



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig
The Rural Development Sub-committee**

**Dydd Llun, 15 Mehefin 2009
Monday, 15 June 2009**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 3 Ymchwiliad i Gynhyrchu a Hybu Bwyd Cymreig
Inquiry into Production and Promotion of Welsh Food

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Mick Bates	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Alun Davies	Llafur (Cadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor) Labour (Sub-committee Chair)
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Edward Morgan	Castell Howell
Jeremy Percy	Cyddfederasiwn Cymdeithasau Pysgotwyr Cymru Welsh Federation of Fishermen's Associations

Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol
Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance

Claire Morris	Clerc Clerk
Meriel Singleton	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 2.36 p.m.
The meeting began at 2.36 p.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Alun Davies:** Galwaf y cyfarfod i drefn. Diolch yn fawr am eich presenoldeb y prynhawn yma. Dechreuaf drwy ymddiheuro am yr oedi cyn dechrau'r cyfarfod—yr oedd hynny am resymau y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth.

Alun Davies: I call the meeting to order. Thank you for your attendance this afternoon. I start by apologising for the delay in starting the meeting—it was due to reasons beyond our control.

2.37 p.m.

Ymchwiliad i Gynhyrchu a Hybu Bwyd Cymreig
Inquiry into Production and Promotion of Welsh Food

[2] **Alun Davies:** Croesawaf Jeremy Percy o Gyddfederasiwn Cymdeithasau Pysgotwyr Cymru ac Edward Morgan o Bwydydd Castell Howell, sy'n rhoi tystiolaeth fel rhan o'n hymchwiliad i fwyd yng Nghymru. Gwerthfawrogwn eich bod yn rhoi o'ch amser y prynhawn yma. Cawsom gyfle i ystyried eich tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig ac yr ydym wedi cyffwrdd â sawl agwedd ar

Alun Davies: I welcome Jeremy Percy from the Welsh Federation of Fishermen's Associations and Edward Morgan from Castell Howell Foods, who are providing evidence as part of our inquiry into food in Wales. We appreciate your giving of your time this afternoon. We have had an opportunity to consider your written evidence and have touched on many aspects of your

eich gwaith yn ein sesiynau tystiolaeth blaenorol. A ydych am wneud unrhyw sylwadau agoriadol? Ar ôl hynny, bydd Aelodau'n gofyn eu cwestiynau.

work in our previous evidence sessions. Do you wish to make any opening remarks? After that, the Members will ask their questions.

[3] **Mr Morgan:** Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu. **Mr Morgan:** I do not have anything to add.

[4] **Alun Davies:** How about you, Mr Percy?

[5] **Mr Percy:** I think that we have probably explained most issues in our written submission, but I wish to stress the serious problems faced by the industry and the potential that it has for Wales in terms of food production and so on. This was best summed up by Aneurin Bevan, who said that Wales was an island built mainly on coal and surrounded by fish; but what most people forget is that he went on to say that only an organisational genius could arrange a shortage of both at the same time. We face the opposite in terms of fish at the moment—there are a great deal of fish around our coast, but we do not have the wherewithal to catch, process, move and sell them.

[6] **Alun Davies:** Thank you. Speaking as someone who comes from Charles Street, Tredegar, I particularly appreciate your reference to the most famous boy from our street—the most famous until now.

[7] I should have said in my introduction that we have received apologies from Brynle Williams.

[8] Over the last few months, we have been focusing on how we produce food in Wales—from the producers, on farms and in fisheries, to the plate and the consumer. We will report on this in the coming months. We are looking at elements of the supply chain and its management and areas where the Government can intervene and improve its current performance and where it needs to address particular problems. We are having this additional meeting because we have received considerable evidence that it is difficult to source local produce in different parts of Wales. Could you outline any difficulties that you have encountered and describe your experiences of sourcing the supply of local produce? Perhaps you would like to start, Mr Morgan.

[9] **Mr Morgan:** Certainly. Perhaps I should have made an opening statement although I probably could not have matched Jeremy's. Are you familiar with Castell Howell's work?

[10] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As you are a constituent of mine, I am, yes.

2.40 p.m.

[11] **Mr Morgan:** We are in the heart of Carmarthenshire. There are always challenges in sourcing local food, but there are also challenges in sourcing global food, especially in the past 18 to 24 months. I think that the first step is to define 'local food'—I am not sure whether you have your own definition—and find out what people mean by 'local food'. The common belief is that it is food produced within 30 miles of the point of consumption; however, I cast the net much wider for my definition and classify 'local food' as 'regional food'. I classify anything that is produced in Wales as regional because, from our point of view, we supply the whole of Wales and the west of England, so we cannot pinpoint or market products as being specifically local because what is local in Cardiganshire is not local to our customers in Cardiff. We look at it from a regional point of view and anything that is Welsh is good and fits in with our marketing.

[12] On difficulties in sourcing, in Wales we are very strong in the dairy and meat sectors. We have difficulty sourcing vegetables that are from Wales or that are predominantly from Wales. There are quite a few value-added products sourced from Wales. There are quite a few companies in the Valleys and actually across Wales—from Bangor down to Cardiff—that add value to Welsh produce by making curries, lasagnes and so on. The challenge for us is to identify new suppliers who can meet our requirements and our customers' requirements, on auditing, hygiene, security and traceability. We have a pretty stable foundation and a good supply base because we have built up relationships with suppliers over the past five to 10 years. On the challenges of sourcing local products, it depends where you are and what you want. I know that that is a bit vague. We supply our customers with a range of regional produce and if they are looking to get very local produce, such as meat from a local farm, that is something that we can offer, but it would be by coincidence more than by design.

[13] **Alun Davies:** Thank you for that evidence, Mr Morgan. You said that you have some difficulties sourcing vegetables, which resonates with evidence that we have received in past sessions. Could you outline the problems that you face and how you overcome them?

[14] **Mr Morgan:** With vegetables, it is just about availability. We have been buying mushrooms from a chap in the Vale of Glamorgan, potatoes on an ad hoc basis from Pembrokeshire, and swede from a local farmer, but generally there is a dearth of vegetable suppliers who supply us. That is not to say that there are no suppliers, but they go through other companies like the Really Welsh Trading Company and Puffin Produce Ltd. There are vegetables out there, but perhaps there is not enough of a surplus to sell to us. If there is a surplus, we get the grade B vegetables as opposed to the grade A, which tend to go to the supermarkets.

