



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Iau, 1 Chwefror 2007
Thursday, 1 February 2007**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio
Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration
- 21 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau
Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation & Networks
- 36 Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd am ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes
Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business
- 47 Datganiad am Wasanaethau Llawfeddygol Brys—Llanelli
Statement on Emergency Surgical Services—Llanelli
- 67 Datganiad am y Cynllun Ail Gynnig yn Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd GIG Ardal Weston
Statement on the Second-offer Scheme at Weston Area Health NHS Trust
- 80 Dadl Fer: A yw'n Syniad Da Ariannu Pleidiau Gwleidyddol ag Arian Cyhoeddus?
Short Debate: Public Funding of Political Parties: A Good Idea?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 12.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 12.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration

Ymddiriedolaethau Tir Cymunedol Community Land Trusts

Q1 Mick Bates: Will the Minister make a statement on community land trusts? OAQ1031(SJR)

C1 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol? OAQ1031(SJR)

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): As indicated in the debate on Tuesday, the Assembly Government has demonstrated support for community land trusts by providing grant funding to Land for People to enable it to undertake three pilot schemes in Powys and to produce guidance for communities considering establishing community land trusts.

Mick Bates: I would like to place on record your support for this. The support for Land for People, in particular, has been extremely useful.

One of the key issues is to obtain the land at a price that makes it achievable to build houses on it and to empower the local community. One of the key areas is the acquisition of Government land, like that in Ceinws, near Machynlleth. The problem is with the legal issues involved in that. Will you commit extra assistance, given that there are so many complexities involved in the acquisition of land? You need to use your good offices to step in here and commit legal resources that would assist in that acquisition and in the building of houses.

Edwina Hart: I am aware of the difficulties that you have had and of the protracted discussions that have gone on with the Forestry Commission, Powys County Council and all the parties involved on issues on this site. I understand your point and I would be happy to consider it in context when we see what happens with the three projects that are involved.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Fel y crybwyllwyd yn y ddatganiad ddydd Mawrth, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dangos cefnogaeth i ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol drwy ddarparu arian grant i'r sefydliad Land for People i'w alluogi i gynnal tri chynllun peilot ym Mhowys ac i gynhyrchu canllawiau i gymunedau sy'n ystyried sefydlu ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol.

Mick Bates: Hoffwn gofnodi eich cefnogaeth chi i hyn. Mae'r gefnogaeth a roddwyd i Land for People, yn benodol, wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol iawn.

Un o'r materion allweddol dan sylw yw prynu'r tir am bris sy'n golygu y gellir codi tai arno a grymuso'r gymuned leol. Un o'r meysydd allweddol yw prynu tir y Llywodraeth, fel yng Ngheins, ger Machynlleth. Y broblem yw'r materion cyfreithiol sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny. A wnewch chi ymrwymo cymorth ychwanegol, o gofio bod cynifer o gymhlethdodau'n gysylltiedig â phrynu tir? Mae angen ichi ddefnyddio'ch grym ac ymrwymo adnoddau cyfreithiol a fyddai'n cynorthwyo'r broses brynu honno ac wrth godi tai.

Edwina Hart: Gwn am yr anawsterau a gawsoch ac am y trafodaethau maith a fu gyda'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, Cyngor Sir Powys a'r holl bartion sy'n gysylltiedig â materion ar y safle hwn. Deallaf eich pwnt, a byddwn yn fodlon i'w ystyried yn ei gyddestun pan welwn beth fydd yn digwydd gyda'r tri phrosiect sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn.

Mick Bates: Thank you. Your positive attitude will lend itself well to ensuring that we eventually see the successful completion of houses by community land trusts. The other issue is that of reducing building costs. Within that realm, you will be aware that the first building and construction conference was held in Cardiff, and it was shown that it is possible to reduce the costs of building a house. What support are you able to lend through your Government to encourage the construction industry to build at a price that makes houses affordable and, at the same time, environmentally friendly?

Edwina Hart: That last point is important, namely that it must be not only affordable but sustainable and environmentally friendly. If we are putting up more housing units, they need to meet all those criteria. I am aware of the initiatives that are going on and that people are looking at building in a far cheaper way, sometimes by not using conventional means. I am more than happy to look at those issues for you.

Jocelyn Davies: You will be aware that some organisations with charitable status would like to dispose of land cheaply for the purposes of community land trusts, but are prevented from doing so by legislation. Will you commit to discussing that with your Westminster colleagues so that community land trusts could take advantage of land available at a price below the market value?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for raising that; the voluntary sector has also raised it. Churches have land assets but, if they are for charitable purposes, they have to try to get the best benefit for the charity. I would be happy to put this on the agenda for my next meeting with Nick Ainger.

Mark Isherwood: Responding to my party's proposals to extend the use of community land trusts, Shelter stated that, with one in seven children growing up homeless or badly housed, innovative thinking about how to provide the homes that this country needs is welcome. The only solution to the current housing crisis is to build more social homes

Mick Bates: Diolch. Bydd eich agwedd gadarnhaol yn gymorth i sicrhau ein bod yn gweld tai'n cael eu codi'n llwyddiannus gan ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol yn y pen draw. Y mater arall yw lleihau costau adeiladu. O fewn hynny, fe wyddoch fod y gynhadledd adeiladu gyntaf wedi'i chynnal yng Nghaerdydd, a dangoswyd ei bod yn bosibl lleihau costau adeiladu tŷ. Pa gymorth y gallwch ei roi drwy eich Llywodraeth i annog y diwydiant adeiladu i adeiladu am bris sy'n gwneud tai'n fforddiadwy, ac yn garedig i'r amgylchedd ar yr un pryd?

Edwina Hart: Mae'r pwynt olaf hwnnw'n un pwysig, sef y dylent fod nid yn unig n fforddiadwy, ond yn gynaliadwy ac yn garedig i'r amgylchedd. Os ydym yn codi mwy o unedau tai, mae angen iddynt fodloni'r holl feini prawf hynny. Gwn am y mentrau sy'n mynd ymlaen a bod pobl yn chwilio am ffyrdd llawer rhatach o adeiladu, weithiau drwy beidio â defnyddio dulliau confensiynol. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ystyried y materion hynny ar eich rhan.

Jocelyn Davies: Fel y gwyddoch, byddai rhai sefydliadau sydd â statws elusennol yn dymuno cael gwared ar dir yn rhad at ddibenion ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, ond cânt eu rhwystro rhag gwneud hynny gan ddeddfwriaeth. A ymrwymwch i drafod hynny gyda'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan, fel y gall ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol fanteisio ar dir sydd ar gael am bris islaw gwerth y farchnad?

Edwina Hart: Diolch ichi am godi'r pwynt hwnnw; mae'r sector gwirfoddol wedi codi'r pwynt hefyd. Mae gan eglwysi asedau tir, ond os ydynt at ddibenion elusennol rhaid iddynt gael y budd gorau i'r elusen. Byddwn yn fodlon rhoi'r pwynt hwn ar yr agenda ar gyfer fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda Nick Ainger.

Mark Isherwood: I ymateb i gynigion fy mhlaid i ehangu defnyddio ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, dywedodd Shelter, gan fod un plentyn o bob saith yn tyfu i fyny'n ddigartref neu mewn cartref o safon wael, fod syniadau arloesol sut i ddarparu'r cartrefi y mae ar y wlad hon eu hangen yn cael eu croesawu. Yr unig ateb i'r

for those in the greatest need. It stated that the key issue is whether, as we have heard, land is available for them to work. Whenever we question you on this, you refer to Forestry Commission land to the exclusion of almost everything else. In talking with you in committee, I have often referred to the fact that, as we heard, churches are keen to assist. That was brought to my attention by the north Wales branch of Cytûn. Country landowners are also keen to assist, and they have highlighted the matter with me and also, I know, in evidence to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee on technical advice note 2. What discussions have you held with Welsh churches and countryside landowners about land release for affordable housing and community land trusts?

Edwina Hart: You referred at the beginning of your question to your party's proposals on community land trusts. I did not realise that they were exclusively yours; I thought that parties across the Chamber were in favour of community land trusts, particularly as they emanate from the community and could prove useful, particularly in some rural areas where we are looking to get more affordable housing. In addition, I do not exclusively refer to the Forestry Commission but I do tend to refer to matters that are under the direct control of the Government, namely Forestry Commission land, former Assembly-sponsored public body land, and our relationships with local government on the issue of land. I have regular meetings with the voluntary sector, which includes churches and others, and these issues are sometimes raised with me. I have an open-door policy, if people have particular problems. It is interesting that Jocelyn raised that particular problem with me today, and I believe that I responded positively to her about discussions on the issue.

Mark Isherwood: The reason why I referred to my party's proposals—although I accept that other parties have similar proposals, particularly, I understand, the Liberal

argyfwng tai presennol yw adeiladu mwy o dai cymdeithasol i'r rheini y mae arnynt eu hangen fwyaf. Dywedai mai'r mater allweddol, fel y clywsom, yw a oes tir ar gael ar gyfer gwneud hynny. Pryd bynnag y cewch eich holi am hyn, byddwch yn cyfeirio at dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth ac yn eithrio bron popeth arall. Wrth drafod gyda chi yn y pwyllgor, yr wyf yn aml wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith, fel y clywsom, fod eglwysi'n awyddus i gynorthwyo. Daethpwyd â hynny i'm sylw gan gangen y gogledd o Cytûn. Mae tîrfeddianwyr cefn gwlad hefyd yn awyddus i helpu, ac maent wedi codi'r mater gyda mi, a hefyd gwn eu bod wedi codi'r mater mewn tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar nodyn cyngor technegol 2. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gydag eglwysi yng Nghymru a thîrfeddianwyr cefn gwlad ynghylch rhyddhau tir ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy ac ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol?

Edwina Hart: Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ar ddechrau'ch cwestiwn at gynigion eich plaid ar gyfer ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol. Nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli mai eich cynigion chi yn unig oedd y rhain; yr oeddwn ar ddeall bod pob plaid yn y Siambr o blaid ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, yn enwedig am fod eu gwreiddiau yn y gymuned ac y gallent fod yn ddefnyddiol, yn arbennig mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig lle'r ydym yn ceisio sicrhau mwy o dai fforddiadwy. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn cyfeirio nid at y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn unig, ond yr wyf yn dueddol o gyfeirio at faterion sydd o dan reolaeth uniongyrchol y Llywodraeth, sef tir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, tir cyrff cyhoeddus a noddid gynt gan y Cynulliad, a'n perthynas â llywodraeth leol o ran tir. Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r sector gwirfoddol, sy'n cynnwys eglwysi ac eraill, a chaiff y materion hyn eu codi gyda mi weithiau. Mae gennyf bolisi drws agored, os oes gan bobl broblemau penodol. Mae'n ddiddorol fod Jocelyn wedi codi'r broblem benodol honno gyda mi heddiw, a chredaf imi roi ymateb cadarnhaol iddi am drafodaethau am y mater.

Mark Isherwood: Y rheswm pam y cyfeiriaais at gynigion fy mhlaidd—er fy mod yn derbyn bod gan bleidiau eraill, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn benodol, yn ôl

Democrats—is that the comments that I referred to—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I know that today is a Thursday, but this is not a debate. It is questions to the Minister, and I have been very tolerant so far of long preambles. I would like questions; not just from you, Mark, but from anyone else whom I may call.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you. I take it from your response, Minister, that you have not had any discussions, although I first raised this issue with you after meeting with Cytûn in 2005. Housing Forum Cymru tells us that Wales needs to fund over 2,500 extra homes each year to meet current needs and to deal with the backlog of households in need. We believe that there has to be a significant increase in funding to establish new forms of housing co-operatives and to expand community land trust development, to bring house prices within the reach of first-time buyers. What additional practical action do you propose to achieve that, working with the housing sector, because what we have had so far—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry, but this is not appropriate. I had taken a vow this year to be nice to everyone until the election, and I do not want to break that, but I ask that we please have questions. I request that the Minister respond to one of those points.

Edwina Hart: We had an extensive debate on affordable housing on Tuesday, which is now a matter of record, in which many of these points were aired and discussed by all parties here.

a ddeallaf, gynigion tebyg—yw bod y sylwadau y cyfeiriais atynt—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gwn ei bod yn ddydd Iau, ond nid dadl yw hon. Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog ydyw, ac yr wyf wedi bod yn oddefgar iawn hyd yma gyda rhaglithiau maith. Hoffwn glywed cwestiynau; nid yn unig gennyh chi, Mark, ond gan unrhyw un arall y byddaf yn ei alw.

Mark Isherwood: Diolch. Cymeraf o'ch ymateb, Weinidog, nad ydych wedi cael trafodaethau, er imi godi'r mater hwn gyda chi gyntaf ar ôl cyfarfod â Cytûn yn 2005. Dywed Fforwm Tai Cymru fod angen i Gymru ariannu dros 2,500 o dai ychwanegol bob blwyddyn i ddiwallu anghenion cyfredol a mynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad teuluoedd mewn angen. Credwn fod rhaid cael cynnydd sylweddol mewn cyllid i sefydlu mathau newydd o gydweithfeydd tai ac i ehangu datblygu ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, er mwyn sicrhau bod prisiau tai o fewn cyrraedd pobl sy'n prynu tai am y tro cyntaf. Pa gamau ymarferol ychwanegol a gynigiwch i sicrhau hynny, drwy weithio gyda'r sector tai, gan fod yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i weld hyd yma—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond nid yw hyn yn briodol. Gwneuthum adduned eleni i fod yn garedig wrth bawb tan yr etholiad, ac nid yr wyf am ei thorri. Ond gofynnaf am gael cwestiynau, os gwelwch yn dda. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymateb i un o'r pwyntiau hynny.

Edwina Hart: Cawsom ddadl helaeth ar dai fforddiadwy ddydd Mawrth, sydd bellach wedi'i chofnodi, a lle cafodd nifer o'r pwyntiau hyn eu codi a'u trafod gan bob plaid yma.

Camddefnyddio Cyffuriau ac Alcohol Drug and Alcohol Abuse

Q2 Glyn Davies: What new policies does the Minister have to reduce the number of young people suffering from drug and alcohol abuse? OAQ1082(SJR)

Edwina Hart: We are currently consulting on the children and young people's model of the substance misuse treatment framework.

C2 Glyn Davies: Pa bolisiau newydd sydd gan y Gweinidog i leihau nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n dioddef o gamddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol? OAQ1082(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar fodel plant a phobl ifanc o'r fframwaith trin camddefnyddio sylweddau.

The document covers treatment, education, prevention and the commissioning of services for children and young people engaged in, or at risk of, substance misuse.

Glyn Davies: Clearly, you have policies on prevention and to assist those who are already suffering. What reports have you commissioned on the number of detoxification beds or places in Wales that you might need, what have those reports told you, and can you assure us that in no part of Wales have you cut the number of places?

Edwina Hart: On funding, which relates directly to this issue, the substance misuse fund has increased from £3.3 million in 2002-03 to £22 million for 2007-08. That is a massive increase of over 600 per cent. An additional 5,500 treatment places have been created with support from that fund, and the community safety partnerships have been asked to make services for young people a priority in 2007-08. Next year, the four community safety partnerships in the Dyfed-Powys area will receive almost £2.1 million in additional money. Therefore, you can see that many initiatives are under way across the piece. I would be the last person, however, to say that there are sufficient services to meet the demand. As I have said honestly in committee, there are growing issues with drug and alcohol misuse, and the fact that the budget line has increased is an indication that we are trying to tackle this.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you agree that school nurses can have an important role to play in dealing with low-level substance abuse and preventative work? What discussions have you had, or would you be prepared to have, with your colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services, to ensure that our network of school nurses is strengthened and put on a solid footing?

Edwina Hart: It is very important that we use all the tools in our armoury, and so, if school nurses are available, I think that they could be enormously helpful perhaps in helping to identify children who might have substance misuse problems, as those children might be going to see the school nurse for

Mae'r ddogfen yn trafod triniaeth, addysg, atal a chomisiynu gwasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau neu sydd mewn perygl o wneud hynny.

Glyn Davies: Yn amlwg, mae gennych bolisiau ar atal a chynorthwyo'r rheini sydd eisoes yn dioddef. Pa adroddiadau yr ydych wedi'u comisiynu ar nifer y gwelyau neu leoedd dadwenwyno yng Nghymru y gallai fod eu hangen arnoch, beth fu casgliad yr adroddiadau hynny, ac a allwch ein sicrhau nad ydych wedi gostwng nifer y lleoedd mewn unrhyw ran o Gymru?

Edwina Hart: O ran arian, sy'n gysylltiedig yn uniongyrchol â'r mater hwn, mae'r gronfa camddefnyddio sylweddau wedi cynyddu o £3.3 miliwn yn 2002-03 i £22 miliwn ar gyfer 2007-08. Mae hynny'n gynydd enfawr o fwy na 600 y cant. Crëwyd 5,500 o leoedd triniaeth ychwanegol gyda chymorth y gronfa honno, a gofynnwyd i'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol roi blaenoriaeth i wasanaethau i bobl ifanc yn 2007-08. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd y pedair partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol yn ardal Dyfed-Powys yn cael bron £2.1 miliwn yn ychwanegol. Felly, gwelwch fod nifer o fentrau ar waith yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf nad oes digon o wasanaethau i ateb y galw. Fel yr wyf wedi ei ddweud yn onest yn y pwyllgor, mae yna broblemau cynyddol o ran camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol, ac mae'r ffaith fod y llinell yn y gyllideb wedi cynyddu yn dangos ein bod yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â hyn.

Helen Mary Jones: A gytunwch y gall fod gan nyrsys ysgol ran bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau ar lefel isel ac mewn gwaith ataliol? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch, neu y byddech yn barod i'w cael, gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i sicrhau y caiff ein rhwydwaith o nyrsys ysgol ei gryfhau a'i atgyfnerthu?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig iawn inni ddefnyddio'r holl ddulliau sydd ar gael inni, ac felly, os yw nyrsys ysgol ar gael, credaf y gallent helpu'n aruthrol efallai i helpu nodi plant a all fod â phroblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau, gan gall y plant hynny fod yn ymweld â'r nyrs ysgol am resymau eraill.

other reasons. I will certainly have further discussions with the Minister about that.

Byddaf yn sicr yn cael trafodaethau pellach am hynny gyda'r Gweinidog.

Polisiau Adfywio Regeneration Policies

Q3 David Melding: Will the Minister outline how her regeneration policies are benefiting South Wales Central? OAQ1035(SJR)

C3 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y mae ei pholisïau adfywio o fudd i Ganol De Cymru? OAQ1035(SJR)

Edwina Hart: South Wales Central benefits from a number of regeneration policies. The community facilities and activities programme is committed to regenerating South Wales Central, and Communities First partnerships are, I hope, raising the aspirations of local people. There are also several renewal areas in Cardiff, the Vale of Glamorgan and Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Edwina Hart: Mae Canol De Cymru yn cael budd o nifer o bolisïau adfywio. Mae'r rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol wedi ymrwymo i adfywio Canol De Cymru, a gobeithio bod partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn codi dyheadau pobl leol. Mae yn nifer o ardaloedd adnewyddu hefyd yng Nghaerdydd, Bro Morgannwg a Rhondda Cynon Taf.

12.40 p.m.

David Melding: I am sure that you will agree with the Beecham report that the way in which we use public expenditure can itself regenerate communities. An obvious example is improving housing standards and getting local firms to apply for contracts, ensuring that they take on local skilled workers and train others. Will you ensure that we work to improve the number of tenders taken up by local companies, by allowing them to apply more speedily and, for instance, by advertising tenders on the internet?

David Melding: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch ag adroddiad Beecham y gall y ffordd y defnyddiwn wariant cyhoeddus ynddi'i hun adfywio cymunedau. Enghraifft amlwg yw gwella safonau tai a sicrhau bod cwmnïau lleol yn gwneud cais am contractau, gan sicrhau eu bod yn cyflogi gweithwyr medrus lleol ac yn hyfforddi eraill. A wnewch chi sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio i wella nifer y tendrau a gaiff cwmnïau lleol, drwy eu galluogi i wneud cais yn gyflymach ac, er enghraifft, drwy hysbysebu tendrau ar y rhyngwyd?

Edwina Hart: The opportunity to use local firms is an issue that my colleague, Sue Essex, is much exercised by. If they can increase their work by tendering for public sector contracts, they might take on more trainees from the local community, which would enhance employment opportunities. I would be more than happy to take up that issue with Sue Essex. It is our duty to make contracts as accessible as possible and as easy to bid for as possible.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r cyfle i ddefnyddio cwmnïau lleol yn fater y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, wedi gwneud llawer o waith yn ei gylch. Os gallant gynyddu eu gwaith drwy dendro ar gyfer contractau'r sector cyhoeddus, gallent gyflogi mwy o weithwyr dan hyfforddiant o'r gymuned leol a fyddai'n gwella cyfleoedd cyflogaeth. Byddwn yn fwy na bodlon codi'r mater hwnnw gyda Sue Essex. Ein dyletswydd yw gwneud contractau mor hwylus â phosibl ac mor hawdd â phosibl i ymgeisio amdanynt.

Leighton Andrews: There are many ways in which Communities First organisations are contributing to the regeneration of their communities, but a difficulty faced increasingly by voluntary organisations is that of accessing core funding for their

Leighton Andrews: Mae yna nifer o ffyrdd y mae sefydliadau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyfrannu at adfywio'u cymunedau, ond un anhawster y mae sefydliadau gwirfoddol yn ei wynebu'n gynyddol yw cael gafael ar arian craidd ar gyfer eu gweithgareddau. A allwch

activities. Can you ensure that funds such as the Communities First trust fund are used flexibly to allow voluntary organisations that serve a number of wards—including Communities First wards—to draw money down?

Edwina Hart: I am grateful to you for raising that point, as the flexibility of the fund is an issue that has been raised with me by various organisations. I will be looking at the issue. If you or any other Members have examples of cases in which the fund has not been sufficiently flexible to deal with specific issue, I would be grateful if you would pass them on to me for further investigation and discussion with my officials. We need to be as innovative as possible in Communities First areas, so that we allow communities to think for themselves, to develop what they want for themselves, and to be given the necessary resources.

Leanne Wood: Minister, regenerating communities is an aim of Communities First, and I am sure that we both agree that the hard work and dedication of Communities First staff is key to the scheme's success. Therefore, does every Communities First partnership, as of today, have a co-ordinator, and will you agree to publish a list of those who sit on the partnership boards?

Edwina Hart: I am not responsible for the staffing arrangements of Communities First partnerships. If you send me a note on this issue, I will endeavour to get the information for you. I believe that there have been discussions about the composition of partnership boards, and I will look further at the issue to see what information can be made available. I have to balance large-scale requests for information with whether officials' time would be better spent undertaking real work than supplying information about the administration of the system. However, I will do my best and see what I can facilitate for Members.

Leanne Wood: In order to monitor equality issues, we have to know the make-up of local partnership boards. We also need to know

si rhau y defnyddir cronfeydd fel cronfa ymddiriedolaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn hyblyg i ganiatáu i sefydliadau gwirfoddol sy'n gwasanaethu nifer o wardiau—gan gynnwys wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—hawlio arian?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am godi'r pwynt hwnnw, gan fod hyblygrwydd y gronfa'n fater a godwyd gyda mi gan nifer o sefydliadau. Byddaf yn edrych ar y mater. Os oes gennych chi neu unrhyw Aelod arall enghreifftiau o achosion lle nad yw'r gronfa wedi bod yn ddigon hyblyg i ymdrin â mater penodol, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech eu hanfon ataf er mwyn imi ymchwilio ymhellach iddynt a'u trafod gyda'm swyddogion. Mae angen inni fod mor arloesol â phosibl mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, er mwyn inni alluogi cymunedau i feddwl drostynt eu hunain, i ddatblygu'r hyn y maent am ei gael iddynt eu hunain, ac i gael yr adnoddau angenrheidiol.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, mae adfywio cymunedol yn un o nodau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwn ein dwy bod gwaith caled ac ymroddiad staff Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn allweddol i lwyddiant y cynllun. Felly, a oes gan bob partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf gydgyssylltydd, heddiw, ac a gytunwch i gyhoeddi rhestr o'r rheini sydd ar y byrddau partneriaeth?

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am drefniadau staffio partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Os anfonwch nodyn ataf ar y mater hwn, ceisiaf gael y wybodaeth ichi. Credaf fod trafodaethau wedi bod am gyfansoddiad y byrddau partneriaeth, a byddaf yn edrych ar y mater ymhellach i weld pa wybodaeth y gellir ei rhoi. Rhaid imi gydbwyso ceisiadau ar raddfa fawr am wybodaeth a'r cwestiwn a fyddai amser swyddogion yn cael ei dreulio'n well yn ymgymryd â gwaith gwirioneddol, yn hytrach na darparu gwybodaeth am broses weinyddu'r system. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf fy ngorau i weld beth y gallaf ei wneud ar gyfer Aelodau.

Leanne Wood: Er mwyn monitro materion cydraddoldeb, mae angen inni wybod beth yw cyfansoddiad byrddau partneriaeth lleol.

how many co-ordinators are in place, because we need to know which partnerships are functioning properly, and we need to intervene in those that are not. I would be grateful if you could give us a date by which you will produce the names of those sitting on partnership boards, and I would be grateful if that could be done quickly.

Edwina Hart: I am not being difficult, and I will consult with officials on the availability of this information. There must be an alternative reason for this request. I am as keen as everybody else to ensure that there is a gender balance, and so on, in partnership boards, and that there is a balance of young people and older people. As a Government, that is one of our aims in the guidance that we provide. However, I will have further discussions on this issue, and come back to the Assembly.

Mae angen inni wybod hefyd faint o gydgyssylltwyr sydd ar waith, oherwydd mae angen inni wybod pa bartneriaethau sy'n gweithio'n iawn, ac mae angen inni ymyrryd yn y rhai nad ydynt yn gwneud hynny. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech roi dyddiad inni pryd y byddwch yn darparu enwau'r rheini sydd ar fyrddau partneriaeth, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech wneud hynny'n gyflym.

Edwina Hart: Nid wyf am fod yn lletchwith, a byddaf yn ymgynghori â'm swyddogion ynglŷn â chael y wybodaeth hon. Rhaid bod rheswm arall dros y cais hwn. Yr wyf mor awyddus â phawb arall i sicrhau bod cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau ryw, ac ati, mewn byrddau partneriaeth, a bod cydbwysedd o bobl ifanc a phobl hŷn. Fel Llywodraeth, dyna un o'n nodau yn y canllawiau a ddarparwn. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn cael trafodaethau pellach ar y mater hwn ac yn dod yn ôl at y Cynulliad.

Bwlch Rhwng y Tlawd a'r Cyfoethog The Gap Between the Poor and the Wealthy

C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa gamau mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yng Nghymru? OAQ1076(SJR)

Edwina Hart: My social justice report for 2006 sets out how, across the Welsh Assembly Government, we are combating the poverty and exclusion faced by disadvantaged groups and those living in our most deprived communities.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, o'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Achub y Plant yn 1999 a oedd yn sôn am y ffaith bod 56,000 o blant yn byw mewn tlodi cyson a difrifol. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad arall yn 2003 a oedd yn dweud nad oedd y sefyllfa wedi newid. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn 2003 mai un o'ch prif amcanion fel Llywodraeth oedd mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, ond, yn y 250 o gyflawniadau honedig a restrwyd gan y Prif Weinidog yn ddiweddar, nid oedd sôn am unrhyw lwyddiant yn y maes hwn.

Edwina Hart: The percentage of people in

Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What action is the Minister taking to address the gap between the poor and the wealthy in Wales? OAQ1076(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Dywed fy adroddiad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol am 2006 sut yr ydym, ar draws Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn brwydro yn erbyn y tlodi a'r allgáu sy'n wynebu grwpiau dan anfantais a'r rheini sy'n byw yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You will be aware, Minister, of the report published by Save the Children in 1999, which mentioned that 56,000 children were living in constant and serious poverty. Another report was published in 2003, which stated that the situation had not changed. The First Minister said, in 2003, that one of your main aims as a Government was tackling child poverty. Yet, in the 250 so-called achievements listed by the First Minister recently, there was no mention of any progress in this area.

Edwina Hart: Mae canran y bobl yng

Wales living in poverty has fallen from 25 per cent at the time of devolution to 21 per cent in the most recent figures. Over the same period, the percentage for Great Britain as a whole fell from 23 per cent to 21 per cent. Poverty rates for children, working-aged people and pensioners have converged across the UK in recent years; indeed, the latest statistics for pensioner poverty show that its incidence is lower in Wales than in Great Britain as a whole. We are also making improvements with the child poverty agenda. I recognise that there is still a long way to go, however, and that will be a major priority for the next four years.

Nghymru sy'n byw mewn tldi wedi gostwng o 25 y cant adeg datganoli i 21 y cant yn y ffigurau diweddaraf. Yn ystod yr un cyfnod, gostyngodd y ganran ar gyfer Prydain Fawr yn gyffredinol o 23 y cant i 21 y cant. Mae'r cyfraddau tldi ar gyfer plant, pobl o oedran gweithio a phensiynwyr wedi cydgyfarfod ledled y DU yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf; yn wir, dengys yr ystadegau diweddaraf ar dlodi pensiynwyr fod llai ohono i'w weld yng Nghymru nag ym Mhrydain Fawr yn gyffredinol. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweld gwelliannau o ran yr agenda tldi plant. Cydnabyddaf fod llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd, fodd bynnag, a bydd hynny'n brif flaenoriaeth ar gyfer y pedair blynedd nesaf.

Tai Fforddiadwy **Affordable Housing**

Q5 Kirsty Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of affordable housing in Wales? OAQ1053(SJR)

C5 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru? OAQ1053(SJR)

Edwina Hart: We have progressively increased the budget for the social housing grant programme over 2005-06 to 2007-08, and introduced a comprehensive package of policy measures and guidance aimed at increasing supply. These include the revised technical advice notes 1 and 2, a local housing market assessment guide, and the affordable housing toolkit.

Edwina Hart: Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb ar gyfer y rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol rhwng 2005-06 a 2007-08, ac wedi cyflwyno pecyn cynhwysfawr o fesurau a chanllawiau polisi sy'n anelu at gynyddu'r cyflenwad. Ymhlith y rhain mae nodiadau cyngor technegol diwygiedig 1 a 2, canllaw ar asesu'r farchnad dai leol, a'r pecyn cymorth tai fforddiadwy.

Kirsty Williams: Parts of south Powys have been lucky enough to have the benefit of the services of a rural housing enabler, who has had some success working as an honest broker with communities, landowners and local authorities to provide affordable housing. Do you believe that there is merit in working with local authorities across Wales, using lessons learned from rural housing enablers, to see what they can bring to the affordable housing issue in urban and rural Wales?

Kirsty Williams: Mae rhannau o dde Powys wedi bod yn ddigon ffodus i allu defnyddio gwasanaethau swyddogion galluogi ym maes tai yng nghefn gwlad, sydd wedi cael rhywfaint o lwyddiant wrth weithio fel brocer gonest gyda chymunedau, tirfeddianwyr ac awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy. A gredwch fod gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru o fudd, gan ddefnyddio'r gwersi a ddysgwyd gan swyddogion galluogi ym maes tai yng nghefn gwlad, er mwyn gweld beth y gallant ei ychwanegu at y drafodaeth ar dai fforddiadwy mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for complimenting the role of the rural housing enablers; excellent work has been undertaken in Gwynedd, north Monmouthshire and south Powys. I have now provided funding for a short-term project to develop a framework for

Edwina Hart: Diolch am ganmol rôl swyddogion galluogi ym maes tai yng nghefn gwlad; gwnaed gwaith ardderchog yng Ngwynedd, gogledd sir Fynwy a de Powys. Yr wyf yn awr wedi darparu cyllid ar gyfer prosiect byrdymor i ddatblygu fframwaith ar

a national network of rural housing enablers—a co-ordinated service that I hope will ensure that national practices are dealt with consistently at a local level. I expect the report shortly. I think that that picks up on your question.

Elin Jones: O ran tai fforddiadwy, un mater sy'n achosi rhywfaint o ansicrwydd i awdurdodau lleol yw sut i fod yn gadarn ynghylch y diffiniad o dŷ fforddiadwy, a sut i gadw tŷ yn fforddiadwy at y dyfodol. Mae rhai awdurdodau yn defnyddio cytundebau adran 106 ond golyga'r rheiny broblemau yn yr hirdymor. Medrir edrych ar gryfhau sail ddeddfwriaethol y diffiniad hwnnw. A oes gan eich Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad i edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth o ran tai fforddiadwy, neu i gryfhau ei chanllawiau ei hun?

Edwina Hart: I think that you have expressed the concerns of several people there. Money goes into affordable housing but the second time that a house is purchased it may or may not still be affordable, so what happens to the investment that we put in? I would be more than happy to look at those points, and I will probably report back to the next meeting of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. I will look at the legislative framework to see whether we can do anything to assist when we have new powers in May.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): I recognise that there is good practice in parts of Wales, but I wonder whether you would look at two particular aspects. The first is the encouragement of more building, as we are simply not building enough low-cost housing in the private sector. Secondly, what is your personal position regarding planning restrictions in relation to second homes in parts of Wales? That is a real problem in parts of Wales and is, I think, distorting the market.

Edwina Hart: I think that I would be rushing in where angels fear to tread if I were to comment on planning issues, Nick. However, I will certainly take up your point with my colleague, Carwyn Jones, who is the appropriate Minister.

gyfer rhwydwaith cenedlaethol o swyddogion galluogi ym maes tai yng nghefn gwlad— gwasanaeth cydgysylltiedig a fydd, gobeithio, yn sicrhau delio ag arferion cenedlaethol yn gyson ar lefel leol. Disgwyliaf i'r adroddiad gael ei gyhoeddi'n fuan. Credaf fod hynny'n ateb eich cwestiwn.

Elin Jones: On affordable housing, one matter which causes some uncertainty among local authorities is how to be firm about the definition of an affordable home, and how to keep a house affordable for the future. Some authorities use section 106 agreements, but they can result in problems in the long term. It would be possible to look into strengthening the legislative foundation of that definition. Does your Government have any intention of revisiting the legislation on affordable housing, or of strengthening its own guidelines?

Edwina Hart: Credaf eich bod wedi mynegi pryderon nifer o bobl. Mae arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn tai fforddiadwy, ond pan gaiff tŷ ei brynu'r eilwaith, fe all fod neu fe all beidio â bod yn fforddiadwy o hyd, felly beth sy'n digwydd i'n buddsoddiad ni? Yr wyf yn fodlon edrych ar y pwyntiau hynny, ac fe gyflwynaf adroddiad yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, fwy na thebyg. Edrychaf ar y fframwaith deddfwriaethol i weld a allwn wneud unrhyw beth i helpu pan fydd gennym bwerau newydd ym mis Mai.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Cydnabyddaf fod yna arfer da mewn rhannau o Gymru, ond a wnewch chi edrych ar ddwy agwedd benodol. Y cyntaf yw annog mwy o waith adeiladu, oherwydd nid ydym yn adeiladu digon o dai rhad yn y sector preifat. Yn ail, beth yw eich barn am gyfyngiadau cynllunio'n ymwneud ag ail gartrefi mewn rhannau o Gymru? Mae honno'n broblem wirioneddol mewn rhannau o Gymru, a chredaf ei bod yn cael effaith niweidiol ar y farchnad.

Edwina Hart: Byddai'n annoeth gwneud sylwadau ar faterion cynllunio, Nick. Fodd bynnag, fe godaf eich pwynt gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Carwyn Jones, sef y Gweinidog priodol.

You are right that there are issues with affordable housing. How shall I put it, Nick? People need to be realistic about understanding the demands in their areas. Sometimes, there are problems, and planners can seem a tad heavy-handed when looking for solutions, particularly in rural areas, and local people cannot understand why something has not been done. However—and I think that I made this point on Tuesday—local authorities have quite a lot of power in this regard, but it is worth looking at this area again in light of certain issues.

I think that we acknowledge that there just does not seem to be enough land available that is suitable to build on in certain parts of Wales, and so that is a concern, as well as the cost of land, sometimes. It can be quite prohibitive for the private sector to build starter homes; it makes more sense for a company to build executive housing, to get its money back.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan ddywedwch fod yha broblemau gyda thai fforddiadwy. Sut allaf fi eirio hyn, Nick? Mae angen i bobl fod yn realistig o ran deall y galw yn eu hardaloedd. Weithiau mae yna broblemau, ac fe all cynllunwyr ymddangos braidd yn llawdrwm wrth chwilio am atebion, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac ni all pobl leol ddeall y rheswm pam na wnaed rhywbeth. Fodd bynnag—a chredaf imi wneud y pwynt hwn ddydd Mawrth—mae gan awdurdodau lleol gryn bŵer yn hyn, ond mae'n werth edrych ar y maes hwn eto o gofio am rai materion penodol.

Credaf ein bod yn cydnabod nad yw'n ymddangos bod digon o dir ar gael sy'n addas i adeiladu arno mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, ac felly mae hynny'n peri pryder, yn ogystal â chost tir, weithiau. Gall fod yn eithaf gwaharddol i'r sector preifat adeiladu tai cychwynnol; mae'n gwneud mwy o synnwyr i gwmmi adeiladu tai dethol, er mwyn cael ei arian yn ôl.

Y Gronfa Atal Troseddau The Crime Fund

Q6 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the objectives of the Assembly Government's crime fund? OAQ1038(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Our objectives are set out in 'Wales: A Better Country', and they include reducing the fear of crime and addressing drug-related crime, ensuring effective treatment for addicts.

Peter Black: I am sure that you would not resent my saying that those objectives are fairly wide and difficult to measure. The Assembly Government is spending more than £100 million—possibly £120 million—over four years on the crime fund, and yet there do not seem to be any clear and measurable objectives by means of which we can evaluate the effectiveness of that expenditure and whether it is making a difference in Wales. Will you give an undertaking to try to produce such measures so that we can scrutinise how effectively that money is being spent?

C6 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am amcanion cronfa atal troseddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAQ1038(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Mae ein hamcanion wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', ac maent yn cynnwys lleihau ofn troseddau ac ymdrin â throseddau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau, gan sicrhau bod y rheini sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau yn cael triniaeth effeithiol.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydddech yn gweld y chwith pe bawn yn dweud bod yr amcanion hynny'n digon bras ac yn anodd eu mesur. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwario dros £100 miliwn—£120 miliwn o bosibl—dros bedair blynedd ar y gronfa atal troseddau, ac eto nid ymddengys fod yna ddim amcanion clir a mesuradwy sy'n ein galluogi i werthuso effeithiolrwydd y gwariant hwnnw, ac a yw'n gwneud gwahaniaeth yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i geisio llunio mesurau o'r fath fel y gallwn weld pa mor effeithiol y mae'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario?

12.50 p.m.

Edwina Hart: It is a difficult area in which to assessing effectiveness, because people still continue to fear crime. However, if you look at achievements, it is having an impact on Wales—the risk of being a victim of crime is at its lowest since the British crime survey began, which was, I think, in 1981. Crime rates in Wales continued to fall during 2005 and 2006. Recorded crime in Wales fell by 3 per cent, compared with a 1 per cent increase in England and Wales. We also recognise what a good job the police are doing, in difficult circumstances sometimes, on these issues. However, I am always happy to look at whether I can add a pointer as to where our money is going in and where we are getting value. The issue of our support of operation Tarian has been raised in committee, and whether we can see any positive results coming out of that. I am happy to pick up your point and see what we can do in terms of monitoring outcomes.

Owen John Thomas: Recently, a young female cyclist was violently attacked and robbed as she cycled home along the Taff trail in Cardiff. Unfortunately, robberies and muggings in the area between Blackweir and Grangetown are increasing, and are turning one of the finest attractions in the capital city into a no-go area after dark. I understand that money is available to help deal with these matters. Will you join me in calling on Cardiff County Council to use the crime fund to install additional closed-circuit television cameras and lighting along more isolated parts of the Taff trail to make this area one that, once again, can be used freely by our citizens?

Edwina Hart: It is important that local authorities look at their role and responsibilities in this regard. It is important that such areas are not out of bounds, because they are for recreation purposes. We are encouraging people to cycle on trails and it is important that we have adequate lighting. This may also be a matter for the community

Edwina Hart: Mae'n faes anodd i asesu effeithiolrwydd ynddo, oherwydd mae pobl yn dal i ofni troseddau. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar gyflawniadau, mae'n cael effaith ar Gymru—mae'r perygl dioddef trosedd ar ei hisaf ers i arolwg troseddau Prydain ddechrau, yn 1981 mi gredaf. Parhaodd cyfraddau troseddau yng Nghymru i ostwng yn ystod 2005 a 2006. Gostyngodd nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru 3 y cant, o'u cymharu â chynnydd o 1 y cant yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Hefyd, cydnabyddwn y gwaith da y mae'r heddlu'n ei wneud, mewn amgylchiadau anodd weithiau, ar y problemau hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon edrych i weld a allaf fod yn fwy eglur ble mae ein harian yn cael ei wario a ble yr ydym yn cael gwerth am arian. Codwyd mater ein cefnogaeth i ymgyrch Tarian yn y pwyllgor, ac a allwn weld unrhyw ganlyniadau cadarnhaol yn sgîl hynny. Yr wyf yn ddigon bodlon gweithredu ar eich pwynt a gweld beth y gallwn ei wneud o ran monitro canlyniadau.

Owen John Thomas: Yn ddiweddar, ymosodwyd yn ffyrnig ar ferch ifanc wrth iddi deithio adref ar ei beic ar hyd Taith Taf yng Nghaerdydd, a chafodd nwyddau eu dwyn oddi arni. Yn anffodus, mae achosion o ddwyn a mygio yn yr ardal rhwng Blackweir a Grangetown yn cynyddu, ac yn troi un o'r atyniadau gorau yn y brifddinas yn ardal na ddylid mynd iddi ar ôl iddi dywyllu. Deallaf fod arian ar gael i helpu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. A ymunwch â mi i alw ar Gyngor Sir Caerdydd i ddefnyddio'r gronfa atal troseddau i osod camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng a goleuadau ychwanegol ar hyd y rhannau mwy ynysig o Daith Taf, er mwyn gwneud yr ardal hon yn un y gall ein dinasyddion ei defnyddio pan fynnant unwaith eto?

