn ddiweddar y cawsant eu sefydlu ym mhob awdurdod lleol. Mae hyn yn gwneud ein cymunedau yn fwy diogel drwy'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Mae hyn yn newyddion da a dylid ei ganmol. Mae angen inni ddangos i bobl heddiw mewn ffordd gadarnhaol a chyfrifol fod y Cynulliad, sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol, yn cymeradwyo ein cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol am y ffordd y maent yn cydweithio'n rhagorol â ni. Efallai fod yr adroddiad hwn wedi cyrraedd flwyddyn neu chwe mis yn hwyr, ond dyma'r gorau sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n dweud wrthym am lawer iawn o waith da sydd wedi cael ei wneud. Cefnogaf y Gweinidog a diolchaf iddi am ei gwaith da. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed mwy am y trefniadau cydweithio arfaethedig yn y dyfodol. Yn ddi- au mae gennym Weinidog sy'n ymroddedig ac sy'n gweithio er budd pobl Cymru mewn partneriaeth â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Mae'n bleser gennyf ei chanmol ar hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at barhau â'r gwaith hwnnw yn y dyfodol er budd holl bobl Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** As has already been mentioned, this is a debate to consider the annual report of the local government partnership scheme. No-one would dispute that partnerships, collaboration and co-ordination are required to move the local government and the Welsh agenda forward. However, despite all the warm words about partnership and collaboration, what is needed is adequate funding. Funding, or lack of funding, can undermine all the collaboration that is taking place with local government. Local government is crucial, as we have already heard, and our county councils deserve fair funding to do their work. Following the publication of the initial funding settlement for local government this week, our councils face a considerable challenge in maintaining current service levels with an increase of only 5 per cent.

There is great pressure on local government



leol; mae CLILC yn cyfaddef hynny. Mae pwysau aruthrol o ran darparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gwasanaethau i'r henoed ac ariannu gofal a thriniaethau i blant ag anghenion arbennig y tu allan i'w bröydd mebyd. Mae pwysau ar gyllid ar gyfer pensiynau ac mae angen arian i wella cyflwr ein stoc tai. Mae ar Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd angen £240 miliwn i wella cyflwr ei stoc tai fel ei fod yn cydymffurfio â'r safonau angenrheidiol. Mae ar Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili angen £120 miliwn i'r un diben. Mae angen arian ar gynghorau ac ni ddylid pwysu arnynt i drosglwyddo stoc bob tro. Mae pwysau aruthrol ar gyllid llywodraeth leol na chaiff ei leddfu gan eiriau melys am bartneriaethau yn unig. O leiaf gall llywodraeth leol godi ei dreth ei hun, yn wahanol i'r Cynulliad, sef y dreth gyngor. Gan fod y setliad mor dynn, bydd pwysau ar ein cynghorwyr i godi arian ychwanegol drwy gynyddu'r dreth gyngor, torri gwasanaethau neu wario'r arian sydd wrth gefn.

Ym mharagraff 2.4 yr adroddiad, cyfeirir at Wanless a'i rôl allweddol o ran achub y gwasanaeth iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn symud agenda Wanless yn ei blaen yn y tymor byr drwy ymdrin â rhestrau aros, fel y mae Wanless yn ei argymhell, ac yn y tymor hir, ar ôl iddi dderbyn 22 o wahanol gynlluniau lleol, sef ffrwyth gwaith y partneriaethau lleol ar lawr gwlad?

Mae paragraff 2.5 yn cyfeirio at y bartneriaeth newydd—sy'n cynnwys y byrddau gwelliant ac ati—rhwng awdurdodau lleol ac Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, sy'n ystyried safonau darpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn lleoedd megis Blaenau Gwent. A ellir sicrhau bod cyfle digonol i archwilio'r bartneriaeth newydd hon yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus?

Mae paragraff 2.7 yn cyfeirio at y partneriaethau rhwng y Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol a'r heddlu. Treuliodd Val Lloyd, Leighton Andrews a minnau ddiwrnod gyda'r heddlu ddydd Mawrth diwethaf a chawsom nifer o sgysiau difyr. Gofynnwyd inni pa obaith sydd yno o roi mwy o

funding; the WLGA admits that. There is great pressure in terms of providing social services and services for older people and funding care and treatment for children with special needs outside the areas in which they live. There is pressure on funding for pensions and funding is needed to improve our housing stock. Newport City Council needs £240 million to improve its housing stock so that it complies with the required standards. Caerphilly County Borough Council needs £120 million for the same purpose. Councils need funding and pressure should not be placed on them to transfer stock every time. There is huge pressure on local government funding that will not be alleviated by warm words about partnerships alone. At least local government can raise its own tax, unlike the Assembly, by means of the council tax. As the settlement is so tight, there will be pressure on our councillors to raise additional funding by increasing council tax, cutting services or spending reserves.

In paragraph 2.4 of the report, reference is made to Wanless and its crucial role in terms of saving health and social services. How will the Minister move the Wanless agenda forward in the short term by tackling waiting lists, as Wanless has recommended, and in the long term, having received 22 different local plans, which are the upshot of the work carried out by the local partnerships on the ground?

Paragraph 2.5 refers to the new partnership—which includes the improvement boards and so on—between local authorities and the Social Services Inspectorate Wales, which assesses the standard of social services provision in places such as Blaenau Gwent. Can the Minister ensure that there will be sufficient opportunity to scrutinise this new partnership in the Local Government and Public Services Committee?

Paragraph 2.7 refers to the partnerships between the Assembly, local government and the police. Val Lloyd, Leighton Andrews and I spent the day with the police last Tuesday, and had many interesting discussions. We were asked what hope was there that priority would be given to planning rules that reflect

flaenoriaeth i reolau cynllunio a fydd yn adlewyrchu pryderon yr heddlu a thrigolion ynglŷn â chynllunio adeiladau na fydd yn denu torcyfraith a fandaliaeth.

Trafodir nifer helaeth o faterion yn yr adroddiad, ond nid yw amser yn caniatáu i mi sôn amdanynt i gyd. I gloi, er yr holl eiriau melys am bartneriaethau, y brif bartneriaeth yw honno rhyngom ni a phobl Cymru. Dyna yw'r brif bartneriaeth bob tro a'n sialens yw darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a fydd yn gwneud gwir wahaniaeth i fywydau pobl Cymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Time is getting on and I need to call the Minister at 4.55 p.m.. However, at that time I will take a procedural motion to extend the debate should anyone wish to propose it. I have a list of five speakers and they will not all get in before 4.55 p.m..

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate and I shall concentrate on two paragraphs in the report. It is noted in paragraph 2.7 of the report that

'the Assembly works closely with the Community Safety Partnerships led by local authorities and the police...The Partnerships were strengthened in 2003 by the addition of police and fire authorities and LHBs as statutory partners'.

Community safety partnerships must have a role in child protection, and this should feature regularly on agendas for meetings. The Mid and West Wales Fire and Rescue Service is to be commended on its child protection policy, for developing the policy and for implementing training strategies. I know that partnership working with social services is key to the effectiveness of this policy. The partnership council could discuss and encourage the sharing of information and best practice in child protection throughout Wales.

In paragraph 6.11, there is a reference to the Fire and Rescue Services Bill. This Bill has

the concerns of the police and residents surrounding designing buildings in such a way so as not to attract criminal activities and vandalism.

Many issues are tackled in the report, but time does not permit me to refer to them all. In conclusion, many have waxed lyrical about partnerships, but the main partnership is the one between us and the people of Wales. That will always be the main partnership and our challenge is to deliver public services that will make a real difference to the lives of the people of Wales.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae amser yn mynd yn ei flaen ac mae angen imi alw ar y Gweinidog am 4.55 p.m.. Fodd bynnag, bryd hynny byddaf yn derbyn cynnig gweithdrefnol i estyn y ddadl os bydd rhywun yn dymuno ei gynnig. Mae gennyf restr o bum siaradwr ac ni chaiff pob un ohonynt gyfle i siarad cyn 4.55 p.m..

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon a chanolbwyntiaf ar ddau baragraff yn yr adroddiad. Nodir ym mharagraff 2.7 yr adroddiad

'mae'r Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Partneriaethau Diogelwch Cymunedol a arweinir gan awdurdodau lleol a'r heddlu... Cryfhawyd y Partneriaethau yn 2003 trwy ychwanegu awdurdodau heddlu a than a Byrddau Iechyd Lleol fel partneriaid statudol'.

