



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu
The Enterprise and Learning Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 19 Mehefin 2008
Thursday, 19 June 2008**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad ac Ymddiheuriadau
Introduction and Apologies
- 5 Tystiolaeth i Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor i Gyfraniad Economaidd Addysg Uwch
Evidence to the Committee Inquiry into the Economic Contribution of Higher Education
- 28 Adroddiad Terfynol Drafft am Gymorth i Bobl â Dyslecsia yng Nghymru
Final Draft Report of the Dyslexia Rapporteur Group on Dyslexia Support in Wales

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Jeff Cuthbert	Llafur Labour
Andrew R.T. Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Irene James	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Christine Chapman) Labour (substitute for Christine Chapman)
Gareth Jones	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Huw Lewis	Llafur Labour
David Melding	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Sandy Mewies	Llafur Labour
Janet Ryder	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Kirsty Williams	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Dr Haydn Edwards	Pennaeth a Phrif Weithredwr, Coleg Menai Principal and Chief Executive, Coleg Menai
Yr Athro/Professor Siân Hope	Dirprwy Is-Ganghellor Trosglwyddo Gwybodaeth a Menter, Prifysgol Bangor Pro-Vice-Chancellor, Knowledge Transfer and Enterprise, Bangor University
Yr Athro/Professor Merfyn Jones	Is-Ganghellor, Prifysgol Bangor Vice Chancellor, Bangor University
Dr Tim Stowe	Cyfarwyddwr, RSPB Cymru Director, RSPB Cymru

Swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn bresennol
Assembly Parliamentary Service officials in attendance

Dan Collier	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Dr Kathryn Jenkins	Clerc Clerk
Alys Thomas	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau Members' Research Service
Anne Thomas	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau Members' Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 1.30 p.m.
The meeting began at 1.30 p.m.

Cyflwyniad ac Ymddiheuriadau
Introduction and Apologies

[1] **Gareth Jones:** Croeso i bob un **Gareth Jones:** I welcome Members,

ohonoch, yn Aelodau, yn dystion ac unrhyw aelodau o'r cyhoedd fydd yn ymuno â ni, i'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. Estynnaf groeso cynnes i Andrew R.T. Davies, y Gweinidog cysgodol dros addysg. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen yn arw at eich cyfraniadau, Andrew. Yr ydych yn aelod newydd o'r pwyllgor ond yn wyneb cyfarwydd iawn inni, ac yr ydych wedi dirprwyo yn y pwyllgor hwn o'r blaen.

witnesses and any members of the public who may join us, to the Enterprise and Learning Committee. I extend a warm welcome to Andrew R.T. Davies, the shadow Minister for education. We look forward to your contributions, Andrew. You are a new member of the meeting but a familiar face, and you have substituted in this committee before.

[2] Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau yn caniatáu imi ddatgan o'r gadair, ar ran pawb un ohonom, ein diolch i Alun Cairns am ei gyfraniad adeiladol, bywiog ac effeithiol i weithgarwch y pwyllgor hwn, yn enwedig yn y gwaith yr oedd wedi'i wneud, ynghyd â thri Aelod arall, fel aelod o'r grŵp rapporteur a oedd yn edrych i mewn i ddyslecsia. Gwnaeth Alun gyfraniad arbennig i'r gwaith hwnnw a byddwn yn cyfeirio at yr adroddiad yn hwyrach.

I am sure that Members will permit me to state from the chair, on behalf of every one of us, our thanks to Alun Cairns for his constructive, lively and effective contribution to this committee's work, especially in the work that he had done, along with three other Members, as a member of the rapporteur group that looked into dyslexia. Alun made a significant contribution to that work and we will refer to the report later on.

[3] **Jeff Cuthbert:** I endorse those remarks. Alun and I did not always see eye to eye on a number of education issues, but that is politics. There is no doubt that he was unstinting in his efforts and his contributions to make the dyslexia report, which we will discuss under item 3 of the agenda, as meaningful as possible, and I am sure that his interest will continue.

[4] **Gareth Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, Jeff.

Gareth Jones: Thank you, Jeff.

[5] Atgoffaf bawb i ddiffodd ffonau symudol ac unrhyw ddyfais electronig arall sydd yn eu meddiant. Nid oes angen cyffwrdd â'r microffonau. Nid ydym yn disgwyl unrhyw ymarferion tân, felly os clywn larwm, bydd yn rhaid inni symud allan o'r adeilad dan gyfarwyddiadau'r tywysyddion. Mae'r cyfarfod yn ddwyieithog ac mae clustffonau ar gael ichi dderbyn gwasanaeth cyfieithu ar y pryd o'r Gymraeg i'r Saesneg. Mae'r cyfieithiad ar sianel 1, ac mae sianel 0 yn chwyddleisio'r sain. Bydd cofnod o'r cyfan a ddywedir yn gyhoeddus.

I remind everyone to switch off mobile phones and any other electronic devices that they have in their possession. There is no need to touch the microphones. We do not expect there to be a fire alarm, so if we hear an alarm, we will have to move out of the building, following instructions from the ushers. The meeting is bilingual and headphones are available to receive a simultaneous translation from Welsh to English. The translation is on channel 1, and channel 0 amplifies the sound. There will be a record of everything said in public.

[6] Yr ydym wedi derbyn ymddiheuriad oddi wrth Christine Chapman. Deallaf y bydd Irene James yn dirprwyo yn ei lle ac y bydd Irene yn ymuno â ni yn hwyrach.

We have received apologies from Christine Chapman. I understand that Irene James will be substituting in her place and that Irene will join us later on.

1.33 p.m.

Tystiolaeth i Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor i Gyfraniad Economaidd Addysg Uwch
Evidence to the Committee Inquiry into the Economic Contribution of Higher
Education

[7] **Gareth Jones:** Yr ydym yn croesawu cynrychiolwyr o ddau sefydliad ym Mangor: yr Athro Merfyn Jones, is-ganghellor Prifysgol Bangor, yr Athro Siân Hope, dirprwy is-ganghellor, trosglwyddo gwybodaeth a menter, Prifysgol Bangor, a Dr Haydn Edwards, pennaeth a phrif weithredwr Coleg Menai. Datganaf fuddiant—ac mae'n iawn fy mod i'n gwneud hyn a bod hyn yn cael ei gofnodi—gan mai un o'm cyn-ddisgyblion yw Haydn. Cafwyd llwyddiannau nodedig yn fy ngyrfa. [*Chwerthin.*] Croesawaf y tystion; yr ydym yn hynod falch eu bod yma. Diolchaf iddynt am y dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig yr ydym wedi ei derbyn, sef papurau 1 a 2 ar yr agenda.

[8] Ni wn a yw'r tri ohonoch am wneud cyflwyniad ond os bydd cyflwyniad, gofynnaf ichi ei gadw at ryw bum munud i 10 munud ar y mwyaf, ac wedyn fe gawn gyfle i ofyn cwestiynau. Yr ydym yn dra diolchgar am y dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig, sydd yn hynod o ddifyr.

[9] **Yr Athro Jones:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Dyma'r ail gyfle i ni gael dod gerbron pwyllgor a chael y fraint o roi tystiolaeth i chi. Y tro cyntaf, siaradais ar ran addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ond heddiw, os maddeuwch i mi, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar Brifysgol Bangor yn ogystal â'n partneriaethau â sefydliadau eraill a chyda'r byd busnes. Byddaf yn fyr iawn.

[10] Yr ydych wedi gweld y dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig, ond, yn amlwg, y mae sefydliad fel Prifysgol Bangor yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar yr economi leol oherwydd yr arian y mae'r brifysgol yn ei ddenu i'r ardal. Mae ein hincwm eleni ychydig dros £100 miliwn ac y mae tua £42 miliwn o hwnnw'n dod yn uniongyrchol o'r cyngor cyllido—o goffrau Llywodraeth Cymru—ac mae'r £60 miliwn arall yn dod o ffioedd myfyrwyr a grantiau ymchwil ac yn y blaen. Mae angen ennill yr arian hwnnw'n gystadleuol bob blwyddyn.

Gareth Jones: We welcome representatives from two institutions in Bangor: Professor Merfyn Jones, vice-chancellor of Bangor University, Professor Siân Hope, pro-vice-chancellor, knowledge transfer and enterprise, Bangor University, and Dr Haydn Edwards, principal and chief executive of Coleg Menai. I declare an interest—and it is right that I do this and that it is recorded—in that Haydn is one of my former pupils. There have been notable successes in my career. [*Laughter.*] I welcome the witnesses; we are very pleased to see them. Thank you for the written evidence that we have received, namely papers 1 and 2 on the agenda.

I do not know whether all three of you would like to make a presentation but if you do have a presentation, I would ask you to keep it to five or 10 minutes and then we will have an opportunity to ask questions. We are very grateful for the very interesting written evidence.

Professor Jones: Thank you, Chair. This is my second opportunity to appear before a committee and have the privilege of providing evidence to you. The first time, I spoke on behalf of higher education in Wales, but today, if you forgive me, I will concentrate on Bangor University as well as the partnerships that we have with other institutions and with business. I will be very brief.

You have seen the written evidence, but, clearly, an institution like Bangor University has a direct impact on the local economy because of the money that it attracts to the area. Our income this year is a little over £100 million and around £42 million of that comes directly from the funding council—from the Welsh Government's coffers—and the other £60 million comes from student tuition fees and research grants and so on. We need to compete for that money every year.

[11] Yr ydym yn cyflogi tua 2,300 o unigolion, yn cynnwys 1,400 o unigolion sy'n gyfwerth ag amser llawn. Yr ydym yn cyflogi nifer o bobl leol, sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaethau yn y brifysgol, gan gynnwys rhywun fel fi, yn ogystal â phobl academig o bob rhan o'r byd. Felly, mae'r effaith honno'n amlwg ac yr ydym yn amcangyfrif, gan ddefnyddio meddalwedd sydd ar gael gan Universities UK, bod yr effaith uniongyrchol honno ar yr ardal yn £230 miliwn. Wrth gwrs, pan soniaf am yr ardal, ni soniaf am Fangor yn unig, ond am yr ardal teithio i waith, sydd yn ardal gweddol fawr, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y mae nifer ohonoch yn gwybod, o ryw 30 milltir neu fwy o gwmpas Bangor.

We employ around 2,300 individuals, including 1,400 full-time equivalents. We employ many local people, who work in services in the university, including individuals such as myself, as well as academic people from all over the world. Therefore, that impact is evident and using the software available from Universities UK, we estimate that the direct impact on the area is around £230 million a year. Of course, when I talk about the area, I am not only talking about Bangor itself, but about the travel-to-work area, which is a relatively large area, as I am sure some of you know, extending around 30 miles or more around Bangor.

[12] Un o'r prif resymau yr ydym yn bodoli yw er mwyn hyfforddi ac addysgu pobl. Yr ydym yn darparu sgiliau uwch ac yr ydym yn gwneud gwaith gradd, wrth gwrs, gydag israddedigion, ond yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gydag ôl-raddedigion sy'n gweithio tuag at gyflawni doethuriaethau ac yn y blaen. Mae'r sgiliau hynny'n allweddol bwysig er mwyn datblygu'r economi wybodaeth yr ydym i gyd yn edrych ymlaen at ei sefydlu yng Nghymru ac sydd eto i ddod. Er enghraifft, wrth sôn am sgiliau uwch-uwch, fel petai, gwelwch yn y ddogfen bod bellach 120 o fyfyrwyr ar draws Cymru yn astudio am ddoethuriaethau ac mae bob un ohonynt yn gweithio gyda chwmnïau lleol. Felly, mae darparu sgiliau entrepreneuriaeth ymysg myfyrwyr yn bwysig iawn.

One of the main reasons that we exist is to educate and train people. We provide high-level skills and we do work at degree level, of course, with undergraduates, but we also work with post-graduates working towards PhDs and so on. Those skills are crucial in developing the knowledge economy that we all look forward to establishing in Wales and which is yet to come. For example, in talking about higher-higher skills, as it were, you will see in the document that 120 students throughout Wales are now studying for PhDs and each one is working with local companies. Therefore, the provision of entrepreneurial skills among students is very important.