[15] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn ofyn cwestiwn ynglŷn â llysiau. Yr ydym wedi derbyn tystiolaeth eisoes ei bod yn anodd iawn cael gfael ar bobl sy'n gallu darparu llysiau'n gyson. A ydych yn dilyn y tymhorau o ran llysiau? Yn sicr, yn yr archfarchnadoedd, yr ydych yn gallu cael llysiau ar unrhyw adeg o'r flwyddyn. A ydych yn dilyn tymhorau traddodiadol Cymru neu a ydych yn mewnfario i sicrhau cyflenwad pan nad yw'r tymhorau'n caniatáu?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would like to ask a question about vegetables. We have already received evidence that it is very difficult to get hold of people who can supply vegetables regularly. Do you follow the seasons with vegetables? In the supermarkets, you can buy vegetables at any time of the year. Do you follow the traditional seasons of Wales or do you import produce to guarantee your supply when certain vegetables are not in season?

[16] **Mr Morgan:** Yr ydym yn ceisio cyflenwi ein cwsmeriaid, felly ar hyn o bryd nid ydym yn dilyn y tymhorau. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni edrych arno yn ystod y flwyddyn neu'r ddwy flynedd nesaf. Os yw ein cwsmeriaid eisiau cynnyrch penodol ac nid ydynt yn gallu ei brynu gennym ni, efallai yr ânt at un o'n cystadleuwyr, ac mae'n rhaid inni hybu ein busnes ein hunain. Ar hyn o bryd, nid ydym yn eu dilyn o gwbl.

Mr Morgan: We try to supply our customers and therefore, at the moment, we do not follow the seasons. However, that is something that we need to look at in the next year or two. If our customers want to buy specific produce and they cannot buy it from us, they might go to one of our competitors and we have to promote our own business. At the moment, we do not follow the seasons at all.

[17] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Onid oes symudiad tuag at wneud hynny?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Is there not a movement towards doing so?

[18] **Mr Morgan:** Oes.

Mr Morgan: Yes.

[19] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych chi wedi dweud eich bod yn ystyried gwneud hynny ac mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn dychwelyd at y tymhorau traddodiadol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You have said that you are considering doing so and more and more people are returning to the traditional seasons.

[20] **Mr Morgan:** Oes, ond nid wyf yn credu bod digon o'n cwsmeriaid yn dymuno gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd i gyfiawnhau peidio â gwerthu mefus y tu allan i'r tymor mefus ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym yn cyflenwi mefus drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Maent naill ai'n dod o Loegr—o Henffordd neu ardal Ross-on-Wye—neu o dramor.

Mr Morgan: Yes, there are, but I do not think that enough of our customers want to do that at the moment in order for us to justify not selling strawberries outside the strawberry season and so on. We supply strawberries throughout the year. They either come from England—from Hereford or the Ross-on-Wye area—or from abroad.

[21] **Mick Bates:** Thank you very much, both, for your opening remarks. I would just like to pursue the issue that you raised, Edward, about 'local' and 'regional'. Will you give a bit more detail about why you have moved away from the use of the word 'local'?

[22] **Mr Morgan:** 'Local' can be a bit ambiguous. We offer pan-Wales distribution and wholesaling. For example, we buy our Welsh yoghurts from Llaeth y Llan up in Denbigh, and because of our distribution network, we collect from there and haul the products back to our depot in Cross Hands. For us to label the yoghurt as local would be stretching things a bit for our customers in Carmarthen. I sometimes feel that if you are looking for local produce for customers in Newport, for example, what is local for them, in terms of mileage within a certain radius from their pub in Caerleon, Cwmbran, or wherever, would probably stretch into Gloucestershire and Herefordshire. To say that 'local' means within a 30 to 40 mile radius would probably work against us, so it is best to adopt a regional approach to sourcing products.

[23] There would be operational challenges if we were to go very local, because we would probably end up having to list five yoghurts, staying with that example, from five different suppliers, and that in itself would create some operational challenges.

[24] **Mick Bates:** How often do you go out to tender? Presumably, when you go out to tender, you do so on a regional basis.

[25] **Mr Morgan:** We do not have a formal tendering process for our regional suppliers. We go out to tender for our bulk items, such as chips, frozen vegetables, and other lines. However, for the regional products, the process is built on trust and relationships, and that is better for us than formal tenders to our Welsh suppliers.

[26] **Mick Bates:** How long would a contract last?

[27] **Mr Morgan:** There are no contracts for our regional suppliers; it is open-ended. As long as we agree a price, and so long as the availability and quality do not change, we continue trading. We do not have any formal agreements with our regional suppliers.

[28] **Mick Bates:** That sounds very much like how we operate, Chair, as farmers. There is no contract; it is done on price. If there is a problem—say the food was bad—do you get rid of many suppliers?

[29] **Mr Morgan:** We have not needed to do that in the past. We do get complaints and we have a customer services department to deal with them, but if you have built up trust with the supplier, then most things can be overcome.

[30] **Alun Davies:** Thank you very much for that evidence, Mr Morgan. Mr Percy, the original question, which we are still discussing, is that of the sourcing and supplying of local produce in Wales.

[31] **Mr Percy:** I speak as a representative of the supply industry, and our main problem is that there is no supply chain at all. There is effectively no added-value processing. It is not exactly an embarrassing state of affairs, but it is not far short of that. I think the reasons are historical. Looking back briefly at the history of the Welsh fishing industry, which was initially centred around Swansea, Milford Haven and Holyhead, you had conglomerations of boats that regularly produced lots of fish, and regular supply was important to continuity. You had the cockle train from Burry Port, and in its heyday you had two trains a day from Milford carrying fish up to London and elsewhere. That was great while it lasted, but as we all know, to our shame, it did not last very long. Now, the fishing industry in Wales, of about 400-odd boats, is scattered around harbours, inlets, as well as off the beach, with a few in Holyhead and Swansea as the main ports—they are mostly scattered. That means that they focus primarily on lobster and crab, mainly using pots, and that accounts for a vast percentage of what is landed. That is the maritime equivalent of having all your eggs in one basket. The industry now is a good example of that, in that brown crab—edible crab—was a mainstay. The market was predominantly for live crabs, taken by vivier trucks straight across the Channel to France, Spain or even Italy sometimes. That market has changed dramatically. It has been grossly oversupplied, mainly by very big, vivier-type vessels; that is, 30m boats that fish offshore and catch vast quantities of, I have to say, poor-quality product. There is a high mortality rate from just shipping the catch off in bulk to whomever wants it.

