

SUMMARY OF RESPONSE TO CONSULTATION LETTER

1. I am very grateful to all those who wrote to me in response to the consultation letter(Annex 2). This Summary seeks to present a fair cross-section of comments, in the words of correspondents. It cannot seek to represent them "scientifically". The selection and "cropping" of quotations is mine. I apologise if I inadvertently distort any correspondent's views.
2. Two **general** areas of comment are particularly **under** represented – there was almost universal and widespread support in responses for the continuance of an Assembly all Wales body in this field, and for more resources. One **specific** area which is underrepresented here is delegation of some listed building consent decisions to local planning authorities. (this was the subject of a recent consultation by Cadw itself).
3. Comments included here are grouped broadly under the following headings:

1. The wider context of the historic environment in Wales:-

a. general policy context considerations

b. economic benefits of the historic environment

2. The appropriateness of the Cadw Quinquennial Review process

3. Discontinuing Cadw's functions

4. Cadw's status and overall role and potential for mergers or other changes:-

a. status and overall role

b. potential mergers or moves of function

5. Cadw's Planning and Structure

6. Cadw's Achievements

7. Areas where more attention is sought:-

a. education and training h. planning guidance

b. research i. local authorities

c. buildings at Risk j. historic landscapes and gardens

d. guidance k. 19th and 20th Centuries

e. disability and equal access policy l. rural policy

f. higher profile m. resources

g. grant aid n. listing

8. Partnerships:-

a. Partnerships with Organisations

b. Partnerships with the public

9. Cadw Within the National Assembly:-

a. Cadw and the Assembly's key themes and policies

b. Location of Cadw

10. Other issues raised including VAT

1a: The wider context of the historic environment in Wales: General Policy Considerations

a) "No final conclusions on the future role of Cadw should be drawn until a body of policy has been developed that places the care of the historic environment within the wider context of the Assembly's guiding themes and values".

"While we are expert at maintaining the estate in care – and value Cadw's role highly in this regard, the wider historic environment is less well appreciated, understood or managed".

"The historic environment is the foundation of our distinctive culture and gives us a sense of local and regional identity. Human influence can be seen throughout the landscape of Wales and therefore the historic environment can be seen as being inextricably linked".

(National Trust)

b) "The shrinking world in which we live and the resulting tendency for a universal approach to new building, often means that an area is increasingly reliant upon its historic buildings to maintain a sense of place. Maintenance of the latter is important both to residents' sense of belonging and to tourists' desire for local character and distinctiveness".

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

c) "Wales lacks a national vision for its built heritage.....there is a need for government to champion the historic built environment, to promote awareness and understanding, and to relate heritage management to sustainability and inclusion".

(Civic Trust for Wales reporting the views of participants in its recent study on Conservation Area Management)

d). "The historic environment is something from which we can learn, something from which your economy benefits, and something which can bring communities together in a shared sense of belonging. With sensitivity and imagination, it can be a stimulus to creative new architecture and design, a force for regeneration and a powerful contribution to peoples' quality of life".

e) " [advocacy of].... developing an integrated sustainable strategy for the landscape (rural and urban) as a whole, which takes account of the needs of local

communities (and features areas of landscape which are considered to be of "local significance"), and where the 'historic' environment is given equal weighting with the 'natural' environment".

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

f) "Buildings of little architectural merit can be worth preserving for their cultural and historical associations where failure to attach listed status on purely architectural grounds can frustrate imaginative projects for reusing buildings with proven historic associations."

(local authority conservation officer).

g) "...the real value of Wales' historic environment has yet to be fully realised. A fundamental aspect of that heritage in Wales is the contribution of the underprivileged and the disenfranchised and their struggle over centuries for recognition.... Perhaps Cadw should be more sensitive to this aspect of heritage as it represents a huge contribution to the nation's history".

(Council for the Protection of Rural Wales)

h) "..... it is sometimes suggested that there is less public enthusiasm for the historic environment in Wales than in Scotland or England It would be possible to test this with a public opinion poll, as English Heritage has done in England."

(The Architectural Heritage Fund)

i) "The historic environment is a matter not only of major public monuments, castles, abbeys and cathedrals, but also of rural sites of great antiquity through to patterns of fields and traditions of land use and on to the everyday fabric of town and village centres."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

j) "The framework for the protection and understanding of the historic environment is generally good, and has been the subject of considerable improvement in the last 10 years. A noticeable stimulant in this respect was the 1993 Report of the Welsh Affairs Committee of the House of Commons However, all is certainly not rosy .. observers are placed at a clear disadvantage in Wales by the absence of the equivalent to the English Historic Environment Review published at the end of 2000 on which the DCMS has just responded."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

k) "The canals, rivers, ports, wharfs and waterspaces of Wales form an integral part of Wales' social and economic history."

(British Waterways)

l) "The historic environment is one of Wales' greatest assets, not least for the economic regeneration of some of the most deprived areas of the county. A greater sense of 'ownership' and understanding of the historic environment, prompting greater inclusiveness and better physical and intellectual access, could make a real contribution to social cohesion and a genuine sense of community.

..... Language, literature and folklore also go hand-in-hand with the "built heritage" and with traces of the past beneath the ground."

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

m. "There has been no systematic or strategic review of the state of the historic environment and intelligence about its true state or the scale of need is lacking. HLF has been unsuccessful in attempting to establish a true picture of the need for funding in the area of places of worship for example, although demand for our funding has been strong. The review of the Historic Environment in England has highlighted the need for a State of the Historic Environment Review. The same is patently true of Wales if a strategic approach is to be taken to targeting the available funding on the greatest needs."

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

n. "Our historic environment is the key component in explaining our landscape and identity, and provides a unique resource in economic, environmental and social terms.

On a wider scale, legends, literary and artistic associations must be prompted not just as of academic interest, but as a key element of environmental and economic sustainability. The point is that the overall approach to conversation and historic environment must be more holistic, and partnership-based.

(Pembrokeshire National Park)

o. "Wales has a wealth of historic buildings and monuments but they are not always held in high esteem. Conservation of the built heritage does not have the same status that it broadly enjoys in England and Scotland. Many historic buildings suffer from a lack of maintenance, which results in the costs of renewal and re-use becoming prohibitive, and relatively low property values outside prime urban and rural areas often mitigate against conservation.

The main challenges for the historic environment in Wales are the need to raise the value of historic buildings and the status of conservation amongst the general public, the on-going need for financial resources for the care and maintenance of historic buildings and monuments, and the low level of traditional craft skills generally available from building contractor".

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

p. "While Cadw's achievements in its first 10 years have been impressive, especially with regard to major monuments and its involvement in regeneration projects, in our view the general quality of Wales' historic environment continues to decline. Of most concern is the fact that grade II buildings by their quantity and grading are the most at risk and the hardest to protect yet it's these buildings which are often the 'glue' which provides the cohesion for conservation areas and particular streetscapes. In addition the decline in our industrial heritage and the loss of industrial sites is becoming more of an issue through dereliction and re-development."

(City and County of Swansea)

q. "The national case in favour of conservation as a worthwhile cultural objective/activity in its own right has yet to be made let alone won. There is still a widespread belief amongst key stakeholders, owners and developers in North Wales that conservation is only of secondary importance in comparison with achieving a development solution at all costs that enables implementation to go ahead as quickly as possible.

(Flintshire County Council)

r. "[Wales] historic environment is often held in lower esteem than in England or Scotland. Some try to explain this by suggesting that Wales is not a visual nation, and has no architectural tradition. Conservation of the built heritage seems to have a low profile and priority with many local authorities."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

1b: The wider context of the historic environment in Wales: Economic Benefits of the Historic Environment

a. "The economic case for the physical historic dimension asset has yet to be made to ["too many local government officers and elected members]"

(Frances Voelcker, Past Chair of Association of Preservation Trusts)

b. [The benefits of history] "include the health and well being of people who live, work or visit the historic environment, local economic development and regeneration from tourism and the provision of attractive tourist locations for businesses. The research undertaken in the study "Valuing the Environment" showed the economic value of the heritage of Wales. This study was led by the National Trust Wales, in partnership with others and was part funded by Cadw".

(National Trust)

c. "There is a fundamental lack of understanding [in Wales] of our built heritage, its context in time and space and the opportunities it presents to benefit the national economy..... the answer to this national failing is education, training and promotion"

(Local Authority Conservation Architect).

d. "Tourism is an extremely important element in Wales's economy and many of the buildings that are now empty and lying derelict could play a beneficial role."

(Save Britain's Heritage)

e. "Exploitation sounds mercenary but it is only by changing perceptions of our heritage as a liability to that of an economic asset will we be able to give our built heritage a sound long term future."

(Local Authority Conservation Architect)

f. "..... the secular building can offer an enhanced value because it is listed, and is much more readily adaptable..... [while] the place of worship, [where] the value ... is significantly reduced, save for the possibility that it may get grant assistance from the state if it is regarded as outstanding [ie less than 10% of listed buildings]."

(The Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

g. "...in considering any proposals for changes that might affect a listed building or scheduled monument, it is essential that proper consideration is given to economic and social concerns."

(Country Land and Business Association)

h. "The historic environment can play an active part in economic regeneration, generating jobs, encouraging investment and attracting tourists. However, at times it may appear that there is a conflict between the historic environment and economic regeneration..... [Assembly planning guidance addresses] such conflicts on a case-by-case basis in a reactive response to specific threats. To forestall such unnecessary conflict there is a need for a higher level, more proactive and integrated strategic policy towards such issues The historic environment should not always, or even often, be seen as standing in the way of change – it is itself the product of change. But **managed** change and **sustainable** development need to recognise that the fragile elements which make up the historic environment can never be replaced once they have been damaged or destroyed."

