

# Enterprise and Learning Committee

## Minutes (EL(3) 15-08)

**Date:** 21 May 2008

**Time:** 9:00am - 10:45am

**Venue:** Committee Room 2, Senedd

### Assembly Members in Attendance

Gareth Jones, (Chair) Aberconwy  
Christine Chapman, Cynon Valley  
Alun Davies, Mid and West Wales  
David Melding, South Wales Central  
Sandy Mewies, Delyn  
Janet Ryder, North Wales  
Kirsty Williams, Brecon and Radnorshire

### Committee Service

Dr Kathryn Jenkins, Clerk  
Daniel Collier, Deputy Clerk

### Committee Specialist

Ben Stokes, Members' Research Service

### Others in Attendance

David Caldwell, Director, Universities Scotland  
Professor Maher Kalaji, Head of Chemistry, Bangor University  
Professor David Knight, Professor of Synthetic Organic Chemistry, Cardiff University.

### 1: Introduction, apologies and substitutions

- 1.1 The Chair welcomed Committee Members and members of the public to the meeting.
- 1.2 Apologies had been received from Alun Cairns, Huw Lewis and Jeff Cuthbert for whom Alun Davies was substituting.

### 2: Evidence to the Committee inquiry into the economic contribution of higher education

**Paper: EL(3) 15-08 - Paper 1, EL(3) 15-08 - Paper 2, Annex**

- 2.1 Video Conference Session: The Committee welcomed David Caldwell, Director, Universities Scotland and questioned him.
- 2.2 The Committee also welcomed Professor Maher Kalaji, Head of Chemistry, Bangor University and Professor David Knight, Professor of Synthetic Organic Chemistry, Cardiff University representing the Royal Society of Chemistry. The Committee scrutinised the witnesses.

### Action point:

Universities Scotland agreed to provide:

An evaluation of the effectiveness of the Scottish Enterprise and Edinburgh Enterprise Fellowship Programme.

### Paper to note:

### Minutes of the last meeting

**Paper: EL(3) 14-08 - Minutes**

The Committee ratified the minutes of the 14 May meeting.

### Committee Service

**May 2008**