[32] At the same time, the buyers on the continent have changed. Traditionally, the housewife would go to market, buy a live crab, cook it, pull it to pieces and feed the family. Then the market moved to vacuum-packed, ready-cooked crabs, because many of these women go out to work. Now, because of the poor quality, they are not buying that product, and that has had a major knock-on effect on Welsh boats. That encompasses, as much as anything, the recently identified need to be able to diversify effort, methods and certain species taken. To do that, we do not need to reinvent the wheel.

2.50 p.m.

[33] At present, the landing infrastructure, irrespective of species, is nigh-on non-existent in most harbours and areas along the Welsh coast. Effectively, there is no supply chain between landing the fish and whoever you might want to get it to, especially with regard to live fish such as shellfish. When you catch fish they start to deteriorate in quality. You need an advanced supply chain, which we do not have. We also need added value. Our agricultural colleagues have at least some system in place, whether good, bad or indifferent. We have always been an insular industry—we have never worked with others; it is probably hard enough for farmers to work together, and if you think that that is difficult, try fishermen. For instance, the rural development plan has a supply chain efficiency scheme, which I have only come across recently, and we need to integrate more with other people who are moving similar stuff to similar locations. So, we are starting from a baseline of nearly zero. The benefit of that is that we have everything to play for, and we could manage the supplies that we have in good quantities in Welsh waters very effectively if we used that approach well.

[34] **Alun Davies:** Thank you very much for that. If Members have no questions, I will pursue a few issues of my own. Are you familiar with the Welsh Assembly Government's fisheries strategy?

[35] **Mr Percy:** Yes, I wrote the commercial section of it.

[36] **Alun Davies:** That probably makes my second question redundant, but I will ask it anyway. Should we assume that the section you wrote fulfils the objectives that you would have for it?

[37] **Mr Percy:** Very largely, yes. It was a very good example of proper co-management participation in those early days, and I am very grateful to the Assembly for that opportunity. For the first time, not just in Wales but in the UK and probably further afield as well, it gave a real and meaningful stakeholder involvement in the development of the strategy, rather than, with the greatest of respect, civil servants producing something and asking ‘What do you think?’—that stakeholders were involved at the baseline. It shows that that made a significant difference. It is a vision document, and we are finalising an implementation plan so that the strategy is implemented—‘wish list’ is the wrong phrase, but it is an aspirational document. The implementation plan says ‘We are going to do this, this and this—this is the responsibility of whoever it is.’ The strategy and the implementation plan provide the building blocks for the future sustainable development of the fishing industry in Wales. On their own, they are building blocks, but they are brought together with support from the Assembly Government and the industry.

[38] I noticed in some of the evidence given that Mr Williams, although he was talking about agriculture, commented on the need for a significant culture change in working together and moving things forward. We have exactly the same threat and opportunity in the fishing industry, which should not be underestimated because culture change is not comfortable for most people. However, we need to do that in Wales with the fishing industry if we are to survive and prosper.

[39] **Mick Bates:** Thank you for that reply to the Chair. What work are you doing to estimate the market in Wales, such as restaurants and retail?

[40] **Mr Percy:** There are two things happening. The Welsh Assembly fisheries unit has taken on consultants called Levercliff Associates Ltd, which is looking at the multiple side of things and the opportunities there may or may not be in that respect. It is not a flippant comment, but we have received serious support from the Minister for Rural Affairs in this respect, part of which was to provide us with support to have a stand at the Royal Welsh Show and the winter fair show. The Royal Welsh Show was very much an awareness-raising exercise, and we ran a questionnaire at the same time. Jaundiced or not, I was extremely heartened. Normally with questionnaires you have to stop people and ask them questions—and we had groups of people doing that—but there was almost a queue sometimes of people who wanted to make the point that they were keen and recognised the value of locally produced fish and fish products from Welsh waters. I was surprised and pleased with the awareness of many of the Welsh public that visited the stand and with the fact that they understood not the detail, but certainly the broad issues in relation to fishing, sustainability and so on. It was heartening that we were able to explain about the very sustainable way in which we are approaching things.

[41] As we are starting off from this base level, we have an opportunity as a nation, collectively, to write the script. We are not trying to reinvent the wheel, and there are some good opportunities. So, we pursued that and we have the responses from the questionnaire, which were hugely supportive. We are now in a bit of a chicken-and-egg situation. On the one hand, you need a market to develop a product, but you need to develop a product to get the market. I am grateful for the delay to the start of this meeting, because Edward and I have had a helpful chat over the last half-hour about fishcakes. With a bit of luck, we may be able to do something there. That is precisely the situation; we need to work together to try to identify markets and to look at the supply chain. In Cornwall, there is any number of businesses with an internet-based supply system. One of the questions that we asked in this questionnaire was, ‘How could you get your supply of fish?’ People felt that, with the courier systems that are in

place in Wales now, there are opportunities for that sort of thing. There is any number of vans. As you will know from the evidence that has already been given to you, vans are running up and down Wales, back and forth, and, if things were integrated, we could benefit from that collectively.

[42] **Alun Davies:** Perhaps we should delay the start of every meeting, and actually get some work done. [*Laughter.*]

[43] **Mick Bates:** To come back on that, from your answer, I think that you have undertaken some market research to see what is available. The half-hour delay was obviously fruitful, if you can get your fishcakes down to Castell Howell, but what will be the major target? Will it be restaurants in the locality or will it be retailers?