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

i) "In broader terms, **Cadw needs to develop its strategic role**. There is little evidence that it is having much impact on the development of local heritage strategies or Agenda 21 county action plans, many of which do not mention the historic environment. **A Welsh equivalent of such initiatives as Power of Place and the Heritage Dividend publication would be welcome.**"

(The Georgian Group)

j) " [The correspondent a local authority]...., Cadw and the WDA are working in seamless harmony.... [towards a new future for a site]. But the future of heritage buildings should not be subject to the vagaries of political lobbying or the serendipity of personal commitment of WDA officers. The system did nothing."

(An owner)

k) "I would like Cadw to have a much closer relationship with bodies such as the Council for Museums in Wales, the proposed Welsh Resource and the Wales Tourist Board, that would recognise the increasing demand for cultural tourism as an important part of the Welsh economy...."

(Wrexham County Borough)

l) "Conservation for conservation's sake cannot be a sustainable way forward and Cadw needs to focus more on how it encourages property owners and developers to preserve, restore, adapt and find new uses for historic structures and environments. Such encouragement could be given through stronger educational provision, practical skills training, and better public awareness."

(City and County of Swansea)

m) Vernacular/locally distinctive architecture needs to be emphasised so that regions of Wales become more attractive to visitors and businesses. The strengthening of local character should also be supported for its own sake. The need for conservation as a long term vehicle for economic regeneration and social inclusion should be emphasised.

(Flintshire County Council)

n) "The relatively low property values outside prime urban and rural areas discourage conservation, particularly of redundant buildings, eg chapels. Many historic buildings suffer a lack of maintenance, which results in the costs of renewal and re-use becoming prohibitive."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

2 The appropriateness of the Cadw Quinquennial Review Process

a. "the quinquennial review is too narrow a process Within which to make recommendations regarding Cadw's future role in relation to other actors and agencies.

Pending [a broader review into policy for the historic environment in Wales] ... no decision should be taken on whether it is appropriate to maintain Cadw's functions as they are presently defined"

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "The priority perhaps should be for the NAW to identify that the "Better Wales" document lacked a clear definition of the importance of the historic environment, and to undertake similar exercise (including wide consultation) to the review recently carried out in England.... which will set the agenda for the future,"

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

c) "The current Quinquennial Review comes after a period of great political change in Wales. The creation of the Welsh Assembly and the movement toward a more devolved political structure will have a profound effect on the long-term future of the Welsh historic environment. To meet the challenge of the new political environment, Cadw will need to reassess the appropriateness of its existing structure and policies.

(The Georgian Group)

d) "I would like to begin with expressing some concern with the Consultation Questionnaire. In my mind, this is confusing two separate strands, or at least bringing them together at the same time when they should be sequential. The document seems to be inviting our strategic analysis of the current situation in Wales, and then later goes on to assume that the existing situation should be regarded as fixed, and invites us to comment on the detail."

e) "A fundamental reassessment is required from its mission right through to its objectives, strategy, and tactics. Its method to deliver greater transparency, openness and understanding, greater objectivity, and communication (especially in grant cases) is vital. We hope that the Quinquennial review will identify the need for these changes."

(Pembrokeshire Coast National Park on behalf of the three Welsh National Parks)

3. Discontinuing Cadw's Functions

a. "would be a disaster in a nation that is neither very effective in protecting the historic built environment nor in encouraging its citizens to recognise its significance and economic and social value"

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "many parts of Wales would suffer terrible losses. Local Government in some areas is explicitly hostile to historic fabric.....; or living in a hand-to-mouth way without lifting their eyes to consider where we come from or where we are going".

(Frances Voelcker, architect, secretary of a building preservation trust)

c. "The heritage of Wales would be endangered, as would be a future rich in the appreciation and benefits of the history [benefits described by NT at section 1b of this annex] of Wales".

(National Trust)

d. "Local Authorities do not have a national remit and few have Specialist Officers with sufficient powers. The Archaeological Trusts have considerable expertise and influence regionally but no statutory powers. The National Museums and Galleries of Wales has a more specialist role in artefact study and preservation. The Royal Commission also has a more specialist role without powers to preserve. The loss of Cadw would be a serious blow, highly damaging to the effectiveness and reputation of the National Assembly."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

e. "..., are CADW desperately searching for places to list ... to justify their own existence?"

(Owner of Listed Building)

f. "Our Group knows of two types of organisations that may benefit from less involvement with Cadw, and these are the various Chapels and Churches that have the need to bring their premises up to the DDA requirements and various public buildings that are used on a day to day basis, and are tied by CADW when they try to gain access for groups of disabled people into their premises."

(Llanelli Disabled Access Group)

g. "...the present functions carried out by CADW do need to be carried out. Given the present level of funding, CADW might consider the need to concentrate more on its core (national) objectives, and release its more peripheral (local) responsibilities to other organisations..... the impact for the Historic Environment of Wales could be serious. The collective knowledge of CADW staff is a valuable resource in itself and that resource could be at threat. CADW's functions would have to be allocated elsewhere (LPAs for example) and there would inevitably be a period of re-adjustment and training which could indirectly damage the historic environment."

(City and County of Swansea)

h. "CADW's current position as custodian/curator of sites and monuments should be critically reviewed to examine whether other public organisations, or in some cases private interests can take over responsibility. This would allow CADW to concentrate on core service areas as advisors, promoters and facilitators for conservation in Wales."

(Flintshire County Council)

4. Cadw's status overall role and potential for mergers or other changes

4a. Status and overall role.

a. "[Cadw's] responsibilities are complex in the sense that they are an enforcing body but also conserve and manage their own properties and are a key part of Wales' tourism industry. Therefore this complexity needs careful prioritisationWe believe that the National Assembly for Wales should fund the functions of Cadw. However we have concerns that its current status as an arm of the National Assembly for Wales appears to restrict its ability to fulfil its wider brief of promoting understanding of the historic environment. We wouldwish to see its status changed to that of an Assembly Sponsored Public Body".

(National Trust)

b. "Cadw's statutory remit should perhaps be broadened to encourage more imaginative, broad-based initiatives such as the current landscape-based characterisation work

[Cadw's]".....remit (or the current interpretation of it) may be seen as narrow when compared with English Heritage and Historic Scotland".

"In recent years, Cadw has adopted a more imaginative approach to the management of the historic environment, and these directions need to be encouraged from within NAW. We would like to see Cadw's strategic direction encompass the protection, conservation, promotion and understanding of the 'historic environment' (as opposed to the 'built heritage' currently in their mission statement). We would also like to see an acknowledgement of the importance of education in achieving these aims and of the development of professional skills amongst historic environment practitioners"

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

c. "Perhaps an arms-length distance from government might give (Cadw) more room to give more independent advice to the Assembly"

(Council for the Protection of Rural Wales)

d) "..... [Cadw's] remit is narrow when compared with other national heritage bodies like English Heritage and Historic Scotland."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

e) "..... a singular anomaly that Cadw is an Executive Agency an ASPB ... would be less confusing, more open and flexible."

(Council of Museums in Wales)

f) "There is a confusion to [Cadw's] status as an Executive Agency and not an Assembly Supported Public Body. It has an inherent weakness as its regulatory functions do not sit comfortably with matters such as the opening of properties in care or grant issuing."

(Built and Moveable Heritage Wales)

g) "..... there remains on impression that [Cadw's] emphasis is still constrained within a narrow and specific definition of the organisation's statutory role. This is clearly evident in the National Assembly's Strategic Plan, "Better Wales" where the limited nature of the stated objectives for the historic environment are extremely narrow"

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

h) "We would like to see Cadw become much more outward focused and providing effective leadership to the sector. A good starting point would be for the Assembly to commission Cadw to lead a Review of the Historic Environment in Wales, and to equip them with adequate professional staff and financial resources to achieve this effectively in partnership with the other organisations concerned with the historic environment in Wales".

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

i) "..... Cadw's role and scope must be clearly determined to ensure protection of appropriate sites/buildings whilst avoiding entirely inappropriate scheduling. Identification of subjects for scheduling based on such a common-sense definition would then be transparent and acceptable".

(An owner of a listed building in the South Wales Valleys)

j) "An Assembly sponsored public body would seem the way forward. costs in implementing this will be high, but such a body could actively promote the historic environment and its care and emphasise its underlying economic importance to the future health of Wales, the 'face' of which is quite simply its 'fortune'. We are making positive inroads into conserving our landscape, language and culture, but the historic environment lags behind by a long way."

(Pembrokeshire National Park on behalf of the three Welsh National Parks)

k) "[English Heritage's].... more distant position in relation to Government appears to have resulted in a more dynamic agency who have taken on a responsibility for the whole of the historic environment. By contrast, Cadw all too readily fall back on the 1979 Act as the limit of the role"

(Wrexham County Borough)

l) "CADW could learn from CCW and the role it enjoys as an adviser to the Assembly on nature conservation and biodiversity matters and similarly raise its profile as the advising organisation on historic environment matters. One of CADW's principle objectives must therefore be to facilitate within the Assembly a greater understanding of the role of the historic environment plays in defining the character of Wales and the role of CADW in protecting that character and how it will be achieved."

