

# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**

## **Pwyllgor Archwilio**

# **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Audit Committee**

### **Rheoli'r Casgliadau yn Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru Collections Management at the National Museums and Galleries of Wales**

**Cwestiynau 1-108  
Questions 1-108**

**Dydd Iau 6 Mai 2004  
Thursday 6 May 2004**

*Aelodau o'r Cynulliad yn bresennol: Janet Davies (Cadeirydd), Mick Bates, Alun Cairns, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Christine Gwyther, Denise Idris Jones, Val Lloyd, David Melding, Leighton Andrews.*

*Swyddogion yn bresennol: Syr John Bourn, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru; Mike Usher, Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru; Gillian Body, Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru; Ian Summers, Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru; Ceri Thomas, Swyddog Cydymffurfio Dros Dro, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

*Tystion: Michael Houlihan, Cyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol, Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru; Eurwyn Wiliam, Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol, Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

*Assembly Members present: Janet Davies (Chair), Mick Bates, Alun Cairns, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Christine Gwyther, Denise Idris Jones, Val Lloyd, David Melding, Leighton Andrews.*

*Officials present: Sir John Bourn, Auditor General for Wales; Mike Usher, National Audit Office Wales; Gillian Body, National Audit Office Wales; Ian Summers, National Audit Office Wales; Ceri Thomas, Acting Compliance Officer, National Assembly for Wales.*

*Witnesses: Michael Houlihan, Director General, National Museums and Galleries of Wales; Eurwyn Wiliam, Deputy Director General, National Museums and Galleries of Wales.*

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.30 a.m.  
The meeting began at 9.30 a.m.*

[1] **Janet Davies:** Croeso i gyfarfod cyntaf y Pwyllgor yn nhymor yr haf.

I remind everyone that the Committee operates bilingually and that headsets are available for the translation of Welsh into English, and also to amplify the sound for those who need it. I also remind everyone to turn off their mobile phones, pagers or other electronic devices, as they interfere with the broadcast and translation system.

Apologies have been received from Mark Isherwood and Carl Sargeant, and we welcome David Melding and Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey in their place.

Are there any declarations of interest?

[2] **Leighton Andrews:** In relation to the paper to note on OSIRIS, I would like to declare an interest. My wife is the national manager of BT in Wales, which is the supplier to Siemens.

[3] **Janet Davies:** Thank you.

This is the first time that the Committee has had the opportunity to discuss the work of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, and at the heart of what we are discussing today is how well the museums' collections are cared for, and the extent to which the people of Wales are able to access the collections. As the Auditor General's report points out, the 4.7 million items are the heritage and culture of Wales, and the collection is largely funded by the public purse, so it is right that we examine whether the museums' collections are being managed effectively. Although progress has been made in recent years, the report leaves us in little doubt that, in terms of curation, storage and conservation, real improvements are necessary, that the wellbeing of at least part of our heritage is possibly at risk, and that the potential for education and access is hampered. We will take evidence today from Mr Michael Houlihan, director general of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, and Mr Eurwyn Wiliam, the deputy director general. I welcome you to this session, and ask you to

[1] **Janet Davies:** Welcome to the Committee's first meeting of the summer term.

Atgoffaf bawb bod y Pwyllgor yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog a bod clustffonau ar gael ar gyfer cyfieithiad o'r Gymraeg i'r Saesneg, a hefyd i gynyddu'r sain i bobl sydd ag angen hynny. Atgoffaf bawb hefyd i ddifodd eu ffoniau symudol, blipwyr neu unrhyw ddyfais electronig arall, oherwydd eu bod yn ymyrryd â'r offer cyfieithu a darlledu.

Derbyniwyd ymddiheuriadau gan Mark Isherwood a Carl Sargeant, a chrosawn David Melding a Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey yn eu lle.

A oes unrhyw ddatganiadau o fuddiannau?

[2] **Leighton Andrews:** O ran y papur ar OSIRIS, hoffwn ddatgan buddiant. Fy ngwraig yw rheolwraig genedlaethol BT yng Nghymru, sef y cyflenwyr i Siemens.

[3] **Janet Davies:** Diolch.

Dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r Pwyllgor gael y cyfle i drafod gwaith Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru, a'r hyn sy'n ganolog i'n trafodaethau heddiw yw pa mor dda y gofelir am gasgliadau'r amgueddfeydd, ac i ba raddau y mae pobl Cymru yn gallu cael mynediad i'r casgliadau. Fel y mae adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn nodi, treftadaeth a diwylliant Cymru yw'r 4.7 miliwn o eitemau, a chyllidir y casgliad i raddau helaeth gan gyllid cyhoeddus, felly, mae'n iawn i ni archwilio a yw casgliadau'r amgueddfeydd yn cael eu rheoli'n effeithiol. Er bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n amlwg, o ran curaduriaeth, storio a chadwraeth, bod gwelliannau gwirioneddol yn angenrheidiol, a bod lles o leiaf ran o'n treftadaeth mewn perygl o bosibl, a bod y potensial ar gyfer addysg a mynediad yn cael ei lesteirio. Byddwn yn cymryd tystiolaeth heddiw gan Mr Michael Houlihan, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru, a Mr Eurwyn Wiliam, y dirprwy gyfarwyddwr cyffredinol.

introduce yourselves.

**Mr Houlihan:** I am Michael Houlihan. I am director general of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. I have been in post since April of last year. Prior to that I was chief executive of the National Museums and Galleries of Northern Ireland. My career spans about 30 years in museums—longer than I care to remember, now—starting at the Imperial War Museum, through local government museums as well, such as the Horniman museum in south London. So, I have quite a broad experience of working in these particular areas.

**Dr Wiliam:** My name is Eurwyn Wiliam. I am the deputy director general. I am also the director directly responsible for this area of the museums' activity.

[4] **Janet Davies:** Thank you. I will begin by asking a couple of fairly general questions. I refer, first of all, to paragraph 1.8 of the Auditor General's report. Could you explain briefly for us exactly what collection management entails, and how you determine the level of resources directed towards collection management, balanced against all the other demands on your resources?

**Mr Houlihan:** Certainly. I will begin by briefly setting out the context for this, which will, I think, assist the committee in understanding how resources are allocated. Museums are driven in quite a number of ways. They have a responsibility, clearly, for the stewardship of their collections, but they also have responsibilities for ensuring that they are accessed and that the public is able to engage with those collections.

Fe'ch croesawaf i'r sesiwn hon, a gofynnaf i chi gyflwyno'ch hunain.

**Mr Houlihan:** Michael Houlihan ydw i. Fi yw cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru. Yr wyf wedi bod yn y swydd ers mis Ebrill y llynedd. Cyn hynny yr oeddwn yn brif weithredwr Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae fy ngyrfa mewn amgueddfeydd yn mynd yn ôl ryw 30 mlynedd—yn fwy nag y dymunaf ei gofio, bellach—yn dechrau yn Amgueddfa Ryfel yr Ymerodraeth, drwy amgueddfeydd llywodraeth leol yn ogystal, fel amgueddfa Horniman yn ne Llundain. Felly, mae gennyf brofiad eithaf helaeth o weithio yn y meysydd penodol hyn.

**Dr Wiliam:** Eurwyn Wiliam ydw i. Fi yw'r dirprwy gyfarwyddwr cyffredinol. Fi hefyd yw'r cyfarwyddwr sy'n uniongyrchol gyfrifol am y maes hwn yng ngweithgareddau'r amgueddfeydd.

[4] **Janet Davies:** Diolch. Yr wyf am gychwyn drwy ofyn ambell gwestiwn digon cyffredinol. Cyfeiriaf, yn gyntaf, at baragraff 1.8 yn adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol. A ellwch egluro'n gryno yn union beth mae rheoli casgliad yn ei olygu, a sut yr ydych yn pennu lefel yr adnoddau a ddefnyddir i reoli'r casgliad, o'i bwysu yn erbyn yr holl ofynion eraill ar eich adnoddau?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn sicr. Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy nodi cyd-destun hyn yn gryno. Bydd hynny, yn fy marn i, yn cynorthwyo'r pwyllgor i ddeall sut y dyrennir adnoddau. Rheolir amgueddfeydd mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Mae ganddynt gyfrifoldeb, yn amlwg, dros stiwardio'u casgliadau, ond mae ganddynt hefyd gyfrifoldebau dros sicrhau bod pobl yn cael mynediad iddynt a bod y cyhoedd yn gallu defnyddio'r casgliadau hynny.

For many years, museums were principally driven by the whole public service context in terms of communicating their collections, but, for the last 20 years, and this has certainly been an international issue, museums have begun to pay more attention to the whole question of how they secure, care for and document their collections. So, the whole move towards collections management, if I can use that phrase, which encompasses the security, care, and documentation of the collections, has received much more attention with the growth of specialised skills within museums—staffing skills on the collections management and conservation side. In many museums, you see the setting up of conservation departments over the past 15 years, documentation sections taking advantage of the new technological changes that have been coming through, and generally trying to increase the ability to access information, both for internal purposes and also for external purposes for the public. There has been this sort of step growth, if you like, in the whole area of collections management. This has been driven by a number of issues and, I think, a greater understanding of the long-term importance of the objects that we hold. I think that it is important to remember that museums tend to take quite a long perspective on their collections—we are talking several hundred years into the future—so there is a whole package of issues there.

They also, obviously, need to make their collections accessible in various ways. The principle way in which museums make their collections accessible has been through exhibitions, but, clearly, technology is opening up very different ways in which information about the collections can be made available to a wider audience. Essentially, there are a whole series of balances that have to be met. There is still a very strong public demand, inevitably, for exhibitions, events, and educational activities in the conventional sense, but there are also long-term drivers, particularly in terms of the security and care of the collections and documentation. It is a question of how you find that balance, and try to build that. However, I think that, if you look at the budgets of the National Museums and Galleries of Wales over the past 20 years, an increasing percentage of the budget is being allocated to this collection care issue. I think that if you compare

Am flynyddoedd lawer, rheolid amgueddfeydd yn bennaf gan yr holl gyd-destun gwasanaeth cyhoeddus o ran cyfathrebu eu casgliadau. Ond yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae hyn yn sicr wedi bod yn fater rhyngwladol, mae amgueddfeydd wedi dechrau rhoi mwy o sylw i holl gwestiwn sut maent yn diogelu eu casgliadau, yn gofalu amdanynt ac yn eu dogfennu. Felly, mae'r symudiad tuag at reoli casgliadau, os caf ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd hwnnw, sy'n cwmpasu diogelwch, gofal a dogfennu'r casgliadau, wedi cael llawer mwy o sylw gyda thwf sgiliau arbenigol o fewn amgueddfeydd—sgiliau staffio ar ochr rheoli a chadwraeth casgliadau. Mewn nifer o amgueddfeydd, gwelwch adrannau cadwraeth yn cael eu sefydlu yn ystod y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, adrannau dogfennu yn manteisio ar y newidiadau technolegol newydd sydd wedi bod yn digwydd, ac yn gyffredinol yn ceisio cynyddu'r gallu i gael mynediad i wybodaeth, at ddibenion mewnol a hefyd at ddibenion allanol ar gyfer y cyhoedd. Mae'r math hwn o dwf bob yn gam, os dymunwch, wedi digwydd ledled holl faes rheoli casgliadau. Llywiwyd hyn gan nifer o faterion, a gwell dealltwriaeth, mi gredaf, o bwysigrwydd hirdymor yr eitemau sydd yn ein meddiant. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig cofio bod amgueddfeydd yn tueddu i gymryd persbectif eithaf hir ar eu casgliadau—yr ydym yn siarad am gannoedd lawer o flynyddoedd yn y dyfodol—felly, mae pecyn cyfan o faterion yma.

Mae angen iddynt hefyd, yn amlwg, sicrhau bod eu casgliadau'n hygyrch mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Y brif ffordd y mae amgueddfeydd yn gwneud eu casgliadau'n hygyrch yw drwy arddangosfeydd, ond yn amlwg, mae technoleg yn hwyluso ffyrdd gwahanol iawn i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth am y casgliadau ar gael i gynulleidfa ehangach. Yn y bôn, mae cyfres gyfan o gydbwyseddau i'w bodloni. Mae galw brwd iawn gan y cyhoedd o hyd, yn anochel, am arddangosfeydd, digwyddiadau, a gweithgareddau addysgol yn yr ystyr arferol, ond mae yna ysgogiadau hirdymor hefyd, yn arbennig o ran diogelwch y casgliadau a'r dogfennau a gofalu amdanynt. Mae'n fater sut i sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw, a cheisio adeiladu arno. Fodd bynnag, o edrych ar gyllidebau Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, credaf fod canran gynyddol o'r gyllideb yn cael ei dyrannu i'r mater hwn

the figures, something like 25 per cent is now allocated to collections, and a similar figure is also allocated to exhibitions and educational activities—if you like, the sort of public front end of the activity.

So, there is a balance there, but, I think that, with pressures coming on budgets, we also have to find somewhat smarter solutions to some of these issues, and certainly try to address the sort of access issues that were picked up in the National Audit Office report. We will need to try to find solutions that not only address access, but also solutions that address communication with the public. Similarly, the museum faces quite serious issues in relation to its estate, and estate management—it needs quite a lot of investment, which we can get into later, if we need to. However, clearly, there are possibilities and solutions there: by addressing improvements in the estate, we can also address issues in relation to the proper care and storage of the collections as well, so it is a case of finding these multiple solutions. Certainly, storage does not necessarily mean that collections are not accessible to the public. We have to find solutions that will enable public access.

[5] **Janet Davies:** Thank you. I think that some of the other Members will want to go into particular details, later this morning. However, may I just ask at the moment, you seem to have managed to reduce the estimate of the size of the collection from 7.5 million items to 4.7 million items, how did you manage to do that? That is quite a significant difference.

**Mr Houlihan:** I can give a general answer and then, if you require further information, Dr Wiliam will be happy to provide it. Essentially, from a context point of view, this has happened, I think, in museums everywhere. As they have got to grips with the issue of identifying and documenting all of the objects in their collections, they have generally found that there are actually a smaller number of objects within the collections. This can be because of issues of poor record keeping in early years. There are classic examples of black holes in some museums' record

o ofalu am gasgliadau. Os cymharwch y ffigurau, credaf fod oddeutu 25 y cant yn cael ei ddyrannu nawr i gasgliadau, ac mae ffigur cyffelyb hefyd yn cael ei ddyrannu hefyd i arddangosfeydd a gweithgareddau addysgol— elfen gyhoeddus y gweithgarwch, os mynnwch.

Felly, mae cydbwysedd yno, ond gyda'r pwysau ar ein cyllidebau, credaf fod yn rhaid i ni hefyd ddod o hyd i atebion gwell i rai o'r materion hyn, ac yn sicr i geisio mynd i'r afael â'r math o faterion mynediad amlinellwyd yn adroddiad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Bydd angen i ni geisio dod o hyd i atebion sydd nid yn unig yn mynd i'r afael â mynediad, ond hefyd atebion sy'n mynd i'r afael â chyfathrebu â'r cyhoedd. Yn yr un modd, mae'r amgueddfa yn wynebu materion digon difrifol ynghylch ei hystâd, a rheoli'r ystâd—mae angen cryn fuddsoddi, y gallwn ei drafod yn ddiweddarach, os bydd angen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg fod yna bosibiliadau ac atebion: drwy fynd i'r afael â gwelliannau yn yr ystâd, gallwn hefyd fynd i'r afael hefyd â materion sy'n ymwneud â storio'r casgliadau a gofalu amdanynt yn iawn, felly, mae'n fater o ddod o hyd i'r atebion lluosog hyn. Yn sicr, nid yw storio o reidrwydd yn golygu nad yw casgliadau ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n rhaid i ni gael atebion a fydd yn rhoi mynediad i'r cyhoedd.

[5] **Janet Davies:** Diolch. Credaf y bydd rhai o'r Aelodau eraill am drafod manylion penodol, yn ddiweddarach yn y bore. Fodd bynnag, a gaf fi ofyn ar hyn o bryd, ymddengys eich bod wedi llwyddo i ostwng yr amcangyfrif o faint y casgliad o 7.5 miliwn o eitemau i 4.7 miliwn o eitemau. Sut y gwnaethoch chi hynny? Mae hynny'n gryn wahaniaeth.

**Mr Houlihan:** Gallaf roi ateb cyffredinol, ac yna, os oes arnoch angen rhagor o wybodaeth, bydd Dr Wiliam yn fodlon ei darparu. Yn y bôn, o safbwynt cyd-destun, mae hyn wedi digwydd, yn fy marn i, mewn amgueddfeydd ymhob man. Wrth iddynt fynd i'r afael â'r dasg o nodi a dogfennu'r holl wrthrychau yn eu casgliadau, maent wedi gweld yn gyffredinol fod llai o eitemau yn y casgliadau mewn gwirionedd. Gall hyn fod oherwydd i gofnodion gael eu cadw'n wael yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae enghreifftiau clasurol o fylchau difrifol yng nghofnodion rhai

keeping—at two of the museums that I worked in, the period from the 1930s to the 1950s was a sort of black hole in documentation. People were really just guessing how many objects were in the collections. There are also quite technical issues in relation to whether you should count a tray of 1,000 fruit flies as 1,000 objects, or is it really just a single object? Do you count a cabinet of fruit flies as one cabinet or 26 trays? There are all these sorts of issues, which, I think, as museums come to grips with the way in which they account for the objects in their collections, the numbers have tended to come down.

[6] **Jocelyn Davies:** How do you know that none of them have been stolen?

**Mr Houlihan:** There are a number of ways in which we ensure that. The first point—and I think that this is a fundamental point—is that security and the security systems that we have in the museum are essential to ensure that risk is minimised. So, it is about a risk management situation, and how you manage risk and how you assess that risk. We have very effective systems that meet international standards, because, bear in mind, not only are our collections going abroad, we are also borrowing from abroad. The recent Thomas Jones exhibition was an example of objects coming from Russia and from the United States.

So, security is very much at the forefront of what we do. In my experience, a high-risk area, if you like, is contractors in a building, which tends to create issues. Again, the National Museum of Wales has very rigorous systems for accompanying contractors around the site, for logging and recording, and a system of passes—those sorts of things. Therefore, there is that system, which is the first line of defence.

amgueddfeydd—mewn dwy o'r amgueddfeydd lle bûm i'n gweithio, yr oedd y cyfnod rhwng y 1930au a'r 1950au megis twll du o ran dogfennaeth. Yr oedd pobl mewn gwirionedd yn dyfalu faint o eitemau a oedd yn y casgliadau. Mae materion eithaf technegol hefyd ynghylch a ddylech gyfrif hambwrdd o 1,000 o bryfed ffrwythau fel 1,000 o eitemau, neu ai un eitem ydyw mewn gwirionedd? A ydych yn cyfrif cist o bryfed ffrwythau fel un gist neu 26 hambwrdd? Mae llwyth o faterion fel hyn, yn fy marn i, ac wrth i amgueddfeydd fynd i'r afael â'r ffordd y maent yn cyfrif y gwrthrychau yn eu casgliadau, mae'r niferoedd wedi tueddu i ostwng.

[6] **Jocelyn Davies:** Sut wyddoch chi nad oes yr un ohonynt wedi'u dwyn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae nifer o ffyrdd i ni sicrhau hynny. Y pwynt cyntaf—a chredaf fod hwn yn bwynt sylfaenol—yw bod diogelwch a'r systemau diogelwch sydd gennym yn yr amgueddfa yn hanfodol i sicrhau cyn lleied o risg â phosibl. Felly, mae'n ymwneud â sefyllfa o reoli risg, a sut yr ydych yn rheoli risg a sut yr ydych yn asesu'r risg honno. Mae gennym systemau effeithiol iawn sy'n bodloni safonau rhyngwladol, oherwydd, cofiwch fod ein casgliadau nid yn unig yn mynd dramor, ond yr ydym hefyd yn benthyg o wledydd tramor. Yr oedd arddangosfa am Thomas Jones yn ddiweddar yn enghraifft o eitemau'n dod o Rwsia ac o'r Unol Daleithiau.

Felly, mae diogelwch yn gwbl hanfodol i'r hyn a wnawn. O brofiad, maes risg uchel, os mynnwch, yw contractwyr mewn adeilad, sy'n tueddu i greu problemau. Eto, mae gan Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru systemau cadarn iawn ar gyfer tywys contractwyr o gwmpas y safle, ar gyfer logio a chofnodi, a systemau o basiau—pethau fel hynny. Felly, mae'r system honno ar waith, sef y llinell amddiffyn gyntaf.

The second area should relate to other aspects, such as spot-checks on collections and, certainly, areas where we have identified that the objects are of high value, intellectually and financially. Those objects are quite often already on display, so they are being checked on a daily basis. Many objects are being checked through use by researchers, our own staff and so on, so there is a lot of checking going on. However, as the report points out, there is a sort of stock check or verification system, which we do some of, and the report indicates that we could do more on that.

[7] **David Melding:** Is it the experience of major museums that the estimate of their collections has gone down by roughly a third, which is very substantial, or, in our case, it is higher? Is there now an accepted methodology for counting collections? I was surprised by the example that you gave, because it struck me that, if you were counting fruit flies then you had 1,000, and if you were counting trays then you had one. I presume that the collection was fruit flies, not trays.

**Mr Houlihan:** It depends on the collection, actually. I was just trying to use that as a simple illustrative example of the situation. Certainly in the museums in which I have worked, the count of objects has generally gone down for the sort of reasons that I have described. I would not be able to answer that for every museum, but generally, that does seem to have been the case. It is partly due to one or two quite significant drivers. Much work, both internationally and nationally, has been done on establishing standardised systems of documentation, both through the vocabulary used to describe objects and through the systems for recording the levels of recording and such like. So a great deal of standardisation has come in, and the standard that is generally adopted, for example, in the UK, is the SPECTRUM standard, which has been developed by what was formally known as the Museums Documentation Association, which I should mention, as I am the chairman as well. So those systems have come in and, I think, as a result of that, there has been this standardisation of systems. Museums are notorious for the fact that they tend to

Dylai'r ail faes ymwneud ag agweddau eraill, fel gwirio casgliadau ar hap, ac yn sicr feysydd lle yr ydym wedi nodi bod y gwrthrychau'n rhai gwerthfawr iawn, yn ddeallusol ac yn ariannol. Caiff y gwrthrychau hynny'n aml eu harddangos eisoes, felly, maent yn cael eu harchwilio bob dydd. Mae nifer o wrthrychau'n cael eu harchwilio drwy gael eu defnyddio gan ymchwilyr, ein staff ein hunain, ac ati, felly, mae llawer o wirio'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei ddangos, mae yna ryw fath o wirio stoc neu system wirio a wneir gennym yn rhannol, ac mae'r adroddiad yn nodi y gallem wneud mwy ynghylch hynny.

[7] **David Melding:** Ai profiad y prif amgueddfeydd yw bod yr amcangyfrif o'u casgliadau wedi gostwng tua thraean, sy'n sylweddol iawn, neu, yn eich achos chi, a yw'n uwch? A oes methodoleg a dderbynnir bellach ar gyfer cyfrif casgliadau? Yr oeddwn yn synnu at yr enghraifft a roesoch, oherwydd yr oedd yn fy nharo i, pe baech yn cyfrif pryfed ffrwythau, yna byddai gennych 1,000, a phe baech yn cyfrif hambyrddau, byddai gennych un. Yr wyf yn cymryd mai pryfed ffrwythau oedd y casgliad, nid hambyrddau.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae'n dibynnu ar y casgliad, mewn gwirionedd. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio defnyddio hynny dim ond fel enghraifft eglurhaol syml o'r sefyllfa. Yn sicr, yn yr amgueddfeydd lle yr wyf wedi gweithio, mae nifer yr eitemau wedi gostwng yn gyffredinol am y math o resymau yr wyf wedi'u disgrifio. Ni fyddwn yn gallu ateb hynny ar gyfer pob amgueddfa, ond ar y cyfan, mae'n ymddangos mai dyna sydd wedi digwydd. Mae hyn yn rhannol oherwydd un neu ddau ysgogiad digon sylweddol. Mae llawer o waith, rhyngwladol a chenedlaethol, wedi'i wneud i sefydlu systemau dogfennu safonol, drwy'r eirfa a ddefnyddir i ddisgrifio gwrthrychau a thrwy'r systemau ar gyfer cofnodi lefelau cofnodi ac ati. Felly, mae llawer o safoni wedi digwydd, a'r safon a fabwysiadwyd fel arfer, er enghraifft, yn y DU yw'r safon SPECTRUM. Mae hon wedi'i datblygu gan yr hyn a arferai gael ei galw'n Gymdeithas Dogfennaeth Amgueddfeydd, y dylwn ei chrybwyll oherwydd mai fi hefyd yw'r cadeirydd. Felly, mae'r systemau hynny wedi'u cyflwyno, ac yn fy marn i, o ganlyniad i hynny mae'r safoni systemau hyn wedi digwydd. Mae

look at data in different ways. In some areas there is not standardisation, but in this area there has been standardisation, which, I think, as a result, has led to this reduction in the count.

[8] **Janet Davies:** If you have a tray of a number of objects, and it is counted as one item, would you notice if one or two of those objects went missing? It would not have to be 1,000 fruit flies, it could be 25 stones or something.

**Mr Houlihan:** Again, I could ask Dr Wiliam to go into a little more detail on the particular systems. However, in my experience, and from what I have observed, say, in the geology store at the national museum, there is information actually attached, quite often, to the tray or whatever, which gives you an indication of numbers, codes and so on that would indicate how many objects, broadly speaking, should be in there. Quite often, when you go into these cabinets, particularly if they are from the Edwardian or Victorian period, you will find that there will be an individual little label with this too. Perhaps Dr Wiliam could give you a bit more detail.

**Dr Wiliam:** Yes, an example might be a tray of Roman pottery sherds. They might be what the trade calls ‘body sherds’, that is, they have no distinguishing features at all and so they are counted, and properly so, as ‘a tray of Roman body sherds’, and that is fine. However, if they were in any way marked—if they were rim sherds, for example, which you can use to date the pottery—then greater attention will be paid to those, and they will be counted individually. So, as Mike says, it is very much a case of treating an object, or a group, in its own right. A tray of fruit flies, which Mike alluded to, would have been pinned in place so that you could instantly see if one were missing. So, it is treating, as I say, an object on its own virtues, if you like.

[9] **Janet Davies:** Thank you. Mick, do you have a question? This seems to be raising a lot of interest.

amgueddfeydd yn enwog am dueddu i edrych ar ddata mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mewn rhai meysydd nid oes safoni, ond yn y maes hwn mae safoni wedi digwydd, sydd, yn fy marn i, o ganlyniad wedi arwain at y gostyngiad hwn yn y niferoedd.

[8] **Janet Davies:** Os oes gennych hambwrdd o nifer o wrthrychau, a hwnnw’n cael ei gyfrif fel un eitem, a fyddech yn sylwi pe bai un neu ddau o’r gwrthrychau hynny’n diflannu? Ni fyddai’n rhaid iddo fod yn 1,000 o bryfed ffrwythau: gallai fod yn 25 o gerrig, neu rywbeth.

**Mr Houlihan:** Eto, gallwn ofyn i Dr Wiliam roi ychydig mwy o fanylion am y systemau penodol. Fodd bynnag, yn fy mhrofiad i, ac o’r hyn yr wyf wedi’i weld, dyweder, yn y storfa ddaearreg yn yr amgueddfa genedlaethol, mae gwybodaeth yn aml wedi ei chysylltu wrth yr hambwrdd neu beth bynnag, sy’n awgrymu niferoedd, codau ac ati a fyddai’n nodi faint o wrthrychau, yn fras, ddylai fod yno. Yn eithaf aml, wrth fynd i mewn i’r cistiau hyn, yn enwedig os ydynt o gyfnod Edward neu Fictoria, byddwch yn gweld bod label fach unigol hefyd gyda’r eitem. Efallai y gall Dr Wiliam roi ychydig mwy o fanylion i chi.