[44] **Mr Percy:** It is across the board. In this situation, you should leave no stone unturned. We have the potential for such a diverse range of species and products derived from that. For instance, a local fisherman in my area, Pembrokeshire, has a 12m boat, his sons run it and it is a typically Welsh, efficient and effective family working its boat. They mainly catch lobster and crab, and the market is as I have explained. He has done two things. First, he has started a dry transport system to China, through which he is flying stuff out and making quite good profits, albeit in a small way. That is cutting-edge technology and I am very impressed with it. Equally—

[45] **Mick Bates:** What is the cutting-edge technology involved in putting it on an aeroplane?

[46] **Mr Percy:** You have to use technology, because crabs die; if you take them out of water, they are not terribly happy. So, you have to persuade them that they are still in water, which we do by chilling them down to a given temperature, so they reach about 2 or 3 degrees and fall asleep. You can take them out and they are not bright enough to realise that they have been taken out of the water. You can pack them dry in an insulated box, put them on an aeroplane to China for 30-odd hours, where the boxes are opened up and they are warmed up, and they get out and think, ‘Good Lord, where am I?’

[47] **Alun Davies:** A bit like politicians here. [*Laughter.*]

[48] **Mick Bates:** That is the way for them to overcome any nerves about flying.

[49] **Mr Percy:** That is right. Just put them to sleep. Those crabs must be of a very good quality. He has chosen to process the other stuff, selling it entirely locally in Wales. He and his partner are working hard. They have a team that is doing the processing, and they deliver the product themselves. He cannot keep up with the demand; he cannot even touch it. To give one example, I was talking to him on the way up, because we are doing something else together, and he is manically busy with his team, because he had an order from a London restaurant for 7.5 kg of white crab meat and 7.5 kg of brown crab meat. The team got it ready, phoned the guy up in London and said, ‘Your order is ready’. He said, ‘That was quick for 75 kg of each’. He had put the decimal point in the wrong place and actually wanted 150 kg of meat, which is something like 1 tonne of crab. This at very good prices.

[50] My point is that there is an overt demand and a latent demand, because people are increasingly recognising the health benefits of fish and shellfish. That is not marketing blurb, it is about omega 3 and so on—I do not need to bore you with that. Our products come packed with it; brown crab meat has the highest omega 3 content of any creature, on land or sea. So, we are pushing what should be an open door in that respect. We can follow that up with the other species that I have mentioned in my written response. There is a whole range of fish and fish products that we can help meet the demand for, latent and otherwise. That is not

only around Wales, but Wales is good, especially in terms of public procurement. I am extremely enthusiastic—this is where our earlier conversation came in—about fishcakes made from sustainably caught Welsh fish, using potatoes from Pembrokeshire or wherever. So, the fish are caught locally and the fishcakes created locally. This is by the same fishery that, in Cornwall, has Marine Stewardship Council accreditation.

3.00 p.m.

[51] Hand-line mackerel fishing is not hugely efficient; it is not a purse seiner or a pair trawler taking hundreds of tonnes at a time. It is fishermen, by their own hands, catching fish on a hook and line. There are no discards; it is an entirely live catch. If you catch fish that are too small, you put them back and they swim away. This sort of example, this sort of artisan approach, is in contrast to almost any other industry, where you want high efficiency. You do not want that in Wales; you want the community-based rural benefits of a large number of small boats, which are not necessarily high-tech, because the use of high-tech boats in other areas of the United Kingdom and further afield has resulted in the demise of fish stocks, which is not what we want.

[52] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I must admit that when I occasionally holiday in Brittany, I am amazed at the way in which the fish markets work there, where you have small villages and ports selling fish throughout the world and everything is done by telephone. People also buy online these days, presumably. I take your point that perhaps that is not the way for Wales to go. We have an industry that is based on small companies. From what you are telling me, a great deal of work has been done on sourcing and identifying where the fish are and what is available. You have done some work on marketing, but you have not done the selling part—well apart from saying something to Edward this afternoon. We had evidence from Justin Baird-Murray from the Metropole Hotel in Llandrindod. He told us that he just cannot source fish in the quantity that he needs for his restaurant in the Metropole. You are telling us that the fish is available and you know where it is, so how do you get that fish to Justin Baird-Murray and the other Baird-Murrays around Wales who are running fairly large establishments?

[53] **Mr Percy:** You have hit the nail on the head. That is the problem; we have plenty of fish in the sea and we have good boats, so we need to do some education, and they need some other equipment to catch stuff. We have had the benefit of a relatively small amount of money, in Government terms, from the Minister to get some interim aid equipment, which is some catching stuff, some processing stuff and so forth. It was a shame that we were not able to get any sort of transport to move stuff around. It is okay to fit into a supply chain that runs at regular times, but if you have to collect two boxes of fish at Burry Port at 3 a.m., couriers are very expensive.

[54] To answer your question, we are not attempting to reinvent the wheel because our agricultural colleagues have been there before us. You need to have the facilities to land and to store the fish, and then to deliver the fish, which is the bit that is missing. Hopefully, after some 19 months' delay, we will get some European fisheries funding, which follows on from the small amount of European funding that we had in a previous round. That will be focused very much on filling in this gap between the catching and everything else. We need to assist the guys to diversify to catch that broader range of species with a wider range of gear to make things much more secure. The aid that we hope to get will go towards putting that in place—you need holding and chiller facilities. You need some processing facilities, probably centrally based, so that you are not doing it in small bits and pieces. I would stress the need to cover all bets, so you need some sort of centralised facility. If you were going to produce fishcakes and other bits and pieces, you would probably need some sort of central facility and you may well be able to tie that in with some of our aquaculture colleagues. At the same time, that sort of local supply to local hotels should be done on an ad hoc, individual fisherman

basis or with more groups of fishermen coming together. It is that aid that we need to put in place.

[55] You are quite right. We have both ends, if you like. The Assembly is doing much the same in terms of the fisheries unit: identifying that need and fulfilling it. That is not difficult. I do not say so just because I am a fisherman or represent the fishing industry, but we have the most fantastic range of products that tick all of the boxes that people want ticked. They also need managing properly—which is the other side of the agenda—in having effective management plans for these species, notwithstanding the vagaries of the common fisheries policy and the failures that that has brought us. The species should then be available for the future, in terms of food security, which will be a key issue for us.