(City and County of Swansea)

m) "CADW has been very effective in its corporate planning in recent years, however, it would undoubtedly benefit from undertaking a fundamental review of its core objectives. This would provide the organisation with an improved national focus on key issues and should enable it to work more effectively with its partners, particularly local authorities.....The current role of CCW in providing built design advice should be examined. This could be a role better undertaken by CADW with the assistance and co-operation of local authorities. Similarly, built heritage grants contained within other grant regimes such as Tir Gofal should require increased input from CADW and local authorities. Also, the monitoring of access agreements for grant beneficiaries may be better carried out by, for instance, local authorities."

(Flintshire County Council)

n) "A merger of Cadw with RCAHMW may have an advantage in increasing the critical mass of expertise and to facilitate better archiving and recording."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

4b. Potential mergers or moves of functions

a. "[there would be]...benefits in integrating the role and responsibilities of Cadw and the Royal Commission.....;also ... benefits in giving resources to local authorities in order to devolve aspects of Cadw's role relating to the protection of listed buildings, but these issues need consideration within a broader context".

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "Cadw and the Royal Commissioncurrently both developing very positive work programmes and so it seems an opportune time to combine their strengths. This has been done in England and seems to be working well".

(Council for the Protection of Rural Wales)

c. "There is currently some overlap between the functions of Cadw and the functions of the Royal Commission ...(RCAHMW), particularly in relation to the roles of both organisations as funding bodies, which can lead to confusion. The RCAHMW partly fund the regional SMRs[sites and monuments records] but their interpretation of their Royal Warrant in this area has meant that funding is not necessarily directed at the priorities of other archaeological bodies working in Wales which rely on SMRs. We feel that certain of the advantages and disadvantages of maintaining two distinct bodies merits detailed examination".

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

d. "We feel that the advantages and disadvantages of maintainingdistinct bodies [Cadw and The Royal Commission] should be examined in detail."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

e. "Merit in looking at a functional re-structure of Cadw - separating out the purely statutory functions, devolving others and forming a new ASPB for more public activities."

(Council of Museums in Wales)

f. "The Royal Commission..... is the government body in Wales which has the greatest overlap with Cadw The arguments for and against such a merger should be seriously considered by the National Assembly in its review of the two bodies in Wales."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

g. "...no reason to...fuse with the Royal Commission – we fear that scarce resources would go towards conservation grants rather than research into the history and functions of buildingssmall size of both organisations ... economies... minimal, and non-existent in the short term."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

h. "There seems, from the Trust's experience in dealing with both bodies, to be a degree of uncertainty between Cadw and the Royal Commission in the way in which they deal with different aspects of survey and record work".

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

i. "There are other players on the Welsh scene that seem to offer opportunities for partnership working. Included amongst these are: -

- Royal Commission on Ancient and Historical Monuments in Wales

There are potential bridges to be built regarding recording and regulating. The lack of co-ordination with them on the Welsh Chapels accelerated resurvey was regrettable, and in contrast to England, both organisations seem to exist in isolation.... a two-way issue.....

- Countryside Council for Wales

- Archaeological Trusts Another obvious partner, and we understand that Cadw part-fund their activities. Their role is highly important: our regional trust, Cambria Archaeology produce excellent work, and the medieval churches project was a successful joint venture between them and Cadw. Fine though all this is, little has been done to convert this resource for use and enjoyment by the general public.
- Economic Bodies such as Wales Tourist Board and Welsh Development Agency"

"Why maintain two bodies – Cadw and the RCAHM which have such similar remits? Why not forge a more formal link to CCW, which has an increasing role in cultural / historic / environment matters such as Balchder Bro, celebrating and supporting projects linked with local distinctiveness?"

(Pembrokeshire National Park on behalf of the three Welsh National Parks)

j. "There may be an advantage in merging Cadw with RCAHMW, although this should be done to achieve a greater critical mass of expertise rather than as a cost-cutting exercise. Similarly, the proposed delegation of some Cadw's regulatory functions to local planning authorities should not be undertaken to cut Cadw's resources but rather it should release resources to concentrate on other conservation activities".

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

k. "CADW might usefully taken on the functions of the Archaeological Trusts or at least bring the Trusts under CADW's direction via changes in the Trusts' funding so as to improve access to archaeological records..... There is also a need for better communication with bodies representing other interests, for example: disabled access groups, emergency services, HSE, buildings regulation, and construction rederations."

(City and County of Swansea)

l. "The link between the listing process and the creation and updating of the National [Monument] Record by the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales should be carefully examined, could CADW combine these two functions?"

(Flintshire County Council)

m. "There would be an advantage if all archives and records relating to the built heritage in Wales were held and managed by a single organisation, eg Cadw."

"Transferring some of Cadw's regulatory functions to local planning authorities or NAW's Planning Division may free up Cadw's resources to enable it to have a more active support/coordinating role."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

5. Cadw's Planning and Structure

- a. "The corporate planning of Cadw seems to be well structured and provides strategic direction within the limits of its current objectives. However its current planning does not seem to fulfil the aims of its mission statement in promoting appreciation of the historic environment of Wales. Indeed it seems that its statutory duties prevent it from undertaking its wider role of promotion. Cadw has a complex role to play in balancing its various responsibilities but currently the balance does not seem to favour promotion and education and the statutory duties inevitably have to take precedence."

(National Trust)

b. "Cadw has made significant progress against testing targets set for it...."

"...Cadw's duties force it to focus primarily on individual sites and buildings at the expense of area strategies...."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

c. "We would strongly recommend that Cadw.... makes all policy documents available on its web-site..... We would recommend English Heritage as an example".

(Disability Wales, having commented that Cadw's corporate plan was not on its web-site)

d. "..... would not ... (be) a good idea to divide Cadw's archaeologists from their architects since the historic environment needs to be more closely integrated, rather than further separated."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

e. "It is impossible to know who decides and upon what basis [Cadw's] targets and priorities are set. One cannot help but wonder if there is a hidden agenda driving the continuing expansion of CADW's projects.

(South Wales listed House owner)

6. Cadw's Achievements

a. "Cadw's achievements are considerable and are to be praised in particular in the practical protection of the historic environment".

(National Trust)

b. "We would highlight

- conservation of estate in care
- achieving targets on listing and scheduling
- quality of interpretation and presentation (at sites)
- producing Landscapes Register
- within its capacity, contributing to regeneration activity...."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

c. "Expertise in terms of the history of the historic environment and how to restore the buildings and other structures is undoubtedly one of Cadw's strengths. The Trust would like to see it taking a more proactive role in developing solutions; restoring and bringing back into use presently unused buildings"

(Railway Heritage Trust).

d. "...Cadw clearly recognises the importance of 'landscape' in their development of significant initiatives such as the Register of Landscapes of Outstanding Historic Importance. The successes..... achieved in the field of presenting sites to the public, and with their guidebooks, are particularly to be applauded".

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

e. ".....Cadw, over recent years, has improved its performance significantly in areas such as its publications and, within financial constraints, seems to be operating well".

(Council for the Protection of Rural Wales)

f. "..... we particularly welcome [Cadw's] increased efforts in producing and publishing information like the "Historic Landscapes Register", in developing public access through grants to properties outside Assembly ownership."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

g. "..... excellence of the CADW/ICOMOS Register of Historic Gardens. Publicity on completion is needed. Back-up from the Tourist Board is needed."

(Sara Furse, member Historic Buildings Council for Wales and Conservation Member for the Clwyd Branch of the Welsh Historic Gardens Trust)

h. "The listed building re-survey has been a major demand on Cadw's resources [Cadw's] work with the archaeological trusts. The success of the

establishment of the Redundant Churches Mechanism....."

(Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

i. "..... Significant achievements which have contributed to the management of the historic environment. We also commend Cadw's support for other organisations like the Architectural Heritage Fund, the Association of Preservation Trusts, and the Civic Trust for Wales. A recent notable achievement was the partnership created to achieve the designation of the Blaenavon Industrial Landscape as a World Heritage Site."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

j. "We applaud Cadw's achievements in conservation and presentation of its major monuments ... its guide books (are) among the very best, skilfully combining scholarship with attractiveness and accessibility."

"We strongly support the philosophy which lies behind the Landscape Registers compiled jointly with CCW and ICOMOS, and applaud Cadw's involvement with schemes such as Tir Gofal ... a move towards the acceptance of responsibility for the totality of the historic environment, beyond the confines of the 1979 Act. In line with the priorities of the National Assembly in its desire to see a sustainable Wales."

"The Field Monument Wardens and the current programme of "Caring for" leaflets have gone some way towards dispelling [the impression of remoteness gained by the public]"

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

k. "British Waterways consider Cadw to be amongst the best of its class given its size. We think that Cadw could lever the benefit of its resources by working in closer working partnerships with organisations such as ourselves. This is intended as praise, not criticism."

(British Waterways)

l. "The Cadw Register of parks and gardens is an achievement of which the Assembly can be rightly proud: it leads the field in the UK."

(The Garden History Society)

m. "Having visited many comparable sites in England, Scotland and abroad, I have no doubt that Cadw's performance is second to none.

In particular I regard Cadw's publications, whether Site Guides or other literature, as excellent.

I do not remember seeing elsewhere anything comparable to the introductory and explanatory panels at the entrances to the North Wales castles (Edwardian and Welsh). I have known visitors so enthralled by them as to jeopardise the time left for a proper visit to the castle!

In short, I believe Cadw has achieved a very great deal. It would be more than a pity if anything were done to imperil this."