Rhaid i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol gael rhan i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o amddiffyn plant, a dylai hyn gael ei drafod yn rheolaidd mewn cyfarfodydd. Rhaid canmol Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru am ei bolisi amddiffyn plant, am ddatblygu'r polisi ac am roi strategaethau hyfforddi ar waith. Gwn fod gweithio mewn partneriaeth â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn allweddol i effeithiolrwydd y polisi hwn. Gallai'r cyngor partneriaeth drafod ac annog y broses o rannu gwybodaeth ac arfer gorau o ran amddiffyn plant ledled Cymru.

Ym mharagraff 6.11, ceir cyfeiriad at y Mesur Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub. Mae'r

now received Royal Assent, and the partnership council should now, in my opinion, be involved in the development and implementation of the National Assembly's national framework for the fire and rescue service in Wales. The framework is now a statutory responsibility and the partnership council must have a role in the consultation process on policy development. Future integrated risk management plans must be subject to wide consultation with the partnership council playing a key role in providing a forum for discussion for key partners, including local authorities, fire authorities, and the National Assembly. These plans must be relevant to the needs of Wales, both geographically and in respect of service delivery.

The powers transferred to the Assembly under the Fire and Rescue Services Bill must be explained and understood, and integrated risk management plans must be compatible with the Assembly's vision for the development of policies for the future. As there is currently only one fire authority member on the partnership council, can the Minister confirm that consideration will be given as to whether the partnership scheme now needs to be revised under Part II of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, to take account of the transfer of responsibility for the fire and rescue service to the National Assembly for Wales?

**William Graham:** I return to the report itself. In view of time, I will just refer to the paragraphs on which I hope to get some answers from the Minister. I will start with paragraph 2.9 and the Police Reform Act 2002. Once again, this is a plea for funding, which you will have had, no doubt, from the chairmen of all the police authorities in Wales. Individual Members have already received a number of letters, and in Gwent we had letters from the chief constable. It is important that you address the funding of the police yet again.

During the year, the Assembly had two meetings with local authority representatives regarding gypsies and travellers in Wales. Minister, you will know that this is a serious problem for many local authorities. Some

Mesur hwn bellach wedi cael Cydsyniad Brenhinol, a dylai'r cyngor partneriaeth yn awr, yn fy marn i, fod yn gysylltiedig â'r gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu fframwaith cenedlaethol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth tân ac achub yng Nghymru. Mae'r fframwaith yn gyfrifoldeb statudol yn awr a rhaid i'r cyngor partneriaeth gael rôl yn y broses ymgynghori ar ddatblygu polisi. Rhaid i gynlluniau rheoli risg integredig fod yn destun ymgynghoriad eang gyda'r cyngor partneriaeth yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn y gwaith o ddarparu fforwm ar gyfer trafodaeth i bartneriaid allweddol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau tân, a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Rhaid i'r cynlluniau hyn fod yn berthnasol i anghenion Cymru, yn ddaearyddol ac mewn perthynas â darparu gwasanaethau.

Rhaid i'r pwerau a drosglwyddwyd i'r Cynulliad o dan y Mesur Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub gael eu hegluro a'u deall, a rhaid i gynlluniau rheoli risg integredig fod yn gydnaws â gweledigaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer datblygu polisiau yn y dyfodol. Gan mai dim ond un aelod awdurdod tân sydd ar y cyngor partneriaeth ar hyn o bryd, a all y Gweinidog gadarnhau y rhoddir ystyriaeth i'r angen i ddiwygio'r cynllun partneriaeth o dan Ran II Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, er mwyn ystyried y gwaith o drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân ac achub i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru?

**William Graham:** Dychwelaf at yr adroddiad ei hun. O gofio'r amser, cyfeiriaf yn unig at y paragraffau y gobeithiaf gael atebion arnynt gan y Gweinidog. Dechreuaf gyda pharagraff 2.9 a Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002. Unwaith eto, ple am arian yw hwn, y byddwch wedi ei gael, mae'n siŵr, gan gadeiryddion pob awdurdod yr heddlu yng Nghymru. Mae Aelodau unigol eisoes wedi cael nifer o lythyrau, ac yng Ngwent cawsom lythyrau gan y prif gwnstabl. Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn ymdrin â mater ariannu'r heddlu unwaith eto.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn, cafodd y Cynulliad ddau gyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr awdurdodau lleol o ran sipsiwn a theithwyr yng Nghymru. Weinidog, fe wyddoch fod hon yn broblem ddifrifol i lawer o

treat it with respect for gypsies and travellers, and some do not. There must be consistency on that, and I ask that you ensure that the partnership council brings forward a further report on this. This matter is of increasing concern throughout Wales. I welcome the Wales Association of Community and Town councils, and it is fair that one should pay tribute to Peter Law, who was Minister in the early days of the Assembly and did a great deal of sterling work as the association's presiding officer.

4.50 p.m.

A point that I have heard made for the last 20 years is contained in paragraph 6.6., which states:

'It was agreed with local government to reduce the length of the consultation on the provisional local government settlement in order to accommodate the production of an earlier final settlement.'

We hear the same empty words each year, and, from your time as a councillor, Sue, you will know that this is a fact. Let us hope that next year is a first.

We recommend the protocol for hypothecated grants. This is a worthwhile document that should be studied by many local authorities in Wales. I endorse the comments made by the previous speaker regarding the Fire and Rescue Services Bill. We once again make a plea for adequate funding, training and equipment.

When I was a member of the previous Local Government and Housing Committee, I recall all members being impressed with Operation Dragon. We ask that it be discussed again in order to see how it is working throughout police authorities in Wales.

Turning to the homelessness strategy referred to in paragraph 6.23, co-operation with officials is to be welcomed, particularly as we now know that, by the end of 2003, there were 2,149 households classed as homeless in Wales and 2,266 households in temporary accommodation. Shelter Cymru estimates

awdurdodau lleol. Mae rhai yn ei thrin gyda pharch at sipsiwn a theithwyr, ond ni wna eraill hynny. Rhaid cael cysondeb ar hynny, a gofynnaf ichi sicrhau bod y cyngor partneriaeth yn cyflwyno adroddiad pellach ar hyn. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n creu pryder cynyddol ledled Cymru. Croesawaf Gymdeithas Cynghorau Tref a Chymuned Cymru, ac mae'n deg talu teyrnged i Peter Law, a fu'n Weinidog yn ystod dyddiau cynnar y Cynulliad ac a wnaeth lawer iawn o waith rhagorol fel llywydd y gymdeithas.

Ym mharagraff 6.6, gwneir pwynt yr wyf wedi ei glywed dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, sef:

'Daethpwyd i gytundeb â llywodraeth leol i gwtogi ar yr ymgynghoriad ar y setliad dros dro i lywodraeth leol fel y gellid sicrhau setliad terfynol yn gynt.'

Clywn yr un geiriau gwag bob blwyddyn, ac fe wyddoch, Sue, o'ch cyfnod fel cynghorydd, fod hyn yn ffaith. Gadewch inni obeithio y bydd pethau'n newid y flwyddyn nesaf.

Yr ydym yn argymhell y protocol ar gyfer grantiau wedi eu clustnodi. Mae hon yn ddogfen werthfawr y dylai llawer o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ei hastudio. Cymeradwyaf y sylwadau a wnaed gan y siaradwr blaenorol ynghylch y Mesur Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub. Unwaith eto apeliw'n am ddigon am arian, hyfforddiant ac offer.

Pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai blaenorol, cofiaf yr argraff a wnaeth Ymgyrch y Ddraig ar yr holl aelodau. Gofynnwn iddi gael ei thrafod eto er mwyn gweld sut y mae'n gweithio yn awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru.

Gan droi at y strategaeth ar ddigartrefedd y cyfeiriwyd ati ym mharagraff 6.23, croesewir cydweithrediad â swyddogion, yn enwedig gan ein bod yn gwybod yn awr, erbyn diwedd 2003, fod 2,149 o deuluoedd yn ddigartref yng Nghymru a 2,266 o deuluoedd mewn llety dros dro. Mae Shelter Cymru yn

that at least 50,000 people experience homelessness each year. A lot of good work has been done, and a lot more needs to be done to make this figure even reasonably respectable. I am aware that housing benefit reform is not a devolved matter, but will the partnership council consider this issue, as it can contribute to homelessness? Will the council also seek a report on the pathfinder project in Conwy in order to see how well it is working?