[56] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you have a rough timescale for that? When will you start the process? You have done the sourcing element and the marketing, and you tell us that you had hoped that they would start building the storage facilities now. When do you hope you can actively be selling the product?

[57] **Mr Percy:** I had a discussion with the food marketing development division folk recently about the Wales the True Taste awards, and we have undertaken to provide a significantly increased range of products for the awards next year. In general terms, that would be a sensible target for some products; others can, effectively, be done now. Live rod-and-line-caught and long-line-caught bass, get a much better price elsewhere, and in local markets, than the fishermen are getting now. That is one of the diversification initiatives that we are pushing—we are providing long-line fishing gear, which uses hooks, with live catches, no discards, and so on, to a range of fishermen to give them an idea. We are providing mackerel-catching equipment, the hook and line stuff, as we speak; it will be circulated around Wales in the next couple of weeks.

[58] We are also involved in a range of other projects to develop rope-grown mussels. There is a buoyant mussel business in the Menai straits in north Wales, which is worth £14 million per year. However, that is specifically for a continental market—it goes to Holland in bulk. People who have been to Brittany often say that one of the first French phrases that they learn is ‘moules frites’, and tourists just live on mussels and chips all the time, yet you cannot buy them in this country. We have developed a system to grow them on ropes that are manageable by fishermen with the kit that they have now, so that they can supply them locally to hotels and restaurants and so on, right up to the Chinese example that I gave you. It is happening now, it has a bit of momentum, and as long as the European Fisheries Fund kicks in, it can continue to develop. I have fished around the UK and sold fish around Europe in past lives, and have seen that we do not just need a can-do approach; we need a must-do approach to this. Yes, there are requirements that we have to follow for European aid, God help us, but we need to be proactive and positive about this if we are to get the best out of it. Otherwise we will stand still or go backwards, and that is not acceptable. This is very much the last-chance saloon for us.

[59] **Alun Davies:** Returning to Mr Morgan, what do you believe the Welsh Assembly Government can and should do to encourage further collaboration in the supply chain?

[60] **Mr Morgan:** We are all too familiar with the costs of running vehicles, warehouses and staff, and our major customers are looking for stringent audit procedures, which carry a cost. You can have a locally based supply chain, but there seem to be lots of vans running up and down the length and breadth of Wales, which is adding to the cost. I am aware that there are supply chain initiative projects, and I have been speaking to someone in mid Wales who is awaiting funding for that, but it seems to be the case that the food is where the people are not in Wales—in mid Wales, you have a wealth of red meat and dairy products, but the people are all down here in south Wales or across the A55.

[61] **Alun Davies:** Those are not insurmountable difficulties or large distances, are they?

[62] **Mr Morgan:** No. I am not sure whether I can contribute much on specific supply chain initiatives. To take a simple supply chain—the milk and dairy supply to ourselves—one of the largest dairies, if not the largest, closed last week in Bridgend, on Thursday or Friday, which was very sad. So, without a strong base of suppliers, and somewhere for them to process their milk or their meat, the supply chain will be concentrated on some of the larger players, which would probably include ourselves in Wales.

[63] **Alun Davies:** What needs to change for primary producers and suppliers? What steps could the Assembly Government take to help primary producers and suppliers to meet the demand of businesses such as yours?

[64] **Mr Morgan:** Our demands, as we have grown over the past couple of years, have been reasonably well met. I do not know whether this will answer your question, but numerous suppliers are going into business making preserves, jams, pickles, burgers, and so on—whether organic or non-organic—and there seems to be a plethora of smaller suppliers who are supplying for a lifestyle choice, possibly, or are happy to supply local restaurants.

3.10 p.m.

[65] As far as new suppliers are concerned, on a local basis, they seem to be cannibalising each other's sales. For example, in Wales we are quite well served with artisan cheeses at the moment, but if a new supplier came onto the market making, say, Brecon cheese, in all likelihood, it would steal sales from another Welsh supplier. Even a farmers' co-operative looking to enter the food service sector with branded produce would steal sales from another farmers' co-operative. That is why the fish idea caught my imagination. Jeremy and I had a chat about fishcakes and I thought, 'This is new'. I do not think that we have fishcakes made with Welsh fish, so that is something new that we can offer the market.

[66] The commercial reality is that local or regional produce tends to be more expensive. We had an interesting morning in the Stradey Park Hotel last Friday—and I imagine that you have been down to Llanelli—with Simon Wright, who has been on television, of Y Polyn restaurant. We had a blind tasting of black pudding, bacon, eggs and sausages. That brought home the commercial realities, because the nicest black pudding was the Welsh black pudding, but the black pudding that we sell to that establishment is £1.50 a kilogram while the regional black pudding was £7 a kilogram, and so it was with the other produce. If the hotel were to buy Welsh cured bacon, it would cost between £2,000 and £3,000 more a year. So, the suppliers coming in need to be commercially switched on, to understand the market that they want to target. If they are targeting a market, there is the question of whether they are cannibalising the sales of another regional supplier, who may live a few miles down the road.

[67] **Alun Davies:** Why are the costs so much greater? That is a considerable disparity in the costs.

[68] **Mr Morgan:** In those examples, they were quite considerable. The other sausages were 20p and the local sausages were 30p, which is a 50 per cent increase. I suggest that it is down to the economies of scale that, as we discussed, are not there in Wales. To add value to regional produce and make it more interesting, in the case of fishcakes for example, there might be manufacturing hubs that can add value to the produce. I suggest that the reason regional and local produce tends to be more expensive is because of the quality of the ingredients and the absence of economies of scale.

[69] **Mick Bates:** You have made some interesting comments there, and they lead us into

the question that I would like to ask Jeremy. When you talked about processing and your work with the Government to provide this, Jeremy, it seemed that there were two levels of operation. The first was independent suppliers supplying directly into restaurants, which is their business. Then, as we have just heard from Edward, there are the high costs of local processing, or whatever is necessary. You say that you would like there to be one centre in Wales rather than lots of local ones. Why would that be a better scenario than having one in the north, one in the south, and one in Aberystwyth perhaps?