**Dr Wiliam:** Ie, gallai hambwrdd o deilchion crochenwaith Rhufeinig fod yn enghraifft. Gallent fod yr hyn y mae’r diwydiant yn ei alw’n ‘deilchion corff’, hynny yw, nid oes iddynt nodweddion unigryw o gwbl, ac felly cânt eu cyfrif, yn hollol gywir, fel ‘hambwrdd o deilchion corff Rhufeinig’, ac mae hynny’n iawn. Fodd bynnag, pe bai marciau o unrhyw fath arnynt—pe baent yn deilchion ymyl, er enghraifft, y gellir eu defnyddio i ddyddio’r crochenwaith—yna rhoir mwy o sylw i’r rhain, a byddant yn cael eu cyfrif ar wahân. Felly, fel y dywed Mike, i raddau helaeth mae’n fater o drin gwrthrych, neu grwp, yn unigol. Byddai hambwrdd o bryfed ffrwythau, y cyfeiriodd Mike ato, wedi’u pinio yn eu lle a gallech weld ar unwaith pe bai un ar goll. Felly, mae’n fater o drin gwrthrych, fel y dywedais, ar sail ei rinweddau ei hun, os mynnwch.

[9] **Janet Davies:** Diolch. Mick, a oes gennych gwestiwn? Ymddengys bod hyn yn ennyn llawer o ddiddordeb.



[10] **Mick Bates:** It certainly does raise some interesting questions. However, I would just like to return to the question asked previously about what would happen if something were stolen. This raises an interesting question in my mind about how you insure all your art and artefacts. What sort of insurance policies do you have against things being stolen or damaged within your own property?

**Mr Houlihan:** We do not have insurance because it is covered under the indemnity scheme, which would mean that, for example, if a Monet or a Manet were stolen—I am inviting disaster here, I know—destroyed or damaged, we are in exactly the same situation as Windsor Castle, and we would have to apply to the Assembly for funding. Obviously, we are not going to replace that object, because it is irreplaceable, but there might be a value consideration. We might be able to replace it with another Van Gogh that was perhaps painted at the same time or which is part of the same group, or is another portrait, or whatever.

[11] **Mick Bates:** I will move on to discuss, if I may, the building itself. Are your own buildings insured?

**Mr Houlihan:** No. It is the Windsor Castle situation.

[12] **Mick Bates:** Absolutely. So, in other words, nothing is insured?

**Mr Houlihan:** No. I mean, this is standard Government practice for national museums.

[13] **Mick Bates:** I see. But, of course, you would have employers' and public liability insurance?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes, and insurance for vehicles and so on. (1)

[14] **Mick Bates:** What about when things are moved from one place to another?

[10] **Mick Bates:** Mae'n sicr yn codi cwestiynau diddorol iawn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd yn gynharach ynglyn â beth fyddai'n digwydd pe bai rhywbeth yn cael ei ddwyn. Mae hyn yn arwain at gwestiwn diddorol yn fy marn i ynglyn â sut yr ydych yn yswirio'ch holl weithiau celf ac arteffactau. Pa fath o bolisiau yswiriant sydd gennych yn erbyn pethau'n cael eu dwyn neu eu difrodi yn eich adeiladau chi eich hun?

**Mr Houlihan:** Nid oes gennym yswiriant oherwydd bod hynny wedi'i gynnwys dan y cynllun indemniad, a fyddai'n golygu, er enghraifft, pe bai gwaith gan Monet neu Manet yn cael ei ddwyn—fe wn fy mod yn temptio ffawd yn awr—ei ddifa neu ei ddifrodi, yr ydym yn yr union sefyllfa â Chastell Windsor, a byddai'n rhaid i ni wneud cais i'r Cynulliad am gyllid. Yn amlwg, ni fyddwn yn gallu cael rhywbeth yn lle'r gwrthrych hwnnw, oherwydd ei fod yn unigryw, ond efallai y byddai ei werth yn cael ei ystyried. Efallai y gallem gael Van Gogh arall yn ei le wedi ei beintio o bosibl yn yr un cyfnod neu sy'n rhan o'r un grwp, neu sy'n bortread arall, neu beth bynnag.

[11] **Mick Bates:** Yr wyf am symud ymlaen i drafod yr adeilad ei hun, os caf fi. A yw'ch adeiladau eich hun wedi'u hyswirio?

**Mr Houlihan:** Na. Mae'n union fel sefyllfa Castell Windsor.

[12] **Mick Bates:** Yn hollol. Felly, mewn geiriau eraill, nid oes dim wedi'i yswirio?

**Mr Houlihan:** Na. Mae hyn yn arfer safonol gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol.

[13] **Mick Bates:** Mi welaf. Ond wrth gwrs, byddai gennych yswiriant cyflogwyr ac atebolrwydd cyhoeddus?

**Mr Houlihan:** Byddai, ac yswiriant ar gyfer cerbydau ac ati. (1)

[14] **Mick Bates:** Beth am gludo pethau o le i le?

**Mr Houlihan:** Well, it depends on the circumstances in which they are being moved. If we were moving an object from Cathays park to, say, Llanberis, then the same rules would apply: we are not insured. If, however, we were sending an object or a group of objects, as we have done recently, to, say, Pittsburgh for exhibition, then the responsibility for insurance becomes the borrower's.

[15] **Mick Bates:** I see. Thank you, that is very interesting.

[16] **Janet Davies:** I would just like to clarify this. Although it is not a direct analogy—it is slightly different—when we looked at clinical negligence, we found that the NHS in Wales has to set up its own pool of money to cover any clinical negligence claims, as it would not get insurance from outside. I think that what is happening with the museum is not totally unusual.

[17] **Leighton Andrews:** May I just ask if you have any items whose ownership is disputed?

**Mr Houlihan:** I am certainly not aware of any objects that are disputed. I think that there are a number of scenarios in which disputes, if you like, can arise. One is a disputed claim to title, say, within a family. Those are not unknown. Certainly, as far as I am aware, there are no circumstances like that within the national museum's collection. Secondly, disputes can arise in relation to the repatriation of objects, human remains, or objects of ritual or ceremonial significance to certain indigenous peoples. Again, I am not aware of that situation arising in Wales, partly because the museum does not have an ethnographic collection. The third area where you can get these sorts of situations arising—this is more recent—is particularly in relation to victims of the Holocaust, where families of victims are, for example, reclaiming paintings that now reside in western European and American museums, which were looted by the German army, or whatever, during the second world war. Again, in common with other national museums, the museum will have done a check through the acquisition of its art collections, and it would be my understanding—and hopefully Eurwyn can confirm this—that there are no questions of any doubt about

**Mr Houlihan:** Wel, mae'n dibynnu dan ba amgylchiadau maent yn cael eu symud. Pe baem yn symud gwrthrych o Barc Cathays i Lanberis, dyweder, yna byddai'r un rheolau'n gymwys: nid ydym wedi'n hyswirio. Fodd bynnag, pe baem yn anfon gwrthrych neu grwp o wrthrychau, fel y gwnaethom yn ddiweddar, i Pittsburgh i'w harddangos, er enghraifft, yna cyfrifoldeb y benthyccwr fydd yr yswiriant.

[15] **Mick Bates:** Mi welaf. Diolch, mae hynny'n ddiddorol iawn.

[16] **Janet Davies:** Hoffwn gael eglurhad ar hyn. Er nad yw'n gymhariaeth uniongyrchol—mae ychydig yn wahanol—pan oeddem yn edrych ar esgeulustod clinigol, gwelwom fod yn rhaid i'r GIG yng Nghymru sefydlu ei gronfa ei hun o arian i dalu am unrhyw hawliadau esgeulustod clinigol, am na fyddai'n cael yswiriant o'r tu allan. Credaf nad yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r amgueddfa yn hollol anarferol.

[17] **Leighton Andrews:** A gaf fi ofyn a oes unrhyw eitemau lle mae anghydfod ynglyn â pherchnogaeth?

**Mr Houlihan:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anghydfod ynglyn â gwrthrychau. Credaf fod nifer o sefyllfaoedd lle gall anghydfod, os dymunwch, ddigwydd. Un yw anghydfod ynglyn â hawl i deitl, er enghraifft, o fewn teulu. Nid yw hyn yn anghyffredin. Yn sicr, cyhyd ag y gwn, nid oes unrhyw amgylchiadau felly yng nghasgliad yr amgueddfa genedlaethol. Yn ail, gall anghydfodau godi ynghylch dychwelyd gwrthrychau, gweddillion cyrff, neu wrthrychau sydd o bwysigrwydd defodol neu seremonïol i bobl gynhenid penodol i'w mamwlad. Eto, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa honno'n digwydd yng Nghymru, yn rhannol oherwydd nad oes gan yr amgueddfa gasgliad ethnograffig. Mae'r trydydd maes lle gall sefyllfaoedd fel hyn godi—mae hyn yn fwy diweddar—yn ymwneud yn benodol â dioddefwyr yr Holocost, lle mae teuluoedd y sawl a ddioddefodd, er enghraifft, yn adhawlio peintiadau a ladratawyd gan fyddin yr Almaen, neu bwy bynnag, yn ystod yr ail ryfel byd, a'r rheiny bellach mewn amgueddfeydd yn Ewrop neu America. Eto, fel amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol eraill, bydd yr amgueddfa wedi archwilio'r broses o gaffael ei chasgliadau celf ei hun, ac o'r hyn a ddeallaf—a gobeithio y gall Eurwyn

how these paintings came into the country, or anything like that, and that they have a full provenance that does not link them back to a black hole in their history, if you like. So, in summary, I am not aware of any such situation.

[18] **Leighton Andrews:** Right. In that case, I will take you to paragraph 2.6 of the report, which deals with the definitions of standards of record keeping. You believe that your inventory-level standard is a higher standard than is the case for much of the museums and galleries sector as a whole. Why have you set a higher standard?

**Mr Houlihan:** I will begin by just briefly describing the standard, if I may. The SPECTRUM standard, which the museum actually exceeds, has a first threshold, if you like, which is called entry-level information. Essentially, that is designed to establish title to the object, coming back to your earlier question in a sense. That would lead anyone who is pursuing an issue of title, say, to a historical file within the institution, which would contain correspondence that would clearly establish the museum's title and claim to that object. So it establishes title, and it will establish a description, that is, basic descriptors of the objects, and the location and date of acquisition. So it is fundamental information. The National Museums and Galleries of Wales's manual records exceed that standard.

Secondly, the museum has established what it calls an inventory-level record, which adds further lines to that information in relation to, say, artist, material, size and weight, which, from a curatorial point of view, is very useful information to have. I will give you a specific example: if I am putting on an exhibition, it is very important at an early stage to have information on size and weight, for obvious reasons in relation to how many objects you can get in a showcase, and so on. So having that information on a record, I think, is very important and extremely helpful. It is not just a collections management issue, it actually assists other functional areas within the institution to do their jobs more effectively.

gadarnhau hyn—nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth sut daeth y lluniau hyn i'r wlad, neu unrhyw beth felly, a bod ganddynt darddiad llawn nad yw'n eu cysylltu â rhyw gyfnod du yn eu hanes, os mynnwch. Felly, i grynhoi, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw sefyllfa o'r fath.

[18] **Leighton Andrews:** Iawn. Os felly, yr wyf am gyfeirio at baragraff 2.6 yn yr adroddiad, sy'n delio â'r diffiniadau o safonau cadw cofnodion. Yr ydych yn credu bod eich safon lefel-rhestr yn uwch nag sy'n digwydd mewn llawer o'r sector amgueddfeydd ac orielau yn ei gyfanrwydd. Pam rydych wedi gosod safon uwch?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy ddisgrifio'r safon yn gryno, os caf. Mae i'r safon SPECTRUM - ac mae'r amgueddfa yn ei rhagori ar honno mewn gwirionedd - drothwy cyntaf, os mynnwch, a elwir yn wybodaeth lefel-mynediad. Yn y bôn, mae hon wedi'i chynllunio i sefydlu teitl y gwrthrych, sy'n dod yn ôl at eich cwestiwn cynharach ar ryw ystyr. Byddai hynny'n arwain unrhyw un sydd ar drywydd teitl, dyweder, at ffeil hanesyddol yn y sefydliad, a fyddai'n cynnwys gohebiaeth a fyddai'n sefydlu'n glir deitl a hawl yr amgueddfa i'r gwrthrych hwnnw. Felly, mae'n sefydlu teitl, a bydd yn sefydlu disgrifiad, hynny yw, disgrifyddion sylfaenol o'r gwrthrychau, a lleoliad a dyddiad ei gaffael. Felly, mae'n wybodaeth sylfaenol. Mae cofnodion llaw Amgueddfeydd ac Oriellau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn rhagori ar y safon honno.

Yn ail, mae'r amgueddfa wedi sefydlu'r hyn a elwir yn gofnod lefel-rhestr, sy'n ychwanegu llinellau pellach at y wybodaeth honno o ran, er enghraifft, artist, deunydd, maint a phwysau, sydd o safbwynt curaduriaeth yn wybodaeth ddefnyddiol iawn i'w chael. Dyma i chi enghraifft benodol: os wyf yn trefnu arddangosfa, mae'n bwysig iawn cael gwybodaeth am faint a phwysau yn gynnar iawn, am resymau amlwg ynghylch sawl gwrthrych y gellir eu cael mewn cwpwrdd arddangos, ac ati. Felly, credaf fod cael cofnod o'r wybodaeth honno yn bwysig iawn ac yn ddefnyddiol dros ben. Nid mater o reoli casgliadau'n unig ydyw: mae mewn gwirionedd yn cynorthwyo meysydd gweithredu eraill o fewn y sefydliad i gyflawni eu swyddi'n fwy effeithiol.

So, in establishing that slightly higher standard, I think that the museum is really seeking to be more efficient, if you like. Again, Eurwyn might be able to explain the particular history of why we have gone down that route.

**Dr Wiliam:** Ten or 15 years ago, we consciously took this decision, and it is tied in with the decision that we then took to computerise our documentation.

Computerisation is a product of two things, I guess. One is the availability of the technology, but also it does enable one very markedly to answer questions from the public or from researchers far more efficiently, quickly and thoroughly. So there were two major drivers for doing that. We could have chosen in 1990 just to computerise our existing documentation, which would merely have translated that paper record onto a computer. We thought that that was probably a waste of resources and that we should, at the same time, seek to enhance that record, and that is why, for the last 15 years or so, we have worked at this enhanced level. As Mike has said, we have a paper record that meets the national requirements for all our collections. We consciously set out on this route to make a step change in the amount of information available to ourselves and to the public.

**Mr Houlihan:** I will add to that, if I may, to say that the existence of a manual documented record for every object in the museum is—I do not want to appear smug, but it is almost unique in museums. That is a very high standard to have achieved. Certainly no other museum that I have worked in has that, and in one museum where I worked we had to add no number numbers, if you can follow that, to objects that had come into the museum and had not been recorded for something like 20 years. So I think that to have that record, which establishes title to those objects and provides location, while we would have to recognise that it is not efficient in terms of information retrieval, it does provide a fundamental core record, which is absolutely important.

Felly, wrth sefydlu'r safon honno sydd ychydig yn uwch, credaf fod yr amgueddfa mewn gwirionedd yn ceisio bod yn fwy effeithlon, os mynnwch chi. Eto, efallai y gall Eurwyn egluro'n benodol pam yr ydym wedi dilyn y llwybr hwnnw.

**Dr Wiliam:** Deg neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl, gwnaethom y penderfyniad hwn yn fwriadol, ac mae wedi'i gysylltu â'r penderfyniad a wnaed gennym wedyn i roi ein dogfennaeth ar gyfrifiadur. Mae cyfrifiaduro yn ganlyniad i ddau beth, mae'n debyg gen i. Y peth cyntaf yw'r dechnoleg sydd ar gael, ond hefyd mae'n galluogi rhywun yn bendant iawn i ateb cwestiynau gan y cyhoedd neu gan ymchwilyr lawer yn fwy effeithlon, cyflym a thrylwyr. Felly, yr oedd dau brif sbardun i wneud hynny. Yn 1990 gallem fod wedi dewis gosod ein dogfennaeth bresennol yn unig ar gyfrifiadur, a fyddai'n syml wedi trosglwyddo'r cofnodion papur i gyfrifiadur. Yr oeddem yn credu bod hynny o bosibl yn wastraff adnoddau ac y dylem, ar yr un pryd, geisio gwella'r cofnod hwnnw. A dyna pam, ers oddeutu 15 mlynedd, yr ydym wedi gweithio ar y lefel uwch hon. Fel y dywedodd Mike, mae gennym gofnod papur sy'n bodloni'r gofynion cenedlaethol ar gyfer ein holl gasgliadau. Bu i ni ddewis y llwybr hwn yn fwriadol i wneud newid sylweddol ym maint y wybodaeth sydd ar gael i ni ac i'r cyhoedd.

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr wyf am ychwanegu at hynny, os caf, i ddweud bod bodolaeth cofnod wedi ei ddogfennu â llaw ar gyfer pob gwrthrych yn yr amgueddfa—nid wyf am ymddangos yn hunanfodlon - ond mae bron yn unigryw mewn amgueddfeydd. Mae hon yn safon uchel iawn i ni fod wedi ei chyflawni. Yn sicr, nid yw hynny ar gael yn yr un amgueddfa arall yr wyf wedi gweithio ynddi, ac mewn un amgueddfa yr wyf wedi gweithio ynddi, yr oedd yn rhaid i ni ychwanegu rhifau dim rhif, os gallwch ddilyn hynny, at wrthrychau a oedd wedi dod i mewn i'r amgueddfa a heb eu cofnodi ers oddeutu 20 mlynedd. Felly, credaf fod cael y cofnod hwnnw, sy'n sefydlu teitl y gwrthrychau hynny a darparu lleoliad, er y byddai'n rhaid i ni gydnabod nad yw'n effeithlon o ran adfer gwybodaeth, yn darparu cofnod craidd sylfaenol, sy'n hollbwysig.

[19] **Leighton Andrews:** So, there is no other museum that you could think of or point to that has gone down this kind of route?

**Mr Houlihan:** What I said was that I have never worked in a museum that has had a full manual documentary record of their collections. There might be smaller museums, I think, where you would find this. However, I can point to collections management reports on museums, for example, Museum Victoria and national museums in Australia. There have been reports on museums in Arizona, for example, and there was an Audit Office report on the English national museums some years ago. They all pointed to these black holes within record keeping.

[20] **Leighton Andrews:** Regarding the inventory level that you would like your record keeping to be at, so far, only about a third of your items are categorised at that level. That involves computerisation of course. We just heard from Dr Wiliam that he started computerisation in 1990. So, that has been 14 years now, and you are only at 34 per cent. Why has that been so slow?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that when you look at the numbers of objects that are involved in those figures they are quite considerable. We are talking about over 1 million objects that have been brought up to that sort of inventory standard. Secondly, the areas that have been prioritised for this work have included, as I think that I indicated earlier, those objects of high intellectual and financial value for the museum and those that are being used most frequently within the collections. Thirdly, I think that the record will show that the museum has developed a documentation unit, which has taken time to set up. It has also taken time to put in the sort of infrastructure that is necessary in order to deal with this. The museum is currently documenting to inventory standard some 200,000 objects a year. However, I think that you also have to add to that, again, the fact that over 20 per cent of the collection has also been catalogued. That is also a very high standard for a museum and it represents a lot of objects. The catalogue standard is of a very high order in terms of the intellectual information that those

[19] **Leighton Andrews:** Felly, ni allwch enwi neu feddwl am unrhyw amgueddfa arall sydd wedi dilyn y math hwn o drywydd?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd nad wyf fi erioed wedi gweithio mewn amgueddfa sydd â chofnod dogfennol llaw llawn o'i chasgliadau. Efallai bod amgueddfeydd llai, credaf, lle byddech yn gweld hyn. Fodd bynnag, gallaf gyfeirio at adroddiadau rheoli casgliadau am amgueddfeydd, er enghraifft, Amgueddfa Fictoria ac amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol yn Awstralia. Cafwyd adroddiadau ar amgueddfeydd yn Arizona, er enghraifft, ac yr oedd adroddiad gan y Swyddfa Archwilio ar amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol Lloegr rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Yr oeddynt i gyd yn cyfeirio at y tyllau du hyn ym maes cadw cofnodion.

[20] **Leighton Andrews:** O ran y lefel rhestr yr ydych am i'ch system gofnodi ei bodloni, hyd yma dim ond oddeutu traean o'ch eitemau sydd wedi'u categorio ar y lefel honno. Mae hynny'n golygu cyfrifiaduro, wrth gwrs. Clywsom Dr Wiliam yn dweud ei fod wedi dechrau cyfrifiaduro yn 1990. Felly, mae hynny ers 14 mlynedd bellach, a dim ond 34 y cant sydd wedi'i wneud. Pam mae hynny wedi bod mor araf?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf wrth i ni edrych ar nifer y gwrthrychau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ffigurau hynny eu bod yn eithaf sylweddol. Yr ydym yn siarad am dros 1 filiwn o wrthrychau sydd wedi'u codi i safon rhestr fel honno. Yn ail, mae'r meysydd sydd wedi'u blaenoriaethu ar gyfer y gwaith hwn wedi cynnwys, fel yr wyf yn credu i mi sôn yn gynharach, y gwrthrychau hynny o werth deallusol ac ariannol uchel i'r amgueddfa a'r rheiny sy'n cael eu defnyddio amlaf yn y casgliadau. Yn drydydd, credaf y bydd y cofnod yn dangos bod yr amgueddfa wedi datblygu uned ddogfennaeth, sydd wedi cymryd amser i'w sefydlu. Mae hefyd wedi cymryd amser i greu'r math o seilwaith sy'n angenrheidiol i ddelio â hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r amgueddfa'n dogfennu oddeutu 200,000 o wrthrychau y flwyddyn i safon rhestr. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod yn rhaid i chi hefyd ychwanegu at hynny, eto, y ffaith fod dros 20 y cant o'r casgliad hefyd wedi'i gatalogio. Mae honno hefyd yn safon uchel iawn ar gyfer amgueddfa, ac yn cynrychioli nifer o eitemau. Mae'r safon gatalog yn un uchel iawn o ran y

records contain. It really reflects the research and all of the information that can be gleaned about an object and about the connections that can be made with that object to considerable depth, so that it could virtually be taken and just put on display with minimal further research work. So, there are two strands to this. There is the inventory level, and there is the catalogue level taking place.

I think that in terms of priorities and such like, quite often, what might drive the museum is the need for catalogue level information in order to feed into exhibitions, loans programmes, the partnership programme, and so on. So that sort of level of information is very important. I think also, maybe just looking towards the future as well, that we are going to face some issues—and I think the report is very helpful in this—in terms of looking at our priorities for documentation. I think that we do seriously have to ask ourselves whether we want to bring every single one of those 4.7 million objects up to inventory standard. We have to ask ourselves why would we want to do that. Maybe it would be more important to develop some more cataloguing or, I suspect even more important, given the interdisciplinary nature of our collections and some of the themes that we will be tackling, would be to see how we can create more of a relational database so that if, for the sake of argument, you are putting on an exhibition on landscape in Wales, you can go to those records and you will get information from across the collections that will be relevant and will feed into that. I think that that is perhaps the communication, public-driven type of use of technology that we have to look for and, similarly, in terms of putting that sort of information onto the web. So, I think that might drive a slightly different approach to documentation.

[21] **Leighton Andrews:** You have raised many further questions, but that was a very helpful answer. Just a basic question. Do you think that you are on target for the next financial year to reach your 42 per cent at inventory standard?

wybodaeth ddeallusol sydd yn y cofnodion hynny. Mae'n adlewyrchu'n wirioneddol yr ymchwil a'r holl wybodaeth y gellir eu casglu am eitem ac am y cysylltiadau y gellir eu gwneud â'r gwrthrych hwnnw yn drylwyr iawn, fel y gellid ei gymryd a'i arddangos fwy neu lai heb fawr ddim gwaith ymchwil pellach. Felly, mae dwy elfen i hyn. Mae'r lefel rhestr, ac mae'r lefel catalog ar waith.

Credaf, o ran blaenoriaethau ac ati, yn aml iawn yr hyn a allai yrru'r amgueddfa yw'r angen am wybodaeth ar lefel catalog er mwyn cyfrannu at arddangosfeydd, rhaglenni benthyciadau, y rhaglen bartneriaeth, ac ati. Felly, mae lefel gwybodaeth o'r fath yn bwysig iawn. Credaf hefyd, wrth edrych tua'r dyfodol efallai yn ogystal, ein bod yn mynd i wynebu rhai pynciau—a chredaf fod yr adroddiad yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn hyn—o ran edrych ar ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer dogfennu. Credaf fod yn rhaid i ni ofyn i ni ein hunain o ddifrif a ydym am ddod â phob un o'r 4.7 miliwn o wrthrychau hynny i fyny i safon rhestr. Mae'n rhaid i ni ofyn i ni ein hunain pam y byddem am wneud hynny. Efallai y byddai'n bwysicach datblygu mwy o gatalogio neu, yn bwysicach fyth o bosibl, o ystyried natur rhyngddisgyblaethol ein casgliadau a rhai o'r themâu y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â hwy, i weld sut y gallwn greu cronfa ddata fwy perthynol. Wedyner enghraifft, os ydych yn cynnal arddangosfa ar dirwedd yng Nghymru, gallwch gyfeirio'n ôl at y cofnodion hynny a chewch wybodaeth o'r casgliadau i gyd a fydd yn berthnasol ac yn ychwanegu at hynny. Credaf efallai mai dyna'r math o ddefnydd cyfathrebu o dechnoleg yn cael ei ysgogi gan y cyhoedd y mae'n rhaid i ni geisio'i gael, ac yn yr un modd o ran ceisio rhoi gwybodaeth o'r fath ar y we. Felly, credaf y gallai hynny ysgogi agwedd ychydig yn wahanol at ddogfennu.

[21] **Leighton Andrews:** Yr ydych wedi codi nifer o gwestiynau pellach, ond yr oedd hwnnw'n ateb defnyddiol iawn. Un cwestiwn sylfaenol. A ydych yn credu eich bod o fewn eich targed am y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf i gyrraedd eich safon rhestr o 42 y cant?

**Mr Houlihan:** I believe that we are on target for that. We would have to document 1.65 million objects over the next 10 years to document the collection to catalogue and inventory standard, so I think that, as the report suggests in one of the recommendations, we do need to look at that and see if we can in fact do something towards achieving that and maybe bring it down in some way.

However, again, this comes back to what I was indicating earlier about the sort of solutions we find. My own belief is that the priorities, if you want a running order, are securing the collections, caring for the collections, particularly in relation to storage—and I think that we need to do a condition survey of the collections, looking at the precise condition of the objects—then documentation, and, obviously, access. Trying to be pragmatic about this, the reality is that museums tend to be rather access driven. People want exhibitions, you need to refresh your products, you need to get more visitors in, and such like. So, finding solutions that hit a number of those areas will be important. I will give you a specific example relating to storage which we can show: we have just had a report done in relation to storage issues and, if we were to adopt an approach whereby, say, our furniture collection, which is currently housed at St Fagans, was put into an extension of an existing storage facility, public access would be created and we would hit quite a number of buttons, because not only would be verifying and stock-checking the collection, we would be putting it into better storage conditions, so we would be dealing with the preventative conservation issue, ensuring the long-term care of the objects. We would also document the collection at the same time, plus we would provide public access to the collection and, at the same time, we would be refreshing our product, if you like, at St Fagans: there would be a new attraction there. Quite often, people like to see behind the scenes and find out what the people in white coats do in terms of conservation and so on. So, I think that trying to look at those sorts of flexible solutions could provide an answer, so that our corporate plan target of having that 90 per cent of storage at a high standard by 2006 could be achieved. I think that it certainly could be, and I would hope that

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf ein bod o fewn ein targed ar gyfer hynny. Byddai'n rhaid i ni ddogfennu 1.65 miliwn o eitemau yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf i ddogfennu'r casgliad i gatalog ac i safon rhestr. Felly, fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei awgrymu yn un o'r argymhellion, credaf fod angen i ni edrych ar hynny i weld a allwn mewn gwirionedd wneud rhywbeth tuag at gyflawni hynny ac efallai ei ostwng mewn rhyw ffordd.

