

Education and Lifelong Learning Committee

Supplementary Information for Item Five

Comparison of Tomlinson Report and 14-19 Learning Pathways February 2004

Aspect	Tomlinson	Learning Pathways
Origin	Developed by team of "great and good" including academics, will report to Government who will decide whether or not to accept recommendations	Developed by practitioners from existing good practice – "what works", Framework already accepted by Assembly Government. Work of groups will feed into guidance for Ministerial approval.
Inclusion	Starts at Entry level	Allows participation at any level – or combination (though Welsh Bac currently starts at Intermediate)
Extra curricular activities	Can be accounted where young people are taking part in them	Pro-active approach to ensuring all young people have access and involvement, including community and voluntary activity
Core	Mathematical skills, communication, ICT, extended personal project, common skills, wider activities, personal review, planning and guidance (workload issues acknowledged but not yet addressed)	Continuum of learning/Core for 14-19 year olds as part of learning pathways, match with WBQ core

Main learning	Statutory NC, programmes analogous to current GCSE/A level, GNVQ etc qualifications recognised by award of Diploma at appropriate level	Programmes leading to wide range of qualifications from recognised list including GCSE/A level, GNVQ etc, will incorporate revised NC at KS4 following review in progress
Breadth/balance	Open or specialised diplomas, content of which which would be prescribed by the particular specialism	Individually tailored learning pathway to reflect learners goals and aspirations, with support from learning coach – would allow for either specialism or breadth
Areas/domains of learning	15 areas of learning on QCA Framework list	5 broad "domains" each with general and applied options, to ensure breadth of choice for all learners
Transparency	Complex radical model	Incremental growth from status quo to transformation
Age related issues	Assessment when ready – earlier or later	Assessment when ready – more flexibility
Links to lifelong learning	Diploma levels interlock and can be upgraded to next level, programmes could contribute to adult learning qualifications	Use of all age CQFW – same qualifications, easy to pick up and develop post 19. Still discussing whether Welsh Bac should be one off or could be upgraded to next level
Assessment	Greater teacher assessment, accredited examiners etc. Work still to be done on how achievement in individual subjects within diploma will be recognised	Some portfolio assessment in Welsh bac, Credit and Qualifications Framework for Wales in development. Can include range of recognised qualifications at intermediate (level 2) and advanced (level 3) in general and applied options

Organisation	Case studies indicate multiple learning settings.	14-19 Networks set up to collaborate to extend option choices and support mechanisms. LEAs and ELWAs established as funding and organisational axis
Support mechanisms	Connexions - personal advisers incorporating careers advice and personal support focused on most disadvantaged young people	Learning Coach, personal support and impartial careers advice, coordinated at local level through 14-19 Network. Basic entitlement for all the learning coach and careers advice, and access to personal support when needed.
Timescale	10 years. Final report due in Autumn 2004. Long lead in time for transition from existing qualifications	Some aspects already in place. 14-19 Networks will start development from September 2004. Eventual timetable will reflect capacity and funding availability
Work-based learning	Modern Apprenticeships not integrated at present. Aim to integrate in long term	Modern Apprenticeships not integrated in current model. Would welcome integration in longer term. Will allow range of work based learning opportunities apart from MA.
Estimated costs	To be subject to large scale DfES analysis over next few months	Financial modelling group to feed into evidence base for SR 2004 and group to be reconstituted to continue work on costings from pilots