[13] Cawsom gystadleuaeth yn ddiweddar ymysg y myfyrwyr am y syniadau a chynlluniau gorau i greu busnesau a chafodd un cynllun gymaint o argraff arnaf, bu i mi ddyblu'r wobwr. Yr oedd gan un myfyriwr, a oedd yn ei ail flwyddyn yn astudio seicoleg, nid syniad yn unig; yr oedd eisoes wedi sefydlu busnes sylweddol yn trefnu llety i fyfyrwyr ar draws gwledydd Prydain.

We had a competition recently among the students on the best ideas and schemes to create businesses and I was so impressed by one scheme that I doubled the award. One student, who was in his second year studying psychology, had not just had an idea, but had already established a substantial business organising accommodation for students throughout the British nations.

1.40 p.m.

[14] Os ewch chi i mewn i'r wefan, gwelwch ei fod yn gweithio yn Birmingham, Glasgow—ym mhobman—a bachgen 21 oed ydyw. Y math hwnnw o sgiliau yr ydym yn ceisio eu meithrin ymysg ein myfyrwyr.

If you go into the website, he is working in Birmingham, Glasgow—all over the place—and he is a 21-year-old. Those are the kind of skills that we are trying to develop among our students.

[15] Wedyn, wrth gwrs, mae ymchwil.

Then, of course, there is research. There is a

Mae llawer o fanylion yn y ddogfen ysgrifenedig am ymchwil, felly ni wnafw bwsleisio hwnnw ymhellach. Mae trosglwyddo gwybodaeth ac ymchwil eto'n allweddol bwysig. Mae pobl yn cael hyn yn rhyfedd, ond y gwir yw bod Bangor wedi bod yn arloesol yn hyn o beth dros y blynnyddoedd, ac wastad wedi bod ymysg y 10 cyntaf ar draws Prydain yn narpariaeth y partneriaethau trosglwyddo gwybodaeth. Y llynedd, cawsom y wob—er nad y wob gyntaf yr ydym wedi'i derbyn—am y partneriaethau trosglwyddo gwybodaeth gorau ym Mhrydain. Felly, yn amlwg, yr ydym yn gwneud rhywbeth yn iawn. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda rhyw 100 o fusnesau i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth yn trosglwyddo o'r brifysgol i fyd busnes. Mae hynny'n allweddol bwysig inni ac i'n cyfrifoldeb i'r prosiect Môn a Menai yn natblygu'r ardal.

[16] Yn olaf, fel prifysgol, yr ydym yn ymrwymo i bartneriaethau yn rhyngwladol, yn nhermau ymchwil a phartneriaethau â myfyrwyr yn y dwyrain canol, yn Tsieina ac mewn gwledydd eraill, ond yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio'n lleol. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Dr Haydn Edwards—y disgybl da, er nid felly yr wyf yn ei weld—yma gyda ni, oherwydd un o'r partneriaethau sydd gennym yw honno â Choleg Menai, ac mae gennym bartneriaethau gyda cholegau eraill ar draws gogledd Cymru. Hefyd, mae gennym bartneriaethau gyda phrifysgolion eraill yng Nghymru, a phartneriaeth uchelgeisiol iawn ar y cyd ag Aberystwyth, sydd yn ymwneud nid yn unig ag ymchwil, ond â mentergarwch a datblygu economi Cymru i'r gogledd o'r M4, oherwydd ychydig iawn a fyddai'n digwydd fel arall.

[17] Dyna fy natganiad byr ar y cychwyn, Gadeirydd. Ni wn a hoffai Haydn ddweud gair.

[18] **Dr Edwards:** Diolch am y cyfle i ddod atoch, a gobeithiaf y bydd yr hyn sydd gennym i'w ddweud mewn tystiolaeth, ar ran y ddau sefydliad, o gymorth ichi wrth wneud eich gwaith. O ran y cyfeiriad at fod yn gyn-ddisgybl i chi, yr wyf yn teimlo rhyw don o euogrydd, pan gyfeiriasoch at yr ysgol, Mr Jones, na wnes i ddewis gwneud daearyddiaeth—

lot of detail about research in the written document, so I will not emphasise that further. The transfer of knowledge and research is, again, crucial. People find it strange, but Bangor has been in the vanguard in this area over the years, and has always been in the top 10 across Britain in the provision of knowledge transfer partnerships. Last year, we received an award—although it was not the first award that we have received—for the best KTP throughout Britain. So, obviously, we are doing something right. We are working with some 100 businesses to ensure that information is transferred from the university into business. That is crucial for us and for our responsibility in the Môn and Menai project in developing the area.

Finally, as a university, we are committed to international partnerships, in relation to research and partnerships with students from the middle east, China and other countries, but we are also working locally. I am pleased that Dr Haydn Edwards—the good pupil, although that is not how I see him—is here with us, because one of the partnerships that we have is with Coleg Menai, and we have partnerships with other colleges across north Wales. We also have partnerships with other universities in Wales, and a very ambitious partnership with Aberystwyth, which involves not only research, but innovation and developing the Welsh economy to the north of the M4, because there would be very little happening otherwise.

That is my brief statement at the outset, Chair. I do not know whether Haydn wants to say something.

Dr Edwards: Thank you for the opportunity to appear before you, and I hope that what we have to say in our evidence, on behalf of both institutions, will be of assistance to you as you carry out your work. With reference to being a former pupil of yours, I feel a little guilty, when you refer to the school, Mr Jones, that I did not choose geography—

[19] **Yr Athro Jones:** Fe wnes i. **Professor Jones:** I did. [*Laughter.*]
[*Chwerthin.*]

[20] **Dr Edwards:** Yr oeddwn wedi syrthio mewn cariad â phwnc arall, sef cemeg. **Dr Edwards:** I had fallen in love with another subject, which was chemistry.

[21] Yn hytrach na mynd trwy'r papur, hoffwn gyfeirio at themâu a gwerthoedd sydd yn dod trwodd ynddo. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ceisio'i ddweud wrthyach yw ei bod yn bwysig bod sefydliadau fel ni—sefydliadau addysg bellach—yn ymatebol, yn arloesol ac yn fentrus. Mae gwrthdaro rhwng bod yn fentrus yn y sector gyhoeddus a methu â chymryd risg, ac yn y blaen, ond yr ydym yn ceisio'n gorau i leihau'r risg, ac, ar yr un llaw, i fod yn fentrus. Rather than going through the paper, I would like to refer to themes and values that emerge from the paper. What I am trying to tell you is that it is important that institutions such as ours—further education institutions—are responsive, innovative and enterprising. There is a clash between being enterprising in the public sector and failing to take risks, and so on, so we are doing our best to reduce risk, but still be enterprising.

[22] Thema arall sy'n dod trwodd yw'r thema o gydweithio, gyda phartneriaethau o bob math, sy'n bwysig i symud yr agenda yr ydych yn ei thrafod yn ei blaen. Rôl ganolog y Cynulliad yw i hyrwyddo hyn ac i osod cyfeiriad yn hyn o beth, a gobeithiaf fod y pwynt hwnnw yn cael ei wneud. Mae pwynt arall ynglŷn â hynny. Nid yw'r broses o gyd-gynllunio yn digwydd ddigon rhwng sefydliadau addysg, rhanbarthau a rhwng gwahanol rannau o'r sector gyhoeddus, fel datblygu'r economi, a'r cyfraniadau yr ydym ni, yn y sector addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, yn medru eu gwneud. Dylai fod cyd-gynllunio a gosod targedi ar y cyd, fel bod cyd-ddiheu a symud yn ein blaenau. Another theme that emerges is that of collaboration, with partnerships of all kinds, which are important to moving the agenda that you are discussing forward. The Assembly has a central role in promoting this and setting a direction for this, and I hope that that point is made. There is another point with regard to that. The process of joint planning does not happen often enough between education institutions, regions and different parts of the public sector, such as economic development, and the contributions that we, in further and higher education, can make. There should be joint planning and the joint setting of targets, so that there are joint aspirations and so that we move forward together.

[23] Y ddau werth olaf yr hoffwn gyfeirio atynt yw'r pwyslais ar ansawdd ac ar fod yn gost-ffeithiol. Mae Webb yn sôn yn ei adroddiad bod cost-ffeithiolrwydd yn fater moesol i'r sector cyhoeddus—hynny yw, bod yr arian sy'n cael ei wario yn cael ei wario i bwrpas, a bod hwnnw'n effeithiol. The two final values that I would like to refer to are the emphasis on quality and on being cost-effective. Webb mentions in his report that cost-efficiency is a moral issue for the public sector—that is, that the money that is spent is spent properly, and that that is done effectively.

[24] Yr wyf yn gobeithio bod y papur yn nodi ein cysylltiadau eang ac amrywiol gyda chyflogwyr a'r gymdeithas yr ydym yn ei gwasanaethu yn gyffredinol, a'n bod yn ymateb i'r galw. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yma i ddweud ein bod yn ymateb i'r galw yn llawn; mae galw nad ydym yn ymateb iddo, ac mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Nid wyf yma i adrodd stori o lwyddiant ysgubol—mae gwaith pwysig i'w wneud eto, ac mae angen I hope that the paper sets out the broad and diverse links that we have with employers and with the society that we serve in general, and that we respond to the demand. However, I have not come here to say that we are fully responding to the demand; there is demand that we are not responding to, and that is an important point to make. I am not here just to tell you a story of huge success—there is important work still to be done, and there are

ymateb i bethau. Mae angen paratoi, ac mae angen buddsoddi ar gyfer her y dyfodol, a bod yn glir beth yw'r rheini.

things that need to be addressed. We need to prepare and invest to meet future challenges, and we need to be clear as to what those challenges are.

[25] Mae un o'r argymhellion yn y papur yn cyfeirio at y pwysigrwydd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn dilyn y drafodaeth ar 'Sgiliau sy'n Gweithio i Gymru', adroddiad Webb, ac yn y blaen, wneud penderfyniadau clir. Nid wyf yn awyddus i weld ymgynghori pellach, a gwirfoddoli ar hyn, llall ac arall—yr ydym yn edrych am gyfeiriad.

One of the recommendations in the paper refers to the importance of the Assembly Government, following the discussions on 'Skills That Work for Wales', the Webb report, and so on, making clear decisions. I do not want to see further consultation, and volunteering on this, that and the other—we are looking for direction.

[26] Yn ail, cyfeiriwch at raddau sylfaen. Yr wyf yn gosod allan yn glir ein safbwynt fel coleg a safbwynt addysg bellach ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf eich bod yn gweld hefyd bod elfen o fod yn gyfrifol yn y papur; hynny yw, nid ydym eisiau gwneud pethau y mae Merfyn yn eu gwneud ym Mhrifysgol Bangor. Nid ydym eisiau agor meysydd lle mae dyblygu o fewn rhanbarth. Mae'n rhaid cael elfen o gyd-gynllunio yn hyn, tra'n cymeradwyo'n llwyr safbwynt y Llywodraeth ar raddau sylfaen.

Secondly, you refer to foundation degrees. I set out clearly our view as a college and the viewpoint of further education on this. However, I also hope that you will see that there is an element of being responsible in the paper; we do not want to do things that Merfyn is already doing at Bangor University. We do not want to open up areas that would mean duplication within a region. There must be an element of joint planning here, although I wholeheartedly applaud the Government's view of foundation degrees.

[27] Yn drydydd, ni fuaswn yn gwneud fy ngwaith fel cynrychiolydd addysg bellach heddiw heb gyfeirio yn nhermau pennawd at y sefyllfa gyllido echrydus yr ydym ynddi ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r rhai a fu'n arwain y trafodaethau a'r ddadl ddoe i ddwyn sylw i'r mater hwn. Nid wyf yn ceisio gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol; y pwynt yr wyf yn awyddus i'w gwneud yw bod angen bod yn glir sut mae'r Cynulliad angen gwario ei arian. Ni all y Cynulliad wario ei arian ym mhob man yn barhaus. Mae angen bod yn glir—os oes angen i addysg bellach grebachu, dywedwch hynny, ac ym mha feysydd. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn barhau i ymestyn a chyrraedd galw os ydym hefyd yn wynebu toriadau.