[70] **Mr Percy:** It would be brave of me to be firm on that, to be honest. We need to do some work on that aspect to identify the costs and benefits. At present, there is an economy of scale in producing stuff in quantity in one place, whether that is in mid Wales or north Wales—and we joke that Aberystwyth is mutually inconvenient to everybody. Fish move around the coast. For mackerel, for instance, there is an earlier season in north Wales and a later season in south Wales, so if you put the processing hub in the north of north Wales, you will have to move stuff a long way for some parts of the season. I would not presume to say, ‘Yes, without doubt, we need one, two or three hubs in mid, north and south Wales’; it is about wherever the best economies of scale are. Edward makes a very important point that an economy of scale is the key, because there is absolutely no use in providing a product that is too expensive, especially if it is in competition with other products. So, the question is entirely valid; the answer, I am afraid, is slightly vague. However, we will have to focus on that now. That is why we have a Welsh fisheries strategy and the implementation plan and, as I said earlier, it is now about having building blocks towards what might be termed the ‘national’ development plan. From the perspective of the federation that I represent, it is vital that we take a strategic approach across the board. The last thing that we want, as Ed quite rightly said, is to see supplier pitted against supplier, fishermen’s association against fishermen’s association, and so on. We need to take that overall strategic approach. In those terms, the first thing that one would need to do is get some pretty expert advice on whether it should be one, three, or however many hubs.

[71] It was very interesting to look briefly at some of the other evidence that you have received. I noted that the Organic Centre Wales had provided a Raphael report, and I must admit that I read it with—well, ‘irritation’ is too strong a word, but you know what I mean. It is talking about the supply chain, integration and selling things, marketing and the flow of goods. I have been vaguely aware of that, because, as I said, I have recently been appointed to the strategic food and drink advisory group, which has broadened my perspective. I am not blaming anyone, as it is very much our own fault as an industry, but we have always been insular. We are only now beginning to learn that there is a supply chain efficiency scheme—a Raphael—operating in Wales. A lot of work is being done. It is not a panacea, but it does help with at least some of it. Anything at this stage is better than nothing. On the question that you asked earlier about what the Assembly Government can do, someone needs to integrate the supply chain in Wales, whether it is for Edward, us, farmers, or whomever else.

[72] **Mick Bates:** I will just go back to the processing if I may. In relation to support, you mentioned PESCA—

[73] **Mr Percy:** The European fisheries fund is the new one.

[74] **Mick Bates:** That is the new one. There is also the rural development plan. As we understand it, a lot of the funding will disappear in 2013.

[75] **Mr Percy:** It will indeed.

[76] **Mick Bates:** So, you do not have a very big window to find out where you are going to put your processing plant and apply for the grant. What is currently being done to get all that in place before 2013?

[77] **Mr Percy:** It is a boring answer, but we are in discussions. The Welsh Assembly Government has a new fisheries unit, which used to be the environment, planning and countryside division, but it has now changed its name to the Food, Fish and Market Development Division. They are all new folk bar one, because the division has been moved from Cardiff to Aberystwyth. It is an entirely new team, so it is taking time to find its feet, which is entirely understandable. The European fisheries funding was ostensibly supposed to be available on 1 January 2008, but it is still not on the table in Wales. The first meeting of the selection panel to decide on bids will be held on 2 July 2009. That 19-month delay has slowed us down significantly. Having said that, there is a growing impetus that we can benefit from. So, as we speak, we are in discussion with the Welsh Assembly Government and others. The remainder of the year will be very exciting, as it will firm up what we need to do to get the maximum benefit.

[78] **Mick Bates:** On a subject that irritates me and many other people immensely, you mentioned the 19-month delay on the European funding side. Can you be a little more specific on that, because it has an impact on many business plans, and those of small businesses in particular?

[79] **Mr Percy:** It has an absolutely massive impact. We have organisations and businesses that, frankly, will fail unless we are extremely fortunate. The funding for the four fishermen's associations expired at the end of last September, and the federation has, luckily, been able to support their core services on the basis that the European fisheries fund would be around the corner. 'Around the corner' now will not be until 2 July. Then, of course, there are the inordinate delays in getting the money after you have put your claims in. It could have serious ramifications around Wales, but it is, effectively, out of our hands. There has been a range of delays and, in essence, we are sitting here with our fingers crossed.

[80] **Mick Bates:** Is it possible to provide a little more detail on that? It seems to me that we need to take more immediate action on that.

[81] **Alun Davies:** Perhaps Mr Percy could write us a note on these matters. If you could send that to the clerk, we can take the matter up.

[82] **Mr Percy:** Yes, of course.

[83] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn symud atoch chi, Edward, a'r disgrifiad a roesoch o'r berthynas rhyngoch chi a'r bobl sy'n cyflenwi'r cwmni—mae wedi'i seilio ar ymddiriedaeth. Mae'n ffordd waraidd iawn, hyd y gwelaf, o gytuno o fewn y broses honno, ac yn dra gwahanol i rai enghreifftiau yr ydym yn clywed amdanynt o ran contractau. Mae ymddiriedaeth mewn brand yn eithriadol o bwysig, onid yw? Mae'n bwysig i Gastell Howell. Mae ganddo'r brand mawr Celtic Pride. Mae pobl yn gwybod beth y byddant yn ei gael gyda'r brand hwnnw, a pha safon y bydd y cynnyrch. Mae awgrym wedi cael ei wneud inni fel pwyllgor y byddai'n beth da cael marc safonol Cymreig.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I want to turn to you, Edward, and the description that you gave of the relationship between you and those who supply the company—it is very much based on trust. That is a civilised way, as I see it, of coming to an agreement within that process, and is quite different from some of the examples that we hear about in relation to contracts. Trust in a brand is very important, is it not? It is important for Castell Howell. It has the well-known Celtic Pride brand. People know what they will be getting with that brand, and what the standard of that produce will be. It has been suggested to us as a committee that it would be a good thing to have a Welsh kitemark.

3.20 p.m.

[84] Mae enghreifftiau i'w cael, fel Mr Welshegg, lle nad yw'r wyau yn dod o Gymru o gwbl, ond o Sbaen neu o wlad arall. Dim ond digwydd cael eu rhoi mewn blychau yng Nghymru a gaiff y wyau. A oes lle i rywbeth a fyddai'n sicrhau bod cynnyrch sydd wedi'i labelu felly yn dod o Gymru? A fyddai gwerth i hynny?