Fodd bynnag, mae hyn eto yn dod yn ôl at yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei nodi'n gynharach am y math o atebion yr ydym yn eu cael. Fy marn bersonol i yw mai'r blaenoriaethau, i'w gosod yn eu trefn, yw diogelu'r casgliadau, gofalu am y casgliadau, yn arbennig o ran storio—a chredaf fod angen i ni wneud arolwg o gyflwr y casgliadau, gan edrych ar union gyflwr yr eitemau—yna dogfennu, ac, wrth gwrs, fynediad. I geisio bod yn bragmatig ynglyn â hyn, y gwirionedd yw fod amgueddfeydd yn tueddu i gael eu gyrru gan fynediad. Mae pobl am gael arddangosfeydd, mae angen i chi adfywio'ch cynhyrchion, mae angen cael mwy o ymwelwyr i mewn, ac ati. Felly, bydd dod o hyd i atebion a fydd yn bodloni nifer o'r meysydd hynny yn bwysig. Yr wyf am roi enghraifft benodol i chi ynglyn â storio y gallwn ei dangos. Yr ydym newydd gael adroddiad ar faterion storio, a phe baem yn mabwysiadu dull lle byddai, er enghraifft, ein casgliad dodrefn sydd yn Sain Ffagan ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei roi mewn estyniad at gyfleuster storio presennol, byddai'n rhaid i ni greu mynediad i'r cyhoedd, a byddem yn ateb llawer problem, oherwydd byddem nid yn unig yn gwirio ac yn stoc-wirio'r casgliad, ond byddem yn ei roi mewn gwell amodau storio. Felly, byddem yn delio â mater cadwraeth ataliol, gan sicrhau gofal y gwrthrychau dros gyfnod hir. Byddem hefyd yn dogfennu'r casgliad ar yr un pryd, yn ogystal â darparu mynediad cyhoeddus i'r casgliad, ac ar yr un pryd byddem yn adfywio ein cynnyrch, os mynnwch, yn Sain Ffagan: byddai atyniad newydd yno. Yn lled aml, mae pobl yn hoffi gweld yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu ôl i'r llenni a chel gwybod beth y mae'r bobl mewn cotiau gwynion yn ei wneud o ran cadwraeth, ac ati. Felly, credaf y gallai ceisio edrych ar y mathau hynny o atebion hyblyg roi ateb, er mwyn i ni allu cyflawni'r targed yn ein cynllun corfforaethol o gael 90 y cant o gyfleusterau

we could do better than that as well.

[22] **Leighton Andrews:** You talked about how you might use technology better in linking objects for exhibition purposes and so on. I will ask a question, then, about access. One of the ways in which you make your items accessible, as you said, is through the web. How far advanced are you in terms of digitisation of the collection, and is that part of this process? Is it an integral part of the collection management process?

**Mr Houlihan:** When I was talking earlier about possible new priorities for documentation, I should have mentioned that digitisation is one of the areas where we might look to transfer some of our documentation activity, if you like. It would be true to say that some of our existing staffing resources has been moved in that direction, and we have set up a digitisation unit within the institution. With all of these issues there is a sort of web of connectivity out there as well, because, for example, one of the areas where we know we can generate more income—this has already been highlighted in a report done for the English national museums—is in image licensing. The National Museums and Galleries of Wales has, for example, the most important collection of impressionists outside of France. However, compared to Northern Ireland, the National Museums of Scotland and the National Galleries of Scotland, our income from licensing is currently quite low. Why is that? So there is a marketing potential issue involved. By digitising the collection, particularly our art collection, and getting it out on the web, we have the possibility of opening up possibilities in the longer term of e-commerce. At this point, I think that it might be just about making it known that we have this collection, which is quite a simple target, if you like. However, in the long term, there might be e-business possibilities and, through that, income generation. I use that example as an illustration of the inter-related complexity of some of these issues. By shifting maybe from documenting the entire collection, to digitising some important parts of the collection and shifting resources in that way, we might ultimately generate more income for the museum, which could be

storio safon uchel erbyn 2006. Credaf yn sicr fod hynny'n bosibl, a byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem wneud yn well na hynny hefyd.

[22] **Leighton Andrews:** Yr ydych wedi sôn sut y gallech ddefnyddio technoleg yn well wrth gysylltu gwrthrychau at ddibenion arddangosfeydd ac ati. Yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn, felly, am fynediad. Un o'r ffyrdd i wneud eich eitemau yn hygyrch, fel y dywedsoch, yw ar y we. Pa mor bell yr ydych wedi datblygu o ran digido'r casgliad, ac a yw hynny'n rhan o'r broses hon? A yw'n rhan ganolog o'r broses o reoli'r casgliad?

**Mr Houlihan:** Wrth siarad yn gynharach am flaenoriaethau newydd posibl ar gyfer dogfennu, dylwn fod wedi crybwyll bod digido yn un o'r meysydd lle gallem ystyried trosglwyddo rhywfaint o'n gweithgarwch dogfennu, os mynnwch. Byddai'n wir dweud bod rhai o'n hadnoddau staffio presennol wedi symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu uned ddigido yn y sefydliad. Yn yr holl faterion hyn mae rhyw fath o we o gysylltiad allan yna hefyd, oherwydd, er enghraifft, un o'r meysydd lle gwyddom y gallwn gynhyrchu mwy o incwm—tynnwyd sylw at hynny eisoes mewn adroddiad a wnaed ar gyfer amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol Lloegr—yw drwy drwyddedu delweddau. Mae gan Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru, er enghraifft, y casgliad pwysicaf o weithiau'r Argraffiadwyr y tu allan i Ffrainc. Fodd bynnag, o'n cymharu â Gogledd Iwerddon, Amgueddfeydd Cenedlaethol yr Alban ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Lloegr, mae ein hincwm ni o drwyddedu yn gymharol isel ar hyn o bryd. Pam hynny? Felly, mae yma fater potensial marchnata? Drwy ddigido'r casgliad, yn arbennig ein casgliad celf, a'i gyflwyno ar y we, mae posibilrwydd i ni greu cyfleoedd e-fasnach dros gyfnod hwy. Ar hyn o bryd, credaf mai mater yw hyn o ddim ond rhoi gwybod fod gennym y casgliad hwn, sy'n darged eithaf syml, os hoffech. Fodd bynnag, dros gyfnod hwy, gallai fod posibiladau e-fusnes, a thrwy hynny gynhyrchu incwm. Yr wyf yn defnyddio'r enghraifft honno i ddangos cymhlethdod cydberthynol rhai o'r materion hyn. Drwy symud efallai o ddogfennu'r casgliad cyfan i ddigido rhannau pwysig o'r casgliad a symud adnoddau fel hynny, efallai y byddem yn y pen draw



deployed in other ways.

[23] **David Melding:** I notice that if you go to the National Gallery or the National Portrait Gallery, they do that. You see people queuing to get large prints that they can order there and then. Is that what you have in mind as one aspect of generating revenue?

**Mr Houlihan:** That could be an aspect of it. There are two foundation-building aspects of this: the first is ensuring that you have the rights to do that because although, as an organisation, we may hold the painting, we may not have the right to actually use it. That is not insuperable, because you can then apply and inform the rights holder and so on and get clearances and all the rest of it. So, that is okay.

The second foundation-building aspect is marketing: that this collection is known about. I think that that would be a significant priority for us. However, I do believe that the licensing of images for uses in publications is probably the big money-spinner. That is where we probably need to look potentially. Then, later, I think that you can start to work on virtual tours, producing prints and so on for sale in the shop. We do that to some extent anyway. A visit to the museum shop in Cathays will show that we do sell prints and so on, but certainly we would have to recognise that it is not on the scale of the National Gallery in London, or even the National Gallery in Dublin.

[24] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, do you want to come in?

yn cynhyrchu mwy o incwm i'r amgueddfa y gellid ei ddefnyddio mewn ffyrdd eraill

[23] **David Melding:** Yr wyf wedi sylwi, os ewch chi i'r Oriol Genedlaethol neu'r Oriol Bortreadau Genedlaethol yn Llundain, eu bod yn gwneud hynny. Fe welwch pobl yn aros eu tro i gael printiau mawr y maent yn gallu eu harchebu yn y fan a'r lle. Ai hynny sydd gennych mewn golwg fel un dull o gynhyrchu refeniw?

**Mr Houlihan:** Gallai hynny fod yn un agwedd arno. Mae dwy agwedd ar hyn sy'n creu syflaen: y cyntaf yw sicrhau bod gennych yr hawliau i wneud hynny oherwydd er mai gyda ni fel sefydliad efallai y mae'r llun, efallai nad oes gennym yr hawl i'w ddefnyddio mewn gwirionedd. Nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth na ellir ei oresgyn, oherwydd gallwch wedyn wneud cais a hysbysu'r sawl sydd â'r hawliau ac ati a chael caniatâd ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae hynny'n iawn.

Yr ail agwedd ar greu sylfaen yw marchnata: bod pobl yn gwybod am y casgliad hwn. Credaf y byddai hynny'n flaenoriaeth sylweddol i ni. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai trwyddedu delweddau i'w defnyddio mewn cyhoeddiadau mae'n debyg sy'n cynhyrchu'r arian mawr. Dyna'r maes lle mae'n debyg fod angen i ni edrych. Yna, yn nes ymlaen, credaf y gallwch ddechrau gweithio ar deithiau rhithwir, cynhyrchu printiau ac ati i'w gwerthu yn y siop. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny i ryw raddau beth bynnag. Bydd ymweliad â siop yr amgueddfa yn Cathays yn dangos ein bod yn gwerthu printiau ac ati, ond yn sicr byddai'n rhaid i ni gydnabod nad yw hynny ar yr un raddfa â'r Oriol Genedlaethol yn Llundain, na hyd yn oed yr Oriol Genedlaethol yn Nulyn.

[24] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, a ydych am gyfrannu?

[25] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Thank you, Chair. You are basically in a chicken and egg situation. You hold a magnificent collection and some truly rare items within that. However, you have a situation where your capital stock—your land stock—requires investment. You have a situation where the storage of your artefacts requires investment, and, in some of those areas, that is very specific and very specialist and very expensive storage. You also have a situation where your record keeping needs to be improved for the various reasons that you have given us. I am glad to hear you talking about marketing and digitisation and selling items on in much the same way as the British Museum and other museums in England do.

You also have a presumption against accessing—'accessioning' is the word that you use. Far be it from me to appear plebeian, but the growth that you list is something like 39,950 items per annum, I believe. That is your estimated annual growth, but there will be a restriction in your ability to either store those items, or to have the geographical locations in which to display them. You have a significantly lower percentage of display area compared with some of the London museums, for example. So, there is a sort of never-ending cycle, is there not? Eighty-eight per cent of your income comes from the state purse, and I would be interested to hear your views on the following. First, you say that you would be trying to lever in funds from other areas, and you mentioned marketing in terms of income generation, but—God forbid—have you ever thought of selling some of the items? You cannot continually grow without reaching a limit. It would seem to me that you have reached some of those limits and are facing some difficulties. I have to say, I am not one for selling things—I own every book that I have ever read in my life and that is a considerable number—but the reality is that you have to geographically and physically move your building to create the space in order to store what you have. You are growing, as I said, at a rate of 39,950 items per annum, but you have only disposed of, or lost, less than 500.

[25] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Yn sylfaenol yr ydych yn sefyllfa'r iâr a'r wy. Mae gennych gasgliad gwych a rhai eitemau gwirioneddol brin yn rhan ohono. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych mewn sefyllfa lle mae angen buddsoddi yn eich stoc cyfalaf—eich stoc tir. Yr ydych mewn sefyllfa lle mae angen buddsoddi i storio'ch arteffactau, ac yn rhai o'r meysydd hynny, mae storio hwnnw'n benodol iawn ac yn arbenigol iawn ac yn ddrud iawn. Yr ydych hefyd mewn sefyllfa lle mae angen gwella'ch dull o gadw cofnodion am yr amrywiol resymau a roesoch i ni. Yr wyf yn falch eich clywed yn siarad am farchnata a digido a gwerthu eitemau mewn modd tebyg i'r Amgueddfa Brydeinig ac amgueddfeydd eraill yn Lloegr.

Mae gennych hefyd ragdybiaeth yn erbyn cyrchu—'mynediad' yw'r gair yr ydych yn ei ddefnyddio. Nid wyf am ymddangos yn werinol, ond mae'r twf yr ydych yn ei restru rywbeth yn debyg i 39,950 o eitemau y flwyddyn, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf. Dyna'ch amcangyfrif o dwf blynyddol, ond bydd cyfyngiad ar eich gallu i naill ai storio'r eitemau hynny neu i gael y manau daearyddol i'w harddangos. Mae gennych ganran sylweddol is o fannau arddangos o'u cymharu â rhai o amgueddfeydd Llundain, er enghraifft. Felly, mae yna ryw fath o gylch diddiwedd, onid oes? Daw 80 y cant o'ch incwm o bwrs y wlad, a byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed eich barn am y canlynol. Yn gyntaf, dywedwch y byddech yn ceisio denu cyllid o feysydd eraill, a soniech am farchnata o ran cynhyrchu incwm. Ond—Duw a'n gwaredo—a ydych erioed wedi ystyried gwerthu rhai o'r eitemau? Ni allwch dyfu'n barhaus heb gyrraedd terfyn. Ymddengys i mi eich bod wedi cyrraedd rhai o'r terfynau hynny ac yn wynebu rhai anawsterau. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud, nid wyf yn un am werthu pethau—yr wyf yn berchen ar bob llyfr yr wyf erioed wedi'i ddarllen yn fy mywyd, ac mae hynny'n nifer sylweddol—ond y gwir yw bod yn rhaid i chi symud eich adeilad yn ddaearyddol ac yn ffisegol i greu'r lle i storio'r hyn sydd gennych. Yr ydych yn tyfu, fel y dywedais, ar raddfa o 39,950 o eitemau'r flwyddyn, ond wedi cael gwared neu wedi colli llai na 500.

[26] **Janet Davies:** Some of these issues will be raised by other Members as we go along.

[27] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yes, but in direct relationship to the marketing, there are a number of points there on which I would be interested to know Mr Houlihan's views.

**Mr Houlihan:** Maybe I could go to the core point about the sale of items from the collections: although the wording in the report is that there is a presumption against disposal, I think that there are a number of issues buried in there, which range from the way in which we collect through to the ethics of collecting and disposal, as well as legal aspects in relation to how we hold the collections. The first point that I would make is that collecting is not something that happens in a straight line. Although the report presents certain figures, and I certainly could not deny that collections are live and are going to develop and grow, they grow at different rates in different years and different areas of the collections will accumulate in different ways. To collect 30 rocks, for example, will not put the same pressure on the organisation as collecting two large canvases. So there are a lot of issues buried in just raw data and statistics, so it is not a straight-line activity. That is the first point that I would make, but I am not denying that it does put pressure on the organisation in terms of storage. My view would be that this is one of the continuous problems and continuous constraints of a museum with a charter-based responsibility to collect. I do not have my copy of the precise wording in the charter with me, but the charter under which the museum is legally bound to operate is very ambitious. It says—I am trying to recall the words—that the museum will collect all of the geology, natural history, ethnography, history, and social history of Wales. Well, I have to own up and say that we are not doing that.

[28] **Jocelyn Davies:** I do not think that you are going to get criticised for that.

[26] **Janet Davies:** Bydd rhai o'r materion hyn yn cael eu crybwyll gan Aelodau eraill yn ystod y cyfarfod.

[27] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Bydd, ond mewn perthynas uniongyrchol â marchnata, mae nifer o bwyntiau yma yr hoffwn glywed barn Mr Houlihan amdanynt.

**Mr Houlihan:** Efallai y gallaf fynd at wraidd y pwynt am werthu eitemau o'r casgliadau. Er bod geiriad yr adroddiad yn awgrymu bod rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn gwaredu, credaf fod nifer o faterion wedi'u cuddio yno, sy'n amrywio o'r ffordd y byddwn yn casglu i foeseg casglu a gwaredu, ynghyd ag agweddau cyfreithiol mewn perthynas â'r ffordd yr ydym yn cadw'r casgliadau. Y pwynt cyntaf yr hoffwn ei wneud yw nad yw casglu yn rhywbeth sy'n digwydd mewn llinell syth. Er bod yr adroddiad yn cyflwyno ffigurau penodol, ac yn sicr ni allaf wadu bod casgliadau'n bethau byw ac yn mynd i ddatblygu a thyfu. Maent yn tyfu ar wahanol raddau mewn gwahanol flynyddoedd a bydd gwahanol feysydd yn y casgliadau'n crynhoi mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Ni fydd casglu 30 o greigiau, er enghraifft, yn rhoi'r un pwysau ar y sefydliad â chasglu dau gynfas mawr. Felly, mae nifer o faterion wedi'u cuddio mewn data crai ac ystadegau, fel nad yw'n weithgarwch llinell syth. Dyna'r pwynt cyntaf yr hoffwn ei wneud, ond nid wyf yn gwadu ei fod yn rhoi pwysau ar y sefydliad o ran storio. Fy marn i yw fod hyn yn un o'r problemau parhaus a'r cyfyngiadau parhaus sy'n wynebu amgueddfa gyda chyfrifoldeb ar sail siarter i gasglu. Nid yw fy nghopi gennyf o'r union eiriad yn y siarter, ond mae'r sy'n rhwymo'r amgueddfa yn gyfreithiol i'w gweithredu yn un uchelgeisiol iawn. Mae'n dweud—yr wyf yn ceisio cofio'r geiriau—y bydd yr amgueddfa'n casglu holl ddaeareg, hanes naturiol, ethnograffeg, hanes, a hanes cymdeithasol Cymru. Wel, mae'n rhaid i mi gyfaddef a dweud nad ydym yn gwneud hynny.

[28] **Jocelyn Davies:** Nid wyf yn credu y cewch eich beirniadu am hynny.

**Mr Houlihan:** However, it does give an indication of some of the expectations out there and how the museum was set up. The second legal aspect, I suppose, is that the museum holds the collections in trust for the public, so the museum is actually not the owner of the collection—the public is the owner of the collection.

The collections, to a great extent, reflect the generosity of previous generations, and there is a fundamental issue involved there in relation to ethics. Quite often, trends in museums change—intellectual trends, if you like, change—for example, taxonomy is no longer the big thing that it was in, say, the Victorian period, and museums are looking at other ways of dealing with those sorts of issues, whereas the National Museums and Galleries of Wales has a very strong record in the whole area of taxonomy, and it collects into that. I think that that is a great strength of the museum, which should not be relinquished. So, at the core of this you are dealing with the public benefit issue; it is not actually a financial issue. Having said that, there is also the ethical issue. The Museums Association guidance, which takes into account international guidance from the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation and such like, actually states that

‘disposal should never be undertaken principally for financial reasons’.

Therefore, we have a code of ethics that we are bound by. Certainly, disposal to fund a storage facility, say, is not only not a value for money activity because you are disposing of a capital asset to fund a revenue gap, or whatever, so is not good financial sense, but it is not good ethical sense either. There is also an issue of reputation in relation to disposal, which is well logged with a number of institutions world-wide that have sought to sell off items from their collections, to dispose of them. What they have found is that, in terms of new acquisitions coming in, people will not go near them. This is particularly in the art sector, where this can happen, especially in the States. They will not get the same stream; potential donors and benefactors will not go near them and that then diminishes not only the reputation of the museum, but also the quality of the collection.

**Mr Houlihan:** Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhoi syniad i ni o rai o'r disgwyliadau sydd gan bobl a sut y sefydlwyd yr amgueddfa. Yr ail agwedd gyfreithiol, mae'n debyg gen i, yw bod y casgliadau ym meddiant yr amgueddfa mewn ymddiriedaeth ar ran y cyhoedd, felly, nid yr amgueddfa yw perchennog y casgliad mewn gwirionedd—y cyhoedd yw perchennog y casgliad.

Mae'r casgliadau, i raddau helaeth, yn adlewyrchu haelioni cenedlaethau'r gorffennol, ac mae mater sylfaenol yma o ran moeseg. Yn ddigon aml, bydd tueddiadau mewn amgueddfeydd yn newid—mae tueddiadau deallusol, os mynnwch, yn newid—er enghraifft, nid yw tacsonomeg mor bwysig ag yr arferai fod, er enghraifft, yn oes Fictoria, ac mae amgueddfeydd yn edrych ar ffyrdd eraill o ddelio â'r mathau hyn o faterion, tra mae gan Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru hanes cryf iawn ym maes tacsonomeg, ac mae'n casglu oherwydd hynny. Credaf ei fod yn un o brif gryfderau'r amgueddfa, ac na ddylid rhoi'r gorau iddo. Felly, wrth wraidd hyn yr ydych yn delio â mater lles y cyhoedd; nid yw'n fater ariannol mewn gwirionedd. O ddweud hynny, mae yna hefyd y mater moesegol. Mae canllawiau'r Gymdeithas Amgueddfeydd, sy'n ystyried canllawiau rhyngwladol gan Sefydliad Addysgol, Gwyddonol a Diwylliannol y Cenhedloedd Unedig ac ati, yn nodi

‘na ddylid gwaredu byth am resymau ariannol yn bennaf’.

Felly, mae gennym god moeseg y mae'n rhaid i ni gadw ato. Yn sicr, mae gwaredu i dalu am gyfleuster storio, er enghraifft, nid yn unig yn weithgarwch nad yw'n rhoi gwerth am arian oherwydd eich bod yn gwaredu ased cyfalaf i gyllido bwlch mewn refeniw, neu beth bynnag, ac felly nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr ariannol da, ond nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr moesegol da ychwaith. Mae yna hefyd fater o enw da mewn cysylltiad â gwaredu, sy'n wybyddus iawn ymhlith nifer o sefydliadau ar hyd a lle y byd sydd wedi ceisio gwerthu eitemau o'u casgliadau, i'w gwaredu. Yr hyn y maent wedi'i weld, o ran caffaeliadau newydd yn dod i mewn, yw bod pobl yn cadw draw. Mae hyn yn benodol yn digwydd yn y sector celf, lle gall hyn ddigwydd, yn arbennig yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Ni fyddant yn cael yr un llif; ni fydd rhoddwyr a chymwynaswyr posibl yn mynd yn agos atynt, ac mae

hynny wedyn yn lleihau nid yn unig enw da'r amgueddfa, ond hefyd ansawdd y casgliad.

[29] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** The other point is that you are recording and cataloguing your 39,950 items as they come in, so that you have a constant level, as well as catch-up?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes, that is right. I should have said that, in fact, we have taken steps anyway to limit acquisition. This is a historical thing as well. If you look back, say, 20 years ago, national museums UK-wide were seen as a sort of location of last resort for anybody who had something. People used to come along with these huge collections and the museums used to say, 'Do not throw it away, we will take it', and so they would bring them in. Occasionally, you get eccentric directors and curators who will just acquire anything and bring it in. Today, though, any object coming into the museum is subjected to a review as to why we are collecting it. The curator has to state why that object is being collected, what benefit it brings to the museum in intellectual and public terms, and what its long-term value is. So there is already an assessment taking place there, which is designed to limit the mass acquisition of objects.

[30] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Does that also include the maintenance and storage issues?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes.

[31] **Janet Davies:** David, you wanted to come in on this?

[32] **David Melding:** Yes. We have touched on the point of decommissioning or de-accession or whatever the term is. With regard to table 10 on page 21, it is probably unfair to compare the items that you acquire with the items that you dispose of, but I would like to ask whether that table roughly demonstrates best practice in Britain, because you seem to be acquiring a lot of items—27,000 in 1999-2000, 78,000 the year after. It was down to 28,000 the year after that, but last year you acquired 35,000. The numbers that you get rid of really do uphold your principle of having a presumption against disposal: you got rid of six items

[29] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Y pwynt arall yw eich bod yn cofnodi a chatalogio eich 39,950 o eitemau wrth iddynt ddod i mewn, er mwyn i chi gael lefel gyson, ynghyd â dal i fyny?

**Mr Houlihan:** Ydy, mae hynny'n gywir. Dylwn fod wedi dweud ein bod, yn wir, wedi cymryd camau beth bynnag i gyfyngu ar gaffaeliad. Mae hyn yn beth hanesyddol hefyd. Os edrychwch yn ôl 20 mlynedd, dyweder, ystyrid amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol drwy'r DU fel rhyw fath o gyrchfan olaf i unrhyw un a oedd yn meddu ar ryw beth. Arferai pobl ddod i'r amgueddfeydd gyda chasgliadau enfawr, ac arferai'r amgueddfeydd ddweud, 'Peidiwch â'i daflu, fe gymerwn i ef', ac felly byddent yn dod â hwy i mewn. O bryd i'w gilydd, bydd cyfarwyddwyr a churaduron ecsentrig yn cymryd bron unrhyw beth a dod ag ef i mewn. Heddiw, fodd bynnag, mae unrhyw wrthrych sy'n dod i mewn i'r amgueddfa yn destun adolygiad pam yr ydym yn ei gasglu. Mae'n rhaid i'r curadur nodi pam mae'r gwrthrych hwnnw'n cael ei gasglu, pa fudd ydyw i'r amgueddfa yn ddeallusol ac yn gyhoeddus, a beth yw ei werth hirdymor. Felly, mae asesu eisoes yn digwydd, sydd wedi'i gynllunio i gyfyngu ar gaffael gwrthrychau dibendraw.

[30] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** A yw hynny hefyd yn cynnwys materion cynnal a chadw a storio?

**Mr Houlihan:** Ydy.

[31] **Janet Davies:** David, yr ydych am gyfrannu?

[32] **David Melding:** Ydwyf. Yr ydym wedi trafod mater dadgomisiynu neu ddad-dderbyn, neu beth bynnag yw'r term. Gan gyfeirio at dabl 10 ar dudalen 21, mae'n debyg ei bod yn annheg cymharu'r eitemau yr ydych yn eu caffael â'r eitemau yr ydych yn eu gwaredu. Ond hoffwn ofyn a yw'r tabl hwnnw yn fras yn dangos arferion gorau ym Mhrydain, oherwydd ymddengys eich bod yn caffael nifer o eitemau—27,000 yn 1999-2000, 78,000 y flwyddyn ganlynol. Yr oedd i lawr i 28,000 y flwyddyn ganlynol, ond y llynedd cawsoch 35,000. Mae nifer yr eitemau yr ydych yn cael gwared arnynt yn wir

in 1999. You have 4.5 million items, and you decommissioned six. You are going to become like the Vatican archive, are you not, if you do not do something about this? You may have piles of stuff, but no-one will know that it is there and be able to access it. Is this decommissioning acceptable or does it need to be increased so that you have a more rational procedure and so that we know, are aware of and use what is there?

**Mr Houlihan:** I suppose that some might say that we might want to aspire to being like the Vatican library. Again, it is cited in the documentation here that the National Museum Directors' Conference recently commissioned a piece of work called 'Too Much Stuff?', which addressed precisely this issue. I will come on to some of the specifics that you have raised, but I will start from a question of principle first, if I may. Most museums these days would recognise that they have a lot of material, and this has been acquired for some of the reasons that I just explained: they were a location of last resort for some of these objects. Most museums have numerous duplicate objects and there are objects that, perhaps, in terms of public communication, cannot be interpreted because of their condition. I agree that we should be looking at those sorts of objects and certainly, as part of a move to improve storage facilities, we should be looking at a more active disposal policy. We must take care on that, though, and I have personal experience of this. There was a very strong argument in one of the museums that I worked in for disposing of a bone collection that had come from South London Hospital. This argument went on for about five years. In the meantime, technology, particularly in relation to DNA, had moved on quite considerably, and that bone collection became fundamentally important to scientific research in terms of determining issues of disease in south London for about 400 years. You have therefore to be very careful about this, and not just say, 'Oh, it's just a load of old bones, get rid of it'. It has to be done on the basis of duplication, lack of intellectual interpretation or communication and those sorts of issues. It has to be handled very carefully, and I think that most museums these days would recognise that.

ategu'ch egwyddor o fod â rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn gwaredu: cawsoch wared â chwe eitem yn 1999. Mae gennych 4.5 miliwn o eitemau, a dadgomisiynwyd chwech gennych. Byddwch fel archif y Fatican, oni fyddwch, os na wnewch rywbeth ynglyn â hyn? Efallai y bydd gennych bentyrrau o bethau, ond ni fydd neb yn gwybod eu bod yno nac yn gallu cael atynt. A yw'r dadgomisiynu hwn yn dderbyniol, neu a oes angen ei gynyddu er mwyn i chi gael gweithdrefn fwy rhesymol ac er mwyn i ni wybod beth sydd yno, bod ymwybodol ohono a'i ddefnyddio?