Edwina Hart: Mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol edrych ar eu rôl a'u cyfrifoldebau yn hyn. Mae'n bwysig i ardaloedd felly beidio â bod yn ardaloedd na ddylid mynd iddynt, oherwydd maent yno er mwyn. Yr ydym yn annog pobl i feicio ar hyd llwybrau, ac mae'n bwysig inni gael digon o oleuadau. Gallai hyn hefyd fod yn fater i'r bartneriaeth

safety partnership, and I will certainly take up the matter, via my officials, on your behalf.

diogelwch cymunedol, ac fe godaf y mater yn bendant, drwy fy swyddogion, ar eich rhan.

Gostwng Lefelau Troseddu Reducing the Levels of Crime

Q7 Kirsty Williams: What is the Minister doing to help reduce the levels of crime in rural communities? OAQ1052(SJR)

C7 Kirsty Williams: Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i helpu gostwng lefelau troseddu mewn cymunedau gwledig? OAQ1052(SJR)

Edwina Hart: I have regular discussions with the four chief constables and the police authorities for Wales on a wide range of issues, including rural crime. Local community safety partnerships are engaged in a range of interventions that address the specific problems of rural communities.

Edwina Hart: Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'r pedwar prif gwnstabl a'r awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru ar ystod eang o faterion, gan gynnwys troseddau gwledig. Mae partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn ymwneud ag amrywiaeth o ymyriadau sy'n mynd i'r afael â phroblemau penodol cymunedau gwledig.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, the success of the two police community support officers who were placed in Llandrindod has been widely acknowledged in the whole of Powys. At the recent meeting with police officers in my constituency, the divisional commander said that he would have PCSOs by the bucket full if only he could afford them. We are about to get some more in Brecon and Ystradgynlais, but there are other communities that would benefit hugely from having that uniformed presence on their streets, reassuring the public, dealing with low-level crime, and showing those who are intent on causing difficulties in their communities that they will be caught and dealt with. What can you do to increase the number of PCSOs in rural communities?

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, mae llwyddiant dau swyddog cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu yn Llandrindod wedi'i gydnabod yn eang ym Mhowys gyfan. Yn y cyfarfod diwethaf gyda swyddogion heddlu yn fy etholaeth, dywedodd y comander rhanbarthol y byddai'n defnyddio llawer iawn o swyddogion o'r fath pe byddai'n gallu eu fforddio. Yr ydym ar fin cael rhagor yn Aberhonddu ac Ystradgynlais, ond mae yna gymunedau eraill a fyddai'n elwa'n fawr o gael swyddogion mewn lifrai ar eu strydoedd, i dawelu meddyliau'r cyhoedd, ymdrin â throseddau lefel isel, a dangos i'r rheini sy'n benderfynol o beri anawsterau yn eu cymunedau y byddant yn cael eu dal ac yr ymdrinnir â hwy. Beth allwch chi ei wneud i gynyddu nifer swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu mewn cymunedau gwledig?

Edwina Hart: I am pleased about your comments on PCSOs, and about the comments that I have had from across Wales that they have proved very useful in addition to police officers in dealing with issues. This is a funding issue for the individual police authorities to discuss, and, as you know, they are not particularly happy at the moment with some aspects of their settlement from the Home Office. I will certainly pick up that point about how they can perhaps prioritise in that area in my regular meeting with the chief constables and the police authority chairs.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn falch clywed eich sylwadau am swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu, ynghyd â'r sylwadau a gefais o bob cwr o Gymru eu bod yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn ychwanegu at swyddogion heddlu wrth ddelio â phroblemau. Mater ariannu i awdurdodau heddlu unigol ei drafod ydyw, ac fel y gwyddoch, nid ydynt yn hapus iawn ar hyn o bryd am rai agweddau ar eu setliad gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Yn bendant, fe godaf y pwynt hwnnw o ran sut y gallant, efallai, flaenoriaethu yn y maes hwn yn fy nghyfarfod rheolaidd gyda'r prif gwnstablaid a chadeiryddion yr awdurdodau

heddlu.

In terms of rural crime, I am aware that there has been a lot of concern expressed about crime relating to farmers. I received representations on that from the National Farmers' Union, and it is important that we recognise the criminality that exists in rural areas and provide the necessary protection.

Laura Anne Jones: Minister, many farmers in my constituency, and, I am sure, across Wales, experience problems when reporting crime in terms of explaining exactly where they are. That often causes a delay in police getting to the crime scene. It is a serious point, and I have many constituency cases about it. It seems to me that the biggest issue is, as Kirsty Williams has said, that we need more police officers and community support officers on the ground. Also, there is a particular problem in south-east Wales in that farmers' first call is to a call centre in Cwmbran. That causes problems for a farmer, say, in Caerphilly, which is quite a distance away. We cannot expect people in those call centres to know the geography of south-east Wales inside out. How are you working with farmers' groups and with the police to try to resolve this issue, because it needs to be tackled?

Edwina Hart: I understand that there are regular meetings between the police and farmers' organisations. However, I shall pick up the point that you have raised with me. I also think that you make a good point about locations. It comes back to the issue of postcodes that Brynle raised in the Chamber, and identifying places in rural areas. I shall pick up on those points and report back via the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee.

O ran troseddau gwledig, gwn fod llawer o bryder ynghylch troseddau'n ymwneud â ffermwyr. Cefais sylwadau am hynny gan Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, ac mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod y troseddu sy'n digwydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig a darparu'r diogelwch angenrheidiol.

Laura Anne Jones: Weinidog, mae nifer o ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth, ac, yr wyf yn siŵr, ledled Cymru, yn wynebu problemau wrth roi gwybod am droseddau i geisio egluro ble yn union y maent. Mae hynny'n aml yn achosi oedi yn yr amser a gymer i'r heddlu gyrraedd lleoliad trosedd. Mae'n bwynt difrifol, ac mae'n fater sy'n codi'n aml iawn yn fy etholaeth. Ymddengys i mi, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, mai'r broblem fwyaf yw prinder swyddogion heddlu a swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu ar y stryd. Hefyd, mae yna broblem benodol yn y de-ddwyrain gan fod ffermwyr yn ffonio canolfan alwadau yng Nghwmbwrân yn gyntaf. Mae hynny'n peri problemau i ffermwr, dyweder, yng Nghaerffili, sydd gryn bellter i ffwrdd. Ni allwn ddisgwyl i'r bobl yn y canolfannau galwadau hynny wybod am ddaearyddiaeth y de-ddwyrain drwyddi draw. Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gyda grwpiau ffermwyr a'r heddlu i geisio datrys y broblem hon, oherwydd mae angen mynd i'r afael â hi?

Edwina Hart: Deallaf fod yna gyfarfodydd rheolaidd rhwng yr heddlu a sefydliadau ffermwyr. Fodd bynnag, fe ymdriniaf â'r pwynt yr ydych wedi ei godi gyda mi. Credaf hefyd eich bod yn gwneud pwynt da am leoliadau. Mae'n dod yn ôl at broblem codau post a godwyd gan Brynle yn y Siambr, a nodi manau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ymdriniaf â'r pwyntiau hyn ac adrodd yn ôl arnynt drwy'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref The Home Energy Efficiency Scheme

Q8 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the uptake of the home energy efficiency scheme? OAQ1074(SJR)

C8 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fater manteisio ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? OAQ1074(SJR)

Q10 Lorraine Barrett: Will the Minister give an update on the home energy efficiency scheme? OAQ1056(SJR)

Edwina Hart: By the end of 2006-07, the scheme will have been able to assist some 72,000 households across Wales. The scheme has a budget of more than £19 million for both this year and 2007-08. Approximately 50 per cent of this budget will be spent on assisting pensioner households.

Jocelyn Davies: In the light of the increasing number of households in fuel poverty, will you review your strategy?

Edwina Hart: The home energy efficiency scheme is subject to almost constant review, as I have constant questions from Members and correspondence on the matter. Therefore, I try to look at the strategy in that context. The level of grants was the subject of one discussion, and we have increased the number of grants. I have a watching brief on the scheme at all times. I understand your point with regard to the number of people now living in fuel poverty, given the escalating gas and electricity charges.

Lorraine Barrett: I am sure that the Minister will join me in welcoming the fact that HEES has multiple benefits. As a result of the scheme, many of my constituents save a weekly average of almost £23, because the HEES advisers also run a benefit entitlement check when they assess people's homes. I hope that that will continue. Will you give some consideration to HEES being developed in future to provide renewable energy generation sources, such as solar panels?

Edwina Hart: Yes, the issue of renewable energy has been raised in the committee. It has been an issue particularly for some rural parts of Wales where there has not been access to gas mains; there has been a whole discussion on that. So, that is an ongoing consideration. You made an important point about maximising income. All households applying to HEES are offered a benefit entitlement check. This has been enormously helpful, because there are many proud older

C10 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? OAQ1056(SJR)

Edwina Hart: Erbyn diwedd 2006-07, bydd y cynllun wedi gallu helpu tua 72,000 o gartrefi ledled Cymru. Mae gan y cynllun gyllideb o fwy na £19 miliwn am y flwyddyn hon a 2007-08. Caiff tua 50 y cant o'r gyllideb hon ei wario ar helpu pensiynwyr.

Jocelyn Davies: Yn sgîl y nifer gynyddol o gartrefi mewn tloidi tanwydd, a wnewch adolygu eich strategaeth?

Edwina Hart: Mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn cael ei adolygu bron yn barhaus, oherwydd caiff cwestiynau eu gofyn gan Aelodau ac mewn gohebiaeth yn barhaus am y mater hwn. Felly, yr wyf yn ceisio edrych ar y strategaeth yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Lefel y grantiau oedd pwnc un drafodaeth, ac yr ydym wedi cynyddu nifer y grantiau. Yr wyf yn cadw golwg ar y cynllun drwy'r amser. Deallaf eich pwynt ynghylch nifer y bobl sydd yn awr yn byw mewn tloidi tanwydd, o gofio'r cynnydd mewn taliadau nwy a thrydan.

Lorraine Barrett: Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i groesawu'r ffaith bod i'r cynllun nifer o fanteision. O ganlyniad iddo, mae nifer o'm hetholwyr yn arbed bron i £23 yr wythnos ar gyfartaledd, oherwydd mae cynghorwyr y cynllun hefyd yn asesu hawl pobl i gael budd-daliadau pan gaiff eu cartrefi eu hasesu. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n parhau. A wnewch chi ystyried datblygu'r cynllun yn y dyfodol i ddarparu ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy, megis paneli solar?

Edwina Hart: Gwnaf, mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn fater sydd wedi'i godi yn y pwyllgor. Mae wedi bod yn fater i rai rhannau gwledig o Gymru yn arbennig lle na fu'n bosibl cael prif gyflenwad nwy; cafwyd trafodaeth lawn ar hynny. Felly, mae hynny'n ystyriaeth barhaus. Fe wnaethoch bwynt pwysig ynghylch gwneud y mwyaf o incwm. Caiff pob cartref sy'n gwneud cais o dan y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref ei asesu o ran hawl y deiliaid i gael budd-daliadau, os

people who still do not want to think that they are entitled to benefits. Sometimes, if someone comes out to deal with HEES and does the benefit check, those people are then delighted to have a few extra pounds. That is quite essential in this day and age, given fuel prices.

Brynle Williams: Regrettably, in my surgery this week, I saw a couple in their 80s, whose boiler had packed up before Christmas. They had no hot water and no heating, and they did not know where to go. Could you please raise the profile of the scheme and publicise it to such people? These people were not aware of the scheme.

Edwina Hart: There has been a great deal of discussion in committee about raising the profile of HEES. I think that it does a reasonable job, but it still does not access everyone that it needs to. We are going to have to put more thought into this. It is very useful when Assembly Members highlight the scheme when they are out and about and with the groups that they talk to in their constituencies. That helps enormously. We are reviewing this all the time. I am not quite sure how to crack it, to be honest. There is quite a lot of literature on it. All voluntary organisations know about it, but there does seem to be a group that we do not seem to reach at all. I shall certainly give that further consideration, within the limitations of my budget, of course, Brynle.

Denise Idris Jones: I have held many Eaga Partnership surgeries across the Conwy constituency. I am in the fortunate position of having a column in the newspaper, so I am able to mention this. I have been able to help many older people overcome or avoid fuel poverty through HEES. Do you agree that tackling fuel and other poverty issues for older people must continue to be at the top of our social justice agenda?

Edwina Hart: Very much so. I think that we are doing so quite well through that scheme. However, we must do more to encourage people to look into their benefit entitlements.

dymunant hynny. Bu hyn o gymorth mawr iawn, oherwydd mae nifer o bobl hŷn balch nad ydynt o hyd am feddwl bod ganddynt hawl i gael budd-daliadau. Weithiau, os bydd rhywun yn dod allan i ddelio â'r cynllun ac yn asesu eu hawl i gael budd-daliadau, bydd y bobl hynny wrth eu bodd i gael ychydig bunnoedd ychwanegol. Mae hynny'n hollol hanfodol heddiw, o gofio prisiau tanwydd.

Brynle Williams: Yn anffodus, yn fy nghymhorthfa yr wythnos hon, gwelais bâr yn eu 80au a oedd â'u bwyler wedi torri cyn y Nadolig. Nid oedd ganddynt ddŵr poeth na gwres, ac ni wyddent at bwy i droi. A allech godi proffil y cynllun a rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd iddo ymhlith pobl felly? Nid oedd y bobl hyn yn gwybod am y cynllun.

Edwina Hart: Bu cryn drafod yn y pwyllgor am godi proffil y cynllun. Credaf ei fod yn gwneud gwaith rhesymol, ond nid yw'n cyrraedd pawb y mae angen iddo'u cyrraedd o hyd. Yr ydym am feddwl amdano ymhellach. Mae'n ddefnyddiol iawn pan fydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn tynnu sylw at y cynllun yn y gymuned a chyda'r grwpiau maent yn siarad â hwy yn eu hetholaethau. Mae hynny'n help aruthrol. Yr ydym yn adolygu hyn drwy'r amser. Ni wn yn hollol beth yw'r ateb, a dweud y gwir. Mae tipyn o ddeunydd darllen arno. Mae pob sefydliad gwirfoddol yn gwybod amdano, ond mae'n ymddangos bod grŵp nad ydym yn ei gyrraedd o gwbl. Fe ystyriaf hynny ymhellach yn sicr, o fewn terfynau fy nghyllideb, wrth gwrs, Brynle.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr wyf wedi cynnal nifer o gymorthfeydd Partneriaeth Eaga ledled fy etholaeth yng Nghonwy. Yr wyf yn ffodus fod gennyf golofn yn y papur newydd, felly, gallaf sôn amdano. Yr wyf wedi llwyddo i helpu nifer o bobl hŷn i oresgyn neu osgoi tloidi tanwydd drwy'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid i fater delio â phroblemau tloidi tanwydd a phroblemau tloidi eraill i bobl hŷn barhau ar frig ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol?

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf, yn bendant. Credaf ein bod yn gwneud hynny'n eithaf da drwy'r cynllun hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wneud mwy i annog pobl i ymchwilio i'w

That is also important. I am delighted that you have been so successful in running these surgeries across your constituency, because the Eaga Partnership is always ready and available to help Members.

hawl i gael budd-daliadau. Mae hynny hefyd yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn falch iawn eich bod wedi cael cymaint o lwyddiant yn cynnal y cymorthfeydd hyn ledled eich etholaeth, oherwydd mae Partneriaeth Eaga bob amser yn barod i helpu Aelodau ac ar gael i wneud hynny.

1.00 p.m.

William Graham: You will acknowledge that when the energy efficiency scheme was set up by the Conservative Government in 1991, one of its secondary aims was the creation of jobs, and, particularly, training for people in those industries. By 1996, 1,600 jobs had been created and 2,100 people had been trained as installers, at a time when the sector was actually reducing in terms of numbers. Would you consider making the secondary purpose of this scheme more widely available in Wales?

William Graham: Fe gydnabyddwch, pan sefydlwyd y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1991, mai un o'i nodau eilaidd oedd creu swyddi, ac yn arbennig hyfforddiant i bobl yn y diwydiannau hynny. Erbyn 1996, yr oedd 1,600 o swyddi wedi'u creu a 2,100 o bobl wedi'u hyfforddi fel gosodwyr, ar adeg pan oedd y sector mewn gwirionedd yn lleihau o ran niferoedd. A ystyriwch gyflwyno diben eilaidd y cynllun hwn yn ehangach yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: I will certainly look at those issues again, William. It is important, in order to make the scheme work, that we have people who are trained in installing and that they are easily available and accessible.

Edwina Hart: Yn sicr, ailedrychaf ar y materion hynny, William. Mae'n bwysig, er mwyn gwneud i'r cynllun weithio, inni gael pobl sydd wedi'u hyfforddi i osod ac y gellir cael gafael arnynt a chysylltu â hwy yn hawdd.

Blaenoriaethau'r Gyllideb Budget Priorities

Q9 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister outline her budget priorities for the next six months?
OAQ1084(SJR)

C9 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gyllideb am y chwe mis nesaf?
OAQ1084(SJR)

Edwina Hart: My spending priorities have been set out in the social justice and regeneration budget, which covers the next three years.

Edwina Hart: Mae fy mlaenoriaethau gwariant wedi eu gosod allan yn y gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, sy'n cwmpasu'r tair blynedd nesaf.

Nick Bourne: One way of getting more punch for the pound is by ensuring that some services are delivered more effectively. With post office services, which I appreciate have a non-devolved element, are we are encouraging and incentivising local authorities to offer some of their services through the post office system and over post office counters? That would make post offices more viable. Is the Minister looking at that, and if so, can she provide a report on it?

Nick Bourne: Un ffordd i gael mwy o werth am yr arian yw sicrhau y caiff rhai gwasanaethau eu darparu'n fwy effeithiol. O ran gwasanaethau swyddfa bost, y cydnabyddaf eu bod yn cynnwys elfen nad yw wedi'i datganoli, a ydym yn annog ac yn cymhell awdurdodau lleol i gynnig rhai o'u gwasanaethau drwy'r system swyddfa bost a thros gownteri'r swyddfa bost? Byddai hynny'n gwneud swyddfeydd post yn fwy dichonadwy. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried hynny, ac os felly, a all roi adroddiad ar

hynny?

Edwina Hart: This is something that I have discussed with the Welsh Local Government Association. There are enormous opportunities for local authorities to deal constructively with post offices, for example by allowing people to pay their bills at post offices and or by having a help point at post offices, where local authority staff could work for one day a week. I am more than happy to explore this further.

Edwina Hart: Mae hyn yn fater yr wyf wedi ei drafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Mae cyfleoedd aruthrol i awdurdodau lleol ymdrin yn adeiladol â swyddfeydd post, er enghraifft, drwy roi cyfle i bobl dalu eu biliau mewn swyddfeydd post, neu drwy agor man cymorth mewn swyddfeydd post lle y gallai staff awdurdodau lleol weithio am ddiwrnod yr wythnos. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ymchwilio ymhellach i'r mater hwn.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Earlier, you said that police authorities were concerned about their budgets and the cuts that they may have to make in the number of police officers and police community support officers. You also mentioned the pressure on your crime fund, and said that you do not know exactly where your money is going in terms of police community support officers. Can you tell us precisely how many police community support officers your current crime fund supports in Wales?

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Yn gynharach, dywedech fod awdurdodau heddlu'n pryderu am eu cyllidebau a'r toriadau y gall fod yn rhaid iddynt eu gwneud o ran nifer swyddogion heddlu a swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu. Crybwyllech hefyd y pwysau ar eich cronfa troseddau, gan ddweud nad ydych yn gwybod yn union i ble y mae eich arian yn mynd o ran swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu. A allwch ddweud wrthym yn union faint o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu y mae eich cronfa troseddau bresennol yn eu cefnogi yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: PCSOs are the responsibility of police authorities. As you will be aware, some police authorities decided early on that they wanted more such officers, while others decided that they would hold back and not take up any further entitlement. I am more than happy to provide a note for Members on the current position. I do not think that you interpreted my remarks correctly, Mike, in the preface to your question; I am satisfied with spend on the crime fighting fund, but I indicated to Peter that I was happy to look at more evidence to support where the money was going. It is important that the public knows where its money is being spent; I always like clarity on those issues.

Edwina Hart: Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau heddlu yw swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu. Fel y gwyddoch, penderfynodd rhai awdurdodau heddlu yn gynnar yn y broses eu bod am gael mwy o swyddogion o'r fath, a phenderfynodd eraill y byddent yn aros ac yn gwrthod unrhyw hawliau pellach. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ddarparu nodyn i Aelodau am y sefyllfa bresennol. Ni chredaf ichi ddehongli fy sylwadau'n gywir, Mike, yn y rhagair i'ch cwestiwn; yr wyf yn fodlon â'r gwariant ar y gronfa ymladd troseddau, ond dywedais wrth Peter fy mod yn barod i edrych ar fwy o dystiolaeth i ategu i ble yr oedd yr arian yn mynd. Mae'n bwysig i'r cyhoedd wybod ble y caiff eu harian ei wario. Yr wyf bob amser yn awyddus i sicrhau eglurder ar y materion hynny.

David Lloyd: How will the need to increase the social housing grant figure in your budget priorities over the next six months?

David Lloyd: Sut fydd yr angen i gynyddu'r grant tai cymdeithasol yn ymddangos yn eich blaenoriaethau cyllideb yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf?

Edwina Hart: The social housing grant is a

Edwina Hart: Mae'r grant tai cymdeithasol

key issue for us in terms of the money that is available, especially as I am now looking to tackle more extra care schemes for older people; schemes to tackle drug and substance misuse are also evident, as they are areas of concern. My social housing grant also contains Wanless money.

yn fater allweddol inni o ran yr arian sydd ar gael, yn arbennig gan fy mod yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â mwy o gynlluniau gofal ychwanegol i bobl hŷn; mae cynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio cyffuriau a sylweddau hefyd yn amlwg, gan eu bod yn peri pryder. Mae fy ngrant tai cymdeithasol hefyd yn cynnwys arian Wanless.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau Questions to the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation & Networks

The Presiding Officer: Question 1, **Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, OAQ1243(EIN), has been withdrawn. OAQ1243(EIN), yn ôl.

Buddsoddiadau'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn Contribution of Ministry of Defence Investments

Q2 Leighton Andrews: Will the Minister make a statement on the contribution of Ministry of Defence investments to the Welsh economy? OAQ1231(EIN)

C2 Leighton Andrews: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyfraniad buddsoddiadau'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn i economi Cymru? OAQ1231(EIN)

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): The defence footprint in Wales is set to increase significantly with the recent wonderful announcement that the new multibillion pound defence training academy will be located at St Athan in the Vale of Glamorgan. It is the largest single investment that Wales has ever received.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Disgwylir i'r ôl-troed amddiffyn yng Nghymru gynyddu'n sylweddol gyda'r cyhoeddiad ardderchog yn ddiweddar y bydd yr academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn newydd sy'n werth biliynau o bunnoedd yn cael ei chodi yn Sain Tathan ym Mro Morgannwg. Dyma'r buddsoddiad unigol mwyaf a gafodd Cymru erioed.

Leighton Andrews: I congratulate the Minister on his role, along with the First Minister and colleagues at Westminster, in helping to bring that development to south Wales. Does he agree that we would not want Wales to be seen as a place that is not welcoming of the British military? We believe that these investments have a considerable role to play in the Welsh economy and that Wales has not, in the past, enjoyed its fair share of such investments.

Leighton Andrews: Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog ar ei rôl, ynghyd â'r Prif Weinidog a'i gyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan, am helpu denu'r datblygiad hwnnw i dde Cymru. A yw'n cytuno na fyddem am i Gymru gael ei hystyried yn fan lle nad yw'n croesawu milwyr Prydain? Credwn fod i'r buddsoddiadau hyn ran bwysig yn economi Cymru ac nad yw Cymru, yn y gorffennol, wedi cael ei chyfran deg o fuddsoddiadau o'r fath.

Andrew Davies: I very much agree. It has been a fantastic team effort, as you said; I pay tribute to your parliamentary colleague, Chris Bryant, who led a very effective lobbying campaign at Westminster. As well as a team effort, it was a Team Wales effort, and it was an attempt to change the perception of Wales. We have been successful in doing that.

Andrew Davies: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Bu'n ymdrech tîm ardderchog, fel y dywedech; yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'ch cyd-Aelod seneddol, Chris Bryant, a arweiniodd ymgyrch lobïo effeithiol iawn yn San Steffan. Yn ogystal ag ymdrech gan dîm, yr oedd yn ymdrech gan Dîm Cymru, ac yn ymgais i newid y syniad am Gymru. Yr ydym wedi

However, we have to bear in mind that some parties would not even have been bidding for the defence training academy.

Plaid Cymru has made its position on this clear. Certainly, Elfyn Llwyd, one of its many leaders, signed a parliamentary motion in November 2006, opposing the entire defence training review programme. We would not even be in this position of celebrating success if we had followed Plaid Cymru. This matter has a long history in that party. Who will ever forget Saunders Lewis's infamous arson attack on the Pwllheli military training camp on the eve of the second world war? Yet another of Plaid Cymru's leaders, Dafydd Iwan, the president, has called for an end to all army activity, including training, in Wales. Who could forget the social justice spokeswoman, Leanne Wood—I am afraid that she is not here at the moment—demanding that representatives of the armed forces be banned from Welsh schools? If we had followed Plaid's policy, we would not have been standing up for Wales; we would be hauling up the white flag for Wales. Where would we be on the north-south air service from Cardiff to RAF Valley, which the Government is introducing? Presumably, Plaid should not really support that, because it is based on a defence site. Where is Elin Jones on the issue of unmanned aerial vehicles?

Elin Jones: I am here.

Andrew Davies: Where are you now on the unmanned aerial vehicle aerospace park at ParcAberporth? We have worked with the Ministry of Defence, as a Labour Government, to bring that to Wales. We could go on and on, about constituency after constituency, where Plaid Cymru would want to see the end of defence expenditure and an end to the creation of thousands of jobs in Wales.

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, y byddech yn cytuno, er bod cludiant yn bwysig—er nad yw storïau'r Blaid Lafur yr un mor bwysig—mai'r hyn sy'n graidd i'r mater yw bod angen i chi sicrhau bod y canran uchaf posibl o'r swyddi

llwyddo i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio na fyddai ambell blaid hyd yn oed wedi gwneud cais am yr academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn.

Mae Plaid Cymru wedi gwneud ei safbwynt ar hyn yn glir. Yn sicr, llofnododd Elfyn Llwyd, un o'i harweinwyr niferus, gynnig seneddol ym mis Tachwedd 2006 yn gwrthwynebu'r holl raglen adolygu hyfforddiant amddiffyn. Ni fyddem hyd yn oed yn y sefyllfa hon o ddathlu llwyddiant pe byddem wedi dilyn Plaid Cymru. Mae gan y mater hwn hanes hir yn y blaid honno. Pwy all fyth anghofio ymosodiad bwriadol enwog Saunders Lewis i losgi gwersyll hyfforddiant milwrol Pwllheli y noson cyn dechrau'r ail ryfel byd? Mae un arall o arweinwyr Plaid Cymru, Dafydd Iwan, y llywydd, wedi galw am ddiwedd i holl weithgarwch y fyddin, gan gynnwys hyfforddiant, yng Nghymru. Pwy all anghofio'r llefarwraig ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, Leanne Wood—yn anffodus nid yw'n bresennol ar hyn o bryd—yn galw am wahardd cynrychiolwyr y lluoedd arfog o ysgolion Cymru? Pe byddem wedi dilyn polisi Plaid, ni fyddem wedi bod yn sefyll dros Gymru; byddem wedi bod yn codi'r faner wen dros Gymru. Ble fyddem o ran y gwasanaeth awyr o'r gogledd i'r de o Gaerdydd i RAF y Fali y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gyflwyno? Mae'n debyg na ddylai Plaid Cymru, mewn gwirionedd, ei gefnogi gan ei fod wedi'i leoli ar safle amddiffyn. Ble mae Elin Jones o ran cerbydau awyr di-griw?

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yma.

Andrew Davies: Beth yw eich safiad ar y parc awyrofod i gerbydau awyr di-griw ym Mharc Aberporth? Yr ydym wedi gweithio gyda'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn, fel Llywodraeth Lafur, i ddod â'r parc hwnnw i Gymru. Gallem rygnu ymlaen, gan sôn am etholaeth ar ôl etholaeth, lle y byddai Plaid Cymru am weld diwedd ar wariant amddiffyn a diwedd ar greu miloedd o swyddi yng Nghymru.

Owen John Thomas: I am sure, Minister, that you would agree that, although transport is important—even though Labour Party stories are not so important—the heart of this matter is the need to ensure that the highest possible number of the new jobs to be created

newydd a fydd yn cael eu creu yn yr ardal honno yn cael eu llenwi gan bobl o'r Fro a'r ardaloedd cyfagos. Dyna sut y gall economi Cymru elwa fwyaf—sichrau bod y swyddi ar gael i bobl sydd eisoes yn byw yn yr ardal. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sichrau bod hynny'n digwydd?

Andrew Davies: I think that it is a bit rich of Owen John Thomas to ask about local jobs. We would not even be in this position, if we had followed the policy of Plaid Cymru's leader of opposing the defence training academy. One of our key strengths in bidding for the defence academy, with our parliamentary colleagues in London, was that we were able to address the Ministry of Defence's concerns about local skills and local sourcing. One of our major strengths was that we could demonstrate that we had the necessary skills in Wales and the capacity and expertise in our further and higher education institutions. We were standing up for Wales, creating wealth and jobs, unlike Plaid Cymru, the party that would put up barriers around Wales.

David Melding: Minister, I must congratulate you on your astonishing and utterly spontaneous replies; they put on record some hard political facts. [*Laughter.*]

I am sure that you will be gracious enough to acknowledge that you had the full support of the Conservative Party and the Liberal Democrats in the Assembly and in Westminster. It is appropriate, at this first opportunity, to congratulate you on the role that you played in this scheme. You have had to stand there and take bad news about the Defence Aviation Repair Agency and a few other things that have happened at St Athan, and it is fair that this massive investment should be acknowledged as such. It was led by your party here, and in London. It is absolutely appropriate that we acknowledge that; we are deeply grateful for it.

What is important now is that as many as possible of the highly skilled jobs involved with the military academy are filled locally. A lot of the jobs will transfer in, and that is appropriate because we are getting a bit of

in that area are filled by people from the Vale and neighbouring areas. That is what will most benefit the Welsh economy—ensuring that the jobs are available to people who already live in the area. What are you doing to ensure that that happens?

Andrew Davies: Credaf ei bod braidd yn hy i Owen John Thomas holi ynghylch swyddi lleol. Ni fyddem yn y sefyllfa hon hyd yn oed pe byddem wedi dilyn polisi arweinydd Plaid Cymru o wrthwynebu'r academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn. Un o'n cryfderau allweddol wrth wneud cais am yr academi amddiffyn, gyda'n cyd-Aelodau seneddol yn Llundain, oedd ein gallu i ddelio â phryderon y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn am sgiliau lleol a darpariaeth leol. Un o'n cryfderau allweddol oedd ein gallu i ddangos bod y sgiliau angenrheidiol i'w cael yng Nghymru, a'r adnoddau a'r arbenigedd yn ein sefydliadau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Yr oeddem yn cynrychioli Cymru, yn creu cyfoeth a swyddi, yn wahanol i Blaid Cymru, y blaid a fyddai'n codi rhwystrau o amgylch Cymru.

David Melding: Weinidog, rhaid imi eich llongyfarch ar eich ymatebion rhyfeddol a chwbl ddigymell; maent yn llwyddo i gofnodi rhai ffeithiau gwleidyddol cadarn. [*Chwerthin.*]

Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ddigon hynaws i gydnabod eich bod wedi cael cefnogaeth lawn y Blaid Geidwadol a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad ac yn San Steffan. Mae'n briodol, ar y cyfle cyntaf hwn, i'ch llongyfarch ar eich rhan yn y cynllun hwn. Bu'n rhaid ichi sefyll a derbyn newyddion drwg am yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn ac ambell beth arall sydd wedi digwydd yn Sain Tathan, ac mae'n deg y dylid cydnabod bod y buddsoddiad hwn yn fuddsoddiad aruthrol. Fe'i gwnaed o dan arweiniad eich plaid yma, ac yn Llundain. Mae'n gwbl briodol inni gydnabod hynny; yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iawn amdano.

Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yn awr yw i gynifer â phosibl o'r swyddi hyfedr sy'n gysylltiedig â'r academi filwrol gael eu llenwi'n lleol. Bydd nifer o'r swyddi'n cael eu trosglwyddo i mewn, ac mae hynny'n briodol gan ein bod

UK defence expenditure—some jobs will have to come in and be protected—but we really want as much of the higher-end stuff as possible. We need to get training in place to ensure that local people are well placed to apply for jobs.

Andrew Davies: Thank you, David, for your comments. It was a team effort. I have paid tribute previously to the Vale of Glamorgan Council for its work in supporting the Metrix consortium bid and helping to address some of the fundamental questions about the impact on the local economy and on local services—education, social services and housing. These were all issues that had to be addressed.

1.10 p.m.

I think that it is a tremendous achievement. When we launched the lobby campaign in the House of Commons many months ago, all three parties that supported the bid were there at parliamentary level, and we joined together for key parts of the argument—as I mentioned to Owen John Thomas—in terms of the ability of our local further education and higher education institutions to address some of the very specific and fundamental issues of skills availability. One of the strengths of our bid was our ability to address those concerns.

I do not think that we can underestimate the impact on the Welsh economy. It does not just affect south Wales; I know of companies in north Wales in the construction sector that will be bidding for construction contracts. Some £58 million a year will be going into the local economy. I know already of people who work at St Athan who travel there from right across south Wales. The impact of it will be felt for decades to come.

Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol Safe Routes to School

Q3 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on how he is ensuring safer routes to schools in Wales? OAQ1237(EIN)

Andrew Davies: I am committed to

yn cael ychydig o wariant amddiffyn y DU—bydd yn rhaid i rai swyddi ddod i mewn a chael eu diogelu—ond yr ydym yn awyddus iawn i sicrhau cynifer â phosibl o'r swyddi pen uchaf. Mae angen inni roi hyfforddiant ar waith i sicrhau bod pobl leol mewn sefyllfa dda i wneud cais am swyddi.

Andrew Davies: Diolch ichi, David, am eich sylwadau. Yr oedd yn ymdrech gan dîm. Yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi teyrnged i Gyngor Bro Morgannwg am ei waith yn cefnogi cais consortiwm Metrix ac yn helpu delio â rhai o'r cwestiynau sylfaenol am yr effaith ar yr economi leol ac ar wasanaethau lleol—addysg, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a thai. Yr oedd yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r holl faterion hyn.

Credaf ei fod yn llwyddiant aruthrol. Pan lanswyd yr ymgyrch lobïo gennym yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin fisoedd yn ôl, yr oedd y tair plaid a gefnogodd y cais yn bresennol ar lefel seneddol, a daethom at ein gilydd ar gyfer rhannau allweddol o'r ddatl—fel y dywedais wrth Owen John Thomas—o ran gallu ein sefydliadau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch lleol i ymdrin â rhai o'r materion penodol a sylfaenol iawn yn ymwneud â darpariaeth sgiliau. Un o gryfderau ein cais oedd ein gallu i ddelio â'r pryderon hynny.

Ni chredaf y gallwn fychanu'r effaith ar economi Cymru. Nid ar y de yn unig y bydd effaith; gwn am gwmnïau yn y gogledd yn y sector adeiladu a fydd yn gwneud cais am gontractau adeiladu. Bydd tua £58 miliwn y flwyddyn yn mynd i'r economi leol. Gwn eisoes am bobl sy'n gweithio yn Sain Tathan ac sy'n teithio yno o bob cwr o'r de. Bydd yr effaith i'w themlo am ddegawdau i ddod.

C3 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae'n sicrhau llwybrau mwy diogel i'r ysgol yng Nghymru? OAQ1237(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i

extending the number of Safe Routes to Schools schemes across Wales, and I will be making an announcement on the 2007-08 funding shortly. While we provide funding to local authorities, it is their responsibility to design, implement and monitor schemes within their area.

Laura Anne Jones: I simply cannot believe that, in this day and age, despite the fact that we all know the real dangers of not wearing a seat belt, particularly on school buses, still nothing has been done about it; I am thinking about buses to school and also buses for school trips. After May of this year, the Assembly will have the chance to use its powers to ensure that every child is able to wear a seat belt, and to ensure the installation of closed circuit television on school buses. It will also be able to carry out checks on drivers and ensure that school buses are recognised as such by all drivers. Research into the dangers of not wearing a seat belt on school buses was conducted while I was still in school, and the fact that this Labour Government has been in power for so long and yet has done nothing about it really lets down the people of Wales, and the children of Wales. What will you do about it, and what plans do you have in place to ensure that every child is able to wear a seat belt? It is very important that we tackle this matter now, or put plans in place for the next Government, whoever is elected in May.

Andrew Davies: We take this issue seriously as a Government. Technically, it is Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, who leads on school transport policy, but we have jointly addressed the issue of safer transport, through Safe Routes to Schools and other schemes that we have supported financially to improve transport in Wales. We have been considering the legislative framework and recommendations that have been made in reports following tragic incidents in Wales and elsewhere in the UK, and we will, obviously, come forward with proposals to address those concerns.

ehangu nifer y cynlluniau Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol ledled Cymru, a byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad am gyllid 2007-08 maes o law. Er ein bod yn rhoi cyllid i awdurdodau lleol, eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw dylunio, gweithredu a monitro cynlluniau yn eu hardal.

Laura Anne Jones: Ni allaf gredu, yn yr oes sydd ohoni, er ein bod yn gwybod bob un ohonom am y peryglon gwirioneddol sy'n gysylltiedig â pheidio â gwisgo gwregys diogelwch, yn arbennig ar fysiau ysgol, nad oes camau o gwbl wedi'u cymryd; yr wyf yn sôn am fysiau ysgol a bysiau a ddefnyddir ar gyfer teithiau ysgol hefyd. Ar ôl mis Mai eleni, caiff y Cynulliad y cyfle i ddefnyddio'i bwerau i sicrhau y gall pob plentyn wisgo gwregys diogelwch, ac i sicrhau y caiff cyfleusterau teledu cylch cyfyng eu gosod ar fysiau ysgol. Bydd hefyd yn gallu cynnal archwiliadau ar yrwyr a sicrhau bod bysiau ysgol yn amlwg i bob gyrrwr arall. Gwnaed gwaith ymchwil i beryglon peidio â gwisgo gwregys diogelwch ar fysiau ysgol tra oeddwn i'n dal yn yr ysgol, ac mae'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi bod mewn grym ers cyhyd ond eto heb wneud dim am y sefyllfa yn sarhad ar bobl Cymru, a phlant Cymru. Beth a wnewch yn ei gylich, a pha gynlluniau sydd gennych ar waith i sicrhau y gall pob plentyn wisgo gwregys diogelwch? Mae'n bwysig iawn inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn awr, neu roi cynlluniau ar waith ar gyfer y Llywodraeth nesaf, pwy bynnag a gaiff eu hethol ym mis Mai.

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif fel Llywodraeth. Yn dechnegol, Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, sy'n arwain ar y polisi cludiant ysgol, ond yr ydym wedi delio â'r mater cludiant mwy diogel ar y cyd, drwy'r cynllun Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol a chynlluniau eraill a gefnogwyd gennym yn ariannol i wella cludiant yng Nghymru. Buom yn ystyried y fframwaith deddfwriaethol a'r argymhellion a wnaed gan adroddiadau yn dilyn digwyddiadau trasig yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill yn y DU, a byddwn, yn amlwg, yn cyflwyno cynigion i ymdrin â'r pryderon hynny.

Janet Ryder: One thing that we can do to ensure a safer environment for children around schools is to attempt to regulate the speed at which traffic travels past schools. The introduction of 20 mph zones around schools can help, depending on the classification of the roads, as some of them fall under your control while others fall under local authorities' control. What are you actively doing to encourage the introduction of 20 mph zones around all schools?

Andrew Davies: A significant amount of action has been taken with local authorities to encourage them to install, with financial support from the Assembly Government, 20 mph limits around schools. The response of local authorities has been quite patchy. Some local authorities, such as Powys, have a good record, while there is at least one Welsh authority that does not have one 20 mph scheme in its area. The responsibility at a local level is with the local authority, but we are actively looking at proposals for ways by which we can improve road safety.

We have been successful in reducing the number of those killed or seriously injured on our roads, as well as reducing accidents involving young people. However, there is still a significant way to go, and, as I said in my response to Laura Anne Jones, we are actively looking at proposals to improve road safety, particularly for young people and in school areas. I will also make the information that I gave to the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee about the issues relating to road safety available all to Members.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4, OAQ1257(EIN), yn ôl.

Janet Ryder: Un peth y gallwn ei wneud i sicrhau amgylchedd mwy diogel i blant o amgylch ysgolion yw ceisio rheoleiddio cyflymder traffig wrth fynd heibio ysgolion. Gall cyflwyno parthau 20 mya o amgylch ysgolion helpu, gan ddibynnu ar ddsbarthiad y ffyrdd, gan fod rhai ohonynt o dan eich rheolaeth chi ac eraill o dan reolaeth awdurdodau lleol. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i annog y broses o gyflwyno parthau 20 mya o gwmpas pob ysgol?

Andrew Davies: Gwnaed cryn dipyn o waith gydag awdurdodau lleol i'w hannog i osod terfynau 20 mya o gwmpas ysgolion, gyda chymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae ymateb awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn ddigon darniog. Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol, megis Powys, record dda, ond mae o leiaf un awdurdod yng Nghymru nad oes ganddo ddim cynlluniau 20 mya yn ei ardal. Yr awdurdod lleol sy'n gyfrifol am y mater ar lefel leol, ond yr ydym yn edrych ar gynigion ar gyfer gwella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd.