Finally, the Treasury requires savings of £21.5 billion, of which 40 per cent is to come from savings in procurement. I note that an authority, fortunately not in Wales, uses 41 stationery suppliers, 64 advertising and marketing suppliers, 60 printing suppliers and 34 temporary staff agencies. I welcome the involvement of private firms in the supply of services to local authorities, but rationalisation and services for taxpayers must be paramount.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will confine my remarks to Cardiff County Council. Cardiff, along with Wrexham, faces considerable problems. The 3.5 per cent increase in rate support grant is the lowest increase among all councils in Wales. When this is combined with the fact that 67 per cent of householders will see their homes move up one or more council tax bands, it is clear that council tax payers face a serious situation. It is inevitable that the two thirds of council tax payers who will move up at least one band will see a double-figure increase in their bills, simply as a result of rebanding. This is before we take into account that, on the basis of a 3.5 per cent increase in RSG, the council will need to rely on council tax increases to make up the difference.

Turning to Cardiff's problems with social services, Members will recall the damning joint inspection report produced last year. The council is trying hard to address the problems highlighted in the report. A key issue identified was the high level of staff vacancies. More staff are being employed in Cardiff social services, but the problem is

amcangyfrif bod o leiaf 50,000 o bobl yn wynebu digartrefedd bob blwyddyn. Gwnaed llawer o waith da, ac mae angen gwneud llawer mwy i wneud y ffigur hwn hyd yn oed yn rhesymol barchus. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol nad yw'r dasg o ddiwygio'r budd-dal tai yn fater datganoledig, ond a wnaiff y cyngor partneriaeth ystyried y mater hwn, oherwydd gall gyfrannu at ddigartrefedd? A wnaiff y cyngor ofyn am adroddiad hefyd ar y prosiect braenaru yng Nghonwy er mwyn gweld pa mor dda y mae'n gweithio?

I gloi, mae'r Trysorlys yn gofyn am arbedion o £21.5 biliwn, y mae'n rhaid i 40 y cant o'r arbedion hynny ddod o arbedion mewn caffael. Nodaf fod awdurdod, yn ffodus nid yng Nghymru, yn defnyddio 41 o gyflenwyr deunyddiau ysgrifennu, 64 o gyflenwyr hysbysebu a marchnata, 60 o gyflenwyr argraffu a 34 o asiantaethau staff dros dro. Croesawaf y rhan a chwaraeir gan gwmnïau preifat wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau i awdurdodau lleol, ond rhaid i waith rhesymoli a gwasanaethau i drethdalwyr fod yn hollbwysig.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd. Mae Caerdydd, ynghyd â Wrecsam, yn wynebu problemau mawr. Y cynnydd o 3.5 y cant yn y grant cynnal ardrethi yw'r cynnydd isaf o blith yr holl gynghorau yng Nghymru. Pan gyfunir hyn â'r ffaith y bydd 67 y cant o ddeiliaid tai yn gweld eu cartrefi yn symud i fyny un band y dreth gyngor neu fwy, mae'n amlwg bod talwyr y dreth gyngor yn wynebu sefyllfa ddifrifol. Mae'n anochel y bydd dwy ran o dair o dalwyr y dreth gyngor a fydd yn symud i fyny o leiaf un band yn gweld cynnydd ffigur dwbl yn eu biliau, o ganlyniad i ailfandio. Mae hyn cyn inni ystyried, ar sail cynnydd o 3.5 y cant yn y grant cynnal ardrethi, y bydd angen i'r cyngor ddibynnu ar godiadau yn y dreth gyngor i wneud iawn am y gwahaniaeth.

Gan droi at broblemau Caerdydd o ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, bydd Aelodau yn cofio adroddiad damniol yr arolygiad ar y cyd a gynhyrchwyd y llynedd. Mae'r cyngor yn ymdrechu'n galed i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a amlygwyd yn yr adroddiad. Un o'r problemau allweddol a nodwyd oedd lefel uchel y swyddi gwag. Mae mwy o staff yn

that staff cost money. However, changes to the personal social services element of the standard spending assessment mean that the SSA will be reduced by £4.2 million. This is a £4.2 million indicative cut for social services alone. I know that the Minister has suggested that that 3.5 per cent guaranteed minimum increase in revenue support grant will do something to alleviate that problem, but it will do very little. It seems to me a topsy-turvy world where a new formula is devised which cuts money for an already financially overstretched service that was condemned only a year or so ago as inefficient.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry, but the Minister must now reply.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** As Mike rightly said, this debate is on the 2003-04 report, and it is a great shame that his colleague, Jenny Randerson, abused the situation and spoke about this year's settlement, which will be debated in committee. You talked about this year's settlement; this debate is about the report for 2003-04.

I agree with Glyn about respect and support for local government. You will know that I was a local government member for many years, and I respect the work that is being done on the ground. One of the critical ways in which we have to bridge the cynicism that exists about tax and the value of services—and people everywhere need those services—is by making that relationship between paying for those services and ensuring that people are getting value for money, because, for many people, particularly in the social care area, those services are essential. Therefore, there is much work to be done, and I appreciate the sentiments behind what you said on that. I do not participate in the blame culture; that does not get us anywhere in Government. We have to work through the difficulties.

cael eu cyflogi yng ngwasanaethau cymdeithasol Caerdydd, ond y broblem yw bod staff yn costio arian. Fodd bynnag, mae newidiadau i'r elfen gwasanaethau cymdeithasol personol yn golygu y caiff yr asesiad o wariant safonol ei leihau £4.2 miliwn. Mae hyn yn doriad dangosol o £4.2 miliwn ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn unig. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi awgrymu y bydd yr isafswm cynnydd gwarantedig o 3.5 y cant yn y grant cynnal refeniw yn gwneud rhywbeth i leddfu'r broblem honno, ond ni fydd yn gwneud llawer. Ymddengys imi yn fyd plith-draphlith lle y dyfeisir fformiwla newydd sy'n cwtdogi ar arian ar gyfer gwasanaeth sydd eisoes wedi'i orymestyn yn ariannol a gondemniwyd prin flwyddyn neu ddwy yn ôl am ei fod yn aneffeithlon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n flin gennyf, ond rhaid i'r Gweinidog ateb yn awr.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Fel y dywedodd Mike, a hynny'n briodol, mae'r ddadl hon ar adroddiad 2003-04, ac mae'n drueni mawr bod ei gyd-Aelod, Jenny Randerson, wedi camddefnyddio'r sefyllfa ac wedi siarad am setliad eleni, a gaiff ei drafod yn y pwyllgor. Bu ichi sôn am setliad eleni; mae a wnelo'r ddadl hon â'r adroddiad ar gyfer 2003-04.

Cytunaf â Glyn ynglŷn â pharch a chefnogaeth i lywodraeth leol. Fe wyddoch imi fod yn aelod llywodraeth leol ers sawl blwyddyn, a pharchaf y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud ar lawr gwlad. Un o'r ffyrdd hollbwysig lle y mae'n rhaid inni bontio'r sinigiaeth sy'n bodoli ynghylch treth a gwerth gwasanaethau—ac mae angen y gwasanaethau hynny ar bobl ym mhob man—yw drwy greu'r berthynas honno rhwng talu am y gwasanaethau hynny a sicrhau bod pobl yn cael gwerth am arian, oherwydd, i lawer o bobl, yn arbennig yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol, mae'r gwasanaethau hynny yn hanfodol. Felly, mae llawer o waith i'w wneud, a gwerthfawrogaf y feddylfryd y tu ôl i'r hyn a ddywedasocho am hynny. Nid wyf am inni feio ein gilydd; nid awn i unman mewn Llywodraeth drwy wneud hynny. Rhaid inni ddatrys yr anawsterau.

On Mike German's contribution, I do not understand your amendment 3, as statistics were placed in the public domain on 1 September, and I have received no complaints from my partners on the partnership council about the availability of statistics from the Valuation Office Agency. However, I agree that it seems to be a long time since we discussed the report at the partnership council and in committee, and we need to find a way of processing this report earlier.

Scrutiny would work better if local government had committees which run as ours do, as the role is not just about being retrospective, it is about being proactive—

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way, Minister?

**Sue Essex:** No I am not, or we will never get through this. Mark has had his chance.

Policy agreements are a good innovation, and we can develop them in many ways. On the balance of funding review, people were talking about how local government does not like the council tax system and so on, but the Welsh Local Government Association supported what we said on the balance of funding review, and there was widespread support for that. Therefore, that contribution has been made and it will be made to the Lyons review.