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae'n debyg y byddai rhai'n dweud ein bod am fod fel llyfrgell y Fatican. Eto, nodir yn y ddogfennaeth yma fod Cynhadledd y Cyfarwyddwyr Amgueddfeydd Cenedlaethol yn ddiweddar wedi comisiynu darn o waith o'r enw 'Too Much Stuff?', a oedd yn mynd i'r afael â'r union fater hwn. Byddaf yn symud ymlaen at rai o'r manylion yr ydych wedi'u codi, ond yr wyf am ddechrau gyda chwestiwn egwyddor yn gyntaf, os caf. Byddai'r mwyafrif o amgueddfeydd y dyddiau hyn yn cydnabod bod ganddynt lawer o ddeunydd, a'i fod wedi'i gaffael am rai o'r rhesymau a eglurais yn gynharach: nhw oedd y gyrchfan olaf ar gyfer rhai o'r gwrthrychau hyn. Mae gan y mwyafrif o amgueddfeydd nifer o'r un gwrthrychau, ac mae yna wrthrychau, efallai, o ran cyfathrebu cyhoeddus, na ellir eu dehongli oherwydd eu cyflwr. Yr wyf yn cytuno y dylem fod yn edrych ar y mathau hynny o wrthrychau, ac yn sicr, fel rhan o symudiad i wella cyfleusterau storio, dylem fod yn edrych ar bolisi gwaredu fwy gweithredol. Serch hynny, rhaid i ni fod yn ofalus ynglyn â hynny, ac mae gennyf brofiad personol o hyn. Yr oedd dadl gref iawn yn un o'r amgueddfeydd yr oeddwn yn gweithio ynddi dros waredu casgliad o esgyrn a oedd wedi dod o Ysbyty De Llundain. Aeth y ddadl hon ymlaen am ryw bum mlynedd. Yn y cyfamser, yr oedd technoleg, yn arbennig o ran DNA, wedi symud ymlaen yn sylweddol, a daeth y casgliad esgyrn hwnnw yn sylfaenol bwysig mewn ymchwil wyddonol o ran penderfynu materion afiechyd yn ne Llundain am ryw 400 mlynedd. Mae'n rhaid i chi fod yn ofalus iawn ynglyn â hyn, felly, a pheidio â dweud, 'O, dim ond casgliad o hen esgyrn ydyw, beth am gael gwared ohono'. Mae'n rhaid ei wneud ar sail dyblygu, diffyg dehongli deallusol neu gyfathrebu, a mathau o faterion felly. Rhaid ei drin yn ofalus iawn, a chredaf y

byddai'r mwyafrif o amgueddfeydd yn cydnabod hynny bellach.

[33] **David Melding:** Do you accept that you need to do more work on this area?

**Mr Houlihan:** Certainly. I think that we would recognise that we need to develop a more proactive approach to the whole question of disposal. In fairness, however, I do not think that one should make a relationship between disposal and acquisition.

[34] **David Melding:** Yes, and I did say that.

**Dr Wiliam:** I would like to add to that slightly, if I may, Chair. Not only do museums have a presumption against de-accessioning, but the public has a presumption against de-accessioning as well. The National Museums and Galleries of Wales still bears the scars—the mental scars, at least—of the closure of the Welsh Industrial and Maritime Museum in Cardiff bay. A cause célèbre for us was over the tug the *Sea Alarm*, which we had acquired many years before and which was landlocked. No other museum was interested in it and there was no way that we could even get a certificate of seaworthiness to take it out. It ultimately had to be cut up, after going through the de-accessioning procedure, and the public reaction was such that we still bear the scars of it. However, my general point is that the public also has this presumption that, once something is transferred to a museum, it is there to be kept in perpetuity safely.

[35] **Janet Davies:** Leighton, you wanted to come in quickly?

[36] **Leighton Andrews:** Yes. You are, however, acquiring nearly 40,000 objects per annum on average, according to table 11, whereas the British Museum is acquiring under 7,000 objects per annum on average.

[33] **David Melding:** A ydych yn derbyn bod angen i chi wneud mwy o waith yn y maes hwn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn sicr. Credaf y byddem yn cydnabod bod angen i ni ddatblygu dull mwy rhagweithiol o ran holl fater gwaredu. I fod yn deg, fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y dylai rhywun geisio gwneud cysylltiad rhwng gwaredu a chaffael.

[34] **David Melding:** Ie, dywedais hynny.

**Dr Wiliam:** Hoffwn ychwanegu ychydig at hynny, os caf, Gadeirydd. Mae gan amgueddfeydd nid yn unig ragdybiaeth yn erbyn dadgomisiynu, ond mae gan y cyhoedd ragdybiaeth yn erbyn dadgomisiynu hefyd. Mae'r creithiau i'w gweld yn Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru o hyd—y creithiau meddyliol, o leiaf—yn sgîl cau Amgueddfa Diwydiant a Môr Cymru ym Mae Caerdydd. Un o'r achosion dadleuol i ni oedd yr un a oedd yn ymwneud â'r tynfad, y *Sea Alarm*, yr oeddem wedi ei gaffael flynyddoedd yn gynharach ac a oedd wedi'i dirgloi. Nid oedd gan yr un amgueddfa arall ddiddordeb ynddo ac nid oedd modd yn y byd inni allu cael tystysgrif addasrwydd i'r môr hyd yn oed i fynd ag ef allan. Yn y pen draw, bu'n rhaid ei dorri'n ddarnau, ar ôl mynd drwy'r broses ddadgomisiynu, ac yr ydym yn dal i ddioddef creithiau ymateb y cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, fy mhwynt cyffredinol yw bod gan y cyhoedd hefyd ragdybiaeth, ar ôl i rywbeth gael ei drosglwyddo i amgueddfa, ei fod yno i'w gadw'n ddiogel am byth.

[35] **Janet Davies:** Leighton, yr oeddech am gyfrannu'n gyflym?

[36] **Leighton Andrews:** Oeddwn. Yr ydych, er hynny, yn caffael bron i 40,000 o wrthrychau y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, yn ôl tabl 11, tra bo'r Amgueddfa Brydeinig yn caffael llai na 7,000 o wrthrychau y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd.

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that the way in which I would reply to that is that the British Museum does not acquire natural history objects and geological specimens, which tend to come in large segments. For example, if the museum is undertaking geological fieldwork, a lot of specimens will come back to us. That is in contrast to archaeological fieldwork, which quite often will only yield, these days, relatively small numbers of objects. Again, clearly, the rate of acquisition in art, in terms of numbers of objects, is quite small, compared with natural history. On the other hand, as I indicated earlier, if that one object is a large canvas, it will give us more storage problems than, say, several thousand natural history specimens. So, the nature of the collection, I think, is fundamentally important.

[37] **Janet Davies:** Of course, this is the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, and, for us, that has to be the most important museum. It is our heritage and culture, and, therefore, if we require more items—

[38] **Leighton Andrews:** The British Museum relates to our heritage as well.

[39] **Janet Davies:** Well, perhaps we will leave that argument for another time.

[40] **Jocelyn Davies:** You mentioned earlier the unique nature of the manual records. Are they complete and reliable?

**Mr Houlihan:** My understanding is—and I will double-check this—that those manual records are complete, that every object has a manual record, and that the fields, if you like, that I mentioned earlier in relation to the date of acquisition, title, basic description of the object, location and such like, are also complete. So, those records would be—the information is almost incontrovertible, so it would be an accurate record. Sometimes, records can become slightly more disputed, if you like, but that only occurs maybe at the cataloguing stage, where there might be different interpretations or whatever.

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf mai'r ffordd orau i mi ymateb i hynny yw nad yw'r Amgueddfa Brydeinig yn caffael gwrthrychau byd natur ac esiamplau daearegol, sy'n tueddu i ddod mewn segmentau mawr. Er enghraifft, os yw'r amgueddfa yn cyflawni gwaith maes daearegol, bydd llawer o esiamplau yn dod yn ôl atom. Mae hynny'n cyferbynnu â gwaith maes archaeolegol, na fydd yn aml iawn ond yn cynhyrchu, bellach, nifer cymharol fach o wrthrychau. Eto, yn amlwg, mae graddfa caffael mewn celf, o ran niferoedd gwrthrychau, yn gymharol fach, o'i gymharu â byd natur. Ar y llaw arall, fel y soniais yn gynharach, os mai cyfnas mawr yw'r un gwrthrych hwnnw, bydd yn rhoi mwy o broblemau storio i ni na rhai miloedd, dyweder, o esiamplau byd natur. Felly, mae natur y casgliad, yn fy marn i, yn hanfodol bwysig.

[37] **Janet Davies:** Wrth gwrs, dyma Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru ac, i ni, hon yw'r amgueddfa bwysicaf i fod. Dyma ein treftadaeth a'n diwylliant, ac, felly, os oes arnom eisiau rhagor o eitemau—

[38] **Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r Amgueddfa Brydeinig yn ymwneud â'n treftadaeth hefyd.

[39] **Janet Davies:** Wel, efallai y gadawn lonydd i'r ddadl honno am y tro.

[40] **Jocelyn Davies:** Bu i chi grybwyll natur unigryw y cofnodion llaw yn gynharach. A ydynt yn gyflawn ac yn ddibynadwy?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall—a byddaf yn cadarnhau hyn—mae'r cofnodion llaw hynny'n gyflawn, mae cofnod â llaw ar gyfer pob gwrthrych, ac mae'r meysydd, os mynnwch, a grybwyllais yn gynharach o ran y dyddiad caffael, y teitl, disgrifiad sylfaenol o'r gwrthrych, y lleoliad ac ati, hefyd yn gyflawn. Felly, byddai'r cofnodion hynny—mae'r wybodaeth bron â bod yn ddiymwad, felly byddai'n gofnod cywir. O bryd i'w gilydd, gall cofnodion fynd ychydig yn fwy dadleuol, os mynnwch chi, ond dim ond yn y cyfnod catalogio o bosibl y bydd hynny, lle y gellir cael gwahanol ddehongliadau neu ryw bethau o'r fath.



[41] **Jocelyn Davies:** Some of these records, I should imagine, are quite old.

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes, they are.

[42] **Jocelyn Davies:** It cannot be easy to be working with manual records—pieces of paper—that might be quite old.

**Mr Houlihan:** Absolutely. I think, again, as I mentioned earlier, that one cannot dispute the fact that a computerised record is far more efficient in terms of retrieval, and also I think that there is a big advantage there in terms of updating the record, and access to the record by other exhibition staff or education staff, say. Computerisation is clearly the route to go down, but in terms of accountability and accounting for the objects, those manual records are still used for doing checks on objects and also for locating objects. Certainly, while only a small number of objects were checked by it, when the National Audit Office did some spot checks, those objects were located.

[43] **Jocelyn Davies:** Did I misunderstand what you said earlier on? Did you say that you were not going to computerise all the manual records, that you had decided that perhaps that was not something that you ought to undertake?

**Mr Houlihan:** Just to clarify that, in response to the earlier question, I indicated that, in the light of the report and in the light of a piece of work that we are doing, we are currently developing a new vision for the national museum and gallery—I know that that is a slightly difficult word—and that will, I think, have big implications for the way in which we use our collections in the future, the intellectual themes that we follow, the stories that we tell and such like. Now, it will be interesting to see—and what we will need to do at that point, certainly, and we are talking this current financial year, is to review, again taking into account this report, our documentation priorities. In the light of that, we might decide that the route to go down is digitisation, cataloguing, or whatever, rather than trying to produce a computer inventory of every single object in the collection. In terms of the drivers for the organisation, there might be a higher priority to

[41] **Jocelyn Davies:** Mae rhywfaint o'r cofnodion hyn, byddwn yndyfalw, yn eithaf hen.

**Mr Houlihan:** Ydynt, maent.

[42] **Jocelyn Davies:** Ni all fod yn hawdd gweithio gyda chofnodion llaw—darnau o bapur—a allai fod yn hen iawn.

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn sicr. Credaf, eto, fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach, na all rhywun ddadlau yn erbyn y ffaith bod cofnod cyfrifiadurol yn llawer mwy effeithlon o ran adfer, a chredaf hefyd fod mantais fawr o ran diweddarw'r cofnod, a mynediad at y cofnod gan staff eraill yr arddangosfa neu staff addysg, dyweder. Mae'n amlwg mai cyfrifiaduro yw'r llwybr i'w ddilyn, ond o ran atebolrwydd a rhoi cyfrif am y gwrthrychau, defnyddir y cofnodion llaw hynny o hyd ar gyfer archwilio gwrthrychau a hefyd ar gyfer lleoli gwrthrychau. Yn sicr, er mai dim ond ychydig o wrthrychau a archwiliwyd ganddi, pan wnaeth y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol wiriadau ar hap, lleolwyd y gwrthrychau hynny.

[43] **Jocelyn Davies:** A gamddeallais yr hyn y bu ichi ei ddweud yn gynharach? A ddywedasoch nad oeddech am gyfrifiaduro'r holl gofnodion llaw, eich bod wedi penderfynu efallai na fyddai hynny'n rhywbeth y dylech ei wneud?

**Mr Houlihan:** Er mwyn egluro hynny, wrth ymateb i'r cwestiwn cynharach, dywedais, yng ngoleuni'r adroddiad ac yng ngoleuni gwaith yr ydym wrthi'n ei wneud, yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn datblygu gweledigaeth newydd ar gyfer yr amgueddfa a'r oriel genedlaethol—a gwn fod hwnnw'n air ychydig yn anodd—a bydd goblygiadau mawr i hynny, fe gredaf, o ran y modd yr ydym yn defnyddio ein casgliadau yn y dyfodol, y themâu deallusol y byddwn yn eu dilyn, y straeon y byddwn yn eu hadrodd ac ati. Yn awr, bydd yn ddiddorol gweld—a'r hyn y bydd yn rhaid i ni ei wneud bryd hynny, yn sicr, ac yr ydym yn sôn am y flwyddyn ariannol hon, fydd adolygu ein blaenoriaethau dogfennu, eto gan ystyried yr adroddiad hwn. Yng ngoleuni hynny, efallai y byddwn yn penderfynu mai'r llwybr i'w ddilyn yw digido, catalogio, neu beth bynnag y bo, yn hytrach na cheisio cynhyrchu rhestr gyfrifiadurol o bob un gwrthrych yn

do those other things. Over time, I have no doubt that every object in the collection will be computerised.

[44] **Jocelyn Davies:** So, what are you doing to make sure that the manual records that you currently have are all brought together and are safe, complete and up to date?

**Mr Houlihan:** The manual records are held—and, again, Eurwyn can correct this—securely. There are fireproof safes, cabinets and such like within the museum; they are secure. So, from that point of view, they are secured. Areas of the collection are identified for priority for computerisation, so those records are computerised. So, I think that it is true to say that the security of the records is held, and that computerisation is taking place at the current rate of 200,000 a year, although we could look at increasing that, I think. Those records are there.

[45] **Jocelyn Davies:** So how realistic then is your estimate of the £1.65 million cost of addressing the curation backlog? Is that realistic?

**Mr Houlihan:** That was the subject of a study that was undertaken by Dr Wiliam, and that was based on full assessment.

**Dr Wiliam:** Yes. That, I guess, was the Rolls Royce model, if you like. That would have not only computerised all our records but also catalogued all our records. So that is something that every museum aspires to and, up to now, very few have ever hit. So that would be, as I say, the Rolls Royce model, and we did cost that at something like £1.6 million.

[46] **Jocelyn Davies:** This job must be quite labour intensive, and I should imagine that curators are highly specialised and highly qualified. Do you have enough curators to do this?

y casgliad. O ran y ffactorau fydd yn llywio'r sefydliad, efallai y bydd blaenoriaeth uwch i wneud y pethau eraill hynny. O dipyn i beth, nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd pob eitem yn y casgliad yn cael eu cyfrifiaduro.

[44] **Jocelyn Davies:** Felly, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y cofnodion llaw sydd gennych ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu casglu ynghyd a'u bod yn ddiogel, yn gyflawn ac yn gyfredol?

**Mr Houlihan:** Cedwir y cofnodion llaw—ac, eto, gall Eurwyn gywiro hyn—yn ddiogel. Mae coffrau gwrthdan, cabinetau a phethau felly yn yr amgueddfa; maent yn ddiogel. Felly, o'r safbwynt hwinnw, maent yn cael eu cadw'n ddiogel. Nodir meysydd yn y casgliad sydd i gael blaenoriaeth o ran eu cyfrifiaduro, felly mae'r cofnodion hynny'n cael eu cyfrifiaduro. Felly, credaf y byddai'n wir dweud bod diogelwch y cofnodion yn cael ei gynnal, a bod 200,000 y flwyddyn yn cael eu cyfrifiaduro ar hyn o bryd, er y gallem ystyried cynyddu hynny, yn fy marn i. Mae'r cofnodion hynny yno.

[45] **Jocelyn Davies:** Felly pa mor realistig yw eich amcangyfrif o'r costau o £1.65 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad o ran curaduriaeth? A yw hynny'n realistig?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr oedd hynny'n destun astudiaeth a wnaed gan Dr Wiliam, a oedd yn seiliedig ar asesiad llawn.

**Dr Wiliam:** Oedd. Mae'n debyg mai hwinnw oedd y model Rolls Royce, os mynnwch chi. Byddai hynny nid yn unig wedi cyfrifiaduro ein holl gofnodion, ond hefyd byddai wedi catalogio ein holl gofnodion. Felly mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae pob amgueddfa'n ceisio'i wneud a, hyd yma, nid oes llawer wedi gallu gwneud hynny. Felly, fel y dywedais, dyna fyddai'r model Rolls Royce, ac amcangyfrifwyd y byddai hynny'n costio oddeutu £1.6 miliwn.

[46] **Jocelyn Davies:** Mae'n rhaid bod y gwaith o wneud hyn yn eithaf llafurus, a byddwn yn dyfalu bod curaduron yn arbenigwyr ac yn gymwys iawn. A oes gennych ddigon o guraduron i wneud hyn?

**Mr Houlihan:** I have to say ‘no’.

[47] **Jocelyn Davies:** How many do you have?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that if you look at the way in which this sort of process happens, a lot of the work on transferring those manual records into a computerised inventory format is, essentially, a sort of copying process. So it can be done by documentation officers, who might be qualified natural historians, but would not, for the sake of argument, be classified as curators—they are not developing a collection, and are not researching a collection. They have a dedicated job of transferring these records. The role of the curator is very much to do a quality check, if you like, on those records, ensuring that descriptors and the vocabulary used are correct, and that we are dealing with a porringer and not with a pot—those sorts of things. That is where the curator’s role is carried out. The role of the curator really is directed towards the areas of developing the collections, researching the collections, interpreting them as a result of that research and, for many of the curators, not only being involved in publication but also in exhibition communication activities, communicating those stories and objects. So it is quite a high-level activity. Where the curator becomes more involved in the process, I suppose, is in relation to the catalogue record, if you like, where it is only the curator that can do the catalogue record. However, the physical task of data entry can be done by a more junior member of staff.

[48] **Mick Bates:** Continuing on paragraph 12.12, you have mentioned your review of targets for documentation and curation levels. What progress have you made on your review of targets for documentation and curation levels?

**Mr Houlihan:** Sorry, which paragraph?

[49] **Mick Bates:** Paragraph 12.12. Sorry, it is 2.12. I do beg your pardon. It is in reference to your review of targets for documentation and curation levels. What progress have you made on reviewing those targets?

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae’n rhaid i mi ddweud ‘nac oes’.

[47] **Jocelyn Davies:** Faint sydd gennyh?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf, os ydych yn edrych ar y ffordd y mae’r math hwn o broses yn digwydd, mai rhyw fath o broses o gopïo yw llawer o’r gwaith ar drosglwyddo’r cofnodion llaw hynny i fformat rhestr gyfrifiadurol. Felly gellir ei wneud gan swyddogion dogfennu, a allai fod yn naturiaethwyr cymwys, ond na fyddent, er enghraifft, yn cael eu dosbarthu fel curaduron—nid ydynt yn datblygu casgliad, ac nid ydynt yn ymchwilio i gasgliad. Mae ganddynt swydd benodol, sef trosglwyddo’r cofnodion hyn. Swyddogaeth y curadur yw archwilio ansawdd y cofnodion hynny, os mynnwch chi, gan sicrhau bod y disgrifiadau a’r eirfa a ddefnyddir yn gywir, a’n bod yn delio â dysgl ac nid powlen—pethau felly. Dyna lle y cyflawnir swyddogaeth y curadur. Mae swyddogaeth y curadur mewn gwirionedd yn ymwneud â meysydd datblygu’r casgliadau, ymchwilio i’r casgliadau, eu dehongli o ganlyniad i’r ymchwil honno ac, i lawer o guraduron, maent nid yn unig yn cyfrannu at gyhoeddi ond yn cyfrannu at weithgareddau cyfathrebu arddangosfa, drwy gyflwyno’r straeon a’r gwrthrychau hynny. Felly mae’n weithgarwch ar lefel bur uchel. Mae’r curadur yn cyfrannu mwy at y broses, mae’n debyg, o ran y cofnod catalog, os mynnwch chi, lle na all neb ond y curadur wneud y cofnod catalog. Fodd bynnag, gall y dasg gorfforol o gofnodi data gael ei chyflawni gan aelod is o’r staff.

[48] **Mick Bates:** Gan barhau gyda pharagraff 12.12, yr ydych wedi crybwyll eich adolygiad o’r targedau ar gyfer lefelau dogfennu a churaduriaeth. Pa gynnydd yr ydych wedi’i wneud o ran eich adolygiad o’r targedau ar gyfer lefelau dogfennu a churaduriaeth?

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, pa baragraff?

[49] **Mick Bates:** Paragraff 12.12. Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, 2.12. Maddeuwch imi. Mae’n cyfeirio at eich adolygiad o’r targedau ar gyfer lefelau dogfennu a churaduriaeth. Pa gynnydd yr ydych wedi’i wneud o ran adolygu’r targedau hynny?

**Mr Houlihan:** The museum has had a number of areas where it has been reviewing activities. We are currently doing quite a lot of review work, as you might imagine. The first area is obviously in relation to developing the vision, which is going to provide a broad context for the museum and its general direction. We are currently looking at issues of display and how we present our collections, particularly at Cathays Park and the Museum of Welsh Life, which will have implications for the numbers of objects on display. We are currently looking at storage, which will, we hope, have a big impact in making the collections more accessible to the public. As I think I have just indicated, we will also, at that point, revisit our documentation targets, which is really one of the report's recommendations. We have also reviewed, and again this is referred to in the document, our approach to conservation. However, by and large, we have been waiting for this report to come through to see the extent to which it corroborates some of the reviewing work that we have been doing so far. So we have to go away now and do a hot towel job on this and bring all these elements together so that we have a cohesive, yet flexible approach to taking a lot of these issues forward, and try to find some of those smart solutions that I was talking about earlier, which hit a number of our targets.

[50] **Mick Bates:** So this review will impact on the resources that you require?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that the review has assisted us in terms of looking at the way in which we use some of our existing resources, maybe in relation to documentation. We already have £3.5 million coming on-stream from the Assembly Government in relation to our storage needs and, clearly, we have to use those resources for the dedicated purpose. However, this study will assist us in addressing those sorts of issues and how that expenditure is made. It has also become a catalyst for ensuring that we achieve some linkages and that we do not just see documentation and conservation sitting in their own compartments and storage but that they are actually part of the same picture.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae'r amgueddfa wedi adolygu ei gweithgareddau mewn nifer o feysydd. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn gwneud llawer o waith adolygu, fel y gallwch ddyfalu. Yn amlwg, y maes cyntaf yw datblygu'r weledigaeth, a fydd yn darparu cyd-destun eang ar gyfer yr amgueddfa a'i chyfeiriad cyffredinol. Yr ydym wrthi'n edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud ag arddangos a sut yr ydym yn cyflwyno ein casgliadau, yn arbennig ym Mharc Cathays ac Amgueddfa Werin Cymru, a fydd â goblygiadau ar gyfer nifer y gwrthrychau sy'n cael eu harddangos. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ystyried storio, a fydd, gobeithio, yn cael effaith sylweddol o ran sicrhau bod y casgliadau yn fwy hygyrch i'r cyhoedd. Fel y soniais eisoes, fe gredaf, byddwn hefyd, bryd hynny, yn rhoi sylw eto i'n targedau dogfennu, sef un o argymhellion yr adroddiad mewn gwirionedd. Yr ydym hefyd wedi adolygu ein hagwedd at gadwraeth, ac eto cyfeirir at hyn yn y ddogfen. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan, yr ydym wedi bod yn disgwyl i'r adroddiad hwn gael ei gyflwyno i weld i ba raddau y mae'n cadarnhau rhywfaint o'r gwaith adolygu yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud hyd yma. Felly mae'n rhaid i ni fynd ati yn awr i dorchi llewys a dod â'r holl elfennau hyn at ei gilydd er mwyn i ni allu rhoi dull cydlynol, ond hyblyg, ar waith i ddatblygu llawer o'r materion hyn, a cheisio dod o hyd i rai o'r atebion treiddgar hynny yr oeddwn yn eu trafod yn gynharach, sy'n bodloni llawer o'n targedau.

[50] **Mick Bates:** Felly bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn effeithio ar yr adnoddau y bydd arnoch eu hangen?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod yr adolygiad wedi'n cynorthwyo o ran edrych ar y modd yr ydym yn defnyddio rhywfaint o'n hadnoddau presennol, efallai mewn perthynas â dogfennu. Yr ydym yn disgwyl £3.5 miliwn eisoes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer ein hanghenion storio ac, yn amlwg, mae'n rhaid i ni ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hynny i'r diben penodol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr astudiaeth hon yn ein cynorthwyo i roi sylw i faterion fel hyn a sut y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario. Mae hefyd yn sbardun i sicrhau ein bod yn cysylltu rhai pethau â'i gilydd ac nad ydym yn gweld dogfennu a chadwraeth fel dau beth sydd wedi'u cyfyngu i'w hadrannau a'u storfeydd eu hunain ond eu bod yn rhan o'r un darlun mewn gwirionedd.

[51] **Mick Bates:** So, will those lead to a consistent approach to your museum-wide strategy?

**Mr Houlihan:** Absolutely.

[52] **Alun Cairns:** May I draw your attention to paragraph 2.13, which highlights the auditing and verification process, and your policy in relation to it? It highlights systematic audit, spot-checking, and audit by use. It recognises that spot-checking and audit by use is conducted, yet there is no systematic verification. Can you tell us why?

**Dr Wiliam:** There is, in fact. Just to rehearse what we are saying, regarding audit by use, curators will constantly be using the collections, whether for their own research or to answer public enquiries. So, there is constant use. The computerisation process is spreading out by definition from those records and objects that are already computerised to those that are not computerised and, as you have already heard, we are tackling 200,000 of those per annum. So, a million were done in the past five years and we shall do another million in the next five years. That means then that, per annum, we are physically verifying 200,000 objects as part of that rolling process. So, we have physically verified over 1 million in the past five years and we will do another million. Although it seems totally tiddly by comparison, we also have a systematic procedure, but that, I am afraid, is only 600 objects a year. Against the totality of over 200,000 checked off and computerised every year, it is fairly meaningless. However, if you add all those together—and those processes are obviously subjected to audit by both the National Audit Office and also our internal auditor, who will do a small spot check per annum—I would guess that we would be physically verifying between a quarter of a million and 300,000 objects per annum.