Buom yn llwyddiannus yn lleihau nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu lladd neu eu hanafu'n ddifrifol ar ein ffyrdd, yn ogystal â lleihau nifer y damweiniau i bobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud eto, ac, fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i Laura Anne Jones, yr ydym wrthi'n ystyried cynigion i wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, yn enwedig i bobl ifanc ac mewn ardaloedd ysgol. Byddaf hefyd yn darparu i'r holl Adelodau y wybodaeth a roddais i'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau am y materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch ar y ffyrdd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4, OAQ1257(EIN), has been withdrawn.

Gwella Cysylltiadau Ffyrdd Improving Road Links

Q5 Glyn Davies: What assessment has the Minister made of the economic benefits of increasing investment for improvements to north-south road links? OAQ1254(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Economic factors, together with other criteria, were taken into account on all schemes, including those on the north-

C5 Glyn Davies: Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o fanteision economaidd cynyddu'r buddsoddiad ar gyfer gwella cysylltiadau ffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de? OAQ1254(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Ystyriwyd ffactorau economaidd, ynghyd â meini prawf eraill. ar gyfer pob cynllun, gan gynnwys y rheini ar y

south routes, in the prioritisation of the trunk road forward programme, which was published in 2002.

Glyn Davies: One of the strongest reasons for investing in the north-south road links is to develop a Welsh sense of nationhood and to bring north and south Wales together, which is an important objective. However, we will not be successful in achieving that unless there is an up-to-date assessment of the economic benefit flowing from those investments. Will you commission an assessment—separate from one for the whole of Wales, because we also have to factor-in the nationhood benefit—that might lead us to a programme of investment over a period of five years to develop a much better road link between north and south Wales, which would achieve one of the major objectives of establishing devolution in the first place.

Andrew Davies: As a Minister, I have always seen the process of bridging that gap to bring all parts of Wales together as a major priority. In terms of transport, funding is already improving north-south road and rail links, and a north-south air service will start later this year between Cardiff and RAF Valley. The economic benefits of roads are by no means straightforward; this is quite a complex issue. In many parts of Wales, improving road transport, for example by dualling the A55, has not always been entirely economically beneficial for communities in north-west Wales, because what can go in can go out just as quickly. When we invest in road schemes, we want to ensure that there is a clear economic benefit to the local community. We also have to balance the other criteria, such as the environmental, social and community aspects.

In terms of the north-south road links, we recently announced the start of the Cancoed to Blaenau Ffestiniog stretch of the A470 and, a few months ago, we announced the preferred route for the Newbridge bypass. So, we are investing a significant amount of money in improving road links, but in making those decisions, I have to balance a whole range of criteria and consider where to

llwybrau rhwng y gogledd a'r de, wrth flaenoriaethu'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2002.

Glyn Davies: Un o'r rhesymau pennaf dros fuddsoddi yn y cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de yw meithrin ymdeimlad o genedligrwydd ac uno'r gogledd a'r de, sy'n amcan pwysig. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn llwyddo i wneud hynny oni wneir asesiad diweddar o'r gwerth economaidd a ddaw o'r buddsoddiadau hyn. A wnewch chi gomisiynu asesiad—ar wahân i'r un i Gymru gyfan, gan fod yn rhaid inni gynnwys y gwerth o ran cenedligrwydd hefyd—a allai arwain at raglen o fuddsoddi yn ystod cyfnod o bum mlynedd, er mwyn datblygu cyswllt ffordd llawer gwell rhwng y gogledd a'r de, a fyddai'n cyflawni un o brif amcanion sicrhau datganoli yn y lle cyntaf.

Andrew Davies: Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf wedi ystyried y broses o bontio'r bwlch hwnnw i uno pob rhan o Gymru yn brif flaenoriaeth erioed. O ran cludiant, mae ariannu eisoes yn gwella cysylltiadau ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, a bydd gwasanaeth awyr rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn dechrau'n ddiweddarach eleni rhwng Caerdydd ac RAF Y Fali. Nid yw gwerth economaidd ffyrdd yn syml o bell ffordd; mae'r mater hwn yn un eithaf cymhleth. Mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, nid yw'r gwaith o wella cludiant ffyrdd, er enghraifft, drwy ddeuoli'r A55, bob amser wedi bod yn fuddiol yn economaidd i gymunedau'r gogledd-orllewin, oherwydd gall yr hyn sy'n cyrraedd adael yr un mor gyflym. Pan fyddwn yn buddsoddi mewn cynlluniau ffyrdd, yr ydym am sicrhau bod budd economaidd amlwg i'r gymuned leol. Rhaid inni gydbwyso'r meini prawf eraill hefyd, fel yr agweddau amgylcheddol, cymdeithasol a chymunedol.

O ran y cysylltiadau ffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, cyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar y byddem yn dechrau gwaith ar ffordd yr A470 o Gancoed i Flaenau Ffestiniog, a chyhoeddwyd rai misoedd yn ôl y llwybr a ffefrir ar gyfer ffordd osgoi'r Bontnewydd ar Wy. Felly, yr ydym yn buddsoddi swm sylweddol o arian i wella cysylltiadau ffyrdd. Ond wrth wneud y penderfyniadau hynny,

put the balance of investment in terms of north-south links and east-west links.

Elin Jones: Diolch am roi gwybod am eich barn am Saunders Lewis inni, ond byddai gennyf i a'm hetholwyr yng Ngheredigion fwy o ddiddordeb gwybod eich barn am gyffordd Tesco yn Aberteifi, sydd ar yr A487, sef y brif ffordd sy'n cysylltu'r de a'r gogledd yn y gorllewin. Mae'r gyffordd honno yn Aberteifi ar gau ers dros bum mlynedd, ac nid oes dim yn eich rhwystro yn awr rhag gwneud penderfyniad ar sut mae ei hail agor. Pa bryd yr ydych yn bwriadu gwneud hynny?

Andrew Davies: I am aware that you have been a regular correspondent with me on this matter, and there are concerns about the retail development in Cardigan. My officials and those of the Mid Wales Trunk Road Agency have been in discussion with the developers, including Tesco, about the best solution for dealing with that local issue. I will write to give you the latest position on that issue.

Kirsty Williams: In addition to economic interests, the other criterion that you have to take into account when planning your forward work programme and expenditure is road safety issues. Last night, I was in Llanbadarn Fynydd, at a meeting with members of the public and community councils, on that stretch of road between Newtown and Crossgates that has seen three fatalities since last summer, including that of an 18-year-old medical student travelling back from university to Builth Wells; her parents were at that meeting last night. What that community wants to know is: do you know where Llanbadarn Fynydd is, and, if so, will you look at what can be done to improve the road in that area?

1.20 p.m.

Andrew Davies: If it is okay with you, Kirsty, I will write to you on that matter. I will get advice from my officials, and yes, I have actually been to Llanbadarn Fynydd.

rhaid imi gydbwysu amryw o feini prawf ac ystyried sut y gallwn fuddsoddi'n gytbwys o ran cysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de a rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin.

Elin Jones: Thank you for giving us your opinion on Saunders Lewis, but I and my constituents in Ceredigion have more of an interest in knowing your opinion on the Tesco junction in Cardigan on the A487, namely the main road connecting the south and the north in the west. That junction in Cardigan has been closed for over five years, and there is nothing to prevent you now from making a decision how to re-open it. When do you intend to do that?

Andrew Davies: Gwn eich bod wedi gohebu â mi'n rheolaidd am y mater hwn, ac mae pryderon am y datblygiad manwerthu yn Aberteifi. Mae fy swyddogion i a swyddogion Asiantaeth Cefnffyrdd y Canolbarth wedi bod yn trafod gyda'r datblygwyr, gan gynnwys Tesco, ynghlŷn â'r ateb gorau i ddelio â'r mater lleol hwnnw. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf am y mater hwnnw.

Kirsty Williams: Yn ogystal â'r buddiannau economaidd, y meini prawf eraill y mae'n rhaid ichi eu hystyried wrth gynllunio eich blaenraglen a'i gwariant yw materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch ar y ffordd. Neithiwr, yr oeddwn yn Llanbadarn Fynydd, mewn cyfarfod gyda'r cyhoedd a chynghorwyr cymunedol, ynghlŷn â'r darn hwnnw o ffordd rhwng y Drenewydd a Crossgates lle digwyddodd tair damwain ers yr haf diwethaf, gan gynnwys myfyrwraig feddygol 18 oed a oedd yn teithio'n ôl o'r brifysgol i Lanfair-ym-Muallt; yr oedd ei rhieni yn y cyfarfod neithiwr. Dyma y mae'r gymuned honno am ei wybod: a ydych yn gwybod ble mae Llanbadarn Fynydd, ac os ydych, a wnewch chi edrych ar yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i wella'r ffordd yn yr ardal honno?

Andrew Davies: Os yw hynny'n iawn gennych chi, Kirsty, ysgrifennaf atoch ar y mater hwnnw. Byddaf yn gofyn am gyngor gan fy swyddogion, ac ydwyf, yr wyf wedi bod i Lanbadarn Fynydd.

Kirsty Williams: One issue that we have spent a great deal of time corresponding about is the trunk road that goes through Nantddu in the south of my constituency. You have consistently refused to look at lowering the speed limit to 50 mph through that small village. In the last two weeks we have had two more accidents in the village and local residents are extremely concerned that there should be a 50 mph zone and appropriate signing. Such a zone is in place just a few miles down the road in Llwyn Onn, in Huw Lewis's constituency, yet there are more houses directly fronting the road in Nantddu than in Llwyn Onn—I counted them as I drove through this morning. If Llwyn Onn has a 50 mph zone, why does not Nantddu?

Andrew Davies: I have asked officials to look at this matter because it strikes me as problematic that we always have to wait for accidents to occur before we are able to introduce, for example, safety cameras. I will write to you about this.

Kirsty Williams: Un mater yr ydym wedi treulio llawer o amser yn gohebu yn ei gylch yw'r gefnffordd drwy Nant-ddu yn ne fy etholaeth. Yr ydych bob amser wedi gwrthod ystyried gostwng y terfyn cyflymder i 50 mya drwy'r pentref bach hwnnw. Yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf, bu dwy ddamwain arall yn y pentref ac mae trigolion lleol yn pryderu'n fawr y dylid cael parth 50 mya ac arwyddion priodol. Mae yna barth o'r fath rai milltiroedd i lawr y ffordd yn Llwyn Onn, yn etholaeth Huw Lewis, ond eto mae mwy o dai ar ymyl y ffordd yn Nant-ddu nag yn Llwyn Onn—fe'u cyfrifais wrth yrru heibio y bore yma. Os oes parth 50 mya yn Llwyn Onn, pam nad yn Nant-ddu?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ystyried y mater hwn, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos yn broblem imi ei bod yn rhaid aros i ddamweiniau ddigwydd cyn y gallwn osod camerâu diogelwch, er enghraifft. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â hyn.

Datblygu Economaidd Economic Development

Q6 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on progress with Welsh Assembly Government policies for economic development in Wales? OAQ1246(EIN)

Andrew Davies: We continue to consolidate and build on the historic growth in employment over recent years. Employment in Wales was up 12,000 over the last year, and up 4,000 over the last quarter, which is evidence of the clear transformation taking place in the Welsh economy.

John Griffiths: Now that we know that Tata will be taking over Corus, and given the importance of the steel industry to Wales, not least in my constituency of Newport East, can you assure me that you and the First Minister will seek urgent meetings with the Tata management? At those meetings, will you first emphasise the importance of the steel industry in Wales; secondly, explore how the

C6 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd gyda pholisïau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru? OAQ1246(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn parhau i atgyfnerthu'r twf hanesyddol mewn cyflogaeth yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf ac yn adeiladu arno. Yr oedd 12,000 o bobl yn ychwanegol mewn gwaith yng Nghymru yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a 4,000 yn ychwanegol yn ystod y chwarter diwethaf, sy'n dystiolaeth o'r trawsnewid sy'n digwydd yn economi Cymru.

John Griffiths: A ninnau'n gwybod bellach y bydd Tata yn meddiannu Corus, ac o gofio pwysigrwydd y diwydiant dur i Gymru, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, a allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch chi a'r Prif Weinidog yn gofyn am gyfarfod gyda thîm rheoli Tata ar fyrder? Yn y cyfarfodydd hynny, a wnewch bwysleisio pwysigrwydd y diwydiant dur yng Nghymru

Welsh Assembly Government can work with the new firm; and thirdly, discuss its investment strategy, and how it intends to build on the highly skilled workforce and the efficient and effective operation that we have here in Wales? Will you include Community and other trade unions in those talks?

Andrew Davies: The First Minister spoke to Philippe Varin, the chief executive of Corus, only yesterday, and we have been in regular contact over many months with the local Corus management, and with Community, the steelworkers' union. There has been a great deal of uncertainty for those working in Corus, and we expect and hope that the announcement that the board is recommending the acceptance of the Tata offer will help to draw a line under that uncertainty and allow its operations in Wales to continue.

It is difficult, at this stage, to understand the full implications of the takeover, if the shareholders accept the offer, but nevertheless we continue to make the case for Wales. The First Minister stressed to Philippe Varin the importance of retaining integrated steel production in Wales and, if the shareholders of Corus accept the offer from Tata, then the First Minister and I will seek early meetings with Tata's senior team to discuss the implications for Welsh operations. We will continue to have close discussions with the steel unions, particularly Community, and I note that, yesterday, Community announced its willingness work in partnership to drive forward an investment strategy that would allow UK operations to contribute further to the profitability of Tata. I am reassured that the Corus management team will remain in place, offering Corus stability in the transition period.

I will make a full oral or written statement to Members when we have a clear understanding of the situation—if the shareholders accept the Tata offer.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n siŵr gennyf y byddech yn cytuno bod gan fusnesau bach gyfraniad mawr i'w wneud i'r economi yng

yn gyntaf; yn ail, archwilio sut y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio gyda'r cwmni newydd; ac yn drydydd, trafod ei strategaeth fuddsoddi, a sut y mae'n bwriadu adeiladu ar y gweithlu medrus iawn a'r dull gweithredu effeithlon ac effeithiol sydd gennym yng Nghymru? A fyddwch yn cynnwys Community ac undebau llafur eraill yn y trafodaethau hynny?

Andrew Davies: Siaradodd y Prif Weinidog â Philippe Varin, prif weithredwr Corus, ddoe ddiwethaf, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â thîm rheoli lleol Corus a Community, sef undeb y gweithwyr dur, ers rhai misoedd. Bu llawer o ansicrwydd i'r rheini sy'n gweithio yn Corus, ac yr ydym yn disgwyl ac yn gobeithio y bydd y cyhoeddiad bod y bwrdd yn argymhell derbyn cynnig Tata yn helpu lleddfu'r ansicrwydd hwnnw ac yn galluogi ei weithrediadau yng Nghymru i barhau.

Ar hyn o bryd mae'n anodd deall goblygiadau llawn y feddiannaeth, os bydd y cyfranddalwyr yn derbyn y cynnig, ond er hynny, yr ydym yn dal i bledio achos Cymru. Pwysleisiodd y Prif Weinidog bwysigrwydd cadw gwaith cynhyrchu dur integredig yng Nghymru wrth siarad â Philippe Varin, ac os bydd cyfranddalwyr Corus yn derbyn cynnig Tata, bydd y Prif Weinidog a minnau'n trefnu cyfarfodydd cynnar gydag uwch dîm Tata i drafod y goblygiadau i weithrediadau Cymru. Byddwn yn parhau i gael trafodaethau agos gyda'r undebau dur, yn enwedig Community, a sylwaf fod Community ddoe wedi cyhoeddi ei barodrwydd i weithio mewn partneriaeth i hyrwyddo strategaeth fuddsoddi a fyddai'n caniatáu i weithrediadau'r DU gyfrannu at gynyddu proffidoldeb Tata ymhellach. Yr wyf wedi fy sicrhau y bydd tîm rheoli Corus yn parhau fel y mae, gan gynnig sefydlogrwydd i Corus yn ystod y cyfnod pontio.

Byddaf yn gwneud ddatganiad llafar neu ysgrifenedig llawn i'r Aelodau pan fydd gennym ddealltwriaeth well o'r sefyllfa—os bydd y cyfranddalwyr yn derbyn cynnig Tata.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am sure you would agree that small businesses have a large contribution to make to the economy in

Nghymru, a bod hynny'n arbennig o wir yn ein hardaloedd gwledig. A ydyw'n peri pryder i chi fod busnesau a oedd arfer cael tipyn o waith gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, bellach yn canfod nad ydynt mewn sefyllfa i geisio am y gwaith hwnnw—heb sôn am gael y gwaith hwnnw sydd, wrth reswm, yn hanfodol ar gyfer eu trosiant—oherwydd y newidiadau yn y rheolau?

Andrew Davies: I am not aware that that is the case. If you can give me examples of it I will follow that up. We have been concerned to maximise the £4 billion that is spent annually by the Welsh public sector on goods and services in Wales for the benefit of the Welsh economy and small companies. Working with my colleague, Sue Essex, the Finance Minister, we set up the business procurement taskforce, which I chair. According to the statistics that we now have, when the taskforce was set up a few years ago, about one third of that £4 billion expenditure went to Welsh-based companies. The latest evidence and statistics that we have show that that is now nearly 50 per cent. Therefore, we have been remarkably successful in bringing the public sector together with local suppliers, through sell2wales and Buy4Wales, and we continue to develop that. As I said, if you have evidence that there are particular companies that have been disadvantaged and can make that available to me, I will follow it up.

Wales and that that is especially true in our rural areas. Are you concerned that businesses which used to get quite a lot of work from the Wales Tourist Board, the Welsh Development Agency and the Welsh Language Board are now finding that they are not in a position to tender for that work—not to mention getting that work, which is essential for their turnover—because of the changes in the rules?

Andrew Davies: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol fod hynny'n digwydd. Os gallwch roi enghreifftiau o hynny imi, byddaf yn ymchwilio i hynny. Yr ydym wedi bod yn awyddus i wneud y gorau o'r £4 biliwn a gaiff ei wario bob blwyddyn gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar nwyddau a gwasanaethau yng Nghymru er lles economi a busnesau bach Cymru. Drwy weithio gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, y Gweinidog Cyllid, crëwyd y tasglu caffael busnes yr wyf yn ei gadeirio. Yn ôl yr ystadegau sydd gennym bellach, pan sefydlwyd y tasglu rai blynyddoedd yn ôl yr oedd tua thraean o'r £4 biliwn hwnnw o wariant yn cael ei roi i gwmnïau yng Nghymru. Dengys y dystiolaeth a'r ystadegau diweddaraf sydd gennym fod y ffigur hwnnw tua 50 y cant erbyn hyn. Felly, yr ydym wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn o ran tynnu'r sector cyhoeddus a chyflenwyr lleol ynghyd, drwy sell2Wales a Buy4Wales, ac yr ydym yn parhau i ddatblygu hynny. Fel y dywedais, os oes gennych dystiolaeth bod cwmnïau penodol o dan anfantais, ac os gallwch roi'r dystiolaeth honno imi, ymchwiliat i'r mater.

Denu Swyddi Attracting Jobs

Q7 Irene James: Will the Minister make a statement on attracting jobs to Wales? OAQ1250(EIN)

Andrew Davies: We have a range of support measures to attract jobs to Wales and to support indigenous companies, including financial and other measures. The most significant incentive is a robust, dynamic and stable economy. These are the factors that bring sustainable success to the people of Wales.

Irene James: As you have already alluded to

C7 Irene James: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddenu swyddi i Gymru? OAQ1250(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Mae gennym amrywiaeth o fesurau cymorth i ddenu swyddi i Gymru ac i gefnogi cwmnïau brodorol, gan gynnwys mesurau ariannol a mesurau eraill. Y cymhelliant mwyaf sylweddol yw economi gadarn, ddeinamig a sefydlog. Dyna'r ffactorau sy'n dod â llwyddiant i bobl Cymru.

Irene James: Fel yr ydych eisoes wedi

in your answer, inward investment is a key part of the economy of industrialised south Wales. Will you give an assurance that, as part of a Labour Welsh Assembly Government, you will not turn your back on the opportunities of inward investment, as advocated by nationalists fighting a nationalist agenda, whatever the cost to economic health and opportunities? Do you agree that indigenous business growth, inward investment, and economic diversity are all essential to a successful, thriving and prosperous Welsh economy?

Andrew Davies: I agree. You need a balanced approach in a modern economy. You need the public sector and Government leading and developing policies that encourage business, entrepreneurial activity and innovation, whether it is Welsh-based companies or inward investors.

I was somewhat taken aback when someone brought to my attention a letter that was sent out by two parliamentary candidates from Plaid Cymru—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]—one of whom was a former leader. The trouble is that there have been so many leaders, it is always difficult to remember their roles. However, the other candidate was a present Assembly Member, who wrote to local businesses in the Arfon constituency stating that, over the past 30 successive years, Governments, Conservative and Labour alike, have placed far too much emphasis on paying grants to bribe—a word that I would like Members to note—large companies into Wales rather than nurturing our own business sector. I am sure that companies such as Inspired Broadcast Networks, at Technium CAST in Parc Menai, Bangor, and Brandsauce, which has created 30 jobs, and The Book People, both of which are also at Parc Menai, would be interested to hear that a Government is offering bribes and that such companies are willing to accept them. Plaid Cymru needs to consider whether it is in favour of developing a sustainable economy or whether, just as in its attitude to the defence industry and the Ministry of Defence, it wants to put up barriers around Wales.

Nick Bourne: I want to put on record that we

cyfeirio yn eich ateb, mae mewnfuddsoddiad yn rhan allweddol o economi de Cymru ddiwydiannol. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd, fel rhan o Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru, na fyddwch yn troi eich cefn ar y cyfleoedd i sicrhau mewnfuddsoddiad, fel sy'n cael ei hyrwyddo gan genedlaetholwyr sy'n ymladd ag agenda genedlaetholgar, beth bynnag fo'r gost i iechyd a chyfleoedd economaidd? A gytunwch fod twf busnesau brodorol, mewnfuddsoddi ac amrywiaeth economaidd i gyd yn hanfodol i economi lwyddiannus, ffyniannus Cymru?

Andrew Davies: Cytunaf. Mae angen ymagwedd gytbwys mewn economi fodern. Mae angen i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r Llywodraeth arwain a datblygu polisiau sy'n annog busnesau, gweithgarwch entrepreneuriaidd ac arloesi, boed yn gwmnïau yng Nghymru ynteu'n fewnfuddsoddwyr.

Yr oeddwn yn synnu braidd pan ddangosodd rhywun lythyr imi a anfonwyd gan ddau ymgeisydd seneddol o Blaid Cymru—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O']—yr oedd un ohonynt gan gyn-arweinydd. Y broblem yw bod Plaid Cymru wedi cael cynifer o arweinwyr nes ei bod bob amser yn anodd cofio'u rolau. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr ymgeisydd arall yn Aelod Cynulliad presennol, ac ysgrifennodd at fusnesau lleol yn etholaeth Arfon yn dweud, yn ystod y 30 mlynedd diwethaf, bod Llywodraeth Geidwadol a Llywodraeth Lafur fel ei gilydd wedi rhoi llawer gormod o bwys ar roi grantiau i lwgrwobrwyo—sy'n air yr hoffwn i'r aelodau ei nodi—cwmnïau mawr i ddod i Gymru, yn hytrach na meithrin ein sector busnesau ein hunain. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gan gwmnïau fel Inspired Broadcast Networks, yn Technium CAST ym Mharc Menai, Bangor, a Brandsauce, sydd wedi creu 30 o swyddi, a The Book People, sydd hefyd ym Mharc Menai, ddiddordeb clywed bod Llywodraeth yn cynnig llwgrwobrwyon a bod cwmnïau o'r fath yn fodlon eu derbyn. Mae angen i Blaid Cymru ystyried a yw o blaid datblygu economi gynaliadwy ynteu a yw am godi muriau o amgylch Cymru, yn union fel ei hagwedd at y diwydiant amddiffyn a'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn.

Nick Bourne: Hoffwn nodi ein bod ni o blaid

are in favour of doing anything within the law to attract inward investment to the United Kingdom and particularly to Wales. We need the jobs. I want to ask the Minister, not about large inward investment projects, some of which are tapering off because of the great growth in the economies in India and China, but about smaller manufacturing job losses in Wales recently, particularly in rural areas, such as in Llandrindod Wells where 37 jobs were lost. That is not a massive amount in terms of the Welsh economy, but it is for that town, which is not in an Objective 1 or a cohesion area. What are you doing to try to ensure that we can protect those jobs and attract other manufacturing jobs of high quality into the rural communities of Wales?

1.30 p.m.

Andrew Davies: I have regular meetings with manufacturers, individually and collectively. In fact, I met the Mid-Wales Manufacturing Group on several occasions most recently at its conference at the Royal Welsh Show ground in Builth Wells last autumn. I addressed their concerns and helped them to identify opportunities and win those opportunities whether through developing their skills base or providing other logistical support. For example, helping small companies to break into overseas markets through International Business Wales. When I visited companies such as Control Techniques in Newtown, it is clear that they appreciate the support that the Government has provided them. For example, the enhancement of Welshpool airport and the extension of the runway have certainly helped companies like Control Techniques to access European and other markets. So, while we are not able to offer direct financial assistance in many cases, because they are not in assisted areas, we will do everything that we can to help individual companies and manufacturing in that part of Wales, because it is a major part of the economy there.

The Presiding Officer: Question 8, OAQ1233(EIN), is withdrawn.

gwneud unrhyw beth a ganiateir yn y gyfraith i ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad i'r Deyrnas Unedig ac yn enwedig i Gymru. Mae arnom angen y swyddi. Hoffwn holi'r Gweinidog, nid am brosiectau mewnfuddsoddi mawr, y mae rhai ohonynt yn diflannu oherwydd y twf yn yr economïau yn India a Tsieina, ond am golli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu ar raddfa lai yng Nghymru yn ddiweddar, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, megis ger Llandrindod, lle collwyd 37 o swyddi. Nid yw hwnnw'n nifer enfawr o ran economi Cymru, ond mae'n nifer enfawr i'r dref honno nad yw'n ardal Amcan 1 nac yn ardal gydlyniant. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i geisio sicrhau y gallwn ddiogelu'r swyddi hynny a denu swyddi gweithgynhyrchu eraill o safon uchel i gymunedau gwledig Cymru?

Andrew Davies: Byddaf yn cael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda gweithgynhyrchwyr, yn unigol a chyda'i gilydd. Yn wir, yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â Grŵp Gweithgynhyrchu Canolbarth Cymru droeon, yn fwyaf diweddar yn ei gynhadledd ar faes Sioe Frenhinol Cymru yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt yn yr hydref diwethaf. Euthum i'r afael â'u pryderon, a'u helpu i nodi cyfleoedd ac ennill y cyfleoedd hynny, boed drwy ddatblygu eu sylfaen sgiliau neu ddarparu cymorth logistaidd arall. Er enghraifft, helpu cwmnïau bach i ddechrau ymsefydlu mewn marchnadoedd tramor drwy Fusnes Rhyngwladol Cymru. Pan ymwelais â chwmnïau megis Control Techniques yn y Drenewydd, mae'n amlwg eu bod yn gwerthfawrogi'r cymorth a roddwyd iddynt gan y Llywodraeth. Er enghraifft, mae ehangu maes awyr y Trallwng ac ymestyn y llain glanio yn sicr wedi helpu cwmnïau megis Control Techniques i fynd i mewn i farchnadoedd Ewrop a marchnadoedd eraill. Felly, er na allwn gynnig cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol mewn llawer achos, gan nad ydynt mewn ardaloedd a gynorthwyr, gwnawn bopeth a allwn i helpu cwmnïau unigol a gweithgynhyrchwyr yn y rhan honno o Gymru, oherwydd mae'n rhan bwysig o'r economi yno.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ1233(EIN), yn ôl.

Hyrwyddo Entrepreneuriaeth Promoting Entrepreneurship

Q9 Michael German: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to promote entrepreneurship in Wales? OAQ1244(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Business Eye is a one-stop shop for individuals starting up or growing their business. Advice and support is available through our General Support for Business programme, and sources of financial assistance include Finance Wales, the Assembly investment grant and regional selective assistance. Young entrepreneurs are also supported through the knowledge exploitation fund.

Michael German: Thank you for that list. Precisely what do you have in place now to supporting those people who have ideas and those who have the funding to make those ideas work? A big problem with interfaces occurs between people who have great ideas for development in products and services but not the necessary entrepreneurial skills, and the people who have the necessary entrepreneurial skills do not have the ideas. What is the marketplace for that, and where is it in Wales?

Andrew Davies: If a person or a company has a good idea, we have an extensive network of support, such as the Wales Innovators Network. There is also a network of technology counsellors, who can help lone inventors or companies to identify those products and help to take them to market.

We are also able to support research and development, for example, through further and higher education institutions when companies may not have the capacity to do it. Financially, we can help through the Assembly investment grant, regional selective assistance, through Finance Wales or by helping companies to access venture capital funds. There is therefore an extensive network of business support programmes that can help companies to innovate and to take those products to market.

C9 Michael German: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo entrepreneuriaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1244(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Mae Llygad Busnes yn siop-un-stop i unigolion sy'n dechrau eu busnes neu'n tyfu eu busnes. Mae cyngor a chymorth ar gael drwy ein rhaglen Cymorth Cyffredinol i Fusnesau, ac ymhlith y ffynonellau cymorth ariannol mae Cyllid Cymru, grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yn ogystal, cynorthwyir entrepreneuriaid ifanc drwy'r gronfa datblygu gwybodaeth.

Michael German: Diolch am y rhestr honno. Beth yn union sydd gennych ar waith yn awr i gefnogi'r bobl hynny sydd â syniadau a'r rheini sydd â'r arian i roi'r syniadau hynny ar waith? Mae yna broblem fawr o ryngwynebu pobl sydd â syniadau gwych ar gyfer eu datblygu mewn cynhyrchion a gwasanaethau ond nad oes ganddynt y sgiliau entrepreneuriaidd angenrheidiol, a'r bobl sydd â'r sgiliau entrepreneuriaidd angenrheidiol ond nad oes ganddynt y syniadau. Beth yw'r farchnad ar gyfer hynny, a ble mae yng Nghymru?

Andrew Davies: Os bydd gan unigolyn neu gwmni syniad da, mae gennym rwydwaith helaeth o gymorth, megis Rhwydwaith Arloeswyr Cymru. Mae yna hefyd rwydwaith o gynghorwyr technoleg, a all helpu dyfeiswyr neu gwmnïau unigol i nodi'r cynhyrchion hynny a'u helpu i'w cyflwyno i'r farchnad.

Yr ydym hefyd yn gallu cynorthwyo ymchwil a datblygu, er enghraifft, drwy sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch pan na fydd gan gwmnïau'r gallu i wneud hynny efallai. Yn ariannol, gallwn helpu drwy grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol, Cyllid Cymru neu drwy helpu cwmnïau i fanteisio ar gronfeydd cyfalaf menter. Felly, mae yna rwydwaith helaeth o raglenni cymorth i fusnesau a all helpu cwmnïau i arloesi ac i fynd â'r cynhyrchion hynny i'r farchnad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Although you are not responsible for the education brief, do you agree that the requirement in the Welsh baccalaureate for learners to study an entrepreneurship project and work-related education is a good example of joined-up thinking by the Welsh Assembly Government, to help to create the next generation of entrepreneurs?

Andrew Davies: That is vital, and encouraging young people to be aware of their potential in business, perhaps even to start their own companies, is important. We have been successful in encouraging young people to do that. For example, the Dynamo programme encourages young people to be aware of business and entrepreneurial activity, and it is now being held up as a model of its kind across the UK. I have worked closely with Jane Davidson, Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, on how we can improve that. The development of the Welsh baccalaureate gives us yet another opportunity to mainstream that into the curriculum for young people.

Jeff Cuthbert: Er nad ydych yn gyfrifol am y brîff addysg, a gytunwch fod y gofyniad ym magloriaeth Cymru i ddysgwyr astudio prosiect entrepreneuriaeth ac addysg yn gysylltiedig â gwaith yn enghraifft dda o feddylfryd 'cydgysylltiedig' gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i helpu creu'r genhedlaeth nesaf o entrepreneuriaid?

Andrew Davies: Mae hynny'n hanfodol, ac mae annog pobl ifanc i fod yn ymwybodol o'u potensial ym maes busnes, hyd yn oed i ddechrau eu cwmnïau eu hunain efallai, yn bwysig. Yr ydym wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn annog pobl ifanc i wneud hynny. Er enghraifft, mae rhaglen Dynamo yn annog pobl ifanc i fod yn ymwybodol o weithgarwch busnes ac entrepreneuriaid, ac mae bellach yn esiampl i weddill y DU. Yr wyf wedi gweithio'n agos gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ar y ffordd inni wella hynny. Mae datblygiad Bagloriaeth Cymru yn gyfle arall inni brif-frydio hynny yn y cwricwlwm i bobl ifanc.

Lefelau Cyflogaeth Employment Levels

Q10 Christine Chapman: Will the Minister make a statement on employment levels in the Cynon valley? OAQ1247(EIN)

Andrew Davies: The annual population survey shows that 27,000 residents of Cynon valley were in employment over the year to June 2006. That is an increase of 4,000, or 15 per cent, since 2001, and compares with a 5 per cent increase across Wales as a whole over the same period.

Christine Chapman: Those are welcome statistics. However, you will be aware of the recent difficulties experienced at Ferrari's bakery, and of the ongoing work to secure a buyer for the company and to secure the jobs there. What assurances can you give that the Welsh Assembly Government will continue to actively support and give practical help to companies that encounter difficulties, so that constituencies such as mine minimise the threat of large-scale job losses?

C10 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefelau cyflogaeth yng nghwm Cynon? OAQ1247(EIN)

Andrew Davies: Dengys yr arolwg blynyddol o'r boblogaeth fod 27,000 o drigolion cwm Cynon mewn gwaith yn ystod y flwyddyn hyd at fis Mehefin 2006. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 4,000, neu 15 y cant, er 2001, ac yn cymharu â chynnydd o 5 y cant ledled Cymru gyfan dros yr un cyfnod.

Christine Chapman: Croesawn yr ystadegau hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn glywbod am yr anawsterau a fu'n ddiweddar ym mhopty Ferrari a'r gwaith parhaus i sicrhau prynwr i'r cwmni ac i ddiogelu'r swyddi yno. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i gefnogi cwmnïau sy'n cael anawsterau ac yn rhoi cymorth ymarferol iddynt, er mwyn i etholaethau fel fy etholaeth i leihau'r bygythiad o gollu swyddi ar raddfa fawr?

Andrew Davies: The difficulties that Ferrari experienced recently are disappointing. My colleague, Carwyn Jones, leads on this, as support for the food industry is part of his portfolio. However, we are acting as a team in supporting companies. I know that significant interest has been expressed to the administrators and receivers, and only recently the administrators extended the deadline for considering bids for the business. Therefore, it is reassuring that there is quite significant commercial interest. We will do everything that we can to help the administrators to keep as many of those jobs as possible, both on the bakery side, in your constituency, and in the shops, which are part of the ongoing business. We have a good record of helping companies the length and breadth of Wales that have experienced difficulties, and many of those have gone on to enjoy considerable growth and prosperity, and to employ a significant number of people.

Andrew Davies: Mae'r anawsterau a fu gan Ferrari yn ddiweddar yn siomedig. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Carwyn Jones, yn arwain ar hyn, gan fod cymorth i'r diwydiant bwyd yn rhan o'i bortffolio. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gweithredu fel tîm wrth gynorthwyo cwmnïau. Gwn fod diddordeb sylweddol wedi'i fynegi wrth y gweinyddwyr a'r derbynwyr, ac ymestynnodd y gweinyddwyr y dyddiad cau ar gyfer ystyried cynigion am y busnes yn ddiweddar. Felly, mae'n galonogol bod diddordeb masnachol tra sylweddol. Gwnawn bopeth a allwn i helpu'r gweinyddwyr i gadw cynifer â phosibl o'r swyddi yn y popty, yn eich etholaeth, ac yn y siopau, sy'n rhan o'r busnes parhaus. Mae gennym record dda yn helpu cwmnïau ledled Cymru sydd wedi cael anawsterau, ac mae nifer ohonynt wedi gweld twf a ffyniant sylweddol ar ôl hynny, ac wedi cyflogi nifer sylweddol o bobl.

Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd am ei Chyfrifoldebau heblaw am Fusnes Questions to the Business Minister on her Responsibilities other than for Business

Llywodraethu Tryloyw Transparency in Government

Q1 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on transparency in government? OAQ0356(BM)

C1 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lywodraethu tryloyw? OAQ0356(BM)

Q7 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister update us on her policies for improving openness in government? OAQ0366(BM)

C7 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am ei pholisïau i wneud y llywodraeth yn fwy agored? OAQ0366(BM)

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): Our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information establishes our policy for maximising openness. The policy has been extensively tested, and we have completed almost 1,550 requests for information since 1 January 2005, when the new access-to-information laws were commenced.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth yn sefydlu ein polisi ar gyfer bod mor agored â phosibl. Mae'r polisi wedi'i brofi'n helaeth, ac yr ydym wedi cwblhau bron 1,550 o geisiadau am wybodaeth er 1 Ionawr 2005, pan gychwynwyd y cyfreithiau newydd ar ganiatáu i'r cyhoedd weld gwybodaeth.

Jenny Randerson: The Freedom of Information Act 2000 has been successful, given the results that you cited. However, it has been so successful that the Westminster Government is crying foul, and has recently

Jenny Randerson: Mae Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, o ystyried y canlyniadau a nodwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi bod mor llwyddiannus nes i Lywodraeth San

announced proposals to amend the fees and regulations under the Act. The effect of that would be to severely restrict the use of the Act and the amount of information available under it. Your Government says that it is the most transparent in the UK; therefore, have you made representations to the UK Government stressing your opposition to this curtailment of the Freedom of Information Act?

Jane Hutt: As you say, Jenny, our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information goes beyond the Freedom of Information Act, and commits us to charging for dealing with data requests only in exceptional circumstances. We have gone even further in this commitment by not charging for dealing with any requests for information, despite some of them being large and complex. We intend to remain in that situation, because it is up to the UK Government what it does, but the Assembly Government will continue operating its own charging policy, which, as I said, is very generous.

Nick Bourne: I appreciate that the Minister may not be able to answer this specific question, but she may be able to take it up with the Minister concerned. I approve of the Freedom of Information Act, as it has been broadly beneficial. I have tabled specific questions on the hospitality given during the 2006 FA Cup final, and the Minister, Andrew Davies, was honest enough to admit that he thought that some of the hospitality and costs had gone too far. I have sought clarification of who was there. I can understand why the names of businesspeople cannot be given, because of possible contracts to the benefit of Wales, but, in the letter that I received, five civil servants were named—though I will not name them here. Is the Minister in a position to check with the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks whether these people enjoyed the hospitality, which included free helicopter rides around Cardiff, as that seems to be a considerable abuse? I do not have that information, but could she take that up, as I can see no possible defence for not releasing that information?

Steffan gilio, ac yn ddiweddar cyhoeddodd gynigion i newid y ffioedd a'r rheoliadau o dan y Ddeddf. Byddai hynny'n cyfyngu'n ddifrifol ar ddefnyddio'r Ddeddf a'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael dani. Dywed eich Llywodraeth mai hi yw'r llywodraeth fwyaf tryloyw yn y DU; felly, a ydych wedi cyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU yn pwysleisio eich gwrthwynebiad i gwtogi'r Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedwch, Jenny, mae ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth yn mynd y tu hwnt i'r Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth ac yn ein hymrwymo i godi tâl am ymdrin â cheisiadau am ddata dan amgylchiadau eithriadol yn unig. Yr ydym wedi mynd hyd yn oed ymhellach o ran yr ymrwymiad hwn drwy beidio â chodi tâl am ymdrin ag unrhyw geisiadau am wybodaeth, er bod rhai ohonynt yn fawr ac yn gymhleth. Bwriadwn barhau'r sefyllfa honno, oherwydd cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y DU yw'r hyn a wna, ond bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i weithredu ei pholisi ei hun ar gyfer codi ffioedd sydd, fel y dywedais, yn hael iawn.

Nick Bourne: Deallaf efallai na fydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ateb y cwestiwn penodol hwn, ond efallai y gall godi'r cwestiwn gyda'r Gweinidog dan sylw. Cymeradwyaf y Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth, gan iddi fod yn fuddiol ar y cyfan. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno cwestiynau penodol ar y lletygarwch a roddwyd yn ystod rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA yn 2006, ac yr oedd y Gweinidog, Andrew Davies, yn ddigon gonest i gyfaddef ei fod yn credu bod rhywfaint o'r lletygarwch a'r costau wedi mynd yn rhy bell. Yr wyf wedi ceisio eglurhad pwy oedd yno. Gallaf ddeall pam na ellir rhoi enwau pobl fusnes, oherwydd contractau posibl er lles i Gymru, ond yn y llythyr a gefais enwyd pum gwas sifil—er nad enwaf hwy yma. A yw'r Gweinidog mewn sefyllfa i gadarnhau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau a gafodd y bobl hynny y lletygarwch, a oedd yn cynnwys taith mewn hofrennydd o amgylch Caerdydd am ddim, oherwydd ymddengys bod hynny'n gamddefnydd sylweddol? Nid yw'r wybodaeth honno gennyf, ond a allai ymholi i hynny, oherwydd ni welaf ddim amddiffyniad posibl dros beidio â rhyddhau'r

wybodaeth honno?

1.40 p.m.

Jane Hutt: As you said, not only are we committed to freedom of information, but we go beyond that in Wales with our code of access. All requests to release information must be considered in the context of that code of practice. My role is to oversee and to develop policies and procedures to deliver open Government. It is clear that you have sought this opportunity to raise, yet again, an issue about which you are pursuing information. I am sure that that will be forthcoming.