Thirdly, I would not be doing my job as a representative of further education today if I did not refer in headline terms to the appalling financial position that we are currently in. I am very grateful to those who led the discussions and the debate yesterday to draw attention to this issue. I am not trying to make a political point; the point that I want to make is that we need to be clear about how the Assembly needs to spend its money. The Assembly cannot spend its money everywhere, all the time. We have to be clear—if further education needs to shrink, then say so, and in which areas. However, we cannot continue to expand and respond to need if we are also facing cuts.

[28] Yn olaf, o ran ansawdd, mae angen gwobrwyo cyrff yn y sector cyhoeddus a phreifat sy'n cyflenwi gwasanaeth o ansawdd. Mae hwnnw'n sail i wneud penderfyniadau o ran pwy ddylai fod yn gwneud beth. Os nad yw'r ansawdd a'r cost-effeithiolrwydd yna, mae angen gofyn a yw'r gwaith angen ei wneud.

Finally, on quality, organisations in the public and private sectors should be rewarded for delivering quality services. That is the basis for making decisions as to who should be doing what. If the quality and the cost-efficiency are not in place; then we need to ask whether the work needs to be done.

[29] Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n crynhoi cyd-

I hope that that gives you some context to our

destun y papur.

paper.

[30] **Gareth Jones:** Diolch i'r ddau ohonoch am eich cyflwyniadau. Mae Aelodau yn awyddus i'ch cwestiynu ar sawl un o'r themâu yr ydych wedi cyfeirio atynt y prynhawn yma ac yn eich tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig.

Gareth Jones: Thank you both for your presentations. Members are eager to ask questions on many of the themes that you have referred to this afternoon and in your written evidence.

[31] Yr ydym yn cydnabod eich pwynt o ran cyllid. Derbyniaf fod honno'n sefyllfa nad oes modd ei hosgoi—dyna'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, i bwrpas yr ymholiad hwn, erfyniaf ar Aelodau i geisio canolbwyntio ar y ffordd allweddol ymlaen— a derbyniaf fod arian yn rhan bwysig. Soniwch am y graddau sylfaenol, ac ati; sut all y rheini fod yn allweddol i hyrwyddo'r agenda o ddatblygu'r economi? Dyna'r nod i ni geisio canolbwyntio arno. Fodd bynnag, mae rhyddid i bob Aelod ofyn y cwestiwn, ond dyna fy apêl i chi.

We acknowledge your point on funding. I accept that the situation cannot be avoided—that is where we are at present. However, for the purpose of this inquiry, I would urge Members to try to concentrate on the key way forward—and I accept that funding is an important part. You mention foundation degrees, and so on; how can they play a crucial role in promoting the economic development agenda? That is the objective for us to try to concentrate on. However, each Member is free to ask the question, but that is my appeal to you.

[32] Janet Ryder sydd â'r cwestiynau cyntaf.

Janet Ryder has the first questions.

[33] **Janet Ryder:** Thank you for your presentations, and for the papers. I wish to refer to some of the things that we have seen on committee visits, and ask what you are doing in Bangor. We have seen examples in England and America where universities have pooled all of their research, from all departments, into one research unit, and have used that so that everyone can buy into it, from any department. It retains the intellectual property, but some businesses have come from that. What we have seen in England is that local businesses have come into universities, seen what is happening, and started to realise that they can buy into the university for research and support on projects that may be quite small to begin with. That has led them on to commission human resources courses for their own staff, as well as developing staff skills in other areas.

1.50 p.m.

[34] First, what is Bangor doing about pooling research, developing research, reaching out to businesses and showing them what it has to offer, and then reaching into human resources and building up skills in businesses—through businesses coming in and asking for a course for its executives, or for a particular department, so that the university puts on tailor-made courses for them?

[35] Secondly, we have taken evidence from Cardiff medical school about its research and, last night, you talked about looking at the number of medical-related courses that Bangor offers. I just wondered whether you would like to elaborate on that, because it is an area that the committee has looked at, and it could be a good sector for Wales.

[36] **Professor Jones:** I am sure that Siân would like to address some of those issues. Our research income last year was £23 million, every penny of which had to be won competitively. That is a substantial part of what we do—it is almost a quarter of our budget. So, research is central to our mission, and so is creating spin-out and spin-in businesses. That is precisely the point that you are making about attracting business to come into the area,

because we have the skills base that they can recruit from, as well as producing spin-outs from that research. So, it is quite fundamental to our mission, and I am sure that Siân could elaborate on the detail.

[37] **Professor Hope:** To come in at that point, we have already been pooling research under the auspices of some Welsh Assembly Government initiatives—

[38] **Professor Jones:** I will come back on the medical question, by the way.

[39] **Professor Hope:** On the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, and the collaboration agenda, we have a number of collaborations—not reconfigurations—that would categorise the research pooling that is happening in England and Scotland. There is a great deal of evidence about the benefits of research pooling. For example, Bangor has led on pooling research on cognitive neuroscience with Cardiff University and Swansea University. Research pooling across Wales is already attracting large corporations, including Unilever, to bring some research work to Wales, if not necessarily to relocate their business. The research spending power of those large corporations will benefit small and medium-sized enterprises, because of the knowledge exchange in those research areas.

[40] The other example is the Aberystwyth and Bangor partnership, which involves four research centres. By pooling research in environmental sciences, the partnership has put the combined research of Bangor and Aberystwyth onto the world stage and provided a focal point for engaging with corporate business, large or small. It helps to grow small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales by providing access to that research. So, that answers the first point on the pooling of research and how we are developing that.

[41] On the second point about reaching out, we have people in our central services whose key responsibility is to go to business and industry and listen to what they need. One recent example was our work with Siemens in Llanberis. That was a big success, with Siemens bringing its global operations base out of Los Angeles and into Llanberis. So, as a global corporate player, it recognised the strength of people in the region from all skill levels, including from FE, but also the higher level skills that they can recruit in the area that is key for that corporate business to grow. They need access to our students, and, in line with the point that you made, it is also about how we can provide appropriate courses for their work-based learning to continue at a higher level. That is quite a challenge for us as a university to deliver, because we are not directly funded to do that. However, we are looking at it closely.

[42] The other example is in north-east Wales, because we do not just work in north-west Wales, and that is moneysupermarket.com, which I am sure you will know about from your constituency, Chair. It currently needs to grow by 200 employees with high-level skills. Where that growth happens could be anywhere. It also needs to grow its current workforce and it needs to find organisations that will work with it directly to help to develop and update the skills from research to what is coming next, especially in that high-tech industry. It needs to keep updating the skills of the key workforce that it already has and grow in a new area. So, we are working closely at the moment with those two areas, and they are specific examples of companies that we are working with and reaching out to, which was your point.

[43] On the point that I think is quite interesting, you will be aware of the technium network. We are heavily involved, in particular, with the centre for advanced opto-technology, which is Technium CAST at Parc Menai. All of the techniums have slightly different models, but we have a research centre there. In that technium, we have something called a software hotel, which allows corporate bodies to try before they buy. It is fair to say that the hinterland of north Wales does not have large industry sectors, so we have to work much harder in partnership with the Department for the Economy and Transport and the Department for Culture, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills to have a combined

planning approach to what access to research and what access to our graduates, in particular from the university, these companies will need.

[44] In the software hotel, there was a company called Inspired Broadcast Networks, which came to north Wales to access the research that we did in computer science. The company brought 20 jobs to the region in the first instance. It is a global corporate company operating internationally, 24 hours a day. Its research and development in software was based in London and it was looking for a new home for two reasons—it was too expensive in London and it could not afford to employ the skilled graduates that it needed, and it could not get access to the research that it needed in London universities. So, to cut a long story short, the company now has 200 employees in north-west Wales, and it runs its whole corporate research and development—it has changed its name to Inspired Gaming Group—out of north-west Wales. The company's chief executive officer said that they were going to go to India, so he said, 'From Bangalore to Bangor—who would have thought it?'. That is another example of spin-in, because spin-in is often forgotten in this area—the companies come because of the access to research and skilled people.

[45] **Professor Jones:** I will be brief on the medical issue. At one stage, Wales had an all-Wales medical school and then Swansea developed a medical school. As a university, we are committed to developing medical education in north Wales. I am approaching this subject as vice-chancellor of the university and as a citizen and consumer of the health service. From the university point of view, medical research is a huge business and it is also relevant to what this committee is looking at. The whole area of medical technology has been identified by the advisory group as being a key area of development, and it is an area in which we want to be. We already have industries locally, and we have terrific capacity in medical visualisation and diagnostic work, and so on, and real capacity in relation to joint appointments with the NHS.

2.00 p.m.

[46] People do not realise that health is the biggest thing that Bangor does, by a long way. It is our biggest area—from neuroscience to nursing. We take great pride in it and we want to see it develop. As a citizen of north Wales, I do not want us to accept that we cannot recruit the best doctors in north Wales because we do not have that facility. It is odd that there are two medical schools in south Wales but nothing for the 670,000 people who live in north Wales. Perhaps I am speaking out of turn.

[47] **Professor Hope:** I would like to come back to the point about the economic impact of having a medical school. For example, we already have one spin-out company, Aurora, which produces medical devices. It is a laboratory on a chip that tests for cryptosporidium in water. You can dip this device in water anywhere in the world and see whether the water is safe to drink. That has come about because of the existing medical research plus the electronic research. This document, 'Chemical Science Spin-outs from UK Universities', points out that the biggest opportunities are in biochemical, bioelectronics and biocomputing. The biggest opportunities, globally, are in that area. So, a medical school should also be able to capitalise on this collaboration internally to combine research strengths and have critical mass in order to use the huge potential that is available globally in creating new impact on the economy of Wales.

[48] **Yr Athro Jones:** Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle i gytuno â'r hyn y bu i Haydn sôn amdano yn ei gyflwyniad. Gallwn gyflawni cymaint yn fwy. Yr ydym yn sôn am ardal yng ngogledd Cymru sy'n ymddangos, ar yr wyneb, yn weddol llewyrchus. Os nad ydych yn digwydd byw lle yr wyf fi'n byw, nid **Professor Jones:** I would like to take this opportunity to agree with what Haydn said in his introduction. We could achieve so much more. We are talking about an area of north Wales that appears, on the surface, to be reasonably prosperous. If you do not happen to live where I do, you would not see the

ydych yn gweld y tloedi. Mae ardaloedd tlawd iawn, lle mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen a safonau bywyd yn isel iawn i nifer fawr o'r boblogaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Haydn yn cytuno ein bod yn teimlo cyfrifoldeb i ddefnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i wella bywydau'r bobl sy'n byw yn y gymuned leol.

poverty. There are extremely poor areas, where the gross domestic product per capita and standards of living are very low for a large proportion of the population. I am sure that Haydn would agree that we feel a duty to use the available resources to improve the lives of those who live in the local community.

[49] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Following your plea, Chair, which was absolutely right, I will not talk about FE funding at this meeting. However, Haydn, I have a private meeting with Fforwm very soon to discuss why my own college appears to have an adequate settlement while others do not. I want to get to the bottom of that.

[50] The questions that I would like to ask you are similar to those that I have asked of your colleagues from other HE and FE institutions. The first is about the use of European structural funds. I read in both of your submissions that you have been involved with Objectives 1, 2, and 3 and have benefited significantly from them. How do you propose to engage with the new rounds—convergence and competitiveness—either on your own, or in partnership with other organisations? What are your plans in that regard? I support what Janet said about engagement with local industry. Some of the visits that we have had have been stunning in the engagement between local businesses and the FE and HE institutions; this is often driven by those local businesses. So, I am keen to know about that level of engagement, particularly the strength, or otherwise, of your relationships with sector skills councils.

[51] You both mentioned that you have relationships with them, and in your case, Haydn, you say that you have relationships with 14 of them. I am not asking you to list the 14, but can you indicate what occupational areas they represent and, in general, what their degree of involvement is? We have had a lot of evidence from sector skills councils; I know some of them very well, and I have no doubt that some are keenly engaging with you. How are you finding it in reality with the demands and the involvement that they want from you on behalf of the occupational areas that they are meant to represent?

[52] The next question is specifically for you, Haydn. We are keen that there is the maximum collaboration possible between the HE and FE sectors, which is why we put it in as part of our terms of reference. The title of this inquiry may be 'The economic contribution of higher education', but we recognise that FE plays a crucial role in that. I realise that you are sitting beside each other, but how well is that working in your areas?