[51] **Mick Bates:** Felly, a fydd hynny'n arwain at ddull cyson yn eich strategaeth amgueddfa gyfan?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn sicr.

[52] **Alun Cairns:** A gaf fi dynnu eich sylw at baragraff 2.13, sy'n amlygu'r broses archwilio a gwirio, a'ch polisi ynghylch hyn? Mae'n amlygu archwilio systematig, gwirio ar hap, ac archwilio yn ôl y defnydd. Mae'n cydnabod bod gwirio ar hap ac archwilio yn ôl y defnydd yn digwydd, ond eto nid oes gwirio systematig. A allwch ddweud pam?

**Dr Wiliam:** Mae hyn yn digwydd, mewn gwirionedd. Ac ailadrodd yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ddweud, o ran archwilio yn ôl y defnydd, bydd curaduron yn defnyddio'r casgliadau'n gyson, naill ai ar gyfer eu hymchwil eu hunain neu i ateb ymholiadau'r cyhoedd. Felly, maent yn cael eu defnyddio'n gyson. Mae'r broses gyfrifiaduro yn ymledu drwy ddiffiniad o'r cofnodion a'r gwrthrychau hynny sydd wedi'u cyfrifiaduro eisoes i'r rhai sydd heb eu gwneud ac, fel yr ydych wedi clywed eisoes, yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â 200,000 o'r rheini bob blwyddyn. Felly, gwnaethpwyd miliwn yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf a byddwn yn gwneud miliwn arall yn y pum mlynedd nesaf. Mae hynny'n golygu, bob blwyddyn, ein bod yn gwirio 200,000 o wrthrychau'n gorfforol fel rhan o'r broses dreigl hon. Felly, yr ydym wedi gwirio dros filiwn yn gorfforol yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf a byddwn yn gwneud miliwn arall. Er bod hyn yn ymddangos yn bitw iawn mewn cymhariaeth, mae gennym hefyd weithdrefn systematig, ond dim ond 600 o wrthrychau, yn anffodus, yw hynny bob blwyddyn. O'i gymharu â'r cyfanswm o dros 200,000 sy'n cael eu gwirio a'u cyfrifiaduro bob blwyddyn, mae'n eithaf diystyr. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn adio'r rheini i gyd at ei gilydd—ac mae'r prosesau hynny yn amlwg yn destun archwiliad gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'n harchwilydd mewnol, sy'n gwneud archwiliad bychan ar hap bob blwyddyn—mae'n debyg y byddem yn gwirio rhwng chwarter miliwn a 300,000 o wrthrychau yn gorfforol bob blwyddyn.

[53] **Alun Cairns:** I draw your attention to the second bullet point on page 15 of the report. Does that mean that you dispute the conclusion that the Auditor General has come to in that bullet point?

**Dr Wiliam:** No, our spot-checking is done essentially on those records that we have computerised. It is a value-for-money point, I think.

[54] **Alun Cairns:** Sorry to cut across you, Dr Wiliam, but I am referring to the systematic verification arrangements that are included in that bullet point.

**Dr Wiliam:** I think that we would agree that we could do more. Where I think that this report has been helpful is that I can see quite clearly that we can fairly readily do those for our science collections, which are stored in their systematic fashion, that is, the Latin names given by Carl Linnaeus in the seventeenth century and Charles Darwin in the nineteenth century. So, a scientific curator, for example, will know exactly where type x of a shell will go because it can only fit into that sequence. So, I can see that we could quite readily—and, clearly, according to this report we should—extend our spot-checking into those areas. However, that will be in addition to the at least 250,000 physical verification exercises that we do per annum.

[55] **Alun Cairns:** Okay. So, given that your spot-checking—because that is what you have specifically highlighted in your response—is mainly chosen from the electronic system, do you feel that those that are held on manual records are therefore at risk, bearing in mind that they represent a large proportion of your collection?

[53] **Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf am dynnu eich sylw at yr ail bwynt bwled ar dudalen 15 yn yr adroddiad. A yw hynny'n golygu eich bod yn amau'r casgliad sydd gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn y pwynt bwled hwnnw?

**Dr Wiliam:** Nac ydyw, mae ein gwirio ar hap yn cael ei wneud yn y bôn ar y cofnodion hynny sydd wedi'u cyfrifiaduro gennym. Y mae'n ymwneud â gwerth am arian, yn fy marn i.

[54] **Alun Cairns:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar eich traws, Dr Wiliam, ond cyfeirio yr wyf at y trefniadau gwirio systematig sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y pwynt bwled hwnnw.

**Dr Wiliam:** Credaf y byddem yn cytuno y gallem wneud rhagor. Credaf fod yr adroddiad hwn wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol am fy mod yn gallu gweld yn eithaf clir y gallwn wneud y rheini'n gymharol rwydd ar gyfer ein casgliadau gwyddoniaeth, sy'n cael eu storio yn y dull systematig, hynny yw, yr enwau Lladin a roddwyd gan Carl Linnaeus yn yr ail ganrif ar bymtheg a Charles Darwin yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg. Felly, bydd curadur gwyddonol, er enghraifft, yn gwybod yn union i ble y bydd cragen math x yn mynd oherwydd mai dim ond i'r dilyniant hwnnw y bydd yn ffitio. Felly, gallaf weld y gallem yn hawdd—ac y dylem, yn amlwg, yn ôl yr adroddiad hwn—ehangu ein gwirio ar hap i'r meysydd hynny. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n ychwanegol at y 250,000 o wiriadau corfforol o leiaf yr ydym yn eu gwneud bob blwyddyn.

[55] **Alun Cairns:** Iawn. Felly, o ystyried bod eich gwirio ar hap—oherwydd dyna beth yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw yn benodol ato yn eich ymateb—yn cael ei ddewis yn bennaf o'r system electronig, a ydych yn credu bod y rhai a gedwir ar gofnodion llaw mewn perygl felly, o gofio eu bod yn gyfran fawr o'ch casgliad?

**Dr Wiliam:** By definition, yes, but what I would say is that when we started the process of computerising our records and our objects, we started by computerising all those on display. We then moved to all those on loan and then identified those that do not fit into either of those categories and which were of greatest monetary and financial worth, so we are working our way down. By definition, therefore, all the most valuable objects in our collections, however defined, will already be on the computerised records. Therefore, we are concentrating our spot-checking in that area, but the 200,000 new records that we create each year will be rolling out into the otherwise uncomputerised records.

[56] **Alun Cairns:** Bearing in mind that it will take 10 years to complete that process, do you think that it is acceptable that the spot-checking will not reach some of the artefacts for 10 years' time?

**Dr Wiliam:** We are back, are we not, to the wider debate about where do resources go. Yes, we could spot-check every item every year, and our curators would do nothing else. In effect, we would not be offering access to the public, we would not be creating new exhibitions and we would not be offering loans. It is a balance.

**Mr Houlihan:** If I could just add to that, I think that we have to be honest about this and say that systematic verification of the entire collection—which is the bullet point—is not a priority for the organisation. However, systematic verification of those objects of high value is a priority for the organisation.

[57] **Alun Cairns:** Finally, as a result of the Auditor General's comments in the report, what plans do you have to change your procedures or priorities in relation, specifically, to verification?

**Dr Wiliam:** Drwy ddiffiniad, ydynt, ond yr hyn y byddwn yn ei ddweud yw pan ddechreuwyd y broses o gyfrifiaduro ein cofnodion a'n gwrthrychau, dechreuwyd drwy gyfrifiaduro pob un o'r rhai a oedd yn cael eu harddangos. Wedi hynny aethom ymlaen at y rhai sydd ar fenthyg ac yna penderfynu pa rai sydd heb fod yn ffitio i'r un o'r categorïau hynny ac a oedd o'r gwerth ariannol mwyaf, felly yr ydym yn gweithio'n ffordd i lawr. Drwy ddiffiniad, felly, bydd pob un o'r gwrthrychau mwyaf gwerthfawr yn ein casgliadau, sut bynnag y'u diffinnir, ar y cofnodion cyfrifiadurol eisoes. Felly, yr ydym yn canolbwyntio ar wirio ar hap yn y maes hwnnw, ond bydd y 200,000 o gofnodion newydd yr ydym yn eu creu bob blwyddyn yn cael eu hychwanegu fesul cam i'r cofnodion nad ydynt wedi'u cyfrifiaduro fel arall.

[56] **Alun Cairns:** O gofio y bydd yn cymryd 10 mlynedd i gwblhau'r broses honno, a ydych yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol na fydd y gwirio ar hap yn cyrraedd rhai o'r arteffactau am 10 mlynedd arall?

**Dr Wiliam:** Yr ydym wedi dod yn ôl, onid ydym, at y ddadl ehangach ynglyn ag i ble y mae'r adnoddau'n mynd. Gallem wirio pob eitem ar hap bob blwyddyn, gallem, ac ni fyddai'n curaduron yn gwneud dim arall. I bob diben, ni fyddem yn cynnig mynediad i'r cyhoedd, ni fyddem yn creu arddangosfeydd newydd, ac ni fyddem yn cynnig benthyciadau. Mae'n ymwneud â chydbwysedd.

**Mr Houlihan:** Os caf ychwanegu at hynny, credaf fod yn rhaid i ni fod yn onest am hyn a dweud nad yw gwirio'r holl gasgliad yn systematig—sef y pwynt bwled—yn flaenoriaeth ar gyfer y sefydliad. Fodd bynnag, mae gwirio'r gwrthrychau hynny sydd o werth mawr yn systematig yn flaenoriaeth i'r sefydliad.

[57] **Alun Cairns:** I gloi, o ganlyniad i sylwadau'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn yr adroddiad, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i newid eich gweithdrefnau neu eich blaenoriaethau ynghylch gwirio, yn benodol?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that we will be following some of the points that Eurwyn made, particularly in relation to the scientific collections, to see how we could get more systematic verification into those sorts of areas. We accept that there is a need to review that area, and I think that it is inevitable anyway that, as we do more storage work, and as more documentation rolls through, more of the collections will be verified or stock-checked. I think that the more of the collection that we can get into public use, as it were, through access and so on, the more areas we would automatically verify as part of our normal security and public access procedures.

[58] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, I do not know whether any of the questions that you wanted to ask have been covered?

[59] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** We have heard that storage has been improved over the years and that some £8 million has been spent on upgrading and increasing storage facilities across your sites. However, instances have been highlighted where physical panes of glass have to be removed to even access items, which implies that there are key areas that still need a lot of work. Could you explain the source of income for the £8 million—where did this come from? In terms of your budgets, do you think that, over the years, you should have perhaps invested more in storage and conservation?

**Mr Houlihan:** I would return to my opening remark and say that, in common with other museums, the National Museums and Galleries of Wales has been playing catch up in this area over the past 15 years or so, which probably spans the period covered by the reports that have been coming out. Efforts have been made, but I think that we would recognise that more is required in the whole storage area, which is why we have been pressing the Assembly Government and why it has agreed to provide us with the £3.5 million to enable us to address storage issues across the organisation. We feel that, in terms of the plans that we are developing, both for development at our Nantgarw facility and for some improvements at other locations that are more publicly accessible, we can

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf y byddwn yn dilyn rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Eurwyn, yn arbennig ynghylch y casgliadau gwyddonol, i weld sut y gallem gael rhagor o wiriadau systematig i'r mathau hynny o feysydd. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod angen adolygu'r maes hwnnw, a chredaf ei bod yn anochel beth bynnag y bydd rhagor o'r casgliadau, wrth i ni wneud mwy o waith storio, ac wrth i ragor o'r dogfennau gael eu gwneud, yn cael eu gwirio neu'n cael archwiliad stoc. Yn fy marn i, po fwyaf o'r casgliad y gellir ei ddefnyddio gan y cyhoedd, fel petai, drwy fynediad ac yn y blaen, po fwyaf o feysydd a fyddai'n cael eu gwirio'n awtomatig fel rhan o'n gweithdrefnau arferol o ran diogelwch a mynediad i'r cyhoedd.

[58] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, nid wyf yn gwybod a oes unrhyw rai o'r cwestiynau yr oeddech am eu gofyn wedi'u trafod?

[59] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yr ydym wedi clywed bod storio wedi'i wella dros y blynyddoedd a bod oddeutu £8 miliwn wedi'i wario ar uwchraddio a chynyddu cyfleusterau storio drwy eich safleoedd. Fodd bynnag, tynnwyd sylw at achosion lle y bu'n rhaid tynnu paenau o wydr er mwyn cael mynediad at eitemau hyd yn oed, sy'n awgrymu bod angen gwneud llawer o waith mewn rhai meysydd allweddol o hyd. A allech esbonio beth yw ffynhonnell yr incwm ar gyfer yr £8 miliwn—o ble y daeth? O ran eich cyllidebau, a ydych yn credu y dylech fod wedi buddsoddi mwy mewn storio a chadwraeth dros y blynyddoedd o bosibl?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr wyf am fynd yn ôl at fy sylw cyntaf a dweud, yn yr un modd ag amgueddfeydd eraill, fod Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi bod yn ceisio dal i fyny yn y maes hwn yn ystod y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, sef y cyfnod sy'n cael ei gynnwys yn yr adroddiadau yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae ymdrechion wedi'u gwneud, ond credaf y byddem yn cydnabod bod angen gwneud mwy yn y maes storio, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod yn rhoi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a pham y mae wedi cytuno i roi £3.5 miliwn i ni i'n galluogi i fynd i'r afael â materion sy'n ymwneud â storio drwy'r sefydliad. Credwn, o ran y cynlluniau yr ydym yn eu datblygu, ar gyfer y datblygiad yn ein canolfan yn Nantgarw ac ar gyfer rhai gwelliannau mewn lleoliadau eraill sy'n fwy



achieve that target of 90 per cent good storage by 2006-07. So, that is where we are going. Our initial estimates of the money that we will need to spend in this sort of period is probably just in excess of £5 million. So, there is a shortfall, and we will have to go out and find additional sums for that. But, again, this comes back to some of these types of solutions. If we were to open up, say, our furniture collection to public access, there are potential funders out there that might assist us with doing something like that. Storage is a particularly unsexy area in terms of sponsors, particularly at a time when, UK-wide, even capital projects are having trouble getting cash into them—such as public museum redevelopments, even in London and so on—so it is quite a difficult area, there is no doubt about that. However, I think that we can put together a package that might interest people.

[60] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Can I have some clarification on the £8 million?

**Dr Wiliam:** I have in my hand a piece of paper relating to that. Much of it came from the museum's capital budget over that time—in fact, all of it did really. Some of it was piggy-backing on the major capital development of the centre court in the national museum and gallery, which, when it happened in the early 1990s, was the largest museum redevelopment in the UK in monetary terms up to that point. It also includes the £2.25 million that we spent on acquiring our collection centre at Nantgarw, so there are major chunks in there. It is at the national museum and gallery, at the Museum of Welsh Life, and at several of our smaller sites as well.

[61] **Mick Bates:** Turning to pages 18 and 19, the Auditor General lists quite a few case studies. I must admit that, when I read through those, I was quite shocked, especially where it appears that staff have been put at risk. To what extent would you agree that this is not just an issue of collection management, but also of health and safety, because staff are being endangered by these conditions?

hygyrch i'r cyhoedd, y gallwn gyflawni'r targed hwnnw o 90 y cant o storio da erbyn 2006-07. Felly, dyna'r llwybr yr ydym yn ei ddilyn. Ychydig dros £5 miliwn yw'n hamcangyfrif cyntaf o'r arian y bydd angen i ni ei wario yn y cyfnod hwn, yn ôl pob tebyg. Felly mae diffyg, a bydd yn rhaid i ni fynd ati i ddod o hyd i arian ychwanegol ar gyfer hynny. Ond, eto, mae hyn yn dod yn ôl at rai o'r mathau hyn o atebion. Pe baem yn agor, er enghraifft, ein casgliad dodrefn i'r cyhoedd, mae cyllidwyr posibl ar gael a allai ein cynorthwyo i wneud rhywbeth felly. Mae storio yn faes hynod o anffasiynol o ran noddwyr, yn arbennig ar adeg pan fo hyd yn oed prosiectau cyfalaf, ledled y DU, yn ei chael yn anodd denu arian—megis prosiectau ailddatblygu amgueddfeydd cyhoeddus, hyd yn oed yn Llundain ac ati—felly mae'n faes eithaf anodd, nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, credaf y gallwn roi pecyn gyda'i gilydd a allai fod o ddiddordeb i bobl.

[60] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** A gaf eglurhad am yr £8 miliwn?

**Dr Wiliam:** Mae gennyf ddarn o bapur yn fy llaw sy'n ymwneud â hynny. Daeth llawer ohono o gyllideb gyfalaf yr amgueddfa yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw—yn wir, y cyfan mewn gwirionedd. Yr oedd rhywfaint ohono yn gysylltiedig â'r datblygiad cyfalaf sylweddol yn y cwrt canol yn yr amgueddfa a'r oriel genedlaethol, y prosiect ailddatblygu mwyaf mewn amgueddfa yn y DU mewn termau ariannol hyd hynny pan ddigwyddodd yn gynnar yn y 1990au. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys y £2.25 miliwn a wariwyd gennym ar gaffael ein canolfan gasgliadau yn Nantgarw, felly dyna symiau sylweddol. Mae yn yr amgueddfa a'r oriel genedlaethol, yn Amgueddfa Werin Cymru, ac mewn llawer o'n safleoedd llai hefyd.

[61] **Mick Bates:** A throi at dudalennau 18 ac 19, mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn rhestru amryw o astudiaethau achos. Mae'n rhaid i mi gyfaddef, pan ddarllenais drwy'r rheini, imi gael fy syfrdanu, yn arbennig lle y mae'n ymddangos bod y staff wedi'u rhoi mewn perygl. I ba raddau y byddech yn cytuno nad mater o reoli'r casgliad yn unig yw hyn, ond mater o iechyd a diogelwch hefyd, oherwydd bod yr amodau hyn yn peryglu'r staff?

**Dr Wiliam:** I guess our response to this report would be that it is immensely helpful, particularly on storage. I hope that the officers of the National Audit Office are content that we have tried to give them access and not hidden anything because obviously, let us be honest, we wanted to use this report. We think that it has been exceedingly helpful. So, these were all issues that we were extremely concerned with and extremely aware of, and I agree, in some cases, with the point that you are making, which is why we are so delighted that the Assembly has been able to earmark £3.5 million for us. These are major items for us and we are absolutely delighted that it seems that we can really do something meaningful about the situation over the next couple of years.

[62] **Mick Bates:** That is fine, but example H states that one storage building was in such a bad condition, following water ingress, that a member of staff fell through the floor. It is all very well to say that you now have £3.5 million to do things, but I would just like to know what records and data are kept, and what actions were taken to address health and safety issues given that you have already admitted that you knew that storage conditions were bad for your staff?

**Dr Wiliam:** That particular example, I think, is sub judice, literally. However, more generally, we do take a risk-based approach to everything following the publication of the Turnbull report a few years ago. We have a very systematic and, I hope, rigorous process of flagging up issues such as this. I can only assure you that we are now acutely aware of these issues. The safety and wellbeing of staff, obviously, has primacy and so we take these issues most seriously.

[63] **Mick Bates:** I am pleased to hear that, but does that mean then that you have good data so that you collect it and revisit health and safety standards in terms of staff accidents on a continual basis?

**Dr Wiliam:** Mae'n debyg mai ein hymateb i'r adroddiad hwn yw ei fod yn hynod o ddefnyddiol, yn arbennig o ran storio. Gobeithio bod swyddogion y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn fodlon ein bod wedi ceisio rhoi mynediad iddynt a heb guddio dim oherwydd yn amlwg, gadewch i ni fod yn onest, yr oeddem am ddefnyddio'r adroddiad hwn. Credwn ei fod wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol dros ben. Felly, yr oedd y rhain i gyd yn faterion yr oeddem yn bryderus iawn yn eu cylch ac yn ymwybodol iawn ohonynt, ac yr wyf yn cytuno, mewn rhai achosion, â'r pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud, a dyna pam yr ydym mor falch bod y Cynulliad wedi gallu clustnodi £3.5 miliwn i ni. Mae'r rhain yn eitemau pwysig i ni ac yr ydym yn falch iawn ei bod yn ymddangos ein bod yn gallu gwneud rhywbeth o bwys am y sefyllfa yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf.

[62] **Mick Bates:** Mae hynny'n iawn, ond mae enghraifft H yn nodi bod un adeilad storio mewn cyflwr mor wael, am ei fod yn gollwng dwr, fel bod aelod o'r staff wedi disgyn drwy'r llawr. Mae'n braf gallu dweud bod gennych £3.5 miliwn yn awr i wneud pethau, ond hoffwn wybod pa gofnodion a data a gedwir, a pha gamau a gymerwyd i fynd i'r afael â materion iechyd a diogelwch o ystyried eich bod wedi cyfaddef yn barod eich bod yn gwybod bod yr amodau storio yn wael ar gyfer eich staff?

**Dr Wiliam:** Credaf fod yr enghraifft benodol honno yn nwylo'r gyfraith, yn llythrennol. Fodd bynnag, yn fwy cyffredinol, mae gennym ymagwedd sy'n seiliedig ar risg o ran popeth wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad Turnbull ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae gennym broses systematig a chadarn iawn, gobeithio, o dynnu sylw at faterion fel hyn. Gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod bellach yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r materion hyn. Mae diogelwch a lles y staff, yn amlwg, yn hollbwysig ac felly yr ydym o ddifrif go iawn ynghylch y materion hyn.

[63] **Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny, ond a yw hynny'n golygu bod gennych ddata da er mwyn i chi allu ei gasglu a rhoi sylw eto i safonau iechyd a diogelwch o ran damweiniau'r staff yn barhaus?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes, we do have formal health and safety committee procedures and accident reporting books, and all that data is retained and kept. We fully comply with normal procedures under the Health and Safety at Work etc Act 1974. Underlying your question is an issue of estate management and such like. I think, certainly since these incidents happened, that we now have a much more rigorous and centralised approach to buildings maintenance and the whole operational area that that involves. However, we cannot deny that there are issues, as I indicated earlier, of investment in the estate that need to be addressed. We would estimate currently that there is something like £1.6 million worth—it is strange how this figure of 1.6 keeps cropping up—of buildings maintenance that we need to carry out over the next 10 or more years; I think that it is actually through to 2016. We would be looking at spending something in the order of £8 million on works in relation to improving the general standard and maintenance of our buildings. I think that, certainly in terms of our organisational priorities for the coming years, we have done a lot of capital development across Wales—at Llanberis, Swansea, Drefach, Big Pit, and so on. However, in some sense there has been a price to pay for that in that the maintenance and standards at St Fagans and Cathays are perhaps not as high as they should be. It comes down to leaking roofs and things like that. Perhaps it is not always as dramatic as this, but there are irritants that affect the environment in which the collections are held. So there are a number of issues in there.

[64] **Mick Bates:** Thank you for that answer. You are admitting more or less then that a site such as St Fagans has been neglected?

**Mr Houlihan:** Oes, mae gennym weithdrefnau ffurfiol ar gyfer y pwyllgor iechyd a diogelwch a llyfrau cofnodi damweiniau, a chedwir yr holl ddata hwnnw. Yr ydym yn cydymffurfio'n llwyr â'r gweithdrefnau arferol dan Ddeddf Iechyd a Diogelwch yn y Gwaith ac ati 1974. Yr hyn sydd wrth wraidd eich cwestiwn yw rheoli'r ystâd a phethau felly. Credaf, yn sicr ers i'r damweiniau hyn ddigwydd, fod gennym ddull llawer mwy cadarn a chanolog o ymdrin â chynnal a chadw adeiladau a'r holl faes gweithredol sy'n ymwneud â hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn wadu nad oes rhai cwestiynau'n ymwneud â buddsoddi yn yr ystâd y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt, fel y soniais yn gynharach. Byddem yn amcangyfrif ar hyn o bryd fod gwerth tuag £1.6 miliwn—mae'n rhyfedd sut y mae'r ffigur o 1.6 yn codi ei ben drwy'r amser—o waith cynnal a chadw adeiladau y mae angen i ni ei gyflawni yn ystod y 10 mlynedd neu fwy nesaf; credaf fod hyn mewn gwirionedd yn ymestyn hyd at 2016. Byddem yn disgwyl gwario tuag £8 miliwn ar waith i wella safon gyffredinol ein hadeiladau a'u cynnal a'u cadw. Credaf, yn sicr o ran blaenoriaethau ein sefydliad ar gyfer y blynyddoedd nesaf, ein bod wedi gwneud llawer o waith datblygu cyfalaf ledled Cymru—yn Llanberis, Abertawe, Dre-fach, y Pwll Mawr, ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, i ryw raddau mae pris i'w dalu am hynny oherwydd efallai nad yw gwaith cynnal a chadw a safonau Sain Ffagan a Cathays mor uchel ag y dylent fod. Yn y bôn mae'n ymwneud â thoeau yn gollwng a phethau felly. Efallai nad yw mor ddramatig â hyn bob tro, ond mae amgylchiadau anffafriol i'w cael sy'n effeithio ar yr amgylchedd lle y cedwir y casgliadau. Felly mae llawer o faterion sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn.

[64] **Mick Bates:** Diolch am eich ateb. Yr ydych yn cyfaddef fwy neu lai felly fod safle fel Sain Ffagan wedi'i esgeuluso?

**Mr Houlihan:** I am not saying that it has been neglected. I think that there are a number of issues in relation to St Fagans. On where we are now, anyone who visits St Fagans will see that we need to replace the signage and that the numbers of people piling through there are causing wear and tear to the site. It is not just a question of free admission—it was happening before that was introduced. We have done a small amount of restructuring within our organisation so that some of the operational aspects, both at St Fagans and at Cathays, are now handled more centrally so that operations are dealt with on a central basis. It is not just a question of the storage of collections at somewhere like St Fagans, but the storage of materials—all the building materials that we use, and so on. Those areas need to be smartened up, and so on, and we need to get in place the sort of systems, procedures and culture that are necessary in order to ensure that, ultimately, the visitor experience is working and that we are operating a safe, clean environment.

[65] **Mick Bates:** Thank you very much. Finally, I would like to hear your reassurance that health and safety matters are really under control.

**Mr Houlihan:** As the key officer responsible for health and safety within the museum, I believe that we now have in place the systems that are necessary to ensure that risk is being assessed and minimised, that action is being taken, that there are suitable responses, and that staff are being made aware that we all have a responsibility for health and safety, so that all of the normal procedures that operate in any other organisation are in place.

[66] **Janet Davies:** Before we go on, Dr Wiliam I will just pick up on one point that you made about having given full access and not hiding anything from the National Audit Office inspection. I am sure that you would wish to say that you recognise that the National Audit Office still has the legal right of access and that there is no way that you would ever consider hiding anything.

**Dr Wiliam:** No, absolutely not.

**Mr Houlihan:** Nid wyf yn dweud ei fod wedi'i esgeuluso. Credaf fod nifer o faterion yn gysylltiedig â Sain Ffagan. O ran ein sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, bydd unrhyw un sy'n ymweld â Sain Ffagan yn gweld bod angen inni osod arwyddion newydd a bod yr holl bobl sy'n tyrru yno yn peri i'r safle dreulio a gwisgo. Mae'n fwy na mater o fynediad am ddim yn unig—yr oedd yn digwydd cyn cyflwyno hynny. Yr ydym wedi gwneud ychydig o waith ailstrwythuro o fewn ein sefydliad er mwyn delio â rhai o'r agweddau gweithredol, yn Sain Fagan a Cathays, yn fwy canolog bellach fel bod gweithredoedd yn cael eu trafod yn ganolog. Nid yw'n ymwneud yn unig â storio casgliadau yn rhywle fel Sain Ffagan, ond storio deunyddiau—yr holl ddeunyddiau adeiladu a ddefnyddir gennym, ac yn y blaen. Mae angen cael trefn ar y meysydd hynny, ac yn y blaen, ac mae angen i ni roi'r math o systemau, gweithdrefnau a diwylliant sydd eu hangen ar waith er mwyn sicrhau, yn y pen draw, fod profiad yr ymwelwyr yn gweithio a'n bod yn gweithredu amgylchedd diogel, glân.