(A resident of Meirionnydd)

n. "CADW's current work programme does reflect its statutory duties. CADW's liaison with local authorities has improved considerably since local government reorganisation in 1996."

(Flintshire County Council)

o. "A great deal of progress has already been achieved and this has been particularly so through the publication of the Cadw, ICOMOS UK and CCW **Register of Landscapes of Historic Interest in Wales**. The Register is now a material consideration in the planning process and we are currently preparing to gather evidence for our third Public Inquiry where information on the Register will be used to support a substantial part of our case. The number of Public Inquiries involving the Register is set to rise but, wherever possible, we seek to resolve historic landscape issues at the pre-planning stage and, in fact, the bulk of casework involving the Register is done in this way and the whole process is greatly helped by regular staff contact between Cadw, the Welsh Archaeological Trusts and CCW **A Guide to Good Practice on the Using the Register of Landscapes of Historic Interest in Wales in the Planning and Development Processes**, jointly prepared by these three organisations, will shortly be issued, by Cadw."

(Countryside Council for Wales)

p. "Cadw has made significant progress in recent years in fostering good working relationships with local authority conservation staff, particularly through the introduction of the Built Heritage Forum. The proposal for local heritage strategies is another excellent initiative which has been welcomed by this Authority. Indeed the local heritage strategy could become the mechanism for developing the kind of relationship which many local authorities currently enjoy with the Countryside Council for Wales."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

q. "At present, officers benefit from informal advice from Cadw personnel on key sites, or projects where grant aid is partnered. Cadw's Town Scheme re-assessment states that Local Authorities are to have more autonomy in operating Town Schemes, however, it is felt important for Cadw to remain available to provide 'expert' advice regarding 'specialist' Town Scheme works."

(City and County of Cardiff)

7a. Areas where more activity is sought: Education and Training

a. "... there is a wider agenda of education about the historic environment, linked to social inclusion, that Cadw is not resourced or charged to address.."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "...there is a need to consider the relationship between the Design Commission.... and Cadw". "...both Cadw and Commission are potential vehicles, amongst others, for the development of historic environment education...."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

c. "Education provides intellectual access to and engagement with the historic environment and its future management. There is a need for more work to be undertaken to identify and overcome barriers to learning and to provide opportunities for appreciating and understanding the historic environment in new and varying ways". "Need for an education strategy and education staff. Local empowerment comes when people are better informed and have an understanding of the significance of the historic environment".

(National Trust).

d. "Educational strategies at all levels should include an understanding of the importance of the historic environment, in the same way that nature and habitat conservation have become an integral part of the education process."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

e. "Working in partnership with the University (of Wales in Cardiff) will be a valued development of Cadw's work."

(Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

f. "[Cadw] ... no longer has an educational programme Cadw has lost an opportunity to generate interest among young people."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

g. "..... an educational and research role should be central to Cadw's work, so as to promote access for all – in both an intellectual and physical sense. Greater strategic emphasis on education and understanding can help develop a pro-active approach to excluded groups, to those who currently feel they have no stake in their historic environment."

"In view of Cadw's impressive publication research and its fine monument presentation, we find it reprehensible that the organisation does not employ an Education Officer to capitalise on these assets also [a need] for an educational policy and strategy which could inform all Cadw's work and enhance their communication with the public."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

h. "There is a pressing need for improved availability of conservation skills The Friends of Friendless Churches in seeking to identify building contractors ... [find] that some regions have no suitably qualified people at all.

..... Many conservation projects in Wales are presently supervised by English based conservation architects and surveyors."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

i. "Cadw could play a more active role in encouraging higher standards by helping to develop relevant academic courses in Welsh Universities; by promoting training in relevant specialisms, such as conservation architecture and architectural history; and by encouraging inter-disciplinary learning within built environment disciplines."

(The Georgian Group)

j. "HLF research has highlighted a crisis in conservation skills training, which is particularly acute in parts of the UK, including Wales. we have just published a summary of the findings, entitled Sustaining Our Living Heritage."

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

k. "Focus needs to be increased on ensuring the necessary expertise is available and on tap to advise on conservation, preservation and enhancement of the historic built environment and to promoting the use of traditional materials, practices, skills, craftsmen, education and development to ensure owners of historic property are not discriminated against by the imbalance which exists."

(Isle of Anglesey County Council)

l. "Cadw has a role to play in the promotion of access to the historic environment through the wider learning community. Although there is access to Cadw properties and the Agency's educational role here is highly successful, there is further scope for educational and interpretive work in schools and wider initiatives to promote skills. There could be an identified source of advice for the promotion of this important aspect of Welsh culture within either Cadw, the National Assembly or Education Learning Wales."

(City and County of Cardiff)

7b Areas where more activity is sought: Research and Professional Development

a. "Use could be made of English and Scottish [technical expertise, research and training facilities] where these are relevant, and a resource database could be useful. Training bursaries could be made available"

(Frances Voelcker, past chair of Association of Preservation Trusts)

b. "There should be more research undertaken to support the identification of key features of the historic environment. The work currently undertaken through Landmap is a good example....Conservation work must be supported by a better understanding of the significance of each place. This again needs further research".

(National Trust)

c. "The promotion of archaeological research (as opposed to rescue archaeology) as an integral part of protecting the historic environment, supporting the development of professional skills are functions which would develop the role of Cadw in a positive way."

(Institute of Field Archaeology)

d. "National databases are essential for policy planning and Cadw could take a lead on this."

(Conservation Architect)

7c Areas where more activity is sought: Buildings at Risk

a. "discussion needed on the relative significance of each listed building, and the degree of change acceptable for it."

(Frances Voelcker, Secretary of a buildings preservation trust).

b. "[need].... to assess the extent to which historic buildings are at risk[This] would enable a strategy to be developed to address the threat to historic buildings and thereby to contribute more effectively to the sustainable re-use and repair of such structures

despite the significant work on some Welsh local authorities' own buildings at risk registers.....lack of an all-Wales register to guide and inform public policy".

(Civic Trust for Wales)

c. "...2 years ago, Cadw did not appear to have a register of "buildings at risk" in Wales and we had to contact each local authority to obtain such information..... an example of the need to improve the interface with customers".

(Railway Heritage Trust).

d. "...more emphasis should be placed on the preservation of examples of "ordinary" life, both domestic and commercial. While it is right to preserve Harlech and Plas Mawr, perhaps a little more attention could be given in future to examples of domestic living at a much lower level and to small businesses.... I appreciate the work done already at St. Fagan's in this direction."

(A resident of Meirionnydd)

e. "While they have provided much-appreciated funding for 'Buildings at Risk' reports and Conservation Area studies, there is little or no agreed national framework to work to...."

(Pembrokeshire National Park on behalf of three national park authorities)

f. "... Wales' Industrial Historic environment is in decline as ... evidenced by the deteriorating condition of many industrial sites. A focused condition survey of listed industrial sites would highlight the rate of deterioration and more money and resources need to be put into the protection of this most important aspect of Wales' Heritage."

(City and County of Swansea)

Footnote

In the mid 1990s Welsh Office Ministers decided that the listing resurvey should be accelerated to achieve completion by 2005. This means that not all "listable" buildings have been identified. Until they have been, Cadw takes the view that it cannot really compile a national register of which are at risk.

Cadw offers 80% funding to local authorities and national parks to compile local registers. The work being undertaken in most authorities is well advanced, and can be topped-up later. It is being done to a common format – Cadw provided a template – so the results will be compatible, and if all local authorities eventually undertake the work, in step with the timetable for completing the resurvey, in effect a national register will have been produced.

The local buildings at risk registers cover all grades whereas the overall English Heritage one for England covers just Grade I and Grade II*

7d Areas where more activity is sought: Guidance

a. ".....high regard for the impact for that town schemes have had in Wales..... there would be benefits now in reviewing the overall effectiveness of town schemes themselves, both in terms of historic conservation, and in terms of the relationship between investments in historic buildings and wider renewal strategies"

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. " there are still great gaps in the publications list. Any Welsh conservation officer, owner, architect or surveyor wishing to know about....."Enabling Development" or "Thatch" to take just two diverse examples, would have to buy English Heritage or Historic Scotland documents and relate these to the particular circumstances of Wales."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

c. "[Cadw should]..... offer "without prejudice" advice on a formal basis (currently it has to be informal) [and] act as a formal champion of good practice and disseminator of information on conservation, materials and expertise (currently it is all ad-hoc and word of mouth)."

(Owner of listed buildings)

d. "Cadw produces some excellent publications, but very little in the way of best practice guidelines, conferences, training seminars or other initiatives on the conservation of historic buildings, for owners, local authorities or building professionals. Apart from the work at the Monuments in Care, Cadw does not provide educational initiatives or leadership to the sector in improving the provision of learning about the historic environment.

"[There are] problems for HLF in obtaining timely expert advice of a high standard from Cadw. Consistency of advice can be a real problem, which suggests that a clear policy framework to conservation issues is currently lacking."

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

e. "[damaging changes to traditional detailing]encouraged by weak development control in certain planning authorities, the almost complete lack of available national advice from Cadw."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

f. "More advice and technical assistance on plaster work, fenestration, and timber detailing for example and, at a wider level, educational advice, practical skills training, workshops, and explanatory leaflets.....to both conservation staff within LPAs and to the owners....."