[53] **David Melding:** May I add something on a skills issue? I was going to raise it later, but it might best be attached now. I thought that it was interesting that Coleg Menai emphasised its current co-operation with 14 sector skills councils and then said that there is an important need to get small and medium-sized enterprises more involved in training, which is a crucial area according to the latest economic evidence that we have had. Most people are employed in SMEs and about half of our GVA is involved in that. Once you drop below 100 employees, the level of training goes down—if there are 10 employees, there will be the least training, on average; if there are 50, it will be more in the middle. Training is related to the number of employees.

[54] **Dr Edwards:** Mae tri phen, hyd y gwelaf i, i'r cwestiwn yr ydych wedi ei ofyn. Dechreuaf gyda'r wedd Ewropeaidd. Fel coleg, yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar gael cyllid Ewropeaidd er mwyn ail-wneud yr ystâd, sicrhau adeiladau newydd, cyfalaf ac

Dr Edwards: There are three parts, as I see it, to your question. I will begin with the European aspect. As a college, we have mainly concentrated on getting European funding so that we can restructure our estate, secure new buildings, capital and so on. We

yn y blaen. Yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio yn bennaf ar hynny yn hytrach nag ar brosiectau refeniw. Ein rhesymeg oedd bod angen inni gael prosiectau a fyddai'n greiddiol i'n gwaith fel sefydliad, yn hytrach na phrosiectau dros dro. Felly, yr ydym wedi gwneud rhai prosiectau mewn partneriaeth â cholegau eraill, er enghraifft gyda Chymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr (Gogledd Cymru) Coleg Harlech. Mae holl golegau'r gogledd orllewin yn rhan o brosiect i fynd ag addysg i'r gymuned a thaclo nifer o broblemau mynediad i addysg mewn pentrefi a chymunedau o bob math. Mae hynny'n waith pwysig ac mae arian Ewropeaidd wedi bod yn hanfodol i hynny.

have concentrated on that rather than on revenue projects. Our logic was that we needed projects that would not be temporary, but which would be central to our work as an institution. Therefore, we have undertaken some projects in partnership with other colleges, for example with Coleg Harlech Workers' Educational Association (North Wales). Every college in the north-west is part of a project to take education into the community and to tackle issues of access to education in villages and communities of all types. That is important work, and European funding has been crucial to that work.

[55] Fodd bynnag, yr ydym, fel coleg, wedi canolbwyntio'n fwy ar gyfalaf, a defnyddio'r arian refeniw mewn partneriaethau. Dyna ein bwriad ni gyda'r gyfran newydd o arian Ewropeaidd; yr ydym am edrych ar fod yn rhan o bartneriaethau er mwyn cael effaith sylweddol yn nhermau sgiliau mewn diwydiant, gwaith cymunedol ac yn y blaen. Mae arian cydgyfeiriant yn cael ei drin yn llawer mwy effeithiol nag yn y gorffennol, pan oedd problemau gydag amseru ac yn y blaen. Bydd gan brosiectau yn y dyfodol fwy o ffocws.

However, as a college, we have concentrated more on capital, and used the revenue funding in partnerships. That is how we aim to use the new European funding money; we are looking to be a part of partnerships that will have a significant impact on skills for industry, community work and so on. Convergence funds are administered more efficiently now than was the case in the past, when there were problems with timing and so on. Future projects will have more focus.

[56] Yr oedd eich ail bwynt yn ymwneud â'n perthynas gyda'r cynghorau sgiliau sector. Nid wyf yn mynd i ddweud bod rhai yn berffaith a rhai yn ofnadwy, ond yr wyf yn meddwl bod angen rhyw fath o arfarniad Cymreig arnynt. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer o waith gyda rhai ohonynt, ac maent yn rhoi arweiniad gwyach. Yr wyf yn sôn am y cynghorau yn y sectorau peirianeg, adeiladu, cyfryngau a chroesawiaeth; mae cynghorau eraill hefyd—efallai na ddylwn fod wedi enwi meysydd penodol. Fel pwyllgor, dylech godi cwestiynau ynghylch y broses o'u haildrwyddedu yn Brydeinig y flwyddyn nesaf. Beth fydd y broses honno? A fydd rhywbeth sydd yn gweithio'n iawn yn Lloegr yn gweithio'n iawn yng Nghymru, yn nhermau capasiti neu faint cyngor arbennig? Mae'n rhaid i'r broses aildrwyddedu gael dimensiwn Cymreig fel maen prawf yn y broses o ddewis y ffordd ymlaen.

Your second point dealt with our relationship with the sector skills councils. I am not going to tell you today that some are perfect and some dreadful, but I think that we need some kind of Welsh evaluation of them. We do a lot of work with some of them, they provide excellent leadership. I am talking about the councils in the engineering, construction, media and hospitality sectors; there are others as well—I should not, perhaps, have named specific areas. As a committee, you should ask questions regarding next year's UK-wide process of re-licensing councils. What will that process be? Will something that works well in England work as well in Wales, in relation to the capacity or size of an individual council? The re-licensing process must have a Welsh dimension as a criterion in the process of choosing the way forward.

2.10 p.m.

[57] Byddwn yn awgrymu'n gryf bod angen i Adrian Webb a Michael Rake—yr wyf yn meddwl mai ef yw'r cadeirydd yn Lloegr—gydweithio ar osod y meini prawf hynny. Mae hynny'n hanfodol er mwyn gwella pethau. Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar ac yr wyf yn pryderu bod rhai o'r cynghorau yn awr yn dod o hyd i'w traed ond y byddwn, yn y brwdfrydedd i gael gwared ar y cwangos ym mhob man, yn awr yn mynd i bennod arall o newid pethau eto. Mae rhoi amser i bethau sefydlu weithiau'n bwysig, er nad dynt yn gweithio'n berffaith.

[58] Yr oedd trydydd pwynt eich cwestiwn—mae'n gwestiwn y byddaf yn meddwl llawer amdano ac y bydd angen ei drafod ymhellach gyda Merfyn ar ôl y cyfarfod hwn—yn ymwneud â pha mor effeithiol yw'r berthynas. A yw'n berthynas o bartneriaeth ac a oes angen ei datblygu ymhellach? Mae'r ddau ohonom wedi nodi bod tir cyffredin rhyngom ac mae'r ffaith bod Prifysgol Bangor yn glir ynghylch ei chenhadaeth yn gwneud y cydweithio hwnnw'n hawdd. Yr ydym ni'n gwybod beth yw'n gwaith ni ac mae'r brifysgol yn gwybod beth yw ei gwaith hi. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y tir canol ac yn cydweithio ar hynny. Pe bai'r ddau sector yn gwneud hynny, efallai ar lefel ranbarthol, byddai canlyniadau i'w gweld. Fel dau sefydliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem wneud pethau'n well a chydweithio mwy nag yr ydym yn ei wneud, ond byddwn hefyd yn dweud—ychydig bach o ryw ymffrost—bod mwy o gydweithio rhyngom ni nac sydd rhwng llawer o sefydliadau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Yr ydych yn codi cwestiwn pwysig iawn y dylai'r ddau sector ei drafod.

[59] **Professor Jones:** If I may, I will just pick up on a couple of the points and I am sure that Siân will elaborate. We certainly have been recipients of, and worked hard to get, Objective 1 funding, and we will be working hard to get convergence funding. It is much the same answer as Haydn gave. It is going into capital—very often capital development—and it is, in a sense, additional. You will sense a note of nervousness in my voice, because I do not want to say anything much about HE funding at this point. This is not core funding. This is money that you get to do something in addition and then you have to make it work and bring in the revenue streams to justify the capital spend. It is a challenging environment and it is not necessarily addressing the issues of core funding. However, it could be of considerable benefit to us. Some of you were there last night when we unveiled some of the plans that we have in Bangor. Two of our particular plans are a health and technology campus, which will do what we were talking about earlier, with links between business and commercialisation and medicine and health, and the other is an arts and innovation centre, which will allow the creative arts to develop, but also work on the interface between creativity in the arts and in science and bring those together in a unique development. Both, I think, could have a huge

I would strongly suggest that there is a need for Adrian Webb and Michael Rake—I think that he is the chair in England—to co-operate on setting those criteria. That will be essential to improve things. These are early days and I am concerned that some of the councils are now finding their feet but that, in the enthusiasm to get rid of all the quangos, we will enter into another period of changing things again. It can be important to give things time to settle, even if they do not work perfectly.

The third point of your question—it is a question that I think about a lot and will need to discuss further with Merfyn after this meeting—was about the effectiveness of the relationship. Is it a relationship of partnership and is there a need to develop it further? We have both noted the common ground between us and the fact that Bangor University is clear about its mission makes that co-operation easy. We know what we have to do and the university knows what it has to do. We are looking at the middle ground and co-operating on that. If both sectors were to do that, possibly on a regional level, there would be an impact. As two institutions, I am sure that we could do things better and co-operate more than we currently do, but I would also say—a small boast, possibly—that there is more co-operation between us than there is between many further and higher education institutions. You have asked a very important question that both sectors should discuss.

transformational impact on the local economy, which is why we are engaged in those big ideas. However, there are a number of other ideas. There is a whole series of big projects, including, as Siân said earlier, collaborative ideas that we have with both Aberystwyth and Swansea. We are working very closely with partner universities in the convergence areas and, actually, in all-Wales approaches as well. Siân, you are closer to this than I am.

[60] **Professor Hope:** To create that step change and the transformational aspects of what these capital expenditures can do, something that is quite challenging to universities is open innovation. We are working very closely with Swansea University on this, because it would need to adopt an approach to open innovation that would allow some radical approaches to sharing IP, which might previously have been protected. So, that is quite challenging for us, but we are committed to doing it for it to have a transformational effect.

[61] The point about the arts and innovation centre is that creativity is important for innovation. Google would never have happened had it not been for that spark of creativity from the arts people as well as the innovation on the science side. You might like to take a look at the Cox review, which is slightly old now but is still relevant. The arts and innovation centre is the interface combining the arts, creativity, science, technology and engineering. You can then develop the skilled workforce of the future that has the multidisciplinary capabilities required to create innovation through spin-outs and to add value to corporate companies. That is what the IBMs of this world say that the global knowledge economy needs. So, the centre is about developing people for the knowledge economy, and the health and technology campus is about trying to create open innovation to generate new knowledge economy activity in north Wales. Our approach to convergence funding is around the knowledge economy: it is about looking at where we are globally to see how a small, smart country such as Wales can compete in that knowledge economy.

[62] On the sector skills councils, I concur with Haydn that the representation in Wales is quite patchy. So, it is easier to engage with the councils in some sectors than others, perhaps because we could engage with some through our research and our graduates. We have good engagement with e-skills, and that is important because it is about creating excitement among young people to engage with the STEM subjects of science, technology, engineering and mathematics. That is what we have focused on, particularly in the sector skills councils nationally. Locally, in our region, we have worked closely with Haydn on engineering and on the needs of a number of sectors, including Wylfa, Babcock International Group plc, Airbus and a host of large corporates, as well as the Royal Air Force, which needs people with engineering skills. That is our engagement with sector skills councils on a local basis. So, we have been selective in our engagement with them, based on our research and the needs of national and local companies.

[63] In his introduction, Merfyn alluded to our innovative PhD programme. I noted from the transcripts that Swansea University has something called the Swansea principle, but there is also something called BRAN—the Bangor research access network—which has a very good reputation in Brussels for being innovative in growing those small and medium-sized enterprises that cannot access training because, as you rightly say, it costs their businesses. Our high-level skills programme—BRAN—which is about getting PhD and research students working for companies, allows that transfer of knowledge in the workplace by bringing in research. That is one thing that we did under Objective 1 that we intend to extend, based on the evaluation of the previous programme. We have extended that to Swansea and Aberystwyth universities and, in the next round, we will extend it to the whole of Wales.