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedwch, nid yn unig yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ryddid gwybodaeth, ond awn gam ymhellach yng Nghymru gyda'n cod ymarfer. Rhaid ystyried pob cais i ryddhau gwybodaeth yng nghyd-destun y cod ymarfer hwnnw. Fy rôl i yw goruchwyllo a datblygu polisiau a gweithdrefnau i sicrhau Llywodraeth agored. Mae'n amlwg eich bod wedi manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i godi, unwaith eto, fater yr ydych yn ceisio gwybodaeth amdano. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch y wybodaeth honno maes o law.

Polisiau Trawsbynciol am Blant Cross-cutting Policies on Children

Q2 Helen Mary Jones: What recent discussions has the Minister held regarding the co-ordination of the Welsh Assembly Government's cross-cutting policies with regard to children? OAQ0364(BM)

C2 Helen Mary Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar ynghylch cydlynu polisiau trawsbynciol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng nghyswllt plant? OAQ0364(BM)

Q3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on any new plans she intends to introduce with regard to cross-cutting policies in relation to children? OAQ0363(BM)

C3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw gynlluniau newydd y mae'n bwriadu eu cyflwyno gyda golwg ar bolisiau trawsbynciol sy'n ymwneud â phlant? OAQ0363(BM)

Q12 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the effectiveness of the Welsh Assembly Government's co-ordination of cross-cutting policies with regard to children? OAQ0365(BM)

C12 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effeithlonrwydd cydlynu polisiau trawsbynciol gan y Llywodraeth yng nghyswllt plant? OAQ0365(BM)

Q13 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What are the Minister's priorities for the co-ordination of cross-cutting policies with regard to children? OAQ0362(BM)

C13 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog ar gyfer cydlynu polisiau trawsbynciol sy'n ymwneud â phlant? OAQ0362(BM)

Jane Hutt: On 11 December, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, the Minister for Health and Social Services and I, as Minister with responsibility for children, met voluntary sector representatives to discuss cross-cutting issues including child and adolescent mental health services, parenting support, substance misuse and 'Making the Connections'. The Cabinet sub-committee continues to co-ordinate our cross-cutting policies for children.

Jane Hutt: Ar 11 Rhagfyr, cyfarfu'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a minnau, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, â chynrychiolwyr y sector gwirfoddol i drafod materion trawsbynciol, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, cymorth rhianta, camddefnyddio sylweddau a 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae is-bwyllgor y Cabinet yn parhau i gydgyssylltu

ein polisïau trawsbynciol i blant.

Helen Mary Jones: In that meeting, I am sure that the voluntary organisations made you aware of their concerns about the way in which the high-level social services strategy does not effectively address children's issues. Can you tell me what subsequent discussions you have had with the Minister for Health and Social Services? In that context, I should say that I was a bit concerned about his response when I raised the matter in committee; I did not feel that it was being taken seriously. What steps will you take as Minister with cross-cutting responsibility to ensure that the needs of children and young people, particularly those who are vulnerable, are built into that strategy rather than being an add-on, which is certainly how voluntary organisations feel at the moment?

Jane Hutt: That is an extremely important strategy and, as Minister for children, I had a high-level input to the consultation and to Cabinet discussions on that. I believe that those interests and needs, as well as the policies that we have already developed, particularly the children's national service framework and the response to implementing 'Keeping us Safe', the Gwenda Thomas review, are reflected in the new strategy.

Helen Mary Jones: I am very glad to hear that, Minister, and I trust that when I meet voluntary organisations in my role as chair of the cross-party group on children they will be able to confirm your view. We are very grateful that changes have been made.

I want to ask you about another specific matter, namely the need for independent national advocacy services, particularly for looked-after children, but also for all vulnerable children. We seem to have been attempting to address this matter in the Chamber and in the relevant committees for a long time. Are you prepared, at this stage, to make a commitment to a nationally funded, fully independent advocacy service for

Helen Mary Jones: Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, yr wyf yn siŵr fod y sefydliadau gwirfoddol wedi eich gwneud yn ymwybodol o'u pryderon nad yw'r strategaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol lefel uchel yn mynd i'r afael â materion plant yn effeithiol. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pa drafodaethau dilynol a gawsoch gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol? Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, dylwn ddweud fy mod yn pryderu ychydig am ei ymateb pan godais y mater yn y pwyllgor; ni themlwn fod y mater yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif. Pa gamau a gymerwch fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb trawsbynciol i sicrhau bod anghenion plant a phobl ifanc, yn arbennig y rheini sy'n ddiamddiffyn, yn cael eu cynnwys yn y strategaeth honno yn hytrach na bod yn ychwanegiad, oherwydd dyna sut mae sefydliadau gwirfoddol yn teimlo ar hyn o bryd?

Jane Hutt: Mae honno'n strategaeth bwysig iawn, ac fel y Gweinidog dros blant gwneuthum gyfraniad lefel uchel i'r ymgynghori a thrafodaethau'r Cabinet ar hynny. Credaf fod y diddordebau a'r anghenion hynny, yn ogystal â'r polisïau a ddatblygwyd gennym eisoes, yn arbennig y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant a'r ymateb i weithredu 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel', sef adolygiad Gwenda Thomas, wedi'u hadlewyrchu yn y strategaeth newydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n dda gennyf glywed hynny, Weinidog, a hyderaf, pan fyddaf yn cyfarfod â sefydliadau gwirfoddol yn fy rôl fel cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar blant, y byddant yn gallu cadarnhau eich barn. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iawn bod newidiadau wedi'u gwneud.

Dymunaf eich holi am fater penodol arall, sef yr angen am wasanaethau eiriolaeth cenedlaethol annibynnol, yn arbennig ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal, ond hefyd ar gyfer pob plentyn diamddiffyn. Ymddengys ein bod yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgorau perthnasol ers cryn amser. A ydych yn barod, ar hyn o bryd, i wneud ymrwymiad i wasanaeth eiriolaeth cwbl annibynnol yn cael

looked-after children to begin with and then, eventually, for all vulnerable children in Wales?

Jane Hutt: As you know, Helen Mary, we are shortly to go out to consultation on the advocacy arrangements. The importance of independence has been stressed throughout. Part of that consultation will be to look not only at the issues for looked-after children, which are vital, but also at all aspects of advocacy. Those issues will certainly be fully brought out during that consultation.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, you will be aware of the debate that has taken place on adoption agencies and the need for their practice to reflect anti-discrimination laws. The Catholic church has said that it might close some of its adoption agencies. Have you had any discussions, or do you plan to have any, about the possible impact of this in Wales, and about how you would address that?

Jane Hutt: I have had no such discussions. I am glad that the amendments were not carried and so the equality regulations will stand, ensuring that there is equality of opportunity and no change in terms of discrimination.

Gwenda Thomas: My point relates to Helen Mary Jones's contribution about the Minister's pledge that the Minister for Health and Social Services has committed to take the findings of the review, 'Keeping us Safe', fully into account. I would also like to say that the voluntary sector and the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales were part of that review, and fully contributed to its work. Diolch yn fawr.

Jane Hutt: It is extremely important that we recognise that. The importance of Gwenda Thomas's review is reflected in how it is being taken forward in every policy document. That will be reflected in the UN convention report.

Mark Isherwood: The draft autism strategy, which was launched this week, clearly has

ei ariannu'n genedlaethol ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal i ddechrau ac yna, yn y pen draw, ar gyfer pob plentyn diamddiffyn yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: Fel y gwyddoch, Helen Mary, byddwn yn ymgynghori ar y trefniadau eiriolaeth cyn hir. Pwysleisiwyd pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth drwy gydol y broses. Rhan o'r ymgynghori hwnnw fydd edrych nid yn unig ar y problemau ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal, sy'n hanfodol, ond hefyd pob agwedd ar eiriolaeth. Ystyrir y materion hynny'n llawn yn sicr yn ystod yr ymgynghori hwnnw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, fe wyddoch am y ddadl a fu am asiantaethau mabwysiadu a'r angen i'w harfer adlewyrchu cyfreithiau gwrthwahanuaethu. Dywed yr eglwys Gatholig y gall gau rhai o'i hasiantaethau mabwysiadu. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau, neu a ydych yn bwriadu gwneud hynny, am effaith bosibl hyn yng Nghymru, a sut y byddech yn mynd i'r afael â hynny?

Jane Hutt: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau o'r fath. Yr wyf yn falch na chafodd y gwelliannau eu pasio ac felly bydd y rheoliadau cydraddoldeb yn aros, gan sicrhau cyfle cyfartal a dim newid o ran gwahaniaethu.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae fy mhwynt yn ymwneud â chyfraniad Helen Mary Jones am addewid y Gweinidog bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi ymrwmo i roi ystyriaeth llawn i ddarganfyddiadau'r adolygiad 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'. Hoffwn ddweud hefyd fod y sector gwirfoddol a Swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw, ac wedi cyfrannu'n llawn at ei waith. Diolch yn fawr.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n hynod bwysig inni gydnabod hynny. Adlewyrchir pwysigrwydd adolygiad Gwenda Thomas yn y modd y caiff ei gyflwyno ym mhob dogfen bolisi. Caiff hynny ei adlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad ar gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'n amlwg bod i'r strategaeth ddrafft ar awtistiaeth, a lanswyd

cross-cutting policy implications for many children in Wales. How do you respond to the National Autistic Society's initial support for the plan, but also its doubts about how key elements of the strategy will work in practice? It says that it is difficult to see how local agencies will be able to implement the plan without additional money, clear targets and statutory power. It is concerned that the sections on key issues such as mental health and family support—including post-diagnostic support—do not fully address the issues that we know that families face.

Jane Hutt: I think, Mark, that you will agree that the launch that was held on Tuesday night was an important one. The pan-Celtic nations meeting and reception that took place here recognised that Wales is in the lead, given our draft autistic spectrum disorder action plan. That action plan has now been launched and is out to consultation. Also, we have made £1.87 million in additional resources available for services for children with autistic spectrum disorder in the budget for 2007-08. I am sure that the consultation will take us forward positively. We must also recognise the achievements that have been made.

yr wythnos hon, oblygiadau polisi trawsbynciol o ran nifer o blant yng Nghymru. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i gefnogaeth gychwynnol y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Awtistiaeth i'r cynllun, ond hefyd ei hamheuon ynghylch sut y bydd elfennau allweddol o'r strategaeth yn gweithio mewn gwirionedd? Dywed ei bod yn anodd gweld sut y gall asiantaethau lleol weithredu'r cynllun heb arian ychwanegol, targedau clir a phŵer statudol. Mae'n pryderu nad yw'r adrannau ar faterion allweddol, fel iechyd meddwl a chymorth i deuluoedd—gan gynnwys cymorth ôl-ddiagnostig—yn mynd i'r afael yn llawn â'r materion a wyddom sy'n wynebu teuluoedd.

Jane Hutt: Credaf, Mark, y cytunwch fod y lansiad nos Fawrth yn un pwysig. Yr oedd cyfarfod a derbynwest y cenedloedd Celtaidd a gynhaliwyd yma yn cydnabod bod Cymru ar y blaen, o gofio'n cynllun gweithredu drafft ar anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistig. Lansiodd y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw bellach a bydd ymgynghori arno. Hefyd, yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2007-08 yr ydym wedi darparu £1.87 miliwn o adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau i blant ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr ymgynghori'n arwain at ddatblygiad cadarnhaol. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod y llwyddiannau a fu.

Bywyd y Cymuned Community Life

Q4 Mick Bates: How is the Minister co-ordinating cross-cutting actions to enable children and young people to play a full part in public and community life? OAQ0370(BM)

Jane Hutt: We promote participation across all Assembly Government portfolios, so that children and young people can become involved in all aspects of public and community life. On 25 January, we launched our national standards for participation, which will underpin and improve participatory practice throughout Wales.

Mick Bates: Thank you for your response, Minister. I would like to know what action your Government is taking with regard to

C4 Mick Bates: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn cydlynu camau trawsbynciol i alluogi plant a phobl ifanc i gymryd rhan lawn mewn bywyd cyhoeddus ac ym mywyd y gymuned? OAQ0370(BM)

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo cyfranogiad ar draws pob portffolio yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y gall plant a phobl ifanc gymryd rhan ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd cyhoeddus a bywyd yn y gymuned. Ar 25 Ionawr, lansiodd ein safonau cenedlaethol ar gyfer cyfranogiad, a fydd yn ategu ac yn gwella arfer cyfranogi ledled Cymru.

Mick Bates: Diolch am eich ymateb, Weinidog. Hoffwn wybod pa gamau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i wahardd

permanent exclusions from school in particular. While this mainly falls under the education portfolio, as you are well aware, many young people miss out on opportunities to engage in community work because the funding from social services or the voluntary sector is insufficient. What work are you undertaking to ensure that those who are permanently excluded from school receive sufficient funding to give them the same opportunities afforded to those who are still in full-time education?

Jane Hutt: We are concerned about this and it is rigorously monitored, not just by the Department for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, but at local authority level. We should also recognise that there is some excellent alternative educational provision across Wales, which can be useful for children and young people who may be experiencing difficulties and troubles. However, it is clear, from our pupil inclusion policies, that permanent exclusion is not something that we seek.

Christine Gwyther: Young people often feel disenfranchised in society and in education as well, and none more so than young people with physical disabilities. There is a very exciting proposal from Trinity College, Carmarthen, which it has talked to me about—I hope that you will also meet it to talk about this—to have an inclusive living centre for disabled people as part of its campus in Carmarthen, so that disabled young and older people can engage in higher education to the same extent as those who are fully able.

Jane Hutt: I would like to visit that centre at Trinity College, and I am sure that it will be a model for the rest of Wales. I would see it as very much meeting the recommendations of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity on service provision for disabled young people.

Jonathan Morgan: A few years ago, your colleague, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, announced the launch of young people's partnerships. They were trumpeted as representing young people and co-ordinating services for young people in each local authority area. At the time, no

disgyblion yn barhaol o ysgolion yn benodol. Er y daw hyn o dan y portffolio addysg yn bennaf, fel y gwyddoch, mae nifer o bobl ifanc yn colli cyfleoedd i gymryd rhan mewn gwaith yn y gymuned gan nad oes digon o arian o'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol na'r sector gwirfoddol. Pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y rheini sydd wedi'u gwahardd yn barhaol o'r ysgol yn cael digon o arian i roi'r un cyfleoedd iddynt ag i'r rheini sy'n dal mewn addysg amser llawn?

Jane Hutt: Mae hyn yn peri pryder inni a chaiff ei fonitro'n fanwl, nid dim ond gan yr Adran Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, ond ar lefel awdurdodau lleol hefyd. Dylem hefyd gydnabod bod darpariaeth addysgol amgen ardderchog ledled Cymru, a all fod yn ddefnyddiol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc a all gael anawsterau a thrafferthion. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg, o'n polisiau ar gyfer cynnwys disgyblion, nad yw gwahardd yn barhaol yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei geisio.

Christine Gwyther: Gall pobl ifanc yn aml deimlo eu bod wedi'u difreinio mewn cymdeithas ac mewn addysg hefyd, yn enwedig pobl ifanc ag anableddau corfforol. Mae yna gynnig cyffrous iawn o Goleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, ac mae wedi'i drafod gyda mi—gobeithio y byddwch chi hefyd yn cwrdd i drafod hyn—i gael canolfan byw'n gynhwysol ar gyfer pobl anabl fel rhan o'i gampws yng Nghaerfyrddin, fel y gall pobl anabl o bob oed gymryd rhan mewn addysg uwch i'r un graddau â phobl nad ydynt yn anabl.

Jane Hutt: Hoffwn ymweld â'r ganolfan honno yng Ngholeg y Drindod, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn batrwm i weddill Cymru. Byddwn yn ystyried i raddau helaeth ei fod yn bodloni argymhellion y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc anabl.

Jonathan Morgan: Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, cyhoeddodd eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, lansio partneriaethau pobl ifanc. Honnwyd eu bod yn cynrychioli pobl ifanc ac yn cydlynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl ifanc ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol. Ar y pryd, ni

young people were appointed to them, because it was felt that it would be inappropriate, and as a result these boards were set up with membership of the great and the good from each local authority. What have the young people's partnerships achieved?

1.50 p.m.

Jane Hutt: Young people's partnerships are key to delivering the extending entitlement agenda, which is crucial for opportunities, particularly, for example, the opportunities that have now arisen as a result of young people's partnerships in the development of youth services, which we lost substantially during the Tory years. I would also say that, with regard to young people's engagement, the youth fora are crucial to young people having a role and a say in their local authority area and influencing those important young people's partnerships.

phenodwyd unrhyw bobl ifanc i fod arnynt, oherwydd teimlid y byddai hynny'n amhriodol, ac o ganlyniad sefydlwyd y byrddau hyn gydag aelodau blaenllaw o bob awdurdod lleol. Beth y mae'r partneriaethau pobl ifanc hyn wedi'i gyflawni?

Jane Hutt: Mae partneriaethau pobl ifanc yn allweddol i gyflawni'r agenda ymestyn hawliau, sy'n hanfodol i roi cyfleoedd, yn benodol, er enghraifft, y cyfleoedd sydd wedi codi o ganlyniad i bartneriaethau pobl ifanc wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau ieuencid. Collwyd y rheini i raddau helaeth yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid. Hoffwn ddweud hefyd, o ran cyfranogiad pobl ifanc, fod y fforymau ieuencid yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod barn pobl ifanc yn cael ei chlywed yn ardal eu hawdurdod lleol, a'u bod yn dylanwadu ar y partneriaethau pobl ifanc pwysig hynny.

Cynorthwyo Pobl Anabl Assist Disabled People

Q5 William Graham: Will the Minister outline discussions she has held with Cabinet members on the future co-ordination of policies to assist disabled people in Wales? OAQ0368(BM)

C5 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu trafodaethau a gafodd gydag aelodau'r Cabinet ynghylch cydlynu polisiau yn y dyfodol i gynorthwyo pobl anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ0368(BM)

Jane Hutt: I regularly discuss cross-cutting equality issues with Cabinet colleagues. In Plenary on 16 January I made a commitment to discuss the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report on service provision for young disabled people with the Cabinet as a cross-cutting issue.

Jane Hutt: Byddaf yn trafod materion cydraddoldeb trawsbynciol yn rheolaidd gyda'm cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet. Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 16 Ionawr ymrwymais i drafod adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar ddarparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc anabl gyda'r Cabinet fel mater trawsbynciol.

William Graham: May I encourage you yet again to express to the Cabinet the great difficulty that newly disabled people often have accessing and understanding services that would enable them to live as full and independent lives as possible?

William Graham: Hoffwn eich annog unwaith eto i gyfleu i'r Cabinet yr anhawster mawr a gaiff pobl sydd newydd fynd yn anabl yn aml i ddefnyddio a deall gwasanaethau a fyddai'n eu galluogi i fyw bywydau mor llawn ac annibynnol â phosibl?

Jane Hutt: Indeed. Furthermore, with regard to discussions about disabled young people and the important Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report, independent living is crucial to many strategic developments, particularly the one regarding fulfilled lives in social services policy.

Jane Hutt: Yn wir. Yn ogystal, o ran y trafodaethau ar bobl ifanc anabl ac adroddiad pwysig y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, mae byw'n annibynnol yn hanfodol i nifer o ddatblygiadau strategol, yn enwedig yr un sy'n ymwneud â bywydau cyflawn mewn polisi gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6, OAQ0358(BM), has been withdrawn. Question 7 has been answered.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6, OAQ0358(BM), yn ôl. Mae cwestiwn 7 wedi'i ateb.

Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl Equality for Disabled People

Q8 David Melding: What action is the Minister taking to achieve equality for disabled people in South Wales Central? OAQ0359(BM)

Jane Hutt: I launched the Welsh Assembly Government's disability equality scheme on 14 December. It sets out how the Assembly Government intends to promote equality for disabled people. The accessible venues and disability equality in action projects are further examples of the Assembly Government's commitment to equality for disabled people.

David Melding: You will have heard the most splendid hyperbole that came from your colleague the Minister for the economy—I cannot remember what his title is: networks and transport so on—that there is an election in the air. It is a great way to mark where disabled people stand in society that they can go to the polling station and cast their vote. It is not just an issue for people who are physically disabled, but for people who have certain learning disabilities as well. I commend the report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee on electoral arrangements. We hope that we will be able to mark a distinct improvement at these elections in access to polling stations, and that, where there is still work to be done, we shall work further to ensure that, in future, it will be the norm that people can access polling stations and vote.

Jane Hutt: I certainly will not indulge in any hyperbole, I can assure you, David. However, I can enlighten you that it is the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks who sits with me in the Cabinet. I pay particular tribute to Scope Cymru, which, as you are aware, over the years, has run a very important campaign to ensure that polling stations, for example, are accessible to disabled people. Returning officers can claim

C8 David Melding: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0359(BM)

Jane Hutt: Lansiais gynllun Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl ar 14 Rhagfyr. Mae'n gosod allan friad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Mae'r lleoliadau hygyrch a chydraddoldeb anabledd mewn prosiectau gweithredu yn enghreifftiau pellach o ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl.

David Melding: Byddwch wedi clywed yr ormodiaith odidog a gafwyd gan eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros yr economi-ni allaf gofio beth yw ei deitl: rhwydweithiau a chlundiant ac ati-bod etholiad ar droed. Mae'r ffaith y gall pobl anabl fynd i'r orsaf bleidleisio a bwrw eu pleidlais yn ffordd wych o nodi eu statws mewn cymdeithas. Mae'n broblem nid yn unig i bobl sydd ag anabledd corfforol, ond i bobl sydd â rhai anabledau dysgu yn ogystal. Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar drefniadau etholiadol. Gobeithiwn y gallwn weld gwelliant amlwg yn yr etholiadau hyn o ran hwylustod gorsafoedd pleidleisio, a lle y mae gwaith i'w wneud o hyd, byddwn yn gwneud mwy o waith i sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, y bydd yn gyffredinol i orsafoedd pleidleisio fod yn hwylus i bobl anabl ac y gallant bleidleisio ynddynt.

Jane Hutt: Yn sicr ni ddefnyddiaf dim gormodiaith, David. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud mai'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau sy'n eistedd gyda mi yn y Cabinet. Rhof deyrnged arbennig i Scope Cymru, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, dros y blynyddoedd wedi cynnal ymgyrch bwysig iawn i sicrhau bod gorsafoedd pleidleisio, er enghraifft, yn hwylus i bobl anabl. Gall swyddogion canlyniadau hawlio 50 y cant o

50 per cent of the cost of installing temporary ramps to polling stations. I hope that you will see those being installed for the forthcoming election. I am sure that we will want to take part in the manifesto event that the Disability Rights Commission is organising.

gost gosod rampiau dros dro mewn gorsafoedd pleidleisio. Gobeithio y gwelwch fod y rhain wedi'u gosod ar gyfer yr etholiad sydd ar droed. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn am gymryd rhan yn y digwyddiad maniffesto y mae'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn ei drefnu.

Blaenoriaethau'r Gyllideb Budget Priorities

Q9 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister outline her budget priorities for the next six months? OAQ0367(BM)

C9 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei blaenoriaethau cyllideb am y chwe mis nesaf? OAQ0367(BM)

Jane Hutt: My budget priorities for the next six months include promoting equality, effective communications, and ensuring that the needs and aspirations of children are fully embedded into Assembly Government policies, budgets and programmes.

Jane Hutt: Mae fy mlaenoriaethau cyllideb dros y chwe mis nesaf yn cynnwys hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb, cyfathrebu effeithiol, a sicrhau y caiff anghenion a dyheadau plant eu hystyried yn llawn ym mholisiau, cyllidebau a rhaglenni Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for her response. It follows on from the point raised by David Melding, which you have taken up, and the report of the charity, Scope Cymru, to which you referred. There are, on average, 15,000 disabled people in each constituency who will have difficulty casting their votes. We remember, from previous elections, going back into the mists of time, the continued difficulties that many people throughout Wales have in getting to the polls and casting their votes. Given that we, quite correctly, encourage people to turn out, are you receiving reports on each constituency, and are you making resources available in so far as you are able to within the budget to ensure that these difficulties will not continue, or, at the very least, that you will minimise them?

Nick Bourne: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweindiog am ei hymateb. Mae'n dilyn ymlaen o'r pwynt a godwyd gan David Melding, yr ydych wedi'i drafod, ac adroddiad yr elusen Scope Cymru y cyfeiriech ato. Ar gyfartaledd, mae 15,000 o bobl anabl ym mhob etholaeth a fydd yn cael anhawster i fwrw eu pleidlais. Cofiw, o etholiadau blaenorol flynyddoedd maith yn ôl, am yr anawsterau parhaus a gaiff nifer o bobl ledled Cymru i gyrraedd y gorsafoedd a bwrw'u pleidlais. O gofio ein bod, yn gywir ddigon, yn annog pobl i bleidleisio, a ydych yn cael adroddiadau ar bob etholaeth, ac a ydych yn sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael cyn belled â phosibl o fewn y gyllideb i sicrhau na fydd yr anawsterau hyn yn parhau, neu o leiaf eich bod yn eu lleihau?

Jane Hutt: The all-Wales elections planning group was established by the Assembly Government. It exists to promote and share best practice among electoral administrators. Although we do not have powers devolved to us concerning the conduct of elections, the elections planning group has been very proactive. As I have already mentioned, returning officers have a key role in this and can claim 100 per cent of the cost of temporary ramps—50 per cent from the Assembly under the National Assembly for Wales (Returning Officers' Charges) Order

Jane Hutt: Sefydlwyd y grŵp cynllunio etholiadau i Gymru gyfan gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ei nod yw hyrwyddo a rhannu arfer gorau ymysg gweinyddwyr etholiadol. Er nad oes gennym bwerau wedi eu datganoli inni o ran cynnal etholiadau, mae'r grŵp cynllunio etholiadau wedi bod yn weithgar iawn. Fel y soniais eisoes, mae gwaith y swyddogion canlyniadau yn allweddol, a gallant hawlio cost lawn rampiau dros dro—50 y cant gan y Cynulliad o dan Orchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau Swyddogion Canlyniadau) 2002 a 50 y cant

2002 and 50 per cent from the Department for Constitutional Affairs. That will be a real statement of change and progress for disabled people.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 10, OAQ0371(BM), and 11, OAQ0372(BM), have been transferred for written answer, questions 12 and 13 have been answered, and question 15, OAQ0373(BM), has been withdrawn.

gan yr Adran Materion Cyfansoddiadol. Bydd hynny'n ddatganiad gwirioneddol o newid a chynnydd i bobl anabl.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiynau 10, OAQ0371(BM), ac 11, OAQ0372(BM), i'w hateb yn ysgrifenedig, atebwyd cwestiynau 12 a 13, a thynnwyd cwestiwn 15, OAQ0373(BM), yn ôl.

Mynediad Digonol i Bobl Anabl Adequate Disabled Access

Q14 Peter Black: What action is the Minister taking to ensure that all polling stations for the 2007 Assembly elections have adequate disabled access? OAQ0361(BM)

Jane Hutt: That is an important question, Peter. Returning officers can claim 50 per cent of the cost of installing temporary ramps to polling stations from the Assembly and the balance from the UK Government, as I have already stated. It is the responsibility of the returning officers to allocate polling stations and the elections planning group will continue to promote best practice in this regard.

Peter Black: I am sure that there is no easy answer to this, but one of the biggest issues for people with disabilities is when caravans are used for polling stations, which are particularly inaccessible. Can you liaise with all returning officers to find out how many caravans are still being used around Wales and on whether better alternatives could be used?

Jane Hutt: That is a key point to take back. We must recognise that we now have the Electoral Administration Act 2006, which aims to improve access and engagement, particularly as a basis for access to registration, postal voting and voting on the polling day. We have to ensure that the implementation of that makes a difference in May 2007.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. I am quite enjoying Thursday questions.

C14 Peter Black: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pob gorsaf bleidleisio ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad 2007 yn cynnig mynediad digonol i bobl anabl? OAQ0361(BM)

Jane Hutt: Mae hynny'n gwestiwn pwysig, Peter. Gall swyddogion canlyniadau hawlio 50 y cant o gost gosod rampiau dros dro mewn gorsafoedd pleidleisio gan y Cynulliad a'r gweddill gan Lywodraeth y DU, fel y dywedais eisoes. Cyfrifoldeb y swyddogion canlyniadau yw dyrannu gorsafoedd pleidleisio, a bydd y grŵp cynllunio etholiadau yn parhau i hyrwyddo arfer gorau yn y cyswllt hwn.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn siŵr nad oes ateb syml i hyn, ond un o'r problemau mwyaf i bobl ag anabledd yw defnyddio carafanau fel gorsafoedd pleidleisio, sy'n anghyfleus iawn. A allwch gysylltu â phob swyddog canlyniadau i weld faint o garafanau sy'n dal i gael eu defnyddio ledled Cymru, ac a ellid defnyddio dulliau amgen gwell?

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn bwynt allweddol i'w ystyried. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod Deddf Gweinyddu Etholiadau 2006, sy'n anelu at wella mynediad a chyfranogiad, yn enwedig fel sail ar gyfer hwylustod cofrestru, pleidleisio drwy'r post a phleidleisio ar ddiwrnod etholiad. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd gweithredu hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth ym mis Mai 2007.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weiniog. Yr wyf yn mwynhau cwestiynau dydd Iau.

Datganiad am Wasanaethau Llawfeddygol Brys—Llanelli **Statement on Emergency Surgical Services—Llanelli**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The provision of emergency surgical services at Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli has been the subject of debate and discussion among the local health community for two years. The need for such consideration has been very real. The wider patterns of change in patient care mean, for example, that there has been a general reduction in the need for emergency surgery—for example, evidenced by appendicitis being less common and better treatment for peptic ulcers reducing the need for surgery for perforated ulcers.

These reasons, linked to the reduced working times in the new consultant contract, the wider European working time directive, training requirements and sub-specialisation, mean that patterns of acute surgery delivery need to change. My reason for agreeing to an independent inquiry therefore focuses on the question of whether due process was adhered to in addressing these challenges. It has been said frequently in the Assembly that patients and the public need to be clear about the range and quality of services that they can receive locally, and see tangible signs of new investment in their future service, if service change is to be brought about successfully.

There are important plans, in an advanced stage of preparation, for new investments in planned surgery services at Prince Philip Hospital. In my view, these investments need to be firmly agreed in the public domain before other services are altered. Against that background, and in broad terms, I want my inquiry to consider how the proposals for change in Llanelli were formulated, how the process of consultation upon these proposals was conducted, how the outcome of that consultation was determined, including the role of the community health council, and how plans for implementation of that outcome were formulated.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Mae darpariaeth gwasanaethau llawfeddygol brys yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli wedi bod yn destun dadl a thrafod yn y gymuned iechyd leol ers dwy flynedd. Yr oedd dirfawr angen ystyriaeth o'r fath. Mae newidiadau ehangach yn y gofal i gleifion yn golygu, er enghraifft, bod gostyngiad cyffredinol yn yr angen am wasanaethau llawdriniaeth brys—tystiolaeth o hyn, er enghraifft, yw bod llid y coluddyn crog yn llai cyffredin a bod triniaeth well ar gyfer briwiau peptig ar y stumog yn lleihau'r angen am lawdriniaethau ar gyfer briwiau sydd wedi rhwygo.

Mae'r rhesymau hyn, ynghyd â'r gostyngiad mewn oriau gweithio yn y contract newydd i feddygon ymgynghorol, y gyfarwydddeb Ewropeaidd ehangach ar oriau gweithio, a gofynion hyfforddiant ac is-arbenigiaeth yn golygu bod angen i batrymau'r ddarpariaeth llawdriniaethau aciwt newid. Mae fy rheswm dros gytuno i ymchwiliad annibynnol felly yn ymwneud yn bennaf â'r cwestiwn a ddilynwyd y prosesau priodol wrth ymateb i'r heriau hyn. Dywedwyd yn aml yn y Cynulliad bod angen i gleifion a'r cyhoedd fod yn ymwybodol o amrywiaeth ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau y gallant eu cael yn lleol, a gweld arwyddion pendant o fuddsoddiad newydd yn eu gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol, er mwyn sicrhau newidiadau llwyddiannus mewn gwasanaethau.

Mae yna gynlluniau pwysig - ac y mae'r gwaith o'u paratoi bron â'i gwblhau - ar gyfer buddsoddiadau newydd mewn gwasanaethau llawdriniaethau a gynlluniwyd yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip. Yn fy marn i, mae angen cytuno'n bendant ar y buddsoddiadau hyn yn gyhoeddus cyn newid unrhyw wasanaethau eraill. Yn y cefndir hwnnw, ac yn gyffredinol, yr wyf am sicrhau bod fy ymholiad yn ystyried sut y lluniwyd y cynigion ar gyfer newid yn Llanelli, sut y cynhaliwyd y broses ymgynghori ar y cynigion hyn, sut y penderfynwyd canlyniad yr ymgynghori hwnnw, gan gynnwys rôl y cyngor iechyd cymuned, a sut y lluniwyd y cynlluniau ar gyfer gweithredu'r canlyniad

hwnnw.

No matter how compelling matters may appear to professionals, change in the health service depends upon demonstrating to the public that the process followed was fair, open and responsive, as far as the outcomes are concerned. The views of patients and the public have to be listened to, carefully considered, and taken into account. The level of concern in Llanelli is such that, in my judgment, an independent report into these matters is required. There are lessons to be learned and I am determined that we should do so.

I am not able, at this stage, to announce the name of the individual who will be appointed to carry out this work. My intention is to appoint someone who is wholly independent of the local area, of the Welsh national health service and of the Welsh Assembly Government, but who has an authoritative understanding of the issues involved and of the way in which changes in the health service are best brought about. I hope to be able to announce a name in the next few weeks.

I have to inform the Assembly that I have received a letter this morning from the chairs of the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust and the Carmarthenshire Local Health Board setting out their failure to secure a safe service as from 2 February, when new medical rotas have to be instituted at Prince Philip Hospital.

2.00 p.m.

I very much regret this failure and I would have much preferred to see the service continue while the inquiry was conducted, but the advice from the chairs is unambiguous: the service cannot be provided safely and will therefore have to be suspended. However, my officials continue to be in discussions with Carmarthenshire trust to see what can be done to reinstate the emergency surgical service at Llanelli while the inquiry goes on. In doing so, we need to ensure that nothing that we say or do puts patient safety at risk.

Nid oes gwahaniaeth pa mor gryf mae'r ddadl yn ymddangos i weithwyr proffesiynol, mae'r newid yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn dibynnu ar ddangos i'r cyhoedd bod y broses a ddilynwyd yn deg, yn agored ac yn ymatebol, o ran y canlyniadau. Rhaid gwrando ar safbwyntiau cleifion a'r cyhoedd, a'u hystyried yn ofalus. Cymaint yw'r pryder yn Llanelli nes bydd angen adroddiad annibynnol ar y materion hyn, yn fy marn i. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu ac yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylem wneud hynny.

Ar hyn o bryd, ni allaf roi enw'r sawl a benodir i wneud y gwaith hwn. Fy mwriad yw penodi rhywun sy'n gwbl annibynnol ar yr ardal leol, ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru ac ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond sy'n meddu ar ddealltwriaeth awdurdodol o'r materion dan sylw a'r ffordd orau i sicrhau newidiadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gobeithiaf allu cyhoeddi enw yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

Rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fy mod wedi cael llythyr y bore yma gan gadeiryddion Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Gaerfyrddin yn dweud na fyddant yn gallu sicrhau gwasanaeth diogel o 2 Chwefror, pan fydd yn rhaid cyflwyno rotas meddygol newydd yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip.

Gresynaf yn fawr at y methiant hwn, a buasai'n well o lawer gennyf weld y gwasanaeth yn parhau tra oedd yr ymchwiliad yn mynd rhagddo. Ond yr oedd cyngor y cadeiryddion yn ddiawys: ni ellir darparu'r gwasanaeth yn ddiogel, ac felly bydd yn rhaid rhoi'r gorau iddo. Fodd bynnag, mae fy swyddogion yn parhau i drafod gydag ymddiriedolaeth sir Gaerfyrddin i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i ailgyflwyno'r gwasanaeth meddygol brys yn Llanelli tra bydd yr ymchwiliad yn mynd rhagddo. Wrth wneud hynny, mae angen inni sicrhau na fydd dim yr ydym yn ei ddweud na'i wneud yn peryglu diogelwch cleifion.

Helen Mary Jones: Thank you, Minister, for your statement, which now clarifies the nature of the inquiry that you announced on Monday. I share your concerns; I think that anyone who has been to Llanelli hospital in the last few months, or the last two years, would share your concerns about the nature of this process. I also support your wish to see lessons learnt. However, compared with the fanfare with which this announcement was greeted on Monday, now that we have more information, it appears to be something of a damp squib. I share your profound disappointment that it is now clear that the service will not be able to continue while the investigation is ongoing. You are right, Minister, that none of us would wish to see patient safety compromised, but I think that an earlier intervention might have enabled the trust to continue with the service. I will refer in a moment to the timing of the inquiry.

I express disappointment that we are talking about a matter of weeks until the person to conduct this inquiry is appointed. One would wish to see a truly independent individual and someone of real calibre, particularly if lessons are to be learnt, not just for the Carmarthenshire area, but for the whole of Wales. Having said that, the matters that this inquiry needs to address are specific. It will be reasonably easy to accumulate the evidence and I will begin by asking you to review the timetable. I believe that most of the people who I meet in Llanelli will think that it is unacceptable that we will have to wait weeks for the inquiry to begin.

I will move on to some specific questions to the Minister. First, what precedents are there for establishing such an inquiry, in your portfolio or in any of the others? It is important that the inquiry is seen to be thorough and fair, because you do not need me to tell you, Minister, that feelings have been running pretty high around this issue. Do we have precedents for this inquiry and, if so, could you tell me what they are? Could you also tell me whether you have plans to establish a similar inquiry into processes elsewhere in Wales that have caused grave concerns to other communities?

Helen Mary Jones: Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich datganiad, sy'n egluro bellach natur yr ymchwiliad a gyhoeddwyd gennych ddydd Llun. Yr wyf yn pryderu, fel chithau; byddai unrhyw un sydd wedi mynd i ysbyty Llanelli yn yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, neu yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, hefyd yn pryderu ynglŷn â natur y broses hon. Cefnogaf hefyd eich dymuniad i weld dysgu gwarsi. Fodd bynnag, o gofio'r ffanffer fawr pan wnaed y cyhoeddiad ddydd Llun, wedi inni gael rhagor o wybodaeth, ymddengys nad yw fawr o werth mewn gwirionedd. Yr wyf fi fel chithau'n siomedig iawn ei bod yn glir erbyn hyn na fydd modd i'r gwasanaeth barhau tra bydd yr ymchwiliad yn mynd rhagddo. Yr ydych yn iawn, Weinidog, na fyddai neb am weld peryglu diogelwch cleifion, ond credaf y gallai ymyriad cynharach fod wedi galluogi'r ymddiriedolaeth i barhau'r gwasanaeth. Cyfeiriaf yn y man at amseriad yr ymchwiliad.

Yr wyf yn siomedig ein bod yn sôn am wythnosau cyn i'r sawl a fydd yn cynnal yr ymchwiliad gael ei benodi. Byddai rhywun yn dymuno gweld unigolyn cwbl annibynnol ac un o'r radd flaenaf, yn enwedig os oes angen dysgu gwarsi, nid yn unig yn ardal sir Gaerfyrddin, ond yng Nghymru gyfan. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r materion y mae angen i'r ymchwiliad hwn ymdrin â hwy yn rhai penodol. Bydd yn weddol hawdd casglu'r dystiolaeth, a dechreuaf drwy ofyn ichi adolygu'r amserlen. Credaf y bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl yr wyf yn cyfarfod â hwy yn Llanelli yn meddwl ei bod yn annerbyniol ei bod yn rhaid inni aros am wythnosau cyn i'r ymchwiliad ddechrau.

Trof yn awr at rai cwestiynau penodol i'r Gweinidog. Yn gyntaf, pa gynseiliau sydd dros sefydlu ymchwiliad o'r fath, yn eich portffolio chi neu ym mhortffolio unrhyw un arall? Mae'n bwysig i'r ymchwiliad gael ei weld yn drylwyr ac yn deg, oherwydd nid oes angen imi ddweud wrthyf, Weinidog, bod pobl yn teimlo'n gryf iawn ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. A oes unrhyw gynseiliau dros yr ymchwiliad hwn, ac os oes, a allech ddweud wrthyf amdanynt? A allech hefyd ddweud wrthyf a ydych yn bwriadu sefydlu ymchwiliad tebyg i brosesau mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru sydd wedi achosi

pryderon mawr i gymunedau eraill?

I will come back now to the inquiry timetable and press you, Minister, to reconsider and see whether we could achieve an outcome from this inquiry before the Assembly elections. When do you intend to establish and publish the full terms of reference for the inquiry? Will you be prepared to share those terms of reference with the Health and Social Services Committee? I ask you to include in those a reference to addressing your role, and that of your officials, in the process until now, and to include the role of political decision-making in the issues relating to this inquiry. You will be aware, Minister, that the trust board is saying—in saying this, I do not necessarily support the point—that it has only been implementing the policies of your Government. Will you look at what decision making has been made at various levels, which may have led the trust to feel that it needed to make this decision? Will you ensure that the inquiry looks at the decision to set up the inquiry and its timing, given that a community health council was made in November? Some of us are slightly confused as to why it has taken this long for you to decide that you needed to intervene, if the process is flawed and, indeed, it is. May we seek your assurance today, and I would point out that this is not my view, but it has been expressed to me, that the decision to establish this inquiry has nothing whatsoever to do with the forthcoming Assembly election in May?

Brian Gibbons: This is an important decision. You asked whether any precedents have been set and, to the best of my knowledge, the answer to that question is, 'no'. To describe this as a damp squib is incredible, when it is the first time that we have done it, certainly during my term as Minister; so we are, to the best of my knowledge, in unprecedented territory.