You have run this line on revaluation for a long time, but, two and a half years ago, that report on freedom of responsibility was taken to committee, and I have looked at the minutes where it states that this was welcomed by all of you. I understand that you might want different methods of taxation, namely local income tax and so on, but at that stage—and it takes a long while to do a revaluation—you all went along with it, and I wish that some of you would remember that. In fairness, Glyn had the confidence to say that he believes in revaluation.

I thank Peter for his comments on the

O ran cyfraniad Mike German, ni ddeallaf eich gwelliant 3, gan i'r ystadegau gael eu rhyddhau i'r cyhoedd ar 1 Medi, ac ni chefais unrhyw gwynion gan fy mhartneriaid ar y cyngor partneriaeth am argaeledd yr ystadegau o Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisió. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf ei bod yn ymddangos bod llawer o amser wedi mynd heibio ers inni drafod yr adroddiad yn y cyngor partneriaeth ac yn y pwyllgor, ac mae angen inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o brosesu'r adroddiad hwn yn gynt.

Byddai craffu yn gweithio'n well pe bai gan lywodraeth leol bwyllgorau sy'n cael eu rhedeg yn debyg i'n rhai ni, gan nad oes a wnelo'r rôl â bod yn ôl-weithredol yn unig, mae a wnelo hefyd â bod yn rhagweithiol—

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych yn ildio, Weinidog?

**Sue Essex:** Nac ydwyf, neu nid awn byth drwy hyn i gyd. Mae Mark wedi cael ei gyfle.

Mae cytundebau polisi yn ddyfais dda, a gallwn eu datblygu mewn sawl ffordd. O ran yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid, yr oedd pobl yn sôn am y ffaith nad yw llywodraeth leol yn hoffi system y dreth gyngor ac yn y blaen, ond cefnogodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yr hyn a ddywedasom am yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid, ac yr oedd cefnogaeth gyffredinol iddo. Felly, gwnaed y cyfraniad hwnnw a chaiff ei wneud i adolygiad Lyons.

Yr ydych wedi cynnal y safbwynt hwn ar ailbrisió ers amser hir, ond, ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl, cyflwynwyd yr adroddiad ar ryddid cyfrifoldeb i'r pwyllgor, ac yr wyf wedi darllen y cofnodion lle nodir i hyn gael ei groesawu gan bob un ohonoch. Deallaf y byddech am gael dulliau gwahanol o drethiant efallai, sef treth incwm leol ac yn y blaen, ond ar y pryd—a chymer amser hir i wneud ailbrisiad—cytunodd pob un ohonoch â hyn, a hoffwn pe bai rhai ohonoch yn cofio hynny. A bod yn deg, yr oedd gan Glyn yr hyder i ddweud ei fod yn credu mewn ailbrisió.

Diolchaf i Peter am ei sylwadau ar y

partnership. He started this partnership council, and I have had dealings with it for a long time. It has delivered in many areas, for example, on concessionary fares, free swimming and on the practical schemes that give better services to the people.

On funding, go back and look at the figures, Dai. Yes, there is a 5 per cent overall settlement, but there is £500 million extra through grants and another £13 million from the Chancellor to use, so you need to go back to look at those figures.

As for criticising what we are doing on health with local government, the core of this is that local health boards and local authorities are working together, delivering the agenda that was in the background of Derek Wanless's thinking. The health and wellbeing strategy unites local government with the health world, and you should recognise that.

I thank Gwenda for her points on fire authorities and for her other points about what the partnership council will consider. I will take those forward to my colleagues because we develop the agenda jointly.

5.00 p.m.

Finally, well done William, for picking up on many points. Unlike some of your colleagues, you read the report thoroughly, and I will respond to you in writing.

bartneriaeth. Ef oedd yn gyfrifol am ddechrau'r cyngor partneriaeth hwn, ac yr wyf wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag ef ers amser hir. Mae wedi cyflawni gwaith da mewn sawl maes, er enghraifft, o ran tocynnau mantais, nofio am ddim, ac o ran y cynlluniau ymarferol sy'n rhoi gwasanaethau gwell i bobl.

O ran cyllido, ewch yn ôl ac edrychwch ar y ffigurau, Dai. Oes, mae setliad cyffredinol o 5 y cant, ond mae £500 miliwn ychwanegol drwy grantiau a £13 miliwn arall gan y Canghellor i'w ddefnyddio, felly mae angen ichi edrych ar y ffigurau hynny eto.

O ran beirniadu'r hyn a wnawn ym maes iechyd gyda llywodraeth leol, hanfod hyn yw bod byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio, yn cyflawni'r agenda a oedd yn sail i feddylfryd Derek Wanless. Mae'r strategaeth iechyd a lles yn uno llywodraeth leol â'r byd iechyd, a dylech gydnabod hynny.

Diolchaf i Gwenda am ei phwyntiau ar awdurdodau tân ac am ei phwyntiau eraill am yr hyn y bydd y cyngor partneriaeth yn ei ystyried. Cyflwynaf y pwyntiau hynny i'm cyd-Weinidogion oherwydd yr ydym yn datblygu'r agenda ar y cyd.

Yn olaf, da iawn William, am sylwi ar nifer o bwyntiau. Yn wahanol i rai o'ch cyd-Aelodau, bu ichi ddarllen yr adroddiad yn drylwyr, ac ymatebaf yn ysgrifenedig ichi.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.  
Amendment 1: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 45.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn



Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.  
 Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 16, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 3: For 16, Abstain 2, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2142): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2142): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Digartrefedd—yr Allgáu Cymdeithasol Gwaethaf Homelessness—the Ultimate Social Exclusion**

**Peter Black:** I have had requests from Leanne Wood, Kirsty Williams, Mark Isherwood and Brynle Williams to contribute to this debate.

If I were making this speech in 1999, we would have been faced with a very different situation. On 6 May 1999, Shelter Cymru reported that there were 150 people sleeping rough across Wales and 1,600 people in temporary accommodation. Today, it reports that homelessness has grown by a third in one year, that the use of temporary accommodation has grown by 101 per cent, and that there is a 121 per cent increase in the use of bed and breakfast accommodation, which is equivalent to 572 households. There are 167 households with dependent children in bed and breakfast accommodation and over 3,000 people now live in temporary accommodation.

We have often said that tackling homelessness is not just about bricks and mortar—it is also about the level of individual support and assistance for people to help them to adjust to their new circumstances. However, the availability of housing is also important, and so it is with regret that I refer to the fact that in the last calendar year, social housing starts were down to less than 600, while demand for new social rented tenancies was estimated to be 2,500 a year. There is a backlog of unmet need for 33,000 dwellings, while at the same time nearly 120,000 homes have been lost to the public sector through right-to-buy since 1981. It is a grim picture, but the increase in the scale of the problem is not the only factor

**Peter Black:** Cefais geisiadau gan Leanne Wood, Kirsty Williams, Mark Isherwood a Brynle Williams i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon.

Pe bawn yn cyflwyno'r araith hon yn 1999, byddem wedi bod yn wynebu sefyllfa wahanol iawn. Ar 6 Mai 1999, cofnododd Shelter Cymru fod 150 o bobl yn cysgu ar y stryd ledled Cymru a bod 1,600 o bobl mewn llety dros dro. Heddiw, cofnoda fod digartrefedd wedi cynyddu draean mewn blwyddyn, bod y defnydd o lety dros dro wedi cynyddu 101 y cant, a bod cynnydd o 121 y cant yn y defnydd o lety gwely a brecwast, sy'n gyfwerth â 572 o deuluoedd. Mae 167 o deuluoedd â phlant dibynnol mewn llety gwely a brecwast ac mae dros 3,000 o bobl bellach yn byw mewn llety dros dro.

Dywedwyd yn aml gennym nad mater syml o frics a sment yw mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd—mae a wnelo hefyd â lefel y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth unigol i bobl i'w helpu i addasu i'w hamgylchiadau newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae argaeledd tai hefyd yn bwysig, ac felly gresynaf fod rhaid imi gyfeirio at y ffaith bod nifer y tai cymdeithasol newydd a oedd ar gael yn ystod y flwyddyn galendr ddiwethaf wedi gostwng i lai na 600, tra yr amcangyfrifwyd fod tua 2,500 o bobl yn gwneud cais am denantiaethau cymdeithasol newydd wedi'u rhentu bob blwyddyn. Mae ôl-groniad o angen nas diwallwyd ar gyfer 33,000 o anheddau ac, ar yr un pryd, collwyd bron i 120,000 o gartrefi i'r sector cyhoeddus

that distinguishes the situation today from that in 1999.