[64] **Dr Edwards:** Hoffwn ychwanegu un darn o wybodaeth yng nghwt y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae cyllid Ewropeaidd yn bwysig iawn, wrth gwrs, fel y mae cynlluniau **Dr Edwards:** I wish to add one additional piece of information at the tail end of that question. European funding is very important, of course, as are INTERREG

INTERREG, sy'n berthnasol i rannau o Gymru. Fel sefydliad, yr ydym wedi eu defnyddio'n helaeth er mwyn gweithio gyda cholegau yn Iwerddon i wasanaethu diwydiant. O ran peirianeg, yr ydym wedi datblygu prototeipiau ar gyfer cwmnïau mawr a bach a phobl sy'n bwriadu sefydlu busnes. Gwelwyd prosiectau hynod ddiddorol yn y sector prosesu bwyd, ac mae ein canolfan wedi datblygu cynnyrch newydd arloesol ac wedi mynd at gwmnïau lleol a gofyn, 'A ydych eisiau cynhyrchu a gwerthu'r cynnyrch hwn?'. Yr ydym yn mynd â'r syniadau at ddiwydiant.

2.20 p.m.

[65] Efallai y dylem edrych ar y posibilrwydd o gael sefydliad arbennig i ymgymryd yn gyfan gwbl â gwaith ymchwil a datblygu cwmni, a chynnig hwnnw i gwmnïau. Byddai hynny'n fodel cyffrous. Byddai cwmni yn ymddiried yn y sefydliad hwnnw, a byddai adnoddau'r sefydliad yn mynd tuag at helpu'r cwmni i ddatblygu yn yr economi. Bu'r syniadau hyn yn cylchredeg yng Nghymru flynyddoedd mawr yn ôl, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod syniadau arloesol ar hyn o bryd.

[66] **Gareth Jones:** Derbyniaf ein bod i gyd yn edrych ymlaen at yr arian buddsoddi cydgyfeirio hwn, ond bydd yr arian hwnnw yn dod i ben. Pa elfen o risg sydd yno? Pan ddaw 2013, a fyddwn ni'n barod i symud ymlaen, neu a fyddwn yn cymryd cam yn ôl? Dylem fod wedi defnyddio'r arian mor effeithiol fel na fyddwn yn gweld ei golli.

[67] **Yr Athro Jones:** Mae'r risg yn sylweddol, ond mae hwn yn mynd â ni yn ôl at y pwynt yr oedd Haydn yn ei wneud yn gynharach. Yr ydym yn y busnes o risg, ac yr ydym yn ceisio ein gorau i greu cynlluniau a fydd yn llwyddo ac a fydd yn gynaliadwy yn y dyfodol, ond mae elfen o risg, wrth gwrs. Dyna natur y busnes yr ydym ynddo. Nid ydym yno i gael arian yn unig; yr ydym yno i ddatblygu ein busnes ein hunain a sicrhau ei fod yn gynaliadwy. Mae'n her fawr.

[68] **Gareth Jones:** A yw'n bwysig ein bod yn rhannu'r risg?

[69] **Yr Athro Jones:** Mae'n bwysig ein

projects, which are relevant to parts of Wales. As an institution, we have used those projects extensively to work with colleges in Ireland to provide a service to industry. On engineering, we have developed prototypes for large and small companies and people who intend to set up in business. There are some very interesting projects in the food processing sector, and our centre has developed new and innovative products and has approached local companies to ask whether they wish to produce and sell these products. We are taking the ideas to industry.

Perhaps we should look at setting up a specific organisation to undertake a company's entire research and development work, and make that suggestion to companies. That would be an exciting model. The company would develop trust in that institution and its resources would go towards helping the company to develop economically. These ideas were going around Wales many years ago, but I do not think that there are such innovative ideas at present.

Gareth Jones: I accept that we are all looking forward to the convergence investment funding, but that money will come to an end. What element of risk is there? When 2013 comes, will we be ready to move forward, or will we take a step back? We should have used that money so effectively that we will not miss it.

Professor Jones: I believe that it is a significant risk, but that takes us back to the point that Haydn made earlier. We are in the business of risk, and we are trying our best to create schemes that will succeed and will be sustainable for the future, but of course there is an element of risk. That is the nature of the business that we are in. We are not just there to receive money; we are also there to develop our own business and to ensure that it is sustainable. It is a huge challenge.

Gareth Jones: Is it important that we share the risk?

Professor Jones: It is important that we

bod yn rhannu'r risg ac, yn sicr o dan Amcan 1, yr oedd honno'n broblem fawr. Pan oedd partneriaethau yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, nid oedd yn glir pwy oedd i gymryd y cyfrifoldeb am y risg, a bu i hynny danseilio nifer o'r partneriaethau. Rhaid i un o'r partneriaid gymryd y risg er nad yw'n gyfrifol am yr hyn y mae'r gweddill yn ei wneud.

[70] **Gareth Jones:** Mae'n amlwg bod hwnnw o dan ystyriaeth.

[71] **Yr Athro Jones:** Mae hwnnw wedyn yn codi cwestiwn sylfaenol ynghylch sut mae arian Ewrop yn cael ei ddefnyddio.

[72] Cytunaf â'r hyn yr oedd Haydn yn ei ddweud am y cysylltiad rhwng addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Fel y gallwch ei weld, mae gennym berthynas agos a chyfforddus iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem wneud yn well, ond mae'n helpu bod gennym ddwy genhadaeth sydd yn weddol glir ac amlwg. Nid yw hynny'n wir ym mhob man ac mae elfen o *mission drift* ar draws y byd addysg, ac nid ym myd addysg bellach ac addysg uwch yn unig. Mae asiantaethau preifat yn dod i mewn i'r busnes hefyd. Pan fydd y genhadaeth yn glir, mae'n haws o lawer cydweithio.

[73] O ran ceisio creu diwylliant a meddylfryd sy'n fwy amlddisgyblaethol heb fod yn gaeth i syniadau'r gorffennol, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi gweld y stori yn y *Western Mail* heddiw am y brodor o Gaerdydd sydd wedi rhoi £25 miliwn i goleg Prifysgol Rhydychen. Ef oedd wedi buddsoddi yn Google. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud mai hanes oedd ei bwnc yn y brifysgol. [*Chwerthin.*]

[74] **Gareth Jones:** Mae pwynt gennych yno.

[75] **Yr Athro Jones:** Gellir defnyddio'r sgiliau hyn ar draws y sectorau. Pwynt personol oedd hwnnw.

[76] **Gareth Jones:** Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn cael y cyfle i gyflwyno'r pwyntiau hynny.

[77] **Kirsty Williams:** In both your papers, you try to evidence the fact that you are grappling with your response to issues around the Leitch review and, in the case of FE, the

share the risk and, certainly under Objective 1, it was a major problem. When partnerships were working together, it was not clear who would be taking responsibility for the risk, and that undermined a number of the partnerships. One of the partners has to take the risk even though that partner is not responsible for what the others are doing.

Gareth Jones: It is clear that that is under consideration.

Professor Jones: That then raises a fundamental question about how European money is used.

I agree with what Haydn was saying about the connection between further education and higher education. As you can see, we have a very close and comfortable relationship. I am sure that we could do better, but it helps that we have two missions that are distinct and clear. That is not true of everyone and there is an element of mission drift across the world of education, and not just in further education and higher education. Private agencies are also coming into the business. When the mission is clear, it is much easier to collaborate.

On trying to create a culture and a mindset that is more multidisciplinary and that is not hampered by the ideas of the past, I am sure that you will all have seen the story in the *Western Mail* today about the man from Cardiff who has donated £25 million to a college of the University of Oxford. It was he who had invested in Google. I am pleased to say that he read history at university. [*Laughter.*]

Gareth Jones: You have a point there.

Professor Jones: Those skills can be used across the sectors. That was just a personal point.

Gareth Jones: It is important that you have an opportunity to present those points.

Webb review. As practitioners on the ground trying to deliver on this agenda, are you sufficiently clear about what is being asked of you by the Welsh Assembly Government, or are you working almost in a vacuum, trying to make what you can of those reports without a clear steer from the Welsh Assembly Government?

[78] Both papers are quite explicit in trying to demonstrate the work being done with employers in those areas. Dr Edwards, your paper is very blunt in stating that you are not currently meeting needs. You are clear and honest in your assessment of that, and I do not know whether Professor Jones would say the same for his organisation. Could you give me some understanding of the barriers? You have identified the need, you know what you are doing, and you have identified the gap, but what are the barriers to fulfilling those demands?

[79] I would like to think that this report, which we have been working on for a long time, gives us a steer on crafting policy in future. What would you say are the risks that this committee needs to identify and suggest solutions to in allowing institutions such as yours to continue to contribute to the economic wealth of this country?

[80] **Dr Edwards:** Mae adroddiad Webb—a rhaid i mi ddatgan buddiant gan i mi fod yn rhan o'r grŵp allanol a oedd yn cynghori'r tîm—yn un o'r adroddiadau mwyaf trylwyr a gyhoeddwyd yn y ddegawd ddiwethaf o ran ei ddadansoddiad a'i gyfeiriad. Mae'n dechrau gyda sgiliau sylfaenol ac mae'n dweud pethau pwysig am anghenion yr economi a'n gobeithion ar gyfer lefelau dysg, llythrennedd a rhifedd y boblogaeth.

Dr Edwards: The Webb report—and I must declare an interest, as I was a member of the external group that was advising the team—is one of the most comprehensive reports to be published in the past decade as regards its analysis and direction. It starts off with basic skills and says important things about the needs of our economy and our hopes for the education, literacy and numeracy levels of the population.

[81] Mae'n anodd i sefydliad unigol ymateb i ddogfen sydd, yn y bôn, yn un strategol. Os ydych yn ystyried adroddiad Webb mewn perthynas â ni fel sefydliad, gallwch ddod i dri chasgliad. Yn gyntaf, ni fyddem yn bod gan y byddem yn rhan o sefydliad mwy—a cheir argymhellion yn yr adroddiad o ran sut y gellid gwneud hynny. Yn ail, byddem yn atebol ar gyfer ein cyllideb i gonsortiw sydd eto i'w ffurfio. Yn drydydd, byddai cyfran o'n harian yn mynd i ddiwydiant i brynu darpariaeth yn ôl. Felly, anodd iawn fyddai i ni gychwyn ar un o'r pethau hynny ein hunain. Disgwylwch i'r Cynulliad ffurfio safbwynt ar hynny. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ddatgan yn glir pa un a yw'n cytuno â ni ai peidio. Mae ymateb i ddogfen mor gynhwysfawr â honno yn broses gymhleth gan fod goblygiadau cyllido i'r ymatebion hynny ac felly nid yw'n hawdd i Lywodraeth ymateb. Yr ydym yn barod fel sefydliad i ymateb gan dderbyn y bydd y Cynulliad yn dod i benderfyniad.

It is difficult for one institution to respond to what is, essentially, a strategic report. If you consider the Webb report in relation to our institution, you could come to three conclusions. First, we would not be in existence as we would be part of a bigger institution—and there are recommendations in the report on how that could be done. Secondly, we would be accountable to a consortium that has yet to be formed for our budget. Thirdly, a proportion of our money would go to industry to buy back provision. Therefore, it would be difficult for us to make a start on one of those options alone. We expect the Assembly to form an opinion on that. The Government needs to state clearly whether it agrees with us. Responding to a comprehensive report such as this is a complex process, given the financial implications of the responses, so it is not easy for Government to respond. We are ready to respond as an organisation while accepting that the Assembly will reach a conclusion.

[82] O ran y rhwystrau, nid ailadroddaf rai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd eisoes ac nid wyf

On the barriers, I will not repeat some of the points that have been made and I do not want

yn awyddus i fynd i'r tir gwleidyddol, yn dilyn arweiniad y Cadeirydd, ond hoffwn godi un pwynt. Gallem gynyddu nifer y prentisiaid sydd gennym hyd at 70 y cant oherwydd y galw. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yw cyfeirio rhai ohonynt at gyrsiau addysg bellach ac ati—a dyna fantais addysg bellach—ond ni all pob darparwr wneud hynny. Gyda mwy o adnoddau, byddem yn gallu cyflawni mwy ond, i raddau, yr ydym wedi creu'r galw hwnnw hefyd. Yr ydym wedi mynd i gwmnïau a'u beirniadu gan ddweud nad ydynt yn hyfforddi staff. Rhaid i ni gael yr adnoddau i'w helpu—er nad ydym yn talu am bob dim—i hyfforddi eu staff fel eu bod yn datblygu. Felly, boed i ni beidio â bod yn rhy feirniadol. Mae rhai pethau da yn digwydd, ond mae angen i ni gydweithio yn fwy ar y pethau hynny.

to venture down the political road, following the Chair's guidance, but I want to raise one point. We could increase the number of apprentices that we have by 70 per cent, based on demand. However, what we do is refer some of them to further education courses and so on—which is an advantage of further education—although not every provider can do that. With more resources, we could deliver more, but, to an extent, we have also generated that demand. We have gone to companies and criticised them by saying that they do not train their staff. So, we need the resources to help them to train their staff—not that we pay for everything—so that we can see them develop. So, let us not be too critical. Some good things are happening, but we need to work together more on those.