[65] **Mick Bates:** Diolch yn fawr. I gloi, hoffwn eich clywed yn rhoi sicrwydd bod y materion sydd a wnelont ag iechyd a diogelwch dan reolaeth mewn gwirionedd.

**Mr Houlihan:** Fel y swyddog allweddol sy'n gyfrifol am iechyd a diogelwch yn yr amgueddfa, credaf fod y systemau sydd eu hangen ar waith gennym yn awr i sicrhau bod cyn lleied o risg â phosibl a bod y risg yn cael ei hasesu, fod camau'n cael eu cymryd, fod ymatebion addas, a bod y staff yn ymwybodol bod gennym i gyd gyfrifoldeb am iechyd a diogelwch, fel bod yr holl weithdrefnau arferol a weithredir mewn unrhyw sefydliad arall ar waith.

[66] **Janet Davies:** Cyn i ni fynd ymlaen, Dr Wiliam yr wyf am drafod un pwynt a wnaethoch am roi mynediad llawn a pheidio â chuddio dim rhag archwiliad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddech am ddweud eich bod yn cydnabod bod gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yr hawl gyfreithiol o hyd i gael mynediad ac na fyddech byth bythoedd yn ystyried cuddio dim.

**Dr Wiliam:** Na, yn sicr.

[67] **Janet Davies:** Right.

[68] **Jocelyn Davies:** You would not get away with it if you tried.

[69] **Janet Davies:** I just want to have that clear.

**Dr Wiliam:** I think, Chair, that I was trying to make the point that it was in our interest to actively, even proactively, co-operate, and not just be passive and supine.

[70] **Janet Davies:** Right, thank you. I just think that we do need to have that on record.

David, you may have other questions.

[71] **David Melding:** Yes, I think that this batch is still pertinent. We will cover the other material that I was keen to pursue later on.

You hope to solve the storage problems for the next 15 or 20 years. By the time we get to the end of that period, will we be in the sorry situation that we are in today with 40-odd per cent of storage being poor, or is it all in the plan and your thinking that, as the collection grows and inevitably standards change, and so on, you will be able to cope better with that than we have, say, in the previous 20 years, building up to our situation today?

**Mr Houlihan:** I would certainly like to think so. In museums generally, and partly this is a general museum answer, I suppose, standards of storage and care of collections are improving rather than declining. I think that there probably was a period—and not only do museums take a long-term future view, we tend to take a long back view as well—almost from about the 1920s right through to the 1960s, when you could very seriously argue that collection care and management was in decline. I would certainly like to think that, through the sort of management systems, particularly through the planning that museums now go through and the rigorous and robust planning schemes to which they are subjected, we would never go back to that.

[67] **Janet Davies:** Iawn.

[68] **Jocelyn Davies:** Ni fydddech yn gallu gwneud hynny pe baech yn rhoi cynnig arni.

[69] **Janet Davies:** Yr wyf am wneud hynny'n glir.

**Dr Wiliam:** Credaf, Gadeirydd, fy mod yn ceisio gwneud y pwynt ei bod er ein budd ni inni gydweithredu yn frwd, hyd yn oed yn rhagweithiol, yn hytrach na bod yn oddefgar ac yn ddiymadferth.

[70] **Janet Davies:** Iawn, diolch. Credaf fod angen i ni gael hynny ar gofnod.

David, efallai fod gennyh gwestiynau eraill.

[71] **David Melding:** Oes, credaf fod y swp hwn yn berthnasol o hyd. Byddwn yn trafod y deunyddiau eraill yr oeddwn yn awyddus i'w dilyn yn ddiweddarach.

Yr ydych yn gobeithio datrys y problemau storio ar gyfer y 15 i 20 mlynedd nesaf. Erbyn i ni gyrraedd diwedd y cyfnod hwnnw, a fyddwn yn y sefyllfa druenus yr ydym ynnddi heddiw gydag oddeutu 40 y cant o'r storio yn wael, neu a yw i gyd yn y cynllun a'ch bod o'r farn y byddwch, wrth i'r casgliad dyfu ac wrth i safonau newid yn anochel, ac yn y blaen, yn gallu ymdopi'n well â hynny nag yr ydym ni wedi gwneud, dyweder, yn yr 20 mlynedd blaenorol, sydd wedi arwain at ein sefyllfa heddiw?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yn sicr byddwn yn hoffi meddwl hynny. Yn gyffredinol mewn amgueddfeydd, ac ateb sydd a wnelo ag amgueddfeydd yn gyffredinol yw hwn mae'n debyg, mae safonau storio a'r gofalu a roddir i gasgliadau yn gwella yn hytrach na gwaethygu. Credaf fod cyfnod o bosibl—ac nid edrych tua'r dyfodol yn unig y mae amgueddfeydd, yr ydym hefyd yn tueddu i edrych yn ôl ymhell hefyd—bron o tua'r 1920au hyd y 1960au, pryd y gellid dadlau o ddifrif fod gofalu am gasgliadau a'u rheoli yn dirywio. Byddwn yn sicr yn hoffi meddwl, drwy'r math o systemau rheoli, yn arbennig drwy'r cynllunio sy'n digwydd mewn amgueddfeydd yn awr a'r cynlluniau trylwyr a chadarn sy'n cael ei wneud arnynt yn awr, na fyddem byth yn mynd yn ôl i hynny.

Maybe I am being touchingly optimistic here, but I would certainly like to think that standards in storage and collections care will continue to improve and that the problem will be one of ensuring that the objects that are coming in are going into storage facilities of a high standard and so on. That is a very different problem, in some ways, from the one that we have at the moment of how we can get rid of these dreadful storage conditions. So I think that there will be a changing over the next 10 years or so in that, and, hopefully, in the national museums and galleries, sooner than that. I would hope that, over the next 20, 30 or 50 years, the problem will be a slightly different one. There will still be the problem of volume, which will have to be addressed. However, it is a fact of life at museums that, unless it is a closed collection—that is, it was a collection that was given and there is no further development of it—given our charter remit, the collection will continue to grow, and we will just have to work with that particular constraint and find solutions to it that are financially and spatially based, as well as staffing based.

[72] **David Melding:** The other point, which has been partly covered, is your own responsibility to generate some funds. There are a number of ways of doing that but, from my estimate, you would be looking at, I think, generating about £1.5 million, in addition to the £3.5 million that the Assembly will provide. Will that be basically the commercial means that you described earlier, such as the rights to images and other matters, and perhaps some commercial development? To be very direct, many museums that I have been to seem to have a better shopfront area. The national museum has a huge vestibule and its shop is rather tucked away, although I notice that you have extended the space a bit by going the other side of the aisle. However, it is still not terribly easy to get around, and you bump into people all the time. You do not have a computerised system where you can check all the paintings that are held there, or are maybe held elsewhere, to which you have the rights to print off and generate money. Are these issues that you will get a bit more enterprising about?

Efallai fy mod fymryn yn optimistaidd yma, ond byddwn yn sicr yn hoffi meddwl y bydd safonau storio a gofalu am gasgliadau yn parhau i wella ac mai'r broblem fydd sicrhau bod y gwrthrychau sy'n dod i mewn yn mynd i gyfleusterau storio o safon uchel ac yn y blaen. Mae honno'n broblem wahanol iawn, i ryw raddau, i'r un sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd o ran sut y gallwn gael gwared ar yr amodau storio gwarthus hyn. Felly credaf y bydd newid dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf yn hynny o beth a, gobeithio, yn yr amgueddfeydd a'r orielau cenedlaethol, cyn hynny. Gobeithio, yn ystod yr 20, 30 neu 50 mlynedd nesaf, y bydd y broblem yn un ychydig yn wahanol. Bydd problem o ran maint o hyd, a bydd yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mewn amgueddfeydd bydd y casgliad, oni bai ei fod yn gasgliad caeedig—hynny yw, yr oedd yn gasgliad a roddwyd ac ni ellir ei ddatblygu ymhellach—o gofio ein cylch gwaith siarter, yn sicr o barhau i dyfu, a bydd yn rhaid i ni weithio gyda'r cyfyngiadau penodol hynny i ddod o hyd i atebion i hynny ar sail ariannol a gofodol, yn ogystal ag ar sail staffio.

[72] **David Melding:** Y pwynt arall, sydd wedi'i drafod yn rhannol, yw eich cyfrifoldeb chi eich hun i gynhyrchu rhywfaint o gyllid. Mae sawl ffordd o wneud hynny ond, yn ôl fy amcangyfrif i, credaf y byddech yn disgwyl cynhyrchu oddeutu £1.5 miliwn, yn ogystal â'r £3.5 miliwn y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei roi. Ai'r dull masnachol y bu i chi ei ddisgrifio'n gynharach fydd hynny yn sylfaenol, megis yr hawliau i ddelweddau a materion eraill, ac efallai rhywfaint o ddatblygiadau masnachol? A bod yn blwmp ac yn blaen, ymddengys fod gan lawer o'r amgueddfeydd yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy well blaen siop. Mae gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol gyntedd enfawr ond mae ei siop o'r neilltu braidd, er fy mod yn sylwi eich bod wedi ehangu'r lle ychydig drwy fynd yr ochr arall i'r eil. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n hawdd iawn mynd o gwmpas o hyd, ac yr ydych yn taro'n erbyn pobl drwy'r amser. Nid oes gennych system gyfrifiadurol lle yr ydych yn gallu archwilio'r holl luniau sydd yno, neu sydd yn rhywle arall o bosibl, y mae gennych yr hawliau i'w hargraffu a chodi arian. A yw'r materion hyn yn rhai y byddwch yn mynd fymryn yn fwy mentrus yn eu cylch?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that we would recognise that we have quite a way to go. For example, if you look at the Comptroller and Auditor General's reports into the national museums in England, the Department for Culture, Media and Sport museums, they are being quite successful in terms of the income that they generate and such like. However, in the past few years, the museum has begun to address this, and it is partly structural. The museum has now established a separate trading company with its own board of non-executive directors and its own three-year business plan. That is taking on board the issues, and it will be income focused. The targets will be in relation to increasing income. It will also, and is already, looking at a whole variety of areas, such as increasing the spend per visitor head and so on. We can demonstrate that that has gone up somewhat from, I think, around 70p around three years ago to around 97p now. That does not sound much, but it is going in the right direction.

It will also look at potential areas, which were also highlighted in the Comptroller and Auditor General's reports for museums in England. There are areas of new development—I have already mentioned image leasing. Corporate hire is an area where I think that we could do better, particularly at Cathays and at the Museum of Welsh Life, where there are many opportunities for doing that. So there are a number of such areas, plus fundraising, and so on. The trading company is bringing these areas within its remit—it will have clear targets and responsibilities to our council to develop those sorts of areas. It will not, to some extent, be trammelled by some of the arguments that you get in museums such as, 'We'd like to produce a catalogue of that exhibition on Slovenian beehive paintings', and the people on commerce saying, 'But it's not going to sell', and the curator saying, 'But we've got to have it'. It will not be getting into those sorts of arguments, we hope. It will have a very clear commercial basis for going forward. So we are driving that area. In recent years, a fundraising department, the department of development, has been established, and it is already generating £1 million of additional income per year,

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf y byddem yn cydnabod bod gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd. Er enghraifft, os ydych yn edrych ar adroddiadau'r Rheolwr a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol yn Lloegr, amgueddfeydd yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, maent yn eithaf llwyddiannus o ran yr incwm y maent yn ei gynhyrchu a phethau felly. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r amgueddfa wedi dechrau mynd i'r afael â hyn, ac mae'n strwythurol yn rhannol. Mae'r amgueddfa yn awr wedi sefydlu cwmni masnachu ar wahân gyda'i fwrdd ei hun o gyfarwyddwyr anweithredol a'i gynllun busnes tair blynedd ei hun. Mae hynny'n rhoi sylw i'r problemau, a bydd yn canolbwyntio ar incwm. Bydd y targedau'n ymwneud â chynyddu'r incwm. Bydd yn edrych hefyd, ac mae'n gwneud yn barod, ar bob math o feysydd, fel cynyddu gwariant fesul ymwelydd ac ati. Gallwn ddangos bod hynny wedi cynyddu rhywfaint o oddeutu 70c tua thair blynedd yn ôl, fe gredaf, i oddeutu 97c yn awr. Nid yw hynny'n swnio'n llawer, ond mae'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn.

Bydd hefyd yn edrych ar feysydd posibl, a amlygwyd hefyd yn adroddiadau'r Rheolwr a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol ar amgueddfeydd yn Lloegr. Mae meysydd datblygu newydd—yr wyf wedi crybwyll prydlesu delwedd eisoes. Mae hurio corfforaethol yn faes y credaf y byddem yn gallu gwneud yn well ynddo, yn arbennig yn Cathays ac Amgueddfa Werin Cymru, lle y mae sawl cyfle i wneud hynny. Felly mae nifer o feysydd o'r fath, ynghyd â chodi arian, ac yn y blaen. Mae'r cwmni masnachu yn cwmpasu'r meysydd hyn o fewn ei gylch gwaith—bydd ganddo dargedau clir a chyfrifoldebau i'n cyngor i ddatblygu y mathau hynny o feysydd. Ni fydd, i ryw raddau, yn cael ei lyffetheirio gan rai o'r dadleuon sy'n digwydd mewn amgueddfeydd fel, 'Yr ydym am gynhyrchu catalog o'r arddangosfa honno ar luniau cychod gwenyn o Slofenia', a'r swyddogion masnach yn dweud, 'Ond ni fydd yn gwerthu', a'r curadur yn dweud, 'Ond mae'n rhaid i ni ei gael'. Ni fydd yn ymhel â'r mathau hynny o ddadleuon, gobeithio. Bydd ganddo sail fasnachol glir iawn ar gyfer symud ymlaen. Felly yr ydym yn symud i'r maes hwnnw. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae adran codi arian, yr adran ddatblygu, wedi'i sefydlu, ac mae'n

which is usually targeted at specific projects.

So that is coming in from trusts and such like, and, to some extent, from corporate-type sponsors as well. We will be looking for ways of developing that. There is more that can be done there as well. So, there are a number of areas where I think that we can move this on. Obviously the pressure will be how we use that money, and we will be back into these arguments about documentation versus public access—these sorts of arguments. However, obviously, the more money that we can generate the better.

[73] **Christine Gwyther:** Both my neighbour, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, and I like the sound of Slovenian beehive paintings. We would be quite interested in that.

I would like, if I may, to come back to a couple of points on which we have already touched very briefly and home in on them. The first is that you talked in your preamble—and this is also in the Auditor General's report—about the move from remedial conservation to less interventionist methods, and I think that we can see the virtue in that, certainly as far as long-term revenue implications are concerned. However, can you reassure us on the direct impact that that will have on the condition of the items that we are talking about?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that there are quite a number of proven cases out there, external to the national museums and galleries, where this has been shown to work as a long-term strategy. For example, within the Science Museum, they have a dedicated conservator, whose only job is to work on the whole preventative, conservation side, and, indeed, within our own organisation, our head of conservation works very much, and was really brought in to work, on that side as opposed to on the remedial side. His brief is in relation to all of our sites, as opposed to the conservators on the remedial side, who work within departmental collections.

cynhyrchu £1 miliwn o incwm ychwanegol eisoes bob blwyddyn, sy'n cael ei dargedu ar brosiectau penodol fel arfer.

Felly mae hynny'n dod i mewn gan ymddiriedolaethau ac yn y blaen, ac, i ryw raddau, gan noddwyr corfforaethol hefyd. Byddwn yn chwilio am ddulliau o ddatblygu hynny. Gellir gwneud mwy gyda hyn hefyd. Felly, mae nifer o feysydd lle y gallwn ddatblygu hyn. Mae'n amlwg y bydd cryn bwysau o ran sut y byddwn yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw, a byddwn yn dod yn ôl at y dadleuon hyn ynglyn â dogfennau yn erbyn mynediad cyhoeddus—y mathau hyn o ddadleuon. Fodd bynnag, yn amlwg, gorau oll po fwyaf o arian y gallwn ei gynhyrchu.

[73] **Christine Gwyther:** Mae fy nghymydog, Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, a minnau yn hoffi'r syniad o luniau o gychod gwenyn o Slofenia. Byddai gennym dipyn o ddiddordeb yn hynny.

Hoffwn, os caf, ddod yn ôl at rai pwyntiau yr ydym eisoes wedi sôn amdanynt yn fyr a'u trafod yn fanylach. Y cyntaf yw ichi siarad yn eich rhagarweiniad—ac mae hyn yn adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol hefyd—am y newid o gadwraeth adferol i ddulliau llai ymyraethol, a chredaf y gallwn weld budd hynny, yn sicr cyn belled ag y mae goblygiadau refeniw hirdymor yn y cwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, a allwch roi sicrwydd i ni am yr effaith uniongyrchol y bydd hynny yn ei chael ar gyflwr yr eitemau yr ydym yn sôn amdanynt?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod nifer o achosion profedig, y tu allan i'r amgueddfeydd a'r orielau cenedlaethol, lle y mae hyn yn amlwg wedi gweithio fel strategaeth hirdymor. Er enghraifft, yn yr Amgueddfa Wyddoniaeth, mae ganddynt swyddog cadwraeth ymroddedig, a'i unig swydd yw gweithio ar yr elfen sy'n ymwneud â chadwraeth ataliol, ac, yn wir, yn ein sefydliad ni, mae ein pennaeth cadwraeth yn gweithio i raddau helaeth, a phenodwyd ef i weithio mewn gwirionedd, ar yr agwedd honno yn hytrach na'r agwedd adferol. Mae ei frîff yn cynnwys ein holl safleoedd, yn wahanol i'r swyddogion cadwraeth ar yr agwedd adferol, sy'n gweithio o fewn casgliadau adrannol.



There are quite a number of other areas. The University of London has a department that, for example, develops thinking on best practice in this whole area. There is a school of building, which, again, is another part of the University of London, which also deals with this holistic approach to the environment. So, I think that there is a building amount of information and data out there that would give the sort of assurance that, I think, you are really seeking on this. It is certainly a lot of resource commitment by a number of the larger nationals that are going into these areas as a hedge against the long-term issue and potential savings. However, one should not underestimate the ongoing need for remedial conservation. Quite often, the sort of objects that are coming back from fieldwork need immediate attention, particularly when you are dealing with natural history collections and such like, and when you are dealing with highly fugitive objects, and so on. So, those sorts of collections do need immediate interventions—there is no doubt about that. Quite often, when we are dealing with loans and, say, our partnership programme, those are significant drivers—as are exhibitions—of the need for remedial conservation and bringing the objects up to the standard for display. If you like, the strategy is preventative, but there is still a need for that tactical intervention as well.

[74] **Christine Gwyther:** I am interested in what you just said, because, surely your motivation should not just be populist; it should not be just on those items that people are keen to see that you carry out the remedial intervention. How do you balance the need of the population to view these things with the need to keep them in good condition?

Mae nifer o feysydd eraill. Mae gan Brifysgol Llundain adran sydd, er enghraifft, yn datblygu syniadau am yr arferion gorau yn y maes hwn yn gyffredinol. Mae ysgol adeiladu, sydd, eto, yn rhan arall o Brifysgol Llundain, sydd hefyd yn ymdrin â'r agwedd gyfannol hon at yr amgylchedd. Felly, credaf fod swm cynyddol o wybodaeth a data a fyddai'n rhoi'r math o sicrwydd yr ydych, yn fy marn i, yn chwilio amdano mewn gwirionedd mewn perthynas â hyn. Yn sicr, mae llawer o adnoddau'n cael ei roi gan nifer o'r sefydliadau cenedlaethol mwyaf sy'n ymwneud â'r meysydd hyn fel amddiffyniad yn erbyn y broblem hirdymor ac arbedion posibl. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai neb ddibrisio'r angen parhaus am gadwraeth adferol. Yn aml iawn, mae angen rhoi sylw ar unwaith i wrthrychau sy'n cael eu canfod yn ystod gwaith maes, yn enwedig pan ydych yn ymdrin â chasgliadau byd natur a phethau felly, a phan ydych yn delio â gwrthrychau prin iawn, ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae angen ymyriadau ar unwaith ar y mathau hynny o gasgliadau—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Yn aml iawn, pan ydym yn ymdrin â benthyciadau ac, er enghraifft, ein rhaglen bartneriaeth, mae'r rheini yn ffactorau pwysig—fel y mae arddangosfeydd—sy'n creu'r angen am gadwraeth adferol a sicrhau bod y gwrthrychau yn ddigon da i'w harddangos. Os mynnwch chi, mae'r strategaeth yn ataliol, ond mae angen yr ymyrraeth dactegol honno o hyd hefyd.

[74] **Christine Gwyther:** Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, oherwydd, siawns na ddylech chi ddim cael eich ysgogi gan boblyddiaeth yn unig; nid dim ond yn achos yr eitemau hynny y mae pobl yn awyddus i'w gweld y dylech gynnal ymyriad adferol. Sut yr ydych yn cydbwysu angen y boblogaeth i weld y pethau hyn â'r angen i'w cadw mewn cyflwr da?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that this goes back to something that I mentioned earlier, which we will look at, which is conducting a survey of the condition of the objects in the collections. Again, this is a practice that is used in a number of museums to identify those objects that are in tip-top, perfect condition, which you do not need to worry about, those objects that might be in need of some sort of intervention, but could await the exhibition or whatever, and those objects that are in urgent need of attention. By doing that, we will identify precisely the category to which you refer: those objects to which we must attend. The other advantage of that sort of approach, I think, is that it also enables us to identify those objects that have gone beyond interpretation and could be brought back, then, for potential disposal. So, those two issues of disposal and the condition survey do go hand in hand.

[75] **Christine Gwyther:** This has been touched on quite a lot, so I will be very brief: on the 20-year backlog that you have accrued, I have to ask you why you think that the actions that have been taken to date have not succeeded in breaking that backlog down. It might be that it was before your time, but, from your experience in the job, can you tell us why previous attempts have failed?

**Mr Houlihan:** Well, I think that what we were probably dealing with previously was a 50-year backlog, in a sense. It is now down to 20 years. I think that, as the report recognises, progress is being made, and a lot of the statistics in the report do support that. However, when you look forward to see what still needs to be done, 20 years sounds like a long time. It is a long time; there is no doubt about that. However, again, I would just caution a little bit about that, and ask, 'Do we have to put every single object in the collection onto a computer? Is that really the priority for the organisation?'. That is why I think that at this time, with this report sitting there, we need to review that to get our priorities absolutely straight, to address these issues of disposal, collections, surveys, and all that sort of thing, and bring those elements together and let us see then where we need to go. We might come back in five years' time and say that there is actually a 10-year backlog on documentation. However, I would hope that we could argue that it is

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod hyn yn mynd yn ôl at rywbeth y soniais amdano yn gynharach, y byddwn yn ei ystyried, sef cynnal arolwg o gyflwr y gwrthrychau yn y casgliadau. Eto, mae hyn yn arfer a ddefnyddir mewn nifer o amgueddfeydd i ganfod y gwrthrychau hynny sydd mewn cyflwr perffaith, penigamp, nad oes rhaid i chi boeni amdanynt, y gwrthrychau hynny sydd angen rhyw fath o ymyriad o bosibl, ond a allai ddisgwyl tan yr arddangosfa neu rywbeth felly, a'r gwrthrychau hynny sydd angen sylw brys. Drwy wneud hynny, byddwn yn nodi'n union y categori y cyfeiriwch ato: y gwrthrychau hynny y mae'n rhaid i ni roi sylw iddynt. Mantais arall y math hwnnw o ddull, yn fy marn i, yw ei fod yn ein galluogi i ganfod y gwrthrychau hynny sydd wedi mynd y tu hwnt i gael eu dehongli ac y gellid dod â hwy'n ôl, wedyn, i'w gwaredu o bosibl. Felly, mae'r ddau fater hynny, gwaredu a'r arolwg cyflwr yn mynd law yn llaw.

[75] **Christine Gwyther:** Mae cryn drafod wedi bod ar hyn, felly byddaf yn fyr iawn: o ran yr 20 mlynedd o ôl-groniad sydd gennych erbyn hyn, rhaid i mi ofyn pam, yn eich barn chi, nad yw'r camau sydd wedi eu cymryd hyd yn hyn wedi llwyddo i leihau'r ôl-groniad hwnnw. Mae'n bosibl bod hynny cyn eich cyfnod chi, ond, ar sail eich profiad yn y swydd, a allwch ddweud wrthym pam y methodd yr ymdrechion blaenorol?

**Mr Houlihan:** Wel, credaf mai'r hyn yr oeddem yn mynd i'r afael ag ef yn flaenorol yn ôl pob tebyg oedd ôl-groniad 50 mlynedd, ar ryw ystyr. Mae hwnnw bellach wedi ei leihau i 20 mlynedd. Credaf, fel y mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod, fod cynnydd yn cael ei wneud, ac mae llawer o'r ystadegau yn yr adroddiad yn cefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, pan edrychwch i'r dyfodol i weld beth sydd angen ei wneud o hyd, mae 20 mlynedd yn swnio'n amser hir. Mae'n amser hir; nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Fodd bynnag, eto, byddwn yn pwylllo ychydig ynghylch hynny, ac yn gofyn, 'A oes rhaid i ni roi pob gwrthrych yn y casgliad ar gyfrifiadur? Ai dyna yw blaenoriaeth y sefydliad mewn gwirionedd?'. Dyna pam yr wyf o'r farn bod angen i ni yn awr, yn sgîl yr adroddiad hwn, adolygu hynny i benderfynu beth yn union yw ein blaenoriaethau, mynd i'r afael â'r cwestiynau hyn sy'n ymwneud â gwaredu, casgliadau, arolygon, a phethau felly, a dwyn yr elfennau hynny ynghyd a gweld wedyn beth sydd angen i ni ei wneud. Mae'n bosibl y

low-risk, low-use areas that we are dealing with and that we are increasing access to the collections, or the use of the collections, I think.

[76] **Christine Gwyther:** Finally, on your Nantgarw aspirations, you are talking about more space to operate a fuller loans programme, which ticks some of the public access boxes, which is very useful. However, if funding for a full conservation and analytical service in Nantgarw is not forthcoming, what is plan B? Do you have a backup?

**Mr Houlihan:** Essentially, it is the Nantgarw project. Sorry for the pause; I just needed to double-check that with Dr Wiliam.

[77] **Christine Gwyther:** It is Nantgarw or bust.

**Mr Houlihan:** That is right—well, it is Nantgarw and other places as well. The central approach to the conservation issue is very much built around the whole approach to preventative conservation. It is Nantgarw, and it is estate management as well. So there is a combination of issues in there. I would be confident that the £3.5 million, and the other money that we can raise, will go a huge way to addressing many of these issues. Some of the tweaks that we have started to put on the planning for this, for example looking at ways in which we can perhaps make some of the collections more accessible at, say, St Fagans, will bring the costs down for this sort of project and bring down the timescale for achieving it, I hope.

[78] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, do you have a question?

[79] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** I have to leave now, Chair. I do apologise.

[80] **Janet Davies:** Okay, thank you. Denise, then.

deuwn yn ôl mewn pum mlynedd a dweud bod ôl-groniad o 10 mlynedd yn wir o ran y dogfennau. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem ddadlau mai meysydd defnydd isel a risg isel yr ydym yn delio â hwy a'n bod yn cynyddu mynediad at y casgliadau, neu ddefnydd o'r casgliadau, yn fy nhyb i.