It is widely acknowledged that the existence of the Assembly has transformed how we deal with homelessness. The report presented to us in the first Assembly by Paul Bevan identified the problems. We responded by increasing the amount of money available for section 180 grants eight-fold, by changing secondary legislation so as to increase the groups of people classified as being in priority need, and by setting up a Homelessness Commission and, from that, a national homelessness strategy monitored by the independent sector.

The other change was the introduction of a new Act of Parliament that placed a requirement on councils to produce local homelessness strategies. That was welcomed by me and by the Homelessness Commission. We took the view that local action was often more effective as it could take account of local needs. It was a measure that would focus the minds of local councils on the homelessness problems in their own area and force them to address those issues. It should have produced benefits all round.

So where did it go wrong? I need to put on record from the start that if it were 1999 all over again, I would not have changed the measures that have been put in place by the Assembly since then. I might have done things a bit differently, especially in terms of how we implemented the new priority homelessness categories, but essentially, I believe that we have been on the right track.

I would also record that the crisis that we are facing today and which is reflected so starkly in the figures that I have quoted is largely caused by forces outside the control of the Assembly Government. A statistic used by John Puzey from Shelter at a presentation a few weeks ago illustrates the problem perfectly. He said that since 1966, the price of a loaf of bread has increased six-fold—the average house in Wales is 60 times more expensive.

drwy'r cynllun hawl i brynu ers 1981. Mae'n ddarlun llwm, ond nid y cynnydd ym maint y broblem yw'r unig ffactor sy'n golygu bod y sefyllfa heddiw yn wahanol i'r sefyllfa yn 1999.

Cydnabyddir gan nifer fod dyfodiad y Cynulliad wedi trawsnewid ein ffordd o ymdrin â digartrefedd. Nodwyd y problemau yn yr adroddiad a gyflwynwyd ger ein bron yn y Cynulliad cyntaf gan Paul Bevan. Bu inni ymateb drwy wneud cynnydd wythplyg yn yr arian a oedd ar gael ar gyfer grantiau adran 180, drwy newid is-ddeddfwriaeth er mwyn cynyddu'r grwpiau o bobl a ddosbarthwyd yn bobl yr oedd eu hangen yn flaenoriaeth, a thrwy sefydlu Comisiwn Digartrefedd ac, yn deillio o hynny, strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddigartrefedd a gaiff ei monitro gan y sector annibynnol.

Y newid arall oedd cyflwyno Deddf Seneddol newydd a oedd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynghorau gyflwyno strategaethau lleol ar ddigartrefedd. Croesawyd y datblygiad hwn gennyf fi a chan y Comisiwn Digartrefedd. Yr oeddem o'r farn bod gweithredu lleol yn aml yn fwy effeithiol oherwydd y gallai ystyried anghenion lleol. Yr oedd yn fesur a fyddai'n hoelio sylw cynghorau lleol ar broblemau digartrefedd yn eu hardal hwy ac yn eu gorfodi i ymdrin â'r materion hynny. Dylai fod wedi bod o fudd i bawb.

Felly beth aeth o'i le? Mae angen imi gofnodi o'r cychwyn pe bai'n 1999 unwaith eto, na fyddwn wedi newid y mesurau a roddwyd ar waith gan y Cynulliad ers hynny. Efallai y byddwn wedi gwneud pethau mewn ffordd ychydig yn wahanol, yn arbennig o ran sut y bu inni ddefnyddio'r system newydd o flaenoriaethu categorïau digartrefedd, ond, yn y bôn, credaf inni ddilyn y trywydd cywir.

Hoffwn gofnodi hefyd bod yr argyfwng a wynebwn heddiw ac a adlewyrchir yn amlwg yn y ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd gennyf wedi'i achosi'n bennaf gan rymoedd y tu allan i reolaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae un o'r ystadegau a ddefnyddiwyd gan John Puzey o Shelter mewn cyflwyniad ychydig wythnosau yn ôl yn cyfleu'r broblem i'r dim. Dywedodd fod pris torth o fara chwe gwaith yn uwch nag yr oedd yn—ar gyfartaledd, mae tŷ yng Nghymru 60 gwaith yn ddrutach.

It is no longer just in rural areas that first-time buyers struggle to get on the housing ladder, it is happening all across Wales. House prices in Wales are now five times average earnings and the demand for social rented housing has grown exponentially. In a way, the worst has not yet come. That is because the housing bubble is starting to burst and, if the lessons of the 1990s are anything to go by, that could see a sharp rise in the number of repossessions and greater demand on our social housing stock.

We have come a long way with our homelessness agenda but now is the time to take stock and ensure that our policies are meeting the demands being placed on them. The first stage in that is to set up effective local homelessness strategies. The fact that most councils failed to get these strategies in on time was a good illustration of how seriously they took them. Most of them seem to continue to struggle on with inadequate resources and are having huge problems coping with the massive increase in the number of people presenting themselves as homeless, of which there were 40,000 in Wales last year. In most cases, councils have simply failed to use their strategies to identify needs and to bid for extra money. There does not appear to be any sustained challenge from them to the Assembly Government to put up the cash needed to tackle homelessness effectively.

In failing to mount that challenge, local councils are letting the Assembly Government off the hook. There is a real danger that despite the national homelessness strategy, the Welsh Assembly Government is beginning to lose its way on this issue. The Government needs to take the reins back from local government and drive forward this agenda itself. Local action is still the best way of dealing with homelessness, but there is a severe lack of strategic direction from councils, which needs to be put back into the equation.

There is clearly a need to make better use of

Erbyn hyn, nid dim ond mewn ardaloedd gwledig y mae pobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf yn ei chael hi'n anodd cael troed ar yr ysgol dai, mae'r sefyllfa wedi lledaenu drwy Gymru gyfan. Mae prisiau tai yng Nghymru bellach bum gwaith yr enillion cyfartalog, ac mae'r galw am dai cymdeithasol i'w rhentu wedi cynyddu'n gyflymach byth. Mewn ffordd, mae'r gwaethaf i ddod, gan fod prisiau tai ar fin gostwng ac, o gofio gwersi'r 1990au, gallai hynny arwain at gynnydd sydyn yn nifer y tai a gaiff eu hailfeddiannu a galw uwch ar ein stoc tai cymdeithasol.

Gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol gennym o ran ein hagenda digartrefedd, ond mae'n bryd pwyso a mesur a sicrhau bod ein polisiau yn bodloni'r gofynion sydd arnynt. Y cam cyntaf yn hynny o beth yw rhoi strategaethau lleol effeithiol ar ddigartrefedd ar waith. Yr oedd y ffaith i'r rhan fwyaf o gynghorau fethu â chyflwyno'r strategaethau hyn ar amser yn dangos yn glir nad oeddent yn eu cymryd o ddifrif. Ymddengys bod y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn parhau i frwydro ymlaen heb ddigon o adnoddau a'u bod yn wynebu problemau enfawr wrth ymdopi â'r cynnydd aruthrol yn nifer y bobl sy'n cofrestru fel pobl ddigartref—yr oedd 40,000 ohonynt yng Nghymru y llynedd. Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, mae cynghorau wedi methu â defnyddio eu strategaethau i ganfod anghenion ac i wneud ceisiadau am arian ychwanegol. Nid ydym yn eu gweld yn ymdrechu'n barhaus i herio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi'r arian sydd ei angen i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd yn effeithiol.

Wrth fethu â chyflwyno'r her honno, mae cynghorau lleol yn achub croen Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Er gwaethaf y strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddigartrefedd, mae perygl gwirioneddol fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dechrau colli ei ffordd mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ailafael yn yr awenau gan lywodraeth leol a bwrw ati ei hun i ddwyn yr agenda hon yn ei blaen. Camau gweithredu lleol yw'r ffodd orau o hyd i ymdrin â digartrefedd, ond mae diffyg cyfeiriad strategol y cynghorau yn ddifrifol, ac mae angen ailafael yn hynny.

Yn amlwg, mae angen gwneud gwell

the available resources and to increase them where necessary. We need to invest across Wales in the day centres, night shelters and hostels that will better enable local councils to manage the large influx of homeless people and help them to avoid using unsuitable bed and breakfast accommodation.