You asked about the timing of this intervention. You are correct in saying that the CHC made its decision, but it was not until Catherine Thomas approached me in December, expressing concern about the

Dychwelaf at amserlen yr ymchwiliad a phwysaf arnoch, Weinidog, i ailystyried i weld a oes modd cwblhau'r ymchwiliad hwn cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad. Pryd y bwriadwch sefydlu a chyhoeddi cylch gorchwyl manwl yr ymchwiliad? A ydych yn barod i ddweud wrth y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithas beth fydd y cylch gorchwyl hwnnw? Gofynnaf ichi gynnwys ynddo gyfeiriad at ystyried eich rôl chi, a rôl eich swyddogion, yn y broses hyd yma, a chynnwys rôl gwneud penderfyniadau gwleidyddol yn y materion sy'n ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad hwn. Fe wyddoch, Weinidog, fd bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn dweud—ac wrth ddweud hyn, nid wyf o reidrwydd yn cefnogi'r pwynt—mai dim ond gweithredu polisiau'ch Llywodraeth y mae wedi ei wneud. A wnewch chi ystyried pa benderfyniadau sydd wedi eu gwneud ar wahanol lefelau, a allai fod wedi peri i'r ymddiriedolaeth deimlo bod angen iddi wneud y penderfyniad hwn? A wnewch chi sicrhau bod yr ymchwiliad yn ystyried y penderfyniad i sefydlu'r ymchwiliad a'i amseriad, o gofio i'r cyngor iechyd cymuned wneud penderfyniad ym mis Tachwedd? Mae rhai ohonom wedi drysu braidd ynglŷn â pham y mae wedi cymryd cyhyd ichi benderfynu bod angen ichi ymyrryd, os oedd y broses yn un ddiffygiol, fel y mae mewn gwirionedd. A gawn sicrwydd gennych heddiw – hoffwn egluro nad fy marn i yw hyn, ond rhywbeth a ddywedwyd wrthyf - nad yw'r penderfyniad i sefydlu'r ymchwiliad hwn yn gysylltiedig o gwbl ag etholiad y Cynulliad ym mis Mai?

Brian Gibbons: Mae hwn yn benderfyniad pwysig. Gofynnwyd a oes unrhyw gyseiliau, a hyd y gwn i yr ateb i hynny yw 'na'. Mae dweud na fydd hyn fawr o werth yn anhygoel, o gofio mai dyma'r tro cyntaf inni wneud hyn, yn sicr, yn ystod fy nghyfnod i yn Weinidog; felly hyd y gwn i, yr ydym yn torri tir newydd.

Yr oeddech yn holi am amseriad yr ymyriad hwn. Mae'n gywir dweud, fel y gwnaethoch, bod y CIC wedi gwneud ei benderfyniad, ond nid tan i Catherine Thomas gysylltu â mi ym mis Rhagfyr, gan fynegi pryder ynglŷn â

CHC's decision, that the matter came to my attention. As you are aware, under the guidance, if a decision, following consultation, achieves local resolution, ministerial involvement should not take place, and it did not take place. It would be entirely inappropriate, given the guidance under which the consultation took place, for me to intervene in this matter.

In mid December, Catherine Thomas brought concerns to my attention, and I told her at that stage that I would carefully consider those concerns over Christmas, before making any decision. After Christmas, I made inquiries about how the CHC's overall decision was taken, and I was surprised to hear that the trust had definitively decided to transfer acute surgery in early February. As I said in my statement—the Assembly has passed resolutions to this effect—substantial change should not happen in the health service unless alternative provision is put in place.

I gave a commitment to Catherine Thomas, in response to a question that she asked in January, that we would have state-of-the-art surgery in Llanelli; it surprised me that the trust had taken what it said at that stage was a clear decision, even before people in Llanelli had had any sight of the alternative state-of-the-art arrangements. I thought that this was a lesson that we had learnt over the initial round of consultation. When I looked into the matter, following the concerns that Catherine Thomas raised, I also wanted to know what was happening in relation to the ambulance service, because I know that the third meeting of the CHC was held with regard to concerns about the ambulance service. In a point that Catherine Thomas raised, last week I think it was, she mentioned the fact that people would travel 25 miles to Carmarthen, whereas there may be other options available in the event of a closure. When I made inquiries, I did not get the feeling that the ambulance protocol had been revisited in line with the concerns that Catherine Thomas had raised.

When I made that statement, I understand that clinicians in Llanelli and Carmarthenshire were highly concerned about the safety of the service, trying to

phenderfyniad y cyngor y tynnwyd y mater i'm sylw. Fel y gwyddoch, o dan y canllawiau, os bydd penderfyniad, ar ôl ymgynghori, yn esgor ar ateb lleol, ni ddylai gweinidog ymyrryd, ac ni wnaed hynny. Byddai'n gwbl amhriodol, o ystyried y canllawiau y cynhaliwyd yr ymgynghoriad yn unol â hwy, imi ymyrryd yn y mater hwn.

Ganol mis Rhagfyr, daeth Catherine Thomas â'i phryderon i'm sylw, a dywedais wrthi bryd hynny y byddwn yn ystyried y pryderon hynny'n ofalus dros y Nadolig cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad. Ar ôl y Nadolig, holais sut y gwnaed penderfyniad y cyngor yn gyffredinol, a synnais glywed bod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwneud penderfyniad terfynol i drosglwyddo llawdriniaeth aciwt ddechrau mis Chwefror. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad—mae'r Cynulliad wedi derbyn cynigion i'r perwyl hwn—ni ddylai newid mawr ddigwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd oni roddir darpariaeth amgen ar waith.

Addewais i Catherine Thomas, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd ganddi ym mis Ionawr, y byddwn yn darparu llawdriniaeth o'r radd flaenaf yn Llanelli; fe'm synnwyd bod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwneud yr hyn a alwodd bryd hynny'n benderfyniad clir, hyd yn oed cyn i bobl yn Llanelli gael gweld y trefniadau amgen i gynig llawdriniaeth o'r radd flaenaf. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl inni ddysgu'r wers honno ar ôl y cylch cyntaf o ymgynghori. Pan ymchwiliais i'r mater, ar ôl i Catherine Thomas godi'r pryderon, yr oeddwn i hefyd am wybod beth oedd yn digwydd o ran y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, oherwydd gwn fod trydydd cyfarfod y cyngor wedi'i gynnal mewn cysylltiad â phryderon am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mewn pwynt a godwyd gan Catherine Thomas yr wythnos diwethaf, mi gredaf, soniodd am y ffaith y byddai pobl yn teithio 25 milltir i Gaerfyrddin, ond y gall fod dewisiadau eraill os bydd gwasanaeth yn cau. Pan holais, ni chefais y teimlad bod y protocol ar gerbydau ambiwlans wedi'i ailystyried yn unol â'r pryderon a godwyd gan Catherine Thomas.

Pan wneuthum y datganiad hwnnw, deallaf fod clinigwyr yn Llanelli a sir Gaerfyrddin yn pryderu'n fawr ynglŷn â diogelwch y gwasanaeth, gan geisio dehongli fy ngeiriau

interpret my words at that stage. They made representations on that, but this week, on Tuesday, I received a delegation comprising Catherine Thomas, Nia Griffiths MP, representatives from Llanelli town council and the committee for the improvement of hospital services. The delegation mentioned the CHC, but also raised wider concerns, so, in view of the fact that the democratically elected representatives of Llanelli were making such a strong case to me and to the First Minister, I felt that I had no choice but to respond to their concerns.

On the timescale, if we can get a person in place in less than two weeks, or one week, then that person will be put in place. However, this will be a serious, authoritative inquiry, and I do not want a yes-man or yes-woman in post when that inquiry is conducted. We want to ensure that the person who conducts the inquiry has the authority and the status to attract the confidence of the Assembly and of people in Llanelli and Carmarthenshire. It is important that the process is seen to be transparent, fit for purpose and resilient.

2.10 p.m.

Finally, there is no precedent for this, but the Assembly will remember that, in the last session, Jenny Randerson raised the issue of my expressing concern about how the Powys restructuring was going ahead. She accused me on that instance of inappropriate political intervention. I took that action at that time because her colleague, Kirsty Williams—and Mick Bates to a lesser extent—brought concerns to me about the process being implemented in Powys. Insofar as having a precedent for me to look at the consultation process in a particular area, the consultation process had not started in Powys, so I was in a slightly different position than when the consultation was taking place in Llanelli. However, when that concern was brought to me by Kirsty Williams, I undertook a review with my officials as to what was happening. At that stage, I required that a more resilient process and framework for consultation should be put in place.

Therefore, there is a precedent in terms of

bryd hynny. Cyflwynwyd sylwadau ganddynt am hynny ond yr wythnos hon, ddydd Mawrth, derbyniais ddirprwyaeth a oedd yn cynnwys Catherine Thomas, Nia Griffiths AS, cynrychiolwyr o gyngor tref Llanelli a'r pwyllgor dros wella gwasanaethau ysbyty. Cyfeiriodd y ddirprwyaeth at y CIC, ond codwyd pryderon ehangach hefyd. Felly, o gofio bod cynrychiolwyr etholedig Llanelli yn cyflwyno achos mor gryf imi ac i'r Prif Weinidog, teimlais nad oedd gennyf ddewis ond ymateb i'w pryderon.

O ran yr amserlen, os bydd modd penodi rhywun o fewn pythefnos, neu wythnos, yna caiff ei benodi. Fodd bynnag, bydd hwn yn ymchwiliad difrifol ac awdurdodol, ac nid wyf am benodi rhywun i'r swydd a fydd yn amenio popeth pan gynhelir yr ymchwiliad hwnnw. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod gan y sawl sy'n cynnal yr ymchwiliad yr awdurdod a'r statws i ennyn hyder y Cynulliad a phobl Llanelli a sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae'n bwysig i'r broses gael ei gweld yn un dryloyw, yn addas at y diben ac yn gadarn.

Yn olaf, nid oes cynsail dros hyn, ond bydd y Cynulliad yn cofio, yn y sesiwn olaf, i Jenny Randerson godi'r mater fy mod wedi mynegi pryder ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr oedd Powys yn ailstrwythuro gwasanaethau. Fe'm cyhuddodd o ymyrryd gwleidyddol amhriodol yn yr achos hwnnw. Gweithredais bryd hynny am fod ei chyd-Aelod, Kirsty Williams-a Mick Bates i raddau llai-wedi mynegi pryderon wrthyf ynglŷn â'r broses a oedd yn cael ei gweithredu ym Mhowys. O ran cael cynsail imi edrych ar y broses ymgynghori mewn ardal benodol, nid oedd yr ymgynghori wedi dechrau ym Mhowys, felly, yr oedd y sefyllfa ychydig yn wahanol i'r hyn ydoedd pan oedd yr ymgynghori'n digwydd yn Llanelli. Fodd bynnag, pan godwyd y pryder hwnnw gan Kirsty Williams, gwneuthum adolygiad gyda'm swyddogion i weld beth oedd yn digwydd. Bryd hynny, gofynnais am i broses a fframwaith cadarnach ar gyfer ymgynghori gael eu rhoi ar waith.

Felly, mae yna gysail o ran Aelodau

elected Members coming to me with concerns about how service change is taking place; having listened, if the case is made, I will respond. I responded to Kirsty Williams's representations, just as I responded to Catherine Thomas's representations. Catherine Thomas was the only person to make representations to me on this issue until I met the MP and representatives of the town council, with the exception of the discussion that I had with Catherine and Helen Mary in relation to breast services. Other than that, all the representations that I received on this matter were from Catherine Thomas.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for the Minister's response and for his statement. I am deeply concerned about the timing of this statement, this close to an election. As the Minister indicated, not for the first time, restructuring plans brought about because of Labour, are being halted until the other side of the Assembly elections. That is what is happening; there is no doubt of that, so it does cause concern.

Is it the case that the Minister wrote in December to Carmarthenshire NHS Trust congratulating it on how it had handled the reconfiguration decisions? Will he make available his correspondence with Carmarthenshire NHS Trust in December?

Secondly, why was this announcement made, this close to an election, with the Minister mentioning the local Assembly Member 15 or 16 times? You are the Minister, so it should not be up to individuals to come to you and say, 'Please do this'. When did you know about these plans? As Minister, you are supposed to have expert knowledge, so surely you can make up your own mind as to whether these decisions are needed. Is it the case that, every time an Assembly Member comes to you—as the Llywydd has said, we are all equal Members—you will have to look at the issue and say, 'I will order an inquiry; I think that that is a good idea'? That is what you seem to be saying.

Given that this is so urgent—I do not doubt

etholedig yn mynegi pryderon wrthyf ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae gwasanaethau'n cael eu newid; ar ôl gwranddo, os cyflwynir dadl ddilys, byddaf yn ymateb. Ymatebais i sylwadau Kirsty Williams, fel yr ymatebais i sylwadau Catherine Thomas. Catherine Thomas oedd yr unig un a gododd y mater hwn gyda mi nes imi gyfarfod â'r AS a chynrychiolwyr cyngor y dref, ac eithrio'r drafodaeth a gefais gyda Catherine a Helen Mary mewn cysylltiad â gwasanaethau'r fron. Heblaw am hynny, dim ond Catherine Thomas a gododd y mater hwn gyda mi.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ymateb y Gweinidog ac am ei ddatganiad. Pryderaf yn fawr ynglŷn ag amseriad y datganiad hwn, a hynny mor agos at etholiad. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, nid am y tro cyntaf, mae cynlluniau ailstrwythuro sy'n bolisi gan Lafur yn cael eu hatal tan ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad. Dyna sy'n digwydd; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny, felly, mae'n achosi pryder.

Onid yw'n wir fod y Gweinidog wedi ysgrifennu ym mis Rhagfyr at Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin yn ei llongyfarch am y ffordd yr oedd wedi ymdrin â'r penderfyniadau ail-gyflunio? A wnaiff gyhoeddi ei ohebiaeth ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin ym mis Rhagfyr?

Yn ail, pam y gwnaed y cyhoeddiad hwn mor agos at etholiad, a'r Gweinidog yn sôn am yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol 15 neu 16 o weithiau? Chi yw'r Gweinidog, felly, ni ddylai unigolion orfod dod atoch a dweud, 'Gwnewch hyn, os gwelwch yn dda'. Pryd y gwyddech am y cynlluniau hyn? Fel Gweinidog, dylech feddu ar wybodaeth arbenigol, felly, rhaid eich bod yn gallu penderfynu eich hun a oes angen y penderfyniadau hyn. A yw'n wir, bob tro pan fydd Aelod Cynulliad yn dod atoch—fel y dywedodd y Llywydd, yr ydym i gyd yn Aelodau cydradd—y bydd yn rhaid ichi ystyried y mater a dweud, 'Trefnaf ymchwiliad; credaf fod hynny'n syniad da'? Dyna beth yr ydych yn ei ddweud, mae'n ymddangos?

O gofio bod hyn yn fater brys—nid wyf yn

that—why do we have to wait so long for the terms of reference, and for an individual to be in place? You said that you do not want a yes-man or a yes-woman, but what is that a ‘yes’ to? Would that be a ‘yes’ to your plans? [Interruption.] You said ‘yes-man’ or ‘yes-woman’.

In respect of timing, you say that this is not being kicked into the long grass on the other side of the Assembly elections. Are you giving us an assurance that the decision on this and all other issues waiting in the long grass in south-west Wales and Powys will be made before the Assembly elections, so that we can see what Labour is up to in terms of this restructuring and the threats to hospital services throughout Wales—in rural Wales and in Llanelli?

Up and down Wales we see these threats, and it seems to me that it is convenient for the Minister and for the Government, to kick it into the long grass. I cannot see any other possible explanation for it, and I deplore it. The only part that I agree with is that patient safety is paramount, but the decision has been taken. We have this wimpish statement that you think that emergency services should be reinstated, but they cannot be reinstated and that pre-judges the decision. It is totally unsatisfactory, and part of your statement seems to indicate that it is done for the convenience of consultants. I understand the bit about clinical services, but you are talking about the impact of the working time directives, and they are chickens coming home to roost; you were warned about this, but you told us that services would not be reduced because of it—[Interruption.] Do you want to say now that services will be reduced because of it? You cannot have it both ways. You have said previously that services would not be under threat because of the working time directive, but here we have it: because of the,

‘new consultant contract, the wider European Working Time Directive,’

and so on, this decision has been forced upon us.

amau hynny—pam y mae’n rhaid inni aros cyhyd am y cylch gorchwyl, ac i unigolyn gael ei benodi? Dywedech nad oeddech am gael rhywun a fyddai’n amenio popeth, ond amenio beth? Ai amenio’ch cynlluniau chi? [Torri ar draws.] ‘Rhywun sy’n amenio popeth’ oedd eich geiriau.

O ran yr amseriad, yr oeddech yn dweud nad yw hyn yn cael ei roi o’r neilltu tan ar ôl etholiadau’r Cynulliad. A ydych yn rhoi sicrwydd inni y caiff y penderfyniad ar hyn, a phob mater arall sydd wedi’i ohirio yn y de-orllewin ac ym Mhowys, ei wneud cyn etholiadau’r Cynulliad, fel y gallwn weld beth y mae Llafur yn ei wneud o ran yr ailstrwythuro hwn a’r bygythiadau i wasanaethau ysbyty ledled Cymru—yng nghefn gwlad Cymru ac yn Llanelli?

Ar hyd a lled Cymru gwelwn y bygythiadau hyn, ac ymddengys i mi ei fod yn gyfleus i’r Gweinidog ac i’r Llywodraeth anghofio amdanynt. Ni welaf ddim esboniad posibl arall iddo, ac mae’n warthus. Yr unig ran y cytunaf â hi yw bod diogelwch cleifion yn hollbwysig, ond mae’r penderfyniad wedi ei wneud. Mae gennym ddatganiad gwan lle y credwch y dylid adfer y gwasanaethau brys ond na ellir eu hadfer, ac mae hynny’n achub y blaen ar y penderfyniad. Mae’n hollol anfoddhaol, ac ymddengys bod rhan o’ch datganiad yn dweud iddo gael ei wneud er mwyn cyfleustra meddygon ymgynghorol. Deallaf y rhan am wasanaethau clinigol, ond yr ydych yn sôn am effaith cyfarwyddebau oriau gwaith, ac mae hon yn broblem sy’n dechrau dod i’r golwg; cawsoch eich rhybuddio am hyn, ond dywedasoed wrthym na fyddai gwasanaethau’n cael eu cwtogi o’r herwydd—[Torri ar draws.] A ydych am ddweud yn awr y caiff gwasanaethau eu cwtogi o’r herwydd? Ni allwch ei chael hi’r ddwy ffordd. Yr ydych wedi dweud o’r blaen na fyddai gwasanaethau dan fygythiad oherwydd y gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith, ond dyma hi; oherwydd

y contract newydd i feddygon ymgynghorol, y Gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ehangach ar Oriau Gwaith,

ac yn y blaen, gorfodwyd y penderfyniad hwn arnom.

This whole review looks at the question of how to do it. It looks at the process, not at the substance of the decision. In other words, the substance is that you want to remain the same, and you gave that away when you talked about the yes-man or the yes-woman. If that is an issue, it means that you have an agenda to run down services at Prince Philip Hospital, as I suspect you do elsewhere throughout Wales, and it is time that this Labour Government came clean about that.

Brian Gibbons: There were not too many questions there, but there were a lot of assertions. First of all, it is not true to say that the consultation on 'Designed for Life' resulted in decisions being kicked into the long grass all over Wales. I am surprised that you say that. As Christine Gwyther told us on many occasions, your involvement in that consultation process was notable for your absence; the questions that you asked reflect that non-participation, and your obvious non-interest at that juncture. In many parts of Wales, significant change has taken place on the back of reconfiguration, and I am just amazed that you would come here and try to assert otherwise.

Equally, you asked about a letter to the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust, commending it on what it had done. No such letter went to the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust. To help you, I think that you may have been referring to a letter that I wrote to Carmarthenshire Community Health Council; I am happy to discuss that if you will confirm that that is the letter that you meant. However, I wrote no letter to the NHS trust.

The reason this has come to a head this week is because of representations made to the First Minister and I, and that meeting took place at the beginning of this week. Kirsty Williams has previously made representations that have not lead to an inquiry, so your assertion that, every time a Member makes a representation about a concern, I respond with an inquiry, is simply not true. The concerns that Kirsty Williams brought to me were investigated and, on the

Mae'r holl adolygiad yn edrych ar y cwestiwn sut i'w wneud. Mae'n edrych ar y broses, nid ar sylwedd y penderfyniad. Mewn geiriau eraill, y sylwedd yw eich bod am barhau'r un fath, a datgelwyd hynny gennych wrth sôn am rywun a fyddai'n amenio popeth. Os yw hynny'n broblem, mae'n golygu bod gennych agenda i gwtogi gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, fel y gwnewch mewn mannau eraill ledled Cymru, mi gredaf, ac mae'n bryd i'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon gyfaddef hynny.

Brian Gibbons: Nid oedd yna fawr ddim cwestiynau, ond yr oedd nifer o honiadau. Yn gyntaf oll, nid yw'n wir dweud bod yr ymgynghori ar 'Cynllun Oes' wedi golygu bod penderfyniadau wedi eu rhoi o'r neilltu ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn dweud hynny. Fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther wrthym droeon, yr oedd eich rhan chi yn y broses ymgynghori honno'n nodedig am nad oeddech yn bresennol; yr oedd y cwestiynau a ofynnwyd gennych yn adlewyrchu'r diffyg cyfranogiad hwnnw, a'ch diffyg diddordeb amlwg bryd hynny. Mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, mae newid mawr wedi digwydd yn sgil ail-gyflunio, ac yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn dod yma ac yn ceisio honni fel arall.

Yn yr un modd, yr oeddech yn sôn am lythyr a anfonwyd at Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin, yn ei chanmol am yr hyn yr oedd wedi ei wneud. Nid aeth llythyr o'r fath at Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin. I'ch helpu, yr oeddech, mi gredaf, yn cyfeirio at lythyr a ysgrifennais at Gyngor Iechyd Cymuned sir Gaerfyrddin; yr wyf yn fodlon trafod hynny gyda chi os gwnewch chi gadarnhau mai dyna'r llythyr yr oeddech yn sôn amdano. Fodd bynnag, nid ysgrifennais lythyr o gwbl at ymddiriedolaeth y GIG.

Mae hyn wedi dod i'r amlwg yr wythnos hon oherwydd y sylwadau a wnaed i'r Prif Weinidog a minnau, a chynhaliwyd y cyfarfod hwnnw ddechrau'r wythnos hon. Mae Kirsty Williams wedi gwneud sylwadau o'r blaen nad ydynt wedi arwain at ymchwiliad, felly, nid yw eich honiad fy mod yn ymateb gydag ymchwiliad bob tro pan fydd Aelod yn mynegi pryder yn wir o gwbl. Ymchwiliwyd i'r pryderon a fynegwyd wrthyf gan Kirsty Williams, ac ar sail yr hyn

basis of what she said, we felt that recommendations had to be made to Powys NHS Trust. Kirsty's colleague, Jenny Randerson, criticised me for that, yet I was responding to the need on an appropriate basis.

Nick, I think that you misunderstand the European working time directive. I know, from your previous contributions, that you have not read many of the documents in relation to 'Designed for Life', but it is absolutely at the core of that strategy that the formation of service, and the way in which services are delivered in Wales, must be re-designed in line with the pressures that the European working time directive will create. That is nothing new, and the fact that it may be an issue in this case is nothing new whatsoever. Our challenge is not to run down the health service in Wales; quite the contrary. Our challenge, in the face of requirements that are not necessarily under our control, such as the European working time directive, is to ensure that we have a resilient health service in Wales, which will, in the face of requirements that are not necessarily under our control, such as the European working time directive, be able to provide state-of-the art, quality care for all people in Wales. To deliver that, we will need to change, and change can be difficult, but to say that we are suddenly changing the rules of the game, as Nick suggested, is completely wrong.

2.20 p.m.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I wish to address two issues, the first of which relates to the reasons for the decision and its nature and timing. As your statement said, these plans have been around for about two years. Why has this decision come now? You have had the power to deal with these issues throughout that time, yet you have left it, and now, in a panic that Llanelli might be lost by the Labour party again—it stretches credibility to think that the decision is not connected with the election—you have made a spur of the moment decision to implement an inquiry. It is clearly a rushed decision, because you do not really have any proposals on how it will be implemented. The message is clear to the people who are trying

a ddywedodd, teimlwyd bod yn rhaid gwneud argymhellion i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Powys. Cefais fy meirniadu gan Jenny Randerson, cyd-Aelod Kirsty Williams, am hynny, ac eto yr oeddwn yn ymateb i'r angen ar sail briodol.

Nick, credaf ichi gamddeall y gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ar oriau gwaith. Gwn, o'ch cyfraniadau blaenorol, nad ydych wedi darllen llawer o'r dogfennau mewn cysylltiad â 'Cynllun Oes', ond wrth wraidd y strategaeth honno rhaid i ffurf y gwasanaeth, a'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, gael eu hail-lunio yn unol â'r pwysau y bydd y gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd yn eu creu. Nid yw'n hynny'n beth newydd, ac nid yw'r ffaith y gall fod yn broblem yn y mater hwn yn rhywbeth newydd o gwbl. Ein her ni yw peidio â beirniadu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru; i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr. Ein her ni, yn wyneb gofynion nad ydynt o reidrwydd dan ein rheolaeth ni, megis y gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ar oriau gwaith, yw sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth iechyd cadarn yng Nghymru a fydd, yn wyneb gofynion nad ydynt o reidrwydd dan ein rheolaeth, megis y gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ar oriau gwaith, yn gallu darparu'r gofal gorau o safon i holl bobl Cymru. I wneud hynny bydd angen i ni newid, a gall newid fod yn anodd, ond mae dweud ein bod yn sydyn yn newid rheolau'r gêm, fel yr awgrymodd Nick, yn hollol anghywir.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Hoffwn ymdrin â dau fater, ac mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r rhesymau dros y penderfyniad a'i natur a'i amseriad. Fel y dywedwyd yn eich datganiad, mae'r cynlluniau hyn wedi bod ar y gweill ers tua dwy flynedd. Pam y gwnaed y penderfyniad hwn yn awr? Yr oedd y pŵer gennych i ddelio â'r materion hyn drwy gydol yr amser hwnnw, ac eto nid aethoch i'r afael ag ef, ac yn awr, mewn panig y gallai'r blaid Lafur golli sedd Llanelli unwaith eto—mae'n anodd credu nad yw'r penderfyniad yn gysylltiedig â'r etholiad—yr ydych wedi gwneud penderfyniad yn y fan a'r lle i gychwyn ymchwiliad. Mae'n amlwg yn benderfyniad brys, oherwydd nid oes

to run the NHS throughout Wales: do not try to do anything until after 3 May, because if you are doing anything that might affect a Labour Member's constituency in a marginal area, you will find that the Government will get in your way. I frequently ask you to put your mind to issues that concern me throughout Wales, which are mainly issues in my constituency. I have written to you this week about the loss of the dermatology ward at the University Hospital of Wales, a situation on which the local health board's own documentation said that it has lessons to learn in terms of the consultation process. I ask you to intervene to reverse the closure of this ward because of the distress that it is causing people. So that I can get my name mentioned many times, I place it on record that I have done this.

The second issue that I wish to raise relates to a comment in your statement that there are important plans in an advanced stage of preparation for new investments in planned surgery services at Prince Philip Hospital. In my view, those investments need to be firmly agreed and in the public domain before other services. I entirely agree that that is the approach that should have been taken from the start in the reorganisation process, but it is not the approach that has been taken until now. When did you change your mind? Why do we suddenly have a new criterion applied? It has not been applied in north Wales or elsewhere in west and mid Wales? Suddenly, you must have the new services in place before you change the old services. It is excellent, but it has financial implications. What calculations have you done of the financial implications of applying that throughout Wales? My constituents in Cardiff Central would be grateful if that were to be applied in our area, because that is the type of approach to the reorganisation process that we should see everywhere.

I wish to express my deep concern at the letter that you received this morning from the trust, saying that it would be unable to provide a safe service and that it provides

gennyh ddim cynigion a dweud y gwir sut y caiff ei weithredu. Mae'r neges yn glir i'r bobl sy'n ceisio rhedeg y GIG ledled Cymru: peidiwch â cheisio gwneud dim tan ar ôl 3 Mai, oherwydd os ydych yn gwneud unrhyw beth a allai effeithio ar etholaeth Aelod Llafur mewn ardal ymylol, fe welwch y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eich rhwystro. Gofynnaf yn aml ichi ystyried materion sydd o bryder i mi ledled Cymru, sef materion yn fy etholaeth i yn bennaf. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch yr wythnos hon yngylch colli'r ward dermatoleg yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, sefyllfa lle y dywedodd dogfennaeth y bwrdd iechyd lleol ei hun fod ganddo wersi i'w dysgu yn y broses ymgynghori. Gofynnaf ichi ymyrryd i newid y bwriad i gau'r ward hon oherwydd y trallod y mae'n ei achosi i bobl. Er mwyn sicrhau y caiff fy enw ei grybwyll lawer gwaith, hoffwn iddo gael ei gofnodi fy mod wedi gwneud hyn.

Mae'r ail fater yr wyf am ei godi yn ymwneud â sylw yn eich datganiad fod cynlluniau pwysig wedi symud ymlaen yn sylweddol ar gyfer buddsoddiadau newydd mewn gwasanaethau llawdriniaeth arfaethedig yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip. Yn fy marn i, mae angen cytuno'n gadarn ar y buddsoddiadau hynny a'u gwneud yn gyhoeddus cyn gwasanaethau eraill. Cytunaf yn llwyr mai dyna'r ymagwedd y dylid bod wedi cael ei mabwysiadu o'r cychwyn yn y broses ad-drefnu, ond nid dyna'r ymagwedd a fabwysiadwyd hyd yma. Pryd y gwnaethoch newid eich meddwl? Pam mae maen prawf newydd yn sydyn wedi ei ddefnyddio? Ni chafodd ei ddefnyddio yn y gogledd nac unman arall yn y gorllewin na'r canolbarth? Yn sydyn, rhaid i'r gwasanaethau newydd fod ar waith cyn ichi newid yr hen wasanaethau. Mae'n rhagorol, ond mae iddo oblygiadau ariannol. Pa gyfrifiadau a wnaethoch o'r goblygiadau ariannol o ddefnyddio hynny ledled Cymru? Byddai fy etholwyr yng Nghanol Caerdydd yn ddiolchgar pe bai hynny'n cael ei ddefnyddio yn ein hardal hwy, oherwydd dyna'r math o ymagwedd at y broses ad-drefnu y dylem ei gweld ym mhobman.

Hoffwn fynegi fy mhryder dwys ynghylch y llythyr a gawsoch y bore yma gan yr ymddiriedolaeth, yn dweud na fyddai'n gallu darparu gwasanaeth diogel a'i bod yn rhoi

unambiguous advice, and so on. When did you first know that the trust was taking action on the basis of safety? Did you know last week or back in December? Has your department received other correspondence indicating that its decision is based on patients' safety? NHS managers and clinicians throughout Wales will be concerned about the idea that patients' safety is not the first issue to be taken into account.

Brian Gibbons: You ask, 'Why now?' and I tried to explain that. As Helen Mary pointed out with reference to the community health council, the process formally finished with the CHC's endorsement of the proposals in November. Clearly, any action before November would have been entirely inappropriate for the very reasons that you mentioned in relation to the dermatology unit in University Hospital Wales. The process finished and, as far as I was concerned, the local process had been gone through, the decision had been made and local agreement had been achieved and we would be moving towards implementation. That was the situation in early December. However, as I pointed out, towards the middle of December, concerns were voiced to me by the local representative from Llanelli. So, the earliest that I was in a position to start taking a different view was when the local Member started raising her concerns. As I have already explained, I told Catherine Thomas that I would consider the implications of what she said over Christmas and would take a view early in the new year.

It was early in the new year when I was definitively informed that the trust would go ahead with the decision to transfer services at the beginning of February. As I said in my statement, I was surprised by that. The reasons for it were stated in the motion passed here in relation to alternative provision being put in place. I think that that was one of the lessons that we have learned. As I said in that debate, I do not accept for a minute that the changes being put in place were progressing without a view of the future because we know that the new hospital in Tenby, south Pembrokeshire is being built along with the new hospitals in Porthmadog,

cyngor diamwys, ac yn y blaen. Pryd y daethoch i wybod gyntaf fod yr ymddiredolaeth yn cymryd camau ar sail diogelwch? A oeddech yn gwybod wythnos diwethaf neu fis Rhagfyr diwethaf? A yw eich adran wedi cael unrhyw ohebiaeth arall yn dweud bod ei phenderfyniad yn seiliedig ar ddiogelwch cleifion? Bydd rheolwyr a chlinigwyr y GIG ledled Cymru yn pryderu o glywed nad diogelwch cleifion yw'r mater cyntaf sy'n cael ei ystyried.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydych yn gofyn, 'Pam yn awr?' a cheisiais egluro hynny. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary wrth gyfeirio at y cyngor iechyd cymuned, daeth y broses i ben yn ffurfiol wrth i'r cyngor iechyd cymuned gymeradwyo'r cynigion ym mis Tachwedd. Yn amlwg, byddai unrhyw gamau a gymerwyd cyn mis Tachwedd wedi bod yn hollol amhriodol am yr union resymau a grybwyllwyd gennych mewn perthynas â'r uned dermatoleg yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Daeth y broses i ben, ac o'm rhan i yr oedd y broses leol wedi ei chwblhau, yr oedd y penderfyniad wedi ei wneud a chytundeb lleol wedi ei sicrhau a byddem yn symud tuag at ei weithredu. Dyna oedd y sefyllfa ddechrau mis Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, tua chanol mis Rhagfyr, mynegwyd pryderon gan y cynrychiolydd lleol o Lanelli. Felly, y cynharaf y gallwn ddechrau llunio barn wahanol oedd pan ddechreuodd yr Aelod lleol fynegi ei phryderon. Fel yr wyf eisoes wedi ei egluro, dywedais wrth Catherine Thomas y byddwn yn ystyried goblygiadau'r hyn a ddywedodd dros y Nadolig ac yn llunio casgliad yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd y cefais wybod yn bendant y byddai'r ymddiredolaeth yn mynd ymlaen â'r penderfyniad i drosglwyddo gwasanaethau ddechrau mis Chwefror. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, yr oedd hynny'n fy synnu. Nodwyd y rhesymau drosto yn y cynnig a dderbyniwyd yma mewn cysylltiad â rhoi darpariaeth amgen ar waith. Credaf mai dyna oedd un o'r gwersi a ddysgwyd gennym. Fel y dywedais yn y ddadl honno, ni dderbyniaf am eiliad fod y newidiadau a oedd ar waith yn mynd ymlaen heb ystyried y dyfodol, oherwydd gwyddom fod yr ysbyty newydd yn Ninbych-y-Pysgod, de sir Benfro, yn cael ei adeiladu ynghyd â'r ysbytai

Holywell, Caerphilly and the Cynon valley. I could mention many other areas, for example Ebbw Vale. There are many parts of Wales where the future shape of the health service is becoming apparent before the full-scale change takes place. However, that does not seem to be the case in the Llanelli situation where there were some operational issues and concerns about the ambulance service in particular.

On the point about UHW and the dermatology unit, it is my understanding—and if it is incorrect, then I am more than happy to receive representations from you—that a local agreement has been reached on the provision of bespoke beds, or targeted beds, for the dermatology unit in UHW, with a number of beds earmarked for specialist use. The unit, which was at the centre of the controversy, will not continue, but local agreement has been reached on ring-fenced beds being made available with additional flexible provision, depending on the number of patients who will use that service. Clearly, if you say that that is incorrect and that local agreement has not been reached on that basis, I would be pleased to receive any correspondence that you may want to send me.

2.30 p.m.

Catherine Thomas: Thank you for your statement, Minister, following the announcement that there will be an inquiry into how Carmarthenshire community health council and NHS trust have dealt with the removal of emergency surgery from Llanelli. I am deeply sorry, and deeply regret the news that emergency surgery is to leave Llanelli tomorrow. My constituents will be devastated on hearing this news. However, if there is a safety issue, I understand that their safety must always come first. During the time that the service is not there, I ask that their needs be met; for example, for constituents who live primarily in the town area of Llanelli, their needs would be better met in Morriston, rather than Glangwili.

This inquiry has the total backing of the local

newydd ym Mhorthmadog, Treffynnon, Caerffili a Chwm Cynon. Gallwn sôn am lawer ardal arall, er enghraifft, Glynabwy. Mae llawer rhan o Gymru lle mae dyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd yn dod yn amlwg cyn i'r newid ar raddfa lawn ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, nid felly y mae yn ôl pob tebyg yn Llanelli, lle yr oedd rhai problemau a phryderon gweithredol ynghylch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn arbennig.

O ran Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru a'r uned dermatoleg, deallaf—ac os yw hyn yn anghywir, yna yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon derbyn sylwadau gennyh—fod cytundeb lleol wedi ei sicrhau ar ddarparu gwelyau arbennig, neu welyau wedi eu targedu, ar gyfer yr uned dermatoleg yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, a nifer o welyau wedi eu clustnodi at ddefnydd arbenigol. Ni fydd yr uned, a oedd wrth wraidd y ddadl, yn parhau, ond daethpwyd i gytundeb lleol i sicrhau bod gwelyau wedi eu neilltuo ar gael gyda darpariaeth hyblyg ychwanegol, yn dibynnu ar nifer y cleifion a fydd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Yn amlwg, os dywedwch fod hynny'n anghywir ac na chafwyd cytundeb lleol ar y sail honno, byddwn yn fodlon derbyn unrhyw ohebiaeth yr hoffech ei hanfon ataf.

Catherine Thomas: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog, yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad y bydd ymchwiliad i'r modd y mae cyngor iechyd cymuned ac ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin wedi delio â dileu llawdriniaethau brys yn Llanelli. Mae'n flin iawn gennyf am hynny, ac mae'n drueni mawr gennyf glywed y newyddion bod llawdriniaeth frys i adael Llanelli yfory. Bydd fy etholwyr yn hynod siomedig o glywed y newyddion hwn. Fodd bynnag, os oes pryder ynglŷn a diogelwch, deallaf mai eu diogelwch hwy yw'r ystyriaeth bwysicaf. Yn ystod y cyfnod pan na fydd y gwasanaeth ar gael yno, gofynnaf am i'w hanghenion gael eu diwallu; er enghraifft, ar gyfer etholwyr sy'n byw yn ardal tref Llanelli yn bennaf, byddai modd diwallu eu hanghenion hwy yn well yn Nhreforys yn hytrach nag yng Nglangwili.

Caiff yr ymchwiliad hwn gefnogaeth lwyr yr

MP, Llanelli Town Council, Llanelli Rural Council, as well as over 40,000 constituents who signed a petition to retain the service. I must comment on some of the remarks been made by Members of the opposition. While I am disappointed by what they have said, I am not surprised. If they knew Llanelli, as my constituents and I do, they would know that, if ever a situation warranted an inquiry, this is it. I am deeply offended by some of the accusations that have been made, because I believe that all Assembly Members know how many times I have got on my feet to defend my constituency and the local health service. I have also made it clear in the past that I hope that anything in relation to that local health service will happen as quickly as possible, for the sake of my constituents. As I said on Tuesday, while wanting a thorough inquiry, I hope that this inquiry will be expeditious and that it does not drag on; if it can be done, I hope that we will have an outcome before the election, for the sake of everyone involved.

I wish to make several points, and reinforce some points that have been made. It is important that I put certain things on record. Impartiality is of huge importance, as I stated on Tuesday. I am pleased that you have given an assurance, Minister, that the individual who will oversee this inquiry will have no links with the health community in Carmarthenshire. However, I also hope that this appointment can be made as soon as possible. Can you also give an assurance this afternoon that the process will be open and transparent, and that concerns that I have raised with you as the local AM will be investigated and answered, and also that my constituents will have an opportunity to feed into this inquiry?

The manner in which the trust and the CHC have dealt with the removal of emergency surgery has left a great deal to be desired, and has not exactly embraced the Nolan principles of openness and transparency. That was evident in the number of votes that the CHC held to determine whether its members supported the removal or retention of the service. The perception is that the CHC kept

AS lleol, Cyngor Tref Llanelli, Cyngor Gwledig Llanelli, yn ogystal â thros 40,000 o etholwyr a lofnododd ddeiseb i gadw'r gwasanaeth. Rhaid imi gyfeirio at rai o'r sylwadau a wnaeth Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau. Er fy mod wedi fy siomi gan yr hyn a ddywedwyd ganddynt, nid yw'n syndod imi. Pe baent yn adnabod Llanelli, cystal â'm hetholwyr a minnau, byddent yng gwybod, os oedd sefyllfa erioed yn haeddu ymchwiliad, mai dyma hi. Mae rhai o'r cyhuddiadau a wnaethpwyd wedi peri loes i mi, oherwydd credaf fod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gwybod sawl gwaith yr wyf wedi codi ar fy nhraed i amddiffyn fy etholaeth a'r gwasanaeth iechyd lleol. Yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir yn y gorffennol hefyd fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd unrhyw beth sy'n berthnasol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd lleol hwnnw yn digwydd mor gyflym â phosibl, er lles fy etholwyr. Fel y dywedais ddydd Mawrth, er fy mod am gael ymchwiliad trylwyr, gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn yn un cyflym ac na fydd yn llusgo ymlaen; ac os gellir gwneud hynny gobeithio y cawn ganlyniad cyn yr etholiad, er lles pawb dan sylw.

Fe hoffwn wneud nifer o bwyntiau, ac atgyfnerthu rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd. Mae'n bwysig immi nodi rhai pethau. Mae'r elfen ddiuedd yn bwysig iawn, fel y soniais ddydd Mawrth. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi rhoi sicrwydd, Weinidog, na fydd gan y sawl a fydd yn goruchwylio'r ymchwiliad hwn unrhyw gysylltiad â'r gymuned iechyd yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio hefyd y gellir gwneud y penodiad hwn cyn gynted â phosibl. A allwch roi sicrwydd y prynhawn yma y bydd y broses yn agored ac yn dryloyw, ac yr ymchwilir i'r pryderon a gyflwynais ichi fel yr AC lleol ac y cawn atebion iddynt, a hefyd y caiff fy etholwyr gyfle i gymryd rhan yn yr ymchwiliad hwn?