[83] Byddaf yn cloi yno; nid af i'r maes risg. I will leave it there; I will not go into the risk.

[84] **Professor Jones:** You are leaving that for me to deal with, are you? [*Laughter.*]

2.30 p.m.

[85] On the barriers, there have been some interesting reports recently on the interface between higher education and business across the UK. There are huge challenges: we all have to go through some kind of culture change and recognise that we are in a different world. For example, I was in a meeting yesterday afternoon with officials from the Welsh Assembly Government and we were looking at China's investment in research and development. In order to survive as an economy, we will have to compete with some serious players, and that means putting serious money into research and development, because, as you know, as a country we have relied historically upon extractive industries—you just dig it out of the ground. That is as true of north Wales as it is of south Wales.

[86] So, in higher education itself—and I will not speak for the business community or decision-makers—we have been through a transformative process. I do not think that we have come to the end of that road, but it is amazing how higher education has changed in its approach to wealth creation. When I was a student, wealth creation was a dirty concept. I took part in sit-ins because the university at which I was a postgraduate was linked to local businesses. It was quite disruptive stuff, I must say. So, we have all had to transform our personal cultures as well, and that is quite difficult for people to do. People who have always concentrated on research, pure research and teaching have had to engage with this other agenda, and I think that higher education has responded in an extraordinary way, and that Bangor has responded in an astonishing way, to that challenge.

[87] However, it is a big challenge, and people need to understand that it exists as a challenge. From Bangor's point of view, wearing these narrow Bangor blinkers, we have raised it as an issue with colleagues and said that this is the way that we have to go and that we must transform ourselves in order to be competitive.

[88] On the risks and issues arising out of Leitch and so on, there is always an issue about targets—whether or not there are targets in Wales compared with England. One hears

comments suggesting that Leitch is really about the south east of England and not about the whole of the UK. I have made this point to my colleagues before: I get frustrated by the argument that Wales needs more and more basic skills and intermediate skills. Of course it does, but we will not succeed in our ambitions unless we also create higher-level skills, and invest in them, and it cannot be a chronological progression. If we wait 30 years to produce people with higher-level skills, we will all be on the dole. It just will not happen. I lived through 15 years of depression in Liverpool when I was involved with Liverpool University and led lifelong learning there; boy, we created a lot of skills, but we did not create a single job and we did not create wealth. That is what has to happen, and that is why universities have a crucial role to play in all of this.

[89] Please do not take that as implying that we do not have to tackle the basic skills agenda—of course we do, as well as the foundation phase and all of that. We are as committed to that as anyone, but if we do not also produce the 90 PhD students to work with business, where will we go to get the growth that will sustain our economy?

[90] Thank you for the question. It gave me the opportunity to sound off. [*Laughter.*]

[91] **Gareth Jones:** This next question from Andrew R.T. Davies may be the last one.

[92] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I was just about to say that, coming in after this lengthy inquiry that you have been undertaking, Chair, it is difficult to pick up the strands that run through it. However, I will ask two questions. In your paper, you highlight the step change that occurs when a university gets its research budget up to £40 million. You are currently on £23 million. I would be interested to know what we could appreciate from that step change. What real differences could we see, bearing in mind that you are also talking about a science park? The committee has visited a science park. What sort of ambition do you have for that science park, because you need the scientists and the professors to man it, so it is almost a chicken-and-egg situation? You need to get the £40 million to get the step change, but how do you get the £40 million, because you are quite some way off?

[93] Going on to Dr Edwards, in your paper you highlight the point, and it has been raised by Kirsty to an extent, about the inability to meet the aspirations of employers at the moment. However, you also mention that there are employers with whom you would not want to be associated. You clearly state that and that they would go out of business. Is that just about the mindset of those employers or is it a question of the product or of the higher education sector not making a connection with those employers? It is a powerful argument and certain businesses will go out of business, but we should be trying to offer products that everyone can buy into.

[94] **Professor Jones:** I will take the research question first. I am sure that Siân can give you a better answer. I think that how much money you need is notional. However, to transform a region, it is a working model that you need that level of research income. I still think that £23 million in one year is quite significant and has quite a transformative impact. However, it does precisely what you say, namely it builds capacity, which means that you have the big research teams, and you need capacity. However, there are other ways to create capacity, for example, through collaboration, and that is one of the things that we are trying to achieve with Aberystwyth. If you put our combined research income together, it would look much healthier. If you then think about north and mid Wales, you would be looking at something close to that threshold, which is transformative.

[95] There is no problem in attracting to north Wales high-level scientists from across the world in whatever subject. We advertise and recruit globally.

[96] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** There is no problem with that, is there?

[97] **Professor Jones:** We get really good scientists. Perhaps some of the stars might go to other universities, but we recruit globally and at a very high level from places such as North America and increasingly from other parts of the world as well as from Wales and the rest of the UK. I do not think that that is a challenge—partly because of the quality of life that we can offer and partly because of the excitement of the science. However, the bigger the capacity you can offer and the bigger the teams that people can work with, the greater the impact is, and then you get business taking an interest.

[98] Let us face it, Bangor captured £23 million last year in research income, which is the most that we have ever had, but you are looking at around five or six universities in England with research incomes of £260 million to £270 million a year. There is a grave danger of all of the research income going to five or six universities and of them attracting the students who want to work in those kinds of places. We all know how that can happen. To add a parochial note—and the Chair will understand this point very well—in north Wales, we are an hour from Liverpool and an hour and a half from Manchester, which has a huge university with 20,000 students. The University of Manchester's research budget is 95 per cent of the total Welsh research budget. That is what we are up against, which is why we need to grow our research income and why we need the scientists and academics who can attract the research income.

2.40 p.m.

[99] We are succeeding. We are getting there, but it is very competitive. Research funding is UK wide, and we are in a situation where there is a department in England, the Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills, where the innovation bit is supposed to be UK wide, but where the universities bit is just for England, and there is a clear and immediate danger of those two sliding into one another. I am not accusing DIUS of any such prejudices, but we need to be alert to the danger of innovation, skills and enterprise being identified with English universities. Of course, there is huge investment going into English universities—if anyone has been to Manchester recently, they will know how different it looks from our real estate.

[100] **Kirsty Williams:** It has been argued in the past that universities should not come under the Department for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, but under the Department for the Economy and Transport, which has the responsibility for enterprise, so that there is a similar situation to that in England. Do you think that we could usefully recommend that here, in taking this agenda forward?

[101] **Professor Jones:** I have an open mind on that issue; I think that Wales is such a small country that we can work closely with any department, and we would be happy to do so. What is true—and, in a sense, I think that it is coming from No. 10—is that there is a clear vision in England of universities being what gives England a competitive edge over the rest of the world.

[102] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is about wealth creation; you said that yourself.

[103] **Professor Jones:** That is why Blair went to Parliament and almost lost his premiership over student fees, because he wanted more money for universities. He said that the spend on universities was a national tragedy. Brown, who is an academic—we have a PhD in the same subject—has come in with a similar kind of commitment, and he has set up a department for universities with a seat in the Cabinet, because it is seen as the future. You go to California and China, but what other future is there? Sorry, I am preaching now.

[104] **Janet Ryder:** To pick up on the point about Westminster departments becoming English departments, if they are going to be UK wide, they should be UK wide. This

committee should take that to the Minister, and express our grave concerns about that, because it is totally wrong.

[105] **Gareth Jones:** Yr ydym yn tynnu at y terfyn, ond mae gennyf un cwestiwn arall. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at weithio mewn partneriaeth gyda gwahanol gyrff ac ati, a chyrrff sy'n hollbwysig inni yng Nghymru yw'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae Conwy, er enghraifft, yn gwario £170 miliwn o refeniw bob blwyddyn—nid wyf yn gwybod am Wynedd—ac y mae, fel pob awdurdod lleol arall, yn awyddus i ddatblygu'r economi leol. Yr ydych yn sôn am £23 miliwn o gyllid ymchwil, ac ati, ac mae arian ar gael—er efallai nid £170 miliwn—i'w ddefnyddio ar y cyd â'n sefydliadau i hyrwyddo prosiectau, ac ati. I ba raddau, Merfyn, y mae hyn yn digwydd? Yr wyf yn meddwl am y Technium CAST. Os oes unrhyw gyrff sy'n defnyddio meddalwedd, ein awdurdodau lleol yw'r rheiny; credaf fod marchnad yno.

[106] **Yr Athro Jones:** Mae Prifysgol Bangor yn cydweithio'n hapus ac yn adeiladol iawn â Chyngor Gwynedd, sydd wedi bod yn gefnogol. Mae'r cynllun gofodol yn gweld rôl arbennig i'r Menai *hub* ac i'r brifysgol yn benodol wrth ddatblygu'r economi yn lleol. Yr ydym wedi cael cefnogaeth ariannol amdano ac yr ydym yn hynod ddiolchgar am hynny. Mae'r amgylchiadau ariannol i Wynedd ac i ninnau yn heriol ar hyn o bryd, ac yr ydym yn gweithio yn agos gyda Chyngor Sir Ynys Môn ar nifer o brosiectau diddorol gan gynnwys rhai sy'n ymwneud ag arian cydgyfeirio yn y dyfodol.

[107] **Gareth Jones:** Un rheswm pam oeddwn yn gofyn hynny oedd oherwydd i ni fynd ar ymweliad i Gaerefrog, ac agwedd hollbwysig ar sefydlu'r parc gwyddonol yn y fan honno oedd y cydweithio â chyngor y ddinas. Felly, mae angen inni gyfeirio at y math hwnnw o gydweithio yn ein hadroddiad.

[108] **Yr Athro Jones:** Dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, mae'r cydweithio rhyngom â'r awdurdodau lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd wedi bod yn gefnogol ac yn adeiladol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n wir am Goleg Menai hefyd.

Gareth Jones: We are drawing to a close, but I have one further question. You referred to working in partnership with various organisations, and so on, and, for us in Wales, local authorities are key bodies. Conwy, for example, spends £170 million of revenue annually—I am not sure about Gwynedd—and, like every other local authority, it is keen to develop the local economy. You talk about £23 million of research funding, and so on, and there is funding available—although perhaps not £170 million—to be used jointly with our institutions to promote projects, and so on. To what extent, Merfyn, is this happening? I am thinking of the Technium CAST. If there are any organisations that use software, they are our local authorities; I think that there is a market there.

Professor Jones: Bangor University collaborates happily and constructively with Gwynedd Council, which has been supportive. The spatial plan envisages a particular role for the Menai hub and for the university specifically in developing the economy locally. We have received financial support and we are exceptionally grateful for that. The financial circumstances for Gwynedd and for ourselves are challenging at the moment, and we are working closely with Anglesey County Council on many interesting projects including some which involve convergence funding for the future.

Gareth Jones: One reason why I asked that question was because we went on a visit to York, and a very important aspect of establishing the science park there was the co-operation with the city council. So, we need to refer to that type of co-operation in our report.

Professor Jones: During the past four years, the joint work between us and the local authorities and the health trusts has been supportive and constructive, and I am sure that that is also true of Coleg Menai.

[109] **Gareth Jones:** Yr ydym yn dod at y terfyn. A gawsoch ateb i'ch cwestiwn ynghylch cyflogwyr, Andrew?

Gareth Jones: We are coming to the end. Did you get a response to your question about employers, Andrew?