(City and County of Swansea)

g. "...there is an increased role for advice and guidance from Cadw...[enhanced] specialist advice and the preparation of wider guidance on issues such as 'Conservation Area Management', building repair, buildings at risk or historic landscapes. All these touch on the more commonplace aspects of the built environment: an area not previously strongly addressed within the Cadw organisational framework."

(City and County of Cardiff)

7e. Equality and Access Policy

a. "We would also recommend that Cadw..... considers the drafting of a Disability Equality and Access Policy, which should underpin the forthcoming guidance "Overcoming the Barriers": it should be noted that this focuses primarily on removing physical barriers to premises".

(Disability Wales).

b. "More should be done regarding the provision of information about buildings and alternative access initiatives to enable people of all abilities to experience their presence."

(Fieldsman Trails (Access Consultancy), Flintshire)

c. "Our group have on many occasions come in contact with the fact the CADW exists, and the great difficulties that occur when necessary planning applications

come into conflict with Cadw's opinions when dealing with entry points for disabled people into the many listed buildings that are in the Carmarthenshire area."

"We believe that there should be a grass roots debate into the future of many of the buildings used for local government etc., and that many of these buildings that are in day-today use should be downgraded to permit full access for all members of the public, to have ramps or lifts fitted to allow disabled people the same access as their able bodied friends and associates to all parts of the building.

Many of these buildings are now in use as pubs/bars, cinemas, restaurants, dentists, doctors surgeries, and places of entertainment. At the time of their building, disabled persons were not even spoken about, let alone given the chance to enter. This has now changed and all disabled persons must have the right to enter these places, either for employment or entertainment."

(Llanelli Disabled Access Group)

7f. Higher Profile for Cadw

a. "..... we would like to see [Cadw] given more independence and a public voice."

(Save Britain's Heritage)

b. "..... Cadw is a far less active or influential body than its counterparts in England and Scotland."

(The Theatres Trust)

e. **"There is a real need to argue the case for this historic environment to a much wider public audience.** To many people – even to those who fully accept the need to protect the *natural* environment – the value of historic buildings and the historic environment is not obvious. There is[a].... feeling that the past is irrelevant and that buildings of the past can be sacrificed in order to create better places to live. Cadw should play a part in conveying the reality: that historic environments often offer, ready-made, the kinds of places explicitly sought in planning policy guidance in the UK – places worth valuing on grounds of utility as well as history and aesthetics. **This implies a much greater public advocacy, campaigning and education role for Cadw.**"

(The Georgian Group)

f. "[Cadw].... should show the public a more caring approach, by turning up to public meetings with local AMs and basically by listening to us."

(A group of South Wales listed homeowners)

g. "The key element in resource management is public perception. Through an awareness of the built environment will come an interest – through that interest will become care, and these relationships are in desperate need of development in the principality. It may be that Cadw are not charged with this remit, but it would appear neither is any organisation in Wales It may be that the National Parks could effect greater partnership with Cadw, at the very least in a promotional capacity."

h. "We regret that we cannot in all honesty advise that Cadw has all our confidence in championing the cause of the historic heritage of Wales, and we see few signs of this improving within the current regime.....We increasingly find ourselves contacting colleagues in English Heritage and Historic Scotland to obtain advice and guidance – for example for technical information."

(Pembrokeshire National Park Authority on behalf of the three National Park Authorities)

i. "We are fully supportive of the excellent work carried out by Cadw to date. However, we would ask that the Review consider the possible benefits of giving Cadw a new degree of autonomy and independence from the executive. In our experience, Cadw's ability to press the conservation case has sometimes been handicapped by its closeness to the executive. While of course it should be accountable to the Assembly, we believe that the Assembly would be better served by a Cadw which had an arms-length relationship to the executive."

(Garden History Society)

j. ".....Cadw could probably do more to promote its positive work, for example its grant programmes. Cadw's excellent membership scheme and its accompanying high quality journal could perhaps be promoted more widely in the media.....More broadly...Cadw could do more to promote the conservation of the historic environment across Wales, as part of the National Assembly's strategy for sustainable development."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

k. "Raising the profile of CADW and the intrinsic value of the historic environment through presentations to members and chief officers, and question and answer sessions would be welcomed. At officer level more regular visits and more sharing of expertise (not just on an individual project basis) possibly through joint regional conservation working groups would strengthen the existing relationships (which are good)."

"[Cadw] ... needs to do far more to raise awareness of its work and objectives in the public domain, especially to those parties such as listed building owners and the public in general."

(City and County of Swansea)

l. "The promotion of a Welsh identity and the care of its historic assets could be enhanced by the improved communication, publicity and guidance referred to above. There are now nearly 1,000 Listed Buildings in Cardiff: a robust demonstration of the City's identity as a vibrant diverse and historic capital city. Cardiff's bid for European Capital of Culture in 2008 could benefit from wider understanding and awareness raising initiatives and Cadw is well placed to play an important role in this process."

(City and County of Cardiff)

7g. Grant Aid

a. "A listing programme unaccompanied by grant aid would be all stick, no carrot Cadw regularly runs out of money in its grant programmes, applicants being told to come back at the beginning of the prospective financial year, by which time the cost of repairs will have increased a surprising number of applications are for increases on already grant aided buildings."

"... pernicious use of Improvement Grants available under the Housing Grants and Construction Regeneration Act 1996 ... we fear that in untutored hands these are used to degrade historic buildings quite unnecessarily – working against the spirit and letter of Cadw conservation grants. One arm of government appears to be undoing the work of another ... we would be interested to know whether Cadw is continuing to monitor the impact of Improvement Grants and to deplore occasions where they are causing architectural damage."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

b. "[Cadw should] provide an incentive structure (not just in money) which facilitates the preservation and management of the built heritage (for example Brecon Beacons National Park, now thankfully under new management, has teamed up with Coed Cymru to offer grants for local hardwood timber doors and windows,

instead of just complaining because people opt for PVC)."

"It would be preferable if the local authority were able to allocate for repairs to listed buildings, as happens in England."

(Owner of listed building)

c. "HLF is experiencing a growing demand for funding for historic buildings in Wales. the conservation of historic places of worship and the Townscapes Heritage Initiative have been particularly well taken up and clearly meeting a need. Cadw's grant allocation has reduced since the introduction of Lottery Funding, a deplorable situation, which contravenes the principal of additionally. Furthermore it disadvantages potential applicants to HLF by reducing the amount of partnership funding available."

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

d. ".....there may be a greater need for training in costing repair work amongst Cadw staff."

(Members of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority)

7h. Planning Guidance

a. "..... the registration of historic landscapes, parks and gardens confers no additional statutory protection. We hope that the proposed arrangements for statutory consultation on planning applications affecting parks and gardens will not be delayed and that the guidance regarding wider historic landscapes will be strengthened [in PPW]"

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

b. " paragraph 14 of Welsh Office Circular 61/96 concerning World Heritage Sites appears somewhat weaker than its English counterpart PPG 15 although we welcome paragraph 16 as a step towards rendering the Landscape and Gardens Register of some effect."

(International Council on Monuments and Sites – UK)

c. ".....**more guidance to unitary authorities in Wales on specific planning topics**..... no national policy framework against which to judge individual cases. Although Circular 61/96 sets out some general guidance, there are still significant gaps, for example in the areas of enabling development, conservation of historic buildings in towns and conservation of farm buildings."

(The Georgian Group)

d. "The reduction of Cadw's financial contribution to the regional archaeological trusts has placed strains on those trusts' ability to provide a professional archaeological service to local planning authorities. This Authority recognises the value of the specialist advice provided by Glamorgan-Gwent Archaeological Trust, and accordingly has provided the necessary degree of funding. However, it is understood that several other planning authorities do not, which must have damaging long-term effects on Wales' archaeological resource."

"National planning policy guidance on the historic built environment lagged behind that for England for many years, but for a brief period in the 1990s was evolving in parallel with English guidance. It is apparent that once again policy development lags behind the work being undertaken by DCMS and English Heritage. Whilst respecting the autonomy and distinctive approach of the National Assembly for Wales, it is difficult to identify any real benefit in building conservation policy guidance in Wales being at variance with that available in England. Greater participation in and co-ordination with policy development in England is therefore urged."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

e. "There is also an uneven availability of competent advice within local planning authorities. If it had greater resources Cadw would be more able to assist in filling those gaps and perhaps offer more specialist advice eg on disabled access, structural engineering, or legal matters to all local authorities."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

f. "There is scope for further input into the preparation of policy and guidance to inform and raise standards.....within the Assembly policy framework. The draft TAN on 'Design' no.12, identifies a need to address local identity and the importance of 'Place'. Cadw have an important role to play in its identification and the Review could address these needs and aspirations."

"Cadw's success in completing a large number of Community re-surveys has greatly extended the protection afforded the historic built environment. However, it has also increased the workload falling to Local Authorities, in a climate of limited financial and manpower resources. Wider guidance using efficient methods of communication and publicity could be investigated."

(City and County of Cardiff)

7i. Local Authorities

a) " a relatively small proportion of the local planning authorities in Wales have properly qualified conservation officers who are resourced to fulfil the requirements of delegation [of some decision making].

(Representative Body of Church in Wales)

b. "... Theatres are a sufficiently specialised building type to merit retention of central advice and control [if some listed building consent procedures are delegated to local authorities]. The recent delegation ... [in Greater London] ... specifically excluded theatres."