Mae'r modd yr ymdriniodd yr ymddiriedolaeth a'r cyngor iechyd cymuned â rhoi'r gorau i lawdriniaeth frys ymhell o fod yn foddhaol, ac nid yw wedi mabwysiadu egwyddorion Nolan o fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw yn dda iawn. Yr oedd hynny'n amlwg yn nifer y pleidleisiau a gynhaliodd y cyngor iechyd cymuned i benderfynu a oedd ei aelodau'n cefnogi'r bwriad i ddileu ynteu i

voting until the desired outcome was reached. Furthermore, it did not inspire public confidence that some of the voting was undertaken by secret ballot. I hope that the inquiry will investigate these points thoroughly.

I hope that the inquiry will ask why the announcement to remove the service tomorrow was made so abruptly at the trust board meeting last Thursday, knowing that you have already said that certain alternative provision was not in place. The inquiry must also investigate why the trust asked a much loved and highly respected surgeon to leave approximately three months before he needed to do so, thus creating a situation in which the service was no longer safe. Why did that happen? I also want to know what is being done to make the service safe, so that emergency surgery can return to Llanelli as soon as possible. I know that an important meeting is being held tomorrow in the trust to explore this, and I understand that, because of the sensitivity of that meeting, you may not be able to expand on that this afternoon. I would also like to know what the trust has been doing since early December to recruit Mr Evans's replacement. Surely this should have been a priority. Many more questions need to be asked, but I will provide these in a written communication to you.

Finally, I reiterate that I hope that this inquiry will be as comprehensive as possible, because the behaviour of both the trust and the community health council have angered my constituents, who feel badly let down. The way in which things have been handled by the CHC and the trust are best summed up in the words of the editorial of today's local paper, which describes recent affairs as a 'shambles' and goes on to say that, as an exercise in how not to do it, it deserves a place in all future manuals for health service bureaucrats.

gadw'r gwasanaeth. Y syniad yw fod y cyngor iechyd cymuned wedi dal i bleidleisio nes iddynt gael y canlyniad a ddymument. Yn ogystal, nid oedd y ffaith iddynt gynnal rhywfaint o'r pleidleisio drwy bleidlais gudd yn fawr o hwb i hyder y cyhoedd. Gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn ymchwilio'n drylwyr i'r pwyntiau hyn.

Gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn gofyn pam y cafodd y cyhoeddiad i ddileu'r gwasanaeth yfory ei wneud mor ddisymwth yng nghyfarfod bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth ddydd Iau diwethaf, o gofio ichi ddweud eisoes nad oedd darpariaeth amgen sicr ar waith. Rhaid i'r ymchwiliad hefyd ymchwilio i'r rheswm pam y gofynnodd yr ymddiriedolaeth i lawfeddyg mor boblogaidd ac uchel ei barch adael tua thri mis cyn bod angen iddo wneud hynny, a thrwy hynny greu sefyllfa a oedd yn golygu nad oedd y gwasanaeth bellach yn ddiogel. Pam y digwyddodd hynny? Yr wyf hefyd am gael gwybod beth sy'n cael ei wneud i ddiogelu'r gwasanaeth, fel y gall llawdriniaeth frys ddychwelyd i Lanelli cyn gynted â phosibl. Gwn fod cyfarfod pwysig yn cael ei gynnal yn yr ymddiriedolaeth yfory i edrych yn fanwl ar hyn, a deallaf, oherwydd sensitifrwydd y cyfarfod hwnnw, na allwch ymhelaethu ar hynny y prynhawn yma. Hoffwn wybod hefyd beth mae'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi ei wneud ers dechrau mis Rhagfyr i recriwtio olynnydd i Mr Evans. Oni ddylasai hyn fod yn flaenoriaeth? Mae angen gofyn llawer mwy o gwestiynau, ond byddaf yn darparu'r rheini mewn gohebiaeth ysgrifenedig atoch.

Yn olaf, pwysleisiaf fy ngobaith y bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn mor gynhwysfawr â phosibl, oherwydd mae ymddygiad yr ymddiriedolaeth a'r cyngor iechyd cymuned wedi cythruddo fy etholwyr, sydd wedi eu siomi'n fawr. Cafodd y ffordd y mae'r cyngor iechyd cymuned a'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi ymdrin â hyn ei chloriannu yng ngeiriau'r erthygl olygyddol yn rhifyn heddiw o'r papur lleol, sy'n disgrifio'r digwyddiadau diweddar fel annibendod, ac mae'n mynd ymlaen i ddweud ei fod, fel ymarferiad sut i beidio â gwneud pethau, yn haeddu ei le ym mhob llawlyfr yn y dyfodol i firocrataid y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Brian Gibbons: I know how you and the people of Llanelli feel about this difficult situation. I have said to you previously that I felt much the same as you around 10 or 12 years ago, when there were proposals to close Neath hospital. There was anger and resentment in the local area about what was going on there. I suspect that it was every bit as intense as what is being felt in Llanelli. I understand people's anger, because I felt it myself. When I became the Assembly Member for Aberavon, one of my commitments was to work to get a state-of-the-art replacement hospital for my constituents, because of the plans to close Neath hospital. That closure went ahead but, thankfully, Jane Hutt, the Minister for health at the time, was able to realise that commitment. However, because we could not see the shape of the future, those of us who lived in Neath Port Talbot were angry with that process. Therefore, I fully understand that local anger.

When I made inquiries about the ambulance service, I was surprised to discover that the ambulance protocols were not in place. Therefore, I agree with you in relation to your point that it would be more appropriate for people living particularly in the eastern part of the Llanelli area to go to Morriston Hospital, as opposed to Glangwili. I am sure that many people living to the west of Llanelli would be more than happy to go to Carmarthen, if they cannot go to Llanelli. However, I can easily see that people on the eastern side would certainly want the option of going to Morriston Hospital.

It is my commitment that we will get this business over and done with. However, I do not want to make a promise in the Assembly and then have people asking me in two or three months' time why it has not happened. For example, the initial expectation was that the inquiry into delayed transfers of care would take about two months, but, with all-party agreement, that has been extended to six months, because we want that to be a thorough root-and-branch, authoritative review. If this can be done in two weeks or two months, I will be happy, but I do not want people to say when the report is published that it is not worth the paper that it

Brian Gibbons: Gwn sut yr ydych chi a phobl Llanelli yn teimlo am y sefyllfa anodd hon. Yr wyf wedi sôn wrthyf yn y gorffennol fy mod yn teimlo'n debyg iawn ichi tua 10 i 12 mlynedd yn ôl pan oedd cynigion i gau ysbyty Castell-nedd. Yr oedd dicter a chwerwder yn yr ardal leol oherwydd yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd yno. Tybiaf ei fod lawn mor ddwys ag a deimlir yn Llanelli. Gallaf ddeall ddicter pobl, gan fy mod wedi teimlo felly fy hun. Pan ddeuthum yn Aelod Cynulliad dros Aberafan, un o'm hymrwymiaidau oedd gweithio i sicrhau ysbyty newydd modern i'm hetholwyr oherwydd y cynlluniau i gau ysbyty Castell-nedd. Cafodd yr ysbyty ei gau, ond, diolch byth, yr oedd yn bosibl i Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd ar y pryd, wireddu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, am na allem weld y dyfodol, yr oedd y rheini ohonom a oedd yn byw yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot yn ddig gyda'r broses honno. Felly, gallaf ddeall hyn llwyr y dicter lleol hwnnw.

Pan ymholais am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, synnais ddarganfod nad oedd y protocolau ambiwlans ar waith. Felly, cytunaf â chi ar eich pwynt y byddai'n fwy priodol i bobl sy'n byw yn rhan ddwyreiniol Llanelli yn arbennig fynd i Ysbyty Treforys, yn hytrach na Glangwili. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai nifer o bobl sy'n byw i'r gorllewin o Lanelli yn fwy na bodlon mynd i Gaerfyrddin os na allant fynd i Lanelli. Fodd bynnag, gallaf weld y byddai pobl sy'n byw ar yr ochr ddwyreiniol yn sicr am gael y dewis o fynd i Ysbyty Treforys.

Yr wyf yn ymrwymo i gau pen y mwdwl ar y busnes hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am wneud adduned yn y Cynulliad a chael pobl yn gofyn imi ymhen dau neu dri mis pam nad yw wedi digwydd. Er enghraifft, y disgwyliadau cychwynnol oedd y byddai'r ymchwiliad i'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn cymryd tua dau fis, ond gyda chytundeb trawsbleidiol ymestynnwyd hynny i chwe mis, oherwydd yr ydym am i hynny fod yn adolygiad trylwyr, awdurdodol, brig a bôn. Os yw'n bosibl gwneud hyn mewn pythefnos neu ddau fis, byddaf yn hapus, ond nid wyf am i bobl ddweud pan gyhoeddir yr adroddiad ei fod yn ddiwerth, oherwydd

is written on, as that would bring the whole process into disrepute. We want to have an authoritative chair. If that person can be appointed within two to three days, that would be all well and good, but I do not think that that is possible. We need an authoritative chair and an open and authoritative report. If it can be done within a month or two, I would be more than happy. I have no interest in this being dragged out. If we can do it, it will be done. However, it has to be a report that will attract public confidence, in terms of its authority and its resilience.

I agree that it is important that the public is involved in that exercise. As a member of a CHC, I have to tell you that members are not paid; they receive nothing for doing that. They do it because of their commitment to public services. There is nothing else in it for them.

2.40 p.m.

Although you have some very legitimate concerns about the process in the CHC, which we must get answers on, we need to appreciate, particularly at this difficult time, that CHCs are run by volunteers, as Jenny Randerson mentioned in relation to Cardiff. They are trying to deliver a public service. If they get it wrong, we need to know that, but I would not like to prejudge the commitment that people are making in that way.

In relation to the trust, the decision was made far more quickly than I expected. The decisive event seems to have been the resignation of a senior clinician at Llanelli. Following my statement in the Assembly a couple of weeks ago, the feedback that I had indirectly in relation to the attitude of senior clinicians in Carmarthenshire is that they were very concerned about the situation. I asked the deputy chief medical officer to go to Llanelli and provide me with an independent report on what was going on there. These are very important matters, and, as you said in your statement, people's lives are at risk. I really wanted an independent view from the deputy chief medical officer.

byddai hynny'n dwyn anfri ar yr holl broses. Yr ydym am gael cadeirydd awdurdodol. Os yw'n bosibl penodi'r person hwnnw ymhen dau neu dri diwrnod, gorau oll, ond ni chredaf fod hynny'n bosibl. Mae angen cadeirydd awdurdodol arnom ac adroddiad agored ac awdurdodol. Os yw'n bosibl gwneud hyn o fewn mis neu ddau, byddwn yn fwy na bodlon. Nid oes gennyf ddim diddordeb mewn gadael i hwn lusgo ymlaen. Os gallwn ei wneud, caiff ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddo fod yn adroddiad a fydd yn ennyn hyder y cyhoedd, o ran ei awdurdod a'i wydnwch.

Cytunaf ei bod yn bwysig cynnwys y cyhoedd yn yr ymarferiad hwnnw. Fel aelod o gyngor iechyd cymuned, rhaid imi ddweud wrthyhych nad yw aelodau'n cael eu talu; nid ydynt yn cael dim am wneud hynny. Maent yn gwneud y gwaith oherwydd eu hymrwymiad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ni chânt unrhyw fantais arall o hynny.

Er bod gennyhych rai pryderon dilys iawn am y broses yn y cyngor iechyd cymuned, a rhaid inni gael atebion iddynt, mae angen inni sylweddoli, yn arbennig yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn, mai gwirfoddolwyr sy'n rhedeg y cyngorau iechyd cymuned, fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson yng nghyd-destun Caerdydd. Maent yn ceisio darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Os aiff pethau o chwith, mae angen inni wybod hynny, ond ni fyddwn yn hoffi rhagfarnu'r ymrwymiad a wnaiff pobl fel hynny.

O ran yr ymddiriedolaeth, cafodd y penderfyniad ei wneud yn gyflymach nag yr oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl. Ymddengys mai'r digwyddiad allweddol oedd ymddiswyddiad uwch glinigydd yn Llanelli. Yn dilyn fy natganiad yn y Cynulliad ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, yr adborth a gefais yn anuniongyrchol am agwedd uwch glinigwyr yn sir Gaerfyrddin yw eu bod yn bryderus iawn am y sefyllfa. Gofynnais i'r dirprwy brif swyddog meddygol fynd i Lanelli i roi adroddiad annibynnol imi am yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd yno. Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig iawn, ac fel y dywedech yn eich datganiad, mae bywydau pobl yn y fantol. Yr oeddwn am gael barn annibynnol gan y

He confirmed that the single biggest event that led to the situation was the resignation of that senior clinician there.

We are still engaging in dialogue, notwithstanding this morning's letter from the trust's chairs. I am determined to get back to the trust's chairs to further explore matters with them, and to clarify their intentions. That is what I shall be doing later this afternoon.

In relation to Mr Evans's successor, I understand that an advertisement is being drawn up. He was a vascular surgeon as well as being a general surgeon, and so I think that the specification for the new surgeon requires vascular surgery as a sub-specialist interest, given that it demands a high level of expertise, particularly in emergency situations, such as dealing with aneurysms. Therefore, the advertisement has been drawn up to appoint a successor, who will be a specialist in vascular surgery. I hope that it will be placed in the relevant journals and will attract a good candidate.

Jonathan Morgan: The NHS trusts in Wales are expected to deliver on your agenda. They also work very closely with the regional offices of the NHS. Given that the consultation process was completed on 21 November, why were you not made aware of the problems until quite recently? Will you make available all correspondence between your department and the NHS trust and community health council in Carmarthenshire, so that people can be aware of the interaction that took place between your department and the relevant health bodies?

Brian Gibbons: Certainly. I did not write anything along the lines of what Nick Bourne suggested in relation to the trust, but what I thought was a private letter from me to the chief officer of the CHC in Carmarthen is in the public domain already. I would be quite happy to provide you with a copy of that letter. I will certainly check the records to see whether there is anything else. However, as far as I was concerned, there was a consultation process on the acute surgical review in Carmarthen, and so, until that

dirprwy brif swyddog meddygol. Cadarnhaodd mai'r un digwyddiad mawr a arweiniodd at y sefyllfa oedd ymddiswyddiad yr uwch glinigydd hwnnw yno.

Yr ydym yn dal i drafod, er y llythyr y bore yma gan gadeiryddion yr ymddiriedolaeth. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o fynd yn ôl at gadeiryddion yr ymddiriedolaeth i archwilio materion ymhellach gyda hwy, a chael eglurhad am eu bwriadau. Dyna y byddaf yn ei wneud yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma.

O ran olynydd i Mr Evans, deallaf fod hysbyseb wrthi'n cael ei llunio. Yr oedd Mr Evans yn llawfeddyg gwaedlestrol yn ogystal â llawfeddyg cyffredinol, felly credaf y dylai'r fanyleb ar gyfer y llawfeddyg newydd gynnwys llawdriniaeth waedlestrol fel diddordeb is-arbenigol, o gofio'i bod yn galw am lefel uchel o arbenigedd, yn arbennig mewn achosion brys, megis ymdrin ag ymlediadau. Felly, mae'r hysbyseb wedi ei llunio i benodi olynydd, a fydd yn arbenigwr mewn llawdriniaeth waedlestrol. Gobeithio y caiff ei chynnwys yn y cylchgronau perthnasol ac y bydd yn denu ymgeisydd da.

Jonathan Morgan: Disgwylir i ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru wireddu eich agenda. Maent hefyd yn gweithio'n agos iawn gyda swyddfeydd rhanbarthol y GIG. O gofio bod y broses ymgynghori wedi ei chwblhau ar 21 Tachwedd, pam na chawsoch wybod am y problemau tan yn gymharol ddiweddar? A wnewch chi sicrhau bod yr holl ohebiaeth a fu rhwng eich adran chi a'r ymddiriedolaeth GIG a'r cyngor iechyd cymuned yn sir Gaerfyrddin ar gael, er mwyn i bobl allu gweld y rhyngweithio a fu rhwng eich adran chi a'r cyrff iechyd perthnasol?

Brian Gibbons: Yn sicr. Nid ysgrifennais ddim byd tebyg i'r hyn a awgrymai Nick Bourne o safbwynt yr ymddiriedolaeth, ond mae'r hyn a gredwn oedd yn llythyr preifat gennyf fi at brif swyddog y cyngor iechyd cymuned yn sir Gaerfyrddin eisoes yn gyhoeddus. Byddwn yn fwy na bodlon rhoi copi o'r llythyr hwnnw i chi. Byddaf yn sicr yn edrych yn y cofnodion i weld a oes unrhyw beth arall. Fodd bynnag, o'm rhan i, cafwyd proses ymgynghori ar yr adolygiad o lawfeddygaeth aciwt yng Nghaerfyrddin,

process came to an end, it was not appropriate for me to be writing letters or issuing instructions to anyone along the lines that you suggest. I will check to see that there is no further correspondence, and I would be happy to make a copy of the letter that I wrote to the CHC available to you.

Gwenda Thomas: I also welcome your decision to hold an inquiry into this important issue, as I also believe that the consultation was not rigorous enough. I must voice my concern regarding what appears to be a complete lack of cross-boundary consultation. Should not meaningful cross-boundary consultation have been part of the due process?

Patients in the Upper Amman Valley, in my constituency, where the GP practice is administered from Carmarthenshire, and who are regularly referred to Prince Philip Hospital, have voiced concerns to me that they would want the right to chose to be treated in Morriston Hospital in the event of an emergency, rather than in Glangwili Hospital, which is far less accessible. I now understand that a meeting will take place on 5 February between the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust and the Swansea NHS Trust with regard to the future provision of emergency surgery. I ask for your assurances today, Minister, that cross-boundary considerations will be included in the terms of reference for this inquiry.

Brian Gibbons: I would be surprised if Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board and Swansea NHS Trust had not been consulted. I will ensure that, as part of the review, I will find out what consultation took place with Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board and with Swansea NHS Trust. What you say is quite right—people in the Amman Valley use Prince Philip Hospital, particularly for acute surgery, and one would have thought that if a service transfer had to take place then there would be proactive planning.

As I said earlier, the ambulance situation clearly concerned the community health council, and it surprised me, when I made my

felly, nes i'r broses honno ddod i ben, nid oedd yn briodol imi fod yn ysgrifennu llythyrau na chyhoeddi cyfarwyddiadau i neb fel yr awgrymwch. Byddaf yn edrych i sicrhau nad oedd dim gohebiaeth bellach, a byddwn yn fodlon darparu copi ichi o'r llythyr a ysgrifennais at y cyngor iechyd cymuned.

Gwenda Thomas: Croesawaf finnau eich penderfyniad i gynnal ymchwiliad i'r mater pwysig hwn, gan fy mod i hefyd yn credu nad oedd yr ymgynghoriad yn ddigon trylwyr. Rhaid imi leisio fy mhryder am yr hyn sy'n ymddangos yn fethiant llwyr i ymgynghori ar draws ffiniau. Oni ddylid bod wedi cael ymgynghori ystyrlon ar draws ffiniau fel rhan o'r drefn briodol?

Mae cleifion yn Nyffryn Aman Uchaf, yn fy etholaeth i, lle caiff practis y meddyg teulu ei weinyddu o sir Gaerfyrddin, ac sy'n cael eu cyfeirio'n rheolaidd i Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, wedi lleisio pryderon wrthyf y byddent am gael yr hawl i ddewis cael eu trin yn Ysbyty Treforys mewn argyfwng, yn hytrach nag yn Ysbyty Glangwili, sydd lawer yn llai cyfleus. Deallaf yn awr y bydd cyfarfod ar 5 Chwefror rhwng Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe ar ddarparu llawdriniaeth frys yn y dyfodol. Gofynnaf am sicrwydd gennyh heddiw, Weinidog, y caiff ystyriaethau traws-ffiniol eu cynnwys yn y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad hwn.

Brian Gibbons: Byddwn yn synnu pe na bai ymgynghori wedi bod â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe. Byddaf yn sicrhau fy mod, fel rhan o'r adolygiad, yn gweld i ba raddau yr ymgynghorwyd â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ac ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe. Mae'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gywir—mae pobl yn Nyffryn Aman yn defnyddio Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, yn arbennig ar gyfer llawdriniaeth aciwt, a byddech yn meddwl y byddai cynllunio rhagweithiol yn digwydd pe bai gwasanaeth yn gorfod cael ei drosglwyddo.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr oedd y sefyllfa ambiwlans yn amlwg yn peri pryder i'r cyngor iechyd cymuned, ac yr oeddwn yn

own inquiries on this matter, that issues such as those that you have raised did not seem to be satisfactorily resolved. Since I became aware of that, my officials have been liaising with the ambulance service on putting in place protocols that are more in line with what people would expect to be normal patient flows and that will be more likely to meet the aspirations of those who are closer to Morriston or Swansea end of things, compared to the Carmarthen end of things. Thank you for that point.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, yr wyf wedi gwrando'n ofalus ar eich datganiad, ac ar eich ymateb i'r cwestiynau. Yr hyn sy'n fy nharo yw bod yr wybodaeth y mae eich adran wedi ei chael am y sefyllfa yn sir Gaerfyrddin yn annigonol ac yn hwyr iawn yn eich cyrraedd. Yn sicr, yr oeddwn i fel Aelod etholedig sir Gaerfyrddin yn ymwybodol o'r pethau hynny lawer ynghynt nag oeddech chi fel Gweinidog. Dylech edrych ar y cysylltiadau hynny, a gofyn cwestiynau eithaf beirniadol i'ch adran ynghylch pam yn union yr oedd yr wybodaeth mor hwyr yn eich cyrraedd.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydych wedi cydnabod nad oes cynsail ar gyfer y penderfyniad yr ydych wedi ei gymryd. Mewn sefyllfa felly, mae'n bwysig bod meini prawf annibynnol a gwrthrychol y mae'n rhaid eu dilyn cyn eich bod yn dod i benderfyniad. Mae pob gwleidydd yn gwybod ei bod hi'n amhosibl diystyru goblygiadau gwleidyddol wrth wneud penderfyniad. Mae hynny'n wir am bawb ohonom. A wnewch chi gydnabod yr angen am feini prawf annibynnol a gwrthrychol i'w dilyn cyn dod i'r math o benderfyniad a wnaed gennych?

Brian Gibbons: I do not disagree with that. The guidance for consultation covers a lot of that. We have learned a lot in terms of how consultation needs to proceed in the light of the exercise that we have been engaged in under 'Designed for Life', and other strategies for that matter.

2.50 p.m.

There is a need to revisit that guidance in the

synnu, pan wneuthum fy ymholiadau fy hun yn y mater hwn, nad oedd materion fel y rhai a godwyd gennych fel pe baent wedi eu datrys yn foddhaol. Ers i mi ddod i wybod hynny, mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn cysylltu â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ynglŷn â chynnwys protocolau sy'n cydymffurfio'n fwy â'r hyn y byddai pobl yn ei ddisgwyl i fod yn arferol o gleifion ac a fydd yn fwy tebygol o fodloni disgwyliadau'r rheini sy'n nes at ardal Treforys neu Abertawe, o'u cymharu ag ardal Caerfyrddin. Diolch i chi am y pwynt hwnnw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, I have listened carefully to your statement, and to your responses to the questions put to you. What strikes me is that the information your department has received about the situation in Carmarthenshire was inadequate and very late in the day in reaching you. As the elected Member for Carmarthenshire, I was certainly aware of those factors long before you were, as Minister. You should take a look at those links, and ask some critical questions of your department about precisely why that information was so late in reaching you.

However, you have acknowledged that there is no precedent for the decision that you have taken. In such a situation, it is important that independent and objective criteria are set, which you must follow before reaching a decision. Every politician knows that it is impossible to disregard the political implications of any decision. That is true for us all. Will you acknowledge the need for independent and objective criteria to be followed before reaching the kind of decision that you made?

Brian Gibbons: Nid wyf yn anghytuno â hynny. Mae'r canllawiau ymgynghori'n cwmpasu llawer o hynny. Yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer am y modd y mae angen i ymgynghori fynd ymlaen yng ngoleuni'r ymarfer y buom yn gysylltiedig ag ef o dan 'Cynllun Oes', a strategaethau eraill o ran hynny.

Mae angen ailedrych ar y canllawiau hynny

light of experience. We are talking about a situation that has really only developed since we had the delegation from Llanelli, so I have to admit that, quite honestly, I have not even thought about some of the wider ramifications that you mentioned. However, you make a fair point about redesigning the consultation guidance. Even though, at one level, the guidance seems to have been complied with, if for some reason, subsequent to the ending of the formal process, concerns are raised about it, it might be useful—if possible—to establish criteria by which that process can be reviewed again, as in the situation in which we find ourselves today.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for taking such time over that statement.

yng ngoleuni profiad. Yr ydym yn siarad am sefyllfa sydd wedi datblygu mewn gwirionedd ers inni gael y ddirprwyaeth o Lanelli. Felly, rhaid imi gyfaddef, yn gwbl onest, nad wyf hyd yn oed wedi ystyried rhai o'r canlyniadau ehangach y cyfeirir atynt. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych bwynt teg o ran ailgynllunio'r canllawiau ymgynghori. Er bod y canllawiau, ar un lefel, i'w gweld wedi eu dilyn, os caiff pryderon eu mynegi amdanynt am ryw reswm, ar ôl i'r broses ffurfiol ddod i ben, gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol os yw'n bosibl-sefydlu meini prawf ar gyfer adolygu'r broses honno eto, fel yn sefyllfa yr ydym ynnddi heddiw.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i chi, Weinidog, am dreulio cymaint o amser ar y datganiad hwnnw.

Datganiad am y Cynllun Ail Gynnig yn Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd GIG Ardal Weston

Statement on the Second-offer Scheme at Weston Area Health NHS Trust

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): It gives me no pleasure to comment on this issue either. The second-offer scheme was set up in April 2004 to ensure that Welsh patients who might have had to wait over the maximum waiting time would receive their treatment in a timely manner. Patients could be referred to a NHS hospital in Wales or England or to an independent hospital. Since this scheme started, nearly 23,000 procedures have been carried out through it, with over 8,500 procedures provided by an alternative provider, such as a hospital in the independent sector or another NHS hospital.

Through regular checks of patients at Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, regrettably, a problem has come to light with regard to a small number of patients who were sent, through the scheme, to Weston Area Health NHS Trust for surgical procedures on the knee. This led to an independent review being carried out by the British Orthopaedic Association on behalf of Rhondda Cynon Taff Local Health Board and Weston Area Health NHS Trust. Pending the outcome of this review, all new knee surgery referrals to Weston were suspended.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid yw'n rhoi unrhyw bleser imi sôn am y mater hwn ychwaith. Sefydlwyd cynllun yr ail gynnig ym mis Ebrill 2004 i sicrhau y byddai cleifion o Gymru, a allai fod wedi gorfod aros yn hwy na'r amser aros hiraf, yn cael eu triniaeth yn amserol. Yr oedd yn bosibl cyfeirio cleifion i ysbyty'r GIG yng Nghymru neu yn Lloegr neu i ysbyty annibynnol. Ers cychwyn y cynllun hwn, mae bron 23,000 o driniaethau wedi eu cynnal dano, a dros 8,500 o driniaethau wedi eu gwneud gan ddarparwr amgen, megis ysbyty yn y sector annibynnol neu ysbyty GIG arall.

Drwy archwiliadau rheolaidd o gleifion yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, yn anffodus, mae problem wedi dod i'r amlwg o ran nifer fach o gleifion a anfonwyd, drwy'r cynllun, at Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd GIG Ardal Weston am lawdriniaethau ar y penglin. Arweiniodd hyn at wneud adolygiad annibynnol gan Gymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain ar ran Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf ac Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd GIG Ardal Weston. Cafodd yr holl achosion a gyfeiriwyd i Weston am lawdriniaeth penglin newydd eu hatal nes cael canlyniadau'r

adolygiad hwn.

The report has recommended that all patients who were sent to Weston for knee surgery under the second-offer scheme should have their x-rays reviewed. As a precaution, the second-offer team has also decided that all patients who went to Weston for orthopaedic surgery of any sort should have their x-rays reviewed. While the only concerns to date relate to knee surgery, all patients who have had joint surgery at Weston will therefore be offered a radiological review. Approximately 384 patients have been referred for knee surgery, 157 for hip surgery, and a further 152 for other orthopaedic procedures.

Mae'r adroddiad wedi argymhell y dylid adolygu adroddiadau pelydr-x yr holl gleifion a anfonwyd i Weston am lawdriniaeth pen-glin o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig. I fod yn sicr, mae'r tîm ail gynnig hefyd wedi penderfynu y dylai adroddiad pelydr-x pob claf a aeth i Weston i gael llawdriniaeth orthopedig o unrhyw fath gael ei adolygu. Er mai llawdriniaeth pen-glin yn unig sy'n peri pryder ar hyn o bryd, caiff pob claf a gafodd lawdriniaeth ar y cymalau yn Weston, felly, gynnig adolygiad radiolegol. Mae tua 384 o gleifion wedi cael eu cyfeirio am lawdriniaeth pen-glin, 157 am lawdriniaeth ar y glun, a 152 arall am driniaethau orthopedig eraill.

Jonathan Morgan: I start by welcoming the fact that the Minister has made a statement to the Assembly this afternoon, since I submitted an urgent question on this yesterday. I would like to raise a number of points with the Minister, of which he may or may not be aware, because the detail, or, rather, lack of detail, in his statement, is worrying. I do not know whether he is aware of what I am about to tell him and has chosen not to mention it, but there are a large number of concerns that I will now raise with him, as I have made my own inquiries in the past few hours to ascertain the background to this problem and what did, in fact, occur.

Jonathan Morgan: Dechreuaf drwy groesawu'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud datganiad i'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma, ers imi gyflwyno cwestiwn brys ar hyn ddoe. Hoffwn godi nifer o bwyntiau gyda'r Gweinidog y gallai fod yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Ond efallai nad yw, gan fod y manylion, neu'r diffyg manylion, yn ei ddatganiad yn peri pryder. Ni wn a yw'n ymwybodol o'r hyn yr wyf ar fin ei ddweud wrtho a'i fod wedi dewis peidio â sôn amdano, ond mae yna nifer fawr o bryderon y byddaf yn eu rhoi ger ei fron yn awr, gan fy mod wedi gwneud fy ymholiadau fy hun yn ystod yr ychydig oriau diwethaf i gael y cefndir i'r broblem hon, a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd mewn gwirionedd.

I understand, Minister, that surgeons in south Wales, who otherwise would have operated on those patients, were not told that their patients had been removed from their list and only found out when their patients presented with complications as a result of being operated on in Weston. In many cases, the procedures recommended by the south Wales surgeons were not even followed in Weston, and many patients received procedures that had not been determined by their surgeons in south Wales.

Deallaf, Weinidog, na chafodd llawfeddygon yn y de, a fyddai fel arall wedi gwneud llawdriniaeth ar y cleifion hynny, wybod bod eu cleifion wedi eu tynnu oddi ar eu rhestr, a phan oedd cleifion yn wynebu cymhlethdodau o ganlyniad i gael eu trin yn Weston y daethant i wybod am hyn. Mewn nifer o achosion, ni chafodd y gweithdrefnau sy'n cael eu hargymhell gan lawfeddygon y de eu dilyn yn Weston, hyd yn oed, a chafodd nifer o gleifion eu trin dan weithdrefnau nad oeddent wedi eu penderfynu gan eu llawfeddygon yn y de.

The knee replacement that is on offer in Weston, is, I understand, called a Kinemax. It is not on offer in south Wales, because here only two particular replacements are used:

Deallaf mai'r math a gynigir ar gyfer y weithdrefn lawfeddygol i osod pen-glin newydd yn Weston yw Kinemax. Ni chaiff ei gynnig yn y de, am mai dim ond dau fath

one is called a PFC Sigma, and the other a NexGen. I understand from surgeons in south Wales that they do not have the equipment to correct problems that arise from a patient's having been given a Kinemax knee replacement. Furthermore, many south Wales surgeons have had to perform additional replacements since those complications have arisen.

I also understand that the surgeons operating in Weston were not specialist knee surgeons, but general orthopaedic surgeons. Looking at the 384 people who were referred to Weston for knee surgery, how many of those received a Kinemax knee replacement and how many of those have now had corrective surgery as a result? How many have had additional knee replacements by south Wales surgeons in order to remove the defective knee replacements that had been put in by the Swedish surgeons who were operating in Weston?

Why were the south Wales surgeons unaware of the fact that patients had been removed from their lists? That needs careful examination, if the second-offer scheme is to gain people's confidence for the future. Surgeons who have been working closely with their patients, who have then found that those patients have been removed from their lists, need to have confidence in the system. Patients ought to be aware of the fact that their surgeons did not know that they had been removed from the list. That should form part of your inquiries.

Why were many of the procedures that were recommended by the south Wales surgeons not undertaken by the surgeons in Weston? It makes sense to me that if a surgeon in south Wales has determined that a patient should follow a particular procedure, then that is the procedure that should be followed in surgery. I have been told that what was being done in Weston, in many cases, was different from what had been determined by surgeons in south Wales. The surgeons who had been flown in from Sweden were, according to the Weston Area Health NHS Trust, there to undertake a specific project. Was the second-offer scheme that specific project? Were they flown in specifically to treat Welsh patients who had been sent there under the second-

penodol a ddefnyddir: PRC Sigma yw'r naill, a'r llall yw NexGen. Yr wyf ar ddeall gan llawfeddygon yn y de nad oes ganddynt y cyfarpar i gywiro problemau sy'n deillio o ddefnyddio Kinemax i osod pen-glin newydd. Ar ben hynny, mae nifer o llawfeddygon yn y de wedi gorfod gwneud llawdriniaethau ychwanegol i osod pen-glin newydd ers i'r cymhlethdodau hynny godi.

Deallaf hefyd nad oedd y llawfeddygon yn Weston yn llawfeddygon pen-glin arbenigol, ond yn llawfeddygon orthopedig cyffredinol. O edrych ar y 384 o bobl a gyfeiriwyd i Weston am lawdriniaeth pen-glin, faint ohonynt a gafodd Kinemax a faint o'r rheini sydd bellach wedi cael llawdriniaeth gywirol o ganlyniad? Faint sydd wedi cael llawdriniaeth ychwanegol gan llawfeddygon yn y de i osod pen-glin newydd yn lle'r rhai diffygiol a oedd wedi eu gosod gan y llawfeddygon o Sweden a oedd yn gwneud llawdriniaethau yn Weston?

Pam nad oedd llawfeddygon y de yn gwybod bod cleifion wedi eu tynnu oddi ar eu rhestrau? Rhaid ymchwilio'n ofalus i hynny, os yw cynllun yr ail gynnig i adennill hyder pobl ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rhaid i llawfeddygon sydd wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gyda'u cleifion, ac sydd wedyn wedi gweld bod y cleifion hynny wedi eu tynnu oddi ar eu rhestrau, gael hyder yn y system. Dylai cleifion fod yn ymwybodol na wyddai eu llawfeddygon eu bod wedi eu tynnu oddi ar y rhestr. Dylai hynny fod yn rhan o'ch ymholiadau.

Pam na ddilynwyd nifer o'r gweithdrefnau a gafodd eu hargymell gan llawfeddygon y de gan y llawfeddygon yn Weston? Mae'n gwneud synnwyr imi, os yw llawfeddyg yn y de wedi penderfynu y dylai claf ddilyn gweithdrefn llawfeddygol benodol, y dylai'r weithdrefn llawfeddygol honno gael ei dilyn yn ystod y llawdriniaeth. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod yr hyn a oedd yn cael ei wneud yn Weston, mewn llawer achos, yn wahanol i'r hyn a oedd wedi ei benderfynu gan llawfeddygon yn y de. Yn ôl Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd GIG Ardal Weston, yno i ymgymryd â phrosiect penodol oedd y llawfeddygon o Sweden. Ai cynllun yr ail gynnig oedd y prosiect penodol hwnnw? A gawsant eu defnyddio'n benodol i drin cleifion o Gymru

offer scheme? If so, what checks had been done as to the level of competence of those surgeons before Welsh patients were treated? Minister, in light of the fact that the patients who were treated in Weston were not operated on by specialist knee surgeons, why did the second-offer scheme allow patients to be treated by general orthopaedic surgeons? If they had been treated locally, the chances are that that operation would have been undertaken by a specialist knee surgeon.

Finally, Minister, I hope that you can allay my fears that the Assembly Government has put the welfare and treatment of patients at risk by using a cheap quick-fix in order to respond to political pressure to bring down waiting lists. There have been too many complications arising out of the treatment that these people have received across the border. It is time that the Government gave them some straight answers.

Brian Gibbons: I will start with the first point, that the surgeons did not know that their patients had been removed from their lists. I cannot answer for every surgeon, but the process used was that patients who were in danger of breaching the waiting time target were identified by their health trust and the trust suggested that those patients should be transferred to an alternative provider. We must remember that most of the patients who were treated under the second-offer scheme were treated in-house, under special second-offer schemes. The list of patients who were identified to go outside of local arrangements was arranged internally by the trust.

As I said, I cannot vouch for every surgeon, because I have not done a person-by-person audit, but I think that we remember that a particular surgeon raised concerns in 2004 about certain patients being referred from his hospital. He raised those concerns in the public domain. In fact, I think that his concerns were raised in the Chamber. Therefore that surgeon, at least, knew that his patients were being transferred. I do not know why that individual would have known that his patients were being transferred and

a oedd wedi eu hanfon yno o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig? Os felly, pa archwiliadau a oedd wedi eu gwneud o lefel cymhwysedd y llawfeddygon hynny cyn i gleifion o Gymru gael eu trin? Weinidog, yn sgil y ffaith na chafodd y cleifion a gafodd eu trin yn Weston eu trin gan llawfeddygon pen-glin arbenigol, pam y caniatodd cynllun yr ail gynnig i gleifion gael eu trin gan llawfeddygon orthopedig cyffredinol? Pe baent wedi eu trin yn lleol, mae'n bur debyg y byddai'r llawdriniaeth wedi ei gwneud gan llawfeddyg pen-glin arbenigol.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, gobeithio y gallwch leddfu fy mhryderon fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi lles a thriniaeth cleifion yn y fantol wrth ddefnyddio dull cyflym a rhad i ymateb i bwysau gwleidyddol i leihau rhestrau aros. Mae gormod o gymhlethodau wedi codi o'r driniaeth a gafodd y bobl hyn dros y ffin. Mae'n bryd i'r Llywodraeth roi atebion gonest iddynt.

Brian Gibbons: Dechreuaf gyda'r pwynt cyntaf, na wyddai'r llawfeddygon fod eu cleifion wedi eu tynnu oddi ar eu rhestrau. Ni allaf ateb ar ran pob llawfeddyg, ond y broses a ddilynwyd oedd i'r cleifion a oedd mewn perygl o orfod aros mwy na'r amser aros targed gael eu henwi gan eu hymddiriedolaeth iechyd a'r ymddiriedolaeth awgrymu y dylai'r cleifion hynny gael eu trosglwyddo i ddarparwr arall. Rhaid inni gofio bod y rhan fwyaf o'r cleifion a gafodd eu trin o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig wedi eu trin yn fewnol, o dan gynlluniau ail gynnig arbennig. Cafodd y rhestr o gleifion a nodwyd fel rhai i fynd y tu allan i'r trefniadau lleol ei threfnu gan yr ymddiriedolaeth yn fewnol.

Fel y dywedais, ni allaf siarad ar ran pob llawfeddyg, am nad wyf wedi gwneud archwiliad o bob un, ond credaf ein bod yn cofio bod llawfeddyg penodol wedi mynegi pryderon yn 2004 am gleifion penodol yn cael eu hatgyfeirio o'i ysbyty ef. Mynegodd y pryderon hyn yn gyhoeddus. A dweud y gwir, credaf fod ei bryderon wedi eu codi yn y Siambr. Felly, gwyddai'r llawfeddyg hwnnw, o leiaf, fod ei gleifion yn cael eu trosglwyddo. Ni wn pam y byddai'r unigolyn hwnnw'n gwybod bod ei gleifion yn cael eu

other surgeons in the same trust—the concerns were raised in the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust—would not. That would be very strange. Jonathan has raised the question and it is reasonable to seek a specific answer to his question, but I am not sure that, in view of what is on the record and in the public domain, what you are saying can be 100 per cent correct; there is strong evidence, which we have discussed previously, to the contrary.

3.00 p.m.

You suggest that the patient did not receive the procedure that he or she was listed for at the original trust. There is a contradiction between what you said and what the British Orthopaedic Association report says, which is almost completely opposite. The association's concern was that the surgeons at Weston were too prescribed in what they were doing; in fact, they were almost arguing that, because the patient had been listed for a certain procedure at the parent hospital, they were obliged to carry that procedure out. Jonathan's account of what happened and the British Orthopaedic Association's response to what happened are not compatible.

It would concern me if a clinician was asked to perform an operation over which he or she was not allowed to exercise clinical judgment. Do not forget that, with regard to the people who we are talking about, the reason why they were going for that operation was because they had been on the waiting list for an extremely long time. So, it is quite possible that a patient's clinical condition will have changed in the interim. I would be as concerned, if not more so, if, in the case of a patient who had been listed for a procedure 18 months to two and a half years earlier, an orthopaedic surgeon were to perform that procedure in a slavish way and without reviewing the patient.