[76] **Christine Gwyther:** Yn olaf, o ran eich dyheadau ynghylch Nantgarw, yr ydych yn sôn am ragor o le i weithredu rhaglen lawnach o fenthyciadau, sy'n golygu tic yn rhai o'r bocsys sy'n ymwneud â mynediad i'r cyhoedd, sy'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Fodd bynnag, os na allwch gael cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaeth cadwraeth a dadansoddi llawn yn Nantgarw, beth yw cynllun B? A oes gennych gynllun wrth gefn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Prosiect Nantgarw ydyw yn y bôn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am y saib; yr oedd angen i mi gadarnhau hynny gyda Dr Wiliam.

[77] **Christine Gwyther:** Nantgarw neu ddim yw hi.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae hynny'n gywir—wel, Nantgarw a lleoedd eraill hefyd. Mae'r agwedd ganolog at gwestiwn cadwraeth yn seiliedig i raddau helaeth ar yr agwedd at gadwraeth ataliol yn ei chyfanrwydd. Nantgarw ydyw, a rheoli'r ystâd hefyd. Felly mae cyfuniad o faterion. Byddwn yn hyderus y bydd y £3.5 miliwn, a'r arian arall y gallwn ei godi, yn cyfrannu llawer at y gwaith o fynd i'r afael â nifer o'r materion hyn. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd rhai o'r addasiadau yr ydym wedi dechrau eu gwneud i'r gwaith cynllunio ar gyfer hyn, er enghraifft edrych ar y ffyrdd y gallwn wneud rhai o'r casgliadau yn fwy hygyrch efallai yn Sain Ffagan, er enghraifft, yn lleihau costau'r math hwn o brosiect ac yn cwtogi'r amserlen ar gyfer ei gyflawni.

[78] **Janet Davies:** Tamsin, a oes gennych gwestiwn?

[79] **Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yr wyf yn gorfod gadael yn awr, Gadeirydd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

[80] **Janet Davies:** O'r gorau, diolch. Denise, felly.

[81] **Denise Idris Jones:** If we look at page 25 of the report, paragraph 4.3 notes that only 1 per cent of the collection is physically on display, and paragraph 4.4 goes on to say why. For example, many fossils are very similar, so there is a question as to whether there would be any point in displaying all of them.

However, what in your view is the main reason as to why only 1 per cent is on display at the museum?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that it can be a number of issues, and I have to partly draw on experience elsewhere as well. It can be an issue in relation to space—that is the obvious answer, I know. It can be an issue in relation to that. Perhaps more interestingly, and from a complex point of view, it could be the way in which we display them, and there are different ways in which you can display objects. For example, if you went to, say, the Pitt Rivers Museum at Oxford, which has remained totally unchanged, virtually, since it was created by General Pitt Rivers, you will see thousands and thousands of objects crammed into more or less a single space, be it galleried, which is one approach to display. You can go to the Guggenheim Museum in New York and walk into a gallery and see one painting on the wall. However, interestingly, no-one complains about that, saying, ‘we came here to see 20,000 paintings on the wall’, because the nature of the display experience is completely different in each case. So, there are quite a number of factors in there.

Again, I think that this is an interesting example of how perhaps sometimes statistics cannot tell the whole story, if you like, in terms of aspects of the visitor experience. From my point of view, I do not get too hung up about this. The issue, essentially, is about the use of collections, and you can ameliorate these situations by rotating collections through travelling exhibitions and partnership programmes. The list is there, to a certain extent, elsewhere in the document. So, you can address that. It is an issue faced by museums. The Museums Association is currently doing a piece of work, in which I am involved, on looking at the use of collections in museums over the next 25 years and how that might change. A lot of it will be about taking collections out of museum space and making them accessible in that way. Obviously,

[81] **Denise Idris Jones:** Os edrychwn ar dudalen 25 yn yr adroddiad, mae paragraff 4.3 yn nodi mai dim ond 1 y cant o'r casgliad sy'n cael ei arddangos, ac mae paragraff 4.4 yn mynd ymlaen i egluro pam. Er enghraifft, mae llawer o ffosilau yn debyg iawn, felly mae amheuaeth a fyddai unrhyw ddiben eu harddangos i gyd. Fodd bynnag, beth yn eich barn chi yw'r prif reswm pam mai dim ond 1 y cant sy'n cael ei arddangos yn yr amgueddfa?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod amryw o bethau efallai, ac mae'n rhaid i mi ddefnyddio rhywfaint o brofiad mewn mannau eraill hefyd. Gall fod a wnelo â lle—gwn mai dyna'r ateb amlwg. Gall fod a wnelo â hynny. Yn fwy diddorol o bosibl, ac o safbwynt cymhleth, mae'n bosibl mai'r modd yr ydym yn eu harddangos ydyw, a gallwch arddangos gwrthrychau mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Er enghraifft, pe baech yn mynd i Amgueddfa Pitt Rivers yn Rhydychen, dyweder, sydd heb newid o gwbl, i bob pwrpas, ers cael ei chreu gan y Cadfridog Pitt Rivers, byddech yn gweld miloedd ar filoedd o wrthrychau wedi eu gwthio i mewn i un gofod fwy neu lai, sydd ar ffurf oriel, dyna un dull o arddangos. Gallwch fynd i Amgueddfa Guggenheim yn Efrog Newydd a cherdded i mewn i oriel a gweld un llun ar y wal. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiddorol, nid oes neb yn cwyno am hynny, gan ddweud, ‘daethom yma i weld 20,000 o luniau ar y wal’, oherwydd mae natur y profiad arddangos yn wahanol ym mhob achos. Felly, mae'n ymwneud â nifer o ffactorau.

Eto, credaf fod hyn yn enghraifft ddiddorol o sut nad yw ystadegau efallai yn gallu rhoi'r darlun cyfan, os mynnwch chi, o ran agweddau ar brofiad ymwelwyr. O'm safbwynt i, nid yw hyn yn fy mhoeni'n ormodol. Mae a wnelo hyn, yn y bôn, â'r defnydd o gasgliadau, a gallwch wella'r sefyllfa hon drwy gylchdroi casgliadau drwy arddangosfeydd teithiol a rhaglenni partneriaeth. Mae'r rhestr yno, i raddau helaeth, yn rhywle arall yn y ddogfen. Felly, gallwch fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae'n fater sy'n wynebu amgueddfeydd. Mae Cymdeithas yr Amgueddfeydd wrthi'n gwneud gwaith ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf innau'n rhan ohono, sy'n ystyried y defnydd o gasgliadau mewn amgueddfeydd dros y 25 mlynedd nesaf a sut y gallai hynny newid. Bydd llawer ohono'n ymwneud â symud casgliadau o ofod amgueddfeydd a'u gwneud yn hygyrch yn y dull

everyone is doing a finger in the air bit at the moment about technology and where that might take you.

There are issues there, because I think the museum is essentially about a real experience with real objects. However, technology has a lot to offer in that respect. So, I think that we will be challenged to see how we use our collections.

On some of the things that we are doing, we will make some big hits with Big Pit, Dre-fach and Swansea coming on-stream, and we will increase the number of objects on display anyway. So, that percentage will improve. However, I have to say that I am not greatly exercised about that. The fundamental issue for me is one of engagement with the public. A lot has been made in recent years of access, which is essentially a quantitative argument. How many objects are in front of me when I visit a museum is not important. What is important is the experience that I have when I visit a museum. It is how I am engaged by those objects and the people who work in that museum and what I take away with me that will help me in relation to society at large. That is the museum experience. Certainly, if we are addressing issues of social inclusion and so on, all the survey work that we are doing, and the experience of other museums, indicates quite dramatically that in order to engage with socially excluded groups, you must deal with smaller batches of objects and smaller numbers of people. Certainly, those museums that have been very successful on social inclusion issues, whether in Leicester, south London or wherever, have actually seen a decrease in their numbers of visitors. However, they have seen a higher level of engagement and their reputation has grown within the community. So, a whole series of very complex and very interesting arguments are buried in that 1 per cent.

[82] **Denise Idris Jones:** I was interested to hear that you were going to rotate your collections. I hope that you will be taking them to north Wales.

hwnnw. Yn amlwg, mae pawb â'i fys yn yr awyr ar hyn o bryd o ran technoleg a'i goblygiadau. Mae rhai cwestiynau ynghylch hynny, oherwydd credaf mai profiad gwirioneddol gyda gwrthrychau gwirioneddol yw'r amgueddfa yn ei hanfod. Fodd bynnag, mae gan dechnoleg lawer i'w gynnig yn hynny o beth. Felly, credaf y bydd yn her i ni weld sut yr ydym yn defnyddio ein casgliadau.

O ran rhai o'r pethau yr ydym yn eu gwneud, byddwn yn cymryd camau pwysig wrth i'r Pwll Mawr, Dre-fach ac Abertawe ymuno â ni, a byddwn yn cynyddu nifer y gwrthrychau sy'n cael eu harddangos beth bynnag. Felly, bydd y ganran honno yn cynyddu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i mi ddweud nad yw hynny yn poeni rhyw lawer arnaf. Ymwneud â'r cyhoedd yw'r mater pwysicaf i mi. Mae llawer o sylw wedi ei roi i fynediad yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, dadl sydd a wnelo â maint yn y bôn. Nid yw'n bwysig sawl gwrthrych sydd o'm blaen pan wyf yn ymweld ag amgueddfa. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r profiad a gaf wrth imi ymweld ag amgueddfa. Mae'n ymwneud â sut y mae'r gwrthrychau hynny a'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn yr amgueddfa honno yn creu argraff arnaf a beth yr wyf yn ei gael a fydd o gymorth i mi mewn perthynas â chymdeithas yn gyffredinol. Dyna'r profiad o fod mewn amgueddfa. Yn sicr, os ydym yn trafod materion sy'n ymwneud â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac yn y blaen, mae'r holl waith arolygu yr ydym yn ei gwneud, a phrofiad amgueddfeydd eraill, yn dangos yn eithaf dramatig fod yn rhaid i chi ddelio â chasgliadau llai o wrthrychau a niferoedd llai o bobl er mwyn ichi allu ymgysylltu â grwpiau sydd wedi eu hallgáu o gymdeithas. Yn bendant, mae'r amgueddfeydd hynny sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn o ran materion cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, boed yng Nghaerlyr, de Llundain neu ble bynnag y bo, wedi gweld nifer eu hymwelwyr yn gostwng a dweud y gwir. Fodd bynnag, maent wedi gweld lefel uwch o ymgysylltu ac mae mwy o fri arnynt yn y gymuned. Felly, mae'r 1 y cant hwnnw yn cynnwys cyfres gyfan o ddadleuon cymhleth iawn a diddorol iawn.

[82] **Denise Idris Jones:** Yr oedd o ddiddordeb i mi glywed eich bod yn mynd i gylchdroi eich casgliadau. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn mynd â hwy i ogledd Cymru.

**Mr Houlihan:** Certainly under the partnership programme we will be. We already have done so, in fact, in Ynys Môn and Wrexham.

[83] **Denise Idris Jones:** We also have Nant Clwyd House in Ruthin, which we are keen to furnish and which we are looking at very keenly in north Wales. Paragraph 4.8 says that museums aim to extend the amount of attractions available electronically. In order to extend the amount of the collection available electronically, you will need additional resources. So, how do you balance the need for resources against the backlog, which you have already spoken about, in documentation and conservation?

**Mr Houlihan:** Again, I think that that comes back to some of the things that I was indicating a little earlier that we may have to consider. If we do not document the entire collection, we can begin, and have already begun, to move resources into the digitisation area, both in terms of staffing and capital equipment. So, that will obviously then enable us to get more of the collection out onto the web and so on. However, I think that we have to take a fairly hard-nosed approach to it. Some museums have just sort of chucked their collection out on their websites, and there are indications now that, not only is it expensive in terms of the maintenance and upkeep of the site, but quite often people do not use them.

[84] **Denise Idris Jones:** They are used in schools, I think.

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that that might be a different route, through some of the wider websites that have been created at a national level for precisely that sort of thing. The Victoria and Albert Museum has been quite successful in terms of e-learning and getting things out there. That probably is, to a certain degree, the future. However, again, I think that you will probably find that it is highly targeted; it is not putting masses of objects out there, which really quite often only works for the specialist. Quite often it is about putting smaller groups, almost like virtual exhibitions, out there that tell a very specific story that can be related to the curriculum. Some of the material that is now being produced, for example, in relation to the first world war, is quite interesting in that respect in

**Mr Houlihan:** Byddwn, yn sicr, fel rhan o'r rhaglen bartneriaeth. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, a dweud y gwir, yn Ynys Môn a Wrecsam.

[83] **Denise Idris Jones:** Mae gennym hefyd Dy Nant Clwyd yn Rhuthun, yr ydym yn awyddus iawn i'w ddodrefnu ac yr ydym yn edrych arno o ddifrif yn y Gogledd. Dywed paragraff 4.8 fod amgueddfeydd yn ceisio ehangu faint o atyniadau sydd ar gael yn electronig. Bydd angen adnoddau ychwanegol arnoch i ehangu faint o'r casgliad sydd ar gael yn electronig. Felly, sut yr ydych yn cydbwyso'r angen am adnoddau â'r ôl-groniad, yr ydych eisoes wedi siarad amdano, mewn dogfennaeth a chadwraeth?

**Mr Houlihan:** Eto, credaf fod hynny'n dod yn ôl at rai o'r pethau yr oeddwn yn eu dweud ychydig yn gynharach y bydd yn rhaid i ni eu hystyried o bosibl. Os nad ydym yn dogfennu'r casgliad cyfan, gallwn ddechrau, ac yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau, symud adnoddau i'r maes digido, a hynny o ran staff ac offer cyfalaf. Felly, bydd hynny'n amlwg yn ein galluogi i roi mwy o'r casgliad ar y we ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod yn rhaid i ni fabwysiadu agwedd eithaf pen-galed ato. Mae rhai amgueddfeydd wedi rhoi eu casgliad ar eu gwefannau rywsut rywsut, ac mae arwyddion bellach bod hyn nid yn unig yn ddrud o ran cynnal a chadw'r wefan, ond, yn aml iawn, nid yw pobl yn eu defnyddio.

[84] **Denise Idris Jones:** Credaf y cânt eu defnyddio mewn ysgolion.

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod hynny yn mynd ar drywydd gwahanol o bosibl, drwy rai o'r gwefannau ehangach sydd wedi eu creu yn genedlaethol ar gyfer y math hwnnw o beth yn union. Mae Amgueddfa Fictoria ac Albert wedi bod yn eithaf llwyddiannus o ran e-ddysgu a chyflwyno pethau ar ei safle we. Dyna'r dyfodol, i ryw raddau, yn ôl pob tebyg. Fodd bynnag, eto, credaf y byddech, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn canfod ei fod wedi ei dargedu i raddau helaeth; nid yw'n cyflwyno lluo o wrthrychau, sydd, yn aml iawn, ond yn apelio i'r arbenigwr. Yn aml iawn, mae'n ymwneud â dangos grwpiau llai, fel arddangosfeydd rhithwir bron, sy'n adrodd stori benodol iawn y gellir ei chysylltu â'r cwricwlwm. Mae peth o'r deunydd sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu ar hyn o bryd, er enghraifft, mewn

that it brings together not only objects, but images, film and all those sorts of things. However, it is very specifically linked to the curriculum need.

[85] **Denise Idris Jones:** I look forward to that, as a former teacher.

I now go on to paragraph 4.9, where we look at your hours of opening. I think that most museums close at 5 p.m., but I was at the national gallery in Dublin last week, which was open until 8 p.m.. I was able to view some of the wonderful paintings there. Are you looking into this?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yes, we are. This year, in terms of our visitor research, we are undertaking a slight shift. There is a two-step element to this. Currently, what we have done is undertake visitor research with a view to establishing visitor numbers, where they come from, age, sex—all that sort of thing—that is, social grouping. Essentially, that is marketing information, which is very important. We are still doing some of that this year, but we are moving across to audience research, which is visitor profiling, getting a better sense of why people come to the museums, what they expect, what their perceptions are, and what sort of things they would like to see. So, it is a slightly more—it is not quite consultative; I think that it would be wrong to say that. It is getting a view of our visitor profile, because what we think that that will reveal, quite possibly, is that we are not representing or reaching certain groups within society. We know that to a certain extent: we know that we are not representing some of them, and there are certain groups that we are not reaching as well. So, we need to establish the reasons for that. The burden of Beaufort Research Ltd—the company that handles it—will be getting that profile right. Then, next year, in 2005-06, we will do quite serious testing of the advantages, disadvantages and public views on whether we should keep the museums open for longer hours and so on, and then respond to that in terms of trialling, for example, keeping the museum open. If you visit Cathays this Saturday, it will be open until 7 p.m. as part of the Wales and the world festival.

perthynas â'r rhyfel byd cyntaf, yn eithaf diddorol yn hynny o beth oherwydd ei fod yn dwyn ynghyd nid yn unig gwrthrychau, ond hefyd ddelweddau, ffilm a'r mathau hynny o bethau i gyd. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi ei gysylltu'n benodol iawn ag angen y cwricwlwm.

[85] **Denise Idris Jones:** Edrychaf ymlaen at hwnnw, fel cyn-athrawes.

Af ymlaen yn awr at baragraff 4.9, lle yr edrychwn ar eich oriau agor. Credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o amgeddfeydd yn cau am 5 p.m., ond yr oeddwn yn yr oriel genedlaethol yn Nulyn yr wythnos diwethaf, a oedd ar agor tan 8 p.m.. Cefais weld rhai o'r paentiadau godidog yno. A ydych yn edrych ar hyn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Ydym. Eleni, o ran ein hymchwil i ymwelwyr, yr ydym yn gweithredu newid bach. Mae elfen dau gam i hyn. Ar hyn o bryd, yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei wneud yw cynnal ymchwil i ymwelwyr gyda'r nod o ganfod niferoedd ymwelwyr, o ble y deuant, oed, rhyw—y math yna o beth—hynny yw, grwpio cymdeithasol. Yn y bôn, gwybodaeth farchnata yw hynny, sy'n bwysig iawn. Yr ydym yn parhau i wneud rhywfaint o hynny eleni, ond yr ydym yn symud at ymchwil i'r gynulleidfa, sef proffilio ymwelwyr, cael syniad gwell o pam mae pobl yn dod i'r amgueddfeydd, beth y maent yn ei ddisgwyl, beth yw eu canfyddiadau, a pha fath o bethau y byddent am eu gweld. Felly, mae ychydig yn fwy—nid yw'n llwyr ymgynghorol; credaf y byddai'n anghywir dweud hynny. Cael darlun o broffil ein hymwelwyr ydyw, oherwydd yr hyn y credwn y bydd hynny yn ei ddatgelu, yn eithaf posibl, yw nad ydym yn cynrychioli neu'n cyrraedd grwpiau penodol yn y gymdeithas. Gwyddom hynny i ryw raddau: gwyddom nad ydym yn cynrychioli rhai ohonynt, a bod grwpiau penodol nad ydym yn eu cyrraedd cystal ag eraill. Felly, mae angen i ni ganfod y rhesymau dros hynny. Cyfrifoldeb Beaufort Research Cyf—y cwmni sy'n delio â'r gwaith—fydd cael y proffil hynny yn gywir. Yna, y flwyddyn nesaf, yn 2005-06, byddwn yn mynd ati o ddifrif i gynnal profion o'r manteision, anfanteision a barn y cyhoedd ar a ddylem gadw'r amgueddfeydd ar agor yn hwyrach ac yn y blaen, ac yna ymateb i hynny o ran cynnal cynlluniau prawf, er enghraifft, ar gadw'r amgueddfa ar agor. Os ewch i Cathays y dydd Sadwrn hwn, bydd ar agor tan 7 p.m.

[86] **Denise Idris Jones:** I will be in Conwy then, so I will not be able to do that.

**Mr Houlihan:** There are also environmental issues, external to the museum, which are quite important. I think that Dublin is a classic example of a city that is bustling with tourists and is very active. The location of the national gallery and the national museum there is quite central—people are constantly going past and so on. Similarly south Kensington. Although, interestingly, at the British Museum, the great court was designed to be open until 10 p.m. for people to pass through, but they have closed it now, because people were not using it, and that is in relatively central London. So that is the sort of environment that you also have to take account of before taking a decision: if we looked at opening all our sites until late evening on Mondays, it would cost us about £0.5 million.

[87] **Val Lloyd:** I will continue with Denise's theme of access. For the last three years, free entry to museum sites has brought a very welcome increase in visitor numbers, and earlier you referred in passing, while answering another question, to the wear and tear that that brought with it. In addition to that, perhaps you have other problems with collections that are on open display, such as those at St Fagans. How do you minimise the potential damage?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that we are still, to some extent, in new territory on this one. Yes, you can physically see where, on previously lawned areas, the public have cut a new path; putting a path there is, I think, the solution to that. There are those physical manifestations. You raised a number of issues. It is not just the care of objects: it is also the security of the objects. I would have to be frank and say that there is an issue there. A number of staff based in the buildings have said that, in some senses, their job is moving from one of interpreting the house to being a security guard. They do not like it; it is a shift in their job, in a sense, created by the numbers of people coming through. It is a case of 'do not touch that', 'do not do that'. That is an issue that we must grapple with

fel rhan o wyl Cymru a'r byd.

[86] **Denise Idris Jones:** Byddaf yng Nghonwy bryd hynny, felly ni fedraf wneud hynny.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae hefyd faterion amgylcheddol, y tu allan i'r amgueddfa, sy'n eithaf pwysig. Credaf fod Dulyn yn enghraifft berffaith o ddinas sy'n byrlymu â thwristiaid ac sy'n fywiog iawn. Mae'r oriel genedlaethol a'r amgueddfa genedlaethol mewn lleoliad eithaf canolog yno—mae pobl yn mynd heibio ac ati drwy'r amser. Mae'r un peth yn wir am dde Kensington. Er, yn ddiddorol, yn yr Amgueddfa Brydeinig, bwriadwyd i'r cwrt mawr fod ar agor tan 10 p.m. er mwyn i bobl allu cerdded drwyddo, ond maent bellach wedi ei gau, oherwydd nad oedd pobl yn ei ddefnyddio, ac mae hwnnw'n gymharol ganolog yn Llundain. Felly dyna'r math o amgylchedd y mae'n rhaid i chi ei ystyried cyn gwneud penderfyniad: pe baem yn ystyried agor ein holl safleoedd tan yn hwyr ar ddyddiau Llun, byddai'n costio tua £0.5 miliwn i ni.

[87] **Val Lloyd:** Gwnaf barhau â thema mynediad Denise. Am y tair blynedd diwethaf, mae mynediad am ddim i safleoedd amgueddfeydd wedi cynyddu niferoedd ymwelwyr, sydd i'w groesawu'n fawr, ac yn gynharach, bu i chi grybwyll yn fyr, tra'n ateb cwestiwn arall, y traul yn sgîl hynny. Yn ogystal â hynny, efallai fod gennych broblemau eraill gyda chasgliadau sy'n cael eu harddangos yn agored, fel y rhai hynny yn Sain Ffagan. Sut yr ydych yn lleihau'r difrod posibl?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf ein bod, i ryw raddau, ar dir newydd o hyd mewn perthynas â hyn. Gallwch, gallwch weld yn ffisegol, lle yr oedd porfa y flaenorol, ble mae'r cyhoedd wedi creu llwybr newydd; credaf mai rhoi llwybr yn y fan honno yw'r ateb i hynny. Mae'r arwyddion ffisegol hynny. Bu i chi godi nifer o faterion. Nid gofal y gwrthrychau yw'r unig fater: mae'n ymwneud â diogelwch y gwrthrychau hefyd. Byddai'n rhaid i mi ddweud yn ddi-flewyn ar dafod bod problem yn y fan honno. Mae nifer o staff sy'n gweithio yn yr adeiladau wedi dweud, ar ryw ystyr, bod eu swydd yn newid o fod yn un o ddehongli'r ty i fod yn swyddog diogelwch. Nid ydynt fodlon â hynny; mae'n newid yn eu gwaith, ar ryw ystyr, sy'n cael ei greu gan niferoedd y bobl sy'n dod drwodd. Mae'n



as an organisation. In an ideal world, we would see that as an opportunity to intervene and say, 'now, there is an interesting object, let me tell you about it', but, because of the numbers of people piling through, there is an issue. We are looking at that; maybe, for example, looking at themed tours—John Williams-Davies, the director, is looking at the possibility of themed tours around some of the houses, which might provide the level of engagement that we are seeking, with groups of people.

However, it is early days and there are problems, there is no doubt about that. However, we do not want to go down the route of putting a roped barrier at the entrance to each of the houses and having people peer in. We have to find a solution to this. There are other examples of practice at Ironbridge and other open-air museums, and such like, where they get large numbers of people through, so maybe we just need to see what they do. I think that there are ways in which you can divert the public as well—dare I say—through costumed interpretation and those sorts of things. There is an opportunity to engage the visitor and stop them playing football or whatever and turn a visit into a learning exercise.

[88] **Val Lloyd:** How do you square the concept of free entry with the introduction of parking fees at a place like St Fagans, particularly when you have an avowed intention to attract a wider range of social groups?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that there are a number of points there. If I were to say that, in terms of the income that has been, or will be, derived from car parking, that, in agreement with the Minister, will be diverted into our partnership programme, which will work across Wales by bringing the national collections to people across Wales, I think that you begin to see some of the balances that are in relation to that. I think that, secondly, there might be other issues, and again, we are going to have to do the research to confirm this. Our non-visitor research would seem to indicate that people who do not visit museums are more likely to come by public transport. There are issues in

achos o 'peidiwch â chyffwrdd â hwnnw', 'peidiwch â gwneud hynny'. Mae hwnnw'n fater y mae'n rhaid i ni fynd i'r afael ag ef fel sefydliad. Mewn byd delfrydol, byddem yn gweld hynny fel cyfle i ymyrryd a dweud, 'yn awr, dyna wrthrych diddorol, gadewch i mi ddweud wrthy ch amdano', ond, oherwydd niferoedd y bobl sy'n tyrru drwodd, mae problem. Yr ydym yn edrych ar hynny; efallai, er enghraifft, ystyried teithiau thema—mae John Williams-Davies, y cyfarwyddwr, yn edrych ar y posibilrwydd o deithiau thema o amgylch rhai o'r tai, a allai ddarparu'r lefel o ymgysylltu yr ydym yn chwilio amdani, gyda grwpiau o bobl.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddyddiau cynnar ac mae problemau, nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym am ddilyn y llwybr o roi rhaff ym mynedfa pob un o'r tai a chael pobl yn edrych i mewn. Rhaid i ni ddod o hyd i ateb i hyn. Mae enghreifftiau eraill o arfer yn Ironbridge ac amgueddfeydd awyr agored eraill, ac ati, lle maent yn cael niferoedd mawr o bobl, felly mae'n bosibl mai'r cyfan sydd angen i ni ei wneud yw gweld yr hyn y maent hwy yn ei wneud. Credaf fod ffyrdd y gallwch ddiddanu'r cyhoedd hefyd—a fentraf ddweud—drwy ddehongliadau mewn gwisgoedd a phethau felly. Mae cyfle i ymwneud â'r ymwelydd a'i stopio rhag chwarae pêl-droed neu beth bynnag a throi ymweliad yn ymarfer dysgu.