[85] **Mr Morgan:** Byddwn yn dweud bod. Dylai cig coch gario label Hybu Cig Cymru a label dynodiad daearyddol gwarchoddedig, yn enwedig cig oen a chig eidion. O safbwynt labeli ychwanegol, teimlaf ambell waith bod gormod o labeli ar fwyd. Efallai bod y person sydd yn y gwesty neu'r siop yn cael ei ddrysio rhywfaint gan y tractor coch, label 'Food from Scotland' neu PGI Hybu Cig Cymru ac ati. Mae gennym label yng Nghymru ond nid yw'r cwsmer yn ei deall yn iawn, sef label 'Cymru y Gwir Flas'. Efallai y byddai modd ei ddatblygu. Pobl sydd wedi ennill y wobr sy'n cario label 'Cymru y Gwir Flas'; nid yw'n label o ansawdd yn gyffredinol.

[86] Mae ansawdd yn oddrychol. Mae ansawdd y cynnyrch yr ydym yn ei gyflenwi i ysbtyai ac ysgolion, sef arlwyo'r sector cost, yn dibynnu ar y pris. Os ydynt am dalu 15c am selsigen, dyna'r cyfan sydd ganddynt i'w wario, a selsigen gwerth 15c a gânt. Mae'n bosibl dadlau na fydd ansawdd y selsigen gystal ag eraill, ond byddai o Gymru. Felly, a yw'n deg bod hwnnw'n cario'r un label â selsigen sydd o well ansawdd, gyda bach mwy o gig ac sydd bach yn fwy bras?

[87] Felly, byddwn yn awgrymu bod cig coch yn iawn gyda label Hybu Cig Cymru, tra bod popeth yn cael ei archwilio drwy'r PGI ac yn y blaen, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddai hynny'n gweithio gyda chynnyrch yn gyffredinol gan na fyddai'r ansawdd yn gyson. Efallai y byddai rhai cwsmeriaid yn disgwyl ansawdd uchel a, phe bai'n dirywio, byddant yn colli ffydd yn y label. Mae'n rhywbeth i feddwl amdano, ond ni chredaf ein bod yn barod ar hyn o bryd.

[88] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch yn fawr. Yr oedd hwnnw'n ateb diddorol iawn. Y duedd yw i edrych ar yr ochr gadarnhaol yn unig, sef y byddai nodi bod cynnyrch yn

There are examples, such as Mr Welshegg, of eggs that did not come from Wales at all, but from Spain or another country. It is just that the eggs are packaged into boxes in Wales. Is there a place for something that would ensure that produce labelled as such comes from Wales? Is there any value in that?

Mr Morgan: I would say that there is. Red meat should carry the Meat Promotion Wales label and the protected geographical indication label, particularly lamb and beef. With regard to additional labelling, I sometimes feel that there are too many labels on food. Perhaps the person in a hotel or a shop is a little confused by the red tractor, the 'Food from Scotland' label, or the Meat Promotion Wales PGI label and so on. We have a label in Wales, but perhaps the customer does not understand it properly: the 'Wales the True Taste'. Perhaps that could be developed. It is those who have won the award who can carry the 'Wales the True Taste' label; it is not a general quality label.

Quality is subjective. The quality of the produce that we supply to hospitals and schools, namely cost-sector catering, is dependent on its price. If they want to pay 15p for a sausage, that is all that they have to spend, and a sausage worth 15p is what they will get. It is possible to argue that the quality of that sausage will not be as good as others, but it would be from Wales. So, is it fair for that to carry the same label as a sausage of better quality, which has more meat and is coarser?

So, we would suggest that red meat is fine with the Meat Promotion Wales label, as long as everything is audited through the PGI and so on, but I am not sure whether that would work for produce more generally given that the quality would not be consistent. Perhaps some customers would expect high quality and, if that deteriorated, they would lose faith in the label. It is something to think about, but I do not believe that we are ready to do that at the moment.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you. That was a very interesting answer. There is a tendency to look only at the positive side, namely that denoting produce as coming from Wales

dod o Gymru yn fanteisiol i'r cwsmer a'r cyflenwyr, ond mae'r pwynt am osod safonau y bwyd o Gymru yn rhywbeth nad yw wedi'i godi yn y dystiolaeth yr ydym wedi ei derbyn, hyd y cofiaf.

would be beneficial for the customer and the producer, but the point about setting standards for food from Wales is something that has not been raised in the evidence that we have received, as far as I can recall.

[89] **Mr Morgan:** Pwy fyddai'n plismona hynny i wneud yn siŵr bod popeth yn cyrraedd ansawdd arbennig? Efallai bod rhywun yng Nghymru yn cynhyrchu cynnyrch x ond efallai bod rhai o'r cynhwysion yn dod o dramor, a hynny o reidrwydd. Yn gyffredinol, byddai'n anodd sicrhau bod yr ansawdd yr un peth ar draws pob categori.

Mr Morgan: Who would police that to ensure that everything reached a certain standard? Perhaps someone in Wales is producing product x but some of the ingredients of that may come from overseas, by necessity. In general, it would be difficult to ensure that the quality was consistent in every category.

[90] **Alun Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes gennych ragor o gwestiynau, Rhodri?

Alun Davies: Thank you very much. Do you have any further questions, Rhodri?

[91] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes. The other question is to Jeremy about the changes in Europe and the common fisheries policy. Post 2012, everything will change. You have outlined some of your plans, but what do you need to do to ensure that you are positioned to move forward after 2012-13, because it is only three years away?

[92] **Mr Percy:** It is, and that point is extremely valid. For the first time with the CFP review in 2012, it is now talking seriously about more regional management, which we have been banging on about for some time. Without wishing to bore you, I will just say that the CFP has been an unmitigated disaster of epic proportion. It was supposed to protect fish-related jobs and stocks in European waters, but there has been a 30 to 60 per cent reduction in both over the lifetime of the policy. Even the fisheries commissioner in Europe, Joe Borg, has said publicly that it has been a disaster. That is not terribly hard to see; we have been telling him that for 30 years.