In many instances, this can be done by using social housing grants to build new facilities. That has been done in Cardiff, where a new block of flats is being built to be used as temporary accommodation for homeless families, and in Swansea, Drws Agored, a hostel for 16 and 17-year-olds, was opened a few years ago. The key is to ensure that there is sufficient revenue funding to help run them, which means getting the supporting people revenue grant right, which is causing anxiety in some places. Supporting people funding might also be used to pay for individual housing plans, as piloted in Bridgend, to ensure that people receive the support that they need.

The problem is that this is not happening everywhere, and even where it is, more can and should be done. The fact that Wales's second city no longer has a night shelter, for example, is a scandal that needs to be addressed. Equally, Aberystwyth, a town with its own significant homelessness problem, does not have the infrastructure to cope with it.

5.10 p.m.

The Government should be setting a clear target for the second Assembly, that it will eliminate the use of bed and breakfast accommodation for families with children and for minors. We need clear and public targets for this, and an action plan driven forward by the Minister. It should be monitored by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and the homelessness strategy group on a regular basis. If this debate achieves that then it will have been worthwhile. To do it will require a step change in the way that the Government handles this issue. I invite the Minister to make that change.

defnydd o'r adnoddau sydd ar gael a'u cynyddu yn unol ag angen. Mae angen inni fuddsoddi ledled Cymru yn y canolfannau dydd, y llochesi nos a'r hostelau a fydd yn galluogi cynghorau lleol i reoli'r cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y bobl ddi-gartref yn well ac yn eu helpu i osgoi defnyddio llety gwely a brechwast anaddas.

Mewn sawl achos, gellir gwneud hyn drwy ddefnyddio grantiau tai cymdeithasol i adeiladu cyfleusterau newydd. Gwnaed hyn yng Nghaerdydd, lle y mae bloc newydd o fflatiau yn cael ei adeiladu i'w ddefnyddio fel llety dros dro i deuluoedd digartref, ac yn Abertawe, agorwyd Drws Agored, sef hostel i bobl ifanc 16 ac 17 oed, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Hanfodol yw sicrhau bod digon o gyllid refeniw ar gael i helpu i'w rhedeg, sy'n golygu cael y grant refeniw cefnogi pobl yn iawn. Mae'r grant hwn yn achosi pryder mewn rhai ardaloedd. Gellid defnyddio arian cefnogi pobl hefyd i dalu am gynlluniau tai unigol, fel y gwelwyd ar ffurf peilot ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn cael y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt.

Y broblem yw nad yw hyn yn digwydd ym mhobman, a hyd yn oed yn yr ardaloedd lle y mae'n digwydd, gellir a dylid gwneud mwy. Mae'r ffaith nad oes lloches nos bellach yn ail ddinas Cymru, er enghraifft, yn warthus ac mae angen ymdrin â hynny. Yn yr un ffordd, nid oes gan Aberystwyth, sef tref â phroblem ddi-gartrefedd sylweddol, y seilwaith i ymdopi â'r broblem honno.

Yn ystod yr ail Gynulliad, dylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn pennu targed clir i gael gwared ar y defnydd o lety gwely a brechwast i deuluoedd â phlant ac i blant dan oed. Mae angen targedau clir a chyhoeddus arnom yn hyn o beth, ynghyd â chynllun gweithredu a lywir gan y Gweinidog. Dylai'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a grŵp y strategaeth ar ddi-gartrefedd fonitro'r cynllun yn rheolaidd. Os llwydda'r ddadl hon i gyflawni hynny, yna bydd wedi bod yn werth chweil. Er mwyn gwneud hynny bydd angen newid sylweddol yn y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Gwahoddaf y Gweinidog i wneud y newid

hwnnw.

There also needs to be investment in improving existing homes and sufficient, sustainable budgets to provide additional social rented housing and affordable homes. The homebuy agenda has been successful in doing that in rural areas, but that success has been achieved at the expense of increasing the queues for rented accommodation. The Minister needs to separate homebuy budgets from the social housing grant and encourage rural councils and housing associations to adopt a twin-track approach to their housing problems—helping first-time buyers and building new homes to rent.

Yn ogystal, mae angen buddsoddi i wella cartrefi presennol a chyllidebau cynaliadwy a digonol i ddarparu tai cymdeithasol ychwanegol i'w rhentu a chartrefi fforddiadwy. Bu'r agenda cymorth prynu yn llwyddiannus wrth wneud hynny mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond cyflawnwyd y llwyddiant hwnnw ar draul cynyddu'r rhestrau aros am lety i'w rentu. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog wahanu cyllidebau cymorth prynu o'r grant tai cymdeithasol ac annog cynghorau gwledig a chymdeithasau tai i geisio datrys eu problemau tai mewn dwy ffordd—helpu pobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf ac adeiladu cartrefi newydd i'w rhentu.

Finally, if we are to contain this problem, we need to give local councils more tools. That means enabling them to retain as much of their social housing stock as possible, particularly in areas of high demand like Cardiff. The Government has made a number of adjustments to the right-to-buy already, but more radical action is needed. The Government needs to seek the powers to suspend the right-to-buy altogether in areas of high demand. That will have a significant impact and enable councils to build new homes as well as use the ones they have in a better way.

I gloi, os ydym am gyfyngu'r broblem hon, mae angen inni roi mwy o ddulliau gweithredu i gynghorau lleol. Mae hynny'n golygu eu galluogi i gadw cymaint o'u stoc tai cymdeithasol â phosibl, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr fel Caerdydd. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud nifer o addasiadau i'r cynllun hawl i brynu yn barod, ond mae angen camau gweithredu mwy radical. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ofyn am bwerau i ddiddymu'r cynllun hawl i brynu yn llwyr mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr. Caiff hynny effaith arwyddocaol gan alluogi cynghorau i adeiladu cartrefi newydd yn ogystal â defnyddio eu cartrefi presennol mewn ffordd well.

**Leanne Wood:** What are the Minister's views on social housing expenditure? We have heard about the problem of increasing homelessness and some of the reasons behind it. In England, the comprehensive spending review announced £450 million in additional public money for social housing, with the promise of more to come through the private finance initiative and the money saved from sacking civil servants. How do you intend to match this level of investment in Wales?

**Leanne Wood:** Beth yw barn y Gweinidog am wariant tai cymdeithasol? Clywsom am y nifer cynyddol o bobl ddigartref ac am rai o'r rhesymau tu ôl i'r broblem honno. Yn Lloegr, cyhoeddodd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant £450 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus ychwanegol i dai cymdeithasol, gyda'r addewid y bydd rhagor i ddod drwy'r fenter cyllid preifat a'r arian a gaiff ei arbed wrth ddiswyddo gweision sifil. Sut y bwriadwch wneud buddsoddiad cyfatebol yng Nghymru?

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank my colleague Peter Black for his balanced approach towards this subject—recognising the needs of urban and rural communities. Last year, 90 per cent of Powys County Council's lettings were for categories of homeless people, which demonstrates the need in rural communities.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelod Peter Black am ei sylwadau cytbwys ar y pwnc hwn—gan gydnabod anghenion cymunedau trefol a gwledig. Mae'r ffaith y prydleswyd 90 y cant o eiddo Cyngor Sir Powys y llynedd i gategorïau o bobl ddigartref yn cyfleu'r angen mewn



That means there is a huge shortage of rented social accommodation within my constituency, which is causing huge problems for many people, with a large number of families living in temporary accommodation, which is unacceptable. It is a difficult challenge for the Government, but in areas such as Brecon and Radnorshire, we need to look seriously at suspending the right for people to buy their council properties. Year after year, more council stock is lost, and we are not in a position to replace it.

**Mark Isherwood:** Is it not the shocking truth that the number of homeless people has increased from 4,297 according to a parliamentary written answer from the Secretary of State for Wales, to 9,100 last year according to Shelter? Ninety eight thousand homes are now unfit for human habitation, and the backlog of urgent maintenance repairs to housing in Wales has risen to 3 billion in the public sector and 1.1 billion in the private sector, because this Welsh Assembly Government's massive housing cuts have hit the lowest income households the hardest. Those of us who speak to housing providers in councils and with social landlords—certainly in my region, North Wales—know that the root cause of this problem is Government policy.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I thank Peter for raising this important issue, which is rightly attracting a great deal of interest. The Homelessness Commission examined this problem in the wider context, and took a view that homelessness is one of the most serious forms of social exclusion. We agree on that across all parties in the Assembly. I thank Peter for his role in developing an understanding of this issue when he undertook this work for me when he was Deputy Minister in the coalition Government.