[88] **Val Lloyd:** Sut yr ydych yn cysoni'r cysyniad o fynediad am ddim gyda chyflwyno ffioedd parcio mewn lle fel Sain Ffagan, yn enwedig pan fo gennyh fwrriad cyffesedig i ddenu amrywiaeth ehangach o grwpiau cymdeithasol?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod nifer o bwyntiau yn y fan honno. Pe bawn yn dweud, yn achos yr incwm sydd wedi, neu a fydd, yn deillio o'r maes parcio, y bydd hwnnw, mewn cytundeb â'r Gweinidog, yn cael ei roi i'n rhaglen bartneriaeth, a fydd yn gweithio ledled Cymru drwy ddod â'r casgliadau cenedlaethol i bobl ledled Cymru, credaf eich bod yn dechrau gweld rhai o'r ffactorau cydbwyso sy'n ymwneud â hynny. Credaf, yn ail, fod materion eraill o bosibl, ac eto, bydd yn rhaid i ni wneud yr ymchwil i gadarnhau hyn. Byddai'n ymddangos o'n hymchwil ymysg pobl nad ydynt yn ymwelwyr fod pobl nad ydynt yn ymweld ag amgueddfeydd yn fwy tebygol o ddod ar drafnidiaeth

relation to the cost of public transport, and the ease of using public transport to come to somewhere like St Fagans. We would also argue that in terms of environmental sustainability—I know that it sounds like a tax on cars, but I think that if that money for parking is deployed into a key area of access, and in subsequent years could be devoted to other aspects and the sort of issues that we have been talking about this morning, then that is a good thing. I think that the final point is that, according to some of the public expressions, polls done in newspapers and so on, and general, casual feedback from people in the car park, people are saying that it is a good thing.

[89] **Janet Davies:** I am sorry to interrupt you, Val, but I would just like to let Alun come in with a brief point on that.

[90] **Alun Cairns:** Thank you, Cadeirydd. Bearing in mind the positive publicity given to highlight the free entry to the museum, and considering that car-parking charges have been introduced, do you think that the principle of free entry to the museum has been compromised?

**Mr Houlihan:** No, because not everyone comes by car, and the core experience is still free.

[91] **Jocelyn Davies:** How much are we talking about here for an average car to stay there for several hours?

**Mr Houlihan:** Two pounds.

[92] **David Melding:** What was the fee to get in?

[93] **Jocelyn Davies:** Say, for a family of four who would come in a car?

**Dr Wiliam:** Prior to free admission, a family of four would probably have been touching £20. It is that order of difference.

[94] **David Melding:** So, there is a saving even for an individual?

**Dr Wiliam:** Yes.

gyhoeddus. Mae materion ynglyn â chost trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, a hwylustra defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus i ddod i rywle fel Sain Ffagan. Byddem hefyd yn dadlau, o ran cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol—gwn fod hyn i'w glywed fel treth ar geir, ond credaf os yw'r arian parcio hwnnw yn cael ei wario ar faes allweddol o fynediad, ac y gallai gael ei neilltuo i agweddau eraill a'r mathau o faterion eraill yr ydym wedi bod yn eu trafod y bore yma yn y blynyddoedd wedyn, yna mae hynny'n beth da. Credaf mai'r pwynt olaf yw, yn ôl rhai o'r arolygon barn, a wneir mewn papurau newydd ac ati, ac adborth anffurfiol, cyffredinol gan bobl yn y maes parcio, mae pobl yn dweud ei fod yn beth da.

[89] **Janet Davies:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar eich traws, Val, ond hoffwn adael i Alun wneud pwynt byr am hynny.

[90] **Alun Cairns:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. O gofio'r cyhoeddusrwydd cadarnhaol a roddwyd i hysbysebu'r mynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfa, a chan ystyried bod taliadau parcio wedi cael eu cyflwyno, a ydych o'r farn fod yr egwyddor o fynediad am ddim i'r amgueddfa wedi cael ei gyfaddawdu?

**Mr Houlihan:** Na, oherwydd nid yw pawb yn teithio i'r amgueddfa mewn car, ac mae'r profiad craidd am ddim o hyd.

[91] **Jocelyn Davies:** Am faint yr ydym yn sôn i gar aros yno am nifer o oriau?

**Mr Houlihan:** Dwy bunt.

[92] **David Melding:** Beth oedd y ffi mynediad?

[93] **Jocelyn Davies:** Ar gyfer teulu o bedwar a fyddai'n dod mewn car, dyweder?

**Dr Wiliam:** Cyn y mynediad am ddim, byddai wedi costio'n agos i £20 i deulu o bedwar. Dyna'r math o wahaniaeth.

[94] **David Melding:** Felly, mae hyd yn oed unigolyn yn arbed arian?

**Dr Wiliam:** Ydy.

[95] **Jocelyn Davies:** We are quids in, then.

[96] **Val Lloyd:** Not only are we quids in, but I was also going to highlight the fact that you said that there was a trade-off with that quite reasonable car parking fee because you would get increased engagement with your partnership scheme, which I would like to come back to. So, you would say that you are fairly confident that the car parking fee would not put off the groups that you have been trying to target?

**Mr Houlihan:** We would hope not, but that would have to be verified in terms of research on visitor numbers and so on, which got held up.

[97] **Val Lloyd:** You do, obviously, get grant-in-aid compensation for the loss of revenue. Does it adequately compensate you? You are probably going to say 'no'. Perhaps, I should rephrase that question: is it a fair trade-off?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that, at the time, it was fair, but I think that there have been hidden factors within all of this that have come to light. It is common with other museums in the UK that went down this particular route. I think that they have found that the wear and tear has actually been higher than was originally anticipated. You also get some other spin-offs, for example—as I indicated earlier—in the changing nature of the job of some of our business services assistants, and so on, which we are going to have to deal with through training and things like that, but then, we have a training budget.

[98] **Val Lloyd:** How was it calculated, and does that compare similarly with museums in the rest of the UK?

**Mr Houlihan:** I will have to ask Eurwyn to answer this question because, in Northern Ireland, they continue to charge for entry to the museums.

[95] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yr ydym ar ein hennill, felly.

[96] **Val Lloyd:** Nid yn unig ein bod ar ein hennill, ond yr oeddwn hefyd yn mynd i bwysleisio'r ffaith i chi ddweud bod cyfaddawd gyda'r ffi parcio eithaf rhesymol hwnnw oherwydd y byddech yn ymgysylltu mwy gyda'ch cynllun partneriaeth, yr hoffwn ddod yn ôl ato. Felly, byddech yn dweud eich bod yn eithaf hyderus na fyddai'r ffi parcio yn rhwystro'r grwpiau yr ydych wedi bod yn ceisio eu targedu rhag ymweld â'r amgueddfa?

**Mr Houlihan:** Byddem yn gobeithio na fyddai'n rhwystro'r grwpiau hynny, ond byddai'n rhaid gwirio hynny o ran ymchwil i niferoedd ymwelwyr ac ati, a gafodd ei gohirio.

[97] **Val Lloyd:** Yr ydych, yn amlwg, yn cael cymorth grant i ddigolledu'r golled mewn refeniw. A yw'n eich digolledu'n ddigonol? Yr ydych yn mynd i ddweud 'na' yn ôl pob tebyg. Efallai y dylwn aileirio'r cwestiwn: a yw'n gyfaddawd teg?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr oedd yn deg, ar y pryd, yn fy marn i, ond credaf fod ffactorau cudd o fewn hyn oll sydd wedi dod i'r fei. Mae'n gyffredin yn achos amgueddfeydd eraill yn y DU a aeth ar hyd y llwybr penodol hwn. Credaf eu bod wedi canfod bod y traul wedi bod yn uwch mewn gwirionedd nag a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol. Yr ydych hefyd yn cael rhai sgil-ffeithiau eraill, er enghraifft—fel y dynodais yn gynharach—newid yn natur gwaith rhai o'n cynorthwywyr gwasanaethau busnes, ac yn y blaen, y bydd yn rhaid i ni fynd i'r afael ag ef drwy hyfforddiant a phethau felly, ond wedyn, mae gennym gyllideb hyfforddi.

[98] **Val Lloyd:** Sut y'i cyfrifwyd, ac a yw hynny'n debyg i amgueddfeydd yng ngweddill y DU?

**Mr Houlihan:** Bydd yn rhaid i mi ofyn i Eurwyn ateb y cwestiwn hwn oherwydd, yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, maent yn parhau i godi tâl mynediad i'r amgueddfeydd.

**Dr Wiliam:** I cannot honestly answer that. At the time, as Mike said, we thought that it was fair. What we had no handle on whatsoever, of course, was the actual number of increased visits. That has surpassed expectation, so there is a concomitant added wear and tear factor, unquestionably.

[99] **Val Lloyd:** When you answered my colleague, Denise, you instanced your visitor research. How much, approximately, do you spend on your marketing budget and your visitor research?

An approximate figure would be acceptable.

**Mr Houlihan:** Sorry for the brief pause, I am trying to find that information. Maybe we could reply in writing to that question.

[100] **Janet Davies:** Yes, perhaps we could have a note on that.

[101] **Val Lloyd:** That would be fine. Thank you, Chair. If you do not have this figure to hand, you may also wish to include this in the note. We heard quite a lot earlier about the need for resources to deal with your conservation and documentation backlogs, and I wondered whether the expenditure on marketing and research yields value for money, particularly in relation to the other needs.

**Mr Houlihan:** It is one area that is constantly monitored because, clearly, marketing has an intimate relationship with visitor numbers, and we are constantly monitoring that, both in our directorate meetings and at council as well. The council does seek for papers to be brought forward on marketing strategy and so on, in order to ensure that visitor numbers are maintained.

[102] **Val Lloyd:** I have just a final couple of questions. I noticed that you have 25,000 items on loan, which seemed to be an enormous number until I realised that it was only 0.53 per cent of your collection. This is a fairly direct question: would you like to see that loan programme extended?

**Dr Wiliam:** Ni allaf ateb hynny yn onest. Ar y pryd, fel y dywedodd Mike, yr oeddem o'r farn ei fod yn deg. Yr hyn nad oedd gennym unrhyw syniad ohono o gwbl, wrth gwrs, oedd cynnydd gwirioneddol yn niferoedd ymweliadau. Mae hynny wedi mynd y tu hwnt i'r disgwyl, felly mae ffactor traul ychwanegol cysylltiedig, heb amheuaeth.

[99] **Val Lloyd:** Pan yr atebasoch fy nghyd-Aelod, Denise, bu i chi enghreifftio eich ymchwil i ymwelwyr. Tua faint yr ydych yn ei wario ar eich cyllideb farchnata a'ch ymchwil i ymwelwyr?

Byddai ffigur bras yn dderbyniol.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf am y saib byr, yr wyf yn ceisio dod o hyd i'r wybodaeth honno. Efallai y gallem ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw'n ysgrifenedig.

[100] **Janet Davies:** Ie, efallai y gallem gael nodyn am hynny.

[101] **Val Lloyd:** Byddai hynny'n iawn. Diolch, Gadeirydd. Os nad yw'r ffigur hwn gennych wrth law, efallai y byddwch am gynnwys hwn yn y nodyn hefyd. Clywsom cryn dipyn yn gynharach am yr angen am adnoddau i ddelio â'ch ôl-groniadau cadwraeth a dogfennaeth, ac yr oeddwn yn meddwl tybed a yw'r gwariant ar farchnata ac ymchwil yn rhoi gwerth am arian, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r anghenion eraill.

**Mr Houlihan:** Mae'n un maes sy'n cael ei fonitro'n gyson oherwydd, yn amlwg, mae cysylltiad agos rhwng marchnata a niferoedd ymwelwyr, ac yr ydym yn monitro hynny yn gyson, yn ein cyfarfodydd cyfarwyddiaeth ac yn y cyngor hefyd. Mae'r cyngor yn gofyn i bapurau gael eu cyflwyno ar y strategaeth farchnata ac ati, i sicrhau bod niferoedd ymwelwyr yn cael eu cynnal.

[102] **Val Lloyd:** Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau cyn gorffen. Sylwais fod gennych 25,000 o eitemau ar fenthyg, a oedd yn ymddangos yn rhif enfawr tan i mi sylweddoli mai dim ond 0.53 y cant o'ch casgliad oedd hwnnw. Mae hwn yn gwestiwn eithaf uniongyrchol: a hoffech weld y rhaglen fenthyg honno yn cael ei hehangu?

**Mr Houlihan:** In a sense, we are actively pursuing that, particularly through the partnership programme. I think that it can be argued that the partnership programme is actually additional to those loans. I think that there are some 88 registered museums in Wales, and pretty well all of them have something on loan from us. The extent to which we lend, to a certain extent, is predicated on the ability of the borrower, or the facilities of the borrower, to take those objects—their own spaces, their own environments—and our ability to resource the loans programme. However, the partnership group does, in a sense, set up accredited museums, if you like, where we know that the standards are satisfactory, and we will then look at how we could put more objects into that. Certainly in terms of use of collections, I think that that is a very important area.

[103] **Val Lloyd:** I was very interested in the partnership programmes and particularly in the outreach collection, which I thought would be an excellent way to reach people who are perhaps not reachable by other ways. Again, in view of the need for engagement, do you have any specific plans to increase the items on loan, bearing in mind that they have to be going somewhere where receipt can be guaranteed?

**Mr Houlihan:** Again, loans are a fluctuating element. Not only do we have loans within Wales, we also have loans outside of Wales, within the rest of the UK. In some senses, some of our collections touch virtually every continent in terms of loans. We have a very dynamic international loans programme, which is obviously very important, not only in terms of raising our reputation, but the reputation of Wales abroad. So, that is going on. It is quite demanding of resources in many respects, in terms of time and diversion of resources, but we do see it as a fundamental obligation on the museum to go down these routes.

**Mr Houlihan:** Ar ryw ystyr, yr ydym yn mynd ati i geisio gwneud hynny, yn enwedig drwy'r rhaglen bartneriaeth. Credaf y gellir dadlau bod y rhaglen bartneriaeth yn ychwanegol mewn gwirionedd i'r benthyciadau hynny. Credaf fod rhyw 88 o amgueddfeydd cofrestredig yng Nghymru, ac mae gan bron pob un ohonynt rywbeth ar fenthyg gennym. Mae'r graddau yr ydym yn benthyca, i raddau helaeth, yn seiliedig ar allu'r benthyciwr, neu gyfleusterau'r benthyciwr, i gymryd y gwrthrychau hynny—eu gofodau hwy eu hunain, eu hamgylcheddau hwy eu hunain—a'n gallu i ariannu'r rhaglen fenthyciadau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r grwp partneriaeth, ar ryw ystyr, yn sefydlu amgueddfeydd achredig, os hoffwch chi, lle gwyddom fod y safonau yn foddhaol, ac wedyn byddwn yn edrych ar sut y gallem roi mwy o wrthrychau yn hwnnw. Yn sicr, o ran defnydd o gasgliadau, mae hwnnw'n faes pwysig iawn yn fy marn i.

[103] **Val Lloyd:** Yr oedd gennyf lawer o ddiddordeb yn y rhaglenni partneriaeth, yn enwedig y casgliad allgymorth, a fyddai'n ffordd wych o gyrraedd pobl efallai nad oes modd eu cyrraedd fel arall yn fy marn i. Eto, o ystyried yr angen i ymgysylltu â phobl, a oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau penodol i gynyddu'r eitemau ar fenthyg, o gofio bod yn rhaid iddynt fynd i rywle lle y gellir sicrhau eu bod wedi cael eu derbyn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Eto, mae benthyciadau yn elfen amrywiol. Nid yn unig y mae gennym fenthyciadau yng Nghymru, mae gennym fenthyciadau y tu hwnt i Gymru hefyd, yng ngweddill y DU. I ryw raddau, mae rhai o'n casgliadau yn cyrraedd pob cyfandir fwy neu lai o ran benthyciadau. Mae gennym raglen fenthyciadau ryngwladol hynod ddeinamig, sy'n amlwg yn bwysig iawn, nid yn unig o ran gwella ein henw da, ond gwella enw da Cymru dramor. Felly, mae hynny'n digwydd. Mae'n gofyn llawer o adnoddau mewn sawl ffordd, o ran amser a neilltuo adnoddau, ond yr ydym yn ei ystyried yn ofyniad hanfodol ar yr amgueddfa i ddilyn y llwybrau hyn.

We would like to see more loans being undertaken, and I would guess that, in terms of the future of the national museums and galleries, and other museums, loans will very much be part of the pattern of how collections are used in future.

[104] **Val Lloyd:** Thank you, Chair.

[105] **Janet Davies:** Thank you, Val. May I just ask, do you borrow as well as lend?

**Mr Houlihan:** We do occasionally borrow. I would cite, for example, the Thomas Jones exhibition, which was on in the museum last year, and which included a very significant loan from St Petersburg and loans from museums in the United States too.

[106] **Janet Davies:** You have talked about drawing on the experience and examples of good practice in other museums; do you have any plans to extend that? How do you propose to do that in the future?

**Mr Houlihan:** I think that there are a number of routes into this. First, the museum has excellent relationships with quite a number of important museums, both in the UK and internationally. There are also a number of bodies where best practice is being exchanged and, at my level for example, I would cite the National Museum Directors' Conference, which is looking at precisely many of the issues that are brought up here. 'Too Much Stuff?' is an example of addressing those sorts of issues at a strategic, almost political level. There are quite a number of museum professional bodies that members of staff belong to and where good practice is exchanged. Also, there have been situations where staff have gone on mini-internships and exchanges, and so on, to other organisations to see how they do things, how things operate, and such like. So, the relationships are good, and the opportunities exist to look at these things. Across museums, this has been going on for years. At a previous museum I worked in, members of staff went for, say, three months to work in Canada to look precisely at how they managed their conservation programmes, and so on. That is certainly something that we can look at, but it is also a matter of keeping

Hoffem weld mwy o fenthyciadau ar waith, a byddwn yn tybio, yn achos dyfodol yr amgueddfeydd ac orielau cenedlaethol, ac amgueddfeydd eraill, y bydd benthyciadau yn rhan bwysig o'r modd y bydd casgliadau'n cael eu defnyddio yn y dyfodol.

[104] **Val Lloyd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd.

[105] **Janet Davies:** Diolch, Val. A gaf fi ofyn, a ydych yn benthg yn ogystal â rhoi benthg?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr ydym yn benthg o bryd i'w gilydd. Byddwn yn crybwyll, er enghraifft, arddangosfa Thomas Jones, a oedd i'w gweld yn yr amgueddfa y llynedd, ac a oedd yn cynnwys benthyciad sylweddol iawn o St Petersburg a benthyciadau o amgueddfeydd yn yr Unol Daleithiau hefyd.

[106] **Janet Davies:** Yr ydych wedi sôn am ddefnyddio profiad ac enghreifftiau o arferion da mewn amgueddfeydd eraill; a oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ehangu hynny? Sut yr ydych yn cynnig gwneud hynny yn y dyfodol?

**Mr Houlihan:** Credaf fod sawl ffordd o wneud hyn. Yn gyntaf, mae gan yr amgueddfa berthynas wych gyda llawer o amgueddfeydd pwysig, yn y DU ac yn rhyngwladol. Mae hefyd nifer o gyrff lle mae arfer gorau yn cael ei gyfnewid ac, ar fy lefel i er enghraifft, byddwn yn sôn am Gynhadledd Cyfarwyddwyr Amgueddfeydd Cenedlaethol, sy'n edrych ar lawer o'r union faterion sy'n cael eu trafod yma. Mae 'Too Much Stuff?' yn enghraifft o fynd i'r afael â'r mathau hyn o faterion ar lefel strategol, a gwleidyddol i raddau. Mae cryn nifer o gyrff proffesiynol amgueddfeydd y mae aelodau staff yn perthyn iddynt a lle caiff arferion da eu cyfnewid. Yn ogystal, bu sefyllfaoedd lle mae staff wedi cymryd rhan mewn lleoliadau byr neu gyfnewidiadau, ac ati, mewn sefydliadau eraill i weld sut maent yn gwneud pethau, sut mae pethau'n gweithio, ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae'r cydberthnasau'n dda, ac mae cyfleoedd i edrych ar y pethau hyn. Mae hyn wedi bod yn digwydd am flynyddoedd ledled amgueddfeydd. Mewn amgueddfa flaenorol y bûm yn gweithio ynddi, yr oedd aelodau staff yn mynd, er enghraifft, i weithio yng Nghanada am dri mis i edrych yn fanwl ar sut yr oeddynt yn rheoli eu rhaglenni cadwraeth, ac yn y blaen. Mae

abreast of some of the new developments that are coming through and where they might be coming from. Identifying those is a little trickier, I have to say.

[107] **Janet Davies:** We are coming to the end of the session now. You have talked, particularly early in the session, about possibly changing the thrust of your policies and perhaps altering the balances of what you do. Of course, you realise that this committee cannot take evidence on policy and the way in which you hold these balances—we can only look at what are your present strategy and policies and how they are being met. I hope that, perhaps, the Auditor General's report will have helped you in doing this. It has to be said, however, that there has been 20 years' evidence of not carrying out the policies that you have had in the past. As you say, they may not have been the best strategies, but they were there. Could you perhaps just summarise for us at the end what you consider to be your main priorities for action in response to this report?

**Mr Houlihan:** We accept the report's recommendations. We have flagged up some areas in relation to the issue of access versus engagement, which may have implications for how we go forward in terms of using this. However, I think that I would suggest that we have had 20 years of not completing the job. I would hope that, in the next 10 years, we could complete the job, but complete it in a way that is supportive of the new intellectual direction that the organisation will take, and supportive of what I hope we have tried to demonstrate this morning—which is coming through with the report—which is the new ways in which we will use the collections in future. One of the curators said to me the other day—and he is responsible for over 1 million objects—'There isn't a single object in my collection that is not being used'.

hynny'n sicr yn rhywbeth y gallwn edrych arno, ond mae hefyd yn fater o sicrhau ein bod yn ymwybodol o rai o'r datblygiadau newydd sy'n dod i'r fei ac o ble y maent yn deillio. Rhaid i mi ddweud bod nodi'r rheini ychydig yn anoddach.

[107] **Janet Davies:** Yr ydym yn dod at ddiwedd y sesiwn yn awr. Yr ydych wedi siarad, yn enwedig ar ddechrau'r sesiwn, am newid cyfeiriad eich polisiau ac efallai newid cydbwysedd yr hyn a wnewch o bosibl. Wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn sylweddoli na all y pwyllgor hwn gymryd tystiolaeth am bolisi a'r modd yr ydych yn dal y cydbwysedd hwn—ni allwn ond edrych ar beth yw eich strategaeth a'ch polisiau ar hyn o bryd a sut maent yn cael eu bodloni. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, efallai, y bydd adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol wedi bod o gymorth i chi wneud hyn. Rhaid dweud, fodd bynnag, y bu 20 mlynedd o dystiolaeth o beidio â gweithredu'r polisiau a fu gennych yn y gorffennol. Fel y bu i chi ddweud, efallai nad hwy oedd y strategaethau gorau, ond yr oeddynt yno. A allech grynhoi i ni ar y diwedd beth y credwch yw eich prif flaenoriaethau gweithredu mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn?

**Mr Houlihan:** Yr ydym yn derbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad. Yr ydym wedi nodi rhai o'r meysydd mewn perthynas â'r mater o fynediad yn erbyn ymgysylltu â phobl, a fydd efallai yn effeithio ar sut yr ydym yn symud ymlaen o ran defnyddio hwn. Fodd bynnag, credaf y byddwn yn awgrymu ein bod wedi cael 20 mlynedd o beidio â gorffen y gwaith. Byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem gwblhau'r gwaith yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf, ond ei gwblhau mewn modd sy'n cefnogi cyfeiriad deallusol newydd y sefydliad, ac sy'n cefnogi'r hyn yr wyf yn gobeithio ein bod wedi ceisio ei arddangos y bore yma—sy'n dod i'r amlwg yn yr adroddiad—sef y ffyrdd newydd y byddwn yn defnyddio ein casgliadau yn y dyfodol. Dywedodd un o'r curaduron wrthyf y diwrnod o'r blaen—ac mae ef yn gyfrifol am dros 1 miliwn o wrthrychau—'Nid oes yr un gwrthrych yn fy nghasgliad nad yw'n cael ei ddefnyddio'.

I think that museums are sometimes their own worst enemies because they talk about stored collections as if all these objects are dead. People are quite happy to talk about libraries, and they understand the concept of public front end and lots of books in there. Similarly with an archive, it sounds great. They are not talked about as stores, and there is a concept that those objects are waiting to be used, that they are live and that something is going to happen to them. I would argue that museums need to think of their collections in that way: that these are resources that are going to be used in the future.

New technology opens up some interesting opportunities. On the ways in which we will use our collections, particularly on the access side—referring to that element in the report—I think that there are some very exciting possibilities out there. I think that we have done the securing of the collections. We have done that, but we have to maintain it and, obviously, increase it in step with new developments. On the conservation side, there is a long job to be done, and that is going to be an ongoing job, but I have indicated the sort of strategies that we can adopt for that. Documentation and storage will be addressed in this next period, so I hope that when the NAO comes back, it will find that there is a job completed there. However, collection development, growth of the collections and conservation, in a sense, are always going to be with us.

[108] **Janet Davies:** Thank you very much for your helpful answers. I remind you that there will be a verbatim record of this session, which will be sent to you so that you can correct anything that you feel is inaccurate before the committee's report is published. Thank you both for coming, it has been a very interesting session.

Credaf mai amgueddfeydd yw eu gelynion pennaf eu hunain ar brydiau oherwydd maent yn sôn am gasgliadau mewn storffeydd fel pe bai'r gwrthrychau hyn i gyd wedi cyrraedd diwedd eu hoes. Mae pobl yn ddigon bodlon siarad am lyfrgelloedd, ac maent yn deall elfen gyhoeddus llyfrgelloedd a'r lluo o lyfrau sydd ynddynt. Yn yr un modd gydag archifau, mae'n swinio'n wych. Ni siaredir amdanynt fel storffeydd, ac mae cysyniad bod y gwrthrychau hynny yn aros i gael eu defnyddio, eu bod yn fyw a bod rhywbeth yn mynd i ddigwydd iddynt. Byddwn yn dadlau bod angen i amgueddfeydd feddwl am eu casgliadau yn y modd hwnnw: bod y rhain yn adnoddau sy'n mynd i gael eu defnyddio yn y dyfodol.

Mae technoleg newydd yn agor y drws i gyfleoedd diddorol. O ran sut y byddwn yn defnyddio ein casgliadau, yn enwedig o ran mynediad—gan gyfeirio at yr elfen honno yn yr adroddiad—credaf fod rhai posibilïadau cyffrous iawn ar gael. Credaf ein bod wedi cyflawni'r gwaith o ddiogelu'r casgliadau. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny, ond mae'n rhaid i ni gynnal y gwaith hwnnw ac, yn amlwg, ei gynyddu yn unol â datblygiadau newydd. O ran cadwraeth, mae llawer o waith o'n blaenau, ac mae hwnnw'n mynd i fod yn waith parhaus, ond yr wyf wedi dynodi'r math o strategaethau y gallwn eu mabwysiadu i wneud hynny. Byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â dogfennu a storio yn y cyfnod nesaf hwn, felly yr wyf yn gobeithio pan ddychwela'r SAG, y bydd yn canfod bod y gwaith hwnnw wedi ei gwblhau. Fodd bynnag, bydd datblygu'r casgliad, twf y casgliadau a chadwraeth, ar ryw ystyr, yn rhywbeth a fydd gyda ni drwy'r amser.

[108] **Janet Davies:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich atebion defnyddiol. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa y bydd cofnod gair am air o'r sesiwn hwn, a fydd yn cael ei anfon atoch fel y gallwch gywiro unrhyw beth sy'n anghywir yn eich barn chi cyn cyhoeddi adroddiad y pwyllgor. Diolch i chi'ch dau am ddod, mae wedi bod yn sesiwn diddorol iawn.

*Daeth y sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth i ben am 11.32 a.m.  
The evidence-taking session ended at 11.32 a.m.*

(1) Mae'r tyst wedi darparu'r cywiriad canlynol i'w ateb i gwestiwn [13]. Yr ateb cywir yw:  
'Na fyddai, byddai'n rhaid inni ddibynnu ar yswiriant y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y risgiau hyn ond mae gennym



yswiriant ar gyfer cerbydau.’

(1) The witness has issued the following correction to his answer to question [13]. The correct answer is:  
‘No, we would have to rely on Government indemnity for these risks but we do carry insurance for vehicles.’