On the prostheses used for the knee replacements, individual trusts and clinicians have their preferred prostheses, and my understanding is that the Kinemax knee prosthesis was the standard prosthesis used in Weston. Different trusts and different

trosglwyddo ac na fyddai hynny'n wir am llawfeddygon eraill yn yr un ymddiriedolaeth—mynegwyd y pryderon yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Byddai hynny'n rhyfedd iawn. Jonathan a gododd y cwestiwn, ac mae'n rhesymol chwilio am ateb penodol i'w gwestiwn, ond nid wyf yn siŵr, o gofio'r hyn sydd wedi'i gofnodi ac wedi'i gyhoeddi, y gall yr hyn a ddywedwch fod yn gwbl gywir; mae yna dystiolaeth gadarn, sydd wedi'i thrafod gennym eisoes, i'r gwrthwyneb.

Fe awgrymwch na chafodd y claf y llawdriniaeth yr oedd wedi'i restru ar ei chyfer yn yr ymddiriedolaeth wreiddiol. Mae gwrthdaro rhwng yr hyn a ddywedwch a'r hyn a ddywed adroddiad Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain, sydd bron yn hollol wahanol. Pryder y gymdeithas oedd bod y llawfeddygon yn Weston yn rhy gaeth yn yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei wneud; yn wir, yr oeddent bron yn dadlau, oherwydd bod y claf wedi'i restru ar gyfer llawdriniaeth benodol yn y rhiant-ysbyty, ei bod yn ofynnol iddynt gyflawni'r llawdriniaeth honno. Nid yw adroddiad Jonathan o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ac ymateb Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn cyd-fynd.

Byddai'n peri pryder imi pe gofynnid i glinigwr roi llawdriniaeth nad oedd ganddo ef neu hi hawl i arfer barn glinigol yn ei chylch. Cofiwch, o ran y bobl yr ydym yn sôn amdanynt, mai'r rheswm pam yn oeddent i gael y llawdriniaeth honno oedd eu bod ar y rhestr aros ers amser maith. Felly, mae'n dra phosibl y bydd cyflwr clinigol claf wedi newid yn y cyfamser. Byddwn lawn mor bryderus, os nad yn fwy pryderus, yn achos claf a oedd wedi'i restru am llawdriniaeth 18 mis i ddwy flynedd a hanner yn gynharach, pe bai llawfeddyg orthopedig yn cyflawni'r llawdriniaeth honno mewn ffordd slafaidd a heb adolygu'r claf.

O ran y prosthesau a ddefnyddir ar gyfer llawdriniaeth gosod pen-glin newydd, mae gan ymddiriedolaethau a chlinigwyr unigol eu dewis o brosthesau, a deallaf mai prosthesis pen-glin Kinemax oedd y prosthesis safonol a ddefnyddid yn Weston.

surgeons, as you say, will have their favoured prostheses and, generally, in orthopaedic surgery, it is suggested that surgeons should try to use the same type of prosthesis fairly consistently from a limited range so that there will be a defined range of prostheses used. My understanding is that, while the prosthesis used in Weston is different to the prosthesis used in south Wales, it was in standard use at that hospital. For the reasons that I gave, it makes sense that, in a hospital that is geared up to operate using a particular prosthesis, significantly changing that prosthesis for another type between patients in the way that Jonathan suggests would pose risks. However, each patient has to be considered individually, because no patient's problems come in a standardised form, and individual circumstances have to be considered.

Jonathan suggests that the surgeons were not experienced knee surgeons; I am not in a position to say. I am trying to find the part of the British Orthopaedic Association's report where it specifically states that these specifically trained and experienced orthopaedic surgeons— [*Interruption.*] No, I do not have the information as to whether they were knee specialists, but the British Orthopaedic Association's review specifically investigated whether these were senior, experienced clinicians, and it reached the conclusion that they were senior, experienced clinicians. It did not cast any aspersions on the competence and background of the clinicians.

Jonathan asked about the Scanloc team that provided the service. I do not think that the Scanloc team put together for these procedures was specifically put in place for south Wales patients, because, before patients were referred to Weston, the second offer team asked for information on Weston's performance as an orthopaedic centre, and my understanding is that it also asked specifically for information on the performance of the Scanloc team before patients were referred.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you for the statement, Minister, because I also asked an urgent question about it yesterday. I have three or four points to raise with you.

Bydd gan ymddiriedolaethau gwahanol a llawfeddygon gwahanol, fel y dywedwch, eu dewis o brosthesis, ac yn gyffredinol, ym maes llawdriniaeth orthopedig, awgrymir y dylai llawfeddygon geisio defnyddio'r un math o brosthesis yn gymharol gyson o ystod gyfyngedig fel y defnyddir ystod o brosthesau wedi ei diffinio. Er bod y prosthesis a ddefnyddir yn Weston yn wahanol i'r prosthesis a ddefnyddir yn ne Cymru, deallaf mai dyna a ddefnyddid yn safonol yn yr ysbyty hwnnw. Am y rhesymau a roddais, mae'n gwneud synnwyr, mewn ysbyty sydd wedi arfer gweithio gan ddefnyddio prosthesis penodol, y byddai newid y prosthesis hwnnw'n sylweddol am fath arall rhwng cleifion fel yr awgryma Jonathan yn creu risg. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried pob claf yn unigol, gan nad yw problemau cleifion yn rhai safonol, a rhaid ystyried amgylchiadau unigol.

Awgryma Jonathan nad oedd y llawfeddygon yn llawfeddygon pen-glin profiadol; ni allaf ddweud yr un ffordd na'r llall. Yr wyf yn ceisio dod o hyd i'r rhan o adroddiad Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain sy'n dweud yn benodol bod y llawfeddygon orthopedig hyn sydd â hyfforddiant a phrofiad penodol— [*Torri ar draws.*] Na, nid yw'r wybodaeth gennyf sy'n dweud a oeddent yn arbenigwyr pen-glin ai peidio, ond ymchwiliodd adolygiad Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain yn benodol i'r cwestiwn a oedd y rhain yn uwch glinigwyr profiadol, a daeth i'r casgliad eu bod yn uwch glinigwyr profiadol. Nid oedd yn bwrw amheuaeth o gwbl ar allu a chefnidir y clinigwyr.

Gofynnodd Jonathan am y tîm Scanloc a ddarparodd y gwasanaeth. Ni chredaf fod y tîm Scanloc a ffurfiwyd ar gyfer y mathau hyn o lawdriniaeth wedi'i greu yn benodol ar gyfer cleifion de Cymru, oherwydd, cyn cyfeirio cleifion i Weston, gofynnodd y tîm ail gynnig am wybodaeth am berfformiad Weston fel canolfan orthopedig, a deallaf iddo hefyd ofyn yn benodol am wybodaeth am berfformiad tîm Scanloc cyn cyfeirio cleifion.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog, oherwydd gofynnais innau hefyd gwestiwn brys yn ei gylch ddoe. Mae gennyf dri neu bedwar pwynt i'w codi

Concerns were raised previously by one of the consultant surgeons in Cardiff, at the end of 2004. At that point, there was an outcry but there were firm and vehement denials that there was a problem. The view that I received was that the surgeon was severely criticised for raising these concerns and for scaremongering about it, as it was then put. Can you explain why there was no investigation at the point when he made those accusations? Did the investigation start at that time, but that we have only just heard about it? When was the independent review by the British Orthopaedic Association commissioned? How many patients have been treated since that consultant surgeon, David Shewring, raised his concerns? It says in your statement that, pending the outcome of the review, all new knee surgery referrals to Weston were suspended, but were other referrals to Weston continuing, even though the knee referrals were suspended? Did the report say that the whole set up and equipment in Weston was inadequate, or did it refer to individual surgeons in terms of their procedures being inadequate? It would be helpful for us to know more detail about the problems.

My second point is about the massive impact that the reconsideration of all these cases will have on services at University Hospital of Wales and at Llandough Hospital, because we are talking about the recall of 700 patients for, at a minimum, x-ray and examination—estimated to cost at least £100 per patient—and some patients will probably need further treatment and operations. It will put a major strain on resources, in terms of the time of consultants and their staff and equipment, it will have an impact on waiting lists and there will also be financial considerations. A quick calculation puts the cost to the trust of what has happened at well over £70,000. Can you explain how the impact will be dealt with? What procedures are you putting in place to alleviate the problems for the trust, which, after all, have come about because of Welsh Assembly Government policy? The trust needs special consideration in terms of coping with this issue, or we will see extremely long waiting lists again.

gyda chi. Mynegwyd pryderon eisoes gan un o'r llawfeddygon ymgynghorol yng Nghaerdydd, ddiwedd 2004. Bryd hynny cafwyd protest, ond gwadwyd yn gadarn ac yn danbaid bod yna broblem. Y farn a gefais oedd bod y llawfeddyg wedi ei feirniadu'n hallt am godi'r pryderon hyn ac am godi bwganod yn ei gylch, fel y dywedwyd ar y pryd. A allwch esbonio pam na fu ymchwiliad pan wnaeth y cyhuddiadau hynny? A ddechreuodd yr ymchwiliad bryd hynny ond mai'n awr y clywsom amdano? Pryd y comisiynwyd yr adolygiad annibynnol gan Gymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain? Faint o gleifion sydd wedi cael triniaeth ers i'r llawfeddyg ymgynghorol hwnnw, David Shewring, fynegi ei bryderon? Dywedir yn eich datganiad bod pob achos newydd o gyfeirio i Weston am lawdriniaeth ar y pen-glin wedi ei atal, tra bydd canlyniad yr adolygiad yn yr arfaeth, ond a oedd cyfeiriadau eraill i Weston yn parhau, er bod y cyfeiriadau am y pen-glin wedi'u hatal? A ddywedodd yr adroddiad fod yr holl brosesau a'r holl offer yn Weston yn annigonol, neu a oedd yn cyfeirio at lawfeddygon unigol a bod eu llawdriniaethau'n annigonol? Byddai'n ddefnyddiol inni gael rhagor o fanylion am y problemau.

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â'r effaith enfawr y bydd ailystyried yr holl achosion hyn yn ei chael ar wasanaethau yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ac yn Ysbyty Llandochau, gan ein bod yn sôn am ail-alw 700 o gleifion i gael o leiaf archwiliad pelydr-X ac archwiliadau eraill-amcangyfrifir y bydd yn costio o leiaf £100 y claf-a bydd angen triniaeth a llawdriniaethau pellach ar rai cleifion, mae'n siŵr. Bydd yn rhoi pwysau mawr ar adnoddau, o ran amser meddygon ymgynghorol a'u staff a'u hoffer, bydd yn cael effaith ar restrau aros a bydd ystyriaethau ariannol hefyd. Cyfrifir yn fras y bydd yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn costio ymhell dros £70,000 i'r ymddiriedolaeth. A allwch esbonio sut yr eir i'r afael â'r effaith? Pa weithdrefnau yr ydych yn eu rhoi ar waith i leddfu problemau'r ymddiriedolaeth a achoswyd, wedi'r cyfan, oherwydd polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Mae angen ystyried yr ymddiriedolaeth yn arbennig wrth ddelio â'r mater hwn, neu fe welwn restrau aros hir iawn unwaith eto.

3.10 p.m.

My third point is whether any other such centres have been used for the second offer scheme for orthopaedic treatment or any other condition. We have all been grateful for the impact of the second-offer scheme, but I am concerned that similar centres could have been used which do not provide the very best treatment. Are you doing quality checks now on the impact of any similar centres that have been used?

Finally, you said in your comments to Jonathan Morgan that the treatment required in Weston may have been too prescribed, and that surgeons may have been told that they could only use one particular procedure when, in practice, the patient might have needed a different one. Who would have made the specification for that? Would it have been the trust, and if so, would it have been working to Welsh Assembly Government guidelines in producing the specification? I assume that your Government put a financial control on any trust that was using the second-offer scheme.

Brian Gibbons: I heard Jonathan Morgan say from a sedentary position that the schemes were too cheap, but if he cares to remember the comments of the Wales Audit Office about the initial wave of these schemes, its criticism was not that they were cheap, but that they were expensive. Therefore, I do not think that that kind of comment becomes Jonathan. I am sure that he is better-informed on this particular area; he knows that the costs were criticised for being too expensive rather than too cheap. I hope that he will not persist with such sedentary, off-stage comments.

Mr Shewring's comments in 2004 were specific to hand surgery. That issue was looked at, and it was felt at the time that his concerns were not substantiated. However, it is fair to say that Mr Shewring's intervention in relation to hand surgery probably meant that a lot of people who might have gone for hand surgery decided not to go to Weston, or anywhere else. However, his comments were specifically in relation to hand surgery, that

Fy nhrydydd pwynt yw a ddefnyddiwyd unrhyw ganolfannau eraill o'r fath dan gynllun yr ail gynnig ar gyfer triniaeth orthopedig neu unrhyw gyflwr arall. Yr ydym i gyd wedi bod yn ddiolchgar am effaith cynllun yr ail gynnig, ond yr wyf yn bryderus y gallai canolfannau tebyg fod wedi eu defnyddio nad ydynt yn darparu'r triniaethau gorau oll. A ydych yn trefnu gwiriad ansawdd yn awr o effaith unrhyw ganolfannau tebyg a ddefnyddiwyd?

Yn olaf, dywedech yn eich sylwadau i Jonathan Morgan y gallasai'r driniaeth a geisiwyd yn Weston fod yn rhy gaeth, a bod llawfeddygon, hwyrach, wedi cael gwybod mai un llawdriniaeth benodol hyn unig y gallent ei defnyddio pan fyddai ar y claf, efallai, angen triniaeth wahanol. Pwy fyddai wedi llunio'r fanyleb ar gyfer hynny? Ai'r ymddiriedolaeth? Ac os felly, a fyddai wedi bod yn gweithredu'n unol â chanllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth lunio'r fanyleb? Cymeraf fod eich Llywodraeth wedi gosod rheolaeth ariannol ar unrhyw ymddiriedolaeth a oedd yn defnyddio cynllun yr ail gynnig.

Brian Gibbons: Clywais Jonathan Morgan yn dweud ar ei eistedd fod y cynlluniau'n rhy rad, ond os yw'n cofio sylwadau Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am y don gychwynnol o'r cynlluniau hyn, nid eu beirniadu am eu bod yn rhad a wnaeth, ond am eu bod yn rhy ddrud. Felly, nid wyf yn credu bod y math hwnnw o sylw yn gweddu i Jonathan. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod ganddo fwy o wybodaeth am y maes penodol hwn; gŵyr fod y costau wedi'u beirniadu am fod yn rhy ddrud yn hytrach nag yn rhy rad. Gobeithio na fydd yn parhau gyda sylwadau o'r fath ac yntau ar ei eistedd.

Yr oedd sylwadau Mr Shewring yn 2004 yn ymwneud â llawdriniaeth ar y dwylo'n benodol. Ystyriwyd y mater hwnnw, a'r teimlad ar y pryd oedd bod ei bryderon yn ddi-sail. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud bod ymyriad Mr Shewring o ran llawdriniaeth ar y dwylo'n golygu bod llawer o bobl a alai fod wedi mynd i gael llawdriniaeth ar eu dwylo wedi penderfynu peidio â mynd i Weston, neu rywle arall. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd a

issue was looked at, and it was felt that the concerns were unsubstantiated.

The British Orthopaedic Association report was finished in June, and on the basis of that the decision was taken not to refer any further patients to Weston. Once we got the report, the decision to suspend was taken, and indeed, although we suspended new referrals in June, we decided to terminate all referrals to Weston in September 2006, and not to renew the contract—even though, to date, I do not think that there is any evidence that any of the procedures, other than those for knee surgery, have been particularly problematic. However, if we have to use the second-offer scheme again, then clearly the issues that have been raised in this review will have to be looked at, and we would have to be happy that the process available at Weston met the standard that we expect.

At the moment, we are hoping that the 700 or so patients affected, predominantly in Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan, will have their review within two months. There is a helpline available that patients in Cardiff should use if they are particularly worried. If there seems to be an urgent problem, then clearly people should be seen in line with clinical priority. I understand the numbers affected in Gwent are much smaller, and that the Gwent trust will make an individual approach to all of those patients, so if there is a particular clinical problem, people in Gwent can raise that when they get the phone call.

On the issue of patients needing revision procedures, I think that nine, 10 or 11 patients, roughly speaking, may have had a revision. The most definitive figure that I have is that up to 20 patients may need revision procedures.

I cannot say for certain whether all of those will be done. I think that it is unlikely in the timescale that we are talking about. The evidence that came forth about the first nine patients about whom concerns was raised, was that a number of those patients have been operated on. At present, our top estimate is

wnelo ei sylwadau'n benodol â llawdriniaeth ar y dwylo, ac ystyriwyd y mater hwnnw, a'r teimlad oedd bod y pryderon yn ddi-sail.

Cwblhawyd adroddiad Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain ym mis Mehefin, ac ar sail hynny penderfynwyd peidio â chyfeirio gleifion eraill i Weston. Ar ôl inni gael yr adroddiad, penderfynwyd atal achosion newydd o gyfeirio, ac yn wir, er inni wneud hynny ym mis Mehefin, penderfynwyd terfynu pob cyfeiriad i Weston ym Medi 2006, a pheidio ag adnewyddu'r contract—er na chredaf, hyd yma, fod tystiolaeth o gwbl fod unrhyw lawdriniaeth, ac eithrio llawdriniaeth ar y pen-glin, wedi peri problemau arbennig. Fodd bynnag, os bydd yn rhaid inni ddefnyddio cynllun yr ail gynnig eto, yna'n amlwg bydd yn rhaid ystyried y materion a godwyd yn yr adolygiad hwn, a byddai'n rhaid inni fod yn fodlon fod y broses sydd ar gael yn Weston yn cyrraedd y safon a ddisgwylwn.

Ar hyn o bryd, gobeithiwn y bydd y 700 o gleifion yr effeithiwyd arnynt, fey neu lai, yng Nghaerdydd a Bro Morgannwg yn bennaf, yn cael eu hadolygiad o fewn deufis. Mae llinell gymorth ar gael i gleifion yng Nghaerdydd ei defnyddio os ydynt yn arbennig o bryderus. Os ymddengys bod problem frys, yna'n amlwg dylid gweld pobl yn unol â blaenoriaeth glinigol. Deallaf fod y niferoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt yng Ngwent yn llai o lawer, ac y bydd ymddiriedolaeth Gwent yn cysylltu â'r holl gleifion hynny'n unigol. Felly, os bydd yna broblem glinigol benodol, gall pobl yng Ngwent godi hynny pan gânt yr alwad ffôn.

O ran y ffaith bod angen llawdriniaeth ddiwygio ar gleifion, credaf efallai fod naw, 10 neu 11 o gleifion, yn fras, wedi cael triniaeth ddiwygio. Y ffigur mwyaf pendant sydd gennyf yw y gall fod angen llawdriniaeth ddiwygio ar hyd at 20 o gleifion.

Ni allaf ddweud i sicrwydd a gaiff pob un ohonynt y driniaeth. Credaf fod hynny'n annhebygol yn ôl yr amserlen yr ydym yn ei thrafod. Y dystiolaeth a ddaeth i'r amlwg am y naw claf cyntaf y codwyd pryderon yn eu cylch oedd bod nifer o'r cleifion hynny wedi cael llawdriniaeth. Ar hyn o bryd, ein

that around 20 patients need major revision surgery following these operations. The precise details of how that will be paid for are still to be sorted out. Clearly, in response to this situation, our first priority has not been to start arguing over the money. The people who have had complications have to be the first priority. We are setting up the reviews and, depending on clinical priority, we want those patients operated on—offered a revision operation—in line with clinical priorities. As time goes on, there is no doubt that the money will have to be sorted out. However, I do not think that we are in a position to start talking about that today. It is more important to get clear messages out to patients, and that those patients who may have complications are seen. We will sort the rest of it out. As you say, there is a financial cost to all of this.

Approximately 8,000 to 9,000 patients have gone to other non-Welsh NHS trusts, either to an NHS organisation, such as Weston Area Health NHS Trust, or to non-NHS organisations such as BUPA in Cardiff or elsewhere. All of those centres are expected to provide audit reports on the activity that is taking place, which has always been the case. Those quality checks should be ongoing. That is part of the specification and it is not something that has just been put in place; it has been part of the second-offer scheme from the start.

We set a contract, which the Audit Commission initially felt was too generous and too expensive—not too cheap. In doing that, we did not set down clinical guidelines in terms of how the procedures should be done. Patients were referred for knee surgery—presumably knee replacements and so forth—but before they had a knee operation, they were assessed. It would not be for us, as a commissioning organisation, to specify the clinical process precisely on an individual case.

Lorraine Barrett: You probably answered most of the points that I was going to raise in replying to Jenny's questions; therefore, please do not feel that you have to reiterate those. However, I would like to have

hamcangyfrif uchaf yw bod angen llawdriniaeth ddiwygio fawr ar tuag 20 o'r cleifion hynny yn dilyn y llawdriniaethau hyn. Mae'r union fanylion ynglŷn â sut y telir am hynny i'w trefnu eto. Yn amlwg, wrth ymateb i'r sefyllfa hon, nid dechrau dadlau dros arian oedd ein prif flaenoriaeth. Rhaid i'r bobl sydd wedi cael cymhlethdodau fod yn brif flaenoriaeth inni. Yr ydym yn sefydlu'r adolygiadau, ac yn ôl y flaenoriaeth glinigol yr ydym am i'r cleifion hynny gael llawdriniaeth—cael cynnig llawdriniaeth ddiwygio—yn ôl blaenoriaethau clinigol. Wrth i'r amser fynd heibio, nid oes amheuaeth na fydd yn rhaid trefnu'r arian. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf ein bod mewn sefyllfa i drafod hynny heddiw. Mae'n bwysicach cyfleu negeseuon clir i gleifion, ac y bydd y cleifion hynny sydd wedi cael cymhlethdodau yn cael eu gweld. Byddwn ni'n trefnu'r gweddill. Fel y dywedwch, mae cost ariannol i hyn oll.

Mae tuag 8,000 i 9,000 o gleifion wedi mynd at ymddiriedolaethau GIG y tu allan i Gymru, naill ai i sefydliad y GIG megis Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ardal Iechyd Weston, neu i sefydliadau nad ydynt yn rhan o'r GIG, megis BUPA yng Nghaerdydd neu rywle arall. Disgwylir i'r holl ganolfannau hyn roi adroddiadau archwilio am y gweithgaredd a wneir, a dyna fu'r achos erioed. Dylai'r gwiriadau ansawdd fod yn rheolaidd. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r fanyleb, ac nid yw'n rhywbeth sydd newydd ei sefydlu; bu'n rhan o gynllun yr ail gynnig ers y dechrau.

Gosodwyd contract gennym a oedd, ym marn y Comisiwn Archwilio, yn rhy hael ac yn rhy ddrud i ddechrau—nid yn rhy rhad. Wrth wneud hynny, gosodwyd canllawiau clinigol ar gyfer y ffordd y dylid cyflawni'r triniaethau. Cyfeiriwyd cleifion am driniaeth pen-glin—gosod pen-glin newydd ac ati, yn ôl pob tebyg—ond cawsant eu hasesu cyn cael y llawdriniaeth pen-glin. Nid ein lle ni, fel sefydliad comisiynu, yw pennu'r broses glinigol yn union mewn achos unigol.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae'n siwr eich bod wedi ateb y rhan fwyaf o'r pwyntiau yr oeddwn am eu codi wrth ateb cwestiynau Jenny; felly, peidiwch â themlo bod rhaid ichi ailadrodd y rheini. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gofnodi

something on record because, at the time, I was critical of Mr Shewring, who has been named now, but that was in regard to the wrist operations. At the time, I felt that while it was the patients' own choice, they should at least have that choice as to whether they went to Weston for their operations. Two constituents rang me to ask what they should do. I said that it had to be their decision, but that they had the choice. I did not want that choice taken away from them.

When do you expect this review of the patients to be concluded? Various figures have been bandied about. You have addressed that, in part, in answer to Jenny. After the headlines in yesterday's newspapers, people could be thinking that about 700 people need new operations, because that is how it came across in the press. The sooner that we can get the actual numbers and get the review concluded, the more it will help to allay people's fears.

Brian Gibbons: I do not think that the figure will be anything like 700 people. As I say, I think that it will probably be tens of people who will need revision surgery. Something of the order of 23,000 or 24,000 patients have been through the second-offer scheme. You may remember that the bulk of those patients were languishing on waiting lists for many years. Their quality of life was miserable. I have no doubt that tens of thousands of people have benefited from this operation and this initiative. Their quality of life has been greatly enhanced by this, but that is no consolation to the people whom we are discussing today. Again, I can only say how much I regret the distress and anxiety that those people who need a revision have experienced along with, as you said, the other 700 who face a degree of uncertainty until they have the review.

3.20 p.m.

Patients exercised choice in this scheme and if you remember, at the beginning, around two fifth of the patients, perhaps even more, who were offered a second-offer place, turned it down. Therefore, patients were offered a choice and, in many instances, they chose not to take it. In the future—and you

rhywbeth, oherwydd ar y pryd yr oeddwn yn feirniadol o Mr Shewring, sydd wedi'i enwi'n awr, ond yr oedd hynny'n gysylltiedig â llawdriniaethau'r arddwrn. Ar y pryd, teimlais y dylai'r cleifion o leiaf gael dewis, gan mai eu dewis hwy ydoedd, a oeddent am fynd i Weston ar gyfer eu llawdriniaethau. Cefais alwad ffôn gan ddau etholwr yn gofyn beth y dylent ei wneud. Dywedais mai hwy oedd yn gorfod gwneud y penderfyniad, ond bod ganddynt ddewis. Nid oeddwn am gymryd y dewis hwnnw oddi arnynt.

Pryd ydych yn disgwyl i'r adolygiad hwn o'r cleifion ddod i ben? Trafodwyd amrywiol ffigurau. Yr ydych wedi mynd i'r afael â hynny, yn rhannol, wrth ateb Jenny. Ar ôl y penawdau yn y papurau newydd ddoe, gallai pobl feddwl bod angen llawdriniaethau newydd ar tua 700 o bobl, gan mai dyna'r argraff a gaed o'r wasg. Po gyntaf y cawn y niferoedd iawn a dod â'r adolygiad i ben, y mwyaf y gallwn dawelu pryderon pobl.

Brian Gibbons: Ni chredaf y bydd y ffigur yn agos at 700 o bobl. Fel y dywedais, yn fy marn i y tebyg yw mai ar ddegau o bobl y bydd angen llawdriniaeth ddiwygio. Mae tua 23,000 neu 24,000 o gleifion wedi bod drwy gynllun yr ail gynnig. Efallai y cofiwch fod y rhan fwyaf o'r cleifion hynny wedi llesgáu ar restrau aros am flynyddoedd lawer. Roedd safon eu bywydau'n druenus. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf na chafodd degau o filoedd o bobl les o'r llawdriniaeth hon a'r fenter hon. Bu gwelliant mawr yn safon eu bywydau oherwydd hyn, ond nid yw hynny'n gysur i'r rhai yr ydym yn eu trafod heddiw. Unwaith eto, ni allaf ddweud mwy na fy mod yn cydymdeimlo â'r blinder a'r pryder a achoswyd i'r bobl sydd ag angen triniaeth ddiwygio arnynt, ynghyd â'r 700 arall, fel y dywedwch, sy'n wynebu rhywfaint o ansicrwydd nes cânt yr adolygiad.

Arferodd cleifion eu dewis yn y cynllun hwn, ac os cofiwch, ar y dechrau gwrthododd dau o bob pump o'r cleifion, efallai hyd yn oed fwy, y cynigiwyd lle ail gynnig iddynt. Felly, cynigiwyd dewis i gleifion, ac mewn llawer achos gwnaethant y dewis o beidio â'i gymryd. Yn y dyfodol—ac nid ydych wedi

have not specifically asked about this—it is our ambition for the health service in Wales for the second-offer scheme not to continue in perpetuity. The fact that we have invested in the Cardiff and vale orthopaedic centre and in St Woolos Hospital and the fact that we put an extra £5 million to £15 million extra into orthopaedic services across Wales will mean that, hopefully, we will be overwhelmingly self-sufficient in this. At the time of the second-offer launch, a big concern was whether we would be able to make our targets by relying on indigenous Welsh capacity. I am pleased to say that, by and large, that looks increasingly possible, which is a tremendous tribute to the people in the NHS in Wales and how they have been able to make use of the money that we have put into the system for the benefit of patients.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gwrandewais ar eich ymateb i Aelodau eraill ac mae nifer o'r cwestiynau yr oeddwn am eu codi eisoes wedi eu hateb, ond, i ategu rhai o bryderon Jonathan Morgan, af yn ôl at y pryderon a godwyd gan David Shewring. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud mai sôn am lawdriniaeth y llaw ydoedd, ond ei bryder oedd nad oedd y llawfeddygon a fyddai'n gwneud y driniaeth honno yn gymwys yn y maes arbennig hwnnw. Rhaid mynd yn ôl i weld beth yn union a ddigwyddodd oherwydd fy atgof i o'r sefyllfa oedd bod ymgais wedi bod, wedi hynny, i danseilio David Shewring a'i honiadau, a bod yr ymgais honno'n ymddangos i lawer ohonom yn ymgais wleidyddol i geisio sicrhau nad oedd y pryderon hynny'n cael eu codi. Felly, byddwn yn falch pe bai'r Gweinidog yn ymrwymo y prynhawn yma i fynd yn ôl i weld a ddylid fod wedi ymchwilio'n llawer mwy manwl i'r materion a godwyd gan David Shewring.

Bu imi godi'r pwynt nesaf gyda rhagflaenydd y Gweinidog presennol, oherwydd daeth llawfeddyg arall a oedd yn digwydd arbenigo ar y galon ataf a chodi pryder ynghylch cynllun yr ail gynnig ar sail y ffaith—a chyfeiriodd Jonathan at hwn—nad yw'r math o driniaeth a fyddai'n cael ei gynnig mewn ysbyty dros y ffin o bosibl yn gymwys gyda'r ôl-driniaeth a fyddai'n cael ei chyflawni yng Nghymru. Yr oedd y llawfeddyg arbennig

gofyn yn benodol ynglŷn â hyn—ein huchelgais i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yw peidio â pharhau'r cynllun ail gynnig am byth. Mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi buddsoddi yng nghanolfan orthopedig Caerdydd a'r Fro ac yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw ac wedi rhoi £5 miliwn i £15 miliwn ychwanegol i wasanaethau orthopedig ar draws Cymru yn golygu, gobeithio, y byddwn yn hunangynhaliol yn hyn i raddau helaeth iawn. Pan lansiwyd yr ail gynnig, yr oedd pryder mawr a allem gyrraedd ein targedau drwy ddibynnu ar ein gallu a'n hadnoddau ein hunain yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch gallu dweud, i raddau helaeth, fod hynny'n edrych yn fwyfwy posibl, sy'n deyrnged aruthrol i'r bobl yn y GIG yng Nghymru ac i'r ffordd y maent wedi gallu defnyddio'r arian yr ydym wedi ei roi yn y system er lles cleifion.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I have listened to your responses to other Members, and several of the questions which I wished to raise have already been addressed. However, to endorse some of Jonathan Morgan's concerns, I return to the concerns raised by David Shewring. You are right to say that he was talking about hand surgery, but his concern was that the surgeons carrying out that treatment were not qualified in that particular specialty. We have to return to see exactly what occurred then, because my recollection of the position was that there was an attempt, following that, to undermine David Shewring and his claims, and that the attempt appeared to many of us to be a political effort to ensure that his concerns were not raised. Therefore, I should appreciate if the Minister would commit this afternoon to revisit the matter to see whether the matters raised by David Shewring should have been investigated far more thoroughly.

I have raised this next point with the current Minister's predecessor, because another surgeon has approached me, who happens to specialise in cardiac surgery, to raise a concern about the second-offer scheme, on the basis of the fact, which Jonathan referred to, that the kind of treatment given in a hospital over the border would not be appropriate to the follow-up treatment that would be carried out in Wales. That

hwn yn bryderus na fyddai'n gallu cynnig y math o ôl-driniaeth a oedd ei hangen ar y claf.

A wnewch hefyd ymrwymo i edrych yn fanwl ar hynny i weld a oes problemau wedi codi gydag ôl-driniaeth y bobl a oedd wedi derbyn triniaeth yn y lle cyntaf drwy'r ail gynnig? Mae'r ôl-driniaeth honno, wrth reswm, yn gorfod cael ei gwneud yma yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, yn eich adolygiad o hyn—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cynnal adolygiad manwl o oblygiadau hyn—a wnewch chi sicrhau bod y cleifion yn cael y cyfle i fynegi barn am ansawdd y driniaeth a'r ôl-driniaeth a gawsant, a pha un a ydynt yn meddwl ei fod wedi bod yn wasanaeth cyflawn?

Brian Gibbons: I do not think that any effort—I think that 'political effort' would be the correct phrase to use—was made in relation to Mr Shewring. He raised concerns about hand surgery and it is difficult to over-generalise because the number of people who went subsequently to Mr Shewring, after these concerns had been raised, may make it difficult to prove it one way or the other. However, the whole point of responding to Mr Shewring's concern was to reassure patients who were taking up the second-offer scheme that they were getting treatment that had been quality assured, and that there were ordered processes and clinical governance processes in place so that people were not getting some sort of second or third-class care.

It would have been totally wrong if the impression was given to patients that, under the second-offer scheme, they were going to get some sort of cheap and nasty treatment, which is Jonathan Morgan's view. We needed to challenge that and assure patients that, if they wanted to avail themselves of quicker treatment, we were committed to ensuring that that treatment was done to acceptable standards and quality. Therefore, our issue with Mr Shewring was not political, in the sense that you meant it; it was about ensuring that people could have peace of mind when they were taking up the second-offer scheme, and that we were happy that

particular surgeon was concerned because he could not offer the kind of follow-up treatment required by patients.

Will you also commit to look in detail at that, to see whether there are any problems with the follow-up treatment of patients who had received their initial treatment through the second-offer scheme? That follow-up treatment has to be performed in Wales, of course.

Finally, when you review this—and I am sure you will make a detailed review of the implications of this—will you ensure that patients are given the opportunity to express an opinion on the quality of their treatment and follow-up treatment, and whether they believe it was a comprehensive, holistic service?

Brian Gibbons: Ni chredaf fod unrhyw ymdrech—credaf mai 'ymdrech wleidyddol' fyddai'r term cywir i'w ddefnyddio—mewn perthynas â Mr Shewring. Cododd bryderon ynglŷn â llawdriniaeth llaw, ac mae'n anodd gor-gyffredinoli oherwydd gall nifer y bobl a aeth at Mr Shewring o ganlyniad i hynny, ar ôl i'r pryderon gael eu codi, olygu ei bod yn anodd ei brofi y naill ffordd neu'r llall. Fodd bynnag, y rheswm pennaf am ymateb i bryder Mr Shewring oedd tawelu meddwl cleifion a oedd yn derbyn cynllun yr ail gynnig eu bod yn cael triniaeth o ansawdd sicr, a bod prosesau trefnus a phrosesau llywodraethu clinigol ar waith fel na fyddai pobl yn cael rhyw fath o ofal ail neu drydydd dosbarth.

Byddai wedi bod yn gwbl anghywir rhoi'r argraff i gleifion y caent ryw fath o driniaeth ddi-ddim o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig, sef barn Jonathan Morgan. Yr oedd angen inni herio hynny a sicrhau cleifion ein bod wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau triniaeth o safonau derbyniol, os oeddent am gael triniaeth gyflymach. Felly, nid oeddem yn anghytuno â Mr Shewring yn wleidyddol, yn yr ystyr a oedd gennych mewn golwg: yr oedd yn golygu sicrhau bod pobl yn dawel eu meddwl wrth dderbyn cynllun yr ail gynnig, a'n bod yn fodlon eu bod yn cael gofal o'r safon y gellid ei disgwyl yn rhesymol fel cleifion y GIG. Dyna oedd ein hunig bryder.

they were getting the quality care that they could reasonably expect as NHS patients. That was our only issue there.

I will take away the point on cardiac revascularisation. I have no problem with that. I do not know the details of it. Patients who had an operation should have had one follow-up procedure at the operation centre. There was nothing in the contract to prevent further follow-up treatment, as necessary; indeed, in the case of the treatment centre in Weston-super-Mare, ironically, that was also offering a one-year follow-up appointment to monitor late complications of the procedure. I do not believe that that was part of the standard contract, but it was part of the package that Weston was offering.

I have just found what I was looking for when Jonathan raised this question. It says here,

‘Having interviewed the two Swedish surgeons, we have no doubts regarding their particular skill or experience’.

That is in the summary of findings from the British Orthopaedic Association, although it went on to say,

‘We do, however, have some concerns regarding the process’.

However, it had no doubts about their skills and experience.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. I believe that you have earned your salary this afternoon.

Derbyniaf y pwynt am ailfasgwlaiddio cardiaidd. Nid oes problem gennyf gyda hynny. Ni wn y manylion. Dylai cleifion a gafodd lawdriniaeth fod wedi cael un driniaeth ddilynol yn y ganolfan driniaeth. Nid oedd dim yn y contract i atal triniaeth ddilynol bellach, yn ôl yr angen, yn achos y ganolfan driniaeth yn Weston-super-Mare a oedd, yn eironig, hefyd yn cynnig apwyntiad dilynol flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach er mwyn monitro cymhlethdodau hwyr y driniaeth honno. Ni allaf gredu bod hynny'n rhan o'r contract safonol, ond yr oedd yn rhan o'r pecyn a gynigid gan Weston.

Yr wyf newydd ddod o hyd i'r hyn yr oeddwn yn chwilio amdano pan gododd Jonathan y cwestiwn hwn. Mae'n dweud yma,

Ar ôl cyfweld y ddau lawfeddyg o Sweden, nid oes gennym ddim amheuaeth am eu sgiliau a'u profiad arbennig.

Dyna yw'r crynodeb o ddarganfyddiadau Cymdeithas Orthopedig Prydain, er ei fod yn mynd ymlaen hefyd i ddweud,

Fodd bynnag, mae gennym rai pryderon ynglŷn â'r broses.

Fodd bynnag, nid oedd amheuaeth o gwbl am eu sgiliau a'u profiad.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog. Credaf eich bod wedi ennill eich cyflog y prynhawn yma.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

A yw'n Syniad Da Ariannu Pleidiau Gwleidyddol ag Arian Cyhoeddus? Public Funding of Political Parties: A Good Idea?

Jeff Cuthbert: I have received requests to speak for one minute from Mike German, Tamsin Dunwoody and Dai Lloyd; I am happy to agree to that.

The issue of how best to fund our nation's political parties has, in previous years,

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf wedi cael ceisiadau i siarad am un funud gan Mike German, Tamsin Dunwoody a Dai Lloyd; yr wyf yn fodlon cytuno i hynny.

Mae'r broblem sut i ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol ein gwlad wedi hawlio'r

dominated the headlines, with some perceived and some real conflicts of interests being brought to light. Britain's democratic process deserves a more stable form of organising its political parties. Public engagement with political parties is on the decline, yet the public remains politically active. Single-issue campaigns still engage millions of people. Last year, Oxfam's 'Make Poverty History' campaign drove tens of thousands of Welsh people onto the streets, and contentious local issues can still fill a church hall.

Parties, however, struggle after the heat of elections to maintain public engagement, en masse, with their policy positions. Dwindling membership money has led parties to turn increasingly to donations from a small number of rich individuals. The result is record levels of campaign spending, combined with low voter turnout. In 2005, small political parties won more than 10 per cent of the vote, a rise of over 500 per cent since 1955. A healthy democracy needs healthy political parties, so what is to be done to turn back the tide?

Against this background, the Prime Minister commissioned Sir Hayden Phillips in March 2006 to investigate the funding of political parties. The Phillips review fulfils the 2005 Labour manifesto pledge to work with the Electoral Commission to explore how best to support political parties in fulfilling their legitimate, democratic role.

3.30 p.m.

The sweeping changes implemented under the Electoral Administration Act 2006 may have removed much of the impetus for change; however, many of the core issues of donations, expenditure and subsidy are still to be decided.

Linked to that are wider concerns around public participation. In Wales in 2003, 80 per cent of 18 to 34-year-olds did not bother to vote. According to the report of the Local Government and Public Services Committee on electoral arrangements in Wales, if young people have not voted by their third election, they never will. If 80 per cent of Wales's

penawdau, yn y gorffennol, ac mae rhai syniadau am wrthdaro mewn buddiannau a rhai real wedi yn dod i'r amlwg. Mae proses ddemocrataidd Prydain yn haeddu dull mwy sefydlog o drefnu ei phleidiau gwleidyddol. Mae llai o bobl yn ymwneud â phleidiau gwleidyddol, ond eto mae'r cyhoedd yn wleidyddol weithgar o hyd. Mae ymgyrchoedd achosion unigol yn denu miliynau o bobl o hyd. Y llynedd, denwyd degau o filoedd o bobl Cymru i'r strydoedd gan yr ymgyrch 'Rhown Derfyn ar Dlodï' gan Oxfam, a gall materion cynhennus lleol o hyd lenwi neuadd eglwys.

Fodd bynnag, mae pleidiau'n ymdrechu i gadw diddordeb y cyhoedd ar ôl prysurdeb etholiadau, gyda'i safbwyntiau polisi. Mae'r gostyngiad mewn arian aelodaeth wedi arwain pleidiau i droi at roddion gan nifer fach o unigolion cyfoethog. O ganlyniad, mae lefelau gwariant ymgyrchoedd yn uwch nag erioed, ynghyd â llai o bleidleiswyr. Yn 2005, enillodd pleidiau gwleidyddol bach dros 10 y cant o'r bleidlais, cynnydd o dros 500 y cant er 1955. Mae angen pleidiau gwleidyddol iach ar ddemocratiaeth iach, felly, beth ellir ei wneud i droi'r llanw?

Yn y cefndir hwn, comisiynwyd Syr Hayden Phillips ym mis Mawrth 2006 gan Brif Weinidog y DU i ymchwilio i sefyllfa ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol. Mae adolygiad Phillips yn cyflawni addewid manifesto Llafur yn 2005 i archwilio sut orau i gefnogi pleidiau gwleidyddol wrth iddynt gyflawni eu swyddogaeth gyfreithlon, ddemocrataidd.