The Welsh Assembly Government welcomed the commission's work, which formed the basis for the national homelessness strategy endorsed by all parties. The strategy identifies the various causes of homelessness, and the impact that they have on other aspects of life, such as training, employment,

cymunedau gwledig. Golyga hynny fod diffyg aruthrol o ran llety cymdeithasol i'w rentu yn fy etholaeth, sy'n achosi problemau enfawr i lawer o bobl, wrth i nifer fawr o deuluoedd fyw mewn llety dros dro. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Mae'n her anodd i'r Llywodraeth ond, mewn ardaloedd fel Brycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, mae angen inni edrych o ddifrif ar ddiddymu'r hawl i bobl brynu eu tai cyngor. Flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, caiff mwy o stoc cyngor ei golli, ac nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i ddarparu stoc newydd yn ei le.

**Mark Isherwood:** Onid y gwir syfrdanol yw bod nifer y bobl ddi-gartref wedi cynyddu o 4,297 yn ôl ateb ysgrifenedig seneddol gan Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, i 9,100 y llynedd yn ôl Shelter? Mae 98,000 o gartrefi bellach yn anaddas i bobl fyw ynddynt, ac mae nifer yr adeiladau sy'n disgwyl gwaith cynnal a chadw brys yng Nghymru wedi codi i 3 biliwn yn y sector cyhoeddus ac 1.1 biliwn yn y sector preifat, am fod toriadau enfawr Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y maes hwn wedi cael yr effaith fwyaf ar gartrefi incwm isel. Gŵyr y rhai ohonom sy'n siarad â darparwyr tai cynghorau ac â landlordiaid cymdeithasol—yn sicr yn fy rhanbarth i, sef Gogledd Cymru—mai gwraidd y broblem hon yw polisi'r Llywodraeth.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Diolchaf i Peter am godi'r mater pwysig hwn, sy'n haeddiannol yn denu llawer o sylw. Archwiliodd y Comisiwn Digartrefedd y broblem hon yn ei chyd-destun ehangach, ac yr oedd o'r farn mai digartrefedd yw un o'r mathau mwyaf difrifol o allgáu cymdeithasol. Mae pob un o bleidiau'r Cynulliad yn cytuno â hynny. Diolchaf i Peter am ei waith wrth helpu pobl i ddeall y mater hwn pan ymgwymerodd â'r gwaith hwn ar fy rhan pan oedd yn Ddirprwy Weinidog yn Llywodraeth y glymblaid.

Croesawodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru waith y comisiwn, a oedd yn sail ar gyfer y strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddi-gartrefedd a gymeradwywyd gan bob plaid. Mae'r strategaeth yn nodi amrywiol achosion digartrefedd, a'r effaith a gânt ar agweddau eraill ar fywyd, megis hyfforddiant,

health, education, risk of offending, and social isolation. The strategy also sets out how we work across the board with statutory and voluntary organisations to prevent and tackle homelessness.

In 2001, we took the brave step of extending homelessness legislation to cover a range of additional vulnerable groups. This move has been criticised by some as leading to an increase in pressure on local authorities. Such criticism is misplaced. The legislation has served to ensure that people who should have been deemed vulnerable under previous legislation have their needs properly recorded and addressed. Too many local authorities give insufficient priority to housing. For example, I am still waiting for several housing business plans to be submitted, and many of those received are of poor quality. I have made it clear that this is unacceptable, and I am not prepared to give major repairs funding next year to councils that have not provided me with satisfactory plans. This lack of priority is particularly apparent in tackling homelessness. Although all the homelessness strategies have been received, only six came in by the deadline, namely Powys, Blaenau Gwent, Denbighshire, Torfaen, Swansea and Merthyr Tydfil.

We are assessing all the local authority homelessness reviews and strategies. The process is nearly complete and we will provide feedback on the strengths and weaknesses, with particular focus on aspects that need to be improved to meet our statutory guidance. Our initial impression is that the reviews have, in most cases, significantly enhanced awareness of local services and led to closer working relationships. The strategies have set a new agenda for developing and improving services for homeless people. However, the standard of reviews and strategies is variable, ranging from good to very weak. Widespread failings were identified in the availability of data, analysis of statistics, understanding of the private sector contribution, assessment of the authority's own services, and review of prevention and alternative sources of

cyflogaeth, iechyd, addysg, y perygl o droseddu, ac unigedd cymdeithasol. Noda'r strategaeth hefyd sut y gweithiwn gyda sefydliadau statudol a gwirfoddol i atal digartrefedd ac i fynd i'r afael ag ef.

Yn 2001, cymerasom gam dewr wrth estyn deddfwriaeth digartrefedd i gynnwys amrywiaeth o grwpiau diamddiffyn ychwanegol. Beirniadwyd hyn gan rai fel datblygiad a arweiniodd at bwysau ychwanegol ar awdurdodau lleol. Nid oes sail i feirniadaeth o'r fath. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod anghenion pobl y dylid bod wedi'u hystyried yn bobl ddiamddiffyn o dan y ddeddfwriaeth flaenorol wedi'u cofnodi'n gywir ac yr ymdrinnir â hwy. Rhydd gormod o awdurdodau lleol flaenoriaeth annigonol i dai. Er enghraifft, yr wyf yn dal i aros i nifer o gynlluniau busnes tai gael eu cyflwyno, ac mae llawer o'r rhai a gafwyd eisoes o ansawdd gwael. Yr wyf wedi egluro bod hyn yn annerbyniol, ac nid wyf yn barod i roi cyllid i wneud gwaith atgyweirio sylweddol y flwyddyn nesaf i gynghorau nad ydynt wedi paratoi cynlluniau boddhaol. Mae'r diffyg blaenoriaeth hwn yn arbennig o amlwg o ran mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd. Er ein bod wedi derbyn pob un o'r strategaethau ar ddigartrefedd, dim ond chwech a gyflwynwyd o fewn y terfyn amser, a hynny gan Bowys, Blaenau Gwent, sir Ddinbych, Tor-faen, Abertawe a Merthyr Tudful.

Yr ydym yn asesu holl adolygiadau a strategaethau yr awdurdodau lleol ar ddigartrefedd. Mae'r broses fwy neu lai wedi'i chwblhau a byddwn yn rhoi adborth ar y cryfderau a'r gwendidau, gan ganolbwyntio'n arbennig ar yr agweddau sydd angen eu gwella er mwyn bodloni ein canllawiau statudol. Ein hargraff gychwynnol yw bod yr adolygiadau, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, wedi gwella ymwybyddiaeth o wasanaethau lleol yn sylweddol ac wedi arwain at gydb berthnasau gwaith agosach. Mae'r strategaethau wedi pennu agenda newydd ar gyfer datblygu a gwella gwasanaethau i bobl ddigartref. Fodd bynnag, mae safon yr adolygiadau a'r strategaethau yn amrywio o fod yn dda i fod yn wan iawn. Nodwyd methiannau cyffredinol o ran argaeledd data, dadansoddi ystadegau, deall cyfraniad y sector preifat, asesu

temporary and permanent accommodation.

gwasanaethau'r awdurdod ei hun, ac adolygu dulliau atal a ffynonellau amgen o ran llety dros dro a llety parhaol.

For instance, the Bridgend review made little use of statistics, and failed to explore access to housing for homeless people. The Vale of Glamorgan's strategy did not address rough sleeping or equality issues, and the Pembrokeshire review and strategy contained no analysis of the statutory service, temporary accommodation or housing provision, and no targets. Most authorities had some difficulty in getting a meaningful contribution from some key organisations. The strategies themselves were generally placed in strategic planning contexts, and most contained action plans. Nevertheless, many of the commitments for action were ill-defined and generalised, without clear timescales or identification of lead responsibilities. In most cases, resources were inadequately described and performance measures were poorly developed.