(The Theatres Trust)

c. "... specialist resources [in local authorities] are frequently deployed at too low a level ... there are too few qualified conservation officers to deal with historic buildings and landscapes, and with ancient monuments."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

d. "frustration many [Association] members feel in dealing with [local authority] conservation staff is well summed up by ... one member: -

"Some of the people I have been dealing with locally are out of their depth and forget that my objective is to preserve and enhance any listed properties ... very often owners are considerably more knowledgeable than the people responsible for regulating them...."

A lack of confidence among owners in the abilities of conservation staff can only make owners reluctant to approach them, or more likely to approach them at later stages when it is more difficult to adjust their proposals to take account of conservation concerns....."

(County Land and Business Association)

e. "Whilst the establishment by Cadw of the Built Heritage Forum has gone some way to improving standards, **responsibility for conservation still rests at a very junior level in most authorities**. At one level this could be rectified by the appointment of 'heritage champions' at a senior level within authorities, or by linking conservation performance to the best value regime."

(The Georgian Group)

f. "As often the first point of contact with property owners, Local Authority staff are ideally placed to promote conservation and could usefully take a more central role in administering Cadw's grant programmes."

(City and County of Swansea)

g. "Potentially, Unitary Authorities are considered to be better vehicles for delivering a comprehensive local conservation service. However, there is a perception that many local authorities are coming under increasingly tight financial constraints and scarce resources are being competed for ever more intensively. Local conservation services provided by County Councils are therefore patchy in quality. The work programme should be prepared to recognise the important national role of CADW and should address the current weaknesses in local delivery."

(Flintshire County Council)

7j. Historic Landscapes

a. "... there should be clear focus on protecting historic landscapes of all ages..."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

b. "... consideration [should] be given to compiling an "Inventory and Database of Historic Parks and Gardens of Local and Regional Importance that do not appear on the Cadw/ICOMOS Register of Historic Parks and Gardens"

(Ancient Monuments Society)

c. "Despite the quality ... progress in completing the Register [of Parks and Gardens] was slow because of limited resources devoted by Cadw ... there is now a vital role for Cadw to play on monitoring and protecting registered sites."

(Garden History Society)

d. At the local planning authority level, expertise on historic gardens is patchy and, with one or two exceptions, generally low to non-existent. It is essential therefore that Cadw is able to supply expert input into the decision-making process, and that resources are made available to pay for at least one additional gardens inspector to assist the single individual currently responsible for all registered gardens in all of Wales.

(Garden History Society)

7k. 19th and 20th Centuries

a. "... [there should be clearer focus on] ... 20th Century buildings and engineering structures where loss of examples of these is unavoidable, the focus should be on careful recording."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

b. "More attention is required for 20th Century architectural heritage in Wales." "[in the areas of 20th century architecture and rural vernacular heritage]... there is less public awareness of the value of the building stock concerned (than of mediaeval castles or abbey). [Urgent Action in both these areas]... to be undertaken by Cadw **in collaboration with** other relevant agencies, eg WDA, WTB, NFU etc...."

(Dr Loach – Convenor, Documentation and Conservation of the Modern Movement – Wales, and a member of the Executive Committee of the Society of Architectural Historians of Great Britain)

c. "Even though progress is being made at last, many structures – especially C20 military buildings and sites are being totally ignored, despite many being under threat from clearance, development or neglect."

(Pembrokeshire National Park)

d. "[Cadw's]....legislation and structure is unsuited to deal with modern problems of decaying industrial buildings and machinery....."

(The Welsh Mines Preservation Trust)

e. "Particular focus should be given to the 19th century built heritage. Until the 19th century the character of Wales evolved gradually, but that century was a period of great and rapid change. The built heritage of the 19th century has now become vulnerable and is under constant threat."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

7l. Rural Policy

a. "In view of impending changes in the rural economy (eg in agricultural subsidies) Devote more resources ... to the recording and safeguarding of the rural vernacular heritage."

(Dr Loach, Architectural Historian)

b. "A particular concern in Wales is the under-protection of traditional farm buildings that are so distinctive a feature of the Welsh rural landscape."

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

c. "In many rural parishes, over 30% of listed buildings are farm buildings – barns, stables, cowhouses, granaries, cider houses and shelter sheds. The current decline in Welsh agriculture has led to a sharp increase in the number of applications to convert historic farm buildings to alternative uses. In England, EH has issued guidance on the conversion of historic farm buildings, thus providing a national policy framework against which local proposals can be evaluated. The absence of comparable guidance in Wales means that historic farm buildings are vulnerable to destruction and disfigurement. This and other gaps should be filled as a matter of urgency."

(The Georgian Group)

7m. Resources

a. [We would like to see] "Cadw strengthened as an expert body with depth of knowledge and experience" ... [and] ... "[Cadw have] sufficient administrative resources to enable consultations to be carried out with national bodies including ourselves and the amenity societies."

(The Theatres Trust)

b. "The establishment of the Heritage Lottery Fund in 1995 has virtually doubled the amount of grant available in Wales for historic buildings, even though this has helped to conceal the comparative meanness of Cadw's budget."

(Ancient Monuments Society)

c. " increased resources to assist owners in meeting public objectives for buildings and monuments. In many cases there will be a private interest in maintaining buildings. But where the public interest demands extra expenditure to meet higher standards which a reasonable owner could not necessarily be expected to deliver, public funding is essential. In blunt terms, public benefits should not be bought at private cost."

(Country Land and Business Association)

d. "It is clear that Cadw has many significant achievements. Compared with comparable bodies in England and Scotland it appears under-resourced.

Cadw could be more pro-active in promoting the positive benefits of historic building conservation to a sceptical Welsh nation."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

e. Compared with Cadw, the Countryside Council for Wales appears to be much better resourced, and enjoys a higher profile. It is thereby the lead body in biodiversity/countryside management nationally. No body fulfils a role in building conservation comparable to CCW."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

f. "... prosperity is a key factor in conservation and that the National Parks Authorities (NPAs) should be promoting the case for far greater resources to fund the conservation work by Cadw and of course by the NPA's themselves."

(Members of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority)

g. "The injection of more money and resources needs to be immediate and targeted at those areas of the historic environment in greatest decline in the short term (not necessarily the best), those that constitute key elements of streetscapes and conservation areas, and those that are representative of particular eras of architectural styles

The pressures within not only Cadw but also its partners which have prevented resources (both financial and human) from keeping pace with Cadw's accelerated programme of scheduling monuments and listing buildings raises a fundamental issue regarding the long-term viability of conserving our historic environment and built heritage.

To illustrate the point, figures issued by CADW show that it has accelerated the listing building re-surveys of Wales from 6 communities per year to 80 per year – with an obvious increase in the number of units requiring protection, but has there been an equivalent rise in resources to match?"

(City and County of Swansea)

7n. Listing

a) "... Spot listing should not be allowed by one Cadw employee When they never take into account the social consequences to the area and the people who live in it..... the present approach has no real regard for the individuals or the general community in socially deprived areas."

(Peter Law, AM)

b) "[Completion of community resurvey lists by 2005]... needs to be supported by thematic lists. We were pleased to note the completion of the first of these (Welsh Chapels) in 2000."

(Architectural Heritage Fund)

c). "[Cadw should] communicate with other owners of all listed buildings [and] transform the perception and reality of listing from burden to benefit"

(Owner of listed buildings)

d) "..... [there is] the need for greater transparency and accountability over the listing and scheduling process... "

(Country Land and Business Association)

e) "The listing process doesn't adequately take into account the knowledge, views and economic interest of owners."

(Members of Brecon Beacons National Park Authority).

8. Partnerships

8a. Partnerships with Organisations

a. "...increasingly concerned about the timing of grant decisions and the process of dialogue that leads up to these....."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "Relationships would be strengthened by greater openness, transparency and communication as to the aims and objectives of Cadw.Cadw co-funded a project – "Valuing the Environment" which looked at the economic impact of the environment in Wales. Cadw ... felt unable to be acknowledged within the document because of their status within the Assembly. Similarly Cadw feels unable to become a full member of the multi agency and multi NGO group set up to support the historic environment in Wales – TASC – because of its Assembly status".

"Cadw needs to build closer relationships with CCW, NGOs and environmental bodies. Issues to be addressed would include influencing the work of the Assembly, education and lifelong learning and wider landscape conservation. In the past Cadw has worked effectively with the National Trust Wales and the other heritage bodies to promote the heritage of Wales through publications and marketing. Its input into this field has been much more limited recently. The linkages between the Wales Tourist Board and Cadw should also be strengthened".

"Cadw has been very responsive and helpful to The National Trust Wales at a local level. The work load has occasionally caused delays in receiving responses. Cadw does not appear to have a strong customer focus at present. Its information is not easily accessible".

(National Trust)

c. "We would welcome a closer working relationship with Cadw....."

(Disability Wales)

d. "The relationship of both Cadw and the Welsh Archaeological Trusts with Countryside Council for Wales has become highly effective over recent years..... which is leading to a holistic approach to landscape management at a national and regional level".

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

e. "Opportunities should be investigated for partnerships (in the field of interpretation) with other organisations such as the National Museum and the National Library".

(Council for the Protection of Rural Wales)

f. "Developing partnership with Unitary Authorities would be particularly advantageous in the future."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

g. "Although Cadw responded to our review of the National Curriculum in 1997-2000, we have had very limited contact with them".

(Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales)

h. "...the urgent need for Cadw and the Wales Tourist Board to work together in the presentation, promotion and use of the historic environment, particularly focussing on cultural tourism".

[changes in Cadw policy] "... Introduced without prior consultation the need for such consultations to forge the necessary partnership".

(Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

i. "Cadw, through the Archaeological Trusts, has sponsored many intelligently devised surveys to enhance the record of individual monument types. But the work has in some cases been rather narrow in its focus and has lacked the essential element of analysis which would raise bald records to works of original scholarship and understanding."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

j. "... no reason to .. fuse Cadw with the Royal Commission – we fear that scarce resources would go towards conservation grants rather than research into the history and functions of buildings... Given the small size of both organisations ... economies of scale would be minimal, and non-existent in the short term.

(Ancient Monuments Society)

k. "British Waterways would like to work with Cadw to develop a vision for the waterways of Wales to determine priorities and timing... Cadw could usefully all develop an enhanced relationship with the new Waterways Trust."

(British Waterways)

l. "HLF has experienced some very positive and co-operative partnership working with Cadw, particularly in relation to our Townscape Heritage Initiative, which has been extremely well received. However, in terms of service delivery from Cadw we consider that there is scope for improvement. This may be largely a question of resources, and higher levels of professional staff. In terms of partnerships on policy and strategic issues we have found that Cadw has not always been able to engage actively with HLF. Again this may be a resource problem, and Cadw has recently proved unable to field a representative at discussions of policy and research whether in Wales or London.."

(Heritage Lottery Fund)

m. "It is worth beginning by saying how very indebted we are to Cadw's support on a number of projects – particularly a major consolidation programme at Carew Castle here in Pembrokeshire which has demonstrated excellent partnership working, and also with the establishment and running of some of Wales' most successful historic town schemes."

"Local authorities / national parks seeking even informal advice from Cadw officers is difficult, and the administrative procedures are poor – many letters on important issues go unanswered, and even Cadw-funded projects such as Buildings at Risk Studies or Conservation Area Studies have barely been acknowledged. Much more needs to be done on a partnership basis – not only on conservation, but also on local distinctiveness, new design etc. Despite welcome recent funding for Buildings at Risk/Conservation Area Studies, little thought has been given to adopting national models and uniform practice – a missed opportunity. The strengths and expertise which local authorities and National Parks should be acknowledged and appreciated to a greater extent, and the scope for agency arrangements explored more positively."

(Pembrokeshire Coast National Park)

n. "The framework for our liaison and working relationship with a Cadw is set out in a **Statement of Intent for the Conservation of the Natural, Archaeological and Historic Environment in Wales** jointly drawn up and signed by us in 1996. The Statement is, therefore, six years old, and [it] is probably a timely juncture at which we should review it our two organisations could benefit enormously by developing our understanding of [the close relationship between the natural and historic environment in Wales] and of the way it affects our respective interests and concerns in the Welsh environment. There is certainly the scope to have more regular liaison meetings with Cadw, but if we are to make real progress, then it can only be achieved through joint training programmes and staff exchanges, which I think, we should both seriously consider."

(Countryside Council for Wales)

o. "Productive relationships exist in a number of respects between Cadw staff and this Authority's planning department staff. These could be greatly enhanced through the introduction of a local heritage strategy, negotiated on an annual basis. Currently, relationships with Cadw staff tend to be on a topic basis rather than being strategic."

"The Built Heritage Forum is an excellent initiative, but it perhaps remains too formal with an abiding us-and-them format. Active participation by more Cadw officers could help to break down barriers."

"There is generally an effective understanding amongst relevant planning officers regarding Cadw's role and relationship with this Authority. Unfortunately, misunderstandings do sometimes occur amongst LBC applicants. Members and officers from other departments regarding Cadw's role. Within the Authority this is particularly the case in respect of the Authority's own LBC and CAC applications."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

p. "... there is significant scope for closer working relationships between Cadw and Local Authorities. While there are very good networks amongst staff these

could be strengthened through more joint working and more structured project partnerships. Establishing Joint Conservation Forums could be a valuable means of promoting our built heritage, celebrating good practice, and developing local conservation skills."

(City and County of Swansea)

q. "Partnership with other individuals and organisations is vital to securing achievements in the conservation field. CADW should develop a clear strategy to maximise the benefits from partnership working. This includes important players such as listed building owners, local authorities, contractors etc. There should also be closer co-ordination between potential funding agencies in Wales that can be of potential benefit to the historic environment. Sources of funding such as housing funds should be administered so that potential benefit to historic buildings is recognised as a priority."

"There is an effective understanding between CADW and planning and conservation specialists in the Council, however, CADW is often perceived by others including listed building owners and the public and local interest groups as remote. CADW's role is only understood by some but this is not surprising given the centralised nature of the organisation and the current level of resources....."

(Flintshire County Council)

8b. Partnerships with the public

a. ".....a staggering inept procedure Cadw adopt in the selection of listed buildings..... I was notconsulted or invited to contribute".

(Owner of a listed property, Monmouthshire)

b. "Cadw appears to have no consideration or sympathy for our rights as a property owner. They do notappreciate the problemsin maintaining homes. The cost of our house insurance has also doubled since we were listed".

(Owner of a listed terraced house, in the Bridgend area.)

c. "...the general public tends to see Cadw as...restrictive..., rather than as a group of experts who can offer help and advice.... partly due to the habit of planning departments hiding behind Cadw on contentious matters. [A view].....on occasion ...fostered by the tone of letters sent by Cadw's administration and also by a sense of remoteness as for many other government departments."

(Council for British Archaeology – Wales)

d. "Better mutual understanding of the perspectives and concerns of Cadw ... and owners and occupiers ... could be provided by circulating information ... on relevant issues which might interest them. A parallel example is ... the newsletter "sitelines" which English Nature distributes to the 33,000 or so owners and occupiers of Sites of Special Scientific Interest in England."

(County Land and Business Association)

e. "The power of this unelected and fundamentally unaccountable quango to inappropriately and adversely impact on the lives of so many private citizens is totally unacceptable. Any meaningful review of CADW must address these basic democratic failings."

(Owner of a listed house, Bridgend area)

f. "CADW interpret and administer the rules and so can literally get away with anything as it is also independent appeal body."

(Residents of a street where properties were listed in South Wales)

g. "Generally, Cadw is seen [by the public] as remote and aloof, certainly not as a user-friendly organisation, sympathetic to the needs and concerns of the rural economy. The Historic Buildings Council equally are seen as an academic non-practical body, who make decisions with little apparent justification or reason. A common complaint is the lack of grant assistance, and the rather casual, even arrogant accompanying administrative procedures."

(Pembrokeshire Coast National Park on behalf of the three Welsh National Park Authorities)

h. "Cadw don't always understand the implications of delays which can some times lead to financial loss....." ".... a procedure is needed which flags up Cadw concerns at the earliest opportunity to owners rather in the same way that the Environment Agency has a procedure for copying their response to the Local Planning Authority to the applicant."

(Members of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority)

i. "[There is a] ...lack of public details as to [Cadw's] management structure."

" Should not the various [Cadw and Royal Commission] reports on buildings , landscapes etc, funded out of the public purse , be made freely available for public consultation?"

(The Welsh Mines Preservation Trust)

9a. Cadw within the National Assembly: Cadw and the Assembly's key themes and policies

a. "....Cadw's aims and objectives, deriving as they do from a reorganisation of monuments administration in the early 1980s, in reality [do not]reflect the guiding themes and values of the Assembly... there is a prior need to review policy for the historic environment as a whole, and within this to consider the respective roles of government, local authorities and the voluntary sector....."

(Civic Trust for Wales)

b. "We may need to accept a greater degree of change to reduce energy use..... [in grade II listed buildings]"

(Frances Voelcker, Architect and Secretary of a Buildings Presentation Trust)

c. ".....Cadw fails to provide guidance on issues such as sustainable development, economic value of the historic environment and the advantages of partnership working".

"A thorough review is required of the entire role of Cadw in order to enable proper understanding of the importance of the historic environment and to provide adequate information in order to safeguard the future. In addition to increased resourcing for the statutory responsibilities, the key issues that remain are education, research and information. These have all taken a back seat perhaps in the effort to deal with statutory responsibilities. But without education and research and evidence, local authorities, politicians and others will never understand the true significance of the historic environment".

(National Trust)

d. "[Issues emerging from the Disability Discrimination Act 1995]..... will have implications for the role of Cadw [including] –

" it is crucial that the listed building consent process is not perceived by applicants as a caveat or excuse to avoid making reasonable adjustments to premises"

"Promoting best practices principles and guidance on access for disabled people to both providers and the public ... beyond the minimal requirements of the DDA."

"How historic buildings can be made more widely accessible to disabled people through a range of interventions, including the interpretation, communication, and presentation of the "heritage experience" through a variety of formats and media understanding that access is much more than a physical barriers issue; that disabled people have a right to enjoy public facilities on the same terms as everyone else".

(Disability Wales)

e) "..... the charging of entry fees to monuments in the care of the National Assembly ... this can be exclusive."

(Institute of Field Archaeologists)

f) "The development of the Assembly's themes and values will be greatly enhanced by the encouragement of partnership between Cadw and other bodies such as the Wales Tourist Board and TASC." [TASC is the multi agency committee (which includes some non-governmental bodies) set up to discuss built and moveable heritage in Wales].

(Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

g. "The very listing of such properties as those of [a Valleys Street] owned by ordinary working people shows that CADW aren't doing anything to tackle social disadvantage. Many people [have] worked very hard underground and spent most of their savings making their houses comfortable for their retirements. To be told to remove double-glazed UPVC windows and doors ...does nothing to conserve the environment, such as heat conservation. How can CADW be promoting sustainable development when its sole focus is that of recreating period buildings of yesteryear? They are intent on recreating one specific date in time for [a street] which is a living, evolving community. ...CADW's work impedes the progress which should now be taking place in westernised communities towards energy efficient homes which are environmentally friendly, e.g. solar-panelled roofing, condensing boilers and effective insulation."

(Correspondent from South Wales Valleys)

h. "Cadw's role in promoting access to historic buildings assists the process of social inclusion."

"Cadw's aims and objectives reflect very well NAW's core value of promoting sustainable development, although there is little evidence of the value of Cadw's work in NAW's strategic documents. A policy document comparable to English Heritage's document on sustainability would be welcomed."

(Bridgend County Borough Council)

i. "NAW needs to give greater visibility to the built heritage in its policy documents, and to give Cadw greater financial and political support in its important role."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

j. " ... there need to be stronger and more visible linkages between Cadw's objectives and the wider aims of the Assembly since it is vital that the conservation of built heritage is not seen as a burden or barrier to development or change."

(City and County of Swansea)

k. "CADW's aims and objectives may indeed improve their focus if they better reflect the nationally agreed aims relating to sustainability, social disadvantage and inclusiveness etc."

(Flintshire County Council)

l. "Development of Cadw/NAW's conservation policy needs to catch up with English Heritage/DCMS, and be more clearly a part of NAW's sustainable development agenda."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

9b. Cadw within the National Assembly: Location of Cadw

Location of Cadw

a. ".....an excellent working relationship with Cadw's inspectors who are willing to respond quickly to requests for advice and assistance throughout Wales".

"A sub-office in north Wales should be considered to address the regional imbalance. Alternatively many organisations in Wales are structured regionally either by setting up regional sub offices. CCW for example have offices across Wales. Correlation with the Assembly's division of Wales into four regions could be considered".

(National Trust)

b. "Our Northern Dioceses have felt that their distance from Cardiff has meant that they have not had the contact with Cadw they would have wished A northern regional office of Cadw might offset this perceived problem."

(Representative Body of the Church in Wales)

c. "Cadw is a relatively small organisation and any restructuring on a functional or geographical basis would in our view only result in higher administrative costs and the fragmentation of existing resources.

(Dyfed Archaeological Trust)

d. "[a] devolved structure in Wales ...would not work effectively. There are simply not enough professional staff to support separate regional offices in Wales."

(The Georgian Group)

e. "It would be helpful for Cadw to consider more regional 'surgeries' going out to local authorities to raise the profile of conservation issues. Allied to this it would be helpful to have a clearer idea as to who does what within Cadw (eg which listing inspector covers which area or theme, which architect covers which area etc..)"

(Monmouthshire County Council)

f. "One benefit based on the English set up is having a QUANGO in place of a central government executive agency is being able to have regional cover as opposed to a central office which in Wales is far from central."

(Isle of Anglesey County Council)

g. Cadw should remain a national organisation, and wholesale regional restructuring would not be helpful since its staff complement is too small to regionalise."

(Welsh Religious Buildings Trust)

h. "CADW's structure could be much improved in terms of its regional effectiveness. CADW's single Cardiff base is not advantageous to joint partnership working with local authorities and other local organisations and voluntary groups, especially when examined from a North Wales perspective."

(Flintshire County Council)

10. Other Issues including VAT

VAT

a.) "Teasing out zero-rated alterations among standard rate items is an exercise not paid for in Cadw or lottery grants."

(Francis John Golder, Principal, Highmead VAT consultancy)

`b) "... a levelling of VAT to 5% over the building industry spectrum would do a great deal."

(Sara Furse, Member, Historic Buildings Council for Wales)

c. ".... Most alterations made to listed buildings qualify for zero-rating whereas expenditure incurred on repairs is subject to standard-rate VAT. This appears to penalise those who seek to maintain our heritage and to help those who alter it...."

(County Land and Business Association).

Other taxation issues

"Regular maintenance of historic fabric could be encouraged by some form of tax rebate linked to listed or conservation area buildings."

(Sara Furse, Member, Historic Buildings Council for Wales)

"Dual Control"

"..... [ie]the unsatisfactory situation where local planning authorities would control, by means of secular listed buildings controls, works to listed structures in church yards whilst,, the exempted denominations control system would deal with the church itself. "[going to say that delegating listed building control to local planning authorities doesn't sit well within similar delegation of exempted denominations control system to Diocesan Courts]."

(Representative Body of Church in Wales)

Field Monument Wardens

"Expanding [the] service and possibly basing it within the local Welsh Archaeological Trusts) might be a cost-effective means of providing points of local contact

for the public".

(Gwynedd Archaeological Trust)

Space between buildings

"..... the importance of space: space between buildings or as the setting to a listed building. Too many fine structures and designed areas have been socially downgraded by the exploitation of their land."

(Sara Furse, Member of the Historic Buildings Council)

Museum Registration

"..... worrying that Cadw has not.... Put its relevant guardianship sites within the Museum Registration Scheme. English Heritage has If Cadw sees itself as promoting standards and its achievements it should"

(Council of Museums in Wales)

Voluntary Sector

"... there is an opportunity for Cadw and the voluntary sector in partnership to achieve more. Out of the 24 [Architectural Heritage Fund supported] projects completed in the UK in 2000-01 none were in Wales and this pattern is likely to be repeated in 2001-02 and beyond"

(The Architectural Heritage Fund)

World Heritage Sites

"[the 2 current World Heritage Sites in Wales are] ... great examples of an industrial landscape and the fortified complexes ... require particular focus"

"... we think that a good deal more priority needs to be given to the preparation of a WHS Management Plan for the Welsh Castles in Cadw's work programme."

(International Council on Monuments and Sites – UK)

Legal Documentation

"... lax wording accompanying listed building consents in Wales, which would not be tolerated in England ... LBCs [should] not be granted without prior securing of development projects of greater inherent work than the listed buildings they replace ... [to] include **detailed** planning permission **and** demonstration of solid financial backing."

(Dr Loach, architectural historian)

Sites and Monuments Record

"It is critical that these records remain based at a regional level where they are best able to deliver local management needs. However, they are currently chronically underfunded... a review of the way in which the SMRs are funded is urgently required".

LIST OF RESPONDEES TO CADW CONSULTATION

Summary of numbers of substantive respondents

Local Authorities 11

Voluntary Sector Organisations 20

Other Organisations 17

Respondees writing as individuals 9

Total 57

1. Local Authorities

County Archivist and Heritage Officer

Denbighshire County Council

Planning and Environmental Services

Isle of Anglesey County Council

Director, Transportation, Planning and the Flintshire County Council

Environment

Assistant Director, Planning Bridgend County Borough Council

Head of Arts, Culture & Tourism

Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council

Conservation Officer

Monmouthshire County Council

Chief Executive

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority (responding on behalf of the 3 National Parks)

Chief Leisure, Libraries and Culture Officer

Wrexham County Borough Council

Assistant National Park Officer reporting additional views of Members

Brecon Beacons National Park Authority

Cabinet Member for Development

City and County of Swansea

and Director Development

Planning Committee

City and County of Cardiff

2. Voluntary Sector Organisations

Secretary	Ancient Monuments Society
Director	Cambria Archaeology, Dyfed Archaeological Trust
Director	Campaign for the Protection of Rural Wales
Director	The Civic Trust for Wales
Chair	The Council for British Archaeology - Wales
Access Officer	Disability Wales
Policy Advisory	The Garden History Society
Secretary	The Georgian Group
Director	Gwynedd Archaeological Trust
Chair	Llanelli Disabled Access Group
Head of Policy & Communications	The National Trust Wales
Executive Director	Railway Heritage Trust
Property Executive	The Representative Body of the Church in Wales
Secretary	Save Britain's Heritage
Convenor	Documentation and Conservation of the Modern Movement - Wales
Director	The Theatres Trust
Secretary, Listed Buildings Advisory Committee	The United Reformed Church
Trust Manager	Welsh Religious Buildings Trust
Director	Institute of Field Archaeologists
Director	Welsh Mines Preservation Trust

3. Other Organisations

Peter Law, AM	The National Assembly for Wales
Director	The Architectural Heritage Fund

Chief Executive	British Waterways
Chair	Built & Moveable Heritage Wales
Campaigns officer	Council for National Parks
Assistant Regional Director	Country Land and Business Association - Wales
Professor of Mediaeval History and Pro-Vice Chancellor	University of Wales Swansea
Secretary	The Royal Commission of Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales
Historic Environment Officer	Countryside Council for Wales
Secretary	International Council on Monuments and Sites - UK (ICOMOS-UK)
Acting Director	The Council of Museums in Wales
Policy Officer	Disability Rights Commission
Owner	Fieldsman Trails, Access Consultancy, Flintshire
Director Wales & West	Health & Safety Executive
Director of Policy	Heritage Lottery Fund
Principal	Highmead VAT Consultancy, West Wales
Chief Executive	Qualifications, Curriculum & Assessment Authority for Wales

4. **Respondees writing as individuals**

Owner of an estate

Owner of a listed property in Monmouthshire

Owner of a listed cottage in South East Wales

Member of the Historic Buildings Council involved in conservation in North East Wales

Owners of a listed terraced house in a South Wales valley

Resident of Meirionnydd

One member of Cadw's staff

Conservation Architect of a local authority

Secretary of a buildings preservation trust in North Wales