[110] **Dr Edwards:** Yr oedd y cwestiwn am sut yr ydym yn perswadio cyflogwyr nad oes ganddynt ymrwymiad i hyfforddi. Os ydynt yn gyflogwyr sylweddol ac nid ydym yn hapus eu bod yn buddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant, yr ydym yn trefnu cyfarfodydd gyda nhw ac yn hyrwyddo manteision gwneud hynny. Mae cant a mil o resymau pam nad yw rhai cyflogwyr am ddarparu hyfforddiant. Yr ydym weithiau yn siarad ag undebau llafur, oherwydd maent yn gallu dylanwadu ar ran staff, ac yn y blaen. Ni allaf roi enghraifft i chi yn gyhoeddus, ond mae nifer o enghreifftiau lle yr ydym wedi dyfalbarhau ac mae pethau wedi troi. Fodd bynnag, os nad yw cwmni yn teimlo bod angen hyfforddiant arno, ni allwn wneud dim byd ag ef, ond mae'r prif gyflogwyr yn rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel iddo; mae pawb yn deall mai dyna'r ffordd i lwyddo—drwy fuddsoddi a sicrhau bod staff ar flaen y gad.

Dr Edwards: The question was about how we persuade employers who do not have a commitment to training. If they are substantial employers and we are not happy that they are investing in training, we arrange a meeting with them and promote the advantages of doing so. There are a hundred and one reasons why some employers do not wish to provide training. We sometimes talk to trade unions, because they can influence on behalf of the staff, and so on. I cannot give you an example publicly, but there are a number of examples of where we have persevered and things have turned around. However, if a company feels that it does not require training, we cannot do anything with it, but the major employers give it a high priority; everyone understands that that is the way to succeed—by investing to ensure that staff are in the vanguard.

[111] **Gareth Jones:** Gyda'r geiriau hynny, terfynwn y rhan hon o'r sesiwn graffu. Ar ran aelodau'r pwyllgor, yr wyf yn diolch i chi o galon am y dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a'r drafodaeth hynod ddefnyddiol a buddiol. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r hyn yr ydym wedi ei glywed a'i ddarllen fod trawsnewid yn digwydd yn y sefydliadau yr ydych yn eu cynrychioli. Mae'n anodd i ni ar adegau fel pwyllgor ddehongli beth yw'r tueddiadau yn union, ond mae'r hyn yr ydym wedi ei weld a'i glywed y prynhawn yma yn galonogol iawn. Diolch i chi am eich cyfraniad ac yr ydym yn dymuno'r gorau i chi yn y gwaith pwysig yr ydych yn ymgymryd ag ef.

Gareth Jones: With those words, I will bring this part of the scrutiny session to a close. On behalf of committee members, I thank you very much for the written evidence and the very useful and beneficial discussion. We are aware from what we have heard and read that the establishments that you represent are being transformed. It is difficult at times for us as a committee to interpret what exactly the trends are, but what we have seen and heard this afternoon is very heartening. Thank you for your contribution and we wish you all the best in the important work that you are undertaking.

[112] **Yr Athro Jones:** Ar ran y tri ohonom, diolch am y gwrandawriad ac am y cwestiynu tra effeithiol. [*Chwerthin.*]

Professor Jones: On behalf of the three of us, thank you for listening and for the rather effective questioning. [*Laughter.*]

[113] **Gareth Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen yn awr at ail ran y sesiwn graffu y prynhawn yma ar gyfraniad economaidd addysg uwch. Yr ydym yn hynod falch o groesawu Dr Tim Stowe, cyfarwyddwr RSPB Cymru. Diolch am eich tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig; yr ydym eisoes wedi ei derbyn a chawsom gyfle i'w darllen. Efallai mai'r ffordd ddoethaf ymlaen

Gareth Jones: We will now move on to the second part of the scrutiny session this afternoon on the economic contribution of higher education. We are very pleased to welcome Dr Tim Stowe, director of RSPB Wales. Thank you for the written evidence, which we have already received and had an opportunity to read. Perhaps the best way

yw gofyn ichi wneud cyfraniad byr o ryw bum munud am y prif bwyntiau. Yna, cawn gyfle, yn Aelodau, i ofyn cwestiynau.

forward would be to ask you to make a short contribution of around five minutes on the main points. We will then have an opportunity, as Members, to ask questions.

2.50 p.m.

[114] **Dr Stowe:** Thank you, Chair. I hope that you will forgive me for addressing you in English. Thank you very much for this opportunity. Our contribution to your inquiry is from the perspective of being the employer and wanting to use the skills that we would hope are available to us in Wales. To continue the theme of the language for a moment, I have made one reference in the paper to the fact that it is quite difficult for us to recruit people with any Welsh language skills in combination with the other skills that we are looking for. That is still quite an issue for us. We have a bilingual policy, and we would normally seek as many Welsh speakers as we can find. So, we have two issues. The first is the language, but the particular one that I wanted to highlight this afternoon is the trend—and it is a long-term trend—for the entire education process to fail to produce the kind of skills that we saw 10 to 20 years ago.

[115] I have been in the conservation business for about 30 years. When I went into this, the people whom I was recruiting would come with very good abilities to identify a range of different types of birds, plants or whatever. Those skills are now not being taught at GCSE or A-level. Students are coming to university—and some of the university teaching does not enhance the background knowledge, which is almost like the bedrock of understanding. A great deal of energy and effort goes into ecological function and process, which is quite correct, but it is also necessary to be able to tell one particular organism from another—certainly in the kind of work that we are doing, which might be, from one extreme, managing a habitat for that particular individual species, to going to a public inquiry and facing interrogation about a species' ecological requirements. We could easily project that that might be the case with something such as the Severn barrage.

[116] We have to have people who are knowledgeable and confident and who understand the subject. The trend that we are seeing in the universities and, as a consequence, among the group of people from whom we can recruit, is that those skills are lacking. On the other hand, the demand for them in employment opportunities in my organisation and others is increasing. So, I guess that the plea from us is: how can you help us to get more graduates or postgraduates coming out of the education system in Wales, preferably with Welsh language skills, whom we can employ?

[117] **Gareth Jones:** Thank you very much for that. Jeff Cuthbert has the first question.

[118] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you very much, Tim, for that oral presentation and, indeed, your written paper, which was a helpful introduction. I think that I am right in saying that you are painting this picture on behalf of most environmental charities and not just RSPB Cymru.

[119] **Dr Stowe:** Yes, we consulted with, I think, three others. However, I believe that the situation is similar across the 26 or so in Wales.

[120] **Jeff Cuthbert:** It seems to indicate that higher education is not recognising or aware of your needs in a way that enables it to work with you to produce the sort of graduates and research and learning facilities that you need to remain viable. What are your links? How do the voluntary organisations that you are representing now seek to influence higher education and, indeed, further education, because that is part of this inquiry?

[121] On a specific point, which I have raised with everyone who has sat there, because you organise in parts of Wales that are covered by structural funds, have you made applications

either by yourselves or with other groups for European structural funds to assist you in skills development, which is a key aspect of structural funds?

[122] **Dr Stowe:** To deal with the question on applying for structural funds first, the short answer to that is that we have not engaged in the way that we could have done. The difficulty for us is that, often, the organisations are relatively small. They are not well equipped to provide the background services and support for the kinds of things that we would want to do. It has happened in the past; I think that the National Trust in particular has done this kind of training, but the level at which this is operating tends to be about more practical, hands-on skills, such as dry stone walling, and not the background, ecological understanding that allows the student to go on and occupy a post as a conservation policy officer, a reserve manager or someone in charge of a farm. So, we have not engaged as much as we could have done, but it is difficult for us to do it.

[123] In response to the question of how we have engaged, a range of opportunities has come our way through discussions with individual universities. One of our scientists talks regularly to Bangor University and discusses joint research projects. We had a meeting with Cardiff University in January, at which, again, we discussed areas of interest for it that overlapped with the sorts of things that we or others would want to know about, so it is very much on the applied side. One of the difficulties is that the number of students studying degrees in specific technical subjects such as zoology is increasing, but the number of students in the general ecological field is declining, and it is to that group that we and the other organisations would offer the most likely job prospects. So, there is a shortage of material before we start, and if we ask, 'Have you got somebody who would be willing to do a PhD on this particular subject?', universities may have only three students available. Ten years ago, they might have had 13 students available, and 20 years ago, 25 students might have been available. So, the pool that we can access is reduced.

[124] **Sandy Mewies:** Following on from what you said, it does not seem to me that organisations such as yours have been sought out by higher or further education to see what you need. I might be wrong—

[125] **Dr Stowe:** No, I think you are right.

[126] **Sandy Mewies:** Do you have any idea why that would be? At one time, there were quite a lot of people about with ecological qualifications, and one presumes that that was because they knew that they would get jobs. Has the job market decreased or is there any other reason that you can identify for that? We are all keen on lifelong learning, so my third question—they are all linked—is whether, if you find someone with the right skills in one area, there is a way that you could access funding to train them in another area.

[127] **Dr Stowe:** On the last point, that is often what happens. We will recruit a member of staff who does not have the full range of skills—and quite often it is the ecological skills that they will not have—and put them through training programmes or get them to work on a site where they can learn from the people around them, so that, after a number of years of working there, they are able to go on and run their own site. For example, if we have a series of nature reserves and we need to replace the manager of one of those sites, it is highly unlikely that that person would come into the job from outside, trained up and ready to go. The organisations are either pinching them from the other organisations or they are pulling them in from some third party. So, there is not the reservoir that there used to be.

3.00 p.m.

[128] One big thing that has happened in the jobs market is the growth of consultancies. Increasingly, we are competing with environmental consultancies for the people with those

skills; that is a market forces issue. Charities tend not to pay the salaries that consultancies do, so, not surprisingly, we lose out. I am not suggesting that we do something about that so much, but about the reservoir from which we can recruit. We do take people from consultancies and consultancies take people from us, so there is some movement, but it is the pool that is small.

[129] I am afraid that I have forgotten what your first question covered.

[130] **Sandy Mewies:** It was on the links, really. It does sound as though you should be sought out by higher or further education so that they could find out what you need.

[131] **Dr Stowe:** That is true. We looked at this in the paper and suggested that one of the reasons might be that partnerships with higher education institutions are quite difficult because we do not have a significant amount of money to bring to the table. This is going back to Mr Cuthbert's point about the EU funding opportunities. That is an area where I think that we could do something and probably should do more, but, until now, higher education institutions have not approached us at all. I have been here 10 years and I have never been approached. I think that that is true across the sector.

[132] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** I just wanted to follow on from Sandy's point. Farming is my background and, obviously, there has been a contraction in the agricultural community. Many agricultural land-based colleges and universities have struggled for numbers. I find it amazing that, in the 10 years that you have been in your role, you have never been consulted, to try to expand the coursework. That is a clear failure on the part of higher education, is it not? You employ 150 people in Wales and consultancies employ an inordinate amount of people; across the UK, you employ 1,700 people and there is an inordinate amount of people involved in the type of work that you are offering. There is a real deficit here. Is it that the wider charity sector is unable to engage with higher education or that higher education is unable to engage with the voluntary sector, as I should say, rather than the charity sector?

[133] **Dr Stowe:** In fairness, it is probably a bit of both. The RSPB and others regularly engage with the training elements at agricultural colleges and so on and produce materials, help to run the courses and even design the courses. There is a quite a lot of input from our organisation into things such as Farming Connect and other advisory services. However, that has not extended into developing a skills base that would allow the people who receive that training to want to move or be able to move into the sector that we are talking about. Once people are in the agricultural sector, they tend to stay there. I think that that is probably the key issue.

[134] **Gareth Jones:** Thank you very much. Are there any further questions?

[135] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you have a relationship with the Wales Council for Voluntary Action? You mentioned expertise and practical provision in making applications for funding. That is part of the WCVA's role. Are you involved with it?

[136] **Dr Stowe:** Yes, the RSPB is a member and I used to be a trustee, so we have very good contacts with it. A huge amount of the work that it does, which I was involved with when I was a trustee, does not cross into the kind of sector that we are involved in. We ought to be thinking of means of developing the sector's interest and involvement as a specific identity. Some of the skills that we are after are quite technical. The answer to your question is that we have very good contacts, but that it is not an area that the WCVA is expert in. If you were to ask Graham Benfield, he would also say that this is not an area in which the WCVA has the necessary expertise.