Efallai fod y newidiadau ysgubol a weithredwyd o dan Ddeddf Gweinyddiaeth Etholiadol 2006 wedi dileu llawer o'r symbyliad dros newid; fodd bynnag, mae nifer o'r materion craidd ynghylch rhoddion, gwariant a chymhorthdal eto i'w penderfynu.

Yn gysylltiedig â hynny mae pryderon ehangach ynghylch cyfranogiad cyhoeddus. Yng Nghymru yn 2003, ni thrafferthodd 80 y cant o bobl ifanc rhwng 18 a 34 oed i bleidleisio. Yn ôl adroddiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar drefniadau etholiadol yng Nghymru, os na fydd pobl ifanc wedi

young people are not voting, they are highly unlikely to be politically active. Political parties must be placed in a position to respond dynamically to that threat.

Public engagement must remain the modus operandi of free political parties. The link between membership and survival is a strong one. The tension keeps us relevant and it would be a mistake for state funding to interfere too much with that dynamic. A political party's failure to attract voluntary contributions must not be rewarded. I do not want today to enter into a debate on the state of Wales's civic society and the need for all sectors, including the media, to do their bit to engage the public in politics, to see how interesting it is. While that is important, it is not the main thrust of today's debate.

The funding of political parties in Britain is highly fragile. Political parties perform a fundamental democratic function that no democracy has yet managed to do without. In Britain, parties are required to conduct a professional and nationwide organisation on a knife edge. In 2005, the running costs of Labour were some £49 million, the Conservatives, some £39 million and the Liberal Democrats, just under £9 million. Since 2001, the three main parties have spent a total of £318 million on running costs alone. Such spending is unsustainable, but the keeping-up-with-the-Joneses mentality among the parties means costs are projected to spiral upwards. If we continue to follow the US example, things could soon get way out of hand. In 1976, the total US elections budget was some \$40 million; by 2004, it had risen to just under \$4 billion for federal elections alone. Most of that money had been raised by donations. The rationalisation and reform of the British system, to prevent us from following America, has never been more important.

The state funding of political parties is not new. Opposition parties have received some

pleidleisio erbyn eu trydydd etholiad, ni fyddant byth yn gwneud hynny. Os 80 y cant o bobl ifanc Cymru yn gwrthod pleidleisio, maent yn annhebygol iawn o fod yn wleidyddol weithgar. Rhaid i bleidiau gwleidyddol fod mewn sefyllfa i ymateb yn ddeinamig i'r bygythiad hwnnw.

Rhaid i ymgysylltu barhau'n ddull gweithredu i bleidiau gwleidyddol rhydd o hyd. Mae'r cyswllt rhwng aelodaeth a goroesi yn un cryf. Mae'r tensiwn yn ein cadw'n berthnasol, a byddai'n gamgymeriad i gyllid y wladwriaeth ymyrryd yn ormodol â'r deinamig hwnnw. Ni ddylid gwobrwyo methiant plaid wleidyddol i ddenu cyfraniadau gwirfoddol. Nid wyf am gychwyn dadl ar gyflwr cymdeithas ddinesig Cymru a'r angen i bob sector, gan gynnwys y cyfryngau, wneud eu rhan i ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd mewn gwleidyddiaeth, i weld pa mor ddiddorol ydyw. Er bod hynny'n bwysig, nid dyna brif fater y ddadl heddiw.

Mae'r dull o ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol ym Mhrydain yn fregus iawn. Mae pleidiau gwleidyddol yn cyflawni swyddogaeth ddemocrataidd sylfaenol nad oes yr un ddemocratiaeth wedi llwyddo i wneud hebddi hyd yma. Ym Mhrydain, mae'n ofynnol i bleidiau gynnal sefydliad proffesiynol a chenedlaethol yn wyneb cystadleuaeth lem. Yn 2005, yr oedd costau rhedeg y blaid Lafur tua £49 miliwn, tua £39 miliwn oedd costau'r Ceidwadwyr ac yr oedd costau rhedeg y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ychydig yn llai na £9 miliwn. Ers 2001, mae'r tair prif blaid wedi gwario cyfanswm o £318 miliwn ar gostau rhedeg yn unig. Nid yw gwariant o'r fath yn gynaliadwy, ond mae natur gystadleuol y pleidiau yn golygu y rhagwelir y bydd costau'n cynyddu'n sylweddol. Os parhawn i ddilyn enghraifft yr UD, gallai pethau fynd ar chwâl yn fuan iawn. Yn 1976, yr oedd cyfanswm cyllideb etholiadau'r UD tua \$40 miliwn; erbyn 2004 yr oedd wedi codi i ychydig yn llai na \$4 biliwn ar gyfer etholiadau ffederal yn unig. Codwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r arian hwnnw gan roddion. Ni fu'r broses o resymoli a diwygio'r system Brydeinig, er mwyn ein hatal rhag dilyn America, erioed yn bwysicach.

Nid yw ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol gan y wladwriaeth yn beth newydd. Mae

moneys for over 70 years. Candidates get free mailshots, and parties receive free broadcast time at election. In 2005, the Conservative Party received £4.5 million in Short and Cranborne money and the Liberal Democrats received £1.8 million in state funding. Plaid Cymru has received £280,000 since 2005 from the Electoral Commission's £2 million-worth policy development grant. It is on record as describing such funding as having a major beneficial impact. These grants perform valuable services, which are both welcome and accepted by the public at large, but are far from sufficient.

In recent years, the financial profile of all parties has shifted. Both major UK parties have seen the ratio of income shift towards donations and away from membership fees. Income from membership fees has fallen from 49 per cent in 1975 to only 25 per cent in 1993. The resultant membership-to-donations ratio has prompted campaign reform. New tactics are centrally organised and bought, thereby indirectly reducing local activism and reducing direct contact with the public.

The POWER Inquiry's 'The Citizen's Audit of Britain', however, gives us cause to hope. A 12-month study found that 62 per cent of those polled donated money to a political or campaigning organisation. The evidence suggests that the public has not stopped donating to political causes; they have just stopped donating to political parties, which themselves may have caused that by the 1980s shift towards more centralised campaign strategies. Therefore, how should the funding of political parties be reformed so as to increase their ability to engage and motivate the public?

It is becoming increasingly evident that there is a need to contain the growth of money within the system, eradicate the possibility of buying political influence, and guarantee a level of funding sufficient to enable parties to carry out their democratic functions of policy development and public activism.

gwrthbleidiau wedi bod yn cael rhywfaint o arian ers dros 70 mlynedd. Caiff ymgeiswyr bostio'u defnydd am ddim, a chaiff pleidiau amser darlledu am ddim yn ystod etholiadau. Yn 2005, cafodd y Blaid Geidwadol £4.5 miliwn o arian gan Short a Cranborne, a chafodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol £1.8 miliwn o arian y wladwriaeth. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi cael £280,000 er 2005 gan grant datblygu polisi'r Comisiwn Etholiadol sy'n werth £2 filiwn. Cofnodwyd bod arian felly'n cael effaith fuddiol sylweddol. Mae'r grantiau hyn yn darparu gwasanaethau gwerthfawr, ac mae'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol yn eu croesawu a'u derbyn, ond maent ymhell o fod yn ddigonol.

Yn y blynyddoedd diweddar, mae proffil ariannol yr holl bleidiau wedi newid. Mae dwy brif blaid y DU wedi gweld y gymhareb incwm yn symud tuag at roddion ac oddi wrth ffioedd aelodaeth. Gostyngodd yr incwm o ffioedd aelodaeth o 49 y cant yn 1975 i ddim ond 25 y cant yn 1993. Mae'r gymhareb ganlyniadol o aelodaeth i roddion wedi ysgogi diwygio ymgyrchoedd. Caiff tactegau newydd eu trefnu a'u prynu o'r canol, gan leihau gweithredu lleol yn anuniongyrchol a lleihau cysylltiad uniongyrchol â'r cyhoedd.

Fodd bynnag, mae Ymchwiliad POWER, 'The Citizen's Audit of Britain', yn rhoi gobaith inni. Darganfu astudiaeth 12 mis fod 62 y cant o'r rhai a holwyd wedi rhoi arian i sefydliad gwleidyddol neu ymgyrchu. Awgryma'r dystiolaeth nad yw'r cyhoedd wedi rhoi'r gorau i gyfrannu at achosion gwleidyddol; yr hyn y maent wedi'i wneud yw rhoi'r gorau i gyfrannu at bleidiau gwleidyddol, a allai fod wedi achosi hynny eu hunain oherwydd y symudiad yn y 1980au tuag at strategaethau ymgyrchu mwy canolog. Felly, sut y dylid diwygio'r broses o ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol i wella'u gallu i ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd a'u hysgogi?

Mae'n dod yn gynyddol amlwg fod angen cynnal y twf arian o fewn y system, dileu posibilrwydd prynu dylanwad gwleidyddol, a gwarantu lefel ddigonol o arian i alluogi pleidiau i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau democrataidd o ran datblygu polisiau a gweithredu ymhlith y cyhoedd.

It is my view that an increase in state funding for political parties can follow only once a comprehensive framework for the limitation of expenditure and donations is agreed, which recognises the unique foundation on which parties have grown. The Phillips review has outlined four ways forward. Scenario 1 involves minimal change, and presumes that the Labour reforms of 2000 and 2006 need greater time to bed in. Scenario 2 envisages increased transparency and greater spending control. The third envisages a cap on donations. The final scenario suggests greater levels of public funding combined with a cap on donations and greater donations transparency.

On 27 February 1900, trade unions founded the Labour Party. Until 1918, it was not possible for individuals to join the party; rather, you gained membership by being part of an affiliated trade union. As a result, trade union funding is properly regarded as an affiliation fee and not as a donation. I know that that is not officially the case under the Political Parties, Elections and Referendums Act 2000, but I believe that that is a mistake that should be corrected, so that trade unions' contributions are properly interpreted as a collective membership fee and not as a single donation. Trade unions are, in reality, facilitators between individual members and the political party. Any attempt to cap such contributions would do huge damage to the singularly most powerful and successful way of ensuring wide and active public participation in politics, which goes back over 100 years.

In the past 30 years, as a percentage of income, the Labour Party has seen trade union affiliation drop from 92 per cent to 25 per cent. Donations have inevitably filled this gap, all of which have been publicised since the landmark Political Parties, Elections and Referendums Act 2000. In response to the Tory sleaze of the 1990s cash for questions, the Act requires the public disclosure of donations of more than £5,000, with foreign donations banned and general election spending capped at £30,000 per contested constituency, or a total of £19.4 million in the year running up to the election. It was the

Yn fy marn i, dim ond ar ôl cytuno ar fframwaith cynhwysfawr ar gyfer cyfyngu gwariant a rhoddion, sy'n cydnabod y sylfaen unigryw sydd wedi bod wrth wraidd twf pleidiau, y gellir sicrhau cynnydd yn arian y wladwriaeth ar gyfer pleidiau gwleidyddol. Mae adolygiad Phillips wedi amlinellu pedair ffordd ymlaen. Mae sefyllfa 1 yn ymwneud â'r newid lleiaf posibl, ac mae'n tybio bod angen mwy o amser i ddiwygiadau Llafur 2000 a 2006 ymsefydlu. Mae sefyllfa 2 yn rhagweld mwy o eglurder a mwy o reolaeth ar wariant. Mae'r trydydd yn rhagweld gosod terfyn ar roddion. Mae'r sefyllfa olaf yn awgrymu lefelau uwch o arian cyhoeddus, ynghyd â therfyn uchaf ar roddion a mwy o eglurder o ran rhoddion.

Ar 27 Chwefror 1900, sefydlwyd y Blaid Llafur gan undebau llafur. Hyd 1918, nid oedd yn bosibl i unigolion ymuno â'r blaid; yn hytrach, yr oeddech yn cael aelodaeth drwy fod yn rhan o undeb llafur cyswllt. O ganlyniad, ystyrir arian undebau llafur yn briodol fel ffi cyswllt, nid fel rhodd. Gwyddom nad dyna'r sefyllfa yn swyddogol o dan Ddeddf Pleidiau Gwleidyddol, Etholiadau a Refferenda 2000, ond credaf fod hwn yn gamgymeriad y dylid ei gywiro, fel y gellir dehongli cyfraniadau undebau llafur yn briodol fel ffi aelodaeth ar y cyd yn hytrach nag un rhodd. Mae undebau llafur, mewn gwirionedd, yn hwyluswyr rhwng aelodau unigol a'r blaid wleidyddol. Byddai unrhyw ymgais i roi terfyn ar gyfraniadau felly'n gwneud niwed mawr i'r ffordd unigol fwyaf grymus a llwyddiannus o sicrhau cyfranogiad eang a gweithredol gan y cyhoedd mewn gwleidyddiaeth, sy'n mynd yn ôl dros 100 mlynedd.

Yn ystod y 30 mlynedd diwethaf, fel canran o incwm, mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi gweld aelodaeth gyswllt undebau llafur yn gostwng o 92 y cant i 25 y cant. Mae rhoddion yn anochel wedi llenwi'r bwlch hwn, a rhoddwyd cyhoeddusrwydd i bob un ohonynt ers pasio Deddf Pleidiau Gwleidyddol, Etholiadau a Refferenda 2000, a oedd yn garreg filltir. I ymateb i lygredd y Ceidwadwyr yn y 1990au yn cynnig tâl am ofyn cwestiynau, mae'r Ddeddf yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cyhoeddi rhoddion o fwy na £5,000, gan wahardd rhoddion o dramor a gosod terfyn o £30,000 fesul etholaeth a

most significant improvement in the regime of party funding since the second world war.

Between April 2001 and May 2005, a total of £148 million was donated to political parties. The Labour Party was the single biggest beneficiary, receiving £65 million, followed by the Conservative Party, which received a far larger amount of money from individual donations than all the other parties, with 43 per cent of donation income coming from individual donations of over £100,000 each. Having said that, the Phillips review highlights the complexity of this arrangement. If a cap on donations varying from £100,000 to £5,000 were implemented, all political parties would suffer. The Conservative Party would see its funding reduced by some 40 per cent, or £7.2 million. Labour's funding would fall by 60 per cent, and that of the Liberal Democrats, by some £1.3 million. That last point underlines the complexity of the current situation and illustrates the fact that such a reform would not solve the problem. A cap would result in parties relying far more on those not covered by the funding cap. While transparency is welcome, it does not in itself solve the problem; all that it does is draw attention to it. Transparency and state funding are no panacea for our political parties.

State bureaucracies funding political parties would cause a far greater set of problems than currently exist, not least that of removing a party's responsiveness to its membership base. Furthermore, individual taxpayers would not welcome their tax money being spent on funding political parties that they do not support. A political version of the BBC licence fee would not be welcomed by many.

Therefore, the current Phillips review is tackling a curate's egg of a problem. Some have recommended asking people at election times to say which party they would like to give state funding to, and the party with the largest number of votes would get the largest financial support. However, if our bigger motive is to improve voter participation and

ymleddir ar wariant etholiad cyffredinol, neu gyfanswm o £19.4 miliwn yn y flwyddyn cyn etholiad. Hwn oedd y gwelliant mwyaf sylweddol yn y gyfundrefn ariannu pleidiau ers yr ail ryfel byd.

Rhwng mis Ebrill 2001 a mis Mai 2005, rhoddwyd cyfanswm o £148 miliwn i bleidiau gwleidyddol. Y Blaid Lafur oedd y buddiolwr unigol mwyaf, a gafodd £65 miliwn, a dilynwyd hi gan y Blaid Geidwadol a gafodd lawer mwy o arian o roddion unigol na'r holl bleidiau eraill, gyda 43 y cant o'r incwm o roddion unigol o dros £100,000 yr un. Wedi dweud hynny, mae adolygiad Phillips yn tynnu sylw at gymhlethdod y trefniant hwn. Pe bai terfyn yn cael ei osod ar roddion yn amrywio o £100,000 i £5,000, byddai pob plaid wleidyddol yn dioddef. Byddai arian y Blaid Geidwadol yn gostwng tua 40 y cant, neu £7.2 miliwn. Byddai arian y Blaid Lafur yn gostwng 60 y cant, a byddai arian y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gostwng £1.3 miliwn. Mae'r pwynt olaf yn amlinellu cymhlethdod y sefyllfa bresennol ac yn dangos na fyddai diwygiad o'r fath yn datrys y broblem. Byddai gosod terfyn yn golygu bod pleidiau'n dibynnu llawer mwy ar bobl sydd heb eu cynnwys o fewn y terfyn ariannu. Er ein bod yn croesawu eglurder, nid yw'n datrys y broblem ynddi'i hun; y cyfan a wnaiff yw tynnu sylw ati. Nid yw eglurder ac arian y wladwriaeth yn ateb tragwyddol i'n pleidiau gwleidyddol.

Byddai biwrocratiaethau'r wladwriaeth sy'n ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol yn achosi llawer mwy o broblemau nag sydd ar hyn o bryd, ac yn bennaf byddai'n dileu ymatebolrwydd plaid i'w haelodaeth sylfaenol. At hynny, ni fyddai trethdalwyr unigol yn hapus gweld eu harian treth yn cael ei wario ar ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol nad ydynt yn eu cefnogi. Ni fyddai fersiwn wleidyddol o ffi trwydded y BBC yn cael ei groesawu gan lawer.

Felly, mae adolygiad cyfredol Phillips yn ymdrin â phroblem sy'n cynnwys nodweddion cadarnhaol a negyddol. Mae rhai wedi argymhell gofyn i bobl adeg etholiadau i ba blaid yr hoffent roi arian y wladwriaeth, a byddai'r blaid sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o bleidleisiau'n cael y cymorth ariannol mwyaf. Fodd bynnag, os ein cymhelliad yn y

engagement with the process of policy development within political parties, such gimmicks will have little effect.

3.40 p.m.

Voter participation is at the heart of the problems that political parties now face. If individuals recognised membership of a political party as a priority for them, all political parties would be handsomely funded and fully engaged with the membership that they seek to represent. As a result, the Local Government and Public Services Committee is right to point to citizenship education and personal and social education in schools as playing critical roles in turning back the tide, so that the next generation of school leavers understand the important duty that they have to engage with political parties. School councils, which are now compulsory, will do a great deal to boost young people's interest in their surroundings and compel them, I hope, to engage with politics.

There remains a clear need in this country to examine the efficacy of current funding arrangements for political parties, and consider what type of reform is required to the system of party funding to help parties to fulfil their legitimate roles. Maintaining a system of parties competing fairly within the British system must concern us all. I hope that this debate has helped to contribute in some small way to the current examination of the system of funding political parties in Britain.

Michael German: I thank Jeff for raising this matter in today's short debate. With the Hayden Phillips review being delayed to achieve consensus between the political parties, this is an opportune moment for us to set out our stalls. The Liberal Democrats' position is that we think that there is a role to be played by state funding in order to deal with the two biggest issues, one of which is the buying of favours—the cash-for-

pen draw yw cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n pleidleisio mewn etholiadau, a'u cynnwys yn y broses o ddatblygu polisiau o fewn pleidiau gwleidyddol, prin fydd effaith gimics o'r fath.

Mae nifer y bobl sy'n pleidleisio mewn etholiadau wrth wraidd y problemau sy'n wynebu pleidiau gwleidyddol yn awr. Pe bai unigolion yn cydnabod bod aelodaeth o blaid wleidyddol yn flaenoriaeth iddynt, byddai pob plaid wleidyddol yn cael ei hariannu'n gadarn ac yn ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r aelodaeth y mae'n ceisio'i chynrychioli. O ganlyniad, mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn iawn i ddweud bod gan addysg ddinasyddiaeth ac addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol mewn ysgolion ran hanfodol i adfer y sefyllfa, fel y gall y genhedlaeth nesaf o bobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr ysgol ddeall y ddyletswydd bwysig sydd arnynt i ymgysylltu â phleidiau gwleidyddol. Bydd cynghorau ysgol, sydd bellach yn orfodol, yn gwneud llawer iawn i hybu diddordeb pobl ifanc yn eu hamgylchoedd, ac yn eu hannog, gobeithio, i ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth.

Mae yna angen clir o hyd yn y wlad hon i archwilio effeithiolrwydd trefniadau ariannu cyfredol y pleidiau gwleidyddol, ac i ystyried pa fath o ddiwygiadau sy'n ofynnol yn y system o ariannu pleidiau er mwyn helpu pleidiau i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau cyfreithlon. Rhaid inni bob un bryderu ynghylch cynnal system o bleidiau sy'n cystadlu'n deg yn erbyn ei gilydd o fewn y system Brydeinig. Gobeithio bod y ddadl hon wedi helpu cyfrannu mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd at y gwaith cyfredol o archwilio'r system ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol ym Mhrydain.

Michael German: Diolch i Jeff am godi'r mater hwn yn y ddadl fer heddiw. O ganlyniad i oedi gydag adolygiad Hayden Phillips, er mwyn sicrhau consensws rhwng y pleidiau gwleidyddol, mae hwn yn gyfle amserol inni roi ein barn. Cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fod yna le i arian y wladwriaeth er mwyn delio â'r ddau fater mwyaf, y naill yn ymwneud â phrynu ffafrau—mater cynnig tâl am ateb

questions issue, which still lurks in the public's psyche—and the second, the fact that very small numbers of people can give massive donations to parties. I think that the Phillips report will deal with that issue. However, I must say that we must not lose sight of the intention of political parties to motivate the electorate themselves. It is absolutely right that political parties should be mass membership parties, and that we should be going out and selling our policies and trying to do the best we can to ensure that people want to join political parties. Anything that seeks to take that away would be a negative. That is a counterbalance to the case for political funding.

I hear very well what Jeff says about the Phillips review and the issue of union membership. That of course is one of the blocks to Phillips getting a consensus on this issue at the moment. A cynic might say that it is because the Labour Party is hard up. However, it is an issue on which the Labour Party will have to give somewhat before it can be resolved. I wish Hayden Phillips every success in this matter, but we must balance the fact that political parties have to take on board their roles and duties in ensuring that they encourage people to want to be a part of the process, with our receiving a level of state funding. That would balance that issue out.

Tamsin Dunwoody: Thank you, Jeff, for raising this very important issue. Like you, I have concerns about public funding, and, like the general public, I have concerns about taxpayers' money funding parties, particularly those very small, more fascist organisations, not just because it is public money, but because it would provide a platform for a purpose that I do not believe would assist our democratic process. Our democratic process is vital and should be protected. There is absolutely no doubt that engaging young people is vital in carrying forward our future. I do not wish to go down the American route of seeing vast amounts of money spent on television campaigns that are, ultimately, just to prove what a good advertising society they have. What I wish to see is openness and transparency, and a return to the activity of young people in

cwestiynau, sy'n dal ym meddyliau'r cyhoedd—a'r ail, sef y gall niferoedd bach iawn o bobl roi rhoddion mawr iawn i bleidiau. Credaf y bydd adroddiad Phillips yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud na ddylem golli golwg ar fwriad y pleidiau gwleidyddol o ysgogi'r etholwyr eu hunain. Mae'n gwbl iawn y dylai pleidiau gwleidyddol fod yn bleidiau aelodaeth fawr, ac y dylem fod yn gwerthu ein polisïau ac yn ceisio gwneud ein gorau glas i sicrhau bod pobl am ymuno â phleidiau gwleidyddol. Byddai unrhyw beth sy'n ceisio dileu hynny yn negyddol. Mae hynny'n groes i'r achos dros ariannu gwleidyddol.

Yr wyf yn clywed yn iawn yr hyn a ddywed Jeff am adolygiad Phillips a mater aelodaeth undebau. Dyna, wrth gwrs, un o'r pethau sy'n atal Phillips rhag cael consensws llawn ar y mater hwn ar hyn o bryd. Gallai sinig ddweud mai'r rheswm dros hyn yw fod y Blaid Lafur mewn sefyllfa ariannol anodd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n fater y bydd yn rhaid i'r Blaid Lafur ildio rywfaint iddo cyn y gellir ei ddatrys. Dymunaf bob llwyddiant i Hayden Phillips ar y mater hwn, ond rhaid inni gydbwysu'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid i bleidiau gwleidyddol ystyried eu rolau a'u dyletswyddau i sicrhau eu bod yn annog pobl i fod yn rhan o'r broses, â lefel arian y wladwriaeth a gawn. Byddai hynny'n rhoi cydbwysedd i'r mater hwnnw.

Tamsin Dunwoody: Diolch ichi, Jeff am godi'r mater pwysig iawn hwn. Fel chi, yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch arian cyhoeddus, ac fel y cyhoedd yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch arian trethdalwyr yn ariannu pleidiau, yn enwedig y sefydliadau bach iawn, mwy ffasgaidd hynny, nid yn unig am mai arian cyhoeddus ydyw, ond oherwydd y byddai'n rhoi llwyfan i ddiben nad wyf yn credu y byddai'n cynorthwyo ein proses ddemocrataidd. Mae ein proses ddemocrataidd yn hanfodol, a dylid ei diogelu. Heb unrhyw amheuaeth, mae ymgysylltu â phobl ifanc yn hanfodol i sicrhau'r dyfodol. Nid wyf am ddilyn ôl-troed America, lle mae symiau anferthol yn cael eu gwario ar ymgyrchoedd teledu sy'n gwneud dim yn y pen draw ond yn ceisio profi cystal cymdeithas hysbysebu sydd ganddynt. Yr hyn yr wyf am ei weld yw natur

campaigns, by bringing the voting age down, and allowing accessibility and an integrity that will ensure that young people are interested in carrying forward politics.

David Lloyd: I also wish to thank Jeff for raising this important issue. It must be said that the cavalier way in which the London-based parties have treated the funding of political parties, certainly in recent weeks, has brought the whole matter into disrepute, to be frank, particularly with the present cash-for-peerages scandal, Lord Levy being rearrested and Tony Blair being questioned again. These events mean that you can forget about the public trusting Labour on state funding, certainly in the short term. I am not in favour of state funding for the reasons that Tamsin referred to—I do not want any of my taxes funding the British National Party. I feel strongly that party funding should be on a membership basis only. The more support you have, the more money you will get. You cannot stop people donating money to your political party as a good cause, but there should be a cap at a reasonable level. There should also be a cap, at a reasonable level, on what parties can spend on elections.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I also thank Jeff for introducing this debate and for a very informed and interesting contribution this afternoon. These are important matters, which affect all of us who believe in democracy. The current debates have ensured extra concentration on this, but, if you listened to Jeff carefully, he said that there are no easy answers and that if there were, they would have been found before now. It is only right that I point out that the regulation of the funding of and expenditure on political campaigns is exclusively a matter for the Westminster Government. It is not a matter for which I or any other Assembly Government Minister has responsibility. Therefore, what I am saying is my personal position, not the collective view of the Welsh Assembly Government.

agored ac eglurder, a gweld pobl ifanc unwaith eto'n cymryd rhan mewn ymgyrchoedd, drwy ostwng yr oedran pleidleisio a chaniatáu hygyrchedd a gonestrwydd, a fydd yn sicrhau bod gan bobl ifanc ddiddordeb mewn symud ymlaen mewn gwleidyddiaeth.

David Lloyd: Dymunaf fi hefyd ddiolch i Jeff am godi'r mater pwysig hwn. Rhaid dweud bod y ffordd ddiotal y mae pleidiau Llundain wedi ymdrin â'r broses o ariannu pleidiau gwleidyddol, yn sicr yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, wedi dwyn anfri ar yr holl fater, i fod yn onest, yn enwedig o ran y sgandal presennol ynglŷn ag arian am arglwyddiaethau, Arglwydd Levy yn cael ei ail-arestio a Tony Blair yn cael ei holi eto. Mae'r digwyddiadau hyn yn golygu y gallwch anghofio am weld y cyhoedd yn ymddiried yn y Blaid Lafur ynghylch arian y wladwriaeth, yn sicr am y tro. Nid wyf o blaid arian y wladwriaeth am y rhesymau y cyfeiriodd Tamsin atynt—nid wyf am weld yr un geiniog o'm trethi yn ariannu'r Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig. Teimlaf yn gryf y dylai'r broses o ariannu pleidiau fod ar sail aelodaeth yn unig. Po fwyaf o gefnogaeth sydd gennych, mwyaf oll o arian a gewch. Ni allwch atal pobl rhag rhoi arian i'ch plaid wleidyddol fel achos da, ond dylid gosod terfyn ar lefel resymol. Dylid gosod terfyn hefyd, ar lefel resymol, ar y swm y gall pleidiau ei wario ar etholiadau.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Yr wyf fi hefyd yn diolch i Jeff am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ac am gyfraniad hyddysg a diddorol iawn y prynhawn yma. Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig, sy'n effeithio ar bob un ohonom sy'n credu mewn democratiaeth. Mae'r dadleuon presennol wedi sicrhau y bydd mwy o ganolbwyntio ar hyn, ond os oeddech yn gwrandao ar Jeff yn ofalus, dywedodd nad oes atebion hawdd, a phe bai atebion hawdd, byddem wedi eu cael cyn hyn. Dylwn ddweud mai mater i Lywodraeth San Steffan yn llwyr yw'r gwaith o reoleiddio ariannu ymgyrchoedd gwleidyddol a faint a warir arnynt. Nid wyf fi nac unrhyw Weinidog arall yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdano. Felly, fy safbwynt personol i yw hwn, nid barn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y cyd.

It seems to me that Jeff raised three separate questions. First, should there be a limit on the expenditure of political parties, not just in the short campaign but perhaps over the electoral cycle? Secondly, should there be a limit on the size of donations to political parties? Thirdly, should the state contribute more to the funding of political parties? At the heart of my consideration of this is the basic proposition and premise that democratic politics needs to be based on the active participation of as many citizens as possible. That is the crux of the issue for us and the challenge for political parties: how do we secure the active participation that we all desire?

I have little sympathy with huge and expensive media-led campaigns. I think that they are, essentially, campaigns that are done to people, not with them and rarely for them. The references to the United States are instructive here, because if we look across the pond, we see a political system that has fundraising at its very heart. At its highest level, at the presidential level, the ability to fundraise seems to be the chief determinant of participation. That seems absolutely appalling to me, but that is the state of play there.

I also have little sympathy with the form of politics that relies on donations from a few individuals. As you rightly say—and others alluded to this—there would be considerable concern about an over-reliance on state funding if the result of that, as may well be the case, is that it increases the passivity of the population, who would just be receiving campaigns rather than thinking about them and being part of them. It may be an old-fashioned view, and I hope that I am not swimming against the tide, but I continue to believe in a form of politics that relies on the large-scale popular membership of political parties. I continue to believe that the principle of political parties is that they have to respond to their own membership and motivate them and earn their subscriptions. However, as I say, I may be swimming against the tide.

In terms of limits on expenditure, if parties are to compete on the basis of the strength

Ymddengys i mi fod Jeff wedi codi tri chwestiwn ar wahân. Yn gyntaf, a ddylid gosod terfyn ar wariant pleidiau gwleidyddol, nid yn yr ymgyrch fer yn unig, ond efallai yn ystod y cylch etholiadol? Yn ail, a ddylid gosod terfyn ar y rhoddion i bleidiau gwleidyddol? Yn drydydd, a ddylai'r wladwriaeth gyfrannu mwy o arian i bleidiau gwleidyddol? Wrth wraidd fy ystyriaeth o hyn mae'r rhagosodiad y dylai gwleidyddiaeth ddemocrataidd fod yn seiliedig ar gyfranogiad brwd cynifer â phosibl o ddinasyddion. Dyna graidd y mater i ni a'r her i bleidiau gwleidyddol: sut y gallwn sicrhau'r cyfranogiad brwd y mae pob un ohonom am ei weld?

Nid wyf yn cefnogi ymgyrchoedd enfawr a chostus yn cael eu harwain gan y cyfryngau. Credaf eu bod yn ymgyrchoedd sydd yn y bôn yn cael eu gorfodi ar bobl, yn hytrach na chyda phobl ac yn anaml ar gyfer pobl. Mae'r cyfeiriadau at yr Unol Daleithiau'n ddefnyddiol yma, oherwydd os edrychwn ar y wlad honno gwelwn system wleidyddol lle mae codi arian yn sail iddi. Ar ei lefel uchaf, ar lefel yr arlywydd, ymddengys mai'r gallu i godi arian yw'r prif ffactor sy'n penderfynu a fyddwch yn cymryd rhan. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn hollol warthus i mi, ond dyna yw'r sefyllfa yno.

Nid wyf ychwaith yn cefnogi'r math o wleidyddiaeth sy'n dibynnu ar roddion gan ychydig unigolion. Fel y dywedwch yn gywir ddigona chyfeiriodd eraill at hyn-byddai pryder mawr ynglŷn â gorddibynnu ar arian y wladwriaeth pe bai'n gwneud pobl yn fwy difater, a gallai hynny ddigwydd yn yr ystyr y byddent yn derbyn ymgyrchoedd yn ddi-gwestiwn yn hytrach na meddwl amdanynt a bod yn rhan ohonynt. Hwyrach mai barn henffasiwn yw hynny, a gobeithio nad wyf yn mynd yn erbyn y llif. Ond yr wyf yn dal i gredu mewn math o wleidyddiaeth sy'n dibynnu ar aelodaeth pobl o bleidiau gwleidyddol ar raddfa helaeth. Yr wyf yn dal i gredu mai egwyddor pleidiau gwleidyddol yw ei bod yn rhaid iddynt ymateb i'w haelodau eu hunain a'u cymell ac ennill eu tanysgrifiadau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, efallai fy mod yn mynd yn erbyn y llif.

O ran terfynau gwariant, er mwyn i bleidiau gystadlu ar sail cryfder a chymhelliant eu

and the motivation of their membership, we must look seriously at limits. We seem to have reached a situation in which parties feel compelled to raise and spend vast sums of money, simply in order not to be outdone by their opponents. The campaign may not necessarily interest or inform the electorate, but the parties seek to ensure that the noise from any one party is not so dominant as to exclude the others. This is primarily a problem for general elections. Expenditure on the forthcoming Assembly election, and on local elections next year, will be modest, and one problem will be trying to achieve a minimal level of communication. However, in general elections, which I think that we are largely referring to here, the sums involved are far larger. My view is that, in general elections, an increased trajectory of expenditure seems to result in a downward trajectory in terms of interest and involvement by the population. As you see more and more money going in, and more hype and noise, it seems to result in a decrease in the very things that people are trying to achieve.

3.50 p.m.

On limits on contributions, if our aim is to encourage wide participation in politics, we would be concerned about any political party that could compete simply on the basis of a few large donations from individuals. There may be a case for a different point of view, and I guess that Mike has a different point of view to Jeff and me. I agree with Jeff that when the donations come from organisations with mass membership and demonstrated commitments, such as trade unions, I do not think that it would be fair to prevent them from making a contribution.

Adding to the amount of public funding that parties receive may not necessarily be popular, but there are arguments in favour of it, as well as against. Simply put, it would ensure financial stability and underline the necessity of healthy political debate in an elected democracy. If it were allocated according to the number of votes cast at one or more previous general elections, and in relation to the elections for devolved administrations, it would, depending on the threshold set, assist smaller parties, not just

haelodau, rhaid inni edrych ar y terfynau o ddifrif. Yr ydym fel pe baem wedi cyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae pleidiau'n teimlo'u bod yn gorfod codi a gwario llawer o arian, dim ond er mwyn sicrhau na fydd eu gwrthwynebwyr yn codi ac yn gwario mwy. Efallai nad yw'r ymgyrch o ddiddordeb i etholwyr nac yn rhoi gwybodaeth iddynt o reidrwydd, ond mae'r pleidiau'n ceisio sicrhau nad yw'r sŵn gan un blaid mor uchel fel ei fod yn boddi llais y lleill. Problem i etholiadau cyffredinol yw hon yn bennaf. Bydd gwariant ar etholiad y Cynulliad sydd ar ddod, ac ar yr etholiadau lleol y flwyddyn nesaf, yn gymharol fach, ac un broblem fydd ceisio sicrhau rhyw lefel o gyfathrebu. Fodd bynnag, mewn etholiadau cyffredinol, fel y cyfeiriwn atynt yma yn bennaf, mi gredaf, mae'r symiau dan sylw yn llawer mwy. Yn fy marn i, mewn etholiadau cyffredinol mae'n ymddangos bod mwy o wariant yn arwain at lai o ddiddordeb a chyfranogiad gan y cyhoedd. Wrth i fwy a mwy o arian gael ei wario, a mwy o gyhoeddusrwydd a sŵn, mae fel pe bae'n arwain at leihad yn yr union bethau y mae pobl yn ceisio'u cyflawni.

O ran gosod terfynau ar gyfraniadau, os ydym yn anelu at annog cyfranogiad eang mewn gwleidyddiaeth, byddem yn pryderu am unrhyw blaid wleidyddol a allai gystadlu ar sail ychydig roddion mawr yn unig gan unigolion. Efallai bod achos dros farn wahanol, a thybiaf fod Mike yn credu'n wahanol i Jeff a minnau. Cytunaf â Jeff, sef pan ddaw'r rhoddion gan sefydliadau sydd â llawer o aelodau ac ymrwymadau amlwg, megis undebau llafur, ni chredaf y byddai'n deg eu hatal rhag gwneud cyfraniad.

Hwyrach nad yw ychwanegu at yr arian cyhoeddus a gaiff pleidiau yn boblogaidd o reidrwydd, ond mae yna ddadleuon o blaid hynny, yn ogystal ag yn ei erbyn. Yn syml, byddai'n sicrhau sefydlogrwydd ariannol ac yn tanlinellu anghenraid dadl wleidyddol iach mewn democratiaeth etholedig. Pe bai'n cael ei ddyrannu yn ôl nifer y pleidleisiau a fwriwyd mewn un neu fwy o etholiadau cyffredinol blaenorol, ac mewn perthynas ag etholiadau gweinyddiaethau datganoledig, byddai'n helpu pleidiau llai, yn ôl y trothwy a

the big battalions. It could also encourage voter turnout in safe seats. A significant amount of public funding is a major component in western-style democracies, such as those of Canada, Australia and New Zealand and, I think, some European countries. However, as people have said, there is resistance in many forms to more public funding. Some people simply oppose it as a matter of principle—it is just something that they could not stomach. However, we have done it; for example, the Assembly provides £2 million in financial support for the mailing of election material for Assembly candidates. Others argue, as has been said here, that they do not want to see their money going to parties with which they strongly disagree. There clearly is, as Tamsin and Dai have said, the worry that that money could go to parties whose beliefs we find completely unacceptable. As Jeff said, there is no obvious answer. If I were to hazard a guess, I think that we may see some movement towards state funding in the future, just because it would be an attempt at achieving a fair playing field—I am not sure that that is the same as a level playing field. But, and it is big ‘but’, if things do move that way, that should not be at the expense of participation in political parties and political activity.

Jeff is right to say that education is crucial. I was a member of the Local Government and Public Services Committee, as was Dai, and it was clear that we have been failing to give our youngsters a basic education about the way that party politics operates. Our visit to Denmark and other countries was very instructive. We saw youngsters who had a real understanding of what political parties mean and of why it was important to vote. As all of us who sat on that committee know, the time bomb is ticking on this one and we need to make some urgent changes if we are not to find a whole generation of people opting out from their duty and their responsibility to be part of the democracy that we have in the UK. Thank you very much, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister,

osodir, nid y pleidiau mawr yn unig. Gallai hefyd annog pobl i bleidleisio mewn seddi diogel. Mae llawer iawn o arian cyhoeddus yn elfen bwysig mewn democratiaethau yn y gorllewin, megis Canada, Awstralia a Seland Newydd a rhai gwledydd yn Ewrop, mi gredaf. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae pobl wedi'i ddweud, mae gwrthwynebiad o lawer math i fwy o arian cyhoeddus. Mae rhai pobl yn gwrthwynebu'r egwyddor—mae'n rhywbeth na allent ei oddef. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi'i wneud; er enghraifft, mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi £2 filiwn o gymorth ariannol i anfon deunydd etholiad drwy'r post ar gyfer ymgeiswyr y Cynulliad. Mae eraill yn dadlau, fel y dywedwyd yma, nad ydynt am i'w harian fynd i bleidiau y maent yn anghytuno'n gryf â hwy. Fel y dywedodd Tamsin a Dai, mae yna bryder yn amlwg y gallai'r arian hwnnw fynd i bleidiau y mae eu daliadau'n gwbl annerbyniol inni. Fel y dywedodd Jeff, nid oes ateb amlwg. Pe byddwn am ddyfalu, credaf y gallwn weld rhyw symud tuag at arian y wladwriaeth yn y dyfodol, oherwydd byddai'n ymgais i sicrhau amodau teg i bawb—nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'r un fath â gosod yr un amodau i bawb. Ond, ac y mae'n 'ond' mawr, os bydd pethau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, ni ddylai hynny fod ar draul cyfranogiad mewn pleidiau gwleidyddol a gweithgarwch gwleidyddol.

Mae Jeff yn llygad ei le pan ddywed fod addysg yn hanfodol. Bûm yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, fel Dai, ac yr oedd yn amlwg nad ydym wedi rhoi addysg sylfaenol i'n pobl ifanc am y ffordd y mae gwleidyddiaeth plaid yn gweithio. Yr oedd ein hymwelid â Denmarc a gwledydd eraill yn ddefnyddiol iawn. Gwelsom bobl ifanc a oedd yn deall yn wirioneddol yr hyn y mae pleidiau gwleidyddol yn ei olygu a pham y mae'n bwysig pleidleisio. Fel y gwyrddom bob un a oedd yn aelod o'r pwyllgor hwnnw, mae'r amser yn mynd yn brin, ac mae angen inni sicrhau rhai newidiadau ar unwaith er mwyn peidio â chael cenhedlaeth gyfan o bobl nad ydynt yn cyflawni eu dyletswydd a'u cyfrifoldeb i fod yn rhan o'r ddemocratiaeth sydd gennym yn y DU. Diolch yn fawr iawn, Lywydd.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog, Jeff

Jeff Cuthbert, and all of you who contributed to that fascinating short debate. Cuthbert, a phawb a gyfrannodd at y ddadl fer hynod ddiddorol honno.

Dyna ddiwedd ar ein trafodion am heddiw. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 3.54 p.m.
The meeting ended at 3.54 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)