[93] There is a chink of light in that Europe is talking about regional management. The Green Paper specifically mentions a focus on small-scale coastal fishing. It recognises, at long last, the potential and specific benefits to local communities of that small-scale stuff. From a Welsh perspective, that is manna from heaven. We are talking to Assembly officials and we will ensure, as a federation, that we are entirely robust in our response to the review. As you rightly said, it matches the loss of any further European funding, which will undoubtedly be the case.

[94] We are told unofficially that, as a result of the increase in European member states, the aid after 2013 will be soaked up. On our industry's history of grant aid, we have never particularly looked for it, but we have been seriously disadvantaged. We received nothing under PESCA, the original grant, because the UK Government refused to match fund it, which was very helpful of it. The previous grant—the financial instrument for fisheries guidance fund—formed the basis of our development. I am talking about 500 individual fishermen who would not talk to each other and would hide around the corner until someone else had landed their fish so that they would not have to give away where they had been and how much they had caught and so on. That used to be the culture, but there has been a necessary change in that culture to get them to work together. So, where they used to say, 'We do not really want to tell anyone what we are doing because we have got a nice thing going here; we have a bit of fish', the culture now is to stand up and be counted to ensure that people like you, and the Welsh Assembly Government, recognise our value and provide the necessary support.

[95] We did not receive a great deal under FIFG and we need a reasonably good bite of the cherry now, bearing in mind that the European structural funds, over the course of what will hopefully be around six years, amount to £17 million in total. That is spread between commercial fishing, aquaculture, inland fishing and so on. So, we will only get a bit of that money. We need to make the most of it to form this framework and to build the foundations on which we can move forward. If we do what I explained that we want to do, then we will be able to stand on our own two feet. So, that is the thrust of where we want to go.

[96] I agree entirely on the quality side of things—we have a good story to tell about Welsh fish. They do it elsewhere; we do not have to reinvent the wheel, because people are already doing it well. We need to copy them and pinch their ideas. We are on such a low level that I hope that we can take advantage of these opportunities. I hope that we can proceed with the support of the Assembly Government, the European fishery funding and that must-do attitude. I speak from experience in saying that, for example, Ireland, Italy, France, and most of our European neighbours, have a more proactive approach to managing European funds. I do not, for a moment, suggest that we should be anything other than entirely above board and tick the correct boxes and fill in the forms, but there is an attitude that needs to prevail in Wales, if we are to get the best from it and maximise opportunities for the future.

[97] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** So, there is some optimism about 2012-13 in that it cannot get any worse and can only get better. You talk about getting support from the Welsh Assembly Government and the need for the system to be reasonably flexible, which other countries seem to have achieved, while we have tended to gold-plate the processes. What else do you want from the Welsh Assembly Government to help you get to 2013 and put you in a better position?

[98] **Mr Percy:** There is a plethora of stuff, both political and practical—the political side being European aid, that positive approach from officials and the willingness to work with stakeholders. There has been a refreshing change in Wales in terms of the development of the Welsh fisheries strategy, as I explained. Across the board, and certainly from a fisheries perspective, generally in society, stakeholders are no longer willing to accept that civil servants know best. A heartening principle about the Welsh approach is that we tend to work together. It is a small nation that affords the opportunity to do so. If you and your officials can encourage that kind of working, it would be extremely helpful. The practical side of things, as I hope I have explained, are already covered. There are huge opportunities. However, there are also huge threats, for example, the common fisheries policy review could be a disaster and there is the imposition of non-extractive zones around the Welsh coast to look forward to.

[99] There is a range of environmental and other legislation to consider, bearing in mind that our environmental credentials—and I say this quite seriously—are better than those anywhere else in Europe in terms of our effect on the environment; I say that advisedly. That is the case because we tend to work with static gear in small boats, which leads to fewer environmental effects. The political—with a small ‘p’—side of things is very much down to that collective approach.

3.30 p.m.

[100] We are currently in discussions and reviewing options for the co-management of fisheries. We were leading the way—nearly two and a half years ago, the federation that I represent put forward to the Welsh Assembly Government’s fisheries folk an approach based on species advisory groups, which, briefly, is about bringing fishermen in a certain locality who focus on specific species together. They know best, and know what happens; they are there every day. For officials and others to second-guess them is, frankly, a waste of time. The idea was to bring people together to discuss how the stock is doing, and how the fishing

is, and to ask whether we should be doing more of one thing or less of another. Effort management will be massive across Wales, as will be getting the balance right politically, with a small ‘p’, and feeding in the industry and its representatives’ knowledge and skills from the bottom up to inform and persuade managers of the best way to do it. We are pursuing marine stewardship accreditation for a range of species in Welsh waters. That is not cheap, but not only does it give you a potentially better marketing tool, but, importantly, if you adhere to the Marine Stewardship Council principles, you have entirely acceptable, sustainable and environmentally friendly fisheries.

[101] So, we are pushing hard on a number of fronts, and in many ways, I tend towards a sense of optimism, because we have a lot to play for and many opportunities. There is the occasional depression, caused by the fact that things could go a bit better, more efficiently and in a joined-up way, but, on balance, provided that all concerned pull their weight, we have some significant opportunities, not least in terms of food security for the future of the nation.

[102] **Alun Davies:** Thank you for that evidence.

[103] Yr wyf yn dod â'r cyfarfod i ben yn awr. Nid oes gan yr Aelodau ragor o gwestiynau. Diolch ichi am eich tystiolaeth; yr ydym yn ei gwerthfawrogi'n fawr. Anfonir copi o'r trawsgrifiad atoch yn ystod y 10 diwrnod nesaf.

I will now bring the meeting to an end. The Members do not have any more questions. Thank you for your evidence; it is greatly appreciated. You will receive a copy of the transcript within the next 10 days.

[104] Cynhelir cyfarfod nesaf yr is-bwyllgor hwn ddydd Mercher yr wythnos hon, a bydd y Gweinidog yn bresennol.

The sub-committee's next meeting will be on Wednesday of this week, and the Minister will be present.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 3.32 p.m.
The meeting ended at 3.32 p.m.*