[137] **Gareth Jones:** I will just ask a final question—it is a comment, in a way. In your

paper, you reveal how exciting it can be to undertake the kind of work that you are involved in; you refer to the range of skills needed and the depth of knowledge required—in land management and so on. It is all there in some detail. Is there a problem with the perception of what the RSPB stands for? We know what the acronym stands for, but is there a problem in that bright young people or graduates might say, ‘That is not for me’, because they do not really understand what it is all about? Can we work on that if it is a problem of perception?

[138] **Jeff Cuthbert:** May I ask a question? I believe that Lantra is the sector skills council for land-based industry, unless it has changed its name. Do you have a relationship with that council? Are your needs part of its overall development and training opportunities?

[139] **Dr Stowe:** We have a relationship and discussions with Lantra, but not at the level that you are suggesting—the RSPB certainly does not, and I do not think that the other organisations do either. We do not do it in a co-ordinated way, which would be a good thing to develop.

[140] **Jeff Cuthbert:** That would seem to be a good thing.

[141] **Dr Stowe:** On the Chair’s question on perception, which is interesting, 10 or 20 years ago, when the organisation was less well known and environmental issues were not as high up the public and private agenda, this was not an issue. So, my immediate response would be to say that I do not think that it is a problem of perception. There is an element of market forces in relation to those people who are available and might go off to the consultancy sector, but the biggest problem is that we are not developing the skills base. I do not think that it would work to ask students, during their fourth year at university, to learn how to tell the difference between different types of plants or invertebrates while they are also trying to understand complex ecological processes—those two things do not sit happily together. That was what I was learning 10 to 15 years before I went to university or did a PhD. It is easier to do that sort of stuff the younger you are. So, I would say that that is the issue, more than perception.

[142] **Gareth Jones:** There is a comparison to be made with the evidence provided by representatives from the science sector. We were more or less using the same kind of language in respect of science as well.

[143] On that note, on behalf of the committee, I thank you for your presentation, Dr Stowe, and for sharing your concerns with us, which are possibly reflected in different subject areas. Your contribution has been very informative and helpful to us in our inquiry. Thank you for your time and attendance this afternoon, and we wish you all the best.

[144] **Dr Stowe:** Thank you. I wish you all the best with your inquiry.

3.08 p.m.

Adroddiad Terfynol Drafft am Gymorth i Bobl sydd â Dyslecsia yng Nghymru Final Draft Report of the Dyslexia Rapporteur Group on Dyslexia Support in Wales

[145] **Gareth Jones:** O ran cefndir yr eitem hon, sefydlwyd grŵp adrodd y pwyllgor ar y cymorth sydd ar gael i helpu pobl i ymdopi â dyslecsia yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor ar 11 Gorffennaf 2007, a gwnaethpwyd Alun Cairns, Jeff Cuthbert, Janet Ryder a Kirsty Williams yn aelodau o’r

Gareth Jones: By way of background to this item, the committee’s rapporteur group on the support that is available to help people to deal with dyslexia was established in the committee meeting on 11 July 2007, with Alun Cairns, Jeff Cuthbert, Janet Ryder and Kirsty Williams as its members. Since then,

grŵp. Ers hynny, fel y gwelwch, mae'r grŵp wedi cynnal sawl cyfarfod ac wedi ymgymryd â sawl ymweliad, gan gynnwys ymweliad ag ysgolion yn Massachusetts yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Yn ystod yr wythnos codi ymwybyddiaeth o ddyslecsia ar ddechrau mis Tachwedd y llynedd, clywodd y pwyllgor llawn dystiolaeth lafar gan dri arbenigwr cydnabyddedig. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad interim ar waith y grŵp ar 12 Rhagfyr 2007.

as you can see, the group has held many meetings and undertaken many visits, including a visit to schools in Massachusetts in the United States. During dyslexia awareness week at the beginning of November last year, the full committee heard evidence from three well known experts. The interim report on the group's work was published on 12 December 2007.

[146] Cawn gyfle heddiw i drafod yr adroddiad terfynol drafft. Hoffwn ddiolch yn fawr i'r grŵp am y gwaith arbennig iawn mae wedi ei wneud. Cyfeiriais yn gynharach at Alun Cairns, ond hoffwn ddiolch i'r pedwar ohonoch a'r swyddogion sydd wedi eich cynorthwyo yn y gwaith pwysig hwn. Fe'ch gwahoddaf i ddweud gair, os ydych yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

We will have an opportunity today to discuss the final draft report. I wish to thank the group for the exceptional work that it has done. I referred to Alun Cairns earlier, but I wish to thank the four of you and the officials who have supported you in this important work. I invite you to say a few words, if you so wish.

3.10 p.m.

[147] **Janet Ryder:** The group worked very effectively and I thank the officers who supported us. It became quite a long review in the end. I had never before been part of a review that was so subject-specific. We have looked at special educational needs support generally in this committee, but taking one particular aspect of it has been extremely beneficial. I feel that I have learned a lot more about additional educational need support through looking at one aspect of it and seeing what needs to be done there.

[148] This work stemmed from an idea that Alun Cairns put before the committee that we look at the Dore programme, and we know what has subsequently happened to that programme. We have reviewed a raft of different kinds of support mechanisms. Some of the issues that have come out have been very basic; for example, that of there not being one definition for dyslexia across Wales. No two local education authorities will take the same definition. For me, one of the key recommendations is that we find a baseline definition.

[149] The other crucial recommendations for me are recommendations 4 and 5, which touch on training all staff in schools, whether that is teaching staff or classroom support staff, and the need for them all to be much more aware than they are now of how to identify additional needs at an extremely early age. We took a great deal of evidence that said that, while the standard of teaching is very high, there would certainly appear to be gaps in the initial teacher training process, which some of the recommendations will ask the Minister to review.

[150] When you look at this, you see all the different projects that have come forward, and every one has something to offer some children. The one thing that stood out for me was the Fast ForWord programme. I have never seen a programme like that; it touched such a wide raft of additional needs and had the capacity to diagnose so precisely how that child was doing at that particular time, in that particular session. It seems to be quite a phenomenal programme, and I sincerely hope that the Minister will consider the recommendation to take it up.

[151] It was an extremely interesting review and everybody has worked hard on it. The officials who supported us have certainly worked exceptionally hard to draw it all together. I

hope that it has been beneficial.

[152] **Kirsty Williams:** I concur with what Janet has said. I have found it an immense pleasure and privilege to work with colleagues on this piece of work over the last months. I am grateful to the support staff. I hope that the recommendations that we have come up with will be unanimously accepted by the rest of the committee. We have put together a fair but hard-hitting and challenging set of recommendations that pull no punches but demonstrate a constructive way forward in addressing some of these issues. I hope that other committee members feel able to support the rapporteur group in its recommendations, because I believe that this piece of work will be significant in how these issues are taken forward by the Welsh Assembly Government. I know that the many people who have been involved in giving evidence to this report are relying on us to put this forward. I am grateful to my colleagues and to the staff who have been working with us. It has been a really good experience, and it was one of the most satisfying pieces of work that I have done in my nine years as an Assembly Member.

[153] **Jeff Cuthbert:** There is not much more to say. This work was tackled in a genuine cross-party way. It is a matter of particular interest to me, because I am dyslexic; I have made that point several times. Therefore, I have particular regard for the importance of this piece of work and for wanting to ensure that, in twenty-first century Wales, we are able to provide the very best for young children, so that they have the best start in life. This report is crucial to that.

[154] What came across, especially from the parents that we met—we met a significant group, from north and south Wales—was their anguish as caring parents in securing the best facilities for their children. Some had successes, and some were still frustrated, but were prepared to carry on; they were pleased with the project that we were undertaking, and they want to remain in touch with us. I have been contacted by parents; it has even been suggested that a blogsite should be set up, although that may not be practical. However, it shows how keen people are to want to remain in touch with this work, and to help to inform others positively about ways forward.

[155] We cannot help but be persuaded by what we saw at Everett Elementary School in Massachusetts. Admittedly, there are many differences between the American system and our system, but the overwhelming weight of evidence that we saw there was clear—children of all abilities were benefiting from a relatively simple phonetic approach, based on IT, which we are capable of doing here now. That evidence is available for examination. I understand that that approach is also used quite widely in Ireland.

[156] It is a good system—I am not saying that it is the best, or the only system, not by any stretch of the imagination. We are recommending a mixed bag of things in considering a solution; it is often a mixture that benefits a child, because everyone has different needs. However, the key thing—it is right that it is recommendation 1—is to try to see whether we can get some form of baseline definition about what we mean, so that we do not have different approaches across Wales. If we take this forward, I believe that it will be a definite plus for us in Wales.

[157] **Andrew R.T. Davies:** It was my predecessor on this committee, Alun Cairns, who participated extensively in this report, and I pay tribute to everyone who was on the rapporteur group. I have briefly read the report; its conclusions and recommendations are compelling, and I hope that they will be adopted. The group had 18 meetings, as well as informal meetings, which shows the level of evidence and information gathering that went on. Coming afresh to this, one thing that struck me was the bit about Scott Quinnell, and how he would sit at the back of the class, reduced to tears. Many people have an image of Scott Quinnell as a big, butch rugby player, but his example shows that dyslexia affects many

people, from all walks of life. I hope that this piece of work goes forward and forms the basis for people to improve the quality of our students in Wales.

[158] **Gareth Jones:** Diolch am y sylwadau hynny. Diolchaf i'r grŵp, a'r swyddogion, am ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn, sy'n arloesol i ni yng Nghymru, fel y soniodd Jeff. Mae wedi bod yn waith anhygoel. Mae rhestr yn atodiad A o'r cyfarfodydd, yr ymweliadau, ac ati, yr ymgymeryd â hwy. Digwyddodd yr holl waith hwn tra'r oedd gwaith y pwyllgor yn mynd rhagddo—mae hwn wedi digwydd yn y cefndir. Llongyfarchaf y grŵp, felly, a phawb sydd wedi gweithio mor ddyfal, bron yn ddisylw; mae wedi bod yn hynod o bwysig.

Gareth Jones: Thank you for those comments. I thank the group, and the officials, for undertaking this work, which is pioneering work for us in Wales, as Jeff mentioned. It has been an amazing piece of work. There is a list in annex A of the meetings, the visits, and so on, that were undertaken. All this work happened alongside the committee's work—this has happened in the background. I congratulate the group, therefore, and everyone who has worked so diligently, without much attention; it has been extremely important.

[159] Er fy mod yn diolch yn swyddogol i chi ar ran y pwyllgor, daw'r gwir ddiolch gan yr unigolion a'u teuluoedd yn y dyfodol, oherwydd yr ydych wedi cyflawni gwaith hollbwysig ac arloesol. Mawr obeithiaf y gwelwn lwyddiant o ran mabwysiadu'r argymhellion hollbwysig hyn i'r dyfodol.

Although I am thanking you formally on behalf of the committee, the true thanks will come from the individuals and their families in the future, because you have undertaken a crucial and pioneering piece of work. I very much hope that we have success in adopting these crucial recommendations for the future.

[160] Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau, felly, gytuno ar yr adroddiad hwn, i'w gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad. Os yw hynny'n dderbyniol, lawnsir yr adroddiad mewn digwyddiad arbennig ar nos Fercher olaf y tymor, 16 Gorffennaf, yng nghwmni cyrff perthnasol, yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio atynt, plant, rhieni ac athrawon. Cynhelir dadl ar yr adroddiad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn ystod tymor yr hydref, os mai dyna ddymuniad y pwyllgor.

I therefore ask Members to agree this report, to be presented to the Assembly. If that is acceptable, the report will be launched at a special occasion on the evening of the last Wednesday this term, 16 July, in the company of relevant organisations, to which you have already referred, children, parents and teachers. A debate will be held on the report in Plenary during the autumn term, if the committee so wishes.

[161] Therefore, it is over to you as Members. Do you agree with that way forward?

[162] Gwelaf fod pawb yn hapus â hynny. Diolch.

I see that everyone is happy with that. Thank you.

[163] Mae papurau i'w nodi, ond, gyda hynny, cyhoeddaf fod y cyfarfod ar ben. Diolch yn fawr.

There are papers to note, but, with that, I declare that the meeting is closed. Thank you.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 3.20 p.m.
The meeting ended at 3.20 p.m.*