Er enghraifft, prin oedd y defnydd a wnaeth adolygiad Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr o ystadegau, a methodd ag ystyried sut y gallai pobl ddigartref gael hyd i dai. Nid ymdriniodd strategaeth Bro Morgannwg â chysgu ar y stryd na materion yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb, ac ni chafwyd unrhyw ddadansoddiad o'r gwasanaeth statudol, llety dros dro neu'r ddarpariaeth tai, nac unrhyw dargedau yn adolygiad a strategaeth sir Benfro. Cafodd y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau rywfaint o anhawster wrth sicrhau cyfraniad ystyrlon gan rai sefydliadau allweddol. Yn gyffredinol, lluniwyd y strategaethau eu hunain yng nghyd-destun cynllunio strategol, ac yr oedd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn cynnwys cynlluniau gweithredu. Serch hynny, yr oedd nifer o'r ymrwymadau i weithredu wedi'u diffinio'n wael ac yn benagored, heb nodi terfynau amser clir na phwy fyddai'n bennaf cyfrifol. Ni ddisgrifiwyd yr adnoddau yn ddigonol yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, ac yr oedd y mesurau perfformiad wedi'u datblygu'n wael.

In the cases, for instance, of Anglesey and Flintshire, no action plan was produced, and only a rudimentary plan was prepared by Gwynedd. There has been insufficient focus by members on the action that needs to be taken, and inadequate resources applied to the issue. I will continue to press local authority leaders to take a much more proactive approach to homelessness, with the emphasis on prevention as well as a more imaginative use of existing housing and financial resources.

Er enghraifft, yn achosion Ynys Môn a sir y Fflint, ni chynhyrchwyd unrhyw gynllun gweithredu, a dim ond cynllun sylfaenol a baratowyd gan Wunedd. Ni chanolbwyntiodd yr aelodau'n ddigonol ar y camau sydd angen eu cymryd, ac ni ddyrannwyd digon o adnoddau i'r mater. Byddaf yn parhau i bwysu ar arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol i ddilyn ymagwedd llawer mwy rhagweithiol tuag at ddigartrefedd, gyda'r pwyslais ar atal ac ar ddefnyddio mwy o ddychymyg wrth ddefnyddio tai ac adnoddau ariannol sy'n bodoli eisoes.

Local authorities can do more to tackle homelessness through better management of their stock. For instance, in 2002-03, several local authorities took more than 10 weeks, to re-let available stock. In addition, 914 local authority dwellings were available for letting that were vacant for more than six months, and some authorities had more than 100 such homes. Speeding up the repairs to empty homes will also make a significant contribution to combating homelessness. Specific examples of local authorities with

Gall awdurdodau lleol wneud mwy i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd drwy reoli eu stoc yn well. Er enghraifft, yn 2002-03, cymerodd sawl awdurdod lleol fwy na 10 wythnos i ailbrydlesu stoc a oedd ar gael. Yn ogystal, yr oedd 914 o anheddau awdurdod lleol a fu'n wag am fwy na chwe mis ar gael i'w prydlesu, ac yr oedd gan rai awdurdodau fwy na 100 o gartrefi o'r fath. Bydd cyflymu'r gwaith atgyweirio a wneir ar gartrefi gwag hefyd yn gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i'r broses o drechu digartrefedd. Ymhlith yr

large numbers of empty homes at 31 March 2004, are Swansea with 172 and Newport with 170. There is an opportunity for collaborative working between councils, and I will take up this point with the Welsh Local Government Association, because homelessness does not stay within local authority boundaries.

Since 1998, as Peter said, we have increased the funding for front-line homelessness projects by 800 per cent, which is a demonstration of our commitment to tackling the problem. We have also ensured that homelessness is recognised in Assembly guidance and policies in other areas, such as health, social care and wellbeing, community safety and domestic abuse. Many people require help to sustain their tenancies so that they can avoid becoming homeless. Funding on supported housing has increased by 300 per cent over the past two years. An additional £48 million over the next three years was also announced in the draft budget in terms of the social housing grant, and this extra investment will help alleviate homelessness. I will review my budget provision in this context.

Due to exceptional changes in the housing market over the past three years, more people are becoming homeless as pressure is placed down the property ladder on affordable housing. There is also the issue of right-to-buy, which, as every Member knows, I have lobbied about. I am particularly concerned that too many families are also being placed in bed and breakfast hotels, which exacerbates the conditions of homelessness and disrupts normal patterns of life.

I have therefore instructed officials to bring forward proposals to restrict the use of bed and breakfast accommodation as a matter of emergency. We need to work with local authorities and their partners to ensure that their strategies to tackle homelessness are placed in the broader community planning framework, and are given sufficient priority within those plans.

I thank Shelter Cymru and other voluntary

enghreifftiau penodol o awdurdodau lleol a oedd â nifer fawr o gartrefi gwag ar 31 Mawrth 2004, mae Abertawe gyda 172 a Chasnewydd gyda 170. Mae cyfle i gynghorau gydweithredu, a thrafodaf y pwnt hwn gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gan nad yw digartrefedd yn aros o fewn ffiniau awdurdodau lleol.

Ers 1998, fel y dywedodd Peter, yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r arian ar gyfer prosiectau digartrefedd yn y rheng flaen 800 y cant, sy'n arwydd o'n hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau bod canllawiau a pholisïau'r Cynulliad mewn meysydd eraill, megis iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles, diogelwch cymunedol a cham-drin yn y cartref, yn cydnabod digartrefedd. Mae angen help ar lawer o bobl i gadw eu tenantiaethau er mwyn iddynt allu osgoi digartrefedd. Mae'r arian a ddyrennir i dai â chymorth wedi cynyddu 300 y cant yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Yn ogystal, cyhoeddwyd £48 miliwn ychwanegol dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn y gyllideb ddrafft o ran y grant tai cymdeithasol, a bydd y buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwn yn helpu i ostwng lefelau digartrefedd. Adolygaf fy narpariaeth gyllidebol yn y cyd-destun hwn.

O ganlyniad i newidiadau eithriadol yn y farchnad dai yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, mae mwy o bobl yn dod yn ddigartref wrth i bwysau gael ei roi yn nes at waelod yr ysgol eiddo ar dai fforddiadwy. Rhaid ystyried y cynllun hawl i brynu hefyd, ac, fel y gŵyr pob Aelod, yr wyf wedi llobio yn ei gylch. Yr wyf yn pryderu'n arbennig fod gormod o deuluoedd yn cael eu rhoi mewn gwestai gwely a brechwast, sy'n arwain at sefyllfa waeth ac yn amharu ar batrymau bywyd cyffredin.

Yr wyf felly wedi cyfarwyddo swyddogion i gyflwyno cynigion i gyfyngu ar y defnydd o lety gwely a brechwast fel mater o frys. Mae angen inni gydweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol a'u partneriaid i sicrhau y caiff eu strategaethau i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd eu gosod o fewn y fframwaith cynllunio cymunedol ehangach, ac y rhoddir digon o flaenoriaeth iddynt o fewn y cynlluniau hynny.

Diolchaf i Shelter Cymru ac i fudiadau

organisations for their contribution in identifying the problems facing us and for finding solutions for people who experience homelessness. I was pleased yesterday to launch the Welsh Consumer Council's report on housing. I had a constructive meeting on 18 October with the chief executive of Homeless Link Cymru, the representative body of voluntary organisation people who work with the homeless, and I think that they will support my proposals for legislation to restrict the use of bed and breakfast accommodation for vulnerable homeless people.

We now begin the review of the national homelessness strategy, and we must all work together to ensure that we strengthen our agenda. I hope that we can take it forward with support from all parties. I am absolutely committed to tackling this problem within the resources available to me, as long as I continue to have support from across the Chamber.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

gwirfoddol eraill am eu cyfraniad wrth nodi'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu ac am ddod o hyd i atebion i bobl sy'n profi digartrefedd. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf ddoe lansio adroddiad Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru ar dai. Cefais gyfarfod adeiladol ar 18 Hydref gyda phrif weithredwr Homeless Link Cymru, sef corff sy'n cynrychioli pobl o fudiadau gwirfoddol sy'n gweithio gyda'r digartref, a chredaf y byddant yn cefnogi fy nghynigion i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyfyngu ar y defnydd o lety gwely a brecwast i bobl ddigartref ddiarnodol.

Dechreuwn yn awr ar yr adolygiad o'r strategaeth genedlaethol ar ddigartrefedd, a rhaid inni oll gydweithio i sicrhau ein bod yn atgyfnerthu ein hagenda. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ei datblygu gyda chefnogaeth pob plaid. Yr wyf yn gwbl ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon gan ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael imi, cyhyd ag y bydd gennyf gefnogaeth o bob rhan o'r Siambr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.20 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)